THE RELATIVE EFFECTIVENESS OF FOUR PROCEDURES FOR EVALUATING STUDENTS' WRITTEN THEMES

BY

MELVILLE YOUNG MCMECHAN

A THESIS SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF MASTER OF ARTS IN EDUCATION

We accept this thesis as conforming to the required standard

THE UNIVERSITY OF BRITISH COLUMBIA SEPTEMBER, 1961
In presenting this thesis in partial fulfilment of the requirements for an advanced degree at the University of British Columbia, I agree that the Library shall make it freely available for reference and study. I further agree that permission for extensive copying of this thesis for scholarly purposes may be granted by the Head of my Department or by his representatives. It is understood that copying or publication of this thesis for financial gain shall not be allowed without my written permission.

Department of Education

The University of British Columbia,
Vancouver 8, Canada.

Date September 18, 1961.
AN ABSTRACT

THE RELATIVE EFFECTIVENESS OF FOUR PROCEDURES
FOR EVALUATING STUDENTS' WRITTEN THEMES

MELVILLE YOUNG MCMACHAN

The ability to communicate effectively in writing is important not only within the educational system but also in business, professional, and domestic life. Most educators agree that this ability can best be developed through regular practice and they agree, further, that this practice can be given direction and purpose through the use of carefully selected and properly employed marking techniques.

Over the years various techniques were developed with a view to increasing the reliability of theme grading; others were designed to reduce the marking load; still others were chiefly concerned with the psychological effect upon the students. But there was no conclusive evidence favouring a specific method which would promote composition improvement.

In response to the need for such a method the writer proposed the use of "salient feature" comments. An instructional and marking programme involving four equated groups of Grade Eight students was devised. The two experimental groups had all their practice themes marked with letter grades and brief comments respectively. The corresponding control groups had only one-quarter of their practice themes marked.

Initial and final test paragraphs provided the numerical bases for making inter-group comparisons. It was hypothesized that, between the pairs of groups to be compared,
if there were no significant mean score differences prior to the practice period there would be no significant mean score differences following it.

Analysis of the main body of evidence showed that the null hypothesis was sustained throughout. No advantage for any particular marking method could be claimed. In fact, the control groups evidently made as much progress as the others. Supplementary calculations focussed attention on smaller sub-groups in restricted ability ranges. Here, apparently, the "salient feature" sub-groups made the most consistent gains.

Subjective opinion as well as objective evidence was sought. A majority of teachers and students thought that the composition had improved and, given a choice of several marking plans, expressed a preference for written comments.

It seemed reasonable to conclude that, while the "salient feature" comments method did not prove significantly advantageous, it might, nevertheless, merit further study. It was suggested further that the kind of marking may be less important than regular, purposeful practice. Perhaps limited marking techniques could be developed which would not only improve composition but also free teachers for the individualized instruction which may, after all, provide the best answer to the question, "How can we help students reach a standard of achievement in composition which is consistent with the demands of an increasingly complex society?"
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LIST OF TABLES</th>
<th>vi</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGMENT</td>
<td>vii</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Chapter

I. BACKGROUND AND STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM ...
- General Description of the Problem
- Survey of Related Research
- Importance of Further Investigation
- Statement of the Problem
- The Hypotheses

II. THE EXPERIMENTAL METHOD ...................... 19
- Subjects, Materials, and Organization
- Orientation of Teachers and Students
- Group Matching Procedure
- Testing Programme
- Organization of Lessons
- Marking of Practice Themes by Teachers
- Rating of Test Paragraphs
- The Control Problem
- Statistical Treatment Employed
- Questionnaires

III. PRESENTATION AND ANALYSIS OF EVIDENCE ..... 38
- Matching Data
- Results of Final Testing
- "Full Practice" Group Results
- Analysis of Results from Selected Sub-groups
- Questionnaire Summaries

IV. INTERPRETATION AND CONCLUSIONS .............. 53
- Re-statement of Problem and Hypotheses
- Conclusions Reached
- Possible Reasons for Observed Results
- Subjective Reactions of Participants
- Avenues for Further Research
BIBLIOGRAPHY ................................................................. 62

APPENDICES ................................................................. Following 65

A. TEACHERS' MANUALS.
B. INSTRUCTIONS TO Raters OF TEST PARAGRAPHS.
C. SAMPLES OF STUDENT TEST AND PRACTICE PARAGRAPHS.
D. SAMPLES OF QUESTIONNAIRES.
## LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Matching Data</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Results of Final Testing</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Test Paragraph Results for the &quot;Full Practice&quot; Group</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Summary of Paragraph Test Score Gains Made by Sub-groups Selected on I.Q. Basis</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Summary of Gains Made by Sub-groups Selected on the Basis of Initial Test Paragraph Scores</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Comparison of Gains Retained Samples / &quot;Full Practice&quot; N</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Answers to Key Questions on Six Teachers' Questionnaires</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Answers to Questions on Students' Questionnaires</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ACKNOWLEDGMENT

To the many people who assisted with the preparation and execution of the experimental programme I am most grateful.

First, I wish to acknowledge the encouragement and guidance offered by my thesis supervisor, Dr. J. R. McIntosh, Director of Secondary Education, University of British Columbia.

Secondly, I wish to thank Mr. D. Dashwood-Jones, Vice-principal of Inglewood Junior High for his invaluable assistance throughout the planning and presentation of the composition lessons. I wish also to thank Mr. J. F. Ellis and Mr. G. Addy who spent many hours rating the test paragraphs.

Finally, I am indebted to the principal, teachers, and students of Inglewood Junior High School for their excellent cooperation.
CHAPTER I
BACKGROUND AND STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM

The development of the ability to communicate clearly and effectively in writing has long been a major objective in our society. How can this worthwhile goal be attained? Most educators agree that the most hopeful procedure is to provide a planned, regular programme of written composition practice. They agree further that writing alone is not enough. Of four hundred teachers questioned in a survey conducted by the California Council of English Associations ninety per cent said that theme marking is an integral part of the overall composition programme.\(^1\) The Department of Education for British Columbia concurs, for, in a recent English bulletin for the Junior High School, it urges teachers not only to provide frequent writing assignments but also to "see that all are marked or graded".\(^2\)

What are the characteristics of an effective theme marking system? Fundamentally, it should facilitate learning, i.e., it should assist students to improve the quality of their written work. More specifically, a marking system should, according to a majority of teachers in the aforecited California survey, arouse and maintain interest, focus


attention on strengths and weaknesses, and indicate progress reliably.³ To this list must be added the important requirement that a scheme of evaluation, however desirable in other respects, should not make unreasonable demands upon the teacher.

The great expenditure of time and energy apparently required for the marking of themes has been the source of much concern and considerable contention among English teachers, particularly at the secondary level where the burden of marking the work of several classes is very real. Binney flatly states that "The real enemy of the English teacher is time, or more accurately, lack of time."⁴ The ideal solution to the problem is, of course, the establishment of smaller classes. However, in view of the current alarm over the ever-increasing cost of education, it is very unlikely that this solution will be employed in the foreseeable future. Now if classes are to remain large, if writing practice is to be increased, and if all of the resulting themes are to be graded, the marking burden may become literally unbearable. In summary then, what is needed is some means of evaluation which will serve the primary purpose of improving the students' ability to communicate clearly and effectively in writing and which, at the same time, will alleviate the marking load.

---

³ William J. Dusel, loc. cit.

Has such a marking system already been identified and put to use? In order to answer this question adequately it will be necessary to examine the available information on the subject.

In twentieth century America and Britain much opinion and considerable research have centred on the marking of English compositions. During the early part of the century a number of composition scales, purporting to assist in the evaluation of such things as mechanical correctness, style, and thought content, were tried out. Among these, some of the better known were those designed by Thorndike, Hillegas, Willing, and Hudelson. Such scales have been criticized on a number of grounds. Green says that scales are useful for the establishment of standards but have failed to provide any adequate basis for the identification of errors or pupil difficulties. Remmers and Gage, after reviewing a number of scales, concluded that they are of


value only when used by experienced raters. The average classroom teacher has neither the experience nor the time to make the widespread use of composition scales feasible.

Traditionally, composition grading has been characterized by the detailed marking of all errors. In the early 1930's several studies were conducted in order to observe the effect of such marking on the elimination of errors in students' written themes. In an experimental research project, Fellows demonstrated that detailed correction by the teacher did not result in any appreciable reduction of technical errors, except perhaps for some of the brightest pupils. He found, as did Leonard and Ransome, that classroom instruction was a more efficient procedure for this purpose. Furthermore, Leonard and Clark both


15 W. A. Clark (Jr.), "Neither a Margin Scribbler Nor a Juggler of Numbers," The English Journal (Col. ed.), vol. 28 (February 1939), pp. 133-138.
expressed the view that traditional error marking placed not only an over-emphasis on the mechanics of writing but also, and more importantly, an under-emphasis on the development of clear and effective expression. Sams summarized this viewpoint rather neatly by saying that the process of composition should be "one of giving form to ideas rather than one of giving ideas to form". More recently a number of educators have directed attention to the possible psychological effects of detailed correction. Maize feels that students are simply overwhelmed by a mass of marking, while Gregory suggests that overuse of the red pencil is "more crude than a slap in the face". Finally, the Junior High School English Bulletin, while urging teachers to use some form of grading for all written assignments, recommends that all-error marking be done only once or twice a month. At this point it seems reasonable to conclude that detailed correction of all written work fails to qualify as an ideal marking procedure.

The obvious alternative is, of course, "general impression" marking in which the teacher makes an overall

assessment of the composition and records it, usually in the form of a numerical score or a letter grade. There are, in the literature, many references both to this marking plan and to variations of it. In the opinion of Steel and Talman, "The impressionist method of marking compositions . . . . . . . is fundamentally sound and can be made workable."\textsuperscript{20} The report of their investigations describes an objective scheme which, while sound in its aims, appears, to this writer at least, to be rather too complicated for easy application by the classroom teacher. Morrison and Vernon, in a study of the Steel-Talman method, concluded that it produced results which were no more consistent than those obtained by means of a simple analysis combined with an over-all impression, and stated further that it ignored those aesthetic aspects of composition which are too subjective to tabulate.\textsuperscript{21} Cast, in a rather comprehensive study, found that general impression marking was only slightly less reliable for evaluation purposes than an analytic grading plan which required the markers to take more cognizance of particular strengths and weaknesses.\textsuperscript{22} ("Analytic grading"


\textsuperscript{22} B. M. D. Cast, "Efficiency of Different Methods of Marking English Compositions", \textit{British Journal of Educational Psychology}, vol. 9 (November 1939), pp. 257-269.
refers to procedures designed mainly for the purpose of trying to improve scoring reliability and should not be confused with the detailed correction of mechanical and grammatical errors discussed in the immediately preceding paragraph.) Paton, in a later study, confirmed Cast's findings and, in addition noted that general impression marking resulted in a somewhat less satisfactory spread of scores than did an analytic method.\(^3\) Coward, in an experimental research, concluded that general impression and content/form (two marks recorded as a fraction, all errors counted for the form portion of the score) methods had approximately the same reliability.\(^4\) More recently Wormsbecker found no statistically significant difference in the improvement of composition writing ability of matched groups of Grade Six children when the two marking procedures employed by Coward were applied by classroom teachers over a ten-week practice period.\(^5\) In summary, there appears to be little conclusive evidence concerning general impression marking, either with respect to its efficacy as a means for improving student writing, or with

---

\(^3\) J. M. Paton, "Marking Examination Papers, with Special Reference to Essay Questions in English," \textit{School (Sec. ed.)}, vol. 35 (May 1947), pp. 580-583.


respect to its reliability as a scoring procedure. It does have the advantage of being reasonably economical of teacher time and energy and may, therefore, merit further study.

As an alternative to the detailed error correction and general impression methods discussed thus far, various writers have put forward the proposal that only a limited number of paragraph elements be marked at any one time. Such a plan, in the opinion of its proponents, not only would benefit the students both psychologically and in terms of subsequent writing ability, but also would be a time-saver for teachers. In 1932 Cook urged teachers to mark only certain specific points directly related to the nature of the writing assignment. Later, a single-point-per theme method, suggested by Maize was used in an experimental study by Wormsbecker. However, this procedure apparently produced no more measurable improvement than did the impression and content/form methods. The English Bulletin recommends that, as a time-saving procedure, teachers should concentrate on specific errors in particular assignments. A variation of such marking practice was employed by Gregory who, in order to permit more actual writing, marked thoroughly only four of the

27 Roy C. Maize, loc. cit.
28 John H. Wormsbecker, loc. cit.
themes submitted by each student in her regular classes during the year. The remaining themes were simply marked "S" or "U", the criterion being "sincerity of effort". Unfortunately, since no controls were established the apparently favourable results could not be verified.

In the continuing search for more helpful composition grading procedures, a number of educators have proposed and tried various systems involving marking by pupils. In an experimental study Hall concluded that a system of pupil-appraisal promoted greater progress in the ability to write than did teacher-appraisal. Chalifour gave her Grade VIII students specific instruction in marking one another's mistakes and found that this procedure decreased the technical errors in their writing. Cotter had groups of students combine to grade paragraphs on a rank basis. They used rating sheets having several questions based on content and technique respectively with apparent success. Halvorsun found that just checking off errors without specifying their

---

30 Emily B. Gregory, loc. cit.


nature placed more responsibility on the student. The English Bulletin suggests that teachers make the fullest possible use of student assistance since "marking has a considerable educational value for the marker". Perhaps one of the chief advantages of a system involving pupil-appraisal is that, to a degree, it frees the teacher to concentrate on such important paragraph elements as selection of ideas, effectiveness of sentence-structure, coherence, etc., and also permits him to provide more individual instruction relative to these elements. The importance of such individual instruction has been emphasized by Washburne, Archer, and Nurnberg. The latter stated that composition improvement depends more on "mind-to-mind discussion" than on correction. At this point a word of caution is in order. While the studies reported apparently obtained results favouring pupil-appraisal, not all of them fall into the category of comprehensive and controlled research. Further, in the opinion of the


writer, there are possible disadvantages which must be considered. In the first place, the inexperience of the student raters may result in serious errors in judgment. In addition, pupil-appraisal methods use considerable instructional time which in many instances may be urgently required for other aspects of the composition programme. It seems reasonable to state that, short of conclusive research to the contrary, pupil-appraisal serves better as a supplement than as an alternative to teacher-appraisal.

A majority of the studies and opinions thus far examined originated in North America. But no survey of composition grading procedures would be complete if it failed to consider the various studies, including a number of controlled researches, which have been carried out in Great Britain. In this country such researches are of special significance because the writing of essays has long been an integral part of the Grammar School Entrance ("11+") and School Certificate Examinations both of which may greatly affect a student’s academic future. Perhaps the best known investigation was conducted by a sub-committee of the International Examinations Enquiry Committee under the chairmanship of Sir Philip Hartog.39 This investigation was designed to test the chairman’s theory that 'directed' essays, i.e., compositions written 'with a given

object in view' contribute more to the improvement of written expression and can be marked more consistently than is the case with the conventional 'undirected' essays. More specifically, Hartog hoped that by the introduction of an element called 'sense', i.e., the degree to which the writer attains the 'given object', both the validity and the reliability of essay marking could be improved. The main part of the carefully controlled investigation was carried out with over one thousand similarly educated students, all of whom were preparing for the School Certificate Examination. When the study was completed, the professional examiners who took part, as well as the report authors, were convinced that 'directed' essays and marking for 'sense' are of value but the statistical analysis failed to show any superiority for this method. One of the chief findings, in fact, was that marks depend, apparently, as much on the idiosyncrasies of the markers as on the actual merits of the composition.

The problem of essay marking reliability, which loomed so large in the Hartog investigation, has been the subject of a number of other enquiries, most of them fairly recent. For example, Vernon and Millican conducted an experiment at the London Institute of Education following which they concluded that the combined judgment of two or more markers "does yield a writing ability factor which can be only partially predicted by tests".

Penfold, on the other hand, was critical of the continued use of the essay in the Grammar School Entrance ("11+") Examination because of the lack of marking consistency. She found that even when the same examiners re-marked essays the resulting reliability coefficient was unsatisfactory, regardless of essay length and of the kind of marking systems employed. Consequently, she contended that reliable results could hardly be expected when many different markers are involved as in the "11+" Examinations. She proposed alternatively that several aspects of composition ability could better be evaluated by objective tests. Wiseman, in answer to Penfold, reiterated the value of the essay examination, stating that the ability to compose could be measured only on the basis of actual composition. In this connection he presented experimental evidence demonstrating fairly high, though not statistically significant, marker reliability. Finally, Pidgeon and Yates, like Penfold, found a lack of marking consistency but concluded, very sensibly in this writer's view, that, for the present at least, educators must choose between reliable measuring instruments (objective tests) which are narrow in scope and restrictive in their influence and less reliable tests (essays) which may exert a more desirable influence on

---


education. These two educators suggested also that it may still be feasible to combine the best features of both objective and essay tests in a creative response test which will be both valid and reliable.

In concluding this survey of important British investigations it may be said, in spite of the lack of agreement in their findings, that as a group they are characterized by thoroughness not only with respect to the analytic grading plans employed but also with respect to the detailed marking instructions issued, and the painstaking statistical analyses applied. These somewhat complicated methods, however, do not seem suitable for use by the regular classroom teacher. And since the fact remains that no satisfactory substitute has yet been found for written compositions, the marking problem continues, at least in some degree, unresolved.

The grading procedures discussed thus far have included detailed error correction, general impression marking, limited marking, pupil-appraisal, analytic grading, and one or two variations of these. Where it has been possible, advantages and disadvantages of each scheme have been noted. From these studies much valuable information has been derived. For example, the futility of continuous all-error marking and the difficulty of marking consistently have been reasonably well established, and various alternatives have been offered.

However, as previously noted by the writer in a research seminar submission, "The most important test of the worthwhileness of any research or classroom procedure is whether it assists in the attainment of desirable objectives."\(^4^4\) The real test of a composition grading procedure, therefore, is whether it contributes materially to the improvement of written composition.\(^4^5\) Many of the studies reviewed in this chapter have paid little attention to this primary marking function. This viewpoint is by no means peculiar to the writer. In 1922, Hudelson criticized a number of composition scales not just because they failed to produce consistent scores, but more importantly, because they failed to take cognizance of the pupils' interpretation of the marks and failed, consequently, to help the writers do better.\(^4^6\) Dusel was critical of any marking system which failed to communicate to pupils the information they needed in order to improve.\(^4^7\) Wormsbecker noted that, while much consideration had been given to marking reliability, very little attention had been paid to pupil reaction to the kind of mark given.\(^4^8\) The Senior High School English Bulletin sums up these


\(^{4^5}\) Ibid., p. 18.

\(^{4^6}\) Earl Hudelson, op. cit., p. 39.

\(^{4^7}\) William J. Dusel, op. cit., pp. 390-397.

\(^{4^8}\) John H. Wormsbecker, op. cit., p. 8.
points of view by stating, "Composition marking must instruct as well as assess." 49

In 1952, as part of the work in connection with the research seminar referred to in the preceding paragraph, the writer proposed an alternative grading procedure which, it was hoped, would prove more effective in improving the quality of written themes than some of the other methods herein reviewed.50 This procedure consisted mainly of "commenting upon the salient features" of the various paragraphs submitted instead of assigning marks, indicating errors, etc. 'Salient features', to be described more fully later, may be briefly defined as "those aspects of a written theme which stand out, either for their excellence or lack of it". Subsequently, Collins expressed a similar idea when he stated that marking comments should be directed to the effectiveness of writing and not to mechanical detail.51 Dusel suggested the use of highly selective comments "revealing only those reader reactions which will be helpful".52 Apparently, however, there has been no actual research involving this particular marking proposal.

In view of the latter fact the writer decided to attempt an experimental study which might determine whether or

50 M. Y. McMechan, op. cit., Outline p. 4.
52 William J. Dusel, op. cit., p. 391.
not this "salient features" proposal might be of particular value in promoting writing improvement. For purposes of comparison and control the general impression and limited marking methods respectively were selected, the former because it was a familiar procedure readily applied by the classroom teacher, and the latter because it was a practical alternative, acceptable to school authorities, for the experimentally desirable "no marking" method.

In general terms, the problem was, "To investigate the relative effectiveness of four procedures for evaluating students' written themes." Briefly stated, the four procedures were: (1) General impression -- A letter grade was assigned on all practice themes.

(2) Salient features -- One or two phrasal comments were made on all practice themes.

(3) General impression and limited marking combined -- A letter grade was assigned on every fourth theme only.

(4) Salient features and limited marking combined -- One or two phrasal comments were made on every fourth theme only.

It will be noted that procedures (3) and (4) are simply limited marking variations of procedures (1) and (2). The purpose of this arrangement, of course, was to incorporate a control feature into the experimental design.

So that the four procedures could be compared, four equated groups of students, X, Y, X₁ and Y₁, were established. X, Y, X₁ and Y₁ had their practice themes over a three and one-half month period marked by procedures one to four respectively.
Initial and final test paragraphs formed the main basis for comparisons between: X/Y, X/X₁, and Y/Y₁, and the chief statistical procedure was application of the null hypothesis.

The assumption was made that if the groups being compared were properly matched there would be no significant mean score differences between X and Y between X and X₁, or between Y and Y₁ on the initial test paragraphs. This being the case, the specific hypotheses in this study became:

(a) There will be no significant mean score difference between X and Y on the final test paragraphs when all Group X practice themes have been marked by the general impression method (letter grade only), and all Group Y practice themes by the salient features method.

(b) There will be no significant mean score difference between X and X₁ on the final test paragraphs when all Group X practice themes have been marked by the general impression method and only one-quarter of the Group X₁ practice themes have been marked by the same method.

(c) There will be no significant mean score difference between Y and Y₁ on the final test paragraphs when all Group Y practice themes have been marked by the salient features method and only one-quarter of the Group Y₁ practice themes have been marked by the same method.

If the null hypothesis were not sustained it might then be possible tentatively to decide which of the four marking procedures has the greatest potential for use in the classroom.
CHAPTER II
THE EXPERIMENTAL METHOD

It is proposed first to outline the experimental method as a whole and then to explain its more important features in greater detail.

Through the kind cooperation of the school administration, arrangements were made to conduct the study from February to June, 1957, using regular Grade VIII classes at Inglewood Junior High School, West Vancouver. Prior to the actual experiment, Mr. D. Dashwood-Jones, Vice-principal and Head of the English Department, and the writer met on several occasions to discuss the details of organization and execution. Next the various materials required were assembled. These included I.Q. and standardized language scores which served as the bases for matching the experimental and control groups, test paragraphs which made possible the comparison of initial and final results, teachers' manuals which contained instructions for the proper conduct of the study together with detailed lesson plans and marking procedures, and miscellaneous other materials which served a variety of purposes: folders for storing practice themes, pass-outs for individual lessons, reading references, and detailed instructions for the rating of test paragraphs.

The study was then carried out according to the following timetable. During the first half of February explanatory meetings were held with the participating classroom teachers and with the independent test paragraph raters, standardized
language and initial paragraph tests were administered, and four matched groups of student subjects were established. With this preliminary phase completed, the classroom composition programme proceeded from mid-February until the end of May, the only interruption of consequence being the Easter tests and holidays. Early in June the final standardized language and paragraph tests were given and brief teacher and student questionnaires were answered.

While this completed the programme insofar as it directly affected the school there still remained two important tasks: the marking of the final test paragraphs by the independent raters and the analysis of results by the writer. The former was achieved within the two months following while the latter was undertaken later.

The foregoing outline was designed to present a brief, if somewhat sketchy, overview of the procedures employed in this experimental study. In order, however, that the reader may more fully understand the purpose and nature of these procedures their essential features will be described in greater detail in the following paragraphs.

The selection of suitable experimental subjects proved relatively easy. At the time, Inglewood Junior High School had some three hundred Grade VIII students enrolled in ten regular classes, eight of which were approximately matched for scholastic aptitude and achievement and two of which were superior but roughly equal to each other. The Grade VIII level was ideal for it was possible to set up a fairly compre-
hensive composition programme and at the same time to retain
the single paragraph as the basic vehicle for written practice.
The availability of ten equal-sized classes within one school
was attractive too for it not only simplified administrative
arrangements but also made possible greater teacher-to-teacher
consistency in lesson presentation and marking.

In addition to having suitable subjects it was, of
course, most desirable to have well-informed and cooperative
teaching personnel. The participating teachers were, therefore,
invited to attend a series of orientation discussions. In a
preliminary meeting Mr. Jones briefly outlined the nature of
the study and the school administration's point of view with
respect to it. A day or two later the writer presented a fur­
ther explanation of the study's purpose and organization. At
this time also the teaching manuals were distributed and dis­
cussed. When the teachers had had time to study the instruc­
tions and lesson plans, another meeting provided the oppor­
tunity for clarification and expansion of various aspects of
the prescribed procedures. Finally, throughout the experi­
mental programme, the instructors were encouraged to seek an­
wers to any questions which might arise.

While it was manifest that full information concerning
the composition programme should be supplied to teachers, it
was less evident how much should be given to the student sub­
jects. It was felt that the end results would be more meaning­
ful if the programme were conducted in an apparently normal
atmosphere rather than in one which was obviously experimental.
With this idea in mind it was finally decided that the necessary information could best be presented quietly and uniformly to all students by means of a simple pass-out. The chief points covered were these: all students would participate in a full programme of composition instruction and practice; the teachers were interested in finding out what kind of instruction, practice, and marking would produce the best results; most of the themes submitted would be returned but the first two and the last two would be retained for purposes of comparison; marking procedures would vary from student to student but no discussion of these would be possible until later in the term; all students would receive the same instruction and be given credit for their best work. Words such as "experimental" and "test" were purposely omitted in the pass-outs.

While the orientation process for teachers and students proceeded, the establishment of the four matched groups X, Y, X₁, and Y₁, was also undertaken. As mentioned previously, the necessary data included I.Q. and standardized language test scores. Up-to-date I.Q. scores, based on the Vocational Guidance Centre Intelligence Indicator, were supplied by the school office. Standardized language scores were obtained by administering Form X of the Cooperative English Test. This test was recommended by Dr. C. B. Conway, Director of the

53 Vocational Guidance Centre Intelligence Indicator, Grades 3-8, adapted from the Henmon-Nelson Tests of Mental Ability, Ontario College of Education, Toronto, 1946.

54 Cooperative English Test (Lower Level), Test A, Mechanics of Expression, Form X, Cooperative Test Division, Educational Testing Service, Los Angeles.
Division of Tests, Standards, and Research, Department of Education. As a check, first term language and composition scores based on teacher estimates were also obtained. For convenient reference all of the data described in this paragraph were summarized by the writer on class lists supplied by the school office. The actual matching involved the selection of four sub-groups in each of the ten classes. The reason for having all four groups represented in each class was, of course, to reduce the effect of teacher-to-teacher variations in instruction and marking. Of the two hundred ninety-two students for whom complete matching data were available eighty-five were assigned to X, eighty-six to Y, sixty-one to X₁, and sixty to Y₁. X and Y were the experimental groups while the smaller X₁ and Y₁ were the corresponding controls. The groups to be compared were considered matched if there were no significant mean or standard deviation differences with respect to either I.Q. or standardized language scores.

In the classroom the students were not identified as X, Y, X₁, or Y₁ but were simply requested to place the number 1, 2, 3, or 4 (in place of X, Y, etc.) on each practice theme submitted. The number in each group was substantially reduced later through the elimination of subjects who moved away, missed test paragraphs, or were absent for three or more practice periods. Detailed information concerning the "N's" actually used in the establishment of matched groups and in the analysis of results will be found in Chapter III.

Materials for comparing the initial and final results consisted of scores obtained from parallel standardized language
tests (Forms X and Y of the aforementioned Cooperative English Test) and scores assigned to test paragraphs by independent raters. As the language tests employed are widely known and accepted there is little need to describe them further. The problem of suitable test paragraphs, however, must be dealt with at greater length.

Altogether four such paragraphs were written by each participating student, two prior to the practice period and two following it. So that the end results could be compared the test assignments were carefully planned and controlled. The mimeographed sheets issued to every student on each of the four occasions included a topic outline, instructions relating to the length and format of the paragraph and a check list for self-appraisal. (Copies of the instructions may be seen in the teachers' manual). Paragraph assignments one and three were parallel in form and similar in nature; paragraph assignments two and four were also comparable but different from one and three. The five even-numbered divisions wrote paragraphs one and two initially and three and four finally while the five odd-numbered divisions wrote three and four initially and one and two finally. This arrangement was designed to offset any possible differences in the difficulty or appeal of the four test paragraphs. The grading of these paragraphs will be discussed later in the chapter.

Described in the foregoing paragraphs were the various procedures which necessarily preceded the actual experimental period. In Chapter One it was stated that the proposed experiment was mainly concerned with the effect of certain
marking procedures on the improvement of students' written compositions. It was essential, therefore, to arrange a suitable practice period during which all students would receive similar instruction and be given the same writing assignments and all teachers would use standardized procedures for marking the themes submitted.

The instruction and assignments employed were based on the fundamental composition forms of narration, description, and exposition as then prescribed for Grade VIII by the Department of Education. At the beginning of the three and one-half month practice period Mr. Jones gave a demonstration lesson in order to keep the method of presentation as consistent as possible from teacher to teacher. The planned teaching programme required two periods per seven-day week and consisted of fourteen one-hour lessons dealing with seven major topics. These topics were based on specific reading selections which were either mimeographed or read from a text. The reading references were designed not only to present stimulating material but also to provide all classes and teachers with a definite and similar point of departure. Each major topic contained material for two lessons, "a" and "b", related by content and/or technique. This "paired-lessons" arrangement made it possible for students to improve paragraph form, to change the focus, or to expand ideas. Revision such as this, it was hoped, would contribute more to the improvement of written composition than would mere error-correction and re-copying of the original themes. Each one-hour lesson was divided into two roughly equal parts, the first being for instruction and the second for
the written assignment. All of the materials needed for each of the fourteen lessons, --outlines, instructions, references, etc., were prepared in advance and placed in the teachers' manual. It should be noted here that only thirteen of the lessons and assignments were completed when time ran out. It seems unlikely, however, that the omission of one lesson had any appreciable bearing upon the results.

The marking of the practice themes, being the independent variable around which the entire experiment revolved, received particular attention. Detailed instructions were placed in the teachers' manuals and fully discussed before the practice period was begun. The four marking procedures, while dealt with briefly in Chapter One, merit further description. At the end of every composition period the teachers first sorted each set of papers into the four sub-groups, X, Y, X₁, and Y₁ (labelled 1, 2, 3, or 4 by the students) and then marked as follows:

Group X. Marking by general impression. Group X papers were sorted into piles and assigned letter grades A, B, C, D, or E according to the teacher's general impression of their relative composition values. Suitable criteria for recognizing good compositions were listed so that the impressions formed by the various teachers would, to some degree at least, have similar bases. No marks or comments other than the single letter grade were permitted.

Group Y. Marking by salient features. Group Y papers were also sorted into piles but as the teachers read they commented in writing, by constructive phrases or short
sentences, on a minimum of one or a maximum of two salient features. So that the reader may understand the term "salient features" the explanation given to the teachers is repeated here. "Salient features are those aspects of the themes which stand out, either for their excellence or lack of it. Often, but not always, these features will be related to the particular concepts discussed in the accompanying lesson. You will not necessarily comment on the same features from student to student or from lesson to lesson. Rather, the criterion should be: What comment(s) will be most effective in helping this particular student to improve his writing ability?" These brief comments were written in the margin or below the work. No other marks were permitted.

Group X. Limited marking using letter grades. The procedure for this control group was the same as for Group X except that, on the students' papers, letter grades were placed on the second, sixth, and tenth assignments only. No marks of any kind were placed on the remaining papers. Instead, as general errors in content and/or mechanics were discussed in class, the X students were encouraged to examine their own unmarked themes in order to identify their weaknesses and estimate their worth.

Group Y. Limited marking using salient feature comment. The procedure for this control group was the same as for Group Y except that the comments were made on the second, sixth, and tenth assignments only. With respect to the remaining papers the method for Y paralleled that for X.

It should be noted here that, prior to the development
of the limited marking plan, the feasibility of "no-marking" control groups was examined. In theory such control would be desirable; in practice it was not feasible for a number of reasons. In the first place, regular marking of written themes is Department of Education policy. In the second place, the superintendent approved the experiment on the understanding that it would involve no serious departure from departmental regulations. In the third place, the school principal felt that a "no-marking" plan not only might result in unfavourable parental reaction but also might adversely affect the progress of a sizable number of students. The placing of marks or comments on every fourth theme only for the $X_1$ and $Y_1$ control groups was an acceptable alternative. For school records only the teachers placed in their own mark-books letter grades for all assignments submitted by all subjects regardless of group but the students were not aware of this fact.

One final observation concerning the marking of the practice themes should be made. Inasmuch as they entailed only a minimum of writing on the students' papers, the procedures outlined above were quite economical of teacher time.

As previously stated, initial and final language and paragraph test results formed the bases for comparing the relative effectiveness of the aforementioned marking procedures. Since the standardized language test used had appropriate parallel forms the results obtained were thought to be reasonably dependable. Unquestionably, however, the results of greatest importance were derived from the grading of
the test paragraphs. It was imperative, therefore, that this grading be done as competently and reliably as possible.

Three independent raters, all experienced English teachers, agreed to undertake this important work. They were Mr. A. G. Addy (then teacher of English at Sutherland Junior High, and presently Vice-principal of Canyon Heights School), Mr. J. F. Ellis (then Principal of Cedardale School, and presently on the staff of the College of Education), and the writer. Before starting the actual grading the raters met on three separate occasions to discuss the problem in general and the bases for assignment of marks in particular. Following these discussions the writer prepared for each rater a typed set of instructions designed not only to standardize grading, recording, and handling procedures, but also to minimize mark variations from rater to rater.

A copy of the detailed instructions is included in Appendix B. Briefly, however, the essential features of the plan were as follows. The grading scheme employed might be described as modified general impression with particular emphasis on effectiveness of expression. The main criteria for determining the quality of composition were suggested by Steel and Talman. All of the test paragraphs were identified by code numbers ahead of time so that the raters did not, at any time, know whose papers they had nor what experimental groups

were involved. Each rater independently graded every test paper and assigned a score out of twenty-five. This score was recorded and the mark removed before the paper was passed on. The three marks thus obtained were totalled and the procedure was then repeated for the second test paragraph. Thus each paragraph was assigned a mark out of seventy-five and each student received a mark out of one hundred fifty for each pair. The total mark for each student was then divided by three (the number of raters) in order to arrive at the composite mark out of fifty which was used in the statistical tables.

The unreliability of composition grading has long been known. So that this problem might be minimized certain additional measures were taken. To begin with, from the first set of papers to be graded completely, sample paragraphs, at various levels of excellence, were selected, typed, and used as guides for all subsequent grading. The chief basis for selection was close mark agreement. Next, the three raters met again to discuss and to reach agreement upon those papers showing considerable mark variation. As a consequence of this and a similar meeting later on, serious mark differences were almost eliminated. Finally, about fifteen per cent of the initial test paragraphs were set aside for inclusion with the final paragraphs. This provided a safeguard against any tendency of the raters automatically to assign higher marks at the conclusion of the practice period.

In order to assure the proper conduct of the experiment it was necessary not only to select suitable subjects and materials, to provide teachers with detailed instructional and
marking information, to establish matched groups, and to ar-
range for competent grading of the test paragraphs, but also
to exert a measure of control over the mechanics of the plan,
especially in the classroom. Several important suggestions
for controlling experimental conditions, while mentioned
directly or inferred elsewhere in this chapter are brought to-
gether here for convenient reference. These suggestions were
discussed with the participating teachers ahead of time and
were repeated in detail in the manuals. Additional meetings
or typed memos made it possible for every teacher to receive
the same guidance as questions arose during the course of the
experiment. The need for close adherence to the prescribed
lesson plans, time allotments, and written assignments was em-
phasized as was also the requirement that marks and comments
on papers were not to be discussed with individual students.
Throughout the practice period, careful attendance and mark
records were kept for all students. At the conclusion of the
experiment these records were consolidated so that it was pos-
sible to ascertain the actual attendance for every student in
each of the matched groups. So that all students would receive
the same information, mimeographed pass-outs were regularly
used. In order to facilitate the handling of the written
themes throughout the practice period, individual folders were
supplied. Finally, two factors combined to guard against out-
side influences. In the first place, students were required
to complete all practice and test themes within the class
periods. In the second place, since visitors to the school
were always encouraged to report to the general office, there
were no unnecessary interruptions in the classrooms. Although the regular Easter testing programme was somewhat longer than anticipated, it proved to be the only important break in the experimental programme.

The statistical treatment employed in connection with the experiment consisted mainly of a series of mathematical comparisons which were designed both for establishing the matched groups and for checking the hypotheses stated in Chapter One. The chief statistical procedure was application of the null hypothesis. The statistics to be calculated for each comparison were the number of subjects ($N$), the arithmetic mean ($M$), the standard deviation ($SD$), the standard error of the mean ($SEM$), the mean difference ($D$), the standard error of the mean difference ($SEP$), and the critical ratio ($CR$). For these terms, for the formulae in which they are used, and for the reference tables employed in the analysis of results the writer is indebted to Garrett.56

The data required for the establishment of matched groups consisted of I.Q. ratings based on the Vocational Guidance Centre Intelligence Indicator and standardized language scores derived from Form X of the Cooperative English Test. Once these data had been consolidated and the four groups $X$, $Y$, $X_1$, and $Y_1$ had been tentatively organized the mean I.Q., the standard deviation I.Q., and the standard error of the mean

---

were calculated for each group. For the last calculation the formula was:

\[ SE_m = \frac{SD}{\sqrt{N-1}} \]

The next step was to calculate the standard error of the mean difference for each of the three pairs X/Y, X/X\_1, and Y/Y\_1, using the formula:

\[ SE_D = \sqrt{SE_{M_1}^2 + SE_{M_2}^2} \]

The final step in this series was to determine the critical ratio \( \frac{D}{SE_D} \) for each pair in order to test the null hypothesis. These calculations were then repeated for the initial standardized test scores. If, at that time, there were no significant mean differences with respect to either the I. Q. ratings or the standardized language test scores one might reasonably conclude that the groups were satisfactorily matched and the experiment could proceed directly. However, as a final check on the closeness of matching, the same procedures were applied to the initial test paragraph scores when these became available.

At this point it should again be noted that some of the subjects for whom the original matching data were complete, subsequently moved away, missed three or more practice assignments, or were absent for one or more final language and paragraph tests. At the conclusion of the experiment it was necessary, therefore, to repeat the aforementioned calculations with a somewhat smaller "N" in each group. These revised
results are summarized in Table I of Chapter Three.

At the conclusion of the practice period the first results available for study were the final standardized language test scores. The statistical procedures applied to the initial test scores were repeated using the final scores, the assumption being that, intervening practice notwithstanding, there would still be no significant mean score difference between X and Y, X and X₁, or Y and Y₁. Thus, the chief aim was not so much to determine the size of the absolute gain but rather to ascertain whether there had been any appreciable change in the relative position of the groups between the initial and final testing.

When the final test paragraph scores were available the null hypothesis was again employed for the inter-group comparisons. This time, however, the standard error of the mean difference between each comparison was determined by the formula:

\[
SE_D = \sqrt{(SE_{M_{x_1}}^2 + SE_{M_{x_2}}^2) (1 - r^2_{xy})}
\]

The introduction of the correlation term into the formula produces a smaller standard error. This is quite reasonable for, according to Garrett, "when two groups have been matched in some test or tests their variability is restricted in all functions correlated with the matching variables."[57] In this case, the correlation between the standardized language test

[57] Ibid., p. 232.
scores and the test paragraph scores was determined by the product-moment method outlined by Garrett. The obtained coefficient of .60 was calculated using the combined N of two hundred forty-six.

The findings with respect to the final language and paragraph test scores are summarized in Table II.

The calculations just described completed the mathematical analysis, as originally planned. Subsequently, however, further analysis was undertaken in order that the available data might be used more fully.

Up to this point the total population used in the calculations was two hundred forty-six and included subjects who were present for at least eleven-thirteenths of the practice as well as for all tests. Although it seemed unlikely that absence from one or two practice periods would have any appreciable effect upon the final results it was decided, nevertheless, to check by repeating the inter-group comparisons with respect to initial and final paragraph test scores for the one hundred seventy-three students who were present for all practice periods. The results of this work are reported in Table III.

The investigations described thus far dealt only with groups in which there were wide ranges of intelligence and composition ability. Further study was needed in order to determine the relative effect of the four marking procedures on students of high and low ability respectively.

58 Ibid., pp. 134-139.
The five sub-groups to which reference is made in the following paragraphs were selected, in appropriate proportions, from the $X$, $Y$, $X_1$, and $Y_1$ "full practice" groups. Since the sub-groups were small it was possible to use the difference method suggested by Garrett for determining the standard error of the difference between means.\footnote{Ibid., pp. 227-228.} This method uses the formulae:

$$SD_D = \sqrt{\frac{\sum x^2}{N-1}} \quad \text{and} \quad SEM_D = \frac{SD_D}{\sqrt{N}}$$

The first sub-group consisted of the forty-four students (about twenty-five per cent) whose V.G.C. I.Q. ratings were one hundred thirty-two or more. The second sub-group consisted of the forty-four lower ability students whose V.G.C. I.Q. ratings were one hundred nine or less. (Although an I.Q. of one hundred nine is in the range usually described as "average" it was nevertheless at the twenty-fifth percentile of this particular population.)

The next three sub-groups were selected not on the basis of intelligence but according to their initial paragraph test scores. For this portion of the investigation the "full practice" students in each of $X$, $Y$, $X_1$, and $Y_1$ were divided into upper third, middle third, and lower third sub-groups. The students composing the upper third had composite initial scores of thirty-two or more out of fifty while the students composing the lower third had scores of twenty-seven or less.
The findings with respect to the aforementioned sub-groups are summarized in Tables IV and V.

This concludes the description of the statistical procedures employed. The presentation, analysis, and interpretation of the results follow in Chapters Three and Four.

The foregoing paragraphs dealt only with the numerical procedures used in the experimental programme. But the objective results produced by these procedures tell nothing of the subjective reactions of the participants. Clearly the ultimate success or failure of any educational method depends in large measure upon such subjective reaction. Therefore, at the conclusion of the experiment, both teachers and students were asked to complete questionnaires which were designed to ascertain what they thought about the programme in general and the marking procedures in particular. Copies of these questionnaires are included in Appendix D and the results are reported in Chapter Three.
CHAPTER III
PRESENTATION AND ANALYSIS OF EVIDENCE

The hypotheses stated in Chapter I called for comparisons between matched groups X and Y, X and X₁ and Y and Y₁ respectively. The various symbols and formulae used for checking the significance between each pair of means were explained in Chapter II.

Before the actual experiment could begin it was essential to establish that the four groups were properly matched. Complete matching data, consisting of intelligence quotients, standardized test scores, and initial paragraph test results, were available for two hundred forty-six students. Table I summarizes this information.

TABLE I
MATCHING DATA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>SEM</th>
<th>Groups Compared</th>
<th>SE_D</th>
<th>MD</th>
<th>CR</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>X</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>120.74</td>
<td>14.15</td>
<td>1.74</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Y</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>119.23</td>
<td>14.55</td>
<td>1.70</td>
<td>XY</td>
<td>2.43</td>
<td>1.51</td>
<td>.62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X₁</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>120.60</td>
<td>13.95</td>
<td>2.01</td>
<td>XX₁</td>
<td>2.66</td>
<td>.14</td>
<td>.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Y₁</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>120.94</td>
<td>14.35</td>
<td>1.93</td>
<td>YY₁</td>
<td>2.57</td>
<td>1.71</td>
<td>.67</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Examination of Table I shows critical ratios of less than one with respect to both intelligence test scores and standardized language results and less than 1.6 with respect to initial paragraph test scores. The assumption was made, therefore, that the four groups composing the reduced N of two hundred forty-six were reasonably well matched in intelligence, general language ability, and paragraph-writing skill.

At the conclusion of the practice period each student wrote a parallel form of the standardized language test and two final paragraph tests. The results are presented in Table II.
TABLE II
RESULTS OF FINAL TESTING

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>SEM</th>
<th>Groups Compared</th>
<th>SE_D</th>
<th>M_D</th>
<th>CR</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>X</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>47.03</td>
<td>7.29</td>
<td>.90</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Y</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>46.48</td>
<td>7.20</td>
<td>.84</td>
<td>XY</td>
<td>1.23</td>
<td>.55</td>
<td>.45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X₁</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>47.65</td>
<td>7.32</td>
<td>1.06</td>
<td>XX₁</td>
<td>1.39</td>
<td>.62</td>
<td>.45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Y₁</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>47.29</td>
<td>8.67</td>
<td>1.17</td>
<td>YY₁</td>
<td>1.44</td>
<td>.81</td>
<td>.56</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>SEM</th>
<th>Groups Compared</th>
<th>SE_D</th>
<th>M_D</th>
<th>CR</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>X</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>32.16</td>
<td>4.68</td>
<td>.58</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Y</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>32.58</td>
<td>4.98</td>
<td>.58</td>
<td>XY</td>
<td>.43</td>
<td>.42</td>
<td>.98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>X₁</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>33.08</td>
<td>5.13</td>
<td>.74</td>
<td>XX₁</td>
<td>.75</td>
<td>.92</td>
<td>1.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Y₁</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>32.34</td>
<td>5.55</td>
<td>.74</td>
<td>YY₁</td>
<td>.58</td>
<td>.24</td>
<td>.41</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Just as Table I indicated no significant mean differences before the practice period, so Table II indicates no significant mean differences at the conclusion of the practice period. The critical ratios are so small that the null hypothesis was clearly sustained for each comparison made. No advantage could be claimed for any one method of grading the practice themes.
The N of two hundred forty-six used in Tables I and II included all students who were present for the intelligence test, the standardized language tests, the test paragraphs, and at least eleven-thirteenth of the practice. It was subsequently decided to repeat the test paragraph calculations, this time including as subjects only the one hundred seventy-three students who were present for all of the practice and tests. Table III summarizes these calculations.

**TABLE III**

**TEST PARAGRAPH RESULTS FOR "FULL PRACTICE" GROUP**

### Part One -- Initial Test Paragraphs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>(SE_M)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>X</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>29.63</td>
<td>5.16</td>
<td>.77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Y</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>29.53</td>
<td>5.40</td>
<td>.77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(X_1)</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>30.23</td>
<td>5.13</td>
<td>.88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Y_1)</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>30.19</td>
<td>4.83</td>
<td>.76</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Groups Compared

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Groups Compared</th>
<th>(SE_D)</th>
<th>(M_D)</th>
<th>CR</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>XY</td>
<td>1.09</td>
<td>.10</td>
<td>.092</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XX(X_1)</td>
<td>1.17</td>
<td>.60</td>
<td>.51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YY(Y_1)</td>
<td>1.08</td>
<td>.66</td>
<td>.61</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Part Two -- Final Test Paragraphs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>(SE_M)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>X</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>32.63</td>
<td>4.68</td>
<td>.70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Y</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>32.47</td>
<td>5.16</td>
<td>.73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(X_1)</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>32.54</td>
<td>5.13</td>
<td>.88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(Y_1)</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>32.68</td>
<td>4.98</td>
<td>.79</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Groups Compared

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Groups Compared</th>
<th>(SE_D)</th>
<th>(M_D)</th>
<th>CR</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>XY</td>
<td>.81</td>
<td>.16</td>
<td>.20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XX(X_1)</td>
<td>.90</td>
<td>.09</td>
<td>.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>YY(Y_1)</td>
<td>.86</td>
<td>.21</td>
<td>.24</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The evidence presented in Part One indicates that the "full practice" groups were adequately matched in paragraph writing ability before the practice period while that presented in Part Two indicates that these groups developed no significant mean score differences during the practice period.

The "full practice" groups X, Y, X₁, and Y₁ made percentage gains in paragraph test scores of six, five point eighty-eight, four point sixty-two and four point ninety-eight respectively. For these large groups, consisting of subjects with a wide range of intelligence and composition ability, the different marking procedures applied during the practice period produced no significant differences between mean gains. However, the average score increase of five point forty-two per cent was sufficient to prompt further study. What proportion of this increase was attributable to students of high and low ability respectively? Did gains made by various sub-groups differ significantly from one another? Tables IV and V summarize some of the answers to these questions. The subjects included in the sub-groups under study were in the "full practice" category.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sub-group</th>
<th>X</th>
<th>Y</th>
<th>X₁</th>
<th>Y₁</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Initial M</td>
<td>33.84</td>
<td>33.10</td>
<td>30.78</td>
<td>33.42</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Final M</td>
<td>36.92</td>
<td>37.90</td>
<td>34.44</td>
<td>36.25</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M_D</td>
<td>3.08</td>
<td>4.80</td>
<td>3.66</td>
<td>2.83</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>df</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>11</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD_D</td>
<td>3.57</td>
<td>3.80</td>
<td>3.85</td>
<td>3.44</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEM_D</td>
<td>.99</td>
<td>1.20</td>
<td>1.28</td>
<td>1.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>t</td>
<td>3.11</td>
<td>4.00</td>
<td>2.86</td>
<td>2.83</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level of significance of gain</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Certain observations may be made concerning Table IV. First, as shown in Part One, all four higher-ability sub-groups made significant gains. X and Y sub-groups made gains significant at the one per cent level while \( X_1 \) and \( Y_1 \) made gains significant at the five per cent and two per cent levels, respectively. Secondly, as shown in Part Two, two lower-ability sub-groups, X and Y, made significant gains. The Y sub-group, whose practice themes were all given "salient feature" comments made very significant gains; the X sub-group, whose practice themes were all marked with letter grades, made significant gains. On the other hand, neither \( X_1 \) nor \( Y_1 \) sub-groups made significant gains. It

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sub-group</th>
<th>( X )</th>
<th>( Y )</th>
<th>( X_1 )</th>
<th>( Y_1 )</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Initial M</td>
<td>25.00</td>
<td>25.58</td>
<td>28.16</td>
<td>27.82</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Final M</td>
<td>27.44</td>
<td>29.00</td>
<td>30.08</td>
<td>29.27</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>( M_D )</td>
<td>3.05</td>
<td>2.78</td>
<td>3.12</td>
<td>2.49</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>( d_f )</td>
<td>1.02</td>
<td>.80</td>
<td>.90</td>
<td>.75</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>( t )</td>
<td>2.40</td>
<td>4.26</td>
<td>2.13</td>
<td>1.93</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Level of significance of gain

| 5% | 1% | Not | Not |
will be recalled that only one-quarter of the practice themes written by these two sub-groups was marked in any way. One might conjecture that the lower-ability students may have become discouraged when their work was returned unmarked.

## TABLE V

Summary of Gains Made by Sub-Groups Selected on the Basis of Initial Test Paragraph Scores

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Part One — Upper Third (Initial Scores of 32 or better)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sub-group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Initial M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Final M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>df</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD&lt;sub&gt;D&lt;/sub&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SE&lt;sub&gt;MD&lt;/sub&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>t</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level of significance of gain</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Part Two — Middle Third (Initial Scores of 28 - 31)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sub-group</th>
<th>X</th>
<th>Y</th>
<th>X&lt;sub&gt;1&lt;/sub&gt;</th>
<th>Y&lt;sub&gt;1&lt;/sub&gt;</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Initial M</td>
<td>29.53</td>
<td>29.46</td>
<td>29.33</td>
<td>29.67</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Final M</td>
<td>32.53</td>
<td>31.62</td>
<td>32.00</td>
<td>31.58</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M&lt;sub&gt;D&lt;/sub&gt;</td>
<td>3.00</td>
<td>2.16</td>
<td>2.67</td>
<td>1.91</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d f</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>11</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S&lt;sub&gt;D&lt;/sub&gt;</td>
<td>3.38</td>
<td>3.05</td>
<td>3.46</td>
<td>2.15</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S&lt;sub&gt;E&lt;/sub&gt;M&lt;sub&gt;D&lt;/sub&gt;</td>
<td>.78</td>
<td>.85</td>
<td>1.15</td>
<td>.62</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>t</td>
<td>3.85</td>
<td>2.54</td>
<td>2.32</td>
<td>3.09</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level of significance of gain</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Part Three — Lower Third (Initial Scores of 27 or less)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sub-group</th>
<th>X</th>
<th>Y</th>
<th>X&lt;sub&gt;1&lt;/sub&gt;</th>
<th>Y&lt;sub&gt;1&lt;/sub&gt;</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Initial M</td>
<td>24.23</td>
<td>24.25</td>
<td>24.46</td>
<td>25.67</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Final M</td>
<td>27.85</td>
<td>28.41</td>
<td>28.18</td>
<td>28.60</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>M&lt;sub&gt;D&lt;/sub&gt;</td>
<td>3.62</td>
<td>4.16</td>
<td>3.72</td>
<td>2.93</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d f</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>14</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S&lt;sub&gt;D&lt;/sub&gt;</td>
<td>2.33</td>
<td>2.48</td>
<td>2.42</td>
<td>4.07</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S&lt;sub&gt;E&lt;/sub&gt;M&lt;sub&gt;D&lt;/sub&gt;</td>
<td>.65</td>
<td>.57</td>
<td>.73</td>
<td>1.05</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>t</td>
<td>5.57</td>
<td>7.31</td>
<td>5.09</td>
<td>2.79</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level of significance of gain</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Some of the subjects who had initial paragraph scores of thirty-two or more were students with high scholastic ability but a sizable number of them were students with middle or lower scholastic ability. Whether or not the latter fact may have restricted the upper third's gains is difficult to ascertain. In any case, Part One of Table V shows that no sub-groups in the upper third made gains which were significant at the one per cent level. Gains for Y and Y₁ did, however, reach the two per cent level of significance.

The figures in Part Two of Table V indicate that all middle third sub-groups made significant gains during the three and one-half month practice period. The gain for X sub-group was the only one to reach the one per cent level.

From Part Three of Table V it may be observed that gains for X, Y, and X₁ sub-groups resulted in very high "t" scores and, consequently, very low levels of significance. Although Y₁'s gain was not so great it was still significant at the two per cent level. Apparently, many students in the lower third initially made a considerable improvement in their relative standing during the term of the experiment.

One may well ask whether the increase in test paragraph scores reported in the preceding tables represented genuine gains in composition ability or whether it simply reflected a possible tendency on the part of the independent raters to assign higher marks to the final themes. So that this eventuality could be checked some of the initial test paragraphs were withheld and, for rating, were included at
random among the final paragraphs. Initial tests could be so included without risk of recognition for the following reasons. First, dates of writing were omitted; secondly, the papers were identified by numbers only; thirdly, the content gave no time clue since half of the subjects wrote test paragraphs one and three initially and two and four finally while the other half reversed this order. The initial and final mean scores of the retained samples are reported in Table VI. For purposes of comparison similar data are given for the "full practice" N of one hundred seventy-three.

TABLE VI

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Initial M</th>
<th>Final M</th>
<th>M Gain</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Retained</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>30.90</td>
<td>33.43</td>
<td>2.53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full Practice</td>
<td>173</td>
<td>29.85</td>
<td>32.56</td>
<td>2.71</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Of thirty-nine samples retained at the beginning of the experiment, eighteen could not be included in the calculations since the subjects moved away or were absent for tests or practice. The figures in Table VI show that the gains indicated for the remaining twenty-one retained samples approximate gains made in the larger group. Therefore, it seems reasonable to assume that the independent raters were not biased and that the reported gains were genuine.

The evidence reported thus far has been based upon
objective procedures. Tables VII and VIII summarize some of the subjective reactions of the teachers and students who participated in the experimental programme.

TABLE VII

ANSWERS TO KEY QUESTIONS ON SIX TEACHERS' QUESTIONNAIRES

1. Which group seemed to make the best progress?
2. Which group seemed to be most satisfied with the procedure?
3. Which procedure did you prefer?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>System of Grading Employed</th>
<th>Number of teacher responses to questions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No. 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>a. All marked -- letter grade</td>
<td>2½</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>b. All marked -- comments</td>
<td>1½</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>c. Limited marking -- letter grades</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>d. Limited marking -- comments</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e. Undecided</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total N</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Mixed numbers in the first and third columns indicate that one teacher gave equal weight to "a" and "b" alternatives. Also, one teacher did not answer question one.

Table VII shows that, in the opinion of the teachers, the marking of all practice paragraphs not only led to greater progress but also gave the students greater satisfaction than did limited marking procedures. The teachers themselves expressed a definite preference for the regular use of comments,
either exclusively or in conjunction with other marking procedures.

The information reported in the following table is based on the answers given by seventy-eight students in three representative divisions.

TABLE VIII
ANSWERS TO KEY QUESTIONS ON STUDENTS' QUESTIONNAIRES

1. Do you think that your own composition improved?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Groups</th>
<th>X</th>
<th>Y</th>
<th>X₁</th>
<th>Y₁</th>
<th>Composite</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>62%</td>
<td>77%</td>
<td>72%</td>
<td>76%</td>
<td>69%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Sure</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>22%</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>23%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. If you had a choice which one of the following marking procedures would be of the greatest help to you?

a. All paragraphs marked in detail, i.e. every error indicated. 37%

b. All paragraphs marked with a letter grade 14%

c. All paragraphs marked with short written comments. 40%

d. Just some paragraphs marked with a letter grade so that you have an opportunity to judge some of your own work. 4%

e. Just some paragraphs commented upon so that you have an opportunity to judge some of your own work. 5%
3. If all of your practice paragraphs were assigned letter grades did these marks help you to judge your own progress? (For Group X only)

4. If all of your practice paragraphs had written comments on them did these comments help you to improve your composition? (For Group Y only)

5. If just some of your paragraphs were assigned letter grades did you feel that you were penalized because you had to judge the rest of the work yourself? (For Group \(X_1\) only)

6. If just some of your practice paragraphs were commented upon did you feel that you were getting enough teacher assistance? (For Group \(Y_1\) only)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Group</th>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
<th>Not Sure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>76%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>87%</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>(X_1)</td>
<td>16%</td>
<td>53%</td>
<td>31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>(Y_1)</td>
<td>54%</td>
<td>36%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

On the basis of the answers to the first question in Table VIII two conclusions may be reached. First, a large majority of the students thought that they had improved in composition ability. Secondly, Groups \(Y\) and \(Y_1\) had, by a small margin, the highest percentages expressing this view.

In answer to the second question thirty-seven percent of the students stated that they would prefer, if given the choice, to have all of their work marked in detail.
Whether this is just what they have been accustomed to over the years or whether they really want to have their errors pointed out is difficult to ascertain. Forty per cent expressed a preference for short written comments. Very few chose the limited marking techniques.

The results of questions three to six in Table VIII indicate that most of the students whose practice themes were all marked, whether by letter grades or with comments, thought that they had benefited considerably. On the other hand, almost half of the students in the control groups had some doubts concerning the value of the limited marking procedures.
CHAPTER IV
INTERPRETATION AND CONCLUSIONS

In Chapter One it was stated that the primary purpose of any composition marking scheme should be the improvement of students' ability to communicate clearly and effectively in writing. From a practical point of view, evaluation procedures must not only serve this primary purpose but also must not make unreasonable demands upon teacher time.

In order to find out whether an effective, practical scheme had already been identified and put to use the writer searched the related literature. This search led to the following conclusions. Composition scales were not found to be feasible for regular classroom use. Detailed correction of all errors emphasizes mechanical accuracy at the expense of the development of clear and effective expression. The evidence with respect to general impression marking is still inconclusive but this method does have the advantage of being reasonably economical of teacher time. Limited marking plans, such as the "single-point-per-theme" method appear to be most useful in complementing rather than in replacing other procedures. Similarly, pupil-appraisal complements but cannot replace teacher-appraisal. In England a number of analytic grading schemes, characterized by great emphasis on the problem of mark reliability, have been tested under controlled conditions. However, these detailed schemes, which were prepared in conjunction with the "11+" or School Certificate Examinations, do not seem to provide a practical solution to
the classroom teacher's daily and weekly composition marking problems.

The writer proposed an alternative procedure which, it was hoped, would prove effective in improving the quality of written work without making excessive demands upon teacher time. This procedure consisted, in the main, of "commenting upon salient features" instead of assigning marks or indicating errors.

For purposes of comparison and control, four marking procedures were selected for use with four matched groups of Grade VIII students, X, Y, X₁, and Y₁. These procedures were:

- **X** — Assigning letter grades to all practice themes.
- **Y** — Commenting upon the salient features of all practice themes.
- **X₁** — Assigning letter grades to one-quarter of the practice themes.
- **Y₁** — Commenting upon the salient features of one-quarter of the practice themes.

The problem was then stated, "To investigate the relative effectiveness of four procedures for evaluating students' written themes." Assuming that X, Y, X₁, and Y₁ were properly matched on the basis of the initial test paragraphs the specific hypotheses for this study then became:

(a) There will be no significant mean score difference between X and Y on the final test paragraphs when all Group X practice themes have been marked by the general impression method (letter grade only), and all Group Y practice themes by the salient features method.
(b) There will be no significant mean score difference between X and X₁ on the final test paragraphs when all Group X practice themes have been marked by the general impression method and only one-quarter of the Group X₁ practice themes have been marked by the same method.

(c) There will be no significant mean score difference between Y and Y₁ on the final test paragraphs when all Group Y practice themes have been marked by the salient features method and only one-quarter of the Group Y₁ practice themes have been marked by the same method.

Table II, dealing as it does with the two hundred forty-six cases for whom complete matching data were available, supplies the basic information needed for testing the aforementioned hypotheses. All six of the critical ratios listed are less than one and the null hypothesis is sustained throughout. Therefore it seems reasonable to assume that the slight mean differences reported may easily have arisen by chance. Similarly, Table III which lists the results derived from the smaller "full practice" group of one hundred seventy-three, reports no significant mean or standard deviation differences between X and Y, X and X₁, or Y and Y₁, and thus confirms the conclusions based upon Table II.

These two sets of results appear to indicate that Group X students, whose work was always graded with letter grades, made approximately the same progress as Group Y students whose work was always marked with "salient feature" comments. Furthermore, Group X₁ and Group Y₁ students, whose
work was marked only one-quarter of the time apparently pro-
gressed as well as the students whose work was marked all of
the time. Evidently, none of the four procedures used proved
more effective than the others.

However, the large heterogeneous groups to which
Tables II and III refer included a wide range of intelligence
and composition ability. Tables IV and V summarize the fur-
ther studies which were carried out with respect to smaller,
homogeneous sub-groups. These investigations, it may be
noted, consisted of testing the significance of the initial
to final gains made by each sub-group in a specific ability
category.

Part One of Table IV shows that all four sub-groups
of students with high intelligence made significant gains
while Part Two shows that only X and Y sub-groups of the
students with lower intelligence made significant gains. The
high ability students progressed favourably regardless of
marking procedures. The lower ability students appeared to
progress favourably only if their work received regular
teacher attention.

As indicated in Table V, when the subjects were
divided according to their initial test paragraph scores the
results were somewhat different. Of students assigned to
the upper third, only Y and Y₁ sub-groups made significant
gains. Of students assigned to the middle third, all four
sub-groups made significant gains. Of students assigned to
the lower third all four sub-groups again made significant
gains. In fact, the t-scores for all lower third sub-groups
except $Y_1$ were much higher than required for the one per cent significance level. It appears that, in general, students who started out with low marks made greater progress than those who began with high marks. This is not surprising since the range through which gains could readily be made was much less restricted for students whose scores were low initially than for students whose scores were high initially. Another factor which may help to account for the recorded outcomes is the probable inequality of raw score units at different points on the scale. Finally, the upper and lower third results may be related to the phenomenon known as "regression towards the mean" which may occur when correlated tests, such as the initial and final paragraph tests, are given at suitable intervals.

Looking at the results of Tables IV and V as a whole, one might observe that the $Y$ sub-groups were the only ones which made significant gains throughout. The $Y$ "$t$-scores" were quite high not only for students in both high and low scholastic aptitude categories but also for students in both high and low initial composition ability categories. Similarly, the $Y_1$ sub-groups, with one exception, had a consistent pattern of significant gains. The apparent advantage held by the $Y$ and $Y_1$ sub-groups was, however, hardly large enough to warrant any definite conclusion.

What factors, quite apart from the procedures used for marking the practice themes, may have led to the rather inconclusive results? One of the most striking features of Tables II - V is the smallness of the gains reported through-
out. How can we account for improvements of only four to six per cent after three and one-half months of carefully-planned instruction and practice?

In the first place, although the students had little paragraph work as such during the first part of the Grade VIII year, they did have considerable practice in the mechanical aspects of written language. Furthermore, paragraph work had received appropriate emphasis during the Grade VII year. These two factors may have tended to restrict the degree of improvement possible during the latter half of Grade VIII.

In the second place, for the purpose of equalizing writer and marker appeal, the initial and final test paragraph assignments made were similar in idea and design. Looking back, however, one wonders if the final tests lacked the motivation that completely new themes might have provided. In the third place, the final writing was done during the first week of June, --perhaps some of the students, especially those with good grades, had begun to relax a little with the end of the year in sight. Finally, the raters were aware that excessive differences between initial and final scores would be open to question. Consequently, they may have been rather conservative in their final assessments.

In the view of the writer, the subjective opinions of both teachers and students are of particular value, for no educational method can be truly successful unless it has earned the approbation of the people who use it.

From Tables VII and VIII it is evident that both teachers and students thought that the marking of all themes
contributed more to the improvement of written composition than did limited marking. Psychologically this view is important, even though it is not borne out by the experimental evidence. It also may be seen that both teachers and students selected, as their first choice, the marking procedure involving the placing of "salient feature" comments on all practice themes.

Some additional teacher and student view points, not reported in the tables, may help to give perspective to the experimental programme as a whole.

Many constructive ideas for alternative marking procedures were offered. Quite a number of students as well as some teachers suggested that a combination of letter grades and comments might prove desirable. Others suggested that all-error marking be incorporated with the aforementioned procedure. A few students thought that the teachers should increase individualized assistance while others indicated their preference for more classroom discussion. Two teachers said that there should be opportunity for students to compare and criticize the work of others in class.

Some less constructive but equally thought-provoking suggestions were also offered. Three examples will serve to illustrate their general tenor.

"Don't write any paragraphs."

"The work should be marked by the person that wrote it --with no teachers breathing down your neck."

The third example is a classic illustration of precise and effective writing. It was simply "Go to ____."
The teachers reported that a sizable number of \( X_1 \) and \( Y_1 \) students, especially among those of average and lower ability, felt that they were being treated unfairly by comparison with students who had their work marked regularly. This attitude may have adversely affected the success of the programme.

A majority of teachers and students liked the "situation" type of lesson provided. There was general agreement that the lessons had high interest value for capable students but there was some feeling that this type of programme was very demanding for less able students. Opinion was divided as to whether enough time was allowed for the discussions and for the written work. One teacher suggested that the programme would have been more effective if overnight planning could have followed the discussion part of the lesson and preceded the actual written assignment.

When the main body of evidence in Chapter III is considered, it must be admitted that the "salient features" marking procedure, for which high hopes were held, did not prove to be more effective than other procedures in improving the quality of the written work of students in general. Nevertheless, a portion of the evidence did seem to suggest that the "salient features" procedure might prove advantageous for use with specific ability categories. Furthermore, both teachers and students apparently thought that this method was helpful. In any case, it does appear to have sufficient promise to merit further study.

In the final analysis, perhaps the type of marking
used is less important than the provision for regular, pur-
poseful practice. The limited marking groups, although not
satisfied with the method, did seem to progress as well or
nearly as well as the other groups. Therefore, the limited
marking plan, like the "salient features" procedure, merits
further investigation. Certainly, if teachers need mark
only some of the written themes, they will have much more
time for preparation and for the individualized instruction
which many educators believe provides the best answer to the
ever-present question, "How can we improve the quality of
students' written work?"
BIBLIOGRAPHY

Articles


Books


Miscellaneous


British Columbia, Department of Education. *Junior High School English, English 7, 8, 10.* 1956, pp. 12, 14.


Cooperative English Test (Lower Level), Test A, Mechanics of Expression, Form X. Cooperative Test Division, Educational Testing Service, Los Angeles.
APPENDIX A  -  TEACHER'S MANUAL

appended to

The Relative Effectiveness of Four

Procedures for Evaluating

Students' Written Themes

M. Y. McMechan
COMPOSITION PROGRAMME

English 8

Feb. -- May 1957

(Information for Teachers)

Introduction

From mid-February until the end of May the Grade 8 classes will participate in a programme of more or less formal composition for two one-hour periods each seven-day week.

The proposed programme has two main features:

(1) An orderly development of some basic composition concepts through the use of suitable reading selections and regular writing assignments. In general, the programme will include narration, description, exposition, and business letters as prescribed by the Course of Studies for Grade 8. The particulars of the programme together with detailed lesson plans will be provided.

(2) Marking or grading procedures which, it is hoped, will not only contribute to the improvement of student writing but also make only reasonable demands upon teacher time and energy. The marking schedule for the practice period may be somewhat more rigorous than usual but at least partial compensation is assured through the provision of detailed lessons.

So that we may have some basis for judging the end results, each class will write initial and final test paragraphs and will take initial and final standardized language tests (using parallel forms). The standardized tests will be arranged for and conducted by the administration. Instructions for the initial and final paragraphs are provided on another page. Other information to follow will include details of marking and recording procedures, what to tell students about the programme, instructions to students concerning writing of paragraphs, instructions relating to the successful execution of the programme, and term outline and detailed lessons.

There is no intention to make class to class or teacher to teacher comparisons of results. In any case, the method of grouping (to be described later) precludes the making of such comparisons. Rather, we hope that, as a result of our planned programme, we may be able to identify and use a more effective means of marking student themes.
The ability to communicate effectively in writing is one of the most useful skills a person can develop. Many authorities agree that the best way to improve this ability is to have regular instruction and practice in written composition.

Your teachers are very interested in finding out what kind of instruction, practice, and marking will produce the best results. So, for the next few weeks, our composition program will be a little different from the usual. During these weeks you will be writing a number of themes each of which is to be done within a regular period. The first two paragraphs will not be returned to you but will be retained so that they can be compared with those you do later.

The marking procedures, too, will be a little different. Later in the term, your teacher will be glad to go over your work with you individually, but, for the present, he or she has been asked not to discuss, on an individual basis, the marks or comments which may appear on your papers.

In the meantime, you may be sure that you will all receive the same instruction in class, and also that all of you will be given credit for the best work you submit.

So, always do your best. In this way you will not only help yourself but also will provide your teachers with valuable information about the most useful kind of composition program for our school.
General Procedure for Composition (Lessons I a -- b)

(Information for Students -- to be firmly fixed in the composition section of each student's looseleaf and to be referred to as often as necessary.)

(a) Each composition lesson for the next few weeks will begin with a short reading selection, either from your text or mimeographed. Read the selection and be prepared to answer questions about it. Careful reading in the first part of the period should result in more effective writing in the second part. Do not write on mimeographed materials unless instructed to do so.

(b) Each lesson will include some instruction, either review or new work. Listen carefully as you will be expected to work entirely on your own in the latter part of the period.

(c) Each lesson will include a written assignment to be done in the second half of the hour.

(c) For each written assignment always have ready an unmarked sheet of looseleaf paper. Prepare it as follows:

1. In the upper left corner of the front, identify your paper using the number 1, 2, 3, or 4, as instructed by your teacher. Write your number in the margin of this paper so that you will always be able to refer to it. This number is for your teacher's use and is in no way related to your class standing or composition ability.
2. In the upper right corner indicate the lesson number (1 a, 3 c, etc.).
3. Unless there is one already, draw a one-inch margin at the left of your paper.
4. Write your name and division on the back of your paper.

(e) Each written assignment will have three parts: title, phrasal outline, and paragraph(s). Your teacher will tell you how and when to proceed for each lesson but always think before you write and then, write as neatly as you can. Make a good impression on the reader.

(f) At the end of the hour you will hand in your written work. Watch your timing so that you will be finished, if possible, about five minutes before the end of the period. Use this time to re-check your work by asking yourself the questions which follow:

(i) Have I spelled and punctuated correctly?
(ii) Have I written good sentences?
(iii) Have I kept to the topic?
(iv) Are my topic and summary sentences effective?
(v) Is my information accurate?
(vi) Do the words I have chosen produce the desired effect?
(vii) Have I used all words correctly?
(viii) Have I joined the various ideas effectively?
(ix) Have I remembered and used the ideas discussed at the beginning of the lesson?
Instructions for Initial and Final Paragraphs (For teachers)

Each student will write, at times designated by the office, a series of four test paragraphs. Two of these will precede the practice period and two will follow it. The writing assignments are based upon given situations (to be described later). The marking of the paragraphs will be done by three independent raters.

(a) Specific instructions (for each of the four paragraphs in turn):

1. Use regular English periods.

2. Give the students no prior notice (other than what appeared in the general introduction for students).

3. Tell the students that they are going to write a paragraph, but do not explain that it is a test paragraph.

4. Hand out foolscap but tell the students to await the instructions which accompany the situation outline. (The mechanical organization is designed to assist the raters.)

5. Hand out mimeographed copies of student instructions and situation outlines. Advise the class to read the instructions and the outline carefully.

6. Watch the time limits. Students are to have fifteen minutes for reading the instructions, preparing their papers, studying the outline, planning their paragraphs, and writing their phrasal outlines. At the end of fifteen minutes, instruct them to begin the paragraph proper. After fifteen additional minutes tell the students they now have five minutes in which to finish and to check their work by asking themselves the questions on their own instruction sheets. Provide no assistance in the actual planning or writing.

7. Collect the papers, place them in the envelope provided, and send them to the office with the following notation:

Paragraph Number (fill in), Division ________

(b) Notes re paragraph topics.

The four situations, described on the following page, were not chosen at random but are designed so that they provide some bases for comparing the initial and final products. If you study the outlines you will observe that "a (1)" and "b (1)" are parallel in that both situations are realistic, both involve the feeling of fear, and both provide the skeleton of the paragraph. Similarly, "a (2)" and "b (2)" are parallel in that both have the "dream approach", both involve exciting adventure, and both require the student to provide his own ideas almost entirely.
Instructions to Students

1. Please do not mark this paper in any way.

2. Do not write anything on your foolscap until you have read the instructions carefully.

3. Draw a one-inch margin at the left and a one-half inch margin at the right of your paper (Page 1). Write your name and division number on the other side of the paper at the bottom (Page 2).

4. Six full spaces up from the bottom of the first page draw a straight line across the page. Then at two-space intervals draw two more lines below the first one so that there are three such intervals altogether. (See sample provided).

5. You are going to write a paragraph based on the mimeographed outline below. Before you write anything, read the outline carefully and plan what you are going to say. Then write a phrasal outline (6 or 7 phrases). Do not start the paragraph proper until your teacher tells you to do so. When you finish, check your work by asking yourself the following questions:

   (i) Have I spelled and punctuated correctly?
   (ii) Have I written good sentences?
   (iii) Have I kept to the topic?
   (iv) Are my topic and summary sentences effective?
   (v) Is my information accurate?
   (vi) Do the words I have chosen produce the desired effect? Have I used all words correctly?
   (vii) Have I joined the various ideas effectively?

Paragraph Situation

Imagine that you have just had the experience outlined here. Write a paragraph (6 – 15 lines, approximately) telling about it.

At home, alone or with smaller children only -- stormy night -- unusual noises -- frightened -- simple explanation -- conclusion.
Instructions to Students

Please do not mark this paper in any way.

2. Do not write anything on your foolscap until you have read the instructions carefully.

3. Draw a one-inch margin at the left and a one-half inch margin at the right of your paper (Page 1). Write your name and division number on the other side of the paper at the bottom (Page 2).

4. Six full spaces up from the bottom of the first page draw a straight line across the page. Then at two-space intervals draw two more lines below the first one so that there are three such intervals altogether. (See sample provided).

5. You are going to write a paragraph based on the mimeographed outline below. Before you write anything, read the outline carefully and plan what you are going to say. Then write a phrasal outline (6 or 7 phrases). Do not start the paragraph proper until your teacher tells you to do so. When you finish, check your work by asking yourself the following questions:

(i) Have I spelled and punctuated correctly?
(ii) Have I written good sentences?
(iii) Have I kept to the topic?
(iv) Are my topic and summary sentences effective?
(v) Is my information accurate?
(vi) Do the words I have chosen produce the desired effect?
Have I used all words correctly?
(vii) Have I joined the various ideas effectively?

Paragraph Situation

Imagine that, for the past few days, you have had an uncle who is a retired sea-captain staying at your home. During the evenings he has told you some marvellous stories about his adventures. Last night you went to bed and had an exciting dream in which you were the captain. Now write a paragraph (6 - 15 lines) describing an exciting incident aboard your ship.
Instructions to Students

1. Please do not mark this paper in any way.
2. Do not write anything on your foolscap until you have read the instructions carefully.
3. Draw a one-inch margin at the left and a one-half inch margin at the right of your paper (Page 1). Write your name and division number on the bottom of the paper at the bottom (Page 2).
4. Six full spaces up from the bottom of the first page draw a straight line across the page. Then at two-space intervals draw two more lines below the first one so that there are three such intervals altogether. (See sample provided).
5. You are going to write a paragraph based on the mimeographed outline below. Before you write anything, read the outline carefully and plan what you are going to say. Then write a phrasal outline carefully (6 or 7 phrases). Do not start the paragraph proper until your teacher tells you to do so. When you finish, check your work by asking yourself the following questions:
   (i) Have I spelled and punctuated correctly?
   (ii) Have I written good sentences?
   (iii) Have I kept to the topic?
   (iv) Are my topic and summary sentences effective?
   (v) Is my information accurate?
   (vi) Do the words I have chosen produce the desired effect?
   (vii) Have I joined the various ideas effectively?

Paragraph Situation

Imagine that you have recently had the experience outlined below. Write a paragraph (6-25 lines approximately) describing what happened.

Motor trip on unfamiliar highway -- going down hill -- brake failure -- increasing speed -- mounting fear -- sudden turning of the highway -- unexpected solution -- conclusion.
Instructions to Students

Please do not mark this paper in any way.

2. Do not write anything on your foolscap until you have read the instructions carefully.

3. Draw a one-inch margin at the left and a one-half inch margin at the right of your paper (Page 1). Write your name and division number on the other side of the paper at the bottom (Page 2).

4. Six full spaces up from the bottom of the first page draw a straight line across the page. Then at two-space intervals draw two more lines below the first one so that there are three such intervals altogether. (See sample provided).

5. You are going to write a paragraph based on the mimeographed outline below. Before you write anything, read the outline carefully and plan what you are going to say. Then write a phrasal outline (6 or 7 phrases). Do not start the paragraph proper until your teacher tells you to do so. When you finish, check your work by asking yourself the following questions:

   (i) Have I spelled and punctuated correctly?
   (ii) Have I written good sentences?
   (iii) Have I kept to the topic?
   (iv) Are my topic and summary sentences effective?
   (v) Is my information accurate?
   (vi) Do the words I have chosen produce the desired effect?
   Have I used all words correctly?
   (vii) Have I joined the various ideas effectively?

Paragraph Situation

Imagine that an uncle, who has spent several years in Africa as a big-game hunter, has been staying at your home for a few days. During the evenings he has recounted some of his more thrilling adventures. Last night you went to bed and dreamt that you were the big-game hunter. Write a paragraph (5 - 25 lines) describing an exciting incident on a big-game hunting expedition.
Grouping of Children Within Classes

Four matched groups X, Y, X₁, and Y₁ will be set up. This involves four sub-groups in each of ten classes. Matching will be done on the basis of I. Q. and standardized language test scores, with first term language marks being used as a check in the doubtful cases. This matching process will be the responsibility of the writer. Before the actual practice period begins, each teacher will receive, for each division taught, class-lists showing to which sub-group each student has been assigned.

It is the intention that the only differentiation in treatment between sub-groups in any class will be with respect to the marking of written themes. All students will receive the same class instruction, the same time in which to plan and write, and the same amount of practice. The different marking procedures are described in detail on a following sheet.

Even though this nomenclature will be retained for explanations of procedure and for statistical treatment of results, it is probably unwise to tell the students that they belong to X, Y, X₁, or Y₁ groups respectively. Instead, they will be identified by number, with 1 representing X, 2 representing Y, 3 representing X₁, and 4 representing Y₁. Both means of identification will be indicated on the class lists you receive. Rather than tell the students they are grouped, just instruct them to write the number you assign in the upper left corner of each written theme. Instruct them to use the same number throughout the practice period.

You will notice that the sub-groups vary in size. This arrangement was chosen partly for experimental purposes and partly to reduce the number of students in the limited marking sub-groups.

The main purpose of having sub-groups within each class, instead of working with whole divisions, is to cancel out teacher-to-teacher differences in presentation and marking.
Marking and Recording Procedures

At the end of each composition period remind the students to make sure their work is identified and then collect the papers. Before marking, sort these papers into the four sub-groups, X, Y, X1, and Y1. Remember that on the students' themes these are indicated as 1, 2, 3, and 4 respectively. Mark the papers and record the results before the next composition period.

X-group. Marking by general impression.

Read the paragraphs carefully, paying particular attention to content or story value and style. Keep in mind originality, sentence structure, precise choice of words, correct use of words, unity, coherence, choice of title, and effectiveness of topic and summary sentences. Note also the extent to which the student employed the concept(s) which was emphasized in the lesson. (See p. 14 of the 1956 English Bulletin for Grades 7, 8, and 9 for "things to look for" when marking student themes). As you read, sort the paragraphs into five piles, occasionally re-reading the first ones as a check. Assign marks A, B, C, D, or E in the left margins of the papers. (In some classes there will probably be no E papers and hence only four piles.) Record the grade in the section of your mark book which you have set up for this purpose. In the separate scribbler provided or in a section of your course book which you can organize for this purpose, note the lesson number and topic and record the following:

(1) Common errors in accuracy of material.
(2) Typical errors in mechanics.
(3) Brief comments, constructive or otherwise, concerning the lesson. (Optional)

(1) and (2) will be used in your next lesson, (3) will form the basis for a possible revision or expansion of this series of lessons. Repeat items (1), (2), and (3) for all groups and all lessons.

Y-group. Marking of salient features.

Read and sort the paragraphs as for X-group. As you read, comment by constructive phrase or short sentence, on a minimum of one or a maximum of two salient features. Salient features are those aspects of the themes which stand out, either for their excellence or lack of it. Often, but not always, these features will be related to the particular concepts discussed in the accompanying lesson. You will not necessarily comment on the same features from student to student or from lesson to lesson. Rather, the criterion should be: What comment(s) will be most effective in helping this particular student to improve his writing ability? The one or two comments described above are to be written in the margin or below the work. No mark (letter grade) is to be placed on the student's paper but, for school purposes only, record the appropriate letter grades in your mark book. Please do not indicate these grades to the students, in any way. Record typical errors, accuracy deviations, etc., as for X-group.
**X₁-group. Limited marking, using a letter grade.**

Proceed as for X-group but, on the student's papers, record the letter grades on the following lesson assignments only: 1 b, 3 b, 5 b, and 7 b. For school purposes, assign grades to, and record results from the intermediate papers as well but write nothing on them. It is most important, from the experimental point of view, that no indication concerning the grade of these intermediate papers be given to the students. Instead, as accuracy and typical errors are discussed in class, X₁-group students should be encouraged to examine their own unmarked themes, to try to locate errors in form and content, and to make an estimate of what they think their grade should be. As a check they may compare their average estimates with that assigned by the teacher on every fourth theme. Record typical errors, accuracy deviations, etc., as for X-group.

**Y₁-group. Limited marking, using salient features.**

Proceed as for Y-group, except that salient feature comments are to be made only for lessons 1 b, 3 b, 5 b, and 7 b. Nothing will be recorded on the intermediate assignments, and as before, students should be given no information about them. As with the X₁ limited marking group, the students should be encouraged to examine their own unmarked themes during the check of accuracy and typical errors. They should try to identify their own weaknesses and strong points on the intermediate papers just as the teacher does on every fourth one. Again, for school purposes only, letter grades should be recorded in the mark book but should be kept secret.

In summary it will be noted that, for school purposes, all students in all groups will have their letter grades recorded in the teachers' mark books. For experimental purposes, the actual written assignments will have only the following grades or comments on them:

- **X-group** ↔ Letter grade on all papers.
- **Y-group** ↔ One or two comments on all papers.
- **X₁-group** ↔ Letter grade on every fourth paper.
- **Y₁-group** ↔ One or two comments on every fourth paper.

**Note:** The following of the procedures outlined above will require careful reading and recording but a minimum of actual writing on the students' papers.

* Students should not be told that a grade is recorded whether a mark appears on their papers or not.
Control of Experimental Conditions

The following suggestions and precautions are mentioned or inferred elsewhere but are put together here for convenient reference. They are designed to reduce teacher-to-teacher differences and, consequently, to help increase the reliability of results.

(a) Suggestions concerning general procedure

(1) Except, possibly, for clarifying directions, do not help students in any way with initial and final paragraphs.

(2) Keep to the lesson plans, time allotments, and written assignments which are provided.

(3) See that all lessons are completed and all assignments collected in class time. No homework is to be assigned. This suggestion is a precaution against the possible influence of factors outside the classroom. The only exception to this is the assignment in the immediately preceding English period, of the reading lessons "1 (a)" and "2 (a)". These two selections require a little more reading time than is available in the regular composition period.

(4) In the scribbler in which you record common errors, lack of accuracy, etc., with respect to each lesson, make a note of any interruptions which seriously affect the time allotment. You will be asked to summarize this information at the end of the practice period.

(5) In your mark book lay out a section for recording the letter grades for each of the fourteen assignments (1 a, 1 b, 2 a, 2 b, etc.). Be sure to collect the assignment, finished or not, from each student each period. Record the letter grades before the next period. This constitutes not only your record of the student's work but also the experimental record of attendance and number of themes per student. This record will be most important at the end of the practice period.

(6) You will be supplied with a folder for each student you teach. All themes should be filed in their proper folders when teacher and students are through with them.

(b) Suggestions concerning the assignments

(1) During the actual writing, do not assist individual students with either form or content. (You will have given pertinent class instructions in the first half of the period.)

(2) When you return papers to the students, do not answer questions relating to marks or comments on individual papers. It may be particularly difficult to refrain from giving some kind of hint to those students in the limited marking groups. However, your close cooperation is most necessary.

(3) If questions come up, point out that each student can make worthwhile improvement by making his own decisions, by finding and correcting his own errors, and by estimating the value of his own finished product.
Outline of Teaching Topics and Assignments

The topics outlined below were chosen and are considered suitable for the following reasons:

1. They provide both teacher and student with a definite and similar starting place or situation. (See, particularly, pupil reading materials in the columnar outline.)

2. They provide a means whereby different teachers will be using the same materials, employing similar teaching methods, and giving the same pupil assignments.

3. They will balance the time and practice factors from class to class.

4. They have (we believe) a fairly high interest value for and a reading and writing difficulty level suited to Grade 8 children.

5. They represent the forms of written composition prescribed by the Department of Education for Grade 8 pupils. (Narration, exposition, description, letters).

Organization of Lessons.

Each major topic provides the material for two lessons, "a" and "b", related by content and/or technique. Each one-hour lesson will be divided into two roughly equal parts, --preparation (1) and actual writing (2). The precise make-up will vary from topic to topic but will follow approximately this plan:

Lesson "a".

1. Preparation
   
   (i) Return compositions from previous "b" period. While each student examines his own paper, briefly discuss content accuracy and typical form errors. Collect these papers.
   
   (ii) Brief introduction to new topic plus basic composition concepts.
   
   (iii) Silent reading -- text or mimeographed. For longer selections this reading will be done in the English class immediately preceding the composition lesson. (I a, II a)
   
   (iv) Brief discussion to bring out points in the selection read. (Facts, ideas, etc.)

2. Writing assignment
   
   (i) Phrasal outline.
   
   (ii) Written theme. (to be graded by the teacher before the next composition lesson)
   
   (iii) Collection of papers.
Lesson "b" (i.e. the second one-hour lesson on a major topic)

1. Preparation

(i) Return of compositions from "a".
(ii) Brief accuracy check (content).
(iii) Brief discussion of typical errors — examples on the board prior to the lesson (form).
(iv) Discussion of the means of development of the second related theme. (Revision, enlargement, change of focus of interest).

2. Writing assignment

(i) Phrasal outline.
(ii) Written theme.
(iii) Collection of both sets of papers — "a" to folders, "b" for marking.

This idea of having each major topic in two parts has these advantages:

1. One selection or situation is used for two lessons. (Reading time not excessive).

2. Some correction and revision of content and form is required of the student. (In accordance with Departmental English Bulletins).

3. Mere mechanical correction is avoided by the inclusion of additional concepts and/or by a change in the focus of interest.

Note re the nature and difficulty of the lesson topics:

1. The reading materials are not too difficult for average Grade 8 children, even though, at first glance, the topics may appear to be somewhat advanced.

2. The students have already had (in Grade 7 and the first half of Grade 8) a reasonable amount of instruction for and practice with sentences and paragraphs in general. In Grade 7 they were exposed to narration, description, and exposition, as such. In Grade 8 thus far, they have had considerable instruction and practice in the mechanics of written expression. The programme from now until the end of May provides students with the opportunity not only to put to use the paragraph fundamentals already emphasized but also to increase their knowledge of composition concepts and to improve their writing skills with respect to narration, exposition and description.
Seven Major Topics (14 lessons -- outline only)

Note: (a) refers to lesson "a" and (b) to lesson "b" of each major topic. G, D, N, and E refer to general, descriptive, narrative, and expository themes respectively.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No. and Type of Major Topic</th>
<th>Pupil Reading Material</th>
<th>Composition Concepts and/or Pool of Interest</th>
<th>General Statement for Writing Assignment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>&quot;Jungle Doctor&quot; P. 294 ff. of prescribed text, Life and Adventure (Board outline by teacher as lesson develops)</td>
<td>&quot;a&quot; and &quot;b&quot; -- Review of basic concepts of composition</td>
<td>&quot;a&quot; and &quot;b&quot; -- Contrast of idealistic and practical qualities of Albert Schweitzer. Note: The reading selection is fairly easy for Grade 8.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&quot;a&quot; -- &quot;May in Ireland&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;a&quot; -- Review of unity. &quot;b&quot; -- Emphasis on facts.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&quot;b&quot; -- &quot;Autumn&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;b&quot; -- Review of coherence and incidents.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II</td>
<td>Mimeographed Paragraph models and pupil instructions. &quot;a&quot; -- &quot;May in Ireland&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;a&quot; and &quot;b&quot; -- Development of a paragraph from a given model. &quot;a&quot; -- Coherence by repetition of a key phrase -- Pattern -- Emphasis on form and content -- Dominant tone, brief mention only</td>
<td>Descriptive paragraph on Spring in West Vancouver. &quot;a&quot; -- Parallel both form and content &quot;b&quot; -- Parallel form only. Content will be original. (Conversion to Spring from Autumn)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&quot;b&quot; -- &quot;Autumn&quot;</td>
<td>&quot;b&quot; -- Coherence by point of view (relationship of writer to environment) Pattern -- for form only Dominant Tone -- emphasized.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III</td>
<td>&quot;a&quot; -- Mimeographed selection and instructions. &quot;The Withered Hand&quot;.</td>
<td>&quot;a&quot; and &quot;b&quot; -- Development of a descriptive paragraph from a given situation with a specific purpose in mind. &quot;a&quot; -- Specific context provided (on pupil instruction sheet)</td>
<td>&quot;a&quot; -- Paragraph describing the hand in order to create an atmosphere of mystery and fear.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No. and Type of Major Topic</td>
<td>Pupil Reading Material</td>
<td>Composition Concepts and/or Foci of Interest</td>
<td>General Statement for Writing Assignment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III (Cont'd)</td>
<td></td>
<td>&quot;b&quot;—Generalized context only. (Silver appears likeable to Jim but repugnant to the reader. How is this achieved?</td>
<td>&quot;b&quot;—Original description of a character on two levels (so that a second character and the reader will have opposite reactions).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>&quot;b&quot; Description of John Silver and his actions. Pertinent parts of Chap. VIII of Treasure Island to be read aloud by the teacher.</td>
<td>&quot;b&quot;—Original description of a character on two levels (so that a second character and the reader will have opposite reactions).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V</td>
<td>Text Selection &quot;The Incandescent Lamp&quot;. (from Life and Adventure Pupil Instructions.</td>
<td>&quot;a&quot;—Expository concepts (general) --Method of summarizing briefly the author's explanation. (Facts and their interpretation)</td>
<td>&quot;a&quot;—Paragraph summary of the development of the incandescent lamp.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>&quot;b&quot;—Point of view. --Writer tells the story as a primary or secondary character.</td>
<td>&quot;b&quot;—Revise and expand &quot;a&quot; using a particular point of view. (e.g., as Edison himself).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

No, and Type of Major Topic
Pupil Reading Material
Composition Concepts and/or Foci of Interest
General Statement for Writing Assignment
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No. and Type</th>
<th>Pupil Reading Material</th>
<th>Composition Concepts and/or Foci of Interest</th>
<th>General Statement for Writing Assignment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| VI | Mimeographed Folk-lore anecdote, "The Elevator Story", plus written instructions. Note: The elevator typifies crowded moving, public conveyances in which disaster may occur. | **"a"** and **"b"**—Discussion of basic narrative concepts.  
**"a"**—Sequence of ideas  
**-Use of scene and summary concept.**  
**-Writer outside of the story.** | **"a"**—Re-telling of the anecdote using the same general idea but original incidents and settings. e.g. plane, ship, or train instead of elevator.  
**"b"**—Point of view. (Who tells the story?) Writer in the story as a primary or secondary character. |}

| VII | Mimeographed narrative selection, "Lapse of Time" plus pupil instructions. | **"a"**—Brief review of narrative concept as in VI.  
**-Re-cap of concepts and anecdotal form as in VI b but with fresh material and more difficult plot-structure.**  
**-Step-by-step teacher assistance with plot analysis.** | **"a"**—Using "lapse of time" plot structure but original settings and incidents. (Still anecdotal form)  
**"b"**—Conversion to narrative form (use of the paragraph as a punctuational device).  
**-Less teacher help and more individual pupil responsibility.** --Practice in paragraph structure. |  

"b"—Re-working of "a" in narrative form. (N,B,—point of view.)
Lesson 1a Review of the Paragraph General

1. Assign the reading of "Jungle Doctor", p. 294, Life and Adventure in the immediately preceding English period.


3. Elicit main facts from the reading, using a board outline.
   (a) Sentence One (Topic Sentence) -- Some statement of the contradictory nature of Albert Schweitzer: his practical ability and his ideals. e.g. Albert Schweitzer could almost be described as a practical saint.

   (b) Body: Group 1 - Sentences describing his physical appearance and his background.

   Group 2 - Sentences pointing out his practical qualities that are demonstrated in the story.

   Group 3 - Sentences pointing out his ideals or his goals that are demonstrated in the story.

   (c) Summary Sentence -- A statement of conclusions to be reached.

4. Assign the writing of a paragraph describing Albert Schweitzer. (To be preceded by a phrasal outline.) The writing is to be done on looseleaf paper supplied by the student.
Lesson 1 b

1. Quickly review idea of coherence. Using Our Language, pp. 41, 98.

2. Return assignments from "a". Discuss typical errors in form (on the board beforehand). Check accuracy by questioning the class on specific points of development in "Jungle Doctor". Encourage the pupils to look for their own errors.

3. Give instructions to students for revision and focussing of interest: (Details by discussion, outline only on the board).
   
   a) (i) Make your statement as definite and as specific as possible. Where you can do so, quote examples.
   
   (ii) Try to find points to bring out that other students may overlook. Don't be satisfied with the obvious things; look for the finer shades of character.

   b) Revise the summary sentence: This should make a final, general comment on the many-sided nature of Schweitzer's character in a form which will stick in the reader's mind.

   c) Select a title for your paragraph.

   d) Work out a phrasal outline according to the instructions you received in the last lesson. Be sure you have done everything that was suggested there.

4. Assign re-writing of paragraph from "a" using specific examples, improving coherence, etc. as suggested above.

Note: No separate pupil instructions (pass-outs) are required here because of the nature of Lessons 1 a and b.
Lesson 2 a  Description (Using Models)

1. Assign Model 1, "May in Ireland" (mimeographed) for reading.
2. The idea is to have the pupils write a similarly patterned paragraph on "Spring in West Vancouver". Explain to the class.
3. Tell your class to study the pattern (form and content) of this selection. The details of procedure are found in pupils' notes and instructions which follow these teaching notes. The parallels referred to would be for West Vancouver.
4. Have the pupils study the plan of organization. Again, details are on pupil instruction sheets.
5. Assign the writing of the theme on looseleaf paper. Pupils should adjust where necessary to make proper sentences and paragraph.

Note: (1) Timing here will have to be closely watched. Suggestion for the five above activities:
   1. and 2. — Total of 5 min.
   3. 10 min.
   4. 15 min.
   5. 20 min.

(2) If teachers feel this time is insufficient, pupils may just revise their work on the model and hand it in.

* Of the 14 written themes, just two are based on models.
Lesson 2a

Description (Using Models)

Exercise based on model. Coherence by repetition of key phrase.

1. The triple-spaced paragraph by Sheehan is the model; the lines are for your rough notes. You are going to follow the pattern of the model and fill in the spaces as the parallels occur to you. You may fill in some here and some there, and go back to complete the blanks later. You may wish to rearrange your ideas somewhat, moving an idea from one end to the other. In any case, you should have thought the piece through from beginning to end, in your own terms, two or three times before you begin your plan.

2. After you have filled in the blanks with ideas parallel to the ideas expressed by Sheehan, study the following organization. Column A is an abstract or generalization of the steps of development used by Sheehan in the model paragraph. Column B is an indication of the method of gaining coherence.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Column A</th>
<th>Column B</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(1) Associate yourself with the topic</td>
<td>Coherence by repetition.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2) State your topic. (time and place)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(3) Indicate your approach. (You are going to give a series of answers to the question: &quot;What does it mean?&quot;)</td>
<td>...it means</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(4) Bring in a figure of speech to show the contrast between winter and spring.</td>
<td>It means</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(5) How do you react to spring? (What do you think of clothes, sports, outdoors, hunting, etc.)</td>
<td>It means</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(6) General signs of spring on land, or on sea, or in the sky</td>
<td>It means</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(7) Specific signs of spring overhead and underfoot</td>
<td>It means</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(8) Bring in the effects of spring on young school children. (Bringing the first flowers to school; or their energetic pursuit of games.)</td>
<td>It means</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(9) How does spring make you feel?</td>
<td>It means</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(10) End with a concrete picture of spring objectified. Some person following a spring pursuit. Show him sharing his pleasure, calling out a greeting or a comment on the weather. A person gardening, pups, children frisking on the lawn.</td>
<td>It means</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3. On a clean sheet of loose leaf paper write out a paragraph using complete sentences, and using pattern and organization of 1 and 2 above.
ENGLISH COMPOSITION — Model Paragraph "May in Ireland", by Sheehan.

(Write in pencil on this paper)

What is the dominant tone?

That was a pleasant drive. It is May in Ireland. What does it mean? It means coming out of a dark tunnel into blinding sunshine. It means casting off the slough of winter, and walking with head erect and fresh habiliments under the leafy trees and by the borders of shining seas. The crab-apple blossoms, pink and white, scent the air over your head, and the primroses and violets dapple the turf under your feet. It means children returning at evening with hands and pinafores full of the scented cowslips and the voluptuous woodbine. It means the pouring of wine blood into empty veins, and the awakening of torpid faculties. It means the cheery salutations of the ploughman, as the coulter turns over the rich brown soil and the rooks follow each furrow for food.
Lesson 2 b

Description (Using Models)

1. Return "2 a" paragraph for discussion of typical errors in form and pattern. Encourage students to examine their own papers to see how they could be improved.

2. Hand out mimeographed paragraphs describing "Autumn" and assign reading. (Model No. 2.).

3. Apply the technique of 2 a to this model. Students may use spaces between lines for outline.

4. Discuss the means of gaining coherence. For 2 a it was repetition of a key phrase but here it involves the relationship of the writer to his environment (moving point of view).

5. The students will write a second paragraph on "Spring in West Vancouver" but with the point of view and pattern discussed and modelled in "Autumn".

6. Urge the students to capitalize on the topical aspect (spring will soon be here) by focussing attention and attempting to create a suitable dominant tone.

7. Assign writing of paragraph on looseleaf paper. (If the model is used as the outline it should be collected and placed in the folder).

Note: The only new pupil material here is the paragraph on "Autumn".
As Ichabod jogged slowly on his way, his eye, ever open
to every symptom (sign) of culinary* abundance, ranged with
delight over the treasures of jolly autumn. On all sides
he beheld vast stores of apples; some hanging in oppressive
opulence on the trees; some gathered into baskets and barrells
for the market; others heaped up in rich piles for cider-press.
Farther on he beheld great fields of Indian corn with its golden
ears peeping from their leafy coverts*, and holding out a promise of
cakes and hasty pudding. Yellow pumpkins lay beneath them, turning
up their round bellies to the sun, and giving ample prospects of the
most luxurious of pies. And anon he passed the fragrant buckwheat
fields, and as he saw them he thought of dainty slapjacks*, well
buttered, and garnished with honey.

*culinary: having to do with the kitchen or the preparation of food.
*covert: thicket.
*slapjacks: this was the name used at that time. We use "Flapjacks".
Lesson 3a

"The Withered Hand"

Teaching Notes

1. Return the assignments from 2b. Quickly discuss typical errors in form. (Place examples on the board before the lesson). Encourage the students to examine their own work.

2. Briefly review dominant tone and logical order, the two principles of description relevant to this lesson. Show how dominant tone can be achieved through word choice and simple imagery. Use three or four short examples, previously selected from students' themes, to illustrate this. Point out that "place to place" and "general to particular" are two commonly used forms of logical order.

3. Collect and file 2b papers, distribute 3a student instructions, and assign the reading. (On the attached student instructions).

4. Question the students to draw their attention to the fact that the story is told in the first person. (The story-teller is a participant in the story.) In the same way draw attention to the light and bantering tone of the first half of the context.

5. Go over the student directions with the class. Emphasize the switch from a light and bantering tone to one of ugliness, mystery, fear and evil. The purpose of the description is to create the necessary atmosphere for the evil which is to follow.

6. Assign the descriptive paragraph. Point out that students will have to decide individually upon a good topic sentence as part of their compositions.
1. Read the following paragraphs in preparation for to-day's assignment.

2. The following account forms the beginning of Guy de Maupassant's tale THE WITHERED HAND in H.W.P. Sloman's translation. If you want to finish the story you can find the book in a collection of de Maupassant's short stories in the school or the local library.

"About eight months ago a friend of mine, Louis R..., had invited some old school friends in one evening; we were drinking punch and smoking, as we talked literature and painting, with a funny story from time to time, the usual sort of young man's party. Suddenly the door burst open and one of my best childhood friends came in like a hurricane. "Guess where I've come from", he cried as he entered: "I bet it's the Mabile night-club, suggested one of the party. "No, you look too cheerful; you've been borrowing money, burying your aunt or taking your watch to the pawn-broker's", opined another... "You're all wrong, I've just come from F.... in Normandy, where I've been staying for a week, and I've brought back a friend, whom I beg leave to introduce you* With these words he took out of his pocket a withered hand; it was...."

"A" - Here follows, in some six lines a description of this dried up human hand, severed at the wrist and coloured with age.

"Picture to yourselves", explained my friend, "the sale the other day of the effects of an old wizard, well known in the district; he attended the Sabbot every Saturday night on a broom stick, practised both white and black magic, made cows give blue milk... Anyhow the old rascal was much attached to this hand, which he alleged belonged to a famous criminal, executed in 1736..."

As the story develops the withered hand develops a life of its own during the hours of darkness and eventually strangles the man who purchased it.

3. Your teacher will discuss the story and directions with you.

4. You are to write the description of the withered hand as it might have appeared at the "A" after the words "it was....". Your description need not be long but every word should count.

Reminders to Students

a) Use some logical order, start with the nails and work back or use the general to the particular. It may help you to "see the hand" if you place your left hand in front of you, fingers bent and tensed in a claw-like position. Notice the skin colour and texture, nails, and bony appearance.

b) The dominant tone here should be one of ugliness and of vindictive evil. There should be something menacing about this lifeless object, possibly best expressed in the position of the fingers. Your description should create an atmosphere of mystery and fear. Be careful with your choice of words.

c) Make your paragraph a complete one. It need not follow grammatically from "it was...". Compose your own topic sentence.

5. Identify your looseleaf paper with name and number as instructed earlier. Plan your work before writing the paragraph.
Lesson 3 b Teaching Notes

Reading material: Description of Long John Silver in Chapter VIII of Treasure Island (Authorized Text, 1955).

1. Return the assignments from 3 a. Quickly discuss typical errors in form. (Place examples on the board ahead of time).

2. Point out that in the 3 a description the purpose, decided beforehand, dictated the dominant tone of mystery and evil. Show how well some students achieved this tone by reading two or three short, previously selected excerpts from the assignment just completed. Collect and file 30 paragraphs.

3. Explain the purpose of the new lesson: To describe a character on two levels. The first level is the impression he makes upon a second character in the story (in this case, the writer). The second level is the impression he makes upon the reader. The second impression is opposed to the first.

The student is going to assume that he is writing a story and has come to the point at which he must introduce an important figure. The writer, as a young character in the story, accepts this figure as an upright, appealing person, but the reader who is less naive, does not accept him but “sees through” his deceiving outward appearance.

4. Having given this general explanation of intention, now read to the class the pertinent parts of Chapter VIII in Treasure Island (4+ pages). Point out that the incidents would arouse the suspicions of an average adult but the attractive and colourful qualities of Silver's appearance, voice, and manner close Jim's eyes to his suspicious actions. An example of such an action is: Silver allows a pirate whom Jim recognizes plenty of time to escape. (The students will be familiar with Silver's real character from their studies in Grade VII.)

5. Reiterate the nature of the assignment. Each student is to imagine that he is writing a story from the first person point of view. In the assignment he is to describe his meeting with a particularly striking figure whom he accepts on sight but whose actions cause the reader to become suspicious.

6. The assignment should be short and it should be original. (Not a description of John Silver.) It may be limited to the appealing general impression that the writer-character has formed, together with one questionable action or incident which starts the train of suspicion in the reader's mind. A simple illustration (which should be read to all students) follows:

A salesman comes to your door and offers, on behalf of his employer, to place, in your home a free encyclopedia, requiring only that you supply a short statement saying how useful the set is. However, at the end of all his glowing friendliness, he quickly passes over a statement, set out in two pages of fine print, that you agree to assume the costs of handling, mailing, and packaging. In your enthusiasm you would tend to overlook this aspect of the arrangement but an onlooker would certainly have misgivings.

7. During your discussion with the class, outline, on the board, the nature and intention of the assignment.

8. No separate student instructions are required. Remind your class to follow the general instructions (which they all have) in laying out the work.
Note: Lessons 4 a and 4 b, Business Letters, are quite different from the preceding lessons. It is suggested, therefore, that ten or fifteen minutes in a preceding English period be used for the return of 3 b paragraphs and for discussion of typical errors. At the same time all students will be able to see marks or comments on their papers since 3 b is one of the four paragraphs which is marked or commented upon for all four groups. If the above procedure is followed then the whole of the 4 a period will be available for the new topic.

Lesson 4 a  
Letter of Inquiry  
Teaching Notes
(No separate student instructions are required.)

1. Provide motivation by questioning the students concerning the variety and volume of business correspondence and the importance of its contribution to the efficient functioning of our society.


3. Review also the principles of accuracy, brevity, and courtesy.

4. Discuss the letter of inquiry. Refer to P. 201-202 in the text. Note that the business letter is one of the most common uses of expository writing.

5. Assign the writing of a letter of inquiry based on the situation outlined below: Nearly new bicycle -- three-month guarantee -- defective brakes -- request for suitable action (adjustment, repair, or replacement). Remind students to identify their papers as instructed earlier.

Lesson 4 b  
Application for a Job  
Teaching Notes

1. Return the assignments from 4 a. Quickly discuss typical errors in form. Note also examples which illustrate lack of accuracy, brevity, or courtesy. (Placed on the board prior to the period). Encourage students to re-examine their own themes in the light of the above discussion.

2. Discuss the letter of application. Have the students refer to P. 217-219, in the text. Emphasize the following principles:
   (i) A letter of application should follow the general rules for all business letters.
   (ii) It should make a prospective employer feel that the applicant is intelligent, neat, and careful.
   (iii) It should attempt to demonstrate (clearly, but not boastfully) that the applicant has ample qualifications and will be an asset to this employer.

3. Assign the writing of a letter of application for a job in answer to an advertisement. See the text, P. 219, Ex. 7, b, for girls, and Ex. 7, c for boys. Allow at least thirty minutes for planning and writing.
Lesson 5 (a) Making the Incandescent Lamp

Introductory Note: This is the first composition lesson following the Easter Holidays. Further, it is a little longer than the average. In order to assure sufficient time both for the necessary review and for the lesson itself you are requested to complete items 1 - 4 in the English period immediately preceding the actual composition period.

1. Have the students re-read the general instructions issued at the beginning of this programme.

2. Briefly review the principles of expository writing. See P. 202 ff., Using Our Language. On P. 209 there is a useful summary of these principles.

3. Briefly review the principles of summarization. (All but only the important ideas, your own words, no unnecessary words, phrases or illustrations, paragraph form in the third person, etc.)

4. Have the students read "Making the Incandescent Lamp", P. 342, Life and Adventure. Instruct them to watch for the key ideas and to be prepared to discuss them.

5. At the beginning of the actual composition period hand out mimeographed pupil instructions. Have the students re-read the selection to find the answers to the questions on their sheets. Take the answers orally. For convenience, both the questions and the answers follow here:

   1. What is the subject matter? A. {Science
      (Electricity
      (Lamps and Lighting
      (The invention of the incandescent lamp

   2. What does "incandescent" mean? A. Something heated to the point that it gives off light.

   3. What is an arc lamp? A. A lamp which creates light by forcing an electric spark to jump a gap.

   4. What was the specific problem? A. To find some material which would withstand the heat necessary to make it incandescent without melting or burning up.

   5. What was the first material used? A. Platinum wire.

   6. What does "drawn" mean in this sense? A. Made, manufactured; literally "drawn out".

   7. What was the next step? A. An attempt to build up a wire coil -- more wire.

   8. What is "resistance"? A. The quality that apparently retards the electrical energy and turns it to heat.

10. What do you mean by "short circuit"? A. Current takes a shorter route than is planned.

11. To what things was he restricted? A. Conductors.


Working with the students, set out on the blackboard, in outline form only, the main facts and steps in Edison's account of the development:

(a) The first encounter with an arc light. (b) The decision to change from series to parallel. (c) The experiment with fine drawn platinum wire. (d) The use of a cylinder of zirconia. (e) The experiment with the carbonized cotton thread heated in a vacuum. (f) The test for length of life of the cotton thread filament. (g) The work with bamboo filaments.

Assign the writing of an anecdotal paragraph summary, about one-quarter the length of the original selection, of the main steps in the making of the incandescent lamp. Remind the students to identify their papers and to plan their work as instructed in previous assignments.
Lesson 5a  Making the Incandescent Lamp

1. Read carefully "Making the Incandescent Lamp", P. 342, *Life and Adventure*.

2. Be prepared to answer the following questions. Pay particular attention to technical terms. Use your dictionary when necessary.
   1. What is the subject matter?
   2. What does "incandescent" mean?
   3. What is an arc lamp?
   4. What was the specific problem?
   5. What was the first material used?
   6. What does "drawn" mean in this sense?
   7. What was the next step?
   8. What is "resistance"?
   9. What happened to the coil idea?
   10. What do you mean by "short circuit"?
   11. To what things was he restricted?
   12. Why had Edison not tried carbon?
   13. What did they use eventually?

3. Your teacher will work with you to prepare a board outline of the key facts and steps in the development of the incandescent lamp.

4. (a) Plan and write a paragraph in which you summarize the selection just discussed. Use the paragraph form in the third person. Your theme should be about one-quarter the length of the original selection.
   (b) As sentence 1 of your paragraph state what the selection is about. You may require a second sentence to complete this.
   (c) In a series of sentences, one for each part of the selection, explain what it was that Edison was trying to do and how he went about it.
   (d) As a concluding sentence sum up what it was that Edison was attempting to explain to us.

5. Remember to check your work over for choice of words, sentence structure and linkage, punctuation, etc., and to identify your paper as instructed earlier.
Lesson 5 (b) Making the Incandescent Lamp

1. Return written assignments from 5 (a). Discuss typical errors in form and accuracy.

2. Review the main steps in the development of the incandescent lamp. Students may again refer to their texts where necessary.

3. Discuss the introduction of the personal note into the original selection. The students' summaries in 5 (a) were written from the third person point of view. Edison's account is from the first person point of view. What advantages has this? Discuss with the students.

4. In order to develop the "personal note" concept mentioned above the teacher may discuss the following ideas as they apply to the selection, "Making the Incandescent Lamp". (See "The Grammar of Gossip", P. 48 of The Art of Plain Talk.)

(a) *Time* magazine prides itself that "our subscribers understand the event in terms of the personality who caused it."

There may be some doubt whether personalities really cause events and whether readers really understand the event better because they are given personal details about the participants. But there is no doubt about one thing: human interest makes for easier reading. Scientific tests have shown that people are better at reading about other people than anything else. (*p. 48*)

*Time*'s human interest devices are not merely the addition of interesting biographical tit-bits. They involve argument, particularly in the discussion form, the writing of science, for example, as a sort of indoor adventure story and the direct address of the reader.

(b) The thing to do is to go through the text sentence by sentence and to look for the logical -- not the grammatical subject. After a while you discover that the logical subject is always a person and that every sentence can be written so that this person is mentioned.

In addition to the logical subject there is often the general public involved and the general public should never be general but should be "you" and "us".

5. Assign the revision of the paragraph submitted in 5 (a). This revision should, of course, involve elimination of errors and inclusion of any principal ideas omitted in the first draft. Most important, however, is the shift in point of view. Each student is now to imagine that he is Edison. Thus the theme will still summarize the important steps in the making of the lamp but will be told in the first person and will be more "personal" than was the first paragraph.
Lesson 6 (a) Folklore Anecdote ("Elevator")

1. Return 5 (b) paragraphs, discuss typical errors, have students re-examine their work, and then place these themes in the folders.

2. Briefly review the principles of narration. See pp. 67 and 94 in Using Our Language.

3. Distribute the mimeographed student instructions which include the "elevator" letter from Alexander Woolcott to Margaret Mitchell in which he recounts an interesting piece of folklore. Assign the reading of this letter.

4. Working cooperatively with the students, outline the sequence of events on the board. Discuss the essential elements of the plot. Point out which are scene and which are summary. For convenience, a brief explanation of these concepts is included on the pupil instruction sheet. At this point no detailed discussion of them is necessary as they will be considered more fully in 6 (b).

The essential elements of the plot are as follows. Someone has a dream in which he sees an object strongly suggestive of death (in this case, the hearse). Associated with this object is a person of striking appearance (the driver) who makes a short, cryptic statement which may or may not be out of place in the situation ("Room for one more"). Later, in his waking hours, the person is in a situation in which tragedy is possible but not probable (about to board the elevator). In this waking situation this person sees the striking face from the dream, hears the same words which are now quite fitting, and, in the shock of memory, withdraws from the situation thus saving his own life.

5. Point out to the students that it would be quite possible to alter the settings (two parts) and the characters and still retain the same essential plot. Discuss two or three possibilities; e.g., crossing a busy street, taking a trip by air, etc.

6. Assign the writing of a similar story using the anecdotal form (third person, single paragraph, no direct speech). The students are to create their own settings and characters but are to use the same plot.
Lesson 6 (b)  Folklore Anecdote -- "Elevator"

1. Quickly review the important concepts of narration.

2. Return the 6 (a) paragraphs. Discuss typical errors in form and serious departures from the essential plot (on the blackboard ahead of time). Encourage the students to re-examine their own themes with respect to these errors and departures.

3. Discuss more fully the use of scene and summary in narration.

4. Discuss the change in point of view. In 6 (a) the students wrote from the third person point of view (outside the story). In 6 (b) they are to write from the first person point of view (inside the story, as the primary character).

The important ideas relating both to scene and summary and to point of view are summarized on the pupil instruction sheets and will not, therefore, be repeated here. Nevertheless, most students will need some assistance in the understanding of these ideas.

5. Assign the revision and expansion of the 6 (a) paragraph. Emphasize the switch in point of view and the application of the scene and summary concept. Go over pupil instructions with your students.
ENGLISH 8
Lessons 6 a and b

NARRATION

Pupil Instructions.

Folklore Anecdote "Elevator"

1. The following quotation is from a letter of Alexander Woolcott (the Original "Man Who Came To Dinner") in which he suggests the plot of a story from the folklore of many countries. Your teacher will discuss it with you.

New York City,
April 3, 1937.

Dear Margaret Mitchell,

You're just goading me to tell that story of the elevator. I wrote it years ago for the "New Yorker" and it was my first encounter with folklore. In that version the scene was an elegant Southern home with the scent of magnolias in the air and the crunch of wheels on gravel. It was a hearse that came by and the driver with the livid face took off his top hat and looked up at the window and said, "Room for one more." It was those words issuing from the selfsame face (but this time the face of a man operating the elevator) which, in a department store up north the following winter, led her to recoil in the nick of time.

I have since learned that that elevator has been crashing steadily since the late "eighties"...more often than not there is a hearse though, I too, have known the man to carry the coffin... It is a hearse that's heard on the cobblestones of Dijon and the crash afterwards occurs in a hotel in Paris. In America the face is usually livid with a scar across it. As you get past the Rhine -- the story has long had currency around Warsaw -- the man is distinguished by a shock of scarlet hair, crowning a face the colour of a fish's belly. Very pretty.......

Alexander Woolcott.

2. Your teacher has reviewed with you some of the important principles of narration. Another important narrative concept concerns the use of scene and summary. Every event in a story does not receive the same attention from the writer. In discussing this stage of the work we will use two terms, "scene" and "summary".

The use of scene. The scene gives the reader the sense of actually being present for he is hearing the words as they were actually spoken and seeing the action as it really happened. Through the eyes of the writer he is watching the story take place. The scene is therefore used for important and intense moments. The crisis and the climax of a series of actions is always narrated in "scene" by a competent writer.

The use of summary. When the writer wishes to cover large areas of space or long periods of time rapidly, he uses summary. Such periods of time and space are necessary to the story but are not worth narrating with the specific detail of a scene.
3. Point of view is another important idea which will be discussed, mainly in connection with 6 b.

A story told by one of the characters is told from the first person point of view. Any incident in which the narrator takes an active part is told in the first person. A story so told gains in vividness but suffers one great disadvantage -- the writer cannot recount events in which he did not take part; Stevenson's "Kidnapped" is told in the first person.

A story told by the author himself, instead of by one of the characters, is told from the third person point of view. This is the point of view used in writing history and is also the one usually chosen for telling a story. The writer sacrifices some vividness by adopting this method since the action is no longer described by one who took part in it, but the author can now recount all events since he assumes knowledge of everything that happens.

4. Writing assignments:

6 a
In your assignment you will create your own settings, incidents, and characters but retain the same plot and anecdotal form. Now write a single paragraph in the third person telling a story similar to (but not the same as) the one above.

6 b
This assignment is a revision and expansion of your 6 a theme. This time you are to imagine that you are the primary character and are to write the story from the first person point of view. You will find that the indirect quotation will enliven your work and will still permit you to use the anecdotal form (no direct speech). At the same time, expand your version of the anecdote by treating some of the incidents as scene and some as summary. Avoid any errors you may have made in 5 a.
ENGLISH 8
Lesson 7 (a)
"Lapse of Time"

1. Return paragraphs 6 (b). Discuss typical errors in form (on the board ahead of time). Use examples from these paragraphs to review the narrative concepts of scene and summary and of point of view. Students should re-examine their own themes in the light of this discussion. Distribute the mimeographed student instructions.

2. Discuss the importance of time sequence in narration (the order in which the various events in the story are told). For this purpose a concrete example is provided as part of the student instructions. Discuss this briefly with the class.

3. Instruct the students to read the story of the Bradys and the Brennans. Working with the students outline the time sequence of events and the essential plot as in Lesson 6 (a). It may be necessary to explain the lapse of time "angle" employed by the writer. The key seems to be in the line "a man may live a whole life in the moment of stabbing and pulling the blade out again". It is quite likely that in that moment the son imagined one unpleasant possibility of the visit to their long-time enemies. The experience was so powerful that it approached reality. The actual event which followed was quite different from the imagined one.

4. Assign the writing of an anecdotal, third person paragraph in which the student uses a parallel plot but original characters and setting. This will be shorter and simpler than the story of the Bradys and the Brennans. Discuss one or two possibilities.
ENGLISH 8

Narration

Lesson 7 (b) "Lapse of Time" Teaching Notes.

1. Return 7 (a) paragraphs. Briefly discuss typical errors in form and serious departures from plot structure. Briefly review also the principles of time sequence, scene and summary, and point of view.

2. In this lesson the students will be required to convert the anecdotal paragraph from 7 (a) to a longer narrative form. Prepare the class for this by taking the original story and deciding (with the class) which incidents can be classified as scene and which as summary.

3. Note also the use of the direct quotation in this story. Encourage the students to include some of this as part of their revisions.

4. Assign the writing of the theme. It should contain the same plot, characters, and setting as 7 (a) but should be converted from an anecdote involving one paragraph to a longer narrative involving at least three paragraphs. Suggest to the students that they limit their narrative to scene, summary, and scene, if possible. Actual length is less important than the attempt to use the principles of narration. In this final paragraph of the series the students branch out from the single paragraph theme and have an opportunity to use the paragraph as a punctuational device.
Lessons 7 a and b. Bradys and Brennans Anecdote ("Lapse of Time")

1. **Time Sequence**

   The order in which a writer sets down the events in his narrative is of great importance.

   Let us imagine that a writer of fiction has found a happening which he feels contains the makings of a plot for a piece of fiction. To simplify the matter further let us imagine that it consists of the following events:

   1. A and B, two desperate men, plan to murder C.
   2. A and B do murder C in the library of his country home.
   3. The butler finds C's dead body.
   4. The butler phones the police.
   5. As in all imaginary stories, the police are baffled and call in the famous detective D.
   6. D questions all the suspects.
   7. D works out the possible method of, and reason for committing the crime.
   8. D exposes the two criminals who are led off to justice.

   If we arrange these events on a line representing the passage of time, they would look something like this:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>6</th>
<th>7</th>
<th>8</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A and B</td>
<td>They</td>
<td>Butler</td>
<td>Calls</td>
<td>Police</td>
<td>Detective</td>
<td>D works</td>
<td>Criminals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plan the strike</td>
<td>finds</td>
<td>police baffled</td>
<td>D arrives</td>
<td>cut</td>
<td>exposed</td>
<td>method</td>
<td>and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>murder</td>
<td>the</td>
<td>body</td>
<td>D works</td>
<td>out</td>
<td>exposed</td>
<td>method</td>
<td>reason</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

   If our writer of fiction set down the events in this order, that is, in their natural sequence, there would be no story because we would know from the beginning who had done the deed and why.

   In order to hold our interest the writer "disturbs" the "natural sequence" or the normal order of time. He would probably put number 3 first and then rearrange them like this:

   3 4 5 6 7 2 1 8

   He might omit 1 completely.

2. **Lapse of Time Plot—The Bradys and the Brennans**

   There were one time, said the folk tale, two warring clans. For convenience call one of them the Bradys and the other the Brennans.

   And the Bradys, a blackheaded people, deciding to make peace with the redheaded Brennans, invited their chief and his eldest son to a banquet in their castle. How the old story tellers always said castle or palace when they meant a thatched, whitewashed cabin.

   The two Brennans approached the Brady cabin and heard in the distance the noise of jollity. "Take your skian (knife) from your leather belt," said the father to the son, "and put it out of sight in the thatch. 'Tisn't wholesome to walk with a bare blade showing into a house of peace."
The son drew slowly from his belt of Spanish leather his long sharp knife. As the father stepped over the welcoming threshold the son reached up and buried the knife in the thatch above the door, stabbing it in until nothing showed but the brass-studded end of the haft. Then he also crossed the threshold to see his father wounded and bleeding on the floor and the Bradys crouched in a corner, hate in their faces, their backs to the wall, their weapons in their hands.

And after the battle the young man, who was strong and a hero, and a match for a haggard full of Bradys, rescued his father, carried him away across the fields and a deep river to the house of a leech who bound and healed the wounds. Fording the river he slipped on a round stone and came near to drowning, but by a great effort he survived and after many terrors saved his father's life. Then, red hot for vengeance, he turned back to the Brady cabin, reached up again, pulled his knife out of the thatch, stepped murderously across the threshold to finish the whole family — and saw the Bradys laughing and drinking, and his father among them as happy and unmarked as a man could be.

His father said to him, "What delayed you, boy, and what are you doing with the skian?"

The Bradys said, "Welcome son of a good father. Drink some poteen". Or words to that effect.

That was all of the old story. No explanations, no moral except, perhaps, that an honest bare blade is better than a blade hidden in the body of a neighbour's house, or that a man may live a whole life in the moment of stabbing and pulling the blade out again...... For the young Brennan boy a gesture had stopped the world dead and given wonderful things the opportunity to happen.

3. Outline of Time Sequence and Essential Plot.
   Your teacher, with your assistance, will outline the time sequence of events and the essential elements of the plot.

4. 7 a Assignment.
   On looseleaf paper you are to plan and write an anecdotal third person paragraph using a parallel plot but original characters and setting. Your paragraph need not be lengthy and will probably be simpler in structure than the story you have just read.

5. 7 b Assignment.
   Using the same plot, characters, and setting as in 7 a convert your theme from a one-paragraph anecdote to a three or more paragraph narrative. This narrative will probably consist only of scene, summary, and scenes. Use direct quotations if possible but, as narrator, retain the third person point of view.
APPENDIX B  -  INSTRUCTIONS

TO RATERS OF TEST PARAGRAPHS

appended to

The Relative Effectiveness of Four Procedures for Evaluating Students' Written Themes

M. Y. McMechan
Instructions to Raters of Initial and Final Paragraphs

1. Introduction

There is sufficient evidence to indicate that, providing the markers read carefully, there is little difference in the reliability of detailed, content/form, or impressionistic marking.

We shall use a modified general impression method. Composition elements to be considered, in decreasing order of emphasis, are: effectiveness of expression, unity, and mechanical correctness.

2. Description of Composition Elements

(a) Effectiveness of expression.

This includes choice of words and phrases, sentence-structure, and sentence-linkage. Since these three aspects of expression largely determine the degree of clarity, emphasis, and reader interest they are of prime importance.

Wisely-chosen words and phrases help the writer more readily and more precisely to communicate his ideas to the reader. Good sentence-structure helps to secure clarity and emphasis through variety of sentence form, changes in the normal word order, proper subordination and coordination, the use of appositional words or groups of words, intra-sentence connectives, etc. Effective sentence-linkings draw together and organize all of the ideas in the paragraph. Involved here are the use of "bridge" words and the arrangement (order) of the various sentences.

(b) Unity.

Unity, or oneness of expression, as considered here, is concerned only with the relation of the various ideas to the topic and the degree to which the topic and summary sentences are unifying forces in the paragraph.

It will be noted that the general content is the same for all paragraphs in each five-division group. The specific ideas, however, were selected by the individual students. This selection of specific ideas is related to oneness of expression. (These ideas are usually noted in the student's phrasal outline and are repeated in the paragraph proper.) The manner of expression and the organization of the ideas are both factors of effectiveness of expression. This is probably a somewhat artificial differentiation but may serve to emphasize some of the composition qualities we consider important and are trying to assess.

(c) Mechanical correctness.
Mechanical correctness also contributes something to the written theme. However, when purely mechanical errors do not greatly reduce the effectiveness of communication between writer and reader, such errors should not be severely penalized. On the other hand, when errors in spelling, punctuation, or usage are such that they appreciably reduce the effectiveness of expression, they should be penalized under that heading.

Of the twenty-five possible marks assigned to each initial paragraph (see below), approximately eighteen to twenty shall be arbitrarily assigned to effectiveness of expression and the remaining five to seven marks to unity and mechanical correctness.

3. Criteria for Determining Composition Qualities

The point of view expressed above may be summarized through the use of questions. It is suggested that marking reliability will be increased if each marker applies the following pairs of questions to each paragraph. Affirmative answers to "a" questions will be reflected in higher scores; affirmative answers to "b" questions will be reflected in lower scores; "neutral" or "partly" answers will be reflected in intermediate scores.

I (a) Does the choice of word or phrase more readily or more precisely define the writer's intention?
(b) Are words and phrases incorrect or ineffective? (Included here would be grammatical errors which commit a breach of idiom).

II (a) Does the sentence-structure help to secure emphasis and/or clarity by the skilful relating of various sentence elements?
(b) Are the sentences lacking in interest; are they incorrect in form; are the various elements left unrelated? Involved here are missing or poorly chosen connectives, misplaced modifiers, incoherences, etc.

III (a) Are the sentences effectively linked? Are they arranged in a good, logical order? The linking may often be achieved through the use of "bridge" words which show time, place, addition, repetition, causual, etc., relationships. In some cases sentence arrangement alone may provide efficient linkage.
(b) Is sentence-linkage ineffective, either because of poor "bridging" or because of poor sentence order? Or, to state both "a" and "b" another way, are the ideas joined in an interesting, efficient, and logical manner?

IV (a) Is the paragraph unified? Are each of the ideas expressed related to the topic? Do the topic and summary sentences contribute to this unification?
(b) Does the paragraph contain material unrelated to the topic? Does the paragraph take too long to get started or go on too long after the climax has been reached?

V (a) In general, are the mechanics good?
(b) Are the mechanics definitely poor?

By keeping these questions in mind the marker will avoid the error of over-emphasizing certain paragraph elements while allowing others to go almost unnoticed.

4. Marking of Sample Paragraphs

At the beginning we shall select twenty-eight or thirty sample paragraphs, say three from each of ten divisions, if possible. These will be chosen so that about seven or eight will be written by students who had A in their first term composition, about seven by students who had B, about seven by students who had C and about seven by students who had D or E. These samples will then be shuffled and marked independently by each of the three raters. Each rater will sort the twenty-eight or thirty samples into four piles, re-read to pick out the median in each pile, and assign marks of 23, 18, 13, and 8 respectively to the median papers. He will then re-read the other papers in each pile and assign marks ranging from 21-25, 16-20, 11-15, ?-10 respectively, depending upon his estimate of each paper compared with the median in each pile. (It will be noted that the maximum score is 25 when this scheme is used).

5. Recording of Scores

The recording of scores will be done as follows: The first rater records each score at the right of the rectangle at the bottom of the paper. He then records the student's name (from the back) in the middle of the rectangle, and finally assigns a code number which he copies at the left of all three rectangles. The code number corresponds to that on a previously prepared list of names and numbers. Finally, he tears or cuts off the bottom rectangle and files it. The papers may then be passed on to the second rater who follows the same procedure but records the score in the second rectangle. Before passing the papers on to the third marker he tears or cuts off the second rectangle and files it. When the third rater has gone through the same procedure the three of them will then compare results, discuss points of difference, re-mark some papers if necessary, and finally decide upon the most reasonable mark to assign to each paper.
6. **Use of Samples.**

Two samples from each of the four categories will be selected on the following bases:

(i) There will have been close agreement on the scores assigned by the three independent raters.

(ii) The paragraphs will have been assigned at or near the median in each of the four sorting piles.

These eight samples will be typed so that the same set will be available in the same form to each of the markers. Raters should remember that, while these samples will be exact copies (including all errors) of the students' work, they will not indicate in any way the appearance of the original papers.

These samples should be referred to regularly as the rest of the marking proceeds.

7. **Marking and Recording of the Remainder of Each Set**

The rest of the paragraphs will not come to the raters in any particular order. Take fifteen to twenty at random, sort into piles, and proceed as with the sample themes. Make regular and systematic comparisons with the typed samples. It may be, for example, that any given group may not have paragraphs in the 21-25, or "less than 11" categories. Make comparisons of each new group, not only with the samples, but also with immediately preceding paragraphs.

Record the scores in the same manner as on the samples.
It was warm and grey, as I looked from my cabin window, early that morning. A sense of peacefulness and quiet was evident throughout the ship. All at once I felt a sick feeling inside me, as I heard the terrified scream of a woman, and smell the raw, choking smoke! I ran from my cabin to the passenger's quarters, just in time to see a panic-stricken woman, in a flimsy nighty, rushing from her room carrying a tiny baby! Yelling commands to the crew and spectators, I grabbed a fire extinguisher and fought my way through the smoke, a damp waiter's towel across my mouth. How far had the fire spread? Would it be the destruction of my ship? My fears soon left me, however, as I saw the burned bed clothes and curtains. The blaze was soon overcome, but the damage to the passenger's property was considerable. I am certain that no guests who were on my ship, on that frightening day, will ever smoke in bed!

---

It was a starry, moonlit, night. There was a feeling of excitement in the air. I am captain of a ship on the high seas. My crew is tough, weather-beaten and grizzled. The ship I am captain of is a gallant, sturdy, fast, sailing vessel. The men seemed to have been acting strangely. Then, it happened! The worst thing that a captain can expect! Mutiny! My cabin door swung open and a long, black gun muzzle was thrust into my dark cabin. My cabin was quite large and I, with a few of my faithful sailors who slept in the same cabin, slipped out the door in the back of the room. After crawling noislessly to the after deck and sliding down a rail to the deck above my cabin we surrounded the mutinous sailors. Then the tables turned. We were the winners. I stepped down, revolver in hand, and forced the mutineers into the brig, where, prisoners were kept. After a few weeks travel I sailed my ship into harbour, where, after a trial, all prisoners were jailed for several years. I had put down a mutiny. Then I woke up. I was not such a hero after all. Although it was a dream, I had the satisfaction of being a public hero and a small-boys idol.
You have a captain visiting you — he told you some wonderful stories — Last night you dreamed you were a sea-captain — you & your crew were plundered by pirates out in the middle of the ocean — You fought them off single-handedly and got all their "loot" that they had stolen.

For the past few days my uncle, who is a sea-captain, has been visiting us, & during that time, he has told us many exiting stories of his adventures. Last night I had a dream about one of them & in it I was the captain. We (my crew & I) were sailing along quite peacefully one afternoon in the middle of the ocean when the look-out spied a pirate ship on the horizon. The crew started to panic but I was not afraid. I soon quieted them down & we got out the ammunition. Before we knew it they were upon us, jumping from all sides with daggers in their teeth! My men were so terrified they couldn't do a thing. But, I just drew out my sword & pistol & with both of them I fought the pirates off single-handed!!! They had killed quite a few of my men but I was able to carry-on with the rest. We boarded the pirate ship & got all of the valuables they had stolen. There were diamonds, emeralds, rubys, all kinds of jewells set in solid gold. Just as we were boarding our own ship again The alarm rang. But, what a wonderful dream that was!

It was 9.30 and I had to go to bed, dreaming about the sea stories my uncle a retired sea-captain had told me. I found myself in mid Atlantic, the sun was high overhead. Nowhere could I see land, only the white-caps off the high Atlantic waves. I had to fish for my food having none on board. Then I caught a fish, I had hooked it through the gills. Blood started to flow from his gills, which attracted dozens of sharks in no time flat. I keyed down flat on the deck so as not to fall over. The sun was sinking behind the waves. At night it became quite calm, the moon shone in the shark's eyes. Then it became very rough. The sharks were waiting. I could see their huge jaws. Then it happened, a monstrous wave caught the boat on its side. I was thrown into the cold deep sea. Then as that happened I found myself laying on the floor in my bedroom, finding out I had had a bad dream.
Paragraph

**On My Own Ship**

I was captain of my own ship and going to sail the high seas. One night we were sailing in the Indian Ocean when all of a sudden a storm blew up it was the worse storm I had ever seen. The waves were crashing at the boat the wind was howling around the mast. Then it happened one of the masts came crashing down. There were loud yells. Five men were trapped under it. One of the men was dead and the others we managed to get out. Then a huge white whale came charging in on us. Then I woke up yelling my head off. I just hope I don't have any more dreams like that.

Phrasal Outline

looking for treasure -- find it -- pirate ship -- chases you. -- battle. pirate ship beat -- go back to harbour circa. ripped.

Paragraph

**The "Sea Worthy"**

One day while I was travelling to an unknown Island where there was reported found a treasures hoping there still some for me. When one of my crew said there was "land Ahoy". So thinkking this was Island we stopped to have a look. Well we were looking around one of my crew stumbled on to an old cave so we all went to have a look. I went in alone and found a treasurer chest. Just as I was about to open it one of my crew said a pirate ship was in sight. So we carried the chest aboared the "Sea Worthy" our ship and set sail. While we were just out of the Bay the Pirate ship started shooting at us so we returned fire. After about ten minutes of firing the Pirate ship started to sink. So we started for home. But on our way home we ran in to a little storm -- after the storm was through we saw the water gushing through the bottom so we set out on our long boat for home. About 6 hours later we reached home without the treasure in all the excitement we foregot about the treasure. Before that the "Sea Worthy" had ridden out many a storm but this time with a treasure aboard it had to sink. My next boat is going to be called. "Unsea Worthy".
APPENDIX C — SAMPLES OF STUDENT
TEST AND PRACTICE PARAGRAPHS

appended to

The Relative Effectiveness of Four
Procedures for Evaluating
Students' Written Themes

M. Y. McMechan
Phrasal outline

1. New highway in interior B.C.
2. Down steep hill
3. Brakes don't respond
4. Stopped fear, almost panic
5. Approaching bend in the road
6. Clear road ahead
7. Conclusion

A Lucky Break

I was on a camping trip in the B.C. Interior when it almost met disaster. It happened when I was driving along an unfamiliar stretch of highway and approaching a steep hill as I started down the steep incline my speed increased so I applied the brakes. They didn't respond! Helplessly my speedometer needle climbed on the dial. Then it followed a sudden drop in which I almost lost control of myself. Fortunately ahead I realized that if a car or truck came around the turn ahead I
ursted past it would mean instant
seconds later
depth plowed around the turn
and onto a clear highway ahead.
Next time I shall remember to
have my brakes checked before
I take another trip.
sudden turning of highway
didn't turn speed through open gate
ran up on grass up little hummock
stop on top all happened so quickly

A few days ago, when we were taking
a motor trip down to Seattle we had a
frightening experience. It was about
7 o'clock and we were just starting down
Queen Elizabeth Hill on Highway 99. We
had never been there before and were very
interested in the surrounding countryside
when all of a sudden the brakes failed.
Our speed was increasing rapidly and my
little brother started crying. There was a
sudden turning in the highway but God
saw it to late. Luckily there was a bridge
across the ditch and then a gate leading
into a pasture. The gate was open and we
sped through and onto the grass. Straight
ahead was a little hummock which we
sped up onto and stopped. It had all hap-
pened within a few seconds and we
were all amazed at our miraculous
escape.
Driving down a long winding steep hill in my new sports car, I had never been on the road before in my life. I started pumping my brakes and nothing happened. The speedometer started climbing. I could see the needle creeping past 60, 70, 80 when all of a sudden a hairpin turned loomed up in front of me. I clung to the wheel as if it were glued to it, but when I remembered the handbrake, I reached down, fumbled around not daring to take my eyes off the road and finally grabbed it. I pulled. There was a terrible scream and dust was flying all over. I could feel myself spinning then everything stopped. I got out and found myself a few inches from the edge of a cliff.
1. Having our way on a highway
2. Slowing up a hill
3. Gas Stating
4. Reaching top of hill
5. Brakes fail
6. Car can't stop
7. Railway track at bottom of hill
8. Train coming
9. To conclusion

The were coming back from a camping trip, when we came to a fork in the road. Taking the one on the right we left the junction and started down it, never telling for one moment. We were the only ones turning. The road started to decline after a few minutes and we found ourselves going very slowly to the top of an enormous hill. At the top the car started to stall and started going back wards. The driver then automati- cally reached for the brake but pulled it completely off. Being an extremely old car it was
to things happening and this all of a sudden marking again. This time it brought panic to the driver though so he jammed his feet on the brake, and the old automobile gave a loud, guttural roar and was off over the hill, licking at air and sluggish speed he realized the brakes did not work he could not stop the car. Down below him lay the railway stretched out like a silver ribbon he knew then it must be time for the 10:30 train. Yet there it was he would not have enough time to cross the tracks but just at the bottom the car stopped. Its engine was broken for good.
A silences, John, there voices again - is this it too? a shadow, creeping along the wall, looks like a figure. a cat walkin' with a snowman going to babysit on a stormy night again.

The Long Wait

"Carol, did you hear it?" cried John. I replied casually, "Ding what, John?" It sounded like the screen door opened and closed. He answered, "Oh! It was probably just the nose of the storm," I replied, "Sit down and read a book." For a few moments there was dead silence, then a crash was heard all through the house.

John started to cry. "I want my mommy, I want my mommy." I was stunned, I didn't know what to do, and then I saw the..."
shadow. It was creeping along the wall like a sinister beast. It stopped, fully silhouetted again the dinning room wall. It looked like a hunchback. Big and ugly. It looked around and proceeded to move again. Just as it was ready to step into the room a loud clap of thunder resounded and John screamed. Then, we walked the pet cat Tabby. Then I exclaimed, ‘Boy, and we glad its only you!’
I was staying in an old rundown house when it began to rain. The rain began to come harder and the only dry spot was by the fire-place so I gathered some wood to make a fire. The clouds began to rumble and thunder filled the air with a loud crash and the lightning lit the whole sky. The house was full of strange noises; the stairs began to creak and the sounds came closer just than a cat meow and spew with 5 little kittens.
The car came and took by the 
feet. I guess that she was cold to 
because she purred all night.
Plan:
1. at home alone
2. watching TV
3. thunderstorm
4. a creaking noise from window
5. frightened by the strange noise
6. the wind had forced open a rusty window

Title:
Cautious Investigation

One night when I was home alone watching television, a very frightening thing happened to me. There was a terrible thunderstorm outside and all of a sudden I heard a loud creaking sound! I was very frightened by the strange noise and cautiously got up to investigate. I tip-toed very slowly downstairs and found that the strong wind had forced open a rusty window. Afterwards I thought that I should have checked the windows and doors in the house before the storm and then I wouldn't have got so scared.
Code: 4

1. Parents went out. 2. Alone at home. 3. Mind blowing
4. Unusual howling and creaking. 5. Frightened

**A Short Scare**

"Good-bye dear, we won't be gone long."

With that my parents left to visit a friend down the street. All of a sudden I found myself alone in the house. I settled down with a good book about a couple who lived in a chicken house all their life.

No sooner did I reach the first sentence than I heard a long howl accompanied by a creak and a groan. Nothing happened so I settled down to read the first page. The same thing happened after I had reached an interesting point in my book. I was gradually getting frightened and just then I looked out the window. There were two shadows moving around outside. They approached the front porch and came up to the door. Very suddenly the door opened and in came my parents: "Rover has a thorn in his foot," dad said, "we'll have to take it out soon."

The branches of the trees rubbing together do make such a
"Scary noise don't they John?" mom said to dad. "And it's so windy outside."
Albert Schweitzer was a great and unselfish man. He was dedicated to the people in Africa, where he was a missionary and doctor. He built a hospital of very primitive materials, in which he treated the natives. He learned how to cure African diseases and taught the people.

In his hospital, he was a doctor, carpenter, and also a drawn-up apothecary. Schweitzer was certain a very great and devoted man.
Jungle Doctors

PLAN:

1. T.S.
2. Gave up personal profit and pleasure for his love of doing the simple, unheroic act.
3. His love of the natives and their reactions to the stories.
4. His love for the helper Joseph and Cjembra.
5. He strained his character in his I medical work. Dentist, etc.
6. C.S.

Albert Schweitzer, the man of many talents gave up personal profit and pleasure for doing the simple unheroic act, the service of the heart and of the hand. He loved the exasperating natives who had never known an easy life and he was going to make their hardships easier. His love for and admiration of Joseph, his helper and Cjembra, the teacher was unconquerable. He strained his character, and lost his temper trying to keep up with his varied medical work. He made himself a dentist, a pharmacist, a physician, and even his own commissary in trying to quell the needs of his people. Albert Schweitzer is truly, a man of great heroism in doing the simple unheroic act, the service of the heart and of the hand.

Organization quasi good -- beginning, ending, etc.

Faults: a series of misused words or phrases "for doing" (143) "strained his character" "made himself a dentist" "to quell the needs"
Albert Schweitzer, Practical Saint (Examination)

1. Albert Schweitzer may be described as a kind of practical saint.

Evidence that he is a practical saint:
1. He gave up his life to help others in need.
2. He used his training in a practical way and became a saint by the way he helped others in need.
3. He had literary skill which helped him keep note of all that happened.
4. It was God who called and he took his advice.

A practical life is going out into the world and living with the nations.

2. He sent my being able to do all he did for the natives and having that call him.
3. Indeed, Albert Schweitzer is a kind of practical saint.

Paragraph

Albert Schweitzer may be described as a kind of practical saint. My first reason for thinking so is because he gave up his whole life to help others that were more in need than himself. He left all the comfort of the world and went out and acted as a doctor for the natives of Africa. He began to do my second reason. He trained to become a doctor and general mechanic and also played the organ very well. He used his training in a practical way and his organ playing along with his skill make him a saint. Lastly, he had a literary skill which helped him keep note of all that happened. Once again, but most, he was called by God to serve him, too.
His success in a paint in the way that God called him and he was endowed to this call. He was practical in the sense that he went to and lived with the natives instead of donating money. This shows that his call from God was great. Indeed Albert Schweitzer is a kind of practical saint.

Dr. Schweitzer was remarkable for his love of local work and local knowledge combining with the love of religious devotion it was a surgeon writing religious books and his words were written and published and with evidence of his kindness and sympathy.
Albert Schweitzer did his work in Africa with his head and his hand. He carried out this service of the hand by building a hospital on the mission. Continually he had to help these natives, all having to be fed (and lodged). Schweitzer would sit up nights with his microscope until the daily pressure drained his nerves. He was his own chemist who had to distill water and prepare medicines with the help of his wife. He would teach to prepare their food and after would get compensated. The reason he did this was that he loved these natives. Schweitzer's service of the heard was his patience and understanding. He would sit and tell them stories of Europe and the life there. Truly, he carried out his mission of the service of the heart and hand.
March 13

Lesson 16

- giving service of heart
- by heart the was added
- by hand built hospital
- for patients
- for nation
- Dr. Schweitzer tells

Dear Schweitzer

Dr. Schweitzer had a
mission in this nation which
furnished to pavement
of hand and heart.

Schweitzer was successful
in Europe and came
to Africa to aid another
made successful one am-
ong his natives. By heart
he was devoted to mission
and he

was in hospital and tended
patients. Dr. Schwei-
tzer certainly said that
the

Voice in this heart
Lesson 16

Grammatical Errors

1. where become from
2. what kind of a life (devoted to native missions)
3. treated or as equally
4. understand native (and to make them un-
   derstand him)
5. (character).

Topic sentence - Dr. Schweitzer came to the jungle to devote his life as a missionary doctor.

Dr. Schweitzer came

Dr. Schweitzer came to the jungle to devote his life as a missionary doctor.

An Introduction to Knowledge

Dr. Schweitzer, an unselfish man, came to the jungle to devote his life as a missionary doctor. He treated the natives as equal and didn’t make them work too hard. He understood the natives’ way of life and tried to make them understand his way. It didn’t seem to matter to them or him in the different way of dressing. He seemed to be an arthouse less an labour and all else. His Dr. Schweitzer was a man who did his share of work in helping others.

Age, Purpose, Connecting - added

He, she, etc.

Need a clear pattern of organization -
Albert Schweitzer was really one of the greatest men that had ever lived in our time. Continuously patients came to be treated. Some with strangulated hernia, pyriform and other dreaded diseases, while others had wounds which had to be pulled out. For some of the natives, Schweitzer could ease their pain while he sent others home with bottles of medicine which he knew would be forgotten or disregarded. On several occasions he often determined to make a diagnosis, while natives outside were waiting to be treated. Albert the courageous wife often helped him but as assistant or anaesthetist. But even then, his work was sometimes beyond endurance. Using his own apothecary, he sometimes managed to find the time to prepare medicine or to distill water. Schweitzer was also a commissary, providing food for his patients. However, they could not pay him for the treatment he gave them. Schweitzer would put them and do the necessary binding of souls etc. anyway. He was always ready for an emergency operation whenever some one was about to be tortured with pain and agony causing him that when he woke up, there would be no more pain. Albert Schweitzer, a very courageous doctor sacrificed his own life for the sake of helping the natives, expecting no compensation for this service of the heart and the hand.
Lesson 1.B.

Schweitzer with heart & hand

He carried out work of heart building hospital

Service, all for a lodge of this SCM

Heart, food, and payment. He could have

Stayed in Europe and done success, but

Schweitzer arose to come to Africa

When he daily gave of himself to

People who would not repay him.

This was a simple, selfless act which

Was his service.


Schweitzer did his work with his

Heart and hand. He could have stayed

In Europe and been a success but

Instead he went to Africa to help the

Natives. This was Schweitzer's service

Of the heart. He carried out his

Service of the heart by building a

Hospital and the mission. Continuously

He had to help some natives, all

Having to be fed and lodged.

Schweitzer would sit up nights with

His microscope until this pressure

Stained his nerves. He was his own

Chemist who had to distill water and

Prepare medicines with the help of

His wife. He would prepare their food

And often would get no repayment.

Truly, he carried out his mission in

A simple (and unselfish) fashion.

Service of "heart" neglected.
Note (1) Exposition is the noun from the verb "expound," i.e., to explain.

(2) The exposition called for in this lesson is the making of a summary of the selection named above. Often the main points of such a selection are given in almost of the original, the product is called an outline.

(3) The topic sentence
   (a) states the general idea
   (b) gives the line of development (key)

(4) A composition will possess coherence if its parts are well ordered. An explanation of a process would be set out in time (chronological) order. The details of an argument would follow in order of importance or climax.

(5) A summary sentence (conclusion sentence) must not add a new detail, but it is a reflection on the general sense of the entire paragraph.
Thomas Edison, after seeing an arc lamp in 1878 while it was travelling around the country with a circus, decided that he would like to try to improve it. He saw that it needed to be subdivided. Then he had raised a little money to begin. He bought some very fine platinum wires but experiment with this failed. He then tried several other experiments which also ended in failure. Then Edison tried to make a high-resistance lamp by winding about a hundred feet of platinum wire around a cylinder of germanium. This lamp short-circuited itself after the oxide developed the phenomena. Not a man to give up, Edison decided to try a carbon filament. He had never used it before as a fine hair of carbon was so sensitive to oxidation. He bought some cotton thread, carbonized it and made a filament. He built the lamp and turned on the current. It lit up and he found its resistance was two hundred and seventy-five megohms. The lamp burned for forty-five hours and Edison knew he had succeeded at last. He then began to try various things and found that carbonized bamboo was the best. Edison then sent people to Sumatra and the Amazon in search of the right kind of bamboo. Then they had found the proper fibre, they cultivated and cross-fertilized it until they got the exact quality they required. Thus with the invention of the incandescent lamp, Edison is really responsible for the inventions of television, radio, and many others which depend on a filament like those Edison introduced.

Myrna Martin
Dec 2
When Edison went about inventing the electric light, he was faced with many problems. The basic one, however, was to find a filament which would not oxidize. Edison, in 1878, saw the arc lamp, travelling around the country with a circus. He was intrigued with this new invention. He had previously finished working on the carbon-button telephone and was unoccupied when the idea of an electric light took possession of him. The arc lamp was too large and powerful, and subdivisioon was to be accomplished. Every light must be independent and burn in multiple arc. To solve the problem, finances were needed and Trowry raised a small sum and formed the Edison Electric Light Company. This enabled Edison to receive a set sum of money per week and also employ a certain number of men. Edison, on fire with the thought of the incandescent lamp, had some very fine platinum wire manufactured. His experiments with this as a filament failed. He tried mixing platinum and iridium, covering the wire with a base of cerium and a number of other combinations, but all these experiments were futile. Another idea came to him. He took a cylinder of zirconia and wound about a hundred feet of platinum wire coated with magnesia from snuff-acetate. This produced a lamp that worked up to forty ohms, but the lamp short-circuited. Previously, he had not thought to try a carbon filament as carbon was very sensitive to oxidation. He did try carbon, however, as he had a high vacuum and good conditions for it. He sent for cotton thread, carbonized it, and made the first successful filament.

Claude A. Adolph
Dec. 2.
Lesson 5: "Exposition"

"Making the Incandescent Lamp" (342)

Note: 1) Exposition is the noun form of the verb "expose" or "to explain."

2) The exposition called for on this lesson is the making of a summary of the selection named above. When the main points of such a selection are given in about 1/4 of the original, the points is called a précis.

3) The topic sentence:

a) states general idea
b) gives line of development (key)

c) A composition will possess coherence if its parts are well-ordered. An explanation of a process would be set out in time (chronological) order. The details of an argument would follow in order of importance or climax.

5) A summary sentence (climacteric) must not add a new detail, but is a reflection on the general sense of the entire paragraph.
Since the vacuum was quite he thought the filament would be stable. Edison built the first lamp and turned on the current. It lit up and its measured resistance was two hundred seventy-five ohms. This lamp lasted for forty-five hours. Even so, Edison was determined to have a longer-lasting filament. Since carbon was the desired product, he set out for carbonate many different things, but a strip of bamboo from a Japanese farm proved to be superior. He sent men to Sumatra, the Amazon and Japan to discover the ideal bamboo for the filament. The contract was made with an old Japanese to supply him with the proper fibre. This man cross-fertilized and cultivated this bamboo until he reached the exact quality required. The electric lamp was at last completed. Edison paved the way for the many modern inventions containing filaments such as radar, television and radio and, therefore, his invention of the incandescent lamp was a crucial invention for mankind.

[Signature: Elmer Adolph]
Phrasal Outline

In 1878 Thomas A. Edison was shown an arc lamp that worked on a wire and he believed that the subdivision could never be accomplished unless each light was independent. He went to work with some extremely fine platinum wire but this resulted in a failure.

In 1878 Thomas Edison was trying to prove to us that a low resistant light could be invented to replace a arc lamp.

Making the Incandescent Lamp

In 1878 Thomas A. Edison was shown an arc lamp that worked on a wire and he believed that the subdivision could never be accomplished unless each light was independent. The first thing he went to work with was some extremely fine platinum wire but this resulted in a failure.

Next he tried mixing in with the platinum a small bit of iridium but this melted very easily. The next step was to wind platinum around zirconia but this idea short-circuited itself. Finally he thought he would try carbonizing some cotton thread and he
made the first filament. Its resistance was two hundred and seventy-five ohms. All he wanted finally was a carbonized bamboo and found that this was just the thing Edison had been trying to prove that an incandescent lamp could be invented.
Phrasal Outline
- Edison sees the arc lamp
- change from series mounting
- experiments with platinum and other metals
- next he tries zirconia
- tests carbonized cotton thread
- tests for endurance
- experiments to find the best thing to carbonize and finds it to be bamboo
- Edison tries to explain what importance it was to make an independent incandescent lamp

The Incandescent Lamp
Edison after seeing the arc lamp realized how much they needed a lamp which was not in a series mounting. In starting the experiment he used fine platinum wire which resulted in failure. Next he tried using a cylinder of zirconia and wound it around a hundred feet of fine platinum wire and coated it with magnesia from the muriatic acid but the lamp short circuited itself. Back where we started we decided to carbonize cotton thread and made our first filament. We had got a high vacuum and we thought it was stable. We lit the lamp and it resistance measured two hundred and seventy five ohms. Just see what we have set out to achieve. Our next step was to see if we could find a better filament which would burn for numerous hours. We found this new filament to be thin strips of carbonized bamboo. Thus Edison made the first incandescent lamp.
Lesson 7a: Narration - Loss of Time

Plan:
1. Two boys go to probation officer
2. One boy tells other to hide his switch knife
3. 5th boy walks in; second boy hides knife
4. 5th boy is captured for disorderly conduct
5. Boy runs in and grabs 5th boy from him
6. They run away captured by police
7. Boy promises to report again to probation officer
8. 5th boy grabs switch knife as he walks this things won't stop as it should

It all started when two vandalistic boys were reporting to their probation officer. Jim was packing a switch knife so Don told him to hide it in the mail box by the door of the probation officer's home. Jim walked in while Don hid his knife. As Don walked in he saw that Jim had been seized. So Don ran forward shoved away the probation officer and the two hoodlums run out of the house. That afternoon as Don and Jim were walking down a back alley a policeman saw them. The policeman makes the boys promise that they will again report to their probation officer. As the two boys walk up to the officer's home don grasps his knife and both boys walk in and see the probation officer all a grin. It then explains it was all a big joke.
The War Between The Planets

There was once time, said the interplanetary digest, two
swarming planets. These planets, one red, one green,
were fighting between one another for years, an
unknown reason. After almost fifty years of fighting,
both planets decided to make peace. The green planet
invited the chief defence minister and the cabinet to
come over to the green planet for a visit. Since all the fighting between these two planets
was out in space, this had been the first time in
over fifty years that members of the red planet had
visited the red planet. As the members of
the red planet came near the planet they heard some
conversation. "Put your Ultra-green ray guns away
in the store-room. You do not want to have fighting
break out in time of peace." This the members for the
green planet did only to come back to guns pointed
toward direction. There was a bloody battle that
followed and only a few members managed to get
back to the store-room to get the guns. The battle
turned out to be a massacre. The red planet
laughing and drinking and mixing everyone
matters as happy as could be. The chief of the green
planet said, "What took you so long and why have
you still got the guns in your hands? Oh well,
never mind, come and enjoy yourself with our
new friends! We guarantee you think a lifetime
better in the short distance between the dining room
and the store-room."
You and Sam will going to play baseball on the field across the railroad tracks with the rest of the boys. They will just about their but they had to go over a fence and across the train tracks. Sam was going out the fence when he saw the train coming and ran across the tracks and the train came right by. Joe (thought) knew Sam was hurt and ran across to the house and he looked very badly. But then he called the rest of the boys to come back and help carry him to another place.

Then he went to get his ball and met us soon as the train went by then it had gone by he went over the fence and Sam called to him to hurry and get over there to play ball. Then he asked know why he did not jump over the fence when he did.
1. The underwear was made of silk.
2. Brennan appropriated the socks.
3. Brennan approached the door.

Joe and I were going to play
four ball on the field. After we
had a talk with the coach, he
told me that I had to
climb a fence and get
over the tracks. Then we had to run
cross the tracks. Joe ran and
jumped over the fence,
and the train was going
eight by
five. Joe and
Sam were fast and so
he ran across and told Sam
and said, 'You bastard, you
was an awful
miss.'
Lesson 7a  Vacation Tape of Time

a. Going on trips to help Father carry presents.

b. Store closed at 6:00.

c. Bus is tied up in accident.

d. All except one of store at 5:55; this closed.

e. Go home on bus unharmed.

Finishing everyone except Father present except that I was going back to store and asked why they closed at 6. The salesclerk asked, "Oh, here. I do for you?"

"Tomorrow is Father's Day and I have only 30 minutes to get my father a present. Because the store closed at 6:00 o'clock, I thought it might disappoint unacceptably. "Oh, I swear this gift would hurry!" Just at that moment my thoughts were interrupted by the tinkling of glass and the shouting of voices and I saw in front of me two that a truck delivering large boxes of glass had dropped two and the road in front of them was scattered with tiny splinters of glass. After an anxious 15 minutes, for Wendy the door was finally cleared, and the bus was allowed to continue on its trip. When it reached the store, Wendy ran from the bus and saw the large clock on the door pointing to 5 minutes before 6 o'clock. With a frantic thrust she said the door but it was already locked. She dragged herself home wearily and after a sleep might get up to hear the rest of the family singing to their father and shaving. Sumner's gifts. As she entered she noticed curious stores from the occupants of the room and so she apologized, they turned around, deaf to her explanation, ignored her as if she were not there. Only when Jordan she stepped on the bus and rode.
to the store to find out why they had 
last closed 5 minutes before closing time. 
As she reached the door she yanked it 
wide open and the clerk with a friend's 
voice said, "Good help you? I suppose 
you have come in to get a Father's Day 
present. I have just the thing!"
West Vancouver, B. C.,
May 29, 1957

Dear Sir,

I would like to submit my application for the job mentioned in today's Daily Standard. My qualifications are as follows:

Age: 16

Education: I have been on the Honour list 2 times in High School. I have been taking Commercial 2, typing and shorthand in school.

Experience: During the summer holidays I worked in a large department store, keeping record of the stock.

Local Qualifications: I was elected leader of the F. T. I. T. at West Vancouver United Church. I have been captain of the school baseball team and secretary of the Student Council.

References:
Rev. T. Saunders,
Rector,
Mannie,
West Vancouver, B. C.

Mr. A. Selman,
Inglewood Junior High,
West Vancouver, B. C.

I would be glad to come for an interview at any time.

Yours truly,
(Miss) Rita Argent
letter of Application
Vancouver, B.C.,
May 29, 1957.

Box 70,
The Daily Standard
Vancouver, B.C.

Dear Sir:

I would like to enter my application for the position offered in today's issue of the Daily Standard. The qualifications I have are as follows:

Age: Sixteen

Education: I have been on the honor list three times and I am also taking a commercial course in high school. I have an "A" average in mathematics.

Experience: During the summer of last year I worked in an insurance firm and learned the basic fundamentals of bookkeeping.

Social Qualification: I am an editor of the school paper and also secretary of the Student Council.

References:

Mr. O. C. Irketer,
Principal,
Vancouver, B.C.

E. St. Louis,
Pastor,
St. John's Church,
Vancouver, B.C.

I would be glad to call for an interview at your earliest convenience.

Yours truly,

Alison Fleming.
I would like to submit my application for the position offered in today's Daily Standard. The qualifications I have are as follows:
May 29, 1957

Advertiser

Vancouver, B.C.

Dear Sir,

I am writing to apply for the position which you advertised in today’s Vancouver Province.

My qualifications are as follows:

Age: sixteen

Education: I have passed grade ten with honours at West Vancouver Secondary High School.

Experience: During the summer I worked as delivery boy for a large firm.

Social Qualifications: I have been President of the Student Council at my previous school, captain of a baseball team and am now captain of our basketball team.

References:

Reverend J. C. B. Carter Minister West Vancouver

Mr. James A. Inkster

Principal

West Vancouver
I shall be glad to call for an interview.

Yours truly,

Allen Murray

Allen Murray
Lesson #46 Letter of Application

I should like to submit my application to the position advertised in this morning's Daily Standard. My qualifications are as follows:

Age: Fourteen.

Education: Completed, with fairly high marks, the Senior High School entrance examination at West Vancouver Junior High School, with honour entry. My senior mark was 80 and I had an average mark of 85 percent.

Experience: Last summer I received a position similar to this position in a smaller firm.

Special Qualifications: I have been captain of one of the school's teams. At the present time, I am president of a C.I.T. group.

References

Mr. L. Pelikan,
Principal,
West Vancouver Junior High School,
West Vancouver.

Rev. J. Barton,
Pastor,
West Vancouver Baptist Church,
West Vancouver.

If you desire an interview, I shall be glad to call.
May 29, 1957

Box 50

The Daily Standard,
Vancouver, B.C.

Dear Sir:

I should like to submit my application to the position advertised in this morning's Daily Standard.

My qualifications are as follows:

Age: 14

Education: I passed with fairly high marks the Senior High School entrance examinations at West Vancouver Junior High School. I was on the honor list four times. My mathematics mark was A and my Arithmetic Fundamental's mark was 98%.

Experience: Last summer I received a position similar to this in a small firm.

Social Qualifications: I have been captain of a school house team. At present I am president of a C.G.I.T. group.

References:

Mrs. I. Belman,
Principal,
West Vancouver Junior High School

Mr. G. Barton,
Pastor,
West Vancouver Baptist Church
West Vancouver,

If you desire an interview, I shall be glad to call

Yours truly,
(Miss) Shelley Fowler

Shelley Fowler
APPENDIX D  -  SAMPLES OF QUESTIONNAIRES

appended to

The Relative Effectiveness of Four

Procedures for Evaluating

Students' Written Themes

M. Y. McMechan
1. First of all, thank you very much for your cooperation in this research project.

2. Did you feel that the programme as a whole required more time and effort than you would ordinarily employ over a 4 month period?

3. Did you feel that the prepared lessons were useful to you as teaching aids?

4. Did you feel that the students gained from this "situation" type of lesson?

5. Were there any difference between high ability and low ability students in this regard?

6. Were there many complaints from the "limited marking" groups?

7. Which of the following seemed to make the best progress: (Underline)
   (a) All marked - letter grades
   (b) All marked - comments
   (c) Limited marking - letter grades
   (d) """" - comments

8. From your personal point of view which of the four marking procedures did you prefer? (See a-d) above

9. What other procedure do you think would be better for your purposes?

10. If you were organizing a similar programme what changes would you make?
    More comparing and marking of para. by students - perhaps some oral reading with class discussion.
Questionnaire—Grade VIII Composition Programme
Please underline one answer to each of the following questions: Do not put your name on this paper.

1. Did you like the "situation" type of assignment which was used throughout the term? Yes, No, Not sure.
2. Do you think that your own composition improved? Yes, No, Not sure.
3. Was enough time allowed for each assignment? Yes, No, Not sure.
4. Answer this item only if all of your paragraphs were assigned letter grades:
   Did this mark help you to judge your own progress? Yes, No, Not sure.
5. Answer this item only if all of your paragraphs had written comments on them:
   Did this type of comment help you to improve your composition? Yes, No, Not sure.
6. Answer this item only if just some of your paragraphs were marked with a letter grade:
   Did you feel you were penalized at all because you had to judge your own work for some of your paragraphs? Yes, No, Not sure.
7. Answer this item only if just some of your paragraphs were commented upon:
   Did you feel you were getting enough teacher assistance? Yes, No, Not sure.
8. Answer this item only if you answered either item 6 or item 7:
   Did you feel that the opportunity to judge some of your own work helped you to improve? Yes, No, Not sure.
   Did you feel that the paragraphs not marked by the teacher were a waste of time because you did not know how you were getting along? Yes, No, Not sure.
9. All students please answer this item:
   If you had a choice which one of the following marking procedures would be of greatest help to you? (Underline one.)
   a) All paragraphs marked in all details, i.e., every error indicated.
   b) All paragraphs marked with a letter grade.
   c) All paragraphs marked with short written comments.
   d) Just some paragraphs marked with a letter grade so that you have an opportunity to judge some of your own work?
   e) Just some paragraphs commented upon so that you have an opportunity to judge some of your own work?
10. Is there some other procedure you think would be better than any of those named above? If so, describe it in a sentence or two.

Have all paragraphs marked with a short comment of 1-2 main mistakes and a letter grade to tell how you stand compared to the class.
Questionnaire—Grade VIII Composition Programme
Please underline one answer to each of the following questions:
Do not put your name on this paper.

1. Did you like the "situation" type of assignment which was used throughout the term?  
2. Do you think that your own composition improved?  
3. Was enough time allowed for each assignment?  
4. Answer this item only if all of your paragraphs were assigned letter grades:
   Did this mark help you to judge your own progress? 
5. Answer this item only if all of your paragraphs had written comments on them:
   Did this type of comment help you to improve your composition? 
6. Answer this item only if just some of your paragraphs were marked with a letter grade:
   Did you feel you were penalized at all because you had to judge your own work for some of your paragraphs? 
7. Answer this item only if just some of your paragraphs were commented upon:
   Did you feel you were getting enough teacher assistance? 
8. Answer this item only if you answered either item 6 or item 7:
   Did you feel that the opportunity to judge some of your own work helped you to improve? 
   Did you feel that the paragraphs not marked by the teacher were a waste of time because you did not know how you were getting along? 
9. All students please answer this item:
   If you had a choice which one of the following marking procedures would be of greatest help to you? (Underline one.)  
   a) All paragraphs marked in all details, i.e. every error indicated.  
   b) All paragraphs marked with a letter grade.  
   c) All paragraphs marked with short written comments.  
   d) Just some paragraphs marked with a letter grade so that you have an opportunity to judge some of your own work?  
   e) Just some paragraphs commented upon so that you have an opportunity to judge some of your own work?  
10. Is there some other procedure you think would be better than any of those named above?  
    If so, describe it in a sentence or two.
1. Did you like the "situation" type of assignment which was used throughout the term? Yes, No, Not sure.
2. Do you think that your own composition improved? Yes, No, Not sure.
3. Was enough time allowed for each assignment? Yes, No, Not sure
4. Answer this item only if all of your paragraphs were assigned letter grades:
   Did this mark help you to judge your own progress? Yes, No, Not sure.
5. Answer this item only if all of your paragraphs had written comments on them:
   Did this type of comment help you to improve your composition? Yes, No, Not sure.
6. Answer this item only if just some of your paragraphs were marked with a letter grade:
   Did you feel you were penalised at all because you had to judge your own work for some of your paragraphs? Yes, No, Not sure.
7. Answer this item only if just some of your paragraphs were commented upon:
   Did you feel you were getting enough teacher assistance? Yes, No, Not sure.
8. Answer this item only if you answered either item 5 or item 7:
   Did you feel that the opportunity to judge some of your own work helped you to improve? Yes, No, Not sure.
   Did you feel that the paragraphs not marked by the teacher were a waste of time because you did not know how you were getting along? Yes, No, Not sure.
9. All students please answer this item:
   If you had a choice which one of the following marking procedures would be of greatest help to you? (Underline one.)
   a) All paragraphs marked in all details, i.e. every error indicated.
   b) All paragraphs marked with a letter grade.
   c) All paragraphs marked with short written comments.
   d) Just some paragraphs marked with a letter grade so that you have an opportunity to judge some of your own work?
   e) Just some paragraphs commented upon so that you have an opportunity to judge some of your own work?
10. Is there some other procedure you think would be better than any of those named above? Yes, If so, describe it in a sentence or two.

   They could grade them very fair, good, excellent etc.
   0 1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 5+, 0, etc.
Questionnaire—Grade VIII Composition Programme

Please underline one answer to each of the following questions:
Do not put your name on this paper.

1. Did you like the "situation" type of assignment which was used throughout the term?  
   Yes, No, Not sure.

2. Do you think that your own composition improved?  
   Yes, No, Not sure.

3. Was enough time allowed for each assignment?  
   Yes, No, Not sure.

4. Answer this item only if all of your paragraphs were assigned letter grades:
   Did this mark help you to judge your own progress? Yes, No, Not sure.

5. Answer this item only if all of your paragraphs had written comments on them:
   Did this type of comment help you to improve your composition? Yes, No, Not sure.

6. Answer this item only if just some of your paragraphs were marked with a letter grade:
   Did you feel you were penalized at all because you had to judge your own work for some of your paragraphs? Yes, No, Not sure.

7. Answer this item only if just some of your paragraphs were commented upon:
   Did you feel you were getting enough teacher assistance? Yes, No, Not sure.

8. Answer this item only if you answered either item 6 or item 7:
   Did you feel that the opportunity to judge some of your own work helped you to improve? Yes, No, Not sure.
   Did you feel that the paragraphs not marked by the teacher were a waste of time because you did not know how you were getting along? Yes, No, Not sure.

9. All students please answer this item:
   If you had a choice which one of the following marking procedures would be of greatest help to you? (Underline one.)
   a) All paragraphs marked in all details, i.e., every error indicated.
   b) All paragraphs marked with a letter grade.
   c) All paragraphs marked with short written comments.
   d) Just some paragraphs marked with a letter grade so that you have an opportunity to judge some of your own work?
   e) Just some paragraphs commented upon so that you have an opportunity to judge some of your own work?

10. Is there some other procedure you think would be better than any of those named above? Yes, If so, describe it in a sentence or two.