COMMERCIAL REHABILITATION
WITHIN THE CENTRAL BUSINESS DISTRICT:
POLICIES FOR FUTURE USE

by

SANDRA EILEEN WOOD
B.A., University of British Columbia, 1964

A THESIS SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT OF
THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF
MASTER OF ARTS
in the Division
of
COMMUNITY AND REGIONAL PLANNING

We accept this thesis as conforming to the
required standard

THE UNIVERSITY OF BRITISH COLUMBIA
April, 1967
In presenting this thesis in partial fulfilment of the requirements for an advanced degree at the University of British Columbia, I agree that the Library shall make it freely available for reference and study. I further agree that permission for extensive copying of this thesis for scholarly purposes may be granted by the Head of my Department or by his representatives. It is understood that copying or publication of this thesis for financial gain shall not be allowed without my written permission.

Department of Community and Regional Planning

The University of British Columbia
Vancouver 8, Canada

Date April, 1967.
Within the central business districts of many North American cities are to be found blighted commercial areas which have deteriorated through the process of time, market changes, and locational obsolescence. Old buildings, some beautiful, are left to deteriorate or are torn down and replaced by characterless new facades in an attempt to compete with the integrated 'shopping center' approach. Such changes do not make a city.

In recent years a number of cities have utilized rehabilitation techniques in an attempt to revitalize blighted commercial areas. Rehabilitation may be broadly defined as remodeling, altering, repairing and otherwise improving substandard, deteriorated, or obsolete areas, or individual structures within these areas so that a decent, safe, and sanitary environment may be achieved. In the case of commercial rehabilitation there is often more emphasis put on the aesthetic aspects of improvement than in residential rehabilitation. Commercial enterprises, for the purpose of this discussion, may refer to places of entertainment, restaurants, or offices, but refer particularly to retail outlets.

It is the basic aim of the thesis to examine the subject of commercial rehabilitation in detail in order to determine its progress and its problems, particularly under present legislative provisions.
Policies are then proposed to enable successful future use of rehabilitation in Canadian cities. On the assumption that revitalization of blighted commercial areas of the central business districts of Canadian and American cities is a desirable objective, as a basis for investigation it is hypothesized that

In order to achieve a comprehensive program of central business district renewal utilizing rehabilitation measures, it is essential that there be coordinated participation of Federal and local governments at the advisory, administrative, and financial levels in conjunction with the efforts of private enterprise.

Study is carried out in three major ways. First, an extensive literature review is used to determine the main physical, social, economic, and legislative aspects of commercial rehabilitation. Second, response from questionnaires sent to Canadian and American cities having central business district rehabilitation projects within a government-sponsored "urban renewal scheme" are tabulated to show the meaning attached to commercial rehabilitation by the involved authorities; the extent of rehabilitation projects in execution or planned; the source of inspiration for these projects; and problems encountered. The hypothesis is examined specifically through the use of a case-study of the City of Victoria, British Columbia. Through a rather special combination of civic and local business concern coupled with an important tourist industry and a heritage of historic buildings, Victoria has been the subject of considerable rehabilitation effort. The most significant limitation of the case-study is that Victoria's
central business district does not exhibit the extreme and far-reaching conditions of blight which are found in many cities.

Throughout the thesis emphasis is placed on the role of local and federal governments in relation to that of private enterprise. From information collected in the manner previously described policies for utilization by Canadian cities are proposed. Briefly they recommend that commercial rehabilitation be mainly a local rather than federal government responsibility; that the local government operate mainly in an advisory and administrative rather than financial capacity; that private enterprise efforts be encouraged wherever possible; and that rehabilitation be carried out on a comprehensive scale. It is felt that the financial role played by local and federal governments should be most active in the provision of services and public works. Where rehabilitation proves impossible through private investment sources and yet is considered to be of genuine benefit to the community, recourse may be made to Central Mortgage and Housing Corporation for "urban renewal schemes" or to the Industrial Development Bank of Canada for other areas. Subject to the limitation placed on the financial role of government in commercial rehabilitation, the hypothesis is considered valid.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Many persons have given assistance during the preparation of this thesis and thus I remember gratefully:

For encouragement and interest in my planning education, Dr. H. Peter Oberlander, Head of the Division of Community and Regional Planning.

For concern and constructive criticism, Prof. Robert Collier of the Division of Community and Regional Planning.

For guidance, assistance, and criticism, my former associates at the Capital Region Planning Board of B.C.: Mr. Anthony Roberts, Mr. George Atamanenko, Mr. John Northey, Mr. James Trimble, and Mr. Michael Bennet; and the Municipal Planner for Saanich, B.C., Mr. T.W. Loney.

For assistance, Miss Melva Dwyer and the staff of the Fine Arts Library; and Mrs. Emily F. Stewart, Secretary to the Division of Community and Regional Planning.

For time freely given in interviews and the completion of questionnaires, a much larger number of persons than it is possible to mention here.

For financial aid during my final year as a planning student, the Central Mortgage and Housing Corporation of Canada.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. THE PROBLEM DEFINED</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urbanization and the Need for Revitalization</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assumptions of the Study</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objectives</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Definitions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Presentation of the Hypothesis</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Organization of the Thesis</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scope and Limitations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Footnotes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. TRENDS IN RETAILING - THE CASE FOR COMMERCIAL REHABILITATION</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Downtown's Historical Development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Suburban Shopping Center</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Effect on Downtown</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blight</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hope for the Downtown Area</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commercial Rehabilitation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Examples of Commercial Rehabilitation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Footnotes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. ASPECTS OF COMMERCIAL REHABILITATION</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical Aspects</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Principles of retail location</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transportation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The pedestrian</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aesthetic aspects</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The shopping street</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The downtown mall</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Aspects</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social importance of downtown</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customer consumption patterns</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The initiative for rehabilitation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## Chapter

### Economic Aspects
- Retail sales
- Land value, rent, and taxes
- Daytime population
- Economic costs
- Economic effects
- Economic aids

### Legislative Aspects
- Great Britain
- The United States
- Canada

### Summary

### Footnotes

## IV. COMMERCIAL REHABILITATION PROJECTS UNDER PRESENT LEGISLATIVE PROVISIONS

### Methodology
- Rehabilitation Sponsored by Private Enterprise
- Analysis of Questionnaires
- Loss in Sales Volume
- The Meaning of Commercial Rehabilitation
- The Extent of Rehabilitation Projects
- The Cost of Rehabilitation
- Source of Inspiration
- Problems Encountered
- The Total Process

### Summary

### Footnotes

## V. EXAMINATION OF A FRAMEWORK FOR REHABILITATION:

### A CASE-STUDY OF VICTORIA, BRITISH COLUMBIA

### Goals and Reasons for Revitalization
### Role of Local and Federal Governments
### Private Enterprise Investment

### Summary

### Footnotes
TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>VI. POLICIES FOR THE IMPLEMENTATION OF COMMERCIAL REHABILITATION</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Program for Action</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Municipal Government Role</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Role of Private Enterprise</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Footnotes</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII. REVIEW AND EVALUATION OF THE STUDY</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary of the Study</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evaluation of the Study</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Hypothesis: Limitations and criticisms</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Study: Limitations and criticisms</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Further research</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Validity of Findings and Hypothesis</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIXES</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BIBLIOGRAPHY</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Population Expansion Ratio and Change in CBD Sales</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Population Size and Stage of Rehabilitation Project for Selected Cities in the United States and Canada</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. CBD Sales of General Merchandise for Selected American Cities 1958-1963</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Methods Used for Commercial Rehabilitation Within the Central Business District</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. The Extent of CBD Commercial Rehabilitation</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Commercial Land Use Functions Involved in CBD Revitalization Projects</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. The Cost of Rehabilitation</td>
<td>65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Source of Inspiration for Rehabilitation Projects</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Estimated Costs, Bastion Square Project Phases 1 and 2</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Cost of Rehabilitation, of Selected Structures Within the Victoria CBD</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Rental Values and Alteration Costs</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Sales per Square Foot of Selling Space in Downtown Department Stores, 1940-1959</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Rehabilitation Project, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Rehabilitation Project, Erie, Pennsylvania</td>
<td>71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Bastion Square, Victoria, B.C.</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF MAPS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Map</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Victoria in Relation to the Capital Region</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. The Core of the Central Business District,</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Victoria, B.C.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Major Highway - Concept for the Capital Region</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Rental Values in the Central Business District 1964</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Rehabilitation Projects in Victoria's CBD</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER ONE

THE PROBLEM DEFINED

The creative city environment evolves as a result of both new and old buildings and a recognition that the city is a continuum relating both to our past and to our future.

Lawrence Halprin in Cities

'Urbanization' and its physical manifestation the 'city' have become keywords of the twentieth century. Seventy percent of the population of the United States and Canada is urbanized. It has been predicted that by 1990 more than half of the world's people will be living in cities of 100,000 or more. Of early cities Aristotle said: "Men come to cities to live; they stay to live a good life." Today those words are echoed with renewed determination. "In a democracy the city to strive for is one in which human beings can live freely together, respect each other's varying tastes and share the immense power of their differences." Cities are not unlike their inhabitants for, from early times, they have been born, they have grown, and they have matured. Some, such as London, Paris, and Rome, have become immortal; others have died when their reason for existence has ceased. Many have been rebuilt. Never before, however, has the revitalization of
cities received so much attention and in particular the revitalization of the heart of the city.

Historically, the market place or downtown area of the city has been the center for the exchange of goods and services as well as for ideas. 'Downtowns' today strive to retain both their importance and their mystery.

Downtown is the business center, the place of work, the museum of style, the change of scene, the confluence of diversities, the escape to anonymity. It is the scene of political action, of courts, of doctors and lawyers, the place in which the deeper human problems are exposed and allayed. It has become the locus of the great modern institution of Lunch, in which you can make a sale or loan over the coffee-cup. It is where a man can meet a lady without being accused of having a rendezvous. It is the place that draws the masses and that the masses have made.3

But 'downtowns' do not continue to exist without threats to their life in the form of the automobile, the suburb, and blight. It is the continued existence of the heart of our cities which is the concern of this thesis. More specifically, it is their continued existence through the utilization of techniques of revitalization, in particular that of 'rehabilitation'.

Assumptions of the Study

The technique of rehabilitation is designed to eliminate urban blight and is presently being employed in conjunction with other renewal measures in residential, industrial, and commercial areas. Support for projects involving rehabilitation is beginning to receive attention from both the private and the public sectors of the economy. This is
particularly true in the case of commercial rehabilitation within 'downtown' areas. The acceptance of programs to revitalize such areas rests upon the acceptance of certain assumptions. They are, firstly, that downtown prosperity is desirable; secondly, that there is a certain level of physical condition which a commercial district must achieve in order to be acceptable and attractive to the public; and finally, that central business district functions which are of benefit to the public must be retained within the central area. These functions include retailing, offices, finance, entertainment, public service, wholesaling, and in some cases, manufacturing and residential facilities.

**Objectives and Hypothesis**

Accepting these assumptions to be tenable, it will be the objective of this study to examine the technique of rehabilitation as it is being used in commercial areas; to review and evaluate the progress of government-sponsored commercial rehabilitation programs in central business districts in the United States and Canada; and by the case-study method to determine the balance of achievement by private enterprise and public endeavour in the rehabilitation efforts of one specific city.

At the outset it was postulated that

IN ORDER TO ACHIEVE A COMPREHENSIVE PROGRAM OF CENTRAL BUSINESS DISTRICT RENEWAL UTILIZING REHABILITATION MEASURES, IT IS ESSENTIAL THAT THERE BE COORDINATED PARTICIPATION OF FEDERAL AND LOCAL GOVERNMENTS AT THE ADVISORY, ADMINISTRATIVE, AND FINANCIAL LEVELS IN CONJUNCTION WITH THE EFFORTS OF PRIVATE ENTERPRISE.
Definitions

For the purpose of clarity a number of terms that will be frequently employed are defined.

'Urbanization' refers to "the proportion of the total population concentrated in urban settlements, or else to a rise in this proportion." 4

'Central Business District' is "the focus of commercial, social, and civic life, and of transportation." 3

'Downtown' ... really a colloquialism, refers to the central business district.

'Urban renewal' is "the collective series of actions, both public and private, the total effect of which might be the restoration of the economic, social and physical health of the community." 6

'Redevelopment' refers to the clearance of existing outmoded structures and their replacement with new construction. 7

'Rehabilitation' involves "the remodelling, altering, repairing and otherwise improving substandard, deteriorated, or obsolete areas, or individual structures within these areas, so that a decent, safe, and sanitary environment may be achieved." 8

'Conservation' is maintaining in good order that which is already in good condition through the application of controls and the encouragement of a public information program.

'Historic preservation' devotes itself through rehabilitation and conservation to the restoration of structures of historic interest placed in suitable surroundings.

All of the aspects of urban renewal which have been mentioned involve the continuing process of improvement and must take place within the framework of an overall community plan.
Organization of the Thesis

Trends in the location of commercial enterprise will be discussed in Chapter Two with particular attention being given to the development of the suburban shopping center and what appears to be the concomitant phenomenon of commercial blight in the core. Commercial rehabilitation, as a method to combat this blight, will be illustrated with examples from Great Britain, from the United States, and from Canada. For convenience the many aspects of commercial rehabilitation will be examined under the headings of physical, social, economic, and legislative-administrative aspects in Chapter Three. In Chapter Four an attempt will be made to evaluate the progress of commercial rehabilitation in Canada and the United States under present legislative provisions. A case-study involving rehabilitation measures utilized in Victoria, British Columbia, will be the subject of Chapter Five; and the policies for commercial rehabilitation will be the subject of Chapter Six. Summary and evaluation of the study will comprise the final chapter.

Scope and Limitations

The emphasis is placed throughout the study on development of policies for Canadian cities. However, since considerable experience in the field of commercial rehabilitation has been gained by other countries, the scope of the thesis is extended to include examples from the United States and Great Britain. The scope is further defined by the methods of research which included a literature review, questionnaires, and personal interviews. Limitations to the study are found in certain
aspects of the questionnaire and case-study methods. Problems with questionnaires may arise from the manner in which questions are asked. The case-study has two weaknesses. The choice of Victoria, British Columbia, is limiting in that this city does not contain any extremely blighted commercial areas, for deterioration has usually been arrested. Finally, it is difficult to establish a control situation against which one can evaluate the policies evolved by a particular city.
Footnotes to Chapter One


4 Davis, loc. cit.


7 Ibid.


9 Pickett, loc. cit.
CHAPTER TWO

TRENDS IN RETAILING -
THE CASE FOR COMMERCIAL REHABILITATION

We must restore to the city the maternal, life-nurturing functions, the autonomous activities, the symbiotic associations that have long been neglected or suppressed. For the city should be an organ of love; and the economy of cities is the cure and culture of men.

Lewis Mumford

During recent years there has been a preoccupation with the development of integrated shopping centers to fulfill the need for retail trade facilities. The shopping center admittedly provides a partial solution to a need created by urban growth. Attention has now turned, however, to the core of the urban area, the downtown or central business district.

The importance attached to this area is not a recent phenomenon. Early societies formed cities some 5,500 years ago and attached special social and ceremonial significance to their communal meeting places in the cleared area surrounded by their homes. Babylon in Mesopotamia; Thebes in Egypt; Mohenjo-Daro in the valley of the Indus River; Anyang in China; Teotihuacan near modern Mexico City all developed between 3,500 B.C. and the first century A.D. and showed the center of the city
as the prestige area, the setting for magnificent religious and governmental centers and the central market area. Fourth century Athens contrasted the bustling activity of the agora against the backdrop of the deeply symbolic Acropolis. The medieval European city converged inward upon the commercial square. The examples are many but point to the fact that the market place has been historically a place of identification for many of the world's cities. Canada and the United States have been no exception. Until the 1920's, Main Street was the civic center for the population of most cities. While many studies have pointed to the central business district as the core of retail and service activity because of its unique accessibility to the entire city population, the cry that 'Downtown is dying!' has become an all too familiar one within the last fifteen years. This demise of downtown is caused by a considerable number of factors.

Development of the Suburban Shopping Center

The 1890's saw the first street railroads in North America and with them the growth of outlying business centers alongside the intersections of public transit lines. These centers housed mainly mass appeal stores. Further business districts developed when the invention of the automobile allowed a release from the fixed pattern of tracks. Previously the only convenient way to get to the central shopping area was on tracks but with the new emphasis on private transportation and on motor bus lines the outlying business district gained accessibility and appeal over the central area. In addition, several other factors
contributed to the evolution of the suburban shopping center as we know it today.

The 'New Town' or 'Garden City' philosophy first suggested by Ebenezer Howard in 1898 gave weight to arguments in favour of establishing self-sufficient small towns. His thoughts were developed further by Sir Patrick Geddes in terms of regional planning and Le Corbusier in his Radiant City. They are seen today in English and Swedish satellite towns and to a certain extent in North American suburbia. They may detract from the importance attached to a city's central area.

The general increase in population and the population shift to the suburbs have combined with an increasingly more 'affluent society' to make the family units with their cars the customers of the new shopping centers. While central business district employment retains its importance many a downtown worker is a suburban resident and shopper. Further, a number of industrial plants and governmental agencies have followed the flight to the suburbs. Merchandising, too, has changed. The trend is toward larger merchandising units, cross lines in merchandising, the use of trading stamps and other advertising gimmicks, rearrangement in the hours of business with night hours catering to the family as a shopping unit, and the availability of no cost off-street parking. The cause of concern to city merchants is demonstrated by the diagram on the following page.
FIG. 2  SALES PER SQUARE FOOT OF SELLING SPACE IN DOWNTOWN DEPARTMENT STORES IN THE UNITED STATES, 1940–1959
Blight Within the Central Business District

Urbanization and its companion suburbanization have had a decided effect on the central business district. The seriousness of the effect has been dependent on a number of factors. The effect appears to be more severe in larger cities than in smaller cities. It depends on the aggressiveness and competence of suburban developers as compared to the owners of the downtown business district. The main type of housing in a city, single family or multiple family dwelling, may be a factor as is the state of the public transportation system. The automobile is perhaps the greatest single source of trouble. While volume of traffic tends to increase, the high cost of land accentuates the problem of providing parking facilities. Added to this is the result of the passage of time. Commercial establishments which may once have been quite adequate as well as aesthetically attractive, may have deteriorated and become obsolete.

"Blight exists where deterioration has set in and where a loss of value exists..." Blight is the name given to the disease which results from the neglect of the physical maintenance of structures and improvements and from a failure to adapt to modern conditions. The physical manifestations of commercial blight are obvious. The economic effects are many and, apart from those affecting ownership, may not be as obvious. Among them are lowered property values and assessment with subsequent loss of revenue to local governments; extra cost in providing services to run-down areas; loss of productivity of those working in an
unattractive and unhealthy environment; and general loss and deterioration of businesses.\textsuperscript{5} An example of the above-mentioned fact is given by Victor Gruen who states that in Cincinnati, Ohio, the number of retail establishments dropped from 1,054 to 854 between 1948 and 1958 and the assessment total of these establishments dropped from 21 percent to 17 percent between 1945 and 1955.\textsuperscript{6} Similar results were found in Detroit, Michigan; Milwaukee, Wisconsin; and Boston, Massachusetts. Berry in his book *Commercial Structure and Commercial Blight* identifies two further forms of blight.\textsuperscript{7} They are functional blight which refers to changes in either the supply or demand for certain types of commercial structures and frictional blight which refers to the deleterious effect which a business may have on its surroundings.

**Indications of Rebirth in Central Business Districts**

If it is true that suburban shopping centers have grown to fill the needs of a suburban-based population adequately, and if downtown is in a state of decay, then perhaps there is no hope. This is not the case for reasons which involve not only the business interests which operate in the downtown area but also the consumers who demand a vital downtown area. Private enterprise has reacted in such a way that

Good, bad, or indifferent, the fact remains that business interests in this portion of the city the central business district in most areas of western culture have adopted a deterministic attitude as to the value of a strong C.B.D., and are supporting their attitudes by both private actions and co-operative efforts through their downtown association.\textsuperscript{8}
For the consumer, two elements are important. In 1955, Mr. C.T. Jonassen published a study which indicated that "... if the C.B.D. declined, the social change would involve a radical reordering of the ecological and functional structure of urban communities" and further that the central business district has certain definite advantages. Downtown held advantages over suburban shopping centers in sixteen out of twenty-three factors tested in his study. Among the disadvantages listed were difficult parking, crowds, and traffic congestion. Advantages included the large selection of goods, the possibility of doing several errands at once, and cheaper prices. Advantages of shopping centers often resulted from negative factors of the downtown situation.

More recently a second phase has become obvious. Downtown is not dying but it is changing. Central office functions are increasing and the retail function is changing in its emphasis. This new emphasis is on specialty goods and on special services. The theories which support these ideas are the ecological theory which suggests that businesses compete for location in terms of rent-bidding and thus those which secure a site in the core are those which demand centrality. The central place theory suggests that the central business district can be the only location for high-order goods, those which are demanded least frequently, and so must have a wider consumer area from which to draw.

Suburban development will continue but the challenge facing planners, civic officials, and private business interests alike is the provision of a balance between suburban areas and the downtown area in order to provide the consumer with maximum choice and maximum convenience.
Goals for the central business district must be clearly enunciated and then tailored to fit the means available to accomplish them. Among these goals must be the retention, strengthening, and diversification of central area activities along with their re-integration; the provision of facilities required for automobile transportation; and physical rehabilitation and renewal which will retain and increase central area value by controlling obsolescence and stabilizing location.

To enumerate goals is considerably less difficult than to implement plans which will achieve them. Within the central business districts of cities there are many obstacles. Among these are the lack of core land, while on the other hand there may be easy availability of large plots of land for suburban development, and there may be apparent resistance to improvement on the part of downtown property owners. Commercial rehabilitation, both on a single business basis and on an areal basis, is presently being used to combat the problems of the downtown area. Commercial rehabilitation is by no means the only answer to downtown revitalization. It must be coupled with an adequate program of conservation; it must be coordinated with an active provision of public services; and it must only be undertaken where, in its implementation, complete redevelopment would not be more economic and successful.

Commercial rehabilitation projects have been carried out and are being carried out in Great Britain, in the United States, and in Canada. They vary greatly in their scope but their general principle of downtown revitalization is constant. The time has come to re-examine
the progress, the success, and the problems which have been encountered
and to determine how rehabilitation can best be extended in the future.

Richard Nelson and Frederick Aschman have listed the objectives
for a program of rehabilitation and conservation "under maximum con-
ditions of need and feasibility." They are:

1. UNIFICATION of the district, architecturally and
planning-wise, into a definite entity which will
not shift its location but will remain as a true
"center" with perpetual rebuilding or self-development.

2. IMPROVEMENT OF SITE LAYOUT through establishment of
new relationships between stores, parking, pedestrians,
motorists, truck and other services.

3. ELIMINATION OF BLIGHT in the form of non-conforming
uses and deteriorated structures.

4. PROVISION of new amenities in terms of both
aesthetics and convenience.

5. ACHIEVEMENT OF COHESION OF MANAGEMENT/OPERATION
through cooperation of multiple interests acting
jointly to maintain scientific management practice
in areas of mutual interest and necessity.

Some of the objectives of commercial rehabilitation can perhaps best be
seen in projects which have been undertaken. For this reason three
examples have been chosen of projects which have attracted substantial
attention. They are found in Norwich, England; in Fresno, California;
and in Toronto, Ontario.
Examples of Rehabilitation Projects

In 1957, the Norwich City Council was approached by the Civic Trust which proposed that a project be undertaken to show how a given area in a city could be improved without major alteration or expense, if all concerned could be persuaded to work together. The area chosen was Magdalen Street because its problems were felt to be typical. The plan was to emphasize good points and camouflage bad ones, a task which is made difficult under conditions of multiple ownership. Support for the scheme was secured through a public meeting and a questionnaire.

What was actually accomplished?

As a matter of record, 66 properties facing the street, together with a number of alleys and courtyards, were repainted in a co-ordinated scheme; 17 signboards over the shops were redesigned and 38 were relettered; 22 projecting name signs and advertisements were removed; 26 shops installed new blinds; 16 added new curtains to their upper windows; 6 lamp standards were removed and replaced by new lighting; 2 new bus shelters of a standard design prepared by the city architect, and 1 especially designed crush barrier were erected; 5 new bus stop signs superseded the old ones; 11 pairs of No Waiting and No Loading signs were redesigned as one; another pair was removed altogether; overhead wires were resited so that they would not cross the street; St. Saviour's Church was floodlit, and a corner lot was planted by the City Park Department. Some 40 other structures and objects in the street were removed, replaced, or repainted - an electricity box here, a notice board there, a fence somewhere else, and so on.

Upon completion the average cost to each merchant was less than $200.00. The total restoration cost was $22,500.00 with the municipalities' portion and that of the Civic Trust at about $15,000.00.
In 1958, through an organization known as the Downtown Association, Fresno, California, hired the architecture-planning firm of Victor Gruen Associates in an attempt to rescue their downtown area. Along Fulton Street, the main street of Fresno, California, in an area six blocks long and three blocks wide, automobiles were banished and a pedestrian mall was created. Featured in the mall are fountains, pools, and many pieces of sculpture as well as playgrounds for the children and benches for the elderly or leisurely. Parking areas are placed around the mall so that no building is more than forty yards from the nearest parking place and small electric trams are provided. The cost of the mall was to be about $1,500,000.00. A merchants' assessment paid $600,000.00, the federal government paid $900,000.00 and the city contributed maintenance costs. The success of this project has been measured in a 20 percent increase in business since the mall opened as well as by the fact that assessed valuations have risen sharply.13

Yorkville Village of Toronto is more truly a 'happening' than a preconceived plan. An area of tall Victorian houses, it was in danger of becoming thoroughly blighted when, in 1950, it was taken over by a number of interior designers and shop-keepers who turned the area into a series of attractive shops and studios. Soon a number of luxury shops moved into the area and were followed by restaurants, sidewalk cafes, and discotheques. In 1962 a group known as the Village of Yorkville Association was formed to control the neighbourhood's character. The city of Toronto has contributed distinctive street
signs, new sidewalks, better lighting, and underground wiring. All these factors have created an exciting and unique shopping precinct.

Suburban shopping centers have grown up to fill a certain need of the suburban populace but as can be seen by the above examples, the central business districts are fighting to regain the prominence they once held. Not only must they recover from the business lost to shopping centers but also from the ravages of time. Commercial rehabilitation used as a method to speed recovery has many aspects and these will be discussed in the next chapter.
Footnotes to Chapter Two


5Ibid., p. 4.


9C.T. Jonassen, The Shopping Center Versus Downtown (Columbus, Ohio: Ohio State University, 1955), p. 94.

11 Ibid.


CHAPTER THREE

ASPECTS OF COMMERCIAL REHABILITATION

Our efforts must be towards creating environmental qualities that will help fulfill the human heart's desire in the city's heart, and on the other hand make it possible to reach the heart with speed and convenience.

Victor Gruen in The Heart of Our Cities

The study of any method of central business district revitalization involves examination of a number of different functional aspects. In reviewing the literature of the central business district Shirley F. Weiss has noted that the fields of urban sociology, human ecology, economic geography, economic history, urban land economics, marketing, social behaviour, traffic engineering, public administration, urban design, and city and regional planning all have an interest. Rehabilitation of commercial land uses in central areas also involves a consideration of many of the subjects studied in these disciplines. For this reason, it is necessary to determine what the physical, social, and economic reasons, methods, and effects of commercial rehabilitation are, as well as to understand what legislative provisions have been made for this type of renewal.
Physical Aspects

The necessity for improvement in the physical aspect of today's cities is most apparent in downtown areas. It would be difficult to find a city which does not suffer from areas made ugly by the passage of time and the ravages of blight. In many cases the streets are in poor condition, narrow, and cluttered with cars. Overhead wiring may form almost a roof over the street. Shop signs and advertisements compete for attention and completely obliterate what might have once been architecturally attractive buildings. The buildings themselves are often structurally unsound and have dim lighting. The area requiring some type of renewal is not difficult to identify: however, before commercial rehabilitation programs are undertaken, certain other conditions must be met to ensure success. This is particularly true in the case of rehabilitation as opposed to total redevelopment which often involves a change in land use.

Most important in any area where retailing is to take place is the need to satisfy the principles of retail location. Richard L. Nelson has identified eight factors which must be considered. They are:

1. There must be an adequate trading area potential.

2. The retail area must be easily accessible to the residents of the trading area.

3. The site of the retail location must contain room for potential growth and must be in a position to intercept business.

4. Within the retail area itself, stores should provide compatibility between themselves and should provide cumulative attraction.
7. The hazards of competition should be minimized.

8. The site must be analyzed in terms of the relation of its cost to its productivity.²

Two of these factors need further definition. According to Nelson the theory of cumulative attraction means that:

... a given number of stores dealing in the same merchandise will do more business if they are located adjacent or in proximity to each other than if they are widely separated.³

The rule of retail compatibility states that:

... two compatible businesses located in close proximity will show an increase in business volume directly proportionate to the incidence of total customer interchange between them, inversely proportionate to the ratio of the business volume of the larger store to that of the smaller store, and directly proportionate to the sum of the ratios of purposeful purchasing to total purchasing in each of the two stores.⁴

Since downtown areas have a large cumulative attraction in their high-density retail establishments and since they serve the downtown working and transient population, they would appear to provide an excellent basis on which to begin rehabilitation.

The second factor which must be considered is the importance of transportation to the life of the central areas of our cities. Without a good system of transportation within and to the downtown area, and without adequate provision for parking, any renewal of downtown will fail. It is not the intention of this thesis to discuss the problems of transportation further, but these problems must be recognized and dealt with in conjunction with all renewal proposals. Individual
characteristics of each central area and its surrounding region, such as land area, floor-space area, types of activity, daytime population, and transportation facilities must be measured and interrelated in any proposal for change in order to provide the most effective transportation system.\footnote{5}

Irretrievably united with the importance of transportation is the importance of providing for the pedestrian in downtown areas. Once a car is brought to the central area and parked, walking becomes the highly flexible means of transportation. In central business districts of larger cities, 90 percent of all daily trips within the area are walking trips.\footnote{6} Further, one study has shown that as many as a third of all downtown purchases are a result of "impulse-shopping" on the part of passers-by.\footnote{7} By providing pleasant pedestrian precincts, the city's retail areas will benefit when people go out of their way to use them. Among the most attractive of pedestrian areas are those which provide squares off the street area, an element of surprise through the curving of streets, and architecture which includes buildings sympathetic to each other and to the provision of sun, shade, and shadow.\footnote{8} A number of suggestions have been advanced to satisfy some of these requirements and many, such as malls, arcades, and wider sidewalks are involved in commercial rehabilitation schemes.

Once the principles of retail location are thought to be satisfied and needs for the transportation system are recognized, the planner is then faced with areas within the central business district which, needing more than conservation, would nevertheless lose their
appeal through total redevelopment or which are economically unacceptable for total renewal. They are often

... anonymous structures which served well in their time and by some happy chance have come down to us intact. They may even be ugly by contemporary taste. But their honesty is splendid; their wholeness can make them sweet. Touch these, and you destroy much that makes the city human. Keep them and you keep the quality of life itself.\(^9\)

There is thus a mysterious aesthetic in the replanning of central areas. People today are becoming very aware of aesthetic values and thus demand them as part of the design of cities. It may be true as Jane Jacobs has said that:

... When we deal with cities we are dealing with life at its most complex and intense. Because this is so, there is a basic aesthetic limitation on what can be done with cities: A city cannot be a work of art.\(^10\)

and further that:

... For all our conformity, we are too adventurous, inquisitive, egoistic and competitive to be a harmonious society of artists by consensus, and, what is more, we place a high value upon the very traits that prevent us from being so.\(^11\)

However, the challenge of rehabilitation is to create an atmosphere which is physically more attractive and efficient than the present one by augmenting and improving the existing physical structure. And by choosing rehabilitation, benefits often accrue in terms of popular support for projects since sentiment and pride of place are involved. Attention to the visual qualities of older areas will also bring benefit by preserving tangible evidence of history, by providing a sense of
local identification, and by making the best use of existing structures.¹²

Improvement of the physical aspect of retail areas must be seen from the vantage point of the rehabilitation of the single store as well as the rehabilitation of a complete commercial area. Stores have always been a composite of three parts: the entrance area and front which displays the business within, the salesroom where the product can be inspected and bought by the customer, and the service entrance for incoming and outgoing merchandise. In order to be successful the store front must catch the eye of the passer-by and must identify the store. It should also provide a means of displaying merchandise and should pull customers into the store. In designing the structure of the store building six elements are important.

1. It should be capable of enclosing interior space with the fewest possible fixed points of obstruction on sales floors, service areas, or store front display zones.

2. It should be adaptable to the flexible installation of circulation elements.

3. It should be fireproof.

4. It should permit maximum construction speed.

5. It should be economical in initial and maintenance cost.

6. It should form an attractive pattern when exposed to view in the sales space or on the store front but should never offer unnecessary visual competition to the merchandise on display.¹³

Rehabilitation of the shopping street can often be achieved through simply removing the clutter which accumulates, and by re-designing the
essential elements in a more unified pattern. Store-fronts are often cluttered with awnings, marquees, overhanging signs, banners and window displays which compete for attention. Pavement is often broken up by different textures and treatments and by man-hole covers and sidewalk elevators. Added to this is the general street clutter of light standards, hydrants, street signs, transit signs, police and fire-boxes, parking meters, litter baskets, and curb-railings. All these elements may be necessary but all can undoubtedly be improved by unification in design.

Commercial rehabilitation can be carried out on a single store basis, on a block basis, or on an areal basis. The most comprehensive of all forms of rehabilitation is found in the downtown mall. The principles of this type of development are simple: one street, a few streets, a few blocks, or an entire downtown are taken and private cars and trucks are banned except for some transit vehicles; the entire mall is modernized and made more attractive; and amenities are installed for shoppers and the business community. The first of these was seen in Springfield, Oregon, in 1957 during a 10 day trial and the first permanent mall was established in Kalamazoo, Michigan. In Canada, the Sparks Street Mall in Ottawa has become widely known. Malls have been criticized on the basis that they are spatially limiting and often hastily executed without thought to the consequences but they have also provided a significant testing ground for areal rehabilitation.
Social Aspects

The social aspects and importance of commercial rehabilitation are complicated by the peculiar relationship which any individual may have with the commercial function of the city. The customer, the small shop-keeper, the businessman, and the city officials all have varying interests. The central city is built by the total population of any one area and is meant for those people.

If it is to serve its fundamental purpose, a city must be meaningful to its human dwellers in terms of helping them to lead the good life. It must provide at least safety and security for all those who live in it or visit it. It must hold out the prospect to its inhabitants of the opportunity to earn their livelihoods. It must provide the institutions and opportunities for education, for cultural creativeness, for self-expression, for rest, diversion, relaxation and freedom of movement. No city has perhaps served these ends perfectly. But the claim of any city to distinction can only be based upon the degree to which it enables those who dwell within its confines to achieve the desirable goals of life.14

The concepts expressed in this quotation are perhaps ideal; however, they emphasize the fact that in the downtown area where many people are brought together daily, communication, exchange of goods, and exchange of ideas are maximized. It is this unique type of social structure spawned by the city which must be encouraged in any downtown revitalization.

To relate the commercial function specifically to the social aspects of city life it should be noted that two distinct functions are performed. From the civic and social viewpoint the various shops, stores, and offices not only serve the public but also provide a focal point in
their individual area. Each structure provides a different type of texture in the life of the city.

The relationship between the customer and the downtown retail outlet is one which has been much studied in past years. The results of these studies must be applied in any commercial rehabilitation. Just as merchants strive for a unique quality in their enterprises, so their customers tend to separate themselves into various social classes as represented by their consumption patterns and purchasing of prestige symbols. The most evident form of buying behaviour is probably found in the patronization of exclusive "carriage trade" or specialty shops by the upper-middle and upper social classes. There are also a number of other factors which must be taken into account and these have been documented by George Sternlieb in his study *The Future of the Downtown Department Store*. The average consumer today has more leisure time, more means to enjoy it, and more goods and activities that compete for his attention. For this reason, the downtown area must work harder than ever before to attract the customer. The consumer is now spending less on general merchandise and more on non-retail outlets. While shopping has traditionally been regarded as one of the most pleasurable activities of a woman's life, its position is now challenged by an assortment of other activities. Women now demand an interesting and attractive atmosphere as well as the satisfaction guaranteed by comparison shopping to find a good bargain. In addition, demand for convenience and a family orientation to shopping have brought success to the suburban shopping center to the discredit of the downtown area. Downtown has, however,
retained its lead in terms of the entertainment function and it is hoped that this may be capitalized upon in downtown revitalization programs.

From the viewpoint of civic and business officials the task of commercial rehabilitation becomes a responsibility. The need for rehabilitation must first be recognized and this has been done in many cities. For example, in a Lancaster, Pennsylvania businessman's questionnaire, the men indicated a knowledge of downtown's struggle for survival and felt that downtown improvement must be the joint responsibility of both public and private bodies. The initiative may also come from the local government authority; the local Board of Trade, Chamber of Commerce, or a particular street association; a local civic or planning association; a local group of architects; the local press, radio, or television station; or from a special interest group. Once the project is under way it is important that a responsible group coordinate the work of the project to achieve a successful total effect as well as to satisfy each of the involved merchants.
Economic Aspects

The field of urban land economics and its sophisticated methods of analysis provide an excellent basis for the evaluation of urban renewal projects. The economics of a commercial rehabilitation project often spell out its success or failure. For the central business district there are three methods which are commonly used to determine its strength: retail sales value, land values, and daytime population.\(^\text{18}\)

Retail sales are a measure of the economic viability of the CBD since shopping goods are often concentrated in this area. Figures quoted by John Rannels in his article "Approach to Analysis" indicate the economic reasons for concern in many central business districts in 1954.\(^\text{19}\) The following table from his work is of interest.

**TABLE 1**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of CBD's</th>
<th>Population Expansion Ratio</th>
<th>Percentage Change CBD Sales 1943-1954</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>0.70-0.99</td>
<td>+5.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>1.00-1.39</td>
<td>+4.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>1.40-1.79</td>
<td>+3.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>1.80-1.99</td>
<td>+2.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>2.00-2.99</td>
<td>-0.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>3.00 or more</td>
<td>-0.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This indicates that gains were generally occurring in areas with less than 250,000 population, rapidly expanding areas having suffered from the effects of decentralization. The "population expansion ratio" refers to the percent growth in the metropolitan area divided by the percent growth in the central area. As shopping centers have been built in smaller cities in the past ten years, they too have felt a loss in CBD sales.

Use of land value as a measure of CBD strength is often helpful since the highest land value is most often found in the center of the retail shopping district where the pedestrian traffic is heaviest. A study of the hierarchy of CBD land uses in terms of land values suggests that the office core of a city including prime office space, prestige retail stores, and service and restaurant functions supports a land value of from $50.00 to $25.00 per square foot. The retail core land value is from $25.00 to $15.00 per square foot. Connected with the value of land and improvements are the factors of rent and taxes. The productivity of any use within the central business district will determine the rent which it is able to pay and thus the land which it can afford to occupy and the kind of improvements which it can afford to make. Programs for expensive improvements may force low productivity uses to relocate in other parts of the city. In addition to the cost of improvements renters must often face increased costs in the form of increased assessment on all improvements made. Cities depend on the CBD for a considerable portion of their tax base and thus cannot afford to have blighted areas which decrease assessment and increase service
costs. The effect of total redevelopment is graphically demonstrated in information collected by the American Municipal Association which reports that in a survey of 123 cities having a total of 294 urban renewal projects, taxes before redevelopment were $26 million while taxes after redevelopment were estimated at $93 million. Many businesses cannot, however, afford the increased taxes which are levied on improvements. This situation provides one time when outlying business areas can help the CBD for they carry part of the tax load.

The importance of the pedestrian to the CBD has already been mentioned as a source of strength. The daytime population attracted to various sections of the downtown area is a good indication of areas of high land value.

Primary among considerations in commercial rehabilitation projects are the economic costs and the economic effects. Costs of such projects are usually borne at three levels. First are municipal costs for new services, street construction, and parking facilities. There will be cooperative costs for improvements which are being made jointly by property owners as in the case of an arcade. Finally there will be individual costs for improvements made to individual buildings. Problems often arise when bond issues must be floated by cities or taxes must be increased in order to provide finances for downtown area improvements. For the individual property owner and the merchants, loans are often needed to make improvements. It is at this point that the roles of the public sector of the economy and the private sector
become clear. As will be discussed in the next section, the public sector presently contributes largely at the municipal level under present legislative provisions for commercial rehabilitation. The ratio of expenditure between the public and the private sector for total redevelopment was pointed out by William Slayton in 1965 when he stated that for every dollar that has been spent for the federally assisted Urban Renewal Program in the United States, $6.50 has been spent for physical improvements by redevelopers in the redevelopment areas.\textsuperscript{23}

The private sector of the economy is thus very important in renewal projects, particularly as it has been estimated that to renew all American cities within a twelve year period (by the current theory of urban renewal) would cost approximately one trillion dollars.\textsuperscript{24} Private enterprise does not hesitate to take part in renewal projects if these projects are clearly economically feasible. Capital investment in commercial property, in comparison to other forms of investment, can be very profitable. Capital invested in the improvement of commercial property may permit increased rent, particularly when merchants' sales increase. A major problem for private enterprise in present government-sponsored renewal efforts is that financial returns are slow in coming in renewal projects. Furthermore, when projects are announced which involve a developer, individual property owners may neglect building maintenance thus increasing costs. Finally, initiation of these projects is often not adequately related to the immediate capabilities of the private financial market.
There are many economic effects of commercial rehabilitation, some of which have been mentioned previously. Such projects involve changes in the capital costs to the city and in their tax revenues. They also involve adjustment of priorities within the city's budget. There will be effects on existing renters and property owners, on surrounding property values, and on real estate valuation within the whole downtown area. All these factors must be taken into account in determining a project's economic feasibility.

Several economic aids have been suggested that may encourage commercial renewal. Among these are regional renewal banks, tax subsidies, compulsory purchase of land and buildings, and condominium ownership. It has been suggested that a regional system of renewal and development banks, similar to the American Federal Home Loan Bank, would permit more rapid and effective local renewal programs.25

Tax subsidies to avoid problems of increased assessment have been tried in some redevelopment projects. For example, in the Kansas City, Missouri Parade Park project, assessment was set at the land assessment of the original properties before acquisition for ten years, and at 50 percent of the assessed value of the land and new improvements for fifteen years before full assessment after twenty-five years.26

In Canada, the budget of June 21st, 1961, introduced a special section (Section 1109 of the amendments to the Income Tax Act) the stated purpose of which was to encourage Canadian business to become more competitive. While all operating expenses for each year may be claimed, capital expenses such as buildings can only be claimed over a period of time.
This is known as capital cost allowance. This amendment allowed for a 15 percent rather than 10 percent rate on the yearly capital assets allowance. The larger expense claim permitted business the use of more money for modernization purposes. This amendment was rescinded in March of 1964. Because of the small percentage change (only five percent) and through ignorance, this amendment was not widely used by small business. The government's intent was undoubtedly to encourage the export possibilities of large businesses. However, this type of legislation illustrates a type of tax subsidy which has been the source of both approval and disapproval.

In Great Britain, Local Planning Authorities have the right to secure unified ownership of land by compulsory purchase with the approval of the Minister of Town and Country Planning. In the case of commercial rehabilitation this process has been avoided since it is elaborate and cumbersome, involves heavy capital expenditure and may mean that capital invested is unavailable for a number of years before income is received to repay loans taken. Another more recently advanced concept, both legislative and economic, is that of Condominium in which an individual unit of land or a building can be owned outright by its individual occupant, while other portions intended for common use are jointly owned by the owner-occupants of all the units within the Condominium project. This may permit unified action on rehabilitation programs. Suggestions for economic remedies to urban renewal problems will probably be frequently advanced in the future. Economic solutions in conjunction with legislative and other provisions are now providing for many total redevelopment programs and similar provisions may be used for commercial rehabilitation in the future.
Legislative Aspects

As it is extremely difficult for many municipalities to undertake any form of comprehensive downtown renewal without financial help, legislative provisions are now being made in the Canadian and American federal urban renewal legislation to help CBD renewal programs. In contrast to the situation in the United States and Canada, cities in Great Britain have been given extensive means to carry out renewal programs. They possess far-reaching powers of expropriation and, while tenders are solicited from private enterprise for redevelopment projects, the city often retains the freehold of the site. Although the subject of commercial rehabilitation will not be discussed to any great extent with respect to Great Britain, it should be noted that the Norwich, England rehabilitation project stands as an excellent monument to local government and private enterprise cooperation.

In the United States, urban renewal legislation has until recently dealt mainly with slum clearance and the provision of housing. The year 1892 saw the first government study made of slums, with 1929 bringing laws to promote the provision of housing. The Emergency Relief and Reconstruction Act of 1932, the National Industrial Recovery Act of 1933, and the United States Housing Act of 1937 extended these provisions, with the latter Act dealing particularly with slum conditions. Before 1949, urban redevelopment statutes were adopted in 23 states and the District of Columbia. The Housing Act of 1949 organized and amplified previous legislation, provided a statement of national housing
policy, and permitted Federal advances to finance the planning of urban redevelopment projects as well as interim loans to provide working capital. The Housing Act of 1954 again dealt only with housing policy but it did encourage the use of conservation and rehabilitation in residential renewal. Previous to 1954 rehabilitation programs were undertaken through systematic enforcement of housing codes and ordinances. An amendment to the 1954 legislation permitted 10 percent of the Federal grant fund to be used for other than residential renewal.

In 1959, authorization was given to grants for renewal studies of entire communities and permitted 20 percent of Federal grants for projects other than residential. This percentage was raised to 30 percent in 1961 reflecting the government's increased awareness of the importance of central city revitalization. The total sum authorized for the urban renewal program was four billion dollars, completion of the 1963 fiscal year being the end of the grant period. The Housing and Urban Development Act of 1965 contains several new provisions which are of interest:

1. A program of rent supplements has been authorized to make housing available to low-income individuals and families. (Section 101);

2. Grants can be made to assist in local programs for the greater use and enjoyment of open-space and other public land in urban areas (Section 906);

3. Thirty-five percent of the additional capital grant authority is to be used for areas which are not predominantly residential in character and which will be redeveloped and rehabilitated for uses not predominantly residential (Section 308);
4. An authorization of appropriations of up to $100 million per year is provided for the low-interest rate Federal rehabilitation loans for homes and businesses in urban renewal areas and code-enforcement areas. (Section 312);

5. A program of lease guarantees is authorized under which certain leases will be guaranteed where the small businesses are eligible for disaster loans under the Small Business Act or for loans under the antipoverty law. (Section 316).29

On April twenty-seventh, 1966, Senator John Sparkman introduced legislation to "authorize financial assistance for urban renewal projects involving the central business district. . . ." Among his suggestions are:

1. official recognition that the commercial, industrial and cultural functions of the central business district are essential to a viable and sound city;

2. authority for rehabilitation and acquisition of historic structures in the CBD;

3. staging of downtown projects on a functional basis rather than a geographic basis;

4. extension of the time allotted for executing complicated downtown projects.30

In the Canadian case, as in the United States, the initiative for urban renewal activity is the responsibility of the municipalities, the senior governments helping in ways specified by legislation. The legislation governing renewal is provincial and federal. An "urban renewal area" is defined by Section 23 of the National Housing Act to be "a blighted or substandard area of a municipality for which the government of the province in which the area is located has approved the implementation of an urban renewal scheme." Early legislation
follows a similar pattern to that of the United States and is briefly summarized here.

The Dominion Housing Act passed in 1935 empowered the government to join with lending associations to aid the construction of housing and this Act was replaced in 1938 by the National Housing Act. The Home Improvement Loans Guaranteeing Act adopted in 1937 contained a guarantee, limited to 15 percent of the loans made by any one institution, against losses which they might incur as a result of home improvement loans made by them. When it was realized that existing legislation did not provide for those who could not afford homes, the National Housing Act of 1944 provided Federal government assistance for slum clearance in conjunction with private financial corporations. Between 1944 and 1949 further legislation was added to persuade private enterprise to construct rental housing. Amendments to the National Housing Act in 1949 gave aid directly to slum clearance and amendments in 1954 included public buildings as an acceptable re-use of land, re-use previously having been restricted to residential development.

The 1956 amendments began to broaden the scope of the legislation and remove it from the strictly housing concept. They allowed that the Federal government would match amounts spent by municipalities and the involved province on "clearance, replanning, rehabilitation, and modernization of blighted areas." (National Housing Act 1954, Chapter 23, Part III, Section 23(1)). The re-use provision was restricted only to the most effective use of the land and financial aid was to be given for special studies of urban conditions.
The 1964 amendments to the National Housing Act have widened the role of the Federal government particularly in the field of rehabilitation. Rehabilitation is now supported through a system of loans or grants to municipalities, with provision for insured or direct loans to individuals for rehabilitation in a designated urban renewal scheme.

In summary then, the Federal government is now permitted:

1. to bear half the cost of acquiring and clearing a substandard area and also of preparing the site for disposal even where there is no housing content, either existing or proposed;

2. to bear half the cost of installing municipal services or works, other than buildings, in any renewal area including areas scheduled for rehabilitation rather than clearance;

3. to bear half the cost of employing staff or consultants in connection with acquisition, clearance, relocation, public information and the assistance of affected property owners;

4. to lend to a province or municipality up to two-thirds of the actual cost of implementing a renewal scheme, after the deduction of federal grants, and

5. to insure loans made by approved lenders to the owners of housing scheduled for rehabilitation in urban renewal areas. These loans, up to 85 percent of the lending value after rehabilitation, are secured by first mortgage and allow for the discharge of existing encumbrances. Should lenders be unwilling to invest in a renewal area CMHC is empowered to make a direct loan.31

Seventy-five percent of the cost of urban renewal studies had been available to municipalities under the National Housing Act and in 1964 a 50 percent federal grant was announced for studies involving individual urban renewal schemes, schemes which were often suggested by earlier renewal studies.32
Summary to Chapter Three

In recent years solutions to the problems of the downtown areas of our cities have dwelt to a great extent on improvements in transportation and on urban renewal measures. Commercial rehabilitation is just one part of these measures. The reasons, methods, and effects involved in commercial rehabilitation have been presented, often without critical comment, in this chapter. For the sake of convenience they have been divided into their physical, social, economic and legislative facets but it must be remembered that these facets are all interdependent. It will be the task of the next chapter to examine the progress of commercial rehabilitation projects under present legislative provisions in the light of facts discussed in this chapter.
Footnotes to Chapter Three


3Ibid., p. 58.

4Ibid., p. 66.


11Ibid., p. 107.


20. Ibid.


29 Information on United States urban renewal legislation is from summaries given in the following:


31 Stanley H. Pickett, "An Appraisal of the Urban Renewal Program in Canada," A Paper read at the Graduate School of Public and International Affairs, University of Pittsburgh, March 17 and 18, 1965, p. 3.

32 Information on Canadian Urban Renewal legislation is from summaries given in the following:

Metropolitan Toronto Planning Board, The Role of Private Enterprise in Urban Renewal, A Study carried out by Murray V. Jones under contract with the Metropolitan Toronto Planning Board (Toronto: Metropolitan Toronto Planning Board, March, 1966).

University of British Columbia, Graduate Students in Community and Regional Planning, The Progress of Urban Renewal in Canada: A Critical Evaluation (Vancouver, B.C.: Division of Community and Regional Planning Board, University of B.C., December, 1965).
CHAPTER FOUR

COMMERCIAL REHABILITATION PROJECTS UNDER PRESENT LEGISLATIVE PROVISIONS

... We will transmit this city not only not less, but greater, better, and more beautiful than it was transmitted to us.

from the Oath of the Athenian City State

The process of recreating environments for living and working - the process of urban renewal - is presently employed in most major cities in the United States and Canada. It is a process which is as costly as it is expansive and is, of necessity, never-ending. Variations in the methods and approaches of urban renewal are considerable and may involve redevelopment, rehabilitation, and conservation and, in most cases, a combination of all three. For this reason it is difficult to examine any one particular aspect; for example, to isolate the rehabilitation of commercial structures and study the process of this type of renewal. Although in this chapter the results of an attempt to study commercial rehabilitation projects are presented, it must be remembered that these programs are part of a larger renewal program. Their success depends not only on what they accomplish in themselves but on what the total program accomplishes and on how successfully the program is integrated with the needs of the particular city.
Methodology

Examination of commercial rehabilitation projects has been carried out by the following method. Questionnaires (see Appendix A) were sent to Canadian and American cities to determine:

1. the meaning attached to 'rehabilitation of commercial areas within the central business district;
2. the extent of rehabilitation projects in execution or being planned for Canadian and American cities;
3. the source of inspiration for these projects;
4. the problems encountered with these projects.

The selection of cities to be studied was made as a result of correspondence with the Central Mortgage and Housing Corporation of Canada and with the Department of Housing and Urban Development of the United States. Names of seven Canadian cities and twenty-one American cities were supplied, which, according to these agencies, had government-sponsored rehabilitation projects. Of the twenty-one American cities contacted, seventeen replied to the questionnaire, but in the Canadian group only Toronto felt that it was sufficiently advanced in its rehabilitation program to reply. Appendix B contains the names of individuals who replied by letter to the questionnaire. The reply received from Oakville, Ontario gave some idea of a privately sponsored rehabilitation project in a Canadian city. Information on the government-sponsored rehabilitation project, Bastion Square, in Victoria, B.C., will be given in Chapter Five.
Before closer examination of the results of the questionnaires is made two subjects must be discussed. They are the reasons for the types of questions asked and the cities selected for survey, and the place of the government-sponsored projects in relation to private efforts. As has been stated previously it was hoped that the meaning attached to the word 'rehabilitation' by the various planning authorities could be determined. The first question was asked in order to discern whether planning bodies recognized rehabilitation as distinct from redevelopment or conservation, as well as the necessary integration of all three aspects. The place of municipal improvements - were they considered separately or as a part of the rehabilitation program - was also questioned. The rehabilitation programs of each city were examined in order that the areal and functional extent of such projects might be determined as well as their cost. The source of inspiration for these projects was felt to be important for it often determines the immediate and continued success of such plans. Finally, the few cities which already had programs in execution were asked what problems they had encountered. Future rehabilitation efforts can be aided by a previous knowledge of these problems.

With the exception of Oakville, Ontario, only cities with government-sponsored projects were examined. There are three reasons for this choice. First, it was felt that agencies involved in government-sponsored renewal would have the most information collected on rehabilitation projects and thus would be able to answer the questionnaire with the least difficulty. Second, projects undertaken
within the context of a government-sponsored urban renewal scheme must, by the definition of these programs, be integrated with a general plan for the community. Finally, it is the purpose of this thesis to make recommendations about rehabilitation programs at the local government level and the federal government level.

Rehabilitation Sponsored by Private Enterprise

Commercial rehabilitation is by no means the exclusive activity of cities which have government-sponsored projects. Legislation in the United States and Canada has only recently permitted expenditure for this type of renewal but there are, nevertheless, many cities which have tackled rehabilitation at their own expense and through participation of local businessmen. Many examples may be given. Cedar Rapids, Iowa, has an extensive program for alley beautification. Champaign, Illinois, places flower baskets on downtown street light poles. Thomasville, Georgia, undertook a program called 'Operation Facelift' in which physical improvements were made to over one hundred businesses. The Newton, New Jersey Improvement Advisory Committee has commissioned a study to show how the facades of stores and other buildings can be harmonized and beautified. In Freeport, Illinois, a free-standing canopy was built around one of the primary downtown blocks, thus allowing stores to do what they wished on their own facades without interference from the canopy.¹ Vancouver, British Columbia, has been the site of several privately-sponsored rehabilitation projects such as the improvement of the Richmond Block on Robson Street by a program similar to that used in Norwich, England.
Analysis of Questionnaires

The questionnaires and letters received in response to inquiries regarding commercial rehabilitation projects represent twenty-two cities situated in thirteen states and four provinces. As examination of Table 2 will show all the American cities, with the exception of Fresno, California, are in the eastern half of the United States. Populations given in Table 2 represent just the city proper and not the Standard Metropolitan Area. There is a great range in population shown, with the smallest city having a population of just over 10,000 persons and the largest of over two million. Eight cities are between 10,000 and 100,000 persons, ten are between 100,000 and 500,000 persons, and four are over 500,000 persons. The complexities of their urban renewal programs tend to increase in proportion to the size of the cities and thus, in the case of Philadelphia, it becomes almost impossible to isolate such facts as the cost of rehabilitation or the number of building units being rehabilitated. Difficulty was encountered in determining the extent of government-sponsored rehabilitation projects because legislation allowing financial aid is so recent. Thus, only twelve cities were at the implementation stage of their projects, while others were still in the planning stage.
TABLE 2

POPULATION SIZE AND STAGE OF REHABILITATION PROJECT
FOR SELECTED CITIES IN THE UNITED STATES AND CANADA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City</th>
<th>State/Province</th>
<th>Population*</th>
<th>Project Stage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>United States</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boston</td>
<td>Massachusetts</td>
<td>697,197</td>
<td>in execution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Erie</td>
<td>Pennsylvania</td>
<td>138,440</td>
<td>in execution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flint</td>
<td>Michigan</td>
<td>196,940</td>
<td>in planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fresno</td>
<td>California</td>
<td>133,929</td>
<td>in execution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Johnson City</td>
<td>Tennessee</td>
<td>31,187</td>
<td>in planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joplin</td>
<td>Missouri</td>
<td>38,958</td>
<td>in planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Little Rock</td>
<td>Arkansas</td>
<td>128,929</td>
<td>in execution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Louisville</td>
<td>Kentucky</td>
<td>389,044</td>
<td>in execution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manchester</td>
<td>New Hampshire</td>
<td>.88,282</td>
<td>in planning²</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Haven</td>
<td>Connecticut</td>
<td>152,048</td>
<td>in execution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oklahoma City</td>
<td>Oklahoma</td>
<td>324,253</td>
<td>in planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philadelphia</td>
<td>Pennsylvania</td>
<td>2,002,512</td>
<td>in execution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sylacauga</td>
<td>Alabama</td>
<td>12,587</td>
<td>in planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tulsa</td>
<td>Oklahoma</td>
<td>261,685</td>
<td>in execution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utica</td>
<td>New York</td>
<td>38,629</td>
<td>in execution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WilkesBarre</td>
<td>Pennsylvania</td>
<td>63,551</td>
<td>in planning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canada</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calgary</td>
<td>Alberta</td>
<td>249,641</td>
<td>proposal³</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edmonton</td>
<td>Alberta</td>
<td>281,027</td>
<td>proposal³</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montreal</td>
<td>Quebec</td>
<td>1,191,062</td>
<td>general aid given⁴</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakville</td>
<td>Ontario</td>
<td>10,366</td>
<td>in execution⁵</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toronto</td>
<td>Ontario</td>
<td>672,401</td>
<td>in execution⁶</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


²Manchester study is still in the survey stage and thus information is limited.

³Calgary and Edmonton propose rehabilitation in CBD areas but have yet to begin studies.

⁴Montreal assists in the establishment of commercial enterprises in rehabilitated buildings within the limits of its charter but it has no government-sponsored project.

⁵Not a government-sponsored project but included for comparison purposes.

⁶Further details on the Victoria project will be given in Chapter Five.
Loss in Sales Volume

A study which was undertaken by Homer Hoyt on the subject of U.S. Metropolitan Area Retail Shopping Patterns provides the data shown in Table 3. An analysis of central business district sales of general merchandise in eleven of the twenty-two cities under consideration in this chapter quickly shows the cause for concern over the economic strength of the downtown area. Five cities actually lost sales value over the five year period and for other cities increases in sales value were minimal. The facts are particularly striking when placed in comparison with the percent increase in sales outside the central business district which ranged from 19 percent to 128 percent. Other findings of this study showed that sales outside the central business districts of American cities rose 89 percent on the average compared with the increase of 54 percent from 1954 to 1958. In 1963 the sales of stores in the CBD were only half the sales of general merchandise beyond the borders of the central areas.
TABLE 3
CBD SALES OF GENERAL MERCHANDISE FOR SELECTED AMERICAN CITIES 1958-1963

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City</th>
<th>1960 SMA Population&lt;sup&gt;1&lt;/sup&gt;</th>
<th>(000's) 1963</th>
<th>(000's) 1958</th>
<th>Percent Increase Outside CBD</th>
<th>No. of Regional Centers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Boston</td>
<td>2,589,303</td>
<td>$205,430</td>
<td>$201,702</td>
<td>62.12</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Erie</td>
<td>250,682</td>
<td>25,310</td>
<td>24,395</td>
<td>19.13</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flint</td>
<td>374,315</td>
<td>31,884</td>
<td>23,291</td>
<td>128.00</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fresno</td>
<td>366,945</td>
<td>23,998</td>
<td>21,298</td>
<td>76.54</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Little Rock</td>
<td>249,980</td>
<td>40,298</td>
<td>36,555</td>
<td>68.75</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Louisville</td>
<td>725,139</td>
<td>51,535</td>
<td>53,538</td>
<td>110.19</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Haven</td>
<td>311,681</td>
<td>19,602&lt;sup&gt;2&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>21,808</td>
<td>58.70</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oklahoma City</td>
<td>511,833</td>
<td>21,863</td>
<td>29,896</td>
<td>121.37</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philadelphia</td>
<td>4,342,897</td>
<td>220,808</td>
<td>259,136</td>
<td>70.53</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tulsa</td>
<td>418,974</td>
<td>19,391</td>
<td>22,693</td>
<td>60.59</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utica</td>
<td>330,771</td>
<td>17,626</td>
<td>16,698</td>
<td>62.38</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<sup>1</sup>Standard Census Metropolitan Area Population.

<sup>2</sup>Planned regional centers with sales in excess of $10,000,000 in 1963.

The Meaning of Commercial Rehabilitation

Eighteen of the twenty-two cities studied replied to the question regarding the meaning of 'commercial rehabilitation.' It is important in government-sponsored projects that planning bodies have not only a similar view of the meaning of a renewal technique but also that their view be reasonably comprehensive. In order to determine the scope of rehabilitation, several choices were given as shown in Appendix A and Table 4. The provision of an architectural consultant was not included as one of these choices but it was included by several people as an important part of a rehabilitation program. The provision of a management consultant was given as one of the choices in order to find out whether help is given to businesses whose problems involve more than just the need for physical improvement. Although only four cities in the United States suggested that such aid was given it may be present in other cities through the auspices of the Small Business Administration. It is interesting to note that thirteen of the eighteen cities included most of the suggested provisions while the others included less than half of the provisions. There would appear to be a general consensus on painting and cleaning of buildings and on a redecoration of interiors. A number of cities mentioned that painting and cleaning were really only conservation or maintenance items by themselves. The improvement of traffic access, parking improvements, and street lighting are considered municipal improvements in many cities and are provided for separately in federal renewal grants.
### TABLE 4

METHODS USED FOR COMMERCIAL REHABILITATION

WITHIN THE CENTRAL BUSINESS DISTRICT

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City</th>
<th>Painting &amp; Cleaning</th>
<th>Improve Traffic Access</th>
<th>Improve Parking</th>
<th>Street Furniture</th>
<th>Redecorate Interiors</th>
<th>Management Consultant</th>
<th>Sign Control</th>
<th>Street Lighting</th>
<th>Architectural Consultant</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Boston</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Erie</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flint</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fresno</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Johnson City</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joplin</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Little Rock</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Louisville</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Haven</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oklahoma City</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philadelphia</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sylacauga</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tulsa</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utica</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WilkesBarre</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montreal</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakville</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toronto</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Mr. James Yielding, the Executive Director of the Oklahoma City Urban Renewal Authority defined rehabilitation as "the restoration of existing structures to established standards of structural adequacy which is but a part of total renewal; other parts being total clearance and new redevelopment, and improvement of existing public works, i.e. sewers, water lines, streets, parks, street lights, street trees and furniture, etc." This definition points out an important aspect of rehabilitation, most evident in the United States. There is considerable emphasis on improvement to meet code standards of structural adequacy rather than just improvement to aesthetic standards. An example of such improvements considered necessary for a property in Erie, Pennsylvania, is given in Appendix C and the even more rigorous standards proposed for Sylacauga, Alabama, are shown in Appendix D. As Mr. Clinton Mullen of the Philadelphia Redevelopment Authority explained: "Rehabilitation means repairs, alterations, partial rebuilding, refinishing etc. to produce a tight, clean, safe, well-appearing structure." Emphasis on a unique type of decoration seems to be found only in areas which are preserved for reasons of historical importance.
FIG. 2  'BEFORE & AFTER' REHABILITATION PROJECTS - PHILADELPHIA, PENN.
The Extent of Rehabilitation Projects

Tables 5, 6 and 7 attempt a summary of the extent of rehabilitation projects presently under way or completed in Canadian and American cities. Table 5 shows the areal extent of the project or whether the project is undertaken on a block by block basis, or on the basis of improvements to single businesses. It also shows whether rehabilitation is part of a larger program of renewal. Most cities determine the extent of rehabilitation on an areal basis, the area varying from Utica, New York's 11.7 acres to Philadelphia's many projects and Boston's total of 349 acres. Only Erie, Pennsylvania and Tulsa, Oklahoma stated that they undertook projects on the basis of improvements to single businesses. All but two of the cities have rehabilitation projects which are part of larger renewal programs. In the case of Louisville, Kentucky, commercial rehabilitation in the central business district is a private voluntary program by the Louisville Central Area Downtown Property Owners' Association. East and west of the central business district is involved in a City Urban Renewal Project involving clearance and redevelopment with spot conservation and scattered rehabilitation. Frequently the larger renewal program, of which rehabilitation was a part, involved redevelopment rather than rehabilitation of other land uses or conservation. It is surprising that conservation was not mentioned as an integral part of all rehabilitation programs, however, many planning offices may consider conservation to be a matter of painting, cleaning, and general maintenance.
## TABLE 5
THE EXTENT OF CBD COMMERCIAL REHABILITATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City</th>
<th>Areal Extent of Project</th>
<th>Part of Larger Program</th>
<th>Elements in Larger Program</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>By Area</td>
<td>Block Basis</td>
<td>Single Business</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boston(^1)</td>
<td>349 Ac.</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Erie</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flint</td>
<td>200 Ac.</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fresno</td>
<td>85 Ac.</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Johnson City</td>
<td>79 Ac.</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joplin</td>
<td>50 Ac.</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Little Rock</td>
<td>427 Ac.</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Louisville(^3)</td>
<td>30 Blocks</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manchester</td>
<td>138 Ac.</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Haven</td>
<td>120 Ac.</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oklahoma City</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philadelphia(^4)</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sylacauga</td>
<td>51 Ac.</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tulsa</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utica</td>
<td>11.7 Ac.</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WilkesBarre</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakville</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toronto</td>
<td>170 Ac.</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^1\)Boston: Waterfront - 104 Ac.; CBD - 245 Ac.
\(^2\)Of this total, the Mall consists of 36.5 Ac.
\(^3\)See accompanying text.
\(^4\)There are seven rehabilitation projects in the CBD, ranging in size from a few to 129 Ac.
Table 6 showing the types of commercial land use which were involved in the central business district again demonstrates the general comprehensiveness of approach of these projects. They are by no means simply aesthetic improvements for an area of specialty shops. They take into account all types of shopping including the department stores which have suffered considerable losses in past years. The only type of commercial land use which was not included in almost all cities was the theatre and this may be caused by 'theatre-rows' not being included in the project area. Several cities included a transportation center such as a railroad station or bus terminal. Although they are more specifically of the transportation function than the commercial function they are certainly structures which can be profitably included in a CBD renewal scheme.

Among the questions concerning the extent of rehabilitation was one in which the various facets of this type of renewal were listed in the same way as in the first section of the questionnaire which dealt with the meaning of rehabilitation. In all but two cases this question was answered in exactly the same manner as the first question. For this reason, these results have not been documented in a separate table. Similarity in the two answers may have been due to a misunderstanding of the difference between the questions or may reflect the fact that the planning authorities' definition of rehabilitation is based upon the experience of their present program.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City</th>
<th>Specialty Shops</th>
<th>Personal &amp; Business Services</th>
<th>Department Stores</th>
<th>Other Shopping</th>
<th>Office Buildings</th>
<th>Theatres</th>
<th>Restaurants</th>
<th>Other¹</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Boston</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Erie</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flint</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fresno</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Johnson City</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joplin</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Little Rock</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Louisville</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Haven</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oklahoma City</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philadelphia</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sylacauga</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tulsa</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utica</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WilkesBarre</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakville</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toronto</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

¹Other uses mentioned were wholesaling, warehousing, a railroad station, and a bus terminal.
The Cost of Rehabilitation

Included in Table 7 which deals with the cost of rehabilitation is the average age of buildings which are being improved and the number of building units which are involved. The age of buildings varies from twenty-six years to over two hundred and fifty years. Rehabilitation plans are thus taking into account buildings which have been poorly constructed in recent times as well as structures which have stood the test of time but need improvements for acceptability by modern taste. The average age of buildings in these programs is about seventy years, their construction period being just before or at the turn of the century.

The number of building units involved is in most cases a reflection of the size of the city but it is interesting to note the cautious approach of Oklahoma City with only nineteen buildings in the first phase of its program compared with Philadelphia which stated that well over a thousand building units are involved. The question concerning the cost of rehabilitation suffered from the fact that most government-sponsored projects are either in the implementation stage or still in the planning stage. Of the twelve cities that gave details about the cost-sharing basis for these projects, seven stated that it was to be 100 percent at the expense of private enterprise. There are two reasons for this. First, in cities in both the United States and Canada, rehabilitation to individual buildings is totally at the owner's expense. The owner can apply to the Federal government for an insured loan for rehabilitation purposes if the building is within an urban renewal scheme but the owner is still
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City</th>
<th>Average Age of Bldgs.</th>
<th>No. of Units</th>
<th>Total Cost 1</th>
<th>(1)</th>
<th>(2)</th>
<th>(3)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Boston</td>
<td>80-130 yrs. 2</td>
<td>222</td>
<td>$10,000,000</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Erie</td>
<td>60-65 yrs.</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>Information not available at present</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flint</td>
<td>75 yrs.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>66%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fresno</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>$1,500,000(^4)</td>
<td>40%</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Johnson City</td>
<td>30-50 yrs.</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joplin</td>
<td>45 yrs.</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Little Rock</td>
<td>35-40 yrs.</td>
<td>600</td>
<td>Unknown(^5)</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Louisville</td>
<td>40 yrs.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>90%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Haven</td>
<td>65 yrs.</td>
<td>Information not available at present</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oklahoma City</td>
<td>50 yrs.</td>
<td>19(^3)</td>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philadelphia</td>
<td>26-266 yrs.</td>
<td>1000+</td>
<td>Unknown(^6)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>66%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sylacauga</td>
<td>50+ yrs.</td>
<td>Information not available at present</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tulsa</td>
<td>25 yrs.</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>$413,000</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utica</td>
<td>40 yrs.</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WilkesBarre</td>
<td>80 yrs.</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>$86,000</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakville</td>
<td>60-120 yrs.</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>100%</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toronto</td>
<td>70 yrs.</td>
<td>381</td>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1Total cost is broken down into (1) % Private enterprise; (2) % Municipal; (3) % Federal.
2Waterfront buildings - 130 yrs. CBD buildings - 80 yrs.
222 waterfront buildings are involved, number in CBD presently unknown.
3Phase 1 of project.
4Total project cost will be $32,000,000; $20,000,000 through local contribution.
5Philadelphia is presently engaged in over 70 urban renewal projects, spends over $30 million federal funds per annum, over $10 million local funds.
6Thirty-five percent of work already completed has cost in excess of $12 million.
100 percent responsible for the cost of improvements. Second, public improvements are considered separately and not as an integral part of rehabilitation projects in the budgeting of many cities. They are, however, often undertaken by municipal governments with Federal government aid and add to the improvements made in rehabilitation schemes.

In almost all cases buildings to be rehabilitated are to be retained by the present owners. Boston, Erie, Flint, Philadelphia, Sylacauga, and Utica have made provisions that will allow buildings to be acquired by public money then either leased or sold back to private businesses if the present owner refuses to cooperate with the rehabilitation scheme.

The Source of Inspiration for Rehabilitation Projects

As was stated previously the source of inspiration for rehabilitation was studied because, in projects which involve government sponsorship and private enterprise, it is important that there be a basic understanding as to the goals of the project. In most of the cities studied (as shown in Table 8) private business interest and local government were together responsible for the project idea. In only a few cases did inspiration come from the redevelopment authority or the local planning board as part of their total renewal program. It is significant that private enterprise plays such an important part in the original inspiration for this type of renewal scheme. It shows not only their awareness of the problem but also their willingness to do something about it. It may also indicate the role of private enterprise efforts in relation to those of public bodies.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City</th>
<th>Private Business</th>
<th>Chamber of Commerce</th>
<th>Local Gov't</th>
<th>Redev't Authority</th>
<th>Local Plan. Bd.</th>
<th>Other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Boston</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Erie</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Flint</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fresno</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Johnson City</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Joplin</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Little Rock</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X^1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Louisville</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Haven</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oklahoma City</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philadelphia</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X^2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sylacauga</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tulsa</td>
<td>X</td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utica</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WilkesBarre</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X^3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oakville</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toronto</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>X</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1A municipal garage was constructed on land which this Authority had sold to the Parking Authority, therefore the surrounding CBD was included for rehabilitation.

2Philadelphia elected a reform government in the early 1960's and thus was able to bring in the business establishment very early in the development of various projects.

3Arkansas Chapter of the American Institute of Architects and the National Citizens Planning Conference of 1957.
Problems Encountered in Rehabilitation Programs

The last section of the questionnaire dealt with the problems which have been met by those cities whose projects are presently in execution. Although only eight cities were able to respond to this question their answers are worth repetition in full and, in some cases, echo the hypothesis of this thesis. The Boston Redevelopment Authority encountered considerable difficulty in demonstrating to property owners the economic feasibility of rehabilitatating structures. In Erie, Pennsylvania, the problems came in financing the project. The Rehabilitation Officer of the Fresno Redevelopment Agency felt that a lack of public understanding and thereby lack of cooperation was the greatest problem. There seemed to be a fear or at least a feeling that the Agency, and perhaps the Federal government, was trying to dictate operating policy and methods to the businessman and was trying to eliminate the small businessman. Some felt that the Agency was trying to turn over the area to large business interests. A follow-up study of the Fresno mall project showed that in a survey of 332 businessmen outside the 'superblock' area, 163 felt the project had brought them better business, 141 had equal business, and 28 felt their business had declined. In Little Rock, Arkansas, coordination of design and materials between adjacent buildings proved difficult. In Philadelphia the quality of work and encouraging voluntary work were problems. Also mentioned was the problem of property which was marginal but not bad enough to condemn and where the owners refused to undertake
the necessary rehabilitation. The Redevelopment Authority of Philadelphia also faced the problem of relocation, particularly of bars, and other uses, which certain neighbourhoods considered objectionable. Utica, New York, had difficulty explaining rehabilitation goals to retired or elderly persons and Toronto found problems with the land ownership pattern.

For most of the cities studied it is too early to determine whether there will be any change in use or change of ownership within the rehabilitation area. However, for the few cities which answered this question there appeared to be about a 10 percent change in use and no change of ownership. Little Rock, Arkansas, was the exception in this case where a 40 percent change in use has been recorded and a 10 percent change of ownership. Unfortunately the questionnaire did not request the number of businesses which have relocated because they did not wish or could not afford to rehabilitate.

The Total Process

Response to the questionnaire has been almost exclusively from the United States and has shown that rehabilitation is only part of the total renewal process in government-sponsored projects. For this reason, it is valuable to consider the total process in order to understand the place of rehabilitation. Using the city of Fresno, California, and the Redevelopment Agency of the City of Fresno as an example, the procedure is as follows. The City of Fresno, recognizing an area's need for renewal, establishes a project by action of the City Council.
The project is then turned over to the Redevelopment Agency of the City of Fresno for study and implementation. This agency is a political subdivision of the State created by the City Council, and operating independently under Federal, State, and local laws. The Redevelopment Agency works with city agencies and within the framework of the city's planning goals. Its creation permits Federal involvement in renewal projects. The project area being designated, a study is undertaken, which may be partially financed by Federal funds, to determine whether the area qualifies as 'a blighted area.' If an area is designated for renewal a plan is prepared and submitted to the Federal government and the public for approval, the City Council making the final decision. After a detailed financial analysis is made and a federal loan and grant contract is approved, the Agency is free to proceed with the plan. In the case of the central business district of Fresno, two-thirds of the total project cost was paid by local contribution. The greater part of the funds came from parking authority bonds and special assessments on the downtown district, very little from the general taxpayer's pocket. There is particular emphasis put on rehabilitation within the central business district and owners of existing structures are encouraged to participate in the project by bringing their properties up to standard. The owners have three choices: to relocate, a process for which they may be given Federal assistance; to rehabilitate, for which the Federal Housing Act of 1964 makes available low interest loans to the value of $50,000; or to sell their property to the Redevelopment Agency. Property owners must agree to one of these provisos in order to
Downtown renewal will be accomplished through a combination of reconstruction and rehabilitation techniques. In this Concept Model of the northern half of the 24-block project, new buildings are shown in white. Existing buildings, which will be rehabilitated, are shown in gray.

**FIG. 3 DOWNTOWN RENEWAL – ERIE PENNSYLVANIA**
prevent a single piece of property from causing deterioration to an entire area.

A similar procedure is followed in most other United States' government-sponsored projects. The procedure which Canadian cities must follow will be outlined in Chapter Five in connection with the City of Victoria project for Bastion Square.

Summary to Chapter Four

Review of renewal projects involving rehabilitation in central business districts of seventeen American and two Canadian cities has shown that they are usually very comprehensive in terms of their physical provisions and that they act as one part of a total renewal program. They are limited to the extent that projects must be within a specific area. It would appear that they are supported by both private business and local government. In almost all cases it is too early to judge whether they have been or will be economically feasible. For completed projects, their present rewards are in the form of improved appearance and vitality of the downtown areas. The greatest problem in the use of rehabilitation would seem to be financial difficulties encountered by many of the businesses designated as part of the renewal areas.
Footnotes to Chapter Four

1Information gathered from newsletters of the Downtown Idea Exchange (New York: The Downtown Idea Exchange, January to June, 1966)

2Homer Hoyt, "U.S. Metropolitan Area Retail Shopping Patterns," Urban Land, XXV, No. 3 (March, 1966), pp. 3-5.

3Ibid., p. 1

4Downtown Association of Fresno, Inc., The Fresno Plan (Fresno, California: The Association, April, 1966), p. 5.

5Redevelopment Agency of the City of Fresno, creating new environments . . . a primer (Fresno, California: The Redevelopment Agency, no date).
CHAPTER FIVE

EXAMINATION OF A FRAMEWORK FOR REHABILITATION:

A CASE STUDY OF VICTORIA, BRITISH COLUMBIA

Victoria has three faces. The first is a face of mellowed charm and a dignity acquired over one hundred years - a quiet maturity to be seen in public buildings, parks and many residential areas. The second face is that of youthful activity symbolized by the confident new buildings of the last decade. From these two faces comes the impression of Victoria as an historic provincial capital, a city of gardens and healthy prosperity. But there is a third face which is not always recognized. It is the face of tired age, weary with the deterioration and neglect which mar the appearance and efficiency of buildings and their surroundings. This third face is called blight and it is slowly corroding the fair faces of the city and creating both a threat and a challenge.

Capital Region Planning Board of B.C.
Urban Renewal Study for Victoria, 1961

The past heritage of the City is an asset to its future and is not in any way an impediment to growth and progress. A city with a history, and with the physical evidence of its history, has a stability of foundation which encourages care and quality in its new development. It is submitted that a measure of a city's maturity is the extent to which it will on the one hand encourage in the proper setting well-planned modern office buildings or high-rise apartments and on the other hand preserve a building constructed in the last century.

Capital Region Planning Board of B.C.
Overall Plan for Victoria, 1965
Goals and Reasons for Revitalization

Through a rather special combination of civic and local business concern coupled with an important tourist industry and a heritage of historic buildings, the central business district of Victoria, British Columbia, location shown on Map 1, has been and continues to be the subject of considerable rehabilitation effort. The vitality of the downtown area has been a major source of concern in Victoria in recent years and it is valuable to examine in depth the proposals and projects of this city. For the purposes of this thesis the study area has been established as the major commercial land use area within Victoria Census Tract Five - the Downtown Tract area. Approximate location of the downtown commercial area and core commercial area are shown in Map 2. It is interesting to note that the highest land value in the downtown core is today found less than four-hundred yards from the site of the original 1843 Bastion.

Proposals and projects for the revitalization of Victoria's downtown involve three major aspects: the provision of accessibility to the downtown area; the provision of parking, and the renewal of downtown in many of the ways discussed in previous chapters. Reasons for concern over the viability of downtown were first expressed in 1956 with the appearance of a growing traffic and parking problem and later in the urban renewal study by the Capital Regional Planning Board of B.C. which emphasized the amount of vacant and derelict space as well as the parking problem. These reports will be discussed in later
VICTORIA IN RELATION TO THE CAPITAL REGION

MAP 1

SOURCE - CAPITAL REGION PLANNING BOARD
THE CORE OF THE CENTRAL BUSINESS DISTRICT
VICTORIA, B.C.

SOURCE: CAPITAL REGION PLANNING BOARD

COMMERCIAL AREA

CORE

MAP 2
sections. Concern deepened with the development of two regional shopping centers, one in 1962 and the other in 1965.

Previous to examining renewal efforts in downtown Victoria, a framework for achievement should be developed in the form of suggested goals for such a city. Although many might be suggested, four general goals will be proposed as a basis for discussion.

1. Downtown should be aesthetically attractive, inspiring, and stimulating while at the same time providing relaxation in some areas.

2. Downtown must be compact and efficient in order to provide the most acceptable atmosphere for business and commerce. It should be readily accessible and have good circulation throughout the area.

3. Downtown should be maintained in such a manner that it will be economically healthy not only within its own business community but for its tributary region.

4. Finally, downtown should provide the best there is of urban living in terms of recreation, entertainment, cultural, and commercial facilities.

Given such a set of goals a city must have sufficient reason to improve its present central business district area rather than attempt the creation of an entirely new town center. For Victoria, there are several reasons.

First, although accessibility is presently a problem, reference to Maps 1 and 3 will show that the present central business district forms a definite focal point for the built up area of the Capital Region. As shown in Map 3, downtown could be readily accessible and provision of an adequate transportation system would greatly relieve the City's present traffic problem. Further discussion of this point
MAJOR HIGHWAY-CONCEPT FOR THE CAPITAL REGION

MAP. 3

SOURCE - CAPITAL REGION PLANNING BOARD
will not be undertaken since improvement of the situation depends to a great extent on decisions by the provincial rather than local government. It is important, however, that the need be recognized in a total planning program.

Second, the core is presently well defined and appears economically healthy despite the challenge of the two regional shopping centers. The present value of development in downtown is approximately 90 million dollars and downtown provides 25 percent of the City's assessment. Future years will undoubtedly show a trend towards increased office and specialized retail use as has been the situation in most North American cities.

Third, the downtown area is most adequate in terms of the present population size of the Capital Region and that of the near future. Victoria City supported a population of 21,000 in 1900 and by 1910 this increased to 30,000. Since that time the population has increased to 56,464 in 1966. In a trend which has already begun future population increase will take place mainly in other parts of the metropolitan region which had a population of 175,000 in 1966.

Finally, it is of very great importance that Victoria maintain a high quality core for besides being the principal source of government in British Columbia it is also an important tourist center.
The Role of Local and Federal Governments in Victoria's CBD Revitalization

During the past ten years there has been substantial effort on the part of both government and private enterprise in renewal efforts which confirm their faith in the thoughts expressed above. Although renewal efforts have incorporated total redevelopment as well as rehabilitation, only rehabilitation will be discussed here. Earliest concern came in 1956 over traffic and parking problems and a study was made whose proposals led to the formation of a Victoria Downtown Improvement Association. In 1958, at the request of the Association and the Victoria City Council, the City's Engineering Department was called upon to develop a plan for the central business district; the result being the Victoria Downtown Improvement Plan. Its proposals suggested the construction of three pedestrian malls and a large parking garage. A money by-law presented to the electorate in December of 1958 was ratified but legal and other impediments prevented its implementation. A parking garage about one-half the size of the one proposed has since been constructed on the suggested site.

The Capital Region Planning Board of B.C. was commissioned in 1960 to make an urban renewal study of the City of Victoria for it was felt that blighted areas gave the city a poor reputation in terms of a depressing and unpleasant environment, drained civic finances, yielded less in tax returns, and interfered with the economic and efficient use of land. An examination of the downtown area comprised a significant part of this study. Among suggestions of this report were a pedestrian
mall as proposed earlier; a precinct of city public buildings; the development of the waterfront area including Bastion Square; painting, planting, and pole removal; and rehabilitation of the Chinatown area which is on the northeast fringe of downtown. It further recommended that these projects should be prepared and included in the capital budget program.

Between 1961 and 1965 there were a number of public improvements which have made a significant difference to the downtown area. Overhead electrical wiring and wooden street poles were removed through combined cooperation on the part of City Officials and the British Columbia Hydro and Power Authority. In May of 1961, $58,000 was spent to refurbish Victoria's famous cluster lights. Commencing in 1964 and continuing to the present time is the Downtown Paint-Up Plan which through joint citizen and city participation attempts a program of conservation and rehabilitation using a coordinated scheme based on improving the exterior appearance of buildings. The 1964 program catered mainly to the individual paint-up job but the extension of these plans to following years recommended that more coordinated painting, lettering and signs would present a better visual pattern of street frontage. Briefly, the Paint-Up involved the City making available free supervision in the implementation of a colour plan; complete building colour recommendations; and recommendations on signs and miscellaneous fixtures in order to assist in creating individual identity and a store "image". Further to the improvements of paint there has been a tree-planting program on the mainstreet and well-designed litter containers have been placed.
throughout the central business district. The City's Centennial Square project included the rehabilitation of the existing City Hall at a cost of about $250,000 and of a theatre.

The Overall Plan for Victoria, as prepared by the Capital Region Planning Board in 1965, while emphasizing the importance of private investment in the downtown area, made a number of proposals which involve the use of rehabilitation techniques. Among these were the rehabilitation of Chinatown and Bastion Square, and the construction of semi-malls on one of the downtown streets. Adjuncts to these were zoning, transportation and parking proposals as well as other public works projects.

Of the projects recommended, Bastion Square is presently being implemented. Figure 4 shows glimpses of present accomplishment in the Square. In order to understand the role of local and federal governments in such a project, the details of development will be discussed in full. Bastion Square is an area which has alternately been the scene of major activity and complete neglect during the past one hundred years. First a place of mercantile importance beside the original palisades of Fort Victoria, Bastion gained prestige with the construction of two court house buildings. When at the end of the nineteenth century there was an economic shift of influence away from Bastion Square, the offices and hotels became warehousing, and blacktop over the street areas provided more room for parking. With the removal of the Court House facilities to another part of the City, Bastion Square finally died.
The first step towards complete rebirth of Bastion Square came on May 5, 1965 with an application to Central Mortgage and Housing Corporation under Section 23 of the National Housing Act for a project which would allow the Square "to be developed to create a pedestrian concourse where a series of interrelated levels together with the textures and colours of sophisticated landscaping (would) provide a foreground for the harbour view." Exterior and interior renovation of buildings adjoining the Square was to be carried out by private enterprise interests for other than City-owned buildings. Final agreement for the first phase of this project came on October 19, 1965 in the form shown in Appendix E. Bastion Square was officially opened at the end of July, 1966, and further application was made to Central Mortgage and Housing Corporation as shown in Appendix F for financial support to carry out the project's second phase. The costs for Phase 1 and estimated costs for Phase 2 are shown in Table 9. When tenders were received for Phase 1, they were found to exceed the original agreement by approximately $70,000.00 and thus the estimate of cost was revised upward and the increase agreed to by both parties.

Today Bastion Square, besides forming an attractive promenade area, is also forming a focal point for much business and cultural activity. Offices, a furniture store, a restaurant, and the Maritime Museum, are presently operating. One building is being completely rehabilitated for offices, another for a series of small boutiques with offices above. A further building has been proposed for acquisition
### Table 9

**Cost Estimates**

**Bastion Square Restoration Projects**

#### Phase 1

1. **Surface and Architectural Treatment**
   - Total: $75,000.00
   
   Made of approximately of:
   
   a. Site preparation, excavation, grading, fill 8,000.00
   b. Foundations for retaining walls, etc. 6,000.00
   c. Paving: Brick, precast concrete, concrete, steps 36,000.00
   d. Retaining and decorative enclosing walls 8,000.00
   e. Landscaping: Trees, planter tubs, tub pads, lawn 6,000.00
   f. Special structures: "bridge", stairway, pond, flag-pole, kiosk, etc. 8,000.00
   g. Miscellaneous 3,000.00

2. **B.C. Hydro**
   - Remove overhead power lines and replace with underground service in duct. 50,000.00

3. **Street Lighting**
   - 30 Luminaires - 300 watt electric on brackets 2,035.00
   - 10 Gas lanterns on 10' posts 1,165.00
   - Underground gas and electric services 1,500.00
   - Total 6,000.00

4. **Underground Services Replacement**
   - a. Sanitary sewer construction 107' of 8" 2,035.00
   - b. Storm drain construction 174' of 8" 1,165.00
   - c. Cost of raising casting and catchbasins 1,500.00
   - d. Relocate low pressure gas main (Cost to project is undepreciated value plus rock blasting) 800.00
   - e. Construct 6" water main (New location) to replace existing 4,500.00
   - Total 14,000.00

5. **Professional Fees and Administration 10%**
   - Total cost to partnership 14,000.00

6. **Recovery. Estimated 50% share of underground Electric utility cost by B.C. Hydro**
   - Total 25,000.00

7. **Net loss to Partnership**
   - 129,000.00
TABLE 9 - Continued

I. Distribution of loss to Partnership

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Share</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Federal Share 50%</td>
<td>$64,500.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provincial Share 25%</td>
<td>$32,250.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City Share 25%</td>
<td>$32,250.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>$129,000.00</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

PHASE 2

1. Acquisition of Dowell Building                         $50,000.00
2. Construction of access including demolition,
   new walls, etc.                                      22,500.00
3. Grading and Restoring the South Lanes                9,500.00
4. Entrance and Loading Dock at Humber's               2,000.00
5. Grading and Restoring the North Lanes               7,500.00
6. Extension of Commercial Alley                        2,800.00
7. Reinstating Wharf and Langley Streets               11,000.00

**$105,300.00**

Professional Fees 10%                               10,500.00

**$115,800.00**

Distribution of Cost

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Share</th>
<th>Amount</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Federal Government 50%</td>
<td>$57,900.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provincial Government 25%</td>
<td>$28,950.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Municipal Government 25%</td>
<td>$28,950.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>$115,800.00</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Rehabilitation efforts at the local government level in Victoria have, as is demonstrated in the examples given above, been implemented through advisory, administrative, and financial techniques. In its capacity as advisor the City has commissioned two studies which have suggested programs for rehabilitation and has encouraged local business participation through a paint-up campaign. The civic administration, besides enforcing such by-laws as those dealing with signs and building standards, has contracted with the Federal and Provincial governments in the improvement of Bastion Square and the rehabilitation of the City Hall. Their attempt to improve the public areas of the City has led to considerable private investment. Throughout the revitalization of the central business district, financial investment has been made in such a way as to encourage rather than interfere with private enterprise. Viewing the total program, it is seen to be one of comprehensive improvements with special programs for areas of special need.

Private Enterprise Investment in Victoria's Revitalization

In response to the general feeling that revitalization was needed in the Victoria downtown core and in conjunction with efforts of the civic administration, private enterprise has contributed enthusiastically to rehabilitation efforts. Rehabilitation has been undertaken in many forms: the construction of a pedestrian precinct known as Trounce Alley; arcades on two sides of one block and on one
side of another; the creation of shops and offices within the old buildings of Bastion Square; single business improvements; and areas which have been part of the "Paint-Up" campaign.

Reference to Map 4 will show rental values as they appeared in 1964, their range being very wide from approximately $25,000 to $360.00 a front foot. For retail trades there is admittedly a close connection between rentals and locational advantage, however the rental values provide a good indication of downtown prosperity. Reference to Map V will show that rehabilitation has been undertaken in all of these rental areas. Building permits issued for the past ten years were examined for twenty-one structures which have been altered and the cost of alterations is shown in Table 10. For the most part rehabilitation has taken place in the rental area which is at about 50 percent of the highest rent. Although costs examined varied with the type of improvements, they can be seen to be considerable.

Since it is often said that rehabilitation can be carried out near areas of high rental value but not at the edge of the core, cost of rehabilitation and rental values have been examined for two blocks which are at the outskirts of the central business district. (See No. 22 and No. 23 on Map 5) These costs and rental values are shown in Table 11 and present an interesting picture. At first glance they would appear very uneconomical. They were justified according to the Trust Company which undertook them by the fact that had they not been rehabilitated, their rental values would have continued to drop. Although it represents a long-term amortization, rents will rise
RENTAL VALUES IN THE CENTRAL BUSINESS DISTRICT 1964

MAP. 4

SOURCE - CAPITAL REGION PLANNING BOARD.
REHABILITATION PROJECTS IN VICTORIA’S C.B.D.

MAP 5.

SOURCE - CAPITAL REGION PLANNING BOARD

GOVT. SPONSORED PROJECTS
PRIVATE ENTERPRISE

SEE TABLE 11
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Use</th>
<th>Cost</th>
<th>Year of Permit</th>
<th>Original Building Permit</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Retail Furs</td>
<td>$18,600</td>
<td>1962</td>
<td>1893</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Charm School</td>
<td>500</td>
<td>1966</td>
<td>1893</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Realty</td>
<td>4,300</td>
<td>1965-66</td>
<td>1895</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Restaurant</td>
<td>5,750</td>
<td>1962</td>
<td>1910</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Realty</td>
<td>20,000</td>
<td>1966</td>
<td>1895</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Realty</td>
<td>11,930</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>1896</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Dept's Store</td>
<td>33,689</td>
<td>1960-67</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Shoe Store</td>
<td>4,200</td>
<td>1966</td>
<td>1899</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Shoe Store</td>
<td>3,500</td>
<td>1966</td>
<td>1899</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Fabrics Store</td>
<td>2,500</td>
<td>1963</td>
<td>1895</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Shoe Store</td>
<td>5,375</td>
<td>1963</td>
<td>1895</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Shoe Store</td>
<td>4,000</td>
<td>1963</td>
<td>1895</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Drug Store</td>
<td>8,094</td>
<td>1957-66</td>
<td>1911</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Realty</td>
<td>8,800</td>
<td>1964-66</td>
<td>1895</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Delicatessen</td>
<td>20,850</td>
<td>1963</td>
<td>1949</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Specialty Store</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Drycleaners</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Realty</td>
<td>2,000</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>1912</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Bakery</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Restaurant</td>
<td>14,000</td>
<td>1966</td>
<td>1912</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Shoe Repair</td>
<td>4,500</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>1893</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Travel Agency</td>
<td>4,075</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>1930</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hat Shop</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Shoe Repair</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Drycleaners</td>
<td>6,000</td>
<td>1966</td>
<td>1927</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Accountants</td>
<td>17,000</td>
<td>1965</td>
<td>1909</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 Number of business refers to number as shown on Map V.

Source: City of Victoria Building Permits.
### Table 11

**RENTAL VALUES AND ALTERATION COSTS**

**Mellor Block - 827 Broughton Street**

**Rents Before Alterations:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Address</th>
<th>Rent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>819 Broughton St.</td>
<td>$120.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>823 Broughton St.</td>
<td>85.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>825 Broughton St.</td>
<td>185.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\[
\text{\$390.00 x 12 = \$4680 Per Year}
\]

**Rents After Alterations: 31.3.67**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Address</th>
<th>Rent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>819 Broughton St.</td>
<td>$133.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>819-A Broughton St.</td>
<td>138.50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>823 Broughton St.</td>
<td>120.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>825 Broughton St.</td>
<td>88.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>827 Broughton St.</td>
<td>138.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>829 Broughton St.</td>
<td>150.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\[
\text{\$767.50 x 12 = \$9210 Per Year}
\]

**Cost of Alterations:**

- **December 1961**
  - Main Floor Alterations -
    - New Fronts
    - Wiring
    - Plumbing
    - Dividing
    - Stores, Architect

**Total Cost** \(\$25,013.96\)

**Fort Block - 1101-19 Fort St. 1023-33 Cook St.**

**Rents Before Alterations:**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Address</th>
<th>Rent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1025, 1027 &amp; 1029 Cook St.</td>
<td>$180.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1031 Cook St.</td>
<td>60.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1033 Cook St.</td>
<td>60.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1101 Fort St.</td>
<td>160.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1109 Fort St.</td>
<td>68.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1111 Fort St.</td>
<td>68.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1113 Fort St.</td>
<td>68.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1115-1117 Fort St.</td>
<td>180.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1119 Fort St.</td>
<td>90.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\[
\text{\$934.00 x 12 = \$11,208 Per Year}
\]
### TABLE 11 - Continued

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Property</th>
<th>Rent</th>
<th>Cost of Alterations: 1962</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1025, 1027 Cook St.</td>
<td>$230.00</td>
<td>$115,584.37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1029 Cook St.</td>
<td>90.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1031 Cook St.</td>
<td>130.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1033 Cook St.</td>
<td>120.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1101 Fort St.</td>
<td>300.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1109 Fort St.</td>
<td>105.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1111 Fort St.</td>
<td>105.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1113 Fort St.</td>
<td>105.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1115, 1117 Fort St.</td>
<td>295.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1119 Fort St.</td>
<td>175.00</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>$1,655.00 x 12 = $19,860 Per Year</td>
<td>$115,584.37</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Royal Trust Company, Victoria, B.C.
within coming years and thus be a worthwhile investment.

It would seem from the above information that financing has not been a major problem, however, this is not always the case. As only the Bastion Square area is presently involved in a renewal scheme the other businesses must find financing from other sources than through loans from Central Mortgage and Housing Corporation. Finance companies contribute much of the financial support. For other sources, two may be suggested. Small business loans are available from banks at 5½ percent interest but are apparently used infrequently.8 Secondly, the Federal Government has created a body known as the Industrial Development Bank
to promote the economic welfare of Canada by increasing the effectiveness of monetary action through ensuring the availability of credit to industrial enterprises which may reasonably be expected to prove successful if a high level of national income and employment is maintained, by supplementing the activities of other lenders and by providing capital assistance to industry with particular consideration to the financing problems of small enterprises.9

It is now possible for this Bank to lend to small business such as retail outlets or restaurants rather than just industrial enterprises. Loans are made at 7½ percent interest rate and are made where evidence is shown of refusal by two other sources and where the amount invested and the character of that investment affords the Bank reasonable protection.10 Loans from such a bank represent a good source of funds for businesses which are not part of a renewal scheme and it is possible that there should be greater coordination between the Industrial Development Bank and Central Mortgage and Housing Corporation.
Summary to Chapter Five

Local government and private investment have each contributed to the revitalization of Victoria's central business district within the past ten years. It would appear that their partnership has been a successful one and thus worthy of future emulation.
Footnotes to Chapter Five


2 City of Victoria Engineering Department, Downtown Victoria Improvement Plan (Victoria: The City, October 28, 1958).

3 Capital Region Planning Board of B.C., Urban Renewal Study for Victoria (Victoria: The Board, 1961).

4 City of Victoria, Downtown Paint-Up Plan '65 (Victoria: The City, 1965).

5 Capital Region Planning Board of B.C., Overall Plan for Victoria (Victoria: The Board, 1965).


7 Personal Interview with Mr. Jack Fraser, Royal Trust Company, Victoria, B.C., April, 1967.

8 Personal Interview with Mr. A. Watt, Canadian Imperial Bank of Commerce, Main Branch, Victoria, B.C., April, 1967.


10 Personal Interview with Mr. J. Auld, Industrial Development Bank, Victoria, B.C., April, 1967.
CHAPTER SIX

POLICIES FOR THE IMPLEMENTATION OF COMMERCIAL REHABILITATION

The challenges of urban renewal are to attain social harmony, to create a physical synthesis, to build beautifully, and to work out a satisfactory relationship between public and private activity...


In Chapters Four and Five of this thesis examination has been made of the rehabilitation projects in central business districts which have 'urban renewal schemes', and of an evidently successful downtown revitalization in Victoria, B.C. Arising out of these chapters and in full cognizance of the many facets of commercial rehabilitation, it is now possible to propose a program for commercial rehabilitation to be used in the central business districts of Canadian municipalities which will take best advantage of the efforts of government and private enterprise.

The need for revitalization of our city centers has occurred and will occur for three major reasons: the blighting effect of age and obsolescence; the increasing needs of a rapidly growing urban population; and the importance to an entire city of economic health in
the downtown area. To date most renewal efforts in central business districts have been a combination of the results of private enterprise undertaking what was profitable and of government supplementing such efforts in the framework of the present legislation. The use of commercial rehabilitation techniques provides a program in which significant results can be achieved by private enterprise while involving government at the advisory and administrative levels rather than at the financial level. It has been stated that

The primary concern of government sponsored renewal is thus with below average aspects of the present; the primary concern of renewal by private enterprise is with the above average aspects of the future.

Commercial rehabilitation provides a method by which both government and private enterprise can improve upon 'the below average aspects of the present' in order to reap full benefit of the 'above average aspects of the future.'

**Program for Action**

The first step in any planning process is the identification of a problem through careful investigation. In the case of the deterioration of downtown areas this investigation may be touched off by the combined concern of local government and local business interests. Research must determine if the downtown area is worthy of renewal, whether it can meet the commercial and cultural needs of the urban population and whether it can be made easily accessible.
Revitalization then being the desired and stated objective, policies and procedures may be formed for a workable program. After a review of present rehabilitation efforts it is felt that these policies must coordinate government and private enterprise in the specific manner which will be detailed below.

The Municipal Government Role

Rehabilitation efforts within a central business district must be largely the role of municipal governments with the Federal government participating as legislation allows. This role can be expressed in terms of advisory, administrative, and financial responsibilities. It would appear from the case-study that the advisory role is extremely significant. Through careful planning the deterioration of the downtown area can be checked in a comprehensive manner and by incorporating all of the renewal techniques of redevelopment, rehabilitation, and conservation. In terms of rehabilitation alone, advice on programs such as Victoria's 'Paint-Up' campaign can be given, municipal services can be improved throughout the downtown area, and special project areas may be designated as 'urban renewal schemes'. Although the design solution of a shopping mall surrounded by parking has frequently been used, it is felt that design must be individual to each city, and further that a series of small projects may better encourage private enterprise than will one large project.

The municipal government may take advantage of several of its powers in the encouragement of commercial rehabilitation. As is
frequently the case in the United States, and as shown in Appendices C and D, code standards may be established in order to improve conditions. If the area in which these standards are being enforced has been designated for urban renewal, provision is often made to allow buildings to be acquired by public money then either leased or sold back to private businesses if the present owner refuses to cooperate. Second, the municipal government may help the improvement of an area by establishing a high-quality program of public works. Finally, the municipal government in partnership with the Federal government may establish an "urban renewal scheme" thus enabling financial assistance to be given. While code standards may meet physical requirements they do not achieve a coordinated or particularly attractive downtown area and public acquisition of buildings too often causes unnecessary hardship to private enterprise. While it is granted that public acquisition within an "urban renewal scheme" may often be absolutely imperative, the Victoria case-study shows how effective local government can be when it operates as advisor and provider of public works.

It is within the realm of financial encouragement that most urban renewal policies have been suggested in recent years. As has been shown in Chapter Five, private enterprise would appear to be capable of considerable accomplishment in terms of commercial rehabilitation without government intervention. Encouragement by incentives in the form of exemption from property tax, from income tax, or from sales tax on building materials is rejected although they may be useful for other than commercial rehabilitation. Tax
penalties on buildings needing rehabilitation are similarly rejected as being too difficult to administer and not in the best interests of a comprehensive revitalization program. Financial aid to improvements as in the Bastion Square example is condoned for they pave the way for rehabilitation by private enterprise in an area which would otherwise be uneconomical. Financial aid may also be given to the individual owner but this will be discussed below.

Government participation in commercial rehabilitation is thus seen to be most effective in its advisory and administrative capacity. Financial aid should be restricted wherever possible to public works.

The Role of Private Enterprise

Private enterprise may be considered to participate at two levels of commercial rehabilitation. The first level involves the continual modernization and improvement of business premises and is carried on at all times if business interests feel that an economic climate exists. The second level involves the rehabilitation of "gray" areas of a central business district and of totally blighted areas. As has been shown in the case-study, financial aid will often be forthcoming to rehabilitate "gray" areas if they appear to have an economic potential. Profits from such rehabilitation may involve a long-term amortization of costs but they will come and they will prevent complete deterioration. Participation in renewal of extreme blight may often require the use of Central Mortgage and Housing Corporation loans if property is within an "urban renewal scheme" or
loans from an agency such as the Industrial Development Bank in other than urban renewal areas.

**Summary to Chapter Six**

Government participation in commercial rehabilitation is thus seen to be most effective in its advisory and administrative capacity. Financial aid should be restricted wherever possible to public works. Through creation of the setting for an attractive and economically healthy downtown, private enterprise will be encouraged to participate in comprehensive revitalization.
Footnotes to Chapter Six

CHAPTER SEVEN

REVIEW AND EVALUATION OF THE STUDY

Summary of the Study

The basic aim of this thesis is to evolve policies which may be followed in the use of commercial rehabilitation as a technique for the revitalization of central business districts within Canada's cities. It is considered necessary that these policies be established at the local government level, that they be coordinated within the federal and local government levels, and that they be established so as to provide maximum encouragement to private enterprise. It is thus hypothesized that

In order to achieve a comprehensive program of central business district renewal utilizing rehabilitation measures, it is essential that there be coordinated participation of federal and local governments at the advisory, administrative, and financial levels in conjunction with the efforts of private enterprise.

Inherent in the development of policies for the utilization of commercial rehabilitation is the necessity for a full understanding of the problems creating commercial blight in downtown areas and of the technique of rehabilitation itself. For this reason, trends in the location of commercial enterprise were examined in order to demonstrate the effect which the suburban shopping center and the automobile have
had upon central business districts. The physical improvement possible to downtown areas through rehabilitation was illustrated by reference to projects in Great Britain, the United States, and Canada.

As these examples showed, commercial rehabilitation in its implementation involves many facets of the life of central business districts. Physical improvement to be successful must be carried out in areas which meet the principles of retail or business location and which are both accessible by the automobile and efficient for the pedestrian. Although it may be difficult to establish a uniformly pleasing atmosphere in aesthetic terms, commercial rehabilitation strives to achieve both good design and a decent, safe, and sanitary environment. The social importance of downtown as a focus for an urban population must be emphasized in any program for downtown revitalization while still recognizing the need for a strong retail trade and thus the importance of customer consumption patterns. Economic aspects are particularly important for they provide a discreet measure for the strength of a central business district as well as for the costs of revitalization. Finally, rehabilitation in that it is a renewal measure, must be placed in the context of legislation for government-sponsored renewal. It is seen that commercial rehabilitation presently forms only a very small part of this legislation and is dependent upon involved areas being part of a designated "urban renewal scheme."

Commercial rehabilitation has been implemented in a number of Canadian and American cities and thus questionnaires were sent to cities which according to the federal renewal agencies had urban renewal
schemes involving this type of revitalization. By restricting the questionnaires to government-sponsored projects it was hoped to determine better the relationship between government and private enterprise. Response to the questionnaires came mainly from American cities and showed a number of interesting facts. The problem of commercial blight does not restrict itself to any particular city size for projects were being undertaken in cities from 10,000 to over two million population. There does not appear to be any one clear definition of rehabilitation in commercial areas for some cities include public works' improvements while others do not. The emphasis was either on an improvement through realization of code standards or on a single project such as the construction of a shopping mall. Most project areas were very large, representing a good portion of the central business district, but it was difficult to determine how much of this area was involved in redevelopment and how much in rehabilitation. In terms of the types of commercial land use rehabilitated the projects were very comprehensive. Their costs were stated to be one hundred percent the responsibility of private enterprise with any government participation probably being through provision of services or loan programs. Original inspiration for these projects came primarily from a combination of local government and local business concern rather than from any planning bodies. For the few cities whose projects were completed the problems encountered seemed to be either financial or the result of friction between government and private enterprise.
A case-study approach is used in the study of Victoria, British Columbia, as an example of commercial rehabilitation. Programs used are examined in order to isolate the policies which form an evidently successful downtown revitalization. The local government role is first examined and is seen to be one of enthusiasm and persuasiveness combined with comprehensive public works to make the downtown area more attractive. Private investment is studied in order to demonstrate what can be achieved without government financial aid when a healthy business community is encouraged. The role of the Industrial Development Bank of Canada is suggested as a type of 'missing link' to be used by businesses which are not part of urban renewal schemes.

From information collected in the methods described above future policies are suggested to utilize more effectively the techniques of commercial rehabilitation in central business districts of Canadian cities. Briefly they recommend that the government role be extended in advisory and administrative capacities and in the provision of public works but that private enterprise be allowed to operate freely in the rehabilitation of individual structures.

Evaluation of the Study

The Hypothesis: Limitations and Criticisms

The hypothesis of the study would appear to be essentially correct with a possible exception being the role of government in the financial aspects of commercial rehabilitation. Its limitations arise
largely from the assumptions which are necessary in order to prescribe a program of commercial rehabilitation. In an attempt to study only rehabilitation other forms of renewal may appear less significant and yet they are often essential in a comprehensive program of revitalization. Further, the hypothesis fails to stipulate which types of land use should be retained in the central business district and thus be rehabilitated.

The Study: Limitations and Criticisms

The study consists of three major sections: an extensive literature review is used to examine the main physical, social, economic, and legislative aspects of commercial rehabilitation; response to questionnaires is tabulated in order to review and evaluate the progress of government-sponsored commercial rehabilitation programs in the United States and Canada; and the case-study method is used to examine interaction between government and private enterprise in rehabilitation efforts.

There is no assurance that all of the aspects of commercial rehabilitation have been considered particularly with respect to actual physical change and the costs involved. The government rather than the private enterprise role being the most frequently documented, this study may have been guilty of neglect of the ideas of private investors. The questionnaire method of study, while it gathers considerable information, has weaknesses because of misunderstanding of questions and by asking for specific facts where ideas and policies might have been more useful. Limitations of the case-study arise from the fact that Victoria does not represent and never has represented the worst examples of
commercial blight within the central business district. Victoria is also most fortunate in having a stock of very fine and attractive old buildings which may be used as a basis for rehabilitation.

Further Research

The study has disclosed a number of areas for further research. Paramount among these is the need for an economic cost-benefit analysis of commercial rehabilitation. Through this analysis it should be possible to determine the dividing line between the need for redevelopment, for rehabilitation, or for conservation. It might also suggest the most practicable economic combination of these three measures. Further study is needed to determine just how much of a central business district can be rehabilitated, and how much must be left in its present form in order to act as a place for the incubation of new commercial activities. The place of the marginal business in the central business district must be examined. Finally, much commercial rehabilitation is achieved through natural market processes rather than consciously directed effort and the relationship between these two needs closer definition.

Validity of Findings and the Hypothesis

Subject to the limitations suggested above, it is considered that commercial rehabilitation should be encouraged as a technique for renewal within downtown areas, and that it is fair to uphold the basic validity of the hypothesis.
APPENDIX A

QUESTIONNAIRE CONCERNING COMMERCIAL REHABILITATION

SENT TO CANADIAN AND AMERICAN CITIES

WITH ACCOMPANYING LETTER OF EXPLANATION
QUESTIONNAIRE

The purpose of this questionnaire is to determine:

1. The meaning attached to rehabilitation within the CBD commercial area
2. The extent of rehabilitation projects in execution or planned for Canadian and American cities
3. The source of inspiration for these projects
4. Problems encountered with these projects

Name of City

1. 'Rehabilitation' as defined by your planning office with regard to CBD commercial areas refers to:
   a. painting and cleaning buildings
   b. improvement of traffic access
   c. improvement of parking
   d. street improvements such as planting of trees, provision of street furniture
   e. redecoration of interiors of buildings
   f. management consultant service for business
   g. control of signs
   h. provision of street lighting
   i. other (please specify)

Comments:

2. Commercial rehabilitation within the central business district of your city is presently in execution or projected:
   a. on an areal basis; on a block basis; on a single business basis. If on an areal basis, how large an area?
b. Is this rehabilitation part of a larger program? Yes______
No_______ If yes, does this larger program also involve:
redevelopment______; other rehabilitation______; or
conservation______.

c. It includes such commercial land use functions as:

specialty shops
personal and business services
department stores
other shopping
office buildings
theatres
restaurants
other (please specify)


d. The average age of buildings being rehabilitated is_______.

e. Rehabilitation in this project will include:

a. painting and cleaning buildings
b. improvement of traffic access
c. improvement of parking
d. street improvements such as planting
   of trees, provision of street furniture
e. redecoration of interiors of buildings
f. management consultant service for business
g. control of signs
h. provision of street lighting
i. other (please specify)


f. The number of building units involved is_______.

g. The total cost of rehabilitation will be $_______
   to be shared
   % by private enterprise
   % at the municipal level
   % at the state/provincial level
   % at the Federal level

h. Will the buildings to be rehabilitated be acquired by public money then either leased or sold back to private business?
3. Original inspiration for this project came from:

- private business interests
- Chamber of Commerce
- local government
- Other (please specify)

b. What criteria did you use to select your rehabilitation area? (if the specific area was not suggested by one of the above)

4. a. With which part of the rehabilitation program have you encountered the most difficulty?

b. In how many of the commercial units rehabilitated has there been or is there indicated

   i. a change of use
   
   ii. a change of ownership.
APPENDIX B

PLANNING OFFICIALS WHO REPLIED TO
LETTERS AND QUESTIONNAIRES CONCERNING
COMMERCIAL REHABILITATION PROGRAMS
United States

Mr. Gordon E. Howard  
Director  
Office of Program Planning  
Renewal Projects Administration  
Department of Housing and Urban Development  
Washington, D.C. 20410

Mr. John T. Sayers, Jr.  
Senior Development Specialist  
Downtown Waterfront Project  
Boston Redevelopment Authority  
Boston, Massachusetts

Mr. Thomas C. Hoffman  
Executive Director  
Erie Redevelopment Authority  
Erie, Pennsylvania

Mr. Leo Wilensky  
Urban Renewal Director  
Flint, Michigan

Mr. Clyde N. Bradley  
Rehabilitation Officer  
Redevelopment Agency of the  
City of Fresno  
Fresno, California

Mr. A.E. Cornett  
Executive Director  
Johnson City Housing Authority  
Johnson City, Tennessee

Mr. Michael R. Chitwood  
Executive Director  
Land Clearance for Redevelopment Authority  
Joplin, Missouri

Mr. George Millar, Jr.  
Executive Director  
Housing Authority of the  
City of Little Rock  
Little Rock, Arkansas

Mr. Jack D. Leeth  
Executive Director  
Urban Renewal and Community Development Agency  
Louisville, Kentucky

Mr. Robert H. McCann  
Assistant Director of  
Urban Renewal  
Manchester Housing Authority  
Manchester, New Hampshire

Mr. Samuel Kaplan  
Downtown Renewal Director  
New Haven Redevelopment Agency  
New Haven, Connecticut

Mr. James T. Yielding  
Oklahoma City Urban Renewal Authority  
Oklahoma City, Oklahoma

Mr. Clinton B. Mullen  
Redevelopment Authority of the  
City of Philadelphia  
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania

Miss Virginia S. West  
Executive Director  
Sylacauga Housing Authority  
Sylacauga, Alabama

Mr. Paul D. Chapman  
Executive Director  
Tulsa Urban Renewal Authority  
Tulsa, Oklahoma

Mr. Howard L. Zacks  
Rehabilitation Coordinator  
Utica Urban Renewal Agency  
Utica, New York

Mr. Leon E. Case, Jr.  
Redevelopment Authority of the  
City of Wilkes-Barre  
Executive Director  
Wilkes-Barre, Pennsylvania
Canada

Mr. T.P. Morris
Branch Architect and Planner
Central Mortgage and Housing Corporation
Vancouver Office
Vancouver, B.C.

Mr. A.G. Martin
Director of Planning
City of Calgary, Alberta

Mr. S.C. Rodgers
Chief Planner
The City of Edmonton
Edmonton, Alberta

Mr. R.B. Grant
Development Officer
City of Halifax
Halifax, Nova Scotia

Mr. N.S. Sibbick
Assistant Planner
Oakville Planning Board
Oakville, Ontario

Mr. W.F. Manthorpe
Commissioner of Development
Development Department
City of Toronto
Toronto, Ontario

Mr. Ernest Langlois
Superintendent
Urban Renewal Division
City Planning Department
City of Montreal
Montreal, Quebec
APPENDIX C

REDEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY OF THE CITY OF ERIE
405 MUNICIPAL BUILDING
ERIE, PENNSYLVANIA

DOWNTOWN ERIE URBAN RENEWAL PROJECT
HHFA-URA PROJECT NO. PENNA. R-136
PA. DEPT. OF COMMERCE PROJECT NO. R-159

REHABILITATION REQUIREMENTS

for

926-932 PEACH STREET - LPA PARCEL NO. 30-13
Specific Rehabilitation Requirements
for 926-932 Peach Street, LPA Parcel No. 30-13

I. Objective: To provide, through rehabilitation, a safe, structurally sound, mechanically and electrically efficient, proper circulating building operation, and a unified, aesthetically attractive exterior and interior image which will blend harmoniously with the design objectives of Erie's new and rejuvenated Downtown.

II. Specific Rehabilitation Requirements:

1. Structural and General Construction
   a. Building is in Fire District No. 1 and minimum allowable construction is Type 3-B.
      (1) All wood framed exterior walls (including those in light and ventilation courts) must be replaced with non-combustible masonry construction.
      (2) All wood floor structure and floor framing throughout the building must be fireproofed by an approved means which will provide the required fire-resistance rating of 3/4 hour.
      (3) All wood framed interior bearing walls and partitions must be fire-proofed to provide the required fire-resistance rating of 3/4 hour.
      (4) All fire walls and fire divisions must have a fire-resistance rating of 3 hours.
         (a) Fire wall between 926 and 928 Peach Street has been broken through and an alcove formed with illegal construction.
      (5) All wood roof structure must be protected by materials providing a fire-resistance rating of 3/4 hour.
      (6) Attic space over second floor apartment area is badly deteriorated, generally useless and constitutes a fire hazard. This construction should be removed and new roof construction (in accordance with the codes) at the second floor ceiling level.
b. 930 Peach Street section occupied by Thayer McNeil has an opening in a masonry wall between the showroom area and stock area, with plaster cracks at the lintel area. Investigation should be made to determine cause (weakened lintel or improper or missing plaster reinforcing) and repaired as required.

c. First and second floors: wood floor structures are sagging badly and are deteriorated beyond proper load-bearing capacity; joist bearing ends are rotted out in some areas. Existing wood floor structures should be replaced with minimum Type 3-B construction as per the city code.

d. Exterior brick has been treated unsuccessfully with a water-proofing type paint to eliminate the cause of interior water damage. Major cause of water damage would appear to be through investigation as follows:

(1) Deteriorated roofing.

(2) Deteriorated and improper flashing.

(3) Inadequately sized or partially plugged roof drains and conductors.

(4) Areas of roof (such as light and ventilation wells) which have no drains and act as water reservoirs, depending on evaporation and absorption into the building for water removal.

e. Wood sash and trim show minor deterioration; should be cleaned and painted, with repair and/or replacement of members as required.

2. Egress

a. All stairways within the building are in violation of both the City and State codes and must be replaced or revised in accordance with the codes.

b. Circulation within the building must be revised in order to provide the proper number of exits and access thereto.

(1) Individual shops and stores, within the building and which are not interconnected, are required by City and State codes to have two (2) exits reasonably remote from one another.
3. Fire Alarm and Fire Protective Systems
   a. No fire alarm system is required for this particular building.
   b. Fire protection equipment in the form of an automatic sprinkler system will be required in the basement, and the remainder of the building shall be furnished with fire protective equipment and extinguishers, all as required by State and City codes.

4. Emergency Lighting Equipment
   a. Emergency lighting for exits, stairs, etc. must be provided as required by the State and City codes.

5. Plumbing
   a. Plumbing is adequate and serviceable generally, although deterioration due to age is setting in. System should be thoroughly checked for replacements and repairs required.

6. Heating, Ventilating and Air Conditioning
   a. Heating is by means of metered "City Steam" with manually controlled cast iron radiators. Although the system design is an obsolete type, heating of the building is adequate, but far from ideal.
   b. Bathrooms and toilet rooms are inadequately ventilated and a positive mechanical system should be installed.
   c. Existing air conditioning units are window type - see "Non-Residential Rehabilitation Requirements" excerpt from the Urban Renewal Plan.

7. Electrical (See also Paragraph 4 - "Emergency Lighting System")
   a. Electrical service is adequate and generally in good condition.
   b. Extensive amount of the distribution system is obsolete and deteriorating; with fraying and illegal splices in evidence. All such wiring should be replaced.
c. Lighting in stairs and corridors is inadequate and should be brought up to Illuminating Engineers Society standards.

d. Convenience and utility outlets are inadequate in number and should be supplemented - ratio should be 1 to 72 square feet of floor area.

8. Interior Materials and Finishes

a. First floor has several areas requiring patching and painting.

b. Second floor throughout and especially in presently unused portions, needs extensive patching and painting.

c. Floors (first and second) - see Paragraph 1 - "Structural and General Construction"

d. Elimination of water damage causes - see Paragraph 1 - "Structural and General Construction"

NOTE "A"

Codes referred to herein are as follows:

1. City of Erie Building Code
2. City of Erie Plumbing Code
4. Fire Prevention Code - National Board of Fire Underwriters
5. City and County of Erie Department of Health and Sanitation
6. Pennsylvania Department of Labor and Industry Regulations for Protection from Fire and Panic

NOTE "B"

If further explanation, guidance, or discussion is desired, Redevelopment Authority staff will be available.
APPENDIX D

CENTRAL BUSINESS DISTRICT

URBAN RENEWAL AREA

PROJECT ALA R-75

ATTACHMENT NO. 1 TO THE URBAN RENEWAL PLAN

SUGGESTED PROPERTY REHABILITATION STANDARDS

SYLACAUGA, ALABAMA
NON-RESIDENTIAL PROPERTY REHABILITATION STANDARDS

PART 1

INTRODUCTION

Objective:

The objective of these property rehabilitation standards is to provide a practical basis for cooperative efforts on the part of property owners, the municipal government, and the housing authority, in achieving a maximum degree of structural improvement, uniformity of design, service facilities, landscaping and general amenities within the boundaries of the subject project area.

These Property Rehabilitation Standards shall apply to all properties within the conservation section of the project area. Where reference is made to existing Codes and Ordinances, the following shall apply:


Part II of these standards are the mandatory requirements as incorporated in the Urban Renewal Plan and adopted by the city. These standards in part II refer to existing codes and ordinances of the city and are supplemented by additional standards pertaining to the health, safety, and welfare of those properties within the urban renewal area.

Part III of the General Improvement Standards pertain essentially to the improvements to be provided by property owners and tenants to upgrade their buildings for the purpose of providing better appearance, convenience, and accessibility for customers, and an improved business climate for the project area. Both part II and part III have been reviewed by the committee of owners and tenants in the project and are considered essential to the successful execution of the overall plan for the Central Business District.
Part IV of these standards contains sign regulations to be enforced within the project area.

Part V of these standards establishes a Design Review Board which shall advise and assist the Conservation Officer in carrying out the conservation program.

PART II
MANDATORY REQUIREMENTS

A. Codes and Ordinances

Where the local code, regulation or requirements permits lower standards than required herein, these Minimum Property Standards shall apply.

B. Building Requirements

(1) Structural - All structural components of the building shall be in sound condition and considered serviceable for the expected useful life of the rehabilitated building.

(2) Walls -

(a) Exterior walls shall provide safe and adequate support for all loads upon them. Masonry walls, either solid or veneer, shall prevent the entrance of water or excessive moisture.

(b) Party or lot line walls shall be of incombustible materials and shall extend the full height of the building from foundation to or through the roof. The wall shall effectively prevent the passage of fire at all floor ceiling intersections with the wall. The fire resistance rating of the wall, where it is new construction in connection with present rehabilitation shall be not less than 2-hours, except as otherwise required by the prevailing code. Any openings through party walls shall be protected by closures, as required by the wall in accordance with the applicable code.

(c) Exterior basement and foundation walls shall prevent the entrance of water or moisture into a basement or crawl space area. Cracks in the walls shall be effectively sealed, and loose or defective mortar joints shall be replaced. Where necessary, the interior or exterior face of the walls shall be dampproofed by bituminous coating and cement pargeting.
(3) Roofs and Moisture Protection

(a) All roofs shall have a suitable covering free of holes, cracks or excessively worn surfaces which will prevent the entrance of moisture into the structure and provide reasonable durability.

(b) All critical joints in exterior roof and wall construction shall be protected by sheet metal or other suitable flashing material to prevent the entrance of water.

(c) Each building shall have a controlled method of disposal of water from roofs where necessary to prevent damage to the property, and avoid causing an unsightly appearance of walls and windows where adequate roof overhangs are not provided.

(d) Any deficiencies in proper grading or paving adjacent to the building shall be corrected to assure surface drainage away from building.

(4) Finishes - The exterior and interior finishes of the building should assure against the entrance or penetration of moisture and extremes of temperature; protect from damage by decay, corrosion, insects and other destructive elements by appropriate means, and provide reasonable durability and economy of maintenance.

(5) Stairways - Existing stairways in sound condition to remain, or to be repaired, shall not be dangerously or to any serious extent below minimum code standards as to rise and run of steps, headroom, obstructions, stair width, landings, or railing protection. Stairways provided for the public shall conform to code standards.

(6) Ventilation of Structural Spaces - Natural ventilation of spaces such as attics and enclosed basementless spaces shall be provided by appropriate preventive measures to overcome dampness and minimize the effect of conditions conducive to decay and deterioration of the structure, and to prevent excessive heat in attics.

(7) Infestation - Each building and all exterior appurtenances on the premises shall be adequately protected against rodents, termites or other vermin infestation. An existing building where found to have defects which will permit the entrance into the structure of rodents, termites or other vermin shall be corrected by appropriate preventive measures.
(8) Mechanical

(a) Heating - Each property shall be provided with a centralized heating facility, or appropriate and sufficient individual space heaters, capable of maintaining a temperature of at least 70 degrees F. when the outside temperature is at the design temperature, in all public spaces. All heating devices or equipment shall have an appropriate recognized approval for safety and performance, or shall be so determined by proper authority. All heaters except electric heaters shall be vented.

(b) Electrical - All appropriate spaces in each building shall be provided with electric service by a system of wiring and equipment to safely supply electrical energy for proper illumination and for the appropriate location and use of appliances or other equipment.

Installation of new wiring and replacement of faulty wiring shall be in conformance with Electrical Code.

(c) Plumbing - The plumbing system and its appurtenances for each building shall provide satisfactory water supply, drainage, venting, and operation of fixtures.

(d) Chimneys and Vents - Chimneys and vents shall be structurally safe, durable, smoketight and capable of withstanding the action of flue gases.

(e) Ventilation of Utility Spaces - Utility spaces which contain heat producing, air conditioning and other equipment shall be ventilated to the outer air, and air from such spaces shall not be recirculated to other parts of the building.

(f) Ventilation of Toilet Spaces - Every toilet room shall have windows providing in no case less than three (3) sq. ft. of open space, or shall have approved, equivalent mechanical ventilation, exhausting outside the building. Where ventilation is provided by mechanical means, lavatories, toilets, bathrooms, and rest rooms shall be provided with at least two (2) cubic feet of fresh air per minute per square foot of floor area.

C. Egress and Fire Protection

No exception to applicable codes permitted.
D. **Sanitary Facilities**

Each commercial unit shall have at least one fully enclosed toilet room with at least one water closet and one lavatory.

**PART III**

**GENERAL IMPROVEMENT STANDARDS**

1. **Planning Assistance** will be provided by the housing authority as follows:

   A. **Inspection** - Each property will be inspected by the Sylacauga Housing Authority to determine its conformance with these standards and a list of deficiencies will be provided to the owner.

   B. **Financial** - A financial advisor will be retained as needed by the Sylacauga Housing Authority to discuss problems of financing the necessary improvements to properties. A complete file of application forms and informational literature of government agencies such as SBA and FHA will be provided, and a list of lending institutions willing to lend money in the project will be maintained.

   C. **Contracting** - A list of qualified contractors, interested in doing work in the project will be maintained and a follow-up will be made by the Sylacauga Housing Authority of any complaints by owners of workmanship and prices.

   D. **Architectural** - A project architect will be retained by the Sylacauga Housing Authority to advise owners and the Design Review Board upon the exterior appearance and the general extent of remodeling desirable to bring the property up to a lasting standard of quality and aesthetic appeal. This advice will be limited to preliminary plans. No working drawings or specifications will be provided as a project service. Owners who need further development of preliminary plans for construction purposes will be expected to secure these services at their own expense.

2. **Buildings and Grounds** - The following provisions apply to all properties in the project area and are intended to provide the basis for the improvement of buildings to a higher standard of appearance and convenience than would be possible under existing codes and ordinances.

   A. **Site Improvements** -

   Walks and steps shall be provided for convenient all weather access to the structure constructed so as to provide safety, reasonable durability, economy of maintenance and pleasing appearance.
(2) The open space of each property should provide

(a) for the immediate diversion of water away from buildings and disposal from the lot,

(b) prevent soil saturation detrimental to structures and lot use, and

(c) where needed, appropriate paved walks, parking areas, driveways, exterior steps, planting of trees, shrubs and herbaceous materials, statuary, drinking fountains, shelters benches and other architectural and landscape architectural features. Contract drawings for landscape architectural treatment proposed as project improvements shall be prepared by a qualified landscape architect whose services shall be retained on a consulting basis during the entire period of project development.

(3) All exterior appurtenances or accessory structures which serve no useful purpose, or those in a deteriorated condition which are not economically repairable, shall be removed. Such structures include porches, terraces, marquees, signs, entrance platforms, garages, carports, walls, fences, miscellaneous sheds. Where a structure is needed for utility or privacy and the existing one requires removal, it shall be replaced with a structure that appropriately serves the building.

B. Building Improvements -

(1) Materials - Every building shall be constructed of materials of such kind and quality which will provide:

(a) appropriate structural strength, and pleasing appearance,

(b) adequate resistance to weather and moisture, and

(c) reasonable durability and economy of maintenance.

(2) Windows and Doors - Existing windows and doors, including its hardware, should operate satisfactorily and give evidence of continuing acceptable service.

(3) Exterior Walls - Repairs to existing siding, stucco, or other exterior wall finish method should use standards for new work as a guide.
(4) Interior Walls and Ceilings - All interior walls and ceilings of rooms and hallways should provide

(a) a suitable base for decorative finish,
(b) a waterproof and hard surface in spaces subject to moisture, and
(c) There shall not be noticeable surface irregularities or cracking.

(5) Floors - Finish floors should be appropriate for the use of the space and provide reasonable durability and economy of maintenance.

(6) Elevators - Where provided, an elevator should furnish convenient and safe ascent and descent to all public spaces and service areas. The character and type of elevator service and equipment shall be appropriate to the building being rehabilitated and to its occupants and conform to Chapter XXIV of Southern Standard Building Code, 1965 Edition.

(7) Light - Adequate artificial light shall be provided for all public spaces. Light sources shall to the maximum extent be concealed. (light shelves, recessed floods, etc.)

(8) Ventilation - Windows or ventilators shall be provided of such size that the aggregate area thereof will be not less than 4 percent of floor area or adequate mechanical ventilation shall be provided to all public spaces.

C. Additional Requirements

(1) Toilet Rooms - Each commercial unit shall provide toilet rooms for employees as follows:

(a) One toilet room up to 6 employees,
(b) One toilet room for each sex with one water closet per 15 employees for establishments of more than 6 employees.
(c) Each toilet room shall contain the following:

1) impervious floor surface material,
2) mirror and light,
3) paper towel dispenser, soap and waste receptacle,
4) garment hook.

(2) Surface treatment - Where painting is not appropriate to the wall materials such as brick or stone these surfaces should be cleaned or sandblasted, repointed, and waterproofed with appropriate materials.

(3) Continuity and uniformity of design and color schemes - Advisory services of the project architect, color consultant, and Design Review Board shall include sketches and suggestions for use of grilles, screens or other suitable methods of concealing and/or coordinating treatment of obsolete design and materials of building facades to present harmonious street scenes. This shall include the selection of basic colors and color combinations and recommendations for color combinations in each block or portion of blocks. Full consideration shall be given to the type of screens or other treatment of building facades and to adopted color schemes in the design and structural specifications for canopies, mall or sidewalk shelters, and other architectural facilities to be provided at project or public expense.

(4) Color treatment - Color scheme shall be submitted to the Design Review Board and Project Architect for review and determination of conformity to overall objectives referred to in preceding paragraph.

(5) Rear Facades - Where the rear and side walls of existing buildings become exposed to parking lots and other uses in the interior of a block, the exposed walls shall be refurbished to present a finished appearance. Where feasible, rear entrances and displays to shops from parking areas should be provided.

PART IV
SIGN CONTROLS

A. Scope

The following regulations shall apply to all signs within the project area and/or adopted as a part of the Urban Renewal Plan.
B. Definition

Sign: Any display of characters, letters, illustrations, ornaments of adjuncts thereto designed to call attention or to indicate the name, use or kind of establishment and/or used as an announcement to promote the interest of any one or more persons or to indicate direction or directions.

C. General Provisions

(1) Building Permit - A building permit shall be required for erection, alteration, relocation or reconstruction of any sign unless otherwise herein set forth and to be issued by the building official so designated in accordance with the applicable local Laws and Codes.

(2) Materials - Signs must be constructed of durable material maintained in good condition and not permitted to become dilapidated.

(3) Sign Area - The area of a sign is the area of the face of a sign formed by a perimeter consisting of a series of straight lines enclosing all parts of the sign. The area of a free standing sign structure is the area of face or faces on one side only.

(4) Illuminated Signs - Signs shall be illuminated by back lighting or flood lighting evenly distributed over the sign face or background material and shall be so placed and so shielded that rays therefrom or from the sign itself will not present a nuisance to other property owners or a hazard to driving automobiles or other vehicles.

(5) Approval - All sign designs and locations shall be submitted to the Design Review Board for approval prior to construction or installation.

D. Signs For Which A Permit Is Not Required

(1) Traffic, directional, warning or information signs authorized by any public agency.

(2) Official notices issued by any court, public agency or officer.

(3) One non-illuminated "for sale", "for rent" or "for lease" sign not exceeding 20 sq. ft. in area located not less than 10 ft. back from the street right-of-way line unless attached to the front or new facade of a building.
E. Regulations Applying to Specific Types of Signs

(1) Roof Signs - Roof signs already in place may remain in place until such time as a building permit becomes necessary under paragraph designated "Building Permit" herein.

(2) Wall Signs - Signs on the walls of a building (including signs attached flat against the wall, painted wall signs and projecting signs) shall meet the following requirements:

The total area of a sign on each facade of a building fronting on a public area (street, highway or public parking area) shall be limited to 1 sq. ft. of sign area per one foot of lineal frontage for each building facade.

F. Prohibited Signs

(1) Signs Imitating Warning Signals - No sign shall display intermittent lights resembling the flashing light customarily used in traffic signals or in police, fire, ambulance or rescue vehicles nor shall any sign use the words "stop", "danger", or any other word phrase, symbol or character in a manner that might mislead or confuse an automobile or other vehicular driver.

(2) Signs Within Street or Highway Rights-Of-Way - Except as herein provided, no sign whatsoever, whether temporary or permanent, except traffic signs and signals and information signs erected by a public agency are permitted within any street or highway right-of-way.

(3) Signs Already In Place - Signs already in place within or overhanging street or highway rights-of-way may remain in place until such time as it becomes necessary to obtain a building permit for work as set forth under paragraph designated "Building Permit" herein, except that signs presently in place extending past the street curb line shall be relocated without building permit to extend not closer than 18 in. to a vertical plane at the street curb line.

(4) Certain Attached and Painted Signs - Signs painted on or attached to trees, fence posts, and utility poles or signs painted on or attached to rocks or other natural features or painted on the roofs of buildings are prohibited except air directional signs visible only from overhead.
(5) Fluttering Ribbons and Banners - Fluttering ribbons and banners and similar devices are prohibited, except the flags of governments and their agencies.

G. Projecting Signs

(1) Wall signs attached flat against a wall may not extend more than 10 in. from the wall. Background material other than wall of a building shall be counted in the area of a sign.

(2) Signs attached at any angle at a wall may extend outside the wall of a building not more than 5 ft. and may be located not closer than 18 in. to a vertical plane at the street curb line. In no case shall signs project beyond property lines except that signs may project over public sidewalks provided that the minimum height above the grade or sidewalk level of such sign shall be no less than 9 ft.

(3) A projecting sign may not extend above the main roof line more than 5 ft.

(4) Where a perimeter canopy is installed each establishment shall provide one sign below the canopy which conforms to the format selected by the Design Review Board.

H. Free Standing Signs

Free standing signs shall be limited to one per street front and shall not exceed 30 sq. ft. in area and 20 ft. in height. Clearance beneath the sign shall be at least 10 ft. No portion of the sign shall extend closer to the property line than 5 ft.

PART V

DESIGN REVIEW BOARD

A Design Review Board of three members selected from names submitted by the Sylacauga Chamber of Commerce shall be appointed by the Mayor and Council.

This Board shall have the responsibility of reviewing all proposals concerning public and private improvements in the Urban Renewal Area.
All proposed structures, signs, public improvements and alterations to existing facilities to be made by property owners, tenants, or public bodies shall be reviewed by this Board before work is started. The Project Conservation Officer, Project Architect, the City Engineer and the City Building Inspector shall assist the Design Review Board in the execution of its responsibility.

Processing of proposals shall be the responsibility of the Sylacauga Housing Authority Conservation Officer who will review preliminary proposals to determine the scope and general nature of the proposal, and act as General Coordinator to insure that all affected city officials and professional advisors are informed of matters before the Design Review Board.
APPENDIX E

AGREEMENT BETWEEN CENTRAL MORTGAGE AND HOUSING CORPORATION AND THE CITY OF VICTORIA FOR THE BASTION SQUARE RESTORATION PROJECT

PHASE 1
THIS AGREEMENT made the 19th day of October 1965,

B E T W E E N

CENTRAL MORTGAGE AND HOUSING CORPORATION
(hereinafter called "the Corporation")

OF THE FIRST PART:

- and -

THE CORPORATION OF THE CITY OF VICTORIA
(hereinafter called "the Municipality")

OF THE SECOND PART:

Whereas the Municipality intends to implement an urban renewal scheme in the Bastion Square area of the City of Victoria, which scheme has been approved by the Province of British Columbia and is acceptable to the Corporation, . . . provided that the scheme may be amended by the Municipality from time to time with the consent of the Province of British Columbia and the Corporation;

AND WHEREAS the Governor-in-Council pursuant to Section 23B of the National Housing Act, 1954, has approved entry into an agreement by the Corporation with the Municipality to provide for payment of contributions equal to one-half of the actual cost, as determined by the Corporation, of the installation of municipal services and works, . . .

NOW THEREFORE THIS INDENTURE WITNESSETH that the parties hereto mutually agree as follows:

1. (1) The Municipality will construct, install and complete the municipal services . . .

(2) The Municipality will call for public tenders for any and all parts of the servicing to be undertaken pursuant to Clause 1(1). When tenders have closed on any part of the servicing, the Municipality is to submit to the Corporation a summary of all tenders received. The Corporation's prior concurrence to an award will be required if:
(a) the contract value exceeds the estimate; or
(b) it is proposed to make the award to other than the lowest tenderer.

(3) The Municipality shall provide the Corporation with a copy of all contracts with respect to the servicing as soon as possible after contracts are awarded.

(4) The Municipality, if it desires to carry out any part of the work itself, shall submit a tender.

2. (1) The actual cost of installing the municipal services and works in the urban renewal area shall be deemed to include:

(a) the costs of installing the various services and works and commuting the outstanding local improvement charges as outlined in . . .
(b) amounts paid for fees and disbursements for solicitors, surveyors, appraisers, brokers and other similar services required for the installation of the municipal works and services;
(c) such other expenses incurred by the Municipality or by the Corporation during the installation of the municipal services and works as may be approved both by the Municipality and the Corporation prior to their incurrence.

(2) The Corporation will pay contributions to the Municipality equal to one-half of the actual cost, as determined by the Corporation, pursuant to subclause (1) above, upon receipt of statements of account in accordance with Clause 3.

3. (1) The Municipality shall in the first instance disburse all items forming part of the actual cost.

(2) Any commitment made by the Municipality or the Corporation which directly or indirectly affects the actual cost shall be made only after the Municipality and the Corporation have concurred in such commitment.

(3) Not less frequently than quarterly the Municipality shall prepare and submit to the Corporation a statement of account supported by such books, records or other data as the Corporation may require, showing:

(a) amounts disbursed by the Municipality toward the actual cost of installing municipal works and services; and
(b) amounts required to commute local improvement charges outstanding against lots acquired during the period covered by the claim.

(4) The Municipality shall provide to the Corporation such books, records or other data supporting such accounts as the Corporation may from time to time require and the Municipality will maintain separate
accounts in respect of the project and will permit the examination, inspection and audit of such accounts by the Corporation or by auditors appointed by it at all reasonable times.

4. The Municipality shall retain all documents, vouchers, records and account pertaining to the cost of supplementing and implementing the scheme for not less than seven years from the date of completion of the scheme as determined by the parties hereto.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF the parties hereto have hereunto affixed their corporate seals as witness the hands of their proper officers in that behalf.

CENTRAL MORTGAGE AND HOUSING CORPORATION

________________________________________

________________________________________

THE CORPORATION OF THE CITY OF VICTORIA

________________________________________
APPENDIX F

APPLICATION FOR BASTION SQUARE

RESTORATION PROJECT

PHASE 2
Whereas the renewal works for Bastion Square which are the subject of an agreement made on the 19th day of October 1965, between Central Mortgage and Housing Corporation, and the City of Victoria are now substantially complete, and

Whereas a prime objective of the scheme is to encourage restoration and rehabilitation of the buildings fronting onto the Square and

Whereas it is essential to provide vehicular and other service access to the buildings to enable them to be used to best advantage and

Whereas the Council and the Corporation of the City of Victoria has caused to be prepared an Urban Renewal Scheme for the area centred between Yates, Government, Fort and Wharf Streets, known as Bastion Square . . .

Now therefore Council of the City of Victoria resolves that:

1. The urban renewal proposals to be known as Bastion Square Restoration Project Phase 2, set out in the accompanying Application be adopted.

2. Application be made to Central Mortgage and Housing Corporation pursuant to Sec. 23B of the National Housing Act 1954, for an Agreement providing for the payment of contributions equal to one half of the actual cost of carrying out the Bastion Square Restoration Project Phase 2.

3. Application be made to the Lieutenant Governor in Council or the Minister appointed by him for that purpose for an agreement pursuant to Sec. 15 of the Housing Act 1960 providing for a grant by the Province to the City equal to fifty percentum of the amount of the grant agreed to be paid to the City of Victoria by the Minister of Labour for Canada for the purpose of carrying out the Bastion Square Restoration Project Phase 2.

4. The proper officers of the City be authorized to negotiate the terms of the Agreements with Central Mortgage and Housing Corporation and the Province providing for the contributions and payments as aforesaid.
BIBLIOGRAPHY
BIBLIOGRAPHY

Public Documents


Books and Theses


**Articles and Periodicals**


Candeub, Isadore. "Small City Downtown Renewal, there are problems, resolved and unresolved," *Journal of Housing*, XX, No. 3 (April 12, 1963).


---


Rouse, James W. "Will Downtown Face Up to its Future," Urban Land, XVI, No. 2 (February, 1957), 1, 3-5.


---


Reports


---


---


---


Jonassen, C.T. **The Shopping Center Versus Downtown.** Columbus, Ohio: Ohio State University, 1955.


Conference Proceedings


Other Sources


Canadian Imperial Bank of Commerce. Main Branch. Personal Interview with Mr. A. Watt, Victoria, B.C., April, 1967.

McLab Enterprises. Personal Interview with Mr. Gavin Hall. Victoria, B.C., April, 1967.

Victoria, City of. Building Department. Personal Interview with Mrs. Muriel Folger, Victoria, B.C., April, 1967.

Royal Trust Co. Personal Interview with Mr. Jack Fraser. Victoria, B.C., April, 1967.