

EDUCATION FOR PLANNING: THE SPECIAL
CIRCUMSTANCES IN LOW INCOME COUNTRIES.

by

LEANDRO A. VILORIA

A.B., Far Eastern University, 1951
M.P.A., University of the Philippines, 1955
D.P.A., Syracuse University, 1962

A THESIS SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT OF
THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF
MASTER OF ARTS

in the Division of
Community and Regional Planning
Faculty of Graduate Studies

We accept this thesis as conforming to the
required standard

THE UNIVERSITY OF BRITISH COLUMBIA

April, 1967

In presenting this thesis in partial fulfilment of the requirements for an advanced degree at the University of British Columbia, I agree that the Library shall make it freely available for reference and study. I further agree that permission for extensive copying of this thesis for scholarly purposes may be granted by the Head of my Department or by his representatives. It is understood that copying or publication of this thesis for financial gain shall not be allowed without my written permission.

Leandro A. Vilorio

Department of Community and Regional Planning

The University of British Columbia
Vancouver 8, Canada

Date April, 1967

ABSTRACT

This study deals with the problem of seeking logical strategies for establishing educational programs on community planning in various categories of poor countries. Its thesis is that education for community planning in poor countries, to be effective, must relate to the development process at all levels of government and to the educational system. Two assumptions have been made: (1) Each of the poor countries must evolve its own program of manpower education, in which community planning education is but a part, in the light of its social and economic goals; and (2) Education for community planning in a poor country must interlock with its social and economic planning process.

Two steps have been employed to prove or disprove this thesis. Initially, a set of logical strategies for establishing an educational system in poor countries has been formulated. Three levels of development have been considered and an appropriate set of strategies have been designed for each. Then this construct has been tested through two case studies. The case studies cover Ghana and Indonesia. In Ghana, an attempt is being made to produce local planning assistants. On the other hand, a professional program with a focus on regional planning has been established in Indonesia. Both programs are pioneering efforts. Both programs have been initiated under United Nations technical assistance. Both programs have been aided by a North American university; Ghana

by the University of British Columbia and Indonesia by Harvard University.

Considering the level of development of both countries, this study finds both programs as too ambitious and therefore too premature. Based on this study's set of logical strategies, Ghana and Indonesia should have concentrated on the education of planning assistants. In the meantime, the positions of professional planners should be filled by expatriate personnel. At the same time, selected nationals should be sent abroad for professional education. With a firm foundation of a planning assistants course, its extension towards professional education could proceed in a logical manner as the country's level of development improves.

To poor countries contemplating to establish planning educational systems, this study offers a set of guidelines. These guidelines consist of two parts. The first part provides a framework for approaching the formulation of an educational program on a comprehensive basis. The second part relates how the comprehensive approach may be realized.

These guideline, hopefully, will be refined as others would conduct further studies on the experiences of the rest of the countries which have inaugurated planning educational programs.

PREFACE

Although a number of poor or industrializing countries in Africa, Asia, the Near East and South America have established planning education programs, very little is known about their experiences, much less the progress of their programs. This is rather unfortunate since other countries in those regions would be deeply interested in finding out what lessons may be learned in the creation of such institutions. For these countries are faced equally with the phenomena of rapid population growth, over-crowding in cities, inadequate and poor housing and other related physical planning problems. They would naturally demand in time if not soon enough the services of trained community planners.

It is on this lack of information to which this study is addressed. It is hoped that this modest effort will stimulate planning educators in poor countries to share their precious experience with the rest of the world.

There are two other more immediate reasons why this subject has been chosen for study. Prof. H. Peter Oberlander, Chairman of the Division of Community and Regional Planning at the University of British Columbia, has been one of the few planning educators who has unselfishly shared his experience on this aspect of international technical assistance with the world community. It has been a privilege to be one of his students. The other reason is a personal one. The writer is going to head a newly-established Institute of Planning at the University of the Philippines from which he

is on study leave for a year.

The ideas and conclusions reached in this study have benefited from discussions with other foreign students enrolled in the community and regional planning program at the University of British Columbia. Special mention should be made of Amjad.A.B.Rizvi, a doctoral student from Pakistan, and Tito C. Firmalino, colleague and countryman, who both share the writer's interest on this subject.

Prof. Robert W. Collier first broached the topic for this study. He had been a kind and conscientious adviser. To him, the writer is extremely grateful. Aside from providing example, Prof. Oberlander also furnished information on recent developments in Ghana's planning education system. He has the writer's respect and admiration.

Mr. W. G. Faithfull, United Nations consultant on training in urban and regional planning in the Philippines, supplied insights and data from halfway around the world. He has been a true friend and collaborator.

For making possible his attendance at the University of British Columbia under the Colombo Plan Program, the writer wishes to express his thanks to the External Aid Office, Ottawa and the Colombo Plan Scholarship Screening Committee, Manila. Also, to Dr. Carlos P. Romulo of the University of the Philippines, for allowing the writer to be on special detail to accept the Colombo Plan fellowship.

To his family, who have cheerfully borne the writer's absence from home for a year, goes his eternal gratitude.

As is customary, the errors in this work belong to the writer alone.

L. A. V.

Vancouver, B.C.
May 1967

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
PREFACE.....	iii
Chapter	
I. INTRODUCTION.....	1
Nature of Study	
The Problem	
Assumptions	
Hypothesis	
Methodology	
Definition of Terms	
II. DEVELOPMENT PLANNING AND COMMUNITY PLANNING EDUCATION IN POOR COUNTRIES.....	10
Development Planning	
Community Planning Education	
Strategies	
New Community Planning Schools	
III. EDUCATION FOR PLANNING: GHANA.....	35
Ghana	
General History	
Economy	
Political System	
Social System	
Development Planning	
Kumasi School	
Appraisal	
Summary	
IV. EDUCATION FOR PLANNING: INDONESIA.....	61
Indonesia	
General History	
Economy	
Political System	
Social System	
Development Planning	
Bandung School	
Appraisal	
Summary	
V. SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS.....	79
Summary	
Conclusions	

Lessons for Developing Countries
Limitations of the Study and an
Agenda for Further Studies

BIBLIOGRAPHY..... 96

CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

Nature of Study

The most dramatic phenomenon which occurred after the last world war is the "revolution of rising expectations" which has been released in the hearts of millions of peoples living in more than fifty new nation-states.¹ The response of the governments of the emerging states to this rising expectations is equally dramatic and revolutionary - development planning to hasten the process of modernization. This revolution of rising expectations - the challenge; and development planning - the response, have so inspired the United Nations General Assembly that it declared the sixties the Development Decade.²

So now it is safe to say that the issue is no longer "Plan or no plan" but rather "Who shall plan, for what purposes, in what conditions, and by what devices?".³ Hence, when one of the delegates to the 1963 Conference on the Application of Science and Technology for the Benefit of the Less Developed Areas remarked that "We are in the era today of plans", he

¹Barbara Ward, The Rich Nations and the Poor Nations (New York: W. W. Norton & Co., 1962), p. 23.

²United Nations, General Assembly Resolution 1710 (XVI).

³Robert A. Dahl and Charles E. Lindblom, Politics, Economics, and Welfare, Planning and Politico-Economic Systems Resolved into Basic Social Processes (New York: Harper Torchbooks, 1963), p. 5.

merely expressed explicitly what everyone took for granted.⁴

In its broadest terms, this study will be dealing with one aspect of development planning, but certainly the most crucial - human resources development. For in the final analysis, the ultimate success of any plan for development may be attributed to the vision and capabilities of the people who have conceived it. Indeed human resources development is at once a cause and an effect of economic development. Or as expressed elsewhere: "Education... is both the seed and the flower of economic development."⁵

Specifically, this study will be concerned with just one constituent element of human resources development in poor countries - education for community planning. The significance of this study will be discussed in the next section.

The Problem. Economic planning in poor countries suffers from one common weakness: "they do not as a rule include a plan for land use" on the implicit assumption that "if an appropriate allocation of capital is obtained, management, labor, and land will follow automatically."⁶ This is a vital lack and could

⁴World of Opportunity, Science and Technology for Development, Report on the United Nations Conference on the Application of Science and Technology for the Benefit of the Less Developed Areas (New York: United Nations, 1963), Vol. 1, p. 172.

⁵Frederick Harbison and Charles A. Myers (eds.), Manpower and Education: Country Studies in Economic Development (New York: McGraw-Hill Book Co., 1965), p. xi.

⁶Charles Haar, Benjamin Higgins and Lloyd Rodwin, "Economic and Physical Planning: Coordination in Developing Areas", Journal of the American Institute of Planners, Vol. 24, No. 3 (1958), p. 167.

lead to irreparable consequences. For as a United Nations official reminds us, unless changes in the physical environment are planned for, both social and economic goals may not be realized.⁷ This reminder is especially important in poor countries where economic and technological resources are limited.

One of the main reasons for the weak coordination between economic and physical planning in poor countries may be traced directly to the almost total absence of trained community planners in such countries. For instance, in 1954, India with over 300 million people at that time barely had ten fully qualified planners.⁸ The situation in other poor countries even today is certainly not any better than India's problem in 1954.

It seems, however, that unless the poor countries start to help themselves, i.e., by establishing their own planning education programs, no early solution to the problem of lack of planners is in sight. In the first place, the problem is not confined to poor countries alone. Even in Great Britain and the United States, two countries with the most extensive training facilities for planners and where the planning pro-

⁷Ernest Weissmann, "The Problems of Urbanism in the Less Developed Countries", Paper read before the Conference on Urban Planning and Development, Ford Foundation, New York, October 10-11, 1956.

⁸"Summary of the Discussions on the 'Education of Planners'," United Nations Seminar on Housing and Community Improvement in Asia and the Far East, Training for Town and Country Planning, Housing, Building and Planning No. 11, ST/SOA/SER. C/11 (New York: United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs, 1957), Appendix A, p. 99.

profession has long been established, the lack of planners is being decried. In Great Britain there is an urgent need to double her planning force of 3,000 but this could be realized only in twenty years time.⁹ In the United States, on the other hand, there is an uneasy feeling that even the projected doubling of the present rate of 500 planning graduates per year may not be enough to cope with the growing demand for trained planners.¹⁰ Secondly, the efficacy of planning education obtained abroad is now being widely questioned.¹¹

Partly because of the two foregoing reasons, partly due to United Nations' instigation, and partly due to a prevailing sentiment that their problems arise from situations quite unique by themselves, poor countries have expressed strong desires to establish planning educational systems either in their region or in each country.¹² Regardless of which scheme is adopted, it is noteworthy to point out that the leaders of

⁹J. S. Allen, "Educating the Planners," Journal of the Town Planning Institute, Vol. 49, No. 10 (December 1963), p. 336.

¹⁰Richard May, Jr., "Meeting the Rapidly Expanding Need for Technical Planning Services," Bulletin of the Association of Collegiate Schools of Planning, Vol. 4, No. 4 (Winter 1966), p. 1.

¹¹See Abridged Transcript of Conference on Urban Planning & Development held at the Ford Foundation, October 10-11, 1956, especially Coleman Woodbury, "Urban Development and Planning in the United States". (Mimeographed.); also Lloyd Rodwin, "The Achilles Heel of British Town Planning" in his The British New Towns Policy: Problems and Implications (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1956), pp. 187-201; and Ruth Glass, "The Evaluation of Planning - Some Sociological Considerations," Regional Planning, Housing, Building and Planning Nos. 12 & 13, ST/SOA/SER. C/12 & 13 (New York: United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs, 1959), pp. 51-57.

¹²Training for Town and Country Planning, op. cit; pp. 16, 99.

the poor countries readily find a close relationship between planning schools and development planning.

Assumptions. This study, therefore, proceeds from two inter-related assumptions, namely:

- 1) Each of the poor countries must evolve its own program of manpower education, in which community planning education is but a part, in the light of its social and economic goals.
- 2) Education for community planning in a poor country must inter-lock with its social and economic planning process.

Before explaining the assumptions, a digression is necessary at this point. Earlier, the term "poor countries" has been used interchangeably with "new nation-states", "emerging states" and "less developed areas." Later "developing countries" and "less industrialized countries" will also be used synonymously with "poor countries." A more precise definition of the term "poor countries" is now in order. By "poor countries" we refer to politically-independent nations where per capita income is below \$500 and where industrialization and technology are just beginning to be introduced into a basically agricultural economy. Barbara Ward characterizes the countries we have in mind thus:

The biological revolution of more rapid growth in population is on the way in these areas. But the other vast changes - an intellectual revolution of materialism and this-worldliness, the political revolution of equality, and above all the scientific and technological revolution which comes from the application of savings and the sciences to the whole business of daily life - are only beginning the process of transforming every idea and institution in the emergent lands. The revolution of modernization has not yet driven these states into the contemporary world.¹³

¹³Ward, Op. cit., pp. 40+41.

Implicit in the first assumption is a commitment to development planning. A country without a national economic plan is now a rarity among the developing nations.¹⁴ It is also being recognized that manpower planning or human resources development is an essential part of a sound economic plan. The importance of manpower planning, its components and how it is conducted are given in summary form by two distinguished scholars in this field:

Human resources development encompasses many constituent and inter-related elements. It includes formal education at all levels. In addition, it covers on-the-job training, individual self-development, and informal as well as formal adult education. The building of an appropriate structure of financial and non-financial incentives is a critical factor. Manpower assessments, education and training surveys, and wage and salary studies are among the more important tools for analysis of these elements. A strategy of human resources development, therefore, requires the integration of a broad range of programs based upon the findings of a wide variety of studies.¹⁵

For purposes of this study, the following point, also by the same scholars, deserves emphasis:

The key to building an effective strategy of human resource development is the achievement of balance in the constituent programs. The nature of this balance, of course, depends upon the goals of a particular country, its level of economic growth, and the stage of modernization it has attained.¹⁶

¹⁴See Barbu Niculescu, Colonial Planning: A Comparative Study (London: George Allen & Unwin, Ltd., 1958); United Nations Bureau of Social Affairs, "Urbanization and Policies for Town and Country Planning" in Philip M. Hauser (ed.), Urbanization in Asia and the Far East (Calcutta: Unesco Research Centre on Social Implications of Industrialization in Southern Asia, 1957), pp. 262 ff.

¹⁵Harbison and Myers, op. cit., p. x.

¹⁶Ibid., p. xi.

One further point which deserves to be stressed in manpower planning is the need to make a careful distinction between educational goals which are designed to maintain society in its condition and those which contribute to rapid economic and social improvements.¹⁷

It seems clear from the foregoing discussion that while it is true that education for community planning is necessary and urgent and that this type of education will contribute to rapid economic and social improvements, nevertheless, one should never lose sight of the fact that it is just a part of a larger strategy for human resources development. In poor countries with scarce facilities and other resources, it is crucial therefore to relate planning education to the total manpower planning necessary to support development plans.

As regards the second assumption, we just want to emphasize that many other disciplines are involved in the social and economic planning process. Furthermore, this process obtains at all levels of government.

Hypothesis. The hypothesis of this study is: Education for community planning in poor countries, to be effective, must relate to the development process at all levels of government and to the educational system.

Methodology

In order to verify the hypothesis the following procedure

¹⁷Richard L. Meier, Developmental Planning (New York: McGraw-Hill Book Co., 1965), pp. 269-271; Cf. W. Arthus Lewis, "Education and Economic Development," International Social Science Journal, Vol. xiv, No. 4 (1962), pp. 685-699.

will be adopted: In the subsequent chapter, the proper place of community planning will be reviewed in the context of developmental planning in poor countries. Particular attention will be devoted to the common problems confronting development planning so as to clearly delineate the role of community planners. In this chapter also, the various strategies for education in community planning will be discussed. Chapters III and IV will be case studies. The establishment of planning schools in Ghana and Indonesia will be presented and analyzed in terms of the framework of Chapter II. The final chapter will contain an evaluation of the experience of the two countries and will also isolate lessons which other countries contemplating to establish similar schools may find profitable to adopt or modify.

This study will rely mainly on written reports emanating either from the schools themselves or those persons who have had a hand in the establishment of such schools. Time and resources do not permit us to extend the coverage of the case studies nor to counter-check the written materials with questionnaires or interviews of other participants in this new venture like graduates and faculty members of the new schools, employers and government officials. These limitations considered, it is nevertheless felt that this selected evaluation of two country experiences would yield meaningful insights that hopefully would inspire future studies of a similar nature.

Definition of Terms

Unless otherwise indicated the following terms when used in this study shall mean:

"Community planning" - the process of organizing the relationships of the different functions of a specific development program in terms of land use; specifically areas and locations are assigned for agricultural, industrial or residential use and their relationship to one another is established by means of transport, power, communications and utility networks. Community planning is otherwise known as "physical planning" or "environmental planning."

"Education" - in its broadest sense, this refers to all transfers of cultural experience; in a restricted sense, to the formal aspect of the process carried on through organized instruction whether in schools or on-the-job.

"Educational system" - refers to the total institutional framework for the preservation, transmission and enlargement of knowledge.

"Development process" - a programmed drive to higher levels of living or a calculated effort toward removing impediments to economic, social and cultural growth.

"Levels of government" - refers to the major political sub-divisions of a state as the national or central government and the local governments if in a unitary state and also the second tier or state or provincial government if in a federal system of government.

CHAPTER II

DEVELOPMENT PLANNING AND COMMUNITY PLANNING EDUCATION IN POOR COUNTRIES

The four-fold purpose of this chapter is: 1) to outline the fundamental elements in development planning; 2) to identify the place therein of community planning education; 3) to review the strategies for instituting community planning education; and 4) to find out what poor countries have established new programs in education for community planning.

Development Planning

The plight of poor countries has been extensively considered and analyzed in many occasions. Illustrative is the appraisal of the United Nations Secretary General in 1965.

The nations which seek to develop their economies today face all the old dilemmas of rapid transition - how to modernize static farming, how to squeeze savings from a poor pre-industrial population, how to choose those industries which actually produce a surplus, how to finance the new skills needed to produce more capital before the capital exists to divert to schools. But they face even tougher problems as well - the population explosion, urbanization beyond control, unfavourable trade patterns and inappropriate technology.¹

The less developed countries have pinned their hopes in their drive for modernization in development planning or country programming. Here almost complete reliance on the national or central government and foreign aid or technical assistance from the more developed countries are the rule. This pattern may be ascribed to two sources. One, from the former

¹The United Nations Development Decade at Mid-Point: An Appraisal by the Secretary General (New York: United Nations Office of Public Information, 1965), p. 27.

metropolitan powers that tried to rationalize the distribution of capital support to their various colonies.² Or secondly, from the requirements of the donors of foreign aid or sources of technical assistance, notably the United Nations and the Specialized Agencies.³ Economists predominated during the early days of development planning.⁴ The more comprehensive view has been supplied by other professions like students of human resources development⁵, sociologists and political scientists who are interested in the process of modernization,⁶ or anthropologists who seek to understand social change or innovation.⁷ To these earlier views, the physical planners are hoping to add their own.⁸

Development therefore has variegated meanings: industrialization, economic growth, process of modernization, movement

²Barbu Niculescu, Colonial Planning: A Comparative Study (London: George Allen & Unwin, Ltd., 1958).

³Charles Abrams, Man's Struggle for Shelter in an Urbanizing World (Cambridge, Mass.: The M.I.T. Press, 1964).

⁴Donald C. Stone, "Public Administration in Nation-building" in Roscoe C. Martin (ed.), Public Administration and Democracy, Essays in honor of Paul H. Appleby (Syracuse, N.Y.: Syracuse University Press, 1965), pp. 245-265.

⁵Frederick Harbison, "Education for Development" in Technology and Economic Development, A Scientific American Book (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1963), pp. 95-104.

⁶S. N. Eisenstadt, Modernization: Protest and Change (Englewood Cliffs, N. J.: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1966).

⁷Edward H. Spicer (ed.), Human Problems in Technological Change, Science Editions (New York: John Wiley & Sons, 1965); Margaret Mead (ed.) Cultural Patterns and Technical Change, A Manual Prepared by the World Federation for Mental Health, (New York: The New America Library, 1963).

⁸Gerald Breese, Urbanization in Newly Developing Countries (Englewood Cliffs, N. J.: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1966).

from rural to urban areas, opportunity for education, and achievement of independence, politically and economically, to name only the most familiar. The focus no doubt is upon change. It is based upon the optimistic conviction that man, in this century of science, can move forward by leaps instead of steps.⁹

It would seem that the hope for change occurs and gains more or less permanent effect through institutions in inter-related fronts. In the case of Puerto Rico, for instance, Kenneth Boulding identifies four key elements which have lead to what he labels as the Fomentarian Revolution: 1) political consensus in the society - a widely shared vision of the future and an image of the way in which the society can move towards its future; 2) stress on education and the development of human resources - higher education of the right kind is especially important; 3) the skill to strike clever bargains with foreign capitalists; and 4) the ability to effect a sufficient cultural change at the level of the individual, the family, the neighborhood, and the small group so that the gains of development can be reasonably permanent and acceptable to the society.¹⁰

⁹Barbara Ward, The Rich Nations and the Poor Nations (New York: W. W. Norton & Co., 1962).

¹⁰Kenneth Boulding, "The United States and Revolution," Center for the Study of Democratic Institutions, Occasional Paper, Fund of the Republic, Santa Barbara, California, 1961, partly reproduced in Richard L. Meier's "Preface" in Developmental Planning (New York: McGraw-Hill, Inc., 1965), pp. vii - ix.

Boulding holds that while bootstrap development, i.e., without importing capital, is possible as demonstrated by Japan and Communist China, this may be realized only when a fairly authoritarian social structure obtains.¹¹ The popular clamor for a present share of future benefits, Boulding believes, makes it extremely hard to realize bootstrap development in looser and more democratic societies.¹¹

Based on extant literature, Harbison and Myers have identified a five-step process for a comprehensive development policy. These five sequential steps are:¹²

- 1) creating an attitude of development-mindedness on the part of government and various segments of the public;
- 2) selecting specific goals or objectives;
- 3) constructing a logical and consistent framework for consideration of alternative measures for achieving the goals;
- 4) making strategic investments in the public sector and inducing appropriate investments in the private sector in order to achieve specific objectives; and
- 5) implementing the course of action which has been evolved and enlisting the enthusiastic participation of the people in pressing it forward.

¹¹Loc. cit.

¹²Frederick Harbison and Charles A. Myers, Education, Manpower and Economic Growth, Strategies of Human Resources Development (New York: McGraw-Hill, Inc., 1964), p. 209.

The process of development, as stressed by Richard L. Meier, "cannot be dissociated from the methods of modern public administration and constructive politics; indeed it requires these forms of reorganization and reform in order to be effective."¹³ After the initial flurry of five-year plans and as many countries find a growing gap between the plans and the degree of implementation, many writers find agreement with Meier's emphasis on the political and administrative processes. We will cite only two other writers who express this common concern. The first one argues:¹⁴

In those democratic underdeveloped countries that have been making substantial economic progress, the major difficulties lie not in the interference of political interests with economic calculation nor in the quality of the economic analysis itself but rather in the fact that the administrative machinery has lagged behind development plans. A due regard for this limitation would hold down the size of the public investment program to dimensions capable of effective management; it would counsel against the imposition of controls whose execution is outside the competence of existing public services; it would emphasize the importance of necessary changes in government procedure.

On the other hand, a former expatriate administrator gives his impressions:¹⁵

¹³Meier, op. cit., p. x. United Nations Bureau of Social Affairs, "Urbanization and Policies for Town and Country Planning" in Philip M. Hauser (ed.), Urbanization in Asia and the Far East (Calcutta: Unesco Research Centre on Social Implications of Industrialization in Southern Asia), pp. 262 ff.

¹⁴Edward S. Mason, "The Planning of Development", Technology and Economic Development, A Scientific American Book (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1963), p. 194.

¹⁵Alfred E. S. Alcock, "The Application of Regional Planning Techniques to Rural Development Programmes", Regional Planning, Housing, Building and Planning Nos. 12 & 13, ST/SOA/SER. C/ 12 & 13 (New York: United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs, 1959), p. 75.

Regional planning techniques which are designed for comprehensive planning, cannot be applied properly when planning is an activity dispersed among a number of self-sufficient departments or organizations, which, while not usually refusing to co-operate with one another are fully concerned with their own day-to-day business and therefore have a little time for interest in each other's affairs. Bureaucracy in many countries has remained supine and indifferent to regional planning, which has been given the barest lip service in the the internecine bureaucratic struggle for power.

It is therefore in enlightened administration that the hope for regional planning exists.

Community Planning Education

To identify the administrative machinery as the weakest link in the development process, however, is not enough. It is necessary for students of community or physical planning especially to go a little further in our analysis of the problem. A fruitful lead is provided by Ernest Weissmann. He advocates: "It is no longer enough to keep physical planning in step with economic and social development. Comprehensive planning - economic, social and physical - on a regional scale must now precede development to ensure its unhampered progress."¹⁶ Weissmann's proposal is anchored on the proposition (to which participants to three special seminars under the United Nations held in New Delhi, Puerto Rico and Tokyo seem to have arrived, at) that the most appropriate approach in developing countries

¹⁶Ernest Weissmann, "Significance of Planning in Economic and Social Development," Training for Town and Country Planning, ST/SOA/SER. C/11 (New York: United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs, 1957), p. 6. Cf. W. Arthus Lewis, "Education and Economic Development", International Social Science Journal, Vol. xiv, No. 4 (1962), pp. 685-699.

for realizing comprehensive planning is through the regional approach.¹⁷

As the Tokyo seminar suggested the main areas susceptible to regional planning are three: metropolitan regions which are experiencing problems of urbanization and industrialization, regions of resource development, such as hydroelectric watersheds, and rural regions in which village improvement programmes are being carried out.¹⁸ While not explicit in the various deliberations in the three seminars, the three reasons for the regional planning approach seem to be: 1) the dominant role of the national or central governments in development planning, 2) the desire to involve local governments in the process, and 3) the lack of trained planners.

Another implicit assumption in the discussions on the role of the planner is that he is or does belong to a staff agency. Students of administration are more prone to make this distinction clear. Thus Mason says: "Planning agencies are of course advisory to political decision-makers, and it goes without saying that planning will inevitably reflect the political characteristics of the government being advised."¹⁹ To another student of administration the greatest need is unmistakable: "It is at the secretariat level, above all, that rigorous

¹⁷See International Action in Asia and the Far East, Housing Building & Planning No. 9, ST/SOA/SER. C/9 (New York: United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs, 1955); Regional Planning, op. cit., Part I; Training for Town and Country Planning, op. cit., Appendices A and B.

¹⁸Regional Planning, op. cit., pp. 3-6

¹⁹Mason, op. cit., p. 193.

standards of professional and academic competence must be fostered and maintained."²⁰

But the problems posed appear insuperable, Lloyd Rodwin's observations are not comforting. He writes:²¹

The first is the question of personnel, which is certainly one of the critical limiting factors. Specialists in these regional development problems are rare; and some of the positions involve responsibilities for which few persons have received the appropriate professional training. The second is the level of intellectual capital. Do we know enough at this time about cities and regions and the relationships of economic, social and physical development to be able to discharge such responsibilities effectively? Are we likely, say through applied research and experience, to obtain the necessary knowledge and understanding early enough to cope with the problems without doing more harm than good? Thirdly, will not the system perpetuate the centralization dilemma for developing areas?.... Can the proposed planning system operate effectively if the central Government begin to divest themselves of some of their basic development responsibilities?

Another American educator in community planning while confirming Rodwin's fears nevertheless finds solace with the possibility that: "In countries where the economy is expanding, and where large areas still remain to be developed, greater opportunities exist for experimentation, and all countries would benefit if those in a transitional stage would pioneer in the evolution of a broad new approach to the

²⁰ Stephen K. Bailey, "The Place and Functioning of a Planning Agency within the Government Organization of Developing Countries!" United Nations Conference on the Application of Science and Technology, Paper E/CONF. 39/H/82, November, 1962, p. 4; Stone, loc. cit.

²¹ Lloyd Rodwin, "Current Developments in Regional Planning", Regional Planning, op. cit., pp. 49-50.

planning of geographical areas."²² Abrams, in fact, has pointed to the need of a comparative science of urbanization.²³ He ventured to offer the necessary steps for making his proposal a reality too.²³ C. A. Doxiades on the other hand is preaching his new science of human settlements - ekistics - which is purported to have universal application.²⁴

Three of the major findings and conclusions of the participants in the Puerto Rico seminar on training for town and country planning still appear to embody the predominant views of experts on planning education in poor countries. These are:

Planning education must relate physical planning at all levels directly to social and economic goals in order that the whole process of planning in general may affect the pattern of social and economic development. It must be emphasized, however, that neither physical planning nor economic or social planning alone can offer workable solutions to developmental problems, because these problems are intimately related and must be resolved in a balanced way.

Efforts to advance general understanding of the role of planning and to create and develop effective planning schools will be most successful where planning has the confidence and support of the citizenry and is an integral part of the government process. Under such conditions planning could be an important instrument in the

²²Frederick J. Adams, "The Status of Planning and Planning Education," Training for Town and Country Planning, op. cit., p. 43.

²³Abrams, op. cit., pp. 211-212.

²⁴C. A. Doxiades, "Ekistics: The Science of Human Settlements," A paper presented before Town and Country Planning Summer School, Southampton, September, 1959.

administration of good government, for planning depends on political action in its highest sense. Conversely, the exercise of good public administration could be a co-ordinating element in mobilizing the different services required for good planning.

Training for planners should be given at different levels; it should include training at undergraduate level for younger students, post-graduate training for those interested in the co-ordinative aspects of planning and special courses for persons in responsible government positions concerned with planning. Consequently, in addition to the establishment of schools of planning at the post-graduate level, equal consideration should be given to schools at the undergraduate level. Both academic programmes should combine efforts with an established, recognized and well-developed educational institution on whose resources the new school can draw.²⁵

Strategies

The assessment of human resources development "in pieces" is perhaps the greatest single deficiency of the manpower and educational surveys which have been conducted in the past. This may be ascribed to the lack of experience in this field. For indeed this is more or less frontier territory. The West did not go through this experience and poor countries therefore must evolve their own paths to follow.

While every country must in many ways develop strategies to suit each particular need, the typology developed by Harbison and Myers seems appropriate to follow. Briefly, they suggest that policy-makers in various countries must first determine in what level of development their particular country is in. Thus countries in Level I where political

²⁵ Training for Town and Country Planning, op. cit., pp. 14-15

sovereignty is the dominant imperative are urged to concentrate on a schedule of "localization". The logical strategy in this instance is to undertake a crash program to expand the output of secondary education. The supporting parts of the entire program are: increasing quality of primary education; placing major reliance on employing institutions for skill development; and rationing opportunities for higher education by government for university training abroad. Countries in Level II where the economic imperative is to build the base for industrialization while expanding agricultural production the top priority in human resource policy is the reform and expansion of secondary education. It is urged that greater emphasis be placed on better teaching of fundamentals of mathematics and science. Next comes the need for expansion of education of subprofessional personnel and technicians. At the same time in higher education, emphasis should be placed on high quality education in science and engineering and curtailing the expansion of low-quality offerings in the law, arts, and humanities. Then a comprehensive program for upgrading and training manpower in government and private enterprises is essential.

Finally, to ensure the success of the entire program of human resource development, an incentive pay scheme must be provided for scientists, engineers, teachers, technicians and other critically needed subprofessional personnel. In countries falling under the category of Level III where the

major economic objective is rapid and massive industrial development, the logical strategy is the reorientation and reform of higher education. What is called for is to give more emphasis to the scientific and technical faculties and improving the quality of instruction in the other fields. Research institutes have to be established to adopt modern science and technology to the needs of the country's modern industries. At the same time, there is need to gear vocational training and adult education with the specific needs of public and private enterprises.

Having then determined the level of development in which a particular country is in, the second logical step should be, Harbison and Myers suggest, the establishment of human resource targets. This process consists of two steps. The first step is the analysis of the present situation. The second step is estimating future requirements.

In the analysis of the present situation, four phases must be looked into: 1) an inventory of employment and short-term requirements for manpower; 2) a general appraisal of the educational system; 3) a survey of existing programs for on-the-job training; and 4) a brief analysis of the structure of incentives and the utilization of high-level manpower.

With respect to estimating future requirements, Harbison and Myers recommend the target-setting approach. Here they suggest the adoption of four principles, namely: 1) that in the analysis of manpower requirements care must be exercised

in seeing to it that goals be specified first through checking the legitimacy of the selection with opinion leaders, politicians and others; 2) that major reliance be placed on making reasonable comparisons both within an economy and with other countries; 3) that in estimating future requirements the human resource planner should concentrate on setting targets rather than on making forecasts - a target indicates a direction for action and its main purpose is to influence the future course of development; and 4) that requirements for human resource development be comprehensive - the closely associated targets for on-the-job training, for changing the structure of incentives, for better utilization of skills, for creating adequate employment opportunity, and for importing expatriate manpower, should be established along with educational targets.²⁶

The Harbison-Mayers models are, it is suggested, only points of departure. They have to be supplemented by another approach such as a specific project instituting an educational scheme for community planning. For the difficulty with the Harbison-Myers models is the indeterminacy of future institutions arising out of the complex process of modernization. In turn, the variety of bundles of skills which such new institutions would require is certainly hard to predict. The other approach suggested by John M. Gaus is the familiar tool of job analysis.²⁷

²⁶Harbison and Myers, op. cit., Chapter 9, pp. 189-208.

²⁷John M. Gaus, "Education for the Emerging Field of Regional Planning and Development," Social Forces, Vol. 29, Nos. 3 (March 1951), pp. 229-237.

The Gaus' approach proceeds from "the recognition of the job and its importance, and a study of its requirements in organization, procedure and personnel."²⁸ In applying this model to the task of providing education for regional planning, Gaus first states what he thinks planning is. Second, he looks for peculiar factors which are contributed when the word "regional" is added to it. Finally he job analyzes this combinations of words to see whether there is a concrete task of education regarding the things thus defined that is a responsibility of universities. His analysis highlights the following: 1) that planning is the effort to improve the making of decisions; 2) that in government there are certain strategic points of decision and that in the highest levels, skill in evaluating and integrating varied types of information from many sources is most important; 3) that regional planning means planning as an aid in the making of decisions as applied to an area; and 4) that planning as a staff function must relate to the planning process at every level of government and jurisdictional areas. Gaus concludes that in regional planning all specialists concerned with civic tasks will have to be drawn upon and that it is team and group work for which there is no one single and clear line of career approach, especially for the top positions.

Before leaving this section, it must be borne in mind that in poor countries there are limits in investments in

²⁸Ibid., p. 228.

education. As aptly pointed out by W. Arthus Lewis: "To attribute all improvements in productivity to education would therefore be more than a little naive."²⁹ There are two reasons for this. First, investment in humans is not to be equated with education, as normally conceived in institutional terms. For human capacity is improved not only by education but also by public health, research, invention, institutional change, and better organization of human affairs. Second, poor countries have a very much lower capacity to absorb the products of schools than rich countries. Here the problem is not wholly one of balance as posited by Harbison and Myers. The main limitation on the absorption of the education in poor countries, Lewis argues, is their high cost relative to average national output per head. Lewis therefore would place more emphasis on adult education as one of the quickest way to increase productivity in less developed countries. This could be in the form of training-within-industry, evening classes, or sandwich courses in urban centers, or in the form of agricultural extension, health programs, or community development in rural areas. In the government hierarchy, this program would not be a responsibility of the ministry of education but rather of the ministries of trade, agriculture, health, community development and others.

Lewis also suggests that in poor countries professional

²⁹W. Arthus Lewis, "Education and Economic Development," International Social Science Journal, Vol XIV, No. 4, (1962), p. 687.

education should mass produce not the second layer but the third.³⁰ Using the agricultural profession as an example this means that attention should be concentrated to the production of well-trained agricultural assistants. If this policy is adopted, Lewis claims that the second layer will also be up-graded in the process. This would follow because the second layer professional would have many more third-layer people working under him; he could assign to them more of the routine work and concentrate to a greater extent on the more difficult tasks. Since his administrative responsibilities would become greater he would then need an even more sounder training, than his professional colleague in the West. Lewis goes on to say that with language difficulties and the need to work in isolation from specialist advice and laboratory analysis, the professional in poor countries would require at least one more year of training than they do in rich countries. In offering this suggestion, Lewis recognizes the high cost of education in poor countries but at the same time he believes quite strongly that in the long run this is better strategy than lowering the standards of education.

We may now offer specific strategies for community planning education program in poor countries. These strategies

³⁰ Lewis conceives that in every profession there are at least three layers: top-flight researchers, professionals, and sub-professionals. For instance, in medicine there would be specialists, general practitioners and nurses, dispensing chemists and medical technologists.

For a similar view see M. Yudelman, "Problems of Raising African Agricultural Productivity" in William B. Hamilton (ed.), The Transfer of Institutions (Durham, N.C.: Duke University Commonwealth Studies Center, 1964), pp. 260-302.

are based on the following assumptions:

1) that in general the levels of development of poor countries fall into the three levels postulated by Harbison-Myers;

2) that the poor countries are committed to national development planning and there exists a national planning agency which is responsible for the preparation of national plans;

3) that there is lack of an effective administrative machinery for plan coordination and implementation which results in:

- a) inadequate manpower resources planning; and
- b) lack of coordination between physical, social, and economic planning;

4) that because the existing administrative system has highly centralist patterns being colonial in origin the local governments and civic participation are generally weak;

5) that there exists nevertheless many agencies and programs directly concerned with community planning like community development programs, development corporations, agricultural extension programs, etc. with little coordination; and

6) that the community planning function is being performed both in line or operating agencies and in staff or research and advisory agencies and that such function is exercised in varying degrees within the various levels of government.

For Level I countries, the logical strategy for community planning education would seem to lie on three approaches. First, expatriate personnel must be relied on to man positions in central planning agencies. They will have basically three functions: operating, consulting, and educational. Perhaps half of their time shall have to be devoted to the usual functions of physical planners in national planning agencies. The other half would be in advising key officials of agencies which have functional programs like land reform, community development, public health, highways, small-scale industries, agricultural extension, etc. on the implications of such programs in physical planning. Also, the expatriate personnel should assist in setting up in-service training schemes among the functional ministries mentioned earlier to be assured that physical planning is not neglected in the exercise of such functions. Quite related to this would be serving as resource persons in seminars or conferences and writing popular articles to inform the general public on the significance of physical planning to community life. Second, an extensive in-service training program and other related adult educational schemes should be inaugurated and pursued with vigor in the functional ministries mentioned above as well as in the central planning agency and in the lower levels of government. Third, training abroad for selected types of government personnel or prospective government personnel must be resorted to for sometime. The first group of government personnel should be those who are in strategic positions and

who have acquired already some experience and possess maturity of judgment. They should be sent for well-structured short-term observation trips both in advanced countries and semi-advanced countries. The other group of prospective government personnel shall be promising students who may be sent to acquire professional training in planning in foreign schools of planning.

For Level II countries, the logical strategy is to start an educational program for planning assistants in the existing university of the country. To ensure that the training program shall fulfill the needs of the country, the training staff must be a combination of university professors and key personnel in strategic government agencies. This would have the dual advantage of ensuring that the graduates would find easy access for employment later on in the strategic agencies and at the same time being able to tap the few trained practitioners. The university, in cooperation perhaps with the central planning agency and a few functional ministries, should undertake a modest research program on community planning. A foreign consultant or two may be availed of in connection with the academic and research programs. To complement the formal education program, the in-service training program should be intensified and expanded to include local officials and personnel. Also observation trips for ranking personnel in foreign countries should be encouraged preferably under the United Nations schemes and other technical assistance arrangements. Bonded government personnel primarily

performing physical or community planning should be selected for graduate training abroad.

For Level III countries, a professional training program may be inaugurated in the existing universities of the country. Not only will the school of planning be responsible for research, a full-blown undergraduate program, but also for offering introductory courses in planning in other faculties or departments in the university. The specialist training or post-graduate program in physical planning abroad may now be confined to faculty members of the school of planning. Short-term foreign consultants may be utilized also sparingly either to do special assignments or tasks in the central planning agency and/or in the university. It is expected at this stage that the in-service training programs have become built-in and self-generating programs both in government and private industries and that the universities role shall be one of providing research products and consultative services. It is also expected at this stage that professional associations will have begun to assert their influence and that a healthy competition between and amongst themselves will be encouraged. More attention will also be devoted to the adult education programs in the local government levels and in the introduction of community planning concepts at the secondary levels in the educational system.

It will be noted in the proposed schemes for community planning education that great emphasis is placed, except in

the Level I countries, on the role of the local university and the central planning agency, as well as in adult education. Further, stress is also laid on the training of community planners who would be expected to work mostly in line or operating agencies rather than staff agencies. Furthermore, greater consideration is given to training local government personnel. Finally, it is obvious that poor countries must for sometime continue to rely on foreign experts and consultants.

Such emphases stem from a recognition of the peculiar or unique situations and needs of poor countries. For unlike the evolutionary development of community planning in Western countries which were carried out by social reformers outside of government and largely from local government levels, the poor countries are undergoing revolutionary development with central governments focusing their attention to economic development. Despite, their difficulties the poor countries are in a unique situation of contributing to the development of a genuine comprehensive planning approach. Poor countries are shackled to many old traditions certainly but not to traditional planning predominated by architects, engineers and surveyors as it has developed in the West.

Whether the strategies postulated above have been recognized and followed in the establishment of new planning schools in poor countries will be dealt with in the subsequent

chapter. An indication of the progress of establishing planning schools in poor countries, in the meantime will be given below.

New Community Planning Schools

In Asia, three countries opened up planning schools beginning in 1959: India, Indonesia and Pakistan. By 1965 there were four institutions offering post-graduate courses in India. The Department of Architecture and Regional Planning at the Indian Institute of Technology, Kharagpur, West Bengal offers a master's degree in regional planning for geographers and social scientists and a master of technology in town and country planning for architects and engineers. Both programs may be finished in one year. The Department of Architecture and Regional Planning in the Bengal Engineering College, Howrah, West Bengal conducts a part-time course of two years duration leading to a master's degree in town and country planning. The Department of Town and Country Planning of the School of Planning and Architecture, New Delhi offers two courses: a two-year full-time post-graduate course in town and country planning, and a three-year part-time program for in-service personnel leading to the degree: diploma in town and country planning. The University of Madras offers a two-year program leading to a master's degree in town and country planning. The Institute of Town Planners, India holds an examination in town planning which leads to associate membership of the

profession. Prof. L. R. Vagale of the School of Planning and Architecture at New Delhi reports that there is a move to offer full-fledged courses in a number of universities, especially those which conduct undergraduate courses in architecture, in a regional basis.³¹ He mentions the following as the potential institutions where such planning courses may be established: Department of Architecture, Roorkee University, the Schools of Architecture at Chandigarh and Ahmedabad, the Regional Engineering College at Bhopal, the Indian Institute of Technology at Bombay, the University of Poona, and the Bangalore University.³²

In Indonesia a Division of Regional and City Planning was established at the Bandung Institute of Technology in 1959.³³

In Pakistan, a Faculty of Architecture and Town Planning exists in the East Pakistan University of Engineering and Technology, Dacca and also at the West Pakistan University of Engineering and Technology, Lahore. In the latter university, the two-year post-graduate program leading to a master's degree had been replaced in 1963 by a four-year undergraduate program leading to a bachelor's degree. The

³¹"Thoughts on Urban and Regional Planning Education in India", A paper read before International Seminar on the Architect and the Community, India International Centre, New Delhi, February 14-20, 1965.

³²Loc. cit.

³³"Bagian Tata Pembangunan Daerah & Kota," Institut Teknologi Bandung, brochure, undated.

programs like those of India, follow the British pattern.³⁴

In Africa, a School of Architecture, Town Planning, and Building was founded in 1957 at the Kumasi College of Technology, Ashanti, Ghana.³⁵ Later an Institute for Community Planning was opened in 1961 at the same place designed to train local planning assistants.³⁶ A similar course was being planned in 1965 at the Department of Civil and Building Engineering of the Technical College at Ibadan, Nigeria.³⁷

In the Middle East Technical University, Ankara, Turkey established in 1956, the architecture department embraces city and regional planning as well as architecture. The city planning course did not get underway until 1961 however.³⁸

In Latin-America, a technical mission in 1960 found out that there were five countries - Brazil, Chile, Columbia, Puerto Rico and Venezuela - contemplating seven new planning programs. At that time four out of 52 educational institutions surveyed devoted themselves exclusively to planning, namely: the Institute of Urban and Regional Planning in Peru,

³⁴Interview with Amjad A.B. Rizvi, February 26, 1967.

³⁵Arena, Vol. 82, No. 904 (July/August 1966).

³⁶H. Peter Oberlander, "Planning Education for Newly Independent Countries," Journal of the American Institute of Planners, Vol. xxviii, No. 2 (May 1962), pp. 116-123.

³⁷Technical College, Ibadan, Nigeria, "Syllabus for Diploma Course for Town Planning Assistants," Town Planning Course, Department of Civil and Building Engineering, January 1965. (Mimeographed.)

³⁸Abrams, op. cit., pp. 206-207

the Economic Planning Centre of the University of Chile, the Institute of Advanced Urban Planning of the University of Buenos Aires and the Inter-American Housing and Planning Centre (CINVA) at Bogota, Columbia.³⁹

The schools of planning are generally located in the faculty of architecture or engineering. These schools are also preponderantly offering graduate studies and their students generally come from architecture or engineering faculties, although students with social science background are also admitted in some schools. Only the Bandung school offers exclusively a full-fledged undergraduate program in planning over a five year span. While only the Institute for Community Planning at Ghana trains local planning assistants. These two educational institutions for planning will be the subject of the next two chapters.

³⁹S.I.A.P., Education for Planning in Latin America: Summary Report (Puerto Rico, February, 1961).

CHAPTER III

EDUCATION FOR PLANNING: GHANA

Having postulated the logical strategy for community planning education for three types of countries in varying levels of development, this study shall consider two "case studies" to test the utility of our constructs. The two institutions which have been selected are the Institute for Community Planning located in the University of Science and Technology, Kumasi, Ghana and the Division of Regional and City Planning of the Bandung Institute of Technology, Indonesia. Hereafter, we shall refer to them as the Kumasi School and the Bandung School, respectively, for convenience.

To place each school in proper context, a brief description of the country where it is located will be presented first. This should help us in forming an opinion whether the particular country under study falls under Level I or Level II or Level III, i.e., generally speaking, at what level of development does Ghana or Indonesia fall at the time the planning school in each country was established?¹ Since we are interested primarily in arriving at a general impression, necessarily the description shall be presented in broad strokes. Each country will be described in terms of general history, economic, political and social conditions.

Secondly, we shall look into the experience of the country in development planning. We shall be particularly interested

¹Supra., pp. 27-29.

in finding out whether the country's development plan includes a program for human resources development.

Ghana and the Kumasi School will be discussed first.

GHANA

General History. One contemporary writer suggests that in a very real sense the beginning of Ghanaian history may be traced to at the earliest the end of the 15th Century.² The earliest European contacts were with the Portuguese who arrived in 1482 and who gave it the name of the Gold Coast. The Portuguese engaged in gold mining and slave trade until 1682 when they were expelled by the Dutch. The Dutch slave trade, however, was to be shared with the English, French, Swedes, Danes, and Germans. In the early part of the 19th Century the English gained stronger foothold over the Gold Coast than the Dutch. In 1807 the British Government abolished the slave trade and in 1821 the Imperial Government for the first time assumed control over coastal forts.³ In 1874 the coastal area was made a Crown colony and in 1901 Ashanti was declared a conquered colony and the Northern Territories were made a protectorate.⁴ British rule over Ghana may be roughly divided into: the period of indirect rule lasting until 1950, and the period of transition towards autonomy within the

²W.E.F. Ward, A History of Ghana, revised third edition (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd., 1966), p. 63.

³Ibid., p. 146.

⁴David E. Apter, Ghana in Transition (New York: Atheneum, 1963), p. 34.

Commonwealth.⁵ On March 6, 1957 the Gold Coast became Ghana, an independent country within the British Commonwealth.

Economy. The economy of Ghana may be described as an individualized system of small land holdings within the larger compass of a tribal-communal system of land ownership. Over 70 per cent of the total labor force is engaged in agriculture. With the exception of gold, industrial diamonds, bauxite and manganese, Ghana is not richly endowed for industrial purposes. Its main energy potential lies in the Volta Development Scheme. Ghana is the world's largest single exporter of cocoa. Cocoa represents about 70 per cent of the country's total exports. It is fair to say that Ghana's economy is still a one-crop system.

The traditional concepts of land tenure, the customary practice of land usage, and the attitude on work have presented perplexing problems for agricultural experts in attempting to get the farmers to accept modern agricultural practices. What this implies to present developmental efforts is explored by Apter.⁶

Land has become a political issue, wrapped up with the perquisites and obligations of traditional chieftaincy and society. For the present Gold Coast government, embarking upon developmental projects infringes upon customary patterns of land tenure. Any changes involving land and land usage infringe upon the prerogatives of chieftaincy. The government must provide new forms of social and community life to replace the tribe, insofar as the old system is increasingly less satisfactory in the light of

⁵Ibid., Chs. 6-8.

⁶Ibid., pp. 57-58.

modern Gold Coast national objectives. In addition, the customary tradition of land tenure is one of the strongest inhibiting factors militating against the rapid development of individualized and Western patterns of competitive practice so closely bound up with private ownership and an atomistic social structure. Whether or not such competitive practice would tend to undermine social discipline and make the task of the present government even harder is difficult to decide. In any case, land and land tenure, remain a real dilemma for the nationalist government.

Political System. For half a century, as mentioned earlier, the British pursued a policy of indirect rule in Ghana. This pattern of indirect rule was characterized by:

- (a) the use of indigenous structures as agencies of both continuity and decentralization in administration;
- (b) the cooperation of the chiefs and people with the colonial service;
- (c) the congruity of colonial policy and traditional social life;
- (d) the residual authority of the Crown.⁷

In time, this pattern undermined the old status of chieftaincy. And as the partially educated grew in numbers, from which the British secular political administration continued to draw to its ranks, the seeds of discord between the old and the new sprouted. The rallying symbol of an emerging force of integration was provided by the charismatic leadership of Kwame Nkrumah. The general election of 1951 became the culminating point for the resurgent nationalism as the Convention People's Party gained an overwhelming victory. This party stood for immediate independence; for the development of Ghana on the basis of socialism. In succession, Dr. Nkrumah became the

⁷Ibid., p. 122.

first Ghanaian Prime Minister in 1952, a Nkrumahian constitution was adopted in 1954 and after the 1956 elections the independence of Ghana within the Commonwealth was assured. Some 326 years after the British built their first port in the Gold Coast and 83 years after proclaiming it as a British Colony, Ghana emerged as an independent state.⁸

The Nkrumah Government took office with three main objectives: (1) to develop the country into a modern state, (2) to secure its position and conversely provide the country with a Government secure from a coup d'etat, and (3) to work for pan-Africanism.⁹ In a masterly fashion to consolidate powers in his hands, Dr. Nkrumah and his Government enacted a Deportation Act and then a Preventive Detention Act. In 1960 under the new constitution, Dr. Nkrumah became President of the Republic of Ghana. The next year, a drastic overhaul of the British inherited system of administration was realized with the passage of the Chieftaincy Act and the Local Government Act. The traditional chiefs were excluded from the work of modern local government. The Local Government Act abolished the old two-tier system of district councils and urban or local councils. The country instead was divided into 69 districts and a number of city or municipal districts.

⁸Ward, op. cit., p. 349.

⁹Ibid., p. 414.

As part of his pan-Africanism movement, Dr. Nkrumah successfully established the nucleus of a United States of Africa by linking Ghana with Guinea in 1959 and Mali in 1960. The charter of the Union of African States was published in the three countries in 1961.¹⁰

The autocratic, socialist regime of Dr. Nkrumah ended in February 1966. At that time, while he was out of the country a National Liberation Council composed of army and police officers took over the reigns of Ghanaian affairs.¹¹

Social System. In 1960, Ghana's 91,843 square miles was populated by 6,690,730 people. These peoples have varied beliefs, cultures and tongues. Ward identifies at least six major languages: at the Coast and Ashanti, the Akans predominate, as well as the Fante, Ga and Ewe. The Northern Territories are peopled by tribes speaking different forms of the Moshi-Dagomba language. Islam and Christianity compete with animism and other ancient beliefs.

The social structure of West Africa, Ghana included, revolves on the tribe.¹² Family, clan, village and territorial division or nation are the crucial membership structures of tribal groupings. What would this mean for the tasks required

¹⁰See Apter, op. cit., Appendix C, pp. 422 ff.

¹¹Irving Markovitz and Jon Kraus, "Ghana Without Nkrumah," Africa Report, Vol. 11, No. 4 (April 1966), pp. 10-20.

¹²Kenneth Little, West African Urbanization: A Study of Voluntary Association in Social Change (Cambridge, England, The University Press, 1965).

for developmental purposes? Apter's observations are illuminating. He wrote:¹³

"Class" based on occupation has only just begun to appear in the urban areas.... In most parts of the Gold Coast, occupational status does not involve a highly articulated built-in system of statuses, and monetary income and traditional prejudices tend to reinforce one another on an inter-tribal and inter-regional basis.... The division of labor is not extensive. It reflects the lack of skilled and even semi-skilled workers available for present developmental tasks.... Traditional responsibilities to the tribe and the family often demand leaving the job, and reduce labor mobility as a sustained force. Traditional responsibilities to land call the worker home for harvest, for festival occasions, and for customary rites.

The educational system in Ghana is almost a complete institutional transfer of the British system. The emphasis of the British policy was on primary education and even there, there was no spectacular increase in the number of children attending primary school. Secondary education received attention late in the 1920's when Achimota College was founded in 1924. As a result of the report of the Elliot Commission, the University College of the Gold Coast was established near Achimota in late 1948 and in 1951 a College of Technology was established at Kumasi. One of the first actions of the Nkrumah Government was to introduce an accelerated development plan for education in 1951. In 1954, nonetheless the literacy rate in the coastal areas of the Gold Coast was just about 30 per cent.¹⁴

¹³Apter, op. cit., pp. 60-61.

¹⁴Philip J. Foster "The Vocational School Fallacy in Development Planning" in C. Arnold Anderson and Mary Jean Bowman (eds.), Education and Economic Development (Chicago: Aldine Publishing Co., 1965), pp. 142-145.

Development Planning.⁴ Development planning, as an official governmental policy, was not a new concept in Ghana. During the incumbency of Sir Gordon Guggisberg as governor beginning 1919 a ten-year plan of development was instituted. The purpose of this plan was the development of a viable social and economic Gold Coast.¹⁵ Under the Colonial Development and Welfare Acts of 1945, development planning in British colonies, including the Gold Coast, was encouraged.¹⁶ In the field of educational planning the British relied on Commissions to guide their policies in Africa. Thus the Achimota College was established under the time of Governor Guggisberg as a result of the Phelps-Stokes Commission, which toured Africa in 1920. As mentioned earlier, the University College of the Gold Coast and the College of Technology at Kumasi were established as a result of the Elliot Commission. This Commission was charged by the Secretary of State in 1943 to consider the whole question of higher education in British West Africa.

Since 1951 Ghana has adopted three development plans: the first from 1951 to 1959, the second from 1959 to 1964 and the third from 1964 to 1970. The first plan laid the framework on which economic development could be built. Its emphasis was on communications, public works, education and general services.¹⁷ The second plan emphasized the development

¹⁵ Ibid., p. 73

¹⁶ Barbu Niculescu, Colonial Planning: A Comparative Study (London: George Allen & Unwin, Ltd., 1958).

¹⁷ Ghana Second Development Plan, 1959-64 (Accra: Government Printer, n.d.), p. 1.

of agriculture and industry. The third plan had been conceived as the instrument for "economic reconstruction and development aimed at creating a socialist society."¹⁸

In all three plans, the importance of human resources development is explicitly recognized. The first two plans emphasized primary education, without neglecting secondary education and technical institutes as well as university education. Also emphasized was adult education through the community development program. The third plan approaches a high level of sophistication in manpower planning. The new emphasis in education in the third plan is on:

...the teaching of skills and other attainments that are needed for the running of a moderneconomy.

...the programme of educational development under this plan therefore lays heavy emphasis on the expansion of secondary education... and of the subsequent facilities for training in technological and managerial skills.¹⁹

Kumasi School

In late 1954 a United Nations Housing Mission visited Ghana "to make a survey of housing problems... and to advise and make recommendations to the Government thereon."²⁰ The Mission's approach to its assignment was comprehensive and

¹⁸ Republic of Ghana, Office of the Planning Commission, Seven-Year Plan for National Reconstruction and Development Financial Years 1963/64-1969/70 (Accra: Government Printing Department, 1964), p. 1.

¹⁹ Ibid., pp. 142-143

²⁰ U.N. Secretariat, Housing in Ghana, Prepared for the Government of Ghana by the United Nations Technical Assistance Housing Mission to Ghana (New York: United Nations Technical Assistance Programme, 1957), p. iv. The Mission was composed of Charles Abrams, chairman, and V. Bodiansky and O. Koenigsberger, members.

sympathetic with the multifarious problems facing a transitional society.

If the housing problem is to be solved in a practical way it is important to formulate a programme that will utilize as much of the local materials and skills as possible; it should leave for import only that which is essential, will not interfere with the primary economic developments of the country, and, will, in fact, complement such developments wherever possible; finally, the problem should be recognized as insoluble by quick recipe but only through a planned utilization of land for long range, by an increase in technical knowledge, labour and materials, by the development of suitable finance mechanisms, and by the evolution of governmental policies appropriate to the environment, the economic capacity and the national requirements.²¹

The Mission's recommendations on education for personnel was also comprehensive. A summary of their recommendations follow:²²

- (1) Extension of the activities of the Department of Social Welfare and Mass Education toward the improvement of rural housing and the recruitment of technical instructors especially trained for this work.
- (2) Study of incentive methods to increase productivity in the building industry.
- (3) Establishment of an immigration policy which encourages the entry of skilled artisans connected with the building trade.
- (4) Expansion of the present programme of technical education to increase the number of artisans and a study of the French system of accelerated technical training of adults.
- (5) Establishment of evening classes and refresher courses for foremen and overseers.
- (6) Provision of homes for teachers.
- (7) Introduction of draftsmanship classes at the Technical Institutes.

²¹Ibid., pp. 8-9.

²²Ibid., pp. 32-33.

- (8) Assistance to African and other contractors through: (a) formation of a Mutual Credit Association; (b) specification of local materials; and (c) institution of professional courses for contractors.
- (9) Foundation of a "SCHOOL OF COMMUNITY PLANNERS" for the education of professional men required to handle the housing programme of the country, and toward that end, the forwarding of a request to the United Nations Technical Assistance Administration for an immediate Follow-Up-Mission to work out the details of the scheme and ensure its realization.
- (10) Association of the proposed School of Community Planners with a parent school in England and with the development programmes of the Gold Coast.
- (11) Establishment of a type design service as an interim measure.

To complement the Design Centre, a Building Research Institute was also recommended.

A detailed analysis of the proposal of the Mission to established a School of Community Planning could be germane to this study and should be reviewed.

On the purpose and importance of the proposed School:

For a developing country, it is always difficult to decide which professions are sufficiently important and sufficiently influenced by local conditions to make it necessary to insist on training within the country. In cases of small professions, it may often be more economical and wiser to rely on foreign training until the home need has grown large enough to justify special institutions. The Mission feels that housing and the professional training required for it do not come under this category. Housing and community planning are subjects of sufficient national importance to justify the establishment of a school in the Gold Coast. They are also subjects which are so utterly dependent on social and climatic conditions that foreign training is only of very limited value. The Mission would therefore like to see the highest priority attached to its suggestion of starting in the Gold Coast a School of Community Planning.²³

²³Ibid., p. 100.

On the creation of a new profession: This new profession would be labelled "community planner" to emphasize its social responsibility in a developing country.

They would be "general practitioners",

...men who know enough of planning to choose sites for development; survey them and prepare simple plans for town extensions or village development; men who know enough of architecture to design and construct residential houses, schools and other simple public buildings; men who know enough of quantity surveying and accounting to prepare estimates and value properties; men who know enough of municipal engineering to cope with village roads, wells, drains and other tasks of this nature and enough of administration and law to be able to put their own projects into practice.²⁴

It was suggested that admission to the School be restricted eventually to holders of first-class school certificates from technical secondary schools who have at least half a year of practical experience in a building craft. Initially, however, older men who have practical experience and are anxious to continue their education would be also admitted provided they undergo a short pre-academic course. Instruction would be from three to four years.

To ensure that competent individuals would be attracted to the new profession, the Mission recommended that (1) the School be attached to either the University College of the Gold Coast or the Kumasi College of Technology; (2) the School be started as a daughter institution of one of the well-known and long-established Schools of Architecture or

²⁴Ibid., p. 97.

Planning in England; (3) the gifted students of the School be sent abroad for further specialist training; (4) the pay scales for public employment of the new profession correspond to those of the medical profession.

The Mission envisioned that the graduates of the School would be absorbed mostly into public employment: as technical staff to local authorities, as technical instructors in the village housing and village improvement programs of the Department of Social Welfare, or in positions in the Department of Public Works, in Railways, and the Department of Urban and Water Supply. The Mission also saw the possibility of some graduates to be absorbed in the building industry either as private practitioners or in the contracting business.

To summarize at this point: The Mission was primarily concerned with housing. However, it construed its task broadly. It recommended a comprehensive approach to solve a national problem. Many institutional innovations inter-related to each other were recommended. Ultimately, it considered that the institutional innovations would only have lasting value if competent personnel, adequate in number, could be made available as quickly as possible. As a long-range strategy, the Mission therefore recommended a School of Community Planning. Instead of specialists in engineering, architecture, surveying and planning, the Mission conceived of a cadre of general practitioners. To support this strategy, however, as a tactical move, the Mission recommended that the new School adopt a parent institution in

England. The community planners would be working as line officers as contrasted to staff officers prevalent in the West. They would be mainly in government agencies, the majority working in local authorities and in national ministries concerned with social welfare, housing, public works, railways. The closest collaboration was therefore recommended between the university, on the one hand, where the School would be attached, and the prospective government ministries-employers on the other. Also the School would collaborate closely with a Design Centre and a Building Research Institute.

Following the visit of the Housing Mission, a two-man team was invited by the Council of the Kumasi College of Technology to advise the latter on professional education in subjects allied to building. This team confirmed the observations of the earlier Mission on the shortage of personnel at all levels, especially of qualified African engineers, architects and building technologists, and the need of introducing educational and training facilities both for professionals and skilled artisans. However, the team did not agree fully on the general practitioner concept of the Mission. Instead, the team proposed a composite four-year course in architecture, building, and town planning. The composite course was explained as follows:²⁵

²⁵United Nations Technical Assistance Programme, Report on Housing in the Gold Coast, Prepared for the Government of the Gold Coast by Otto. H. G. Koenigsberger, Report No. TAA/GOC/1, Add. 1 (New York: United Nations, November 5, 1956), Annex, p. 34.

The idea is that all who wish to enter the building field should be given a preliminary common course of two years, and that they should then specialize for two further years in Architecture, or in Building Technology and Quantity Surveying, or in Housing and Community Planning.

The composite course was considered as an intermediate stage towards professional standing. In fact, the team viewed the

three branches of the composite course [would] provide opportunities for the most promising students to proceed to advanced studies, at home or overseas, in the three professions, leading to associate membership of the R.I.B.A., the R.I.C.S., or the T.P.I..²⁶

Dr. Koenigsberger, one of the members of the Housing Mission, apparently approved of the recommendation to establish the School of Architecture and Building that would offer the composite course.²⁷ The Council of the Kumasi College of Technology approved the proposal of the two-man team and a School of Architecture, Town Planning and Building was established in 1956.²⁸ The School is for all practical purposes oriented towards the requirements of three professional institutes of England. "Students who are accepted to the course in Town and Country Planning at Kumasi College of Technology will work towards the examinations of the Town Planning Institute."²⁹ And so do the other two groups of

²⁶Prof. R. Gardner-Medwin and Prof. J.A.L. Matheson, "Report to the Council of Kumasi College of Technology, Gold Coast, On Professional Education in Subjects Allied to Building," Koenigsberger, op. cit., Annex, p. 35.

²⁷Ibid., p. 26.

²⁸School of Architecture, Town Planning & Building, Kumasi College of Technology, Information (Kumasi, Ghana: The College of Technology, 1958).

²⁹Ibid., p. 11.

students in architecture and building technology; they have to work towards the examination of the appropriate professional institute in London.

It became apparent that the School of Architecture, Town Planning and Building could not provide "a short-term course in order to produce the largest possible number of recruits in the shortest possible time and to develop the course and raise the standard gradually"³⁰ as proposed by the Housing Mission. During the visit of Mr. Ernest Weissmann, Assistant Director of the Bureau of Social Welfares of the United Nations, in Ghana in early 1959 he noted "the shortage of personnel adequately trained to provide leadership in the execution of development projects at the local level."³¹ He recommended the establishment of a special training center for planning assistants for local development projects. His concepts of the functions and responsibilities of the center were:³²

Such a centre would provide to the students not only the elements of physical planning, construction, housing, agricultural and land improvement, economics, sociology and public administration, but it should also equip them for leadership in encouraging community action and facilitating co-operation of the different services and groups involved in the execution of local and national projections in a given locality.

³⁰Housing in Ghana, op. cit., p. 98.

³¹Cited in United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs, A Report on the Establishment, Organization and Administration of an Institute for Community Planning in Ghana, Prepared for the Government of Ghana by Prof. H. Peter Oberlander (New York, February 2, 1960), pp. 2-3.

³²Ibid., p. 3.

The students and faculty of the training centre would be recruited from the different services operating in the economic and in the social programmes at the local level. Since teaching would be focussed on planning and execution of the physical manifestations of development (e.g. school buildings, water supply, roads, community improvement, sanitation works, etc.), the organization and supervision of the centre should be entrusted to the Town and Country Planning Department. This Department would also be in the best position to employ the trainees to the best advantage.

This recommendation was favorably received and Prof. H. Peter Oberlander of the University of British Columbia was commissioned by the United Nations to assess the needs for training in community planning in Ghana and to recommend on way and means to meet such needs. Professor Oberlander posited four assumptions in the establishment of an Institute of Community Planning: 1) that the training program should be made on a continuing basis within a permanent framework of administration, 2) that community planning, as a distinct profession with its own hierarchy of professional competence, deserves a comprehensive program of education, 3) that planning education in developing countries is primarily for civil service appointment, hence, the educational program should be closely linked with the ministry concerned with community planning, and 4) that existing facilities be used for the new training center.³³

We shall now look more closely on the specific proposals.

³³Ibid., pp. 5-6.

It should be noted that Prof. Oberlander's terms of reference were quite explicit:³⁴

- (a) the establishment, organization and administration of a Centre for the training of planning and development assistants, along the following lines:
 - (i) the Centre will be supervised by the Town and Country Planning Department;
 - (ii) the Centre will be established in conjunction with an existing institution of higher learning, or a specialized training centre; and
 - (iii) the Centre will accommodate at least twenty to twenty-five trainees the first year and ten to fifteen afterwards.
- (b) The development of the curriculum for a two-year academic course.
- (c) the organization of short orientation and refresher courses for officials of the governmental services operating at the local level and for such groups as community development assistants, village level workers, etc.

Prof. Oberlander recommended the establishment of an Institute of Community Planning. Three responsibilities were to be assigned to the Institute: training local planning assistants; developing teaching aids for planning education; and providing short-term courses of the in-service variety.

The Institute was to be governed by its own Council. The chairman of the Council would be the Minister of Works and Housing, with membership drawn from Government and the universities.

Affiliation with the proposed College of Public

³⁴Ibid., p. 1.

Administration was recommended. The possibility of affiliating with the School of Architecture, Town Planning and Building at the Kumasi College of Technology was dismissed because: "The curriculum of this programme reflects the professional requirements of this [Great Britain's] Town Planning Institute, which in the main cannot be expected to be of great value in preparing junior staff to act as local planning assistants in Ghana..."³⁵

Entrance to the two-year program of the Institute was to be limited to secondary school graduates with a West African School certificate. Provision for determining the personality and academic record of the candidate for admission was to be observed. In the formulation of the detailed curriculum, it was suggested that a review be made of the experience of the Panfukdrom Village Planning School. Prof. Oberlander stressed that the emphasis of the training program would be to develop "the individual's capacity to think for himself, assess a given situation and render a decision."³⁶

It was envisioned that local planning assistant graduates could work either at the village level or as junior planning staff members at the central and regional offices of the Department of Town and Country Planning.

Finally, to implement the above proposals, Prof. Oberlander

³⁵ Ibid., p. 12.

³⁶ Ibid., p. 16.

suggested that the Ghana Government rely on the technical assistance schemes available to the country.

The Ghana School was established in 1961 at the Kumasi College of Technology under United Nations technical assistance. Its object had been "to promote the sound physical development of the communities of Ghana and other African countries."³⁷ The School started with a two-year Diploma course for planning assistants "who would serve as the eyes and ears of a regional planning officer, and as a technical aide to village development committees in his district."³⁸

In general, it may be said that the Ghana School is operating within the frame of reference provided by Prof. Oberlander.³⁹ The first director of the School was Alan Armstrong, a Canadian. The Government assures employment for every Ghanaian who graduates from the Institute. A Ghanaian is extended a government scholarship once he gets accepted as a student. He is expected to enter into a bond to stay in the course and to render at least three years service in the Government after obtaining a Diploma. Prof. Oberlander estimated in 1960 that Ghana needed about 90 to 100 local planning assistants.⁴⁰ At that time there appeared to be enough jobs for any Ghanaian holder of a Diploma in Community Planning.

³⁷Institute for Community Planning Diploma Course (Kumasi; Kwame Nkrumah University of Science and Technology Press, 1961), p. 3.

³⁸Ibid., p. 2.

³⁹H. Peter Oberlander, "Planning Education for Newly Independent Countries," Journal of American Institute of Planners, vol. xxviii, No. 2 (May 1960), pp. 116-123.

⁴⁰Ibid., p. 20.

Appraisal. In 1962 another United Nations Mission on Physical Planning was sent to Ghana to assist the Government in the preparation of a national physical development plan. The Mission also found the urgent need for trained Ghanaian planning personnel. The Mission "found that the situation at the local level was not as serious as it was at the national and regional levels."⁴¹ They pointed out that there were only ten Ghanaian planning officers in the whole country. To remedy the situation, the Mission suggested that a post-graduate course in regional planning be instituted in the School of Architecture, Town Planning and Building of the Kwame Nkrumah University of Science and Technology. The Mission thought that this course should be open only to selected graduates in economics, geography, civil and agricultural engineering and architecture. The course would be for two academic years and would be "patterned more to the American flexible system than to the British formal system."⁴² Graduates would have the title "Diploma in Regional Planning," conferred on them.

The Mission noted that within the next ten to fifteen years, the educational facilities of Ghana at the time could produce only 51 planning officers and 45 assistants. However,

⁴¹United Nations Physical Planning Mission, "Report on the Training of Planning Personnel and the Undertaking of Research in the Field of Regional Planning," (Accra, 1962), p. 2. (Mimeographed.)

⁴²Ibid., p. 5.

it was estimated that in order to attain the desired rapidity of development, Ghana would need not less than 300 qualified planning officers.

The Government of Ghana accepted the principle of a post-graduate course in regional planning. However, this concept became integrated into a reorganized Faculty of Architecture. In 1963 two significant events occurred. The Institute of Community Planning was merged with the reorganized Faculty of Architecture of the University of Science and Technology. John R. Lloyd, an Englishman, was appointed as Dean of the then School of Architecture, Town Planning and Building. He reorganized the curriculum with emphasis on environmental design. Thus the Faculty of Architecture now offers a bachelor of science and a master of science. Under the new curriculum, common courses are now limited to the first year. While specialization in architecture, town planning and building technology is still possible, design is now emphasized in all three areas of specialization and everyone is conferred a bachelor of science degree. Students who specialize in architecture and town planning may proceed to a master of science in urban planning. Students who specialize in building technology are expected to secure their master's degree in the Faculty of Engineering. Graduates from other disciplines may enroll at the Faculty of Architecture in its two-year graduate course in regional planning. The reorganized Faculty of

Architecture then is basically oriented towards environmental design, the professional institutes in England, and the British-type civil service system of Ghana.⁴³

Upon the advice of Prof. Oberlander, the curriculum of the Institute for Community Planning was revised in 1964. It was felt that two years was too short to develop competent planning assistants. Moreover, there was very little incentive for the qualified to enroll in the program because the civil service salary schedules worked unfavorably on holders of a diploma on community planning. Hence, the diploma course has been lengthened to three years and the entrance requirement has been raised to a West African School Certificate with at least one "A" level.⁴⁴

The revised three-year diploma course on physical planning is now designed

to train middle-level, sub-professional planning assistants who, working under the guidance of a professional planner, will be able to

- A. Carry out surveys and analyses;
- B. Develop proposals and plans for village improvement projects;

⁴³Arena, Kumasi Special Issue, Vo. 82, No. 904 (July/August 1966), pp. 46-47.

⁴⁴Physical Planning Diploma Course Year III, Report on the July 1966 Field Session at Medina, Ghana (Kumasi: Faculty of Architecture, University of Science and Technology, October, 1966), p. 1. (Mimeographed).

- C. Implement plans and proposals through self-help and community development techniques.⁴⁵

It has been reported that out of 56 students in the course in the 1966-1967 academic session, three come from other African countries, one each from Tanzania, Uganda and Nigeria.⁴⁶

Summary

The roots of planning education in Ghana may be traced to a concern for housing. The United Nations Mission on Housing recommended the creation of a new profession of "general practitioners" to satisfy this need. Two separate institutions were established. One, the School of Architecture, Town Planning and Building was originally conceived as an intermediate training institution to qualify Ghanaians for membership in the professional institutes in England. The course may be labelled as a composite course, that is, the first two years served as a common program and the last two years were meant to produce specializations in the field of architecture, town planning and building technology. Second, the Institute for Community Planning as the title of the institution implies was more oriented to the training of local planning assistants. These assistants would be concerned with the larger field of planning and would serve as eyes and ears

⁴⁵"Physical Planning Diploma Course", Faculty of Architecture, University of Science and Technology, Kumasi, Ghana, December 1966. (Mimeographed leaflet.).

⁴⁶Loc. cit.

of professional regional planners in the field. As the need for inter-locking the educational program with national planning requirements became more apparent, the Institute was integrated into the School of Architecture, Town Planning and Building. Another step towards this direction was taken when the School was converted to a Faculty of Architecture. The Faculty has a strong bias towards environmental design. It offers a bachelor of science and a master of science degree. Thus within a period of less than ten years, Ghana has established a full-fledged professional program in community planning.

This rapid development has been made possible largely because of the strong commitment of the country to national planning. In turn the strong national planning commitment is traceable to the charismatic leadership provided until early 1966 of Dr. Kwame Nkrumah.

One observer who has been closely involved in the development of planning education in Ghana believes that the transition towards a full-fledged professional education in planning has come much too quickly.⁴⁷ Ghana's problem now seems to lie on securing competent faculty members for its Faculty of Architecture. Since the physical planning course has started modestly and proceeded more gradually, its future seems more stable and deserves close watching.

⁴⁷Interview with Prof. H. P. Oberlander, March 16, 1967.

On the basis of the strategy we have formulated in Chapter II, and considering the level of development of Ghana, the most logical strategy for planning education should be to stress the training of local planning assistants, enlarge the secondary education program and conduct mass education programs. Such should be accompanied by a government-wide in-service training program. Training-within-industry should complement efforts in the public sector. With a strong start in community development, perhaps serious effort should be made to tie in more closely the current physical planning course with the work of the Department of Social Welfare and Mass Education. The "general practitioners" concept espoused by the United Nations Missions on Housing still seem valid for Ghana for some time.

CHAPTER IV

EDUCATION FOR PLANNING: INDONESIA

General History. Indonesia is considered as a cultural melting pot of Asia.¹ Indian influence to the archipelago started as early as 200 A.D.. Buddhism reached its zenith from the 8th to the 14th centuries. Two great Malayan Empires rose during this period: The Shri Vijaya in the 8th and 9th centuries, and the Madjapahit in the 14th century. By the end of the 15th century Mohammedanism had replaced the Brahman-Buddhist strains. Today, the Brahman-Buddhist-naturalist traditions are largely confined to the romantic island of Bali and a few of the outer islands.

Western influence reached Indonesia at the end of the 15th century when the Portuguese successfully established themselves in Malacca.² Soon the Portuguese had also bases in Java, Sumatra and other islands. The Dutch ousted the Portuguese in 1595. Except for five years of British rule during the Napoleonic Wars, Indonesia remained a Dutch colony until 1945.

The Dutch rule, which was primarily dictated by commercial interests, started with the "forced delivery system" of the Netherlands East Indies Company. This was replaced

¹Charles Wolf, Jr., The Indonesian Story, Issued under the auspices of the American Institute of Pacific Relations (New York: The John Day Co., 1948), p. vii.

²Benjamin Higgins with Jean Higgins, Indonesia: The Crisis of the Millstones (Princeton, New Jersey: D. Van Nostrand Co., Inc., 1963), p. 105.

by the "culture system" after 1830. In turn, the "liberal system" replaced the "culture system" after 1850. From 1900 to 1930, the Dutch pursued an "ethical policy". Finally, a regulated economy was imposed after the Depression in the thirties. With the fall of Holland in May 1940, the colonial government of the Netherlands Indies more vigorously pursued the policy of regulated economy.

From March 1942 to March 1945, Indonesia came under Japanese Occupation. The groundwork for independence was laid during this short period.

On August 17, 1945, Soekarno and Hatta proclaimed the Republic of Indonesia. After four years of further bloodshed and the intervention of the United Nations, Indonesia's independence was reluctantly recognized by the Dutch.

Economy. Indonesia is the fifth largest nation in the world with an estimated population of 105 million. Composed of thousands of islands, three-fifths of the population, however, are crowded in the island of Java. Indonesia is richly endowed with natural resources, largely untapped. Its economic growth has always been dependent on agricultural exports and more recently on its mineral resources - tin, bauxite and petroleum. Despite its natural wealth, Indonesia is not producing enough of its food requirements nor is it able to exploit its mineral resources to advantage. While still the world's largest producer of natural rubber, due to government price policy and lowered efficiency in the management of the

plantations plus the absence of a sustained replanting program among smallholders, Indonesia's production has continuously declined.

Apart from its post-independence political stability, the economic difficulties which Indonesia faces today, may be traced largely to the dual economy inherited from the Dutch.

After 350 years of Dutch colonialism, the Indonesians had been drawn into the modern sector of the economy to an astonishingly small degree. In 1940 less than 10% of the labor force was employed in that sector. Only about 5% of the Indonesian labor force was engaged in trade of any kind, and a still smaller percentage were smallholders producing export products. At least 80% of the population still gained its livelihood in the traditional sector.³

The unstable dual economy, moreover, is exacerbated by the fact that while the greater majority of the population are crowded in Java where the village subsistence economy exists, the rest of the population are scattered in the outer islands where there are some highly efficient large-scale industries producing mainly for export.

In 1961 a United States economic survey team noted that at least half of the population still existed in a non-monetized sector of economic life and that about 70 per cent of Indonesia's population were still engaged in non-estate agriculture. They also noted that the industrial sector of the economy had been placed under direct or indirect government control. They gave an over-all impression of their visit in these terms:⁴

³Ibid., p. 65.

⁴United States Economic Survey Team to Indonesia, Indonesia: Perspective and Proposals for United States Economic Aid, A Report to the President of the United States (New Haven: Yale University Southeast Asia Studies, 1963), p. 4.

Certain pre-conditions of self-sustaining growth are only now in the process of development, so that in the familiar metaphor of growth we feel that Indonesia is not yet ready for the take-off but has recently left the hangar. However, location, climate, human and natural resources are such that when the plane does take-off it has the potential to fly high and fast.

Indonesia's efforts towards economic stabilization and development unfortunately suffered serious setbacks since then. Huge outlays for defense and security had to be made because of the West Irian (New Guinea) liberation movement, followed by the Malaysian konfrontasi and then the September 30, 1965 tragedy.

The toll on the total economy of such unfortunate events has been disclosed in a special business report on Indonesia published by an English journal in late 1966.⁵ This special report showed that the cost-of-living index moved from 100 in 1957 to 348 in 1960, to 36,000 in 1965, and to 150,000 in 1966! On the other hand, the budget deficit of around 23 billion rupiah in 1961 rose to 1,500 billion rupiah in 1965 and was estimated to reach 18,000 billion rupiah in 1966! The Indonesian Government nonetheless calmly points out that because of Indonesia's dual economy, it is only the "economy concentrated around the cities and large towns that has suffered through inflation."⁶

⁵"Business Report on Indonesia", Far East Trade and Development, Vol. 21, No. 12 (December 1966), pp. 1311 ff.

⁶Ibid., p. 1319.

Political System. Indonesia is a guided democracy.

Pauker, a specialist on modern Indonesian politics, explains the major reasons why Indonesia has adopted guided democracy in this manner.⁷

During the last phase of Dutch colonial rule all Indonesian attempts to engage in active political life had been repressed. The authoritarian indigenous political tradition, reinforced by the anti-democratic intellectual climate nurtured between the two world wars by Communism and Fascism, and by the traumatic experience of Japanese military occupation followed by Dutch colonial warfare, could hardly have prepared the Indonesian nationalist elites for the practice of democracy.

Other reasons may be cited: the Dutch indirect rule, not unlike the British system in Ghana; the limited educational system under the Dutch; the enduring adat which varies from island to island and even from village to village; the great social discrepancies between urban and rural communities; the lack of modern mass media of communication both between villages and the far-flung islands.⁸

Since 1945, Indonesian politics has mirrored the changing forces of alignment between Soekarno, the Army, and the numerous political parties. Under the 1945 Constitution and until the Provisional Constitution of 1950, Soekarno exercised powers which were limited only by his own decision to form a Cabinet, of his own choosing, and a National Committee with

⁷Guy J. Pauker, "Indonesia: The Year of Transition," Asian Survey, Vol. VII, No. 2 (February 1967), p. 138.

⁸Selosoemardjan, Social Changes in Jogjakarta (Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press, 1962), pp. 164-166.

members also appointed by Soekarno. With nearly 50 political parties, government was always by coalition. A dozen cabinets fell between 1949 to 1948, for instance, because of the innumerable political parties.⁹

The Provisional Constitution of 1950 formalized the parliamentary system of government initiated by Soekarno under the 1945 Constitution. Elections were held in 1955. In 1957, Soekarno announced his famous "guided democracy" or "democracy with leadership." The essence of this konsepsi for reconstruction is to do away with the concept of parliamentary opposition. The mechanisms to realize this concept are two: a gotong royong (mutual aid) cabinet where all parties would be represented, and a musjawarah (consultative compromise) council to be composed of all important groups of people.¹⁰ One keen interpreter of Indonesian politics views this as an attempt to strike a balance of power between Soekarno, the Army and the PKI (Communist Party).¹¹

An abortive revolt was staged in 1958 as a protest to Soekarno's "guided democracy." The rebellion was led by a former prime minister who wanted Indonesia to develop on non-Communist lines with increased regional and local autonomy.

⁹United Nations Economic Survey Team to Indonesia, op. cit., p. 2.

¹⁰Higgins with Higgins, op. cit., pp. 116-117.

¹¹Justus M. van der Kroef, "Indonesian Communism and the Changing Balance of Power," Pacific Affairs, Vol. XXXVII, No. 4 (Winter, 1964-65), pp. 357-383.

The rebel leaders also wanted to return to a federal constitution similar to what the Dutch promulgated in 1945.¹²

In July 1959, Soekarno proclaimed a return to the 1945 Constitution. There followed Soekarno's "nasakom" concept - symbol for the unity of nationalist, religious and communist parties.¹³

In 1965, the Communists seemed to have reached their height of greatest influence. Soekarno withdrew from the United Nations and United States-Indonesia relations was at its lowest ebb. Then on September 30, 1965, six generals known to be sympathetic with the moderate General Nasution were assassinated. It is believed that the assassination was Communist-inspired.¹⁴

In March 1966, Soekarno turned over the affairs of State to General Suharto. Soon after, the National Committee was reconvened with General Nasution as chairman. At the end of its July session, the National Committee passed the following important ordinances:

- 1) ratified the emergency powers given by Soekarno to General Suharto;
- 2) instructed General Suharto to form a new cabinet which should have political and economic stabilization as its basic guidelines;

¹²Higgins with Higgins, op. cit., pp. 118-119.

¹³van der Kroef, op. cit., p. 360.

¹⁴Daniel S. Lev, "Indonesia 1965: The Year of the Coup," Asian Survey, Vol. VI, No. 2 (February 1966), pp. 103-110.

3) cancelled the 1963 National Committee decree by which Soekarno had been named president-for-life;

4) ratified the dissolution of the PKI and its affiliate organizations and prohibited the dissemination or teaching of Marxism and Leninism in Indonesia; and

5) decreed that free, direct and secret elections be held in 1968.

Since July 1966, Indonesia has a new Cabinet composed of 24 ministers and who are supervised by five chief ministers who form a Presidium.¹⁵

Social System. Indonesia's 105 million peoples may be divided into four racial types: Malay, Melanesian, Negroid and Papuan. Of the many ethnic groups, ten are of real importance in numbers and cultural and linguistic distinction: the Javanese and Sundanese of Java; the Madurese of Madura; the Balinese of Bali; the Coastal Malays, the Menangkabau, Bataks and Atjehnese of Sumatra; the Coastal Malays of Kalimantan; and the Macassarese-Buginese of Celebes.¹⁶ From these dominant linguistic groups emanate local dialects. All the languages trace themselves into a single general stock: Malayo-Polynesian, one of the most widespread linguistic families in the world. Bahasa Indonesia, based on Malay, is the official language and is taught in all schools.

¹⁵Pauker, op. cit., pp. 147-148.

¹⁶Higgins with Higgins, op. cit., pp. 16-17.

The Dutch did not provide mass education in Indonesia. Rather, the elitist educational system then prevailing in Holland was transferred bodily to the colony. This resulted in a limited number of educated Indonesians, the alienation of the educated Indonesian from his social environment, and the perpetuation of the traditional authoritarian social structure.¹⁷ In 1945 the literacy rate in Indonesia was below 10 per cent; "there were perhaps 35 qualified Indonesian engineers, 1,200 doctors of medicine, 150 dentists, 2 Ph. D.s in economics, and 1 physicist."¹⁸

The ironic thing was that despite the limited numbers of educated Indonesians, very few were employed in the Civil Service. In a situation which persisted for a long time, where positions of responsibility in the plantations and the better positions in the civil service were reserved for Dutch personnel and where the small trades and commerce were under Chinese monopoly, the entrepreneurial spirit of the Indonesians were practically destroyed.¹⁹

One of the most impressive accomplishments of Indonesia since independence is in the field of education. To illustrate,

¹⁷Selosoemardjan, op. cit., pp. 345-347.

¹⁸Bruce Glassburner, "High-Level Manpower for Economic Development: The Indonesian Experience", in Frederick Harbison and Charles A. Myers (eds.), Manpower and Education: Country Studies in Economic Development (New York: McGraw-Hill Book Co., 1965), p. 173.

¹⁹Benjamin Higgins, "Introduction," Entrepreneurship and Labor Skills in Indonesian Economic Development: A Symposium (New Haven: Yale University South East Asia Studies, 1961), pp. 1-38.

total college enrollment had grown from only 800 Indonesians in three faculties in 1939, to 18,400 by 1953, 36,000 by 1959, and 45,800 by 1961 in fourteen state universities. The secondary schools in turn had grown from 145 with 26,535 students in 1940 to 1,001 schools with 139,532 students in 1950, and to 6,742 schools with 731,262 students in 1960. In this rapid growth, it is true, however, that quality had suffered both in the secondary schools and in the higher institutions of learning.²⁰ This explosion in the educational field has not been free of problems. An Indonesian student of social change foresees danger too.

It appears rather unlikely that economic development and expansion of the administration in the near future can catch up with the rapid spread of education so that employment can be provided for all those who have enjoyed formal education. It may therefore be expected that the army of the educated unemployed will grow even larger....

An army of unemployed, dissatisfied intelligentsia is always a potential danger to any country.²¹

This was written in 1960-1961. By 1966, Pauker informs us that: "After the change of regime that occurred in March, relations between the students and military became the major dynamic factor in Indonesia politics."²²

²⁰Glassburner, op. cit., pp. 181-187.

²¹Seloesomardjan, op. cit., pp. 374-375.

²²Pauker, op. cit., p. 145.

Development Planning. Although a Ten-Year Plan was announced by the new Government in early 1947, Indonesia has had actually just three long-range plans since 1945. The so-called Ten-Year Plan of 1947 outlined at least thirteen broad policies which have been successively repeated generally in the subsequent plans. The Plan outlines a policy of controlled economy, the elimination of illiteracy and expansion of educational facilities, gradual industrialization accompanied by reforms in the agrarian economy, reliance on foreign experts and technicians as government advisers, transmigration from overpopulated islands to thinly populated regions, and soliciting foreign loans from all sources.²³ This Plan was not pursued because of the Dutch-Indonesian war.

An Economic Urgency Program was adopted in 1951. Its aims were limited to raise output of consumer goods and processing of domestic raw materials, and to mechanize small firms. In the meantime, the Indonesian Government entered into an agreement with the United Nations and the United States Government for assistance in economic planning. A new Five-Year Development Plan was submitted to the Cabinet in 1956 and this was approved by Parliament in 1959. Technically this was a sound plan. It could not be implemented fully because of political decisions or events: the nationalization of all Dutch interests in 1957, the rebellion in 1958, and

²³Wolf, op. cit., pp. 78-84.

the expulsion of the Chinese in 1959.

An Eight-Year Development Plan was prepared in 1959 by a presidential-appointed group representing regions and functional interest.²⁴ The voluminous document embodies both economic and non-economic goals but lacks adequate support from facts and statistics.²⁴

In both the Five-Year Plan and the Eight-Year Plan there is an indication of

the intense awareness of the Indonesian leadership of the need to develop high-level manpower as a basic resource for economic development. However, the need for a systematic programming (sic) of such resources - either in terms of optimal utilization of those in being or in terms of their group - has been only dimly seen.²⁵

Bandung School

As in Ghana, the concept of a national school of physical planning in Indonesia was first initiated by somebody under the United Nations Technical Assistance Scheme. In the case of Indonesia, the "selling" of the idea came from Mr. Kenneth Watts who was U.N. Technical advisor to the Municipality of Djakarta.²⁶

Mr. Watt's efforts were successful as the State Planning

²⁴United States Economic Survey Team to Indonesia, op. cit., pp. 83-85.

²⁵Glassburner, op. cit., p. 193.

²⁶Kenneth Watts, How to Make an Urban Planning Survey Based on Djakarta, Indonesia, Series of Provisional Text No. 1 (Bandung: Division of Regional & City Planning, Bandung Institute of Technology, 1961), cover leaf.

Bureau picked up quickly the need in Indonesia of a training and research program in physical planning. A meeting was convened by the State Planning Bureau on September 4, 1957 wherein representatives from nine agencies concerned with physical planning were invited. The idea was enthusiastically supported. Negotiations were then made with the University of Indonesia at Bandung. On February 11, 1958 the Senate of the Technical Faculty recommended to the Presidium of the University of Indonesia at Bandung, the establishment of a department of planning.²⁷

Largely through Mr. Watt's representation, the United Nations Technical Assistance Mission in Indonesia approved a seven-year plan of assistance to establish the planning school. This was followed by a visit to Harvard University in June 1958 by Mr. Watt and discussions in Tokyo between Indonesian officials, Ernest Weissmann of the United Nations and Martin Meyerson of Harvard University.

In November 1958, the Indonesian Government agreed to invite two representatives from Harvard University to look into the feasibility of establishing the planning school.

A memorandum of agreement was signed in January 1959 between Harvard, the United Nations Resident Representative, the Indonesian Government and the Bandung Institute of Technology, to open a planning school in September 1959.

²⁷"Memorandum Concerning the Proposed New Department of Regional and City Planning" (Bandung Institute of Technology, May 1959), p. 1. (Mimeographed.)

Major Features. The Division of Regional and City Planning in Bandung addresses itself to national physical planning in developing countries in general. Its emphasis is on the region. The rationale for this is explained by William A. Doebele, Jr.:²⁸

...an important premise of the new school has been that planning in developing countries requires significantly stronger emphasis on the region than has generally been characteristic of planning elsewhere. By the same token, it has been felt that questions of financing and implementation take on special significance in this context....

This implies not only that the region itself is a basic unit for planning and development, but the fundamental premise that in developing countries national physical planning can generally be best integrated at the regional level...urban problems as such will be given appropriate attention. It is however, taken as a working hypothesis that ultimate solutions to urban growth in developing nations lie in reorganization at the regional level. Thus, the curriculum puts its heaviest emphasis on the region as the basic unit for study, going upward, as it were, from this base to include national planning, and downward to include coverage of urban problems.

In deciding on the length of the program - four and a half years (now five years) - three considerations were kept in mind. Firstly, the requirements of the other departments at the Institute of Technology and other Indonesian universities had to be taken into account. Secondly, since the program is specifically directed to the training of students for positions of major policy responsibility, it was felt that any lesser time would not permit sufficient depth

²⁸William A. Doebele, Jr., "Education for Planning in Developing Countries," Town Planning Review, Vol. xxxiii, No. 2 (July 1962), pp. 104-105.

and flexibility.¹ Thirdly, it has been the hope that the Bandung School will not only serve the needs of Indonesia but of all Southeast Asia and therefore the program must accomodate the varying needs of the countries in the region.

As to why the Bandung Institute of Technology was selected as the mother unit: "This University, one of the oldest and most distinguished in the country, offers a broad range of engineering and scientific courses, and possesses the only department of architecture in Indonesia."²⁹

One distinct advantage in the establishment of the Bandung School is that through a university-to-university constract under United Nations sponsorship, a well-conceived staff development program had been realized. At the same time, the initiation of a research program was made early.

Appraisal. Although it was estimated in 1962 that at least 400 planners could be placed into responsible jobs immediately in Indonesia³⁰, even Doebele had expressed then some misgivings about to use his own words, "the largest experiment in planning education for developing countries existing anywhere in the world."³¹ His misgivings rest on two critical areas: (1) "the question of education for a kind of planning that does not yet actually exist," and (2) "in Indonesia itself physical planning is still new and untried."³²

²⁹Ibid., p. 98

³⁰Ibid., f.n. 38.

³¹Ibid., p. 95.

³²Ibid., p. 97, 112.

An evaluation was made in 1965 of the Bandung School and Doebele's earlier misgivings were confirmed. The report presented this dilemma: while Indonesia's need for planners might not be met by Bandung's production in fifty years time, jobs for planners had not yet been created and there was widespread ignorance even among the students themselves of the roles they would be equipped to play. The appraisal concluded:

Until there is some experience of how the future planners of Indonesia will play their parts in the development of the country, and there is more knowledge of the sort of work they will be called upon to do, the curriculum of any training establishment must remain tentative...The answers are made more difficult because they depend, to some extent, on the trends and the progress made in the growth and development of allied professions. It may well be a decade or more before the way becomes clear and some finality can be reached in the fixing of the training programme.³³

To make a more meaningful appraisal of the Bandung School there is a need for further understanding of the educational system of Indonesia in the first instance. Secondly, there is need to determine how the educational system supports the development plan of the country. A modest start has been attempted by Glassburner and he seems to suggest that in order to support the development plan of Indonesia, massive effort is still required to eliminate a wide gap on terms of high-level manpower needs. At the same time Glassburner argues, extensive use of affiliations with foreign universities is

³³F. W. Ledger, "Job Opportunities in Indonesian Planning," Australian Planning Institute Journal, Vol. 3, No. 4 (April 1965), pp. 138-139.

necessary to improve the quality of higher education.³⁴ But unless there will be some measure of political stability, development planning in Indonesia will continue to flounder. This political stability unfortunately profoundly affects every improvement effort, planning education not excepted.

Summary

Planning education in Indonesia has been conceived as an important tool of national economic planning. Its focus is on the region. This seems to be an appropriate focus in a country dedicated to a regulated economy. It has added meaning in two respects. First, Indonesia is a nation of islands. Secondly, the architects of the Bandung School conceived of a research and training center in regional and city planning not for Indonesia alone but for all Southeast Asia.

No valid and meaningful evaluation can as yet be made of the Bandung School. Its graduates have to operate in an unstable environment.

For purposes of this study, however, the establishment of a full-blown professional program in regional and city planning in Indonesia may be considered as premature. From the evidence at hand, Indonesia is still in Level II in her stage of development. The logical strategy would have been

³⁴Glassburner, op. cit., pp. 193-201.

to stress in-service training first in the ministries concerned with physical planning; to rely on foreign technical personnel and advisors; and to start modestly with an educational program of local development officers on the sub-professional level. The strong sense of regionalism and the far-flung islands logically dictate the opening of regional training centers attached to the newly-established state universities. The University of Indonesia at Djakarta which has a stronger social science faculty plus the fact that the key ministries are located in Djakarta would have made this university the logical national research and training center for regional and city planning.

A United Nations consultant on training for Urban and regional planning, who has recently visited the Bandung School, gives this impression:

They are fine people but they miss contacts with the outer world and their programme is rather a limited one. It is built on an engineering foundation and largely lacks the administrative approach which is so vital. They have very little written materials available...³⁵

³⁵W. C. Faithfull, personal communication to the writer, dated February 9, 1967.

CHAPTER V

SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

Summary

In its broadest sense, this study deals with development planning in poor countries. In these newly-independent countries, governments are committed to hastening the process of modernization, relying primarily on development planning. This approach is the response to the "revolution of rising expectations" amongst their peoples. This study, however, covers only one aspect of human resources development to support development planning. Specifically, it is concerned with the formulation of an appropriate and logical set of strategies in the establishment of educational systems for community planning.

Two reasons have been advanced by other writers as to why poor countries should consider establishing their own systems of community planning education. First, it has been pointed out that one of the weaknesses of development planning in these countries is the lack of coordination between social and economic planning, on the one hand, and physical planning, on the other. This may be attributed in part to the absence of trained community planners. However, it has also been pointed out that the lack of trained planners is a universal problem. Secondly, there is a growing recognition that the problems of community planning are different from those of the highly-industrialized countries in the West. Therefore, the argument is that, aside from the high cost involved, education obtained from planning schools in the West is not entirely suitable to the needs of the poor countries.

As noted in Chapter II, several countries in Africa, Asia, the Near East, and Latin America have already inaugurated educational programs in community planning. While there is very little information about them, it is suspected that these new institutions were established under wrong assumptions. The purpose of this study is to raise what is believed crucial issues in the establishment of these institutions. It is hoped that in raising these issues, policy-makers in poor countries, especially their educational leaders, would become more conscious of the implications of their decisions. These leaders should become more aware that there are genuine limits to education. In poor countries with limited resources, efforts should be made to devise administrative strategies that would mitigate and possibly solve current problems, rather than add further problems.

The thesis of this study is that education for community planning in poor countries, to be effective, must relate to the development process at all levels of government and to the educational system. The two assumptions are: (1) Each of the poor countries must evolve their own program of manpower education, in which education for community planning is but a part, in the light of its social and economic goals; and (2) Education for community planning in poor countries must inter-lock with the social and economic planning process of each country.

If these assumptions are correct, it follows that each poor country could design a set of suitable and logical strategies for establishing its own educational program for community planning. The strategies would relate directly to the

level of development of the country. In this study, three sets of strategies were formulated. They had been derived from a typology of strategies for over-all human resource development devised by Harbison and Myers.¹ Education, both in the Harbison and Myers typology and in those formulated in this study, is construed broadly to include formal education, on-the-job training, informal as well as formal adult education. Recognition is given due regard on the absorptive capacity of the main employer in the country - the government, as well as on the proper role of foreign technical assistance experts.

The essence of the three set of logical strategies is as follows:

For Level I countries, emphasis would be placed on in-service or on-the-job training, utilization of expatriate personnel to man most of the high-level positions, mass education through community development schemes, and acquisition of professional training abroad.

For Level II countries, the initiation of a sub-professional training program is recommended. Cooperative effort between the training institution and the planning agencies in research and teaching would be fostered. The in-service training program would be extended to local government levels. Expatriate personnel would now be limited. Promising graduates of the sub-professional program would be sent abroad for advanced training. Short-term observation tours would be arranged for civil servants in semi-advanced and advanced countries.

¹Supra., Chapter II.

For Level III countries, the establishment of a professional school would be warranted. Research and consulting services would become a regular function of the professional school. Professional organizations and associations might be encouraged and supported at this point. Foreign consultants on short-term basis or for highly selected projects would be the rule. Post-graduate training as well observation tours abroad by civil servants would be for limited numbers.

To test the utility of the foregoing construct, two case studies were conducted. The first case study dealt with the response of Ghanaian officials to a recommendation of a United Nations Housing Mission to establish a school of community planners.² The second related to the creation of a Division of Regional and City Planning at the Bandung Institute of Technology in Indonesia.³

This study considers that in both instances, the strategy adopted by either Ghana or Indonesia was not suitable to their level of development. Both countries established a professional program. In Ghana, a School of Architecture, Town Planning and Building Technology was established first. The School offered a four-year bachelor's program in the fields of architecture, town planning and building technology. An Institute for Community Planning was created later to train local planning assistants. Subsequently, the Institute was merged with the School, while the latter was reorganized into a Faculty of Architecture. The Faculty now offers an undergraduate as well as a graduate degree in urban and regional planning.

²Supra, Chapter III.

³Supra, Chapter IV.

These degree programs are oriented more to the requirements of a professional association in England. In Indonesia a new five-year professional program has been designed. This program hopes to provide a link between national development planning and urban planning; it is meant to serve not only Indonesia but all of Southeast Asia. Both programs have originally been conceived to suit the particular needs of the country in which each has been established. Both programs are attached to a university; in Ghana to a Faculty of Architecture, while in Indonesia, the leading engineering university.

Conclusions

Development planning in poor countries, as shown by our two case studies, and Richard L. Meier and others recognize, "cannot be dissociated from the methods of modern public administration and constructive politics."⁴ This seems obvious enough. But it bears repeating again and again; especially for those who assume responsibilities for creating supporting institutions to achieve development and modernization as rapidly as possible.

The above suggests a different form of reorganization and reform in the realm of public affairs. The innovators in the poor countries must chart novel pathways if they wish to have their reorganizations and reforms become effective.

⁴Richard L. Meier, Developmental Planning (New York: McGraw-Hill, Inc., 1965), p. x.

For they simply cannot rely on the pattern that has gradually evolved in the West. Philip M. Hauser's perceptive analysis of the contrast between urbanization in Asia and the West applies with equal force to all poor countries in Africa and Latin-America as well.

There are many reasons to assume that urbanization in Asia may involve quite different patterns of development and interrelationships with economic development than those observed in the West. These reasons include differences between the situation at the present time, when Asia is attempting to accelerate economic development and especially industrialization, and the situation one or two centuries ago when the European and American nations experienced the industrial revolution.

Among these differences are: basic differences arising from the fact that present urban development in many countries of Asia is largely an outgrowth of colonialism, and in large measure, reflects the troubled conditions of post-war adjustment and newly-won independence; differences in the extent to which central planning and government interventionism, as contrasted with the free market economy, may be expected to operate in Asian economic development; differences in the state of industrial and agricultural technology in the 20th, as contrasted with the 18th and 19th centuries; differences in the ratio of population to resources and the availability of open lands for surplus population emigration; differences in basic outlook and value systems between Asia and the West; and significant differences in the total world situation - economic, social and political, at the present time as contrasted with the 18th and 19th centuries.⁵

With particular reference to education for community planning, the new enterprise called for in poor countries, seems to be in the larger rubric of public affairs. This

⁵Philip M. Hauser (ed.), Urbanization in Asia and the Far East (Calcutta: UNESCO Research Centre on the Social Implications of Industrialization in Southern Asia, 1957), p. 31. See also Philip M. Hauser (ed.), Urbanization in Latin America (New York: International Documents Service, 1961).

approach has been espoused also in the United States particularly by Robert A. Walker,⁶ John D. Millett,⁷ John M. Gaus,⁸ and Harvey S. Perloff.⁹ The United Nations seminar on training for town and country planning held in Puerto Rico in 1956 came to the same conclusion.¹⁰ Gaus expresses succinctly the relevance of this approach:

Planning is the effort to improve the making of decisions....Planning is not...a general political theory, or a doctrine of public functions and powers, but a process, I repeat, of facilitating better decision-making. It is not in itself an assurance of good or bad policies or programs or operating; it may be well done or badly done; it seems to me inherent in the larger process of government.¹¹

If this approach is accepted, the task of formulating an appropriate set of strategies for planning education should proceed along the lines developed in this study. In relation to these strategies, two points deserve further comment.

⁶Robert A. Walker, The Planning Function in Urban Government, 2nd ed. (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1950).

⁷John D. Millett, The Process and Organization of Government Planning (New York: Columbia University Press, 1947).

⁸John M. Gaus, "Education for the Emerging Field of Regional Planning and Development," Social Forces, Vol. 29, No. 3 (March 1951), pp. 229-237.

⁹Harvey S. Perloff, Education for Planning: City, State, & Regional (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Press, 1957).

¹⁰Training for Town and Country Planning (New York: United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs, 1957).

¹¹Gaus, op. cit., p. 230.

Firstly, why should there be a careful choice on the set of strategies? Secondly, how may such strategies be translated into administrative action? As regards the first point, it should be recognized that there are genuine limits in investment education and in this context the main one is on the very low capacity to absorb the products of schools in poor countries.¹² This is well put in the essay of Philip J. Foster.

There is a tendency to talk of the "needs" for development as if they were quite independent of the actual structure of job opportunities in the economy. This is daring planning, but it need hardly be said that if the rate of growth of the economy is not sufficient to absorb the products of a vastly expanded educational system, then the unemployment situation will become even worse. The production of large numbers of specifically trained individual does not, at the same time, create employment opportunities for them¹³

This had been the case in Indonesia as this study shows.¹⁴

This leads us to our second point. Foster offers us a fruitful scheme for translating our strategies into administrative action. He asks us to "think small" as he suggests the following:

- (1) to ascertain where government activity in the field of education can make a contribution and where it cannot;

¹²Supra, Chapter II.

¹³Philip J. Foster, "The Vocational School Fallacy in Development Planning" in C. Arnold Anderson and Mary Jean Bowman (eds.), Education and Economic Development (Chicago: Aldine Publishing Co., 1965), p. 153.

¹⁴Supra, Chapter IV.

- (2) to identify potential situations in which other agencies can with adequate inducements take over a large number of educational functions; and
- (3) above all, to indicate what are the comparative advantages and limitations of various types of educational programs, in the schools and outside of them, in economic growth.¹⁵

The foregoing suggestion should be a pre-requisite then before moving into the creation of a new centre for planning education.¹⁶ For it may turn out that the set of strategies may well be a problem of "internal programming" since government is the only employer of planning personnel in most developing countries. The job-analysis approach discussed in Chapter II would then become a useful tool. This approach, it seems to us, is not only realistic but quite easy to administer.

The Bandung School's emphasis on public finance and implementation is a step in the right direction. As the planners will be working in large organizations, it is proper that they must be familiar with organization and management techniques and concepts. Further, since they are to be concerned with influencing human behavior to effect physical changes, they should be equipped with communications skills and they should have a good understanding of the dynamics of social change.

In a sense the poor countries are fortunate because in education for community planning they have a variety of choices:

¹⁵Foster, op. cit., p. 162.

¹⁶Cf. William A. Doebele, Jr., "Education for Planning in Developing Countries," The Town Planning Review, Vol. xxxiii, No. 2 (July 1962), p. 99.

import professional planners, send students for foreign training, or create their own schools.¹⁷ Within their own country, the educators could rely on universities, on-the-job training, or create new institutes or research centers. They also have the opportunity to move into new ways of teaching community planning. But these opportunities impose tremendous responsibilities as well. This study has tried to show what those responsibilities would be. For clearly the demand seems to be a new profession for positions which are still in the making.

Lessons for Developing Countries

Despite the fact that a number of poor countries have already established formal educational programs on community planning, very little has been written on such pioneering efforts. And whatever has been written for international consumption has been done by former foreign consultants, generally associated with institutions of higher learning. Understandably the emphasis of these writers is on the role of universities in planning education and on the enhancement of the planning profession. In short, while we have been enlightened on what the future sponsoring or parent university institutions should do, we are still in the dark on what the host or recipient country must do.

In concluding this study, therefore, we shall offer some

¹⁷W. Alonso and F. W. Ledger, "The Education of Town and Regional Planners in Developing Countries," Journal of the Town Planning Institute, Vol. 51, No. 9 (November 1965), pp. 364-368.

guidelines to poor countries which are contemplating to establish educational systems on community planning. These guidelines should be treated as tentative and may well be considered as an agenda for future research.

Inasmuch as poor countries usually are committed to national development planning, the point of departure for preparing for community planning education should be this fact. The second most important consideration is that planning in poor countries is basically government planning. The third consideration is that education in poor countries should be broadly construed to include both formal education and adult education. Finally, the source of trained personnel for poor countries is not limited to their nationals but extends to foreign countries by reason of an expanded international technical assistance program.

Given such factors, the process of preparing for community planning education should proceed along the following lines:

1. A determined effort should be made to clarify development goals, establish priorities in programs and projects, identify the social, economic, and physical planning components of each program and project. From this exercise there should emerge the physical planning requirements peculiar to the country.

2. An analysis of the planning machinery comes next. This analysis should show whether the public administration system is organized to carry out most effectively the

development programs and projects. It should clarify the powers and responsibilities among the various levels in the government. It should further identify the relationship between administrative and political units within the same governmental level. Most importantly, this analysis should identify the political and administrative units which are concerned with physical planning.

3. A job analysis of positions in physical planning units will then have to be made. Through this job analysis will emerge the required attitudes, knowledge and skills so that the duties and responsibilities inherent in each position will be performed efficiently and well. From the job analysis also will be found the total personnel requirements for every physical planning unit at all governmental levels. Only after this has been done could an educational and training program be formulated.

4. An evaluation of the country's manpower resources comes next. The purpose of this evaluation is to arrive at the most logical strategy for filling the positions which have been determined through job analysis. What positions may be filled by local personnel? What should be filled by expatriates? What educational and training facilities are currently available? What additional facilities would be required? How many and what classes of government and prospective government personnel should be sent abroad for planning education?

5. Whatever educational and training arrangements would be made, the job analysis findings should provide a sound guide to the emphasis of knowledge, skills and attitudes to be imparted to students or trainees. Logic suggests that close collaboration will be needed between the educational and training institutions and the government units entrusted with community planning in terms of who should teach, what is to be taught, who shall be taught.

The most dominant feature of the foregoing scheme is the firm link between practice and theory, and both emerging from the peculiar requirements of the country. As the national goals change or the priorities on programs and projects change the entire process discussed above changes accordingly. The educational and training focus moves with the changes in practice.

Limitations of the Study and an Agenda for Further Studies

A typology of logical strategies for planning education has been formulated in this study for poor countries in three general levels of development. This construct had been tested against the experience of only two countries and both of them fall under the second level of development as defined herein. To gain greater confidence in the utility and relevance of this construct, it is desirable to extend the coverage of the case studies in other countries falling under the first and third levels of development.

Subsequent studies in this area should be conducted on an intensive basis. One of the weaknesses of the present study is

its almost complete reliance on materials written by foreign consultants or those supplied by the technical assistance agencies. It is not far-fetched to suggest that the critical decisions in the setting up of planning education systems had been made or would be made by officials of the host governments. Therefore, the decision-making process within the host governments could be a separate study by itself. It is suggested that a fruitful approach for this type of study would be the interview method. Such a study would be able to show the importance of individual personalities or particular agencies in the total administrative machinery.

Another area for further study would be the career patterns of the graduates of the newly-established planning schools. A well-designed mail-questionnaire, supplemented by interviews of a sample of the graduates would shed light on such significant items as: the relevance of the school curriculum and the teaching methods to the actual job requirements; the degree of satisfaction of the employers on the performance and ability of the graduates; the field where refresher courses, specialized seminars, or further training should be conducted.

Quite related to the foregoing would be a study on the administrative arrangements that would lead to the most effective manner of training and/or performing research. In this area of research, the main issue to be resolved would be to determine whether the planning school should be an administratively independent agency, or as a regular department in a university, or as a unit of one of the regular departments of government.

Another concern in this area of course is to locate the planning school where it would attain the greatest impact on influencing decision-makers in community planning. It may be postulated that while no common administrative arrangement could be prescribed, nonetheless the success of the planning school would be directly related to its ability to have its graduates gain easy entry to the civil service. This type of study would perhaps be best undertaken by students of educational or public administration.

It has been mentioned in this study that there is a growing belief that training in community planning obtained from abroad, especially from the highly industrialized countries, is not suitable to the needs of the poor countries. A similar study along the lines outlined for graduates of newly-established planning schools should be made to test the validity of this belief. This could then lead to a comparative study of the relative merits and disadvantages of local and foreign training. Such a study could lead to determining the proper proportion or combination of these two types of training.

Of great interest to planning educators would be to find out what concepts and techniques in community planning would be transferable from one culture to another and which ones are not. In this area, planners who have had the opportunity to serve in various countries should be encouraged to write their impressions perhaps in the form of autobiographies. Also, a study should be made to determine whether two-way visiting professorships and student exchange among planning schools would

assist in providing better information in this area.

As this study has shown, the establishment of new planning schools in poor countries is generally realized through international technical assistance schemes. Some experience must have been accumulated by now in this novel and exciting experiment and perhaps a study of this field of international technical assistance is now ripe. This study could be done along the method followed by Edward Weidner on his assessment of the establishment of institutes of public administration in various countries of the world.¹⁸ Such a study should provide a basis to support the contention of one of the active participants in this international venture that: "Education for physical planning may well become a technique of priming the pump with which to activate and continue the process of development."¹⁹

¹⁸Edward W. Weidner, Technical Assistance In Public Administration Overseas: The Case In Development Administration (Chicago: Public Administration Service, 1964).

¹⁹Professor H. Peter Oberlander, "Education for Physical Planning: A Pump Priming Process," Journal of the Town Planning Institute, Vol. 50, No. 1 (January 1964), p. 20.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Public Documents

- Ghana. Office of the Planning Commission. Second Development Plan 1959-64.
- Ghana. Office of the Planning Commission. Seven-Year Plan for National Reconstruction and Development - Financial Years 1963/64-1969/70.
- Great Britain. Ministry of Town and Country Planning. Report of the Committee on Qualifications of Planners. Cmd. 8059. 1950. Reprinted 1964.
- United Nations. Department of Economic and Social Affairs. A Report on the Establishment, Organization and Administration of an Institute for Community Planning. Report No. TAO/Gha/6. New York, February 2, 1960.
- United Nations. Department of Economic and Social Affairs. International Action in Asia and the Far East. Housing, Building and Planning No. 9. ST/SOA/SER.C/9. New York, 1955.
- United Nations. Department of Economic and Social Affairs. Training for Town and Country Planning. Housing, Building and Planning No. 11. ST/SOA/SER. C/11. New York, 1957.
- United Nations. Department of Economic and Social Affairs. Regional Planning. Housing, Building and Planning Nos. 12 & 13. ST/SOA/SER. C/12 & 13. New York, 1959.
- United Nations. General Assembly. Resolution 1710 (XVI).
- United Nations. Office of Public Information. The United Nations Development Decade at Mid-Point: An Appraisal by the Secretary-General. New York, 1965.
- United Nations. Report on the United Nations Conference on the Application of Science and Technology for the Benefit of the Less Developed Areas. Science and Technology for Development. World of Opportunity. Vol. I. New York, 1963.
- United Nations. Technical Assistance Programme. Housing in Ghana. ST/TAA/K/GHANA/1. New York, 1957.

United Nations. Technical Assistance Programme. Report on Housing in the Gold Coast. TAA/GOC/1, Add. 1. New York, 1956.

Books

Abrams, Charles. Man's Struggle for Shelter in an Urbanizing World. Cambridge, Mass.: The MIT Press, 1964.

Anderson, C. Arnold and Mary Jean Bowman (eds.). Education and Economic Development. Chicago: Aldine Publishing Co., 1965.

Apter, David E. Ghana in Transition. Originally published by Princeton University Press as the Gold Coast in Transition. New York: Atheneum, 1963.

Breese, Gerald. Urbanization in Newly Developing Countries. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1966.

Dahl, Robert A. and Charles E. Lindblom. Politics, Economics and Welfare: Planning and Politico-Economic Systems Resolved into Basic Social Processes. New York: Harper & Row Publishers, 1963.

Eisenstadt, S. N. Modernization: Protest and Change. Englewood Cliffs, N. J.: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1966.

Harbison, Frederick and Charles A. Myers. Education, Manpower and Economic Growth: Strategies of Human Resources Development. New York: McGraw-Hill Book Co., 1964.

Harbison, Frederick and Charles A. Myers. Manpower and Education: Country Studies in Economic Development. New York: McGraw-Hill Book Co., 1965.

Hauser, Philip M. (ed.). Urbanization in Asia and the Far East. Calcutta: Unesco Research Centre, 1957.

Hauser, Philip M. (ed.). Urbanization in Latin America. New York: International Documents Service, 1961.

Higgins, Benjamin with Jean Higgins. Indonesia: The Crisis of the Millstones. Princeton, N.J.: D. Van Nostrand Co., Inc., 1963.

Little, Kenneth. West African Urbanization: A Study of Voluntary Associations in Social Change. Cambridge, England: The University Press, 1965.

Martin, Roscoe C. (ed.). Public Administration and Democracy. Essays in honor of Paul H. Appleby. Syracuse, N.Y.: Syracuse University Press, 1965.

- Mead, Margaret (ed.). Cultural Patterns and Technical Change. A manual prepared by the World Federation for Mental Health. New York: The New America Library, 1963.
- Meier, Richard L. Developmental Planning. New York: McGraw-Hill Book Co., 1965.
- Millett, John D. The Process and Organization of Government Planning. New York: Columbia University Press, 1947.
- Niculescu, Barbu. Colonial Planning - A Comparative Study. London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd., 1958.
- Perloff, Harvey S. Education for Planning: City, State and Regional. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Press, 1957.
- Rodwin, Lloyd. The British New Towns Policy. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1956.
- Selosoemardjan. Social Changes in Jogjakarta. Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press, 1962.
- Spicer, Edward H. (ed.). Human Problems in Technological Change: A Casebook. New York: Russell Sage Foundation, 1952.
- Ward, Barbara. The Rich Nations and the Poor Nations, New York: W. W. Norton & Co., Inc., 1962.
- Ward, W.E.F. A History of Ghana. revised 3rd ed., London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd., 1966.
- Walker, Robert A. The Planning Function in Urban Government. second edition. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1950.
- Watts, Kenneth. How to Make an Urban Planning Survey Based on Djakarta, Indonesia. Bandung: Institute of Technology, 1961.
- Wolf, Charles, Jr. The Indonesian Story: The Birth, Growth and of the Indonesian Republic. Issued under the auspices of the American Institute of Pacific Relations. New York: The John Day Co., 1948.
- Yale University. South East Asia Studies. Entrepreneurship and Labor Skills in Indonesian Economic Development: A Symposium. Monograph Series No. 1. New Haven: 1961.

Articles and Periodicals

- Adams, Frederick J. "The Status of Planning and Planning Education" in Training for Town and Country Planning, ST/SOA/SER. C/11 (New York, United Nations, 1957), 37-44.

- Alcock, Alfred E.S., "The Application of Regional Planning Techniques to Rural Development Programmes" in Regional Planning, ST/SOA/SER. C/12 & 13 (New York, United Nations, 1959), 71-80.
- Allen, J. S., "Educating the Planners," Journal of the Town Planning Institute, 49:10 (December 1963), 361-367.
- Alonso, W. and F. W. Ledgar. "The Education of Town and Regional Planners in Developing Countries," Journal of the Town Planning Institute, 51:9 (November 1965), 364-368.
- Arena. Kumasi Special Issue, 82:904 (July/August 1966).
- Bailey, Stephen K. "The Place and Functioning of a Planning Agency within the Government Organization of Developing Countries," United Nations Conference on the Application of Science and Technology, Paper E/CONF. 39/H/82, November 1962.
- Boulding, Kenneth. "The United States and Revolution" in part in Richard L. Meier, Developmental Planning (New York: McGraw-Hill Book Co., 1965), vii-ix.
- "Business Report on Indonesia," Far East Trade and Development, 21:12 (December 1966), 1311 ff.
- Doxiades, C.A. "Ekistics - The Science of Human Settlements," Paper presented at Town and Country Planning Summer School, September 2, 1959, Southampton.
- Foster, Philip J. "The Vocational School Fallacy in Development Planning" in C. Arnold Anderson and Mary Jean Bowman (eds.), Education and Economic Development (Chicago: Aldine Publishing Co., 1965), 142-166.
- Doebele, William, Jr. A. "Education for Planning in Developing Countries," Town Planning Review, xxxiii:2 (July 1962), 95-114.
- Glass, Ruth. "The Evaluation of Planning - Some Sociological Considerations" in Regional Planning, ST/SOA/SER. C/12 & 13 (New York, United Nations, 1959), 51-57.
- Gaus, John M. "Education for the Emerging Field of Regional Planning and Development," Social Forces, 29:3 (March 1951), 299-237.
- Glassburner, Bruce. "High-level Manpower for Economic Development: The Indonesian Experience" in Frederick Harbison and Charles A. Myers (eds.), Manpower and Education: Country Studies in Economic Development (New York: McGraw-Hill Book Co., 1965), 173-201.

- Haar, Charles, Benjamin Higgins and Lloyd Rodwin. "Economic and Physical Planning: Coordination in Developing Areas," Journal of the American Institute of Planners, 24:3 (1958), 167-173.
- Harbison, Frederick. "Education for Development" in Technology and Economic Development, A Scientific American Book (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1963), 95-104.
- Higgins, Benjamin, "Introduction" in Yale University Southeast Asia Studies, Entrepreneurship and Labor Skills in Indonesian Economic Development: A Symposium, Monograph Series No. 1 (New Haven, 1961), 1-38.
- Ledgar, F. W. "Job Opportunities in Indonesian Planning," Australian Planning Institute Journal, 3:4 (April 1965), 138-139.
- Lev, Daniel S. "Indoneisa 1965: The Year of the Coup," Asian Survey, VI:2 (February 1966), 103-110.
- Lewis, Arthur W. "Education and Economic Development," International Social Science Journal, XIV:4 (1962), 685-699.
- Markovitz, Irving and Jon Kraus. "Ghana without Nkrumah," Africa Report, 11:4 (April 1966), 10-20.
- Mason, Edward S. "The Planning of Development" in Technology and Economic Development, A Scientific American Book (New York: Alfred S. Knopf, 1963), 181-194.
- May, Richard, Jr. "Meeting the Rapidly Expanding Need for Technical Planning Services," Bulletin of the Association of Collegiate Schools of Planning, 4:4 (Winter 1966), 1-4.
- Oberlander, H. Peter. "Education for Physical Planning: A Pump-priming Process," Journal of the Town Planning Institute, 50:1 (January 1964), 18-20.
- Oberlander, H. Peter, "Planning Education for Newly-Independent Countries," Journal of the American Institute of Planners, xxxviii:2 (May 1962), 116-123.
- Pauker, Guy J. "Indonesia: The Year of Transition," Asian Survey, VII:2 (February 1967), 138-150.
- Rodwin, Lloyd. "Current Developments in Regional Planning" in Regional Planning, ST/SOA/SER. C/12 & 13 (New York, United Nations, 1959), 45-51.
- Rodwin, Lloyd. "The Achilles Heel of British Town Planning" in his The British New Towns Policy (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1956), 187-201.

- Stone, Donald C. "Public Administration and Nation-building" in Roscoe C. Martin (ed.), Public Administration and Democracy, Essays in honor of Paul H. Appleby (Syracuse, N.Y.: Syracuse University Press, 1965), 245-265.
- Vagaly, L. R. "Thoughts on Urban and Regional Planning Education in India," A paper read before International Seminar on the Architect and the Community, India International Centre, New Delhi, February 14-50, 1965.
- van der Kroef, Justus M. "Indonesian Communism and the Changing Balance of Power," Pacific Affairs, XXXVII: 4 (Winter 1964-65), 357-383.
- Weissmann, Ernest. "The Problems of Urbanism in the Less Developed Countries," Paper read before the Conference on Urban Planning and Development, Ford Foundation, New York, October 10-11, 1956.
- Weissmann, Ernest. "Significance of Planning in Economic and Social Development" in Training for Town and Country Planning, ST/SOA/SER. C/11 (New York, United Nations, 1957), 4-7.
- Woodbury, Coleman. "Urban Development and Planning in the United States," Paper read before the Conference on Urban Planning and Development, Ford Foundation, New York, October 10-11, 1956.
- Yudelman, M. "Problems of Raising African Agricultural Productivity," in William B. Hamilton (ed.), The Transfer of Institutions (Durham, N.C.: Duke University Commonwealth Studies Center, 1964), 260-302.

Reports

- Conference on Urban Planning and Development, "Abridged Transcript," Ford Foundation, October 10-11, 1956. (Mimeographed.)
- Gardner-Medwin, R. and J.A.L. Matheson. "Report to the Council of Kumasi College of Technology, Gold Coast, on Professional Education in Subjects Allied to Building." Kumasi, Ghana, 1956. (Mimeographed.)
- S.I.A.P. Inter-American Planning Society for Education Planning in Latin America: Summary Report. San Juan, Puerto Rico, 1961.
- United Nations Physical Planning Mission. "Report on the Training of Planning Personnel and the Undertaking of Research in the Field of Regional Planning." Accra, Ghana, 1962. (Mimeographed.)

United States Economic Survey Team to Indonesia. Indonesia: Perspectives and Proposals for United States Economic Aid. A report to the President of the United States. New Haven: Yale University Southeast Asia Studies, 1963.

Other Sources

Bandung Institute of Technology. "Memorandum Concerning the Proposed New Department of Regional and City Planning." May 1959. (Mimeographed.)

Bandung Institut Teknologi. Bagian Tata Pembangunan Daerah & Kota. (brochure. n.d.)

Kumasi College of Technology. School of Architecture, Town Planning and Building. Information - Architecture, Town Planning, Building Technology. 1958.

Technical College, Ibadan, Nigeria. "Syllabus for Diploma Course for Town Planning Assistants," Town Planning Course, Department of Civil and Building Engineering, January 1965. (Mimeographed.)

University of Science and Technology, Faculty of Architecture, "Physical Planning Diploma Course" leaflet. Kumasi, Ghana, 1 December 1966. (Mimeographed.)

University of Science and Technology. Faculty of Architecture. Physical Planning Diploma Course Year III. "Report on the July 1966 Field Session at Medina, Ghana", October 1966. (Mimeographed.)

University of British Columbia. Interview with Amjad A. B. Rizvi, faculty member on leave, Faculty of Architecture and Town Planning, West Pakistan University of Engineering and Technology, February 26, 1967.

University of British Columbia. Interview with Prof. H. Peter Oberlander, Chairman, Division of Community and Regional Planning, Faculty of Graduate Studies, March 16, 1967.

W. G. Faithfull, U.N. consultant on training for urban and regional planning, Philippines, personal communication, dated February 9, 1967.