JOHN COLLIER AND THE PROTESTANT CHURCHES

by

SUSAN LECOMPT STACEY

B.A., Whitworth College (Spokane, Washington), 1971

A THESIS SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT OF
THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF
MASTER OF ARTS:
in the Department
of
History

We accept this thesis as conforming to the
required standard

THE UNIVERSITY OF BRITISH COLUMBIA
December, 1973
In presenting this thesis in partial fulfilment of the requirements for an advanced degree at the University of British Columbia, I agree that the Library shall make it freely available for reference and study. I further agree that permission for extensive copying of this thesis for scholarly purposes may be granted by the Head of my Department or by his representatives. It is understood that copying or publication of this thesis for financial gain shall not be allowed without my written permission.

Department of History

The University of British Columbia
Vancouver 8, Canada

Date December 5, 1973
ABSTRACT

In 1933 President Franklin Roosevelt appointed John Collier to the post of United States Indian Commissioner. Collier had been a social worker in New York City and California during the early twentieth century, but the effects of the industrial mode of life that he constantly witnessed made him extremely pessimistic about the ability of the modern world to foster and sustain any type of healthy social system. In the early 1920's he was the guest of the Taos Pueblos Indian tribe for several months, and during his stay with these native Americans he was deeply impressed by their genius at maintaining, in the face of nearly overwhelming pressure, a culture whose primary function was the creation and sustenance of well-balanced individual and group personalities. Throughout the 1920's he incessantly battled against any legislation, executive order, or social or economic pressure that was endangering what he saw to be one of the last truly humane civilizations on earth. When he became Commissioner, he instituted a program designed to revive the tribal structures, their power and status systems, their languages, their religions, and all other vital aspects of their existence. He backed this up with a comprehensive plan for economic, educational, and health improvement so that the natives would be able to solidly entrench themselves in the type of life they desired.

One group who opposed this policy of Collier's were the Protestant missionaries who labored among the aborigines. From the earliest days of their missions they had set themselves
to the task of "civilizing" the Indian and helping him to assimilate into the larger American society where he could more easily and more effectively function as a Christian. They were therefore dismayed by Collier's attempt to promote segregation, isolation, and a return to the original lifestyles, although they did come to approve of the other aspects of his work.

This thesis examines Collier's philosophy and program of Indian administration through his own writings and through executive reports, explores the depth and importance of their Indian missions to the Protestant churches, and then sets forth and analyzes the negative Protestant reaction to Collier's Commissionership. It attempts to explore the nature of a confrontation between two powerful forces in American life.

The general conclusion that emerges from this work is that Collier's appointment marks the first real break in the cooperation of church and state in Indian affairs. Collier began a secularization of the office that has continued to the present day. The missionaries recognized the implication of this secularization for their own future and responded accordingly. Both sides had rallied around ideological standards (the church was committed to its theology, Collier to his sociological beliefs) and neither could nor would give way. Thus the missionaries tended to work themselves out of a major role in the management of Indian affairs.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION 1

Chapter

I. THE ESSENTIAL JOHN COLLIER 4
II. THE INDIANS' CHAMPION 21
III. THE NEW DEAL FOR THE INDIANS 34
IV. INDIANS AND MISSIONARIES 50
V. THE MISSIONARY RESPONSE TO COLLIER 82

CONCLUSIONS 118

BIBLIOGRAPHY 122
INTRODUCTION

This thesis explains and analyzes the reaction of the Protestant churches to the United States Indian policy which John Collier developed and vigorously promoted during his years as Indian Commissioner (1933 to 1945). The time period and the various topics involved in this research offer many and alluring temptations for digression, but three themes will remain the center of attention. The first is Collier himself, the second is the background of church involvement in Indian affairs, and the third is the manner in which the Protestant churches responded to Collier's vision of the native American's role in American society.

The first few chapters will examine John Collier's life and thought. Involved in social work throughout his career, it was Collier's passion for the Indians which propelled him into one of the highest bureaucratic positions in Washington, D.C., and which set him on the same stage as many of the great names of our century. He never considered himself primarily a public man, however, and it was always the inner, philosophic self which he cultivated most carefully. From this meditative penchant and from his long and often frustrating toil in community work he developed a world view in which he saw a distinct and critical place for the Indians. Faithful to his vision, he was impervious to the claims of land and money interests and to the theories of those who believed that there were other ways to order Indian affairs. Almost fanatically unwilling to compromise his beliefs, it was inevitable that he would meet stiff
The study of these churches is not based on individual Protestants, whether prominent or not, and the beliefs they may have held, although such individuals may be used to illustrate some particular point. It is with the institutional church that the next few chapters are concerned. Furthermore this research does not necessarily include each and every sect encompassed within the Protestant faith as not all were significantly entangled in Indian affairs. It does include those prominent religious organizations whose credal statements place them within the Protestant pale and whose crusading instincts led them to the Indians. These institutions were busily engaged in philosophizing about, ministering to, and planning for the native population from the day the first European settler climbed out of his ship. From decade to decade and within various groups the theories about what should be done with the aborigines differed, but the general consensus was that some sort of interference in the Indian life was necessary. There gradually developed a close working relationship between government and church in matters of Indian policy to the point where the religious partner could often choose those who were to function in the civil capacities.

With the advent of Collier's program, however, the missionary was somewhat unceremoniously evicted from his sphere of influence and self-determination for the Indian was the order of the day. The last chapter deals with the way in which
the churches coped with this situation; it describes their initial reaction, the process of adjustment, and the final resolution.

This thesis is not intended to be a biography of Collier or a study of Indian policy. It is rather an examination of how one of the major institutions of American life met a challenge on a social issue posed by a powerfully unorthodox man in an unsettled and uncertain time.
CHAPTER I
THE ESSENTIAL JOHN COLLIER

To write of a high government official whose stated policy and driving ambition was the promotion of racial segregation would likely indicate a thesis on some personality out of the late nineteenth century, especially if he were known to have been born and reared in the deep South. John Collier, however, was a man of the twentieth century, whose political contemporaries were not the fathers of Jim Crow: but those same men who shaped Franklin Roosevelt's New Deal. Furthermore it was the Indian whom he wished to segregate. By pursuing such a policy he hoped to shield them from the destructive elements of European culture, both to ensure the Indian the right to choose his own life-style and to conserve for America a reservoir of alternative social structures and philosophies from which to draw if her own proved incapable of supplying the needs of the rest of her peoples.

It is difficult to categorize Collier as a member of any particular social or political movement. A short narrative of his family background and of his career would probably be more useful in showing how he fitted into the structure and temper of his times.

He was born into a large and prominent Georgia family—his father was a banker who served as mayor of Atlanta, as president of the Cotton States Exposition of 1895, and as a leading member of several major Southern organizations. Collier, however, lost both of his parents fairly early in
life. After his mother's death in 1897, when he was thirteen, he attended a convent school in rural Georgia. When his father died in 1900, he returned to Atlanta to finish high school and then spent many months camping in the Appalachians and living with mountain people. In 1902 he enrolled in Columbia University in New York to study literature and biology.¹

While in New York Collier became involved with a social set that included many of the prominent intellectuals of early twentieth century America, and in such an environment he was exposed to many of the popular philosophical stances of the day. During this same period he participated in various humanitarian projects, none of which met with any remarkable success. In 1907 he attended the College de France in order to study under some of the most prominent psychologists of that period. The next year he returned to the United States by way of Boston where he was appalled by the lack of any kind of facilities for dealing with the problems of the immigrants who were streaming into the country in massive numbers. From 1908 to 1920, therefore, his energies were devoted to community work in New York City.²

Most of this time was spent in association with The People's Institute, an organization intended to function "as a medium of adult education and a free forum for the discussion of weighty questions in politics, literature, economics and sociology" and which hoped to reduce misunderstandings between people of differing classes and political leanings.³ Collier joined the Institute as its civic secretary and as editor of
its newspaper, and while on the staff did extensive research into the commercial amusements available to the public, the conditions of child life in the city, and the training of social workers. During this time he wrote widely in all these fields and was instrumental in the establishment of the National Board of Censorship for films.4

After World War I many of the programs in which Collier had participated faded away for lack of funds and encouragement. He therefore accepted an offer to become the director of adult education for the State of California. His educational theory and techniques did not meet with official approval, however, so in November, 1920, he resigned his position and left for the wilderness of the Sonora Mountains of Mexico. While on his way south, he received letters from a friend living in Taos, New Mexico, urging him to visit her. Intending to stay only a few days, the Colliers spent approximately eight months there.5

Collier's friend was a New Yorker who had married one of the leaders of the Taos Pueblos, and it was she and her husband who introduced the future Indian Commissioner to these Indians and their life-style. To Collier, Taos seemed like a new world:

The discovery that came to me there, in that tiny group of a few hundred Indians, was of personality-forming institutions even now unweakened, which had survived repeated and immense historical shocks, and which were going right on in the production of states of mind, attitudes of mind, earth-loyalties and human loyalties, amid a context of beauty which suffused all the life of the group. What I observed and experienced was a power of art—of the life-making art—greater in kind than anything I had known in my own world before.6
He began to feel that all his previous endeavors, although they had failed to achieve their proposed aims, had prepared him to appreciate and understand the value of the Indian way of life: "...they led me to say within myself, with absolute finality about the Indians: This effort toward community must not fail; there can be no excuse or pardon if it fails."  

Although he returned to San Francisco during the 1921-1922 school year to teach social science at San Francisco State Teachers College, and although he at that time intended to make California his home, he devoted much time and thought to a study of the Indians. He grew especially sensitive to the acts of President Harding's Secretary of the Interior, Albert B. Fall, concerning Indian land and resources. When a friend offered to arrange financial support if he would resign his teaching position and work full-time for Indian rights, he did so.  

John Collier cannot be adequately presented by outlining the particulars of his life, however. While it is a perilous historical venture to try to fathom the depths of any personality, the fact that Collier left behind so many introspective writings makes it less presumptuous to try to determine the factors that motivated his actions. Besides a rather intensive autobiography which deals more with his beliefs and feelings than with the events of his life, he published several volumes of poetry and injected much of his personal philosophy into the books and magazine articles that he wrote throughout his career. The following paragraphs do not presume to offer
an incisive analysis of Collier's psyche, but rather present some of the dominant themes that he expressed in his more philosophic and poetical writings. This is done in the hope of revealing the nature and intensity of the moral principles which controlled his actions.

Orthodox religion was not a particularly significant element in Collier's life. He was reared in the Methodist church and spent two years of his adolescence at a Catholic boarding school, but he would not accept the Christian dogma: "Within Catholicism, I experienced nothing except wisdom and great human kindness. I passed out from Catholicism with no inward struggle, with no pain. Removing myself from Catholicism was removing myself from the absolutist God of any creed, any philosophy."9 Throughout his writings, he seems to regard the church only in its role as a social agency and secular power. Its spiritual aspects seem to have held little significance for him.10

Collier's panegyrics on nature could well lead some to believe that it was the untainted wilderness which claimed his spiritual loyalties. Indeed, he sounds like a prophet of the modern ecology passion:

Ecologically understood, our planet itself, with its atmosphere, waters, and soils, and all its animate life, is one single event. The event, in its multitudes, complexities and interdependencies, in its unexhausted potential and its inexhaustible ranges of liberty far exceeds the conceptual reach of any age prior to our own, and far exceeds our own age's conceptual and emotional reach, though it does not exceed our own age's contraecological power to destroy.11

Throughout his life story one constantly finds him headed off
for the solace of the wilds. "From my eighteenth year, I would go on foot for months of each summer across the southern Appalachians...the glorious, virgin forests still persisted there from before the days of the red men, or any man." After his failure in an early humanitarian project "...what I did was to depart to the mountains, equipped with nothing but a piece of canvas, a waterbag, a frying pan, a hatchet, and a knife. For about six months I lived in the wilderness of the southern Appalachians..." After seven years of work at the People's Institute, "I reviewed the gains and losses since 1908, and suddenly there swept over me the longing, experienced again and again in my life, for wilderness...Thereupon, I surrendered all positions and work connections, and with Lucy and our three sons...I departed to the North Carolina wilds. The year which ensued was filled with deep life, immersion into the silent quietude of the wilderness...." And, after his frustrations in California, "...I departed for the Sonora Mountains of Mexico. The family would camp there for a year or longer. It was the desert we wanted--the non-human wilderness." Statements such as these have led one critic to say that "If this is not animism, it borders intimately upon what the philosophers describe as pantheism. Consequently, it is logical for the one-time Indian Commissioner to deprecate Christian influences upon the aborigines and to exalt the primitive, pagan elements in their societies." Collier, however, was by no means the individualistic type of back-to-nature man; he had an inflexible belief in the
indispensable role of society in human existence. "Societies exist. They create a people's temperament, the world-view and the color and structure of personality among their members. They deep-dye the peoples...societies differ one from the other, they make the man. To individuals they are nurture, shaper, and fate."\textsuperscript{17}

He asserted that until the present century "mankind lived the determining part of its life in face-to-face, primary social groups: in village communities and federations of village communities," and that this manner of life was marked by "cooperation and reciprocity," by "the conserving and cherishing of earth and its flora and creature life," and by the type of education which was "the art of informing, enriching, tempering, and socializing the personality, and of internalizing the moral imperatives."\textsuperscript{18} In European culture, the local community has dissolved and has not been replaced by any more inclusive world community. He maintained that modern man is therefore a social isolate who must cope with an exploitive system which undermines cultures and value systems, devours natural resources, and constantly gambles in power conflicts which often lead to wars. Collier saw the only hope for peaceful, creative, and spiritually satisfying human existence in the re-attainment of local communities where "the fateful years of personality formation and attitude formation" could be lived out.\textsuperscript{19} His entire career in social work was dedicated to reviving or reconstructing such social structures.

Thus devotion to "the non-human wilderness" and to
human society were both fundamental elements in Collier's makeup, while religion had more or less been exorcised, but none of these factors could be pointed to as the controlling ethic of his life. Collier himself, however, had an analysis of what was:

Always it has appeared to me that there exists forever an inflow and outflow between the human being and the human being in groups, and between these and the world of nature. This consciousness of the union of man with man, and of the race of man with nature, with each thing and with all things and with the everything that is—this consciousness has been the living center of my life's philosophy.  

My own seventeenth-eighteenth year, succeeding upon the most lethal shock I have ever experienced [his father's suicide], was in its essence an emergence, by means of, and out past and beyond, all of experience that I had ever known: out past and beyond my own self, beyond visible, audible nature—an emergence into what seemed to myself to be a union with the spirit of the whole. Whether valid perception or illusion, that emergence proved to be my life's determinant—then (nearly sixty years ago) as now. Keeping one's mind and one's practical life open-eyed to emergent wholes...this has been, I venture, the controlling ethic, or if one will, the moral imperative of my own life history....All other undertakings [except the American Indian enterprise], as institutionally embodied, have commanded me entirely until swiftly, and as a rule silently, I pass out from them. And I passed out from them in no instance to grasp a securer opportunity, or any other measurable opportunity, but instead to return to that which, in these paragraphs, I have called the spirit of the whole.

Collier was widely read in literature, sociology, and psychology, but the writings which stirred him most profoundly were those of the philosophers, especially Nietzsche: "Nietzsche yet remains at the center of my own thinking being, with his concept of the 'beyond man' as the yet-unrealized potential within living man, present man; and of the entire task of life
as the ordering of society and of thought so as to invoke the beyond-man from present man." Other thinkers to whom Collier felt indebted were Lester Frank Ward, Freud, Jung, F. W. H. Myers, varied social psychologists and gestaltists, Herbert Spencer, Walt Whitman, William Morris, Robert Owen, Sidney and Beatrice Webb, the European utopians, Shelley, Byron, Wordsworth, Fiona Macleod, William Butler Yeats, and Sir Horace Plunkett.

In addition to these literary stimuli, Collier's intellect was aroused by what he observed on his travels. While in Europe, Collier saw the early days of many social movements, but those that intrigued him most were the cooperative and labor movements in France, Belgium, England, and Ireland. Impressed as he was by them, he could not wholeheartedly support them:

From their early years, the vision of even these movements was walled within the concept that enclosed all nineteenth-century philosophy—the concept of the economic, the selfish, the isolated center of man's motivation. Liberals, socialists, cooperative commonwealth proponents, all believed in the same nature of man as did those who opposed their doctrines of human sameness, and all believed that the narrow segment of man they saw, or thought they saw—nineteenth-century, western man—was universal man. How out of ages far gone in pre-history...man is something decisively other than the isolated, economic man, was barely, if at all, suspected by thinkers then....

Through the many years of his community work Collier was sustained "by a belief which died hard in me: the belief that what I may call the Occidental ethos and genius were the hope of the world; that they might also become the world's doom; and my unwearying task was to make some difference in
that Occidental ethos and genius."\(^{25}\) For this reason he threw himself into the work of the People's Institute and was particularly energetic in his attempts to reform the movie industry. He hoped that this artform would become "the people's theatre", concentrating on the universal aims of mankind, "the longing to witness through this powerful medium not the perversions of modern man, but the stirrings in his soul for beauty, harmony, and above all, shared responses and shared experiences, making him come alive to himself and the world and people around him. In short...the film industry could unite us...as a vast community."\(^{26}\)

By the end of his career in New York, he was extremely disillusioned about the potential of the modern western world to provide any type of healthy social environment for man. Its \textit{zeitgeist} ("its ethos, its sick spirit, its atomizing intellectual and moral aims and purposes") appalled him. He described his milieu as follows:

Our western world way of life (sociologically, it may be called the \textit{gesellschaft} mode of life--life lived solitarily by individuals who are divorced from communion with one another toward ends greater than any of them, as individuals), has us in its grip. It conquered the programs and purposes of the People's Institute, which was formed expressly to counteract this isolating of the self within the crowd. The People's Institute was seeking to bring to the common folk of New York, as we now in retrospect realize, what is known as the \textit{gemeinschaft} mode of life (the sufficing brotherhood, within innumerable local communities which are moved by shared purposes), but that effort, and, for the 'modern western world', that mode of life, faded before the scorching onset of the \textit{gesellschaft} mode of life--before the shattering, aggressive drive toward competitive utility....The \textit{gesellschaft} mode of life is a lonely one: mechanisms and social organizations for shared, sustained
public greatness, which could unite men, great and humble, within common purposes and endeavors, exist no longer. The recreation of such mechanisms is our world's task. Indeed, it is critical to our survival. Can such mechanisms for community existence be re-created within the socio-economic order which engulfs us now, deeper and always deeper; engulfs us in its denial of all order except that imposed by industrialism and militarism, intermixed with governmental authority? Much of my life has been lived in the search of the answer to this question, this challenge.

Collier's encounter with Indian society was a tonic for his pessimism; there was, he believed, this one last hope for the salvation of Western civilization. He had previously considered the Indians a long-lost cause, but his experience with the Taos Pueblos changed his mind.

Repeatedly, I had been solicited on behalf of America's Indian peoples; but always I had resisted and refused. It was too late, I believed; that golden age was done....For years I believed that the long, remorseless course of events, the social destruction piled on biological destruction which the white man had wrought upon the Indians, must have killed, in most Indians, that most profound of their spiritual possessions—the one our sick world most needs. That possession is a way of life at once simple, since it is disciplined, and complex: it involves world view and sentiment of self; institutionalized tradition and symbol-invested belief, which implicitly or explicitly realizes man as a co-partner in a living universe—man and nature intimately co-operant and mutually dependent. It is a way of life which realizes the individual and his society as wholly reciprocal and both of them as drawing value and power to the racial and cosmic future, and past and future are not only that which in linear time-sequence has been or is yet to be, but are propulsive, efficient living reality here and now....through all the slaughter of American Indian biological stocks, the slaughter of their societies and trampling upon their values, strange as it may seem, they have kept the faith. The inner core-value, complex and various, has not been killed....Could we make it our own, there would be an eternally inexhaustible earth and a forever lasting peace.
These beliefs impelled Collier to throw all his energies into Indian work for the next twenty-five years. When he left Indian work in 1945, however, his departure was true to his pattern of returning to "the spirit of the whole." "However, my really controlling reason for resigning the Commissionership lay outside the Indian Service or government service. The Indian New Deal had been meant for practical effectiveness, but also (and in identical terms) as a contribution to problems and situations world-wide—the problems of non-white, non-literate, and variously dependent peoples, with more than a billion of population. I wanted to be free to give myself entirely to this world wide need."  

E. Palmer Patterson II wrote an article in which he compared Duncan Campbell Scott and John Collier, both of whom were leading Indian administrators (Scott in the Canadian government) and both of whom were poets. Patterson examines their unofficial, poetical writings to see if there are "clues to the attitudes toward Indians which influenced them as they carried out their duties." He analyses Collier as follows:

Collier, encountering beauty and order in the peace-oriented society of the Pueblos, was part of a later generation, one which had experienced World War I and read Spengler, Freud, and Mein Kampf, though its intellectual origins are found in the decade of the 1890's. That generation had deep doubts about the old certainties of progress and Western superiority. Thus Collier is a product of the reconstruction of European social thought whose greatest thinkers...shifted the axis of that tradition to make
room for the new definition of man as something more (or less) than a logically calculating animal. ...As Scott expresses a possible rationale for assimilation, so Collier has formulated an ideology for Indian resurgence.  

Collier, then, was a secular intellectual who was keenly sensitive to the human condition. He believed in the unlimited potential of each individual and was firmly convinced that only through social organizations could these potentials be recognized, nurtured, and fulfilled. His career was an exhaustive crusade in search of creative, people-oriented community structures. He had weighed religion and found it wanting. Philosophers had molded his ideals but could not satisfy them. He realized that the most idealistic social movements and the most intensive community work could never reverse the vicious, personality-destroying trends of the modern, industrial, Western world. His vision of the reattainment of the local community where the intimate relationship between man, his fellows, and nature would nourish all aspects of the lives of all men and promote peace and harmony, seemed a phantom until his contact with Indian society convinced him that it was still possible to have that mode of life in this world. His work with the Indians was not the culmination of his career, however; it was rather an interlude during which he learned and developed social philosophies, techniques, and programs to carry to those who needed them.

As disillusioned as he was with his civilization, Collier never abandoned it. He worked through the bureaucratic system he so bitterly criticized in an attempt to mend it. Des-
pite his flirtations with other life-styles, he never denied his own culture, but persistently sought ways to modify and reconstruct it to fit his ideas of how a society should function and what it should accomplish.
NOTES TO CHAPTER I


5 Collier, *From Every Zenith*, pp. 90-91, 115-118.

6 *ibid.*, p. 126.

7 *ibid.*, p. 123.

8 *ibid.*, pp. 127-131.
9 ibid., p. 24.


12 Collier, *From Every Zenith*, p. 27.

13 ibid., p. 48.

14 ibid., p. 82.


19 ibid., p. 161.

20 Collier, *From Every Zenith*, p. 32.

21 ibid., pp. 77-78.

22 ibid., p. 38.

23 ibid., pp. 32, 37, 44, 64-65.

24 ibid., p. 64.

25 ibid., p. 68.

26 ibid., p. 72.

27 ibid., pp. 93-94.


CHAPTER II
THE INDIANS' CHAMPION

John Collier's full-time involvement with the American Indians began in 1922 when he left his teaching post in San Francisco and departed for the Southwest. Soon after his arrival in New Mexico he learned of the Bursum Bill, legislation which would allow certain whites who had settled on Pueblo lands to sue for title to those lands. Collier appointed himself to the task of informing the Indians about the bill and its implications for them. As a result of his briefing the Pueblos organized for the first time since 1680 (when they drove the Spanish from their territory) and decided to carry a personal protest to Washington, D.C. Seventeen Indians, Collier, and a Santa Fe lawyer (Francis C. Wilson) took off on this mission which was paid for out of Collier's pocket.

Stopping first in Chicago, they found wealthy sponsors and spoke at several meetings. It was here that Harold L. Ickes, Franklin Roosevelt's Secretary of the Interior and Collier's superior while Commissioner of Indian Affairs, was drawn into the Indian cause. They stopped for a short time at Washington and then went on to New York, where they again gained considerable attention. They appeared before the League for Political Education whose founder, Robert E. Ely, was soon to launch the American Indian Defense Association (which later merged with the National Association on Indian Affairs to become the Association on American Indian Affairs). Furthermore, in New York "...the Catholics came in with us,
and from this time on the Bureau of Catholic Indian Missions stood by us through thick and thin.⁶ A number of prominent Jews also came to the support of the Indians at this time. Fred M. Stein figured prominently in the American Indian Defense Association, and Louis Marshall, the constitutional lawyer, contributed several hundred thousand dollars worth of legal services.⁷

Returning to Washington, they participated in the hearings before the House Committee on Indian Affairs in January, 1923, and to the chagrin of the Indian Bureau, the Bursum Bill was killed. The Bureau leveled charges that the newly formed AIDA was a Soviet tool and that Russian Communism was involved in their efforts on behalf of the Indians. In the same year Secretary of the Interior Albert B. Fall and the Bureau tried to push through the Indian Omnibus bill, which would have deprived the Indians of many of their land and water rights, but the AIDA, working with Senator Robert LaFollette, defeated it.⁸

For the rest of the decade Collier's life was involved with the work of the AIDA. Founded in 1923 as an agency for opposing the Bursum Bill, it owed its existence to Robert E. Ely, who had called together a conference of the various Indian welfare associations in June of 1923 to plan a concerted strategy for the next legislative session. This New York meeting produced a set of principles which were to guide the policies of the soon-to-be-formed AIDA. These included:

1. To induce the Government to observe with respect to the Indians its treaty and contractual obli-
gations with the same measure of good faith that would be expected of a private individual who had assumed similar obligations.

2. To induce the Government to fulfill with respect to those of the Indians toward whom it has assumed the responsibilities of guardianship, the full measure of its fiduciary obligations, with the same strict observance of the interests of the wards and the same recognition of moral and financial responsibility as would be expected of a private individual who had undertaken a similar trusteeship.

3. To induce the Government to safeguard for the Indians the same rights to life, liberty and property that are guaranteed to all other persons by the Federal Constitution and to accord to them the same measure of religious liberty within the law, as is secured to all other persons by that instrument.

4. To induce the Government to adopt and foster such reasonable measures as will enable the Indians to preserve, for their own happiness, and for the instruction and enlightenment of mankind, the distinctive features of their ancient civilization.

5. To modify, in so far as may prove necessary, the existing agencies of contact and control in such manner as to insure the co-ordination of all the humanitarian and constructive services of the Government, in the fulfillment of the moral and financial obligations of guardianship, and to substitute for the present autocratic departmental control of Indian life a system of beneficent supervision regulated by law, consistent with the principles of an enlightened Democracy.

6. To advocate legislation, where necessary, for the accomplishment of these ends and to oppose in Congress all action inconsistent with these principles and aims.

7. To disseminate accurate information about Indian life, customs and traditions to the end that action with respect to them shall be taken only in the light of full information, and that an enlightened public opinion shall help to formulate Governmental and other activities affecting their welfare.\[^9\]

Collier was responsible for the actual establishment of the organization and was its executive secretary from the start. Although it soon had branches in San Francisco, Pasadena, Santa Barbara, and Los Angeles, Collier chose to work
primarily in Washington, where he maintained his headquarters and a continuous lobby. He also edited the Association's publication, *American Indian Life*. In general, he and his organization "were devoted to a preservation of Indian cultures and to the repeal of the allotment policy in favour of the retention or restoration of title to Indian land in the tribe rather than in the individual." Most of the membership consisted of "writers, artists, social scientists and reformers who had been working in Indian affairs on a local basis, but who had not participated actively on the national Indian scene....These men and women possessed substantial influence in public and academic circles, and all were deeply sympathetic to Indian tribal cultures. Impressed with the insights to be gained by social science, they were immediately interested in applying the lessons of 'indirect rule' emergent from the experience of colonial powers and in the problems of developing a sense of community and neighborhood in a swiftly urbanizing culture."

In 1923 the Commissioner of Indian Affairs issued a "Dance Order" which instructed the reservation superintendents to discourage any dances or parts of ceremonials that they considered to be immoral, indecent, or dangerous. Collier and his group immediately protested that this violated the Indians' constitutional right to religious freedom. They further maintained that the ceremonials were in fact beautiful religious rituals and not at all of an obscene character.

Throughout 1923 and 1924 there also raged a battle on
the peyote question. The peyote cult, which had originated in the late nineteenth century among certain Plains tribes who had recently been settled on reservations, became a widespread, Pan-Indian movement of the early twentieth century, and was incorporated into the Native American Church in 1918. Various groups pressed for antipeyote legislation in the federal Congress and again Collier led the fight to protect this aspect of Indian religion.14

By the end of 1923 Collier had established himself as one of the major figures of the Indian rights movement. The new Secretary of the Interior, Herbert W. Work, therefore invited him to be one of "The Committee of One Hundred" to review and offer advice on Indian policy. This committee, consisting of a number of prominent Americans (e.g., Bernard M. Baruch, Gen. John J. Pershing, William Jennings Bryan), clergymen, Indian defense leaders, and anthropologists, agreed on the need for a better quality of education and health facilities for Indians, on the desire to see "the characteristic native arts and crafts" encouraged, and on the decision to approve Indian dances and ceremonials as long as they were not unlawful nor against "the interests of morality". They also recommended that the National Research Council study peyote to see whether or not it was detrimental to the health or morals of its users. They also advised immediate and careful investigation of former Secretary Fall's land policy in relation to Indian holdings.15

In 1926, the Brookings Institute began an intensive study of the administration of Indian Affairs at the request of
the Secretary of the Interior. Called the Merriam Report when it was published in 1928, it helped subsequent Indian administrators in their reform programs. Collier was not directly involved in the preparation of this report, but he was consulted extensively.\textsuperscript{16}

During this time Collier also published dozens of articles in many of the nation's magazines dealing with the Indians of the country and their situation. These essays described various tribes and their peculiar conditions, stripped certain congressional bills dealing with Indian matters of their legal terminology, or proposed exhaustive changes in the administration of Indian concerns. All emphasized one or more of several themes that Collier wanted to impress upon the public's consciousness.\textsuperscript{17}

One such issue was the need for comprehensive reform in the federal Indian service. Collier relentlessly accused the Indian Bureau of misemploying its unquestionable and nearly absolute rule over Indian life. He claimed that these abuses stemmed from the Bureau's inefficiency due to its bureaucratic nature, from an absence of coordination between federal, state, and local authorities, and from the organization's jealousy of its power. What was needed, in Collier's opinion, was a political change in the topmost officials, an end to the Indian Service as it then existed, and the establishment of a program which concentrated on agricultural development, health services, local schools, conservation, housing reform, economic counseling (especially for those tribes whose land was rich in
oil and other desirable natural resources), and tribal self-government.

Another theme was his distain for legislators whose sole interest in Indian affairs was the trading value of Indian lands in their logrolling maneuvers. Still another subject was his hostility to white aggression against Indian land and culture and the national attitudes which seemed to sanction it. Not a few of his writings were dedicated to demonstrating that Western culture was not the realization of utopian dreams and that the Indian civilization in many respects produced more well-balanced personalities.

When Herbert Hoover took office in 1929, he appointed Charles J. Rhodes and J. Henry Scattergood, two Quaker businessmen, as Indian Commissioner and Assistant Commissioner, respectively. Although the spirit of the Indian Service became more receptive to reform measures under their administration, and although they took steps to humanize the handling of Indian affairs (especially in the matter of the schooling of Indian children), they did not push for legislation which would have lent more power to their program. They became bogged down in Indian department bureaucracy and entangled in the entrenched methods of work and thought which governed the institution, and in the end their humanitarian aspirations bowed to the domination of the old system. The AIDA had held back any criticism of Rhodes and Scattergood until the new administration could prove itself, but as it became clear that no substantial reforms were to be made permanent, Collier again
called public attention to the plight of the Indians.

In 1933 Franklin Delano Roosevelt was inaugurated president of the United States, Harold Ickes became his Secretary of the Interior, and the two of them were responsible for the appointment of Collier to the post of Commissioner of Indian Affairs. The story of his selection is related by Arthur M. Schlesinger, Jr., in *The Age of Roosevelt*:

Once Joe Robinson was backing an unsuitable candidate for the Indian Commissionership. To settle the matter, Roosevelt asked Robinson and Ickes—who had his own more qualified candidate—over to the White House for tea. Then the President set Robinson talking about his recent defense of the administration against Huey Long, spurring him on by exclamations of wonder and admiration. As the apparently aimless talk continued, Ickes began to doubt whether Roosevelt would ever reach the point; 'I felt that, for some reason, the President had decided to put off the operation.' Finally, as dinner was announced and the two men rose to leave, Roosevelt said, 'By the way, Joe, I would like to talk with you about the Indian Commissionership. You have a man from Arkansas....I have had a lot of protests about him from women's organizations, Indian rights associations and reformers generally. Now, I don't suppose that you and I want to go up against that kind of opposition.' Caught off guard, Robinson mumbled a reply. 'Well, I thought that you would feel that way about it,' the President said suavely. 'I have been under pressure to name John Collier. And Harold Ickes, here, does not want Meritt. He does not believe that he can work with him. He wants Collier. Since he is to be responsible, I suppose that the thing to do is to let him have the man he wants.'

The details of Collier's program during his commissionership will be discussed in the following chapter, but a summary of his work is not out of place here. Collier's major achievement during his term was the passage of the Wheeler-Howard Bill (the Indian Reorganization Act) in 1934. With the help of Interior Department lawyers, Collier drew up the act which was to be the legal basis of his program and which was
designed to help Indians establish economic and political home rule, to protect them against white encroachment on their lands and cultures, and to improve their educational opportunities. Following this milestone, Collier plunged into administrative, cultural, and economic reforms. By 1940, for example, half of the employees of the Department of Indian Affairs were Indians. He also abolished the boarding schools which separated Indian children from their families and cultures; stimulated interest in Indian art, music, and folklore by helping to create the Indian Arts and Crafts Board; set up economic, conservational, and agricultural training programs; and encouraged anthropological research.

During World War II larger issues than the needs of the Indians forced themselves into Collier's attention. Milton Eisenhower, in charge of the administration of several of the concentration camps for Japanese-Americans, asked Collier and the Indian Service to take complete responsibility for the largest of these, the one in Poston, Colorado, which was the temporary home of 18,000 people. Collier did so on the condition that they could run it along the same principles that guided them in working with Indians, and this was immediately agreed to. Although the inhabitants were restricted to the premises, within the camp they organized their own governmental system, developed cooperatives, participated in adult education programs, farmed and landscaped as they pleased, and were encouraged to make criticisms of the administration of the
camp. Eisenhower transferred to other war work, however, and his successors did not at all approve of Collier's approach to concentration camp organization. The Indian Service, therefore, soon withdrew from the enterprise.  

In 1945 Collier resigned the Commissionership and helped to establish the Institute of Ethnic Affairs, designed to contribute to the solution of the problems of the dependent peoples of the world. He was also an advisor on trusteeship matters to the United States delegation at the first session of the United Nations General Assembly in London in 1946. From 1947 to 1954 he was a professor of sociology and anthropology at the City College of New York, and was professor emeritus from 1954 to his death. He continued his writing, producing *America's Colonial Record* (1946), *The Indians of the Americas* (1947), *Patterns and Ceremonials of the Indians of the Southwest* (1949), *On the Gleaming Way* (1949), and *From Every Zenith* (1963). In addition, he frequently came to the defense of Indians when the work he had done seemed threatened by later administrations. He died in 1968 at Taos, New Mexico.
NOTES TO CHAPTER II

1 Congressional Record, 67th Congress, 2nd Session, pp. 12323-12325.

2 Collier, From Every Zenith, p. 132.

3 ibid., p. 132.


5 Collier, From Every Zenith, pp. 131-133.

6 ibid., p. 133.

7 ibid., p. 133.

8 ibid., pp. 133-135.


10 Collier, From Every Zenith, p. 135.


18 Collier, From Every Zenith, pp. 148-156.


20 Collier, From Every Zenith, pp. 301-303.

21 ibid., pp. 315-316.


CHAPTER III
THE NEW DEAL FOR THE INDIANS

The two preceding chapters have tried to reveal the background and nature of the man who stepped into the commissionership in 1933. Not religious in an orthodox sense, Collier was a secular missionary with an evangelical zeal for repairing man's relationships with other men and with the world in which they abide. This chapter deals with the Indian policy which grew out of this ideology.

There was enthusiastic optimism about the future of Indian affairs as Collier took office. One newsmagazine noted:

There will be rejoicing on the reservations, at least among the Indian inhabitants, at the news of John Collier's appointment as head of the Indian Bureau. We may now look forward to that sweeping reform in the service which he has so long demanded. It will not be an easy task. Mr. Collier must contend with the entrenched and selfish interests that have controlled and exploited the bureau for so many years at the expense of the Indians. Moreover, he must face the opposition of those who have been the objects of his own sharp and continuous attack....We know his courage and apparently the President is ready to strengthen his hand. For the first time in many years the Indians have a right to expect justice and sympathy from their guardians in Washington.

Collier's first major project upon assuming the post was his drafting of the Indian Reorganization Act, the legislation which was to provide the legal basis for his programs. In structuring this milestone of Indian policy, Collier and his aides were guided by certain principles which he had formulated during his many years of studying and working for the native peoples of America.

In his writings Collier condenses these principles to
three points: "Economic rehabilitation of the Indians, principally on the land. Organization of the Indian tribes for managing their own affairs. Civil and cultural freedom and opportunity for the Indians." This program was to be accomplished by recognizing Indian societies, by giving them responsibility and power, by allowing them to use their land as they saw fit, and by guaranteeing them every freedom that other Americans enjoy (e.g., freedom to organize, the right to religious liberty, etc.). Furthermore, the government was to help the Indian societies to take advantage of this program by helping them organize, by making credit available, by providing technological, business, and legal education, by giving them responsibility for the natural resources on their lands, by providing capital goods, and by helping them develop responsible democratic systems. Finally, research in the field of Indian affairs by both administrators and laymen was to be encouraged.

The Indian Reorganization bill (also called the Wheeler-Howard bill) took nearly fifty pages to set forth specific legislation to put these diverse proposals into effect. Its main features were as follows:

1. Future land allotment is prohibited.
2. The trust period is everywhere extended.
3. The acquisition of land for landless Indians is authorized, with $2,000,000 a year appropriated for this purpose.
4. Tribal corporations are authorized and these may accept relinquishments of the title to allotted lands in exchange for cash or for shares in the corporation.
5. A system of financial credit for Indians is established and $10,000,000 is authorized as a
6. Indian tribes are permitted to organize. When organized, the Executive cannot rescind their organization, and the organized tribes are given important powers, particularly in matters affecting tribal funds and the expenditures of the Indian Service.

7. Indians who may qualify for the jobs of Indian Service are exempted from civil-service requirements.

8. The training of Indians in colleges and trade and professional schools for leadership of their people and for success in the outside world is provided for, $250,000 a year being authorized.

9. The Secretary of the Interior is authorized and directed to apply the principles of conservation to Indian forests and range lands, through comprehensive and effective language.

10. The undisposed-of surplus and ceded lands, about 2,000,000 acres, are restored to tribe ownership.

After twenty-nine sessions before the Committee on Indian Affairs and much debate on the floor, it passed the Senate in a modified form. Following a similarly stormy process in the House, an amended version was returned to the Senate and a conference report eventually allowed the passage of a revised bill which was presented to and approved by President Roosevelt.

Collier, therefore, had won approval of the legal framework he had devised for his reform program, but several of the provisions he considered vital to its effectiveness did not survive the Congressional gauntlet. He had hoped to set up a simplified system of civil and criminal law enforcement which would be responsible to the tribes and which would be answerable only to the federal courts. Furthermore, he wanted the power to consolidate the lands which had been allotted and to return them to the tribal estates. Because of heirship problems created by the allotment legislation and because many
of the allotments had passed into non-Indian hands, it was difficult for the tribes to make long-range plans for their land holdings. Since the lands the whites had taken over were scattered among the Indian holdings in checkerboard fashion, it was also difficult, if not impossible, to make large-scale plans. Congress, however, denied Collier the power to implement these aspects of his program.

One of the sections (section 10) of the act stipulated that it would apply only to those tribes who approved it with a majority vote of their members. In the following year, 189 of the 266 tribes (132,000 of 195,000 Indians) for whom it was designed (it did not include the Indians of Oklahoma or Alaska) ratified it and thereby voted themselves into the Indian New Deal. The tribes which accepted it then drew up their own constitutions and by-laws, determining what rights the federal government, the tribes, and the individual had in tribal affairs. After completing this groundwork, Collier applied himself to the task of getting the maximum effectiveness from his bill in the shortest possible time.

The problem of Indian lands was, of course, always foremost in Collier's mind. One of his major aims was land acquisition, for which the federal government was to provide $2,000,000 yearly. Between 1933 and 1937, approximately 3,600,000 acres were added to the Indian domain through restoration of lands to reservation status which had been formerly opened to homestead entry and through various land purchase funds. After 1936, money became tighter and the Indian
Bureau never again received its annual $2,000,000. Nevertheless, between 1937 and 1940, it acquired another 500,000 acres. No public funds were available for land purchases during the war years, but money left over from previous appropriations and some tribal purchases kept the program going.

Close corollaries of the land acquisition project were the cessation of allotments and sales of Indian property, the reinstatement of government trusteeship, and the initial attempts to consolidate Indian holdings. A few allotments and sales were permitted upon special and urgent request from individuals, but for the most part, the loss of land from the tribal estates was effectively stopped. The consolidation process was very slow, however, and very little was accomplished during Collier's term. Once the allotment mechanism was turned off, it was easier to resolve many of the legal cases concerning the ownership of Indian land; much probate work was executed and the procedures and records necessary for this task were better organized.

Much of the land that the Indians lost between 1887 and 1933 was their best farming and grazing acreage. The property they retained therefore needed a great deal of care if it was ever to be productive. For this reason, Collier instituted an intensive conservation program. Working with the Soil Conservation Service of the Department of Agriculture, the tribes and the Bureau of Indian Affairs developed engineering works and revegetation, land use, range control,
and stock reduction projects. In addition, conservation principles were taught in the Indian schools, beginning with the earliest grade levels.16

The Indian Emergency Conservation Work funds (after 1937, the Civilian Conservation Corps, Indian Division) also provided some measure of land improvement. Working on telephone lines, horse trails, bridges, fire lanes, trailside clearing, insect and rodent control, forest fire fighting, fence building, and other such tasks, the native peoples learned the skills involved in this type of work, and as most of the Indian Division were Indians, many of them obtained supervisory training. Since a certain amount of the emergency money was earmarked for work on the reservations, the value of the Indian holdings was also increased.17

Some of the remaining reservation land was rich in natural resources, and these, too, needed careful cultivation. Forestry programs and mineral development plans were therefore drawn up to help the natives "use these natural resources in a way which will preserve their productivity and at the same time furnish the maximum possible economic and social benefit to the Indians."18 Through studies, application of conservation measures, and business training, the Bureau hoped to create profitable enterprises and to train the Indians to sustain them.19

To embark on even a small-scale agricultural, lumber, mining, or other business endeavor, however, requires a considerable amount of capital. As Indians could not put up
government trust lands as security for loans and as few owned any other type of acceptable collateral, there were virtually no sources of credit available to them. For this reason, the IRA established a ten million dollar revolving credit fund for those tribes that accepted its provisions. The governing body of the tribe was made the agency responsible for deciding which individuals or chartered corporations within its community received these funds. Loans to individuals were used basically for agriculture, loans to groups were generally used for various business or industrial endeavors, and some loans were approved for educational and relief purposes. Bureau representatives participated by helping tribes to set up evaluation procedures and standards for applications; and by assisting the applicants in making realistic judgments concerning the amounts they needed and could repay.  

Despite these extensive and much-needed reforms in the economic sphere of their lives, the depression years found the Indian population even more enmeshed in their particularly unfortunate financial plight. Collier, therefore, saw that as much Indian labor as possible was used in the federal projects relating to the reservations.

Various construction programs provided employment, training opportunities, and needed facilities for the native population. Funded largely by the Public Works Program, houses, hospitals, farm buildings, schools, and heating, water, sewer, and power systems were added to the Indian holdings. Extensive road systems were built on the reservations.
migration projects employed Indian workmen and taught them the skills necessary for maintaining and managing them.  

Besides the on-the-job training arrangements, Collier encouraged the development of extension programs and industrial education. According to his plans, the community centers or various organizations in the tribe would provide an audience for demonstrations of agricultural techniques, livestock shows, construction procedures, household care, and so on. He hoped that by giving such advice on the wise use of resources, the tribal standards of living would be raised.

Increasing numbers of Indians were employed by the Bureau of Indian Affairs in all categories of positions: regular, irregular, and emergency labor. In 1934, 1,785 of the 5,325 regular workers were natives; in 1938, they held one-half of these regular jobs. By 1940, over half of all employees of the Bureau were Indian. In addition, the Indian Employment Division of the Bureau found government jobs for Indians outside of the Indian Service.

Collier's interest was not only in matters pragmatic. His concern for the protection of the Indian artisan led him to establish the Indian Arts and Crafts Council shortly after he took office. This agency was to protect, encourage, and find markets for the artistic products of the aboriginal culture. This was to be accomplished by making raw materials available, by researching methods to improve the quality of the product, by obtaining government trademarks of genuineness and quality, by helping the craftsmen to obtain loans, by organizing
and publicizing exhibitions, by market research, and by creating new marketing agencies or encouraging old ones.  

Allied with the appreciation of native art was the Bureau's encouragement of anthropological research. Many studies were made of the organization and function of certain tribes in order to aid the Bureau in creating programs that wouldn't interfere with traditional power or status structures. Indian language, folk lore, and other characteristics were also scrutinized.

The need for reform in the Bureau was one of Collier's fiercest battlecries in his pre-Commissioner days and the institution of that reform was one of the hallmarks of his twelve years in office. His basic plan was to decentralize the Service. He invested as much authority as possible in the tribal governing bodies and in the field personnel that worked with them. Besides avoiding the red tape that communicating with Washington always involved, this move restored a great deal of sovereignty to the chieftains in the hope that this would help restore the traditional power structures of the tribes and would encourage initiative at the local level. Besides decentralizing the Indian Service, Collier wanted to end its autonomy over Indian affairs by involving other federal, state, and non-governmental agencies in the programs he had devised. Federal departments that helped give shape to the Indian New Deal included the Civilian Conservation Corps, the Soil Conservation Service, the U.S. Public Health Service, the Bureau of Animal Husbandry, the Bureau of American Ethnology, the Federal Emer-
gency Relief Administration, the Agricultural Adjustment Administration, and the Land Program. By virtue of the provisions of the Johnson-O'Malley Act of 1934, the Indian Service was able to make contracts with the states whereby the latter would agree to provide some health, educational, and social services to the reservations. In addition, the General Federation of Women's Clubs, the American Indian Defense Association, the Indian Rights Association, and other such agencies were given more freedom to pursue their policies. Besides formulating these major plans on Bureau reform, Collier revised office procedures to make them more efficient, instituted the codification of data, started compiling more reliable statistics, encouraged in-service training, and developed information services. 28

Health care for the native population also received a great deal of Collier's attention. During his administration, tuberculosis, trachoma, and venereal diseases were especially troublesome. To combat these he recruited great numbers of new personnel, built hospitals and clinics, sought increased cooperation with the federal Public Health Service and with state and local health programs, commissioned surveys to determine the health needs of Indians, provided as much dental service as possible, widened the vaccination program, provided nursing training for Indian girls, encouraged research into the diseases prevalent among the natives, instituted a better records system, and started health education projects. As a reward for his labors, he had the satisfaction of seeing the Indian death rate
decrease and the Indian population increase at a rate faster than that of the rest of the nation.²⁹

The education of Indian children was always a major matter to Collier. Early in his administration he set forth the three major tasks he wanted to accomplish in this area: "(a) improving existing schools; (b) reducing and eliminating Indian boarding schools and transferring Indian children back to their own homes; (c) developing day schools that will work with adults as well as children and become real centers for Indian community life."³⁰ Many Indian children were transferred to public schools because of agreements made with the states by the Bureau. In the schools that the Indian Service continued to run, there was increased emphasis on becoming literate, bi-lingual, self-supporting, and familiar with the ways of the larger American society without being separated from their own homes and heritage. Special textbooks, more relevant to Indian environment and often in two languages, were introduced in the primary grades. Health education was stressed. Art was encouraged. In the secondary schools vocational and agricultural training became the major field of study, especially during the war years. Scholarships and educational loans became more plentiful and adult education more popular.³¹

There was one certain aspect of Indian education that Collier was especially anxious to reform. In the years during which the missionaries dominated the reservation schools, they often forbade native religious and cultural expressions and insisted upon compulsory instruction in the Christian faith.
Therefore, in January of 1934, Collier issued a circular in which he unequivocally declared a new policy:

There are Government schools into which no trace of Indian symbolism or art or craft expression has been permitted to enter. There are large numbers of Indians who believe that their native religious life and Indian culture are frowned upon by the Government, if not actually banned. Accordingly—

No interference with Indian religious life or expression will hereafter be tolerated. The cultural history of Indians is in all respects to be considered equal to that of any non-Indian group.32

The new regulations did not actually ban missionaries from the reservations, but rather required that, for boarding school students, specific directions from the parents concerning religious education be received before any such training began. Religious exercises in the day schools could not be held during regular school hours, but the facilities could be used for such a purpose at other times.33

In one of his yearly reports, Collier himself gives a good summary of his administration's goals:

Indian Service policies, funds, and personnel focus in the ultimate upon the family, and community life of the Indians. To improve their standards of living, to combat sickness and disease, to provide cultural expression, to increase the social satisfactions of home and community life, these are the fundamental objectives of the Indian Service. Basic, of course, is the program of economic rehabilitation paralleling that of conserving and making efficient use of natural resources. Closely related to these are the community services of hospitals and nursing, education, development of arts and crafts, and the enforcement of law and order.34

Noble as all these plans and projects were, and energetic as Collier was in their prosecution, they were only a feeble beginning to what he wanted to accomplish. The war drained nearly all the funds and much of the personnel of the
Indian Bureau. Centuries of well-earned distrust of European aims made it difficult to persuade the natives to try still another program. The fact that many Indians, having no land and little money, were literally starting from nothing at a time when many white Americans were in desperate financial straits was another obstacle. But the spirit of the new administration was unmistakeable, and it was vigorous enough to sound an alarm in certain camps.
NOTES TO CHAPTER III

1 The Nation, April 26, 1933, p. 459.

2 Collier, From Every Zenith, p. 173.


4 The Dawes (General Allotment) Act of 1887 was the last major legislation dealing with Indians before 1934. It was intended to encourage assimilation of the native population into white society. It was thought that if each Indian had his own parcel of land, he would more quickly acclimate himself to the thought patterns and legal systems of the European population and shed his primitive ways. Accordingly, the act provided that the tribal domains be divided into lots of certain sizes and allotted to the individual tribal members; any extra land was to be opened to white settlement. After a certain trust period, during which the government held title to the lands while the Indian learned to cope with his new responsibility, he was given fee simple title to his plot. The result of the legislation was that most of the allotments were purchased from the Indians by whites. In 1887, Indian lands numbered 130,000,000 acres; in 1933 they had only 49,000,000 acres left. Collier's legislation put an end to the allotment program and reinstated government trust.

5 Congressional Record, 73rd Congress, 2nd Session, p. 11743.

6 Congressional Record, 73rd Congress, 2nd Session, pp. 9071, 9221, 9222, 9607, 10583, 11222-11239, 11226-11229, 11634, 11724-11744, 11830-11831, 12001-12004, 12073, 12161-12165, 12256-12257, 12340, 12451.

7 Collier, The Indians of the Americas, p. 265.

8 Congressional Record, 73rd Congress, 2nd Session, p. 11725.


11 Annual Report, 1937, pp. 198, 204.

13 Annual Report, 1940, p. 368.

14 Annual Report, 1944, p. 239.


30 Annual Report, 1934, p. 84.


32 Annual Report, 1934, p. 90.

33 ibid., pp. 90-91.

34 Annual Report, 1939, p. 46.
CHAPTER IV

INDIANS AND MISSIONARIES

Before discussing the church reaction to Collier's program, it is necessary to describe the range and vigor of the religious involvement in the history of American Indian affairs. The fact that Collier's "New Deal" struck a sensitive chord in Protestant circles indicates that they considered their work with the Indians to be a principal aspect of their reason for existence. This chapter will briefly explain how and why the Protestants took their message to the natives of the continent and will try to determine the importance of this mission to their view of their own significance and power as a social force in America.

A concern for the souls of the savages was evident in the very earliest days of exploration and settlement. The Spanish and Portuguese sent not only their explorers and warriors to the Americas, but their priests as well.

There was nothing which the Spanish government had more earnestly at heart than the conversion of the Indians. It forms the constant burden of their instructions, and gave to the military expeditions in this western hemisphere somewhat the air of a crusade....Not to care for the soul of his benighted enemy was to put his own [the Spanish soldier's] in jeopardy....Whoever died in the faith, however immoral had been his life, might be said to die in the Lord. Such was the creed of the Castilian knight of that day.  

The English, although nearly a century behind the Spaniards in their colonization of the New World, were no less greedy for the treasures that America held, but again religion was an important factor in their empire building. It was not acceptable to them that the natives continue in their pagan
state, but it was even less desirable that the Catholics be the instruments of their salvation. In his discourse on the advantages of American colonies for England, Richard Hakluyt starts with a consideration of the religious responsibilities of his nation:

Seeing that the people of that parte of America from 30. degrees in Florida northewarde unto 63. degrees (which ys yet in no Christian princes actuall possession) are idolaters...it is necessary for the salvation of those poore people which have sitten so long in darknes and in the shadowe of deathe, that preachers should be sent unto them....Now the Kinges and Queenes of England have the name of Defenders of the Faithe. By which title I thinke they are not onely charged to mayneteyne and patronize the faithe of Christe, but also to inlarge and advaunce the same....Now the meanes to sende such as shall labour effectually in this business ys, by planting one or two colonies of our nation upon that fyrme, where they may remaine in safetie, and first learne the language of the people nere adjoyninge...and by little and little acquainte themselves with their manner....for preachers to come unto them rashly with oute some such preparation for their safetie, it were nothing els but to ronne to their apparaunte and certaine destruction, as yt happened unto those Spanishe ffryers, that, before any plantings...landed in Fflorida, where they were miserably massacred by the savages....And this enterprise the princes of the religion (amonge whom her Majestie ys principall) oughte the rather to take in hande, because the papists confirme themselves and drawe other to their side, shewinge that they are the true Catholicke church because they have bene the onely converters of many millions of infidells to Christianitie.  

In the first charter of the Virginia colony, the crown commends the colonizers' "desires for the furtherance of so noble a work, which may, by the providence of Almighty God, hereafter tend to the glory of his divine Majesty, in propagating of Christian religion to such people, as yet live in darkness and miserable ignarance of the true knowledge and worship of God, and may in time bring the infidels and savages, living in those parts,
to human civility, and to a settled and quiet government...."3
Furthermore, the ministers of the colony are instructed "that
they, with all diligence, care, and respect, doe provide, that
the true word, and service of God and Christian faith be
preached, planted, and used, not only within every of the said
several colonies, and plantations, but alsoe as much as they
may amongst the salvage people which doe or shall adjoine unto
them, or border upon them, according to the doctrine, rights,
and religion now professed and established within our realme of
England."4 The seal of the Massachusetts Bay Colony portrayed
an Indian with the words "Come over and help us", and its charter
required that the colony be managed so that "our said people,
inhabitants there, maie be soe religiously, peaceablie, and
civilly governed, as their good life and orderlie conversacon
maie wynn and incite the natives of the country to the knowledg
and obedience of the onlie true God and Savior of mankinde, and
the Christian fayth, which, in our royall intencon and the adven­
turers free profession, is the principall ende of this plan­
tacon."5 At a later date, Georgia's founders, although without
missionary zeal of their own, granted five hundred acres to the
Moravians for an Indian mission.6

Although pecuniary motives cannot be dislodged from
their leading place in the list of reasons for European coloni­
zation of America, the religious impulse, including the desire
to Christianize the natives, cannot be dismissed as relatively
insignificant. As one author explains:

A congenial alliance between religion and trade in the
late sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries profoundly influenced the beginnings of what would one day become the British Empire. The fact is that late Elizabethan and Jacobean preachers, Anglicans and Puritans alike, were keenly aware of the necessity of checkmating Spain, and they waged an incessant campaign to arouse the English nation to awareness of the danger that threatened it. England as a whole, however, was only dimly conscious of the implications of the Spanish empire, and many Englishmen were ardent isolationists. The Protestant clergy, with their traditional hatred of Catholic Spain, set to work to shake England out of its lethargy. They succeeded in paving the way for empire.

The desire for ecclesiastical expansion, therefore, found justification for its activities in the existence of a host of pagans on the American shores. Those benevolent Englishmen of the time whose concern for things spiritual included the salvation of the Indians thus found that their interests happily coincided with those of their state and that they were, in fact, encouraged to commence their religious (especially missionary) efforts in the New World.

After the initial settlements, disruptions, and resettlements of the various colonial ventures, several distinct groups of churches were conspicuous in America. Nearly all were imbued with the desire to minister to the natives and nearly all experienced the frustration of these missionary efforts. Specific examples will illustrate.

In the southern colonies (Virginia from its beginnings; Maryland, Georgia, the Carolinas, and New York after the Restoration) Anglicanism was the established church, and as such played a role in both the secular and religious matters of the American settlements. In the earliest days of these colonies there was great enthusiasm for winning Indian converts. In 1613, Alexander
Whitaker wrote back to London:

Let the miserable condition of these naked slaves of the divell move you to compassion toward them. They acknowledge that there is a great good God, but know him not, having the eyes of their understanding as yet blinded: wherefore they serve the divell for feare, after a most base manner....Wherefore my brethern, put on the bowels of compassion, and let the lamentable estate of these miserable people enter in your consideration: One God created us, they have reasonable soules and intellectual faculties as well as wee....Awake you true hearted English men, you servants of Jesus Christ, remember that the Plantation is Gods, and the reward your Countries. Wherefore, aime not at your present privat gaine, but let the glory of God, whose Kingdome you now plant, & good of your Countrey, whose wealth you seeke, so farre prevale with you, that you respect not a present returne of gaine for this yeare or two: but that you would more liberally supplie for a little space, this your Christian worke....

Indian troubles, particularly the massacre of 1622, had a dampening effect on missionary zeal, however, that lasted until the end of the century.10

By 1700 many churchmen in England realized that a substantial missionary effort was necessary if Anglicanism was to be an effective voice in colonial life. Therefore the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel in Foreign Parts was established in 1701 with considerable royal, political, and ecclesiastical support. Its concern was to extend the Church of England beyond the British shores, and for the next eighty years America was its prime target.11 Its main tasks were: "...in the first place, to settle the state of religion, as well as may be, among our own people there, which, by all accounts we have, very much wants their pious care; and then to proceed, in the best methods they can, toward the conversion of the natives."12 The S.P.G. missionaries made substantial inroads in New England and the middle colonies
during the eighteenth century; their efforts among the Indians, however, do not seem to have been crowned with success.13

Historically, the Puritans are probably the best-known of the religious groups in the colonies. Although they were anxious to make converts among the Indians, they were often deprived of spiritual leadership for their own congregations, and it was not until about 1650 that any major work was done among the natives. In Massachusetts, one of the earliest such missionaries was Thomas Mayhew, who, with his father, converted many of the natives of Martha's Vineyard to Christianity.14 The major missionary work among the Indians was that of John Eliot, however, who came to New England in 1631 and soon afterwards began his pastorship. During the 1640's he learned the Indian tongue and visited various native villages from time to time. In 1647 he was sufficiently confident of his mastery of the language and of the progress of his converts to begin an ardent campaign to encourage this aspect of the ministry and to secure financial support for it. Because of Eliot's efforts the conversion of the Indians became a major Puritan project, and from 1650 to 1665 the missionary movement grew. The "praying towns", consisting of congregations of Indian Christians, were built, European tools were distributed to the natives, and educational programs commenced. "The President and Society for Propagation of the Gospell in New-England" provided great sums of money for teachers, books, and interpreters. Eliot produced an Indian translation of the Bible and various other religious works were soon available in the Indian language. The years 1665-1675 saw
the harvest of this great crusade; more missionaries extended the field of operations, and plans were being made to provide higher education for the many natives who were becoming literate.\footnote{15}

The Plymouth Puritans were not so successful. The Indians living around them were not as receptive to religious ideas, they did not have missionaries with abilities comparable to those of Eliot and Mayhew, and they didn't have as much money as the Massachusetts Bay settlements to spend on education. The Connecticut Puritans were not much more fortunate, as they were faced with the resistance of certain key Indian leaders, which effectively prevented their reaching the rest of the tribe members.\footnote{16}

King Phillip's War (1675-1676) spelled doom for the New England Indian population. Hundreds were killed, struck down by hunger or illness, or forced to migrate. Following their defeat the tribes were restricted to an early form of reservation. Eliot continued his work among them, but as the years went on, the Indians gradually disappeared from the New England scene; by 1750 only a few thousand were left. After Eliot's death missionary work among them ceased until shortly before the Revolution.\footnote{17}

Although the Puritans cannot be accused of the ruthless racial attitudes which later generations used to justify the expulsion of the natives to the western lands, they do stand guilty of some misjudgments about the aborigines. First of all, they underestimated the reluctance of the Indian to give up his own religion for the European one. Secondly, they had extremely
high standards for acceptance into church membership. They insisted that their converts not only have a thorough know­ledge of the Scriptures and Puritan theology and morals, but that they adopt concepts and life-styles completely foreign to their own way of life. The Indian converts had to relin­quish their former lives; to become Christian was to become non-Indian. It was, therefore,

...unlikely that natives and New Englanders, separated by vast differences in political, economic, religious, and social patterns, could share the same corner of the continent without occasional clashes of interest and arms. But what is most significant is that when troubled times came, the division of forces was not along purely ethnic lines. Red man and white had enough in common to pick their quarrels over issues rather than over skin color. This, in itself, is a sign that the New England Puritans had treated the Indians not as a race apart, but as fellow sinners in God's great universe. It also makes more poignant the ultimate failure of the Puritans' mission to the wilderness.¹⁸

The other major Calvinist body in America was the Dutch Reformed Church which was transplanted from Europe to the New York area by the Dutch West India Company and which was never very strong as a religious force because its adherants had come to America for riches, not to escape religious persecution. Only the ministry seemed concerned about the Indians—many sources indicate that the colonists were more likely to turn heathen than to convert the heathen to their faith.¹⁹ Most of the missionary efforts were aimed at the Indian children. As one minister (in 1628) put it:

As to the natives of this country, I find them entirely savage and wild, strangers to all decency, yea, uncivil and stupid as garden poles, proficient in all wickedness and godlessness....It would be well then to leave the
parents as they are, and begin with the children, who are still young. So be it. But they ought to be separated from their parents...in order to place them under the instruction of some experienced and godly schoolmaster, where they may be instructed not only to speak, read, and write in our language, but also especially in the fundamentals of our Christian religion....

Several years later (1654) missionary success apparently still eluded them:

...you make mention in your letter, that you have gathered from our letters, that the knowledge of the Gospel is making great progress among the Indians here. Speaking with all deference, we do not know or think that we have furnished any such intelligence in our letters. We greatly wish, indeed, that such were the state of things among the Indians, but as yet, there is little appearance of it....We do not indeed expect much fruit of religion among these barbarous nations, until they are brought under the government of Europeans, as these latter increase in numbers.

The Baptists, the Friends, the Presbyterians, the Lutherans, and various other smaller denominations were also being transplanted to the American shores in the colonial period, but due to the pressures of adapting to a new environment and due to the poverty of these particular institutions, most did not begin large-scale Indian missions until after the Revolution.

In the course of the vast German migration to the American colonies, one religious sect, the Moravians, took refuge in Georgia (1735) and later moved to Pennsylvania (1740). Their chief aim in migrating, apart from escaping persecution, was to do missionary work among the German settlers and the Indians. Their settlements of Bethlehem and Nazareth supported about fifty missionaries who did extensive work among the Six Nations and in the Susquehanna Valley. Between 1765 and 1770, David Zeisberger, their leading missionary, established missions
(Friedenshutten, Schonbrunn, Gnadenhutten, and others) on the Susquehanna, Alleghany, and Tuscarawas Rivers. These facilitated the conversion of large numbers of Indians who consequently settled into a more agricultural life-style. In the opinion of many, the Moravians "conducted the most efficient missionary work among the Indians of any of the early colonial churches." For the most part, then, the religious bodies of colonial America could claim few spiritual victories among the pagans of the continent. Many came to America with the hope and sincere intention of winning these people to their faith, but they did not have a sufficiently extensive knowledge of the Indians to develop means of approaching them successfully. What was accomplished was largely the result of the labors of individuals instead of a concerted church effort. At any rate, religion was at a low ebb through most of the colonial period; funds and clergy were scarce nearly everywhere, and the colonists were generally concerned with material rather than spiritual matters. The churches, therefore, had to spend most of their energy keeping their European charges within some semblance of Christianity. The Calvinist churches held to very strict standards for church membership, and this meant that missionary work necessarily entailed an extensive and costly education program. Other denominations were either too recently established or too poor (or both) to initiate any large missions work. Finally, the colonial period saw a great deal of warfare in which the Indians took part against the British colonists. This tended to make the Europeans think of the Indian as a treacherous and savage foe rather than
as a potential Christian brother and thus created a climate of hostility that made missionary work all the less appealing.

The nation's religious scene experienced a vigorous revitalizing process, however, in the phenomenon known as the Great Awakening, "the religious revival that swept through the American colonies between 1739 and 1742." The most important by-product of the revival within the scope of this paper was the new social consciousness and broad humanitarianism which resulted in a renewed enthusiasm for Indian missions.

By the middle of the eighteenth century, however, a new missionary impulse, coming directly out of the revival, sent John Sargent to begin his mission among the Stockbridge Indians in Western Massachusetts, and led Eleazar Wheelock to open his school for the training of missionaries and Indian youth for missionary work among the Indians. The revival also was responsible for starting Presbyterian Indian missions. David Brainerd, a convert of the revival expelled from Yale College because of his revivalism, transferred his church relationship to the Presbyterians and devoted the remainder of his short life to work among the New Jersey and Pennsylvania Indians. His saintly character and life of devotion as revealed in his diary edited by Jonathan Edwards was a tremendous stimulus in promoting interest in missions. Samuel Kirkland's missionary activities among the Senecas and Oneidas in central New York was also a direct outreach of revival influence.

These missions flourished for several years, but as the Revolution neared the American churches fixed their attention on other crises that more deeply affected their white congregations. Throughout the Revolution and in the years immediately following it, missionary work among the aborigines was nearly non-existent.

For approximately fifteen years after independence was secured American church work was at a virtual standstill. The war and the philosophies that accompanied it led many to free
themselves from religious bonds that they had felt compelled to assume in the more conventional pre-war society. The general disruption caused by the hostilities forced many of the churches to reorganize and rebuild, an effort that made them neglect an active preaching program for several years. \(^{27}\)

The Methodists, Baptists, and Presbyterians emerged most rapidly with national organizations and spread into the West as the massive post-war westward migrations began. Many of the churches with close European ties remained on the seashore and tried to "Americanize" their clergy, literature, and financial sources. All of these denominations eventually returned to a fairly aggressive evangelizing work as soon as they were institutionally strong enough. \(^{28}\)

This task was facilitated by the spread of another great "awakening" in the last few years of the 1700's and in the first decade of the new century which filled the churches with new members and renewed vigor. In the wake of this revival there was again aroused a pietistic fervor to carry the Christian message to the heathen, and a great many missionary societies were organized which proclaimed this as either a primary or secondary goal. \(^{29}\) These included The Society for Propagating the Gospel among the Indians and Others in North America (1787), the Society of the United Brethren for Propagating the Gospel Among the Heathen (1787); the New York (1796), the Northern (1797), the Connecticut (1798), the Massachusetts (1799), and the Western (1802) Missionary Societies; the American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions (1810), and the United
Foreign Missionary Society (1817). In the Baptist constitution (1814) and the papers of the Missionary and Bible Society of the Methodist Episcopal Church in America (1820) similar sentiment is expressed.\(^\text{30}\)

The societies were hampered at first by the lack of money (which meant that they could support few missionaries and that these few had to serve tribes close to the society's headquarters) and by the fact that state and regional supremacy prevented the construction of nationwide transportation and communication systems which could widen the scope of missionary activity. This meant that the missionary work of the period (1790-1812) was generally the toil of a few individuals.\(^\text{31}\)

After the War of 1812 the tide of nationalism that swept the country changed the "scope of missionary operations. Denominations organized churchwide societies which drew funds from members in all regions. Missionary directors envisioned stations strung across the continent, and an expanding economy and improved transportation made these dreams practical. More money meant larger stations staffed by missionaries who lived there year-round. Better transportation offered access to tribes further away and enabled the missionary to serve the cause of Manifest Destiny."\(^\text{32}\)

In the years between 1789 and 1825 the federal government tried handling Indian affairs with "peaceful persuasion and negotiation." The political sages of the day believed that the aborigines could and should conform to the ways of European civilization and accordingly encouraged the establishment of
schools among the various tribes. This encouragement was reinforced in 1819 with an appropriation of $10,000 which the President was to receive each year to employ "capable persons of good moral character" to teach the Indians agricultural skills and to instruct Indian children in the conventional schoolroom arts.

The presidents generally distributed this money to the missionary societies, and by 1825 there were thirty-eight such schools.33

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tribes:</th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>By Whom Established</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Choctaw</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>American Board of Foreign Missions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East and West Cherokee</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>Seven by the Am. Bd. of Foreign Missions; two by Baptist General Convention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seneca</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Two by United Foreign Mission Society; one by Baptist General Convention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chickasaw</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>One by Cumberland Mission Board; one by Synod of South Carolina and Georgia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oneida</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>One by Baptist General Convention; one by Protestant Episcopal Church</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Osage</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>United Foreign Mission Society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ottawa</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>One by Baptist General Convention; one by Western Mission Society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chippewa</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>United Foreign Mission Society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creek</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Baptist General Convention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Missouri</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Jesuit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Passamaquoddy</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Society for Propagating the Gospel, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Potawatomie</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Baptist General Convention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tuscarora</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>United Foreign Mission Society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wyandot</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Methodist Episcopal Church</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

These were the major missionary organizations of the nineteenth century, and they expanded their work in various parts of the country as the frontier continued westward. The American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Missions started as a broadly interdenominational society in 1810, but it was soon dominated by the Congregationalists and the New School Presbyterians (those who had moved away from the strict Calvinism of the Westminster
Between the War of 1812 and the Civil War it supported more Indian missionaries than any other society. The United Foreign Missionary Society, which was founded in 1817 and which absorbed several of the Calvinist societies that sprang from the second Great Awakening (most notably the New York Missionary Society), was in turn absorbed into the ABCFM in 1826. The Old School Presbyterians disapproved of the activities of the American Board and so made the Western Missionary Society their agency among the Indians. The Cumberland Mission Board was the missionary organization of the Cumberland Presbyterians, who had broken away from the larger Presbyterian group in one of the revival schisms. The Society for Propagating the Gospel among the Indians and Others in North America was the creation of twenty-one Congregational clergymen and laymen in 1787. This society, with the aid of Harvard College, supported the few non-Moravian missionaries still at work among the Indians at the end of the Revolution. Thus most of the missionary endeavor in the 1812-1860 period was that of Calvinist bodies.

The Baptists, however, were very energetic in this activity once they started. The Baptist General Missionary Convention was established in 1814, and they began extensive work among the Southern Indians. In the same year, Isaac McCoy, one of their most famous agents, began his mission in Indiana. In 1820, the Episcopalians founded the Domestic and Foreign Missionary Society of the Protestant Episcopal Church in the United States, which worked primarily with the Oneidas in Wisconsin. The Friends did not have a specific missionary society, but in their yearly
meetings they appropriated support for the various members of their group engaged in mission work.35

The government-aided mission schools were considered successful by the legislators and the "civilization" fund was therefore renewed annually. In the next few years, however, federal Indian policy moved in a new direction: "The year 1825 might be regarded as the year terminating the old federal Indian policy of peaceful persuasion and negotiation and beginning the new coercive policy."36 The Indians were pushed to the west of the Mississippi River and the eastern missions had to close down to follow them. Washington continued to contribute its yearly $10,000 plus other sums of money provided by treaty stipulations for education. Private citizens and mission societies donated increasingly large amounts for the same purposes. The missionaries re-established their schools and resumed a vigorous teaching program with impressive results. Many Indians sent their children to them and many were turned away for lack of facilities, despite the increasing numbers of buildings, teachers, and materials. Not only did the missionaries have their former eastern congregations to tend to, but their scope was expanded to include the Indians indigenous to the West. The official fund was not increased, but the treaty agreements were altered to provide more money for schools. In addition, some tribes contributed from their own resources. In 1834, there were sixty schools with 137 teachers and 2,000 pupils; by 1848 "sixteen manual labor schools, eighty-seven boarding and other schools were reported in operation, and several additional manual labor schools under contract."37 Mis-
sionaries were sent to the Plains tribes and to the Pacific coast and hopes were high for the Christianization of the entire continent.\(^38\)

The 1840's saw the ebb of this great evangelical movement as "...the slavery issue began to hamper mission effort. The missionary current as part of the great national tide broke upon the rocks of sectionalism. As denominations divided into northern and southern churches, missions were parceled out between the contending parties. Finally the turmoil of the Civil War compelled many mission stations to close their doors."\(^39\) The Presbyterians were split between the "Old" and "New" Schools, with the predominantly Southern "Old" school withdrawing to form its own mission society. The Episcopalians were divided among the high and low (evangelical) churchmen. Other churches suffered similar schisms. In addition to the breakdown of the old denominations there was the emergence of new sects and varieties of religious experience, including Mormonism, Millerism (the Seventh Day Adventists), spiritualism, and communistic experiments. And above all this hung the abolition issue, which split the churches that were fairly evenly distributed throughout the nation (namely, the Baptists, the Methodists, and the Presbyterians).\(^40\)

In this missionizing period between the War of 1812 and the Civil War, the Protestants undertook to both Christianize and civilize the American Indian. Various denominations stressed one over the other (Moravians favored Christianity first, Quakers, Congregationalists, and Presbyterians were ardent civilization-first adherants, and the Baptists and Methodists varied), but none
denied that both were necessary elements of their mission to
the aborigines. The civilization they hoped to impart was that
of the nineteenth century United States; they propagated econo-
mic individualism, republicanism and democracy, and the liberty
of the individual. Protestantism, of course, was seen to be an
integral part of this whole system. Thus the missionary held
the basic values of his culture in common with other Americans.
He dressed in a certain style, possessed but one wife, believed
in abstract justice, ate certain foods in certain ways, and
favored the specific economic and political system of his fellow
countrymen. At the same time missionaries represented a sub-
culture within American life, for they emphasized theology and
morals more than other people. They adhered more vigorously to
the sexual code, were more honest (or were supposed to be), pro-
pounded the theological system more seriously, and were more con-
cerned with the minor taboos of drink and the verbal prohibitions
against obscenity, profanity, and blasphemy. The Indians were
the most in need of civilizing salvation because their life
styles were the least attuned to this unilinear progress toward
the goals held dear by Americans of the day. They were savagism
personified: they did not grasp "The intellectual and moral
qualities that Americans have deemed necessary to civilization
in the United States." Since the missionary's "stock in trade"
was moral evaluation it was he who took it upon himself to bring
the savages to the level of culture deemed necessary for parti-
cipation in the Christian world which the religious of the day
were busily planning. There was a sense of urgency about this
task, as well, as this was a period of millenial expectation--they had to work quickly and well lest the Second Coming find them with work undone.43

As the century progressed, however, and schools were established, churches built, and congregations enlarged, there was never a long-lasting, general feeling of elation about the work accomplished. The ABCFM did close its mission operations among the Cherokees with the announcement that its presence there was no longer needed, but even there it was probably financial pressure that forced the decision. The churches generally saw their Indian work as a failure for a variety of reasons. In the first place they expected immediate success that was impossible in such a contact situation. Secondly, interpretations of what constituted success varied according to those involved; the definition depended on the class outlook, religious perspectives, and other characteristics of the observer. Those who stressed an emotional rather than intellectual religion could see more encouraging results, for example, but all accounted their slow success a failure. Because the missionaries believed that their charges could not sustain their Christian status without assuming the white civilization, they felt compelled to spend considerable time on the civilizing process, but the more time spent teaching white man's ways meant less time spent propagating the Gospel, and vice versa. Thus the mission process was inevitably snail-paced.44

What is more, the American culture of the time was not static: "Even if the Indians had achieved the material condition the whites possessed at the commencement of missionization, the Indians
would still have been considered backward in light of the subsequent change in American civilization. Here success turned bitter because the goal had actually changed.  

Not only the unreasonably high standards of the missionaries hindered their success, however; very substantial cultural difficulties also stood in their way. When the missionary made converts he created a faction in the tribe and thereby set up an opposition to his further efforts. In addition, Indians were loath to give up their accustomed life-styles, and even if they had, it was no guarantee that the white population was willing to accept them: "By discriminating against the aborigine upon the basis of a belief of white cultural superiority, Americans forced the Indian to remain savage and guaranteed the failure of the missionary program."  

As the churches hit the skids in the 1840's so did their missionary program which was a discouragement to them despite several decades of fervent and devoted effort. Meanwhile the insistent mood of manifest destiny took another tack in the handling of Indian affairs:

In the 1840's, Americans discovered that the West, to which they had consigned the Indian, itself needed the creative hand of civilization. The notion of removal, of pushing the Indian to the Great Plains, somewhere west of the Mississippi, no longer seemed practicable; for then he would stand between Americans and Santa Fe, Oregon, and California. He had to be dealt with; his newly acquired lands had to be taken over; and still he had to be brought to civilization, or die. What eventually resulted was the reservation system, whereby Indians were segregated and gathered together on specific pieces of land assigned to specific tribes. These were to be savage islands in the midst of civilized seas. The good hope was that once they were on their islands, Indians would be at long last liable to proper civilizing.
During Reconstruction many of the Indian wars (the Sioux in the 1860's, 1870's, and 1890's, the Cheyenne and Arapahoes in the 1860's, the Modocs and Nez Perces in the 1870's, to name a few) broke out due to the incessant pressure of white settlement in the West, and many of the missionaries there had to flee. The humanitarian movement of the day demanded that something be done to aid the Indians. During President Grant's administration, therefore, the "Peace Policy" was inaugurated. It provided two million dollars for immediate relief and set up a Board of Indian Commissioners to administer it. This board, which had the power to inspect and advise the Indian Office, was in sympathy with the missionaries and acted as an intermediary between them and the government. At this time the reservation agencies were apportioned to various church bodies for religious instruction and Indian agents were chosen largely from lists of nominees submitted by the churches.

Generally speaking, however, after the Civil War the campaign for the welfare of the Indians fell into the hands of the humanitarians, "for American censure in the past century had reduced the Indian to a state so pitiful as to be comprehended only by philanthropy and humanitarianism." And most of those who took up the cause were those who had been involved in the antislavery movement.

Some concentrated on Indian-rights work, while others became involved in a multitude of reform causes. The political sympathies of nearly all were with the Republicans... Most of them lived in Massachusetts, Pennsylvania, and New York, but a few had migrated to the Far West, where firsthand observation had converted them to work for Indian rights. Among them were congressmen, teachers, ministers, businessmen, Indian agents, Federal
Government officials, farmers, journalists and writers, and several who could be called professional reformers. Nearly all were middle-class idealists who believed in the basic right of all men to freedom from oppression and who felt an obligation to bring this belief to reality....Ideas of progressive transition and change did guide their thoughts and actions on most significant social issues, but they were not revolutionaries or truly utopian thinkers. They had no desire to overturn the basic social, political, or economic structure of the nation, and most of them were too experienced and too realistic to expect social perfection....The reformers appealed to two authorities to justify their demands for change. One was religious, documented by the New Testament; the other was political, documented by the Declaration of Independence and the Bill of Rights. The political authority was the legal framework, and the religious authority provided the basic foundation for the entire structure of human rights—the pervading power of love and the brotherhood of mankind. Practical and rational on one hand, mystical and pietistic on the other, they assumed that what they were doing was right and just. Wendell Phillips called it a 'working reform Christianity' that he believed would regenerate the world.  

These reformers were no devotees of materialism, but they did believe that if the Indians could own and cultivate their own plots of land they would more easily learn the ways of and be absorbed into the larger American society. They therefore supported the Dawes Act and campaigned for it through to its adoption. Although it did not contain all the provisions they had hoped for, it did embody the majority of their demands, and they were generally satisfied that they had substantially improved the lot of the Indian. Thereafter those who remained in the movement (many of the great reformers were by this time dead or incapacitated by age) tended to concentrate their efforts on watchdog activities—recommending the hiring or removal of certain agents, calling attention to corruption, and advising the government in matters dealing with specific tribes.
As the reformers were taking over the cause of Indian affairs, the churches turned their attention to several new facts of American life. These included the great increase in the wealth of the nation, the rise of emotional religions as many of the lower classes were forced out of the increasingly affluent middle-class sects, and the problems posed by a militant laboring class. Foreign missions commanded more and more of the church's attention, especially after the Spanish-American War. The home missionary work that continued was centered in Oklahoma and in the various reservations where the religious workers maintained the schools and clinics they had established years before, but there was no great feeling of accomplishment concerning the work being done.\textsuperscript{53}

The 1920's produced a decided decline in missionary interest. In foreign mission fields the "heathen" were not so sure that they wanted Western religion. Nationalism made missionary presence unacceptable in many parts of the world. An anti-(any) religion movement made the church's task even more difficult. The home missions to the Indians were not in much better condition.\textsuperscript{54} The Board of Indian Commissioners financed an extensive study of the matter and published its conclusions in a bulletin entitled "Christian Missions among the American Indians". Some of their opinions follow:

This bulletin presents certain facts about the history, progress, present distribution, and needs of the Christian missions among the American Indians....The missions maintained on Indian reservations by the Protestant and Catholic churches have long been regarded as cooperating units with the board and the Bureau of Indian Affairs in the Federal
Government's effort to aid and qualify Indians to take their places as self-supporting, independent men and women in the general citizenry of the Nation.

...The Federal officers have recognized the missionaries as influential members of the authorized personnel on the reservations. The Government as the guardian and trustee of some 240,000 Indians desires and welcome the cooperation of the mission boards in all endeavors to promote the welfare of the Indians.

The members of the Board of Indian Commissioners are constrained to feel that the members of the Christian churches are not sufficiently informed on matters concerning our American Indians, and because of this there seems to be a lack of interest in the Indian mission activities. Information is the mother of interest and interest is the mother of generosity.

The reader of this bulletin, and particularly of that part of it which contains testimony and recommendations of the missionaries themselves, will probably agree that there is room for greater efficiency in the Indian mission field, for larger appropriations for Indian mission work, for more appreciation of the manifold problems faced by Indian missionaries and a stronger recognition of their value as a Christianizing and civilizing influence among the Indian people.

...The Board of Indian Commissioners believe that Christian teaching and the upbuilding of Christian character are fundamental necessities in any plan of action designed 'to hasten the progress and development of the Indian wards of the United States and their absorption into active and serviceable citizenship.' It is hoped that the facts here presented will quicken interest and stimulate greater efficiency in this important work.

As the country moved into the great depression missionary work suffered even more. They were allotted even smaller budgets as contributions to the church greatly declined. The youth of the day tended to avoid missionary duties to work instead for more secular ideals. The great revivals of the past had usually spawned missionaries in vast numbers, but these old awakenings were not part of the contemporary ecclesiastical style.

Alarmed by this state of affairs, the various mission boards commissioned a study of the matter. The result of this inquiry was a book by William E. Hocking, Rethinking Missions
(1932). It recommended that missions be continued and strengthened, but with changed methods and modified motives. It also reflected a growing insistence that the Protestant missionary effort be unified to a much greater degree. "Though sharply resented by many missionaries, the report as a whole was well received by the executives of the missionary boards represented on the commission, and steps were soon being taken to put many of the recommendations into operation."  

This brief history of missionary work with the North American Indians serves to point out several aspects of this activity. One such fact is that the churches have often been the handmaiden of the government. When the British wanted to build an empire, the missionaries were encouraged to go spread the religion of Englishmen to the inhabitants of the North American continent. When the interests of the United States pointed to westward expansion, churches and their missionaries were helped to set up schools and chapels to prepare the Indians for the onslaught of the white culture it was hoped they would learn to appreciate and adopt. When the corruption of the Indian department became intolerable, the government turned to the religious for advice on who to appoint, responded to their pressure in passing new Indian legislation, and gave over various reservations to the denominations for religious instruction. 

Secondly, a gradual progress from the religious to the secular can be seen in Indian relations. The seventeenth and eighteenth century missionaries relied for the most part on their own funds and initiative to fulfill their task. Eliot, Mayhew,
and the rest took up the evangelization of the Indian by their own choice and worked largely according to their own means and methods. In the nineteenth century the church became a partner of the government in the handling of Indian affairs. In the early part of the century this involved accepting federal money for schools for the "civilizing" process. In the latter half, one element of the church continued this acculturation task with the reservation schools and churches provided for in Grant's Peace Policy while a more secular-minded group of "working reform" Christians took over the Indian rights movement. The latter group was part of the reform stream from which Collier imbibed many of his philosophies even though they tended to fade away when they felt that they had done their best in pressing through the Dawes Bill. In the twentieth century the Indian reform movement passed into basically secular hands, culminating with Collier's program which was not at all enamored of the idea of pressing the Indians into an American Protestant mold.

This incessant design of civilizing the Indians was still another element of the American missionary movement. After having defined savagism as that which did not correspond to the American life-style of the time, the American people set out to rid their nation of all that was foreign in this respect. As Thomas Hart Benton put it: "Civilization, or extinction, has been the fate of all people who have found themselves in the track of the advancing Whites, and civilization, always the preference of the Whites, has been pressed as an object, while extinction has followed as a consequence of resistance. The Black and the Red
Races have often felt their ameliorating influence." From the early Puritans, who wanted to conform the Indians to the habits of good Calvinists, to the twentieth century Board of Indian Commissioners who believed that "Christian teaching and the upbuilding of Christian character" were necessities if the American Indians were to become "active and serviceable" citizens, there was never a thought that the Indians could become Christians without adopting a European Christian lifestyle. This leads to the inevitable question: how did the Protestant missionaries of the 1930's respond to John Collier's plans to protect and preserve Indian life and culture?
NOTES TO CHAPTER IV


4 "Articles, Instructions and Orders made...for the good Order and Government of the two several Colonies and Plantations to be made by our loving subjects, in the Country commonly called Virginia and America..." in Brown, op. cit., vol. I, pp. 67-68.


10 Smith, Handy, and Loetscher, *op. cit.*, p. 46.


13 *ibid.*, pp. 263-269.


16 *ibid.*, pp. 298-303.

17 *ibid.*, pp. 309-322.

18 *ibid.*, p. 338.


22 Sweet, *Religion in Colonial America*, pp. 120-166, 210-270; Frank S. Mead, *Handbook of Denominations*, pp. 31-33, 108-109,


28 *ibid.*, pp. 193-222.

29 *ibid.*, pp. 223-231.

30 Robert Berkhofer, Jr., *Salvation and the Savage* (University of Kentucky Press, 1965), p. 3.

31 *ibid.*, p. 1.

32 *ibid.*, p. 2.


34 *ibid.*, pp. 163-164.

35 Berkhofer, pp. 162-178.

36 Harmon, p. 167.

37 *ibid.*, pp. 351-360.


39 Berkhofer, p. 2.

41 Berkhofer, op. cit., pp. 4-15.

42 ibid., p. 9.

43 ibid., pp. 11-13.

44 ibid., pp. 152-158.

45 ibid., p. 158.

46 ibid., p. 159.


48 ibid., p. 241.


50 Pearce, op. cit., p. 241.


52 ibid., pp. 198-228.


57 *ibid.*, p. 417.

58 *Pearce, op. cit.*, p. 240.
CHAPTER V
THE MISSIONARY RESPONSE TO COLLIER

In searching the church publications, and especially those of the missionary societies, for reaction to the Indian Reorganization Act and its consequences, it is surprising at first to discover that it wasn't greeted with pages of immediate and indignant condemnation. At first reading it seems a fringe issue; many other topics seem to have captured more ecclesiastical attention at that time. As William R. Hutchison put it:

To the historians of American religious thought few events or clusters of events have seemed so pivotal as the Protestant theological "bouleverse­ment" of the years around 1930. Interpreters have laid great stress upon America's awakening, at that moment of deep cultural crisis, to European theolo­gies of divine transcendence. They have remarked the sudden stirrings of new life in American semi­naries after 1930, the publication of certain mani­festoes which preached a need for realism about human prospects, and the meteoric rise of Reinhold Niebuhr as prime critic of progressive optimism. Other historians of our culture have been debating whether an 'end of American innocence' is most readily discernible just after Versailles, just be­fore Sarajevo, or perhaps as far back as the 1890's. The theologians and church historians, however, have remained nearly unanimous in placing their theological watershed at the turn into the Depression decade.

In the light of these larger developments, however, the church pronouncements on the Indian New Deal assume significance as examples of how Protestantism was adapting to the realities of twentieth century America. It is therefore necessary to briefly examine what was predominant in American Protestant thought of the time.

One of these new trends indicative of the new order of religious matters in the United States was the disassociation of Protestantism with Americanism. These two concepts were-
equated in the minds of many Americans by the end of the nineteenth century. "It is a commonplace that toward the end of the nineteenth century Protestantism largely dominated the American culture, setting the prevailing mores and the moral standards by which personal and public, individual and group, conduct was judged. If a culture is the tangible form of a religion, in the United States that religion was Protestantism. As H. Paul Douglas put it, 'despite multiplying sectarian differences, Protestantism's prevalence tended to create a Protestant cultural type....It was a triumph of religion still on the communal level.'" In other words, "...the bulk of American Protestantism achieved during this period a working ideological harmony with the modes of the modern industrialized civilization, the free-enterprise system, and the burgeoning imperialism."^

During the early part of the twentieth century, however, while Protestantism was being challenged by the labor problems of the day, by the new Protestant theologies (to be discussed in following pages), and by the competition of popular secular organizations, the Catholics and Jews of the country were making substantial gains in both numbers and in the solidarity of their position in American society. The great Irish immigration of the period played a significant part in this process:

Due to this predominant Irish influence, Catholicism in America soon acquired a special character which... indubitably helped it survive and adapt itself to American reality. In the first place, the Catholicism the Irish brought with them seemed less foreign to American eyes....It was English-speaking, 'puritanical', democratic, popular, and activistic....But perhaps the
most distinctive feature of Irish Catholicism...was the fusion of religion and nationalism in the Irish mind. In the centuries of struggle against an alien and Protestant master, national loyalty came to take on an intense religious coloring....To be a Catholic was to be a true Irishman; to be an Irishman was to be a true Catholic...the Irish newcomer--after some hesitation--adopted this country as his own, and transferred his deeply emotional nationalism to his adopted land. His Americanism took on the same religious fervor and soon came to be identified with his Catholicism....In any case, it was under Irish hegemony, and largely through the advantages which their distinctive background gave to the Irish clergy, that the Catholic Church in America was consolidated into an American religious community.

The church that the Irish molded according to their religious heritage absorbed and "Americanized" the German, Italian, and Slavic Catholics who also poured into the country at this time.

In becoming a major part of American religious life, the Catholics had to adjust somewhat to the American social peculiarities. This adjustment involved becoming activist and conforming their beliefs on the relation of church and state to the American tradition. The most important element of this adjustment, however, was for the Church, which believed itself to be the one true and universal church, to regard itself as part of a religious plurality: "By the second quarter of the present century the American Catholic, like every other American, was thinking of his church as one of the three 'religions of democracy,' side by side with the other two; he could hardly imagine an America without Protestants and Jews--even though he might be deeply suspicious of Protestants and not altogether free of anti-Semitism."5

The Jews of the United States underwent a similar process. The influx of East European Jews in the late 1800's...
forced American Judaism to reorganize itself to accommodate them. As the second and third generations of these immigrants improved their social and economic standings they shed their sense of cultural distinctiveness. They saw themselves as "Americans differing from other Americans in little but religion."\(^6\) The third generation felt so securely American that they began to return to and reassert the religion that their parents had tended to downplay, and there developed a considerable scholarship in and celebration of American Judaism.\(^7\)

By the end of the first third of the twentieth century, therefore, America was no longer a primarily Protestant nation. Immigration and creative forces within Catholicism and Judaism had made for a condition of religious pluralism rather than an official or unofficial "state church". This, then, was one change that Protestants of the time were witnessing in their world.

While these religions were coming to the fore, Protestantism was undergoing theological difficulties. This period saw the decline of liberalism in its battles with the conservatives (fundamentalists) and radicals (modernists) in the church, and the emergence of neo-orthodoxy as the predominant theological statement of American Protestantism.

The theological liberals tended to emphasize human reason and play down divine revelation. They were optimistic about progress and saw man as inherently good. "The growing popularity of the liberal theology in the early decades of the present century was in some measure related to the closeness of
the churches to the culture. The intellectual revolution associated with the impact of scientific and historical thinking had affected the prosperous and educated middle and upper classes, especially in the North, in the later nineteenth century. Many of these people had been reared in predominantly revivalistic, Bible-centered, conservative Protestantism. Not a few found that their faith was being eaten away by the acids of modernity. In the crisis, they found the new patterns of liberal theology a way of saving faith.⁸

After World War I, however, philosophies emphasizing the goodness of man and the spirit of progress lost their flavor and the conservatives strove to take control of the denominations. They sought to have the churches accept the Bible as "the inerrant and verbally inspired Word of God." Their leader and figurehead was William Jennings Bryan, but after his death following the Scopes trial, the movement lost its momentum and split into several factions. Several liberal leaders who were dissatisfied with their former stance moved beyond liberalism to what was called modernism. They defined it as: "the use of the methods of modern science to find, state, and use the permanent and central values of inherited orthodoxy in meeting the needs of a modern world."⁹ Some retained a Christian position, while others became theistic rather than Christian and still others became basically humanists.

In general, religion became unattractive to many; Protestantism was in a spiritual depression. When the economic depression and the reports of the rise of totalitarianism and
barbarism in the world of the 1930's appeared, liberalism disintegrated. Moving in to take its place, however, was a new theological current from Europe, neo-orthodoxy (also called dialectical theology or theology of crisis). The major American voice in this movement was Reinhold Niebuhr, and he with his followers preached a return to an earlier theology that stressed the primacy of faith, the centrality of the Bible, the sinfulness of man, and the transcendence of God. It was a more realistic theology that decried faith in man's innate goodness and in his ability and rejected political and economic systems that presupposed a human ability to reasonably control man's own destiny. The intellectual and theological toughness of this new school gave American Protestantism a new and solid core around which to organize and so helped the church rebuild in the 1930's.¹⁰

Another great source of stress in the Protestantism of the time was the ecumenical movement. Although the first twenty years of the century had witnessed increased cooperation between the denominations in the mission and Social Gospel programs, in the campaign for the prohibition of alcohol, and in various other causes, it wasn't until the 1920's and 1930's that there developed a great push toward ecumenicity, or oneness in the faith. There occurred a growth of the community church movement (i.e., local churches that included all denominations) and a series of mergers that encouraged church union proponents.¹¹ Closer ties were also established between the various agencies of the churches—especially the missions boards. Several of the missionary
journals also combined their operations at this time.

Foreign missions had been a favorite cause of the church since about 1900. Great congresses of missions boards declared the need for the Christianization of the world, various organizations recruited students to help "evangelize the world in this generation", and the Y.M.C.A., the Laymen's Missionary Movement, the Men and Religion Forward Movement, and other such crusades engendered further enthusiasm for the cause.¹²

After World War I and the decline of missionary giving, the lack of new recruits, and the appearance of opposition to missionary presence in many places, the mission boards commissioned the study of the situation referred to in the last chapter. During much of the 1930's the boards were busy measuring the response to this evaluation of mission work from field workers and others while trying to rebuild the program.

Thus, as the 1930's unfolded with all their economic and political convolutions, the Protestant churches of America were wrestling with their own internal problems. They were adjusting to being one of three major religious communities rather than "a religious movement sweeping the continent or as a national church representing the religious life of the people."¹³ They were also trying to close ranks with the ecumenical movement, to find a stable theology, and to repair their foreign missions program.

While all these tempests raged in the Protestant world, Collier introduced his programs and the missionaries of the day responded. His ideas were not new to them. They had clashed
with Collier and the AIDA over many issues in the previous
decade—most significantly over the Indian Department order
discouraging tribal dances ("There seems little question that
the Dance Order was issued in response to pressure from mis-
sionaries and (the Indian Rights Association") and over the
peyote question. Their authority in Indian matters had been
challenged; the validity of their moral judgments had been
called into question.

When Collier and the ideas he espoused were given
official sanction by the administration that gave him the In-
dian Commissionership, the initial reactions of the missionaries
were somewhat hostile and were expressed in a tone that indi-
cated annoyance with those who thought that a radical new scheme
for operating Indian affairs would produce more substantial
progress than the traditional approaches. In 1933 George
Hinman of the American Missionary Association summed up the
prevailing views of his fellow workers on the American Indian
missions in a book that he published that year. His thoughts
on the Collier school of Indian management follow:

From among them (tourists, artists, etc.) has arisen
a considerable group of sentimentalists who object to
any interference with the religion of the Indian, who
idealize the sun worship of the Pueblos and even apolo-
gize for the use of phallic symbols in the religious
processions. To them the missionary is a nuisance.
They maintain that the Indian must be allowed to prac-
tice religion in his own way. Some of them claim the
constitutional guarantees for freedom of worship to
protect the old tribal ceremonies, overlooking the
fact that much of the motive for keeping them up is
now largely commercial, to satisfy the curiosity of
tourists looking for a show.

Many of the younger Indians have lost acquain-
tances with or interest in the rites of the old reli-
gion, and some of the sentimentalists are urging that
they be taught these things in the government boarding schools. There was a proposal made in a conference of Indian Service teachers that Indian medicine men should be brought into the schools to give religious instruction to the Indian children just as the Roman Catholic and Protestant missionaries do....Some artists and writers dream of the perpetuation of an unmodified Indian culture existing in the midst of our American civilization as a sort of picture gallery for beauty lovers, like the unchanging glories of the mountains and canyons of the Indian country.

Mary Austin, high priestess of the old Indian culture of the Southwest, finds the missionaries absolutely objectionable, and advocated... 'letting the so-called Christianized Indians alone, and trusting time and local influence to restore them to their original culture.' She thinks 'the so-called Christianized Indians become, as a rule, untrustworthy, and lose the natural integrity of Indian character as well as the dignity of Indian culture.' But she overlooks the fact that the 'local influence' is changing rapidly. The Coolidge dam and the Hoover dam...will continue to modify the local influences, so that the old desert culture will not much longer correspond to the environment....

In spite of protests the assimilating power of our American civilization is steadily modifying the habits of all the Indians, and inevitably fitting them into the molds of our Christian social standards. An appeal for the preservation of the old Indian culture could not well discriminate between the picturesque colorful features of a public display for tourists and the brutalities and obscenities of the sun dance and the initiations. Those white persons who want to preserve the best of the old Indian culture can hardly set themselves up as judges of what is best. That should be left to the judgment of educated and thinking Indians who have had a chance to know both the old and the new.16

Hinman went on to summarize some of the progress that had been made in reconciling Indians to Christian life-styles and then arrived at his evaluation of what the future program of mission work should be. He saw the basic mistake of earlier policy as the process of subjugating rather than assimilating the Indian. As a consequence the present-day missionary had to work with those natives handicapped by the "psychology of the defeated", and they therefore had to patiently and laboriously
win back the confidence of the Indians before they could expect them to be open to their religious instruction. Consequently he saw the campaign for the economic and social amelioration of the native living conditions as the top priority for the contemporary missionary.

One cannot study Protestant Indian missions without being convinced that the Indian's religious progress is considerably dependent on his economic status. The Salvation Army's formula, 'soup, soap and salvation', applies in Indian missions; but the stages cannot follow as rapidly as they do in some rescue work in cities....The Indian can no longer take for granted the old economic life of his ancestors; he can no longer maintain himself as they did in the hunting or pastoral stage. He finds himself an alien in the new economic order of the white man. Material aid given by the government has done little to solve his problem of life-adjustment—which is learning to work successfully under the conditions of American country and village life, as his white neighbors are doing. Bewildered by the complexity of modern industrial conditions, enfeebled by inaction and paternalism during the transitional stage from the old to the new, embittered by the injustice and misunderstanding of the white man, he faces the task of 'getting a job' in the common life of his fellow Americans with unusual handicaps.17

He asserted that the missionaries must realize that one of the most important aspects of their ministry was to help the Indian make the cultural transition from nomadic to industrial life and to teach the skills necessary to make such an adjustment.

Hinman also saw the need of bringing certain social habits under the discipline of state and local legal standards. "The Indian is now largely without the support of the old sanctions, and not yet brought under the influence of the new, the law and order of the American community. This is a problem of religious work, not merely a question of legal jurisdiction."18

He also felt that having to learn and adhere to the strictures
of European justice would hasten the end of the segregation of the white and Indian communities and thereby make it easier for Indians to build the economic and social lives they desired.

Finally, Hinman wanted to phase out missionary work and turn over the leadership of the Indian churches to native leaders who were supported by their own congregations. Until such time as the Indians had self-maintaining and self-propagating Christian churches, he felt that the missionary work was unfulfilled. 19

At about the same time that Hinman's work appeared, another prominent churchman published a book that dealt somewhat more intellectually with the problems of missions. Robert E. Speer's The Finality of Jesus Christ investigated the relation of Christianity to non-Christian religions. While taking a more objective view of the virtues and vices of the latter, he developed substantial arguments explaining why they were not acceptable to Christianity and how Christian churches should deal with them.

I think that it is necessary that we should make some distinctions that are too often overlooked, with a good deal of resultant confusion. First between religion and race. Each race, it is held, develops its own religion, the religion best suited to its own character and needs....It may be that its religion has now become, as a depository and projection of the racial inheritance, a moulding educational influence in the perpetuation of the race and its racial character, but even so it was and is itself an effect and not a cause of the racial temper and personality and experience. 20

He maintained, however, that Christianity could not be classed as a race religion. "The simple faith that Jesus Christ, the Son of God, is Lord is not a racial or Western faith." 21 Furthermore, he attacked one of the missionary assumptions of the nine-
teenth century:

A second distinction which must be made is between religion and culture or civilization. The mistake is constantly made of conceiving the missionary enterprise as an interchange of cultures, and its problems as the problems of contacts with non-Christian religions. Culture and religion are not identical terms. No careful and true definition of either will allow their identification, unless 'religion' is used to cover everything and so loses all definition whatsoever.\(^2\)

In addition:

A third distinction must be drawn between religions and their adherents....This...distinction will save us from the error of condoning or overlooking the evil and falsehood in the non-Christian religions out of charity and tenderness toward the sincerity and faith of those who believe in these faiths.\(^3\)

He went on to claim that whatever good and beauty may be found in these religions does not make them acceptable to Christians; if they are not in accordance with the Christian dogma, then the Christian world is duty-bound to present its own faith to them. They (the Christians) may not ignore, preserve or perpetuate, nor merge with them and remain truly Christian. It is necessary to do away with the non-Christian content of the religion and refill it with the gospel message.\(^4\)

These two writers reflected the basic attitudes of the Protestant church to Indian missions at the outset of Collier's administration. Speer, the theologian, re-emphasizes the point that Christians are those with a faith and a very definite set of beliefs to perpetuate. To compromise or deviate from these beliefs is to abandon Christianity. What is more, the Christian must seek out the heathen to present this faith to them; to be negligent in this respect is to be a poor Christian. The
churchman is responsible for the salvation of all his fellow men. Hinman, the author with the more intimate knowledge of this one mission field, emphasizes that the church cannot sympathize with the "sentimentalists" who strive to preserve the Indian culture. He maintained that the old Indian order was already gone, that the content had vanished, leaving only empty forms and meaningless rituals. He therefore stressed that the best Indian policy was that which hastened the assimilation of the native into white American life, and he believed that the missionary had a vital part in that process.

These were reactions to the general new humanitarian trend in Indian affairs of which Collier was a part. With the announcement of the provisions of the Indian Reorganization Act, Collier's personal program for reservation management, the alarm in the missionary ranks was soon expressed in print. G. E. E. Lindquist, missionary at large for the Society for Propagating the Gospel Among the Indians, wrote:

Any policy, therefore, which directly or by implication constitutes a limitation of missionary cooperation with the Indian Service and tends to nullify the constructive efforts of the past, as well as having far-reaching effects on the future, is a matter of deep concern to those interested in the task of elevating and improving the condition of the American Indians. That such a limitation is in prospect is the conviction of missionary workers, both Indian and white, if the recently announced plans of Hon. John Collier, the present Commissioner of Indian Affairs, are put into operation.

Two aspects of these plans particularly worried Lindquist:

The underlying assumption of the Collier proposal is that the 'Indian's master problem is land'....Those interested in missionary work among the Indians feel that while the possession of land is important it is
by no means 'the Indian's master problem'. Land itself is only potential wealth; the mere fact of possession will not feed or clothe anyone....Unless there is stimulated from within a desire to be and to do, all the land with its wealth of untapped resources, will avail the Indian but little. 'Too often we strive,' as one worker has put it, 'to conserve the Indian's property at the expense of his manhood, his ambition, his finer values. He will develop responsibility only by having responsibility to bear.'

But the feature of the Government proposals that causes the deepest concern to missionary workers, and that is apt to have the most baneful effect on the future of the Indian, is the revival of tribalism and the segregation and isolation involved in 'the back to the reservation' movement. Many feel also that the encouragement of the dance ceremonials in the Commissioner's order of January 3, 1934...is one of the first steps in the attempt to revive 'the cult of the primitive'. This order directs the superintendents to inform the Indians 'that native religious life and Indian culture' is not to be frowned upon by Government representatives; and, that 'no interference with Indian religious life or ceremonial expression will hereafter be tolerated.'

Lindquist describes the missionary task as one of trying "to preserve the best of the past, and to fill it with new meaning."

He pointed out that while the missionaries had cooperated with the ethnologists, anthropologists, and others interested in the original Indian culture, they asserted always that "the Indian must be saved by a process of Christian assimilation to American life, not by a carefully guarded and subsidized segregation." They opposed anything that encouraged separation and racial discrimination. The church, he claimed, considers the Indian's "essential humanity and that the Church of Christ owes him more because he is a human being than because he is an Indian."

In March of 1934, both Catholic and Protestant missionaries at the Plains Indian Congress in Rapid City, South
Dakota, issued the following statement concerning their feelings about the legislation Collier was proposing:

We are in favor of:

1. The encouragement of spiritual values.
2. The Indian making his contribution to the life of community and nation.
3. The Indian sharing in the responsibilities and the privileges of government and citizenship.
4. 'No special advantages, no special disadvantages' for the Indian.
5. The following features of the Wheeler-Howard bill:
   A. The educational provisions, especially the training of Indian young people for positions in the Indian service.
   B. The providing of land for young Indians who are looking forward to the establishment of homes and were born too late to acquire land rights.
   C. The effort to untangle the problems in connection with heirship lands.
   D. Increasing self-government in those distinctly Indian interests in which the Indians share exclusively as members of an Indian tribe or group.

We are opposed to the following:

1. It perpetuates segregation. In more progressive communities where the Indians share in the general social and economic life of the community, it means even going back to segregation. Tribalism means exemptions and exemptions lead to race prejudice.
2. It perpetuates freedom from taxation instead of looking forward to the time when the Indian contributes his proportionate share to the cost of government.
3. The Indian Court also promotes segregation. The Court may mean prompter justice, but it perpetuates the present intolerable situation where Indians escape punishment of crimes because they do not come under the jurisdiction of state laws and only very few Indian crimes are punishable under Federal Statute.
4. While seemingly granting the Indian new liberties we are of the opinion that the bill means a great increase in supervision and delay in action on the part of the Secretary of the Interior and the Commissioner of Indian Affairs.
5. The conviction back of the bill that the land allotment system is at the bottom of the Indian's poverty. Possession of land as such does not mean salvation for any people.

6. The implication that physical values are supreme and spiritual values are nonexistent.

Both Lindquist's and the Rapid City statements underscore the basic religious objections to Collier's philosophy. They declared that no land policy could succeed in improving the Indian condition if the Indians themselves were not prepared to make the best of it. Only when the natives became responsible for their lands would this happen, and it was through missionary efforts that they were learning the spiritual values that prepared them to assume this responsibility. They also discouraged anything that stood in the way of the acculturation process for which they had so diligently worked. The bulk of their work in the nineteenth century had involved "civilizing" the native population. They looked to the day when red man and white could live together as Christian brothers, and thus they were most distressed by those parts of the Indian Reorganization Act which seemed to foster segregation and emphasize that which was uniquely Indian. And again, they could not approve anything that impeded their task of converting souls to Christianity.

Another writer took a slightly different tack in upholding the missionary position. Elaine Goodale Eastman opposed Collier's plans as reactionary and as detrimental to the Indian well-being. While admitting that "all pagan worship is naturally frowned upon by Christian missionaries," she saw the crux of the
issue not in the question of whether or not the native religions were harmonious with missionary dogma or even with the original culture, but whether or not they were suited for the twentieth century Indians who had already been intensively exposed to European culture.\textsuperscript{29} She concluded by claiming that Collier was "no true friend to our Indians. We have spent and are spending millions annually in a national effort to build them up—not as exotic tribes with primitive conceptions of life and conduct, but as competent individuals, and as an acceptable element in the general population....Is there not something hopelessly incongruous about rhapsodizing—and publically upholding—their communal, dramatic prayer for rain, while at the same time teaching scientific forestry and erosion control, and investing hundreds of thousands of dollars of the tax-payers' money in a local, up-to-date water supply?"\textsuperscript{30}

That same year Mrs. Eastman published another article ("Does Uncle Sam Foster Paganism?") which evoked a response from Collier in the same publication. She was objecting to the Commissioner's circular instructing his superintendents not to interfere with Indian religious life or ceremonial expression. She feared that this encouragement might foster the revival of such rituals as the Sun Dance torture, some of the death ceremonies, the ghost dance, the peyote cults, and other such practices. She argued that although these rites may have had meaning in the ancient isolated cultures of the pre-Columbian Indian, they could not spiritually satisfy the more worldly native of the present day.\textsuperscript{31} "The real danger lies in promoting
confusion worse confounded among the young and the suggestible, or where isolated groups are still in the earlier stages of the inevitable transition, difficult enough at best. The predestined end of these observances, in many cases now reached, is complete degradation, as paid exhibitions for the amusement of the crowd. Yet some such pseudo-native institution as the 'Peyote church', or a new 'Messiah craze' invented by self-seeking fakirs, may serve to drug the Indian masses into forgetfulness of the fact that the present Indian policy tends not to the promised full enfranchisement, but rather to a perpetual twilight of insincere praise and actual inferiority.\textsuperscript{32}

Collier replied by first stating his policy on the missionary presence in Indian lands. He claimed that he and his department insisted upon the fullest constitutional liberty in all matters affecting religion conscience, and culture for all Indians. He stated, furthermore, that any denomination or missionary, including the representatives of native Indian religions, could use Indian service buildings to hold classes in religious instruction on the condition that the pupils, if under eighteen years of age, be present with parental consent. It forbade any form of coercion in the propagation of religion, which, Collier claimed, was the prevalent missionary policy before his administration. He refuted Mrs. Eastman's charges that Indian religions were "pagan" or "atheistic", claiming that they contain an emotional or mystical belief or experience of union with a purposeful being greater than oneself, that there is a moral affirmation of accepting the will of this-
larger being and uniting one's personal forces with this
greater will, that there is a code of conduct, felt as moral
and involved with the conscience, and that there are disciplines aimed toward the purification or enlargement of consciousness and toward communion with the larger power. He took exception to her claims that the Ghost Dance and Peyote cult were inherently harmful, and he denied that there was any sort of commercialization of the Indians going on as a result of his program.*

Mrs. Eastman took issue with his article in a subsequent
letter to the editor, but she could do little more than accuse Collier of avoiding the question of whether the government was fostering a pagan renaissance by extolling the virtues of Indian religions. She again pointed out that whatever religious fragments of the ancient Indian cultures remained had little spiritual significance for the Indian of the day.*

This exchange illustrates a fundamental and inevitable source of conflict between the churchmen and Collier. The churches were bound to a set of beliefs and to a pattern of involvement discussed in Chapter Four (i.e., teaching the natives to adapt to the culture and life-style of European Protestantism). They could not move with the tides of the popular philosophies of the day because they were firmly anchored to a definite theological system. Until the Collier administration they did not need to worry about these shifting currents as the Government had always proceeded on the assumption that it was desirable that the Indians cultivate a Christian life-style. With the
advent of the Indian New Deal, however, they not only had
to justify their presence on the reservations in terms of
the progress they had made, but they had to also justify
the propagation of their particular faith. What the
missionaries called "pagan" was not necessarily non-religious
to Collier. He had his own view as to what constituted a
valid religious dogma, and as long as any set of beliefs
corresponded to that view he was ready to defend it on con-
stitutional grounds. The missionaries saw this as a sanction
for all manner of barbarous practices and as an obstacle to
the accomplishment of their goals; hence the conflict between
them.

In 1935 another letter to the editor of The Christian
Century called for the removal of Collier from his office and
the repeal or radical amendment of the Wheeler-Howard Act on
the grounds that the Commissioner had only a superficial under-
standing of the Indians and was advocating policies which would
set back the work of Indian affairs by fifty years. The editors
printed the letter as a matter of news, but commented that they
could not "but regard the evidence of increasing misunder-
standing and hostility between Protestant forces working among
the Indians and the present administration of Indian affairs
as unfortunate and tending rapidly toward a deplorable and
unnecessary break."\textsuperscript{35}

Other missionaries were publishing articles that year
on the need for Christian religion and education in Indian
country\textsuperscript{36} and Collier was busy defending his policy of encouraging
the native religions, although somewhat more diplomatically than in his earlier retorts:

There are important Indian groups who have no religion but their native one. To crush it is only to make them godless human beings. The native religions, shaped by human experience under supreme tensions across many ages of tribal life, contain priceless elements of beauty, of discipline, of charity, and of resignation, which can be appreciated even though these religions may be viewed as nothing except institutions secular, social, earthly. To tear them apart is to tear apart the Indians' very protoplasm. Time and change are doing the work all too fast, without adding to their influence a lawless onslaught by the Government of the United States. The Christian religion has become native to a majority of the Indians no less than the pre-Columbian religions. It has entirely supplanted the pre-Columbian religion in some places. The two systems, more or less interacting, exist side by side in many tribes. The official policy toward the Christian missionary work has never been more hospitable or more practically cooperative than it is right now. To stop the interference of the Government with native religions has been, I earnestly believe, to help the real cause of the missionaries. The missionaries, by and large, have been generous in recognizing these facts. I have dwelt on the subject for no reason except the fact that some missionaries, who are not the most of the missionaries, have criticized bitterly the new policy of tolerance.37

He also invited evaluation by the missionaries on specific points of his program and asked for suggestions on other policies that might be instituted.

For the next two years (1936 and 1937) as Collier's policies were implemented missionary criticism died down and the churches adopted a "wait and see" attitude. Mrs. Eastman, however, responded to Collier's invitation to criticize his administration. Again it was the underlying philosophy of recognizing and preserving the Indian culture to which she objected. She asserted that the missionaries did not campaign
against the native ways because they were native but because
the inevitable end of the warring and buffalo hunting culture
and its replacement by an agricultural or industrial mode of
life made them meaningless and they therefore hindered the
moral and civic progress necessary if the Indians were to
achieve any kind of successful adaptation to the dominant
European culture. Certain cultural features that had to be
rooted out included faith in and dependence upon medicine men,
rites involving public torture and mutilation, belief in
witchcraft and ghosts, the habit of giving away rather than
accumulating wealth, the Peyote cult, religious taboos against
many common foods, polygamy, and the tradition of incessant
petty warfare. She claimed that those who advocated retaining
the "best" of Indian culture were judging by standards alien
to those of the natives and thus favored the retention of
uncharacteristic and unimportant features of aboriginal life.
She went on to maintain that the restoration of the integrity
of the Indian culture would involve recognizing the leadership
of powerful tribal leaders such as Geronimo, Sitting Bull, and
Kicking Bear, and allowing the traditional intertribal feuds
as well as a deep-seated and possibly bellicose hostility to
the white Americans living near them. 38

On the other hand, our present-day Indian leaders
have been trained by Christian men and women to
lead away from, not back to, the primitive. Most
of them are of mixed ancestry, and the same is true
of an estimated two-thirds of the Indian popula-
tion, so-called. Intermarriage, says the Dutch
scientist, Schrieke, in his book, 'Alien Americans',
is 'America's greatest contribution' to the solu-
tion of the Indian problem. The inevitable transi-
tion is now far advanced. Surely the future of
these aspiring contemporary Americans cannot, to any significant extent, lie along aboriginal folkways? If not, the 'missionary motive' is still valid, and Christ not only offers an advance on any and all native religions but a new conception of God and the way of life for man.

As Collier began implementing his plans, therefore, the missionaries were steadfastly opposed to those which in any way encouraged the renewal of native life-styles or philosophies. Even after their "wait and see" period, they could not find anything of value in this aspect of Collier's administration.

In 1938, at a Conference of Friends of the Indians, the delegates, representing two secular Indian associations and Indian mission workers of twenty-eight Protestant churches, drafted a report citing "lawlessness, drinking, vice, illegal marriages in Indian communities" and blamed this on the "hands-off policy" of the Government. They did not approve of Collier's encouraging the aborigines to "turn back to their so-called ancient cultures, and to revive pagan practices and ceremonials of the pre-Columbian era" as this "appears to the Christian forces of America to be a denial of the right of the Indians to enter into an appreciation of their Christian heritage, implicit in their status as American citizens."40

Although Collier's plans for cultural resurgence were still totally unacceptable in missionary eyes, by 1939 both sides had mellowed somewhat. If still not in total agreement, each at least had begun to appreciate the efforts of the other. In April of 1939 an article entitled "A Better Day for the Indians" appeared in one of the missionary journals. It reported on the government's progress in the Indian New Deal,
and although it offered no evaluation at least the title implied approval.41

That same year, Rev. G. A. Watermulder, a missionary for the Reformed Church, which was traditionally conservative in the field of Indian affairs, offered this statement of his view of the state of the matter:

...we have not adequately understood the Indians. We, Europeans, have tried to make them European-Americans. Yet the Indian type persists....We have often failed to understand their basic aboriginal culture. We have so often approached our Indian problem as we would the problem of our own race....We have been forcing him to change his entire course of life. As this can come only by a slow process through many years under favorable conditions, our approaches to this difficult problem often reveal our lack of preparation for the task....We have no mission boards that prepare their missionaries for Indian service....We believe however that a new day has begun to dawn. Both the Church and the government are facing the problems with deeper and clearer understanding. Any temporary resurgence of paganism, or humanistic philosophies, will not ultimately prevail....If we are true to our mission, and in the name of Christ approach our problem, the American Indian will be set free.42

Rudolf Hertz, the Superintendent of Congregational Indian Missions, also saw something of value in the government program, although he was not about to wholeheartedly approve it:

At the best, of course, this is a time of strain and stress. The government can furnish the means and the men to carry through such an extensive plan. But the Indian needs more than money and advisors. He needs spiritual as well as material vision. He needs moral stamina. He needs the will to do the work. All these come from God, not from the government, and God's representatives on earth have before them a big task indeed to help the Indian to continue in constant touch with Him that supplieth all our needs....43
Thomas Alfred Tripp reviewed one particular educational institution operated under the reformed policy of the new government, and he found the results encouraging. He concluded: "Now the task is to enter vigorously upon the new phase which is to meet the Indian on his own doorstep with the Christian culture."^44 Mark A. Dawber, another church worker, submitted an article summarizing and approving the progress of the IRA's social and economic aspects.^45

Watermulder seemed to appreciate the anthropological approach that Collier introduced into Indian affairs when he commented favorably on the "deeper and clearer understanding" that church and state were developing concerning native culture. He approved of these methods, however, not because they would enable a primitive life-style to recognize and maintain its heritage, but rather because they would help the missionary to fabricate a more effective program for reaching the souls he wanted to Christianize. He believed that while this type of study would initially make many enthusiastic about the prospects of revitalizing this ancient American culture, the perserverance of the church would survive long after this humanistic ardor subsided, and that the missionary cause would be all the stronger for it.

Hertz and Tripp recognized the value of the great amounts of money and manpower that Collier was able to command for his programs in the first few years of his Commissionership. They were encouraged by the social and material up-grading of Indian life produced by this program, but neither could agree
that Collier's long-range hopes for an improved standard of living could ever materialize without the Indians being imbued with the spirit of Christianity.

There still remained some highly critical voices in the missionary ranks, however, and again the major bone of contention was the government's support of tribalism:

While the opposition of the Indian Bureau to Christian missionary work is not quite so pronounced as it was two or three years ago, still, the encouragement of the 'ancient Indian traditions' is featured, and the revival of old pagan rites and ceremonies is applauded at Washington. The Bureau established expensive and well-equipped hospitals with highly trained staffs; and yet at the same time encourages the submission of patients to native healers whose stock-in-trade is a primitive and superstitious 'magic' that defies all modern rules of health and sanitation.  

Missionary Lindquist was still decrying the retention of the ancient cultures, this time as a response to an ethnological study of the Pueblos by Dr. Elsie Clews Parsons, which concluded that Protestant Christianity was a disintegrating factor in Pueblo life. Lindquist protested:

Tribalism, inherent in the Pueblo religion, has been weighed in the balances and found wanting. It cannot meet the tests of the transition period in which the Indian now finds himself. It is because of our conviction of the divine resources of the Christian faith, a faith which rises above tribalism and nationalism, its adequacies to meet the need of all men and of all races, that the messengers of Christ seek to preach the Gospel and seek to propagate the Christian faith among the Indians....

Still another criticism was that there was too much paternalism in both governmental and ecclesiastical circles. W. A. Petzoldt, of the Crow Baptist Mission, disapproved of both agencies' policies:
Our country has been infected by the hysteria of government sweeping over the world....Our country will come out of its hocus-pocus Promised Land spree in time....Too long has the white man carried the red man's burden. Until recent years the Indian has scarcely been asked what contributions he had to make to the betterment of his own condition....In all history no racial group has been experimented with as much as the Indian....In these latter days enough is being done for him....Not enough has been done by the Indian for himself....The Indian problem is no nearer solution today than it was ten years ago....The Indian problem will only be satisfactorily solved by the Indians themselves and not by a benevolent bureaucracy at Washington. The Indian must be helped less and permitted to help himself more. The future will record the evanescence of the Indian Office at Washington and the dawning of a better day for the Indian. Indianism will give way to Americanism. The Indians of the old ways and days is passing out of the picture....Education and the reviving of the old customs are adverse to each other. They are beginning to see the fallacy of this Washingtonized policy and are getting away from its blighting influence.

The Indians of the future will seek self-support as a goal in their churches....The Indians will provide their own Christian leadership. All any missionary can do is to introduce a tribe to Jesus Christ....The Indian churches will gradually merge with the white churches.

Lindquist agreed about the need for the development of solely Indian churches:

Historically, the most successful missions are those in which Indians have actively participated in the evangelization of their own people....While the primary objective of all Indian mission work is to make known Christ and His Gospel, to do this most effectively the ultimate aim is to develop and use Indian leadership...the white missionary should work himself out of a job....Great pressure is being brought to bear on Indian youth to enter other secular callings, especially from Governmental agencies and notably so in recent years. Progress in raising up qualified Indian Christian leaders will continue to be slow unless missionaries with greater earnestness continue to recruit, train and release an increasingly large number of
Indian workers for the evangelization of their own people.\textsuperscript{49}

Collier's encouragement of tribalism still perturbed the missionaries, although they were becoming increasingly receptive to other aspects of his work. They pointed out what appeared to them to be ridiculous contrasts between the encouragement of both the primitive and the ultra-modern areas of Indian life, and they proudly defended the progress they had made in breaking down the tribal ties that the Indian Service was trying to strengthen. More and more emphasis was placed on the importance of phasing out the special attention given the natives by both governmental and church agencies. The theme of assimilation into European (and hopefully Christian) society became more insistent.

With the advent of World War II, the attention of both the church and state was diverted from Indian affairs to other concerns requiring both money and manpower. The Indians themselves tended to leave the reservations in fairly large numbers either to serve in the military or to work in defense industries. During this time, however, the Board of Home Missions was extensively reorganized and the supervision of its Indian churches was transferred from the missionary division to another department whose concern was with churches of diverse racial backgrounds. Increasing emphasis was put on building up Indian communities economically and socially, with the church as the guiding force and center of the community. Thomas A. Tripp, the executive secretary of the Board, explained their objectives as follows:
As in the past, the Indians will be given every possible encouragement to improve their economic and social condition, working primarily through their churches. If religion is to be an effective force for better home and community life, the Indian churches must first be strengthened as religious institutions. They should grow in numbers. They should have the best possible teaching and preaching that they may know the purposes of the Christian church.

Our major aim today is to encourage the greatest possible degree of self-determination in the Indian churches. This objective requires, of course, that the churches must participate to the fullest degree in their own support. Since this aim has been put before them, several Indian churches have begun definite efforts looking toward self-support, and they are showing creditable initiative. Probably the most basic problem of the Indian is economic. Poverty abounds due to poor land and inadequate skills. This means that the religious program must seek the economic improvement of the people. Toward this end it is assumed that the local church is basic. In these Indian communities the church is practically the only neighborhood organization. Properly utilized it can become an instrument of social integration and inspiration to economic improvement. It is a possible rallying point for community action and for personality development. Thus, the emphasis upon effective parish work is the focus of our Indian missions, not only for the specifically religious but for economic and social objectives as well.

Statements such as these sound very much like the type of program Collier advocated a decade before, but with one very basic difference.

Collier's hope for the Indian future was a complex vision in which he hoped to improve the standard of living for all Indians, while helping to repair and revitalize the numerous social systems that characterized each of the many tribes under his supervision. He wanted to recreate the Indian culture of the past in all its integrity; he wanted to
restore the language, the arts, the power structures, the moral codes, the rituals, the religions, and all else that had given meaning to these ancient societies and had enabled them to mold the individual and social spirits that had so moved him on his first visit to Taos. He wanted to accomplish this in such a way that it could not be lost in the frenzy of a twentieth century industrialism that was devouring even its own heritage. He sought, therefore, to isolate the tribes long enough for them to strengthen their cultures to the point where they could survive renewed invasions of their way of life. Meanwhile, he was providing them with the health, educational, and other material facilities to learn the nature of the intruders.

The Protestant church, however, and especially its missionaries to the Indians, viewed Collier's plans in a different light. They didn't perceive the one great master-plan; instead they recognized only two major aspects of it which they felt to be contradictory. They welcomed the encouragement of material, social, and health progress, and they noted the support of tribalism, segregation, and isolation. The former they could understand and accept; they themselves had worked for decades to bring about these same ends. They encountered the Indian as a poor, ignorant, and heathen savage, and everything in their background and education told them that the sooner they managed to civilize, educate, and Christianize the natives, the better Indian lives would be. They thus found that this aspect of Collier's New Deal coincided nicely with
their own aims and prejudices and so they could accord him their support—especially when they recognized how effectively his administration could implement these goals. The other part of his plan, the support of tribalism, appalled them. They did not see how it could possibly complement a plan for material amelioration; in fact, they could only agree that it would do nothing but hinder such a plan. They feared that Collier's program would encourage paganism and the myriad social miseries that accompanied it, and they feared the setback of their diligent and earnest labors. They could do nothing but object to any policy that threatened such a prospect.

Therefore, at the beginning of his administration, Collier dismayed the missionaries, whose eyes were clouded by visions of the return of the Ghost Dance, the proliferation of the Peyote cult, and the suppression of Christian contact with the aborigines. As the years went by, however, they were mollified by the greater attention and support accorded to other aspects of Collier's program. While their fears about isolationism were still strongly expressed, they found grounds for cooperation with the Indian Commissioner. By the time of the Second World War, they were fairly comfortable with his program, and, knowing that the demands of the war effort prevented any drastic new plans and knowing that the increased contact between the two cultures caused by the war would hasten the assimilation program that they themselves had set out so many years before, they could take a more relaxed attitude
toward the Indian Service.

In general, then, the church increasingly appreciated the economic and social aspects of Collier's program and gradually made his policy on these matters their own, but they steadfastly refused to accept his ideas about the recognition and preservation of Indian culture.
NOTES TO CHAPTER V


3 ibid., p. 154.


5 ibid., pp. 149-152.

6 ibid., p. 182.

7 ibid., pp. 172-198.


9 ibid., pp. 193-194.


12 ibid., p. 185.


15 ibid., p. 275.


17 ibid., pp. 165, 167.

18 ibid., p. 169.

19 ibid., pp. 170-176.


21 ibid., pp. 280-281.

22 ibid., p. 283.

23 ibid., pp. 283-284.

24 ibid., pp. 348-377.


26 ibid., pp. 182-183.

27 ibid., p. 184.

28 "Statement Unanimously Adopted by Missionaries, Both Catholic and Protestant, at Plains Indian Congress Held at Rapid City, South Dakota, March 2 to 5, with Special Reference to HR 2902 and S 2755," The Missionary Review of the World, April 1934, p. 184.


30 ibid., pp. 462-463.

32 *ibid.*, pp. 1017-1018.


39 *ibid.*, pp. 130-131.

40 "Indians' Friends," *Time*, May 2, 1938, p. 49.


CONCLUSIONS.

In analyzing the material presented in the preceding chapters, two conclusions come to the forefront. Both deal with the church's relationship to the Federal government.

In the first place, the discord between Collier and the Protestant missionaries was the first real division between church and state in the history of Indian affairs in the United States. During the many decades that both were intimately concerned with Indians, little conflict over policy had occurred. When the government sought to expand into the continent, the missionaries proved eager for the chance to carry their Gospel to the remotest tribes. When the government wanted to civilize the natives to make them more passive, it found its agents in the missionaries who wished to mold the Indians into replicas of white American Christians. If the aims of the two parties were not alike, at least the churches could use their own means and thereby hope to win converts to their fold.

When John Collier entered the arena of Indian affairs, however, with his program of economic, social, medical, and educational improvement and cultural revival for the natives, the missionaries could only respond negatively. Their stock in trade was the propagation of the Christian gospel. Any economic, "civilizing", or political scheme that might further that end could meet with their approval, but a policy that restricted their operation on the reservations and that encouraged the development of the "paganism" against which they
had battled for centuries was nothing but an abomination to them.

Thus the Protestant churches found themselves up against a thoroughly secular Indian Commissioner for the first time, and were forced to defend the continuing validity of their historic mission to the Indian people. Collier marked the beginning of a series of Indian administrators who preferred to use the methods of the social scientist, the ethnologist, the linguist, the economist, etc. instead of the man of God to do his work. It was the start of a secularization of Indian affairs and the missionaries in good conscience could not approve.

The second major point that can be made is that the 1930's saw government and the church go off on opposite philosophical tangents. While the bulk of Protestants were scurrying to the neo-orthodox standard and shedding their humanism for a starker view of man and his possibilities, the Indian Service was rediscovering the virtues and vitality of the Indian lifestyle. Collier's discovery of the native society had ended his pessimism about the human future and his program was intended to leave the Indians to their own cultural devices and thereby let them develop the best of all possible worlds for themselves.

The churches, however, took what they considered to be a more realistic stance. The ancient cultures could never be satisfactorily revived because the environment that had produced them was changed or changing. The presence of whites in
settlements all over the country, the encroachment of agricultural developments, the construction of dams and irrigation projects, and the contacts that had already been made between natives and white precluded any return to what had been. The Indians could not support themselves the way their ancestors had with the hunts, they could not prove their manhood with the intertribal wars of former days, and they could not roam the Plains in the nomadic ways of their fathers. As their religions were expressions and celebrations of these types of activity, they became meaningless when the lives of the Indians were changed. The missionaries, therefore, claimed that any revival of the religions or ceremonies would do nothing but make the Indians into living museum pieces. In their eyes the only solution was to continue the work already started and far gone; the assimilation of the Indians into white American society. For this reason they supported the economic and social aspects of Collier's plan, but rejected anything that hinted at segregation or isolation.

In summary, the conflict between John Collier and the Protestant missionaries demonstrates two aspects of the church-state relationship of the time. One was that the state was becoming increasingly secular in its orientation while the church held firm to its ecclesiastical beliefs. The other was that the government of the day was moving towards humanism while the churches were becoming increasingly more critical of man's ability to handle his own world successfully. One focus of this struggle between two powerful institutions in
American life was the area of Indian affairs, and during the 1930's and 1940's there was no sign of either side compromising its guiding ethics.
LITERATURE CITED

I. Government Publications


Congressional Record. 67th Congress, 2nd Session, pp. 12323-12325.

Congressional Record. 73rd Congress, 2nd Session, pp. 9071, 9221, 9222, 9607, 10583, 11122-11139, 11226-11229, 11634, 11724-11744, 11830-11831, 12001-12004, 12073, 12161-12165, 12256-12257, 12340, 12451.


II. Books and Articles by Collier

A. Books


B. Articles


Collier, John. "The Fate of the Navajos: What Will Oil Money Do to the Greatest of Indian Tribes?" Sunset, January 1924, pp. 11-13, 60, 62, 73, 74.


Collier, John. "Our Indian Policy: Why Not Treat the Red Man as Wisely, as Generously as We Have Treated the Filipino." *Sunset*, March 1923, pp. 13-15, 89-93.


III. Books and Articles by Missionaries

A. Books


**B. Articles**


"Statement Unanimously Adopted by Missionaries, Both Catholic and Protestant, at Plains Indian Congress Held at Rapid City, South Dakota, March 2 to 5, with Special Reference to HR 2902 and S 2755." The Missionary Review of the World, April 1934, p. 184.


IV. Other Books

A. Primary


B. Secondary


Schusky, Ernest L. *The Right to be Indian*. Board of National Missions of the United Presbyterian Church in cooperation with the Institute of Indian Studies, State University of South Dakota, 1965.


V. Other Articles

A. Primary


"Indians' Friends." Time, May 2, 1938, p. 49.


The Nation, April 26, 1933, p. 459.


"People in the Limelight: Collier and Brophy." The New Republic, March 5, 1945, p. 319.


Time, February 19, 1945, pp. 18-19.

Time, June 24, 1949, p. 15.

B. Secondary

Atkins, Gaius Glenn. "The Crusading Church at Home and Abroad." Church History, September 1932, pp. 131-149.


VI. Miscellaneous Works of Reference

