

A Textual Analysis and Comparison of the Taketori Monogatari
and Cupid and Psyche

by

Joy Alexandra Dubé

B.A. Université Laval, 1978

A THESIS SUBMITTED IN FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR
THE DEGREE OF MASTER OF ARTS

in

THE FACULTY OF GRADUATE STUDIES

(Department of Asian Studies)

We accept this thesis as conforming
to the required standard

THE UNIVERSITY OF BRITISH COLUMBIA

April 1996

© Joy Alexandra Dubé

In presenting this thesis in partial fulfilment of the requirements for an advanced degree at the University of British Columbia, I agree that the Library shall make it freely available for reference and study. I further agree that permission for extensive copying of this thesis for scholarly purposes may be granted by the head of my department or by his or her representatives. It is understood that copying or publication of this thesis for financial gain shall not be allowed without my written permission.

Department of Asian Studies

The University of British Columbia
Vancouver, Canada

Date May 30, 1996

Abstract

My thesis is that texts are sites of competing discourse and ideological struggle. I employ the theoretical writings of Mikhail Bakhtin and James Clifford to analyze instances of "social heteroglossia," "reaccentuation" and "competing discourses" in my analyses of the Taketori Monogatari, a tenth-century anonymous Japanese tale, and Cupid and Psyche, a second-century Latin tale by Apuleius.

I investigate the socio-historical mini-world of the Taketori Monogatari to develop my argument that substrata of a native, Japanese, female shamanism enter into conflict with a Confucian state ideology and male emperor system which was officially adopted in Japan in the seventh century. I also uncover the figure of the Queen Mother of the West in Chinese Taoist texts which is transposed onto the figure of Kaguyahime, the protagonist of the Taketori Monogatari. In the ensuing transposition, the original Taoist content of the Chinese text is erased and subsumed into a non-religious, aesthetic effect. I view the Taketori Monogatari as a site of competing ideologies of religion, state and gendered politics à la Bakhtin and Clifford.

In order to compare the Taketori Monogatari to Cupid and Psyche, I also analyze the socio-historical mini-world of Cupid and Psyche to uncover the struggle between Roman state religion and the Isis cult, and between the Isis cult, Christianity and magic. Class interests, nativism, and Platonic philosophy combine against the background of this struggle to produce a text which is reaccentuated by the power elite in later centuries, in socio-ideological contexts of nationalism and European colonial expansion.

I comment on the critical analyses of the Taketori Monogatari by two scholars--Michele Marra and Richard Okada-- to further develop my thesis that texts are sites of competing discourse. Marra's analysis comes closest to the Bakhtinian analysis of socio-ideological mini-worlds, while Okada's analysis is based on what Foucault terms the approach of the "traditional historian" who searches for origins.

I investigate the twentieth-century psychoanalytical, literary commentaries of Erich Neumann and Hayao Kawai on Cupid and Psyche and, by extrapolation, the Taketori Monogatari, to expose the theoretical grounding of the psychoanalytical and literary approach to texts. I find it is firmly rooted in an age of orientalism, imperialism, sexism, nationalism and capitalist ideologies. I use the theoretical insights of Foucault, Homi Bhabha, Miyoshi Masao and Naoki Sakai to situate my analyses of texts as "literature" or as psychoanalytical truth.

Table of Contents

Abstract.....	ii
Table of Contents.....	iv
Glossary.....	v
Introduction.....	1
Part I <u>The Taketori Monogatari</u> and its Pre-texts.....	7
Part II Shamanistic Elements in the <u>Taketori Monogatari</u>	22
Part III <u>Cupid and Psyche</u>	42
Part IV Twentieth-century Reaccentuations of the <u>Taketori Monogatari</u>	53
Part V The Psychoanalytic Perspective.....	62
Conclusion.....	79
Bibliography.....	83

Glossary

asobi-be.....	遊部
akitsukami.....	現つ神
bungaku.....	文学
Chuang-Tzu.....	莊子
Chinkon-sai.....	鎮魂祭
Daijō-sai.....	大嘗祭
fushi no kusuri.....	不死の薬
hagoromo no setsuwa.....	羽衣説話
Han Shū.....	漢書
Han Wu-ti nei-chuan.....	漢武帝内傳
hiko-hime.....	彦姫
Hsi Wang Mu.....	西王母
Hsün-tzu.....	荀子
irogonomi.....	色好み
Jingikan.....	神祇官
kambun.....	漢文
Kana	仮名
kekkon kyohi.....	結婚拒否
kitanaki tokoro.....	穢き所
kotodama.....	言霊
kaimami.....	垣間見
Lieh-tzu.....	列子
matsurigoto.....	政
miko.....	巫子
mu.....	無

Mu T'ien-tzu chuan.....	穆天子傳
mono no aware.....	物の哀
Po wu chih.....	博物志
ritsuryō.....	律令
sanshi	三戸
Sei Ōbo.....	西王母
sekkanke.....	攝關家
tennō.....	天皇
Taketori Monogatari.....	竹取物語
Tao-te ching.....	道德經
ti.....	帝
tōyōteki mu.....	東洋的無
tōyōteki ronri.....	東洋的論理
u.....	有
uchi-soto.....	内/外
ujigami.....	氏神
uji no kami.....	氏の上
Wu wei.....	無為
yōen.....	妖艶
zhe-xian.....	謫仙
zhisehn zhiguo.....	治身治國

Introduction

I began my thesis by comparing two texts from different historical and cultural traditions. I was struck by similarities in theme and narrative detail between Cupid and Psyche, a second-century Latin tale, and the Taketori Monogatari, a tenth-century Japanese tale. The central protagonist in both tales is a woman--Psyche in Cupid and Psyche, and Kaguyahime in the Taketori Monogatari. Both protagonists are able to transcend human and divine realms through the intercession of divine powers. Nearly impossible tasks are assigned in both stories--Kaguyahime assigns tasks to her suitors, and Psyche must perform tasks to appease the goddess Venus and regain her lost spouse. An elixir of immortality is crucial to both protagonists--Psyche, a mortal, becomes immortal by imbibing the elixir, and Kaguyahime is able to ascend to Heaven when she partakes of the elixir of immortality. Both stories end with the protagonist's attainment of immortality.

What is different in Cupid and Psyche and the Taketori Monogatari is the fact that Psyche's journey is from mortal to immortal, while Kaguyahime was always an immortal, or divine being, who had lost her status temporarily while on earth, and was able to regain it in the end. Psyche marries a divine spouse, and loses him when she transgresses a taboo. Then she actively seeks to re-unite with him. Kaguyahime, on the other hand, does not wish to get married, and successfully eludes her suitors.

What can be the meaning of these apparent similarities and differences? On what basis can one compare works from such different historical and cultural traditions? What would be the point of making such a comparison?

I found that by investigating the socio-historical and ideological contexts of Cupid and Psyche and the Taketori Monogatari, it was possible to view them as texts produced through struggle and competition between differing ideologies. I was inspired by Mikhail Bakhtin's concept of social heteroglossia and reaccentuation of texts, and by James Clifford's parallel concept of discourse specification in cultural production.

In considering the limits and changing focus of ethnography, James Clifford comments on the "specification of discourses."¹ Instead of emphasizing culture as an object of study according to traditional ethnography, the new ethnography uncovers the various levels of interpretation, or discourses, which define that culture in its relationship to the ethnographer. Basically, the question is who speaks or writes, and under what relations of power and authority. As Clifford puts it, "culture" is "always relational, an inscription of communicative processes that exist, historically, *between* subjects in relations of power" (Clifford 1986, 15). And again, "Culture is contested, temporal, and emergent"(Clifford 1986, 19).

Mikhail Bakhtin writes about the dialogic orientation of discourse in literary textual production. Dialogic orientation is an interior, active force of all discourse which unites the subjective perspective of all linguistic participants--speakers, hearers, and readers--simultaneously uncovering and creating the object of discourse. Dialogic orientation is manifested in the socio-ideological substrata of language, in a "heteroglossia" where different world views harmonize or struggle with each other, under the cover of a single, unified language.² The "intentionality of stratification" in literary language is due to social forces which mask the dialogical relations between languages, giving rise to a "heteroglot

¹ Writing Culture: The Poetics and Politics of Ethnography (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1983) 14.

² Michael Holquist, ed., The Dialogic Imagination: Four Essays by M.M. Bakhtin trans. Michael Holquist and Caryl Emerson (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1981) 291-292.

conception" of the world (Holquist 293). Literary language is not a language, but a dialogue of languages (Holquist 294). Bakhtin writes:

Concrete socio-ideological language consciousness, as it becomes creative--that is, as it becomes active as literature--discovers itself already surrounded by heteroglossia and not at all a single, unitary language, inviolable and indisputable. The actively literary linguistic consciousness at all times and everywhere (that is, in all epochs of literature historically available to us) comes upon "languages," and not language.

(Holquist 295)

According to Bakhtin, the writer of a text does not seek to rid the text of its heteroglossic features, but actively introduces the socio-ideological mini-worlds and differing perspectives of the language he or she uses. He writes, "The prose writer makes use of words that are already populated with the social intentions of others and compels them to serve his own new intentions, to serve a second master" (Holquist 299-300). When texts are recontextualized by other writers, or are re-situated in different social contexts, cultures and eras, Bakhtin calls this process a "reaccentuation" of dialogue" (Holquist 419-420).

The theoretical insights of Bakhtin and Clifford encouraged me to research the pre-texts of the Taketori Monogatari, and by so doing, to discover a particular mode of transmission of texts between China and Japan during the ninth century. I found that the Queen Mother of the West in Chinese Shang Ch'ing Taoist texts was transposed onto Kaguyahime, and that the meeting and unconsummated passion between the emperor and Kaguyahime originally stemmed from conflicting tendencies in the early mystic, religious

tradition of China. Part of the Taketori Monogatari was an adaptation of an earlier work of Taoist literature, but it no longer contained the traces of an ideological struggle which was germane to the Taoist, Chinese context. The struggle between the emperor and Kaguyahime was emptied of religious content, and aestheticized. It became an unfulfilled romantic yearning which was a staple of Heian literature.

Still focusing on Kaguyahime's relationship with the emperor, I was also able to uncover the struggle of a shamanistic tradition in Japan at odds with a recently imposed Confucian state ideology and male emperor system from China. Kaguyahime's double role of shamaness and celestial wife to the emperor-shaman, and the emperor's double role of rejected partner and shaman can be viewed in the context of the contradictory and complementary movement by which the shamanistic tradition was being slowly suppressed by state ideology, yet at the same time it was being subsumed into a predominantly male power structure. I view the Taketori Monogatari as a site of competing discourse and social heteroglossia, between ideologies of the state, religion, and gendered politics.

I find a similar phenomenon in Cupid and Psyche. Roman state ideology at odds with a foreign religion which appealed to the lower classes and immigrants, the struggle between that religion and local, magical practices and Christianity, the personal bias of the author Apuleius who was a Roman official yet was not at the center of the power elite, all combine to produce Cupid and Psyche. Framed by the theme of the soul's journey from base, slavish desires to a higher, divine reality, which was the standard fare of Platonic philosophy, the story of Psyche was read as an allegory or fable by Apuleius' contemporaries. It was later reaccentuated by European writers in completely different contexts, giving rise to literary effects such as the

picaresque in Spain, and contributed towards the nineteenth-century myth of "classical literature" which, during an age of European colonial expansion, was the product of a superior, white race.

Michele Marra and Richard Okada have commented extensively on the Taketori Monogatari. I discuss their insights in relation to current debates on orientalism and nativism. I find Marra's approach closest to the Bakhtinian mode of analysis, while Okada has adopted a "search for origins" approach which is in the pure tradition of Foucault's "traditional historian" or seeker of the "Truth."

I investigate the twentieth-century commentaries of Erich Neumann on Cupid and Psyche and I extrapolate Hayao Kawai's psychoanalytically-inspired literary criticism to focus on the Taketori Monogatari. Neumann's position that individuation is a universal psychical phenomenon constructs and devalues an "undeveloped" Japanese psyche. Hayao Kawai argues for a different type of Japanese psyche, while using the same universalizing vocabulary and terms of debate as Neumann. I show how the psychoanalytical theoretical tradition is firmly anchored in a specific socio-historical mini-world flavored by orientalist, sexist, nationalistic and racist ideologies. Lastly, I note that the concept of texts as "literature" and the comparing of literatures has firm theoretical grounding in nationalistic, imperialistic and capitalist ideologies.

To support my thesis that textual production is a site of competing discourses and ideologies as described by Clifford and Bakhtin, I will first focus on the Taketori Monogatari in Part I, analysing the medieval Chinese representation of the Queen Mother of the West and comparing it to Kaguyahime, the protagonist of the Taketori Monogatari. In Part II, I uncover shamanistic elements in the Taketori Monogatari, revealing the

traces of an ideological struggle between ancient cultic practices and emerging state ideology in Japan. In Part III, I concentrate on the text Cupid and Psyche. By investigating the socio-ideological context of Cupid and Psyche, I maintain and further elaborate my critical stance that textual production is ideological and heteroglossic. In Part IV, I examine modern, twentieth-century commentaries of both the Taketori Monogatari and Cupid and Psyche. In uncovering discourses of orientalism, sexism, and nationalism in these commentaries, I rely on Bakhtin's notion of "reaccentuation" of texts, and on Foucault's analysis of knowledge as perspective. In Part V, I focus on the psychoanalytic literary critical perspectives of Erich Neumann and Hayao Kawai. Neumann deals explicitly with Cupid and Psyche, and although Kawai does not specifically consider the Taketori Monogatari, I extrapolate his insights on the theme of the disappearing female protagonist in Japanese myth and folktale to the related theme of the Taketori Monogatari. I also use the critical commentaries of Michel Foucault, Masao Miyoshi, Naoki Sakai, and Homi Bhabha in an attempt to situate my analysis and criticism within the current ideological debate over key issues concerning "Japan", "The West", and "Literature." Texts construct and mask a reality of power relationships. Viewing texts in this way reveals them to be products of ideology and competing discourses, at specific points in time.

I conclude by noting that my own readings of the Taketori Monogatari and Cupid and Psyche are situated within an ideological context of postcoloniality, poststructuralism, and feminism. It is a context colored by a democratic, liberal bias, which contests yet affirms a hegemonic tradition of Western academicism. It is also a context which is specific to time and place, and thus cannot be considered as a final or authoritative reading.

Part I: The Taketori Monogatari and its Pre-texts

In the tenth-century Japanese text The Tale of the Bamboo Cutter, the protagonist is Kaguyahime, a princess from the Moon capital.³ She is a divine being who possesses magical abilities. At the beginning of the tale she is a tiny human being three inches high. She is discovered in the stalk of a bamboo by a Bamboo Cutter who takes her to his home to be raised by him and his wife as their daughter. She radiates light and lights up every corner of their house. She grows rapidly -- in three months she attains adult size, and is radiantly beautiful. The Bamboo Cutter henceforth grows rich and prosperous, finding gold in every bamboo stalk he cuts. Soon suitors come to woo her from far and wide, but she refuses to marry. She eventually sets impossible tasks to five suitors and promises to marry the one who succeeds in fulfilling his task. They all fail miserably, and she rejoices in not having to marry. Eventually the emperor requests her services in his palace, but she dares to refuse even him, and turns invisible at the very moment he tries to grasp hold of her. Although she will not serve the emperor at his palace, she acknowledges his professions of attachment to her, and she too grows fond of him. She gazes longer and longer at the moon, and confesses to her adoptive parents, the old Bamboo Cutter and his wife, that she is originally from the Moon Capital and must return to her real parents who live there. The King of Heaven and an army come to take her back to the moon. The King of Heaven announces that the Bamboo Cutter had performed good actions in the past and thereby had won the privilege of raising Kaguyahime as his own child for twenty years. The King of Heaven also explains that Kaguyahime had

³The text of the Taketori Monogatari I am using is found in Katagiri Yoichi et al, eds., Nihon Koten Bungaku Zenshu , vol.8 (Tokyo: Shogakukan, 1986). Hereafter all references to page numbers of the Taketori Monogatari will be abbreviated to NKBZS.

transgressed a law of the Moon capital and was sent to earth as a temporary form of punishment. The superior divine powers of the King of Heaven and his army cannot be matched by the earth-bound armies sent by the Emperor to prevent Kaguyahime from ascending to the moon. Kaguyahime regrets the pain she will cause her adoptive parents and the emperor by her departure. However, she follows the instructions of the King of Heaven. She takes a sip of the elixir of immortality, dons a magic feathered cape which makes her forget everything about her life on earth, and ascends to the moon in a heavenly chariot.

Depending on which part of the Taketori Monogatari one focuses on, the figure of Kaguyahime can be seen as a composite of folkloric and literary personages. The tale also contains thematic and narrative elements which derive from Chinese Taoist literature. The ur-text, then, is multiple and fragmented, constituted across the ages and across the geographical divide which constitutes China and Japan. In Figures of Resistance: Language, Poetry and Narrating in the Tale of Genji and other Mid-Heian Texts, Richard Okada has summarized some of the narrative pre-texts of the Taketori Monogatari, by describing a Tibetan tale, the eighth-century Manyōshū poems, and various Fudōki tales of the heavenly maiden motif.⁴ Konishi Jin'ichi describes the work of Ito Seiji regarding the Tibetan origins of the first part of the tale, and the *hagoromo setsuwa* which is the origin of the second part of the Taketori Monogatari.⁵ Kaji Nobuyuki focuses on a Taoist

⁴(London and Durham: Duke University Press, 1991) 42-52.

⁵A History of Japanese Literature, vol. 2 trans. Aileen Gatten and Nicholas Teele (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1984) 421-422. *Hagoromo* means "feathered cape." *Hagoromo setsuwa* were tales centered around a motif of a celestial woman whose means of concealment and flight to and from earth was provided by her magical, feathered cape. See also Alan Miller, "The Swan-Maiden Revisited: Religious Significance of Divine-Wife Folktales with Special Reference to Japan," Asian Folklore Studies 45 (1987): 55-86.

reading of the Taketori Monogatari as a unified text, analyzing Kaguyahime as a symbol of the *sanshi*, or corruption of the human soul and body according to Taoist demonology. Kaguyahime's relationship with the Bamboo Cutter is central to this reading.⁶

In analyzing the Taketori Monogatari, I am inspired by Mikhail Bakhtin's approach to textual analysis as the uncovering of "heteroglossia." Heteroglossia means the competing, or harmonizing of world views in a text. Social forces mask these world views, presenting texts as a single, unified language (Holquist 291-929). The task of the analyst of texts, according to Bakhtin, is to uncover the differing world views and languages in the text. Using Bakhtin's theories of heteroglossia, I examine the figure of the Queen Mother of the West in Chinese medieval texts, and I attempt to uncover narrative and thematic similarities between the Taketori Monogatari and the Han Wu-ti nei-chuan, a sixth-century Taoist work of literature. I conduct my research in the light of socio- and religio-ideological substrata of early Chinese mysticism, Shang Ch'ing Taoism and Japanese courtly aesthetics.

My reading of the figure of Kaguyahime is based on descriptions of the Queen Mother of the West by Suzanne Cahill in her work Transcendence and Divine Passion: The Queen Mother of the West in Medieval China.⁷ The Queen Mother of the West (Ch. *Hsi Wang Mu*; Jpn. *Sei Ōbo*), originally an archaic goddess and shamanistic deity during the Warring States period (403-221 B.C.), is mentioned in classic mystical literature such as the Chuang-tzu (third century B.C.), and in the Hsün-tzu, a state document from the same era. She is described in these works as a celestial, superior being, and as a teacher. The Queen Mother of the West was also the object of a soteriological peasant cult

⁶Chugoku Shiso kara mita Nihon Shisoshi Kenkyu (Tokyo: Yoshikawa Kobunkan, 1985) 113-136.

⁷(Palo Alto: Stanford University Press, 1993)

in the year 3 B.C., described in the Han shu, (Book of Han), the official history of the Han Dynasty. Her image is that of a shamanistic deity, during a time of peasant revolt and political disorder (Transcendence 21-23). Imperial cults of the Han Dynasty underwent radical change in the first century B.C. when Heaven was adopted as the supreme object of worship, superseding the former worship of *ti*, or powers, that were the object of the imperial cult of the Shang kings.⁸ Michael Loewe describes the development of the myth of the Queen Mother of the West during the first century B.C. and the first century A.D. as fulfilling deficiencies of the cosmology of the day when this change took place.⁹ According to his description, a mythology and cosmology had to be provided to answer the question of human destiny after death, and to explain a means for communicating with the realms of heaven, earth and humans. The figure of the Queen Mother of the West was one vehicle used to maintain the direct link between the cosmologies of the Earth and Heaven, in the name of the authority of the state (Loewe 96-98). She was adopted into Han Dynasty literature as a goddess of immortality, controlling the cosmos and performing ecstatic flight through the heavens. However, Han works in the Taoist canon make little reference to her, prompting Cahill's remark that early Taoist leaders were attempting to reform the native religions of China by expunging any mention of her. Cahill cites the related attempts of the Celestial Masters, a proto-Taoist religion, to establish legitimacy by opposing or suppressing pre-existing cultic practices, by eliminating ancestor worship, blood sacrifice and monetary payments to the clergy (Transcendence 32). Stimulated by the introduction of Buddhism into China,

⁸Denis Twitchett and Michael Loewe, eds., The Cambridge History of China, vol.1 (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995) 600-608.

⁹Ways to Paradise: The Chinese Quest for Immortality (London: George Allen and Unwin, 1979) 96-98.

Shang Ch'ing Taoism adopted the figure of the Queen Mother of the West, synthesizing local shamanistic and elixir cults of southern China with a northern Chinese Taoism. Her iconographic and literary image then was fully subsumed into the imperial state cult as a supreme deity in the Shang Ch'ing pantheon, receiving an official title: the "Ninefold Numinous Grand and Realized Primal Ruler of the Purple Tenuity from the White Jade Tortoise Terrace" (Transcendence 34). Her image was that of a teacher of Taoist masters, guarding the holy books of Taoism, and controlling access to immortality. In these texts she becomes a native Chinese goddess in the face of the foreign Buddhist religion, fully aligned with and supportive of the imperial and state cult. According to Cahill, the Queen Mother of the West's image "combines elements from native Han dynasty and earlier, systematically pulled together and defined by codifiers of the Shang Ch'ing textual corpus" (Transcendence 36). Thus, her image is a site of struggle between early, local shamanistic cults with state cults, eventually becoming subsumed into a state-affirming, native Chinese goddess which developed in the face of Buddhism, a foreign religion. She helped to define China as a polity as it faced the foreign Other (Transcendence 33, 36).

In the Six Dynasties texts (222-589 A.D.) which describe her meetings with the emperor, the Queen Mother of the West is identified as a high goddess of aristocratic Shang Ch'ing Taoism. She confers immortality on special individuals, and resides in a celestial realm. She also transmits texts from the Shang Ch'ing Taoist corpus to suitably qualified Taoist adepts. The meetings of the Queen Mother of the West and the emperor conform to the classic Shang Ch'ing Taoist belief that the adept must attain a perfect internal blend of yin and yang, preferably through union with a divine spouse, in order to achieve transcendence, or immortality. In the texts mentioned by

Cahill, the theme of a failed union between the immortal goddess and a human emperor who cannot attain immortality, is constant.

In the Lieh-tzu, a text which Cahill dates from the third century A.D., King Mu of the Chou dynasty (r. 1001-946 B.C.) journeys to mythical regions of the empire and receives tribute from the people he meets. In the course of his wanderings, he becomes a guest of the Queen Mother of the West, and they exchange greeting on the banks of the mythical Turquoise Pond. The king laments the fact that he is unworthy of being a leader, and leaves the abode of the Queen Mother of the West without attaining immortality (Transcendence 48).

In a canonical text for Six Dynasties believers in the cult of immortality, the Mu T'ien-tzu chuan (Transmissions Concerning Mu, Son of Heaven), which Cahill dates from the late third century A.D., King Mu visits the Queen Mother of the West, and although tempted to stay with her in her magical abode, he is concerned about his earthly duties and returns to rule on earth without attaining immortality (Transcendence 50-51).

In the third-century Po wu chih (Monograph on Broad Phenomena), the Martial Thearch of the Han (Han Wu-ti; r.141-87 B.C.) meets the Queen Mother of the West, and their meeting, according to Cahill, "becomes the model for the meetings between the Shang Ch'ing Taoist adept and his transcendent female teacher" in later T'ang literature (Transcendence 54). Instead of the emperor journeying to meet her, as related in the Lieh-tzu or the Mu T'ien-tzu chuan, in the Po wu chih it is the Queen Mother of the West who descends from the heavens to where the emperor lives. The peaches of immortality, which are the major emblem of the Queen Mother of the West, are first mentioned in the Po wu chih. In this account, the emperor is offered the peaches of immortality by the Queen Mother of the West, and he

eats them, but cannot gain immortality from them since he cannot plant their seeds.

In the Han Wu-ti nei chuan, (Esoteric Transmissions Concerning the Martial Thearch of the Han) another canonical work serving as a source legend for later T'ang poets, dated by K.M. Schipper to the second half of the sixth century A.D., the meeting of the Queen Mother of the West and the emperor is similarly described.¹⁰ The Queen Mother of the West arrives from her heavenly abode to the emperor's earthly realm. She is described as a numinous being in the form of a beautiful young woman, gorgeously attired, and "about thirty years old" (Schipper 73). The Queen Mother of the West serves a meal to the emperor, and gives him four exquisite peaches to eat. The emperor wants to keep the peach kernels to plant them, but he is told by the Queen Mother of the West that they produce fruit only once in three thousand years, and will be useless to him (Schipper 74). The emperor then pleads for instruction as a humble Taoist acolyte. The goddess bestows several talismanic texts on the emperor, and with the help of the Lady Chang-yuan, another Taoist immortal, she eventually transmits more important texts describing methods of attaining immortality from the Shang Ch'ing corpus to the emperor (Schipper 92-119). However, because of his personal failings and poor leadership qualities, the emperor cannot benefit from the teachings of the Queen Mother of the West or of the Lady Chang-yuan. The manuscripts containing their teachings about the secrets of immortality are destroyed when his palace library burns. The emperor then regrets that he did not benefit from their teachings (Schipper 127). The emperor eventually dies like an ordinary mortal (Schipper 129).

¹⁰K.M. Schipper, trans., L'empereur Wou des Han dans la légende Taoiste: Han Wou-ti nei-tchouan (Paris: Ecole française d'extrême-Orient, 1965)

The fact that the emperor is denied immortality in each of these canonical texts, the Lieh-tzu, the Mu T'ien-tzu chuan, the Po wu chih, and the Han Wu-ti nei chuan, can be interpreted in the light of the early structure of the Taoist religion as it defined itself in relation to, and against the reigning Confucian philosophy and religion. In Early Chinese Mysticism: Philosophy and Soteriology in the Taoist Tradition, Livia Kohn describes the figure of the Taoist Sage who, while espousing Taoist philosophical ideals of harmony and mystic transcendence, remains nevertheless a ruler who combines religious ecstatic freedom with political order.¹¹ He is not a seeker of longevity. Kohn explains that in Taoist philosophy, the concept of *zhishen zhiguo* is a harmonious synthesis between the path of world-abandoning mysticism and a Confucian concept of the state's authority and the ruler's responsibility to rule in the earthly realm. *Zhishen zhiguo* postulated an intimate connection between cultivating oneself and governing the country (Kohn 65). Thus, while metaphorically withdrawing from the world to cultivate his relationship with the Tao, the sage-ruler maintains a physical presence on earth and actively governs the country at the same time (Kohn 65-66). In the Guo Xian version of the Taoist foundational text, the Chuang-tzu, (edited around the year 300 A.D.), the ruler governs the world through perfect non-action (*Wu-wei*), attaining mystic union with the Tao. Kohn notes that in the original Chuang-tzu, the Taoist conception of society is one of constraint and superficial worldliness that must be renounced, and the sage-ruler correspondingly renounces active involvement in governing the world. There is a definite lack of political or social concern in the original Chuang-tzu which does not correlate with the later Guo Xian commentary. This reveals to Kohn two extreme poles of early Chinese mysticism --the escapist

¹¹(Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1984) 50-51.

versus the integrationist. The Guo Xian commentary represents the integrationist side, integrating Confucian thinking into Taoist mysticism (Kohn 173).

In the fifth-century Heshang Gong commentary on another foundational mystical text, the Tao-te ching, Heshang Gong, a legendary figure under Emperor Wen (first-century B.C.), refuses the summons of the emperor to explain the Tao-te ching, and eventually the emperor begs him, as Lord of the Tao, for teachings. Heshang Gong descends from the heavens and hands the emperor a text of the Tao-te ching, and vanishes. The emperor remains on earth, as a humble student of the Tao. His sage-like behavior and attainment of the Tao leads to a perfect government of the world (Kohn 63).

In these commentaries, transformative, mystical journeys and quests for immortality by the emperor are balanced with the needs of a Confucian-inspired model of the state. According to the concept of *zhishen zhiguo*, such a state required that the earth-bound ruler, while seeking the Tao, must also fulfill the requirements of his position as a political figure. This compromise in the interest of Confucian philosophy and state politics is mirrored in the failure of the legendary kings to attain immortality. Thus, ecstatic explorations of King Mu or the search for immortality of Emperor Wu, come to a sober end with the ruler's eventual inability to attain immortality.

In each of the texts mentioned by Kohn-- the Lieh-tzu, the Po wu chih, the Mu T'ien-tzu chuan and the Han Wu-ti nei-chuan--the relationship between the Queen Mother of the West and the emperor is that of master and disciple. The Queen Mother of the West's role is to transmit the sacred texts of the Shang Ch'ing corpus to a suitably qualified mortal. As the Shang Ch'ing Taoist tradition was adopted by the aristocratic power elite, that suitably qualified mortal was inevitably the highest representative of the power elite

itself, namely the emperor. In the Han Wu-ti nei-chuan, the failure of Emperor Wu to be a good and just administrator is described at length--he killed many innocent people and gave full rein to licentious behavior and debauchery (Schipper 124, 126). Because of this, the Queen Mother of the West does not reappear to him, and he loses the benefit of her teachings when his palace library is burnt. The failure of the emperor illustrates the concept of *zhishen zhiguo*. It also illustrates the primacy of the Shang Ch'ing tradition of textual transmission as it supported and sought approval from the power structure, in competition with other traditions and lineages of textual transmission.

The Han Wu-ti nei-chuan was recorded in the Nihon Koku Genzaisho Mokuroku (Inventory of Written Works Extant in Japan) by Fujiwara no Sukeyo (d.898), attesting to its textual transmission from China to Japan by the late ninth century.¹² The similarity in narrative content between it and the second half of the Taketori Monogatari points to an interesting phenomenon in textual transmission between China and Japan, and the development of certain aesthetic and literary ideals in Japan during the ninth and tenth centuries. In comparing both works, I shall be relying on the French translation of the Han Wu-ti nei-chuan by K.M. Schipper and my own translation of the Taketori Monogatari, supplemented by the well-known translation by Donald Keene.¹³

In the Han Wu-ti nei-chuan, the struggle between escapist and integrationist elements in early Chinese mysticism, as described by Livia Kohn, is translated one century after its textual transmission to Japan, as a purely romantic yearning for an unattainable partner in the Taketori

¹² Konishi Jin'ichi, vol.2: 307; Yotsugi Genryo, ed. Nihon Koku Genzaisho Mokuroku: Shusei to Kenkyu (Tokyo: Kyuko Shoin, 1984) 104.

¹³"The Tale of the Bamboo Cutter," Monumenta Nipponica 11:4 (1956): 1-27.

Monogatari. The figure of the Queen Mother of the West as a Taoist goddess and transmitter of sacred Shang Ch'ing Taoist texts is translated into Kaguyahime, a celestial being, who is solely an object of affection and unconsummated passion. The emperor, as seeker of religious knowledge and ruler of a state in the Han Wu-ti nei-chuan, becomes simply a disappointed seeker of erotic pleasure (*irogonomi*), albeit still an emperor, in the Taketori Monogatari.

In the Taketori Monogatari there is no mention of transmission of sacred texts, and Kaguyahime is not a teacher. The emperor does not request instruction as a humble student, nor does he request the elixir of immortality. The elixir of immortality is a gift Kaguyahime freely bestows upon the emperor as a souvenir of herself. There are no pre-conditions or instructions for its use. There are no long lists of drugs of immortality or lists of titles of the sacred Shang Ch'ing corpus. The emperor's political leadership qualities, or lack of them, bear no relation to his failure to unite with Kaguyahime. Thus the Taketori Monogatari is emptied of any Shang-Ch'ing Taoist or Confucian content. What is retained from the Han Wu-ti nei-chuan are descriptions of Kaguyahime's numinous and beautiful appearance, her celestial escort, the emperor's pleading attitude, and the departure of Kaguyahime against the wishes of the emperor. The feelings of longing and unconsummated passion of the emperor are emphasized, as well as the overwhelming grief of Kaguyahime's parents and her serving women, upon Kaguyahime's departure. Kaguyahime's melancholic disposition and weeping at the moon are also extensively described. Her departure is dramatically delayed by epistolary outpourings of emotion and poems expressing her affection for the emperor. In the Han Wu-ti nei-chuan, the sacred texts transmitted to the emperor are burnt in a sacred fire because the Queen

Mother of the West believes he is not worthy of their transmission (Schipper 127). In the Taketori Monogatari, this detail is transposed to the emperor ordering his men to burn Kaguyahime's letter and the elixir of immortality atop Mount Fuji. This is done according to the instructions of the emperor who is emotionally overwrought at losing Kaguyahime. Thus, what was the emperor's frustrated longing for religious instruction and immortality in the Han Wu-ti nei-chuan becomes a purely romantic yearning for an unattainable partner in the Taketori Monogatari. "Of what use is the elixir of immortality/ I float in tears, not even able to meet you again," laments the emperor as he orders the burning of the elixir and letters.¹⁴

The character of Tong-fang Shuo in the Han Wu-ti nei-chuan is similarly transposed onto the character of Kaguyahime. Tong-fang Shuo is one of Emperor Wu's courtiers. He is a mischievous, clown-like character who tries to steal the peaches of the Queen Mother of the West. Since the peaches bloom only once every three thousand years, Emperor Wu realizes that Tong-fang Shuo must be an immortal. Tong-fang Shuo has been banished temporarily to earth, "in the realm of filth and impurity," because of his transgressive behavior. However, as the Queen Mother of the West explains to the emperor, he has been exonerated through the intercession of two immortals (Schipper 122). In the Taketori Monogatari, the King of Heaven explains to the Old Bamboo Cutter that Kaguyahime has committed a sin, and was sent to earth temporarily to expiate her crime. She is urged to drink some of the elixir of immortality to purify her from the contamination of the "dirty place"(*kitanaki tokoro*) where she has been living (NKBZS 105). Her sin is not explained. K.M. Schipper describes the figure of Tong-fang

¹⁴NKBZS 107 "Afu koto mo/namida ni ukagu/ waga mi ni ha/ shinanu kusuri mo/ nani ni ka ha semu"

Shuo as a literary trope in Han Dynasty literature . His role in Chinese fairy tales is that of a "banished immortal" (*zhe-xian*), who has been exiled from Heaven for transgressive behavior (Schipper 60). Schipper refers to Tongfang Shuo in the Han Wu-ti nei-chuan as the best example of a double personality, ("*personnalité double*"), or banished immortal-clown ("*clown-immortel-exilé*"), playing the role of mediator between Heaven and Earth. His role incorporates opposing elements of profane and sacred, heaven and earth, dichotomies which the Taoist adept attempts to harmonize through ritual. While in the Han Wu-ti nei-chuan, the episode concerning Tongfang-Shuo has little narrative weight, in the Taketori Monogatari it becomes a useful pretext to explain why Kaguyahime, an immortal, is living on earth among mortals.

The theme of encounters between emperors and goddesses became a popular one among T'ang poets. In particular, the abridged version of the Han Wu-ti nei-chuan as recounted by Tu Kuang-t'ing (850-933) and the Transmissions Concerning Mu, Son of Heaven provided ample material for poetic elaboration.¹⁵ Poems describing the Queen Mother's beauty, the palace of the emperor, her peaches, the feast and banquets they enjoy together, and her exchange of poems with the emperor, became the object of poetic focus. The personal failings of the emperor who struggled to achieve a balance between his personal religious life and his public duty as a political leader were important themes for T'ang dynasty officials who were caught between Confucian state ideology and private life (Transcendence 125). The emperor's religiously-inspired search for immortality received less attention, and was finally relegated to a vague longing for the unattainable, unconsummated

¹⁵ Suzanne Cahill, "Reflections of a Metal Mother: Tu Kuang-ting's Biography of Hsi Wang Mu" Journal of Chinese Religions 13,14 (1985-86): 127-142.

union of the human and divine. Cahill writes, " The poignant themes of pursuit of immortality in the face of inevitable death and hope for contact with divinity in the midst of the mundane proved attractive to medieval Chinese writers. Poems on the two emperors embodied the contradiction of human aspirations with reality in concrete stories" (Transcendence 183). In Japan, I would suggest that the meeting of the Queen Mother of the West and the emperor was stripped of religious significance, and became, in the Taketori Monogatari, a vehicle for the expression of an unfulfilled, romantic yearning for an ideal, unattainable woman of ethereal beauty in courtly literature. The fact that the Han Wu-ti nei-chuan was an expression of an aristocratic tradition, and thus a product of a political power elite, no doubt appealed to the class interests of the Japanese aristocracy which developed and defined itself and its textual production in terms of the Chinese-inspired emperor system.

Class interest, and a Japanese context insensitive to the struggles of a Chinese Taoist-Confucian religious debate, combined to produce the Taketori Monogatari. The theme of romantic yearning was most notably developed in later works of literature, such as the eleventh-century Genji Monogatari and the twelfth-century Tale of Mutsura. In these texts, the theme of unfulfilled, romantic yearning is expressed in Japanese courtly and aesthetic ideals, defined as *mono no aware* and *yōen*, and in the theme of *kekkon kyōhi*, or the heroine's refusal to marry.¹⁶

¹⁶ In his translation of The Tale of Mutsura: Fujiwara Teika's Experiment in Fiction, Wayne P. Lammers discusses the concept of *yōen*, and quotes Brower and Miner's definition of it as "the romantic idealization of a delicate, dreamlike beauty--the beauty of a peony or an exquisite heavenly maiden descending to earth on a hazy, moonlit spring night. Such beauty was elusive, ephemeral, the stuff that dreams are made of, and while the typical imagery of *yōen* had a delicate lightness of cherry petals, it was often used to convey a tone of sadness--of lovers parting or of nostalgia for the vision of a beauty not of this world (27)." *Aware* is used, most notably, by the twentieth-century writer Motoori Norinaga to create and describe a poetic mode which pervades the Tale of Genji. One

The socio-ideological substrata (or in this case, religio-ideological substrata) of the Shang Ch'ing Taoist-Confucian struggle and the figure of the Queen Mother of the West as a native, Chinese goddess represent the different world views, or heteroglossia, which are harmonized as "a single, unitary language, inviolable and indisputable" (Holquist 295) which is represented by the figure of Kaguyahime as an object of romantic yearning, and the theme of unfulfilled, romantic yearning in Japanese courtly literature. The transformation and adaptation of narrative and thematic elements of the Han Wu-ti nei-chuan in the Taketori Monogatari is an example of Bakhtin's concept of reaccentuation of texts. In the process of reaccentuation, "..the prose writer makes use of words that are already populated with the social intentions of others and compels them to serve his own new intentions, to serve a second master" (Holquist 299-300). The writer or compiler of the Taketori Monogatari has reaccentuated the social intentions of the writer of the Han Wu-ti nei-chuan by ignoring the specific *zhishen zhiguo* nature of the Shang Ch'ing Taoist-Confucian struggle, and has instead used that struggle, or "re-populated" it to express a non-religious, aesthetic effect.

scholar, Hu Xiu Min, has invoked the concept of *aware*, noting the thematic resemblance between the Taketori Monogatari and the Tale of Genji, where descriptions of the yearning for another world of the princesses in the Genji and their refusal to marry, are likened to Kaguyahime's refusal to serve the emperor and her yearning to return to the Moon Capital. The *kekkon kyohi* theme with reference to the Taketori Monogatari is explored by Mitani Eiichi in "Kekkon kyohi dan no Hoho" in Genji Monogatari Koza, vol. 1, eds., Yamagishi Zokuhei and Oka Ichiro (Tokyo: Yuseido, 1971) 188-198.

Part II: Shamanistic Elements in the Taketori Monogatari

I make use of Bakhtin's concept of heteroglossia in my attempt to uncover shamanistic elements in the Taketori Monogatari. According to Bakhtin, "the prose writer makes use of words that are already populated with the social intentions of others and compels them to serve his own new intentions, to serve a second master" (Holquist 299-300). The writer or compiler of the Taketori Monogatari, using a process described by Bakhtin as heteroglossic, did not seek to rid the early kambun version of the Taketori Monogatari of its shamanistic substrata, but "actively introduce[d] the socio-ideological mini-worlds and differing perspectives" of his own, building upon the earlier shamanistic substrata to construct a new, Japanese language text.

Being a tenth-century text, the Taketori Monogatari contains Taoist and Buddhist elements. These are described in detail by Michele Marra,¹⁷ However, in the highly syncretic religious environment of early Japanese history, there are definitely elements which can be explained by references to a native Japanese female shamanism which pre-dated, struggled and was eventually subsumed into Chinese state institutions. I believe there must have been a struggle between the two traditions which was significant enough even in the relatively late seventh century to find expression in the *kambun*, or Chinese language version of the Taketori Monogatari. I am able to postulate such a late expression of religio-ideological struggle by uncovering evidence of shamanistic elements in the extant, later, ninth to early tenth century *kana*, or Japanese language version of the Taketori Monogatari.

¹⁷Michele Marra, The Aesthetics of Discontent: Politics and Reclusion in Medieval Japanese Literature (Honolulu: University of Hawaii press, 1991) 14-34.

My argument rests on a historical development which spans over five centuries, beginning in the Kofun period (300-600 A.D.) and culminating with the formal adoption of Chinese bureaucratic institutions in 645 A.D. I use the arguments of scholars of myth, history and archaeology to support my contention that there is evidence of such a conflict, or heteroglossia, in the Taketori Monogatari. In this section, I focus on the story of Kaguyahime and the emperor in the second part of the Taketori Monogatari in my attempt to uncover heteroglossic features, in the form of socio- and religio-ideological strata of shamanism co-existing and competing with an emerging state ideology.

The author or compiler of the Taketori Monogatari is unknown, but is presumed to have been male, and well-versed in Chinese literature.¹⁸ Linguistic analysis of the text suggests the existence of an early *kambun* version of the tale, dating from around 700 A.D.¹⁹ The later, extant *kana* version, is dated from 858 to 922 A.D. Evidence for an early *kambun* version is further supported by allusions to historical figures from as early as 642, the date of the Jinshin Rebellion.²⁰ Thus, it is reasonable to assume that the Taketori Monogatari represents a textual development spanning two hundred years or more. It is a development whose beginning was close to the date of the Taika Reform (645 A.D.) when the Japanese state first defined itself as a polity in relation to China, and political reforms were introduced, modeled on Chinese patterns. While the Taika Reform introduced official reforms at the level of the governing polity, pre-existing cultic practices and associated cultural phenomena did not disappear suddenly.

¹⁸ Richard Okada, Figures of Resistance: Language, Poetry and Narrating in the Tale of Genji and Other Mid-Heian Texts (London Duke University Press, 1991) 61.

¹⁹ 15.

²⁰ Marra 28-30.

Japanese shamanism in the Jōmon period (prior to 300 B.C.) is thought to have developed from two strains of shamanism --a northern Siberian female shamanism and a Melanesian, south Chinese shamanism.²¹ Hori Ichiro, inspired by Mircea Eliade, defines shamanism as the

...general name given that magical, mystical, often esoteric phenomenon that has taken shape around the shaman, a person of unusual personality who has mastered archaic techniques of ecstasy (trance, rapture, separation of the soul from the body, etc.) (Shamanism 245).

The shaman is a "magical, charismatic figure" and shamanism is a matter of religious significance (Shamanism 247-248). Hori notes that the area extending from southern Korea through the main Japanese islands and on to the Ryukyus formed a single religio-cultural sphere, and was an area in which shamanesses were particularly numerous (Shamanism 283).

The Japanese chronicle, the Kōjiki, compiled in 712 A.D., records the myth of a divine female figure, Amaterasu, the Sun Goddess, from whom the Emperor line claims descent.²² In the Chinese dynastic histories of the third century A. D., mention is made of Queen Himiko of Japan who possessed shamanistic powers.²³ She is supposed to have unified thirty states

²¹ Carmen Blacker, The Catalpa Bow: A Study of Shamanistic Practices in Japan (London: George Allen and Unwin Ltd., 1975) 29.

²² Donald Philippi, trans. Kōjiki (Princeton University Press, 1969) 68-86.

²³ Ryūsaku Tsunoda, trans. Japan in the Chinese Dynastic Histories: Later Han Through Ming Dynasties ed. L. Carrington Goodrich (South Pasadena: P.D. and Ione Perkins, 1951) 2-3.

from 180 to 248 A.D.²⁴ The mythical figure of Empress Jingū, who ruled from 201-269 A.D., is considered to embody the prototypical shamaness' combined roles of death and birth. She is a figure that has evolved out of the Goddess of the Undersea World, as described by marine mythical topoi, into a celestial mythical tradition, represented by Amaterasu.²⁵ And, as late as 594 B.C., Empress Suikō was considered to be an influential shamaness. She was considered to be an *uji no kami*, or clan leader, of the dominant Soga clan.²⁶ The combination of shamanism and political leadership is reflected in the word for government in early Japan, *matsurigoto*, meaning both government and ritual practice.²⁷

The Kofun period (300-600 A.D.) is characterized by increasing Chinese and Buddhist influence in the development of the Japanese state and institutions. The archaeological evidence for the transition from the early Jōmon period (11,000 B.C.-300 B.C.) to the Yayoi period (300 B.C.-300 A.D.) when rice culture was introduced, and Yayoi to Kōfun indicates major ritual changes in society. Through myth analysis and a rectification of traditional chronology, Robert Ellwood has argued that the change from Yayoi to Kōfun was characterized by the discrediting of female shamanism in favor of male-centered spirituality.²⁸ Akima Toshio analyses ritual death poetry from the

²⁴Ichirō Hori, Folk Religion in Japan: Continuity and Change eds. Joseph M. Kitagawa and Alan L. Miller (London: University of Chicago Press, 1968) 191.

²⁵ Akima Toshio, "The Myth of the Goddess of the Undersea World and the Tale of Empress Jingu's Subjugation of Silla," Japanese Journal of Religious Studies, v.1:2-3; 95-185.

²⁶ J.H. Kamstra, Encounter or Syncretism: The Initial Growth of Japanese Buddhism (Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1967) 415.

²⁷Kamstra 469, 91.

²⁸"The Sujin Religious Revolution," Japanese Journal of Religious Studies 1990, 17:2-3;199-216. For a concise contestation of certain details of Ellwood's theory in the form of a footnote, see Akima Toshio "The Origins of the Grand Shrine of Ise and the Cult of the Sun Goddess Amaterasu Omikami" Japan Review 1993, 4:181-182.

Nihon Shōki (compiled in 720 A.D.), and using the historical document, the Ryō no Shūge (compiled in the late 9th. century), finds evidence for the existence of the exclusive role of women as shamanesses in death rituals performed in the ancient pre-Chinese-influenced clan society. He also finds evidence for the deliberate discrediting of female shamanistic power and its usurpation by male spiritual figures, coinciding with the adoption of the imperial court institutions (Songs 498-501). Akima writes about the ritual serving of food by the *Asobi-be* shamanesses in the *Chinkonsai* festival held by the imperial court as a vestigial remnant of their ritual and political roles:

The formalisation and sophistication of rituals in the imperial court probably allowed no room for orgiastic shamans and shamanesses and retained only this one aspect of the ancient funeral. (Songs 500)

Empress Suiko, a clan leader and shamaness, was eclipsed by her nephew Shotoku Taishi, the new male representative of divine power and the new Buddhist religion, and her achievements were downplayed in the dynastic chronicles.²⁹ Paddy Tsurumi castigates the male bias of modern historians of early Japan by arguing that the female holders of power who ruled between 592 A.D. and 770 A.D. were strong political figures who either governed jointly with their male spouse or who were able to command allegiance on their own. They were not just temporary holders of power for male offspring or male relatives, as has been argued by some scholars of Japanese pre-history.³⁰ Sekiguchi Hiroko has argued that the appearance of female emperors in the sixth century resulted from a transition period which saw

²⁹Kamstra 415-417.

³⁰"Male Present versus Female Past," Bulletin of Concerned Asian Scholars 14:4 (1982): 71-75.

changes in the structure of Japanese kingship.³¹ She quotes the work of Japanese scholars who have postulated the *hiko-hime* configuration of tribal leadership, existing from the early third century until the mid-fifth century, when political and cultic power was shared equally by a male-female couple (Sekiguchi 15-18). One scholar, quoted by Sekiguchi, who has studied Kofun archeological mortuary remains, has concluded that the two roles of government and ritual were assumed by men and women who played both main and supporting roles, regardless of gender (Sekiguchi 17). Sekiguchi maintains that gender roles were not fixed, but were quite fluid. According to her, the existence of female emperors is proof of a historical transition period between the equal sharing of power between males and females and the advent of male-centered power (Sekiguchi 20). This "fluid" system was confronted with the Chinese one-ruler kingship system, and eventually gave way to the Chinese model of a predominantly male emperor. Okada Seishi notes that originally both men and women had equal status but different roles in the ritual practices attached to shrines.³² However, around the eighth and ninth centuries, with the formal establishment of the Bureau of Ritual Affairs (*Jingikan*) under the Chinese-inspired *ritsuryō* system, such roles were no longer recognized or recorded officially (Okada Seishi 73-74). Okada makes the important distinction between discrimination based on gender and non-recognition of a pre-existing, older cultic system. Women ritualists were not discriminated against because they were women, but because their particular ritualistic roles were not part of the newly-adopted *ritsuryō* system. Under the *ritsuryō* system, male ritualists suffered the same fate as

³¹ "Himiko kara Jotei e" Nihon Joseishi eds. Haruko Wakita et al. (Tokyo: Yoshikawa Kobunkan, 1987) 15-20.

³² "Kyūtei miko no jittai" Nihon Joseishi ed. Emura Minoru, Vol. 1 (Tokyo: Tokyo Daigaku Shuppankai, 1982) 43-74.

their female counterparts (Okada Seishi 74). While other scholars argue for a gender-based discrimination (Ellwood, Akima, Tsurumi, Sekiguchi), Okada sees the loss of female cultic power as the result of an institutional change, and refuses to speculate further. That such an institutional change was strongly correlated with gendered politics, in the form of a predominantly male emperor system, is a factor that cannot be ignored, however.

With the adoption of patriarchal models of Chinese government in the seventh century, and with the introduction of Buddhist and Confucian thought, shamanism and its associated female ritual and political power was relegated to secondary status in the realm of folk religion, and eventually, entertainment.³³ According to Confucian thought, women's virtues lay uniquely in their nurturing role as mothers and preservers of the family structure. There was no role for them in the political life of the state.³⁴ Buddhist teachings held that women's bodies were impure and that they could only attain enlightenment if they were reborn as men.³⁵ Thus, the position of empress or female cultic leader in Japan was increasingly devalued and eventually gave way in political and symbolic importance to that of the male emperor. In the Ruijū Kokushi, the statesman Sugawara Michizane (845-903 A.D.) writes critically about the Emperor Heizei who reigned from 806-809 A.D., and he expresses what must have become a common criticism of woman rulers:

³³Wakita Haruko "Chūsei ni okeru Seibetsu yakuwari buntan to Joseikan" Nihon Joseishi: Chūsei v.2 (Tokyo: Tokyo Daigaku Shuppankai, 1983) 93-102.

³⁴Patricia Buckley Ebrey, ed. Chinese Civilization and Society: A Source Book (New York: The Free Press, 1989) 33-36.

³⁵Leon Hurvitz, trans. The Scripture of the Lotus Blossom of the Fine Dharma (New York: Columbia University Press, 1976) 200-201.

In coming to ascend the throne, (the Emperor Heizei) killed his younger brother the Prince, his children, and his mother and arrested many others. People regarded these as punishments in error. Thereafter his heart inclined toward inner trusted subjects, and he entrusted the government to a woman. The saying goes that the censure against letting a woman take power is because it ruins the house. How lamentable.³⁶

Female shamanesses and male shamans no doubt posed a threat to the newly-evolving, male-dominated Buddhist clergy and the Chinese-influenced emperor system. In Japan, the shaman or shamaness was an individual with special sacred powers connected to the worship of village gods, or *ujigami*.³⁷ On the basis of comparative ethnographic evidence and documentary material from the Kōjiki and the Nihon Shōki, Carmen Blacker offers a description of the ancient *miko*, or shamaness, in the following account:

She was not only a majestic figure invested with spiritual authority, whose life was set apart and sealed off from the sources of pollution, separate from contact with blood and death, childbirth and sexual intercourse, which for ordinary people were the natural and unavoidable causes of ritual uncleanness. She was also a natural shaman,

³⁶Sakamoto Taro, The Six National Histories of Japan, trans. John S. Brownlee (Vancouver: UBC Press, 1991) 135.

³⁷Kamstra 102-105.

experiencing the characteristic initiatory sickness,
supernatural call to the sacred life and subsequent
magic powers which enable her to act as a bridge
between the human world and the world of spirits.

(Blacker 114)

The *miko* of the early power structure represented the continued importance that ritual and divine intercession played in the workings of government. As *miko* attached to imperial shrines, however, they played a considerably reduced role, merely performing purification rituals and offerings to the god of the shrine. The Saigū Princess who performed priestly functions at the Grand Shrine at Ise represented a purely symbolic arm of the imperial court. As described in the Engi-shiki in 927, and interpreted by Robert S. Ellwood, The female, royal and virginal state of the Saigū Princess were of more importance than any shamanistic or spiritual power that could be ascribed to her prototypical *raison d'être* as an instrument of divine possession, revelation and divination.³⁸ Hori notes that charismatic authority, represented by shamanism, "stands in sharp contrast both to bureaucratic and to patriarchal authority systems" (Shamanism 250).

Shamanism, while discredited by the official state ideology, was nevertheless adopted early into the emperor system as an integral part of its rituals and ceremony. This is evident in the accession ceremony of the emperor, the *Daijō-sai*. It was a ceremony originating in archaic Harvest and Spring rites, textually recorded in the Nihon Shōki(720), the Kōgoshui (807), Nara-period Fudōki, and the court rituals of the Engi-shiki(927).³⁹ In the

³⁸"The Saigū: Princess and Priestess," History of Religions 7 (1967): 35-60.

³⁹Robert S. Ellwood The Feast of Kingship: Accession Ceremonies in Ancient Japan (Tokyo: Sophia University Press, 1973) 49-59

Daijō-sai, the new emperor takes a ceremonial bath, purifying himself, then puts on a white linen robe called the *hagoromo*, or feather-robe, and imitates the descent of the Imperial Grandson who descends from heaven, as recorded in the myths of the Kojiki. He eats sacred food offered by two maidens, who were daughters of the Nakatomi priestly clan. It was a carefully performed ritual whereby the emperor symbolically ascends to and descends from heaven, re-affirming his celestial and divine nature. In the *Chinkon-sai* ceremony, which was part of the *Daijō-sai*, the imperial soul was believed to attach itself to the emperor when he covered himself with a futon-like cover, and fasted. He became the Imperial Child of the Sun, changing status from human to divine, when the cover was removed.⁴⁰ When the emperor donned the *hagoromo*, he was similarly believed to assume the status of a deity.⁴¹

Eliade writes of the ornithological symbolism of the shaman. To don a feathered robe is to imitate the shape of a bird, usually an eagle. It allows the shaman to return to a previously mystical state in the other world (156). In Japan of the Yayoi period, there is abundant archaeological evidence connecting ornithological symbolism with death rituals and communication with the dead.⁴² In the celestial wife figure, as identified by Eliade, the male shaman is helped along on his ecstatic journeys to the other world by a celestial wife and other feminine spirits (75-81). They confer magical powers on him and offer him food so that he will forget his earthly life and remain in their power. The offering of food to the emperor by the two daughters of

⁴⁰Sasaki Kōkan "Priest, Shaman, King," Japanese Journal of Religious Studies 17:2-3 (1990): 105-128.

⁴¹"The Feast of Kingship" 59.

⁴²Richard Pearson Image and Life: 50,000 Years of Japanese Prehistory (Museum of Anthropology, UBC 1978) 18-19; Donald Philippi, trans. Kojiki 126 ; Also The Catalpa Bow , 320; footnote 12.

the Nakatomi priestly clan in the *Daijō-sai* can be interpreted in the shamanistic context as the role of the celestial wife of the shaman, or helping feminine spirits. The close correspondence between shamanistic rites of accession and the content of myths of the founding of the emperor line are studied by Gary Ebersole in Ritual Poetry and the Politics of Death in Early Japan.⁴³ Ebersole points out that the myths of the Amaterasu-Susano-o narrative in the *Kojiki* are “charter myths” of the *chinkon-sai* rituals. They basically served to legitimate the emperor line as it sought to establish politico-religious hegemony over the claims of other competing clans (Ebersole 91, 96-98).⁴⁴ The donning of the *hagoromo* by the emperor in the *Daijō-sai* indicated that the emperor’s role as *kami* was conflated with that of head shaman and deity. Originally, shamans or priests of a clan, *uji no kami*, did not possess divine status but were simply intermediaries between the clan’s god (*ujigami*), and the clan.⁴⁵ The *Daijō-sai*, however, was a ceremony which conferred divine status on the emperor in his simultaneous capacity as head shaman.

Edward Kamstra writes about the *uji* system as it evolved into a state system, combining cultic and political power:

When the *uji* was later assembled into a more federal union, and various conglomerations of *uji* came into being, the power and the influence of the *ujigami* grew in accordance with that of the *uji* and they began to enjoy recognition in wider circles. When large and powerful *uji* subjected lesser *uji*, the *ujigami* of these lesser *uji* shared their fate. Thus a

⁴³(Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1989)

⁴⁴Also see Toshio 141-198.

⁴⁵Kamstra 110

divine hierarchy came into being. We can imagine how this divine hierarchy was introduced into various myths.

[Kamstra earlier cites the myths of the Kōjiki and Nihon Shōki which privilege the imperial lineage]...As such an uji grew to national significance, its ujigami could expand commensurately to a national deity. However, this could not take place without the spiritual power which had previously been held by the uji no kami of the conquered uji being also concentrated in the hands of the most powerful uji. ⁴⁶

Kamstra's analysis is confirmed by Joan R. Piggott who writes about the pattern of confederative political organization centered around sacred rulership and shared ritual forms from Yayoi to imperial times.⁴⁷ Divine genealogies centering around Amaterasu, the Sun Goddess, were developed to privilege the status of the imperial clan in the Kōjiki and Nihon Shōki, and myths and cultic practices were blended between the imperial and affiliated, competing clans.⁴⁸ When the Council of Kami Affairs (*Jingikan*) was instituted during the late seventh and eighth centuries, Japanese emperors began to refer to themselves in imperial edicts as manifest kami (*akitsukami*).⁴⁹ The relationships between priest, shaman and king are considered in the context of Ancient Japan by one writer who notes that the shamanic figure gradually came to be differentiated into the two functionaries of priest and shaman, which were essentially political. It was a

⁴⁶Also see Joseph M. Kitagawa "Prehistoric Background of Japanese Religion," History of Japanese Religions 1:1(Winter 1963): 292-328.

⁴⁷"Sacral Kingship and Confederacy in Early Izumo" Monumenta Nipponica 44:1 (1989): 45-74.

⁴⁸Piggott 62.

⁴⁹Delmer Brown, gen. ed., The Cambridge History of Japan, vol. 1 (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993) 326.

differentiation which coincided with the development of a centralized authority and social stratification. According to this analysis, "the essence of the *Daijō-sai* could be said to lie in the symbolic performance of an event that was a real, vivid union-of-god-and-king that took place in earliest times."⁵⁰ (Here, the author uses the words "emperor" and "king" interchangeably). Amino Yoshihiko writes that the use of the Chinese term '*tennō*', or emperor, is contemporaneous with the use of the word '*Nihon*', demonstrating the central importance of the emperor system in the creation of a state ideology. '*Nihon*', used as early as 645, was the term designating the state based in the Kinai region, the *ritsuryō* state, which defined itself in terms of, and against, T'ang China. State consciousness was limited to a small power elite comprised of state officials, and was geographically restricted. Amino writes,

...just as there could be no *tennō* before the appellation
itself took root, so there could be neither a Japan nor
Japanese before the name for Japan came into currency.

(132)

The history of Japan, Amino suggests, is the history of the imposition upon and acceptance of the term '*Nihon*' by tribes and competing polities in and around the Kinai region. With the added insights of archaeological and mythological analysis, the history of Japan also entailed the discrediting of female shamanism and the exclusivity of male-centered political and cultic power.

In the *Taketori Monogatari*, Kaguyahime plays the double role of celestial wife and shamaness at a time when the emperor had assumed, or usurped, the role of shaman, at least symbolically, in ritual such as the *Daijō-*

⁵⁰Sasaki Kōkan 125.

sai. Kaguyahime's double role reflects the ambiguity of the female shamaness' position in an increasingly Chinese-influenced state and its close correlation with gendered politics. In their special capacity as spiritual figures, the *miko* were forbidden contact with blood and death, childbirth and sexual intercourse, all sources of ritual uncleanness.⁵¹ Kaguyahime's refusal of sexual union with her male suitors or the Emperor, and the concern of the King of Heaven that she has been polluted by her stay on earth, can be interpreted in the light of these ritual interdictions. Kaguyahime's trance-like gazing on the moon and resultant change of consciousness can be explained as the trance which the shamaness undergoes as she prepares to communicate with the other world.⁵² Kaguyahime's donning of her feathered robe operates a change in consciousness in her, similar to a shamanistic trance, and allows her to traverse the boundaries of heaven and earth. As mentioned earlier in connection with the emperor's ritual donning of the *hagoromo* in the *Daijō-sai*, this reference to ornithological symbolism was an important aspect of the shaman's ability to "fly" back and forth between heaven and earth. Kaguyahime's unexplained past "sin" which caused her to be abandoned on earth is perhaps derived from the continental prototypical tale recorded by Eliade, which incorporates myths of an original sin. In shamanic practices among some continental peoples, there is the belief that the first men moved freely between earth and heaven; as a result of a "sin", the heavenly pathway was blocked. Only upon death can a person cross the road to heaven, with the help of the shaman (Eliade 441). However, Eliade notes that these are aspects of Siberian shamanism which are not considered typical of Japanese shamanism. Along with the figure of the

⁵¹Blacker 114

⁵²Blacker 108.

celestial wife, they are considered to be directly derived from the continental prototype.⁵³ Since Japanese shamanism is considered to have been derived from a northern, Siberian strain of shamanism, these elements must have coalesced with the native Japanese shamanistic tradition of communication with the other world while in a state of trance.⁵⁴

Kaguyahime's radiant presence emits light all around, brightening the corners of the miserable hut of the Bamboo Cutter. Her unnatural glow calls to mind another shamanistic characteristic. Hori writes that the magical "interior heat" of the Japanese shaman represents ecstatic communication with the divine (Shamanism 255, 259, 265, 273). The mountain upon which the Emperor burns Kaguyahime's letters is an image which evokes the early Japanese belief in the numinous power of mountains, a belief which predates the introduction of Buddhism to Japan. Spirits were believed to dwell in mountains, and communication with the other world was particularly effective from a mountain. Hori notes that:

The mountain beliefs in Japan...show a typological similarity to shamanic beliefs of the archaic period in other parts of the world, in which such motifs as magical heat, ascension to heaven, and descent to the nether world are prominent. In Japan, it is significant that these motifs are integrally related to sacred mountains, which are both the object of religious worship and the arena of religious practices...Japanese mountain worship, though

⁵³Blacker 108.

⁵⁴Blacker 114. Also, see note 20 above.

historically coloured by Shugen-do and Tantric Buddhism, has preserved many features of ancient shamanism which can be traced to the prehistoric period.⁵⁵

The date on which Kaguyahime ascends skyward, the fifteenth day of the eighth month, is the traditional date when ancestors return to the earth (Hori FRJ 156). It is also a spiritually-charged time when ancestors are called into the body of a shamanistic medium and encouraged to speak to their living offspring.⁵⁶

Kaguyahime also plays a second role, which is that of celestial wife. This can be observed in the motifs of the *hagoromo*, or feathered robe, and her offer of the elixir to the emperor. The *hagoromo*, while enabling the shaman or shamaness to fly back and forth between the divine and earthly realms, was also worn by a celestial wife who, in the Siberian shamanistic tradition, was not a shamaness, but whose role was to help her husband-shaman in his other-worldly journeys (Eliade 78). Kaguyahime's offer of the elixir of immortality to the Emperor can also be explained by the figure of the celestial wife who offers food to her husband shaman in order to keep him in her power and offer him aid as he journeys to the world of spirits (Eliade 77).

This double role of Kaguyahime, as both celestial wife and shamaness, is matched by the double role of the emperor as head shaman and representative of the newer, *ritsuryō* system. When Kaguyahime returns to heaven, she refuses union with her lowly earth-bound suitors and with the emperor because she is the vestigial incarnation of a female shamaness, who must remain in a state of ritual purity. Although the emperor is supposed to

⁵⁵Folk Religion in Japan: Continuity and Change (London: University of Chicago Press, 1968) 177-179.

⁵⁶Blacker 47.

be divine, since he is a descendant of the Sun Goddess, his divinity is no match for Kaguyahime's divinity. When summoned to meet the emperor's messenger, Kaguyahime refuses to do so, and remarks almost sacrilegiously: "I do not think that what the emperor said is so awe-inspiring."⁵⁷ However, since the emperor is also the head shaman, according to ritual and symbolic tradition, Kaguyahime plays a second, lesser role of celestial wife or helpmate. This she does when she offers the elixir to the emperor. The Emperor refuses to partake of the elixir of immortality because, as the representative of the patriarchal *ritsuryō* political system, he rejects the native shamanistic tradition and Kaguyahime's role of celestial wife, and/or shamaness, within that tradition. Their mutual refusal of each other betrays a struggle between religious and political traditions at a time in Japan's history when a Chinese-inspired, patriarchal order was being formally superimposed on a society which previously had accorded high political and religious status to the female and the shamanistic tradition. It was a struggle which had started since around 300 A.D. when the influence of Chinese state ideology was starting to be felt in Japan, but it must have intensified with the formal adoption of the Taika Code in 645 A.D. Since the earliest postulated date of composition of the *kambun* version of the Taketori Monogatari is 700 A.D., it is not unreasonable to assume that a struggle of such momentous political importance would find expression in a written text. It is a struggle which, perhaps paradoxically, but not unusually, co-existed with the gradual adoption and assimilation of aspects of shamanism into the emperor system.

Mikhail Bakhtin explains that concrete socio-ideological language consciousness exists in textual production. It is the existence of different world views which are filtered through specific contexts of differing history,

⁵⁷NKBZS , 89. "Mikado no meshite notamahamu koto, kashikoshi to mo omowazu"

societies and ideologies. When texts are created, this socio-ideological language consciousness is found to be heteroglossic, that is, multiple, and sometimes conflicting. The creator of a text will reaccentuate such conflicts or multiplicity, according to his or her own specific context and ideological viewpoint. Bakhtin writes, "Consciousness finds itself inevitably facing the necessity of *having to choose a language*." With each literary-verbal performance, consciousness must actively orient itself amidst heteroglossia, it must move in and occupy a position for itself within it, it chooses, in other words, a "language." (Holquist 295 Italics in original) When texts are recontextualized by other writers, or re-situated in different cultural, social or historical contexts, such choices are made. Bakhtin calls this process of actively choosing a language "reaccentuation."

Reaccentuation of the Taketori Monogatari is evident in the eleventh-century Tale of Genji. It occurs in the famous "Picture Contest" chapter where the Taketori Monogatari is referred to as the "ancestor of all romances" (*monogatari no ideki-hajime no oya*).⁵⁸ Here, in a contest of the merits of the Taketori Monogatari and another picture romance, which pits the left team against the right, Kaguyahime is praised by the contestants of the left team for maintaining a proper distance from earthly defilement. The contestants of the right, however, deem her of inferior status via-à-vis the emperor because she was found inside a bamboo stalk, and thus cannot be placed within the imperial system of court rank.⁵⁹ What is more, the radiance she exuded cannot compare to the light of the imperial halls and pavilions. The latter judgment is deemed appropriate and secures a win for the right side. Thus, the possession of what I consider a shamanistic

⁵⁸Edward Seidensticker, trans. (New York: Alfred Knopf, 1981) 311.

⁵⁹Seidensticker 311-312.

characteristic--radiating light--is construed as inferior, and unworthy of attention from the representative of the state's divine symbol, the emperor. It is the source of Kaguyahime's loss of social rank. The unconsummated passion and failed union of the emperor and Kaguyahime which were substrata of an ideological conflict between state ideology and the pre-existing cultic tradition in the Taketori Monogatari become recontextualized in the Tale of Genji into a positive valorization of the superior rank of the Emperor, the representative of the newer state ideology, and the inferiority of Kaguyahime, the representative of the earlier, oppositional shamanistic tradition.

Thus, in the Tale of Genji, written a century after the presumed composition date of the Taketori Monogatari, the representative of the patriarchal political system triumphs definitively over the feminine spiritual tradition. Such a recontextualization or reaccentuation illustrates Bakhtin's concept of consciousness actively orienting itself amidst heteroglossia, and choosing a particular language, or viewpoint. The particular concrete socio-ideological language consciousness which I have identified as a struggle between shamanistic substrata and state ideology is surrounded by heteroglossia--it is a heteroglossia of the later, historical context of the eleventh century when that state ideology is positively valorized and the shamanistic tradition, coupled with its related female cultic power, is denigrated. According to Bakhtin's analysis of reaccentuation, the shamanistic subtext of the Taketori Monogatari in the Genji Monogatari is an example of discourse "already peopled by the social intentions of others"(Holquist 291-292). The reaccentuation of this discourse by one writer, Murasaki Shikibu in this case, illustrates further how the writer

"bends discourse to new purposes, to serve a second master"(Holquist 299-300).

Part III: Cupid and Psyche

Bakhtin writes that a text is the site of internal dialogization--that is, it is a nexus of forces of competing, and sometimes harmonizing, world views (Holquist 284). The writer uses these world views in new ways when she builds upon an already existing text, or when she creates a new text, using words and ideas that belonged to earlier, different contexts. Bakhtin writes,

"The whole matter consists in the fact that there may be, between "languages," highly specific dialogic relations; no matter how these languages are conceived, they may all be taken as particular points of view on the world. However varied the social forces doing the work of stratification--a profession, a genre, a particular tendency, an individual personality--the work itself everywhere comes down to the (relatively) protracted and socially meaningful (collective) saturation of language with specific (and consequently limiting) intentions and accents."(Holquist 293)

By uncovering dialogic relations in Cupid and Psyche in the form of a struggle between religion and state ideology, and personal bias and nativism of its author, I wish to show that Cupid and Psyche can be favorably compared with the Taketori Monogatari, despite the fact that both works are far removed in time and socio-ideological and cultural contexts from each other.

Cupid and Psyche is an ancient Latin tale written by Apuleius, a Roman writer, around 160 A.D. It is part of a larger work known as The Metamorphoses, or, alternatively, The Golden Ass.⁶⁰ The tale's prototype can

⁶⁰P.G. Walsh, The Golden Ass (Oxford: The Clarendon Press, 1994)

be found in Greek myth and folk tales throughout Europe, Asia Minor, India, and Indonesia⁶¹ and contains narrative elements and themes which appear similar to the Taketori Monogatari. Psyche is a young mortal woman whose beauty attracts the attention of the god Cupid. She is spirited away from her earthly domain and her parents to become his reluctant bride. In a narrative pattern conforming to the 'Monster-bridegroom' type, he remains invisible to her, visiting her only at night. She is not allowed to see him, but contrives to get a glimpse of him while he is asleep. Because she has transgressed the "looking taboo" imposed on her, Cupid leaves her at that very moment. The rest of the story consists of Psyche's efforts to find her husband. The goddess Venus, the mother of Cupid, imposes several Herculean-type tasks on her which she accomplishes with much suffering and hardship. In the last task, she descends to the Underworld to procure a divine beauty potion for Venus, but disobeying the "opening and looking" taboo, she opens the box containing the potion, and falls into a deep slumber. Her husband Cupid returns to the scene to rescue and revive her. When she takes a sip of ambrosia, the divine nectar of the gods, she becomes an immortal among the other gods on Mount Olympus.

Psyche's beauty, her ability to transcend the boundaries between earth and heaven, her transgressing of taboos, the imposition of impossible tasks, her attainment of immortality, and her final apotheosis are themes that present a superficial resemblance to the Taketori Monogatari. In the Taketori Monogatari it is Kaguyahime who sets the tasks for her suitors, whereas in Cupid and Psyche, it is Psyche who must perform tasks. A magical,

⁶¹James R.G. Wright, "Folktale and Literary Technique in Cupid and Psyche," The Classical Quarterly 21 (1979): 273-284.

transformative elixir of immortality figures in both stories. Psyche becomes an immortal by imbibing ambrosia, the elixir of immortality. Kaguyahime, upon tasting some of the elixir of immortality, forgets all about her life on earth, and is restored to the Moon Capital as an immortal. The donning of the robe of feathers and sipping of the elixir of immortality by Kaguyahime returns her to her original status as a princess of the Moon capital, and her memory of life on earth is completely erased by these acts. This is similar to Psyche falling into a deep Stygian sleep upon opening the box of magic beauty ointment. It is the prelude to her eventual change in status from mortal to immortal. Psyche has transgressed taboos of "looking" and "opening and looking" and is punished. Kaguyahime has similarly transgressed a taboo, which remains unspecified, and she must expiate her crime by residing on earth as a mortal.

Both works are specifically compared by one writer who comments on the topos of *kaimami* in Heian-period literature. *Kaimami* is defined as a type of voyeurism by Norma Field.⁶² Field notes that the Taketori Monogatari is an example of *kaimami*, whereby a superior, heavenly being is spied upon, and the seeing results in either union or separation. Field cites the episode of the emperor catching a glimpse of Kaguyahime and her immediate disappearance from the scene, and eventually her abandonment of him. She compares this to a similar type of *kaimami* in Cupid and Psyche where Psyche's violation of the "looking" taboo results in her husband's disappearance.

The Metamorphoses concerns a central character, Lucius, who is transformed into an ass because of his inordinate sexual curiosity and interest in magic. He undergoes a series of tragi-comical adventures in his

⁶²The Splendor of Longing in the Tale of Genji (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1987) 56-67.

animal form. In a "transformative journey" thematic pattern, Lucius' adventures lead him through scenes of sensual debauchery involving humans, and eventually he is restored to his original human form as a wiser and less curious person through the intercession of the goddess Isis. The last part of the tale has him renounce his obsession in magic, 'slavish pleasures' (*serviles voluptates*) and 'unhappy curiosity' (*curiositas improspira*), and become a worshiper of the goddess. Using the already well-known techniques of allegory and fable, Apuleius inserted the story of Cupid and Psyche in the Metamorphoses to highlight and allegorize the trials of Lucius. Psyche's suffering, her curiosity which intensifies her suffering, her difficult journey to redemption, and her eventual elevation to the state of immortality among the gods of Mount Olympus mirror thematically, and in several details, Lucius' adventures.⁶³ The Metamorphoses was Apuleius' adaptation of an earlier Greek comic romance called Lucius or the Ass by Lucian, a Roman author who was a contemporary of Apuleius.⁶⁴ In the work by Lucian, the tale of Cupid and Psyche is absent. Apuleius also makes a conscious nod to The Metamorphoses by Ovid, a work dating from 8 A.D. The literary technique, general theme and broad outline of Apuleius' work show the influences of his literary predecessor.⁶⁵

P.G. Walsh has advanced the thesis that Apuleius used the tale of Lucius to argue for the primacy of Isiac religion over Christianity. He does this by examining Apuleius' own career as a highly-educated government

⁶³P.G. Walsh The Roman Novel: The 'Satyricon' of Petronius and the 'Metamorphoses' of Apuleius (Cambridge University Press, 1970) 190-192.

⁶⁴Carl C. Schlam, The Metamorphoses of Apuleius: On Making an Ass of Oneself (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1992) 22.

⁶⁵Judith Krabbe, The Metamorphoses of Apuleius New York: Peter Lang Publishing, 1989) 37-81.

official, a representative of Rome, who nevertheless was not Roman, but who lived and wrote in Carthage, North Africa. He wrote at a time when Christianity was particularly popular in North Africa, and the Isiac religion had been under attack, at least in polemical writings, by writers in Rome (Walsh 1994, xxxviii). In the Metamorphoses, Lucius' salvation by the goddess Isis, thinly veiled criticism of the Christian religion in one episode, and the popular belief the Christians worshipped the ass, are examples quoted by Walsh to support his claim (Walsh 1994, xxxviii-xxxix). His claim is echoed by a historian of religion who examines the geographical shift of Rome as center of literary activity to the outer provinces, such as North Africa, and the subsequent proliferation in North Africa of Christian-inspired Latin writers. He writes "...it is likely that Apuleius was moved to write his masterpiece, the Metamorphoses, by desire to defend the worship of Isis from Christian charges and claims."⁶⁶ Walsh surmises that Apuleius was enthusiastic about the Isiac religion, and that his Middle Platonist philosophical attitude harmonized with the Isiac doctrine of a soul's journey through the mire of sensual pleasure and eventual purification, salvation and elevation to a higher reality (Walsh 1994, xxxii). Cupid and Psyche was thus meant to be read by Apuleius' contemporaries as an integral part of the Metamorphoses, highlighting and allegorizing the author's exhortation to the seeker of philosophical truth to worship the divine Isis. Walsh writes:

Viewed as a projection of Lucius' career into the world of myth, the history of Psyche presents a vision of the progress of the human soul alienated from the true reality, yet searching unceasingly for

⁶⁶J.H.W.G. Liebeschuetz, Continuity and Change in Roman Religion (Oxford: The Clarendon Press, 1979) 205.

it and being eventually admitted to it by initiation into the mysteries. It is in this sense that Apuleius can be said to have shaped the tale into a Platonist-Isiac myth. (Walsh 1970, 223)

The last book of the Metamorphoses contains the most detailed description of Isis ritual to survive from the time of Apuleius (Walsh 1994, xxxvii). Although Isis worship, originating in Egypt, differed from traditional Roman religious beliefs, it was not an exclusive religion. It allowed its believers to worship Roman gods at the same time. However, Isis worship had long been associated with immigrants and the lower classes, and its spread among the upper classes was quite limited.⁶⁷ It was a religion which emphasized ritual and moral purity, and in contrast to the Christian religion's emphasis on life after death, it offered a restructuring and prolongation of the individual's life in the here and now. Isis worship freed its believer from the tyranny of Fortune and other abstract Roman Gods.⁶⁸ Thus, while existing outside of the Roman established religion, Isis worship was not exclusive and did not discriminate against Roman gods.⁶⁹

Apuleius left Carthage at a young age to become a student in Athens, studying Latin and Greek. He is assumed to have been bilingual, speaking both Punic and Latin. He traveled widely, spending some years in Rome, then returned to Carthage in later life, enjoying social prominence and literary distinction (Walsh 1994, xi). His "rootlessness" during his time in Athens and Rome, his personal wealth which contrasted with the poorer material

⁶⁷Liebeschuetz, 180-182.

⁶⁸Liebeschuetz, 221-222.

⁶⁹Liebeschuetz, 221-222, 177.

circumstances of other Isis worshippers, and his experience of being an Isis worshipper in Rome, made him an outsider.⁷⁰ His espousal of Platonist philosophy catered to his individualistic tastes, further separating him from community-centered religion.⁷¹ Apuleius' situation as a representative of Rome, yet not a Roman, must be taken into account when considering his defense and support of the Isiac religion. With the rise of Christianity in his native North Africa, Apuleius no doubt felt the need to assert his own fractured identity as a Roman government official belonging to the center, yet at the same time existing on the periphery as a native North African.⁷² Defending an exotic religion of Egyptian origin which coexisted peacefully with the Roman worship of abstract deities against the exclusivist doctrinary incursions of Christianity must have seemed quite natural to someone in his position.

In the Metamorphoses, Lucius is also warned against an obsession with magic, a warning which perhaps can be understood in the context of the Isiac religion competing with marginalized religious and magical practices. In an earlier work, the Apology, Apuleius defends himself against charges of magic, making a distinction between 'degrading magic' and his own, presumably legitimate and uplifting, intellectual activity (Walsh 1994, xxxiii). The assumption was that the search for philosophical truth, while superficially resembling magic, was on the contrary an activity of the literate, propertied classes. "Magic" was something confined to the base superstitions of peasants and barbarians.⁷³ One writer who has studied the fictional representations of magic and magicians in Graeco-Roman society

⁷⁰Liebeschuetz, 217.

⁷¹Liebeschuetz, 217.

⁷²Liebeschuetz, 216-217.

⁷³Liebeschuetz, 219.

makes the observation that "The opposition to true knowledge is caricatured by being represented as marginal --socially, biologically, intellectually, spatially marginal. The denunciation of superstition is the language of those who claim to be intellectually central, it is a language of power; those who are foolish enough to believe in superstition deserve their peripheral place in the cultural hierarchy."⁷⁴ The preoccupation with magic and "inappropriate" intellectual curiosity in The Metamorphoses is echoed in Cupid and Psyche with Psyche's looking at her sleeping husband and opening the box containing the beauty potion. Like Lucius, Psyche is punished for her curiosity, and wanders forlornly through the world in search of divine help. In focusing on Psyche's inordinate curiosity and assigning value to it, Apuleius did not betray his class interests as a wealthy, educated government official, a representative of the center.

Thus, in the Metamorphoses, and its allegorical subtext, Cupid and Psyche, class interests, nativist sentiment, and personal bias coincide with religious dogma to produce a work of literature to be consumed and recycled among the literati and power elite. The differing world views of class, nativism, state ideology and religion are the "specific intentions and accents", or concrete socio-ideological consciousness, which stratify and form the dialogic relations within and between the languages of a text, according to Bakhtin. In Cupid and Psyche, Apuleius as the writer is the individual personality who functions as a social force doing the work of stratification of dialogue--he consciously chooses his own language from other, pre-existing languages and texts. Bakhtin comments further on the role of the writer:

⁷⁴Richard Gordon, "Aelian's peony: The Location of Magic in Graeco-Roman Tradition," Comparative Criticism: An Annual Journal, ed. E.S. Shaffer (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1987) 66.

The prose writer [as a novelist] does not strip away the intentions of others from the heteroglot language of his works, he does not violate those socio-ideological cultural horizons (big and little worlds) that open up behind heteroglot languages-- rather he welcomes them into his work. The prose writer makes use of words that are already populated with the social intentions of others and compels them to serve his own new intentions, to serve a second master. (Holquist 299-300)

By creating the text Cupid and Psyche, Apuleius reveals the socio-ideological cultural horizons of a particular Roman government official, living and writing in the second century A.D.

Cupid and Psyche provided a conceptual framework for The Confessions of Augustine (354-430 A.D.) some two centuries later, a text which described the redemptive journey of sinner to Christian believer.⁷⁵ In Renaissance Europe, The Metamorphoses, first translated into Spanish in 1525, was to have a wide literary influence on the picaresque genre in Spain.⁷⁶ Its English translation in 1566 gave thematic inspiration to a wide range of literature, from Shakespeare's A Midsummer's Night's Dream to Spenser's The Faerie Queene and John Keats' Ode to Psyche.⁷⁷

The popularity of Cupid and Psyche in later ages attests to the process of "reaccentuation" described by Bakhtin. He writes, "Each era reaccentuates

⁷⁵Judith K. Krabbe, The Metamorphoses of Apuleius (New York: Peter Lang Publishing Inc., 1989) 11-25.

⁷⁶Krabbe, 22

⁷⁷P.G. Walsh, 1994 xlvii-xlviii.

the works of past eras. The historicity of classical literature is, eventually, an uninterrupted process of its socio-ideological re-accentuation" (Holquist 231-233). The notion of European classical literature based on Greek and Roman texts and artifacts which were "re-discovered" in the Renaissance is part of the process of reaccentuation. According to Martin Bernal, the study of European historiography suggests the construction and retrospective revalorisation of "classical" culture, activities which were consonant with the sense of progress, the romanticism, racialism and Christianity of the early nineteenth century.⁷⁸ He argues that proof of the Egyptian and African roots of Greek civilization has been consistently denied and denigrated because it did not serve the interests of the age of European imperialism or our current notion of "classical" literature. The Egyptian or African ur-text of Cupid and Psyche, if it ever existed, would have been neglected by biased scholarship. According to this view, Cupid and Psyche, as a product of the Graeco-Roman world, is a construction of our Western European heritage, a heritage that is racist, Christian, romantic, and allied with our sense of progress (Bernal 20-21).

Textual production in the second century A.D., in the Roman Empire, later during the European Renaissance, and now, was and continues to be, a site of competing ideologies à la Clifford, or reaccentuated socio-ideological consciousness, as defined by Bakhtin. The competing ideologies of religion, state, nativism and class interest in Cupid and Psyche resemble the ideological struggle between Taoist and Confucian philosophies in the Chinese pretexts of the Taketori Monogatari, and the struggle between ancient cultic practices of shamanism and the emerging state ideology of Japan. As I shall explore

⁷⁸"Black Athena Denied: The Tyranny of Germany Over Greece and the Rejection of the Afroasiatic Roots of Europe: 1780-1980," Comparative Criticism: An Annual Journal (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1986) 3-69.

further, comments by twentieth-century writers and critics reveal that the Taketori Monogatari continues to be a site of competing discourses and ideologies.

Part IV: Twentieth-century Reaccentuations of the Taketori Monogatari

In this section, I will consider the critical comments of Michele Marra and Richard Okada, two twentieth-century writers, who analyze the Taketori Monogatari. The Taketori Monogatari is viewed by both writers as a site of competing discourse and ideology, at specific points in time. Their critical comments, while uncovering the internal dialogization of the Taketori Monogatari, at the same time reveal their ideological positions, illustrating Clifford's concept of "specification of discourses." In discourse specification, discourse is arranged hierarchically. That is, they are relations of power and privilege existing in specific historical and social contexts (Clifford 1986, 17). By examining critical commentaries about a text, one can uncover the hierarchical arrangement of discourse in that text, as well as the ideological bias of its creator. The text which is the object of critical commentary is then viewed as a vehicle for such bias, and such biases themselves intersect and form a new heteroglot opinion of the world. Bakhtin's concept of reaccentuation continues to be a useful concept here. In the reaccentuation of texts, a writer makes use of the internal dialogization, or heteroglossia, of a pre-existing text to create a separate, new text which embodies a new worldview. This act of creation is situated in time by ideology and personal bias. It is based on the principle that language is heteroglot, that is, that it is mediated. Bakhtin writes,

Thus at any given moment of its historical existence,
language is heteroglot from top to bottom: it
represents the co-existence of socio-ideological
contradictions between the present and the past,
between differing epochs of the past, between

different socio-ideological groups in the present,
 between tendencies, schools, circles and so forth, all
 given a bodily form. These "languages" of
 heteroglossia intersect each other in a variety of
 ways, forming new socially typifying "languages."
 (Holquist 291)

In his study of counter-ideological discourse in the Taketori Monogatari, Michele Marra interprets the failed union of Kaguyahime and the emperor in terms of a struggle between Buddhism and Taoism (16-28). He describes the numerous Buddhist and Taoist elements in the Taketori Monogatari and suggests that the text is an example of Buddhist didactic literature. The failure of the Emperor to attain immortality confirms the Buddhist doctrine that life is as ephemeral as a drop of dew. The Taoist search for immortality, according to the Buddhist view, must end in failure. Kaguyahime must remain unattainable, and the Emperor must remain a mortal. Marra writes,

Realizing that immortality is subject to a higher truth,
 the emperor, given the chance to become an immortal,
 refuses the medicine of eternal life. The illusive nature
 of the Taoist theme of permanence is exposed. The six
 men [the five suitors and the emperor] may or may not
 have learned a lesson, but they have undoubtedly been
 awakened from the world of illusion. (Marra 27)

Marra bases his argument on a real distinction between Buddhism and Taoism at a time in Japanese history when Taoist texts from China, such as the Chuang Tzu (Jpn. Sōshi) and the Lao-tzu (Jpn. Rōshi) were of scant doctrinal import, and Buddhism was an amalgam of various religious and

cultic practices. He writes that an early version of the Taketori Monogatari was written soon after the monk Kyokai had compiled an anthology of Buddhist sermons, the Nihon Ryōiki, in 821. It was a time "when the Buddhist doctrine had already won widespread acceptance among the courtiers and intellectuals" (Marra 24). However, Neil McMullin describes the lack of clear-cut distinctions between religious doctrine, cultic practice and superstitions at this time in Japanese religious history.⁷⁹ He cites the example of Saichō (767-822 A.D.), the founder of the Tendai school of Buddhism in Japan, who chose the site of the Enryakuji monastery, guided by native Shintō feelings about sacred mountains, and "perhaps also by Taoist notions about auspicious places and directions" (McMullin 5). He goes on to note,

The fact of the matter is that Buddhist monks in pre-modern Japan were also Shintoists, which is to say no more -- but no less-- than that they were enmeshed from birth in a cultural fabric that was shot through with a *mélange* of indigenous and imported myths, symbols, rituals, and moods that taken together we call Shintō. Throughout most of Japanese history, foreign (Buddhist, but also Taoist and Confucian) and indigenous elements were amalgamated in a single, cohesive whole. Indeed, Buddhism and Shintō were amalgamated institutionally, ritually and doctrinally to such a degree that to treat them as distinct,

⁷⁹"Historical and Historiographical Issues in the Study of Pre-Modern Japanese Religions," Japanese Journal of Religious Studies 16 (1989): 3-40.

independent traditions is to misrepresent the structure of pre-modern Japanese societies. (McMullin 5)

McMullin criticizes scholars who adopt the modern Western "genus-species" view of religion which divides religion into "primitive", "world" and "gnostic" religions. It is a model of religion which assumes that Buddhism, being a "world" religion and Shinto a "primitive" religion, they must be separate and distinct from each other, instead of existing simultaneously together (McMullin 23-24). Another scholar, Kuroda Toshio, has researched the etymology of the word "Shintō" and finds that Shinto was another term for Taoism in China during the same period it was textually recorded in Japan, in the Nihon Shōki (720 A.D.).⁸⁰ Many Japanese rituals and ceremonies were influenced by Taoist practice, and "Shintō" was merely a local brand of Taoism. Taoism did not systematically enter Japan in ancient times, but it became part of Japan's religious milieu over a long period of time (Kuroda 5-7). Recontextualizations of Taoist and Buddhist themes and topoi in non-didactic, non-religious texts was common practice. Most male writers of the Heian period, who were educated to read and write Chinese and Japanese poetry, would naturally, and sometimes indiscriminately, incorporate Buddhist and Taoist elements in their work.

Marra concentrates on the failure of the emperor to attain immortality in his explanation of a struggle between Buddhist and Taoist religious doctrine. My focus on the failure of the union of Kaguyahime and the emperor as well as the failure of the emperor to attain immortality is part of an attempt to uncover shamanistic substrata which pre-existed the official introduction of Buddhism and Confucianism to Japan. As I have also shown

⁸⁰"Shintō in the History of Japanese Religion," Japanese Journal of Religious Studies 7 (1981):1-21.

above, in the Taketori Monogatari, the failed union between Kaguyahime and the emperor had lost its earlier prototypical Shang Ch'ing Taoist content and concomitant struggle between early Chinese mystical traditions. What remained was the thematic expression of an unfulfillable, romantic yearning that gave rise to the creation of certain aesthetic ideals of courtly literature.

Elsewhere, Marra describes more successfully the Bakhtinian socio-ideological mini-world in the Taketori Monogatari, as a "re-politicization" of the stories of the five suitors of Kaguyahime (Marra 28-34). Quoting extensively from the work of Japanese scholars, Marra is able to identify each of the suitors in the Taketori Monogatari as historical figures dating from the 642 Jinshin Rebellion and later. Both the *kambun* (Chinese language) and *kana* (Japanese language) versions of the Taketori Monogatari represent separate, although similar re-politicizations. According to Marra, the *kambun* version represents political discontent of the seventh century against Fujiwara no Fuhito (Marra 30). It was the time of the transition period from the Taika reform of 645 to the imperial system in 701. Two centuries later, at the time of the later *kana* version of the ninth century, the *ritsuryo* system, based on Chinese models of administration and penal law and land tenure, was slowly giving way to the control of a new political elite centered around the emperor and the new *sekkanke* system. The *sekkanke* system was ruled by a sublineage of the Northern branch of the Fujiwara which came to hold hereditary posts of *sessho* (imperial regent) and *kampaku* (civil dictator). It was a time when discontent was high among the formerly powerful families who were politically marginalized in the process. In his parodic and ironic treatment of each of the five suitors, the captain of the guards, and the emperor's messenger, the unidentified author or compiler of the Taketori

Monogatari expresses discontent against the Fujiwara political hegemony in the ninth century. According to Marra, the author/compiler was able to veil his discontent in legendary material and supernatural themes (Marra 31). In his historical and ideological analysis of the expression of political discontent, Marra's approach to the Taketori Monogatari is modeled closely on Bakhtin's concept of reaccentuation and socio-ideological mini-worlds. The text is viewed as a reaccentuated site of competing ideologies and discourses.

Another writer has focused on the Taketori Monogatari, with quite different interpretive strategies. By examining the text and pretexts of the Taketori Monogatari, Richard Okada has uncovered a wide variety of narrative modes and an "unprecedented play of language" (56). The use of *hiragana* to rewrite a text originally composed in *kambun* represents "a nativist linguistic moment that generates itself, breaking loose from the graphic and syntactic constraints of Chinese and perhaps also signaling a different attitude toward the notion of *kotodama* [word-spirit]...The Taketori text...presents a new signifying practice" (Okada 56). In the textual representation of poems, announcements, documents, letters, adventure stories, reports, decrees, and other narrative conventions, the narrator of the Taketori "seems to be relishing the newfound freedom provided by *hiragana* writing to render native speech" (Okada 62). Another writer quoted by Okada views the free manipulation of "words" separate from their "representative" function in the Taketori as a key to the formation of *monogatari* literature (Okada 80). Okada has made much of the difficulties of translating the verbal suffixes *keri* and *ki* in Heian literature. He maintains that they indicate the tenselessness of *monogatari* discourse, and are better understood as modality or aspect markers. Thus he translates *keri* and *ki* into the English historical present. By doing so, Okada is criticized by another

scholar, Haruo Shirane, of "wash[ing] out the complexities and nuances of narration, particularly the subtle modulations of focus and distance, which, as Japanese scholars have shown, is never fixed or stable", and of "serious distortion."⁸¹ Okada is further accused by Shirane of primitivism and exoticism in his claims that the original integrity of the Japanese language was violated by Chinese writing systems. Shirane writes, "In Okada's study, the phoneticist hiragana script (opposed to Chinese graphism) is similarly aligned with orality, innocence, and the fantasy of a community in resistance to the 'violence of the letter'"(Shirane 228). According to Shirane, Okada is eventually a neo-orientalist in his bald attempt to appropriate the "Other" and in his definition of Heian *monogatari* as a series of oppositions to Chinese appropriations (Shirane 227).

It is difficult not to agree with Shirane that Okada's analysis of the Taketori Monogatari and its use of language are nativist. Okada's use of the highly controversial word *kotodama* is problematic. The belief in "word-spirit" was revived by nationalist scholars to give credence to ideas of Japanese uniqueness at a time of Japanese militaristic expansion, and in the late eighth century it was invoked to explain linguistic problems experienced by Japanese officials who were learning Chinese.⁸² By not problematizing his use of *kotodama*, and claiming the existence of a prior, "free" Japanese language, Okada's approach to textual analysis in the Taketori Monogatari is one whereby causes and effects can be determined by intangible, immutable essences. It culminates in a high point where essences are at their purest, and all subsequent development can only be poor imitation or nostalgic

⁸¹rev. of Figures of Resistance: Language, Poetry and Narrating in the Tale of Genji and Other Mid-Heian Texts, by Richard Okada, Journal of Japanese Studies 20:1(1994): 221-228.

⁸²Joshua S. Mostow, "Animism, Orality, and Japanese Literature," ([Vancouver]: [Dept. of Asian Studies, UBC] 1996) 1-10.

evocation of an ideal. Michel Foucault describes this approach in the work of the traditional historian as opposed to the genealogist. The latter realizes that there is no given essence to reality, and that everything is an effect of discourse, while the former believes in "Truths", "Origins" and "Essences."

Foucault writes:

...the origin makes possible a field of knowledge whose function is to recover it, but always in a false recognition due to the excesses of its own speech. The origin lies at a place of inevitable loss, the point where the truth of things corresponded to a truthful discourse, the site of a fleeting articulation that discourse has obscured and finally lost. ...Moreover, the very question of truth, the right it appropriates to refute error and oppose itself to appearance, the manner in which it developed... --does this not form a history, the history of an error we call truth? ...The genealogist needs history to dispel the chimeras of the origin, somewhat in the manner of the pious philosopher who needs a doctor to exorcise the shadow of his soul. (Rabinow 79-80)

Okada's reaccentuation of the Taketori Monogatari is in the tradition of Foucault's truth-seeker. His lack of historical insight and essentializing discourse severely limit the possibility of uncovering dialogic orientation and heteroglossia, as defined by Bakhtin. Marra, on the other hand, has used historical and ideological analysis to illustrate, or to attempt to illustrate, the various socio-ideological mini-worlds which populate the Taketori Monogatari.

The debate between orientalism and nativism in Shirane's critique of Okada, and the uncovering of dialogic orientation in Marra's approach reveals an ideological struggle which is situated in twentieth-century global politics and history. Orientalism and nativism are born of responses to nineteenth-century European colonial expansionism and subsequent decline. Orientalism was an ideology which was helpful in legitimizing and furthering European colonizing ventures. In an era of post-coloniality and independence from European colonization, new nation-states formed, and its founders developed ideologies of nativism to counter imperialistic discourse and European hegemony. Okada's analysis rests firmly within the parameters of the ideological context of nativism and its resistance to colonizing discourse.

While Marra's approach leads to a fuller appreciation of the complexities of discourse and dialogical relations in textual production, his uncovering of modes of resistance against dominant discourse reveals an anti-hegemonic bias in an age of post-coloniality and global hegemonic politics. The heteroglot opinion of the world presented by him in the text of the Taketori Monogatari is informed by twentieth-century ideologies of resistance and struggle.

Part V: The Psychoanalytic Perspective

Bakhtin maintains that each age reaccentuates in its own way the works of the past. He writes: "The historical life of classic works is in fact the uninterrupted process of their social and ideological re-accentuation" (Holquist 421). James Clifford's ethnographic methodology approaches a text as an example of cultural production, that is, as something produced through relations of production (Clifford 1986, 13). In such an approach, the questions that must be asked are: "who speaks? who writes? when and where? under what institutional and historical constraints?" (Clifford 1986, 13).

In this section, I will discuss the critical comments of two Jungian scholars who engage directly and indirectly with both the Taketori Monogatari and Cupid and Psyche. My aim is to show how these texts, as sites of competing discourse and internal dialogization, continue to be reaccentuated as sites of ideological struggle in the twentieth century. I will attempt to uncover the historical and socio-ideological bias which informs this struggle. In doing so, I rely on Bakhtin's and James Clifford's insights on reaccentuation and competing discourse.

The term "collective archetype" was coined by Carl Jung to describe the primordial images that exist in the unconscious lives of human beings. Crossing cultural and linguistic boundaries, existing since prehistoric times, these images have remained constant, according to Jung. They appear in different forms, and are manifested as symbols in art, literature and social rituals. Understanding archetypes leads one to an understanding of the collective psyche which exists in the individual human being. According to Jung, the development of an individual's consciousness, ego and Self, is a psychical process which is reflected in universal archetypal images.

Familiar archetypes discussed by Jung are the Mother, the Trickster, Rebirth, Transformation, the Hero's Quest, to name but a few. They appear at various intervals in the development of the human psyche. The goal of all psychical development is Selfhood. This is a state in which consciousness separates from the unconscious, and the resulting ego attains a higher form of consciousness in a process called individuation. A fully individuated person functions normally in society and can deal effectively with the struggles between the ego and the unconscious in his or her psychical structure.

The scholar Erich Neumann applied Jung's theory of psychical development to the study of myths. He developed the archetypal themes of Great Mother, Separation of World Parents, the Uroboros, the Hero Myth and the Transformation Myth to show the development of the human psyche through symbols and motifs that appear in the myths of the world. In the story of Cupid and Psyche, Neumann traces these archetypes to posit a hypothesis of the nature of feminine consciousness.⁸³ I will briefly describe Neumann's argument, and contrast it with a similar psychoanalytically-inspired analysis of Japanese folk tales and myth by the Japanese scholar of myth and fairy tale, Hayao Kawai. I extrapolate Kawai's analyses to include the Taketori Monogatari. In contrasting Kawai's and Neumann's analyses, I attempt to ideologically situate the discourse of psychoanalytical analysis within current debates about "Japan" and "The West."

According to Neumann, the Uroboros is the original unity, the individual's psychic identification with the Mother figure. At this stage the individual has no ego consciousness. From this original unity, there occurs a

⁸³Amor and Psyche: The Psychic Development of the Feminine, trans. Ralph Manheim (New York: Harper and Row, 1956)

struggle for separation from the Mother figure, which leads to a higher consciousness (Neumann 82). The struggle of Psyche in Cupid and Psyche to attain immortality is interpreted by Neumann as the struggle of the unconscious ego against the Great Mother. It is an important step towards individuation, or selfhood (Neumann 89). Psyche's initial separation from the Mother figure occurs when she leaves her parents and is betrothed to an unknown husband. Her separation is further intensified by a second severing of a human relationship, this time from her new husband. She enters into direct conflict with the Mother figure, represented by Venus, her mother-in-law, when she embarks on a search for Cupid. As Psyche acquits herself of a series of tasks imposed by Venus, she develops a masculine consciousness, which, according to Neumann, is essential for individuation in both the female and male psychical make-up (Neumann 110). However, she asserts her "essential womanhood" by opposing masculine reason in disobeying an injunction not to open the box which contains the magic beauty potion which Venus commanded her to obtain. By doing so, and succumbing to vanity, she confirms her feminine nature, and wins back her husband (Neumann 123). She is thus able to attain apotheosis as an Immortal on Mount Olympus. Psyche's success depends on her uniting with the male, with the opposite. It is a 'hieros gamos', or sacred marriage between opposites, signifying an evenly balanced unity which is the successful development of the Self.

However, in applying Neumann's analysis to the Taketori Monogatari, Kaguyahime's adventures on earth and in heaven would be interpreted as an arrested development of the Self. Although the initially awakened feminine consciousness of Kaguyahime is challenged by the five suitors, and the character of Kaguyahime displays masculine consciousness, as defined by

Neumann, she eludes union with the opposite principle of maleness as embodied in a male partner. There is no "hieros gamos", or sacred marriage leading to the Divine or Selfhood. Instead, Kaguyahime returns to the original, primordial state of unconsciousness by returning to heaven, and by forgetting all that happened to her on earth. In the moon, she explains to the Bamboo Cutter and his wife, people have no worries. Thus there is no conflict, no struggle with the archetypal Mother figure. In psychoanalytical terms, Kaguyahime's adventures represent the continued dominance of the Great Mother over an undeveloped ego.

In The Japanese Psyche: Major Motifs in the Fairy Tales of Japan Hayao Kawai argues that a Western, Jungian analysis is inappropriate to an analysis of Japanese mythology and folk tales.⁸⁴ By considering a number of Japanese tales where the female protagonist simply disappears at the end, returning the tale's narrative movement to a situation identical with its beginning, Kawai postulates the concept of "nothingness" (Kawai 1988, 167-170). The fact that "nothingness" has occurred symbolizes a positive, rather than negative value, in the Japanese psyche. He maintains that in the unique "Women of Will" figure in Japanese mythology and folktales, resolute activity by the heroine is not typical of the passive feminine consciousness of Western psychoanalysis, but rather reflects a unique, Japanese "feminine" consciousness (Kawai 1988, 177-182). But, according to Neumann's analysis, Kaguyahime displays Western "masculine" attributes by actively setting tasks for her male suitors. Kawai counters this analysis by noting that the meaning of male and female in Jung's archetypes is derived from the symbolic system in Western alchemy where the sun is male and the moon is female. In Japanese mythology, however, the sun is female and the moon

⁸⁴trans. Kawai Hayao and Sachiko Reece (Dallas: Spring Publications Inc., 1988)

Neumann, she eludes union with the opposite principle of maleness as embodied in a male partner. There is no "hieros gamos", or sacred marriage leading to the Divine or Selfhood. Instead, Kaguyahime returns to the original, primordial state of unconsciousness by returning to heaven, and by forgetting all that happened to her on earth. In the moon, she explains to the Bamboo Cutter and his wife, people have no worries. Thus there is no conflict, no struggle with the archetypal Mother figure. In psychoanalytical terms, Kaguyahime's adventures represent the continued dominance of the Great Mother over an undeveloped ego.

In The Japanese Psyche: Major Motifs in the Fairy Tales of Japan Hayao Kawai argues that a Western, Jungian analysis is inappropriate to an analysis of Japanese mythology and folk tales.⁸⁴ By considering a number of Japanese tales where the female protagonist simply disappears at the end, returning the tale's narrative movement to a situation identical with its beginning, Kawai postulates the concept of "nothingness" (Kawai 1988, 167-170). The fact that "nothingness" has occurred symbolizes a positive, rather than negative value, in the Japanese psyche. He maintains that in the unique "Women of Will" figure in Japanese mythology and folktales, resolute activity by the heroine is not typical of the passive feminine consciousness of Western psychoanalysis, but rather reflects a unique, Japanese "feminine" consciousness (Kawai 1988, 177-182). But, according to Neumann's analysis, Kaguyahime displays Western "masculine" attributes by actively setting tasks for her male suitors. Kawai counters this analysis by noting that the meaning of male and female in Jung's archetypes is derived from the symbolic system in Western alchemy where the sun is male and the moon is female. In Japanese mythology, however, the sun is female and the moon

⁸⁴trans. Kawai Hayao and Sachiko Reece (Dallas: Spring Publications Inc., 1988)

male, or absent (Kawai 1988, 24-25). Thus , Western concepts of patriarchal and matriarchal consciousness do not seem particularly well adapted to a discussion of ego development where such distinctions are not always clear, as is evident in Japanese mythology. Kawai suggests that the ego of a Japanese is better symbolized as female and not as male(Kawai 1988, 123-134).

Elsewhere, in "The Japanese Mind as reflected in their Mythology", Kawai describes further evidence to support a view of the unique qualities of the Japanese psyche.⁸⁵ In the mythology of the founding of the Japanese nation, Kawai notes that of the three deities, the Sun Goddess Amaterasu, the Moon God Tsukuyomi and the God of Wind Susano-o, only Tsukuyomi is not mentioned in subsequent stories and tales, despite the fact that the Japanese show a greater love for the moon than the sun in poems and literature. This can be attributed to the fact that Tsukuyomi is an inactive force occupying the central position between opposite active forces such as heaven and earth, good and bad, and so on. Tsukuyomi, by his absence, is in the central position of the Japanese pantheon, which is common among triads of deities in other generations of deities. Kawai calls this the "Hollow Center Balanced Model" (Psychologia, 20). As opposed to the "Western Central Power Ruled Model," where distinctions between good and evil are clear cut, in the Japanese Hollow Center Balanced Model the unique feature consists in the mutual existence of reciprocal elements that maintain a delicate balance among themselves. Judgment between right and wrong is ambivalent. The weak point of the Hollow Center Model lies in the fact that the Center, being empty, is open to invasion by strong foreign elements, although this is usually just a temporary situation, as harmony and balance reassert themselves by that foreign subversive element being ejected, never liquidated.

⁸⁵Psychologia 28 (1985):71-76.

Thus, the return of Kaguyahime to the Moon Capital can be interpreted as the "nothingness" which has happened, or the reassertion of the Hollow Center Balanced Model. The circular movement of the tale's narrative represents an inactive principle which does not distinguish clearly between male and female or good and evil. It is Wholeness achieved -- not arrested ego development, according to Western Jungian analysis. Kaguyahime's assumption of masculine traits when she assigns tasks to her suitors is indicative of the ambivalent sexual characteristics in the Japanese psyche, according to Kawai's analysis. She does not succumb to vanity like Psyche, and display "an exclusive Western feminine consciousness" as defined by Neumann. In Cupid and Psyche, Psyche's progress from the initial situation of being a mortal to attaining immortality in the end indicates a linear, directed movement which is typical of Kawai's Western Central Power Ruled Model.

Kawai's counter-analysis coincides with a current, prevalent view of the uniqueness of Japanese culture as always reasserting its unique character in the face of foreign cultural elements, such as Taoism, Buddhism or Western scientific ideology.⁸⁶ It is a view which is reflected in the development of the science of ethnology in Japan in the early twentieth century. Its ideological underpinnings were given form and voice by the scholar Yanagita Kunio who collected legends and anecdotes from all over Japan in order to capture and preserve the archaic and enduring folk spirit which was being threatened by modernization and the West. According to one commentator, "...to the extent that it became constituted as the study of what was uniquely Japanese, that is, outside the corruptions of Western modernity, Yanagita and his folklore studies...contributed to the chauvinism

⁸⁶ See Kosaku Yoshino, Cultural Nationalism in Contemporary Japan: A Sociological Inquiry (London: Routledge, 1992) 9-38.

and cultural nationalism of the wartime period."⁸⁷ Origuchi Shinobu, a follower of Yanagita Kunio, concentrated his efforts on the study of literature to discover the "true" Japanese identity which, although hidden by foreign accretions of Chinese influence and Buddhism, nevertheless still existed in the consciousness of the ordinary Japanese person.⁸⁸ Kawai echoes these sentiments of nationalism and unique conceptions of identity when he writes that:

The true "strength" of the Japanese lies not in how clearly one can make others understand and act in accordance with one's own theories and beliefs but rather in how many outside elements one can accept without losing one's own identity. And I am convinced that it is this basic difference in approach to life that brings about misunderstandings between Japanese and Westerners. (Psychologia, 75)

Kawai's evocation of the concept of "nothingness" is closely modeled on the philosophical writings of the Japanese philosopher, Nishida Kitaro. While Nishida engaged seriously with the Western philosophical tradition, and attempted cross-cultural philosophizing in his comparisons between Zen Buddhist philosophy and the Western existential philosophical tradition, the Kyoto School of philosophy which formed between 1927 and 1945 used Nishida's ideas and philosophy to promote ideologies of cultural nationalism and Japanese superiority. Nishida's articulation of a "logic of the East" (*tōyōteki ronri*) and an "Asian nothingness" (*tōyōteki mu*) were seized upon

⁸⁷Marilyn Ivy, Discourses of the Vanishing: Modernism, Phantasm, Japan (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1995) 94.

⁸⁸H.D. Harootunian Things Seen and Unseen: Discourse and Ideology in Tokugawa Nativism (London: University of Chicago Press, 1988) 418-430.

by his followers during a time of mounting cultural chauvinism and militaristic ideology, eventually leading to the Pacific War.⁸⁹ Nishida's critical stance on "nothingness" was related to fundamental philosophical problems in both Western and Zen Buddhist contexts. *Mu* is characterized by Nishida as a standpoint of "no-ego" which embraces the contradictory elements of self and non-self, leading to subsumption into a higher, albeit contradictory, non-logical entity.⁹⁰ However, his discourse was articulated on binary distinctions between "East" and "West," whereby Western philosophical texts were characterized as "being"(*u*) and Eastern texts as "non-being" (*mu*) (Dilworth 140). Kawai's adoption of this East/West binarism in Nishida's philosophy and vocabulary is part of his attempt to situate Japan and Japanese literature as unique phenomena, possessing indigenous essences, in opposition to the West or China. His approach resembles, and derives inspiration from, the Kyoto School which tacitly endorsed war-time nationalism, and capitalist ideology.⁹¹

Neumann's and Kawai's theories and counter-theories indicate a larger problem which involves questions of knowledge, power and history. In exploring such questions, I am inspired by Foucault's description of Nietzsche's concept of "effective history." Effective history, as opposed to traditional history which is teleological and metaphysical, views an event as "...not a decision, a treaty, a reign, or a battle, but the reversal of a relationship of forces, the usurpation of power, the appropriation of a vocabulary turned against those who had once used it, a feeble domination

⁸⁹David A. Dilworth, trans. Last Writings: Nothingness and the Religious Worldview, by Nishida Kitaro (Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 1987) 129.

⁹⁰Nishitani Keiji, Nishida Kitaro, trans. Yamamoto Seisaku and James W. Heisig (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1991) 49-55.

⁹¹Asada Akira, "Infantile Capitalism and Japan's Postmodernism: A Fairy Tale" Postmodernism and Japan eds. Masao Miyoshi and H.D. Harootunian (Durham: Duke University Press, 1989) 273-278.

that poisons itself as it grows lax, the entry of a masked "other" (Rabinow 88). Traditional history, on the other hand, is masked in a "cloak of universals" (Rabinow 91). Foucault's genealogist, as opposed to the traditional historian, views history as relationships of power, and knowledge and truth as perspective. Kawai's appropriation of Nishida's vocabulary unmasks the "other" of Japan and Japanese culture as being located in the West and Buddhist China.

A Foucauldian genealogical analysis of psychoanalysis and Jung's archetypes which derive from it, reveals the workings of some of these power relationships and perspectives which constitute "knowledge" and "truth." A genealogical analysis also situates the theories of Neumann and Kawai in a specific ideological context of the twentieth century.

Jung's basic philosophical premise was that of Enlightenment vitalism. Enlightenment vitalism, based on the observation of living nature, sought to establish "a logic of the ambiguous, enthrone complementarity over unity or contradiction."⁹² The goal of the cultural sciences, according to this model, was the study of the development of humanity as an organic entity. There was a teleological impulse, a hidden active force which directed human development, whose discovery was possible through the scientific methods of comparison and analogy. Jung's psychoanalytical theorizing was fully in this European-centered tradition. It was also a tradition which defined itself against the "Other" of the East, framed by orientalist scholarship. Edward Said has described this type of scholarship in the context of the history of European colonization. In the orientalist tradition, European anthropologists and linguists who often formed the vanguard of European-inspired

⁹²Peter Hanns Reill, "Science and the Construction of the Cultural Sciences in Late Enlightenment Germany" The Case of Wilhelm Von Humboldt," History and Theory: Studies in the Philosophy of History 33:3 (1994): 345-366.

colonizing enterprises, sought to better know the 'enemy' and thereby subjugate it. The culture under scrutiny comes to be objectified and classified by the subject culture in an uneven relationship underscored by the historically perceived economic and political advantages of the latter over the former. The "East" becomes the locus of the irrational, the unknown, the "masked other," as Foucault would say, of the West (Rabinow 88). I shall extrapolate the orientalist discourse to the case of Japan and Japanese mythology, as presented by the Jungian psychoanalytical perspective.

According to J.J. Clarke, Jung's theorizing was based on an understanding of the 'East' through texts which were, in the orientalizing tradition of scholarship, trail-blazing efforts of translation.⁹³ His comprehension of the state of non-ego as obliteration of the individual similarly limited his understanding of Eastern religions (Clarke 173). Critics of Jung have commented that "the voice of the Protestant conscience" in Jung and his inability to free himself of Western prejudice, were important factors influencing his cross-cultural theorizing about the 'collective unconscious' (Clarke 173). Although Jung reversed earlier thinking about the unitary Self in the Western tradition, postulating it as a dynamic, active set of forces in conflict with each other, the ideal of individuation or Selfhood is wholeness and harmony, or absence of conflict (Clarke 174). In studies of Japanese language and society, Jane Bachnik notes the "lack of compatibility of the Japanese *uchi/soto* (inside/outside) distinction with the notions of the Western "self" as a bounded, inner, reflective psychological essence."⁹⁴ Recent pragmatic linguistic analysis and analyses of spatio-

⁹³Jung and Eastern Thought: A Dialogue With the Orient (New York: Routledge, 1994) 170.

⁹⁴Situated Meaning: Inside and Outside in Japanese Self, Society, and Language, eds. Jane Bachnik and Charles Quinn, Jr. (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1994) 23.

temporal distinctions such as inside and outside (*uchi/soto*), verbs of giving and receiving, and polite and informal language show how fluid the boundaries are which determine Self in the Japanese language (Bachnik 3-38). Neumann's euro-centric, universalizing analytic norm, deriving from Jungian theory, constructs a Japanese "psyche" which, in its failure to achieve wholeness, is the undeveloped "Other" of the Western psyche.

Kawai and Neumann use psychoanalytical theory to construct a feminine consciousness. Kaguyahime's presumed "masculine" traits and ambivalent sexuality and Psyche's "feminine" consciousness must be viewed critically against a background of the constructed nature of gender. Psychoanalytical theory, based on Freudian theories which theorize feminine consciousness as natural or universal has come under heavy criticism from feminist critical scholarship.⁹⁵ Freudian and post-Freudian descriptions of male and female acculturation are founded on the concept of a mother-rejecting ego. In Freud's Oedipal theory, girls as well as boys must reject the figure of the mother to develop a healthy psychical life. Boys are later able to find a mother-substitute in adult life by marrying a woman, and girls must adopt the role of mother, both to their husbands and to their children. But the girl's connection with her own mother is broken by patriarchal social systems. "Feminine consciousness" was wholly consonant with a societal and cultural norm which required women to play the roles of mother and wife. One writer considers that Freud had trouble theorizing about female consciousness and femininity because he was bound to urban, capitalist, masculinist norms.⁹⁶ According to her, Freud's Oedipus theory was "a

⁹⁵Teresa Brennan, "An Impasse in Psychoanalysis and Feminism," A Reader in Feminist Knowledge, ed. Sneja Gunew (London: Routledge, 1991)114-138.

⁹⁶Ruth Anthony El Saffar, Rapture Encaged: The Suppression of the Feminine in Western Culture (London: Routledge, 1994) 41-44.

distillation of Western cultural history, its Judeo-Christian monotheistic base being overlain by the development of technology, imperialism and the growth of capital in the sixteenth century"(El Saffar 41). James Clifford likewise examines Freudian theoretical discourse in the context of 'traveling theory' and suggests that "psychoanalysis loses something of its theoretical aura when it is found to be rooted in bourgeois Vienna of the turn of the century and in a certain male subjectivity for which woman is object and enigma."⁹⁷ Jung's theorizing of the feminine as being receptive, irrational, and imaginal, was not much different from Freud's. It was a concept firmly rooted in dualistic, essentialist categories of male and female, oblivious to patterns of power and dominance (El Saffar 47, 38).⁹⁸ According to Nancy Chodorow, the heroic striving for individuation, which is a key concept in psychoanalytic theory, is male-centered and incompatible with a successful development of the feminine ego. Chodorow disputes the psychoanalytic account of feminine consciousness development in contemporary society by focusing on the importance of the mother-daughter bond. The mother-daughter bond, largely ignored by traditional psychoanalytical theory, is, according to her, a key element in successful feminine ego development. Thus, Jung's archetypes, derived from myths, can be viewed as constructs of historical and social discourses. They reflect the biases of a patriarchal

⁹⁷"Notes on Travel and Theory" Inscriptions 5 (1989): 177-188.

⁹⁸Rapture Encaged 47, 38. "In dualistic thinking, difference is understood as opposition. In oppositional structures, the *other* is what one cannot, at all costs, be. That means that one must assume a position of power and engage in efforts to resist or suppress that which seems, because of the conflictual nature of the world view, to be threatening to one's status as a being. It is in this sense that consciousness so developed comes to be associated with the masculine. It arises out of a negation of the mother as a figure of autonomy and power, and it maintains itself by splitting "good" and "bad" aspects of that original whole and enforcing in women an identification with one or the other that leaves them no room to experience their full range of affect."

society, and instead of reflecting women's "natural" consciousness, reflect instead women's consciousness as constructed by men.

The universal, gendered human consciousness which Jung and Neumann propounded is an example of the "cloak of universals" which Foucault described. It provided answers to the "Truth" of human development in an age of orientalist discourse, sexism, and racism. It led to the construction of a "universal" human psyche which was normatively male, bourgeois, and European. It also constructed a Japanese psyche which reflected the "other" of Western psychoanalysis. In an intellectual atmosphere of Japanese cultural chauvinism and nationalism, Hayao Kawai also uses the tools and language of psychoanalytic theory, but in a reverse and particularizing movement, his analysis of Japanese myths and folk tales uncovers a unique Japanese consciousness.

In analysing colonial texts, Homi Bhabha writes about "Universalist" and "Nationalist" critics.⁹⁹ Both critics argue from the theoretical position that texts are representations of reality, and that to evaluate a text, one assesses its accuracy of representation, or degree of mimeticism, with reference to an "ideal text." Bhabha writes,

The Nationalist critic caught in the problematic of image analysis, speaks against one stereotype but essentially, and inevitably, for another. The static nature of 'stereotype-analysis' - which is the image caught outside the process of the text - demands that the derogatory stereotype must be replaced by positive ('Nationalist') images, which oppose the

⁹⁹"Representation and the Colonial Text: A Critical Exploration of Some Forms of Mimeticism," Theory of Reading, ed. Frank Gloversmith (Brighton: Harvester, 1984) 93-122.

undifferentiating liberal humanist discourse of
Universalism. (Bhabha 105)

The ideal, "correct" text of both Kawai and Neumann is a European, male-centered, orientaling text. Kawai's ideal text, while seeming to resist the Europeanness of Jung's and Neumann's theorizing, nevertheless accepts and uses the terms of debate of the orientalist, euro-centric construction of the psyche. Bhabha relies on 'ideological analysis' in an attempt to get beyond the Universalist/Nationalist discourse and to approach texts as constructions of ideological discourse. Seeming to echo Foucault's concept of "effective history" and knowledge as perspective, Bhabha continues, "Literature and History, mediated by the concept of ideological practice, are part of an internal relationship; a process of that internal contradiction which...constitutes literature as an ideological form" (Bhabha 108).

In discussing modernity and postmodernity in Japan, the writer Naoki Sakai uncovers the similarly articulated "universalizing" and "particularizing" theoretical stances of three early twentieth-century Japanese philosophers, Kosaka Masaaki, Koyama Iwao and Takeuchi Yoshimi.¹⁰⁰ While they critique "modernity" and the "West," they nevertheless accept the Eurocentric and monistic world historical parameters of discourse. Kosaka and Koyama simply reverse the debate to position "Japan" at the center, in a resisting position, and the "West" at the perimeter, being actively resisted. Sakai writes,

Yet in this very resistance it (the Orient) was
integrated into the dominion of the West and served,
as a moment, toward the completion of Eurocentric

¹⁰⁰"Modernity and Its Critique: The Problem of Universalism and Particularism," Postmodernism and Japan, eds. Miyoshi Masao and H.D. Harootunian (Durham: Duke University Press, 1989) 115-116.

and monistic world history. In this scheme, the Orient was to play the role of self-consciousness that had failed in the continual dialectical reaffirmation and recentering of the West as a self-consciousness that was certain of itself; it also served as an object necessitated in the formation of the West as a knowing subject....even in its resistance, the Orient is subjugated to the mode of representation dominated by the West. (Sakai 115-116)

According to Sakai, postmodernity is the sense of uncertainty brought about by resistance to modern subjectivity and its related historico-geopolitical pairing of discursive schemata (Sakai 94-95). Such schemata underlies the politics of representation. To expose the ideological bias of such politics is to recognize discourse as discourse, and to eschew an emancipatory ideology (Sakai 120). Homi Bhabha's injunction to the reader of literature to analyze ideological discourse and the politics of representation is characteristic of the postmodern sensibility, according to Sakai.

The search for meaning in myth and literature is motivated by competing interests and ideologies. In Europe of the Romantic era a developing sense of nationhood grew out of new beliefs in individual freedom and the right of a people to self-determination. Literature was a useful construct in the European colonizing attempt to consolidate nation states and empires. It promoted the myth of national unity and cultural homogeneity in the service of political and economic aims. Collections of folk tales and literature were symbols of the unique 'soul' of a nation. In trying to capture the essence of this uniqueness, European scholars of comparative literature

compared and classified myths and literature.¹⁰¹ In writing about the "invention" of English literature, Masao Miyoshi writes about the study of English in Japan during the Meiji period (1868-1912) and the critical response of Natsume Soseki, the Japanese writer, towards English Literature.¹⁰² He traces the etymology of the word "*bungaku*" which is the now accepted Japanese term for literature. The use of the term "*bungaku*" was historically consonant with the rise of the consciousness of a bourgeois nation-state in Japan at a time when British and American imperialistic powers provided models of capitalism, statehood and imperialism (Miyoshi 278). Miyoshi writes:

Literature was..useful as the ruling class was confronted with the proletariat displaced by the expansion of industrial capitalism. Together with "Culture," an even more diffuse idea, literature was to provide a sense of agreement and community among the disparate groups of a nation. The Meiji enlightenment leaders found a similar need for "literature" in Japanese society and used the word *bungaku* in the new sense that had spread by Soseki's time among writers and scholars. In short, by 1900 literature seems to have taken root in Japan with all its problematic contours intact. (Miyoshi 278-279)

¹⁰¹Susan Bassnett, Comparative Literature: A Critical Introduction (Oxford: Blackwell Publishers, 1993) 14-16.

¹⁰²"The Invention of English Literature," Japan in the World, eds. Masao Miyoshi and H.D. Harootunian (Durham: Duke University Press, 1993) 271-287.

Textual production as "literature" reveals itself to be firmly rooted in ideologies of orientalism, capitalism, nationalism, imperialism and gender politics. When situated ideologically, both Kawai's and Neumann's psychoanalytic approach to the reading of myth and folk tales can be viewed as discourse which "cloaks" itself in universals, "a relationship of forces, the usurpation of power, the appropriation of a vocabulary turned against those who had once used it, a feeble domination that poisons itself as it grows lax, the entry of a masked "other" (Rabinow 91).

To recapitulate the critical insights of Bakhtin and Clifford, the texts of Cupid and Psyche and the Taketori Monogatari are reaccenuated in the ideological context of the twentieth century. The psychoanalytic literary critical tradition is a "positioned utterance" (Clifford 1986, 12). It is situated in a particular ideological context at a particular point in time. The text is viewed as a cultural product whose relations of production are enmeshed in politics of representation, orientalism, imperialism, sexism, racism, and capitalism.

Conclusion

My analysis of textual production as ideology and relationships of power has followed a single, unifying trajectory. In comparing two texts from different historical and ideological contexts, I have demonstrated how such texts can be viewed as sites of conflicting ideologies and histories. In uncovering shamanistic substrata and the figure of the Queen Mother of the West in the Taketori Monogatari, and the socio-historical and religious background of the creation of Cupid and Psyche, I have demonstrated that texts can be analyzed as sites of conflict between religion, state ideology, personal bias, nativism and gender-oriented politics.

I have focused on the writings of modern, twentieth-century writers whose comments are pertinent to these texts, in order to show how such texts are re-circulated and re-evaluated in the light of twentieth-century contexts and ideologies. In uncovering the biases that inform the critical commentaries of Kawai and Neumann, Okada and Marra, I have relied on the works of Bakhtin, Clifford, Foucault, Bhabha, Miyoshi and Sakai to give theoretical cohesion to my critical stance that knowledge is perspective, and that history is the study of relationships of power. Universally accepted terms such as "Literature", "Japan" and "The West" are discourses of power and knowledge. Who manipulates such discourse, how and why, are questions that form the basis of the study of any form of ideological production.

My own particular research into the pre-texts of the Taketori Monogatari and into shamanism are informed by ideologies of resistance -- they are ideologies of a post-colonial, poststructuralist, feminist worldview which struggle with the legacy of an ongoing colonial, patriarchal, cultural heritage in Western academic discourse. By describing the resistance of a

shamanistic tradition, which privileged female cultic power, against the imposition of patriarchal political power, I situate my reading as feminist. My uncovering of Apuleius' class interests reveals a liberal, bourgeois, democratic bias flavored by post-World War II egalitarianism. Oppositions to state ideology in Japan and in the Roman Empire are based on ideologies of individualism and personal freedom from state control. My focus on constructions of "Japan," "literature," and "The West" is informed by a postcolonial, anti-capitalist worldview which privileges oppositional readings and critiques of representation, while acknowledging its own contradictory situation in attempting to provide final, hegemonic readings. My biases and ideological standpoints are given cohesion by Bakhtin and Clifford. Their theories can be situated specifically in the twentieth century.

Bakhtin's theories of reaccentuation and social heteroglossia were formulated in Russia in the early part of the twentieth century. It was a time of revolutionary change which privileged a particular reading of history as monologic and supportive of a new, repressive state apparatus. Bakhtin's uncovering of dialogical relations in texts and socio-ideological consciousness was not be welcomed by a state bureaucracy which sought to paper over dissent or any questioning of authority. As a result, Bakhtin's work was not fully known either within or outside of Russia until the 1960's.¹⁰³ It is symptomatic of the vast changes in global political realignments and the restructuring of the Soviet Union, that Bakhtin's work is newly published and much-quoted in Western academia. The fact that the University of Texas has the complete copyright ownership of Bakhtin's oeuvre perhaps illustrates this restructuring process best. The work of Bakhtin, suppressed in Russia in the early 1930's and 40's because of its questioning of fundamental precepts

¹⁰³ introduction, The Dialogic Imagination, xxv

of state authority, is re-discovered and revived to provide theoretical grounding, à la "glasnost", in a later age of postcoloniality, poststructuralism, and feminist theory in Western academic discourse.

My use of Bakhtin, then, is firmly situated in the ideological context of the later part of the twentieth century. I have searched for resistance and struggle in texts at a time when the metanarratives of "final readings" are called into question by the oppositional theories of postcoloniality, poststructuralism and feminism. Clifford's acknowledgment that traditional ethnography is anchored in relations of power and his proposal of a new ethnography based on discourse specification is fully consonant with the postcolonial, poststructural and feminist ideological resistances to hegemonic theories and metanarratives.

My own readings of the Taketori Monogatari and Cupid and Psyche must be viewed as positioned utterances or reaccentuation, à la Clifford and Bakhtin. They are firmly situated in a specific ideological context which is constrained by time and place, as are all ideological contexts.

While I have concentrated on twentieth century reaccentuations of the Taketori Monogatari and Cupid and Psyche, Bakhtinian theory allows further, more detailed research of these texts in history. Reaccentuated socio-ideological consciousness and heteroglossia in the history of the reception of these texts will highlight ideologies and ideological conflicts in Japanese and European history. Continued research into the reception history of these texts can uncover past reaccentuations, while creating future reaccentuations. Each new reaccentuation will have to be analyzed in the context of changed ideologies and socio-ideological heteroglossia. It is a mirroring process whereby each reading of the text creates a reaccentuation which is then analyzed as such. It is a never-ending process.

As Clifford writes, "No one reads from a neutral or final position"

(Clifford 1986, 18)

Bibliography

Akima, Toshio. "The Songs of the Dead: Poetry, Drama, and Ancient Death Rituals of Japan." Journal of Asian Studies 61 (1982):485-509.

-----, "The Origins of the Grand Shrine of Ise and the Cult of the Sun Goddess Amaterasu Omikami." Japan Review 4 (1993): 141-198.

Amino, Yoshihiko. "Deconstructing Japan." Trans. Gavan McCormack. East Asian History 3(1992):121-142.

Asada Akira. "Infantile Capitalism and Japan's Postmodernism: A Fairy Tale." Postmodernism and Japan. Eds. Masao Miyoshi and H.D. Harootunian. Durham: Duke University Press, 1989. 273-278.

Bachnik, Jane and Charles Quinn, Jr. eds. Situated Meaning: Inside and Outside in Japanese Self, Society, and Language. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1994.

Barnes, Gina L. Protohistoric Yamato: Archaeology of the First Japanese State. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Center for Japanese Studies, University of Michigan, 1988.

Bassnett, Susan. Comparative Literature: A Critical Introduction. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers, 1993.

Bernal, Martin. "Black Athena Denied: The Tyranny of Germany Over Greece and the Rejection of the Afroasiatic Roots of Europe: 1780-1980." Comparative Criticism: An Annual Journal. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press (1986): 3-69.

Bhabha, Homi. "Representation and the Colonial Text: A Critical Exploration of Some Forms of Mimeticism." Theory of Reading. Ed. Frank Gloversmith. Brighton: Harvester, 1984. 93-122.

Brennan, Teresa. "An Impasse in Psychoanalysis and Feminism." A Reader in Feminist Knowledge. Ed. Sneja Gunew. London: Routledge, 1991. 114-138.

Brown, Delmer, Ed. Ancient Japan. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993. Vol. 1 of The Cambridge History of Japan. 5 vols.

Cahill, Suzanne. Transcendence and Divine Passion: The Queen Mother of the West in Medieval China. Palo Alto: Stanford University Press, 1993.

------. "Reflections of a Metal Mother: Tu Kuang-ting's Biography of Hsi Wang Mu." Journal of Chinese Religions (1985-86): 27-142.

Chodorow, Nancy. "Family Structure and Feminine Personality." Woman, Culture and Society: A Theoretical Overview. Eds. Michelle Zimbalist Rosaldo and Louise Lamphere. Palo Alto: Stanford University Press, 1974. 44-66.

Clarke, J.J.. Jung and Eastern Thought: A Dialogue With the Orient. New York: Routledge, 1994.

Clifford, James. Writing Culture: The Poetics and Politics of Ethnography. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1986.

------. "Notes on Travel and Theory." Inscriptions 5(1989): 177-188.

Dilworth, David A. Postscript. Last Writings: Nothingness and the Religious Worldview. By Nishida Kitaro. Trans. David A. Dilworth. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 1987. 127-149.

Eagleton, Terry. Literary Theory: An Introduction. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1983.

Ebersole, Gary. Ritual Poetry and the Politics of Death in Early Japan. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1989.

Ebrey, Patricia Buckley, ed. Chinese Civilization and Society: A Sourcebook. New York: The Free Press, 1981.

Eliade, Mircea. Shamanism: Archaic Techniques of Ecstasy Trans. Willard R. Trask. New York: Bollingen Foundation, 1964.

Ellwood, Robert S. "The Saigu: Princess and Priestess." History of Religions 7 (1967): 35-60.

-----, The Feast of Kingship: Accession Ceremonies in Ancient Japan. Tokyo: Sophia University, Tokyo, 1973.

-----, "Patriarchal Revolution in Ancient Japan: Episodes from the Nihonshoki Sujin Chronicle." Journal of Feminist Studies in Religion 2 (1986):23-37.

-----, "The Sujin Religious Revolution." Japanese Journal of Religious Studies 17 (1990):199-217.

El Saffar, Ruth Anthony. Rapture Encaged: The Suppression of the Feminine in Western Culture. London: Routledge, 1994.

Field, Norma. The Splendor of Longing in the Tale of Genji. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1987.

Gordon, Richard. "Aelian's Peony: The Location of Magic in Graeco-Roman Tradition." Comparative Criticism: An Annual Journal. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1987.

Harootunian, H.D. Things Seen and Unseen: Discourse and Ideology in Tokugawa Nativism. London: University of Chicago Press, 1988.

Holquist, Michael, ed. The Dialogic Imagination: Four Essays by M. M. Bakhtin. Trans. Caryl Emerson and Michael Holquist. Austin: University of Texas Press, 1981.

Hori, Ichiro. Folk Religion in Japan: Continuity and Change. London: University of Chicago Press, 1968.

------. "Shamanism in Japan." Japanese Journal of Religious Studies 2 (1975):231-287.

Hu, Xiu Min. "Princesses Who Yearn for the Moon: Murasaki no Ue, Oigimi and Ukifune as Reflections of Kaguyahime." Paper delivered at the Western Conference of the Association for Asian Studies, Claremont, California. 1994 (Unpub)

Hudson, Mark J. "Rice, Bronze, and Chieftains: An Archaeology of Yayoi Ritual." Japanese Journal of Religious Studies 19 (1992):139-189.

Hudson, Mark J. and S. Kaner. eds. "Introduction: Towards an Archaeology of Japanese Ritual and Religion." Japanese Journal of Religious Studies 19 (1992):113-138.

Hurvitz, Leon, trans. The Scripture of the Lotus Blossom of The Fine Dharma. New York: Columbia University Press, 1976.

Ishino Hironubo. "Rites and Rituals of the Kofun Period." Japanese Journal of Religious Studies 19 (1992): 191-216.

Ivy, Marilyn. Discourses of the Vanishing: Modernism, Phantasm, Japan. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1995.

Jung, Carl. Four Archetypes: Mother/Rebirth/Spirit/Trickster. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1957.

Kaji, Nobuyuki. Chugoku Shiso Kara Mita Nihon Shisoshi Kenkyu. Tokyo: Yoshikawa Kobunkan, 1985.

Kamstra, J.H. Encounter or Syncretism: The Initial Growth of Japanese Buddhism. Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1967.

Katagiri, Yoichi et al, eds. Taketori Monogatari/Ise monogatari/Yamato Monogatari/Heichu Monogatari. Tokyo: Shogakukan, 1986. Vol 8 of Nihon Kōten Bungaku Zenshu. 51. vols.

Kawai, Hayao. "The Japanese Mind as Reflected in their Mythology." Psychologia 28 (1985):71-76.

----- . The Japanese Psyche: Major Motifs in the Fairy Tales of Japan. Trans. Kawai Hayao and Sachiko Reece. Dallas: Spring Publications Inc. 1988.

Keene, Donald. trans. "The Tale of the Bamboo Cutter." Monumenta Nipponica 11:4(1956): 1-27.

Kitagawa, Joseph M. "Prehistoric Background of Japanese Religion." History of Religions 1 (1963): 292-328.

Kohn, Livia. Early Chinese Mysticism: Philosophy and Soteriology in the Taoist Tradition. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1992.

Konishi, Jin'ichi. The Archaic and Ancient Ages. Trans. Aileen Gatten and Nicholas Teele. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1984. vol.1 of A History of Japanese Literature. 3 vols.

Krabbe, Judith K. The Metamorphoses of Apuleius. American University Series: Classical Languages and Literatures xvii. New York: Peter Lang Publishing Inc., 1989.

Kuroda, Toshio. "Shinto in the History of Japanese Religion." Japanese Journal of Religious Studies 7 (1981):1-21.

Lammers, Wayne P., trans. The Tale of Matsura: Fujiwara Teika's Experiment in Fiction. Ann Arbor: Center for Japanese Studies, University of Michigan, 1992.

Liebeschuetz, J.H.W.G. Continuity and Change in Roman Religion. Oxford: The Clarendon Press, 1979.

Loewe, Michael. Ways to Paradise: The Chinese Quest for Immortality. London: George Allen and Unwin, 1979.

Marra, Michele. The Aesthetics of Discontent: Politics and Reclusion in Medieval Japanese Literature. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 1991.

McMullin, Neil. "Historical and Historiographical Issues in the Study of Pre-Modern Japanese Religions." Japanese Journal of Religious Studies 16(1989): 3-40.

Miller, Alan. "The Swan-Maiden Revisited: Religious Significance of Divine-Wife Folktales with Special Reference to Japan." Asian Folklore Studies 45(1987): 55-86.

Miner, Earl, Hiroko Odagiri and Robert E. Morrell. The Princeton Companion to Classical Japanese Literature. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1985.

Mitani, Eiichi. "Kekkon Kyohi dan no Hoho." Genji Monogatari Koza. vol.1, Eds. Yamagishi Zokuhei and Oka Ichirō. Tokyo: Yuseido, 1979. 188-198.

Miyoshi, Masao. "The Invention of English Literature." Japan in the World. Eds. Masao Miyoshi and H.D. Harootunian. Durham: Duke University Press, 1993. 271-287.

Mostow, Joshua. "Animism, Orality and Japanese Literature," ([Vancouver]: Dept. of Asian Studies, UBC], 1996)

Nagamine, Mitsukazu. "Clay Figurines and Jomon Society." Windows on the Japanese Past: Studies in Japanese Archaeology and Prehistory. Ann Arbor: Centre for Japanese Studies, University of Michigan, 1986.

Neumann, Erich. Amor and Psyche: The Psychic Development of the Feminine. Trans. Ralph Manheim. New York: Harper and Row, 1956.

Nishitani, Keiji. Nishida Kitaro. Trans. Yamamoto Seisaku and James W. Heisig. Nanzan Studies in Religion and Culture. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1991.

Okada, Richard. Figures of Resistance: Language, Poetry and Narrating in the Tale of Genji and Other Mid-Heian Texts. London: Duke University Press, 1991.

Okada, Seishi. "Kyutei miko no jitai." Nihon Joseishi: Genshi, Kodai. Ed. Emura Minoru. Vol. 1. Tokyo: Tokyo Daigaku Shuppankai, 1982.

Ortolani, Benito. The Japanese Theatre: From Shamanistic Ritual to Contemporary Pluralism. Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1990.

Pearson, Richard. Image and Life: 50,000 Years of Japanese Prehistory. Museum Note No. 5. Vancouver: Museum of Anthropology, UBC, 1978.

Piggot, Joan. "Sacral Kingship and Confederacy in Early Izumo." Monumenta Nipponica 44:1(1989):45-74.

Rabinow, Paul. ed. The Foucault Reader. New York: Pantheon Books, 1984.

Reill, Peter Hanns. "Science and the Construction of the Cultural Sciences in Late Enlightenment Germany: The Case of Wilhelm von Humboldt." History and Theory: Studies in the Philosophy of History 33 (1994):345- 366.

Said, Edward. Orientalism. New York: Vintage Books, 1979.

Sakai, Naoki. "Modernity and Its Critique: The Problem of Universalism and Particularism." Postmodernism and Japan. Eds. Miyoshi Masao and H.D. Harootunian. Durham: Duke University Press, 1989. 93-122.

Sakamoto, Taro. The Six National Histories of Japan. Trans. John S. Brownlee. Vancouver: UBC Press, 1991.

Sasaki, Kokan. "Priest, Shaman, King." Japanese Journal of Religious Studies 17(1990):105-128.

Schipper, K.M., trans. L'empereur Wou des Han dans la légende Taoïste: Han Wou-ti nei-tchouan. Paris: Ecole française d'extrême-Orient, 1965.

Schlam, Carl. The Metamorphoses of Apuleius: On Making an Ass of Oneself. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1992.

Seidensticker, Edward G., trans. The Tale of Genji. New York: Knopf, 1976.

Shirane, Haruo. Rev. of Figures of Resistance: Language, Poetry and Narrating in the Tale of Genji and Other mid-Heian Texts, by

Richard Okada. Journal of Japanese Studies 20:1(1994) 221-228.

Smyers, Karen A. "Women and Shinto: The Relation Between Purity and Pollution." Japanese Religions 12 (1983):7-18.

Tsunoda, Ryusaku, trans. Japan in the Chinese Dynastic Histories: Later Han Through Ming Dynasties. Ed. L. Carrington Goodrich. South Pasadena: P.D. and Ione Perkins, 1951.

-----, et al. Sources of Japanese Tradition. New York: Columbia University Press, 1958. Vol.1 of Introduction to Oriental Civilizations.

2 vols.

Tsurumi, Paddy. "Male Present Versus the Female Past: Historians and Japan's Ancient Female Emperors." Bulletin of Concerned Asian Scholars 14 (1982): 71-75.

Twitchett, Denis and Michael Loewe, eds. The Cambridge History of China. Vol.1. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995.

Wakita Haruko. "Chusei ni okeru Seibetsu yakuwari buntan to Joseikan." Nihon Joseishi: Chusei. vol. 2. Eds. Wakita Haruko et al. Tokyo: Tokyo Daigaku Shuppankai, 1982.

Walsh, P.G. The Roman Novel: The Satyricon of Petronius and the Metamorphoses of Apuleius. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1970.

-----, trans. The Golden Ass. Oxford: The Clarendon Press, 1994.

Wehr, Demaris S. Jung and Feminism: Liberating Archetypes. Boston: Beacon Press, 1987.

Wright, James R.G. "Folktale and Literary Technique in Cupid and Psyche." The Classical Quarterly 21 (1979): 273-284.

Yamagata, Mariko. "The Shakado Figurines and Middle Jomon Ritual in the Kofun Basin." Japanese Journal of Religious Studies 19 (1992):129-138.

Yoshino, Kosaku. Cultural Nationalism in Contemporary Japan: A Sociological Inquiry. London: Routledge, 1992.

Yotsugi, Genryo. Ed. Nihon Koku Genzaisho Mokuroku: Shusei to Kenkyu. Tokyo: Kyuko Shoin, 1984.