CANADIAN FORCES FAMILIES
SOCIAL IMPACTS OF ACCOMMODATION POLICY

by

DAVID B. BUTTON

BEng (Civil), The Royal Military College of Canada, 1978

A THESIS SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF
THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF
MASTER OF SCIENCE
in
THE FACULTY OF GRADUATE STUDIES
(School of Community and Regional Planning)

We accept this thesis as conforming
to the required standard

THE UNIVERSITY OF BRITISH COLUMBIA
April 1988
© David B. Button, 1988
In presenting this thesis in partial fulfilment of the requirements for an advanced degree at the University of British Columbia, I agree that the Library shall make it freely available for reference and study. I further agree that permission for extensive copying of this thesis for scholarly purposes may be granted by the head of my department or by his or her representatives. It is understood that copying or publication of this thesis for financial gain shall not be allowed without my written permission.

Department of **GRADUATE STUDIES** *(School of Community and Regional Planning)*

The University of British Columbia
1956 Main Mall
Vancouver, Canada
V6T 1Y3

Date **25 April 1988**
ABSTRACT

Since World War II the Canadian military community has evolved to meet the needs of a permanent military force and has changed from the preserve of the single male to include women and families. Thus the Department of National Defence (DND) has become concerned with the welfare of military families as an integral part of military preparedness.

A variety of accommodation policies were formulated and programs established to satisfy the needs of these families who worked and lived in such a unique environment. These policies and programs have emphasised housing and related infrastructure, and included both physical and social services. They have, in part, enabled DND to relieve many family related problems despite the disruptive lifestyle.

However, as a result of evolutionary changes in the Canadian Forces, the lifestyle of Canadians and the general economic situation, concern has arisen that current DND policies relating to housing and service provision may no longer be appropriate or effective.

This thesis looks at the lifestyle and unique difficulties of military families in order to evaluate the social impacts on the families resulting from accommodation policy. Although the general question of whether DND should even be in the business of creating and maintaining its own communities is complex and requires the consideration of many factors, this thesis limits itself to the social impacts of accommodation policies.
Since it is generally perceived that social concerns have received limited consideration in the past, this thesis develops a framework to consider and include such concerns. This is done through: secondary research of analogous civilian communities and other military communities; primary data from recent DND family studies; informal interviews with families and decision-makers in the military community; and, the personal experience of the author as a member of the military community.

There are four main findings. First, a framework based on Lichfield's Planning Balance Sheet methodology is a suitable and appropriate tool for assisting decision-makers in making informed choices. Second, the creation of a Non-Public Housing Society responding to DND but operated at arms-length, is seen as a viable housing policy alternative which deserves further study. Third, the social impacts on military families resulting from the municipalization of physical services are not significant. And fourth, social services when provided internally appear more successful.

The unique lifestyle of military families is linked to operational effectiveness and military preparedness through the work/family environment. The importance of social planning on this interface is emphasized to encourage decision-makers to explicitly incorporate social planning into the decision-making process. The Planning Balance Sheet methodology is suggested as an appropriate one for this purpose.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT ................................................. ii
LIST OF TABLES ............................................. vii
LIST OF FIGURES ........................................... viii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS .......................................... ix

1. INTRODUCTION ........................................ 1
   1.1 STATEMENT OF PURPOSE
   1.2 PROBLEM STATEMENT
   1.3 SCOPE
   1.4 DEFINITIONS
   1.5 METHODOLOGY
   1.6 ORGANIZATION OF THE THESIS

2. UNDERSTANDING THE MILITARY COMMUNITY ............ 11
   2.1 HISTORICAL EVOLUTION ............................. 13
      2.1.1 European Society
      2.1.2 Canadian Society
      2.1.3 Summary
   2.2 PROFILE OF THE MILITARY COMMUNITY ............ 24
      2.2.1 Demographics
      2.2.2 Geographic Location
      2.2.3 Accommodation
      2.2.4 The DND School System
      2.2.5 Summary
   2.3 MILITARY STYLE OF LIFE .......................... 35
      2.3.1 The Military Profession
      2.3.2 Work and Residence
      2.3.3 Role of the Family
      2.3.4 Military Mobility
      2.3.5 Etiquette and Ceremony
      2.3.6 Summary
   2.4 UNIQUE SOCIAL DIFFICULTIES OF THE MILITARY FAMILY.. 44
      2.4.1 Perceived Military Attitude
      2.4.2 Role of the Wife
      2.4.3 Mobility
      2.4.4 Family Separation
      2.4.5 Employment of Wives and Children
      2.4.6 Fishbowl Effect of a Closed Community
      2.4.7 Summary
   2.5 COMMUNITY STRUCTURES ............................. 60
      2.5.1 The Community Council
      2.5.2 The Recreation Council
      2.5.3 The Administration of Married Quarters
      2.5.4 Summary
   2.6 SOCIAL AND ECONOMIC TRENDS ....................... 69
      2.6.1 Women in the Workforce
      2.6.2 Occupationalism of Military Personnel
      2.6.3 Social Acceptability of Relocation
      2.6.4 Human Rights
      2.6.5 Housing
      2.6.6 Summary
   2.7 SUMMARY ............................................. 77
# LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2-1</td>
<td>Married Quarter Portfolio Grouped by Province</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2-2</td>
<td>Married Quarter Inventory Not Owned by DND</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2-3</td>
<td>Age of Housing Stock at Selected Bases as a Percentage of Total Base Stock 1982</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2-4</td>
<td>U.S.A. Military Political Identification - Conservative/Liberal</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2-5</td>
<td>Mean Number of Family Separations by Element (1984)</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2-6</td>
<td>Mean Number of Months Separated During the Year</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-1</td>
<td>Potential Duplication of Payment for Services</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3-2</td>
<td>Comparison of DND and Canadian Fire Losses</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-1</td>
<td>Comparison of Social Impacts Chosen Versus Others in the Literature</td>
<td>148</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-2</td>
<td>Planning Balance Sheet of Housing Options</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-3</td>
<td>Planning Balance Sheet of Physical Services</td>
<td>158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4-4</td>
<td>Planning Balance Sheet of Social Services</td>
<td>159</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## LIST OF FIGURES

| Figure 2-1 | Composition of Canadian Forces Families | 26 |
| Figure 2-2 | Base Organization Chart | 61 |
| Figure 3-1 | Three Dimensional Matrix of Factors Leading to Policy Options | 82 |
| Figure 3-2 | Non-Public Housing Society Organization Chart | 100 |
| Figure 4-1 | Finsterbusch's Impact Relevance Tree for Social Impact Analysis | 146 |
| Figure 5-1 | The Accommodation Question Relevance Tree | 194 |
| Figure 5-2 | Social Impacts as Part of The Decision-Making Process | 197 |
| Figure 6-1 | Accommodation Policy Areas of Particular Concern to Military Families | 201 |
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I wish to express my sincere thanks to Dr. Setty Pendakur for his effort as an advisor on this thesis, as well as for his continued support and assistance throughout the program. I am also extremely grateful for the guidance and assistance of Professor Peter Boothroyd who was always able to comprehend what I was trying to express and then provide valuable advice and direction.

I would also like to thank the Department of National Defence for providing the opportunity to undertake this program.

Most importantly, I would like to thank my wife, Gene, for her encouragement, support, and understanding.
1.0 INTRODUCTION

1.1 STATEMENT OF PURPOSE

The purpose of this thesis is to illustrate the need for social planning within the military community and to develop a framework in which to do so.

Decisions to create and maintain military communities result from the extensive consideration of many factors which can generally be categorized as political, economic, geographic, operational, or social. One of the considerations which is weaved throughout these categories is the effectiveness and professional commitment of service members. This commitment is affected by the degree to which the member feels he is meeting his family obligations. In turn, the satisfaction of the family is assisted through the creation of a favourable community environment. This thesis deals with the heart of such an environment, its accommodation and service provision policies.

1.2 PROBLEM STATEMENT

The Department of National Defence has had a unique role in the creation and maintenance of numerous communities in Canada and abroad. Such communities have evolved because of the unique requirements, policies, and often location of military deployment. Maintenance of these communities has been accepted as part of the "cost of doing business"; and has been seen as necessary and acceptable in the maintenance of a trained, ready, and capable military presence.
Military philosophy as to how the community should be established and relate to the "soldier's" duties, has been carefully and deliberately instilled into the military lifestyle. A stable community life has been considered necessary to ensure that the "soldier" carries on with his duties, confident that his family is safe and well cared for. As a result, military communities have been established as a significant part of the infrastructure of most military institutions. Through these communities, the military administrators can ensure that the relative family impacts of military life are controlled to provide military members the security necessary to concentrate on their primary duties.

As a result of evolutionary changes in the Canadian Forces, the lifestyle of Canadians and the general economic situation, concern has arisen that National Defence policies relating to housing and community development may no longer be appropriate or effective.

The general question of whether the Department of National Defence should be in the business of providing housing and services is extremely complex and requires extensive consideration of operational, geographic, political, economic, and social factors.

Operational readiness considerations in the 1950's (when most of the married-quarters were built) led to operational and support personnel being required to live near the base. Effective response to various contingencies was seen as being dependent upon the proximity and quantity of domestic accommodation. With
technological improvements in transportation and communication over the last three decades the criterion of operational readiness is now easily met with a few on-site duty personnel, and established "fan-out" alert systems to recall all military personnel regardless of their location.

The geographic locations of the various military installations were dictated by technological, strategic and operational defence requirements of the period. As a result many units were positioned in isolated locations requiring that all municipal services be provided by the Department of National Defence. In the 1950's, when many of the bases and stations were first built they were either isolated or semi-urban. Most have since seen significant growth and many have been engulfed by urban centers. This has caused a different problem: fluctuating availability and higher cost of housing. This directly impacts the nomadic like life style of military families.

Economic considerations have been the easiest to quantify and evaluate. As a result, assessment of military accommodation options has predominantly focussed on their financial consequences. The need to review accommodation policy has been excentuated by the results of three DND studies undertaken since 1979 which have all shown that the costs to operate married quarters on behalf of military families is significant. However, the social impacts associated with policy review are not easily quantified and are often not considered in the cost-benefit type analyses. As a result, social factors have received relatively little consideration in the decision-making process involving the operation and administration of married quarter communities.
Consideration of social factors is often separated between community (family) and work environments. As such, work and family are frequently viewed as independent domains. Typically, workers have been expected to perform their jobs as if they did not have family obligations and, similarly, families were supposed to provide a haven for the worker. The family was corporately viewed as a separate institution that the "provider", generally the male, could leave behind physically and mentally when he left for work in the morning. In the evening the family nurtured and rejuvenated the worker so that he could arise refreshed for work the following day. In this view of the world the worker should experience no or few family stresses that affect his performance on the job, and job stresses should have little effect on family life.

The distinction between the stresses resulting from work or family have become blurred as a result of demographic changes in the size and composition of the family along with the increased participation of women in the labour force and changes in social attitudes towards sex roles. These changes suggest that a larger portion of the work force is likely to experience conflicts between work and family responsibilities. This in turn may reduce the operational effectiveness and professional commitment of service members as they begin to increase personal priorities to family life and decrease priorities to work. Therefore, it is in the best interests of the Department of National Defence to consider social impacts when developing accommodation policies, as this policy area provides one of the best opportunities to
control the unique social difficulties associated with employment in the Canadian Forces.

1.3 SCOPE

This thesis is concerned only with the unique social impacts associated with Canadian Forces housing and service provision policies. The framework developed in this thesis for assessing these social impacts must then be integrated with evaluations of operational, geographic, political and economic issues when the Department establishes policies regarding accommodation and the military community.

The thesis is also only concerned with accommodation and services provided to the military family. The single military member although a significant part of the military establishment (41%), is not the focus of this thesis.

In addition, the scope is also limited to the evaluation of predominantly urban and semi-urban bases and stations, where options for accommodation programs exist because services and accommodation are available in adjacent civilian communities.

1.4 DEFINITIONS

Military members. Refers to Canadian Forces military personnel. All references and tables refer to the Canadian Armed Forces and Department of National Defence unless otherwise indicated.
Dependents. Refers to individuals in the military member's family living with or supported by him/her. The term refers to all members regardless of whether one of the other family members may in fact receive a wage in excess of that received by the military member.

Living Accommodation. Used as a general term for all types of living accommodation used by CF members (and their families), whether Crown-owned, Crown-leased, privately-owned, or privately-rented.

Public accommodation for individuals, or "Single Quarters" (SQ's). Refers to DND accommodation such as barracks, rooms, or suites for use by CF members.

Private Accommodation for individuals. Refers to private market accommodation for individual occupancy such as apartment units, houses and rooms.

Public family housing or Married Quarters (MQs). Refers to DND-operated accommodation such as Crown-owned houses and apartments, and houses and apartments leased from private entrepreneurs, other government departments and other governments for use by CF members.

Private family housing. Refers to private market homes and apartments privately-owned or privately-rented.

Non-Public Funds/Organizations. Refers to money and organizations administered and controlled by the Department of National Defence but not funded by the public purse. It should be noted that "Non-Public" refers only to institutions specifically formed and designated as "Non-Public", and not simply anything "not owned" by the public.
Base. Is used generically to include both CF bases (CFB) and CF stations (CFS), unless noted otherwise.

Urban, Semi-urban, and Isolated. Terms used in reference to the three categories of military base specified in military regulations to guide the administration of CF living accommodation. A list of urban and semi-urban bases and stations of interest in this thesis is provided at Table 2-1.

Married Quarter Community. Refers to the community of military families who actually live in Crown-owned MQs, and is viewed both as a spatial-temporal and social system. The married quarter community is a subset of the larger military community.

Military Community. Refers to a more general group of families, in which one parent of each family is a member of the military, without regard to where the family resides. There is no spatial component to the military community.

Municipalization. The act of transferring the responsibility for operation and maintenance of physical services to the local municipality.

Externalization. The act of transferring the responsibility for providing social services to an organization external to the Department of National Defence. The transfer could be to either: another government agency, a different level of government, or private enterprise.
1.5 METHODOLOGY

For the purposes of this thesis, information has been obtained from the Department of National Defence and Canada Mortgage and Housing Corporation, as well as from other published sources. Personal interviews were conducted with key personnel from the Department of National Defence. Experiences of other militaries, and relevant civilian agencies and corporations, such as "company towns", were obtained through library research. This information is supplemented by the author's 32 years as a member of the military community; 18 as a dependent, and 14 as a member of the CF. During this period a total of 16 moves were experienced. The author has lived in both private and public living-accommodation in a variety of urban, semi-urban, and isolated locations, both in Canada and abroad. Fourteen years of CF membership included responsibility for construction and maintenance of married quarter infrastructure, as well as three years as Chairperson of a military community "Recreational Council".
1.6 ORGANIZATION OF THE THESIS

The thesis is organized into four main parts: background, housing policy alternatives, social impacts, and conclusions/recommendations.

Chapter two provides a historic review of the evolution of the military community including a detailed profile of the existing demographic, physical, and organizational structure of the community. The military way of life is explained, and the inherent social difficulties resulting from the unique lifestyle are identified to provide a basis for appropriate accommodation policy formulation. An analysis of social and economic trends in Canadian society illustrates how past accommodation policies must be adjusted to suit the expectations of modern military families.

Chapter three discusses the background leading to the selection of the following policy options for evaluation:

HOUSING OPTIONS
A - Provide Complete Public Housing
B - Establish a Non-Public Housing Society
C - Do Not Provide Housing

PHYSICAL SERVICES OPTIONS
A - Internalized
B - Municipalized

SOCIAL SERVICES OPTIONS
A - Internalized
B - Externalized
The implications and costs associated with each of the housing policy options are discussed. The internalization or externalization of community support services is also discussed with regard to the social impacts on the military family.

Chapter four develops a framework to evaluate the perceived social impact of the policy options. Sixteen potential dissatisfiers to the military family are identified and discussed with respect to the perceived impact of the different options. The table created provides an effective reference tool to quickly identify potential strengths and weaknesses of future policy considerations. Based on the results of the evaluation, policy options are recommended.
2.0 UNDERSTANDING THE MILITARY COMMUNITY

In order to properly understand the complexities affecting the military community it is necessary to understand what the "military community" is, and how it evolved. This chapter provides a detailed description of the elements of the military community, as well as factors affecting the community. This provides a suitable framework so that in later chapters the accommodation and service provision policies impacting the community can be properly addressed.

In a historical review, the formative elements of the Canadian military community are examined first. The evolution of the military perspective is traced from "the soldier", to "the army", to "military society", and finally to "military community". As well, it is noted that Canada had no significant permanent military force prior to the second World War; it was only after the war that the "military community" as we now know it came into existence. These two factors illustrate the limited historic perspective available in dealing with problems related to the military community.

A profile of the "military community" as it currently exists follows. This snapshot of the typical community describes size, location, demographic, and physical factors of the community.

Once the first military communities were established it became important to understand what the military expected from its new families. These expectations are addressed by reviewing the military lifestyle. The concept of the co-located home and
workplace, as well as the expectations of a military member, spouse and children in the military community, are important to understand before the social problems arising from the atmosphere can be adequately addressed.

A discussion of the social difficulties resulting from the unique job requirements of the military follows. Mobility, family separation, employment difficulties of the spouse and children, and the special role of the wife, are issues peculiar to this segment of society.

In order to instill a sense of community, military decision-makers have established rules and regulations to guide the formal operation of the military community. The organization and structure of the resulting institutions affecting the military community are therefore described.

The chapter concludes by discussing some of the general social and economic trends currently being experienced in Canadian society which also impact the military community.
2.1 HISTORICAL EVOLUTION

The concept of "community" in the military is very new; however, customs and traditions have developed over many years which form the backbone of general military society. In order to better understand those which have influenced the modern military community it is important to realize how general military philosophy has evolved. A change in perspective of militarism from "the soldier" to "the army", then to "military society", and finally to "the military community" is a noticeable and important element in the formation of Canada's military community.

Canada's history had very important European influence and as such the rise of military society will be looked at first of all from its European background, and then specific Canadian factors.

2.1.1 European Society

The clergy of the twelfth century fostered the beliefs of a three way division of society: those who prayed, those who fought, and those who worked. (Corvisier 1979, p.7) The Noblemen, separated from the "people" and the clergy, were designated to command the profession of arms. The peasants in turn were obliged to support this order and provide obligatory military service. Whole troops of private soldiers were formed through a feudal system of homage of vassals to their lords. In the western monarchies these remained at the level of personal retinues of loyal attendants or hired followers, but in central Europe they became the formative elements for national armies.
This distinction between the military profession and military obligation was the beginning of a military society somewhat isolated from society in general. The military society was a separate "order" comparable to the clergy as it also was divided into two sub-orders; that of officers, and common soldiers. Up until this point in history civilians and soldiers were practically indistinguishable.

In the sixteenth century the greater number of troops, improvement of weapons and increased expense of maintaining armies made it practical only for rulers with significant resources. Changes in military technique were also evident at this time, requiring greater control over men in the permanent armies (Corvisier 1979, p.196). The distinction between civilians and military became greater as the troops were housed in barracks and in other ways separated from civilian society.

The military society was by nature one of soldiers—adult single males. It included some civilians to provide various levels of support but women and children were generally not encouraged. Military authorities recognized that some women were required to wash and mend clothes, and that marriage for the soldiers was the best means to limit prostitution in the camps. However, they took varying measures in the different armies to avoid having too many married men in order that the armies might not be burdened with responsibility for a great number of non-combatants, and so that discipline might be maintained.

The presence of women and children turned some armies into true societies. Even where married soldiers were less common, the army formed a kind of social unit, in which regiments and
companies corresponded to provinces and villages. The solidarity of these units was a result not only of the discipline, but also of personal relationships between soldiers, or between the soldier and his officer. The relationships were based on loyalty and comradeship.

Second only to prayer, the exercise of arms was accorded the highest respect among all human activities by the societies of the ancien regime. This was not only the result of weapons being the instruments of power for rulers such as the feudal overlords; it was also the expression of a moral setting in which violence and respect for force characterized relationships among individuals. This evolution of social attitudes brought about a change in the status and role of arms in society. (Corvisier 1979, p.3)

The shift from the essentially "automaton armies" of the sixteenth century with very low portions of permanent soldiers to the "soldier armies" of the eighteenth century with high portions of permanent soldiers was a long and complex evolution. This shift also brought with it a change from a "warrior" mentality to an "army" mentality. The use of firearms impersonalized the battlefield and removed the romanticism of the medieval times. Discipline and structure became much more important in the modern army.

In the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, eastern and central European societies tended to become more "military" as they followed the lead of government systems, whereas in western Europe military social groups were found within, but distinct
from society as a whole. It took the national wars set off by the French Revolution to re-establish tighter, though temporary, links between armies and societies. In the end, the widespread, nearly omnipresent militarization that we see in the Europe of 1914 came about with the adoption of the idea of universal military service by societies that were no longer military in nature. (Corvisier, 1979 pp.171-173)

2.1.2 Canadian Society

'Canadians regard themselves as "an unmilitary people", and they assume that Canada was built by the arts of peace rather than by war. However, many know that their country was born in war (the American War of Independence), and that Canadian soldiers performed great feats of military prowess in the War of 1812 and even more in the First and Second World Wars; and a few realise that these wars also had a considerable effect on the development of a distinct Canadian nation. Yet this admission does not go far enough. It neglects other ways in which military factors have been a formative influence on the making of Canada. For, although military tradition has not been the predominant force in Canadian history, it was often operative when Canada was at peace as well as when war threatened or occurred. Canadian Society and the Canadian economy have been noticeably, perhaps even profoundly, affected by military interests and institutions which Canadians want to forget or reject.' (Preston 1972, p.49)

New France. The first French settlers were not soldiers and they had no wish to use the sword instead of the plough. The society of French Canada was however very hierarchial in structure, being separated into distinct upper and lower layers. The broad lower order was formed by the colonists, or habitants, who were generally farmers. Government officials, the large landholders (siegneurs), and the principal clergy formed the upper level. The seigneurial system represented a version of
feudalism imported into America. Through the workings of feudalism, the lord owed duties of government and military leadership to their tenants, and in turn they owed obedience and armed support to him. In a wilderness environment such as North America this system was felt to be essential to both develop the land and provide defence. However, with the wilds close at hand, promising freedom and fortune in the fur trade, as well as, the importance of maintaining a large number of farmers, heavy obligations of the feudal system were not feasible (Careless 1970, p.59-63). As a result, responsibilities were minimal, and the habitants did not owe military service to their seigneurs (Preston 1972, p.50). However, as there was always the threat of Iroquois attack individual settlements enforced regulations that every able-bodied male in the colony was potentially a soldier and required by law to possess weapons, drill and do guard duty. (Goodspeed 1967, p.1)

In 1665 in response to repeated appeals of assistance to King Louis XIV, twenty-four companies of regular infantry were sent to handle the Indian problem. With their task apparently accomplished and the danger to the colony having passed (Stanley 1974, pp.15-19) most of the regular soldiers were returned to France by 1667, not to be replaced until 1755. A soldier-settlement scheme drawn on the experience of the Roman military colonies was attempted to attract many of the soldiers to remain. However, it was not overly successful and as such the organization of a proper militia was ordered. Each parish or seigneurie thus raised and trained at least one militia company. This force was used by the Governor not only for defence but also
for public works connected with defence such as fortification, road and bridge building. This had important economic side-effects in knitting the colony together, especially when the officers of the regular regiments from France who once again garrisoned the colony in 1755 brought large infusions of money to construct fortifications, as well as an aristocratic social tradition.

The military influence continued in New France after the conquest by the British. The British used the existing militia organization to govern the conquered colony. Militia captains were given powers equivalent to justices of the peace. Although there was an influx of English-speaking immigrants, "Canadiens" in general were not able to identify with British Imperial interests, and as a result military interest eventually declined among the body of French-Canadians. (Preston 1972, pp.49-52)

British Influence. The British military system had a much stronger impact on the development of military society in Canada. Actual military colonies were created as a result of the American War of Independence, with the relocation of American Loyalists into British North America being implemented as a military operation. The Loyalists were given rations, tools, and seeds from military stores, as well as land surveyed and distributed by military engineers and army officers. As such, the new garrisons established a very strong economic base for the growth of British North America. At various times the British Army regulars helped to open the country. They cleared the sites of several cities, they built canals such as those on the St. Lawrence and the
Rideau, and they built roads such as the Cariboo Trail in British Columbia. (Preston 1972, pp.56-57).

C.F. Hamilton calculated that from 1841 to 1851 Great Britain "spent more in safeguarding the provinces [of Canada] than the [provincial] legislature did in administering it" (Preston 1972, p.58). These garrison towns became centres of a vigorous social life and their influence spread widely as they attracted people of wealth and leisure from distant places.

The British military influenced society in more than just the garrison style communities established for the Loyalists, it was also an important tie for the "Old Country" associations. Until 1870 the British garrisons helped to foster English ways and English ideas and as such to resist "Americanization" throughout Canada. These garrisons also reinforced a very conservative element in Canadian society (Preston 1972, pp.64-66).

Before the American Civil War brought an increase to the numbers of British troops in Canada, the relative influence of the military in Canadian life had declined steadily as a result of the large growth of the civil population. The withdrawal of the British garrison in 1870 reduced it even further. (Preston 1972, pp.66-67)

Post-Confederation. A Canadian military institution was created slowly. It was modelled largely in the British manner, and British officers were often used to develop and guide programs. The main difference was not in style, as the Canadian military was similar in kind, but had much less financial support than the traditional British garrison. In fact relative to the
British, the Canadian government spent only one-third of the amount the British garrison had provided, a quarter of a century earlier, when the country was much smaller.

The mid 1870's were very tame times in terms of unrest which accompanied by years of financial depression, caused decline in militia strength and the disbandment of some units. For 1876-1877 the defence budget was the lowest it had been since Confederation. (Goodspeed 1967, pp.12-13).

Lessons learned in the Boer War initiated Militia reform between 1900 and 1914. A new Militia Act came into effect on 1 November 1904, and raised the Permanent Force establishment to 2,000. (Goodspeed 1967, pp.22-23) When Halifax and Esquimalt were finally taken over from the British in 1906 and 1907, the establishment of the Permanent Active Militia was doubled to 4,000. After the First World War, establishment was set at 10,000; however, the strength actually remained at 4,000. The Non-Permanent Active Militia's establishment was similarly increased from a pre-war figure of 75,000 to over 120,000; but the number trained in 1928 was only 34,000, which was less than the 50,000 trained just before the war. (Preston 1972, pp.76-78)

The reason for this decline in numbers was that while the Canadian government professed the intention of maintaining a military establishment almost twice as large as that before the war, it budgeted only about two-thirds of the pre-war appropriation to pay for it. The reasons given were the growth of pacifism as a result of the horrors of Canada's first experience in a modern major war, the hope that the League of
Nations would soon make war and armies unnecessary, the government's desire to economize where it was politically advantageous to do so, and the lack of any apparent danger. Not until a second war with Germany became imminent was this policy altered. (Preston 1972, pp.78-79)

Post World War II. The influence of the Second World War caused a vast expansion of the total establishment of all three services. Initial levels of Permanent Force were set at 50,000 and were soon doubled as a result of the Cold War. Relative to other countries this was not large, nevertheless this introduced a significant influence on the Canadian scene. Most Canadians who were unaccustomed to seeing a military uniform in peace time were now in the midst of them as Canadian Army, Navy and Air Force Bases became scattered across the country.

The Canadian regular force had a very strong British flavour, however, the Canadian serviceman developed a distinct national ethos. There was less social division between officers and other ranks, and Canadian officers were not selected from one upper class.

The permanent force establishment in 1950 was 47,000 and had doubled by 1952. The peak in Canada's peace time armed forces was in 1962 at 126,500. (Coulombe 1972, p. 129), while strength in 1986 was 86,036 (Defence 86, 1987). It was in the late 1950's and early 1960's that the military community became an important entity, as the larger permanent force and corresponding increase in military families caused the military to rethink its policies on the military family, as it recognized that it could not compete with the family for a soldier's loyalty (Stanton 1976, p.
At every military, naval or air force base new "married quarters" were constructed having important social and economic effects especially when located adjacent to small communities. A large number of new military installations were constructed in somewhat isolated locations, such as the three radar warning lines (Pine Tree Line, Mid-Canada Line, and Distant Early Warning Line).

A good illustration of the impact the establishment of a base could have on an entire region, is the locating of Camp Gagetown in New Brunswick in 1952. The neighbouring community of Oromocto grew from 600 people in 1952 to 12,170 in 1961. In fact the total wage packet of the base amounted to 2.5% of the total personal income of all of New Brunswick. (Preston 1972, pp. 78-80) There are many other similar examples; however, to realize the economic impact, just watch the political battles when government tries to close down an established base.

Although formation of the military community, and accommodation for its families, became a necessary part of the total military establishment, there were still many rules and regulations which discouraged marriage within the military. In the 1950's the Royal Canadian Air Force did not recognize marriage among its members until they reached the age of twenty-one. As such, a married member under twenty-one (even with children) could not reside in military Married Quarters. Even to this day (although not a formal requirement) it is considered common courtesy to inform your Commanding Officer of your intentions to be married.
2.1.3 **Summary**

This brief historical review indicates the relative youth of the military community. It is seen that there is limited military experience in dealing with families to draw upon in order to assist in the review and analysis of accommodation policy. This is particularly true for Canada which did not have a significant permanent peacetime force, nor any military community, until after World War II. In Europe, before Canada's Confederation, there were some large permanent force armies; however, regulations in most cases precluded families, and in fact wives and children were considered as liabilities.

In Canada until the end of the Second World War, military society consisted of the social interactions of the part-time militia officer and soldier. Even before the creation of a formal militia in Canada, citizens fought for Canada more in the form of self-defence, as they saw themselves as farmers first and soldiers second. Their lifestyle and community evolved exclusively around their civilian encounters, except during the limited periods of militia social or training activity.

The establishment of the many Army, Navy and Air Force bases and the increase in the permanent force in Canada after World War II resulted in the formation of military communities. The communities were designed and organized based on socio-economic and operational constraints of the time, but with little experience of the particular family difficulties resulting from the unique military lifestyle. This thesis reviews these demographic, economic, and social trends within the military community in order to assess the social impacts.
2.2 PROFILE OF THE MILITARY COMMUNITY

Since World War II, when the establishment of a large permanent Armed Force brought on the creation of a large scale military community, the profile of the Canadian Military has changed significantly. No longer is it the preserve of the single male, and no longer is its influence on Canadian society an insignificant factor. "The Department of National Defence is the largest real property holder and landlord in the Federal Government, and perhaps in Canada." (Evaluation Report 20, 1979, p. 6) A snapshot of the current demographics, geographic location, accommodation, and dependants schooling in the Department of National Defence, provides the detail necessary to put the size of the community into perspective.

2.2.1 Demographics

In 1986 the Canadian Forces consisted of 86,036 Regular Force members, 24,311 Primary Reserve members and 26,787 Supplementary Reserve members. In addition to these, the Department of National Defence employed 31,681 civilians. There were also 9500 non-public fund employees working in base messes and institutes associated with the military community. (Defence 86 1987, p. 85) Of primary concern to the military community, and specifically this thesis is the 86,036 Regular Force (fulltime) members. Of even more significant concern is those of the Regular Force who are married, or have families participating in the military community.
The military community is far from being the preserve of the single service member (Goldman 1976, p. 119), and even further from being the exclusive domain of the young single male. Figure 2-1 identifies the composition of Canadian Forces Families as of March 1984. (Popoff et al. 1986, pp. 13-17) As indicated, approximately 60% of service members either have been, or are presently married. Seven percent of the marriages are between military members (intraservice), which is distinctive as both husband and wife are Forces members and are, therefore, bound by its administrative and legal obligations.

In addition to the intraservice families where both parents are fully employed within the military, another 27% of married service members had civilian spouses who were employed full-time. As such, a total of 34% of married military members have spouses who are employed full-time outside of the home. Even this is a conservative estimate of what is commonly referred to as two income families, or dual career couples, since it does not take into account the 13% of civilian spouses who were unemployed and actively looking for work, nor the 17% of civilian spouses who were employed part-time and were included in the figure for homemakers. (Popoff et al. 1986, pp. 14-16) Therefore, up to 65% of military families could be considered as dual career couples with as few as 35% of the spouses being considered "traditional homemakers".
FIGURE 2-1
COMPOSITION OF CANADIAN FORCES FAMILIES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MARITAL STATUS</th>
<th>MAJOR ACTIVITY</th>
<th>FAMILY LIFE CYCLE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Canadian Forces 83,205</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Never Married 41.1%</td>
<td>Intraservice 7%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others 58.9%</td>
<td>Married (46,026) 93.9%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Separated/Divorced with Children 5.9%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Widowed with Children 0.2%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Employed Civilian Spouse 27%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Preschool 36%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>School 8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Empty Nest 1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Unemployed Spouse 13%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Childless 21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Preschool 20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>School 26%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Teen 25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Empty Nest 8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Homemaker 53%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Childless 12%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Preschool 43%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>School 25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Teen 16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Empty Nest 4%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2.2.2 Geographic Location

The Department of National Defence owns and operates property across the country. It is the largest real property holder in the Federal Government, and perhaps in Canada. It operates and leases over 4.62 million acres (i.e., over 7,200 square miles are under active use and control). The 1978 replacement value of the property was estimated at $7 billion. (Evaluation Report 20 1979, pp. 6-7)

The climate and facilities available at each of the different locations is as diverse as the locations themselves. Military installations vary from the tropical island of Bermuda to north of the magnetic north pole (Alert). Facilities in the different locations can vary from: relatively little, at a small urban site; to practically every community service imaginable, at a large more isolated site. Of concern in this thesis is those locations in which families are a significant portion of the military community, and in which the military has flexibility in how it accommodates its families by allowing some of the burden to be shared with a local civilian community. The next section, which profiles accommodation in the military, delineates those installations of specific interest in this thesis.

2.2.3 Accommodation

In conjunction with being the largest property holder in the Federal Government, and perhaps Canada, the Department is also the largest landlord. DND controls 81% of the total Federal Government holdings of employee living accommodation. (Evaluation Report 20 1979, p. 6) The Department owns 22,321
Married Quarter units augmented by approximately 4,300 that are leased from private entrepreneurs under a number of different programs at various locations (these are identified later). (AWG 1985, p. 2) Housing located: above the 60th parallel, at isolated locations, and at the independent radar stations (most of which are being closed), has been eliminated for the purposes of this thesis as the various accommodation policies to be discussed later are not all feasible options at these locations. The location of the remaining married quarter portfolio is identified in Table 2-1.

In addition to the 22,321 units owned by DND—of which 21,016 are of specific interest in this thesis—there is also an important portion of DND family housing accommodation secured by alternate methods. These are Bulk Lease Housing Units (BLHU), Self Help Housing (SHH), Limited Dividend Housing (LDH), CMHC Leased Accommodation dedicated to DND, and Mobile Home Parks and Units. (ND/CMHC AWG 1983, pp. A4-1/2) An inventory of housing not owned but preserved exclusively for DND use and control is shown in Table 2-2.

Of particular interest in the consideration of the married quarter portfolio owned by DND is its age and state of repair. Generally the portfolio has been well maintained; however, it is extremely outdated in terms of layout, lacks character, and projects a "rundown" and somewhat sterile profile to the community. The units could generally be categorized as "adequate but ugly". In part, this is a result of the age of the housing portfolio as most of the married quarters were built in the
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BASE/STATION</th>
<th>NUMBER OF MQs</th>
<th>BASE/STATION</th>
<th>NUMBER OF MQs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>British Columbia</td>
<td></td>
<td>Quebec</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chilliwack</td>
<td>414</td>
<td>Bagotville</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aldergrove</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>Montreal</td>
<td>257</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vancouver</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>St. Jean</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comox</td>
<td>304</td>
<td>Valcartier</td>
<td>922</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Victoria</td>
<td>739</td>
<td></td>
<td>1435</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1564</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alberta</td>
<td></td>
<td>New Brunswick</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calgary</td>
<td>1010</td>
<td>Chatham</td>
<td>526</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>l^r^wht</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>Gagetown</td>
<td>2200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cold Lake</td>
<td>1252</td>
<td>Moncton</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edmonton</td>
<td>1264</td>
<td></td>
<td>2818</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Penhold</td>
<td>243</td>
<td>Prince Edward Island</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suffield</td>
<td>183</td>
<td>Summerside</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4039</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saskatchewan</td>
<td></td>
<td>Nova Scotia</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moose Jaw</td>
<td>280</td>
<td>Barrington</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dundurn</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>Cornwallis</td>
<td>248</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>308</td>
<td>Debert</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Greenwood</td>
<td>1083</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Halifax</td>
<td>730</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Mill Cove</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Newport Corners</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Shearwater</td>
<td>301</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Shelburne</td>
<td>46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sydney</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2715</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manitoba</td>
<td></td>
<td>Newfoundland</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portage la Prairie</td>
<td>184</td>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>222</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shilo</td>
<td>744</td>
<td>St. John's</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Winnipeg</td>
<td>571</td>
<td></td>
<td>313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1499</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ontario</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Borden</td>
<td>1367</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kingston</td>
<td>812</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>London</td>
<td>137</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North Bay</td>
<td>234</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ottawa</td>
<td>824</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Petawawa</td>
<td>1705</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toronto</td>
<td>292</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trenton</td>
<td>699</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6070</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Grand Total</td>
<td>21,016</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Source: AWG 1985, p. F9-1; ND/CMHC AWG 1983, p. 3-2)
TABLE 2-2

MARRIED QUARTER INVENTORY NOT OWNED BY DND

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Project Name</th>
<th>Number of Units</th>
<th>Method</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Halifax</td>
<td>Wallis Heights</td>
<td>397</td>
<td>BLHU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lakefront</td>
<td>432</td>
<td>BLHU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Maritime Apartments</td>
<td>216</td>
<td>BLHU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Westmount</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>CMHC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Winnipeg</td>
<td>St James Project</td>
<td>409</td>
<td>BLHU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North Bay</td>
<td></td>
<td>243</td>
<td>BLHU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summerside</td>
<td>Hill Crest</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>BLHU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ottawa</td>
<td>Ottawa South</td>
<td>545</td>
<td>SHH</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comox</td>
<td></td>
<td>100</td>
<td>LDH</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Toronto</td>
<td>Downsview</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>LDH</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Montreal</td>
<td>St Bruno</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>LDH</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Various</td>
<td>locations</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Mobile</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>3102</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Source: ND/CMHC AWG 1983, pp. A4-1/2)
1950's. Only 598 married quarters were constructed prior to 1948, while 92% of the existing married quarters were constructed prior to 1963. (Evaluation Report 20 1979, p. 65) A detailed listing of the age of the DND owned housing stock as of 1982 is illustrated in Table 2-3.

The current accommodation portfolio (both DND owned and administered) is theoretically capable of housing about 27,000 or 60% of our married personnel. In practice about 55% are actually housed due to administrative factors. The remaining 20,000 families either own their own homes (14,000) or are dependent upon private rental accommodation (6,000). (AWG 1985, pp. 4-11) The supply and demand for this private sector housing, and its availability and affordability is subject to market conditions. Military families who must participate in the private sector are "captured clientelle", unable to take advantage of the opportunities of time due to the frequency and unpredictability of transfers in the military.

2.2.4 The DND School System

The military has a continuing commitment to its members for the education of their dependents. This is particularly evident in the case of families who are located in areas where the predominant language is other than their mother tongue. Schooling is provided through either the local school system with DND paying school taxes typical of any landlord, or through a completely independent DND School System.

During the 1985-86 school year, the DND Dependent's School System operated 57 schools in Canada and overseas. These schools
### TABLE 2-3

**AGE OF HOUSING STOCK**

**AT SELECTED BASES AS A PERCENTAGE OF TOTAL BASE STOCK 1982**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BASE</th>
<th>TOTAL</th>
<th>0-10</th>
<th>10-20</th>
<th>20-30</th>
<th>30+</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Halifax</td>
<td>800</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>26%</td>
<td>65%</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Greenwood</td>
<td>1078</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Victoria</td>
<td>692</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gagetown</td>
<td>2203</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Valcartier</td>
<td>946</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Petawawa</td>
<td>1705</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Calgary</td>
<td>998</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Borden</td>
<td>1367</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kingston</td>
<td>795</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>67</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Winnipeg</td>
<td>579</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shilo</td>
<td>745</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chilliwack</td>
<td>480</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trenton</td>
<td>700</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ottawa</td>
<td>824</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edmonton</td>
<td>1264</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cold Lake</td>
<td>1256</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td>16432</td>
<td>2%</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>64%</td>
<td>24%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Source: ND/CMHC AWG 1983, p. A3-13)
were staffed by 977 teachers and accommodated 14,469 dependents at both elementary and secondary levels. In Canada, DND paid for an additional 5,358 dependents of married quarters attending municipal schools. The overseas school system served 3,500 Canadian students. (Defence 86 1987, p. 89)

The gross costs for educating children for the fiscal year 1985-86 were $82 million. DND received a rebate of about $13 million from provincial grants and tuition fees paid by non-entitled pupils attending DND Dependent's Schools. (Defence 86 1987, p. 89)

Regardless of the accommodation policy selected, there will continue to be an obligation on the part of DND to provide suitable schooling for its dependents. Either a separate school system will have to be maintained, or adequate schooling in both official languages will have to be supported financially by the department through local school boards. A distinct advantage to the DND Dependent's School System is the improved continuity in education which suffers when children are required to regularly transfer between provincial school systems.

2.2.5 Summary

The military community is far from being the preserve of the adult single male. Of the 86,036 Regular Force members, approximately 60% are either married, or have been. Of the married couples, 7% are intraservice marriages, and up to 65% of military families could be considered as dual career couples. As such, the family and structures established to support it are of direct concern when considering the welfare and operational
effectiveness of military members.

To provide an appropriate community environment DND has become the largest real property holder and landlord in the Federal Government. The DND owns 22,321 married quarter units augmented by approximately 4,300 administered through private entrepreneurs. Most of this housing stock is old, but in a relatively good state of repair, and is generally categorized as "adequate but ugly".

Approximately half of the married families live in married quarters while the others are subject to the fluctuating private market. Of these, approximately 14,000 own their own homes, and 6,000 occupy rental accommodation.

DND accepts its obligation to provide suitable schooling for its dependents. To do so, at many locations it maintains a DND School System which accommodated 14,469 students in 1985 at a cost of $82 million.
2.3 MILITARY STYLE OF LIFE

The style of life of the typical military family is significantly different from that of its civilian counterpart. This is mainly due to the unique characteristics required to train and prepare a ready and capable military force. Military philosophy as to how the community should be established and inter-relate with the "soldiers" duties, has been carefully and deliberately instilled into the military lifestyle.

In order to appreciate the problems inherent in a military community, it is important to understand the basic philosophies that form the basis of this unique military lifestyle. A look at the military as an independant profession indicates why rules and regulations have become an accepted way of life. It also identifies a variation in the personal values of members in the three elements of the Armed Forces, as well as, why there may be a requirement for the military to establish and maintain its own communities.

2.3.1 The Military Profession

"The Military Profession is more than an occupation; it is a complete style of life. The officer is a member of a community whose claims over his daily existence extend well beyond his official duties."

(Janowitz 1960, p.175)

The fact that an officer is a professional and conceivably performs a crucial "life and death" task, and is therefore expected to be called upon at any time to abandon his routine and personal commitments, is a basic element in understanding
military mentality. As a professional, the soldier is in the unique position of having "to carry out his task even to the detriment of his self-interest for the good of the larger society." (Gabriel 1982, p. 82) A less obvious, yet equally disconcerting, fact is that any profession which is continually preoccupied with the threat of danger requires a strong sense of solidarity if it is to operate effectively. (Janowitz, 1960 pp. 175-177) As such, the military maintains detailed regulations imposing a specific military life style in order to enhance group cohesion, loyalty, and maintain the martial spirit. This regulating has historically been effective in part due to the generally closed community environment in which the military have lived.

However, this philosophy of rigid regulation is changing. In recent years war has not been popular; nor has the military (Hunter 1982, p.3). Professional pride has dissipated, and the views of the military as a "way of life" are being challenged. No longer is the military looked upon by its members as purely a "calling" or a "profession", but more and more it is looked upon as merely an "occupation" or "job". (Hunter 1982, pp. 3-5; McCubbin and Marsden 1978, pp. 207-218; Moskos 1978, pp. 199-206). This transition is discussed further in section 2.6.2.

With these significant changes in the mentality of military members and the community in general, it is remarkable to what extent the military profession has been able to maintain many of its unique characteristics, traditions and culture (Bowers 1976, pp. 89-90). To those within the system, it may appear that the "old systems" are gone. However, from outside observers, it
still appears as though the military has somehow managed to maintain much of the traditional style and life of the old Army and Navy. This is most evident when one looks at the newest member of the military family, that of the Air Force, who through the large powers of self-regulation, have managed to establish traditional military values within its members, and community.

A closer look at the three elements of the Canadian Armed Forces show the values and traditions to be slightly different. The Army and Navy are generally more regimented and traditional in nature than the Air Force. An indication of this is illustrated in the responses of 576 senior officers in the U.S.A. assigned to the Pentagon Staff Duty in 1954 when asked the following question: "In domestic politics, do you regard yourself as: conservative, a little on the conservative side, a little on the liberal side, liberal?": (Janowitz, 1960 page 237)

Table 2-4

U.S.A. MILITARY

POLITICAL IDENTIFICATION - CONSERVATIVE/LIBERAL

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>ARMY %</th>
<th>NAVY %</th>
<th>AIR FORCE %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Conservative</td>
<td>25.1</td>
<td>23.0</td>
<td>14.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Somewhat Conservative</td>
<td>44.5</td>
<td>45.2</td>
<td>46.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Somewhat Liberal</td>
<td>21.3</td>
<td>18.3</td>
<td>31.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Liberal</td>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>3.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No answer</td>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>7.2</td>
<td>3.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
This response is perceived to be consistent with the relative values between the three elements in the current Canadian establishment. It is also a result of the more liberal philosophy of air force members, that has generally created a somewhat less structured and regimented community at Air Force Bases, as compared to Army or Navy Bases. The value and effectiveness of a more structured community environment is one of the items that impacts the type of community support structure evaluated later in this thesis.

2.3.2 Work and Residence

The intimate social solidarity of the military community (which civilians often both envy and resent) is grounded in a peculiar occupational fact. Separation between place of work and place of residence typical of most civilian urban occupations, is absent. Instead, the military community is a relatively closed community where professional and residential life have been completely intermingled. This physical location of the work place, relative to the residence, becomes an important factor in drawing the community together. Typically military housing is co-located on the military base. This relative social isolation, resulting in more contact amongst themselves than outsiders, assists in the creation of a powerful "esprit de corps" among military members.

Residence in the married quarter community also creates an artificial environment which often affects the lifestyles of the family, particularly the children. Housing is segregated by rank often causing the children to associate others according to the
rank and status of their father. The common lifestyle of playmates also provides a sense of security, as the military community offers a relatively well-ordered and semi-sheltered life. It is undoubtedly one of the few communities in which one hundred percent employment is guaranteed, and in which job security is not in question. "Indeed, it is an artificial community isolated from the civilian world." (Sarkesian 1975, p. 53)

2.3.3 Role of The Family

The traditional married quarter community molded family life to the requirements of the profession. In most cases the entire family was involved in the profession of the military member. This is evident from Elizabeth Finlayson's study of the wives of military officers and her following comment (1976, p. 20):

"The life is founded on customs, traditions and regulations - and no member of the family can completely escape them."

A general philosophy to keep the family involved in the military members career through community participation is evident. The community is organized so that family relations support the military member in his conviction that he has--more than a job--some special mission or calling. Through this lifestyle, conflicts between family and career obligations are held to a minimum (Janowitz 1960, p. 187).

As part of the artificial environment created in the married quarter community there are virtually no old people, nor any who are physically incapacitated or ailing; and, children are not
likely to be surrounded by grandparents, cousins, or other relatives around them. Cohesion and closeness within the community has therefore been supplied, to a certain extent, by the military itself. (Sarkesian 1975, pp. 53-55) An ethos that the military "takes care of its own" is instilled into both the family's and the military's methods of operation. As a result, instances arising in the married quarter community involving a family member are often discussed in the workplace, with the military member's supervisor.

2.3.4 Military Mobility

Military families must adjust to periodic and frequent movements from one base to another or to overseas locations. This is an accepted part of the military "way of life". A move typically is necessary every two or three years, although recent policies have attempted to decrease the frequency of moves. It is still not unusual to find some families who have moved on an average of once every eighteen months over a period of years. As such, it is inevitable that a military family will have to move, regardless of the roots that the family has established in a particular location.

The military reasons for frequent dislocation stem from the need to provide a variety of experiences, both in terms of environment and types of employment, to its members. This combined with the need to share time spent at less desireable locations, and the requirements to staff positions with appropriate rank and qualifications, causes a massive turnover of military personnel every year. As stated by the senior military
member of the Canadian Armed Forces (Chief of the Defence Staff) during a presentation made to the Canadian Public Personnel Management Association:

"Contrary to what you might think, we have relatively little latitude in the number of moves we must make each year. Retirements, voluntary releases, returns from overseas, lengthy career courses and promotions generate over 90 percent of our postings. The remaining moves are due to family or other compassionate problems, overly lengthy stays in one spot and like reasons."

(CF Personnel Newsletter 1986, p. 5)

In contrast to civilian life where moving almost always rewards the executive with a better job and greater income, the military member is just as likely as not to be moved from a pleasant and beneficial environment to one that is less desirable. Typically only executive level or highly skilled civilian employees are transferred (Chartier 1982, p. 44; Wikstrom 1975, p. 3; Pay Research Bureau 1982, p. 151-2), and such a move is normally accompanied by a promotion. While some studies have concluded that "people generally tend to be neither psychologically harmed nor socially isolated by their moves" this was perceived to be because "people with the most to gain, the least to lose, and the most resources to use in making a move are the most likely to move." (Surace and Seeman 1981, p. 95) This is not the case in the military, where everyone moves, and not necessary with the incentive of a promotion or personal gain.

While there are many benefits to mobility, the social consequences to the family are also numerous (see section 2.4). In order to alleviate some of these difficulties the military has established a variety of support structures and benefit packages
as both direct compensation and indirect social support. The creation of the married quarter community is one such structure. This thesis evaluates the effectiveness of similar accommodation policies and provides recommendations.

2.3.5 Etiquette and Ceremony

The military establishment thrives on regulations and detailed operating procedures, and it would be illogical to think that this mentality would not extend to social commitments. Elaborate rules of etiquette and ceremony are in fact, some of the few traditions encountered in the historic review that have continued to influence the military community.

Members of the military are energetic socializers, and they work hard at their ceremonial obligations. No other occupation, with the exception of professional diplomacy, is so concerned with courtesy and protocol (Janowitz 1960, pp.196-197). There are many theories as to why the military has established such elaborate social rituals, but they remain, as traditions and customs in an essentially conservative society. The importance of understanding this protocol is as important for the spouse as it is for the member, as officers are expected to be accompanied by a lady/gentlemen to the numerous official functions. As well, since the social environment is such an important part of the military life style, a successful career is assisted by appropriate conduct by both member and spouse in the social arena.
2.3.6 Summary

Military philosophy in the creation of past military communities identified a requirement for a strong cohesive community, where the family lives in housing provided, and participates fully in that community. The family is expected to support the military member completely; in work, community activities, and social interaction.

"In the final analysis, the family has become an inseparable part of the profession—to such an extent in fact that an officer's chances of rising in the military establishment are increased by marriage, and even more so by marriage to an attractive, well-educated woman who has social graces and political acumen."

(Sarkesian 1975, p. 61)

This section has provided a thumbnail sketch of the style of life that has been created by the military on the assumption that a suitable community environment would allow the military member to concentrate on "soldiering" duties confident that his family would be properly taken care of in his absence. A further evaluation of the unique social difficulties arising from such a lifestyle follows in the next section. Subsequently the institutions created to administer the community, and social trends which are placing pressure for change within the community are examined.
2.4 UNIQUE SOCIAL DIFFICULTIES OF THE MILITARY FAMILY

Since the second world war, when the establishment of a large scale permanent military force in Canada resulted in the creation of the military community, the hierarchy of the Canadian Military has placed high values on family lifestyle. It was felt that a stable community life was necessary in order that the "soldier" could carry on with his duty confident that his family would be safe and well cared for in his absence (Bowen 1984, p. 583). However, this rigidly controlled and unique military environment has resulted in a variety of social difficulties for the typical military family.

The unique job requirements of the military, place unusual stress on the family. Spouses and children are expected among other things to; cope suitably for extended periods while the military member is away on duty, dislodge and move frequently without complaint, and endure the traditions and customs of a military environment.

It has become increasingly recognized that the service person's satisfaction with military life (like a civilian to his job) is highly related to family satisfaction and family functioning (Galinsky 1986, pp. 118-119). As such, the mission of the family and of the military are inextricably intertwined, and elimination of disharmony or conflict at the family/organization interface is critical for optimal success of both (Bowen 1984, p. 591). It therefore, becomes a direct economic payoff for the military if these conflicts can be reduced or eliminated. (Hunter and Nice, 1978)
2.4.1 Perceived Military Attitude

"if the military wanted you to have a wife, they would have issued you one"

This common saying about the military lifestyle served as a warning against family interference with the demands of military life. It also served as a reminder of the importance of unit solidarity of the military mission. In the single man's army, "the problem of choosing between work and family life did not exist." (Janowitz 1960, p.178) A military organization and a community evolved emphasizing "esprit de corps". The military family was viewed as an integral part of this total system. The predominant attitude was that the family, and especially the serviceman's wife, played an important but subordinate role in the husband's career. (McCubbin et al., 1976 pp.292-293)

From this general attitude a hypothesis of the overall goals of the military establishment with respect to the family can be derived.

"The military seeks to make the family instrumental to its mission of developing and maintaining an effective combat-ready body of fighting men, mobile enough to be deployed anywhere in the world when needed. Wives and children of married personnel, from the perspective of the military, should be socialized to subordinate their individual needs and desires to the 'good of the service' and to minimize any family claims on the time and presence of the husband/father. The wife of a career military man might profitably pursue educational activities and perform voluntary services in the military community but should definitely not embark on an independent occupational career incompatible with her responsibilities as mother and military wife. Children should observe the rules of the military community lest the reputation of the military father be tarnished and interfere with his career. The family should be a morale builder for the military man, providing love and affection and a minimum of problems to distract him from his central task of serving the 'Cause'."

(McCubbin et al. 1976, pp.11-12)
A superficial look at this statement would lead one to believe that the military establishment shows little concern for the families of its most important resource. In fact the opposite would be more correct (Stanton 1976, p. 149). By understanding how it expects the family to react under inevitable circumstances, it can then establish appropriate institutions to deal with the problems.

The military attitude towards the family, and the social institutions that it has established to support the family, have been successful (Stoddard and Cabanillas 1976, pp. 152-153). This is also illustrated by the two following statements:

"Compared with the general population, career families in the military are better educated (both wives and husbands), more traveled, more informed about services to which they are entitled, more active in voluntary organizations, and much more mobile. Although 75 percent of families have experienced one or more prolonged periods of father absence, a smaller proportion of career officers are in the divorced status than men in the general population."

(McCubbin et al. 1976, p. 13)

"There is no question that some people are totally ill-suited to military life and others are well suited. There is no question that there are difficulties with military life, but, in terms of the frequent moves that one has to encounter, there are arguments about whether that is good or bad for families or for children. We are not aware of any recent study in Canada, but I am aware of a study just last week in the United States concerning military families, showing that, there are less social problems, from alcoholism to wife battering to various abuses, in the military than there are in society as a whole in the United States. We treat our military families better than they do in the United States, and if by treating them better contributes to the lowering of those kinds of problems, then we should have an even better record in Canada in terms of military families versus civilian families."
The Associate Minister of National Defence, Honourable Harvie Andre, when questioned by the Standing Senate Committee on National Defence, on the subject matter of "Freedom of assembly and speech of spouses of members of the Canadian Armed Forces".

(Lafond Commission, 5 June 1986 p. 14:21)

These observations are supported by the findings of the Department of National Defence's Directorate of Social and Economic Analysis in their study of "The Emotional Well-Being of Canadian Military Families in Relation to the Canadian Population" (Popoff and Truscott 1986, p. 31). Their findings suggested that "the prevalence of 'frequent' symptoms of anxiety and depression is generally lower in the Forces that in the general population."

Despite the efforts of the military hierarchy there are still a number of social issues that must receive special attention when discussing the military community. The following issues are the main concerns in the development of community within the military, and will be addressed further as independent problems:

a) The role of the wife
b) Mobility
c) Employment of wives and children
d) Family separation
e) Fishbowl effect of a closed community

2.4.2 Role of The Wife

Many of the societal changes which have taken place since World War II have resulted in a changing concept of the role of the modern women. The military wife has shared in these changes, and as such the cliche "The women's place is in the home" is
outdated. Aside from this change in attitude, one must remember that the military wife is expected to fill many roles within the military community. To her husband she is a wife. To her children she is a mother; during separations she is both mother and father. To the military she is a dependent. To her civilian neighbours she represents the military, and when on foreign soil she is a diplomat. How well she fills all of these roles in a changing society is a true test of her talents and skills. It also is seen to affect her husband's career. (Hunter 1982, pp.10-11)

The changing roles of women in society today add a great deal of pressure on wives in the military community. Sociologists have noted that the greatest pressures on married women occurs in situations where her husband's employer operates within a social enclave (such as a military institution). This causes the wife to participate in activities and roles which she may personally dislike, but nonetheless performs (Stoddard and Cabanillas 1976, p. 169). As such, the ambivalence that she experiences is sometimes destructive to her self-esteem. (Hunter 1982, pp.9-10) Therefore, it is important that the military modifies the social atmosphere to assist the wife in adapting to the military community's customs and traditions, without causing additional stress on the family unit.

2.4.3 Mobility

There are two types of mobility of concern to the military family. The first is the fact that an active duty military person is always on call, and the second is that at any time the
family may be given orders to relocate. The issue of absence due to training or duty is addressed in the next section as "family separation" whereas this section looks at "mobility" in terms of the physical dislocation of the entire household. Dislocation in turn leads to the separate problems of the physical move itself, and the stress produced by confrontation with a new distinct environment (Surace and Seeman 1981, p. 96).

Military families experience financial stresses as a result of relocation; more significantly, however, are the social-psychological costs associated with such a nomadic like lifestyle. "When they are isolated from the traditional supports of extended family, close friends, and stable community relationships, members of military families often experience emotional and interpersonal difficulties apparently related to their 'rootlessness'." (McCubbin and Marsden 1978, pp. 212-213)

Although there are benefits to a highly mobile life-style, such as travel, excitement, a broadening of values, and camaraderie with other military families (McKain 1976, pp. 69-70), these must be capitalized upon to compensate for and reduce the negative aspects of the life-style. In sum, most sociologists see relocation as one of the most socially disruptive events in an individuals life (Surace and Seeman 1981, p. 83).

Policies on relocation in the Canadian Forces are largely based on policies developed for the relatively immobile Federal Public Service and the private sector. This however is relatively incongruent with the frequency of relocation experienced with each of the groups. In FY 77/78, about 11,000 public servants (4%) were geographically relocated. This is more
than the private sector, but substantially less than the 33,327 (42%) military personnel that were transferred. Of these 21,000 (26%) involved geographic relocations and included 12,000 married personnel (Evaluation Report 20 1979, p. 17). The conference Board of Canada recognizes that in comparison with general industry, who has an average annual relocation of one percent of total employees DND is an exception. They state "...large variations occur by industry and employer, a case in point being the Department of National Defence, which relocates more than 13,000 of its non-civilian employees within Canada every year out of a total military staff of 80,000." (Chartier 1982, p. 44)

Relocating to a new base is a shared stress for the entire family, with the heaviest burden falling on the wife. In many instances a "door to door" move is not possible due to the unavailability of accommodation at one end or the other. In such cases, as the military member must get to his job, often the family is left to prepare for the move with the father returning shortly before moving day, to simply tie loose ends. The bulk of the work and stress has been left behind for the spouse to handle.

From a social activity viewpoint, the military member has a predictable and established workplace and social atmosphere at the new location which he can simply walk into. Although it is still somewhat stressful--as one always wants to ensure that they make good first impressions with his/her new boss, peers and subordinates--the environment is set up in advance for him. There is also typically a sponsor to help him become adjusted to
his new location. The family on the other hand must enter the new community and begin establishing social contacts, friendships, neighbours and acquaintances with minimal assistance. Generally the same sponsor mentioned above tries to help with this as much as possible, but once again any help outside of the workplace to the family and spouse is normally left to the sponsor's spouse to provide.

One of the conditioning results of a large number of moves is that it enables the military family to become generally tolerable of immediately unpleasant situations, with the expectations that they will not have to be endured long. This coupled with the institutionalized expectation that "the service is your family" which induces neighbours of the newly assigned family to help with indoctrination into the new community, as well as, the availability of similar voluntary associations, and service clubs such as cubs and scouts, helps the family assimilate into the community more easily. (Little 1971, p.266)

A familiar house, community structure, and physical environment also assists the family in fitting into the new location more easily. One benefit that the standardized military pattern of construction allows is familiarity with houses and buildings regardless of the geographic location. As such, when notified of a married quarter allocation in the new location, the family can immediately visualize its size and layout. Similarly, since the Air Force (for example) had one pattern for recreation center construction, then military families could travel from base to base and quickly recognize the recreation center and know exactly where to enter and how to get the the activity of their
choice. This reduces the obvious reluctance of newcomers to recommence activities they enjoyed in previous locations. As such, this standard pattern of construction is in a limited way capable of providing some reduction to the social difficulties experienced in frequent relocation. Similar benefits are also enjoyed in the conforming organizational structure of the various community councils and military organizations which make it easier for new members to quickly understand what is happening and take part in the activity.

2.4.4 Family Separation

Periodic disruptions of family life while the father is away on assignment, occurs in the military society as a condition of life rather than by choice as in the civilian community. It is the uncertainty of the father's presence that actually places the most stress on the mother, as she must be prepared to periodically assume his role as well. (Little, 1971)

The degree and type of family separation varies significantly with the element of the armed forces, and the type of position the military member is currently filling. Figures 2-4 and 2-5 provide a detailed breakdown of the number of times family separation occurs in each of the different elements, and the number of months of separation that can be anticipated. (Truscott and Fleming 1986, pp. 5-8/9) Typically, naval personnel are required to be at sea for long periods, normally two to three months at a time. These absences would be interspersed with equally long periods in the home port. The army on the other hand, does not go away for as long an
TABLE 2-5

MEAN NUMBER OF FAMILY SEPARATIONS BY ELEMENT
DURING THE PAST YEAR*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ELEMENT</th>
<th>MEAN NUMBER OF SEPARATIONS</th>
<th>STANDARD DEVIATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Officers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sea Operations</td>
<td>5.7</td>
<td>3.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Land Operations</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>2.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Air Operations</td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>2.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication/Engineering</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>1.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personnel/Support/Logistics</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>2.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Ranks</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sea Operations</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>2.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Land Operations</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>2.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Air Operations</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>2.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engineering</td>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>2.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personnel/Support</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>2.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Logistics</td>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>2.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Excluding separations of less than one weeks duration

(Source: Truscott and Fleming 1986, p. 5-8)
## TABLE 2-6

**MEAN NUMBER OF MONTHS SEPARATED DURING THE PAST YEAR**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ELEMENT</th>
<th>MEAN NUMBER OF MONTHS</th>
<th>STANDARD DEVIATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Officers</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sea Operations</td>
<td>4.0</td>
<td>1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Land Operations</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>0.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Air Operations</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>0.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication/Engineering</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>0.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personnel/Support/Logistics</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>0.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Other Ranks</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sea Operations</td>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Land Operations</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>0.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Air Operations</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>0.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Communication</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>0.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engineering</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>0.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personnel/Support</td>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>0.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Logistics</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>0.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Source: Truscott and Fleming 1986, p. 5-9)
individual period (unless assigned a United Nations peace keeping duty), but has many medium length training exercises, normally of two to six weeks, on a fairly regular basis. The air force, varies immensely with the occupation of the individual. Most ground crew rarely leave the home base. Aircrew on the other hand may spend a great deal of time on call, and may be required to fly missions with little or no notice. Normally aircrew are not gone for extended periods (more than one week), but often for many shorter periods. Personnel in any of the three elements can normally expect to occasionally fill staff jobs in a headquarters position, where travel is normally common, but usually preplanned.

In the husband's absence, the wife must take on his role. In a sexist, but not untypical view, often this requires a venture into the outside world and into the stereotyped masculine realm, in order to maintain a functioning household. In some cases additional marital stress is caused because of this change in roles, which occur both from the opportunity for, and the necessity to develop independence during the husband's absence (Stanton 1976, p. 146). In some cases the wife may become unwilling to shift back to her former passive, dependent role after the husband's return. (Hunter, 1982, p. 12-13) This becomes difficult for the children to understand as well, as they appear to have one set of standards when one parent is around and different standards when both are home. Often the family becomes a more female-centered or matriarchial family where the mother takes on instrumental family tasks. (Hunter 1982, p.13)
2.4.5 Employment of Wives and Children

Although it is generally not encouraged (as the spouse is expected to concentrate her efforts in assisting her husband's career), there is no policy prohibiting the employment of military spouses. There are however a large number of both overt and covert obstacles. Some of the many are identified below:

a) employers shy away from hiring anyone who is not going to be permanent (which is quite understandable if looked at purely from the employers perspective)

b) Many locations, especially if isolated or overseas, do not have either: enough employment for all those seeking employment, or sufficient variety for those following particular careers

c) The unpredictability of the work schedule of the military member makes it difficult for the spouse to guarantee her availability due to childcare or carpool type conflicts

d) Social conscientiousness is also important, as it is generally considered improper for an officers' wife, for example, to take on what are perceived as menial or demeaning type jobs, or to take one of the few jobs available at an isolated location.

As a result, relative to civilians of the same age, military spouses are employed somewhat less. In addition, participation within voluntary community oriented organizations is expected of military spouses living within the married quarter community. (Finlayson 1976, pp.22-41) A 1969 study of seven hundred and fifty three wives of military officers' revealed (Finlayson 1976, pp.24-41):

a) nearly half of the wives participated in volunteer services.
b) wives were more likely to perform these services within the military community than in a civilian community.

c) those wives living on the military base were more likely to be volunteers than those living off the base.

d) wives living off the base who volunteered in the civilian community were most likely to be supporting youth programs.

e) wives volunteering on the base were active in women's cultural, social, and recreational programs.

f) organizations servicing the military community such as Red Cross, and Army Community Services were generally well supported.

g) participation of the wife as a volunteer increased with the rank of the spouse, whereas participation in the labour force decreased with rank.

Many of the difficulties associated with employment for spouses also relate to their children. Frequent moves combined with the requirement to re-establish employment contacts at each new location, makes it extremely difficult to motivate a teenager to recommence their quest for work. In addition, many locations due to their isolated location simply have very few job opportunities.

2.4.6 Fishbowl Effect of a Closed Community

The phenomenon we have seen with the "closedness" of the military community in some ways also adds stress to the individual military family, as there has been a growing resentment toward isolation in the "khaki ghetto" and a desire by many military families to lead more "normal" lives (Stanton 1976, p. 138). The father works in the same environment in which the
family lives, and the children play and go to school. The wife participates in social activities and organizations within the same community while maintaining most of her close friends as neighbours. This environment while supportive of community cohesion, is not conducive to and has low tolerance for individual variation (Frances and Gale 1982, p. 173).

Evidence of the hierarchical structure of the military exists throughout the community. Rank permeates not just the work environment, but also the social activities, the location of housing, and personal relations. The actions of the entire family can significantly influence the members possibilities of promotion. (Frances and Gale 1982, p. 173; Sarkesian 1975, pp. 54-56)

The physical closeness of the community makes it extremely difficult to temporarily remove one's self in order to get privacy. Even when on vacation, there is a feeling of not being away from work as everything around you reminds you of it. Often peers, bosses, or subordinates will approach you at home due to physical convenience, many times thinking that you would be interested in their story or problem. This sort of interruption does not occur to other military members living off the base, nor is it perceived to happen in the general civilian community; although, this claustrophobic "fish-bowl feeling" has also been observed in most single-industry towns (DREE 1977, p. 4).
2.4.7 Summary

We have seen that although a close, tightly knit community is encouraged by the military hierarchy, and helps alleviate many social problems peculiar to military society, it also may cause other problems related to its "fishbowl" effect. The military expects the wife specifically, and the family in general, to help them in the task of creating a suitable environment to ensure the military member can carry on with the "soldiering" in an effective manner. This added pressure, combined with other problems related to the nature of military employment, such as mobility and separation, make lifestyles in the military somewhat awkward. In order to balance these added difficulties, the military has created a military community structure and molded appropriate community services to ease military life. The effectiveness of different policy alternatives are evaluated later in this thesis in terms of sixteen potential social impacts on military families.
2.5 COMMUNITY STRUCTURES

The military takes great pride in what they consider to be a very positive community environment throughout the military. They have established a hierarchy of rules and regulations to guide a variety of institutions in order to ensure that they provide this suitable environment for the military family. These rules are implemented for the benefit of the community as a whole. Although individuals may often feel that they are personally discriminated, the military organization is structured on the basis that a loss for some is justified by a gain for most.

Operation of the military community varies slightly between bases, but is controlled and guided in most part by specific regulations. These regulations are directed mainly at the Commanding Officer to ensure that he provides services and assistance considered necessary to support the community. Of most concern are two military regulations. One concerns the establishment and running of "Married Quarters Community Councils"; the second, relates to the policy for the organization and administration of Recreational Clubs, which are normally grouped to run under the establishment of a "Recreational Council." Both of these organization are of direct concern to the CO, but for day to day operation, are managed through the Base Administration Officer, as shown in the organizational chart at Figure 2-2.
* Ex-Officio Members - Are those Base representatives such as, Engineering, Police, and Accommodation, who are invited to meetings to provide information, as requested.

FIGURE 2-2
2.5.1 The Community Council

Military regulations are very specific about the amount of flexibility a Commanding Officer has with respect to the organization of a community council. He is essentially limited through these regulations by the minimum service that he must provide to the military community. Part of the regulation reads as follows:

"The commanding officer (CO) of a base, station or other element of the Canadian Forces where MQs are located shall establish an MQ council."

(CFAO 50-21)

The same regulation goes on to specify what the function of a MQ council shall be:

"An MQ council is a representative body that works for the general betterment of life in the area it serves. It brings together all segments of MQ community interest and provides a medium for cooperative study, planning and action to enhance the life of the MQ community. In general, the functions of an MQ council are similar to those of a community association in a civilian community.

The specific responsibilities of an MQ council should be designed to reflect the needs and circumstances at a particular location. Normally, the MQ council should:

a. identify and study community needs, and co-ordinate and plan programs and projects to meet these needs.

b. sponsor and promote new committees, clubs and interest groups as the need arises; and

c. plan for the effective and equitable use of existing facilities and services and for improvements and extensions to facilities where required."

(CFAO 50-21)
It should be noted that the formation of the individual councils at each of the many locations is generally up to the discretion of the council itself, with guidance and direction provided upon request. Of course, if the council were to deviate drastically from the basic principles of the organization, or to contravene official regulations direction would no doubt be forthcoming.

The principles used to guide the MQ council are specified as follows:

a. it should be representative of the main segments of interests, such as social, physical, cultural and welfare;

b. it should provide for representation of the physical areas making up the community;

c. it should provide a forum for the points of view of men, women, and youth;

d. it should provide opportunity for council members to be elected by the MQ residents; and

e. it should provide for council members to be appointed by the base commander or CO.

It should be noted that paragraph (e) is mainly included for those periods in which no member of the community is interested in representing his or her area, or in some locations where the mayor is not elected, but appointed.

A major factor when considering the military community is the fact that the employer, and the individuals interested in the success of the community are one in the same. As such, the military with its dual interest in the individuals time can authorize military members time during normal working hours to perform community duties. In fact, often military members are expected to perform such duties and are formally assigned them as
"secondary duties". The member is then assessed on how well he performs this duty during his annual performance review. As a result, much more community involvement and commitment is obtained from an individual who otherwise may not have participated. Alternately, many argue that due to the secondary nature of the duty, the task ends up lower on the individuals priority list and often gets neglected. The ultimate of course would be to assign these duties to an individual who has both the time and interest in the appointment.

Another factor in the usefulness of military members becoming involved in the community council, is the fact that they generally know the ways and means of getting things expedited in the bureaucracy of a typical government department. They can often use their personal contacts to get tasks done more quickly. The argument against military members involvement is that they may not necessarily act in the best interest of the community, but may act in the manner which they expect their boss would prefer, in order not to "rock the boat".

2.5.2 The Recreational Council

On large bases in addition to the MQ council, a Recreation Council is also formed to ensure that suitable recreation programs are organized within the community. One of the major principles on which it operates is that:

"an individual should not only be allowed to choose his leisure activities, but also should be afforded the opportunity to participate in the planning, organization and operation of these activities. Special care must be taken that this principle is applied in the organization of recreation programs for military personnel and their dependants because of their frequent moves." (CPAO 50-20)
Examples of some of the many clubs and activities are: ski club, scuba club, golf club, sailing association, swimming club, cubs, scouts, guides, brownies, dancing clubs, arts and crafts, minor league sports, and many others.

Often, if a club generally exists for the exclusive use of the members of the married quarter community (e.g. babysitting co-op, local cub pack) then it is administered through the Community Council. If it is an activity that serves the general membership of the local base (for example a ski club) then it operates through the Recreational Council. The advantage of having two organizations is basically a matter of improved span of control.

The operation of the Recreational Council is very important to the members of the married quarter community and often they are the majority of its members. The economic viability of both the Community Council and the Recreational Council centers upon participation. It is also this participation that creates the positive community atmosphere that the military hierarchy feels is necessary to promote and maintain satisfaction and a suitable "quality of life" in the military and married quarter communities.

Participation in these clubs often involves a minimal entry fee. The clubs are not funded by the public purse; however, many facilities and some public equipment is often permitted for use. Typically DND allows the use of buildings and facilities not currently in use for military duties. The most obvious example is the use of unused military land for the construction of a base.
golf course. Not paying for the capital costs of land or a municipal level of property tax improves the financial viability of the club. Through this indirect support the council is able to offer members key recreational services at reasonable cost.

2.5.3 The Administration of Married Quarters

At times the administration of MQs often appears similar to that of community and recreational councils: a secondary duty. Responsibilities for administering MQs is divided among a number of sections. All of these have operational commitments and tasks to perform, often relegating problems with MQs to a low priority. This combined with the lack of a single source of funding, and a split in responsibilities for maintaining and operating MQs among several sections on base, causes extreme frustration when attempting to coordinate MQ projects. The variety of sections and responsibilities are namely:

a. Construction Engineering (CE) for maintenance and construction.

b. Base Administration for allocation of accommodation, Military Police, and general personnel welfare.

c. Base Transport for provision of vehicles for moving stores, and heavy snow removal equipment.

d. Base Supply for providing new appliances, and other stores for general maintenance of MQs.

As a result of this wide variety of responsibilities and the lack of one overall agency in charge of administering the operation of MQs, the occupant is often ill informed of the status of work at his residence, and when or who will be responding. For example if the occupant has problems with a
major appliance such as a fridge a repairman from Construction Engineering visits to inspect the fridge. If a replacement is required then arrangements with Base Transport must be made to remove the fridge and obtain another. Base Supply must arrange for a new one and for the storage of the old one until properly disposed of, and Base Administration must coordinate the movement of the appliances which are under its overall control. The entire, relatively simple, operation provides a potential source of real frustration to the occupant who often sees the bureaucracy as an impossible obstacle. This negative landlord-tenant relationship is a perception that is practically impossible to erase regardless of the improvements in maintenance response and organizational change. What the military establishment gains through the provision of accommodation, is often lost through the inevitably negative image of "landlord".

2.5.4 Summary

The military has attempted to create a very positive community environment in which some of the social difficulties of military life are satisfied through a strong support structure. Two formal organizations "Community Councils" and "Recreational Councils" are administered at all bases to allow participation in the day-to-day operation of the military community by its members. These councils exist in a very regulated configuration to ensure that the military community has ample opportunity to organize and direct themselves. The military hierarchy has essentially structured the system in this manner to ensure that individual Base Commanders do not "take control" and "rule" as
they please, but that a democratic system is in place which allows the voices of all within the community to be heard.

It is anticipated that such structures will help in creating the sense of community necessary to compensate for the limited ties of kin and friends that are typical in less mobile communities. This formation of a military community attempts to not only create high cohesiveness within military families, but also between military families. It is certain that support systems for military families are needed to make up for the lack of extended families, absent spouses, and other peculiarities of military life. It is important that these supports are in place and operating prior to family crises if their efficacy is to be maximal.
2.6 SOCIAL AND ECONOMIC TRENDS

A number of social and economic trends in Canada directly affect the standard and style of life expected by military families. Similarly, the change in profile of the military from a predominantly single male preserve to a family environment has lead to necessary changes in how the military motivates and administers its members. The trends causing the greatest influence in the military community are discussed separately in this section:

1. Women in the Workforce
2. Occupationalism of Military Personnel
3. Social Acceptability of Relocation
4. Human Rights
5. Housing

2.6.1 Women in the Workforce

The women's liberation movement of the late sixty's and early seventy's provided an impetus for re-evaluation of the sex-role definitions, policies, and attitudes that had previously limited the social options available to women. (McCubbin and Marsden 1978, p.210) Consequently many of the traditional economic, legal, educational and occupational barriers encountered by women have crumbled. This has impacted both employment of women in the Armed Forces, as well as wives of military members.

Growing numbers of women, as well as men, are critically examining the institutions of marriage and the family with their traditional strictly defined sex roles. "The movement is a strong social force that legitimizes women's interests outside
the home and, by extension, men's interests within the home." (McCubbin and Marsden 1978, p.210) The changing of these traditionally inflexible sex roles has resulted in substantial changes in Canadian society and the life styles of military families (Margiotta 1978, p. 438). As women find job opportunities more equitable and as a result increase their participation in the labour force, dual income families will become more prominent. The increasing number of working spouses alters social standards and creates different expectations for living accommodation. Increasing numbers of working wives are making it possible for Canadian Forces families to live in more expensive housing and thus creating long-term dependencies on jobs which most wives are reluctant to give up when their husbands are posted (Hauser 1984, p. 453; Evaluation Report 20 1979, p. 7).

These changes have led social scientists to suggest that a larger portion of the work force is likely to experience conflicts between work and family responsibilities that may contribute to absenteeism, attrition and decreased job productivity. (Popoff et al. 1986, p. 2) Social scientists have suggested that the dual income families have forced men to devote less energy to the development of their careers, in order to enjoy the benefits of a two-paycheque marriage.

Similarly, the increased participation by women in the labour force has allowed them to realize a new found sense of economic security and personal worth. (Popoff et al. 1986, p. 2) It has been speculated that this in turn has allowed more women to leave unsuccessful marriages (Canceller 1984, p. 3), as well
as allowing many working women to value their own career considerations before those of their husband, and their family.

This change in attitude by the traditional homemaker increases the potential stress on the nuclear family. In the old fashioned view of the world, the worker experienced no or few family stresses that affected his performance on the job, as "the family was corporately viewed as a separate institution that the 'provider', generally the male, could leave behind, both physically and mentally, when he left for work in the morning. In the evening the family nurtured and rejuvenated the worker so that he could arise refreshed for work the following day." (Popoff et al. 1986, p. 1)

These changing roles of women in society, in the military, and in the family, have the potential of profoundly affecting the quality and traditional style of military life. Policymakers must be aware of these changes and prepare for a host of new family-related issues when considering the military family. Members of military families will undoubtedly become more assertive of their personal and family needs, and less willing to subordinate their lives to the order of the military establishment (Margiotta 1978, pp. 437-439). These changes will also make it difficult to recruit, socialize, and retain high-quality military personnel in the light of current and projected social change; unless these social factors are properly understood and taken into consideration in the preparation of policies affecting the military community.
2.6.2 Occupationalism of Military Personnel

"In most Western democracies, the proposition that the military as a profession must be somewhat separate from the larger society it serves has been under assault. The tendency has been to reduce the military's sense of professionalism and to substitute for it the idea that the military service is essentially no different than working at any other occupation."

(Gabriel 1982, p. 94)

This perception of change has come from both outside and within the military, and represents a shift in philosophy from the traditional military model (Hauser 1984, p. 449). The "calling" of military service was legitimated by values and norms that underscore a "purpose" which transcended individual and family self-interests in favour of a presumed public good: the defense of the country. In the traditional view, military members, and through socialization, their families, were guided by principles of self-sacrifice and dedication. Compensation for their efforts was received from an array of social supports that underscored the intent of the military institution to "take care of its own" and set it apart from general society. (Moskos 1978, pp. 199-206)

A shift in the rationale of the military toward the occupational model leads to the legitimation of the marketplace, where monetary reward is provided for participation. Thus, members are said to enter and remain in the armed forces for the same reasons that any civilian chooses an occupation: wages, free time, paid vacation, working conditions, and status. (Gabriel 1982, pp. 94-96) This shift to an occupational model signifies most importantly, a first priority to self and family interests rather than to the employing organization and its objectives.
This shift to a more occupationally focused military establishment was experienced in Canada in 1966, when the Canadian Forces adopted a policy of pay comparability with the Federal Public Service, and hence, the private sector. (Evaluation Report 20 1979, p. 65) Before 1966, members for whom DND rations and quarters were not available on bases received subsistence allowances to permit them to pay for their private accommodation and food. Married members also received a marriage allowance. In 1966, these allowances were terminated along with the mandatory requirement for trained members to occupy married quarters, when available. This shift in philosophy by the employer leads employees and their families to also reconsider the priorities between self-interest/family and organization.

2.6.3 Social Acceptability of Relocation

In recent years there has been a decrease in the willingness of employees to be mobile in both the United States and Canada. (Chartier 1982, p. 45) This change is generally attributed to both a changing attitude toward career success and the high social and financial costs of moving. (Evaluation Report 20 1979, p. 14) Employees have become increasingly reluctant to leave a family, friends, and a familiar neighbourhood simply for a promotion. The few private sector companies which attempt to alleviate such employee concerns are finding it increasingly expensive.

Canadian Forces members, who in many ways are also showing an increasing reluctance to move, are probably reflecting
attitudes of Canadian society from which they were recruited. As a result, even promotion and economic inducement provides insufficient compensation for the financial and sociological costs of geographic relocation. Since the military must relocate regularly to maintain suitable levels of competence and experience, the sociological costs of geographic relocation become an even more important factor in evaluating the welfare and potential dissatisfiers of military life.

2.6.4 Human Rights

The average education levels of Canadian Forces members have created expectations and demands for improved lifestyles. (Evaluation Report 20 1979, p. 7) This phenomena is not unique to the military, as Canadian society in general has also experienced significant increases in average education (Future Trends 1974, p. 19). This combined with recent Human Rights legislation has created an awareness that significantly alters the relationships between employers and employees, as well as, landlords and tenants. No longer are societal members willing to accept the status quo, and often, having an improved understanding of basic human rights, they demand to be treated appropriately (Future Trends 1974, p. 19).

As such, the traditional, conservative philosophies of the military are being scrutinized in terms of basic human rights, often resulting in change. Frequently the policies requiring changes are those which were specifically implemented in the best interests of the military community; when they are eliminated due to perceived inequities, they often are replaced
2.6.5 Housing

With increased education and understanding of basic rights, it is evident that the mandatory occupation of married quarters--as was the policy prior to 1966--is not possible. Further, since expectations and demands for improved life-style have increased, young military members are no longer accepting the "adequate but ugly" married quarter accommodation provided. What was ordered prior to 1966, and was voluntarily accepted as a suitable standard of accommodation until recently, is no longer deemed to be entirely acceptable.

The common social arrangement in modern Canadian society is that people tend to sleep, play and work in different places, and in each case with a different set of participants, under a different authority, and without an overall externally imposed rational plan. (Evaluation Report 20 1979, p. 7) Military bases are rather unique institutions in that they break with these social expectations. Since most military members are recruited from general society this peculiar life in married and single quarters is seen to be at odds with the life-style they are accustomed to. To the extent that this difference bothers them, they are likely to want to avoid living in quarters.

A growing trend towards home ownership in the Canadian Forces has prevailed since 1973 when housing prices started to increase dramatically. In part, this is a reflection of the changes in accommodation policy which allowed military members to live off base, but also was a desire by military members to
accumulate housing equity in a market which was quickly becoming too expensive for a retired individual to afford. This is also part of the general expectations and socialization of Canadian society: the dream of homeownership.

2.6.6 Summary

There have been considerable changes in the military in the past decades, and much of this has been in direct response to changes in families generally. Families have become less willing, especially over the past ten years, to accommodate every demand placed upon them by the military organization. Most of the impetus for change has come from the wife, who is no longer asked to do all the adjusting. The pressures of society have significantly changed the expectations of women, which in turn has changed their role. The increased participation of women outside of the home has raised expectations and increased the dependency on two paycheques. This has reduced the flexibility and mobility of military families.

While family life has changed considerably, so has the military persons view of his occupation. The profession role of soldier is slowly becoming a 9 to 5 job. This combined with higher education, a better understanding of basic human rights, and the social acceptability of relocation, is making the administration of military personnel much more difficult. The family is becoming a more important priority than the member's career. As such, the evaluation of accommodation policies in light of these social changes is important in maintaining an acceptable quality of life in the military community.
2.7 SUMMARY

There have been considerable changes in the military since the second world war. Structurally it has changed from the part-time job of the militiaman prior to the war, to the complete, full time military community that exists today. The military is not the preserve of the single adult male, but exists as a total family and community environment. Recent changes in Canadian society and its family structure has resulted in similar changes in the military family. Families have changed from being the untiring servants of the military member's career. They are now less accommodating to every demand placed upon them by the military organization.

In reviewing the various advantages and disadvantages of the military lifestyle a number of conclusions can be made. Certainly support systems for military families are needed to make up for the lack of extended families and often absent spouses. These support systems must be in place and operating prior to family crises if their efficacy is to be maximal. Commitment to the military lifestyle produces job satisfaction, performance, and retention. To increase family commitment, families must be valued as important members of the "team", and they must be made fully aware that they are indeed valued by the organization in which they are enmeshed.

The support systems that existed in the past were successful in compensating for the unique social difficulties of the military lifestyle. This is verified by social indicators which show that the social ills of Canadian society are not as common
in the military community.

Since changes in policy and operation are always necessary to keep pace with the trends and expectations of general society, numerous programs must be restructured, and ongoing evaluation of policy is necessary. The research findings of yesteryear do not necessarily provide answers concerning the problems of today's military families.

It is hoped that this thesis will establish a framework for analyzing how modern military families are affected by different accommodation policies. This chapter has described the community; the next two chapters will describe and evaluate possible accommodation policy options.
3.0 ACCOMMODATION POLICY OPTIONS

The nature of the military profession, which involves the surrendering of some personal advantage to the common good, and the demands placed on service members who must be able to respond when ordered to do so, to meet the military needs of the State, require that DND concern itself to a far greater extent than most other organizations with the accommodation and personnel support needs of service members and of their families. Living accommodation and associated personnel support facilities are a significant element in the motivation of personnel, and in turn, this affects the contribution of each person to operational efficiency.

The complex question of the extent to which DND should remain involved in the creation and maintenance of its own communities is limited in this thesis to the discussion of social elements. In assessing social impacts the thesis emphasizes accommodation policies as the author feels they are at the heart of the military community question. The review of accommodation policy is further divided into the areas of housing and service provision. This chapter describes three housing policy options and four service provision options selected by the author:

HOUSING OPTIONS

A - Provide Complete Public Housing
B - Establish a Housing Society
C - Do Not Provide Housing

PHYSICAL SERVICE OPTIONS

A - Internalized
B - Municipalized
SOCIAL SERVICE OPTIONS

A - Internalized
B - Externalized

The manner in which these specific options have been selected is described, followed by a detailed description of each of the options. These policy options are then evaluated in chapter 4 through the use of a framework developed specifically to assess social impacts on military families resulting from the military life-style.
3.1 FACTORS LEADING TO POLICY OPTIONS

Of the many social factors to be considered in assessing the military community accommodation policy, three are particularly important. First, housing ownership; second, the provision of community services; and third, the fact that military families live both on base and off base—normally by choice, but often as a result of a lack of on base accommodation for them.

The concurrent consideration of these three factors leads to the scenarios graphically illustrated in the three dimensional matrix at Figure 3-1. Unfortunately, it is infeasible to evaluate all twelve of these permutations. Fortunately, however, many of the twelve can be simplified by grouping similar impacts, and making some basic assumptions about real possibilities, as discussed in the following sections.

Housing is the central element upon which the other two factors hinge. For example, if no housing were provided (Option C), then the choice of living on or off base would not exist: military families would have to live off. Similarly, for services the provision of total public housing (Option A) is linked more closely with internalized services, while no housing (Option C) logically implies more externalized services.

Therefore, individual components of the matrix are separated and concentrated on independently, with the main focus being on the provision of housing and community services.
THREE DIMENSIONAL MATRIX OF FACTORS LEADING TO POLICY OPTIONS

Figure 3-1
3.1.1 Housing Options

Wherever military personnel are required to perform the duties demanded of them by DND, they must have access to adequate, suitable, and affordable housing. This obligation agrees with that concluded by industry executives surveyed by The Conference Board in 1974. They state (Wikstrom 1975, p. 28):

"Employee housing is considered to be a 'company problem' when it is clear that actions by the company have created housing problems for the employee. When the company initiates a transfer that necessitates a change in residence, when it assigns an employee to work at a location for so short a period that obtaining housing would clearly be difficult, or when an employee is asked to work in so remote an area that no housing is available, the employee's housing problem is clearly a result of the company's action. Executives agree that in these cases it is appropriate that the company provide services to help the employee get decent housing, even if it means that the company must provide it in some cases. It is a company problem to be solved by the company."

In some areas, sufficient accommodation may be available from civilian sources to meet this need. But, the variations in military needs among the geographic regions of Canada and between local areas indicate the need for an accommodation system to assist both DND and individuals in meeting their aspirations. The system would involve housing inventories, policies, regulations and information programs.

In 1981 the DND Accommodation Policy Task Force developed the following principles to guide accommodation policy (ND/CMHC AWG 1983, p. N5-3):

a. the CF must concern itself to a far greater extent with the accommodation of its members (and their families) than happens in most other government departments.
b. those who live out of quarters, whether of married or single status, must be treated equitably to those who live in quarters.

c. members should be treated equitably regardless of the location in which they serve.

To facilitate an effective evaluation of potential policies, the assessment of a wide and complete range of accommodation alternatives is necessary. Two of the options were selected as the extremes which ranged from complete public housing (Option A), to no housing provided at all (Option C). Any combination of housing provided in between these two extremes could ultimately be chosen; however, an evaluation of the extreme situations allows the specific impacts to be more readily apparent. The department currently maintains public housing for approximately half of the married military population, with availability varying significantly among bases.

The third housing option chosen for evaluation is that of creating a housing society at arm's length from the Department of National Defence. The configuration and operation of such an organization allows for the evaluation of a policy option between the two extremes.

Many of the difficulties associated with the current administration of MQs (which have been responded to by the recent DND studies on military accommodation) are the constraints resulting from DND accommodation being part of a huge government bureaucracy and subject to the federal Financial Administration Act and other legislative controls. Each of the DND accommodation studies indicated that such restrictions are a significant factor in the operation of MQs, and that government regulations on
staffing, tendering, financial administration, and organizational structure, inhibit the efficient operation of MQs (Evaluation Report 20 1979; ND/CMHC AWG 1983; AWG 1985). While it is accepted that these are part of the "cost of doing business" in the maintenance of a trained, ready, and capable military presence, the costs have become significant enough to provoke the review of the entire accommodation system. Option B, the creation of a housing society, was chosen by the author as an alternative which avoids some of the difficulties of operating MQs as a directly government controlled institution. This option is possible because of a special provision in the National Defence Act which stipulates that "the Financial Administration Act does not apply to non-public property." (National Defence Act, para 38(10))

Other housing options considered by the author, but discarded for various reasons were:

a. MQ Co-operatives. While the formation of a co-operative would have the benefit of involving occupants in ongoing management, and would allow for the accumulation of equity through home ownership, it is deemed unsuitable for the military community. The successful operation of a co-operative requires the continued involvement of all participants. The extreme mobility of military families would preclude this involvement, and continuity in the co-operative would suffer.

b. Non-Profit Corporation. Since part of the financial difficulty experienced by DND in the operation of MQs resulted from having to operate under stringent government guidelines, the creation of a non-profit corporation operating separately from DND would allow suitable flexibility in operation to be financially viable. However, there is some doubt as to whether the registrar, under the Canada Corporations Act would accept the "non-profit" corporation as being "of a national, patriotic, religious, philanthropic, charitable, scientific, artistic, social, professional
or sporting character, or the like objects."

(Canada Corporations Act, para 154(1))

c. Crown Corporation. The most logical choice of Crown Corporation to assume the married quarter portfolio is that of CMHC. With the expertise which the corporation enjoys in the area of housing, combined with the established regional and local offices, they could provide a valuable service in the administration of public housing. Unfortunately, assimilation by CMHC or any other Crown Corporation would not provide relief from the restrictive financial requirements which currently exist in the DND operation. As well, such change would further reduce the flexibility and control of the military community by DND, without providing significant benefit.

d. Private Management. The MQ portfolio could be sold to a private entrepreneur, who would operate the units under the terms of a sales agreement. This would be similar to existing Bulk Lease Housing Unit (BLHU) agreements which have existed in a number of locations (see Table 2-2). However, these have been less than favourable, and difficult to administer due to the difficulty in preparing an agreement that includes all possible problems without being excessively onerous on the entrepreneur.

3.1.2 Internalized or Externalized Services

In most locations DND has the flexibility to choose whether it will provide services to the married quarter community itself, or ensure that equivalent services are provided through the local municipality. The factors influencing this decision have changed drastically over the years as local municipalities have grown around the married quarter community and federal regulations pertaining to the payment for services have been restructured. Such changes have provoked the review of service provision policy discussed in this section.

The services provided to the married quarter community can generally be categorized as either social services, or physical services. Military families regardless of where they live
(either on or off base) are entitled to partake of the services provided by both the military and the local community. This flexibility results from the fact that DND pays the local municipality for such services on behalf of the married quarter community in the form of a Grant-In-Lieu of Tax (GILT).

Most military installations were constructed in the 1950's as self-contained-defence-establishments, in part due to the limited civilian services available at the time, as well as, the perceived need for the military establishment to be completely self-sufficient. As such, most bases operate and maintain a complete selection of both physical and social services. As Canada becomes more urbanized, environmental standards become more rigid, and the military life style and operation becomes less independent; the municipalization of many physical services, and the externalization of social services becomes a more viable alternative.

The main impetus to review the provision of services came in 1980, when the Municipal Grants Act, 1980 (MGA 80) was passed by the federal government with the consequence of significantly increasing GILT payments. In the case of federal government properties, GILT is paid based on the assessment of the property value and the general mill rate struck by the municipality. In return for these payments federal properties are entitled to the same level of service provided to all other tax payers. Since DND is unique among federal government departments in that it operates what could be referred to as "company towns" it had enjoyed special consideration in the calculation of GILT. Prior to MGA 80, grants paid with respect to these properties were
restricted in two ways (D Util MS 1984, p. 4):

a. Self Contained Defence Establishments were exempt from grants except with respect to land and residential housing.

b. A reduction in a grant was made when a service was provided with DND resources. Therefore, when DND provided services such as a fire department, garbage collection, sewer and water treatment, etc. the grant paid was reduced by an amount considered appropriate.

The introduction of the new Act eliminated this distinction and the federal government now pays a full grant for all DND properties. The single exception is for dependents education where DND operates schools or provides schooling from its own resources. (Municipal Grants Act, 1980, para 6(a)(i)) Other reductions can only be made when a municipality has refused to provide a service.

The implementation of the Act prompted a review of the services provided to DND establishments. The review initially commenced with physical services with the recommendations that "the streets, sewers, water lines and associated services located in MQ areas should be transferred to the municipalities to eliminate duplication of costs by the Federal Government." (D Util MS 1984, p. 5) The reaction to this by the hierarchy in DND was mixed, with general support for the economic aspects of the proposal, but, with concern expressed about the "loss of military control" and "erosion of the military community". Precisely the elements being assessed in this thesis.

The duplication of payment for services varies with location; however, the services identified in Table 3-1 are the service areas where the potential for a double payment exists.
Table 3-1

POTENTIAL DUPLICATION OF PAYMENT FOR SERVICES

**Physical Services**

1. Water Line Maintenance
2. Sanitary Sewer Maintenance
3. Electrical Distribution System Maintenance
4. Storm Sewer System Maintenance
5. Street Lighting
6. Road and Sidewalk Maintenance
7. Gas Line Maintenance
8. Garbage Disposal
9. Fire Protection
10. Snow Removal

**Social Services**

1. Police Protection
2. Social and Welfare
3. Recreation
4. Education
5. Public Transportation

There are a number of unique ways in which married quarter communities could become involved in provincial and municipal support programs in order to eliminate the double payment. Due to varying provincial regulations these alternatives must be considered on a province by province basis but are generally contingent upon the handover of married quarter inventories by DND. A study of CFB Comox, operating under the British Columbia Municipal Act indicated the following alternatives (Semmens and Adams 1987, pp. 33-39):

a. Incorporate CFB Comox as a Municipal Village

b. Extend the boundaries of the Town of Comox to include CFB Comox

c. Incorporate CFB Comox as an Improvement District
d. Incorporate CFB Comox federally as a local level of government. This would be similar to the legislation recently passed to incorporate the Sechelt Indian Band with its own self-government. (Sechelt Indian Band Self-Government Act) Provincial legislation was then necessary to recognize the area as a municipality under B.C. law. (Sechelt Indian Government District Enabling Act)

Unlike British Columbia, all of Alberta is incorporated in some fashion within a local government entity. However, the Municipal Act of Alberta does allow for the creation of a local government entity called a hamlet. As such, in Alberta, Canadian Forces Bases could be designated as hamlets similar to the community of Sherwood Park (pop. 35,000), east of Edmonton. (Semmens and Adams 1987, pp.46-49) It is anticipated that similar arrangements could be made in each province as required.

The Department of National Defence could pursue these types of options if it felt that the municipalization and externalization of DND services were paramount. However, extensive federal-provincial negotiation would be necessary. This thesis does not elaborate on the method of externalizing services, but limits its assessment to the evaluation of whether such a movement would be advantageous in terms of social impact on the military family. The municipalization of physical services, and the internalization/externalization of social services, and the resulting social impact on military families is discussed further in section 3.5, and is evaluated in Chapter 4.
3.1.3 Members Living On or Off Base

There are two dimensions to the question of families living on base or off base. The first dimension, is the selection of residential location based on personal/family choice. As was noted in chapter 2, mandatory occupation of married quarters ceased in 1966 (Evaluation Report 20 1979, p. 65). The second dimension, is the limited number of housing units provided in each location. This number of units and their availability is further restricted by the designation of units at each base according to rank and family size. Therefore, some military families live in civilian accommodation through personal choice while others are there through circumstances beyond their control.

The preference of living on or off base is hard to assess as a general military preference, as the choice fluctuates with respect to: geographic location, cost-of-living, economic climate, community environment, family stage, family size, children's schooling, and many other factors. The specific question of "Do you prefer to live on-base or off-base?" was asked during an extensive study of Canadian military families conducted in 1984-1985 designed to examine how the family/work relationship affected the health of service families and the operational effectiveness of service members. (Military Family 1983, p. 84) In this study 16% indicated they preferred to live on-base, 67% preferred to live off-base, and 17% had no preference. Even with empirical data such as this, or with historic MQ occupancy rates, it is difficult to determine where
military families would prefer to live given a realistic choice. This is due to the numerous factors—many administrative and unrelated to the specific question of preferred place of residence—which influences the answer.

Since a universally applicable, explicit indication of where military families would prefer to live is not obtainable, this information has to be derived through the assessment of the various social impacts which affect military families. Chapter 4 develops an assessment framework and through the evaluation of the different policy options discussed in the following section, implicit guidelines on the most suitable—and therefore most desirable—accommodation for military families (based on social considerations) can be derived.
3.2 OPTION A - COMPLETE PUBLIC HOUSING

One of the two extreme ranges of housing policy that will be evaluated is the provision of complete public housing. This policy would see a Crown-owned housing unit provided for every military family. While it is impossible to ascertain exactly how many military families would choose to live on or off base (for the reasons discussed in section 3.1.3), it is logical to assume that an insufficient number of crown-owned married quarters exist to meet current demand, as indicated by the many bases with extensive MQ waiting lists. (AWG 1985, p. 9) However, since this thesis limits consideration to the social impacts of accommodation policy on military families, it is unnecessary to quantify this shortfall or its location. Instead, it is assumed that the provision of public accommodation for any military family that chooses to occupy such, is feasible. The evaluation of the social impacts undertaken in chapter 4 will indicate whether the pursuit of this goal is worthwhile relative to other housing options.

3.2.1 Organizational Structure

The option of complete public housing is a simple extension of the status quo. The organizational structure would remain essentially unchanged from that currently in practice. Under the present system married quarters are operated and maintained as an integral part of overall base operations, competing for limited budget funds with other military functions. A detailed description of existing married quarter administration is
provided in section 2.5.3. The biggest weakness in the current structure is the extremely fragmented maintenance/support organization that exists in the operation of married quarters. No single responsibility center exists to co-ordinate and manage all aspects of the married quarter operation. As such, under Policy Option A the status quo will be modified to establish a single military responsibility center at both the base and National Defence Headquarters levels, to coordinate both married quarter administration and maintenance. The base authority structure and chain of command as discussed in Chapter 2, would remain unchanged.

3.2.2 Housing Requirements

The accommodation profile of the military community provided in section 2.2.3 indicated that the current portfolio (both DND owned and administered) is capable of housing about 27,000 or 60% of the married personnel. In practice about 55% are actually housed due to vacancies, maintenance, and other administrative factors. Extrapolating this data indicates that an additional 25,000 housing units are necessary to ensure that a MQ is available for each and every military family. However, as discussed in section 3.1.3 not all families would choose to live on base, and since 1966 it has not been military policy to require the occupation of married quarters. Since cost is not the overriding factor in this assessment it is assumed that the portfolio of MQs could be increased sufficiently to accommodate all interested military families.
3.2.3 Cost

While cost is of limited importance in this thesis's evaluation of social impacts on the military family, it is still an advantage to understand the relative cost of the different policy options. Relative cost is also particularly important when considering the combination of housing and service provision policies. For example, any funds saved or profit secured through an effective DND housing policy could possibly be transferred to the provision of community services. As such, if an assessment of policy options indicated little difference in social costs, then it is an advantage to understand how the economic costs of the policies vary, so that the combined social impacts for both housing and service provision are minimized in conjunction with costs. Similarly, a large difference in the social costs between two options is more easily understood or legitimized if the level of financial support each program enjoyed was recognized.

A number of military accommodation studies have assessed the cost of operating and maintaining the DND housing portfolio. Of indisputable importance to private sector property managers as well as DND, is the question of the economic viability of such portfolios. It is hard to believe that DND's portfolio with no land cost, no debt service to retire capital, and no profit requirement, could be losing money. However, this seems to be the case. A 1979 study estimated the net annual cost to operate married quarters as $74 million (Evaluation Report 20 1979, p. 71), while a 1985 study estimated the costs at $16.3 million (AWG
1985, pp. 29-30). While the assumptions for each estimate can undoubtedly be argued, it is clear that the economic viability of the housing portfolio as it is currently being operated is questionable.

All the studies agree that the cost excesses incurred by the portfolio are not necessarily a function of the occupant or the service provided to the occupants. "They are more a function of the legislation governing the occupancy of Crown land, Federal policies imposed on the Department of National Defence, excessive standards imposed by DND, and military requirements." (ND/CMHC AWG 1983, p. E-1) As such, it is concluded that these extraordinary costs to the portfolio should be borne by DND as a "cost of doing business", and should not be seen as losses to the housing portfolio. Some of the factors influencing costs identified in the 1983 Accommodation Working Group Study were:

- a. The cost of services normally provided tenants in the private sector through taxation are borne by DND in the payment of GILT and/or provided by DND
- b. Federal or provincial subsidies available to support certain services in the municipal or private sectors are generally denied DND
- c. Federal policies regarding pollution of land or ground water dictate higher levels of service than the private sector
- d. The isolated location of many bases and stations contributes to increased costs
- e. Certain units within the portfolio command a disproportionate amount of services, or are more expensive to maintain (official residences and heritage buildings)
- f. Some services, or the level of some services, exceed the norm due to military requirements
- g. Conversion of units to uses other that MQ with resulting increases in service or maintenance
h. Occupants are generally discouraged from participating in the maintenance or upgrading of units and grounds

i. Maintenance standards in some instances exceed the private sector norm

j. Optimum results are not always achieved in maintenance and renovation practices

Other significant financial impacts to the public housing option are: the age of the housing portfolio, its outdated style, and the acquisition of additional stock to increase the portfolio. Table 2-3 provides a breakdown of the age of housing stock at selected bases. The most significant observation, is that at least 92% of the housing stock is more than twenty-five years old (see section 2.2.3). While it has been well maintained it still requires significant ongoing maintenance to keep the predominantly wood structures in acceptable condition. The structural design of the MQs was found by a CMHC study team (who had just completed a similar study on civilian homes through the Residential Rehabilitation Assistance Program) to have "...characteristics that give rise to occupant dissatisfaction. This arises because of differences between MQs and contemporary house design and lifestyles." (ND/CMHC AWG 1983, p. B-3) Renovations necessary to update these homes would be expensive. Similarly, there would be extensive capital costs if the housing portfolio was increased to enable housing for all military families.
3.3 OPTION B - NON-PUBLIC HOUSING SOCIETY

The policy option of creating a Non-Public Housing Society was selected for evaluation as it has the potential to satisfy the prerequisites considered necessary to operate married quarters effectively. The financial controls required in a government department preclude the effective management of the housing portfolio (see section 3.1.1). However, a special provision in the National Defence Act stipulates that "the Financial Administration Act does not apply to non-public property." (National Defence Act, para 38(10)) As such, a Non-Public Housing Society operated at arms length of the department, would ensure that the necessary financial controls are maintained at all levels, but would provide the desired level of flexibility and control not achievable in the present system.

3.3.1 Organizational Structure

To operate effectively, the Housing Society would have to operate in a manner untypical of the traditional military mode of operation. A more centralized system is necessary. It would be controlled ultimately at the national level by the Chief of the Defence Staff through a Board of Directors made up of senior military personnel who represented the bases and support services. The Society would essentially be a "private" company staffed by property management professionals. At the base level the Society would have indirect contact with base support staff and the Base Commander, but would be responsible through a regional system to the Board of Directors at National Defence
Headquarters (refer to organization chart at Figure 3-2). Base Commanders who were not satisfied that the needs of his personnel were being met by the Housing Society could pursue their case through the military chain of command to their representative on the Board. While this centralization of control is a drastic change from the standard operational/functional command structure it is deemed necessary to ensure the viability of the Society.

The centralized, self-contained organization of the Housing Society ensures that existing problems experienced with the coordinating of a number of different departments is eliminated. One organization would now handle maintenance, administration, and management of the entire portfolio. The organization would be centrally located within the married quarter community to be clearly identifiable, approachable, and ensure contact is maintained with its clientele.

The organizational design of such a structure would obviously need more extensive elaboration in order to be sufficiently persuasive for its implementation to be considered. However, for the purposes of this thesis, this is not considered necessary. What is important, is to understand how the organization will run and inter-relate with the occupant, so that the resulting social impacts on military families can be assessed. If an organization such as the Non-Public Housing Society operated at arms length from DND yet providing dedicated, exclusive service to its military community, is seen as the best housing policy option in the evaluation undertaken in chapter 4, then further organizational design and consideration could be undertaken.
Figure 3-2
3.3.2 Housing Requirements

The Housing Society option is based on the assumption that all existing housing owned by DND will be transferred to the Society. As such, the current portfolio (which is only capable of accommodating 60% of the married personnel) will have to be increased if housing is to be made available to all military families through the Housing Society.

3.3.3 Cost

During a 1984/5 DND accommodation study, property management specialists from CMHC and DND compared the existing married quarter maintenance operation with typical commercial practice. (AWG 1985, p. 30) It was estimated that labour costs could be reduced by approximately 40 percent through a Housing Society style operation. "The major savings occur as a result of increases in productivity because of the projected use of handymen as opposed to trade specialists and the elimination of waiting times through the move to personal transportation." (AWG 1985, p. 30) This increased efficiency is mainly a result of the freedom from the Financial Administration Act, Public Service Alliance of Canada labour agreements, and the contracting agencies of Supply and Services Canada, and Defence Construction Ltd.

An estimate of operation costs conducted by the same group revealed a net annual profit of slightly less than $1 million as compared to the net loss of $16.3 million experienced through the existing operation. It should be noted that this estimate includes an annual capital expenditure program of approximately
$15 million to continue current levels for renovation and improvements. The group concludes that "despite generous allowances for overhead, [the Non-Public Housing Society] can achieve financial self-sufficiency without having to seek additional sources of revenue." (AWG 1985, p. v, original emphasis)

The viable operation of the Housing Society is contingent upon:

a. married quarter portfolio being transferred to the Housing Society

b. the Housing Society being self-sustaining and enjoying exemption from the external influences inherent in the existing DND operation

c. recognition by DND that certain operating costs should not be borne by married quarter occupants and that these costs be reimbursed to the Housing Society as an accepted "military cost of doing business"

d. the Housing Society is able to retain operating revenues and surpluses, and obtain other sources of funds for capital projects as necessary, through private or public sources
3.4 OPTION C - NO HOUSING PROVIDED

The other extreme to providing complete public housing is the option of not providing any housing at all. In some interpretations, this would be more in line with government policy which states that (Treasury Board 1981, p. 1):

"It is the policy of the government that, under normal circumstances, employees are responsible for securing their own living accommodation. However, the Crown shall provide such accommodation for employees when:

(a) it is an operational requirement and it is necessary to combine the employee's accommodation and place of work (such as at airports, national parks, locks on canals, and radar stations),

(b) it is clearly advantageous to have the employee reside at or near the job location (such as at agricultural or research stations), or

(c) no suitable living accommodation is available in the vicinity."

This policy option would envision the disposal of the married quarter portfolio at all urban and semi-urban bases. In accordance with article (c) above, the more isolated sites where no suitable living accommodation is available could retain existing housing stocks.

3.4.1 Organizational Structure

The organizational structure would remain unchanged. Sections within the department that existed exclusively to support the married quarter operation would be eliminated. Other bases agencies would be reduced an amount appropriate to compensate for their decreased responsibility. It is estimated that approximately 460 Public Service postions could be declared
redundant if the need to operate MQs was transferred to a separate organization. (AWG 1985, p. v) Any additional administrative functions or services created to support the general military community living in privately secured accommodation would be established within the existing organizational structure.

3.4.2 Housing Disposal

Assuming that housing was no longer provided for military families the portfolio at urban and semi-urban bases could be disposed of. Section 3.1.2 identified some unique ways that the entire married quarter community could be transferred to the local municipality or administered through self-government. Alternately, DND could divest itself of the housing portfolio by public sale of the housing stock. This sale could be restricted in a number of ways: to military families only, to the general public, or to private landlord entrepreneurs. No conclusive disposal technique to support this option is suggested; for the purposes of the evaluation it is assumed that in this option military families would be obliged to obtain private accommodation through either the private rental or purchase markets.

The relinquishment of housing responsibilities by DND would remove the unfavourable "landlord/tenant" relationship that exists, and is unavoidable regardless of the level of service provided. Similarly, removal of the maintenance, construction, and landscaping constraints on the occupants of married quarters (as they would now be privately owned) will enhance the "ghetto" type atmosphere that predominates married quarter communities.
The current "ugly but adequate" impression of the housing stock will slowly be upgraded enhancing the community environment as homeowners invest time and money to improve their homes and secure their investments.

Concurrent with the sale of the housing stock a shift in policy emphasis could be initiated from the existing provision of public housing to about one-half of the married families, to the implementation of a comprehensive policy involving salary and benefits which could be enjoyed by all military families. Such benefits could in part compensate for any perceived social impact resulting from the loss of the married quarter community.

3.4.3 Cost

This option assumes that DND has arrived at a stage in its evolving development where it may no longer be able to afford—or need to carry—the high costs of operating family housing. If there remains no need for housing it could be disposed of. However, this would not eliminate the corporate responsibility of DND to ensure that suitable accommodation is available for military families so that the mobility or operational effectiveness of DND is not jeopardized. However, accommodation assistance programs other than the provision of housing could be considered to reduce the social impacts resulting from the unique life style of the military. It would be logical to assume that if DND is willing to provide public housing at extensive cost (supposedly to reduce the social impacts on families), then it would also consider alternate programs which may provide equivalent social benefits at a reduced cost.
DND has been quite progressive in its relocation benefits over the past decade and provides benefits equivalent to what the Conference Board of Canada survey identifies as a "Standard Relocation Package". (Chartier 1982, pp. xiv-xvi) Such relocation assistance includes: moving expenses (both possessions and family), house-hunting trip, lump-sum payment as "disruption" allowance, real estate and legal fees, and temporary living expenses. Programs beyond the standard package which could be considered are (Chartier 1982, pp. xvi-xvii):

a. a guaranteed home sale plan
b. employee loans, both short and long term
c. subsidies for various cost of living differentials, such as mortgage interest rates and housing

While it is not the intent of this thesis to establish a relocation policy for DND, the benefits accruing to military families through relocation affect the critical social impacts inherent in their nomadic lifestyle. Increased relocation benefits can offset some of the apprehension in securing appropriate accommodation (Wikstrom 1975, p. 14). For example, a guaranteed sale plan which also guaranteed no loss in sale price, especially if combined with low interest loans, would enable many military families to enter the private housing market with little concern. The feasibility and implementation of such programs must be considered in light of the total impact on the military community. Should the evaluation of policy options undertaken in Chapter 4 determine that this policy option sufficiently satisfies the social concerns of the military family, then its economic feasibility would be evaluated further.

106
3.5 PROVISION OF SERVICES

Table 3-1 identified the services that could potentially be duplicated through services being provided by both DND and the local municipality. These services have been evaluated in past DND studies mainly from the view of economic efficiency: it is illogical to provide a DND service when an equivalent one is available from the local community and is being paid for anyway through GILT. This thesis is not concerned with the financial concerns of efficiency, but is interested in evaluating what the optimum method of service provision is to compensate for the social impacts of the unique military lifestyle.

The services were generally categorized as either physical or social services. The municipalization of physical services and the internalization or externalization of social services are discussed separately in the following sections. The discussion in this section is more descriptive in nature and identifies the strengths and weaknesses of the various methods for each service. A more detailed quantification of the social impacts exists in chapter 4, where sixteen social impacts are evaluated through the different policy options.

3.5.1 Physical Services

The municipalization of physical services is easily quantified in financial terms. However, the social impacts resulting from a perceived erosion of the military community are not so easily measured. This thesis develops a framework which enables such intangible and incommensurable variables to be
considered so that they may become a substantive input in the decision-making process. The ten physical services identified in Table 3-1 have been grouped into service areas which exhibit similar impacts, and the advantages and disadvantages resulting from municipalization are discussed. The service groupings are:

1. Fire Protection
2. Roads and Sidewalks/Sanitary and Storm Sewers/Water Lines
3. Gas and Electrical Distribution Systems/Street Lighting
4. Garbage Disposal and Snow Removal

Fire Protection. Fire protection for DND sites is provided by a combination of municipal fire departments and DND operated fire halls and fire protection services. In many cases DND bases and facilities are unique and are beyond the scope of some municipal fire departments. For example, DND operational air fields, explosive storage areas, and high security installations. These operational factors generally dictate the selection between either military or municipal fire protection. However, fire protection is much more than simply the fire fighting operation itself; it is also fire prevention in the form of engineering, education and enforcement. Through this combination of protection and prevention DND has maintained an enviable record of fire losses as compared with the Canadian average (Table 3-2).

While the perceived higher standard of protection provided to military families is beyond that expected in a typical Canadian municipality, it has still become the norm among married quarter occupants. The elimination of the military fire protection service, while relatively insignificant in itself is compounded when similar services afforded the military community are also eliminated. Services provided by the military above and
Table 3-2

COMPARISON OF DND AND CANADIAN FIRE LOSSES (1982)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Canada</th>
<th>DND</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Loss per Fire</td>
<td>$5,723</td>
<td>$1,895</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Per Capita Loss/Year</td>
<td>$18.05</td>
<td>$2.35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Fire Death Rate per 100,000</td>
<td>37.39</td>
<td>0.41</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Source: D Util MS 1984, p. 12)

Beyond that normally available in the much larger service area of a typical municipal fire department are:

a. regular inspections of accommodation

b. assistance in the servicing of fire fighting equipment such as smoke alarms and extinguishers.

c. unscheduled inspections upon request

d. individual fire fighting and fire prevention training

In summary, while suitable structural fire protection may be available from the local municipality it is necessary to consider any municipalization of the fire protection service in conjunction with all services being provided to the military community. Any extensive reduction of even superficial services such as fire protection could result in incorrect perceptions that the military is no longer interested in "taking care of its own".
Roads and Sidewalks/Sanitary and Storm Sewers/Water Lines. These municipal functions have been grouped together because it is difficult to do anything to one which does not impact on the others. Normally the sewer and water systems are in the ground under roads or within the road allowances. There is concern that DND will experience "loss of control" if the roads are turned over to municipal authorities. The roads would become public thoroughfares and responsibilities for controlling access to pedlars, solicitors, or other undesirables would shift from DND to the individual MQ occupants, the same as in any civilian neighbourhood.

In urban areas where DND retains operational control and maintenance of sewer, water lines, and roads they may find themselves becoming increasingly isolated from the cities expanding around them. They could potentially become an anachronism, largely left out of the cooperative planning required for regional sewage and water systems, and transportation routes, etc (Freedman 1976, p. 78). As such, it is important for DND planners to enter into joint land-use planning with other local government agencies. (Low 1979, pp. 22-24) This is especially important if control of municipal infrastructure is retained by DND.

The main concern to the military community is the question of the social impacts resulting from the opening up of what has traditionally been a very closed and controlled environment. The "Neighbourhood Watch" type programs encouraged in local communities due to increasing need (Cancellier 1984, p. 6), have
never been necessary in married quarter communities as everyone knows each other, and outsiders are closely watched both by community members, and the private military police force. Municipalization of services increases the number of individuals external to the married quarter community who have legitimate access. This perceived intrusion reduces some of the positive attributes of a strong cohesive community.

Of equal consideration is that the nonstandard, rigidly controlled military environment that has traditionally existed also may provide some concern to those members of the married quarter community who would prefer an environment more typical of general Canadian society (Stanton 1976, p. 138).

Gas and Electrical Distribution Systems and Street Lighting. While the services discussed in the previous paragraph are typically municipally owned, operated, and controlled, gas and electrical distribution systems need not necessarily be municipal services. Even where they are owned by the municipality they are usually run as revenue-dependent agencies of the local municipal authority. As such, the municipalization or externalization of such services further increases legitimate intrusion into the military community, as maintenance is required and meters must be read regularly.

On truly self-contained bases there is no alternative: DND must supply their own power. On any other base one alternative is to buy the gas and electricity from the "wholesaler" at the gate, and distribute it within the base MQ area as well as the operational areas. This procedure was common at most bases prior
to 1975, until a Treasury Board Decision 11 March 1975 directed that "...wherever practicable, usage of utilities (heat, light and water) shall be individually metered, and the occupant shall pay the amounts billed directly to the supplier..." (D Util MS 1984, p. 20) Since that time most bases have turned over gas and electrical distribution systems within MQ areas to local suppliers of utilities.

While this conversion has proven to be very cost effective, in addition to making occupants more energy conscious, it is another incremental erosion of the closed environment. While it is stated that no "loss of control" has been experienced by the communities that have converted (D Util MS 1984, p. 21) this comment is unsubstantiated as such an effect realistically is unmeasurable. As this method of service provision is practiced throughout civilian communities and has become the accepted method throughout Canada, it is not anticipated that effects on the married quarter community would be significant, if any. However, the accumulated affects of these minor changes may be eroding the military community.

Garbage Disposal and Snow Removal. Comments regarding the erosion of the married quarter community resulting from increased intrusion discussed in other service provision areas, also relate to these two services and will not be elaborated further. To enable the municipalization of these services it is necessary to first transfer ownership of the roads and sidewalks. This is required to ensure that the organization that is damaging the roads (as typically happens during snow clearing operations) is
the same one that maintains them. For garbage disposal, some municipalities have argued that they will provide the equivalent service to DND as it does for any other rate-payer: by picking the garbage up at the edge of the "customer's property". Unless the roads are owned by the municipality, door-to-door garbage pickup is seen as impossible for some municipalities.

3.5.2 Social Services

While for physical services economic factors associated with the municipalization of services seem relatively easy to quantify but measurement of the social impacts is difficult; in considering social services for the military community both economic and social factors are difficult to ascertain. The specific services that are considered for either internalization or externalization—as the services could be provided by either DND or the local municipality at most urban or semi-urban bases—are discussed in the following section, and are evaluated in Chapter 4. The services discussed are:

1. Dependent's Education
2. Police Protection
3. Social and Welfare Services
4. Recreation
5. Public Transportation

Dependent's Education. In view of the fact that Crown lands are not taxable, DND recognizes its obligation, as a landlord, to provide for the education of dependent children, as well as, service and civilian personnel residing on Crown lands. DND derives its authority to provide this education from Order in Council P.C. 1977-4/3280 dated 17 November 1977. (D Util MS 1984, p. 7) This Order also affords dependent children of
service personnel the opportunity to attend schools where the language of instruction is consistent with the language used in the home, as well as the policy intent of the Official Languages Act. Under this authority students attend either a Dependent's School or a local municipal school (upon DND's payment of non-resident school fees). Details of the profile of the DND Dependent's School System have been provided in section 2.2.4.

DND schools, particularly those at the elementary level, are an integral and essential element of the married quarter community (Pressman 1976, p. 184). Since schooling is the single exception to the Municipal Grants Act (see section 3.1.2), DND is capable of operating its own schools without having to be concerned with the duplication of services, and the payment of municipal services not received. The operation of DND schools is linked directly with the existence of a married quarter community owned and operated by DND. Therefore, if no housing was provided by DND it would continue to pay GILT equivalent to school tax on its "commercial" base structure, however, the students would attend local schools.

One of the distinct advantages of the DND Dependent's School System is the improved continuity in education which is not available when children are required to regularly transfer between provincial school systems. The DND system is very understanding of the difficulties involved with relocation and has established methods and procedures to accommodate students to reduce the social impact.

Since the reduction of GILT for school services is the only
exception allowed in MGA 1980 (Municipal Grants Act, 1980, para 6(a)(i)), the economic pressure to externalize the school system has not been as strong as the movement towards municipalization discussed in the provision of physical services. However, since schools are an integral element in a community, any change in the school system must be viewed in conjunction with its affect upon the entire married quarter community. Similarly, dependent's education must be considered when developing policy for the married quarter community.

**Police Protection.** Military Police (MP) also form an integral part of each base. The involvement and duties of MP have evolved differently at each site depending on such factors as local civilian police availability, the degree of acceptance of full peace officer powers for MP, whims of local courts, and the perceived gravity of certain offences within the respective military and civilian systems.

By law, certain police activities must be considered a virtually exclusive civilian police perogative. For example, impaired driving, murder, manslaughter, sexual offences and most drug cases. (D Util MS 1984, p. 10) As would be expected in the military, commander's policies are typically enforced more rigidly than municipal by-laws. Similarly, with the exception of the specific offences which are within the exclusive jurisdiction of civilian courts, MP give the first choice of tribunal to Commanding Officer's of subjects of MP investigation. This ability is a premise upon which the Code of Service Discipline (National Defence Act, Part IV) was founded, and impacts upon the
cohesiveness and effectiveness of a unit. Through this system the Commanding Officer is capable of dealing with an infraction in the best interests of the unit as a whole, with specific regard to military interests and concerns. To civilianize the police force would remove this important element from their position of command.

MP also have a number of additional resources that are made immediately available for their use as the situation dictates. For example, padres, social workers, fire marshals, unit duty personnel, and medical personnel. All of these disciplines are drawn from a resource base whose threshold knowledge level and historical inter-action is geared toward service personnel and their families. It would be difficult for a civilian police force to recognize the infrastructures of the military organization to cope with the same variety of situations.

Military Police tend to present the results of an investigation before a commanding officer and then withdraw from the scene unless called upon as a witness. Civilian police on the other hand tend to think "prosecution" and, indeed, may act as prosecutor when an offence occurs. This would reduce the role of commanding officers to submitting certificates of civil conviction rather than their traditional role of determining appropriate punishments based on service or unit interests. Service personnel and their families would likely suffer from the impersonal approach that would result from civilian police protection.

Although there are numerous benefits to a closed environment complete with self-policing, it also creates a feeling of "living
in a fishbowl". This fishbowl effect, as discussed in section 2.4.6, adds some family stress, as the father works in the same environment in which the family lives, and the children play and go to school (Stanton 1976, p. 138). Any infraction committed by a family member is likely to be discussed with the military parent's supervisor. This example in itself has benefits and costs, as discussing the infraction in this manner may eliminate the pursuance of a civil conviction, while on the other hand, it may indirectly influence the military member's career.

Social and Welfare Services. Members of the military community have access to the complete range of civilian social work agencies and resources that are available to members of the general community. The services commonly offered in any civilian community include such things as child welfare services (adoptions, foster placements, child abuse, counselling) and financial assistance (emergency welfare and welfare payments to families who fall below provincial poverty lines). As well, there are usually a number of special interest agencies that cater to specific problems, (ie, associations for the mentally retarded, multiple sclerosis society, alcoholics anonymous, etc).

The choice of requesting assistance directly from civilian agencies or through military social workers has always been available. The civilian community can offer things that cannot be provided by military social workers such as the above mentioned services. On the other hand, military social workers can do things for the military community that civilian agencies cannot. Examples of these would include the investigation and
reporting of compassionate situations through the chain of command, with appropriate recommendations for administrative and career authorities. Further, because military social workers are familiar with the particular requirements of the military community and problems associated with the unique military lifestyle, and organization, they are better suited to provide assistance in many situations.

The military and civilian social work services as they exist, seem to complement one another and the services offered by both will continue to be required by service families. Those formal support services such as social workers, doctors, dentists, lawyers, and chaplains have been part of Canada's military for years. However, the more informal support systems that augment the services of these professionals are becoming increasingly important. The development of these subordinate support services have really only begun in the military community since the early 1980s. (Dorge 1987, pp. 10-11)

One of the more informal service areas that is increasing in need both in Canadian society and the military community is the availability of suitable child-care (Galinsky 1986, p. 132). While this is not the specific responsibility of either military or civilian public agencies, it is still a necessary service for the community. Typically it is provided either by private entrepreneurs or non-profit agencies. DND as the administrator of non-public activities on military bases must be encouraged to initiate the creation and provision of such services. As a result of a 1984-85 Military Family Study, DND has proposed the
establishment of a Forces' wide Family Support Program that would eventually lead to a common base line of support services on every base. (Personnel Newsletter 1987, p. 4)

Recreation. The availability of municipal recreational services to the military community is treated similar to that of the other services discussed, ie. the military has paid for equal treatment through its payment of GILT. Members of married quarter communities are eligible for the same services as other residents, however, a variety of reasons exist as to why they either do not receive, or do not use municipal recreation services. The reasons include:

a. in most municipalities the demand for services far exceeds the resources available, and the MQ area, with a transient population usually located in an out-of-the way corner of the municipality has great difficulty in competing with neighbourhoods composed of long term tax-payers for a fair share of what is available

b. municipalities are reluctant to build facilities or operate programs not on municipally owned land

c. bases are reluctant to accept municipal services because of possible loss of control, expected requests for uncontrolled access for other personnel, and the general intrusion into the married quarter community and base.

Recreation and its direct relationship to the physical fitness of military members is highly regarded in the military. As a result a large infrastructure has been created at bases to ensure that military personnel have the opportunity to remain fit. Recreation and sports also plays a large part in the military indoctrination program. This provision of recreation programs directed mainly at the young single male has resulted in services and infrastructure focusing on sporting activities.
However, a number of specialty interest activities have also been established at most bases. As a result of this extensive recreational infrastructure a special organizational structure exists at each base to coordinate the activities. The role and responsibilities of this "Recreational Council" is discussed in section 2.5.2.

It is clear that the recreational services provided to the military community are, on a per capita basis, more extensive than those provided to most civilian communities. In addition, members of the military community also have access to these municipal programs if they desire. As such, any externalization of recreational service will result in a decrease in the total service available to the military community. Conversely, the extension of some military programs to the local population has been conducted at some bases. This has enabled the expansion or improvement of some programs which are not already fully utilized.

Public Transportation. This is a service that the military community relies entirely upon the municipality to provide. In part this is due to the relatively self-sufficient community environment created by the military, which had eliminated the need to travel. As urbanization of the local community sprawled towards and engulfed many bases the need for public transportation to nearby business, and services increased. Similarly, as base services became more municipalized or externalized, travel outside of the base became more necessary. It is apparent that past limited participation by base personnel
in joint community planning has resulted in a lower quality of municipal service being provided to the military community, especially in the area of public transportation. (Low 1979, p. 49) Potentially, increased participation by base personnel in the regional planning of municipal services should provide an opportunity for increased or improved services for the military community.

Increased involvement by DND in the provision of its own public transportation is not anticipated. As such, it is important that base personnel provide more input into municipal public transportation to ensure that equitable levels of service are maintained for all rate-payers, including the married quarter community.
3.6 SUMMARY

This chapter has discussed the three main factors which affect the structure of the military community: housing, community services, and the choice of whether to live on or off base. Emphasis is placed on three wide ranging policy options for housing the military community, as well as the options to either externalize or internalize community support services. These policy options were dealt with in detail to ensure that they were properly understood prior to their assessment in terms of the relative social impacts on the family resulting from each.

The three housing options encompassed a wide range of options stretching from complete public housing to no housing at all. A third option, to create a non-public housing society, was chosen to provide the opportunity to evaluate a housing structure which remained exclusively controlled by DND, but outside of the typical government bureaucracy. This enables the retention of the married quarter community, but puts its administration at arms length from the day-to-day, base level military operation.

Costs for each housing option were discussed superficially to indicate the relative costs of each. Option A, the provision of public housing through the existing organizational structure imposes a significant cost on DND; despite the fact that it has no land cost, no debt service to retire capital, and no profit requirement. However, this structure is more closely controlled by the military hierarchy, and allows them to maintain the traditional military community values and systems that have been
successful in providing a stable community environment.

It has been estimated that Option B, the creation of a Housing Society operating outside of the strict DND regulatory structure could operate the existing married quarter portfolio at a slight profit. Included in this estimate is the acknowledgement by DND that it must accept its share of non-standard housing expenses as "the cost of doing business". This structure would enable the retention of most of the traditional married quarter community structures, but would relieve DND of the unpleasant and negative landlord/tenant relationship.

Option C, to provide no housing at all, would enable the disposal of all existing housing infrastructure located at urban and semi-urban bases. In its place alternate accommodation assistance programs would be considered. This logic is based on the premise that DND would continue to accept its corporate obligation to ensure its employees have access to adequate accommodation at an affordable cost.

Discussion of the provision of community services was broken down into physical and social services. Physical services externalized to the local municipality are generally referred to as "municipalization", while the externalization of social services is simply referred to as "externalization". There is a general perception that both municipalization and externalization will erode the military community and ultimately lead to its demise, to the detriment of the military family and military operational effectiveness.

These varying policy options have been chosen to give the
widest breadth to the assessment following in chapter 4. Based on the recommendations arising from this evaluation, a particular policy option could be developed further, with a clearer understanding of the social implications on the military family.
4.0 EVALUATION OF THE SOCIAL IMPACTS OF POLICY OPTIONS

The more quantifiable elements of the accommodation question—such as economics—have been considered in detail in past DND studies of military accommodation policy. In part, this has been due to their ease in measurement and the existence of an established framework to do so. Conversely, social concerns impacting the military family (eventhough a high priority to the corporate leaders in DND) have only superficially been considered due to the limited knowledge: first, of the impacts, and second, of how to incorporate what little was known about these impacts into the decision-making process. This predicament is common in most assessments, and typifies the adage "If you can't do it, ignore it." (Peterson and Gemmell 1981, p. 394) Even the Department of Economic and Regional Expansion (DREE), which in introducing a paper on single-industry communities identified that "while the economic problems appear most obvious, it is the social problems...which make single-industry communities in Canada a salient area for policy planning." (DREE 1977, p. 2) They then proceed to establish a framework which ignores social impacts, stating "A multitude of social concerns are excluded from this [framework] as many of them are not readily quantifiable and most are not aggregative." (1977, pp.37-38).

Chapters 2 and 3 have provided a background and understanding of the unique military life style and the resulting social difficulties experienced by military families. This chapter uses this information to establish a framework through which the social impacts on the military family resulting
from accommodation policy can be evaluated.

The general concepts of "social planning", "quality of life", "social indicators", and "social impact assessment" are explored in the process of designing a suitable evaluation technique. The selection of a conceptual framework and the identification and measurement of social impacts are discussed in detail. Ultimately, a "Planning Balance Sheet Analysis" is completed on the selected impacts. The interpretation of this analysis allows conclusions and recommendations on housing and service provision policies for military accommodation to be drawn.
4.1 DEFINING SOCIAL IMPACTS

There are literally thousands of scales and indexes to measure social variables (Miller 1983, p. 271). The challenge to the social scientist is in being knowledgeable of the alternatives and to apply the most appropriate measurement technique to the situation, within given financial and time constraints. To properly understand the role and use of social impact assessment in the decision-making process it is necessary to realize the general goals of social planning, and various methods of measuring community health.

This section briefly describes the purpose and goals of "social planning"; describes the background to the concepts of "quality of life" and "social indicators"; and then discusses the "social impact assessment" process itself. This leads to a more detailed discussion of the methodology of social evaluation undertaken in this thesis.

4.1.1 Social Planning

"Social Planning" is an elusive term not specifically associated with any particular profession (Lauffer 1987, p. 311), although three claim to practice it (Qadeer 1977, p. 86):

"Professional social work involves the promotion, organization and delivery of health and welfare services, and planning for these tasks is its form of social planning. Programming and planning for housing and community services is the basis of urban planning's claim to the practice of social planning. Contemporary planned efforts for national development (a la five year plans) combining economic growth, social transformation and institutional building have also been called social planning."
Even though such planning legitimately exists in many fields, discussion of it in this thesis is limited to the domain of urban planning; although, some evaluation of service provision does extend into the area of social work.

In the planning of Tumbler Ridge (the most recent large scale new community in Canada), the planners saw social planning and the creation of a formal social plan as "...a process involving rational decision-making and sensible and pragmatic foresight to guide social development" (Thompson et al. 1978, p. 1). The rationale assumes that uncertainty about the future and the resulting negative impacts, can be reduced by intentional design. Planning is considered to be better than leaving things to chance. It is also linked closely to the social ecology concept of planning, which is based on the belief that the social process and structure of society are a direct result of the environmental superstructure built upon streets, sewers, transportation, buildings, and economic institutions, which has been a significant influence in urban and social life (Kumove 1976, pp. 164-165). However, additional knowledge is necessary on the functioning of communities because, "in spite of a higher quality of physical environment, the residents of such communities are still suffering from acute degrees of tension, stress and unhappiness." (Pressman 1976, p. 170)

Kumove (1976, p. 164) describes the function of social planning as the development of social goals and policies, and indicates that planning should be considered with regard to the following:

1) health and personal development of individuals
2) the maintenance and strengthening of family life
3) the development of opportunities for other meaningful social and community relations
4) the integration of the present residents and the future residents in the new community
5) the integration of diverse social and cultural groups to assure successful settlement and integration of the residents in the new communities and within their region as defined in social, economic and political terms

Social planning could be used to direct social change within a community, or to attempt to minimize negative impacts from external developments. Generally, social planning recognizes that change within a society is inevitable. In the military community the social trends leading to pressures of change are discussed in section 2.6. These trends generally involve changes in the character of the family, its values and attitudes.

4.1.2 Quality of Life

The aim of social planning has been defined as the goal of improving "quality of life" (Simmonds 1973, p. 36). While declarations for the improvement of the quality of life as a national objective are easy to agree upon, there is little consensus on how quality of life should be defined, measured, and fostered (Solomon et al. 1980, p. 224). Part of the problem stems from the youthfulness of the concept. A review by Szalai into the sociological literature, revealed that the term has only achieved currency in the last 20 years, and until 1979 had yet to appear in encyclopedias or dictionaries (1980, pp. 7-8).
The notion of quality of life that underlies the study in this thesis is similar to that expressed by Dalkey (1972, p. 9):

"The notion of quality of life...is somewhat different from the one used by the news media, and by most public officials. The more usual meaning is related to the environment and to the external circumstances of an individual's life—pollution, quality of housing, aesthetic surroundings, traffic congestion, incidence of crime, and the like. These are important influences on an individual's satisfaction with life. And they have the additional feature that they appear to be more manageable by municipal, state, and national programs than attitudes or feelings. But they form only a limited aspect of the sum of satisfactions that make life worthwhile. An important question for policy is whether they constitute a major share of an individual's well-being, or whether they are dominated by factors such as sense of achievement, love and affection, perceived freedom, and so on. To answer this question, a somewhat deeper look has to be taken at quality of life as the individual experiences it."

Quality of life is seen as an inclusive concept which covers all aspects of living as experienced by an individual. The environment (natural and man-made) often provides the reference point as well as the yardstick for the individual's evaluation of his quality of life (Onyemelukwe 1981, p. 75). For measurement purposes, aggregated individual life experiences are often used to assess the quality of life of a community; but this does not necessarily produce a realistic picture. Similarly, it is difficult to assess the impact a community has on the quality of life of an individual (Solomon et al. 1980, p. 224). Solomon and his colleagues have conceptualized quality of life research as follows: (Andrews 1980, p. 275)

"quality of life research uses both objective and subjective indicators, is concerned with the interaction of these two types of indicators, draws its data mainly from sociological surveys, tries to analyze life-quality as an integral system of value frameworks, and is oriented to the past and the future as well as to the present."
4.1.3 Social Indicators

"Social Indicators, the tools, are needed to find pathways through the maze of society's interconnections. They delineate SOCIAL STATES, define SOCIAL PROBLEMS, and trace SOCIAL TRENDS, which by SOCIAL ENGINEERING may hopefully be guided toward SOCIAL GOALS formulated by SOCIAL PLANNING."

(Miller 1983, p. 339, original emphasis)

Usually one thinks of quantitative measures when referring to social indicators; however, the author supports Sheldon and Freeman (1970, p. 97) in the feeling that qualitative ones should also be included. Many of the indicators of social conditions in use would be classified as quantitative (objective) and are the products of records taken by institutions and agencies with specific interests and functions (Andrews and Withey 1976, p. 5). Typical of these are the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development's (OECD) list of social indicators (OECD 1982, p. 13), which attempt to standardize a comprehensive list of indicators shared by member countries to enable comparison. However, social indicators by themselves are meaningless. "They acquire meaning and relevance...only when placed in a broader valuative context...to protect or enhance the quality of social life." (Olsen et al. 1981, p. 48)

Since it is widely agreed that the notion of quality of life includes important perceptual and subjective elements, then social indicators must go beyond purely quantitative measurements. While both quantitative and qualitative indicators can complement each other the more subjective "perception" of an individual's well-being must be captured, as it is his
perceptions of his own well-being, or lack of well-being, that ultimately defines the quality of his lives. Goudy (1977 p. 381) quoting Campbell et al. states "The reported level of satisfaction is influenced implicitly by a set of standards held by the person, including his image of the most attractive community he has known, or has read about..." Andrews and Withey propose a set of social indicators which consist of a parallel series: "one indicating how people themselves evaluate various aspects of their lives; and the other indicating the external or environmental conditions relevant to each of those aspects." (1976, p. 7)

The assessment of "well-being" is conducted by numerous agencies in many different ways, each with their own logic, tools, constraints, and purposes for measuring the particular socio-economic indicators that they do. Standardized health questionnaires such as Macmillian's Health Opinion Survey (Popoff and Truscott 1986) or Dupuy's General Well-Being Schedule (Popoff et al. 1986) are examples of suitable tools for such measurement. The use of such standardized questionnaires enables comparisons to be made between communities in addition to the inter-relationships apparent within any particular survey. Although the social indicators resulting from such surveys are often employed by planners as "good statistics" to record the success or failure of specific programs, this could be misleading (Mukherjee 1981, p. 20).

The health opinion surveys noted above have been used recently in the military community (Popoff and Truscott 1986: Popoff et al. 1986), and have provided information on which
elements of the community are most at risk or exhibit particular stresses. This information is important and essential in understanding the effects of the unique military lifestyle. What such health type surveys are ineffective in doing is determining the specific impacts of various policy options. This thesis follows on from the work of Popoff and colleagues to use the indicators to assess the perceived social impacts on military families that would result from specific housing and service provision policies.

4.1.4 Social Impact Assessment

Inserting the term "impact" into the discussion of social planning, social indicators, and quality of life, "implies that a causal relationship exists or might exist between the impacting thing and the impacted thing" (Boothroyd 1978, p. 118), which in turn deserves assessment.

A variety of techniques have been developed by economists to describe economic phenomena and to aid in their decision-making. Cost-benefit analysis (a technique for describing and quantifying the advantages and disadvantages to society of an initiative policy in terms of a common monetary measure) "is undoubtedly the most commonly employed technique for evaluating alternative plans of action from society's or the community's economic viewpoint." (Davis 1984, p. 9)

Due to its youthfulness (Boothroyd 1978, pp. 130-132), social impact assessment (SIA) has not enjoyed the long history and development of techniques that has provided economists with their repertoire of tested and proven assessment tools. SIA has
only grown in prominence since environmental protection legislation was passed in the United States (1969) and Canada (1973). Of particular concern to social scientists, is that no technique exists to completely integrate the impacts measured through economic and social assessments. As a result, independent evaluations of economic and social impacts are often conducted without cross consultation or final integration prior to their submission to decision-makers.

Lichfield et al. have done extensive work in integrative impact assessment and have categorized general approaches to plan evaluation methodology under the following categories (1975, p. 49):

1) Financial investment appraisal  
2) Check-list of criteria  
3) Goals-achievement analysis  
4) Assessment of resource costs  
5) Social cost-benefit analysis  
6) Planning balance sheet analysis  
7) Optimization

Three of the methods: financial investment appraisal, assessment of resource costs, and optimization are overly restrictive in their applications as they concentrate on the areas of economics, resources and design-cost respectively. As such, they are deemed inappropriate for use in this thesis, and are not described further. The remaining approaches are discussed briefly.

**Check-list of Criteria.** This methodology has been developed amongst physical planners and basically uses a system of criteria to select options (Lichfield 1970, pp. 156-157). Criteria may or may not be weighted. The advantages or
disadvantages of each proposal against each criterion is noted. In the method's simplest form, the chosen option is that which has the least number of items of disadvantage. An improvement to this system, which introduces an important feature enabling the off-setting of measured money costs against features which cannot be costed as a basis for judgement, was made by the Roskill Commission (Lichfield et al. 1975, p. 51). In their system, comparison and elimination of options was completed in stages. Costed criteria would be evaluated in one stage then the uncosted criteria in the next. This system worked well for reducing options; however, subjective judgement remained a major role in the final comparisons.

Goals-Achievement Analysis. Goals achievement methods attempt to determine which option is best given a predetermined set of "goals" or "objectives". "Goal" is described by Hill, the author of the approach, as "an end to which a planned course of action is directed." (Hill 1968, p. 22) The technique measures both tangible and intangible consequences, where benefits are seen as positive in terms of a stated objective and costs as negative (Davis 1984, p. 27). "For each objective and each alternative course of action, costs and benefits are compared, aggregated where possible, and reported separately. The decision-maker is then in a position to weigh the alternative courses of action against each other." (Hill 1968, p.22) Layout of the matrix consists of affected groups in the rows and the associated costs or benefits in each column.

The Goals Achievement Matrix with its focus exaggerated almost exclusively on goals, does not compensate for other
important consequences with have not been explicitly defined. In addition, it limits itself to the consideration of single sectors as consideration of the interactions and interdependencies between objectives are not taken into account (Davis 1984, p. 28).

**Social Cost-Benefit Analysis (SCBA).** This approach has been developed by economists for appraising the social worth of projects. Williams, as quoted by Lichfield et al (1975, p.58) defines SCBA as:

"...essentially a means of adapting the rules for profit-maximizing investment behaviour by private firms to fit the different circumstances under which governments operate, which in turn means trying to take account on the one hand of externalities and the peculiarities of 'public goods' compared with 'private goods', and on the other recognising that the budgeting process of government may require further reformulation of the rules if they are to be appropriate in a setting which is far removed for the classical one of a small firm operating in a large and perfect capital market."

Items of cost and benefit included in the analysis are all the gains and losses of every member in society whose well-being could be affected. As much as possible, observed measurements of the individual's costs or benefits are used rather than stated preferences. Costs or benefits which are not directly comparable are measured by the amount of goods or services which would provide either the same amount of satisfaction, or would provide sufficient compensation to restore the impactees to their initial level of well-being. The "trade-off" of equity considerations is a subjective measurement made by the decision-makers.

**Planning Balance Sheet Analysis (PBSA).** This method is an adaptation of the SCBA approach developed by Lichfield for use on
urban and regional planning studies (Lichfield 1960, 1966, 1970). It's strength is in its "multi-sectoral" nature. The conventional application of SCBA is limited to items which can be quantified, measured, or compared in common units. PBSA eliminates the need for common units by including a statement of intangibles and incommensurables in the same table as those for which measurement is possible. As such, a convenient summary of all the information is produced forcing "the decision-taker to make explicit the subjective judgements about the value of the intangibles and incommensurables." (Lichfield et al. 1975, p. 61) "Thus, the balance sheet cannot, and does not, aim to provide a conclusion in terms of rate of return or net profit measured by money values as is the case in some typical cost-benefit studies. Its value lies in exposing the implications of each set of proposals to the whole community and to the various groups within that community, and also in indicating how the alternatives might be improved or amalgamated to produce a better result. The purpose of the approach is the selection of a plan which, on the information available, is likely to best serve the total interests of the community." (Lichfield, 1970, p. 156) More details on the PBSA are included in section 4.2 as it is the method chosen for the evaluation of social impacts on the military family assessed in this thesis.
4.2 THE PLANNING BALANCE SHEET ANALYSIS

The question of whether DND should be in the business of creating and maintaining its own communities, and if so, which housing and service provision policies would be most appropriate, is a huge question. This thesis has limited it to the discussion of differential social impacts on the military family. Lichfield (1966, p. 216) suggests that to eliminate the market inadequacies associated with other techniques a "supra-investment framework" is necessary to properly evaluate the problem and ensure that both economic and non-economic factors are considered. Lichfield calls this framework the Planning Balance Sheet. It is used in this thesis as an illustration of its capabilities to evaluate the social impacts, after which it is easily expandable to include all other elements necessary to provide informed direction in the accommodation question.

This section describes the Planning Balance Sheet Analysis which is the technique proposed for assessing social impacts of military community policies.

4.2.1 Conceptual Framework

The Planning Balance Sheet Analysis was chosen due to its strength in assessing inter-sectoral impacts and especially the manner with which it deals with intangibles and incommensurables.

To discuss the framework it is helpful to refer to the elementary school questioning maxim "Who? What? Where? When? Why? and How?" Consideration of the elements of the Planning Balance Sheet by asking these questions will focus and assist in
ensuring all elements are adequately considered.

Who is Impacted? This first step in Lichfield's Balance Sheet is to identify the various "producers" and "consumers" who play a part in a proposed development (Lichfield 1966, pp. 219-220). Ideally, all producers and consumers are identified and the corresponding costs and benefits associated with each measured.

The various "levels" of social systems, such as individuals, families, neighbourhoods, or regions should be identified and included in an impact assessment (Boothroyd 1978, p. 122). Social impactees should be further categorized in various dimensions (age, ability, ethnicity, community and economic status, occupational/social role, and family structure). (p. 126) This leads to an extensive list of social impactees who must be considered independently, as the impacts on them vary significantly.

In the heuristic model created in this thesis to assess the military community the variables are limited significantly to illustrate the operation of the framework more simply. Rather than measuring the impacts on both producers and consumers only those affecting consumers are considered. This is appropriate as the thesis has limited its interest to determining the social impacts on military families (consumers) resulting from various accommodation policies. The group of consumers is further limited, in the systems level sense, to the family. Additionally, impacts on families are limited to those internal to the military community. That is, the costs or benefits to non-military families in the local community are not considered.
Dimensionally, it is assumed that the military community is a homogenous group of families and as such, additional dimensions such as husband/wife or parent/children are also not addressed as independent consumers.

**What are the impacts?**  **What are the options?**  The selection of impacts is an extensive and crucial process, and as such, is described in detail in its own section (4.2.2). Choosing appropriate policy options is also a complicated and important process, which, for the heuristic model has been completed in Chapter 3, where three different housing policies and either internalized or externalized service provision were selected. These particular options were unilaterally chosen by the author to provide extreme cases which would ensure that the comparative results of the evaluation were more obvious. Theoretically, other social planning techniques such as brainstorming, expert and local surveys, and delphi methodologies could be employed in an actual evaluation to ensure that all possible options were developed and explored.

**When is the impacting thing to take place?**  The timing of an impact assessment is important. Often it is not undertaken soon enough, and as a result a decision or some form of commitment is made without a knowledgeable understanding of all the impacts. Ideally, SIA should be undertaken from the beginning of a project's conception (Boothroyd 1978, p. 129).

**Where is being impacted?**  It is necessary to clarify the location which is being impacted. The many military communities are in a variety of urban, semi-urban and isolated locations.
Each location has its own peculiarities and constraints, and therefore accommodation and service policies should be evaluated independently for each site to ensure an accurate analysis. For example a key concern in the area of housing would be the local market. If housing in one particular location is unavailable or unaffordable then the impact on military families in that location would vary from that exhibited in other locations, where adequate local housing was available. The heuristic model developed in this thesis assumes a generic military community located in a municipality capable of supporting members of the military community as part of the local community.

**Why change policy? Why Social Impact Assessment?** The reasons for a review of existing accommodation policies are discussed in Chapters 2 and 3. In brief, the need for change stems from pressures arising from economic cost and social change. As well, it is good management to proactively review policy. Social impact assessment is necessary as it is concerned with how change affects quality of life. Quality of life in turn, has been seen as an important element in maintaining a satisfied and effective workforce.

**How are impacts measured?** This is another element of the process which merits more extensive elaboration and is discussed independently in section 4.2.3.

4.2.2 **Identifying Impacts**

The problem of selecting impacts for assessment is similar in nature to the task of choosing social indicators in a quality of life assessment. There are numerous impacts which could be
chosen, and some analytical methodology is necessary to justify the choice made. Finsterbusch (1981a, pp. 3-5) suggests that this problem can be approached through the following techniques:

a. relevance tree
b. literature survey
c. delphi interviewing
d. iterative interviewing
e. contextual analysis
f. contingency trees
g. model construction

The seven techniques identified are briefly described. A relevance tree is a branching diagram which identifies social phenomena in a tree type pattern moving from general to specific. Literature surveys enable the use of past experience to be used in the analysis. This could be verified or augmented by small-scale attitude data sampling techniques such as the "Community Attitude Assessment Scale" offered by Fitzsimmons and Ferb (1977), or "mini-surveys" suggested by Finsterbusch (1981d). Delphi interviewing employs "experts" to individually assess possible social phenomena, and then to reevaluate their judgements after consideration of the opinions and criticism of others. Iterative interviewing informally obtains information on perceived impacts from a variety of organizations, groups, and individuals likely to be impacted, and alters subsequent interviews to maximize the information obtained from previous interviewees. Contextual analysis places the specific community, organizational and institutional settings of the project into the proper context to consider the analysis of impacts. A contingency tree systematically maps possible impacts into first-second- or higher-orders. A related technique, the use of a "scenario" (Vlachos 1981), is simply one of the paths on a
Model construction uses relationships, normally mathematical, to calculate the cross-impacts of a policy alternative.

Davis (1984, pp. 15-22) offers two additional techniques, analogous communities and demographic inference. Analogous communities, a type of literature survey, infers from the experience of a similar community the anticipated affects of a certain stimulus on the community being evaluated. "Demographic inference attempts to estimate community impacts by relating changes in community social patterns to alterations in the socio-demographic structure of the study region." (Davis 1984, p. 21)

These various techniques can be considered as scanning devices which enable the researcher to systematically question whether a proposed alternative would have any potential impacts which would require further study. The wider the range of social categories, the more techniques, and the more analysts used, the less likely the opportunity for subjective bias.

Once an exhaustive list of potential social impacts are identified, it is necessary to isolate the more significant ones for further study. Finsterbusch (1981a, p. 8) offers commonly used criteria of significance to reduce this list as: "intensity, probability, irreversibility, political sensitivity, duration, higher-order impacts, and the number of persons affected." He agrees that inevitably, considerable subjective judgement will have to enter into the process. In addition to using these criteria to pare the list, it suggested that the iterative delphi technique using both experts and those potentially affected be
utilized to weight or rank all possible impacts until a consensus is achieved. Several authors have suggested that identifying impacts, like all of components of SIA, should be an iterative process (Bowles 1981, p. 25).

The use of a combination of techniques for selecting impacts described above are suggested when conducting impact assessments. The logic and selection technique used to select the social impacts used in the heuristic model evaluated in this thesis are described below.

A variety of social impact assessment checklists illustrated in the literature of past case studies were reviewed. It was determined that generally each case developed its own unique list based on the peculiar impacts perceived in its project (an anticipated and logical result). As such, two of the more generic social impact checklists reviewed were used. Finsterbusch's "Impact Relevance Tree for Social Impact Analysis" was one (1981a, pp.6-7), and Boothroyd's "Checklist of social environmental conditions (impact categories) to be considered in social impact assessment" was the other (1978, p. 125).

Finsterbusch's relevance tree was also sited by Bowles (1981, p. 17) as a suitable starting point to answer the question of "What are the social phenomena which might be affected?" in his discussion of social impact assessment in small communities. The strength of the relevance tree is in its generic but extensive consideration of all possible social impacts across a broad range of social categories. The almost two hundred impacts identified by Finsterbusch, as illustrated in the adapted relevance tree at Figure 4-1, are far too many to be properly
addressed in this evaluation. Those ultimately chosen are indicated on the tree.

The author used a number of techniques to isolate the impacts considered most significant. The list of impacts resolved from each of the different methods was synthesized to select the final list of impacts.

First, a list was produced intuitively based on personal experience. This list was prepared before being influenced by additional research as it was developed as an initial part of the thesis prospectus.

Second, literature survey was undertaken of analogous communities and general societal trends. Communities that were investigated included: those of other militaries, resource towns, small communities, and planned towns. Included in this research was the consideration of the questionnaire survey results of a military life study survey conducted in 1983/4 by the Department of National Defence on the military family (Popoff et al. 1986). A review of societal trends and its impact on components of similar communities also enabled some demographic inference of what affects could be anticipated in the military community. Based on this review, a second list of impacts was created.

Third, the 200 or so impacts on the relevance tree described above were reduced to a workable number using lexicographic pruning. This technique is commonly used in every day decision-making and simply eliminates alternatives which are not high in the key dimension. In this case, the key dimension is the family as a social unit and its perceived well-being given different
Figure 4-1
FINSTERBUSCH'S IMPACT RELIANCE TREE FOR SOCIAL IMPACT ANALYSIS

1.00 HOUSEHOLDS
1.01 INDIVIDUALS
1.01.10 ECONOMIC
1.01.11 MATERIAL CONSUMPTION
1.01.12 WORK RELATED ACTIVITIES
1.01.20 POLITICAL
1.01.30 SOCIAL
1.01.31 PHYSICAL & PSYCHOLOGICAL WELL BEING
1.01.32 EDUCATION AND SOCIALIZATION
1.01.33 LEISURE ACTIVITIES
1.01.34 SOCIAL RELATIONS
1.02 NUCLEAR FAMILY
1.02.10 ECONOMIC
1.02.11 MATERIAL CONSUMPTION
1.02.12 WORK RELATED ACTIVITIES
1.02.20 POLITICAL
1.02.30 SOCIAL
1.02.31 PHYSICAL & PSYCHOLOGICAL WELL BEING
1.02.32 EDUCATION AND SOCIALIZATION
1.02.33 LEISURE ACTIVITIES
1.02.34 SOCIAL RELATIONS
1.03 OTHER HOUSEHOLDS
1.03.10 ECONOMIC
1.03.11 MATERIAL CONSUMPTION
1.03.12 WORK RELATED ACTIVITIES
1.03.20 POLITICAL
1.03.30 SOCIAL
1.03.31 PHYSICAL & PSYCHOLOGICAL WELL BEING
1.03.32 EDUCATION AND SOCIALIZATION
1.03.33 LEISURE ACTIVITIES
1.03.34 SOCIAL RELATIONS

2.00 COMMUNITIES
2.10 ECONOMIC
2.11 MATERIAL CONSUMPTION
2.12 WORK RELATED ACTIVITIES
2.20 POLITICAL
2.30 SOCIAL
2.31 PHYSICAL & PSYCHOLOGICAL WELL BEING
2.32 EDUCATION AND SOCIALIZATION
2.33 LEISURE ACTIVITIES
2.34 SOCIAL RELATIONS
2.40 CULTURAL
2.50 ENVIRONMENTAL

(Source: Adapted from Finsterbusch 1981a, p. 5)

146
accommodation possibilities. As such, impacts on the tree were eliminated if they did not seem to meet this key prerequisite. As a result a third list was created.

Fourth, the Boothroyd checklist was used because of its extensive grounding in social theory. It was derived from social environment conditions considered necessary to meet the basic individual human needs defined by Maslow (Boothroyd 1978, p. 124). In conjunction with the Boothroyd checklist, a check was made with lists of concerns receiving attention from official international bodies doing work on social indicators, such as UNESCO (1981) and OECD (1982). It was perceived that some critical social issues may have been missed by the three previous methods, as such it was necessary to use a fourth list which captured social issues in a manner generic but suitably comprehensive to provide assistance in the selection process.

The lists produced through the four techniques were compared, and although the terminology describing the impacts was diverse, the impacts identified were quite similar. The final selection, as in most social impact assessments, was a subjective one by the author. The final sixteen social impacts appear in Table 4-1, and are described and assessed in section 4.3. Table 4-1 also relates the partial equivalency between the 21 social impacts in the Boothroyd checklist, the portions of the relevance tree which were ultimately used, and the sixteen impacts selected.
### Table 4.1: Comparison of Impacts Chosen versus Others in Literature

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Impacts</th>
<th>Remarks</th>
<th>Finsenbusch</th>
<th>Boothroyd Checklist with Basic Need to Be Met</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.3.1 Employment of Dependents</td>
<td>-opportunities for dependents</td>
<td>2.101</td>
<td>1. Economic opportunities/ security</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.2 Accessibility</td>
<td>-physical accessibility to work, services, activities</td>
<td>1.112</td>
<td>2. Physical mobility/access opportunities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3 Sports/Recreation</td>
<td>-availability of resources and activities</td>
<td>1.336</td>
<td>3. Exercise opportunities (physical recreation)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.4 Housing Quality</td>
<td>-quality of shelter</td>
<td>1.111</td>
<td>4. Decent shelter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.5 Personal Safety</td>
<td>-from: crime, violence, dangers and hazards</td>
<td>1.312/3</td>
<td>7-8 Physically/Socially safe environment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.6 Dislocation</td>
<td>-mitigation of social costs of relocation</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>9. Emotionally secure environment (anxiety free)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.7 Separation</td>
<td>-mitigation of social costs</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Safety</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.8 Community Identity</td>
<td>-belongingness to the community</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>10. Community identity opportunities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.9 Friendships</td>
<td>-ability to establish at the individual level</td>
<td>1.342</td>
<td>11. (Non-invidious) interaction opportunities esteem</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.10 Community Participation</td>
<td>-accessibility into community programs</td>
<td>1.403</td>
<td>12. Community involvement opportunities Esteem</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.11 Political Participation</td>
<td>-accessibility into community politics</td>
<td>1.202</td>
<td>13. (Political) power over own environment opportunities Esteem</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.12 Degree of Regulation</td>
<td>-paternalism -depersonalization</td>
<td>1.201</td>
<td>Self-Actualization Esteem</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.13 Lifestyle Selection</td>
<td>-ability to be involved in life style of choice</td>
<td>1.334</td>
<td>14-15. Specific/universal cultural preservation Self-actualization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.14 Neighbourhood Attractiveness</td>
<td>-aesthetics/natural beauty -pride in neighbourhood</td>
<td>2.503</td>
<td>16. Symbols/historic sites Belongingness Aesthetics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.15 Education</td>
<td>-opportunities for children and adults</td>
<td>1.321</td>
<td>17. Aesthetics (design texture)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.16 Socialization</td>
<td>-to military life -to societal norms</td>
<td>1.324</td>
<td>18-21 Tranquility and leisure time opportunities Belongingness, Esteem Cognition</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Opportunity for dependents
- Physical accessibility
- availability of resources
- Quality of shelter
- from: crime, violence, dangers and hazards
- mitigation of social costs of relocation
- mitigation of social costs
- belongingness to the community
- ability to establish at the individual level
- accessibility into community programs
- accessibility into community politics
- paternalism -depersonalization
- ability to be involved in life style of choice
- aesthetics/natural beauty -pride in neighbourhood
- opportunities for children and adults
- to military life -to societal norms
4.2.3 Measuring Impacts

The role of measurement is to find an expression for the degree of difference in distinguishable qualities of characteristics (Lichfield et al. 1975, p. 98). Economic impact assessment can perform this task readily as the direct impacts are clearly evident, easily quantified, and representable by dollar values. Social impact assessment, however, deals with "initiatives whose effects are fundamentally non-monetary in nature and thus relatively less evident than those of an economic nature and more difficult to quantify, particularly in dollar terms." (Davis 1984, p. 37) The Planning Balance Sheet offers a means to explicitly incorporate these different assessments into a common framework.

All of the costs and benefits of both producers and consumers must be considered prior to a decision being offered. The heuristic framework developed in this thesis has significantly limited the consideration of many of these elements to facilitate illustration of the process. As such, only consumers are considered. Typically, consumer costs and benefits are intangible transactions not measurable in terms of the common denominator, money. Where measurement is not possible because of intangibles, it is noted as such on the balance sheet, and therefore, not excluded (Lichfield 1966, p. 221).

Normally, an analysis would compare costs and benefits arising from a particular alternative, against those arising from simple maintenance of the status quo. In this case, options have been selected symbolizing the extremes of policy options and
comparisons are made of the costs and benefits accrued from each.

Comparisons can be made in terms of either absolutes or differences. It is mainly the difference that is being sought in this subjective assessment; however, the inclusion of the amount of difference (if known) assists in gauging the impact. Usually absolutes are difficult or costly to calculate, whereas differences can be quickly grasped.

To provide a more factual basis for these subjective judgements Olsen and colleagues suggest that each of the impacts can be described as absolutes or differences in terms of several dimensions, such as: (Olsen et al., 1981, p. 56)

1. Probability: How likely is the change to occur?
2. Primacy: Will the change be a relatively direct or more indirect consequence of the proposed action?
3. Onset: Will the change occur relatively immediately or only after some delay?
4. Duration: Will the change be temporary or permanent in length?
5. Magnitude: How large or extensive will the change be?
6. Distribution: What categories or groups of people will be most affected by the change?
7. Scope: Will the change extend beyond the community to affect other communities, the state, or the region?

The judgement of the various impacts over these dimensions can be performed in a variety of ways. Theoretically, the more people involved, the more social science techniques employed, and the more iterations performed, the greater the chance of accuracy. This heuristic model extensively uses the subjective judgement of the author to evaluate the various impacts. This
judgement is based on: literature surveys of both primary and secondary data on military families and analogous communities; personal experience; demographic inference; and informal interviews with members of the military community.

The resulting judgements are discussed in detail in section 4.3, and are entered into the three balance sheets in tables 4-2, 4-3, and 4-4. A detailed description of the cost benefit approach from which this model is conceptualized, can be found in Lichfield (1966).

4.2.4 Data Analysis

Once the Planning Balance Sheet is completed it is necessary to put all the information together in a way that "tells the story" (Finsterbusch 1981a, p. 9). This can be done through a variety of analytical social science techniques such as: classification, synthesis, comparison of cases, measurements of the association among variables, and other data manipulation techniques. However, since social impact assessment is replete with intangibles much of this synthesis is impractical, or simply camouflages the important observations determined in the assessment. The balance sheet itself identifies the significant impacts, their likely consequences for the people involved, what dimensions are most severely affected by social impact, and other important information. It is important for the decision-makers to be obliged to make their values and biases explicit in order to deal with these.

Since many of the predicted social impacts may influence one another, the final analysis must view the total set as an
interrelated system (Olsen et al. 1981, p. 56). This means that the final decision must involve a series of tradeoffs between the impacts. This decision could be made unilaterally by the policy makers, but it is argued by many that such decisions should only be made by the people who will be most directly and significantly affected by them, on the basis of their own value system.

Section 4.4 interprets the data discussed in the next section. Different methods of trading off impacts could be done using different weighting schemes. However, such ranking and weighting is not recommended as many important variables get lost in the process which defeats the purpose and strength of the Planning Balance Sheet. Lichfield and colleagues state the importance of planners and individuals other than decision-makers who are involved in the process, quite well in the following statement (1975, pp. 105-106):

"A further point of some importance for the proper understanding of the role of measurement in evaluation must be made about ranking. The function of evaluation is to provide the best information possible to those whose responsibility it is to make and justify decisions. It is for planners to provide this information, and for others to use it as they see fit. The planners' role in evaluation is not that of decision-takers, whether or not the planners have a decision-taking role delegated to them, for example when asked to recommend a course of action. But that role, which involves using evaluation evidence, should not be confused with the evaluation itself. Evaluation evidence does not indicate which alternative should be selected as preferred."
4.3 COMPLETING THE PLANNING BALANCE SHEET

The issues typically considered by social analysts in conducting social impact assessments tend to be "squishy" as they cannot be unambiguously captured in any well-defined mathematical manner (Davis 1984, p. 21). The Planning Balance Sheet approach enables the consideration of such intangibles and incommensurables by explicitly including them in the balance sheet itself and describing the noted inter-relationships in accompanying prose. In this manner, decision-makers have access to all available information prior to choosing between alternatives.

This section contains the supporting prose to the three balance sheets situated at the end of the section. Separate sheets are provided for each of the option areas: housing, physical services and social services, and are located in Tables 4-2, 4-3 and 4-4 respectively. Each table uses the social impact methodology discussed in section 4.2 for selection, and 4.3 for measurement. Each table is structured to identify: the social impact being measured, the effect(s) resulting from each of the various policy options, the inter-relationship (relative difference) of the impacts between options, and the identification of the option with the net advantage. Summation and interpretation of the balance sheets is then conducted in section 4.4.

Quantification and qualification of the various impacts is extremely difficult. The use of prose to describe the inter-relationships between the various impacts resulting from each
option provides a great deal of assistance; in addition, it was found advantageous to view the impacts in terms of "dissatisfiers". Since the concepts are bound to incorporate a significant element of subjective judgement it has been argued that it is easier to work with the notion of dissatisfaction as opposed to attempting to define some other acceptable measure of community welfare (Davis 1984, p. 32). Use of dissatisfiers is also simplified by the fact that most case studies and articles seem to focus on community problems, difficulties, and constraints, but not their strengths, making cross-reference easier.

While some subjective judgement is used on the part of the author to synthesize information obtained from a great variety of sources (see section 4.2) still further judgement is necessary to discover the hidden attitudes of military families. This is necessary, as despite whether an impactee's expectations are substantiated or not, his/her state of social well-being is based on his/her perception of the issue (Gunder 1981, p. 28; Rojek et al. 1974, p. 20). And, these perceptions cannot be properly inferred from secondary data (Fitzsimmons and Ferb 1977, p. 376). In evaluating community satisfaction Goudy (1977) states that, "The reported level of satisfaction is influenced implicitly by a set of standards held by the person, including his image of the most attractive community he has known or read about..." (p. 381). These findings are confirmed by Fitzsimmons and Ferb who compared "resident attitudes" with other "objective" community status measures and found that they did not correlate (1977, p.
374). Due to the recognized importance of perceptions, this evaluation attempts to acknowledge both the implicit and explicit factors influencing social impacts.

A thorough and complete assessment of the impacts in the sixteen categories evaluated in this heuristic model would require extensive investigation and discussion; a process which is infeasible within the scope of this thesis, and is unnecessary to describe the process and framework developed in the thesis. As such, a few key factors within each category are identified and discussed simply in terms of their relative differences. A subjective measurement of the relative differences is discussed in the accompanying prose, and identified in the Planning Balance Sheet tables.

Each of the sixteen selected impact categories are discussed separately. A general description of the impact and its critical elements are discussed, followed by specific comment on the inter-relationships between the various housing and service provision options.

Tables 4-2, 4-3, and 4-4 have been inserted prior to the description of the individual categories, and the ensuing discussion, to aid in comprehending the assessment process. A key to the Planning Balance Sheet tables is provided to clarify the accounting method and terminology used.
Key to Planning Balance Sheets

1. Costs or benefits are measurements identified in terms of money, time, or intangibles (M,T,I).

2. Costs and benefits are discussed in terms of difference only, and as such absolutes are undetermined. This also eliminates the requirement to identify separate columns for cost and benefit in the heuristic model.

3. Subscripts distinguish the different M, T, and I entries. The same number is used in an element if the particular entries are considered to be equivalent.

4. A balance column is provided to distinguish the relative difference between entries. This is necessary since absolutes have not been determined for tangibles, and intangibles cannot be arithmetically reduced. Mathematical symbols of greater than (>) and equal to (=) are used to indicate relative strength.

5. Where any social account contains more than one dimension (M,T,or I) then a mathematical statement of the relativity between dimensions is indicated in the balance column.

6. A net advantage column indicates which option has the net advantage in the particular category. Where no advantage is perceived it is indicated as no advantage (N). The housing balance sheet indicates advantages for Options A, B, or C, as described in Chapter 3. The physical and social service balance sheets indicate the advantage between internalized (INT) and either municipalization (MUN) or externalized (EXT) services respectively.

7. If the impact of an option is not observable, then no assessment is made, and is indicated by a dash (-).
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SOCIAL IMPACT</th>
<th>A PUBLIC HOUSING</th>
<th>B HOUSING SOCIETY</th>
<th>C NO HOUSING</th>
<th>BALANCE</th>
<th>NET</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Employment, Dependents</td>
<td>I 1</td>
<td>I 2</td>
<td>I 3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Accessibility</td>
<td>I 1</td>
<td>I 2</td>
<td>I 1</td>
<td>A,B</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Sports/Recreation</td>
<td>I 1</td>
<td>I 2</td>
<td>I 1</td>
<td>A,B</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Housing Quality</td>
<td>I 1</td>
<td>I 2</td>
<td>I 3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Personal Safety</td>
<td>I 1</td>
<td>I 2</td>
<td>I 1</td>
<td>A,B</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Dislocation</td>
<td>I 1</td>
<td>I 2</td>
<td>I 3</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Separation</td>
<td>I 1</td>
<td>I 2</td>
<td>I 3</td>
<td>A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Community Identity</td>
<td>I 1</td>
<td>I 2</td>
<td>I 1</td>
<td>A,B</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Friendships</td>
<td>I 1</td>
<td>I 2</td>
<td>I 1</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Community Participation</td>
<td>I 1</td>
<td>I 2</td>
<td>I 1</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Political Participation</td>
<td>I 1</td>
<td>I 2</td>
<td>I 1</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Degree of Regulation</td>
<td>I 1</td>
<td>I 2</td>
<td>I 1</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Lifestyle Selection</td>
<td>I 1</td>
<td>I 2</td>
<td>I 1</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Neighbourhood Attractiveness</td>
<td>I 1</td>
<td>I 2</td>
<td>I 1</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Education</td>
<td>I 1</td>
<td>I 1</td>
<td>I 1</td>
<td>A,B</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Socialization</td>
<td>I 1</td>
<td>I 2</td>
<td>I 1</td>
<td>C</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

157
### TABLE 4-3

**PLANNING BALANCE SHEET OF PHYSICAL SERVICES**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SOCIAL IMPACT</th>
<th>INTERNAL</th>
<th>MUNICIPAL</th>
<th>BALANCE</th>
<th>NET</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Employment, Dependents</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Accessibility</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Sports/Recreation</td>
<td>$I_1$</td>
<td>$I_2$</td>
<td>$I_1 &gt; I_2$</td>
<td>INT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Housing Quality</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Personal Safety</td>
<td>$I_1$</td>
<td>$I_2$</td>
<td>$I_1 &gt; I_2$</td>
<td>INT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Dislocation</td>
<td>$I_1$</td>
<td>$I_2$</td>
<td>$I_1 &gt; I_2$</td>
<td>INT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Separation</td>
<td>$I_1$</td>
<td>$I_2$</td>
<td>$I_1 &gt; I_2$</td>
<td>INT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Community Identity</td>
<td>$I_1$</td>
<td>$I_2$</td>
<td>$I_1 &gt; I_2$</td>
<td>INT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Friendships</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Community Participation</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Political Participation</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Degree of Regulation</td>
<td>$I_1$</td>
<td>$I_2$</td>
<td>$I_2 = I_1$</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Lifestyle Selection</td>
<td>$I_1$</td>
<td>$I_2$</td>
<td>$I_2 &gt; I_1$</td>
<td>MUN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Neighbourhood Attractiveness</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Education</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Socialization</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### TABLE 4-4

**PLANNING BALANCE SHEET OF SOCIAL SERVICES**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SOCIAL IMPACT</th>
<th>INTERNAL</th>
<th>EXTERNAL</th>
<th>BALANCE</th>
<th>NET</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Employment, Dependents</td>
<td>$M_1$</td>
<td>$M_2$</td>
<td>$M_1 &gt; M_2$</td>
<td>INT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Accessibility</td>
<td>$M_1$</td>
<td>$M_2$</td>
<td>$M_1 &gt; M_2$</td>
<td>INT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Sports/Recreation</td>
<td>$I_1$</td>
<td>$I_2$</td>
<td>$I_1 &gt; I_2$</td>
<td>INT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Housing Quality</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Personal Safety</td>
<td>$I_1$</td>
<td>$I_2$</td>
<td>$I_1 &gt; I_2$</td>
<td>INT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Dislocation</td>
<td>$I_1$</td>
<td>$I_2$</td>
<td>$I_1 &gt; I_2$</td>
<td>INT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Separation</td>
<td>$I_1$</td>
<td>$I_2$</td>
<td>$I_1 &gt; I_2$</td>
<td>INT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Community Identity</td>
<td>$I_1$</td>
<td>$I_2$</td>
<td>$I_1 &gt; I_2$</td>
<td>INT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Friendships</td>
<td>$I_1$</td>
<td>$I_2$</td>
<td>$I_1 &gt; I_2$</td>
<td>INT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Community Participation</td>
<td>$I_1$</td>
<td>$I_2$</td>
<td>$I_1 &gt; I_2$</td>
<td>INT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. Political Participation</td>
<td>$I_1$</td>
<td>$I_2$</td>
<td>$I_1 = I_2$</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12. Degree of Regulation</td>
<td>$I_1$</td>
<td>$I_2$</td>
<td>$I_2 &gt; I_1$</td>
<td>EXT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13. Lifestyle Selection</td>
<td>$I_1$</td>
<td>$I_2$</td>
<td>$I_2 &gt; I_1$</td>
<td>EXT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14. Neighbourhood Attractiveness</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15. Education</td>
<td>$I_1$</td>
<td>$I_2$</td>
<td>$I_1 &gt; I_2$</td>
<td>INT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16. Socialization</td>
<td>$I_1$</td>
<td>$I_2$</td>
<td>$I_2 = I_1$</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.3.1 Employment of Dependents

This impact element is concerned exclusively with the employment of dependents and not the job of the military member. In a military family study conducted by DND in 1983/4 it was determined that 50% of civilian wives of servicemen found it stressful to maintain a career while married to a forces member (Popoff et al. 1986, pp. 22-23). Different aspects of this stress were: attempts to find work at a new location (47%), having to give up a career due to moves (47%), and having to give up a career to further their spouses career (26%). These stresses were further accentuated in 20% of the cases as the wives perceived that they had been refused past employment because of their association with the forces which is known to relocate families frequently. Other employment related difficulties are also experienced by the teenage children of military families who seek part-time work.

Housing. The three housing alternatives each reduce the negative impacts associated with employment difficulties in their own ways. Both A (public housing) and B (housing society) can employ community-supported nepotism similar to that experienced in one-industry towns (Himelfarb 1982, p. 23) to ensure that jobs within the community are maintained for community members. Families living off base and interacting with members of the local community on a regular basis are more apt to hear about, and establish contacts to increase local employment opportunities. Part-time work for teenagers is more abundant in the local municipality.
Although the intangible impact on each housing option is different they are perceived to be similar in scale and no net advantage is perceived.

Physical Services. The method of physical service provision does not appear to impact employment.

Social Services. In the provision of social services there are a variety of opportunities to improve employment opportunities if the services are internalized. Examples drawn from Langin (1981, pp. 87-88) are:

1. a commitment and active program on the part of the social service sector (and DND) to hire and integrate military spouses in all phases of their operations
2. provide a wider variety of services (on a user pay basis) to increase opportunities,
3. create more part-time jobs through job-sharing programs,
4. provide child care facilities which enable more participation in the labour force,
5. encourage and enable one-woman home occupations which can add to the provision of goods and personal services offered in the community without adversely affecting neighbours (e.g. hair cutting, dog trimming, seamstress, photography studio, cake decorating, babysitting)
6. initiate special interest and skills classes (e.g. exercise, music, dance and craft classes)

Since the encouragement and enabling of such activities can be assisted more readily through a more internalized structure a net advantage is perceived for internalized social services.
4.3.2 Accessibility

This impact element assesses the benefits which location and the resulting physical accessibility had on the policy alternatives. Most married quarter sites are co-located with the military member's place of employment. Typically the operational site and living quarters are within walking distance or a short drive of each other. Similarly, sports and recreation facilities are also conveniently located. Having a common living area linked with a place of employment results in similar destinations for many workers and enables car pooling or other cost saving measures to be employed.

Housing. Both options A and B would enjoy conveniently located work, pleasure, and living locations, while option C would require varying commuting distances both to work and to recreational activities. This increased travel is perceived to have monetary, time and intangible costs providing a net advantage equally to Options A and B.

Physical Services. There is no perceived effect on the provision of physical services related to accessibility.

Social Services. With the provision of social services, the benefits noted of co-located work, pleasure and home are repeated in the scope of social services. If such services are externalized then additional travel is necessary, and not to one common destination. A net advantage is perceived for internalized social services.
4.3.3 Sports and Recreation

This impact element assesses the availability of sports and recreation resources and activities. Such activities are often established to keep "idle hands busy" and individuals out of trouble (Lucas 1971, pp. 192-194). Based on this logic, the military has operated a vast infrastructure of publicly funded facilities for its military members. In addition, many non-public organizations have also been created under the control of the community "Recreational Council". Through both of these avenues activities are organized to serve the entire military community. Due to the size of the military community, and the scale of facilities available, access is normally better than that experienced in most adjacent communities; although, the variety in large municipalities may be more diverse. In addition, members of the military community, through the payment of GILT, also have access to municipal facilities.

Housing. Options A and B provide families with better access in terms of time and the intangible difficulty and involvement of a parent who must package up her children and drive them to a distant facility. In many cases married quarter residents can simply walk. A net advantage is perceived for Options A and B.

Physical Services. Physical services impacts the community in a minor way through the operation and scheduling of its maintenance program. Facilities, either sports fields or buildings, require ongoing maintenance. A smaller scale operation, ultimately controlled by the same master, enables more
flexibility and contact between users and maintainers. If such services were performed by a municipality, with the responsibility of many of such facilities, flexibility could be jeopardized. A net advantage is perceived for internalized physical services.

**Social Services.** Most of the social service impacts on sports and recreation relate to access. Since many DND non-public activities are offered underused space in public buildings at non-peak times at little or no cost, they in turn can offer services at a rate lower than the local municipality. Access is almost always available to members of the military community. In addition, military families also have access to services offered by the local municipality. A net advantage is perceived for internalized social services.

### 4.3.4 Housing Quality

This element deals with the quality of the housing stock itself, and the perception of the family's satisfaction with its shelter. It also considers the negative affects inherent in a landlord-tenant relationship (Queen's University 1953, pp. 122-123). This negative affect is observed in survey results which indicated that 45% of married quarter occupants felt that DND as landlord did not handle household repairs and maintenance promptly (Popoff et al. 1986, p. B-13).

**Housing.** Details of the existing DND housing stock are provided in section 2.2.3, and can be generalized as "adequate but ugly" and "out of date". As a result, the CMHC stipulated rents (based on equivalent accommodation in the local community)
are somewhat lower than similar sized homes in the local community. The Housing Society option would enable upgrading of the housing stock, but would also result in increased rents once they were not subjected to the constraints of federal bureaucracy. As such, a monetary benefit exists for Option A as out of pocket housing costs are less than the other two options.

Having families obtain their own shelter allows them to choose the environment, location, size and type of home that they prefer within their budget. In addition, the no housing option also enjoys the benefit of "removing the monkey [of being landlord] from [DND's] back" (Oncken and Wass 1974). Experience has shown that in company towns where control of housing was relinquished to home owners, the interest in and care of the property improved (Lucas 1971, p. 79). Therefore, an intangible benefit is perceived for Option C.

In sum, while marginal monetary benefits are enjoyed by the public housing option these are surpassed by the intangible benefits of good quality housing stock as chosen by the families themselves through Option C.

Physical and Social Services. Neither social nor physical services are affected by this impact.

4.3.5 Personal Safety

This impact element assesses the perceived impacts associated with personal safety from crime, violence, dangers, or hazards. A Queen's University study of single-enterprise communities in Canada--although somewhat dated--identifies the typical policing situation in company towns which generally
mirrors that perceived of the current military community (1953, p. 206):

"Most police agree that there is a minimum of crime in company towns because of the fact that everybody is fully employed. There are no breeding grounds for crime such as poor housing, slums, or unemployment within the company-owned townsite. Teenagers are usually kept out of mischief by means of the company's intensive recreational programme which keeps juveniles' leisure time fully occupied. Furthermore, since most company towns are relatively small in population, there is the added pressure of social sanctions tending to make the townspeople law-abiding. Social pressure is particularly effective because the majority of residents are part of the one big industrial family. The ultimate sanction is the fear of being disciplined by the company."

Although the study concludes that "maintenance of a company police force, except for use as watchmen or plant guards, is contrary to the Canadian concept of impartial law enforcement" (p. 264), it is not directly applicable to military communities patrolling the married quarter community, as the military sites being assessed are not isolated, and other civil authorities are also available.

**Housing.** Options A and B enjoy the additional security offered by military police patrols in the community. The community structure is also: very homogeneous, everyone knows each other, and access is generally restricted; thus public order becomes the concern of everyone, further increasing perceptions of safety (Time-Life 1976, p. 77). Eighty-nine percent of military families surveyed rated the safety of the married quarter neighbourhood as a "very good" to "good" (Popoff et al. 1986, p. B-14). As such, a net advantage is perceived for options A and B.
Physical Services. Each service municipalized legitimizes entry to an additional group. This increased intrusion erodes the ability of community members to self-police. As such, a net advantage is perceived for the internalization of physical services.

Social Services. The externalization of police services decreases the total amount of policing received by the military community. They presently enjoy the services of both military and local police. Military police are also understanding of the infrastructures of the military organization available to cope with the variety of problems experienced by the military community. Although the increased policing creates a fish-bowl affect it is perceived that internalized services provides a net advantage.

4.3.6 Dislocation

This impact element assesses the assistance provided to overcome the difficulty of dislocation. Military families move more frequently that any other identifiable group. In the military family study "postings" were identified as the highest stress area by civilian spouses. Some key elements were: the difficulties associated with the move itself (47%), postings preventing the purchase of a home (49%), inadequate sponsorship provided on a posting (48%), inadequate support in finding accommodation (56%), inadequate time to prepare for a move (81%), and inadequate information about a new location (66%). (Popoff et al. 1986, pp. B-9/10) The stresses indicated can be assisted or exacerbated by administrative, financial, or psychological
stresses associated with different accommodation policy options.

Housing. Monetary, time, and intangible considerations are affected by this impact. A recurring monetary concern to military families relating to housing, is the inability to build equity due to frequent moves. Programs such as guaranteed buy-back (see section 3.4.3) possible through option C would enable more military families to enter the private housing market. In concerns related to time, both options A and B enable the occupant to acquire accommodation more quickly as sufficient public or society housing would be available for all families. More intangibles elements include: familiarity with the housing stock and the structure of the organization controlling housing. Options A and B enjoy the benefits of a common style housing throughout the various sites. Furthermore, Option B with its single-purpose organizational structure is available to concentrate on providing a housing service, thus ensuring that allocations are made quickly and efficiently and that the occupant receives as much information about the house and site as early as possible. The combinations of intangibles and time are perceived to out weigh the limited monetary benefit of option C to provide a net advantage to option B.

Physical Services. A minor intangible benefit for internalized physical services is perceived during transfers, as occupants would only have to deal with one agency to complete the administration necessary to terminate and initiate services.

Social Services. Social services run internally can focus more on the difficulties associated with frequent transfers and can offer programs to ease the stress. The smaller-scale, more
flexible social welfare, sports, and recreation programs can be structured to accommodate new arrivals eliminating the long registration lead times considered the norm in most municipal activities. As well, the DND School System is understanding of the difficulties associated with inter-provincial transfers and is well structured to ease the transition. A net advantage is perceived for internalized social services.

4.3.7 Separation

This impact element assesses the assistance provided to overcome the difficulties associated with the temporary separation of families. With an average separation frequency of six times per year and for periods totalling five months annually (see section 2.4.4), it is logical that this impact concerns military families almost as significantly as the turmoil associated with frequent transfers. In a survey of military families 43% of civilian spouses reported moderate to high stress resulting from separation (Popoff et al. 1986, p. B-12).

Housing. The intangible benefit accruing to Options A and B from the knowledge that others in your neighbourhood suffer from the same difficulty of temporarily being a one-parent household makes it easier to meet the stress of separation (Siemens 1970, pp. 67-68). Option A benefits even further since the employer has more direct control over the neighbourhood. When a military units families' are all living in a common location, it enables the unit to provide assistance more readily to families in the absence of the military member. As such, a net advantage is perceived for Option A.
Physical and Social Services. For similar more direct control reasons, a net advantage is perceived for internalized services as it enables more direct assistance to be provided for temporarily separated military families.

4.3.8 Community Identity

This impact element assesses the belongingness felt by members of the community and is evaluated mainly in terms of an observed spatial boundary and cohesiveness of membership. Such social cohesiveness was the goal of the planners of Tumbler Ridge (Budgen 1983, p. 10), and as such, social development of the community was given the same priority as physical development (Harkness and Paget 1982, section 8.0). This was done through a number of innovations at the early stages: designation of a Director of Social Development to spear-head "community building", and formation of a "community services committee" who could provide community involvement and coordinate services.

McCalla (1976) while studying social interaction in self-sufficient suburbs, observed a positive co-relation between social interaction and community identity (pp. 36-38). Bowles (1981, p.48) labels this type of positive interaction as "social vitality" and clarifies the concept by contrasting "vital" and "nonvital" communities. In a nonvital community there are still many opportunities for collective intermingling but they are sponsored, organized and conducted by an official agency and do not foster a sense of "community". "Thus, in the nonvital community, members do not share participation in collective events, do not work together in organizing collective events, do
not spontaneously provide services and assistance to each other, and so not share life's sorrows and joys with each other." (1981, p. 48) In a vital community networks inter-relate almost every one in the community, leaving few that are socially isolated. "These networks can be based on kinship, on the fact that people work together, on recreational activities, on common participation in churches, or on visits between families." (1981, pp. 49-50)

**Housing.** Most married quarter communities have been constructed on the self-contained neighbourhood unit concept attributed to C. Perry (Goodall 1987, p. 321; Endersby 1965, p. 61). This facilitates easy spatial community identify by military families. Families dispersed throughout the local community may have varying ties to their own new community; however, the married quarter identity—due to the similarities between the many locations—enables such identity to be carried from location to location. There is also an identity built through the common employment, uniform, and life style of those within the married quarter community. The married quarter "Community Council" also provides for the participation and coordination that designers of Tumbler Ridge felt was necessary to create community identity. The married quarter community contains most of the dimensions of a strong "vital community" expressed by Bowles (1981, p. 52). As such, a net advantage is perceived for options A and B.

**Physical Services.** A minor intangible benefit for internalized physical services is perceived through the
limitation of legitimate access into the community.

Social Services. The concept of the neighbourhood unit envisioned by town planners: Perry, Gallion, and Stein, all had elementary schools as the central element of the community (Stein 1978, p.150, pp.47-51; Endersby 1965, pp. 60-62). It was seen that "the spirit of the [community] influences the school and the school plays an important part in forming that spirit." (Stein 1978, p. 157) If DND no longer maintained its own school system it is feasible that the local school board would locate outside of the married quarter community on to non DND property, removing the focal point of the neighbourhood unit. If other social services were also externalized there would be no clearly identifiable community focal point (Wiesman 1977, p. 21), as the services would be offered at a variety of locations some distance from the married quarter community. In terms of social activities, married quarter communities have been organized to maximize the dimensions of a "vital community" as envisioned by Bowles (1981, p. 52). As such, a net advantage is perceived for internalized social services.

4.3.9 Friendships

This impact element assesses the ability to initiate non-invidious interactions leading to friendships. For an individual to achieve a sense of belongingness and self-esteem it is necessary for them to establish a number of both intimate and non-intimate interpersonal community ties. Such ties are possible through interaction both in person and on the telephone (Wellman 1982, p. 24). Wellman argues that in order to study
contemporary community ties we must look beyond the neighbourhood to see them as a network of ties regardless of location. Although this has merit it provides for little relative difference between the policy options; as such, friendship is evaluated in terms of the ability of the families to establish non-invidious relationships within the local community.

**Housing.** Options A and B provide an extremely homogeneous environment in which members: share the same employer, share a unique life style, share the difficulties associated with this life style, and have roughly the same age and social status. As a result, interaction between community members is facilitated; and the more often they interact, the more they will share common values (Lucas 1971, p. 329); and the easier it will be to nurture friendships. However, such contact cannot be considered unbiased, as housing and socializing are often segregated according to the rank of the military member. As in many company towns, wives frequently act out the husband's status role which consequently remains class-bound (Porteous 1976, p. 337). This is a result of the fact that (again like company towns) residents are all employed by the same company eliminating "the subtle gradations and vagueness of social stratification prevalent in a more open society." (Robinson 1962, p. 82; McCann 1978, p. 47) The emphasis on allocating homes by rank would decrease in Option B as the Society would opt for a more flexible and efficient allocation technique.

A problem frequently cited as a major one of social life in isolated company towns (which are perceived to have a social atmosphere similar to married quarter communities) is gossiping.
However, Porteous (1976, p. 336) agreed with Matthiasson (1970, p. 2) that this was not a generally recognized problem among community members. Lucas (1971, p. 347) even found gossip to be "the most effective means of social control in a small and isolated community."

For those at the mercy of the external community seeking out new friendships in a community is a task. Although organizations such as Welcome Wagon and kind-hearted neighbours try to ease the transition it is not as noteworthy as that which exists by virtue of commonality in the military community. As such, although the non-military community is considered unbiased in its housing market, it is perceived that the ease of establishing friendship ties in the married quarter community provides a net advantage for Option B.

**Physical Services.** There is no perceived effect on friendship relating to the provision of physical services.

**Social Services.** For social services the environment noted above is extended to the recreational arena, where community members again have the opportunity to meet their neighbours and workmates to nurture friendship. This increased interaction in yet another forum provides for "increasing normative agreement, while personalizing the relationships even further." (Lucas 1971, p. 330) The issue of rank segregation is significantly less in the area of social services. As such, a net advantage is perceived for internalized social services.
4.3.10 Community Participation

This impact element assesses the opportunities to participate in community programs and services. Lucas (1971, p. 199) and Kerri (1971, p. 24) found that community activities, in addition to providing direct leisure services outside the home, also performed an integrative function of bringing together people who would have otherwise be unlikely to interact. While Nickels and colleagues (1976), in studying life satisfaction in frontier communities did not find a strong positive correlation between quality of life and social participation (p. 92), they questioned their survey methods, and cited a number of other studies which did find positive correlations (p. 16). This premise is also assumed in this evaluation. It should be noted that, while element 4.3.3 (sports/recreation) comments on the differences between the availability of activities and resources, this element looks at the realistic opportunities for participation in community activities.

Housing. Any military member is entitled to participate in non-public activities organized by the "Recreational Council". However, this benefit is not as advantageous to a family living a long distance from the military site. While the military member may be willing to commute for employment, participation by family members with heavy requirements for long distance commuting is not as conceivable. As such, a net advantage is perceived to exist for options A and B as they are co-located with an expansive infrastructure of community activities.
Physical Services. There is no perceived affect on the provision of physical services related to community participation.

Social Services. The internalization of social services ensures that military members have access to services without having to suffer the consequences associated with transiency. Although all rate-payers have access to similar activities and services in local municipalities they often require long lead times for registration, and are generally organized on a "first come first served" basis. For those programs which continue annually entry into the system by a transient is difficult. As such, a net advantage is perceived for internalized social services.

4.3.11 Political Participation

"The way in which community residents respond to [changes] is critical in shaping the social consequences of the impacting event. Responses can vary, including total apathy and passivity, privatized individual adaptations, collective responses which are unorganized or ineffective, and effectively organized collective responses. Participation by the public in the decision-making process is commonly regarded as necessary to prevent negative social impacts."

Roy T. Bowles (1981, p. 57)

This impact element assesses the ability to participate politically at the local level, and the resultant involvement in "neighbourhood self-management". Currently, members of society "exercise almost no control over the development and planning of the neighbourhood, nor over such varied fields of activity as housing, consumption, community or health services, cultural activities etc." (Fish 1982, p. 220) All that is expected of
the average citizen is a vote every few years, and otherwise everything is left in the hands of public officials.

**Housing.** DND has created a very rigid and controlled environment in its married quarter communities. To compensate somewhat for this it has also directed that Base Commanders create a "Community Council" which "brings together all segments of a MQ community interest and provides a medium for cooperative study, planning and action to enhance the life of the MQ community." (CFAO 50-21) This council is structured so that representation is possible from every conceivable interest, and through membership by election. As the married quarter community is such a closed "fishbowl" environment it is perceived that the Housing Society slightly at arms length from the military hierarchy would enable more unfettered participation. While members living in the local community have an equal voice in their local community matters their relative youth in the area and limited network of contacts restricts their effectiveness and realistic ability to participate. As such, a net advantage is perceived for Option B.

**Physical Services.** There is no perceived affect on the provision of physical services related to political participation.

**Social Services.** The "Recreational Council," a parallel organization to the "Community Council," exists for sports and recreational activities. This forum provides an opportunity for military families to participate in the planning, organization and operation of these activities (CFAO 50-20) regardless of whether they actually belong to a specific activity or not. Since
this level of involvement is not available in services offered in most municipalities, internalized social services is perceived to have a net advantage.

4.3.12 Degree of Regulation

This impact assesses the affects of paternalism and depersonalization resulting from the degree of regulation exercised. The control that DND exerts on its employees moves far from the work place and well into the community. This is evident from its direct control and operation of housing and some services, and indirect control of almost everything else in the married quarter community. When questioned 58% of service members and 61% of civilian spouses agreed or strongly agreed with the statement that "The Forces usually acts as if its rules and regulations were more important than people." (Popoff et al. 1986, p. 24)

Studies of single-industry communities with similar problems resulting from strong company influences, have indicated that although outsiders observe the phenomenon it is not felt by the residents themselves (Porteous 1976, 340; Wiesman 1977, p. 15). In a study of migration from such communities "company dominated town" was cited as the lowest of twelve categories of reasons for leaving (Matthiasson 1971, p. 32). Further, in comparing communities which had changed from being company controlled to private ownership, Lucas identified that such a change was unpopular (1971, p. 77):

"Before the change, the citizens complained about the undue authority held by the company over the small details of life, including such things as the colour
scheme of the house, the planting of a hedge, the cleanliness of the house, and the paternalism that invaded all aspects of living. Once the changes of status were announced, however, there were many objections. As one informant put it, "It is a good thing that the change-over did not have to be put to a vote, or we would never have had the changes made."

Some of the reasons for workers embracing company paternalism center around the reminder that in conjunction with rights and privileges come duties and obligations. As well, some people are attracted to communities such as this because there's less need for individual responsibility than elsewhere, as the company takes care of so many things (Porteous 1976, p. 340; Lucas 1971, p. 78). In addition, some members of the community may know no other culture, and become paternalism-dependent.

Despite some of the benefits of a highly regulated community, and its attractiveness to some members of society, there are others who prefer a freer environment. In 1962 Robinson expressed this feeling and suggested that no more company towns should be built as a result (1962, p. 5). With social trends now focusing on human rights and freedoms, it is perceived that the once popular paternalist-benevolence provided by a company would now be seen as highly sceptical. This may be evident in the 60% of service members and 66% of civilian spouses who "strongly agreed" or "agreed" with the statement that "The Forces expects more from me than it is willing to give back." (Popoff et al. 1986, p. 25).

Housing. Having families secure accommodation on their own (Option C) provides the least amount of regulation. Option B, slightly at arms length from the military hierarchy provides less regulation than that of the completely publicly controlled
married quarter environment. Although a paternalistic atmosphere is enjoyed by some, it is perceived that the modern military family would prefer the less ordered and depersonalized community environment available through Option C.

**Physical Services.** Municipalized physical services are typically owned and operated either: by the municipality, a monopoly, or a large conglomerate, whose organizational structures (from the perception of the individual consumer) are hard to differentiate from that of DND. As such, no net advantage is perceived.

**Social Services.** Often, dependents of military members enroll and participate in DND community services not as individuals, but as a dependent of a military member. Even being referred to as a "dependent" is revolting to most (Berton and Smith 1985, p. 74). As such, a net advantage is perceived for externalized services.

4.3.13 *Life Style Selection*

This impact element assesses the opportunity of military families to live in and enjoy the life style of their choice, including cultural activities, language, and religion. There is evidence that most people prefer to live among those who share a similar style of life (Siemens 1976, p. 283). While the military has a tradition and life style all its own, members of the married quarter community are recruited from society at large, and bring with them different values and expectations. Until they become socialized to, and completely accept, this new way of life they may wish to share life in an environment which
more closely resembles that from which they came.

**Housing.** Living in the civilian community affords the best opportunity for families to select accommodation based on preferred life style. Even if a military married quarter community did not exist, families which shared their enjoyment for such a life style could migrate to a common location in the municipality, likely adjacent to the military camp. This external formation of relatively homogeneous neighbourhoods is possible through the combination of the open market system and personal choice (McCann 1978, p. 54). As such, Option C with its inherent freedom to choose is perceived to have a net advantage.

**Physical and Social Services.** Both municipalized physical services and externalized social services are the norm in Canadian society and are perceived to have a net advantage.

4.3.14 Neighbourhood Attractiveness

This impact element assesses the neighbourhood attractiveness as viewed by the occupant. "Basic human needs and aesthetic considerations have to be satisfied to make a successful community." (Bollinger 1976, p. 39) For an individual to take pride in what he calls his neighbourhood or community he must be satisfied with its aesthetic qualities. An important part of this is landscaping, which Stein (1978, p. 91) concludes "is a sound investment--financially as well as in good living".

**Housing Options.** Married quarter communities--like many company towns--suffer from monotonous and mundane atmospheres (McCann 1978, p. 47). This results from the houses being built
"en masse" from a limited number of designs. While this makes maintenance easier and cheaper, it detracts from the aesthetic qualities of the neighbourhood. Further, since a very transient population occupies the homes, little yard maintenance or landscaping is done. DND as landlord has also been reluctant to increase maintenance costs by providing elaborate landscaping even in common areas. As such, a net advantage is perceived for option C.

Physical and Social Services. Neither physical or social services are perceived to have an impact on neighbourhood attractiveness.

4.3.15 Education

This impact element assesses the learning/educational opportunities for both children and adults. The concept of the "neighbourhood unit" centers on the elementary school as a focal point (Stein 1978, p. 150). In a very transient population (especially one which frequently transfers between provinces) the school system plays a large role. Parents who feel somewhat guilty about having to tear their children from a group of friends, move them to a new area and enroll them in a new school, can be relieved of some anxiety if they see that the new school is particularly well suited to deal with these peculiarities.

Married military families are made up of: 17% childless, 36% preschool, 42% school age, and 5% empty nest households (Popoff et al. 1986, p. 14). As such, approximately 78% of the families are involved or will be involved with arranging schooling for their children. In the military family survey 45% of spouses

182
felt that their family was in an unsuitable posting area because of the "different school standards for child's education" (p. B-10).

For adult education frequent postings can also be a disincentive as it is difficult to transfer credits between institutions and re-enroll.

**Housing.** Although the housing options do not directly impact education, the fact that the entire military community would be co-located in options A and B enables children in the community to attend the same school, regardless of whether it was operated by DND or the local school board. This allows the school board to concentrate on the particular problems of military families. As such, a net advantage is perceived for Options A and B.

**Physical Services.** There is no perceived impact on education from the provision of physical services.

**Social Services.** The DND School System was originally established to provide education services for military families, and has been structured specifically to deal with their unique difficulties. To assist transient military members, DND has coordinated a university education program through The University of Manitoba which enables military members at various locations to obtain degrees without residency. Programs such as these are only feasible if services are internalized and organized on large scale. As such, a net advantage is perceived for internalized social services.
4.3.16 Socialization

This impact element assesses the opportunity to receive information and be socialized in the way of life of one's choice. It is similar to the lifestyle element discussed above, but instead of evaluating whether the existing life style is the one preferred, it evaluates whether there is the opportunity for future socialization in the manner of your choice. There are two main areas of socialization of interest: to military way of life, and to societal norms.

Housing. Option A provides the best benefits for a complete indoctrination and socialization into the military way of life. Work, play, school, neighbourhood, social life and church are all centered around the married quarter community. Option B is all of the above but slightly removed, as DND has "loosened the reins" on the neighbourhood somewhat. Option C enables the family to be immersed in the local municipality, but still have contact with the military establishment at a level regulated by personal preference. As such, a net advantage is perceived for Option C.

Physical Services. There is no perceived impact on socialization from the provision of physical services.

Social Services. Internalized services would enable the promotion of the military way of life, while externalized services would provide a realistic view of general society. It is perceived that both are necessary. To help ease the difficulties of military life it is necessary to become accustomed to its ways. Similarly, since family members will not
always be under the protective wing of the married quarter community they must become familiar with "the real world". No net advantage is perceived between internalized or externalized social services.
4.4 INTERPRETATION OF RESULTS

In a typical Planning Balance Sheet Analysis, with its extensive list of: costs/benefits, producers/consumers, absolutes/differences and tangibles/intangibles it is an advantage to complete a "summation" balance sheet which groups as many of the components as possible and provides a further balance and net advantage. However, it is important that this summation does not remove any of the intangible and subjective measurements which have been identified; as this is the task of the decision-makers. It is essential that the decision-maker is forced to make explicit these judgements about intangibles and incommensurables for the Planning Balance Sheet Analysis to be effective. Planners and social analysts must not become so involved in conducting the analysis that they overstep their responsibilities in presenting the information, in an attempt to simplify it for decision-makers (Boothroyd 1978, p. 130). They should not disguise the fact that recommendations are value laden.

Since many of the factors are unquantifiable and cannot be "summed", it's impossible to have a clearly indicated final result: or winner. A number of weighting and ranking schemes are used in other matrix type assessments to determine a "scientific" solution. However, this is presumptuous as the scientific solution is subject to the perceptions, judgements and values of the analyst. If public input is involved in this process the resulting "scientific" judgement is deemed more acceptable. However, the most appropriate procedure would be to have
decision-makers in conjunction with the impacted public not only weigh and rank the elements, but also choose the preferred course of action.

Aside from assisting in the selection of a preferred accommodation policy, the balance sheet is useful for a number of other very practical planning and policy uses. First, it identifies the elements of the community most in need of support. This enables the governing body to get the best "bang for its buck" by incorporating policy which eliminates elements exhibiting the most perceived dissatisfaction. Second, it identifies elements of concern which must be addressed if a particular policy option is chosen. Third, it identifies elements which exhibit little impact and as a consequence can essentially be ignored.

Once the balance sheet has been completed certain elements will appear as being more significant than others. In turn, other elements may be vague and require additional clarification. The impact assessment process should be iterative, so at this stage refinement through the re-evaluation of some areas of the assessment and confirmation of any uncertainties would be appropriate.

Since the heuristic model has already been simplified through the elimination of a large number of variables a summation balance sheet is not necessary. As most of the elements remaining involve intangibles and are measured in terms of relative difference (vice absolutes), any reduction would generally shroud important information.
The individual results of each of the balance sheets are discussed separately below. Although many of the factors relating to housing and service provision are inter-related, and policies for one would have to be considered in conjunction with the other, they are discussed separately to interpret the perceived policy impacts peculiar to each.

Within each of the policy areas no individual policy option could clearly be considered the best alternative as definite advantages were observed by each of the options in the different impact elements. Since the accommodation question is larger in scope than simply the social impact concerns of the family, it is unnecessary to determine a solution exclusively from the social perspective. Instead it is necessary to understand the relative advantages and disadvantages so that they can be properly incorporated in a final policy decision. As such, each of the options are discussed separately.

4.4.1 Housing

Option A - Complete Public Housing. This option enjoyed a net advantage in six of the sixteen elements. Its strength exists as a result of its: location; availability of sports and recreational resources; perceived safety; schooling; and especially its ability to provide support to families during the absence of the military member. Weaknesses can be seen in the elements of: quality of shelter; attractiveness of the neighbourhood; degree of regulation; and, ability to provide socialization for both military and societal ways of life.
Option B - Create A Housing Society. This option enjoyed a net advantage in nine of the sixteen areas (the most of any option). The impacts are similar in many aspects to those of option A as they shared a net advantage in five of the elements. In fact the only element in which Option B was not at least equal to or better than Option A, was in reducing negative impacts resulting from temporary family separation. In addition to having strengths equivalent to Option A the following strengths also existed: assistance for dislocation; ability to establish non-invidious friendships; and, ability to participate in community and political activities. Of particular interest is that Option B was not seen as least advantageous policy in any of the sixteen elements.

Option C - No Housing Provided. This option enjoyed a net advantage in five of the sixteen areas. Real strengths were exhibited in the areas of: quality of shelter; attractiveness of the neighbourhood; degree of regulation; life style; and, the ability to socialize towards both the military and societal ways of life. Weaknesses were seen in: location; availability of sports and recreational resources; safety; ability to provide support for dislocation and temporary separation; community identification; ability to establish friendships; ability to participate in community and political activities; and, education.

Conclusion. The final decision would involve significant trade-offs in many of the elements. However, this framework enables the identification of those elements requiring greatest
consideration in order that they can be addressed as priority elements. From the social perspective undertaken in this assessment it appears that the creation of a housing society would be the best alternative. This is a result of its greater number of strengths and especially because it weaknesses are not as significant as those exhibited by the other options. However, if some of the noted problem areas are addressed through policies external to accommodation (e.g. to eliminate/reduce military transfers and separation) then a different alternative could be perceived as acceptable.

4.4.2 Physical Services

Internalized services had a net advantage in five elements as compared to only one for municipalized service. Advantages for internalized services were exhibited in: availability of sports and recreational facilities; safety; dislocation; separation; and, community identity. Whereas, municipalized services had an advantage in lifestyle. What is most significant in the assessment of this policy area is that ten out of the sixteen elements either experienced no impact, or were seen as being equivalent. Even the six impact elements in which some impact was identified the effects were minimal. As such, the social impact resulting from physical services policy appears to be of little significance. Therefore, since past economic analyses of physical services have determined that significant financial benefit can be obtained through the municipalization of services, it is apparent why it has proceeded.
4.4.3 **Social Services**

Internalized services had a net advantage in ten elements as compared to two for externalized services. Externalized services only displayed an advantage in: degree of regulation and lifestyle; of which both were only marginally more advantageous than internalized services.

Unlike physical services and housing, there appears to be a significant impact on the military family resulting from the provision of social services; it appears that these impacts can be best satisfied through providing social services internally. This is not to say that services must continue to be provided in the current manner, but that the consequences of a change in this area appear to be significant.
4.5 SUMMARY

While it cannot be said that the Planning Balance Sheet Analysis has provided the answer for a very difficult question, a basis for an informed value judgement has been laid. The impact elements have been identified, their relative affect noted, the nature of the benefits isolated and described, and a comprehensive picture presented. The heuristic model, in assessing the social impacts on military families resulting from various accommodation policies, presents only a small portion of the total assessment necessary to answer the question of whether DND should continue to create and maintain its own communities? To do that, each of the components of the Planning Balance Sheet would have to be extensively expanded.

The final decision would be a value judgement which would involve all the classical problems of social choice: "how to make judgements on behalf of others whom you represent; how to hold the balance between sections of the community whose objectives are in conflict; how to defend the interests of a minority and of the yet unborn." (Lichfield 1966. p. 241)

But, the value judgement would be made more sure based on this comprehensive Planning Balance Sheet Analysis than without. The previously intangible and incommensurable issues have been brought to the attention of decision-makers for consideration and discussion alongside traditional factors. This improves the chances of a sound decision being made.
5.0 CONCLUSIONS

The question of whether DND should be in the business of creating and maintaining its own communities, and if so, what accommodation policies are appropriate, is very involved and complicated. The evaluation of the social impacts on military families undertaken in this thesis has only scratched at the surface of the entire question. Similarly, the heuristic model used to describe the Planning Balance Sheet Analysis methodology has also been simplified to enable visualization of the process such that it too only partially covers the social impacts on military families. As such, it is necessary to put the larger problem back into perspective to show how the Planning Balance Sheet method can assist in solving the problem.

Figure 5-1 uses a relevance tree to illustrate the components of the problem which have been investigated in this thesis. Of the many factors which must be considered prior to making an informed decision on military communities, only a minute portion have been discussed, as evident from the many unexplored branches of the tree. Extensive expansion both vertically and horizontally on the relevance tree is necessary before a completely informed decision is possible.

To complete this process it is also necessary to expand the impact categories to be assessed. In chapter four, the categories were limited to sixteen which specifically impacted the family. Although the categories are somewhat generic they would still have to be expanded when other key factors are included. As well, this assessment only investigated the
Figure 5-1
THE ACCOMMODATION QUESTION RELEVANCE TREE

OPERATIONAL

WORK ENVIRONMENT

ISOLATED SITES

SINGLE

INDIVIDUALS

HUSBAND

WIFE

CHILDREN

AGE

RANK

ETHNICITY

ECONOMIC STATUS

OCCUPATIONAL ROLE

FAMILY

MARRIED QUARTER

NEIGHBOURHOOD

LOCAL COMMUNITY

ECONOMY

Housing

FACILITIES

REGION

THE MILITARY COMMUNITY QUESTION

SOCIAL

COMMUNITY ENVIRONMENT

URBAN SITES

MARRIED

ECONOMIC

GEOGRAPHIC

POLITICAL

THE MILITARY COMMUNITY QUESTION

184

Areas considered in the heuristic model
costs and benefits in terms of consumers (families). To provide sufficient and accurate information for a well informed decision, the costs and benefits to both consumers and producers must be determined. Further consideration of the family itself is also necessary, as this thesis has dealt with a generic military family living in a municipality which was assumed capable of providing service to the military community. These areas would have to be explored further as indicated on the relevance tree.

This thesis has described the techniques necessary to develop each stage of each of the many unexplored branches, as well as having provided an appropriate method to capture the resulting information for presentation to decision-makers.

The Planning Balance Sheet Analysis is recommended as a suitable methodology to evaluate the impacts determined from any branch of the relevance tree, and then to capture the information in a manner which can be easily diagnosed by decision-makers. It is sufficiently flexible to allow consideration of a large variety of intangibles and incommensurables, while still providing the scientific accuracy necessary to compare measureable absolutes.

It is doubtful whether a full analysis of all elements of the completed relevance tree would be simultaneously conducted due to the time and expense which a full scale investigation requires. However, the PBSA can also be used as an integrative tool to combine the results of a variety of different independent studies undertaken in different impact areas. The PBSA with its combination of a detailed balance sheet and accompanying prose
allows decision-makers to quickly ascertain the relative difference between alternatives and obtain details of specific differences as required from the descriptive narrative.

The manner in which the social impact assessment process described in this thesis is integrated with policy formulation is illustrated in Figure 5-2. The decision-making process depicted has been conceptualized from a similar model designed by Olsen and colleagues (1981, p. 45), and identifies the predicted social impacts resulting from the key elements evaluated in the social impact assessment. Use of the Planning Balance Sheet Analysis enables social predictions to be considered alongside operational, economic, political and geographic factors, even though the later may have been evaluated in independent studies. Separate balance sheets can be prepared for each of the factors based on their independent studies and can be summarized into a final balance sheet for the informed consideration of decision-makers.

More importantly however, is the use of the Planning Balance Sheet Analysis as a presentation device. While most evaluation devices (even the most simplified versions) are extremely complicated and difficult for decision-makers to absorb and understand in the limited time that is typically available, the Planning Balance Sheet Analysis enables a very quick and relatively easy identification and comparison of impacts. As well, it is one of the few techniques which provides decision-makers with information on all the factors, both measurable and immeasurable, in order to make their informed choice.
Figure 5-2
SOCIAL IMPACTS AS PART OF THE DECISION-MAKING PROCESS

INPUTS
EXISTING SOCIAL & ECONOMIC CONDITIONS

PROPOSED POLICY

VALUES INTERESTS & ATTITUDES

EXISTING POLICY

THRUPUTS

DEMOGRAPHIC CHANGES
COMMUNITY STRUCTURE CHANGES
HOUSING CHANGES
SERVICE PROVISION CHANGES

ECONOMIC CHANGES

COMMUNITY GOALS
IMPACT AMELIORATION

SOCIAL WELL-BEING CHANGES

SUBJECTIVE COMMUNITY SATISFACTION

OUTPUTS
PREDICTED SOCIAL IMPACTS

OPERATIONAL ECONOMIC POLITICAL & GEOGRAPHIC FACTORS

PLANNING & MANAGEMENT RESOURCES

POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS
In addition to providing a tool to assist in the consideration of such complex problems, this thesis has also organized a great deal of practical information on the military community. As well, the thesis has illustrated the importance of the military family to the operational effectiveness of DND and thus the need for social planning to be explicitly included in the DND corporate planning process.
6.0 RECOMMENDATIONS

Having reviewed and understood the unique social difficulties arising from the military style of life, described different policy extremes to deal with these problems, created a framework to assess the impacts arising from the policy options, and evaluated the social impacts on military families resulting from the policies, it is necessary to provide recommendations on how to use what has been learned. There are many areas in which this information may be used. The most obvious benefits exist for DND in formulating accommodation related policies and improving quality of life in the military community. However, many of the observations are of value to and can be equally applicable in some civilian communities. As such, specific comments and recommendations are provided for each of these areas in the following two sections:

6.1 The DND Accommodation Question
6.2 General Planning Implications
Assessing the social impact categories as they are affected by the different policy options, provides a clear indication of which categories are the most significant in each area. These observations enable policy makers to concentrate on categories in which the impacts are most severe, and the returns from any effort are likely to be highest.

Figure 6-1 illustrates the social impact categories considered to be most significant in each of the policy areas as assessed in the heuristic model. The flow chart enables decision-makers to quickly identify areas of particular concern as they are impacted by any anticipated change in policy direction. This does not suggest that other impact categories can be ignored, but simply that those identified on the flow chart should be considered first, as higher priority concerns.

This quick reference is also useful when attempting to mitigate the impacts on military families arising from policy formulated without full consideration of social impacts. It does not alleviate the need to conduct detailed planning in the manner suggested in this thesis, but provides assistance in salvaging policies which could otherwise be even more socially harmful.

In sum, it is hoped that decision-makers will realize the importance of social planning in the decision-making process involving military families, and will be able to incorporate such planning through the use of the Planning Balance Sheet Analysis. Specific recommendations in the three policy areas are provided in the following sections.
Figure 6-1: Accommodation Policy Areas of Particular Concern to Military Families

Policy Area

- HOUSING QUALITY
- Neighbourhood Attractiveness
- Degree of Regulation
- Socialization
- Lifestyle Selection

- HOUSING QUALITY
- Neighbourhood Attractiveness
- Lifestyle Selection
- Socialization

- Accessibility
- Sports/Recreation
- Education
- Personal Safety
- Community Identity
- Dislocation
- Separation
- Friendships
- Community Participation
- Political Participation

- Housing Quality
- Neighbourhood Attractiveness
- Lifestyle Selection
- Socialization

- Toward More Public Housing
- Toward a Housing Society
- Toward Private Housing

- Toward Internalized Services
- Lifestyle Selection
- Sports/Recreation
- Personal Safety
- Dislocation
- Separation
- Community Identity

- Toward Municipalization
- Toward Internalized Services
- Degree of Regulation
- Lifestyle Selection
- Employment of Dependents
- Accessibility
- Sports/Recreation
- Personal Safety
- Dislocation
- Separation
- Community Identity
- Friendships
- Community Participation
- Education

Policy Direction

- Areas of Particular Concern
6.1.1 Housing

The evaluation of housing policy undertaken in this thesis determined that the creation of a Non-Public Housing Society deserves a great deal more consideration. A Housing Society style of organization seems to enjoy most of the benefits of the very closed publicly controlled married quarter community, but would also be capable of altering the organizational structure sufficiently to obtain some of the benefits of a less structured environment.

Through the Planning Balance Sheet Analysis it was also possible to see how the housing policy extremes impacted the military family in different ways. The Planning Balance Sheet was also capable of segregating individual impacts such that the strengths and weaknesses of each component were visible. As such, it assists in developing housing policy which incorporates as many of the strengths of each of the options as possible. Arising both directly from the heuristic model, as well as indirectly from the information about the military community organized in this thesis, the following housing related actions are suggested:

a. The creation of a Non-Public Housing Society should be investigated and developed further.

b. If the concept of a formal housing society is not adopted, then efforts should be undertaken to re-organize housing support under one agency. This will assist in providing service to the occupants and also ensure that support to married quarters does not become a "secondary" tasking among a number of base organizations.
c. The importance of the aesthetic qualities of accommodation should be realized, and efforts made to improve the housing stock and neighbourhood attractiveness of married quarter communities.

d. The existing rigid control over DND housing should be investigated and self-help programs considered to foster both community pride and cohesiveness and to improve housing stock and neighbourhood attractiveness.

e. Housing allocation should be structured to accommodate those families most in need. In conjunction with this, the policy of segregation by rank should also be studied.

f. Since many of the benefits in both social services and housing are based on the physical location and accessibility of services to military families, the interrelatedness of the two must be considered when developing policies for either.

6.1.2 Physical Services

The evaluation undertaken in this thesis also indicated that social impacts on military families which could result from the municipalization of physical services were not significant. Although internalized services exhibit more benefits they are seen to impact families only marginally. Since the economic benefits of municipalization have been shown to be significant, it is realistic to allow the transfer of responsibility for physical services to proceed. However, consideration should be given to the re-direction of financial benefits accruing from municipalization back into the military community through either housing or social services. This will assist in ensuring that the marginal impacts of municipalization are compensated for, with a net benefit to military families, but without additional cost to DND.
6.1.3 Social Services

A very significant, and the most notable observation arising from the assessment of the heuristic model, is the importance of the provision of social services. While the policy areas of housing and physical services exhibited numerous costs and benefits which required some trading-off between alternatives and as such did not indicate a distinct "winner", social services were seen to clearly satisfy family social impacts much more successfully when provided internally.

The analysis of social services overwhelmingly suggests that DND should play a major role in the provision of social services, but the role does not necessarily need to be financial in nature. However, it is suggested that DND as the administrator of public and non-public activities in the military community take the initiative to ensure that suitable social services are encouraged, enabled, and assisted at all military locations.

As it is strongly recommended that DND play a major role in the provision of social services it is appropriate to provide more specific recommendations on how this role should be increased. While the general recommendation for DND to be involved is drawn explicitly from the findings of the thesis, the following recommendations are not so explicitly drawn. They arise from a combination of the realized importance of the provision of social services, and the specific identification of areas in which the author feels the improvement of services is warranted and feasible:
a. Family support centers should be established (at public expense) at all bases to provide a central office from which concerns of military families can be administered and services coordinated.

b. A co-located volunteer bureau should be established to organize volunteer efforts.

c. Unit family liaison officers should be designated for each military unit, to facilitate unit support through the family support center to families whose military member is absent.

d. A position of ombudsperson should be established at each base to act as a spouse intermediary and assist spouses to understand procedures and to cut through the bureaucracy when necessary.

e. The organizational structure and operation of committees should be reviewed to enable and encourage more spouses to participate in the "Community Council" and "Recreational Council".

f. Suitable child care facilities should be established including the provision of emergency 24 hour service for problems arising from military exigences.

g. Spousal employment should be encouraged and assisted through community nepotism, job-sharing programs, one-women home occupations, and special interest and skills classes (section 4.3.1).

h. Base activity programs should be reviewed to ensure that adequate specific programs are available for spouses and children.

i. A relocation information bureau should be established at each base. This could be operated as a non-profit organization in a manner similar to local "Welcome Wagons" with funding solicited from local businesses (through advertising) and with facilities provided by DND. The bureau would send information to members newly posted in as soon as they were informed, and would greet them with a housecall upon arrival. Similar information on preparing to move, and the services available on the departure end of the posting would also be provided.
6.2 GENERAL PLANNING IMPLICATIONS

The Canadian military family is simply a microcosm of the family in Canadian society. As such, many of the implications of overall societal trends apply to all communities although many are of particular relevance to the military. Since some of the impacts are: larger, more apparent, and occur more quickly as a result of the uniqueness of military life, the military environment serves as a useful case study to infer impacts on other communities. As well, the workable size of military communities, their spatial definition, their dispersal throughout Canada, and their mixed urban/semi-urban/isolated locations enables them to be a useful tool for projecting impacts on other Canadian communities.

In addition to being useful as a good, general indicator of social impacts, military communities also exhibit a number of characteristics which are so similar to those experienced by single-industry towns that direct correlations can be made. Some of the parallel characteristics shared by these relatively analogous communities are:

a. Mobility of workforce  
b. Lack of kinship ties  
c. Paternalism  
d. Homogeniety of population  
e. Unbalanced population  
f. Single employer  
g. Closedness of community  
h. Lack of employment for dependents  
i. Community identity  
j. Monotonous housing stock
Many of the recommendations directed at military policy makers in the previous section can be extended to other forms of community. This is particularly true of the importance of social services, and was also identified by Goudy (1977) in his study of community satisfaction, by Suttles in his research on local community (Franck 1983, p. 309), and by the planners of Tumbler Ridge who have explicitly attempted to incorporate social services into their planning process (Budgen 1983; Thompson et al. 1978). As planners become more involved in developing and maintaining communities it is perceived that social dimensions will begin to assume greater and greater importance relative to the traditional physical dimension of planning.

Some questions for planners which are drawn from this profile of the military community but are shared with many other communities are:

a. How to deal with community members who do not appear to make a long-term commitment to the community. This is particularly true of military families as they know they will be moving on within a few years. However, the phenomenon exists throughout society.

b. How to deal with apathy resulting in a prevailing attitude of "let the company [municipality] do it ... it's their community [job] anyway".

c. How to satisfy a diverse population socialized to social and cultural forms developed in other regions.

d. How to evaluate impacts replete with intangibles and incommensurables; and then, how to inform decision-makers of this information.
In the opinion of the author, the Department of National Defence has done a good job of answering these questions, and with the Planning Balance Sheet now has a technique to address them further. DND's success is evident from the positive results indicated by measured social ills in the military community as compared to society in general.

In summary, there is much that can be learned from the military community and conversely, the military community can benefit immensely from studying the experiences of other Canadian communities, and conversing with planners working in these communities.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

Accommodation Working Group (AWG)

Andrews, Frank M.

Andrews, Frank M. and Stephen B. Withey

Berton, Paul and Nancy Johnson Smith

Bollinger, Stephan
1976 "Should New Communities Consciously Strive to be Nice?" in CONTACT, Journal of Urban and Environmental Affairs Vol 8(3), Faculty of Environmental Studies, University of Waterloo, Waterloo.

Boothroyd, Peter

Bowen, Gary Lee

Bowers, David G.

Bowles, Roy T.

Bradbury, John H.  

Budgen, Mark  

Canada Corporations Act

Canada's Single-Industry Communities: A Proud Determination to Survive  

Canadian Forces Administrative Order 50-20.

Canadian Forces Administrative Order 50-21.

Canadian Forces Personnel Newsletter  
1986  "From Start to Finish: The Canadian Forces Personnel System" Issue 10/86, Department of National Defence, Ottawa

Cancellier, Patricia H. (Editor)  

Careless, J.M.S.  

Chartier, A.E.  

Corvisier, Andre  

Coulombe, Pierre  

Cutter, Susan L.  
Dalkey, Norman C.  

Davis, H. Craig  

Defence 86  
1987  Supply and Services Canada, Ottawa.

Department of Regional Economic Expansion (DREE)  

Dorge, Marsha  

Directorate of Utilities and Municipal Services (D Util MS)  

Endersby, Stanley Alfred  

Evaluation Report E20  

Finlayson, Elizabeth M.  

Finsterbusch, Kurt  
Finsterbusch, Kurt


Fish, Muriel (translated by)

Fitzsimmons, Stephen J. and Thomas E. Ferb

Frances, Allen and Leonard Gale

Franck, Karen A.

Freedman, Allen

Future Trends in Employee Benefits
1974 A Report from the Conference Board in Canada

Gabriel, Richard A.

Galinsky, Ellen
Goldman, Nancy L.  

Goodall, Brian  

Goodspeed, D.J.  

Gorlin, Harriet  

Goudy, Willis J.  

Gunder, Robert John Michael  

Harkness, Gary C. and Gary Paget  

Hauser, William J  

Hill, Kim Quaile and Jib Fowles  

Hill, Morris  

Himelfarb, Alex  
Hunter, Edna J

Hunter, Edna J. and D.S. Nice

Janowitz, Morris

Kerri, James N.

Kumove, Leon

Laffeur, Armand

Lafond Commission

Langin, Susan Esther

Lichfield, Nathaniel


Lichfield, Nathaniel, Peter Kettle and Michael Whitbread
Little, R.W.  

Low, William James  
1979 Interorganizational Relations in Local Land-Use Planning. Unpublished Master Thesis in the School of Community and Regional Planning, University of British Columbia, Vancouver.

Lucas, Rex A.  

Margiotta, Franklin D.  

Matthiasson, John S.  


Mann, Michael  

McCalla, Mary Ellen  
1976 Local Community or Metropolitan Community: Social Interaction in the Self-Sufficient Suburb. Master thesis in the Department of Sociology, Center for Urban and Regional Studies, the University of North Carolina, Chapel Hill.

McCann, L.D.  

McCubbin, H.I., B.B. Dahl and E.J. Hunter  

McCubbin, Hamilton I. and Martha A. Marsden  
McKain, Jerry L.  

Military Family, Life/Work Stress Questionnaire  
1983  Directorate of Social and Economic Analysis, Operational Research and Analysis Establishment, Department of National Defence, Ottawa.

Miller, Delbert Charles  

Moskos, Charles C., Jr.  

Mukherjee, Ramkrisha  

Municipal Grants Act, 1980

Municipal Act (Alberta)

Municipal Act (British Columbia)

National Defence Act

ND/CMHC AWG  

Nickels, J.B., D.L. Sexton and C.A. Bayer  
1976  Life Satisfaction in a Resource Frontier Community. Center for Settlement Studies, University of Manitoba, Winnipeg.

Olsen, Marvin E., Barbara D. Melber and Donna J. Merwin  
Oncken, William Jr. and Donald L. Wass

Onyemelukme, J.O.C.

Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD)
1982 The OECD List of Social Indicators. Paris: OECD.

Pay Research Bureau

Peterson, George L. and Robert S. Gemmell

Popoff, T. and S. Truscott and R. Hysert

Popoff, T. and S. Truscott

Porteous, J. Douglas

Pressman, Norman E.P.

Preston, Richard
Qadeer, Mohammad A.

Queen's University

Riffel, J.A.

Robinson, Ira

Rojek, Dean G., Frank Clemente and Gene F. Summers

Roy, R.H.

Sarkesian, Sam C.

Sassone, Peter G.

Sechelt Indian Band Self-Government Act

Sechelt Indian Government District Enabling Act
1987 Bill 4 - 1987, Province of British Columbia

Semmens, Ted and Peter Adams

Sheldon, Eleanor Bernet and Howard E. Freeman
Siemens, L.B.
1970  Planning Communities For the North: Some Social and Psychological Influences. Occasional Papers No. 1, Center For Settlement Studies, University of Manitoba, Winnipeg.


Simmonds, W.H.C.

Solomon, Erwin S., Naceur Bouchouchi, V. Denisov, Elemer Hankiss Carlos A. Mallmann, and Lester W. Milbrath

Stanley, George F.G.

Stanton, M. Duncan

Stein, Clarence S.

Stoddard, Ellwyn R. and Claude E. Cabanillas

Surace, Samuel J. and Melvin Seeman

Szalai, Alexander
Thompson, Berwick, Pratt and Partners  
1978 Social Plan - Tumbler Ridge Northeast Sector B.C.  
Prepared for the British Columbia Ministry of Municipal  
Affairs and Housing. March 23.

Time-Life  
Books.

Treasury Board of Canada  
1981 "Chapter 125 - Living Accommodation," in Treasury Board  
of Canada Administrative Policy Manual. December 1981,  
Ottawa.

Truscott, S and S. Flemming  
1986 Occupational Stress Among Married and Single-Parent  
Canadian Forces Personnel. Operational Research and  
Analysis Establishment Report No. PR375, Department of  
National Defence, Directorate of Social and Economic  
Analysis: Ottawa.

United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization  
(UNESCO)  
1981 Socio-economic Indicators for Planning: Methodological  
Aspects and Selected Examples. Paris: UNESCO.

Vlachos, Evan  
1981 "The Use of Scenarios for Social Impact Assessment," in  
Kurt Finsterbusch and C.P. Wolf. Stroudsburg  

Weisman, Brahm  
1977 The Plan That Shaped the Town, Kitimat, British  
Columbia: Implications for Resource Frontier Towns.  
Unpublished paper, School of Community and Regional  
Planning, University of British Columbia, Vancouver.

Wellman, Barry  

Wikstrom, Walter S.  
1975 Corporate Response to Employees' Housing Needs. The  
Conference Board Inc. New York.

Wong, Kenneth B. and J. Gary Halpin  
from the Compensation Research Centre of The Conference  
Board in Canada, May 1977, Ottawa.