CITY PLANNING AND THE POLITICAL AND
FISCAL REPERCUSSIONS OF HIGH UNEMPLOYMENT

By
DIANNE ELIZABETH MARY KING

B.A. The University of British Columbia, 1979

A THESIS SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF
THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF
MASTER OF ARTS

in
THE FACULTY OF GRADUATE STUDIES
(The School of Community and Regional Planning)

We accept this thesis as conforming
to the required standard

THE UNIVERSITY OF BRITISH COLUMBIA

March 1985

© Dianne Elizabeth Mary King, 1985
In presenting this thesis in partial fulfilment of the requirements for an advanced degree at the University of British Columbia, I agree that the Library shall make it freely available for reference and study. I further agree that permission for extensive copying of this thesis for scholarly purposes may be granted by the head of my department or by his or her representatives. It is understood that copying or publication of this thesis for financial gain shall not be allowed without my written permission.

Department of Community and Regional Planning

The University of British Columbia
1956 Main Mall
Vancouver, Canada
V6T 1Y3

Date 16 April 1985
ABSTRACT

The environment of city planning practice includes increasing unemployment rates in the communities practitioners serve. There should be effects of this; however, there is little discussion in the literature of the relationship between high unemployment and planning. This thesis is an exploratory study of that relationship. It examines the effects of high unemployment on city planning as mediated by the political and fiscal environments. Three levels of planning are considered: strategic, normative, and operational planning. The subjective quality of the workplace is also considered.

A preliminary review of the literatures on unemployment, on political participation and its economic antecedents, on planning, and on municipal fiscal stress, was followed by interviews with twenty-two planners, councillors, and administrators of nongovernmental services for the unemployed.

The thesis describes the relationship between unemployment and political participation. (Canadian data on magnetic tape which can be used in quantitative work in this area are listed in the Appendix.) The implications of that relationship are then developed for city planning. The effects on planning of unemployment-related municipal fiscal pressure are also explored.

A number of hypotheses are generated which take into account
contextual effects. These are incorporated into four future scenarios which make different assumptions about the ability of left- and right-of-center governments to reduce the unemployment rate. The thesis concludes with directions for future research and some general issues.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF TABLES</td>
<td>vii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIST OF FIGURES</td>
<td>viii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACKNOWLEDGEMENT</td>
<td>ix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CHAPTERS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PURPOSE</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>METHODOLOGY</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PROBLEMS IN DATA COLLECTION</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TERMINOLOGY</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployment</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Political Participation</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>City Planning</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OVERVIEW</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. BACKGROUND</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FACTS ABOUT UNEMPLOYMENT</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Unemployment Rate</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Unemployment Experience</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THE ESSENTIAL FEATURES OF POLITICAL PARTICIPATION</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Socioeconomic Status and Political Participation</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Politicization of Economic Well-being</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>THE PLANNING ENVIRONMENT</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strategic Planning</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Normative Planning</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operational Planning</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality of the Workplace</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CONCLUSION</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. THE POLITICAL REPERCUSSIONS OF HIGH UNEMPLOYMENT</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>POLITICAL APATHY</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I.</td>
<td>Municipality and Position of Respondents.</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II.</td>
<td>Canadian Studies on magnetic tape in the University of British Columbia's Data Bank that contain measures of both Economic Status and Political Participation.</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF FIGURES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Analytical Framework showing the relationships between High Unemployment,</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Political Participation, Fiscal Pressure, and City Planning.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Unemployment and Income Trends: Canada, British Columbia, and Metropolitan</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Vancouver</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Factors underlying the relationships in the Analytical Framework</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Percentages of Total Appropriations, City of Vancouver: Planning and Social</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Planning Departments, Economic Development Office, Health and Social</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Welfare account, Public Works account, and Police Department (half of total</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>appropriations)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Ratios of Appropriations: Planning and Social Planning Departments, and the</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Economic Development Office</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

For Henry Hightower's guidance, openness, and patience throughout this learning experience, I would like to express my sincere thanks. To Jaimie Wallin, in Administrative, Adult, and Higher Education, my gratitude for being realistic with respect to the time required for the study. My thanks, also, to Bob Collier, Administrator of the Municipality of Delta, for his moral support, to Brahm Wiesman, for his interest in my work and encouragement to continue the work I have begun, and to Richard Johnston and Jean Laponce, in the Political Science Department, for their initial guidance.

I would also like to acknowledge my anonymous respondents, for their time and thoughtfulness, and my parents, for their patience and practical assistance. Thanks also go to Jim L., who commented on an early draft, and to my sister, Lynda, and to Elaine, for their faith in me. Finally, I express my gratitude to the many writers whose own work made this thesis possible. Any errors remaining in the thesis are, of course, my own.
CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

City planners have been working in the face of increasing unemployment rates in their communities. However, there is little discussion of the implications of high unemployment for the planning environment. High unemployment is usually treated as an object of planning activity rather than as a factor in the planning process. This thesis asks how high unemployment affects political participation, and how the political environment, as well as fiscal pressures, affect city planning during high unemployment.

Political scientists generally agree that economic conditions affect political participation; however, "the precise relationship...is a little difficult to pin down" (Alt, 1979:3). "We have little information about what happens to political participation during times of depression" (Milbrath and Goel, 1977:95). In his review of Politics, Policy and the European Recession, Grant states that contributors are not sure how to talk about the impact of recession on parties and pressure groups (1983).

Given that political scientists have not come up with a clear account of the relationship between economic conditions and political participation, it is not surprising that there has been little discussion of the implications of this relationship for city planning. Yet city
planning is likely to be affected by political participation in at least two ways: through politicians' responses to political pressures and through direct exchanges between planners and politically active citizens.

Discussions of the effects of unemployment-related fiscal pressure on municipal government are easier to find than discussions of unemployment-related political pressures. However, the growing amount of literature on municipal fiscal stress is largely American and does not discuss city planning explicitly. Yet budget levels and procedures undoubtedly affect an organizational activity like planning.

PURPOSE

The thesis aims to fill a gap in planners' knowledge about the planning environment. It explores the effects of high unemployment on political participation and the implications for city planning of political and budgetary pressures during high unemployment. Specifically, the thesis aims to

1. characterize political participation during high unemployment (Chapter III);

2. explore the implications for city planning of political participation during high unemployment (Chapter IV);

3. characterize planning under budgetary pressure (Chapter V).

A basic premise of the study is that high unemployment has a direct effect on planning in the form of fiscal pressure, as well as an indirect
effect in terms of politically mediated responses to high unemployment. Political factors influence planners both directly through personal observations and exchanges with citizens, and indirectly through the actions of council and senior governments. Figure 1 depicts the variables and relationships examined in the thesis. Relationships beyond the scope of the study are indicated with a dotted line.

An understanding of the political environment may help planners to better anticipate and actively participate in change. Cox argues that only those European nations that have been able to mitigate the effects of political difficulties of the recession have been able to tackle the basic structural and cyclical economic problems (1982:16).

In addition, the growing literature on the politics of planning tends to adopt a neomarxist approach (cf. Bolan, 1980). A systems view, such as that taken in the thesis, and encompassing psychological and historical factors, should throw new light on this area of planning theory.

**METHODOLOGY**

A preliminary review of the literatures on unemployment, on political participation and its economic antecedents, on planning, and on municipal fiscal stress, were followed by interviews with twenty-two planners, councillors, and administrators of nongovernmental services for the unemployed. Additional literature, including the Annual Reviews of the City of Vancouver Planning Department, was consulted during the analysis and write-up.
Figure 1. Analytical Framework showing the relationships between High Unemployment, Political Participation, Fiscal Pressure, and City Planning (Adapted from Frey, 1983)
Interviews were held with a director and assistant director of planning, the head of a planning division, eight city planners, two social planners, six councillors, and three administrators of union, church, and nonprofit programs for the unemployed. Eighteen interviews were with persons in the City of Vancouver, and four with persons from the surrounding municipalities of West Vancouver, New Westminster, Delta, and Surrey. Table I depicts the positions of the respondents and the municipalities in which they work. Respondents are not identified because of the political nature of the interviews.

Potential respondents were referred to the writer by directors of planning, initial respondents, or the thesis advisers. Subjects were sought who had exposure to the public in order that they would be able to describe changes in political participation and the implications for their work. Five of the planners in the Vancouver City Planning Department are in Area Planning; two are in Central Area planning with previous experience in other divisions. The two social planners are in Social Services Planning.

To obtain interviews with the mayor and councillors, a formal request was circulated by the Aldermen's Secretary. Six councillors consented. Three are with the Committee of Progressive Electors or the Civic Independents, which support labor, and three with The Electors Action Movement or the Non-Partisan Association, which advocate free-enterprise, although there is some cross-voting.
Table I. Municipality and Position of Respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Planner</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Councillor</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Administrator, Service for Unemployed</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Van. = Vancouver
New West. = New Westminster
W. Van. = West Vancouver
Except for one telephone interview and two personal interviews which were between fifteen and fifty minutes in length, the interviews were fifty to ninety minutes long. Given the exploratory nature of the study, the interviews were open-ended. Planners and councillors were asked to describe changes in political participation since the onset of the current recession and to make causal attributions where possible. Respondents were then asked to describe how these changes had influenced their work. In the first interview, filing cards were used to present concepts for feedback; however, this inefficient procedure was abandoned in favor of verbal probing.

Respondents generally had some difficulty describing changes in political participation and accounting for any changes observed. However, with two or three exceptions, they seemed very interested in the study focus. The interviews underscore the need for more debate and better theory in this area.

Because public officials may have little contact with, or concern about, people who may not participate in politics, the political behavior of the unemployed was explored with administrators of services for this group. The format of the interviews was the same as for the planners and councillors except that questions focused on the effect of unemployment on political participation, efforts to organize the unemployed, and the reactions of public officials.

In view of differences between municipalities with respect to how hard they had been hit by the recession, it was decided, after several interviews, to focus on Vancouver. Unless otherwise noted, therefore, it
can be assumed that respondents quoted in the remainder of the thesis are referring to the situation in Vancouver.

The effect of high unemployment on political participation was inferred from the political science literature, which tends to focus on electoral participation in the United States at the state and national levels, as well as from Johnston's analysis of data on the 1979 and 1980 Canadian elections (1983), material on the Great Depression of the 1930's, the theoretical background on unemployment and on political participation presented in Chapter II, and the interviews.

The implications of political participation for city planning were inferred from the planning and public administration literatures, as well as from the theoretical background on political participation and planning presented in Chapter II, the Planning Department Annual Reviews, and the interviews. And, finally, the implications of fiscal pressure for planning were gathered from the literature on municipal fiscal stress, the Annual Reviews, and the interviews.

PROBLEMS IN DATA COLLECTION

Several methodological problems were encountered at the outset. First, Canadian studies of political participation available on magnetic tape in the University of British Columbia's Data Bank tend to focus on participation in national and provincial politics and predate the current recession. These studies are listed in the Appendix for the use of future investigators. They will provide an interesting contrast to studies conducted during the 1980's when these become available.
Letters to municipal officials were a potential source of information about citizens' preferences and the characteristics of citizens who try to influence officials. However, the Vancouver City Clerk's office indicated that only some letters are forwarded to that office, and only some of these are filed. The record of public meetings is also sketchy. Data would have to be extrapolated from overtime or hall rental budgets.

The Festival Committee has a partial record of demonstrations. However, prior to 1981 (the end of the protest era, according to one official) groups did not usually consult the City before staging an event. In addition, records are kept alphabetically by the name of the organization. To determine any change in activity over the years would involve a time-consuming search through selected groups' files.

Council minutes could have provided information about delegations. However, because a small number of individuals make repeat appearances which councillors tend to ignore, according to those councillors interviewed, and because accessing the information would have been an inefficient use of time considering the limited view of political participation it would provide, this path was foregone.

Open-ended interviews were selected as the most efficient method of data collection and the most forgiving of the lack of theory in this area. Future investigators may have the resources and theory to examine more quantitative data.

Finally, there is little systematic study of the planning environment upon which to draw. Most work in this area is of the case study variety.
Research in related areas, such as social work, budgeting, and public administration, is a useful supplement to the planning literature, although caution must be exerted in generalizing from different contexts.

LIMITATIONS OF THE STUDY

The trends in planning to be discussed in the thesis do not necessarily result from the political impact of unemployment. Unemployment is only one of many factors affecting political participation. Inflation (MacKuen, 1983; Fisher and Huizinga, 1982), income (Kinder and Mebane, 1983; Rosenstone, 1982; Fair, 1978:171), the voter's general sense of whether the nation's economy is improving or deteriorating (Kiewiet, 1983), foreign affairs (Mackuen, 1983), and regional or cultural factors (Clarke et al., 1979) are stronger predictors of political preferences than unemployment in certain circumstances. In addition, political participation is undoubtedly only one of many factors affecting planning. Some attempt is made in the thesis to distinguish between the effects of the political and fiscal environments, but this is only a beginning.

The temporal dimension of the relationship between unemployment and political participation (lags, cumulative effects, etc.) is beyond the scope of the thesis. Little is known about this aspect of the problem, and to attempt to explore this matter would unduly complicate the discussion. An exception to this is the discussion of an increasing unemployment rate. The reader interested in the temporal dimension may wish to consult the work of MacKuen (1983), Hibbs, (1979), Fiorina (1981), Paldam (1981), Monroe (1979), Fair (1978), Bloom and Price (1975), and

Due to the lack of research at the local level, the discussion in Chapter III focuses on politics at the provincial and national levels. However, as two councillors suggested, most people are not very active in city politics and do not distinguish among the responsibilities of different levels of government. The large and diverse budgets of large municipalities may also facilitate generalization from larger political arenas. It appears, moreover, that the left-right dimension of political participation is more important in B.C. provincial politics (U.B.C. political scientists, 1985) and Vancouver politics (Gutstein, 1983:15) than in national politics. This suggests that the relationship between unemployment and political participation found at the national level may be a conservative estimate of this relationship in Vancouver politics.

By focusing on political participation, the thesis takes an atomistic view of the political environment. Discussion of individual behavior dominates that of parties, interest groups, and social action movements. It is assumed that groups shape themselves to attract supporters more than individuals compromise their values to be a part of a political group. That the whole may be greater than the sum of the parts is a possibility, exploration of which is beyond the scope of the thesis.

Readers may be disappointed that little is said about citizens' reactions to government cutbacks. While the thesis sows the seeds for a chapter on "How Cutbacks Affect Political Participation," the cultivation of such a chapter is future work. A book would be a more appropriate format than the thesis for yet another level of analysis.
Given that Figure 1 distinguishes between planners and council, it would appear that council receives short shrift thereafter. In the interests of simplicity, it was decided to handle the role of council passim rather than separately with all of the definitional and theoretical treatment given unemployment, political participation, and planning. The consequences of political participation for the composition of council are discussed throughout Chapter III, while the role of council in the mediation of citizens' responses to high unemployment is discussed at various points in Chapter IV.

The thesis is directed primarily towards municipal planners. Regional and nongovernmental planning are beyond the scope of the thesis. So, too, are planning education and theory in substantive areas of planning. The focus is on planning practice.

TERMINOLOGY

This section defines the major variables—unemployment, political participation, and city planning—as they are viewed in the thesis.

Unemployment

The official unemployment rate as reported by Statistics Canada is the percentage of the noninstitutional civilian labor force without a job or laid off and seeking work. However, this statistic underestimates the number of discouraged unemployed workers who have given up trying to find a job, and the number of underemployed workers who cannot obtain sufficient hours of work. The effect of considering only civilian employment is to slightly exaggerate the unemployment rate. However, in
the balance, the official unemployment rate probably underestimates unemployment, particularly during periods of high unemployment when unemployed workers are more likely to become discouraged (see Chapter II).

It is sometimes argued that the unemployment rate is inflated by secondary income earners whose income is not essential to the support of the family. However, it appears that wives entered the workforce between 1971 and 1981 primarily to offset declining family income (Statistics Canada, 1984). The unemployment rate can, therefore, be considered a measure of deprivation.

Trends in unemployment and some of the psychological and social effects of unemployment with relevance for the discussion of political participation in Chapter III are outlined in further detail in Chapter II.

**Political participation**

Political participation is defined as involvement of individuals in activities intended to influence government (elected officials or the administration). Preparatory activities like "keeping informed" will not be considered here.

Political participation is a multi-dimensional concept. The modes identified by factor analysis include voting, campaigning and other partisan activity, contacting officials with respect to a community problem, and contacting officials with respect to a private problem (Milbrath and Goel, 1977; Verba and Nie, 1972). Some modes, such as demonstrating, have received less attention and could constitute separate modes. Some people are active in most modes -- the complete
modes. Some people are active in most modes—the complete activists—while others are active in none—the apathetics or inactives.

Before the different modes were identified, it was common to talk about gladiators and spectators after Milbrath's seminal book on how and why people participate in politics (1965). The intensity dimension still has validity as a separate dimension (Milbrath and Goel, 1977).

Chapter II provides further detail on some of the essential features of political participation which are critical to understanding both the impact of unemployment on it and the political setting of planning.

City planning

For the purposes of this thesis, city planning is defined as a professional advisory function in municipal government which attempts to make policy-making more rational and anticipatory. This definition belies the degree of disagreement on this point and is, therefore, somewhat arbitrary and personal.

As a rational activity, planning attempts to

1. identify a problem and the stakes in its resolution. The anticipatory component of planning requires the identification of gaps between projected trends and goals, and the formulation of community goals;

2. determine a range of alternate solutions likely to include the best one (Davidoff and Reiner, 1962);

3. assess the obstacles, opportunities, and side-effects;
4. make recommendations.

However, the political process tends to outweigh long-range and comprehensive plans based on principles of rationality (Blowers, 1980; Catanese, 1974:24). Therefore, it is argued that some degree of rationality must be traded-off for proposals with a higher chance of being adopted (Catanese, 1974; Benveniste, 1972:118). But then, planners may be criticized for being reactive, incremental and bureaucratic (Blowers, 1980). The position taken in the thesis is that the "expert's dilemma" (Benveniste, 1972:118) is unavoidable and planners will find themselves making compromises.

As conditions which foster one aspect of planning may hinder another, it is useful to distinguish between three levels of planning: the strategic, normative, and operational levels (Smith, 1982; Ozbekan, 1973). Thus, the political and fiscal repercussions of high unemployment (discussed in Chapters IV and V respectively) will be discussed under the headings of "Strategic Planning," "Normative Planning," and "Operational Planning."

Strategic planning is the analysis, evaluation, and selection of alternative means (Smith, 1982:362). Rational comprehensive planning tends to focus on strategic planning. The ends are taken as given, or it is assumed there is a single public interest.

Normative planning is the reconsideration of the value premises underlying decisions, and the definition of desired ends and ideals (Smith, 1982:362). The ends are not taken for granted, nor is an objective
public interest assumed. Normative planning is concerned with the proper political procedure for reaching solutions and with the communication of information.

Finally, operational planning is the determination of what will be done; in contrast, strategic planning is concerned with what can be done, normative planning with what should be done (Smith, 1982:362). Operational planning involves the cultivation of consensus.

There is also disagreement about the scope of the planning function. Some planners argue that they should restrict themselves to land use issues (Reade, 1982). Others take a broader view which encompasses social issues or politics (e.g. Forester, 1982; Webber, 1978; Davidoff, 1965). The view taken in this thesis is that city planning covers all areas of municipal responsibility. Thus, in some cities, planning may be restricted to land use. In other cities, social and/or economic policy may be appropriate subjects.

Some planners contend that political involvement taints the numbers they provide (Sternlieb, 1978:299). Others contend that planning is political whether or not it is recognized as such (Davidoff, 1965), and it tends to be used to mediate and prevent social conflict (Blowers, 1980:37). The view underlying this thesis is that in addition to providing the numbers, planners have a role in facilitating constructive debate, that is in normative planning. Public involvement can be a means to this end.

Finally, it has been argued that planning should extend access to
opportunities by ensuring the most efficient and equitable distribution of resources (Lynch, 1981; Webber, 1968). In the absence of a practical and accepted theory of social justice, decisions about the distribution of resources are basically politically motivated. The writer's position is that when planners disagree with council, they should use persuasion, but they should not presume that they know the public interest better than do the elected representatives. On issues about which they feel strongly, planners should seek to change the value position of council through the electoral system as private individuals.

OVERVIEW

Chapter I has presented the problem, specified the purpose and significance of the study, described the methodology and problems encountered in data collection, discussed the limitations of the study, and defined the major variables. Chapter II characterizes unemployment, political participation, and city planning in fuller detail.

Following this, Chapter III will describe how unemployment affects political participation. Chapter IV will then explore the implications for city planning of the themes discussed in Chapter III. Chapter V outlines the fiscal repercussions of high unemployment for municipalities and the implications for city planning.

The final chapter of the thesis assesses the progress made in closing the gap, identified at the outset, in our knowledge. It speculates on future trends, suggests directions for further research in the area, and reflects on some general issues in planning.
CHAPTER II

BACKGROUND

This chapter provides a fuller description of the study variables than could be afforded in Chapter I and fleshes out the study framework introduced in Chapter I. Some of the essential characteristics of unemployment, political participation, and the planning environment are presented to facilitate understanding of the following chapters.

FACTS ABOUT UNEMPLOYMENT

This section provides a brief look at aggregate trends in, and the distribution of, unemployment, followed by a sketch of the experience of unemployment.

The Unemployment Rate

Figure 2 depicts trends in unemployment for Vancouver, British Columbia, and Canada. Unemployment had hovered between four and ten percent since the 1950's until the early 1980's, when the rate reached its highest level since the 1930's. Care must be taken in generalizing from historical data, however, as later definitions of unemployment are more inclusive. For this reason, the different data series are identified in Figure 2.

British Columbia's unemployment rate is usually higher than Ontario's
Figure 2. Unemployment and Income Trends: Canada, British Columbia, and Metropolitan Vancouver (Source: Statistics Canada, catalogue nos. shown).
and the prairie provinces' (Economic Council of Canada, 1977). However, since 1984, B.C. has had the second or third highest unemployment rate in Canada. Public sector firings have undoubtedly contributed to increased relative unemployment.

Unemployment tends to be highest in the interior of B.C. (24% in the first quarter of 1984) and lowest in the Lower Mainland (14% during the same period) since the primary, construction, manufacturing, and transportation industries have higher rates of unemployment than the service and financial sectors (B.C. Central Credit Union, 1984:2).

Blue-collar Canadians, and increasingly, clerical workers and people in sales, as well as Canadians with little education or at the beginning or end of their working lives, have the highest rates of unemployment (Deaton, 1983:16-17). In general, lower status individuals are the most likely to be unemployed (Schlozman and Verba, 1979).

The Unemployment Experience

The unemployed usually suffer a loss of income. Since the onset of the recession in 1982, the number of people below the poverty line (see Figure 2) and the rate of transfer payments (Statistics Canada, 1982; Kirsh, 1983:75) have increased. In addition, Figure 2 shows how the income share of the bottom sixty percent of the population has decreased in recent years. It appears that economic inequality increases with a steep rise in unemployment.

The unemployed also tend to experience reductions in self-confidence, social contact with coworkers and friends, residential and marital

Initial shock and depression tend to be followed by optimism and job search, whereas extended unemployment tends to produce resignation (Borgen and Amundson, 1984:103; Kirsh, 1983:62; Hayes and Nutman, 1981). Health differences between the long term unemployed and the employed gradually disappear (Buss and Redburn, 1983:49), suggesting that the unemployed adjust to their circumstances.

Borgen and Amundson have found that people who have not anticipated unemployment and women with few supports tend to experience higher than average swings in emotions (1984:32). Repeated layoffs may also intensify the response to joblessness (Kasl and Cobb, 1979). In contrast, immigrants are more persistent than average in their job search and have less noticeable emotional swings (Borgen and Amundson, 1984:65,78,104). Secondary wage earners experience relatively little emotional upheaval and a gradual downturn in emotions (Borgen and Amundson, 1984:61). Where unemployment is anticipated, Borgen and Amundson found that many emotions are felt before unemployment begins (p. 50). Finally, they discovered that unemployed youths with little or no post-secondary education exhibit resentment and little constructive job search activity (p. 104).

As the duration of unemployment increases, unemployed union workers tend not to renew their memberships (Schlozman and Verba, 1979:262). However, there is disagreement about the effect of unemployment on organizational participation in general. Some researchers have observed decreased participation (Kennedy and Davis, 1984; Ostheimer and Ritt,
Two of the planners who were interviewed thought that unemployment would affect middle socioeconomic status persons more than low status persons whom the planners assumed would be accustomed to economic hardship. "Status" is used interchangeably with "socioeconomic status" which refers loosely to educational achievement, occupational status, and income level.

The middle status unemployed may experience as much stress as the lower status unemployed; however, they may be more effective in handling stress (Kirsh, 1983:18-20; Catalano and Dooley, 1983; Scott and Acock, 1979). Displaced blue collar workers experience more downward mobility (Foltman, 1968; Crysdale, 1965) and are more likely to withdraw socially (Crysdale, 1965:17-18; Aiken et al., 1968:86). (Displaced workers are workers who have lost their jobs to a plant closure and who may be reemployed at the time of the study.) Similarly, a respondent claimed that the "non-savings" unemployed are absorbed in looking for work and bargains, doing things themselves, and walking (instead of driving or taking the bus).

A number of factors may moderate the impact of unemployment, including optimism about economic growth and job opportunities, personal savings, and social support (Buss & Redburn, 1983:56-57; Kirsh, 1983; Hayes and Nutman, 1981; Kasl and Cobb, 1979).

Finally, the unemployed tend to cite personal as opposed to economic
factors for their unemployment (Tanner et al., 1984; Kirsh, 1983:47; Bakke, 1940). Psychological studies find that people generally believe they deserve their fate (Lerner, 1981:21).

In conclusion, unemployment appears to have two major effects which may affect political participation: economic deprivation and social marginality. In addition, lower status groups appear to be affected more often if not more severely, although age, ethnicity, social support, national economic conditions, and many other factors, influence the psychosocial impact of unemployment. Finally, the attribution of responsibility for joblessness has implications for its politicization.

THE ESSENTIAL FEATURES OF POLITICAL PARTICIPATION

Several features of political participation are critical to understanding the impact of unemployment on it and its relevance for city planning. First, the effects of socioeconomic status are discussed, followed by a discussion of the politicization of economic well-being.

Socioeconomic Status and Political Participation

One of the most thoroughly documented findings in political science is that higher socioeconomic status persons are more politically active than lower status persons (Mishler, 1979:92-97; Milbrath and Goel, 1977:92). Education may be the most important factor in this relationship (Milbrath and Goel, 1977:98). Education is associated with other variables, such as income and memberships, which facilitate political participation; it fosters cognitive skills which facilitate learning about politics; it brings people in contact with political stimuli; it helps people to
understand the significance of political decisions; it fosters personal efficacy and the belief that one can influence government; it facilitates discussion about politics with a wider range of people; and it provides experience with bureaucracy (Wolfinger and Rosenstone, 1980:35-36; Milbrath and Goel, 1977:38, 100). However, education is less strongly related to voting than to nonelectoral forms of participation (Milbrath and Goel, 1977:96, 100-1; Rothman, 1974:329).

Occupational status, in general, contributes little to the relationship between status and political participation, although some jobs have a facilitative effect on political participation similar to education (Wolfinger and Rosenstone, 1980:27, 35). These are jobs that cultivate cognitive, social, and negotiating skills; that depend directly on government policies; and that produce identification with the middle class (Wolfinger and Rosenstone, 1980:29; Milbrath and Goel, 1977:103-4). Professionals and businessmen are particularly active in lobbying and holding elected office (Mishler, 1979:92; Milbrath and Goel, 1977:104-105). They are able to bypass electoral channels and communicate directly with elected officials (Mishler, 1979:92). Professionals prefer professional channels to protest (Rothman, 1974:343) and are about average with respect to campaigning (Mishler, 1979:93).

Poverty appears to reduce participation, but otherwise increased income has little impact on voting (Rosenstone, 1982:35; Mishler, 1979:96). Low income persons are also less likely to participate in programs aimed at changed lifestyles or attitudes than in programs aimed at improving economic and social conditions obviously affecting them
Income appears to facilitate participation in activities that require self-esteem or money, such as campaigning and donating money (Milbrath and Goel, 1977:97). In addition, economic optimism about personal and national conditions is associated with increased voting and a vote for the right-of-center Republican party in the northern United States (Campbell et al., 1960:397).

The relationship between socioeconomic status and political activity is moderated by the organization of the working class (Milbrath and Goel, 1977; Verba and Nie, 1972:208; Lipset, 1960). Working class organizations, like volunteer organizations of the middle class, foster rational decision-making, collective goals, and promotion based on achievement (Milbrath and Goel, 1977:111). Organization of the working class also increases partisanship, which subsequently stimulates political activity; thus, labor union members are more likely to have strong stands on issues and to vote than nonunionized workers (Milbrath and Goel, 1977:40-47, 112).

Status polarization is the degree to which the working and middle classes support the labor and conservative parties respectively. The degree of status polarized voting varies considerably across countries, being higher in Britain than in the United States and Canada (Hibbs, 1982a; Clarke et al., 1979:128; Crewe et al., 1977; Franklin and Mughan, 1978). In B.C., about one-third of the working class supports Social Credit, and these tend to be individualistic persons; about one-third of the middle class supports the New Democratic Party (N.D.P.), and these believe in a strong role for the state in social policy and economic
regulation (U.B.C. political scientists, 1985). After 1972, former
Liberals tended to support the N.D.P., whereas former Conservatives tended
to support the Social Credit party (U.B.C. political scientists, 1985).

The various modes of political participation mentioned in Chapter I
are associated with different skill levels and attitudes, and,
consequently, with different types of participants (Milbrath and Goel,
1977; Verba and Nie, 1972). Since the modes also differ in their influence
on politicians (Verba and Nie, 1972), it stands to reason that different
groups have different levels of influence on government. Nevertheless,
participation can increase or decrease social inequality depending on who
takes advantage of it; leaders tend to respond to participants and not to
their social characteristics (Verba and Nie, 1972:342; Guerrette,
1979:132).

The Politicization of Economic Well-being

Attribution of responsibility for the economy to government is
critical to the politicization of personal circumstances (Johnston, 1983;
Feldman, 1982).

To the extent that people locate the causes of their
economic problems either in the immediate environment or in
their own failings, personal discontent is unlikely to have
political consequences....in accounting for national economic
conditions, the public will often point to political

Voters tend to vote out the incumbent government during slow or
negative economic growth (Amacher and Boyes, 1982; Lewis-Beck, 1980;
Tufte, 1975; Fiorina, 1978; Frey and Schneider, 1978; Bloom and Price,
1975; Kramer, 1971) and this effect crosses party lines (Campbell et al.,
The tendency for incumbents to retire from politics when they believe their chances of reelection are poor further reduces the chances of the incumbent government being reelected (Kernell, 1978).

Elections with a high amount of competition and conflict, such as might be found in a recession, are associated with high rates of voter turnout (Milbrath and Goel, 1977:132-140; Rothman, 1974:365). However, the perception that economic crisis is a political resultant may produce psychological resignation and political withdrawal on top of any produced by economic deprivation (Fried, 1982:10,12).

In addition, economic individualism (belief in equal opportunity and individual responsibility for economic well-being) reduces the relevance of personal economic well-being to political decisions (Feldman, 1982; Schlozman and Verba, 1979; Brody and Sniderman, 1977). For a minority who reject economic individualism, "declining well-being is related to negative evaluations of the government's economic performance" (Feldman, 1982:459).

Similarly, partisanship appears to be more important than personal economic grievances in national economic outlook (Alt, 1979:112) and evaluations of the incumbent party (Kinder and Kiewiet, 1979:514). It distorts economic evaluations in a "cognitive dissonance reducing manner" (Kramer, 1983:104; Tufte, 1978:130-134; Campbell et al, 1960:388). On the other hand, the tendency for Independents and Democrats in the United States to be more sensitive to unemployment while the Republicans are more sensitive to inflation, reflects objective status differences (Hibbs, 1982a).
There are several preconditions of organized protest: a collective identity, belief that the group is exploited, the formulation of goals, and credibility of goal attainment; in addition, having been in better circumstances recently increases the credibility of goal attainment (Kriesberg, 1979:323-4,323). Status inconsistency, particularly high educational status combined with occupational status, is also associated with participation in protest movements (Rothman, 1974:331,335).

In conclusion, socioeconomic status tends to affect the level, mode, and direction of individual political behavior, but it is not the overriding factor. Fluctuations in personal economic well-being tend to be politicized only under certain conditions. Even so, partisanship may color the perception of economic conditions.

THE PLANNING ENVIRONMENT

Finally, this section describes some basics of the planning environment. It is organized according to the three levels of planning defined in Chapter I: strategic, normative, and operational planning. The subjective quality of the workplace is also considered, but as an end in itself, since job satisfaction is only indirectly related to performance (Rothman, 1974:473).

Strategic Planning

Selbst defines organizational crisis as anything that interferes with the acceptable attainment of objectives or organizational survival, or that has a detrimental personal effect as perceived by the majority of the employees or clients (1978:854). Among the various types of organizational
crises Selbst identifies are resource, role, and domain crises; in a domain crisis, the objectives of the organization are seriously questioned (p. 858). A role crisis may reduce efficiency, effectiveness, and innovativeness (Rothman, 1974:69).

In addition, Selbst suggests that organizational crisis may produce anxiety and, in the long run, a loss of confidence (1978:865). These are two of the conditions which Janis has demonstrated produce concurrence seeking or "groupthink" (1982). According to Janis, groupthink hinders the analysis and evaluation of alternatives, risks, and objectives, as well as the use of information and contingencies. Similarly, Selbst argues that acute crisis produces an emphasis on hierarchical relations and visible criteria, while chronic crisis produces an ad hoc approach to problems (1978:865). On the positive side, organizational crisis may stimulate improved management or change power relations for the better (Selbst, 1978:852).

In a different vein, a liberal or reform-oriented clientele may facilitate innovation (Rothman, 1974:435). Strategic planning may also be facilitated where there is general agreement on goals (Chetkow-Yanoov, 1982:172).

**Normative Planning**

There are several features of the political environment with relevance for the reconsideration of the value base of decisions during high unemployment. First, responsiveness to interest groups generally depends on their concentration and respectability in the community (Rothman, 1974:269), and on how well informed they are (Howard, 1984:14). Officials
tend to share the preferences of politically active individuals; however, they are less responsive to these individuals when community conflict is high (Verba and Nie, 1972:333). Appointed officials may be more responsive than politicians (Friedman, 1975:201).

Developers are particularly influential because the city depends on them for creating the "physical and economic substance" of the city (Layton, 1984:404; Dickerson et al., 1980:10-11). Dependence on developers is accentuated by economic recession (Layton, 1984:404). Dependence tends to reduce planning to "a series of ad hoc reactions...leading to a form of pre-emptive decision-making" (Blowers, 1980:38).

Citizen consultation may influence policy direction by generating alternatives and by providing "a forum for alternate spokesman subsequently elected to council" (Fish, 1981:96). The reform movement in the sixties and seventies made politicians and municipal staff more wary of developers (Tennant, 1981:138; Bureau of Municipal Research, 1975). However, the benefits of citizen consultation tend to accrue to the middle class because of the skills required for participation (Riedal, 1972:214) and the typical focus of planning programs on land use (Layton, 1984:405,410; Simmie, 1974:154).

Operational Planning

With respect to operational planning, disagreement on goals has a negative impact by hindering compromise (Chetkow-Yanoov, 1982:172; Bolan, 1969). Environmental uncertainty and organizational instability also reduce agreement on actions (Selbst, 1978; Bolan, 1969).
Quality of the Workplace

Finally, with respect to the quality of the workplace for planners, Selbst suggests that anything which produces the anticipation of organizational crisis may foster anxiety, while long-run threat tends to produce lowered morale, the internalization of problems, and resigned indifference (1978:865). Similarly, an on-going crisis may produce a loss of confidence (Selbst, 1978:865).

CONCLUSION

Figure 3 depicts a more refined version of the analytical framework originally presented in Chapter I (see Figure 1). It suggests that unemployment, and its effects on attention, income, and organizational activity, as well as the attribution of responsibility for joblessness affect the intensity, form, distribution, and content of political participation. Socioeconomic status, age, ethnicity, and social support affect both the impact of high unemployment on personal economic circumstances as well as political participation directly.

The nature of political participation, in turn, affects the composition of council and its electoral outlook and policies (Frey, 1983). Policies, in turn, as well as organizational crisis, conflicting political pressures, and dependency on business influence the various levels of planning and the quality of the workplace for planners.

The next chapter now turns to an in-depth analysis of the effects of unemployment on political participation.
Figure 3. Factors underlying the relationships in the Analytical Framework
CHAPTER III

THE POLITICAL REPERCUSSIONS OF HIGH UNEMPLOYMENT

This chapter explores the impact of high unemployment on political participation. First, the conditions under which unemployment reduces participation are discussed. This is followed by consideration of the circumstances which produce protest, defined as participation of a critical nature. The left-right dimension of participation is then discussed, with a special section on how high unemployment and neoconservatism have affected politics in Vancouver. The final section looks briefly at the effect of high unemployment on the democracy-authority dimension.

POLITICAL APATHY

From the Chapter II discussion, it appears that unemployment has a negative effect on several factors associated with political participation: membership in a union and possibly other types of organizations, residential stability, marriage, feelings of efficacy, economic optimism, and income. In fact, survey data suggest that the unemployed are less likely than employed persons to vote (Wolfinger and Rosenstone, 1980:29; Brody and Sniderman, 1977:346; Schlozman and Verba, 1979:241), write to officials, and campaign (Schlozman and Verba, 1979:241).
High unemployment would presumably increase the number of people adversely affected and reduce the overall level of participation. However, under certain circumstances, explored in the following section, high unemployment fosters protest.

Five respondents reported decreased participation in public meetings concerning B.C. Place. However, this is not necessarily due to high unemployment. The issue may be worn out, or potential participants may have been distracted by provincial issues. Decreased participation at public meetings could also reflect a slowdown in the rate of new development.

In contrast, two planners noted that the citizens' committees are as active as ever. These committees were established by the local area planning program. Recently, three more committees were established to plan mitigation of the impacts of transit stations on local residents. Participation in local area planning is generally higher than participation in city-wide affairs (Gil and Lucchesi, 1979:554).

Parenthetically, a councillor noted that since the recession, self-employed persons, who are not eligible for unemployment insurance, have less time for political participation. These people are not unemployed as defined in Chapter I, pointing to the need to reevaluate our conceptualization of unemployment.

Three conditions were identified which may exacerbate the negative effect of high unemployment on political participation: a rising unemployment rate, the left-of-center party as incumbent, and chronic high
unemployment.

**Rising unemployment.** Rosenstone contends that unemployment temporarily reduces political participation while the unemployed make adjustments; the negative effect of unemployment on political participation appears to disappear by the sixteenth week (1982). This suggests that a rising unemployment rate would reduce political participation more than would a stable unemployment rate.

**The left-of-center party as incumbent.** Given the traditional alignment between the working class and the left-of-center party (usually the labor, socialist, or liberal party, depending on the number of major parties and other factors), the unemployed are more likely to abstain from voting in federal elections when the left-of-center party is incumbent, than when the conservatives are incumbent. Johnston contends that the unemployed may wish "to punish the Liberal governments but find the Conservatives an inappropriate vehicle by which to do so. No such compunctions restrain the unemployed from punishing the Conservatives by a swing to the Liberals" (1983:22).

This pattern does not hold in B.C. where the unemployed tended to support the Conservative party in the 1980 national election. This province may be susceptible to the claim that the New Democratic Party is bad for investment (Johnston, 1983:26). However, conservative party victories in Canada, the United States, and Great Britain, suggest B.C.'s voting pattern is no longer the exception. This trend is partially a function of persistent high unemployment, to which the discussion now turns.
Persistent high unemployment. With the economy the most important problem facing the nation, one would expect years of economic failure to loosen ties to political parties and the political system (Alt, 1979:200). Indeed, decreased partisanship and voter turnout have been documented for several countries since the 1960's (Tuckel and Tejera, 1983; Coates, 1982:141; Rosenstone, 1982:43; Alford, 1982; Alt, 1979).

The perceived ability of the Canadian, American and British governments to manage the economy has eroded during this period (Pammett, 1984:284; Kiewiet, 1983:113; Alt, 1979:171). This is why we do not find anger so much as "bemused detachment" and an "apolitical political culture" (Pammett, 1984:284). The President of the polling firm, Decima, believes that the current recession has fostered a "post-survivor mentality," the belief that individuals are better equipped to solve their economic problems than are business and government (Nagle, 1983).

Alternatively, Orr argues that low turnout coincides with a renaissance of local participation in grass roots and community self-help organizations (1982). Public officials in the United States, particularly at the local level, have been under pressure to provide ways for citizens to participate in government decisions, especially financial decisions (Rehfuss, 1978:1). However, Bradshaw claims that disillusionment with the citizen participation process and economic pressures are causing citizens to question the funding of public participation programs and to reexamine the demands made on their own resources (1982:358).
PROTEST

This section looks at the circumstances which facilitate or moderate protest during high unemployment. It concludes with a brief comparison of the depressions of the 1930's and 1980's.

The unemployment rate is a stronger determinant of political behavior than the personal experience of unemployment (Weatherford, 1983:885; Kinder, 1981; Kinder and Kiewiet, 1981:150,152, 1979; Campbell et al., 1960:399). High unemployment seems to foster the perception that unemployment is a community problem. Thus, Hayes and Nutman contend that by 1980, the British media had become sympathetic toward the unemployed (1981:5).

Although the individual experience of unemployment may reduce political participation, very high unemployment may increase political activity by the unemployed and employed alike. Recall from Chapter II that the electorate tends to vote out the incumbent during slow or negative economic growth and that the effect crosses party lines.

Those financially worse off are substantially more likely to vote out the incumbent during slow or negative economic growth than during rapid growth (Alford, 1982:14-15; Tufte, 1978:129). Conversely, in good times, persons worse off may be more supportive of the status quo than persons better off as they stand to gain the most from continuing growth (Alford, 1982:17).

Cross-sectional data suggest that high unemployment is associated with
increased voting rates (Silberman and Durden, 1975). Similarly, survey data on voting in the 1980 federal election (Johnston, 1983:43) suggest that the unemployed are less likely to abstain from voting in regions with above average unemployment rates. In B.C., the unemployed were more likely than the employed to vote (Johnston, 1983:43). This may relate to the high level of organized labor in this province. On the other hand, high unemployment tends to produce polarized politics, as discussed in the next section, and conflict, in turn, tends to stimulate political participation, as noted in Chapter II.

Survey data on voting in the 1980 national election also suggest, when viewed in conjunction with electoral results, that the unemployed support parties weak in their province. Recall that the Canadian Commonwealth Federation and Social Credit Party were born in the 1930's. The United Party of B.C. formed in 1984, but it is too early to tell whether it is a viable party.

There are several factors which moderate protest, including the characteristics of the unemployed, economic individualism, fear of repression, economic dependency, chronic high unemployment, and widespread unemployment. These are briefly discussed in turn.

Factors that Moderate Protest

Characteristics of the unemployed. At high levels of unemployment, the unemployed are a socially heterogenous group (Garraty, 1978). This hinders the formation of the collective identity required for collective protest.
Recall from Chapter II that professionals tend to avoid conflict. Similarly, the "nontraditional" unemployed (professionals, managers, and technicians) generally avoid protest. A September 1984 meeting of a nontraditional unemployed support group concluded that the nontraditional unemployed are unaccustomed to protest, confrontation, and high profile activities. However, two councillors suggested that unionized professionals are more likely than nonunionized professionals to construe unemployment as a community problem and to protest.

Although lower status individuals bear the brunt of unemployment, they may be politically inactive for reasons more closely related to their socioeconomic status than to their current employment status (Schlozman and Verba, 1979; Kramer, 1971). Recall from Chapter II that low income individuals tend to shun abstract causes. This may help to explain why the unemployed are difficult to organize (Kennedy and Davis, 1984:39; Garraty, 1978:195). For example, the Unemployed Workers of Manitoba, a group which lobbies for the unemployed in such areas as welfare legislation and unemployment insurance regulations, is having difficulty attracting members (Globe and Mail, 1 May 1984:5).

Nevertheless, it appears that the working class provides the bulk of the electoral response to economic decline (Hibbs, 1982b:274, Weatherford, 1978; Campbell et al., 1960:384). In addition, "since he is relatively disadvantaged and perceives few traditional means of effective influence, the alienated worker is a prime recruit [for protest groups] if organized and led" (Mishler, 1979:94). Because the unemployed cannot strike, they may be more likely to use the streets for protest (Piven and Cloward,
However, protest tends to be sporadic, unfocused, rhetorical and melancholic (Garraty, 1978:182). Factors which reduce political activity tend to work against organized protest.

Protest may be more organized where there is a strong labor movement. When the unemployment rate is high and unions' bargaining strength is threatened by the loss of members, unions are compelled to become more politically active. This effect was suggested by a respondent who works with unemployed union members. In B.C., the unions appear to be responsible for most of the organized protest (e.g. Solidarity, the Unemployment Action Centres, the Labour Council, and the Commission on Economic Alternatives).

Four councillors, two social planners, and two city planners claimed that there is increased class conflict or class consciousness. They probably had in mind those activities in which the unions have been involved, as Schlozman and Verba found that the unemployed are no more class conscious than the employed (1979:110). However, their study was conducted before the present recession and, thus, may not capture the effect of high unemployment on union activity and its role in politicizing economic well-being.

Economic individualism. Recall from Chapter II that economic individualism negates the politicization of economic well-being. The earliest form of protest during the Great Depression was looting and denials of evictions (Piven and Cloward, 1977:49). In 1929, it was
generally felt that the depression would be short-lived (Piven and Cloward, 1977:45; Gallacher, 1969:60) and it was given little news coverage (Piven and Cloward, 1977:45).

However, by late 1932, there was fear of widespread pauperism (Gallacher, 1969:73). The extent of distress belied the customary conviction that one's economic fortune was a matter of personal responsibility (Piven and Cloward, 1977:43-44; Gallacher, 1969:31,70). Participation in social action movements tends to increase as awareness of the structural causes of social problems increases (Rothman, 1974:338), and in the late years of the Great Depression, people were demanding a political economy that would prevent a reoccurrence (Gallacher, 1969:108).

The National Unemployed Workers' Association of Canada demanded a moratorium on evictions, work at union wages, and noncontributory insurance (Gallacher, 1969:141). In B.C., Liberals demanded a minimum income and work with wages (Ormsby, 1962). Agitation by the unemployed became balanced pressure put upon government, and this was followed by pressure from employed individuals to ensure their livelihoods were never endangered (Gallacher, 1969:141).

Similarly, Garraty contends that, by 1900, partially as a result of the most severe depression up to that time, unemployment came to be recognized as a social problem for which some general protections were needed (1978:121-130). By 1911, England had an unemployment insurance program; by 1935, all of the industrial nations except France had a similar program (Garraty, 1978:213).

Garraty also suggests that "the internalization of what may be called
the Keynesianism value system has altered the psychology of unemployment": workers are more likely to hold the government responsible for unemployment than previously (1978:251). However, as will be discussed in the next section, Keynesianism appears to be falling into disrepute.

Fear of repression. Fears of repression during the 1930's were legitimate fears (Garraty: 1978:184). Demonstrators frequently clashed with police and, on one occasion, the American president used military force (Piven and Cloward, 1977:49,53). Canadian readers may recall that the 1935 On-to-Ottawa Trek ended in bloodshed in Regina.

Economic dependency. Garraty contends that dependency on government relief moderated protest during the Depression (1978:186,187). Recall from Chapter II that poverty reduces political participation and that dependency on welfare increases during a period of high unemployment. However, it appears that destitute people in the 1930's came to hate the bureaucrats and regulations which deprived them of their self-respect (Broadfoot, 1973:15), pointing to the potential for protest.

Persistent unemployment. Persistent unemployment tends to be discounted. Increasingly high levels of unemployment became acceptable during the 1930's (Garraty, 1978:167). During the prosperity of the 1940's, the Canadian government was committed to full employment; however, since unemployment began to rise in the 1960's, full employment has been redefined to include higher and higher levels of "normal" unemployment (Vancouver Unemployment Action Centre, 1983:2; Deaton, 1983:15; Garraty, 1978:242-7).
Widespread high unemployment. That countries of diverse political persuasions are experiencing high unemployment probably intensifies the perception that governments are unable to manage the economy. Garraty claims that the international nature of the 1930's depression prevented blame being directed at individual governments (1978:182). People perceived they were all in the same boat, that there was no enemy (Broadfoot, 1973:358). Runciman claims that there was more economic inequality than people realized, as there was little information on the distribution of property (1966:73).

The 1930's and Today

The last time the unemployment rate was above ten percent was in the 1930's. Readers will undoubtedly be interested in comparisons between that period and the 1980's. The impression exists that there was more protest at that time; however, comparative studies do not appear to exist. Several factors could possibly have contributed to higher levels of protest then:

First, the unemployment rate at the peak of the Depression was about nineteen percent as opposed to twelve percent in 1984. Because the early unemployment statistics exclude some forms of unemployment now included (such as layoffs), the difference between the two periods of unemployment is greater than the official unemployment rate indicates.

In addition, the unemployed may have been a more cohesive group in the 1930's than today. Unemployed workers are currently divided between programs established by unions and charities. In contrast, in several provinces during the 1930's, unemployed single men were concentrated in
relief camps where political discussions leading to protest were a major form of recreation. This comparison was made by a man in conversation with the writer, who had participated in the On-to-Ottawa Trek and who is still active in the labor movement.

During the 1930's, there was fear of widespread pauperism, and destitute or sympathetic people demanded that the provincial government provide relief for the unemployed and find markets for local production (Gallacher, 1969). Today's social programs reduce the intensity of economic deprivation associated with unemployment, although there is increasing concern about their adequacy.

Finally, during the Depression, the government came to be seen as having some responsibility towards the unemployed. In the 1980's, the efficacy of government intervention is being questioned. Alberta's minister of manpower recently stated that unemployment motivates the workforce; "if any politician had said in 1934 that unemployment was a good thing, he would have been very quickly looking for a new job himself" (Todd, 1984).

LEFT-RIGHT DIMENSION

This section considers, in turn, the conditions under which high unemployment produces increased liberalism, status polarization, and, finally, increased conservatism.

Increased Liberalism

Because the left-of-center party generally reduces unemployment at the expense of inflation (Hibbs, 1977), increased unemployment tends to give
the Liberal, Democratic, and Labour parties in Canada, the U.S., and Britain an electoral advantage (e.g. Johnston, 1983; Monroe and Laughlin, 1983; Hibbs, 1982a; Schlozman and Verba, 1979; Garraty, 1978:186; Goodman and Kramer, 1975; Meltzer and Vellrath, 1975). The positive relationship between unemployment and liberalism, therefore, depends on the left-of-center party's reputation for economic management. However, Canadians perceive larger differences between the parties than may actually exist (Johnston, 1983:16; Hibbs, 1977:1473).

Since voters tend to vote out the incumbent in an economic downturn, the election of an opposition party on the left does not necessarily signify an ideological shift. Furthermore, businessmen and bankers may become lobbyists for the poor where the unemployment rate is high (Piven and Cloward, 1977:64; Campbell et al., 1960:384); however, this does not necessarily reflect altruism or increased liberalism. In every case, reform agencies established by the Canadian government during the Depression were cast in the mold advocated by business (Finkel, 1979:168).

**Status Polarization**

Status polarized voting has been observed for the 1930's (Campbell et al., 1960) as well as for the recession years of 1958 and 1960 (Weatherford, 1978). In Britain, those personally better off tend to increase support of the Conservative party, whereas those worse off tend to decrease their support of the Conservatives (Butler and Stokes, 1974:384). Working class Americans were most severely affected by the 1958 and 1960 recessions and were most likely to vote according to their class (Weatherford, 1978).
In the eighties, status polarization has been observed in the Netherlands (Peper, 1982:109) and Germany (Cox, 1982:18), and in Britain among less strong Labour supporters (Alt, 1979:256). Conflict appears to be over income redistribution (Peper, 1982:109) and the role of government (Cox, 1982:18). Cox notes that German unions are angry about increased business profits contrasted with decreased wages and social expenditures (p. 19). This seems to describe the current situation in B.C., as well.

Coates argues that the recession strengthened the faction within Britain's political parties which wished to make a break with the economic policies of the 1960's and replace them with policies closer to the parties' very particular political philosophies (1982:144). However, he notes that entrenched interests have forced a retreat back to the middle road (p. 147).

In contrast, Butler and Stokes have described how the affluence of the forties, fifties, and sixties reduced class consciousness and status polarized voting in Britain (1974:194-205). They suggest that the Labour party separated itself from the unions and became more middle class in composition; and, subsequently, the convergence of Labour and Conservative policies produced a decrease in the perceived differences between the parties and in voter turnout, especially in working class areas; and produced a more unpredictable electorate.

**Increased Conservatism**

Under certain conditions, high unemployment may increase political support for the conservative party or its ideas. First, the effect of rising unemployment is examined, followed by the effect of stagflation,
and, finally, the effect of high unemployment and neoconservatism in politics in Vancouver.

**Rising unemployment.** A rising unemployment rate may give the conservative party an electoral advantage given the traditional alignment between the working class and the left-of-center party. The Democrats and Independents in the United States are more likely than the Republicans to be unemployed and, presumably, to be distracted from voting by recent unemployment (Rosenstone, 1982:43). Goodman and Kramer found that the level of unemployment is associated with support for the Democrats, whereas the rate of increase in the level of unemployment is associated with support for the Republicans (1975).

**Stagflation.** Unemployment must compete with many issues for attention. When the unemployment rate increases, concern about it increases; however, when the unemployment rate is stable, concern about inflation increases and only the unemployment experience of particular groups (older persons who remember the Great Depression) seem to influence public opinion (Fisher and Huizinga, 1982:16-7; Hibbs, 1979).

Stagflation may reduce the leftist party's electoral advantage. As unemployment and prices began to rise simultaneously in the late 1950's, the Keynesian analysis of unemployment began to lose favor, and by the mid seventies, it was being argued that government spending increases unemployment (Garraty, 1978:239,249).

The unemployed are more averse to inflation than to unemployment (Hibbs, 1979:715; Alt, 1979:193) when they believe that increased
inflation is the price of reduced unemployment (Alt, 1979:193). Taxpayers want reduced taxes and, to a lesser extent, reduced social spending (Clark and Ferguson, 1983:177; Ladd and Wilson, 1982:139; Danziger and Ring, 1982:48). In many countries, social goals have been shunted aside in favor of economic objectives, and violations of trade union rights have increased (1984--Gloomy year, 1985). In addition, survey data suggest that macroeconomic conditions are more important to the popularity of the American president than redistributive policies (Monroe and Laughlin, 1983:337).

Alt contends that "people must feel well off before they can be persuaded to be generous towards others in their social outlook" (1979:272). This same sentiment was expressed by a respondent who had assumed that the Social Credit party would have been voted out in the last provincial election. The decline of the British economy produced a greater decline in working class than middle class support for the Labour incumbent (Hibbs, 1982b:273). Similarly, Labour supporters whose economic position had deteriorated were more likely than supporters of other parties to cease favoring spending on social services (Alt, 1979:260). In the United States, opposition to welfare expenditures increased at all income levels between 1973 and 1977 (Clark and Ferguson, 1983:181).

Classical democratic and marxist theories both hold that economic security and equality are preconditions for altruism. Similarly, Maslow's "hierarchy of needs" illustrates how basic needs, such as hunger, thirst, security, and achievement, must be satisfied before less urgent needs, such as justice, beauty, and order can be met (1968). There is also
experimental evidence to suggest that scarcity encourages self-interest. Subjects in one experiment divided a payment between themselves and a co-worker more fairly when the payment was sufficient than when it was insufficient (Greenberg, 1981:294).

However, the working class is not necessarily less class conscious. British Labour supporters were not less likely to cease sympathizing with strikers than Labour and non-Labour supporters whose economic positions had improved (Alt, 1979:26). But Labour supporters are in a dilemma because the public is less willing to pay for social programs (Butler and McNaughton, 1984:24; Hibbs, 1982b:273; Alt, 1979:261). Of those Labour supporters whose economic circumstances had deteriorated, less strong supporters became more partisan than strong supporters (Alt, 1979:256).

An alternate explanation is that government intervention is perceived to hinder economic growth. In 1952, in the context of prosperity, a substantial number of Democrats supported Eisenhower, accepting the Republican theme of prosperity without government intervention (Campbell et al., 1960:399).

**Vancouver politics.** One councillor noted resentment by the unemployed of tax dollars going to community service groups, adding, "It's hard to sell soft." Similarly, a planner reported seeing newcomers at citizens' committee meetings complaining about the "fat" at City Hall, even though real City expenditures per capita actually decreased between 1971 and 1983 (City of Vancouver, 1983:9).

Two respondents noted that since the recession, citizens seem to care
less about the quality of development in the city and more about job
creation: "People get hyper about jobs and complain about refusals of
development applications."

More people than anticipated wanted to participate in
discussions on [the inner-city conversion areas], and revisions
were needed to recognize emerging goals such as streamlining of
the development process and increasing housing densities....The
Fairview Heights program encountered its own delays resulting
from staff being unable to reach agreement with the citizens
planning committee who challenged data and upheld their support
for apartment rezoning in the area (City of Vancouver Planning
Department, 1984:22).

Seventy-six percent of respondents to the "Choices for Vancouver's
Future" pamphlet (n=450) agreed with the "Coreplan" strategy not to limit
growth at this time; only 24 percent felt that the benefits of limiting
growth would outweigh the disadvantages (Stott, 1984:15). In contrast, the
prerecessionary "Goals for Vancouver" report devoted more space to issues
of aesthetics than economics (Vancouver Planning Commission, 1980). Even
no-growth advocates may have softened their stance to one of "do-it-well,"
according to a planner from a neighboring municipality.

Increased concern about jobs and economic growth is appropriate in a
recession, but, as one planner noted, people seem to be less willing to
consider alternatives that will create just as many jobs while preserving
noneconomic goals. As the wife of the Canada Ports Corporation chairman
so aptly put it after a visit to Taiwan, "We have to decide what kind of
pollution we want, whether it's smoke or dirt or unemployment" (Daniels,
1985). This point was raised at a workshop in the Planning Department to
discuss why the public was not more supportive of council with respect to
controlling the development of B.C. Place.
The development industry may be taking advantage of this hysteria about jobs by pressing for a streamlined approval process and less exacting development regulations. Six respondents noted that developers, builders, architects, and construction workers are more active in contacting officials and more visible at council meetings, although one councillor said that they are less interested in running for office as they cannot afford to lose a government contract. One planner believes that citizens have been manipulated by B.C. Place which, for example, closed its briefs to council in late 1983 and early 1984 with the argument that the Corporation's development strategy would create jobs.

Similarly, a planner from a neighboring municipality described how the construction industry lobbied for reduced standards on the basis that it would be able to produce more affordable housing. However, while standards were not enforced, prices did not fall. Another planner suggested that the citizens' committees have provided an open forum wherein developers have won the sympathy of citizens. On the other hand, developers may be responding to the removal of development incentives in 1982 such as soft-cost write-offs and the Multi-Unit Residential Building Program.

In the recent Vancouver civic election (17 November 1984), the conservative Non-Partisan Association (N.P.A.) gained in the popular vote and picked up a seat on the Parks Board. However, in the ensuing by-election (2 February 1985), to settle a contested aldermanic seat, the Committee of Progressive Electors' candidate was returned. This unexpected result, given the trend towards conservatism just described,
may be due to the controversy about Provincial education cutbacks, which was at fever pitch at the time of the by-election. Education tends to be a bipartisan issue (Clark and Ferguson, 1983:177). Indeed, Vancouver's polarized council is unanimous in its support of school board autonomy. The controversy may have hurt the chances of the N.P.A. candidate with "Socred" ties.

On the other hand, British Columbians may be becoming disillusioned with restraint. An opinion poll indicates that voters dislike the Social Credit government's lack of feeling, and even Socred supporters may have abstained in the recent by-election in the former Socred stronghold of North Okanagan (Barrett, 1984:2). Perhaps as a result of these sentiments, the "restraint" was replaced by theme of "renewal" in the government's third anniversary and 1985 budget speeches.

Before, the discussion is summarized, we take a brief look at the implications of high unemployment for tolerance of authority.

**RISING UNEMPLOYMENT AND AUTHORITARIANISM**

A rising unemployment rate may foster support for the party with the strongest leadership. It may produce uncertainty which appears to increase tolerance of authority (Arrow, 1974:93). Bill Bennett was "marketed" as a tough leader in the 1983 election because polls showed that "British Columbians were beginning to lose 'spirit' in the face of economic hardship" (Barrett, 1984:2). Leadership was a major issue in recent civic elections as well as in the elections of Reagan, Hitler, and Roosevelt, which took place in the context of economic decline.
SUMMARY

This chapter has explored the impact of unemployment on political participation. The following relationships were hypothesized and are graded according to the confidence which can be placed in them. Two stars (**) indicate that the relationship is frequently observed in different contexts. One star (*) signifies that the evidence is weak or that the relationship holds only in certain contexts. Finally, no star indicates that the proposition is speculation.

1. High unemployment reduces conventional political participation

   - when the unemployment rate is rising, as recently unemployed persons are preoccupied; (*)

   - when the left-of-center party is incumbent, as voters may wish to punish the incumbent party but find the right-of-center party an inappropriate vehicle by which to do so; (*)

   - when high unemployment is a chronic situation, as years of economic failure may loosen ties to the political system. (*)

2. High unemployment produces political inequality

   - where the working class is poorly organized, as lower status individuals, who bear the burden of unemployment, tend to be politically inactive; (*)

   - when the left-of-center party is incumbent, as the unemployed, who are largely working class individuals, wish to punish the government but find the right-of-center party an inappropriate vehicle by which to do so. (*)
3. High unemployment fosters protest, as it tends to increase the perception that unemployment is a community problem and, consequently, unemployment is more likely to be politicized. However, due to factors that moderate participation, protest tends to be "sporadic, unfocused, rhetorical, and melancholic." (**)

4. Protest is moderated by the following factors:

- the fact that the unemployed are largely lower status individuals who tend to be politically inactive where the working class is poorly organized; (*)
- the social heterogeneity of the unemployed at high levels of unemployment; (*)
- the tendency for nonunionized professionals to avoid political conflict; (*)
- economic individualism, as government is not held responsible for personal economic circumstances; (**) 
- fear of repression; (*)
- dependency on welfare; (*)
- persistent high unemployment, as the unemployment rate tends to be discounted; (*)
- widespread high unemployment, as it is difficult to attribute responsibility to any particular government. (*)

5. High unemployment fosters increased liberalism or support for the left-of-center party

- when the left-of-center party has a reputation for reducing
unemployment; (*)
- when the conservative party is incumbent and voters want a change; (**) 
- when the need for increased government intervention is perceived. (*)

6. High unemployment produces status polarization, as those worse off tend to be working class individuals who increase their support for the left-of-center party, while those better off tend to increase their support for the right-of-center party. (*)

7. High unemployment fosters increased conservatism or support for the right-of-center party
- when the unemployment rate is rising, given the traditional alignment between the working class and the left-of-center party, as working class individuals are most likely to be preoccupied with unemployment; (*)
- when the inflation rate is also high, since people tend not to support policies which will increase government spending or hinder economic growth. (*)

8. Rising unemployment fosters uncertainty and tolerance for authority.

This concludes the discussion of the political repercussions of high unemployment. The next chapter turns to the implications for city planning of the effects hypothesized in this chapter.
CHAPTER IV

CITY PLANNING AND THE POLITICAL REPERCUSSIONS OF HIGH UNEMPLOYMENT

This chapter explores the implications for city planning of the political repercussions of high unemployment. The Chapter II theory and the Chapter III propositions are synthesized with input from the interviews. The discussion is organized according to the levels of planning identified in the introduction: strategic, normative, and operational. This is followed by a brief discussion of the implications of the political environment for the quality of the workplace for planners.

STRATEGIC PLANNING

This section examines the different effects of increased conservatism, liberalism, and status polarization on strategic planning.

Conservatism and Strategic Planning

In the previous chapter, it was argued that high unemployment fosters support for the conservative party when the unemployment rate is rising (given the traditional alignment between the working class and the left-of-center party) or when the inflation rate is high.

Conservatism appears to reduce strategic planning by reducing funding
for planning. This is not to say that increased planning is necessarily a good thing. The Canadian Institute of Planners' Task Force on the Future of the Planning Profession has, for example, encouraged planners "to de-regulate matters which are no longer of value to society" (1982:13).

Nevertheless, Thomas contends that planners in Conservative Britain are limiting themselves to environmental issues in which their expertise is generally acknowledged and which have appeal that cuts across party lines; "meanwhile whole areas of planning debate, notably, the relationship between social welfare and town planning may have all but disappeared" (1984:69-70). Even in the affluent fifties, the Conservatives in Britain pursued "more strictly environmental goals with zest...while lessening government's sense of responsibility for the fullest implementations of other social-policy features of town planning" (Foley, 1973:87). This suggests that the current attack on social planning is as much a political as fiscal effect.

In 1984, appropriations to the Planning and Social Planning Departments (as a proportion of total city appropriations) were reduced (see Figure 4), and both departments are the target of further cuts (Krangle, 1984). Cuts have not been across-the-board as one planner suggested. The Economic Development Office, which does economic planning, has not been cut back (see Figure 4), and appropriations to the office have increased as a ratio of appropriations for physical and social planning (see Figure 5).

However, the most notable change in funding for planning since 1975 is in social planning as a ratio of appropriations for physical planning.
Figure 4. Percentage of Total Appropriations, City of Vancouver: Planning and Social Planning Departments, Economic Development Office, Health and Social Welfare account, Public Works account, and Police Department (half of total appropriations). (Source: City of Vancouver Operating Budget. Old accounts have been adjusted for consistency with present accounts.)
Figure 5. Ratios of Appropriations: Planning and Social Planning Departments and the Economic Development Office. (Source: City of Vancouver Operating Budget. Old accounts have been adjusted for consistency with present accounts.)
This may reflect the transfer of responsibility for social welfare to the provincial government (see Figure 4). The Social Planning Department may have also been spared significant cuts to date because Vancouver has had a left-wing council since 1982. The city has increased operating grants to community service groups whose funding has been cut by the provincial government. The Social Planning department has also earned a reputation for efficiency (McMartin, 1984). One social planner remarked that council "relies on the department to fill in the cracks." Finally, social planning in Vancouver has some protection as a separate departmental function. In a neighboring municipality, the only social planner was replaced with a general purpose planner.

Economic planning may be the least likely component of planning to be affected by increased conservatism during a period of high unemployment because the municipality has a self-interest in economic growth. However, an integrated approach to planning may be necessary to deal with deep-seated economic problems (Lichfield, 1979:7).

Reade contends that planners have less understanding of their subject matter and objectives than other government advisors (1982:51). However, Lithwick believes that planners are becoming more circumspect in their interventions (1982:6). This suggests that increased conservatism may have some rationality advantages. On the other hand, resources may be directed away from planning work to defensive activities (Lithwick, 1982:6).

The provincial government is considering legislation that would provide incentives for municipalities to deregulate land use (Palmer, 1985). Bill 9, The Municipal Amendment Act, has already removed authority
from regional districts, although all of the Greater Vancouver Regional District municipalities, except one, joined together to contract the services of the District (Droettboom, 1984:9-10).

It was mentioned at the beginning of this section, that the Task Force on the Future of the Planning Profession is encouraging selective deregulation. It wants planners to recognize the needs of the market when writing or evaluating regulations (1982:14).

Similarly, the Ten Year Task Force of the Vancouver Planning Department has highlighted the need to "sharpen up our regulating processes." 1983 was the tenth year of the Annual Review management process. The Task Force was to evaluate the department's achievements and anticipate changes (City of Vancouver Planning Department, 1984:51). Unfortunately, except for brief comments in the 1983/1984 Annual Review, documentation is for internal use only. Subsequently, the Planning Department gave lower priority to the departmental objective of "regulating and guiding private and public actions and continually improving regulatory by-laws" (City of Vancouver Planning Department, 1984:51,54).

Of course, the "review and rationalization" work of the Planning Department is partially a reflection of the age of the department: policies and regulations "developed at different times for different purposes. As a result there is not a satisfactory, coordinated, organized body of policy" (City of Vancouver Planning Department, 1984:80). However, the following incidents suggest that the Planning Department is responding to external pressures for deregulation.
Two planners and two councillors reported that the City is less careful with respect to the quality of small developments, given complaints by developers, unemployed construction workers, and anonymous individuals about refusals of development applications. Another planner reported feeling frustrated by the unwillingness of citizens to consider alternative approaches to the development of B.C. Place.

In addition, a planner from a neighboring municipality described how pressure by developers and architects produced tacit approval of compact housing. The development industry had argued that compact housing would be more affordable. However, when it became apparent that increased densities had not made housing more affordable, the municipality halted this practice. At the time of the interview, the municipality was, instead, exploring the feasibility of housing cooperatives as an alternative to compact housing.

Demands for economic growth and job creation need not result in what Blowers has called "pre-emptive decision-making." The City of Vancouver commissioned two studies of the development permit process and assigned extra staff to speed up the existing service. In addition, the Planning Department produced a contingency plan for the central business district, which controls economic growth (City of Vancouver Planning Department, 1984:64).

Liberalism and Innovation

Chapter II argued that unemployment produces a shift toward the left under three conditions: 1) when the left-of-center party has a reputation
for reducing unemployment; 2) when the unemployment rate is high and the conservative party is incumbent; and 3) when the need for increased government intervention is perceived.

Recall from Chapter II that a liberal clientele facilitates innovation. This suggests that a shift to the left may expand the range of means considered in the achievement of objectives. The Labour-controlled Greater London Council, for example, intends to use planning in an "ambitious interventionist strategy to achieve desired social and economic goals" (Thomas, 1984:70).

Of course, when increased support for the left-of-center party reflects the deep-seated belief that capitalism is not working, the political environment will be more hospitable to planning than when the voters have merely punished the incumbent party which happens to be conservative at the time.

**Polarization and Strategic Planning**

Polarization may have a negative effect on strategic planning. Greater consensus within the working and middle classes, respectively, may impede the analysis of means. Recall from Chapter II that dominant groups tend to restrict participation in decision-making and the scope of issues (Chetkow-Yanoov, 1982:172). In addition, Mintzberg notes that a politicized environment tends to foster legitimizing roles (liaison, spokesman, and negotiator) at the expense of the entrepreneur role (1973:108). On the other hand, polarization may be a source of critical analysis. Such is the basis of our parliamentary system.
This section considers the effects on normative planning of apathy, protest, and status polarization.

Apathy and Normative Planning

The previous chapter argued that the unemployed tend to be underrepresented when the working class is poorly organized, particularly when the left-of-center party is incumbent. If the politically inactive unemployed have a distinct set of policy preferences, then normative planning is reduced unless planners counter this effect.

One planner noted that groups "must speak up first; planners are good recipients of information," adding that Canadian planners generally do not have a community organizer or advocate role which seeks to strengthen politically disadvantaged neighborhoods or groups. It is interesting to note that this respondent was not aware of any apathetic unemployed persons.

Standard public involvement programs may actually reinforce underrepresentation of the unemployed, as they tend to focus on land use and to attract middle class and organized groups (Blowers, 1980:32,70). Recall from Chapter II that low income persons, the majority of unemployed, generally shun programs that do not aim to improve their immediate living conditions.

It was also suggested in Chapter III that persistent high unemployment reduces voter turnout and working class participation. It seems reasonable to expect that in a politically apathetic environment, the
value base of planning remains unchallenged. Planning can be expected to reflect the values of interest groups, in a brokerage style of planning.

### Protest and Value Premises

Chapter III described how a high or rising unemployment rate fosters protest. Protest tends to increase uncertainty and solicitousness in public officials gauging political winds (Piven & Cloward, 1977:28). Increased solicitousness does not necessarily result in the meaningful reevaluation of value premises, however. Recall that the reforms of the thirties were shaped by business. Citizen consultation may be used to neutralize demands (Hulchanski, 1974). In addition, uncertainty may increase intolerance, prejudice, and cynicism among planners as others (Emery and Trist, 1975:59). Recall, on the other hand, that organized protest may increase the electoral chances of reformers.

### Polarization and Normative Planning

Status polarization may reduce normative planning. Chapter II noted how community conflict tends to reduce the responsiveness of officials. However, by facilitating participation of the working class, polarization may promote the reconsideration of values in planning in the long run.

### OPERATIONAL PLANNING

This section considers the effects on operational planning of status polarization, a shift to either the right or left, and increased tolerance of authority. First, planners in a polarized environment may have difficulty cultivating agreement on actions. It was noted in Chapter II that community conflict hinders decision-making.
In contrast, a shift to either the right or left, which reflects increased political homogeneity, should reduce the uncertainty characteristic of a polarized political environment. Presumably, this would facilitate long-range planning.

Increased tolerance of authority may also facilitate operational planning. Arrow argues that authority economizes on the exchange of information (1974:74). However, he notes that this advantage is countered by the possibility of "unnecessary errors," that is, by a reduction in strategic planning.

QUALITY OF THE WORKPLACE

Increased conservatism may produce role confusion in planners faced with defending their profession (Healy et al., 1982b; Sternlieb, 1978:205). Recall that role confusion tends to reduce job satisfaction. Polarization may also increase role confusion, as planners may be more aware of competing demands. However, none of the planners who were interviewed expressed confusion about their role. They seemed to feel that the leftist majority on council is on their side.

SUMMARY

Chapter IV has described the impact of the political repercussions of high unemployment on strategic, normative, and operational planning. The hypotheses generated in this chapter are listed below and graded according to the three star system described in Chapter III.
Strategic Planning

1. Increased conservatism reduces strategic planning by
   - reducing funding for planning; (*)
   - increasing acceptance of deregulation and a reduced scope for planning activities; (*)
   - compelling planners to direct resources away from planning work to defensive activities. (*)

2. Increased liberalism widens the range of means considered in the achievement of objectives. (*)

3. Status polarization reduces strategic planning by
   - producing greater consensus within the working and middle classes;
   - fostering legitimizing roles.

Normative Planning

4. Underrepresentation of the unemployed reduces normative planning unless planners have a community organizer role.

5. In a politically apathic environment, particularly where the working class is underrepresented, the value base of planning is not challenged and planners are brokers of interest group pressures.

6. Protest promotes the reconsideration of value premises by increasing political uncertainty and solicitousness of officials. (*)

7. Protest reduces normative planning by producing prejudice and intolerance in planners, as a function of uncertainty.
8. By reducing the responsiveness of officials, status polarization reduces normative planning, but, by increasing participation rates, it increases normative planning in the long run. (*)

Operational Planning

9. Polarized politics hinder the cultivation of consensus.

10. A shift to either the right or left facilitates long-range planning by reducing political conflict and uncertainty.

11. Increased tolerance of authority facilitates decision-making.

Quality of the Workplace

12. Increased conservatism reduces the quality of the workplace for planners by challenging the rationale of planning, and producing role confusion and job dissatisfaction. (*)

13. Political polarization increases role confusion and job satisfaction by producing conflicting political pressures.

The thesis now turns to an examination of the fiscal repercussions of high unemployment and the implications for planning.
CHAPTER V

CITY PLANNING AND THE FISCAL REPERCUSSIONS
OF HIGH UNEMPLOYMENT

This chapter discusses the implications of fiscal restraint for the various levels of planning and the quality of the workplace. First, a few words are said about municipal finances during high unemployment.

HIGH UNEMPLOYMENT AND MUNICIPAL FINANCES

High unemployment affects both city revenues and expenditures. It tends to put a lid on taxes as the number of land assessment notices that are appealed increases (4,600 fight assessments, 1984). At the same time, where municipalities have responsibility for relief, such as during the Great Depression, welfare expenditures increase.

In Vancouver, budgetary pressure has been reduced by the transfer of monies from the Property Endowment Fund to balance the last two budgets. However, some councillors believe the City should be more cautious and cut services since the recession could be prolonged. Mayor Harcourt has indicated that unless taxes are raised, funding for parks and recreation, planning, social planning, and libraries will be cut (Krangle, 1984).

"At a time of public expenditure cuts, planning is particularly vulnerable as the necessity for large, apparently non-productive planning
departments is questioned" (Blowers, 1980:18). Layton contends that while the affluence of 1950's through the early 1970's "provided may crumbs to distribute to the poor and disadvantaged," since the late 1970's, "good planning policies and humane social programs are being haphazardly tossed to the wind (1984:391). He adds that in the 1970's, progressive reforms could be afforded, whereas in the 1980's, politicians are realigning themselves with business (p. 410). In this sense, the effects of fiscal pressure resemble the effects of increased conservatism; both may originate with high unemployment.

The City of Vancouver Planning Department has experienced budget cuts since mid-1982, at a time when Provincial megaprojects and the elimination of the official regional planning function by the Province increased workloads in the Overall Planning division (City of Vancouver Planning Department, 1984). The Area Planning division is implementing local area plans slowly, but surely, because of its commitment to citizens (City of Vancouver Planning Department, 1983:21; 1984:64,73).

On the other hand, slowed economic growth may free planners from development permit work (Procos, 1983:104). In Vancouver, applications for major developments have leveled off, producing more balanced workloads in the Zoning division (City of Vancouver Planning Department, 1983, 1984). Even during economic growth, the planning budget tends to fluctuate as federally funded housing programs come and go, and as "master" plans (e.g. the local area and central business district plans) are started up and completed (see Figure 5 in Chapter IV). Thus, many Vancouver planners are temporary staff.
In 1982 and 1983, the Social Planning Department received more money for community program grants previously funded by the provincial government. However, as noted in Chapter IV, total funding of the Social Planning Department decreased in 1984 (see Figure 5). In contrast, the Economic Development Office has received steady increases in funding although these are a small percentage of the total appropriations.

STRATEGIC PLANNING

This section examines some of the effects of fiscal restraint on strategic planning. Positive effects were noted with respect to the explicitness of criteria and the level of economic planning. Negative trends were noted with respect to the misrepresentation of budgets, ad hoc decisions, a trade-off mode of planning, increased concern with the visibility of performance, and reduced goal achievement.

Explicitness of Criteria

Fiscal restraint may foster the use of more explicit criteria in the evaluation of alternatives. British local governments, required to maintain budgets at the same level, have tended to widen the parameters of budget review and to require more explicit analysis of the relationship among community resources, objectives and problems, and expenditures (Greenwood et al., 1980).

Similarly, Rubin found that retrenchment at universities fosters a more systematic, explicit, and comparative approach to budgeting as well as increased collection of data and their use in decision-making (1980). The Vancouver Planning Department, too, claims that "we must be clearer in
our recommendations about assigning resources to planning work" (City of Vancouver Planning Department, 1984:52).

However, Greenwood et al. found that improvements to strategic analysis declined over time (1980:42). They suggest that improvements which are not made immediately may be difficult to make; that the potential for improvement may decline; and that panic may cease to be a motivating factor (pp. 42-44).

**Economic Planning**

As mentioned in Chapter IV, municipalities may be more interested than usual in economic planning when the unemployment rate is high. In the United States, cities are encouraging groups to form community development corporations to acquire property and establish businesses (Swartz, 1982:277). British planners are also becoming more entrepreneurial and promotional (Healy et al., 1982a:13).

In its most recent Annual Review, the Vancouver Planning Department gave higher priority to the objective of "suggesting and utilizing programs that provide resources to improve Vancouver" (City of Vancouver Planning Department, 1984:54). The objectives are not numbered, but the change in order is suggestive considering the order has remained unchanged for years. One planner remarked that planners should be giving more emphasis to community development and fund raising in order to generate resources. A stronger economic role has also been advocated in the planning literature (Hutton, 1983; Friedman, 1979:590). Municipalities, in general, are demanding stronger powers to develop their local economies (Union of B.C. Municipalities, 1983).
However, this emphasis on economic planning is not solely a response to economic recession and high unemployment. Reduced federal involvement in community development (Lithwick, 1982:7-8) and the failure of conventional macroeconomic policies (Lee, 1980:68) may have contributed to interventionist approaches to the economy.

**Misrepresentation of Budgets**

Budgetary pressure, particularly severe pressure (Schick, 1980) has been shown to encourage the misrepresentation of budgets, including the underestimation of revenues and manipulation of allocations (Levine et al., 1981; Rubin, 1980; Caiden, 1980). With respect to municipalities, this occurs less frequently in municipalities with a city manager (Levine et al., 1981:47). Paradoxically, such risky strategies tend to increase fiscal uncertainty (Rubin, 1980).

**Ad hoc Decisions**

Inadequate or ad hoc budgeting tends to impede long range planning. Under budgetary pressure, program development is generally sporadic and favors programs with low initial costs, although multi-year implications may be brought out to dampen demands (Schick, 1980:122).

Three planners claimed that planning is becoming more reactive due to increased workloads. Increased workloads tend to increase decision difficulty and the "use of oversight," and it may be the more important and difficult problems that are left unresolved (Cohen et al., 1976:34-35). One planner commented that there is less "real" planning, which was equated with the development of technical guidelines.
A social planner described planning in that department as more anticipatory than before the recession. However, this was attributed to the developmental stage of the department; as the backlog of needs was met, the department was able to plan for future needs. This may change under continued fiscal restraint.

**A Trade-off Mode of Planning**

One of the recommendations of the Vancouver Ten Year Task Force was to set priorities (Vancouver City Planning Department, 1984:105). The 1983/1984 Annual Review utilized three levels of priority where previously there were two. "Work which cannot be achieved with current funding" (previously second priority work) has been split into two levels of priority: "important work which requires additional funds" (second priority) and "desirable work which can be deferred" (third priority). The Review also states that careful programming and effective priority-setting are important in maximizing capacity and efficiency (City of Vancouver Planning Department, 1983:77).

One social planner is optimistic that hard times will produce more efficient community services--"community groups need to learn to set priorities"--but is concerned that groups might spend too much time raising funds and not enough time servicing the public. With respect to municipalities, Levine et al. found that severe fiscal pressure produces cutting rather than efficiency (1981:81).

A physical planner felt that there is more "real" planning now, defined as "being forced to make hard choices." Recall that another planner felt that there is less real planning now. This difference has
more to do with the two planners' perspectives on planning than with the perception of budgetary pressure which both planners acknowledged. The planner who believes there is more real planning is probably referring to the degree of change in the department, whereas the one who believes there is less real planning may be referring to the quality of that change.

Like the planner who believes there is now more real planning, Susskind (1980) argues that fiscal stress offers "opportunities for managerial reform." However, Hartman contends that the problem is not how to plan without adequate funding, but how to bring about changes that ensure needs are adequately funded (1978:82). Similarly, Hulchanski argues that the result of accepting constraints is a "trade-offs mode of decision-making," in contrast to planning as the "progressive inclusion within the scope of human choice and decision, matters that earlier appeared as constraints or unavoidable outcomes" (1974:65). There is also concern that priorities planning, by dividing up the problem and identifying what can be cut, facilitates major cuts (Hearn, 1982:172).

Visibility of Performance

In an organizational crisis such as that produced by fiscal pressure, the "visibility of performance may assume political importance" (Selbst, 1978:866). In response to scrutiny by the Conservative government, British planners are initiating and coordinating quickly executed and visible projects (Thomas, 1984:69). They are seeking to prove their relevance by getting things done (Healey et al., 1982:10). Similarly, Sternlieb contends that "the sheer frustration in the inability to deliver, which so many planners feel, makes for a vast impatience and a questioning of the
relevance of the theory" (1978a:xi). In general, planners must concern
themselves only with those issues that are definable, concrete and
solvable to be considered good managers of change and responsive to both
politicians and special interest groups (Catanese, 1974:170). However,
organizations which emphasize low costs and quantity of products are less
innovative that those which emphasize quality (Rothman, 1974:471).

Similarly, the Ten Year Task Force of the Vancouver Planning
Department has recommended that the department improve its public
relations (City of Vancouver Planning Department, 1984:105). For example,
the Overall Planning Division intends to expand the readership of the
Quarterly Review (p. 62,65). While "improving communications" has been a
stated objective for many years, emphasis on communications at this time
may be a response to diminished support for planning.

Reduced Goal Achievement

Rubin found that the combined effect of cutbacks and budget
uncertainty at universities was to reduce rewards so far that many
administrators did not try to maximize goals (Rubin, 1980). Similarly,
Fried argues that persistent low grade psychological stress produces
selective inattention and narrowed vision (Fried, 1982:18). Arrow
suggests, furthermore, that overload causes information to be filtered
according to preconceptions (1974:75).

Retreat into routine is a common response to ineffectiveness owing to
inadequate resources (Sternlieb, 1978a:xii). Organizational crisis
produces an emphasis on hierarchy and procedures, intolerance of change,
"loss of confidence and an ad hoc approach to day-to-day problems, aptly
called 'crisis management,' often observed in local public agencies" (Selbst, 1978:865).

Decisions may have to be made over (Rubin, 1980:177). The Vancouver Planning Department found that fluctuating staff resources and "the lack of senior supervision below the level of Associate Director meant that the work program proceeded in fits and starts less efficiently than it might have otherwise," and inadequate funding required staff to do "arduous original research" that could have been purchased (City of Vancouver Planning Department, 1983:16). The department is concerned that it may "slip behind" (City of Vancouver Planning Department, 1984:52).

NORMATIVE PLANNING

It would seem that normative planning would be reduced when citizen participation in policy-making is restricted. In Sweden, interest groups have been excluded from investigative commissions on the grounds of greater operational efficiency, decreasing their role in basic policy formation (Olsen, 1982:205). The Vancouver Planning Department cut back its formal liaison with the local area citizens' committees; however, this was due to the completion of the local area plans (City of Vancouver Planning Department, 1984:24).

The department also intends to cut costs by substituting "'hard' data and opinion polls for direct citizen consultation through committees and meetings" (City of Vancouver Planning Department, 1983:63). While surveys can be used to clarify community values, the danger exists that they will be used to give legitimacy to decisions which have already been made.
Despite stated intentions, planners attended eleven percent more public meetings after work hours in 1983 than in 1982 (City of Vancouver Planning Department, 1984:5). According to a division head, protest following approval of the development of a fast foods outlet in a small business area, without the usual public review, reaffirmed the department's belief in the necessity of starting out with legitimacy.

This vacillation reflects the dual character of citizen participation: while citizen consultation is expensive, it is useful to increase citizens' awareness of constraints on government and to legitimize government when it can no longer meet demands by increasing expenditures (Hulchanski, 1974:53,59). One planner stated that council expects "meaningful participation, hard slogging, so that citizens do not have unrealistic expectations." On the other hand, departments, competing for funding, may also use citizen consultation to build support for programs (McCurdy, 1977:119).

OPERATIONAL PLANNING

Fiscal restraint may reduce operational planning by producing competition for resources. In addition, Selbst contends that if an organizational crisis develops gradually, staff "may divide their opinions, questioning the premises of the likely result of the crisis, and polarizing their responses" (1978:865). This could hinder consensus on planning issues. On the other hand, fiscal restraint may produce centralized executive or political control over departments and budgets in order to facilitate operational planning (Levine et al., 1981:199; Hining et al., 1980).
THE QUALITY OF THE WORKPLACE

In this section, the effects of budgetary pressure on the quality of the workplace for planners are examined. Selbst contends that "in the short run, and under positive conditions of staff motivation, crisis may serve to unify and mobilize the staff" (1978:866). Similarly, Vancouver's city planners have proved they can work well under unusual pressure (Vancouver Planning Department, 1984:33). One of the social planners noted that morale in the department was high despite some uneasiness and suggested that the many job offers social planners receive in the course of their work (which puts them in contact with the federal government, community agencies, and business) has cushioned anxieties. Planners in a neighboring municipality were reportedly finding their work more varied and interesting.

In other circumstances, fiscal restraint may reduce the quality of the workplace for planners. Centralization of control would reduce the number of decision-making positions. However, professionals enjoy autonomy (Rothman, 1974:173). Based on trends in appropriations and demands for economic growth, the autonomy of physical and social planners may be curtailed more than that of economic planners. However, in the neighboring municipality mentioned in the previous paragraph, cutbacks fostered a team approach which the respondent indicated planners were enjoying.

Budgetary pressure may also reduce job security, remuneration, and prestige for planners. Rubin observed a redirection of resources at
universities away from providing prestige toward problem-solving (1980:167). In the long run, the profession may have difficulty keeping and attracting good students, particularly in physical and social planning.

**SUMMARY**

This chapter has explored the implications of fiscal restraint for planning. As in previous the chapters, the hypotheses generated by the study are listed below and are graded according to their confidence level. Two stars indicate that we can have confidence in the proposition. One star indicates that the evidence for the proposition is weak or that the relationship does not hold in many circumstances. No star signifies that the proposition is speculative.

**Strategic Planning**

1. Fiscal restraint has these positive effects on strategic planning:
   - it
     - fosters the development of explicit criteria; (*)
     - supports economic planning. (**)  

2. Fiscal restraint has these negative effects on strategic planning:
   - it
     - fosters misrepresentation of budgets, particularly in the absence of a city manager; (*)
     - produces less anticipatory planning; (*)
     - produces a trade-off mode of planning; (*)
     - fosters concern about the visibility of performance; (*)
- reduces goal achievement. (*)

Normative Planning

3. Fiscal restraint reduces normative planning
   - when funding for citizen consultation is reduced;
   - when citizen consultation is used to mold expectations or legitimate decisions.

Operational Planning

4. Fiscal restraint reduces operational planning by
   - producing competition for resources;
   - producing polarized opinions with respect to gradual crisis development.

5. Fiscal restraint facilitates operational planning by fostering centralized decision-making. (*)

Quality of the Workplace

6. Fiscal restraint improves the quality of the workplace in the short run and under positive conditions of staff motivation by making work more interesting. (*)

7. Fiscal restraint reduces the quality of the workplace
   - when decision-making is centralized; (*)
   - when job security is reduced;
   - when salaries and funding for prestige items are reduced (*).

The next chapter concludes the thesis with a summary, projections, research needs, and some general issues.
CHAPTER VI

CONCLUSION

This chapter concludes the thesis with a few comments about what has been achieved; speculates on future trends in the economy, politics, and planning; provides directions for future research; and reflects on a few general issues in planning.

CLOSING THE GAP

The thesis has brought together data and perspectives on the political and fiscal environments of planning and proposed some general relationships which require validation. Probably more questions may have been raised than have been answered.

Following the introduction of the study in the first chapter, Chapter II fleshed out the background of the study. Chapter III then discussed how unemployment affects the nature of political participation. It was intended that this chapter should increase readers' awareness of unemployment as a factor in political participation, their appreciation of the complexity of that relationship, and their familiarity with some of the contextual factors and differential effects.

Chapter IV suggested how the political repercussions of high unemployment may affect city planning. The goal of this chapter was to
increase readers' awareness of political participation as a factor in planning as well as readers' appreciation of contextual factors. The effects of fiscal restraint on planning were discussed in Chapter V. This chapter provided an opportunity for readers to develop a better understanding of the fiscal environment of planning. This chapter should help to put the previous chapters in context.

POSSIBLE FUTURES

This section examines trends in unemployment and outlines four possible futures of political participation and planning. The scenarios differ in the assumptions made about the success of governments to counteract the trend towards continued high unemployment and to attract political support. The first two scenarios, the Neoconservative and Polarization scenarios, have a conservative government incumbent; the next two, the Apathy and Liberalism scenarios, have a left-of-center government incumbent. First, a few words on the prospects for full employment.

Unemployment Projections

International competition, technological change, high interest rates, business debts, caution about reinvesting, and continued entry of women and baby-boomers into the work force will probably maintain high levels of unemployment throughout the 1980's (Sinclair, 1984; McGillivray, 1984; McNish, 1984; Cook, 1984; Walker, 1984).

However, by the end of the decade, fewer women and young people should be entering the work force (Commission of Inquiry into Part-Time Work, 1983:21); increased levels of self- and part-time employment may
characterize a larger proportion of the work force; vocational and technical training may be in greater demand; unions may be more involved in investment funds and other innovations to create jobs (Gray, 1984:10); and union decertification and concessions may reduce lockouts and production costs (Hemeon, 1984), thereby reducing unemployment slightly by the end of the 1980's. Nevertheless, high unemployment is likely to be a feature of the planning environment in B.C. for the remainder of the 1980's.

**The Neoconservatism Scenario**

This scenario assumes that conservative policies succeed in reducing unemployment, thereby increasing working class support for the conservative party and government spending restraint. At the same time, the party on the left may incorporate some of the themes of the neoconservatives' success, thereby losing its more partisan supporters. With respect to Vancouver politics, the Non-Partisan Association (N.P.A.) should have an electoral advantage.

A conservative trend could lead to reduced funding of planning, particularly social and physical planning. Defensive strategies may further strain departmental resources, and budgets may be misrepresented. Planners may become more concerned with the visibility of performance and less able to make long-range plans or to involve citizens in planning in a meaningful way. Deregulation may thwart environmental goals. In addition, criticism of the rationale and value of planning may produce role confusion and reduced innovativeness and job satisfaction.

On the positive side, increased political homogeneity may facilitate
operational planning. Departmental fiscal pressure may, in addition, foster the development of explicit criteria. In the short run, work may be more interesting.

The Polarization Scenario

The Polarization scenario assumes that conservative economic policies fail to reduce unemployment, thereby increasing economic deprivation and status polarization. Protest should become more organized, then taper off. The left-of-center party should have an electoral advantage. This scenario probably comes closest to describing provincial politics in B.C. Had N.P.A./Team formed a majority on Vancouver's city council during the period that the Committee of Progressive Electors/Civic Independents have held a majority, this scenario could have described the local scene as well.

While the conservative party still forms the government, protest may produce reconsideration of the value base of decisions; witness the reversal of Social Credit policies from "restraint" to "renewal." On the other hand, protest may reduce normative planning by producing uncertainty, prejudice, and intolerance. Similarly, political conflict may reduce the responsiveness of planners, foster legitimizing roles, and produce role confusion and job dissatisfaction. In addition, planners may be constrained in their analysis of alternate strategies by the polarization of views. Polarization can also be expected to reduce the cultivation of consensus.

At the same time, municipal fiscal stress may foster the development of explicit criteria and economic planning. In the short run, work may be
more interesting. However, restraint may also produce misrepresentation of budgets, ad hoc decisions, a trade-off mode of planning, concern about the visibility of performance, and reduced goal achievement. Funding for citizen participation may be reduced or citizen participation may be used to mold expectations. Over a period of time, polarized opinions may develop in the department which may hinder decision-making. Competition for departmental resources may also reduce operational planning. Finally, restraint may reduce the quality of the workplace by producing centralized decision-making and reduced job security and compensation.

The Apathy Scenario

In this scenario, the left-of-center party's economic policies fail, thereby increasing apathy, particularly in the working class. This situation would prevail, for example, if the New Democratic Party came to power in the next provincial election but failed to reduce the unemployment rate. If the recession deepens and the leftist majority on Vancouver's city council can no longer borrow enough from the Property Endowment Fund to make it unnecessary to raise taxes, council may also find itself in this situation. Owing to reduced participation by potential supporters of the leftist party, the right-of-center party could subsequently be reelected. However, the latter would not have as strong a mandate as in the Neoconservatism scenario.

Cynicism and apathy may reduce critical evaluation of the value base of planning decisions. In addition, underrepresentation of the unemployed and working class people, alienated by the failure of the leftist party to help them, could hamper normative planning unless planners have a
community organizer role. Planners could become brokers of those interest groups which are active. In addition, to these political effects, the effects of fiscal stress apply, as outlined in the Polarization scenario.

The Liberalism Scenario

Finally, in the Liberalism scenario, the party on the left is successful in reducing unemployment. For example, the New Democratic Party, if elected in 1986, could reduce unemployment by the end of the eighties, aided by demographic factors. Or Vancouver's city council could successfully boost the local economy. This development would give greater credence to liberalism. Political participation by the working class, which would feel more fairly represented, should subsequently increase.

A liberalized polity should support an increased role for planning. In addition, increased participation by the working class may foster the reconsideration of the value premises of planning decisions. Finally, increased political homogeneity may facilitate decision-making and long-term planning.

DIRECTIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH

This study points to the need for further research on the political and fiscal environments of planning. Following are some of the research directions provided by the thesis which are organized by chapter.

Unemployment and Political Participation:

Research Needs

The discussion in Chapter III suggested the need for more Canadian content, comparative research, disaggregated studies, better
conceptualization of unemployment, and data on the policy preferences of
the unemployed.

**Canadian content.** Many of the data in this thesis were American or
British. Although the data did not seem to be at odds with the available
Canadian data or the interviews, it is too early to make solid
comparisons. More Canadian studies are required.

**Comparative research.** Related to the need for Canadian data is that
for comparative research. Crossnational research would provide insights
into political culture, religion, etc. as contextual variables in the
relationship between unemployment and political participation. One of the
assumptions made in this thesis was that research on participation in
national and provincial politics could be applied to the study of
participation in local politics. Clearly, this assumption requires
validation with comparative work.

**Disaggregated studies.** Knowledge of differential effects helps us to
understand the factors involved in a relationship and to predict
variations. This study suggests the need for two types of disaggregated
studies. The first would examine the effect of unemployment on political
participation for different subpopulations. Occupational status, age, and
partisanship are some factors that have received some attention in the
literature and in this thesis; however, further study is warranted. The
influence of ethnicity and immigrant status are particularly important in
a city like Vancouver.

The second type of study would examine the effect of unemployment on
different dimensions of participation. The thesis examined voter turnout, the direction of party support, and, to a lesser extent, demonstrations, campaigning, writing officials and participation in public meetings. The available data do not permit comprehensive analysis of the various dimensions of political participation. This is unfortunate because the different aspects of political participation interact.

Factor analysis of unemployment. A tentative characterization of unemployment was provided in Chapter II. A factor analysis of unemployment and its relatives, involuntary part-time employment and insufficient self-employment, is needed to help us achieve a better understanding of unemployment and its political impact, and to facilitate model building.

Policy preferences of the unemployed. Chapter III pointed to the lack of information on the policy preferences of the unemployed. Without this information it is difficult to assess the impact of high unemployment on political equality.

The Political Environment of Planning: Research Needs

Four basic research needs or topics come out of Chapter IV: cross-sectional data, consolidation of the relevant social science research, decision-making contexts, and communications in planning.

Cross-sectional data. Much of the planning literature is of the case study variety with few controls of extraneous variables. Cross-sectional data would help us determine the role of organizational factors, planning style, community characteristics, etc. in the relationship between planning and the political environment.
Consolidation of research findings. Neoconservatism has highlighted the need for better theory and greater consensus in planning (Hightower, 1984:72; Lithwick, 1982:6). The planning literature tends to be idiosyncratic and polemical. More meaningful variations in conceptualization might develop from a common ground. Much of the data collected by social scientists has direct implications for planning. However, not enough attention has been given to the consolidation and dissemination of this material.

Decision-making contexts. More study is needed of decision-making contexts or contingencies. Work in this area would help to bridge the gap between social science and its application.

Communications in planning. Chapter IV also highlights the need for research and training in communications. Recall one planner's conviction that developers are manipulating the public's hysteria about jobs. Critical theory is promising in this regard.

Planning under Fiscal Restraint: Research Needs

The main need in the area of fiscal restraint and planning is for comparative studies. By comparing the effects of restraint on different planning bodies, organisational characteristics which modify the effects of budgetary pressure might be identified. The literature cited in Chapter V was largely borrowed from the public administration literature. Research on the fiscal environment of city planning, in particular, is required. However, there is a danger that research which is designed to reduce trade-offs may receive short shrift.
GENERAL ISSUES

The thesis concludes by reflecting on some general issues: the dual nature of planning, independence for planners, and the historical perspective.

The Two Faces of Planning

The thesis highlights the conflict in planning between the technical and political sides of planning. For example, conservatism may produce a trade-offs mode of planning in place of the scientific reduction of trade-offs. Paradoxically, the increasing emphasis in planning theory on the moral and political side of planning (Hemmens, 1980:259) may have weakened planners' technical expertise in substantive areas needed to bring about the reduction of trade-offs.

At the same time, political expertise may be essential to the achievement of social planning objectives during high unemployment, such as the reversal of the development of political inequality and cynicism. The best planners have undoubtedly cultivated both technical and political skills (Meltsner, 1976).

Independence of Planners

Neoconservative criticism of planning can be expected to raise the issue of independence for planners. However, the planner is unlike the ombudsman who is not supposed to question strategic or normative decisions. The idea of an independent appointed government body shaping policy should be repugnant in a representative democracy.
Conversely, the trend towards privatization raises doubts about planners' right to a place in government at all. Why should planners have more direct access to politicians than private planning bodies? Are government planners necessarily more effective than planners with private organizations? Were the Neoconservatism scenario to be more fully realized, these questions would undoubtedly be raised, and planners should be prepared with their answers. Crossnational studies may be useful in this regard.

The Historical Perspective

The Task Force of the Future of the Planning Profession has suggested that continued high unemployment produces the need to plan for increased leisure time and to redistribute income on a non-job basis (1982:34). It is beyond the scope of the thesis to say whether a guaranteed income and adequate educational and recreational opportunities would substitute for a job, although the discussion of conservatism in Chapter III suggests that the expense and discriminatory nature of such a set of programs would not be acceptable to the employed taxpayer, at least at this time. Garraty contends that

...if there is a lesson to be learned from the history of [unemployment], it is that sound attitudes and policies are responses to particular conditions, which change over time. Inflation was the bogey of the age of John Maynard Keynes; fear of it caused a quarter of the world's work force to suffer unemployment. Fear of unemployment must not become the bogey of modern times (1978:262).

Inflation is possibly the bogey of the 1980's. What this discussion suggests is that an appreciation of history could help planners avoid bandwagon approaches to planning.
REFERENCES


Cook, Peter. 1984. O.E.C.D. forecasts jobless rate to stick close to 11.7% level. *Globe and Mail.* 21 June:B3


Perception. 6(5):14-19.


Globe and Mail. 1 May 1984:5


McMartin, Peter. 1984. It was the big turnout that helped win it for COPE. The Sun. 21 November:A5.


Ormsby, Margaret A. 1962. T. Dufferin Pattullo and the little New Deal.


Union of B.C. Municipalities. 1983. Minutes of the Annual Convention of the Union of British Columbia Municipalities held at Penticton, British Columbia, on September 14th, 15th, and 16th.


APPENDIX

Table II lists some of the studies on magnetic tape in the University of British Columbia's Data Bank, which contain survey data on individuals' economic status and political activities. Several data files containing aggregate election and census data are also included. As mentioned in Chapter I, these studies should be useful in comparative research.

The table records the type of data available, the nature of the economic status and political participation variables, the level of politics to which measures of participation apply, and other variables of potential interest. As all of the studies contain some measure of income and demographic information (age, sex, and marital status), these variables are not shown in the table.

Other features of the studies that are not shown, but which may affect the use of any particular study, should be mentioned. Some studies use different samples so that all of the variables shown for a particular study are not necessarily amenable to crosstabulation. In addition, the variable lists for the time series studies are not necessarily complete for every year in the series. Finally, the table does not indicate the time frame of the variables, such as whether responses pertain to current or past activities. The temporal context of the variables affects the meaning of relationships between them.
Table II. Canadian studies on magnetic tape in the University of British Columbia's Data Bank that contain measures of both Economic Status and Political Participation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STUDY AND LIBRARY NUMBER</th>
<th>ECONOMIC STATUS</th>
<th>POLITICAL ACTIVITY</th>
<th>AREA</th>
<th>OTHER VARIABLES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Canadian Gallup Polls</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Change in Canada</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1979 (#3671 0635 1979)</td>
<td>X X X X X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1977 (#3671 0635 1977)</td>
<td>X X X X X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gén. National Election</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1979 (#3271 C553 1980)</td>
<td>X X X X X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1974 (#3271 C553 1974)</td>
<td>X X X X X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1972 (#3271 C553 1972)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pre-election</td>
<td>X X X X X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>post-election</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1972 (Que. sample)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1971 (#3671 S635 1971)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1970 (#3672 F588 1970)</td>
<td>X X X X X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.C. Voting Patterns</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1960 (#3271 P554 1960)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1968 (#3271 M458 1968A)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1965 (#3271 C54 1965)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.C. Election Study, 1979-80 (#3272 P756 1972)</td>
<td>X X X X X X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mar. 1977 (#3272 C353 1977)</td>
<td>X X X X X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.C. Political Attitudes 1979 (#3272 B756 1979)</td>
<td>X X X X X X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1978 (#3272 B756 1978)</td>
<td>X X X X X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Apr. 1977 (#3272 B756 1977)</td>
<td>X X X X X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May Care &amp; Services....</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1976 (#3272 B756 1976)</td>
<td>X X X X X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dec. 1975 (#3272 B756 1975)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work, Welfare and Social Services (#3271 M458 1975)</td>
<td>X X X X X X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1972-3 (#3272 B756 1972)</td>
<td>X X X X X X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work, Welfare &amp; Social 1972-3 (#3272 B756 1972)</td>
<td>X X X X X X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tenure</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1965 (#3271 M458 1965)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1971 (#3672 F588 1971)</td>
<td>X X X X X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1970 (#3672 F588 1970)</td>
<td>X X X X X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1960 (#3271 P554 1960)</td>
<td>X X X X X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1968 (#3271 M458 1968A)</td>
<td>X X X X X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1965 (#3271 M458 1965)</td>
<td>X X X X X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alberta BBQ Research Project (#3271 B756 1972)</td>
<td>X X X X X X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1972-1977 (#3271 B756 1972)</td>
<td>X X X X X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1980 (#3272 B756 1980)</td>
<td>X X X X X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vancouver Civil Elect'n 1970 (#3272 B756 1970)</td>
<td>X X X X X X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Crossman's Five Community (#3672 F588 1970)</td>
<td>X X X X X X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ontario Political Culture 1972 (#3271 M458 1972)</td>
<td>X X X X X X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waterloo Social Elections (#3271 M458 1972)</td>
<td>X X X X X X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ontario Provincial Election, 1960 (#3271 P554 1960)</td>
<td>X X X X X X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1972 (#3272 B756 1972)</td>
<td>X X X X X</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>