THE CONTRAPUNTAL STYLE OF HEALEY WILLAN

by

WILLIAM JONATHAN MICHAEL RENWICK
B.Mus., The University of British Columbia, 1979

A THESIS SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT OF
THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF
MASTER OF MUSIC

in
THE FACULTY OF GRADUATE STUDIES
DEPARTMENT OF MUSIC

We accept this thesis as conforming
to the required standard

THE UNIVERSITY OF BRITISH COLUMBIA
March 1982

© William Jonathan Michael Renwick, 1982
In presenting this thesis in partial fulfilment of the requirements for an advanced degree at the University of British Columbia, I agree that the Library shall make it freely available for reference and study. I further agree that permission for extensive copying of this thesis for scholarly purposes may be granted by the Head of my Department or by his representatives. It is understood that copying or publication of this thesis for financial gain shall not be allowed without my written permission.

Department of Music

The University of British Columbia
2075 Wesbrook Place
Vancouver, Canada
V6T 1W5

Date March 19, 1982
Abstract

Healey Willan was a Canadian composer who succeeded in integrating a broad range of stylistic characteristics into a personal musical idiom. It is the object of this paper to examine various elements which make up the unique style of this composer, so as to provide a foundation for a better appreciation of the value of his work.

The first chapter deals with the varied influences on the composer's development, and outlines the different styles which affected his work. A discussion of his pedagogical methods illustrates that his teaching bears a close relation to his compositional work.

Chapter Two begins the actual study of Willan's music by examining in detail two important aspects of the music's surface structure: dissonance treatment and parallelism. Willan's treatment of dissonance usually follows the rules of traditional part writing, but he attempts to express new ideas within the established norms. Willan often uses parallelism as a way of enriching a basic contrapuntal structure, and this chapter examines a variety of textures which result from such enrichment.

The following chapter deals with aspects of the music which serve as recurring "fingerprints" of the composer. The special recurring features treated here are 1) consecutive minor chord patterns, 2) chromatically based
episodes, 3) a characteristic pattern of initial ascent, and 4) the use of a closing formula based on the Gregorian "Amen".

Following this discussion of the various surface aspects of Willan's style, Chapter Four turns to a study of the composer's harmonic technique, as manifested on various levels of structure. An outstanding feature of Willan's harmonic style is his avoidance of the dominant function, which is often replaced with material from the subdominant side of the harmonic spectrum. Both in the surface melodic patterns and in the larger formal designs of entire pieces, this avoidance of the dominant is clearly in evidence.

The final chapter of this thesis discusses Willan's use of two-part counterpoint, both as a surface organizational procedure, and as a basis for the design of entire pieces. The final analyses illustrate the combination of a rigorous contrapuntal structure in the form of a two-part framework, and a harmonic plan which deliberately avoids the dominant in favour of harmonies involving the subdominant.

It is hoped that by examining significant aspects of Willan's style, this study will enable an assessment of the value of his work.

iii

William E. Benjamin
Thesis Supervisor
# Table of Contents

Abstract ii
List of Examples v
List of Figures xi
Acknowledgements xii
Introduction 1
I Willan's Musical Development 3
II Surface Structures 26
III Personal Elements 77
IV Tonal Functions 100
V Two-Part Framework 127
Conclusion 153
Appendix: Longer Musical Examples 155
Bibliography 167
Index of Works Cited 171
List of Examples

Ex. 1.1 All Hail, All Hail, mm. 1-20.  page 7
Ex. 1.2 Fugue in g minor, mm. 34-37.  18
Ex. 1.3 Fugue in g minor, mm. 33-35.  18
Ex. 1.4 Byrd, Ave Verum Corpus, mm. 33-37.  19
Ex. 1.5 Willan, Ave Verum Corpus, mm. 38-44.  20
Ex. 2.1 Behold, the Tabernacle of God, mm. 7-8.  27
Ex. 2.2 O King of Glory, mm. 45-47.  28
Ex. 2.3 Lo, In the Time Appointed, mm. 19-20.  29
Ex. 2.4 Lo, In the Time Appointed, mm. 31-32.  29
Ex. 2.5 Fair in Face, m. 2.  30
Ex. 2.6 O King, to Whom all Things do Live, m. 8.  30
Ex. 2.7 Hodie, Christus natus est, mm. 34-36.  30
Ex. 2.8 Hodie, Christus natus est, m. 44.  31
Ex. 2.9 O King of Glory, mm. 8-9.  31
Ex. 2.10 Preserve us, O Lord, m. 6.  32
Ex. 2.11 O King, to Whom all Things do Live, m. 19.  32
Ex. 2.12 Fair in Face, mm. 31-32.  33
Ex. 2.13a I beheld her Beautiful as a Dove, mm. 3-4.  33
Ex. 2.13b. (untitled)  34
Ex. 2.14 Behold, the Tabernacle of God, mm. 1-3.  35
Ex. 2.15 O King of Glory, mm. 23-24.  35
Ex. 2.16 Fair in Face, mm. 17-19.  36
Ex. 2.17 O King of Glory, mm. 14-17.  36
Ex. 2.18 O King, all Glorious, m. 25.  37
Ex. 2.19 *Rise up, my Love, my Fair One*, mm. 3-4.  page 37

Ex. 2.20 *Behold, the Tabernacle of God*, mm. 9-10.  38

Ex. 2.21 *I beheld her Beautiful as a Dove*, mm. 11-12.  38

Ex. 2.22 *I beheld her Beautiful as a Dove*, mm. 8-9.  39

Ex. 2.23 *Rise up, my Love, my Fair One*, mm. 7-8.  41

Ex. 2.24 *Rise up, my Love, my Fair One*, mm. 25-26.  41

Ex. 2.25a *I beheld her Beautiful as a Dove*, m. 31.  42

Ex. 2.25b. (untitled)  42

Ex. 2.26a *Rise up, my Love, my Fair One*, mm. 9-10.  43

Ex. 2.26b. (untitled)  43

Ex. 2.27a *Rise up, my Love, my Fair One*, mm. 14-15.  44

Ex. 2.27b. (untitled)  44

Ex. 2.28 *O King, to Whom all Things do Live*, m. 15.  45

Ex. 2.29a *Fair in Face*, mm. 24-25.  46

Ex. 2.29b. (untitled)  46

Ex. 2.30 *Fair in Face*, mm. 1-2.  47

Ex. 2.31a *I beheld her Beautiful as a Dove*, m. 11.  49

Ex. 2.31b. (untitled)  50

Ex. 2.31c. (untitled)  50

Ex. 2.31d. (untitled)  50

Ex. 2.31e. (untitled)  50

Ex. 2.31f. (untitled)  50

Ex. 2.32 *I beheld her Beautiful as a Dove*, m. 5.  51

Ex. 2.33 *Rise up, my Love, my Fair One*, mm. 17-18.  52
Ex. 2.34a Behold, the Tabernacle of God, mm. 1-2.

Ex. 2.34b. (untitled)

Ex. 2.34c. (untitled)

Ex. 2.35 Behold, the Tabernacle of God, mm. 16-17. 54

Ex. 2.36 Behold, the Tabernacle of God, mm. 18-19. 55

Ex. 2.37 "Benedictus qui venit", Missa Brevis No. 4.

Ex. 2.38 Scherzo (Five Pieces for Organ), mm. 5-12.

Ex. 2.39 O King, all Glorious, mm. 30-32.

Ex. 2.40 Matins, mm. 18-27.

Ex. 2.41a O King of Glory, mm. 1-4. First Manuscript version

Ex. 2.41b O King of Glory, mm. 1-4. Second Manuscript version

Ex. 2.41c O King of Glory, mm. 1-4. Final, printed version

Ex. 2.42 God is Gone Up with a Shout, mm. 25-28.

Ex. 2.43 Hodie, Christus natus est, mm. 43-47.

Ex. 2.44 Ave Maris Stella (Five Preludes on Plainchant Melodies), mm. 1-4.

Ex. 2.45 The Spirit of the Lord, mm. 5-11.

Ex. 2.46 An Apostrophe to the Heavenly Hosts, mm. 97-99.

Ex. 2.47 Ring Out, Ye Crystall Shears from the Coronation Suite, mm. 10-11.

Ex. 2.48 Eternity, mm. 59-61.

Ex. 2.49 This Endris Nyght, mm. 7-13.

Ex. 2.50 O Trinity, Most Blessed Light, mm. 47-50.

Ex. 2.51 The Shepherds from The Mystery of Bethlehem, mm. 45-47.
Ex. 2.52  *Come, Thou Beloved of Christ* from the *Coronation Suite*, mm. 98-100.

Ex. 2.53  *Hodie, Christus natus est*, mm. 48-57.

Ex. 2.54  *Weep You No More, Sad Fountains*, mm. 44-48

Ex. 2.55  *Gloria Deo per immensa saecula*, mm. 60-63.

Ex. 2.56  *Who is She that Ascendeth?*, mm. 10-12.

Ex. 2.57  *Rise up, my Love, my Fair One*, mm. 1-10.

Ex. 3.1  *Prelude and Fugue in c minor*, mm. 5-8.

Ex. 3.2  *Deirdre*, Act I, mm. 9-13.

Ex. 3.3  *Deirdre*, Act III, mm. 1-3.

Ex. 3.4  *Deirdre*, Act III, mm. 842-846.

Ex. 3.5  *Urbs Hierusalem beata*, mm. 58-59.

Ex. 3.6  *Passacaglia and Fugue No. 2, in E minor*, mm. 1-3.

Ex. 3.7  *Christ ist erstanden*, mm. 26-29.

Ex. 3.8  *Nun preiset alle*, mm. 32-39.

Ex. 3.9  *Festival*, mm. 30-35.

Ex. 3.10a  *Martyrdom*, mm. 16-19.

Ex. 3.10b  *Martyrdom*, mm. 35-38.

Ex. 3.11  *Nun lasst uns Gott dem Herren*, mm. 26-29, 36-41, and 52-57.

Ex. 3.12  *Intermezzo*, mm. 1-2.

Ex. 3.13  *Quem pastores*, mm. 1-2.

Ex. 3.14  *Wareham*, mm. 1-2.

Ex. 3.15  *Rise up, my Love, my Fair One*, mm. 1-2.

Ex. 3.16  *Scherzo*, mm. 37-38.

Ex. 3.17  *Christ, whose Glory fills the Skies*, mm. 1-2.
Ex. 3.18 "Amen" from the hymn Ad Regias Agni Dapes. page 93

Ex. 3.19 Fantasie upon the plainchant "Ad Coenam Agni", mm. 86-89. 93

Ex. 3.20 Very Bread, Good Shepherd, Tend Us, mm. 32-37. 94

Ex. 3.21 O Lord, Our Governour, mm. 44-49. 95

Ex. 3.22 Father, We Praise Thee, mm. 74-78. 95

Ex. 3.23 Hodie, Christus natus est, mm. 62-64. 96

Ex. 3.24 Hosanna to the Son of David, mm. 62-68. 97

Ex. 3.25 On May Morning, mm. 39-45. 97

Ex. 3.26 Andante, Fugue and Chorale, mm. 102-106. 98

Ex. 4.1 Nicaea, mm. 1-6. 102

Ex. 4.2 I Will Lay Me Down in Peace, mm. 1-5. 103

Ex. 4.3 Epilogue, mm. 1-4. 104

Ex. 4.4 Very Bread, Good Shepherd, Tend Us, mm. 6-8. 105

Ex. 4.5 Finale Jubilante, mm. 1-2. 106

Ex. 4.6 Nun preiset Alle, mm. 1-4. 107

Ex. 4.7 Interlude for a Festival, mm. 48-49. 108

Ex. 4.8 Urbs Hierusalem beata, mm. 55-60. 112

Ex. 4.9a O King, all Glorious, mm. 30-34. 113

Ex. 4.9b. (untitled) 114

Ex. 4.10 Andante, Fugue and Chorale, mm. 39-42. 114

Ex. 4.11 Evensong, mm. 54-57. 115

Ex. 4.12 "Sanctus", Missa Brevis No. 2, m. 12. 116

Ex. 4.13 The Spirit of the Lord, mm. 1-11. 117

Ex. 4.14 Part Motion in the "Chorale" from the Andante, Fugue and Chorale. 118
Ex. 4.15a Harmonic Motion in O King, to Whom all Things do Live.

Ex. 4.15b Summary of Harmonic Motion in O King, to Whom all Things do Live.

Ex. 4.16a Harmonic Motion in Behold, the Tabernacle of God.

Ex. 4.16b Summary of Harmonic Motion in Behold, the Tabernacle of God.

Ex. 5.1 An Apostrophe to the Heavenly Hosts, mm. 116-120.

Ex. 5.2 Benedictus and Jubilate Deo, stanza 3.

Ex. 5.3 Andante, Fugue and Chorale, mm. 94-96.

Ex. 5.4 "Sanctus", Missa Brevis No. 10, mm. 13-24.

Ex. 5.5 Festival, mm. 1-7.

Ex. 5.6 I beheld her, Beautiful as a Dove, mm. 29-35.

Ex. 5.7 Urbs Hierusalem beata, mm. 10-15.

Ex. 5.8 Voice-leading in Rise up, my Love, my Fair One.

Ex. 5.9 Two-part Framework in Rise up, my Love, my Fair One.

Ex. 5.10 Surface Structures of the Intermezzo, mm. 1-17.

Ex. 5.11 Foreground of the Intermezzo, mm. 1-17.

Ex. 5.12. (untitled)

Ex. 5.13 Middleground of the Intermezzo, mm. 1-17.

Ex. 5.14. (untitled)

Ex. 5.15. (untitled)

Ex. 5.16 Background of the Intermezzo, mm. 1-17.

Ex. 5.17 Shenkerian Ursatz.
List of Figures

Fig. 4.1 Chordal Analysis of Selected Compositions of Healey Willan.  

Fig. 4.2 Harmonic Plan of The Spirit of the Lord, mm. 1-11.  

Fig. 4.3 Harmonic Plan of the "Chorale" from the Andante, Fugue and Chorale.
Acknowledgements

It is with a deep sense of appreciation that I express my gratitude to Dr. William Benjamin, who has carefully guided me in this work. I also extend my thanks to the members of my thesis committee, Professors John Chappell and James Schell; to Dr. Helmut Kallmann and the staff of the National Library for their assistance; to the Canadian Music Centre, for making available many pieces of Willan's music which are out of print; and to the following companies which have kindly consented to the use of their copyrighted materials: Belwin Mills, Berandol Music, Concordia Publishing House, Frederick Harris Music, Leslie Music Supply, Longman, Inc., Novello, Oxford University Press, C.F. Peters Corp., and Gordon V. Thompson Ltd. I would also like to thank the trustees of the Estate of Healey Willan for their willing cooperation.

Among the many individuals who have particularly aided me in this work, Mary Mason comes first to mind. I am also appreciative of the help which Albert Mahon, Sir William McKie, Frederick Geoghegan, Jocelyn Pritchard, and Father Donald Nielsen have given.

Finally, to my loving parents, who have warmly supported my endeavors, I extend most grateful thanks.
Introduction

In light of Healey Willan's recent centenary, it is the purpose of this paper to examine the distinctiveness of Willan's contribution as a composer. His importance as a leading figure in Canadian music, particularly as a teacher, has never been questioned. He has always been regarded as a mainstay of the Canadian music scene. But the merit of his creative work and the scope of his originality have not always been fully appreciated. Within the framework of the established techniques of his musical background, he was an innovative composer, transcending his cultural milieu by synthesizing a wide variety of forms and styles into a cohesive poetic idiom.

His conservative style and the impression made by the voluminousness of his output have tended to mask for many observers the extent to which the work is, in fact, informed by true creative genius. His consistently well crafted and modest style suggests that Willan was more craftsman than artist, and indeed he was a great craftsman, filling a vacuum in the field of liturgical music for many Christian denominations as, for example, Hindemith filled a vacuum in the field of chamber music.

However, I intend in this work to show that beneath the surface of traditional forms and textures
lies a music which, while growing naturally out of musical antecedents, is of very personal expression.

(A number of people have made superficial examinations of Willan's style, but no one, it seems, has tackled the problem of discovering the elements which form his style.)

This paper attempts to reassess the artistic merits of Willan's work. It traces his development from roots in the romanticism of turn-of-the-century England to active participation in the developing musical life of Canada, examining in detail the surface contrapuntal structure, the personal traits of the composer, and, at various structural levels, the music's harmonic characteristics and voice-leading patterns. Examples illustrating the text are drawn primarily from works of the composer's most creative "middle period" (ca. 1918-1940).

It is hoped that this paper will be of use in leading to an understanding of the significance of Willan's music viewed as an aesthetic, rather than a functional, corpus.
I Willan's Musical Development

James Healey Willan was born at Balham, Surrey, near London, on October 12, 1880. At age four he began studying piano with his mother and with the governess of the Willan household. At this time, too, he made his first acquaintance with the organ, often visiting St. George's Church, Beckenham, to listen to the organist practising. At the age of eight he entered St. Saviour's Choir School, Eastbourne, where he studied organ, piano, and harmony under Dr. Walter Hay Sangster, an organist steeped in the Victorian musical tradition. By the age of eleven Willan was accompanying services in the chapel and occasionally rehearsing the choir. While at the choir school, he began to take an interest in the voice-leading aspects of music, and their importance in musical composition.

It was interesting to me, the way the parts were interwoven. I got rather bored with the one dimensional hymn tune stuff. Rather ordinary. But as soon as it became complicated, contrapuntal, then I was having a good time. I enjoyed it immensely.

After being told at one harmony lesson that parallel

---


fifths were not allowed, he immediately cited an example of their use in the slow movement of Beethoven's *First Piano Sonata*, a work he was learning at the time.  

After leaving the choir school at age fifteen, Willan spent a year at home. He seems to have been quite ill and confined to bed for lengthy periods, and it was during these long hours that he began to study counterpoint in earnest. Although accounts of his methods of study are at variance with one another, it seems that he devised a system for the study of species counterpoint whereby all the contrapuntal possibilities of the diatonic system could be explored in an orderly manner. Marwick reports that he devised "all sorts of contrapuntal combinations in all five species for any three notes of the scale." It would seem that Willan used each three-note subset of the major -- and possibly also the minor -- diatonic collections as a cantus firmus against which he worked out examples in all five species, presumably in two parts, with the counterpoint both above and below the cantus firmus. He probably continued this sort of rigorous method into three and four parts, although it is unclear how far he carried it.

In his later teens, Willan devoted the greater part

---

4Marwick, p. 4. The parallel fifths mentioned are probably those which occur in the middle voices at the sixth measure.

5Ibid., p. 7.
of his time to keyboard studies. Because he lived near London he was able to study organ with William Stevenson Hoyte and piano with Evlyn Howard-Jones. Two of his fellow organ students in London were Gustav Holst and Leopold Stokowski. At the age of seventeen Willan became an associate of the Royal College of Organists, and at nineteen he became a fellow of the same organization. Before an injury to his right arm precluded the possibility, he had been seriously interested in the career of a concert pianist, intending to specialize in the music of Brahms.

During these early years in London, Willan was engaged in a wide range of musical activity. He served as organist-choirmaster for several churches, proofread for Novello, conducted the Wanstead Choral Society; and directed the Thalian Operatic Society in the production of Gilbert and Sullivan operettas. Participation in the stimulating musical life of London helped to form his musical tastes. He heard Tchaikovsky conduct, and he met Nikisch, the great German conductor who promoted

6Marwick, p. 7.
8Marwick, p. 9.
Willan's heroes in contemporary composition, Strauss and Wagner.\(^{10}\) Willan's favourite concert music was that of Brahms and Elgar.\(^{11}\) Of course one of the overwhelming influences on Willan's musical development was the music of the Anglican Church — the music of Stanford, Parry, and a host of other church musicians with whose music Willan came into daily contact from his earliest years.

This wide range of musical experience influenced Willan's own early attempts at composition. His earliest anthems reflect mainly the late Victorian church style, and contain little of what came to be featured in his mature style. Example 1.1, the first page of his earliest published composition, (ca. 1898), could have been written by any one of many English church composers of the turn of the century.

While continuing to absorb late-nineteenth-century influences, Willan began to take an interest in earlier styles of music. He formed a close association with Francis Burgess, the plainchant specialist, and in 1910 became a member of the London Gregorian Association, of which Burgess was the director.\(^{12}\) In this capacity


\(^{11}\) Ibid., p. 238.

\(^{12}\) Bryant, p. 14.
ALL HAIL! ALL HAIL!

(A EUCHARISTIC HYMN.)

Copyright.  Price 2d.

Words by Rev. WALTER JENKS.  London: COMPOSERS & AUTHORS PRESS, Ltd., 50 & 52 Southwark Row, W.C.

Music by HEALEY WILLAN.

Knee - Lord Bishop of Colchester.

Words and music dedicated by permission to the Right Rev. Henry Frank, long Bishop of Colchester.

Reproduced by permission of the Estate of Healey Willan.
Willan assisted Burgess in organizing and directing a series of Gregorian Festivals at St. Paul's Cathedral. Sir Richard Terry, the choirmaster of Westminster Cathedral, also influenced Willan's development. Through Terry, who was involved in the rediscovery of English Tudor music and the publication of its masterpieces in the historical edition Tudor Church Music, Willan was exposed to a large and important body of Renaissance polyphony.

Willan had married Gladys Ellen Hall in 1905 and, in need of financial security to support a growing family, he accepted the offer of the position as head of theory at the Royal Conservatory of Music in Toronto. He emigrated to Canada in 1913, bringing his family over in the following year, and soon found himself very much involved in the developing musical life of the city. He was appointed organist of St. Paul's Anglican Church, where an enormous organ was being installed in a new church of cathedral proportions. It was the resources of this organ that Willan had in mind when he composed his large-scale organ pieces, notably the Introduction, Passacaglia and Fugue (1916). Other activities of

---

13Marwick, p. 10.  
14Ibid.  
Willan's in this period included teaching music theory at the University of Toronto, beginning in 1914; serving as musical director of the Hart House Theatre, 1919-1925; and composing for the Toronto Mendelssohn Choir. Willan also began and directed in its first season the Toronto Proms, a summer concert series based on the London Proms.

In 1921 an event occurred which altered the course of Willan's musical development to an extraordinary degree. He was asked to suggest a replacement for the position of organist at the church of St Mary Magdalene, and he offered his own services. This move from perhaps the most sought after church position in Canada to a poor neighbourhood church meant a significant reduction in income as well as loss of recognition in the field of church music. One factor prompting this move was the fact that services at St. Paul's were of the low, evangelical type, rather than the high, liturgical type which Willan preferred. At St. Mary Magdalene's, where the ritual was of the high, Anglo-Catholic variety, Willan saw the possibility of developing a complete musical and liturgical tradition.

It was at this time that Willan's compositional style began to be influenced to a large extent by Renaissance

16Marwick, p. 19.

17Mary Willan-Mason, Letter to the Editor, The Graduate, Magazine of the University of Toronto Alumni, Volume IX, Number 1, September-October, 1981, p. 28.
music. Prior to this time older music had had little effect on Willan's musical style. In his first published organ piece, Fantasia upon the Plainchant Melody "Ad Coenam Agni" (1906), the harmonic idiom is firmly romantic despite the music's melodic basis in chant. At St. Mary's, services included accompanied plainsong sung by a male choir in the chancel, and unaccompanied polyphonic music, generally in the Renaissance style, sung by a mixed choir in the west gallery. In keeping with these musical-liturgical traditions, Willan wrote for the mixed choir a series of masses and motets which constitute his most lasting artistic achievement. Deserving of particular mention are the Six Motets and the eleven Liturgical Motets. With their polyphonic part writing, chant-like melody, freedom of rhythm, and modal harmony, they represent what is most characteristic, even unique, in Willan's mature idiom, and represent the composer at the height of his creative powers.

The move to St. Mary Magdalene's also provoked a change in Willan's approach to organ extemporization. At St. Paul's he had developed a grandiose improvisatory style, but at St. Mary's, where he improvised plainsong accompaniments, interludes and postludes, his style became more peaceful and reserved, in keeping with the refined and introspective atmosphere of the Anglo-Catholic liturgy.

The years between the wars were extremely productive
for Willan. In terms of composition he produced, in addition to liturgical music, both concert music, including a first symphony, and incidental music for the Hart House Theatre. Very active as a performer, Willan was appointed University Organist at the University of Toronto in 1932, a position he retained until 1964. Willan's continuing interest in early English music prompted him in 1934 to form and direct a secular choir devoted to its performance. Known as the Tudor Singers, this group specialized in Elizabethan madrigals. During the Second World War the ranks of the Tudor Singers were depleted, and the remaining members joined forces with the choir of St. Mary Magdalene. This group performed under the name of the St. Mary Magdalene Singers, their work culminating in two very successful recitals at Town Hall, New York, in 1945.¹⁸

By 1940 Willan had spent almost half his life in Canada, and in recognition of his growing importance as a Canadian composer the Canadian Broadcasting Corporation offered him a series of commissions for larger works: the radio opera *Transit Through Fire* (1942), the pageant *Brebuf* (1943), the *Pianoforte Concerto in c minor* (1944), and the opera *Deirdre of the Sorrows* (1945).

After the war, Willan's reputation continued to

¹⁸Marwick, p. 19.
grow, and commissions continued from a wide range of sources. In 1950 he formed the Gregorian Association of Toronto in order to promote plainchant, and with his retirement from the university in that year he was able to devote more time to composition.

In the same year his lasting relationship with the Lutheran publishing house Concordia began. He was asked to write a series of six chorale preludes, and following their success was urged to continue with an additional set. In the succeeding years he wrote for the same company eight additional preludes, a Missa Brevis, six motets, thirteen anthems, seven hymn-anthems, and a large volume of miscellaneous liturgical music. This continuing relationship with Concordia gave him financial stability through his retirement years.

Following the lead of Concordia, the C. F. Peters Corporation began in 1956 a series of commissions which continued until the composer's death. For this house he wrote a total of 139 chorale preludes, an achievement whose importance was recognized in the Harvard Dictionary of Music. In addition, he provided Peters with two large-scale organ works, the Passacaglia

---

19Willi Apel, Harvard Dictionary of Music, (2nd edition; Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1972), p. 921. Mention is here made that the practice of transcribing voluntaries from anthems, oratorios, and instrumental works "has fortunately almost vanished through the efforts of contemporary composers of voluntaries, such as H. Willan, E. Thiman, and many others."
and Fugue No. 2 in e minor (1959) and the Andante, Fugue and Chorale (1965), as well as four anthems, twenty hymn-anthems, and a number of miscellaneous pieces.

In these post-war years Willan's musical style, rather than developing the trends established earlier, took a more conservative turn. His compositions began to take on a more "classical" flavour in terms of formal proportions and adherence to established patterns. Marwick suggests that this conservative trend was due to the fact that Willan was writing for choirs of less ability than his own, and, accordingly, modifying his style to accommodate them.\textsuperscript{20} Though this may have some validity, it should be noted that his pre-war motets are no more difficult to sing than his later ones. A more likely explanation is that he was forced, through the sheer numbers of commissions, to write more quickly, relying on his established compositional patterns.

That Willan had lost none of his creative powers after the war, and that he was still able to write complex music, is demonstrated in the Passacaglia and Fugue No. 2 of 1952, a work undoubtedly superior to the earlier and highly acclaimed Introduction, Passacaglia and Fugue of 1916. The Passacaglia and Fugue No. 2 contains all the interest of the earlier work in a

\textsuperscript{20}Marwick, pp. 69, 80, 92, 118, 156, 158, 176, 190ff.
more compact design of better proportions which nevertheless produces at least as thrilling an effect as the earlier work.

In 1952 Willan was honoured by a command performance, before Princess Elizabeth, of his highly successful choral work, An Apostrophe to the Heavenly Hosts.\(^{21}\) Performed at the St. Cecilia's Day concert, this work drew the attention of William McKie (now Sir William), the organist of Westminster Abbey. McKie asked Willan to compose a hommage anthem to be performed during the coronation of the Princess in 1953. At the same time he was commissioned by the C.B.C. to write a large work for chorus and orchestra, to be performed on the network in honour of the coronation. June 2, 1953 was a day of triumph for Willan: his anthem \textit{O Lord, Our Governour} was performed in Westminster Abbey while the \textit{Coronation Suite} was being aired across Canada.

In 1959 the National Film Board produced a film about Willan's musical activities. He is seen in a variety of situations -- composing, rehearsing, and teaching a class in which he appears to improvise a fugue, including stretto and inversion, at the piano. In fact, however, this fugue had been written earlier by Willan, and is published as the \textit{Fugue in e minor}.

\(^{21}\)Bryant, p. 18. This work, composed in 1921 for the Toronto Mendelssohn Choir, is a large-scale motet for two choirs and mystic or echo choirs.
This unfortunate episode has caused some confusion as to Willan's actual ability as an improvisor. In the Parker Tapes, a series of interviews with Willan in his last years, the interviewer inquires into Willan's ability:

   Parker: You were able to improvise fugues and things like that.
   Willan: Well...
   Parker: But in the film Man of Music you improvised a whole fugue in front of a class.
   Willan: Well.., Yes.., I suppose I did.22

Although his ability as a contrapuntal improvisor may be brought into question, there is no doubt of his skill in evoking moods of mystery, grandeur, serenity and peace through improvisation.

In the final years of his life, Willan completely revised his opera, Deirdre, the work he considered his finest, and it received its first stage performance at the University of Toronto in 1965. These years saw a slow decline in Willan's health, but after a cataract operation in November, 1967 he managed to find the strength to appear and direct the midnight service at St. Mary's, despite the fact that his eyes were covered with bandages. The beauty of his final improvisation at this Christmas Eve mass of 1967 is acknowledged by most of those who were present. In early February,

---
22 The Parker Tapes are a series of interviews with Willan, conducted by Rev. Dr. Max Parker between 1963 and 1965. They are available at the National Library of Canada,
1968 he had a mild heart attack, and on the 16th. of that month he died in his sleep.23

Throughout his long career, Willan was accorded numerous honours, beginning with an honourary Mus. Doc. from the University of Toronto in 1920. Other degrees received were: an LL.D. from Queen's University (1952), a D. Litt. from the University of Manitoba (1954), the Lambeth Doctorate, Mus. D. Cantuar., conferred by the archbishop of Canterbury (1956), and a D. Litt. from McMaster University (1962).24 Willan was made an honourary member of the Canadian League of Composers (1955), a fellow of the Ancient Monuments Society of England (1958), a fellow of the Royal School of Church Music (1963), and a fellow of the Royal Hamilton College of Music (1965). He was awarded the Canada Council Medal in 1961, and was made a Companion of the Order of Canada in 1967.25

Willan's activities as a pedagogue help to illustrate his own thoughts as a composer and musical thinker. As noted above, his professional life in Canada centred around his teaching duties at the Royal Conservatory of Music and later at the University of Toronto. Willan taught both theory and composition, numbering among his

24Bryant, p. 18.  
25Ibid. p. 20.
students many notable Canadian composers and musicologists of the succeeding generation; Louis Applebaum, Gerald Bales, John Beckwith, Kieth Bissel, Frederick Clarke, Robert Fleming, Kelsey Jones, Walter MacNutt, George Maybee, Stanley Osborne, Charles Peaker, Eldon Rathburn, Godfrey Ridout, Frederick Silvester, and John Weinzweig, to name a few.\(^\text{26}\)

In teaching composition, Willan encouraged his students to analyse old masterworks and to compose pieces imitative of their styles. Willan's own ability in this area is evidenced by certain pieces, written late in his career, which bear the marks of other composers. Especially fine examples are to be found in a series of pieces written as incidental music for the radio-drama Brebuf and his Brethren. The contrapuntal style of Bach's Die Kunst der Fuge is very accurately imitated in one of the movements from Brebuf, the Fugue in g minor for strings. This piece contains two references to its model. Example 1.2 is a quotation of Bach's own fugue subject in the


\(^{26}\text{Macmillan and Beckwith, Contemporary Canadian Composers, p. 29.}\)

\(^{26}\text{Helmut Kallmann, Catalogue of Canadian Composers, revised and enlarged edition, (Canadian Broadcasting Corporation, 1951), p. 213.}\)
first violin, and Example 1.3 is a statement of the B A C H theme in inversion, B-flat, C, A, B-natural, in the final notes of the viola. The music of Bach no doubt had a profound influence on Willan's own development. A Willan disciple, Margaret Drynan relates that

he loved Bach, and the contrapuntal writing in his own works reveals his absorption with the music of Bach and the composers of the Tudor period.\footnote{Margaret Drynan, \textit{A Tribute to Healey Willan}, (Toronto: Royal Canadian College of Organists, 1979), p. 7.}

Norman Gary Johnson observes that

in his composition classes Willan required his students to study Bach's use of counterpoint closely and to compose works of their own, making use of the same contrapuntal devices.\footnote{Norman Gary Johnson, "Healey Willan 1880-1968," \textit{The American Organist}, October, 1980, p. 34.}

Example 1.2 \textit{Fugue in g minor}, mm. 34-37.

\[\text{Example 1.2 Fugue in g minor, mm. 34-37.}\]

Reproduced by permission of the Estate of Healey Willan.

Example 1.3 \textit{Fugue in g minor}, mm. 33-35.

\[\text{Example 1.3 Fugue in g minor, mm. 33-35.}\]

Reproduced by permission of the Estate of Healey Willan.
The motet *Ave Verum Corpus*, also from the cycle *Brebuf*, shows the influence of the Tudor composer William Byrd, whose own motet *Ave Verum Corpus* obviously serves as a model. Examples 1.4 and 1.5 exhibit the similarity of style between the two pieces, both in g minor. In each example the soprano is answered by the other voices, and both make use of minor seconds for expressive effect. In Example 1.4, from Byrd's motet, the minor seconds occur between the D and E-flat of the alto, the B-flat and A of the soprano, and the C and B, and G and F-sharp, of the tenor. In the corresponding passage of Willan's work, Example 1.5, the minor seconds are found between the G and A-flat, and the B and C, of the soprano, the G and A-flat of Example 1.4 Byrd, *Ave Verum Corpus*, mm. 33-37.
the alto, the C and B of the tenor, and the G and A-flat of the bass. The melodic contour of the motives, a rise and fall, is very similar in both examples.

The styles of Reger, Elgar, Brahms, Rachmaninov, and Debussy are also clearly in evidence in certain pieces of Willan's work. Any doubt that Willan was interested in the ability to imitate other composer's styles should be dispelled by studying a group of pieces written for a friend of his, Reverend Dr. Carmino de Catanzaro. These small contrapuntal pieces -- versets and versicles -- listed among the Varia of Willan's output are musical jokes, and it can be ascertained from the accompanying notes that they were consciously composed in imitation of
Bach, Byrd, and others.\textsuperscript{29} Willan's teaching of composition was not restricted to stylistic imitation. He was willing to listen openly to new ideas put forth by his students while he was teaching them basic compositional technique. Robert Fleming tells us

any "new" idea... was discussed without bias and put through the microscope of his all-seeing eye. When such a session was over the young student knew precisely why his ideas were good or bad from a technical viewpoint and the aesthetics were a matter of the student's conscience from this point onward.\textsuperscript{30}

Some of Willan's thoughts concerning contemporary musical aesthetics can be found in the reports of his former students, and these ideas reflect the values underlying Willan's approach to composition. Marwick reports that Willan said

all music should have shape, design, and melodic content. If these are not to be found in any music, whether it be ancient or modern, Dr. Willan has no interest in it.\textsuperscript{31}

Gerald Bales states that as a teacher Willan impressed him most by his "philosophy of economy of materials combined with an acute sense of form and balance."\textsuperscript{32} In his teaching, rather than pressing on his students a particular style, "his task, of which he was utterly

\textsuperscript{29}Holographs of these pieces are contained in the Healey Willan Collection of the National Library of Canada.

\textsuperscript{30}Marwick, p. 199


\textsuperscript{32}Campbell-Yukl, p. 16.
convinced, was to impart...a technique. If it sounded right to his students, then it was right."\textsuperscript{33} In Willan's own music, as I hope to show, this predilection for economy of materials and this sense of form and balance combine to provide a foundation for a highly integrated compositional style.

Willan is often thought of as an "old fogey" when it comes to composition, but it must be remembered that his musical training was virtually complete by 1900. His most creative period, during which he evolved his distinctive style, coincides with the twenties and thirties. Willan has not always been considered old fashioned; Augustus Bridle, in a 1929 survey of Canadian composers, described Willan's composition as "in the modern style, but with true regard for form, melodic line, and intelligible harmony,"\textsuperscript{34} surely a description of which Willan could be proud.

Commenting on his contemporaries, Willan said: "Stravinsky is a great composer, but his music hasn't settled yet."\textsuperscript{35} "Debussy was the most original composer

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{34}Augustus Bridle, "Who Writes Our Music?", \textit{MacLeans Magazine}, (December 15, 1929), p. 20.
\end{itemize}
who ever lived."\(^{36}\) and "There's nothing lasting in funny noises."\(^{37}\). These comments show that he recognized the significance of two of the most progressive composers of the twentieth century, and that he felt that modern techniques should add to the established traditions in a meaningful way, rather than completely superceding them.

Willan's method of teaching music theory, as recorded by his former students, offers further insights into his activities as a composer. Many of these sources mention his insistence on the ability to write fluent two-part counterpoint, an important part of his own technique. He called counterpoint the logic of music, and proposed as his epitaph: "He preached two-part counterpoint and nobody believed him."\(^{38}\) For Willan, the relationship between the soprano melody and the bass line were of primary importance, and we shall see later how his compositions reflect this way of thinking to a remarkable degree.

That he was particularly concerned with parallel fifths can be supported by aspects of his professional activity as reported by two observers who worked with him.


Giles Bryant, his successor at St. Mary Magdalene's, describes the "ferocity" with which he marked the parallel fifths in his copy of The Cambridge Hymnal, (Cambridge University Press, 1967), a modern hymnal which pays little regard to the principles of counterpoint. Margaret Drynan mentions that he consistently ferreted out consecutive fifths in his students' work. Parallelism plays an important role in Willan's style, and the explanation he gave for his own use of parallel fifths was: "You can break the rules for a special effect, but you have to know the rules before you can break them."

Lorne Watson, recollecting his harmony class, provides some revealing insights into Willan's musical thought:

Willan's teaching of harmony and counterpoint -- one indivisible subject with him -- was completely fascinating. His insistence on simplifying all progressions to absolute basics often resulted in two or three measures of chromatic chords being reduced to a simple V-I progression. Such thinking prepared one for analysis à la Schenker. His uncomplicated teaching encouraged simplicity.

His use of the word insistence in this passage indicates

---

40 Drynan, p. 6. 41 Ibid.
that the process of reduction to underlying levels was very important to Willan.

The issues which arose in Willan's teaching of music theory are the very ones which are central to an understanding of his own music. Accordingly, the following discussion deals with parallelism, harmonic language, and two-part framework in Willan's music, with frequent recourse to reduction as a way of explaining each of these aspects of his style in greater depth.
II Surface Structures

Both on the surface and at the deeper levels of its structure, Willan's music exhibits strongly distinguishing stylistic characteristics. This chapter will explore some of these traits in their surface level manifestations. Willan's individual, often unique approaches to the use of the common contrapuntal devices will be discussed here, and his interesting use of parallelism will be treated as well, both discussions serving as an introduction to his style and as a preparation for the analytical studies which follow.

Dissonance Treatment

Willan makes use of all the traditional types of dissonance, and the following pages discuss his own particular use of dissonance -- passing tones (abbreviated to "p" in the examples), neighbour tones or auxiliaries (n), suspensions (s), appoggiaturas (app), anticipations (ant), cambiatas (cam), escape tones or échappées (et), and pedal points (pp) -- illustrated by examples from the works of Willan's middle period.

This study begins with simple examples of dissonances occurring individually and in groups, and continues with examples of a more complex nature, involving various types of dissonance acting concurrently. Examples of dissonance are drawn from the first ten of the
eleven *Liturgical Motets* (1928-1935). (The final motet of the series, *Who is She that Ascendeth* (1937), is cast in a style less typical of Willan's middle period. It presents a freer, more "contemporary" style.) These motets, written at the height of his creative powers, demonstrate the greatest freedom of part motion while still, with few exceptions, adhering to the traditional contrapuntal rules.

Passing tones and neighbour tones

Simple passing tones occur very commonly in Willan's music. In addition, there are two types of passing tone less frequently found in his music which are of interest: the free passing tone and the passing chord.

Example 2.1  *Behold, the Tabernacle of God*, mm. 7-8.

Example 2.1 contains a free passing tone where the tenor moves from E-flat through F to A-flat. Emphasis on the F in the tenor, combined with resolution by skip, gives the F a quasi-harmonic stability. The

---

1Marwick, p. 27.
effect is close to that of an F minor seventh chord, while the actual harmony is an A-flat chord.

On the second half-note of Example 2.2, an A major triad is used as a passing chord. The preceding F-sharp in the alto is a passing note which connects the primary triad, G, with the passing triad. The use of multiple passing tones creates the smooth, stepped quality which is characteristic of Willan's style. In this example the largest melodic interval in any voice is the major second.

Example 2.2 O King of Glory, mm. 45-47.

Willan makes extensive use of neighbours in ways which go beyond the norm of mere decorative ornament. His neighbour tones often have voice-leading functions and become essential elements in the music. In Example 2.3 the neighbour tone, C, causes a dissonance to occur between the soprano and alto. Although the dissonance resolves at the beginning of the following measure, Willan treats the soprano B-flat as a sort of suspension which resolves when the soprano reaches A. The neighbour is treated by Willan as a harmonic
note in relation to the soprano, causing the B-flat to become unstable. Example 2.4 shows another arrangement of the same pattern, but in this case the resolution of the tenor involves a cambiata figure.

Example 2.3 *Lo, In the Time Appointed*, mm. 19-20.

Example 2.4 *Lo, In the Time Appointed*, mm. 31-32.

Example 2.5 shows a typical instance of three concurrent neighbours in contrary motion, creating a harsh dissonance of a minor ninth and a major seventh on the second beat. In Example 2.6, Willan's use of a neighbour chord creates a five-tone sonority. Here the alto F, being a third away from its original note, is not a neighbour but a consonant harmonization of the two other neighbours.
Example 2.5 *Fair in Face*, m. 2.

Example 2.6 *O King, to Whom all Things do Live*, m. 8.

Example 2.7 shows a rare use of neighbours which act on the same pitch, D, but which are out of step rhythmically. When the tenor resolves its neighbouring E back to D, the soprano moves to its neighbour, E. The soprano and tenor exchange pitch classes, elevating the auxiliary, E, almost to the status of a harmonic tone.

Example 2.7 *Hodie, Christus natus est*, mm. 34-36.
Example 2.8 shows the use of neighbours in four voices in the context of parallel motion. On the fourth eighth-note of this example the use of four neighbours creates a dissonant neighbouring chord. The juxtaposition of F-sharp against E in the middle voices gives the neighbour chord an extra impetus to resolve. Example 2.9 shows a similar neighbour chord of four notes which is prolonged so that it assumes the status of a harmonic element as well as that of a voice leading element.

Example 2.8 *Hodie, Christus natus est*, m. 44.

Example 2.9 *O King of Glory*, mm. 8-9.
Suspensions

Willan uses suspensions in a variety of interesting ways. Example 2.10 is a simple suspension in the context of a modal cadence, and Example 2.11 is an inverted suspension -- one which resolves upwards rather than downwards. The normal resolution here would be F, but Willan has used A-flat instead, bringing about a smoother melodic line in the tenor. This suspension, as well as contributing to the rhythmic variety of the passage, also avoids parallel fifths between the inner voices.

Example 2.10 Preserve us, O Lord, m. 6.

Example 2.11 O King, to Whom all Things do Live, m. 19.
The double suspension occurs quite frequently in Willan's music, often in the context of parallel motion. Example 2.12 is harmonically unambiguous, because the suspensions occur in the inner voices. Here the suspended notes become dissonances when the bass causes a harmonic motion in its move to A.

Example 2.12 Fair in Face, mm. 31-32.

It is normal for the upper notes to form suspensions over the bass, but in the following case, Example 2.13a, the uppermost note, C-sharp, is the harmonic note, and the lower notes are suspended. Until the resolution of the lower voices occurs, the C-sharp sounds like an appoggiatura which might resolve according to Example 2.13a I beheld her Beautiful as a Dove, mm. 3-4.
2.13b. Because the non-harmonic tones outnumber the harmonic tones, and because the only harmonic tone is the upper note, the non-harmonic tones sound like harmonic tones until their resolution is perceived.

Example 2.13b.

The use of multiple suspensions has the effect of blurring the harmonic motion so that the change from one chord to another becomes a gradual process. (The reverberant acoustics of churches, where these motets are usually performed, naturally reinforce this effect.)

In Example 2.14 the apparent suspension of C in the tenor, which would normally resolve to B, is dissolved when the D in the alto rises to E and the bass note changes to C. The alto D at first sounds like a harmonic tone, but it is actually a prepared appoggiatura. The tenor C no longer needs resolution when it is supported by the bass C.

Example 2.15 includes a suspension in the lowest voice. The first C-sharp in the bass is a lower neighbour, but the second is the resolution of the
suspended D. Because of the melodic context of the bass line and the fact that the suspension occurs in the low range of the lowest voice, the leading tone effect of the C-sharp is weakened. The C-sharp in the second measure sounds very much like a lower neighbour, which it is in the first measure. (The significance of the leading tone in Willan's music is fully discussed in Chapter Four.)

Example 2.15 O King of Glory, mm. 23-24.

Example 2.16 shows a chain of suspensions in the context of a cadential figure. It is reminiscent of a Renaissance cadential figure in its use of suspensions and stepwise resolution, but not in keeping
with Renaissance norms are the held note, F-sharp, in the soprano, and the absence of a raised leading tone, A-sharp, in the tenor which produces a neo-modal effect, typical of Willan's middle period. Suspensions are used here to avoid the parallel fifths in what would otherwise be a simple progression of sixth-chords.

Example 2.16 *Fair in Face*, mm. 17-19.

Example 2.17 is a suspension chain in five voices, treated sequentially. Each suspension is decorated with a lower neighbour in a manner reminiscent of the Baroque polyphonic style.

Example 2.17 *O King of Glory*, mm. 14-17.
Appoggiaturas

In his vocal writing, Willan uses a large number of both prepared and unprepared appoggiaturas. These are normally resolved downwards although there are some cases in which they rise.

Example 2.18 includes a simple prepared appoggiatura with a falling resolution. The appoggiatura is used here primarily to avoid parallel fifths.

Example 2.18 O King all Glorious, m. 25

Example 2.19 shows two appoggiaturas at once, both of which are prepared. Although the alto appoggiatura is made by way of a leap, the A-flat is prepared in the soprano voice.

Example 2.19 Rise up, my Love, my Fair One, mm. 3-4.
In Willan's usage, appoggiaturas in contrary motion usually converge on an octave or a unison. In Example 2.20, the appoggiaturas in contrary motion are unprepared, but the dissonant pitch classes are both present in the previous chord.

Example 2.20 Behold, the Tabernacle of God, mm. 9-10.

Example 2.21 is unusual in the music of Willan because the falling resolutions of the two final appoggiaturas create parallel fifths. As will be seen, Willan normally does not use parallel fifths in the context of dissonance resolution, using them instead as consecutive consonances where the voice-

Example 2.21 I beheld her Beautiful as a Dove, mm. 11-12.
leading is less noticeable. In this example the parallel fifths are obscured to some degree by the opposing motion of the tenor voice.

In Example 2.22, rhythm and accent play an important role in the interpretation of dissonance. If the bar line is understood to indicate a relatively strong point, the second C-sharp in the alto and the A in the tenor can be heard as appoggiaturas -- accented non-harmonic tones -- which resolve upwards to D-sharp and B. However, if the first beat of the measure is not accented the C-sharp and A sound like passing tones connecting B and G-sharp with D-sharp and B. The role of the C-sharp and A is further complicated by the fact that they affect the stability of the harmonic tone, G-sharp, in the soprano. As in Examples 2.3 and 2.4, the concurrence of G-sharp and A at the beginning of the measure causes the soprano G-sharp to descend to F-sharp, even though the dissonance has by this time been resolved. The aural effect is

Example 2.22 I beheld her Beautiful as a Dove, mm. 8-9.
that the C-sharp and A are heard as harmonic tones while the G-sharp is heard as a suspension. The ambiguities of harmonic and non-harmonic function, brought about through, or itself resulting in, deliberate obscuring of the metrical pulse as indicated by the bar lines, lend a characteristic continuous flow to Willan's music.

The triple appoggiatura is used fairly frequently by Willan. Example 2.21 above includes an instance of three concurrent appoggiaturas, both rising and falling, to an E major chord. The use of a large proportion of dissonant to consonant notes produces an ambiguous harmonic structure: chords are blurred into one another; one chord begins while another is still sounding, and then the new chord emerges fully, provided that another chord has not begun to cast a blurring foreshadow.

Example 2.23 contains a succession of triple appoggiaturas resolving downwards in sixth-chords, and provides an example of the blurring effect just mentioned. Here, either the second quarter of the fourth quarter of the first measure can be understood as the beginning of the F minor chord. By labelling the lower notes as appoggiaturas, one suggests that the F minor chord begins on the second quarter of the measure. However, it might be argued that the A-flat in the soprano is actually an anticipation of the
F minor chord which appears on the fourth beat.

Example 2.23 *Rise up, my Love, my Fair One*, mm. 7-8.

Example 2.24 shows Willan's use of appoggiaturas in the context of a modal cadence in six voices. In music of the eighteenth century the cadential appoggiatura chord is normally a delayed dominant over a tonic bass note. Willan's application of the appoggiatura chord to a modal cadence successfully integrates sixteenth and eighteenth century devices in a novel effect.

Example 2.24 *Rise up, my Love, my Fair One*, mm. 25-26.
Anticipations

Willan's use of anticipations, although infrequent, is nevertheless of interest. Examples 2.25 and 2.26 contain anticipations in the context of a three-against-two arrangement. In the first of these, the length of anticipation of the C-sharp in the soprano is very slight — only a triplet eighth-note. The following D-sharp is a neighbour to C-sharp. This anticipation gives a sense of fluidity to the music, again by blurring the precise point of harmonic movement. Example 2.25b, a simplification of the passage, illustrates that the material of the second beat is essentially a passing motion between the first and third beats.

Example 2.25a I beheld her Beautiful as a Dove, m. 31.

Example 2.25b.
In Example 2.26a, the tenor G-flat is an anticipation which stands for an underlying, retained A-flat. However, the use of sixth-chords in the lower voices causes the G-flat to sound like a harmonic tone rather than like an anticipation. Example 2.26b is a simplification of the motion, demonstrating that the G-flat in the soprano is delayed in its motion to A-flat, a motion which would normally occur at the time the lower parts begin their descent.

Example 2.26a Rise up, my Love, my Fair One, mm. 9-10.

Example 2.26b

Example 2.27a includes an anticipation of more extended duration. The anticipation in the alto sounds very much like a chordal element because of the parallel third relationship that pertains between the upper
voices. In Example 2.27b, a simplification of the progression, the D-flat does not occur until the beginning of the second measure. A confusing element in Example 2.27a is that, in relation to the D, the C of the tenor sounds like an appoggiatura rather than like the resolution of the neighbour, B-flat. As the simplified version illustrates, this resolution is actually part of a sixth-chord movement. Although the C sounds like the non-harmonic tone, is is actually the D-flat which is dissonant.

Example 2.27a *Rise up, my Love, my Fair One*, mm. 14-15.

Example 2.27b.
Cambiatas and escape tones

Both cambiatas and escape tones are rare in Willan's music. His reluctance to make use of them is possibly due to the tendency of these figures to break up smooth melodic lines by the introduction of decorative leaps. The soprano voice of Example 2.28 contains a cambiata, D-flat, which circumvents parallel fifths between the outer voices, and which transforms the sonority on the second quarter-note into a seventh chord.

Example 2.28  O King, to Whom all Things do Live, m. 15.

Example 2.29a includes an escape tone in the alto voice, the middle element in the melodic figure F-sharp, E, G-sharp. However, in terms of stuctural voice-leading, the E represents a passing motion between the alto F-sharp and the tenor D-sharp. Example 2.29b, avoided by Willan because of the parallel fifths and because the texture thins to only three real parts, shows a more natural resolution of the voices.
Willan uses pedal point in two distinct ways: as a non-functional textural device of short duration, and to express a dominant function of extended duration. In Example 2.30 the tenor has a brief pedal point which is dissonant to the surrounding harmony for only one beat. The effect is as if the tenor had failed to move to an A on the third beat. Substituting an A for the B at this point clarifies the harmony, but the tenor melody becomes repetitious, while substituting a C-sharp results in parallel octaves. In other words, voice-leading reasons were the basis of Willan's decision to leave the tenor on B as a non-functional
pedal. Short pedal points of this type are usual in Willan's vocal writing.

Example 2.30 *Fair in Face*, mm. 1-2

The extended pedal point with a dominant function is not normally found in the vocal music. However, it is standard in the longer works for organ, and in these it always occurs as a preparation for the final return to the tonic key. Two fine examples may be found: in a very early organ work, the *Prelude and Fugue in c minor* (1908), and in a much later one, the *Passacaglia and Fugue No. 2 in e minor* (1959). In the first the pedal point lasts for twenty-three measures while the upper voices present a series of sequences culminating in a triple stretto of the principal fugue subject in very close formation. In the second instance the pedal point lasts only seven measures, in which Willan reintroduces the principal subject together with its countersubject.²

²Campbell-Yukl calls this countersubject the third subject of what she terms a triple fugue. In fact, however, it is the countersubject, accompanying both principal subjects. See Campbell-Yukl, pp. 160, 162-164.
Combinations of dissonances

The following examples are intended to be not an exhaustive collection, but a sampling of the ways in which Willan uses a variety of dissonances together. The effect of multiple dissonances in a texture is usually one of ambiguity, and it often becomes difficult to distinguish between harmonic and non-harmonic tones.

A profusion of dissonances arises naturally in a thoroughly contrapuntal style where horizontal, melodic thinking predominates, but it should not be forgotten that counterpoint is as much a matter of rhythm as it is one of pitch. In Willan's vocal music, the accentual plan of each voice is largely determined by its rendition of the text, and the metric impression conceived by the ensemble as a whole is frequently uncertain. As we have seen, this uncertainty greatly intensifies the ambiguous effect of the pitches themselves.³

³In the Liturgical Motets, Willan developed a notational device, the wavy bar line, intended to guide singers in performance without connoting metrical accents in the normal way. (This idea may have been derived from plainchant in which rhythm is dependent solely on the stress of the words.) There is, of course, some question as to whether a performer's conception of the musical flow is significantly altered by this simple notational expedient, but it is worth noting that many composers have used dotted lines to indicate important but unstressed simultaneities. After completion of the Liturgical Motets, Willan did not use wavy bar lines again, although there were occasions when he did use dotted bar lines. (See Come, Thou Beloved of Christ (1953).)
Another point worth bearing in mind is that Willan's use of parallelism is significantly related to his use of dissonance. Specifically, as some of the following examples show, and as will become clear below, the melodic drive of streams of parallel motion overrides the usual principles of preparation and proper resolution of dissonance.

In Example 2.31a the alto is indicated as having a suspension while the tenor and bass have passing tones. The resolution of the alto takes place while the tenor and bass are passing, so that the harmonic tone, G-sharp in the alto, is heard as a dissonant seventh above the bass. The following group of examples reveals the underlying motion of this phrase. Example 2.31b shows the basic structure: a rising motion in the bass harmonized by a neighbouring motion in the soprano. Example 2.31c shows the addition of the middle voices, the alto in contrary motion to the bass, and the tenor in parallel thirds with the bass. The inclusion of this tenor line causes parallel octaves
between the soprano and tenor, prompting further expansion of the passage. Example 2.31d includes an extra rising motion in the lower voices, which allows the tenor to descend to C-sharp, eliminating the parallel octaves. In Example 2.31e, the alto begins on F-sharp instead of A, so that the third of the first chord will not be doubled, but it quickly moves
to A to avoid parallel octaves with the bass. The suspension of the A in the alto is introduced so that the implied octaves, F-sharp to G-sharp between the alto and bass, will be obscured through rhythmic displacement. Example 2.31f shows the addition of a delay in the final F-sharp chord by the use of an appoggiatura chord. The final surface structure, Example 2.31a, introduces motivically related material in the tenor and soprano: a melodic repetition of B, C-sharp, D-sharp, E in imitation. The surface structure of the passage is revealed to be a logically developed extension of a simple underlying structure, dissonances being introduced primarily for functional rather than decorative reasons.

The remaining examples in this section are not analysed in extreme detail. Rather, different combinations of dissonance are pointed out, as are features which make each excerpt remarkable.

In Example 2.32 the two lower voices each move

Example 2.32 I beheld her Beautiful as a Dove, m. 5.
through three consecutive dissonances, an anticipation, a neighbour, and an appoggiatura, before arriving at a harmonic note. Parallelism in the lower parts helps to support this extended use of non-harmonic tones.

Example 2.33 presents a variety of dissonances which combine to produce a thick, dissonant texture. The most interesting element in this example is the tenor A-flat, which is marked as an appoggiatura, but which appears to resolve by leap to the F. In fact the A-flat, in terms of voice-leading, resolves upwards to B-flat while the chord tone F is added below. In this context the A-flat sounds like a seventh, a chord tone in a B-flat chord. However, a substitution of A-natural for the A-flat reveals the true voice-leading resolution to B-flat. The chord then appears clearly as an F seventh-chord over a B-flat bass. Willan's use of A-flat rather than A-natural obscures the essential dominant function of the appoggiatura

Example 2.33 Rise up, my Love, my Fair One, mm. 17-18.
chord.

Example 2.34a is a passage in which differentiation between harmonic and non-harmonic tones is difficult. Example 2.34b shows the underlying four-voice texture which includes parallel octaves between soprano and tenor voices. Willan removes this parallelism by moving the tenor first to D, and by suspending the tenor over the change of harmony, as in Example 2.34c. In the final form, Example 2.34a, a confusing element, the anticipation of E in the alto, is added, to preserve the four-voice texture, giving the inner parts the semblance of one parallel stream. Although the inner voices move in tandem, their functions differ, the

Example 2.34a Behold, the Tabernacle of God, mm. 1-2.

Example 2.34b.  

Copyright 1934 by Carl Fischer, Inc.  
Reproduced by permission.

Example 2.34c.
alto F being an anticipation of the second chord, while the tenor D is a suspension of the first chord. While their functions differ, they sound as one, so that the alto F tends to sound like a suspension, rather than an anticipation.

Example 2.35 illustrates the effect of a suspension combined with passing tones. The suspension occurs in the soprano, and at its point of resolution the tenor and bass begin a descending passing motion, so that all three of these voices descend at once in parallel six-four-chords. Because the six-four-chord is relatively consonant, and because the soprano passes through its initial note, C, again after the B-flat, the soprano B-flat sounds like a neighbour, rather than like the resolution of a suspension.

Example 2.35 Behold, the Tabernacle of God, mm. 16-17.

The final example of dissonance treatment, Example 2.36, is in six parts, and involves parallelism to a large extent. The upper voices move from a consonant A-flat triad through a passing G minor triad to an
F minor triad whose root is a dissonant fourth above the bass. At this point the lower voices begin a rising passing motion up to C and E-flat, a dissonance in relation to the alto F. This dissonance causes the alto to make a neighbouring motion to G before its final goal, E-flat, is reached. The soprano has a \textit{nota cambiata} motion which harmonizes with the descending passing tones of the lower voices, and the middle of the three upper voices has an escape tone, B-flat, before it proceeds to G. As a point of style, it is interesting to note that Willan here accepts parallel fifths in the upper voices but uses the \textit{nota cambiata} in the soprano to avoid parallel octaves with the tenor. This is because the soprano and tenor belong to separate, independent streams of motion. Parallelism between separate streams would tend to diminish the character of opposition between them.

Example 2.36 \textit{Behold, the Tabernacle of God}, mm. 18-19.
Parallelism

Willan's style is permeated by parallelism in three ways: 1) As we have seen, parallelism is important in Willan's contrapuntal technique, where it is used to fill out the harmony and to support non-harmonic tones. 2) As an element of texture, parallelism is present in the form of streams of parallel motion. (In this context, a stream of motion consists of a distinct melodic line or group of lines, which functions as a unit in terms of melody and rhythm.) This type of parallelism is focused on here. 3) Parallelism is also used as a feature of deeper-level structure, as will be seen in Chapter Five.

In streams of two or more voices, Willan usually employs diatonic parallelism -- that in which the intervals between parallel lines are modified to preserve the operative diatonic collection. For example, a melodic stream in parallel thirds would alternate between major and minor thirds in the manner of gymel. Willan also uses chromatic parallelism, in which exact interval relationships are preserved, and in addition, hybrids of the two types occur, in which a certain amount of chromatic parallelism is present in a prevailing diatonic type.

The most usual of the surface textures in parallel streams is that in which two distinct and opposed streams are present. Four-part contrapuntal writing constitutes
the surface of Willan's art but, as was pointed out above, he "preached" two-part counterpoint, in the form of a structural framework consisting of a melodic line, usually found in the soprano, and a bass line. In this sort of arrangement the middle parts are thought of either as independent melodic lines added to the primary structure to fill it out, or as parallel lines appended to either the soprano or bass melodies.

While resorting most often to structures in two streams, Willan did make use of a pattern in which three distinct streams of motion occur. The normal form of this type is that in which the soprano and bass have independent melodic streams, while the alto and tenor form a third, contrasting stream of parallel motion and harmonic support. The texture is like that of a trio, but using four voices instead of three.

The other textural approach to parallelism which Willan uses is derived from his study of plainchant and ancient music. This type involves parallelism in all the voices at once, resulting in only one melodic stream. This style resembles both organum and the fauxbourdon style of the old English masters.

The following pages systematically examine Willan's technique of composition using parallel streams of motion.

Two-part counterpoint, expanded by parallelism, takes the following forms in Willan's music: 1) an upper
voice supported by two lower ones in parallel motion;  
2) two upper voices in parallel motion supported by one  
lower voice;  3) an upper voice supported by three  
lower voices in parallel motion;  4) three upper voices  
in parallel motion accompanied by an independent lower  
voice;  5) two upper voices in parallel motion accom­  
panied by two lower voices, also in parallel motion; and  
6) soprano an: tenor in parallel motion accompanied by  
alto and bass in parallel motion. Willan does not make  
use of the one remaining form: highest and lowest voices  
in parallel motion, with the middle voices supplying an  
opposing contrapuntal stream. Of course, this last  
mentioned form is not used by Willan because it violates  
his concept of a two-part counterpoint between upper and  
lower voices. In fact, the only instance in which the  
highest and lowest voices are consistently in parallel  
motion is when the highest voice doubles the lowest at  
the octave. This procedure (see for example An Apostrophe  
to the Heavenly Hosts (1921), mm. 6ff.) is really an  
orchestration. An octave doubling for an effect of  
brilliance, it is no more a case of parallel octaves than,  
for example, the octave doubling of first and second  
violins in an orchestral score.  

When writing for three voices, Willan almost habit­  
ually uses a soprano melody accompanied by two lower  
voices in parallel motion. A good example of this occurs  
in the "Benedictus qui venit" of Missa Brevis No. 4 (1934),
Example 2.37. After an imitative opening, the lower two voices move in parallel diatonic thirds to the end of the piece. The same approach can be found in the "Benedictus qui venit" of Missa Brevis No. 1 (1928), the middle section of the "Agnus Dei" of Missa Brevis No. 5 (1935), and the first section of the carol, Here are We in Bethlehem (1929). The two motets for three voices, O Saving Victim and Look Down, O Lord (1935), are almost exclusively composed in this style. Many other compositions include large or small sections of similar design.

Example 2.37 "Benedictus qui venit" of Missa Brevis No. 4.

Copyright 1934 by Carl Fischer, Inc.
Reproduced by permission.

Less common is the texture in which the soprano melody is in parallel motion with an inner voice, accompanied by an independent bass-line. However, examples of this type do occur. The best of these is probably the
"A" section of the Scherzo from Five Pieces for Organ (1957-58). A few measures of this chromatic parallelism are reproduced in Example 2.38.

Example 2.38 Scherzo (Five Pieces for Organ), mm. 5-12.

Expansion of the basic texture of two streams from three into four voices results in a denser polyphony. This style normally takes these forms: 1) the soprano or the bass has a counter melody to parallel six-three or six-four chord motion in the other parts; 2) the two upper voices form one stream and the two lower voices form a counter stream; 3) of soprano and tenor form
one stream and alto and bass form the other.

Example 2.39 O King, all Glorious, mm. 30-32.

Example 2.40 Matins, mm. 18-27.
Example 2.39 shows a soprano melody harmonized by three lower voices in parallel motion. This texture is never continued for long periods, probably because of the imbalance in forces between the streams.

Examples 2.40 and 2.41 demonstrate the inversion of the above texture, in which the upper melody, a stream of three voices, is accompanied by an independent bass line. Willan does not hesitate to use this texture for extensive sections, because the bass can balance the upper three voices reasonably well.

Example 2.41, which shows three stages of Willan's compositional process, is of particular interest. Three successive versions of the opening of the motet *O King of Glory* (1929) are presented. Example 2.41a gives the earliest manuscript version, in which the upper voices move consistently in parallel six-three chords. Note that in the subsequent versions, from a later sketch and from the published work, the contours of the outer voices remain unchanged, while the detail of the inner voices is altered to give a semblance of melodic independence to the alto and tenor. The simple parallelism of the first sketch becomes disguised by the crossing of the alto and tenor voices. Although the surface of the music is no longer strictly in parallel motion, the underlying plan of the phrase remains a two-part counterpoint between soprano and bass, with the middle voices in motion parallel to the soprano.
Example 2.41a *O King of Glory*, mm. 1-4.

First Manuscript Version

Reproduced by permission of the Estate of Healey Willan.

Example 2.41b *O King of Glory*, mm. 1-4.

Second Manuscript Version

Reproduced by permission of the Estate of Healey Willan.

Example 2.41c *O King of Glory*, mm. 1-4.

Final, Printed Version

Copyright 1929 by Oxford University Press. Reproduced by permission.

Example 2.42 exhibits parallelism in which the upper voices form one stream and the lower voices form another. This is a common texture in Willan's writing,
and it is the predominant texture in the pieces *Regina Coeli Letare* (1928) and *Tyrle, Tyrlow, Tyrle, Tyrlow* (1928), both written for women's voices, a cappella.

Example 2.42 God is Gone Up with a Shout, mm. 25-28.

More unusual in Willan's music is the application of this texture in a more chromatic context, as seen in Example 2.43. Here the two streams of motion move in contrary motion. The upper voices express an underlying pattern of minor thirds moving up by alternating half-and whole-steps, while the lower voices outline a whole-tone scale in descending major thirds as a result of rapidly fluctuating diatonicism.\(^4\)

A final example of parallelism of two upper parts against two lower parts, Example 2.44 is from the opening measures of the organ piece *Ave Maris Stella* (1951). The parallelism occurs over a bass pedal, and is interesting because the two streams are in similar

---

\(^4\)Willan did not often use the whole-tone scale, but effective examples do occur. Other pieces which include whole-tone techniques are *Urbs Hierusalem Beata* (1951), *The Dead* (1917), and *Vexilla Regis* (1951).
rather than contrary motion. One stream rises slowly in sixths, the other quickly in thirds.

Example 2.44 \textit{Ave Maris Stella} (Five Preludes on Plainchant Melodies), mm. 1-4.

Parallelism in which the soprano and tenor are linked, as are the alto and bass, is infrequently encountered, usually taking the form of a sequence. Example 2.45, from the motet \textit{The Spirit of the Lord} (1951), provides a simple but characteristic instance of this textural type.
Parallelism in two streams is quite common in Willan's vocal music for more than four parts. In his five-part music the usual arrangement is for the upper three voices to form one stream while the lower two voices form another, as Examples 2.46 and 2.47 illustrate. Example 2.46 is composed of two melismas surrounding a C-flat chord. The upper voices execute a turn, while the lower voices have a neighbouring motion. Example 2.47 is of the same basic design, but here the melodies are more adventurous.
Example 2.47 Ring Out, Ye Crystall Spheres

from the Coronation Suite, mm. 10-11.

In six voices, parallelism in two streams usually consists of the upper three voices in one stream and the lower three voices in the other, an expansion of the five-voice texture just described. Example 2.48 is demonstrative of the style. Note that each of the streams includes only perfect fifths in the outer voices, while the inner voice alternates between major and minor thirds, the whole remaining within the diatonic collection. Because of the limited contrapuntal possibilities, this style is restricted to short time-spans in Willan's music. In this piece the
excerpts is marked *con exultazione* and forms the climax of the work.

Parallelism in three separate streams is common in Willan's music, and it occurs in four voices when only two are in parallel motion. The overall texture is that of a trio—melody, counter melody, and bass—with one stream filled out through parallelism.

In the chorale preludes the inner voices are often in parallel motion, as in Example 2.49. Here

Example 2.49 *This Endris Nyght*, mm. 7-13.

Copyright 1957 by C.F. Peters Corp.
Reproduced by permission.
the soprano and bass are in long note values, while
the inner parts are predominantly in eighth-note motion
in parallel thirds, harmonizing the outer voices.
Willan was evidently very fond of this texture and,
because of its suitability to the organ, where the
melody would be on one manual, the accompaniment of
two parts on another manual, and the bass in the pedals,
it was probably used a good deal by Willan in improv­
isng chorale preludes. The Prologue on Ascension
(1956) is in this texture for the first thirty-eight
of its forty-nine measures.

Example 2.50 shows a three-part texture in which
the lower voices are in parallel motion against
independent upper voices. This texture is neither as
common, nor as extended in use, as the preceding one.
The soprano and alto on separate melodies cannot success­
fully balance the stream of thirds in the lower voices,
so the use of the texture is limited.

Example 2.50 O Trinity, Most Blessed Light, mm. 47-50.

Copyright 1925 by Novello & Co.
Reproduced by permission of the Estate of Healey Willan.
A final example of parallelism in separate streams is taken from the cantata *The Mystery of Bethlehem* (1923). Example 2.51 contains a section of music which uses four distinct streams: a melody in the soprano, a canonic imitation of this melody at the seventh in the oboe, an independent bass-line, and a harmonic accompaniment in parallel thirds in the alto voices. This texture is continued for ten measures, and it is interesting to note that the parallelism occurs again in the accompanying alto voices, rather than in a melody or bass-line.

Example 2.51 *The Shepherds* from *The Mystery of Bethlehem*, mm. 45-47

---

Copyright 1951 by H.W.Gray Co.
Reproduced by permission of Belwin Mills Corp.
Example 2.52 illustrates the simple nature of a parallelism derived from organum, using a consonant eight-five-three chord to harmonize the chant-like soprano melody. An aspect of the music not derived from parallel organum is that the inner voices follow the steps of the mode, rather than being intervalically consistent with the soprano. As a result, some chords are major, some minor, depending on the scale degree of the melody.

Example 2.52 Come, Thou Beloved of Christ from the Coronation Suite, mm. 98-100.

An extension of this style is found in the Liturgical Motet Hodie, Christus natus est (1935). The excerpt from this work, given as Example 2.53, is once again a passage of parallel motion based on a simple melody of limited range. However, in this example the
parallelism is intervalically accurate in the voices sounding the fifths of the chord, but only diatonically accurate in the voice sounding the thirds. Although D-flat is found in the soprano melody, D-natural, the diatonic third of the chord, occurs in the alto.

Example 2.53 *Hodie, Christus natus est*, mm. 48-57.

The part-song *Weep You No More Sad Fountains* (1929) provides instances of the second technique mentioned above, in which parallel motion is based on a dissonant sonority. Example 2.54, which quotes the work's final measures, shows Willan's use of parallel six-four-three chords. As in Example 2.52, the harmonic intervals of the chords are diatonic rather than exact. The close, on an unresolved dissonance, is most unusual in the music of Willan, but is effective here
in connection with the final word of the text, "sleeping". This piece is one of Willan's most experimental, using parallelism and chromaticism freely, remaining tonal but closing on a dissonance.\(^5\) It is significant that it was written in 1929, the middle of Willan's most creative period. The work was finally published in 1979, in preparation for the composer's centenary.

Example 2.54 *Weep You No More Sad Fountains*, mm. 44-48.

It was noted above that Willan typically took a diatonic approach to parallel writing. Nevertheless, his work does offer examples of a literal, chromatic approach. Example 2.55 exhibits chromatically descending dominant seventh chords in five parts. The seventh of the chord is taken by the bass in an independent melodic line, and the upper voices cross parts to preserve some independence and to avoid parallel fifths and octaves between voices.

\(^5\)The following pieces are also exceptional in their use of a dissonant ending: *A Soft Light from a Stable Door* (1948), *Here Are We in Bethlehem* (1929), and *Fair in Face* (1928).
Example 2.55 *Gloria Deo per immensa saecula*, mm. 60-63.

Copyright 1952 by Western Music Co.
Reproduced by permission of Leslie Music Supply.

Example 2.56, from the final Liturgical Motet, *Who is She that Ascendeth?* (1937), is a highly chromatic passage in parallel motion. It is comprised of parallel major triads over an independent bass-line. The interaction of the two streams results in various seventh chords and dissonant relationships. This motet, written just two years after the part-song *Weep You No More, Sad Fountains* (see Example 2.54), represents Willan's vocal writing at its most chromatic.

Example 2.56 *Who is She that Ascendeth?*, mm. 10-12.

Copyright 1937 by Carl Fischer.
Reproduced by permission of Chanteclair Music.
Having surveyed the various types of parallelism used by Willan, this chapter will conclude with a look at the organization of parallelism over the course of a single passage. Example 2.57 demonstrates the use of a variety of types of parallelism smoothly connected to one another. In this example there are from two to four independent streams of motion at any one time.

Example 2.57 Rise up, my Love, my Fair One, mm. 1-10.

At the beginning of the piece there are three streams, the lower voices being in parallel thirds. The voices become totally independent in the second measure, but by the end of this measure the upper three voices begin to form a stream. In the middle of the third measure the tenor switches from the upper stream to the lower and, as the cadence in measure 5 is approached,
the parts assume a greater degree of independence. In the second phrase (beginning after the rest) the voices divide into an upper and a lower stream. At measure 7 the alto shifts to the lower stream, where it remains until the final measure of the example, in which both the alto and tenor shift to the upper stream.

The subtlety of design and flexibility of approach which are evident here typify the music of Willan's middle period, a very large proportion of which makes use of various types of parallelism. Of course there are pieces of a consciously contrapuntal nature in Willan's output, such as *O How Sweet, O Lord* and *Let Us Worship* and *Fall Down*, both from the *Six Motets* (1924), and the fugue from the motet *Gloria Deo per immensa saecula* (1950), where parallelism is the exception rather than the norm, but it is Willan's use of parallelism in creative ways which characterizes so much of his music.
There are four main personal traits in Willan's music which act as fingerprints of the composer: 1) the use of consecutive minor chords, 2) the use of episodes based on descending chromatic scales, 3) the use of a characteristic initial ascent at the beginning of a composition or section, and 4) the use of a closing formula based on the chant melody used in singing "Amen" at the end of Gregorian hymns.

Consecutive minor chords

Willan's use of consecutive minor chords, usually in a chromatic relationship to each other, is evident in a wide range of music from all stages of his career. One of the earliest occurrences of consecutive minor chords is in the Prelude and Fugue in c minor (1908).

Example 3.1 Prelude and Fugue in c minor, mm. 5-8.
Example 3.1 shows a sequential passage of minor chords over a chromatically descending bass. Although major chords are produced through the use of escape tones in the upper voice (m. 2 beat 2, m. 3 beat 2, and m. 4 beat 2), the overall effect is that of a chromatic descent in parallel minor chords.

Willan normally uses minor chord-chains and sequences for dramatic effect. Coupled with chromatic descent they evoke a sense of tragedy and intense drama which recurs particularly in his later period. In his opera *Deirdre* (1943), he uses ostinato patterns of minor chords to portray the pervading atmosphere of gloom and impending doom. Example 3.2 is taken from the opening of the opera, just after the opening theme is played unaccompanied. This ostinato sets the mood for the ominous opening lines:

> Blow low, red wind from the east,
> Blow with your tidings of evil,
> For it is you has the terror of voice,
> It is you has the splendour of coming.

Example 3.2 *Deirdre*, Act I, mm. 9-13.
Example 3.3 is taken from the beginning of the third act. It is a simple but effective ostinato, again built on a chromatic, rather than diatonic, succession of minor chords.

Example 3.3 *Deirdre*, Act III, mm. 1-3.

Example 3.4 shows the ostinato of the final chorus, "It is the curse of the gods on Conochar", which follows the tragic love-death scene.

Example 3.4 *Deirdre*, Act III, mm. 842-846.
Willan used minor chords dramatically in later compositions for organ, notably in the processional, Urbs Hierusalem beata (1951), and in the Passacaglia and Fugue No. 2 (1959). Urbs Hierusalem beata is a prelude based on the Sarum Office Hymn melody "Urbs Beata", used in the highly dramatic liturgy of the Dedication Festival. Example 3.5 comprises a succession of minor chords which forms a sequence of two-chord patterns descending by major thirds. Passing tones in the bass result in a whole-tone scale in that voice.

Example 3.5 Urbs Hierusalem beata, mm. 58-59.

Example 3.6, the memorable opening of the Passacaglia and Fugue No. 2, provides another instance of this technique, this time as an introductory, attention arousing device. Here the third chord is major, a deviation from the strict use of minor chords in earlier examples. This progression is based on a chromatic descent in the upper voice.
A final example of this technique is from the chorale prelude *Christ ist erstanden* (1958). Significantly, this prelude is based on a hymn for Easter, again a dramatic point in the liturgy. Example 3.7 shows a small portion of this piece, throughout which minor chords are used in a dramatic fashion. Again the progression is based on a chromatic descent in the soprano.
It should be noted that Willan never wrote chromatic sequences of minor chords, such as the ones described above, for voices, presumably because such progressions are extremely difficult to sing in tune.

Episodes based on descending chromatic scales

In Willan's later creative period, from 1950 to his death, the extraordinary number of commissions for chorale preludes led him to the development of a characteristic chorale prelude style. Generally these pieces are in a four-part contrapuntal texture of three independent voices based on motives from the chorale tune, and one voice presenting successive phrases of the tune separates by short interludes.

As a means of bringing harmonic variety to the often limiting chorale tunes, Willan began to base his episodic material (the material between chorale phrases) on descending chromatic scales, which form the basis of chromatic sequences. Willan had used descending chromatic bass lines in his earliest organ pieces, the Prelude and Fugue in c minor (1908) (see Example 3.1), the Prelude and Fugue in b minor (1909), and the Epilogue (1909), but their particular use as foundations of episodic material did not occur until much later.

The chorale prelude Nun preiset alle (1950) includes a passage based on a descending chromatic line as a preparation for the presentation of the chorale phrase.
which follows. The descent from G to D-flat in the bass is harmonized with a variety of chromatic chords, and the texture activated by a rising motive in eighth-notes.

Example 3.8 Nun preiset alle, mm. 32-39.

Example 3.9 includes a similar chromatic descent, this time arriving at the dominant in preparation for a restatement of the opening material. The upper voices are in a free, imitative counterpoint, again using chromatic chords to harmonize with the bass.
The chorale prelude **Martyrdom** (1957) includes two instances of chromatic motion which clearly serve to fill the interludes between successive phrases of the chorale melody. Example 3.10a occurs between the first and second phrases of the melody, and Example 3.10b occurs between the third and fourth phrases. (Between the second and third phrases there is an episode of diatonic character.) The two chromatic episodes are very similar to each other and so attain the status of secondary thematic material.
Willan's use of chromatic episodes was fully extended by 1958, when the chorale prelude *Nun lasst uns Gott dem Herren* was written. In this piece there is a chromatic episode between each pair of chorale phrases. In Example 3.11, which shows the three episodes, the chromatic base lines contain irregularities of motion -- whole steps and upward motions --
Example 3.11 Nun lasst uns Gott dem Herren,
mm. 26-29, 36-41, and 52-57.
which provide variety in the context of a technique which can easily result in formalized patterns and repetitive chord motions. The upper voices are never treated sequentially in this example, as is usually the case in Baroque episodes. Rather, they are in free counterpoint of the same style as is found in the free parts accompanying the chorale phrases. This continuity of design, coupled with the harmonic variety of the episodes, creates a fine balance of unity and diversity.

The development of a style which introduces an element of chromaticism into a non-modulating composition functions vitally in maintaining interest in the music. Willan binds the two elements of diatonicism in the chorale melody and chromaticism in the episodes by the use of a continuous, free, but motivically related counterpoint in the remaining voices.

Other compositions which make use of sequences based on a descending chromatic line are the chorale preludes Bristol (1957), Tunbridge (1958), and A Rouen Church Melody (1958).

Initial ascent

The initial ascent which is found in many of Willan's compositions bears an interesting resemblance
to Schenker's *Anstieg*. Schenker's initial ascent may be described as an arpeggiation of the tonic triad at the beginning of a piece, often filled out through the use of scale steps, ending on the first tone of the *Urlinie*. Willan's initial ascents are also based on arpeggiation of the tonic triad, sometimes filled in with scale steps, but their highest point of arrival is normally followed directly by a descent, usually by step. The individual aspects of the initial ascent as Willan used it are its appearance on the surface of the music rather than in deeper structures such as Schenker had in mind, and its avoidance of the leading tone in the rise to the tonic.

The following examples of initial ascent are drawn from several of Willan's pieces. Each example represents the beginning of a piece or section.

Example 3.12 includes an initial ascent in the soprano voice, its usual location in Willan's music. It begins on \( \hat{3} \) and rises through \( \hat{4} \) and \( \hat{5} \) before leaping up to the tonic and immediately descending.

Examples 3.13 and 3.14 illustrate very similar ascents from two chorale preludes. In each case the ascents contain ever widening intervals -- seconds, a third, and a fourth -- which create a sense of

---

building intensity in the phrase.

Among Willan's most effective uses of an initial ascent is that found at the beginning of the Liturgical Motet Rise up, my Love, my Fair One (1929). Example 3.15 shows the soprano ascent to F, followed by a second ascent in the tenor, measure 2, imitating the soprano and rising to G-flat, a semitone above the soprano's
ascent, disregarding octave placement. This passage beautifully illustrates the opening words of the motet, "Rise up, my Love". Each of these ascents is followed immediately by a stepwise descent, a release of the energy built up in the ascent.

Example 3.15 Rise up, my Love, my Fair One, mm. 1-2.

Two final examples of initial ascent show the composer borrowing from himself, either consciously or unconsciously. In each case the harmonization is the same, and both are in the same key. In these ascents, the motion is from 3 to 3, and again the leading
tone is avoided.

Example 3.16 Scherzo, mm. 37-38.

Example 3.17 Christ, whose Glory fills the Skies, mm. 1-2.

Other pieces which include an initial ascent in some form or other, but always in the soprano voice, are: Christ hath a Garden (1940), Sing Alleluia Forth (1940), Sing we Triumphant Songs (1950), Matins for organ (1961), and the hymn-anthem Lord of all Hopefulness (1966).
"Amen" closing formula

Through his activities in both dramatic and sacred music, Willan became well aware of the theatrical and dramatic aspects of the liturgy. In a short pamphlet he describes the role of liturgical music in the following words:

The organist, upon whose shoulders lies the main responsibility of performance, should realize that the music of the service is in reality the incidental music of a great drama, and that it should in no way obscure the intention or impede the movement.  

The "Amen" and "Gloria Patri" concluding formulas which articulate a liturgical office must have suggested to him the idea of developing a formula for both organ and choral music which would act to punctuate the musical portions of the liturgy in a complementary way.  

The music of the "Amen" is unique in Gregorian literature because it always embodies the same tune, whichever mode is used. (In contrast, there is a different melody for the "Gloria Patri" in each of the modes.) Example 3.18, the "Amen" from the hymn _Ad Regias Agni Dapes_, shows the invariable form of the "Amen"—a motion of 1, 2, 1, 7, 1.  

While composing his first published organ piece, the _Fantasie upon the plainchant "Ad Coenam Agni"_, (1906),

---


or possibly while improvising, Willan hit upon the idea of using this melodic formula as a way of rounding off a composition. It is a most effective formula,

Example 3.18 "Amen" from the hymn *Ad Regias Agni Dapes*.

![Example 3.18](image)

both in its relationship to the liturgy, and for purely musical reasons. The weaving about the tonic gives an assurance of arrival at the latter, and, in its use of supertonic and leading tones, it is the melodic counterpart of the harmonic motion I, IV, I, V, I.

In Example 3.19 the "Amen" melody is used as a coda after the tonic arrival, in much the same way that an "Amen" is appended to a plainchant hymn.

Example 3.19 Fantasie upon the plainchant

"Ad Coenam Agni", mm. 86-89.

![Example 3.19](image)

Copyright 1906 by Novello & Co.
Reproduced by permission of the Estate of Healey Willan.
The first appearance of the "Amen" formula in Willan's vocal music seems to be in the third of the Six Motets, *Very Bread, Good Shepherd, Tend Us* (1924), significantly one of the first liturgical compositions to be published after his appointment to St. Mary Magdalene's. Example 3.20, containing the final measures of this motet, exhibits the "Amen" melisma in the soprano voice. However, the melisma is presented on the dominant rather than the tonic, an occurrence which became quite commonly associated with Willan's use of this motive. In this example the "Amen" is not a coda or an appendage, but the true close of the composition. The bass reaches the tonic only when the last note of the "Amen" melody is attained in the soprano.

Example 3.20 *Very Bread, Good Shepherd, Tend Us*, mm. 32-37.

Example 3.21 shows a setting of the same melisma, this time actually sung to the word "Amen". Here the highest notes of the organ contain the formula, while the choir sings "Amen" beneath. The whole takes place over a tonic pedal, giving a sense that this is a
Example 3.21 O Lord, Our Governour. mm. 44-49.

Example 3.22 shows an "Amen" formula in the soprano, harmonized by an interesting succession of chords. The

Example 3.22 Father, We Praise Thee, mm. 74-78.
supertonic is harmonized by the succession II, flat-VII, and the following, medial tonic is harmonized by IV, rather than I six-four.

Example 3.23 is similar to Example 3.21 in that the melisma occurs on the dominant pitch, over a tonic pedal. This example exhibits a frequently recurrent phenomenon in Willan's music: the use of a penultimate chord comprised of both dominant and subdominant elements. In this case the penultimate chord contains a VII triad in the upper voices and a IV six-four triad in the lower voices.

Example 3.23 Hodie, Christus natus est, mm. 62-64.

Example 3.24, from a late motet, Hosanna to the Son of David (1951), is interesting because of its use of the chromatic form of the melisma $\hat{1}$, flat-$\hat{2}$, $\hat{1}$, $\hat{\Lambda}$, $\hat{\Lambda}$, $\hat{\Lambda}$, sharp-$\hat{7}$, $\hat{1}$--giving a sort of Neapolitan flavour to both the melodic line and the harmony. Again the use of both dominant and subdominant elements is evident in the penultimate chord.
Example 3.24 Hosanna to the Son of David, mm. 62-68.

Example 3.25, from the part-song On May Morning (1950), shows that Willan also introduced the "Amen" formula into secular music, presumably because he sensed the formula's inherent implication of finality apart from its liturgical implication. Here the melisma is in an entirely diatonic setting.
The final example of Willan's "Amen" closing formula is from a late organ work, the Andante, Fugue and Chorale (1965). Here the melisma is harmonized by a primary IV to I progression, seen in the last three measures of Example 3.26. The dominant is characteristically weakened by the absence of a raised leading tone, by placement on a weak beat, and by the use of a tonic four-three appoggiatura. In this example Willan combines the "Amen" with statements of the primary motive of the whole composition—C-sharp, D-sharp, G-sharp—in the lower voices. It is fitting that this piece concludes with an "Amen" coda because the last movement is a chorale, a homophonic movement reminiscent of a hymn.

Example 3.26 Andante, Fugue and Chorale, mm. 102-106.

Some other pieces which include "Amen" closes are:

the organ pieces Aeterna Christi munera (1951) and Christe, Redemptor omnium (1951), both based on plainchant
The illustrations in the preceding chapters indicate that Willan's music is firmly based in traditional concepts of harmonic progression and voice leading. However, there are certain fundamental aspects of his harmonic style which tellingly affect the music's tonal qualities. Preeminent among these, and therefore of signal importance in contributing to his particular "sound", is the suppression of that dynamic force comprised of interrelated upper-fifth and leading tone functions, whose action in traditional music is directed toward, or implies, the tonic. The lack of this dynamic force, which produces the central harmonic motions of "common practice" music, gives Willan's music a certain impressionistic and mystical quality. Instead of relying on the opposition of dominant and tonic functions, Willan achieves motion through melodic direction of the voices, phrase structure, and formal design.

The leading tone function, conventionally the melodic component of the drive to the tonic, is avoided by Willan in the following ways: 1) avoiding the seventh degree, 2) using the leading tone in parallel contexts, in which its dynamic force is suppressed in the overall motion of a parallel stream, 3) resolving the seventh degree in a falling rather than a rising manner, 4) artificially flattening the leading tone at crucial
points, and 5) using modal scales which naturally include a flattened rather than a raised seventh degree.

In Chapter Two we have seen various types of parallel motion in which the independence of the leading tone, and consequently its strength, is subsumed in the overriding motion of a parallel stream. In Example 2.39 the C-sharps never realize their function as leading tones because of the overall motion of the three lower voices. In Example 2.41 the C-sharp leading tones of the lower three voices are, with only one exception, again incorporated in parallel motions of a larger stream or, in the bass, in a descending motion. (The final C-sharp in the bass does rise independently to D. However, here the tenor doubles the leading tone an octave higher, removing some of its dynamic force. Willan breaks the rule about doubling the leading tone according to his own dictum: "You can break the rules for a special effect". 1)

Prime examples of the avoidance of the seventh degree occur in Willan's initial ascents, which often rise to the tonic and invariably omit the leading tone. Examples 3.15, 3.16, and 3.17 include upward motions in which a skip occurs between the sixth and eighth scale degrees. Of course, in the descending passages which usually follow these initial ascents the leading tone is

---

1Drynan, p. 6.
often included because it does not express its rising vector function. (Motives which skip the leading tone in ascent but use it in descent pervade Willan's music. Examples 2.18, 2.32, and 2.54 follow this pattern.)

One way in which Willan reduces the importance of the seventh scale degree without omitting it altogether is to use it only in the lower voices, leaving the soprano only six diatonic melody notes. He often makes use of this approach for quite extensive sections.

Example 4.1 Nicaea, mm. 1-6.
of music. Example 4.1 includes no instance of $\text{A}$ in the upper voice until the last measure, where it acts merely as an unaccented neighbour. The lower voices include nine instances of $\text{A}$, none of which resolves upwards, and none of which expresses the leading tone function. The motion $\text{A} - \text{A}$ is common here, but $\text{A} - \text{A}$ is absent. Tonality is maintained primarily through use of the diatonic collection and through repetition of important pitches.

Example 4.2 also illustrates avoidance of the leading tone function. Here again, the soprano has a characteristic initial ascent and contains no leading tones. Each of the lower voices has instances of $\text{A}$, but all of these progress by descent.

Example 4.2 I Will Lay Me Down in Peace, mm. 1-5.

Copyright 1950 by Concordia Publishing House. Reproduced by permission.

Using the natural minor scale is an obvious way of avoiding the raised leading tone. Example 4.3 shows Willan's use of this scale. Indeed, the first $\text{A}$ in the soprano is a raised leading tone, but here it acts only as a local arpeggiation of E. The following C's,
which are of more significance to the structure of the phrase, are natural. In the motion towards D at the end of the phrase, Willan uses the natural minor scale in both the descending soprano line and the rising bass line, deviating from the conventional use of the ascending form of the melodic minor in a rising figure.

Example 4.3 Epilogue, mm. 1-4.

Copyright 1909 by Novello & Co.
Reproduced by permission of the Estate of Healey Willan.

As well as avoiding the leading tone function by using the minor mode, Willan makes use of the ecclesiastical modes to a limited degree, and only in pieces actually based on Gregorian melodies, such as the chorale preludes Ave Maris Stella (1950), Christe, Redemptor Omnium (1950), and Iste Confessor (1958), the Missa Brevis No. 7, O Westron Wynde (1936), and the modal service music. Example 2.44 is representative of Willan's modal style. The leading tone function is absent due to the nature of mode I, so the motion $\hat{7} - \hat{8}$ is freely
used here without its normal harmonic implication.

Example 4.4 demonstrates Willan's use of the flattened seventh degree in the context of major tonality. Here the soprano has A-flat when ascending and the scale-conforming A-natural when descending. Willan's harmonization of this passage is designed to accommodate the chromatic alterations with as much continuity of texture as possible. The idea of flattening the seventh on ascent and raising it on descent is antithetical to the melodic minor construct, in which scale degrees are raised on ascent and lowered on descent.

Example 4.4 Very Bread, Good Shepherd, Tend Us, mm. 6-8.

In his avoidance of the leading tone function in the major mode, Willan often seems to hark back to the modal principle termed *fa suprā la*. This involves the use of a flattened seventh scale degree as an additional melody note to the modal hexachord of the first six scale degrees. This seventh degree is borrowed from the *molle* hexachord based on the subdominant, and is used as an auxiliary pitch in the natural hexachord.
It is of signal importance that the flattened seventh is borrowed from the subdominant hexachord, relating as it does Willan's melodic patterns to his heightening of the importance of the subdominant and weakening of the dominant, as will be seen in the following pages.²

Example 4.5 shows Willan's application of the principle of fa supra la. Here the range of the melody is from the tonic, A, to the seventh, G-natural, the latter forming the melodic apex. While using the flattened seventh, Willan harmonizes the melody with a simple I - V - I progression, thereby combining an aspect of conventional tonality with one of an earlier, modal approach.

Example 4.5 Finale Jubilante, mm. 1-2.

²For a detailed discussion of fa supra la, the reader is referred to: Allaire, Gaston G., The Theory of Hexachords, Solmization, and the Modal System, (American Institute of Musicology, Musicological Studies and Documents, No. 24, 1972.)
Example 4.6 again shows the application of "fa-supra-ia. Here the soprano ascends from the tonic to the seventh degree, which is flattened. The harmony is again a simple I - V - I progression, with a minor instead of a major dominant.

Example 4.6 Nun preiset Alle, mm. 1-4.

In the orchestral piece Interlude for a Festival, from the Coronation Suite (1953), Willan lowers the leading tone by another technique. Example 4.7, the "Horn Call", shows an upper melody harmonized in a semi-diatonic parallelism of root position triads: the fifths are perfect while the imperfect interval, the third, is major or minor, depending on the scale degree involved. The use of strict parallel fifths forces the seventh degree to be flattened, avoiding the implications of a tritone in the outer voices and the
leading tone function of the C.

Example 4.7 Interlude for a Festival, mm. 48-49.

In addition to avoiding the leading tone function, Willan has a complementary tendency to avoid the dominant triad in chordal progressions, favouring chords on the subdominant side of the harmonic spectrum. William Marwick, in his dissertation on Willan's sacred choral music, has produced some statistical evidence concerning Willan's avoidance of the dominant triad. Figure 4.1 presents five analyses from Marwick's work which point up a degree of de-emphasis of the dominant. For each of the compositions analysed, results are tabulated, indicating the numbers and percentages of each chord (tonic, supertonic, mediant, etc.) found in the composition.

The five examples of Figure 4.1 have been selected to indicate the low proportion of dominant chords which characterizes Willan's style. To be sure, one may find numerous compositions in his oeuvre where the dominant triad is very much in evidence. Nevertheless, the marked absence of this triad, especially
at crucial articulative points in so many of his works, is a characteristic particular to Willan's style.

Figure 4.1
Chordal Analysis of Selected Compositions of Healey Willan.³

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chord</th>
<th>Number of Occurrences</th>
<th>Percentage of Occurrences</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>37.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>9.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>19.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>19.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1) Missa Brevis No. 10, "Sanctus" (1948).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chord</th>
<th>Number of Occurrences</th>
<th>Percentage of Occurrences</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>32.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>6.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>11.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>16.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>10.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>8.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>14.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2) Very Bread, Good Shepherd, Tend Us (1924).

³Marwick, pp. 65, 71, 75, 78, and 89. (Only the total numbers of occurrences of each chord are included here, rather than complete breakdowns of each into triads, sevenths, ninths, and altered chords. The reader is referred to Marwick's dissertation, The Sacred Choral Music of Healey Willan, for more detailed information.)
Figure 4.1 -- Continued

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chord</th>
<th>Number of Occurrences</th>
<th>Percentage of Occurrences</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3) Behold, the Tabernacle of God (1933).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>36.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>12.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>7.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>21.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>9.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>10.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>25.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>17.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>7.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>17.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>12.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>11.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>8.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5) Magnificat and Nunc Dimittis, Tone II, Solemn, Verse Six of the Magnificat.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>31.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>9.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>14.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>21.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>9.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Interesting aspects of the information contained in Figure 4.1 are the relatively large proportions of tonic chords and subdominant chords. The remaining classes of chords seem to have a fairly even-proportional distribution. Supertonic, mediant, and submediant chords, as well as chords built on the normally lowered seventh degree are all well represented.

More central to a study of Willan's style than a superficial listing of chordal proportions is arriving at an understanding of the ways in which he avoids the dominant function: he absents it from important points, though harmonic elision, and through retrogression at important cadences, and weakens it through the use of a minor, rather than a major dominant chord. (Of course, Willan can make very effective use of the dominant and often does, notably in the dominant pedals which are so common in his fugal writing.) Often the subdominant is given an important role, in place of the dominant, as will be seen in the following pages.

Example 4.8 shows a cadence in G minor which avoids the dominant entirely, and involves a compensatory inflation of the role of the subdominant. The whole of this example is in effect a prolongation of IV, beginning in the second measure, where there is a deceptive modal cadence, VII - IV. The subdominant is prolonged through the following measures in a scalewise descent
followed by a whole-tone descent in the bass, which finally arrives on the tonic in the fifth measure of the example. The final measures contain a I - flat-II6 - I progression, ornamented by a suspension in the soprano. The flat-II6 substitutes for a more conventional IV chord, and the progression serves to bring back a sense of the tonality after the chromatic passage in the fourth measure. The dominant has no place in the entire passage.

Example 4.8 Urbs Hierusalem beata, mm. 55-60.
Example 4.9a again demonstrates a lack of dominant function. The B minor tonic triad is approached in the third measure through a triad built on the natural seventh scale degree. The important chords leading up to this cadence are IV and IV7, occurring on the first, third, and fifth quarters of the third measure. In this passage the dominant pitch occurs only as a member of the tonic and mediant chords.

Example 4.9a O King, all Glorious, mm. 30-34.

The final measures of this example are interesting because the motion ends not on the tonic, as one might expect, but on a subdominant triad, closing the piece on E. Example 4.9b shows an alternate ending to the composition, ending on the tonic. This is put forth only by way of comparison with Willan's ending, and not as a suggested revision. It shows what for Willan would have been "common practice"—what he might be expected to have done, and what he elected not to do in this case.
Example 4.10 shows another way in which Willan imaginatively avoids the dominant at an important structural point in his music. This cadence, I - IV7, sharp-3 - I, in C-sharp minor, involves an unusual use of the major-minor seventh-chord on the subdominant. This cadence may be seen either as a plagal cadence involving chromatic alteration, or as a deceptive cadence having B major, the dominant of the relative major, as its expected resolution. The cadence combines

Example 4.10 Andante, Fugue and Chorale, mm. 39-42.
the vertical sonorities of an authentic cadence (the major-minor seventh), with the harmonic progression of a plagal cadence. It suggests an authentic cadence by its sound, but it avoids the dominant function.

Example 4.11, the final cadence of the organ piece *Evensong* (1961), provides a clear example of elision of the dominant. An authentic cadence could be very naturally produced here by inserting a dominant chord between the penultimate and final chords of the example. With its omission of the dominant function, the music of this example relies on strong melodic progressions in the outer voices for its firm cadential effect and clear expression of the tonality.

Example 4.11 *Evensong*, mm. 54-57.

Retrogression, the contradiction of normal harmonic movement by reversal, is yet another means by which
Willan avoids the dominant function. In Example 4.12, a cadence from the "Sanctus" of Missa Brevis No. 2 (1932), the tonic triad, F minor, is approached through a cycle of rising fifths—D-flat, A-flat (6), E-flat, B-flat, and F—a distinct contrast to the conventional approach to a cadence through descending fifths. (Elsewhere, notably in episodic material, Willan does make effective use of descending fifth cycles, but again, it is his deviation from common practice which constitutes the unique aspect of his style.

Example 4.12 "Sanctus", Missa Brevis No. 2, m. 12.

As well as avoiding the dominant in superficial ways, Willan often avoids the dominant in the larger structures of his music. The following examples demonstrate the ways in which his compositions are designed to avoid prolongations of the dominant.

Example 4.13, the opening section of the motet The Spirit of the Lord (1951), shows a passage which is organized around the tonic and subdominant areas,
to the exclusion of the dominant. Figure 4.2 outlines the harmony of this example.

Example 4.13 The Spirit of the Lord, mm. 1-11.

Figure 4.2
Harmonic Plan of The Spirit of the Lord, mm. 1-11.

Measure:
1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10

Chord:
I IV I IV I IV I IV I IV I

Background Harmony:
I ----------/ IV ---- I

As can be seen from Example 4.13 and the accompanying figure, the structure of this phrase is I - IV - I, with
no apparent dominant in either of the represented levels of structure. (In contrast to this opening passage, the fugue which concludes the piece, like all of Willan's fugues, uses the tonic-dominant relationship as a primary harmonic framework, thereby conforming to the traditional norms of fugal writing.)

The "Chorale" of the Andante, Fugue and Chorale (1965) is another passage in which Willan weakens the role of the dominant as a structural element. Example 4.14 summarizes the harmonic motion of the chorale, and Figure 4.3 shows the underlying harmonic plan.

Example 4.14 Part Motion in the "Chorale" from the Andante, Fugue and Chorale.
Figure 4.3

Harmonic Plan of the "Chorale" from the Andante, Fugue and Chorale

Phrase:
1 2 3 4 5 (Coda)

Harmony:
I I V IV VII IV I IV (V) I
# # # #

Background Harmony:
\[ \text{I} \quad \text{IV} \quad \text{I} \]

After moving to a half cadence on V# (end of phrase two), the music proceeds to IV and thence to IV of IV. The return to the tonic is via the subdominant rather than the dominant. In the structure as a whole, therefore, the dominant is not without some weight, but the subdominant has the primary structural role because it predominates in the long approach to the final tonic.

The coda is of special interest. The fact that it is based on the "Amen" motive was noted in Chapter Three. (See Example 3.26.) As well as introducing the "Amen", the main function of the coda is to shift the mode of the tonic from minor to major. This is accomplished through a I - IV, sharp - V, natural - I, sharp progression, in which the A-sharp of the IV chord leads the E of the following I chord to be raised. (If an E-natural were used here, a harsh cross-relation would
result between A-sharp and E-natural.) The penultimate chord, V-natural, is of secondary importance here because of its metric location on a weak beat, and because it lacks a raised leading tone. It seems only to be a bridge, linking the subdominant and tonic as a harmony for the B melody note of the "Amen" motive.

O King, To Whom All Things Do Live (1931), the eighth of the Liturgical Motets is a prime example of Willan's use of the subdominant region at a deep level of structure. Example 4.15a gives a sketch of the harmonic activity in this motet, and Example 4.15b summarizes the motion of the piece. (The entire composition is reproduced in the Appendix.) Important pitches in the outer voices are notated using white noteheads and stems. Willan's characteristic reliance on a clear linear scheme, the subject of the next chapter, is evident here. For the time being, attention should be focused on the Roman numerals which describe the harmonic trajectory. It should be clear that the primary region of modulation is the subdominant, extending from measure 16 to measure 23. This region is expressed in modal terms. Specifically, B-flat minor is tonicized in measure 16 by an A-flat minor-seventh-chord (natural-VII, flat-7), and the approach to the B-flat cadence in measure 23 is locally from a
Example 4.15a Harmonic Motion in "O King, To Whom All Things Do Live."
minor subdominant triad and, in a more long range sense, from the natural-VII,flat-3 harmony of measure 19. In other words, IV appears here in a Phrygian guise. Particularly important is the fact that local dominant - tonic relations play almost no role in the opening or closing tonal regions or, as noted, in the medial subdominant region. Only in two places are such relations in evidence. The first of these is in measures 18 and 19, where a local V - I occurs in the passing tonality of G-flat, and the other instance occurs in the coda, where a simple I - IV,sharp-3 - V,sharp-3 - I,sharp-3 cadence is appended; a surprisingly plain close to a closely knit work. Example 4.15b summarizes the basic harmonic motion, I - IV - I in the bass, and in the upper voice, the opening arpeggiation and the descending Urlinie which constitutes the primary melodic motion of
the piece.

Example 4.16, an analysis of *Behold, the Tabernacle of God* (1933), shows the harmonic framework of another piece in which Willan creatively avoids prolongations of the dominant. (This piece is reproduced in the Appendix.) The main areas of modulation, seen in Example 4.16b, are IV and III. It is common practice to modulate to the relative major, but Willan accomplishes this in an unusual way which masks the basic design. The relative major, III is approached through IV and flat-VII, flat-3, the latter its minor dominant. III itself arrives in measure 28 as a first inversion minor chord, preceded by its own subdominant. Only after B-flat minor is established does Willan move to the major mode of the relative key. Again, the return to I in measure 47 is made directly through III, rather than by way of a dominant.

Important dominants do occur in this piece (see measures 12 and 36), but these are local cadential features. The dominant is not present in the plagal close.

The Neapolitan chord plays an important role in this piece. As a way of linking the various sections, Willan uses the Neapolitan as a motivic sonority in measures 7, 18, and 57, and he uses the Neapolitan note, A-flat, as a very important melodic pitch in both the
Example 4416a Harmonic Motion in *Behold, the Tabernacle of God.*
ascent to B-flat (m. 24), and the descent back to G (m. 57). The apex of the melody in Example 4.16b is formed by the Neapolitan note of the relative, B-flat.

While Willan does follow standard procedure in modulating to the relative major, this aspect of the structure is somewhat masked by the intervening keys, IV and VII. Here again the dominant is only of secondary importance:

Example 4.16b Summary of Harmonic Motion in Behold, the Tabernacle of God.

This chapter illustrates the most significant features of Willan's harmonic style: avoidance of the leading tone and dominant functions in favour of lowered melody notes, such as the such as the fa-supra-la and the Phrygian or Neapolitan flat-2, and subdominant harmonies and tonal regions. Chapter Five discusses
Willan's characteristic contrapuntal-melodic technique based on a two-part voice-leading framework which acts at various structural levels.
V Two-Part Framework

In the second chapter of the present work the use of parallel streams of motion was discussed. It was shown that Willan often made use of a two-part surface structure consisting of opposing streams of parallel motion, and that he less frequently used three streams or a single stream of parallel motion. This chapter expands the role of two-part counterpoint in Willan's music to include its application to structural levels which lie beneath the surface of his music.

Example 2.2 provides a simple instance in which, as voices in a structure which lies just beneath the surface, the soprano and bass have primary roles, forming a structural two-part counterpoint. Although the inner voices do not represent a strict parallel motion in relation to the soprano, they do move generally in the same stream of motion as the soprano. These inner voices are somewhat independent on the surface of the music, but at a slightly deeper level they belong to the upper stream of motion.

Example 2.31 was discussed in detail in terms of its contrapuntal style, but it is also of interest for the sake of its two-part structure. Example 2.31b shows the underlying structure of the excerpt to be a two-part framework of soprano and bass voices, while
the following examples, 2.31c through 2.31f, show how this basic structure is developed into, and masked by, a surface texture.

Example 5.1 represents the final measures of the first section of *An Apostrophe to the Heavenly Hosts* (1921). This simple excerpt demonstrates the sort of two-part framework which so frequently recurs in Willan's music. (This excerpt is another "Amen" formula, and it is sung to the word "Amen" by one mystic choir and answered antiphonally by another.\(^1\)) The essential structural feature of this passage is the contrary motion of the outer voices. The inner voices fill out the harmony in parallel lines appended to the framing voices. Further examples will illustrate Willan's use of the two-part structural framework at

---

\(^1\) Evidently Willan was fond of using mystic choirs -- small choral groups within the main body of a choir -- for echo effects, often involving the setting of the word "Alleluia". The mystic chorus representing the angelic choir is not Willan's own invention. It dates back at least to 1903, the year in which Elgar's oratorio *The Apostles* was first produced at the Birmingham Music Festival. In this piece a mystic chorus of high voices is used, its music set to the word "Alleluia" in the same general style as is found in Willan's mystic choruses. It seems more than likely that Willan was familiar with this composition, both because he proofread for Novello, Elgar's publishing firm, and in view of his deep admiration for Elgar's music. In addition to *An Apostrophe to the Heavenly Hosts*, Willan used a mystic chorus in *In the Heavenly Kingdom* (1924), which title alone suggests the presence of angelic choirs; *Sing We Triumphant Songs* (1950); *O Sing Unto the Lord a New Song* (1956); and *Ye Shall Know that the Lord will Come* (1967).
deeper levels of his music.

Example 5.1 An Apostrophe to the Heavenly Hosts, mm. 116-120.

Example 5.2, a section of the Benedictus and Jubilate Deo (1953), is typical of Willan's four-part a cappella writing. Here the soprano and bass are gen-

Example 5.2 Benedictus and Jubilate Deo, stanza 3.
erally in contrary motion. Occasionally the outer voices are in oblique motion, but in this as in many other examples they are never in similar or parallel motion. The inner voices either provide harmonic filler or are part of a stream of motion with one of the outer streams.

Example 4.13 of the previous chapter again points up the prime importance given by Willan to the two outer, framing voices. Here the only point at which the outer voices move in similar motion is in measure 4, the approach to the cadence, where the harmonic drive overrides the contrapuntal opposition of the outer voices. The inner voices move generally in parallel motion with the outer voices, although in this example the tenor and soprano are often paired, as are the alto and bass.

The "Chorale" from the Andante, Fugue and Chorale (1965), also discussed in the previous chapter, is another instance of Willan's use of the soprano and bass as primary structural elements in the surface construction of the music. Example 5.3 shows the first two phrases of the "Chorale", as well as the improvisatory monody which connects them. As in the previous examples, the soprano and bass are almost entirely in contrary motion. (In this example there is one exception, the approach to the second chord of
the second chorale phrase, in which both outer voices descend.) Again the inner voices provide harmonic support and move generally, but not strictly, in parallel motion with the soprano.

Example 5.3 Andante, Fugue and Chorale, mm. 94-96.

Homophonic textures, such as those in the examples discussed thus far in this chapter, most directly illustrate the fundamental opposition of soprano and bass in Willan's music, but, as we shall see, the concept of a two-part framework continues to be per-
tent in the realm of his polyphonic music.

Example 5.4, the second section of the "Sanctus" from Missa Brevis No. 10 (1948), is somewhat more polyphonic than the previous examples. Here again the primary roles are given to the outer parts which work in opposition to one another, one descending while the other remains stationary, or both moving in contrary motion. In the later measures of the example, as the texture becomes more homophonic, the opposition of the outer voices becomes more apparent.

Example 5.4 "Sanctus" from Missa Brevis No. 10, mm. 13-24.

Copyright 1948 by H.W.Gray Co.
Reproduced by permission of Belwin Mills Corp.

One might note that this passage is essentially in the key of G, the dominant key of the piece. How-
ever, the soprano melody ranges from the temporary
tonic, G, to the flattened seventh above it, making the
local dominant, D, a minor chord. Other interesting
harmonic features in this excerpt are the introduction
of B-flat, which removes some of the dominant quality
of the G chord itself, and the stepwise bass motion
to the final cadence, precluding a V - I cadence in G.

In Example 5.5, the opening phrase of the organ

Example 5.5 Festival, mm. 1-7.
piece *Festival* (1954), the outer voices have a real rhythmic independence from one another. Their phrases overlap instead of being synchronous, but the opposing motion of the outer voices is nevertheless maintained, except for a few scattered instances. As usual the middle voices fill out the harmony, adding melodic turns here and there, as in the alto voices of measures 5 and 6, to give a semblance of independent motion.

The third Liturgical Motet, *I Beheld Her, Beautiful as a Dove* (1928), illustrates the use of a two-part framework at a surface level of organization. Example 5.6, presenting the final measures of the motet, shows an abundance of contrary and opposing motion between the outer voices. The inner voices again find their role mainly as voices of parallel streams appended to one of the outer voices. In the third measure of the example all the voices proceed for a short time in parallel motion, but here the dissonance of the parts in some measure compensates for the lack of contrary motion, substituting a different kind of tension between the voices. The lower voices form a parallel stream for this entire measure, while the upper voice remains to some degree independent: at the beginning of the measure the soprano is in contrary motion to the others; then it descends, forming seventh dissonances in relation to the continuing sixth-chords below; finally
it begins to move again in contrary motion to the lower stream. A degree of opposition is maintained in the outer voices throughout this passage. (This measure is also discussed in Chapter Two, p. 42.)

The following measures of the example present a much less ambiguous opposition of outer voices.

Example 5.6 I Beheld Her, Beautiful as a Dove, mm. 29-35.

A final example of the use of a two-part framework as a surface organizational procedure, Example 5.7 from the chorale prelude Urbs Hierusalem beata (1951), shows Willan's application of the same technique in the context of a highly chromatic texture. Here again the fundamental contrary motion of the outer voices is supported by loosely parallel streams of inner voices.
Sometimes the inner voices have metrical subdivisions (eighth-notes) which give them a semblance of independent melodic motion, but these are only local phenomena of textural rather than structural significance. (One may note here again the use of minor chords for dramatic effect as discussed in Chapter Three, and the absence of leading tone and dominant functions discussed in Chapter Four.)
Two final analyses will demonstrate both Willan's avoidance of the dominant function and his use of two-part framework at deeper levels of musical structure. The fifth Liturgical Motet, Rise up, my Love, my Fair One (1929) is representative of Willan's middle period, and the Intermezzo from Five Pieces for Organ (1959) exhibits his later style. In each piece both two-part framework and avoidance of the dominant are fundamental to structural unity. (Both pieces are reproduced in the Appendix.)

Examples 5.8 and 5.9 present successive structural levels of Rise up, my Love, my Fair One, exemplifying the use of two-part framework as a basis of the harmonic texture. In these examples the two opposing streams are shown by the use of two staffs, one for each stream. Phrases are marked by slurs and certain prolongations, involving retention of structural tones, by broken ties. Straight lines indicate the motion of voices from one stream to another, and essential harmonies are noted below the diagrams. Example 5.9 somewhat reduces the material of Example 5.8, through removal of prolongations and neighbouring motions. Willan emphasises the duality of the opposing streams by the use of mirror inversions, as in measures 4 and 5, where the lower voices are a direct mirror of the upper voices.
Example 5.8 Voice-Leading in *Rise up, my Love, my Fair One.*
Example 5.9 Two-part Framework in *Rise up, my Love, my Fair One.*

In the following two measures the two streams again operate in mirror inversion, the upper stream ascending by step while the lower stream descends, also by step.

Two additional points concerning texture in this piece are the frequency with which the inner voices shift from one stream to another, affording much variety of
texture within the limitations of the two-part framework, and the use of an open formation for the upper stream, a refreshing contrast, in measures 12 and 13. Here the upper stream spans vertical tenths rather than the more usual fifths and sixths.

Example 5.9 emphasises the essential duality of the opposing streams which generally move in contrary motion in this middleground level. For example, the opening four measures clearly express a mirror-like formation of opposing streams, expanding and contracting. In the second phrase, continuing to measure 10, the mirror formation is carried on more at the surface, but the following phrase again demonstrates the mirror-like opposition of streams, moving from II7 to VI (measures 11-18).

In this piece the dominant triad is conspicuously absent as a structural element. Willan avoids the leading tone, and directs harmonic motion to chords which stand in a plagal relationship to the tonic. The most important secondary harmony in this piece is II7, which appears both in prolongation (measures 3-10), and as a recurring chord of articulative importance (measures 2, 11, 21, 23, 25, and 28). This chord may be thought of as a substitute for the dominant in the context of this piece. In traditional harmonic practice II7 serves as a preparation for the dominant; in this
piece it implies a dominant which never appears. Prolongations of II7 take the place of traditional dominant prolongations, as in the second phrase of the piece, measures 6-10, where a prolongation is indicated by beamed pitches in the outer voices. Interior cadences in this piece are to the relative minor, rather than the dominant. The lack of modulation to, or tonicization of, any of the secondary harmonic goals gives a feeling of modality to the work. The final cadence, formed by the progression II, four-three - I, has a strong plagal quality. This music is purely diatonic and strongly tonal, but its harmony does not follow the I - V - I paradigm.

The Intermezzo is a simple yet highly refined work which very clearly illustrates the ideas concerning two-part framework set forth above. The work is in ternary form, and the following discussion is of the first section of the piece only, that is, of measures 1 to 17. It should be noted at the outset that the outer voices are overwhelmingly in contrary motion on the surface of the music. Although this surface is a contrapuntal texture of two to four streams of motion, at deeper levels the piece can be seen to consist, in its entirety, of two streams.

Example 5.10 shows the surface structure of the
Example 5.10 Surface Structure of the Intermezzo, mm. 1-17.
first section of the Intermezzo. Large white notes indicate the fundamental motion which occurs in the soprano and bass voices. These white notes are beamed to indicate the direction of motion of these important voices. Large black notes indicate secondary progressions: arpeggiation, reiterations, and significant neighbouring or passing motions. All the small black notes indicate embellishing material which is only of significance on the surface of the composition. This includes all local neighbouring functions, appoggiaturas, escape tones, and so on. Notes in brackets are not present on the surface of the music in the specified octaves, but are implied by the progress of the voices. Their derivations are indicated by the use of vertical ties, connecting presented pitches to their implied octave positions.

Example 5.10 clearly illustrates that the soprano line consists of three successive descents, $\hat{8} - \hat{3}$, $\hat{6} - \hat{3}$, $\hat{6} - \hat{1}$, following an initial upswing which occurs as a surface feature of the work.

Before proceeding to further levels of structure, two interesting secondary motions will be discussed. The first of these is a rising motion in sixths, which occurs in the inner voices in measures 7 and 8. It is an ascent in the alto from E-sharp to A, and in the tenor from G-sharp to C-sharp, the important
pitches being denoted by large black notes. This motion supports a literal prolongation of the outer voice tones, extending the C-sharp in the soprano, arrived at in measure 7, to measure 9. The four note ascending motions of the inner voices, rather than being scalar, are comprised of successive ascending thirds and descending seconds, as if the second and third notes of the series were exchanged. (Example 5.12 illustrates the "normal" presentation of this motion.) In the two previous measures, 5 and 6, the other secondary motion occurs, illustrated on a third staff in square brackets. This is a local descent of the inner voices in sixths, balancing the succeeding ascent in sixths. Although the motion presented on the third staff, descending from D and F-sharp to F-sharp and A, is audible, it is only of local importance, the real structural pitches of these measures being presented in the upper staffs of the second system.

Example 5.11 clarifies the essential motions of the piece by removing all the local embellishments indicated by small black notes. The two secondary motions mentioned above are present in the third staff of the second system.

Important prolongations are also found in measures 9 - 10 and 12 - 13. These two are once again paired, as were the inner motions of measures 5 - 8. Here
Example 5.11 Foreground of the Intermezzo, mm. 1-17.
prolongations are constructed of a local scalar descent in the soprano, mirrored by a step-wise ascent in the bass, the soprano descending a fourth while the bass ascends a fifth. This motion is followed directly by a motion back to the primary notes of prolongation in each case. Each prolongation is marked by broken ties which connect the notes being retained, and each forms a miniature I – V = I motion, the first on the subdominant, and the second on the supertonic.

The prolongation in measures 14 – 15 is illustrated in the preceding diagram, Example 5.10. It takes the form of an exchange of pitches E and C-sharp in the outer voices, marked by crossing lines. In Example 5.11 this motion is greatly simplified to a simple rearrangement of the C-sharp minor chord, from root position to first inversion, facilitating a downward octave transfer during the bass motion from C-sharp to D.

Example 5.12 presents the same notes as the previous example, but here the bar lines have been removed, while chord symbols have been added to indicate the essential harmonic motion. In measures 7 – 9 the note order of the inner voices has been changed, in order to clearly indicate their underlying motion, a simple ascent in sixths. Although secondary dominants do occur in the prolongations of measures 9 – 10 and 12 – 13, it will be seen that no dominant occurs at
deeper structural levels. At this stage the middleground motion begins to emerge as a series of upper voice descents, forming a stream of sixth-chords with the middle voices, and harmonized by an independent bass line.

In Example 5.13 the prolongations have been removed, leaving only the primary outer voice motions and the supporting harmony of the inner voices. Three
Example 5.13 Middleground of the *Intermezzo*, mm. 1-17.

Main descending phrases can be seen in the soprano, completing an entire octave descent from A to A. The main bass motion is A - F-sharp - D - B - A, the D being transferred up an octave before moving to B. On this level of structure, the piece appears as a two-part counterpoint, consisting of three upper voices in parallel sixth-chords against the bass. As the final cadence is approached, this obbligo is relaxed, and the middle voices switch to the lower stream for the final cadential progression in measures 16 and 17.

Example 5.14 is a further simplification of the preceding diagram. Here the tenor has been raised an octave, illustrating clearly the parallel formation of the upper voices. The bass notes have also been raised an octave, as far as measure 12, showing the motion of the bass to clearly be an octave descent, A - F-sharp - D - B - A. The three primary upper stream descents now appear supported by three successive bass
Example 5.14

Example 5.15 outlines the motion of the outer voices: there are three descents of the soprano, each supported by a single bass note (successively A, F-sharp, and D), and a final cadence. At this point the significance of the initial C-sharp at the beginning of the soprano line becomes clear. It is the first note of the initial ascent, the first melody note of the composition, and the first note of the background fundamental line, $^\wedge 3 - ^\wedge 2 - ^\wedge 1$. The C-sharp which begins the initial upswing is prolonged over a I chord through the first soprano descent from A to C-sharp. In the second phrase the C-sharp is again prolonged as part of a VI chord, and serves again as the final note of

notes, A, F-sharp, and D. Measures 9 to 15 appear as a prolongation of II6, and the final cadence is II7 - I. The prolongation of II6 is outlined in the soprano melody (F-sharp - D - B), the bass motion (D - B - D), and the chords which support these notes, all of which are supertonic triads.
the second soprano descent, F-sharp – C-sharp. However, when the bass descends another third, to D, the C-sharp in the soprano becomes a dissonant seventh above the bass. This dissonance is resolved in measure 15, where the soprano finally descends to B. From here the cadence to I is a simple and fairly direct motion, although Willan chooses to make another third descent in the bass, resulting in a II7 – I cadence. (Compare the final measures of *Rise up, my Love, my Fair One*, which also ends with a II7 – I cadence.) The initial ascent, as well as being a surface fingerprint of the composer, is structurally a link between two organizational levels of the soprano line—the fundamental $\hat{3} - \hat{2} - \hat{1}$ line, and the series of three middleground descents.

Example 5.16 summarizes the essential motion of the two-part framework of this piece: a stepwise descent in the soprano harmonized by the tonic, subdominant, and tonic in the bass. I have included the
other fundamental bass notes, the third-dividers F-sharp and B of the previous example, as well as adding a hypothetical middle voice which completes the harmonies. This extremely simple diagram represents the most fundamental structure of the piece, a relatively simple composition which is nevertheless very characteristic of Willan's work. The ultimate background diagram and its derivation from succeeding clearly defined structural levels illustrates the high degree of integrity in Willan's work.

It will be observed that Example 5.16 bears a very close resemblance to the Schenkerian Ursatz, Example 5.17. The striking similarity between the two

---

2Heinrich Schenker, Free Composition (Der Freie Satz), trans. and ed. by Ernst Oster, (New York: Longman Inc, 1979), Figure 1.
is found in the primary descent of the upper voice, \( \wedge 3 - 2 - 1 \). The obvious difference lies in the fundamental bass line, Schenker's being \( \wedge 1 - 5 - 1 \), and Willan's \( \wedge 1 - 4 - 1 \). Comparison of the two fundamental approaches to harmonization of the *Urlinie* reveals the very important distinguishing trait in Willan's music: the avoidance of dominant function.

While the fundamental structure of this section of Willan's *Intermezzo* cannot be considered the fundamental design of even the majority of his works, it does illuminate both his high level of attainment in logical structuring of music, and his fundamental divergence from tradition with respect to the importance of the dominant as a primary pole of harmonic structure.
Healey Willan succeeded in integrating many facets of his musical background—an intimate familiarity with traditional Anglican music, a love of Brahms, and a lively interest in plainsong and Renaissance polyphony—creating a style of composition which is perhaps a hybrid, but which nevertheless is unique and significant. The melodic curves of plainchant suggested his own melodic shapes, the modality of Renaissance music contributed to his personal harmonic sensitivity and contrapuntal technique, and the sonorities of nineteenth-century Romanticism never ceased to affect him. The synthesis of all these factors, mediated by his own sensitivity to his material, yielded a very personal music with much grace of design.

The bulk of his published output, designed for performance in connection with religious services, will continue to be heard in church settings. However, it seems likely that only a fraction of Willan's work is destined for repeated public performance. The Liturgical Motets, particularly *I beheld her Beautiful as a Dove*, *Fair in Face*, *Rise up, my Love, my Fair One*, and *Hodie, Christus natus est*, are often heard in recital. In addition, the large motets, *An Apostrophe to the Heavenly Hosts*, and *Gloria Deo per immensa saecula* are frequently performed. Only a
handful of the organ works appear on recital programs, such as the **Introduction, Passacaglia and Fugue**, and a few of the chorale preludes, although many of the works are used regularly as teaching material. Although Willan's opera, *Deirdre*, is both of historical significance as Canada's first full-length opera, and of musical significance as the work Willan considered his best, the costs involved in mounting a production of such a work make it seem doubtful that it will ever be performed again.

It can be argued that the list of works which continue to be performed is unreasonably short, and that many fine works remain unjustifiably neglected, for example, the previously mentioned part-song *Weep You No More Sad Fountains*, and the *Passacaglia and Fugue No. 2*. Ultimately, however, Willan's popularity should not be allowed to serve as an index of the worth of his artistic achievement. Only by way of conscientious and informed analysis is it possible to properly evaluate his stature. It is hoped that by examining the nature and extent of Willan's contrapuntal mastery, particularly with reference to his management of the two-part framework as a basis of voice-leading, parallelism, and form, this study has enabled a more convincing documentation of his lasting contributions to music.
Appendix

Longer Musical Examples

This appendix contains the music of *O King, to Whom all Things do Live*, *Behold, the Tabernacle of God*, *Rise up, my Love, my Fair One*, and the first section of the *Intermezzo*, pieces which are analysed in detail in the text.

Errors in the printed music are as follows:

**O King, to Whom all Things do Live**

- mm. 19 - 20: The slur in the piano score should connect the tied soprano G's not the alto.
- mm. 20 - 21: The tenor B-flats in the piano score should be tied.
- m. 21: The piano score should have G-flat in the alto, not G-natural.

**Behold, the Tabernacle of God**

- mm. 2 - 3: The piano score should have ties for the soprano, tenor, and bass I notes.
- mm. 51 - 52: The soprano G in the piano score should be tied.

**Rise up, my Love, my Fair One**

- mm. 8 - 9: The alto should be tied in the piano score.
- mm. 12 - 13: The soprano should be slurred from F to D-flat.
- m. 13: The bass slur should end on E-flat, not F.
- m. 19: On the third quarter alto II should have B-flat, not C.
- m. 27: Soprano I should have a half-note, not a whole note.
8. O King, to Whom all Things do Live
(For Funerals)

Words from Liturgical Sources

Soprano  Alto  Tenor  Bass

Piano  (For rehearsal only)

HEALEY WILLAN

Copyright MCMXXXI by Carl Fischer Inc., New York
International Copyright Secured

Reproduced by permission of Carl Fischer, Inc.
souls of thy servants a place of rest

to the souls of thy servants a place of rest

freshment, the quiet of beauty

a-titude, and the glory, the glory

a-titude, and the glory, the glory, the glory
Shine up on them, O Lord, for endless ages with thy blessed ones, for thou art gracious.
Behold, the Tabernacle of God

Words from Antiphons of the Feast of Dedication

Slow (about \( \frac{3}{69} \))

**HEALEY WILLAN**

Soprano

Alto

Tenor

Bass

Piano

(For rehearsal only)

God is with men, and the Spirit of God

Copyright MCMXXXIV by Carl Fischer Inc., New York
International Copyright Secured

Reproduced by permission of Carl Fischer, Inc.
dwell-eth with-in you: for the temple of

God is holy, Which

of God is holy, Which

p. cres. poco a poco
temple are ye: for the love of

temple are ye: for the love of

temple are ye: for the love of

26627-6
O how dreadful is this

tivity. O how dreadful, how dreadful is this
tivity. O how dreadful, how dreadful is this
tivity. O how dreadful, how dreadful is this

tivity. O how dreadful is this

This is the house of God, and

This is the house of God, and

This is the house of God, and

This is the gate of heav'n.

This is the gate of heav'n.

This is the gate of heav'n.
5. Rise up, my Love, my Fair One

(Easter, or Feasts of Our Lady)

Song of Solomon 8

In free rhythm. \( \frac{3}{4} \) about 120

SOPRANO

ALTO

Rise up, my love, my fair one, and come away, for

Rise up, my love, my fair one, and come away, for

For rehearsal only

Copyright by Oxford University Press, New York, 1929  Printed in U.S.A.

Reproduced by permission of Oxford University Press.
the flowers appear upon the earth; the time of the singing of birds is come; 

Rise up, my love, my fair one - B
Rise up, my love, my fair one, and come away.

H.W. March 1929
Intermezzo

Andante sostenuto (d=ca.72)

HEALEY WILLAN

MANUALS

PEDAL

© Copyright MCMLIX BMI CANADA LIMITED, 16 Gould St., Toronto 2, Ontario
International Copyright Secured
All Rights Reserved Including Public Performance for Profit
Reproduced by permission of Berandel Music.
The Healey Willan Collection of the National Library of Canada is the main collection of documents relating to the composer. It includes original musical compositions in manuscript and published form, correspondence, programs, clippings, papers dealing with various activities in which Willan participated, drafts of speeches, lectures, etc., published articles, 46 unpublished biographical impressions of Willan written by friends and colleagues in 1960, diplomas, degrees, medals, and photographs. Included in this collection are the Parker Tapes, a series of interviews of Healey Willan conducted by the Rev. Dr. Max Parker between 1963 and 1965, and Willan's library of more than 350 published volumes of music.

The following list is selective, but an exhaustive bibliography may be found in the Healey Willan Catalogue.

**Bibliography**


Index of Works Cited

This index, intended to facilitate the location of references to particular compositions of Healey Willan, lists all works referred to in the text, and is ordered numerically in accordance with the plan of the Healey Willan Catalogue.

Dramatic Music

27 Transit Through Fire (1942), 11

29 Brebuf (1943), 11, 17, 19
  Ave Verum Corpus, 19-20
  Fugue in g minor, 17

30 Deirdre (originally Deirdre of the Sorrows) (1943-45), 11, 15, 78, 79, 154

Vocal Music with Instrumental Ensemble

56 O Lord, Our Governour (1952), 14, 95

57 Coronation Suite (1952), 14, 67, 71, 107
  Ring Out Ye Crystall Sphears, 67
  Intermezzo, 107, 108
  Come, Thou Beloved of Christ, 48, 71

Orchestra and Band Music

70 Symphony No. 1 in d minor (1936), 11

76 Pianoforte Concerto in c minor (1944), 11

Chamber Music

105 Fugue in g minor (1947), 17

Organ Music

144 Fantasia upon the Plainchant Melody "Ad coenam agni" (1906?), 10, 92, 93

145 Epilogue (1909), 82, 104
146 Prelude and Fugue in c minor (1909), 47, 77, 82
147 Prelude and Fugue in b minor (1909), 82
149 Introduction, Passacaglia and Fugue (1916), 8, 13, 154
155 Six Chorale Preludes, Set I (1950), 12
   1 Quem Pastores, 89
156 Six Chorale Preludes, Set II (1951), 12
   1 Nun preiset Alle, 82, 83, 107
   6 Vexilla Regis, 64
157 Five Preludes on Plainchant Melodies (1950)
   1 Aeternae Christi Munera, 98
   2 Christe, Redemptor omnium, 98, 104
   4 Ave maris stella, 64, 65, 104
   5 Urbs Hierusalem beata, 64, 80, 112, 135-136
158 Interlude for a Festival (1952), 107, 108
161 Three Pieces (1954)
   3 Festival, 84, 133, 134
168 Prologue on "Ascension" (1956), 69
173 Ten Hymn Preludes, Set II (1957)
   1 Wareham, 90
   5 This Endris Nyght, 68
   8 Bristol, 87
   9 Martyrdom, 84, 85
174 Ten Hymn Preludes, Set III (1958)
   3 Iste Confessor, 104
   4 Tunbridge, 87
   7 Christ ist Erstanden, 81
   8 A Rouen Church Melody, 87
   10 Nun lasst uns Gott dem Herren, 85, 86
177 Five Pieces for Organ (1957-1958), 60
   3 Intermezzo, 89, 137, 141, 152
   4 Scherzo, 60, 91
   5 Finale Jubilante, 106
178 Passacaglia and Fugue No. 2, in E minor (1959), 12, 13, 47, 80, 81, 154
179 Fugue in e minor (1959?), 14
180 36 Short Preludes and Postludes on Well-known Hymn Tunes, Set I
   7 Nicaea, 102
183 Two pieces for Organ (1961)
   1 Matins, 61, 91
   2 Evensong, 115

184 Andante, Fugue and Chorale (1965), 13, 98, 114, 118, 119, 130-131

Masses

216 Missa Brevis No. 1 in E-flat major (1928), 59
217 Missa Brevis No. 2 in f minor (1930), 116
219 Missa Brevis No. 4 in E major (1934), 58, 59
220 Missa Brevis No. 5 in f-sharp minor (1935), 59
222 Missa Brevis No. 7 in g minor "O Westron Wynde" (1936), 104

225 Missa Brevis No. 10 in c minor and major (1948), 109, 132-133

Canticles

251 Benedictus and Jubilate Deo (1953), 129

276 Magnificat and Nunc Dimittis, Tones II-2 and III-4 (1930), 110

Motets

302 The Dead (1917), 64
303-308 Six Motets (1924), 10, 76
305 Very Bread, Good Shepherd, Tend Us, 94, 105, 109
307 O How Sweet, O Lord, 76
308 Let Us Worship and Fall Down, 76
309 O Trinity, Most Blessed Light (1925), 69
310-320 Eleven Liturgical Motets (1928-1937), 10, 27, 48, 153
310 Preserve Us, O Lord (1928), 32
311 O King, All Glorious (1928), 37, 61, 113
312 I beheld her Beautiful as a Dove (1928), 33, 38, 39, 42, 49, 51, 134, 135, 153
313 Fair in Face (1928), 30, 33, 36, 46, 47, 73, 153
314 Rise up, my Love, my Fair One (1929), 37, 41, 43, 44, 52, 75, 89, 90, 137-141, 150, 153
315 O King of Glory (1929), 28, 31, 35, 36, 62, 63
316 Lo, In the Time Appointed (1929), 29
317 O King, to Whom all Things do Live (1931), 30, 32, 45, 120-122
318 Behold, the Tabernacle of God (1933), 27, 35, 38, 53, 54, 55, 110, 123-125
319 Hodie, Christus natus est (1935), 30, 31, 65, 71, 72, 96, 153
320 Who is She that Ascendeth? (1937), 27, 74
321 O Saving Victim (1935), 59
322 Look Down, O Lord (1935), 59
328 Ave Verum Corpus (1943), 19, 20
331 I Will Lay Me Down in Peace (1949), 103
335 Hosanna to the Son of David (1951), 96, 97
336 The Spirit of the Lord (1951), 65, 66, 110, 116, 117
Ring Out, Ye Crystall Sphears (1953), see 57

Anthems
341 All Hail, All Hail (1898), 6, 7
351 Sing Alleluia Forth in Duteous Praise (1940), 91
352 Christ Hath a Garden (1940), 91
355 Sing We Triumphant Songs (1950), 91, 99, 128
357 A Prayer of Rejoicing (1953), 99
358 O Lord, Our Governour (1952), 14, 95
Come, Thou Beloved of Christ (see 57)
359 Isaiah, Mighty Seer (1954), 99
363 O Sing Unto the Lord a New Song (1956), 128
364 Ye Shall Know that the Lord Will Come (1957), 128
373 God is Gone Up with a Shout (1960), 64
380 In the Heavenly Kingdom (1924), 128

Hymn-Anthems

385 Before the Ending of the Day (1938), 99
388 Lift Up Your Heads, Ye Mighty Gates (1950), 99
391 Christ, Whose Glory Fills the Skies (1950), 91
396 Father, We Praise Thee (1958), 95
404 St. Venatius (O Trinity of Blessed Light) (1961), 99
413 Lord of all Hopefulness (1966), 91

Carols

426 Regina coeli letare (1928), 64
427 Tyrle, Tyrlow, Tyrle, Tyrlow (1928), 64
428 Here Are We in Bethlehem (1929), 59, 73
432 A Soft Light From a Stable Door (1948), 73

Miscellaneous Sacred Music

584 An Apostrophe to the Heavenly Hosts (1921), 14, 58, 66, 128-129, 153
585 The Mystery of Bethlehem (1923), 70
593 Gloria Deo per immensa saecula (1950), 74, 76, 153

Secular Choral Music

635 Weep You No More Sad Fountains (1929), 72-74, 154
641 Eternity (1931), 67
656 On May Morning (1950), 97

Varia

772-775 Versets and Versicles, 20
772 Verset pour l'orgue (1957), 20
773 Versicle and Response, 20
774 Imprimatur nihil obstat (in C major), 20
775 Imprimatur nihil obstat (in c minor), 20