THE TOMB OF MARGARET OF BRABANT
BY GIOVANNI PISANO

by

PETER JOHN BLACKMAN
B.Sc., University of British Columbia, 1974

A THESIS SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF
THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF
MASTER OF ARTS

in

THE FACULTY OF GRADUATE STUDIES
(Department of Fine Arts)

We accept this thesis as conforming
to the required standard

THE UNIVERSITY OF BRITISH COLUMBIA
April, 1978

© Peter John Blackman, 1978
In presenting this thesis in partial fulfilment of the requirements for
an advanced degree at the University of British Columbia, I agree that
the Library shall make it freely available for reference and study.
I further agree that permission for extensive copying of this thesis
for scholarly purposes may be granted by the Head of my Department or
by his representatives. It is understood that copying or publication
of this thesis for financial gain shall not be allowed without my
written permission.

Department of FINE ARTS

The University of British Columbia
2075 Wesbrook Place
Vancouver, Canada
V6T 1W5

Date APRIL, 1978
ABSTRACT

Unique in its design, the tomb of Margaret of Brabant is one of the last works of sculpture produced by Giovanni Pisano. Executed between the years of 1312 and 1313, the monument represents the only extant essay, made by Giovanni Pisano, in the field of tomb sculpture. Originally erected in the church of San Francesco di Castelletto, Genoa, the tomb was partially destroyed between 1798 and 1810, along with the church. As it now survives, the tomb consists of six marble fragments; a group representing Margaret of Brabant with two attendants, a Madonna, a figure representing the virtue Justice, and the head from such a figure representing Temperance.

The fragments of the monument present problems of reconstruction and interpretation. Documentation of the tomb project is minimal and no contemporary descriptions of the original appearance are known. Although the Justice figure and the Temperance fragment correspond to the same elements in a group of four, mid-fourteenth century virtue figures which are likely to have been copied from the tomb's original complement, the fragments of the tomb, in and of themselves, do not provide a sufficient basis for reconstruction. Interpretation of the tomb has been hindered by its fragmented state, yet two major opinions have been published. Harald Keller has suggested that the tomb represents a Last Judgment scene. Margaret of Brabant is to be seen as rising from the grave at the call of the final
trumpets. Herbert von Einem, on the other hand, relates the rising figure of Margaret of Brabant to French examples in relief, of the Assumption of the Virgin and interprets the political significance of this association in the light of Dante's *Commedia*.

An attempt is made here to elucidate both the problems of reconstruction and interpretation offered by the tomb of Margaret of Brabant. By the study of related, contemporary tomb designs, particularly those of Arnolfo di Cambio and Tino di Camaino, the examination of the available documentation and description, a thesis for the reconstruction of the monument and a definition of the elaborate, multi-level, wall appended tomb type which it introduces is presented. By an examination of contemporary theology concerning the nature of the human soul and its fate, a thesis for the interpretation of the tomb as a unified programme illustrating the ascension of the soul of Margaret of Brabant, immediately after death, is expounded.

In conclusion, the position of the tomb of Margaret of Brabant in the contemporary tradition of funerary sculpture is analysed. Giovanni Pisano's contributions and innovations are seen to herald a significant change in the conception of tomb design of the period.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract  
Table of Contents  
List of Illustrations  

| CHAPTER I: | GIOVANNI PISANO, MARGARET OF BRABANT, AND HER TOMB | 1  |
| CHAPTER II: | RECONSTRUCTING THE TOMB OF MARGARET OF BRABANT | 16 |
| CHAPTER III: | INTERPRETING THE TOMB OF MARGARET OF BRABANT: AN HISTORICAL ANALYSIS | 41 |
| CHAPTER IV: | INTERPRETING THE TOMB OF MARGARET OF BRABANT: A NEW PERSPECTIVE | 50 |
| CHAPTER V: | CONCLUSION | 60 |

Notes  
Illustrations  
Bibliography  
Appendix  

Notes  
Illustrations  
Bibliography  
Appendix
LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS

1. GIOVANNI PISANO: Tomb of Margaret of Brabant, main group, Palazzo Bianco, Genoa. 79
2. GIOVANNI PISANO: Tomb of Margaret of Brabant, main group (detail), Palazzo Bianco, Genoa. 79
3. GIOVANNI PISANO: Tomb of Margaret of Brabant, Justice (front view), Palazzo Rosso, Genoa. 80
4. GIOVANNI PISANO: Tomb of Margaret of Brabant, Justice (rear view), Palazzo Rosso, Genoa. 80
5. GIOVANNI PISANO: Tomb of Margaret of Brabant, Madonna (front view), Palazzo Rosso, Genoa. 81
6. GIOVANNI PISANO: Tomb of Margaret of Brabant, Madonna (rear view), Palazzo Rosso, Genoa. 81
7. GIOVANNI PISANO: Tomb of Margaret of Brabant, Temperance (front view), Swiss private collection. 82
8. GIOVANNI PISANO: Tomb of Margaret of Brabant, Temperance (rear view), Swiss private collection. 82
9. GIOVANNI PISANO: Tomb of Margaret of Brabant, Temperance (detail), Swiss private collection. 82
10. Two angels holding a baldacchino, Palazzo Bianco, Genoa. 83
11. Justice, S. Maria Maddalena, Genoa. 84
12. Temperance, S. Maria Maddalena, Genoa. 84
13. Prudence, S. Maria Maddalena, Genoa. 84
14. Fortitude, S. Maria Maddalena, Genoa. 84
15. Death of Walram of Luxemburg. Codex Balduini Trevirensis, Staatsarchiv, Koblenz, 1 C No. 1, 14a. 85
16. Funeral of Margaret of Brabant. Codex Balduini Trevirensis, Staatsarchiv, Koblenz, 1 C No. 1, 17a. 85
17. Death of Henry VII. Codex Balduini Trevirensis, Staatsarchiv, Koblenz, 1 C No. 1, 35b. 86
18. Henry VII's body transferred to Pisa. Codex Balduini Trevirensis, Staatsarchiv, Koblenz, 1 C No. 1, 36a. 86
19. Funeral of Henry VII. Codex Balduini Trevirensis, Staatsarchiv, Koblenz, 1 C No. 1, 36b. 87
20. An idealised representation of Henry VII's tomb. Codex Balduini Trevirensis, Staatsarchiv, Koblenz, 1 C No. 1, 37. 87
21. Tomb of Cardinal Guglielmo Fieschi (d. 1256), S. Lorenzo fuori le mura, Rome. 88
22. Tomb of Luca Savelli, S. Maria in Aracoeli, Rome. 88
23. PIETRO DI ODERISIO: Tomb of Clement IV (d. 1268), S. Francesco, Viterbo. 89
24. PIETRO DI ODERISIO: Tomb of Clement IV (detail), S. Francesco, Viterbo. 89
25. ARNOLFO DI CAMBIO: Tomb of Adrian V (d. 1276), S. Francesco, Viterbo. 90
26. ARNOLFO DI CAMBIO: Tomb of Cardinal Riccardo Annibaldi della Molara (d. 1276), S. Giovanni in Laterano, Rome. 90
27. ARNOLFO DI CAMBIO: Tomb of Cardinal Guillaume de Braye (d. 1282), S. Domenico, Orvieto.
29. ARNOLFO DI CAMBIO: Tomb of Cardinal Guillaume de Braye (detail), S. Domenico, Orvieto.
30. Drawing of the tomb of Boniface VIII (d. 1303).
31. Tomb of Benedict XI (d. 1304), S. Domenico, Perugia.
32. Tomb of Benedict XI (detail), S. Domenico, Perugia.
33. Reconstruction by Valentiner of the tomb of Henry VII (d. 1313).
34. Reconstruction by Bauch of the tomb of Henry VII.
35. TINO DI CAMAINO: Tomb of Henry VII (detail of two counsellors), Camposanto, Pisa.
36. TINO DI CAMAINO: Tomb of Cardinal Riccardo Petroni (d. 1314), Cathedral, Siena.
39. Reconstruction by Valentiner of the tomb of Gastone della Torre (d. 1318).
40. Reconstruction by Valentiner of the tomb of Bishop Antonio degli Orsi (d. 1320 or 1321).
41. TINO DI CAMAINO: Tomb of Bishop Antonio degli Orsi (detail), Cathedral, Florence.
42. TINO DI CAMAINO: Tomb of Catherine of Austria (d. 1323), S. Lorenzo, Naples.
43. TINO DI CAMAINO: Tomb of Mary of Hungary (d. 1323), S. Maria Donna Regina, Naples.
44. TINO DI CAMAINO: Tomb of Mary of Hungary (detail), S. Maria Donna Regina, Naples.
45. TINO DI CAMAINO: Tomb of Charles of Calabria (d. 1328), S. Chiara, Naples.
46. TINO DI CAMAINO: Tomb of Marie of Valois (d. 1331), S. Chiara, Naples.
47. GIOVANNI AND PACIO DA FIRENZE: Tomb of Robert of Anjou, S. Chiara, Naples.
48. GIOVANNI DI BALDUCCIO: Tomb of Guarnerio degli Antelminelli, S. Francesco, Sarzana.
49. NINO PISANO: Tomb of Archbishop Simone Saltarelli (d. 1342), S. Caterina, Pisa.
50. Tomb of Archbishop Juan de Aragon (d. 1334), Cathedral, Tarragona.
51. Tomb of Archbishop Juan de Aragon (detail), Cathedral, Tarragona.
52. Tomb of Cardinal Luca Fieschi (d. 1343), S. Lorenzo, Genoa.
53. DOMENICO PIAGGIO: Transcription of the epitaph of the tomb of Margaret of Brabant.
54. Shrine of Beato Bertrando (d. 1350), Baptistery, Cathedral, Orvieto.
55. GIOVANNI DI BALDUCCIO: Shrine of Saint Peter Martyr, Portinari Chapel, S. Eustorgio, Milan.
56. GIOVANNI DI BALDUCCIO: Shrine of Saint Peter Martyr (detail), Portinari Chapel, S. Eustorgio, Milan.

57. Reconstruction by Torriti of the tomb of Margaret of Brabant.

58. Reconstruction of the tomb of Margaret of Brabant.

59. Tomb of the Bardi family, S. Croce, Florence.

60. Tomb slab of Presbyter Bruno (d. 1194), Cathedral, Hildesheim.

61. Tomb slab of Saint Reinheldis, Church, Reisenbeck.

62. Death and transfiguration of Abbot Lambert (d. 1125), Municipal Library, Boulogne, MS. 46, fol. 1 V.

63. GIOVANNI DI BALDUCCI AND ASSISTANTS: Tomb of Azzone Visconti, S. Gottardo, Milan.

64. Drawing of the tomb of Abbot Pierre de Dijon (d. 1132), Abbey of Saint-Bégnine, Dijon. Collection Roger de Gaignières.


67. Drawing of the tomb of Bishop Ancoul de Pierrefonds of Soissons (d. 1158), Abbey, Longpont. Collection Roger de Gaignières.

68. Drawing of the tomb of Bishop Gosselin de Vierzy of Soissons (d. 1152), Abbey, Longpont. Collection Roger de Gaignières.

69. Detail of the Porte Romane, Cathedral, Chartres.

70. Awakening of the Virgin (detail of west portal), Cathedral, Senlis.
CHAPTER I

GIOVANNI PISANO, MARGARET OF BRABANT,
AND HER TOMB

The Trecento tradition of figural tomb sculpture has its origins in the last decades of the thirteenth century. Its roots can be traced to Gothic France. In the hands of Arnolfo di Cambio and his Roman followers, and in the later tombs of Tino di Camaino, this nascent tradition develops rapidly. Concerned with the clarification of programmatic stages in funerary iconography, architecture plays an important role in the early tombs. Centred on the personal salvation of the deceased and his recorded image, these funerary monuments are remarkable documents of their period.

Coming less than fifty years after the re-birth of figural tomb sculpture in Italy, Giovanni Pisano's tomb for Margaret of Brabant (d. 1311) represents an important step in the evolution and adaptation of French Gothic sepulchral forms in Italy. The tomb places Giovanni Pisano -- together with his father, Nicola, his fellow pupil, Arnolfo di Cambio, and his own follower, Tino di Camaino -- among the primogenitors of the Italian Renaissance tomb. Each makes noteworthy contributions to the figural tomb tradition. Nicola Pisano's design for the Arca of Saint Dominic, S. Domenico, Bologna, as reconstructed by Pope-Hennessy, in its original form included a sarcophagus, decorated with scenes from the life of the saint,
supported by archangels, cardinal virtues, and acolytes. The caryatid supports and the narrative sarcophagus are two highly innovative features. Arnolfo di Cambio, in his tombs of Cardinal Riccardo Annibaldi (d. 1276), S. Giovanni in Laterano, Rome (Fig. 26), Pope Adrian V (d. 1276), S. Francesco, Viterbo (Fig. 25), Cardinal Guillaume de Braye (d. 1282), S. Domenico, Orvieto (Fig. 27), and Pope Boniface VIII (d. 1303), Old St. Peter's (surviving fragments in the Grotte Vaticane), adapts and transforms traditional elements of French tomb sculpture, laying the basis for a new Italian tradition. Tino di Camaino, in his Neapolitan tombs, expands upon the motifs introduced by his predecessors, creating an efflorescence of design possibilities in the second quarter of the fourteenth century.

Vasari, in Le vite de'piu eccelenti pittori, scultori ed architettori, gives Giovanni Pisano a considerable tomb oeuvre. While Vasari does not mention the tomb of Margaret of Brabant, three additional tombs are discussed in the Giovanni Pisano Vita. Of the first, that of Pope Urban IV, Vasari writes,

"Essendo dunque morto in Perugia papa Urbano IV, fu mandato per Giovanni, il quale andato là fece la sepoltura di quel pontefice di marmo; la quale, insieme con quella di papa Martino IV, fu poi gettata per terra quando i Perugini aggrandirono il loro vescovado, di modo che se ne veggiono solamente alcune reliquie sparse per la chiesa."
enlarged their Vescovado, in a way that only a few remains are seen dispersed in the church.)

Scholarly opinion sees Vasari's mention as a confused reference to the tomb of Martin IV (d. 1285) having been executed by Giovanni Pisano rather than to the tomb of Urban IV (d. 1264). As nothing of these tombs survives, it is impossible to judge the accuracy of Vasari's statement, but it is nevertheless noteworthy that Vasari attributes Giovanni Pisano with an important papal tomb at what would be a relatively early point in his career.

Vasari credits Giovanni Pisano with another tomb, that of Benedict IX:

"Essendo, poi, morto in Perugia papa Benedetto IX, fu mandato per Giovanni, il quale andato a Perugia fece nella chiesa vecchia di San Domenico de' Frati Predicatori una sepoltura di marmo per quel pontefice; il quale ritratto di naturale e in abito pontificio pose intorno sopra la cassa con due Angeli, uno da ciascun lato, che tengono una cortina; e di sopra una Nostra Donna con due Santi di rilievo che la mettono in mezzo; e molti altri ornamenti intorno a quella sepoltura intagliata."  

(Having, then, died in Perugia Pope Benedict IX, Giovanni was sent for, who was to make in Perugia in the old church of San Domenico de' Frati Predicatori a tomb of marble for that pontiff; the effigy of whom is taken from nature and in pontifical habit is placed on the sarcophagus with two angels, one on each side, that hold a curtain; and a Madonna with two saints with her in the middle; and many other ornaments carved around the tomb.)

Again the specific reference is unlikely. It is probable that Vasari is referring here not to the tomb of Benedict IX, who
dies in 1044, but to the tomb of Benedict XI (d. 1304). The tomb of Benedict XI still stands in S. Domenico, Perugia (Fig. 31), and seems to belong to a later moment in Trecento sculpture.10

A third Giovanni Pisano tomb is described by Vasari:

"Parimente, nella chiesa nuova de'detti Fratti Predicatori fece il sepolcro di messer Niccolò Guidalotti perugino e vescovo di Recanati, il quale fu institutore della Sapienza nuova di Perugia."

(Similarly, in the new church of the Friars Preachers he made the tomb of M. Niccolò Guidalotti of Perugia and Bishop of Recanati, who instituted the new University of Perugia.)

Supino identifies the tomb as that of Benedetto Guidalotti and dates it to the thirteenth century.12

The Vasari Vita, while incorrect in its specific tomb attributions, helps us to see Giovanni Pisano's work on the Margaret of Brabant tomb in a broader context, suggesting that by the time of this project, coming late in the sculptor's life, Giovanni Pisano had already established himself as an important tomb sculptor, and quite possibly as a sculptor whose work included an important papal tomb design.

The tomb of Margaret of Brabant, executed between 1312 and 1313, is one of the last works of Giovanni Pisano.13 It survives in fragments preserved in the Palazzo Bianco and the Palazzo Rosso of Genoa, and in a Swiss private collection. The commission for the tomb comes shortly after the completion of
the pulpit for Pisa Cathedral in 1311. After this, his last pulpit, the sculptor produces three works: the Madonna di Arrigo (1312-1313),\(^{14}\) the tomb of Margaret of Brabant (1312-1313), and the Madonna della Cintola (after 1312).\(^{15}\) The tomb is the masterpiece of Giovanni Pisano's last years, and perhaps his final, large programmatic sculptural undertaking.

The significance of the tomb involves not only its artistic importance but also the historical position of its occupant, Margaret of Brabant. Daughter of the Duke of Brabant, Margaret's marriage to Henry IV, Count of Luxemburg in 1292 united the warring houses of Luxemburg and Brabant.\(^{16}\) From the beginning, Margaret of Brabant's association with Henry IV of Luxemburg appears to have had important political implications. Margaret's intercession in Henry's activities, on the few occasions that these are recorded apparently served to moderate his policy. She was known as a "merciful and mild queen," whose actions elicited widespread praise.\(^{17}\)

Henry IV's political career appears to have been uneventful until, having greatness thrust upon him, he was elected Henry VII, King of the Romans and emperor-elect.\(^{18}\) Margaret of Brabant was present at the coronation ceremonies in Aachen on January 6, 1309. Almost immediately, Henry VII began the preparations for a triumphal voyage to be crowned Holy Roman Emperor in Rome. With hopes of uniting Italy under imperial rule, the emperor-elect embarked upon his journey, accompanied by his queen, in December, 1310.
The arrival of the royal court in Italy was taken by
some as the presage of a new age.

"Behold, now is the acceptable time, wherein
arise the signs of consolation and peace....
Rejoice, O Italy, though now to be pitied even
by the Saracens, for soon you will be envied
throughtout the world, because your bridegroom,
the solace of the world and the glory of your
people, the most clement Henry, Divine and
Augustus and Caesar, hastens to the nuptials." 19

So Dante hailed the arrival of Henry VII.

Margaret's sojourn in Italy was to be short lived. She
travelled with Henry VII to Milan, where another coronation
took place on January 6, 1311. She died of the plague in Genoa
later that same year, on December 14, and was buried in a lead
coffin in the church of San Francesco di Castelletto to await
proper entombment. 20 Henry VII moved on to Rome. It was there,
on June 29, 1312, that he was finally crowned emperor by the
pope's legates. Henry's quest for the unification of Italy
proved to be a hazardous and impossible task. Slowly the papal
sanction for his activities in Italy was withdrawn. Robert of
Anjou, King of Sicily, and a strong opponent of an empire under
Henry VII, worked efficiently to undermine Henry's efforts. It
was on August 24, 1313, while besieging Siena, that Henry VII
succombed to malarial fever and died.

Nothing is known of the original commission for the
tomb of Margaret of Brabant or the details of its construction.
The only document pertaining to work on the tomb is dated one
day after the death of the emperor. It records the payment to Giovanni Pisano by Giovanni da Bagnara, archbishop of Genoa, at the request of Henry VII, on August 25, 1313, of eighty-one golden florins. The sum is partial quittance for the cost of the monument. The sculptor signs in receipt of payment, designating himself the sculptor of Queen Margaret’s sepulchre:

"...intalliatov operis sepulcri...domine Margarite..."

Other circumstances of the commission are open to conjecture. Leaving Genoa on February 16, 1312, Henry VII arrived in Pisa on March 6, 1312. It is possible that between this date and April 23, 1312, when Henry left Pisa, that the commission for the monument was awarded to Giovanni Pisano. Work presumably began on the monument shortly thereafter. Possibly moved by boat from Pisa to Genoa, the tomb may have been erected at some time in 1313. As Giovanni Pisano is recorded in Genoa in August, 1313, it seems likely that he then supervised the completion of the tomb. How ever the dating is manipulated, it is certain that the tomb was complete by the March of 1314, for Giovanni Pisano is documented in Siena at that time. The tomb remained in San Francesco di Castelletto until its destruction in the years following 1798.

From the destruction of the church of San Francesco di Castelletto until 1960, the only piece known to survive from the tomb of Margaret of Brabant was a half-figure of a woman being raised up by two auxiliary figures (Fig. 1). The central figure
and her assistant to the right are connected by a bridge of marble at the base of the figures. The auxiliary figure to the left is now completely freestanding. This latter figure has arms severed in the mid-forearm. It leans forward, its legs carefully counterpoised. The vestiges of its left hand are apparent on the right shoulder of the rising woman. This lady, horizontally terminated at a line between her right hip and left thigh, leans towards the left. Her head turns upwards. Her eyes are open. The nose and lips are slightly damaged. Her right arm is missing -- severed at the shoulder -- but her left arm, held in the hands of the assistant on the right is intact to the wrist (a repair beneath her shoulder is apparent). The assistant to the right again leans forward towards the central figure, holding her arm closely against its chest. The lower portion of the figure is damaged but extends beneath the level of the horizontal plane of the base of the woman. All figures are draped. The assistants wear loosely fitting habits, drawn in at the waist and elbow. A cowl is visible on the assistant to the right. The woman wears a shawl. Two bands are crossed over her chest. She wears a wimple. The veil over her head is drilled through on both sides of her neck. She is crowned. All the figures are carved in the round with equal detail on all sides. The auxiliary figure on the left measures 66 cm. in height, that on the right, 74 cm. The central figure is 67 cm. in height. The provenance of this group, now in the Palazzo Bianco, Genoa, is traceable. It seems likely that these fragments were purchased by the secretary of the Brignole-Sale
family, Antonio Rosso, in 1804. They thus moved from their endangered location in the church of San Francesco di Castelletto into the Brignole-Sale collection. It was in the Villa Brignole-Sale, in Voltri, that the figures were identified as remnants of the tomb of Margaret of Brabant in 1874. Then owned by the Duchessa di Galleria (née Brignole-Sale), the pieces were connected by Santo Varni to the newly discovered document of August 25, 1313, published by Federico Alizeri. The fragments passed into the Accademia di Belle Arti and thence to the Palazzo Bianco (the civic museum of Genoa).

Additional fragments of the tomb have come to light since 1960. A figure of Justice — identified as such by the sword and scroll which the figure holds and the balance emblazoned on the chest — was discovered by Caterina Marcenaro in a deserted Genoese garden (Figs. 3 and 4). This figure is freestanding, leaning with the upper part of the body to the right. The head is thrust forward, the neck is extended as the face turns to the left. The lips are slightly open. The figure is clothed in a flowing robe and carries a sword in the right hand and a scroll with the inscription *DILECISTI IUSTITIAM ODISTI INIQUITATEM* (Love Justice — Despise Iniquity) from Psalm 44 of the Vulgate. The head is mantled in the same fashion as the figure of the rising woman. Her head is also crowned and although much damaged this ornament appears to have been more elaborately pinnacled than the simple band worn by the other figure. Once broken from the rest of the body, the head has
been restored. From the carving, there is no indication that the figure was associated with any other sculptural or architectural form. Although the figure is much damaged and worn, the details on all sides are seen to be executed with equal care. The figure stands 103 cm. in height. The provenance of the piece, now in the Palazzo Rosso, Genoa, is unknown.

Another draped figure was identified by Marcenaro in the Galleria di Sant'Agostino as a remnant of the Margaret of Brabant tomb, in 1963 (Figs. 5 and 6). This figure had been orally attributed to Giovanni Pisano by W.R. Valentiner, in 1939, to the Direzione Belle Arti. The close affinities that this headless figure exhibits with Madonna and Child figures by Giovanni Pisano, such as the Madonna della Cintola, indicate that this piece represents a Madonna -- the Child having been lost. The figure is freestanding. The back is concave as the figure leans out to the right. The drapery is gathered into the right hand. The left arm is missing from the elbow down. Once again the detail on all sides of the figure is executed with equal care. Without its head, the figure stands 47.5 cm. in height. The original height may be estimated to have been 54 cm. The Madonna, also in the Palazzo Rosso, is known to have been moved from Sampierdarena into the Galleria di Sant'Agostino, Genoa, at an unrecorded date. Its earlier provenance is unknown. It was moved, after Marcenaro's identification of the figure, into the Palazzo Rosso with the Justice figure.
The head of a female was identified by Seidel with the tomb of Margaret of Brabant in 1968. (Figs. 7 and 8). From the remaining section of neck, it is apparent that the head was originally slightly lowered and turned to the left. The eyes look downwards. The surface of the face is roughened in a vertical line running through the lips and chin (Fig. 9). The back and top of the head are smoothly finished. The fragment is 15.5 cm. high. This piece, on the art market in 1942, is now in a Swiss private collection. No earlier provenance is known.

Two additional figures, each holding the remains of a baldacchino, were also connected with the monument for Margaret of Brabant. (Fig. 10). These pieces of unknown earlier provenance, were given by Santo Varni to the Palazzo Bianco museum. Their association with the monument may be seriously questioned. The quality of their execution is in no way comparable to that of the other fragments of the tomb and an attribution to Giovanni Pisano is unacceptable. All the pieces connected with the tomb are Carrara marble.

That the fragments, with the exception of the baldacchino angels, are the work of Giovanni Pisano has never been questioned. The style of the fragments is entirely consistent with the production of Giovanni Pisano's late years. There is a certain gravity, and grace, and calm in these pieces that associates them with the Madonna della Cintola, the Madonna di Arrigo, and the Paduan Madonna for Enrico Scrovegni (c. 1305-6), of Giovanni Pisano's later years. Whether this may be seen, as Ayrton has
suggested, as the product of a final release of energy in the last, Pisa pulpit or as a result of the disparate nature of the late works in relation to his earlier pulpits and prophet figures is unknown. Nevertheless, the tranquility and calm which invade Giovanni Pisano's last works marks a change in the sculptor's style from which the Genoan fragments may not be disassociated.

Additional information concerning the tomb is provided by a group of statues on the facade of S. Maria Maddalena, Genoa, which represent a Madonna and Child with four virtue figures, Justice, Temperance, Prudence and Fortitude (Figs. 11, 12, 13, 14). The close resemblance between the Justice and head fragment by Giovanni Pisano with the Justice and the head of the Temperance figure of the S. Maria Maddalena group suggest that the latter are deliberate copies. Toesca connects the virtues at S. Maria Maddalena with a tomb project by a follower of Giovanni Pisano and Marcenaro suggests that they may be dated to c.1350. It may be suggested that the tomb of Margaret of Brabant had four virtue figures which served as the models for a later tomb project by a follower of Giovanni Pisano. The S. Maria Maddalena copies also suggest that the specific fragments now associated with the tomb of Margaret of Brabant were in fact in Genoa in the mid-fourteenth century.

Since Santo Varni's original association of the Palazzo Bianco fragments with the tomb of Margaret of Brabant only one rejection of this claim has been published. Portigliotti (cf.,
Appendix, entry 21), denying that the fragments belong to the
tomb of Margaret of Brabant, links the image of the rising woman
to the Resurrection of the Virgin: and suggests that this was
in fact the original meaning of Giovanni Pisano's work. Grosso
has indicated that the portrait-naturalism of the Genoese figure
bears no resemblance to Giovanni Pisano's idealised Madonna
figures and rejects Portigliotti's thesis.

Accepting the pieces as fragments of a tomb by Giovanni
Pisano, it may be questioned that this tomb was the tomb of
Margaret of Brabant. However, the almost complete absence of
tombs for females in Italy at this time mitigates strongly against
there being two such Genoese monuments, one un-recorded, by
Giovanni Pisano. This aspect of the tomb is noteworthy. The
paucity of tombs designed for women, in Italy, is due, in all
probability, to the political situation at the time. It is
only in Naples at the court of the Angevin kings of Sicily,
that appreciable numbers of tombs for women were commissioned.
Those of the queens Catherine of Austria (d. 1323, Fig. 42),
Mary of Hungary (d. 1323, Fig. 43), and Marie of Valois (d.
1331, Fig. 46), all by Tino di Camaino, attest to the political
and dynastic importance of their occupants. In Northern Italy,
the city-states were not conducive to the development of polit­
cical power by women and their dynastic importance was not great.
In Northern Europe, on the other hand, there existed a long
tradition of monarchic rule. Tombs designed for women are there
not uncommon. We may cite the famous tombs of Eleanor of
Aquitaine (d. 1204) in the Abbey Church of Fontevrault, and the tomb of Duchess Mathilda in Brunswick Cathedral as examples of a large number of such monuments. Thus, the death of Margaret of Brabant, in Genoa, afforded the rare opportunity for the construction of a female tomb in Northern Italy, and was the occasion -- as will be argued in this thesis -- for a new approach to the depiction of the occupant of the tomb.

The reasons for the choice of Genoa as the site for Margaret of Brabant's monument are also relevant to the discussion. Henry VII had, upon his arrival in Genoa, attempted to restore order among its Guelph and Ghibelline factions. He had extracted an oath of fealty from the city. When he left, in February 1312, although the protection of imperial rights in the north was left to his troops and the Ghibelline signori of Genoa, Henry VII's supremacy in these regions was by no means secure. It seems likely that Henry VII availed himself of the opportunity to maintain the imperial presence in Genoa, at least in memory, with tomb of his queen. The burial of his brother, Walram, in Verona at the request of the Scaliger vicars, may adduce a similar interpretation. The extant Codex Balduini Trevirensis (Staatsarchiv, Koblenz, 1 C No. 1) is an illuminated manuscript which depicts the journey of Henry VII to Italy. It was designed under the direction of Baldwin of Luxemburg, archbishop of Trier and Henry VII's brother. The manuscript appears to take special care in its depiction of the deaths and burials of Henry VII, Walram of Luxemburg, and Margaret of
Brabant (Figs. 15 - 20). That the burials of these members of the imperial family, on Italian soil, should receive careful attention -- recording the lingering presence and perhaps the imperial right to the land -- is interesting and serves to stress the importance of the commission of the tomb of Margaret of Brabant.

That the commission of the tomb of Margaret of Brabant was awarded to Giovanni Pisano attests to the reputation of the sculptor. At the age of about sixty, Giovanni Pisano had a long and illustrious career behind him and his fame must have been widespread. The choice of Giovanni Pisano suggests the importance placed by Henry VII on the work, and the extant fragments indicate that this was a production of quality. It is the aim of this thesis to demonstrate that the programme of the tomb of Margaret of Brabant also represents an important re-interpretation and development of current trends in sepulchral iconography, making it a key monument in the tradition of tomb design in Italy.

The disjecta membra of the tomb of Margaret of Brabant pose problems both of reconstruction and interpretation. With the gradual accumulation and identification of fragments associated with the tomb, new solutions to these problems have been formulated. Accordingly, it is only in recent years that a fuller understanding of this important monument has become possible.
CHAPTER II

RECONSTRUCTING THE TOMB

OF MARGARET OF BRABANT

The original appearance of the tomb of Margaret of Brabant is unknown. The fragments which can be associated with the tomb, while insufficient in number for a full physical reconstruction, do provide information about the form of the tomb. The work of Arnolfo di Cambio and Tino di Camaino -- the traditions before and the developments after -- assist in an understanding of the contribution made by Giovanni Pisano in the monument of Margaret of Brabant. The fragments themselves, the Trecento tomb tradition, and descriptions of the tomb of Margaret of Brabant known from the fifteenth through the late eighteenth century, form the basis upon which a reconstruction can be made.

The tradition of figural tomb sculpture into which Giovanni Pisano's tomb of Margaret of Brabant may be placed has origins in the last decades of the thirteenth century. Prior to this little interest appears to have been shown in tomb designs which recorded, in effigy, the likeness of the deceased or in any other figural representation. In a Rome dominated by the school of the Cosmati, it is indicative of the absence of a sculptural tradition and attendant technique that the only tombs in which figural representation occurs are those in which antique sarcophagi are re-used. The tombs of Cardinal Guglielmo Fieschi (d. 1256), S. Lorenzo fuori le mura, Rome (Fig. 21), and Luca
Savelli, S. Maria in Aracoeli, Rome (Fig. 22), are eminent examples. In both, a Christian gloss is provided by additional elements. In the Fieschi tomb the sarcophagus, of the third century A.D., bears the representation of a wedding scene and attendant sacrifice with a panel containing the symbolism of apotheosis.\(^{45}\) Above, appears a mosaic panel depicting the cardinal's soul being presented by saints to an enthroned Christ.\(^{46}\) This depiction of the deceased as a sponsored donor figure is indicative of an interest in the representation of scenes illustrating personal salvation. And although the mosaic is arranged in an idealised and hierarchical fashion, an attempt is made to record the image of Cardinal Fieschi. In the Savelli monument, a small seated Madonna and Child is placed in the upper register of the tomb.\(^{47}\)

Both the concern for personal reference and architectural completeness characterise the early tombs in which the figural tradition in Italy was set. Deriving sustenance from French and Spanish examples, this Italian tradition developed at the time of Arnolfo di Cambio.\(^{48}\) Initially of interest is the tomb of Clement IV (d. 1268), S. Francesco, Viterbo, by Pietro di Oderisio (Fig. 23).\(^{49}\) In this monument the classical ciborium which surrounds the Fieschi tomb is replaced by a Gothic canopy -- an element to be used extensively in later Italian tombs. Of more importance, however, is the representation of the deceased as a reclining effigy. The face of the dead pope is carefully and powerfully rendered (Fig. 24). An attempt has been made
to capture the likeness of the deceased. The eyes are closed, the flesh sags downward -- the pope is dead. This is a precocious example of many such depictions of the deceased in effigy; an immediate successor being the tomb of Adrián V (d. 1276), S. Francesco, Viterbo (Fig. 25). A development towards architectural unity, and portrait-likeness in the effigy is again strongly marked.

An important addition to the programmes of these early tombs occurred with Arnolfo di Cambio's tombs for Cardinal Riccardo Annibaldi della Molara (d. 1276), S. Giovanni in Laterano, Rome (Fig. 26), and Cardinal Guillaume de Braye (d. 1282), S. Domenico, Orvieto (Fig. 27). In these tombs, incorporated with the effigy of the deceased -- itself of long lineage in France -- are the elements of the French tombeaux de grande cérémonie, developed at the close of the twelfth century. In France, these tombs are characterised by their use of the effigy attended by clergy performing funeral rites, acolytes, and sometimes mourners. To this action related to the corpse of the deceased there are included images of Christ, and the soul of the deceased being lifted to heaven. In Italy, Arnolfo di Cambio adapted these elements to Italian taste. Julian Gardner in his discussion of the now fragmented monument of Cardinal Annibaldi indicates the probable form of the tomb in its original state. The tomb would seem to have been originally set in a wall niche. The effigy of the cardinal, reclining upon his sarcophagus, was surrounded by a curtained enclosure to the rear of which ran a
frieze of clerics. The six figures represented on this extant fragment hold objects associated with the office of the dead. Above and behind the effigy appeared a relief depicting the Madonna and Child. In the de Braye tomb the effigy of the deceased is again enclosed in a curtained compartment. In this case, two angels or deacons hold the drapery in such a way that the effigy of the cardinal may be seen. Above, a saint presents a kneeling figure of the cardinal's soul to the Madonna and Child, flanked by S. Dominic. Two headless, censing angels also survive from the original monument but their disposition is not clear. In the effigies associated with both tombs may be seen a development of the portrait image. But of striking importance is the manner in which Arnolfo di Cambio adapts the French ceremony tomb and its depiction of the drama of death to these monuments. The interest in personal salvation that we noted in earlier monuments is much in evidence. In the de Braye tomb -- closer to its original form than the Annibaldi monument -- the use, in France, of images of the human soul being lifted to heaven, such as that of Abbot Arnoult (?) recorded by Gaignières (Fig. 66), is replaced by the kneeling, sponsored donor figure that we have met in the Fieschi tomb in mosaic. In the French tradition, the image of the rising soul indicates the reception of the soul of the deceased into heaven. In the de Braye tomb the same intention underlies the iconography. The passing of life is represented below by the effigy of the cardinal in his curtained recess, while above -- and here in its isolation of the
components of the programme, the architecture plays a key role -- the figure of the cardinal's soul, presented to the Madonna and Child, may be taken to represent the personal salvation of Cardinal de Braye. Thus, this tomb by Arnolfo di Cambio introduces into the Italian tomb tradition a distinct emphasis upon the dramatic depiction of salvation enhanced by a controlled and discriminating use of architectural setting.

The interest in making personal salvation visually explicit appears to have motivated the decoration of the now lost tomb chapel of Nicholas III (d. 1280), in Old St. Peter's, Rome. The chapel contained an effigy of the pope and behind the altar, a painting of Nicholas III being drawn upwards by Saint Nicholas with Saint Francis -- the *vis a tergo* -- pushing from behind. This is known from a description of the tomb in the *Chronicon de Lanercost*:

"...supra altare capellae suae dipingi faceret sanctum Nicholauum se ad superiora ducentem et sanctum Franciscum a tergo impellentem."  

Although unprecedented in Italian art, this image in its depiction of Nicholas III being led to heaven after death, is compatible with the tradition we have traced. In this chapel the drama of death with its explicit personal references and the use of an architectural setting -- in this case the funerary chapel, the first of its kind in Italy -- all conform with basic propositions of, for example, the tomb of Cardinal de Braye.

Arnolfo di Cambio's last tomb design, that for Boniface
VIII (d. 1303), in Old St. Peter's, Rome (Fig. 30), took up the use of the funerary chapel introduced by Nicholas III. It was originally set into the rear wall of the chapel of Saint Boniface. Above the altar, the monument was recessed within a niche. The effigy lay in a curtained enclosure with angels in attendance at the head and feet. In this arrangement Arnolfo changed the design of the Annibaldi tomb in two ways. In that earlier monument there were deacons, rather than angels, placed behind the effigy. Also, the drapery of the effigy is here treated as though it belongs to a reclining figure. In the Annibaldi, de Braye, and other earlier tombs this had not been the case -- the drapery being treated as though the figure were standing. Above the effigy was a mosaic panel showing the souls of Boniface IV and Boniface VIII being presented to a Madonna and Child by Saints Peter and Paul.

In the tomb of Benedict XI (d. 1304), in S. Domenico, Perugia (Fig. 31), the three-dimensional representation of the deceased's soul as a kneeling donor figure is revived. As has been noted in the first chapter, this tomb was described by Vasari and attributed to Giovanni Pisano but is now thought to be the work of a Sienese master. Vasari's description of the tomb includes those elements which form the basis of Arnolfo di Cambio's innovations in tomb design: the portrait-naturalism of the effigy, "...il quale ritratto di naturale..."; angels standing to reveal the effigy in a curtained recess, "...due
Angeli, uno da ciascun lato..."; and a Madonna and saints, "...una Nostra Donna con due Santi..." The Madonna and saints stand in a tabernacle and the whole is set within a Gothic canopy. Gardner writes that this tomb, "...probably conveys the best impression of the original form of Arnolfo's de Braye tomb." With the accession of Clement V, in 1305, and the subsequent removal of the papal court and its patronage to Avignon, Rome declined as a centre of innovative tomb sculptural activity. Other centres of Italy began, at this time, to make important contributions in tomb design. The dissemination of Arnolfo di Cambio's ideas through Italy seems to have been rapid. In the work of Tino di Camaino, Nino Pisano, and Giovanni di Balduccio the motifs of Arnolfo di Cambio and the tombs of the late thirteenth century are expanded and presented in new combinations. The number of secular tombs from this period increases and a great divergence in tomb design is observed.

One of the first important non-ecclesiastical commissions of the fourteenth century, the tomb of Henry VII (d. 1313), was awarded to Tino di Camaino. Begun in 1315, the tomb is known only in a fragmented state. From the remains of the tomb it is apparent that figural sculpture played a greater role here than encountered before. Henry VII was represented twice in the programme; below as an effigy, reclining on his sarcophagus, and above seated in majesty with four standing figures representing his counsellors (Figs. 33 and 34). This double
representation of the deceased is entirely different from the previous depictions of the effigy with a sponsored donor figure, and new to Italy at the time. Images of such seated figures are recorded in France, and it is tempting to associate the iconography, as we did with the female tomb tradition, with the power of monarchical rule. It is significant that the next appearance of this form of double representation is in Naples, at the court of the Angevin kings. In the tradition of developing portrait-naturalism that we have traced this tomb must stand as a landmark. It is clear that not only are the features of Henry VII sculpted with an aim to capturing the likeness of the emperor, but those of his counsellors are also treated with individuality (Fig. 35).

Ecclesiastical patronage did not completely disappear and seems to have been responsible, in fact, for the dispersal of the lately developed Roman Gothic tomb style, north, into Tuscany. An early example of this influence is Tino di Camaino's tomb for Cardinal Riccardo Petroni (d. Genoa, 1314), in the Cathedral of Siena (Fig. 36). This tomb falls into a category of tomb architecture quite distinct from the Roman tomb type. The tomb is set up from the ground and appended to the wall, supported by four consoles. On a broad base is positioned the sarcophagus upheld by four figures which bear the sarcophagus on their shoulders. The sarcophagus is decorated with three relief panels; a Noli Me Tangere, the Resurrection of Christ, and Saint Thomas Inspecting the Wounds of Christ. On the top
of the sarcophagus, beneath a tent-like baldacchino held open, originally by four figures, reclines the effigy of Cardinal Petroni. Above this, in a tripartite tabernacle, is set a Madonna and Child with two saints. The use of the effigy, baldacchino, and the tabernacle above are traditional elements. In its other aspects the tomb is revolutionary. Unlike the tombs of Arnolfo di Cambio, the emphasis of the tomb is upon the figural rather than the architectural aspect of the monument. It is only in the tabernacle at the summit that architecture plays any significant role at all. The appearance of the Resurrection of Christ in the tomb programme would also appear to be unprecedented in Italy. Gardner cites this iconography as being demonstrative of northern influence in the design — the image being employed by German stained-glass workers in the apse of San Francesco at Assisi. With the use of the Resurrection scene the Petroni monument depicts personal salvation through Christ rather than the previously explicit individual references seen in the tombs of Arnolfo di Cambio. The use of caryatid figures beneath the sarcophagus is also unusual, being the first extant example of their use other than in the shrines of saints. The idea itself probably has a direct lineage from Nicola Pisano's innovative design for the Arca of Saint Dominic, in Bologna, finished in 1267. There eight supports depicting archangels, acolytes and virtues originally held aloft the sarcophagus of the saint. The first secular use of these supportive elements may have occurred in late thirteenth century
Naples. Four caryatid virtues, now in the Louvre, are identified as late thirteenth century works (Figs. 37 and 38). Valentiner further suggests that they are the work of a follower of Nicola Pisano and tentatively associates them with the destroyed tomb of Charles Martel (d. 1295), S. Lorenzo, Naples. These four virtues, Justice, Fortitude, Prudence, and Temperance, may have supported a sarcophagus in much the same way as the figures by Tino di Camaino, that support the tomb of Cardinal Petroni. The sarcophagus at Bologna is decorated with relief scenes of the life of Saint Dominic and Tino di Camaino's use of relief scenes probably draws its inspiration from that work by Nicola Pisano.

Tino di Camaino's next tomb, that of Gastone della Torre (d. 1318), for S. Croce, Florence (Fig. 39), was again supported high on the wall by means of consoles. The iconography of Christ's Resurrection is utilised once more on the sarcophagus face. As in the Petroni monument, the effigy of the deceased reclines inside a baldacchino held open by angels. Above is set a Madonna and Child. Of more interest, because of its clear break from the traditions of tomb iconography of the time, is the tomb of Bishop Antonio degli Orsi (d. 1320-1), Cathedral, Florence (Fig. 40), by Tino di Camaino. Again, the tomb is known only in a fragmented state. The tomb consists of a seated figure of the bishop represented in death upon his sarcophagus (Fig. 41). The latter is decorated with a relief showing the Virgin presenting the bishop to Christ. Originally, a group
of the Madonna and Child with two flanking saints, one of which presented a kneeling figure of the bishop's soul, were part of the programme. The sarcophagus was supported by three caryatid figures and two angels holding open a baldacchino are also identified with the tomb. The whole structure originally rested on an arcaded support decorated with allegorical reliefs. As in the Henry VII and Petroni monuments, great emphasis is placed upon the figural sculpture of the tomb. In his portrayal of Bishop Antonio degli Orsi, seated in majesty, Tino di Camaino has broken with traditional representations. In addition, the bishop is represented thrice in the tomb programme and this number without the inclusion of a reclining effigy which may have once been a part of the tomb programme.

As a group, the Henry VII, Petroni, and degli Orsi monuments, may be taken to represent the versatility of tomb iconography at the beginning of the fourteenth century. These tombs are marked by their dependance on figural sculpture and the freedom and variety with which the effigies of the deceased are handled. We see in these tombs a developing tendency to create different levels of representation in the tomb programme -- in Valentiner's reconstruction of the degli Orsi monument (Fig. 40) five distinct levels are apparent. In his relief carvings, Tino di Camaino introduces new iconography -- the Resurrection of Christ, the scene of intercession on the the degli Orsi sarcophagus, and the allegorical scenes beneath.
In 1323 or 1324, Tino di Camaino went to Naples, where he designed tombs for the Angevin court: Catherine of Austria (d. 1323), S. Lorenzo (Fig. 42); Mary of Hungary (d. 1323), S. Maria Donna Regina (Fig. 43); Charles of Calabria (d. 1328), S. Chiara (Fig. 45); and Marie of Valois (d. 1331), S. Chiara (Fig. 46). Notable in all these monuments is Tino di Camaino's use of virtue figures as caryatids to support the sarcophagus of the deceased. This tradition, as we have seen, may be traced back to Nicola Pisano. In the tomb of Catherine of Austria, the figures of Hope and Charity support the sarcophagus on which four freestanding figures of saints surround the effigy. In a lunette is shown in relief the supplicant figure of Catherine of Austria's soul being presented to Christ. In the tomb of Mary of Hungary, the four Cardinal Virtues, as angels, are ranged in front of the supports of the sarcophagus. Above, the effigy is enclosed in a baldacchino held open by two angels. Above this, the supplicant soul of Mary of Hungary and a model of the church of S. Maria Donna Regina are presented by two angels to a seated Madonna and Child. In the tomb of Charles of Calabria, and possibly in that of Marie of Valois, the complement of angel-virtues is increased to include the three Theological as well as the four Cardinal Virtues -- all of which stand on leonine plinths. In these last two tombs a frieze of mourners and clerics -- as in the Annibaldi tomb -- is ranged behind the recumbent effigy of the deceased which may indicate a Roman contact in Tino's work. Above these, the now typical scene of
the supplicant soul is seen. The last tombs of Tino di Camaino in Naples show a marked increase in the architectural quality of their programmes. All are surrounded by substantial Gothic canopies and all are rigidly divided into ascending horizontal levels, each with its own decorative and symbolic scheme. The success that this architectural design could achieve is perhaps nowhere better illustrated than in the tomb of Robert of Anjou by Giovanni and Pacio da Firenze, S. Chiara, Naples (Fig. 47), the design of which owes much to the developments made by Tino di Camaino. In this tomb, of about 1345, the horizontal divisions of the monument are carefully modulated to achieve a compelling vertical movement of the eye from the lowest registers to the image of Christ in Majesty above.

From the architectural complexity of Tino di Camaino and his successors we turn to another pupil of Giovanni Pisano, Giovanni di Balduccio. His work on the tomb of Guarnerio degli Antelminelli, S. Francesco, Sarzana (Fig. 48), in comparison with the work of Tino di Camaino in Naples is both simple and unassuming. Again, the tomb is supported above ground level, appended to the wall on consoles. The architectural surrounding of the monument is minimal. The sarcophagus of the boy is mounted on two lions (symbolic of resurrection and fortitude). The effigy reclines as in bed asleep beneath a canopy held by two angels. Above in a tabernacle stands the Madonna and Child.

Another tomb of importance in the traditions we have
traced is that of Archbishop Simone Saltarelli (d. 1342), S. Caterina, Pisa (Fig. 49), by Nino Pisano. Resting at ground level, the sarcophagus is decorated with relief scenes of the life of the archbishop. Above this, in an arcaded enclosure reclines the effigy of the deceased. Two angels draw back curtains from the front of this enclosure. Above in a tripartite tabernacle is placed a Madonna and Child with two adoring figures. Between this tabernacle and the enclosure below appears an image of Saltarelli's soul -- a small nude figure -- being escorted to heaven by angels. The relief serves here to re-emphasise the interest in personal salvation and the drama of death that has run through the tomb designs of this period. In the Saltarelli tomb, the horizontal layering of the monument is used with an expertise born of the previous tradition. Here the stepwise ascent of Simone Saltarelli, from life to death, through ascension to heaven, is clearly and elegantly expressed in the four layers of the tomb. Nino Pisano's use of the nude, ascending soul is a retrospective use of French examples of the rising of the soul and a conscious rejection of the kneeling supplicant soul figures that we have described as a largely Italian iconography. It is interesting to note that a link between these types of representation is provided by the remote tomb, by an Italian craftsman, of Archbishop Juan de Aragón (d. 1334), set into a niche of the Cathedral, Tarragona (Figs. 50 and 51). In this tomb the sarcophagus of the deceased, resting on lions, is surrounded on one side by figures. Above, the soul of the
archbishop, in this case fully clothed and kneeling in supplication is borne towards Christ by two angels. Clearly a compromise between the nude ascending soul and the kneeling supplicant soul is intended.

Returning to Genoa, we note the tomb of Cardinal Luca Fieschi (d. 1343), S. Lorenzo (Fig. 52), by a pupil of Giovanni Pisano. Not now in its original location and much fragmented the tomb's original appearance is unknown. However, from what remains, it is clear that the sarcophagus, decorated with a scene showing the inspection of the wounds of Christ by the twelve apostles, rested upon four lions. The reclining effigy of the deceased upon the sarcophagus was also enclosed by a baldacchino held open by two angels, examples of which are legion elsewhere.

These then are the important tombs which shaped the tradition of figural tomb sculpture from the mid-thirteenth century to the mid-fourteenth century, in Italy. Giovanni Pisano's tomb of Margaret of Brabant, in its original form, must be analysed in the light of this tradition with reference to its key monuments. Attempered with descriptions of the tomb prior to 1798, and information gleaned from the fragments themselves, an estimate of that original form may be made.

Historical descriptions, before the destruction of the church of S. Francesco di Castelletto in the years following 1798, are available. These serve to indicate the original location and provided some information concerning the original
form of the tomb of Margaret of Brabant. None of this material develops in detail the appearance of the monument. It is apparent from the context in which the monument is cited, in each work, that the historical importance of Henry VII, Margaret of Brabant, and the fact that she was buried in Genoa, were of prime consideration. Descriptions of the tomb are provided as adjuncts to these considerations and are accordingly general in character.

The first known reference to the tomb of Margaret of Brabant, after the document of 1313, is provided by the Libro degli anniversarii del Conventu di San Francesco di Castelletto. This records the Processio in die mortuorum in which the first oration was spoken before the tomb of Margaret of Brabant. Stating that this procession would travel from the choir of the church along the right hand side of the nave, Marcenaro interprets the reference, datable to shortly after 1321, to indicate that the tomb was originally placed in the choir of the church to the right of the high altar. This is supported by Cristoforum Cipricum in 1460, who writes that Margaret of Brabant,

"...in Capella Maiori a parte leva sepulcro marmoreo fuit sepulta..." (Appendix, entry 1)

(was entombed in a marble sepulchre in the raised part of the main chapel).

In 1537, Agostino Giustiniani saw the tomb,

"...in la capella maggiore in una sepultura di marmo della parte sinistra, secondo che ella haveva ordinato." (Appendix, entry 3)
(in the main chapel in a marble sepulchre on the left side as she had ordained.)

The last time that the tomb is recorded to have been seen in the main chapel was in 1610. Giulio Pasqua writes that the tomb was,

"dentro la chiesa dalla banda dritta dell' altar grande." (Appendix, entry 4)

...(inside the church on the right side of the high altar).

Marcenaro explains the variance in the descriptions with regard to the side on which the tomb appeared to be the result of different points of view. Giulio Pasqua, a layman, would have looked from the nave into choir, seeing the tomb on the right. Monsignor Agostino Giustiniani, Bishop of Nebio, would have looked from the choir into the nave, seeing the tomb on his left.

Between the date of the Pasqua reference and the next, in 1641, the tomb may have been relocated. Agostino Schiaffino writes,

"...la sua arca si vede ancora in presente a fronte dell'organo ornato di statue di marmo." (Appendix, entry 5)

...(her tomb is still seen at present facing the organ, decorated with marble statues).

In addition, Schiaffino's attention was drawn to the inscription of the tomb which he read as,

MARGARITA HENRICI VII ROMANORUM UXOR OBIIT JANUE ANNO DOMINI MCCI (sic). (Appendix, entry 6)
An anonymous chronicler of the eighteenth century, probably enriching upon Giustiniani's report but also locating the tomb differently, writes that Margaret of Brabant,

"...desiderosa partecipare de meriti di questi Santi religiosi Ordino nel suo testamento d'esser internata nella loro Chiesa, dove sopra la Capella di S. Francesco in un suntuoso mausoleo fù tumulata." (Appendix, entry 7)

(eager to participate in the merits of these holy brothers ordained in her testament to be interred in their church, where above the chapel of S. Francesco in a sumptuous mausoleum she was entombed).

Of more importance than the previous brief descriptions of the tomb is the *Monumenta Genuensia* of Domenico Piaggio. This work, concerned primarily with tomb epitaphs, contains a sketch of the inscription of the Margaret of Brabant monument (Fig. 53). Piaggio only briefly treats of the actual sculpture of the monument with the words,

"Depositum cum statua decumbente dictae Imperatricis." (Appendix, entry 12)

Several aspects of this document are noteworthy. In the drawing of the epitaph a semi-circular band is used for the inscription. This is shown beneath the coat-of-arms, and above the epitaph of Bishop Leonardo Fornario. 78

The basic issues which present themselves for solution in any attempt to reconstruct the original form of the tomb of Margaret of Brabant are as follows: (1), the nature of the tomb in relation to the structure of the church of San Francesco di Castelletto; (2), the nature of the architectural structure of
the tomb itself; and (3), the nature and disposition of the original sculpture of the tomb. The first consideration relates to the structure of the tomb as a whole, be it freestanding, constructed against a wall, recessed into a niche, or projecting high up from the wall above ground level. All of these formal arrangements have been met before.

The freestanding monument, the least common of the four, is best represented by Nicola Pisano's Arca of Saint Dominic (fin. 1267), in S. Domenico, Bologna. The shrine of Saint Luke, S. Giustina, Padova, is an early example of the same form in the fourteenth century. The use of the arrangement into the mid-fourteenth century is demonstrated by the shrine of the Beato Bertrando (d. 1350), in the Baptistery of Orvieto Cathedral (Fig. 54), and those of Saint Peter Martyr (1335-1339, Fig. 55), and Saint Augustine (c.1350-60), both by Giovanni di Balduccio in S. Eustorgio, Milan, and San Pietro in Ciel d'Oro, Pavia, respectively. Although the form is admirably suited to shrines for the veneration of saintly relics, this was not its sole use. This is evinced by the tomb of Rizzardo di Camino (d. 1335), S. Giustina, Vittorio Veneto, and the Scaliger monuments of Verona. Taking into account the descriptions of the tomb, prior to 1798, and the paucity of this type of monument, doubt is cast upon its being utilised in the tomb of Margaret of Brabant. The early descriptions of the tomb place it on the side of the main chapel of the church. In this location a wall tomb would be more appropriate, for functional reasons, than a freestanding
monument. Evidence also suggests that the freestanding tomb was reserved primarily for the relics of saints for which a central and readily accessible monument is most suitable. Accordingly, there are no known freestanding tombs by either Nicola Pisano, Arnolfo di Cambio, Tino di Camaino, or Giovanni di Balduccio for non-sanctified occupants.

The tradition of the large scale figural tomb as it develops in Italy in the course of the fourteenth century appears to go in various directions. In Rome, and those areas under the influence of Roman developments, a tomb design emphasising the architectural component of the programme developed. Such tombs as those of Clement IV (Fig. 23), Adrian V (Fig. 25), Cardinal de Braye (Fig. 28), and Benedict XI (Fig. 31), are examples of this trend. Figural sculpture is confined and the programme of the drama is controlled by the architecture in these monuments. Gothic canopies surround the tombs, making them monumental and self-sufficient.

In Tuscany, and to the north, a tomb type develops in the early fourteenth century that I want to call the elaborate, multi-level, wall appended tomb. This form is best illustrated by the tombs of Cardinal Riccardo Petroni (Fig. 36), Gastone della Torre (Fig. 39), Bishop Orso (Fig. 41), and initially as will be argued below, the tomb of Margaret of Brabant. In these tombs, figural sculpture rather than architecture is emphasised. Elaborate iconographical schemes are introduced and formulated. In these tombs the sculpture is allocated to many distinct levels in the
programme. Furthermore, the tombs are not self-sufficient monuments but rather are appended to the wall, raised from the ground on consoles.

The two traditions appear to be fused by Tino di Camaino in his Naples tombs. As has been suggested, some of Tino's designs in Naples reflect Roman traditions and seem to indicate that Tino, perhaps on his way to Naples, became aware of the Roman developments. In the Neapolitan tombs of Mary of Hungary (Fig. 43), Charles of Calabria (Fig. 45), and Marie of Valois (Fig. 46), and later in the tomb of Robert of Anjou (Fig. 47) by Giovanni and Pacio da Firenze, the union of the two traditions is expressed in the combination of highly sculptural iconography with rigorous architectural structure.

An analysis of two tombs, close in date, from the disparate Roman and northern traditions clarifies the distinction between the two forms. The tomb of Benedict XI (d. 1304), as constructed for S. Stefano del Castellare c.1320, represents the Roman type (Fig. 31). The tomb of Cardinal Riccardo Petroni (d. 1314), constructed in 1318, represents the elaborate, multi-level, wall appended tomb type (Fig. 36). The Benedict XI tomb is constructed against the wall, while the Petroni monument is raised up on the wall. In the Benedict XI tomb the architectural component of the tomb is emphasised. This submission of the figural sculpture to the architecture of the tomb is alien to the tomb of Cardinal Riccardo Petroni. Figural sculpture abounds in the latter monument. Caryatids are introduced. The decorative
panels of the Benedict XI tomb are replaced with relief scenes. The use of Arnolfo di Cambio's curtained effigy chamber seen in the Benedict XI tomb, is developed into a tent-like canopy held open by four instead of two figures. The tomb also makes use of a greater number of horizontal levels, each with its own sculptural iconography. The gradual diminishing of the size of these levels gives a vertical accent to the tomb -- that the tomb is placed above ground level and raised up enhances this emphasis. This aspect of ascension through various levels of the tomb is absent from the Benedict XI monument. In this respect the Tino di Camaino tomb may be seen to bear fruit in Nino Pisano's tomb for Simone Saltarelli, S. Caterina, Pisa (Fig. 49). There the levels of the tomb and the vertical axis of the monument clearly delineate the pilgrimage of Saltarelli's soul from earth to heaven. The interest in the sequential drama of death evident in the northern, Tuscan development stems, of course, from the trends seen in Arnolfo di Cambio's tomb for Cardinal de Braye (Fig. 28). It is an enrichment of the Roman tradition -- may we call it there a two act drama -- into a multi-level narration of progress through death into heaven. With the gradual inclusion of virtue figures, for which the tomb of Margaret of Brabant was a vanguard, and the addition of scenes of earthly activity, this programme develops further to include the 'life' of the deceased in the narrative.

It is logical to consider the tomb of Margaret of Brabant as a forerunner of the northern tomb tradition and thus of the
elaborate, multi-level, wall appended type. This is consistent with the known facts about the tomb and suggests that the innovative iconography of the tomb (as will be discussed below) was a part of an equally innovative structural design. Although Giovanni Pisano has been shown to be aware of certain Roman developments, it is more reasonable to believe that Tino di Camaino's innovations follow those made by his master.  

It is apparent, initially, that the tomb of Margaret of Brabant had relatively considerable figural sculpture; four free-standing virtues, a figure of Margaret of Brabant -- for so the central figure must I think be interpreted -- assisted by two figures, and a Madonna and Child. It should be noted that only the Madonna and Child is a traditional element. Even if other traditional forms, such as baldacchino holding angels or a reclining effigy were once a part of the tomb, the emphasis upon figural sculpture and its innovative quality place the monument closer in spirit to Tino di Camaino than to the Benedict XI tomb. The disposition of the sculpture within the programme of the tomb of Margaret of Brabant must also have had affinity with the multi-level aspect of the tomb of Cardinal Riccardo Petroni. The original placement of the Madonna and Child at the apex of the tomb, in all possibility in a Gothic tabernacle, would seem most probable and quite traditional. Below the Madonna and Child, being escorted upwards towards them, must have been the figure of Margaret of Brabant. The three-quarter figure is cut off by a horizontal plane from her left thigh to the upper right
hip. This strongly indicates that the slanted figure rested on a flat surface beneath it. The position of the assistant to the right of the main group is firmly fixed by his arm and a marble bridge to the central figure. The appearance of this bridge and the unfinished appearance of the feet of the assistant may indicate that these elements were not originally intended to be visible from the ground. In addition, the base of this assistant is terminated below the base of the central figure, placing a limit to the size of the structure upon which Margaret of Brabant's figure rested. The position of the assistant to the right is not as rigidly prescribed. The orientation of this main group strongly suggests that the central figure is being lifted from a container beneath her. That this container may have been her sarcophagus is a reasonable conclusion. It is possible, however, that this group was located above a reclining effigy on the sarcophagus of Margaret of Brabant, in an intermediate level between the effigy in death, and heaven, represented by the Madonna and Child. The presence of a reclining effigy in the original tomb programme is highly problematic. Because of the pervasive tradition for the inclusion of such an element in northern European and Italian tomb programmes, the absence of a reclining effigy would be extremely unusual. The presence of a reclining effigy would introduce another level into the tomb programme which has been seen to be a concern apparent in the tomb of Cardinal Petroni.

The utilisation of freestanding virtue figures must also have influenced Tino di Camaino's tomb for Cardinal Petroni.
It is likely that the four virtue figures, Justice, Temperance, Prudence, and Fortitude, the latter two with attributes resembling the same figures in the S. Maria Maddalena group, acted as caryatid-like figures beneath the sarcophagus of Margaret of Brabant. Because there is no evidence that the extant Justice figure ever supported another structure, it is possible that the figures stood in front of four piers which actually supported the sarcophagus. This arrangement is seen in Giovanni di Balduccio's shrine for Saint Peter Martyr (Fig. 56). A reconstruction of the tomb of Margaret of Brabant based upon these ideas is given here (Fig. 58).

It should be noted that an alternate arrangement has been suggested. A reconstruction by Pope-Hennessy places the virtue figures as guardians around the recumbent effigy of Margaret of Brabant, with the rising figure in a lunette above. In this connection it is interesting to consider the tomb of Juan de Aragón (Fig. 50) in which various saints are arrayed behind the effigy of the deceased. The use of the figures as quasi-supports beneath the sarcophagus is much more consistent with Giovanni Pisano's use of such figures in his pulpits, however, and also conforms to the meaning of the tomb programme as a whole as is discussed below.
CHAPTER III

INTERPRETING THE TOMB OF MARGARET OF BRABANT:

AN HISTORICAL ANALYSIS

Major problems of interpretation are posed by the tomb of Margaret of Brabant. The representation of the effigy of the deceased, lifted dramatically upwards by two attendants, is unprecedented in Italian tomb sculpture. While sources of this iconography have been suggested, the meaning of this main group of the tomb remains partially obscure. The boldness and "parachronistic" qualities of the group have been indicated but the essential significance of the programme remains unclear.

The history of the interpretation of the tomb of Margaret of Brabant is varied. The first fragments to avail themselves for interpretation were the three figures of the enigmatic main group -- the rising figure and its two assistants. The early reports by Alizeri and Varni (Appendix, entries 14 and 16), concerning the rediscovery of these pieces and their documentation deal briefly and descriptively with the fragments. The central figure of the group is described as illustrating Margaret of Brabant in the act of being lifted from her tomb. Only the appearance of Milanesi's interpretation that conceived of Margaret of Brabant as being lowered into her tomb by monk-like figures changed this descriptive analysis (Appendix, entry 17). This interpretation was repeated by Scott, in 1886. The two figures of the main group were interpreted as monks or deacons, until
the publication, in 1906, of Venturi's *Storia dell'arte italiana* (Appendix, entry 19), in which these figures are described as angels. Santo Varni's initial impression that these two figures were angels had been erased, for him, with the observation that the figures had no wings (nor indeed had they apparently ever possessed such appendages, be they marble or bronze). Varni also observed that one of the figures bore a cowl on his back. It was Venturi who appears, first, to have accepted the two assistants as angels without question.

Venturi may be accredited with the first interpretive appraisal of the tomb, writing,

"...il corpo, ma richiamato a vita sorgere, assistito e soretto dagli angioli alla beatitudine e all gloria." (Appendix, entry 19)

(The body, recalled to life, rises, assisted and supported by the angels to beatitude and glory.)

Suggesting that Margaret of Brabant's body is being resurrected -- recalled -- to be taken to heaven.

Harald Keller, in his book *Giovanni Pisano*, 1942, also favours the interpretation that the main group of the Margaret of Brabant tomb is an attempt to demonstrate the resurrection of the queen. Keller also recognises the unique nature of Giovanni Pisano's conception. He writes,

"Giovanni allein hat es gewagt, die Tote als Auferstehende darzustellen. Als der Schall der Posaunen des Gerichtstags an ihr Ohr dringt, erhebt, sich die Herrscherin vom Totenbett,"
wo sie im Leichengewand gelegen hatte, mit kreuzförmig gebundenen breiten Bändern umwickelt. Zwei Engel sind beschäftigt, ihr aufzuheilen, aber die Königin sieht über die himmlischen Boten hinweg, ihr ahnungsvoller Blick sucht den Weltenrichter." (Appendix, entry 27)

(Giovanni alone has attempted to depict the dead as a resurrected being. When the sound of the trumpets reaches her ear on the day of judgment, even the sovereign arises from her deathbed, where she lay in her tomb garments, with wide ribbons tied around her in the shape of a cross. Two angels are busy to help her arise, but the queen looks beyond the heavenly messengers, her look of anticipation searches for the judge of the world.)

Keller's conjecture is footnoted with a reference to a fresco above the tomb of a gentleman of the Bardi family (c. 1340), in the Bardi di Vernio Chapel, S. Croce, Florence (Fig. 59). Taken as a whole this tomb presents a clear statement of a belief in the future resurrection of the body. The dead Christ that appears on the sarcophagus in conjunction with the living Pantocrator in the fresco is a Christian statement of such a credo -- just as Christ was resurrected, so shall we all. The fresco illustrates the Last Judgment and is clearly divided into two zones -- one on either side of Christ. That this gentleman of the Bardi family had expectations of beatitude is evinced by his placement on the right hand side of Christ. Keller's identification of the theme of the Margaret of Brabant tomb with that of the gentleman of the Bardi family suggests that Margaret of Brabant is rising from her tomb, her body and soul re-united on the Last Day, to face her final judgment.
In 1954, S'Jacob found the meaning of the tomb to be unexpected. She writes that,

"contrary to the prevailing notions about the resurrection of the dead, the shrouded body of Margaretha of Luxembourg (Brabant) rises from her bed of state, assisted by two angels." (Appendix, entry 29)

S'Jacob accepts Keller's interpretation of the theme of the Margaret of Brabant tomb but interjects that Margaret of Brabant must be seen to be rising from her bed of state. This interpretation takes into account the form of contemporary tomb in which an effigy of the deceased is seen to be lying on such a bed. S'Jacob is the first to relate the figure of Margaret of Brabant to the usually reclining effigy figures of the day -- the implication being that this effigy has been activated -- to use a term later employed by Panofsky -- in its resurrection.

Panofsky, in lectures delivered in 1956, followed Keller's interpretation of the tomb.

"And in one memorable case -- so boldly para-chronistic it foreshadows the Baroque rather than the High Renaissance -- the body of the deceased itself (Margaret of Brabant) is assisted to 'rise from the dead' as if in anticipation of the Last Judgment." (Appendix, entry 40)

The major interpretation and the only thorough analysis of the tomb has been provided by Einem, in 1961 (Appendix, entry 35). Questioning the veracity of Keller's interpretation, Einem associates the conception of the tomb with monuments in which the soul of the deceased is borne to heaven. Notable among Einem's examples are the tomb slab of Presbyter Bruno (d. 1194),
Cathedral, Hildesheim (Fig. 60), and the tombstone of Archbishop Engelbert II, Cathedral, Bonn, dated to the last quarter of the fourteenth century. That these depict the soul of the deceased, rather than his resurrected body, being assisted upwards by two angels is attested by the double representation of the deceased. The body, in effigy, is shown at the same time as the soul represented by a small, naked form. Einem also cites certain French and Swiss examples of relief representations of the Resurrection of the Virgin in which the Virgin is seen to be rising from her tomb with angelic assistance. For Einem, this theme is applicable to the tomb of Margaret of Brabant. He interprets the raising of Margaret of Brabant to heaven as a representation, in *imitatio*, of the Assumption of the Virgin. A nearly contemporary description of this assumption is provided by the *Legenda Aurea*, of Jacobus de Voragine. Of interest here are the words of Christ when He comes to take the soul of the Virgin Mary,

"Come my chosen and I shall set thee in my seat, for I have coveted the beauty of thee."  

Three days later, the Lord returns to the body of the Virgin,

"And anon the soul came again to the body of Mary, and issued gloriously out of the tomb, and thus was received in the heavenly chamber, and a great company of angels with her."  

Thus, the body and the soul of the Virgin were assumed to Christ's side in heaven, upon His throne. An analogous situation is found, by Einem, in Dante's description of the throne awaiting Henry VII in heaven.
"In that great chair whereon you fix your eyes,
Moved by the crown already placed above it,
Ere yet yourself will share this mystical feast
Shall sit the soul -- on earth imperial --
Of lofty Henry, who shall come to guide
An Italy as yet unfit for him." (Paradise, XXX:133-138)

In Einem's view, Henry VII, in imitatio Christi, may be seen to await the assumption of Margaret of Brabant, in imitatio Virginis. 95

After the discovery of the Madonna and Justice figures, additional interpretation of the tomb was provided by Seidel, in 1968, on the occasion of his publication of the identification of the head of Temperance (Appendix, entry 42). Concerning himself with the meaning of the virtue figures, Seidel found the significance of the original application of the finger to the lips by the Temperance figure to be an attribute of Mansuetudo. Mansuetudo being that virtue which bridle's men's tongues and prevents them from offending with their speech. 96 Seidel takes as his reference James, 3:13,

"Let him show out of a good conversation his works with meekness of wisdom."

Of the position of the virtues in the tomb programme as a whole, Seidel concludes,

"...die Tugenden gleichsam di irdischen Stufen bilden, die zur Verklärung der Margarethe emporführen. Die Offenbarung erfüllt die 'Iustitia' mit Schrecken; die 'Temperantia' ist, obgleich von einer sanften Stille umgeben, noch im Nachdenken befangen. Erst die auferstehende Königin erfährt die Vision als eine beseligende und befreiende Kraft." 97
(The virtues form, as it were, the steps on earth which lead up to the transfiguration of Margaret. The revelation is fulfilled by Justice with fright; Temperance is deep in thought. It is only when the queen rises from the dead that she experiences the vision as a blissful and liberating force.)

Thus, developing upon Einem's interpretation of the tomb, Seidel gives the virtue figures a transcendent function in the monument's programme -- as the "steps" from which Margaret is assumed to heaven.

Gian Lorenzo Mellini, in 1970, interpreted the main group of the tomb with reference to a medieval iconographical tradition of long standing. He writes of the monument:

"L'origine del racconto e tuttavia medioevale, deriva infatti dall'iconografia...della disputa tra l'angelo e il diavolo per l'anima del defunto, da cui alla lontana vengono le due enigmatiche figurine fuori scala e perciò non realistiche, ma semplici geni, tra i quali la defunta, non più animula, ma concreta e levitante salma corporea, si libra con lento ritmo helicoidale, scartando l'uno e volgandosi all'altro, che si piega a guardarla nel volto, come per riconoscerla, e ad esso sorride."

(Appendix, entry 45)

(The origin of the story is, however, medieval, it derives from the iconography of the dispute between the angel and the devil for the soul of the deceased, for which from afar come the two, out of scale, enigmatic figures, not real but simple genii, between which the deceased, no longer a little soul, but a real and rising corporeal body, liberates herself with slow helical rhythm, rejecting one and turning herself to the other, that bends to look her in the face as in recognition, and to smile at him.)

We will have occasion to return to this interpretation.
It is evident from the preceding account that interpretations of the tomb have changed significantly since the time of the discovery of the first fragments to the present. Yet, one aspect of the commentaries has remained constant; all interpretations of the tomb, with the exception of Portigliotti's (see Appendix, entry 21), accept the central figure of the main group as a representation of Margaret of Brabant at some time after the moment of her death. It has been the exact identification of that moment that has caused the controversy. That the figure of Margaret of Brabant, for so the figure must be identified, is rising upwards seems evident -- Milanesi's interpretation is laid to rest by the face of the figure, whose expression belies that she is being entombed. Taking up a suggestion made by Venturi, Keller developed the first identification of the 'moment' depicted in the monument. His thesis, that Margaret of Brabant is being resurrected at the Last Judgment, would seem quite attractive. The presence of a Madonna and Child would be unsuited to such a programme. One would expect in this case that a representation of Christ Pantocrator -- as in the Bardi tomb, but now lost -- would have been an integral part of the tomb. S'Jacob, in her relation of the figure of Margaret of Brabant to the reclining effigy, introduces a concept that is highly poetic. Giovanni Pisano may be seen to have breathed life into the formerly static effigy form.

The importance of Einem's interpretive analysis of the main group cannot be underestimated. However, two points may be
criticised. Einem's association of the image of Margaret of Brabant rising to heaven and the poetry of Dante is highly questionable. Dante cannot have written the lines describing Henry VII's lofty seat prior to Henry's death on August 24, 1313. Giovanni Pisano had, on August 25, 1313, received the partial payment for his work on the tomb, at which time it is probable that the tomb was complete. It is unreasonable, therefore, to expect Giovanni Pisano to have anticipated in his work both the death of the emperor and Dante's subsequent verses. And while, as has been seen, the analogy drawn between the figure of Margaret of Brabant and her assistants and the Assumption of the Virgin is acceptable visually, the parallels are rather dubious from a theological point of view. This latter criticism serves to indicate a lacuna in the interpretations so far.

As yet, the theological and philosophical implications of the image of Margaret of Brabant have received little attention. These aspects of the tomb would seem to be of prime importance to a full understanding of the monument. The significance of contemporary attitudes towards death, the soul, and the afterlife, in any interpretation of the tomb has been neglected. A neglect that ignores rich sources of information that ultimately give a new meaning to this impressive and unique monument. It would seem, therefore, imperative to investigate the theological and philosophical environment in which the monument was designed if an informed interpretation of the tomb of Margaret of Brabant is to be formulated.
CHAPTER IV

INTERPRETING THE TOMB OF MARGARET OF BRABANT:

A NEW PERSPECTIVE

The thirteenth century, the time of Giovanni Pisano's birth, was a period of great theological and philosophical controversy. The introduction into Europe of Averroes' commentaries upon Aristotle, in the 1230's acted as a catalyst in much of the reformulation of Christian thought occurring during these years. The attitudes of such Christian men as Saint Bonaventure, Saint Thomas Aquinas, and Siger of Brabant towards the metaphysics and moral and natural philosophy of the pagan Aristotle and his commentators reflect the changes of the age. As the theology of Augustine met the philosophy of Aristotle not least in the thoughts of those who interpreted the ways of God to man was the nature and disposition of the human soul.

Investigation of the qualities of the human soul was touched by the drive for clarity instilled by the scholasticism of the age. By the close of the thirteenth and the beginning of the fourteenth century, the nature of the human soul and its post-mortem existence had received careful scrutiny by the theologians and philosophers alike. It is to these studies and the critical years of their formulation, between 1260 and 1280, that we turn in order to better understand the tomb of Margaret of Brabant.
During the latter half of the thirteenth century, much of the systematic codification of the Christian concepts of the human soul had been written in defense of its very existence. Critical in this situation had been the development, in the mid 1260's, in Paris, of a school of Radical or Heterodox Aristotelians, known also as Latin Averroists. These scholars, led by Siger of Brabant, affirmed Averroes' doctrine of monopsychism which denied the immortality of the individual human soul. In Averroes' philosophy, the individual human possesses a passive intellect -- the imagination. This being entirely corporeal, it perishes in articulo mortis. The passive intellect is activated by the agent intellect which is eternal and singular for all mankind. Above the agent intellect is ranged a hierarchy of intelligences which derive from the Prime Mover. Thus, individual and personal salvation was denied. By extension, individual responsibility and the rewards of the after-life were also rejected. Siger of Brabant's acceptance of this thesis was, of course, in direct conflict with many of the major tenets of Christian faith and elicited strong objections.

Specific attacks upon Siger of Brabant's position began, in 1267, with Bonaventure's *Collationes de decem praeceptis*. In this, the Seraphic Doctor called attention to three errors made by Averroes: (1), that the world is eternal; (2), that there is only one intellect for all mankind; and (3), that it is impossible for a mortal being to attain immortality. Bonaventure found the root of these problems in Averroes' 'misinter-
pretation' of Aristotle's original philosophy. Again, in 1268, in his lectures De donis Spiritus Sancti, Bonaventure criticised the Averroistic views. On December 10, 1270, Stephen Tempier, Bishop of Paris, made his condemnation of these same errors. Thirteen points were proclaimed to be erroneous and "excommunicated along with all who shall have taught or asserted them knowingly." Three of these points are of particular interest: "the first article is, that the intellect of all men is numerically one and the same;" the seventh, "that the soul, which is the form of man specifically as man, disintegrates with the corruption of the body;" the eight, "that the soul in its state of separation after death does not suffer from corporeal fire." The contradiction of this last error was the form in which the church, on a more popular level, responded. The post-mortem state of the spirit was more rigorously defined. In the Profession of Faith made by the Greek, Michael Paleologus, to the Second Council of Lyons, in 1274, the position of the church in this matter is made clear.

"The souls of those who after having received holy baptism have incurred no stain of sin, either while remaining in their bodies or being divested of them, are received immediately into heaven. The souls of those who die in mortal sin or with original sin only, however, immediately descend to hell, yet to be punished with different punishments." In 1270, Thomas Aquinas also entered the fray with his De unitate intellectus contra Averroistas. Siger of Brabant made reply to this and the other condemnations in his De anima
intellectiva, of 1272 or 1273. In 1277, Stephen Tempier was again prompted to action. Two hundred and nineteen errors were then condemned. Steenberghen has called this condemnation, "the most important of the middle ages." It sought to establish the supremacy of theology over philosophy and, in matters of controversy, the ascendancy of faith over reason. Even Dante later had cause to comment on the Averroistic philosophy. In hell,

"On this side Epicurus and his train
Have sepulchre, they who affirmed the soul
Dies with the flesh." (Inferno, X:13-15.)

On a more popular level, utilising older beliefs, lay manuals containing religious instruction were produced. These emphasised the nature and location, after death, of the soul and the punishments it could expect to receive. Gradually, developing upon traditional conceptions, the doctrine of immediate judgment was formulated. At death, a psychomachia, or battle for the soul, was thought to take place. The forces of good being pitted against the forces of evil. The victor in this battle being granted possession of the deceased's soul. Angelic assistants were considered to play a key role in the psychomachia. An early reference to their appearance is found in the apocryphal gospel Joseph the Carpenter, of the late fourth century. In this text, Joseph is dying and his soul is being sought by three demons, the Devil, Death, and the Egyptian god Amenti. Christ appears at Joseph's death-bed and vanquishes the evil spirits.
Four angels then come to escort the soul of Joseph to Abraham's Bosom. This traditional description of the *psychomachia* evolved into the doctrine of immediate judgment which upholds that at death one's eternal fate is decided. The performance of the church's last rites for the dead being of extreme importance in this matter. This doctrine was given recognition by Vincent of Beauvais and Saint Thomas Aquinas and affirmed as dogma by Benedict XII in the edict *Benedictus Deus*, of January 29, 1336. Returning again to Dante, we see the same concepts expressed.

"When Lachesis has no more thread the soul
Is freed of flesh and carries off with it
*In posse* both the human and the divine;
All of the other faculties are muted,
But memory, intelligence, and will
Are more alert in act than e'er before.
Without delay and of its own accord
It falls to either bank, most wondrously,
And there it first learns of its destined course.
And soon as space encompasses it there:
Around it the form-giving virtue radiates,
With shape and size as in the living members..."

(Purgatory, XXV:78-89.)

Not all the exegetic material on the nature of the human soul may be considered to be the result of Siger of Brabant's activity. Much of the work was prompted by a conscientious attempt to rationalise the newly encountered pagan philosophies with an already long established Christian theology. In their desire to understand the nature of man and his relationship with God the theologians of the thirteenth century investigated the mediator of that interaction, the Virgin Mary.
Saint Bonaventure writes of the Virgin,

"...Mary is not only the glorification of heaven essential to man's salvation. The Lord never receives anyone except through her."\(^{115}\)

Albertus Magnus, in his *Tractatus de natura boni*, of 1240, also establishes the Virgin Mary as a mediator,

"...because she gave birth to the Redeemer and because she prays for us in heaven,"\(^{116}\)

presumably *nunc et in hora mortis nostrae*. In his commentary on *Luke*, written between 1260 and 1274, Albertus Magnus also states that,

"...the fulness of the Godhead dwelt in her bodily only because Jesus Christ dwelt in her, and through him alone she becomes for us a source and aqueduct of grace, so that through her it can overflow to men."\(^{117}\)

Recalling the words of Saint Paul,

"The grace of God is eternal life," (*Romans*, 6:23)

we see the important position given to the Virgin Mary.

As the Virgin Mary was conceived as the mediator between God and the human soul, so were the virtues considered to be the mediators between the soul and the body. In *La Lumiere as Lais*, a lay text of considerable popularity in the late thirteenth century, the union of the soul and body is discussed in the following terms,

"Les philosophes disent que l'âme est unie au corps par des 'vertus' qui servent entre elle et lui d'intermédiares et de liens."\(^{118}\)
(Philosophers say that the soul is united with the body by the 'virtues' which serve between them as intermediaries and as links.)

This text written in c.1267, mirrors the extensive exegetics of Thomas Aquinas on the subject. Believing that "virtue is a power of the soul," Aquinas sought to demonstrate that the moral virtues (Justice, Temperance, Fortitude, and Prudence) remain after death in a perfected form as powers of the separated soul. Believing that, "the entire structure of good works is built on the four virtues," Aquinas sought to define their individual roles.

"Thus, prudence is the virtue which commands; justice the virtue which renders what is due in actions between equals; temperance the virtue which restrains desires for the pleasures of touch; and courage the virtue which strengthens in the face of death."122

In the nascent figural tomb tradition that has been discussed, an interest in making the drama of death visually explicit is clearly in evidence. The clarity with which this drama is expressed mirrors the concise and explicit theological exegetics on the subject. For just as the appearance and disposition of the human soul and its immortality after corporeal death became a subject of great concern to theologians, the same interests inform the programmes of Italian tombs. At the very time that Siger of Brabant questioned the individuality of the soul, a new emphasis is placed on recording the image of the deceased and his separated, yet individualised soul. It becomes relevant to ask, therefore, if the depiction
of Margaret of Brabant rising upwards may not be explained in the light of these ideas.

In 1311-1312, at the time when the tomb of Margaret of Brabant was being designed, the Council of Vienne affirmed Thomas Aquinas' conception of the soul as the *forma corporis* -- the essential, informing power of the body.\(^{123}\) At the same time, the shades that populate Dante's *Commedia* were being conceived as simulacra of the human body.\(^ {124}\) The after-life had been studied and the human soul thoroughly analysed. May we not conclude that, just as the soul became defined theologically, sculpture could represent it just as concretely? May we not interpret the figure being assisted to rise by the two attendants as a representation of the soul of Margaret of Brabant being escorted to heaven immediately after death? We may thus explain all the extant elements of the tomb with reference to the theology of the time.

Noting again the words of Saint Paul,

"The grace of God is eternal life." (*Romans*, 6:23)

we see the important position that the Madonna and Child would have played in the original tomb programme. Margaret of Brabant may be thought to be arising by the grace of the Lord, mediated by the Madonna. The radiant expression on the face of Margaret of Brabant recalls the words of Saint Thomas Aquinas,

"...grace is a kind of light of the soul."\(^{125}\)
In the mosaic above the tomb of Cardinal Guglielmo Fieschi (Fig. 21) and in the tomb of Cardinal Guillaume de Braye (Fig. 27) the soul of the deceased is shown in supplication. Kneeling, and with the patronage of his saint, he prays for mercy. Margaret of Brabant, on the other hand, is shown receptive of divine grace. Her face shines, her head is anointed with oil. The drama is explicit and positively affirms the acceptance of Margaret of Brabant's soul into heaven.

The four virtue figures of the tomb may also be seen to have an important role in the activation of Margaret of Brabant's soul. Saint Augustine writes,

"God is the very life of the soul. Now it is precisely by bestowing virtues on the soul that God bestows life upon it, for even the soul is neither wise, nor just, nor pious, it is still a soul when stripped of these virtues; but it is, so to say, a soul that is dead, a soul deprived of life. It is capable of giving life to the body, but it also needs to be given life. God vivifies it by granting it wisdom, piety, justice, charity and thereby, all the other virtues."  

In addition, the presence of the virtue figures is the result of an ancient belief that the body and soul of the deceased has to be protected. Angels, evangelists, and lions also serve the same apotropoic function. Turning away evil, they protect the soul and body of the deceased. An image of the virtues as militant guardians of the defunct may be traced to the Psychomachia of Prudentius. Also, in the twelfth century at least, a didactic purpose was given to the representation of the virtues upon tombs. Katzenellenbogen writes,
Twelfth century sermons maintain the justifiability and necessity of such ornamentation, 'If the relics of the saints were to remain hidden and did not shine forth with the symbols of the virtues,' says Thiofridus of Echternach (d. 1110), 'what could stir up a longing for heaven in the hard and stony heart of man? What would be capable of freeing it from vice and restoring it to virtue?'

The escorts of Margaret of Brabant are explained by the apocryphal gospel, Joseph the Carpenter, which has been discussed. These figures are, therefore, the guardians sent to guide the soul of Margaret of Brabant after her death.

All the extant elements of the Margaret of Brabant tomb may be seen to conspire in the creation of a unified and meaningful programme for the monument as a whole. Giving substance to the theological concerns of the period, Margaret of Brabant's soul is seen to be drawn upwards. With the assistance of the attendant figures she rises up towards the Madonna above her, the illumination of grace apparent in her face. The Madonna is the source and mediator of the grace which draws Margaret of Brabant to heaven. The virtues associated with this scene are the powers which activate the soul of Margaret of Brabant and serve a transcendent function in the lifting of her soul. The virtues may also be seen to serve a protective and a didactic function, as guardians of the soul and body of Margaret of Brabant and examples of the virtues which make her ascension possible,
CHAPTER V
CONCLUSION

The representation of the soul of the deceased being escorted to heaven immediately after death has a long history in both manuscript and in relief sculpture that goes back to antiquity. The imago clipeata of a Roman sarcophagus such as that of the Seasons Sarcophagus, Dumbarton Oaks, Washington, and that which Panofsky terms a "medievalized imago clipeata," of the sarcophagus of Dona Sancha (c. 1100) both depict the ascension of the human soul after death. Other depictions of the same event are noted in the Apotheosis of an Emperor from an ivory consular diptych in the British Museum, and the tomb slab of Saint Reinheldis (c. 1130), Riesenbech (Fig. 61). In a manuscript, now in the Municipal Library, Boulogne (Fig. 62), the soul of Abbot Lambert is carried upward by two angels from his funeral bed. One of the last major examples of the use of this imagery in Italian tomb sculpture is the tomb of Simone Saltarelli (d. 1342), S. Caterina, Pisa (Fig. 49), a work that in some ways can be looked on as a reversion to earlier French traditions. That such images record the ascension of the soul immediately after death is emphasised when the dead body of the deceased or the funeral ceremony also appears. In the British Museum Apotheosis diptych the soul is lifted by two winged genii while down below an elephant-drawn platform carries an effigy of the deceased, enthroned under a canopy of honour, in a funeral pro-
cession. On the tomb slab of Presbyter Bruno (d. 1194), the soul of Bruno is lifted away from the corpse of the deceased which is being wrapped in a winding-sheet (Fig. 60). In the tomb of Azzone Visconti (d. 1339), S. Gottardo, Milan (Fig. 63), by Giovanni di Balduccio and assistants, although dismantled, the extant fragments indicate that the immediacy of the soul's ascent would have been explicitly rendered. The naked image of Visconti's soul is carried by an angel. On top of the sarcophagus, the effigy of the deceased is tenderly settled with angelic assistance. Thus, as in the Bruno tomb slab, both the body and the soul receive careful attention.

Although predominant, the depiction of the soul ascending does not always take the form of a naked figure, as is evinced by the Apotheosis diptych. In the tombs of the Bishop Ancoul de Pierrefonds (d. 1158) and that of Bishop Gosselin de Vierzy (d. 1152), both from the abbey at Longpont (Figs. 67 and 68) as recorded by Gaignières, the souls of these two Bishops of Soissons wear their robes of office. The tomb of Juan de Aragón (d. 1334), Tarragona (Fig. 50), depicts the soul of the deceased in his archbishop's apparel.

A predilection for depicting the soul being escorted to heaven is apparent in French tombs of the thirteenth century. The stressing of the intercessory role of the Virgin in the admittance of the deceased's soul into heaven would seem to partially explain the adaptations made in Italian tomb design of the
French motif. Prior to Giovanni Pisano's tomb of Margaret of Brabant, the representation of the ascending soul was transformed into the kneeling donor figure. This Panofsky has called,

"...a new humanistic substitute for the image of the soul in the guise of a little nude figure carried aloft by angels."134

The role of the Virgin is also changed in these tombs from that of a passive spectator into that of an active participant in the drama of the soul's ascension. This aspect of the Virgin is paralleled in the writings of Saint Bonaventure and Albertus Magnus that have been cited.

The tomb of Margaret of Brabant appears as a logical development of the French and Italian depictions of the soul after death. The Italian desire to dramatise and make visually explicit the processes of death is here united with a French iconography. The concrete and three-dimensional image of Margaret of Brabant's soul being escorted to heaven uniquely embodies the French representation of the soul's ascent and the Italian "humanized" and individualised, kneeling donor figure. Giovanni Pisano, by giving substance to the soul, fulfils a need to record the personal and immediately apparent acceptance of the deceased's soul into heaven with the intercession of the Virgin. It is significant that the re-use of the French motif of the ascension of the soul occurs in Italy only after Giovanni Pisano's re-introduction and adaptation of the iconography.

The theological and philosophical environment which
nurtured Giovanni Pisano's depiction of the soul of Margaret of Brabant in a concrete fashion has been discussed. It is impossible that Giovanni Pisano could have been unaware of these developments and a matter of coincidental interest that, of them, he may have had first-hand knowledge. Various scholars have considered it possible that Giovanni Pisano visited France during his lifetime.\(^{135}\)

That this hypothetical journey is thought, by some, to have occurred in the early 1270's, at the critical time when much of The controversial aspects of Siger of Brabant's Aristotelianism would have been openly discussed is intriguing.

Giovanni Pisano's inclusion of the virtue figures in the tomb and the concomitant increase in the number of levels of the tomb programme is a logical development of the earlier Roman tradition spearheaded by Arnolfo di Cambio. The virtue figures may be considered, in part, to be the earthly aspects of the life of Margaret of Brabant which support her soul's ascension. The drama of the soul's acceptance into heaven is associated with exemplary characteristics of Margaret of Brabant's temporal activity. In the future development of the Renaissance tomb this association becomes of considerable importance.\(^ {136}\)

The tomb of Margaret of Brabant is one of the first monuments of the fourteenth century to fully comprehend the possibilities of programmatic development. Giovanni Pisano, sculptor and architect, unites both aspects of his activity to achieve an enriched and concise narrative. The elaborate, multi-level,
wall appended tomb that he introduces emphasises sculptural elements but orders them into a distinct and clear architectural scheme. The potential of this development is attested by the florescence of this form after Giovanni Pisano's initial experiment. Prior to Giovanni Pisano, we may find perhaps the closest parallel to the tomb of Margaret of Brabant's emphasis on clarity and a well ordered progression from earth to heaven through successive levels only in the *Summa Theologiae* of Saint Thomas Aquinas.
NOTES


2. John Pope-Hennessy, "The Arca S. Dominic; A Hypothesis," Burlington Magazine, 93 (1957), pp. 347-351. The problems related to the attribution of segments of this monument are treated with illustration by Stefano Bottari, L'Arca di S. Domenico in Bologna, Bologna, Patron, 1964. The Arca of Saint Domenic was completed in 1267. Although Nicola Pisano appears to have been responsible for the design, his hand is seen only rarely in the execution. Arnolfo di Cambio, Lapo, and Fra Guglielmo are all thought to have contributed extensively to the work.


5. All citations of Vasari have been drawn from Gaetano Milanesi, Le vite de'più eccelenti pittori, scultori ed architettori scritte da Giorgio Vasari, Florence, Sansoni, 1878, I.


10. I.B. Supino, Giorgio Vasari: Vita di Niccolo e Giovanni Pisano scultori e architetti, Florence, Bemporad, 1911, p. 51, "Il monumento a Benedetto IX (si legga invece Benedetto XI) non appartiene a Giovanni, ma a qualche maestro senese." A. Garzelli, Sculture toscane nel Dugento e nel
Trecento, Florence, Marchi and Bertolli, 1969, p. 205, discusses the problems of the attribution of the monument and notes that it originally stood in S. Stefano di Castellare. The tomb is dated to c.1320.


13. The birthdate of Giovanni Pisano is uncertain, as is the date of his death. Generally, it is believed that the birth of the sculptor occurred c.1250, making him in his sixties at the time of the commission of the tomb for Margaret of Brabant. Giovanni Pisano is assumed to have died at sometime between 1314 and 1319, see Michael Ayrton, Giovanni Pisano, Sculptor, New York, Weybright and Talley, 1969, pp. 37 and 192.

14. This work, now in the Camposanto, Pisa is thought to have been completed before Giovanni Pisano's journey to Genoa to complete the tomb of Margaret of Brabant, see Ayrton, p. 187.

15. The Madonna della Cintola rests on the altar of the chapel of the Holy Girdle in Prato Cathedral. It is generally thought to be Giovanni Pisano's last surviving work, Ayrton, p. 220. Caterina Marcenaro, "La Madonna della tomba di Margherita di Brabant," Paragone, 167 (1963), pp. 17-21, believes that the Madonna della Cintola predates the tomb of Margaret of Brabant for stylistic reasons. This would make the tomb the last extant work of Giovanni Pisano.

16. William M. Bowsky, Henry VII in Italy, The Conflict of Empire and City-State, 1310-1313, Lincoln, University of Nebraska Press, 1960, p. 18. Bowsky is the source of all biographical material pertaining to Margaret of Brabant that follows.

17. Bowsky, p. 137.


20. "...In choro ecclesiae (San Francesco di Castelletto) iuxta altare depositum in sarcophago plumbeo..." -- from Albertino Mussato, Historia Augusta, published by L.A. Muratori, Rerum Italicarum Scriptores, Mediolani, 1727, X, 5, r. IV, col. 404a-b (Caterina Marcenaro, "Per la
The text of the document, *Atti del Cartolario del Notaio Leonardo de'Garibaldi*, Archivio di Stato, Genoa, Reg. 2, (1313-1318), folio 21b, reads:

"In nomine domini -- amen. Ego magister Johannes quondam magistri Nicole de Pisis intalliator operis sepulcri bone memorie domine Margarite olim romanorum imperatrix, regine semper auguste, in domo Fratrum minorum de Janua confiteor vobis domino Johanni de Bagnaria archidiacono Januensis me a vobis habuisse et recepisse florenos octaginta unum auri, boni et iusti ponderis et valoris qui valet pro quotibet floreno solidos XXIII et denarios quattuor Janue dantibus et solventibus pro nomine et vice serenissimi principis domini Henrici dei gratia Romanorum imperatoris semper augusti et de ipsis domini imperatoris propria pecunia pro dicto opere et nomine ipsius operis, renuntians exceptioni non habitorum et non receptorum et non numeratorum doctorum florenorum et omni ali iuri per quod in contrarium me tueri possem: promittens vobis dicto nomine et de ipsis florentis et ipsos expendere bona fide et sine fraude in ipso opere et bonam et ydoneam rationem de ipsis facere vel aliui cui de iure dicta ratio fieri debet vel debeat. Alioquin penam dupli dictae quantitatis cum omnibus dampnis interesse et expensis quae propterea fierent vobis dicto nomine stipulantibus et solvere promitto. Ratis manentibus supradictis et proinde et ad sic observandum omnia bona mea vobis nomine pignori debita habenda. Actum Janue in sacrestia anno domini nativitate millesimo trecentesimo decimo tertio indictione X die XXV augusti circa tertiam: Presentibus testibus presbitero Jacopo de Montogio da cappucinis sacrista ecclesie Januensis et presbitero Bevioto cappellano in ecclesie Januensis pro domino imperatore."

Bolletino Ligustico per la storia e la cultura regionale, 12 (1961), pp. 124-134; Marcenaro, Tomba, p. 6. The latter reading appears to be correct.

22. This opinion is expressed by Valentiner, p. 19.


24. Marcenaro, Tomba, p. 9. In 1798, the church of San Francesco di Castelletto was expropriated by the Direttorio and its demolition begun in 1805.

25. For the measurement of this and other pieces see, Pope-Hennessy, Gothic Sculpture, p. 179.

26. Marcenaro, Tomba, p. 9 and n. 24. The sale of several marbles was authorised on September 15, 1804, for their protection, by the Senator and President of the Magistrate of Finance, Genoa.


30. Marcenaro, Tomba, p. 3. For the circumstances of this find and its publication see Appendix, entry 36.

31. Marcenaro, Tomba, p. 4.


33. Ibid., p. 18.

34. Ibid., p. 18.

35. Seidel, op. cit.

36. These two fragments measure 77 and 68 cm. The right hand figure holds a segment of curtain upon which the letters \(0\)TA CENTRUM are inscribed. The association of these figures with the tomb of Margaret of Barabant originates with F. Alizeri, Catalogo della Collezione Santo Varni, Genoa, 1887, p. 29. M. Sauerlandt, Über die Bildwerke des Giovanni Pisano, Leipzig, 1904, pp. 47ff; and I.B. Supino, Arte Pisano, Florence, Fratelli Alinari, 1904,
p. 174, both link the two angels with the monument while recognising their inferior quality (M. Longhurst, Notes on Italian Monuments of the 12th to 16th Centuries, Victoria and Albert Museum, London, n.d., I, C42). Following these authors, Grosso, p. 2; A. Venturi, Giovanni Pisano, sein Leben und sein Werk, Florence, Pantheon, 1927, I, p. 52; Valentiner, p. 39; Pope-Hennessy, Gothic Sculpture, p. 179, all accept the angels as part of the original tomb programme. The following authors either doubt or specifically reject this association: Longhurst, op. cit.; Keller, p. 71; Pietro Toesca, Il Trecento, 1951; rpt. Turin, Unione Tipografico, 1964, p. 233.

37. Ayrton, p. 185.


42. Bowsky, pp. 152-153.

43. The codex is illustrated and a history of Henry VII's journey to Rome given by G. Irmer, Die Romfahrt Kaiser Heinrich's VII. im Bilderzyklus der Codex Balduini Trierensis, Berlin, Weidmannsche, 1881.

44. Ayrton, p. 186, adduces the same conclusion with respect to Giovanni Pisano's Madonna for Enrico Scrovegni; "There is, however, no doubt that the Madonna carved for Scrovegni by Giovanni was an indication of his widespread fame. Scrovegni spared no expense, and in employing Giotto and Giovanni upon his pious undertaking, he was certainly aware that he had acquired the services of masters of the first rank."


47. The date of the Savelli monument is uncertain. References in the inscription of the tomb allow it to be post-dated from 1287. The architecture of the tomb and its mosaic decoration may be fourteenth century additions. Cf. *Guida d'Italia; Roma e dintorni*, Milan, 1962, p. 119.

48. Julian Gardner, "The Tomb of Cardinal Annibaldi by Arnolfo di Cambio," *Burlington Magazine*, 114 (1972), pp. 136-141. Gardner traces the influence of the Porte Romane, Cathedral, Reims (Fig. 69), and tombs in Leon Cathedral, upon Arnolfo's designs. However, it is possible that a more direct source for this influence may have existed. "It cannot be excluded that the French model may have been in Old St. Peter's itself. The tomb of Amice de Courtnay, Countess of Artois, who died in Rome in 1275 may have conformed to this type," Gardner, *Annibaldi*, p. 141. n. 34. Cf., *Bauch, Anfänge*, pp. 246ff.

49. *Bauch, Anfänge*, pp. 252ff., argues that this tomb may be considered an early work of Arnolfo di Cambio.

50. For a discussion of the "considerable philosophical support for this new sculptural trend," in the writings of "men close to or members of the curia itself," see Gardner, *Influence*, p. 29, n. 2.

51. Gardner, *Arnolfo*, argues against the attribution of this tomb to Arnolfo di Cambio, "Comparison with the other effigies (by Arnolfo) reveals that of Adrian V to be the product of an eclectic sculptor heavily interested by Arnolfo di Cambio's style, and substantially later than the pope's death."

52. E. Panofsky, *Tomb Sculpture; Four Lectures on its Changing Aspects from Ancient Egypt to Bernini*, H.W. Janson, ed., New York, Abrams, n.d., pp. 60-61. As examples: the tomb of Pierre de Chatellerault, Bishop of Poitiers (d. 1135), Fontevrault, designed in the thirteenth century, and recorded in a drawing by Gaignières (Fig. 65); the tomb of Gilles du Chastelet (d. thirteenth century), Evron (J. Adhemar, "Les tombeaux de la Collection Gaignières,"*Book I,* "*Gazette des Beaux-Arts*, 84 (1974), pp. 1-192, #120); and the tomb of Abbot Arnoult (?), formerly St.-Père, Chartres (Fig. 66).

53. Gardner, *Annibaldi*, pp. 136ff, and fig. 7. A drawing
of the tomb (Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Codex Barberini, Lat. 4423, folio 23), once believed to record the original form of the tomb is shown convincingly to be an inaccurate assemblage of fragments of the tomb after its destruction.


57. Gardner, Arnolfo, p. 437, figs. 24 and 25.

58. See above, n. 10.


62. The association of this group of counsellors with the tomb of Henry VII has been questioned (Valentiner, p. 148, n. 4). The original connection was made by E. Bertaux, "Le mausolée de l'Empereur Henri VII à Pise," Mélanges à Paul Fabre, Paris, 1902, p. 365.

63. An effigy of King Dagobert in St. Denis is described by Dom Doublet as seated, resting his feet on a lion and a dog (s'Jacob, pp. 179-180).

64. Cf., Gardner, Influence, p. 172.

65. Pope-Hennessy, Gothic Sculpture, p. 16, inaccurately describes the four supporting figures as "...slender caryatids of the Virtues..." The figures are without attributes. Three are male, the fourth, female.

66. Gardner, Influence, p. 172. See Guiseppe Marchini, Le Vetrate dell'Umbria, Rome, De Luca, 1973, (Corpus Vitrearum Medii Aevi, Italia, Vol. I), p. 33 and pl. XXIV, who dates the windows, 1253-1260. Valentiner, p. 49, fig. 8, suggests that a predella panel illustrating the Resurrection of Christ, by Ugolino da Siena, for his S. Croce altarpiece, influenced Tino di Camaino. He writes, "It can scarcely be doubted that Tino was inspired by this panel of Ugolino, who, for his part, may have been indebted
for the motive to northern painting, possibly to French miniatures of the thirteenth century, in which the scene was similarly represented.

67. See above, n. 2.

68. Paris, Musée national du Louvre, Catalogue des sculptures du Moyen Age, de la Renaissance et des temps modernes, Paris, Musée Nationaux, 1922, I, p. 70, #'s 571-574. These statues stand 110 cm. in height.

69. Valentiner, pp. 93-94 and 151, n. 15. The tomb of Charles Martel is described by Pietro Summonte, Historia della città e regno Napolitano, Naples, 1675, II, p. 353 (Valentiner, p. 152); "...mori dunque il re d'Ungharia in Napoli intorno il fine dell'anno 1295 d'età d'anni 30....fu sepolto in un sepolcro di marmo sostenuto dalle statue delle quattro virtù cardinale."

70. Valentiner, p. 59.


72. This number may be increased to four if Valentiner's suggestion that the bishop is portrayed in the allegorical relief panel is correct (Valentiner, p. 72).

73. Cf., Victoria Goldberg, "Leo X, Clement VII and the immortality of the soul," Simiolus, 8 (1975-6), pp. 16-25, p. 19, discusses the rarity of such depictions.


75. Libro degli Anniversarii del Convento di San Francesco di Castelletto in Genova, Biblioteca Reale, Turin, MS., "Processio in die mortuorum in Conventu Janue.... Prima Statio."
Ad imperatricem. omnia fiunt sicut consuetum est in suis anniversariis. Responsorium Subvenire sancti et cetera et inde kyrie eleison pater noster.

ORATIO. Quesumus domine pro tua pietate misere clementer anime famule tue imperatricis. et a contagis mortalitatis exutam in eterne salvatoris partem restitue. Inclina domine tuam ad preces nostras quibus miserioordiam tuam supplices exoramus ut animam famuli tui imperatoris qui de hoc secolo migrare iussisti in pacis ac lucis regionis constitutas. et sanctorum tuorum iubeas esse consortem. per christum." (Marcenaro, Tomba, p. 15, n. 14).

76. Marcenaro, Tomba, p. 8.
77. Marcenaro, Tomba, pp. 8-9.
78. Cf., Einem, p. 147, n. 36.
79. The shrine is illustrated by W. Wolters, La scultura veneziana gotica, 1300-1460, Venice, Alfieri, 1976, II, figs. 28-30. The affinities between the monument and the original form of the shrine of S. Dominic are noted by Wolters, I, p. 152.
81. For the shrine of Saint Augustine, see Pope-Hennessy, Gothic Sculpture, p. 199, pl. 62, and fig. 45.
82. See Wolters, I, pp. 160-161, and II, figs. 84-90.
83. Garzelli, p. 205.
84. The use of this tent-like canopy may have preceded the Petroni monument in that of Henry VII. Cf., Pope-Hennessy, Gothic Sculpture, p. 184, who writes, "The tent-like structure within which the effigy is placed appears, from a miniature in the Codex Balduini noted by Valentiner, also to also to have been employed in the monument of the Emperor Henry VII at Pisa, and perhaps derives in both cases from Giovanni Pisano's monument of Margaret of Luxemburg at Genoa, which may have inspired other reatures of Tino's wall monuments." Henry VII was in fact given a tent, "bedecked with jewels and surmounted by a golden eagle," upon his arrival in Pisa (Bowsky, p. 153). It seems likely that the inclusion of such an element in the Codex Balduini Trevirensis is a direct reference and a commemoration of this gift (Fig. 20).
86. Cf., Marcenaro, *Madonna*, p. 21, who writes of the Madonna, "La sua scala, rapportata a quella delle altre statue superstite della tomba scomparsa, suggerisce una complessità prospettica che conferma la supposta grandiosità dell'opera..."

87. The Orso monument (Fig. 40), as reconstructed by Valentiner, had no effigy, but this may also be questioned, cf., Pope-Hennessy, *Gothic Sculpture*, p. 185.

88. This form of reconstruction is suggested by Torriti, *Giustizia*, pp. 133-134, fig. 8-9 (Fig. 57). Torriti's reconstruction of the tomb places the rising figure and her two assistants on top of the sarcophagus with four virtue figures as actual caryatids. The position of the virtues is largely hypothetical but Torriti suggests that the Justice may have appeared on the left because, "...il suo fianco destro e squadrato e calato a piombo come un pilastro angolare." This reconstruction is questioned by Seidel, p. 338, and p. 350, n. 28. Torriti's assumption that the Justice acted as a caryatid was made prior to the removal, by restorers, of surplus cement from the neck of the figure which had been left when once the fractured head had been replaced.

89. Pope-Hennessy, *Gothic Sculpture*, p. 179, writes, "...since the inscription is in the second person singular and is addressed to the Empress, it is probable that this and the three other Cardinal Virtues were grouped round the effigy."

90. Panofsky, p. 77.

91. Cf., E. Mâle, "Le portail de Senlis et son influence," *Revue de l'art ancien et moderne*, 29 (1911), pp. 161-176. Examples of the iconography are found at Senlis, Chartres, Laon, Saint Yvod de Braine, Lausanne, and S. Maria in Vezzolano. It appearance at Senlis was apparently unprecedented (Fig. 70).


93. Ibid., p. 241.

94. The Assumption of the Virgin appears infrequently in sepulchral monuments (cf., s'Jacob, pp. 126-127). For examples see, the tomb of Doge Francesco Dandolo (d. 1339), S. Maria dei Frari, Venice, Wolters, I, pp. 163-164, and II, fig. 100; and an anonymous tomb in the Collezione
Cini, Monselice, Wolters, I, p. 181, and II, figs. 302-305.

95. Einem, p. 144.


98. The presence of a Madonna and Child in the programme would be unsuitable in this case, although the Virgin Mary would not be as difficult to explain. The Virgin Mary's role as an "instrument of Incarnation and Redemption" is discussed by D.C. Shorr, "The Role of the Virgin in Giotto's Last Judgment," Art Bulletin, 38 (1956), pp. 207-214. See also, Sister M. Vincentine, The Blessed Virgin Mary as Mediatrix in the Latin and Old French Legend Prior to the Fourteenth Century, Washington, Catholic University of America, 1938, p. 71.


100. The problems relating to the appellation of this group are discussed by Gilson, pp. 388-389.


102. Gilson, p. 403.

103. Ibid.


105. Ibid.

106. Ibid.

108. Cf., Siger of Brabant, "De anima intellectiva, Chapter 7: Whether the intellective soul is multiplied in accord with the multiplication of human bodies," in Wippel, pp. 360-365.

109. Steenberghen, p. 94.


112. Cf., s'Jacob, p. 120.

113. In tomb sculpture, these beliefs find expression in the *tombeaux de grande cérémonie* (cf., see above, n. 52). In these monuments the emphasis placed upon the last rites performed for the deceased indicates the concern with which the moments after death were viewed. S'Jacob, p. 73, writes, "...the Gothic artists did not aim so much at commemorating the liturgical acts, as drawing attention to the efficacy of the prayers." It is the performance of these acts that ensures the everlasting bliss of their recipient.

114. The relevant text of the *Benedictus Deus* is published by Denizinger, pp. 530-531. All those worthy of immediate admission to heaven are granted, "by intuitive vision," the sight of God.


118. Langlois, p. 80.


120. *Ibid.*, la 2ae:67,1
121. Ibid., 1a 2ae:60,1.

122. Ibid., 1a 2ae:61,4.

123. Denzinger, p. 190, #481. The Council of Vienne, in the edict De summa trinitate et fide catholica, reproved, "as erroneous and inimical to the Catholic faith every doctrine or position rashly asserting or turning to doubt that the substance of the rational or intellectual soul truly and in itself is not a form of the body." Cf., Saint Thomas Aquinas, The Soul, Trans. J.P. Rowan, St. Louis, Herder, 1949, p. 13, art. 1, "When the body is corrupted the soul does not lose the nature which belongs to it as a form, despite the fact that it does not actually perfect matter as a form."


125. Aquinas, Summa, 1a 2ae:110,1.

126. Cf., ibid., 1a:89, "The separated soul does not understand by means of innate species, nor by species it abstracts then, nor by species alone....but by species participated in by the influence of the divine light. The soul is made a sharer in these just like other immaterial substances, though in an inferior mode. Thus as soon as it ceases to turn to the body it turns to higher beings. It does not follow on this account that the knowledge is not natural, for God is the author of the inflowing of light, not only of grace, but also of nature."


128. Cf., s'Jacob, p. 213.


130. Illustrated by Panofsky, fig. 127

131. Ibid., p. 59, fig. 236.

132. Ibid., fig. 239.

133. Cf., Toesca, p. 272.

134. Panofsky, p. 78.
135. Cf., Pope-Hennessy, *Gothic Sculpture*, p. 7; and Ayrton, p. 42. Keller, p. 11-12, is the most insistant of those who believe Giovanni Pisano to have visited France. He writes, "Zwischen 1270 und 1275 muss sich dann Giovanni Pisano in französischen aufgehalten haben."

136. Panofsky, p. 73, characterises the inclusion of the virtues in tomb programmes as character witnesses as one of the "iconographical innovations" which mark the transition between Gothic tomb sculpture and Renaissance tomb sculpture.
GIOVANNI PISANO: Tomb of Margaret of Brabant (d. 1311), main group, Palazzo Bianco, Genoa.

GIOVANNI PISANO: Tomb of Margaret of Brabant, main group (detail), Palazzo Bianco, Genoa.
**Fig. 3**  
GIOVANNI PISANO: Tomb of Margaret of Brabant, Justice (front view), Palazzo Rosso, Genoa.

**Fig. 4**  
GIOVANNI PISANO: Tomb of Margaret of Brabant, Justice (rear view), Palazzo Rosso, Genoa.
Fig. 5  GIOVANNI PISANO: Tomb of Margaret of Brabant, Madonna (front view), Palazzo Rosso, Genoa.

Fig. 6  GIOVANNI PISANO: Tomb of Margaret of Brabant, Madonna (rear view), Palazzo Rosso, Genoa.
GIOVANNI PISANO: Tomb of Margaret of Brabant, Temperance (front view), Swiss private collection.

GIOVANNI PISANO: Tomb of Margaret of Brabant, Temperance (rear view), Swiss private collection.

GIOVANNI PISANO: Tomb of Margaret of Brabant, Temperance (detail), Swiss private collection.
Fig. 10  Two angels holding a baldacchino, Palazzo Bianco, Genoa.
Fig. 11  Justice, S. Maria Maddalena, Genoa.
Fig. 12  Temperance, S. Maria Maddalena, Genoa.
Fig. 13  Prudence, S. Maria Maddalena, Genoa.
Fig. 14  Fortitude, S. Maria Maddalena, Genoa.
Fig. 15

Death of Henry VII's brother, Walram of Luxemburg, at the siege of Brescia, July 26, 1311, and his funeral: D(omi)n(u)s Walr(amus) fr(ater) regis sagitta obiit Brixie. Sepelit(ur) V(er)one multi mortiunt(ur) aere corrupto. Codex Balduini Trevirensis, Staatsarchiv, Koblenz, 1 C no. 1, 14a.

Fig. 16

Funeral of Margaret of Brabant: Regina obiit Janus XI. dece(m)b(r)is an(n)o XVIII sepelit(ur) ad Minores. Codex Balduini Trevirensis, Staatsarchiv, Koblenz, 1 C No. 1, 17a.
Fig. 17 Death of Henry VII at the siege of Siena, August 24, 1313: *Obitus Imperatoris H(enrici) septimi i(u) Bonon(u)t(o) die XXIII augu(sti) anno MCCCXIII.* Codex Balduini Trevirensis, Staatsarchiv, Koblenz, 1 C No. 1, 35b.

Fig. 18 Henry VII's body transferred to Pisa: *Reductis H(enrici) Imp(eratoris) Pysis.* Codex Balduini Trevirensis, Staatsarchiv, Koblenz, 1 C No. 1, 36a.
Funeral of Henry VII in Pisa: Exequie H(enrico) Imp(er)atoris Pysis.
Codex Balduini Trevirensis, Staatsarchiv, Koblenz, 1 C No. 1, 36b.

An idealised representation of Henry VII's tomb.
Codex Balduini Trevirensis, Staatsarchiv, Koblenz, 1 C No. 1, 37.
Fig. 21 Tomb of Cardinal Guglielmo Fieschi (d. 1256), S. Lorenzo fuori le mura, Rome.

Fig. 22 Tomb of Luca Savelli, S. Maria in Aracoeli, Rome.
Fig. 23  PIETRO ODERISIO: Tomb of Clement IV (d. 1268), S. Francesco, Viterbo.

Fig. 24  PIETRO ODERISIO: Tomb of Clement IV (detail), S. Francesco, Viterbo.
Arnolfo di Cambio: Tomb of Adrian V (d. 1276), S. Francesco, Viterbo.
Arnolfo di Cambio: Tomb of Cardinal Riccardo Annibaldi della Molara (d. 1276), S. Giovanni in Laterano, Rome.
Fig. 27  ARNOLFO DI CAMBIO: Tomb of Cardinal Guillaume de Braye (d. 1282), S. Domenico, Orvieto.
Fig. 28  Reconstruction by Romanini of the tomb of Cardinal Guillaume de Braye.
Fig. 29  ARNOLFO DI CAMBIO: Tomb of Cardinal Guillaume de Braye (detail), S. Domenico, Orvieto.
Fig. 30 Drawing of the tomb of Boniface VIII (d. 1303).
Fig. 31 Tomb of Benedict XI (d. 1304), S. Domenico, Perugia.
Fig. 32 Tomb of Benedict XI (detail), S. Domenico, Perugia.
Fig. 33 Reconstruction by Valentiner of the tomb of Henry VII (d. 1313).
Fig. 34 Reconstruction by Bauch of the tomb of Henry VII.
Fig. 35 TINO DI CAMAINO: Tomb of Henry VII (detail of two counsellors), Camposanto, Pisa.
Fig. 36  
TINO DI CAMAINO: Tomb of Cardinal Riccardo Petroni (d. 1314), Cathedral, Siena.

Fig. 37  
Caryatid Fortitude, Louvre, Paris.

Fig. 38  
Caryatid Prudence, Louvre, Paris.

Fig. 39  
Reconstruction by Valentiner of the tomb of Gastone della Torre (d. 1318).
Fig. 40

Reconstruction by Valentiner of the tomb of Bishop Antonio degli Orsi (d. 1320 or 1321).

Fig. 41

TINO DI CAMAINO: Tomb of Bishop Antonio degli Orsi (detail), Cathedral, Florence.

Fig. 42

TINO DI CAMAINO: Tomb of Catherine of Austria (d. 1323), S. Lorenzo, Naples.
Fig. 43  TINO DI CAMAINO: Tomb of Mary of Hungary (d. 1323). S. Maria Donna Regina, Naples.

Fig. 44  TINO DI CAMAINO: Tomb of Mary of Hungary (detail), S. Maria Donna Regina, Naples.
Fig. 45  TINO DI CAMAINO: Tomb of Charles of Calabria (d. 1328), S. Chiara, Naples.

Fig. 46  TINO DI CAMAINO: Tomb of Marie of Valois (d. 1331), S. Chiara, Naples.
Fig. 47  GIOVANNI AND PACIO DA FIRENZE: Tomb of Robert of Anjou, S. Chiara, Naples.
Fig. 48  GIOVANNI DI BALDUCCIO: Tomb of Guarnerio degli Antelminelli, S. Francesco, Sarzana.
Fig. 49  NINO PISANO: Tomb of Archbishop Simone Saltarelli (d. 1342), S. Caterina, Pisa.
Fig. 50 Tomb of Juan de Aragon (d. 1334), Cathedral, Tarragona.

Fig. 51 Tomb of Juan de Aragon (detail), Cathedral, Tarragona.
Fig. 52  Tomb of Cardinal Luca Fieschi (d. 1343), S. Lorenzo, Genoa.

Fig. 53  DOMENICO PIAGGIO: Transcription of the epitaphs of Margaret of Brabant and Leonardo Fornario.

Fig. 54  Shrine of the Beato Bertrando (d. 1350), Baptistery, Cathedral, Orvieto.
Fig. 55  GIOVANNI DI BALDUCCIO: Shrine of Saint Peter Martyr, Portinari Chapel, S. Eustorgio, Milan.

Fig. 56  GIOVANNI DI BALDUCCIO: Shrine of Saint Peter Martyr (detail), Portinari Chapel, S. Eustorgio, Milan.
**Fig. 57** Reconstruction by Torriti of the tomb of Margaret of Brabant.

**Fig. 58** Reconstruction of the tomb of Margaret of Brabant.

**Fig. 59** Tomb of the Bardi family, S. Croce, Florence.
Fig. 60 Tomb slab of Presbyter Bruno (d. 1194), Cathedral, Hildesheim.

Fig. 61 Tomb slab of Saint Reinheldis, Church, Reisenbeck.

Fig. 62 Death and transfiguration of Abbot Lambert (d. 1125), Municipal Library, Boulogne, MS. 46, fol. 1 V.

Fig. 63 GIOVANNI DI BALDUCCIO AND ASSISTANTS: Tomb of Azzone Visconti (d. 1339), S. Gottardo, Milan.
Fig. 64 Drawing of the tomb of Abbot Pierre de Dijon (d. 1132), Abbey of Asint-Bénigne, Dijon. Collection Roger de Gaignières.

Fig. 65 Drawing of the tomb of Bishop Pierre de Chatellerault of Poitiers (d. 1135), Abbey, Fontevrault. Collection Roger di Gaignières.

Fig. 66 Drawing of the tomb of Abbot Arnoult (?), formerly Saint-Père, Chartres. Collection Roger de Gaignières.

Fig. 67 Drawing of the tomb of Bishop Ancoul de Pierrefonds of Soissons (d. 1158), Abbey, Longpont. Collection Roger de Gaignières.

Fig. 68 Drawing of the tomb of Bishop Gosselin de Vierzy of Soissons (d. 1152), Abbey, Longpont. Collection Roger de Gaignières.
Fig. 69  Detail of the *Porte Romane*, Cathedral, Reims.

Fig. 70  Awakening of the Virgin (detail of west portal), Cathedral, Senlis.
BIBLIOGRAPHY


Bowsky, William M. *Henry VII in Italy; the Conflict of Empire and City-State, 1310-1313*. Lincoln, University of Nebraska Press, 1960.


Gilson, E. "Dante's Notion of a Shade; Purgatorio XXV." *Mediaeval Studies*, 29 (1967), pp. 124-142.


Jacob, Henriette s'. *Idealism and Realism; a Study in Sepulchral Symbolism.* Leiden, E.J. Brill, 1954.


Sauerlandt, Max. Über die Bildwerke des Giovanni Pisano. Dusseldorf, K.R. Langewiesche, 1903.

Schmarsow, August. Italienische Kunst in Zeitalter Dantes. Augsburg, Dr. Benno Filser, 1928.

Scott, Leader. Sculpture; Renaissance and Modern. London, Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge, 1905.


Torriti, Piero. "La 'Giustizia' di Giovanni Pisano e il monumento a Margherita di Brabante." *Bollettino Ligustico per la storia e la cultura regionale*, 12 (1960), pp. 124-134.


A collection of Genoese records, 1099-1460.

Margaret of Brabant's death during the feast of Saint Lucy, on December 12, in the monastery of S. Dominic, is recorded. The notice makes reference to Margaret's direct involvement in the burial arrangements. She was entombed, as she herself had chosen --

"...prout ipsa legaverat..." --
in a marble sepulchre in the raised part --

"...a parte leva..." --
of the choir of S. Francesco.
Cronica Januæm ab initio ad annum 1333, Archivio di Stato, Turin.

"...Anno domini MCCCVIIIJ electus est in alamania rex henricus comes de lucemburgo vir imperatorem et venit in Lombar­diam MCCX itaque omnes civitates lombardie per solempnes ambasatores se dederunt dicto domino imperatorì et Januenses similiter fecerunt. Et MCCCXI venit in Janua et manendo ibi domina imperatrix uxor eius ibidem defuncta est et sepulta ad sanctum franciscum de Janua. Dictus vero dominus imperator ivit pisas et romam, et post multa bella et controversias que habuit tam in roma quam item in tuscia et lombardia sicut deo placuit vitam finivit MCCCXIIJ in die beati rochi."

(V. Promis, Atti della Societa Ligure di Storia Patria, X (1874), pp. 495ff; Marcenaro, Tomba, pp. 13-14, n. 5.)

A Genoese chronicle.

An account of Henry VII's election as "vir imperatorem" and his subsequent Italian journey. Margaret of Brabant's death in Genoa, in 1311, and her burial in the church of S. Francesco --

"...ad sanctum franciscum..." --

are noted.

Agostino Giustiniani: Castigatissimi Annali con la loro
Il giorno di S. Lucia L'Imperatrice Margarita, della quale abbiamo parlato di sopra, nel monasterio di S. Dominico passo di questa vita all'altra, & fu sepolta nella chiesa di S. Francesco in la capella maggiore in una sepultura di marmo della parte sinistra, secondo che ella haveva ordinato.

(Marcenaro, p. 16, n. 16.)

The death of Margaret of Brabant in the monastery of S. Dominic and her entombment in a marble sepulchre in the church of S. Francesco, on the left side of the chapel, is noted. Reference is made to arrangements for the entombment being made by Margaret herself:

"...secondo che ella haveva ordinato."

1610


"Dentro la chiesa dalla banda dritta dell'altar grande, 1311. Il Deposito di Margherita Imperatrice."

(Einem, p. 132.)

Placed the tomb of Margaret of Brabant inside the church of S. Francesco to the right of the high altar.
"...La sua arca si vede ancor in presente a fronte dell'organo ornata di statue di marmo."

(Marcenaro, Tomba, p. 14, n. 7.)

Places the tomb, decorated with marble statues, facing the organ. At that time, the organ was located above the Altar of the Conception in the left arm of the transept (Marcenaro, Tomba, p. 7 and n. 8). This is the first reference to what appears to be a moving of the tomb from its original location in the Cappella Maggiore of the church.

"Il giorno di S. Lucia in Genova nel monastero di S. Domenico si morì Margarita moglie del Re Henrico e secondo ch'ella aveva ordinato fu sepellita nella chiesa di S. Caterina nella contrata di Locoli, posseduta dalle Monache dell'ordine di S. Francesco che poi cadendo ad altra religione, fu il suo corpo trasportato nell' chiesa di S. Francesco nella cui arca fu posto tale epitaffio: Margarita Henrici VII Regis Romanorum uxor obiit Janue anno domini MCCCI."

(Einem, p. 133.)
The erroneous reference to burial in S. Caterina is corrected by Giscardi, in 1750 (see below, Appendix entry 11). The epitaph of the tomb reads,

Margaret, wife of Henry VII, King of the Romans, died Genoa the year of the Lord 1301 (sic).

7

18th Century

Chiesa di Genova, Archivio Storico del Commune, Genoa, MS. 050, p. 279.

"In che gran concetto di religiosa perfetione vivessero i Frati antichi di questo Monastero può argumentarsi ch'essendo morta in Genoa il giorno di S.ta Lucia dell'1311 L'Imperatrice Margarita Moglie d'Enrico Sesto desiderosa partecipare de meriti di questi Santi religiosi Ordino nel suo testamento d'esser interrata nella loro Chiesa, dove sopra la Capella di S. Francesco in un suntuoso mausoleo fu tumulata."

(Marcenaro, Tomba, p. 14, n. 12.)

Extended reference is made to Margaret's request for burial in the church of S. Francesco. The tomb, described as a "sumptuous mausoleum," is located "sopra la Capella di S. Francesco." The actual location of the chapel is unknown. It has been suggested that the site referred to here is identical with that referred to in entry 5, that is, in the left arm of the transept.
18th Century


(Marcenaro, *Tomba*, p. 7.)

Describes the tomb as "un suntuoso mausoleo."

1728


"La cui moglie morse e fu sepolta in Genova domina Margarita in S. Francesco dove ancor hoggi si vede la sua arca marmorea..."

(Einem, p. 134.)

Margaret of Brabant's marble tomb --
"...arca marmorea..." --

is mentioned in the church of S. Francesco.

1739


"...Aveva essa prima di morire ordinato d'esser sepolta nella chiesa di P.P. minori di S. Francesco di Genova, che però il di Lei cadavere cola traferito gli furono celebrate l'essequie
degne dell'Imperiale Majestà et indi collocato in un arco di marmo ornata di molte figure che anche al presente si vede sopra la cappella del medesimo S. Francesco alla parte sinistra del Sancta Sanctorum."

(Einem, p. 133.)

Describes the monument as a marble tomb decorated with many figures, located "above the chapel of S. Francesco," to the left of the high altar.

11


"L'anno 1311 morì in Genova Margarita moglie dell'Imperatore Henrico VII il die successe il giorno di S. Lucia, e secondo quello avea ordinato circa il suo deposito fu sepolta nella presente chiesa di S. Francesco, dove ancora oggidì si vede il di Lei sepolcro ornato di molte statue di marmo sopra la capella di detto Santo. L'anno seguente cessò di vivere nel luogo di Buonconvento nella Toscana il medesimo Imperatore Henrico VII il cui cadavere fu sepolto nella Città di Pisa, ma il di lui cuore ordinò prima di morire che fosse portato in Genova come fu eseguito e riposto nella stessa arca ove giaceva l'Imperatrice sua consorte Margarita. Errore il Canonico Calcagnino nella Storia delle ceneri di S. Giovanni Battista ove dice che l'Imperatrice Margarita fu sepolta nella chiesa di S. Caterina, mentre, il fatto stesso cioè l'esistenza del suo sepolcro mostra il contrario:"

(Einem, p. 133.)
This manuscript provides the first and only reference to the heart of Henry VII having been transported to Genoa, in accordance with a request made by the Emperor prior to his death, and being placed in the tomb of Margaret of Brabant. The erroneous reference to Margaret of Brabant's burial in S. Caterina made by Agostino Schiaffino (see below, Appendix entry 6) is here corrected.

18th Century


*Super Capellam S. Francisci*
*Margherita Enrici Sexti Regis Romanorum uxor obijt*
*Genua anno MCCCXI*
*depositum cum statua*
*decumbente dicta Imperatricis*

*Leon:* *dus* ex antiqua Furnariorum
*Familia S.C. celeberrimus et Marianensis*
*dignissimus episcopus hoc*
*Sacellum proprio aere construi*
*Iussit*

(Einem, p. 133.)

A transcription of the tomb's epitaph placed in a narrow semi-circular field that seems to serve as the frame for a lunette-like opening. The coat-of-arms of Leonardo Fornari, Archbishop of Genoa, appears above the epitaph. The legend "*Super Capellam S. Francisci*" is written to the right.
1874


The first publication of the document of August 25, 1313, and the initiation of the modern history of the tomb of Margaret of Brabant. Reference is made to Genoese chronicles in which the tomb is discussed, but it is assumed that the work itself is lost.

1874


In response to Alizeri's publication (Appendix entry 13), Varni links fragments in the Villa Brignole-Sale, in Voltri, to Giovanni Pisano's tomb project. The fragments are described as,

"...costano di tre figure; cioè di una muliebre in atto di essere alzata dalla tomba da due altre mutilate nella testa, le quali indossano una lunga veste."

An identification of the two attendant figures as angels is doubted. Note is also made that the fragments were found,

"...con più altri provenienti dalle demolizioni di san Francesco."
1875


Repeats the findings of Alizeri and Varni (Appendix entries 13 and 14).

1876


Re-publication of the document of August 25, 1313, with reference to the newly discovered fragments.

1878


An addendum to Vasari's *Vite* of Nicola and Giovanni Pisano. Describes the central figure as,

"...una muliebre in atto di essere messa nella tomba...",

by two figures dressed as monks. This interpretation is repeated by J.P. Richter, Commentary containing notes and emendations from the Italian edition of Milanesi and other sources, London, Bohn, 1901, II, p. 295; and Leader Scott, Sculpture, Renaissance and Modern, 1886; rpt. London, Society for Promoting Christian
Knowledge, 1905, p. 28.

18

1904

A. Brach, Nicola and Giovanni Pisano und die Plastik des XIV Jahrhunderts in Siena, Strassburg, Heitz and Mundel, 1904, p. 50.

Of the tomb of Margaret of Brabant Brach writes,

"Erhalten is die Grabfigur der Kaiserin, di von zwei Engeln, deren Köpfe zerstört sind, aus dem Grabe emporgehoben."

Uses the fragments of the monument to counter the attribution of the tomb of Benedict XI, S. Domenico in Perugia, to Giovanni Pisano.

19

1906


Describes the three figure group as a "scena della resurrezione."

"...La defunta, sorpresa dal sonno di morte, aiutata da due angioletti a sorgere dalla tomba. Nella camera funebre sopra il corpo, ma richiamato a vita, sorgere, assistito e sorretto dagli angioletti, alla beatitudine e alla gloria."

20

1906

W. Suida, Genua, Leipzig, E.A. Seeman, 1906, pp. 36-37.

Suida placing the tomb of Margaret of Brabant in the
late thirteenth and early fourteenth century tradition of tomb sculpture, suggests that the monument may have originally resembled the tomb of Cardinal de Braye by Arnolfo di Cambio.

1925


Argues that the fragments from the Villa Brignole-Sale may not be associated with the tomb of Margaret of Brabant for the following reasons:

(1), the provenance of the sculpture does not establish that the fragments originated in the church of S. Francesco di Castelletto;
(2), the central figure of the group resembles Madonna figures by Giovanni Pisano;
(3), the costume of the central figure does not correspond with that of the depiction of Margaret of Brabant in the Codex Balduini Trevirensis;
(4), the funeral of Margaret of Brabant depicted in the Codex Balduini Trevirensis does not correspond with the extant tomb fragments;
(5), the iconography of the three figure group is inconsistent with that of contemporary tombs.

Portigliotti suggests that the fragments represent an Assumption of the Virgin made by Giovanni Pisano.
22

1925

Orlando Grosso, "Intorno alla tomba di Margherita di Brabante a Palazzo Bianco," Genova; riviste mensile del commune, October 31, 1925, pp. 1203-1204.

A rejection of Portigliotti's interpretation of the fragments (Appendix entry 21).

23

1927


The unique qualities of the tomb in relation to contemporary tomb sculpture are noted. Venturi cites the tombs of Arnolfo di Cambio and the tradition of tomb sculpture in Italy in the fourteenth century as being distinct from the iconography of the Margaret of Brabant monument. The figure of Margaret of Brabant is interpreted as illustrating "eine Besiegerin des Todes," as opposed to the tradition of showing the deceased in the sleep of death.

24

1933


Refers to the tomb fragments as the "Hauptwerk der Spätzeit" of Giovanni Pisano.
Valentiner recognises the portrait quality of the face of Margaret of Brabant, writing,

"In the workshop of Giovanni Pisano... portraits are rare. The most important is that of the Empress Margaret on the Genoese tomb, though, if one subtracts the costume little remains of the individual character of the portrayed..."
Tipografico, 1964, pp. 252 and 380-381.

Describes the figure of Margaret of Brabant,

"...in atto di risorgere sorretta da Angeli illuminata da un sorriso..."

The four virtue figures of S. Maria Maddalena, Genoa, are mentioned as the work of a follower of Giovanni Pisano.

---

1954


Describes the figure of Margaret of Brabant as rising,

"...from her funeral bed assisted by two angels."

---

1956


Discusses the tomb fragments in relationship to the style of Giovanni Pisano in his late years.

---

1956


Discusses the tomb fragments in the context of Giovanni Pisano's late style.
The central figure of the main group is described as rising,

"...dal letto funebre..."

A figure representing the Cardinal Virtue of Justice is herein associated with the tomb of Margaret of Brabant and attributed to Giovanni Pisano. The close resemblance of the Justice figure to that in a group of figures from the church of S. Maria Maddalena, Genoa, is noted (cf., Appendix entry 28). The suggestion is made that the five figures from Santa Maria Maddalena were copied for a funerary monument from their corresponding figures in the tomb of Margaret of Brabant. The Justice figure is identified as a caryatid from the first level of the tomb of Margaret of Brabant.
Pisano e il monumento a Margherita di Brabante, "Bolletino Ligustico per la storia e la cultura regionale, XII (1960), pp. 124-134.

Provides a rough reconstruction sketch.

1961


Published with knowledge only of the three fragments of the main group. Provides a major interpretation of the iconography of these pieces, focussed on their relationship with the Assumption of the Virgin and the political significance of the tomb.

1961


A figure representing Justice is attributed to Giovanni Pisano and associated with the tomb of Margaret of Brabant. Descriptions of the tomb, prior to 1798, are discussed in detail. It is suggested that the Justice figure was a caryatid in the monument.

1961

Piero Torriti, "Ancora sul monumento Brabante di Giovanni
In chronological sequence;

(1), C. Marcenaro found the Justice figure in March, 1960.
(2), P. Torriti found the Justice figure in December, 1960.
(3), P. Torriti, 1960 (Appendix entry 33), published.
(4), C. Marcenaro, 1961 (Appendix entry 36), published.
(6), P. Torriti, 1960 (Appendix entry 34), published.

1962


The figure of Margaret of Brabant is linked stylistically with a figure representing Pisa (Museo dell'Opera del Duomo, Pisa). This late work of Giovanni Pisano was originally part of a group representing Henry VII and Pisa kneeling before a Madonna and Child.

1963


The headless, standing figure of a woman is identified as a Madonna by Giovanni Pisano and associated with the tomb of Margaret of Brabant. The suggestion is made that the Madonna
occupied a lofty position in the tomb programme.

40

1964


Refers to the figure of Margaret of Brabant as being,

"...assisted to rise from the dead' as if in anticipation of the Last Judgment..."

41

1966


"Varied movement, emotional sensitivity and rigid selectivity of detail were evidently characteristic of the tomb of Margaret of Luxemburg (Brabant).... the basis of this wall tomb must have been a further development of the sepulchral drama of Arnolfo's monument for Cardinal de Braye."

42

1968


A head, in a Swiss private collection, is identified as part of a figure of Temperance by Giovanni Pisano and associated with the tomb of Margaret of Brabant.

A discussion of the tomb in the context of Giovanni Pisano's late work.


Suggests that it is,

"...likely that the prominent use of more or less freestanding virtue figures was introduced by Giovanni Pisano in the tomb of Margaret of Brabant..."


Discusses the tomb in the context of a tradition of representing the *psychomachia* between the devil and angels after death. The figure of Margaret of Brabant is interpreted to be rising, in her resurrection, towards one of her attendants whilst shunning the other.

Suggests that the resurrection of Margaret of Brabant derives from French reliefs depicting the Awakening of the Virgin. Suggests that the Cardinal Virtues were grouped around the effigy of Margaret of Brabant beneath a lunette containing the rising figure of Margaret of Brabant.


Suggests that the iconography of the tomb of Margaret of Brabant may have been derived from that of the tomb chapel of Nicholas III (d. 1280).