

SHAPING THE ENGLISH-CANADIAN NOVEL, 1820-1900

by

CAROLE FAINSTAT GERSON

B.A., Simon Fraser, 1970

M.A., Dalhousie, 1972

A THESIS SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF
THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF
DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

in

THE FACULTY OF GRADUATE STUDIES
(Department of English)

We accept this thesis as conforming
to the required standard

THE UNIVERSITY OF BRITISH COLUMBIA
April, 1977

© Carole Fainstat Gerson

In presenting this thesis in partial fulfilment of the requirements for an advanced degree at the University of British Columbia, I agree that the Library shall make it freely available for reference and study. I further agree that permission for extensive copying of this thesis for scholarly purposes may be granted by the Head of my Department or by his representatives. It is understood that copying or publication of this thesis for financial gain shall not be allowed without my written permission.

Department of English

The University of British Columbia
2075 Wesbrook Place
Vancouver, Canada
V6T 1W5

Date April 27, 1977

ABSTRACT

This dissertation examines nineteenth-century Canadian fiction in relation to the cultural context from which it emerged. The first three chapters present the difficulties which undermined the development of the novel in a conservative colonial community. Chapter I surveys the literary nationalists who called for the establishment of a distinctive Canadian literature and deplored the apathy of the Canadian public; chapter II documents Victorian Canada's suspicion of the novel as a valid literary form; chapter III looks at the problem of finding valid material for fiction in a recently settled land which appeared to lack the historical and cultural associations presumed necessary for literature.

The fourth and fifth chapters provide the critical focus of this dissertation by analyzing nineteenth-century Canadian discussions of the theory of the novel. Sara Jeannette Duncan, post-Confederation Canada's most radical literary critic, argued consistently that the romantic novel was obsolete. Despite Duncan's vigorous promotion of Howellsian realism, most Canadians remained faithful to the standard of Sir Walter Scott, and read

and wrote romantic fiction conforming to the moral and aesthetic principles outlined by Goldwin Smith in his 1871 address on "The Lamps of Fiction." The opposition between Duncan's realism and Smith's romanticism provides an indigenous critical framework in which to evaluate the work of nineteenth-century Canadian novelists.

The last four chapters examine the efforts of Canadian writers to fit Canadian materials to the forms and conventions of popular romance. Chapter VI shows how John Richardson's search for exciting Canadian subjects suitable for the romance of high adventure was repeated by other writers throughout the century. Chapter VII discusses Victorian Canada's taste for historical romance as part of a movement to discover and recover Canadian history, and analyzes An Algonquin Maiden (1887) by G. M. Adam and E. A. Wetherald as a deliberate effort to prescribe historical romance as the proper mode for Canadian fiction. Most novelists interested in history abandoned English Canada for Acadia and Quebec, however, and their work is the subject of Chapter VIII. William Kirby's The Golden Dog (1877) provided a prototype for historical fiction about Quebec; the work of Susan Frances Harrison and Duncan Campbell Scott epitomizes the imaginative importance French Canada held for English Canada. Even when nineteenth-century writers turned to everyday experience their treatment of ordinary life was tinged by their taste for romance

and didacticism, as Chapter IX shows. With a few exceptions, Canadian writers refrained from realism until many years after the route to modernism was indicated by Duncan Campbell Scott's stories of the North and Sara Jeannette Duncan's novel, The Imperialist (1904).

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	PAGE
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS USED	v
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	vii
INTRODUCTION	1
CHAPTER I: BACKGROUND: THE CULTURAL COMMUNITY	10
CHAPTER II: THE VALIDITY OF FICTION	36
CHAPTER III: THE VALIDITY OF CANADA AS A LOCATION FOR FICTION	79
CHAPTER IV: SARA JEANNETTE DUNCAN AND THE PROGRESS OF REALISM	110
CHAPTER V: THE SEARCH FOR THE CANADIAN WALTER SCOTT: REQUIREMENTS FOR CANADIAN FICTION	135
CHAPTER VI: "THE QUINTESSENCE OF NOVELS AND ROMANCES": ROMANCE AND HIGH ADVENTURE	172
CHAPTER VII: "THE HEROIC TIMES OF CANADA": ENGLISH-CANADIAN HISTORY AND ENGLISH-CANADIAN FICTION	213
CHAPTER VIII: "THE OLD WORLD OF AMERICA": FRENCH CANADA IN ENGLISH-CANADIAN FICTION	258
CHAPTER IX: "THE ROMANCE OF REAL LIFE": DOMESTIC AND REGIONAL REALISM	312
CONCLUSION	347
A SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY	359
PERIODICALS CONSULTED: AN ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY	400

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS USED.

In the notes to each chapter, the following abbreviations are used. Detailed information about the nineteenth-century periodicals will be found in the Annotated Bibliography of Periodicals, pp. 400-413.

<u>AAM</u>	<u>Anglo-American Magazine</u>
<u>Acadian</u>	<u>Acadian Magazine</u>
<u>BAM</u>	<u>British American Magazine</u>
<u>BMM</u>	<u>Belford's Monthly Magazine</u>
<u>CIN</u>	<u>Canadian Illustrated News</u>
<u>CJ</u>	<u>Canadian Journal</u>
<u>CM</u>	<u>Canadian Magazine</u>
<u>CMLR</u>	<u>Canadian Magazine and Literary Repository</u>
<u>CMNR</u>	<u>Canadian Magazine and National Review</u>
<u>CRLHJ</u>	<u>Canadian Review and Literary and Historical Journal</u>
<u>DAR</u>	<u>Dominion Annual Register</u>
<u>DI</u>	<u>Dominion Illustrated</u>

<u>JCF</u>	<u>Journal of Canadian Fiction</u>
<u>LG</u>	<u>Literary Garland</u>
<u>NDM</u>	<u>New Dominion Monthly</u>
<u>PAC</u>	Public Archives of Canada
<u>RBCM</u>	<u>Rose-Belford's Canadian Monthly</u>
<u>Stewart's</u>	<u>Stewart's Literary Quarterly</u>

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank my supervisor, Dr. W. H. New, for his time, advice and continual support. The other members of my committee, Drs. M. W. Steinberg and D. G. Stephens, also provided helpful suggestions and encouragement. In addition, I am very grateful to the staff of the Interlibrary Loans Division of the University of British Columbia Library, who zealously tracked down many obscure publications; to Mrs. Anne Yandle, Head of the Special Collections Division of the University of British Columbia Library; and to the Canada Council and the University of British Columbia for their generous financial aid. Special thanks also to Lynda, who typed this dissertation; Susan, who kept telling me that theses do get finished; Kathy, who kept me company in Special Collections; and Martin, who kept me sane.

INTRODUCTION

Nineteenth-century Canadian fiction is the product of a particular cultural community at a particular time in history. Most Canadian novels written before the First World War excite little interest as works of art. As documents in literary and cultural history, however, they present a fascinating portrait of a colonial society, reflecting the aspirations, preconceptions and limitations of an emerging nation struggling towards self-definition and seeking its identity in part through its literature. Rather than pass easy judgment on the obvious shortcomings of most of the stories and novels written in Victorian Canada, the task of the investigative critic is to discover and define the cultural context which encouraged the growth of artificiality, didacticism and popular romanticism. In 1965, Gordon Roper remarked that nineteenth-century Canadian fiction had suffered blanket disparagement because "historians of Canadian literature, judging by literary standards current in mid-twentieth century departments of English, have dismissed all but one or two books as less than first rate." This dismissal has meant that popular

Canadian literature has not received the critical attention which has been accorded to the less than first-rate literature of England and the United States. Studying the neglected field of nineteenth-century Canadian fiction in relation to its cultural milieu will, in Roper's words, "present information and perspectives which may help us recover our lost knowledge of that fiction and of the Canada in which it was written."¹

Recovering lost knowledge about Victorian Canada's literary attitudes involves the reconstruction of a set of social and cultural assumptions which today appear limited and unsound. Nineteenth-century Canadian novelists shared their community's sincere belief that the proper model for fiction was Sir Walter Scott. In Scott's work, they found the morality, didacticism, idealism and romance which, they believed, should characterize the literary identity that was being forged for Canada. Conservative and nationalistic, Canadian writers and critics revered what they considered to be the best literary traditions of the Old World. In true colonial fashion they tried to transplant in the New World the forms, characters and moral qualities of popular romantic fiction which derived from the novels of Walter Scott.

The best source of information about nineteenth-century Canada's literary opinions is the host of literary and cultural periodicals which appeared sporadically and died prematurely through most of the century. In their occasional pieces of

literary criticism and their book review columns, these periodicals reveal that many Victorian Canadians considered the novel a minor and often regrettable genre. To be accepted as a valid piece of literature in their eyes, a novel had to be edifying, informative and present no challenge to the status quo. In addition, many commentators questioned whether Canada, "the youngest born of nations,"² could possibly furnish the historical and mythical resonances necessary for a national literature. Discussions of the validity of fiction as a literary genre and the validity of Canada as a location for fiction illuminate the difficulties underlying the efforts of nineteenth-century writers to produce a distinctive Canadian literature.

Nineteenth-century periodicals themselves present a number of problems. At present there exists no complete bibliography of literary and cultural periodicals produced in Canada during the last century. Information about their editors and their frequently anonymous contributors is sparse. To date, the contents of only two periodicals, the Literary Garland (Montreal, 1838-51) and the Canadian Monthly and National Review (Toronto, 1872-78; continued as Rose-Belford's Canadian Monthly, 1878-82) have been indexed. To aid my readers, I have appended to this dissertation an annotated bibliography of periodicals consulted during my research or referred to in my text. Of these, the most influential in shaping Canadian literary taste were the Literary Garland, the Canadian Monthly, and The Week (Toronto,

1883-96). The small ephemeral magazines published in major and minor centres in Central Canada and the Maritimes are equally important, however, for they reveal the cohesiveness of the Canadian cultural community throughout the nineteenth century. While these periodicals vary greatly in style and content, from the erudite eighteenth-century tone of the Acadian Magazine (Halifax, 1826-28), to the condescending moralism of children's periodicals like the Maple Leaf (Montreal, 1852-54), to the popular orientation of the Canadian Magazine (Toronto, 1893-1939), their attitudes towards the development of a national literature and towards the novel as a literary venture remained generally consistent. This consistency was both temporal and geographical. Similarly conservative views about the acceptable form and function of the novel appeared in magazines published in Halifax, St. John, Montreal, Quebec and Toronto. Although these communities differed in their social and historical makeup, their cultural leaders shared common literary opinions. Such uniformity is hardly surprising, in view of the smallness of the Canadian cultural community as a whole, and the tendency of its editors and writers to shift from periodical to periodical.

This movement began early in the century when David Chisholme, founding editor of the Canadian Magazine and Literary Repository (Montreal, 1823-25) left that magazine to start a rival publication, the Canadian Review and Literary and Historical Journal (Montreal, 1824-26). Susanna Moodie and Catharine Parr Traill spread their

genteel literary taste across the Canadas by contributing polite stories and sketches not just to the Literary Garland, but also to the Canadian Literary Magazine (York, 1833), the Moodies' Victoria Magazine (Belleville, 1847-48), the Anglo-American Magazine (Toronto, 1852-55), the Maple Leaf (Montreal, 1852-54) and the British American Magazine (Toronto, 1863-64). After the demise of the Literary Garland, one of its best writers, Rosanna Leprohon, published stories in the Canadian Illustrated News (Montreal, 1869-83) and the Canadian Monthly and National Review (Toronto).

After Confederation, the inter-relationships within this community became especially noticeable. John George Bourinot, a Nova Scotian by birth, contributed stories and articles relating to Canadian history and culture to Stewart's Literary Quarterly (St. John, 1867-72), the New Dominion Monthly (Montreal, 1867-79), the Canadian Monthly and The Week. Another Maritimer, George Stewart, Jr., founded Stewart's Literary Quarterly (St. John) in 1867, in 1878 moved to Toronto to edit Rose-Belford's Canadian Monthly, and a year later moved to Quebec where he edited the Daily Chronicle from 1879 to 1896. Graeme Mercer Adam married the daughter of John Gibson, editor of the Literary Garland, and was closely associated with the British American Magazine (Toronto, 1863-64), the Canadian Monthly and National Review and its successor, Rose-Belford's Canadian Monthly, and contributed criticism to The Week. John Talon-Lesperance was variously

connected with the Montreal Gazette, the Montreal Star, the Canadian Illustrated News (Montreal, 1869-83) and the Dominion Illustrated (Montreal, 1888-92). When the Royal Society of Canada was founded in 1882, its membership comprised a roll call of Canada's intellectual leaders. Included were many influential members of the literary community: James M. LeMoine, Goldwin Smith, George Stewart, John George Bourinot, William Kirby, and John Talon-Lesperance.

The cultural homogeneity of Victorian Canada is indicated also by census statistics. By 1881, close to 86% of the population was Canadian born. Of those born abroad, the vast majority -- nearly 78% came from the British Isles. Within Canada itself, the non-French section of the population was overwhelmingly British in origin: from 1871 to 1901, over 80% of the Canadians who were not French declared themselves of English, Irish or Scottish descent.³ Uniformity of class orientation and cultural goals cannot be shown statistically, but Frank Watt, who has culled early publications in search of Canada's radical tradition and literature of protest, concludes that during the nineteenth century the vast majority of Canadians were conservative, individualistic, and scarcely interested in the social and political problems accompanying industrialization. When they did touch on these issues, they seldom advanced beyond the radicalism of "the middle-class American 'progressives,'" for "A too-active social conscience

was looked upon as unhealthy and out of place in the Canadian scene."⁴ Dissenting opinion did find an outlet in the small radical labour press of Ontario during the last three decades of the century, but its effect upon "the respectable Canadian tradition of the period"⁵ was negligible. In creative literature, the respectable Canadian tradition successfully squelched most nonconformity. Even Sara Jeannette Duncan, Victorian Canada's least conventional literary critic, is radical only in contrast to her surroundings.

My study of this community's literary attitudes and the fiction it produced begins with the 1820's, which saw the publication of the first novel by a native Canadian and the founding of important literary periodicals in the Maritimes and Montreal. It extends to the end of the century with the generation of writers born in the 1860's, who began to publish fiction in the 1880's and 1890's. Although their work carries over into the twentieth century, their attitudes were shaped by the nineteenth. This group includes authors whose approach towards the novel varied from the best-selling conventionality of Robert Barr, to the religious sentimentality of Ralph Connor, to the pompous romanticism of Gilbert Parker, to the exuberant realism of Sara Jeannette Duncan. Rather than proceed chronologically through the century, which would involve much repetition of issues and attitudes which scarcely changed from 1820 to 1900, I have chosen to define the problems affecting the Canadian novel which remained fairly

constant, and to structure this dissertation according to these problems.

In the following analysis of the relationship between a cultural community and its literature, the term "novel" is used to embrace all forms of extended fictional prose narrative. The term "romance" describes a particular kind of novel: an extended fiction in prose presenting an unrealistic view of the world, in which the author removes characters and circumstances from the arena of everyday life by heightening their distinguishing characteristics so that heroes are more perfect, villains more evil, and events more coincidental, tragic or blissful than in real life. Because Victorian Canadians shared a preference for romantic fiction, in defiance of the efforts of Sara Jeannette Duncan to introduce a taste for Howellsian realism, they seldom distinguished between the romance and the novel. They assumed that by definition the novel was romantic, and that the role of art was to perfect, not reproduce, the world of common experience.

NOTES TO INTRODUCTION

¹ Gordon Roper, "New Forces; New Fiction," in Literary History of Canada, ed. Carl F. Klinck (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1967), pp. 260-61.

² Anon., "The Literature of a New Country," Monthly Review, 1 (Jan. 1841), 60.

³ Seventh Census of Canada, 1931, Ottawa: Patenoude, 1936, I, pp. 214, 236.

⁴ Frank Watt, "Literature of Protest," in Literary History of Canada, ed. Carl F. Klinck (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1967), pp. 458-61.

⁵ Watt, p. 465.

CHAPTER I

BACKGROUND: THE CULTURAL COMMUNITY

Throughout the nineteenth century, Canadian nationalists argued that the development of a distinctive Canadian literature was a crucial factor in the development of a distinctive Canadian identity. During the formative decades before Confederation, the buoyant years surrounding Confederation and the more reflective era following the depression of the late 1870's, cultural leaders in all parts of Canada vociferously encouraged Canadian writers to write and the Canadian public to buy and read their books. In 1858, Thomas D'Arcy McGee presented the arguments underlying this literary nationalism when he explained that

Every country, every nationality, every people, must create and foster a National Literature, if it is their wish to preserve a distinct individuality from other nations. If precautions are not taken to secure this end, the distinctive character and features of a people must disappear; they cannot survive the storms of time and the rude blasts of civil commotion. The popular mind must be trained and educated according to the physical appearances and social condition of the country; and the people who are so unfortunate as to possess no fountain from which they can procure the elixir of their existence, will soon disappear from the face of the earth, or become merged in some more numerous, or more powerful neighbour.

Six years later, Reverend Hartley Dewart took an important step towards the establishment of a national literature by compiling Selections From Canadian Poets (1864), the first anthology of Canadian poetry. In his "Introductory Essay," today regarded as a seminal document in Canadian literary criticism, Dewart echoed McGee's sentiment that

A national literature is an essential element in the formation of national character. It is not merely the record of a country's mental progress: it is the expression of its intellectual life, the bond of national unity, and guide of national energy. It may be fairly questioned, whether the whole range of history presents the spectacle of a people firmly united politically, without the subtle but powerful cement of a patriotic literature.²

How to inspire "patriotic literature" in a population undistinguished by literary sensibility was a difficulty constantly confronting Canada's cultural leaders and critics. The more optimistic postulated a direct connection between economic advancement and cultural maturity, theorizing that the new country's burgeoning material prosperity would inevitably lead to the end of frontier pragmatism and promote the growth of cultural refinement. The Literary Garland, during its existence (1838-51) the most influential literary periodical in the Canadas, ~~was~~ ⁱⁿ Canada, repeatedly asserted that "as the country generally increases in its available means, literature and art, which are the truest evidences of enlightenment and prosperity, will proportionately flourish."³ In 1881, John George Bourinot spoke for all those who saw intellectual development as a concomitant to material

development when he argued:

If Canada makes the material progress within the next few decades that her people hope, and her statesmen are endeavouring to accomplish, in the face, no doubt, of many difficulties, we may confidently look forward to a corresponding intellectual development. So much practical work of immediate importance has to be performed in a comparatively new country like this, that native talent has naturally found chief expression in politics, the professions and the press; but with greater wealth, and an older condition of society, literature, science and art, will be cultivated to a far larger extent. . . . with the greater opportunities of leisure and culture necessarily opening up to us in the future, Canadians may yet have a literature, not merely imitative, as at present, but creative and original.⁴

Long before Bourinot's pronouncement, editors of literary periodicals subscribed to the same theory as one by one they cheerfully predicted an immediate end to pioneer utilitarianism and heralded a new era of literary refinement. Confidence in the power of literature to aid in civilizing the new land underpinned the efforts of individuals like Reverend Dr. John McCaul, who conducted The Maple Leaf, or Canadian Annual (1847-49) to promote "the soft influences of the refined taste,"⁵ and the Moodies, who founded the Victoria Magazine (1847-48) "to contribute in some considerable degree to the extension of the taste of general literature among that most numerous and not least respected class of our fellow Colonists, -- the rural population of the Province."⁶ Mrs. Holiwell, one of the British American Magazine's major contributors, regarded literature as "a missionary of civilization and refinement."⁷ After publishing Wacousta (1833) and The

Canadian Brothers (1840), Major John Richardson felt himself entitled to a government pension for his efforts "to introduce into [Canada] that spirit of refinement, through the instrumentality of literature, which is the first indication of moral superiority in a people, and the surest guarantee of order and well regulated submission to authority."⁸ Such assurance notwithstanding, the ephemeral existence of most nineteenth-century Canadian literary periodicals indicates that the enthusiasm of their editors was matched by the staunch indifference of the Canadian public.

This was certainly the experience of Mr. Kent, editor of the Canadian Literary Magazine (York, 1833), who optimistically declared in 1833 that

The severe trials of an early settler, and daily warfare with mental and physical difficulties, may have super-induced a crust of roughness over the outward man; but the same feelings which the settler brought with him from his native land, or which the Canadian-born inherits from his parents, exist, though perchance it may be, in a latent state.⁹

Unfortunately Mr. Kent failed to tap these latent "feelings" of literary interest sufficiently to keep his well-intentioned periodical alive beyond the third number.¹⁰ Nineteen years later Reverend Robert Jackson MacGeorge, editor of the more successful Anglo-American Magazine (1852-54), reiterated Mr. Kent's hopes when he attempted to establish a journal of literary refinement in a society characterised by pioneer materialism:

The difficulties with which literary enterprise has to encounter in these days of utilitarian philosophy, encyclopaedic knowledge, and almost limitless facilities

of multiplication and reproduction, are in no trifling degree encreased in this country, where the "battle of life" is mainly fought in the fields of commerce and labour, and in which the combatants, and of these comparatively few, have neither the leisure or means -- alas! that we should think the inclination also wanting to partake of the relaxation of intellectual pursuits and to encourage the attempts which are made to promote them. We believe, however, and we rejoice in the belief, that as the stern asperities of life's chequered way are rapidly diminishing under the triumphs of energetic and successful enterprise, so the desire, natural to the race from which we spring, of enjoying to the fullest extent those fruits of mental culture and those benefits of refinement, which have been aptly termed "the embellishments of life," will grow stronger.¹¹

This periodical survived for two and a half years. Most optimistic of all was John Gibson, editor of the Literary Garland. Most of the journal's thirteen volumes, published from 1838 to 1851, contain supremely confident addresses "To Our Readers" asserting (in the Garland's elegant horticultural idiom) that the country's literary development paralleled its physical growth. In 1843 Gibson announced that

It must be very gratifying to the Canadian born, or to him to whom Canada is Home, to know that the progress of literature has been co-equal with that of the settlement of the wilderness: and that if the latter has been made to bloom and blossom as the rose, the literature of Canada likewise blooms and blossoms beauteously.¹²

The literary bouquets so carefully nurtured by the Garland proved to be false harbingers of the springtime of Canadian literary development. Susanna Moodie, when so inclined, could easily adopt the Garland's ornamental language to rhapsodize about her labours in the flower gardens of literature.¹³ But after the failure of the Victoria Magazine in 1848 and of the Garland

itself in 1851, Mrs. Moodie's enthusiasm regarding the cultural possibilities of her adopted country temporarily waned as she learned that "The sin of authorship meets with little toleration in a new country."¹⁴ In 1853, after twenty years of heroic struggle to establish genteel literary standards for the colony and to promote education as a route to cultural and moral refinement, "the woman that wrote" was forced to acknowledge the disparity between her cultural ideals and the reality presented by Canadians themselves:

The Canadian people are more practical than imaginative. Romantic tales and poetry would meet with less favour in their eyes than a good political article from their newspapers. The former they scarcely understand, the latter is a matter of general interest to the community. Yet there are so few countries in the world which possess so many natural advantages, and present more striking subjects to fire the genius of the poet, and guide the pencil of the painter.¹⁵

In her disappointment, Susanna Moodie reiterated the frustrations of Major John Richardson, who in 1841 had unsuccessfully petitioned Lord Sydenham, then Governor-General of British North America, for a pension in consideration of his literary productions. In 1847, in Eight Years in Canada, Richardson lambasted his fellow countrymen for not paying as much attention to Wacousta (1833) as had the Americans, and for not caring "a straw whether the author was a Canadian or a Turk."¹⁶ When he wrote an introduction for the 1851 American edition of Wacousta, Richardson bitterly declared that for all the attention it had received that book's sequel, The Canadian Brothers (1840), may as well have been

published in Kamschatka.¹⁷ John Richardson's fruitless efforts to achieve literary recognition in his native land bore out the truthfulness of the comments contained in "The Literature of a New Country," an anonymous article published in the Monthly Review (Toronto) in 1841:

A Colony is a peculiarly unpropitious spot for the development of learning or the arts. Its population, from the very nature of its constituent parts, is all bent on the engrossing task of advancing personal interest, or extending personal enterprise and industry. It is a land of struggles with the difficulties of climate, untamed nature, and limited resources. A "mute, inglorious Milton" may be found among its forests, but his soft voice will be drowned in the hum and bustle of active life. He may bud, but it will be only to wither; he may put forth blossoms, but it will be only to be frosted at once by the sneer or laugh of those around, intent on far more matter of fact pursuits, and ready at once to wonder at or pity the unhappy wight devoted to what they cannot but deem a frivolous vocation, or an "unprofitable investment" of talent or industry.¹⁸

The situation responsible for such a pessimistic outlook appeared to ameliorate considerably during the next thirty years, which saw the growth of a cult of progress. Lawrence S. Fallis's recent study of "The Idea of Progress in the Province of Canada" reveals that "Mid-Victorian Canadians were convinced that they were living in what was time and again referred to as an 'age of improvement.'"¹⁹ Tangible results of this national optimism appeared when Confederation provided new impetus for literary activity, stimulating the founding of journals like the New Dominion Monthly Magazine (Montreal, 1867-79), Stewart's Literary Quarterly (St. John, 1867-72), the Canadian Illustrated News

(Montreal, 1869-83) and the Canadian Monthly and National Review (Toronto, 1872-78). Yet at the height of Confederation enthusiasm regarding the cultural potential of the new nation, there still persisted the debate that characterized discussions of Canadian literature throughout the nineteenth century. On one side ranged the optimists -- often editors and publishers -- who convinced themselves, if not the country at large, that Canada's obvious material prosperity would inspire a cultural renaissance. On the other side sat the realists, including many writers, who discovered, often through dismal personal experience, that the country was not at all interested in recognizing its authors. In 1864 Rev. Dewart spoke for the realists when he bluntly declared that

There is probably no country in the world, making equal pretensions to intelligence and progress, where the claims of native literature are so little felt, and where every effort in poetry has been met with so much coldness and indifference, as in Canada. And what is more to be deprecated than neglect of our most meritorious authors, is the almost universal absence of interest and faith in all indigenous literary productions, and the undisturbed satisfaction with a state of things that, rightly viewed, should be regarded as a national reproach. The common method of accounting for this by the fact that almost the whole community is engaged in the pursuit of the necessaries and comforts of life, and that comparatively few possess wealth and leisure, to enable them to give much time or thought to the study of poetry and kindred subjects, is by no means satisfactory.²⁰

The following year, Graeme Mercer Adam stated in the Canada Bookseller, a trade magazine put out by his publishing firm, that in Canada the book trade suffered because

there is a lack of that generous feeling towards literature generally that characterizes the English connoisseur of books and the frequenter of the shops of the book men in the old world. We regret that there is so little encouragement to the book man to import the better class of books.²¹

By 1872 the book trade had improved to the point where Adam could announce that

judging from the value and extent of her book-importations and the development and activity of her book-trade, [Canada] asserts for herself a high position in the intellectual scale of nations In proportion to the population . . . there is no dependency of the Crown whose book-imports exceed that of Canada; and the extent of the increase of that trade is a remarkable and gratifying feature in her national progress.²²

Canada's much-heralded "national progress" failed to produce more than a temporary remission of the cultural malaise diagnosed by Dewar. In 1877 the Canadian Illustrated News reprimanded Canadians for their failure to acknowledge their writers, opining that

The truth is that the Canadian mind needs a stimulus from within. Its provincialism is a bane and a reproach. While platitude should never be encouraged because it is of native growth, mediocrity might be treated with indulgence, and where there is real excellence, it should be proclaimed precisely because it is Canadian.²³

And in 1887 Sara Jeannette Duncan assaulted her country's "blinding lethargy" in cultural affairs, denouncing her fellow Canadians as "the imported essence of British Philistinism, warranted to keep in any climate, and affording in our proper persons a guarantee that it will increase in force and efficiency in this one."²⁴

Canadian Philistinism was certainly not allowed to endure unchallenged. By the time of Confederation, and continuing through the remainder of the nineteenth century, there flourished in Central Canada a community of writers, publishers, editors and critics all fully prepared to nurture and cherish a native literature. They clustered around the literary periodicals which they edited and to which they contributed -- the most notable being the Canadian Monthly and National Review (Toronto, 1872-78) and The Week (Toronto, 1883-96) -- and around the literary section of the Royal Society of Canada, founded in 1882.

Vocal and opinionated, these individuals figure prominently in a comprehensive analysis of the literary climate of Victorian Canada. Among those most involved in the new Dominion's cultural development was Graeme Mercer Adam, who wore the various hats of bookseller, publisher, critic and novelist. Two years after immigrating to Canada in 1858, he established a bookselling and publishing firm with James Rollo. In 1867 John H. Stevenson succeeded Rollo as Adam's junior partner and together they founded the house of Adam, Stevenson & Co. which published many Canadian books before going bankrupt in the depression of 1876. In addition, Adam published the British American Magazine (Toronto, 1863-64) and conducted a trade journal, the Canada Bookseller (1865-72). Adam's most notable contribution to the Canadian literary scene was his publishing of the Canadian Monthly and National

Review from 1872 to 1876, in close association with Goldwin Smith. From 1879 to 1882 he edited Rose-Belford's Canadian Monthly, successor to the Canadian Monthly. As a critic Adam contributed many articles on European and Canadian literature to The Week, and as a novelist he collaborated with Ethelwyn Wetherald in the writing of An Algonquin Maiden: A Romance of the Early Days of Upper Canada (1887).

Certainly the most internationally prominent member of this community was Goldwin Smith. Shortly after his arrival in Canada in 1871, Smith became instrumental in the founding of the Canadian Monthly. In addition to giving frequent lectures and addresses on cultural and literary matters, Smith

began the Nation to which he contributed articles; joined John Ross Robertson in establishing the Telegram in 1874; wrote and published the Bystander from 1880 to 1890 . . . founded The Week in 1883; and salvaged the Weekly Sun, the organ of the Farmer's Movement, keeping it alive from 1896 to 1909.²⁵

Also greatly concerned with the development of a national literature was George Stewart, Jr., who edited and published Stewart's Literary Quarterly (Saint John) from 1867 to 1872, left the Maritimes to edit Rose-Belford's during Adam's absence in 1878, edited the Quebec Daily Chronicle from 1879 to 1896, and wrote much literary criticism. Stewart was a founding member of the Royal Society of Canada, as was another Maritimer, John George Bourinot. Author of Our Intellectual Strength and Weakness (1893), Bourinot contributed numerous articles on Canadian literature, cultural life

and history to Stewart's, the New Dominion Monthly, the Canadian Monthly, The Week, and other periodicals. Other charter members of the Royal Society actively involved in Canada's literary life included John Talon-Lesperance, editor of the Canadian Illustrated News from 1873 to 1880, founding editor of the Dominion Illustrated Monthly in 1888, and author of a well-received historical novel, The Bastonnais (1877); James MacPherson LeMoine, author of Maple Leaves (6 vols, 1863-1906) and other works on Quebec history and folklore and a close friend of William Kirby; William Kirby, author of The Golden Dog (1877); and the poet, Charles Sangster. The most prominent female members of this literary community (women were not admitted to the Royal Society) were Agnes Maule Machar ("Fidelis"), who wrote several novels and contributed fiction, essays and literary criticism to the Canadian Monthly and The Week; Ethelwyn Wetherald, a poet who co-authored An Algonquin Maiden (1887) and wrote literary criticism for The Week; and Sara Jeannette Duncan, whose radical literary opinions and exuberant wit enlivened the pages of The Week, the Toronto Globe and the Montreal Daily Star. Prominent among the publishers who wished to encourage a national literature and publishing industry were John Lovell (Montreal), Samuel E. Dawson (Montreal), Graeme Mercer Adam, Belford Brothers (Toronto), Hunter, Rose & Co. (Toronto), and William Briggs (Toronto).²⁶

Despite individual variations in literary taste, these people and their colleagues formed a coherent nationalistic and generally

conservative intellectual community quite devoted to encouraging a distinctive Canadian literature. But even the most sincere dedication could not overcome the obstacles to a vital national literature which were posed by the weaknesses of Canadian writers, repressive copyright laws, the demands of international literary markets, geographical disunity and general cultural apathy. The optimism generated by Confederation was soon dispelled by the economic depression of 1876, which affected Canadian cultural life by causing the bankruptcy of Adam, Stevenson & Co. in 1876, the ruin of the American branch of Lovell's firm in 1877, the demise of the New Dominion Monthly Magazine in 1878, and forced the merging of the Canadian Monthly with Belford's Magazine in 1878. By the 1880's it appeared to contemporary observers that the economic depression was accompanied by a general cultural depression. To many critics, who tried to protect their country's vulnerability by overlooking its hostility towards the arts and the incompetence of many of its writers, the most obvious single villain was the Imperial Copyright Law of 1847. This law was frequently and vociferously attacked by Graeme Mercer Adam and others because "the anomalous state of our copyright law represses all native publishing enterprise, and retards the development of an industry which would have much to do with the educational and intellectual advancement of the country, were the trade relieved from the disabilities that now trammel it."²⁷

One of the main functions of the copyright law was to forbid

the reprinting of British books in the colonies, while allowing the importation of American reprints into Canada under a duty of 12½%. At the time it was imposed the law seemed to satisfy Canada's demand for cheap editions of British books while protecting the rights of the authors. But its long-term effects proved disastrous for the Canadian publishing industry and Canadian writers. Because no copyright agreement existed between Britain and the United States, Canadian books were easily pirated by American publishers. In effect the law provided more protection for American writers than for Canadians, since

an American author, by establishing temporary residence in Canada and then sending a few advance copies of his latest book to England for "first publication," could obtain full protection under the Imperial Act against the reprinting of his work in Canada. A Canadian author's copyright in Great Britain, however, was forfeited if the original form of publication in Canada was deemed to be inferior to British standards.²⁸

Until 1911 the Canadian government was powerless to make other than minor changes in the law, and during the second half of the nineteenth century the effect of the Imperial Copyright Law was, as Graeme Mercer Adam put it, to "surrender the native book-market to the American publisher."²⁹ To obtain adequate copyright protection, Canadian writers had to publish in the United States or England. Deprived of the lucrative reprint industry and deserted by Canadian writers, Canadian publishers depended for survival upon utilitarian items like school texts, directories, church materials and almanacs.

Several clever publishers managed to manoeuvre around the

law. Belford Bros. retaliated for a time by printing pirated editions of Mark Twain's works and selling them in the United States below American prices, and John Lovell circumvented it by

setting up a printing plant at Rouses Point, New York, close to the Canadian border. By the extraordinary stratagem of having his books printed in the U.S.A. and then sending advance copies to London for "first publication" Lovell (like all American publishers) was able to reap the benefits of Imperial Copyright, or by paying 12½% duty he could import and sell in Canada his own reprints of British authors.³⁰

Unfortunately this ingenious procedure backfired when Lovell's American branch went bankrupt in 1877 without having properly registered the copyright for William Kirby's The Golden Dog. When the plates fell into American hands, Kirby never obtained his due rights and lost his royalties, the power to control editions of the text, and the inclination to venture further into the treacherous arena of Canadian fiction.³¹

In addition to unfavourable copyright laws, Canadian writers had to contend with a small and unreceptive home market. As Goldwin Smith viewed the situation in 1894, Canada's poor literary showing was caused by adverse economic and geographical circumstances combined with the pragmatic attitude of its citizens:

A writer in Ontario has hardly any field outside his own Province. Quebec, saving the British quarter of Montreal and the British remnant in Quebec city, affords him none. There is very little chance of his reaching beyond Quebec to the Maritime Provinces. On the other side neither Manitoba nor the Territories have as yet much of a reading public, and British Columbia is in another world. Ontario is his sole constituency, and Ontario is a farming Province with little over two millions of people; while among the wealthy class

reading is not very much the fashion nor are libraries very often seen.

Moreover, a writer with any chance of success would obviously head for greener pastures:

A writer of mark appearing in Ontario, still more one appearing in any of the minor Provinces, would seek the larger market of England, that of the United States, or both. For the English market publication in a colony is a great disadvantage. From the American market the Canadian writer is practically excluded unless he publishes in the United States, since he cannot have American copyright if he prints here.³²

After about 1875 most cultural critics regretfully noted Canada's limited literary achievement, but like Goldwin Smith few were able to find specific causes apart from the obvious problems of copyright and a small population preoccupied with its material welfare. In 1875 James Douglas, Jr., President of the Literary and Historical Society of Quebec, was forced to acknowledge the fallacy of the popular assumption that material progress would bring about cultural progress. Addressing the Society on "The Intellectual Progress of Canada during the Last Fifty Years, and the Present State of its Literature," Douglas concluded that "our intellectual acquirements have not kept pace with the growth in material wealth of our country."³³ A similar tone of disappointment coloured The Week's 1892 review of Rolf Boldrewood's Nevermore, in which the writer enviously declared, "Would that Canada could produce a novelist who could impart to our literature the distinction which this able author has given to that of our sister colony, Australia."³⁴

Several articles published in The Week in the 1880's reveal that Graeme Mercer Adam and Sara Jeannette Duncan -- whose opinions regarding the acceptable forms and functions of literature differed considerably -- found themselves in occasional agreement regarding Canada's apparent indifference towards its cultural development. According to Duncan, the reasons why "We are still an eminently unliterary people" originated in the country's colonial status and attitude:

A spirit of depreciation of such faint stirrings of literary life as we have amongst us at present has often been remarked in Canadians, a tendency to nip forth-putting buds by contemptuous comparison with the full-blown production of other lands, where conditions are more favourable to literary efflorescence. This is a distinctly colonial trait; and in our character as colonists we find the root of all our sins of omission in letters.³⁵

But Duncan also warned against fostering a colonial attitude which enthusiastically greeted all native literary productions without applying any standards of literary quality:

Our colonial status, our comparative poverty, our youth, are allowed to plead for us when they all should be silent. We hear too often "It is very well, considering." Let it be very well, absolutely, not relatively, or let it not be at all -- at least let us not hear about it. Judgment is not passed on our cattle or our wheat with charity, nor payment made for them with liberality because they are "really better than might be expected," and the feeble efforts of a country three hundred years old ought to be "encouraged." Neither should criticism of our books be made on that principle. Our tendency to overpraise our own productions and to listen complacently while the Spectator or the Athenaeum chucks us patronizingly under the chin and compliments us for learning our A.B.C.'s is working the destruction of a national literature, and instead of being fostered should be sternly repressed.³⁶

In this call for literary standards Duncan was replying to Graeme Mercer Adam, who attributed Canada's literary poverty solely to copyright difficulties and the country's lack of national spirit. In The Week, Adam attacked Canada's unreceptive literary attitude in a series of articles appropriately titled "An Interregnum in Literature,"³⁷ "Native Literature and the Scoffing spirit,"³⁸ "Nationalism and the Literary Spirit,"³⁹ and "Literature, Nationality and the Tariff."⁴⁰ In his 1889 analysis of "Retarding Influences on Canadian Literature" Adam assailed Canada's literary sluggishness by attempting to awaken a sense of national identity and pride:

Literature, unhappily, has had more to contend with in making way in Canada than colonialism and the indifference of a people absorbed in the struggle for material gains. Not only has there been in some prominent quarters a lack of sympathy with the aims and achievements of native writers, but a spirit of detraction has frequently displayed itself in referring to the product of the Canadian intellect, and a Philistine repudiation that any literary good has come or can soon come out of the Canadian Nazareth.⁴¹

The following year Adam hinted that Canada's inferior political position was responsible for its inferior literary situation when he commented that

the literature of dependency cannot have the qualities of strength or of flavour which characterize that of a nation. The history of colonies, it has been said, is seldom written and never read. The same, it is to be feared, is true of their literature.⁴²

In attributing Canada's literary problems to the country's subordinate political status Adam was in fact echoing the opinion of Goldwin Smith, who had asked in 1880,

What dependency ever had a literature? The whole history of mind shows us that there is a close connection between the intellectual fruitfulness of a nation and its general life. The stirrings of literary activity appeared in this country simultaneously with a faint beating of the pulse of nationality.⁴³

That Canada's weak literary performance and lack of cultural self-confidence derived from the country's "colonial condition"

was voiced again near the end of the century by John George

Bourinot:

Literary stimulus seems to be more or less wanting in a colony where there is in some quarters a want of self-confidence in ourselves and our institutions, arising from that sense of dependency and habit of imitation and borrowing from others that is a necessity of a colonial condition. The tendency of insufficient self-assertion is to cramp intellectual exertion. When we see in the Dominion generally less of that provincialism which means a narrowness of mental vision on the part of our literary aspirants, and prevents Canadian authors from reaching a larger audience in other countries, we shall rise superior to those weaknesses of our intellectual character which now impede our mental development, and shall be able to give larger scope to what original and imaginative genius may exist among our people.⁴⁴

The discouraging opinions of Bourinot, Smith, Adam and Duncan were not allowed to go unchallenged. In 1888, in the first volume of the Dominion Illustrated Weekly there appeared an article deploring the fact that

Some singular people are disposed to question the fact of this improvement [in Canadian letters] and one or two writers have been so venturesome as to deny that there was such a thing as Canadian literature at all. Of course there is no arguing with such people, no more than there is any use in heeding the croakers who are everlastingly belittling the material prosperity of this country, and the quality of its institutions. Indeed, one factor explains the other. Canadian literature

there is precisely because the country is doing well, giving the opportunity to the author to write and means to the reader to encourage the works of his countrymen. One thing is certain -- that we have done very well, in the past decade, and that the outlook for the future is specially bright.⁴⁵

By the end of the century it was evident that this bright future had faded without sparking great cultural vitality. In 1899 Robert Barr launched one of the bitterest attacks on Canadian cultural apathy ever to appear in print. A hack novelist and journalist, Barr was himself a prime example of what Adam had called the "literary exodus" of Canada's "brains and pens" and "hopes and hearts" to the larger and more hospitable literary markets of England and the United States.⁴⁶ Writing not in the sophisticated style of The Week (which was by then defunct), but in a blunt, down-to-earth manner appropriate to the more popular tone of the Canadian Magazine, Barr showed little mercy for Canadian Philistinism:

Apologists for the Dominion have said that life in Canada is strenuous; that there is the inevitable struggle in conquering a new country; that money is scarce and that books are not a necessity. Is this true? Is it lack of money that makes Canada so poor a book market? Or is it because Canadians are not a reading people? The bald truth is that Canada has the money, but would rather spend it on whiskey than on books. It prefers to inflame its stomach than inform its brain. . . . What chance has Canada, then, of raising à Sir Walter Scott? I maintain that she has but very little chance, because she won't pay the money, and money is the root of all literature. The new Sir Walter Scott is probably tramping the streets of Toronto to-day, looking vainly for something to do. But Toronto will recognize him when he comes back from New York or London, and will give him a dinner when he doesn't need it.⁴⁷

Barr's anger aroused the sympathies of Walter James Brown, who attributed Canada's cultural stagnation to its history of "intense conservatism." In the last year of the nineteenth century Brown informed his fellow Canadians that "We should cease to bind our minds with the casings of antiquity, we should cut loose from prejudice, narrowness and provincialism, and become alive to the demands and opportunities of our country and our time."⁴⁸

During the nineteenth century, cultural critics usually identified the obstacles to Canada's literary development as the country's pioneer and colonial condition, the difficulties imposed by copyright laws, and cultural apathy partly due to a necessary preoccupation with material progress. Astute observers like Sara Jeannette Duncan and John George Bourinot arrived at judgments close to a mid-twentieth-century point of view when they decried their country's provincialism and lack of literary standards. While these impediments affected all forms of artistic endeavour, the critic who examines nineteenth-century periodicals will discover that the growth of the Canadian novel was hindered by two additional problems. These problems surface in most of the fiction and criticism of fiction written in Victorian Canada, although their importance was seldom elaborated by nineteenth-century commentators who usually looked for external reasons, like copyright and economics, to explain Canada's difficulty in establishing a national voice in fiction. Imbedded within Canada's social consciousness and colonial viewpoint were widespread

suspicion of the validity of fiction as a literary mode, and an undercurrent of doubt regarding the validity of Canada as a location for fiction. Victorian Canada's failure to produce more than a small handful of novelists and short story writers whose work rises above the level of mediocre market literature was due not just to the limited talents of those Canadians who did attempt to write prose fiction, but also to internal cultural attitudes which regarded the novel as an inferior form of literature and discouraged serious innovation. Before writers could begin to establish the Canadian novel as a significant literary venture, they had to overcome the prejudices which they shared with their community. With a few important exceptions, nineteenth-century Canadians did not want their fiction to aim above the level of entertaining popular romance, and questioned whether Canada, as a new country, could possibly equal the Old World as a location for this kind of literature.

NOTES TO CHAPTER I

¹ Thomas D'Arcy McGee, "Protection for Canadian Literature," The New Era, 24 April 1858.

² Rev. Hartley Dewart, "Introductory Essay," Selections from Canadian Poets (Montreal: Lovell, 1864), p. ix.

³ John Gibson, "To Our Readers," LG, 2 (Dec. 1839), 3.

⁴ John George Bourinot, The Intellectual Development of the Canadian People (Toronto: Hunter Rose, 1881), pp. 125-26.

⁵ "Preface," The Maple Leaf, or Canadian Annual. A Literary Souvenir for 1847 (Toronto: Henry Rowsell, 1847), n.pag.

⁶ "To the Public," Victoria Magazine, 1 (Sept. 1847), 2.

⁷ Mrs. Holiwell, "The Love of Reading," BAM, 2 (Jan. 1864), 271.

⁸ John Richardson, petition to Baron Sydenham. n.d., arrd. 20 July 1841. Papers of the Governor General's Secretary, Vol. 4, PAC.

⁹ "The Editor's Address to the Public," Canadian Literary Magazine, 1 (April 1833), 1-2.

¹⁰ Susanna Moodie, "Introduction" to Mark Hurdlestone (1853; rpt. in Life in the Clearings, Toronto: Macmillan, 1959), p. 289.

¹¹ "Editor's Shanty," AAM, 1 (July 1852), 67.

¹² "Introduction to the New Series of the Garland," LG, n.s. 1 (Jan. 1843), 2.

¹³ See Susanna Moodie, "Introduction" to "The Miser and his Son," LG, 4 (June 1842), 319.

¹⁴ Moodie, Life in the Clearings (1853; rpt. Toronto: Macmillan, 1959), p. 44.

¹⁵ Moodie, "Introduction" to Mark Hurdlestone, p. 292.

¹⁶ John Richardson, Eight Years in Canada (Montreal: H. H. Cunningham, 1847), p. 92.

¹⁷ John Richardson, Wacousta (New York: DeWitt & Davenport, 1851), p. vii.

¹⁸ "The Literature of a New Country," Monthly Review, 1 (Jan. 1841), 56.

¹⁹ Lawrence S. Fallis, "The Idea of Progress in the Province of Canada," in The Shield of Achilles, ed. W. L. Morton (Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 1968), p. 170. Henry J. Morgan's "Introductory Remarks" to his Bibliotheca Canadensis (Ottawa: Desbarats, 1867) epitomize Confederation enthusiasm regarding Canada's literary potential.

²⁰ Dewart, Selections from Canadian Poets, p. x.

²¹ Graeme Mercer Adam, "Notes of the Season," Canada Book-seller, March 1865, p. 1.

²² Graeme Mercer Adam, "The Approaching Book Season," Canada Bookseller, n.s. 2 (Oct. 1872), 25.

²³ "Justice to Canadian Authors," CIN, 15 (24 Feb. 1877), 114.

²⁴ Sara Jeannette Duncan, "Saunterings," The Week, 4 (20 Jan. 1887), 120.

²⁵ Norah Story, The Oxford Companion to Canadian History and Literature (Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1967), p. 770.

²⁶ For more details regarding the history of Canadian publishing, see the work of H. Pearson Gundy: Book Publishing and Publishers in Canada Before 1900 (Toronto: Bibliographical Society of Canada, 1965); "Literary Publishing" in Literary History of Canada, ed. Carl F. Klinck, (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1967), pp. 174-88.

²⁷ Graeme Mercer Adam, "The Copyright Law," Canada Bookseller, n.s. 1 (Feb. 1872), 17.

²⁸ Gundy, "Literary Publishing," Literary History of Canada, pp. 183-84.

²⁹ Adam, "An Interregnum in Literature," The Week, 1 (12 June 1884), 439.

³⁰ Gundy, Book Publishing and Publishers in Canada Before 1900, p. 21.

³¹ For details of Kirby's copyright difficulties see Lorne Pierce, William Kirby: The Portrait of a Tory Loyalist (Toronto: Macmillan, 1929); Wm. Kirby, Rep., "Brief of the Publication of William Kirby's Novel 'Le Chien D'Or' (The Golden Dog) to Dr. Lorne Pierce." Unpublished manuscript in the Metropolitan Toronto Central Library.

³² Goldwin Smith, "What is the Matter with Canadian Literature?" The Week, 11 (31 Aug. 1894), 950.

³³ James Douglas, Jr., "The Intellectual Progress of Canada during the Last Fifty Years, and the Present State of its Literature," Transactions of the Literary and Historical Society of Quebec, n.s. no. 11 (1873-75), p. 83.

³⁴ The Week, 9 (15 July 1892), 524.

³⁵ Sara Jeannette Duncan, "Saunterings," The Week, 3 (30 Sept. 1886), 707-08.

³⁶ Sara Jeannette Duncan ("Garth Grafton"), "Bric à Brac," Montreal Daily Star, 31 Jan. 1888, p. 2.

³⁷ The Week, 1 (12 June 1884), 438-39.

³⁸ The Week, 5 (5 Jan. 1888), 85-86.

³⁹ The Week, 5 (19 Jan. 1888), 118-19.

⁴⁰ The Week, 7 (27 Dec. 1889), 59-60.

⁴¹ The Week, 6 (25 Jan. 1889), 120.

⁴² "Canadian Literature," The Week, 8 (4 July 1890), 486.

⁴³ Goldwin Smith, Bystander, 1 (Jan. 1880), 55.

⁴⁴ J. G. Bourinot, "Views on Canadian Literature," The Week, 11 (16 March 1894), 368.

⁴⁵ "Canadian Letters," DI, 1 (21 July 1888), 343-5.

⁴⁶ Graeme Mercer Adam, "Literature, Nationality and the Tariff," The Week, 7 (27 Dec. 1889), 59.

⁴⁷ Robert Barr, "Literature in Canada," CM, 14 (Nov. 1899), 4-5.

⁴⁸ Walter James Brown, "Robert Barr and Literature in Canada," CM, 15 (June 1900), 173.

CHAPTER II

THE VALIDITY OF FICTION

During the nineteenth century, Canadian criticism of prose fiction reflected many of the disputes which earlier in England had accompanied the novel's struggle for acceptance as a valid literary form. In the mother country arguments against the novel were many. As a relative newcomer to the literary arena, it lacked the sanction of classical precedent. As a species of fictional creativity, it frequently aroused the suspicions of the growing middle classes whose utilitarian, evangelical bias encouraged distrust of imaginative self-indulgence. When the size of the reading public dramatically expanded at the end of the eighteenth century and the beginning of the nineteenth, the resulting rift between serious and popular literature increased the popular novel's reputation as a debased literary form.

In Victorian Canada, the country's intellectual leaders were familiar with the common arguments for and against the novel. On the whole they echoed their British predecessors, transferring to a Canadian context the disputes documented by John Tinnon Taylor in his study of Early Opposition to the English Novel.¹

Canadian literary criticism reveals a spectrum of attitudes (all tinted conservative) varying from absolute abhorrence of the novel, to restrained attraction to it, to qualified justification of prose fiction as a vehicle for moral education or as a pleasing means to "while away an idle hour, or fill up the blanks of a wet day."² Unlike Britain, Canada contained no balancing body of enlightened critics and readers to foster great, innovative novelists. Canadian critics acknowledged the tremendous power of prose fiction to seize the imagination, arouse the emotions, and consciously or subconsciously persuade the reader. They dreaded the abuse of this power by unscrupulous writers, and dolefully warned against the detrimental effects of addiction to novel-reading upon the morals and industry of an infant nation. Arguments for and against popular fiction focussed on its usefulness for moral and factual education, its role in developing a national culture, and its value as earned relaxation. Within this generally conservative framework there occurred many variations of opinion as critics and editors defined moral and entertainment values in different ways, and occasionally expressed quite divergent views about certain books or authors.

From a chronological point of view the arguments for and against prose fiction changed to a certain extent during the nineteenth century, but in Central Canada and the Maritimes there remained constant a stream of educated and influential critics who excluded the novel from the higher realms of literature.

In 1824, the Canadian Review and Literary and Historical Journal defined literature as "the study and knowledge of the languages, of Poetry, of History, and of Philosophy."³ Through the remainder of the century those with conservative literary tastes continued to limit "literature" to philosophy, poetry and history. In 1848 W.P.C., a frequent contributor to the Literary Garland, announced that "History is the highest and noblest species of literature."⁴ The Provincial, or Halifax Monthly Magazine allowed science and philosophy to join history when it remarked:

Like the fruit and lighter matters at dinner, a romance is occasionally acceptable; but as solids are necessary to man's physical strength, in as great a degree does his intellectual system require good literary food -- a course of study calculated to interest and strengthen the mind, such as is afforded by science, history, or philosophy, but never by the contents of a baseless novel.⁵

As late as 1894 this disparagement of fiction was perpetuated by ~~Charles~~ Charles Mair, who opened a discussion of Canadian literature by declaring that "By the term Literature you mean, of course, poetry."⁶ In the opening paragraph of his Headwaters of Canadian Literature (1924), one of the first twentieth-century critical histories of Canadian writing, Archibald MacMechan followed Mair by defining literature as "poetry in all its branches."⁷

This restrictive point of view may have originated in Canada's eighteenth century heritage. One of its earliest expressions appeared in 1790, when the Nova Scotia Magazine observed of Charlotte Smith's Ethelinde (1788?) that

to wade through five copious volumes of fictitious, and sometimes improbably narrative, neither animated with any moral, nor glowing with sentiment, is a toil which is not compensated by any beauties of language or rewarded by any varieties of character, or pictures of fashionable dissipation. Improvement is the object of every sensible reader; and where this is not to be expected, the contemplative mind, however spurred on by curiosity, will not be much delighted with a romantic tale and long-drawn scenes of distress, which, however they rouse the passions, neither meliorate the heart nor increase the stores of knowledge.⁸

Disapproval of fiction was carried into the nineteenth century in the Canadian Review and Literary and Historical Journal's notice of Julia Catherine Beckwith Hart's St. Ursula's Convent (1824). The first novel by a native Canadian, its reception indicates the kind of literature critics wanted to encourage in the Canadas. David Chisholme, editor of the Canadian Review, had previously announced in the Canadian Magazine and Literary Repository his preference for "the substantial realities of a virtuous education, of prudent habits, and useful learning to the evanescent colourings of modern polite literature."⁹ In the Canadian Review Chisholme candidly admitted that he had bothered with St. Ursula's Convent only because it was "the first native novel that ever appeared in Canada."¹⁰ While he acknowledged that fiction was "the most alluring of all species of composition," he refused to accord it any lasting value:

We must, in the first place premise, that we have not yet arrived at a satisfactory conviction of the utility of novel writing, especially of those light, amatory, and romantic tales which, under this title are daily issuing from the press . . . and that until that is the case, we cannot help thinking, that the genius and talents

of young writers, of both sexes, might be applied to much greater advantage to themselves and others in commencing their labours, by pursuing some more serious and important course in literature than fiction.¹¹

Chisholme conceded that fiction could be acceptable and even useful if it was "made subservient to the highest sentiments of morality and virtue." But he wondered what attraction fiction held when all that was truly valuable was to be found in abundance in the real world:

In the actual occurrences of life there is a natural beauty, as well as a moral principle which the invention of the highest genius can never equal; and in reflecting upon them, a feeling and generous mind, is often struck with awe and veneration at the happy or unfortunate results to which they lead in human affairs. As the recollection of these are as useful and important for the preservation of social and patriotic feelings, as the worshipping of their household gods by the ancients, we could wish that all young persons aspiring to the enviable rank of authorship, instead of distracting their minds for the purpose of drawing an unnatural and insipid picture of humanity by means of a tale of fancy in the form of a novel, would apply themselves with assiduity to collect the scattered fragments of what may have happened in real life, and by combining them with those scenes of rural beauty of which nature has, almost, in every country, been so profuse, present them to our view in the unassuming garb of facts, which must inevitably lead to some moral deduction.¹²

Out of his preference for fact Chisholme advised Miss Beckwith to turn to history, and he concluded his review by offering to send her a copy of the "History of the British American Colonies."¹³

Not all critics shared Chisholme's views, for at least one pre-Victorian Canadian journal was willing to recognize the legitimacy of imaginative prose fiction so long as it contained "beauty and philosophy, and historical information, and natural

truth." In 1830, presumably with Walter Scott in mind, the Halifax Monthly Magazine distinguished between the gothic romance of the past and the realistic novel of the present, condemning the former but praising the latter:

The Novels generally of a former century were written evidently for the thoughtless and the idle: their intent was by uncommon and striking incidents to create mere excitement -- and they were for the most part monotonously bombastic -- filled with exaggerated pictures, and froathy sentiments, and producing in the minds of their readers, a worthless dream-like enjoyment, from which no lasting good of any kind was derived; and which generally added to the vapour and pomposity of the reader's character. Modern Novels on the contrary, address themselves to the most literary and polished of the human family; their chance of success depends on their truth to nature -- on the information which is blended with amusement in their pages, and on the strength and beauty of their composition. Some of the brightest names in the literary annals of the world, have been identified with these comparatively light works; and the best of them exhibit a chain of occurrences which in all probability have passed, and are passing in the great theatre of life -- and exhibit them with as much vigour and beauty as if the powerful minds of their authors had borne a part in the scene.¹⁴

Writers interested in the education of the young were especially concerned about the value of fiction. While they concurred in defining education as the fostering of morality and reason, and advocated a factual, rational approach to the real world, they differed significantly regarding the role of the imagination in the intellectual development of the child. Overtly didactic tales like those by Susanna Moodie and Catharine Parr Traill were generally the most acceptable form of children's literature because they contained a clear moral structure. But in 1827 I. of Colchester, writing in the Acadian Magazine, advocated

unusual leeway in children's reading. While he assumed that the ultimate goal of literary education was "imagination brought under subjection to reason and rendered submissive to its direction," he also appreciated the fact that children generally prefer fairy tales to "historical facts and logical inductions." Hence he argued that

The recital of such tales, or their perusal, undoubtedly is to the young mind what light food is to the young body: -- it imperceptibly prepares it to receive, and induces it to relish, what is stronger and more nutritious That such tales recited or read, engender in the young mind a dislike to truth and wholesome nutriment, is essentially erroneous: -- they foster the imagination, and feed it with itself, till the gradual development of reason impel it to seek for more solid matter.¹⁵

Because this educational theorist enjoyed an eighteenth-century trust in the natural power of right reason and assumed that the properly educated child would normally discard the fictional world as he matured, he even allowed children unexpurgated editions of the ancient and modern classics. But only the classics -- for he eventually cautioned that

in leaving youth the liberty of choice I would not be understood as recommending an indiscriminate Library -- a "Candide" by the side of a "Rasselas," a "Purcellle" by the side of "The Exiles of Siberia," or a "Don Juan" by "The White Doe." Works evidently pernicious and immoral, however recommended by genius, are in no wise defensible, -- can in no wise conduce to any salutary end.¹⁶

Despite the prudish tone of his concluding remarks, I.'s approach to imaginative literature was distinctly more liberal than that taken twenty-five years later by Robert W. Lay, editor

of the Maple Leaf, a magazine for children produced in Montreal in 1852 and 1853. Although this periodical did publish fiction, including extracts from Uncle Tom's Cabin and didactic tales, Mr. Lay continually cautioned against literature dealing with "the unreal":

Fictitious writings have long flooded the country. The Magazines, and works in other forms, now in circulation in which this branch of literature is handled in a masterly style, amount almost to legion. Certainly, those whose palate is not satisfied with the true and substantial, can obtain a surfeit from them. There is so much information of the most enticing character, so many interesting things really existing which we can collect, collate and write about, and make a magazine of this size valuable, that we do not wish to enter much upon the unreal.¹⁷

When he began to serialize Catharine Parr Traill's "The Governor's Daughter,"¹⁸ which is less a novel than a series of nature lessons related in a fictional framework, Mr. Lay felt compelled to justify himself in italics:

It is not intended to introduce thrilling descriptions of imaginary adventures, or a history of wonderful characters living in an ideal world, far above the stern realities of life; but we wish and intend to develop the Natural History of this country, in a faithful and pleasing manner. Although our Magazine is -- necessarily for the price -- but small, yet we sincerely hope that it may prove a Key to a storehouse of information far more useful, even more interesting than the fictitious works of Bulwer or James. "Truth is stranger than fiction," is a proverb in common use; and really there is so much of the true and substantial, so much information of the most enticing character, so many things existing to write about, that we deem it worse than folly to enter much upon the unreal.¹⁹

Catharine Parr Traill herself inclined much less towards fiction than did her younger sister. Traill relates that because

she preferred factual and practical literature, she became extremely bored during her voyage to Canada in a ship whose library was "unfortunately . . . chiefly made up with old novels and musty romances."²⁰ In addition to writing juvenile stories primarily concerned with factual information and moral precept, and frequently documenting the factual sources for her occasional ventures into fiction, Mrs. Traill warned that children allowed a steady diet of fiction suffer because "superstition, credulity and a love of falsehood are by degrees established in the infant mind."²¹

Traill's point of view found a supporter in Henry Youle Hind, a prominent geologist, geographer and professor of chemistry who edited the Canadian Journal: A Repertory of Industry, Science and Art (1852-1888). In his introduction to the first number of the Journal, Hind argued that "the habit of reading for amusement alone" destroyed the superior abilities of the mind:

Until parents and teachers set themselves more strongly against this habit, not only for the injury it frequently does to the moral strength of the young, but still more universally, its destruction to the intellect, there will continue to be a waste of the best faculties, and distaste for the most rational and elevating pursuits.²²

This distrust of the imaginative world per se and relegation of the reading and writing of fiction to a position well beneath that held by other intellectual activities persisted into the last decades of the nineteenth century. That the novel was valuable only insofar as it participated in other areas like politics and philosophy was implied by Goldwin Smith's 1880 remark that in

his journal, the Bystander, books would be judged "not as literary works, but as events and landmarks in the history of opinion."²³

In 1878 J. L. Stewart, writing about George Eliot in Belford's Monthly Magazine, hailed the advent of the psychological novel because it finally raised fictitious literature to the level of "science, philosophy and theology."²⁴ And John George Bourinot, who wrote several important assessments of Canada's cultural standing, considered the novel markedly inferior to the more factual discipline of history. In Our Intellectual Strength and Weakness (1893), he at first appeared to encourage prose fiction when he stated that "I do not for one deprecate the influence of good fiction on the minds of a reading community like ours." But he then proceeded to discuss the novel in qualifying and pejorative language which reveals a bias very much against imaginative literature. He described the novel as "a necessity of the times in which we live," especially suited to "women distracted with household cares," and hoped that Canadian writers would not

bring the Canadian fiction of the future to that low level to which the school of realism in France, and in a minor degree in England and the United States, would degrade the novel and story of every-day life. To my mind it goes without saying that a history written with that fidelity to original authorities, that picturesqueness of narration, that philosophic insight into the motives and plans of statesmen, that study and comprehension of the character and life of a people, which should constitute the features of a great work of this class, -- that such a history has assuredly a much deeper and more useful purpose in the culture and education of the world than any work of fiction can possibly have even when animated by lofty genius.²⁵

Because of this prevailing doubt regarding the ultimate value of prose fiction, despite its obvious appeal to much of the literate public, many literary periodicals found themselves in an ambiguous position. Journals whose emphasis was primarily informational or political, like the Canadian Monthly and National Review (1872-78), easily justified the inclusion of some fictitious literary material as part of their purpose to foster a national culture or as lighter diversion from their more serious articles. But periodicals which published large amounts of prose fiction, like the Literary Garland (1838-51), felt called upon to vindicate their presence, their contents, and where applicable, their financial success. In the case of the Garland this was accomplished through annual editorial addresses declaring that the growth of polite literature aided in refining the morals and manners of the new country, and by publishing articles and book reviews in which the boundaries of acceptable prose fiction were carefully defined. Ironically, some of the Garland's items, such as J. P.'s 1850 piece on "Novels and Novel Readers," arrived at conclusions questioning the nature of the Garland itself:

although we admit that novels may be made the instruments of good, and that there are many both amusing and instructive, yet we would remind the reader, that nature is a higher and purer field, for the exercise and enlightenment of the mind. We are constrained to do this, from a conviction that fiction is a little too much sought after now-a-days. Science, except to a few, is still a closed book; the many still think it to be a comparatively uninteresting accumulation of facts; they shun it as they would an unpleasant task, and run to fiction for amusement. But this is a mistaken idea. There is far more real poetry in science than in fiction.²⁶

In the same volume, Rev. Henry Giles warned that

Constant indulgence in fiction weakens both mind and motive, it incapacitates the one for thought, and the other for action. It surrounds the life of its victim with an atmosphere of unreality, and it puts within it a fountain of uneasy desire. . . . Useful and sober studies are not simply neglected, they are loathed. . . . We get so habituated to the landscapes of romances that in these only we luxuriate, and we turn from the actual to rejoice in a fanciful creation.²⁷

To counteract the debilitating effects of fiction, the Garland continually reminded novelists of

the obligation under which an author rests to his readers, that in furnishing them with amusement for an idle hour, he should not only avoid presenting to them language, which it might be beneficial to forget, and ideas or characters which it would be pernicious to emulate; but that, on the contrary, he should endeavour to entwine the fictitious and real portions of his subject in such a manner, that many, who have only commenced its perusal for the purpose of acquiring some useful information, or banishing a tedious hour, may have a pleasing recollection of its most striking passages.²⁸

The Garland's editorial commentators invariably assumed that the reading of prose fiction was to be treated as a secondary activity. In one of the magazine's first discussions of literature, which enthusiastically anticipated the proposed republication of Wacousta (1833), John Richardson's novel was recommended as

a never failing source of pleasurable excitement, when the reader would be relieved from graver studies, which, being too assiduously followed, disease the mind as much as the want of exercise debilitates the body. The spoiled children of fortune, whose only business is pleasure, may command in it an inexhaustible fountain of enjoyment, and the general reader will find from its perusal, that no author has ever more efficiently attained one of the principal objects of a novel writer --

the delightful employment of an idle hour -- than
the author of "Wacousta, or The Prophecy."²⁹

The Garland felt that prose fiction had to be condescendingly treated as "amusement for an idle hour," allowable only after the pursuit of "graver studies," precisely because it recognized the pleasures of the imaginative world. In nineteenth-century Canadian literary criticism it was generally taken for granted that while there was a distinct and obvious separation between the "real" everyday world and the "unreal" world of literary experience, the unreal world possessed extraordinary power to influence the real world. To be acceptable, a novel had at best to promise to improve the real world, and at worst promise to do no harm.³⁰ Judged unadmissible were all novels whose effects could be pernicious for one of two reasons -- either because through their plots they forced the reader to sympathize with characters or activities which would be reprehensible in real life, or because their style could arouse sentiments and desires which would incapacitate the reader to function usefully in the real world. The problem of the relationship between literature, imagination and ordinary life goes back at least to Plato. A conflict between literary representations of reality and life itself has accompanied the novel ever since Don Quixote set out to try to put into practice the ideals and events of literary romance. But the subject that Cervantes treated rather humorously Victorian Canadians usually regarded as a matter for solemn concern. Most novel readers were treated as simple-minded innocents, easily misguided and corrupted

by the wrong sort of literature. Hence almost every discussion of the novel included admonitions against books designed "to gratify some particular passion or fancy."³¹ Reading merely for self-gratification encouraged egotism; as the Canadian Literary Magazine cautioned in an article appropriately titled "The Effects of Literary Cultivation on Morals,"

In the bosom of him who neglects every other pursuit in his love of books, the streams of humanity, benevolence, and charity are dried up; the feelings of affection and sympathy in the joys and sorrows of his fellow mortals are banished from his heart; and, in short, every virtue included under piety to God, and love to man, is totally neglected and contemned.³²

This article then defined the literary attitude which would properly benefit the reader and society as a quest for both aesthetic and moral enlightenment:

By literary cultivation we mean, not merely a fondness of reading, or a taste for works of imagination, and polite literature in general, but that enlightened state of mind, which is the result of almost every literary pursuit united with an ardent desire to seek after and obtain the truth: and a love of every sentiment, and thought that pleases the understanding by its novelty or beauty, and that interests the heart, by the association which it calls forth. Upon examination, we shall find that the natural effect of such a disposition of mind is the establishment of good moral principles in the heart. . . . He who is fond of employing his mind in this way, will at least lead an innocent life. By constantly exercising his reason, his passions are by degrees reduced into subjection, and his head and heart keep pace with each other in improvement.³³

Equally concerned with the government of the passions by the exercise of reason was Henry Giles, who pointed out in the Garland in 1850 that one of the gravest abuses of fiction was to use

its "fascinating eloquence" to create "exalted sensualism -- associated as such sensualism ever is with a concentrative egotism Desire is raised from the low station which the moral reason gives it to a dangerous aristocracy in which the sensual imagination rules."³⁴ As M. W. C. ominously warned in The Harp in 1879, the victims of popular fiction fail to discover their addiction in time to save their souls:

Readers of "flash" literature are sure "the stuff won't hurt them." Beginners in dissipation find only agreeable sensations, which lure them on. Through the vistas of pleasure, they trace their thoughtless steps until they find themselves lost in the sombre depths of the abyss of ruin. Then the truth flashes upon them, but all too late. They cannot retrace their footsteps; they cannot escape their doom; they are lost!³⁵

Motivated by the same fear of corruption from bad literature, George Stewart Jr. founded Stewart's Literary Quarterly in 1867 to save the youth of New Brunswick from cheap American fiction:

The reading of "Dime Novels," and other books of that ilk, has wrought incalculable injury to many a bright and promising lad. Tales of bucanears, murderers, and highwaymen; of "fast young men," and "gay and festive gamblers," deaden the moral sensibilities -- familiarise the mind with crime and lead it on to moral ruin. It is true that there are no highwaymen now with mask and pistol, demanding "your money or your life!" nor blood-thirsty pirates, compelling unfortunate victims to "walk the plank!" -- but if your youth cannot find work of this kind to do there is something else for them: they can learn to drink and smoke and swear and swagger in the truest dime novel style, and become the heroes and haunters of bar and billiard rooms. That numbers have been ruined in the way indicated is beyond question, but how many, eternity only will reveal! It behoves everyone to use his influence to free his country from the vice breeding literature with which it is now flooded.³⁶

The New Dominion Monthly also predicted that young Canadians would suffer permanent moral and intellectual damage if the tide of dime novels was not stemmed:

The importance of placing in the hands of the young healthy reading matter cannot be overvalued. A child who is taught to read senseless literature only will grow up with an appetite formed on it, and incapable of digesting solid works. To many dime novels and other such trash is the only reading matter they care anything about, and its supply being regulated by the demand we see at nearly every store where books, pencils pens and paper are sold, a great preponderance of those abominations. If the child has put into his hands when young good reading matter, his taste for it increases, and he would no more waste his time in reading what is worthless than he would change a warm comfortable suit of clothes for a beggar's rags.³⁷

While this kind of rather hysterical denunciation of dime fiction appeared frequently in popular Canadian magazines, more erudite periodicals published sophisticated literary criticism which assessed the detrimental effects of fiction according to its ability to subvert reason through skillfully written appeals to the emotions. The Canadian Monthly maintained its usual thoughtful tone when its 1872 review of Wilfrid Cumberland praised George Macdonald for "a subtle and delicate fancy, high and pure aims, sensitiveness of the most ethereal order, and a graceful and nervous style." But at the same time the Monthly's innate conservatism surfaced when it warned that Macdonald's "seductive" "semi-inspired tone" masked dangerous ideas.³⁸

The Monthly's ability to perceive both the achievement and the failure of a particular novel appeared again a year later, when it reviewed The New Magdalen. It gave Wilkie Collins "full credit"

for enlisting "all the sympathies of the reader and spectator for an unfortunate woman," but cautioned that the structure of the story propounded the dubious moral that "it must be better to be sinful and unfortunate than unfortunate and sinless; it must be better to sin and confess than not to sin at all; and she who passes her life alternately sinning and confessing, must accumulate, if she live long, a vast amount of virtue."³⁹

Less sophisticated criticism, such as diatribes against dime fiction, assumed the existence of a very tangible connection between literature and life and evaluated novels according to the kinds of concrete examples they provided. J. G. Bourinot descended to this level when he discussed Du Maurier's Trilby in The Week, and advised that the heroine was "not a model for the maidens of Canada."⁴⁰ This attitude was common through most of the nineteenth century; forty-five years earlier, a writer in the Literary Garland had feared that fashionable sentimental novels would be mistaken for true pictures of life:

They instil false notions into the minds of the young, and create aspirations which can never be realized. They sometimes place humanity in a higher position than it really occupies; and at other times they represent the nature of man to be far worse than it really is. It is by reading such works that many render themselves unfit to perform their duties to society, and unable to bear the ills and the realities of life.⁴¹

The practice of including within novels characters who have rendered themselves "unfit to perform their duties to society, and unable to bear the ills and the realities of life" by mistaking

the extravagances of fiction for everyday life became a conventional part of the British reaction against the novel.⁴² Also fairly common in mid-nineteenth-century Canadian fiction are individuals like Jane Austen's Catherine Morland, Scott's Edward Waverley and Flaubert's Emma Bovary, whose education has consisted of reading for gratification and whose judgment is consequently impaired. The comic possibilities of this convention appeared in the person of Miss Laura Matilda Applegarth, a character in "The Purser's Cabin" column of the Anglo-American Magazine.

A backwoods Canadian female Quixote, she was

a devoted member of the sisterhood of novel readers, and as such profoundly tinctured with the essential oil of romance. For every thing in the shape of the common place or prosaic she entertained a generous contempt, and would rather have tramped barefooted through the world, with a knight errant of the orthodox olden school, than have submitted to the degradation of wedding an unpoetical agriculturalist, whose only crusades have been against the weeds which invaded his acres, or the foxes which depopulated his hen roosts!⁴³

The tragic potential of such misguidance was exploited by Rosanna Leprohon in two of her serialized novels, "The Stepmother" (1847) and "Ida Beresford" (1848), as well as in Antoinette de Mirecourt (1864). When innocent Antoinette is placed under the tutelage of Mrs. D'Aulnay, a woman whose moral sense has been corrupted by "novels, love-tales of the most reprehensible folly,"⁴⁴ she becomes involved in intrigues which nearly destroy her. Susanna Moodie found the convention appropriate to the didactic tone of "Jane Redgrave" (1848)⁴⁵ and Matrimonial Speculations (1854).⁴⁶

Two stereotyped female characters in two works by Agnes Maule Machar are also defined according to their literary tastes.

Lilias, the lovely heroine of "For King and Country" (1874), is an unspoiled rural maiden whose "mind had never been imbued with such sentimental ideas as most young ladies derive from novels."⁴⁷ In contrast, Lottie Wood, the shallow young lady wooed but not won by the hero of "Lost and Won" (1875), constantly reads "morbid sensational romances," which are "not only vapid and unprofitable, but positively pernicious, from their highly coloured and false views of life."⁴⁸

In the eyes of most nineteenth-century Canadian critics, the most reprehensible crime an author could commit was to depict vice and depravity. Novels which appeared to advocate immorality were universally condemned because they would "inflame unsteady and romantic young men with a brigandish furor."⁴⁹ In the Literary Garland, J. P. spoke for the Canadian cultural community at large when he lamented that

in some of the pages of Sue, Dumas and Ainsworth, and in most of those of Reynolds, Soulie and De Balsac . . . crime is represented in a couleur de rose, the criminal is decked in a species of heroism, and the hideous features in his character are partially, if not wholly, hid, by the dramatic manner in which they are portrayed.⁵⁰

This kind of "sensation" fiction universally aroused the ire of Canadian critics -- who lumped under the heading of "sensationalism" all they found offensive in the way of sensuality, criminality, revolution and irreligion. In the 1820's and 1830's the word

was often attached to gothic fiction, in Upper Canada when the Canadian Literary Magazine deplored the "spectre-mongering" of Monk Lewis⁵¹ and in Nova Scotia when "Senex" complained in the Acadian Magazine:

What is so popular now, as a German Tale of some supernatural mountain monster, who performs prodigies, in general ending fatally for the individual on whose behalf or on whose account they are wrought? or contracts with the devil, by disposing to him, of one's own shadow, reflection or personal appearance; -- signing with one's own blood, to follow his direction, in order to obtain some imaginary advantage? A true story excites little interest, with most readers of the present day.⁵²

Later in the century "sensationalism" referred to fiction concerned with sexuality, crime, class conflict, or religious unconventionality. The Anglo-American Magazine, for example, attacked G. W. M. Reynolds as a sensationalist, claiming that his "unvarying task" was to "minister to the coarsest and most depraved sensual appetites -- to inflame the poor against their richer brethren -- to demonstrate that aristocracy and guilt are synonymous terms -- and to sneer at every thing in the shape of revealed religion."⁵³ Tirades against sensational fiction increased in volume and vituperation as the century progressed. In the British Canadian Review (1863), "Casca" announced his preference for "the classic style of Clarissa Harlowe" over the "sensational paraphernalia of Sue or Dumas,"⁵⁴ and in 1869 a contributor to Stewart's Literary Quarterly remarked that

It is not a very easy matter, in this age of sensations, to horrify or even astonish the reading public; for,

thanks to Miss Braddon and her doubtfully successful imitators, our modern heroes are almost all murderers, adulterers or devils incarnate, our heroines Cleopatras, Helens of Troy and Beatrices de Cenci, or possibly Hecates, Scyllas and Astartes.⁵⁵

According to the Saturday Reader, the "mission" of sensation novels was to "supply morbid food to depraved appetites."⁵⁶

The literary policy of the Canadian Monthly and National Review was to "throw down the gauntlet to the sensation school of novelists."⁵⁷ Belford's feared that "the taste of the ordinary

novel-reader has become so vitiated with the sensational plots of the day" that he had lost his sense of literary artistry.⁵⁸

Even Sara Jeannette Duncan, the most radical Canadian critic of the 1880's, deplored the "cheap Coney Island realism" of the American sensational press.⁵⁹ Her opinion was shared by J. E.

Smith, who complained in 1889 that the sensational novel's

emotions are simulated, its characters have little vitality, its descriptions have the sort of resemblance to real life that a mask has to the human face; there is a likeness, but we are rather repelled by it than attracted. There is no writing that so depreciates the force and value of the word. . . . it is in describing emotion that [the author] works hardest and affects us least. Love, fear, hate, despair, remorse, penitence . . . he shrinks from nothing, and his characters go through an amount of mental and moral suffering that one feels sure only the toughest constitutions could survive in real life. And yet the strange part of it is we feel so little sympathy with them.⁶⁰

Canadian critics attacked overtly sensational fiction with great gusto. They discovered a more thorny problem in novels which depicted depravity in order to denounce it. In her preface to Honor Edgeworth, or, Ottawa's Present Tense (1882), Kate

Barry warned that when dealing with such literature,

the eye of the critic . . . must not hesitate to discern whether the motive has been merely to arouse emotional tendencies, by clothing life's dangerous forms in unreal fascinations, or (where the author's hand, guided by his unsullied heart, has taken up the quill as a mighty weapon) to preserve or defend the morals of his country.⁶¹

During the first year of its existence the Canadian Monthly voiced its suspicion of fiction which indulged in the very kind of sensationalism that its authors purported to condemn,⁶² and when the Monthly merged with Belford's to become Rose-Belford's Canadian Monthly the new magazine maintained this point of view.⁶³ In the 1870's these magazines expressed opinions already current in the 1840's and 1850's, when the Garland's J. P. declared that such novels should be proscribed because they "bring their readers among gamblers and murderers, forgers and highwaymen, and they instruct them in the secrets of their occupations, the peculiarities of their residences and a narration of their exploits."⁶⁴ With this judgment editorial opinion in the Garland concurred, in a review of G. P. R. James's Russel which began,

There is something so poisonous in the very atmosphere of vice, especially that of a sensual character, that we can hardly breathe in it without contamination. The delineation of it in all its odious and disgusting particulars, although accompanied with a detail of the ruinous consequences to which it inevitably leads, has a natural tendency to produce an effect the very opposite to that which the generality of the novel writers of the old school, and not a few of the present day, seem to have anticipated.⁶⁵

Despite its frequent dogmatism, the Garland was flexible enough to publish several articles which took the other side. Miss

Foster's 1848 defence of Jane Eyre argued against condemning a work as immoral because of the improbity of its "hero" without examining the larger moral situation,⁶⁶ and Susanna Moodie championed "our great modern novelists" who described social evil in order to campaign for reform.⁶⁷

In the 1880's Emile Zola provided a convenient focus for discussions of the boundaries and abuses of fiction. His works bewildered some of his detractors, since, as Goldwin Smith acknowledged, "They do not seem to be exactly obscene or even immoral; at least there is nothing in them calculated to inflame the passions."⁶⁸ Nonetheless Zola's novels did elicit some wonderfully colourful rhetoric from Canadian critics, such as Smith's assessment of L'Assomoir and Nana as "simply loathsome":

Go into the filthiest alley you can find in New York, pace slowly along it, observing intently each disgusting object, sniffing deliberately each foul smell, and you will have a good notion of "L'Assomoir" and "Nana." M. Zola's speciality as an artist seems to us to be his faculty of distinguishing all the elements of a composite stench and presenting each, with the delectable source of it, vividly to the reader's mind. People who have a taste for bathing in a cesspool, cannot be made dirtier by being allowed to do it.⁶⁹

In The Week Zola was variously designated "repulsive," "slimy," "foul and prurient," "debased," and "degraded." The Week's 1891 review of Zola's Money termed it a "dull and disgusting book," like "a photograph full of lecherous and greedy monkeys." At the same time Zola's style of realism was defined as

dulness with the superadditions of the odour of onions, whiffs from the sewer, smells of decayed vegetables,

marks of beer glasses on the tables, greasy table napkins, inane conversation, stupid ribaldry. No undegraded person with a nose, ears and eyes voluntarily lives in such an environment, or voluntarily reads one of Zola's books. They are the worst garbage of modern literature, wholly inartistic, essentially false as descriptions of life, and to be avoided not because of their immorality (for who can call putridity immoral?) but because they are emetic in an excessively nauseating way.⁷⁰

Despite this critic's assurance that he cannot find Zola's book "immoral," his vituperative language reveals the tremendous threat posed by Zola's treatment of the real world to all that Victorian Canada valued in life and literature, and to its sense of the interaction between the two.

If literature could pollute by example, so could it elevate. When nineteenth-century Canadian critics found fiction to be a valid or valuable form of entertainment, they usually saw the fictive world upholding the ideals and principles by which society was supposedly motivated in the real world. With a few notable exceptions, nineteenth-century critics maintained that the purpose of good literature was to instruct: morally by providing examples of proper conduct, and educationally by providing useful information about the real world. Hence in acceptable literature the emotional power wielded by the novel was expected to work entirely for the good. The mechanics of this connection between the real and fictive worlds were outlined in an article by Grace Aguilar, reprinted in the Anglo-American in 1852, which upheld fiction as one of the best means to communicate truth:

who is there that cannot retrace a long-growing dislike and fear of some particular fault, or a still-strengthening approval of an opposite virtue, to the vivid effect produced by a well-written tale? Both virtue and fault, perhaps, had been set before us a hundred times; but it was not till we saw the one exemplified in the conduct of a good girl, or the consequences of the other pictured in the misery of a naughty boy, that either wrought upon us any degree of that influential impression which has since grown with our growth and strengthened with our strength Have we not found the moral truth, or the moral quality, which, in its abstract nature, has scarcely been apprehended by us, startling us into attention, fixing itself with powerful grasp on all our faculties, when clothed in its developed attributes, -- when embodied in a real character?⁷¹

The watchwords of this didactic attitude were "moral," "truth," "virtue," "ideal," "respectability," and "decorum." Most critics writing in the literary periodicals felt it their duty to evaluate literature primarily on grounds of religious and sexual morality, which they defined as conventionality, and would have agreed with the definition of the responsibility of the literary reviewer which appeared in the Garland in 1840:

There will always . . . be scope for the legitimate exercise of the lash, as long as ignorance and vanity shall find vent through the press; books of doubtful moral tendency, or those designed to pander to the vicious appetites of the many, will always offer a fair mark to the reviewer whose pen is dipped in gall. In such cases severity is a virtue, and he that can scourge the guilty into a proper respect for honour and decency, is a public benefactor.⁷²

While the moral responsibilities of the novelist were generally taken for granted, there was less critical accord regarding the permissible range of the actual contents of the novel. Early in the century, when literature intended merely for entertainment

was generally suspect, fiction was required to demonstrate its "utility." As the two reviews of St. Ursula's Convent indicate, this was to be accomplished either by providing useful information⁷³ or by supporting "the highest sentiments of morality and virtue."⁷⁴ Praiseworthy novels were expected to contain an extractable moral relating directly to the world of everyday experience: in 1832 the Halifax Monthly Magazine applauded James Fenimore Cooper's The Bravo as "an admirably constructed illustration of the evils of bad government."⁷⁵ Always more concerned with a novel's moral import than with its literary value, the Literary Garland's reviewers enjoyed framing moral messages, such as the one found in The Lottery of Life by the Countess of Blessington:

As a pleasant pastime, it may be read, and, if the moral be applied by those who read it, to themselves it will not be without profit. It teaches that the path to honour is open to all who worthily pursue it, and that ill-regulated conduct and unstable principles will bring even the highest in rank to a very low place indeed, in fortune's wheel.⁷⁶

In the Garland, even so great a novel as The Scarlet Letter was valued primarily for the applicability of its message, since it was found to contain

a thrilling portraiture of the inner man, shewing the resistless force of uncurbed passion, and the might and certainty of the retribution, which follows its indulgence. So strikingly is the great moral developed in the story, that all who read must unvoluntarily ask themselves if they are living a life of hypocrisy, or if the great and divine law of Truth is the guide and safeguard of their hearts.⁷⁷

Around the middle of the century, those who demanded that

fiction uphold traditional values began to find themselves caught in a web of paradoxes. In 1851 Susanna Moodie took the most radical position to be found in Canadian criticism at that time. Writing in the Garland, she praised "our great modern novelists," Dickens and Sue, for venturing into the realm of "the murderer, the thief, the prostitute" to depict "heart-rendering pictures of human suffering and degradation." The value of the work of "these humane men [who] bid you step with them into the dirty hovels of the outcasts of society, and see what crime really is, and all the miseries which ignorance and poverty, and a want of self-respect never fail to bring about" lay in the social reforms they advocated:

If these reprobated works of fiction can startle the rich into a painful consciousness of the wants and agonies of the poor, and make them, in despite of all the conventional laws of society, acknowledge their kindred humanity, who shall say that these books have been written in vain? For my own part I look upon these men as heaven inspired teachers, who have been commissioned by the great Father of souls, to proclaim to the world the wrongs and sufferings of millions of his creatures, to plead their cause with unflinching integrity, and with almost superhuman eloquence demand for them the justice which society has so long denied. These men are the benefactors of their species, to whom the whole human race owe a vast debt of gratitude.⁷⁸

Few mid-Victorian Canadian critics went as far as Mrs. Moodie, and none went further in allowing the novel to wander into the nether areas of human experience, even if its purpose was laudatory. But during the latter half of the nineteenth century the great novelists of Britain and Europe were engaged

in exploring the literary and social frontiers of fiction. Hence Canadian critics frequently found themselves in an ironic position. As cultural conservatives they generally distrusted literature that was purely entertaining, requiring a concrete moral connection between the real and the fictive worlds; but because they were conservative, they were increasingly disconcerted to discover that the didacticism which they demanded of fiction was being directed towards radical ends. As a result they were left with a number of unsatisfactory alternatives. They could continue to demand that literature be instructive, and simply rail against those novelists who carried their didacticism into unmentionable regions. They could acknowledge the literary greatness of the best writers, while bemoaning their immorality. Or they could cease to demand that fictional literature deal with everyday life, and instead call for a return to the good old days of Sir Walter Scott.

Examples of the first two positions abound in the Literary Garland. The Garland's predilection for literature "alike elegant in style and diction," with a "high tone of religious and moral feeling"⁷⁹ meant that it experienced difficulty accepting even the relatively innocuous work of Charles Dickens. Its editorial response to Oliver Twist indicates that from a moral point of view the reviewer felt uneasy about the kinds of characters who receive the author's attention, but that as a reader he couldn't help responding to Dickens's artistic power:

It is true that a good deal of the characters the book delineates, is not such as to impart much benefit, except by teaching to shun those whose portraits are exhibited; but for interest, mirth, or pathos, no pen surpasses that of Boz, and no production of that pen surpasses "Oliver Twist."⁸⁰

In The Chimes, however, not even Dickens's literary gifts could redeem his moral errors. While agreeing in principle with the kinds of reforms Dickens advocated, the Garland found Dickens guilty of the terrible crime of fomenting class discord.⁸¹

Several months later Disraeli, a writer of "high genius," was also chided for overstepping the acceptable limits of fiction by expressing his Chartist sympathies in Sybil. So threatening were Disraeli's politics that the Garland solemnly declared that "it is our firm conviction that were the tone assumed by the author to be generally adopted, we should ere long witness the decline of Great Britain from the eminent position she now holds among the nations of the earth."⁸²

Because of their conservatism, many Canadian critics found themselves trapped between their predetermined standards of what a novel should be, and their actual aesthetic response to great literature which violated those standards. This conflict between a critic's approval of a novelist's artistry and disapproval of the same novelist's morality appeared most overtly in an anonymous article on Georges Sand published in the Garland in 1849. The author acknowledged that "as a mere writer [Sand] decidedly stands alone, unparalleled, and far above every other of the present day." He then added,

No writer, however, since the days of Rousseau and his "Heloise," has done so much harm as George Sand, or has tended more to demoralize society at large. . . . Totally without either principle or religion, her whole object seems to be to cast a stigma upon every feeling we are taught to value -- upon every institution we hold sacred.⁸³

Georges Sand was not universally condemned in Canada, however.

In 1877 the Canadian Monthly, reviewing her Tower of Percemont, named her "the author who, next to George Eliot, has done most to redeem the modern novel from decaying along with the modern drama."⁸⁴

Often a critic's conflicting responses manifested themselves more subtly, and are discernible more in his language than in his overtly expressed opinions. That the consequences could be quite humorous was inadvertently demonstrated by Charles Pelham Mulvaney's 1878 discussion of Manon Lescaut, in which he said of the heroine that "The author paints in the warmest colours her matchless beauty and grace and charming gaiety, so that while we read we almost forget to condemn the infatuation which she inspires."⁸⁵ Later articles occasionally reveal a critic in the process of working out his divergent responses, in order to reconcile a novel's obvious greatness with its less acceptable qualities. One of the most interesting examples of the critic wrestling with the novel appeared in The Week's 1886 discussion of The Mayor of Casterbridge. The anonymous reviewer realized that Hardy entered territory not usually associated with literary masterpieces when he remarked that

The material with which Mr. Hardy works is of the coarsest fibre, though not wholly base The social horizon of "The Mayor of Casterbridge" is contracted. The life it depicts is unredeemably dull, and the dialogue abounds in inconsistencies.

Hence it appeared to him that Hardy's skill made the book great almost in spite of its content:

the art with which the whole conception is wrought has added definitely to the small amount of genuine human nature embodied in current fiction. . . . the book holds the inalienable charm of truth, and will score a success of a new order for the novelist whose name it bears.⁸⁶

The Week found artistry to justify content also in Anna Karenina.

Reading the novel as an account of "the inevitable consequences of a transgression of virtue," The Week's reviewer was able to conclude that "This is a masterpiece of fiction, and though dealing with a delicate subject, a profoundly moral book."⁸⁷ But in The Week artistry triumphed over moral stricture only some of the time. Late nineteenth-century Canada's most important periodical described Tolstoy's "Kreutzer Sonata" as "dreary and pessimistic"⁸⁸ and found that the truthfulness of George Moore's Celibates could not excuse its offensiveness:

Undeniably powerful, but intensely disagreeable is "Celibates" by George Moore. It consists of three stories, the second of which should never have been written. All three deal with unpleasant subjects and persons, and though we fully recognize their ability and also we regret to say their truthfulness as possible sketches of real life, we confess to have obtained little from their perusal.⁸⁹

By the 1850's Canadian writers and critics had perceived that the direction taken by serious English novelists led away

from the wholesome, entertaining romances of Sir Walter Scott, towards a commitment to philosophical, political, social and sexual issues which frequently challenged the status quo. They quickly discovered that one way to avoid the unpleasantness associated with the contents and messages of these "problem novels" was to call for fiction that was simply entertaining. In 1855, the characters of the "Editor's Shanty" column of the Anglo-American Magazine summarized the situation in their conversation about The Young Husband by Mrs. Grey:

Major: Mrs. Grey is a clever writer, but too fond of dwelling upon the darker features of our fallen humanity. She is always straining after painful effects.

Laird: What is the use o'writing sic havers, I should like to ken! When a man taks up a story book it is for the purpose o'relaxation. He has been worn oot wi sewing breeks, if a tailor -- or skelpin' dogged laddies, if a schoolmaster -- or ploughing, if a farmer, like your humble servant. . . . The creature lees down upon a sofa, lichts his pipe, and opens the volume expectin' to be entertained and diverted. But losh pity me, ere he has read a dizen pages he finds himself in a perfect bog o'misery and tribulation -- up to the vera oxtar in sorrow -- and far mair inclined to greet than to laugh! Whaur is the relaxation there, I would like to ken?

Doctor: I perfectly agree with you. There is enough, and more than enough, of cark and care in this planet of ours, without seeking to import any of the article from dreamland.⁹⁰

Not surprisingly, the Major (and presumably the editor) approved of a historical romance whose author

is impregnated to the backbone with the concentrated essence of story-telling. On he goes from one adventure to another, without stopping to moralize or do the sentimental, and crams as much material into a chapter as would serve the majority of modern fiction manufacturers for a full-grown volume!⁹¹

When Canadian critics of the second half of the nineteenth century asked that fictional literature avoid moral messages they were not always sidestepping tricky issues. Belford's argued quite consistently that "a writer of fiction must establish the artistic claim before his preaching can be tolerated"⁹² because didacticism was not an essential aspect of the novel:

It is not in every case a pleasant experience when you take up for pure recreation and enjoyment a novel, attractive in title and general surface, to find before you have read very far that either by easy and gradual stages you are being lured on, or by a sudden plunge in medias res you are brought face to face with that bête noire of novel readers -- an object. It may be political, scientific, philanthropic or religious, in another form an old hobby of your own; but whatever it is, it is foreign matter in a novel.⁹³

Critics with a taste for literary artistry denounced sermonizing, and required that a novel's moral structure be implicit within its narrative structure. Rev. J. A. Bray, who reviewed many popular novels in his Canadian Spectator, highly praised a book for being "singularly destitute of 'padding,' no 'moral remarks' of the author's hinder the progress of the plot or occupy the closing pages; the moral is in the story itself."⁹⁴ The Canadian Monthly similarly declared that "we may doubt the aesthetic propriety of fiction being laden with social moralities"⁹⁵ and was happy to accept fiction intended purely for entertainment so long as decorum was maintained. It would not tolerate some novelists because

A few modern writers are apt to think that coarseness and strength are synonymous, and that, because Smollett

and Fielding wrote down in black and white what gentlemen of their age would not have scrupled to talk and laugh about out loud, we can now-a-days write what no one would venture to describe in a conversation.⁹⁶

But the works of a good popular writer like Trollope were welcomed because "he does not live and move in an atmosphere redolent of conjugal infidelity and secret poisoning. There is nothing in his novels to which Mr. Podsnap could object, as likely to be offensive or harmful to 'the young person.'"⁹⁷ While the Monthly was willing to acknowledge the entertainment value of a well-plotted adventure novel, exemplified by the works of Wilkie Collins (five of whose stories and novels appeared in the Monthly and in Rose-Belford's), it insisted that only prose fiction which reached the standard set by George Eliot contained true literary value. Hence a clear distinction between the acceptable popular novel and the valuable literary novel underlies all the Monthly's literary criticism, such as its evaluation of George Meredith's Beauchamp's Career:

Its author is far less read and less heard of than he deserves to be -- probably because his works are of a class beyond the appreciation of the average novel-reader, who cares only for highly wrought plot and sensational incidents; and partly, also, because his circuitous and somewhat recondite style, strong and vivid as it is, resembles that of Browning too much to be palatable to the man who takes up a work of fiction for relaxation only, and does not care to be confronted with social problems or literary enigmas at every turn. . . . "Beauchamp's Career" will probably be far less widely read than "The Boudoir Cabal," but any true lover of literature will rank it as superior to that clever satire as "Romola" or "Middlemarch" is to a novel of Rhoda Broughton's.⁹⁸

In The Week, however, critics who advocated harmlessly entertaining novels usually did so less for aesthetic reasons than out of distaste for the kinds of moral concerns which preoccupied the greater novelists. C. Davis English spoke for most of The Week's contributors when he declared that, "Fiction is primarily designed for amusement, and while it may inculcate a moral lesson, it must not play upon the mind a can-can, or imprint upon it a loathsome picture."⁹⁹ He received the support of Carter Troop, who argued that "the primary object of the novel is to amuse. Its office is neither to teach nor to preach" because he was offended by writers like Rider Haggard, whose imagination was "at once morbid and sensual."¹⁰⁰ Towards the end of the century, and primarily in The Week, the word "wholesome" appeared in Canadian literary criticism as a definitive term of approbation. In their campaign for fiction that was healthy, wholesome and "eminently respectable,"¹⁰¹ many of The Week's writers implicitly constructed a history of the English novel which looked back to the time of Sir Walter Scott as a lost Golden Age of English romantic fiction. Among the most vocal of these critics was Graeme Mercer Adam, who in 1885 mourned that "The good old romantic and imaginative novel of our grandmothers' time seems a creation wholly of the past."¹⁰² In 1894 The Week welcomed a reprint of The Cloister and the Hearth by exclaiming, "How truly refreshing is this good, old-fashioned romance in contrast with present day realism and psychological

analysis: a happy substitute indeed."¹⁰³ And Anthony Hope's

The Prisoner of Zenda was greeted with the declaration that

The good old days of romance are with us again: Crockett, Weyman, Hope, Parker and others are giving us excellent matter, in an excellent manner, and we are indeed truly thankful for a renewal of the literary feast with which Scott and his fellows delighted our younger hours.¹⁰⁴

Most applauded were heroes and novels "of the old school," the old school consisting of Scott, Reade, G. P. R. James, and whoever else had specialized in the creation of "fresh wholesome romance, free from soul-harrowing incidents."¹⁰⁵ Most of The Week's literary critics would have agreed with W. A. Fraser, a Canadian-born popular novelist who announced at the very end of the nineteenth-century:

I, for one, do not want to know of all the shame, and misery and crime, real and imaginary, that is in the world. I haven't time to go into it. My moral nature needs healthier food; and my family, young and ready for impressions, cannot wade through chronicles of violence and infamy day after day, and still believe in the good of humanity.¹⁰⁶

In 1899 Fraser named Kipling "the greatest living writer," seeing him as the heir of Dickens, "the father of this good school that is breathing of health today."¹⁰⁷

Discussions of literature in Canadian periodicals indicate that the nineteenth-century Canadian cultural community did not consider prose fiction to be as valuable a form of literature as poetry or history. Nonetheless it was prepared to accept novels which combined instruction with entertainment, presented a moral and wholesome vision of society, and reinforced conventional

standards of sexual and religious behaviour. Not surprisingly, it expected Canadian novelists to conform to this norm. For Canadian writers, however, the literary prejudices of their community formed only part of the problem of establishing the Canadian novel as a distinctive literary form. In addition to the conservatism of their compatriots, nineteenth-century Canadian novelists had to contend with the land itself, to discover how they could transfer to barely civilized territory the highly sophisticated literary traditions surrounding the European novel. The establishment of Canada as a valid location for fiction necessarily preceded the establishment of the Canadian novel as a legitimate literary venture.

NOTES TO CHAPTER II

¹ John Tinnon Taylor, Early Opposition to the English Novel. The Popular Reaction from 1760 to 1830 (New York: King's Crown Press, 1943).

² Susanna Moodie, Life in the Clearings versus the Bush (1853; rpt. ed. R. D. McDougall, Toronto: Macmillan, 1959), p. xxxiii.

³ "On the Influence of Literature," CRLHJ, 1 (July 1824), 67.

⁴ W. P. C., "Our Literature, Present and Prospective," LG, n.s. 6 (May 1848), 247.

⁵ Rev. of St. George; or The Canadian League, by William Charles McKinnon, Provincial, or Halifax Monthly Magazine, 1 (April 1852), 148.

⁶ Charles Mair, "Views on Canadian Literature," The Week, 11 (9 March 1894), 344.

⁷ Archibald MacMechan, Headwaters of Canadian Literature (Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 1924), p. 14.

⁸ Rev. of Ethelinde; or, The Recluse of the Lake, by Charlotte Smith, Nova Scotia Magazine, 3 (Oct. 1790), 303-04.

⁹ David Chisholme, "Introduction," CMLR, 1 (July 1823), 7.

¹⁰ "New Publications. St. Ursula's Convent; or The Nun of Canada," CRLHJ, 1 (July 1824), 49.

¹¹ CRLHJ, 1 (July 1824), 49.

¹² CRLHJ, 1 (July 1824), 50. For a Nova Scotian expression of a similar point of view, see the Acadian, 1 (June 1827), 449.

- 13 I have not been able to trace this book.
- 14 Rev. of Paul Clifford, Halifax Monthly Magazine, 1 (Aug. 1830), 81-82.
- 15 I., "Cursory Thoughts and Literary Reminiscences," Acadian, 1 (Jan. 1827), 259; 327, 1830.
- 16 Acadian, 1 (Jan. 1827), 261.
- 17 Robert W. Lay, "Editorial," Maple Leaf, 1 (Sept. 1852), 95.
- 18 Later published in book form under several different titles: Lady Mary and her Nurse (London: Hall, 1856); Stories of the Canadian Forest (Boston: Crosby & Nichols, 1861); Afar in the Forest (London: Nelson, 1869).
- 19 Maple Leaf, 2 (Jan. 1853), inside back cover.
- 20 Catharine Parr Traill, The Backwoods of Canada (London: Knight, 1836), p. 9.
- 21 Catharine Parr Traill, Narratives of Nature (London: Edward Lacey, n.d.) p. v.
- 22 Henry Youle Hind, "Introduction," CJ, 1 (Aug. 1852), 3.
- 23 Goldwin Smith, Bystander, 1 (Jan. 1880), 55.
- 24 J. L. Stewart, "George Eliot," BMM, 3 (May 1878), 675.
- 25 J. G. Bourinot, Our Intellectual Strengths and Weakness (Montreal: Foster Brown, 1893), p. 30.
- 26 J. P., "Novels and Novel Readers," LG, n.s. 8 (May 1850), 212.
- 27 Henry Giles, "Fiction," LG, n.s. 8 (June 1850), 264.
- 28 "Our Table," LG, n.s. 8 (May 1850), 238.
- 29 "Our Table," LG, 1 (Feb. 1839), 144.
- 30 See Carter Troop, "On the Horrible in Fiction," The Week, 6 (8 Feb. 1889), 153.
- 31 Angus M'Kinnon, "Reading," NDM, 1 (Feb. 1868), 284.
- 32 "The Effects of Literary Cultivation on Morals," Canadian Literary Magazine, 1 (April 1833), 38.

- 33 Canadian Literary Magazine, 1 (April 1833), 38-39.
- 34 Henry Giles, "Fiction," LG, n.s. 8 (June 1850), 267.
- 35 M. W. C., "The Use of Books," The Harp, 4 (Oct. 1879), 495.
- 36 George Stewart, "Introductory," Stewart's, 1 (April 1867), 1.
- 37 "Publisher's Department," NDM, March 1876, 237.
- 38 "Book Reviews," CMNR, 1 (May 1872), 478.
- 39 "Book Reviews," CMNR, 4 (Oct. 1873), 357-59.
- 40 J. G. Bourinot, "Notes in My Library," The Week, 12 (5 April 1895), 4445.
- 41 J. P., "Novels and Novel Readers," LG, n.s. 8 (May 1850), 209.
- 42 John Tinnon Taylor, Early Opposition to the English Novel (New York: King's Crown Press, 1943), pp. 69-71.
- 43 "The Purser's Cabin," AAM, 5 (Oct. 1854), 334.
- 44 Rosanna Leprohon, Antoinette de Mirecourt (Montreal: Lovell, 1864), p. 126.
- 45 Susanna Moodie, "Jane Redgrave," LG, n.s. 6 (Jan. 1848), 6.
- 46 Susanna Moodie, Matrimonial Speculations (London: Bentley, 1854), p. 45.
- 47 Agnes Maule Machar, "For King and Country," CMNR, 5 (April 1874), 195.
- 48 Agnes Maule Machar, "Lost and Won," CMNR, 7 (March 1875), 211.
- 49 "Editor's Shanty," AAM, 5 (Dec. 1854), 609.
- 50 J. P., "Novels and Novel Readers," LG, n.s. 8 (May 1850), 211.
- 51 "The Editor's Address to the Public," Canadian Literary Magazine, 1 (April 1833), 2.
- 52 Senex, "Modern Literature," Acadian, 1 (May 1827), 436.
- 53 "Editor's Shanty," AAM, 1 (Aug. 1852), 173. See also 2 (Feb. 1853), 206.

⁵⁴ Casca, "Emily Montague; or, Quebec a Century Ago," British Canadian Review, 1 (Jan. 1863), 87.

⁵⁵ I. Allan Jack, "Harriet Beacher Stowe on Lady Byron's Life," Stewart's, 3 (Oct. 1869), 279.

⁵⁶ "Canadian Books," Saturday Reader, 1 (30 Dec. 1865), 261.

⁵⁷ CMNR, 1 (Jan. 1872), 152.

⁵⁸ "Current Literature," BMM, 1 (April 1877), 4708.

⁵⁹ Sara Jeannette Duncan, "Saunterings," The Week 3 (7 Oct. 1886), 723.

⁶⁰ J. E. Smith, "Sensational Novels," DI, 3 (28 Sept. 1889) 203.

⁶¹ Kate M. Barry, Honor Edgeworth, or Ottawa's Present Tense (Ottawa: Woodburn, 1882), p. iii.

⁶² "Literary Notes," CMNR, 1 (June 1872), 570.

⁶³ "Current Literature," RBCM, 1 (July 1878), 117-8.

⁶⁴ J. P., "Novels and Novel Readers," LG, n.s. 8 (May 1850), 211.

⁶⁵ "Our Table," LG, n.s. 5 (Sept. 1847), 435.

⁶⁶ Miss Foster (T. D. F.), "Jane Eyre -- An Autobiography," LG, n.s. 6 (July 1848), 335-38.

⁶⁷ Susanna Moodie, "A Word for the Novel Writers," LG, n.s. 9 (Aug. 1851), 348-51.

⁶⁸ Goldwin, Smith, Bystander, 1 (July 1880), 390.

⁶⁹ Smith, Bystander, 1 (July 1880), 390.

⁷⁰ "Our Library Table," The Week, 8 (17 April 1891), 319.

⁷¹ Grace Aguilar, "The Days of Bruce," AAH, 1 (Dec. Dec. 1852), 519.

⁷² Andrew Robertson ("A.R."), Retrospective Reviews, " LG, 2 (June 1840), 307.

⁷³ "St. Ursula's Convent or The Nun of Canada," CMLR, 2 (May 1824), 463-64.

- 74 "New Publications," CRLHJ, 1 (July 1824), 49.
- 75 "The Bravo, A Venetian Story," Halifax Monthly Magazine, 2 (Feb. 1832), 410.
- 76 "Our Table," LG, 4 (Aug. 1842), 437.
- 77 "Our Table," LG, n.s. 8 (June 1850), 289.
- 78 Susanna Moodie, "A Word for the Novel Writers," LG, n.s. 9 (Aug. 1851), 350.
- 79 "Our Table," LG, 2 (March 1840), 192.
- 80 "Our Table," LG, 2 (March 1840), 192.
- 81 "Our Table," LG, n.s. 3 (April 1845), 190.
- 82 "Our Table," LG, n.s. 3 (July 1845), 336.
- 83 "George Sand," LG, n.s. 7 (Feb. 1849), 63.
- 84 "Book Reviews," CMNR, 12 (Dec. 1877), 664.
- 85 Charles Pelham Mulvaney, "Some French Novels of the Eighteenth Century," BMM, 3 (Feb. 1878), 385.
- 86 "Our Library Table," The Week, 3 (1 July 1886), 500.
- 87 "Our Library Table," The Week, 3 (22 April 1886), 338.
- 88 "Literary and Personal Gossip," The Week, 8 (24 July 1891), 549.
- 89 "Recent Fiction," The Week, 12 (3 Aug. 1895), 951.
- 90 "Editor's Shanty," AAM, 6 (Jan. 1855), 103.
- 91 "Editor's Shanty," AAM, 5 (Nov. 1854), 511.
- 92 "Current Literature," BMM, 2 (Nov. 1877), 856.
- 93 "Current Literature," BMM, 2 (July 1877), 343.
- 94 "Current Literature," Canadian Spectator, 1 (26 Jan. 1878), 36.
- 95 "Book Reviews," CMNR, 12 (July 1877), 100.

- 96 "Book Reviews," CMNR, 13 (Feb. 1878), 224.
- 97 "Book Reviews," CMNR, 10 (July 1876), 87.
- 98 "Book Reviews," CMNR, 9 (April 1876), 341.
- 99 C. Davis English, "The Immoral in Fiction," The Week, 2 (8 Oct. 1885), 709.
- 100 Carter Troop, "On the Horrible in Fiction," The Week, 6 (8 Feb. 1889), 152-53.
- 101 "Roderick Random," "Letters to Living Authors -- Mr. Robert Louis Stevenson," The Week, 6 (5 July 1889), 487.
- 102 G. Mercer Adam, "Some Books of the Past Year," The Week, 2 (15 Jan. 1885), 103.
- 103 "Library Table," The Week, 11 (2 Feb. 1894), 232.
- 104 "Library Table," The Week, 11 (20 July 1894), 809.
- 105 E. G., "Recent Fiction," The Week, 13 (1 May 1896), 550.
- 106 W. A. Fraser, "Literature," CM, 13 (May 1899), 35.
- 107 Fraser, CM, 13 (May 1899), 37.

CHAPTER III

THE VALIDITY OF CANADA AS A LOCATION FOR FICTION

Before Canadian writers could begin to develop a national prose literature, they had to convince themselves and their readers that Canada provided a suitable setting for the kinds of characters and events usually depicted in popular fiction. During the nineteenth century the problem of establishing Canada's validity as a location for fiction went through several stages. After Confederation, in the 1870's and 1880's, national confidence and enthusiasm allowed writers and critics simply to assert that their country contained exciting subjects and colourful backgrounds for fiction. But in pre-Confederation periodicals and novels, the twentieth-century reader can perceive a genuine struggle to find material in an immature country suitable for the mature forms of both short and extensive fictional narratives. In the last decade of the century this problem acquired a new dimension when Canadian writers tried to break into the international popular fiction market. In the 1890's and early 1900's many Canadian-born novelists became literary expatriates, forsaking

their native origin to write novels undistinguishable from the mass of popular British and American fiction, or constructing a literary vision of Canada more in tune with the international taste for exotic colour than with Canadian actuality.

The difficulty of developing a national literature in a land which failed to supply most of the conditions presumed necessary for literary activity preoccupied and baffled many pre-Confederation critics. Immigrants attempting to create a local literature in a country lacking "infinite associations of time, place and circumstance"¹ found their expectations constantly deflated. In 1831 Andrew Shiels discovered that the prosaic terminology developed by Nova Scotians undermined the alignment between romantic landscape and language he had known in Scotland:

instead of the "mountain high" and "hills of green," -- the beautiful vale, breathing with imagery, including mouldering abbey, delapidated tower, ruin'd camp of Dane and Roman, fields of battle where the warriors fought and fell, princely palaces, classic rivers and sylvan brooks (each bearing its own specific designation and its legend besides) of my "pleasant Teviot-dale" let the traveller in Nova-Scotia ask what is the name of yonder dwelling? the answer is almost universally Mr. Such or such-a-one's farm, and that contains all the variations of its History; or enquire the name of the dull half forgotten, or perhaps unknown stream, in any quarter of the province, and ten to one but it is either Nine mile or Salmon river.²

Shiels's disillusionment received considerable expansion in an important article titled "The Literature of a New Country," published anonymously in the Monthly Review (Toronto) in 1841. The author of this piece summarized the dilemma confronting prospective

poets and novelists who found themselves in a land which challenged all their basic assumptions regarding the foundations of literature:

The very nature and character of the land itself, its past history, its former inhabitants, all conspire against its literary success. Almost every one of the European or Eastern nations, that has furnished a proportion to the general array of authors, has contained within itself the ordinary materials for the formation of a national literature. Tradition, legend, tale, and song, have sent down from the floating shadows of the past, rich and exhaustless stores of mingled fact and fiction, from which the successive writers of ages could draw, as from a vast historic reservoir, and weave from their sparkling fragments the rich chaplets of their own creative and combining powers. . . . The inhabitant of this Continent has little, if any, early recollections to be entwined with the local characteristics of the land he inhabits; he has to cast his eyes beyond an ocean, should he ask for legends or memories of the past to awaken the inspiration of the present.³

This writer perceived the essential irony underlying English Canada's literary relationship with Britain. When the new country tried to create its own culture, the New World's great literary inheritance become a liability rather than an asset because it deprived the North American of the opportunity to develop his own language:

The language in which he speaks and thinks, is but a borrowed medium, a language in which have excelled the greatest masters that have ever ennobled an earthly tongue, and who must, in the rich excess of their brightness, outdazzle and outshine the highest efforts of a nation of imitators. Hence the [North] American writer cannot but feel, that how far soever he may outstrip all rivals that strive with him on his own shore, a hopeless contest still awaits him with the almost invincible giant of English literature, who requires from his transatlantic children unreserved homage and fealty, in return for his extending to them the rich boon of his glorious language. . . . In small communities, distinct in habit and peculiar in language, an author

of moderate ability may rise to distinction, and be known to the world as the first poet, novelist, or historian of his country, though in the general assembly of literary talent, his place might be far from foremost. A [North] American, however, cannot share this advantage. From the snows of Labrador to the Andes, he may have no equal; but till he performs the Herculean task of mounting higher than the starry names in the literary galaxy of England, the world at large will only accord him his fitting rank among the authors who spoke or sang in the language of Shakespeare and Milton.⁴

This then was the formidable task facing early nineteenth-century Canadian novelists and poets: to compete with those who wrote "in the language of Shakespeare and Milton" while they themselves were isolated in a land which failed to furnish even the basic "store of materials from which to mould a pleasant tale or sparkling romance."⁵

The difficulty of finding an appropriate literary language, coupled with the weight of Britain's literary heritage, lies behind the book today generally regarded as "the worst of the many bad novels produced in Canada."⁶ Awed by the great tradition of English literature, Charles Heavysege tried to model his only novel on the greatest English writer of all -- William Shakespeare. He composed The Advocate (1865) in neo-Shakespearean rhetoric, with most of its action occurring in the dialogue. The book is crammed with Shakespearean references and allusions: the Montreal advocate owes much to Iago and Richard III, his son Narcisse is a Canadian Caliban, his illegitimate daughter participates in a Romeo and Juliet style balcony scene, and she and her lover reenact the marriage in Friar Lawrence's cell when they plan to be

married secretly in the church of St. Laurent. The Advocate fails abysmally as a novel because its author did not understand that the novel requires a kind of believability not sustained by translating a nineteenth-century Canadian story into pseudo-Shakespearean bombast. Heavysege's unhappy resolution to the problems outlined in the Monthly Review further emphasized the dismal prospects facing the writer in a land where

No ruined castle, clothed in the wayward folds of the glossy ivy, and tenanted by the hooting owl, frowned from the pointed rock, or gazed on its own melancholy shadow in the free waters of the passing river. No harmless goblins scared the benighted shepherd in the twilight forest. No playful fairies danced by the moonlit fountain, or basked in the merry starlight in some open glade of the greenwood. Oberon and Titania held no sway over the Canadian forests.⁷

As the century progressed this feeling gradually diminished, although in 1863 an anonymous writer in the British American Magazine reiterated the opinion that this was a country with no indigenous history or mythology:

We must remember . . . that Canada has no historical past distant enough to lift its events into the clear region of the imagination, where all that is trite and common-place in the actual falls away, and the grand poetical lineaments alone remain; -- no worshipped heroes whose memory may bind the hearts of the people together, or give the poet's lyre a truly national tone; -- no sacred fables, myths or traditions like those which, in the morning of the world, steeped some favoured spots of earth in an atmosphere of romance and poetry that will cling to them forever. Her annals are brief and clearly defined; her heroes, if she has any, are exceedingly modern and matter-of-fact; her legends are only the dim shadowy traditions of the Indian tribes, which, at best, have but little power of moving the sympathies of the races so much stronger and mightier in thought and deed, so much fuller of heroic action and passion, that have taken their place.⁸

As late as 1884, John E. Logan declared in The Week that Canada lacked the origins necessary for a national literature:

We have had no barbarous infancy moulded by the natural features of our land. No divinities have sanctified to us our mountains and streams. No fabled heroes have left us immortal memories. We have not amalgamated with the natives and woven the woof of our refinement in the strong sinuous web of an aboriginal tradition and religion. . . . We have come almost full grown into the world, not unlike some unbred specimens of the canine race.⁹

Parallel to this stream of thought regarding Canada's inadequacy as a cradle for literature ran the opinions of critics who felt that Canada lacked not literary material, but writers interested in exploiting that material. In 1853 Susanna Moodie decried the indifference of native Canadians to their country's artistic possibilities:

Beautiful -- most beautiful in her rugged grandeur is this vast country. How awful is the sublime solitude of her pathless woods! what eloquent thoughts flow out of the deep silence that broods over them! . . . Has Canada no poet to describe the glories of his parent land -- no painter that can delineate her matchless scenery of land and wave? Are her children dumb and blind, that they leave to strangers the task of singing her praise?¹⁰

Andrew Learmont Spedon, a younger contemporary of Mrs. Moodie's, echoed her lament. In 1861 this Lower Canadian writer and teacher recognized Canada's apparent barrenness when he remarked:

what have we here in Canada to boast of? may be asked -- a region that has scarcely emerged from the silent chaos of barbarism: -- a country that has no antiquity, or retrospect but the shadowed lineaments of the present: -- a land whose rivers are comparatively unknown to song, whose forests have never been visited by the classic feet of the sylvan goddess; and whose mountains that

have towered their shaggy summits for ages over an unbroken wilderness, have never lent their soil to the nourishment of the Parnassian laurel.¹¹

But he also argued that Canada's lack of European history did not necessitate a dearth of literary material. "Though it cannot boast of a thousand dilapidated towers, around which the hero-spirits of a hundred ages still linger," he declared, "yet, there are spots, sacred to the world's history; that stand as the deathless memorials of departed glory and illustrious valour."¹²

Several of the pieces in Spedon's Tales of the Canadian Forest (1861) document just such local incidents of "departed glory and illustrious valour," but he felt that he was working alone in his efforts to enhance Canada's literary identity. In his introduction to his subsequent collection of Canadian Summer Evening Tales (1866), he voiced his frustration with Canadians' literary indifference to their native or adopted land:

Unlike many of the older countries, Canada has but few literary pioneers and sons of song. Yet what a noble field there is for the native sons of genius to gather therefrom the forest laurels of a past age, to adorn the literature of their country, and to give it that mystical enchantment which antiquity alone is capable of giving. Oh! for a shade of Scott, Cooper or Irving, to call up the Indian from his tomb, -- the hero from the battle-field, -- the mariner from the deep; to breathe upon their dry bones, -- to embody them in nobler forms, and to give to them a life and an immortality unknown before! O, ye Canadians! why will ye slumber in literary indolence and allow your noble rivers to roll on, year after year, "unlettered and unsung?"¹³

Not all pre-Confederation writers lamented Canada's dearth of romantic literary associations. To Catharine Parr Traill,

who approached the New World from a point of view akin to eighteenth-century rationalism, Canada's lack of folklore was a distinct advantage. In The Backwoods of Canada (1836) Traill simply recorded her observation that

As to ghosts or spirits they appear totally banished from Canada. This is too matter-of-fact [a] country for such supernaturals to visit. . . . We have neither fay nor fairy, ghost nor bogle, satyr nor wood-nymph; our very forests disdain to shelter dryad or hama-dryad. No naiad haunts the rushy margin of our lakes or hallows with her presence our forest-rills. No Druid claims our oaks; and instead of poring with mysterious awe among our curious limestone rocks, that are often singularly grouped together, we refer them to the geologist to exercise his skill in accounting for their appearance: instead of investing them with the solemn characters of ancient temples or heathen altars we look upon them with the curious eye of natural philosophy alone.¹⁴

In her unpublished journals Mrs. Traill declared more emphatically her approval of a land with no mythology. In the entry dated August 16, 1837, she mentions hearing strange night sounds and then adds:

Formerly imagination would have fancied these nocturnal sounds into the voices of yelling demons and all manner of evil spirits exulting sporting amid the war of the elements -- Happily in this new country fancy has little food to exist upon -- the toil of every day labour is before us -- the hard but simple process of subduing the giants of the forest to provide the necessities of life leaves little leisure for indulging in superstitious vanities -- The mind is not excited by legendary lore -- there are no tales of by gone days of the generations before us to listen to, no accounts of wars or rumours of wars no feudal times to refer to replete with crimes and interest. The Canadian settlers children will probably never listen to any of the wild tales of ghosts and witches and robbers and fairies and seers -- that formed at once the blight and terror of their parents childhood.¹⁵

On January 29, 1838, after enjoying a moonlit winter walk, she again rejoiced in the purity of a new world, free from superstition. "How enervating to the mind are those tales of the wild and wonderful that used to form so great a part of the mental food of young children when I was a child,"¹⁶ she declared. Like her sister, Susanna Moodie approved of the "utter disbelief in supernatural appearances which is common to most native-born Canadians."¹⁷ For Mrs. Moodie, the presence of ghosts required the consciousness of sin. She found Canada's lack of supernatural associations to be a measure of the greater innocence of a land undefiled by civilization:

The unpeopled wastes of Canada must present the same aspect to the new settler that the world did to our first parents after their expulsion from the Garden of Eden; all the sin which could define the spot, or haunt it with the association of departed evil, is concentrated in their own persons. Bad spirits cannot be supposed to linger near a place where crime has never been committed. The belief in ghosts, so prevalent in old countries, must first have had its foundation in the consciousness of guilt.¹⁸

In the virgin territory of the New World freedom from ghosts may have indicated freedom from traditional sin and guilt, but it also indicated freedom from the literary associations and cultural resonances conducive to great imaginative literature. That the novel suffered more than any other prose form from Canada's lack of a solid foundation of social and historical experience is demonstrated by Mrs. Moodie's own writing. Like her pre-Confederation contemporaries in other parts of the country that

was to become Canada,¹⁹ Mrs. Moodie achieved her greatest literary success in the essay, the sketch and the journal. In Roughing it in the Bush (1852) and Life in the Clearings versus the Bush (1853) she resorted primarily to non-fictional forms to transform raw experience into enduring literary artifacts which related directly to her Canadian life. Her novels, however, which were published in London in the 1850's after serialization in the Literary Garland, were written with one eye on the British market for polite, sentimental romance. Because she unabashedly wrote for money, Mrs. Moodie took no risks by attempting to transplant to Canadian soil the complex plots and stereotyped characters required by the genre. The closest she ever came to writing a novel about Canada was Flora Lyndsay (1854),²⁰ which contains a fictionalized account of the Moodies' own departure from England but ends as soon as the Lyndsays arrive in the New World. Even here Mrs. Moodie found that the form of the novel (as she understood it) demanded more material than the simple experience of an emigrant family's departure could supply. She had to add character and plot first by interpolating a series of character sketches into Flora's preparations and embarkation, then by inserting wholesale a 100-page story that Flora writes to pass the time when their ship is becalmed off Newfoundland. This novelette -- "Noah Cotton"²¹ -- includes enough murder, illegitimacy, theft and romance to compensate for Flora's more mundane activities. As a piece of literature, Flora Lyndsay contains no value beyond

some amusing character sketches and autobiographical Moodie material. Nonetheless the book does illustrate the difficulties confronting mid-nineteenth-century Canadian writers who found that the Canada they knew was not compatible with the elaborately plotted fiction demanded by the popular market.

In the 1830's and 1840's Thomas Chandler Haliburton and Major John Richardson demonstrated that it was indeed possible to write full-length fictional works constructed of Canadian material, but their books proved to be exceptions to the general rule. It was primarily in the literary periodicals of the nineteenth century that the struggle to establish Canada's validity as a location for fiction took place. In pre-Confederation journals, interest in Canada ranged from the British Colonial Magazine's almost total indifference to its Canadian origin, to the Literary Garland's deliberate efforts to foster in Canada the kind of genteel literary culture its contributors and readers had enjoyed in England and Boston. Edited by W. H. Smith of Toronto in 1852 and 1853, the British Canadian Magazine was composed almost entirely of literary items selected from popular British periodicals like Chamber's, Gentleman's and Fraser's magazines. Except for rare notices of utilitarian Canadian publications like The Canadian Constable's Almanac and Scobie's Canadian Almanac for 1852, the magazine bore no trace of its nationality. While his periodical's non-Canadian orientation may have indicated Mr. Smith's contempt for Canadian writers and Canadian subjects, it

more likely resulted from the economic expedient that it was easier to select material from British journals (possibly without paying copyright dues) than to enter the precarious venture of soliciting and financing Canadian authors.

The Literary Garland, however, managed to thrive for thirteen years (1838-51) on Canadian interest in the products of Canadian writers. Carl Klinck notes that in tone the Garland was "Anglo-Bostonian rather than Anglo-Canadian"²² as it attempted to establish for Canadian letters a norm of pious middle-class gentility. While the majority of its contributions came from Canadian residents and were directed towards Canadian readers, its fiction was primarily non-Canadian in both form and content. Especially popular were Oriental tales, Old World pastoral idylls, European medieval romances, Irish and Scottish dialect anecdotes and English silver fork stories. When they did write about Canada, Garland writers and their successors sought Canadian equivalents for the conventions they favoured. Only some aspects of Old World experience, however, could be successfully transplanted to the New. Mrs. Moodie and Mrs. Traill learned in real life that Irish peasants had readily relocated in the Canadian backwoods; but Mrs. Holiwell inadvertently discovered when she wrote "The Settler's Daughter"²³ that English gentlemen could not be credibly transferred to estates on the shores of the Great Lakes.

Like "The Settler's Daughter," many pieces of nineteenth-century Canadian fiction are to be admired more for their authors'

ingenuity in transplanting literary conventions than for their faithfulness to Canadian reality. The Garland especially abounds in such tales. One, "The Hermit of Saint Maurice,"²⁴ concerns a British hermit living in a cave on the Saint Maurice river, who is supported by charitable Indians and dies leaving behind a scroll containing his heart-rending story. Others include Indians who behave rather like Marie Antoinette's courtly shepherds and shepherdesses. In "The Pride of Lorette," the beautiful Aulida describes her daily activities: "I work the mocassins and ornaments of bark, and cultivate my little garden."²⁵ The story titled "The Heiress; an Adventure at the Springs," reveals a very conscious attempt to find a Canadian equivalent for the watering-place romance. The author opens her conventional love story by justifying her choice of the Caledonian springs in Lower Canada:

The watering places of Europe, and even in the States, have long enjoyed an enviable supremacy in romantic adventure. These places of gregarious resort have been from time immemorial celebrated in story, as the scene of many a love-lorn tale and ditty, or the chosen site of some fortunate dénouement, where virtue and constancy triumphed over trials, that too often interrupted the current of true love.

There are as bright eyes and as susceptible hearts in Canada as in any portion of the globe, and it is self-evident to all logicians, that the same causes will produce the same effects all the world over; Caledonia has therefore had its share of adventure, and it only waits a faithful narrator to give the interesting details to the public.²⁶

Not just in love stories, but also in tales with titles like "The Ruins. A Canadian Legend,"²⁷ "Canadian Legends. 1. The

Ruined Cottage,"²⁸ "A Legend of the Lake,"²⁹ and "The Old Manuscript. A Mémoire of the Past"³⁰ Garland writers sought Canadian fictional equivalents for the romantic narrative of the remote European past, devising New World mysteries and love intrigues to colour the Canadian landscape with tinges of legendary tradition.

That early and mid-nineteenth-century writers experienced considerable difficulty fitting their literary assumptions to Canadian settings is demonstrated by two structural patterns which appeared quite consistently in their fiction. In the first of these patterns, Canada serves as a place for trial and adventure, but deserving characters are ultimately permitted to return to their estates in Europe. Frances Brooke's The History of Emily Montague (1769), English Canada's only eighteenth-century novel, may be regarded as the prototype of this form, which was used also by Julia Catherine Beckwith Hart in St. Ursula's Convent (1824). It recurred in stories and novels like Mrs. Cushing's "A Canadian Legend" (1830),³¹ Douglas Huyghue's Argimou (1847), Andrew Learmont Spedon's "Marriage in Middle Life" (1861),³² Mrs. Noel's "The Secret of Stanley Hall" (1866),³³ Mrs. Ross's Violet Keith (1868), J. G. Bourinot's "Marguerite" (1870),³⁴ Mrs. Huddleston's Bluebell (1875) and Agatha Armour's Lady Rosamond's Secret (1878). After 1880 this pattern became less obvious. The late nineteenth-century interest in local colour usually inspired Canadian novelists to allow their characters to live happily ever after in the green meadows and forests of the New

World, but exceptions occur in Agnes Maule Machar's The Heir of Fairmount Grange (1895) and R. L. Richardson's Colin of the Ninth Concession (1903), in which heroic orphans displaced in the New World are eventually restored to their estates in the Old.

In the second of these patterns the narrative begins and ends in Canada, but the bulk of the action occurs elsewhere. A number of Garland tales are structured around a person for whom Canada serves merely as a point of termination. These characters either die, leaving behind manuscripts describing their pre-Canadian adventures, or else verbally relate their exploits in the Old World which have resulted in their residence in the New.

In the Garland "The Hermit of Saint Maurice,"³⁵ "The Elopement,"³⁶ "The Gibbet Tree,"³⁷ "The Old Man's Tale,"³⁸ and "Canadian Legends.

1. The Ruined Cottage"³⁹ take this form, as does "Alciphron Leicester"⁴⁰ in the Victoria Magazine.

The contents of periodicals published in Victorian Canada reveal that Canada became a valid location for short stories, tales and sketches long before it became a suitable setting for longer, serialized fiction. Despite the Garland's cultural nationalism, very few of its writers supplied serialized novels about their country as readily as short pieces. An interesting example of the difficulties encountered in fitting Canadian content to the form of the popular novel occurs in the work of Rosanna Leprohon. Before she could write about the present and

past social life of her own country in "The Manor House of de Villeraï" (1859), "Antoinette de Mirecourt" (1864) and "Clive Weston's Wedding Anniversary" (1872), Leprehon first served an apprenticeship as a writer of English high life novels for the Garland. "The Stepmother" (1847), "Ida Beresford; or, The Child of Fashion" (1848), "Florence; or, Wit and Wisdom" (1849), "Eva Huntingdon" (1850) and "Clarence Fitz-Clarence; or, Passages from the Life of an Egoist" (1851) all owe their existence to the popularity of fashionable silver fork fiction in England in the 1830's and 1840's.

Although Leprehon was able to effect a transition from writing about England to writing about Canada, many of her successors did not follow suit. Perhaps the most cogent illustrations of the difficulty of filling the form of the novel with Canadian content occur in the periodicals founded on the wave of national enthusiasm which accompanied Confederation. Magazines like the New Dominion Monthly (1867-79), the Canadian Illustrated News (1869-80), the Canadian Monthly and National Review (1872-78) and Belford's Monthly Magazine (1876-78) present a remarkable cross-section of Canadian life in their serialized articles and short fiction, but to satisfy the demand for long fiction they usually serialized novels by Wilkie Collins, James Payn, Besant and Rice, and other popular British and American writers. In the case of some journals, like the Saturday Reader (1865-67), finances rather than patriotism governed the choice of serialized

fiction. The Saturday Reader's avowed purpose being "to make money," this short-lived periodical assumed that the fastest route to economic success was by "the reproduction of the works of British authors of repute."⁴¹ Twenty-six years later, the reliable drawing power of popular British and American novelists accounted for the Dominion Illustrated's triumphant announcement that

we have purchased the exclusive rights for Canada for the publication of a series of new and brilliant serial stories, by leading English authors, to be continued throughout the year. Robert Buchanan, Hawley Smart, W. Clark Russell, Geo. Manville Fenn, who, with other prominent writers, will contribute serials to our columns, are known all over the English-speaking world as being in the front rank of novelists.⁴²

To its credit, the Dominion Illustrated also published many Canadian short stories, and began its new series in 1892 by serializing Charles G. D. Roberts's "The Raid from Beauséjour."

When the New Dominion Monthly was founded in 1867, it relied heavily on material selected from British and American periodicals like the Atlantic Monthly, Harper's and All the Year Round. This magazine soon established its national orientation by increasing its native content until it consisted almost entirely of items by Canadians about Canada. Only a small proportion of this material was fictional, however, the bulk of it being essays, reminiscences, and descriptive, historical or character sketches. Unlike most other Canadian periodicals of its time, what serial fiction it did publish was Canadian in both origin and content, usually historical romance or didactic and sentimental accounts of love

or business adventures. The magazine's desire to establish itself as one which "the ladies will look upon as a counsellor and friend"⁴³ narrowed its fictional concerns to amorous entanglements and the achievement of domestic harmony, in the forests of New France or the countryside and towns of contemporary Ontario.

Belford's Monthly Magazine (1876-78), which published considerably more fiction than the New Dominion Monthly, maintained its national orientation to the point of accepting short stories about such diverse Canadian subjects as Cobourg summer romances ("A Romance of the Arlington Hops"⁴⁴) and Canadian family ghosts ("My Grandfather's Ghost Story"⁴⁵). For its serialized novels, however, it turned to James Payn and J. G. Holland. The contents of the Canadian Monthly and National Review -- undoubtedly the most erudite and sophisticated periodical of this period -- were almost entirely Canadian in origin. Yet its novels, by Canadian writers like Louisa Murray and Mrs. J. V. Noel, were set in Ireland or Italy or France. Although nearly every number of the Canadian Monthly contained one or two installments of serialized fiction, its only long pieces to deal with Canada were "Clive Weston's Wedding Anniversary,"⁴⁶ Rosanna Leprohon's two-part story of Montreal social life which hardly counts as a novel, Agnes Maule Machar's two novels "For King and Country"⁴⁷ and "Lost and Won,"⁴⁸ and G. A. Mackenzie's "Selma: A Tale of the Summer Holidays,"⁴⁹ an inconsequential love story. In its later years, before and after it amalgamated with Belford's in 1878

to form Rose-Belford's Canadian Monthly, this magazine ran two novels by Besant and Rice, two by F. W. Robinson, one by James Payn, one by William Black, and five pieces by Wilkie Collins. Given the Monthly's policy of promoting Canadian culture, it would appear that its failure to publish much long Canadian fiction was due more to a dearth of appropriate Canadian novels than to the popularity of the English and American writers.

The large and lavish Canadian Illustrated News (1869-1880) repeated the pattern of its fellow periodicals. Less interested in Canadian fiction than in Canadian subjects for picturesque engravings, it nevertheless commenced publication by sponsoring a contest offering prizes for the best "ROMANCES founded on Incidents in the History of Canada"⁵⁰ and serialized the winners. During its first years this magazine's fiction was primarily Canadian in origin and content, but by its later volumes it too had turned to non-Canadian sources, running novels by Miss Braddon, Wilkie Collins, Rhoda Broughton, and Besant and Rice.

When the Canadian Illustrated News decided to pursue its search for Canadian literature in the direction of the historical romance, it was simply voicing the general assumption that the way to build a Canadian novelistic tradition was to follow the lead of Walter Scott. In Britain, one of Scott's major contributions to the development of fiction was to establish the respectability of the novel among the middle classes.⁵¹ In Canada, Scott was valued not only for his moral wholesomeness, but also for his

example in substantiating almost single-handedly the literary validity of a previously neglected culture. In 1874 Reverend M. Harvey of Saint John's, who contributed many articles to the Maritime Monthly Magazine, articulated Scott's significance to a society seeking literary self-definition. Calling for a Sir Walter Scott for Newfoundland, Harvey asked:

Who knew or cared anything about Scotland till Walter Scott lifted the veil and revealed her, not only to her own astonished and delighted inhabitants, but also to other nations who had hitherto despised or derided "the land of mountain and of flood." The future will no doubt produce a Walter Scott for Newfoundland, who will gather up its traditions and superstitions, its tales of peril and heroic daring among its ice-laden seas, the oddities of humours of its fisher-folk, the tragedy and comedy of human existence as here developed, and perhaps weave them into such charming romances, poems and dramas as shall win the ear of the world.⁵²

Before Canadian traditions, superstitions, tales and oddities could find their way into novels, they had to be recognized and validated in the literary periodicals, in short fiction and sketches which focussed on single incidents and events. This process began in the 1820's, with tales elevated to the status of legend like "The Fairy Harp" (1824)⁵³ and "The Faithful Heart" (1825).⁵⁴ In the later periodicals, in addition to the familiar Canadian themes of winter social life, ice accidents, hunting adventures, adults or children lost in the bush, historical events, encounters with Indians and hardships of settlement, Canadian storytellers wrote about smuggling on the St. Lawrence or the Great Lakes,⁵⁵ crime and vice in Canadian villages,⁵⁶ Ontario

court-room drama,⁵⁷ and Toronto ghosts.⁵⁸

For novelists who sought financial success beyond Canada, the problem of Canada's validity as a location for fiction was compounded by the requirements of the international popular novel market. In the latter half of the nineteenth century, British and American popular taste required complex, sensational plots set in familiar or exotic places. May Agnes Fleming, "a Saint John housewife" who earned a comparative fortune by her pen in the 1870's, resolved the problem by constructing the plot of each of her forty-two novels so that some of the action occurred in Canada.⁵⁹ For James De Mille, a scholar who debased his literary talents to pay off his family debts in the 1860's and 1870's,⁶⁰ the situation was rather more complex.

Although De Mille generally relied on the familiar tricks of the market novelist for the ingredients of his highly contrived plots, in a few of his "potboilers" (as he called them)⁶¹ he did manage to add some Canadian content to his usual canon of sensational machinery. The American Baron (1872) is set mostly in Italy, but one of the novel's many romantic entanglements begins when a young Englishman, visiting Canada, rescues a young lady from a forest fire in the Ottawa valley. A Comedy of Terrors (1872) opens with a Montreal merry widow recounting how a brave American rescued her chignon when it was blown onto the cliffs at Niagara. In order to complicate the plot, however, all the

characters soon traipse off to Europe where they are trapped in the siege of Paris during the Franco-Prussian war. Cord and Crease (1869), whose plot ranges from Australia to Hong Kong to England to San Salvador, also includes Canada when De Mille likens a south Asian desert island to Sable Island. Some of this book's minor characters reportedly die in the Quebec cholera epidemics of the 1830's, but are later found in Halifax. But aside from his juvenile B.O.W.C. series, De Mille wrote only two novels whose primary action occurs in Canada.

The first of these, The Lady of the Ice (1870), is De Mille's most accomplished piece of fiction after A Strange Manuscript Found in a Copper Cylinder (1888). The plot centres on an indigenously Canadian catastrophe which became a convention in nineteenth-century Canadian literature: the rescue of a character trapped on an ice floe when a river (preferably the St. Lawrence) breaks up in the spring.⁶² In this instance the rescued is a mysterious young lady, and her saviour a flippant young officer stationed at Quebec whose first-person narrative consistently betrays his fatuousness and conceit. The book's literary humour (reflecting De Mille's own erudition), self-revealing narrator and clearly delineated characters and events render it far more successful than De Mille's other adult Canadian novel, a trivial historical romance titled The Lily and the Cross (1875).

Presumably part of De Mille's motivation in writing his B.O.W.C. series of boys' adventure stories was to show that his

native region did contain valid literary material, even if not of the sort to appeal to the general adult readership of his American publishers. Although bibliographic information on De Mille is sparse, his Maritime juvenile fiction appears to have remained in print long after his potboilers disappeared from publishers' lists. First published in 1869 and the early 1870's, each of these books went through three or four editions, and in 1902 they were still listed by the Boston firm of Lee & Shepard in their American Boys' Series.⁶³

In these novels, De Mille drew on his Saint John childhood and his own Grand Pré schooldays. He lavishes much attention on the physical beauties of the Fundy area, proclaiming its superiority to even the most celebrated landscapes of Europe. In a Grand Pré sunrise, he says,

you may see all that can be presented by even Italy in every part of its varied outline -- on the plain, on the mountain top, or by the seaside; you may traverse the Apennines, or wander by the Mediterranean shore; or look over the waste Campagna, and yet never find anything that can surpass those atmospheric effects which may be witnessed along the shores that surround the Basin of Minas.⁶⁴

In addition to substantial geographical detail, De Mille's Maritime material included an account of the great Miramichi fire of 1825, an incident at the Tracadie leper colony, visits to the Magdalen and Sable Islands, and many references to the Acadians. In The Treasure of the Seas (1873) he exploited the local legend that Captain Kidd had buried his treasure on Oak Island, off the

south-west coast of Nova Scotia. While these books are not as overtly didactic as those in the same author's Young Dodge Club series, much historical and geographical information is carefully worked into their narrative structure.

The world of the B.O.W.C. books is essentially a benign childhood paradise, in which the Fundy area provides adventure without real danger. When the boys of Grand Pré School establish their secret society (the Brethren of the White Cross, hence B.O.W.C.), they try to impose on the Nova Scotian landscape the activities they have read about in American and British boys' books. Games like building medieval fortresses, playing pirate and digging for treasure prove abortive, however. Instead, the boys encounter the genuine character of their country when at various times they are lost in the woods, lost in the fog, trapped by the St. John reversing falls, shipwrecked along the Fundy coast or on Anticosti Island, or trapped by forest fire. Although they occasionally encounter the possibility of death or starvation, rescue is always imminent. Like the children in Catharine Parr Traill's The Canadian Crusoes (1850), De Mille's boys learn to use their common sense in order to survive, discovering that human rationality can overcome difficulties imposed by the natural world. In De Mille's fiction as whole, genuine disaster and evil are reserved for non-Canadian situations: when murder is attempted by sealing up a character in the catacombs of Rome in An Open Question (1873), by pushing a character overboard in a hurricane

in Cord and Crease (1869), or by abandoning several characters at the bottom of a flooding treasure pit in Old Garth (1883). Yet in his Maritime fiction De Mille rejected one set of conventions only to set up another. Although the B.O.W.C. books are free from the preposterous plots and characters of his potboilers -- in the creation of which De Mille seems to have enjoyed a perverse literary pleasure -- they foster a point of view which regards Canada as a location appropriate only for harmless, idyllic fiction, suitable for children and Mrs. Grundy.

Novelists who succeeded De Mille continued to encounter difficulties regarding Canada's validity as a location for fiction. In the 1890's and early 1900's authors trying to survive solely by their writing had to decide whether to stay national (and poor) or go international and leave Canada behind. Many of the internationalists literally became expatriates, some of them clustering around the Idler in London, which was edited from 1892 to 1895 by Robert Barr and published work by Barr, Gilbert Parker, Grant Allen and Sara Jeannette Duncan. Of the expatriates, Sara Jeannette Duncan was certainly the greatest loss to Canada. Because her novels focus on the ability or inability of characters to perceive and understand the world around them, her own experiences in Britain and India provided richer material than Canada could supply. As she stated in an 1895 interview,

there is such abundance of material in Anglo-Indian life -- it is full of such picturesque incident, such

tragic chance. I assure you, the most commonplace Englishman, with that background, becomes, by contrast, invested with all sorts of interesting qualities.⁶⁵

But before she left Canada in 1891, when she married Charles Everard Cotes, curator of the Indian Museum at Calcutta, Duncan had made an indelible impression on the Canadian literary scene. An avowed realist in the tradition of William Dean Howells and Henry James, Sara Jeannette Duncan had energetically attempted to overcome the cultural conservatism of the Canadian public. In the 1880's her articles in The Week, the Toronto Globe and the Montreal Daily Star relentlessly badgered Canadians to relinquish their prejudices against serious, realistic fiction; and to enjoy the innovations occurring in novels which reached beyond the narrow vision of a colonial backwater.

NOTES TO CHAPTER III

- ¹ Andrew Shiels, The Witch of the Westcot (Halifax: Joseph Howe, 1931), n. pag.
- ² Shiels, n. pag.
- ³ "The Literature of a New Country," Monthly Review, 1 (Jan. 1841), 59-60.
- ⁴ "The Literature of a New Country," 60-61.
- ⁵ "The Literature of a New Country," 61.
- ⁶ Desmond Pacey, Creative Writing in Canada, new ed. (1961; rpt. Toronto: McGraw-Hill Ryerson, 1967), p. 25.
- ⁷ "The Literature of a New Country," 61.
- ⁸ "Canadian Poetry and Poets," BAM, 1 (Aug. 1863), 417.
- ⁹ John E. Logan ("Barry Dane"), "National Literature," The Week, 1 (21 Aug. 1884), 601.
- ¹⁰ Susanna Moodie, "Introduction" to Mark Hurdlestone (1853; rpt. in Moodie, Life in the Clearings, ed. R. L. McDougall, Toronto: Macmillan, 1959), p. 292.
- ¹¹ Andrew Learmont Spedon, Tales of the Canadian Forest (Montreal: Lovell, 1861), p. 203.
- ¹² Spedon, Tales, p. 203.
- ¹³ Andrew Learmont Spedon, Canadian Summer Evening Tales (Montreal: Lovell, 1866), p. 5.
- ¹⁴ Catharine Parr Traill, The Backwoods of Canada (London: Knight, 1836), pp. 153-54.

¹⁵ Catharine Parr Traill, Journal, 16 August 1837, Traill Family Papers, vol. 2, PAC.

¹⁶ Catharine Parr Traill, Journal, 29 January 1838, Traill Family Papers.

¹⁷ Susanna Moodie, Roughing It in the Bush (1852; rpt. Toronto: Bell & Cockburn, 1913), p. 281.

¹⁸ Moodie, Roughing It in the Bush, pp. 281-82.

¹⁹ See George L. Parker, "Literary Journalism Before Confederation," Canadian Literature, No. 68-69 (Spring/Summer 1976), 97.

²⁰ Flora Lyndsay; or, Passages in an Eventful Life (London: Bentley, 1854). First serialized in the Literary Garland as "Trifles from the Burthen of a Life," LG, n.s. 9 (March-July 1851).

²¹ First serialized in the Literary Garland, n.s. 9 (Sept.-Dec. 1851).

²² Carl F. Klinck, "Literary Activity in Canada East and Canada West (1841-1880)," Literary History of Canada, (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1967), p. 146.

²³ Mrs. Holliwell, "The Settler's Daughter," BAM, 1 (June 1863) - 2 (Nov. 1863).

²⁴ John Gibson, "The Hermit of Saint Maurice," LG, 1 (Dec. 1838), 5-15.

²⁵ Mrs. MacLachlan ("E.M.M."), "The Pride of Lorette. A Tale Founded on Fact," LG, 2 (July 1840), 337-51.

²⁶ A., "The Heiress; an Adventure at the Springs," LG, 2 (March 1840), 161-64.

²⁷ T., "The Ruins. A Canadian Legend," LG, n.s. 2 (Oct. 1844), 467-68.

²⁸ Clarence Ormond, "Canadian Legends. 1. The Ruined Cottage," LG, n.s. 4 (April 1846), 177-79.

²⁹ Mrs. Cheney ("H.V.C."), "A Legend of the Lake," LG, n.s. 9 (Feb. 1851), 74-79.

³⁰ Mrs. Cheney ("H.V.C."), "The Old Manuscript; a Mémoir of the Past," LG, n.s. 9 (April-Sept. 1851).

³¹ Mrs. Cushing ("E.L.C."), "A Canadian Legend," LG, 1 (March 1839), 167-80.

³² Andrew Learmont Spedon, "Marriage in Middle Life," in his Tales of the Canadian Forest (Montreal: Lovell, 1861).

³³ Mrs. J. V. Noel, "The Secret of Stanley Hall," Saturday Reader, 12 (3 Feb. 1866) - 21 (10 March 1866).

³⁴ J. G. Bourinot, "Marquerite: -- A Tale of Forest Life in the New Dominion," NDM, Jan.-June 1870.

³⁵ John Gibson, "The Hermit of Saint Maurice," LG, 1 (Dec. 1838), 5-15.

³⁶ Mrs. Bayley, "The Elopement," LG, n.s. 1 (Jan.-Feb. 1843).

³⁷ M. W., "The Gibbet Tree," LG, n.s. 2 (Feb. 1844), 69-78.

³⁸ C., "The Old Man's Tale," LG, n.s. 3 (Jan. 1845), 41-45.

³⁹ Clarence Ormond, "Canadian Legends. 1. The Ruined Cottage," LG, n.s. 4 (April 1846), 177-79.

⁴⁰ Hamilton Aylmer, "Alciphron Leicester," Victoria Magazine, 1 (Jan.-March 1848).

⁴¹ "Our Undertaking," Saturday Reader, 1 (Sept. 1865), 1.

⁴² "To Our Readers," DI, 6 (Jan. 1891), 2.

⁴³ "Publisher's Department," NDM, March 1876, 237.

⁴⁴ W. J. D., "A Romance of the Arlington Hops," BMM, 1 (March 1877), 534-47.

⁴⁵ W. I. D., "My Grandfather's Ghost Story," BMM, 3 (Feb. 1878), 301-08.

⁴⁶ Rosanna Leprohon, "Clive Weston's Wedding Anniversary," CMNR, 2 (Aug.-Sept., 1872).

⁴⁷ Agnes Maule Machar, "For King and Country," CMNR, 5 (Feb.-June 1874).

⁴⁸ Agnes Maule Machar, "Lost and Won," CMNR, 7 (Jan. 1875) - 8 (Dec. 1875).

- 49 G. A. Mackenzie, "Selma: A Tale of the Summer Holidays," CMNR, 12 (Aug.-Oct. 1877).
- 50 CIN, Prospectus, 1869.
- 51 See John Henry Raleigh, "What Scott Meant to the Victorians," in his Time Place and Idea (Carbondale and Edwardsville: Southern Illinois University Press, 1968), pp. 96-125.
- 52 Rev. M. Harvey, "A Trio of Forgotten Worthies," Maritime Monthly, 4 (Nov. 1874), 408-09.
- 53 John Howard Willis ("H."), "The Fairy Harp," CRLHJ 1 (Dec. 1824), 311-48.
- 54 John Howard Willis ("H."), "The Faithful Heart," CMLR, 4 (April 1825), 416-18.
- 55 Caldwell, "Sam Horton's Last Trip," LG, n.s. 1 (Dec. 1843), 522-24; James McCarroll, "The Adventures of a Night," AAM, 6 (Dec. 1854), 553-60.
- 56 "Sketches of Village Life," LG, 3 (Jan.-May 1841); Harry Bloomfield, "Richard Craighton," LG, n.s. 5 (Jan.-June 1847).
- 57 C.W. Cooper, "Jessie's Lawsuit," CMNR, 2 (July 1872), 25-36.
- 58 John Charles Dent, "The Gerrard Street Mystery," BMM, 1 (May 1877), 761-81.
- 59 Fred Cogswell, "Literary Activity in the Maritime Provinces, 1815-1880," in Literary History of Canada ed. Carl F. Klinck (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1967), p. 111.
- 60 See A. J. Crockett, "Concerning James De Mille," in More Studies in Nova Scotian History, ed. George Patterson (Halifax: Imperial Publishing, 1941), pp. 124-25.
- 61 Lawrence J. Burpee, Canadian Novels and Novelists (n.p. 1901), p. 10.
- 62 Ice accidents appear in Philippe Aubert de Gaspé's Les Anciens Canadiens (1863); J. A. H., "The Story of Jenny Stuart," NDM, 2, (Sept. 1868), 335-39; Arthur Faverel, "Rosalba, or: Faithful to Two Lovers," CIN, 1 (19 March-16 April 1870); Susan Frances Harrison's Ringfield (1912).

⁶³ Tom Flemming, "James De Mille, A Bibliography," unpublished manuscript prepared for Dalhousie School of Library Service, 1974.

⁶⁴ James De Mille, The Boys of Grand Pré School (Boston: Lee & Shepard, 1871), p. 66.

⁶⁵ G. B. Burgin, "A Chat with Sara Jeannette Duncan," Idler, 8 (1895), 117.

CHAPTER IV

SARA JEANNETTE DUNCAN AND THE PROGRESS OF REALISM

In The Progress of Romance (1785), the first book-length discussion of prose fiction written in England, Clara Reeve defined the terms "romance" and "novel":

The Romance is an heroic fable, which treats of fabulous persons and things. -- The Novel is a picture of real life and manners, and of the times in which it was written. The Romance in lofty and elevated language, describes what never happened nor is likely to happen. -- The Novel gives a familiar relation of such things, as pass every day before our eyes, such as may happen to our friend or to ourselves; and the perfection of it, is to represent every scene, in so easy and natural a manner, and to make them appear probable, as to deceive us into a persuasion (at least while we are reading) that all is real, until we are affected by the joys or distress, of the persons in the story, as if they were our own.

A century later, Sara Jeannette Duncan subscribed to Reeve's basic distinction between romantic fiction and literary realism when she urged her fellow Canadians to relinquish their taste for the former, and to read and write serious novels concerned with everyday life. In her articles in The Week, the Toronto Globe and the Montreal Daily Star, published during the later 1880's, Duncan attacked the artificiality of old-fashioned

Scott-inspired romance, and heralded the innovations of literary realists like William Dean Howells and Henry James. In 1888 she applauded the way in which

Fiction seems determined to broaden its scope in all directions. Its encroaches upon metaphysical, scientific and economic ground within the last few years have been marked. Imagination alone would form most insufficient capital for the novelist of to-day. And it is quite excusable if in its exultant march forward an ambitious department of literature should take some false steps.²

Duncan's keen wit showed little mercy for those who advocated

the old fashioned method in fiction by which the heroine was brought safely and comfortably out of her woes and the reader was left in the agreeable certainty that only the unnecessary people had died, the evil disposed fallen into their own pit, and the truly deserving married and lived happily ever afterward.³

She endorsed the advancements being made in progressive literary circles, where "modern tendencies in fiction" were fast gaining hold:

The idea seems to be gaining ground that life should be represented as it is and not as we would like it to be, regardless of probabilities. And in life as it is the traditions of the novelist are very often reversed. There is always consolation for the disconsolate, though, on the top shelves of the circulating libraries and in the old numbers of The Young Ladies Journal and similar publications.⁴

This literary radicalism, together with her energetic feminism, inspired Sara Jeannette Duncan to acclaim the modern heroine as one of the major achievements of the new realism:

The woman of today is no longer an exceptional being surrounded by exceptional circumstances. She bears a translatable relation to the world; and the novelists who translate it correctly have ceased to mark it by

unduly exalting one woman by virtue of her sex to a position of interest in their books which dwarfs all other characters. It has been found that successful novels can be written without her. The woman of today understands herself, and is understood in her present and possible worth. The novel of today is a reflection of our present social state. The women who enter into its composition are but intelligent agents in this reflection, and show themselves as they are, not as a false ideal would have them.⁵

Duncan was undoubtedly the most daring Canadian critic of her time, enjoying fiction which ventured beyond the bounds of harmless imagination and concerned itself with concrete social issues. However, her radicalism was not unlimited. As an author and a critic she both advocated and wrote fiction about ordinary people and ordinary life. But she restricted her radicalism to the decorous domestic and psychological realism of Howells and James, whom she described as "gentlemen both engaged in developing a school of fiction most closely and subtly related to the conditions and progress of our time."⁶ In a lengthy discussion of Howells's literary theory, Duncan lauded his arguments for realism, but she also made a deliberate point of asking that literature be true to art as well as to life:

A cabbage is a very essential vegetable to certain salads, but we do not prostrate ourselves adoringly before the cabbage bed in everyday life, and it is a little puzzling to know why we should be required to do so in art galleries and book stores, however perfect the representations there of cabbages, vegetable or human. If we do it is certainly purely the art we admire, not the nature. And so we take the liberty of thinking that literature should at its best be true not only to the objects upon and about which it constructs itself, but faithful also to all the delicate attractions and repulsions which enter so intimately into the highest art.⁷

She evinced obvious discomfort with the practices of European realists and naturalists and with popular sensational fiction which did not respect the principles of "the highest art."

Her own sense of propriety emerged in her 1887 defence of female hack novelists, when she remarked that bad novels were produced by men just as often as by women, and that women, at least,

have no part in contributing the depraved element of fiction which drags the average down. The work of women in fiction does not increase the statistics of crime. In being denied such contact with the world as might serve to make their books stronger and more realistic they are also deprived of the temptation of making them the dangerous social force that cheap sensational literature represents.⁸

In her Globe column of June 17, 1885, Duncan defined the qualified realism she favoured. Ostensibly describing the literary taste of women in general, she in fact stated her own preferences:

The ordinary detail of humdrum life and circumstance, pen-painted by an artist with sympathies keen enough to detect the mysterious throbbing of the life that is inner and under, fascinates us like our own photographs. As a rule we dislike strong situation and sanguinary scenes are the exception in recent novels of the better class. Coarseness we cannot tolerate, even with that saving sauce in the eyes of men -- humour.⁹

Because she recoiled from "sanguinary scenes" and "coarseness," Duncan's appreciation of the modern novel's engagement with the great social issues of the day was frequently tempered by a tone of restraint. This reserve appeared in her article on "Outworn Literary Methods," in which she observed that

The novel of to-day may be written to show the culminative action of a passion, to work out an ethical problem of

everyday occurrence, to give body and form to a sensation of the finest or of the coarsest kind, for almost any reason which can be shown to have a connection with the course of human life, and development of human character. Motives of this sort are not confined to any given school or its leaders, but affect the mass of modern novel writers very generally, and inspire all whose work rises above the purpose of charming the idle hour of that bored belle in her boudoir, whose tastes used to be so exclusively catered to by small people in fiction. The old rules by which any habitual novel reader could prophesy truly at the third chapter how the story would "come out" are disregarded, the well-worn incidents discarded, the sine qua nons audaciously done without. Fiction has become a law unto itself, and its field has broadened with the assumption.¹⁰

Aware that fiction had become "a law unto itself," Duncan maintained a healthy scepticism regarding those proponents of realism who autocratically "announce to their scribbling emulators the only proper and acceptable form of the modern novel, announce it imperiously, and note departures from it with wrath."¹¹ When she reviewed An Algonquin Maiden (1887), co-authored by Graeme Mercer Adam and Ethelwyn Wetherald, Duncan admitted that old-fashioned romance retained an appeal which all the logic and rhetoric of the literary realists could not diminish:

Gentlemen of the realistic school, one is disposed to consider you very right in so far as you go, but to believe you mistaken in your idea that you go the whole distance and can persuade the whole novel-reading fraternity to take the same path through the burdocks and the briars. Failing this, you evidently believe that you can put to the edge of the sword every wretched romanticist who presumes to admire the exotic of the idea, and to publish his admiration. This is also a mistake, for both of the authors of "An Algonquin Maiden" are alive, and, I believe, in reasonable health; and "An Algonquin Maiden" is a romance, a romance of the most uncompromising description, a romance that might have been written if the realistic school had never been heard of.¹²

In this review, Duncan simultaneously recognized the persistence of the romantic temperament and wittily castigated the improbabilities imposed by the romantic mode. But she also acknowledged that romance, when well-written, could render ridiculous conventions quite palatable. Her assessment of the ending of An Algonquin Maiden began as censure, but turned into moderate praise:

True to the traditions of romance, the authors arrange a perfectly satisfactory termination of affairs for everybody concerned. Odd numbers being incompatible with unalloyed bliss, Miss Wetherald drowns the unfortunate Algonquin maiden, in the chapter before the last, which she styles poetically "The Passing of Wanda" -- drowns her in a passage of such sympathetic grace that one becomes more than reconciled to the sad necessity of the act, and convinced that the love-smitten Algonquin maiden herself could ask no happier fate.¹³

Duncan's flexible point of view permitted her to treat An Algonquin Maiden quite differently in her "Woman's World" column in the Globe. Aware that she was no longer writing for the select readership of The Week, but for the public at large, Duncan refrained from adverse criticism. Instead she exchanged her role of literary realist for that of literary nationalist, and enthusiastically promoted the book as "an unaccustomed literary sensation . . . in a land where literary sensations are about as frequent as earthquakes."¹⁴

In such an unabashed romance as An Algonquin Maiden there was little room for the kind of realism which Duncan defined as "the everlasting glorification of the commonplace."¹⁵ Yet she did not find romance and realism necessarily incompatible, as

her discussion of Frances Brooke's The History of Emily Montague (1769) reveals. Although "Mrs. Brooke wrote in the palmy days of heroes and heroines," Duncan discovered in the first novel about Canada a valuable "picture of contemporary British ways of thinking and writing, as well as a sprightly and presumably truthful account of our own social beginnings."¹⁶ Moreover, Duncan's personal preference for novels concerned with social reality did not cloud her perception that one of the primary traits of prose fiction is its variability of form. The art of fiction, she stated, "having for its shifting and variable basis, humanity, is bound to present itself in more diverse forms than any other -- constantly to find new ones, constantly to recur to old ones."¹⁷ The frequent recurrence of the old forms of romance originated in the motivation of ordinary readers, which Duncan recognized to be their desire to project themselves into a world which satisfied their fantasies and reinforced their prejudices:

The average novel reader likes above all a book in which his imagination will permit him to feel at home, a book in which the people talk as he would like to have talked, and act as he would like to have acted, and a book which makes any number of sacrifices of the probabilities in order to arrive at an orthodox and comfortable conclusion.¹⁸

Sara Jeannette Duncan put her own critical principles into practice when she humorously played with her reader's expectation of an "orthodox and comfortable conclusion" in two of her lighter novels, An American Girl in London (1891) and its sequel, A

Voyage of Consolation (1898). Both concern the European adventures of Mamie Wick, a bright young lady from Chicago (and literary cousin of Daisy Miller) whose ingenuous spirit exposes the limitations and prejudices of the British and American characters she encounters. In her first narrative Mamie is courted by Mr. Mafferton, a proper young Englishman whose attentions certainly anticipate a wedding-bells ending. As The Week's reviewer of this novel remarked, "we feel we shall not be surprised if the usual fate which pursues pretty American girls overtakes our heroine. That it does not is perhaps the cleverest thing in the book."¹⁹ In the last pages of An American Girl in London, Mamie unexpectedly reveals that she had utterly misinterpreted Mafferton's behaviour because she was secretly engaged to a young man back home.

Having deflated her reader's expectation of a transatlantic marriage in her first book, Mamie opens her second by declaring that both her behaviour and her apparently frank autobiographical report had in fact been conditioned by the requirements of the romantic novel:

I once had such a good time in England that I printed my experiences, and at the very end of the volume it seemed necessary to admit that I was engaged to Mr. Arthur Greenleaf Page, of Yale College, Connecticut. I remember thinking that this was indiscreet at the time, but I felt compelled to bow to the requirements of fiction. I was my own heroine, and I had to be disposed of. There seemed to be no alternative. I did not wish to marry Mr. Mafferton, even for literary purposes. . . . So I committed that indiscretion.

In order that the world might be assured that my heroine married and lived happily ever afterwards, I took it prematurely into my confidence regarding my intention. The thing that occurred, as naturally and inevitably as the rain if you leave your umbrella at home, was that within a fortnight after my return to Chicago my engagement to Mr. Page terminated.²⁰

In A Voyage of Consolation, Duncan again simultaneously mocks and works within popular literary convention. The marriage ending that Mamie rejects at the beginning of the book is affirmed with a vengeance at its conclusion. After a series of coincidental encounters while travelling through continental Europe, Mamie and all the unattached characters (including Mr. Mafferton) terminate their adventures in three, and possibly four marriages -- Mamie becoming Mrs. Arthur Greenleaf Page after all. Sara Jeannette Duncan, like James De Mille before her, discovered that one way to come to terms with the inescapable demands and conventions of the novel as a narrative form was to treat the conventions ironically. Rather than search for new literary form, Duncan in these two books manipulated traditional form for her own purposes, producing some delightful humour in the process.

Even in her comic novels, like the Mamie Wick books and Vernon's Aunt (1894), Duncan experimented with literary form to a certain extent. Here, as in her more serious fiction, she moved away from the novel of plot towards the novel of character and idea, which defines and reveals character by focussing on an individual's perception of the world around him. Mamie Wick evokes more interest for her piquant comments upon British society

than for her amorous involvements. Elfrida Bell, the Bohemian heroine of A Daughter of Today (1894), speaks for Duncan herself when she states that "forra novel one wants a leading idea -- the plot, of course, is of no particular consequence. Rather I should say plots have merged into leading ideas."²¹ The "leading idea" of Duncan's serious fiction -- set in India, Canada or Britain -- is to explore how modes and limitations of perception shape people's lives. Hence her concern is not narrative for the sake of adventure, but the effect of events on the formation of vision. As Duncan herself says of Lorne Murchison's trip to England in The Imperialist (1904), "what he absorbed and took back with him is, after all, what we have to do with; his actual adventures are of no importance."²² Duncan's own novels tend to be weakest when she tries to construct plots based on "actual adventures"; this is especially true of some of her later books, like Set in Authority (1906), His Royal Happiness (1914) and Title Clear (1922). In her best writing she almost abandons plot, delineating characters whose pathos, comedy and potential tragedy arise from their one-sided view of the world around them. Her limited characters generally reveal their short-sightedness in contrast to the more astute perceptions of characters of superior vision, a structure she may have assimilated from Jane Austen.

At the lowest end of Duncan's scale of vision sit individuals like the Brownes of The Simple Adventures of a Memsahib (1893),

who transfer their middle-class British life to Anglo-India with only minute effects on their own sensibilities. More interesting and disturbing are those characters who not only fail to sense their limitations, but who try to change the world around them by putting into practice the principles underlying their distorted vision. In Canada, idealistic Lorne Murchison of The Imperialist fails to transform Canada's political relationship with Britain because he completely loses touch with concrete everyday life. In The Burnt Offering (1909), set in India, Vulcan Miles, a British social democrat, ruins his own parliamentary career and nearly incites grave political trouble because he cannot evaluate the Indian situation on its own terms. As with Murchison, Miles's interpretation of the political situation in which he finds himself is coloured by his romantic perception of his own role in the greater world. The source of Vulcan Miles's limited vision is that he

belonged, emphatically, to the earlier emergence of the Socialist idea, before it had learned the necessity of compromise, or the value of business methods. . . . Vulcan's long-contemplated journey had . . . brought him to the heart of a political romance where a knight was clearly needed, a mailed fist, with a pipe in it, and no nonsense about it, to take the part of inarticulate millions. He came to it out of a world of prosaic engagements, mean streets, and wet umbrellas, and he brought a capacity for sentiment which was like the thirst of a lifetime.²³

Through characters like Lorne Murchison and Vulcan Miles, Sara Jeannette Duncan (like Scott in Waverley and Flaubert in Madame Bovary) exposed the inability of the romantic temperament

to cope with the complexities of everyday life. Through her untraditional literary structures, Duncan rejected the novel of plot in favour of the novel of idea. Hence in her fiction as well as in her criticism Sara Jeannette Duncan tried to push Canadian fiction into what she identified as the mainstream of serious literary artistry -- the social and psychological realism of writers like Howells and James. But that direction was to be pursued only by a younger generation of Canadian novelists, beginning in the 1920's when Grove, Ostenso, Knister and others finally established in Canada trends which had already dominated sophisticated European literature for more than fifty years. With the one obvious exception of Duncan Campbell Scott, whose achievement in the short story indicates that he shared Duncan's interest in capturing inner experience, most of Duncan's Canadian contemporaries yielded to their financial ambitions and their own innate conservatism and eschewed the frontiers of literary realism.

As an avowed literary realist Sara Jeannette Duncan enjoyed only one notable Canadian predecessor. From the mid-1830's to the mid-1850's Thomas Chandler Haliburton used his famous character of Sam Slick to advocate a form of eighteenth-century realism that was "true to nature." This phrase indicated not detailed accuracy so much as faithfulness to a more generalized kind of truth. Slick explains its meaning in Nature and Human Nature (1855), the last of the volumes of sketches and observations he purportedly relates to the Squire. When asked if he had actually

said and done all he had recorded in his earlier books, Slick replies,

I wouldn't just like to swear to every word of it, but most of it is true, though some things are embellished a little, and some are fancy sketches. But they are all true to natur I have tried to stick to life as close as I could, and there is nothin' like natur, it goes home to the heart of us all.²⁴

Pursuing that generalized entity called "natur," Slick envisages his literary mission to be "Holding Up the Mirror." He informs the Squire that "the sketches I send you are from life; I paint things as you find them and know them to be."²⁵ Particularized detail excites some interest for its own sake; Sam subscribes to the dictum of "old Dictionary Johnson" that "the life of every man, if wrote truly, would be interesting" because "every man has a story of his own, and some things have happened to him that never happened to anybody else."²⁶ The importance of this individual realism, however, lies in the way it supports the truth that "natur is the same always." Hence Slick finds great literary value in the work of eighteenth-century novelists like Smollett and Fielding because their books are "true to life" and "a pictur of the times, and instructin' as well as amusin'."²⁷

Instruction combined with amusement was certainly Haliburton's own intention, since he advocated realism for didactic as well as literary purposes. While Sara Jeannette Duncan was primarily interested in the artistic possibilities of the novel, Haliburton's principal concern was to use popular literary forms to advance

social, economic and political causes. He remarked in 1839 that after he had completed his Historical and Statistical Account of Nova Scotia (1829),

It occurred to me that it would be advisable to resort to a more popular style, and, under the garb of amusement, to call attention to our noble harbors, our great mineral wealth, our healthy climate, our abundant fisheries, and our natural resources and advantages I was also anxious to stimulate my countrymen to exertion, to awaken ambition and substitute it for that stimulus which is furnished in other but poorer countries than ours by necessity. For this purpose I called in the aid of the Clockmaker.²⁸

Sam Slick shared his creator's interest in the practical effects of literature. In 1855 he congratulated himself for having incited noticeable changes in the habits and attitudes of Nova Scotians:

The Blue-nose of 1834 is no longer the Blue-nose of 1854. He is more active, more industrious, and more enterprising. Intelligent the critter always was, but unfortunately he was lazy. He was asleep then, now he is wide awake and up and doing. . . . A new generation has sprung up, some of the drones are still about the hive, but there is a young vigorous race coming on who will keep pace with age Now, I have held the mirror to these fellows to see themselves in, and it has scared them so they have shaved slick up, and made themselves look decent. I won't say I made all the changes myself, for Providence scourged them into activity, by sending the weavel into their wheatfields, the rot into their potatoes, and the drought into their hay crops.²⁹

According to Slick, hand in hand he and Providence had reformed and rejuvenated the stagnating province that he had first visited in the early 1830's.

Didacticism being Haliburton's overt motive, he did not

write within the tradition of the novel -- which would have involved the creation of a complete fictional world -- but within a tradition of social satire which allowed him to create one outstanding fictional character to express his own opinions about the real world.

The humour and vitality of the idiosyncratic Slick rather than Haliburton's practical messages accounted for the Clockmaker's remarkable popularity in England and the United States. According to V.L.O. Chittick, the character of Sam Slick was not an original invention but "the epitome and embodiment of a long current conception of the typical New Englander."³⁰ While American critics did not see Slick as an accurate representation of American character or a realistic individual in his own right, they enjoyed in him

much diverting liveliness, and at least a sort of stage vitality, so that, notwithstanding his decided lack of authenticity, he was well enough equipped with what makes for popular appeal to win his way promptly into an astonishingly widespread favor, not only in England and the colonies, but also in the United States.³¹

English critics praised Haliburton's "welcome unconventionality,"³² finding his down-to-earth attitude a refreshing contrast to the "Washington Irving style, which to us tastes like a composition of treacle and water, sickly and sweet."³³ As a fictional character Slick himself rivalled Sam Weller in common popularity,³⁴ winning the appreciation of French critics and even of Bismarck.³⁵

Nova Scotians, however, displayed mixed reactions. The Novascotian lauded Haliburton for establishing abroad the literary validity of Nova Scotia, declaring in 1838

That the "Clockmaker" excited much attention in this province is not surprising, for here, a literary work of even moderate pretension is a novelty -- a "rara avis"; but that it has been so generally admired by the experienced judges of England, stamps it with the quality of sterling merit.³⁶

Haliburton had placed Nova Scotia on the world map of literary humour; as The Novascotian announced when The Attaché appeared in 1843, "If England has its Dickens -- and Ireland her Lever -- Nova Scotia has her Haliburton whose literary fame is nothing dimmed by a comparison with his most popular contemporaries."³⁷

Unlike British and American reviewers, Nova Scotians read Haliburton not just for his humour but also for his political and social commentary, with which they took frequent issue. Although Joseph Howe had published the first series of The Clockmaker in The Novascotian, his democratic liberalism conflicted with Haliburton's toryism. In 1838 his newspaper objected to the political opinions expressed in the second series of The Clockmaker,³⁸ and in 1843 The Novascotian (no longer directed by Howe but still loyally Liberal) stopped its serialization of The Attaché because Haliburton's book was "not conspicuously conducive to good morals, religious freedom of conscience or political liberality."³⁹ The Novascotian always maintained its respect for Haliburton's literary ability, disparaging only his principles, but Julian, a contributor to the Acadian Recorder, could find absolutely no merit in his work. In 1837, Julian denounced Haliburton's style, structure and characterization, declaring that his primary object was "to libel the Plebian population

of the Province"⁴⁰:

The Author is evidently ignorant of the People whose domestic manners he has attempted to exhibit, and to ridicule, and of much of the country he has chosen for the theatre of his hero's adventures. His local characters are over wrought and false to nature, and the language which they are made to express themselves in, such as is unknown among them.⁴¹

Although Julian had clearly misread Haliburton's irony, Chittick's survey of reactions to Sam Slick indicates that The Clockmaker won more unstinted praise abroad than at home.⁴² Haliburton's fellow Nova Scotians paid closer attention to his political views than to his literary accomplishments, with the result that "his influence on Canada is political rather than literary, whereas his reputation and influence in the world is literary rather than political."⁴³

Of all Haliburton's books, only The Old Judge (1849), his sole piece of fiction not narrated by Sam Slick, anticipates the work of Sara Jeannette Duncan. In The Old Judge, Haliburton put his penchant for literary realism to serious use, attempting "to delineate Life in a Colony"⁴⁴ by assembling a collection of Nova Scotian tales and sketches which reveal "an unsuspected facet of romantic feeling and talents of a high order for serious fiction."⁴⁵ The original form of the book presents an anatomy of Nova Scotian life, history and society, using several narrators to describe and satirize elements as diverse as the Governor's ball and rural manners. Its structure of interspersed stories, essays, descriptive sketches and individual opinions achieves an

air of objectivity, despite the dominance of Haliburton's toryism, by balancing the quiet irony of educated commentators like Barclay and Judge Sandford against the un-self-conscious vitality and exuberant coarseness of the common people. Although definitely not a novel, The Old Judge indicates that Haliburton was capable of a degree of subtlety and restraint not present in the Sam Slick books, and suggests that had he been able to step down from his podium, he could probably have used his sense of literary realism to produce full-length fiction in line with the literary principles of Sara Jeannette Duncan. History has determined otherwise, however. As a humorist, Haliburton enjoyed no immediate Canadian successor. As an author of prose fiction, his reputation rests on the creation of one memorable character who voices satiric commentary, not on full-length novels and romances. Despite his deservedly high position in the annals of Canadian literature, and his advocacy of literary realism, Haliburton's writing bears little direct relation to the development of the Canadian novel.

Unlike Haliburton, most of Duncan's contemporaries and immediate successors displayed little interest in and talent for literary realism. In the 1890's and early 1900's a few realistic Canadian novels appeared, such as Francis W. Grey's Trollopian The Curé of St. Philippe (1899) and M. Allerdale Grainger's Woodsmen of the West (1908). These writers were virtually ignored by Canadians, who preferred the romances produced by more popular authors like Gilbert Parker and Robert Barr, the latter distinguished

by the Canadian Magazine as "the Prince of Canada's storytellers."⁴⁶

On several occasions, most notably in The Translation of a Savage (1893), Parker showed some talent for realistic social comedy.

Robert Barr also evinced some interest in social realism in The Mutable Many (1896), a serious look at labour unrest in industrial England. On the whole, however, Parker and Barr followed the trends of best-selling literature, identifying with the popular revival of romantic fiction that swept through the English-speaking world in the last decades of the nineteenth century.

This apparently sudden rebirth of a supposedly dormant taste for unrealistic literature can be seen in part as a low-brow reaction against the decadence of the Beardsley circle, and against the weighty and disturbing productions of the serious realists and naturalists. Modern British critics have attributed it to a number of causes. Forrest Reid, writing on "Minor Fiction in the 'Eighties,'"⁴⁷ ascribes the upsurge of ephemeral escapist romance to the peculiar taste of the critic Andrew Lang, who wielded his power in favour of tales of adventure. Amy Cruse, in The Victorians and Their Reading⁴⁸, locates its beginning in the popular successes of Hall Caine and Marie Corelli in the late 1880's. In his History of the English Novel, Ernest A. Baker finds Richard Blackmore, author of Lorna Doone (1869), a key source of the late Victorian taste for literary romance, and argues that the artistry of Robert Louis Stevenson gave romantic fiction new respectability in more serious literary circles in

the 1890's.⁴⁹ In a study titled "The Historical Novel in England since Sir Walter Scott," Hugh Walpole also describes Stevenson as a major figure in the revival of historical romance, holding his facile imitators responsible for the "grand romantic days from 1895 to 1910," when "the historical novel . . . became once again child-like."⁵⁰ Conscious that they were departing from the norm of mid-Victorian seriousness which had dominated fiction in the 1860's and 1870's, romantic novelists like Stevenson, Ouida and Hall Caine published lively defences of the imaginative adventure novel.⁵¹

This turn-of-the century surge of interest in romantic fiction appeared to signify changes in the accepted form and function of the novel, after the mid-Victorian realism of Trollope and Eliot, and away from the late Victorian naturalism of Hardy and Moore. But it was less a change than a re-affirmation, this time with the blessing of some respected critics, of the persistence of popular literary forms. Beneath the widespread appeal of realists like George Eliot, Thackeray and Harriet Beecher Stowe, there had always flourished a low-brow tradition of popular romance. It was established in an historical vein by imitators of Walter Scott like G. P. R. James, Ainsworth, Bulwer Lytton and Charles Reade, and pursued in a domestic and social vein by female novelists like Charlotte Yonge, Rhoda Broughton, Marry Braddon and Ouida. The apparent growth in romantic fiction that occurred in the 1830's and 1840's⁵² and again in the 1880's and 1890's did not indicate changes in the taste of the general reading public so much as

temporary closures of the gap between sophisticated literary artistry and elementary literary entertainment.

By choosing romance as their fictional mode, Canadian novelists throughout the nineteenth century deliberately removed themselves from the frontiers of serious literary development and placed themselves squarely within the mainstream of popular literature. Coming from a country which supplied "no established standards for them to uphold," the vast majority of Victorian Canadian novelists, as T. D. McLulich has observed, "allowed themselves to accept popularity as a measure of merit."⁵³ Hence to fairly evaluate most nineteenth-century Canadian novels it is necessary to place them within the context which produced them: the tradition of the popular romantic novel, established by Sir Walter Scott and supported by a colonial society which demanded that its literature be instructive, elevating, and "eminently respectable."⁵⁴

NOTES TO CHAPTER IV

¹ Clara Reeve, The Progress of Romance (1785; facsimile rpt. New York: Garland, 1970), p. 111.

² Sara Jeannette Duncan, "Saunterings," The Week, 5 (2 Aug. 1888), 574.

³ Sara Jeannette Duncan ("Garth Grafton"), "Bric à Brac," Montreal Daily Star, 17 Jan. 1888, p. 2.

⁴ Duncan, "Bric à Brac," Montreal Daily Star, 17 Jan. 1888, p. 2.

⁵ Duncan, "Saunterings," The Week, 3 (28 Oct. 1886), 771-72.

⁶ Duncan, "Literary Pabulum," The Week, 4 (24 Nov. 1887), 831.

⁷ Duncan, "Bric à Brac," Montreal Daily Star, 5 Dec. 1887, p. 2.

⁸ Duncan, "Bric à Brac," Montreal Daily Star, 31 Dec. 1887, p. 4.

⁹ Duncan ("Garth Grafton"), "Other People and I," Toronto Globe, 17 June 1885, p. 3.

¹⁰ Duncan, "Outworn Literary Methods," The Week, 4 (9 June, 1887), 451.

¹¹ Duncan, "Saunterings," The Week, 4 (13 Jan. 1887), 111.

¹² Duncan, "Saunterings," The Week, 4 (13 Jan. 1887), 111.

¹³ Duncan, "Saunterings," The Week, 4 (13 Jan. 1887), 112.

¹⁴ Duncan ("Garth Grafton"), "Women's World," Globe, 13 Jan. 1887, p. 6.

¹⁵ Duncan, "Saunterings," The Week, 4 (13 Jan. 1887), 111.

16. Duncan, "Bric à Brac," Montreal Daily Star, 26 May, 1888,
p. 2.
17. Duncan, "Bric à Brac," Montreal Daily Star, 26 May, 1888,
p. 2.
18. Duncan, "Saunterings," The Week, 5 (2 Aug. 1888), 574.
19. "Our Library Table," The Week, 8 (3 April 1891), 288.
20. Duncan, A Voyage of Consolation (New York: Appleton,
1898), pp. 1-2.
21. Duncan, A Daughter of Today (New York: Appleton, 1894),
p. 258.
22. Duncan, The Imperialist (Toronto: Copp Clark, 1904),
p. 190. For a more thorough analysis of this book, see my article,
"Duncan's Web," Canadian Literature, No. 63 (Winter 1975), 73-80.
23. Duncan, The Burnt Offering (1909; rpt. London: Methuen,
1919), pp. 117-20.
24. Thomas Chandler Haliburton, Nature and Human Nature
(1855; rpt. London: Hurst and Blackett, 1859), p. 83.
25. Haliburton, Nature and Human Nature, p. 244.
26. Haliburton, Nature and Human Nature, p. 245.
27. Haliburton, Nature and Human Nature, p. 245.
28. The Novascotian, 13 June 1839. Quoted by V. L. O. Chittick,
Thomas Chandler Haliburton (New York: Columbia University Press,
1924), p. 179.
29. Haliburton, Nature and Human Nature, pp. 238-39.
30. V. L. O. Chittick, Thomas Chandler Haliburton (New York:
Columbia University Press, 1924), p. 326.
31. Chittick, p. 350.
32. Chittick, p. 206.
33. "The World We Live In," Blackwood's, 42 (Nov. 1837), 677.
34. Chittick, pp. 351-52.

- 35 Chittick, pp. 355-56.
- 36 The Novascotian, 27 Sept. 1838. Quoted by Chittick, p. 233.
- 37 The Novascotian, 24 July, 1843. Quoted by Chittick, p. 477.
- 38 Chittick, p. 233.
- 39 The Novascotian, 4 Sept. 1843. Quoted by Chittick, p. 479.
- 40 Acadian Recorder, 10 June 1837. Quoted by Chittick, p. 211.
- 41 Acadian Recorder, 10 June 1837. Quoted by Chittick, pp. 209-10.
- 42 Chittick, pp. 350-57.
- 43 J. D. Logan, Thomas Chandler Haliburton (Toronto: Ryerson, 1923), p. 23.
- 44 Thomas Chandler Haliburton, The Old Judge; or, Life in a Colony (London: Colburn, 1849), I, p. 5.
- 45 Fred Cogswell, "Haliburton," in Literary History of Canada, ed. Carl F. Klinck (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1967), p. 100.
- 46 "Books and Authors," CM, 13 (Sept. 1899), 487.
- 47 Forrest Reid, "Minor Fiction in the 'Eighties," in The Eighteen-Eighties, ed. Walter de la Mare (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1930), pp. 107-35.
- 48 Amy Cruse, The Victorians and Their Reading (Boston and New York: Houghton Mifflin, 1935), p. 417.
- 49 Ernest A. Baker, History of the English Novel (1936; rpt. New York: Barnes & Noble, 1963), IX, pp. 290-93; 296-338.
- 50 Hugh Walpole, "The Historical Novel in England since Sir Walter Scott," in Sir Walter Scott Today, ed. H. J. C. Grierson (London: Constable, 1932), p. 183.
- 51 See items in George L. Barnett, ed., Nineteenth-Century British Novelists on the Novel (New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, 1971).
- 52 See James C. Simmons, The Novelist as Historian. Essays on the Victorian Historical Novel (The Hague: Mouton, 1973).

⁵³ T. D. McLulich, "Novel and Romance," Canadian Literature, No. 70 (Autumn 1976), 45.

⁵⁴ Roderick Random, "Letters to Living Authors -- Mr. Robert Louis Stevenson," The Week, 6 (5 July 1889), 487.

CHAPTER V

THE SEARCH FOR THE CANADIAN WALTER SCOTT: REQUIREMENTS FOR CANADIAN FICTION

In a 1968 essay on "Victorian Canada," the Canadian historian W. L. Morton discusses the colonial point of view that was responsible for the secondhand character of most nineteenth-century Canadian cultural life. According to Morton,

That a colonial society should be derivative in its style, mind and taste was only to be expected. Indeed, the need of a new country was not to be original but to prove the old possible in the new, to re-affirm accepted models in new conditions. The task was not creative but re-creative.

Hence to look for innovation is to be in error, for "the original and creative work of Victorian Canada was not to invent, but to apply, not to bring forth new things, but to make old, and contemporary things, live and move in new conditions."² Observations recorded by an American who visited Canada exactly one hundred years before Morton's essay was published support his analysis.

In 1868 E. L. Godkin remarked of English Canadians:

One has hardly set foot in the country when one is struck by the well-known colonial tendency to out-Herod Herod. They are considerably more English,

in all things in which resemblance to the English is possible, than the English themselves.³

Victorian Canadians themselves could scarcely remain unaware of this tendency. In his 1881 study of The Intellectual Development of the Canadian People, J. G. Bourinot perceived that "Striking originality can hardly be developed to any great extent in a dependency which naturally, and perhaps wisely in some cases, looks for all its traditions and habits of thought to a parent state."⁴ Not to create, but to re-create; not to invent but to adapt: this cultural attitude shaped the taste of the vast majority of nineteenth-century Canadian writers, readers and critics, whose favourite model for fiction was Sir Walter Scott.⁵

The tenacity of Scott's eminence in Canadian literary opinion is indicated by a personal letter from G. M. Fairchild to Sir James M. LeMoine, dated the first of January, 1903. Himself the author of a pleasant collection of stories,⁶ Fairchild wrote to LeMoine regarding William Kirby's place in Canadian literature. According to Fairchild, "When Gilbert Parker is forgotten Wm. Kirby will be remembered as the Walter Scott of Canada" because "His 'Chien D'Or' is the greatest of all our Canadian romances." In the first decade of the twentieth century, Fairchild assumed that the proper direction for Canadian fiction was national romance modelled on the work of Walter Scott:

I could wish that Kirby had done more on the lines he so auspiciously commenced. The material was, and is, profuse for the writer of Canadian romance.

Now that Parker has abandoned the field I wonder

who will be the man to arise and do the big work? I glance over the field, but I see no light. I see the possibilities and the material and I wish I were possessed with the genius. Alas! I am only a scribbler and can but skirt the edges of the work that some genius will yet do. . . . the real heart of the thing, the big romance, with its greater setting, as done in the work by Kirby, has yet to come, and it will come in the by and bye when the right man comes, and the needing world has sickened of the nauseus [sic] stuff that now prevails.⁷

A survey of Canadian literary opinion throughout the nineteenth century reveals that Fairchild revered Scott not out of anachronistic eccentricity, but in accord with a long-enduring national attitude which valued Scott for his use of history, his lively characters, his "realism" and his unimpeachable morality. The Canadian Magazine and Literary Repository, one of the few Canadian journals in existence during Scott's own lifetime, reviewed St. Ronan's Well (1823) with great enthusiasm because Scott's incorporation of historical material redeemed his fiction from the charge that imaginative literature was useless.⁸ During the middle and later years of the century, Canadian critics upheld Scott as the pure standard from which later fiction had deviated. B.F.M., writing on "Romance" in the Literary Garland in 1841, saw Scott as both the heir and the termination of a romantic tradition extending from prehistoric times through Herodotus, Chaucer, Spenser and Shakespeare. In contrast to Scott's colour, pageantry, "genuine humour and unflagging wit . . . overflowing kindness and open-hearted hospitality," fiction in 1841 presented an "intellectual dearth" in which "All is sterile and destitute of beauty."⁹ B.F.M.'s opinions were shared to some

degree by W.P.C., a later Garland writer who refrained from condemning fictional literature altogether, but feared that "there is far too much idle, affected sentimentality, both in the literary productions of our own country and in those which we obtain from abroad." W.P.C. believed that fiction was certainly able to teach virtue if it would only follow the example of Johnson's Rasselas or of Scott, for "we think no higher or holier principles have every been inculcated in the world, than those of Walter Scott."¹⁰ Again in the Garland, Henry Giles echoed W.P.C. when he ended his attack on the depravity of current fiction with extravagant praise for Scott, proclaiming that "his name is to us, above the proudest of the Pharoahs, and we would not give the least of his romances for the greatest of the Pyramids."¹¹

In the Anglo-American Magazine Scott became the standard by which all historical romances were judged.¹² Dumas's Emanuel Philibert received that journal's highest accolade when it declared that "Sir Walter Scott could not have done more justice to the theme."¹³ In 1870 the New Dominion Monthly printed an article in which Harriet Beecher Stowe answered the question "What shall the Girls Read?" with one word -- "Ivanhoe."¹⁴ The following year, in a Stewart's article simply titled "Scott," Andrew Archer acknowledged Scott's version of the past to be a "glorious dream"¹⁵ but reflected current opinion when he praised Scott's novels for "their natural air and healthy tone."¹⁶ Ten years later Goldwin Smith used the standard of "the high-minded Scott"¹⁷ to condemn

Disraeli's Endymion. And in The Week the exalted name of Scott was invoked whenever critics encountered literature transgressing their standards of good taste. As late as 1893 The Week's reviewer of Conan Doyle's The Refugees praised the author as "the modern Sir Walter Scott,"¹⁸ and the reviewer of Edmund Gosse's The Secret of Narcisse advised Gosse "to give no heed to the new school which philosophizes instead of narrating, and to go and sit at the feet of Walter Scott who will teach him the good and the right way."¹⁹

What, precisely, were the literary and moral qualities which so endeared Scott to Victorian Canada? The answer is conveniently provided by Goldwin Smith. In 1871, shortly after his arrival in Canada, Smith contributed to the Toronto celebration of the Scott centenary an address titled "The Lamps of Fiction."²⁰ Adapting his structure from Ruskin's Seven Lamps of Architecture, Smith enunciated seven principles to guide the novelist who wished (and ought) to pursue the tradition of Walter Scott, whose "heart, brave, pure and true, is a law unto itself."²¹ Although a newcomer to Canada at the time, Smith defined the attitudes which had dominated Canadian fiction for fifty years and would persist for close to another fifty.

Smith's seven lamps were Reality, Ideality, Impartiality, Impersonality, Purity, Humanity and Chivalry. A step by step analysis of the nuances of these abstract qualities reveals the structure of conservative social beliefs which bound the geographically

disconnected regions of Victorian Canada into one generally coherent cultural community. Of the seven, Purity and Impersonality most obviously define themselves. By Impersonality, Smith meant that novelists should refrain from debasing their work "by obtruding their personal vanities, favouritisms, fanaticisms, and antipathies."²² According to Smith, Scott never perverted his art to achieve personal vengeance or to pamphleteer:

Not only is Scott not personal, but we cannot conceive of his being so. We cannot think it possible that he should degrade his art by the indulgence of egotism, or crotchets, or petty piques. Least of all can we think it possible that his high and gallant nature should use art as a cover for striking a foul blow.²³

Purity Smith defined as sexual morality. Smith commended Scott for having rescued the English novel from "the impurity half-redeemed of Fielding, the unredeemed impurity of Smollett, the lecherous leer of Sterne, the coarseness even of Defoe."²⁴

Unlike French writers, who made "the divine art of Fiction procuress to the Lords of Hell," Scott demonstrated "the manly purity of one who had seen the world, mingled with men of the world, known evil as well as good; but who being a true gentleman abhorred filth, and teaches us to abhor it too."²⁵

Impersonality and Purity are rather straightforward issues. It is in trying to understand what Smith and his contemporaries meant by Reality, and in unravelling the complexities of the quartet formed by Ideality, Impartiality, Humanity and Chivalry that the modern reader reaches the heart of Victorian Canada's view of fiction. Of these, Reality requires first consideration.

In his modern study of British literary taste, aptly titled "What Scott Meant to the Victorians," John Henry Raleigh notes that Scott was especially valued for his brand of realism.²⁶ Scott's practice of substantiating his characters and plots with apparently authentic historical detail, regional dialects and frequent footnotes contributed to the believability and acceptability of his fictional world. Scott achieved the Reality which Goldwin Smith defined as "a faithful study of human nature"²⁷ through this expansive and personalized use of detail:

The human nature which he paints, he had seen in all its phases, gentle and simple; in burgher and shepherd, Highlander, Lowlander, Borderer and Isleman; he had come into close contact with it; he had opened it to himself by the talisman of his joyous and winning presence; he had studied it thoroughly with a clear eye and an all-embracing heart. And when his scenes are laid in the past, he has honestly studied the history.²⁸

Smith's praise for Scott's Reality echoed earlier Canadian opinion. In 1830 the editor of the Halifax Monthly Magazine certainly had Scott in mind when he praised modern novels for "their beauty and philosophy, and historical information and natural truth." Unlike earlier sentimental romances, which were "filled with exaggerated pictures and froathy sentiments," novels recently written by "some of the brightest names in the literary annals of the world" contained "truth to nature" and "a chain of occurrences which in all probability have passed, and are passing in the great theatre of life."²⁹

That romance inspired by Scott's historical realism greatly

outvalued fashionable, frivolous romance was stressed also by Rosanna Leprohon in "Florence; or, Wit and Wisdom," a novel serialized in the Literary Garland in 1849. Scott's achievement in the Waverley novels clearly underlies Leprohon's description of the taste and temperament of Nina Alleyn, an initially unexciting young lady whose humility, honesty and virtue eventually prove her to be Leprohon's true heroine. The romance to which Nina inclines is

Not that romance which consists in making a public parade of the most ridiculous sentimentalism on every occasion, investing frivolous events with a mysterious, exaggerated importance, thinking it necessary always to wear a sentimental, melancholy look, and be forever expatiating on the happiness of a kindred communion of souls, the yearning of the heart for sympathy, the difficulty of being understood and appreciated by the cruelly matter of fact race amongst whom they are doomed to dwell. Of such romance Nina had none, but of that which consists in deep thought, hidden feeling -- a passionate love for nature's beauties -- a strange devotion to the chronicles of the olden time -- the records of the brave and virtuous -- the relics of ages gone by, she possessed an inexhaustible fund. More true enjoyment would she have reaped from listening to the old house-keeper's traditional tale about some ancient portrait, some ruined tower, than in the most touchingly sentimental novel of the day.³⁰

Leprohon's distinction between unacceptable sentimental romance and acceptable Scott-inspired romance appeared frequently in Canadian literary criticism until about 1860. Up to that time, writers and critics generally remembered that Scott's great contribution to the English novel had been to make romance believable. As Raleigh points out, Waverley, like the novels of Austen, Fielding and Cervantes before, had been initially inspired by a desire to

"laugh off the stage the currently fashionable romances in the name of realism."³¹ Recollecting what literary romance had been like before Scott's influence became absolutely pervasive, early Canadian novelists and critics commended his addition of "realism" (meaning believability) to the earlier traditions of romance.

The Canadian Magazine's 1824 review of St. Ronan's Well dwelt primarily on Scott's accurate use of detail. In 1832 the Halifax Monthly Magazine reviewed The Bravo by James Fenimore Cooper, "the American Scott," and lauded the book for containing "Romance and Realism married together! -- the most rare, as well as the most exciting and piquant of all literary unions."³² A similar awareness that pre-Scott romance lacked credibility underlies the convention of disclaiming romance which appears in the work of several early Canadian novelists. John Richardson attacked the romantic stereotype of the sentimental hero when he declared at the beginning of Ecarté (1829) that Clifford Delmaine,

Our hero, though kind hearted and generous, was not a hero of romance -- or, in other words, he had not that unreserved faith in the perfection and disinterestedness of mankind, which, when carried beyond the bounds of probability, leads one less to applaud the heart than to question the judgment and the understanding.³³

Likewise Susanna Moodie felt it necessary to claim that Flora Lyndsay, heroine of the novel of the same name, "was no heroine of romance, but a veritable human creature, subject to all the faults and weaknesses incidental to her sex."³⁴

Moodie's distinction between unrealistic romance and fiction

about real life was both blurred and temporarily resolved by the influence of Scott. By the era of Confederation, Canadian literature was in the hands of a generation who had been raised on Scott, and who therefore assumed that one of the requirements of the romantic novel was a quantity of realism sufficient to assure the reader of the narrative's possibility, although it did not have to be at all probable. The simple requirement that fiction be realistic enough to be believable appeared in Canadian criticism long before the 1860's: in 1840 the Garland's review of Cooper's The Path Finder praised the book's "vivid and life-like charm," commending "the romance as one of the purest of its class we have read."³⁵ But by the 1860's the influence of Scott's credible romances had consolidated to the point where Canadians defined the novel as prose romance. Literature which both Sara Jeannette Duncan and modern critics would describe as romantic, most Victorian Canadians found realistic, meaning romance made believable. What Duncan called realism her Canadian contemporaries called French depravity or Zolaism, roundly condemning its psychological intensity and concern with the more mundane aspects of human experience. The desirable combination of realism and romance was outlined in 1891, when George Stanley Adamson wrote about "The Coming Novel" and looked forward to fiction which upheld Goldwin Smith's lamp of Reality:

The probability . . . is strongly in favour of imaginative realism, or the romantic and the realistic -- not the realism of Zola, but that in which human nature is depicted in its varying moods, and as we know it, on the

street or in the parlour. It will doubtless have a high moral tone and be full of life and movement. There is nothing society enjoys better than to find itself mirrored in literature, and particularly so when invested with an air of romance.³⁶

Nineteenth-century Canadian critics and writers tended to use the terms "novel" and "romance" interchangeably.³⁷ This was not because romance is the elder of the two terms or forms, but because they expected all prose fiction to conform to the structure of Scott-inspired romance. To be acceptable, a novel had to be moralistic and idealistic, concerning unambiguous characters whose extraordinary adventures terminated in appropriate rewards and punishments. The realm of the novel was the possible, not the probable; so long as improbable characters and events were depicted convincingly, they were generally received with more enthusiasm than were ordinary characters who never moved beyond the pale of common life. This attitude was aptly illustrated by the Canadian Monthly's 1877 review of Robert Buchanan's The Shadow of the Sword. The reviewer identified the book as "a romance, for it abounds in strange and romantic adventure; the incidents are improbable, marvellous; the hero is so idealized that we never expect to see any one like him in real life." Yet he found the "powerful and pathetic" moral struggle between a peasant and Napoleon so moving that he concluded, "To our mind, it is the most striking work of fiction, with the exception of Daniel Deronda, which has lately appeared."³⁸

Thus when most nineteenth-century Canadian critics discussed

realism, they really referred to Walter Scott's brand of believability which Goldwin Smith defined as the lamp of Reality.

Nonetheless two periodicals, the Anglo-American Magazine (1852-55) and Stewart's Literary Quarterly (1867-72), at times argued in favour of fiction that was not only believable, but probable. Unlike Sara Jeannette Duncan, their support for literary realism was inspired less by their interest in literary innovation than by their reversion to eighteenth-century rationalism. In the Anglo-American's "Editor's Shanty" column, realism was frequently measured against the standard of Defoe. Uncle Tom's Cabin received high praise because Harriet Beecher Stowe's

style is at once correct and familiar, and the narrative possesses all that truthful matter-of-fact like air, which was the leading characteristic of old Daniel Defoe. Indeed, it is difficult for the reader to persuade himself that he is perusing a fiction, and not a bona fide relation of events which really occurred.³⁹

In later columns Thackeray was favourably compared with Addison and Fielding as an illustrator of society,⁴⁰ and now forgotten novels like Catharine Crowe's Linny Lockwood and the anonymous Heiress of Houghton were lauded if they met the standard of William Godwin and Jane Austen.⁴¹ According to the Major, one of the characters inhabiting the "Editor's Shanty," it was easy to write successful second-rate fiction simply by fulfilling Johnsonian common sense, for "Old Sam Johnson once observed that if the most ordinary cadet of Adam's family recorded the daily occurrences of his uneventful life, the book would be readable, simply because

it could not fail to contain many things harmonizing with the experience of the reader."⁴² Because the Anglo-American shared with Haliburton a taste for eighteenth-century realism and respect for "Old Dictionary Johnson,"⁴³ it enjoyed the social commentary and satire in Nature and Human Nature (1855), finding Haliburton's

sarcasm . . . as sharp, and his wit as elastic as ever. There is a freshness, and a plethora of fun about Nature and Human Nature, which is equal to anything in the first series of The Clock Maker.⁴⁴

In 1870 Stewart's Literary Quarterly supported a similar view of literary realism when it published a series of articles on the history of English literature by Professor Lyall. At a time when most Canadians were arguing about Fielding's questionable sexual morality,⁴⁵ Lyall's rational appreciation of eighteenth-century fiction allowed him to praise Tom Jones for its "closeness to nature" and for "the naturalness of the plot -- the ease and simplicity with which incident after incident arises out of the narrative and the perfect vraisemblance therefore of the whole production."⁴⁶ This magazine's respect for literary verisimilitude spurred its censure of Mrs. Ross's Violet Keith (1870) because the book's sensationalism distorted its depiction of Canadian life:

We consider "convent life" and the "damp cell" affair as rather gross exaggerations. It is not within the pale of reason that such scenes could be enacted in this quarter of the globe, at this enlightened age of the world's history.⁴⁷

Not surprisingly, George Stewart, Jr., founder and editor of

Stewart's, later revealed himself to belong to the small group of Canadians who shared Sara Jeannette Duncan's admiration for Howells. In his chapter on Howells in Evenings in the Library (1878), Stewart observed of Howells's A Chance Acquaintance that "the total absence of plot and its concomitants shows how skilful an artist Howells is. He has no heroes or heroines, his characters are individuals who seem to exist in real life."⁴⁸

On the whole, the Anglo-American Magazine and Stewart's Quarterly were exceptions in their preference for literary realism. During the nineteenth century many Canadian critics called for realism, but like the Reality Goldwin Smith praised in Scott, their "realism" was qualified by distinctly romantic considerations. When he solicited contributions to his new journal, the editor of the Canadian Literary Magazine (1833) declared that "the more closely the author can pourtray [sic] human nature as it is, and events as they occurred, the greater will be the delight with which the reader will peruse his page." But he also wanted writers who "will by no means despise the ornaments of picturesque romance."⁴⁹ Similar discussions of literary realism often began by making apparently strong statements in favour of "truth to nature," only to add qualifications which revealed the writers' essentially romantic approach to fiction. Miss Foster's lengthy review of Frederika Bremer's The Neighbours, which appeared in the Literary Garland in 1843, commences by favourably contrasting Bremer's "simple picture of Swedish life" with the "ultraism"

and sensationalism of current popular fiction. According to Foster, Bremer is so realistic that "Fiction indeed seems an inappropriate name for what bears upon almost every page the stamp of truth and nature."⁵⁰ In the next sentence, however, when Foster coins the phrase "romance of real life," she reveals her true criteria: she values Bremer not for her versimilitude, but for her ability to add romantic qualities to ordinary life. Hence Bremer's accomplishment is that she has "by the charm of her fancy, filled this prosaic life with deep beauty, and breathed an almost poetic inspiration into the homely details of domestic economy, and the daily intercourse of the friendly circle."⁵¹ Bremer had in fact fulfilled the dictum pronounced by Belford's more than thirty years later, that "To surround familiar scenes, domestic incidents, and everyday pursuits with the halo of romance is the task which the average novelist of the period sets before him."⁵²

This restricted realism reveals that the definition of realism as truth to nature depends upon one's definition of nature. Victorian Canadians did not want to read about the grittier realities of sex, birth and death, miserable marriages, social injustice, triumphant criminals and common depravity. When they asked for Reality, what they really wanted was the illusion of reality: life as it should be, not life as it really was. A concrete example of this blurring of realism and idealism appeared in Rose-Belford's 1879 review of Howells's Lady of the Aroostook. The magazine commended Howells's

rare faculty of individualizing his characters, and making them stand out in relief as distinct and original types. His men and women may be met every day in the streets of cities and in the byways and lanes of villages.

But what really excited the reviewer was the idealization he discovered in Howells's portrait of Lydia Blood, "the perfect type of ideal womanhood." This reviewer thought he was praising Howells's realism, when he was in fact revealing his own penchant for idealism:

His aim has been doubtless to paint the portrait of the American girl as she really exists, to portray her in all her freshness and goodness and gracefulness, and to apply a wholesome corrective to a class of criticism which men and women of a certain school have taken pains of late to formulate both in America and Europe.⁵³

Hence when Goldwin Smith named Reality as the first of the seven lamps of fiction kindled by Scott, he meant Reality qualified by the four remaining lamps which illuminate the world of literary romance: Ideality, Impartiality, Humanity and Chivalry.

Smith separated into four categories qualities which Victorian Canadians usually lumped together under the single heading of idealism. This idealism consisted of two distinct but related components, revealed in two rather different connotations of the word, one current through most of the century, the other belonging to its last two decades. The earlier meaning -- and the one used by Smith -- refers to "ideal" in the sense of "universal." It derives from the aesthetic theory that the appeal of art lies in its ability to tap the shared universals of human experience.

The duty of the idealistic novelist is to write only about what he can depict in broad emotional terms which relate to "normal" experience, and to eschew highly individualized characters, feelings and situations if he cannot transcend their uniqueness and portray them in terms with which the ordinary reader can identify. According to Goldwin Smith:

The artist is not a photographer, but a painter. He must depict not persons but humanity, otherwise he forfeits the artist's name, and the power of doing the artist's work in our hearts. . . . Of course, this power of idealization is the great gift of genius. It is that which distinguishes Homer, Shakespeare and Walter Scott from ordinary men. But there is also a moral effect in rising above the easy work of mere description to the height of the heart. . . . Scott's characters are never monsters or caricatures: They are full of nature; but it is universal nature. Therefore they have their place in the universal heart, and will keep that place forever.⁵⁴

Or as Sam Slick put it, "natur is the same always."⁵⁵ To this definition of Ideality Smith added Impartiality, meaning objectivity. In order to successfully portray universal humanity, the novelist should follow the sublime examples of Shakespeare and Scott. He should not side with one character against another, but appear to treat them all with sympathy and justice.

The names of Scott and Shakespeare, individually or together, appear in almost every Canadian discussion of the duty of the novelist to touch "the hidden springs of sympathy which exist in the human heart."⁵⁶ When Henry Giles wrote on "Fiction" in the Garland in 1850, he found that much of the genre's "moral usefulness" arose from the human sympathies it inspired:

It does not stop in making us acquainted with an abstract humanity, but enriches those generous charities and affections that bind us to individual men. All those novels, therefore, which deal in personal scandal and polemical dispute are as abominable to ethics as they are to art. Fiction which is alive with the spirit of true genius, out of its own fulness pours an abundant love. Near, and afar off, humanity is dear to it, and nothing so execrable to it, as anti-social or misanthropic feelings. To bring the mind not only into nearer, but kindlier contact with humanity is the best office of genius. Shakespeare's creations above all, have this influence.⁵⁷

Canadian articles on Shakespeare never failed to emphasize that his relevance to "common humanity" was a direct result of his "strict adherence to nature."⁵⁸ The moral consequence was that "he never fails to bring out the true issues of virtue, or of vice, because he searched the depths of the human heart."⁵⁹ Hand in hand with the assumption that there was an absolute "universal nature" went the assumption that humanity was governed by absolute moral laws. Goldwin Smith made this abundantly clear in 1890, when he discussed Shakespeare as the illustrator of "philosophic truths" and "lofty moral lessons":

The great principles of morality are generalizations of experience amended and confirmed by the observations of successive generations. And as Shakespeare's work is the result of unwonted clearness of vision for the facts of nature and life, so those great fundamental principles underlie his plays, as they underlie the events of the actual world. Shakespeare's work is profoundly wholesome. He neither misrepresents nature, in the fear of undermining, or with the aim of encouraging what the sense of men call right, nor for a moment does he blink the stern penalty which is exacted on the inner nature, though often not on the external fortune of the weakling and the evil-doer.⁶⁰

The duty of the novelist to represent moral law in action, using Scott and Shakespeare as his paradigms, was upheld with increasing vigour in the last decades of the nineteenth century. At that time, in reaction against the picture of human nature presented by social Darwinists and naturalistic novelists, the term "idealism" received a new connotation. Not only was the novelist supposed to deal with human universals, but he was now asked to restrict himself to the better universals. Hence Ideality now implied a concern with only the more noble aspects of human behaviour, and included a vision of the perfectibility of human nature. Louisa Murray illustrated this position in 1889 when she wrote on "Democracy in Literature," and declared that because France was a democracy, it enjoyed "a literature in which the worst vices, diseases and deformities of debased humanity are employed in the services of a degraded art, of which M. Emile Zola is the great high priest." As examples of proper artistry she cited Scott, Eliot and Dickens, "great spirits and fine artists," whose writings

strongly impress us with the truth that beauty and virtue are more real and permanent parts of nature and life than vice and ugliness, and for this reason they will always have the finest uses for humanity, being good for hope, for healing, and for the strengthening and ennobling of men and women.⁶¹

In the 1870's, in the Canadian Monthly and National Review, Belford's Monthly Magazine and Rose-Belford's Canadian Monthly, George Eliot was frequently commended as a writer who upheld

idealism in both senses of the word. The Saturday Reader praised her "exquisite sympathy with humanity"⁶² and J. L. Stewart enjoyed the universal appeal of her realism:

Other authors make rough workmen appear presentable, and believers in heterodox creeds rational, by making them better than their brethren, but she places her readers in such perfect sympathy with other minds, making them look at things from the same standpoint, that classes and creeds which they have been accustomed to look upon as without the pale of their sympathies, become respectable in their eyes.⁶³

In addition to her appeal to common humanity, Stewart found Eliot an idealist in her vision of human possibilities, for her work "sets a loftier ideal before the mind than the pursuit of gain or the craving for applause and power."⁶⁴ In 1875 the Canadian Monthly measured Far From the Madding Crowd against the Eliot standard, and found Hardy deficient. His portrait of Gabriel Oak especially lacked idealism:

He is a noble fellow, who should have been spared the humiliation of being made a servant to such a man as Troy. Many readers will feel too that he loses some dignity in becoming a mere patient drudge, even though it be of the heroine. The total absence of the ideal element is indeed the main defect of the book as a work of art. This is a mistake that George Eliot never makes. No matter how realistic a novel of hers may be, she always retains enough of the ideal element to prevent it degenerating into a mere photograph, instead of a painting.⁶⁵

Although the Monthly found Eliot useful as a literary yardstick, it was not completely satisfied with her idealism. Early in 1873 it voiced some suspicion of her pessimism⁶⁶ and later the same year, when reviewing Middlemarch, it felt that her rejection

of conventional Christianity left her with a rather "cheerless creed," in which darkness, struggle and a melancholy undertone nearly overwhelmed "the stretching forth of longing arms to welcome the dawning of the coming day."⁶⁷ The year before it merged with the Canadian Monthly, Belford's also manifested some discomfort with Eliot. Although it pronounced Daniel Deronda "the greatest of all works of fiction," it found the book "chilling and startling in its calm, cold philosophy of will, and consequence, and apparent human government."⁶⁸

Underlying these hesitations about Eliot's religious and philosophic position was the fear that despite her morality and artistry, she ventured too far beyond the boundaries of conventional Christianity. One of the most basic assumptions shared by the nineteenth-century Canadian cultural community was that fiction must support the tenets of standard Christian belief, and that "Idealism" ultimately referred to Christian principles. The editor of the Canadian Monthly summarized Canadian opinion regarding the primacy of religion in literature and cultural life when he announced in the first number of the magazine that "In attempting to take a general view of contemporary literature, we naturally give precedence to works bearing upon the subject of religion."⁶⁹ The religious controversies that raged during the nineteenth century served only to consolidate Canadian religious conservatism. In 1876 the Canadian Monthly extravagantly praised Mrs. Charlesworth's Oliver of the Mill as a book without "speculation or

reference to speculation," which shows "the relation to human needs, cravings and aspirations, of those great central truths which Christianity has most fully brought to light."⁷⁰ In 1885, writing in The Week on "Some Books of the Past Year," G. M. Adam heartily welcomed the publication of "such a mass of able and thoughtful literature on the defensive side of Christian belief."⁷¹ To be completely acceptable, then, fiction had to be Christian, uplifting and optimistic, with the effect that, as Stewart's remarked of Mrs. Ross's The Wreck of the White Bear (1870), "One feels better pleased with mankind and the world and all that in it is, when the perusal of this work is complete."⁷²

In The Week, literary idealism was equated with the advancement of human dignity and spiritual values. Marius the Epicurean received praise for being "pregnant with noble thoughts."⁷³ George Gissing's In the Year of the Jubilee suffered censure because its characters were "mostly half-educated people, frivolous, mean and sordid, without a single high or elevated idea among them."⁷⁴ Agnes Maule Machar attacked Grant Allen (a fellow native of Kingston, whose sister was married to Machar's brother) as a Darwinist who advocated a philosophy

that, while it illuminates certain fields of knowledge, does not recognize its own limitations, and overlooks the deepest facts of human consciousness, with the inevitable penalty of falling short of the profoundest truth, and of robbing our human life of its true spiritual glory; and ignoring those strongest forces which have inspired humanity to its noblest victories in the past as they alone can do in the future.⁷⁵

The Week's attitude towards literary idealism was summarized by the anonymous author of "The Modern Novel," who echoed the values of Goldwin Smith when he declared that "the function of the artist [is] to show the ideal in the real." He complained that modern fiction had betrayed the true direction of human progress, for

our Zolaists revel in the disgrace of humanity. They rejoice to show our coarseness, our baseness, our selfishness, our animality. Has humanity nothing but these qualities? Is it not striving towards something better? Has it not in some measure attained?⁷⁶

What The Week defined as idealism, Goldwin Smith discussed as his last two lamps of fiction -- Humanity and Chivalry. Humanity meant the rejection of Zolaist coarseness and animality, and of sensationalism: Scott "knew that a novelist had no right even to introduce the terrible except for the purpose of exhibiting human heroism, developing character, awakening emotions, which when awakened dignify and save from harm."⁷⁷ And Chivalry meant maintaining "the ideal of a gentleman," by which the writer would never "lower the standard of character or the aim of life."⁷⁸

Throughout the nineteenth century, most Canadian critics and writers assumed that the appropriate mode for Canadian fiction was the romantic novel modelled on Scott and characterized by Reality, Ideality, Impartiality, Impersonality, Purity, Humanity and Chivalry. The criteria by which English and American novels were evaluated were applied with equal vigour to native productions, with an added touch of nationalism. Canadian fiction was expected

to be informative, harmless, morally elevating, nationalistic, idealistic, and to contain entertaining and believable characters and events. Canadian life was to be presented in a favourable light; Canadian history was often a favourite subject. Above all, Canadian writers were to eschew dime novel sensationalism. The Canadian Monthly's 1874 review of Agnes Maule Machar's For King and Country (which was serialized in the Monthly before it appeared in book form) spelled out the moral and intellectual standards required for acceptable Canadian fiction:

To the reader who takes up the story for the first time, we commend especially the intelligent literary criticisms in it, the splendid description of the Falls, and the graphic, yet concise account of the battle of Queenston. Above all there is a healthy tone of morality and a warm, though not obtrusive vein of practical piety, which ought to secure for it a wide circle of readers, apart from merits of a purely aesthetic character.⁷⁹

Despite the lip-service continually paid to moral and social idealism, most Canadian authors and critics knew that the easiest way to secure a wide circle of readers was not by appealing to healthy morality and practical piety. As the Canadian Illustrated News caustically noted in its 1870 review of Trollope's The Vicar of Bullhampton, literary success and literary value were frequently two entirely different matters:

Mr. Anthony Trollope's last novel can hardly be called a success. Undoubtedly it is clearly and carefully written. The characters drawn are truthfully presented to the reader, and throughout the whole book there is not the faintest trace of exaggeration or sensational writing. The narrative is told in any easy, formal sort of way, and as the novel is, like all Mr. Trollope's

works, utterly destitute of striking incidents, and possesses but a slight plot, it is hardly the sort of book to take with the ordinary run of novel readers. Not that the Vicar of Bullhampton is inferior to any of the author's other novels; but its very truthfulness and reality prevent it from being to any degree a success. It is the sort of novel that would be inevitably stamped as "goody-goody" by the ordinary run of novel readers. . . . To a careful, intelligent reader the book will repay perusal, although it is not in the slightest degree sensational. It is simply a faithful study of certain phases of English life, carefully written and ably reproduced.⁸⁰

In Canada, as in the rest of the English-speaking world, there smouldered a conflict between novelists who simply desired popular success and critics who wanted great literature. When the Canadian Monthly reviewed Mrs. Fleming's Kate Danton (1876) it carefully distinguished between serious novels and run-of-the mill entertainment, wishing that Mrs. Fleming had attempted the former, but conceding her success with the latter:

Mrs. Fleming's novel has nothing in it to place it outside or above the general run of novels of average merit which are poured from the press in a perennial stream, to be read, laid aside, and forgotten. If Mrs. Fleming wishes to leave a permanent impress upon Canadian literature and to make for herself a name therein, she will do well to engage in a profounder study of human nature than she yet appears to have done, to write less, and to take greater pains with what she does write. If, on the other hand, her aim is merely to enable her readers to pass away a few idle hours pleasantly and without fatigue, then novels of the calibre of "Kate Danton" will very well answer her purpose.⁸¹

Also frequent was a conflict between a reviewer's literary nationalism and his distaste for certain aspects of a particular writer's work. The Literary Garland experienced the dilemma of wanting to promote John Richardson as a Canadian writer for

nationalistic reasons, while at the same time finding his sensationalism somewhat disturbing. In its first volume, the Garland campaigned vigorously for the republication of Wacousta (1832), although its praise contained the qualification that

It is true that we look upon the interest of the tale as too painfully intense, the reader being irresistibly borne on with the author, without a moment's breathing time in which the mind is relieved from its anxiety respecting the fate of the characters of the drama.⁸²

When the Garland reviewed The Canadian Brothers (1840), it again regretted that "to our judgment the gallant Major indulges somewhat too freely in the mysterious."⁸³

Over-indulgence in mystery and sensationalism, misrepresentation of the ideals of Canadian life and lack of optimism were the most reprehensible violations of the seven "Lamps of Fiction" that Canadian authors could commit. That pessimism of any sort would not conform with Canadian idealism was announced as early as 1827, in the "To Correspondents" column of the Acadian Magazine. The editor of the Acadian simply refused to accept as final the unhappy ending of a tale submitted to him, and in his public letter to the author he rewrote the story to fit his own conception of literary convention:

We are pleased with Arion, and his tale in general: but as, in its present state, it does not finish, we delay the insertion of it till we hear from him again. The little maid, according to the general style of fairy tale, should be ultimately restored, or rescued by some counter spell, and if possible by some interesting youth, the former companion of her childish sports, in whose heart the pleasing remembrance of her, aided by his frequent hearing, from the fairy haunts,

her well known and much loved voice, has nourished fond infantile affections into ardent and unchangeable love, and which has induced him to brave the demonic rage of the whole elfin host, to rescue his little maid from their power. He ought to restore her to her parents; and, as a reward for his love and heroism, receive her from their hands.⁸⁴

In an equally idealistic vein, the Canadian Spectator commended Mrs. Dobbin's Thos. A Simple Canadian Story (1878) for its "hopefulness and courage."⁸⁵ When founded in 1852, the Provincial, or Halifax Monthly Magazine announced that "cheerfulness" would be one of its virtues.⁸⁶ The Provincial remained consistent with the principles of Goldwin Smith when it condemned William McKinnon's St. George; or The Canadian League (1852) for "violating the honor of humanity" because "more blood thirsty, inhuman and disgusting characters were never presented to the reader, than the majority of the personages who figure in the book."⁸⁷

Similar literary views were revealed in the book reviews written by Casca in the short-lived British Canadian Review (1862-63). Casca censured Emile Chevalier's Ile de Sable -- based on an incident in early Canadian history -- because "Some of the situations . . . are unnatural and too far fetched, recourse frequently had, when it was necessary, to the clap-trap of modern sensation novels of the Jules Janin, Balzac and Dumas school."⁸⁸ In Frances Brooke's The History of Emily Montague (1769), Casca discovered a more agreeable combination of romance and Canadian reality as he responded nostalgically to the book's description of "the good olden times":

This charming novel is written more in the classic style of Clarissa Harlowe, than with the sensational paraphernalia of Sue or Dumas The history of Emily Montague presents to the reader together with a racy description of Canadian scenery, a most romantic account of colonial courtships, flirtations, etc. The reader is initiated into Quebec society as it existed in the good olden times: Chateau balls, military pic-nics, sleigh-drives to the ice cone at the falls, tommy-cod fishing in December on the river St. Charles, the breaking up of the ice bridge on the St. Lawrence, everything is most agreeably and graphically described; -- what was said of Quebec in 1765 can be said of it in 1862.⁸⁹

That "everything concerning Canada bears . . . a couleur de rose tint" was for Casca a matter of pride since he, like many Canadian critics of the time, felt that a national literature should depict Canada in as ideal terms as possible.

Lack of such "couleur de rose" idealism in Mrs. Huddleston's Bluebell (1875) incurred the wrath of the Canadian Monthly.

This novel's plot describes the flirtations and social frivolities of British officers and Canadian girls in Toronto. Bluebell, the heroine, turns out to be a Canadian Becky Sharp whose first concern is always her own success. Becky Sharp may have been admissible in England, but the Monthly was appalled to find her transferred to Canadian soil:

We feel sure that all those who look upon the purity of our domestic life, and the fair fame of our country-women, as objects to be conserved and held sacred from the dishonour of being lightly spoken of, will join us in deprecating the picture of society represented in "Bluebell," as typical of Canadian households; and in resenting so gross an offence against good taste, good feeling, and hospitality, as the authoress has in the work before us been guilty of. . . . the book is so eminently offensive that . . . we should have to go

back to the period of Smollett to find its match. The style is slipshod and objectionable; and the tone vulgar and mischievous. But it is as a study of so-called Canadian society that we most object to it. We should blush for our countrywomen were the novel accepted as evidence of their manners or their bearing.⁹⁰

Just as blameworthy as betrayal of the ideal aspects of Canadian life was recourse to sensationalism, of which James De Mille was frequently found guilty. Because De Mille was a respected Dalhousie professor, his potboilers attracted attention in several Canadian periodicals. In an 1870 article on "Canadian Literature," George Stewart confined himself to praising Helena's Household (1867) and the Dodge Club (1859), simply remarking that he found Cord and Creese (1869) "much too sensational for our taste."⁹¹ Four years later the Canadian Illustrated News utterly disparaged The Living Link (1874), declaring that "It would have been better for the author's fame if it never been written, for in its pages the master hand that produced 'The Dodge Club' is nowhere recognizable." De Mille's greatest error was

the preposterous invraisemblance that characterizes the whole plot. From beginning to end, the situations are ludicrously forced; while the events upon which the story hinges are so glaringly unreal, so unlike anything that ever happened in the nineteenth century, that the effect is to extinguish utterly any little interest that may have been excited in the reader's mind by the perusal of the early chapters of the book. . . . Miss Braddon is generally allowed to be the sensation writer par excellence of the day, but she is completely out-Braddoned by Professor De Mille. In his little volume of 170 pages he manages to introduce a forger, a murder, a case of transportation, a returned convict, a persecuted heiress, a secret marriage, a supposed murder, a trial, a long lost wife, a ditto son, a mad dog, and a happy

marriage. Surely a surfeit of sensations that would suffice Miss Braddon for half a dozen novels.⁹²

J. G. Bourinot also disapproved of De Mille's ability to out-Braddon Miss Braddon, describing his best-sellers as "slavish imitations of the ingenious plots of Wilkie Collins and his school."⁹³

Neither De Mille's sensationalism nor Sara Jeannette Duncan's realism conformed with the demand for romantic idealism which dominated Canadian literary opinion throughout the nineteenth century. To fulfill Goldwin Smith's "seven Lamps of Fiction," Canadians felt that "What we need here in Canada . . . is a literature that abounds in stories of strong, true, beautiful deeds."⁹⁴ Novels modelled on the romances of Sir Walter Scott most readily fulfilled this requirement. But instead of trying to do for Canada what Scott had done for Scotland by working his country's history, landscape and eccentricities into a distinctive literary form, Canadians simply imitated Scott, fitting Canadian material to Scott's conventions. Belford's assumed that Scott provided the best model for Canadian novelists when it welcomed John Lesperance's The Bastonnais (1877), declaring that "No better subject could be found for a historical romance." All the points which Belford's commended derive directly from Scott: a sense of historical authenticity, a "beautiful love story," colourful local characters, an illusion of believability and impartiality, and a style which was "rapid and picturesque and well sustained." Moreover, Belford's

noted with a sigh of relief that "In a historical romance there is no room for that psychological treatment which, for good or ill, asserts itself so prominently in the novel-writing of the day."⁹⁵

Towards the end of the century, the British revival of adventurous romance simply reinforced existing Canadian assumptions that the novel should be romantic. Robert Barr found Susan Frances Harrison's The Forest of Bourg-Marie (1899) "a notable work of genius" because it was a romance which managed to do without a heroine.⁹⁶ In 1902 The Prince Edward Island Magazine, reviewing Charles G. D. Roberts's Barbara Ladd, congratulated the author of such a "delicious sample of romance" for being a Canadian.⁹⁷ In the face of such overwhelming preference for romantic fiction, the arguments of Sara Jeannette Duncan and her occasional followers appeared to have foundered. Instead of involving themselves with the subtleties of ordinary characters and day-to-day life, Canadian novelists preferred to write romances of high adventure, Scott-like novels based on English- or French-Canadian history, or didactic domestic tales illustrating the romance of real life.

NOTES TO CHAPTER V

¹ W. L. Morton, "Victorian Canada," in The Shield of Achilles, ed. W. L. Morton (Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 1968), p. 328.

² Morton, p. 330.

³ E. L. Godkin, "French Canada," The Nation, 7 (13 Aug. 1868), 128.

⁴ J. G. Bourinot, The Intellectual Development of the Canadian People (Toronto: Hunter Rose, 1881), p. 108.

⁵ For a study of Scott's influence on French-Canadian fiction, see David M. Hayne, "The Historical Novel and French Canada," Diss. Ottawa, 1945.

⁶ A Ridiculous Courting and other stories of French Canada (Chicago: Donnelly, 1900).

⁷ Fairchild to LeMoine, 1 Jan. 1903, Lorne Pierce Collection, Box 41, Douglas Library, Queen's University.

⁸ "Original Papers. St. Rowan's Well," CMLR, 2 (Feb. 1824), 97-110.

⁹ B.F.M., "Romance," LG, 3 (June 1841), 302-04.

¹⁰ W.P.C., "Our Literature Present and Prospective," LG, n.s. 6 (May 1848), 246.

¹¹ Henry Giles, "Fiction," LG, n.s. 8 (June 1850), 268.

¹² See "Editor's Shanty," AAM, 1 (July 1852), 74-77.

¹³ "Editor's Shanty," AAM, 5 (Dec. 1854), 610.

¹⁴ Harriet Beecher Stowe, "What Shall the Girls Read?" NDM, Aug. 1870, 39.

- 15 Andrew Archer, "Scott," Stewart's, 5 (July 1871), 148.
- 16 Archer, "Scott," 145.
- 17 Goldwin Smith, Bystander, 2 (Jan. 1881), 47.
- 18 "Library Table," The Week, 10 (1 Sept. 1893), 952.
- 19 "Library Table," The Week, 10 (6 Jan. 1893), 135.
- 20 Published in the Canadian Journal, 13 (1871-73), 347-51; rpt. in Smith's Lectures and Essays (Toronto: Hunter, Rose, 1881).
- 21 CJ, 347.
- 22 CJ, 349.
- 23 CJ, 350.
- 24 CJ, 350.
- 25 CJ, 350.
- 26 John Henry Raleigh, "What Scott Meant to the Victorians," Victorian Studies, 8 (1963); rpt. in his Time, Place and Idea (Carbondale: Southern Illinois University Press, 1968), pp. 96-125.
- 27 CJ, 347.
- 28 CJ, 347.
- 29 "Paul Clifford," Halifax Monthly Magazine, 1 (Aug. 1830, 81-82.
- 30 Rosanna Leprohon, "Florence; or, Wit and Wisdom," LG, n.s. 7 (June 1849), 247-48.
- 31 Raleigh, p. 101.
- 32 "The Bravo," Halifax Monthly Magazine, 2 (Feb. 1832), 409.
- 33 John Richardson, Ecarté (1829; rpt. New York: Dewitt & Davenport, 1851), p. 13.
- 34 Susanna Moodie, Flora Lyndsay (New York: Dewitt & Davenport, 1854), p. 67.

- 35 "Our Table," LG, 2 (April 1840), 239.
- 36 George Stanley Adamson, "The Coming Novel," The Week, 8 (17 July 1891), 528.
- 37 See "Current Literature," Belford's, 1 (April 1877), 708; J. G. Bourinot, Our Intellectual Strength and Weakness (Montreal: Foster Brown, 1893), p. 27; Robert Barr, "Literature in Canada," CM, 14 (Dec. 1899), 135; Annie G. Savigny, A Romance of Toronto. (Founded on Fact) A Novel (Toronto: Briggs, 1888).
- 38 "Book Reviews," CMNR, 11 (Feb. 1877), 226.
- 39 "Editor's Shanty," AAM, 1 (Aug. 1852), 174.
- 40 "Editor's Shanty," AAM, 1 (Sept. 1852), 265.
- 41 "Editor's Shanty," AAM, 4 (March 1854), 326; AAM, 7 (Sept. 1855), 246.
- 42 "Editor's Shanty," AAM, 2 (May 1853), 531.
- 43 Thomas Chandler Haliburton, Nature and Human Nature (1855; rpt. London: Hurst and Blackett, 1859), p. 245.
- 44 "Editor's Shanty," AAM, 7 (July 1855), 62.
- 45 See "Editor's Shanty," AAM, 1 (Dec. 1852), 560.
- 46 Professor Lyall, "From the Augustan Age to the Present Time," Stewart's, 4 (Jan. 1871), 356.
- 47 Stewart's, 3 (Jan. 1870), 405.
- 48 George Stewart, Evenings in the Library (Toronto: Belford, 1878), 203.
- 49 "The Editor's Address to the Public," Canadian Literary Magazine, 1 (April 1833), 1-2.
- 50 Miss Foster ("T.D.F."), "The Neighbours," LG, n.s. 1 (July 1843), 309.
- 51 Foster, "The Neighbours," LG, n.s. 1 (July 1843), 309.
- 52 "Current Literature," BMM, 1 (April 1877), 708. See also A Medical Student, "A Pedestrian Excursion," AAM, 3 (Dec. 1853), 416-17.

- 53 "Current Literature," RBCM, 2 (May 1879), 511-12.
- 54 CJ, 348.
- 55 Haliburton, Nature and Human Nature, p. 245.
- 56 "Our Table," LG, 2 (April 1840), 239.
- 57 Henry Giles, "Fiction," LG, n.s. 8 (June 1850), 265.
- 58 I., "Cursory Thoughts and Literary Reminiscences," Acadian,
1 (May 1827), 423.
- 59 Richard Lewis, "Shakespearean Studies," BMM, 2 (June,
1877), 70.
- 60 Goldwin Smith, Bystander, n.s. Aug. 1890, 406-07.
- 61 Louisa Murray, "Democracy in Literature," The Week, 6
(2 Aug. 1889), 550.
- 62 "Felix Holt, The Radical," Saturday Reader, 2 (18 Aug.
1866), 370.
- 63 J. L. Stewart, "George Eliot," BMM, 3 (May 1878), 682.
- 64 J. L. Stewart, "George Eliot," BMM, 3 (May 1878), 675.
- 65 "Book Reviews," CMNR, 7 (Jan. 1875), 99.
- 66 "Book Reviews," CMNR, 3 (Feb. 1873), 170.
- 67 "Book Reviews," CMNR, 3 (May 1873), 551-52.
- 68 "Current Literature," BMM, 2 (Aug. 1877), 471.
- 69 "Literary Notes," CMNR, 1 (Jan. 1872), 94.
- 70 "Book Reviews," CMNR, 10 (July 1876), 88.
- 71 Graeme Mercer Adam, "Some Books of the Past Year," The
Week, 2 (15 Jan. 1885), 102.
- 72 Stewart's, 4 (Oct. 1870), 330.
- 73 "Book Notices," The Week, 2 (30 April 1885), 348.
- 74 "Recent Fiction," The Week, 12 (12 April 1895), 471.

- 75 Agnes Maule Machar, "Prominent Canadians -- XXXVII -- Grant Allen," The Week, 8 (10 July 1891), 510.
- 76 "The Modern Novel," The Week, 7 (1 Aug. 1890), 549.
- 77 CJ, 351.
- 78 CJ, 351.
- 79 "Book Reviews," CMNR, 6 (Dec. 1874), 572.
- 80 CIN, 2 (12 Aug. 1870), 102.
- 81 "Book Reviews," CMNR, 9 (May 1876), 455.
- 82 "Our Table," LG, 1 (Feb. 1839), 144.
- 83 "Our Table," LG, 2 (Feb. 1840), 139.
- 84 "To Correspondents," Acadian, 1 (March 1827), 360.
- 85 "Current Literature," Canadian Spectator, 1 (14 Sept. 1878), 300.
- 86 "Our Address," Provincial; or Halifax Monthly Magazine, 1 (Jan. 1852), 2.
- 87 Provincial, or Halifax Monthly Magazine, 1 (April 1852), 146-48.
- 88 Casca, "Thirty-Nine Men to One Woman," British Canadian Review, 1 (Dec. 1862), 40.
- 89 Casca, "Emily Montague; or, Quebec A Century Ago," British Canadian Review, 1 (Jan. 1863), 87.
- 90 "Book Reviews," CMNR, 8 (Aug. 1875), 184.
- 91 George Stewart, "Canadian Literature," Stewart's, 3 (Jan. 1870), 404.
- 92 "Recent Literature," CIN, 10 (22 Aug. 1874), 118.
- 93 John George Bourinot, The Intellectual Development of the Canadian People (Toronto: Hunter Rose, 1881), p. 108.
- 94 W. A. Fraser, "Literature," CM, 13 (May 1899), 35.
- 95 "Current Literature," BMM, 1 (March 1877), 579.

⁹⁶ Robert Barr, "Literature in Canada," CM, 14 (Dec. 1899),
135.

⁹⁷ Prince Edward Island Magazine, 4 (Nov. 1902), 337.

CHAPTER VI

"THE QUINTESSENCE OF NOVELS AND ROMANCES":

ROMANCE AND HIGH ADVENTURE

The book acclaimed as "the first native novel that ever appeared in Canada"¹ was Julia Catherine Beckwith Hart's St. Ursula's Convent, or The Nun of Canada, written when the author was only seventeen and published in Kingston in 1824. Although this was a distinctly amateurish production, as the two Canadian journals which reviewed it quickly pointed out, for the modern critic St. Ursula's Convent conveniently epitomizes some of the problems which pursued Canadian novelists throughout the nineteenth century. In her zeal to awaken British North America from its "long night of ignorance and inaction" to "a dawn of literary illumination,"² Hart created a Canadian romance which, according to the Canadian Magazine and Literary Repository, should have been titled "The Quintessence of Novels and Romances."³ Hart considered the form of the novel to be entirely a matter of plot. Self-consciously attempting to write the first Canadian novel, she crammed into her two small volumes a mass of clichéd romantic situations. As the Canadian Magazine caustically commented,

We cannot attempt an account of the story of the convent of St. Ursula. There are so many plots and underplots in this tale that it would require an explanation equal in size to the work itself, to convey an accurate account of them. The incidents come so thick upon us; nay, they are thrown in duplicates, for we find two children exchanged, two storms at sea, two deceiving old (I beg the ladies pardon) young nurses; a lady who, thinking she has lost all her family, retires to a convent, emerges again from its gloom, and returns to her husband and children; some scenes of high life in England, badly described it is true; a vicious old friar's death-bed confession of his intrigues; the narrow escape of a young lady from a marriage with her own brother; and finally, the whole is wound up with three or four marriages, we forget which.⁴

Hart's plot-heavy narrative leaves no space to develop character or setting. Moreover, the impetus for the action comes entirely from Europe. The main characters, all from upper-class French and English families, spend a limited, if complicated, period of time in Canada straightening out their true identities, and finally return to live happily ever after on their Old World estates.

Quebec provides a tinge of indigenous romance with its humble, happy habitants and a conniving Jesuit priest. For Hart, as for later Canadian writers, the novel was a European literary form. The way to write a Canadian novel was either to find Canadian equivalents for European literary conventions -- in Hart's case Quebec's Catholicism conveniently furnished a convent and a treacherous priest -- or to import European characters and situations and simply impose them on the Canadian landscape.

John Richardson encountered problems similar to those which confounded Hart's efforts to establish the Canadian novel. A much better and more prolific writer than Hart, and far more

conscious of the conventions and demands of fictional forms, Richardson was fortunate to find a mentor of sorts in James Fenimore Cooper. Richardson frequently reiterated his admiration for Cooper as "the first among American authors,"⁵ and in Hard-scrabble (1851) he declared that he had modelled Mr. Heywood's background on that of Cooper's Leatherstocking.⁶ When Richardson wrote a new introduction for the 1851 edition of Wacousta, he classed himself with Cooper and congratulated himself for having scooped "that first of vigorous American novelists"⁷ by grabbing the tale of the Pontiac conspiracy for himself. The extent to which Cooper's writing coloured Richardson's perception of North America is intimated by Richardson's own account of a visit to the Alleghanies, where

there was a wild and romantic character about the scenery that forcibly impressed the imagination. The various descriptions of the pine, the cypress, and the hemlock, wore, amid the snows that fringed their boughs as with trellis work, an appearance of loneliness and sternness, leading one to expect, at every moment, the appearance of some savage beast of prey, that, emboldened by the solitude which reigned around, should feel disposed to avenge the violation of its privacy by a bold and restless attack upon the intruder. Never were the characters in Cooper's "Leather Stocking" and the "Pathfinder" more vividly brought before my recollection.⁸

Popularly hailed as the American Walter Scott, Cooper included among his accomplishments the discovery of indigenous North American material suitable for literary romance. In his prefaces, he evolved a coherent theory of romance as the appropriate mode for American fiction;⁹ in his novels, he created the romance of the American frontier. Unlike Cooper, Richardson never wholly committed himself

to literary romance. His plot devices, characters and use of language all attest to the romantic quality of his imagination, but Richardson frequently interjected authorial assertions announcing that his fictional writing was "founded on fact." This cliché was easily tossed off by nineteenth-century novelists, frequently without sincerity and occasionally with deliberate irony. But Richardson's earnestness indicates that to him it meant more than a conventional gesture.

Richardson's rather precarious balance between romance and factuality appears in his first novel, Ecarté (1829), which is set in Europe but contains the problems of form which characterize his later, Canadian fiction. In the first volume of Ecarté Richardson takes considerable pains to assure his readers that the story they are about to read is "founded principally on facts":

Whoever has taken up these volumes with the expectation of meeting with a detail of more than ordinary incidents, or discovering more than ordinary perfection in the leading characters, will be disappointed. We pretend not to enter the lists with those who have the happy art of divesting their heroes and heroines of all the weaknesses common to human nature, and clothing them in such brilliancy of wisdom and virtues as to render it a task of difficulty to determine whether they should belong to earth or heaven. The characters in our story are such as are to be met with every day, and we are inclined to hope that we shall not be utterly unsuccessful in our attempt to render them natural, since many of the events are furnished by our own experience.¹⁰

Richardson's convincing sketches of gambling dens, Paris slums and French prisons persuaded his British reviewers -- favourable and unfavourable alike¹¹ -- that Ecarté factually portrayed the

iniquities of real life. But these moments of literary versimilitude are bound together by a most improbable romantic plot, ranging from Kentucky to India, and including duels, jealous lovers, libertine aristocrats and misused maidens. In Ecarté, Richardson established the pattern he was to continue in his Canadian fiction: in order to fit the material he knew to his conception of the romantic novel, he strung together his sections of journalistic description with highly fanciful plots and idealized, stereotyped characters.

This uneasy combination of real life and romance appears quite strikingly in Richardson's use of language. Frequently he awkwardly juxtaposes colloquial English with the most high-flown romantic oratory. In Ecarté, the colloquial dialogue of the gambling scenes contrasts sharply with the formal, heavily adjectival rhetoric of the lovers and heroic characters. When Frederick Dormer, the reformed gambler who becomes young Clifford's guardian, tells his long-lost friend of his past romantic adventures, he produces improbable utterances like, "The quick motion of my horse against a pure and refreshing air, perfumed by the various odiferous plants and flowers which grew in wild luxuriance around, enlivened my spirits and gave energy to my feelings."¹² In Wau-Nan-Gee (1852), one of Richardson's last novels, Captain Headley speaks ordinary English but his wife expresses herself only in the formalized language of romance. Their conversations tend to be rather incongruous as, for example, when Mrs. Headley informs her husband

that within the camp of the Pottowatomies lurks one untrustworthy Indian. Headley, the plain-speaking soldier, asks "What purpose, what motive, can he have?" To which his wife replies, in suitably romantic style, "The purpose and motive those which often make the gentle tigers, the timid daring, the irresolute confirmed of will -- Love." The practical Headley then demands, "Love! What love? whose love? and what has that to do with the fidelity of the Pottowatomies?" Mrs. Headley eloquently responds, "The love of Wau-Nan-Gee, the once gentle and modest son of Winnebeg, who, scarce three months since, could not gaze into a white woman's eyes without melting softness beaming from his own, and the rich, ripe peach-blush crimsoning his dark cheek."¹³

Richardson's different literary languages originate in part in his desire to match voice to character, assigning ordinary speech to the commoners and purple prose to his heroes and heroines. But they arise also from a basic conflict between his own knowledge of history and real life, and his sense of the formal requirements of fiction. In spite of his desire to make his name as a novelist, Richardson's literary gifts inclined more towards autobiography, chronicle and the presentation of immediate experience than towards the development of plot and character, and much of his most vigorous and convincing writing occurs in his descriptive non-fiction. In this non-fiction, especially The War of 1812 (1842), Eight Years in Canada (1847), and "The Story of a Trip to Walpole Island and Port Sarnia" (1849)¹⁴, Richardson

revealed his concern for historical fidelity. To his account of accidentally discovering his brother's grave, on his return to Amherstburg, Richardson added, "I relate this anecdote chiefly with a view to show how truly it has been related that the romance of real life is often more stirring than that of fiction."¹⁵

During the same journey, he revisited the scenes of Wacousta and was dismayed to find that history had been forgotten and the locale of the Pontiac conspiracy had been absorbed into the expanding settlements without due regard for "ground which had been sanctified by time and tradition, and hallowed by the sufferings of men reduced to the last extremity, by a savage and vindictive enemy."¹⁶

When Richardson turned to fiction he frequently wrote out of his own experience, describing scenes, battles, incidents and large historical occasions at which he or people he knew had been personally present, and which were therefore indeed "founded on fact."¹⁷ In Hardscrabble, he made fidelity to history the excuse for comic relief at a moment of high tension, declaring that "Nothing can, we conceive, be in worst taste in a fictitious narrative, than the wanton introduction of the ludicrous upon the solemn, but when, in an historical tale, these extremes do occur fidelity forbids the suppression of the one, lest it should mar the effect of the other."¹⁸ In his introduction to The Canadian Brothers (1840), Richardson stressed his respect for history when he congratulated himself because

although works of fiction are not usually dedicated to the Sovereign, an exception was made in favour of the following tale, which is now for the first time submitted to the public, and which, from its historical character, was deemed of sufficient importance not to be confounded with mere works of fiction.¹⁹

And in his preface to Wau-Nan-Gee, Richardson declared that "the whole of the text approaches so nearly to Historical fact, that any other preface than that which admits the introduction of but one strictly fictitious character . . . in the book, must be, in a great degree, supererogatory."²⁰ Yet to transform historical events into fiction, Richardson required smooth-tongued gentlemen, voluptuous, sentimental ladies, intricate, suspenseful plots, and sensational gore. Much of his best and his worst writing is directly proportional to the degree to which he either adheres to the illusion of documenting reality, or over-indulges in fictional ornamentation. Although his plots and characters are frequently preposterous, Richardson's novels are saved from utter mediocrity by his ability to create a remarkable sense of immediacy. In his best scenes he builds up tension by detailing only the particulars relating to the present moment, reserving explanation. What the Athenaeum said of Wacousta pertains to Richardson's fiction as a whole. "The story is not very consistent or probable," it noted, but "The writer displays no ordinary share of graphic power."²¹

Richardson's last novels, The Monk Knight of Saint John (1850), Hardscrabble (1851), Westbrook (1851), and Wau-Nan-Gee

(1852), were written directly for the American sensation market, when he had moved to New York after giving up on his efforts to achieve recognition as a Canadian novelist. It was in his two most overtly Canadian novels, Wacousta (1832) and The Canadian Brothers (1840), that he continued the quest feebly begun by Hart: to do for Canada what Scott had done for Scotland and Cooper had done for America, by establishing his country's validity as a location for fiction, and founding a national literary identity.

The introduction to the 1851 edition of Wacousta, written some nineteen years after the book's original publication, reveals much about John Richardson's conception of the novel as a literary form. In this introduction, Richardson fills out the historical background to the Pontiac conspiracy in distinctly personal terms, describing the experiences of his maternal grandparents. For Richardson, historical importance arose from the intersection of personal history with national history; Wacousta was initially inspired by his grandmother, who "used to enchain in my young interest by detailing various facts connected with the siege she so well remembered, and infused into me a longing to grow up to manhood that I might write a book about it."²² In Richardson's view, his grandmother's tales were indeed "facts," for he considered history itself to be objective and verifiable. Hence his concern in this introduction with justifying "Two objections [which] have been urged against 'Wacousta' as a consistent tale -- the

one involving an improbability, the other a geographical error."²³

The improbability relates to Wacousta's ability to escape from the fort by climbing the flagpole with Clara in his arms; the geographical error concerns the narrowness of the river St. Clair.

To the modern reader, Richardson's anxiety about these two relatively minor components of a romance composed entirely of improbabilities seems inconsistent. Although his plot takes great liberties with the logic of real life, Richardson felt that only his tampering with geography required the excuse of "the license usually accorded to a writer of fiction, in order to give greater effect."²⁴ Despite apparent discrepancies, Richardson's theory of fiction did in fact correspond to his own practice.

When he declared that "The story is founded solely on the artifice of Pontiac to possess himself of those last two British forts. All else is imaginary,"²⁵ he posited a clear distinction between history and imagination. Only aberrations connected with the historical reality of "the artifice of Pontiac" required justification; for the "imaginary" portions, license was simply assumed to be the author's right.

Within the actual text of Wacousta, Richardson adds to this distinction between historical reality and imagination a distinction between emotional reality and imagination. After Wacousta captures Clara De Haldimar, Madeline De Haldimar and Sir Everard Valletort, he discovers that Ellen Halloway, whom he had abducted, has been the wife of two Reginald Mortons -- himself and his

nephew. Richardson plots this remarkable coincidence, which forms part of the "imaginary" action, without authorial comment. But as soon as his attention turns to the love affair of Clara and Sir Everard, Richardson insists that "ours is a tale of sad reality Within the bounds of probability have we, therefore, confined ourselves."²⁶ True to the tradition of the novel of sensibility, Richardson found improbability of plot perfectly acceptable so long as probabilities of the heart were properly respected. While Richardson's novels contain very little of the everyday realism advocated by Sara Jeannette Duncan, his definition of literary realism as fidelity to history and fidelity to emotion accords with Goldwin Smith's *Lamps of Reality and Ideality*.

The narrative structure of Wacousta reflects some of the difficulties Richardson encountered in transplanting an Old World literary form to "ground hitherto untouched by the wand of the modern novelist" (I, p. 2). Wacousta opens in the besieged garrison of Detroit, where the sudden appearance of a mysterious stranger has amplified the tensions already produced by hostilities between the English and the Indians. The plot initially appears to be a colourful version of a uniquely North American situation, for its incidents at first seem to arise directly out of the historical events surrounding Pontiac's resistance to the British. But the ultimate discovery that the mysterious visitor is Reginald Morton, alias Wacousta, demonstrates that North American history forms only the frame of Richardson's novel, on which he hangs a romantic

narrative motivated entirely by rivalries originating in Europe. Tracing the historical roots of the plot of Wacousta also reveals the line of literary tradition that Richardson followed when he decided to transform history into fiction.

The immediate present of Richardson's plot is the autumn of 1763. But past historical time soon becomes important; when tried for treason, Frank Halloway pleads his loyalty by referring to events in 1759, when he had saved Frederick De Haldimar's life on the Plains of Abraham. While serving with Wolfe, Frederick had been attacked by a gigantic French officer, really Wacousta in disguise. The connections between Wacousta and De Haldimar, which are responsible for the dramatic abductions and confrontations of the present plot, extend eastward from Detroit to Quebec to Great Britain, and back in time to the Jacobite rebellions of the 1740's, when both men were English officers stationed in Scotland. For his "imaginary" material Richardson looked not just to England, by making both Reginald Mortons Cornishmen, but to Scotland, where the Jacobite troubles brought together the ill-fated triangle of Morton, De Haldimar and Clara Beverley. Behind Clara Beverley lies even more Scottish history; her misanthropic father, "of English name but Scottish connections" (III, p. 223), had retreated to his Highland wilderness Eden after losing his fortune and his wife because he had participated in the Jacobite rebellion of 1715. Richardson's recourse to Scotland for the primary motivation of a novel about the Pontiac conspiracy indicates that in 1832, even a native-born Canadian found it impossible to divorce

the romantic novel from its connections with Walter Scott.

Although Richardson turned to Scott's territory for the historical background of Wacousta, his actual method of adapting Old World literary traditions to North America drew more heavily on gothic and sentimental conventions than on the historical novel as developed by Scott. Scott's characters are usually motivated by their political and class allegiances at particular eras of historical crisis. But in Wacousta and The Canadian Brothers, Richardson's plots of curses and revenge end up losing sight of the historical issues at hand. Historical events provide local colour and sensational effect, but the political and moral claims of the conflicting parties virtually disappear. This is especially evident in The Canadian Brothers, which does commence like a true historical novel. The scene is Amherstburg, at the beginning of the War of 1812 (in which Richardson himself had been a teen-aged soldier). The Indians, under Tecumseh, are gathering to join the British. Within the British camp exist rivalries between British-born and Canadian-born soldiers. Americans, both reliable and treacherous, dwell on both sides of the border. Some British deserters have joined the Americans; the British have just captured an American ship. All in all, Richardson assembles a rich assortment of conflicts arising directly out of national, political and cultural circumstances, but the war soon ceases to be the focus of attention. The novel dissolves instead into a gothic thriller of prophecy and revenge, as Matilda Montgomery, grand-daughter

of Ellen Halloway, tries to implement the curse laid by her grandmother upon the descendants of Colonel De Haldimar.

In The Canadian Brothers, Richardson repeats the transformation of history into gothicism that had occurred in Wacousta. Wacousta joins Pontiac's war-party not out of sympathy with the cause of the Indians, but to avenge himself on De Haldimar. As a pseudo-Indian, he outdoes the natives themselves in savagery -- with interesting moral and psychological implications, as modern critics like John Moss point out.²⁷ What Richardson actually achieves in Wacousta is not an historical novel about the Pontiac conspiracy so much as a romance of archetypal conflict between good and evil. In the chaotic wilderness of North America, this conflict encompasses strange ironies as Wacousta, the apparent villain, turns out to be remarkably sympathetic, while the apparently good De Haldimar turns out to have a less than virtuous past.

To achieve this archetypal impact, Richardson draws on the tradition of the literature of emotion: gothic terror and sentimental sympathy. Both Charles De Haldimar and his sister Clara appear to have wandered into the North American forest directly out of a novel of sensibility. Charles, very much Richardson's "man of feeling," speaks in "accents of almost feminine sweetness" (I, p. 42) and has a ready tear for all touching occasions. Early in the novel, when Frank Halloway declares his loyalty to his captain, "the young, the generous, the feeling Charles De Haldimar" is so moved that he "even shed tears" (I, p. 64). Throughout

Wacousta "the young and sensitive De Haldimar" (I, p. 66) fulfills the stereotype of the eighteenth-century sentimental hero, from his fainting fit, illness and tears when his brother appears to have been killed, to his own murder by Wacousta, who captures the young man because he is so "Overcome by his emotion" (III, p. 300) that he lacks the presence of mind to flee. In accordance with the style of the sentimental novel, Richardson continually analyzes the fine emotions of Charles, his close friend Valletort, and his sister Clara. Even more sensitive and delicate than her brother, Clara faints as frequently and conveniently as Samuel Richardson's Clarissa. As the innocent young virgin pursued by the malevolent Wacousta (whose feelings also receive detailed scrutiny when Richardson transforms him to a rather sympathetic character redressing his wrongs), Clara links Richardson's use of the sentimental literary tradition to his adaptations of European gothicism.

Unlike the majority of nineteenth-century English-Canadian writers of gothic fiction, Richardson did not avail himself of the Roman Catholicism, crumbling châteaux and demonic folklore of Quebec. To fit the gothic world of prophecy and portent, mysterious coincidences, concealed identities and "virtue in distress" to North America, Richardson inverted some of the conventions of European gothicism. He changed the location of confinement, rape and horror from the convent or the castle to the labyrinthine wilderness. For the displaced Europeans of Wacousta, "The forest, in a word, formed, as it were, the gloomy and impenetrable walls

of the prison-house" (II, p. 237). Instead of safety occurring in escape from the fortress into the outer world, the only refuge from the terrors of Richardson's hostile wilderness lies within the garrison; Richardson transformed the claustrophobia which animates most European gothicism into agrophobia: fear of unknown, uncivilized space. Within this space, "the dark, dense forest" (II, p. 235), Indians, the "cunning and midnight enemy" (I, p. 31), replace mad monks and dissolute aristocrats as the personification of danger and persecution.²⁸ In the New World, virtue is less assured of triumph than it was in the Old; Wacousta successfully and brutally destroys Charles and Clara De Haldimar, the two characters most redolent of the Old World cult of sensibility.

Richardson's gothicism generated the third of his literary styles. In addition to his high romantic rhetoric and his straightforward documentation, Richardson frequently indulged his penchant for pornographic and gory sensationalism. Far removed from the genteel language of Walter Scott, Richardson's lurid touches closely resemble the style of "Monk" Lewis. From the scene in Ecarté (1829) when De Forsac tries to rape Adeline, to his sensuous description of a bullet being removed from Mrs. Headley's "magnificent" arm in Wau-Nan-Gee (1852), Richardson maintained a lusty interest in violence and in natural and unnatural sexuality that received its apogee in The Monk Knight of Saint John (1850). In Wacousta, detailed descriptions of blood and mutilation abound, as in the

early discovery of Harry Donellan's body, with its "scalpless crown completely saturated in its own clotted blood and oozing brains" (I, p. 102). Richardson's depiction of mad Ellen Halloway united his fascination with "reeking corpses" with his delight in the female form:

Her long fair hair was wild and streaming, her feet and legs and arms were naked, and one solitary and scanty garment displayed rather than concealed the symmetry of her delicate person. She flew to the fatal bridge, threw herself on the body of her bleeding husband, and imprinting her warm kisses on his bloody lips, for a moment or two presented the image of one whose reason has fled forever. Suddenly she started from the earth; her face, her hands, and her garments so saturated with the blood of her husband that a feeling of horror crept through the veins of all who beheld her (I, p. 277).

The 1851 version of Wacousta, edited in the interest of gentility as well as brevity, modified much of the blasphemous language and overt sexuality of the original text. Also cut were the words which conclude the above scene, when Wacousta carries Ellen Halloway away from the corpse of her husband, pressing "his lips to hers, yet red and moist with blood spots from the wounds of her husband " (I, p. 279).

A close comparative study of the 1832 and 1851 editions of Wacousta would reveal in detail the evolution of popular literary taste towards the middle of the nineteenth century. Richardson originally wrote his three-volume novel for British readers, and included much background information which he deleted when he prepared his one-volume American edition. To produce a faster paced narrative, he also cut many passages of authorial reflection.

To conform with propriety, he replaced all religious oaths with less offensive phrases: "damned" became "d----d," "Jasus" became "gracious," "damn" became "hang," and so on. Also deleted were many passages examining the emotions of the characters, descriptions of physical expressions of passion, obviously homosexual scenes between Charles De Haldimar and Sir Everard Valletort, and extreme examples of gory sensationalism. The ultimate result was to remove from Wacousta many of its links with the conventions of eighteenth-century sensibility and gothic horror, bringing it somewhat closer to the wholesome Victorian romance of high adventure, and to the principles enunciated in Goldwin Smith's seven "Lamps of Fiction."

John Richardson's formula for Canadian fiction was to found his novels upon actual historical events, thereby fulfilling his need for Reality. He then satisfied his desire for romance by grafting onto history various elements from European novelistic traditions: Scottish colour, high life adventure, the cult of sensibility and gothic terror. Although his ostensible object was to preserve Canadian history, his definition of the novel required so much extravagant adventure that in his books the trappings of romance completely overshadow any modern sense of realism. Fortunately Richardson was enough of a literary artist to produce fiction that today is still quite readable and exciting, despite its frequent excesses.

Most Canadian writers who also defined the novel as the

narration of romantic high adventure failed to match Richardson's distinctive, albeit limited, success. One of the more disastrous compositions was St. George: or The Canadian League, written by William Charles McKinnon, a Nova Scotian Wesleyan minister, and published in Halifax in 1852. McKinnon sets his novel at the time of the 1837 rebellion, prefacing it with documentary evidence that a secret revolutionary league had actually existed. But the events of his fiction have nothing to do with history, which serves merely as an excuse for a badly written sequence of incredible crimes and ruses, performed by a villain specializing in disguise and hypnotism (called "magnetism" or "biology"). McKinnon's novel is all plot, and that plot is hopelessly entangled. As The Provincial remarked,

It would require a very peculiar mind to follow this story through all its windings and contradictions. Where romance can be extended no further, the Author then steps in with Biology, and every difficulty and impossibility is rendered easy and practicable.²⁹

Similarly marred by its author's assumption that the novel must contain a significant quantity of romantic adventure was L. S. Huntingdon's Professor Conant: A Story of English and American Social and Political Life (1884). A Canadian politician, Huntingdon dedicated his story of British/American rapprochement to Goldwin Smith. Like Smith, he believed that romance was the appropriate mode for Canadian fiction. Consequently his novel consists of passages of serious political discourse linked together by a plot involving amorous misunderstandings, a kidnapping, a

shipwreck, several deaths, insanity, a retreat to a convent, and a happy wedding of symbolic significance between an upper-class British politician and an American girl.

Dick Harrison's recent, well-documented survey of "The Beginnings of Prairie Fiction" indicates that during the nineteenth century, the West fared as badly as the rest of Canada in the hands of romantic novelists who took their form from Scott and Cooper, and simply used western settings for "the working out of old world or eastern dreams."³⁰ Their attitudes ranged from J. E. Collins's utter contempt for geographical accuracy, to Agnes Laut's laboured efforts to unite early history with fanciful adventures. Collins did Archibald Lampman a great disservice by dedicating to him Annette the Métis Spy (1886). According to Collins, this vicious attack on Louis Riel "lays no claim to value or accuracy in its descriptions of the North-West Territories." Never having visited the West, Collins cheerfully admitted to having

arranged the geography of the Territories to suit my own conveniences. I speak of places that no one will be able to find upon maps of the present or the future. Wherever I want a valley or a swamp, I put the same; and I have taken the same liberty with respect to hills or waterfalls. The birds, and in some instances the plants and flowers of the prairies, I have also made to order.³¹

Collins also made to order plot and character, concocting a breathless sequence of chases and captures unified only by the lusts and misdeeds of the horrendously evil Riel.

In contrast, Agnes Laut's Lords of the North (1900), about "the days of gentleman adventurers in no-man's-land,"³² represents a thoroughly sincere attempt to cast Western history in the mould of Scott-like historical romance. Despite Laut's careful research, in her book romance completely overshadows reality because she insistently medievalizes early nineteenth-century Canada. Her good characters bask in the glow of Smith's lamp of Chivalry, and her highly complicated intrigue distracts from her occasionally realistic perceptions of frontier life.

Many of the stories serialized in nineteenth-century Canadian periodicals indicate that their authors, like McKinnon, Huntingdon and Collins, conceived of the form of the romantic novel primarily as plot, and then lost control of their plots' complexities. One tale which commenced promisingly, only to lose its focus, was John George Bourinot's "Marguerite, a Tale of Forest Life in the New Dominion" (1870).³³ An experienced writer of non-fiction, and well versed in Canadian history, Bourinot tried to dramatize the conflicts between the English, the French and the Indians in Nova Scotia in 1757. Unfortunately his restrained, clear narrative style fails to carry his melodramatic intrigue. This consists of a web of chases, involving a kidnapped girl who eventually returns to her family, her brother, who pursues an Acadian spy who is also an Indian chief, and an English officer who is captured and re-captured by hostile Indians, and rescued and re-rescued by a mysterious Indian maiden, until he finally

marries Marguerite, the nominal heroine of the piece. "Marguerite" appears to have been Bourinot's only venture into extended prose fiction. In his short stories he confined himself to tighter plots, with considerably more success. Although these tales are all set in Quebec, their action depends more upon the larger tradition of the mystery story than upon specifically French-Canadian gothic colouring. The first, "The Mystery at Château des Ormeaux" (1869)³⁴, includes a sleepwalker who reveals Bourinot's debt to Wilkie Collins. The others also derive from the popular conventions of mystery and suspense: "The Old Japanese Cabinet" (1877)³⁵ contains a secret drawer full of crucial deeds and papers; "Stories We Heard Among the Pines" (1872)³⁶ tell of ghosts and murders; an old diary reveals "What Happened at Beaumanoir One Christmas Eve." (1870).³⁷

The pattern of success and failure presented by Bourinot's infrequent exercises in fiction represents the general fate of nineteenth-century Canadian writers who attempted the romance of high adventure. When they tried to compose full-length narratives based on exciting plots using exotic Canadian material, their enthusiasm usually overwhelmed their judgment as they crammed their novels with as much extravagance as they could muster. But when they restricted themselves to shorter fictional forms, frequently the mystery tale modelled on Poe, they concentrated instead on believability, making a Canadian town or rural area the scene of one unified action. Stories like "A Night of Terror

in the Backwoods of Canada" (1872)³⁸, "The Secret Passage; a tale of Ottawa City" (1882)³⁹, "A Ghostly Warning" (1878)⁴⁰, "My Grandfather's Ghost Story" (1878)⁴¹, and John Charles Dent's "The Gerrard Street Mystery" and "The Haunted House on Duchess Street" (1888)⁴² proved that Canada could hold her own as a location for effective tales of terror, crime, suspense and encounters with the unknown.

That it was possible to bridge the gap between real life and literary romance in a long narrative was evidenced by William McLennan's competently written Spanish John (1898). This novel is actually an expanded version of a two-part memoir composed by Colonel John McDonell some time before his death at Cornwall in 1810, and published in the Canadian Magazine and Literary Repository in 1825. McLennan sticks closely to McDonell's details of his youthful adventures in the Spanish Catholic army, striving to reinstate the deposed Stuarts. He maintains the straightforward narrative voice of the original version, and bolsters its unstructured plot by adding subplots involving frequent reappearances of characters who figure only occasionally in the original text. Even when McLennan adds a didactic incident, when McDonell plays good Samaritan and is consequently rewarded, the moral implications remain unobtrusive. The result is a restrained and occasionally compelling transformation of an early Canadian document into fictional romance.

By choosing to write romantic novels structured on improbable

and extravagant incidents and reflecting the influence of Sir Walter Scott, Richardson, McKinnon, Huntingdon, Collins, Laut, McLennan and others worked deliberately within one of the major forms which dominated Canadian prose fiction throughout the nineteenth century. Their main contribution to the development of a national literature lay in demonstrating that Canada could supply suitably exciting situations; many other Canadian writers and editors looked outside Canada for such material. In the first half of the century, Canadian periodicals reflected the popular taste for exotic literature by publishing elegant stories with remote settings in space and time. Especially attractive were Oriental and Arabic tales, or those set in medieval or historic Europe. The Acadian Magazine selected from British periodicals stories located in medieval Italy, Renaissance Britain, gothic Germany, or Arabia. In the Acadian, short fiction by Canadians frequently conformed to the exotic pattern, such as John Templeton's "Almanzor the Moor; or The Fall of Granada. A Tale of the Fifteenth Century,"⁴³ and the anonymous "Fitz Aubert. A Tale of the Times of the Commonwealth."⁴⁴ The Canadian Magazine also approved of tales of exotic adventure, publishing items like "The Pirate's Treasure"⁴⁵, "The Cavalier in France. A Tale of the Seventeenth Century"⁴⁶ and "The Bleeding Heart."⁴⁷ Susanna Moodie frequently turned to the exotic tale; one of her first pieces to appear in Canada was "Achbor: An Oriental Tale," first published in the Canadian Literary Magazine in 1833 and later reprinted in the

Victoria Magazine.⁴⁸ She contributed to the Literary Garland many pieces like "The Royal Election. A Tale of the Olden Times -- Borrowed from the Early History of Poland."⁴⁹ In addition to the Moodies' work, the Victoria Magazine published polite, exotic stories by Susanna's sister, Agnes Strickland. Even Catharine Parr Traill, who frequently deprecated fanciful literature, published tales of remote, romantic adventure such as "St. Margaret's Minster"⁵⁰ and "The Doge's Daughter. A Tale of Venice."⁵¹

By mid century, the taste for the elegant tale had declined but that for high adventure remained strong. The Anglo-American's stories -- usually anonymous and presumably selected from British periodicals⁵² -- tended to be more realistic in tone than those of the Garland. They frequently concerned domestic life or the excitement of the high seas, but their settings were usually European and their interest arose from their tense, improbable plots. In the 1870's and 1880's Belford's, Rose-Belford's and the Canadian Monthly disapproved of overt sensationalism, but their stories of India and Europe indicate their approval of wholesome adventure in distant locations.

The late nineteenth-century popular revival of exotic romance encouraged Canadian writers interested in international recognition to look outside their own time and country for appropriate subjects. Gilbert Parker and Robert Barr both profited from this market, creating a number of novels wholly unrelated to Canada. In addition to his Canadian stories, Parker wrote romantically about the

Jersey Island during Napoleonic times in The Battle of the Strong (1898), Elizabethan England in A Ladder of Swords (1904) and Egypt in Donovan Pasha (1902) and The Weavers (1907). Barr's romantic novels were certainly directed more towards exploiting the financial potential of the international English-language best-seller market than towards establishing a Canadian literature. He exhausted his Canadian interest in In the Midst of Alarms (1893) and The Measure of the Rule (1906), and in the rest of his books catered to the public taste for European detective stories, medieval French and German history, and tales of American newspaper life and financial intrigue. In these ephemeral novels Canada turns up occasionally -- as a location for fishing trips in The Tempestuous Petticoat (1900), as a safe place (across the border) to store profits from American speculative ventures in The Girl in the Case (1910), and as the site of a mine for which intriguing American and British investors engage in cutthroat competition in A Woman Intervenes (1895). Barr's numerous historical romances are completely undistinguishable from the productions of British popular writers, for whom "The recipe was always the same, the France of Henry IV, Eighteenth-century England, the Elizabethans, the Scottish Covenanters, a heroine in distress, a hero shabby in clothing, courageous and defiant, adventures hot on the heels of adventures, and a grand marriage to end all."⁵³

In the 1860's and 1870's, before Barr and Parker contrived their conventional swashbuckling tales, two earlier Canadian

writers also worked within the genre of exotic romance, with interesting, if not always artistic, results. Both completely un-Canadian and unrealistic was James Murray De'Carteret Odevaine's Papeta. A Story, published in Saint John in 1867. Odevaine claimed that his compendium of romantic plot devices was "Abridged and Adapted from the Diary and Private Papers of Mr. Eugene Murat," and he asked indulgence for the weakness of his narrative because

The title page of this work is sufficient evidence to point out to my readers the great difficulties under which I have laboured, in arranging the following story.

Most of the characters I have so poorly depicted are still living.

When we have to deal with plain facts, we must be circumspect. My original intention was to embody these events into the form of a romance. But I found that such an ideal was impracticable. To succeed, I must invent. The introduction of false characters would necessitate a deviation from the strict line of truth. I, therefore, preferred giving it to the world in its auto-biographical form; trusting to a generous public for the result.⁵⁴

Beginning an elaborately contrived narrative by disclaiming romance is Odevaine's only clever gesture in the entire book.

Stewart's Literary Quarterly made its review of Papeta the occasion to discuss the importance of realistically depicting character, society and setting in fiction, and found Odevaine deficient on all accounts.⁵⁵ Plot alone holds Papeta together, and that plot, activated by a vengeful Italian villain, includes a wronged woman, an abducted child, a false burial, and enough coincidence eventually to reunite all the characters in Turkey.

Only one nineteenth-century novel written by a Canadian

but not set in Canada, and structured according to the conventions of exotic romance, deserves serious critical attention: James De Mille's A Strange Manuscript Found in a Copper Cylinder (1888). De Mille's last published book⁵⁶ uses devices belonging to adventurous romance -- a found manuscript, a voyage to the south pole, the discovery of a hitherto unknown culture and country -- as the frame for an incisive satire, attacking social hypocrisy and irreligious materialism. Since its republication in 1969, with a perceptive introduction by R. E. Watters,⁵⁷ A Strange Manuscript has captured the attention of a number of modern critics. They have thoroughly analyzed this remarkable novel in relation to De Mille's own life,⁵⁸ in relation to intellectual issues of the 1870's and British Utopian fiction,⁵⁹ and in relation to the fiction of Poe and Melville.⁶⁰ When R. E. Watters, Crawford Kilian, M. G. Parks, George Woodcock and Wayne Kime discuss the biographical, social, philosophical and moral issues raised by A Strange Manuscript, they divorce this book from De Mille's other novels, dismissing them as the ephemeral, sensational concoctions they indeed are. But De Mille's potboilers are not ordinary sensational romances. A number of them contain the same satiric impulse which inspired A Strange Manuscript, directed towards whimsical literary comedy rather than ironic social criticism.

Within A Strange Manuscript, De Mille knocks both predictable sensational fiction and pretentious literary critics. Melick, the fatuous London littérateur, insists that Adam More's manuscript

is a "transparent hoax,"⁶¹ produced by a publicity-seeking sensation novelist, and censures it because

this writer is tawdry; he has the worst vices of the sensational school -- he shows everywhere marks of haste, gross carelessness, and universal feebleness. When he gets hold of a good fancy, he lacks the patience that is necessary in order to work it up in an effective way. He is a gross plagiarist, and over and over again violates in the most glaring manner all the ordinary proprieties of style.⁶²

This echo of critical catch-phrases, similar to those which appeared in reviews of books like De Mille's own potboilers, would appear a just assessment of the general faults of market fiction. But they are not a just assessment of More's compelling manuscript, and are uttered by the least attractive character aboard Featherstone's yacht. Unlike Dr. Congreve, the man of science, and Oxendon, the scholarly linguist, Melick lacks solid knowledge on which to base his criticism. This "professional cynic, sceptic, and scoffer"⁶³ is astute enough to realize that More's narrative may be read as a "satirical romance." But Melick's interpretation of the dark- and death-living Kosekin as a "new race of men, animated by passions and impulses which are directly the opposite of ours,"⁶⁴ is, as Watters, Parks and Woodcock have indicated, a response only to the most superficial meaning of the text. In Melick's blindness to the deeper similarities between the inverted values of the Kosekin and the hypocrisies of his own society, and in his disparagement of More's document simply to enhance his own self-importance, De Mille caricatures the mediocre, egotistical literary critic.

Although A Strange Manuscript is the only one of De Mille's more than twenty novels to demonstrate unquestionable literary merit, De Mille himself possessed a sound sense of literary value and fostered no illusions regarding the artistic qualities of his other fiction. According to Archibald MacMechan, who planned to write a full-length biography of De Mille,⁶⁵ "No one could think more meanly of his books than did their author; he called them his 'trash,' his 'pot-boilers.'"⁶⁶ Nonetheless a number of these "facile imitations of the prevailing literary fashions" reveal De Mille's behind-the-scenes delight in parodying the stereotyped plots and characters required by popular, money-making fiction. MacMechan himself recognized that despite De Mille's self-disparagement, "Only a gentleman and a scholar possessing something like genius could have written these light, amusing novels."⁶⁷

In his burlesques of popular sensational and romantic fiction, De Mille played with the conventions of both narrative and typographical form. At times his wit took a distinctly Shandyeian turn, when he rearranged chapter divisions and titles. In The Lady of the Ice (1870), crucial utterances which would normally be printed as part of the text are heightened by being turned into chapter headings. The first of these comic departures from normal form occurs at the end of the second chapter:

Jack resumed his pipe, and bent down his head; then
he rubbed his broad brow with his unoccupied hand;

then he raised himself up, and looked at me for a few moments in solemn silence; then he said, in a low voice, speaking each word separately and with thrilling emphasis:

Chapter III

"MACRORIE -- OLD CHAP -- I'M -- GOING -- TO -- BE -- MARRIED!!!"

At that astounding piece of intelligence, I sat dumbly and stared fixedly at Jack for the space of half an hour.⁶⁸

Another of De Mille's typographical jokes involved the composition of chapters consisting only of titles. Chapters XVIII and XXVII of The Dodge Club (1869) are all upper-case title, and the final chapter of The Lady of the Ice parodies and pillories both the practice of writing long, explanatory chapter headings, and the usual wedding-bells ending to the high society novel:

Chapter XXXVIII

GRAND CONCLUSION. -- WEDDING-RINGS AND BALL-RINGS. -- ST. MALACHI'S. -- OLD FLETCHER IN HIS GLORY. -- NO HUMBUG THIS TIME. -- MESSAGES SENT EVERYWHERE. -- ALL THE TOWN AGOG. -- QUEBEC ON THE RAMPAGE. -- ST. MALACHI'S CRAMMED. -- GALLERIES CROWDED. -- WHITE FAVORS EVERYWHERE. -- THE WIDOW HAPPY HAPPY WITH THE CHAPLAIN. -- THE DOUBLE WEDDING. -- FIRST COUPLE -- JACK AND LOUIE! -- SECOND DITTO -- MACRORIE AND MARION! -- COLONEL BERTON AND O'HALLORAN GIVING AWAY THE BRIDES. -- STRANGE ASSOCIATION OF THE BRITISH OFFICER AND THE FENIAN. -- JACK AND MACRORIE, LOUIE AND MARION. -- BRIDES AND BRIDEGROOMS. -- EPITHALAMUM. -- WEDDING IN HIGH LIFE. -- SIX OFFICIATING CLERGYMEN. -- ALL THE ELITE OF QUEBEC TAKE PART. -- ALL THE CLERGY, ALL THE MILITARY, AND EVERYBODY WHO AMOUNTS TO ANY THING. -- THE BAND OF THE BOBTAILS DISCOURSING SWEET MUSIC, AND ALL THAT SORT OF THING. YOU KNOW.

On reading the above heading, I find it so very comprehensive that it leaves nothing more for me to say. I will therefore make my bow, and retire from the scene, with my warmest congratulations to the reader at reaching

THE END.⁶⁹

De Mille's worst potboilers are those in which he used the devices of sensation fiction seriously, such as The Cryptogram (1870) and The Living Link (1874). In the best of these books, he maintained a humorous distance from his preposterous plots and predictable characters, allowing his reader to discover that his efforts to "out-Braddon Miss Braddon"⁷⁰ were usually tongue-in-cheek. By exaggerating the standard components of popular romantic fiction, De Mille pointed to their inherent absurdity. In An Open Question (1872), he created a narrative structure which accentuated the improbability of a plot containing a manuscript about treasure, an evil disguised priest, various switched children, and characters with multiple identities. Every thirty pages or so, one of the characters summarizes what he or she knows so far; the reader, who knows more than the character, knows the summary to be wrong. And the author, who piles coincidence upon coincidence, sets up his readers and his characters as foils for his own ingenuity in contriving a Gordian knot with an ultimately logical solution. De Mille's ironic authorial comment in A Castle in Spain (1883), regarding the fortuitous sorting out of his entangled lovers, applies to his sensational fiction as a whole. "Such coincidences are frequent in real life," he declared, "and still more frequent in our 'Castle in Spain.'"⁷¹

Although De Mille never made public his theory of the novel, he anticipated the anti-romantic bias and witty tone of Sara Jeannette Duncan when he simultaneously employed and parodied

the conventions of popular fiction. He enjoyed satirizing stock romantic characters, like Miss Minnie Willoughby, the sweet young heroine of The American Baron (1872) who is always being rescued from dire situations. Miss Willoughby finally becomes so annoyed by the train of gentlemen who save her life and then propose marriage that her delight knows no bounds when one of her saviours turns up in the garb of a priest. "I've longed so to be saved by a priest," she confesses. "These horrid men, you know, all go and propose the moment they save one's life; but a priest can't, you know -- no, not even if he saved one's life a thousand times over."⁷²

A similar tone of parody pervades several of De Mille's juvenile novels. Among the Brigands (1871) concerns a group of travelling American boys whose expectations of adventure have been conditioned by their reading of "the novels of Cooper . . . Francesco, the Pirate of the Pacific, Lafitte, the Pirate of the Gulf, and Rinaldo Rinaldini."⁷³ In Italy, they expect every stranger they encounter to be a brigand. Here again the book's narrative structure ridicules the devices of sensational fiction, for the boys constantly anticipate high adventure, only to be deflated by the prosaic realities of everyday life. De Mille's mock ferocious description of one supposed "brigand" as a "great, big, bluff, burly, brusque, bearded, broad-shouldered, beetle-browed brigand"⁷⁴ prepares for the later revelation that the man is not a bandit at all, but an innocent American painter.

Long before Leacock burlesqued the predictable stereotypes of popular fiction in Nonsense Novels (1911), De Mille was exercising his literary wit in the creation of hyperbolic versions of similar stock situations and characters. In 1927, Lorne Pierce pronounced De Mille "the father of the Leacockian type of humour" because "He is sprightly and wholesome, and depends upon exaggeration and extravagance for his effects."⁷⁵ In 1888, De Mille's style of literary parody was perpetuated in the Dominion Illustrated Weekly, which published two hilarious pieces by Walter Blackburn Harte. The first, "Noblesse Oblige. A British Society Novel, By a Crowned Head. Abridged and Mutilated by W. Blackburn Harte," demolished Ouida-like high life romance and elicited the following editorial footnote:

Different readers will judge of this story in different ways. Some will storm against it as coarse, with no redeeming characters; others will simply wonder what the author meant, if he meant anything; and still others will fail to see what moral is to be enforced by it. The editor, who was the first to proclaim and make public the clever young writer, when he put forth a short sketch, some time last winter, accepted this contribution from him as a pretty successful burlesque on the class of harrowing short stories, quite popular in England, supposed to be written by persons of "the quality" and meant to ridicule their own caste.⁷⁶

Harte's second piece, "Something in the Wild West,"⁷⁷ applied the same technique to the romantic tale of Western high adventure.

Like James De Mille, Robert Barr depended financially upon the writing of sensational, exotic romance, and in one of his more than thirty books he also developed the genre's comic

possibilities. In the Midst of Alarms (1894), one of Barr's two specifically Canadian novels, is not a literary parody so much as a light-hearted love story which refuses to take history seriously. Richard Yates, a brash Yankee reporter, seeks rest and solitude in the Canadian backwoods only to find himself in the midst of the Fenian troubles of 1866. Far from being heroic, the battle of Ridgeway is so minor that "The result of the struggle was similar in effect to an American railway accident of the first class."⁷⁸ Of greater interest are the amorous entanglements of Yates and his friend the Professor, as each ends up with a good Canadian wife. The effectiveness of Barr's comedy stems largely from his deflation of the high romantic tone and exotic adventures usually associated with fiction relating to Canadian history.

De Mille, Harte, Barr, Sara Jeanette Duncan and Stephen Leacock each made some contribution to a minor tradition of literary satire, burlesquing the prevailing forms of romantic fiction. But in Canada most nineteenth-century writers of historical romance took their history far more seriously than did Barr, their romance more seriously than De Mille, and worked more directly within the tradition of Sir Walter Scott than did Richardson. In their efforts to provide Canada with a suitable national literature based on Canadian history and modelled on Scott, they seriously tried to kindle all seven of Goldwin Smith's "Lamps of Fiction." Of the available forms of fiction, Victorian Canada chose to promote

the historical romance as a genre which would develop a national identity by popularizing and mythologizing Canada's neglected history.

NOTES TO CHAPTER VI

¹ "Saint Ursula's Convent or The Nun of Canada," CRLHJ, 1 (July 1824), 49. Frances Brooke's The History of Emily Montague (1769) was the first English novel set in Canada, but Mrs. Brooke was only a temporary resident of Quebec.

² Julia Catherine Beckwith Hart, St. Ursula's Convent, or The Nun of Canada (Kingston: Hugh C. Thomson, 1824), I, p. v.

³ "New Publications," CMLR, 2 (May 1824), 464.

⁴ CMLR, 2 (May 1824), 464.

⁵ John Richardson, Eight Years in Canada (Montreal: H. H. Cunningham, 1847), p. 14; see also p. 95.

⁶ John Richardson, Hardscrabble; or the Fall of Chicago (New York: De Witt, n.d. [1851]), pp. 66-67.

⁷ John Richardson, Wacousta (New York: De Witt & Davenport, 1851), p. iii.

⁸ Richardson, Eight Years in Canada, p. 161.

⁹ See Arvid Shulenberger, Cooper's Theory of Fiction (Lawrence: University of Kansas Press, 1955); George Perkins, ed., The Theory of the American Novel (New York: Holt, Rinehart & Winston, 1970), pp. 17-30.

¹⁰ John Richardson, Écarté, or, The Salons of Paris (London: Coburn, 1829), I, p. 197. Similar statements appear on I, p. 229; II, pp. 49-50; II, p. 117.

¹¹ See Westminster Review, 11 (Oct. 1829), 303-26.

¹² Richardson, Écarté, I, p. 79.

¹³ John Richardson, Wau-Nan-Gee; or, The Massacre at Chicago (Philadelphia: T. B. Peterson, n.d. [1852]), pp. 8-9.

¹⁴ LG, n.s. 7 (Jan. 1849), 17-26.

¹⁵ Richardson, Eight Years in Canada, p. 91.

¹⁶ Richardson, Eight Years in Canada, p. 104. See also the "Introduction" to the 1851 edition of Wacousta, p. vi.

¹⁷ Two recent critiques which describe the autobiographical aspects of Richardson's fiction are Desmond Pacey's "A Colonial Romantic," Canadian Literature, No. 2 (Fall 1959)-No. 3 (Winter 1960), and Carl F. Klinck's introduction to University of Toronto Press 1976 reprint of Richardson's The Canadian Brothers; or, The Prophecy Fulfilled.

¹⁸ Richardson, Hardscrabble, p. 43.

¹⁹ John Richardson, The Canadian Brothers; or, The Prophecy Fulfilled (Montreal: Armour & Ramsay, 1840), I, p. x.

²⁰ Richardson, Wau-Nan-Gee, p. iii.

²¹ Athenaeum, No. 270 (29 Dec. 1832), 838.

²² Richardson, Wacousta (1851), p. vi.

²³ Wacousta (1851), p. vi.

²⁴ Wacousta (1851), p. vii.

²⁵ Wacousta (1851), p. vi.

²⁶ Richardson, Wacousta; or, The Prophecy, a Tale of the Canadas (3 vols. London: Cadell, 1832), III, p. 182. All further quotations will be taken from this edition, and will be identified by volume and page number.

²⁷ John Moss, "Canadian Frontiers; Sexuality and Violence from Richardson to Kroetsch," JCF, 2, No. 3 (1973), pp. 36-41.

²⁸ In Love and Death in the American Novel (New York: Dell, 1969), p. 149, Leslie Fiedler identifies this pattern as American.

²⁹ Provincial, or, Halifax Monthly Magazine, 1 (April 1852), 147.

³⁰ Dick Harrison, "The Beginnings of Prairie Fiction," JCF, No. 13 (1975), p. 162.

- 31 J. E. Collins, Annette the Métis Spy (Toronto: Rose, 1886), p. 142.
- 32 Agnes Laut, Lords of the North (New York: Taylor, 1900), p. 6.
- 33 NDM, Jan.-June, 1870.
- 34 Stewart's, 3 (Oct. 1869), 242-51.
- 35 CMNR, 12 (Aug. 1877), 139-52.
- 36 Stewart's, 5 (Oct. 1872), 242-68.
- 37 CIN, 2 (24-30 Dec. 1870).
- 38 Mrs. M. E. Muchall, CMNR, 1 (Feb. 1872), 138-41.
- 39 RBCM, 8 (Feb. 1882), 184-91.
- 40 E.C.G., BMM, 3 (Jan. 1878), 259-65.
- 41 W.I.D., BMM, 3 (Feb. 1878), 301-08.
- 42 In The Gerrard Street Mystery and Other Weird Tales (Toronto: Rose, 1888).
- 43 Acadian, 1 (March-May, 1827).
- 44 Acadian, 1 (July-Dec. 1826).
- 45 John Howard Willis ("H."), CMLR, 3 (Aug.-Sept. 1824).
- 46 CMLR, 3 (Nov. 1824), 437-45.
- 47 CMLR, 4 (April 1825), 330-32.
- 48 Canadian Literary Magazine, 1 (April 1833), 45-49; Victoria Magazine, 1 (July 1848), 253-56.
- 49 LG, 3 (Dec. 1840-March 1841).
- 50 LG, 4 (Dec. 1841), 49-54.
- 51 AAM, 1 (Dec. 1852), 545-49.
- 52 See Robert L. McDougall, "A Study of Canadian Periodical Literature of the Nineteenth Century," Diss. Toronto 1950, p. 165.

53 Hugh Walpole, "The Historical Novel in England since Sir Walter Scott," in Sir Walter Scott Today, ed. H. J. C. Grierson (London: Constable, 1937), pp. 183-84.

54 James Murraray De'Carteret Odevaine, Papeta. A Story (Saint John: J. & A. McMillan, 1867), n. pag.

55 Stewart's, 1 (1867), 78.

56 In "The Cheerful Inferno of James De Mille," JCF, 1, No. 3 (1972), pp. 61-67, Crawford Kilian argues that A Strange Manuscript may have been started in the late 1860's. M. G. Parks supports Kilian in his recent article on De Mille, titled "Strange to Strangers Only," Canadian Literature, No. 70 (Autumn 1976), pp. 61-76.

57 New Canadian Library edition, Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 1969.

58 Kilian and Parks. See note 56.

59 George Woodcock, "De Mille and the Utopian Vision," JCF, 2, No. 3 (1973), pp. 174-79.

60 Wayne R. Kime, "The American Antecedents of James De Mille's A Strange Manuscript Found in a Copper Cylinder," Dalhousie Review, 55 (Summer 1975), 280-306.

61 James De Mille, A Strange Manuscript Found in a Copper Cylinder (New York: Harper, 1888), p. 66.

62 A Strange Manuscript, p. 247.

63 A Strange Manuscript, p. 158.

64 A Strange Manuscript, p. 245.

65 See A. R. Bevan, "James De Mille and Archibald MacMechan," Dalhousie Review, 36 (1955), 201-15.

66 Archibald MacMechan, Headwaters of Canadian Literature (Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 1924), p. 48.

67 MacMechan, Headwaters, p. 48.

68 James De Mille, The Lady of the Ice (New York: Appleton, 1870), p. 9.

69 De Mille, The Lady of the Ice, pp. 145-46.

- ⁷⁰ See review of The Living Link, CIN, 10 (22 Aug. 1874), 118.
- ⁷¹ James De Mille, A Castle in Spain (New York: Harper, 1883), p. 161.
- ⁷² James De Mille, The American Baron (New York: Harper, 1872), p. 104.
- ⁷³ James De Mille, Among the Brigands (Boston: Lee & Shepard, 1871), p. 147.
- ⁷⁴ De Mille, Among the Brigands, p. 145.
- ⁷⁵ Lorne Pierce, Outline of Canadian Literature (Toronto: Ryerson, 1927), p. 164.
- ⁷⁶ DI, 1 (28 July 1888), 59.
- ⁷⁷ DI, 1 (24 Nov.-1 Dec. 1888).
- ⁷⁸ Robert Barr, In the Midst of Alarms (New York: Stokes, 1894), p. 230.

CHAPTER VII

"THE HEROIC TIMES OF CANADA":

ENGLISH-CANADIAN HISTORY AND ENGLISH-CANADIAN FICTION

The large number of historical romances published in Canada during the nineteenth century would appear to indicate that fiction celebrating "the heroic times of Canada"¹ received widespread approval. Although novels based on history were indeed highly favoured, the anti-fiction bias of many critics led to colourful debates about the role of history in imaginative writing. For John Richardson, the presence of historical material in a fictional narrative validated imaginative literature. Throughout the nineteenth century many Canadian writers and critics shared Richardson's reverence for history, based on the assumption that history was empirical, factual, one of the classical disciplines, and therefore demonstrably superior to "mere works of fiction."² Diverse evaluations of historical fiction resulted from this conviction. Some commentators, like Richardson, asserted that the inclusion of historical material increased the moral and didactic value of a novel; others trembled lest fiction be confused with

history, and historical truth suffer distortion. The Literary Garland summarized the virtues and pitfalls of historical fiction when it reviewed Richardson's The Canadian Brothers in 1840, and found that its historical basis made the book especially "useful":

In its historical character . . . this work may be safely recommended, containing as it does, much that is useful in point of fact. While we deprecate the superficial reading of history to be gleaned from even a connected chain of historical tales, as being a dangerous medium from which to acquire knowledge, we cannot withhold our opinion that the perusal of fictitious narratives, founded upon historical truths, which the author, neither in works nor spirit has perverted, will be found to afford much assistance to the younger student, as being more free from tedium than the graver details of the formal historian; and, in countries such as these, which are lamentably deficient in works treating upon their past existence, such books must be particularly useful.³

Seven years later, the Garland reiterated its endorsement of truthful historical fiction which combined information and entertainment:

We highly approve of what are generally designated Historical Novels, because, while they interest our feelings, they enlighten our understandings, and thus, combining instruction with amusement, our stock of knowledge is increased without any dry or arduous study, and impressed upon the memory without an effort.

At the same time, the Garland cautioned that

Many people, however, especially the young and inexperienced, in reading such works, are apt to attach too much credit to the statements they contain -- to mistake for historical accuracy a plausible and circumstantial train of events and occurrences distorted and exaggerated and not unfrequently invented to suit the purpose of the story teller. This is an error to be carefully guarded against.⁴

Contributors to the Garland also voiced concern about the merits and demerits of historical fiction. In 1850, Henry Giles echoed the journal's editorial approval of the historical novel's didactic value. For him its importance lay not in its ability to teach history, but in its power to teach universal human understanding, in a manner corresponding to Goldwin Smith's Lamp of Ideality:

Romance can not teach history, nor should it be taken even as historical interpretation, and yet it can help us to understand history. We understand history as we understand man. It is as we can grasp the everlasting realities of his nature, that we can comprehend him, into whatever shape the mould of custom or of time may cast him. Outward changes of eras and of empire can be recorded in chronicles, it is sympathy alone that reaches down to the spirit of that eternal humanity which underlies them. Fiction does much to excite and to enlarge this sympathy. An age lives to us again, and they who were buried in it as in a grave, come forth at the wizard's invocation, giving us not the story, but the very being of their day.⁵

The dangers rather than the virtues of historical fiction excited J. P., another Garland writer, who declaimed against novelists whose efforts to "romance history" resulted in distortion. Especially reprehensible were authors of romances of the middle ages, who played down the grisly details of medieval life, and, in J. P.'s view, endeavoured to prove

that our historians are all liars; that our ancestors were far wiser than the men of the present day; that the period which some call the dark ages, was the most enlightened in history; that the feudal customs were not -- as we have been foolishly told -- composed of arbitrary enactments, but a very enlightened code of laws. A huge castle, surrounded with gibbets and steel-clad warriors, is, in their eyes, a very picturesque sight; donjon keeps, filled with human captives, they look upon as mere bird cages; and forays and

assassinations, as innocent and gentlemanly amusements.⁶

This condemnation of historical fiction on empirical grounds concluded with the remark that "There is more real poetry in science than in fiction."⁷ An empiricist like J. P., W. P. C. also considered most fictitious writing to be an inferior form of literature. While J. P. advised seekers of the marvellous to study the natural world, W. P. C. recommended history. When he wrote on "Our Literature, Present and Prospective" in the Garland in 1848, W. P. C. urged Canadians to pay more attention to history:

After all, History is the highest and noblest species of literature! and as such, is the one best adapted to our present intellectual necessities. Here we find united entertainment and instruction -- the curious and the philosophic. History is defined to be "philosophy teaching by example." He who delights in the romantic, need not suppose it is alone contained in fiction! nor need he go back to the early traditionary periods in search of the marvellous and wonder-working. The times of England's "Virgin Queen," -- the singular incidents connected with the fate of Essex, the adventures and subsequent imprisonment of Raleigh! the journey of Prince Charles and Buckingham to the Court of Madrid; the fall of the Stuart family, and later still, the brief but infernal supremacy of the infernal trio, Robespierre, Marat and Danton; and the rise, glory and fall of Napoleon -- these are the more interesting since we are confident of their reality. They bid defiance of the most imaginative romancist to excel them.⁸

The New Dominion Monthly supported this kind of respect for history in 1870 when it published an article by Harriet Beecher Stowe advising girls to read history during their summer holidays. Stowe considered historical fiction a valid medium for learning history, if it were well-written. Hence she recommended Ivanhoe

as "a study in style, and as a study in history." Ivanhoe would provide aesthetic as well as factual education; Stowe informed her readers that "If you like it, relish it, feel its beauties, you will find that you have gained more than a knowledge of history -- you will have formed a taste for first-class writing."⁹

Readers of such literature had to remain alert, however; as the Canadian Monthly warned a year later, "It is so much more pleasant to float through pages of picturesque narrative, sweetened with mellifluous sentiment, than to inquire whether the narrative is true."¹⁰

The distortion of history feared by the Garland, its various contributors, and the Canadian Monthly was discovered in abundance by Rose-Belford's in 1881 when it reviewed Disraeli's Endymion. Severely censured by Goldwin Smith for violating the standards of Walter Scott,¹¹ Disraeli was also reprimanded by Rose-Belford's for violating the sanctity of history. The latter angrily demanded:

Do not doubtful facts and erroneous statements already creep in among the records of our national progress with sufficient ease, and must we deliberately add to the confusion and difficulty by foisting them in by wholesale? A comic history of England has always seemed to us a sufficiently dull piece of stupidity; but "Endymion" rises above the domain of comicality. Its tone is too serious to cover a joke, the resemblance to actual events often too close to allow its author to class it among purely imaginary histories. To our mind it appears a tragic-comic history, comic in its distortion of facts, tragic in the desecration implied in such a piece of business. . . . When the present generation has passed away, what opportunity for error, for misconception, and misappreciation, will be found in the pages of the Earl of Beaconsfield's historical novels!¹²

Fear of "error . . . misconception and misapprehension" may have accounted for Goldwin Smith's rather lukewarm reception of Stories of New France (1890), by Agnes Maule Machar and T. G. Marquis. Disappointed that a book obviously intended for Canadian readers had been published in Boston, Smith conceded in the Bystander that

The work at least has this advantage, that it enables the student to pick up his reading of Canadian history without having to wade through uninteresting and interminable details, though, on the other hand, in many of the stories he may have a surfeit of horrors and more than he cares for of rapine and bloodshed. . . . The stories are told with spirit and, on the whole, with a close adherence to facts. Apart from the native histories, there is a place for the book, and our young people, especially, will find it instructive as well as entertaining reading.¹³

On the whole, such reservations and admonitions were not intended to discourage Canadians from writing historical fiction, but to encourage them to write the right kind. Throughout the nineteenth century, and especially after Confederation, many Canadian writers were preoccupied with discovering and preserving Canadian history, in both formal historiography and the historical romance. Before Canada could claim a distinct national identity, they believed, the country had to know and cherish its history.¹⁴ The popularity of historical fiction in Europe helped to fortify Canadian interest in indigenous material for romance, and reinforced the widely-held supposition that in order to develop a recognizable literary tradition, Canada had first to establish its historical identity. Although no critic questioned the

importance of history, and most assumed there existed a direct correspondence between a country's awareness of its past and the quality of its imaginative literature, different opinions emerged regarding the specific situation of Canada.

Least optimistic were those commentators who asserted that the paucity of good Canadian literature resulted directly from the country's relative newness. They presumed that only the resonances of antiquity could produce great imaginative writing, and Canada should give up looking for its Shakespeare, Milton or Scott until the country had been settled for several thousand years. In 1841, the anonymous author of "The Literature of a New Country" described how European literatures had taken centuries to evolve, eventually incorporating folklore, myth and history into sophisticated literary traditions:

Strongly tinged with the spirit of its early superstitions is the literature of every land, with the peculiar physical characteristics of its vales and mountains, and above all, with the influence which early events exercised over the minds and destinies of its first inhabitants. The achievements of unforgotten heroes, almost incredible and impossible as they seem to modern eyes, magnified through the mists and vapours of past centuries; the struggles for liberty, kept up by a gallant few, in the rude fastnesses of the mountain land; the strife for freedom, "bequeathed from bleeding sire to son," found fitting chroniclers in the fervid harps of the wandering minstrels, who sent down the thrilling legends from bard to bard, till a more advanced age reduced the crude narrative to writing, and printing ultimately insured it against destruction.¹⁵

According to this author, Canadians lacked not only a romantic past of their own, but also any interest in history. To the

average Canadian, "History is a pursuit naturally foreign to his habit of thinking, for his own country, the youngest born of nations, has but little of her own, and no local enthusiasm, that essential of the highest order of annalist, can prompt him, should he take the past occurrences of other lands for his theme." Canada's necessary absorption in "the matter of fact, sober, plodding routine of Colonial existence," its lack of history and lack of interest in history meant that "Years, long years must elapse, before a Colony, situated like Canada, can cause her voice to be heard in the literary world."¹⁶

In 1853, Catharine Parr Traill revealed that despite her literary involvement with her adopted country she too considered Canada to be a land without a history. Although she detested railroads, she did not object to their construction in the New World because

here, in this new country . . . there are no feelings connected with early associations, to be rudely violated; no scenes that time has hallowed to be destroyed. Here, the railroads run through dense forests, where the footsteps of man have never been impressed, across swamps and morasses on which the rays of the sun have scarcely ever shone, over lonely rivers and widespread lakes, that have never echoed to the dash of the oar, or reflected aught on their bosoms but the varied foliage of the overhanging woods.¹⁷

A similar point of view was expressed ten years later, by an anonymous writer on "Canadian Poetry and Poets" who attributed Canada's want of a distinctive national literature to the fact that

Canada has no historical past distant enough to lift its events into the clear region of imagination . . . no worshipped heroes whose memory may bind the hearts of the people together, or give the poet's lyre a truly national tone; -- no sacred fables, myths or traditions like those which, in the morning of the world, steeped some favoured spots of earth in an atmosphere of romance and poetry that will cling to them forever.¹⁸

Well after Confederation some critics continued to describe Canada as a land without a history conducive to the production of great literature. Like the writers previously cited, John E. Logan viewed the relation between history and literature in European terms. Canada, he felt, could not achieve literary distinction until it had aged sufficiently to acquire the historical experience which underpinned European literatures:

From my unscholarly point of view let me try to answer the question, "Can we have a distinctive Canadian literature?" Yes, most probably we can, and will, when all the unknown and undreamt changes and influences of centuries have wrought their impress on the people; when revolutions have marked eras in our history, and history, itself grown old, is phosphorescent with the halo of romance; when to our descendents eighty-ton guns and turret vessels are as javelins and Athenian galleys to us; when our railways are as Roman roads, and our present manners and customs are uncouth to the refinement of twenty-five hundred and eight-four. That we will have a literature long before such things happen I do not question; but he is doomed to awake unsatisfied who dreams of a distinctive literature from the hands of a genius, who, at a single bound, has leaped from chaos to cosmos across the evolution of ages.¹⁹

Fortunately for the development of Canadian historiography and Canadian literature, Logan was outnumbered by writers who asserted that Canada did indeed possess a distinctive history, containing ample material to inspire a national literature.

Throughout the nineteenth century, Canadian periodicals printed numerous exhortations to Canadians to study and write about their own history. The movement to recover Canadian history began in earnest in the 1830's, and expanded considerably with the awakening of Canadian nationalism that accompanied Confederation. The Canadian Monthly and National Review, like other journals of the 1870's, contributed to post-Confederation nationalism by publishing many articles about Canadian history which, according to J. G. Bourinot, "have been of especial value, in the way of attracting attention to the stores of interesting lore which lies around us in old Canadian archives."²⁰

In addition, there appeared in the Monthly a number of statements by various writers designed to correct the European point of view which presumed that Canada did not have a valid history because the country had been settled for only several centuries. These writers declared that in order to appreciate Canadian history, it was necessary to redefine European standards of antiquity, and to avoid imposing Old World criteria on the New. The time scheme of the New World needed to be understood on its own terms; as Daniel Wilson explained in his article on "Toronto of Old,"

The olden times of our Ontario capital must be measured by the scale of the New World to which it belongs; and the young Dominion in which it occupies so prominent a place; but youthful as it is, its beginnings already pertain to elder generations; and it has a history of its own not without interest to others besides its modern denizens.²¹

Wilson illustrated Toronto's stature as an historical city by comparing its origins with those of Thebes, Rome, London and other cities of antiquity. Agnes Maule Machar redefined historical time in a similar fashion when she began her article on historic Kingston by stating that "Two hundred years, though very far below the antiquity of the Chesters and Berwicks of Old England, constitute a pretty respectable age for a town in a world which is emphatically called the New."²² Again in the Monthly, M. J. Griffin equated the ancestors of Victorian Canada with the heroes of classical antiquity:

surely it is not too much to claim that the Canadian reader shall have a kindly and deep interest in the men who began the history of our country. It is a history to which we look back as the Greeks looked back to the Homeric heroes, or the Roman to the dim figures which fill the epoch of his country's foundation, and which will ever be the prologue to the recital of the most splendid developments to which these colonies may in the future attain.²³

In its "Literary Notes" column of February, 1873, the Monthly dealt editorially with the issue of relative historical values and time schemes. "Compared with the mother-land our antiquities may seem but things of yesterday," it noted, but in the New World historical processes have been condensed:

Events in the new world move rapidly. Within the compass of a few decades we seem to have crowded the interest of a century's history in the old world. A new world has been opened up; nature has been wrestled with; tribes subdued, civilization has displaced the rude and primitive; savagery has given place to law; the discoverer has become the pioneer; the pioneer the colonist; and from the colony we have now the nation.

In such conflicts and achievements, and in so great a stride in material and moral progress, it could not fail that much that is rich in association and stirring in story, should result and become the heritage of the present.²⁴

The quest for Canadian history, suitably "rich in association and stirring in story," permeated the consciousness of Victorian Canada. Many stories in the literary periodicals attempted to add historical associations to the apparently timeless wilderness, searching the Canadian landscape for resemblances to the Old World, where "Every valley, every mountain, every ruin, has its tale of legendary lore."²⁵ One Garland tale, "The Gibbet Tree" (1844), was written to show that "this country, although unknown to fame, can produce its romantic incidents also, which, if happy in a historian, would be devoured by the reader with as much avidity as the marvellous tales and legends of older and more favored lands."²⁶ H. T. Devon's "Leaves from the Life Romance of Merne Dillamer," serialized in the British American in 1864, opened with a similar affirmation of Canada's romantic value:

The Bay of Quinté in its present state affords attractions of no ordinary kind to the lovers of picturesque scenery only wanting in the charms of association to equal the placid serenity of many far-famed English rivers, or to rival even the bolder beauties of the fairy-haunted Rhine.²⁷

To add "the charms of association" to Upper Canadian soil, Devon constructed a tale of amorous complications occurring thirty years previously, and involving a descendant of

one of those intrepid United Empire Loyalists who, at the commencement of the great American struggle for

independence, left their native homes with a spirit of undaunted heroism, and traversed perilous and unknown tracts of forest, and miles upon miles of unreclaimed wilderness, in order to reach the British Provinces of the north, rather than endure the insulting alternative of acknowledging a self-constituted government, or of proclaiming their allegiance to a flag whose folds waved in triumphant though rebellious majesty over the noble land of their birth.²⁸

Devon's Tory loyalism, reverence for history, and desire to enrich Canadians with a personal sense of their past culminated in his final remarks. At the end of the story he switched his focus from the past to the present, speaking in his own voice in order to relate past events and present realities to a specific Canadian locality:

As the author writes this, he stands near the spot where they laid this erring daughter of earth down to rest. Under a drooping elm-tree in this quiet churchyard, beneath this hill, is the lonely grave of Maude Dillamer. . . . The mansion at Prospect Hill is now, in the march of improvement which of late years has swept over the land, -- much less recognizable than when it occupied a more isolated position in a less progressive time.²⁹

Also motivated by a desire to endow his country with a sense of legend based on history was the anonymous author of "A Tale of the Red River," published in the Anglo-American in 1855. After relating how the Red River received its name, from the massacre of a party of settlers by Indians, the author concluded that "a halo of glory must ever surround the names of those pioneers of civilization in the far Northwest, as bright as that which encircles the heroes of Balaclava or Inkerman."³⁰ A slight variation in this pattern occurred in the work of William Charles

McKinnon, who was interested in Canada's links with sensational rather than heroic history. In the chapter of Frances, or Pirate Cove (1851) titled "Cape Breton 120 Years Ago," McKinnon argues persuasively that notorious pirates like Blackbeard and Dampier had frequented the coast of Cape Breton, thereby giving his otherwise impossible novel some sense of historical authenticity.

These mid-nineteenth-century stories, which reveal a strong interest in imbuing the Canadian landscape with romantic historical associations, represent the attitude of the Canadian cultural community as a whole. During the nineteenth century, critic after critic exhorted Canadian writers, of fiction and non-fiction alike, to develop native historical subjects. Pre-Confederation editors of literary periodicals, seeking to establish a market for Canadian literature, requested material about the country's past and suggested suitable topics. In 1833 the editor of the Canadian Literary Magazine asked,

who will deny that the events which have characterised the infancy of this extensive country afford ample material for the Historian, the Poet, and the Novelist? The sufferings of the U. E. Loyalists, -- the privations of those who sunk beneath the gnawings of Famine in Hungry Bay, -- the adventures of the Hunter, especially if he possessed the romantic spirit of Lord Edward Fitzgerald, -- the Guerilla-like achievements of the late War, -- the past and present condition of the Aborigines, -- are subjects interesting to the Canadian, and to him who has adopted Canada for his country.³¹

In 1853, with more elegance than grammar, the editor of the Maple Leaf reminded her contributors that

Articles delineating events and scenes which have transpired in the Province will be welcomed. Touches from pens which love to trace the early stages of progress in a community, and enliven their sketches by bringing to light incidents and legends relating to our wonderful past, will find a corner for such tracery in our Magazine.³²

Full-length Canadian histories were enthusiastically welcomed by the Moodies in the Victoria Magazine³³ and by the Literary Garland, which declared that John Richardson's War of 1812 (1842) "will rescue from oblivion one important epoch,"³⁴ and also hoped it would mollify some of the residual hostilities from the 1837 rebellion. Richardson used language similar to the Garland's in 1841, when he petitioned Baron Sydenham, Governor General of British North America, for a pension. Among his achievements Richardson cited the writing of The Canadian Brothers, whose purpose was "to rescue from oblivion the names of great and good men whose death not less than their lives have reflected lustre upon this Province."³⁵

That Confederation would provide new stimulation for historiography and historical romance was recognized in 1867 by Stewart's Literary Quarterly, which remarked that

There is a mine of historic and romantic literature to be worked by the student of this or a later day, and we trust that when the flag of the Dominion shall wave proudly over all the confederated states, from the Atlantic to the Pacific, we shall endeavour to preserve from oblivion many a faded annal of the past, or weave into romantic fiction . . . scraps of legendary lore.³⁶

The key words in this statement are "historic" and "romantic," syntactically linked together. The kind of history which excited

post-Confederation Canada included incidents and characters which merited the adjectives "romantic" and "heroic," able to furnish material for novels modelled on the works of Sir Walter Scott and faithful to Goldwin Smith's seven "Lamps of Fiction." A similar view of history underlay the nationalism of the Canada First movement. W. A. Foster's 1871 address, "Canada First; or, Our New Nationality," opened with a paean to the romance of Canada's past:

what a land of adventure and romance has this been!
 We may have no native ballad for the nursery, or home-born epic for the study; no tourney feats to rhapsodise over, or mock heroics to emblazon on our escutcheon; we may have no prismatic fables to illumine and adorn the preface of our existence, or curious myths to obscure and soften the sharp outline of our early history; yet woven into the tapestry of our past, are whole volumes of touching poetry and great tomes of glowing prose that rival fiction in eagerness of incident, and in marvellous climax put fable to the blush. We need not ransack foreign romance for valorous deeds, nor are we compelled to go abroad for sad tales of privation and suffering. The most chivalrous we can match; the most tried we can parallel.³⁷

A few chroniclers and essayists perceived that the historical foundation of the new nation lay in the trials and deeds of its early pioneers, whose heroism resided in the day to day labours of colonization. Writers like William Wye Smith, who published a series of "Illustrations of Canadian Life" in Rose-Belford's in 1882, wanted the country's debt to its first settlers properly acknowledged:

In a few centuries, or even in a few generations, the first fifty years of Canadian life -- the ways and means, and make-shifts, of the men who took hold

of the Bush, and made it into an inhabited and cultivated country -- will be an interesting study. Then people will regret that so few materials remain for the illustration of the formative period of the country. The immigration of a family into this country will always be held as the beginning of the family history. How desirable would it be, could we induce the authorities at Ottawa or Toronto to encourage the preservation of such family histories, by opening a set of books, to permanently register at a reasonable fee, memoranda concerning our pioneer families. We can only faintly imagine how much interest may surround these, in the years or centuries to come. At the present time it is hard to imagine the truth that we are living in the formative, the heroic age of the country.³⁸

In 1884 the Canadian Methodist Magazine expressed a similar outlook when it warmly welcomed Samuel Thompson's Reminiscences of a Canadian Pioneer for the last Fifty Years:

As Mr. Goldwin Smith truly remarked . . . the noblest chapters in the history of Canada are buried in the graves of the early pioneers throughout this land. . . . We cannot be too grateful when one of these pioneers leaves us a record of the early days of Canada. It is peculiarly rare to find one of the literary merit of Mr. Thompson's volume. It is the best account of pioneer life that we know.³⁹

Several contributors to the New Dominion Monthly also called attention to the heroism of the ordinary men and women who first settled British North America. In 1868, W. H. W. recounted the founding of the Red River settlement, and Rev. T. Webster produced a series of articles describing "Early Scenes in Canadian Life."⁴⁰

In the 1870's and 1880's, however, the time had not yet come for accounts of ordinary life -- past or present -- to enter the mainstream of Canadian fiction. Such material frequently appeared in books or periodicals in the form of journalistic

sketches or factual memoirs of the past, but was not considered sufficiently exciting to fulfill the requirements of historical romance. Those interested in recovering Canadian history and establishing Canadian literature through the medium of the historical novel turned instead to men and women whom history had endowed with heroic stature, or to eras of great historical crisis, appropriately "rich in association and stirring in story."⁴¹

Among the most prominent supporters of Canadian efforts in the fields of historical research and romance were three founding members of the Royal Society of Canada. James MacPherson LeMoine, John George Bourinot and John Talon-Lesperance all wrote copiously on Canadian historical subjects, publishing monographs and full-length works, and contributing articles and reviews to the major post-Confederation periodicals.⁴² In his later years Bourinot valued pure historiography more highly than fiction, and encouraged the writing of historical romance more in concession to popular taste than in accordance with his own literary principles. But in the 1870's, when he himself wrote a few stories, Bourinot joined LeMoine and Lesperance in believing that, far from corrupting history, the historical romance performed the dual purpose of educating the Canadian public and developing a distinctive Canadian literature by following "the memorable example of the author of Waverley."⁴³

Bourinot, LeMoine, Lesperance and other intellectual leaders of Victorian Canada performed their mission of directing the

development of Canadian fiction by continually reminding their readers that "The early times of Canada abound with incidents of the most dramatic interest -- inexhaustible stores of materials for the novelist."⁴⁴ LeMoine specified the results he anticipated from his historical researches in an essay on "The Heroine of Verchères," published in Stewart's in 1869:

The early times of Canada teem with incidents most romantic: feats of endurance -- of cool bravery -- Christian heroism in its loftiest phases; acts of savage treachery of the darkest dye;-- deeds of blood and revenge most appalling -- adventurous escapes by forest, land and flood; which would furnish the frame-work for fifty most fascinating romances. . . . The era is not far distant when the beauties of Canadian history will be as familiar to our youth as they are comparatively unknown at the present time. D'Iberville, M'lle de Verchères, Latour, Dollard des Ormeaux, Lambert Close, will yet, we opine, receive from the magic wand of a Canadian Walter Scott a halo of glory as bright as that which, in the eyes of Scotia's sons, surrounds a Flora McIvor, a Jeannie Deans, a Claverhouse, or a Rob Roy.⁴⁵

LeMoine's essays on the history and traditions of early Canada and Quebec, collected in his six volumes of Maple Leaves (1863-1906) and other works, did in fact inspire many writers, most notably William Kirby, a fellow founding member of the Royal Society. When the Canadian Monthly reviewed LeMoine's Past and Present (1876), it indicated the national significance of his work:

It is always a pleasure to receive a new volume from the author of "Maple Leaves." Mr. Le Moine's energy and industry have laid his own Province and the Dominion at large under a deep obligation. In collecting materials, sketches of character, Indian and Canadian, in rescuing

favourite chansons, and, generally, in treasuring up for the historian's use mémoires pour servir, he has been an indefatigable labourer.⁴⁶

Bourinot aligned LeMoine's research with a romantic approach towards history when he declared of his friend that "To him the natural beauty of the St. Lawrence and its historic and legendary lore are as familiar as were the picturesque scenery and the history of Scotland to Sir Walter Scott."⁴⁷ Scott's name appeared again in the obituary of LeMoine published in the Proceedings and Transactions of the Royal Society of Canada in 1912: "Ce que furent Sir Walter Besant pour Londres, Frederic Mistral pour le Provence, Sir Walter Scott pour l'Écosse, Sir James LeMoine l'a été pour la ville et la région du Québec."⁴⁸

Like LeMoine, Bourinot determined to resurrect the forgotten heroes and heroines of early Canada. He tended to maintain a more balanced, less enthusiastically nationalistic position than LeMoine, viewing Canada within the larger spectrum of world history. In his 1877 article on "Gentlemen Adventurers and Coureurs de Bois," Bourinot postulated that Canadian history had suffered neglect because it could not quite equal the "striking" and "sensational" events surrounding Spanish activity in the New World. He therefore resolved to correct the omissions and oversights which had characterized the recording of Canadian history from the time of the first explorers:

The Spanish monarch showered dignities on the bold unscrupulous men who gave a new world to Spain, and poured untold millions into her treasury; but the

pioneers who won a boundless domain for France, only met with neglect and coldness. Even the names of many of these adventurers have been forgotten, and are only now and then brought to light by the enthusiastic student of our early records.⁴⁹

The object of Bourinot's historical researches was to call attention to "Canadian Materials for History, Poetry and Romance," as he titled an essay published in New Dominion Monthly in 1871. Canada would take centuries, Bourinot felt, to acquire the historical resonances of the Old World, "where every foot of ground has its memorable associations -- its record of human heroism and human suffering," but it still possessed its own "record of heroic endeavour and suffering, of the struggle between antagonistic principles and systems, of human passion, frailty and virtue" that comprised the true "essence of history, romance and poetry."⁵⁰ He found the earliest days of Canada to be especially rich in "prolific materials for the novelist." For Bourinot, this period ended with the War of 1812, which marked the end of the country's dramatic, romantic history, and the beginning of its preoccupation with utilitarian development. "Since that time," he declared, "our history has been wanting in the elements of dramatic interest; it has had no episodes of stirring import, except the fruitless rebellion from 1836-37 which after all was little more than a faction fight in some Irish county. Our history for the past half century has been the record of material progress."⁵¹

Bourinot's 1871 summary of romantic historical material available for fiction included Louisbourg, Quebec, the Jesuit

missionaries, Indians, LaSalle, St. Castin, Lemoine d'Iberville, and the War of 1812. But twenty-two years later, when he evaluated Canada's intellectual strength and weakness, he was disheartened to note that no Canadian had yet achieved international recognition in "the novel or romance." Despite Bourinot's personal efforts to encourage interest in Canadian history, Canada still lacked a national literature which successfully gave

form and vitality to the abundant materials that exist in the Dominion, among the habitants on the old seigneuries of the French province, in that historic past of which the ruins still remain in Montreal and Quebec, in the Northwest with its quarrels of adventurers in the fur trade, and in the many other sources of inspiration that exist in this country for the true story-teller.⁵²

Although the quantity of native prose fiction had significantly increased from 1871 to 1893, its quality failed to reach Bourinot's high literary standards.

Unlike LeMoine and Bourinot, John Talon-Lesperance contributed to the encouragement of Canadian historical romance more as a novelist and journalist than as an historian or cultural critic. From 1873 to 1880 he edited the Canadian Illustrated News (1869-83), a weekly periodical whose policy of promoting historical romance first appeared in its prospectus, issued in 1869, which announced a contest with cash prizes for the best "ROMANCES founded on Incidents in the History of Canada." It serialized the winners, and under Lesperance's direction the magazine continued to publish historical fiction. When he became founding editor of the Dominion

Illustrated Weekly in 1888, Lesperance continued to favour romantic stories based on Canadian history, writing for the first number of the new periodical a two-part narrative designed to combine Canadian history with one of the most popular forms of short magazine fiction -- the summer love story. Unfortunately, in "A Missiquoi Holiday" ancient history and contemporary amours fail to blend harmoniously because the historic material is didactically superimposed upon the primary narrative. When the hero pays his first visit to the Eastern Townships, he encyclopaedically summarizes the area's various historical associations, with rather incongruous results. At one point Lesperance insists on inserting into a description of sunset on Lake Champlain factual details which simply interrupt the flow of the love story:

It was now sunset, and we had the glorious view which Sharpe had promised me. The great lake -- scene of so much history, in two hundred years -- the incursions of the Iroquois to Quebec; the expedition of de Tracy into the Mohawk Valley; the ascent of Montcalm in 1758; the descent of the British in 1760; the triumph and flight of the Continentals in 1776-77; the disastrous march of Burgoyne, which culminated at Saratoga in 1780; the naval encounters of 1812-15; and the lesser incidents of the Canadian rebellion of 1837-38, the great lake seemed to reflect in sanguine glory all these deeds of victory and defeat as the sun poured his departing fires upon its bosom, tempered by streaks of storm clouds.⁵³

His earnest concern with publicizing Canadian history through the medium of fiction, present also in his best-known work, The Bastonnais (1877), earned Lesperance an estimable reputation in Canadian literary circles. In 1889 Canadiana commended his

editorial direction of the Dominion Illustrated, lauding the magazine's promotion of historical fiction:

The field of historical romance is in this country a fertile and as yet almost unbroken one, vast as our prairies, and without their apparent monotony. The Dominion Illustrated can do much for Canada, and we feel sure that under the present management our history will not be lost sight of in its editorial department.⁵⁴

When Lesperance died in 1891, W. D. Lighthall eulogized his friend's literary principles, stating that he had shown "more than any man how much interest can be awakened in the romance of the regions around us, and there is little doubt that he educated not a few permanently in that culture of the heart which alone makes the gentleman and the gentlewoman."⁵⁵

Lighthall's praise for Lesperance's interest in "the romance of the regions around us" and cultivation of gentility echoes the influence of Walter Scott and concurs with the lofty idealism expressed in Smith's seven "Lamps of Fiction." Following the example of Scott, and maintaining Smith's code of literary chivalry, English-Canadian novelists (including Lighthall) turned to various eras of Canadian history. Resolved to create a national literature, they tried to fit Canadian material to the form of the historical romance. Canadian content, not Canadian form was the object of these literary nationalists; as an anonymous theorist stated in 1881, an

atmosphere of nationalism, indeed, is one that should more penetratively pervade all our literature than it does. If that literature is ever to fire the heart of the nation, and to create a distinguishing type

of national character, it must cease to be imitative, and find the materials of its art and occupation at home. It may borrow the literary forms of the author-craft of the Old World, but its themes must be those of the New.⁵⁶

In their search for appropriate Canadian themes, a number of English-Canadian novelists -- mostly from Upper Canada -- chose to write romances about the past of their own, English-speaking communities. One of these, An Algonquin Maiden (1887), by Graeme Mercer Adam and Agnes Ethelwyn Wetherald, represents a deliberate attempt to establish the historical romance as the proper mode for Canadian fiction. In her discussion of this book in The Week, Sara Jeannette Duncan quickly discerned Adam's and Wetherald's desire to counter the realistic direction of the modern novel:

"An Algonquin Maiden" is a romance, a romance of the most uncompromising description, a romance that might have been written if the realistic school had never been heard of. One need go no further than the title to discover it a romance; "maidens" are unknown to the literary methods of a later date. They have become extinct, and are less euphonically replaced. Even in poetry usage has handed the word over to be, along with his coronet, the exclusive literary property of Lord Tennyson. More than this, the title boldly states, as well as implies, the character of the book. "A Romance," its authors have had the temerity to subtitle it, "Of the Early Days of Upper Canada." This must be regarded as nothing less than a challenge to the modern idea of the form of latter-day fiction.⁵⁷

The authors announce their romantic perception of the past in their first paragraph, which opens with the poetic statement that "It was a May morning in 1825 -- spring-time of the year, late spring-time of the century," and closes with reference to "the

romantic halo which the mist of years loves to weave about the heads of departed pioneers."⁵⁸ In 1832, William Dunlop had observed of Canada that "I can conceive no possibility of its becoming for centuries a fitting stage for the heroes or heroines of the fashionable novels of Mr. Bulwer or the young D'Israeli."⁵⁹

Such details of social history did not faze Adam and Wetherald, however, who created characters appropriate to romantic fiction by populating Upper Canada with well-born European families.

Helène DeBerczy, one of the three unattached maidens whose amorous involvements shape the plot, descends from a Huguenot family transplanted to the New World. They belong to a community thirty miles from York, settled by

French officers of the noblesse order, who, during the French Revolution, when the royalist cause became desperate, emigrated to England, thence to Canada, where, by the bounty of the Crown, they were given grants of land in this portion of the Province of Upper Canada. Here many of these émigrés had made clearings on the Ridges, and reared Châteaux for themselves and their households after the manner of their ancestral homes in Languedoc and Brittany (pp. 14-15).

The English counterpart to this romantically French (and conveniently Protestant) element is fulfilled by the Macleod family, headed by strongly Tory Commodore Ralph Macleod. "A grand specimen of the sturdy British seamen, who contributed by their prowess to make England mistress of the seas," Macleod retired to Canada where he built "a palatial residence" (p. 26) on the shore of Lake Simcoe. His Toryism and his political activities as a member of the Legislative Council identify him with the Family

Compact, and he bitterly opposes the reforming activities of young Allan Dunlop, his son Edward's friend and eventually his daughter Rose's husband.

Dunlop adds another dimension to this romantic cast. This upstart Reformer, born in Canada in a farmer's cottage but also incarnating "all that became a patriot and a gentleman" (p. 29), at first appears too low-born to win the maiden he loves. But Dunlop proves to be a hero in disguise. "Though born and bred on a farm," Allan Dunlop "had in him the springs of a higher and finer life. He was a man of delicate instincts, refined feelings, and great native sensibility, inherited from his mother" (p. 91), an English gentlewoman who had eloped with her riding-master. Dunlop's high parentage and even higher principles eventually win him his bride, as both he and Ralph Macleod learn to take "a more dispassionate view of the questions which disturbed the country and which had ranged them politically on opposite sides" (p. 237). To this classic romantic plot, in which the hero realizes his true identity and noble love triumphs over political and parental obstacles, Adam and Wetherald add a subplot centring on the Algonquin maiden.

Although Wanda has little effect upon the main plot, the fact that this post-Wordsworthian child of nature gives the book its title indicates the prominence of romance in the minds of its authors. Described by Rose Macleod as "a beauty. Half-wild . . . but with

a sort of barbaric splendour about her that dazzles and bewilders one" (p. 58), Wanda epitomizes the romantic noble savage. Her creators place her in a paradisaical natural world, to her far superior to that developed by European civilization. Wanda and Rose MacLeod are friends, but Wanda's

admiration of Rose was tinged with pity. Poor garden flower, confined for life to the dull walks and prim parterres of a fixed enclosure, when she might roam the wild paths of the forest; condemned to sleep in a close room, on stifling feathers, and bathe in an elongated tub, when she might feel the elasticity of hemlock boughs beneath her, inhale the perfumed breath of myriad trees, and plunge at sunrise into the gleaming waters of the lake. It was indeed a pitiable life (p. 49).

But a serpent invades Wanda's innocent wilderness when Rose's philandering brother becomes infatuated with the Algonquin maiden. Haunted by the "intense recollection of a tawny woman, beautiful and warm-blooded" (p. 98), Edward breaks off his commitment to Helène DeBerczy, and determines to marry Wanda. Eventually her conduct at a social gathering demonstrates that Wanda cannot adapt to the manners of white society, in whose eyes she behaves "precisely like an overgrown child of five years who has 'never had any bringing up'" (p. 193). Yet for a long time Edward continues to vacillate between the two women -- one representing refined European civilization, the other the passionate call of the Canadian wild -- until he finally returns to Helène. The once innocent Wanda, now deeply in love with Edward, is too much a victim of civilization to return to her idyllic forest. She finally drowns herself, having "committed the god-like sin

of loving too much" (p. 233).⁶⁰

According to Sara Jeannette Duncan, the more romantic sections of the book were written by Wetherald, a poet whose taste for flamboyance frequently obtrudes. As Duncan dryly remarked in the Globe, "In any love story there are plenty of opportunities for the divine afflatus to precipitate itself, as it were, into prose, and Miss Wetherald has improved every opportunity."⁶¹ Duncan remained true to her literary principles when she announced her preference for the chapters concerned with real, political life:

The historical and political parts of the volume, which form by no means too much ballast for Miss Wetherald's aerial writing, we owe entirely to Mr. Adam; and it will probably be wished in many quarters that we had been given more chapters like that upon "Politics at the Capital," even at the expense of a few of the sort of that upon "A Kiss and its Consequences."⁶²

Like much Canadian historical fiction, An Algonquin Maiden contains a political as well as a literary purpose. In addition to advocating romance as the proper mode for Canadian fiction, and trying to instil a sense of patriotism, this novel's illustration of the conflicts which culminated in the 1837 rebellion and the achievement of Responsible Government prescribes a code of political chivalry. In Allan Dunlop, Adam portrays the ideal, temperate political reformer:

He was one of the few in the Legislature who, while they recognized that the old system of government was becoming less and less suited to the genius and

wants of the young Canadian community, at the same time wished to usher in the new régime with the moderation and tact which mark the work of the thoughtful politician and the aims of the true statesman (p. 29).

Although Dunlop identifies with the reformers, he eschews republicanism, for he is "too loyal a man to rank with the 'heated enthusiasts' who were threatening to overturn the Constitution and make a republic out of the colony" (p. 168). His "eminently fair and judicial" (p. 169) mind seeks to correct abuse and lessen the power of the "ruling oligarchy" without unduly upsetting the status quo. To maintain political peace, he learns to regard the political situation "from a point of view which was eminently statesmanlike and discreet," and therefore refrains from "pressing many reforms which time, he knew, would quietly and with less acrimony bring about" (p. 237).

Dunlop's virtues and gentility eventually win over Colonel Macleod, the crusty old Tory whose "kindly, sympathetic heart" respects "those whose aims were high and whose motives were good" (p. 237). Although Adam documents some of the abuses of power committed by the Family Compact, his own biases surface when he compliments their "respect for British institutions, and their staunch loyalty to the Crown, at a time when republican sentiments were dangerously prevalent" (p. 169). Altogether, Adam seems to advocate an evolutionary Toryism, which maintains the best of the old, and introduces innovations only when the old system fails to live up to its ideals. Sara Jeannette Duncan

stated that Adam's tactful efforts to paint both sides in their best colours stemmed from his being "aware that the foibles of both the early pioneers of Reform and the upholders of the Family Compact have descended almost intact unto the second and third generations, and doubtless desirous, above all things, to avoid fanning the flames of Provincial party strife." But of his apparent refusal to take sides she also remarked, "While congratulating Mr. Adam upon the diplomacy with which he has compassed a somewhat difficult situation, one cannot help observing in the necessity for it another and an unsuspected difficulty which besets Canadian authorship."⁶³

Tact and diplomacy meant little to many other authors of historical fiction about English Canada, who were frequently motivated by a desire to advance a particular cause. Writers about the 1837 uprising tended to be especially partisan -- usually in favour of the government, and against the rebels. In their stories, plot and character serve merely to enhance a political position. Typical of this attitude was William Charles McKinnon. In his preface to Saint George: or, the Canadian League (1852), McKinnon claimed that "the author has not allied himself to any party or taken the view of any particular faction with regard to the insurrection,"⁶⁴ but he depicted all those associated with William Lyon Mackenzie as absolute villains. "In the Thick of It," by A Backwoodsman, first published in 1858 and attributed to William Dunlop⁶⁵ states its author's political allegiance even more clearly. Here the rebels are portrayed as

utterly disreputable licentious individuals, who try to commit the "act of sacrilege" of kissing the heroine, and converse "in language too debased for these pages."⁶⁶ The story's hero, Harry Hewit, remains true to his UEL origins and helps quell the moral chaos incited by Mackenzie and his followers:

Though the actual rebellion under Mackenzie was quickly crushed, a year elapsed before peace and prosperity began to return to the British dominions in North America. The contagious breath of armed resistance had swept over all the provinces, and under the violence of the commotion thereby caused, scoundrels of all sorts enjoyed a sort of immunity, of which they were not slow to avail themselves.

Incendiarism, riot, robbery and violence kept the loyal inhabitants of Canada and the other provinces in a state of constant dread. Nowhere was the evil more rife than on the borders of Upper Canada, and Hewit's company did yeoman service to the Crown, in punishing and suppressing those bands of invaders who, under the flag of liberty, pursued their lawless courses.⁶⁷

Like the author of "In the Thick of It," Catharine Parr Traill portrayed the rebels only in unsavoury terms. Susanna Moodie expressed sympathy with Mackenzie's cause, especially in "Canada: A Contrast," added to the 1871 edition of Roughing It in the Bush. But her sister maintained a more conservative attitude, originating, no doubt, in the fears she experienced when news of the outbreak first reached her in 1837. Traill's diary entry for December 7, 1837 begs, "God preserve us from the fearful consequences of a civil warfare. It seems we have been slumbering in fancied security on a fearful volcano which has burst and may possibly overwhelm us." It concludes, "Surely

ours is a holy warfare -- the rebels fight in an unholy and unblessed cause."⁶⁸ When she later transformed her historical experiences into fiction, in "The Volunteer's Bride" published in the Maple Leaf in 1854,⁶⁹ Traill used the rebellion to teach patriotism to her young readers. In this story, duty comes before love as the bridegroom troops off with the government forces minutes after his wedding ceremony. Traill stresses the virtues of "our brave Canadian volunteers" and the selflessness of their wives; the tale ends when the government triumphs, and the wedding cake is finally cut "with three cheers -- one for the bride, one for the bridegroom, and the third for the colony and its brave volunteers."⁶⁹

Later writers, aided by the passage of time, viewed the rebellion more dispassionately. In a rambling potpourri of literary styles, plots and characters, serialized in the Maritime Monthly in 1874 under the title of "Josiah Garth," Dr. Daniel Clark expressed sympathy with Mackenzie. And in "Rosalba; or, Faithful to two Lovers," the story which received second prize in the Canadian Illustrated News's historical romance competition, Arthur Faveral discounted the political import of the rebellion. His Canadian narrator explains to an American that

The rebellion . . . marks an era in our history. It is an event to date from. To men of my generation it is a starting point, but that is because it is the era of our Union. Outside of this fact, I can trace no direct influence it has had on the Canadian people. The rebellion was crushed before it became a revolution,

and it is only revolutions, you know, that can materially alter a national character, one way or the other. Hence the Canadian people, barring always their steady advance with the wave of universal progress, have remained ever since the rebellion pretty much what they were before it.

For Faverel, the rebellion acquires literary importance because "there are numerous episodes connected with that event -- scraps of legendary and ballad literature of our village firesides, most of them still unwritten"⁷⁰ which fulfill the conventions of literary romance. Hence "Rosalba" dwells more on the amorous complications produced by the rebellion than on its political meaning.

Writers especially interested in arousing nationalistic fervour tended to avoid the troubles of 1837, which involved internal dissent, and instead turned to the War of 1812, which allowed them to indulge in patriotism to their hearts' content. Agnes Maule Machar's For King and Country, serialized in the Canadian Monthly in 1874 before its publication in book form, supported that periodical's Canada First point of view.⁷¹ The story combines amorous romance with historical romance as Ernest Heathcote, of lower-class origins, proves worthy of his upper-class Upper Canadian sweetheart by fighting bravely with Brock at Queenston Heights. The situation is complicated by Ernest's American birth; that an American can support the Canadian cause reinforces British morality and justice. Heathcote devotes himself to Canada because he feels that

a reckless, unscrupulous invasion of a peaceful country, brought about by base men for selfish ends, must be resisted by every honest man. To take up arms in such a cause was to fight not only for King and Country, but for peace and good order, -- for the sacred rights of man, -- for home and the dear helpless ones around the hearthstone; and against murder, rapine, crime, -- all the countless villainies that must attend the success of reckless marauders.⁷²

A similar position is taken by the hero of W. H. Withrow's Neville Trueman, The Pioneer Preacher (1880), a young American-born Methodist who finds himself in Canada when the war breaks out. Trueman stays with the Canadians, declaring,

My choice is made; I cast in my lot with my adopted country. I believe this invasion of a peaceful territory by an armed host is a wanton outrage, and cannot have the smile of Heaven. I daresay I shall encounter obloquy and suspicion from both sides, but I must obey my conscience.⁷³

Despite his noble intention to "present certain phases of Canadian life during the heroic struggle against foreign invasion, which first stirred in our country the pulses of that common national life which has at length attained a sturdier strength in the confederation of the several provinces of the Dominion of Canada,"⁷⁴ Withrow's earnestness defeats his purpose. He crams into one small volume the history of the entire war, the history of Ontario Methodism, and a tract illustrating the conversion of the heroine to Methodism, trying to unite the whole through the sporadic appearances of the itinerant Trueman, who even manages to encounter Laura Secord in the middle of her famous journey. Also designed to uphold the British virtues of honour, loyalty and justice, against American self-interest and licence was Robert Sellar's Hemlock, A Tale of the War of 1812 (1890). But by far the most

polished and carefully constructed Canadian novel about this war was William Wilfred Campbell's A Beautiful Rebel (1909), in which "the unofficial poet laureate of Canadian imperialism"⁷⁵ turned the conventions of romance into a statement of imperial sentiment.

Campbell's preface announces that his purpose is both national and imperial. He re-creates "in romantic form the early vicissitudes of fortune in the life of my native province," to show that "no portion of our continent contains more fascinating and tragic material for the novelist, than does the triangular peninsula bounded by the Great Lakes, the Ottawa River, and the Upper St. Lawrence." But his ultimate goal is to reach beyond Canada and to place Canada within the larger context of the British Empire:

To the British over-sea, but in the Empire I present these pages, in the hope that they will realize that the true strength of the Empire depends not on trade or commerce, not on force or political diplomacy; but on the common loyalty of her children at home and abroad to the highest instincts and traditions of a great people.⁷⁶

Hence Campbell describes Brock as "a brave soldier of the Empire" (p. 6) and the battle of Queenston Heights as the occasion when "the first great victory in the battle for the preservation of Canada to the British crown was won" (p. 264).

To relate the War of 1812 to the Empire, Campbell creates a story whose central conflict occurs not between Canadians and Americans, but between two families of British descent who carry into the New World the romantic, historic friction between the

Roundheads and the Cavaliers. The Bradfords, republicans "by reason of their heredity of blood from their regicide ancestors" (pp. 62-63), plot with the Americans against British aristocrats living in Upper Canada. Their main target is Colonel Monmouth, whose garden, "like a bit of the Old World," represents the transplanting of aristocratic culture in North America. Outside his fence is "the rough squalor and coarseness of a primitive back-woods yard," while within exists "a condition showing infinite care, toil and ideality, a refinement of garden hedge and orchard-wall, which suggested England" (p. 125). Not surprisingly, Campbell resolves the English Civil War on the side of the Royalists. Lydia Bradford, who "instinctively loved and worshipped beauty and refinement" (p. 222) despite her republican origins, is converted through love, marries Monmouth's heir, and together they settle down as gentlefolk in Upper Canada.

Like Adam and Wetherald, Campbell required the sanction of Old World aristocracy and its historical associations to render English-Canadian life suitable for literary romance. Their fictional heroes and heroines are born in Canada, but mostly to families who have attempted to transplant upper-class European life wholesale to the New World, and have established park-like estates in the wilds of Upper Canada. This kind of nostalgic attraction to a form of high life which did not exist in contemporary Victorian Canada, and could be found in its past only with some difficulty, appeared also in Gasca's 1863

discussion of The History of Emily Montague,⁷⁷ and in Agatha Armour's Lady Rosamond's Secret (1878). The only noteworthy aspect of Armour's naive romantic fantasy is its setting in Fredericton during the administration of Lord Howard Douglas in the late 1820's. According to Armour, "These were Fredericton's glorious days -- days of sport; days of chivalry; days of splendour and high life."⁷⁸ Armour discovered in Fredericton's historic past a Canadian analogue to medieval romance:

Truly this was the chivalric age in the history of the capital of New Brunswick -- the age when proud knighthood was the ruling passion in the breasts of the sterner sex, when true heroic bravery was the quality which won the maiden fair, when the breath of slander could not be tolerated without calling forth a brave champion on behalf of the wronged. This is the age that has passed away never to return. Progress and Reform are the two great powers combined to crush out all traces of those bygone days. In united action they ruthlessly wipe out every vestige or lingering relic of past greatness Reform suggests, Progress acts -- Reform suggests the removal of all old landmarks, Progress assists in the accomplishment. By such means, and through successive stages, did those days pass away, now to be reviewed, as a beautiful dream of the past.⁷⁹

Despite Armour's enthusiastic nostalgia, most novelists interested in the past found that English Canada offered comparatively little in the way of dramatic social, cultural and political history. They would have concurred with John George Bourinot's 1881 remark that the history of Canada, "under the English régime, labours under the disadvantage of a want of unity . . . being for the most part a record of comparatively insignificant political controversy." While Bourinot called

for dedicated historians to "lift [English-] Canadian history out of that slough of dulness into which so many have succeeded in throwing it,"⁸⁰ few novelists aside from Adam and Wetherald showed much interest in the task. Instead, English Canadian writers turned to the one region within their own borders which most readily provided exciting history, romantic folklore and a European social order, and adopted as their own the history of the French Canadians, in Acadia and in Quebec.

NOTES TO CHAPTER VII

¹ "One can readily enter into the meaning of one of our late Governors, the Earl of Elgin, who, in one of his dispatches to the Home Government, in speaking of the primitive days of the colony, describes them as 'the heroic times of Canada.' The expression was as eloquent as it was truthful." J. M. LeMoine, "The Heroine of Verchères," Stewart's, 3 (April 1869), 85.

² John Richardson, The Canadian Brothers (Montreal: Armour & Ramsay, 1840), I, p. x.

³ "Our Table," LG, 2 (Feb. 1840), 138.

⁴ "Our Table," LG, n.s. 5 (May 1847), 242.

⁵ Henry Giles, "Fiction," LG, n.s. 8 (June 1850), 265.

⁶ J. P., "Novels and Novel Readers," LG, n.s. 8 (May 1850), 208.

⁷ J. P., LG, n.s. 8 (May 1850), 212.

⁸ W. P. C., "Our Literature, Present and Prospective," LG, n.s. 6 (May 1848), 246.

⁹ Harriet Beecher Stowe, "What Shall the Girls Read?" NDM, Aug. 1870, 40.

¹⁰ "Book Reviews," CMNR, 1 (May 1872), 475.

¹¹ Bystander, 2 (Jan. 1881), 47-50.

¹² "Current Literature," RBCM, 6 (Jan. 1881), 98.

¹³ Bystander, May 1890, 269.

¹⁴ See Carl Berger, The Writing of Canadian History (Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1976), p. 2; Lorne Pierce, Outline of Canadian Literature (Toronto: Ryerson, 1927), p. 237.

¹⁵ "The Literature of a New Country," Monthly Review, 1 (Jan. 1841), 59-60.

¹⁶ "The Literature of a New Country," 59-61.

¹⁷ Catharine Parr Traill, "Forest Gleanings. No. 12. A Walk to Railway Point," AAM, 3 (Oct. 1853), 401.

¹⁸ "Canadian Poetry and Poets," BAM, 1 (Aug. 1863), 417.

¹⁹ John E. Logan ("Barry Dane"), "National Literature," The Week, 1 (21 Aug. 1884), 600-01.

²⁰ J. G. Bourinot, "Review of Literature, Science and Art," DAR, 1879, p. 266.

²¹ Daniel Wilson, "Toronto of Old," CMNR, 4 (Aug. 1874), 89.

²² Agnes Maule Machar ("Fidelis"), "An Old Canadian Town," CMNR, 4 (July 1874), 1.

²³ M. J. Griffin, "The Romance of the Wilderness Missions. A Chapter of our Early History," CMNR, 1 (April 1872), 344.

²⁴ "Literary Notes," CMNR, 3 (Feb. 1873), 176.

²⁵ J. G. Bourinot, "Canadian Materials for History, Poetry and Romance," NDM, 7 (April 1871), 193.

²⁶ M. W., "The Gibbet Tree," LG, n.s. 2 (Feb. 1844), 69.

²⁷ H. T. Devon, "Leaves from the Life Romance of Merne Dillamer," BAM, 2 (Dec. 1863), 140.

²⁸ Devon, BAM, 2 (Dec. 1863), 142.

²⁹ Devon, BAM, 2 (Feb. 1864), 416-17.

³⁰ AAM, 7 (July 1855), 49.

³¹ "The Editor's Address to the Public," Canadian Literary Magazine, 1 (April 1833), 1-2.

³² "Editorial," Maple Leaf, 3 (July 1853), 31.

- 33 "Editor's Table," Victoria Magazine, 1 (Sept. 1847), 24.
- 34 "Our Table," LG, 4 (Sept. 1842), 482.
- 35 John Richardson, Petition to Baron Sydenham, n.d., arrd.
20 July 1841. Papers of the Governor General's Secretary, vol. 4,
PAC.
- 36 Stewart's, 1 (1867), 77.
- 37 W. A. Foster, "Canada First; or, Our New Nationality;
An Address" (Toronto: Adam Stevenson, 1871), p. 5.
- 38 RBCM, 8 (Feb. 1882), 155.
- 39 "Book Notices," Canadian Methodist Magazine, 19 (April
1884), 381-82.
- 40 W. H. W., "The Red River Settlement," NDM, 2 (May 1868),
99-101; Rev. T. Webster, "Early Scenes in Canadian Life," NDM,
2 (Aug.-Sept. 1868).
- 41 "Literary Notes," CMNR, 3 (Feb. 1873), 176.
- 42 For a bibliography (not always accurate) of Bourinot's
writing, see Royal Society of Canada, Proceedings and Transactions,
12 (1894), pp. 16-18. For a bibliography of LeMoine, see Raoul
Renault, Bibliographie de Sir James M. LeMoine (Quebec: Leger
Brousseau, 1897).
- 43 LeMoine, "François de Bienville," Stewart's, 2 (Oct. 1871),
325.
- 44 LeMoine, Stewart's, 2 (Oct. 1871), 326.
- 45 LeMoine, "The Heroine of Verchères," Stewart's, 3 (April
1869), 85.
- 46 "Book Reviews," CMNR, 10 (Nov. 1876), 453-54.
- 47 J. G. Bourinot, The Intellectual Development of the Canadian
People (Toronto: Hunter Rose, 1881), pp. 110-11.
- 48 Royal Society of Canada, Proceedings and Transactions,
ser. 3, 6 (1912), p. vi.
- 49 J. G. Bourinot, "Gentlemen Adventurers and Coureurs de Bois,"
BMM, 1 (April 1877), 637.

50 J. G. Bourinot, "Canadian Materials for History, Poetry and Romance," NDM, 7 (April 1871), 193.

51 Bourinot, NDM, 7 (April 1871), 199-200.

52 J. G. Bourinot, Our Intellectual Strength and Weakness (Montreal: Foster Brown, 1893), pp. 27-29.

53 John Talon-Lesparance, "A Missisquoi Holiday," DI, 1 (7 July 1888), 10.

54 "Current Items," Canadiana, 1 (Oct. 1889), 159.

55 W. D. Lighthall, "John Talon-L'Esperance," DI, 6 (21 Mar. 1891), 267.

56 "Review of Science, Literature and Art," DAR, 1880-81, p. 282.

57 Sara Jeannette Duncan, "Saunterings," The Week, 4 (13 Jan. 1887), 111-12.

58 Adam and Wetherald, An Algonquin Maiden. A Romance of the Early Days of Upper Canada (Montreal: Lovell; Toronto: Williamson, 1887), p. 9. All further quotations are taken from this edition, and are identified by page number.

59 William Dunlop, Statistical Sketches of Upper Canada for the Use of Emigrants (London: John Murray, 1832), p. 10.

60 In their imaginative literature, Victorian Canadian writers freely appropriated the Indian to their romantic vision. On the simplest level, Indians were depicted as either ferocious barbarians or noble savages, depending upon the author's personal orientation and the needs of his plot. Some of John Richardson's Indians are idealized primitives, but most are gruesomely blood-thirsty. Contributors to the Literary Garland usually eulogized the country's indigenous people as "nature's noblemen" and "children of nature." Frequently both views occur within the same book: in Catharine Parr Traill's Canadian Crusoes (1850), for example, Indiana, the good little Indian girl, is a forerunner of the "Algonquin Maiden." Her ruthless pursuers, however, fit the stereotypes used by Richardson. More subtle are stories and poems which attempt to take into account the effect upon the Indian of contact with the white man. The Literary Garland contains many sentimental tributes to the fading grandeur of a "fated race," necessarily giving way to European progress and civilization, and Douglas Huyghue's Argimou (1847) opens with an impressive mea culpa blaming the white man for destroying a civilization ideally

adapted to its environment. An especially sensitive and sophisticated treatment of Indian/White relations occurs in Duncan Campbell Scott's Indian poems, which receive considerable attention in D. G. Jones's Butterfly on Rock. John Moss discusses Richardson's Indians in Patterns of Isolation, and recently several individual poems about Indians have been analyzed in critical articles. However, most research on the role of the Indian in Canadian literature has been confined to Masters' and Doctoral theses, and a full-length study of the Indian in nineteenth-century poetry and fiction has not yet appeared in print. Among other things, such a study would look at the prominent figure of Tecumseh, the threat of miscegenation in Richardson's Wau-Nan-Gee (1852) and Andrew Learmont Spedon's "Maggie Lee" (1861), W. D. Light-hall's idealization of Indian life before the coming of the white man in The Master of Life (1908), and the frequency with which Indian braves and maidens sacrifice their lives to save their white superiors. Wanda, the Algonquin maiden who conveniently drowns herself to save her white sweetheart from disgrace, was certainly not a unique figure in nineteenth-century Canadian literature.

⁶¹ Sara Jeannette Duncan, "Women's World," Globe, 13 Jan. 1887, p. 6.

⁶² Duncan, "Saunterings," The Week, 4 (13 Jan. 1887), 112.

⁶³ Duncan, "Saunterings," The Week, 4 (13 Jan. 1887), 112.

⁶⁴ William Charles McKinnon, St. George; or, The Canadian League (Halifax: Fuller, 1852), p. x.

⁶⁵ This was first published as Twenty Years Ago. A Tale of the Canadian Rebellion. By A Backwoodsman (Toronto: Cleland's, 1858). Watters identifies "A Backwoodsman" as William Dunlop, who used the same pseudonym. In 1889, Sarah Anne Curzon had the work serialized in the Dominion Illustrated, 3-4 (12 Oct. 1889-18 Jan. 1890) under the title "In the Thick of It."

⁶⁶ DI, 4 (19 Oct. 1889), 10.

⁶⁷ DI, 4 (18 Jan. 1890), 42.

⁶⁸ Catherine Parr Traill, Journal, 7 December 1837, Traill Family Papers, Vol. 2, PAC.

⁶⁹ Catharine Parr Traill, "The Volunteer's Bride," Maple Leaf 4 (May 1854), 138.

- 70 Arthur Faverel, "Rosalba," CIN, 1 (19 March 1870), 318.
- 71 Carl Berger, The Sense of Power (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1970), p. 70.
- 72 Agnes Maule Machar ("Fidelis"), For King and Country, CMNR, 5 (March 1874), 197.
- 73 W. H. Withrow, Neville Trueman, The Pioneer Preacher (1880; rpt. Toronto: Briggs, 1900), p. 18.
- 74 Withrow, p. iii.
- 75 Berger, p. 192.
- 76 Wilfred Campbell, A Beautiful Rebel (Toronto: Westminster, 1909), pp. 5-6. All further quotations will be from this edition, and identified by page number.
- 77 Casca, "Emily Montague; or, Quebec A Century Ago," British Canadian Review 1 (Jan. 1863), 87.
- 78 Agatha Armour, Lady Rosamond's Secret. A Romance of Fredericton. (St. John: Telegraph Printing and Publishing Co., 1878), p. 17.
- 79 Armour, pp. 107-08.
- 80 John George Bourinot, The Intellectual Development of the Canadian People (Toronto: Hunter, Rose, 1881), p. 109.

CHAPTER VIII

"THE OLD WORLD OF AMERICA":

FRENCH CANADA IN ENGLISH-CANADIAN FICTION

The contents of pre-Confederation periodicals reveal that Victorian Canada's literary interest in Quebec originated in its taste for romance and the picturesque. During the course of the nineteenth century, this fascination with the romantic aspects of French Canada grew into a sense of identification with Québécois and Acadian culture, folklore and history which helped to enrich English Canada's own relatively barren national image. In the 1860's, as the country moved towards nationhood, French Canada's literary, imaginative and national importance to English Canada increased correspondingly. The significance of Quebec's distinctive history and secure culture to post-Confederation Canada's continual quest for identity was indicated by Ethelwyn Wetherald (co-author of An Algonquin Maiden) in 1888, when she remarked that

In a certain sense Quebec is the Old World of America. Its claims to distinction depend not upon any untrustworthy hopes of future greatness; they rest with a

confidence of assurance upon an unforgettable and richly dowered past. Patriotism may be cherished by the ordinary Canadian as a fit and proper sentiment, but for it to thrill his imagination and touch his heart it is necessary that he should dwell in the Lower Province.

In order to thrill the imagination and touch the hearts of their fellow citizens, English-Canadian writers drew on the "unforgettable and richly dowered past" of Quebec and Acadia with the whole-hearted approval of influential cultural figures like John George Bourinot, J. M. LeMoine, and the editors and reviewers of literary periodicals. Comments made by these individuals concerning Quebec as a source of literary material reveal how thoroughly they shared the assumption that English-Canadian literature should be romantic, and that French Canada could provide that romance. Bourinot summarized the appeal of Quebec's heroic past and associated distinctive characters when he stated that

In the history and traditions of New France, there are many elements calculated to evoke the genius of poetry and romance. If we open the volume of the past, we see the soldier and the priest, the reckless gentleman-adventurer and the preux Chevalier, the Coureur de bois and the voyageur, the Indian warrior and a host of other romantic figures telling a story of achievement and adventure.²

Interested in fostering native "poetry and romance," Canadian periodicals enthusiastically welcomed J. M. LeMoine's seven volumes of Maple Leaves (1863-1906) and other collections of French-Canadian historical and legendary lore. In the words of a reviewer of Chronicles of the Saint Lawrence (1878), LeMoine's

books proved that "The early days of Canada were marked by a web of romance, as delightful in its way, as the legendary things which obtain in old European countries and some places in the distant Orient."³ In 1863, the British American Magazine proclaimed the first volume of Maple Leaves a "godsend" because it filled the void felt by the English-speaking inhabitants of a land without a mythology:

We have, within the limits of British North America, no such strongholds of romance, as Quebec, and its surroundings. Nowhere else are such tragedies native to the scene, as the stories of Chateau Bigot, the Chien D'Or, and the "Iron Cage." . . . And the natural features of that wonderful land and river scenery, which one may take in at a glance from the celebrated citadel that crowns Cape Diamond, harmonizes perfectly with the gleams of tragedy and poetry, which still shoot athwart the waters of the St. Lawrence and the St. Charles.⁴

Later commentaries also illustrate how LeMoine's writings fired the imagination of English Canadians by adding romantic historical associations to the barren North American landscape. Reviewing the fourth series of Maple Leaves (1873), the New Dominion Monthly waxed eloquent about the "phenomena of self-sacrifice and devotion" presented by LeMoine's account of

the missionaries of France, singly or in pairs carrying the doctrines of the Cross through thousands of miles of forest; and the noblest blood of that nation, carrying conquest, with the chivalry of the Crusades, to the Hudson, the Ohio and the Mississippi, the lakes and the icy seas of the north, [who] have sowed the land with facts which cannot be thought upon without exciting an exuberant growth of fancy.⁵

By playing up Quebec's colourful history and idealizing both early and contemporary French-Canadian life, Victorian Canada

fulfilled its own yearning for national romance. Blanche Mac-Donell, author of many romantic stories and novels about Quebec, epitomized this attitude when she excused the lack of early literary activity in New France by explaining that "These people lived poetry and romance, but had no time to write it."⁶ To nineteenth-century English-Canadians, living in a relatively prosaic society preoccupied with material progress, the French Canadians did indeed seem a people gifted with the ability to "live poetry and romance." Old Quebec appeared to present a unified, self-contained world, founded on an heroic past and composed of individuals representing distinct class and social types, secure in their language, religion, history and traditions. As John Talon-Lesperance remarked in 1877, "No country, from its peculiarities, presents a fairer field for fiction than does Lower Canada."⁷

The earliest English-Canadian tales about French Canada bear evidence of greater interest in the romantic settings, characters and folklore associated with Quebec's antiquity and foreignness than in its documented history. In the 1820's, Lower Canada appeared as the home of gothicism and mystery in stories like "The Fairy Harp"⁸ and "Midsummer Eve. A Tale of the Ottawa."⁹ Both by John Howard Willis, these narratives recount experiences with phantoms and the interpenetration of imagination and reality.

Quebec's Catholicism added another dimension to Lower Canada's

appeal by giving English-Canadian writers an opportunity to bring to North America the anti-Catholicism which characterized much European gothicism. In 1824, when Julia Catherine Beckwith Hart included in St. Ursula's Convent a Jesuit priest who conspires to confine a lady in a Quebec convent, the first Canadian novel established a pattern that was to recur occasionally but consistently until about 1875. In a well-documented article on Mrs. Ellen Ross, author of Violet Keith (1868), Jeffrey L. Wollock discusses the role of Montreal in nineteenth-century anti-Catholic literature, and mentions a number of sensational anti-Catholic publications which appeared in the United States, primarily in the 1830's. Of these the most famous and frequently reprinted were Lorette, The history of Louise, daughter of a Canadian nun (1833), the Awful Disclosures, by Maria Monk, of the Hotel Dieu Nunnery of Montreal (1836), and Further Disclosures (1837), all wholly or partially written by George Bourne, an English-born Presbyterian minister who spent some time in Quebec.¹⁰ These scurrilous productions, along with incidents in Canadian fiction like the seduction of the heroine of John Richardson's Westbrook (1851) by a lascivious priest attached to the Montreal convent of Notre Dame, the "damp cell episode" of Violet Keith (1868), and the enforced nunhood of the heroine of "Adrienne Cachelle," a story serialized in the New Dominion Monthly in 1871, all indicate that Quebec's Catholicism provided North American writers

with local equivalents to the dark convents and monasteries of Italy and Spain, in which many of the horrors of European gothic fiction take place.

Contributors to the Literary Garland, however, cared more about the courtly elegance and high adventure they attributed to the history of New France than about fabricating nefarious religious practices. Their polished tales of heroic devotion and sacrifice, set in the early days of Quebec and Acadia, are usually placed within a verifiable historical context but concern affairs of love and honour peripheral to the main historical action. Writers like Mrs. E. L. Cushing and Mrs. H. V. Cheney, who produced tales with descriptive titles such as "A Canadian Legend,"¹¹ "Jacques Cartier and the Little Indian Girl,"¹² and "The Old Manuscript; a Mémoire of the Past,"¹³ viewed their literary creations as something quite distinct from history. As Mrs. Cushing indicated, her role was not to write history, but to embellish it by expanding upon the "numerous affecting incidents, that developed the character of individuals, and which lent . . . a tinge of romantic interest, that sheds a mellow lustre over the dry and scanty detail of the historian."¹⁴

In the early 1860's, when James MacPherson LeMoine and Francis Parkman published the first volumes of their expansive works relating to Canadian history, English-speaking Canadians awoke en masse to the fact that their past -- or at least Quebec's -- was anything but "dry and scanty." In 1863, LeMoine gathered

his scattered magazine articles into the first volume of Maple Leaves, subtitled "a Budget of Legendary, Historical, Critical and Sporting Intelligence." This collection of assorted facts and observations, "many written offhand from self-memory of persons or events, and others with more research into the records of the past, or reminiscences of the living,"¹⁵ focussed on social, cultural, literary, folkloric and historical aspects of Quebec, and immediately captured the attention of English Canada. When Parkman published the first volume of his France and England in North America in 1865, his style of narrative history, which emphasized the dramatic and heroic side of French Canada's past despite his disapproval of New France's political structure, further encouraged English Canada to adopt and romanticize Quebec's history. Indeed, Parkman almost single-handedly determined the direction of Canadian historiography and historical fiction for the last three decades of the nineteenth century.¹⁶ The Dominion Annual Register's "Review of Literature, Science and Art" for 1880-81 spoke for that era as a whole when it remarked that

The chief interest in Canadian history, it is almost trite now to say, has hitherto centred in the French régime, the heroic incidents of which Mr. Francis Parkman has anticipated Canadian writers in depicting, though his charming narratives . . . reconcile us to the thought that the period has found its first and best historian in an American.¹⁷

Parkman's organized historical research and LeMoine's more random but equally engaging tidbits together inspired a literary interest

in historical and contemporary Quebec that was to thrive into the twentieth century. Foremost among its consequences was the writing of William Kirby's The Golden Dog (1877), the book revered in Canada in the 1880's and 1890's as "our finest novel."¹⁸

The Golden Dog was inspired by LeMoine and approved by Parkman. In a letter written to LeMoine in 1877, after his book finally appeared in print, Kirby described its conception:

In 1865 I think, I was in attendance at Parliament in Quebec -- lobbying a bill -- in fact -- when your excellent "Maple Leaves" came into my hands. I read it with great interest, and sitting with Sulte one day in the window of the St. Louis Hotel, I read portions of it to him remarking that here was the finest subject for a romance that I knew of. We talked much of Chateau Bigot, and the Chien d'or. I wanted Sulte, as a clever French Canadian, to write the story, and finally half in jest, half in earnest threatened him that if he would not write the story of Chien d'or I would! That was the beginning of it. The planting of this grain of mustard seed that has grown into the big tree full of leaves -- or rather book full of leaves, that you see.¹⁹

LeMoine in turn declared, "I have no hesitation in predicting to your book a great -- a very great success, and I would feel very proud of it, had I written it."²⁰ LeMoine's consequent nomination of Kirby to an honorary membership in the Literary and Historical Society of Quebec pleased Kirby immensely, satisfying his craving for the approval of French Canada. "I know that the best judges of the Chien d'or, are my readers in the city of Quebec," he wrote, "and I feel, I confess, greater pleasure in their commendations than in any others."²¹

William Kirby, his friends and his reviewers generally concurred regarding The Golden Dog's didactic, nationalistic and literary value. The Toronto Mail found that the book "gives good insight into the manners and society of that period," and that it "will be considered to be not without its use as a historical study."²² In a more lengthy review, the Canadian Monthly wholeheartedly endorsed Kirby's version of the last days of French rule in New France, finding his novel informative as well as entertaining:

This admirable historical fiction deserves the warmest commendation, not merely for its lucid and flowing style, and the artistic construction of its plot, but especially for the light it throws on the institutions of the old French regime and the real causes of the collapse of Bourbon power in the Dominion. . . . the natural fruit of a vicious system began to appear the moment France neglected her colony and bad men assumed the reins of power.²³

It accepted Kirby's excuse that he "had to perpetrate an anachronism or two to make the ends of it tie together"²⁴ since "the slight liberties taken with received accounts not only do not mar the story but were absolutely necessary to ensure the unities of time and action and give completeness to the plot." In fact, the Monthly found that "As compared with Scott, [Kirby] is accuracy itself." Moreover Kirby's contribution to the development of a national literature overrode any minor objections, and the Monthly concluded that "as a whole, the work deserves to be attentively read by all who relish an interesting book, but more especially by those who love Canada and her traditions, and desire to foster

and encourage native literature."²⁵ The French press also responded enthusiastically. In La Revue Canadienne, P. N. was impressed by Kirby's historical research,²⁶ and in L'Opinion Publique Kirby's friend, Benjamin Sulte, proclaimed:

Saluons un Anglais qui a étudié l'histoire de la Nouvelle-France.

Saluons l'un des meilleurs romans canadiens qui aient été écrits en langue anglaise.²⁷

Kirby's correspondence with LeMoine reveals his concern with historical accuracy and his desire for authoritative approval. That Kirby found his major difficulty in writing The Golden Dog to be the satisfactory union of romance and history appears in a letter regarding his references to the Ursuline convent. Kirby told LeMoine,

Should the volume fall under the eyes of your worthy brother, (I believe) the Chaplain of the Ursulines who wrote their history, I trust he will not find a word to disapprove of in my references to the Religieuses of 130 years ago.

The romance of New France permeates the old convent through and through. Its traditions are so intermingled with the early history of the Colony that a work like mine would be sadly incomplete as a picture of the times without reference to them.²⁸

The "romance of New France" rather than its history was, however, Kirby's first concern. Although he consulted LeMoine regarding historical details, Kirby remained fully aware that he was not writing history. In 1904 Kirby defined his own approach to his book when he informed John A. Cooper, editor of the Canadian Magazine, that "Historical inaccuracies may be discovered in the history of the Chien d'or but this book is not a history -- but

a romance -- and must be judged by the higher laws of poetic and dramatic fiction than by the dry rule & figures work of history."²⁹ Moreover, he reminded Cooper that "the MS was read by the late Francis Parkman at the request of the Lovells -- and by him strongly recommended for publication. His imprimatur has always been a pleasing recollection."³⁰ Indeed, Kirby regarded history as the common property of the literary world, and he jumped to LeMoine's defence when the latter was accused of plagiarism in his Chronicles of the St. Lawrence (1878):

Plagiarism indeed! as if historical facts legends and traditions were not the stuff, the raw material out of which every writer who is worth reading does not exercise his genius in forming them into works of art and things of beauty -- if he can! We take things that are basic matter -- common property -- like un-appointed land, and by our work give them value, beauty, life and they become a right & an inheritance. As well dispute Shakespeare a title to his plays because they are a new fusion of old stories refined & recast in his immortal mind!³¹

It was Kirby's recasting of Canadian history that won him the praise of Benjamin Sulte, his personal friend and later his associate in the Royal Society. Sulte valued The Golden Dog precisely because it was not history, and would therefore reach and educate a much larger audience:

Mr. Parkman, que les lecteurs anglais admirent avec raison, n'a pourtant rien fait que de coucher dans la langue qu'il parle des pages bien connues de l'Histoire du Canada, mais connues des Canadiens-français seulement. En exploitant le même mine, vous aurez comme lui la vogue and le charme de la nouveauté. De plus, la parti de vos récits qui ressort de l'imagination pure et simple contribuera à populariser le Chien d'or, -- ceci n'arrivera

pas pour Mr. Parkman, car du moment que l'on traite l'histoire pour l'histoire on ne se fait connaître que d'une classe de la société.³²

As an historical novelist Kirby, in Sulte's view, belonged to distinguished company. Although Lorne Pierce was to complain in 1929 that "Kirby had studied the novel as developed by Scott and Dumas père and applied the rules of these craftsmen with little originality,"³³ Sulte praised Kirby's resemblance to Scott, Cooper and Dumas:

L'avantage du roman sur les autres genres est très visible. Quant à la renommée littéraire qui en déroule, je pense qu'on peut être content de se nommer Walter Scott, Fenimore Cooper, ou Alexandre Dumas. Dans notre pays, cette place est à prendre, et laissez-moi vous dire que vous semblez le comprendre parfaitement.³⁴

In addition to its value in teaching history to the Canadian public and developing national romance, Sulte believed that The Golden Dog would help unite English and French Canada. In January, 1878 he wrote to Kirby:

Le Chien D'Or fera connaître le vieux Canada français à ceux qui le liront. Les préjugés tomberont comme magie devant vos descriptions de moeurs et vos peintures d'histoire. Chacun de vos lecteurs devient un ami des Canadiens-français. Je ne sais si Parkman peut en dire autant de lui-même -- en tout cas, vous et lui, vous avez ouvert une voie qui amènera loin les esprits des lecteurs des deux côtés de la 45° -- et en Angleterre.³⁵

Sulte's remarks indicate that Kirby shared his opinion concerning the power of historical romance to promote national unity and reduce prejudice. In July, 1878 Sulte reminded Kirby, "Il y a longtemps que vous m'écrivez: 'La connaissance de l'histoire du Canada, fera tomber les préjugés, unifiera nos deux races: car elles se

rendront justice et s'estimeront."³⁶

The Golden Dog may not have fulfilled its national purpose of unifying French and English Canada, but it certainly did succeed in crystallizing English Canada's formulation of the myth of Quebec. In his "Conclusion" to the Literary History of Canada, Northrop Frye identifies English Canada's literary fascination with French Canada with the pastoral tradition. According to Frye,

At the heart of all social mythology lies what may be called, because it is usually called, a pastoral myth, the vision of a social ideal. The pastoral in its most common form is associated with childhood, or with some earlier social condition -- pioneer life, the small town, the habitant rooted to his land -- that can be identified with childhood. The nostalgia for a world of peace and protection, with a spontaneous response to the nature around it, with a leisure and composure not to be found today, is particularly strong in Canada.³⁷

In nineteenth-century Canada, this myth frequently took the form of

the evocation of an earlier period of history which is made romantic by having a more uninhibited expression of passion or virtue or courage attached to it. This of course links the pastoral myth with the vision of vanished grandeur that comes into the novels about the ancien régime.³⁸

The wholehearted participation in this myth on the part of The Golden Dog's contemporary critics and reviewers appears in their warm praise for the book's portrayal of New France. Indeed, their reiterated commendation of Kirby's "realism" indicates how fully his romance satisfied the preconceptions of English

Canadians regarding historic Quebec. Before he had read more than the first few chapters, LeMoine wrote to Kirby, "Your characters of Angélique des Meloises, Bigot, the Travelling Notary, are splendidly drawn: if the rest is of that calibre, you may indeed congratulate yourself as having produced a durable record & one sufficient to hand down your name."³⁹ The Canadian Monthly also found Kirby's characters and settings fully credible, observing that "The sketches of manners and institutions under the old régime are exceedingly well wrought in."⁴⁰ W. D. Lighthall likewise enjoyed The Golden Dog's presentation of "pictures of that picturesque epoch which are rich in their fulness of historic detail."⁴¹ And Benjamin Sulte indicated that the book also satisfied French Canada's vision of its romantic past when he said of Kirby in L'Opinion Publique:

Ses personnages vivent de la vie historique. Il les prend où il les trouve, tels qu'ils sont, avec les traits qui nous en ont été transmis. Ses dialogues roulent sur des sujets d'actualité au moment même où parlent les acteurs. La couleur locale est complète et le tableau ne laisse rien à désirer.⁴²

Although Kirby conceived of The Golden Dog as tragedy, the book is pastoral in Frye's sense for the way it depicts the self-destruction of a once ideal feudal society, whose noble principles and personages are brought down by the serpent of corruption and self-interest. Underlying the story of the Philiberts, the Repentignys, Bigot, Angélique des Meloises and La Corriveau is the archetypal conflict between good and evil, figured forth in

human terms. In Kirby's fictional world, absolute good (*Amélie de Repentigny* and *Bourgeois Philibert*) and absolute evil (*La Corriveau*) are clearly identified. Through the gradual corruption of *Bigot* and *Angélique*, who infect the wavering and destroy the virtuous, New France yields to the ascendancy of evil with all the inevitability of preordained action contained in "received traditions."⁴³ Occasional, apparently casual references to Eden and Adam and Eve, uttered by Peter Kalm (p. 1), Pothier and Philibert (pp. 48-49), *Le Gardeur* (p. 161), the peasants (pp. 280-81) and the author (pp. 79, 476) reinforce the book's mythic structure as a New World version of the first fall.

In his concluding paragraph, Kirby summarizes both the moral and the imaginative relationship between his fictional romance based on history and the real world. He gives his tale a fable quality, for

It ends in all sadness, as most true tales of this world do! There is in it neither poetic nor human justice. Fain would we have had it otherwise, for the heart longs for happiness as the eye for light! But truth is stronger as well as stranger than fiction (p. 678).

Kirby's assertion that his book illustrates the absence of poetic or human justice in a fallen world disturbed the Canadian Monthly's reviewer enough for him to carry the story beyond Kirby's conclusion, and include in his review details concerning the ultimate fate of "*Bigot* and his vile crew . . . for it is eminently satisfactory to one's sense of justice."⁴⁴ But Kirby himself was more concerned with the imaginative relationship between old

Quebec and the present than with proving moral absolutes. The sentence that begins "But truth is stronger as well as stranger than fiction . . ." continues

. . . and while the tablet of the Chien d'Or overlooks the Rue Buade; while the lamp of Repentigny burns in the ancient chapel of the Ursulines; while the ruins of Beaumanoir cover the dust of Caroline de St. Castin; and Amélie sleeps her long sleep by the side of Héloïse de Lotbinière, this writer has neither courage nor power to deviate from the received traditions in relating the story of the Golden Dog. (p. 678)

In the repeated "while"'s, which emphasize the continuity of the past into the present, stressing the relics and "received traditions" from the past which shape the present, Kirby reveals the way he and his compatriots looked back to old Quebec for the "vision of vanished grandeur" required to complete the social mythology of English Canada.

Kirby's writing of The Golden Dog was overtly motivated by his Tory nostalgia for an irretrievable, idyllic Royalist past, which he located in the early days of New France. His description of May-day celebrations on the estate of Lady de Tilly, one of the last representatives of the old ideal feudal aristocracy, is interrupted by the authorial reflection that "The revels of May in New France, the king and queen of St. Philip, the rejoicings of a frank, loyal peasantry -- illiterate in books but not unlearned in the art of life -- have wholly disappeared before the levelling spirit of the nineteenth century" (p. 284). Similar observations obtrude throughout the book, confirming Kirby's

equation of feudal New France, before it suffered the depredations of the dissolute Bourbon monarchy, with a lost Eden. Although the corruption of Bigot's administration -- which was responsible for the loss of this paradise -- excited Kirby's moral indignation, its luxury and debauchery also excited his literary imagination. His elaborate descriptions of the furnishings of Caroline de St. Castin's secret apartment, where "Nothing that luxury could desire, or art furnish, had been spared in its adornment" (p. 67), of Angélique's boudoir as a "nest of luxury and elegance" (p. 155), and of Bigot's revelries which "defied the very order of nature by [their] audacious disregard of all decency of time, place and circumstance" (p. 51) reveal the perverse attraction exercised by Gallic decadence on the upright Upper Canadian Tory mind.

In addition to portraying pre-Conquest Quebec as the scene of sexual and moral corruption, Kirby exploited its gothic potential. The combined attraction to manifest evil and repulsion from it that constitute the "gothic shudder" inspired Kirby to make the legendary poisoner, La Corriveau, one of the main actors in his tale. Parallel to the way Bigot's administration infects the New World with the depravity of the Old, La Corriveau preserves and cherishes horrible secrets and poisonous knowledge inherited from Renaissance France and Italy. Kirby describes La Corriveau's murder of Caroline de St. Castin in language that shows he has deliberately transferred to Quebec the archetypal gothic situation of the innocent maiden pursued by the forces of evil. Before

La Corriveau can kill Caroline, she must pass through a door
that is

the dividing of light from darkness, of good from evil,
of innocence from guilt. On one side of it, in a chamber
of light, sat a fair girl, confiding, generous, and
deceived only through her excess of every virtue; on
the other, wickedness, fell and artful, was approaching
with stealthy footsteps through an unseen way. (p. 479).

The agent of "wickedness, fell and artful," La Corriveau performs on a functional level by expediting Kirby's plot. On a structural level she unifies several of the French-Canadian legends popularized by LeMoine, and on an imaginative level she personifies unregenerate evil.

Some of the best writing in The Golden Dog occurs in its account of the history and activities of La Corriveau, and Kirby's own obvious fascination with the darker traditions of French Canada helped consolidate English Canada's sense that Quebec folk culture was largely gothic.⁴⁵ At the same time, Kirby drew on less sinister aspects of the romantic tradition. He treated folklore sentimentally when he adapted LeMoine's account of "The Grave of Cadieux"⁴⁶ to provide Amélie de Repentigny with a song "of wonderful pathos and beauty" which

had just been brought down from the wilds of the Ottawa, and become universally sung in New France. A voyageur flying from a band of Iroquois, had found a hiding place on a rocky outlet in the middle of the Sept Chûtes. He concealed himself from his foes, but could not escape, and in the end died of starvation and sleeplessness. The dying man peeled off the white bark of the birch, and with the juice of berries, wrote upon it his death song, which was found long after by the side of his remains. His grave is now a marked spot on the Ottawa. (p. 271).

Equally sentimental, and pastoral in the common sense of the word, is Kirby's portrait of the Québécois habitants.

Kirby's depiction of a humble, happy peasantry perpetuated a view of Quebec already present in the first native English-Canadian novel. In St. Ursula's Convent, Hart's characters describe the habitants as an "honest, peaceful contented people," whose filial dependence upon their Seigneur recalls "the golden ages."⁴⁷ Kirby expands upon this image, emphasizing the innocence and simplicity which allow the Quebec rustics to endure and prosper, untouched by the corruption of the governing classes despite their knowledge of Bigot's depravity. In their devotion to God and King, their perpetuation of a folk culture inherited from the old country, their lack of material ambition and their acknowledgment of their place in the world, Kirby's habitants incarnate the purity of a pastoral feudal society. The difference between their innate wholesomeness and the debauchery of their rulers figures forth in the kinds of music preferred by the two classes. According to Kirby,

The popular songs of the French Canadians are simple, almost infantine in their language, and as chaste in expression as the hymns of other countries. Impure songs originate in classes who know better, and revel from choice in musical slang and indecency. (p. 260).

By portraying a colourful, contented peasantry, by presenting contrasting extremes of chivalry, luxury, debauchery and religious devotion, and by bringing to life both legendary and documented history, The Golden Dog substantiated a view of French Canada

which provided English Canada with a social mythology capable of inspiring a national literature.

Most of William Kirby's fellow romancers who wrote about Quebec developed the province's local and historical colour without penetrating the mythic realms touched by Kirby's comprehensive, if at times clumsy, fictional narrative. The novel most frequently linked with Kirby's as evidence of English Canada's growing literary powers was John Talon-Lesperance's The Bastonnais (1877), published in the same year as The Golden Dog. In 1890 "Mabel," a contributor to Canadiana, declared that the two historical romances "are not surpassed by the littérateurs of any other country or language. To such examples of literary art a Canadian may point with pride as evidence of the high rank of English Canadian literature."⁴⁸ Both the Canadian Monthly and Belford's enthusiastically welcomed The Bastonnais, complimenting Lesperance for "constructing an interesting historical tale, in which the facts of history are handled with scrupulous reverence."⁴⁹ Indeed, Lesperance's reverence for history is somewhat too scrupulous, for he continually interrupts his "Tale of the American Invasion of Canada in 1775-76" with detailed references to "the researches we have made."⁵⁰ Throughout the book Lesperance the historian battles for supremacy with Lesperance the romancer, as the author digresses from the complicated love story which forms the centre of his plot to resurrect the forgotten heroism of Joseph Bouchette (p. 201), to justify the defence preparations of Lieutenant-Governor

Cramahé (pp. 91-92) and to quote an observer of the death of Montgomery (p. 274).

More interesting than Lesperance's use of history is his use of certain stereotyped characters and plot structures which recur frequently in nineteenth-century Canadian fiction. His plot concerns the amorous entanglements of two French-Canadian women with two English-speaking men, one American, one of British birth. Roderick Hardinge, born in Scotland but raised in Murray Bay, combines within him all the attributes of Canada's multiple heritages. In addition to being fluently bilingual,

Roderick Hardinge was tall, robust, athletic and active. He was very fond of field sports. He had made many a tramp on snow-shoes with the coureurs de bois far into the heart of the wilderness. He had often wandered for months with some of the young Hurons of Lorette in quest of the deer and the bison. He was a magnificent horseman. (p. 85).

The American counterpart to this magnificent specimen of Canadian manhood is Cary Singleton, an equally valiant, honourable, bilingual officer, descended from "a good stock, Maryland on the side of his father, Virginia on that of his mother" (p. 137). Together these two romantic heroes vie for the affections of two belles Québécoises: Pauline Belmont, "the true type of the loveable woman" (p. 88), and exotic Zulma Sarpy, educated in France, "fair as a filament of summer gorse, and statuesque in all her poses" (p. 96). The complicated amours of this quartet are saved from utter banality because the four represent conflicting political and cultural allegiances. Despite their superficial differences

of nationality and cultural origin, all four respect the same code of love and honour. Hence it becomes rather easy to interpret the eventual marriages of Roderick and Zulma, and of Pauline and Cary as an allegory of the union of English and French, and Canadian and American interests in North America. Lesperance himself appears to sanction such a reading in his very last paragraph, in which the narrator encounters a young lady who turns out to be the grand-daughter of the four characters. When "at last, the blood of all the lovers had mingled together in one" (p. 359), amorous complications are resolved and continental peace and unity assured.

The separation of lovers by political discord is, of course, one of the stock ingredients of romantic comedy. But in Canadian fiction like The Bastonnais this situation frequently acquires overtones of national allegory when a French-Canadian maiden is wooed and won by an English-Canadian suitor. Love triumphs and resolves national disputes when the French-Canadian heroine of "Rosalba; or, Faithful to Two Lovers"⁵¹ eventually marries her English-Canadian sweetheart, after the trauma of the 1837 rebellion. However, not just an Anglophone will do, as Mrs. Leprohon's Antoinette de Mirecourt discovers. In her 1864 sentimental novel set in post-Conquest Quebec, Leprohon first allows her French-Canadian heroine to make the mistake of marrying the wrong Englishman, the violent, fortune-hunting Audley Sternfield, before finally settling down with the romantic wanderer, Captain Evelyn. Although

Antoinette's father would prefer her to espouse her Québécois childhood companion, Louis Beauchesne, Leprohon conveniently disposes of both that option and the villainous Sternfield by having Beauchesne shoot Sternfield, freeing Antoinette from her odious secret marriage. Unlike most subsequent English-Canadian fiction set in historic Quebec, Antoinette de Mirecourt evinces little interest in documented history, pageantry, local colour, or legendary events and personages. Instead Mrs. Leprohon uses the social and moral complications presented by the sudden influx of British officers into Montreal high society just after the Seven Years' War to preach a message of emotional honesty and filial obedience.

In Mrs. Leprohon's mind, there appears to have been no doubt that Antoinette, daughter of a defeated nation, should marry one of her conquerors. This point of view was not shared by her French-Canadian counterpart, Philippe Aubert de Gaspé. In Les Anciens Canadiens (1862), a novel about the conquest of Quebec closely modelled on Sir Walter Scott, de Gaspé carefully develops a refined romance between Blanche D'Haberville, daughter of a seigneurial Quebec family, and Archibald Cameron of Lochiell, a Jacobite exile who has sought refuge in Quebec. When the Seven Years' War breaks out, Cameron joins a Highland regiment and is ordered to burn down the Manoir D'Haberville. After the war, he makes his peace with the Habervilles and asks Blanche to marry him. Although she makes no secret of her love for

"Arché," Blanche refuses, declaring

Il est naturel, il est même à souhaiter que les races française et anglo-saxonne, ayant maintenant une même patrie, vivant sous les mêmes lois, après des haines, après des luttes seculaires, se rapprochent par des alliances intimes; mais il serait indigne de moi d'en donner l'exemple après tant de désastres; on croirait, comme je l'ai dit à Arché, que le fier Breton, après avoir vaincu et ruiné le père, a acheté avec son or la pauvre fille canadienne, trop heureuse de se donner à ce prix. Oh! jamais! jamais!⁵²

Blanche will allow her brother to marry "une Anglaise," but for her to marry her conqueror would be unpatriotic capitulation. By accepting marriage between a Francophone man and an Anglo-phone woman, but rejecting the converse, de Gaspé reinforces the conjecture that the frequency of marriages between belles Québécoises and stalwart Englishmen in nineteenth-century English-Canadian fiction originated in part in English Canada's political supremacy. Since such a marriage would mean the absorption of the weaker, female partner into the dominant culture of the male, it would suggest an obvious analogy between sexual submission and political submission. If the Revue Canadienne's comments on Antoinette de Mirecourt represent Quebec opinion in general, French-Canadian critics appear to have been very sensitive to the implications of such intermarriages. E. Lef. de Bellefeuille praised Leprohon's book extravagantly, but took exception to its ending:

Si je devais trouver un défaut dans le livre de Mme. Leprohon, ce serait peut-être d'avoir fait marier successivement son heroine, sa belle Antoinette, avec deux officiers anglais. . . . Je pense bien que l'auteur n'a pas voulu le proposer en cela comme un modèle à nos jeunes Canadiennes, mais la peinture d'un boneur fictif

peut quelquefois vivement séduire un jeune coeur nourri d'idéal loin de la trompeuse réalité. . . . Il est vrai que le Col. Evelyn, le second mari d'Antoinette, était catholique; c'est quelque chose, mais ce n'est pas tout ce que je désire voir dans l'époux d'une de mes jeunes compatriotes: il n'était pas Canadien.⁵³

In the slick historical fiction of Charles G. D. Roberts, however, love between two members of opposing political forces relates less to national allegory than to the predictable plot formulas of popular turn-of-the-century historical romance. While Upper Canadians and Anglophone Quebeckers interested in French Canada followed Parkman and turned to historic Quebec, Maritimers followed Longfellow (who had himself been inspired by Haliburton⁵⁴) and turned to Acadia. In 1877, the Canadian Monthly ironically summarized Canada's debt to these two American writers when it remarked that "Mr. Parkman is our best chronicler, and Mr. Longfellow, in his *Evangeline*, our national poet."⁵⁵ Early in his literary career, Roberts paid homage to Longfellow, whose

handling of the Acadian story has simply glorified the theme for later singers. Every dike and ancient rampart, and surviving Acadian name, and little rock-rimmed haven, from the wind-rippled shifting sepulchre of Sable Island to the sunny levels of Chignecto, should be breeding ground for poem and history and romance.⁵⁶

Roberts's adulation of Longfellow was shared by Canadians at large, with the exception of Goldwin Smith who protested in the Bystander that

The false and calumnious version of [the expulsion of the Acadians] has been made popular by the barley-sugar composition which is styled the poetry of Longfellow.

Perhaps the moralists will some day give us, for the benefit of history, their opinion as to the proper limits of lying in verse.⁵⁷

Goldwin Smith notwithstanding, the romance of Acadia captured the attention of Maritimers interested in exploring their own counterpart to the romance of Quebec.

When Roberts published his Acadian stories in the late 1890's and early 1900's, he was working within a tradition already established by a number of earlier Maritime writers. Long before Kirby incorporated into The Golden Dog legendary material concerning the daughter of Baron de Saint-Castin and his Abenaki wife, two Nova Scotians had produced fictionalized accounts of the prolific Baron's half-Indian progeny. Douglas Huyghue's Argimou (1847), published the same year as Longfellow's Evangeline, elegizes the decline of the once-noble "aborigines of America" as it describes the love and trials of Argimou, Grand Sachem of the Micmac nation, and his "fawn-like" Waswetchcul, Saint-Castin's daughter, whose racial background is visible in her complexion, "exceedingly clear and almost as light as a European's."⁵⁸ Although the action of Huyghue's tale concerns the English conquest of Fort Beauséjour in 1755, his main romantic interest, expressed in his opening address to his readers, lay in lamenting the white man's destruction of the North American Indians. In St. Castine: A Legend of Cape Breton (1850), William Charles McKinnon also contrasted "the degenerate Micmac of to-day" with their forefathers, "Haughty as the knights of old, and easily affronted."⁵⁹ As in his other

novels,⁶⁰ however, McKinnon cared primarily about developing an inordinately complicated intrigue. This he accomplished by giving Saint-Castin two sons -- one half-Indian, who succeeds him as war chief of the Abenaki, the other all French but raised in England and serving under Wolfe. The two meet at the battle of Louisbourg, first as enemies, then as allies when the Abenaki St. Castine, previously allied with the French, decides to support Britain. McKinnon's pro-British stance renders his book less an attempt to understand history than an extravagantly plotted compliment to General Wolfe, set against the colourful background of the siege of Louisbourg.

Unlike much of the historical fiction about Quebec, fiction about Acadia demonstrates little concern with reconstructing the past through references to documented history. Instead, Maritimers drew upon their French-Canadian past mainly as a convenient source of local colour and ready sentimentality. James De Mille's The Lily and the Cross (1875) uses Louisbourg merely to provide an exciting Canadian background to a complex tale of intrigue and revenge which begins and ends in France, and involves only French characters. Charles G. D. Roberts's historical tales also exploit the sentimental associations surrounding the expulsion of the Acadians without attempting any deep understanding of or faithfulness to history.

Written primarily after Roberts left Canada for New York, and published by Boston and New York firms, Roberts' historical

tales specifically cater to the international taste for swash-buckling romance, supplying a market for French-Canadian historical material already established in the United States by Mary Hartwell Catherwood in the late 1880's and 1890's. To conform to popular romantic standards, Roberts populated the land of Evangeline with humble Acadian peasants, bloodthirsty Indians under the leadership of the vicious Black Abbé, a demented prophet who wanders through several of the books chanting, "Woe, woe to Acadie the fair," and various pairs of lovers for whom historical discord provides barriers to be overcome by love. Roberts generally supports the British, but by making Abbé Le Loutre the villainous instigator of Acadian resistance, he also generates sympathy for the simple Acadians, depicting them as the bewildered victims of "the romantic period in Canadian history when the French were making their last struggle to retain their hold upon the peninsula of Acadie."⁶¹

Even today Roberts's literary skill distinguishes his light historical romances from the hack work of writers like Robert Barr, and at the turn of the century he helped to establish an international image of Canadian literature which accorded with the standards set by Goldwin Smith. The New York World's reviewer enjoyed The Prisoner of Mademoiselle (1904), a fast-paced tale of love and pursuit, appreciating it as a particularly Canadian book:

It possesses a peculiar attraction which we recognize in almost all works of fiction which come to us from Canada; an atmosphere of refinement and a certain loftiness characterise their romance . . . It has gleams of humour in its high romance, and is told with a certain elegance characteristic of its origin.⁶²

The historical novels of Charles G. D. Roberts and Gilbert Parker show how English Canada's interest in Quebec degenerated from an earnest involvement in its culture and history, exemplified by the serious historical fiction of the late 1870's, to a superficial concern with French Canada's picturesqueness, illustrated by the slick stories popular in the 1890's. Like Roberts, Gilbert Parker viewed history as dull fabric to be embroidered by the romancer. Modern critics agree that Parker's historical fiction contains none of the determined faithfulness to the past, appreciation of historical forces or complex patterns of motivation which distinguish The Golden Dog.⁶³ Compared with Kirby's monumental work, Parker's Canadian historical novels -- The Trail of the Sword (1894) and The Seats of the Mighty (1896) -- are merely fast-paced costume romances, evincing little interest in Quebec beyond a source of high adventure, picturesque scenery and exotic colour. Yet contemporary reviewers valued "the pre-Raphaelite fidelity with which Mr. Parker's vivid and picturesque scenes are painted."⁶⁴ Massey's Magazine pronounced The Seats of the Mighty a work of "considerable" historical value,⁶⁵ and the Canadian Magazine declared its author to be "Canada's greatest novelist" because

His works . . . are wholesome and fruitful, bright and interesting, polished and refined. His historical romances compare with the best work of this class in the English language. He is progressive and stable. He is never flippant and always instructive.⁶⁶

Of more importance to the development of Canadian literature and literary attitudes are Parker's stories of contemporary French-Canadian life. The same late nineteenth-century interest in local colour that inspired American and British writers to investigate the manners and dialects of far corners of their country sent Parker to the Northwest and Quebec. Parker claimed that these tales, first published in popular British and American periodicals before being collected in Pierre and His People (1892), opened up the Canadian North in fiction.⁶⁷ To unify his melodramatic stories of life and death in the harsh Hudson's Bay region, Parker created the romantic character of Pretty Pierre, an elegant French-speaking Métis "begat in an hour between a fighting and a mass."⁶⁸ Parker always insisted that Pierre was "true to life -- to his race, to his environment, to the conditions of pioneer life through which he moved,"⁶⁹ although some of his critics differed.

Certainly the majority of Parker's Canadian audience would have agreed with the Toronto Daily Star's 1904 pronouncement that "We are thankful to Sir Gilbert for idealising Canada,"⁷⁰ and with Bliss Carman's prediction, made ten years previously, that Parker was "one of the half dozen English novelists to whom the opening of the twentieth century is likely to belong."⁷¹

Even in the 1920's Parker's eulogizers enjoyed the way his books upheld the principles of Smith's seven "Lamps of Fiction;" according to Lorne Pierce, "There are many elevated moral passages in his work, as well as a fine use of the Scriptures. Mr. Parker is also free from morbidity, sombre psychology and sex; he is wholesome and yet virile."⁷² Against this chorus of applause there rose several discordant voices, expressing opinions coinciding with those of modern readers. In 1896 T. G. Marquis observed that Pierre and His People bore little relation to real life:

In "Pierre and his People" Mr. Parker shewed individuality, strength, and a subtle power of characterization; but as we closed his studies we felt that the life portrayed was drawn from his own brain, and had never existed on any known part of this continent.⁷³

British reviewers approached Parker's first book warily, responding primarily to its unusual setting; as the Athenaeum cautiously remarked, "Mr. Parker's scenes from Quebec and the Hudson's Bay Territory have the great advantage of being novel."⁷⁴ The Bookman enjoyed Parker's "picturesqueness," but perceived that his romanticism destroyed any sense of probability:

The men are bigger, the women of robuster beauty than elsewhere. Their language is more than picturesque; it is literary; poetical, and it must be confessed they nearly all talk in the same manner, whether they be natives of Donegal, or of the Cypress Hills, or of Belgravia. The weakest point of the whole is the part that Belgravia plays. It sends out too many too interesting exiles to make acquaintance with the elegant, melancholy half-breed Pierre.⁷⁵

Parker's constant willingness to subordinate reality to romance aroused the indignation of the Toronto Evening Standard, which

angrily accused him of simply exploiting his country, without respecting its true nature:

Gilbert Parker . . . is a poseur from first to last. He is romantic and idealistic, and has the faults of his qualities. Able to write limpid prose, he prefers to strain after those meretricious blank verse effects which spoil true style. He is popular because he had the commercial shrewdness to give the reading public the only part of the British Empire that had not been exploited. When *Pierre and His People* was published, Haggard had worked Africa and Kipling India, and the other habitable portions of the globe had likewise their manipulators. Parker served up Canada and the Canadian Northwest, giving the latter region a local colour that existed largely in his own imagination. At any rate, invidious people say that Parker's Northwest is as much like the real thing as a peacock is like a Moor hen, and as for the preposterous *Pierre*, with his everlasting cigaret and his graceful insouciance -- such a half-breed as that could hardly escape the Lieutenant Governorship of the Territories.⁷⁶

Parker carried his inability to distinguish between clichéd romance and believability from the North to Quebec in The Pomp of the Lavilletes (1896), The Lane that Had no Turning (1900), The Right of Way (1901) and The Money Master (1915). In the prefaces to the Imperial Edition of his Collected Works, he declared these books to be realistic studies of French-Canadian life, and his Canadian reviewers praised their "atmosphere of the old French-Canadian life so truthfully depicted that its very naturalness is the highest tribute to the author's ability."⁷⁷ The Athenaeum, however, justifiably expressed reservations about The Lane that Had No Turning:

One gladly admits that the setting is picturesque . . . but one may be allowed to doubt whether this collection was worthy to be dedicated, as it is, to Sir Wilfrid

Laurier. It is unfortunate that the stories do not succeed in conveying the impression they are intended to convey of the character of the French-Canadians. The least attractive and admirable traits are those that are most prominently brought forward. To achieve what Mr. Parker meant to achieve would require a more sympathetic imagination and a literary skill of a more delicate kind than he has succeeded in bringing to his task. The principal story is a well-constructed piece of melodrama, but one may hope that it is as unlike real life as a melodrama can be.⁷⁸

An overwhelming taste for melodrama and a condescending attitude towards French Canadians account for much of Parker's failure to do for Quebec what Thomas Hardy had done for Wessex. The Money Master, for example, owes much to The Mayor of Casterbridge, but Parker's insistence on populating nineteenth-century Quebec with gothic eccentrics and predictable romantic stereotypes, despite his claims to understand the French Canadian character,⁷⁹ undercut any possible sense of realism.

Both Parker's interest in French Canada and his general failure to write well about the Lower province originated in part in his basic approach towards the novel as a literary genre and towards Canada as a location for fiction. In an undated interview with the New York Sun, Parker explicitly rejected the kind of realism advocated by Sara Jeannette Duncan:

I appreciate the talent of the writer who takes a slab of life, and who anatomizes it as a skilled surgeon would a body, who brings out its details even though they may be hideous, but there is no urge in me for such dissection.

I have the romantic tendency I make my characters a little better, a little more adventurous, a little more superlative in all their qualities than they would be possibly in real life.⁸⁰

Parker's "romantic tendency" led to his interest in Quebec because, as he revealed in an 1897 interview, it was the only part of Canada with any "glamor." Most of Canada Parker described as "serenely unpicturesque":

The country is new (leaving out the Province of Quebec,) and therefore the houses are more or less plain and in their aspect unsoftened by the finger of Time. The very bright sunlight, the raw surroundings, are apt to produce an effect of garishness, and the life of the people, being largely agricultural, has no glamor upon it.

Parker felt that he needed "the clash of race" and "great elements of contrast" to provide dramatic material, and he could find this only in the North and in Quebec:

You have, at the present day in Canada, human life, and that is immensely interesting, and to bring it out of unpicturesque surroundings and give it eminence requires not only great art, but great humanity; therefore, we who are not great, have a hard task because we have no adventitious aids to fame. That is why I went where there were contrasts -- to Hudson's Bay which still provided great elements of contrast It is also provided in Quebec, by reason of the clash of race -- English and French.⁸¹

The "clash of race" is certainly an interesting Canadian theme, but Parker never did develop it between English and French beyond its romantic contributions to the love plots of The Trail of the Sword and The Seats of the Mighty, and his superficial treatment of the 1837 rebellion in The Pomp of the Lavilletes. Only in The Translation of a Savage (1893), in which a Canadian Indian girl is suddenly placed in London high society, did he even begin to explore a clash of race in a manner approaching

the social interests of Sara Jeannette Duncan, and only in When Valmond Came to Pontiac (1895) did he use Quebec in a reasonably serious study of identity and destiny.

Parker belonged to a group of Canadian writers who contributed local colour tales of French Canada to large American periodicals like Scribner's, Harper's and the Century before re-issuing them in book form.⁸² Collections like E. W. Thomson's Old Man Savarin Stories (1895), William McLennan's In Old France and New (1899), and G. M. Fairchild's A Ridiculous Courting and Other Stories of French Canada (1900) all exhibit to some degree the condescension, melodrama and sentimentality which characterise Parker's stories. Nonetheless English-Canadians took these tales to be realistic portrayals of French-Canadian life, and in 1895 Archibald Lampman particularly lauded E. W. Thomson's work. However, the points for which he praised Thomson relate less to the Old Man Savarin Stories than to Lampman's own conception of what a truly Canadian literature ought to be. Lampman's desire for a sense of authenticity occasioned his commendation of fiction

written not by a foreign littérateur who has scoured this country on the hunt for new sensations, but by a Canadian who has lived in the places the very scent of whose pines and the pure breath of whose atmosphere he brings before us, and worked with the people whose simple humanity and genuine talk lend humour and life to his pages.

In Thomson's stories -- some written in Québécois dialect -- Lampman thought he detected a genuine Canadian voice. He found Thomson's language to be

often extraordinarily simple, but it is the kindly offspring of genuine conception, and direct spontaneous feeling, and sometimes in his easy way he will give forth a stroke of imagery containing a world of meaning in a single phrase, often something particularly apt to a Canadian ear.⁸³

Although Thomson's stories are in fact barely distinguishable from the magazine fiction produced by his compatriots, two more gifted writers did add a special dimension to English Canada's literary treatment of French Canada when they transformed the local colour tale from a superficial account of a quaint culture to a confrontation with psychic reality. The Quebec fiction of Susan Frances Harrison and Duncan Campbell Scott follows an approach to Lower Canada first adumbrated in The Golden Dog.

Nineteenth-century Canadians enjoyed The Golden Dog because, like Queen Victoria herself, they "liked a novel."⁸⁴ But Kirby's handling of time indicates that in writing about French Canada he found himself tackling a problem more subtle than the relatively simple recounting of historical facts and legends. When dealing with historically verifiable characters, Kirby occasionally leaps out of the present time of his novel, to forecast future events. In the very first chapter, which introduces "Men of the Old Régime," Kirby foretells their final destiny. Although he confines his present story to about six months in 1749, he repeats this pattern of projecting into the future several times in the body of his book (pp. 190-91, 514) and in his final chapter, thereby underscoring the relation of each historical moment to previous and

future historical time. At the same time, however, he constructs a kind of superhistorical time scheme when he refers to areas and events outside the bounds of verifiable history. Kirby introduces geological prehistory when he emphasizes the brevity of Pierre Philibert's and Amélie de Repentigny's just-declared love by seating them upon a "boulder which had dropped millions of years before out of an iceberg as it sailed slowly over the glacial ocean which then covered the place of New France" (pp. 299-300). This apparently casual remark is later developed when Peter Kalm argues from geographical and biological evidence that the New World is of vaster antiquity than the Old (pp. 412-16). To Kalm's scientific speculations regarding time outside human knowledge, Kirby adds the dimension of mythic time by frequently referring to the Bible and to classical mythology. By making Quebec the confluence of various kinds of historical and non-historical time, or of time and timelessness, Kirby effectively elevated Lower Canada from a geographical to an imaginative place.⁸⁵ It was as such an imaginative space that Quebec attracted two of the best late nineteenth-century Canadian writers of fiction, Susan Frances Harrison and Duncan Campbell Scott.

In both her poetry and her fiction, Harrison creates a Quebec removed from English Canada in both space and time -- a Quebec containing not just conventional cheerful peasants, but also

direct encounters with the kinds of fear and horror which characterize the imaginative world of gothic romance. In the opening poems of Pine, Rose and Fleur de Lis (1891), Harrison carries her reader "Far from flat Ontario"⁸⁶ to a place where geographical and chronological distinctions blur as "The Old World and the New World meet" (p. 38). Once the present is left behind, degrees of antiquity cease to be relevant; when "The spell of Age is over all," the seventeenth-century architecture of Château Papineau may just as easily be described as "medieval" (p. 41). Although most of the Pine, Rose and Fleur de Lis poems cater to a stereotypical view of colourful, pastoral Quebec, the idyll is undercut by those which warn a young Québécoise never to anger or betray her Métis suitor, "For know, my girl, there is always the axe" (p. 36). French Canada's otherwise Edenic landscape is polluted by the beggars of Côte Beaupré, "Mouthing and mumbling and making a hell of the free highway" (p. 51), and its apparently pure religious structure is haunted by

The World, the Flesh and the Devil -- they're
On the country road, in the gas-lit town,
Anear and afar and everywhere (p. 61).

In Harrison's prose fiction this sinister tone dominates her vision of Quebec, which becomes a place where her protagonists (usually English-speaking outsiders) encounter madness, terror and death. Several of the pieces in her Crowded Out! and Other Sketches (1886) strikingly illustrated the imaginative relationship between Canada and Quebec in which Lower Canada functions as a kind of

looking-glass world for Upper Canada, where inner experiences can be clothed and confronted in tangible, outer forms. The narrator of the title story is a young English-Canadian musician and writer failing to achieve recognition in London. As he descends into madness and death, he calls on his beloved Hortense, a high-born Québécoise. Not only is Hortense Angélique de Repentigny de St. Hilaire⁸⁷ a disdainful mistress whose image haunts her lover, but she is also under the domination of a lecherous old priest who

has taught her all she knows, how to sew and embroider, and cook and read, though he never lets her read anything but works on religion. Religion, always religion! He has brought her up like a nun, crushed the life out of her . . . my God! that night while I watched them studying and bending over those cursed works on the Martyrs and the Saints and the Mission houses -- I saw him -- him -- that old priest -- take her in his arms and caress her, drink her breath, feast on her eyes, her hair, her delicate skin⁸⁸

This experience with perverted religion and sexuality destroys Hortense's unsuccessful lover, who dies murmuring, "Descendez à l'ombre, / Ma jolie blonde."

These same lines from a Quebec ballad, "so weird, so solemn, so earnest, yet so pathetic, so sweet, so melodious"⁸⁹ form the title of a story in which they again signify death for the English outsider, this time from smallpox contracted from a French-Canadian. Other English-speaking visitors discover Quebec to be the home of gothicism, romance and the grotesque in "The Story of Delle Josephine Boulanger," when a reserved old maid turns out to be

a harmless maniac, and in "The Story of Etienne Chezy D'Alencourt," when an English immigrant decides he has found the epitome of the habitant in a lumberjack, only to discover that the man is in fact of noble descent. Duncan Campbell Scott developed a similar pattern of English/French relations in his narrative poem "Catnip Jack" (1905). Jack, "a sturdy English lad," loses his French-Canadian sweetheart to smallpox. The disease manifests itself materially in a vision of horrible "old mother Picotte," and the young couple, destroyed by their encounter with mystery and terror, end up "closer in death than in love."⁹⁰

Harrison's two novels, The Forest of Bourg-Marie (1898) and Ringfield (1912), expand her gothic vision of Quebec. Joshua Ringfield, the protagonist of her second novel, is an Ontario Methodist preacher whose traumatic experiences in the isolated village of St. Ignace ultimately result in his retreat from English Protestantism to the secure arms of the Catholic church. An ambitious, practical man, Ringfield first arrives in St. Ignace at the request of the Americanized Poussette, an entrepreneur who hopes to bring progress and enlightenment to his native parish. But Poussette's designs backfire when Ringfield's repressed passions break through his cool, Protestant exterior, and he falls hopelessly in love with Pauline Clairville, an actress descended from the region's seigneurial family. Pauline's fatal decadence is aptly symbolized by the white peacock wandering around the decaying Clairville manor, which she shares with her demented

brother. Ringfield suffers terrible conflicts between emotion and intellect when his infatuation with Pauline forces him to accept much that his democratic Methodism abhors -- aristocracy, the stage, hints of illegitimacy, sexuality -- in general, the dark world of suppressed passion and irrationality. In his inevitable nervous breakdown he finally succumbs to the overwhelming psychic underworld that, for the Anglophone, can become manifest in Quebec. When Pauline finally marries his rival, Ringfield cannot return to Ontario. The Roman Catholic Church, the backbone of French Canada, beckons, and Ringfield retires forever into the alien world of "The cloister, the cross, the strange, hooded, cloaked men the rich symbolism of even the simplest service that beckoning world of monks and monastic quiet."⁹¹

In The Forest of Bourg-Marie (1898) the role of the Anglophone outsider is not conferred upon a character within the novel, but is transferred to the English-speaking reader. Harrison introduces English Canada to the alien wilderness of Quebec in her opening paragraphs:

Bordering the mighty river of the Yamachiche there are three notable forests, dark, uncleared, untrodden, and unfrequented by man, lofty as Atlas, sombre as Hades. In their Plutonian shades stalk spectral shapes of trapper and voyageur, Algonquin and Iroquois, Breton and Highlander, Saxon and Celt

The forest of Bourg-Marie is the darkest, the deepest, the most impenetrable, the most forbidding of the three. The stars of spring that light up other woods seem here rarely to pierce through the cold, hard ground to the sun; the sun itself seldom penetrates the thick branches of fir and pine and hemlock. . . . Fitting soil for fable and legend, for the tale of the Dead Man's Tree,

for the livelier story of ill-fated Rose Latulippe,
for countless minor myths that the old women and the
old men, even the young men and maidens, have at
their fingers' ends.⁹²

Harrison's alliance of classical mythology and Quebec folklore creates a foreboding landscape which forms the backdrop to a drama of conflict between past and present, tradition and materialism, and, ultimately, good and evil. Old Mikel Caron, forest-ranger for Yamachiche, makes himself fully at home in the primeval wilderness. A descendant of the ancient seigneurial family who originally possessed the land, he still owns the ruined Manoir built by his ancestors. Here he has constructed a secret room, furnished with an elaborately set antique dining table. For Mikel, this room symbolizes his dream of restoring past glory through his grandson, Magloire, whom he envisages as a great French Canadian leader. But Magloire completely betrays his origins by Americanizing himself to the extent of assuming an English name. Now a gambler, he regards his home and family only as potential sources of money. Disgusted with his grandson's materialism, Mikel chooses for his heir Nicholas Laurière, a habitant and "the worthiest, most virtuous, most respectable young man in the parish."⁹³

Like the English-speaking outsiders who appear as characters within Harrison's other works, the English reader of The Forest of Bourg-Marie is drawn into a gothic landscape of ruined mansions and primeval forests, inhabited by strange characters including

a hunch-backed dwarf and a clever, manipulative priest. Against this nightmarish background he witnesses the triumph of darkness when the good, innocent Nicholas is destroyed by Magloire, and the Manoir itself is devastated by a windstorm. Magloire escapes unpunished and prospers in the United States. In the end, all that remains is Mikel's power to endure, as he continues his old life as an accomplished woodsman and bear hunter.

Stylistically, The Forest of Bourg Marie demonstrates the strength of well-controlled romance. The Canadian Magazine found the book "a distinct revelation of power and mastery of material."⁹⁴ Robert Barr's enthusiastic involvement in the novel's imaginative power infected his own prose style, when he declared in one breathless sentence that

"The Forest of Bourg Marie" is a notable work of genius, a book superb in its character drawing, noble in diction, thrilling in incident, and so strongly constructed that it dispenses with conventional love-making, without losing an atom of its interest, a feat which has not been accomplished, to my knowledge, since Robinson Crusoe, and I doubt if there is a novelist living, however famous, who would have had the courage to put forth a romance without a heroine in it.⁹⁵

Powerful writing of a different sort appears in Duncan Campbell Scott's stories of the village of Viger, whose inhabitants work out problems of physical and psychic survival in a modified gothic world. Like Harrison's Quebec fiction, the Viger stories contain many of the conventions common to late nineteenth-century stories of French Canada -- humorous courtships, shared superstitions, local legends, and colourful, eccentric characters. What distinguishes

Scott's writing from the productions of his Canadian contemporaries is the way his fine literary skill combines with his conception of Quebec as a space in which the life of the imagination can enjoy special freedoms.⁹⁶ The "restrained intensity" which E. K. Brown so admired in Scott's poetry⁹⁷ appears just as markedly in his fiction. In the Village of Viger (1896) is held together by a tension between depicting Viger as a "pleasant" retreat from "The complex joys and ills of life," in the words of Scott's epigraph, and sensing the threat imposed on the village by the expanding city, which is described on the very next page.⁹⁸ This balance of idyll and threat, or illusion and reality, permeates the life of Viger, as Scott sets up a world in which the boundaries between illusion and reality blur and blend until reality ceases to be verifiable, and magic and mystery are not only possible, but occasionally the norm. Scott's small French-Canadian characters confront the intermingling of actuality and imagination when Charles Desjardins progresses from studying Napoleon to believing that he is Napoleon, when Paul Arbique dies the same day his native Sedan falls to the Prussians, when gambling Louis Blanc's dreams transform a small white dog into an emblem of his "accusing conscience,"⁹⁹ and when Paul Farlotte, himself haunted by unseen visitors, becomes guardian of a family victimized by obsessive insanity. The same transformation of myth into reality occurs on a communal level when the whole village of Viger shares the belief that a mysterious pedlar may have

been "the old Devil himself."¹⁰⁰

Although much of Scott's French-Canadian material belongs to the realm of gothic romance, his artistic control produces realistic effects. Through his restrained style, very like the prose equivalent of the "bare technique" he admired in the poetry of John Donne,¹⁰¹ Scott rejected the dialect humour, melodrama and sentimentality common to the Quebec stories written by his contemporaries. As a result his stories embrace both romance and reality, depicting the unpredictable life of the imagination in relatively matter-of-fact language. Scott's Canadian critics appreciated his stylistic artistry, commending him as a "graceful writer."¹⁰² T. G. Marquis declared In the Village of Viger a success because Scott "has a poetic eye for effects, and is able to make his picture real to the most careless reader."¹⁰³ Massey's reviewer understood especially well the relation between skillful writing and the impression of realism. He distinguished Scott as "without doubt, one of the best writers of short stories, that Canada has yet turned out," because in In the Village of Viger, "The characters are so true to life, the scenes are those met with every day, and the local color has been applied with such brief exactness that Lower Canada may be traced on every page." This critic singled out "The Desjardins" as a remarkably well-written story in which "every word is made to count . . . There is so much suggested in it, so much left to the imagination."¹⁰⁴ Lorne Pierce also perceived that in the Viger stories, Scott "revealed

a fine sense of artistic unity and dramatic action. Every superfluous line is erased, that the significance of his idyll may be clearly seen. . . . Every story moves by its own momentum, and the dénouement is both inevitable and memorable."¹⁰⁵

Scott's finely controlled stories marked a high point in Victorian Canada's literary love affair with Quebec. His superior skill allowed him to express French Canada's importance to the cultural identity of English Canada without the superficiality that mars the work of most of his predecessors and contemporaries. Throughout the nineteenth century, Quebec was one place where English Canada's literary imagination could find a home, in the gothic tale, the historical romance, and the local colour story. Scott's stories crystallized this imaginative relationship, while his craftsmanship allowed him to maintain the realistic tone advocated by Sara Jeannette Duncan without violating the basic standards of Goldwin Smith.

Duncan Campbell Scott's ability to tread the fine line between realism and romance was not shared by most other nineteenth-century Canadian writers. While a number rejected the romantic subject of French Canada in favour of the everyday life of their own English-speaking communities, they retained their taste for romantic, didactic literature. Victorian Canada's penchant for romance becomes especially obvious in novels which deal with topics which could have been treated unromantically. Pioneer life,

religious crises, social and amorous complications and unwed mothers interested many Canadian authors, but they invariably used these subjects as occasions to preach morality, or to illustrate "the romance of real life."

NOTES TO CHAPTER VIII

- ¹ A. Ethelwyn Wetherald, "Some Canadian Literary Women,
-- I. Seranus," The Week, 5 (22 March 1888), 268.
- ² J. G. Bourinot, "Review of Science, Literature and Art,"
DAR, 1879, pp. 264-65.
- ³ "Current Literature," RBCM, 1 (July 1878), 121.
- ⁴ "Reviews," BAM, 1 (Oct. 1863), 638.
- ⁵ "Literary Notices," NDM, Jan. 1874, 61-62.
- ⁶ Blanche L. Macdonell, "The Literary Movement in Canada up
to 1841," Canadiana, 2 (Feb. 1890), 17-18.
- ⁷ John Lesperance, "The Literary Standing of the New Dominion,"
CIN, 15 (24 Feb. 1877), 118-19.
- ⁸ John Howard Willis ("H."), CRLHJ, 1 (Dec. 1824), 343-48.
- ⁹ Willis, CRLHJ, 3 (Sept. 1826), 203-05.
- ¹⁰ Jeffrey L. Wollock, "Violet Keith and all that sort of
thing," JCF, 3, No. 3 (1974), pp. 80-88.
- ¹¹ Mrs. Cushing ("E.L.C."), LG, 1 (March 1839), 167-70.
- ¹² Mrs. Cheney ("H.V.C."), LG, n.s. 6 (Oct.-Dec. 1848).
- ¹³ Mrs. Cheney ("H.V.C."), LG, n.s. 9 (April-Sept. 1851).
- ¹⁴ Mrs. Cushing, LG, 1 (March 1839), 167.
- ¹⁵ "Literary Notices," NDM, Jan. 1874, 61.

¹⁶ See Carl Berger, The Sense of Power (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1970), p. 94; John Robert Sorfleet, "French Canada in Nineteenth-Century English-Canadian Fiction," Diss. New Brunswick 1975, especially pp. 12-37, 330-32.

¹⁷ "Review of Literature, Science and Art," DAR, 1880-81, p. 283.

¹⁸ W. D. Lighthall, "William Kirby," DI, 2 (11 May 1889), 298.

¹⁹ William Kirby to J. M. LeMoine, 7 April 1877, LeMoine Correspondence, Kirby Collection, Ontario Archives.

²⁰ Le Moine to Kirby, 2 April 1877, LeMoine Correspondence.

²¹ Kirby to LeMoine, 30 April 1877, LeMoine Correspondence.

²² Toronto Mail, 4 April 1877, p. 2.

²³ "Book Reviews," CMNR, 11 (May 1877), 564.

²⁴ Kirby to LeMoine, 7 April 1877, LeMoine Correspondence.

²⁵ CMNR, 11 (May 1877), 565.

²⁶ "Bibliographie," La Revue Canadienne, 14 (mars 1877), 227.

²⁷ Benjamin Sulte, "Le Chien D'or," L'Opinion Publique, 8 (3 mai 1877), 208.

²⁸ Kirby to LeMoine, 28 March 1877, LeMoine Correspondence.

²⁹ William Kirby to John A. Cooper, 20 January 1904, John Alexander Cooper Papers, PAC.

³⁰ Kirby to Cooper, 27 January 1904, Cooper Papers.

³¹ Kirby to LeMoine, 23 January 1879, LeMoine Correspondence.

³² Benjamine Sulte to William Kirby, 9 avril 1877, Sulte Correspondence, Kirby Collection, Ontario Archives.

³³ Lorne Pierce, William Kirby. The Portrait of a Tory Loyalist (Toronto: Macmillan, 1929), p. 259.

³⁴ Sulte to Kirby, 9 avril 1877, Sulte Correspondence.

³⁵ Sulte to Kirby, 7 janvier 1878, Sulte Correspondence. A similar remark appears in Sulte's letter to Kirby, 17 mai 1877.

- 36 Sulte to Kirby, 18 juil. 1878, Sulte Correspondence.
- 37 Northrop Frye, "Conclusion," Literary History of Canada, ed. Carl F. Klinck (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1967), p. 840.
- 38 Frye, pp. 840-41.
- 39 LeMoine to Kirby, 22 March 1877, LeMoine Correspondence.
- 40 CMNR, 11 (May 1877), 565.
- 41 W. D. Lighthall, "William Kirby," DI, 2 (11 May 1889), 298.
- 42 Sulte, L'Opinion Publique, 8 (3 mai 1877), 208.
- 43 William Kirby, The Chien D'Or. The Golden Dog. A Legend of Quebec (New York & Montreal: Lovell, Adam, Wesson & Co., 1877), p. 678. All further quotations will be taken from this edition, and will be identified by page number.
- For a full discussion of this book's complicated publishing history, see the typescript in the possession of the Toronto Public Library, "Brief of the Publication of William Kirby's Novel 'Le Chien d'Or' (The Golden Dog) to Dr. Lorne Pierce," by Wm. Kirby, Rep. This presumably was Pierce's source for the account of Kirby's publishing and copyright difficulties presented in William Kirby. The Portrait of a Tory Loyalist (Toronto: Macmillan, 1929).
- 44 CMNR, 11 (May 1877) 565.
- 45 In Surfacing (1972), Margaret Atwood continues this tradition. See my article, "Margaret Atwood and Quebec: A Footnote on Surfacing," Studies in Canadian Literature, 1, No. 1 (Winter 1976), 115-19.
- 46 J. M. LeMoine, Maple Leaves (Quebec: Hunter. Rose, 1863), pp. 1-7.
- 47 Julia Catherine Beckwith Hart, St. Ursula's Convent, or, The Nun of Canada (Kingston: Thomson, 1824), I, p. 63.
- 48 Mabel, "Le Chien d'Or," Canadiana, 2 (Feb./Mar. 1890), 118.
- 49 "Book Reviews," CMNR, 11 (Apr. 1877), 543.
- 50 John Talon-Lesperance, The Bastonnais. Tale of the American Invasion of Canada in 1775-76 (Toronto: Belford, 1877), p. 91. All subsequent quotations will be taken from this edition, and identified by page number.

- 51 Arthur Faverel, CIN, 1 (19 Mar.-16 Apr. 1870). This story won second prize in the Canadian Illustrated News's historical romance competition.
- 52 Philippe Aubert de Gaspé, Les Anciens Canadiens (1862; rpt. Montreal: Fides, 1967), p. 268.
- 53 R. Lef. de Bellefeuille, rev. of Antoinette de Mirecourt, by Mrs. Leprohon, La Revue Canadienne, 1 (juil. 1864), 444.
- 54 V. L. O. Chittick, Thomas Chandler Haliburton (New York: Columbia University Press, 1924), p. 134.
- 55 "Book Reviews," CMNR, 11 (May 1877), 564.
- 56 Charles G. D. Roberts, "The Outlook for Literature. Acadia's Fields for Poetry, History and Romance," Halifax Herald, 1 Jan. 1886.
- 57 Goldwin Smith, Bystander, n.s. Feb. 1890, 170.
- 58 Douglas Huyghue, Argimou: A Legend of the Micmac (Halifax: Morning Courier Office, 1847), p. 6.
- 59 William Charles McKinnon, St. Castine: A Legend of Cape-Breton (Cape Breton Herald Office, 1850), p. 13.
- 60 Frances, or Pirate Cove. A Legend of Cape-Breton (Halifax: Office of the "British North American," 1851); St. George: or, The Canadian League (Halifax: Fuller, 1852).
- 61 Charles G. D. Roberts, By the Marshes of Minas (Boston: Page, 1900), p. ii. See also Roberts, A History of Canada (Toronto: Morang, 1898), pp. 126-30.
- 62 From publisher's announcement, bound with Sara Jeannette Duncan's Set in Authority (London: Constable, 1906).
- 63 See Fred Cogswell, "The Canadian Novel from Confederation to World War I," M.A., New Brunswick, 1950; John Robert Sorfleet, "Fiction and the Fall of New France," JCF, 2, No. 3 (1973), 132-46.
- 64 W. L. Alden, "The Book Hunter," Idler, 6 (Nov. 1894), 504.
- 65 "Book Notices," Massey's, 2 (July 1896), 72.
- 66 "Books and Authors," CM, 7 (June 1896), 190. See also The Week, 10 (16 June 1893), 687; The Week, 10 (18 Aug. 1893), 905-06.

67 Parker, "Preface" to Pierre and His People, Imperial Edition (New York: Scribner, 1912), pp. xii-xiii.

68 Parker, Pierre and His People, p. 28.

69 Parker, Pierre and His People, p. xii.

70 "Sir Gilbert's Critics," Toronto Daily Star, 5 Oct. 1904, p. 6.

71 Bliss Carman, "Mr. Gilbert Parker," The Chap-Book, 1 (1 Nov. 1894), 343.

72 Lorne Pierce, Outline of Canadian Literature (Toronto: Ryerson, 1927), p. 31.

73 T. G. Marquis, "The Seats of the Mighty," The Week, 13 (29 May 1896), 643.

74 Athenaeum, No. 3395 (19 Nov. 1892), 700.

75 "Some Short Stories," Bookman, Dec. 1892, p. 92.

76 Toronto Evening Standard, 2 June 1898.

77 "Book Notes," Prince Edward Island Magazine, 2 (Nov. 1900), 298.

78 Athenaeum, No. 3810 (3 Nov. 1900), 575.

79 "Preface" to The Money Master, Imperial Edition (New York: Scribner, 1916), pp. vii-ix.

80 Undated clipping, Parker Papers, Edith and Lorne Pierce Collection, Douglas Library, Queen's University.

81 W. J. Thorold, "Gilbert Parker, An Interview," Massey's Magazine, 3 (Feb. 1897), 118-21.

82 The local colour movement in literature had its counterpart in Canadian painting. Late nineteenth-century Canadian artists "created an image of Quebec widespread through Canada, an image of quaint folk customs and superstitions, of a country people who were likeable yet slightly backward and out of touch with reality and current life." They "sought for the picturesque and quaint elements in Quebec for their subject matter." Russell Harper, Painting in Canada: A History (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1966), p. 244.

83 Archibald Lampman, "Mr. Thomson's 'Old Man Savarin'," The Week, 12 (9 Aug. 1895), 880-81.

84 Kirby's papers in the Edith and Lorne Pierce Collection in the Douglas Library at Queen's University contain several copies of an anecdote in which the Princess Louise informed Kirby that her mother enjoyed his book because "She likes a novel." See Lorne Pierce, William Kirby (Toronto: Macmillan, 1929), p. 266.

85 Other writers also sensed in Quebec a feeling of timeless and displacement. Blanche Macdonell's "The Heroism of La Petite Marie" takes place in Beaulieu: "remote from any large town, Beaulieu might as well have been situated at the North Pole, so far did it seem removed from the busy turmoil of the world." RBCM, 5 (Sept. 1880), 309.

86 Susan Frances Harrison ("Seranus"), Pine, Rose and Fleur de Lis (Toronto: Hart, 1891), p. 7. Subsequent quotations from this book will be identified by page number.

87 Note that this name echoes both the heroine of The Golden Dog (Amélie de Repentigny) and her rival (Angélique des Meloises).

88 Susan Frances Harrison ("Seranus"), Crowded Out! and Other Sketches (Ottawa: Evening Journal Office, 1886), p. 9.

89 Harrison, Crowded Out!, p. 87.

90 Duncan Campbell Scott, "Catnip Jack," in New World Lyrics and Ballads (Toronto: Morang, 1905), pp. 41-45.

91 Susan Frances Harrison ("Seranus"), Ringfield. A Novel (Toronto: Musson, n.d. [1912]), p. 304.

92 Susan Frances Harrison ("Seranus"), The Forest of Bourg-Marie (Toronto: Morang, 1898), pp. 1-2.

93 Harrison, The Forest of Bourg-Marie, p. 167.

94 "Books and Authors," CM, 12 (Dec. 1898), 182.

95 Robert Barr, "Literature in Canada," CM, 14 (Dec. 1899), 135.

96 See my article, "The Piper's Forgotten Tune: Notes on the Stories of D. C. Scott and a Bibliography," JCF, No. 16 (1976), pp. 138-43.

⁹⁷ E. K. Brown, On Canadian Poetry (1934; rpt. Ottawa: Tecumseh, 1973), p. 125.

⁹⁸ Duncan Campbell Scott, In the Village of Viger (1896; rpt. Toronto: Ryerson, 1945), p. 1.

⁹⁹ Scott, Viger, p. 76.

¹⁰⁰ Scott, Viger, p. 100.

¹⁰¹ Scott, "Poetry and Progress. Presidential Address delivered before the Royal Society of Canada, May 17, 1922," rpt. in The Circle of Affection (Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 1947), p. 135.

¹⁰² A. D. Brodie, "Canadian Short Story Writers," CM, 4 (Feb. 1895), 339.

¹⁰³ T. G. Marquis, "In the Village of Viger," The Week, 13 (10 July, 1896), 788.

¹⁰⁴ "Book Notices," Massey's Magazine, 2 (July 1896), 73.

¹⁰⁵ Lorne Pierce, Outline of Canadian Literature, p. 116.

CHAPTER IX

"THE ROMANCE OF REAL LIFE": DOMESTIC AND REGIONAL REALISM

In 1843 Miss Foster, one of the Literary Garland's frequent contributors, reviewed a novel of domestic life which she found to be marked by "deep beauty," "poetic inspiration" and "a high tone of moral feeling." She concluded that "the romance of real life far exceeds in wildness, age and in improbability, the imaginings of the most fantastic brain."¹ Her coupling of "romance" with "real life" exemplifies the attitude of those Victorian Canadians who did indeed want to read and write fiction about moral and social problems encountered in everyday life, but could not free themselves from the assumption that both the form and the language of the novel were, by definition, romantic. In the 1890's Duncan Campbell Scott demonstrated that an author could render potentially romantic material realistic by carefully controlling form and language -- by writing with "brief exactness," in the words of an appreciative reviewer.² But most of Scott's Canadian predecessors and contemporaries lacked his technique,

and succeeded instead in rendering potentially realistic material romantic.

Although the search for a Canadian Walter Scott turned many writers towards historical subjects, a significant number shared the opinion of Rev. J. W. Longley of Halifax, who in 1873 called for a Canadian literature based on the present, not the past. According to Longley:

The delineator of Canadian life must picture the quiet scenes of industry, the simple incidents of ordinary life, the joys, sorrows, hopes, disappointments, successes and failures which are incident to men in the common routine of life. But there need be no lack of interest in these tales, because devoid of the "blood and thunder" element. The faithful history of any human heart, through all its struggles in life, can never grow wearisome. It must strike a chord that will vibrate in every other heart. There is more tragedy in the life of the poorest wood-cutter than even the ³most brilliant novelist has conceived and written.

While asking for novels about ordinary life, Longley also asked for "tragedy" -- for fictional representations of common life to be structured on a grand scale appropriated from a genre dealing with very extraordinary characters and situations. Conditioned by a romantic view of literature, Longley's contemporaries who wrote about real life fitted their Canadian material to pre-existing forms, usually resulting in stereotyped characters and unlikely plots. Although they drew their material from everyday working life, most of these writers saw the link between their fiction and the real world not as the development of literary verisimilitude, but as moral edification.

From the founding of the Literary Garland in 1839, stories illustrating "simple incidents of ordinary life" appeared regularly in Canadian periodicals, their pictures of the "joys, sorrows, hopes, disappointments, successes and failures which are incident to men in the common routine of life" invariably coloured by didacticism. Most of this literature upholds conventional standards of religious morality and social behaviour, preaching correct conduct, temperance, industry and godliness. One need read no further than their titles to predict the tenor of the messages couched in pieces like "A Mistake in Life. A Canadian Story Founded on Facts,"⁴ "Loss and Gain; or, The Bensons,"⁵ "The Story of a Flirt,"⁶ or "Marian's Miseries."⁷ Written in the 1870's and 1880's, this group of stories used Canadian characters in local settings to teach Canadians not to gamble, flirt, or try to rise above their proper station in life.

Earlier writers concerned with similar issues frequently failed to discover Canadian situations appropriate to their themes. One anonymous tale in the Garland -- "The First Cow. A Story of the Back-Woods"⁸ -- is quite unusual for its relatively straightforward depiction of immigrant life, though typical of Garland fiction in its message that hard work and occasional sacrifice will lead to prosperity. Another, "Memgog," begins promisingly with detailed descriptions of Canadian life when the narrator conducts the reader into a log cabin:

We enter on the side fronting the water, through a rude door, that trembles and creaks ominously on its wooden hinges. In the entry way we stop short against the foot of a crazy staircase, that ascends in a curve into the chamber, or garret. Here we tarry a short time to look at various implements of husbandry and the chase, -- such as an axe, hand-saw, hammer, hoes, an ox yoke, an iron banded Springfield musket, and an Indian hatchet, that lie, some in the corners and some hanging on wooden pins in the walls.⁹

Unfortunately, this concrete realism soon disappears. The anonymous author abandons his (or her) descriptive sketch to hammer home a predictable message regarding "the vanity of wealth."¹⁰ In general, Garland writers interested in real life cared more about abstract matters like proper social conduct and the definition of virtue than about such concrete issues as the problems of frontier settlement or survival in the Canadian bush. Authors like Susanna Moodie and Rosanna Leprohon preferred the sophisticated social life of England, where they easily found familiar literary conventions to illustrate their moralistic themes of filial obedience, faithfulness, generosity, honesty, and the supremacy of virtue.

Despite her vigorous interest in civilizing Canadian society, in many ways Mrs. Moodie never left England. She expressed the feeling that England was really her true home in a letter written in 1869. After spending more than half her life in the New World, Mrs. Moodie told a young friend that the failure of English daisies to adapt to the Canadian climate reminded her of "my own heartsickness, to return and die upon my native soil."¹¹

In her fiction, Moodie imaginatively enacted this return by setting all her novels in middle- and upper-class English society.

Stories first serialized in the Garland from 1839 to 1851 before publication in book form in London, such as Mark Hurdlestone, The Gold Worshipper (1853), Matrimonial Speculations (1854), and Geoffrey Moncton; or The Faithless Guardian (1856), as well as those which never found their way beyond the periodicals, exploit the conventions of popular romantic fiction to illustrate morals equally applicable to English and Canadian life. Unable to develop character, Susanna Moodie instead relied on complicated plots, using upon occasion devices like complex inheritances, smugglers, witchcraft and wicked uncles to carry her piously sentimental messages of resignation to the will of God, the importance of proper education, and the triumph of Christian morality.

Of more importance to the subsequent development of Canadian literature is the didactic fiction of Rosanna Eleanor Mullins Leprohon. From 1847 to 1851 Leprohon contributed to the Literary Garland five well-written serialized tales exposing the frivolity and hypocrisy of fashionable society.¹² In these stories, all set in England, she refined the themes she was to employ in her best-known Canadian novel, Antoinette de Mirecourt (1864). Four of the five centre on a young lady whose problems arise from improper education, or from the irresponsibility of her parents or guardians. All are cast in a high romantic mould, involving

intricate love complications recounted in elegant language, but Leprohon's ability to handle her chosen idiom with restraint distinguishes her as one of the best of the Garland's writers. Although Susanna Moodie's literary criticism usually evidenced more concern with morals than with artistry, she praised the "power and vigor" of Leprohon's writing, singling out her talent to create believable characters. Of "Ida Beresford; or The Child of Fashion" (1848) Mrs. Moodie observed:

The character of Ida, is very finely and effectively cast, and with all her faults, there is thrown around her, the fascination of a noble frank independence, which genius alone could imagine, and call into existence. The writer is still very young -- one of the gifted, upon whom fancy smiled in her cradle, and genius marked her for his own.¹³

One is tempted to speculate what such early promise might have produced had Rosanna Mullins not married Dr. Jean-Lukin Leprohon in 1851 and borne twelve children. What did in fact result were a number of adequate, but generally unmemorable magazine stories published mostly in the Canadian Illustrated News (1869-77), many poems, and three novels in which Mrs. Leprohon retained but failed to develop her ability to delineate social manners. In the first two she transferred her youthful interest in high life from England to Quebec, examining the effects of the Seven Years' War on the French-Canadian aristocracy. John Talon-Lesperance considered her best work to be her first Canadian novel, "The Manor House of de Villeraï", serialized in the Montreal Family

Herald (1859-60) but never issued in book form in English.¹⁴

This novel contains an interesting study of class conflict when Gustave de Montarville, unloved by Blanche de Villeraï to whom he has been engaged since childhood, becomes infatuated with Rose Lauzon, a peasant who returns his affections but refuses to marry him. Although their relationship never progresses beyond several conversations, Rose suffers public disgrace and leaves the village to enter service in Montreal, while the disconsolate de Montarville gets himself wounded serving under Montcalm. Despite her self-effacing modesty Rose's beauty attracts the "insolent importunities"¹⁵ of the effete Count De Noraye, whom de Montarville then challenges to a duel. Smallpox and the fortunes of war eventually conspire to allow Rose and de Montarville to marry, but Leprohon removes the union of the prince and the pauper from the real life world of Quebec when she sends the happy couple back to France after the Conquest. In "The Manor House of de Villeraï" Leprohon rejected tragedy, allowing her Christian optimism to transform a study of "virtue in distress" to a romance of "virtue rewarded," similar to the way she later permitted Antoinette de Mirecourt to survive and thrive despite her marital misadventures.

But in Antoinette de Mirecourt (1864), unsubtly subtitled "Secret Marrying and Secret Sorrowing," Leprohon's didacticism gained the upper hand, just as it had in "Eveleen O'Donnell." The latter, serialized in the Boston Pilot (1859)¹⁶ and directed

towards American readers, is a cloyingly sentimental religious romance, dominated by Leprohon's Roman Catholic outlook. Generally Christian rather than specifically Catholic moralism informs Antoinette, however. In this narrative Mrs. Leprohon never hesitates to intrude in order to underline the moral significance of Antoinette's fall and redemption. On her heroine's misery following her clandestine marriage to Audley Sternfield, a "handsome fascinating demon,"¹⁷ the author comments:

The lesson would be a painful, though, perhaps, a useful one. She had erred, but how speedy had been her retribution; she had violated the dictates of conscience and religion, -- trampled on a daughter's most sacred duties, and what had it brought her? That which guilt and wrong-doing will ever bring to those who are not utterly hardened in evil, -- remorse and wretchedness.¹⁸

Antoinette's remorse and repentance fortunately prove her salvation. After Sternfield's death Colonel Evelyn can still love and marry the abused heroine because, as he tells her, "As gold out of the furnace, so have you come purified and perfected out of your fiery trial."¹⁹ A fine counter-example to theories of Canadian victimhood, Antoinette refuses the Clarissa role her community tries to thrust upon her:

Despite the opinions of friends and acquaintances, who had obligingly decided that Antoinette should at once enter a convent, or retire to Valmont, there to live and die in the strictest seclusion, she was publicly united a year after to Colonel Evelyn. It is hard to say whether surprise or indignation predominated. . . .²⁰

It is unfortunate that Leprohon's ironic perception of social behaviour, indicated in these remarks concerning the final fate

of her heroine, usually suffered the imposition of didacticism. The pattern of irony undermined by moralizing which mars Antoinette de Mirecourt occurs also in Armand Durand (1868). Leprohon's only venture into the lower orders of French-Canadian life, this novel contains some interesting illustrations of rural Quebec manners but ends up resembling a complexly plotted temperance tract. In a similar way "Clive Weston's Wedding Anniversary,"²¹ a Canadian version of her earlier stories of British high life, commences as an ironic study of wealthy English Montreal society only to turn into a rather conventional exposé of frivolity and flirtation.

Susanna Moodie and Rosanna Leprohon used romantic plots, formalized language and predictable characters to advocate a conventional moral code relating to all dimensions of social behaviour. A number of writers narrowed their concern with real life to specifically religious matters. Long before Ralph Connor's brand of muscular Christianity popularized godliness at the turn of the century,²² Canada fostered a succession of evangelical novelists whose piety far exceeded their literary artistry. These religious moralists used popular novelistic forms to provide a thin sugar-coating of imagination for Sunday-school dogma, failing to achieve anything remarkable in terms of style, plot, setting or characterization.

Mary E. Herbert's Woman as She Should Be: or Agnes Wiltshire (1861) typifies this kind of fiction.²³ That Herbert's message

is more important than her medium is immediately evident in her title, which inverts the usual order of title and subtitle, subordinating the main character to the moral. Herbert's account of a virtuous Nova Scotia orphan who devotes herself to charitable Christian works, survives a shipwreck on the coast of Newfoundland and eventually ends up happily married to the man she has reformed, is designed to inform women how to exercise their sexual and maternal powers to redeem the world. The author proclaims:

Oh woman, woman, how potent is thy influence, which thou exercisest, in thy apparently limited sphere, over the human race. Thy tender hand moulds the plastic mind of childhood; thy gentle rebuke checks the wayward impulses of the impetuous youth; thy loving sympathy and voice counsel, cheer, and stimulate manhood; and to thee age and infirmity look with confidence and delight²⁴

The key to this power is "heart religion"²⁵ -- not mere attendance at church, but recognition of "the natural depravity of the human heart, and the necessity of the mind being fully renewed."²⁶ Essentially an evangelical tract, Herbert's book exploits the conventions of popular fiction to teach her fellow Maritimers true religion, temperance, charity and clean living.

The Maritimes provided a setting for evangelical fiction again in Miramichi (1865), attributed to Mrs. William T. Savage, which recounts the conversion of the backwoods of New Brunswick from "a land of almost heathenish darkness and vice"²⁷ to a state of religious enlightenment. Throughout the nineteenth century didactic Christian fiction flourished in Central Canada as well

as in the Maritimes. R. L. Richardson wrote nostalgically of the religious life of Scottish immigrants in Ontario in Colin of the Ninth Concession (1903). Rev. William T. Withrow, editor of the Canadian Methodist Magazine, employed the form of the novel to relate the history of Ontario Methodism in Barbara Heck (1895) and to unite religious and patriotic feeling in Neville Trueman, The Pioneer Preacher (1880). Of especial interest are the ambitious novels of Agnes Maule Machar, who spent most of her long life in Kingston.

Machar copiously contributed prose, poetry and fiction to Canadian periodicals, especially the Canadian Monthly and The Week, under the pseudonym "Fidelis." Chosen because, in her own words, "Faithfulness is the quality I most value and care most to possess,"²⁸ this pen name indicates the moral and religious tenor of her fiction. One of Machar's first novels, Katie Johnstone's Cross: A Canadian Tale (1870), won first prize in a competition sponsored by the Toronto publishers James Campbell and Son for a "book best suited to the needs of the Sunday School library,"²⁹ thus setting the tone that was to dominate her subsequent literary activity. Set in a fictitious Ontario town, this story of domestic life aims "chiefly to illustrate how great a blessing may flow from an affliction, if met and borne in a spirit of faith and Christian cheerfulness."³⁰ In addition to remonstrating against drunkenness, frivolous novel-reading and Sabbath-breaking, Machar pleads with her fellow-Canadians to participate actively in

reforming juvenile delinquents:

Perhaps every reader of this tale might be able to do something towards reclaiming one such; and were every one to try who could, it would more advance the prosperity of Canada than any development of merely material resources.³¹

Marjorie's Canadian Winter. A Story of the Northern Lights (1893)

contains an even less subtle fusion of nationalism and evangelism. Marjorie, a young American, spends a winter in Montreal learning Canadian history and Christian purity. Directed towards juvenile readers, the book provides more instruction than amusement with its thinly disguised lectures on the heroism of French Canada's past and on true Christian conduct.

The woman who denounced The Rise of Silas Lapham as "vulgar and commonplace" and praised The House of Seven Gables for its depiction of "the awful moral results of sin"³² tried to bring to Canadian literature the genteel Victorian refinement and morality advocated by Goldwin Smith. Hence her earnest efforts to portray the Reality of contemporary life are tinged with her own notions of Ideality, Purity, Humanity and Chivalry. Christian chivalry especially dominates her only novel about modern industrial society, Roland Graeme: Knight. A Novel of Our Time (1892). An idealistic Christian socialist, Graeme is a manse-born Canadian who tries to overcome labour unrest in an American mill town by promoting brotherly love and cooperation between labour and management. Machar's condescending sympathy with the working-class allowed her to depict the evils of industrialization with some sense of

realism, but her own genteel point of view prevented her from advocating anything more radical than a fairy-tale form of benevolent capitalism. Moreover her conception of the novel required a romantic plot structure in which to discuss real-life issues. Hence the amorous entanglements of the upper-class characters, including the melodramatic return of a cast-off alcoholic wife, take over from the book's philosophical concerns.

It is certainly no accident that Machar's only novel to recognize social evil is set in the United States. Her fiction about Canadian life presents Canada as an agricultural Arcadia, in which proper conduct, morality, temperance and godliness will inevitably lead to economic prosperity and domestic bliss. This attitude dominates "Lost and Won," which was serialized in the Canadian Monthly in 1875. Very loosely based on Adam Bede, this novel recounts how poor but honest Alan Campbell fortunately loses the affections of frivolous, spoiled Lottie Ward and wins those of saintly Lenore Arnold. The rightness of Campbell's conduct becomes evident when an apparently useless piece of property inherited from his father turns out to contain valuable minerals, and the undeserving Lottie finds her match in an unsavoury wheeler-dealer appropriately named Sharply.

Several minor novelists who shared Machar's interest in depicting and promoting domestic felicity and prosperity in Canadian society chose Dickens for their model. Ebenezer Clemo, who

published two Canadian novels under the slightly ambiguous pseudonym "Maple Knot," hinted at his debt to Dickens when he included in The Life and Adventures of Simon Seek (1858) a farmer with the habit of falling asleep who "had been surnamed Joe, by some wags . . . after the world-famed Joe the fat boy."³³ This book begins in Dickens's London and follows a collection of impoverished working-class characters to Canada, where the land of milk and honey turns out to be the resort of poverty, unemployment, and unscrupulous land agents. Although the novel is marred by a hodge-podge plot which carries Dickens's use of coincidence to new heights of improbability, Clemo's adaptation of his mentor's style and values results in several well-written domestic scenes and witty squibs on Canadian politics. That satire rather than fiction was Clemo's real talent becomes evident when his inability to construct a plot is contrasted with his ability to scathingly describe the Double-Majority question, which occupied the Canadian House of Assembly in the 1850's, as

a kind of double compound complication of complex incomprehensibilities, the only object of which appeared to be to get up a sort of political quadrille on the floor of the House, between the ins and the outs, by virtue of which they would be changing places and dancing from one side of the House to the other every hour or so, to the theme of Upper and Lower Non-Confidence.³⁴

With the encouragement of John Lovell,³⁵ Clemo produced a second novel -- Canadian Homes; or, The Mystery Solved. A Christmas Tale (1858). In his preface he announced that his purpose was to

propose a solution to Canada's economic ills, using a more popular and readable literary form than the newspaper:

It has been [the author's] endeavour to produce a tale of Canadian life that might beguile a winter's evening, and that might be read, without fear of very serious consequences, by even the most un-matter-of-fact and romantic; but at the same time, through the medium of the scenes and characters introduced, to effect as far as consistent and convenient in a work of fiction, the other and more important object.³⁶

The "mystery" of the title was why there should be unemployment and poverty in a land of plenty, and the answer involved protection of Canadian manufacturing. Because Clemo's purpose was polemical rather than literary, his effective descriptions of his characters' distresses are continually interrupted by political theorizing, resulting in an unhappy marriage of Dickensian descriptive realism with intrusive argument.

While Clemo learned from Dickens how to write about working-class life in order to illustrate his economic theories, a writer who used the pseudonym "Grodenk" constructed a Canadian novel composed entirely of tidbits of Dickensiana. "Grodenk"'s avowed purpose was to amuse and instruct, while telling a story of "Canadian every day life" which was "true to the letter," and would assist in building up "a literature of our own, more healthy in its tone and less injurious to the young readers of our country than the great bulk of the novels annually imported from other lands."³⁷ To illustrate "how wonderfully Providence works"³⁸ in rewarding the good, punishing the bad and reuniting long-lost

relatives, "Grodenk" created a Canadian hero based on David Copperfield and Nicholas Nickleby. After a rural Ontario childhood nearly identical to Copperfield's, Harry Hardy runs away to New York where he is befriended by Gasher, a street urchin straight out of Oliver Twist. Good deeds earn the two youths positions with the firm of Jamby and Jubb (modelled on the brothers Cheeryble), who eventually send them to Toronto. Here their financial and amorous fluctuations are punctuated alternately by episodes of Pickwickian humour and sentimental bathos, culminating in Gasher's deathbed reunion with his long-lost, much abused mother, and Hardy's blissful marriage after recovering his property from his villainous stepfather. Nowhere striking in its originality, "Grodenk"'s book is best where it most closely resembles Dickens, although it contains none of Dickens's distinctive vitality. Along with Dickensian humour, sentimentality, characters and situations, it transfers to Canada the Victorian values of middle-class morality and domestic felicity which particularly distinguish Dickens's early novels.

Similar values imbue a more modest work, Mrs. Dobbin's autobiographical Thos. (1878), whose chief literary interest lies in its description of upper middle-class Montreal life. Thos. represents most Canadian Victorian fiction purporting to depict real life in that it exalts happiness above financial prosperity, while at the same time its plot culminates with the virtuous receiving the reward of deserved wealth. The novels of

domestic moralists like Mrs. Dobbin, high life sentimentalists like Susanna Moodie and Rosanna Leprohon, religious evangelists like Agnes Maule Machar and Mary Herbert, and imitators of Dickens like Ebenezer Clemo and "Grodenk" all centre in the celebration of "dulce domum," identifying the home and the family as the locus of social and personal morality and happiness. In this fiction purporting to depict everyday life, domestic felicity and prosperity are both the cause and result of proper conduct and godliness. This same theme of the sanctity of the home and family was approached from a different angle by several other Canadian writers who used fictional forms as the framework for pragmatic information about life in the New World. While Susanna Moodie's genteel novels may be seen as manuals for moral survival in a complex social environment, her sister's The Canadian Crusoes (1850) was definitely designed as a manual for physical survival in the equally threatening wilderness of the Canadian backwoods.

Intended for juvenile readers, Catharine Parr Traill's account of the survival of three Canadian children lost in the forest is realistic only in its factual information. Indeed, the form and content of this novel encapsulate the problems encountered by writers who attempted to transfer a sophisticated literary genre to Canadian soil in the middle of the nineteenth century. The structure of the story is utterly romantic: three young cousins -- one French, the other two half-Scottish and half-French -- aided by an Indian girl, create their own little domestic

paradise when they lose their way in the primeval forest near Rice Lake. Relying solely on their wits, they apply their knowledge of the natural world to their own dilemma. For two years they enjoy a cozy retreat from the world of their parents, interrupted only by hostile Indians whose efforts to capture the children are ultimately foiled. Traill's writing drips with Christian sentimentality as she describes how a combination of rational behaviour and divine beneficence triumph over adversity, proving that only faith, will and judgment are required to tame the Canadian wilderness. This romantic plot provides a skeleton which Traill fleshes out with encyclopaedic nature lore, didactic moralizing on proper juvenile behaviour, and Christian proselytizing as the white children convert their Indian friend. Once baptised, Indiana becomes a suitable mate for one of her white, Christian playmates, as Traill rounds off the romance with a double marriage appropriately uniting Canada's British, French and Indian heritages. This novel's relation to the real world of frontier Canadian life occurs not in its idealized characters or the likelihood of its plot, but in its presentation of valuable information regarding survival in the wilderness.

A similar structure appears in the first novel of the Canadian West -- Alexander Begg's Dot-It-Down; A Story of Life in the North-West (1871).³⁹ Here the author's chosen form proves particularly inappropriate for his material since his tangled romantic plot -- which includes a deathbed marriage -- distracts from his

realistic descriptions of the Red River area and his cogent comments on frontier society. Begg's main interest lay in detailing Northwest life, defending the Hudson's Bay Company, and proving that the Western territory was suitable for settlement. To demonstrate that the region contained literary as well as agricultural promise, he attempted to document it in the sophisticated form of the romantic novel. Presumably Begg sensed his failure to enclose his material in his chosen form, since he supplemented his narrative with an "Emigrant's Guide to Manitoba." Although Dot-It-Down purports to describe the activities of a family of emigrants, the characters themselves become so bogged down in romantic conventions that Begg required this appendix to clarify the import of his book.

In the nineteenth century, the majority of Canadian novelists approached the relation between real life and literature from a didactic point of view, using romantically structured fiction to convey social, moral, and religious messages, or practical information. Their purpose was to bolster conventional standards of morality and conduct, to create a Canada composed of little enclaves of domestic bliss, harmoniously interacting according to Christian principles. This norm of middle-class complacency was occasionally relieved by the efforts of writers who considered the novel a genre useful for criticizing, not reinforcing, social convention.

One of the earliest such works was Belinda: or, The Rivals,

written by Abraham S. Holmes in southern Ontario in 1843. Holmes's two modern advocates, Carl F. Klinck and Marilyn I. Davis, read the book as "a competent spoof of the sentimental seduction tale"⁴⁰ which inverts the usual structure of the genre by presenting a lively Canadian coquette who assumes various genteel and religious guises to seduce a series of vulnerable men. Similar to the way James De Mille was to use the form of the adventure novel to ridicule extravagant romantic fiction, Holmes used the form of the sentimental novel to unmask the hypocrisy which frequently underlay moralistic tales of seduction and betrayal. To set up his romance, Holmes superimposed high life conventions on the Canadian landscape:

Every body knows that there is not in all these provinces an edifice which might properly be called a castle. But as strict propriety of language is not always consulted, things often take names to which they are not entitled. Thus, the house of Belinda's uncle, from its imposing structure and antique appearance, was called THE CASTLE; and he, perhaps from his manners and dimensions, the old Burgher.⁴¹

In Belinda, people as well as buildings "often take names to which they are not entitled," as Holmes and his heroine both appropriate the stylized language and conventions of sentimental fiction to their own ends: Holmes "to punch a few earthy holes in a highly artificial literary tradition,"⁴² Belinda to exploit the affections of her easily blinded lovers for her own gratification. As Carl Klinck has observed, Holmes's constant protestations of truth play with his readers in the same manner as Belinda plays

with her lovers: "Coquetry becomes in Holmes' hands a literary mode, governing the general plan and every paragraph of the book, just as Belinda, within the scheme, governs her suitors."⁴³

While Holmes obviously disapproves of Belinda's perversion of love and religion, he seldom relaxes his atmosphere of witty ambiguity. Even when he kills off his heroine, after she presents her husband with a fine son just six weeks after her marriage, Holmes creates a deathbed scene refreshing in its irreverence. Belinda's short-lived contrition quickly dissolves into assurance, and after a life of dissimulation she dies with "a confident expectation of being welcomed to the realms of bliss immediately upon her dissolution."⁴⁴ Forgiven by her family, the promiscuous frontier belle receives the tribute of her community "as if some patriot hero, the pillar and support of his community, had fallen."⁴⁵

Although Holmes's language remains unimpeachable, he writes about sexuality with an air of coy frankness which leaves no doubt regarding the activities of an energetic young lady who is "as intimate as Antony and Cleopatra"⁴⁶ with her various lovers. Holmes's avowed intention "to give every dog his due to tell what certain characters actually were"⁴⁷ hints that this frankness was inspired by actual circumstances, and the single surviving copy of the original edition of the book at one time contained a handwritten note identifying the main characters.⁴⁸ Holmes's modern critics speculate that the book nearly disappeared because the author's community recognized itself, and attempted to obliterate

this less than complimentary portrait of social manners in "the county of Kent, in Canada."⁴⁹

If the Canadian Monthly's review of Mrs. Huddleston's Bluebell (1875) may be taken as a reliable indication, Canadian readers righteously condemned fiction portraying flirtatious Canadian women who in any way resembled Holmes's irreverent heroine.

Unlike Belinda, Bluebell is less a social satire than a run-of-the-mill society novel, but its depiction of lively, coquettish Canadian maidens constituted, in the words of the Monthly, "a gross injustice . . . to Canadian girlhood," maligning "the purity of our domestic life, and the fair fame of our countrywomen."⁵⁰

Ephemeral society romances like Bluebell and Annie Savigny's A Romance of Toronto (1888) were attacked also by Kate M. Barry ("Vera") in her preface to her own contribution to the genre, Honor Edgeworth; or, Ottawa's Present Tense (1882). The purpose of Miss Barry's moralistic book was to "appeal to the minds and hearts of those women who are satisfied to remain slaves to the exactions of an unscrupulous society, at the sacrifice of their most womanly impulses, and their noblest energies."⁵¹

Presumably the proper Miss Barry would have supported the Winnipeg matron in "Zero"'s One Mistake (1886), who prudishly informed the heroine that "We don't use 'leg' in Canada."⁵²

So long as their reading respected the sanctity of Canadian womanhood and refrained from sexual impropriety, Victorian Canadians were prepared to enjoy fiction containing moderate amounts of

political, economic and religious satire. Sir Peter Pettysam (1882), "a satirical story of Canadian life marked by considerable ability," according to the Dominion Annual Register,⁵³ tackled nearly every aspect of Canadian life except sexuality. Its anonymous author demonstrated his respect for idealized domesticity by enclosing his direct attacks on Montreal's religious sectarianism and Scots-dominated economic community in a standard love story, for which he dropped his satiric stance.

Belinda, Sir Peter Pettysam and the fiction of Haliburton employed a comic satiric mode of eighteenth-century derivation to criticize nineteenth-century Canadian social attitudes and practices. Sara Jeannette Duncan's witty adaptations of Howellsian realism to delineate social manners also derived to some extent from an earlier form -- the social comedy of Jane Austen.⁵⁴ Very few writers attempted to transfer to Canada the form and concerns of the mid- and late-Victorian novel, whose sheer massiveness reconstructed a solid social order within which the individual tried to assert and discover his own identity, and whose challenge to society included the literary expression of sexual reality. Sexual decorum rather than sexual realism characterised Canadian fiction until well into the twentieth century, although several writers did try to break with Canada's romantic tradition which relegated sexual irregularity to the ancien régime, and permitted no more than discreet hints at sexual misdemeanors in contemporary Canadian life. Abraham Holmes's daring account of pre- and

extra-marital sexual activity in Canada West in the 1840's enjoyed no obvious successor until 1890, when Thomas Stinson Jarvis's Geoffrey Hampstead startled Toronto.

Geoffrey Hampstead, like Charles G. D. Roberts's The Heart That Knows (1906), exhibits a conflict between realistic content and romantic form. Jarvis's description of the levels and nuances of upper middle-class Toronto society effectively documents both the petty snobbery of the old families who discriminate against the nouveau riche Lintons, and the failure of the Lintons themselves to live up to their moral and familial responsibilities. While Mr. Linton spoils his child in the hope that she'll marry a "dook," and Mrs. Linton spends her time and money on charities for fallen women, their beautiful daughter Nina quietly goes her own way, falls under the spell of Geoffrey Hampstead, and melodramatically dies in a shipwreck, pregnant and unmarried. The novel centres on the disruptions to unromantic Toronto society caused by the entrance of Hampstead, a spectacularly handsome outsider. To study the effect of an amoral character on a very moral social order, Jarvis found it necessary to give Hampstead an inordinately romantic past to account for his lack of moral sense. Half-English, Hampstead turns out to be also half-Tartar, descended on his mother's side from primitive, thieving tribesmen whose contempt for western civilization both fascinates and disgusts Hampstead when he travels to Russia to discover his roots. Despite his thoroughly gentlemanly exterior, Hampstead

lives out his heritage when he seduces Nina, embezzles from the bank where he works, inadvertently causes Nina's death, nearly destroys his best friend, and eventually dies trying to swim the Niagara whirlpool. The romantic machinery which accounts for most of the flaws in this nevertheless fascinating novel includes not just Hampstead's maternal ancestry, but also the complex plot structure, which in the last hundred pages transforms the book from a serious study of character and society to a sensational detective novel.

Charles G. D. Roberts's The Heart That Knows (1906) similarly reveals the difficulties experienced by Canadian novelists in transferring their allegiance from romance to realism. As a study in social realism, the book effectively portrays the various attitudes expressed by members of a small New Brunswick community towards a girl who bears a child out of wedlock. As a novel, however, it depends upon a highly unrealistic plot. Very much a Canadian Tess in her confrontation with social convention, Luella Warden's difficulties are compounded by a jealous rival and a forged letter which by comparison make the accidental loss of Tess's crucial letter to Angel a very minor liberty on Hardy's part. Roberts's refusal to subscribe to Hardy's tragic vision leads him into even greater improbabilities, since his congenial resolution depends upon the romantic convention that unknown parents and children do intuitively recognize one another. He forces his novel towards a happy ending by having Luella's son

and his father melodramatically save each other's lives in the far East, leading to a cheerful reunion of the beleaguered little family. In its mixture of success and failure, The Heart That Knows indicates the pitfalls encountered in attempting to follow simultaneously the literary standards of Sara Jeannette Duncan and Goldwin Smith. Roberts's realistic treatment of society continually conflicts with his romantic viewpoint, which required that Ideality, Purity, Humanity and Chivalry ultimately prevail.

The tension between realism and romance which neither Jarvis nor Roberts could resolve in novels primarily concerned with social issues found a more congenial home in the regional novel, which became the dominant form of early twentieth-century Canadian fiction. In the wake of the local colour movement and the influence of the Scottish kailyard school,⁵⁵ which at the end of the nineteenth century changed the orientation of American and British fiction, turn-of-the-century Canadian writers turned to distinctive regions of their own country. In addition to Quebec, which had already been a favourite subject, they discovered the literary possibilities of Newfoundland (Norman Duncan), Prince Edward Island (L. M. Montgomery), various parts of the West and Northwest (Gilbert Parker and Ralph Connor), and rural Ontario (Adeline Teskey, Joanna Wood, Ralph Connor, R. L. Richardson). Despite its overtly romantic orientation, the local colour movement initiated a process of discovering their own territory that encouraged

serious Canadian writers to discard their rose-tinted romanticism, and to see their country through the blunter, more ironic glasses of twentieth-century realism. The direction which serious Canadian writers like Raymond Knister, Robert Stead, Martha Ostenso and Morley Callaghan were to pursue in the 1920's and '30's was forecast during the 1890's and early 1900's by two writers born in the same decade as Gilbert Parker and Ralph Connor, but more in touch with the movements in international literature which rejected popular romanticism. In their adaptations of two of the forms commonly used by the regional colourists, Sara Jeannette Duncan and Duncan Campbell Scott indicated that the exotic tale of the far North and the idyll of the small town, although usually treated romantically by their compatriots, could furnish good material for carefully controlled, realistic studies of the inter-relation of character, society and environment.

Scott's stories of the northern wilderness expand upon the concerns expressed in In the Village of Viger. In Scott's North, the struggle for physical and psychic survival, which in the Viger stories had been internalized by the characters, becomes instead an outer matter, as the harsh land elicits physical expressions of inner experience. The feelings most appropriate to the primal northern environment are the primal emotions of love and hate, loyalty and vengeance, which Scott's native Métis and established immigrants carry to their most violent conclusions. Stories like "The Triumph of Marie Laviolette" (1892), "Charcoal"

(1904), "Labrie's Wife" (1923), "Clute Boulay" (1934), and "Tête-Jaune" (1939) develop an anti-romantic correlation between character and environment as they show that in the North murder, shooting and vicious feuds are accepted by the local inhabitants as the normal manifestation of a harsh life in a harsh land. In another group of tales composed of "The Vain Shadow" (1900), "Vengeance is Mine" (1906), "Expiation" (1907) and "In the Year 1806" (1923), Scott contrasts the inevitable brutality of the North with refined civilization. He describes the effects of isolation and climactic severity upon outsiders who have been educated to respect a tradition of gentility, emotional sensitivity and consciousness of guilt, and consequently break under the strain of living in a social and physical environment which refuses to recognize such refinements. Similar to the way the tension between the encroaching city and the idyllic village embodies the psychic and emotional traumas of the Viger characters, the unbearable tension between European values and the raw Canadian North leads unprepared British traders to surrender and despair.

Scott led Canadian fiction into the twentieth century by examining the relation between character and environment in a thoroughly unromantic manner; in The Imperialist (1904) Sara Jeannette Duncan accomplished the transition from romance to realism within the form of the regional novel. Unlike Adeline Teskey's Mapleton, L. M. Montgomery's Avonlea, R. L. Richardson's Ontario "Scotch Settlement," Connor's Glengarry, and all the

other small Canadian communities immortalized in fiction in the first decades of the twentieth century, Duncan's Elgin is portrayed with more irony than nostalgia. Duncan pays glancing tribute to the prevailing tradition of local quaintness when she opens The Imperialist with a description of old Mother Beggarlegs, who "belonged to that group of odd characters, rarer now than they used to be, etched upon the vague consciousness of small towns in a way mysterious and uncanny."⁵⁶ But her cool assessment of Elgin's middle-class materialism quickly dispels any sense of sentimental reminiscence. A town where "No one could dream with impunity . . . except in bed" (p. 63), Elgin expects its citizens to manifest "sobriety and decorum" (p. 39). In Elgin, "religious fervour was not beautiful, or dramatic, or self-immolating; it was reasonable" (p. 92). Its citizens respect normality itself as a virtue, for "a difference is the one thing a small community, accustomed comfortably to scan its own intelligible averages, will not tolerate" (p. 62). Day to day life occupies the attention of a town where

The arts conspired to be absent; letters resided at the nearest university city; science was imported as required, in practical improvements. There was nothing, indeed, to interfere with Elgin's attention to the immediate, the vital, the municipal: one might almost read this contraction of interest in the white dust of the rambling streets, and the shutters closed against it (pp. 91-92).

In its values, Elgin presents a microcosm of Anglo-Saxon Canada; as Lorne Murchison notices, "Elgin market square, indeed, was

the biography of Fox Country and, in little, the history of the whole Province." (p. 117).

Such a narrow, determined community defies the possibility of romance or tragedy. The greatest allowable divergence from Elgin's revered normality, while still remaining within the bounds of acceptability, appears in the Murchison family, who contain a "strain of temperament" (p. 62) which subliminally threatens to develop into eccentricity or genius. Idiosyncratic in their humour, irregularity and decision to live in a rambling old house designed according to "large ideas" (p. 33), the otherwise unimpeachable family produces two remarkable children whose political and amorous involvements carry romantic idealism as far as it can go within Elgin's prosaic limits. Because Elgin's commonplace horizons can admit neither tragic nor saccharine resolutions to the experiences of its citizens, Duncan carefully balances the endings of the parallel adventures of Lorne and Advena. Advena's happy marriage to the man she loves is countered by the rejection of Lorne's idealistic imperialism by those he had considered his allies. In each case normality triumphs, as the couple who belong together are relieved of the idealism which kept them apart, and the political visionary is betrayed by a community which refuses to subordinate prosperity to ideology.

When Sara Jeannette Duncan put her own literary precepts into practice by writing a realistic novel of contemporary Canadian

life, she signalled the direction to be taken by the writers who rather belatedly brought Canadian fiction into the twentieth century during the decades following the First World War. Sara Jeannette Duncan and Duncan Campbell Scott were the two finest writers of prose fiction to come out of Victorian Canada because they possessed sufficient artistic acumen to reject the preference of their own community for Walter Scott-like romantic novels fulfilling the principles contained in Goldwin Smith's "Seven Lamps of Fiction." The simple fact that these two stand almost alone indicates that during the nineteenth century the history of the Canadian novel was a history not of rebellion, but of conformity.

NOTES TO CHAPTER IX

- ¹ Miss Foster ("T.D.F."), "The Neighbours," LG, n.s. 1 (July 1843), 309.
- ² "Book Notices," Massey's Magazine, 2 (July 1896), 73.
- ³ J. W. Longley, "Canadian Literature," Maritime Monthly, 2 (Sept. 1873), 259-60.
- ⁴ C.E.W., NDM, Nov.-Dec. 1874.
- ⁵ Edith Auburn, NDM, April-June, 1875.
- ⁶ F.T., BMM, 2 (Oct. 1877), 669-79.
- ⁷ Charles Pelham Mulvaney, RBCM, 5 (July 1880), 37-49.
- ⁸ LG, n.s. 2 (Aug. 1844), 376-78.
- ⁹ Non., LG, n.s. 2 (Sept. 1844), 413.
- ¹⁰ Non., LG, n.s. 2 (Oct. 1844), 451.
- ¹¹ Susanna Moodie to Anna Ricketson, 4 Sept. 1869, bMs Am 1131 (21), Houghton Library, Harvard University.
- ¹² "The Stepmother," LG, n.s. 5 (Feb.-June 1847); "Ida Beresford; or, The Child of Fashion," LG, n.s. 6 (Jan.-Sept. 1848); "Florence; or, Wit and Wisdom," LG, n.s. 7 (Feb.-Dec. 1849); "Eva Huntingdon," LG, n.s. 8 (Jan.-Dec. 1850); "Clarence Fitz-Clarence," LG, n.s. 9 (Jan.-May 1851).
- ¹³ "Editor's Table," Victoria Magazine, 1 (June 1848), 240.
- ¹⁴ John Talon-Lesperance, "The Literary Standing of the New Dominion," CIN, 15 (24 Feb. 1877), 118. "The Manor House of

de Villeraï" was translated into French, and published in book form as Le Manoir de Villeraï (1861).

15 Montreal Family Herald, 1 (11 Jan. 1860), 69.

16 Boston Pilot, 24 Jan.-26 Feb. 1859.

17 Rosanna Leprohon, Antoinette de Mirecourt; or Secret Marrying and Secret Sorrowing (Montreal: Lovell, 1864), p. 279.

18 Leprohon, Antoinette, pp. 327-28.

19 Leprohon, Antoinette, p. 364.

20 Leprohon, Antoinette, p. 358.

21 CMNR, 2 (July-Aug. 1872).

22 In his autobiography, Charles W. Gordon ("Ralph Connor") explained that one reason for the phenomenal popularity of his early novels was "the fact that, though in fiction form, they possess a definitely religious motif. Religion is here set forth in its true light as a synonym of all that is virile, straight, honorable and withal tender and gentle in true men and women. And it was this religious motif that startled that vast host of religious folk who up to this time had regarded novel-reading as doubtful indulgence for Christian people." Gordon, Postscript to Adventure (New York: Farrar & Rinehart, 1938), p. 150.

23 Margaret Robertson, Charles W. Gordon's maternal aunt, contributed to this genre with pious novels like Shenac's Work at Home. A Story of Canadian Life (1868) and The Bairns; or, Janet's Love and Service (1870). One of its most frequently encountered examples is The Adopted Daughter; or The Trials of Sabra. A Tale of Real Life (Montreal: Lovell, 1863). Its anonymous author has been identified as Sarah A. McDonald; see Jack Brown, "The Adopted Daughter Identified," Canadian Notes & Queries, No. 15 (July 1975), 11-12.

24 Mary E. Herbert, Woman as She Should Be; or, Agnes Wiltshire (Halifax: Mary E. Herbert, 1861), pp. 40-41.

25 Herbert, Woman As She Should Be, p. 8.

26 Herbert, Woman As She Should Be, p. 39.

27 Mrs. Savage, Miramichi (Boston: Loring, 1865), p. 8.

²⁸ Leman A. Guild, "Canadian Celebrities. No. 73 -- Agnes Maule Machar (Fidelis)," CM, 27 (Oct. 1906), 500.

²⁹ F. L. MacCallum, "Agnes Maule Machar," CM, 62 (Mar. 1924), 357.

³⁰ Agnes Maule Machar ("A.M.M."), Katie Johnston's Cross. A Canadian Tale (Toronto: Campbell, 1870), n. pag.

³¹ Machar, Katie Johnston's Cross, pp. 204-05.

³² Agnes Maule Machar ("Fidelis"), "Between the Lights -- With Old Books," The Week, 6 (19 April 1889), 311-12.

³³ Ebenezer Clemo ("Maple Knot"), The Life and Adventures of Simon Seek (Montreal: Lovell, 1858), p. 53.

³⁴ Clemo, Simon Seek, p. 144.

³⁵ Henry Morgan, Celebrated Canadians (Quebec: Hunter Rose, 1862), p. 766.

³⁶ Ebenezer Clemo, Canadian Homes; or, The Mystery Solved. A Christmas Tale (Montreal: Lovell, 1858), n. pag.

³⁷ "Grodenk," My Own Story. A Canadian Christmas Tale (Toronto: A. S. Irving, 1869), n. pag.

³⁸ "Grodenk," My Own Story, p. 138.

³⁹ See Dick Harrison, "The Beginnings of Prairie Fiction," JCF, No. 13 (1975), p. 170.

⁴⁰ Marilyn I. Davis, "Anglo-Boston Bamboozled on the Canadian Thames: Holmes's Belinda; Or, The Rivals," JCF, 2 No. 3 (Summer 1973), p. 57.

⁴¹ Abraham Holmes ("A.S.H."), Belinda; or, The Rivals (1843; rpt. Toronto: Anansi, 1975), p. 16.

⁴² Davis, p. 60.

⁴³ Carl Klinck, "Introduction," Belinda; or, The Rivals. A Tale of Real Life. by A.S.H. (1843; rpt. Vancouver: Alcuin, 1973), n. pag.

⁴⁴ Holmes, Belinda (Anansi), p. 119.

⁴⁵ Holmes, Belinda (Anansi), p. 121.

- 46 Holmes, Belinda (Anansi), p. 97.
- 47 Holmes, Belinda (Anansi), pp. 54-55.
- 48 Klinck, "Introduction," Belinda (Alcuin), n. pag.
- 49 Holmes, Belinda (Anansi), p. 4.
- 50 "Book Reviews," CMNR, 8 (Aug. 1875), 184.
- 51 Kate M. Barry ("Vera"), Honor Edgeworth, or, Ottawa's Present Tense (Ottawa: A. S. Woodburn, 1882), n. pag.
- 52 "Zero", One Mistake. A Manitoban Reminiscence (Montreal: Canada Bank Note Company, 1888), p. 71.
- 53 "Review of Literature, Science and Art," DAR, 1882, p. 275.
- 54 In his Outline of Canadian Literature (Toronto: Ryerson, 1927), p. 173, Lorne Pierce commented that "Mrs. Cotes has been likened to Jane Austen for her crisp humor, and for her photo-static reproduction of the social milieu."
- 55 See Elizabeth Waterston, "Canadian Cabbage, Canadian Rose," JCF, 2, No. 3 (Summer 1973), 129-31.
- 56 Sara Jeannette Duncan, The Imperialist (Toronto: Copp Clark, 1904), pp. 1-2. All subsequent quotations will be taken from this edition, and identified by page number.

CONCLUSION

As a literary realist, Sara Jeannette Duncan ushered in the mode of ironic realism that was to dominate Canadian fiction from the 1920's to the early 1960's. The local colour movement of the early 1900's helped prepare for this realism by refining a sense of locality and a concern with regional distinctiveness. In a 1959 discussion of "Local Colour in Canadian Fiction,"¹ William H. Magee argues that this interest in regionalism was "provincial," originating in a "regional pride" that rejected universal human issues in favour of complacently celebrating an idealized state of rural perfection. Magee's description of the romantic nature of this literature is indeed correct, but his assessment of its role in the development of the Canadian novel fails to take into account its importance as a transitional stage between nineteenth-century romance and mid-twentieth-century realism. Assuming that the novel was by definition romantic, the vast majority of nineteenth- and early twentieth-century Canadian writers and readers felt that Canadian material had to be fitted to the prevailing romantic forms. While Sir Walter Scott reigned

as the supreme romantic model, especially during the decades following Confederation, Canadian history was complacently tailored to Scott's pattern. When the local colour movement reached Canada in the 1890's and early 1900's, Canadian writers turned their romantic glasses from the past to the present and again attempted to fit "real" Canadian life to a romantic vision. Unlike the mid-Victorian evangelical realists, the local colourists rejected overt didacticism in favour of general wholesomeness, quiet humour and heart-warming sentimentality. It is indeed true that Ralph Connor's *West* contains disproportionately more sunsets than blizzards, L. M. Montgomery cultivates a garden-like image of Prince Edward Island, and the harshness of daily life in Norman Duncan's *Newfoundland* is continually undercut by his verbose sentimentality. But this generation of regionalists performed an important task by concentrating upon distinctive Canadian localities, thereby proving the validity of Canada as a location for fiction that did not depart from the mainstream of popular literature.

The history of the nineteenth-century Canadian novel is very much the history of the transferral to Canada of British and American popular literary tastes and prejudices. Throughout the nineteenth century, the English-Canadian novel was shaped by the literary and cultural attitudes of the community in which and for which it was written. Conservative and nationalistic,

this community often viewed prose fiction with suspicion and questioned whether Canada, as a fledgling nation, could possibly provide material suitable for the limited range of fiction its citizens found acceptable. Goldwin Smith summarized his adopted country's literary values by finding in the novels of Walter Scott the romance and idealism he described in his 1870 address on "The Lamps of Fiction." His most vocal opponent was Sara Jeannette Duncan, who argued wittily and consistently that old-fashioned romance was obsolete. The almost polar opposition between Smith's adulation of Scott and Duncan's contempt for Scott-like romance provides an indigenous critical framework in which to discuss nineteenth-century Canadian fiction.

Beginning with Julia Catherine Beckwith Hart, Canada's first native novelist, Canadian writers tried to produce local fiction by finding Canadian equivalents for European romantic conventions. The work of John Richardson and his successors reveals how their insistence that Canadian fiction be romantic meant that their novels were usually more faithful to the model of Fenimore Cooper or Walter Scott than to the actualities of Canadian life. Even the few novels whose contents challenged the Canadian establishment hesitated to depart from the form established by Scott; M. A. Foran's "The Other Side" (1872),² the most radical nineteenth-century novel discovered by Frank Watt in his search for Canada's literature of protest, resorts to an impossibly complex web of romantic plot devices to describe the triumph of unionism and

the defeat of bloodthirsty capitalists.

The historical romance held an especially strong appeal for nationalistic Canadian novelists, who saw historical fiction as a means to discover and recover Canadian history, and develop a national identity. In 1887 Graeme Mercer Adam and Ethelwyn Wetherald collaborated in the writing of An Algonquin Maiden, "A Romance of the Early Days of Upper Canada," in order to prescribe historical romance as the proper mode for Canadian fiction. The influence of Parkman, Longfellow and Canadian popularizers of history like J. M. LeMoine sent many Canadian writers to Quebec and Acadia, which provided settings for fiction ranging in form and quality from William Kirby's ponderous The Golden Dog (1877), to the slick historical romances of Gilbert Parker and Charles G. D. Roberts, to the penetrating stories and novels of Susan Frances Harrison and Duncan Campbell Scott.

Victorian Canada's preference for romantic fiction becomes especially obvious and obtrusive in novels purporting to depict contemporary experience. Interested not in prosaic reality, but in "the romance of real life," nineteenth-century Canadian writers constructed improbable plots to convey edifying messages regarding religious and sexual morality, the value of hard work, and the inevitable triumph of virtue. Only a few writers saw the novel as a genre which could be used to criticize, rather than reinforce, social convention: Abraham Holmes in his rollicking Bélinda; or,

The Rivals (1843), Thomas Stinson Jarvis in Geoffrey Hamstead (1890), and Charles G. D. Roberts in The Heart That Knows (1906).

When the nineteenth-century Canadian novel is studied in relation to its cultural context, some of the reasons underlying its problems become clearer. So long as every Canadian novelist was trying to be the Canadian Walter Scott, Canadian fiction was forced into a romantic mould, consisting of elaborate, improbable plots, elegant, formal language, and stereotypical heroes and heroines whose adventures bore little relation to actual Canadian experience. Hence a curious pattern arose in Canadian fiction. Beginning with the books of John Richardson and continuing into the early years of the twentieth century, many Canadian novels took the form of a series of realistic sketches of Canadian locations, life, or eccentric minor characters, bound together by a plot-heavy unrealistic narrative recounting the adventures of idealized heroic characters. Robert Barr's The Measure of the Rule (1906), accurately described by Louis MacKendrick as an account of "keenly felt autobiographical experience subjected to and at times overwhelmed by a sentimental and formulaic romanticism,"³ epitomizes this structure. For the modern reader, Barr's bitter condemnation of the senselessly rigid rules and regulations governing Normal School students loses much of its impact because his unrealistic characters engage in adventures resembling the enactment of naive romantic fantasy.

Robert Barr's novels support Desmond Pacey's 1945 generalization that "Our novelists of the past, with a few honourable exceptions, have been cautious souls, afraid to incur the wrath of the public, and producing either sugar-coated tracts or novels of escape."⁴ Pacey's remark suggests that the place of the serious novelist is at the vanguard of social and artistic progress, and that out of faithfulness to their art, conscientious Canadian writers should have repudiated their community's taste for harmless, edifying literature. As the preceding study has shown, incurring the wrath of the public was the last thing most nineteenth-century Canadian writers -- with the exception of Sara Jeannette Duncan -- had in mind. Far from conflicting with their society, these writers shared and stabilized its literary attitudes. They viewed their proper place as the mainstream, not the forefront, of artistic and social thought. Hence the primary value of their work lies not in its artistic accomplishment, which was frequently negligible, but in its reflection of cultural attitudes. Judged by international artistic standards, most nineteenth-century Canadian fiction demonstrates little merit. When viewed within its own cultural context, however, this literature provides valuable insights into the relation between cultural attitudes and literary performance in a community struggling towards self-awareness. To borrow Sam Slick's already borrowed phrase, nineteenth-century Canadian fiction "holds up the mirror" to Victorian

Canada. It reflects the upright conservatism of a colonial society which believed that nationhood would be achieved by transferring the most honourable traditions of the Old World to the New. Against the continual threat of American cultural domination, Victorian Canada affirmed and reaffirmed its belief that a national literature must be patriotic and optimistic, based on the models of Shakespeare and Scott. In fiction, this literary conservatism manifested itself formally when the editor of the Acadian Magazine demanded that a tale be rewritten with a happy ending,⁵ politically when the Literary Garland disapproved of the reformism of Dickens and Disraeli,⁶ morally when The Week vehemently condemned Zola's naturalism,⁷ and aesthetically in the country's universal taste for idealistic romance.

In his conclusion to his Outline of Canadian Literature (1927), Lorne Pierce encapsulated nineteenth-century Canada's view of its literature. In 1927, the mainstream of Canadian literary criticism still flowed in the direction established by its Victorian inheritance, and had not yet been touched by the efforts of the generation of A. J. M. Smith and Dorothy Livesay to bring Canadian literature into the twentieth century. Pierce revealed some critical acumen when he described the faults of Canadian writers as "diffuse style, shadowy characters, and ephemeral thinking." The Canadian writer's realism, Pierce admitted, "does not extend beyond things to character, and being

unable to penetrate to the heart of man, he stands apart and offers a moral epigram as a substitute."⁸ In this Pierce said nothing new; similar charges had been levied against Canadian novelists by J. G. Bourinot. Pierce perpetuated the opinions of his Victorian predecessors like Bourinot, Goldwin Smith and W. A. Fraser most noticeably when he singled out the commendable characteristics of Canadian literature. He found Canadian literature to be distinguished by "simplicity and sincerity," "optimism," "courage," a "pioneering spirit," "power and rugged dignity," and independence. He praised Canadian writers for maintaining decorum, assuring his readers that "With all our simplicity we rarely become so naive as to ask improper or embarrassing questions, and those who do so are promptly labelled erotic and so done to death for ever."⁹ Pierce also approved of the way Canadian realism "lacks the stern philosophy and morbid psychology of the Continent, and on the whole is more optimistic and wholesome."¹⁰ After the First World War, Goldwin Smith's seven "Lamps of Fiction" still glowed brightly.

Lorne Pierce continued the literary conservatism of his Victorian forebears not just in his cultural attitudes, but also in his belief that these values were shared by the international literary community at large. At the same time as he commended Canadian writers for their rejection of eroticism and pessimism, he praised their "cosmopolitanism," observing that "There is still a great deal that is narrow, bigoted and parochial among

us, but we are possessed of a broad outlook" which "has imparted to our literature a certain catholicity and eager expectancy."¹¹

Pierce performed an interesting feat of critical gymnastics when he found "catholicity" in the literature of a nation dedicated to preserving the cultural values it defined as the tradition of Walter Scott. Modern catholicity and cosmopolitanism reached Canada piecemeal in the 1920's, tentatively when Duncan Campbell Scott rejected Victorianism and supported T. S. Eliot's rediscovery of John Donne in "Poetry and Progress" (1922),¹² more expansively when A. J. M. Smith tried to yank Canada out of its provincialism in his critical essays, "Contemporary Poetry" (1926) and "Wanted: Canadian Criticism" (1928).¹³ This new criticism ushered in a new era of modernism in Canadian poetry and realism in Canadian fiction. Yet the romantic mode has never ceased to attract Canadian writers. In an important recent article titled "Novel and Romance," T. D. MacLulich argues that the development of Canadian fiction does not reveal a steady progression towards realism, but a continual "tension between the romance and the novel, between 'romantic' and 'realistic' ways of portraying the world."¹⁴ This tension appears not just in the difficulties Sara Jeannette Duncan experienced in trying to convert her contemporaries to literary realism, but also in many novels written after realism supposedly began to dominate Canadian fiction. The short stories of Duncan Campbell Scott reveal that in the hands of a true craftsman, the tension between romance and realism can become a

source of artistic strength. As Canadian writers developed a secure idiom, technical skill and confidence in Canadian subjects for fiction, their romantic inclinations ceased to obtrude. The modern Canadian novel encompasses a wide range of romantic and realistic attitudes; the achievement of many twentieth-century writers has not been to subdue romance, but to master it and modernize it, in books like Howard O'Hagan's Tay John (1939) and Sheila Watson's The Double Hook (1959). A number of novelists who are commonly regarded as realists, like Grove, Callaghan and MacLennan, have revealed their sympathy with the romantic mode in their use of idealized characters and unlikely situations. Moreover, in the 1960's and 1970's some of the best and most popular Canadian novelists, like Robertson Davies, Leonard Cohen, Margaret Atwood, Marian Engel, Robert Kroetsch and Rudy Wiebe, have evolved updated versions of romance. Their use of subjective narrative forms departs from the objective realism which dominated Canadian fiction from about 1920 to 1960, and reveals a resurgence of interest in the kind of imaginative experience associated with fantasy and romance.

NOTES TO CONCLUSION

¹ William H. Magee, "Local Colour in Canadian Fiction," University of Toronto Quarterly, 28 (June 1959), 176-89.

² M. A. Foran, "The Other Side," Ontario Workman, 1 (27 June 1872-27 Feb. 1873). See F. W. Watt, "Literature of Protest," in Literary History of Canada, ed. Carl F. Klinck (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1967), p. 465.

³ Louis MacKendrick, "Introduction," The Measure of the Rule by Robert Barr (1906; rpt. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1973), p. xv.

⁴ Desmond Pacey, "The Canadian Novel" (1945), rpt. in Essays in Canadian Criticism (Toronto: Ryerson, 1969), p. 25.

⁵ See above pp. 160-61.

⁶ See above p. 64.

⁷ See above pp. 58-59.

⁸ Lorne Pierce, Outline of Canadian Literature (Toronto: Ryerson, 1927), pp. 241-42.

⁹ Pierce, p. 239.

¹⁰ Pierce, p. 242.

¹¹ Pierce, p. 240.

¹² Duncan Campbell Scott, "Poetry and Progress. Presidential address delivered before the Royal Society of Canada, May 17, 1922," rpt. in The Circle of Affection (Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 1947).

¹³ A. J. M. Smith, "Contemporary Poetry," McGill Fortnightly Review, 2 (15 Dec. 1926); "Wanted: Canadian Criticism," Canadian Forum, 8 (April 1928). Both rpt. in Dudek and Gnarowski, ed., The Making of Modern Poetry in Canada (Toronto: Ryerson, 1968).

¹⁴ T. D. MacLulich, "Novel and Romance," Canadian Literature, No. 70 (Autumn 1976), p. 43.

A SELECTED BIBLIOGRAPHY

The following bibliography is divided into two sections: Primary Sources, which includes all nineteenth-century materials cited or consulted, and Secondary Sources, which lists modern criticism, including Master's theses and dissertations, related to the study of nineteenth-century Canadian fiction. The list of Primary Sources is itself divided into two sections. Part A includes all works of fiction referred to in the text of this dissertation or consulted during research; Part B lists all such non-fictional sources, including criticism, book reviews, and archival material. This Selected Bibliography is followed by an Annotated Bibliography of Periodicals, describing all nineteenth-century Canadian periodicals cited or consulted.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

I. Primary Sources.

A. Fiction.

A. "The Heiress; An Adventure at the Springs." Literary Garland, 2 (March, 1840), 161-64.

Adam, Graeme Mercer, and Wetherald, Ethelwyn. An Algonquin Maiden. A Romance of the Early Days of Upper Canada. Montreal: Lovell, Toronto: Williamson, 1887.

Allen, Grant. The Woman Who Did. Boston: Roberts, 1895.

Angers, Félicité [Laure Conan pseud.]. Angéline de Montbrun. 1881; rpt. Montreal: Fides, 1967.

Anon. "The Bleeding Heart." Canadian Magazine and Literary Repository, 4 (April 1825), 330-32.

----- "The Cavalier in France. A Tale of the Seventeenth Century." Canadian Magazine and Literary Repository, 3 (Nov. 1824), 437-45.

----- "The First Cow. A Story of the Backwoods." Literary Garland, n.s. 2 (Aug. 1844), 376-78.

----- "Fitz Aubert; A Tale of the Times of the Commonwealth." Acadian Magazine, 1 (July-Dec. 1826).

----- "The Purser's Cabin." Anglo-American Magazine, 5 (July 1854)-6 (June 5 1855).

----- "The Secret Passage; A Tale of Ottawa City." Rose-Belford's Canadian Monthly, 8 (Feb. 1882), 184-91.

Anon. Sir Peter Pettysham. A Story of Canadian Life. Montreal:
Canada Railway News, [1882].

-----". "Sketches of Village Life." Literary Garland, 3
(Jan.-May 1841).

-----". "A Tale of the Red River." Anglo-American Magazine,
7 (July 1855), 44-49.

Armour, Agatha. Lady Rosamond's Secret. A Romance of Fredericton.
Saint John: Telegraph Printing & Publishing Office, 1878.

Aubert de Gaspé, Philippe. Les Anciens Canadiens. 1862; rpt.
Montreal: Fides, 1967.

Auburn, Edith. "Loss and Gain; or, The Bensons." New Dominion
Monthly, April-June 1875.

Aylmer, Hamilton. "Alciphron Leicester." Victoria Magazine,
1 (Jan.-March 1848).

Barr, Robert. Cardillac. London: Mills & Boon, 1909.

-----". The Face and the Mask. New York: Stokes, 1895.

-----". The Girl in the Case. London: Eveleigh Nash, 1910.

-----". The Helping Hand. London: Mills & Boon, 1920.

-----". In a Steamer Chair and Other Shipboard Stories.
London: Chatto & Windus, 1892.

-----". In the Midst of Alarms. 1893; rpt. New York: Stokes,
1894.

-----". Jennie Baxter, Journalist. New York: Stokes, 1898.

-----". The Lady Electra. London: Methuen, 1904.

-----". The Long Arm. Toronto: Briggs, 1899.

-----". Lord Stranleigh, Philanthropist. London: Ward Lock, 1911.

-----". The Measure of the Rule. London: Constable, 1906.
Rpt. with an Introduction by Louis K. MacKendrick, Toronto:
University of Toronto Press, 1973.

-----". The Mutable Many. New York: Stokes, 1896.

- Barr, Robert. A Prince of Good Fellows. New York: McClure, 1902.
- , A Rock in the Baltic. Toronto: McLeod & Allen, 1906.
- , The Speculations of John Steele. New York: Stokes, 1904.
- , The Sword Maker. A Romance of Love and Adventure.
Toronto: McLeod & Allen, 1910.
- , Tekla. A Romance of Love and War. New York: Grosset
& Dunlap, 1898.
- , The Tempestuous Petticoat. London: Collins, [1904].
Also published as A Chicago Princess. New York: Grosset
& Dunlap, 1904.
- , The Triumphs of Eugène Valmont. New York: Appleton,
1906.
- , The Victors. A Romance of Yesterday Morning and This
Afternoon. New York: Stokes, 1901.
- , A Woman Intervenes. New York: Stokes, 1895.
- , Young Lord Stranleigh. London: Ward Lock, 1908.
- Barry, Kate M. [Vera pseud.]. Honor Edgeworth; or, Ottawa's Present
Tense. Ottawa: Woodburn, 1882.
- Bates, Walter. The Mysterious Stranger. 1817; rpt. Saint John,
Geo. W. Day, 1895.
- Bayley, Mrs. "The Elopement." Literary Garland, n.s. 1 (Jan.-
Feb. 1843).
- Begg, Alexander. Dot-It-Down. A Story of Life in the North-West.
Toronto: Hunter, Rose, 1871.
- Bloomfield, Harry. "Richard Craighton," Literary Garland, n.s.
5 (Jan.-June 1847).
- Bourinot, John George. "Marguerite. A Tale of Forest Life in the
New Dominion." New Dominion Monthly, Jan.-June 1870.
- , "The Mystery at Château des Ormeaux," Stewart's
Literary Quarterly, 3 (Oct. 1869), 242-51.
- , "The Old Japanese Cabinet." Canadian Monthly and
National Review, 12 (Aug. 1877), 139-52.

Bourinot, John George. "Stories We Heard Among the Pines." Stewart's Literary Quarterly, 5 (Oct. 1872), 242-68.

------. "What Happened at Beaumanoir One Christmas Eve." Canadian Illustrated News, 2 (24-30 Dec. 1870).

Brooke, Frances. The History of Emily Montague. 4 vols. London: Dodsley, 1769.

Brown, W. H. She Might Have Done Better. A Novel. 2 vols. St. John's P. Q.: The News Steam Printing House, 1877.

Burnham, Hampden. Jack Ralston, or, The Outbreak of the Nascopees. London: Nelson, 1903.

C. "The Old Man's Tale." Literary Garland, n.s. 3 (Jan. 1845), 41-45.

Caldwell, Ned. "Sam Horton's Last Trip." Literary Garland, n.s. 1 (Dec. 1843), 522-24.

Campbell, John [J. Cawdor Bell pseud.]. Two Knapsacks: A Novel of Canadian Summer Life. Toronto: Williamson, 1892.

Campbell, Wilfred. A Beautiful Rebel. A Romance of Upper Canada in Eighteen Hundred and Twelve. Toronto: Westminster, 1909.

Cheney, Mrs. Harriet [H.V.C. pseud.]. "The Fort of St. Johns, a Tale of the New World." Literary Garland, n.s. 7 (Jan.-July 1849).

------. "Jacques Cartier and the Little Indian Girl." Literary Garland, n.s. 6 (Oct.-Dec. 1848).

------. "A Legend of the Lake." Literary Garland, n.s. 9 (Feb. 1851), 74-79.

------. "The Old Manuscript. A M  moire of the Past." Literary Garland, n.s. 9 (April-Sept. 1851).

Clemon, Ebenezer [Maple Knot pseud.]. Canadian Homes; or, The Mystery Solved. A Christmas Tale. Montreal: Lovell, 1858.

------. The Life and Adventures of Simon Seek, or, Canada in All Shapes. Montreal: Lovell, 1858.

Collins, Edmund. Annette, The M  tis Spy; A Heroine of the N. W. Rebellion. Toronto: Rose, 1886.

Connor, Ralph. See Gordon, Charles W.

Cooper, C. W. "Jessie's Lawsuit." Canadian Monthly and National Review, 2 (July 1872), 25-36.

Crawford, Isabella Valancy. Selected Stories. Edited and introduced by Penny Petrone. Ottawa: University of Ottawa Press, 1975.

Cushing, Mrs. E. L. [E.L.C. pseud.]. "A Canadian Legend." Literary Garland, 1 (March 1839), 167-80.

D., W.I. "My Grandfather's Ghost Story." Belford's Monthly Magazine, 3 (Feb. 1878), 301-08.

D., W.J. "A Romance of the Arlington Hops." Belford's Monthly Magazine, 1 (March 1877), 534-47.

De Mille, James. The American Baron. New York: Harper, 1871.

-----. Among the Brigands. Boston: Lee & Shepard, 1871.
(Young Dodge Club Series)

-----. The Babes in the Wood. A Tragic Comedy. A Story of the Italian Revolution of 1848. Boston: Gill, 1875.

-----. The "B.O.W.C." [Brethren of the White Cross]. Boston: Lee & Shepard, 1869.

-----. The Boys of Grand Pré School. Boston: Lee & Shepard, 1870. (B.O.W.C. Series)

-----. A Castle in Spain. A Novel. New York: Harper, 1883.

-----. A Comedy of Terrors. Boston: Osgood, 1872.

-----. Cord and Creese. New York: Harper, 1869.

-----. The Cryptogram. New York: Harper, 1870.

-----. The Dodge Club; or, Italy in 1859. New York: Harper, 1869.

-----. Fire in the Woods. Boston: Lee & Shepard, 1871.
(B.O.W.C. Series)

-----. Helena's Household. A Tale of Rome in the First Century. 1867; rpt. London: Nelson, 1883.

-----. The Lady of the Ice. A Novel. New York: Appleton, 1870.

De Mille, James. The Lily and the Cross. A Tale of Acadia. Boston: Lee & Shepard, 1874.

-----: The Living Link. A Novel. New York: Harper, 1874.

-----: Lost in the Fog. Boston: Lee & Shepard, 1870.
(B.O.W.C. Series).

-----: The Martyr of the Catacombs. A Tale of Ancient Rome. 1865; rpt. New York: Hunt & Eaton, n.d.

-----: Old Garth. A Story of Sicily. New York: Munro, 1883.

-----: An Open Question. A Novel. New York: Appleton, 1873.

-----: Picked Up Adrift. Boston: Lee & Shepard, 1872.
(B.O.W.C. Series)

-----: The Seven Hills. Boston: Lee & Shepard, 1873. (Young Dodge Club Series)

-----: A Strange Manuscript Found in a Copper Cylinder. New York: Harper, 1888.

-----: The Treasure of the Seas. Boston: Lee & Shepard, 1873. (B.O.W.C. Series).

-----: The Winged Lion; or, Stories of Venice. 1877; rpt. New York: Dillingham, 1899.

Dent, John Charles. The Gerrard St. Mystery and Other Weird Tales. Toronto: Rose, 1888.

Devon, H. T. "Leaves From the Life Romance of Merne Dillamer." British American Magazine, 2 (Dec. 1863-Feb. 1874).

Dobbin, Mrs. [George Graham pseud]. Thos. A Simple Canadian Story. Montreal: Lovell, 1878.

Dougall, Lily. Beggars All. London: Longmans, 1891.

-----: The Madonna of a Day. London: Bentley, 1896.

Duncan, Norman. The Way of the Sea. New York: McClure Phillips, 1903.

Duncan, Sara Jeannette. An American Girl in London. Toronto: Williamson, 1891.

- Duncan, Sara Jeannette. The Burnt Offering. 1909; rpt. London: Methuen, 1919.
- . The Consort. London: Stanley Paul, 1912.
- . Cousin Cinderella. A Canadian Girl in London. Toronto: Macmillan, 1908.
- . The Crow's Nest. New York: Dodd, Mead, 1901.
- . A Daughter of To-day. New York: Appleton, 1894.
- . His Honour and a Lady. Toronto: Rose, 1896.
- . His Royal Happiness. New York: Appleton, 1914.
- . The Imperialist. Toronto: Copp Clark, 1904.
- . The Path of a Star. 1899; rpt. London: Collins, n.d.
- . The Pool in the Desert. New York: Appleton, 1903.
- . Set in Authority. London: Constable, 1906.
- . The Simple Adventures of a Memsahib. New York: Appleton, 1893.
- . The Story of Sonny Sahib. London: Macmillan, 1904.
- . Those Delightful Americans. New York: Appleton, 1902.
- . Title Clear. A Novel. London: Hutchinson, [1922].
- . Vernon's Aunt. Being the Oriental Experiences of Miss Lavinia Moffatt. London: Chatto, 1894.
- . A Voyage of Consolation. (Being in the nature of a sequel to the experiences of "An American Girl in London"). New York: Appleton, 1898.
- Dunlop, William [A Backwoodsman pseud.]. Two and Twenty Years Ago. 1859; rpt. as "In the Thick of It." Dominion Illustrated Weekly, 3 (12 Oct. 1889)-4 (18 Jan. 1890).
- Fairchild, G. M. A Ridiculous Courting and Other Stories of French Canada. Chicago: Donelley, 1900.
- Faverel, Arthur. "Rosalba; or, Faithful to Two Lovers." Canadian Illustrated News, 1 (19 March-16 April 1870).

- Fleet, William Henry [Hon. Francis Thistleton pseud.]. How I Came to Be Governor of the Island of Cacona. Montreal: Ramsay, 1852.
- Fleming, May Agnes. Kate Danton; or Captain Danton's Daughters. New York: Carleton, 1876.
- Foran, M. A. "The Other Side!" Ontario Workman, 1 (27 June 1872-27 Feb. 1873).
- Forrest, E. W. Ned Fortescue; or, Roughing It Through Life. Ottawa: Hunter Rose, 1869.
- Fraser, W. A. The Lone Furrow. New York: Appleton, 1907.
- G., E.C. "A Ghostly Warning." Belford's Monthly Magazine, 3 (Jan. 1878), 251-65.
- Galt, John. Lawrie Todd; or, The Settlers in the Woods. 3 vols. London: Colburn & Bentley, 1830.
- Gibson, John. "The Hermit of St. Maurice." Literary Garland, 1 (Dec. 1838), 5-15.
- Gordon, Charles W. [Ralph Connor pseud.]. Black Rock. A Tale of The Selkirks. Toronto: Westminster, 1898.
- , The Man From Glengarry. A Tale of the Ottawa. Toronto: Westminster, 1901.
- , The Sky Pilot. A Tale of the Foothills. Chicago: Revell, 1899.
- Grainger, M. Allerdale. Woodsmen of the West. 1908; rpt. Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 1964.
- Grey, Francis W. The Curé of St. Philippe. 1899; rpt. Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 1970.
- Grodenk pseud. My Own Story. A Canadian Christmas Tale. Toronto: Irving, 1869.
- H., J.A. "The Story of Jenny Stuart." New Dominion Monthly, 2 (Sept. 1868), 335-39.
- Haliburton, Thomas Chandler. The Clockmaker; or The Sayings and Doings of Samuel Slick, of Slickville. Halifax: Joseph Howe, 1836.

Haliburton, Thomas Chandler. Nature and Human Nature. 1855; rpt.
London: Hurst and Blackett, 1859

----- . The Old Judge; or, Life in a Colony. 2 vols. London:
Colburn, 1849.

Harrison, Susan Frances [Seranus pseud.]. Crowded Out! and Other
Sketches. Ottawa: Evening Journal Office, 1886.

----- . The Forest of Bourg-Marie. Toronto: Morang, 1898.

----- . Pine, Rose and Fleur de Lis. Toronto: Bart, 1891.

----- . Ringfield. A Novel. Toronto: Musson [1912].

Hart, Julia Catherine Beckwith. St. Ursula's Convent, or, The
Nun of Canada. Containing Scenes from Real Life. 2 vols.
Kingston: Hugh C. Thomson, 1824.

----- . Tonnewonte, or The Adopted Son of America. A Tale,
Containing Scenes from Real Life. Watertown, N. Y.: Adams,
1825.

Harte, W. Blackburn. "Noblesse Oblige. A British Society Novel,
By a Crowned Head." Dominion Illustrated Weekly, 1 (28 July
1888), 58-59.

----- . "Something in the Wild West." Dominion Illustrated
Weekly, 1 (24 Nov.-1 Dec. 1888).

Heavysege, Charles. The Advocate. A Novel. Montreal: Worthing-
ton, 1865.

Herbert, Mary E. Woman As She Should Be; or, Agnes Wiltshire.
Halifax: Mary E. Herbert, 1861.

Holiwell, Mrs. "The Settler's Daughter." British American Magazine,
1 (June 1863)-2 (Nov. 1863).

Holmes, Abraham S. [A.S.H. pseud.]. Belinda, or The Rivals. A Tale
of Real Life. 1843; rpt. with an Introduction by Carl F.
Klinck. Vancouver: Alcuin, 1970. Rpt. Toronto: Anansi, 1975.

Huddleston, Mrs. G. C. Bluebell: A Canadian Society Novel. Toronto:
Belford, 1875.

Huntingdon, Hon. L. S. Professor Conant: A Story of English and
American Social and Political Life. New York: Worthington, 1884.

Huyghue, Douglas [Eugene pseud.]. Argimou: A Legend of the MicMac.
Halifax: Morning Courier Office, 1847.

Jarvis, Thomas Stinson. Geoffrey Hampstead. Toronto: National
Publishing, 1890.

----- . She Lived in New York. New York: Judge, 1894.

Kirby, William. The Chien D'Or. The Golden Dog. A Legend of Quebec.
New York and Montreal: Lovell, Adam, Wesson, 1877.

Laut, Agnes C. Lords of the North. New York: Taylor, 1900.

Leprohon, Rosanna Eleanor Mullins. "Ada Dunmore; or, A Memorable
Christmas Eve. An Autobiography." Canadian Illustrated News,
1 (25 Dec. 1869-12 Feb. 1870).

----- . Antoinette de Mirecourt; or, Secret Marrying and Secret
Sorrowing. Montreal: Lovell, 1864.

----- . Armand Durand; or, A Promise Fulfilled. Montreal:
Lovell, 1868.

----- . "Clarence Fitz-Clarence!" Literary Garland, n.s. 9 (Jan.-
May 1851).

----- . "Clive Weston's Wedding Anniversary." Canadian Monthly
and National Review, 2 (July-Aug. 1872).

----- . "Eva Huntingdon!" Literary Garland, n.s. 8 (Jan.-Dec. 1850).

----- . "Eveleen O'Donnell!" Boston Pilot, 24 Jan.-26 Feb. 1859.

----- . "Florence; or, Wit and Wisdom!" Literary Garland, n.s.
7 (Feb.-Dec. 1849).

----- . "Ida Beresford; or, The Child of Fashion!" Literary Garland,
n.s. 6 (Jan.-Sept. 1848).

----- . "The Manor House of De Villeraï!" Montreal Family Herald,
1 (16 Nov. 1859-8 Feb. 1860).

----- . "My Visit to Fairview Villa." Canadian Illustrated News,
1 (14 May-28 May 1870).

----- . "A School-girl Friendship." Canadian Illustrated News,
16 (25 Aug.-15 Sept. 1877).

Leprohon, Rosanna Eleanor Mullins. "The Stepmother." Literary Garland, n.s. 5 (Feb.-June 1847).

-----". "Who Stole the Diamonds." Canadian Illustrated News, 11 (2 Jan.-9 Jan. 1875).

Lesperance, John-Talon. The Bastonnais: Tale of the American Invasion of Canada in 1775-76. Toronto: Belford, 1877.

-----". "A Missiquoi Holiday." Dominion Illustrated Weekly, 1 (7 July-14 July 1888).

-----". Tuque Bleue. A Christmas Snowshoe Sketch. Montreal: Dawson, 1882.

Lighthall, W. D. The False Chevalier. Montreal: Grafton, 1898.

-----". The Master of Life. A Romance of the Five Nations and of Prehistoric Montreal. Toronto: Musson, 1908.

-----". The Young Seigneur; or, Nation Making. Montreal: Drysdale, 1888.

Lowell, Robert Traill Spence. New Priest in Conception Bay. 1857; rpt. Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 1974.

McCarroll, James. "The Adventures of a Night." Anglo-American Magazine, 6 (Dec. 1854), 553-60.

McDonald, Sarah A. The Adopted Daughter; or, The Trails of Sabra. A Tale of Real Life. Montreal: Lovell, 1863.

MacDonell, Blanche L. Diane of Ville Marie. A Romance of French Canada. Toronto: Briggs, 1898.

-----". "The Heroism of La Petite Marie." Rose-Belford's Canadian Monthly, 5 (Sept. 1880), 309-16.

Machar, Agnes Maule [Fidelis pseud.]. Down the River to the Sea. New York: Home Book Co., 1894.

-----". "For King and Country." Canadian Monthly and National Review, 3 (Feb.-June 1874). Toronto: Adam Stevenson, 1874.

-----". The Heir of Fairmount Grange. London: Digby Long; Toronto: Copp Clark [1895].

- Machar, Agnes Maule [Fidelis pseud.]. Katie Johnston's Cross. A Canadian Tale. Toronto: Campbell, 1870.
- ".Lost and Won. A Canadian Romance! Canadian Monthly and National Review. 7 (Jan. 1875)-8 (Dec. 1875).
- ". Marjorie's Canadian Winter. A Story of the Northern Lights. Boston: Lothrop, 1893.
- ". Roland Graeme: Knight. A Novel of Our Time. Montreal: Drysdale, 1892.
- Mackenzie, G. A. "Selma: A Tale of the Summer Holidays," Canadian Monthly and National Review, 12 (Aug.-Oct. 1877).
- McKibbin, Rev. A. [Mack Gloie pseud.]. The Old Orchard. Toronto: Briggs, 1903.
- McKinnon, William Charles. Frances, or, Pirate Cove. A Legend of Cape-Breton. Halifax: Office of the "British North American," 1851.
- ". St. Castine: A Legend of Cape-Breton. Cape Breton Herald Office, 1850.
- ". St. George: or, The Canadian League. 2 vols. Halifax: Fuller, 1852.
- MacLachlan, Mrs. [E.M.M. pseud.]. "The Pride of Lorette. A Tale Founded on Fact." Literary Garland, 2 (July 1840), 337-51.
- McLennan, William. In Old France and New. New York: Harper, 1899.
- ". Spanish John. New York: Harper, 1897.
- and J. N. McIlwraith. The Span o' Life. A Tale of Louisbourg and Quebec. New York: Harper, 1899.
- Marquis, T. G. Marguerite de Roberval. A Romance of the Days of Jacques Cartier. Toronto: Copp Clark, 1899.
- Medical Student, AA pseud. "A Pedestrian Excursion." Anglo-American Magazine, 3-3 (Oct. 1853)-4^b (Feb. 1854).
- Monk, Maria pseud. The Character of a Convent. Displayed in the Awful Disclosures of Maria Monk. 1836; rpt. London: Houlston & Stoneman, 1851.

- Moodie, Susanna. "Achbor: An Oriental Tale." Canadian Literary Magazine, 1 (April 1833), 45-49; Victoria Magazine, 1 (July 1848), 253-56.
- . "The First Debt. A Tale of Every Day." Literary Garland, 3 (April-Nov. 1841).
- . Flora Lyndsay: or, Passages in an Eventful Life. New York: De Witt & Davenport [1854]. First serialized in the Literary Garland in two parts: "Trifles from the Burthen of a Life," LG, n.s. 9 (March-July 1851); "Noah Cotton: A Tale of Conscience," LG, n.s. 9 (Sept.-Dec. 1851).
- . Geoffrey Moncton: or, The Faithless Guardian. New York: De Witt & Davenport, 1855. First serialized in the Literary Garland, 2 (Dec. 1839-Aug. 1840).
- . "Jane Redgrave. A Village Story." Literary Garland, n.s. 6 (Jan.-Dec. 1848).
- . Mark Hurdlestone, The Gold Worshipper. 2 vols. London: Bentley, 1853. First serialized in the Literary Garland as "The Miser and His Son." LG, 4 (June-Nov. 1842).
- . Matrimonial Speculations. London: Bentley, 1854. First serialized in the Literary Garland in three parts: "Waiting For Dead Men's Shoes," LG, n.s. 3 (July-Sept. 1845); "The Miss Kings," LG, n.s. 4 (Jan.-June 1846); "Richard Redpath," LG, n.s. 1 (Sept.-Dec. 1843).
- . "Mildred Rosier. A Tale of the Ruined City." Literary Garland, n.s. 2 (Feb.-Dec. 1842).
- . "Monica: or, Witchcraft." Literary Garland, n.s. 4 (Jan.-June 1846).
- . "The Royal Election. A Tale of the Olden Times -- Borrowed From the Early History of Poland." Literary Garland, 3 (Dec. 1840-March 1841).
- . The World Before Them. A Novel. 3 vols. London: Bentley, 1868.
- with J. W. D. Moodie. The Victoria Magazine. 1847-48; rpt. Vancouver: University of British Columbia Library, 1968.
- Muchall, Mrs. M. E. "A Night of Terror in the Backwoods of Canada." Canadian Monthly and National Review, 1 (Feb. 1872), 138-41.

Mulvaney, Charles Pelham. "Marian's Miseries." Rose-Belford's Canadian Monthly, 5 (July 1880), 37-49.

Noel, Ellen. The Abbey of Rathmore and Other Tales. Kingston: Creighton, 1859.

----- . "The Secret of Stanley Hall." Saturday Reader, 1 (3 Feb. 1866)-2 (10 March 1866).

Non. pseud. "Memgog -- A Tale." Literary Garland, n.s. 2 (Sept.-Oct. 1844).

Odevaine, James Murray De'Carteret. Papeta. A Story. Saint John: McMillan, 1867.

Ormond, Clarence. "Canadian Legends. 1. The Ruined Cottage." Literary Garland, n.s. 4 (April 1846), 177-79.

Parker, Gilbert. The Lane That had no Turning. New York: Doubleday, 1900.

----- . The Money Master. New York: Harper, 1915.

----- . Pierre and His People. Tales of the Far North. 1892; rpt. Toronto: Copp Clark, 1897.

----- . The Pomp of the Lavilletes. 1896; rpt. London, Methuen, 1919.

----- . The Right of Way. Toronto: Copp Clark, 1901.

----- . The Seats of the Mighty. Toronto: Copp Clark, 1896.

----- . The Trail of the Sword. New York: Appleton, 1894.

----- . The Translation of a Savage. New York: Appleton, 1893.

----- . The Trespasser. New York: Appleton, 1893.

----- . When Valmond Came to Pontiac. 1895; rpt. Toronto: Copp Clark, 1897.

----- . You Never Know Your Luck. Toronto: Bell & Cockburn, 1914.

Richardson, John. The Canadian Brothers; or, The Prophecy Fulfilled. A Tale of The Late American War. 2 vols. Montreal: Armour & Ramsay, 1840.

Richardson, John. Ecarté; or, The Salons of Paris. 3 vols. London: Colburn, 1829. Rpt. New York: DeWitt & Davenport, 1851.

----- . Hardscrabble; or, The Fall of Chicago. New York: DeWitt, [1851].

----- . The Monk Knight of St. John. A Tale of the Crusades. New York: DeWitt, 1850.

----- . "The Sunflower. A True Tale of the North-West." Graham's Magazine, 37 (Nov. 1850), 285-92.

----- . Wacousta; or, The Prophecy. A Tale of the Canadas. 3 vols. London: Cadell, 1832. Rpt., rev. with Introduction, New York: DeWitt & Davenport, 1851.

----- . Wau-Nan-Gee; or, The Massacre at Chicago. A Romance of the American Revolution. Philadelphia: Peterson, [1852].

----- . Westbrook, The Outlaw; or, The Avenging Wolf. An American Border Tale. 1851; rpt. Montreal: Woolmer, 1973.

Richardson, R. L. Colin of the Ninth Concession. A Tale of Scottish Pioneer Life in Eastern Ontario. Toronto: Morang, 1903.

Roberts, Charles G. D. By the Marshes of Minas. Boston: Page, 1900.

----- . The Canadians of Old. Trans. of Aubert de Gaspé's Les Anciens Canadiens. New York: Appleton, 1890.

----- . The Forge in the Forest. Being the Narrative of the Acadian Ranger, Jean de Mer. New York: Grosset & Dunlap, 1896.

----- . The Heart of the Ancient Wood. New York: Silver Burdet, 1900.

----- . The Heart That Knows. Boston: Page, 1906.

----- . The Prisoner of Mademoiselle. A Love Story. Toronto: Copp Clark, 1904.

----- . A Sister to Evangeline. The Story of Yvonne de Lamourie. New York: Grosset & Dunlap, 1898.

Robertson, Margaret. The Bairns; or, Janet's Love and Service. 1870; rpt. London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1885.

----- . Shenac's Work at Home. A Story of Canadian Life. London: Religious Tract Society, 1868.

Ross, Ellen. Violet Keith; an Autobiography. Montreal: Lovell, 1868.

Saunders, Marshall. Rose à Charlitte. An Acadien Romance. Boston: Page, 1898.

Savage, Mrs. William T. Miramichi. Boston: Loring, 1865.

Savigny, Annie G. A Romance of Toronto. (Founded on Fact.) A Novel. Toronto: Briggs, 1888.

Scott, Duncan Campbell. The Circle of Affection. Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 1947.

----- . In the Village of Viger. 1896; rpt. Toronto: Ryerson, 1945.

----- . New World Lyrics and Ballads. Toronto: Morang, 1905.

----- . The Witching of Elspie. A Book of Stories. Toronto: Doran, 1923.

Sellar, Robert. Hemlock. A Tale of the War of 1812. Montreal: Grafton, 1890.

Seton, Earnest Thompson. Wild Animals I have Known. 1898; rpt. New York: Grosset & Dunlap, 1926.

Spedon, Andrew Learmont. Canadian Summer Evening Tales. Montreal: Lovell, 1866.

----- . Tales of the Canadian Forest. Montreal: Lovell, 1861.

T. "The Ruins. A Canadian Legend." Literary Garland, n.s. 2 (Oct. 1844), 467-68.

T., F. "The Story of a Flirt." Belford's Monthly Magazine, 2 (Oct. 1877), 669-79.

Templedon, John. "Almanzor the Moor; or the Fall of Granada." Acadian Magazine, 1 (March-May 1827).

Teskey, Adeline. Where the Sugar Maple Grows. Idylls of a Canadian Village. New York: Fenno, 1901.

Thomson, E. W. Old Man Savarin Stories. 1895; rpt. Toronto: Grundy, 1917.

Traill, Catharine Parr. The Canadian Crusoes. A Tale of the Rice Lake Plains. London: Hall, 1850. Also published as Lost in the Backwoods. A Tale of the Canadian Forest. London: Nelson, 1886.

-----". "The Doge's Daughter. A Tale of Vencie." Anglo-American Magazine, 1 (Dec. 1852), 545-49.

-----". "Forest Gleanings." Anglo-American Magazine, 1 (Sept. 1852)-3 (Oct. 1853).

-----". Lady Mary and Her Nurse; or, A Peep into the Canadian Forest. London: Hall, 1856. Republished under several different titles: Stories of the Canadian Forest; or, Little Mary and Her Nurse. Boston: Crosby & Nichols, 1861. Afar in the Forest; or, Pictures of Life and Scenery in the Wilds of Canada. London: Nelson, 1869. In the Forest; or Pictures of Life and Scenery in the Woods of Canada. A Tale. London: Nelson, 1881. First serialized as "The Governor's Daughter; or, Rambles in the Canadian Forest." Maple Leaf, 2 (Jan. 1853)-3 (Dec. 1853).

-----". "St. Margaret's Minster." Literary Garland, 4 (Dec. 1841), 49-54.

-----". "The Volunteer's Bride. A Tale of the Canadian Rebellion." Maple Leaf, 4 (May 1854), 129-38.

-----". The Young Emigrants; or, Pictures of Canada. 1826; rpt. New York: Johnson Reprints, 1969.

W., C.E. "A Mistake in Life. A Canadian Story Founded on Facts." New Dominion Monthly, Nov.-Dec. 1874.

W., M. "The Gibbet Tree." Literary Garland, n.s. 2 (Feb. 1844), 69-78.

Walsh, Henry Cecil. Bonhomme. French-Canadian Stories and Sketches. Toronto: Briggs, 1899.

Willis, John Howard [H. pseud.]. "The Fairy Harp." Canadian Review and Literary and Historical Journal, 1 (Dec. 1824), 311-48.

-----". "The Faithful Heart." Canadian Magazine and Literary Repository, 4 (April 1825), 416-18.

-----". "The Pirate's Treasure." Canadian Magazine and Literary Repository, 3 (Aug.-Sept. 1824).

Withrow, W. H. Barbara Heck. A Tale of Early Methodism. Toronto: Briggs [1895].

-----, Neville Trueman, The Pioneer Preacher. A Tale of the War of 1812. 1880; rpt. Toronto: Briggs, 1900.

Wood, Joanna E. The Untempered Wind. New York: Tait, 1894.

Zero pseud. One Mistake. A Manitoban Reminiscence. Montreal: Canada Bank Note Company, 1888.

B. Non-fiction

Adam, Graeme Mercer. "The Approaching Book Season." Canada Bookseller, n.s. 2 (Oct. 1872), 25.

-----, "Canadian Literature." The Week, 8 (4 July 1890), 486.

-----, "The Copyright Law." Canada Bookseller, n.s. 1 (Feb. 1872), 17-18.

-----, "An Interregnum in Literature." The Week, 1 (12 June 1884), 438-39.

-----, "Literature, Nationality and the Tariff." The Week, 7 (27 Dec. 1889), 59-60.

-----, "Nationalism and the Literary Spirit." The Week, 5 (19 Jan. 1888), 118-19.

-----, "Native Literature and the Scoffing Spirit." The Week, 5 (5 Jan. 1888), 85-86.

-----, "Notes of the Season." Canada Bookseller, March 1865, p. 1.

-----, "Retarding Influences on Canadian Literature." The Week, 6 (25 Jan. 1889), 120.

-----, "Some Books of the Past Year." The Week, 2 (8 Jan.-15 Jan. 1885), 87, 102-03.

Adamson, George Stanley. "The Coming Novel." The Week, 8 (17 July 1891), 528.

Aguilar, Grace. "The Days of Bruce." Anglo-American Magazine, 1 (Dec. 1852), 519-21.

- Alden, W. L. "The Book Hunter." Idler, 6 (Nov. 1894), 503-04.
- Allen, Grant. "My First Book." Idler, 2 (Sept. 1892), 154-63.
- Anon. "Book Notes." Prince Edward Island Magazine, 2 (Nov. 1900), 298.
- . "Boök Notices." Canadian Methodist Magazine, 19 (April 1884), 381-82.
- . "Book Notices." Massey's Magazine, 2 (July 1896), 72-73.
- . "Book Notices." The Week, 2 (30 April 1885), 348.
- . "Book Reviews." Canadian Monthly and National Review, 1 (May 1872), 475-79. 3 (Feb. 1873), 170; (May 1873), 549-52. 4 (Oct. 1873), 357-59. 6 (Dec. 1874), 571-72. 7 (Jan. 1875), 99. 8 (Aug. 1875), 184. 9 (April 1876), 341; (May 1876), 455. 10 (July 1876), 87-88; (Nov. 1876), 453-54. 11 (Feb. 1877), 226; (April 1877), 453-55; (May 1877), 554-55. 12 (July 1877), 100. 13 (Feb. 1878), 224.
- . "Books and Authors." Canadian Magazine, 7 (June 1896), 190. 12 (Dec. 1898), 181-82. 13 (Sept. 1899), 487.
- . "Canadian Books." Saturday Reader. 1 (30 Dec. 1865), 261.
- . "Canadian Letters." Dominion Illustrated Weekly, 1 (21 July 1888), 34-35.
- . "Canadian Poetry and Poets." British American Magazine, 1 (Aug. 1863), 415-19.
- . "Current Items." Canadians, 1 (Oct. 1889), 159.
- . "Current Literature." Belford's Monthly Magazine, 1 (March 1877), 579; (April 1877), 708-09. 2 (July 1877), 343; (Aug. 1877), 463-71; (Nov. 1887), 856-57.
- . "Current Literature." Canadian Spectator, 1 (26 Jan. 1878), 36; (14 Sept. 1878) 300.
- . "Current Literature." Rose-Belford's Canadian Monthly, 1 (July 1878), 117-21. 2 (May 1879), 511-12. 6 (Jan. 1881), 98.
- . "Editor's Shanty." Anglo-American Magazine, 1 (July 1852), 67-77; (Aug. 1852), 173-74; (Sept. 1852), 264-73; (Dec. 1852), 560. 2 (Feb. 1853), 206; (May 1853), 530-43. 4 (March 1854), 326. 5 (Nov. 1854), 511; (Dec. 1854), 609-10. 6 (Jan. 1855), 103-04, 7 (July 1855), 62; (Sept. 1855), 246.

- Anon. "The Effects of Literary Cultivation on Morals." Canadian Literary Magazine, 1 (April 1833), 37-40.
- ". "George Sand." Literary Garland, n.s. 7 (Feb. 1849), 63-64.
- ". "Justice to Canadian Authors." Canadian Illustrated News, 15 (24 Feb. 1877), 114.
- ". "Library Table." The Week, 11 (2 Feb. 1894), 232; (20 July 1894), 809.
- ". "Literary and Personal Gossip." The Week, 8 (24 July 1891), 549.
- ". "Literary Notes." Canadian Monthly and National Review, 1 (Jan. 1872), 94; (June 1872) 570. 3 (Feb. 1873), 176.
- ". "Literary Notices." New Dominion Monthly, Jan. 1874, 61-62.
- ". "The Literature of a New Country." Monthly Review, 1 (Jan. 1841), 54-62.
- ". "The Modern Novel." The Week, 7 (1 Aug. 1890), 548-49.
- ". "New Publications. St. Ursula's Convent, or The Nun of Canada." Canadian Magazine and Literary Repository, 2 (May 1824), 463-64.
- ". Obituary of Sir James M. LeMoine. Royal Society of Canada, Proceedings and Transactions, ser. 3, 6 (1912), v-vii.
- ". "On the Influence of Literature." Canadian Review and Literary and Historical Journal, 1 (July 1824), 65-72.
- ". "Original Papers. St. Rowan's Well." Canadian Magazine and Literary Repository, 2 (Feb. 1824), 97-110.
- ". "Our Library Table." The Week, 3 (22 April 1886), 338; (1 July 1886), 500. 8 (3 April 1891), 288; (17 April 1891), 319; 10 (6 Jan. 1893), 135; (1 Sept. 1893) 952.
- ". "Our Table." Literary Garland, 1 (Feb. 1839), 144. 2 (Feb. 1840), 138-39; (March 1840), 192; (April 1840), 239. 4 (Aug. 1842), 437; (Sept. 1842), 482-84. n.s. 3 (April 1845), 190-92; (July 1845), 336. n.s. 5 (May 1847), 242; (Sept. 1847), 435. n.s. 8 (May 1850), 238-40; (June 1850), 289.

- Anon. "Our Undertaking." Saturday Reader, 1 (Sept. 1865), 1.
- ". "Prospectus." Canadian Illustrated News, 1869.
- ". "Publisher's Department." New Dominion Monthly, March 1876, 237.
- ". "Recent Fiction." The Week, 12 (12 April 1895), 471-72; (30 Aug. 1895), 951.
- ". "Recent Literature." Canadian Illustrated News, 10 (22 Aug. 1874), 118.
- ". Review of Barabara Ladd, by Charles G. D. Roberts. Prince Edward Island Magazine, 14 (Nov. 1900), 317.
- ". Review of The Bravo, by James Fenimore Cooper. Halifax Monthly Magazine, 2 (Feb. 1832), 409-10.
- ". Review of Ecarté, or The Salons of Paris [by John Richardson]. Wesminster Review, 11 (Oct. 1829), 303-26.
- ". Review of Ethelinde; or, The Recluse of the Lake, by Charlotte Smith. Nova Scotia Magazine, 3 (Oct. 1790), 303-04.
- ". Review of Felix Holt, The Radical, by George Eliot. Saturday Reader, 2 (18 Aug. 1866), 370.
- ". Review of The Golden Dog, by William Kirby. Toronto Mail, 4 April 1877, p. 2.
- ". Review of Papeta. A Story, by James Murray D'Cartaret Odevaine. Stewart's Literary Quarterly, 1 (1867), 78.
- ". Review of Paul Clifford. Halifax Monthly Magazine, 1 (Aug. 1830), 81-82.
- ". Review of Pierre and His People, by Gilbert Parker. Athenaeum, No. 3395 (19 Nov. 1892), 700.
- ". Review of Pierre and His People, by Gilbert Parker. Bookman (London), Dec. 1892, 92.
- ". Review of St. George; or The Canadian League, by William Charles McKinnon. Provincial, or Halifax Monthly Magazine, 1 (April 1852), 147-51.
- ". Review of Wacousta; or, The Prophecy [by John Richardson]. Athenaeum, No. 270 (29 Dec. 1832), 837-38.

- Anon. Review of The Wreck of the White Bear, by Mrs. Ellen Ross. Stewart's Literary Quarterly, 4 (Oct. 1870), 327-330.
- . Review of The Vicar of Bullhampton, by Anthony Trollope. Canadian Illustrated News, 2 (12 Aug. 1870), 102.
- . "Review of Science, Literature and Art." Dominion Annual Register. 1880-81, pp. 279-89; 1882, pp. 268-91; 1883, pp. 206-13; 1884, pp. 168-73; 1885, pp. 328-29; 1886, pp. 210-23.
- . "Reviews." British American Magazine, 1 (Oct. 1863), 638.
- . "Sir Gilbert's Critics." Toronto Daily Star, 5 Oct. 1904, p. 6.
- . "The Six Prigs to Robert Barr." Canadian Magazine, 14 (Jan. 1900) 248-52.
- . "To Correspondents." Acadian Magazine, 1 (March 1827), 360.
- . "To Our Readers." Dominion Illustrated, 6 (Jan. 1891), 2.
- . "The World We Live In." Blackwood's, 42 (Nov. 1837), 677.
- Archer, Andrew. "Scott." Stewart's Literary Quarterly, 5 (July 1871), 145-62.
- Barr, Robert. "Literature in Canada." Canadian Magazine, 14 (Nov.-Dec. 1899), 3-7, 130-36.
- Bourinot, John George. "Canadian Materials for History, Poetry and Romance." New Dominion Monthly, April 1871, 193-204.
- . "Gentlemen Adventurers and Coureurs de Bois." Belford's Monthly Magazine, 1 (April 1877), 637-44.
- . The Intellectual Development of the Canadian People. Toronto: Hunter, Rose, 1881.
- . "Notes in My Library." The Week, 12 (5 April 1895), 444-46.
- . Our Intellectual Strength and Weakness. Montreal: Foster Brown, 1893.
- . "Review of Literature." Dominion Annual Register and Review for 1879. Ed. Henry J. Morgan. Ottawa: MacLean Roger, 1880.
- . "Views on Canadian Literature." The Week, 11 (16 March 1894), 368.

- Brodie, Allan Douglas. "Canadian Short Story Writers." Canadian Magazine, 4 (Feb. 1895), 334-44.
- Brown, Walter James. "Robert Barr and Literature in Canada." Canadian Magazine, 15 (June 1900), 170-76.
- Burgin, G. B. "A Chat with Sara Jeannette Duncan." Idler, 8 (Sept. 1895), 113-18.
- Burpee, Lawrence J. Canadian Novels and Novelists. n.p., 1901.
- C., M.W. "The Use of Books." The Harp, 4 (1879), 418-19; 494-95.
- C., W.P. "Our Literature, Present and Prospective." Literary Garland, n.s. 6 (May 1848), 245-47.
- Casca pseud. "Emily Montague; or, Quebec a Century Ago." British Canadian Review, 1 (Jan. 1863), 87.
- "Thirty-Nine Men to One Woman." British Canadian Review, 1 (Dec. 1863), 40.
- Carman, Bliss. "Mr. Gilbert Parker." The Chap-Book, 1 (1 Nov. 1894), 339-43.
- Chisholme, David. "Introduction." Canadian Magazine and Literary Repository, 1 (July 1823), 108.
- "Saint Ursula's Convent or The Nun of Canada." Canadian Review and Literary and Historical Journal. 1 (July 1824), 49-53.
- Colquhoun, Arthur H. U. "A Century of Canadian Magazines." Canadian Magazine, 17 (June 1901) 141-49.
- Dawson, S. E. The Prose Writers of Canada. An Address Delivered Before the Teachers of the City and District of Montreal. Montreal: Renouf, 1901.
- de Bellefeuille, R. Lef. "Antoinette de Mirecourt by Mrs. Leprohon." La Revue Canadienne, 1 (juil. 1864), 443-44.
- De Mille, James. "Acadie and the Birthplace of Evangeline." Putnam's, 2 (Aug. 1853), 140-45.
- "Professor D'Mill's Inaugural Address." Dalhousie Gazette, 6 (15 Nov. 1873), 1-6.

- Dewart, Rev. E. H. "Introductory Essay." Selections from Canadian Poets. Montreal: Lovell, 1864.
- Douglas, James. "The Intellectual Progress of Canada during the Last Fifty Years, and the Present State of its Literature." Transactions of the Literary and Historical Society of Québec, n.s. No. 11 (1873-75), 62-83. Reprinted in the Canadian Monthly and National Review, 7 (June 1875), 465-76.
- Duncan, Sara Jeannette [Garth Grafton pseud.]. "Bric à Brac." Montreal Daily Star, 5 Dec. 1887 p. 4; 31 Dec. 1887 p. 4; 17 Jan. 1888 p. 2; 31 Jan. 1888 p. 2; 26 May 1888 p. 2.
- ". "Literary Pabulum." The Week, 4 (24 Nov. 1887), 831.
- ". [Garth Grafton pseud.] "Other People and I." Toronto Globe, 17 June 1885, p. 3.
- ". "Outworn Literary Methods." The Week, 4 (9 June 1887), 450-51.
- ". "Saunterings." The Week, 3 (30 Sept. 1886), 707-08; (7 Oct. 1886), 723; (28 Oct. 1886), 771-72. 4 (13 Jan. 1887), 111-12; (20 Jan. 1887), 120-21; (10 March 1887), 232-33; 5 (Aug. 1888), 574.
- ". [Garth Grafton pseud.] "Women's World." Toronto Globe, 13 Jan. 1887, p. 6.
- Dunlop, William. Statistical Sketches of Upper Canada For the Use of Emigrants. London: Murray, 1832.
- English, C. Davis. "The Immoral in Fiction." The Week, 2 (Oct. 1885), 709-10.
- Fabré, Hector. "On Canadian Literature." Transactions of the Literary and Historical Society of Québec, n.s. parts 4 & 5 (1865-66), pp. 85-102.
- Fairchild, G. M. Letter to J. M. LeMoine, 1 January 1903. TS in the Edith and Lorne Pierce Collection, Box 41, Douglas Library, Queen's University.
- Foster, Miss [T.D.F. pseud.]. "The Neighbours." Literary Garland, n.s. 1 (July 1843), 309-15.
- ". "Notices of New Works. 1. Jane Eyre." Literary Garland, n.s. 6 (July 1848), 335-38.

- Foster, W. A. Canada First; or, Our New Nationality. An Address.
Toronto: Adam Stevenson, 1871
- Fraser, W. A. "Literature." Canadian Magazine, 13 (May 1899), 34-37.
- G., E. "Recent Fiction." The Week, 13 (1 May 1896), 550.
- Gibson, John. "Introduction to the New Series of the Garland."
Literary Garland, n.s. 1 (Jan. 1843), 1-4.
- , "To Our Readers." Literary Garland, 1 (Dec. 1838), 3-4.
- Giles, Henry. "Fiction." Literary Garland, n.s. 8 (June 1850),
262-68.
- Godkin, E. L. "French Canada." The Nation, 7 (13 Aug.-20 Aug. 1868),
128-29, 146-48.
- Gordon, Charles W. Postscript to Adventure. New York: Farrar &
Rinehart, 1938.
- Griffin, M. J. "The Romance of the Wilderness Missions. A Chapter
of Our Early History." Canadian Monthly and National Review,
1 (April 1872), 344-53.
- Guild, Leman A. "Canadian Celebrities. No. 73 -- Agnes Maule Machar
(Fidelis)." Canadian Magazine, 27 (Oct. 1906), 499-501.
- H., P. "Bibliographie. Le Chien D'Or, par William Kirby." La Revue
Canadienne, 14 (mars 1877), 227.
- Harvey, Rev. M. "A Trio of Forgotten Worthies." Maritime Monthly,
4 (Nov. 1874), 408-22.
- Hind, Henry Youle. "Introduction." Canadian Journal, 1 (Aug. 1852), 3.
- Holiwell, Mrs. "The Love of Reading." British American Magazine,
2 (Jan. 1864), 267-75.
- I. "Cursory Thoughts and Literary Reminiscences." Acadian Magazine,
1 (Jan. 1827), 258-61; (May 1827), 421-24. 2 (Aug. 1827),
58-61.
- Jack, I. Allan. "Harriet Beecher Stowe on Lady Byron's Life."
Stewart's Literary Quarterly, 3 (Oct. 1869), 278-87.
- Katzmann, M. J. "Our Address." Provincial; or, Halifax Monthly
Magazine, 1 (Jan. 1852), 1-2.

Kent, Mr. "The Editor's Address to the Public." Canadian Literary Magazine, 1 (April 1833), 1-2.

Kirby, William. Correspondence with J. M. LeMoine and Benjamin Sulte. Kirby Collection, Ontario Archives.

-----. Letters to John Alexander Cooper. John Alexander Cooper Papers, MG 30, D34, Public Archives of Canada.

-----. Papers and Correspondence. Edith and Lorne Pierce Collection, Box 41, Douglas Library, Queen's University.

Kirby, Wm. Rep. "Brief of the Publication of William Kirby's Novel 'Le Chien D'or' (The Golden Dog) to Dr. Lorne Pierce." Unpublished MS., Metropolitan Toronto Central Library.

Lampman, Archibald. "Mr. Thomson's Old Man Savarin." The Week, 12 (9 Aug. 1895), 880-81.

Lay, Robert W. "Editorial." Maple Leaf, 1 (Sept. 1852), 95.

Lay, Mrs. Robert W. "Editorial." Maple Leaf, 3 (July 1853), 31.

LeMoine, James M. "Francois de Bienville." Stewart's Literary Quarterly, 4 (Oct. 1870), 325-27.

-----. "The Heroine of Verchères." Stewart's Literary Quarterly, 3 (April 1869), 85-87.

-----. Maple Leaves: A Budget of Legendary, Historical, Critical and Sporting Intelligence. 6 vols. Quebec, 1863, 1864, 1865, 1873, 1880, 1894.

Lesperance, John Talon. "The Literary Standing of the New Dominion." Canadian Illustrated News, 15 (24 Feb. 1877), 118-19.

Lewis, Richard. "Shakespearean Studies." Belford's Monthly Magazine, 2 (June 1877), 70-77.

Lighthall, W. D. "John Talon-Lesperance." Dominion Illustrated Weekly, 6 (21 March 1891), 267.

-----. "William Kirby." Dominion Illustrated Weekly, 2 (11 May 1889), 298.

Logan, John E. [Barry Dane pseud.]. "National Literature." The Week, 1 (21 Aug. 1884), 600-01.

- Longley, J. W. "Canadian Literature." Maritime Monthly, 2 (Sept. 1873), 257-61.
- Lyall, Professor. "From the Augustan Age to the Present Time." Stewart's Literary Quarterly, 4 (April 1870), 356-57.
- M., B.F. "Romance." Literary Garland, 3 (June 1841), 302-04.
- McCaul, Rev. John. "Preface." The Maple Leaf, or Canadian Annual. A Literary Souvenir for 1847. Toronto: Rowse, 1847.
- Macdonell, Blanche L. "The Literary Movement in Canada up to 1841." Canadians, 2 (Feb. 1890), 17-23.
- McGee, Thomas D'Arcy. "Protection for Canadian Literature." The New Era, 24 April 1858.
- Machar, Agnes Maule [Fidelis pseud.]. "Between the Lights -- With Old Books." The Week, 6 (19 April 1889), 311-12.
- ". "An Old Canadian Town." Canadian Monthly and National Review, 4 (July 1874), 1-18.
- ". "Prominent Canadians. XXXVII -- Grant Allen." The Week, 8 (10 July 1891), 510.
- M'Kinnon, Angus. "Reading." New Dominion Monthly, 1 (Feb. 1868), 282-85.
- Mabel pseud. "Le Chien D'Or." Canadians, 2 (June/July 1891), 118-19.
- Mair, Charles. "Views on Canadian Literature." The Week, 11 (9 March 1894), 344.
- Marquis, T. G. "In the Village of Viger." The Week, 13 (10 July 1896), 788.
- ". "The Seats of the Mighty." The Week, 13 (29 May 1896), 643.
- Moodie, Susanna. Letter to Anna Ricketson, 4 September 1869. bMs Am 1131 (21), Houghton Library, Harvard University.
- ". Life in the Clearings Versus the Bush. London: Bentley, 1853. Rpt., ed. R. L. McDougall, with the "Introduction" to Mark Hurdlestone. Toronto: Macmillan, 1959.
- ". Roughing It in the Bush; or, Forest Life in Canada. 2 vols. London: Bentley, 1852; Rpt. Toronto: Bell & Cockburn, 1913.

Moodie, Susanna. "A Word for the Novel Writers." Literary Garland, n.s. 9 (Aug. 1851), 348-51.

----- with J. W. D. Moodie. "Editor's Table." Victoria Magazine, 1 (Sept. 1847), 24.

Morgan, Henry J. Bibliotheca Canadensis. Ottawa: Desbarats, 1867.

----- . Celebrated Canadians. Quebec: Hunter, Rose, 1862.

Mulvaney, Charles Pelham. "Some French Novels of the Eighteenth Century." Belford's Monthly Magazine, 3 (Feb. 1878), 383-86.

Murray, Lousia. "Democracy in Literature." The Week, 6 (2 Aug. 1889), 550.

P., J. "Novels and Novel Readers." Literary Garland, n.s. 8 (May 1850), 207-13.

Parker, Gilbert. Parker Papers. Edith and Lorne Pierce Collection, Douglas Library, Queen's University.

----- . Prefaces to the Imperial Edition of his Collected Works. 24 vols. New York: Scribner's, 1912-23.

Reeve, Clara. The Progress of Romance. 1785; facsimile rpt. New York: Garland, 1970.

Renault, Raoul. Bibliographie de Sir James-M. LeMoine. Quebec: Brousseau, 1897.

Richardson, John. Eight Years in Canada. Montreal: Cunningham, 1847.

----- . Petition to Baron Sydenham. n.d., arr'd 20 July 1841. Papers of the Governor-General's Secretary, vol. 4. RG7 G20, Public Archives of Canada.

----- . "The Story of a Trip to Walpole Island and Port Sarnia." Literary Garland, n.s. 7 (Jan. 1849), 17-26. Rpt., with an Introduction by A. H. U. Colquhoun, as Tecumseh and Richardson. Toronto: Ontario Book Co., 1924.

Roberts, Charles G. D. A History of Canada. Toronto: Morang, 1898.

----- . "The Outlook for Literature. Acadie's Fields for Poetry, History and Romance." Halifax Herald, 1 Jan. 1886.

Robertson, Andrew [A.R. pseud.]. "Retrospective Reviews." Literary Garland, 2 (June 1840), 307-09.

Roderick Random pseud. "Letters to Living Authors -- Mr. Robert Louis Stevenson." The Week, 6 (5 July 1889), 487.

Senex pseud. "Modern Literature." Acadian Magazine, 1 (May 1827), 436.

Shiels, Andrew. Preface. The Witch of the Westcot. Halifax: Joseph Howe, 1831.

Smith, Goldwin. Bystander, 1 (Jan. 1880), 55; (July 1880), 390. 2 (Jan. 1881) 47. n.s. May 1890, 269; Aug. 1890, 406-07.

----- . "The Lamps of Fiction." (An Address delivered by Professor Goldwin Smith, at the Toronto Celebration of the Scott Centenary, 1871). Canadian Journal, 13 (1871-73), 347-51.

----- . Lectures and Essays. Toronto: Hunter, Rose, 1881.

----- . "What is the Matter with Canadian Literature?" The Week, 11 (31 Aug. 1894), 950-51.

Smith, J. E. "A Word on Sensational Novels." Dominion Illustrated Weekly, 3 (28 Sept. 1889), 203.

Smith, William Wye. "Illustrations of Canadian Life." Rose-Belford's Canadian Monthly, 8 (Feb., March, May 1882).

Stewart, George. "Canadian Literature." Stewart's Literary Quarterly, 3 (Jan. 1870), 403-07.

----- . Essays from Reviews. Second Series. Quebec: Dawson, 1893.

----- . Evenings in the Library. Toronto: Belford, 1878.

----- . "The History of a Magazine." Dominion Illustrated Monthly, ser. 2, 1 (Aug. 1892), 400-08.

----- . "Introductory." Stewart's Literary Quarterly, 1 (April 1867), 1-2.

----- . "Professeur James De Mille." Article published in an unidentified French-Canadian periodical, c. 1880-82, pp. 175-92. Copy held by the Metropolitan Toronto Library.

- Stewart, J. L. "George Eliot." Belford's Monthly Magazine, 3 (May 1878), 675-82.
- Stowe, Harriet Beecher. "What Shall the Girls Read?" New Dominion Monthly, Aug. 1870, 39-40.
- Sulte, Benjamin. "Le Chien D'Or." L'Opinion Publique, 8 (3 mai 1877), 208.
- Thorold, W. J. "Gilbert Parker, An Interview." Massey's Magazine, 3 (Feb. 1897), 117-23.
- Traill, Catharine Parr. The Backwoods of Canada. London: Knight, 1836.
- Traill Family Papers. Personal correspondence of Susanna Moodie and Catharine Parr Traill, and Catharine Parr Traill's Journals. MG 29, D 81, vol. 1-2, Public Archives of Canada.
- Troop, Carter. "On the Horrible in Fiction." The Week, 6 (8 Feb. 1889), 153.
- W., H.W. "The Red River Settlement." New Dominion Monthly, 2 (May 1868), 99-101.
- Webster, Rev. T. "Early Scenes in Canadian Life." New Dominion Monthly, 2 (Aug.-Sept. 1868).
- Wetherald, A. Ethelwyn. "Some Canadian Literary Women. -- I. Seranus." The Week, 5 (22 March 1888), 268-69.
- Wilson, Daniel. "Toronto of Old." Canadian Monthly and National Review, 4 (Aug. 1874), 89-96.

II. Secondary

- Adam, John Coldwell. Seated with the Mighty. A Biography of Sir Gilbert Parker. Unpublished MS.
- Altick, Richard. The English Common Reader. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1957.
- Anderson, Rachel. The Purple Heart Throbs. The sub-literature of love. London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1974.

- Argyle, Barry. An Introduction to the Australian Novel. London: Oxford, 1972.
- Bailey, Alfred G. "Literature and Nationalism After Confederation." University of Toronto Quarterly, 25 (July 1956), 409-24.
- Baker, Ernest A. History of the English Novel. Vol. 9. 1936; rpt. New York: Barnes & Noble, 1963.
- Baker, Ray Palmer. A History of English Canadian Literature to the Confederation. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1920.
- Ballstadt, Carl. "The Literary History of the Strickland Family." Diss. London 1965.
- ". "The Quest for Identity in Pre-Confederation Literary Criticism." Master's thesis Western Ontario 1959.
- ". The Search for English-Canadian Literature. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1975.
- ". "Thomas D'Arcy McGee as a Father of Canadian Literature." Studies in Canadian Literature, 1, No. 1 (Winter 1976), 85-95.
- Barnett, George L. ed. Nineteenth-Century British Novelists on the Novel. New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, 1971.
- Beasley, David. "The Tempestuous Major: The Canadian Don Quixote." Bulletin of the New York Public Library, 74 (1970), 3-26.
[on John Richardson]
- Berger, Carl, ed. Approaches to Canadian History. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1967.
- ". The Sense of Power. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1970.
- ". The Writing of Canadian History. Toronto: Oxford, 1976.
- Bernbaum, Ernest. "The Views of the Great Critics on the Historical Novel." PMLA, 41 (1926), 424-41.
- Bevan, A. R. "James De Mille and Archibald MacMechan." Dalhousie Review, 35 (Autumn 1955), 201-15.
- Beyea, G. P. "The Canadian Novel Prior to Confederation." Master's thesis New Brunswick 1950.

- Bissell, Claude. "Literary Taste in Central Canada During the Late Nineteenth Century." Canadian Historical Review, 31 (Sept. 1950), 237-51.
- Brissendon, R. F. Virtue in Distress. Studies in the Novel of Sentiment from Richardson to Sade. London: Macmillan, 1974.
- Brown, E. K. On Canadian Poetry. 1943; rpt. Ottawa: Tecumseh, 1973.
- Brown, Jack. "The Adopted Daughter Identified." Canadian Notes & Queries, No. 15 (July 1975), 11-12.
- Brown, Mary Markham. An Index to the Literary Garland. Toronto: Bibliographical Society of Canada, 1962.
- Chase, Richard. The American Novel and Its Tradition. New York: Doubleday Anchor Books, 1957.
- Chittick, V. L. O. Thomas Chandler Haliburton. New York: Columbia University Press, 1924.
- Cogswell, Fred. "The Canadian Novel from Confederation until World War I." Master's thesis New Brunswick 1946.
- ". "The Forest of Bourg-Marie: An Ancestor of Maria Chapdelaine and Trente Arpents." Journal of Canadian Fiction, 2, No. 3 (1973), 199-200.
- ". "Haliburton," and "Literary Activity in the Maritime Provinces (1815-1880)." Literary History of Canada. Ed. Carl F. Klinck. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1967, pp. 92-101, 102-24.
- Colby, Robert A. Fiction with a Purpose. Bloomington Indiana: Indiana University Press, 1967.
- Crockett, A. J. "Concerning James De Mille." More Studies in Nova Scotian History. Ed. George Geddie Patterson. Halifax: Imperial Publishing Co., 1941, pp. 120-48.
- Cruse, Amy The Victorians and Their Reading. Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1935.
- Cumberland, R. W. "Agnes Maule Machar." Queen's Quarterly, 34 (1927) 331-39.
- Davies, Marilyn I. "Anglo-Boston Bamboozled on the Canadian Thames: Holmes's Belinda; Or, The Rivals." Journal of Canadian Fiction, 2, No. 3 (1973), 56-61.

Deneau, Henri. (Brother Adrian.) "The Life and Works of Mrs. Leprohon." Master's thesis Montréal 1948.

Doyle, James. "The Image of Canada in the Literature of the United States." Diss. British Columbia 1974.

Dudek, L., and Gnarowski, M. The Making of Modern Poetry in Canada. Toronto: Ryerson, 1970.

Edwards, Mary Jane. "Essentially Canadian." Canadian Literature, No. 52 (Spring 1972), 8-23.

----- . "Fiction and Montreal, 1769-1885." Diss. Toronto. 1969.

----- . "Fiction and Montreal, 1769-1885." Papers of the Bibliographical Society of Canada, 8 (1969), 61-75.

Eggleston, Wilfrid. The Frontier and Canadian Letters. Toronto: Ryerson, 1957.

Egoff, Sheila. "Early Canadian Children's Books." The Republic of Childhood. Toronto: Oxford, 1975.

Fairchild, Hoxie Neale. The Noble Savage. A Study in Romantic Naturalism. New York: Russell, 1961.

Fallis, Lawrence Jr. "The Idea of Progress in the Province of Canada: A Study in the History of Ideas." The Shield of Achilles. Ed. W. L. Morton. Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 1968, pp. 169-83.

Fiedler, Leslie. Love and Death in the American Novel. 1960; rpt. New York: Dell, 1969.

Fleishman, Avrom. The English Historical Novel. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Press, 1971.

Flemming, Tom. "James De Mille. A Bibliography." Unpublished MS. Dalhousie School of Library Service, 1974.

Flitton, Marilyn. "The Canadian Monthly, 1872-1882." Master's thesis Simon Fraser 1973.

----- . An Index to the Canadian Monthly and National Review and Rose-Belford's Canadian Monthly. Toronto: Bibliographical Society of Canada, 1976.

Friden, Georg. The Canadian Novels of Sir Gilbert Parker: Historical Elements and Literary Technique. Upsala Canadian Studies, 1953.

Frye, Northrop. "Conclusion." Literary History of Canada. Ed. Carl F. Klinck. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1967. pp. 821-849.

Gerson, Carole. "Canada's Response to Thomas Hardy: A Look at Nineteenth-Century Attitudes." Dalhousie Review, 55 (Summer 1975), 252-62.

----- . "Duncan's Web." Canadian Literature, No. 63 (Winter 1975), 73-80.

----- . "Margaret Atwood and Quebec: A Footnote on Surfacing." Studies in Canadian Literature, 1, No. 1 (Winter 1976), 115-19.

----- . "The Piper's Forgotten Tune: Notes on the Stories of D. C. Scott and a Bibliography." Journal of Canadian Fiction No. 16 (1976), 138-43.

Gnarowski, Michael. "The Advocate by Charles Heavysege. A Re-Appraisal." La Revue de L'Université de Sherbrooke, 2 (mai 1962), 215-20.

Goggio, Emilio, et. al. A Bibliography of Canadian Cultural Periodicals in Canadian Libraries. Toronto: University of Toronto Department of Italian, Spanish and Portugese, 1955.

Goodwin, Rae Elizabeth. "The Early Journalism of Sara Jeannette Duncan." Master's thesis Toronto 1964.

Gundy, H. Pearson. Book Publishing and Publishers in Canada Before 1900. Toronto: Bibliographical Society of Canada, 1965.

----- . "Literary Publishing." Literary History of Canada. Ed. Carl F. Klinck. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1967. pp. 174-88.

Hamil, Fred C. "A Pioneer Novelist of Kent County." Ontario History, 39 (1947), 101-13. [on Abraham Holmes, author of Belinda; or, The Rivals.]

Harper, Russell. Painting in Canada: A History. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1966.

- Harrison, Dick. "The Beginnings of Prairie Fiction." Journal of Canadian Fiction, No. 13 (1975), 159-77.
- Hart, James D. The Popular Book. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1961.
- Hayne, David M. "The Historical Novel and French Canada." Diss. Ottawa 1945.
- Horning, Lewis Emerson, and Burpee, Lawrence J. A Bibliography of Canadian Fiction. Toronto: Briggs, 1904.
- Keith, W. J. Charles G. D. Roberts. Toronto: Copp Clark, 1969.
- Kiely, Robert. The Romantic Novel in England. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1972.
- Kilian, Crawford. "The Cheerful Inferno of James De Mille." Journal of Canadian Fiction, 1, No. 3 (Summer 1972), 61-67.
- Kime, Wayne R. "The American Antecedents of James De Mille's A Strange Manuscript Found in a Copper Cylinder." Dalhousie Review, 55 (Summer 1975), 280-306.
- Klinck, Carl F. "Early Creative Literature of Western Ontario." Ontario History, 45 (Autumn 1953), 155-63.
- "John Galt's Canadian Novels." Ontario History, 49 (Autumn 1957), 187-94.
- "Introduction." Belinda; or, The Rivals, by A. S. H. Vancouver: Alcuin, 1970.
- "Introduction." The Canadian Brothers; or The Prophecy Fulfilled, by John Richardson. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1976.
- "Literary Activity in the Canadas (1812-1841)," and "Literary History in Canada East and West (1841-1880)." Literary History of Canada. Ed. Carl F. Klinck. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1967, pp. 125-44, 145-62.
- Ed. Literary History of Canada. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1967.
- "Samuel Hull Wilcocke." Journal of Canadian Fiction, 2, No. 3 (Summer 1973), 13-21.

Klinck, Carl F. Wilfred Campbell. A Study in Late Provincial Victorianism. Toronto: Ryerson, 1943.

----- . "The World of The Scribbler." Journal of Canadian Fiction, No. 15 (1975), 123-48.

Kline, Marcia B. Beyond the Land Itself. Views on Nature in Canada and the United States. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1970.

Leavis, Q. D. Fiction and the Reading Public. 1932; rpt. New York: Russell, 1965.

Logan, John Daniel. "Scott and Haliburton. An Essay in the Psychology of Creative Satiric Humour." Halifax: Allen, 1921.

----- . Thomas Chandler Haliburton. Toronto: Ryerson, 1923.

Lukacs, Georg. The Historical Novel. Trans. by Hannah & Stanley Mitchell. 1938; rpt. London: Merlin, 1962.

MacCallum, F. L. "Agnes Maule Machar." Canadian Magazine, 62 (March 1924), 354-57.

McCourt, Edward A. "The Canadian Historical Novel." Dalhousie Review, 26 (April 1946), 30-36.

McDougall, Robert L. "The Literary Influence of Scott in Canada." Unpublished address.

----- . "A Study of Canadian Periodical Literature of the Nineteenth Century." Diss. Toronto 1950.

MacLeod, Douglas E. "A Critical Biography of James De Mille." Master's thesis Dalhousie 1968.

MacLulich, Thomas. "Literary Attitudes in English Canada, 1880-1900." Master's thesis Simon Fraser 1971.

----- . "Novel and Romance." Canadian Literature, No. 70 (Autumn 1976), 42-50.

MacMechan, Archiblad. "Concerning James De Mille." Canadian Bookman, 4 (April 1922), 12-13.

----- . "De Mille, the Man and the Writer." Canadian Magazine, 27 (Sept. 1906), 404-16.

----- . Headwaters of Canadian Literature. Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 1924. 1974.

- Magee, William H. "Local Colour in Canadian Fiction." University of Toronto Quarterly, 28 (Jan. 1959), 176-89.
- Matthews, John P. Tradition in Exile. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1962.
- Morley, William F. A Bibliographical Study of Major John Richardson. Toronto: Bibliographical Society of Canada, 1973.
- Morton, W. L. "Victorian Canada." in The Shield of Achilles. Aspects of Canada in the Victorian Age. Ed. W. L. Morton. Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 1968, pp. 311-33.
- Moss, John. "Canadian Frontiers: Sexuality and Violence from Richardson to Kroetsch." Journal of Canadian Fiction, 2, No. 3 (Summer 1973), 36-41.
- . Patterns of Isolation. Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 1974.
- Moyles, R. G. English-Canadian Literature to 1900. A Guide to Information Sources. Detroit: Gale, 1976.
- Nagarajan, S. "The Anglo-Indian Novels of Sara Jeannette Duncan." Journal of Canadian Fiction, 3 No. 4 (1975), 74-84.
- Pacey, Desmond. "A Colonial Romantic. Major John Richardson, Soldier and Novelist." Canadian Literature, No. 2 (Fall 1959)-No. 3 (Winter 1960).
- . Creative Writing in Canada. New edition, 1961. rpt. Toronto: McGraw-Hill Ryerson, 1967.
- . "The Canadian Novel." 1945; rpt. in Essays in Canadian Criticism. Toronto: Ryerson, 1969.
- Parker, George L. "Literary Journalism in the Maritimes Before Confederation." Canadian Literature, No. 68/69 (Spring/Summer 1976), 88-100.
- Parks, M. G. "Strange to Strangers Only." Canadian Literature, No. 70 (Autumn 1976), 61-78. [on James De Mille]
- Perkins, George, ed. The Theory of the American Novel. New York: Holt, Rinehart & Winston, 1972.
- Pierce, Lorne. Outline of Canadian Literature. Toronto: Ryerson, 1927.
- . William Kirby. Portrait of a Tory Loyalist. Toronto: Macmillan, 1929.

- Raleigh, John Henry. "What Scott Meant to the Victorians." Victorian Studies, 8 (1963). Rpt. in his Time, Place and Idea. Carbondale: Southern Illinois University Press, 1968. pp. 96-125.
- Reid, Forest. "Minor Fiction in the 'Eighties." The Eighteen-Eighties. Ed. Walter de la Mare. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1930. pp. 107-35.
- Riddell, William Renwick. John Richardson. Toronto: Ryerson, 1926.
- . William Kirby. Toronto: Ryerson, 1923.
- Roper, Gordon. "New Forces, New Fiction." Literary History of Canada. Ed. Carl F. Klinck. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1967, pp. 260-83.
- Ross, Matthew Whiting. The Silver-Fork School. Novels of Fashion Preceding Vanity Fair. New York: Columbia University Press, 1936.
- Schulenberger, Arvid. Cooper's Theory of Fiction. Lawrence: University of Kansas Press, 1955.
- Scott, Joel A. "Publishing in Canada, 1751-1861." Amphora, 12 (Fall-Winter, 1972/73), 17-24.
- Seventh Census of Canada, 1931. Vol. 1. Ottawa: Patenaude, 1936.
- Shortt, Samuel Edward Dole. The Search for an Ideal. Six Canadian Intellectuals and their convictions in an age of transition. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1976.
- Shrive, Norman. Charles Mair, Literary Nationalist. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1965.
- Silver, A. I. "Introduction." Jules-Paul Tardivel, For My Country, "Pour La Patrie". Trans. Sheila Fischman. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1975.
- Simmons, James C. The Novelist as Historian. Essays on the Victorian Historical Novel. The Hague: Mouton, 1973.
- Sorfleet, John Robert. "French Canada in Nineteenth-Century English-Canadian Fiction." Diss. New Brunswick 1975.
- . "Fiction and the Fall of New France." Journal of Canadian Fiction, 2, No. 3 (Summer 1973), 132-46.

Stang, Richard. The Theory of the Novel in England, 1850-1870. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1959.

Storey, Norah. The Oxford Companion to Canadian Literature and History. Toronto: Oxford, 1967.

Tausky, Thomas E. "The American Girls of William Dean Howells and Sara Jeannette Duncan." Journal of Canadian Fiction, No. 13 (1975), 146-58.

Taylor, John Tinnon. Early Opposition to the English Novel. The Popular Reactions from 1760 to 1830. New York: King's Crown Press, 1943.

Tod, Dorothea, and Cordingley, Audrey. "A Bibliography of Canadian Literary Periodicals, 1789-1900." Transactions of the Royal Society of Canada, ser. 2, 26 (1932), section II, pp. 87-96.

Tompkins, J. M. S. The Popular Novel in England, 1770-1800. 1932; rpt. London: Methuen, 1969.

Wallace, Elizabeth. Goldwin Smith: Victorian Liberal. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1957.

Wallace, W. S. "The Periodical Literature of Upper Canada." Canadian Historical Review, 12 (March 1931), 4-22.

Walpole, Hugh. "The Historical Novel in England Since Sir Walter Scott." Sir Walter Scott Today. Ed. H. J. C. Grierson. London: Constable, 1932. pp. 161-88.

Waterston, Elizabeth. "Canadian Cabbage, Canadian Rose," Journal of Canadian Fiction, 2, No. 3 (Summer 1973), 129-31.

Watt, Frank William. "Literature of Protest." Literary History of Canada. Ed. Carl F. Klinck. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1967, pp. 457-73.

-----". "Radicalism in English-Canadian Literature Since Confederation." Diss. Toronto 1957.

Watt, Ian. The Rise of the Novel. London: Chatto & Windus, 1957.

Watters, R. E. A Checklist of Canadian Literature and Background Materials, 1628-1900. Second edition. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1972.

-----". "Introduction." A Strange Manuscript Found in a Copper Cylinder, by James De Mille, 1888; rpt. Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 1969.

Wollock, Geoffrey L. "Violet Keith and all that sort of thing."
Journal of Canadian Fiction, 3, No. 3 (1974), 80-88.

Wood, Susan Joan. "The Land in Canadian Prose, 1840-1945."
Diss. Toronto 1975.

Woodcock, George. "De Mille and the Utopian Vision." Journal of Canadian Fiction, 2, No. 3 (Summer 1973), 174-79.

PERIODICALS CONSULTED:
AN ANNOTATED BIBLIOGRAPHY

Acadian Magazine; or Literary Mirror, consisting of original and selected matter on literary subjects.
Editor unidentified.
Published by J. S. Cunabell.
Monthly, Halifax.
vol. 1-2, July 1826-February 1828.

Erudite and literary in tone, the Acadian's contents were almost entirely anonymous or pseudonymous. Most of its material was original; its poetry especially reveals the nature and extent of local literary activity. In its fiction the exotic tale prevailed, while its non-fiction consisted largely of scholarly argument, or of local practical and historical information.

Anglo-American Magazine.
Edited by Rev. Robert Jackson MacGeorge.
Published by Thomas Maclear.
Monthly, Toronto.
vol. 1-7, July 1852-December 1855.

The contents of the Anglo-American seem to have been mostly selected from British and American periodicals, although it also published several stories by Susanna Moodie and Catharine Parr Traill, and Traill's unfinished series of "Forest Gleanings." The magazine's intelligent conservatism and sensible literary criticism appeared in its lively "Editor's Shanty" column. For a detailed study of the Anglo-American, see Robert L. McDougall, "A Study of Canadian Periodical Literature of the Nineteenth Century," Diss. Toronto 1950.

Belford's Monthly Magazine; a magazine of literature and art.

Editor unidentified

Published by Belford,

Monthly, Toronto.

vol. 1-3; December 1876-May 1878.

To gain a large popular audience, Belford's serialized fiction by James Payn, J. G. Holland, and Edward Eggleston. It also published stories and articles by important Canadian cultural figures like George Stewart, Jr., J. G. Bourinot, and J. M. LeMoine. In July 1878, Belford's merged with the Canadian Monthly and National Review to form Rose-Belford's Canadian Monthly.

British American Magazine; devoted to Literature, Science, and Art.

Edited by Henry Youle Hind.

Published by Rollo & Adam.

Monthly, Toronto.

vol. 1-2, May 1863-April 1864.

Founded by Graeme Mercer Adam, this sophisticated magazine's contributors constitute a roll call of Central Canada's ~~leading~~ leading authors. The British American published fiction by Mrs. Holiwell, Susanna Moodie and Louisa Murray, poetry by Mrs. Leprohon and Charles Sangster, and serious articles by Henry Youle Hind, Thomas D'Arcy McGee, and Daniel Wilson. In his "Study of Canadian Periodical Literature of the Nineteenth Century" (Diss. Toronto 1950), Robert L. McDougall discusses the British American as a periodical which mirrors the intellectual and cultural outlook of its age.

British Canadian Review.

Editor unidentified.

Published by Hunter, Rose & Co.

Monthly, Quebec.

vol. 1, no. 1-3, December 1862-February 1863.

This short-lived English-language Quebec periodical was intended to be "a trustworthy source of information and amusement, and a truthful repository of National literature, pure and undefiled." Its articles and poems, by writers like J. M. LeMoine, Henry Morgan and Charles Sangster, reflect a nationalistic point of view, and its book reviews concentrate on Canadian publications.

British Colonial Magazine, Gems of Literature.

Edited by W. H. Smith, author of Smith's Canadian gazetteer (1846) and Canada: past, present and future (1851).

Published by Henry Rowse.

Weekly, Toronto.

vol. 1, no. 1-26, 1852-1853.

In his article titled "A Century of Canadian Magazines," Arthur H. U. Colquhoun stated that this is "said to have been an English periodical having a Canadian imprint" (CM, 17 [June 1901] 147). Its contents were all selected from British magazines, and only the odd review of a Canadian book indicates its national origin.

Bystander; a monthly review of current events.

Edited by Goldwin Smith.

Published by Hunter, Rose & Co.

Toronto.

Monthly, vol. 1-2, January 1880-June 1881.

Quarterly, vol. 3, January -October 1883.

Monthly, new series, October 1889-September 1890.

The voice of Goldwin Smith, the Bystander commented fearlessly and idiosyncratically on current local and international events. Smith paid scant attention to imaginative literature; his few remarks on recent fiction and poetry reflect his conservative bias, present also in his articles expressing anti-Semitism and arguing against female suffrage.

Canada Bookseller.

Edited by Graeme Mercer Adam.

Published by Rollo & Adam; new series by Adam, Stevenson.

Toronto.

Earliest unnumbered issue, March 1865. Quarterly, vol. 1-2,

March 1870-April 1871.

Monthly, new series vol. 1-2, January-December 1872.

A trade journal, the Canada Bookseller provides valuable information about the publishing and selling of books in Canada from before Confederation to 1872. Its contents, including many articles on the problem of copyright, were presumably from the pen of Graeme Mercer Adam.

Canadian Illustrated News.

Edited by Alexander Robertson 1869-73; edited by John Talon-Lesperance 1873-1880.

Published by George Desbarats.

Weekly, Montreal.

vol. 1-28, 30 October 1869 - 29 December 1883.

Large and lavishly illustrated, this periodical tried at first to satisfy both its nationalism and its need for a large readership by promoting Canadian fiction. Its proportion of Canadian material decreased, its later volumes serializing novels by writers like Rhoda Broughton. Lesperance wrote much of the Illustrated News's Canadian material and Rosanna Leprohon contributed fiction, but the magazine never acquired the sophisticated tone of the best periodicals of the era, and its engravings are generally of more interest than its written content.

Canadian Journal: A Reportory of Industry, Science and Art, and a record of the Proceedings of the Canadian Institute.

Edited by Henry Youle Hind.

Published by the Canadian Institute.

Toronto.

vol. 1-3, August 1852-December 1855. 2nd series, vol. 1-15, January 1856-January 1878. 3rd series, vol. 1-6, 1879-1888.

The organ of the Canadian Institute, the Canadian Journal was almost exclusively scientific in orientation, with only the occasional review or article of literary interest. It is analyzed by Robert McDougall in his "Study of Canadian Periodical Literature of the Nineteenth Century," Diss. Toronto 1950.

Canadian Literary Magazine.

Edited by J. Kent.

Published by George Gurnett, Courier Office.

Monthly, York, Upper Canada.

vol. 1 no. 1-3, April-October 1833.

A precursor of the Literary Garland in style and content, this short-lived journal published poems and stories by Susanna Moodie and similarly elegant authors.

Canadian Magazine of politics, science, art and literature.
Sometimes called Canadian.

Founded and edited by J. Gordon Mowat, vol. 1-5. Succeeded by John Alexander Cooper.

Published by the Ontario Publishing Company.

Monthly, Toronto.

vol. 1-91, March 1893-April 1939

Popular and nationalistic, the Canadian Magazine published articles on Canadian events, stories by Canadian writers, and kept track of the literary careers of Canadian authors in its "Books and Authors" column. In 1897 it incorporated the eighteen month-old, financially bankrupt Massey's Magazine.

Canadian Magazine and Literary Repository.

Founded and edited by David Chisholme, July 1823-February 1824.

Edited by Dr. A. J. Christie, February 1824-June 1825.

Published by Joseph Nickless.

Monthly, Montreal.

vol. 1-4, July 1823-June 1825.

A rival of Samuel Hull Wilcocke's Scribbler, the Canadian Magazine selected some material from leading British periodicals like Blackwood's and the New Monthly Magazine, but a high proportion of its content was "original." Intelligent and mature in tone, it published informative articles on Canadian life, and the pre-faces to its four volumes present interesting insights into cultural and publishing conditions. Its fiction leans towards exoticism, in contrast to the common-sensical stance of its literary criticism.

Canadian Methodist Magazine; devoted to Religion, Literature and Social Progress. Called Methodist Magazine and Review, vol. 29-42, 1889-1895.

Founded and edited by William H. Withrow.

Published by Methodist Book Room.

Monthly, Toronto.

vol. 1-94, January 1875-December 1906.

This magazine's fiction and reviews overwhelmingly reflect its Methodist point of view. It is of literary interest largely because its editor, William H. Withrow, was associated with many of the leading cultural figures of his day, and wrote a number of religious novels, travel books and historical works.

Canadian Monthly and National Review.

Editor unidentified (not Graeme Mercer Adam, according to Marilyn Flitton).

Published by Adam, Stevenson, 1872-76; Hart & Rawlinson, 1877-78.

Monthly, Toronto.

vol. 1-13, January 1872-June 1878.

Influenced by Goldwin Smith and closely associated with Canada First, the Canadian Monthly was definitely the most important post-Confederation Canadian periodical. Nationalistic, moral and conservative in its political and literary views, it published the best Canadian periodical writing of the time. In 1878 it merged with Belford's Magazine to form Rose-Belford's Canadian Monthly. Although some critics describe Graeme Mercer Adam as its editor, Marilyn Flitton claims that he was only the publisher until 1879, when he began to edit Rose-Belford's Canadian Monthly. The Canadian Monthly receives detailed analysis in Robert L. McDougall's dissertation, "A Study of Canadian Periodical Literature of the Nineteenth Century" (Diss. Toronto 1950), in Roy Daniells's chapter on "Confederation to the First World War," in the Literary History of Canada (ed. Carl F. Klinck [Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1967] pp. 191-207), and in Marilyn Flitton's Index to the Canadian Monthly and National Review and Rose-Belford's Canadian Monthly (Toronto: Bibliographical Society of Canada, 1976).

Canadian Review and Literary and Historical Journal. Also called Canadian Review and Magazine.

Edited by David Chisholme.

Published by H. A. Cunningham.

Montreal.

vol. 1 no. 1-5, July 1824-September 1826.

Founded by David Chisholme to rival the Canadian Magazine and Literary Repository after he had disassociated himself from the latter, the Canadian Review lasted for only five, irregularly published numbers. In style it was similar to the Canadian Magazine, publishing a number of stories and poems by Canadian authors, in addition to informative and polemical essays.

Canadian Spectator.

Edited by Rev. A. J. Bray.

Published by the Canadian Spectator Company.

Weekly, Montreal.

vol. 1, 5 January-28 December 1878.

A weekly digest of current news and articles emphasizing theology, the Canadian Spectator also published level-headed reviews of popular fiction, mostly American in origin.

Canadiana; A Collection of Canadian Notes published monthly.

Edited by W. J. White.

Published by Gazette Printing Company.

Monthly, Montreal.

vol. 1-2, January 1889-December 1890.

Edited by the Vice-president (later President) of the Montreal Society for Historical Studies, Canadiana's main focus was Canadian history, with some interest in historical fiction.

Colonial Protestant; and Journal of Literature and Science.

Edited by Rev. W. Taylor and Rev. J. M. Cramp.

Published by Rollo Campbell.

Monthly, Montreal.

vol. 1-2, January 1848-March 1849.

Dedicated to the extermination of Romanism, this vehemently Protestant journal defined "literature" as theological writing.

Dominion Annual Register and Review.

Edited by Henry J. Morgan.

Published by MacLean Roger, 1879-80; Lovell, 1881; Hunter Rose, 1882-85; Senecal 1886.

Annually. Ottawa, 1878-80; Montreal, 1881, 1886; Toronto, 1882-85.

8 vols., 1878-86.

Although the Dominion Annual Register was mainly a summary of political and statistical information, each volume from 1879 to 1886 contained a "Review of Literature, and Science and Art" which supplies valuable information about books published that year. The first of these was by John George Bourinot; subsequent authors remain anonymous, but the title page for each volume suggests that likely candidates include John Reade, G. Mercer Adam and Charles G. D. Roberts.

Dominion Illustrated.

Edited by John Talon-Lesperance, 1888-89; John Reade, 1889-91;
J. P. Edwards, 1892-95.

Published by George Desbarats.

Montreal.

Weekly, vol. 1-7, 1 July 1888.-26 December 1891. Monthly, new
series, vol. 1-3, February 1892-1895.

Montreal's major English periodical during the late 1880's and
early 1890's, the Dominion Illustrated was coloured by an earnest
sense of nationalism which was established by its first editor
and maintained by his successors. Among the leading authors
published were Charles G. D. Roberts, Archibald MacMechan, Bliss
Carman, George Stewart, James M. LeMoine and Pauline Johnson,
whose fiction, sketches and serious articles provide a good summary
of contemporary literary concerns.

Halifax Monthly Magazine.

Edited by John Sparrow Thompson.

Published by J. S. Cunabell.

Monthly, Halifax.

vol. 1-3, June 1830-January 1833.

Often political in interest, this magazine's contents appear
to have been largely original. While the Halifax Monthly Magazine
payed close attention to local current events, its fiction and
poetry bear little relation to Nova Scotia or Canada.

Harp; A Magazine of General Literature.

Editor unidentified.

Published by Gillies & Callahan.

Monthly, Montreal.

vol. 1-7, May 1874-October 1882.

Not a "magazine of general literature," but the voice of Montreal's
Irish Catholic community, the Harp's fiction and general orientation
was resolutely Irish, with little interest in Canada.

Lake Magazine.

Founded by D. K. Mason.

Publisher unidentified.

Monthly, Toronto.

vol. 1, no. 1-7, August 1892-February 1893.

Nationalistic and imperialistic, the Lake published interesting articles on the female suffrage question, politics, and religion, as well as good short fiction.

Literary Garland and British North American Magazine; A Monthly Repository of Tales, Sketches, Poetry, Music, etc.

Edited by John Gibson, assisted in later volumes by Mrs. E. L. Cushing.

Published by John Lovell.

Monthly, Montreal.

vol. 1-4, December 1838-November 1842; new series vol. 1-9, January 1843-December 1851.

The most important and influential literary periodical of the 1840's, the Literary Garland fostered a taste for genteel, polite fiction and poetry, written in an ornamental style, and reflecting very little of contemporary Canadian life. Among its major authors were Susanna Moodie, Rosanna Leprohon, Mrs. E. L. Cushing and Mrs. H. V. Cheney. Robert McDougall discusses the Garland in his "Study of Canadian Periodical Literature of the Nineteenth Century" (Diss. Toronto 1950), and Mary Markham Brown has published an Index to the Literary Garland (Toronto: Bibliographical Society of Canada, 1962).

Maple Leaf; a Juvenile Monthly Magazine.

Edited and published by Robert W. Lay, 1852-53; taken over by his widow, March 1853.

Monthly, Montreal.

vol. 1-4, July 1852-December 1854.

Condescending and didactic, the Maple Leaf published fiction and articles by Susanna Moodie, Catharine Parr Traill, and other writers who remain anonymous. In tone it resembles a juvenile extension of the Literary Garland. It was founded by Robert Lay, who had aided in the publication of the Snow Drop, when the proprietors of the Snow Drop decided they no longer needed Lay's assistance.

Maple Leaf; or, Canadian Annual.
 Edited by Rev. Dr. John McCaul.
 Published by Henry Rowsell.
 Annually, Toronto.
 vol. 1-3, 1847-49.

Because readers of the first volume of the Maple Leaf deplored its lack of Canadian content, the second attempted to amend this error by including material praising Toronto. Some of its anonymous and pseudonymous writers have been identified by pencilled notes in the margins of the volumes held by the Library of the University of British Columbia.

Maritime Monthly. A Magazine of Literature, Science and Art.
 Edited by H. L. Spencer.
 Published by A. & W. Mackinlay (Halifax), J. & A. McMillan (Saint John), Dawson Bros. (Montreal).
 Monthly, Halifax, Saint John and Montreal.
 vol. 1-5, January 1873-June 1875.

This post-Confederation periodical was designed to acquaint the various regions of Canada with each other, presenting descriptive sketches, historical essays, poetry, and little fiction. Of especial interest are the contributions of Rev. M. Harvey of Saint John's, who published many sketches and stories of Newfoundland life in the Maritime Monthly.

Massey's Magazine.
 Edited by Hart Massey (?).
 Published by Hart Massey.
 Monthly, Toronto.
 vol. 1-3, January 1896-June 1897.

This regrettably short-lived periodical resembled a popular, illustrated version of The Week. During the eighteen months of its existence it published four short stories by Duncan Campbell Scott, before it was absorbed by the Canadian Magazine in 1897.

Monthly Review; devoted to the Civil Government of Canada.
 Edited by John Waudby.
 Publisher unidentified.
 Monthly, Toronto.
 vol. 1, January-June 1841.

According to Arthur Colquhoun, the Monthly Review "was originally projected in Kingston, but printed in Toronto, in 1841. It was edited by Dr. John Waudby, a political pamphleteer and journalist of that day, but it was really the organ of Lord Sydenham, who wanted his constitutional views expounded and defended. When he passed away the magazine disappeared" ("A Century of Canadian Magazines," CM, 17 [June 1901], 146). Its primary literary achievement was the publication of an anonymous article titled "The Literature of a New Country."

New Dominion Monthly.

Edited by John Dougall.

Published by John Dougall & Son.

Monthly, Montreal.

vol. 1-[25], October 1867-January 1879. No volume numbering after vol. 4.

Founded on the wave of post-Confederation nationalism, the New Dominion Monthly began as an unremarkable popular magazine but improved as it attracted important Canadian writers like J. G. Bourinot and J. M. LeMoine. In the early 1870's it slowly changed from a national to a ladies' magazine, but it was still unable to survive the economic depression of the late 1870's.

Nova Scotia Magazine and Comprehensive Review of Literature, Politics and News.

Edited by Rev. William Cochran, then by Joseph Howe.

Published by Joseph Howe.

Monthly, Halifax.

vol. 1-5, July 1789-March 1792.

The first Canadian literary periodical, the Nova Scotia Magazine relied heavily on selections from British books and periodicals, and was overtly Loyalist in its attention to British politics. It published some local poetry, and essays, but showed little interest in fiction.

Prince Edward Island Magazine.

Edited and published by Archibald Irwin.

Monthly, Charlottetown.

vol. 1-7, March 1899-January 1905.

Very local in orientation, this magazine presents a delightful picture of turn-of-the-century Prince Edward Island life and culture. Its book review columns followed the careers of Gilbert Parker and Charles G. D. Roberts.

Provincial; or, Halifax Monthly Magazine.

Edited by Mary Jane Katzmann.

Published by James Bowes & Sons.

Monthly, Halifax.

vol. 1-2, January 1852-December 1853.

Intelligently written, the Provincial published work by leading contemporary Maritime writers but could not attract enough subscribers to survive. See George L. Parker, "Literary Journalism Before Confederation," Canadian Literature, No. 68/69 (Spring/Summer 1976), p. 91.

Rose-Belford's Canadian Monthly and National Review.

Edited by George Stewart, Jr., 1878; succeeded by Graeme Mercer Adam, 1879-82.

Published by Belford Bros.

Monthly, Toronto.

vol. 1-8, July 1878-June 1882.

Formed by the merging of the Canadian Monthly and National Review with Belford's Monthly Magazine, Rose-Belford's aimed for a wide popular audience. Slicker than its predecessors, it included more illustrations, modified the political character of the Canadian Monthly, and serialized fiction by popular American novelists. It published some literary criticism, including a lengthy book review column; its Canadian content stressed informative essays and light fiction. See Marilyn Flitton, Index to the Canadian Monthly and National Review and Rose-Belford's Canadian Monthly (Toronto: Bibliographical Society of Canada, 1976).

Saturday Reader. Sometimes called Illustrated Saturday Reader.

Editor unidentified.

Published by W. B. Cordier, vol. 1-2; succeeded by R. Worthington. Weekly, Montreal.

vol. 1-4, September 1865-August 1867.

Despite its announcement that it would confine itself "chiefly to the reproduction of the works of British authors of repute," the Saturday Reader paid considerable to Canadian literature. It published poetry by Rosanna Leprohon, prose by Mrs. J. V. Noel, and reviews of Antoinette de Mirecourt, the first volume of LeMoine's Maple Leaves, Heavysege's The Advocate, and many of the books published by Dawson, in Montreal.

Snow Drop; or, Juvenile Magazine.

Edited by Mrs. E. L. Cushing and Mrs. H. V. Cheney.

Published by Lovell & Gibson, vol. 1-4; new series vol. 1 published by Robert Lay; succeeded by James Armour.

Monthly, Montreal.

vol. 1-4, April 1847-June 1850; new series vol. 1-5, July 1850-June 1853.

Predecessor of the Maple Leaf, the Snow Drop set the moralistic, didactic tone which was continued in the Maple Leaf. The Canadian authors of its stories and informative articles remain anonymous; its selected material was frequently drawn from Chambers' Edinburgh Journal. Edited by two of the Literary Garland's major contributors, it resembles a juvenile version of the Garland.

Stewart's Literary Quarterly Magazine, devoted to Light and Entertaining Literature. Sometimes called Stewart's Quarterly or Stewart's Quarterly Magazine.

Edited by George Stewart, Jr.

Published by George James Chubb.

Quarterly, Saint John.

vol. 1-5, April 1867-October 1872.

The major post-Confederation periodical of the Maritimes, Stewart's anticipated the intelligent tone and national orientation of the Canadian Monthly and National Review. It paid considerable attention to Canadian poetry and fiction, reviewing Canadian books, and publishing stories by John George Bourinot and articles by James LeMoine. For a detailed account of the magazine's publishing history and descriptions of its contributors, see George Stewart, "The History of a Magazine," DI, ser. 2, 1 (Aug. 1892), 400-08.

Victoria Magazine. A Cheap Periodical for the Canadian People.
 Edited by Susanna and J. W. Dunbar Moodie.
 Published by Joseph Wilson.
 Monthly, Belleville.
 vol. 1, September 1847-August 1848.

Closely resembling the Literary Garland in taste and style, the Victoria Magazine was conducted by the Moodies to help civilize rural Canada by cultivating a taste for polite, genteel literature. The magazine has been reprinted, with an introduction by William H. New, by the University of British Columbia Library (1968).

Week; A Canadian Journal of Politics, Society and Literature.
 Edited by Charles G. D. Roberts, 1883-84; successor unidentified.
 Published by C. Blackett Robinson.
 Weekly, Toronto.
 vol. 1-13, 6 December 1883 - 20 November 1896.

Undoubtedly the most important Canadian periodical of the 1880's and 1890's, The Week provided a forum for Canadian political and literary argument, publishing the opinions of Sara Jeannette Duncan, Graeme Mercer Adam and Goldwin Smith, among others. It also published and reviewed the poetry of Archibald Lampman, Duncan Campbell Scott, and William Wilfred Campbell. Claude T. Bissell discusses the importance of The Week to late Victorian Canada's intellectual development in his article titled "Literary Taste in Central Canada During the Late Nineteenth Century," Canadian Historical Review, 31 (Sept. 1950), 237-251. Rpt. in Twentieth Century Essays on Confederation Literature, ed. Lorraine McMullen (Ottawa: Tecumseh Press, 1976).