SCORE AND STRUCTURE IN RITUAL REPRESENTATION: MEANINGS OF THE NOTATIONAL FORM IN SARUM PROCESSIONAL IMAGES

by

Jamie L. Kemp

A THESIS SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF
THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF

MASTER OF ARTS

in

The Faculty of Graduate Studies

(Art History, Visual Art and Theory)

THE UNIVERSITY OF BRITISH COLUMBIA

September, 2007

Abstract

This research project examines an intriguing type of depictions which can be found within Sarum processional manuscripts, a genre of liturgical books which were produced between the thirteenth and fifteenth centuries. The central focus is a specific example from Norwich which was produced between the late fourteenth and early fifteenth centuries. I propose that their flat, ordered, and geometrically arranged mode of representation can be best understood when considered in relation to the semantic characteristics of notational systems. Their visual form signals that they are not representations of idiosyncratic events which have happened in the past, but are instead authoritative proscriptive layouts. They illustrate what important objects are required for the performance of a ritual and the number, status and position of the participants that will need to be in attendance. Thus, I argue that the viewer is not intended to be a passive witness to a scene taking place in the image, but is instead a presumed participant in a future performance of a specific character.

Three arguments are introduced to lend support to the thesis. The first presents historical evidence which illustrates the authoritative role given to these books. The text discusses their widespread use and argues that this authoritative role may have been the result of a deliberate strategy on the part of the individuals seeking to increase the circulation of the books associated with the Sarum Use. The second argument is based on the examination of the relationships between the images and the texts found within the books. It states that

the images do not present sufficient information to be considered pictorial instructions, but instead, can convey other meanings. The final argument is that the pictorial images have the semantic characteristics of a notational system. I argue that they are related to one specific system—the musical scores which interleave the images and intermingle with them in the pictorial frame.

Table of Contents

List of Figures

Acknowledgements

I extend the most earnest thanks to the faculty, staff, and my fellow graduate students in the Department of Art History, Visual Art and Theory at the University of British Columbia. I owe particular gratitude to Dr. Carol Knicely and Dr. Caroline Hirasawa. Their excellent advice and insightful questions have allowed me to understand my own work more deeply. They are both educators of the best kind.

I also offer my enduring gratitude to both my parents and my brother for their unfailing support through my years of education. They have all given much in order to allow me to continue my studies. My mother, who is nearly as talented a proof-reader as she is a painter, is deserving of particular admiration.

Special thanks are owed to my partner Nicolas Bullot, who has not yet tired of reading and re-reading this text. His encouragement, willingness to devote time to discussion, and gourmet French cooking continue to be a source of inspiration.

1 Introduction

The present project studies an intriguing type of depiction that can be found in Sarum processional manuscripts, a genre of books—produced between the thirteenth and fifteenth centuries—that contains chant scores and written instructions for the organization of ritual processions. Specifically, this study will focus on a manuscript, now in the British Library, which was copied in the city of Norwich between the late fourteenth and early fifteenth centuries. These images, which have not attracted the attention of art historians, are quite puzzling as they exhibit some striking and unusual visual properties. These include their flat, ordered and geometrically arranged appearance, the unusual combination of two distinct kinds of perspectival cues (both frontal and aerial viewpoints), and their use of a limited vocabulary of symbols or pictograms.

The pictograms themselves, including mysterious double circles and isolated but carefully rendered liturgical objects, challenge the viewer to provide an interpretation or a story which could explain the meaning of the symbols and their meticulous display. What could these symbols represent? And why are they presented using this mode of representation?

Looking closely at the image related to the Singing of the Litany at the Font on Holy Saturday (Figure 1), we see two tall and slender columns framing a geometrically arranged group of symbols. A pair of candles in detailed candlesticks hover to either

side of a golden processional cross. Below this is the symbol representing an elaborate censor which rests between a closed book and a third taper. Just below this row are two identical oil containers and the mysterious double circles, which are arranged in a careful "T" shape.

From examining these curious images, one can see that rather than displaying their subject in an easily recognizable setting or moment in time, they operate in a more abstract, ordered and symbolic way. They present objects or pictographs in isolation from their worldly environment and embodied in an artifactual context in which spatial relationships are emphasized for the purposes of instructing the viewer.

The use of this mode of representation raises several fundamental questions for the art historian: Why has this mode been chosen rather than other modes which may capture a ritual in a way which we may consider to be more direct and easily readable? Are there specific meanings, strategies and advantages attached to this particular mode of representation? Have a set of conventions been invented for this particular type of image, or does it have significant precedents?

I will argue that the interpretation of these images can be aided through the study of notational systems, such as diagrams and musical scores, and will therefore compare painting with these other types of representation. While this is an unusual methodological approach to the study of art, it is my argument that we can look to these modes of representation to help us to better understand the meaning and historical function of an image.

My argument is that the study of these images reveals that they are associated with a notational language which must be interpreted according to specific rules or conventions. They can be understood as guides to performances, and can therefore be said to have characteristics which are similar to that of a musical score, a symbol system which was quite well developed in the Middle Ages. By entering into a discussion of the characteristics of scores, I will suggest that the images discussed in this paper can be said to reflect a sense of authority, order, hierarchy and structure.

First, I will introduce the historical context in which the images were produced. This section will discuss the processional genre in detail and also look at the historical circumstances found at Salisbury Cathedral which might have encouraged its production. Second, I will discuss and describe the images themselves, focusing on the vocabulary of symbols, possible systems of syntactic organization, and also their various limitations. This section will also include a comparison with what I will classify as more "scenic" or "figurative" modes of representation. The following section will include an examination of the written content of the processional book itself. I will focus here on the relationship between the images and their accompanying texts. The argument of the final section is that the processional images have the semantic characteristics of a notational system. I will expand the discussion to other forms of pictorial representation which are linked conceptually with the processional images including diagrams as a wider category, the Arma Christi, medieval cartographic images. In the end, I will argue that the notational system with

which this processional shares the most structural characteristics may be music

notation.

2 Power Strategies and the Historical Context of the Sarum Processional Books

The particular historical moment in which the Sarum processional book was produced and used can provide a good starting point for the discussion of the advantages of the notational mode of presentation. A discussion of some key figures related to Salisbury, or Sarum, cathedral and her liturgical history will help to provide the necessary historical context for the processional genre. It will also, however, bring to light several power strategies[1] associated with the project of securing the widespread distribution of the books associated with this diocese. The acceptance of Sarum as an authority over ritual form across the British Isles would be an important achievement for Salisbury Cathedral as an institution. The long standing interest in organized ritual, and the fact that the liturgy was not standardized during this period, makes this particularly true. This authority would give the cathedral, as an institution, the power to govern the ritual actions of others in their neighbouring areas.[2] When examining the historical context of the processional books, two main strategies for securing this

---

[1] By *power strategies* I mean planned "winning solutions" as discussed, for example, in, Foucault, Michel, "The Subject and Power," in *Michel Foucault: Beyond Structuralism and Hermeneutics*, ed. Hubert L. Dreyfus and Paul Rabinow (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1983), : pp. 224-5.

[2] I use the term "govern" to mean "to structure the possible field of action of others", as used by Foucault in, Ibid., p. 221. The notion of power strategies is also outlined in the aforementioned text.

authority can be isolated. They are, namely (i) the assertion of a connection between the bishops of Salisbury and Rome and (ii) the attempt to forge a relationship between the Use of Sarum and a particularly renown bishop.[3] In order to understand the relationship between the visual form of the processional images and Sarum's desire to wield authority over ceremonial form, we will first examine the history of the processional books themselves, and then turn our attention to each of the aforementioned strategies in turn.

2.1 History of the Processional Book and its Known Copies

The Sarum processional book is a text which contains the chant scores and instructions for the celebration of the Mass, with a strong focus on the more elaborate rituals of Holy Week, including those performed on Palm Sunday and Holy Saturday. It was produced originally in the city of Salisbury, and is a service book associated with the Use of Sarum[4], but at the height of its popularity in the late middle ages it began to be copied and produced in other cities. The date of the first book of this type, which is now lost, is unknown. However, between the 13th and the end of the 15th century, books of this type were a fairly common possession of larger Churches in England and the surrounding territories, including the city of Norwich, where the

---

[3] I will argue that the use of the visual form of the processional images can be interpreted as a third strategy associated with the project to assert the authority of the Sarum liturgical form, but I will reserve this for sections 3 and 5.

[4] The Use of Sarum refers to the standardized liturgical customs of the city of Salisbury.

6

images which are the topic of this paper were produced between the late 14th and early 15th centuries. Despite its popularity, the use of Processional books, which seem to have had a relatively short period of production, fell into decline in the 16th century.[5]

The Sarum processional is one of the service books which, along with the city's missal, gradual, and breviary, represents the codification of the Sarum Use or the liturgical customs of Salisbury Cathedral.[6] Salisbury's Use, which is based on early Roman Rites, was thought to have been designed by the Norman Bishop Osmond of Salisbury (later Saint Osmond) some time in the 9th century.[7] Terence Bailey argues that the book was originally a supplementary volume to the books of Mass and Office and the Ordinals which contained the chant scores for rituals.[8] While this is certainly

---

[5] Bailey, Terence, *The Processions of Sarum and the Western Church* (Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Medieval Studies, 1971): p. 79.

[6] Ibid. p. x.

[7] For further reading on the 'Use of Sarum' and its relationship with Bishop Osmond, see: Brown, Andrew D., *Popular Piety in Late Medieval England: The Diocese of Salisbury, 1250-1550* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1995): p. 4; Klauser, Theodor, *A Short History of the Western Liturgy: An Account and Some Reflections*, trans. John Halliburton (New York, Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1969); Northy, T.J., *The Popular History of Old & New Sarum* (Salisbury: Wiltshire County Mirror & Express Co., Ltd., 1897); Webber, Teresa, *Scribes and Scholars at Salisbury Cathedral C.1075 - C.1125* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1992). The history and connections between Osmond and the spread of the Use is complex and will be treated in greater detail later in this section of the paper.

[8] Bailey, *The Processions of Sarum and the Western Church*:p. 80. Further information regarding these liturgical books can be found in: Harper, John, *The Forms and Orders of Western Liturgy from the Tenth to the Eighteenth Century* (Oxford: Oxford University Press1, 1991): p. 207; Palazzo, Eric, *A History of the*

plausible, Bailey, like the other scholars who have studied processional manuscripts, is a music historian and therefore bases his assessment on the musical content of the texts.[9] These earlier and more established service books are, however, quite different from the Processional on several levels. They do not, for example, contain information about the specific staging of the Sunday processions or any illustrations.[10]

While the Sarum Processional books as a genre provide a relatively consistent assortment of information to the reader between editions, including both the chants and textual instructions which describe the route of the processions, the type of liturgical implements and vestments to be used, and the participants that would take part, several copies do not contain illustrations or diagrams.[11] Several examples are also incomplete, neglecting certain rituals altogether, despite the fact that these rituals certainly would have been performed.[12] In addition to textual differences, there are

---

Liturgical Books from the Beginning to the Thirteenth Centre, trans. Madeleine Beaumont (Collegeville Minnesota: Liturgical Press, 1993).

[9] The books have not, to my knowledge, been studied by art historians in the past. The images, therefore, have not been considered seriously when discussing possible precedents for this genre.

[10] Bailey, *The Processions of Sarum and the Western Church*: p. 80. This can also bee seen by examining other versions of the processional such as: Pynson, Richard, ed., *Processionale Ad Usum Sarum 1502*, vol. 16:1, *Musical Sources -Facsim* (Clarabricken, Ireland: Boethius Press, 1980).

[11] Wordsworth, Chr, *Ceremonies and Processions of the Cathedral Church of Salisbury* (Cambridge: The University Press, 1901): p. xx.

[12] Bailey, *The Processions of Sarum and the Western Church* : p. 80.

also variances in the number of images, their placement on the page, and their general form. These differences seem to be linked to the chronology of the books' production.[13]

While copies of this text were distributed in places far from Salisbury Cathedral, an interesting fact is that its contents were not altered to suit the needs of other churches. The texts do not change to take the architectural specificities of other spaces into account,[14] nor do the illustrations attempt to depict individual cathedral treasures or local participants. The Norwich copy of the Sarum Processional (Figures 1-9), for example, does not contain texts or diagrams which make specific reference to the idiosyncrasies of Norwich Cathedral. Indeed, the program of the rituals found in the text does not lose its Marian focus, which would have been particularly significant to the celebrations at Salisbury, in order to allow for the celebrations of the patron saints of other cities.[15] This level of standardization is surprising given the book's presumed use as a tool for the organization of the route and choreography of actual

---

[13] There are striking differences, for example, between the images found in the Norwich manuscript (Figures 1-9) and those found in later printed editions (Figures 11-23). This is a topic which will be discussed further in section 3.

[14] Two interesting text which focus on the routes of processions and connections between architecture and liturgy at Salisbury is: Davison, Nigel, "So Which Way Round Did They Go? The Palm Sunday Procession at Salisbury," *Music & Letters* 61, no. 1 (1980). For a more complete description of the building projects, see: Blum, Pamela Z, "The Sequence of Building Campaigns at Salisbury," *The Art Bulletin* 73, no. 1 (1991).

[15] Wordsworth, *Ceremonies and Processions of the Cathedral Church of Salisbury*: p. xix.

processions[16], and is a clear indication of the reputation that the Salisbury processions had attained.

Though there were Processional books created elsewhere, including York and Hereford, the group of Processionals associated with Sarum are said to be the only complete books of this genre which survive from the medieval period.[17] In all, the Sarum Processional exists today in the form of about twenty manuscripts and twenty-five printed editions.[18]

2.2 Strategy (i)— Salisbury and the Papal Court

The question of why these standardized books were circulated throughout the British Isles and the continent is a complex one and it seems to have been asked even in the medieval period. According to early sources, the ceremonies held at Salisbury Cathedral were taken as a model to be emulated by other parishes as early as the 11th century, making the books associated with the Sarum Use, of which the processional is a late example, a useful commodity. Books of a similar nature were also produced in other English cities, including Hereford and York, but no others enjoyed nearly as broad a distribution.[19]

---

[16] Hayes, Dawn Marie, *Body and Sacred Place in Medieval Europe, 1100-1389* (New York: Routledge, 2003): p. 18.

[17] Bailey, *The Processions of Sarum and the Western Church*: p. x.

[18] Ibid. p. 3.

[19] Ibid; Hayes, *Body and Sacred Place in Medieval Europe, 1100-1389*: p. 18.

The success of Sarum's processional can be linked with the acclaim given to the ritual practices associated with the Cathedral. In 1256 Bishop Giles de Bridport is said to have remarked that "Among the churches of the whole world the church of Sarum hath shone resplendent like the sun, in respect of its divine services."[20]

Early writings suggest that the clergy of Salisbury Cathedral were believed to have had a special status or authority when it came to matters of ceremony and ritual. Significantly, this authority was reputed to stem from the papal court in Rome. We read in Wilson's *English Martyrology,* for example, that it was speculated that the Bishop of Salisbury had been given the official "Titles of the Pope's Maister of the Cerimonyes" in "ancient tymes".[21] This belief could help to explain the influence of Sarum ritual, but while this is an image which clergy of Salisbury would surely wish to perpetuate, the remarks provide little in the way of reliable information. Wilson's text gives only the most general of explanations regarding the granting of the official title, giving the excerpt an almost legendary tone. He neglects to specify which Bishop of Salisbury was so honoured, and relegates the event to an indeterminate once upon a time.

---

[20] Bailey, *The Processions of Sarum and the Western Church*: p. x; *Statutes of the Cathedral Church of Sarum*, ed. C Wordsworth and D Macleane (Bath: 1813).

[21] Bailey, *The Processions of Sarum and the Western Church; Wilson's English Martyrology*, (London: 1608).

2.3 Strategy (ii)—The Use of Sarum and (Saint) Osmond

Despite Wilson's rather vague account for the prominent position of Sarum ritual and liturgical books, it does strengthen an interesting connection between the Use of Sarum and the Bishops of Old Salisbury.[22] It is likely that the Bishop of "ancient tymes" refers to Bishop Osmond (1078-99), who was (and often, still is) credited with compiling and codifying the rituals of the cathedral. The Norman Bishop Osmond, who was nephew of William the Conquerer, was highly interested in reviving the tradition of the Roman Rite. While no official documents can be found to link Osmond directly to the papacy, Romanization of the liturgy was definitely among his chief objectives.[23]

Although the liturgical books of Sarum are closely associated with Osmond and his interest in Roman liturgy, the codification of the rituals of Salisbury Cathedral was, in actuality, undertaken much later by Richard le Poore (d. 1237), Osmond's successor and the first Bishop of the New Sarum Cathedral. Richard le Poore may not have

---

[22] The cathedral at Old Sarum, which was completed in 1092, was partially destroyed by a storm shortly after its dedication. Herbert Poore (predecessor of Richard le Poore, in office 1194-1217) proposed moving the cathedral to a new location in 1194. The building of New Sarum, which was located a short distance from the old cathedral, commenced in 1220. See Northy, *The Popular History of Old & New Sarum*.

[23] Sources which discuss Osmond, his ties to the Sarum Use, and his interest in the Roman liturgy include: Brightman, F.E., *The English Rite*, 2 ed., vol. 1 (London: Rivingtons, 1921): p. xvii; Brown, *Popular Piety in Late Medieval England: The Diocese of Salisbury, 1250-1550;* Harper, *The Forms and Orders of Western Liturgy from the Tenth to the Eighteenth Century*.

been given due credit for the writing of the Use of Sarum, but he seems not to have gone to much trouble to right the situation. This may be explained by the fact that it was le Poore who instigated the campaign to canonize Osmond.[24] It is clear that the success of the canonization project would have had multiple advantages. The economic gains, stemming from the attraction of generous pilgrims, for example, could be particularly useful during the building and establishment of the new cathedral. But the financial rewards associated with the creation of a shrine to a saint with strong connections to the church aside, the canonization of Osmond may also have been considered an effective way of encouraging the widespread acceptance of Sarum's ritual and service books.[25] In the context of a strategy to gain symbolic power (authority), Le Poore could have used the name of Osmond to establish the authority of his texts by associating them with the former Bishop.[26] The connection between le Poore's liturgical books and Osmond's Roman tradition could have, in effect, been seen as a way to foster a sense of continuity between Old and New Sarum.

Unfortunately, le Poore's strategic attempt to canonize Osmond was unsuccessful and the efforts were continued, with varying degrees of zeal, until the petition was granted

---

[24] Brown, *Popular Piety in Late Medieval England: The Diocese of Salisbury, 1250-1550*: p. 5.

[25] Ibid. p. 57.

[26] Others interested in widening of the circulation of Sarum's service books and the promotion of liturgical standardization such as Bishop Hallam of Salisbury (1414) also took an interest in Osmond's canonization. Ibid. p. 6.

by the Pope in 1457. It seems that the successive campaign attempts coincide with times of increased financial need, including expenses related to an unexpectedly costly construction project in the late fourteenth century and the need for repairs to a crumbling belfry in 1363. [27] However, Brown notes in his book, *Popular Piety in Late Medieval England: The Diocese of Salisbury 1250-1550* that the extremely high cost of pursuing the canonization (over £1000 according to the records of the papal court) makes the explanation that the Cathedral officials were motivated by the possibility of drawing funds from pilgrims more difficult to accept on its own. Brown asserts that it is likely that the Bishop's canonization would also have been seen as a way to promote the status of the liturgical books which were associated with him.[28] In this way, the efforts would have had long term rewards which would have lasted beyond the immediate time of need.

The processional book, which is the focus of this study, is one of the books associated with the Sarum Use—despite the fact that there is little in the way of an actual connection between the text and Osmond. The link between the nearly sainted Bishop and the Processional would have given the book's contents some of the sense of authority that would be required to ensure the adoption of Sarum's "resplendent"

---

[27] Ibid. p. 58.

[28] Ibid. p. 59. In Foucaultian terms, Osmond could be established as an appropriate "authority of delimitation" regarding ritual form, whether or not he was living. See: Foucault, Michel, *The Archaeology of Knowledge*, trans. A. M. Sheridan Smith (London and New York: Routledge, 1989): p. 46.

ritual form, which may already have been famous, throughout Europe.[29] The images,

with their structured, organized, and codified appearance, help to convey the

information that the rituals themselves represent the work of a knowledgeable master

of ceremonies.[30]

---

[29] Bailey, *The Processions of Sarum and the Western Church*: p. x; *Statutes of the Cathedral Church of Sarum*.

[30] An article related to the interest in the Medieval interest in the organization of information, though in a different context, is: Caviness, Madeline H., "Images of Divine Order and the Third Mode of Seeing," *Gesta* 22, no. 2 (1983).

3 Visual Form and the Norwich Processional Images

In this section, we will turn our attention to the visual form of the Sarum processional images. Specifically, I will discuss the images found in the Sarum processional manuscript which was copied in the diocese of Norwich during the late 14th to early 15th century in order to establish the ways in which they convey the authority of Sarum rites (Figures 1-9). My suggestion is that these images convey the message that the Sarum rituals are structured, well ordered, and deserving the highest esteem. Further, the books themselves represent an authoritative manifestation of the divine rites. While these illustrations have, for the most part, been dismissed or ignored by scholars[31], it is clear that, like the texts found within the manuscript, they can be seen as important carriers of this message.

The Norwich Processional contains nine large, full page depictions of rituals, the majority of which are associated with the Easter Season. According to my identifications, they represent The Sunday Blessing of the Holy Water (fol. 2v) (Figure 2), The Palm Sunday Blessing of the Branches (fol. 32r) (Figure 3), The Holy

---

[31] As noted, these images have gained little attention form art historians. The most notable discussion can be found in, Wordsworth, *Ceremonies and Processions of the Cathedral Church of Salisbury*. While the scholar uses the woodcut images in his explanation of the rituals, he spends little time examining them. In fact, the scholar simply defines them as "rude" before moving on to other content.

Saturday Blessing of the New Fire (fol. 54v) (Figure 4), The Holy Saturday Blessing of the Paschal Candle (fol. 57r) (Figure 5), what appear to be two images representing The Singing of the Litany at the Font on Holy Saturday (fols. 62v & 63v) (Figures 1 & 6), two images of The Station at the Font at Vespers During Easter Week (fols. 71r & 72r) (Figures 7 & 8), and finally The Station Before the Cross at Vespers During the Summer (fol. 90r) (Figure 9). All nine of the images share certain striking visual characteristics, centering on an ordered arrangement of isolated pictographic symbols on a flat parchment ground. All of the diagrams also incorporate a rather unusual dual perspective, where some objects are depicted with a map-like aerial perspective while others are shown frontally.

Though it is true that each image exhibits unique features, I will begin this discussion with an examination of the picture related to the ritual of the Singing of the Litany at the Font on Holy Saturday, which was described briefly in the introduction (Figure 1). This ritual itself, which takes place on the day before Easter, involves preparing for the baptisms which would traditionally take place at the font on this day. The Singing of the Litany, which is to be performed here, is a practice which occurs during many rituals and requires the participants to chant petitions in a call and response form. This image is perhaps one of the most Spartan and unambiguous of the set, and I will use this particular example to highlight features which are more or less consistent throughout the nine representations. This will include a great number of the elements which make up much of the standard vocabulary of characters and symbols seen in each of the images. I stress this sense of uniformity as I consider it to

be essential to the meaning and significance of the structured form of representation. Despite the apparent differences between the nine depictions, there is a definite sense that the pictures are produced using a limited range of symbols and a distinct set of syntactic rules.

3.1 The Singing of The Litany at the Font on Holy Saturday

Each of the images, and the picture depicting the Singing of the Litany at the Font on Holy Saturday (Figure 1) is no exception, is framed by a pair of tall and slender columns to the left and right of the arrangements of flat symbols. The columns which stand to either side of the symbols representing the objects and individuals involved in the ritual work formally as a framing device, but they also act as an architectural container for the suspended objects. The columns are depicted in great detail, with intricate turreted capitals, a decorative band in the centre and elaborate multi-layered bases. These columns help to suggest the richness of the cathedral setting, without actually representing it explicitly and help to mark the importance of the spatial relationships between the objects. The columns are also important landmarks during the enactment of the rituals themselves and the text instructs the participants to perform certain actions upon reaching these points. In the Holy Saturday procession, we read that the fire for the thurible and candles is to be struck between these columns.[32] However, it is important to note that little attempt has been made to

---

[32] See the translation of the text found in section 4 (page 35) and also, Bailey, *The Processions of Sarum and the Western Church.*

18

portray a believable or specific space. Despite the detailed decoration of the columns, the viewer cannot visualize him/herself as a spectator in an actual cathedral. Only the relative spatial relationship between the participants and objects is preserved.

In the Singing of the Litany image (Figure 1), a collection of objects is arranged on the otherwise blank page. The most mysterious of these pictograms, the curious double circles which, are arranged in a "T" shape in the bottom portion of the image, are in fact the principle actors in the procession. They represent the tonsured heads of deacons and sub-deacons viewed from above. These individuals (or, rather, types of individuals) are depicted through one corporeal attribute—a significant one which would distinguish these individuals in life and represent their devotion. The larger grey tonsure, which overlaps the relatively ornate font, belongs to the Bishop or celebrant. The use of the colour grey could suggest age, and therefore experience and authority. This figure is further distinguished through the inclusion of his red cope which extends behind his head in a triangle shape.[33] As mentioned, other objects which are represented include the large and richly decorated font, the Cathedral columns and the small implements for use in the ritual, including candle sticks, oil flasks, a liturgical book, a censor, and a processional cross.

An examination of the text which explains this ritual tells the reader that, while the deacons and sub-deacons are depicted in their human form, however symbolic or

---

[33] The two objects which overlap each of the columns are curious inclusions which cannot be identified through examination of the text of the manuscript. This topic will be discussed further in section 4.

19

abstract their representation may be, the acolytes and boys who would carry the liturgical implements such as the censor, book, and vessels for holy oil, are represented only through the *objects* themselves. The viewer must look to the textual description to discover who would be given the task of carrying each of the implements. The most striking and unusual feature of the image is that the implements and elements of the architectural setting are depicted frontally whereas the deacons are depicted from a map-like bird's-eye view. This dual sense of perspective makes the viewer's relationship with the environment ambiguous. We are presented with a visual contradiction which makes it impossible to position oneself within the ritual space as a spectator positioned in the scene (having a unique point of observation). The pictograms look rather like they are floating in mid-air or as if placed on a treasury shelf.

Despite the flat, emblematic appearance of the pictograms, great care has been taken to illustrate the liturgical objects which needed to be used in the ritual (see section 5). While they do not appear to be referring to unique precious tokens or known unique treasures which could be found within the treasury or sacristy of a particular church, there is considerable interest in depicting their details. The explanation for this could rest in the desire to make the objects easily recognizable to the viewer and convey something about their preciousness and importance. There is a possibility that the details, such as the red colour of the celebrant's cope, which is highlighted in both the image and the text, could also help to distinguish the tone of the procession. C. Clifford Flanigan, in his article entitled "The Moving Subject: Medieval Liturgical

Processions in Semiotic Cultural Perspective", notes that the processions, as rituals, have a variety of possible meanings (or functions) and were used for many occasions in the middle ages. "Processions", he writes

> could be either festive or penitential, there character distinguished by the colour of the clerical vestments and above all by the nature of the song. Both the Antiquity (sic.) and the Middle Ages had penitential processions undertaken with bare feet, the head covered in ashes or veiled, the body clothed in sacks, and accompanied by long fasts and long stations for prayer. Conversely, festive processions like Palm Sunday's or Corpus Christi's, marked the joy of the feasts by decorations along the route such as banners, lights and even musical instruments.[34]

The type of objects and dress to be used in the procession can provide crucial *clues* about the *essential tone* or character of ritual events. Beyond providing an impressive display, the use of specific treasures or colours can be an important means for communicating with the viewers or participants on a visual level.

While the image is orderly, the symbols themselves are not placed very precisely on the surface of the parchment. In the case of the Singing of the Litany image, the double circles have not been drawn with the use of a compass, and the five deacons at the bottom of the page appear to be jumbled over to the left side. Close inspection of the picture, however, reveals that the painter has gone to considerable effort to arrange them in an *orderly* manner. It is likely that the artist has used the lines from

---

[34] Flanigan, C. Clifford, "The Moving Subject: Medieval Liturgical Processions in Semiotic Cultural Perspective," in *Moving Subjects: Processional Performance in the Middle Ages and Renaissance*, ed. Kathleen Ashley and Wim Husken, *Ludus: Medieval and Early Renaissance Theatre and Drama* (Atlanta: Rodopi, 2001), :p. 36. See also, Cargill, Oscar, *Drama and Liturgy* (New York: Octagon Books, 1969). regarding the relationships between drama and liturgy.

the text on the recto side of the parchment, which are visible even in reproduction, for arranging the objects on the horizontal axis. The bases of the candlesticks at the top of the image seem to sit firmly on the same line, as do the base and neck of the font. The columns may have been used to govern the vertical axis of the diagram, but they appear to have been used in a much more approximate way. Inexact though the arrangement may be, the geometric and hierarchical placement of the symbols conveys the idea that the rituals should be structured and organized.

Resting in the bottom center of the image is the frontal depiction of a large font which dominates the page because of its size, position. It is also rather ornate and its decorations are depicted in relative detail compared with the other objects. The double circles at the base of the font indicate that a pattern of circles, which echoes the tonsure symbols, has been sculpted in relief. A more elaborate depiction of angels appears to be carved around the rim of the basin. The font, as mentioned, is shown as if viewed frontally, but the upper basin is tipped slightly to show the rippled blue and white water within. The prominent position and attention to detail awarded to the font are unsurprising, given the important role that this object played in the Singing of the Litany ritual. When looking at the picture, the font is the focus of the viewer/participant, just as it should be during the future ritual itself.

Just as the font is distinguished from the other objects depicted in the image, so too is the main celebrant's symbol distinguished from those of the other ritual participants. His tonsure is larger than the others and his hair is painted a blue-grey color rather

than the usual brown. Like the rest of the clergy, his symbol shows subtle black curving lines which are intended to indicate hair. While it is unclear from the reproductions available, the other images within the Norwich processional seem to use a grey coloured double circle as the symbol for the celebrant, as well, indicating that the use of colour in this case is an important indicator in the symbol system which probably signifies age and status. It is useful to note that the text which accompanies this image notes the details of the vestments to be worn by most of the participating clergy, but it is only the principal actor who is shown with his red silk cope extending out behind his head.[35] The image and the text must be used together in order for the viewer to find all of the necessary information for the translation of the ritual from parchment to reality.

As mentioned, individual participants other than the important figures of the celebrant, deacons and sub-deacons are represented by the objects which they would be responsible for carrying. Besides highlighting the importance of the treasures, this has the additional benefit of preserving the clean and uncluttered ground. It is evident, however, that certain perspectival techniques have been used. Spatial information is provided, for example, through the indication of shadow inside the openings of the oil containers, and the way the base appears to recede in space. One certainly gets the impression that a more "naturalistic" representational approach could have been taken by the artist if that were requested of him. These perspectival cues are not used to

---

[35] See Bailey's translation on page 35 and in, Bailey, *The Processions of Sarum and the Western Church.*

make the objects appear to be less isolated or to disturb the clear figure/ground relationship. No shadows fall outside the outline of the symbols onto the plain ground. The liturgical implements are presented in a way which makes them easy to identify, but they seem to be subject to their own internal and idiosyncratic logic.

The symbol of the book, which the text tells us is to be carried by a boy, is illustrated upside-down to the viewer (with its spine to the right) in both the manuscript and printed version. While this detail seems rather peculiar, the fact that it remains unaltered in the later woodcuts suggests that it is unlikely to be a mistake. It may, in fact, indicate either the direction that the boy carrying the book is facing, or that it could have been read by someone facing him. In other illustrations, such as that depicting The Station Before the Cross at Vespers During the Summer (Figure 9), the book is illustrated in an open position. It is possible that this type of image could have been used to help the person organizing the ritual to know exactly what objects would be needed without having to sort through the complicated text, but details like the unusual depiction of the book suggest that the image can also show some significant and informative details of the *choreography* of the ritual procession.

3.2 Significant Variations from the Singing of the Litany at the Font Image

While the other images in the Norwich Processional share many common characteristics with the Singing of the Litany at the Font picture discussed here, there are also some significant variations between the images. The first two images, those

depicting the Sunday Blessing of the Holy Water and the Palm Sunday Blessing of the Branches (Figures 2 & 3), are certainly the most complex of the set of pictures found in the codex, which seem thereafter to become increasingly simple and plan-like. Both of these images contain small drawings of scenic altarpieces which appear at the top of each of the otherwise sparsely painted plans. Like the font in the Holy Saturday image, the altarpieces are shown from a frontal perspective which seems at odds with some of the other elements in the picture. The figural Man of Sorrows motif in the Sunday Blessing of the Holy Water (Figure 2) picture and the Crucifixion scene in the Palm Sunday image (Figure 3) provide a strong contrast to the schematic appearance of the rest of the image. Like the other precious objects portrayed, it is apparent that much care has been taken in their rendering. The use of this scenic form of representation found within these tiny pictures of pictures highlights the fact that the artists responsible for the production of the processional images had the skill to produce less diagrammatic representations. The use of this mode of presentation represents a choice between several alternatives. The depictions of altarpieces also help to define the architectural settings of the ritual and make them more complex. The inclusion of elaborate pictures of pictures is dispensed with after the first two images, despite the presence of an altar in the picture related to Holy Saturday Blessing of the Paschal Candle (which is placed much later in the book) (Figure 5). Overall, there appears to be a trend towards greater schematization and abstraction as the book progresses.

25

A feature which is not present in the Singing of the Litany image, but which is nevertheless a striking element of several of the other images in the Norwich processional, is the intrusion of text and musical notation into the pictorial frame set by the columns. In several cases, lines of text and music are placed neatly between the capitals and bases of the columns, giving the impression that the three types of representation can be integrated unproblematically. It is only in the last image of the book, which depicts The Station Before the Cross at Vespers During the Summer (Figure 9), that there is an attempt to divide the text from the image in a clear way. In this last picture, the columns are shortened significantly in order to accommodate the lines of music notation beneath.[36]

Another interesting variation from the norm appears in nearly the last images of the book between folios 62r and 72v. While I cannot be certain of my identifications, it is likely that the episodes of the Singing of the Litany at the font of Holy Saturday (Figures 1 & 6) and The Station at the Font at Vespers During Easter Week (Figures 7 & 8) are each represented by two images which appear on successive leaves of parchment. This conjecture derives from the unusual proximity of the images in terms of their positions in the book and the use of the same group of objects in successive images. The rearrangement of the symbols between images suggests that the participants have changed their positions and that the viewer is seeing a second distinct moment in the ritual. Interestingly, the latter images of both pairs are not

---

[36] I will discuss the topic of the relationship between images, text and music in sections 4 and 5 respectively.

found in any of the printed editions.[37] In all cases, the woodcuts depict each ritual once. It is possible that these last images could represent a budding interest in the use of series, and the representation of time which is all but absent from the flat, plan-like pictures.[38] The fact remains, however, that even two images are not sufficient to provide the amount of information required for the staging of an elaborate ritual in absence of the text.

In spite of some differences amongst the Sarum Processional images, they all make use of a sparse and diagrammatic mode of representation. In this way, the Sarum processional pictures are much different than an image like the 15th century image of the "Procession of St. Gregory" from *Les Très Riches Heures du Duc de Berry* (see also section 5) (Figure 10). This, like many other images which take rituals as their subject, seems to be the depiction of a real or imagined procession which could have happened, either actually or fictionally. The figures are depicted as particular individuals, that are capable of conveying information about the event taking place through their bodies and expressions. They can do this even if they are imaginary figures taking part in a fictional rite. While these characters may still represent larger groups or types of individuals, they still express subjective emotions and react to the events which surround them. There are other activities happening in the image

---

[37] This, unfortunately makes the images more difficult to identify due to the difficulty of reading the Norwich manuscript in its reproduction.

[38] The use of series and the depiction of time is a subject which will be discussed in greater detail in section 4 of the paper.

besides the ritual, and this image is clearly not intended to instruct viewers as to what a procession *ought* to look like. Specifically, we see a depiction of the procession that, according to the Golden Legend, was called by Gregory the Great in 590 to bring the end of the plague. The viewer can see that a man has fallen from this illness, and that some of the other participants are quite distracted by this. Gregory, in his papal vestments, looks up to see an angel perched on a turret signalling that the end of the epidemic is near.[39] The accident and the miraculous sighting has caused the participants to fall out of order and, to some extent, fall out of the procession's ideal formation. It also appears that the deacons entering through the gate are finding the cross and banner poles that they are carrying, to be awkward and they sway their backs and tuck in their chins in response to their weight. The viewer is given some information about spatial relationships, but the intended order is not clear. The accident has caused the procession to become somewhat muddled.

The Processional images have quite a different focus than this scene as they do not represent a moment in a particular event. Instead, we are presented with something rather more generic. The objects which are represented are not particular objects, and the participants are not specific individuals. One might say that it is a depiction of the structure of a *type* of procession rather than a token example (i.e., a particular procession which may be located in space-time).

---

[39] See Meiss, Millard, *French Painting in the Time of Jean De Berry*, vol. 1-3 (New York: Phaidon, 1969).

3.3 The Processional Woodcuts

The "corrective" measures taken by the designer of the woodcuts in the 16th Century

printed versions of the Sarum processional deserve serious consideration when

examining the manuscript images in relation to notational symbol systems. They

differ significantly from the manuscript images and, in many ways, can serve to

heighten our awareness of the differences between notational and figurative images.

The woodcut images themselves are much more regular, and the objects are arranged

in an even and measured way. The most striking feature about the woodcuts is that an

attempt has been made to reconcile the difficulties arising from the use of the double

viewpoint. In most of the images, the tonsured heads remain bodiless,[40] save for that

of the celebrant, but the inner circles are now slightly elongated to the side to become

ellipse-like in shape. The ovoid shapes representing the hairless spots of the clerics

are pushed upward near the top of the outer circle. This change, when combined with

the subtle indication of shadows around the outside of the circles and at the tops of

the inner ellipses gives the impression that the scene is being viewed from above. The

dark lines representing hair are also rendered in such a way as to increase the illusion.

In the woodcuts, the cope of the principle celebrant is much more elaborate and his

back and arms are always portrayed as well, giving the man a nearly complete body.

---

[40] The exceptions are: The Sunday Blessing of the Holy Water (Figure 11), The
Ejection of the Penitents on Ash Wednesday (Figure 12), and The Station Before the
Cross at Vespers During the Summer (Figure 21), in which the sub-deacons are
depicted with vestments.

While the triangular shape attached to the grey double circle may have been difficult to recognize as a cope in the Singing of the Litany at the Font image in the Norwich manuscript (Figure 1), it is certainly clear in the printed version of the same subject (Figure 16).

The sense of space is also clarified by the use of devices which give the viewer the impression that s/he has a single vantage point. In the woodcut representing The Singing of the Litany at the Font on Holy Saturday (Figure 16), the horizontal line, which runs between the two columns near the bottom of the image, can be imagined as a raised platform from which the viewer can look down upon the scene from above, while also helping to frame the image. The viewer is given the impression that s/he is standing in the same space as the columns, and the five deacons at the bottom of the scene, cut off slightly by the horizontal line, give the viewer the sense that the deacons are emerging from below. The columns framing each of the woodcuts are not at all generic and uniform in the way that the columns of in the Norwich processional are. [41] Instead, each example is decorated with a unique pattern. All are joined in an arch over the top of the scenes and their bases are not visible. These features help to distinguish the space of the columns, which could be a loggia from which the viewer could look down upon the procession, from the space of the ritual. They do not seem

---

[41] The image related to The Procession before Mass on Christmas (Figure 23), is perhaps most unusual and appears to make reference to the city walls. Further research into these various settings may yield interesting results.

to be part of the cathedral space, and they can not, therefore, act as landmarks within the ritual.

This difference changes the position of the viewer dramatically. Where s/he is considered a potential active agent in the manuscript images, here the viewer is put in the position of a spectator. This framing horizontal line is present in all of the woodcuts, but it does not always seem to serve this function. In the image related to The Blessing of the Candles on Purification (Figure 22), for example, the same horizontal band exists, yet in this case, two thuribles rest atop it as if on a low ledge. Nevertheless, the line serves to distance the viewer from the ritual space.

The other objects depicted in the printed version are much simpler in shape, and are more generic in appearance. There is a definite lack of surface decoration on the liturgical objects, though surely this is due, at least in part, to the constraints dictated by the medium. In the Singing of the Litany image (Figure 16), for example, the font, which is the primary focus of the ritual, is depicted using a relatively simple outline and is obscured by the body of the celebrant. The symbols used for the candlesticks, cross, thurible, and clergy members are quite similar throughout the images in the woodcuts, and one gets the impression that the standard vocabulary of symbols is maintained. Some small details, such as the proportions of the objects and the depth or roundness of the heads, differ slightly from image to image, suggesting that there is more than one hand involved.

The woodcuts found in the printed versions of the Sarum processional are much closer to figurative or scenic images. We can imagine ourselves as a spectator looking down on a procession that is taking place below us. The mode of representation, though only slightly different than that seen in the Norwich images, gives the impression that the image is a representation of a moment in a token procession. Some of the ambiguity remains, despite these measures, as the conventions of the earlier image are not dispensed with entirely.

Overall, the woodcut prints do not have the same aura of authority that the manuscript images do. This difference can be attributed to the diagrammatic and notational appearance of one, and the more scenic appearance of the other. The printed images appear to represent something close to a particular token event which can be watched by the viewer from a particular vantage point. The manuscript images, on the other hand, represent an official proclamation of the pope's master of ceremonies. The mode of representation, which denies this vantage point, does not encourage the viewer to be a spectator of the procession. Instead, the viewer is given the task of translating the image and reproducing the ritual in real time. The mode of representation gives the impression that the movements of the procession are repeatable, both at Salisbury and wherever the books' content may aid in the direction of rituals.

Visual analysis of the manuscript images suggests that to understand what these images are and to appreciate what elements are essential to our understanding it is

necessary to have some prior contextual knowledge of the ritual to be performed. The information needed cannot be accessed through visual analysis alone and it seems that the viewer who had actually seen such a procession before would be best equipped to deal with this sort of image. It is fairly likely that this would have been the target audience as well. None of the symbols, from the easily recognizable liturgical implements to the considerably less transparent double circles, is labelled or otherwise clarified, leaving the viewer to the task of translating the ritual from coded pictorial representation to physical reality. It seems that it is also quite important to have some mastery over the conventions of the symbol system which has been used throughout this genre of book. For this reason, it is essential to examine the images with an eye towards the relationship that exists between them and the texts and music notation which are bound with them.

4 The Relationship Between the Images and Text

As noted in the previous sections, calligraphy and music notation appear together throughout the manuscript, intermingling within the pictorial frame of the images, making the question of their relationship a pressing one. The three types of representation, the images, texts, and scores which are present in the processional book, work together to provide a relatively comprehensive picture of the multi-sensory experience of how a future ritual performance ought to look and sound. The somewhat informal mixing of word, image, and notation in the manuscripts calls for these categories and their boundaries to be re-examined. In this section, I will discuss the relationship between text and image—leaving the more complex discussion of music notation to section 5—in order to develop the argument that the images are not independent pictorial instructions, but are best understood within the context of the text found within the book.

While we frequently find text continuing into the pictorial space, outside the frame of the columns we also find solid sections of text which are devoted to the explication of each of the ritual performances.[42] The texts, which are quite specific about both the

---

[42] The text cited is actually a translation of that found in a printed version of the book. The manuscript also contains a description of this type.

form of the procession and the various liturgical implements and vestments to be used on the occasion, are highly complex. The written directions provide much more detailed information than the images and provide guidance about the people who should participate and what they should wear, the places in the cathedral at which the events should happen, as well as when specific songs should be sung and movements should be made. While text is detailed, the task of reconstructing the ritual mentally using this textual information alone is quite difficult. The text explaining the ritual of the Singing of the Litany at the Font on Holy Saturday begins simply enough, reading,

> After None, the officiant, in priests' vestments with a red silk cope, the deacon in a dalmatic, the sub-deacon in a tunicle, and the rest of the ministers of the altar in albs and amices (without a light on the candles, or cross, or fire in the thurible), and an acolyte, someone of the first rank in a surplice, carrying, on a stick, an unlighted candle (made of three candles twisted together at the bottom, but separate at the top), shall go in procession, after the bearer of the Holy Water, who shall be dressed in a surplice, the chorus following in ordinary habits, those of highest dignity first, down the middle of the choir to the column, in the south end of the church, near the font. Here the priest shall bless the fire, struck there between two columns. As they go the whole choir shall recite a psalm, antiphonally, and without singing,

but as the instructions continue, things begin to become more complex and tangled. The text continues,

> When the litany has ended the officiant, facing east, shall be assisted in blessing the font by the ministers ranged around it: on the right, next to the priest, the deacon, the sub-deacon on the left; he who carries the chrism, next to the deacon, and he who carries the oil, next to the sub-deacon; opposite the priest, facing him, he who carries the cross; beside whom, similarly, the two taperers; and after the taperers, the thurifer; he who carries the candle, between the deacon and the chrism; the boy carrying the book, between the oil and the sub-deacon. The bishop, if present, shall occupy, as in all other processions, the last place behind the singers of

the-litany. For the return to the choir, three clerks of the higher rank, in silk copes (two in red, and one in white), sang a litany, the first verse before the procession started back.[43]

It would seem that the readers, presumably the organizer of the event and perhaps its participants, would benefit greatly from a series pictorial instructions to clarify their duties and relative positions.[44] Ensuring that the individuals participating in the rite understood their role within the ritual would certainly be essential to its success and therefore, it is not surprising that visual tools, whether in the form of rough sketches or official diagrams, could have been used to clarify the texts in the minds of the participants. What the reader is provided with in terms of a visual aid, however, does little to untangle the intricate web of moving objects and participants. The incongruities between the text and the images including, for example, the unexplained presence of the two rods which appear overlapping the columns in the Singing of the Litany image (Figure 1), and the third candle which is not included in the woodcuts of the same subject (Figure 16) also make the images difficult to read and use.[45] Had they also included labels, like those seen in diagrams and cartographic images from the medieval period, these images would be much more accessible. The viewer is

---

[43] Bailey, *The Processions of Sarum and the Western Church*: p. 21-22.

[44] On pictorial instructions, see, Gombrich, Ernst, "Pictorial Instructions," in *Images and Understanding. Thoughts About Images Ideas About Understanding*, ed. Horace Barlow, Colin Blakemore, and Miranda Weston-Smith (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1990).

[45] It is important to note that the text cited in this paper, which has been translated by Bailey, is one which is found in later printed editions of the text. It is likely that there would be differences between this text and that found within the Norwich book. It is difficult to ascertain, however, whether or not these differences can explain the incongruities cited. This is a topic which can be explored further in future research.

simply not provided with enough information to use these images as stand-alone pictorial instructions.

What is also absent in the images, which is present in the list-like text, is a sense of time, chronology and movement. While the idea of the need for pictorial instructions seems to be a reasonable motive for the presence of the images in the manuscripts, the pictures themselves are in many ways, inadequate. Because of the limitations of this mode of representation, we are left with depictions of abbreviated and motionless processions.

The question remains, therefore, that if the pictures found within the processional manuscript do not provide enough information to serve as pictorial instructions, what do these images do? One answer could possibly be that the images are placed to work simply as a supplement to the information provided through the words and music. This could mean that the images can be understood as *visual clarification* of a difficult text. I would contend, however, that the diagrams are more than mere visual clarifications: they have an ability to convey the organized and hierarchical character of the ritual along with the sense of solemn dignity that a well functioning ritual should provide in a way that the long and dense textual description cannot. The rationale for justifying this observation is found in the difficult text cited above. The text gives meticulous instructions and a better sense of the movement of the performance, but its thorough descriptions cannot represent the hierarchical stringency of the ritual form as directly and effectively as do the images. The images

may also serve to carry information about the legitimacy of the text and the Sarum liturgical tradition, but this is a point to which I will return in the following section when we focus our attention on the examination of the relationship between the images and the music notation found within the processional.

5 The Problem of the Taxonomy of Notational Systems and Painting

Besides acting as a supplement to the written words in the Sarum processional manuscript, the pictures studied in this paper provide information about the types of rituals they depict and the influence and authority of the Sarum ritual form. They are able to communicate this message by making use of a visual form which is quite different from that used in the representation of figural scenes. This visual form can be categorized as "notational", as the concept of notational system can be used to refer to representations that share features with both diagrams and musical scores.[46]

5.1 The Theory of Notational Systems

According to Nelson Goodman, notational systems (e.g., scores, maps and diagrams) are systems of symbols used to refer to, or denote certain entities, properties or relationships (e.g., musical or choreographic performances, geographical entities, spatial or physical relations among individuals or magnitudes).[47] The category of

---

[46] Throughout the present text, notational systems are to be understood as the superordinate category, while diagrams, maps, and scores are subordinate categories.

[47] For a full explanation of Goodman's theory of notational systems, see, Goodman, Nelson, *Languages of Art an Approach to the Theory of Symbols* (Cambridge: Hackett Publishing, 1976); Goodman, Nelson, *Ways of Worldmaking* (Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing Company, 1978); Mitchell, W.J.T., *Iconology - Image, Text, Ideology* (Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press, 1986).

notational systems includes a relatively wide ranging group of representations and it

includes symbol systems which are often considered to be unrelated to each other. In

his text, *Languages of Art*, Goodman analyses representations which range from maps

and models, diagrams and musical scores to written texts.

All of these notational systems, he argues, share some common syntactic and

semantic characteristics. Many of the criteria he uses to group symbol systems in this

way can help to characterize features found in the Norwich processional images.

These criteria include (i) the use of a standard vocabulary of characters which can be

used in isolation or combined[48], (ii) a certain degree of character indifference[49], and

(iii) a compliance and referential relation between the mark of the symbol and a

referent in the world[50]. Goodman's criteria are rather stringent (and would exclude, if

---

[48] This set of characters (e.g. letters, numerals, hieroglyphs) must be finite in number, but in a true notational system, they can be combined in an infinite number of ways following syntactical rules. See Goodman, *Languages of Art an Approach to the Theory of Symbols*: p. 133.

[49] The notion of "character indifference" can be defined as the feature which allows one to change the visual form of a character or symbol, to a certain degree, without changing its meaning. For example, the letter "a" can be written in a variety of ways ("a", "ɑ", "a") while remaining recognizable to the reader, and still being attached to the same sound. Ibid. p. 141.

[50] That is to say that in notational systems, marks refer to, or denote certain entities (performances, spatial relations etc.) whether or not these entities are types or token, individual examples. Goodman terms this semantic relation (i.e., the referential relation of marks to certain entities) a relation of "compliance" (pp. 143-8). This compliance relation need not be one of resemblance nor does it need to be based on optical or geometric projections. The compliance relation could be, for example, between a sound and a letter according to the rules of a defined language. Ibid. pp. 143-8.

applied strictly, even some established "languages of art" such as Labannotation)[51],

but nevertheless, we have noted some of the characteristics associated with this

criteria in our visual analysis.

With respect to criterion (i), we can argue that the images do exhibit a relatively

limited number of repeatable and easily recognizable pictograms or characters (e.g.

the tonsures, a simply shaped oil container, a long slender candlestick, the framing set

of columns, a richly decorated font, etc.) which are repeated and combined in

multiple images. While there are also unique characters which are not repeated

(which is also the failing of Labanotation), these are represented in a similar flat and

pictographic form. One can presume, for example, that if there were to be more than

one ritual involving the fire present in the depiction of The Holy Saturday Blessing of

the New Fire, a similar pictogram would be used.

(ii) Character indifference is also present in the processional images. Though there is

a recognizable vocabulary of symbols, variations in their details, such as their surface

decoration and size, do not necessarily change the meaning of the symbols. This can

be attributed to the fact that the characters refer to *types* of objects rather than token

objects/individuals or particular examples. The processional cross in the Singing of

the Litany at the Font image (Figure 1) does not denote a unique gold and wood

---

[51] Labanotation, the most frequently used system of dance and music notation, does not satisfy criteria (i). This topic will be further discussed later in this section (Figure 29) For the principles of Labanotation, see, Laban, Rudolf von, *Principles of Dance and Movement and Notation* (Boston: Plays, Inc., 1975).

cross, but the precious cross which belonged to the cathedral holding the ritual (not necessarily the one found at Salisbury). Character indifference also makes the differences between the decoration of the fonts depicted in two of the Holy Saturday images (Figures 1 & 6) and one of the Easter Week images (Figure 7) unproblematic. The conventional rules of the system may, however, make some simple changes to characters signal a semantic change in the symbol, such as the use of the colour grey inside a double circle of the tonsure to indicate the celebrant.

(iii) The last criterion, which states that the symbols must have a referent in the world, is complicated by the fact that the images do not refer to any particular, token objects. While this is true, the images can be said to meet this requirement as this notation represents a generic type of ritual which should eventually be performed. This performance may be said to comply more or less accurately with the notation.[52]

5.2 Notational Systems and Medieval Art

Although the processional images may be a paradigm case of notational images, other forms of representation placed under the same theoretical umbrella by Goodman, such as diagrams and maps, do not satisfy the aforementioned criteria when one focuses on work from the middle ages. Nevertheless, diagrammatic and cartographic images from the medieval period do share several characteristics with the

---

[52] The notational system has a normative and authoritative dimension—the performance can be assessed as more or less adequate (or compliant) with respect to the model presented by the notational system. See Goodman, *Languages of Art an Approach to the Theory of Symbols*: pp. 143-54; Goodman, *Ways of Worldmaking*.

processional pictures, including the interest in the spatial display of information,[53] the

involvement of the viewer as an active agent,[54] and a desire to convey the notion that

the image is the authoritative representation of dependable knowledge.[55]

We shall now turn our focus to other types of images found in medieval art which

share a similar mode of representation with the Sarum processional. The categories of

pictures discussed here have been chosen because they share qualities, such as an

interest in the isolated depiction of precious objects and the rejection of a more scenic

approach to representation in favour of a schematized and diagrammatic mode.

---

[53]Regarding meaning in spatial displays of information, see, Dorling, Daniel and
Fairbairn, David, *Mapping: Ways of Representing the World* (Essex: Longman,
1997); Edson, Evelyn, *Mapping Time and Space: How Medieval Mapmakers Viewed
Their World* (London: The British Library, 1999); Koffka, Kurt, "Perception: An
Introduction to the Gestalt-Theorie," *Psychological Bulletin* 19 (1922).

[54] The viewer is described as an active agent, capable of entering into a dynamic
relationship with the image in several texts which deal with medieval images. These
include, but are not limited to, Connolly, Daniel K., "Imagined Pilgrimage in the
Itinerary Maps of Matthew Paris," *The Art Bulletin* 81, no. 4 (1999); Lewis, Flora,
"The Wound in Christ's Side and the Instruments of the Passion: Gendered
Experience and Response," in *Women and the Book. Assessing the Visual Evidence*,
ed. Lesley Smith and Jane H.M. Taylor (Toronto and Buffalo: University of Toronto
Press Incorporated, 1997); Shiller, Gertrud, *Iconography of Christian Art*, trans. Janet
Seligman (New York: New York Graphic Society, 1971-1972); Verderber, Susan M,
"Subjective Vision and Fragmentation in Late Medieval France, Burgundy, and
Flanders" (University of Pennsylvania, 2000).

[55] Goodman discusses this notion in relation to notational systems in general and
musical scores in particular (See Goodman, *Languages of Art an Approach to the
Theory of Symbols*.) This subject is also discussed, however, in relation to the Arma
Christi in Sandler, Lucy Freeman, *Omne Bonum: Fourteenth-Century Encyclopedia
of Universal Knowledge, Studies in Medieval and Early Renaissance Art History*
(London: Brepols Publishers, 1996).

5.2.1 Medieval Diagrams—The Example of Byrhtferth's Diagram of the Elements

Diagrams, as a category of images, were used since the Early Middle Ages as a means to organize knowledge in a clear and ordered way. The mode of presentation found in this type of representation is particularly useful for conveying the information that God has organized the universe in an ordered and harmonious manner. The diagram itself, even apart from the information it conveys, exudes a sense of order. The diagrammatic mode allows information to be arranged in a way which is more easily remembered by the viewer and relationships between abstract concepts can be made in a manner that is different from, and much more direct than, textual explanations.[56] As we have seen in the discussion of the structured and hierarchical appearance of the processional diagrams, they also have the ability to convey significant information about the creator of the illustration. The sense of organization is effective for showing that the scholars and clergy (or contemporary scientists, for that matter) who created them had an understanding of the world and its design.[57]

The 12th century *Diagram of the Elements* (from the Abbey of Tournay, England) based on Byrthfert's *Computus* (c. 1010) (Figure 24) is an excellent example of this

---

[56] Diagrams in the medieval context are discussed in Edson, *Mapping Time and Space: How Medieval Mapmakers Viewed Their World;* Sekules, Veronica, *Medieval Art* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001); Verderber, "Subjective Vision and Fragmentation in Late Medieval France, Burgundy, and Flanders".

[57] Sekules, *Medieval Art*: p. 128.

44

kind of notational system as it presents information ranging from the elements and

astrological signs, to the twelve ages of man and the cardinal directions, in a design

which reflects the idea that God's universe and creation are balanced and

harmonious.[58] Looking at the diagram of the elements, one is not faced with

conflicting theories of the universe, or a cosmos in flux, but something static, well

understood, and even comforting. We get the impression that, in order to produce

such a clear and organized image, Byrhtferth must have believed himself to have had

comprehensive and dependable knowledge worth presenting to the world. Indeed, the

purpose of such *Computus* diagrams, as they are called, was to present a coherent,

easy to remember summary of the available knowledge of the interconnecting

elements of the world. While the Processional image presents knowledge which is,

perhaps, more practical than that depicted in Byrhtferth's diagram, it does appear to

assert that the "choreographer" of the processions within the codex, presumably

Osmond of Salisbury, has a degree of authority when it comes to ceremonial affairs.

At the same time, it suggests that all proper ritual should be carefully ordered and

structured.

5.2.2 The Arma Christi

The Arma Christi, a category of images which depict symbols representing the

instruments of Christ's Passion for the purposes of guided meditation, possess several

characteristics which are similar to the processional image. On a basic level, the

---

[58] Ibid.

Arma Christi and the Sarum processional images share an interest in showing objects

which have been isolated from their worldly context (liturgical implements or items

associated with the Passion) presented against a flat ground. Though not diagrams in

the strictest sense, the Arma Christi images do depict these objects for the purpose of

drawing attention to their respective roles in a performance.[59] Both types of images

are also closely associated with more detailed texts which help to guide the

performances, the written description in the case of the processional images, and the

Meditations on the Life of Christ and other devotional texts in the case of the Arma

Christi. While examples of this type of image take many different forms, I have

chosen to focus my attention on one of the earliest and most diagrammatic

representations of the Arma Christi (Figure 25). This image can be found in James le

Palmer's *Omne Bonum*, an English encyclopaedia which is dated between 1360 and

1375, making it roughly contemporaneous to the Norwich processional.[60] I have

chosen this example because it presents the most organized example of an image

related to the Arma Christi ritual, and because, as in the processional, the viewer is

charged with a specific task related to a ritual performance.

---

[59] For further reading on the Arma Christi, see Kamerick, Kathleen, *Popular Piety and Art in the Late Middle Ages. Image Worship and Idolatry in England 1350-1500* (New York: Palgrave, 2002); Lewis, "The Wound in Christ's Side and the Instruments of the Passion: Gendered Experience and Response."; Shiller, *Iconography of Christian Art;* Verderber, "Subjective Vision and Fragmentation in Late Medieval France, Burgundy, and Flanders".

[60] A full discussion of this manuscript can be found in Sandler, *Omne Bonum: Fourteenth-Century Encyclopedia of Universal Knowledge*. It should be noted that Arma Christi images more often appear in devotional books, most commonly the Missal.

Though the performance of the Arma Christi ritual takes place in the meditative mind rather than in the cathedral, the two types of ritual representation have significant similarities. Unlike the processional image, which was created to inspire public performances of some of the most important Easter rituals, the mental performance of the Arma Christi was thought to bring personal rewards in the form of indulgences. While the length of the indulgence varies quite widely from image to image, the viewer who approached the meditation with sufficient seriousness and piety was assured that he or she would be granted a significant reward, ranging from 20,000 years off their purgatorial stay to a full plenary indulgence in the case of the *Omne Bonum* Arma Christi.[61] Despite the disparity in the size of the indulgence, it is clear that viewing this type of image, and viewing it in the *proper* manner, is extraordinarily important on a metaphysical level. The form of presentation, which depicts the Instruments of the Passion in a way which is highly organized and removed from the context within the scenes of the Passion narrative, encourages a slow and methodical meditation. Similar to the processional case, we find in the Arma Christi a sense of order and structure that can set the pace and character of the meditation. It may lead the viewer to consider each of the objects individually, and the lack of contextual information would provoke the viewer to enter into an imaginative process of mentally reconstructing the narrative.

---

[61] Verderber, "Subjective Vision and Fragmentation in Late Medieval France, Burgundy, and Flanders".

Gertrude Schiller has made several interesting historical observations which may account for the unusual appearance of the Arma Christi, which she describes as being like "shorthand or pictograms".[62] She has tied the images to the influx of Passion relics in the west, which were brought from Constantinople after the crusades of the 12th century. She also notes a change in the form of the reliquaries which housed the objects, which began to be made of glass or crystal in this period. While the jewel covered boxes of the previous period were lavishly decorated to reflect the preciousness of the spiritual treasure it housed, the transparent containers would allow worshipers to view the objects themselves.[63] The viewer would then be able to use the relic as a visual stimulus for meditation.

Shiller suggests that the viewer was meant to progress through the images like a narrative, stopping to consider each of the Stations of the Cross in sequence. The scholar links this process to the widespread popularity of the Franciscan book *Meditations on the Life of Christ* in the 14th century. Shiller writes that in this text, and in Loudolf of Saxony's *Vita Jesu Christi*,

> The worshiper was continually exhorted to enter into each individual episode. As a consequence, all the scenes of the way of suffering also become important artistic themes. With the new spiritual involvement in the sufferings of Christ from station to station, the Instruments of the Passion became important as substitute symbols...[64]

---

[62] Shiller, *Iconography of Christian Art*: p. 189.

[63] Ibid.: p. 190.

[64] Ibid.: p. 191.

While the connection between the methodical meditative approach of the *Meditations* and the Arma Christi is clear, the Arma Christi does not present the objects in a way which would suggest that they are to be "read" like a chronological text. The *Omne Bonum* image, which is ordered in a linear way, is not arranged in a sequence which corresponds to the way in which the events of the Passion would have unfolded in time, whether we read the image horizontally or vertically. Like in the Sarum processional image, the representation of time is ambiguous. The division of the image into distinct squares could be interpreted as the breakdown of a ritual into a series of moments, but the order in which the symbols are meant to be apprehended is not specified in the representation.

The wide band in the center of the image includes several scenes which feature human figures or body parts. Interestingly, the image of the Crucifixion and the Man of Sorrows depicted here are the very same images that appear on altars in the first two Norwich Processional images underlying the fact that these were popular devotional images at the time. Like the painted altarpieces which appear in the processional (Figures 2, 3, 11 & 13), there is an interesting juxtaposition between images of scenes and isolated symbols. If one views the Crucifixion scene in the *Omne Bonum* image closely, it is possible to see several of the objects which are depicted in greater detail in other sections. The nails are positioned at an angle which makes them quite salient to the viewer. The wounds caused by the nails, and the wound in Christ's side are clearly visible. Blood sprays dramatically in three lines from His side, and drips from His hands and feet. Christ's cross is raised higher than

those of the two thieves, who look rather comfortable compared to the thin central

figure. While Christ's arms look stretched and strained, the thieves have their arms

tied behind their backs. We can see, by viewing the ropes which bind their legs that

they have been spared the torture of being nailed to their respective crosses.[65] It is

also evident that their crosses take the form of a "T" shape, and that they are wearing

fuller garments. These differences certainly make the image interesting and clear

compositionally, but they also tie the objects which are depicted in detail closely to

Christ. The three nails which are depicted so carefully in their individual

compartment can only have been those which penetrated the hands and feet of Christ,

as they are not present anywhere else. Spatial cues, such as visual occlusion of the

parts of the nails which would be inside Christ's hands, are dispensed with in order to

make the objects more visible. One can compare this to the processional images

which often avoid visual occlusion for the purposes of clarity. There is no attempt, for

example, to show the complex relationships between the liturgical objects and the

individuals who would carry them.[66]

---

[65] This is a rather unusual feature as the thieves are often portrayed as suffering the terrible pain of the crucifixion while Christ remains serene. This is particularly true in Late Medieval Crucifixion paintings from Germany. See, Merbeck, Mitchell B., *Thief, the Cross and the Wheel: Pain and the Spectacle of Punishment in Medieval and Renaissance Europe* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1999).

[66] There are definitely some examples of overlapping objects in the processional images, for example, the layering of the tonsure and font in Figure 1. These, I would argue, are rather exceptional cases. For the most part, there has been significant efforts made to preserve a clear figure/ground relationship.

The fact that the *Omne Bonum* Arma Christi is contained within an encyclopaedia, and one which is claimed to have been the largest and most organized of this type, is highly significant. James le Palmer's book is among the first alphabetically arranged encyclopaedia of its type, and like the processional, the book is intended to represent a vast display of ordered knowledge.[67]

5.2.3 Cartographic Images of the Middle Ages

The cartographic image is perhaps the most immediately apparent comparison that comes to mind when first confronting the notational images found in the Sarum processional book. First, one can say that maps generally take a diagrammatic and notational rather than scenic approach to representation. Further, the processional's interest in conveying information about spatial relationships among depicted objects, its use of the aerial perspective, and the use of symbols or pictograms for the representation of real-world objects seems to be echoed quite closely in medieval maps.[68] We may also think of maps as tools which can be used to guide a person through bodily actions and help him or her to navigate a space. The modern notion that maps take the spatial relationships between objects and locations as their principle subject, however, does not necessarily hold when discussing medieval

---

[67] Despite it's claim that it contains nearly "universal knowledge", this particular encyclopaedia focuses on the topics of cannon law, natural history, and morality. Sandler, *Omne Bonum: Fourteenth-Century Encyclopedia of Universal Knowledge.*

[68] This type of classical approach to the study of cartography can be found in texts such as Bagrow, Leo, *History of Cartography* (Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1964); Woodward, David, *Art and Cartography* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1987).

maps. Recent literature regarding the concepts behind the making of maps in the Middle Ages tends to agree that these tools were rarely used for the purposes of navigation or wayfinding.[69]

Daniel K. Connolly suggests, in his paper "Imagined Pilgrimage in the Itinerary Maps of Matthew Paris", that the English itinerary maps which are his subject (c. 1250) (Figure 26) would have likely served as a guide for a mental journey, much like the Arma Christi[70], rather than a physical journey like the one inspired by the processional.[71] The maps, therefore, were not drawn with the intention to provide enough accuracy or detail to offer the information required to make the trek to Jerusalem on foot. Instead, the viewer is presented with a great deal of information

---

[69] Texts which look for alternative "functions" for maps include, Birkholz, Daniel, *The King's Two Maps: Cartography and Culture in Thirteenth Century England* (New York and London: Routledge, 2004); Breen, Katharine, "Returning Home from Jerusalem: Matthew Paris's First Map of Britain in Its Manuscript Context," *Representations* 89 (2005); Connolly, "Imagined Pilgrimage in the Itinerary Maps of Matthew Paris."; Delano-Smith, Catherine and Kain, Roger J.P., *English Maps: A History* (Toronto and Buffalo: University of Toronto Press, 1999); Dorling and Fairbairn, *Mapping: Ways of Representing the World;* Edson, *Mapping Time and Space: How Medieval Mapmakers Viewed Their World;* Kline, Naomi Reed, *Maps of Medieval Thought: The Hereford Paradigm* (New York: Boydell Press, 2005); Thrower, Norman JW, *Maps and Man. An Examination of Cartography in Relation to Culture and Civilization* (1972: 1972).

[70] This comparison with the Arma Christi is not explicitly made by Connolly.

[71] Connolly, "Imagined Pilgrimage in the Itinerary Maps of Matthew Paris." Interestingly, a similar approach has been taken to non-cartographic images. A good example of a text which suggests that the medieval audience could be led on a mental pilgrimage by images and their placement within a manuscript can be found in Rudy, Kathryn M., "A Guide to Mental Pilgrimage: Paris Bibliotheque De L'arsenal Ms 212," *Zeitschrift fur Kunstgeschichte* 63, no. 4 (2000).

which is highly organized and arranged geographically for the purpose of guiding a spiritual exercise.

Likewise, Naomi Reed Kline suggests that the famous Hereford Mappa Mundi would have been of little use to a pilgrim or any other traveller.[72] This large and impressive T-O style world map[73] is positively filled with symbols and words representing everything from actual buildings and geographical landmarks, to mythical heroes and monsters. The painter has also placed references to historical events, such as the travels of Alexander the Great.[74] While the disk of the earth and major geographical features such as rivers are drawn as seen from above, like in the processional, the isolated pictograms are illustrated using a mixture of frontal and aerial perspectives. We see the city of Jerusalem in the center of the map depicted through the representation of a bird's-eye view of the circular city walls, for example, while many of the other buildings and creatures on the map are illustrated frontally. Once again, the use of this mixed perspective can be attributed to the desire to show objects from

---

[72]See: Kline, *Maps of Medieval Thought: The Hereford Paradigm.*

[73] A T-O style map represents the then known world as a circular disc which is divided into three continents by T shaped Mediterranean. These maps are normally oriented towards the East, situating Asia at the top and Jerusalem near the center above the cross of the T. The outside of the O shape represents the surrounding ocean. This type of map is roughly based on the writings of the 7th century scholar Isidore of Seville and can be found in a simple diagrammatic form. Ibid.

[74] For further reading on the Hereford Mappamundi, see: Ibid; Terkla, Dan, "The Original Placement of the Hereford Mappa Mundi," *Imago Mundi* 56 (2004); Westrem, Scott D., *The Hereford Map* (Turnhout: Brepols, 2002).

an easily recognizable angle and to display many types of individuals in a single and unified layout.

The cluttered disk representing the earth's surface is surmounted by a depiction of the Last Judgement, including the enthroned Christ. The inclusion of a scene representing the otherworldly is an important indication that the maps have an ambition which is greater than the depiction of spatial relationships between *worldly* objects and locations. The map provides information about places, peoples and historical events while reminding the viewer that the temporal world will be subsumed in the Last Judgement. The scenic inclusion thus provides a moral commentary, or gloss, for the knowledge presented inside the disk.[75] Despite first appearances, the similarities between the processional diagrams and the Medieval maps discussed here lies not in the attempt to show accurate spatial relationships between objects, but in the fact that both are interested in showing the viewer an organized display of knowledge which can be used actively by the viewer.

5.3 The Processional and its Relation to the Musical Score

Earlier in this text, I described the aerial perspective and the care that is taken to show spatial relationships as "map-like", and indeed I initially came across the processional images within a book on the topic of English map history.[76] While this comparison is

---

[75] Kline, *Maps of Medieval Thought: The Hereford Paradigm.*

[76]This book was namely, Delano-Smith and Kain, *English Maps: A History.* While the text provides an interesting survey of English mapmaking, it does not provide

quite valid on certain levels, as addressed above, it is interesting to look at this image within the context of the rest of the material in the book, including some items not commonly considered in relation to visual art, specifically musical notation. While the processional images can be said to be diagrammatic in form, they can also be linked to a more specific kind of notational language. The images presented in the Norwich Processional are interleaved with chant scores, as are the surviving printed editions of the text.[77]

The visual similarities between the musical notations and the Norwich image are quite surprising. The arrangements of isolated symbols seen in the images, which are framed by vertical columns, are reminiscent of notes and bar lines, systematically arranged across the parchment. As discussed in a previous section, the way the music notation is routinely allowed to merge within the space of the pictorial frame literally forces one to consider them in relation to one another (See Figures 5, 8 & 9).

Apart from their visual similarities, there are definite connections on a conceptual level as well. Both can be considered to be abstracted *notations* of a performance that require a particular skill or knowledge to read. Neither takes into account the

---

much in the way of a justification for the inclusion of the processional image. The image itself is not studied in any depth.

[77]The chant scores of the processional are studied or are reproduced in Messenger, Ruth Ellis, "Processional Hymnody in the Later Middle Ages," *Transactions and Proceedings of the American Philological Association* 81 (1950); Pynson, ed., *Processionale Ad Usum Sarum 1502;* Wordsworth, *Ceremonies and Processions of the Cathedral Church of Salisbury.*

specificities or idiosyncrasies of a single participant and neither is a document of an

historical performance. Instead, both appear to offer something like a memory aid. As

medieval music historian Leo Treitler writes, music notation does not allow even its

most accomplished reader to "necessarily reproduce in our minds the sounds of music.

What the score can represent to us is the structure of the music."[78] The same could be

said for the category of images discussed in this paper.

Some of the specific conventions of early musical notation are quite interesting when

compared with the Norwich images.[79] Notation underwent an important transition in

the middle ages which changed the relationship between notation and performance.[80]

There was an evolution from a vague system, where noteheads were placed in relative

hierarchy, either higher or lower than each other on the page,[81] to something much

more specific where a four line staff was used to indicate precise information about

---

[78] Treitler, Leo, "The Early History of Music Writing in the West," *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 35, no. 2 (1982): p. 112.

[79] For a more detailed discussion of these conventions, see, Harrison, Frank Ll., *Music in Medieval Britain* (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1958); Treitler, "The Early History of Music Writing in the West.".

[80] Harrison, *Music in Medieval Britain;* Treitler, "The Early History of Music Writing in the West."

[81] An example of this can be seen in figure 28. While this score was copied in the 11th century, the notation is in an older style. Note that the absence of bar and staff lines prevents the noteheads from having a set tonal value. This form is much less orderly and "language-like" than later notations. One gets the feeling that the notes are something like the balls which the juggler tosses somewhat erratically in the air.

pitch and meter.[82] The shift to a more specific system, which began as early as the

tenth century, represents a transition from memory aid to more direct instruction.[83]

While this is true, it is important to note that musical scores are never a record of an

actual performance.[84] Like the processional, it was and is, rather, an illustration of an

ideal version of the sounds and their relational structure.

What is missing in the processional image, that is present in the musical score and

even, to a certain extent, the Arma Christi, is a clear and consistent indication of

time.[85] [86] As each ritual episode is represented only once, or in rare instances, twice

within the text, rather than in series, we are necessarily left with a set of motionless

processions.[87] It would be quite impossible to reconstruct the individual rituals from

---

[82] This style of notation can be found on each of the pages facing the images in the processional manuscript (See Figures 2-9).

[83] Treitler, "The Early History of Music Writing in the West."

[84] This argument is shared by both Nelson Goodman, in his discussion of music notation as a symbol system (Goodman, *Languages of Art an Approach to the Theory of Symbols*.) and Treitler in his discussion of medieval music (Treitler, "The Early History of Music Writing in the West.").

[85] Two interesting texts regarding strategies involved in temporal notation and painting are Mayr, Albert, "Temporal Notations: Four Lessons in the Visualization of Time," *Leonardo* 23, no. 2/3 (1990); Vadnerkar, S.V., "A Code for Representing the Occidental Musical Notation in Pictorial Art," *Leonardo* 9, no. 2 (1976).

[86] There are several extant images which depict the Office of the Dead in a series of scenes which represent the various stages of the ritual on a single page in a manuscript Wieck, Roger S., *Painted Prayers: The Book of Hours in Medieval and Renaissance Art* (New York: George Braziller, Inc., 1997).

[87] This is interesting when compared with the Arma Christi image from the Omne Bonum which clearly divided successive portions in the meditation into distinct sections.

the images alone. At best, the image may tell the reader where and how the individual participants should stand during one crucial period of the procession. Like in the figurative image of the "Procession of St. Gregory" from *Les Très Riches Heures du Duc de Berry*, we are presented with a single moment (see section 3). It appears that, in this way, the Norwich images have some characteristics related to both notational and figural modes of representation.

The fact that the images do not offer a precise prescription for how to choreograph a procession is not surprising. Many scholars, including Goodman, assert that despite several attempts, a successful notational system has yet to be developed for dance or movement in general. The closest to success, developed by Roudolf Laban in the 1920s, still partially relies on a musical score to provide specific information about time (Figure 29).[88] Nevertheless, Labanotation has a highly differentiated use of series which suggests chronology in a way that the Processional image does not. Goodman criticizes Laban's "language" for using unstandardized pictograms to indicate objects used in the performance, suggesting that they do not satisfy the limited character criterion addressed previously.[89]

According to Goodman a score is a representation that is often regarded as a simple tool, which, as a functional object, is no longer necessary after the performance. It

---

[88]See: Goodman, *Languages of Art an Approach to the Theory of Symbols;* Laban, *Principles of Dance and Movement and Notation.*

[89] Goodman, *Languages of Art an Approach to the Theory of Symbols.*

remains somewhat at a distance from the work of art itself, never truly being part of it, somewhat like the relationship between a painting and the paint brush used to complete it. However, he notes that, as a representation, it is not a merely practical guide.[90] He writes,

> A score, whether or not ever used as a guide for a performance, has as a primary function the authoritative identification of a work from performance to performance…a score must define a work, marking off the performances that belong to the work from those that do not. This is not to say that the score must provide an easy test for deciding whether a given performance belongs to the work or not…The line drawn need only be theoretically manifest.[91]

While Goodman states that the score suggests "authoritative identification", he holds that the representation does so on purely theoretical or normative grounds. "What matters with a diagram" he argues "is how we are to read it".[92] Any authority the image conveys is conceptually driven rather than a product of its specific visual qualities. To put this notion into the context relevant to our discussion, the Processional image, as something like a score, provides information to the reader, specifically, that a Sarum ritual should be performed in a way which is different from other processions. It also tells the viewer that the rituals, supposedly designed centuries earlier by the Pope's master of ceremonies, are highly organized. The image can thus be used to identify authentic or proper rituals of this type. This "authoritative

---

[90] Ibid.: p. 127.

[91] Ibid.: p. 128.

[92] Ibid.: p. 170.

identification" is *normative* in its relation to the performer. By normative I mean that it proscribes the *correct* way to proceed.

It could be said that even if the processional image is not a true notational system or score (perhaps due to the lack of a consistent representation of time), it certainly gives the impression that it is similar to the music notation that surrounds it. While it does not provide thorough pictorial instructions for the staging and performance of a procession, it does, to a certain extent, mark out those performances that belong to it, through the choice of implements, the colour of the vestments, and the structural arrangement of objects. Through its structured and organized appearance, it gives the impression of being authoritative, repeatable, and definitive. This may remind us of Leo Treitler's argument that early music notation represents "the structure of the music" rather than a performance directive or a representation of a sound.[93]

In a time where the liturgy was far from standardized, the notion that the Bishops and of Salisbury, and specifically Osmond, had inherited the position of "Titles of the Pope's Maister of the Cerimonyes", and thus, knowledge about the successful performance of rituals, is significant. The long standing interest in well orchestrated and carefully performed rituals made Salisbury's reputation in this regard an important one. The images help to support this claim as they convey that the movements and organization of the procession, which are detailed in the text, are as

---

[93] Treitler, "The Early History of Music Writing in the West,": p. 112.

structured and significant as the chant, both of which were inseparable in liturgical performances.

Despite the usefulness of this particular understanding of the score, Goodman's theory of notational systems may overemphasize the conventional nature of this "aura" of authority that appears to be present in a score and underestimate the role of perceptual effects that are not dependent on conventions.[94] In the case of the Processional the particular formal characteristics can also be said to suggest the ideas of authority, order, structure and hierarchy by *purely visual* means. In these cases, it is not merely how we read the images as a function of symbolic and social conventions. Important information can also be accessed based on the way the marks on the surface of the image look, or more accurately, how they are perceived. The form and general layout of the depiction can be said to inform a perceiver's understanding and mode of viewing in a way which is not completely arbitrary. I would argue that the diagrams may achieve their unique visual characteristics through a movement away from the conventions of figurative painting and by the creation of new conventions or "keys" for accessing meaning.

---

[94] The Gestalt psychologists, for example, have many arguments which suggest that this is so. See, Koffka, "Perception: An Introduction to the Gestalt-Theorie."

6 Conclusion

This research has introduced the use of the theory of notational systems for the analysis of medieval works of art. This has led us to examine, for the first time, the images found in Sarum processionals as depictions deserving of scholarly attention from both an art historical and theoretical standpoint.

Specifically, it has argued that their mode of representation and their authoritative role can be best understood when considered in relation to the semantic characteristics of notational systems. Their visual form signals that they are not representations of idiosyncratic events which have happened in the past. In addition to aiding the reader in the task of orchestrating specific future rituals based on the Sarum liturgical model, their mode of representation works to convey the idea that these are authoritative proscriptive layouts, rather than generic scenes. They illustrate what important objects are required for the performance and the number, status and position of the participants that will need to be in attendance in a clear and orderly presentation. Thus, the viewer is not intended to be a passive witness to a scene taking place in the image, but is instead a presumed participant in a future performance of a specific character.

Three types of arguments have been introduced to lend support to the thesis which explores different "contexts" of the images (including the book's historical context,

the context of the book as a coherent object, and context of image with regard to other types of depictions). The first argument (section 2) has presented historical evidence showing that the books were authoritative in the sense that their use was widespread, and secondly, that this authoritative role may have been the result of a deliberate strategy on the part of the individuals seeking to increase the circulation of the books associated with the Sarum Use and hence the reputation of Salisbury Cathedral. The second argument (section 4) was based on the examination of the relationship between the images and the texts found within the processional book. The resulting conclusion is that the images do not present sufficient information to be considered pictorial instructions, but instead, can convey or support other types of authoritative knowledge. Specifically, the additional message that the images can relay is related to the structure and strict organization of the rituals and the authority of the Sarum tradition. The third and final argument (section 5) is that the pictorial images have the semantic characteristics of a notational system, such as character indifference, repeatability, the use of a finite number of characters which are combined according to conventions. More specifically, they are related to the musical scores which interleave the images and intermingle with them in the pictorial frame.

This text represents only a first foray into the discussion into the taxonomy of notational systems and their relationships with art images. While this approach is particularly useful for the discussion of the Sarum processional images which are the topic of this paper, interesting results could be produced by applying this approach to other types of images.

Figures

Notice: The figures found in this text have been omitted due to copywrite restrictions. The images can be found at the sources noted below each title entry.

Figure 1   The Singing of the Litany at the Font on Holy Saturday. Sarum Processional from Norwich: Late 14th- Early 15th Century.

The British Library, MS 57, 534 (fol. 62v).

Delano-Smith, Catherine, and Roger J.P. Kain. *English Maps: A History*. Toronto and Buffalo: University of Toronto Press, 1999: 39.

Figure 2   The Sunday Blessing of the Holy Water. Sarum Processional from Norwich: Late 14th- Early 15th Century.

The British Library, MS 57, 534 (fol. 2v).

Reproduction available from The British Library.

Figure 3   The Palm Sunday Blessing of the Branches. Sarum Processional from Norwich: Late 14th- Early 15th Century.

The British Library, MS 57, 534 (fol. 32r).

Reproduction available from The British Library.

Figure 4   The Holy Saturday Blessing of the New Fire. Sarum Processional from Norwich: Late 14th- Early 15th Century.

The British Library, MS 57, 534 (fol. 54v).

Reproduction available from The British Library.

Figure 5   The Holy Saturday Blessing of the Paschal Candle. Sarum Processional from Norwich: Late 14th- Early 15th Century.

The British Library, MS 57, 534 (fol. 57r).

Reproduction available from The British Library.

Figure 6   The Singing of the Litany at the Font on Holy Saturday. Sarum Processional from Norwich Late 14th- Early 15th Century.

The British Library, MS 57, 534 (fol. 63v).

Reproduction available from The British Library.

Figure 7   The Station at the Font at Vespers During Easter Week. Sarum Processional from Norwich: Late 14th- Early 15th Century.

The British Library, MS 57, 534 (fol. 71r).

Reproduction available from The British Library.

Figure 8   The Station at the Font at Vespers During Easter Week. Sarum Processional from Norwich: Late 14th- Early 15th Century.

The British Library, MS 57, 534 (fol. 72r).

Reproduction available from The British Library.

Figure 9   The Station Before the Cross at Vespers During the Summer. Sarum Processional from Norwich: Late 14th- Early 15th Century.

The British Library, MS 57, 534 (fol. 90r).

Reproduction available from The British Library.

Figure 10   The Procession of St. Gregory. Les Très Riches Heures du Duc de Berry: 1480.

Chantilly, Musèe Condè, MS 65 (fol. 72r, detail).

Reproduction available from ArtStor.

Figure 11   The Sunday Blessing of the Holy Water. Woodcut print from a Sarum Processional. England: 15th century.

Bailey, Terence. *The Processions of Sarum and the Western Church*. Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Medieval Studies, 1971:180.

Figure 12   The Ejection of the Penitents on Ash Wednesday. Woodcut print from a Sarum Processional. England: 15th century.

Bailey, Terence. *The Processions of Sarum and the Western Church*. Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Medieval Studies, 1971: 181.

Figure 13   The Palm Sunday Blessing of the Branches. Woodcut print from a Sarum Processional. England: 15th century.

Bailey, Terence. *The Processions of Sarum and the Western Church*. Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Medieval Studies, 1971: 182.

Figure 14   The Holy Saturday Blessing of the New Fire. Woodcut print from a Sarum Processional. England: 15th century.

Bailey, Terence. *The Processions of Sarum and the Western Church*. Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Medieval Studies, 1971: 183.

Figure 15   The Holy Saturday Blessing of the Paschal Candle. Woodcut print from a Sarum Processional. England: 15th century.

Bailey, Terence. *The Processions of Sarum and the Western Church*. Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Medieval Studies, 1971: 184.

Figure 16   The Singing of the Litany at the Font on Holy Saturday. Woodcut print from a Sarum Processional. England: 15th century.

Bailey, Terence. *The Processions of Sarum and the Western Church*. Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Medieval Studies, 1971: 185.

Figure 17   The Station and Procession with the Cross on Easter before Matins. Woodcut print from a Sarum Processional. England: 15th century.

Bailey, Terence. *The Processions of Sarum and the Western Church*. Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Medieval Studies, 1971: 186.

Figure 18   The Station at the Font at Vespers during Holy Week. 187. Woodcut print from a Sarum Processional. England: 15th century.

Bailey, Terence. *The Processions of Sarum and the Western Church*. Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Medieval Studies, 1971: 187.

Figure 19   The Procession for Rogation Monday. Woodcut print from a Sarum Processional. England: 15th century.

Bailey, Terence. *The Processions of Sarum and the Western Church*. Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Medieval Studies, 1971: 188.

**Figure 20   The Station and Procession Before Mass on Ascension.
Woodcut print from a Sarum Processional. England: 15th century.**

Bailey, Terence. *The Processions of Sarum and the Western Church*. Toronto:
Pontifical Institute of Medieval Studies, 1971: 189.

**Figure 21   The Station before the Cross at Vespers during the
Summer. Woodcut print from a Sarum Processional. England: 15th
century.**

Bailey, Terence. *The Processions of Sarum and the Western Church*. Toronto:
Pontifical Institute of Medieval Studies, 1971: 190.

**Figure 22   The Blessing of the Candles on Purification. Woodcut
print from a Sarum Processional. England: 15th century.**

Bailey, Terence. *The Processions of Sarum and the Western Church*. Toronto:
Pontifical Institute of Medieval Studies, 1971: 191.

**Figure 23   .The Procession before Mass on Christmas. Woodcut
print from a Sarum Processional. England: 15th century.**

Bailey, Terence. *The Processions of Sarum and the Western Church*. Toronto:
Pontifical Institute of Medieval Studies, 1971: 192.

**Figure 24   Diagram of the Elements. Manual of Byrhtferth. St.
Oxford: 1110.**

St. John's College Library, MS 17 (fol.7v).

Sekules, Veronica. *Medieval Art*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001: 128.

Figure 25 Arma Christi. James le Palmer's Omne Bonum. England: 1360-1375.

The British Library, MS Royal 6 E VI – 6 E VII (fol. 15).

Reproduction Available from The British Library's "Images Online" Project.

Figure 26 Matthew Paris, Chronica majora, Itinerary from Italy, Rome, and Apulia. St. Albans Abbey, England: 1250.

Cambridge, Corpus Christi College, MS 26 (fol. 3r, with flaps open).

Connolly, Daniel K. "Imagined Pilgrimage in the Itinerary Maps of Matthew Paris." *The Art Bulletin* 81, no. 4 (1999): 598-622.

Figure 27 The Hereford Mappa Mundi. Hereford Cathedral, England: c. 1300.

Reproduction Available from ArtStor.

Figure 28 Gradual. The Third Mode, from a Tonary, Illustrated by a Man Juggling. Toulouse: Late 11th century.

(fol. 298).

Reproduction Available from The British Library's "Images Online" Project.

Figure 29 Example of Labanotation.

Reproduction Available from Ballet Dance Magazine.
http://www.balletdance.com/200607/articles/images/Labanotation2Rathvon.jpg.

Bibliography

Bagrow, Leo. *History of Cartography*. Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1964.

Bailey, Terence. *The Processions of Sarum and the Western Church*. Toronto: Pontifical Institute of Medieval Studies, 1971.

Birkholz, Daniel. *The King's Two Maps: Cartography and Culture in Thirteenth Century England*. New York and London: Routledge, 2004.

Blum, Pamela Z. "The Sequence of Building Campaigns at Salisbury." *The Art Bulletin* 73, no. 1 (1991): 6-38.

Breen, Katharine. "Returning Home from Jerusalem: Matthew Paris's First Map of Britain in Its Manuscript Context." *Representations* 89 (2005): 59-93.

Brightman, F.E. *The English Rite*. 2 ed. Vol. 1. London: Rivingtons, 1921.

Brown, Andrew D. *Popular Piety in Late Medieval England: The Diocese of Salisbury, 1250-1550*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1995.

Cargill, Oscar. *Drama and Liturgy*. New York: Octagon Books, 1969.

Caviness, Madeline H. "Images of Divine Order and the Third Mode of Seeing." *Gesta* 22, no. 2 (1983): 99-120.

Connolly, Daniel K. "Imagined Pilgrimage in the Itinerary Maps of Matthew Paris." *The Art Bulletin* 81, no. 4 (1999): 598-622.

Davison, Nigel. "So Which Way Round Did They Go? The Palm Sunday Procession at Salisbury." *Music & Letters* 61, no. 1 (1980): 1-14.

Delano-Smith, Catherine, and Roger J.P. Kain. *English Maps: A History*. Toronto and Buffalo: University of Toronto Press, 1999.

Dorling, Daniel, and David Fairbairn. *Mapping: Ways of Representing the World*. Essex: Longman, 1997.

Edson, Evelyn. *Mapping Time and Space: How Medieval Mapmakers Viewed Their World*. London: The British Library, 1999.

Flanigan, C. Clifford. "The Moving Subject: Medieval Liturgical Processions in Semiotic Cultural Perspective." In *Moving Subjects: Processional Performance in the Middle Ages and Renaissance*, edited by Kathleen Ashley and Wim Husken, 35-52. Atlanta: Rodopi, 2001.

Foucault, Michel. *The Archaeology of Knowledge*. Translated by A. M. Sheridan Smith. London and New York: Routledge, 1989.

———. "The Subject and Power." In *Michel Foucault: Beyond Structuralism and Hermeneutics*, edited by Hubert L. Dreyfus and Paul Rabinow. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1983.

Gombrich, Ernst. "Pictorial Instructions." In *Images and Understanding. Thoughts About Images Ideas About Understanding*, edited by Horace Barlow, Colin Blakemore and Miranda Weston-Smith, 26-45. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1990.

Goodman, Nelson. *Languages of Art an Approach to the Theory of Symbols*. Cambridge: Hackett Publishing, 1976.

———. *Ways of Worldmaking*. Indianapolis: Hackett Publishing Company, 1978.

Harper, John. *The Forms and Orders of Western Liturgy from the Tenth to the Eighteenth Century*. Oxford: Oxford University Press1, 1991.

Harrison, Frank Ll. *Music in Medieval Britain*. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1958.

Hayes, Dawn Marie. *Body and Sacred Place in Medieval Europe, 1100-1389*. New York: Routledge, 2003.

Kamerick, Kathleen. *Popular Piety and Art in the Late Middle Ages. Image Worship and Idolatry in England 1350-1500*. New York: Palgrave, 2002.

Klauser, Theodor. *A Short History of the Western Liturgy: An Account and Some Reflections*. Translated by John Halliburton. New York, Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1969.

Kline, Naomi Reed. *Maps of Medieval Thought: The Hereford Paradigm*. New York: Boydell Press, 2005.

Koffka, Kurt. "Perception: An Introduction to the Gestalt-Theorie." *Psychological Bulletin* 19 (1922): 531-85.

Laban, Rudolf von. *Principles of Dance and Movement and Notation*. Boston: Plays, Inc., 1975.

Lewis, Flora. "The Wound in Christ's Side and the Instruments of the Passion: Gendered Experience and Response." In *Women and the Book. Assessing the Visual Evidence*, edited by Lesley Smith and Jane H.M. Taylor, 204-29. Toronto and Buffalo: University of Toronto Press Incorporated, 1997.

Mayr, Albert. "Temporal Notations: Four Lessons in the Visualization of Time." *Leonardo* 23, no. 2/3 (1990): 281-86.

Meiss, Millard. *French Painting in the Time of Jean De Berry*. Vol. 1-3. New York: Phaidon, 1969.

Merbeck, Mitchell B. *Thief, the Cross and the Wheel: Pain and the Spectacle of Punishment in Medieval and Renaissance Europe*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1999.

Messenger, Ruth Ellis. "Processional Hymnody in the Later Middle Ages." *Transactions and Proceedings of the American Philological Association* 81 (1950): 185-99.

Mitchell, W.J.T. *Iconology - Image, Text, Ideology*. Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press, 1986.

Northy, T.J. *The Popular History of Old & New Sarum*. Salisbury: Wiltshire County Mirror & Express Co., Ltd., 1897.

Palazzo, Eric. *A History of the Liturgical Books from the Beginning to the Thirteenth Centre*. Translated by Madeleine Beaumont. Collegeville Minnesota: Liturgical Press, 1993.

Pynson, Richard, ed. *Processionale Ad Usum Sarum 1502*. Vol. 16:1, *Musical Sources -Facsim*. Clarabricken, Ireland: Boethius Press, 1980.

Rudy, Kathryn M. "A Guide to Mental Pilgrimage: Paris Bibliotheque De L'arsenal Ms 212." *Zeitschrift fur Kunstgeschichte* 63, no. 4 (2000): 494-515.

Sandler, Lucy Freeman. *Omne Bonum: Fourteenth-Century Encyclopedia of Universal Knowledge, Studies in Medieval and Early Renaissance Art History*. London: Brepols Publishers, 1996.

Sekules, Veronica. *Medieval Art*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2001.

Shiller, Gertrud. *Iconography of Christian Art*. Translated by Janet Seligman. New York: New York Graphic Society, 1971-1972.

Statutes of the Cathedral Church of Sarum. Edited by C Wordsworth and D Macleane. Bath, 1813.

Terkla, Dan. "The Original Placement of the Hereford Mappa Mundi." *Imago Mundi* 56 (2004): 131-51.

Thrower, Norman JW. *Maps and Man. An Examination of Cartography in Relation to Culture and Civilization*. 1972, 1972.

Treitler, Leo. "The Early History of Music Writing in the West." *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 35, no. 2 (1982): 237-79.

Vadnerkar, S.V. "A Code for Representing the Occidental Musical Notation in Pictorial Art." *Leonardo* 9, no. 2 (1976): 140-41.

Verderber, Susan M. "Subjective Vision and Fragmentation in Late Medieval France, Burgundy, and Flanders." University of Pennsylvania, 2000.

Webber, Teresa. *Scribes and Scholars at Salisbury Cathedral C.1075 - C.1125*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1992.

Westrem, Scott D. *The Hereford Map*. Turnhout: Brepols, 2002.

Wieck, Roger S. *Painted Prayers: The Book of Hours in Medieval and Renaissance Art*. New York: George Braziller, Inc., 1997.

Wilson's English Martyrology. London, 1608.

Woodward, David. *Art and Cartography*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1987.

Wordsworth, Chr. *Ceremonies and Processions of the Cathedral Church of Salisbury*. Cambridge: The University Press, 1901.