

GENDER, RACE, AND NATION
IN MODERN JAPANESE AND TAIWANESE LITERATURES:
A COMPARATIVE STUDY OF
WOMEN'S LITERARY PRODUCTION

by

MEI-YAO CHEN

B.A., Chinese Culture University, Taiwan, 1993

M.A., Soochow University, Taiwan, 1996

A THESIS SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF
THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF
DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

in

THE FACULTY OF GRADUATE STUDIES
(ASIAN STUDIES)

THE UNIVERSITY OF BRITISH COLUMBIA

July 2005

© Mei-Yao Chen, 2005

Abstract

This dissertation examines and compares representations of female subjectivity in selected literary texts by women writers from modern Japan and Taiwan. Particular attention is paid to narrative constructions of gender, race, and nation as these configure subjectivity. The use of a comparative framework of analysis provides a more nuanced understanding both of the specific authors addressed and the gendered nature of modern literary production in these two countries that share such a complex colonial and postcolonial history.

The dissertation begins by situating the literary works addressed in the socio-historical context from which they emerged. The analysis of the literary works incorporates critical concepts and insights by postcolonial theorists such as Gayatri Spivak, and Trinh T. Minh-Ha, as well as feminist and gender theorists such as Hélène Cixous and Luce Irigaray.

The five critically-acclaimed women writers under discussion are Kanai Mieko, Enchi Fumiko, and Ōba Minako from Japan, and Li Ang, and Zhu Tianxin from Taiwan. In each chapter one writer from Japan is paired with one from Taiwan according to the thematic similarities of their works. Themes that I have chosen for comparison include the female body, feminine sexuality, man-slaughtering, women's language, and geographic/temporal displacement. These themes appear frequently and conspicuously in the fiction of the most important female writers of postwar Japan and Taiwan, and as such provide valuable points of entry for the critical exploration of identity issues of gender, race, and nation.

Apart from similarities of theme, structure, and writing strategy, this comparative study also explores the differences between Japanese and Taiwanese women's writing in the modern period. As Taiwan's complicated colonial history differentiates its postcoloniality from that of Japan, national identity often emerges as a crucial issue in Taiwanese women's writing; this is less often the case in the work of Japanese women writers. My elucidation and discussion of these differences counters the Orientalist tendency to treat all non-Western countries as a homogenous block, on the erroneous assumption that there is one fundamental experience of coloniality that all colonized nations share. By examining the residual influences of colonialism in postcolonial Japan and Taiwan, this dissertation contributes to the critical exploration/interrogation of the features of both extra-Asian and intra-Asian colonialisms in general, and their effects on gendered literary production in particular.

Table of Contents

	page
Abstract	ii
Table of Contents	iv
Acknowledgements	vii
Stylistic Notes	ix
Introduction	1
Objectives.....	1
Historical Background.....	2
Situating a Comparative Study.....	9
Method and Scope.....	13
Outline of Chapters.....	14
Chapter One: Brief Surveys of Modern Japanese and Taiwanese Literatures	20
Modern Subjectivity in Prewar Japan.....	21
Fiction in the Occupation Period.....	27
The Intellectual Climate of Post-Occupation.....	32
The Flowering of Women's Writing from the 1950s to 1970s.....	35
The Origins of Modern Taiwanese Literature.....	41
Nostalgic Anti-Communist Literature.....	47
Modernist Literary Movement.....	50
The Nativist Literary Debate.....	54
The Pluralism of the Eighties and Beyond.....	59
Conclusion.....	63

Chapter Two: Killing Patriarchy: Kanai Mieko and Li Ang's Man-Slaughtering...	73
Kanai Mieko: Biographical Background.....	74
Gender Theory.....	76
"Rotting Meat".....	82
Reversing the Power Paradigms.....	88
Li Ang: Biographical Background.....	93
The Symbolic Order.....	99
<i>The Butcher's Wife</i>	101
Man-slaughtering as Resistance and Revolution.....	108
Rebellion and Subversion: Kanai Mieko versus Li Ang.....	117
Chapter Three: Writing Her-story: Enchi Fumiko's <i>Masks</i> and Li Ang's	
<i>Labyrinthine Garden</i>	126
Enchi Fumiko: Biographical Background.....	127
Writing with the Body.....	133
<i>Masks</i>	138
Masked Performance, Multi-layered Subjectivity.....	148
Li Ang in Transformation.....	156
Historical Memory and Identity Construction in Postcolonial Discourse.....	159
<i>Labyrinthine Garden</i>	164
Enigmatic Maze of Labyrinthine Identity.....	174
Writing Her-story: Enchi Fumiko versus Li Ang.....	184
Chapter Four: Displaced Subjectivities: Ōba Minako's "The Repairman's Wife" and	
Zhu Tianxin's "Ancient Capital"	195

Ōba Minako: Biographical Background.....	196
Displaced Subjectivity.....	201
“The Repairman’s Wife”.....	203
Displacement in the Multicultural Space.....	209
Zhu Tianxin: Biographical Background.....	220
Transforming Identity in Post-Martial Law Taiwan.....	224
“Ancient Capital”.....	228
Resolving Hybridized Identity in the Postcolonial “Ancient Capital”.....	236
Ōba Minako versus Zhu Tianxin.....	248
Conclusion.....	260
Bibliography.....	273

Acknowledgements

I wish to express my unbounded gratitude to the following people for their constant mental and intellectual support in helping me complete this dissertation. I am most grateful to my advisor Professor Sharalyn Orbaugh who has inspired and encouraged me to conduct a literary comparative study between modern Japanese and Taiwanese literatures. With exceptional intellectual perspicacity and thoughtful practical guidance, Sharalyn not only taught me how to write good research proposals in order to obtain academic grants, but also showed me what dedicated scholarship is all about. She read my dissertation repeatedly and patiently at all stages, corrected my errors, and provided me her insightful and sound advice. In this particular regard, I've always considered myself extremely fortunate.

I am also indebted to members of my dissertation supervisory committee. Professor Tineke Hellwig was always generous to share her time and knowledge, and provide me her invaluable comments. I have benefited tremendously from the directed reading class on feminism with her. Professor Joshua Mostow who always wrote me excellent reference letters was liberally supportive of my research project. His insightful comments directed my attention to crucial points that I missed.

I am deeply grateful to my friend Miseli Jeon, whose own comparative research between Japanese and Korean literatures set a good example for me in spirit and in substance. I have benefited from many a stimulating conversation with her. My thanks also go to Jasmina Miodragovic and Mina Wong in Asian Studies for their practical help and for always being there.

My research for this dissertation was funded by the doctoral fellowships from Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada (2001-2003), and Chiang Ching-kuo Foundation (2003-2004). With their generous and substantial funding, I was able to concentrate on my dissertation writing.

I thank my parents for their wholehearted support and endless patience in waiting for the completion of my doctoral studies. Last but not the least, I could not possibly have finished my dissertation without my husband Philip, and my son Alex. Without my husband's encouragement and support in the most literal sense, I would not have been able to start and finish my doctoral studies. My son who is only eight years old has always wanted to help me write dissertation whenever seeing me stuck in front of the computer. I thank him for his consideration and endurance for my constant absences.

Stylistic Notes

1. Japanese and Chinese names are given with surnames first followed by first names, except for those who have been writing in English and chosen to adopt the Western order.
2. All transliteration of Japanese follows modified Hepburn, except for individuals who have chosen alternative styles of Romanization.
3. All transliterations of Chinese are in *pinyin*, except for cases in which a different system, usually the Wade-Giles, was used originally in a quoted text.
4. Chinese first names are not hyphenated unless the author is published so.
5. When the author's original text is quoted, the translation comes first followed by the original text.

Introduction

Objectives

This dissertation aims to compare selected literary texts by women writers from modern Japan and Taiwan in order to investigate the question of a female perspective and literary practice in these two countries.¹ I will analyze the narrative constructions of identities of gender, race, and nation within women's writing, and will inquire how theories derived primarily from Western discursive practice can (or cannot) be applied in an analysis of the linkages between identity formation and writing in the two countries. To my knowledge this is the first extended comparison of Japanese and Taiwanese fiction produced by women in the modern period. The use of a comparative framework of analysis will provide a more nuanced understanding of the authors addressed and the gendered literary production of the two countries. In a larger sense, this endeavour is intended as one step in the exploration of the feasibility of establishing a thematic and theoretical framework for critical analysis of Third World women's literary works in general.

The second half of the twentieth century saw a boom in women's writing in both Japan and Taiwan. This trend gave rise to significant changes in women's writing, both in terms of the quantity of publications, and also in an increased variety of subjects, themes, and styles. As this dissertation will demonstrate, at historical moments when society undergoes rapid socio-economic and juridical changes, questions of identity become central in literary production. I will address the fiction produced during times of political and economic upheaval in Japan and Taiwan, with attention to the ways that women's writing is deeply implicated in the socio-political milieu.

Besides their shared cultural origins in neo-Confucianism, Japan and Taiwan have an intricate and intimate relationship in modern history, which will be discussed in some detail below. Even today, the effects of the 50-year period of Japanese colonization of Taiwan still subtly linger in postcolonial Taiwan, and can be traced in many Taiwanese literary productions. Therefore it is not surprising to find that Japanese and Taiwanese women writers have shared similar writing themes and strategies. Both Japanese and Taiwanese women writers are struggling to develop a language of their own, a style, a voice, and a structure with which they can not only freely articulate their subjectivities, but also can situate themselves in a discipline that was previously dominated by men.

Historical Background

It is fair to say that most Asian countries initiated attempts to achieve modernization after being threatened and provoked by the modern project in the form of Western imperialism in the nineteenth century. For both Japan and China this took place in the nineteenth century. With the Opium War of 1839-1842, British gunboats forced China to open more treaty ports, insisting that China open its door for "free trade." From this time on, British, American and other European colonial forces established territorial bases in China and consolidated their power with unequal treaties.

Similarly, in 1853, U.S. Commodore Matthew Perry compelled the shogun's government to reopen Japan to foreign trade and cultural communication with the West after its nearly 250 years of isolation. Having seen the formidable inroads of the Western colonial powers across the globe, and in particular the cruel fact of China's inability to resist foreign aggression, the newly-instituted Meiji government in Japan undertook an

intensive and thoroughgoing modernization campaign in a bold attempt to quickly catch up with the modern nation-states in the Anglo-European world.² Through numerous legislative measures, including the establishment of a constitutional monarchy with limited male suffrage (based on the contemporary British and Prussian models), as well as vigorous educational reforms (inspired by the education system of the United States), and a rapid military buildup (with lessons learned from Britain and Germany), within 40 years the Meiji government effectively constructed Japan as a modern nation-state. By the end of the Meiji period this status had been confirmed by Japan's success as the first and only non-Western (read as non-white) colonizer. Japan annexed Taiwan and the Pescadores Islands in 1895, and then Korea in 1910, as its colonial possessions after its victorious wars against China in 1894-5, and against Russia in 1904-5. One of the most important aspects of Meiji modernization was its organization of the nation into a "*kazoku kokka*" 家族国家 (family-nation), in which the emperor was understood as the father of the nation and its inhabitants, as well as the inhabitants of its colonial possessions. On the social level this idea was reflected in the "*ie seido*" 家制度 (family or household system), in which the father of the family held all power as patriarch, and in which the subordinate members of the family owed him loyalty and respect. Under the *ie seido* women had no social or political and few economic rights.

China's embarrassing defeat in the Sino-Japanese war in the late nineteenth century gave rise to numerous revolutions. Eventually, the Qing Dynasty was toppled and the Republic of China (ROC) was established in 1911.³ For the first time in China's history, Chinese people had a chance to form their government, one constitutionally of, by and for the people. However, the new democratic government also had no choice but to

inherit many unequal treaties with the Western colonizers and Japan. Most strikingly, after World War One, parcels of Chinese territory were transferred to Japan without the Chinese people's consent, so that the club of colonizers in Asia could achieve stability in their spheres of influence. In 1919, thousands of university students marched to Tiananmen Square in Beijing to protest the humiliating terms of the Treaty of Versailles. This incident, known as the May Fourth Movement, tremendously inspired the ensuing transformations of China's modernity. Incorporating rhetorical conceptions derived from the Western world, such as "[a]nti-traditionalism, democracy, science, enlightenment, individualism, evolution, nation, and revolution," China tried to catch up with the advanced modernized nations in the West.⁴ It is also significant that many of the leaders of the social and political revolutions in China in the first decades of the twentieth century had studied in Japan.

The modernization process in China was less intense and thoroughgoing than that in Japan. There were many reasons for this: recurrent civil wars between warlords that took place in different parts of the country; the legacy of Western influences remaining from earlier colonial impositions; and new invasions and extortionist treaties imposed by foreign powers.

However, starting from relatively similar points in the nineteenth centuries, both countries shared certain commonalities in their transformation toward modernity. Similarities can also be found in the two countries' attempts to produce a modern literature. As Joshua Mostow points out, "diglossia" is one of the major similarities shared by the modern literatures of China, Japan and Korea.⁵ That is, despite the existence in each country of its own modern spoken language, all serious written

communication in Japan, Korea and China was done in classical Chinese—a language that was intricately entwined with the ideology of Confucianism, but bore almost no relation to each country's spoken language. Both Japan and China were successful, however, in producing a new written language for literary purposes, one that more closely followed the modern colloquial speech. In Japan, *genbun'itchi* 言文一致 (unification of the spoken and written language) was developed between 1880 and 1920, and in China the *baihuawen yundong* 白話文運動 (vernacularization) movement took place in the 1920s.⁶ Using these newly developed languages, authors could express the individual, autonomous, objective, and neutral subjectivity featured in the modern literature of Anglo-European nations.⁷

Although the influence of the May Fourth movement also travelled to Taiwan, the modernization of Taiwan took a different path from that of the mainland. In 1661 Zheng Chenggong, a loyalist to the previously toppled Ming Dynasty, expelled the Dutch, who had colonized Taiwan for the past 38 years, and became the first Chinese ruler in Taiwan.⁸ When Taiwan fell under the rule of the Qing Dynasty in 1683, the army led by Zheng's descendants was expatriated to the furthest reaches of the Qing Empire, leaving approximately 7,000 Han Chinese in Taiwan. Two centuries later, less than half of the island was under Chinese administration while the remaining lightly populated regions of the interior were controlled by various aboriginal tribes. As a settlement for China losing the war in 1895, Taiwan was ceded to Japan in perpetuity, becoming the first Japanese imperial colony. During its colonization of Taiwan between 1895 and 1945, Japan spared no effort in modernizing Taiwan—not for the sake of Taiwanese interests but for its empire's politico-economic benefits. In line with the policy of *dōka* 同化 (assimilation),

the residents of the Japanese colonies were forced to learn the Japanese language and to use it in schools and in official settings. Moreover they were educated to consider themselves loyal subjects and "children" of the Japanese emperor, as head of the *kazoku kokka* (family state). In addition, the *ie seido* as a social institution and ideology was imposed in Taiwan. As Ken Ito suggests, by reinforcing the father's/emperor's patriarchal powers, the Japanese state benefited tremendously from the mobilization and manipulation of patriarchy.⁹ However, while Japan endeavoured to make its colonial subjects become Japanese, a contradictory Japanese discourse of colonialism expressed an anxiety to differentiate Taiwanese colonial subjects from the "real Japanese."¹⁰ Being subjected both to general discrimination as colonial subjects and to specific discrimination as women, Taiwanese women were doubly colonized.

After Japan's defeat in World War Two, Taiwan became again a possession of China. In 1949, however, a new "colonization" took place as China's Nationalist government, or the Kuomintang (KMT)¹¹, led by Chiang Kaishek, retreated from the mainland to the island when the KMT was finally defeated by the Communists. From this point on, Taiwan was secluded from Communist China across the Taiwan Strait in almost every respect until the late 1980s. The forty-year period of authoritarian rule under the Chiang regime was characterized by remarkable continuity and homogeneity in the social, political, and cultural spheres. On the international stage, Taiwan was recognized as independent from the People's Republic of China (PRC), by major powers such as the United States.

However, drastic changes began to emerge at all levels of society after martial law was lifted in 1987. New intellectual and artistic currents have been thriving, many with

the explicit or implicit motive of re-examining the existing order. It is at this moment that Taiwanese women writers started to grapple with issues of identity politics that involve re-constructing modern history from their traumatized position both under the Japanese colonial rule and the KMT rule.

A similar moment of historical upheaval occurred a few decades earlier in Japan. Several days after the atomic bombings of Hiroshima and Nagasaki in August 1945, the Japanese Emperor declared the government's surrender on the radio. Two weeks later, on September 1, Japan lost its sovereignty as the Allied Occupation government took power. Symbolically, Japan lost its "masculinity" when the symbolic father, the emperor, along with his unquestionable authority, was replaced by the alien U.S. General MacArthur, the head of SCAP (Supreme Command for the Allied Powers), as the new government was called. In this complicated time, and thereafter, many writers struggled to come to terms with ignominious defeat, the wholesale destruction of 80 percent of Japanese cities, and Japan's first experience of occupation/colonization by a foreign power.

During the nearly seven years of the Occupation, the American advisors working for SCAP imposed a number of sweeping changes in the juridical and social structures of Japan's society.¹² In particular the Constitution of 1947 was written and imposed by the Occupation government in its attempt to establish a democratic society, and included the enfranchisement of women. For the first time Japanese women were given the right to vote and to participate in political activities. While many male writers thereafter had to grapple with reassessing the meaning and enactment of male subjectivity and masculinity, women writers started to vigorously challenge the prewar ideologies and constraints regarding the family system, nation building, and gender relations. Upon the withdrawal

of the Allied Occupation forces, Japan began a series of projects to rebuild its industrial base. By the 1960s, with its astonishing economic growth, Japan had recovered from its painful experience of war destruction. Thanks to Japan's improved economic conditions, women could finally get started writing their challenges to the prewar patriarchy, which was still very influential in postwar Japan.

The historical context of modernization in Japan and Taiwan, respectively, cannot be overlooked when we are examining various issues of modern literature in both countries. As backdrop, it helps us understand how a modern subject has been constructed and represented in literary production. Therefore, for Taiwanese women writers, I have chosen to focus on the writing produced from the 1980s to the 1990s. On the other hand, for Japanese women's writing, the time between the late 1950s and the 1970s will be the period of my investigation—these are the moments when each country finally came out from under the colonialist yoke and soon thereafter experienced rapid social transformation mostly induced by tremendous economic surges. In the modern period, women in Japan and Taiwan were similarly excluded from the establishment of symbolic and legal lineage and became the “ground” upon which a modern national identity was constructed.¹³ When political and socio-cultural conditions changed during moments of upheaval, the women in both countries found an opportunity to explore the prevailing discourses and power relations that had structured their societies till that time. Given more freedom and openness, women writers demonstrated in their writing how subjectivity is interlocked with elements of gender, race and nation.

Finally, I must point out that Taiwanese subjectivity has been a controversial issue with dense intricacies and ambiguities; therefore, a definition of Taiwanese literature

needs to be set and clarified for the purpose of this thesis. With due consideration, I have adopted Li Qiao's convenient definition: "Taiwanese literature is that literature which takes the viewpoint of the people of Taiwan and which writes about Taiwanese experience."¹⁴

Situating a Comparative Study

In the present dissertation, I will use theory and criticism originally applied to Third World countries in my discussions of Japan and Taiwan. It is, of course, contentious to consider Japan and Taiwan as Third World countries. The term "Third World" was first used during the Cold War period to designate those countries aligned with neither the United States nor the Soviet Union. Conveniently, the term is still widely used as shorthand referring to the group of countries that are struggling to escape from underdevelopment. In fact, the term is associated with ambiguities and has become quaint and inappropriate in the post-Cold War period where the distinction between the First and Second Worlds seems to have disappeared.¹⁵ According to *The Oxford Companion to Politics of the World*, the Third World encompasses "the nations of Africa, Asia, and Latin America, most of them former colonies which to varying degrees could be characterized as underdeveloped."¹⁶ Taiwan and Japan certainly may be considered among the "nations of . . . Asia" in this definition, but their current economic might makes it difficult to think of them as "underdeveloped" in economic terms. However, for the purposes of this research project, I believe it is warranted to make a distinction between *economic* and *cultural* power in the global hierarchy of nations. While Japan and Taiwan may be powerful economically, Edward Said and others have pointed out that "the Orient" has

been constructed in Western hegemonic discourse as culturally inferior or subservient to the West. According to Said, in standard Western representations "the Orient" suggests "not only fecundity but sexual promise (and threat), untiring sensuality, unlimited desire, deep generative energies."¹⁷ Orientalism attributes characteristics of femininity to the Orient, accentuating "its eccentricity, its backwardness, its silent indifference, its feminine penetrability, its supine malleability."¹⁸ In other words, "the Orient" has been constructed as inferior feminine Other to the West, and Japan and Taiwan are no exceptions to this discursive construction. Having been subject to Western cultural hegemony and having shared many aspects of colonial/postcolonial history, both Japan and Taiwan can be arguably considered marginalized to the extent of being countries of the "Third World."

Each of the terms "gender," "race," and "nation" represents a complicated and contentious concept, and thus needs to be clarified. Recently many feminist theorists have treated gender as a cultural construct enacted by a vast repetition of social performance.¹⁹ Under such an arbitrarily and dominant construct, women are typically designated a passive role while men are designated an active one. Race has also been revealed to be a cultural construct, rather than a biological/genetic distinction. As Michael Banton suggests, economic, ideological, cultural, and historical factors all need to be considered for an understanding of race, as these factors help explain the ways in which "differences" are theorized along racial lines.²⁰ Like gender, the ideas of race continue to configure the way in which people understand and represent their subjectivity in a global context. The idea of nation is now fixed in the general imagination; as Benedict Anderson puts it, nation is an "imagined community."²¹ Nation, like race, has continued to be "the most universally legitimate value in the political life of our time," according to Anderson.²²

These three terms are the fundamental hierarchies that create oppressive and unequal social relations, especially the oppressions that Third World women have experienced.

Another term I will use in this dissertation, "women," similarly requires definition. In my usage "women" is a complex category that refers to issues of specific community identities like race, nation, ethnicity and class, as well as gender or sexual difference.²³ The fact that Third World women's identities are constituted as much as by race, nation and other categories of identity as they are by sex or gender is often downplayed in considerations of the Western female subject—studies that play a key role in determining the "truths" around which women's identities are constructed in academic writing. Recognizing this problem, feminists from countries with histories of colonization, such as Chandra Talpade Mohanty, Angela Gilliam, and Cheryl Johnson-Odim, often reject the focus on gender as the sole basis of struggle and instead emphasize the need to examine the intersection of various networks of gender, race and nation. Japanese and Taiwanese feminist literary critics have, for the most part, tended to promote an exclusively gender-based way of reading; issues of race or nation have rarely been included in their feminist analyses. As will be seen in the following chapters, however, issues of nation and race arise explicitly or implicitly in the work of many postwar women writers in Japan and Taiwan, and are tightly entwined with those writers' attempts to interrogate gender.

Despite the upsurge in the number of Japanese and Taiwanese women writers in the post-World War Two period, critical discussion of women writers' contribution to the shaping of the modern literature of each country is scarce. Writing against their respective socio-political milieus, Japanese and Taiwanese women writers embark on re-constructing a "politics" and "history" of the time that are different from those

constructed in accordance with the hegemonic androcentric view. This study will be one of the first to give consideration to gender in the construction of the modern literatures in these two nations.²⁴ In particular, so far there has been no systematic and theoretically-informed critical study comparing contemporary women writers from the two countries in question. Among other scholars, Yip Wai-Lim and John J. Deeney have lamented the lack of such comparative study. They point out that the unusually long and strong literary ties among the literatures of Japan, China and Korea demand a comparative perspective.²⁵ Furthermore, I hope that a comparative study such as this dissertation may contribute to a deconstruction of Western colonial views of a monolithic "Orient."

Since critical study of modern women's writing has been greatly neglected in both Japan and Taiwan, my research will help to provide a new literary history and criticism that can combine the literary experiences of both women and men. Through decoding the representation in women's writing, the crucial factors in constituting women's identities, such as gender, race, and nation, *inter alia*, will be fruitfully revealed. Furthermore, although colonialism/postcolonialism has been one of the most vigorous fields in cultural studies in the last two decades, there remains insufficient investigation of Japan's colonial experience. Japan is one of the few countries in the world to have so fully experienced the role of both colonized and colonizer, but neither standpoint has been thoroughly examined so far. By examining the residual subtle influences of colonialism in postcolonial Japan and Taiwan, I intend in this project to critically investigate the features of both extra-Asian and intra-Asian colonialism and their effects on gendered writing.

Method and Scope

As a writer's style and interests change throughout her writing life, it would be too broad and unenlightening to pair up women writers from the two countries and then compare their entire oeuvres. Instead, this comparative project will be conducted according to thematic similarities of selected works by acclaimed women writers. As such, the same writer may be discussed in different chapters depending on the themes with which she grappled in specific works. Themes that I have chosen for comparison include the female body, feminine sexuality, "man-slaughtering," women's language, and geographic/temporal displacement. These themes appear frequently and conspicuously in the fiction of the most important female writers of postwar Japan and Taiwan, and provide valuable points of entry for the exploration of identity issues of gender, race, and nation.

Incorporating Third World feminist literary criticism and postcolonial critical theory, I will focus on these women writers' strategies of "writing against" dominant discourses, and how such strategies are shared by both postcolonial Japanese and Taiwanese women writers. Given the issues discussed above concerning the intertwined nature of race, nation, and gender, and the need for consideration of the colonial legacy, the questions that merit critical investigation in this dissertation include: the way women writers (re)present the constitution of identity; the way they (re)construct their history in their writing; the similarities and differences in their strategies of writing against the master narrative; and the extent to which the specific socio-political milieu in each country has affected their writings in terms of choice of themes and perspective.

Outline of Chapters

After setting out the objectives, scope and method of my study in this dissertation, I will begin in the first chapter with a brief historical survey of modern Japanese and Taiwanese literatures. I will concentrate on a presentation of the socio-political conditions that have constrained (and sometimes liberated) women in the two nations, to illuminate the material and discursive conditions that women writers write "against." This will include a discussion of the categories into which women writers in Japan and Taiwan have been "confined" in the literary canons of each culture.

In the second chapter, I will apply gender theory and the Lacanian view of the Symbolic order to investigate and then compare fictional works that have adopted a similar violent theme in dealing with subtle issues of sexuality, power and the textual subversion of patriarchal discourse. These works reveal the brutal realities of patriarchal exploitation of women, and illustrate how the writers intend to subvert the inequities of power in patriarchal ideologies through their writing. Such writings unmask and indict the economies of power in which women are always assigned the role of "performing passivity." The primary literary examples in this chapter are "Funiku" (Rotting Meat, 1972; tr. 1997), written by Kanai Mieko (1947-) from Japan who is well known for her shocking stories; and *Shafu* (The Butcher's Wife, 1983; tr. 1986), written by Li Ang (1952-), one of Taiwan's most famous and controversial feminist writers. In both works the male protagonists kill pigs for a living, and both end up being killed by the female protagonists. With grotesque and controversial depictions, both works subvert the simplistic masculine-feminine paradigm; and yet, the most noteworthy feature of both stories is that neither work acts as a simple revenge fantasy. Instead both stories work to

illuminate and critique existing power structures.

The third chapter will be centred on works that attempt to (re)construct a family genealogy, or even an archaeological history of the nation, from a female as opposed to male perspective. Using the female body as a source of metaphor, the female protagonists in the works under consideration manipulate the dominant discourse to carry out well-laid plots so as to achieve a sort of liberation from patriarchal dominance. Enchi Fumiko's *Onnamen* (*Masks*, 1958; tr. 1983) and Li Ang's *Miyuan* (*The Labyrinthine Garden*, 1991) are two of the most representative works that narrate this kind of strategy. Both works are extremely complex multi-layered novels exploring contemporary women's empowerment within "the confines of an archetype spawned by a male-centric imaginary."²⁶

Instead of narrating a body politics that rejects women's objectification, some writers have addressed the difficulties that arise in resolving the problems of identity displacement and fragmentation in a postcolonial world. In the fourth chapter, I will discuss the works of Ōba Minako (1930-) and Zhu Tianxin (1958-) to explore the predominant theme of displaced subjectivity commonly expressed in the work of these two well-known writers. Ōba's "Yorozu shūzenya no tsuma" (*The Repairman's Wife*, 1974; tr. 1989) and Zhu's "Gudu" (*The Ancient Capital*, 1997) both feature a female protagonist who makes a journey of pilgrimage to a foreign country that had once colonized her homeland. In returning to their own countries from the pilgrimage, both female protagonists find a new way of interpreting their relationship with their homelands and their place in an international hierarchy of nations, and resolve the resentment or anxiety arising from their earlier feelings of being abandoned by or excluded from the nation-state narrative.

As briefly discussed above, issues of gender, race, and nation loom large within the scope of this research project. As Western mainstream feminism is inadequate to deal with Japanese and Taiwanese women's writing, I will use a critical approach subsuming postcolonialism, adapting work by theorists such as Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak, Trinh T. Minh-Ha, and Rey Chow, which will enable us to more effectively investigate gendered literary production in Japan and Taiwan. That is, we need a gender-sensitive perspective incorporating marginalized and Third World women's experiences with critical insights from postcolonialism. Equally important in dealing with the complexity of highly contested identity issues will be this project's focus on each country's specific socio-historical context. In the concluding chapter I will recap the points demonstrated in the discussions of specific literary works, and will link these points with the larger questions of postcolonial identities and the applicability of Western theory in the study of postcolonial non-Western literary works.

Notes

¹ For the purpose of comparative study in this dissertation, I refer to Taiwan as an independent country. In a fundamental sense, Taiwan possesses its own unique belief and value systems, and therefore on the international scene exists as an independent entity with its own national character.

² In a series of battles in the late 1850s and into the 1860s, the Shogunal government was overthrown, and the emperor returned to his position as head of state. The establishment of the new imperial government took place in 1868, and is usually known as the Meiji Restoration. The period of the Meiji emperor's reign, from 1868 until his death in 1912, is known as the Meiji period.

³ The Qing Dynasty, also known as the Manchu Dynasty, was founded by Manchurians,

who ruled over China where the Han people constitute the overwhelming majority of the population. Taking advantage of the political instability and popular rebellions plaguing the Han-dominant Ming Dynasty, the Manchu armies took over Beijing in 1644, and later established their imperial rule with significant assistance from members of the Han Chinese elite who were systematically selected into the imperial court through Confucian examinations. The Qing ruled China until it was overthrown in a revolution led by Dr. Sun Yatsen in 1911, which ended China's 2000-plus year history of imperial rule.

⁴ Kirk A. Denton, "Thematic Essays: Historical Review," in *The Columbia Companion to Modern East Asian Literature*, ed. Joshua Mostow (New York: Columbia University Press, 2003), p. 291.

⁵ Joshua Mostow, "The Columbia Companion to Modern East Asian Literature," *idem. The Columbia Companion to Modern East Asian Literature*, p. 9.

⁶ The vernacularization of Chinese literature both did and did not include Taiwan. Taiwanese writers who wrote in standard Mandarin Chinese after the 1920s could, of course, use the new vernacular, but those who wanted to write in Taiwanese dialect, or any of the other many dialects of the ethnic groups of Taiwan, could not. For more on the problems involved, see Faye Yuan Kleeman, *Under an Imperial Sun: Japanese Colonial Literature of Taiwan and the South* (Honolulu: Hawai'i University Press, 2003), p. 122.

⁷ For more information on *genbun'itchi* in Japan, see Nanette Twine, *Language and the Modern State: The Reform of Written Japanese* (London: Routledge, 1991); for *baihuawen yundong* in China, see Milena Doleželová-Velingerová, "The Origins of Modern Chinese Literature," in *Modern Chinese Literature in the May Fourth Era*, ed. Merle Goldman (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1977), pp. 17-35.

⁸ Zheng Chenggong was born in Japan to Zeng Zhilong, a Chinese merchant and pirate, and to Tagawa Matsu, a Japanese woman. When the Dutch came to Taiwan in 1624, they only found the aborigines on the island: there was no sign of any administrative structure or any form of government. Therefore, it is assumed that by that time Taiwan was not part of China's territory. The first influx of Han immigrants from China came during the Dutch period. As a Han general, Zheng devoted himself to building Taiwan into an effective base in order to restore the Ming Dynasty. His ambition, succeeded by his son and grandson, was eventually dashed in 1683 when Taiwan fell to the Qing armies. See John E. Wills, Jr. "The Seventh-Century Transformation: Taiwan under the Dutch and the Cheng Regime," in *Taiwan: A New History*, ed. Murray A. Rubinstein (Armonk, New York; London, England: M.E. Sharpe, 1999), pp.84-106.

⁹ Ken Ito, "The Family and the Nation in Tokutomi Roka's *Hototogisu*," *Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies* 60, no. 2 (Dec. 2000): p. 489.

-
- ¹⁰ The terms of *gaichi* 外地 (literally, external territory) and *naichi* 内地 (internal territory) were used to differentiate Japan's colonies and itself. The colonial literature was referred to as *gaichi bungaku*.
- ¹¹ Members of the Nationalist Party (KMT) had dominated the government in China until 1949.
- ¹² Herbert Passin, "The Occupation—Some Reflections," in *Shōwa: The Japan of Hirohito*, eds. Carol Gluck and Stephen R. Graubard (New York: W.W. Norton, 1992), pp. 107-29.
- ¹³ Several scholars have argued previously that the periods I have identified here mark significant moments of political and socio-cultural upheaval in the two countries, opening for women a new literary space. For Taiwan see Kuei-fen Chiu's "Identity Politics in Contemporary Women's Novels in Taiwan," *Tamkang Review* 30, no. 2 (Winter 1999): pp. 27-54; for Japan see Sharalyn Orbaugh's "The Body in Contemporary Japanese Women's Fiction," in *The Woman's Hand: Gender and Theory in Japanese Women's Writing*, eds. Paul Gordon Schalow and Janet A. Walker (Stanford, California: Stanford University Press, 1996), pp. 119-64.
- ¹⁴ Li Chiao, "Bickering About Literature: The Meaning of 'Taiwan Literature,'" trans. Robert Smitheram *Taiwanese Literature: English Translation Series* no. 1 (August 1996): p. 13.
- ¹⁵ Bill Ashcroft, Gareth Griffiths, and Helen Tiffin, *Key Concepts in Post-Colonial Studies* (London and New York: Routledge, 1998), pp. 231-2.
- ¹⁶ Joel Krieger ed., *The Oxford Companion to Politics of the World*, 2nd ed. (Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press, 2001), p. 835.
- ¹⁷ Edward Said, *Orientalism* (New York: Vintage, 1978), p. 188. Said did not explicitly address East Asia—China, Japan, and Korea—in his work, but numerous scholars have extended his findings and arguments to that area as well.
- ¹⁸ *Ibid.*, p. 206.
- ¹⁹ There will be more discussion on the definition of gender in Chapter 2.
- ²⁰ Michael Banton, *Racial Theories* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1987).
- ²¹ Benedict Anderson, *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism* (London and New York: Verso, 1983), p. 15.
- ²² *Ibid.*, p. 12.
- ²³ Recognizing the danger of exclusion and essentialism the category might entail, feminists are still arguing whether one should retain the unified category "women." However, many feminists from places other than Europe and North America contend that the category "women" remains necessary and relevant to criticism that must consider the complex politics of gender and nation together. Gayatri Spivak, for example, suggests that "strategic essentialism" may be necessary to effective politics.

She points out that essentialism is bad not in its essence but in its application. Strategic essentialism, when clearly identified as such, can be useful in considerations of postcolonial identity/subjectivity. Similarly, deconstruction—which advocates the elimination of such essentialist categories—is not primarily for the purpose of exposing error but to constantly and persistently look into how truths are produced. See Spivak's *In Other World: Essays in Cultural Politics* (London; New York: Methuen, 1987), pp. 197-221. In this dissertation I will use the “deconstructive” approach of tracing the origins of various discourses in order to reveal their limits and contradictions, but will also use the “strategic essentialist” approach of considering categories like “women” or “Taiwanese” (national/cultural identity) to be legitimate political-cultural tools when writers are considering their identities in the global hierarchy of nations.

²⁴ Recent years have seen a slow but steady increase in critical analyses of Japanese and Taiwanese literature that do include consideration of gender in the construction of national literatures. I will cite these studies in my discussion below and in subsequent chapters.

²⁵ Wai-Lim Yip, “Beyond Chinoiserie: Differentiating Sameness in the Oriental Hermeneutic Community,” pp.221-32; John J. Deeney “Chinese-Eastern Comparative Literature Studies: The Case of China-Korea-Japan,” pp. 185-200, both in *Tamkang Review* 15 nos. 1-4 (May 1984). Miseli Jeon is one of the forerunners who conduct comparative research between modern Japanese and Korean literatures. See her doctoral thesis, “Violent Emotions: Modern Japanese and Korean Women’s Writing, 1920-1980,” The University of British Columbia, 2004.

²⁶ Nina Cornyetz, “Bound by Blood: Female Pollution, Divinity, and Community in Enchi Fumiko’s *Masks*.” *U.S.-Japan Women’s Journal: English Supplement* 9 (December 1995): p. 37.

Chapter One

Brief Surveys of Modern Japanese and Taiwanese Literatures

Japan's new era of modernity is commonly considered to have begun in 1868 with the Meiji Restoration. Through an intensive and self-conscious process of modernization/westernization Japan successfully transformed itself into the first modern nation-state in Asia. Yet, modernity also raised new questions about the meaning of subjectivity—subjectivity as defined through nation and nationalism on the one hand; and through modern definitions of family, gender, and sexuality on the other hand. The new literature that was developed after the Meiji Restoration in order to express these new aspects of subjectivity is what we mean when we refer to “modern Japanese literature.” By contrast, it is rather difficult to define the scope and content of “modern Taiwanese literature” for certain because of Taiwan's complicated political/colonial history, which is still unfolding. However, the Qing government's cession of Taiwan to Japan in 1895 and China's May Fourth Movement in 1919 are historical events that had profound influences on Taiwan's modernization and the development of a modern Taiwanese literature. In this chapter I will briefly explain the major social and political events that shaped Japanese and Taiwanese modernity, and will trace the literary developments that paralleled those social and political changes. In particular I will highlight the ways colonial relationships and gender are implicated in social, political and literary developments, in order to provide background for the exploration of the three major themes in this project: that is, gender, race and nation in their relations to and effects on women's literary production in the post-World War Two period.

Modern Subjectivity in Prewar Japan

Compared with Taiwan, the modernization of Japan was more thorough and the process smoother. In fact, Japan was the first country in Asia to achieve full modernity and join the club of the Great Powers by the late 19th century. Threatened and provoked by the modern project in the form of Western imperialism, the oligarchs of the Meiji government initiated a program of adopting Western technology, and military and governmental structures. Moreover, Japanese leaders generally adopted Western discourses of modernity and the modern nation-state, with all of the complex, even metaphysical conceptions of subjectivity implied therein. Despite Japan's success in transplanting the trappings of modernity, resulting in 1920 in its inclusion among the founding members of the League of Nations (the only "non-white" nation included), Japan had already been designated an immovably inferior position in the hierarchy of modern nations, based on race. According to the new Anglo-European sciences of the nineteenth century, "Whites" were seen as most advanced, civilized, "Orientals" were next, and "Blacks" were at the bottom of the hierarchy. Therefore, in contrast to Anglo-European countries that were represented as superior and "masculine," Japan was seen as inferior and "feminine." The inflexibility of this belief was made clear when Japan requested that a statement of basic racial equality be included in the founding charter of the League of Nations, only to be emphatically refused by the other founding members.

Japan's military buildup in the Meiji period, and its earliest colonial incursions into neighboring nations were attempts to replicate the colonizing activities of the "already modernized" nations of the Western world. But it is likely that these colonizing efforts

and those that followed were also motivated by a desire among Japanese leaders to assert masculinity in the face of this racialized and gendered discourse of inferiority.¹

Significantly, when reinventing itself as a modern nation, Meiji Japan invoked the *ie seido* 家制度 (“the family system”)—an institution within which the father of a family retained all the authority and legal rights, while other family members remained subordinate—as the most important building block in the establishment of the *kazoku kokka* 家族国家 (“the family nation”), within which the emperor held the analogous position of head of the “national family.” Behind the system is the commonplace notion of analogizing the relations between emperor/subject to parent/child. These social/juridical structures were further supported by the implementation of the *koseki* 戸籍 (household registry) system in 1871, in which every individual’s family affiliation was registered with the government.² With the husband/father as the head of the household, each family had to duly register any newcomer in its *koseki*, such as a legitimate new born child, a bride, or an adoptive child or adoptive husband. In order to preserve the patrilineal bloodline, family inheritance and headship were passed from father to the eldest son. A family that had daughters but no sons would legally adopt a husband for one of its daughters, to inherit the family’s surname and property. In this case the “patrilineal” relationship was fictive, but the all-important transmission of headship from male to male was maintained.

In rationalization of the annexations of Taiwan (1895) and Korea (1910) Japan termed these new members of the family *yōshi* 養子 (adopted sons), using the discourse of the family-nation to encourage assimilation. In order to imperialize its colonial subjects and inculcate in them a sense of commonality with the Japanese main islands, policies

such as education in the Japanese language and the implementation of the household registry system were imposed on the colonies. The ideology of the family-nation united all the regions and classes of Japan and its colonies into one “imagined community” by reinforcing the Confucian virtues of filial piety, loyalty, and submissive and passive femininity on the part of the subordinate members.

In demonstrating the fundamental homology and complicity between nationalist and Orientalist discourses, Partha Chatterjee suggests that it is “woman” who becomes the ground upon which nationalism is able to construct its national identity.³ In the case of modern Japan pursuing its nationalist project, the Meiji government enacted the 1890 constitution and subsequent legislation to prohibit women from playing any role in politics.⁴ Thus removed from the foreground of modernization, women were nonetheless given what they were told was an important role in nation-building: they were to be “*ryōsai kenbo*” 良妻賢母 (good wives, wise mothers) so as to support the nation’s specific national policy of *fukoku kyōhei* 富国強兵 (rich country, strong army).

The new conceptualizations of subjectivity, based on newly emerging discourses of nation and gender, were explored and sometimes contested by writers of modern literature. Among the earliest important writers to address the new conceptions of nationhood and the subjectivity of modern Japanese people were Mori Ōgai and Natsume Sōseki. Ōgai’s so-called “romantic trilogy” (1890-1891),⁵ influenced by German Romanticism and based on Ōgai’s four-year experience as an army medical officer in Berlin, emphasized the desire for a strong stance of masculinity and national pride when encountering the already modernized Western nations. The trilogy reveals Ōgai’s attempt to reverse the “sciences” that claimed to have proved the equation of “the Orient” and “inferiority,” and

his desire to construct male subjectivity through re-masculinizing the Japanese male vis-à-vis the West. In contrast, Natsume Sōseki expressed a disconcerted sense of racial inferiority in several works, including his famous essay on individualism.⁶ Moreover, in his novel *Kokoro* (1914; tr. 1957, *Kokoro*), he uses the death of the real-life General Nogi Maresuke as a central symbol to probe into the nature of the modern male intellectual subject's relation to the *kazoku kokka*.⁷ At the end of the story, the protagonist commits *junshi* to the spirit of the Meiji era in the hope of alleviating the discomfort of guilt resulting from the influence of Western individualism. An important aspect of the work of both of these pioneering male authors of modern Japanese literature is their striking attention to the different roles played by men and women in Japan's modernity, with the women in their works depicted almost uniformly as passive, the "ground" against which modern masculinity is defined.

As the family-nation ideology not only made "natural" loyalty to the emperor but also granted wide-ranging powers to the head of a family over his subordinate members, the desire to search for and substantiate the patrilineal lineage is a key component not only of national identity but also in that of the individual modern man. Accordingly many of the male-authored novels in the pre-World War Two period in Japan share the common theme of the "male anxiety over 'authentic' genealogy; that is, the search for, or anxiety over, the identity of the father, to the exclusion of women."⁸ The female-excluding homosocial genealogy that Eve Kosofsky Sedgwick defines as one of the fundamental elements of modern literature and nation building in English literary production⁹ can also be found here in modern Japanese literature. In many male-authored novels of the prewar period, women function as objects of exchange between men, becoming the foundation of

the homosocial construction of the male subject. They remain nothing more than an imaginary projection of the male protagonists' fantasies and desires, and never display any agency of their own. Leading at best unhappy or unflattering, and at worst violent and tragic lives, women presented in the prewar literature were merely the ground upon which the *kazoku kokka*, its masculinity and modern subjectivity could be constructed.

Unlike their counterparts in Taiwan, Japanese women writers had occupied a preeminent position in the classical literary canon, a phenomenon that many observers have noted as an anomaly in world literatures.¹⁰ However, after the great heyday of writing by court women in the Heian period (794-1185), the works produced by Japanese women writers suffered a decline until the Meiji period (1868-1912) when Western literary ideas of the nineteenth-century were introduced. Japanese women have been described as discursively "silent" between these two literary peaks.¹¹ However, the second peak—in the modern period—was relatively slow to take off. Compulsory education for both girls and boys was instituted in the Meiji period, but beyond the elementary years the content of that education differed considerably by sex. As the number of educated, literate women slowly grew, a few women writers of modern fiction did emerge in the years before World War Two. Among these were Uno Chiyo, Tamura Toshiko, Hayashi Fumiko, Miyomoto Yuriko, and Hirabayashi Taiko. Despite the difficulties in getting published in a literary environment entirely controlled by men, as well as government censorship of materials dealing with explicitly feminist themes, these early modern women writers did present visions of Japanese modernity that differed strikingly from their male counterparts. Statistically speaking, however, it was not until the postwar period that women's literary production comprised more than a tiny fraction

of male authors' output.

Thus, although modern Japanese women writers have inherited a relatively rich literary legacy, their position is little better than that of Western women writers who are from a silent past. Conventionally, the works by Japanese women writers have been defined as *joryū bungaku* 女流文学, or women's literature, a categorization made simply in terms the gender of the author. Joan E. Ericson contends that the concept of *joryū bungaku* is one of the modes used to segregate women's works from the modern literary canon, which is defined as works by male writers.¹² In particular, under the institutionalized ideology of the family nation, women who were institutionally and discursively molded as *ryōsai kenbo* (good wives, wise mothers) were excluded from the establishment of the symbolic lineage of the family nation, and became merely the ground upon which modern nationalism was forged.

In the postwar period, however, after Japan had obtained economic and political autonomy in the 1960s and 1970s, women writers suddenly comprised an important part of the literary community. In this period, which I will discuss below, women writers started probing into the residual destructive effects of the family system and the strictly determined gender roles assigned for women to faithfully observe. As the fluctuating fortunes of writers in different ages suggest, Japanese women have been especially vulnerable to social and ideological constraints. Like that of their counterparts in Taiwan, Japanese women's literature offers a particularly valuable record of the way in which such constraints can be both depicted and resisted in language.¹³

Fiction in the Occupation Period

After Japan was defeated in 1945, the nation lost sovereignty and passed into the control of the Supreme Command for Allied Powers (SCAP), a coalition of Allied nations. For more than seven years Japan was entirely under the control of this alien government. While this is not equivalent to the kinds of colonialism practiced by Western nations and Japan earlier in the century, the effects of the Occupation on concepts of Japanese nationhood and individual subjectivity were similar to those we find in colonized areas. If we consider the Meiji period as a time when Japan was intensively (if willingly) colonized by Western discourses, then the Occupation marks a second, and far more intensive, experience of discursive colonization.

The modern subjectivity imagined and expressed in prewar literature was subjected to critical reevaluation when Japan was defeated in World War Two after the atomic bombings of Hiroshima and Nagasaki. The emperor's radiocast announcement of Japan's surrender on August 15, 1945 was a psychological blow to the entire nation, and the ensuing arrival of the SCAP government entailed tremendous changes in the juridical institutions and social structures that later commanded far-reaching effects in almost every aspect of Japan's society. Led by U.S. General Douglas MacArthur, SCAP imposed numerous structural changes in the next seven years that had profound influences on Japan's existing economic, political, educational, and judicial systems.¹⁴ Despite the war damage and the shortage of food, housing, and printing materials, the publication industry revived almost immediately after the end of the war. Throughout the fifteen years of war time, rigid censorship and an extensive system of "advisorship" had been exercised to produce conformist texts. As early as 1933, left-wing writers of the so-called Proletarian

School had been forced to choose between “converting” (*tenkō*) or going to prison.¹⁵ Succumbing to various kinds of harsh pressure, the majority of Japanese intellectuals seem to have regarded it as their duty to cooperate in their field with the government’s war efforts.

For the majority of Japanese intellectuals the defeat signified the regaining of their freedom of expression. One of SCAP’s first actions was to loosen the wartime censorship on printed materials. Criticism of the emperor system was tolerated and became commonplace.¹⁶ The writers who had been silent during the war and those who had been imprisoned for their writing critical of the war came out to join in an energetic debate on the issues of nation, subjectivity, Japan’s war responsibility and its international position. SCAP did impose its own areas of censorship, however, writing depicting the experiences of bombings, the postwar food shortage, Allied soldiers’ involvement in the black market, “destructive criticism” of the Allied forces, and so on, were forbidden.¹⁷ Nonetheless, this was a time of active reevaluation of the meaning of Japanese subjectivity in literature.

The number of women writing during the Occupation period remained small compared to that of men. But this was also a time of very important changes in the legal structures that supported Japan’s gender systems, resulting in new literary conceptions. The new constitution of 1947, written and imposed by the SCAP in its first attempt to nurture a democratic society, enfranchised women fully equal to men. For the first time Japanese women were given equal rights to vote and participate in political activities. The *ie seido* was abolished (although the *koseki* system remains). Women were given the right to initiate divorce proceedings and the right to own property and make legal decision without the consent of a husband or father. In this time of great social progress, women

writers began to challenge the prewar ideologies and gender relations.

For many men, Japan's defeat resulted in a loss of the "masculinity" that had been partly achieved through Japan's previous colonization of some Asian countries. Above all, they lost their symbolic father when SCAP required the emperor to renounce his divinity and sovereignty. Under the control of the occupation forces, Japanese men were once again implicitly (and sometimes explicitly) feminized by the Western Powers. During the Occupation, "true" masculinity was represented by General MacArthur—physically large, white, and English-speaking.¹⁸

Many of the male writers who had already established themselves before the war continued to write and publish their works with little indication that they were disturbed by Japan's defeat. It was the generation of younger writers who started their careers during or after the war who most conspicuously struggled to reassess the meaning of Japanese (male) identity. Among them the *senchū-ha* 戦中派 (war generation), comprising those whose youthful experiences coincided with the years of mounting intellectual repression and military expansion of Japan, wrote about their experiences, both as participants in and as chroniclers of the war and the defeat, with ironies and feelings of "chronic weariness."¹⁹ This would also be the first generation in modern Japan to have been cut loose from the system of family/home as most of them fell out of touch with family/home, convention and heritage during their childhood. Yet, most unfortunately, after the war they returned only to a disrupted society that offered no place for them. As such, they had to struggle to live in the absence of values that had previously sustained their ancestors for generations.²⁰

A literary association known as the *Dai-san no shinjin* 第三の新人 (The Third

Generation of New Writers) was a subgroup within the *senchū-ha*, led by Yasuoka Shōtarō, Kojima Nobuo, and Shimao Toshio. These young men's writing, known as "the literature of humiliation," can be characterized as gloomy, "sometimes humorous, sometimes surrealistic, but always expressing a sense of disempowerment and degradation."²¹ For example, Yasuoka Shōtarō writes about the loss of home and the war defeat in a tone of "gloomy pleasure" (*inki na tanoshimi*, the title of his Akutagawa Prize-winning story). Depicted in this tone of self-mockery, his characters are often crippled, inept, and cowardly, and all they can do is stand helplessly, not only puzzled by modernization but deserted by tradition.

While immediate postwar male writers thus struggled with large-scale themes such as the loss of masculine authority and psychological oppression under the occupation, female writers, such as Hayashi Fumiko and Hirabayashi Taiko, tended to focus on the difficult conditions of daily life immediately after the war. Right after the war, Hayashi Fumiko (who had debuted in 1928 with her autobiographical novel *Hōrōki* [Diary of a Vagabond, tr. 1997]), began to write of the despair that seized the Japanese populace during the immediate postwar period. She focused on poor and working-class women, particularly on their attempts and efforts to survive the war and its aftermath—particularly its effects on families. "Kawahaze" (River Gudgeon, 1947) and "Hone" (Bones, 1949; tr. 1981) are two representative works dedicated to this theme. "Kawahaze" portrays the female protagonist's agony over the incestuous relationship between herself and her father-in-law that has developed while her husband has been off at war. The desperate Chihoko, the protagonist, thinks about committing double suicide with her newborn illegitimate baby when she learns that her husband will soon be demobilized. Ironically,

although she feels guilty over her infidelity, her desire for Yohei, her father-in-law, has lost none of its intensity. Caught in between shame and sexual desire, Chihoko feels as if she is a river gudgeon whose head is cut off but the body is still struggling on the chopping board. She is desperate to figure out a way to create a new kind of family that can survive even such an upheaval, so that she, her new baby, and her husband can go on.

In a similar fashion, “Hone” also depicts women’s vitality to survive. The protagonist, Michiko, widowed by the war, is forced to prostitute herself in support of her family—her father crippled with rheumatism, her younger brother Kanji bedridden with tuberculosis, and her seven-year-old daughter Emiko who has never seen her father. Despite her initial reluctance, Michiko gradually gets used to the work of prostitution, for the cruel reality leaves her no choice. The crushing family burden makes Michiko pray for Kanji’s inevitable death to come quickly, to stop the relentless pressure of his constant demands for expensive foods and a hopeless operation. When Kanji does die Michiko grieves, but then starts to wonder when her father is going to pass away. The male members of the family, who used to hold all authority and bring in the income, are depicted in this story as useless burdens, forcing Michiko into a life of prostitution that threatens her own health and her ability to take care of her young daughter.

Through the characters of Chihoko and Michiko, Hayashi is in effect challenging the conventional wisdom and social constructs regarding the prewar roles of “good wife and wise mother.” In Hayashi’s stories, women eventually come to realize that they live for the sake of the child, and more importantly, live for themselves. Hayashi’s attack on patriarchy is reinforced by her representations of unconventional females who possess a keen self-reliance and “seek to impart their own meanings and significance to their

actions."²² Her works are representative of the literary production by women in the immediate postwar period.

The Intellectual Climate of Post-Occupation

Upon the withdrawal of the Allied Occupation Forces in 1952, Japan regained its economic and political autonomy. SCAP had supported an economic restructuring and the rebuilding of Japan's war-flattened industries. Building on this momentum, the Japanese government enacted a strategy of economic growth that led in the late 1950s and throughout the 1960s to a period of unprecedented economic prosperity. In 1964 Tokyo hosted the Eighteenth Olympic Games (the first ever held in Asia) and in 1970 Osaka hosted the International Exposition (Expo); both successful events impressed the world and substantially enhanced Japan's international image. While the post-Occupation period was successful in those regards, it also saw a cluster of sociopolitical activism in the form of mass demonstrations and citizens' movements in the 1960s and early 1970s. The mass protests against the signing of the U.S.-Japanese Security Treaty (Anpo) in 1960 were supported by a majority of intellectuals who vehemently criticized Japan's continued dependence on and complicity with the United States. There were also many student riots in the late 1960s, the Sanrizuka farmers' bitter resistance to the construction of Tokyo International Airport at Narita since 1966, and widespread anti-pollution movements inspired by horrendous ecological disasters, of which Minamata in the late 1960s and early 1970s is the most widely known.²³ Not only were writers actively involved in these movements but many reflected these heated political and social debates in their writing. Many male writers in the 1960s, such as Ōe Kenzaburō, Abe Kōbō, and Shimao Toshio,

used existentialist and humanist techniques to portray the rapidly increasing internationalization, industrialization and urbanization of Japanese life.²⁴

After one hundred years of modernization beginning with the Meiji Restoration in 1868, Japanese literature achieved international validation in 1968 when Kawabata Yasunari won the Nobel Prize for literature. Ironically, however, it was not the “modern” aspects of Kawabata’s fiction that were praised. Kawabata was honoured by the Nobel Prize Committee explicitly for the special affinities with Japanese traditions that his works revealed, despite the fact that his works dealt exclusively with the lives of contemporaries.²⁵ This phenomenon reveals Japan’s continued status as a “Third World” country in cultural terms. Taking inspiration from the movie *King Kong*, Rey Chow has proposed the notion of the “King Kong syndrome” to describe the Western reading of non-Western, “Third World” countries. She writes that it is “the cross-cultural syndrome in which the ‘third world,’ as the site of the ‘raw’ material that is ‘monstrosity,’ is produced for the surplus-value of spectacle, entertainment, and spiritual enrichment for the ‘First World’.”²⁶ In other words, the more traditional and “authentic” the cultural products of “Third World” nations appear to be, the more highly the First World praises them.

As Japan’s first Nobel Prize winner, it is worth briefly considering the explorations of subjectivity, especially gendered subjectivity, in Kawabata’s fiction. For Kawabata Japan’s defeat in WW II was a severe shock that made him feel obligated to preserve what was left of what he saw to be Japan’s essential beauty. This can be seen in early postwar works such as *Senbazuru* (1949-50, Thousand Cranes) and *Koto* (1961, The Old Capital). In his later works, Kawabata employs surrealistic techniques to tell stories that reveal his

exploration of modern gender. These stories include *Nemureru bijo* (1960; tr. 1969, *The House of Sleeping Beauties*) and “Kataude” (1965; tr. 1985, *One Arm*), both of which represent a “powerful and enlightening climax” in Kawabata’s career.²⁷ Both of the stories provide the most radical solution to the Kawabata male who desires to search for and then to preserve the purity of a virginal girl. Both stories feature an alienated, self-loathing male protagonist who is somehow “purified” or even spiritually “enlightened” by his contact with a beautiful “virginal whore.” Aligning himself with Nakamura Mitsuo, Keene asserts that the men in Kawabata’s works serve mainly to set off the women; as such, “they [that is, the male protagonists] are not the vehicles for the author’s reflections and emotions as in an ‘I novel’.”²⁸ However, I would argue on the contrary that Kawabata’s female protagonists, who are constantly depicted as pure, erotic, and innocent, are merely *ficelle* characters that are there to prop up the male protagonist’s pursuit of his “ideal.”²⁹ That is, despite their erotic potency, Kawabata’s female protagonists are assigned roles of subordination around “the centrality of inactive, impotent, but dominant males,” serving to bolster a cultural ideology of male domination.³⁰

Ōe Kenzaburō was the second Japanese writer to be awarded the Nobel Prize for literature, in 1994, 26 years after Kawabata. Ōe represents a new generation of postwar male writers. In one of his earliest stories, “Shiiku” (Prize Stock, 1958), Ōe deals with Japanese male experiences of war and occupation from the perspective of a boy—as he himself was at the time. Ōe allegorically depicts the feelings shared by many Japanese young men after the war of betrayal committed by the symbolic father, and the havoc that this caused in people’s lives. In “Ningen no hitsuji” (Human Sheep, 1958), another story

written during the same period, Ōe portrays the inhumane and humiliating treatment experienced by the disempowered Japanese under the Allied occupation. Later, Ōe criticizes Japan's political relationship with the United States in *Man'en gannen no futtobōru*, (The Silent Cry, 1967); and proposes a critical reassessment of the postwar emperor and the emperor system as a whole in *Waga namida o nuguitamau hi* (The Day He Himself Shall Wipe My Tears Away, 1972). Ōe has gone through many changes in his nearly 50 year career so far, but in general it can be said that he is concerned with the meaning of being Japanese in a postwar national and international context, and is one of the representative postwar (male) writers who are implicitly or explicitly engaged in a search for something ineffable that Ōe himself terms the "sublime."³¹ Like the writing of his contemporaries, Ōe's literature often questions dogmas, institutions and national identities.

The Flowering of Women's Writing from the 1950s to 1970s

It was not until the late 1950s that many women were active in literary production. One of the first women to achieve mainstream recognition in this period was Enchi Fumiko. Perhaps taking a cue from the women's fiction published during the Occupation, Enchi also focused on themes of the residual destructive effects of the family system and the strictly determined gender roles for women. Enchi's most famous novels, *Onnazaka* (*The Waiting Years*, 1957; tr. 1971) and *Onnamen* (*Masks*, 1958; tr. 1983) are representative works. *The Waiting Years*, awarded the Noma Literary Prize, portrays the jealousy and agony experienced by the wife and concubines of an upper-class politician in the Meiji period. It depicts the devastating effects that the *ie seido* institution had upon the

women of that age, and analyzes the plight of women who had no choice but to accept the demeaning roles assigned by the patriarchal family system. Whereas *The Waiting Years* is historical fiction, *Masks* is an extremely complex multi-layered novel exploring contemporary women's empowerment within "the confines of an archetype spawned by a male-centric imaginary."³² The widowed Mieko, the protagonist of *Masks*, secretly carries out a plot to avenge her husband's past infidelity by creating her own maternal genealogy. Using the "feminine" tools of spirit possession and seduction, Michiko manages to produce an heir to her husband's family line, the semi-aristocratic Toganōs, who in fact bears no Toganō genes, but rather carries the genes of Michiko's former lover. Works such as these, which critique and sometimes subvert prewar gender structures (many of which continued into the postwar period in practice if not in law), are typical of the writing of many women in the late 1950s and into the 1960s and drew important critical attention to the work of women writers.

It was in the 1960s, however, that women's writing in Japan started to blossom out. Due to a substantial increase in the number of women writers getting published, and also to some remarkable qualitative changes in their writing, the 1960s and 1970s were dubbed by critics as a "Little Heian" after the great Heian period of women writers in the tenth and eleventh centuries. Although very few women writers had achieved mainstream critical attention before that point, Japanese women writers claimed nearly half of the major literary awards (such as Akutagawa Prize) in the 1960s and the 1970s.³³ (As we shall see, there was a parallel phenomenon in Taiwan in the 1980s.)

There are a number of reasons for the sudden rise of women's fiction in this period. The changes in women's rights under the Occupation, such as the revision of Japan's

Civil Code and the enactment of the new Constitution, had enshrined important civil liberties, providing Japanese women equality in marriage, education, and work. Moreover, birth control and abortion were legalized in the postwar period for the first time in decades.³⁴ Although the full effects of such enormous changes took time to unfold, they gradually created a more level playing field for women writers in the 1960s and 1970s. In particular, these measures enabled women writers to gain access to literary venues which heretofore had been dominated by men. Attaining the legal right to equal social status (even if not yet fully achieved in reality), women were able to assert themselves and to claim their rights to participate in public and cultural affairs.

The economic surge since the late 1950s also gave rise to an important phenomenon in this context. Thanks to advances in home appliances and increasing affluence, some women were substantially relieved from the daily burden of domestic duties and thus were free to engage in their personal pursuits. The healthy economy combined with the postwar liberalization of the education system also meant that more women were educated and thereby prepared both to produce and consume literature. Having thus acquired a greater degree of literacy and financial freedom, women became powerful but as yet unexplored players in the cultural market place. Unprecedented progress in media development and technology also made publishing much easier than before. Fiction written by women or intended for women to read therefore became a brand new popular product to hit the market in the 1960s.³⁵

It is the writing produced by women in this time period that will be the focus of my analysis in subsequent chapters. Among the most prominent women writers who were active during the late 1960s and 1970s are Kōno Taeko, Ōba Minako, Kurahashi Yumiko,

Tsushima Yūko, and Kanai Mieko. In contrast to their female predecessors, whose writing styles are realistic and autobiographical, and also in contrast to the work of the majority of male writers in the same time period, many of these women writers often feature fantasy and utopian or dystopian worlds, parody, satire, and a focus on the grotesque.³⁶ In particular, disturbing and offensive themes such as incest, explicit sado-masochism, amnesia, infanticide, cannibalism, murder, dismemberment, disfiguration and so on, are quite common in the fiction written by women of this era.³⁷

Among them, Kōno is well known for her graphic portrayal of women's psychology, particularly subversions of motherhood defined in terms of the "good mother," and subversions of female sexuality defined in terms of "sexual passiveness/submissiveness." Two of her representative works on this theme are "Yōjigari" (Toddler-hunting, 1961; tr. 1991) which won her fame when it was awarded the Shinchōsa Dōjin Zasshi Award, and "Kani" (Crabs, 1963; tr. 1996) for which she was awarded Japan's highest literary honor, the Akutagawa Prize. The protagonists in these two works, as in most of Kōno's other stories, are middle-aged women who cannot bear children because of tuberculosis, and have a particular aversion toward girls but on the contrary an excessive pedophilic interest in boys. Hayashi Akiko in "Yōjigari" is an economically independent woman who impulsively buys boy clothes and enjoys imagining small boys putting them on. With no desire to get married, she develops a sadomasochistic sexual relationship with a man named Sasaki who is two years her junior. She indulges herself: having Sasaki whip her and grip her neck with necklaces or wash ropes while they are having sex. One night her kinky pursuit of this passion is so extreme that Akiko almost dies. After having this kind of sex with Sasaki, she always ends up longing emphatically to have a little boy. She

fantasizes that little boys, the object of her sadistic sexual urges, are chastised by their fathers. The fantasies turn beyond simple punishment into tyrannizing violence, such as burning and disemboweling. Defying categorization, Kōno's female characters tend to reject the conventional domestic life and the traditional feminine ideal.

In contrast to Kōno's anti-motherliness, Ōba Minako writes specifically from the position of "mother-as-subject," focalizing on the seldom articulated experience of maternity.³⁸ "Sanbiki no kani" (The Three Crabs, 1968; tr. 1982), for which Ōba won both the Gunzō New Writer's Prize and the Akutagawa Prize, explores the constitution of the family and the subject construction of the mother. Also written from the position of mother-as-subject, her "Yamauba no bishō" (The Smile of the Mountain Witch, 1976; tr. 1991) sympathetically explores the behavior of the allegedly irrational, alien, and threatening female demon that is believed to live within all women. Using the topos of the *yamauba*—the demon woman who devours men—as "the embodiment of all women who defy the constricting rules of society,"³⁹ Ōba acknowledges the distinctiveness of women and reveals the ways in which society condemns that very difference as pathological. For Ōba, all women are *yamauba* at heart. The *yamauba*'s struggle is emblematic of the difficulties women encounter when they try to represent their experiences within a patriarchal code that is designed to exclude and deny them. As such, Ōba often creates unwomanly yet autonomous women, especially mothers, who deviate significantly from the stereotyped or idealized norms and conventions prescribed for women. Ōba's other works will be discussed in further detail in a later chapter.

Among the women writers of the 1960s and the 1970s, Kanai Mieko explores some of the most offensive themes and presents some of the most disturbing images in her

stories that deconstruct the family system. In these works, such as "Kikan" (The Home-coming, 1970), "Usagi" (Rabbits, 1972; tr. 1982), "Funiku" (Rotting Meat, 1972; tr. 1997), and "Boshizō" (Portrait of Mother and Child, 1972), Kanai, using the female body as a source of metaphor, a locus of structural analogy (as Enchi Fumiko did in *Masks*), makes visible the ways the body has been gendered to produce and maintain the power economies of patriarchy. In the following chapter, Kanai's "Rotting Meat," which best represents her use of the body as metaphor will be further discussed to demonstrate the point.

Most women writers have been regarded as less important by Japanese literary critics because their writing is deemed limited to the "physical" or "private" areas of life. However, since both gender and the body are historically and culturally determined, the personal is in effect the political.⁴⁰ Moreover, women writers' texts of this period that return to the body are indeed political in the sense that they propose and enact a politics of resistance to hegemonic patriarchal discourse and institutions. As Orbaugh puts it, "by appropriating aspects of the gendered-based power economies and inverting them, collapsing them, twisting them, and by exaggerating them through rendering them literal," Kōno, Ōba, Kanai, and others make obvious "the grotesqueries, absurdities, and actual dangers to women that are glossed over by abstract, intellectualized narratives of power."⁴¹

While Japanese women writers in the 1960s and 70s showed great concern with gendered subjectivity in the specific social, political and cultural circumstances of Japan, they rarely address issues of colonial/postcolonial subjectivity, or the meaning of Japanese national identity in an international hierarchy of nations. (There are exceptions

to this, as we shall see in Chapter Four, when we look at the work of Ōba Minako.) This is one of the most salient points of contrast between the Japanese and Taiwanese women writers addressed in this dissertation, and I will return to this point several times in the discussion to follow.

The Origins of Modern Taiwanese Literature

Since the 17th century Taiwan's culture has often been influenced by visitors from abroad. Taiwan has been colonized several times: first by Dutch in 1624, by Spain 1626,⁴² and by Japan from 1895 until 1945. Some people also consider the KMT rule of Taiwan, from 1949 until the repeal of martial law in 1987, to have been a form of colonization as well. As the last four hundred years of the island's history indicates, Taiwan is commonly considered to have had a ruptured history of repetitive colonization. As ambiguous as its sovereign status and as complicated as its history, the modern literature created in this island was profoundly affected by many an "external" factor. These include the effects of Japanese imperialism during its colonial rule (1895-1945); the May Fourth Cultural Movement in China in 1919; the authoritarian Nationalist (KMT) control of Taiwan in its resistance to the Communist regime across the strait after 1949; as well as Western literary ideas gradually introduced since the early 20th century. Due to a number of periods of political turbulence, Taiwanese writers have frequently been restricted to the specific themes favoured by the government in power. Reflecting Taiwan's social and political history, Taiwanese literature is a profoundly hybrid phenomenon.

When Japan took over Taiwan in 1895, the newly installed colonial government applied the French assimilationist model; i.e. Japan planned to effectively modernize Taiwan and assimilate the Taiwanese people to Japanese culture. Accordingly, the

Japanese rule embarked upon a project to rapidly modernize Taiwan's infrastructure—such as the transportation and communication networks that facilitate rapid economic growth—so it could become a replica of rapidly modernizing Japan. The initial response of the Taiwanese to Japanese colonization was armed rebellion. These uprisings were sporadic, yet fierce from time to time, but were largely contained and brutally suppressed by 1902, although relatively minor rebellions still occurred in subsequent years. In the mid-1920s, members of the intelligentsia involved in the *Taiwan wenhua xiehui* 台灣文化協會 (Taiwan Cultural Association, 1921-31) began a new form of revolt: they initiated a large-scale cultural reform movement with an explicitly political agenda. Lai He 賴和 (1894-1943), one of the key figures of the movement, advocated what he called the *Taiwan xin wenxue yundong* 新文學運動 (Taiwan New Literature movement), which can be seen as an echo of the *ba-hua wenxue yundong* 白話文學運動 (Vernacular Literature movement) that had transformed Chinese literature a few years earlier. Seeking an effective way to create an indigenous, vernacular written language and employing it in depicting Taiwan's unique and hybrid identity, the Taiwan New Literature movement became an integral part of a new phase of socio-political resistance by the Taiwanese people to Japanese colonial rule. Frequently regarded as the “father” of Taiwanese literature, Lai refused to write in Japanese although he had been educated in Japan as a physician.⁴³ Due to the lack of a written vernacular Taiwanese language, Lai and other intellectuals attempted to develop a new national language based on the native tongue. Unsurprisingly, since this effort was conceived as a linguistic strategy of resistance and as a means of asserting Taiwanese identity, such a project was quickly suppressed by the colonial government.

By the 1930s, a new generation of Taiwanese intellectuals had emerged to help the maturation of Taiwanese New Literature. Educated in the Japanese system, these people felt little allegiance to their Chinese past. Unlike their predecessors, who seemed fixated on the abuses arising from the colonial government's laws, writers of the new generation tended to present both the evil and the benign sides of colonial rule, in spite of rampant discriminatory practices against native Taiwanese.⁴⁴ Maintaining close relations with and easy access to the literary institutions in Japan, these new writers gained a closer grasp of Western artistic concepts via Japan's westernized/modernized literature. Writers such as Yang Kui, Zhang Wenhuan, and Lü Heruo, who were strongly concerned with issues of social justice advocated by the Proletarian Literature movement, were considered Taiwan's nativist writers. Writing mainly in Japanese, these authors revealed a complex attitude toward their colonizer: their works often demonstrate an anti-imperialist spirit by revealing the ways the Japanese played the role of the oppressors, but also implicitly or explicitly acknowledge Japan as the provider of cultural prestige.

In 1937 Japan was once again officially at war with China. Kobayashi Seizō, the seventeenth governor-general of Taiwan, implemented a policy of *kōminka* 皇民化, or "imperialization," which embraced a number of government-sponsored assimilationist programs and reforms to gain Taiwan's inhabitants' commitment to Japan's war effort and nationalistic aspirations. The first *kōminka* measure was to replace Chinese language with *kokugo* 国語 (the modern, standard vernacular Japanese); the use of Chinese was banned in all public media, and local inhabitants were required to adopt Japanese family names.⁴⁵ Many of the activities engaged in by Taiwan's nativist writers were banned, including the production of works with leftist themes. Many of the important writers of the 1940s such

as Zhou Jinpo, Wang Changxiong, and Chen Huoquan, grappled with the question of how they could become imperial subjects and depicted the predicament of reconciling their Taiwanese roots with the Japanese intellectual world in which they lived. They have been called "imperial-subject" writers because of their seemingly unquestioning loyalty to Japan, its emperor, and its culture. Although their works were later considered to constitute traitorous advocacy of the colonizer's interests, Faye Yuan Kleeman points out that the work of these writers can also be read as an ironic attempt to "subvert the oppressor's power by mimicking his language."⁴⁶

Molded by influences from the Japanese educational, political and cultural systems, the modern literary form called Taiwanese New Literature significantly departed from the classical Chinese tradition. Although its evolution abruptly ended at the conclusion of World War Two when Taiwan was returned to China, the legacy of the Taiwanese New Literature movement provided a vital nourishing source for the *bentuhua*, 本土化 (nativization, or localization) movement that reemerged in the 1970s.

Not until the 1970s when the *xiangtu wenxue lunzhan* 鄉土文學論戰 (Nativist literary debate) unfolded did intellectuals start to call for a specifically Taiwanese consciousness in literary creativity and for a re-evaluation of Taiwan's native culture, which had long been belittled and neglected. Until the late 1980s, Taiwanese literature was still called "*xiangtu*" 鄉土 (regional) literature, or "*bentu*" 本土 (nativist) literature—a subset of "mainstream" Chinese literature, in other words. It was only towards the end of the 1980s that it gained its proper name as *Taiwanese* literature. More important than the name was the recognition that Taiwanese literature differed substantially from "mainstream" Chinese literature, the recognition that it truly was a distinct national/cultural form. After

that recognition, the issue of the definition of Taiwanese literature has been a major concern for many writers and scholars. From a historical point of view, Taiwanese literature has a distinct identity with its own historical origins and unique tradition. To study Taiwanese literature simply as a sub-category of Mainland Chinese literature would therefore overlook many of the issues that lie at the heart of Taiwanese writers' engagement with their historical/cultural moment, and the resulting hybridity and heterogeneity that characterizes Taiwanese literature.

Ye Shitao, a veteran writer and literary critic from the Japanese colonial period, was the first to establish an historiography of Taiwanese literature, in 1987. He did this by reexamining Taiwanese works since the 1920s, especially those that had been suppressed either by Japan's colonial rule or by the Nationalist government. The year that his historical outline of Taiwanese literature was published, under the title of *Taiwan wenxue shigang* (Chronicle of Taiwan Literature), martial law was finally lifted. Ye pointed out that: "Taiwan has been invaded and ruled by foreign powers at various periods of time; accordingly, the history of Taiwanese literature is a genuine account of people's resistance against colonial rule, as well as their seeking for freedom, democracy, and 'political,' 'economical,' and 'social' equality."⁴⁷ Following this, Peng Reijin published *Taiwan xinwenxue yundong sishinian* (Forty Years of Taiwan's New Literature Movement) in 1991. With more detailed historical evidence, Peng attempted to establish a paradigm premised on the basic substance of Taiwanese literature, which arguably can be employed to link up Taiwanese literature's past with its future.

According to Ye and Peng, modern Taiwanese literature was born in the 1920s amid the aforementioned Taiwanese New Literature movement, an aggregate of literary

conventions, critical discourses, and aesthetic assumptions that was stimulated and influenced by both the May Fourth Movement in China and the proletarian literary movement in Japan.⁴⁸ Their historical account of Taiwanese literature, emphasizing the continuity of a tradition of anti-colonialism and anti-feudalism, is intended to (re)construct the “subjectivity” of Taiwanese literature, which had long been suppressed in the master narrative of the ruling power. Peng asserted that any work that is rooted in this island and sincerely reflects “the history and reality of the lives of the people living on the island of Taiwan” was eligible to be called Taiwan literature, regardless of the place of birth of its author.⁴⁹ Nonetheless, most works by non-Taiwanese writers or women writers have tended to be either marginalized within or entirely excluded from the definition of modern Taiwanese literature due to their failure to “identify with the land/Taiwan,” or their failure to depict anti-colonial resistance. I agree in general with Peng’s definition of Taiwanese literature; however, as Taiwanese literature has been continuously created by members of the various ethnic groups that comprise Taiwan’s society, the definition of Taiwanese literature should be broadened to recognize and acclaim its tradition of heterogeneity, as articulated by its multi-ethnic groups and communities and writers of all genders.

In the following sections, I will look into the vigorous literary development in Taiwan in the post-World War Two years—i.e. the nostalgic Anti-Communist literature of the 1950s, the modernist literary movement of the 1960s, the revival of nativist literature in the 1970s, and the pluralism in the 1980s and beyond—in order to examine how modern Taiwanese literature has evolved and how Taiwanese subjectivity has been constructed and expressed in the writing of different periods of time.

Nostalgic Anti-Communist Literature

Taiwan was retroceded to China on October 25, 1945; the "China" recognized by the Allied nations at that time was the government of Generalissimo Chiang Kaishek's Nationalist Party (KMT). Upon the retreat of the Nationalist government to the island in 1949, Taiwan became the only territory/province of effective jurisdiction of the Republic of China (ROC). In order to purge any lingering remains of Japanese colonial influence, a policy of Chinese nationalism was re-imposed on the island and its people. From then on, the standardized curriculum had stressed Chinese culture at the expense of native Taiwanese culture. In eradicating the remnants of Japanese nationalism in Taiwan, the KMT government officially banned the use of the Japanese language in 1946, and implemented the *Guoyu* (North China Mandarin) language movement. Educated in Japanese, native Taiwanese writers were not only hampered by the language barrier but silenced out of fear of political persecution, particularly after the February 28 incident of 1947.⁵⁰ Under these circumstances, the literary scene of the 1950s was dominated by mainlander writers who had retreated with the KMT government to Taiwan in 1949.⁵¹ Upon its defeat on the mainland, the KMT cast its conflict with communism in nationalist terms, claiming that the island was a vital base in their attempt to recover the mainland and resurrect the government of the Republic of China.

Most mainlander writers were mobilized in the state-sponsored cultural programs that explicitly or implicitly worked towards the state's anti-Communist agenda. Memories of their place of origin, the agonies of losing families, and the torment of personal trauma caused by the communist rebels are the major themes of this period's nostalgic anti-Communism literature. Representative works include Jiang Gui's novel *Xuanfeng*

(*The Whirlwind*, 1957; tr. 1977) and Chen Jiying's *D-cunzhuan* (*Fool in the Reeds*, 1955; tr. 1959). On the other hand, in promoting traditional culture as a means of asserting its own legitimacy of acting as the Chinese only legitimate government, works by Zhu Ziqing and Xu Zhimo were selected for high school textbooks to support and circulate the ideology of the state through education.⁵² Both Zhu Ziqing and Xu Zhimo were well-known poets and essayists after the May Fourth Movement; in particular Xu was one of the first Chinese writers to have successfully naturalized Western romantic forms into modern Chinese poetry. Their works were intentionally selected by the government to emphasize the lyrical trend of Chinese New Literature from the pre-1949 era, not for the purpose of anti-communism but establishing a sentimental link with Chinese culture more broadly. In response to the state's cultural policy, some mainlander writers, such as Zhang Xiuya, Yu Guangzhong and Qi Jun, attempted in their works to retain archaic expressions and allusions to classical literature, meanwhile avoiding sensitive political issues.

To the eye of Taiwanese literary historians, the literature of the 1950s was bleak and barren as native Taiwanese writers were silenced whereas the works of mainlander writers were totally incorporated under the state's ideology.⁵³ Nonetheless, Gong Pengcheng, among others, stands opposed to the exclusivism arising from the Taiwan-centered viewpoint of Taiwanese literary historians and vehemently criticizes them for overlooking the literary activities and contributions made by non-Taiwanese writers (that is, writers who came to Taiwan from the mainland) to the overall Taiwanese literary scene.⁵⁴ Indeed, a narrative that emphasizes the resistance of the colonized is necessary in reconstructing Taiwanese identity; however, once the consciousness of Taiwan-as-distinct-nation/culture has been reconstructed, studies of Taiwanese literature

should be able to embrace the voices from all of the island's various ethnic groups and communities, including the newly arrived mainlanders. Continually modifying his definition of Taiwanese literature in accordance with the changing socio-political situation, Ye points out in a recent article that "multi-ethnic" should be regarded as one of the most distinctive characteristics of modern Taiwanese literature.⁵⁵ If we think about the history of modern Taiwanese literature from a perspective other than Taiwanese chauvinism, the literary environment of the 1950s has a completely different appearance. For example, this was a time of relative productivity and energy on the part of women writers, particularly as compared to the previous decades under Japan's colonial rule. Influenced by the May Fourth Movement, a number of relatively well-educated female mainlanders provided a significant new stimulus to the literary scene that had previously been dominated by male writers.⁵⁶

Although the majority of literary works in the 1950s were either inspired by nostalgia for lost hometowns or were set in mainland China, some women writers shifted their thematic focus from the socio-historical domains to the private. While male writers conjured up pictures of the homeland to soothe their homesickness, female writers depicted their determination to settle down in Taiwan and their identification with the island.⁵⁷ While the former strove to sustain the orthodox concepts of family and nation, the latter developed a "shifted" identity with Taiwan's territory, and pondered family and gender roles from various other points of view. Feeling the pull and the rupture between the old and new symbolic orders, women writers had the openness to explore and reformulate their identity. They tackled issues such as the repressive nature of traditional Chinese family and marriage systems, and women's rights to education and jobs.

Mainlander women writers, such as Lin Haiyin, Xie Bingying and Zhang Shuhan, wrote positively of the intermarriage between Taiwanese and mainlanders, suggesting that thereby the ethnic confrontations between the two groups could gradually, if not immediately, die out.

Despite their productivity during this period, these women writers have been mostly left out of the canon of Taiwanese literature. It is argued that their writing is “light weight” and lacks the moral of *ganshi youguo* 感時憂國 (anxiety over the times and national situation), a standard criterion used in the construction of the Taiwanese literary canon. From this “canonical” point of view, the issues women writers are dealing with are deemed too “private” and domestic, lacking serious commitment to the betterment of society.⁵⁸ However, through writing about the physical and private areas of life, women writers did succeed in revealing how their identities were entangled with the politics and history of the time, and started to challenge the cultural hegemony.

The general climate of the 1950s was not considered conducive to the production of serious art, and most of the writing produced in this period was irrevocably embedded in the conservative, dominant culture. On balance, however, if we avoid examining these works from a point of view that privileges male writers and native Taiwanese nationalism, we discover that the multiplicities and complexities of the literature of this time reflect the contemporary cultural and political environment in significant ways.

Modernist Literary Movement

Taiwan in the 1960s saw its economy booming and domestic politics less fraught, although the government overall still retained authoritarian control of society, and people

were not without fear of persecution. In general, both writers and readers had lost interest in the theme of nostalgic anti-communism. The increasingly dynamic interactions with Western countries, endorsed by the government, had profound effects on all aspects of Taiwan's society, motivating a surge in Westernization discourses. Writers started to explore and enjoy the so-called "Modernist literary movement," which has been characterized by C.T. Hsia as a "literary renaissance."⁵⁹ The Modernist literary movement may be seen as another major effort of Taiwanese intellectuals to emulate Western high culture since the May Fourth Movement.⁶⁰ When they adopted literary concepts developed in Western capitalist societies, the Modernists naturally absorbed and accepted bourgeois social values.⁶¹ Individualism, liberalism and rationalism were "horizontally transplanted" from the West as remedies for the rather oppressive social relations in most Asian societies, including China and Taiwan.

The publication of the literary magazine *Xiandai wenxue* 現代文學 (Modern literature), founded in 1960 by a group of young writers who were at the time still undergraduate students in the Department of Foreign Languages and Literatures at National Taiwan University, marked the beginning of the Modernist literary trend. In its inaugural issue, Bai Xianyou, one of the founders, expressed the editors' literary dilemma and grave concerns for the future of "Chinese literature."⁶² Regarding nostalgic anti-Communist literature as psychologically debilitating, they desired to create new artistic forms and styles to conduct what they called "constructive destruction."⁶³ In addition to creative works produced by Chinese writers, their magazine also introduced the movements, trends, criticism and thought of the contemporary Western arts. Specifically, they translated representative works of Western writers such as Franz Kafka,

James Joyce, Virginia Woolf, and William Faulkner. This bimonthly magazine published fifty-two issues, discovering and training writers such as Wang Wenxing, Chen Yingzhen, Wang Zhenhe, Huang Chunming, Chen Ruoxi, Ouyang Zi, Shi Shuqing, and Li Ang, who went on to make critical contributions to the development of modern Taiwan literature.

Stressing the principle of artistic autonomy, Modernist writers experimented with allegory, stream of consciousness, and allusion, in order to explore themes like the emergence of individualism and the breakdown of relational forms of subjectivity. Bai Xianyoung's *Niezi* (Crystal Boys, 1983; tr. 1990) and Wang Wenxing's *Jiabian* (Family Catastrophe, 1973; tr. 1995), both sharing the theme of father-son conflict, represent two of the most significant Modernist works of the time. They both provided a radical cultural examination and thus called into question the very foundations of contemporary Taiwan society. Both works vigorously protested traditional ethical norms, characterized by the Confucianist concepts of *zhong* (loyalty) and *xiao* (filial piety). In her *Modernism and the Nativist Resistance: Contemporary Chinese Fiction from Taiwan*, a critical examination of Taiwan's Modernist literary movement, Sung-sheng Yvonne Chang points out that the constant searching for paternal surrogates in *Crystal Boys* and *Family Catastrophe* "betrays their authors' anxiety over the general corruption of the terms governing human relationships in contemporary Taiwan society, terms that in history were solidly built on the patriarchal order."⁶⁴

Absorbed with Western existentialism and psychoanalysis, female Modernist writers like Chen Ruoxi, Ouyang Zi, Shi Shuqing and Li Ang often used symbolism to create fictional worlds of fantasy and absurdity. Alternating the polarities of imprisonment/escape, illness/strength, and destruction/completeness, Shi Shuqing's

"Nixiangmen de jidian" (The Ritual of the Clay Idol, 1969; tr. 1975) explores the fantastic structure of the human imagination. With realistic portraits of juvenile psychology, Li Ang's "Huaji" (Flower Season, 1968; tr. 1990) demonstrates an excellent example of "the technique of constructing the story's symbolic structure through an extraneously derived referential framework."⁶⁵ In her story "Huaping" (Vase, 1961), Ouyang Zi also employs psychology to depict the self-entrapment of men and women, and the alienation caused by the objective truth of reality. At the time, most of the female Modernist writers zealously imitated and internalized the orthodox values and standards of the intellectual community—values and standards often defined from a male perspective. According to Elaine Showalter's three phases of historical development of women's literature, the writing of the female Modernists at this point in time can be seen as "feminine literature."⁶⁶ In other words, although the Modernist women writers still had not dealt with women's issues from a feminist perspective, their writing often displayed a deep awareness of the constraints imposed upon women in modern society, and a desire for an idealized neutrality toward gender issues.

During this time period, when the authority of the government was still very much heightened by the maintenance of martial law, Modernist writers were either unable to discern or unwilling to take on the socio-political conditions that caused the general cultural climate to be stagnant and stifling. Although their motif of alienation and isolation is often accused by nativist or conservative critics of being immorally disengaged from the current socio-political crisis, Modernist writers did manage to develop beyond the perimeter of state policy and establish a set of writing paradigms opposing state control and resisting compromise with the status quo of cultural recession.

The Nativist Literary Debate

Although the Modernist literary movement attracted many followers and became the mainstream of the literary scene in the 1960s, it had been largely incorporated into the dominant culture by the late 1970s and thus infuriated groups of native critics who denounced the work of westernized Modernists and instead advocated a nativist, socially responsible literature. Growing out of opposition to the ideology-bound anti-communist literature of the 1950s and the dominant Modernist trend of the 1960s, the counter-hegemonic Nativist activity reached its peak when the fierce Nativist literary debate (*Xiangtu wenxue lunzhan* 鄉土文學論戰) unfolded in 1977 and 1978. As the first truly oppositional formation since 1949, the Nativist movement arose from the accumulated frustrations of Taiwan's native intellectuals who were brought up after the war. Their frustrations were further exacerbated by adverse developments in Taiwan's socio-political milieu; there was a deterioration of many aspects of life beginning in the early 1970s. On the international scene, for instance, in 1971 Taiwan saw its expulsion from the United Nations and Richard Nixon's state visit to the People's Republic of China (PRC), the archenemy of the ROC government on Taiwan. Also, Taiwan saw its diplomatic relations with Japan severed in 1972 and, worse yet, with the United States in late 1978. This cluster of political setbacks not only resulted in Taiwan's international isolation but also gave rise to a turbulent crisis of national identity, particularly among its intellectuals.⁶⁷ Such domestic turbulence provided the native intellectuals an opportunity to vent the discontent that they had been storing up for years: e.g., their resentment about the unbalanced power distribution between mainlanders and native Taiwanese, and in particular the government's persecutions of dissidents; concerns about the socio-economic

problems created by industrialization; and anxiety over the country's future after the other China (PRC) had won its political legitimacy from most of the major powers of the world, including former staunch allies of Taiwan, Japan and the U.S.

Although the Nativists ostensibly waged their battle in the realm of literature, their ultimate goal was to challenge the existing unjustifiable socio-political order. Their proclaimed goals were threefold: to undo the political myth of the Nationalist government, to denounce bourgeois-capitalist social values, and to battle Western cultural imperialism. They intentionally launched bitter attacks on the government's economic dependence on Western countries, especially on the United States. They attempted to draw people's attention to the adverse effects of capitalism upon the farmers, fishermen, and workers who often were exploited in the process of urban expansion. Viewed as a product of the capitalist West, the Modernist literary movement became an easy scapegoat and was literally accused by the Nativist critics of collaborating with foreign cultural imperialism.⁶⁸ It is arguable that the political agenda of Nativist literary criticism is fraught with oversimplifications and dogmatism. However, it undeniably had great impact by calling attention to sensitive issues, such as the intractable "provincial identity" (*shengji* 省籍) complex,⁶⁹ and the constant conflict between indigenous and foreign cultural forms.

The origins of the Nativist literary movement and its debates can be traced back to the 1930s when "*xiangtu wenxue*" (regional or nativist literature) and "*Taiwan huawen*" (Taiwanese vernacular) were advocated under the influences of the Proletarian literature movement in Japan and the vernacular literature movement in China, as I have indicated above. It is widely agreed that Nativist literature began as early as "Yigan chengzi" (The

Scale, 1926) written by Lai He. Nearly half a century later, in the 1970s, the intervening political and cultural disruptions (especially Japan's implementation of *kōminka* and later the KMT government's resurrection of Sinology) ensured that anti-imperialism and Taiwanese consciousness still constituted the core spirit of Nativist literature. The Nativist literature of the 1970s uses the "rustic" Taiwanese dialect mixed with Mandarin to narrate realistic stories of socially underprivileged groups, such as farmers and workers. The principles of Nativist literature assert that the time and place described in a literary work should be closely associated with the island of Taiwan and its people. Chief among the Nativist writers are Huang Chunming, Wang Zhenhe, Chen Yingzhen, Zhong Lihe, Ye Shitao, Zhong Zhaozheng, and Li Qiao.

Huang Chunming's "Erzi de dawanou" (His Son's Big Doll, 1967) depicts the thoughts and feelings of the lower class, revealing the interiority of characters that appear to be opaque and inaccessible to mainstream society. In a profane but comical tone, Wang Zhen-he depicts the tensions between urban and rural, native Taiwanese and mainlanders, and the prostitution of women in both the war effort and the development of the global capitalist economy in his prominent works like "Jiazhuang yi niuche" (An Oxcart for Dowry, 1967), or *Meigui, Meigui, woaini* (Rose, Rose, I love you, 1984).

The Nativist literary movement was not the only major event in the literary scene of the mid-1970s and the early the 1980s. Of equal moment is the notable increase of young women writers. From this boom in women's literature came writers like Xiao Sa, Liao Huiying, Li Ang, Xiao Lihong, Jiang Xiaoyun, Zhu Tianwen, Zhu Tianxin, Su Weizhen, and Yuan Qiongqiong, whose names frequently appeared in the literary supplements of major newspapers and best-seller lists in Taiwan. Some women writers of this period

claimed profound influence from mainland (non-Taiwanese) writer Zhang Ailing (Eileen Zhang); they focused on topics of domestic relationships between men and women in a lyrical, sentimentalized writing style.⁷⁰ Despite the wide variety of their writing, all the literary works by women at this time were categorized as “*quixiu wenxue*” 閨秀文學 (feminine literature), and failed to receive positive critical notice. Lü Zhenghui, a defender of realist literature, has suggested that the phenomenon of “feminine literature” was sustained by the Nationalist government, which used its control of the media to restrain the frenzy of Nativist literature.⁷¹ Yang Zhao also argues that the writers revolving around the *Sansan shufan* 三三書坊 (Double-three Bookstore)⁷², with Zhu Tianwen as one of its leading and founding members, were essentially pro-government because of their sentimentally conceived cultural sinocentrism.⁷³

Nonetheless, as Louis Montrose points out, instead of being static, singular and homogeneous, the notion of ideology is “heterogeneous, unstable, permeable and processual.”⁷⁴ Ideological concepts expressed in a single writer’s literary works or in a certain literary trend should be seen as endless interrelations “between movements and tendencies both within and beyond a specific and effective dominance.”⁷⁵ Although some of the so-called “feminine literature” does favor the nationalist ideology of Chinese national imagination, their writing also contains subversive significance vis-à-vis the nationalist ideological project of nation-building. A case in point is Xiao Lihong’s *Guihuaxiang* (Cassia Lane, 1977), a work notable as a literary site for the intersection between Nativist literature and women’s writing.⁷⁶ Written in a dialectal style, *Cassia Lane* tells the story of a young woman from a fishing village who struggles with the patriarchal tradition that suppressed and controlled female sexual desires. Although

Cassia Lane echoes Eileen Zhang's *Yuannü* (lamenting women) style, the story in itself plays an implicit role in the struggle over the construction of a national imagination. In his comments on another of Xiao Lihong's novels, *Qianjiang you shui qianjiang yue* (*A Thousand Moons on a Thousand Rivers*, 1981; tr. 2000), Yang Zhao points out that Xiao employed the literary languages of both the Nativist School and the Double Three School of writers, yet promoted neither critical ideology. Ultimately, however, she was co-opted by Nativism.⁷⁷

Unlike *A Thousand Moons on a Thousand Rivers*, which stresses the nostalgic aspect of Nativist realism but remains vague on the critical components of Nativism, *Cassia Lane* questions the male-centered viewpoint of "native place imagination" from a hitherto neglected gender perspective. In Nativist literature, while male writers evoke Taiwan as *the* homeland in order to reflect on nostalgia and romanticism, or to chastise the exploitation of industry and commerce, women writers like Xiao Lihong and Chen Ye are more concerned about their gendered situation in society. The "native place" or "original homeland" in women's writing is not a pristine site that offers salvation, but a fetter shackling women in the name of "tradition." As Qiu Quifen points out, those male-sanctioned positive aspects of Nativist literature do not necessarily constitute the experience of women, as exploitation, control and suppression already existed in the so-called native traditional, homeland, long before "outside" influences arrived.⁷⁸

Generally speaking, the Nativist work produced in the 1970s is not always evaluated positively because its excessive concern over ideology is regarded as an impediment to literary achievement. However, just as Modernist literature continued to flourish despite the rise of the Nativist literature movement, neither did Nativist literature cease to

advance, even after the Nativist literary debate came to an abrupt end in 1979 when several prominent Nativist members exited the literary scene and involved themselves directly in the rising political protests. On balance, the Nativist literature of the 1970s paves the way for the rise a decade later of a more popular "serious" literature that displays a sharp increase in social awareness and formal consciousness. Indeed, in the 1980s Taiwanese literature ushered in a new era of pluralism, to which now we turn.

Pluralism of the 1980s and beyond

By the mid-1980s Taiwan had achieved remarkable success in the process of modernization, and had transformed itself into a prosperous, fast-growing economy—one of the so-called "Four Asian Dragons." In 1987 with the lifting of martial law and the formation of an opposition party, the Democratic Progressive Party (DPP), a new, more democratic era began in Taiwan. As freedom of speech was now possible and different ideologies were allowed to compete in society, the 1980s saw the genuine liberation of people's minds as well as their words for the first time in Taiwan's history. Writers became bolder in taking up taboo subjects that had been anathema, such as sexual subjects, debates on Taiwan's future and its fundamental political structure, and personal recollections of the unpleasant past, most of which had to do with the February 28 incident of 1947. It was as if a wide variety of literary flowers were poised to come into full bloom after long enduring a frosty winter.

The literary scene since the 1980s has been largely dominated by the so-called baby-boom generation who refuse to see political contention as the function of literature. Inextricably involved in the country's booming mass media, the younger writers are more

concerned with popularity, and with various issues that affect Taiwan's middle-class urbanites. Some writers, such as Haung Fan, Li Ang, and Chen Yingzhen, offer critiques on multinational capitalism and power distribution on the Island. Others, such as Xiao Sa, Liao Huiying, and Yuan Qiongqiong, investigate new social factors that have changed the ordinary people's ways of life, focusing mostly on heterosexual and extramarital relationships. Compared with their predecessors, the young generation, whether progressively or conservatively inclined, faithfully reflect more varied attitudes and divergent values in their writing in the face of the new political situation.

In an increasingly globalized milieu, the transnational nature of cultural forms has blurred the border-line that used to demarcate the foreign from the indigenous. The literature of the 1980s is characterized by pluralism as writers' approaches are much more diverse. While assimilating the Modernists' technical sophistication as well as demonstrating their social awareness thanks to the Nativist influence, the young generation of writers contributes significant heterogeneity to the literary scene at this time. This new generation of literature is an orchestration of a multitude of discordant "voices," as suggested in the title of a collection of essays by Wang Derwei, a distinguished critic who has written extensively on Chinese fiction, *Zhongsheng xuanhua* (Polyphonic clamor, 1988).⁷⁹ In the current literary scene there are several prominent literary genres: *juancun* 眷村 (military compound) literature,⁸⁰ works that depict lives of the second-generation mainlanders raised in military housing compounds; *zhengzhi xiaoshuo* 政治小說 (political fiction) with a special subgenre for the February 28 incident; neo-nativist literature; resistance literature; feminist works; science fiction, etc.

Thanks to society's newly-acquired openness and freedom, the influence of the

international feminist movement was also able to exert a greater impact on progressive intellectuals. The women's movement of Taiwan, emerging in the early 1970s, was promoted by the current ROC Vice President Xiulian Annette Lü.⁸¹ On Lü's heels, Li Yuanzhen, a college professor, started a magazine called *Fünü xinzhi* (Awakening Women) in 1982, seeking to shore up the self-consciousness of women and striving to strengthen women's legal rights. Later, the first private women's organization, the Awakening Foundation, was founded in 1987. Studies of feminist literature began to appear in magazines and journals as of 1986.⁸² Notably, the Eugenics Protection Law was passed in 1984 to make legal abortion available for women if a pregnancy might damage her mental health or might do her family harm. This piece of legislation marked a milestone in substantially advancing women's reproductive choices and their legal rights.

However, women writers of the younger generation respond to these waves of feminist thought in a variety of ways. On the one hand, there are explicit feminist reflections such as Li Ang's *Shafu* (The Butcher's Wife, 1984; tr. 1986) and "Anye" (Dark Night, 1985), Xiao Sa's "Zouguo congqian" (Out of the Past), and Liao Huiying's *Mangdain* (Blind Spot, 1986). Their works candidly uncover the exploitative nature of traditional marriage and depict stories of courageous women who strive to assert their subjectivity. On the other hand, there are ultraconservative women writers such as Xiao Lihong, Yuan Qiongqiong, and Jiang Xiaoyun, who focus mostly on heterosexual relationships and praise the "traditional virtues of female self-sacrifice and self-denial in protest against the expanding utilitarianism of Taiwan's urban society."⁸³ Despite their different reactions to feminist thinking, women writers of this younger generation have made more valuable contributions than did their predecessors to an enhanced

understanding of Taiwan's gender ideology and women's changing status. The gender ideology addressed in their works shares a number of common motifs such as late marriage, divorce, extramarital relationships, prostitution and juvenile delinquency; these literary concerns have demonstrated them to be important writers of contemporary Taiwan who have made efforts to reflect and rectify the patriarchal definition of women.

The conceptual notions of postmodernism introduced into Taiwan in the mid-1980s mingled with post-martial-law politics, fostering the dynamics of pluralism at the time. All kinds of different views were circulated and all artistic approaches were competing in novelty and attraction. The great flowering of women's writing began in the 1970s, and over the last two decades women's writing has occupied a significant place in the literary scene. From the 1980s, almost all the literary awards went to young women writers. (This is similar to the situation experienced by female writers in Japan in the 1960s and thereafter.) Despite inimical attacks from those male critics who have long held a traditional deprecatory attitude toward women's literature, of whom Lü Zhenghui is a prime example, women writers have already become leading players in almost every aspect of this literary renaissance.

As the critic Peng Xiaoyan points out, the writing of history and fiction that addresses political issues used to be a terrain exclusive to male writers.⁸⁴ The repeal of martial law changed all that, and thereafter Taiwanese literature underwent a transformation. In response to this epoch-making event, women writers such as Li Ang, Ping Lu, and Zhu Tianxin tackled issues of national narrative, ideology, collective memory, and the problems of ethnicity in their recent fiction. Unlike male writers who usually approach political fiction with a direct interrogation of the national narrative,

women writers' works are more concerned with issues of gender identity and national identity, displaying the many layers of paradoxes underlying women's identity.⁸⁵ Li Ang's *Labyrinthine Garden* and Zhu Tianxin's *Gudu* (The Ancient Capital, 1997) can be regarded as two of the most representative of such works, reflecting the profound transformation that is currently taking place in women's literature. The former depicts the entanglement of women's growth and development with Taiwan's reconstructed colonial history; the latter employs a female sensibility of memory as the departure point to surmount the ideological struggle over Taiwan's national identity. In the third and fourth chapters, I will investigate these two works, in comparison with each one's selected Japanese counterpart, to critically examine how national identity and gender identity are addressed in contemporary Taiwanese women's writing.

Conclusion

Above I have briefly delineated the contours of Japanese and Taiwanese modern literatures, in particular the socio-political and historical milieu that those literatures both grew out of and helped to create.

Japanese writers started to enjoy true freedom of expression as early as 1952 when the U.S. occupation ended. In contrast, it was not until martial law was lifted in 1987 that Taiwanese writers could wield their pens truly without fear. After Japan saw the blooming of women's writing in the 1960s and 1970s, Taiwan also witnessed a boom in women's writing, albeit a decade later. Another similarity between the two countries has been the fact that women's writing in both nations has been categorized separately from men's—termed “women's literature” in Japan and “feminine literature” in

Taiwan—despite the wide diversity in genres, themes, or styles in the work of female authors. Such a rigid, exclusionary category conveys a sense of “the principal conceptual antinomies” of literary criticism: men’s pure, serious writing versus women’s domestic, popular writing.⁸⁶

Critics such as Lü Zhenghui and Murō Saisei have tended to read women’s writing through an essentialist lens that eventually segregates and subordinates women’s literary creativity.⁸⁷ Scholars equipped with more up-to-date theories of cultural/literary studies, however, attempt to redeem women’s writing from the negative pole. The collection of essays edited by Paul Gordon Schalow and Janet A. Walker, *The Woman’s Hand: Gender and Theory in Japanese Women’s Writing* (1996) was the first fruit of a newly emerging trend within the Japanese literary studies that applies feminist and gender criticism to Japanese texts. Similarly, essays collected in *Xingbei lunshu yu Taiwan xiaoshuo* (Gender Discourse and Taiwan Fiction, 2000) also appropriate gender theory to reassess women’s writing produced in postwar Taiwan. In addition to feminist theory, Qiu Guifeng (Chiu Kei-fen)’s *Houzhimin ji qiwai* (Rethinking Postcolonial Literary Criticism in Taiwan, 2003) skillfully uses colonial/postcolonial critical theory in its investigation of the heterogeneity and complexity in women’s writing. Nonetheless, research on Japanese women’s literature has rarely been conducted from a colonial/postcolonial theoretical perspective. Moreover, so far in the field of Asian literary studies there has been no systematic research comparing Japanese and Taiwanese women’s literary production. In both countries, the centrality of identity politics clearly demonstrates the great extent to which cultural production is deeply implicated in the socio-political structure and cultural milieu. As such, this dissertation aims to highlight identity politics in terms of gender,

race and nation in systematically tracing the similarities and differences in the literary production and history of women's writing from Japan and Taiwan.

For the comparative purpose of this project, I analyze women's writing between the late 1950s and 1970s in Japan and that produced in the 1980s and 1990s in Taiwan. These time periods, though separated by 20 or more years, represent similar cultural/political moments in each country's history. The fiction produced by women in these periods abundantly demonstrates the interwoven intricacy and complexities of gender, race, and nation.

Notes

¹ Sharalyn Orbaugh, "Gender, Family, and Sexualities in Modern Literature," in *The Columbia Companion to Modern East Asian Literature*, ed. Joshua Mostow (New York: Columbia University Press, 2003), p. 43.

² The household registry system was basically a reconstructed version of the mutual household surveillance system called *hokō* 保甲 that was originally invented in the North Song Dynasty (960-1127) of China. It was also implemented in Taiwan when Japan colonized it. Serving as an auxiliary arm of the civil police force, enabling surveillance, the household registry system intensified and increased the existing patriarchy in the Taiwanese society. For more information on the registry system in Taiwan, please see Harry J. Lamley, "Taiwan under Japanese Rule, 1895-1945: The Vicissitudes of Colonialism," in *Taiwan: A New History*, ed. by Murray Rubinstein (New York: Sharpe, 1999), pp. 201-60.

³ Partha Chatterjee, "The Nationalist Resolution of the Women's Question," in *Recasting Woman: Essays in Colonist History*, cited in Meyda Yegenoglu, *Colonial Fantasies: Towards a Feminist Reading of Orientalism*. (London and New York: Cambridge UP, 1998), p. 125.

⁴ In 1890, the cabinet enacted the *Shūkai oyobi kessha hō* (Law on Associations and Meetings) that banned women from attending political meetings or joining political

- organizations. In 1900, the Home Ministry redrafted the ban as the *Chian keisatsu hō* (Security Police Law). See Sharon Nolte and Sally Ann Hastings, "The Meiji State's Policy Toward Women, 1890-1910," in *Recreating Japanese Women, 1600-1945*, ed. Gail Lee Bernstein (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1991), pp. 154-5.
- ⁵ The trilogy are "Maihime" 舞姫 (1890; tr. 1975, *The Dancing Girl*), "Utakata no ki" うたかたの記 (1890, *Foam on the Waves*) and "Fumizukai" 文づかい (1891, *The Courier*).
- ⁶ Natsume Sōseki 夏目漱石, "Watashi to kojinchugi" 私の個人主義, in *Sōseki bunmei ronshū* 漱石文明論集 (Tokyo: Iwanami, 1986), pp.97-136.
- ⁷ General Nogi Maresuke committed *junshi* (a retainer following one's samurai lord in death) on the night of the funeral of the Meiji emperor, September 12, 1912. Nogi's dramatic ritual suicide—an act that at the time had been outlawed for 150 years—symbolized a revival of a traditional sign of loyalty. Accompanied by his wife's suicide, Nogi's anachronistic suicide was thrilling to the entire Japanese society and called into question the notions of traditional values and national identity during the Meiji period. See Orbaugh "General Nogi's Wife: Representations of Women in Narratives of Japanese Modernization," in *In Pursuit of Contemporary East Asian Culture*, eds. Xiaobing Tang, and Stephen Snyder (Boulder, Colo.: Westview Press, 1996), pp. 7-31
- ⁸ *Ibid.*, p. 15.
- ⁹ Eve Kosofsky Sedgwick, *Between Men: English Literature and Male Homosocial Desire* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1985).
- ¹⁰ See Shūichi Katō's *A History of Japanese Literature, vol. 1* (Tokyo: Kōdansha International, 1983), pp. 170-88, and Ivan Morris' *The World of the Shining Prince* (New York: Penguin, 1994), p. 211.
- ¹¹ Schalow and Walker, Introduction to *The Woman's Hand: Gender and Theory in Japanese Women's Writing*, eds. Paul Schalow and Janet Walker (Stanford, California: Stanford University Press, 1996), pp. 1-16.
- ¹² Joan E. Ericson, "The Origins of the Concept of "Women's Literature," in *The Woman's Hand: Gender and Theory in Japanese Women's Writing*, pp. 74-115.
- ¹³ Victoria V. Vernon, Introduction to *Daughters of the Moon: Wish, Will, and Social Constraint in Fiction by Modern Japanese Women*, Japan Research Monograph 9 (Berkeley: University of California, Institute of East Asian Studies, 1988), pp. 1-16.
- ¹⁴ Iokibe Makoto, "Japan Meets the United States for the Second Time," in *Shōwa: The Japan of Hirohito*, ed. by Carol Gluck and Stephen R. Graubard (New York: W.W. Norton 1992), pp. 91-106.
- ¹⁵ Leftist writers such as Kurahara Korehito who refused to convert were thrown into prison. See Donald Keene, *Dawn to the: Japanese Literature of the Modern Era* (New

- York: Holt, Rinehart, and Winston 1984), p. 971.
- ¹⁶ Keene, *Dawn to the West: Japanese Literature of the Modern Era*, p. 963.
- ¹⁷ See Sharalyn Orbaugh's "Occupation-Period Fiction," in *The Columbia Companion to Modern East Asian Literature*, pp. 184-9.
- ¹⁸ Orbaugh, "Gender, Family and Sexualities in Modern Literature," in *The Columbia Companion to Modern East Asian Literature*, pp. 41-51.
- ¹⁹ Van C. Gessel, *The Sting of Life: Four Contemporary Japanese Novelists*. (New York: Columbia University Press 1989), p. 5.
- ²⁰ Ibid. p. 6.
- ²¹ Orbaugh, "Occupation-Period Fiction," p. 185.
- ²² Janice Brown, "Hayashi Fumiko: Voice from the Margin," *Japan Quarterly* (Tokyo) 43, no.1 (Jan-Mar 1996): p. 97.
- ²³ Irmela Hijiya-Kirschner, "Post-World War II Literature: the Intellectual Climate in Japan, 1945-1985," in *Legacies and Ambiguities: Postwar Fiction and Culture in West Germany and Japan*, eds. Ernestine Schlant and J. Thomas Rimer (Washington, D.C.: Woodrow Wilson Center Press, 1991), p. 102.
- ²⁴ Orbaugh, "The Problem of the Modern Subject," in *The Columbia Companion to Modern East Asian Literature*, pp. 24-35.
- ²⁵ Keene, *Dawn to the West*, p. 786.
- ²⁶ Rey Chow, "Violence in the Other Country: China as Crisis, Spectacle, and Woman," in *Third World Women and the Politics of Feminism*, eds. Chandra Mohanty, Ann Russo, and Lourdes Torres (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1991), p. 84.
- ²⁷ Roy Starrs, *Soundings in Time: The Fictive Art of Kawabata Yasunari* (Surry, B.C.: Japan Library, 1998), p. 192.
- ²⁸ Keene, *Dawn to the West*, p. 792.
- ²⁹ Henry James uses the term *ficelle* to denote a secondary character whose presence in the story is created for the needs of the form. See his preface to *The Portrait of a Lady*, A Penn State Electronic Classics Series Publication, <http://www.hn.psu.edu/faculty/jmanis/hjames/portrait-lady.pdf>.
- ³⁰ David Pollack, *Reading against Culture: Ideology and Narrative in the Japanese Novel* (Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press, 1992), p. 121.
- ³¹ Susan J. Napier. "Ōe Kenzaburō and the Search for the Sublime at the End of the Twentieth Century," in *Ōe and Beyond: Fiction in Contemporary Japan*, eds. Stephen Snyder and Philip Gabriel (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 1999), pp. 11-35.
- ³² Nina Cornyetz, "Bound by Blood: Female Pollution, Divinity, and Community in Enchi Fumiko's *Masks*," *U.S.-Japan Women's Journal: English Supplement* 9 (December 1995): p. 37.
- ³³ According to Gretchen Jones, before 1960 less than 10 percent of the total number of

recipients of the Akutagawa Prize were women writers. See Jones' "The 1960s and 1970s Boom in Women's Writing," in *The Columbia Companion to Modern East Asian Literature*, p. 222. After that time the percentage rose as high as 50% at some points, and has rarely gone below 33%.

³⁴ Japan's 1908 Criminal Code had made abortion illegal, and in 1930 when preparing for the war, the Japanese government aggressively pursued pro-natalist policies. See Sharon Sievers' "Women in China, Japan, and Korea," in *Women in Asian: Restoring Women to History*, ed. Barbara N. Ramusack and Sharon Sievers (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1999), pp. 225-6.

³⁵ Jones, "The 1960s and 1970s Boom in Women's Writing," pp. 221-9.

³⁶ Ibid, p. 223.

³⁷ Orbaugh, "The Body in Contemporary Japanese Women's Fiction," in *The Woman's Hand: Gender and Theory in Japanese Women's Writing*, p. 127.

³⁸ Orbaugh, "Ōba Minako and the Paternity of Maternalism," in *The Father-Daughter Plot: Japanese Literary Women and the Law of the Father*, eds. Rebecca L. Copeland and Esperanza Ramirez-Christensen (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2001), p. 266.

³⁹ Yukiko Tanaka, *Unmapped Territories: New Women's Fiction from Japan* (Seattle: Women in Translation, 1991), pp. xii-xiii.

⁴⁰ Audre Lord, "The Master's Tools will Never Dismantle the Master's House," in idem, *Sister Outsider* (Freedom, Calif.: Crossing Press, 1984), pp. 110-3.

⁴¹ Orbaugh. "The Body in Contemporary Japanese Women's Fiction," p. 125.

⁴² In 1624, Dutch traders first established an artillery base at Fort Zeelandia (close to present-day Tainan) for conducting commerce with Japan and China. Two years later, the Spanish established a settlement on the northwest coast of Taiwan near Keelung, which they occupied until 1642 when they were driven out by the Dutch. The Dutch administered the island and its predominantly aboriginal population until they were ousted in 1661 by Cheng Cheng-Kung.

⁴³ Lai He used Chinese to create in his work a more lifelike Taiwanese colloquialism, however, he was extremely frustrated with the experiment because many words in the Taiwanese spoken language do not have corresponding Chinese characters. See Sung-sheng Yvonne Chang, "Taiwanese New Literature and the Colonial Context: A Historical Survey," in *Taiwan: A New History*, p. 270.

⁴⁴ Faye Yuan Kleeman has analyzed in detail the literature produced in Japanese by Taiwanese writers during the colonial period: for more on the authors and movements mentioned below, see idem. *Under an Imperial Sun: Japanese Colonial Literature of Taiwan and the South* (Honolulu: Hawai'i University Press, 2003), passim.

⁴⁵ For the Imperialization Movement, please see Harry J. Lamley's "Taiwan under Japanese Rule, 1895-1945: The Vicissitudes of Colonialism," in *Taiwan: A New History*,

pp. 201-60, and Wan-yao Chou's, "The Kōminka Movement in Taiwan and Korea: Comparisons and Interpretations," in *The Japanese Wartime Empire, 1931-1945*, eds. Peter Duus, Roman H. Myers, and Mark R. Peattie (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1996), pp.55-100.

⁴⁶ Faye Yuan Kleeman, *Under an Imperial Sun: Japanese Colonial Literature of Taiwan and the South*, p. 6.

⁴⁷ Ye Shitao 葉石濤, "Kaichuang Taiwan wenxueshi de xin geju" 開創台灣文學的新格局, *Taiwan wenxue de beiqing* 台灣文學的悲情 (Gaoxiong: Paise wenhua, 1990), pp. 91-2.

⁴⁸ For the Taiwanese New Literature Movement under Japanese colonial rule, see Xu Chunya 許俊雅, *Riji shidai Taiwan xiaoshou yanjiu* 日據時代台灣小說研究 (Taipei: Wenshiji, 1995); and Liang Mingxiong 梁明雄, *Riji shiqi Taiwan wenxue yundong yanjiu* 日據時期台灣文學運動研究 (Taipei: Wenshiji, 1996).

⁴⁹ Peng Juichin, "The Primary Issue for Taiwan Literature is Identifying with the land," trans. by Mabel Lee. *Taiwan Literature: English Translation Series*, no. 4 (Dec. 1998): p. 10.

⁵⁰ On February 27, 1947, a woman illegally selling cigarettes in Taipei was struck by officers of the Monopoly Bureau. An angry crowd quickly gathered, and violence broke out after one officer fired into the crowd, killing a bystander. Soon the uprising spread out over the island as Taiwanese and the Nationalist government battled for control of the public infrastructure. Unemployed youth, workers, students, peddlers, and small businessmen briefly wrested control of Taiwan from the provincial administration. After a week of increasing tension, the Nationalist reinforcements from the mainland reasserted the government's control by indiscriminately shooting anyone on the streets. Administrator Chen Yi declared martial law throughout the island. Thousands of Taiwanese who were involved in the uprising or subsequent negotiations were executed, and others unfortunate enough to be on the streets massacred. Seeing the incident as a rebellion, the government had implemented the Provisional Amendments for the Period of Mobilization and Suppression of Communist Rebellion in 1948, which entrusted the President with more power to deal with the national emergency. Based on the Provisional Amendments, Chiang Kai-shek instituted martial law and made the Nationalist party domestically unchallengeable as long as the state of civil war against the communists continued. Under the shadow of the White Terror, Taiwanese were deprived of freedom of speech and political activity until the martial law was finally lifted in 1987. See Steven Philip, "Between Assimilation and Independence: Taiwanese Political Aspirations under Nationalist Chinese Rule, 1945-1948," in *Taiwan: A New History*, pp. 292-6.

⁵¹ Generally, émigrés from mainland China after 1945 are called "mainlanders" or 外省人

waishengjen (literally, people from other provinces than Taiwan), and the descendants of the earlier Chinese settlers are usually identified as “native Taiwanese” or *benshengren* 本省人 (literally, people of Taiwan province). The descendants of Malayo-Polynesian people, who are indigenous inhabitants of the island, are generally referred to as “aborigines.”

⁵² Sung-sheng Yvonne Chang, “Literature in Post-1949 Taiwan, 1950 to 1980s,” in *Taiwan: A New History*, p. 406.

⁵³ See Ye Shitao, *Taiwan wenxue shigang* 台灣文學史綱, and Peng Reijin 彭瑞金 *Taiwan xinwenxue yundong sishinian* 台灣文學運動四十年 (Taipei: Zili wanbaoshe, 1991).

⁵⁴ Gong Pengcheng 龔鵬程, “Taiwan wenxue sishinian” 台灣文學四十年, in *Taiwan wenxue zai Taiwan* 台灣文學在台灣 (Banqiao: Luotuo, 1997), p. 74.

⁵⁵ Ye Shitao, “The Multi-ethnic Issue of Taiwan Literature,” trans. by Wan-Shu Lu, *Taiwan Literature: English Translation Series* no. 3 (June 1998): pp. 3-12.

⁵⁶ Qiu Quifen 邱貴芬, “Cong zhanhou chuqi nǚzuoia de chuanguzuo tan Taiwan wenxueshi de xushu” 從戰後初期女作家的創作談台灣文學史的敘述, *Zhongwai wen-xue* 中外文學 (Chungwai Literary Monthly) 29, no. 2 (July 2000): pp. 320-326.

⁵⁷ Fan Mingju 范銘如, “Taiwan xinguxiang: wushi niandai nǚxing xiaoshou” 台灣新故鄉: 五十年代女性小說, in *Xingbei lunshu yu Taiwan xiaoshuo* 性別論述與台灣小說, ed. Mei Chialing 梅家玲 (Taipei: Maitian chuban, 2000), p. 124.

⁵⁸ See Ye Shitao, *Taiwan wenxue shigang*, and Peng Reijin *Taiwan xinwenxue yundong sishinian*.

⁵⁹ C.T. Hsia, Preface to *A History of Modern Chinese Fiction*, 2d ed. (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1971), pp. v- viii.

⁶⁰ Sung-sheng Yvonne Chang, “Literature in Post-1949 Taiwan, 1950 to 1989s,” in *Taiwan: A New History*, p. 408.

⁶¹ Here, the “Modernist literary movement” with a capital M is used specifically in reference to Taiwan’s *Xiandai Taiwan wenxue yundong*, in contradistinction to the general implications of the non-capitalized “modernism.”

⁶² At the time when the terms “Taiwan consciousness” or “Taiwanese literature” still remained taboo, literature created in the island was called Chinese literature.

⁶³ Bai Xianyoung 白先勇, Foreword to *Xiandai wenxue* 現代文學 (Modern literature) 1, (1960).

⁶⁴ Sung-sheng Yvonne Chang. *Modernism and the Nativist Resistance: Contemporary Chinese Fiction from Taiwan* (Durham: Duke University Press, 1993), p. 14.

⁶⁵ Sung-sheng Yvonne Chang. “Three Generations of Taiwan’s Contemporary Women Writers: A Critical Introduction,” in *Bamboo Shoots after the Rain: Contemporary Stories by Women Writers of Taiwan*, eds., Ann Carver and Sung-sheng Yvonne Chang

(New York: Feminist Press at the City University of New York, 1990), p. xx.

- ⁶⁶ According to Elaine Showalter, *Feminine, Feminist, and Female* are the three phases of development of women's writing. See Showalter's *A Literature of Their Own: British Women Novelists from Bronte to Lessing* (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1999), p. 13. Showalter's categorization of women's writing will be further discussed in the next chapter.
- ⁶⁷ David Der-Wei Wang, "Introduction" to *Chinese Literature in the Second Half of a Modern Century: A Critical Survey*, eds., Pang-Yuan Chi and David Wang (Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2000), p. xxx.
- ⁶⁸ Sung-sheng Yvonne Chang, "The Nativist Resistance to Modernism," in *Modernism and the Nativist Resistance*, pp. 148-76.
- ⁶⁹ The "provincial identity" complex refers to the psychological tension or alienation between native Taiwanese and mainlanders that has been stored up since the February 28 incident.
- ⁷⁰ Although Eileen Zhang, a mainland writer of the pre-1949 era who often set stories in Hong Kong and Shanghai before the Communist Revolution, never resided in Taiwan, her writing has been highly popular and profoundly influential there. Writers such as Xiao Lihong, Jiang Xiayun, Zhu Tianwen, Zhu Tianxin, Su Weizhen, and Yuan Qiongqiong have to varying degrees displayed influence from Eileen Zhang.
- ⁷¹ Lü Zhenghui 呂正惠, *Zhanhou Taiwan wenxue jinyan* 戰後台灣文學經驗 (Taipei: Xindi wenxue 1992), p. 131.
- ⁷² The Sansan (Double Three) literary group consisted of the second generation of mainland women writers led by the sisters Zhu Tianwen and Zhu Tianxin, who established a literary journal *Sansan jikan* (1977) to advocate their literary ideology based on Sun Yatsen's Three Principles of the People and the Christian Trinity.
- ⁷³ Yang Zhao 楊照, *Wenxue, shehui yu lishi xiangxiang: zhanhou wenxueshi sanlun* 文學、社會與歷史想像：戰後文學史散論 (Taipei: Lianhe wenxue, 1995), pp. 151-3.
- ⁷⁴ Louis Montrose, "Professing the Renaissance: The Poetics and Politics of Culture," in *The New Historicism*, ed. H. Aram Veeser (New York: Routledge, 1989), pp. 15-36.
- ⁷⁵ Raymond Williams, *Marxism and Literature* (Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press, 1977), p. 121.
- ⁷⁶ Qiu Quifen 邱貴芬, "Nüxing de 'xiangtu xiangxiang': Taiwan dangdai xiangtu nüxing xiaoshuo chutan" 女性的鄉土想像：台灣當代鄉土女性小說初探, in *Xingbei lunshu yu Taiwan xiaoshuo*, p. 124.
- ⁷⁷ Yang Zhao 楊照, "Cong 'xiangtu xieshi' dao 'chaoyue xieshi'—bashi niandai de Taiwan xiaoshuo" 從「鄉土寫實」到「超越寫實」——八十年代的台灣小說, in *Taiwan wenxue fazhan xianxiang: wushi nianlai Taiwan wenxue yantaohui lunwenji* 台灣文學發展想像：

五十年來台灣文學研討會論文集 2. (Taipei: Xingzhengyuan wenjihui), pp. 137-50.

⁷⁸ Qiu Qui-fen, "Nü-xing de 'xiang-tu xiang-xiang' pp. 119-43.

⁷⁹ Wang Derwei 王德威, *Zhongsheng xuanhua: sanling yu b-ling niandai di Zhongguo xiao-shuo* 眾聲喧嘩：三〇與八〇年代的中國小說. (Taipei: Yuanliu, 1988).

⁸⁰ Military housing compounds were built for dependents of military personnel, mostly Nationalists relocated from the mainland.

⁸¹ Upon the completion of graduate studies in the United State, Xiulian Annette Lü returned to Taiwan in 1971 and launched a number of programs advocating gender equality. Nonetheless, her progressive efforts toward raising women's consciousness concerning their rights provoked stubborn resistance from the dominant conservatives. Lü's 1977 book *New Feminism* was banned six months after its publication and she herself was arrested in 1980 for political activism.

⁸² Special issues with a focus on Western feminism and literary and cultural studies were published by a distinguished literary magazine, *Zhongwai wenxue* (Chungwai Literary Monthly): "Feminist Literature" in March 1986, "Women and Literature" in March 1990, "Women's Sky: Women's Literature and Culture in Taiwan" in July 1997, "Women's Literature/Arts and Cultural Discourse" in March 1999. *Dangdai* (Con-Temporary) also published a special issue on Feminism in September 1986, and *Lianhe wenxue* (Unitas Literary Monthly) circulated a special issue on Women and Literature in March 1986.

⁸³ Sung-sheng Yvonne Chang, "Three Generations of Taiwan's Contemporary Women Writers: A Critical Introduction," p. xxiv.

⁸⁴ Peng Xiaoyan 彭小妍, "Nüzuoja de qingyu shuxie yu zhengzhi lunshu: jeidu Miyuan" 女作家的情慾書寫與政治論述：解讀《迷園》. *Chungwai literary monthly* 24, no. 5 (1995): pp. 72-92.

⁸⁵ Kuei-fen Chiu, "Identity Politics in Contemporary Women's Novels in Taiwan," *Tamkang Review* 30, no. 2 (Winter 1999): pp. 27-54.

⁸⁶ Joan E. Ericson, "The Origins of the Concept of "Women's Literature," in *The Woman's Hand: Gender and Theory in Japanese Women's Writing*, p. 93.

⁸⁷ Lü's and Murō's criticism on Taiwanese and Japanese women's writing respectively will be further discussed in Chapter 3.

Chapter Two

Killing Patriarchy: Kanai Mieko's and Li Ang's Man-Slaughtering

The first pair of women writers I will discuss and compare are Kanai Mieko (1947-) and Li Ang (1952-), specifically the works "Funiku" 腐肉 (Rotting Meat, 1972) by Kanai and *Shafu* 殺夫 (The Butcher's Wife, 1983; tr. 1995) by Li, both of which feature the theme of man-slaughtering. In each story the marginalized and exploited female protagonist eventually kills the abusive male protagonist who butchers pigs for a living; each narrates a dramatic plot with grotesque depiction that is intended to subvert the simplistic male-female power paradigm. While the man-slaughtering in Kanai's story is committed by a prostitute—a gender role that is antithetic to the government-promoted model of "good wife and wise mother," Li's story of husband-killing exposes the exploitative nature of family and the marriage system in a shockingly sanguine way, pushing the limits of censorship prior to Taiwan's repeal of martial law. For a better understanding of the formative process of each writer and how the work in question is situated within the writer's career, I will begin with a biographical sketch of each writer. In terms of theoretical perspective, gender theory and the Lacanian conception of the Symbolic order will be employed to investigate women's oppression and confinement in a patriarchal society. Despite the fact that both of these works feature the same, highly controversial theme and grotesque depictions, neither should be simply read as a female revenge fantasy but, rather, as an undisguised representation of the absurdity and inhumanity found within patriarchal institutions, which is intended to shock the reader into reflection. Both writers highlight the ways patriarchal institutions affect female

subjectivity and each narrates one possible result of the effects of patriarchy.

Kanai Mieko

Biographical Background

Kanai Mieko was born in the city of Takasaki in Gunma Prefecture in 1947, when Japan was still under the authority of the Allied Occupation. Her father Kanai Shichishirō was an ardent consumer of Tanizaki Jun'ichirō's¹ work, and her mother was so enthusiastic about movies that she often carried Kanai on her back to movie theatres from the time of Kanai's infancy. Kanai's father died when she was only five years of age, and the sad event has ever since had an enormous impact on her and her writing. She once remarked that reading was a way of escaping the nightmare of darkness and absence caused by losing a parent.² Kitada Sachie argues that the origin of Kanai's writing/reading is the attempt to escape from the uneasiness of absence of the father to the unreal world of enchantment.³ After having survived the loss of her father by immersing herself in vast reading, Kanai was determined to become a writer when she was still in primary school, and started to engage in writing at an early age. In junior high she skipped school as often as twice a week to go to the movies, and kept a movie journal for a year. She enjoyed reading Ishikawa Jun and Sakaguchi Ango,⁴ and during the same period of time she also started reading modern poetry.⁵

After graduating from Takasaki Girls' High School in Gunma Prefecture in 1966, Kanai wrote poems and stories instead of going on to pursue higher education as she had decided that preparation for the college entrance exams was merely a waste of time. In 1967, just one year after her graduation, she published her first short story, "Ai no

seikatsu” 愛の生活 (Love Life), which was designated the runner-up for the third Dazai Osamu Prize for fiction. In the story Kanai employs the technique of stream-of-consciousness to portray the state of mind of a female novelist who is obsessed with a craving for love. The work earned warm praise from such highly respected writers as Ishikawa Jun and Yoshida Ken'ichi.⁶ Although she was not awarded the prize, her story was published in *Tenbō*, a prestigious literary magazine of the time. In the following year, she did win the eighth annual Gendai-techō Prize (Contemporary Poetry Notebook Award) for an early version of her poetry collection *Madamu Juju no ie* マダムジュジュの家 (The House of Madam Juju; tr. 1977), which was published in its final version in 1971.

Since her successful debut, Kanai has been frequently nominated for and often awarded almost every major literary prize. With many a trophy, she remains prolific in a variety of literary works to this day. Unlike most contemporary female writers who concentrate on one literary genre, Kanai has been remarkable for continuing to write poetry, fiction, essays, and literary criticism. On top of her profuse writing of poetry and fiction, Kanai also regularly contributes essays and film criticism to major newspapers, women's magazine, and literary journals. Kanai has been writing and publishing perhaps longer than any other Japanese writer born after the war.⁷ Although she rarely refers to the Japanese literary influences on her work, Kanai has acknowledged that she was inspired by Ōoka Shōhei, Sakaguchi Ango, and Ishikawa Jun.⁸ Also, she was profoundly influenced by Western literary and cultural theory. She reads and writes critical essays on the work of Flaubert, Foucault, Barthes, Lacan, Deleuze, Simone de Beauvoir, Virginia Woolf, Germaine Greer, and filmmakers Godard, Renoir, and Ford. Although Kanai

herself claims that she has no interest in writing feminist work, most critics have been fairly convinced that much of her work is, in effect, feminist.⁹

Kanai has been interested in new experimental forms of writing that are skilfully designed to reflect the complexity of reality. Most of her earlier stories are extremely short but full of grotesquerie and graphic violence such as scenes of blood, cannibalism, dismemberment, and incest. Following Judith Butler's argument of sex/gender as performativity, Orbaugh regards Kanai's short fiction, which relentlessly explores the roles of gender and the nature of subjectivity from the margins of the discourse of signification, as an act of "arguing with the real."¹⁰

Kanai's multifaceted writing in her thirty-eight year career so far defies any easy categorization. It is beyond the scope of this chapter to provide a general overview of her work. I will focus on her short fiction written in the 1970s to investigate how Kanai intelligently writes against the socio-political background in a style that is grotesque yet very powerful. In particular, Kanai's "Funiku" (Rotting Meat, 1972; tr. 1997) will be the main focus of my analysis to illustrate the point.

Gender Theory

In examining Kanai Mieko's fiction I will particularly bear in mind Luce Irigaray's critique of phallogocentric culture in her *This Sex Which Is Not One* (1985), and Judith Butler's gender/sex as performativity conception proposed in her *Gender Trouble* (1990). I do not equate the socio-political background of post-war Japan to the intellectual milieu that brought about the emergence of French Feminist theorists like Irigaray, Hélène Cixous, and Julia Kristeva. However, theoretically inspired by Irigaray and Butler, I

deduce general concepts that are applicable to the critical reading of Kanai Mieko. I am convinced that the prism of gender theory will help us glean in-depth understanding of the effects of Kanai's hard-to-categorize writing.

Initially appearing as a part of feminist theory, gender theory has subsequently come to include investigations of all gender and sexual categories and identities, and has become one of the most vigorous fields in cultural studies.¹¹ On the heels of political feminism in the United States and Western Europe during the 1960s, feminist gender theory emerged as a vigorous field of critical inquiry. While generally challenging the paradigms and intellectual premises of Western thought, feminist gender theory intends to transform the social order by proposing required interventions and providing alternative epistemological positions. In the context of emerging postmodernism, Judith Butler and other gender theorists view the category of "gender" as a human construct that is enacted by a vast repetition of social performance. In *Gender Trouble* (1990), one of her most influential books, Butler called for a new way of looking at sex and gender. She asks:

Can we refer to a 'given' sex or a 'given' gender without first inquiring into how sex/and or gender is given, through what means? And what is 'sex' anyway? Is it natural, anatomical, chromosomal, or hormonal, and how is a feminist critic to assess the scientific discourses which purport to establish such 'facts' for us? (10)¹²

Butler contends that the sexual categories, like gender categories, are culturally constructed and as such contribute to the creation of social reality, rather than simply reflecting it. As a result, sex is not to nature as gender is to culture.

Gender theory acquired much of its initial theoretical inspiration from French feminist theorists such as Luce Irigaray, Hélène Cixous, and Julia Kristeva. In general,

French feminist thought asserts that the Western philosophical tradition represses the experience of women in the structure of its ideas. As an inevitable consequence of this systematic intellectual repression and exclusion, women's historical lives and physical bodies are subject to repression as well. As Cixous indicates, the history of Western thought is structured through binary oppositions: "Activity/Passivity, Culture/Nature, Sun/Moon, Father/Mother, Intelligible/Sensitive, Head/Emotions, Logos/Pathos."¹³ These hierarchical binary oppositions are invariably equated to the fundamental binary "male/female" and therefore reflect the same positive/negative evaluation. Like Cixous, Irigaray also attacks the phallogentrism or the "logic of the same" in Western thought under which women remain unrepresented or presented as lack. In her major work *Speculum of the Other Woman*, Irigaray criticizes phallogocentrism (a word combining phallogentrism and logocentrism) by demonstrating how Freudian and Lacanian theories of sexuality are constructed on just one sex.¹⁴ Inevitably, the patriarchal binary thought hidden in phallogocentric ideology leaves no positive space for women. Cixous and Irigaray endeavor to turn the idea of lack into an idea of excess, and challenge the binary opposition that so evidently prevails in the phallogocentric system of language.

In her texts Irigaray seeks to unveil how both psychoanalytic theory and philosophy situate "woman" outside representation, and relegate "woman" to the realm of inert, lifeless, inessential matter. She argues that in the Freudian paradigm female sexuality is viewed and defined in relation to or in opposition to male sexuality. She opens her article "This Sex Which is Not One" with a sobering statement: "Female sexuality has always been theorized within masculine parameters."¹⁵ According to this male-dominant line of logic, the existence of female sexuality is always dependent on male sexuality. According

to Irigaray, Freud asserts that “the hypothesis of a single identical genital apparatus—the male organ—is fundamental in order to account for the infantile sexual organization of both sexes.”¹⁶ Therefore, in Freudian theory sexual difference is in its entirety based on the visibility of difference:

They (girls) notice the penis of a brother or playmate, strikingly *visible* and of large proportions, at once recognize it as the superior counterpart of their own small and inconspicuous organ, and from that time forward fall a victim to envy for the penis. (emphasis mine)¹⁷

In the eyes of Freud, the male has an obvious sex organ, the penis, and the female has nothing. Therefore the penis is exalted for epitomizing the masculine because it can be seen while the female difference is perceived as an absence or negation of the male norm. As represented in Greek statuary, “woman’s genitals are simply absent, masked, sewn back up inside their ‘crack.’”¹⁸ With genitals seemingly “missing,” woman’s body becomes an unthreatening yet pleasing object for men to gaze at. Questioning this manner of privileging the visual over the non-visual, Irigaray criticizes the Freudian model of sexuality as scopophilic. Entering into such a dominant scopic economy leads to woman’s consignment exclusively to passivity; a woman becomes the beautiful passive object of the male gaze. Irigaray thus argues that Western culture privileges identity, unity, and sight—all of which in fact are entirely associated with male anatomy.

Contrary to male pleasure, which amounts to the dictates of the phallus and is seen as monolithically unified, Irigaray alleges that a woman’s sex is not *one* as she has sex organs just about everywhere (lips, vagina, clitoris, cervix, uterus, breasts) and therefore her sexual pleasure is multiple, non-unified and diffuse.

A woman "touches herself" constantly without anyone being able to forbid her to do so, for her sex is composed of two lips which embrace continually. Thus, within herself she is already two—but not divisible into ones—who stimulate each other.
(324)

The system based on female sexuality would then give privilege, not to the visual, but to the tactile domain. According to Irigaray, touch lessens the distance that is required in vision, and therefore the boundaries between self and other or subject and object would become blurred. In a phallogocentric society, female sexuality is a commodity among men; but once the dominance of the visual is overthrown, the phallogocentric system will break up and in turn the question of ownership will immediately crumble, particularly the ownership of female sexuality. Irigaray envisions a system based on excess and plurality, one in which females and males relate to one another directly; a sexuality and system that is limitless in scope, fluid in practice, ever-changing and ever-expanding.

Judith Butler ponders gender in a postmodern form beyond Freud's sexual theory and problematizes gender as a category of essence. She questions the very idea that a person is male or female, masculine or feminine—the fundamental concepts with which Freud developed his theory. Butler takes pains to demonstrate that gender is not just a social construct, but rather a kind of performance—a show that we put on, a set of signs that we wear, as costume or disguise—hence as far from essence as can be.

As opposed to the fixed masculine/feminine gender binary, Butler elucidates that gender should be seen as free-floating, shifting and changing according to contexts and times. It is the way we behave at different times and in different situations rather than who we are. In light of Butler's performative theory of identity, our identities do not

express some authentic inner “core” self but are the dramatic effect of our performance.

That the gendered body is performative suggests that it has no ontological status apart from the various acts which constitute its reality. This also suggests that if that reality is fabricated as an interior essence, that very interiority is an effect and function of a decidedly public and social discourse, the public regulation of fantasy through the surface politics of the body, the gender border control that differentiates inner from outer, and so institutes the “integrity” of the subject. In other words, acts and gestures, articulated and enacted desires create the illusion of an interior and organizing gender core, an illusion discursively maintained for the purposes of the regulation of sexuality within the obligatory frame of reproductive heterosexuality.

(173)

That is to argue that the illusion of an “interior and organizing gender core” is itself a “fantasy instituted and inscribed on the surface of bodies” through our performances. Moreover, that illusion effectively protects the institution of reproductive heterosexuality from scrutiny and critique as an institution, continually regulating rather than merely “reflecting” our sexuality. Therefore, Butler concludes that gender is a fantasy or a set of internalized images, which should not be seen as a primary category, but a set of secondary narrative effects.

Like many feminists before her, Butler painstakingly attempts to achieve equality between “men” and “women.” However, rather than proposing some utopian vision, Butler advocates gender parody as a way of challenging traditional notions of gender identities. One of her intellectual efforts dedicated to this trailblazing endeavour is the use of drag as the main metaphor for this subversive action. By dressing up as a member of the opposite sex, “drag fully subverts the distinction between inner and outer psychic

space and effectively mocks both the expressive model of gender and the notion of a true gender identity.”¹⁹ Through imitating gender, drag implicitly “reveals the imitative structure of gender itself as well as its contingency.”²⁰ Butler believes that parody, as the most effective strategy for subverting the fixed binary frame of gender, might bring about changes in political culture leading to improvement of the situation of “women.” As she speculates with respect to the collapse of fixed gender identities and its implications:

If identities were no longer fixed as the premises of a political syllogism, and politics no longer understood as a set of practices derived from the alleged interests that belong to a set of ready-made subjects, a new configuration of politics would surely emerge from the ruins of the old. (189)

If no fixed role is imposed upon either gender, it would not be unusual for a “woman” to be in power at work or for a “man” to stay home and look after children. In other words, to put it in more traditional feminist terms, the changes advocated by Butler would transform the existing patriarchal society into something closer to equality for all regardless of gender.

Bearing in mind the concepts and cautions put forward by the theorists discussed above, I will turn now to an analysis of the literary texts, beginning with Japanese writer Kanai Mieko’s “Rotting Meat.” I will then analyze Taiwanese writer Li Ang’s *The Butcher’s Wife*. I will conclude this chapter with a direct comparison of the two works to highlight the similarities and differences in their challenges to patriarchal discourse.

“Rotting Meat”

The presentation of “Rotting Meat” is fascinating and exceptional. There is no

indication given of where or when the story is set, nor is any character given a proper name; this vagueness produces a tone that is both fantastic and subtle. All the characters are referred to either as *kanojo* 彼女 (she), *otoko* 男 (man), *otokotachi* 男たち (men), or simply by occupation such as *fudōsan'ya* 不動産屋 (the real estate agent) and *tosatsujin* 屠殺人 (the butcher). The story has two first-person narrators—one male frame narrator and one female internal narrator. The frame narrator tells the reader about his unusual encounter with a strange woman; the internal narrator enters the story at a certain point and then takes over the narrative. The frame narrator returns to the story at the end and is situated in the “real world” with which the reader is familiar; whereas the internal narrator depicts a world that is removed from reality.

The story starts off with the frame narrator stressing what he knows and what he is sure about:

While I'm sure that I've been to her room before, finding it again would be difficult. The moment I left that room, deep inside I knew it: if I leave here, I won't be able to get back again. Deep inside I knew it. I knew I probably wouldn't even be able to find the realtor who had taken me to the room if I did try and find it. Yet when I saw that bloody, rotting meat, I fled from that room, only able to think of getting outside for air as fast as I could. (110)²¹

彼女の部屋に行ったのは確かなことなのだが、今となっては、その部屋を見つけ出すこともむづかしい。あの部屋を出て来た時、ぼくにはわかっていたんだ。ここを出ちまえば、二度とここに戻って来ることが出来なくなることが、ぼくにはわかっていた。見つけようとしても、部屋に案内してくれた不動産屋さえ決して見つからないだろうということが、わかっていた。でも、あの血だらけの腐った肉を見た時、ぼくは部屋を飛び出して一時も早く外の空気を吸うことしか考えられなかった。(150)²²

After telling the reader these various things he is sure about, the narrator casually

mentions a lump of “bloody, rotting meat.” Immediately thereafter, in a new paragraph, he tells us that he had met a woman in “that room,” and as he tells us of their encounter, she takes over the narration.

She tells the man about her former livelihood. She had been a thriving prostitute who often received valuables from her patrons such as gold watches, jeweled lighters and, of course, cash. She liked to keep the gifts as souvenirs of each man, remembering the details of her relationship with each of them. Although cash was useful for purchasing her daily necessities, she preferred gifts as they were less awkward and made the transaction less explicit. But one of her patrons, who was a butcher, one day brought her something far more unusual—the meat of a whole, freshly butchered piglet.

Once, though, a man brought me a whole, freshly slaughtered pig. (He was a butcher. And he always reeked of the blood of newly killed animals—as a butcher, that was only natural, I guess—but, he was always saying that before coming to see me he had ‘just downed a few draughts’ of the warm blood from the animals he’s killed... Anyway, always, the day after that blood-stained butcher had been to see me, every joint and bone in my body hurt so bad that I couldn’t do a thing with any other customer.) But a whole pig, why, it was impossible for me to eat it all by myself! It would’ve been somehow strange to make each customer take a slice of meat home with him as a kind of souvenir, and making them eat some meat dish would have been somehow too much trouble since that would probably mean I would have to do the cooking. Even supposing I were to do cooking, well, not so much the actual cooking, but more like decide when the meat should be cooked, or when the food I’d cooked should be eaten, about such things as that, I had no idea. The more I thought about it, the more I didn’t know what to do. (110-12)

いつかなんか、屠りたての小豚丸々一頭分の肉を持って来た男（その男は屠殺人で、いつも殺したての動物の血の臭いをさせていて、それもそのはず、ここにやって来る前に、殺した

ての動物の温かい血を“ちょっと一杯ひっかけて”くるの。それで、その血まみれの屠殺人が来た翌日は身体の節々が痛くて、お客の相手なんてとっても出来なかったわ) がいて、一人じゃ食べきれずとても困ったことがあった。お客の男たちに一切れずつの肉をお土産に持たせるのもなんだか妙だったし、男たちに肉料理を食べさせるのも(その為にはあたしが料理をすることになるだろうから)、なんだか面倒だったし、それにたとえ料理を作ったとして、というよりも、いつ料理を作るべきなのか、いつその料理を食べるべきなのかあたし、よくわからなかったのよ。考えれば考えるほど、わからなくなってしまったわ。(150-51)

The word “meat” reminds of her own profession as a prostitute; she feels like she sells her own flesh piece by piece. She continues to describe the meat that was brought to her by the butcher:

This butcher of mine, well-built, rather hairy, vulgar, he had brought me a pig that in its soft, peach-coloured clumps, rather than ‘meat’ it would be better to call it a dead body, an animal’s dead body. Of course, anywhere you look there are cases where it is more correct to call a dead body or a person’s body ‘meat’—in particular, ‘meat’ is what a whore’s body is sometimes called—but that meat which the butcher brought me, no matter how you looked at it, it was the dead body of a pig he had killed and skinned. The pig’s dead body was wrapped in newspaper and plastic and stuffed under my bed. Because I didn’t know what else to do with it. (112)

体格の良い毛むくじゃらの下品な屠殺人の持ってきた小豚丸々一頭は、桃色の柔らかな塊で、肉というよりは動物の死体といったほうが正確で、世の中には、肉といったほうが正確な死体や身体もあるし、とりわけ、娼婦の身体は《肉》といった呼ばれ方をすることがあるけれど、屠殺人の持ってきたものは、どうみても、彼が殺した小豚の皮を剥いだ死体だったわ。小豚の死体はビニールと新聞紙に包まれて寝台の下に押しこめておいたの。だって、どうしていいかわかんなかったから。(151)

She tells the man that in her golden days men often had to make a reservation one month

before visiting her. However, the jealous butcher always treated her body so roughly that she could not see any other customer after his visit. As such, the number of her customers plunged dramatically and her business suffered severely. At this juncture, the male frame narrator picks up the narration to relate how the woman had become a prostitute, but then he suddenly changes the subject to explain the circumstances that led to his meeting with the woman and why he had not asked her more about the rotting meat.

He tells us that he is a writer who had been looking for a quiet room—not for pursuing writing but for escaping from writing. He was shown a small furnished apartment by a realtor who had a peculiarly terrible bad breath. He moved in immediately. There was an unpleasant odour in the room that he thought was the lingering smell of the realtor's bad breath. By the nighttime the foul smell got even stronger and almost suffocated him, so he investigated and traced it to a built-in European-style wardrobe. To his surprise, he found a woman inside lying down on a double bed. Of course the realtor had given him no warning that there were a bed and a woman in the wardrobe. He thought that even if perhaps she was the former tenant she had no right to be here now. He tried to explain this to her, but she simply ignored his explanation and firmly believed that he had been brought to the room by her pimp. He made a move to rationalize this confusion as a dirty trick of the venal realtor but she was indifferent to his bewilderment and remained calm, continuing to state her version of the situation.

She continued to talk and did not seem bothered at all by the offensive stench that had been getting stronger and stronger. However, the man could not stand it any more and was moved to ask her if something smelled bad. She answered, "If something smells, it's the bad smell of 'meat.' It's started to rot, you see." (臭いがするとしたら《肉》の臭いだわ。

腐りは始めているのよ。114; 152). As he continued to inquire, he was totally taken by surprise:

“So this smell is the meat of the pig that the butcher brought you?”

“No,” she answered. “The pig was eaten up by him. A long time ago.”

“Well, so what meat is rotting then?”

“The meat of the butcher who killed the pig. See.”

Saying that, she stripped the cover from off the legs of the bed, and showed me the dark space underneath.

“As for that one, he absolutely hates me to get along with any other man but him. Give up this business, and let’s set up a household, he’d said. Am I the sort who is able to act out that bit of common pretense? Still, though, I really did love him. That’s why it was only natural that he be killed, you know.” (114)

「すると、この臭いは屠殺人の持って来た豚の肉なんですね？」

「いいえ」と彼女は答えた。「豚は食べちゃったわ、あの人が。とっくの昔に」

「じゃあ、何の肉が腐ってるんです？」

「豚を殺した屠殺人の肉よ。ほら」

そう言って彼女は寝台の脚を覆っていたカバアを剥ぎ、寝台の下の薄暗い空間をぼくに見せた。

「あの人ったら、あたしが自分以外の男と仲良くするのをとても嫌って、こんな商売はやめて世帯を持とうって言ったのよ。そんな下品な真似、できるもんですか。あたしは、あの人を本当に愛していたんですもの。だったら、殺されて当然なのよ」 (152-53)

Calmly she had told the man that she had killed the jealous butcher and shoved the corpse under the bed. As soon as the man had caught sight of the bloody lump, and finally came to realize that it was the butcher’s corpse not pig meat, he had fled the room instantly.

Winding up, the story returns to the frame narrator, expressing his desire to look for the prostitute again. He wants to find the room and propose marriage to the former

prostitute. He even fantasizes that he will become a slice of rotting meat to be swallowed up by her insides. Recently, he says, his body has been rotting away, little by little from the inside out; and his own breath has becoming horrifyingly bad, just like that of the realtor.

Reversing the Power Paradigms

Coming onto the literary stage in Japan in 1967 as a teenager, Kanai is one of the women writers mentioned earlier who benefited from the postwar freedom of expression and economic prosperity to create an unprecedented boom in women's writing. Kanai rejected the existing definitions of the fictional genres previously considered appropriate for women—autobiography, confession, and realistic or historical fiction—and embarked on a new kind of literary search for ways of expressing gendered identity. (In this she was joined by other female authors of the period, such as Kōno Taeko, Ōba Minako, Kurahashi Yumiko, all of whom defied social and cultural norms in the depictions of their fictional worlds.) As in her other short works from the 1970s, in "Rotting Meat" Kanai intentionally uses a "deviant" theme and writing strategy to reflect, and sometimes exaggerate as creatively necessary, the preconceived notions of gender.²³

"Rotting Meat" is an extremely short story, consisting of only 154 lines. The nameless, allegorical characters and ambiguous settings situate the story in a fairy-tale-like atmosphere, giving it a sense of fantasy. With nary a word mentioned about the location, the story could be set anywhere in the world. Such structural characteristics—which can also be found in Kanai's other short fiction from this period, such as "Kikan" 帰還 (The home-coming, 1970), "Boshizō" 母子像 (Portrait of mother

and child, 1972) and “Usagi” 兎 (Rabbits, 1972)—might be regarded as a writing strategy specifically for the purpose of creating a “female” expression of subjectivity.²⁴ The lack of proper names for the characters and the very ambiguous description of the physical settings or the characters’ appearances that could otherwise help the reader to “visualize” them, create a fantastic world that is distanced from reality. This resonates significantly with Irigaray’s suggestion that patriarchal discourse emphasizes the domain of the visual; when Kanai downplays the visual aspects of her invented worlds she may be creating a space relatively free from that masculinist emphasis. In quite a creative twist, Kanai’s world of fiction, delineated by senses other than visual, effectively dismantles the subject/object dichotomy and vigorously attests to Irigaray’s vision of woman having multiple subjectivities/desires. In “Rotting Meat,” the sense of smell is pivotal as the stench of a rotting body spreads throughout the story.

The lack of proper names also resonates with Irigaray’s theory of gendered subjectivity. In Irigaray’s characterization, “any theory of the subject has always been appropriated by the ‘masculine’”; i.e. entering into such a theory inevitably means woman has to subject herself to objectivization in discourse, renouncing her own subjectivity.²⁵ As such a male-centered paradigm is governed by the name of the Father, all roles are defined through their proper relationship to the Father inasmuch as all the legitimacy and authority are given by the names. Creating nameless characters fits perfectly with Kanai’s intentions to escape from the given androcentric norms and to seek a position where the female can articulate her own subjectivity.

Despite the lack of (visual) physical description about the characters, body discourse is the primary issue in the work. Traditionally, in the context of binary gender-based

relationships of power, man is always regarded as an active agent while woman is a passive object. In identifying the nature of men's structural domination over women through the mechanisms of kinship system, Gayle Rubin identifies two conceptions formulated by Levi-Strauss—the gift and the incest taboo—to further expound the idea of “the exchange of women.”²⁶ Rubin argues that the idea of the exchange of women—upon which the male-dominated system is established and made functional—places men and women in asymmetric power relations by rendering men as “givers/receivers” and women as “gifts.” A kinship system based on the exchange of women is one in which women do not have full rights in and by themselves, whereas men have absolute rights over women. In Rubin's argument, it is not just primitive cultures that live by this gender structure. Contemporary, modernized industrial societies continue to treat women metaphorically as the objects of exchange between men. Reflecting this common gender structure, in “Rotting Meat,” it is the man who possesses the right not only to kill animals with impunity because of his occupation but also to consume the body of the female by exhausting her because, in spite of brutal abuse, his consumption is deemed lawful in such a masculinist system. After all, since the female protagonist is a prostitute who sells her own body for a living, any man is allowed to consume her body as he wishes as long as he can pay for it.

In the story, both the frame and internal narrators have attempted to distinguish meat from corpse. They argue that, usually, meat is edible while a corpse is not. Nonetheless, as the internal narrator—the prostitute—herself points out, sometimes it is hard to discern the difference between the two. The frame narrator also stresses the fact that all meat starts out as a corpse, a dead body. If a corpse is properly handled, such as being bled,

skinned, gutted, and chopped, it becomes edible meat. It is generally assumed that the flesh of a dead animal will become edible meat after appropriate handling, and that the flesh of a dead human body is called a corpse and certainly is not edible regardless of any handling. As her body is always referred to as meat because of her work of life, the prostitute identifies herself with the piglet; taking her logic a step further she then says that if upon her death she would be considered a corpse then so should the piglet be considered a corpse. With her self-identification with the pig in this way, the big lump of piglet becomes more like a corpse than meat in the eyes of the prostitute, even though the piglet is properly handled (skinned). That explains why she would shove it under the bed since she was at a loss as to how to deal with the corpse of the piglet.

In effect, the relationship between the butcher and the prostitute epitomizes the conventional power paradigm: man (particularly a butcher) has the right to kill, the right to eat, and the right to consume the female body; woman (particularly a prostitute) gets to be “killed” and “consumed,” like an animal. In the standard view, man equals human and becomes a corpse, whereas woman equals something less, therefore becoming something less than a corpse—perhaps meat—on her death. However, the story would be incomplete if this paradigm were not dramatically reversed in the end. The butcher who kills pigs and consumes the prostitute’s body ends up being killed by the prostitute who used to be brutalized (“killed”) and consumed. In reverse, his dead body replaces the corpse of the piglet and is shoved under the bed just as the piglet was before. Ironically, the frame narrator starts to fantasize that the prostitute may be a cannibal (even though she is never depicted in the story as eating meat, much less a corpse), and he desires to be killed and eaten by her. Despite the fact that the frame narrator was terrified out of his wits and fled

the scene instantly when he realized the rotting meat was the butcher's corpse, later in the safe and normal world he begins to be captivated by the lust of overturning the normal power paradigms. As a *male* and a *writer*, the frame narrator signifies the subject's power to speak, to write, and to define. However, he confesses that he wanted a quiet room not to write but to escape from writing—essentially to flee to the extreme point of not writing but rather, as he tells us, quietly and passively waiting for the visit of death in the disguise of a beautiful maiden. Renouncing all his power and rights, he intends to remain in his quiet existence. After meeting the prostitute, he becomes anxious to indulge himself in utter passivity. He wants to propose marriage to the woman, to surrender to her, and to be killed and consumed by her, although he knows that he can find neither the room nor the woman again. Given the impossibility of his fantasy, the only comfort he can find now is to fantasize himself rotting from his inside out and emitting a rancid smell in his breath (just like the realtor with bad breath).

Succinctly yet soberly in this work, Kanai demonstrates her astute sensitivity regarding the gender structures of society, and creates a brilliant fantasy world in which, instead of being consumed and victimized, women can consume, like the prostitute; instead of consuming and victimizing, men can be consumed, like the butcher and the male narrator. Those who encounter the magical prostitute in the story end up having their own status in the normal power paradigms reversed: the butcher who kills is killed, and the male writer who is an active subject wants to become a passive object. As opposed to the fixed masculine/feminine gender binary, Kanai deliberately makes her characters perform the so-called inherent traits of the opposite gender in a very dramatic and ironic way. Like drag in Butler's parody theory, Kanai makes her characters put on the

performance of the opposite gender so the conventional ideas of gender norms can be subverted so as to challenge the “constitutive categories that seek to keep gender in its place by posturing as the foundational illusions of identity.”²⁷ By displacing, reversing, and exaggerating the gender norms, Kanai makes obvious “the grotesqueries, absurdities, and actual dangers to women that are glossed over by abstract, intellectualized narratives of power.”²⁸ In such a short yet very powerful story, Kanai not only astutely exposes the ironies and absurdities within the abstract power paradigms that have erroneously informed the construction and observance of gender identities, but also opens up space for critical thinking about them, and perhaps an opportunity, too, for attaining gender equality that avoids domination or exploitation of any sort.

Li Ang

Biographical background

Well known for her explicit depictions of sex, Li Ang is one of the most controversial contemporary women writers in Taiwan. Born in the seaport of Lugan near Zhanghua in 1952, Shi Shuduan 施叔端 chose her mother’s maiden name Li 李 and *ang* 昂 (literally “upright, soaring”; a Chinese character that is usually used to name a male) to be her pen name. Like the Brontës of England, the Shi family of Taiwan produced three girls who would become active in the literary scene. The eldest daughter, Shi Shu 施叔, is a distinguished literary critic; the second, Shi Shuqing 施叔青 is also a prominent novelist; and the third daughter is Li Ang. Their parents, a successful self-made businessman and a housewife, provided the daughters an abundant and liberal environment in which to grow up. Like Kanai Mieko, Li Ang’s young mind was enriched with literature; at a young age,

she had read the fairy tales of almost every region imaginable and had managed to memorize hundreds of classic verses of Tang poetry, particularly the most often-recited long poem *Changhenge* 長恨歌 (The Song of Everlasting Sorrow), about the tragic court beauty Yang Gui Fei. From the age of thirteen, she started to indulge in reading *wuxia xiaoshuo* 武俠小說 (chivalrous novels) and famous literary works from all over the world.²⁹

Inspired by her eldest sister, Li Ang started writing fiction at the age of fourteen. She tried to have her very first novel *Caoyuan de shengxia* 草原的盛夏 (The Midsummer of Grasslands) published, but her first ardent hope was dashed. With a precocious literary talent, however, Li was finally successful when her short story “Huaji” 花季 (The Flowering Season, 1968; tr. 1985) was put into publication only two years after her first novel was rejected. The penetrating psychological depiction of a young schoolgirl who fantasized about the possibility of being raped by a florist brought young Li instant fame in the literary scene. In 1970 she entered the Chinese Culture College to major in philosophy and immersed herself in the works of Freud, Camus, Simone de Beauvoir, Virginia Woolf and others. Since then Li has written several experimental stories under the influence of existentialism and psychoanalysis. The notable impact of the Modernist literary movement of the 1960s is also observable in Li’s earlier work. A case in point is “You quxian de wawa” 有曲線的娃娃 (Curvaceous Dolls, 1970; tr. 1999), which is a short story with Freudian overtones about a woman’s fantasies about and obsession with her own body.

Affected by *Modern Literature*, a magazine in Taiwan that introduced masterpieces from around the world, Li set for herself a long-range goal of winning the Nobel Prize in

literature. In a self-interview, Li admitted that gender was not an important issue during her early stage of writing as she seldom thought of herself as a woman.³⁰ This is in fact not uncommon among women writers. For instance, in her investigation of the female literary tradition in the English novel, Elaine Showalter made an insightful observation of women writers' three-stage development toward finding their own self-identity. She identifies three major phases of historical development in female writing, commonly shared by all literary subcultures:

First, there is a prolonged phase of *imitation* of the prevailing modes of the dominant tradition, and *internalization* of its standards of art and its views on social roles. Second, there is a phase of *protest* against these standards and values, and *advocacy* of minority rights and values, including a demand for autonomy. Finally, there is a phase of *self-discovery*, a turning inward freed from some of the dependency of opposition, a search for identity. An appropriate terminology for women writers is to call these stages, *feminine*, *feminist*, and *female*. (13)³¹

One can also clearly identify the three major phases of Li's thirty-six year writing career so far. Although they do not exactly parallel Showalter's three-stage development, they do show significant changes in Li's understanding of her gendered position as a writer. Choosing a male pseudonym to enter the literary scene, Li internalized the mainstream male-centered values. In fact, it was her intention to make it difficult for the reader to determine whether the works collected in *Hun sheng he chang* 混聲合唱 (Mixed Chorus, 1975) were written by a male or female writer. Not until she went to college did Li become conscious of herself as a woman. In her awakening to and desire for love, she started to write love stories that displayed the "feminine" qualities of delicacy and sentimentalism. Works produced in this period are collected in *Ren jian shi* 人間世 (The

Mundane World, 1976), which can be identified as representative of the second phase of her career—advocating femininity.

On her sister's heels, Li went to North America for graduate studies and received a Master of Arts degree in drama from Oregon State University in 1977. Like Kanai Mieko, Li has been profoundly influenced by Western thinking. In particular, she was fascinated by the work of Simone de Beauvoir, Virginia Woolf, and Germaine Greer, among other feminist writers.³² Upon her completion of the degree, she returned to Taiwan and started teaching in the Drama Department at the Chinese Culture College (later the Chinese Culture University) and continued to write. The experience of studying abroad tremendously changed Li Ang's life and her writing. With a much broader view and particularly with her personal exposure to the Western world, Li attempted from then on to rid her writing of the "fatal female traits like small-mindedness, cattiness, back-stabbing, and sentimentalism."³³ She was once again convinced that to write like male writers was in fact the only way to broaden the range of her writing. It was not until she wrote *The Butcher's Wife* that Li came to realize that no matter how hard she tried to imitate male writers she could never write like them, and more importantly, that imitation of male writing is utterly unnecessary.

I was writing a column called "Women's Opinion" then, and I realized that historically, women have always been subordinate to men. Women have always lacked self-confidence and the courage to truly develop their own specifically female potential. Therefore, in history, the universally recognized "female characteristics" have been limited to virtues like tenderness, sensitivity, and consideration. I think women's potential is greater than that. As long as we are confident, I believe there should be a way to write something great as well as female. Women's literature will then no longer be considered the realm of proper ladies and

their personal essays.³⁴

Content as a woman and confident as a writer, Li remains single as she sees writing as her eternal love. (It is interesting to note that Kanai also remains single, for whatever reason.) Her fundamental belief about writing is that it expresses truth, reflects the times and explores problems. As Li attests, "I think that telling the truth is the writer's most fundamental moral obligation. So, when I think something should be written about, I don't give much consideration to whether or not this violates custom (note that I say custom, not morality) or taboos."³⁵ Since she chose female sexuality as the featured theme throughout the majority of her writings, using this theme to reflect and explore the problems of Taiwan's society, Li has encountered incessant attacks, some of which have been downright brutal and ruthlessly personal. However, in a chronological study of Li's works, Howard Goldblatt concluded that Li must be regarded as "the most consistent, successful, and influential writer of sexual fiction in Chinese."³⁶

While dedicated to the theme of female sexuality, Li has never fully committed herself to any particular artistic approach. Although her appropriation of Modernist techniques in works ranging from "Flower Season" to her best known novella, *The Butcher's Wife*, is impressive, she has never pledged her faith in aesthetic modernism as other Modernist writers have done.³⁷ She wrote stories about her hometown Lugang even before the Nativist literary trend was emerging; and when writing *The Butcher's Wife* and then *Miyuan* (The Labyrinthine Garden, 1991), Li still constantly reminded herself to stay clear of those dogmatic beliefs arising from the ever-imposing Nativism of the time.

As mentioned above, as a young female writer entering male-dominated turf with a focus on issues of sexuality, gender and power, Li has been vehemently attacked in public

and often has had to brave intense public disapproval. Despite all the tensions and obstacles, she completed *The Butcher's Wife* in 1983—a novella regarded as one of the most disturbingly powerful works in the history of Taiwanese literature.³⁸ Its publication aroused wide controversy in Taiwanese society because its daring and astonishing depiction of sex and violence was touching every nerve of those who hold “moral values” close to their hearts; in particular, it was deemed extremely unsettling to the moral foundation of society because of the heroine’s subversive deed—killing her husband. Some wrathful critics, government officials, and self-styled defenders of the public morality even considered this work pornography that would corrupt the time-honoured conventions and most-cherished virtues of society. Nonetheless, the fact remains that *The Butcher's Wife* was awarded the best novel prize of *United Daily News* and later was translated into several foreign languages, including English, German, French, and Japanese. In this remarkable work one can detect the powerful and bold interrogation of dominant male-centered power paradigms that are often featured in the second phase of women’s writing, according to Showalter. In the author’s preface to *The Butcher's Wife*, Li directly acknowledges that she approached its composition with a number of feminist ideals in mind, and that she attempted to display the tragic fate awaiting the economically-dependent Taiwanese women in an oppressive patriarchal society.³⁹ The novella forthrightly exposes the brutal nature of domestic violence, patriarchal oppression and the exploitation of women. In a very similar vein, both *The Butcher's Wife* and “Rotting Meat” are political works forcefully protesting against sexual violence towards women. Through man-slaughtering, patriarchy is killed metaphorically; and simultaneously, women’s status is elevated symbolically.

The Symbolic Order

I turn to Lacanian-inspired theory to elucidate my analytical reading of Li Ang's *The Butcher's Wife*, with particular attention to the perplexing question of women's relation to language and the Symbolic order. I have proposed that the two stories addressed in this chapter are attempts to subvert patriarchal discourse, so I will now turn to a brief discussion of the psychoanalytic descriptions of the source and structure of patriarchy. Most contemporary theorists of gender begin with concepts introduced by Jacques Lacan (although in some cases they introduce those concepts in order to critique them). Most pertinent for this discussion are the ideas of the Imaginary and Symbolic orders, domains of experience that mark different periods in a human's development of subjectivity. The Imaginary is described by Lacan as that domain experienced by infants in their first few months of life, when they perceive no separation between themselves and the external world; caregivers, objects, emotions are all perceived by the infant as coextensive with the self. Around the age of six to eighteen months, however, infants begin to recognize that they are beings with discrete boundaries, separate from the world around them. At this stage infants placed before a mirror can recognize their own image; the impression of wholeness, completeness, and control given by the mirror image of the infant's own imperfectly controlled body/self leads to a lifelong misrecognition of selfhood as something perfect and whole.

It is at this same period that the infant is first acquiring language, and it is through entry into language and recognition of the self as separate that the infant enters the Symbolic. The Symbolic order constitutes the infant in the structures that exist in her language/culture, including, of course, gender structures. According to Lacan, the

structures of the Symbolic order are anchored by the master sign of the phallus and the Law of the Father. In the Symbolic order, women have no position of power and no access to a language that is not already constituted by the Law of the Father. This would seem to leave women writers with no means of expressing an experience that is outside mainstream patriarchal discourse. However, feminist theorists such as Kristeva, Cixous, Irigaray and Spivak have criticized Lacan for having failed to diagnose the fundamental error of his predecessor, Freud. That is, Lacan also understood the world and language in terms of a one-sex model of sexuality and subjectivity. Although Lacan declared that the phallus in his theory is not connected to male biology, his appropriation of Freud renders this declaration dubious, according to some critics. Moreover, much of Lacanian theory continues to rely on “vision” as the primary domain in the development of subjectivity. Lacan’s Symbolic order—primarily the order of culture and language—remains fundamentally masculine and patriarchal. In opposition to Lacan’s indelible patriarchal model, Kristeva replaces Lacan’s distinction between the Imaginary and the Symbolic order with a distinction between the semiotic and the symbolic. She posits the space of semiotic, a prelinguistic space anterior to the Symbolic, as the place in which the source of anarchy, disorder, ambivalence, and silence reside.⁴⁰ Linked to the pre-Oedipal primary processes, the semiotic is referred to as the chaotic flow of drives experienced by the infant who is unable to distinguish self from other. Kristeva argues that this space could function as the locus of disruption, displacing the Symbolic order where the binary categories of male and female fall into place, and it could transgress its boundaries, causing a breakdown of individual or sexual identity, logical meaning, or social order. While Kristeva’s reworking of Lacanian concepts has also been criticized, I find that her

semiotic thesis is helpful in interpreting elements of contemporary Taiwanese women's writing, including *The Butcher's Wife*.⁴¹

The Butcher's Wife

Like Kanai's "Rotting Meat," *The Butcher's Wife* has two narrators—a frame and an internal. The frame narrator is situated in the real world (newspaper reports), with which the reader is familiar; while the internal narrator depicts a world that is removed from reality. The frame narrator represents an epistemological world while the internal narrator depicts an ontological one. More significantly, however, the epistemological status of the frame narrator has been subverted by the internal narrator at the end of the story. In *The Butcher's Wife* the third-person frame narrator in the two short news reports provides a prologue, introducing the main text, which is told by another third-person internal narrator. In the news reports, the reader is informed that Lin Shi, the female protagonist, is an "immoral" woman who killed her husband for the sake of an extramarital affair. According to the news:

When asked why she had killed her husband, Chen responded that he had been a cruel, brutal man who went out to drink and gamble every day, then came home and amused himself by yelling at and beating her. Knowing how she hated to see living things killed, he once forced her to go with him to the slaughterhouse to watch him work. On the day of the crime, he had returned home with a butcher knife and a scowl so menacing that she had feared for her own safety. Toward dawn, after making sure he was fast asleep, she cut him up like a pig, just as she had seen him do at the slaughterhouse. In her own mind this deed also served to avenge the deaths of the countless poor animals that had met their end at his hand.

Chen Lin Shi's confession defies reason and logic, for, since ancient times, a

murder of this sort has always been the result of an adulterous affair. We urge the authorities to launch a thorough investigation to determine the identity and precise role of the secret lover in this case... the killing of a man by his wife is a moral issue that affects all of society...[the] authorities must treat this case with the utmost severity in order to stem the public outcry and restore healthy social tendencies. (3)⁴²

問何以殺夫，陳林市回答，丈夫對她太凶狠殘暴，每日喝酒賭博，回來打罵她作樂。知道她害怕見人殺生，還情帶她至屠場觀其殺豬。事發之日，丈夫帶回來一把屠刀，狀極凶惡，恐不利於她，天亮俟丈夫熟睡後，她即以所見的屠宰方法，將丈夫像殺豬一樣的支解了。想他一生殘害豬隻不計其數，也算替生靈報仇。

按陳林市供詞，於情於理皆不合。自古以來，有道無奸不成殺，陳林市之殺夫，必有奸夫在後指使，有待有關當局嚴查。……謀殺親夫乃是道德問題……還待當局嚴加辦理此案，以息輿論，以匡社會風氣。(75-6)⁴³

The anonymous reporter accuses Lin Shi of murdering her husband in an authoritative, “logical,” and “rational” tone of voice. A second news report says that despite lacking proof of any infidelity, Lin has been sentenced to death for murdering her husband. Bound and placed on the back of a truck, Lin is publicly exhibited as a stern warning against immorality. Through the news reports, the frame narrator stresses the necessity of the parade and attributes the decline in womanly virtues to feminist influences from the West.

Whereas the frame narrator delineates the event in an epistemological tone—what is publicly known about the event—the main text that follows narrates the female protagonist’s story in an ontological sense, explaining who and what she really is. As opposed to the prologue, the internal narrator gradually converts Lin’s image from a “debauched” woman who should be severely punished into an exploited and cruelly

treated victim of patriarchy.

The story is set in Lugang, Li Ang's hometown, in the 1930s when Taiwan was under Japanese colonial rule. Lin and her mother, a plain rural woman, were forced to roam the streets after Lin's father died when she was only nine years old. Presuming that Lin's mother would remarry, her uncle dispossessed Lin and her mother of the tile-roofed house that was their only possession. One day Lin's mother was caught "having sex" with a stray soldier while simultaneously chewing greedily on the rice balls which were provided by the soldier in return for the sex.

In the bright moonlight, Lin Shi saw the soldier. He was naked from the waist down, except for a piece of gray legging that was draped loosely around his ankle. Pinned beneath him was her mother, whose face, whose haggard face, was flushed bright red and all aglow with a greedy light.

She was chewing on one rice ball and clutching another in her hand. Low moaning sounds escaped from her mouth, which was stuffed with food. Half-eaten grains of white rice, mixed with saliva, dribbled down the side of her face, onto her neck, and down her shirtfront. (7)

林市清楚看到阿母身上壓著的那軍服男子，他的下半身衣褲俱退盡，只剩下一截零散的灰色綁腿堆在腳踝處。然後林市看到被壓的阿母，阿母的那張臉，衰瘦臉上有著鮮明的紅豔顏色及貪婪的煥發神情。

阿母嘴裡正啃著一個白飯糰，手上還抓著一團。已狠狠的塞滿白飯的嘴巴，隨著阿母唧唧哼哼的出聲，嚼過的白顏色米粒混著口水，滴淌滿半邊面頰，還順勢流到脖子及衣襟。(78-79)

In this near "rape" scene of the mother, the young Lin Shi witnessed a starving woman indulging completely in the quenching of hunger while trading her body for food in an unabashed manner. Without any knowledge of how her mother was punished by her clansmen for her alleged adultery, Lin never saw her mother again and was then sent to

live as a servant in the tile-roofed house with her uncle's family. A few years later, to her uncle's advantage, Lin was traded off in marriage to Chen Jiangshui—a pig butcher with an unsavory reputation. With a destructive nature, Chen uses food and violence to control Lin in order to satisfy his own sexual desires and his will to dominate. On the wedding night, starved and exhausted, Lin utters painful screams when her drunken husband brutally claims his “conjugal privilege.” After his savage desire is quenched, Chen rouses the already fainting Lin with wine, and fetches her a big piece of pork.

Chen Jiangshui went into the living room and came back with a big piece of pork, dripping with fat, which he stuffed into her mouth, skin and all. With bloated cheeks, she chewed on the pork, making squishing noises as fat oozed out the corners of her mouth and dribbled down in rivulets to her chin and neck, all greasy and wet. Just then her tears finally brimmed over and ran down her face, sending a chill through her. (13)

陳江水到廳裡取來一大塊帶皮帶油的豬肉，往林市嘴裡塞，林市滿滿一嘴的嚼吃豬肉，噉吱吱出聲，肥油還溢出嘴角，串串延滴到下顎、脖子處，油濕膩膩。這時，眼淚也才溢出眼眶，一滾到髮際，方是一陣寒涼。(84)

After the wedding day, the marital relationship for Lin is nothing but a ritualistic exchange of sex and food. Unable to avoid or resist her husband's sadistic violence in bed, Lin can only cry out in pain. However, her painful howling only makes Chen more covetous than ever. He has set a pattern of wanting her when he returns from the slaughterhouse in the morning. In order to survive, Lin has to endure his constant sexual assaults as on the days he wants her he always comes home with plenty of food. After his sexual violation comes to an end, Lin can get to enjoy the food while the physical pain subsides.

Through her next-door neighbour, Auntie Ahwang, Lin associates herself with a group of neighbourhood women and gradually learns the social code of womanly conduct. When washing clothes by the well, Lin always enjoys listening to the other women exchanging gossip and information, although she seldom participates in the conversations. However, one day, Lin overhears Auntie Ahwang talking about her with other neighbours:

“A person doesn’t have to moan and groan all the time to try to make people believe she’s having a good time. It’s people like that who give all women a bad name. But I guess I’m just wasting my breath talking about her.” (101)

「那裏要每回唉唉大小聲叫，騙人不知以為有多爽，這種查某，敗壞我們女人的名聲，說伊還浪費我的嘴舌。」 (164)

Auntie Ahwang continues to say that Lin, as licentious as her mother who was caught committing adultery, shamelessly and greedily demands sex day and night and never gets enough. Totally shocked by Auntie Ahwang’s vicious remarks behind her back, Lin decides that from then on no matter how cruelly her husband treats her during their intercourse, she will keep quiet. However, her resistance of silence irritates her husband who can only be satisfied when she responds by forceful moaning and groaning. Dissatisfied, her husband only resorts to more intensive and aggressive abuses. He forbids Lin any contact with the neighbours, who he thinks have a bad influence on her, and stops bringing home any food for her. He has taken to not coming home for several days in a row, either going gambling or staying with Golden Flower, a prostitute whom he used to visit frequently before getting married. Forced to seek economic independence, Lin uses the deflowering money received from her husband to buy a brood of ducklings, hoping to sell duck eggs. No sooner does her husband discover her venture than he brutally

dismembers the ducklings with his butcher knife. Knowing that Lin is afraid of blood, Chen forces her to work in the slaughterhouse cleaning the intestines. Beholding the grotesque scene, Lin feels as if she is in hell:

....In the dim yellow light she saw the sharp gleaming knife in his hand as it plunged into the gullet of a pig, followed by a prolonged raspy squeal and a great deal of blood gushing out of a wound. The scenario was repeated over and over again.... Lin Shi watched Chen Jiangshui trace a downward motion with his knife—miraculously, immaculately, without even a trickle of bloody liquid, the abdomen of one of the pigs parted, and from inside, a mass of pulsating gray innards of varying thickness spilled out along with some dark-coloured organs. It was such a departure from what she had imagined, so devoid of the blood she had expected to see, that she was more convinced than ever that she was caught up in a dream.

But then Chen Jiangshi came walking up to her with an armful of organs and intestines, which he thrust toward her with out saying a word. Automatically, she reached out and took them from him. They were soft and sticky to the touch, and still quite warm.

The spongy texture, the heavy bulk, the feeling of warmth, the suffocating stench that assailed her nose—Lin Shi suddenly comprehended the fact that this was not a dream. As the realization began to sink in, her mind became crowded with gushing blood and long, piercing screams, making the whole scene all too real. Looking down, she saw that she was holding a wriggling mass of intestines in her arms, one long coil of which had spilled out of her embrace and was dangling in midair.

With an agonizing scream, she keeled over backwards before she even had time to toss away the things in her arms; her eyes rolled back in her head and a white froth began drooling from her mouth. (134-5)

.....在黃昏的燈光下手上白晃晃的尖刀一刀插入豬仔的喉口，豬仔嘶軋的長聲尖叫混著大股湧出來的凝紅色鮮血，一再重複又重複。.....林市看到陳江水一刀劃下，神奇、乾淨不沾一絲血

水的打開豬仔的肚膛，擁擠出大量灰白色尚蠕動的粗細腸子，還有混雜其中深顏色的內臟。由於與想像中全然不同的不帶一滴鮮血，林市更相信自己仍置身夢中。

可是陳江水卻抱著整整一懷抱的一堆內臟與腸子朝著走來，什麼也不曾說的推向她，本能中林市伸出手去接，那堆腸肚觸著手臂，柔柔軟軟極為黏膩，而且仍十分溫熱。

……林市恍然醒覺這一切都不是夢，在會意到真實的一剎，適才那股噴湧出來的鮮血與嘶聲長叫，全以無比真實的意義湧聚過來，林市低下頭，看到懷中抱著似乎尚在蠕動的腸子有一截已流落到手臂外，虛空的懸著。

林市慘叫一聲，來不及將懷裡抱的東西丟出去，向後直挺挺的倒下去，眼睛向上吊，嘴裡汨汨的不斷流出白色泡沫。(194-195)

Tormented by the bloody scene, Lin is so traumatized that she passes out and has to be taken home on a two-wheeled barrow that is used to transport slaughtered pigs. Shortly before noon on the same day, however, people see Lin begging for money to offer sacrifice to her mother. With the papier-mâché effigies and food as sacrificial offerings, she prays on her knees before the altar.⁴⁴ Chen is furious when he spots her burning effigies at home. He curses viciously at Lin and her mother while brutally beating her. Then he drags her into the bedroom, takes out his butcher knife, which he carries with him at all times, and brandishes it under her nose to make her scream. As always, he falls asleep in no time with the gleaming butcher knife laid on the bed next to his hand.

Still in a trance, Lin feels herself being drawn by the butcher's knife that is gleaming in the pale moonbeam. She grips the butcher knife and stabs downwards, recalling what she had been forced to behold at the slaughterhouse. She slaughters her husband in the way he slaughters the pigs (she thinks she is killing a pig, and keeps telling herself: "it must be a dream"⁴⁵). While she is wielding the knife, many memories suddenly flash into view: the face of the soldier who "raped" her mother, a squealing, struggling pig with a

butcher knife buried at an angle in its gullet, and those nightmares that had been haunting her for a long time. It is as if all the suffering, torment, and nightmares are hacked away by the knife. Finally, she can have a dreamless and tranquil sleep.

As the first person to witness the bloody scene and report to the police, Auntie Ahwang is interviewed by the authorities. The story ends with Auntie Ahwang's malicious comment on the case according to her "first-hand" information. She interprets Lin's cries of pain as cries of sexual pleasure, and reports all kinds of distortions about Lin's life. Echoing the prevalent view in society, as sternly and authoritatively presented in the news reports in the prologue, Auntie Ahwang accuses Lin of committing adultery, just like her "sinful" mother, as there is no other possible motive for killing her husband. Or is there?

Man-slaughtering as Resistance and Revolution

Throughout the story, the female protagonist is defined by a language that is foreign to her. We seem to hear Lin Shi's voice in her confession in the first news report. However, as soon as she articulates something, her voice is encoded into the language that serves patriarchy; i.e. her confession becomes irrational and unreliable. The narrative in the news reports prior to the main text suggests that before her story is told, the female protagonist has already been found guilty by the official and authoritarian language that represents the patriarchal paradigms of power. As Sandra Gilbert and Susan Gubar write:

As a creation "penned" by man, moreover, woman has been "penned up" or "penned in." As a sort of "sentence" man has spoken, she has herself been "sentenced": fated, jailed, for he has both "indited" her and "indicted" her. As a thought he has "framed," she has been both "framed" (enclosed) in his texts, glyphs,

graphics, and “framed up” (found guilty, found wanting) in his cosmologies.⁴⁶

Without solid evidence the news report has already enclosed Lin Shi and imposed a heavy sentence on her. Nonetheless, the injustice of the passages and the unconvincing claims in the two news reports are rather apparent. In fact, through a formal and sanctimonious tone, Li Ang intends to satirize the male moralists prevailing in the media. In this parody the reader can easily detect the deliberate ironies contained in these contradictory, self-justifying and unconvincing assertions presented in the news reports. As Mikhail Bakhtin characterizes it, parody is a “hostile,” “opposing” voice that can penetrate another discourse with an ulterior intention. This voice inevitably violates the other’s voice and appropriates its materials for a new use.⁴⁷ By bracketing the ironies and sarcasm presented in the news reports, not only is the weight of the authoritative voice diminished, but the much urged “justice” is undermined.

Besides the news reports and the main text, there is an appendix inserted by the author. In the appendix Li Ang provides the initial document that had inspired her before she embarked upon writing the novel, and explains how she transformed a murder case that actually occurred in Shanghai into a fictionalized story of old Taiwanese society. According to the document, Chan Chou Shi, a Shanghai woman who had long been abused by her alcoholic, sadistic, and promiscuous husband, slaughtered and dismembered him, cutting him into eight pieces. On top of a death sentence, Chan, like Lin in the story, was sentenced to be exhibited on a truck to the gaze of the derisive and censoring public, as much a stern warning to other women as a punishment for the convicted. However, due to the Chinese victory in Japan’s war with China (1931-45) at the end of World War Two, Chan was granted a general amnesty prior to her execution.

With the insertion of this appendix, structurally balancing the fictional news reports in the beginning, Li not only creates a sense of cyclicity, suggesting women's history of being driven crazy by patriarchal tyranny, but also implies the possibility of exonerating Lin from any punishment. Unfortunately, the inserted appendix is omitted in the English translation.⁴⁸ If one espouses the Derridian view that the appendix is an inseparable part of a text, then the omission of the appendix in the translated version will inevitably lead to a misrepresentation of Li's novel, one way or the other. Bakhtin also suggests that modern literary texts are distinctively polyphonic and capable of articulating a number of positions, none of which is exclusively privileged by the author. In this work, the news reports, the internal story, and the appendix speak three different views of the narrative; to excise any of them drastically changes the overall text. In this case the appendix is intended to present a view in opposition to the authoritative "mainstream" patriarchal interpretation of the event provided by the fictional news reports at the beginning of the story.

Through the narrative of the main text, the reader comes to realize that the female protagonist, instead of being an evil woman, is in fact a silent victim in a patriarchal rural village. Being silent is Lin's only frail defence against the patriarchal discourse. There are several occasions on which she attempts to speak out but her voice is muted and ignored. The first occasion is before her marriage when she is frightened by the sight of her initial menstrual blood and when she is haunted by a recurring dream full of symbols of sex and violence. In an attempt to rationalize the dream, Lin repeats it over and over to her neighbours. However, there is no audience for her to speak to; people simply avoid her whenever she tries to talk about it. For lack of a listener, Lin is exiled to the realm of

silence, becoming ever more taciturn and absentminded. Ironically, her socially estranged silence and her vacant gaze at men are capriciously interpreted by the village people as the moony expression of "lovesickness," and that gives her uncle an excuse to marry her off.

Lin Shi is trapped in an enclosed, exclusive, suffocating, male-centered "dystopia" in which various visible or invisible controls are imposed upon her through clan rules, social customs, superstition, and gossip.⁴⁹ The elders of the Lin clan expel Lin's mother from society in the name of "virtue"; Chen Jiangshui, himself an outcast due to his abject occupation, gains power over his wife by being a breadwinner and provider of sustenance. Regardless of gender, however, all those who have internalized patriarchal values take part in imprisoning and silencing Lin. This is why Lin's painful cries during her husband's brutal violation are interpreted as lascivious screams by Auntie Ahwang. Just like the clansmen who falsely interpreted the hungry look in Lin's mother's eyes as a lustful craving, Lin's painful moanings are unfairly regarded as incontinent cries of orgasmic ecstasy. Powerless to overturn Auntie Ahwang's malicious slanders, Lin is again reduced to her absolute silence. No matter how unbearable her husband's sexual assaults are, she stifles her moans as remaining silent becomes the only way to indicate her innocence. That is, even her painful screams, her uninhibited, instinctual struggle against phallocentrism and violence, are ruthlessly suppressed into silence. Auntie Ahwang who valorizes the phallocentric values and observes the "rules of virtues," such as women's obedience to their husbands and female chastity, is endowed with the power of "telling the truth" and collaborates in submitting other women to the whims of patriarchy. When Lin came across Auntie Ahwang who just crept off after peeping in on Chen performing

sex on her, Lin saw in Auntie Ahwang's eyes "the look in Chen Jiangshui's eyes" whenever he sexually assaulted her (43). Uncannily, Auntie Ahwang's gaze mirrors the male gaze, exemplifying her desire for phallic control. In particular, her vicarious pleasure in gazing at Chen's sexual torture of Lin constitutes a kind of voyeurism that suggests male scopophilia—the love of peeping. Like her once-bound disfigured feet, Auntie Ahwang's mind has been distorted by the phallocentrism that is steadfastly rooted in her society.⁵⁰

In the main text, Li Ang uses symbols to flesh out her characters and help the plot unfold. For instance, the image of Lin as a powerless victim is often associated with a dehumanized puppet and a helpless animal. As she is malnourished, her appearance is described as lanky and plain, like a doll carved out of a piece of wood. Lacking experiences of affection, joy and any knowledge of positive sexuality, she is often portrayed as a sex object or a frightened animal.

Her husband is also portrayed in animal images, but certainly not as a frightened animal. With small beady eyes that are sunk deep into a swelling of flesh around the sockets, so-called "pig-eyes," his name, too, has become associated with the pigs: "Pig-Butcher Chen" (殺豬仔陳, 14; 83). Although this signifies Chen's grossness and brute animality throughout most of the text, it also foreshadows his gruesome death, slaughtered like a pig.

Images and metaphors of blood are frequent throughout the story as well. Having been a butcher for almost forty years, Chen slaughters pigs and bleeds them to death daily. The images and colour of blood in the slaughterhouse signify violence, brutality, and death. In her lifetime Lin witnesses several bloody scenes: her initial menstrual blood, the

bleeding caused by her husband's brutal sexual abuses from the time of the wedding night, and the bloody scene she is forced to behold at the slaughterhouse. For Lin, the image of blood is inevitably connected with her humiliation, subjugation, and victimization. The recurring images of bloody pillars that have been haunting Lin for years in her dreams can best illustrate this point:

Several pillars, so tall they impale the clouds, disappearing into a pitch darkness that stretches on endlessly. Suddenly, a rumble of thunder, moving inexorably nearer and nearer. Then a loud boom. Not a trace of flames anywhere, yet the pillars become instantly charred, without so much as wobbling. Finally, after the longest time, dark red blood begins to seep from the cracks in the blackened pillars. (10)

接下來的夢境，是幾隻高得直聳入雲的大柱子，直插入一片墨色的漆黑裏不知所終，突然間，一陣雷鳴由遠而近，轟轟直來，接著轟隆大響，不見火焰燃燒，那些柱子片時裏全成焦黑，卻仍直挺挺的挺立在那裏，許久許久，才有濃紅顏色的血，從焦黑的柱子裂縫，逐漸的滲了出來。(82)

The image of the pillars symbolizes Lin's unresolved fear, anxiety, and sexual repression from past traumatic experiences.⁵¹ When her mother had been caught committing "adultery" in the ancestral hall, she had been tied to a pillar when awaiting the punishment to be inflicted on her by her clansmen. These erect pillars are analogous to the phallic shape, and imply the male principle. For Lin, therefore, the pillars resemble the mores of patriarchy and a place where only men have the right to speak.

The Japanese colonial rule in Taiwan was patriarchal in nature. In order to exercise tight and effective control over the Taiwanese inhabitants, the Japanese colonial government implemented the *hokō* 保甲 system in 1903. This mutual household

surveillance system featured a two-level structure consisting of *ho* and smaller *kō* household groupings which were units operated under the informal leadership of unpaid *ho* and *kō* male heads selected by the household heads within each grouping.⁵² The constituent households were responsible for carrying out duties and services assigned by the police. Furthermore, by establishing household registries and keeping them constantly updated, local police stations maintained constant surveillance over the Taiwanese people. Although the inferior position of women in family and society was a general phenomenon in Chinese/Taiwanese society, these policies officially and further enhanced the power and authority of men, especially the head of the household.

When Lin's mother had had sex with the soldier in exchange for food, Taiwan was already under the power of the Japanese colonial government; the soldier is thus implicated with the patriarchal colonizing power. The image of the pillars, which haunts Lin, is therefore linked, albeit indirectly, with the Japanese colonizers, too. In the story, the pillars that remain erect despite the thunder suggest the empowered male authority, the male's penetration into the female's body, and the steadfastness of patriarchy. Thus the image of the black bloody pillars symbolizes the male-centered discourse that threatens to suffocate Lin's body and soul.

Another shocking equivalency in the novel is that killing pigs and sexual intercourse are uncannily linked by recurring overlapping metaphors.⁵³ Lin's screams of pain on the wedding night sound like "the bleating of ghostly pigs" (13). The next morning, one of Chen's co-workers asks him if his bride, on the wedding night, squealed like a bound pig waiting to be butchered. As a reply, Chen raises his pointed knife, a metaphorical penis, menacingly plunging it into the flesh of the pig. Being a professional butcher, Chen is

very proud of his slaughtering skill.

As the knife was withdrawn and the blood spurted forth, he was infused with an incomparable sense of satisfaction. It was as though the hot stream coursing through his body was converted into a thick, sticky white fluid spurting into the shadowy depths of a woman at the climax of a series of high-speed thrusts. To Chen Jiangshui, the spurting of blood and the ejaculation of semen had the same orgasmic effect. (75)

這就是陳江水的時刻了，當尖刀抽離、血液冒出，懷藏的是一份至高的滿足，就像在高速衝擊的速度下，將體內奔流的一股熱流，化作白色的濃稠黏液，噴灑入女性陰暗的最深處，對陳江水來說，那飛爆出來的血液與精子，原具有幾近相同的快感作用。(139)

The butcher's knife, representing the essence of phallic control and reappearing on the marital bed, is associated with blood: "Next to the spots of blood lay an even more menacing object—a shiny, long, sharp blade, Chen Jiangshui's butcher knife, which he had casually set down before climbing into bed" (血塊旁赫然是尖長的一把明晃晃長刀，是陳江水臨上床時隨手擱置的豬刀。20-21; 90). The squealing of struggling pigs is equated to Lin's screams of pain in the bed; the blood of pigs represents Lin's blood caused by the butcher's violent sexual assault. Chen's indulgence in his taste for conquering and dominating women is related to the fact that he enjoys full control over handling the pigs. Chen's slaughtering pigs is associated with the violent victimization of the female bodies. Indeed, Lin is essentially equivalent to a pig whose helplessness provides Chen the pleasant sensation of male dominance.

It is very important to point out the economic nature of women's oppression under men. Lin has been traded like a sow to Chen by her uncle in exchange for a portion of meat Chen brings to her uncle every ten days. Like the prostitute in Kanai Mieko's

“Rotting Meat,” Lin is a commodity that is exchangeable and is exchanged between men. As Irigaray points out, “Women are marked phallically by their fathers, husbands, procurers. The stamp(ing) determines their value in sexual commerce.”⁵⁴ The scene in which Lin’s mother is having sex with the soldier and that in which Lin is having sex on her wedding night are equivalent. The redundant images of a mouthful of food, saliva dripping down, and eating while half-naked in both scenes underscores the resonance of the scenes. In essence, Lin’s marriage is a repetition of her mother’s forced prostitution. The similar nature between marriage and prostitution is further allegorized when Chen tosses *kaibao chien* 開苞錢 (defloration money) to Lin on the wedding night, similar to a brothel’s custom in Chinese society where a virgin prostitute would always receive a special payment from her first customer. With the defloration money, Lin is tagged with a price on her flesh and her existence as a woman is negated.

The enclosed and suffocating patriarchal dystopia is challenged and subverted when Lin takes over her husband’s knife—a symbol of phallic power. Through slaughtering and dismembering her husband’s body, she hacks through the Symbolic order, reversing the existing relationship between male and female, the dominant and the silenced. Lin’s act of killing, carried out in a dream-like, gothic atmosphere, releases the oppressed feminine into the semiotic order.⁵⁵ In the space of the semiotic prevails the primeval power of the feminine that relates to the natural cycle of the moon, and the “irrational” and “illogical,” according to Kristeva. Lin becomes able to transgress the Symbolic order and then to escape (if only temporarily) from the prison of isolated identity, language, and gender. In such an overwhelming state of wildness, what has been repressed from consciousness and been excluded from cultural or linguistic representation is now able to flow again. In

other words, Lin's wild psyche that has long been denied and concealed inside her unconscious finally explodes, and is reclaimed in a surrealistic stream of consciousness. When she kills her husband, a chaotic state arises, if only for a brief moment, to indicate not only a subversion of the Symbolic order but a return to the semiotic space where the repressed female instincts explode. By turning Chen into a pig and slaughtering him in the way he does pigs, Lin symbolically rejects the patriarchy and declares her feminine power in a dream-like state of mind.

Finally, it is worth noting that when Lin scoops out and hacks at Chen's intestines, she actually thinks she is slashing numerous pig's tongues. In a sense, the act of slicing the pig's tongues symbolizes her resisting the harmful gossip of the village women who have internalized patriarchal values and tried to vent their resentment and jealousy on other females. Instead of helping Lin, they are complicitous in estranging Lin from the community and society. As if reminiscent of her mother's controversial incident, Lin, after the dream-like killing, hungrily devours a bowl of rice that had been placed on the altar as an offering to the ancestors and then falls asleep peacefully. Her post-killing satisfaction from food and peaceful sleep mitigates the horror of the killing, and further undermines patriarchal domination in the forms of superstition, ancestral worship, and sexual exploitation.

Rebellion and Subversion: Kanai Mieko versus Li Ang

Kanai Mieko's "Rotting Meat" and Li Ang's *The Butcher's Wife* are two graphically sanguine works that signify the disruption and subversion of patriarchal domination. Both works deal with subtle issues of sexuality, power and the textual subversion of patriarchal

discourse.

“Rotting Meat” has almost no plot, and its setting and style are fantastic, other-worldly. Nonetheless, the brutal realities of pig slaughtering, prostitution, and male sexual abuse of women are portrayed using vivid imagery primarily from the domains of scent and touch. The prostitute in “Rotting Meat” does not view herself as having been oppressed, but the reader can hardly envy her current state: trapped in a wardrobe saturated with the smell of rotting meat. In contrast, *The Butcher’s Wife* has a complicated plot yet is written in a rather straightforward and realistic way. The dark dystopian world in *The Butcher’s Wife* clearly portrays the social oppression and sexual brutalization of the female protagonist. Li dramatically unfolds inhuman practices with regard to sex and economic power—such as arranged marriage, control of food, and sexual abuse—so as to clearly reveal the effects of the phallogentric world and to shock the reader into awareness. Like the prostitute in “Rotting Meat,” Lin Shi (and her mother as well) has to trade the sexual use of her body for food. Also, in both stories, the female protagonists are at first equated with pigs, which are slaughtered to provide food for humans (that is, men, and those who go along with patriarchal discourse). Both women are originally portrayed as meat to be “killed” and consumed whereas the men in their lives, butchers, are portrayed as the rightful “killers” and consumers. However, at the end of these two stories, this paradigm is inverted, as both butchers end up being equated with pigs and killed (though not consumed).

In *The Butcher’s Wife*, Lin’s triumph is only temporary because in the end she is sentenced to death as a husband-killing murderer. Some critics argue that even up to the moment of gripping the knife, Lin has not reached any self-awareness; therefore, rather

than a revolt against patriarchy, Lin's killing is merely a total collapse.⁵⁶ However, as Li Ang has asserted, it is unrealistic for an illiterate peasant like Lin to be aware of her oppression and rebellion; therefore, Lin's killing has to take place in a dream-like state.⁵⁷ But the story does not depict Lin as completely passive and unaware of her situation. As we have seen, Lin tries twice to seek economic independence, which may allow her to improve her circumstances, but in vain. Considering the difficulty for women to throw off patriarchal social constraints, it is no surprise that Lin's method of killing her husband is so full of unconscious symbolism.

In contrast to *The Butcher's Wife*, which concluded with a punishment for the female protagonist's act of rebellion against patriarchal society, there is no punishment of any sort rendered for the prostitute in "Rotting Meat." Unlike Lin, a peasant woman who does not have the sense of self and autonomy and whose rebellion is rather more on a subconscious level, the prostitute in "Rotting Meat" is economically independent and self-conscious. However, the fact remains that she hardly can be considered a victor as she is discovered isolated in the closet with a lump of rotting meat, and her once prosperous career has been ruined.

Instead of being confined by a simplistic power paradigm between men and women (men are hunters/victimizers, women are food/victims), Kanai and Li introduce a new binary paradigm—men can be eaten/passive and women can eat/be active. Nonetheless, it is important to note that reversing women's status from the oppressed to the oppressor would be an oversimplification of the complexities of power and power relations; the binary trap would still remain, in spite of the subversion and reversal. And although these stories do narrate such a reversal of the normal power paradigms, they do not suggest that

this will bring happiness to specific people or lasting change to society. Both stories are composed of many shocking sexual, violent, grotesque, and bloody scenes. However, it is imperative to recognize that it is not the writers' intentions to produce erotic novels or to inspire women to rebel with violence. Rather, I would argue that both writers intend to expose the absurdities and dangers arising from the normal male-centered power paradigms, in particular the harm done to women's bodies and subjectivity. The act of man-slaughtering in both stories is clearly a symbolic protest and rebellion against patriarchal domination. Through subversion and reversion, Kanai and Li provide the reader a chance to soberly ponder the much broader issue of gender identity.

In these two works, the issues of colonial dominance, race or nation are not explicitly raised. There is not even any indication in Kanai's story that it is necessarily set in Japan. But the kind of society depicted and critiqued by Kanai in this and other works from the 1970s is one still heavily influenced by Japanese prewar models of gender relations—as was the case in Japanese society many decades after the end of the war. Born and raised in the postwar period, Kanai has the liberty to critique gender structures freely, unlike some of her predecessors. By creating shocking images of woman that are contrary to the conventional gender roles assigned by the national narrative, Kanai unmask the abusive and absurd natures of gendered power paradigms and challenges the arbitrarily prescribed gender roles that continue to support the national narrative on into the postwar period.

On the other hand, produced under the spectre of martial law, Li's work did not have much room for challenging the authoritative national narrative. Set in the past, when Taiwan was under the control of a very different government (Japan), *The Butcher's Wife*

could get away with narrating a critique of patriarchal power structures. But even if she was not hit with actual government censorship for this work, Li Ang has been severely criticized by the protectors of the status quo social mores, showing that her critique of patriarchy in the past still resonates deeply with readers in the present. It was not until martial law was lifted that writers like Li Ang could investigate the intersection of various networks of gender, race, and nation, free from concerns about government intervention. In the following chapters, however, we will see more fully the ways that issues of race, nation, and colonial status are tied up with literary explorations of gendered identity.

Notes

¹ Tanizaki Jun'ichirō 谷崎潤一郎 (1886-1965) was one of the most prominent writers of modern Japanese literature, and to this day remains one of the most acclaimed Japanese novelists. While most of his works are highly sensual in nature, some focus particularly on explicit eroticism; all are laced with wit and ironic sophistication.

² Cited in Kitada Sachie's 北田幸恵 "Usagi" 兎, in *Tanpen josei bungaku: Gendai* 短編女性文学, eds. Imai Yasuko, Yabu Teiko, and Watanabe Sumiko (Tokyo: Ōfūsha, 1993), p. 153.

³ Ibid., p. 153.

⁴ Ishikawa Jun 石川淳 (1899-1987) was a well-known Japanese novelist, highly praised for his intellectual acumen, sophistication and urban artistic interests. He was sometimes likened to France's André Gide. He and Sakaguchi Ango 坂口安吾 (1906-1955) were considered members of the *burai-ha* 無頼派 (the decadents) group, because of their shared nihilism and opposition to authority.

⁵ For information on Kanai Mieko's biographical background, I have consulted Kitada Sachie "Usagi," in *Gendai josei bungaku jiten*, eds. Muramatsu Sadataka and Watanabe Sumiko (Tokyo: Tōkyōdō, 1990), and *Japanese Women Writers: A Bio-critical Sourcebook*, ed. Chieko I. Mulhern (Westport CT: Greenwood Press, 1994).

⁶ Mary A. Knighton, "Kanai Mieko," in *The Columbia Companion to Modern East Asian*

-
- Literature*, ed. Joshua Mostow (New York: Columbia University Press, 2003), p. 242.
- ⁷ Sharalyn Orbaugh, "Arguing with the Real: Kanai Mieko," in *Ōe and Beyond: Fiction in Contemporary Japan*, eds. Stephen Snyder and Philip Gabriel (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 1999), p. 246.
- ⁸ Ōoka Shōhei 大岡昇平 (1909-1988) was a famous poet, novelist, literary critic, and translator of French literature. Belonging to the group of postwar writers, Ōoka wrote about his own war experiences at home and abroad. He regarded war as the supreme evil, and felt obligated to portray its horror to the last detail.
- ⁹ See Kitada "Usagi," in *Tanpen josei bungaku: Gendai*, and Orbaugh "The Body in Contemporary Japanese Women's Fiction," in *The Woman's Hand: Gender and Theory in Japanese Women's Writing* (California: Stanford University Press, 1996), pp. 119-164.
- ¹⁰ Sharalyn Orbaugh, "Arguing with the Real: Kanai Mieko," pp. 250-2. The phrase "arguing with the real" comes from the title of a chapter in Judith Butler's *Bodies That Matter: On the Discursive Limits of "Sex"* (New York and London: Routledge, 1993).
- ¹¹ Masculine gender theory as a separate enterprise, which has focused largely on social, literary, and historical accounts of the construction of male gender identities, is beyond the scope of my discussion here.
- ¹² Judith Butler, *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity*, 2nd ed. (New York, 1999), p. 10.
- ¹³ Toril Moi, *Sexual/Textual Politics: Feminist Literary Theory* (London and New York: Routledge, 1985), p. 104.
- ¹⁴ See Luce Irigaray *Speculum of the Other Woman*, trans. Gillian Gill (Ithaca: Cornell UP, 1985), and "This Sex which is Not One," trans. Claudia Reeder, in *The Second Wave: A Reader in Feminist Theory*, ed. Linda Nicholson (New York and London: Routledge, 1997), pp. 323-329.
- ¹⁵ Irigaray, "This Sex Which Is Not One," p. 323.
- ¹⁶ Irigaray, "Psychoanalytic Theory: Another Look," in *This Sex Which Is Not One*, p. 35.
- ¹⁷ Sigmund Freud, "Some Psychological Consequences of the Anatomical Distinction between the Sexes" in *Sexuality and the Psychology of Love*, ed. Philip Rieff. (New York: Collier Books, 1963), p. 187.
- ¹⁸ Irigaray, "This Sex Which Is Not One," p. 325.
- ¹⁹ Judith Butler, *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity* (New York and London: Routledge, 1999), p.174.
- ²⁰ *Ibid.*, p.175.
- ²¹ Kanai Mieko 金井美恵子, "Rotting Meat" ("Funiku"). Trans. by Mary Knighton. *Fictional International* vol.29 (1997): 110.
- ²² Kanai Mieko, "Funiku" 腐肉(1972), in *Chikuma bungaku taikei* 筑摩文学大系, vol. 93.

(Tokyo: Chikuma Shobō, n.d.), p. 150.

- ²³ "Rotting Meat" is one of the nine short stories Kanai has written in the early 1970s. With discrete narrative, each of the stories is linked to the others through certain similarities.
- ²⁴ Sharalyn Orbaugh, "The Body in Contemporary Japanese Women's Fiction," in *The Woman's Hand: Gender and Theory in Japanese Women's Writing*, eds. Paul Schalow and Janet Walker (Stanford, California: Stanford UP, 1996), p. 159 f21.
- ²⁵ Irigaray, "Any Theory of the 'Subject' Has Always Been Appropriated by the 'Masculine'," *Speculum of the Other Woman* (Ithaca, New York: Cornell University Press, 1985), p. 133.
- ²⁶ Gayle Rubin, "The Traffic in Women" in *Toward an Anthropology of Women* ed. Rayna R. Reiter, (New York: Monthly Review Press, 1975).
- ²⁷ Butler, *Gender Trouble*.
- ²⁸ Orbaugh, "The Body in Contemporary Japanese Women's Fiction," p. 153.
- ²⁹ For information on Li Ang's biographic background, I have consulted Hong Shanhui's 洪珊慧, "Li Ang xiaoshuo yanjiu" 李昂小說研究, M. A. Thesis (National Tsing Hua University, 2000), Jiang Baochai's 江寶釵, "'Xiandai wenxue' nüxing xiaoshuojia: cong yige zhuti chufa" 現代文學'女性小說家：從一個主體出發, Ph.D. Thesis (National Taiwan Normal University, 1994), and Howard Goldblatt's, "Sex and Society: The Fiction of Li Ang," in *Worlds Apart: Recent Chinese Writing and Its Audiences*, ed. Goldblatt (Armonk, N.Y. and London: M.E. Sharpe, 1990), pp. 150-65.
- ³⁰ Li Ang, "Protest of a Woman Author against Reckless Accusations: Another Self-Interview, This Time from Taipei," in *Modern Chinese Writers Self-Portrayals*, ed. Helmut Martin and Jeffery Kinkley. (N.Y.; London: An East Gate Book, 1992), p. 256.
- ³¹ Elaine Showalter, *A Literature of Their Own: British Women Novelists from Bronte to Lessing* (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1999), p. 13.
- ³² Ying-Ying Chien, "Women Crossing the Wild Zone: Sexual/Textual Politics in the Fiction of Ding Ling and Li Ang," *Fu Jen Studies* vol. 28 (Feb. 1995): p. 8.
- ³³ Li, "Protest of a Woman Author against Reckless Accusations," p. 256.
- ³⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 256.
- ³⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 258.
- ³⁶ Howard Goldblatt, "Sex and Society: The Fiction of Li Ang," p. 150.
- ³⁷ Sung-sheng Yvonne Chang, *Modernism and the Nativist Resistance: Contemporary Chinese Fiction from Taiwan*, (Durham: Duke University Press, 1993), p. 181.
- ³⁸ Ying-Ying Chien, "Deconstructing Patriarchy/Reconstructing Womanhood: Feminist Readings of Multicultural Women's Murder Fiction," *Tamkang Review* 26, nos. 1, 2 (Autumn & Winter 1995): p. 268.

- ³⁹ Li Ang, *The Butcher's Wife* (Sha-Fu 殺夫), in *The Butcher's Wife and Other Stories*, trans. and ed. by Howard Goldblatt and Ellen Yeung (Boston, MA: Cheng & Tsui, 1995).
- ⁴⁰ For a complete exposition of Kristeva's theory, see Kristeva, *Revolution in Poetic Language* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1984), especially chap. 1, "The Semiotic and the Symbolic," 19-106.
- ⁴¹ For lucid commentary on Kristeva's work, see Moi's *Sexual/Textual Politics*.
- ⁴² Li Ang, *The Butcher's Wife*, in *The Butcher's Wife and Other Stories*, trans. and ed. by Howard Goldblatt and Ellen Yeung (Boston, MA: Cheng & Tsui, 1995).
- ⁴³ Li Ang 李昂, *Sha-fu: Lucheng gu-shi* 殺夫：鹿城故事. (Taipei: Lian-he bao-she, 1983).
- ⁴⁴ In Taiwanese society it is a religious custom to burn coloured papier-mâché figures that resemble and represent things like furniture, vehicles, and money for the deceased to use in the nether world. Most Taiwanese believe that the more papier-mâché figures they offer the more comfortable and peaceful the deceased will be.
- ⁴⁵ Li Ang, *The Butcher's Wife and Other Stories*, p.139.
- ⁴⁶ Sandra M. Gilbert and Susan Gubar, *The Madwoman in the Attic: The Woman Writer and the Nineteenth-Century Literary Imagination* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1979), p. 13.
- ⁴⁷ Mikhail Bakhtin, *Problems of Dostoevsky's Poetics*, trans. Caryl Emerson (Minneapolis & London: University of Minnesota Press, 1997), pp. 193-194.
- ⁴⁸ For the problematic nature of English translation from the Chinese in general, please see Michael S. Duke "The Problematic Nature of Modern and Contemporary Chinese Fiction in English Translation" in *Worlds Apart: Recent Chinese Writing and Its Audiences*, pp. 198-227.
- ⁴⁹ Ying-Ying Chien, "Women Crossing the Wild Zone: Sexual/Textual Politics in the Fiction of Ding Ling and Li Ang," p. 13.
- ⁵⁰ Originated in the Southern Tang dynasty around 920 A.D. and survived for a thousand years, foot binding can be seen as a practice of "bodily mutilation inflicted on women by patriarchs (often dubbed 'Confucian') to serve male interests." In a society with a cult of female chastity, one primary purpose of foot binding was to limit women's mobility; i.e. to keep them in a hobbled and subservient domestic state. Moreover, it rendered women as sex objects to satisfy men's perverted erotic fantasies. Auntie Ahwang exemplifies how woman's body and mind have been culturally and sexually mutilated by patriarchy. For reference please see Dorothy Ko, "The Body as Attire: The Shifting Meaning of Footbinding in Seventeenth-Century China," *Journal of Women's History* 8, no. 4 (Winter 1997): p. 8.
- ⁵¹ Chien, "Deconstructing Patriarchy/Reconstructing Womanhood: Feminist Readings of Multicultural Women's Murder Fiction," p.272.

-
- ⁵² Harry J. Lamley, "Taiwan under Japanese Rule, 1895-1945: The Vicissitudes of Colonialism," in *Taiwan: A New History*, ed. by Murray Rubinstein (New York: Sharpe, 1999), p. 213.
- ⁵³ Sheung-Yuen Daisy Ng, "Feminism in the Chinese Context: Li Ang's *The Butcher's Wife*," *Modern Chinese Literature* 4, nos. 1&2 (Spring & Fall 1988): pp. 177-200.
- ⁵⁴ Irigaray, "This Sex Which Is Not One," p. 328.
- ⁵⁵ Ying-Ying Chien, "Women Crossing the Wild Zone: Sexual/Textual Politics in the Fiction of Ding Ling and Li Ang," p. 12.
- ⁵⁶ See Cai Yingjun, "Nü zuojia de liangzhong dianxing he qi kunjing," *Wenxing* 110 (Aug 1987): pp. 96-101, and Sheung-Yuen Daisy Ng, "Feminism in the Chinese Context."
- ⁵⁷ Ying-Ying Chien, "Women, Feminism, and Creativity: An Interview with Li Ang," *ChungWai Literary Monthly* vol.17, no.10 (March 1989): pp. 184-5.

Chapter Three

Writing Her-story:

Enchi Fumiko's *Masks* and Li Ang's *Labyrinthine Garden*

In this chapter I pair up Enchi Fumiko's *Onnamen* 女面 (*Masks*, 1958; tr. 1983) with Li Ang's *Miyuan* 迷園 (*Labyrinthine Garden*, 1991) for literary comparison, featuring the theme of "writing her-story." Although Enchi's work was produced in the late 1950s and Li's work came out three decades later, Japan of the 1950s and Taiwan of the 1990s can be seen as similar postcolonial moments in each country's history, as briefly discussed in the previous chapters. Both works were created not long after each country was freed from its own form of colonization. In the late 1950s Japan was just a few years away from the end of the war, the collapse of its colonial empire in Asia, and then the Allied Occupation, during which the Allies, especially the United States, held colonial-like rule from 1945 to 1952. On the other hand, Taiwan was not completely unshackled from the authoritarian rule and grand narrative of the Nationalist government till the late 1980s; the particularly infamous martial law was not lifted till 1987. Therefore, despite a time difference of more than three decades between the two novels considered here, they came out of similar historical moments in each country. Socio-politically these moments were marked by new possibilities for the exploration of a number of formerly taboo issues, including the intersections of gender, race, and nation.

Thematically, the two novels share certain similarities—a focus on renegotiating gender relations after the colonial yoke is gone, through the theme of subverting the patrilineal lineage. Enchi's *Masks* portrays a bold attempt to establish a matrilineal

genealogy in an uncompromisingly patrilineal system, whereas Li's *Labyrinthine Garden* demonstrates a woman writer's active engagement with the national narrative and her willingness to engage the hot-button issue of ethnicity in Taiwan. I will trace the significant similarities in terms of theme and structure of the two novels; the two writers use similar structural techniques to support related themes. Equally important, I will discuss their significant differences, which arise primarily from each country's different experiences of colonization. To facilitate the discussion, I will be presenting Hélène Cixous' theory of *écriture féminine* to illustrate how Enchi employs the female body as a source of metaphor, considering the importance of the female body as a sensual ground and source of imagery for women's writing. Through multiple allusions to classical literature, Enchi creates a Medusa-like archetype to subvert the patriarchal system. Regarding Li's novel, I will look into the politics of identity (re)construction in postcolonial discourse to investigate the ways gender relationships have been affected by painful memories of colonization; especially the February 28 incident in the case of Taiwan. Overall, this comparison is to illustrate the intricate entanglement of the national narrative in women's identity and women's active role in (re)writing *her-story*.

Enchi Fumiko

Biographical background

Well known for her brilliant probing of female psychology, sexuality, tenacity, and agency, often through allusions to classical Japanese literature, Enchi Fumiko (1905-1986) was one of the most acclaimed women writers in modern Japan. She was born Ueda Fumi, the third and youngest child of Ueda Kazutoshi who was a distinguished linguistics

professor at Tokyo University.¹ Thanks to her scholarly father, Enchi received a rather unconventional education for her time, especially for a girl. Apart from her privileged access to her father's personal library filled with erudite books ranging from the Japanese classics to world literature, Enchi's program of education was tailored to meet her unique needs and personal interests. She was constantly surrounded by numerous professors, scholars, and students who frequented the Ueda's residence. It would be extremely difficult to overestimate her father's influence on Enchi. However, it was her paternal grandmother, an avid partisan of Kabuki, who most powerfully excited Enchi's inchoate imagination by reciting to her lines from the Kabuki or Jōruri, and by telling her popular stories from the Edo period (1600-1867). Gradually but surely, this intimate storytelling nurtured Enchi's love for reading, which eventually transformed into a career as a writer. Enchi herself gave due credit to her grandmother's storytelling in the development of her writing career.² In addition to her grandmother's stories, Enchi also had direct experience of the Kabuki and Noh theaters, accompanying her family to performances from the age of four. Arguably, theatre and the Japanese classics not only laid the groundwork for shaping Enchi's aesthetic appreciation and developing her unique artistic sense but later often became the source of inspiration for some of her most creative literary narratives.³

As the seventeen-year-old Fumiko found the prescribed education at the women's high school highly unlikely to satisfy her literary aspirations, she withdrew from school and was tutored at home, determined to become a writer. Influenced by Nagai Kafū's *Shōsetsu Sahō* (How to Write Novels, 1920), a book in which he advised that college does not matter much but a writer has to know at least two other languages beside Japanese,⁴ Enchi was individually tutored in English, French, classical Chinese, and Bible studies by

numerous prominent college professors and a British lady missionary. Although Enchi later studied at the Japan Women's University for four years, she left without receiving her degree. Nonetheless, she continued to receive private tutorials paid for by her father until she got married at the age of twenty-four. In her early teens, Enchi not only indulged in reading *Genji monogatari* (The Tale of Genji, circa 1000) but was also captivated by the "demoniac Romanticism" of Edgar Allan Poe, Oscar Wilde, Nagai Kafū, and Tanizaki Jun'ichirō, from which Enchi picked up the gothic and sensual writing style that she later incorporated into her own writing of fiction. In particular, Enchi was most impressed by Tanizaki's almost religious reverence for the beauty of women, and Kafū's beautifully refined eroticism.⁵ As a modern writer, it is fair to say that Enchi successfully synthesized literary influences from the East and West, as well as from the past and present.

Although Enchi's reputation lay mainly in the short stories and novels that she produced after the 1950s, she made her debut in the literary scene not as a novelist but a playwright at the age of twenty-one when her play *Furusato* ふるさと (Native Land, 1926) was published by the journal *Kabuki*. Attending a seminar on playwriting given by Osanai Kaoru, then the leader of the Modern Theater movement, Enchi was one of the first women to have three successful plays staged at the Tsukiji Little Theater founded by Osanai. After Osanai's sudden death, Enchi became acquainted with novelists of the proletarian movement, such as Hirabayashi Taiko (1905-1972), Hayashi Fumiko (1903-1951), and in particular Kataoka Teppeï (1894-1944) with whom she fell in love. She was, nonetheless, never active in the left-wing movement, primarily because of her concern for her father's position in the university. Nonetheless, it is no doubt that Enchi's

sympathy for marginalized people came from her contact with those leftist intellectuals.

In 1930, when leftists were being pursued and persecuted by the government, she married Enchi Yoshimatsu, a 34-year-old journalist, so as to distance herself from the proletarian movement. Although throughout their marriage she never loved her husband, who was in fact handpicked by her father, she had a daughter with him and remained married to him until his death in 1972. Enchi joined the magazine *Nichireki* in 1935 and started to learn about writing fiction as she felt she had reached an impasse in writing plays. However, far from becoming an award-winning fiction writer overnight, she experienced quite a few difficulties getting her work into print. With great encouragement from her long-time friend Hirabayashi, she continued to write, believing her works would eventually prevail.

Enchi's first important short work "Genzai" 原罪 (Original Sin) was completed in 1938, the year following her father's death from cancer at the age of seventy. Then the war intervened, and at the same time Enchi encountered the first of many serious maladies she would have to face in her life: she was diagnosed with breast cancer. As a result, she had to endure the medical procedure of mastectomy, and then suffered a serious postoperative infection. While she was making a slow recovery from the operation, most of her property was reduced to ruins during the bombing campaigns of the war. Thereafter her works increasingly delved into the psychic realm of women, especially aging or sexually disabled women, their fears of death, and their hunger for sex and for life. Enchi was unable to make serious inroads into the literary world until her short story "Himojii tsukihi" ひもじい月日 (Days of Hunger) was published and awarded the Women's Literature Prize in 1953. Masamune Hakuchō (1879-1962), one of the most

influential Naturalist writers of the time, praised this short story, saying that it made him feel an unwonted shudder in its merciless depiction of the male and its unflinching portrait of despair.⁶ After that, Enchi was actively pursued by publishers; and over the following three decades she produced a great assortment of literary masterpieces including more than twenty plays, more than fifty short stories, thirty full-length novels, collections of essays, and a number of modern translations of classical works such as *The Tale of Genji*. In 1970 Enchi was elected to the Japan Academy of Arts; and two years later, she received the Grand Prize for Japanese Literature. On top of six major awards of distinction, Enchi was decorated by the Emperor with the *Bunka kunshō* (Order of Cultural Merit) in 1985—one of the only two female writers to have been awarded this highest honour in postwar Japan.⁷ It is ironic that Enchi, whose works frequently depict a subversion of some patriarchal and/or patrilineal narrative, should be acknowledged as a “national writer” through this imperial award. Until her death from heart failure at the age of eighty-one in 1986, Enchi led a remarkable life of prolific literary creativity.

Many of Enchi's novels deal with conflicts between a woman's sexual desires and the norms in contemporary society. One of Enchi's most representative novels is her first masterpiece *Onnazaka* 女坂 (literally, Woman's hill, 1957; tr. as *The Waiting Years*, 1971; awarded the Noma Literary Prize), which is in fact a fictional rendition of her grandmother's painful life. With acute sensitivity, in the novel Enchi portrays marriage as an oppressive institution and delineates its devastating effects upon women in the Meiji period. The female protagonist Tomo is forced not only to select her husband's concubines but to live with them under the same roof. After a lifetime of catering to her husband's every whim, however, the silent Tomo finally speaks out on her death bed

asking to have her body dumped into the sea instead of the solemn familial burial that is commonly deemed proper. Stunned by her wilful statement, her husband's mind and body suffer the full force of the emotions that Tomo has struggled to repress for forty years past, as the shock is powerful enough to "split [her husband's] arrogant ego in two."⁸ Confronting her husband for the very first and last time, Tomo avenges all the unbearable humiliation from which she has suffered in the marriage with him.

Like Tomo in *The Waiting Years*, Enchi's female protagonists often terrify the male reader when they reveal their deep wells of pain, terror, and malice against their male oppressors. Although most male critics have responded with admiration for Enchi's literary works, their appraisals often reveal an implicit sense of discomfort with the women characters Enchi has created. Okuno Takeo regards Enchi as "a woman to be eternally feared" precisely because she tends to depict woman to be unknowable/opaque, detestable, and repugnant to men.⁹ In contrast to Tomo who lived in the Meiji period and protested only with her dying request, the contemporary protagonist Mieko in *Masks* exacts a more long-term and devious revenge on her husband for his past infidelity. Mishima Yukio once commented that Enchi's works possess both a moral side and a deeply immoral side. Agreeing with Mishima's assessment, Enchi herself suggests that *The Waiting Years* derives from her virtuous, moral side, while *Masks* narrates the darker, decadent, "immoral" half.¹⁰ Conscious of the oppression inflicted on women, Enchi declares that her writing is not hers alone but is jointly produced with numerous women who lived in the past.¹¹

Writing with the Body

Enchi Fumiko is one of the few women writers in Japan who has commanded the respect of the male-dominated literary world while writing unflinching representations of sexual politics from an implicitly feminist point of view. Aware that literature in postwar Japan is produced, criticized and canonized according to the standard of male critics, Enchi made great efforts during her lifetime to preserve the literary institution "Joryū bungakukai" (The Association of Women's Literature), out of the firm conviction that women writers should unite together to survive in the male-dominated literary world. This sort of "separatism" might seem essentialist and problematic to some younger feminists; however, in order to fend off sexual discrimination and get a foothold in the literary scene, the unity of women writers was deemed necessary at the time.

As if echoing Hélène Cixous' theory of *écriture féminine* (feminine writing), Enchi regarded the female body as both the source and the sign for her writing in search of female sexuality. As Cixous suggests, "Write yourself. Your body must be heard. Only then will the immense resources of the unconscious spring forth."¹² In order to escape the discourse of mastery, Cixous believes that we must begin to write the body. That is, when the individual woman writes herself, she must discover for herself what her body feels like and how to write about that body in language. Specifically, a woman must find her own sexuality, one that is rooted solely in her own body, and to find ways to write about that pleasure—which Cixous, following Lacan, names "jouissance." Jouissance can be conceived of as a virtually metaphysical fulfillment of desire that goes far beyond satisfaction. In light of Lacan's theory of the Symbolic order, Cixous believes that our sexuality and the language in which we communicate are inextricably linked. To free one

means freedom for the other. As women are marginalized in the Symbolic order, they are not solidly anchored or fixed in place as men are; therefore, women and their language are more fluid, more flowing, and more unstable. When women speak or write their own bodies, the structure of language itself will change, as women become active subjects, not just beings passively acted upon, their position as subject in language will shift. Women's writing will produce a new signifying system that contains more fluidity and flexibility than the existing rigid phallogocentric symbolic order, Cixous argues.

Like Cixous's feminine writing, Enchi's writing provides a rupture, or a site of change and transformation, a place where the totality of the system breaks down and one can see a system as a system or a structure, rather than simply as "the truth." Granting that she does this, it is surprising that most male critics and scholars, however, do not seem to notice the subversiveness in Enchi's writing. While they often comment about her use of "the body" in producing fiction that is different from that of male writers (as we shall see below), they see this as "natural" and (unfortunately) inevitable rather than subversive. In their critiques of Enchi's writing and women's writing in general, male critics have tended to disparage women writers as focusing only on personal experiences and physical appearance. Buying wholeheartedly into the mind/body dichotomy that values the mind over the body, male critics have tended to suggest that male writers write only with their "mind" or "intelligence," whereas women writers write with their body, emotion, and primitiveness. While some feminist theorists, such as Cixous, might celebrate women who are able to write with their bodies, for the Japanese male critics of the postwar period, this judgement does not constitute a compliment.

Murō Saisei's *Ōgon no hari* (Golden Needles, 1961), which surveys the works of

nineteen women writers from the Taishō (1912-1926) and Shōwa (1926-1989) periods, best represents the essentialist view that disparages Japanese women's writing. Associating women's writing with sewing, Murō suggests that, just as women possess the refined skills necessary for sewing a *kimono*, women writers produce fiction that is too neat, without skipping any stitches. He contends that women's style of writing, which resolves everything and leaves nothing to the imagination, lacks delight and thus is inappropriate for fiction. On the contrary, he argues that male writers, like *tatami*-makers who sew with a three-inch needle, write with loose and uneven stitches, the very qualities that Murō finds required in outstanding writing.¹³ Strikingly, however, Murō's analogy not only is emblematic of essentialism but embodies a fundamental fallacy.¹⁴ He first assumes that sewing is naturally a feminine job (which is problematic to begin with), and then asserts that all women writers "naturally" adopt such a "feminine" skill into their writing (an unsubstantiated, and even more unsustainable assertion). Of significance in the background in which Murō would have made such a contention is that writing is commonly regarded as the male writers' domain. Nonetheless, if we use Gilbert and Gubar's metaphoric equation between pen and penis to interpret Murō's analogy between sewing and writing, then paradoxically, the unusually large three-inch *tatami*-makers' needle male writers use is the metaphor for the penis, while the much smaller needle female writers use becomes the clitoris, the castrated penis. In light of this reformulated interpretation of Murō's analogy, then arguably Murō would seem to have further suggested that when a woman transgresses gender boundaries by picking up a tiny needle to imitate men's writing, her writing can never be as good as that of male writers as she is not possessed of a "legitimate" pen/needle/penis. This extension of Murō's analogy only

reveals the fact that Murō's contention is, unwittingly or not, very much dictated by the discourse and logic of phallocentrism.

In his comment on Enchi Fumiko, whom he characterized as "someone who writes with a golden pen," Murō makes another analogy between women's writing and women's bodies. He refers to Enchi's female body as her writing instrument:

It is true that writers write with their bodies....I thought that Enchi Fumiko must be always writing with her dripping flesh....A woman's body, having a different structure from mine, overflows with sticky fat. The ideas that pass through such a body are also greasy, so much so that it seems to smear right on the manuscript. (my translation)

作家は肉体で書くということは本統である... 円地文子もやはりぼたぼたした肉で何時も書くのだと思った.... 女の人ばかりだの構造が私などと違って、ねっとりした脂肪がみなぎっているの、そこを潜り抜けて出る思いはやはりあぶらがあって、油は原稿紙にしみ互らしい。¹⁵

Here, based on his unflattering depiction of biological difference between male and female, Murō asserts that as a female body contains more fat than the male's, female writing composed through the bodies that have this excessive viscous fat would be "naturally" greasy. Interestingly, Murō is not the only critic to have used such adjectives as *pota pota shita niku* (dripping flesh) and *nettori* (sticky) to describe Enchi's writing. In their commentaries on Enchi's work, Okuno Takeo's *nurai* (viscous), *nechi nechi* (clammy, sticky), and Masamune Hakuchō's *betabeta to nebarituita*¹⁶ (tenaciously sticky) all seem to imply that women's writing in general, and Enchi's writing in particular, inevitably reflects the excessiveness derived from the female body: the sticky and fishy smell of menstruation, bleeding from delivery, fat, or secretions.¹⁷ Mishima Yukio even regards such excessiveness as the ultimate requirement for women's writing and as the

major characteristic differentiating it from men's writing.¹⁸

The male critics' linking the images of sticky blood, fat, and secretion in woman's bodies to the style of women's writing presents a striking contrast to the concept of *écriture féminine*, in which the woman's voice flows and runs like liquid. Far from *écriture féminine*'s intention of recovering the woman's voice, undermined in phallogocentric society, women's writing has been defiled by male criticism of this sort as something unknown, alien, mysterious, premodern, or primitive, serving merely as the Other to enhance the superiority of men's "modern" literary work.

As if echoing Cixous's ideas about feminine writing, Enchi writes about female sexuality with unprecedented audacity. It has been inferred, mostly by male critics, that Enchi paradoxically felt compelled to write about female sexuality after her losing her quintessentially female organs—breast and uterus—to cancer. Despite Enchi's repeated claims that her works are not reflections of her own experience but are *kyokō* (fabrication), male critics continue to see her works as autobiographical, connecting the loss of her female organs to her writing. Okuno believes that after Enchi lost her sexual organs, the *otoko no me* (male gaze) inside her, in terms of both body and soul, became bigger and stronger.¹⁹ A female writer without a uterus but with an ardent thirst for the fulfillment of her emotional void and emptiness is praised by male critics for the "unfeminine" qualities in her works—unfeminine precisely because she delineates the female gender and sexuality with obsessiveness and audacity. Because of these "unfeminine" qualities, Murō differentiates Enchi from the rest of women writers: "however, there is still some unevenness in Enchi Fumiko's writing" (併し円地文子にはまだがたがある)²⁰, suggesting that Enchi's writing is possessed of some of the required qualities in

superior/male writing. But Murō's categorization of Enchi's writing as nearly masculine could not be further from the truth. In actuality, by taking up such body-related topics and experiences of women Enchi effectively appropriates and fundamentally inverts the orthodox discourse on women's writing and their bodies. Instead of seeing her loss as a metaphor for emptiness, Enchi regards the void as a source that produces abundant flows of creativity and imaginativeness, just like the greatest Chinese ancient historian Sima Qian 司馬遷 (B.C. 145?-B.C. 86?) completed *Shiji* 史記 (The Record of Great Historians, 91 B.C.) after the ruthless castration inflicted on his body by the Han Emperor.²¹ Metaphorically, it can be further argued that without the sexual organs that normally signify women's confinement to their conventional roles, Enchi is thus liberated to explore the relationship between gender identity and persistent sexual drive in a female body "free from" reproductive organs.

In her various works, Enchi employs the female body as a source of metaphor, manifesting the importance of female body as a sensual ground and source of imagery for women's writing. One of her most representative "body" works is *Masks*. In the following sections, I will first provide a synopsis of *Masks* and then look into how Enchi's female protagonist challenges patriarchal dominance in the family structure and further creates her own matrilineal "blood lineage" through the power of spirit possession.

Masks

The protagonist of *Masks*, Toganō Mieko, is a widow in her fifties at the time the story is set. She is an accomplished poet who has a keen interest in classical Japanese literature, particularly the theme of spirit possession in *The Tale of Genji*. With "a peculiar

power to move events in whatever direction she pleases, while she stays motionless,”²² Mieko manipulates the people around her to take vengeance on her long-dead husband. Gradually the reader finds out the circumstances of Mieko’s young married life, which motivate her actions in the narrative present. We discover that when the nineteen-year-old Mieko had married Toganō Masatsugu, a rural samurai of the kind who assisted in creating the Meiji government, she had discovered something dismaying—her wealthy husband kept a concubine in the house and intended that she should go on living there even now that he had taken a bride. Before Mieko’s arrival, this concubine, named Aguri, had been impregnated twice by Masatsugu and both times had been forced to have an abortion. After the marriage, when Mieko had gotten pregnant, the bitterly jealous Aguri had devised a malicious plot to cause Mieko’s miscarriage by planting a protruding nail on the stairs; Mieko had duly tripped and fallen down the stairs, resulting in a miscarriage. But even though Mieko had soon realized what Aguri had done, she further realized that the source of her physical pain and moral humiliation was not Aguri, but Masatsugu, her husband. Instead of venting her resentment onto Aguri, Mieko secretly plotted to get revenge on her husband and the family that made him what he was.

While still a young wife, Mieko had taken a secret lover by whom she bore fraternal twins—a boy and a girl—who are believed to be Toganō Masatsugu’s children. (The lover had died shortly thereafter, in the war.) The girl twin, Harume, brain-damaged at birth and mentally retarded, had been sent away by the Toganōs to be raised in a temple in the countryside. The boy twin, Akio, had grown up a fine young man, and in adulthood had married an attractive, intelligent woman named Yasuko. Before they had any children, however, Akio had died in a mountain climbing accident. His young widow, Yasuko, now

lives with Mieko, and helps with her research on spirit possession and the Japanese classics. In the novel's narrative present there are two other important characters, both of them men who are interested in spirit possession and also both interested in pursuing Yasuko: a married professor of Heian literature, Ibuki Tsuneo, and an unmarried psychologist, Mikame Toyoki, who is an amateur in the folklore of spirit possession. Both men had known Akio before his death.

As the novel progresses the reader also gradually comes to understand that Mieko's plan for revenge is to produce an heir to the ancient and well-respected Toganō family line who in fact will not bear one drop of Toganō blood; rather the heir will be of the bloodline of Mieko's secret lover. Now that Akio is dead, however, the only way to engineer that is to somehow impregnate Harume. In order to succeed, Mieko must manipulate the behaviour of Yasuko, Harume, Ibuki and Mikame, and the novel's plot follows her in these manipulations.

The theme of spirit possession is important in the novel, as will be seen in several examples below. To enhance this theme, Enchi makes use of the images of various masks worn in the Noh theatre. The Noh theater is a highly stylized form of Japanese traditional drama that flourished particularly during the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries. It became the official drama of the Tokugawa shogunate and is still popular today. Performed exclusively by male actors who often wear masks, Noh plays are highly stylized rather than mimetic. Through subtle movements and skilful manipulation of the masks, actors are meant to convey complex and deep emotions, such as the pain a mother feels at the loss of a child. While each play has named characters in a specific plot, the number of mask-types is quite limited, and one mask will be used in many different plays. Each

mask is identified in terms of gender, general age group, and emotional tenor.

Masks is divided into three sections, each of which is named for a category of female mask used in the performance of Noh plays.²³ The title of the first section, *Ryō no onna* 霊女 (literally, spirit woman), is a mask for the vengeful spirit of a woman who is distressed by unrewarded love and thus turns her energies inward. The second section, *Masugami* 十寸髪 is for a young madwoman, or a beautiful young woman in a frenzy; and the third, *Fukai* 深井 (literally, deep well or deep woman) represents the face of a middle-aged woman who is beyond the age of sensuality, hiding her secret will in a heart as deep as a well. Besides these, several other Noh masks are referred to in the novel—all of them, however, are masks used exclusively for female characters. It is also noteworthy that most of the masks are associated with more than one character. *Ryō no onna*, for example, is associated with both Mieko and Aguri, *Masugami* with Yasuko (when in sexual frenzy) and Harume. The mask of the final section, however, *Fukai*, is associated with Mieko alone.

The novel begins in Kyoto. Ibuki runs across Mikame in a coffee shop there and the two men recall a séance they recently attended with Yasuko. As the séance had been held coincidentally on the anniversary of Akio's death, Yasuko was traumatized by an Akio-like spirit that declared itself through the medium. Extremely frightened, she had unconsciously taken Ibuki's hand. Whereas Mikame is sceptical of the séance and tends to see it as a pseudo-scientific show, Ibuki, who understands the significance of the day for Yasuko, was deeply moved by the mysterious vibrations that communicated themselves from Yasuko's hand to his. Although both men have noticed the unusually strong bond between Yasuko and Mieko, they have rather different views on the women's relationship:

Mikame sees Yasuko as the stronger woman, while Ibuki believes that she is under Mieko's influence, almost in a kind of spirit possession.

Mieko and Yasuko then arrive, and they all go together to the Yakushiji home, a family of Noh masters. There they are shown numerous precious Noh masks. Mieko and Yasuko are especially spellbound by the *Zō no onna* 増 and *Ryō no onna* 霊の女 masks, which are the finest in the Yakushiji collection and usually are kept hidden from view. After this visit, Mieko deliberately prolongs her stay and sends Yasuko on the train with Ibuki home to Tokyo. It is clear that she hopes their budding romance will progress.

On the train, Yasuko confesses to Ibuki that when she had seen the *Zō no onna* mask she was frightened by its uncanny resemblance to Akio's face:

"When he (Mr. Yakushiji) stood up wearing the *Zō no onna* mask, it took my breath away. It was as if something dead had come to life, or as if male and female had suddenly become one...it was almost as if Akio's spirit had taken over the mask."

(25)

「薬師寺さんが、増の面をかけて、ぬうっと立上ってたでしょう。あの時、はっとしたんです、死んでいたものが生きかえって来た.... 男と女が一緒になった、秋生さんが憑りうつったような気がしましたの....」 (858)²⁴

Yasuko also reveals to Ibuki the previously well-kept secret of Akio's sequestered twin sister Harume, and Ibuki suddenly realizes that he had seen her before. He recollects Mieko's firefly garden party at which he and Mikame had both noticed a mysterious beauty in an arbour looking like a Buddha figure. Attracted by the stranger's alluring beauty, they had been told only that she was Mieko's distant relative. Yasuko seemed to be guarding her, and neither man had been able to speak to the beautiful stranger. Now, with Yasuko's revelation, Ibuki remembers the half-lifeless face of "marshmallow pallor"

he saw at the garden party, and realizes that her face also uncannily resembles the *Zō no onna* mask they had seen the day before.

Despite her intimate relationship with Mieko, Yasuko tells Ibuki that she sees Mieko as an enigmatic person with whom secrets abound:

Like a quiet mountain lake whose waters are rushing beneath the surface toward a waterfall, she has the power to move events in whatever direction she pleases. She's like the face on a Noh mask, filled with innumerable secrets.

「でもそれだけに表が静かに見える山の湖の底に水が強い力で滝のある方へ動いているように、凝としたままで自分のしようと思っていることはちゃんとその方向へ動かして行く力を持っています。つまりあの面の女なのですね。秘密があの人の中にはいっぱい詰め込まれています。」 (861)

While denying that her relationship with Mieko resembles that between the medium and the spirit in the séance, Yasuko cannot but help feeling that she is acting under Mieko's influence. Yasuko confides to Ibuki her desire of severing ties to the Toganō family and Mieko, if need be, through marrying Mikame or having an affair with Ibuki or both. Upon hearing these distressing revelations and insinuations, Ibuki acts on the spur of the moment and abducts Yasuko to a love hotel in Atami.

Besides its references to the Noh theater, *Masks* also makes frequent reference to the *Tale of Genji*, the eleventh-century masterpiece written by Murasaki Shikibu, a highly educated lady-in-waiting who served at the court of Empress Shōshi (988-1074) during the Heian period (794-1185). The main part of *The Tale of Genji* is the story of a "shining" royal prince, Hikaru Genji, and his loves. On the surface, Genji seems to care for the women he loves, but in actuality they suffer constantly from Genji's infidelity and the patriarchal subjugation of the time. Murasaki Shikibu's story was appropriated by

medieval Noh dramatists, who wrote a number of plays based on incidents drawn from the tale, featuring several important female characters. One of the most famous of these is the Lady Rokujō, a high-ranking aristocrat who was so jealous of Genji's relations with other women that her repressed emotions eventually caused her spirit to leave her body to torment Genji's beloved women, two of whom her spirit eventually killed.²⁵ When Mieko was in her thirties (when her husband was still alive and the twins still young), she had written a scholarly essay on the character of Lady Rokujō, in which she attempts to vindicate this often-criticised character. Against the male reading of Lady Rokujō as vindictive, Mieko links Lady Rokujō to shamanism and identifies the *Ryō no onna* mask with Lady Rokujō. She describes the persona of the mask/character as "one who chafes at her inability to sublimate her strong ego in deference to any man, but who can carry out her will only by forcing it upon others—and that indirectly, through the possessive capacity of her spirit" (憑霊的な能力によって、自分の意志を必ず他に伝え、それを遂行させねばやまぬ霊女なのである。52; 873). Mieko's essay not only reflects her clear intention of re-evaluating the character of Lady Rokujō but also betrays her sympathy with Roujō's unfortunate experience.

Mikame has somehow discovered this essay from many years before, and shares it with Ibuki. Ibuki is startled to recall the *Ryō no onna* mask he had seen in the Yakushiji home, and Yasuko's associating the mask with Mieko. He starts to feel that somewhere in the room the toothless, sunken-checked mask is staring down at him with deep hollow eyes. Ibuki surmises in private that Mieko has used Lady Rokujō as a pretext to write an essay in effect rationalizing her own psychic powers.

The second part of the novel, titled *Masugami*, the mask of a young woman in a state

of frenzy, centres on Harume. Having suffered brain damage caused by her twin brother Akio's feet treading against her head while still in the womb, Harume is reduced to a physical being who lacks rational intelligence. The Toganō family, seeing multiple birth as "vaguely beastly and unpleasant" (40), insists on raising the twins separately, so Harume is sent to the countryside. After Akio's death, however, Mieko brings Harume back into her home, to live with her and Yasuko. Harume's essential bestiality is emphasized through descriptions of her as becoming like a wild animal during her menstrual periods, biting those who would try to help her.

Since producing a child by Harume will be the only possibility for fulfilling Mieko's plot of revenge after Akio's death, Mieko schemes with Yasuko to trick Ibuki into having sex with Harume. Yasuko seduces him in Mieko's house, gets him thoroughly drunk, and then brings in Harume to have sex with him in her place. The plan succeeds and Harume gets pregnant, although Ibuki awakes with confused memories of a strange woman in his bed.

While Yasuko continues to raise Mikame's and Ibuki's fond hopes for her hand, Ibuki's wife Sadako hires a private detective to spy on her husband's affair with Yasuko. With all the evidence she has gathered, Sadako concludes that Yasuko is a witch who manipulates men like puppets, and strongly suggests to Mikame that he withdraw his proposal to Yasuko:

"That house is a witches' den. Serves you right for wrapping yourselves up in a weird subject like spirit possession—you and Tsuneo [Ibuki] are both under a witch's spell!" (119)

「あの家是一種の化物屋敷ね。憑霊なんて、妙なものに凝るから、伊吹も三瓶も化物に魅入られたのよ。」 (904)

Although Mikame lends a patient ear to Sadako's ranting, at heart he is repelled by her foul-mouthed accusations of Yasuko. Mikame is surprised to find out from Sadako about Akio's twin sister, and feels deep sympathy for Mieko's "unimaginable torments"—to have had a mentally retarded daughter who is now bearing an illegitimate baby. Contrary to Mikame's assumption that Mieko would arrange an abortion for Harume, Mieko insists on going through with the birth, despite the fact that Harume's "severely retroflexed womb" might cause a dangerous childbirth (124).

Expressing her excitement at the prospect of seeing a baby with Akio's blood and of being its guardian, Yasuko confides in Mieko:

"You and I are accomplices, aren't we, in a dreadful crime—a crime that only women could commit. Having a part to play in this scheme of yours, Mother, means more to me than the love of any men." (126)

女だけの出来る残忍な悪事を私たちは共同で犯しているのね。私、男の人と愛しあうことよりもお母さまの企みに参加することの方がずっと生甲斐を感じるわ。(908)

Listening to Yasuko's confidence, Mieko feels that "a woman's love is quick to turn into a passion for revenge—an obsession that becomes an endless river of blood, flowing on from generation to generation" (女の愛情とは容易に復讐に変形するもので、同時にその妄念はやがて、次の世代へ自分を伝えて行く尽きない血の流れでもあるのだ。127; 909).

Mieko fulfills her plot of revenge when Harume gives birth to a baby boy who is the image of Akio—creating a legitimate Toganō heir who is, however, totally unrelated to the Toganō family by blood. As anticipated, Harume dies shortly after the delivery. In the last scene of the novel, Mieko is sitting alone gazing at the *Fukai* mask, a mask that contains "a metaphor comparing the heart of an older woman to the depths of a

bottomless well—a well so deep that its water would seem totally without color” (深い井戸をのぞきこんだ時の水の色も見えないような底なしの深さを中年の女の心に譬えて、138-39; 915). For a brief sobering moment, Mieko’s face seems to have overlapped with the mask as if she and the mask have become one:

The pale yellowish cast of the mournful thin-cheeked mask in her hands was reflected on her face, the two countenances appearing faintly in the lingering daylight like twin blossoms on a single branch. The mask seemed to know all the intensity of her grief at the loss of Akio and Harume—as well as the bitter woman’s vengeance that she had planned so long, hiding it deep within her....

The crying of the baby filled her ears.

In that moment the mask dropped from her grasp as if struck down by an invisible hand. In a trance she reached out and covered the face on the mask with her hand, while her right arm, as if suddenly paralyzed, hung frozen, immobile, in space. (141)

頬の瘦せた淋しげな女面の黄を沈めた白さが、それを手にしている三重子の顔と重なって、一つ枝に咲いた二つの花のように夕明りの中に灰かに浮かんでいた。秋生と春女の生命の消えて行った悲しみをこの面は皆知っているようである。同時に自分の中に深く秘めて来た毒々しい女の企みも.....。

赤児の泣く声が聞こえて来た。

その声をきいた瞬間、見えない手がはたき落したように三重子の手から面がぽとりと落ちた。三重子は打たれたように急に痺れた右手を空に上げたまま、畳に上向いている面の上に、覆うように片手をのばした。(916)

Mieko seems to have realized the dreadful crime she has committed. Suddenly dropping the mask in a state of shock, she sorrowfully recognizes the heavy price her personal vengeance has exacted.

Masked Performance, Multi-layered Subjectivity

As the title suggests, the concept of the Noh mask is important to the structure as well as the theme of the novel. The plot of *Masks* is anything but straightforward; rather, it is revealed very slowly as one "mask" after another is donned and discarded. The classic triangular love affair among Yasuko, Ibuki, and Mikame that is revealed in the first section effectively masks the novel's true plot: Mieko's secret vengeance on her polygamist husband and the patriarchy that supported his behaviour. This true plot becomes clear to the reader only toward the end of the novel. Similarly the focus on spirit possession in the first two sections suggests concealment and layering: it is unclear whether Yasuko, Ibuki and Mikame are acting on their own desires or are merely puppets being manipulated by Mieko's spirit. (And for a long time the reader is unsure whether Mieko is manipulating Yasuko or whether the younger woman is actually in charge.) The references to Noh plays, the *Tale of Genji*, and Buddhist art (the mandala) also produce a layering effect, with multiple texts embedded in and supporting the main text. At the heart of all this complex layering we eventually discover Mieko. It is no accident that the Chinese characters of her given name 三重子 literally mean three-layered child.

Another subtheme through which the novel's message is supported is that of androgyny or homosexuality. Akio is the only male character in the novel who is associated with a Noh mask—the *Zō no onna* mask. When she sees this mask at the Yakushiji's, Yasuko nearly faints as she has a vision of the two faces of Harume and Akio becoming one in the mask.²⁶ Later when brushing Harume's hair, Yasuko feels that it is as if Akio is playfully teasing her in the disguise of a woman. These associations in effect link Akio (and Harume) to the category of androgyny. Seen as a taboo in Japanese society,

twins are usually deemed either as animal-like or as the result of sexual lasciviousness. Worse, fraternal twins of different sexes are superstitiously believed to be the reincarnations of a man and a woman who had committed double suicide in their previous lives.²⁷ Given the intended differentiation in their names, Akiō 秋生 (literally, autumn man) and Harume 春女 (literally, spring woman), their twin image gives a double sense of sameness (because they are twins) and difference (because they are different sexes). Androgyny and (inappropriate) sexual union/confusion are brought together in the image of these twins.

Similarly, the notion of homosexuality is a subtheme throughout the novel. Doris Bergen suggests that androgyny is analogous to homosexuality (*dōseiai*), insofar as homosexuality is defined as a preference for and expression of sameness.²⁸ It is clear to Ibuki and Mikame that the relationship between Mieko and Yasuko is so intimate as to suggest homosexuality (*dōseiai*), and later the reader witnesses a scene of the two in bed together in a situation that is deeply intimate, if not explicitly sexual.²⁹ Such a deep and powerful bond between mother (-in-law) and daughter (-in-law) insinuates incestuous overtones and thus disconcerts both Ibuki and Mikame, making them feel secondary and threatened as men. The sexual issues predicated upon the concepts of twins (similarity), androgyny, and homosexuality in the novel fundamentally attack the very system of patriarchy that is predicated on the concept of difference.³⁰ In other words, twins, androgyny, and homosexuality are combined together to obscure the prescribed difference in gender roles between masculine and feminine. Once the difference is gone, the system of patriarchy is undermined.

Blood lineage is the keystone by which to establish kinship and maintain

communities of inclusion and exclusion from generation to generation. This is manifestly the case in the modern nation of Japan, established on the *ie* (family) system, in which the patrilineal bloodline is preserved through carrying on the male's family name by another male, and preferably by one with the same bloodline. Furtively, however, the patrilineage is disrupted, violated and in effect replaced by Mieko's matrilineage in her plot of revenge. Harume's male child becomes, after Akio, the second fraudulent Toganō heir. Mieko's choice of using the married Ibuki to impregnate Harume is not only a strategy for keeping Yasuko's tie with the Toganō family (rather than having her marry Mikame and become a part of his family), but also a way of defrauding Ibuki's own patrilineage.³¹ Manipulated like a puppet by Mieko, Ibuki unwittingly falls into the trap set by women, and helps perpetuate the matrilineal bloodline with no regard to paternal interests.

As Elizabeth Grosz has pointed out, "the female body has been constructed not only as a lack or absence but with more complexity, as a leaking, uncontrollable, seeping liquid; as formless flow; as viscosity, entrapping, secreting; as lacking not so much or simply the phallus but self-containment...a formlessness that engulfs all form, a disorder that threatens all order."³² Such constructions of the female body that Grosz identifies in the modern West can also have their Japanese counterparts, as we can see in *Masks*. Metaphorically, the recurrent image of blood in the novel is represented as a structural component of female otherness. The novel presents the masculinist Buddhist and Shinto view that menstrual blood is fundamentally defiling and childbirth is polluting. Harume's irregular menstrual periods often leave "a trail of crimson drops" behind her, and with her a pungent odor lingers. Characterized by her periods, Harume's existence exemplifies the mainstream representations of female uncleanness, stickiness, viscosity, fluidity, and

boundlessness. The abhorrence, the fear of contamination, and the abjection associated with female menstrual blood can also be found in the letter from Mieko's anonymous lover:

To put it another way—you contain a curious ambiguity that enables you to get along without distinguishing between the truth and falseness of your actions in the real world. Because of that trait you seemed at once incomprehensible and unclean to me (I admit to the unreasonable fastidiousness of the Japanese male, to whom that blood of menstruation is of all blood the dirtiest). Even so, I was profoundly drawn by the intense emotion engendered in your mysterious body and soul. (104-5)

言いかえればあなたは、自分の現実の世界で犯している行為の嘘と真実を分明しないまま生きていられる不思議な曖昧さを中に保っている人なのだ。そのことはあなたを晦渋にも不潔にも感じさせた。女の経血を他の血液よりも不潔だと感じる日本の男に伝統した理不尽な、潔癖感なのだ。にもかかわらず、僕はあなたのその黒白不明な、模糊した肉体、精神の醸し出す重厚な濃密な情緒に魅せられた。(897)

As if echoing the words of the male critics cited earlier who have commented on Enchi's work, Mieko's secret lover also links her literary creativity to her female body, especially the "filthy" menstrual cycle from which emanates the putative unfathomable-ness of the female.

Treated like a real daughter, Yasuko is expected by Mieko to fulfill the mission that Harume fails—to pass on the woman inside Mieko. Ibuki describes the connection between Mieko and Yasuko as "a quality of moistness, of clingingness, like that of something animal," (90) and he finds that such a "viscid flow of emotion" (80) binding them together is unclean yet desirable. Associated with a particularly Heian-type of femininity—passive, and lacking in vivacity—the vacant and vaguely "unclean" Harume

provides a modern male like Ibuki a blank to fill with his masculine erotic imagination. As Nina Cornyetz points out, in *Masks* blood functions as “an index of female identity, and as a marker of female pollution and divinity. It also forms the basis on which a community of women exclusive of men is constructed.”³³ In the novel, Enchi lays out these ironic contradictions to reveal that the female body is in effect treated as the site upon which patriarchal discourses on femaleness—such as divinity, plurality, vacancy, and pollution—are inscribed.

Mieko’s essay of “An Account of the Shrine in the Fields” infuses the theme of Shinto female shamanism into Buddhist doctrines on spirit possession, a new theory that Ibuki as a scholar finds both amateurish and bold. As Mieko describes Lady Rokujō, her essence lies in her possession of Genji’s wife, Aoi. Commentators influenced primarily by Buddhist teachings are inclined to interpret Lady Rokujō as jealous and vindictive:

As passion transforms the Rokujō Lady into a living ghost, her spirit taking leave of her body again and again to attack and finally kill Genji’s wife Aoi, the commentators see in her tragic obsession a classic illustration of the evil karma attached to all womankind. (51)

高貴な身分の御息所が生霊になって、源氏の本妻葵の上を悩まし、遂にとり殺す物語が描かれているというのである。(872)

In contrast to this conventional interpretation, Mieko argues for interpreting Lady Rokujō as a highly sophisticated, proud, and lonely woman whose strong will is so suppressed by the rigidity of her social circumstances that she cannot but vent it through spirit possession. Mieko’s moral stance towards the most sophisticated lady in *The Tale of Genji* is one of sympathy elevated to the point of identification. Through her essay, Mieko asserts a relationship between female pollution and a specifically female power. Through

her vindication of Lady Rokujō as a spiritually empowered female archetype, Mieko simultaneously vindicates her own role as shamaness.

Cixous once argued that woman's true essence cannot be found in the existing phallocentric system of representation, because in them the Medusa has been identified as a fearful archetype (for men):

The Dark Continent is neither dark nor unexplorable.—It is still unexplored only because we've been made to believe that it was too dark to be explorable. And because they want to make us believe that what interests us is the white continent, with its monuments to Lack. And we believed. They riveted us between two horrifying myths: between the Medusa and the abyss....

Wouldn't the worst be, isn't the worst, in truth, that women aren't castrated, that they have only to stop listening to the Sirens (for the Sirens were men) for history to change its meaning? You only have to look at the Medusa straight on to see her. And she's not deadly. She's beautiful and she's laughing.³⁴ (emphasis in original)

In a similar vein, Enchi's depiction of Rokujō/Mieko as a shamaness in *Masks* exemplifies a reinterpretation of the Japanese archetype of male fear. Identifying Lady Rokujō as a victim of male oppression, instead of a villainess, Mieko is the embodied image of the empowered female who could challenge the social construct of a solid masculine self:

Just as there is an archetype of woman as the object of man's eternal love, so there must be an archetype of her as the object of his eternal fear, representing, perhaps, the shadow of his own evil actions. The Rokujō Lady is an embodiment of this archetype. (57)

男が永遠に愛しつづける女性の原型があるように、永遠に恐れる女性もある筈である。それは、男性の悪の影法師かもしれない。六条御息所はそういう女性のシンボルである。(875)

However, in terms of her shamanic behaviour, what differentiates Mieko from Lady Rokujō is that, instead of wreaking vengeance on her female rivals, Mieko looks to men as the ultimate source of women's oppression. Mieko—and Enchi as well through her presentation of the protagonist—seem to realize that it is men who have led women to hate women, “to be their own enemies, to mobilize their immense strength against themselves, to be the executants of their virile needs,” as Cixous puts it.³⁵ In *Masks* women are entwined by blood, forming a community against the patriarchy. Thrilled by “the prospect of a baby with Akio's blood in [its] veins” (126), Yasuko actively participates in Mieko's scheme to impregnate Harume; i.e. she is willing to become Mieko's accomplice, rather than just an accessory. In fact, in Mikame's eyes, Yasuko seems to have more shamanistic influence than does Mieko:

“Do you really think that Mieko has that much of the shamaness in her? It wouldn't surprise me if it were Yasuko who dominated *her*, behind the scenes. That's what her pupils will tell you. ” (13; emphasis in original)

「そうかな。梶尾さんてそんな巫女じみた女かな。..... むしろ、泰子さんがお姑さんを看板にして動かしている、あそこの歌の社中の話をきいても皆、そんな風に言うがね」 (852)

Mikame's sense of uncertainty suggests that there seems no clear hierarchy between Yasuko and Mieko as is asserted elsewhere. United in their common quest for a child, Yasuko and Mieko are mutually linked to the multiplicity of women's spirits in the past narratives that are cited in the text. Despite her compliance with Mieko's formidable will, Yasuko remains a speaking and thinking subject. Even Harume, whose fertility simply functions as a vehicle for Mieko's vengeful purpose, retains a certain degree of subjectivity, as in the scene when she is in bed with the deceived Ibuki:

Despite the clear apprehension in her look, she showed no sign of fear. When Ibuki

suddenly released her body, her eyes roamed his face in blank amazement, a smile of physical satiety curving her mouth. (110)

不安の表情の鮮やかなほど恐怖が春女をすくませている様子もない。急に身体をはなした伊吹の顔に呆然と瞳をさまよわせながら、春女は官能を満たされた微笑を頬に溜めていた。

(900)

Given her reduced mental state, Harume in such a sexual scene is associated with the role of the *miko*, an ancient Shintō priestess and medium who experiences sexual intercourse sinlessly in a state of trance during exorcism rites. However, aside from showing her physical satisfaction, the camellia petal-like lipstick mark she (accidentally or intentionally?) left on Ibuki's chest (which eventually leads to Sadako's suspicion of Ibuki's infidelity), seems to suggest her active participation in the scheme. In other words, at this very moment Mieko and Yasuko seem to have united together with Harume in her body. It is worth noting that in the room where the intercourse takes place hangs a portrait of the young Mieko looking down on Ibuki as if she were supervising the event. At this point in time, the three women have closely united right there together in fulfilling the revenge plot. Through forging an alliance, the three women are able to subvert the traditional ideas of *miko*/shamaness as passive vessel into empowered women who can inspire respect and a sense of awe.

Although still entrapped within the logic of phallocentric difference, *Masks* reclaims the matrilineal origins of "blood lineage" from their conventional subordination to patrilineal ideology. At face value, the novel might be read as a simple story of vengeance. If we agree with what Mieko argues in her essay—that male critics are mistaken to interpret Lady Rokujō as simply jealous and vindictive—we would be no less mistaken to

read Mieko's similar story simply as one of vengeance. It is not so much the destruction of male hegemony as the reconstruction of female subjectivity and power that is crucial in this novel. Enchi's *Masks*—and Mieko's essay on Lady Rokujō—should be read as treatises about female creativity and self-empowerment.

Li Ang in Transformation

Since her debut in 1968 Li Ang's fiction has dealt with topical and idiosyncratic subjects; she is prone to engage taboo issues. In particular, most of Li's works address the dark aspects of women's changing social and sexual consciousness in the context of a male-centred society. After her major breakthrough novel, *The Butcher's Wife*, Li moved the stage of her fiction from her hometown Lugang to Taipei³⁶ where the bubble economy had been booming throughout the 1980s. Her fiction *Anye* 暗夜 (Dark Night, 1985) "describes the complex, and sometimes slightly contrived, social and sexual relationships of a group of middle- and upper-class men and women living in the intensely materialistic environment of Taipei's financial circles," as Howard Goldblatt puts it.³⁷ Although she wrote *The Butcher's Wife* with a number of feminist ideals, Li claims that "the ultimate concern of a piece of feminist literature is, after all, human nature."³⁸ By the time she wrote *Dark Night*, Li seemed less concerned with "femininity" (*nüxing*) than with "humanity" (*renxing*), tackling issues of human nature in a rapidly transforming Taiwanese capitalist society that has often been plagued by damaging money games.

After the repeal of martial law in 1987, Taiwan underwent drastic social and political changes, giving rise to an open search for Taiwanese identity, particularly at the

grass-roots level of society. However, the determined quest for Taiwanese identity began several decades earlier than 1987. In particular, Peng Mingmin is seen by many as the most prominent prophet in this regard. Opposing the previous orthodox paradigm that considered Taiwan as an inseparable part of mainland China, Peng's work promoted a new model of Taiwan-centered identity, in which the historical, cultural and political ties between Taiwan and China were significantly de-emphasized.³⁹ He argued that Taiwan had been first deserted by the Qing Dynasty, who saw it as a land of "rebels, bandits, pirates, misfits, and opium addicts," and was heartlessly abandoned again by China after its loss of the war against the Japanese in 1895.⁴⁰ As a matter of fact, during the hundred year period of Japanese colonization (1895-1945) and the KMT's rule (1949-1987), Taiwan had no political ties or cultural contacts with China. Peng argued that the influences from the West and Japan on Taiwan run deeper, and are in fact more beneficial, than Chinese culture.⁴¹

Li Ang's commitment to feminism and socialism is connected with her inclination to the Taiwan-centred camp. While many contemporary writers started grappling with political issues in a number of different approaches, Li was a trailblazer in linking gender issues to the question of Taiwanese identity. With a Taiwanese female perspective, Li specifically interrogates the issue of ethnicity in the context of changing political contours and the emerging realignment of political power in Taiwan. In *Labyrinthine Garden*, said to be her most ambitious work so far,⁴² Li ventures to fictionally (re)construct the history of Taiwan from the perspective of a female protagonist who is Taiwanese and who has witnessed both Japanese colonialism and the authoritarian rule of the Chiang regime. In the preface to the novel, Li admits that the significance of her work must lie with the

readership in Taiwan: "For me, the significance of my fiction writing relies primarily on the readership of my fellow citizens. To assume that my writing is not intended only for the twenty million people of Taiwan but for all human beings would be sheer illusion and self-aggrandizement. After all, that would be like building a castle on sand" (我的小說創作的意義，對我個人來說，最主要的該是爲我自己的人民，如果不是爲台灣這兩千萬人創作，而虛幻的、自我膨脹的自以爲是替全人類創作，那麼，終究是站在一個不實在的基礎。).⁴³ Later, her devotion to promoting Taiwan independence was manifested in a 1993 biography of Shi Mingde, a former political prisoner who spent twenty-five years in jail for his dissident political activities, and who twice became the chairman of the Democratic Progressive Party. In the preface she explains that she wrote the biography as a struggle against historical amnesia and an attempt to re-collect the memories of "tears and blood" that mark the history of Taiwan over the past forty years.⁴⁴

Li Ang is sensitive not only to the socio-political milieu surrounding her but is also closely attuned to Western cultural criticism. If her audacious narrative in *The Butcher's Wife* is under the influence of second wave feminism, which took place in the West during the 1960s and 1970s, then the intricate identity politics interlocking gender, race, and nation in *Labyrinthine Garden* may be seen as Li's literary reflections on Third World feminist criticism and her creative response to recent cultural studies with regard to identity politics. In *Labyrinthine Garden* and later in *Beigang xianglu renren cha* 北港香爐人人插 (The Incense Urn of Beigang, 1997), the national narrative is grafted onto the site of the body—the locale in the text for the representation of a distinct Taiwanese identity. Whereas her early works like *Aiqing shiyan* 愛情試驗 (Experiments in Love, 1988), *Tianmei shenghuo* 甜美生活 (Sweet Life, 1991) and *Dark Nights* were written to

deconstruct male definitions of femaleness by parody, her later works since *Labyrinthine Garden* are becoming more analytical, focusing on the political economy of female sexuality. In works like *Labyrinthine Garden* and *The Incense Urn of Beigang* that are created from the edges of the postcolonial world, Li seems to have given up the humanist, liberal image that characterized her in the early 1980s. Rather, she concerns herself much more with issues of sexuality, desire, cultural critique, and nationalistic interests in fin-de-siècle decadent society.

In *Labyrinthine Garden*, Li attempts to relate women's experiences with the four hundred year history of Taiwan's successive colonizations. In particular, she draws on the politics of memory/identity to posit a counter-memory/history to the authoritative official version of Taiwan's history. By evoking historical memory, Li reveals the unspeakable and unspoken sufferings of the native Taiwanese in the past, and ventures to wrestle with the intriguing identity issues of Taiwan in a particular socio-historical context.

Historical Memory and Identity Construction in Postcolonial Discourse

Primarily inspired by French "high" theory, notably the poststructuralist studies, postcolonial theory has been attempting to make obvious both the nature and the impact of colonial power relations, and their continuing effects on modern global cultures and politics. It involves the discussions of experiences of "migration, slavery, suppression, resistance, representation, difference, race, gender, place, and responses to the influential master discourses of imperial Europe such as history, philosophy and linguistics, and the fundamental experiences of speaking and writing by which all these come into being."⁴⁵ As many critics have pointed out, postcolonial studies are based on the "historical fact" of

colonialism/imperialism and the diverse material effects that this phenomenon has brought about. In other words, the historical phenomenon of colonialism is the absolute determining factor for postcolonial societies.

History writing is political because it is constructed, shaped, and dispersed by current politics. It has been pointed out that historians produce knowledge about the past rather than recover the truth of it. For instance, Joan Wallach Scott holds that history "is not purely referential but is rather constructed by the historian. Written history both reflects and creates relations of power. Its standards of inclusion and exclusion, measures of importance, and rules of evaluation are not objective criteria but politically produced conventions."⁴⁶ In this light, the problem of history becomes extremely crucial for postcolonial studies as different interpretation of the past inevitably leads to different perception of the current affairs and surely commands divergent perspective onto the future. Furthermore, as Bill Ashcroft, Gareth Griffiths and Helen Tiffin argue, the postcolonial task "is not simply to interrogate the message of history, which has so often relegated the individual post-colonial societies to footnotes to the march of progress, but also to engage the medium of narrativity itself, to reinscribe the 'rhetoric,' the heterogeneity of historical representation."⁴⁷

Like the history of a nation, personal individual memory is a heavily-constructed narrative and operates under the pressure of challenges and alternatives. While counter-history aims to distort the adversary's self-image through the deconstruction of his memory, "counter-memory designate[s] the residual or resistant strains that withstand official versions of historical continuity."⁴⁸ As Natalie Zemon Davis and Randolph Starn have pointed out in their introduction to a special issue on historical memories, "by whom,

where, in which context, against what” are the key questions that need to be addressed whenever memory is evoked.⁴⁹ In fact, the connections between national identity, national narrative, and individual memory have been explored by many critics and scholars.⁵⁰ Following Foucault’s claim that “Nothing in man [sic]—not even his body” escapes “the influence of history,”⁵¹ historians and critics have argued that conceptions of identity—for example, gender, race, and sexuality—are in fact historically constructed, rather than being natural or essential as previously assumed. Questions of identity are, as Stuart Hall holds, always questions about representation:

They are always questions about the invention, not simply the discovery of tradition.

They are always exercises in selective memory and they almost always involve the silencing of something in order to allow something else to speak.

Silencing as well as remembering, identity is always a question of producing in the future an account of the past, that is to say it is always about narrative, the stories which cultures tell themselves about who they are and where they came from.⁵²

At core, memory is the fundamental force behind identity formation and self-understanding. If our identity is inevitably intertwined with how we narrate our past, then how history is evoked and represented becomes an issue of pressing importance for a postcolonial subject to (re)construct his/her identity. Arguably, to have a history means to have “a legitimate existence,” as history often legitimates the one(s) who construct(s) the history.⁵³ Much of the new social history written about the marginalized depends on the return to the private sphere and the practices of everyday life as such counter-memories provide alternatives to the official memory of public historiography. By posing a counter-memory to the orthodox/colonizer’s history, the silenced and the excluded Others are able to re-present themselves; and, in turn, to destabilize and subvert the hegemonic

narrative through their representations and counter-narrative.

Li Ang's *Labyrinthine Garden* can be seen as a task of reformulating a counter-narrative to the Chinese national narrative through a reconstruction of the historical memories of Taiwan, particularly when she evokes the obliterated historical memory of the February 28 incident from the point of view of the victims and their families. In Taiwan, the repeal of martial law in 1987 can be seen as final moment of the KMT's authoritarian rule, which shared essential characteristics with Japanese colonialism. Since then the orthodox history of Taiwan began to face increasing public challenge. Without the fear of persecution, it became possible to talk openly about the traumatic February 28 incident of 1947, in which thousands of Taiwanese are believed to have been slaughtered by the KMT's army in the name of maintaining social order. Remembering the February 28 incident and redressing the wrongs caused by the KMT government in this most tragic moment of Taiwan's modern history became a hot issue in the political and cultural spheres of post-1987 Taiwan. Archival materials that had heretofore been classified were made available to scholars, and a group of historians was commissioned to conduct comprehensive research on the incident and to produce a series of reports. In the KMT's official archive filed by Bai Chongxi, the then-Minister of Defense of the Nationalist government in Nanjing, the incident was recorded as a riot fomented by the Taiwanese because of the influence of fifty years of sordid, evil education from the Japanese, and by some mad, ambitious communist schemers.⁵⁴ Consequently, the incident prompted the state to make diligent efforts to reinforce the supremacy of Chinese identity over Taiwanese identity through a variety of high-handed programs of re-sinicization and mandarinization.

As soon as political suppression began to subside in the late 1980s, the long-suppressed movement toward Taiwanese identity formation began to re-emerge. (In fact this movement can be traced as far back as 1895 when Japan's colonization of Taiwan began.) Over the years, especially since 1987, a large number of contentious articles and books have been written about the February 28 incident, mostly in opposition to the official version of the event. One of the dominant views within the counter-history camp holds that the incident was an angry reaction to KMT-inflicted oppression; and despite innumerable tragedies and misfortunes resulting from it, it was seen as a phenomenal phase in Taiwan's long-fought on-going struggle for independence and democracy.⁵⁵ Families of the victims and a number of dissident intellectuals strongly urged the government to recognize, apologize for and provide compensation for the victims of its wrongful action in this tragic incident. Under the leadership of Li Denghui, the first native Taiwanese president of Taiwan, a monument in memory of the victims was built in Taipei on the 50th anniversary of the incident.

The emerging counter-memories and counter-histories of the February 28 incident intend to expose the arbitrary and totalizing nature of the KMT's national narrative and problematize the standpoint from which that narrative was formed. However, very few of those counter-memories are (re)constructed from the viewpoint of female Taiwanese. Just as they were excluded from the grand narratives of Japanese colonialism and the KMT's authoritarianism, women seem to have been overlooked again in the currently on-going (re)construction of Taiwanese identity. As women in colonized societies are doubly colonized by both colonial and patriarchal ideologies, their postcolonial task is to closely analyze colonial *and* indigenous patriarchal powers, and the crucial archival work as well,

so any of the lost/neglected female cultural text and resistance can be recovered. This urgent task will lend substantial help to opening up the closed official narratives of nationalism currently undergoing consolidation in today's newly transforming Taiwan. As a topical writer, Li Ang is one of the most prominent and influential voices in relating, reflecting on, and explicating the intricate relationship between women's experiences and the colonial history of Taiwan. Taking as her protagonist the daughter of a victim of the February 28 incident, Li's *Labyrinthine Garden* not only critically re-visions Taiwan's history from the poignant perspective of a native Taiwanese woman, but warns its reader about the possible dangers and contradictions, and possibly repressive nature of the unwitting suppression and exploitation of women when engaging in the current project of (re)constructing a nationalist Taiwanese narrative.

Labyrinthine Garden

As her first long novel, Li Ang started writing *Labyrinthine Garden* in 1986 and had it serialized in the *China Times* after four years of writing.⁵⁶ Like *Masks*, *Labyrinthine Garden* is divided into three parts; but unlike the former, which is told by a third person narrator, the latter has a relatively complicated narrational structure. *Labyrinthine Garden* has a third-person narrator and two first-person narrators (Zhu Yinghong and her father). Each of the three sections has two chapters and each chapter is comprised of two smaller sections. The first section of each chapter narrates the childhood of Zhu Yinghong, the female protagonist, and life in the Hanyuan, the Lotus Garden, where the Zhu family has taken up residence. Through the account of Zhu Yinghong's traumatic personal experiences, the tragic life of her father Zhu Zuyan, representing the doomed fate of the

Taiwanese people of the past, is revealed. The second section of each chapter centres on the now-adult Zhu Yinghong's love story with Lin Xikeng, a self-made business tycoon in the exuberant real estate industry of Taiwan. With two interlocked thematic threads—the reconstruction of Taiwanese history and the pursuit of female sexuality and identity—the narrative of *Labyrinthine Garden* shifts back and forth between the past and the present, between the Lotus Garden and Taipei City, between the father-daughter relationship and the man-woman love affairs.

The novel starts with Zhu Yinghong narrating her own birth in a grade three composition: "I was born in the last year of the Sino-Japanese War" (我生長在甲午戰爭的末年).⁵⁷ Then the invisible and omniscient third-person narrator takes over to unfold Zhu's childhood. The reader is told that Zhu's innocent statement about her birth flies in her face, and she is openly ridiculed by her teacher and classmates because the Sino-Japanese war broke out at least half a century before she was born.⁵⁸ Right from the beginning, this anecdote succinctly reflects the extent to which Zhu Yinghong's mind and sense of self have been inscribed with the (counter)history of Taiwan by her father, even before she can comprehend the whole historical picture and its intriguing complexity. Her father later rationalizes Zhu Yinghong's innocent statement in a certain way that regards the Sino-Japanese War (1894-1895) as a critical turning point for Taiwanese, since it led to the Japanese colonization of the country:

...I used to think that the Sino-Japanese War was both a beginning and an end to the Taiwanese people, as the destiny of the Taiwanese has been fatefully determined since that critical moment. My arrest and imprisonment, concurrent with the annihilation of the Taiwanese elites, was but another inevitable extension of the Taiwanese people's tragic fate. For good or ill, I was released on the assumption

that I would soon be dead from a serious illness. As it turned out, however, I have been dragging out my life ignobly to witness the tragedies still in store for the Taiwanese.

……我過去總以為，甲午戰爭是台灣人的一個開始、也是結束，始自那時刻，台灣人的命運就已宿命的被決定。我的被抓與被關，同時台灣精英的被掃除殆盡，不過是另個延續台灣人宿命悲劇的必然方式。只是幸運或不幸，以為我重病將死，方放我出來，卻讓我苟延殘存這許多年，來親眼目睹，等待著台灣人的還不知是怎樣悲慘的將來。(32)

Zhu Zuyan is not only a victim of the traumatic February 28 massacre but formerly a colonized subject under Japanese rule. While being brought up under the Japanese colonization, he was taught by his father to resist the foreign invasion by refusing to speak Japanese at home. He reminisces about this to his daughter:

“Your grandfather had always been strict about us speaking only Taiwanese and not Japanese at home ...he taught us from our childhood the concept that the Japanese are not only a different race but invaders. I never forgot his precepts, but ironically one day I came to realize that compatriots of the same race could be even crueller and bloodier than were the invaders of a different race. As such, now I choose to use the language of a different race; and furthermore, I am using it to teach my own children.”

「但妳祖父一向有嚴格的教訓，在家裏絕不能講日語，一定只能說臺灣話，…妳祖父自小教導日本人是異族，是侵略者的觀念，我現在都沒忘…可笑的是有一天我發現，不是異族，但比異族還殘酷，不是侵略者，但比侵略者還更血腥，所以，我又用了異族的語言，而且來教導自己的小孩」(198)。

Zhu Zuyan ironically uses the previous colonizer's language (Japanese) to betoken his rejection of the new oppressor's culture (that of the mainland-born KMT people). In this regard, it is noteworthy that throughout his remaining life after release, Zhu Zuyan has

communicated only in Japanese, particularly in correspondence with his daughter when she was studying in New York. Also, he always addresses his daughter as Ayako 綾子 instead of Yinghong 影紅, a genuine Japanese name as opposed to Chinese. As Faye Yuan Kleeman suggests, for people of Zhu Zuyan's generation, such a strategic choice of using the Japanese language asserts a defiant self-identification that voluntarily puts one in the position of an "interpellated" subject.⁵⁹ Sadly however, Zhu Zuyan is deprived of any possibility for fulfilling his dream, let alone his political ambitions. As such Zhu Zuyan has symbolically become a socially disabled person, just as he has become physically disabled through the torture and crippling of his feet while he was a prisoner of the KMT regime. For Zhu Zuyan, the Lotus Garden becomes the only free and secluded space where he can manage to recover a minimum degree of health and dignity. During the time of Zhu Yinghong's childhood he is confined to the Lotus Garden under the harsh surveillance of the authorities.

Built two hundred years before, Hanyuan the Lotus Garden (homonymous with "Han Chinese" garden) once was one of Taiwan's most elaborate gardens in the Chinese style.⁶⁰ Previously a concrete symbol representing the fortunes and power of the landed gentry, the garden also bears witness to the family's humiliation and downfall after Zhu's apprehension and persecution by the authorities. Later on he abandons himself to collecting cameras, stereos and Mercedes-Benzes, merely whiling his life away. Refurbishing the garden, and growing plants only of native Taiwanese species is one of the things into which he throws himself, in order to keep his body and soul together. Of greater significance is the fact that Zhu Zuyan teaches his daughter the family genealogy and the history of Taiwan with thoughtful details, not only contrasting Chinese style with

native Taiwanese but also revealing his awakening to identity formation and transformation. Moreover, this childhood education later exerts a profound influence on Zhu Yinghong's love relationship with Lin Xikeng; she inevitably submerges herself within the guidance of these two most important men in her life, struggling to make sense of the contrasts and compensations between them as she struggles to locate her gender identity.

Zhu Yinghong first met Lin Xigeng at a pub among a group of real estate tycoons. While abominating the cheap and bawdy sex of the nightclub world, she is nonetheless immediately captivated by Lin's fine and tall figure, his youthful success, and most importantly his melancholic dark qualities. Dancing with Lin, Zhu is helplessly dominated by his dictatorial, self-conceited personality, and even fantasizes about being his love slave:

In a trance, I can't stop but thinking that, if only Lin Xigeng could acknowledge and understand me, I would willingly follow this fine man of good figure anywhere and do anything he pleases.

Never have I had such a powerful surge of desire for a man I've only known for a couple of hours. It's not that I have never been attracted to a man's distinction in the past; but at this very moment, I can hardly resist the intoxicating desire within my heart for indulging myself in this man's embrace and caresses, and feeling his bodily pressure upon me.

恍惚中我止不住的想，那片刻中只要林西庚知曉並懂得，我會願意同這高壯美麗的男人，到任何地方作任何事。

從來不曾，我對一個剛認識幾個小時的男人有如此強烈的渴求。過往我不是不曾為男子的美麗著迷，但絕不是像這片刻，我止不住自己心中醞釀的縱情渴望，這般想望著男人懷抱的感覺、撫觸與重壓。(47-48)

In the novel, Li Ang frequently employs the technique of "indirect free speech" to blur the boundaries between character and narrator so that the voice of the character becomes embedded in the voice of the narrator.⁶¹ As the above quotation shows, these inserted monologues become interlaced with the omniscient third-person narrative so that the protagonist's sexual desire and great affection for Lin is revealed in her own voice. The monologues, representing Zhu's reminiscences of and reflections on the development of her love relation with Lin Xigeng, are intertwined with the narratives of constructing a family genealogy and national narrative, which are iterated by the third-person narrator. With this narrative strategy of shifting between the present and the past and intertwining the third-person narrative with Zhu's monologues, Li Ang manifests not only the intricate interlocking of gender and national narratives but the very feeling of rupture experienced by the female protagonist.

As if they are fated for each other, Lin is no less attracted to Zhu than she is to him. He is fascinated meeting a woman "as if born in the last century" who has acquired "the kind of female qualities of serenity from back in the old times...the conventional virtues of Taiwanese women, like chastity, docility, good upbringing, and cute cleverness...." (好像生在...生在上個世紀...有那個時代的女性的那種安靜...那種傳統台灣女人的美德，像貞潔、柔順、有家教、乖巧... 48). From their second encounter, Lin seeks to conquer her by showing off his financial power: showing her his Rolls-Royce limousine, talking of his habit of flying first-class around the world for vacations, and chatting with her on international phone calls for hours. Submitting herself to a man she loves and worships, Zhu feels tremendously happy and carefree. However, as their relationship further develops, Zhu discovers that Lin is a married man who practices casual sex and keeps concubines. Most

importantly, Lin refuses to change anything for her, so Zhu decides to break up with him. As they are preparing to say farewell, Lin once again displays his desire and ambition of being a conqueror:

She obeys, as usual, to his hint that she open the gate to the courtyard, where she lets him lead her hands to touch him. Zhu Yinghong is absentmindedly performing whatever movements he suggests. However, nothing remains within her heart but sheer hopelessness and emptiness as a result of his impending departure. Nonetheless, Zhu Yinghong is startled at the agility of his adroit undressing and exposing of his pertinent body part while standing neatly.

By the touch of her hands, she feels the man's excitement has risen to the point of no return. This powerful expression of masculinity is just like Lin Xigeng's personal character with which Zhu Yinghong is so familiar. She is so charmed as to lower her head, staring at what is in her hands.

"So big!" she mumbles with fascination.

A pair of powerful hands press upon her shoulders and she understands what he wants. She bends hesitantly but his hands forcefully press her down until her lips touch it.

She begins by squatting, but after a while she changes her posture to kneeling with both knees on the ground. This gesture reinforces his imposing manner, consistently inducing her accustomed yielding and obedience to him.

在他的示意下，她一向對他的屈從仍存在，她遵從的打開大門，來到院子裡，任他牽引著她的手去撫觸他。朱影紅無甚意識的在他的指引下做被要求的動作，心中仍充滿他即將離去的絕望空茫。倒是林西庚那般技巧嫻熟的打開自身衣物，露出身體適當部位而能衣著整齊的站著，他的熟練與適當裸露的方式，令朱影紅一陣驚心。

.....朱影紅從手中的撫觸知覺男人的亢奮，並很快的一發不可收拾。那男性本能的強悍表達能力，一如熟悉的林西庚個性，迷惑與讚嘆使朱影紅低下頭，珍惜的注視手中所有。

「好大。」她迷亂的說。

.....一雙有力的手臂在她的肩頸施予壓力，她懂得他要的，彎下身來，遲疑中，他的手強勁的引導著她，終於她的唇觸撫到它。

她原是蹲著，時間稍久她換轉姿勢，跪下正臨他的高度，那雙膝著地的跪姿加強他站立的雄踞氣勢，也引發出她一貫對他的屈服與屈從。(87-88)

While flaunting his inflated penis, Lin half forces Zhu to kneel before him to perform oral sex, as if giving her a farewell souvenir. Passively responding to him, Zhu is hardly aware that he is treating her as his prey.

Despite her failure to win him over completely, Zhu Yinghong continues to feel affection for Lin. Scheming to accommodate her own sexual desire, she begins a weekly rendezvous with Teddy, a married businessman who is well known for his sexual appetite and prowess. Dissociating love from sexual desire, Zhu uses Teddy's ministrations for pleasure and relief for her physical frustrations, in order to enable her to calmly capture Lin again at her leisure. When Lin finally asks Zhu out again, she arranges yet another session with Teddy prior to the important date with Lin. In this sexual encounter, she mounts Teddy's body, feeling that she is the one who is launching an attack, energetically turning Teddy into her prey:

Breathing in rhythmic spasms, she involuntarily presses, extends to push forward her most private long and narrow interior tube to lay bare her vulva so that she is ready to smother the fervent thrusts in waiting. She feels as if her private part is swelling forward, hissing like a snake, ready to capture the man's erection. Eventually, the prey is totally enclaved; Zhu Yinghong inhales deeply feeling fully contented from engulfing him and being filled up.

她吞吐、律動的內在，壓縮著窄長的管道，推擠著，延伸著朝前推進，凸顯出外在的部份以便去包容，去及早容納等待進入的穿刺。她感到身體的那部份在膨脹著朝前，昂揚吐信般的要攫獲男人準備好的挺立。然後終於完整的包圍住那獵物，緊吸並充塞的感覺使朱影紅深深吸口

However, there is another desire buried deeply in Zhu's body that cannot be soothed by a penis. Later, while still maintaining the stuffed feeling in the lower part of her body provided by Teddy, Zhu feels a concealed surge of desire that awakens due to Lin's skilled caresses. In an ecstasy unconnected to sexual intercourse, Zhu's insatiable desire is quenched with true love—all of a sudden, she realizes how deep her love is for Lin. Ironically, when she is about to confess her true feelings for him, Lin starts bragging about his manual prowess while at the same time conceding that lately he has been sexually impotent, perhaps as a result of his excessive sexual activities in the past.

Zhu Yinghong goes along with Lin Xigeng to explore the sensuous decadent underworld of Taipei. Partly because Lin needs more stimulation to recover his sexual function, they play various kinds of sexual games at a number of unusual sites, such as in the limousine, among the weeds, or when they are massaged by a blind masseuse. Despite these sensuous adventures, Zhu never obtains anything meaningful in return for her true love; Lin fails to make any commitment even when Zhu gets pregnant by him. Utterly disappointed and disheartened, Zhu decides to have an abortion without consulting Lin, as she refuses to use the baby as a means to forcefully confine him to a marriage. She returns to the Lotus Garden to regain her autonomy, instead of continuing to be Lin's love slave. Coming from a lower class family and without a proper education, Lin has always admired and is much fascinated with Zhu's gentle origins among the learned gentry. When Zhu stops catering to his interests, she becomes even more noble and unattainable than ever to him. Meeting her again in the Lotus Garden, Lin finally decides to divorce his wife and marry Zhu. He proposes to her in his usual proud tone: "As you were born

and brought up in this garden by your father, I would like to help you refurbish it so that our children can also be born and raised in the Lotus Garden.”(妳父親讓妳生在這個園子，在這個園子長大。而我，我要幫妳把園子整個修復，以後，我們的孩子，也會生在『菡園』，在『菡園』裡長大。265)

With Lin's financial assistance, the garden, deserted since the death of Zhu's father, is restored and thrives again. However, against Lin's wishes, Zhu Yinghong decides to donate the garden to a public foundation so that it can forever belong to the twenty million people of Taiwan and avoid any future risk of becoming the property of the coercive government that had cruelly persecuted her father. This decision is also made out of her anxiety that she might not always be Mrs. Lin.

Besides rebuilding the garden, Zhu Yinghong also restores the name of the first generation patriarch of the family, Zhu Feng, a pirate, to the family genealogic records, risking the effects of a vicious curse imposed by Zhu Feng's abandoned wife generations ago. This curse, which proclaims that whoever inserts the name of Zhu Feng back into the family genealogy will extinguish the Zhu family altogether, has long haunted the Zhu descendants. As the novel concludes, it appears as if the curse has indeed taken effect, as Lin seems to have lost his sexual function when he tries to make love to Zhu Yinghong in the Lotus Garden. Realizing that she may never be able to bear his children, the distressed Zhu Yinghong becomes very eager to have one more look at the garden right away, lest it is about to vanish all of a sudden. From where she stands in the dark night, Zhu Yinghong overlooks the garden that is ablaze with lights, thriving brightly as if it were burning with an intense fire.

Enigmatic Maze of Labyrinthine Identity

As the title suggests, *Labyrinthine Garden* is like an enigmatic maze that entraps its reader with abundant allegories of ethnic identity, cultural politics, gender relationships, and national identity. The interpretive difficulties of the novel derive from its ambitious combination of attention to the decadent gender relationships in Taipei on the one hand, and its fundamental concern with the reconstitution of the national memory/history of Taiwan on the other. In a manner similar to the rather negative responses Li Ang has received for her earlier controversial/influential works, the bold depictions of sexual scenes in the novel are read by some critics as simply morally depraved. For one, Lü Zhenghui denounces the morbid negativity that he finds grossly incompatible with the other serious issues in the work, and concludes that the novel contains an "incorrect ideology of vulgar capitalism."⁶² Conversely, some feminist readers defend the erotic adventures of Zhu Yinghong, which they say should be read as rites aiming to exorcize unsound gender relations⁶³ or as part of the maturing process women have to undergo so that they can achieve sexual autonomy or regain consciousness under the dominant patriarchy.⁶⁴ Unimpressed with the "political thread" of the novel, however, most feminist readers regard the combination of national narrative and the narrative of gender relationships as an unfortunate flaw. For example, Huang Yuxiou is sceptical of the "political thread" which is asserted in flashbacks but unsubstantiated or sometimes even contradicted in the narrative of the female protagonist's present life.⁶⁵

Perhaps with an unspoken binary or essentialist ideology—a novel should be either about gender *or* about nation—the aforementioned commentaries either failed to appreciate the two intertwined thematic threads in narrative combination, or rather

oversimplified the deep ambivalence and profound complexity of the novel. Indeed, it is my contention that colonial historical memories play an important role in the shaping and transforming of the female protagonist's gender relationships. As a leitmotif of the novel, the statement in Zhu Yinghong's elementary school composition does suggest that her historical memories, mostly received from her father's teaching, predominate over the construction of her national and gender identity, and in turn dictate her love relationship with Lin Xigeng. In terms of critically relating memory to history and vice versa, it is of pressing importance to say that remembering is not simply an act of reiterating history but a process of using limited and discrete memories to re-arrange or re-compose the past. Often, when memory is evoked, experiences of remembering tend to reinforce certain details, and the process of remembering becomes elusive and complicated as every remembering may recollect different details.⁶⁶ Through such constant re-arranging and re-composing of historical memories, one reaches an explication of the past and comes to realize the significance of his/her present life. As such, for the purpose of analysis, it is imperative to acknowledge the critical function and influence of memory-cum-history, and the dominant effect they combine to exert on the female protagonist's construction and transformation of national and gender identities.

In *Labyrinthine Garden*, the text constantly shifts back and forth between the past and the present, drawing parallels between Zhu Yinghong's father-daughter relations on the one hand and her love relations with Lin Xigeng on the other. For instance, right after the scene in which Zhu and Lin are making love in a limousine, the narrative shifts back to her memories of riding with her father in his Mercedes-Benzes. With this shifting narration, the reader is prompted to parallel and compare the two most important men in

Zhu Yinghong's life: Zhu Zuyan and Lin Xigeng, both providing crucial knowledge and experience for Zhu in constituting her identity. Whereas the father enlightens Zhu on the family genealogy, Taiwan's history and her femininity, Lin coaches her on the exploration of sensuality. Despite their different temperaments, Lin and Zhu Zuyan share similar uniquely Taiwanese characteristics and both feel strong and proud to be Taiwanese. Unlike Zhu Zuyan who can only narrate Taiwan's history and its national fate to his daughter or denote his identification with Taiwan by refurbishing his isolated garden with Taiwanese plants, Lin physically embodies the Taiwanese spirit through entrepreneurial expansion of his local and international businesses. It is no accident that Zhu Yinghong falls in love with a man who is as blatantly masculine as Lin. Although Zhu Zuyan continues to symbolize the Law of the Father inside the Lotus Garden and to his daughter in particular, his crippled social status signifies his emasculation by the ruling powers. Under the oppressive atmosphere of colonialism, Taiwanese women often witnessed the symbolic castration of the men close to them.⁶⁷ In a similar fashion, haunted by the inarticulate fear of the "white terror" after the February 28 incident, Taiwanese men were virtually reduced to zero masculinity. Therefore, reconstructing Taiwanese men's masculinity and dignity has become a subconscious task for postcolonial Taiwanese women, to relieve their men from the constantly agonizing burden of historical memory. Li Ang depicts how this phenomenon has affected Zhu Yinghong's construction of the gender relationships in her life.⁶⁸ With the miraculous expansion of his business enterprises, reflecting the so-called "Taiwan miracle," Lin not only embodies the spirit of Taiwanese men in general, but also represents an example of reclaimed Taiwanese masculinity.

Right after the scene in which Zhu Yinghong performs oral sex for Lin when they are about to break up, the narration shifts from the third-person to Zhu's first-person narration, recalling the traumatic images of her father being arrested and taken away from the Lotus Garden. The lingering melancholy on her father's face and the fear of forever losing her father have haunted Zhu Yinghong since her childhood. Lin's leave-taking awakens her memory of her father being taken away which, in effect, reinforces Zhu's pain—it is a repetition of the experience of losing a man she deeply loves. As Lin is leaving, she rushes upstairs, attempting to have a last look at him before he really parts from her life. Then suddenly, she realizes that when her father was being taken away, it had been impossible for her to see his facial expression in the dark night. The haunting memory of this particularly painful image is actually a combination of two incidents, she realizes: one is the fact of her father's apprehension, and the other is her witnessing of her teacher being arrested and taken from school by soldiers.⁶⁹ The stream-of-consciousness mode of narration in this section of the text connects the past and the present, in which the disappearances of three major male figures in her life are overlaid. When she realizes that she has been deceived by an inaccurate memory, all the agonies she has gone through in all the previous years seem to have become meaningless. This realization and new interpretation of her memory partly resolves her traumatized childhood experience of losing her father and, more importantly, presages an optimistic future in her relationship with Lin. Although she could not do anything to alter the course/outcome of her father's or her teacher's disappearance, she can at least avoid a repetition of history by making every effort to keep Lin.

Zhu Yinghong's re-insertion of Zhu Feng into the family genealogy has significant

implications in the grand project of re-visioning the national narrative. Contrary to the conventional reading of Zhu Feng as a pillaging pirate who brought indelible shame upon the family, Zhu Zuyan characterizes Zhu Feng as a nationalistic hero who helped people immigrate to Taiwan in defiance of the Ming Dynasty's isolationism and its policy of curfew at sea. Eulogized by Dutch sailors as the "China Captain,"⁷⁰ the Robin Hood-like pirate-merchant Zhu Feng embodies the adventurous spirit of self-made migrants that are good at trade. By highlighting the similarities between Lin Xigeng and Zhu Feng, Li Ang reinforces the concept that an adventurous entrepreneurial spirit is characteristic of Taiwanese people and constitutes their vitality. In so doing, Li is able to interrupt the Chinese national narrative and to postulate Taiwanese men and women as people of an independent nation. Xu Xinliang, the former chairman of the opposition political party DPP, also advocates a similar treatise in his book *Xinxing minzu* 新興民族 (The Rising People, 1995). He holds that Taiwan is a nation of immigrant people who are good at assimilating different cultures, ingenious in exploiting what they have learned from without, and very commercially-oriented in engaging in trade.⁷¹ Theoretically this bears potential (post)colonialist significance in analyzing issues of national narrative and gender identity. That is, both Li and Xu's postcolonial readings problematize the conventional view of Taiwan as merely an adjunct to the grand narrative of China's history. Alternatively, they attempt to open up the possibility of Taiwan having a distinct national narrative of its own.

In the novel, Zhu Zuyan admires his pirate ancestor so much that he plants many flame-trees (*fenghuang mu* 鳳凰木), which are indigenous to Taiwan, in his garden. He even once considered changing the name of the garden to "Fenghuang yuan" 鳳凰園 in

commemoration of Zhu Feng. *Feng* 鳳, the Chinese character shared by the names of Zhu Feng and the flame-tree, refers to a kind of mystical bird symbolizing periodic destruction and re-creation, like a phoenix reborn from its own ashes. For Zhu Zuyan the blossoms of these trees that flame in summer represent the vigorous vitality of the Taiwanese people who can always survive destruction to be reborn. However, despite his admiration for and identification with Zhu Feng, in the end Zhu Zuyan gives up the idea of renaming the garden and dares not risk his honour to rewrite the family genealogy, probably because of the matriarch's vicious curse. As Zhu Zuyan's two sons who were sent abroad for a better environment in which to grow up eventually sever all ties to the family and the nation, his dream of restoring the pride of the family and the nation falls upon Zhu Yinghong, who is now seen as the only true heiress of the Zhu family.

Apart from the heroic characteristics that Zhu Zuyan admires, Zhu Feng was in fact a polygamist who abandoned his wife and children to flee Taiwan with his mistress. Chen Shi, Zhu Feng's wife, is presented by Zhu Zuyan as a prophet and an energetic matriarch, who had been born with mixed parentage: aborigine, Dutch and Han Chinese. She had laid down the family rule, observed thereafter for over three hundred years, in which her husband's name was to be expunged from the family genealogy. Her curse had been passed on from generation to generation as "whispers" (*eryu* 耳語), gaining vigorous momentum as the family had expanded and divided into many branches. The figure of Chen Shi reminds us of the shamaness in *Masks* who exemplified the female archetype of male fear. For the Zhu family's male descendents, the shamaness-like Chen Shi embodies a mysterious yet powerful force that rouses a man's double fear: the fear of women and the fear of failure to produce a male heir for the family. According to the

Chinese/Japanese/Taiwanese-inspired *ie seido* (family system) that still exists in Taiwan, to pass the lineage through the male line is the most important mission of each male descendant. It is debatable, however, whether the power of the curse would have the same effect on the female descendents. Seemingly, the only possible way to annul the curse is to designate a woman to do the job of resurrecting Zhu Feng. By donating the garden to the public and rewriting the family genealogy, Zhu Yinghong achieves what her father dared not, and succeeds where her father failed—openly identifying with the land and showing her pride in being a Taiwanese.

As if it were a woman's preordained fate, Zhu Yinghong experiences desertion by the man she loves, as did her foremother Chen Shi. However, in contrast to Chen Shi who was unable to change her situation except by imposing a curse, Zhu Yinghong transforms herself from passive prey into an active man-hunter who eventually recaptures the man she loves with her feminine scheming. It is worth noting that whenever Lin enters the garden he gets lost without Zhu Yinghong's guidance; more significantly, he feels so intimidated by the omnipresent gaze of Chen Shi as to become impotent in the garden. In the womb-like garden where women (Chen Shi and/or Zhu Yinghong) effectively reign, Lin's masculine superiority is reduced to oblivion: i.e. sexually impotent, and financially deprived of the ownership of the garden (after it is donated to the public). Like Mieko in Enchi's *Masks*, Chen Shi and Zhu Yinghong make scheming and great use out of the little they have to drastically undermine the patriarchy, and reclaim their female power.

For good or ill, each character in the novel experiences dramatic events and fluctuations in her/his life. As a result, their identity is incessantly being tested and transformed so as to accommodate the hybridized complexity of the much broader

socio-political milieu in which they struggle, and to reflect the malleable flexibility of the so-called "Taiwan spirit" to which they adapt. Consequently, Taiwanese identity is being constructed and re-constructed with intense ferment and transformation. For instance, the pirate-merchant Zhu Feng, wanted by the Ming and later the Qing Dynasties, is an ambivalent figure. The mixed blood Chen Shi transforms into a powerful matriarch after being deserted. The ambitious Zhu Zuyan who holds high hopes for Taiwan's democracy is sadly obliterated into a social invalid indulging in collecting luxuries. The labyrinthine Zhu Yinghong drastically changes from a feminine girl to a man-hunter, finally becoming a mature woman who enjoys sensuality, and thus remarkably achieves much more than her father ever did. The upstart Lin Xigeng who used to wear clothes made from flour bags in his childhood becomes a business tycoon and is now dressed extravagantly only in brand names, but in the end he is relegated from a sexual stud to an impotent man. Unique in the (post)colonial historical context of Taiwan, all of the characters contain both masculine and feminine features to the extent that the line between the dominant and the subordinate is rather ambiguous.⁷²

Like most postcolonial writing that regards the hybridized nature of postcolonial culture as a strength rather than a weakness, *Labyrinthine Garden* elucidates the fact that the transactions of the postcolonial world are not a one-way street in which oppression demolishes the oppressed or the colonizer silences the colonized in absolute terms. That is, Taiwan has developed a distinct hybridized identity of its own that comprises not only rebellion/exclusion but also assimilation/inclusion of previous colonization(s). We witness both paradoxical dimensions in Li's novel. For instance, while holding Chinese chauvinism up to ridicule through the words and deeds of Zhu Zuyan, Li Ang also raises

some serious doubts and questions regarding the Taiwan-independence fundamentalism that advocates a radical change from Taiwan's current ambivalent status quo. Fully aware of the temptation and danger of returning to some atavistic, "pure" and nativist "Taiwanese" identity, Li's text not only illustrates the highly contested hybridized identity formation and transformation to drive home for its reader the profound complexity and heterogeneity of identity politics, but also attempts to reinvent a narrative that "deliberately makes visible, within the very structure of its narrative forms, its own repressive strategies and practices."⁷³ With its abundant allegories of land and identity, *Labyrinthine Garden* might fit into the category of the Nativist literature that has been booming in Taiwan since the late 1970s. However, in contrast to the traditional Nativist literature that regards Taiwan as an immovable, pure native land upon which "authentic" Taiwanese identity is constructed, the native land of Taiwan in Li's novel is insightfully treated as a space of continually shifting meanings and a site for the perpetual contemplation of the problem of identity construction.⁷⁴

As a symbol of Taiwan, Zhu's donation of the Lotus Garden to the public allegorically signifies Taiwanese people's reclamation of the land that historically has long been invaded and exploited by different races and powers. This seemingly happy ending is at once shadowed by the bleak prospect of Lin becoming impotent and the couple remaining barren. Lin's impotence, resulting from his previous promiscuity, suggests that the matriarch's curse has been realized. Being symbolically castrated in the text, Lin's (temporary or permanent?) impotence might be seen as the author's invalidation of Lin's masculinity, obtained as it was through his ever-expanding capitalist enterprise as well as his innumerable sexual conquests. When the threat of castration from

the authoritative rule(s) disappears, women's suppression under the indigenous patriarchy resurfaces. In particular, the strategy of suppressing women, using them merely as steppingstones for constructing a new masculinity and national identity, is often re-employed when the colonial yoke is lifted. In this text we see Lin using the sexual conquest of women to help construct his own postcolonial identity. Since Zhu Yinghong is the focus of the novel, Lin's masculinity must be problematized after she has woken up from the colonial nightmare(s).

Ambiguously, Zhu Yinghong's last fervent gaze at the garden seems to suggest an alternative interpretation of the curse. Just as her haunting memory of having lost her father is resolved by a re-composed memory, Zhu's anxieties of losing everything including progeny and the garden seem to have been relieved when her gaze confirms the existence of the thriving garden. That is, if the garden does not vanish, why should their barrenness necessarily come to pass? Besides, the matriarch's curse was originally intended to apply to the patrilineage, the male descendents. Since Zhu is a daughter, and therefore not usually expected to assume the responsibility for carrying on the family line, the curse might not work its vicious effect on her after all. One could also argue that the Zhu clan may have already been terminated after Zhu Zuyan sent away his two sons who eventually severed all ties to the family and the land.⁷⁵ Although he does not resurrect Zhu Feng himself, it is Zhu Zuyan's teaching that eventually leads his daughter to fulfill his dream. In this sense, the curse may have already worked, not on the daughter but on the father, as his teachings provide the inspiration for Zhu Feng's eventual restitution to the family genealogy.

The recovery of memory is never an innocent act, as it partakes in the forging of the

present by pretending to speak about the past. The operation of memory in Li Ang's *Labyrinthine Garden* is effectively exploited to intervene in the constructions of national narrative as well as gender narrative. With the female protagonist's seemingly optimistic view of her future—which is in fact gleaned from her discursively re-constructed historical memories—Li not only successfully completes a counter grand narrative through her work but indicates a rather promising future for Taiwan, *if only* the dangerous repressive natures within the structure of its narrative forms are not overlooked.

Writing Her-story: Enchi Fumiko versus Li Ang

Both Enchi Fumiko's *Masks* and Li Ang's *Labyrinthine Garden* are complex multi-layered novels that brilliantly explore contemporary women's empowerment within the male-centric social imaginary. Significantly, both authors use, as their primary structuring metaphor, an item from each culture's traditional, artistic past: the Noh masks for Enchi and the classical garden for Li. Each of these items is effective in connoting layeredness—the double face implied by a mask, and the labyrinthineness of the Lotus Garden. Like most postcolonial writing that concerns itself with the hybridized nature of post-colonial culture, both novels lay emphasis on the fragmentation, complicatedness, and heterogeneity of postcolonial identities through such a device, a means of evading the replication of the binary categories of the past and developing new anti-monolithic models of thinking. With intertextual references to *The Tale of Genji* and other classic literature, *Masks* is presented through many kinds of performance depicted in the novel, such as the Noh plays and the layeredness of spiritualism which needs the spirit, the medium and the person possessed. Moreover, its labyrinthine structure is further

complicated by numerous triangular relationships in the novel—the female triangle of Mieko, Yasuko, and Harume; the traditional romantic triangle of Yasuko, Ibuki, and Mikame; and the duplicitous triangle of Yasuko, Ibuki, and Harume. These triangles and other uses of the number three contribute to weaving a web so intricate that the conspiracy of the major player, Mieko (whose name means “three-layered-child”), is concealed.

In *Labyrinthine Garden*, the fragmented and complicated form of narration suggests the rupture of historical time characterizing a repeatedly colonized Taiwan. Li Ang’s work exemplifies the extent to which this sense of rupture regulates the general social and private life of people in Taiwan. Moreover, the novel’s fractured and interrupted narrative is further complicated by its prologue and epilogue—both are about the garden donating ceremony—that tightly enclose the main text like a womb or cocoon, symbolically speaking. In the prologue there is a juxtaposition of two donating events: a group of gay men who are canvassing in bars for subscriptions for their friend suffering from AIDS; and the broadcasting of Zhu Yinghong’s garden donating ceremony, which is shown on a huge television wall. Interestingly, in both novels the issue of homosexuality is employed (if only briefly and indirectly) by the writers to contest the system of patriarchy. However, the issue of homosexuality brought up in Li Ang’s prologue does not simply serve to criticize masculine phantasms and homophobia, but metaphorically relates gay men with women in term of their marginalized positions, prophesying the female protagonist’s potential power to subvert the dominant hegemonic narrative.

In *Masks*, Enchi creates a type of femme fatale—the vengeful mistreated woman who desires to reveal her secret self and power. In antithesis to the “good wife and wise

mother" model promoted by the government, such a femme fatale not only constitutes a grave threat to men but seriously challenges the national narrative founded upon the notion of the *kazoku kokka*, the family nation. Unlike *Masks*, which obviously posits patriarchal oppression as the primary foe, women's liberation in *Labyrinthine Garden* is further complicated by the history of colonization and the issue of national identity. Under the colonial rule(s) prior to the repeal of martial law, Taiwanese women suffered the pain of witnessing their fathers/husbands/brothers/sons being symbolically castrated by the dominating authority. Unlike Enchi who never explicitly raises the issue of national identity or the definition of Japaneseness in her novel, Li regards pursuing Taiwan's national identity or the so-called Taiwaneseeness, after waking up from the colonial nightmare, as the most important issue in the novel. Comparatively speaking, this difference can be traced back to the divergent historical experience of colonialism of the two countries. When suffering cultural imperialism in the Meiji period, or direct "colonial" domination by the Allied forces after World War Two, Japanese people were not stripped of their language or identity. They may have struggled with the humiliation of having "Japaneseness" marked as inferior in the hegemonic value structure, but "Japaneseness" itself remained intact. On the contrary, the colonizers in Taiwan, whether the Japanese or the KMT, made great efforts to eradicate anything representing Taiwaneseeness, and tried to transform Taiwanese people into Japanese or Chinese. Understandably, when Taiwan finally became an independent entity, one of the most urgent tasks was the recovery and reinterpretation of the selectively obliterated histories and then affirming a new national identity.

The difference between the way the two authors deal with the national identity issue

might also be attributed to the different time periods when these two novels were created. Produced in the 1990s when an international discourse of postcoloniality prevailed, Li Ang seems to have been attuned to the latest cultural critical theories and engaged in writing for both national and international audiences,⁷⁶ whereas Enchi may have never imagined that anybody besides Japanese people would ever read her book when she was writing back in the 1950s, a period of time in which there was virtually no broad awareness of postcoloniality.

In both novels, men are treated merely as means for fulfilling women's sexual desire and empowerment. While the unwitting Ibuki in *Masks* is set up to perpetuate Mieko's matriarchal lineage, the horny Teddy in *Labyrinthine Garden* is used by Zhu Yinghong to relieve the sexual anxiety deriving from her unsuccessful romance with Lin. In Enchi's work, the paternal lineage is deprived of its rights and interests; in Li's work, it is further insulted when Zhu Yinghong "pollutes" Lin's embryo with Teddy's sperm and then terminates her pregnancy without even consulting Lin. Ironically, women's reproductive capacities—which so long have been exploited as to maintain and prolong the patrilineal kinship system—become the most powerful destructive weapon for subverting that system. At the end of *Labyrinthine Garden*, the philanderer Lin is textually castrated after his masculinity fulfills the missions of healing Zhu Yinghong's traumatized colonial memories and helping with her national identity (re)construction. Also, it is not until Zhu has overcome the fear of her father's emasculation by the colonial power that she comes to realize her subordination in the gender relationship with Lin. For Zhu, she has to overcome the effects of colonialism *before* she can encounter gender inequality and embark on her identity (re)construction. Comparatively speaking, this two-stage process

of awakening indicates one more structural hurdle, and much more intricacy and complication, for the identity formation of Taiwanese writers and readers than their Japanese counterparts. In fact, Li's rather ambiguous ending seems intended to insinuate the female protagonist's attainment of self-consciousness and her subversion of the prevailing power paradigms.

On the issue of masculinity/potency, the two authors compose completely different tunes. In *Labyrinthine Garden*, Lin Xigeng is very masculine, virile, sexually aggressive, and confident. His masculinity is enshrined to reflect the political need for reclaiming racial/ethnic pride, and in turn alleviates the female protagonist from her traumatic colonial memories. However, at the end of the story, Lin is textually emasculated through impotence. Conversely, in *Masks*, none of the men is ever explicitly emasculated—they all remain masculine and potent, and sexually active: this is true for Toganō, Mieko's secret lover, Akio, Mikame, and Ibuki. While not all of them father children, there is nothing to suggest that they are incapable of doing so. Far from depicting men's impotence, in Enchi's novel men's sexual desire, their masculinity/potency, especially Ibuki's, is crucial to fulfill Mieko's plan of subverting the patrilineage.

In terms of the depictions of masculinity, the stark contrast between these two works calls for postcolonialism(s) to shed new light, together with insights from feminist/gender theories; this contrast calls for further study. For Li Ang, the emasculation of Taiwanese men—first by the colonizers and later by the postcolonial circumstances in the female labyrinthine garden—is a major point. However, for Enchi, emasculation is not mentioned as it is not the point. We might speculate that this difference derives from the fact that Enchi is aware not only of Japanese men's experience of being emasculated by

the colonizers but also of their once being colonizers who attempted to emasculate others. As such, she might have had no sympathy for Japanese men's problems in postcoloniality, quite contrary to Li's sympathy for the complicated situation of Taiwanese men.

With subversive intent, Enchi and Li incorporate either the ancient canon or historical memories into their texts to re-present and re-construct the meanings of particular grand narratives in each nation. Reflecting their specific socio-historical backgrounds, Enchi illustrates a powerful backlash against the residual impact of the rigid gender and family systems imposed in the Meiji period and maintained through 1945, whereas Li testifies to the remarkable extent to which the engagement with historical memory is connected to questions of identity and national narrative. In terms of exploring gender relationships, both texts produce a wonderful site for our critical investigation into the intricate interlocking of gender, race, and nation in women's identities.

Notes

-
- ¹ Also known as Ueda Bannen, Ueda Kazutoshi studied with B.H. Chamberlain, the pioneer Japanologist and British philologist, and introduced Western research methods into the study of Japanese language and linguistics after four years of research in Germany and France. He participated in the compilation of the influential dictionary *Dai Nihon kokugo jiten* (Greater Japanese Dictionary) and trained numerous researchers in his capacity as a member of the Kokugo chōsa iinkai (National Language Research Committee). He was respected in his field and well known on the literary scene.
- ² Enchi Fumiko 円地文子, "Watashi to bungaku no aida" 私と文学の間, in *Enchi Fumiko zenshū* 円地文子全集 vol. 16 (Tokyo: Shinchōsha, 1978), p.43.
- ³ For information on Enchi Fumiko's biographical background please see Itō Hatsuko "Enchi Fumiko," in *Tanpen josei bungaku: kindai* 短編女性文学, ed. Imai Yasuko 今井

- 泰子(Tokyo: Ofūsha, 1997): pp. 228-36; Takenishi Hiroko 竹西寛子, "Enchi Fumiko" 円地文子, *Nihon kindai bungaku daijiten* 日本近代文学大事典 vol. 1 (Tokyo: Kōdansha, 1977), pp. 235-7; Yumiko Hulvey "Enchi Fumiko," in *Japanese Woman Writers: A Bio-critical Sourcebook*, ed. Chieko Mulhern (Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1994): pp. 40-60.
- ⁴ Enchi, "Watashi no rirekisho" 私の履歴書, in *Nihon Keizai Shimbun* 日本経済新聞, 1983, cited by Juliet Winters Carpenter in "Enchi Fumiko: A Writer of Tales," *Japan Quarterly* 37, no. 3 (July-September, 1990): p. 344.
- ⁵ "Intabyū: Enchi-shi ni kiku," インタビュー: 円地氏に聞く interviewed by 熊坂敦子, *Kokubungaku kaishaku to kyōzai no kenkyū: Tokushū* 国文学解釈と教材の研究, 37 (July, 1976): pp. 27-8.
- ⁶ Takenishi Hiroko, "Enchi Fumiko," p. 236.
- ⁷ The other is Nogami Yaeko who received this honour in 1971.
- ⁸ Enchi Fumiko, *Onnazaku* 女坂, trans. by John Bester as *The Waiting Years* (Kodansha International, 1971), p. 203.
- ⁹ Okuno Takeo 奥野健男, "Eien ni osorerareru onna: Enchi Fumiko no bungaku" 永遠に怖れられる女: 円地文子の文学, *Bungakukai* 文学界 (1959), in *Enchi Fumiko zenshū* 円地文子全集, vol. 3 (Tokyo: Shinchōsha, 1978), pp. 375-85.
- ¹⁰ Mishima's comment is drawn and quoted by Enchi herself in her "Watashi no rirekisho," in *Nihon Keizai Shimbun*, no. 26, 1983, cited by Carpenter in "Enchi Fumiko: A Writer of Tales," p. 353.
- ¹¹ Enchi, "Watashi no rirekisho," pp. 352-3.
- ¹² Hélène Cixous, "The Laugh of Medusa," trans. Keith Cohen and Paula Cohen. *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society* 1, no. 4 (1976): pp. 875-93.
- ¹³ Murō Saisei 室生犀星, "Ōgon no hari" 黄金の針, *Fujin kōron* 婦人公論 (1960), in *Enchi Fumiko zenshū* 円地文子全集, vol. 14 (Tokyo: Shinchōsha, 1978), pp. 307-15.
- ¹⁴ Joan Ericson, "The Origins of the Concept of 'Women's Literature,'" in *The Woman's Hand: Gender and Theory in Japanese Women's Writing* (California: Stanford University Press, 1996), pp. 101-2. Also, see Catherine Ryu, "A Golden Needle, A Rabbit's Tail, and the Density of Female Body Fat: An Analysis of Murō Saisei's Metaphors for Enchi Fumiko's Writing Libido," in *Love and Sexuality in Japanese Literature*, ed. Sekine Eiji (West Lafayette, IN.: Association for Japanese Literary Studies, 1999), pp. 264-73.
- ¹⁵ Murō, "Ōgon no hari," pp. 310-1.
- ¹⁶ Yoshinaga Seiko, "Enchi Fumiko and Re-writing Postwar Japan: Translating Classics, Women, and Nation.," Ph.D. dissertation. (University of Pennsylvania University: 2001), p. 57.
- ¹⁷ Murō, "Ōgon no hari," p. 307.

- ¹⁸ Mishima Yukio 三島由紀夫, "Sakuhin-hyō: Fuyu momiji" 作品表: 冬紅葉, *Gunzō* (1959) 群像, in *Enchi Fumiko zenshū* 円地文子全集, vol. 3, p. 368.
- ¹⁹ Okuno, "Eien ni osorerareru onna: Enchi Fumiko no bungaku," p. 384.
- ²⁰ Murō, "Ōgon no hari," p. 307.
- ²¹ Yoshinaga Seiko, "Enchi Fumiko and Re-writing Postwar Japan: Translating Classics, Women, and Nation," p. 66-7.
- ²² Enchi Fumiko, *Masks (Onnamen)*, 1958), trans. Juliet Winters Carpenter. (New York: Adventura, Vintage Books, 1983), p. 30. Page numbers in parentheses refer to Carpenter's English translation.
- ²³ It is interesting to note that the title of the novel, *Onnamen* 女面, literally "female mask," is reduced to "masks" only in the English translation.
- ²⁴ Enchi, *Onnamen* in *Shōwa bungaku zenshū* 昭和文学全集 vol 12, ed. Inoue Yasushi (Tokyo: Shōgakkan, 1986-1990), p. 858.
- ²⁵ For more information on Noh drama based on *The Tale of Genji*, please see Janet Emily Goff's *Noh Drama and The Tale of Genji: the Art of Allusion in Fifteen Classical Plays* (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1991).
- ²⁶ As the traditional Noh performance requires an all-male cast, masks seem to be irrelevant to gender distinction. Donning the mask, the actor can be either man or woman as need be. Such transformations through masks bring about the "revival of the androgynous one-ness of the ancient." This may imply a deconstruction of the logic behind phallogocentric difference. For the quote, please see Thomas Immoos, *Japanese Theatre*, (New York: Rizoli, 1997), p. 44.
- ²⁷ Ikeda Yoshiko, "Parental Attitude Toward Twins in Japan," in *Japanese Culture and Behavior: Selected Readings*, ed. Takie Sugiyama Lebra and William P. Lebra (Honolulu: University Press of Hawai'i, 1974), p. 316.
- ²⁸ Doris Barga, "Twin Blossoms on a Single Branch: The Cycle of Retribution in *Onnamen*" *Monumenta Nipponica* 46, no.2 (Summer 1991): p. 154.
- ²⁹ One night, Yasuko who woke up from a terrifying nightmare was comforted by Mieko. Invited into Mieko's quilt, Yasuko "lay encircled in Mieko's arms, her chest heaving so that it brushed with each sharp intake of breath against the round swelling of Mieko's breasts.... Gently, as if it were a little child that she held in her arms, Mieko patted and brushed back the cold sweat-soaked strands of hair along Yasuko's brow. At the same time her legs began a smooth, rotary motion like that of paddle blades, softly stroking and enfolding Yasuko's curled-up legs" (ドキドキ波打っている泰子の胸の鼓動が恰度三重子の抱いている乳のふくらみに触れた。..... 三重子は、幼い子供にするように、泰子の冷たく汗ばんでいる額髪の乱れを掻き撫でてやりながらきいた。三重子のすべすべした足はそんな間にも自然に水掻きのように動いて軟かく泰子のすくめた足を掻き抱くようにした。62; 877).
- ³⁰ Yumiko Hulvey, "Enchi Fumiko," pp. 40-60. Also see Barga, "Twin Blossoms on a

Single Branch: The Cycle of Retribution in Onnamen," pp. 147-71.

- ³¹ Ironically, Ibuki's bloodline is carried on not by his legitimate daughter but by the boy to whom Harume gives birth, yet without bearing the name of Ibuki as the father.
- ³² Elizabeth Grosz, *Volatile Bodies: Toward a Corporeal Feminism* (Indiana University Press, 1994), p. 203.
- ³³ Nina Cornyetz, "Bound by Blood: Female Pollution, Divinity, and Community in Enchi Fumiko's *Masks*," *U.S.-Japan Women's Journal English Supplement* 9, (1995): p. 29.
- ³⁴ Cixous, "The Laugh of Medusa," pp. 884-5.
- ³⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 878.
- ³⁶ In this dissertation, whenever referring to the city of 台北 I use "Taipei" instead of its pinyin "Taibei," as "Taipei" is more commonly used internationally.
- ³⁷ Howard Goldblatt, "Sex and Society: The Fiction of Li Ang," in *Worlds Apart: Recent Chinese Writing and Its Audiences*, ed. Goldblatt (Armonk, N.Y. and London: M.E. Sharpe, 1990), p. 189.
- ³⁸ Li Ang, Author's Preface to *The Butcher's Wife and Other Stories*, *Li Ang*, trans. and ed. Howard Goldblatt and Ellen Yeung (Boston, MA: Cheng & Tsui, 1995), p. x.
- ³⁹ Peng Mingmin 彭明敏, *Ziyou de ziwei—Peng Mingmin huiyilu* 自由的滋味—彭明敏回憶錄, translated from English into Chinese by Lin Meihui. (Irvine, Calif.: Taiwan Publishing Co., 1984).
- ⁴⁰ *Ibid.*, p. 250.
- ⁴¹ *Ibid.*, p. 6.
- ⁴² David Der-wei Wang, "Fin-de-siècle Splendor: Contemporary Women Writers' Vision of Taiwan" *Modern Chinese Literature* 6, nos. 1-2 (Spring & Fall 1992): p. 52.
- ⁴³ Li Ang, Author's Preface to *Miyuan* (Taipei: Maitian, 1998), p. 6. As the haunting fears arising from the white terror were still lingering everywhere when she finished writing the story in 1991, Li Ang decided to publish the novel out of her own pocket and solely at her own risk. In 1998, the novel was reprinted by the publisher Maitian in Taipei. Quotations from *Labyrinthine Garden* are drawn from the 1998 edition, and translated into English by the author of this thesis.
- ⁴⁴ Li Ang, *Shi Mingde qianzhuan* 施明德前傳 (Taipei, Qianwei, 1993): p. 1.
- ⁴⁵ Bill Ashcroft, Gareth Griffiths and Helen Tiffin eds. *The Post-Colonial Studies Reader* (London and New York: Routledge, 1995), p. 2.
- ⁴⁶ Joan Wallach Scott, "History in Crisis?" *American Historical Review* 94 (1989): p. 681.
- ⁴⁷ Bill Ashcroft, et al. *The Post-colonial Studies Reader*, p. 356.
- ⁴⁸ Natalie Zemon Davis and Randolph Starn, "Introduction." *Representation* 26 (1989): p. 2. For more on counter-memory, see Michel Foucault, *Language, Counter-Memory*,

- Practice*, ed. Donald F. Bouchard (Ithaca, N.Y., 1977), esp. pp. 139-64.
- ⁴⁹ Davis and Starn, "Introduction." *Representation* 26 (1989): pp. 1-6.
- ⁵⁰ For example, Benedict Anderson, *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism* (London and New York: Verso, 1983).
- ⁵¹ Michel Foucault, "Nietzsche, Genealogy, History" in *Language, Counter-memory, Practice*, ed. Donald F. Bouchard (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press; Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1977): p. 153.
- ⁵² Stuart Hall, "Negotiating Caribbean Identities," *New Left Review* 209, (January/February, 1995): p.5.
- ⁵³ Bill Ashcroft, et al. *The Post-colonial Studies Reader*, p. 355.
- ⁵⁴ Bai Chongxi, "Taiwan shibian de zhenxiang, *Zhengqi yuekan* 2, no. 2 (May 1, 1947): p. 39, cited in *A Tragic Beginning: The Taiwan Uprising of February 28, 1947*, eds. Tse-han Lai, Ramon H. Myers and Wei Wou, (Stanford, California, Stanford University Press, 1991), p. 5.
- ⁵⁵ Peng Mingmin, *Ziyou de ziwei*, p. 120.
- ⁵⁶ The novel was serialized in the *China Times* from August 18, 1991 to March 11, 1991.
- ⁵⁷ Li Ang, *Miyuan*, p. 21.
- ⁵⁸ China's first war with Japan, usually known as the Sino-Japanese War, broke out in 1894, and according to the story Zhu Ying-hong was born sometime in 1943. Japan was again at war with China from 1931 to 1945.
- ⁵⁹ Faye Yuan Kleeman, *Under an Imperial Sun: Japanese Colonial Literature of Taiwan and the South* (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2002), p. 246.
- ⁶⁰ The design of the garden and its planting is in imitation of the famous gardens in mainland China during the period of the Qing Dynasty.
- ⁶¹ Paul Cobley, *Narrative* (London and New York: Routledge, 2001), pp. 84-6.
- ⁶² Lü Zhenghui 呂正惠, "Miyuan de liangxing guanxi yu Taiwan qiyezhū de zhenmao" 《迷園》的兩性關係與台灣企業主的真貌. *UNITAS* 7, no. 11, (1991): pp. 161-5.
- ⁶³ Huang Yuxiou 黃毓秀, "Miyuan zhong de xing yu zhengzhi" 《迷園》中的性與政治 in *Dangdai Taiwan nüxing wenxuelun* 當代台灣女性文學論, ed. Zheng Mingli 鄭明俐. (Taipei: Shi bao wen hua, 1993), pp. 69-107.
- ⁶⁴ Lin Fangmei 林芳玫, "Miyuan jixi: xingbie rentong yu guozu rentong de diaogui" 《迷園》解析：性別論述與台灣小說, in *Xingbie lunshu yu Taiwan xiaoshuo* 性別論述與台灣小說, ed. Mei Jialing 梅家玲. (Taipei: Maitian, 2000), pp. 145-72.
- ⁶⁵ Huang Yuxiou, "Miyuan zhong de xing yu zhengzhi," pp. 98-101.
- ⁶⁶ Gerald M. Edelman, *Bright Air, Brilliant Fire: On the Matter of the Mind* (New York: Basic Books, 1992), P.102, cited in Peng Xiaoyan 彭小妍, "Nüzuoja de qingyu shuxie yu zhengzhi lunshu: jiedu Miyuan" 女作家的情慾書寫與政治論述：解讀《迷園》，in *Lishi*

henduo loudong: cong Zhang Wojun dao Li Ang 歷史很多漏洞：從張我軍到李昂. (Taipei: Zhongyang yanjiuyuan, 2000), p. 163.

- ⁶⁷ Qiu Guifen, "Xingbie/quanli/zhimin lunshu: xiangtu wenxue zhong de qushi nanren" in *Dangdai Taiwan nüxing wenxuelun* 當代台灣女性文學論, pp. 13-34.
- ⁶⁸ Kuei-fen Chiu [Guifen Qiu], "Identity Politics in Contemporary Women's Novels in Taiwan, *Tamkang Review* 30, no. 2 (Winter 1999): pp. 27-54.
- ⁶⁹ Li Ang, *Miyuan*, pp. 89-92.
- ⁷⁰ Li Ang, *Miyuan*, p. 113. The original text specifically uses "China Captain" in English.
- ⁷¹ Xu Xinliang 許信良, *Xinxing minzu* 新興民族. (Taipei, Yuanliu, 1995).
- ⁷² Lin Fangmei, "Miyuan jiexi," p. 169.
- ⁷³ Dipesh Chakrabarty, "Postcoloniality and the Artifice of History," in *The Post-colonial Studies Reader*, p. 388.
- ⁷⁴ Qiu Guifen 邱貴芬, "Nüxing de xiangtu 'xiangxing': Taiwan dangdai xiangtu nüxing xiaoshuo chutan" 女性的鄉土想像：台灣當代鄉土女性小說初探, in *Zhongjie Taiwan nüren* 仲介台灣女人 (Taipei: Yuanliu, 1997), pp.74-103.
- ⁷⁵ In one of his letters, Zhu confesses to his daughter that "Probably I am the biggest sinner in terms of passing on the blood of the Zhu clan in Taiwan for the last three hundred years. I have raised two sons who are outstanding enough to have earned doctoral degrees; spiritually, however, I discontinue their inheritance of the Zhu family" (我很可能是我們朱家近三百年來在台灣相承的罪人。雖然在血脈上我替朱家留下兩個兒子，兩個出色的、拿到博士學位的兒子，可是在精神意義上，我卻斷絕了朱家子孫的承繼。33).
- ⁷⁶ Li Ang's *The Butcher's Wife* has been translated into English, French, and Japanese, and thereafter, Li has been frequently invited to attend international conferences on Taiwanese literature.

Chapter Four

Displaced Subjectivities: Ōba Minako's "The Repairman's Wife" and Zhu Tianxin's "Ancient Capital"

In this chapter, I compare Ōba Minako (1930-) with Zhu Tianxin (1958-) on the theme of displaced subjectivity in their work. Although Ōba's "Yorozu shūzenya no tsuma" よろず修繕屋の妻 (The Repairman's Wife) was written in 1974 and Zhu's "Gudu" 古都 (Ancient Capital) in 1997, the stories are thematically similar—through spiritual and physical displacements the female protagonist is able to renegotiate her own identity, an identity that is intricately intertwined with issues of gender, race, and nation. I find a comment of Gadamer's perfectly captures the reflective function and the spiritual inspiration of displaced subjectivity: "To seek one's own in the alien, to become at home in it, is the basic movement of spirit, whose being is only return to itself from what is other."¹ Through their return from a pilgrimage to the colonizer's country, both female protagonists find a new way of interpreting their relationship with the nation. That is, their identity is located by way of displacement from their own to the alien/other and back.

I will present theoretical formulations on postcolonialism, in particular the concepts of displacement and diaspora, before heading into the discussion and analysis of each text that follows. The general milieu in which Zhu created her novella was historically unique and socio-politically complicated; therefore it calls for another section further elucidating the bitterly fierce debate over the transformations of Taiwan's identity in the post-martial law era. In conclusion I will compare and contrast these two works and writers, both to further the discussion in the preceding chapters about women's writing in postwar Japan

and Taiwan, but also to reflect on the validity and effectiveness of the theoretical framework that I have been using for analyzing women's literary production.

Ōba Minako

Biographical Background

Like Enchi Fumiko and Kanai Mieko, Ōba Minako is noted for her provocative female voice. However, what distinguishes Ōba from other contemporary women writers in Japan is her uncommon cross-cultural perspective obtained from her sojourn in America, mostly in Alaska, between 1959 and 1970. Ōba herself acknowledges that her eleven year's of life in the United States provided her a tremendous sense of liberation.² She could say and do what she could not or dared not in Japan. By depicting fictional female protagonists who often have cross-culture experiences, Ōba tackles issues of gender, race, power, and nation, often challenging and rejecting the ubiquitous model of normative power relations in society while at the same time searching for and suggesting alternative voices.

Born in Tokyo in 1930, the eldest daughter of Shiina Saburō and his wife Mutsuko, Ōba Minako enjoyed her youth in an upper middle-class family.³ Due to her father's occupation, a naval doctor, the family had to move whenever her father was transferred. By the time Ōba graduated from high school, she had experienced more than ten school transfers. Ōba's self-characterization as *nenashigusa* 根無し草 (rootless wanderer) or *hōrōsha* 放浪者 (vagabond), who always tends to write with a loose sense of belonging, is inseparable from her childhood experience.⁴ On top of the frequent moves, Ōba's childhood was also clouded by war. Only one year after Ōba's birth, the Manchurian

Incident broke out in 1931 and significantly increased the tension between Japan and China. This was the beginning of what the Japanese call "the Fifteen Year War," 1931-1945, which culminated in Japan's involvement in World War Two. Therefore, Japan was at war pretty much from the time Ōba was born and throughout her childhood and adolescence until she was a teenager in 1945. Although her father served in the military, her family never hung the Emperor's picture in the house like most Japanese families did. Ōba's mother, a self-aware and assertive woman, openly denounced the *kamikaze* suicide corps and regarded those Japanese who were fanatically joining in the imperialist ambition as lunatics.⁵ Instead of fanatic patriotism, Ōba's young mind was implanted with a rather defiant attitude toward authority in general, and the national government in power in particular.

With a young mind enriched by literature, Ōba found no comfort but reading to make it through the hardships of war. Yet, the young Ōba was often scolded, sometimes even corporally punished by school teachers, for reading *nan bungaku* 軟文学 (soft literature), which was seen as entertaining and therefore unconnected with maintaining a patriotic spirit, according to the ruling military regime. With her subversive, indomitable spirit, Ōba was labelled as *chūi jinbutsu* 注意人物 (literally means a "dangerous" person with a harmful character) who often posed a threat to the authority.⁶ Toward the end of World War Two, her family moved to the small town of Saijō in Hiroshima, where Ōba attended the local girl's high school. In one of its desperate efforts to fight a losing war, the government mobilized all the students to work eleven hours a day at the school-turned-uniform-factory. Only the intermittent air raid alarms temporarily saved Ōba from relentless, backbreaking labour. As a result of a shortage of space in the shelters,

people had to take refuge in the wheat fields. Lying on the warm earth, Ōba was always reading a book while the U.S. B-29s were dropping bombs almost everywhere. On the 6th of August 1945 in Seijō City, Ōba saw a huge mushroom cloud hanging over the sky in nearby Hiroshima City. Joining a student relief squad, Ōba witnessed the terrifying aftermath of the atomic bombing. Surrounded by the grotesquely disfigured dead and people slowly dying in extreme pain, Ōba and the other mobilized students were in fact unable to relieve any of the survivors' suffering except by serving them meals. The hellish scene has haunted Ōba ever since, and reappears over and again in various forms in her writing.⁷ In particular, Ōba addresses this memory of unspeakable devastation in her essays "Jigoku no haizen" 地獄の配膳 (Serving Dinner in Hell, 1972), "Prometeusu no hanzai" プロメテウスの犯罪 (The Crime of Prometheus, 1973) and "Bōrei" 亡霊 (The Spirit of the Dead, 1975). Later in her long autobiographical work *Mae, Mae, Katatsumuri* 舞へ舞へ蝸牛 (Dance, Snail, Dance, 1990) Ōba compares this nightmare to the sensation of being impaled on a hook: "My experiences during the war years continue to burn in my throat. (In the same way that) they say a fish swallows a hook...."⁸

In 1949 Ōba entered Tsuda College, probably the most progressive academic institution for women at the time, where she spent four glorious years of study and freedom. The dormitory life at Tsuda that Ōba still cherishes not only nurtured her dormant seed of self-expression but accelerated her growth in becoming an exceptional female writer. In 1955 Ōba married Ōba Toshio on the condition that she be allowed to continue fiction writing. This "conditional" marriage in which Ōba was able to retain her own self and to pursue her own writing career was quite unusual in the still very conservative environment of Japan a decade after the war. When Ōba Toshio was

appointed as the engineering representative of Japan-Alaska Pulp Company in 1959, the Ōba family moved to Alaska where they made their home for the next eleven years. Ōba left Alaska temporarily to pursue graduate studies in art at the University of Wisconsin at Madison in 1962, and four years later she continued her painting and literature studies in the art program of the University of Washington. At the age of thirty-eight, Ōba published her first short story, and definitively one of her finest, "Sanbiki no kani" (The Three Crabs, 1968) in *Gunzō*, a prestigious intellectual magazine. For this debut work, Ōba won the Gunzō New Writer's Prize and the Akutagawa Prize, two major literary prizes in the same year. Since then she has continued to write both short and long fiction, as well as poetry and essays. In 1987 Ōba was appointed one of the judges for the Akutagawa Prize, only the second woman novelist selected (after Kōno Taeko) to serve on this extremely prestigious adjudicating committee.

Among those factors shaping Ōba's imaginative mind—such as her progressive education, unique family, unconventional marriage and Japan's militaristic past—her witnessing of the atomic bombing of Hiroshima in person and her sojourn experience of displacement from Japan can be seen as two of the most critical in terms of their later profound influence on her writing. Janice Brown points out in an essay titled "Ōba Minako—Telling the Untellable" that Ōba relates the trauma of atomic death with the trauma of gender, a transformation that is vividly reflected in Ōba's *Shishū: Sabita kotoba* (A Poetry Collection: Tarnished Words, 1971). Brown holds that in Ōba's poems "[t]he female body is thus made a problem, while gendered existence becomes a relentless devouring of body/self—brain, blood, the very mouth through which the female voice would speak rendered incapable."⁹ This relation identifies an intersection between gender

and nation through which women suffer differently from, and maybe more than, men.

In her essays on issues of the individual and the nation, Ōba attributes the holocaust of atomic bombings on Hiroshima and Nagasaki to Japan's imperialist ambition, in which the nation had betrayed its people with terrible consequences.¹⁰ Given this attitude, she adamantly disavows any collective solidarity that would damage individuality in any way, especially putting women at the very bottom of its foundational structure. In large part, this is why Ōba creates female protagonists who desire to free themselves from the nationalistic, feudalistic script to develop a language of their own, one true to their gender, through which unspeakable trauma can be articulated. "The Repairman's Wife" is one of her works that best reflect this female desire. The story is set in a multicultural community in Alaska, and, like Ōba's first published piece "The Three Crabs," "The Repairman's Wife" brings identity issues into crisis, using spatial displacement to enable people to reflect upon things that used to be taken for granted. On examining this story, I intend to first of all illustrate her characters' resistance to the conventional roles assigned by the way family and nation are constituted; and secondly reveal their displaced subjectivities in a multicultural community. The first part of my examination of course has much to do with gender studies; the second part, however, points beyond feminism to a set of related issues involving the complicatedness of race and nation. Intriguingly in Ōba's story, all the entrapping structures of nationalities, identities, and the various characters' foundational understandings of themselves, are challenged and dismantled beyond recognition.

Displaced Subjectivity

For my critical analysis of these works, I will be using criticism and theory developed around the concept of displaced subjectivity. In his deconstruction of Western metaphysics, Derrida asserts that traditional thinking since Plato is predicated on a series of binary oppositions, one of which is inevitably valued above the other. In launching an attack on what he calls "logocentrism," which believes that "meaning" and "truth" are guaranteed by an intentional presence outside the words themselves, Derrida proposes the notion of *différance* (a combination of *differer*—deferral or delay—and the idea of difference) to suggest the unfixed, unstable nature of meaning.¹¹ His sense of *différance*, as Christopher Norris puts it,

remains suspended between the two French verbs 'to differ' and 'to defer' (postpone), both of which contribute to its textual force but neither of which can fully capture its meaning. Language depends on difference, as Saussure showed ... the structure of distinctive propositions which make up its basic economy. Where Derrida breaks new ground ... is in the extent to which 'differ' shades into 'defer' ... the idea that meaning is always deferred, perhaps to this point of an endless supplementarity, by the play of signification.¹²

In other words, Derrida's concept of *différance* not only challenges the fixed binaries that stabilize meaning and representation, but shows how meaning keeps on moving to encompass other additional meanings. Derrida further proposes a notion of "displacement": the operation of locating the marginalized term into the center of the dominant one. Through displacement, it becomes obvious how the subject depends on the other to constitute his/her subjectivity.

The notion of Derridean deconstruction has strongly influenced many critics

working in the fields of feminism and postcolonialism, Spivak, Trinh T. Minh-Ha, and Rey Chow, to name a few. It appeals to politically resistant readings precisely because it persists in questioning the logic of opposition that has characterized Western metaphysics, such as universalist, humanist, and colonial discourses. In her heterogeneous interdisciplinary work that synthesizes Marxism, deconstruction, feminism, and psychoanalysis, Spivak sees deconstruction as a reading strategy that consistently questions objectivity.¹³ It is a theoretical strategy that does not inherently privilege or marginalize any voices; as such, it provides a subversive space in which one can intervene in the prevailing discourses without committing oneself to any of the existing structures of power. For Spivak, Derrida's conception of displacement is extremely useful in preventing postcolonial struggle from lapsing into a fundamentalist politics.

In her treatise, *Woman, Native, Other*, Trinh Minh-ha asks a crucial question: How can feminist discourse represent the categories of "woman" and "race" at the same time? She argues that there is no point in choosing to identify either as ethnic or as woman because "You never have/are one without the other."¹⁴ Trinh contends that emphasizing marginalized identities, such as "writer of color," "woman writer," or "woman of color," again partakes in the "Euro-American system of dualistic reasoning and its age-old divide-and-conquer tactics."¹⁵ Incorporating Derrida's concept of *différance*, Trinh believes "what is needed is perhaps not a clean erasure but rather a constant displacement of the two-by-two system of division."¹⁶ She employs the term "infinite layers" to challenge and subvert any unitary identification: "Not One, Not two either. 'I' is, therefore, not a unified subject, a fixed identity, or that solid mass covered with layers of superficialities one has gradually to peel off before one can see its true face. 'I' is, itself,

infinite layers."¹⁷ As shall be seen, this conception of *infinite layers* will shed new light on the identity issues in the work of the two authors addressed in this chapter.

Through displacing and thereby multiplying identity, both Spivak and Trinh demonstrate a way to escape the enclosure of subjectivity. As in Trinh's characterization, "Displacement involves the invention of new forms of subjectivities, of pleasures, of intensities, of relationships, which also implies the continuous renewal of a critical work that looks carefully and intensively at the very system of values to which one refers in fabricating the tools of resistance."¹⁸ As prominent diaspora critics, Spivak and Trinh propose that identity and language be read not as closed, static, and imbued with essences, but rather as performative, "hybrid," "creolised," and existing "on the borders" of various interpellating systems. The theoretical formulation laid out here will be drawn to illustrate the overarching theme of "displaced subjectivities" created in Ōba's "The Repairman's Wife" as well as Zhu's "Ancient Capital." More significantly, in light of this theoretical formulation, we may come to see that both female protagonists eventually resolve their identity crisis, not for good but to a manageable extent, a moment of resolution in which the protagonist is able to locate her self without getting lost in the turbulence of identity (de)construction. My interpretation of these works, in which I find that the protagonists reach a resolution, in fact stands in stark contrast to many a critic who has argued otherwise, particularly in the case of Zhu's "Ancient Capital."

"The Repairman's Wife"

"The Repairman's Wife" is the second tale of a trilogy in *Garakuta hakubutsukan* がらくた博物館 (The Junk Museum, 1975), which received the Women's Literature Prize.

Based in part on her experiences in Sitka, Alaska, the trilogy displays the concept of freedom with which Ōba unfetters herself, and her characters in the story, from the constraint of linguistic and cultural imprisonment back in Japan. The other tales in *The Junk Museum* are: "Inuyashiki no onna" 犬屋敷の女 (The Woman of Dog Mansion, 1972) and "Suguri no shima" すぐりの島 (The Island of Suguri, 1974). Although each story of the trilogy is independent, they share the same characters; and more importantly each is part of a larger narrative. The first story, "The Woman of Dog Mansion," is the tragicomic odyssey of Maria Andrevena, a Russian refugee who lives with her four wolf-like Siberian dogs in her large "dog mansion." A Japanese woman, Aya, is the central character in "The Repairman's Wife"; Aya happens to be the Russian woman Maria's best friend. The trilogy concludes with a story concerning a Spanish man named Carlos. The main characters are all living in (self-imposed) exile from their mother countries in a small town on the west coast of Alaska. My discussion will focus on "The Repairman's Wife," as it is directly related with Aya as a Japanese woman vis-à-vis Japan as a nation, grappling with identity issues of gender, race and nation.

The undramatized, omniscient third-person narrator tells us that Aya came from a destitute family and therefore could not afford a university education despite her determined will and literary talents. Instead, Aya had pursued her dream of becoming an actress in a theatrical club where she met Takanobu, a promising youth who is a graduate from the prestigious Tokyo University. Drawn by Aya's allure as an actress, Takanobu had become acquainted with Aya and eventually married her. However, the marriage turns out to be a youthful indiscretion. Despite his prestigious diploma, the just-graduated Takanobu ekes out a bare livelihood with Aya. However, when Aya quits her job because

of her pregnancy, Takanobu, who is full of boundless ambition to become a wealthy intellectual at the top of the social ladder, begins to disdain Aya for her impoverished background and to blame her for his failure in fulfilling his dream. Hunting richer and more intelligent women, Takanobu commits adultery with a woman doctor—as it happens, the doctor who had delivered their daughter, Chizu. Aya decides to leave him once she finds that the man she had previously looked up to has become a snob who even takes pride in his extramarital affairs with “status-enhancing” women.

Back in her parents’ poverty-stricken house with her new born baby, Aya meets an American soldier named Russ through her brother who works in the army as an interpreter. Russ had voluntarily joined the army out of sheer vexation after he found his wife in bed with a graduate student who happened to be a communist. In their first encounter, Russ is fascinated with the exotic atmosphere around Aya:

When Russ saw Aya sewing on a cushion patterned in flowers, with the sewing board on her lap, he felt suddenly as if fresh, intangible words were being created. The broken foreign language was now much more enchanting to each of them than the fluent mother tongue. (89-90)¹⁹

花ゴザの座布団をしいて、くけ台を膝の下に敷き、縫物をしているアヤの姿を見て、ラスは突然そこにみずみずしい得体の知れない言葉が生まれるように感じたのである。こんな場合、お互いに片言の外国語のほうが流暢な同国語よりずっと神秘的である。(73)²⁰

He immediately asks Aya to come to live with him in America with her baby daughter. Sharing with Russ the experience of having been betrayed and abandoned by a more “intellectual” spouse, Aya accepts the sincere invitation of the “unintellectual” Russ. Leaving with Russ, Aya decides to sever all ties to Japan as her hatred for her husband has turned into her hatred for the nation: “Aya was determined to cherish that small black

seed of hatred in the depths of her heart and to cultivate it over the years like a pearl.” (アヤはその小さい黒い恨みの粒を胸の奥に抱きかかえて、そのまわりを長い年月をかけて真珠のように巻き育てようと思った, 92; 76).

Aya and Russ settle in a small town in Alaska, where Russ works as a repairman. Despite his unattractive appearance and limited education, he turns out to be not only a loving father and husband but an excellent repairman, who is constantly surrounded by many intellectuals for some reason. Like a skilful doctor, he can repair all kinds of odds and ends, from watches to boat and airplane engines, or creatively invent new things out of the old parts. The miscellaneous junk that Russ has collected over the years, such as old kitchenware, broken musical instruments, and helmets from the East and West, is displayed in a dilapidated ship later called the “junk museum.” This museum becomes a landmark listed in the local guide book when Aya starts to sell coffee and cookies in the museum. The odds and ends in the ghost ship possess a strange charm when Aya walks around “trailing the hem of a pale blue kimono that suggested the ethereal, used somewhat ghostly make-up, and played records on an old gramophone” (薄青い幽霊を思わせるキモノの裾を長くひきずって、どこやら幽霊めいた化粧をして、古い蓄音機でレコードをかけていた, 93; 77).

After ten years of marriage, Russ suggests that Aya go back to Japan for a visit and take Chizu to visit her birth father. Out of her intention to exact revenge on her former husband and, by extension, on Japan as a nation-state, Aya decides to take Russ’s suggestion. In a conversation with Maria before she leaves for Japan, the nonconformist Aya is finally able to identify her internalized anger and verbalize her resentment toward Japan in her own language:

"I didn't like people who cooperated with the government. Or rather those who loved the country hated me. But perhaps I was useless. To those who were useful to the country. So in effect the country deserted me.

"No matter how much I loved Japan, Japan didn't care about me one way or the other. And so I was deserted by Japan...."

Aya grew excited as she talked. Her anger at Japan, the land of her birth, which she had been harbouring in her heart for ten years, exploded all at once. (110-111)

わたしはあの国のやり方に協力する人たちが好きじゃなかったの。というよりあの国が愛している人間から嫌われたの。いや、役立たずだったの。あの国にとって役に立つ人間にとって。

わたしがどんなに日本を恋したって、日本はわたしなんかどうだっていいのよ。わたしは日本に捨てられたんだもの。...

アヤは話しているうちに激して来た。それは彼女が十年間心の中で想いつづけて来た、生まれた国、日本に対する恨みつらみが一度に爆発した、といったものだった。(98)

Because her mother had intentionally brought her up independent of her Japanese heritage, the eleven-year-old Chizu, who is called Liz in America, knows hardly anything about Japan or its language and sometime she even feels embarrassed by the Japanese blood in her veins. In confiding her resentment of Japan, Aya warns Chizu that Japan and the people there might not be kind to Chizu. Chizu is not bothered at all by the fact that her mother left her Japanese husband to remarry an American, as parents of her classmates are getting divorced all the time.

Back in Japan, Aya and Chizu finally meet Takanobu after ten years of separation. The older yet still selfish and self-important Takanobu feels that Aya, who looks reasonably well-off, is as attractive as a "nymph" (仙女 112; 100). Takanobu takes them to

an exclusive and expensive restaurant where the authentic Japanese furnishings and food make Chizu feel uncomfortable. At first, Takanobu seems to show an interest in his daughter, but when Chizu starts to talk proudly about her American Daddy he feels offended and becomes impatient. In an effort to impress Chizu favourably, Takanobu compares his high position in one of Japan's largest companies (a firm that exports heavy machinery to countries around the world) to Russ's sales of repaired goods out of "a suitcase." However, Chizu cannot find any greatness in the large scale machines made through the system of division of labour, in which the individual's creativity is not allowed to be any part of the process of production. In her view, those who only tighten a bolt on one part of the machine or are only responsible for selling the machine must be very lonely as they do not know anything inside the machine. Conversely, she thinks that Russ's job produces more meaning and satisfaction than does Takanobu's as Russ is in charge of the entire process of creating and repairing.

Having now taken offense, Takanobu feels that "Suddenly Chizu seemed to him like a cheeky little bitch who got on his nerves, but he tried his best to retain his dignity...."

(急にチズが小癪に障るこまちゃくれた小鬼に見えたが、あくまで威厳を保っておおように言った。

118; 107). While Chizu keeps talking about her American father, the collection in the museum, and the letters he receives from the president and governor, Takanobu notices a shining Alexandrian pendant at Aya's throat, and immediately assumes that Russ must be some sort of hotshot with a fortune. With newly aroused curiosity in Aya, he asks to meet her again without their daughter present. Aya ignores the invitation and returns to the hotel with Chizu. On their way back to the hotel, Aya has a conversation with the taxi-driver who is a veteran of the Navy. Through the taxi-driver's eloquent conversation

about his own life and Japan, Aya realizes that even within Japan there are people who refuse to be part of the state or company machinery where people work “like the ‘ants’ that are scared of falling away from the collective and eke out their lives with tiny crumbs thrown to them.”²¹

That evening, Chizu suggests that she return to America by herself so Aya can stay longer in Japan. However, Aya is determined to go back to the small town in Alaska as soon as possible. Although Chizu could hardly understand the Japanese conversation between Aya and Takanobu, she draws conclusions about the relationship between her mother and her Japanese father based on her observations: “I think he still likes you a little. And though you really look down on him, you’re concerned about him. But that’s why I like you” (あのひと、もしかしたら、お母さんを、まだすこし好きみたい。そして、お母さんはあのひとをほんとうはバカにしている癖に、気をつかっているのね。でも、あのひとに気を遣っているお母さんを、リズは好きなの、132; 124).

And that is how the story ends.

Displacement in the Multicultural Space

Abandoned by her husband and feeling deserted by her nation as well, Aya comes to Alaska with a new-born baby in her arms and a “black seed” implanted deeply in her heart that represents her grudge against her husband and the nation that has made him what he is. Her decision to marry Russ is not simply out of romance but because Russ promises to bring up her baby as his own. More importantly, what Russ symbolizes is everything contrary to Aya’s former husband and the kind of Japan he represents. Leaving Japan with Russ who is “unintellectual,” a foreigner, and a soldier of a nation that not

only defeated Japan in the Second World War but also colonized it for seven years afterward, Aya openly rejects the grand narrative that the modern Japanese state has inscribed onto its subjects. As Yonaha Keiko points out, Ōba believes that to refuse her role in the conventional system, in which woman's individuality is repressed and threatened, is the first step for a woman to pursue her own identity.²² Going into exile becomes Aya's first step in escaping from the grip of the nation-state in order to search for her own identity.

It is of tremendous significance that the story is set in Alaska, a multicultural community situated peripherally to the American mainland and its mainstream culture. Located between Russia and Canada, Alaska still retains Russian cultural traits of a bygone era. At the period when the story is set, America was at the height of its involvement in the Vietnam War, and communism was seen as its mortal enemy and greatest fear. What makes Alaska significant is not only its alienation from the mainland U.S., but also its closeness to communist Russia—America's archenemy at the time. The ambiguity this Alaskan space creates tends to bring people's identity into crisis. Moreover, as this multicultural town is comprised of not only marginalized Americans or Russians but also exiles from other countries (such as the Spaniard Carlos and Korean Sue), Aya's search for her identity and her own language can rather easily escape the danger of being swamped or subsumed as Other under another mainstream power paradigm.

Nonetheless, in Ōba's depiction this multicultural space is never a simplistic utopia. Despite their fascinating talents and interesting personalities, Maria and Russ, as well as other townspeople, suffer from prejudice. Yet, that does not prevent Aya from learning and growing, but rather provides an impulse for Aya to reflect on herself by noticing their

prejudice. In effect, this ambiguous and ambivalent multicultural setting opens up possibilities and opportunities for sensitive individuals in locating and resolving their identity. As suggested by Homi Bhabha in his *The Location of Culture*, "It is in the emergence of the interstices—the overlap and displacement of domains of difference—that the intersubjective and collective experiences of *nationness*, community interest, or cultural value are negotiated."²³ These "in-between" spaces provide "the terrain for elaborating strategies of selfhood—singular or communal—that initiate new signs of identity, and innovative sites of collaboration, and contestation, in the act of defining the idea of society itself."²⁴ In such "in-between" spaces as the peripheral small town community of Alaska, the naturalized, unifying discourse of nation, and the authentic traditions that embody people's identity cannot be readily referenced, and therefore become remote. The displacement, though unsettling, strikes people into an awareness of the construction of culture and the invention of tradition.

Although every character in the story is described either by other characters or by the narrator in terms of his/her race, size, body type, hair color, ethnicity, and nation of origin, the issue of nationality commands rather less importance in conversations between Aya and Maria, which cogently reveal their (as well as Ōba's) deconstructionist views on nationality and power:

Why should we have to love a country just because we happened to be born there? I think that children have the right to desert the parents who are good-for-nothings and citizens have the right to desert good-for-nothing countries...we didn't choose our parents and countries. They were fixed by birth. So you won't be denying yourself if you deny your parents and country when you grow up. If we are to be chained to the country where we were born for our whole lives, we're the same as

slaves, aren't we? (108)

その国に生まれたというだけでその国を愛さなければならない義務なんぞあるものですか。子供はろくでなしの親を捨てる権利があるし、国民はろくでなし国を捨てる権利があると思っているわ。... 親や国は自分で選んだわけじゃない。生まれたときからそうになっていたんです。大きくなって、親や国を否定したからと言ってそれは自分を否定することにはならないわ。生まれた国に一生縛りつけられていなければならないとしたら、それは一種の奴隷じゃありませんか。(95)

Eventually Aya comes to realize that all nations produce the same stratification and marginalization, and that America has its own fanatic nationalism, and intolerance of differences, even in a remote state like Alaska. She confides to Russ that she has no love for America at all, not to mention lacking any desire to give up her life for America, but she might give up her life for him. This clearly speaks for individuality in protest against collectivity of any sort, among which the nation-state is one of the most prominent in claiming utopian ideals and the most powerful in commanding human resources.

As a political exile, Maria experiences intensely the sad reality of being driven out; she calls the people like herself, all living in the small town, "a race of drifters" who are:

a little bit more sensitive than the ordinary person and less easily deceived.... We're people who have to live surrounded by hostility, no matter where we are.... We don't accept what most people are resigned to. They say, 'That's the way things are,' but we say, 'How absurd!' Then the people around us who have given up without a struggle call us vain and begin to hate us." (102-3)

あたしたちが普通の人間よりほんのちょっと感受性が豊かで、騙されることの少ない人間だというだけよ。... あたしたちはどこにいても常に敵意に囲まれて暮らさなければならない人間なのよ。... 大多数の人間たちが、仕方がない、こういうものだと言っていることを、

あたしたちは諦めないのね。これは不合理だ、と思うわけ。そこで周囲の諦めのいい人たちはあたしたちが傲慢だと思い、憎み始めるのよ。(88-9)

The bond between Aya and Maria is significant as they both have overcome feelings of being abandoned and dissatisfactions with their countries of origins in which conventional gender roles were arbitrarily assigned and observed. When the old and big Maria walks with the young and tiny Aya around the town, their mother-and-child-like figures always draw people's attention because they have the same odd air. Sometimes they would gather seaweed on the beach, looking as shabby as beggars, yet sometimes they would be walking along the streets dressed up like movie stars from a generation before. Following racialized gender stereotypes, the townspeople see Aya as timid, simple, and subservient, always following Maria around. As depicted by the narrator, however, Aya is in fact far from subordinate in her relationship with Maria. Despite their shared identification as part of the "race of drifters," both Aya and Maria are able to maintain their own uniqueness and at the same time respect and tolerate each other's difference. Although frequently inspired by Maria's unusual odyssey and sober analysis of the power relations between citizen and nation, Aya feels hardly able to approve Maria's incurable hatred of "American Negroes" simply because she was once attacked by a black burglar. Yet, the two women are closely united by their mutual tolerance and respect.

In the broader context of the community, the relationship between Aya and Maria can be further symbolized by their houses, which blend in with the natural landscape while each retaining its own uniqueness:

That was just about the time when Russ came back from Japan with Aya; for their new home, he bought an old dilapidated house by the sea, surrounded by mountain

ash, willow, and hazel trees, very much like a haunted house. Maria's house, which the townspeople called 'Dog Mansion', was right next door, and while the site was much smaller than Russ', there was a huge Japanese evergreen, and a small marshy stream flowing out from the mosscovered ground in the humid backyard along the border with Russ's site, where yellow cabbage grew in profusion. In front of the two houses was a hedge of sweet briers, and at a glance, the place looked like a single estate with a pair of strange-looking houses. According to local legend, these sweet briers had been brought from Japan a long time ago, but for some reason they were called 'Russian Roses' instead of 'Japanese Roses'. (101)

ラスはその頃、アヤを日本から連れ帰ったばかりだったが、新居として海辺に、これまた幽霊屋敷といったほうがふさわしい、ななかまどと柳と榛の木にかこまれたぼろ家を買った。町のひとびとに犬屋敷と呼ばれているマリヤの家はこの家と隣り合わせにあって、敷地はラスの家にくらべるとずっと小さかったが、大きなあすなろうの木があり、裏庭の湿った苔地からラスの敷地との境に小さな沢が流れて出ていて、そこに黄色い水芭蕉が群生していた。この二軒の家の前にははまなすの垣根が結ってあって、ちょっとみると二軒の家は一對の風変りな家屋のある一つの屋敷とも見えた。はまなすは一説によると昔、日本からもちこまれたものだそうだが、どういうわけかジャパニーズ・ローズとは呼ばれずに、ルシアン・ローズと呼ばれている。(87)

Aya's new house in this distant land presents a striking contrast to the Japanese house where Russ first finds her huddling up in the corner of the room with her new born baby like abandoned dogs. Located in a congested alley, the rabbit-hutch-like Japanese house where privacy is always infringed upon by neighbours gives Russ "the seedy feeling of animals rubbing themselves against each other" (それは丁等動物同士肌をすり合わせる汗っばい感じに似ていた。89; 73). In Alaska, the rigid Confucian *ie* (house) or family system of Japan that has betrayed Aya and her baby has been replaced by an old, dilapidated house. Despite its "wild" and unconventional atmosphere, this "haunted" house is the hotbed of Aya's identity construction and transformation. In this foreign land, the connection

between signifier and signified becomes extremely loose: Aya and Russ's happy home is like a haunted house, and Maria's happy home is called the "Dog Mansion"; similarly, the sweet briars from Japan are called "Russian Roses." In this scene, the existing social and linguistic systems are challenged, and as such the previously-assigned meanings become unstable, unfixed, deferred, and encompassed with additional meanings.²⁵

Just as their houses cannot be easily differentiated from each other yet each still keeps differences of its own, Aya and Maria are able to search for their own identity through a language within which subjectivity is not constructed on subordinating the Other. In this notion of agency, the subject is "active in the sense of a receptivity and openness to others and otherness," as opposed to desiring to dominate and control others and the world.²⁶ The otherness or difference should be taken as a tool of creativity to question and destabilize multiple forms of repression and dominance. Only when the otherness or difference is not denied its equality in every sense but conceived as a constant self-reflective condition of the subject can one be free from the conventional dominating and possessive form of subjectivity.

The ghost-ship-turned-junk-museum itself also manifests the notion of *différance*. It is a ship that is unable to set sail, as well as a museum very different from the conventional sense of the term. Like a newly created piece of sculpture, the ship/museum has its own order formed by the junk displayed in it: "The junk ordered the space in this ghost ship with a strange charm; it gave one the feeling that the ship itself was a sort of sculpture" (それらがらくたはこのお化けや船の中の空間を不思議な魅力のある秩序で埋めていて、いわば、船全体が一種の彫刻といった感じを与えるのだった。94; 78). Unlike the conventional museum that mostly displays items from historically important periods or

once owned by royal families, the collection in the junk museum is made up of discarded belongings from ordinary people's lives in the past. After Russ's creative repair and reassembling, most of the displayed items can no longer be signified by their original signifiers. The items in the junk museum, such as "the windmill built inside a Coke bottle, a violin made of match sticks, a model dungeon made of piles of old coins," and "a doll whose eyes were exquisitely made and yet uncanny, each having two pupils," (93-4) diffuse a tremendous sense of eccentricity that is shared by the repairman himself. More significantly, the ship can be seen as an icon of Japan's military past. At the beginning of the Second World War, the Japanese Navy was arguably the most powerful navy in the world. Its naval aviation corps was the most highly trained and proficient force of its kind. Aya's encounter with a taxi-driver who is an ex-Navy soldier also reinforces the suggested relationship between the ship and Japan's army. Ironically, however, the ship in Alaska is stripped of any military function and made to house the collection of small, odd, and personal things.

Russ is said to have inherited his eccentricity from his uncle Crazy Larry who gave him part of the junk. Aya calls Russ "unintellectual" because he does not have a university degree, yet, as a first-rate repairman his exceptional ability to isolate and solve problems always draws the attention of the intellectuals' around him. Russ's hearing is impaired due to a wartime injury. However, this "disability" does not make him useless, as some people would assume, but in fact helps him focus entirely on his own creative activities. Symbolically, his near-deafness not only prevents him from hearing people's gossip but also shuts away any government propaganda or hegemonic social discourse that locates him in a marginal and inferior position. Free from that distracting "noise," Russ has

gained great insight into the problems of society. His ability to dismantle things into their components and reassemble the old and new parts into a new invention symbolizes the process by which new languages are created.²⁷ No wonder Russ as an eccentric individual, created and dismissed by his society, is always surrounded by intellectuals who often stand too close to the power structure to be able detect its problems for themselves.

Although she feels herself to be in exile from the suffocating society of Japan, Aya finds the same inequality and irrationality in America. She is constantly beleaguered by the townspeople's questions that reveal their stereotypes of Japanese and their thinly veiled sentiment of Japan-bashing. Even after Aya has tried to correct their mistaken ideas, in the end they walk away with satisfaction as if their racist assumptions about Japanese business practices and gender roles have been reconfirmed by a native expert. Gradually, Aya starts to develop a more objectively-measured view of Japanese society as the Alaskan townspeople function as a mirror that reflects her own image. Also, in the face of Maria's intense hatred of "Negroes" and Russ's bitter resentment toward all communists, Aya sees the danger and injustice of over-determination induced and reinforced by traumatized personal emotions. Their stubborn and incurable generalized hatred enables Aya to recognize her own irrational generalizations, in which she identified her former husband with all graduates from the University of Tokyo and with Japan as a whole, and was determined to hate them all:

In her mind, Japan was something like a multi-colored cloud, flickering behind the image of her former husband's face enlarged and distorted as by a wide-angle lens. She even thought that she would not mind sacrificing the whole of Japan to revenge herself on her former husband who had thrown her out like an old shoe. (96)

彼女の中では日本は広角レンズに不恰好に大写しにされた前夫の顔の後にゆらめいている、五色の雲のようなものであった。実際彼女は彼女を紙屑のように捨てた前夫に恨みを晴らすためなら、日本全土を犠牲にしたってかまわないとさえ思っていた。(80)

Significantly, Aya comes to realize the irony of the fact that she has never seen the people living in Japan as individuals even though she wants to be recognized as an individual herself. Her conversations with Takanobu ten years later further manifest her matured thinking; now she sees that people like Takanobu are also victims of the system in Japan. Like many other Japanese, he has been struggling to survive under his individual circumstances. Despite her initial vengeful intention, Aya's return to Japan in the end helps resolve her previous hatred and resentment toward her husband and Japan:

"I now feel that I'm neither American or Japanese, and that I would be living in the same way even in Arabia or India. Just a moment ago, I was feeling bitter towards Japan, that is, towards the Japan that you represent, and I wanted to get even, but for some reason, I feel as if the bubbles that until now had been foaming white, had suddenly broken and disappeared." (122)

今ではわたしはアメリカ人でも日本人でもなく、それこそ、アラビアに行ったって、インドに行ったって同じように暮せるような気がしています。つい、少し前まで、わたしは日本を恨んでいて、つまり、あなたに代表される日本を恨んでいて、その恨みを晴らしたいような気分だったのですが、——なんだか急に、今まで真っ白に泡立っていた泡が消えていくみたいな感じ。(112)

Metaphorically, it is precisely at this moment that Aya has fully acquired a new language through which her identity can be constructed and precisely articulated. With this language that is in constant transformation, Aya is able to dismantle her language of resentment and to acquire a measured view of herself as well as of Japan and its people.

For Aya, to discard the “black seed” of resentment like burst bubbles is the only way to liberate herself from the power structure of Japanese society. In other words, as long as Aya continues to cultivate the “black seed” of resentment, she will remain entrapped in the power network that has long been oppressing her. Finally Aya can be free from the old dominating and possessive form of subjectivity as she is now able to conceive difference as a reflective and equal condition of subjectivity. Such a language of exile does not necessarily require a *physical* displacement to reveal itself; the veteran-turned-self-employed-taxi-driver who is disillusioned by the Navy’s politics and the gigantic corporation called Japan is also an exile in his own homeland. With her newly acquired language, Aya is now able to communicate with other exiled individuals within Japan. Michiko Niikuni Wilson argues that as Aya continues to live in the United States her conflicts remain unresolved at the end of the story.²⁸ However, on the contrary, I would argue that Aya’s conflicts and resentments have been resolved at the moment when she acquires her own language. As Aya says, it does not matter where she lives, Japan or America, Arabia or India, she can be herself, free from the fetters of any forms of collectivism.

As critics point out, Ōba’s eleven-year sojourn in the United States and her gender awareness mark her unshakable sense of self and unrepenting spirit.²⁹ When different nationalities come into play in Ōba’s fiction, the “in-between” space not only provides her characters the opportunity to challenge the social-cultural conventions (sometimes even to reverse the status quo), but also opens up new possibilities to redefine the politics of transnational identities. As many postmodern and postcolonial theorists suggest, people who are marginalized by the power economy have more freedom to seek for independent

behaviour and alternative thinking. Accordingly, women in a foreign country with a doubly displaced subjectivity will have greater opportunities, and perhaps more open spaces for that matter, to search for alternatives. In such an “in-between” space, Ōba, as well as Aya and Maria in the story, is able to become sceptical of the socially constructed and always suspicious of universally accepted notions of “reality.”

Zhu Tianxin

Biographical Background

Zhu Tianxin was born in 1958, the second daughter of Zhu Xining and Liu Musha who together nurtured three literary daughters. The father, Zhu Xining, had served in the Nationalist army from the time of Japan's war in China in 1937 and followed Chiang Kaishek's retreat to Taiwan in 1949. He established himself as a celebrated military writer who was active in the literary scene of Taiwan in the 1950s and 1960s. The mother, Liu Musha, also had a talent for literature and has long been a distinguished translator of many modern Japanese literary works.

As daughters of a military officer, the Zhu sisters were raised in the *juancun* 眷村, or military housing compound, and inherited a patriotism that was an essential constituent of the *juancun* subculture.³⁰ Upon Chiang Kaishek's retreat in 1949, numerous military housing compounds were built exclusively for the families of the military personnel who followed the Nationalist government to Taiwan. Consequently, these *waishengren* 外省人 (mainlanders, referring to those post-1945 expatriates from various provinces of mainland China who are not native Taiwanese) formed a world of their own. As mainlanders generally believed that the Nationalist forces would soon recover the mainland, they tended to regard themselves as in temporary diaspora on the island. Such a mentality of

temporary diaspora prevented them from actively engaging and integrating with the local Taiwanese society, and instead they developed a subculture of their own. Zhu Tianxin and her elder sister Zhu Tianwen were among the first writers of “*juancun* literature” that depicted the mainlanders’ lives and memories in Taiwan’s military housing compounds.³¹

Zhu Tianxin began her writing career when she was fifteen. Since her earliest writing, she has displayed an unusual sensitivity to and passionate concern for Chinese history and classical literature. The Zhu sisters were under the apprenticeship of Hu Lancheng 胡蘭成, the former husband of Eileen Zhang and an accomplished scholar and philosopher of Chinese literature and thought.³² Purveying to them the uniqueness of Japanese beauty and its connections with ancient Chinese ideals, Hu exerted a profound influence on the Zhu sisters’ writing. Hu even compared Zhu Tianxin with Li Bai 李白(701-762), an eminent classical Chinese poet who is widely regarded as unrivalled in terms of ingenious artistic creativity in poetry. As a history major at Taiwan University, Zhu Tianxin joined Zhu Tianwen (her sister), Xie Caijun (who later became her husband) and others to found a literary magazine called *Sansan jikan* 三三集刊 (The San-san Series) in 1977. Two years later, they headed into the publishing industry and established the San-san Bookstore. The name Sansan (literally, three-three) represents two sets of three or two trinities: first, *Sanmin zhuyi* 三民主義 (the Three People’s Principles promoted by Dr. Sun Yatsan for China’s democratization and modernization in the early 1900s); second, the Christian Trinity—Father, Son, and Holy Ghost. The name they chose for their magazine and publishing company speaks clearly of the group’s patriotic, conservative spirit.

In 1977, Zhu Tianxin published her first collection of short stories *Fangzhou shang de rizi* 方舟上的日子 (Days on the Boat), and a long prose work *Jirangge* 擊壤歌 (Drum

Songs); both of which recorded her adolescence during high school. Like her elder sister, Zhu Tianxin uses an imaginary China as a necessary model for her sense of cultural heritage and identity. Their early works are considered to be consistent with the official, mainstream ideology of reunification, drumming up the sentiment that "Taiwan was the defender and torchbearer of China's age-old cultural tradition that was being destroyed on the mainland."³³ After graduating from university, Zhu Tianxin changed her writing style from maidenly sentimentalism to social critique, and became interested in political issues during the formative years of Taiwan's emerging democratization in the 1980s.

There is a noticeable change in Zhu's choice of topics and writing style in her two short story collections compiled after 1987: *Wo ji de* 我記得 (I Remember, 1989) and *Xing wo juancun de xiongdemen* 想我眷村的兄弟們 (Remembering My Brothers in Military Housing Compounds, 1992). That is, both works clearly exhibit Zhu's scepticism towards politics and ideology. In response to the ruptured Chinese national narrative, faced with a competing, drastically alternative reading of Taiwan's history, Zhu attempts in both of the collections to investigate how identity politics can be interrogated from the viewpoint of the second-generation mainlanders. A short story collected in *I Remember*, "Xindang shijiouri" 新黨十九日 (Nineteen Days in the New Party, 1989), particularly explores in depth the agony some people suffered from the inescapable rupture of time. In a nutshell, the story is about a housewife who timidly breaks out of the bounds of the family when she secretly speculates on the stock market, an activity that revives the liveliness of her spirit. However, with the government introducing a new transaction levy on the stock exchange, she is prompted to join a public protest led by the opposition Democratic Progressive Party (DPP), against the party in power, the KMT. As a

second-generation mainlander, her participation in the protest drastically undermines her long-held political beliefs and practice of loyalty to the Nationalist government. When her family confront her in disbelief upon finding out about her secret trading and public protest, she totally breaks down. The story dramatically manifests the mainlanders' generalized anxiety, in particular with regard to family values and social tensions, and more generally toward questions of cultural identity and political allegiance.

In the collection *Remembering My Brothers in Military Housing Compounds*, Zhu addresses the issues of national identity more directly, meditating on the dynamic relationship between history and the individual. In an autobiographical mode, Zhu writes of her childhood memories in a military housing compound, and explicates how personal historical memories are inevitably intertwined with the construction of a national narrative. For one, Zhu intends to refute the stereotype of mainlanders as a privileged social group; and more significantly, she emphasizes the fact that they are also victims of a past ideological construction of "China" as the real homeland, a construction that had long commanded their unquestioning belief in the Chinese national narrative.³⁴ In this work, Zhu demonstrates her concerns and intentions to participate in the debates about Taiwan's identity. She identifies with and speaks for the second-generation mainlanders as a social group who are going to have to grapple with identity construction in a social milieu that is fast undergoing sweeping transformations from their past beliefs.

Focusing on a more personal, individual level, the ruptured identity narrative is further addressed in Zhu's later collection of stories *Gudu* 古都 (Ancient Capital, 1997). Situated in the postcolonial/postmodern city of Taipei, the stories in the collection teem with detailed references to foreign cities and countries, world literature, mythology,

theoretical jargon from academic disciplines, and popular culture elements such as pop music, fashion, movies, and soap operas. In these stories, Zhu attempts not only to evoke nostalgic sentiments shared by her generation, but also to signify the cultural identity crisis faced by people in postcolonial Taiwan, particularly the second-generation mainlanders. The title story "Ancient Capital" is written from the perspective of a second-generation female mainlander who is struggling with issues of self-identity in the fierce and polarized competition between different national narratives (unified China vs. independent Taiwan). Strategically, Zhu looks into history hoping to find ways of resolving the ruptured identity of a highly hybridized culture that is in fact a result of its particular colonial history. Through her pilgrimage to Kyoto Japan, and on her return trip to the island of Taiwan, the female protagonist struggles to analyze and understand her displaced identity, which is heavily intertwined in the constructions of Chinese and Taiwanese national narratives, respectively or in combination. Despite experiencing the inescapable agony of being displaced from the centre of the power paradigm to the margins, the second-generation female mainlander protagonist (and the author as well) seems to have obtained a critical perspective for re-examining the new power structure. For an enhanced understanding of the socio-political context in which Zhu's "Ancient Capital" was written, it is worthwhile to briefly review Taiwan's drastic changes brought about by the cultural and political paradigmatic shifts in the post-martial-law era

Transforming Identity in Post-Martial Law Taiwan

Due to the peculiar historical development across the Taiwan Strait since 1949, there has long been ongoing a fundamental ideological competition for Taiwan's identity

construction.³⁵ Taiwanese society is composed of four ethnic groups: *benshengren* 本省人, or native Taiwanese whose families came to the island from China before 1895 (prior to the Qing Dynasty's cession of Taiwan); *waishengren* 外省人, or mainlanders who arrived after 1945 (posterior to Japan's handover of Taiwan); Hakka people 客家人, who are descendants of those migrating from east of Guangdong and west of Fujian in China during the Ming and Qing Dynasties; and *yuanzhumin* 原住民, or aboriginal people.³⁶ This diversity of ethnicity was completely disregarded by the ruling powers—whether the Japanese or the KMT—for the similar purpose of political expediency. It was not until the late 1980s, when the KMT's authoritarian ideological control started to loosen up, that the existence of multiple ethnic groups in Taiwanese society was openly recognized.

When Li Denghui (Lee Tenghui) succeeded Chiang Chingkuo in 1988, it would be the first time in history for a native Taiwanese to assume the presidency and the governing of the island. Over the next twelve years, Li made successful efforts to revamp, first of all, the political power structure within the KMT that had been in power for forty years but out of touch with the general populace; and secondly, to overhaul the election systems of the National Assembly and Legislature, culminating in the direct popular election of the president in 1996. Also, he shifted several key policies regarding reunification with China, and started to cooperate with political forces at the grass-roots level to intensify efforts towards "localization" or "Taiwanization" (*bentuhua* 本土化). Significantly, these efforts were to make sure the constitution of the government from now on can only be legitimated by residents of Taiwan alone through regular elections.³⁷ Implicitly, Li shared a common goal with the opposition party, the DPP, which had been gaining wider currency in Taiwan's political scene—to establish a democratic and

independent state in Taiwan. In a most revealing interview with Shiba Ryōtarō, a well-known Japanese writer, in fall 1993, Li spoke of “the misery of being a Taiwanese,” implying that Taiwan has, for hundreds of years, been ruled by different foreign regimes and has never had a chance to determine its own fate. This widely-cited line came very close to a tacit endorsement of the principle of self-determination.

As an alternative to the pursuit of *de jure* independence, Li promoted the so-called “Republic of China on Taiwan” formula that was basically anchored on a two-China model while being ingeniously evasive, flexible and ambiguous on the issue of national reunification. The ambiguity of feigning a reunification stance while making practical moves towards independence was vehemently criticized by the PRC. In response to Li’s “provocative” political views and his pro-independence agenda, Beijing threatened Taipei with missile tests off the northern coast of Taiwan in an attempt to disrupt Li’s re-election bid and bring Taipei to its knees. Nonetheless, to the disappointment of Beijing’s hard-liners, the missile crisis across the Strait might have actually helped Li to win the presidency with a clear majority. Worried that Taiwan might lose ground to the PRC if the majority could not speak with one unified voice, many traditional staunch DPP supporters decided to shift their votes originally destined for the DPP candidate Peng Mingmin to Li running on the KMT ticket.

For several decades, the mainlander elite justified its hegemony on the basis of the one-China principle propagated by the KMT government.³⁸ Awakening to the hitherto long-suppressed Taiwanese consciousness, Taiwanese society began its quest for a separate identity in the international community, inevitably bringing about fierce competition between Taiwanese nationalism and Chinese nationalism in which the

mainlander elite started to feel confused, angered and marginalized as they saw the further erosion of their political power and the cultural legitimacy they used to represent. However, the mainlander elite's sense of loss was rather different from that of the great number of veterans, or *rongmin* 榮民, who had been living in the lowest stratum of society. Most mainlanders, especially those of the second-generation, would forcefully refute the stereotype depicted by the "nativist discourse," which equated the second-generation mainlanders with the first, the KMT, and the privileged class. For most mainlanders, who were not close to any power of any kind, their sense of loss derived from the shattering of the previously held values and beliefs. While the policy of localization has been intensified on the island, the Chiang Kaishek brand of nationalism was forced to face bankruptcy. The values and beliefs that had enabled most mainlanders to endure the unbearable situation in their lives—encapsulated in such KMT slogans as *Fangong fuguo* 反攻復國, or reclaiming Mainland China—suddenly were questioned, stigmatized, ridiculed, and trampled by the "new" mainstream society as a result of the political mobilization of ethnic identity after 1988. The second-generation mainlanders' identity is thus particularly ambiguous as they seem able to claim either "Chinese" or "Taiwanese" identity or both; but by the same token, they can also face possible rejection from both mainland Chinese and native Taiwanese. A most unfortunate catch-22 situation of "double loyalties" is thereby created from which the mainlanders seem bound to suffer regardless.³⁹

As Taiwan continues its self-transformation into a democratic society, the project of identity construction is placed in the people's hands instead of being dictated by an authoritarian government or ruling elite. Upon obtaining absolute freedom of speech,

writers in Taiwan, regardless of their ethnicity, have been striving to rewrite history, redefine authenticity, reconstruct identity, and repossess the home island. Incidentally, by evoking historical memory, Li Ang's *Labyrinthine Garden* unveils the unspeakable and unspoken ordeal of the native Taiwanese in the past, while Zhu Tianxin's "Ancient Capital," accentuates the mainlanders' anxiety of being engulfed by the mainstream national narrative in progress and their urgent desire to participate in the (re)construction of cultural/national narrative. Often, the second-generation mainlanders who are unable to identify either with Mainland Chinese (PRC) or are very suspicious of the prospects for the Taiwanese nationalist movement are caught in the "in-between-ness," and tend to find themselves doubly exiled in the post-martial law era of Taiwan.⁴⁰ Zhu Tianxin's "Ancient Capital" clearly depicts this agonizing experience of in-between-ness by the second generation mainlanders in Taiwan. In the next section I will provide a synopsis of "Ancient Capital," to be followed by critical analysis of the story.

"Ancient Capital"

Zhu Tianxin borrowed the title "Ancient Capital" for this novella from Kawabata Yasunari's canonical novel *The Old Capital* (Koto, 1962) 古都, which is one of the three works cited by the committee when Kawabata won the Nobel Prize for Literature in 1968. With a linear plot, Zhu's "Ancient Capital" thematically parallels Kawabata's novel; however, the narrative in each story is completely different. Like most of Zhu Tianxin's recent stories in which the narratee plays a key role, the narratee in "Ancient Capital" is in fact the protagonist. Unlike *The Old Capital*, which is narrated by an anonymous and omniscient third person, "Ancient Capital" is told by a dramatized second-person narrator.

The narrative can be seen as an interior monologue that is self-reflexively addressed to the narratee through the salutation of "you." It is as if the narrator is addressing herself/itself directly to the unnamed protagonist, and frequently reminding the protagonist about her own memory and thoughts. In other words, in the text, the narratee, an unnamed middle-aged woman to whom the narrator refers as "you," is strategically overlapped with the narrator so that they are essentially one consciousness, for the purpose of invoking mutual sympathy and common understanding.⁴¹ With a self-reflexively poignant question, "You don't say that your memory doesn't count at all..." (難道, 你的記憶都不算數....., 151),⁴² the novella starts with the narrator's memories of her high school years spent with her bosom friend who is only referred to as A. Lamenting the rapid vanishing of the familiar landscape of contemporary Taipei city, the anonymous narrator awakens the protagonist's memories of the good old days with A, and recalls what Taipei was like in their adolescent years. At that time, the sky used to be bluer and the air fresher, indicating the most nostalgic "age of innocence":

At that time, body fluids and tears were as pure and fresh as morning dew on the flowers that people were more willing to let them exude.

At that time, people were so pure and simple that they were willing to sacrifice their lives for a single cause or their beloved, regardless of partisanship.

At that time prior to the large-scale development and rampant speculation induced by the commodification of the land, trees were more likely to grow tall with shiny green like those in tropical countries.

At that time, there was rarely a public place like a coffee shop, let alone a fast food restaurant, bubble-tea shop, KTV or pub, so teenagers could only loaf about on the streets. Yet, there was hardly any stream of people crowding the streets like hordes of guinea pigs.

At that time, the Milky Way and meteors were usually visible on summer nights. Beholding the starry sky would always touch off a compelling sense of vicissitude, so compelling that some of the rather innocent beholders would resolve on the spot to achieve something great in the future, worthy of their lives.

那時候的體液和淚水清新如花露，人們比較願意隨它要落就落。

那時候的人們非常單純天真，不分黨派的往往爲了單一的信念或愛人，肯於捨身或赴死。

那時候的樹，也因土地尚未商品化，沒大肆開路競建炒地皮，而得以存活得特別高大特別綠，像赤道雨林的國家。

那時候鮮有公共場所，咖啡館非常少，速食店泡沫紅茶 KTV、PUB 更是不用說，少年的只好四處遊蕩猛走，但路上也不見人潮洶湧白老鼠一般。

那時候的夏天夜晚通常都看得到銀河和流星，望之久久便會生出人世存亡朝代興衰之感，其中比較優的就有立誓將來要做番大事決不虛度此生。(151-2)

Teeming with detailed references to foreign culture (dominantly American), represented by its popular music and movies, the memories of the narrator's naïve and ambitious youth show her frequently taking off on foot with A to explore the landscape of Taipei city. During these walks, areas of Taipei would always be associated with places to which they had never been, particularly places in their "imaginative China," or America.⁴³ Conversely, they were completely oblivious to the local markets, temples, and buildings that only suggested native Taiwanese culture:

You all deliberately overlook the nearby buildings at the foot of the mountain that are conspicuously built in the southern Fujian style, yet all agree in unison that the view ahead looks just like San Francisco, although none of you have ever been there.

The mountain trail leads through some local resident's kitchen only to the oldest street of the area, on which you have to endure the mundanity of walking past the fish stand, pork shop, a large greasily-strained pot from deep-frying fish year-round,

and the ancient temple built in early the Qing Dynasty. Not far away down the narrow CKS Road, on which you've got to be watchful lest you be hit by the public bus, you would become very familiar with every step of the way up to the narrow lane right in front of the ferry stop... as if you just got back home and almost holler "*Tada ima*, we're home!" to the neighbours across the street.

你們都故意忽視腳下單脊兩屋坡的閩南式斜屋頂不看，彼此一致同意眼前景色很像舊金山，雖然你們誰也沒去過。

山腰小路的盡頭，得穿過別人家的廚房，回到重建街，然而你們走避不及離開這條最老的街道，忍受著重回現實穿過魚鮮攤豬肉舖、終年炸魚酥的大油鍋、雍正年間建廟的福佑宮，小心別被客運撞到的走在窄小的中正路上，不會太遠，你們像回到家似的熟門熟路拾級而上渡船口正對的窄巷，……，只差沒向二號和四號的人家喊一聲：「タダイマ！」回來啦。(154-5)

Detached from Taiwan's local culture and customs, the protagonist and A would seem to feel intimacy and triviality when walking through a traditional market; as if only by romanticizing a sight through its imagined similarity to any distant Western world, like Spain or the Mediterranean countries, can they feel any comfort in continuing to live in this island.

The intimate relationship between the protagonist and A suggests a homoerotic sentiment, although even as adolescents they both participated in the heterosexual paradigm by having boyfriends. The protagonist remembers that A once asked her: "I wonder if homosexuality is fun?" (不知道同性戀好不好玩, 153) when the two were lying in the same bed. Despite their young innocent vow to never part and never get married, they became estranged from each other after graduating from college, and both eventually got married. One day the adult protagonist receives a fax from A, who has been residing in America for decades, inviting her to get together in Kyoto. With excitement and nostalgia

the protagonist travels to Kyoto alone to meet A, as if having an extramarital affair. While she anxiously awaits A's arrival, the protagonist takes a walk through the streets and alleys in the city, with the guidance of Kawabata's *The Old Capital*, recalling the past in parallel memories: her previous trips to Kyoto with her daughter, and the adolescence shared with A in Taipei. On each trip to Kyoto, the protagonist and her daughter would visit a Japanese paper store, and then hurry to a café and start folding origami. This routine is ritualized and intertwined with the ancient temples of Kyoto to manifest the imperishability of the old city. Like the Nonomiya Shrine mentioned in the *Tale of Genji* which remains intact nowadays as it used to be, Kyoto is a symbol of changelessness and an eternal space of spiritual beauty.⁴⁴ Likewise, the protagonist feels assured that the persimmons must have looked the same to the eyes of the Haiku poet, Bashō; i.e., the sense of assurance rendered by Kyoto's seeming eternal changelessness enables her to find peace, despite the fact that she is an alien in the city. In a defiant tone, the "you"/narratee even declares her desire to breathe her last breath in Kyoto.

In contrast to Kawabata's depiction of Kyoto as an eternal cultural symbol, the narrator bemoans the rapid destruction of Taipei's landscape and its natural environment brought upon by the KMT government as well as those native Taiwanese politicians who often obliterate history in the name of progress.⁴⁵ By quoting fragmentary historical passages from the ruling Manchurians (during the Qing dynasty) and Japanese (colonial period), who often referred to Taiwan as an island where pirates or smugglers tended to flock together, the narrator exhibits evidence of how undesirable the island used to be, underscoring that "you" is not the first one to be dissatisfied with it (不滿那地方的, 不自你始。177). Understandably, like pilgrims who set out from their homeland spurred by

dissatisfaction with the present and their home, the narrator/narratee desires to go into exile or escape from the island by projecting her being and soul onto an exotic utopia or mythic past.

You simply don't understand why since then you would incessantly long to travel faraway to distant lands. In fact, you've never left the island for more than a month, just as the smugglers and pirates avoiding doing. For many years you have to live by fantasizing that certain lots in the city, some sections of the road, or some part of the street scene are like those in some exotic city, to which you may or may not have been; very much in the same way that some men can only perform by fantasizing that their wives, beloved or not, are some other women.

You never try to sort out this kind of feeling, dare not mention it to anyone else, either, especially during this period of time when there's always someone who would question whether you like it here, and would even urge you to leave as soon as possible if you don't.

Urging you to leave here or return to somewhere makes it sound as if you had always got some place to go and live but still brazenly refuse to budge.

.....

Is there a place like that?

你簡直不明白爲什麼打那時候起就從不停止的老有遠意、老想遠行、遠走高飛，其實你不曾有超過一個月以上的時間離開過這個海島，像島夷海寇們常幹的事。好些年了，你甚至得時時把這個城市的某一部份、某一段路、某一街景幻想成某些個你去過或從未去過的城市，你才過得下去，就像很多男人，必須把不管感情好壞的妻子幻想成某個女人，才能做得了男女之事。

你從未試圖整理過這種感覺，你也不敢對任何人說，尤其在這個動不動老有人要檢查你們愛不愛這裏，甚至要你們不喜歡這裏的就要走快走的時候。

要走快走，或滾回哪哪哪，彷彿你們大有地方可去大有地方可住，只是死皮賴臉不去似的。

.....

有那樣一個地方嗎？（169-70）

Zhu also quotes passages from Kawabata's *The Old Capital*, as if the tourist/narrator were reading Kawabata's text simultaneously. These short and fragmentary excerpts are used to support her portrayal of Kyoto as a utopian space where history retains its legacy and also remains alive, in contrast to Taipei where nothing lasts but dies off. Staged in Kyoto, Kawabata's novel is about the fateful relations between identical twin sisters, Chieko and Naeko, who were separated from each other at birth. Chieko has known for years that she was a foundling adopted by the Saga family who operates a kimono manufacture business in Kyoto. Soon after a chance encounter at the Yasaka Shrine, Chieko learns of her twin sister Naeko, brought up by her natural parents. Despite their separation from birth and different life experiences since then, they share a sincere love for each other and show an unselfish kind of siblinghood that is rarely found nowadays. The story ends with a scene in which Chieko sees off Naeko on a snowy early morning after the two have spent one night together. The plot is juxtaposed with elegant depictions of Kyoto's natural landscape and the narrative's reminiscence of the city's cultural heritage. In the novel, Kawabata creates a profound sense of tranquility and stillness. In contrast to the twins, who choose to part from each other after their brief reunion, in Zhu's story the protagonist's much anticipated reunion with A never even comes to pass, as A fails to show up in time. Reluctantly, the protagonist decides to head back to Taiwan earlier than scheduled.

Upon her arrival at the Taipei airport, the protagonist is approached by a cab driver who mistakes her for a Japanese tourist. With no intention of correcting the driver, she gets into the cab and revisits the city as a foreigner, i.e. as a fake Japanese tourist who actually does not speak a word of Japanese. With a Japanese colonial map of Taipei, the

protagonist surveys the city as it was half a century before. When the Japanese took possession of Taiwan in 1895, they modeled Taipei city after Kyoto to become the capital city where the Japanese governor's colonial office and official residence were to be located. The protagonist's map lays out Taipei city the way it was designed by the Japanese with streets, governmental buildings, and landmarks indicated by their previous colonial names. The narrator refers to many a difference between the Japanese prototype on the map and its shape in contemporary reality. The journey takes her to the Ximen District, now one of the busiest and most crowded quarters of the city, only to have it juxtaposed against its once wasteland counterpart haunted by ghosts.

The city tour is also undertaken with recurrent allusions to Tao Yuanmin's 陶淵明 (365-427) renowned pastoral piece on the "Taohuayuan" 桃花源 (Peach Blossom Stream). It is a story about a fisherman who accidentally discovers an ancient utopia where people live in a timeless world without being aware of the changes in dynasties. The fisherman is treated with hospitality upon his visit to the utopia. Enmeshed in the intertextuality of "Peach Blossom Stream," the protagonist seems to have converged with the fisherman, who cannot find the utopia again when she/he tries to revisit the place. The narrator/tourist intends to draw an analogy between Taipei and the utopia of "Peach Blossom Stream." To her grief, the ruthless myriad changes in contemporary Taipei only compel her to recognize that Taipei is precisely the opposite of Tao's Peach Blossom Stream: a dystopia. The journey ends in Tamsui where the narrative had begun.⁴⁶ However, the Tamsui River, which the youthful protagonist and A had associated with the magnificent Yangtze River, is now depicted as disgusting as floating dead bodies. Seeing how vile the Tamsui River has become, the desperate protagonist is completely

disoriented and disconcerted, having lost her "Peach Blossom Stream."

There is a helicopter circling over the river, probably searching for floating dead bodies. An old man is passing by you on an old motorbike that emits black smoke; perhaps, he has been notified to identify the body; [...].

Where is this place? ..., you burst into wailing.

.....

天空有直升機盤旋，大概在找江上浮屍；歐幾桑騎著老歐都拜嘟嘟嘟嘟放著黑煙迎面擦身而過，大概也是接到通知去認屍；[.....]

這是哪裏？.....，你放聲大哭。

..... (233)

As if unable to resolve her suffocating dilemma, the protagonist wanders along the riverbank losing her nerve. It is significant, however, that the story ends with another inserted passage, this one from Lian Heng's 連橫 *Taiwan tongshi xu* 台灣通史序 (Preface to The General History of Taiwan, 1918): "May we forever observe our ancestral precepts to honour this beautiful island in the glittering ocean" (婆娑之洋，美麗之島，我先王先民之景命，實式憑之。 233). As a trailblazer in systematically recording Taiwan's history, Lian's voluminous historiography not only confirms the substantive existence of Taiwan but extols the boundless beauty of Island Formosa.⁴⁷ This quoted statement implicitly indicates the author's positive attitude, deep feelings and high hopes for the island; as opposed to the abandonment, abhorrence and sheer disappointment that seem to have prevailed in the text until the very end.

Resolving Hybridized Identity in the Postcolonial "Ancient Capital"

It has been pointed out that in "Ancient Capital" Zhu Tianxin has spatialized history

in such a way that history becomes ruptured, as opposed to linear, continuous, or progressive. Moreover, Zhu probes into the ruptures of histories in a limited urban space, like a phantasm roaming in dilapidated historical remains.⁴⁸ Indeed, by utilizing spatiality as a nonlinear form of writing history, Zhu effectively delineates traces of the people who came to this land, and exhibits how these traces of personal experiences are intricately entwined with the politics of urban space. Instead of a pre-given, natural order that is completely beyond the realm of human construction, space must be seen as continuously fabricated in the production and reproduction of society. Due to its peculiar socio-political development in the past four hundred years, which has seen waves of explorers, settlers and foreign colonizers leave their imprints on the island, it is imperative to recognize the pronounced features of the hybridized identity formation in Taiwan that has been (re)constructed in the context of multiple spatial-temporalities.

In "Ancient Capital," each stroll the protagonist takes to the urban spaces engenders a new reading of this highly complicated postcolonial city through the connections drawn with her personal experience and the way she deciphers space through her historical erudition. Fully aware of the dominant ideology and politics hidden in the spatiality of Taipei, the protagonist grieves over the drastic changes in the landscape brought about by the ruling powers at different periods. The narrator tells us that during the Japanese colonial period, over ten thousand cherry trees were planted throughout the island and many magnificent post-offices and train stations were built in honour of the Japanese Emperor, often too dignified to blend in well with the unprosperous local towns. After the incumbent president Chen Shueibian won the mayoralty of Taipei for the opposition in December 1994, the landscape of Taipei also underwent marked changes. For example,

the boulevard in front of the President's Office, which used to be called Jieshoulu, meaning "Long live Chiang Kaishek," was renamed Kai da ge lan 凱達格蘭, claiming to honour the first found aboriginal tribe of Taiwan; and rows of aged trees were ruthlessly removed for the construction of high-class residences. For the protagonist, the dominant power's wilful alteration in the name of "renovation and progress," which often disregards people's traces of life, signifies the repetitive obliterations of people's collective memory in the city:

You remembered a writer who has the same background as you, who wrote: "It dawned on me that you cannot call a place hometown in which you had buried none of those dear to you." Not as picky as the writer, however, you still want to humbly ask: no matter how you name it, (usually in the name of prosperity and progress, or alternatively, hope and happiness) wouldn't it be just another strange city if people's imprints and traces of life are not preserved? You've got to wonder why you would adore, cherish, conserve, and identify with a strange city as such...?

你記得一名與你身分相同的小說作者這樣寫過，「原來沒有親人死去的地方，是無法叫做故鄉的。」你並不像他如此苛求，你只謙畏的想問，一個不管以何為名（通常是繁榮進步偶或間以希望快樂）不打算保存人們生活痕跡的地方，不就等於一個陌生的城市？一個陌生的城市，何須特別叫人珍視、愛惜、維護、認同……？(187)

When the familiar elements of scenery keep disappearing one after the other, the protagonist inevitably suffers a sense of loss and confusion. Her memories of the past are blotted out as the streets in which she can take a stroll are numbered. She must constantly ask herself "Where am I?" in order to confirm her location so as to preserve her own identity in relation to the city.

In order to break through the confinement brought about by the drastic changes in the landscape, the protagonist employs an imaginative way of evoking history to re-read

the urban space. For example, she embeds her memory in that of the early settlers and the aborigines:

The sky when you were seventeen was just the same as it was four thousand years ago when our ancestors came along to the Tamsui River to hunt, fish, and farm; nor was the sky any different from three hundred and thirty years ago, on the night when the Spanish first found the aboriginal tribe of the Kai da ge lan.

你十七歲時的天空，與四千多年前沿著淡水河來此漁獵農耕的先民所看到的相去不大，與三百三十年前某暗夜朔河而上並首次發現凱達格蘭人的西班牙人所見無異。(169)

By inscribing the memory of her past into the history of the land, the protagonist's existence becomes a significant part of the collective existence of the earlier settlers: the aborigines, the early Chinese settlers, the Dutch, the Spanish, and the Japanese invaders. As a second-generation mainlander, the protagonist does not see the year 1949 when her father was first relocated to Taiwan as the starting point of her origins there but merges herself with different segments of Taiwan's colonial history and accepts colonial experience as an inseparable part of what she and her ancestors have become. Instead of denying or rebelling against its colonial history, the protagonist travels back to the past in reconciliation with Taiwan's colonial heritage in order to locate meanings in the present and the future. Strategically, the narrator (and the author as well) not only declares her identification with the island but reveals her urgent desire to participate in the (re)construction of Taiwan's history and its cultural identity formation.

However, as the story suggests, for the second-generation mainlanders the process of identifying with the island is accompanied by a grave anxiety and sense of self-contradiction. On the one hand, the protagonist protests the total erasure of the island's colonial history in that she underscores the absurdity of the KMT government's

authoritative imposition of "the great Chinese identity" upon Taiwan's people; while on the other hand, she glorifies as an age of innocence the time when the KMT were in power, concealing the fact that she is a beneficiary of the government's Mandarin policy.⁴⁹ Contradiction also emerges when she claims her Taiwanese roots from her mother's side but continues to hold dear the Chinese cultural identity from her father's side and refuses to identify with Taiwanese local customs and culture. Nonetheless, the inclination of native Taiwanese toward hostility against China and whatever it represents also intensifies the complexity and difficulty in her attempts to fully identify with Taiwan. The most telling example of this contradictory psyche would be the scene where the protagonist joins a campaign rally for the opposition party. In the belief that the ruling party (KMT) has been sufficiently corrupt to warrant a change of government, the protagonist and her husband, who is a native Taiwanese, attend a political rally held in a soccer stadium with their eager support for the opposition's victory the next day. Ironically, however, it turns out to be an experience of sheer self-humiliation for the protagonist:

You feel sheer estrangement when you see his facial expression that is blurry but strongly resembles those of the tens of thousands of people around him hailing and clapping alternately with the orator under the spotlight. Finally, an auxiliary speaker dares to say that anyone having your sort of regional origin should make haste for China. In a whirl, your husband casts a glance at you, seemingly worried that you might be singled out and expelled by the people around you.

你看到他與周遭幾萬張模糊但表情一致的群眾的臉，隨著聚光燈下的演說者一陣呼喊一陣鼓掌，陌生極了，終於有名助講員說了類似你這種省籍的人應該趕快離開這裏去中國之類的話，你丈夫亂中匆忙望你一眼，好像擔心你會被周圍的人認出並被驅離似的。(168)

Feeling unwelcome by both native Taiwanese and the mainland Chinese still in China⁵⁰, the protagonist is caught in between and inevitably faced with a double-edged struggle in her identity construction.

Apart from the intriguing complexities of cultural and national narratives, gender remains an important factor in her identity formation. That night, back home from the rally, the protagonist's husband mounts her body with an unusual excitement. While participating in the intercourse reluctantly, she refuses to shed any tears. Later, she detects an unpleasant odour in her body that has stuck to her ever since she gave birth to her daughter.(168) The unpleasant odour is implicitly contrasted with the "pure and fresh body fluids and tears" she and A used to exude in the innocent age. Metaphorically, the unbearable odour manifests the protagonist's degeneration within the practice of heterosexuality. Adrienne Rich notes that heterosexuality has been forced upon women by a patriarchal system that seeks to convince them that marriage and sexual orientation towards men is inevitable.⁵¹ Unable to escape the obligatory heterosexual paradigm that is pressed on everyone, the protagonist (and A as well) has been "normalized" after entering society. However, despite submission to heterosexuality, her intimate relationship with A still commands an unforgettable power in her memory after all those years. In anxious anticipation of her reunion with A, the protagonist's passion for A, which had been buried in the course of her "normalization," is strongly aroused again. She longs to share the same bed with A but worries that her unpleasant odour might offend A, or that the married A might also give off the same unpleasant odour.

Understandably, her solitary trip to Kyoto signifies her eager desire to escape from the island so as to project herself into a utopia, an idealized place where everything is

well-preserved, including the happy memories with A in the past. In this light, her trip to Kyoto can be seen as a soul-searching journey of memory-making/identity-construction that helps her preserve things as they were or should be. On the other hand, the trip can also be seen as an escape, if only temporarily, from both heterosexual confinement and the bitter entanglement of cultural/national narratives on the island.

Postcolonial critics and theorists have proposed using colonial mimicry as a strategy for negotiating new positions of power and as a way of establishing new cultural identities by creating ambivalence. In Bhabha's words, colonial mimicry is "the desire for a reformed, recognizable Other, *as a subject of a difference that is almost the same, but not quite.*"⁵² That is to say the discourse of mimicry is constructed around ambivalence. The concepts of mimicry and ambivalence enable the critics to go beyond the rather simplistic and oppositional politics of the marginalized, and to understand the excesses or slippage within colonial discourses. In coping with the complexity and hybridity of postcolonial culture, postcolonial writers often apply tactics of imitation and appropriation, and use intertextuality as a strategy to provide additional levels of textual depth. Such an engagement signifies the desire to claim symbolic power for constructing identity and its legitimation.

This writing strategy has been featured in many of Zhu's recent works, particularly those collected in *Ancient Capital*. She frequently uses tactics such as pastiching canonical works, appropriating aesthetic ideas or borrowing titles from renowned films or literature to effectuate her agenda of reconsidering the cultural politics of Taiwan's postmodern and postcolonial condition. Particularly in "Ancient Capital," in addition to Kawaba's *The Old Capital*, Tao Yuanmin's "Peach Blossom," and Lian Heng's *The*

General History of Taiwan, Zhu also appropriates texts by other Western and Chinese authors to suggest a poly-vocal textuality. As passages from Lawrence, Thoreau, Freud, and Frost are appropriated to enhance thematic intertextuality, so are reportages of Han explorers and administrators of Taiwan inserted in the story to intensify the intersubjective historicism which is rather negative about Taiwan.⁵³ More significantly, however, the appropriated texts become void signifiers into which Zhu can insinuate new meanings and interpretations according to the context of her own story. As she rephrases Picasso in "Death in Venice," another story collected in *Ancient Capital*, "each creation signifies a disintegration of the old order" (每一個創造，都意味著舊有秩序的即將瓦解。60).

Zhu overlaps Kawabata's Kyoto with her depictions of Taipei and then blends the city's colonial past with its postcolonial present to create a labyrinth of intertextuality. The geographical similarities between the two cities prompt the protagonist to see Kyoto, an eternal city, as a spiritual homeland or a projection of an ideal Taipei. In fact, the Japanese colonizers chose Taipei to be the location for Taiwan Jinja 台灣神社 (the Taiwan Shinto Shrine) and the governor's colonial office and official residence precisely because of its geographical resemblance to Kyoto, Japan's ancient capital. For instance, Taipei's Jilong River looks like Kyoto's Kamogawa River, and Jiantan Mountain is similar to Higashiyama (Eastern Mountain); not to mention that both Kyoto and Taipei are cities built within a basin. When walking on the streets of Kyoto, the protagonist is often reminded of Taipei: the Ramen noodle store near Sannenzaka (Three-year-slope) evokes the memory of having eaten green bean soup with A in Tamsui; the Kiyamachi near Sanjō Street looks just as adorable as the oldest street of Tamsui. The scenery of the streets and parks in Kyoto also constantly reminds her of the previous trips she made there together

with her daughter. As everything in Kyoto has been well-preserved, she is able not only to evoke her happy memories with A via the similarity between the two cities but to revisit every site and corner that she and her daughter have previously visited in this foreign city, and is thus able to recapture her daughter's childhood and the common memories they share. In contrast, as Taipei has undergone rapid and constant transformation by the KMT government and the native Taiwanese politicians alike, almost every trace of its past has been somehow modified or erased altogether. Accordingly, it becomes understandable why a foreign city would indicate familiarity and history to the protagonist, whereas her homeland signifies alienation and temporality. However, the protagonist also notices the pretence or fabricatedness of Kyoto's "authenticity" when she witnesses a road construction there. It is arguable that Kyoto's pretence of perfectly preserving its past is as oppressive, exclusionary, and marginalizing as any government-imposed urban building code and project. Despite that, for the protagonist, Kyoto is less a real city than a mental construct which helps her to reconceptualize Taipei in different ways.

Under Zhu's pen, Kyoto and Taipei are like Kawabata's twin sisters who share striking similarities yet have taken completely different directions in life. To Zhu, the dichotomy of homeland/foreign, colonized/colonizer becomes blurred and the conception of authenticity or originality seems unattainable, such as when the protagonist is surprised to discover that Maruyama Park 円山公園 in Kyoto seems to have appropriated its name from Taipei's Yuansan Park 圓山公園, but her daughter on the contrary regards Taipei as the copycat.(175) Apparently, the mother and daughter have come to know the place in reverse order so they have different ideas of what constitutes "authenticity" and "copy" when looking at exactly the same thing. Furthermore, if we take into account the

historical fact that Kyoto was built by Emperor Kanmu in 794 modelled on the Tang Dynasty's capital city Changan, it becomes even more difficult to trace and confirm the source of "authenticity." If old Taipei is a replica of Kyoto, would it be outrageous to see Kyoto as a replica of Changan? In the story Zhu does not mention or imply this relation between Kyoto and Changan, but given her erudition in history I doubt she is unaware of this historical fact. If so, then what does this say about the twin city relations between Kyoto and Taipei? In any event, one thing is for sure: that is that Kyoto's authenticity as an unchanging utopia has to be put into question.

The most significant issue Zhu intends to explore in her narrative is the discontinuity in the historical record of Taiwan and the disruption of the collective memory of the Taiwanese people.⁵⁴ To generations of Taiwanese born after 1949, regardless of ethnicity, Taiwan's colonial history has been erased and replaced by another version of history and memory, namely "the great China," by the KMT government. For people who have not experienced colonization or heard firsthand recollections of living under it, the Japanese colonization can be both alluring and mystifying as Japanese cultural imprints remain in Taiwan and yet belong to the untaught and unexperienced past.⁵⁵ Therefore, Zhu's appropriating Kawabata's old capital is not simply a matter of romanticizing an ancient city. On the one hand, Kyoto's authentic historicity provides the protagonist with necessary references to trace a segment of the disrupted histories of Taiwan and to recall nostalgic memories of the Taipei of her youth; on the other hand, such seemingly authentic historicity that is unattainable in Taipei leads her to recognize the hybridity and heterogeneity in postcolonial Taiwan.

Like a returning pilgrim bearing a talisman brought back from a sacred place, Zhu's

protagonist, with a colonial map of Taiwan in hand, is able to see and experience anew the place from which she previously had been intending to escape. In the disguise of a Japanese tourist, the protagonist becomes an alien in her homeland. This displacement allows her to see the homeland from a distance, and to rewrite the selectively forgotten colonial history of Taipei. Like Kawabata's text, the colonial map functions as the rational representation of the desire to articulate the present. However, while allowing the protagonist to create an imagined past and reinforce her nostalgia of the past as a utopian space, like the Peach Blossom Stream, the colonial map eventually widens the gap between her imagined Taipei and the real city in the present. When the protagonist loses the map at the end of the journey, i.e. without the disguise of a Japanese tourist, she still feels herself to be an alien when she wanders into an obscure village where people seem to speak in a dialect that she cannot understand. Contrary to the utopian Peach Blossom Stream, the village represents a disconcerting dystopia where the protagonist is excluded and threatened by the fear of death and desolation.

Zhu Tianxin's "Ancient Capital" is often read as a resistance to modernization because of the protagonist's nostalgia and glorification of the past.⁵⁶ In fact, what ultimately concerns her, however, is not modernization itself but the dominant power's wilful obliteration of the history of the displaced/marginalized in the name of "modernization" or "progress." To the protagonist, the destruction of the familiar environment indicates the negation of her existence and identity. More specifically, it is the political ideology dominating the spatial change of the urban city that threatens the existence and identity of the protagonist. The novella betrays the author's deep anxiety about the prevailing mainstream ideology that alienates and marginalizes the mainlanders

in order to secure its version of the cultural/national narrative. As such, critical reflection and inclusive accommodation are implicitly urged by the author in the ongoing grand (re)construction of Taiwanese identity, because utopia or dystopia is on the line.

Rereading and remapping the landscape of Taipei through the lens of its colonizer does not relate the protagonist with the colonizer; rather, it functions as a way of exaggerating her displaced subjectivity. Whether in the guise of a Japanese tourist or not, the protagonist feels herself a stranger in her own country. Displacement enables the protagonist to alienate herself so as to see the present Taipei through the eyes of the Other. Metaphorically, when the mistake of exclusivity or erasing the history of the other is repeated again by the mainstream ideology—at present it is the ideology of Taiwanese nationalism—then Taipei would become a dystopia, an evil twin of Kyoto or Peach Blossom Stream. Rather than intensifying the dichotomy between Chinese and Taiwanese cultural/national narratives, Zhu warns of the danger and absurdity of an essentialist, exclusive, and oppressive grand narrative in the formation of so-called “Taiwaneseness,” or the subjectivity of Taiwan. Inevitably, however, in the process of identifying with the land, she also exhibits the second-generation mainlander’s typical self-contradiction and generalized anxiety. As summarized in the opening sentence: “You don’t say that your memory doesn’t count at all...,” the narrator/author intends to seek a common ground to engage in dialogues with others, native Taiwanese or mainlanders alike, who all suffer disruptions of memory. Ideally, with common trauma in this “imagined community,” the native Taiwanese people’s suffering would be recognized and sympathized with as much as the second-generation mainlanders’ anxiety.

Rephrasing Spivak’s “always on the run,” Susan Stanford Friedman has pointed out

that rootlessness acquires its meaning only in relation to its opposite—rootedness.⁵⁷ In other words, narratives of identity often require some form of encounter with an other, a displacement, either physical or psychical, to come to consciousness. Born to a mainland father and a Hakka Taiwanese mother, and married to a native Taiwanese, the protagonist has a background that best exemplifies the hybridity of Taiwanese-ness, just like the author herself does in real life. Specifically, in addition to the mentality of diaspora inherited from her father, the protagonist/author further experiences displacement when the Taiwanese nativist ideology gains driving force and political power. Like Spivak who resists a fixed identity, the protagonist/author is also always on the run. The “in-between” space provides the protagonist/author an opportunity to involve herself with an underlying dialogic negotiation between the assertion of difference and the acceptance of hybridity produced through displacement.

Ōba Minako versus Zhu Tianxin

Through displacement, the female protagonists in Ōba’s “The Repairman’s Wife” and Zhu’s “Ancient Capital” are able to renegotiate their own identities, intricately intertwined as they are with issues of gender, race, and nation. Both protagonists start their identity formation/reformation with a journey of pilgrimage to a foreign country that has once colonized their homeland. While Aya in “The Repairman’s Wife” leaves her country with an American soldier as a way of exacting revenge on her ex-husband for abandoning her and her new-born baby, the protagonist in “Ancient Capital” escapes from her own country hoping to find a utopia in Kyoto, where she hopes to be able not only to flee the bitter struggle between the Chinese and the Taiwanese cultural/national narratives

but also to revive her homoerotic sentiments with her bosom friend A. Both protagonists share a similar resentment that is derived from being abandoned by or excluded from the nation-state narrative of each country, although the protagonist's anxiety in Zhu's story is further intensified by her confinement within compulsory heterosexual practice.

It is interesting to note that while Aya's "sacred place" is Alaska, a multicultural space situated peripherally to the American mainland and its mainstream culture, Zhu's protagonist obtains her inspiration from Kyoto, an old city that crystallizes Japan's cultural authenticity and social homogeneity. Functioning similarly, each "sacred place" denotes the opposite state and contrasting features of the protagonist's home country, and clearly indicates the possibility of reflecting on the differences; these are spaces of ambivalence where identity can be reformulated. Encountering an intercultural other, the two protagonists become able to initiate a dialogue between sameness and difference. Just as the townspeople in Alaska function as a mirror for Aya to reflect on her own irrational generalizations, Kyoto's eternal historicity propels Zhu's protagonist to retrace the ruptured colonial history of Taiwan and thus realize the impossibility of pursuing cultural authenticity and continuative history in postcolonial Taiwan. Equally important, it is not until the protagonists return to their homeland that they acquire a "language" of their own in which they can resolve their resentment and communicate with the Other. Initially, both protagonists return home as aliens to exert their revenge. As a naturalized American citizen, Aya shows off her completely Americanized daughter to her former husband; while Zhu's protagonist disguises herself as a Japanese tourist to revisit the urban city of Taipei through the filter of its former colonizer. Upon their return from the pilgrimage, both female protagonists find a new way of meditating on their relationship with the

nation.

Metaphorically Aya and Zhu's protagonist are able to reformulate their identities in a language within which subjectivity is not predicated on subordinating the Other. With this constantly transforming language, both protagonists are able to have their resentment resolved and acquire a more objectively-measured view of themselves and the Other. Instead of denying difference, they regard otherness or difference as a creative means to reflect on themselves and to destabilize multiple forms of repression and dominance. For them, identity is a constant ongoing process of formation and reformulation, and depends centrally upon narrative, as opposed to invariably being fixed into stable cores. Having originally come from a homogeneous society with a clear unified national identity, Aya feels free from the confinement of any form of collectivism upon acquiring her enlightened individuality.⁵⁸ Although eventually she decides to go back to Alaska after visiting Japan, Aya now could feel at home with her own identity wherever she lives. Conversely, Zhu's protagonist seems to have no such easy exit. However, despite the female protagonist's anxiety of ending up with a dystopia, the last passage drawn from Lian's historiography arguably indicates the author's intention of identifying with the island if only the scenario of dystopia can be read as a vigilant warning. That is, Zhu's protagonist still manages to locate her identity and her language, by which her resentment may be resolved to some acceptable and sustainable extent. The major difference from Aya, however, is that Zhu's protagonist still desperately needs to find an identification that will allow her to be included by fellow members of the community, largely because Taiwan in every respect is an extremely heterogeneous society, the collective identity of which is still highly contested.

While Aya refuses to affiliate herself with any collective group or ideology, Zhu's protagonist longs to attain both individual and communal identities that are respectable and sustainable. This difference between Ōba's and Zhu's works (and the other two pairs compared in the previous chapters as well) speaks clearly again to the specificities of each country's unique socio-historical context. One particularly significant difference is that Japan has never been forced to forsake and replace its own language, culture, and history with those of the colonizer. Taiwan, however, was put under a series of intensive colonization(s) for almost a century after 1895, which at times imposed strict linguistic, cultural and socio-political structures from the outside. In a time of drastic political transformation, the issue of national identity has only become more urgent. Women writers like Li Ang and Zhu Tianxin are rigorously participating in the current debate over the reconstruction of Taiwan's communal identity. In their respective work, they both demonstrate the significant extent to which the questions of national identity and gender identity are deeply implicated in the socio-political structure.

The differences in dealing with the nation issue also reflect each author's different experience of (post)colonialism. Growing up during the war, Ōba Minako learned how terrible it was for a nation to betray its own people. Seeing nationalism and patriotism as dangerous and poisonous, Ōba creates protagonists who are always critical of Japan's imperial past, but eventually come to see its people as individuals with differing degrees of responsibility, after the protagonists have discovered how to be individuals themselves. On the contrary, as a member of the baby-boom generation, Zhu has never personally experienced any war. More importantly, like most of the mainlanders in Taiwan, she probably would not see the KMT's authoritarian rule as a form of colonization. Therefore,

her criticism of the KMT's rule is not as scathing as native Taiwanese might like it to be. However, her disillusion from the previous myth created by the KMT government propels her not to uphold any kind of nationalism.⁵⁹ Like Aya in Ōba's novel, Zhu (and her protagonist) will not kill or die for patriotism or any form of collective solidarity. Zhu's attempt to identify with the island itself, or her desire to be included in the collective community, should not be simply seen as a new kind of postcolonial nationalism but as a way of preventing herself from being obliterated in the progressing (re)construction of national narrative. As in the novel, the protagonist's deep anxiety over the bleak prospect of Taiwan becoming a dystopia clearly indicates Zhu's intention of participating in the dialogue and the general formative process of reconstructing Taiwanese identity in the postcolonial era. In fact, for Zhu Tianxin as an influential writer in Taiwan, "Ancient Capital" is her crucial means for entering and engaging that general discussion.

It is worthwhile to discuss the woman-woman relationship that denotes a significant page in each protagonist's life. In Ōba's story, Aya and Maria attain an intimate friendship that is based on their shared trauma: being abandoned by their countries of origins where the conventional gender roles are arbitrarily assigned and observed, and individuality has been reduced to nothing in the name of nationalism or conformist collectivism. The bond of friendship helps them both overcome their feelings of being abandoned, and resolve their resentments toward their home countries. On the other hand, in Zhu's story, the relationship between the protagonist and A is beyond mere friendship. Never questioning prevailing heterosexual practice, the young protagonist has absent-mindedly participated in heterosexual patriarchy while still feeling a passionate desire for A. Although the protagonist and A never really practiced homosexuality, either, A remains the dearest

person in the protagonist's life and memory. In Zhu's particular narrative, the narrator seems to suggest that the unfulfilled homoerotic sentiments, and the rupture caused by heterosexual hegemony, can be seen as a universal trauma experienced by all women.

In the Conclusion I will discuss the ways in which all the works and authors discussed in this and previous chapters contribute to a critical investigation into postcolonial issues of identity, particularly in terms of gender, race and nation.

Notes

- ¹ Hans-Georg Gadamer, *Truth and Method* (New York: Seabury Press, 1975), p. 15.
- ² "An Interview with Ōba Minako," in Michiko Niikuni Wilson, *Gender is Fair Game: (Re)Thinking the (Fe)male in the Works of Ōba Minako* (Armonk, New York: M. E. Sharpe, 1999), p. 170.
- ³ For information on Ōba Minako's background see Michiko N. Wilson, "Ōba Minako," in *Japanese Women Writers: A Bio-critical Sourcebook*, ed. Chieko Mulhern (London: Greenwood Press, 1994,) pp.285-94; Numazawa Kazuko, "Ōba Minako" 大庭みな子, in *Tanpen josei bungaku gendai* 短編女性文学現代, eds. Imai Yasuko, Yabu Teiko, and Watanabe Sumiko (Tokyo: Ōfūsha, 1993), pp. 61-8; Sachiko Schierbeck, "Ooba Minako," in *Japanese Women Novelists in the Twentieth Century: 104 Biographies 1900~1993* (University of Copenhagen: Museum Tusculanum Press, 1994), pp. 218-21; and Michiko Wilson, "An Interview with Ōba Minako," pp.166-87.
- ⁴ Numazawa Kazuko, "Ōba Minako," p. 61.
- ⁵ *Ibid.*, pp. 62-3.
- ⁶ Michiko N. Wilson, "Ōba Minako," p. 286.
- ⁷ Numazawa Kazuko, "Ōba Minako," p. 63
- ⁸ Ōba Minako 大庭みな子, *Mae, Mae, Katatsumuri* 舞へ舞へ蝸牛 (Tokyo: Fukutake Bunko, 1990), p. 199. Cited in Janice Brown "Ōba Minako—Telling the Untellable," *Japan Quarterly*, 15, no. 3, (July-September 1998): p.50.
- ⁹ Janice Brown, "Ōba Minako—Telling the Untellable," p.52.
- ¹⁰ Ōba Minako 大庭みな子, "Kojin to kokka" 個人と国家, in *Mezamete miru yume* 目覚め

てみる夢 (Tokyo: Kōdansha, 1978), pp. 163-6.

- ¹¹ Pam Morris, "Construction of Gender: Freud and Lacan," in *Literature and Feminism* (Oxford: Blackwell, 1993), p. 117.
- ¹² Christopher Norris, *Deconstruction: Theory and Practice* (New York; London: Methuen, 1982), p. 32.
- ¹³ Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak, "Imperialism and Sexual Difference," *Oxford Literary Review* 8, 1-2 (1986): p. 230.
- ¹⁴ Trinh, T. Minh-Ha. *Woman, Native, Other: Writing Postcoloniality and Feminism*. (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1989), p. 104.
- ¹⁵ Ibid., 104.
- ¹⁶ Ibid., 39.
- ¹⁷ Ibid., 94.
- ¹⁸ Trinh, "No Master Territories," in *The Post-colonial Studies Reader*, eds. Bill Ashcroft, Gareth Griffiths, and Helen Tiffin (London and New York: Routledge, 1997), pp.216-7.
- ¹⁹ Ōba Minako, "Yorozu shūzenya no tsuma," trans. by Tomoyoshi Genkawa and Bernard Susser as "The Repairman's Wife," in *The Kyoto Collection: Stories from the Japanese* (Osaka: Niheisha, 1989).
- ²⁰ Ōba Minako 大庭みな子, "Yorozu shūzenya no tsuma" よろず修繕屋の妻, in *Ōba Minako zenshū* 大庭みな子全集 vol. 4 (Tokyo: Kōdansha, 1991).
- ²¹ Miseli Jeon, "Violent Emotions: Modern Japanese and Korean Women Writing, 1920-1980" PhD Thesis, (The University of British Columbia, 2004), p. 224.
- ²² Yonaha Keiko 与那覇恵子, "Ōba Minako ron" 大庭みな子論, in *Gendai joryū sakka ron* 現代女流作家論 (Tokyo: Shinbisha, 1986), p. 90.
- ²³ Homi Bhabha, *The Location of Culture* (London; New York: Routledge, 1994), p. 2. Emphasis in original.
- ²⁴ Ibid., 1-2.
- ²⁵ Miseli Jeon, "Violent Emotions: Modern Japanese and Korean Women Writing, 1920-1980," p. 230.
- ²⁶ Meyda Yegenoglu, *Colonial Fantasies: Towards a Feminist Reading of Orientalism* (London and New York: Cambridge UP, 1998), p. 9.
- ²⁷ Miseli Jeon, "Violent Emotions: Modern Japanese and Korean Women's Writing, 1920-1980," p. 231.
- ²⁸ Michiko Niikuni Wilson, *Gender Is Fair Game: (Re)Thinking the (Fe)Male in the Works of Ōba Minako*, p. 55.
- ²⁹ Ibid., p.9.
- ³⁰ Qi Bangyuan 齊邦媛, "Juancun wenxue: xiangchou de jicheng yu shiji" 眷村文學 聯合報 25-26 Oct. 1991: 25.
- ³¹ Despite her distinguished writing, Zhu Tianwen is best known for her collaboration

with Taiwan's internationally acclaimed film director Hou Xiaoxian (Hou Hsiaohsien), for whom she wrote several major film scripts, such as *Tongnian wangshi* 童年往事 (A Time to Live, A Time to Die, 1985).

³² Due to his alleged collaboration with the Japanese in occupying Shanghai during the China War, Hu was accused by the Nationalist government of treason and forced into exile in Japan. He resided in Japan after the war but later came to teach in Taiwan. He became a close friend to the Zhu family and mentor to the sisters after the late 1970s when he was fired by the Chinese Cultural University and taken in by the father Zhu Xining.

³³ Lingchei Letty Chen, "Writing Taiwan's Fin-de-siècle Splendor: Zhu Tianwen and Zhu Tianxin," in *The Columbia Companion to Modern East Asian Literature*, ed. Joshua Mostow. (New York: Columbia University Press, 2003), p.588.

³⁴ Chiu Kuei-fen, "Identity Politics in Contemporary Women's Novels in Taiwan," *Tamkang Review* 30, no. 2 (Winter 1999): p. 44.

³⁵ On the peculiar historical development that made the great divide across Taiwan Strait since 1949, please see Ralph N. Clough, *Island China* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1978). Steven E. Phillips, *Between Assimilation and Independence: the Taiwanese Encounter Nationalist China, 1945-1950*, (Stanford, California: Stanford University Press, 2003). On Taiwan's domestic socio-political transformation up to 1988, the most popular text would be Tien Hung-mao, *The Great Transition: Political and Social Change in the Republic of China* (Stanford, CA: Hoover Institution Press, 1989). Despite the common interest of survival against the communist China, there have been quite a different variety of proposals for consolidating Taiwanese identity. Most fundamental among them are people who support a unified China with the mainland, as opposed to those who are championing for the full independence of Taiwan as a sovereign state. The majority of Taiwanese people, however, recognize the fact that either proposal has its insurmountable political difficulties and grave dangers from within and without. As such, neither competing camp has been able to garner any major political force from the general populace. In practical terms, the status quo is expected to retain wide currency as long as the overall economic health is maintained for the general stability in social development.

³⁶ In loose terms and without any sense of discrimination or exclusion in this thesis, "native Taiwanese" usually refers to all those except mainlanders, as the term is customarily used in Taiwanese society. It is imperative to note, however, that through marriages across different ethnic groups, which are not uncommon, it has become virtually impossible to identify definitively an individual's specific ethnic group, particularly for the second generation and later. For example, Zhu Tianxin was born to a mainland father and a Hakka mother, and her husband is a native Taiwanese. Despite

the fact that the paternal name and values would still have precedence in practice, it is not always clear which ethnic group would endorse which particular political position with regard to Taiwan's unification with or separation from China. This is quite another important phenomenon characterizing the post-modernity in today's Taiwanese society. As a researcher and critic of ethnicities-related issues, and in particular for the purpose of this thesis, I think it is appropriate for me to state how I personally fit into the mix of late 20th century Taiwan's postcoloniality being discussed here. My ancestors from both the paternal and maternal sides are Han Chinese who immigrated from China long before the Qing Dynasty, so practically I would fit into the category of native Taiwanese. None of my family was a victim of the February 28 incident or directly affected by the so-called "white terror"; moreover, my father has a rather uncritical attitude towards the KMT government, perhaps because he worked as a public servant all his life. Growing up in such a family, which is quite common to many people in Taiwanese society, the national identity I absorbed was not much different from the myth created by the KMT government. It was not until I came to Canada, displaced from where I grew up, that I started to develop a more critical view toward what I had previously taken for granted. With a new perspective inspired by my studies and research on (post)colonialism and feminism, I am now inclined to see the absurd and oppressive nature of grand narratives of any sort, either previously held or currently being developed. In the post-martial-law era, native Taiwanese seem to enjoy the most "legitimate" right to speak for the people in Taiwan. However, I would argue that any individual Taiwanese, regardless of ethnicity, has every right to participate in and contribute to the process of constructing "Taiwaneseness." That is to argue that, despite ethnic differentiation, the category of ethnicity should be no reason for exclusion, which would risk essentialism and chauvinism.

³⁷ Despite criticisms and controversies, Li was once dubbed "Mr. Democracy." Li's efforts in consolidating Taiwan's political reforms not only have realigned the outdated political power structure, but also have solidly laid down institutional arrangements that will frame any future development of Taiwan solely within democratic principles. For a recent assessment of Li's twelve year presidency, see Bruce Dickson and Jianmin Zhao eds. *Assessing Lee Teng-hui's Legacy in Taiwan's Politics: Democratic Consolidation and External Relations* (Armonk, NY: M.E. Sharpe, 2002).

³⁸ The "one-China principle" originally refers to the KMT government's intention of recovering all of China's territories from the communist regime which has, however, effectively occupied the entire Chinese mainland since 1949. Ironically, this principle has always been welcomed by the PRC, as essentially it declares Taiwan to be an inseparable part of China. However, it is imperative to recognize that the KMT government's intention was to absorb all of China under its rule, not under the

communist rule in the name of PRC. As such, there have since been different interpretations in terms of what constitutes "China."

³⁹ Some would choose emigration from Taiwan as a way out of such an agonizing dilemma, much as some native Taiwanese dissidents faced a similar situation of diaspora until the early 1990s when they were forced to flee KMT persecution or to take decades-long sojourns in foreign countries to protest the "illegitimate" rule of the Chiang regime.

⁴⁰ Chiu Kuei-fen, "Identity Politics in Contemporary Women's Novels in Taiwan," p. 40.

⁴¹ Like the stories in *Remembering My Brothers in Military Housing Compounds*, "Ancient Capital" is written in an autobiographical mode. On the surface, the arrangement brings the narrative to a level of self-consciousness, and the narrator's tone is intended to show her, or even the implied author's, sympathy for the narratee to a point of identifying one with the other. In terms of a writing strategy, this particular style of narrative serves the purpose of identifying the narratee with the reader. In other words, any given reader, regardless of ethnicity, is invoked by the author to identify with the narratee, the narrator, and the implied author. See Chou Ying-hsiung, "Between Temporal and Spatial Transformations: An Ancient Capital City at the End of Time," *Tamkang Review* 31, no. 2 (Winter 2000): p. 68.

⁴² Please note that the original sentence does not end with a question mark as is expected. All translations of *Gudu* (Ancient Capital) used here are mine. Quotations of original text are drawn from the Maitian edition.

⁴³ As David Derwei Wang 王德威 has pointed out, "walking" is Zhu's favourite activity for her characters. The story of "Ancient Capital" is also unfolded through the characters' numerous walks in different cities. See Wang's "Xulun: Laolinghuen qianshi ginsheng—Zhu Tianxin de shiaoshuo" 序論：老靈魂前世今生—朱天心的小說, in *Gudu* 古都 (Taipei: Maitian, 1997), p. 27.

⁴⁴ In fact, the Nonomiya Shrine is a reconstruction, but for the protagonist of "Ancient Capital" its significance lies in the fact that it supposedly looks just as it did 1000 years ago when *The Tale of Genji* was written.

⁴⁵ When Zhu was writing this story, Taipei city had recently elected an opposition party (DDP) to be in power for the first time.

⁴⁶ Tamsui is a place that carries a lot of personal emotion and invokes innumerable happy memories of the narrator, the narratee, and the author herself as well.

⁴⁷ Lamenting the lack of historiography of Taiwan, Lian Heng was the first to compile a general historiography of Taiwan in an attempt to firmly secure the existence and identity of the Taiwanese. The Preface to Lian's voluminous work comprising about six hundred thousand words has now been used in Taiwan's school textbooks.

⁴⁸ Wang, "Xulun: Laolinghuen qianshi ginsheng—Zhu Tianxin de shiaoshuo," p. 26.

- ⁴⁹ The narrator describes the seventies as “everything is new and unknown and thus full of unlimited possibilities. Despite and apart from certain taboos, you are free to do just about anything and enjoy full freedom, real freedom” (一切都是新的未知的因此充滿了無限的可能，儘管有人規定你必須這樣不許那樣，但是規定之外卻全都可以全都自由，真正的自由，157).
- ⁵⁰ For the purposes of this thesis, by “mainland Chinese” I am referring to those Chinese who did not relocate to Taiwan after 1949. It is simply used to distinguish those relocated mainlanders and their children in Taiwan from those Chinese currently residing in mainland China. Again, the usual disclaimer applies that I intend no discrimination or exclusion whatsoever.
- ⁵¹ Adrienne Rich, “Compulsory Heterosexuality and Lesbian Existence,” in *Feminisms*, eds. Sandra Kemp and Judith Squires (Oxford, New York: Oxford University Press, 1997), pp. 320-5.
- ⁵² Homi Bhabha, “Of Mimicry and Man,” in *The Location of Culture* (London and New York: Routledge, 1994), p.86. (emphasis in original)
- ⁵³ For example, Yu Yonghe 郁永河, Lan Dingyuan 藍鼎元, Shen Baozhen 沈葆楨, and Li Hongzhong 李鴻章.
- ⁵⁴ Lingchei Letty Chen, “The Right to Copy and the Copyright: Cultural Identity, Hybridity, and Authenticity,” p. 131.
- ⁵⁵ Ibid., p. 132.
- ⁵⁶ Hao Yuxiang 郝譽翔, “Yijiubaqinian de taowang—lun Zhu Tianxin xiaoshuo zhong de chaosheng zhi lü” 一九八七年的逃亡—論朱天心小說中的朝聖之旅, *Tonghua renwen xuebao* 東華人文學報 no. 3 (July, 2001): pp. 241-68.
- ⁵⁷ Susan Stanford Friedman, *Mappings: Feminism and the Cultural Geographies of Encounter* (Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1998), p. 151.
- ⁵⁸ In fact, Japan is not an entirely homogeneous society, and its clear sense of one unified identity is more of a fiction than most people are willing to admit. From before the beginnings of modernity in Japan there have been a number of ethnic or social minorities in Japanese society, but their existence is rarely acknowledged in mainstream social discourse. In addition, in postwar Japan the number of foreign-born, naturalized Japanese citizens has steadily increased, together with the number of foreigners residing permanently in Japan, but these people, too, are left out of the mainstream picture of “Japaneseness.” Therefore, even though it does not accurately reflect the reality of modern Japan, the notion of Japan’s homogeneity is a fundamental belief of most people both inside and outside Japan, and is used in Japan’s construction of a national identity on the international stage.
- ⁵⁹ Rephrasing Graham Greene’s novel, *Our Man in Havana*, Zhu once explained her attitude towards the concept of “nation.” She says that “I will not kill for my country,

not for communism, not for capitalism, not for a social democratic state, and not for a welfare state. But if someone killed my daughter, I would kill him for revenge. I would kill for the sake of my family." See Zhu's "Doesn't My Memory Count?" trans. Oiwan Lam, *Inter-Asia Cultural Studies* 3, no. 1 (2002), p. 103.

Conclusion

By analyzing and comparing selected literary texts by women writers from modern Japan and Taiwan in this dissertation, I have investigated the question of a female perspective and literary practice in these two countries and have tried to demonstrate the extent to which women writers represent subjectivity as interlocked with elements of gender, race and nation in the thematic issues of their writing. Incorporating feminist literary criticism with postcolonial critical theory, I have chosen to focus on these women writers' strategies of "writing against" dominant discourses, and how such strategies are shared by both postcolonial Japanese and Taiwanese women writers.

In chapter one I briefly delineated the contours of Japanese and Taiwanese modern literature and demonstrated how writers in each country have, implicitly or explicitly, reflected or responded to its specific socio-political milieu. In particular I have presented a brief overview of the socio-political conditions that have constrained (or liberated) women in the two countries, and the discursive circumstances that women writers write "against," to reveal the profound significance of the three major themes identified by this thesis—namely gender, race, and nation—both in terms of their respective relations to and their combined effects on women's literary production.

When creating itself as a modern nation, Meiji Japan invoked the *ie seido* (the family system)—an institution within which the father of a family maintained all the authority and legal rights, while other family members remained subordinate—as the foundation for the establishment of the *kazoku kokka* (the family nation), within which the emperor was analogized to the head of the "national family." Excluded from the establishment of

any kind of real or symbolic lineage, women who were institutionally molded to be “*ryōsai kenbo*” (good wives, wise mothers) became the ground upon which the modern nation was built. Influenced by the apparent hegemony of the *ie* system, many of the key works of most male authors prior to the war were diligent in searching for an “authentic” father-son genealogy at the expense of women, exposing their desire to pursue and uphold the supremacy and continuance of patrilineal lineage. The new conceptualizations of subjectivity dictated by the ideology of patriarchy in the Meiji period then went on to exert residual yet profound influences on the following generations, even in the postwar period.

With its status as a nation state relatively ambiguous, and with its complicated colonial and cultural history, Taiwan’s modern literature was affected by a number of turbulent and revolutionary political events. Taiwanese literature was born in the Japanese colonial period and soon burgeoned, but, at the same time, from its inception it was constantly restrained by explicit and implicit censorship from expressing ideas of subjectivity freely. Modern Taiwanese literature evolved from the Taiwan New Literature movement of the 1920s, by way of the nostalgic Anti-Communist literature of the 1950s, the modernist literary movement of the 1960s, and the nativist literature of the 1970s, to the pluralism in the 1980s. Whereas Japanese writers started to enjoy freedom of expression as early as 1952 when the U.S. occupation ended, Taiwanese writers could not wield their pens truly without fear until martial law was lifted in 1987. I have argued therefore that women’s literary production between the 1950s and 1970s in Japan and that of the 1990s in Taiwan share similar characteristics of postcoloniality after the writers of both countries regained a certain degree of economic and political autonomy.

Sharing the theme of man-slaughtering, both Kanai Mieko's "Rotting Meat" and Li Ang's *The Butcher's Wife* deal with subtle issues of sexuality, power and the textual subversion of patriarchal discourse in an astoundingly lethal way. In both stories, women are treated like prostitutes who have to trade their bodies for food; in these stories, women/prostitutes are equated to "meat" whereas men/butchers get to "kill" and consume that "meat." While Li realistically portrays a dark dystopian world in which the female protagonist has been socially oppressed and sexually brutalized, Kanai employs nameless, allegorical characters and ambiguous settings to create her story in a fantasy-like atmosphere. Despite these differences, in each story, the Symbolic order is subverted through the female protagonist's shocking act of killing. The newly reversed power paradigm—wherein men can be eaten/passive and women can eat/be active—that both Kanai and Li have created in their stories, does not, in the end, free gender discourse from the pitfall of simple binaries. However, it is extremely important not to overlook the authors' bold attempt to expose the absurdities and dangers arising from androcentric power paradigms, and the theory that gender is performative.

As Kanai was born after the war and spent her formative years after the Allied Occupation forces had left Japan, most of her early works focus on the interrogation of the meaning of being "woman," and seldom directly grapple with issues of war or politics. Nevertheless, by creating shocking images of women that are contrary to conventional gender roles, which continue to derive from prewar patriarchy, Kanai grotesquely reveals the abusive and absurd nature of existing power paradigms and effectively challenges the national narrative for its arbitrarily prescribed gender roles. In a similar fashion, Li's story also focuses on gender relations situated within male-dominated institutions. While *The*

Butcher's Wife does not include more images of "nation" and "history" than does Kanai (such as the soldier who trades food for sex with the protagonist's mother), Li seems to intend to avoid politically sensitive issues in this story. As a matter of fact, with the "white terror" still threatening when this work was written, Li does not have much room for challenging the authoritative national narrative in *The Butcher's Wife*. It was not until martial law was lifted in 1987 that writers like Li Ang could start to freely contemplate and represent the intersection of various networks of gender, race, and nation. Accordingly, *Labyrinthine Garden* became the first long novel of Li's to represent the fruit of her contemplation of such complicated issues.

For this reason *Labyrinthine Garden* is well suited to be compared with Enchi Mieko's *Masks*. As my critical comparison has revealed, both works are in effect fatally challenging the dominant patrilineal discourse and national narrative. Both Li Ang's *Labyrinthine Garden* and Enchi Fumiko's *Masks* are complex multi-layered novels that explore contemporary women's empowerment within the androcentric imaginary. Using an item from each culture's traditional, artistic past as their primary structuring metaphor—the Noh masks for Enchi and the classical garden for Li—both authors iterate a similar "layeredness" of postcoloniality. Equally, both novels accentuate the fragmentation, complicatedness, and heterogeneity of postcolonial identities through this structuring metaphor, in order to avoid the replication of the binary categories of the past and to create new anti-monolithic models of thinking. With allusion to such classic literary works as *The Tale of Genji*, Mieko's masked revenge is unfolded through layered performances such as the Noh plays and spiritualism, and is obscured by the intricate numerous triangular relationships involving herself and other characters. In *Labyrinthine*

Garden, Li uses fractional and interrupted narrative to crystallize the historical ruptures of Taiwan as it was repeatedly colonized, testifying to the significant extent to which this sense of rupture affects the social and private lives of people in general, and is gendered.

In antithesis to the conventional gender role of 'good wife, wise mother,' Enchi intermixes empowered women from historical texts and the literary canon to create an empowered female archetype—the vengeful mistreated woman who desires to reveal her secret self and power—not only to pose a dire threat to the men of patriarchy but also to lethally challenge the national narrative founded upon the notion of the family nation. Almost as scheming as Mieko in Enchi's *Masks*, Zhu Yinghong in *Labyrinthine Garden* ventures to search for her identity, densely interlocked as it is with Taiwan's history of colonization and national narrative(s). In Zhu Yinghong we see the pain of witnessing male family members being symbolically castrated by various forms of dominating authority in Taiwan. As such, Li represents her protagonist as having to overcome the effects of colonialism *before* she can confront gender inequality and embark on her identity (re)construction. In a similar strategy of writing against dominant discourses, Enchi illustrates the powerful backlash of the residual impact arising from the rigid gender and family systems imposed from the Meiji period, whereas Li testifies to the remarkable extent to which the engagement with historical memory is closely connected to questions of identity and national narrative.

Whereas Enchi never explicitly raises the issue of national identity or the definition of Japaneseness in her novel, Li asserts the issue of Taiwan's national identity or so-called Taiwaneseeness as the most crucial theme of hers. This apparent difference in attention to the issue of national identity, in fact, significantly reflects the specific historical

experience of colonialism of Japan and Taiwan. Although since the Meiji period Japan has been unwittingly colonized by Western metaphysics and cultures, and was actually colonized by the Allied Occupation forces from 1945 to 1952, the Japanese people have never been forced to give up their own language, history, or culture for that of the colonizer. In contrast, under the Japanese colonial rule or the KMT government's authoritarian rule, the Taiwanese people have suffered the systematic deprivation of their native culture, history, and language. Therefore, when the political yoke of martial law disappeared in 1987, Taiwanese identity/subjectivity became the hottest literary topic; questions of identity could now be thought of in alternative ways, especially in those ways that do not postulate necessary conjunction between Taiwan and China.

In both Enchi's and Li's novels, women's productivity, which has long been used to bolster and prolong the patriarchal kinship structures, ironically becomes women's very weapon for subverting the dominant institutions that have ruthlessly confined them. In both stories, men are merely treated as means for women's purpose: for example, the intoxicated Ibuki in *Masks* is tricked into impregnating Harume in order to perpetuate Mieko's maternal lineage; and the sexually aggressive Teddy in *Labyrinthine Garden* is used by Zhu Yinghong for relieving her sexual anxiety and helping her to get revenge on the philandering Lin. Significantly, the system of paternal lineage is deprived of its rights and interests. However, there is a striking difference between the two novels in the ways they deal with the issue of masculinity/potency. In *Labyrinthine Garden* the father is symbolically emasculated by the colonizer, and eventually Lin is textually-castrated after his masculinity fulfills the dual mission of healing Zhu's traumatized colonial memories and helping with her national identity (re)construction. On the contrary, there is no

emasculatation of the men in *Masks*; all the men are sexually active throughout the story and the text presents no obstacle to their role of begetting children. Instead, men's sexual desire and masculinity/potency is in fact appropriated to fulfill Mieko/Enchi's plot for revenge through subverting the patrilineal line.

Theoretically speaking, my discovery of the stark contrast between these two works reaffirms the validity and usefulness of (post)colonialism(s), in conjunction with feminist/gender theories. The comparative study of Japanese and Taiwanese fiction reveals a "blind spot" in the feminist fiction of many postwar Japanese women writers: despite Japan's unique position as a nation to have been both colonizer and colonized, issues concerning the national narrative are rarely explicitly addressed. It could be argued that Enchi is aware of Japanese men's history of being colonizers who attempted to emasculate others, and that she therefore might have had little sympathy for Japanese men's problems in postcoloniality. But since the question of Japan's (post)colonial position or national narrative is never explicitly addressed in *Masks* (or in any of Enchi's other works, to my knowledge), it is impossible to know whether this "blind spot" reflects a lack of sympathy or a lack of interest in such issues on the part of the author.

One exception to this trend is Ōba Minako, whose work frequently addresses Japan's colonial and wartime activities and responsibility. Instead of focusing on body politics, Ōba Minako and Zhu Tianxin attempt to ponder the problems of identity through narratives that represent geographic/temporal displacement on the part of the protagonist. Both female protagonists in "The Repairman's Wife" and "Ancient Capital" become able to renegotiate their own identities—intricately intertwined with issues of gender, race, and nation as they are—through journeys of pilgrimage to the colonizer's country. They

originally leave their homeland with resentment, as they feel abandoned by or excluded from the national narrative: Aya in "The Repairman's Wife" leaves her country with an American soldier as a gesture of exacting revenge on her former husband and the nation that has made him; the nameless protagonist in "Ancient Capital" escapes from her own country hoping to find a utopia in Kyoto where she will be able not only to flee the bitter struggle between the polarizing Chinese and Taiwanese cultural/national narratives but also to (temporarily) escape the heterosexual imperative by reviving her homoerotic sentiments with her bosom friend.

Whereas Aya's "sacred place" is Alaska, a multicultural space situated peripherally to the American mainland and its mainstream culture, Zhu's protagonist obtains her inspiration from Kyoto, an ancient city that embodies for her Japan's authenticity in culture and homogeneity in society. In confronting an intercultural other, the two protagonists become able to initiate an enlightened dialogue between sameness and difference. The imperfections Aya finds even in the happily multicultural community of Alaska propels her to reflect on her own irrational generalizations. On the other hand, Kyoto's seemingly eternal historicity motivates Zhu's protagonist to retrace the ruptured colonial history of Taiwan and thus realize the impossibility of pursuing cultural authenticity and continuative history in postcolonial Taiwan. Although each protagonist returns to her homeland with an unresolved grudge, each eventually realizes an alternative way of conceptualizing her relationship with her native nation and reformulating her own identity through an understanding that subjectivity does not necessarily have to be constructed on subordinating the Other. Instead of denying difference, they both come to regard otherness or difference as a creative means for them to reflect on themselves, and

to destabilize multiple forms of repression and dominance as well. As a matter of fact, Ōba's and Zhu's texts significantly testify that identity (re)construction is an ongoing process of formation and reformulation and depends centrally upon narrative, as opposed to being fixed into stable cores.

Despite the intriguing thematic similarities, there remains a significant difference between Ōba's and Zhu's stories: whereas Aya refuses to affiliate herself with any collective group or ideology, Zhu's protagonist longs for *both* individual *and* communal identities through which she could be able to situate herself agreeably in society. As in the other pairs of comparison above, this difference between Ōba's and Zhu's texts not only reflects again the significant impact derived from each country's unique socio-historical milieu—the relatively homogeneous Japanese society, formerly a major military and colonialist power, versus the multiethnic, multilingual Taiwanese society that has been repeatedly colonized—but also reflects each author's varied experiences of (post)colonialism. Personally traumatized by the war, Ōba asserts her resolute antipathy against any form of collective ideology, often creating protagonists who are utterly critical of nationalism and patriotism. On the other hand, Zhu addresses the issues of nationalism rather less harshly. However, that does not mean that Zhu is attempting to embrace a new kind of postcolonial nationalism; this would be most unlikely after her disillusion with the national myth created by the KMT government. Rather, the kind of national identity her protagonist seeks is inclusive and receptive to otherness; unlike the one that is exclusive and oppressive, of which she is fearful to witness but seemingly unfolding in Taiwan.

It is worthwhile to mention that fundamentally Li and Zhu seem to have shared similar hopeful expectations of Taiwan's positive future, in spite of their different

backgrounds and varying perspectives. Like the promising image of the thriving Lotus Garden presented at the end of *Labyrinthine Garden*, Zhu's ending not only reveals her faithful intention of identifying with the island and her sincere desire of being included in the collective community, but gives a vigilant warning against the danger and absurdity in forming a grand narrative of any kind for Taiwan as a whole. This valuable lesson and fair warning from both Li and Zhu should not be taken as any less significant than the other issues that both authors have addressed in their stories. When the issue of national identity has become more urgent than ever, women writers like Li Ang and Zhu Tianxin have courageously and rigorously participated in the debate.

Situating themselves in the postcolonial era, the authors addressed in the present thematic comparative study all vigorously write against the existing hegemonic androcentric narratives. Starting with their critiques of the power configurations dictated by authority figures—whether indigenous or foreign—they describe how encodings of gender, race and national narratives have been superimposed on various specific forms of power paradigm, and expose how individuals have been regulated or traumatized thereby. The authors employ one of the primary political strategies of feminist and postcolonial discourse—focusing on the individual, the physical, the personal, and the specific—to re-construct and re-present a “politics” and a “history” of the time that are different from those constructed in accordance with the hegemonic androcentric view. The differences I have noted in this comparative study challenge the essentialist tendency to treat non-Anglo-European countries as a homogenous block, amounting to an assumption that there is a shared identity amongst ex-colonial states. As a matter of fact, Taiwan's complicated (post)colonial history significantly differentiates its postcoloniality from that

of Japan. Geographically peripheral to the Chinese mainland, Taiwan had always been marginalized by the discourses of the Ming and Qing Dynasties; let alone being ceded to Japan by the Qing, and then occupied by the KMT. The contradictions and ambivalence in the multilayered postcolonial Taiwanese identity are so unique that it would be difficult to find a similar example anywhere in the world. Japan's postcolonial identity—as extensive and powerful colonizer as well as extensively colonized—is also probably unique in the world.

As demonstrated, women's writing offers a particularly valuable record of the way in which the social and ideological constraints women have experienced can be both depicted and resisted in language. However, women's writing has been marginalized in each country's literary canon, a result of categorizing practices that privilege men's writing. A more gender-sensitive perspective and self-consciously inclusive policy will be imperative for constructing a literary history in either country that includes the literary experiences of both women and men.

The selected Western theories applied in this dissertation prove to have significant relevance and usefulness in analyzing the narrative constructions of identities of gender, race, and nation within modern Japanese and Taiwanese women's writing. Theories developed by Kristeva, Cixous, and Irigaray are extremely useful in analyzing the oppression of women in patriarchal society, whereas Spivak's and Trinh Minh-Ha's works provide a critical path to the interrogation and exploration of Third World women's subjectivity that is inextricably interlocked with gender, race, and nation. Nonetheless, a comparative analysis of literary production from modern Japan and Taiwan also displays the limits of Western theories, in particular postcolonialism. Postcolonialism incorporates

various studies of European colonialism's effects on many cultures in the world, and it includes all the academic disciplines current in the Western academy. Clearly, however, it is only within the Western academy that such a seemingly inclusive term as "postcolonial studies" appears feasible. Western postcolonial studies have overlooked Japan's colonial experience in Asia as the only non-Western colonizer. Japan's ambivalent position, both colonizer and colonized, I believe, can be posed as a critical test for the approaches to postcolonial criticism practiced heretofore. Furthermore, Taiwan's experience of repeated colonization, both by white and non-white colonizers, manifests complexities that cannot be easily explained in the usual West-centered terms of postcolonial criticism and theory.

This dissertation can be seen as a first step leading to more comprehensive comparative studies on Japanese and Taiwanese literatures. I believe the thematic and theoretical framework of this comparative study—interrogating themes such as the female body, female sexuality, "man-slaughtering," women's language, and geographic/temporal displacement, in conjunction with feminism and (post)colonialism—can be applied to Third World women's literary works in general, as long as adequate attention is paid to the local specifics of any nation's colonial history.

The conclusions and gaps in this study suggest fruitful areas for further research. As men are the ones who actually experience symbolic castration under the colonial power, or the ones who execute castration as the colonizer, an in-depth comparative study on how men's subjectivity is (re)constructed in the (post)colonial era in each country's literature would also help reveal the features of colonialism and its effects on gendered writing. Moreover, as Japan's colonial and postcolonial relationship with Korea is completely different from that of its model colony Taiwan, comparative studies of literary

texts from the three countries would significantly contribute to the critical exploration/interrogation of both extra-Asian and intra-Asian colonialisms in general, and their effects on literary production in particular.

Bibliography

- Abel, Elizabeth, ed. *Writing and Sexual Difference*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1982.
- Adams, Hazard. *Critical Theory since 1965*. Tallahassee: Florida State University Press, 1986.
- Alexander, M. Jacqui and Chandra Talpade Mohanty, eds. *Feminist Genealogies, Colonial Legacies. Democratic Futures*. New York: Routledge, 1997.
- Anderson, Benedict. *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*. London and New York: Verso, 1983.
- Ashcroft, Bill, Gareth Griffiths, and Helen Tiffin, eds. *The Empire writes back: Theory and Practice in Post-colonial Literatures*. London: Routledge, 1989.
- . *The Post-colonial Studies Reader*. London: New York: Routledge, 1995.
- . *Key Concepts in Post-Colonial Studies*. London and New York: Routledge, 1998.
- Bakhtin, Mikhail. *Problems of Dostoevsky's Poetics*. Trans. Caryl Emerson. Minneapolis; London: University of Minnesota Press, 1997.
- Bargen, Doris G. "Twin Blossoms on a Single Branch: The Cycle of Retribution in Onnamen." *Monumenta Nipponica* 46, no.2 (Summer 1991): 147-71.
- Barlow, Tani E., ed. *Gender Politics in Modern China: Writing and Feminism*. Durham and London: Duke UP, 1993.
- Barthes, Roland. *Empire of Signs*. New York: Hill and Wang, 1982.
- Belsey, Catherine. *The Feminist Reader: Essays in Gender and the Politics of Literary Criticism*. New York: B Blackwell, 1989.
- Bernstein, Gail Lee, ed. *Recreating Japanese Women, 1600-1945*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1991.
- Bhabha, Homi. *Nation and Narration*. London; New York: Routledge, 1990.
- . *The Location of Culture*. London; New York: Routledge, 1994.
- Bose, Brinda, Chandra T. Mohanty and Ghosh Biahnupriya. *Interventions: Feminist*

- Dialogues on Third World Women's Literature & Film*. New York: Garland, 1997.
- Bulbeck, Chilla. *Re-Orienting Western Feminisms: Women's Diversity in a Postcolonial World*. Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 1998.
- Bulter, Judith. *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity*. New York: Routledge, 1999.
- Brown, Janice. "Hayashi Fumiko: Voice from the Margin." *Japan Quarterly* (Tokyo) 43, no.1 (Jan-Mar 1996): 85-99.
- . "Ōba Minako: Telling the Untellable." *Japan Quarterly* 45, no.3 (July-September 1998): 50-9.
- Carpenter, Juliet Winters. "Enchi Fumiko: 'A Writer of Tales.'" *Japan Quarterly* 37, no.3 (July-September 1990): 343-55.
- Caruth, Cathy. *Unclaimed Experience: Trauma, Narrative, and History*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins UP, 1996.
- Carver, Ann C. and Sung-sheng Yvonne Chang, eds. *Bamboo Shoots After the Rain: Contemporary Stories by Women Writers of Taiwan*. New York: Feminist Press at the City University of New York 1990.
- Chang, Hsiaohung. "Vocal Exercises of Women's Bodies." Trans. Yenna Wu. *Taiwan Literature: English Translation Series*, 12, (2003): 3-5.
- Chang Sungsheng (Zhang Song-sheng). "Chu T'ien-wen and Taiwan's Recent Cultural and Literary Trends." *Modern Chinese Literature* 6, nos. 1&2 (Spring/Fall 1992): 61-81.
- . *Modernism and the Nativist Resistance: Contemporary Chinese Fiction from Taiwan*. Durham: Duke University Press, 1993.
- . "Yuan Qiongqiong and the Rage for Eileen Zhang among Taiwan's Feminine Writers." *Modern Chinese Literature and Culture* 4, Nos. 1 & 2, (Spring & Fall 1988): 201-23.
- Chang, Sung-sheng Yvonne and Michelle Yeh, eds. *Contemporary Chinese Literature: Crossing the Boundaries*. Austin, TX: Literature East & West, 1995.

- Chen, Chang-fang and Mei-hwa Sung. "Elements of Change in the Fiction of Taiwan of the 1980s." *Chinese Pen* (Taipei) no.2 (Sum 1989): 31-42.
- Chen Fangming 陳芳明. *Houzhimin Taiwan: wenxue shilun ji qi tongbian* 後殖民台灣：文學史論及其周邊. Taipei: Maitian, 2002.
- Chen, Huiling and Whitney Crothers Dilley, eds. *Feminism/femininity in Chinese literature*. Amsterdam ; New York: Rodopi, 2002.
- Chen, Li-fen. "The Cultural Turn in the Study of Modern Chinese Literature: Rey Chow and Diasporic Self-Writing." *Modern Chinese Literature and Culture* 12, no. 1 (Spring 2000): 43-80.
- Chen, Lingchei Letty. "The Right to Copy and the Copyright: Cultural Identity, Hybridity, and Authenticity." Ph.D. Thesis. Columbia University, 2001.
- Chen Yuling 陳玉玲. *Taiwan wenxue de gudu: nüxing, bentu, fanzhimin lunshu* 台灣文學的國度：女性・本土・反殖民論述. Taipei: Boyang wenhua, 2000.
- Chi, Pang-Yuan and David Wang, eds. *Chinese Literature in the Second Half of a Modern Century: A Critical Survey*. Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2000.
- Chiang, Shu-chen. "Gender in Taiwan's Postmodern Literature," *Asian Culture Quarterly*, 28, no. 1 (Spring 2000): 9-28.
- . "Literary Feminism in Taiwan." Ph.D. Thesis. University of Rochester, 1994.
- Chien, Ying-Ying. "Deconstructing Patriarchy/Reconstructing Womanhood: Feminist Readings of Multicultural Women's Murder Fiction." *Tamkang Review* 26, nos. 1&2 (Autumn & Winter 1995): 265-87.
- . "Women Crossing the Wild Zone: Sexual/Textual Politics in the Fiction of Ding Ling and Li Ang." *Fu Jen Studies* vol. 28 (Feb. 1995): 1-17.
- Chiu, Kuei-fen (Qiu Quifen). "Feminism in the Context of Popular Fiction: Liao Hui-ing and Popular Women's Novels." *Journal of the College of Liberal Arts*. (National Chung Hsing University) 22 (Mar 1992): 91-9.
- . "Identity Politics in Contemporary Women's Novels in Taiwan." *Tamkang Review* 30,

- no.2 (Win 1999): 27-54.
- . "Taking off: A Feminist Approach to Two Contemporary Women's Novels in Taiwan." *Tamkang Review* 23, nos.1-4 (Fall-Sum 1992-1993): 709-33.
- . Trans. Fan Pen Chen. "The Feminine 'Regional Imagination': A Preliminary Study of Contemporary Fiction by Female Authors in Taiwan." *Taiwan Literature: English Translation Series*, 11, (2002): 185-208.
- Chou, Ying-hsiung (Zhou Yingxiong). "Between History and the Unconscious: Contemporary Taiwanese Fiction Revisited." *Tamkang Review* 22, nos.1-4 (Fall-Sum 1991-1992):155-176.
- . "Between Temporal and Spatial Transformations: An Ancient Capital City at the End of Time." *Tamkang Review* 31, no.5 (Winter 2000): 51-70.
- . "Imaginary Homeland: Postwar Taiwan in Contemporary Political Fiction." *Modern Chinese Literature* 6, (1996): 23-37.
- Chow, Rey, ed. *Modern Chinese Literary and Cultural Studies in the Age of Theory: Reimagining a Field*. Durham and London: Duke UP, 2000.
- . *Primitive Passions: Visuality, Sexuality, Ethnography, and Contemporary Chinese Cinema*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1995.
- . *Woman and Chinese Modernity: the Politics of Reading between West and East*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1991.
- . *Writing Diaspora: Tactics of Intervention in Contemporary Cultural Studies*. Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 1993.
- Chu, Yen. "Sociocultural Change in Taiwan as Reflected in Short Fiction 1979-1989." In Stevan Harrell and Chun-chieh Huang, eds., *Cultural Change in Postwar Taiwan*, 205-26. Boulder, Colo.: Westview Press, 1994.
- Cixous, Hélène. "The Laugh of Medusa." Trans. Keith Cohen and Paula Cohen. *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society* 1, no. 4 (1976): 875-93.
- Clough, Ralph N. *Island China*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1978.
- Cobley, Paul. *Narrative*. London and New York: Routledge, 2001.

- Copeland, Rebecca and Esperanza Ramirez-Christensen, eds. *The Father-Daughter Plot: Japanese Literary Women and the Law of the Father*. Honolulu, Hawai'i: University of Hawai'i Press, 2001.
- Cornyetz, Nina. "Bound by Blood: Female Pollution, Divinity, and Community in Enchi Fumiko's *Masks*." *U.S.-Japan Women's Journal: English Supplement* 9 (December 1995): 29-58. Translated into Japanese as "Chi no sokubaku: Enchi Fumiko no Onnamen ni okeru onna no fujō, shinsei, soshite rentai." *Nichibei josei jānaru* 22 (August 1997): 94-119.
- . "Enchi Fumiko" In *Dangerous Women, Deadly Words*, 99-154. Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press, 1999.
- Davis, Natalie Zemon and Randolph Starn. "Introduction." *Representation* 26 (1989): 1-6.
- Deeney, John J. "Chinese-Eastern Comparative Literature Studies: The Case of China-Korea-Japan." *Tamkang Review* 15, nos. 1-4 (1984-5): 185-200.
- Dickson, Bruce and Jianmin Zhao, eds. *Assessing Lee Teng-hui's Legacy in Taiwan's Politics: Democratic Consolidation and External Relations*. Armonk, NY: M.E. Sharpe, 2002.
- Dilley, Whitney Crothers. "Reading the Colonial Other: Japanese and British Motifs in Taiwanese and Quebecois Fiction." *Tamkang Review* 28, no.1 (Fall 1997): 113-30.
- Dirlik, Arif. *The Postcolonial Aura: Third World Criticism in the Age of Global Capitalism*. Boulder, Colo.: Westview Press, 1997.
- Doleželová-Velingerová, Milena. "The Origins of Modern Chinese Literature." In Merle Goldman, ed., *Modern Chinese Literature in the May Fourth Era*, 17-35. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1977.
- Donaldson, Laura E. *Decolonising Feminisms: Race, Gender, and Empire-building*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1992.
- Dooling, Amy D. and Kristina M. Torgeson. *Writing Women in Modern China: An Anthology of Women's Literature from the Early Twentieth Century*. New York:

- Columbia University Press, 1998.
- Duke, Michael S. *Worlds of Modern Chinese Fiction: Short Stories and Novellas from the Peoples' Republic, Taiwan and Hong Kong*. Armonk, N.Y.: Sharpe, 1991.
- . *Modern Chinese Women Writers: Critical Appraisals*. Armonk, N.Y.: M.E. Sharpe, 1989.
- Duus, Peter, Roman H. Myers, and Mark R. Peattie, eds. *The Japanese Wartime Empire, 1931-1945*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1996.
- Eagleton, Terry. *Literary Theory: An Introduction*. Oxford: Blackwell, 1983.
- Eagleton, Mary, ed. *Feminist Literary Theory: A Reader*. Cambridge, Mass.: Blackwell, 1996.
- Enchi Fumiko 円地文子. *Masks*. Trans. Juliet Winters Carpenter. New York: Adventura, Vintage Books, 1983.
- . "Onnamen" 女面. In Inoue Yasushi, ed. *Shōwa bungaku zenshū* 昭和文学全集 vol 12, 848-916. Tokyo: Shōgakkan, 1986-1990.
- . *The Waiting Years*. Trans. John Bester Tokyo: Kodansha International, 1971.
- . "Watashi to bungaku no aida" 私と文学の間. In *Enchi Fumiko zenshū* 円地文子全集 vol. 16, 42-7. Tokyo: Shinchōsha, 1978.
- Ericson, Joan E. *Be a Woman: Hayashi Fumiko and Modern Japanese Women's Literature*. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 1997.
- Esbenshade, Richard. "Remembering to Forget: Memory, History, National Identity in Postwar East Central Europe." *Representation* 49 (1995): 72-96.
- Fan, Ming-Ju 范銘如. "From Homogeneity to Heterogeneity: Women's Literature in Contemporary Taiwan." *Stockholm Journal of East Asian Studies* (Stockholm) 10 (1999): 215-22.
- . *Zhonli xunta: Taiwan nüxing xiaoshuo zonglun* 眾裏尋她—台灣小說縱論. Taipei: Maitian, 2002.
- Flynn, Elizabeth A. and Patrocínio P. Schweickart, eds. *Gender and Reading: Essays on Readers, Texts, and Contexts*. Baltimore and London: The Johns Hopkins University

- Press, 1986.
- Foucault, Michel. *Language, Counter-Memory, Practice*. Donald F. Bouchard, ed. Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University Press, 1977.
- Freud, Sigmund. *Sexuality and the Psychology of Love*. Philip Rieff, ed. New York: Collier Books, 1963.
- Friedman, Susan Stanford. *Mappings: Feminism and the Cultural Geographies of Encounter*. Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1998.
- Fujimura-Fanselow, Kumiko, and Atsuko Kameda, eds. *Japanese Women: New Feminist Perspectives on the Past, Present, and Future*. New York: The Feminist Press, 1995.
- Gadamer, H. G. *Truth and Method*. New York: Seabury Press, 1975.
- Gessel, Van C. *The Sting of Life: Four Contemporary Japanese Novelists*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1989.
- Ghandi, Leela. *Postcolonial Theory: A Critical Introduction*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1998.
- Gilbert, Sandra Caruso Mortola and Susan Dreyfuss David Gubar. *The Madwoman in the Attic: The Woman Writer and the Nineteenth-century Literary Imagination*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1979.
- Gluck, Carol and Stephen R. Graubard, eds. *Shōwa: The Japan of Hirohito*. New York: W.W. Norton 1992.
- Goldblatt, Howard, ed. *Worlds Apart: Recent Chinese Writing and Its Audiences*. Armonk, N.Y.; London: M.E. Sharpe, 1990.
- Gong Pengcheng 龔鵬程. *Taiwan wenxue zai Taiwan* 台灣文學在台灣. Banqiao: Luotuo, 1997.
- , ed. *Taiwan de shehui yu wenxue* 台灣的社會與文學. Taipei: Dongda tushu, 1995.
- Greene, Gayle and Coppéli Kahn. *Making a Difference: Feminist Literary Criticism*. London; New York: Methuen, 1985.
- Grosz, Elizabeth. *Volatile Bodies: Toward a Corporeal Feminism*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1994.

- Haddon, Rosemary. "From Pulp to Politics: Aspects of Topicality in Fiction by Li Ang." *Modern Chinese Literature and Culture* 13, no. 1 (Spring 2001): 36-72.
- , ed. *Oxcart: Nativist Stories from Taiwan, 1934-1977*. Dortmund [Germany]: Projekt Verlag, 1996.
- Hall, Stuart. "Negotiating Caribbean Identities." *New Left Review* 209, (January/February, 1995): 3-14.
- Hao Yuxiang 郝譽翔. "Yijiubaqinian de taowang—lun Zhu Tianxin xiaoshuo zhong de chaosheng zhi lü" 一九八七年的逃亡—論朱天心小說中的朝聖之旅. *Tonghua renwen xuebao* 東華人文學報 no. 3 (July, 2001): 241-68.
- Harrell, Stevan and Chun-chieh Huang, eds. *Cultural Change in Postwar Taiwan*. Boulder, Colo.: Westview Press, 1994.
- He Shuwei 賀淑瑋. "Xing, kongjian yu shenfen: lun Li Ang xiaoshou de zhengzhi meixue" 性, 空間與身分: 論李昂小說的政治美學. *Taiwan Wenyi* 台灣文藝 156, (August, 1996), 35-49.
- Heinrich, Amy Vladeck. "Double Weave: The Fabric of Japanese Women's Writing." *World Literature Today*, special issue: "Contemporary Japanese Literature," 62, no.3 (Summer 1988): 408-14.
- Hong Shanhui 洪珊慧. "Li Ang xiaoshuo yanjiu" 李昂小說研究. M.A. Thesis. National Tsing Hua University, 2000.
- Hulvey, Yumiko. "Enchi Fumiko's Portal to Desire." *Japanese Studies Review* 2, (1998): 37-55.
- Hung, Eva, ed. *Contemporary Women Writers: Hong Kong and Taiwan*. Hong Kong: Research Centre for Translation, Chinese University of Hong Kong, 1990.
- Hsia, C.T. *A History of Modern Chinese Fiction*. 2d ed. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1971.
- Imai Yasuko 今井泰子, et al., eds. *Tanpen josei bungaku: Gendai* 短篇女性文学. Tokyo: Ōfusha, 1993.
- Immoos, Thomas. *Japanese Theatre*. New York: Rizoli, 1997.

- Ito, Ken. "The Family and the Nation in Tokutomi Roka's *Hototogisu*." *Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies* 60, no. 2 (Dec. 2000): 489-536.
- Irigaray, Luce. *Speculum of the Other Woman*. Trans. Gillian Gill. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1985.
- . *This Sex Which Is Not One*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1985.
- James, Henry. Preface to *The Portrait of a Lady*, A Penn State Electronic Classics Series Publication. <http://www.hn.psu.edu/faculty/jmanis/hjames/portrait-lady.pdf>.
- Jeon, Miseli. "Violent Emotions: Modern Japanese and Korean Women Writing, 1920-1980." PhD Thesis. University of British Columbia, 2004.
- Jiang Baochai 江寶釵. "'Xiandai wenxue' nüxing xiaoshuojia: cong yige zhuti chufa" '現代文學'女性小說家：從一個主體出發. Ph.D. Thesis. National Taiwan Normal University, 1994.
- Jiang Baochai 江寶釵 and Fan Mingru 范銘如, eds. *Daoyu wensheng—Taiwan nüxing xiaoshuo duben* 島嶼姣聲—台灣女性小說讀本. Taipei: Ju-liu, 2000.
- Jiang Zide 江自得, ed. *Zhimindi jingyan yu Taiwan wenxue: diyijie taixin Taiwan wenxue xueshu yantaohui lunwenji* 殖民地經驗與台灣文學：第一屆台杏台灣學術研討會論文集. Taipei: Yuanliu, 2000.
- Johnson, Barbara. *The Feminist Difference: Literature, Psychoanalysis, Race, and Gender*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1998.
- Joshua, Mostow, ed. *The Columbia Companion to Modern East Asian Literature*. New York: Columbia University Press, 2003.
- Kahn, Coppia and Gayle Greene, eds. *Changing Subjects: The Making of Feminist Literary Criticism*. London; New York: Routledge, 1993.
- Kanai Mieko 金井美恵子. "Funiku" 腐肉. *Chikuma bungaku taikei* 筑摩文学大系, vol. 93. Tokyo: Chikuma Shobō, n.d. 150-3.
- . "Rotting Meat" (*Funiku*). Trans. by Mary Knighton. *Fictional International* vol.29 (1997): 110-5.
- Katō, Shūichi. *A History of Japanese Literature, vol. 1*. Tokyo: Kodansha International,

1983.

- Kawahara Isao 河原功. *Taiwan shinbungaku undō no tenkai: Nihon bungaku to no setten*
台灣新文學運動の展開: 日本文学との接点. Tokyo: Kenbun Shuppan, 1997.
- Keene, Donald. *Dawn to the West: Japanese Literature of the Modern Era*. New York:
Holt, Rinehart, and Winston, 1984.
- Kleeman, Faye Yuan. *Under An Imperial Sun: Japanese Colonial Literature of Taiwan
and the South*. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2003.
- Knapp, Bettina Leibowitz. "Fumiko Enchi's *Masks*: A Sacred Mystery." In idem, *Women in
Twentieth-Century Literature: A Jungian View*, 183-207. University Park: Pennsylvania
State University Press, 1987.
- Ko, Dorothy. "The Body as Attire: The Shifting Meaning of Footbinding in
Seventeenth-Century China," *Journal of Women's History* 8, no. 4 (Winter 1997): 8-27.
- Kosofsky Sedgwick, Eve. *Between Men: English Literature and Male Homosocial Desire*.
New York: Columbia University Press, 1985.
- Krieger, Joel, ed. *The Oxford Companion to Politics of the World*, 2nd ed. Oxford and New
York: Oxford University Press, 2001.
- Kristeva, Julia. *Revolution in Poetic Language*. New York: Columbia University Press,
1984.
- Lai, Tse-han, Ramon H. Myers and Wei Wou, eds. *A Tragic Beginning: The Taiwan
Uprising of February 28, 1947*. Stanford, California: Stanford University Press, 1991.
- Lao Chaoyang 廖朝陽. "Jiaohuan yu biantong: du Li Ang de Miyuan 交換與變通: 讀李昂的
《迷園》." *Zhongwai wenxue* 中外文學 (Chungwai Literary Monthly) 28, no.2 (July
1999): 8-20.
- Larson, Wendy. *Women and Writing in Modern China*. Stanford California: Stanford
University Press: 1998.
- Lau, Joseph S.M. *The Unbroken Chain: An Anthology of Taiwan Fiction since 1926*.
Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1983.
- Lebra, Takie Sugiyama and William P. Lebra eds. *Japanese Culture and Behavior*

- Selected Readings*. Honolulu: University Press of Hawai'i, 1974.
- Lemaire, Anika. *Jacques Lacan*. London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1977.
- Li Ang 李昂. *Miyuan 迷園*. Taipei: Maitian, 1998.
- . "Protest of a Woman Author against Reckless Accusations: Another Self-Interview, This Time from Taipei." In Helmut Martin and Jeffery Kinkley, eds., *Modern Chinese Writers Self-Portrayals*, 254-60. N.Y.; London: An East Gate Book, 1992.
- . *Shafu: Lucheng gushi 殺夫：鹿城故事*. Taipei: Lianhe baoshe, 1983.
- . *Shi Mingde qianzhuan 施明德前傳*. Taipei, Qianwei, 1993.
- . *The Butcher's Wife and Other Stories*. Trans. Howard Goldblatt. Boston, MA: Cheng & Tsui, 1995.
- Li Chiao. "Bickering About Literature: The Meaning of 'Taiwan Literature.'" Trans. Robert Smitheram. *Taiwanese Literature: English Translation Series* no. 1 (August 1996):13-6.
- Li Hongqiong 李鴻瓊. "Wei siwang suo longzhao de zhuti: lun Miyuan zhong de yuyan, lishi yu xing 爲死亡所籠罩的主體：論《迷園》中的語言、歷史與性." *Zhongwai wenxue 中外文學* (Chungwai literary monthly) 28, no.2 (July 1999): 42-79.
- Liang, Iping. "Taipei and Its Discontents: Fin-de-siecle Mapping of Taipei in *Gudu* and *Taipei 100*." *Tamkang Review* 31, no. 2 (Winter 2000): 105-29.
- Liang Mingxiang 梁明雄. *Riji shiqi Taiwan wenxue yundong yanjiu 日據時期台灣文學運動研究*. Taipei: Wenshiji, 1996.
- Liao, Chaoyang. "Catastrophe and Hope: The Politics of 'The Ancient Capital' and 'The City Where the Blood-Red Bat Descended'" *Journal of Modern Literature in Chinese* 4, no. 1 (July 2000): 5-33.
- . "History, Exchange, and the Objective Voice: Reading Li Ang's Recent Fiction." <http://ccsun57.cc.ntu.edu.tw/~chyliao/p/garden.htm>
- Lin, Jui-ming. "The Study of Taiwanese Literature: A Conflict in National Identity," *Taiwan Literature: English Translation Series*, 1, (1996): 72-90.
- Liou, Liang-ya. "Gender Crossing and Decadence in Taiwanese Fiction at the

- fin-de-siecle: The Instances of Li Ang, Chu Tien-wen, Chiu Miao-Jin, and Cheng Ying-Shu." *Tamkang Review* 31, no.2 (Win 2000): 131-67.
- Liu, Kang and Xiaobing Tang, eds. *Politics, Ideology, and Literary Discourse in Modern China: Theoretical Interventions and Cultural Critique*. Durham, N.C.: Duke University Press, 1993.
- Liu Liangya 劉亮雅. "Baidang zai xiandai yu houxixandai zhijian—Zhu Tianwen jinqi zuopin zhong de guozu, shidai, xingbie, qingyu wenti" 擺盪在現代與後現代之間—朱天文近期作品中的國族、世代、性別、情慾問題 *Zhongwai wenxue* 中外文學 (Chungwai literary monthly) 24, no. 1 (June 1995): 7-19.
- . "Jiuling niandai nüxing chuangshang jiyi xiaoshuo zhong de chongxin jiyi zhengzhi: yi Chen Ye Nihe, Li Ang Miyuan yu Zhu Tianxin 'Gudu' wei li" 九〇年代女性創傷記憶小說中的重新記憶政治：以陳燁《泥河》、李昂《迷園》與朱天心〈古都〉為例. *Zhongwai wenxue* 中外文學 (Chungwai literary monthly) 31, no.6 (Nov. 2002): 133-57.
- . "Shijimo Taiwan xiaoshuo li de xingbie kuajie yu tuipei: yi Li Ang, Zhu Tianwen, Qiu Miaojin, Cheng Yinshu wei li" 世紀末台灣小說裡的性別跨界與頹廢：李昂、朱天文、邱妙津、成英姝為例. *Zhongwai wenxue* 中外文學 (Chungwai literary monthly) 28, no. 6 (Nov. 1995): 109-34.
- Lord, Audre. *Sister Outsider: Essays and Speeches*. Trumansburg, NY: Crossing Press, 1984.
- Lowe, Lisa. *Critical Terrains: French and British Orientalisms*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1991.
- Lü Zhenghui 呂正惠. "Miyuan de liangxing guanxi yu Taiwan qiye zhu de zhenmao" 《迷園》的兩性關係與台灣企業主的真貌. *UNITAS* 7, no. 11, (1991): 161-5.
- . *Zhanhou Taiwan wenxue jinyan* 戰後台灣文學經驗. Taipei: Xindi wenxue, 1992.
- Lupke, Christopher M. "Modern Chinese Literature in the Postcolonial Diaspora." Ph.D. Thesis. Cornell University, 1993.
- Mawatari Kenzaburō 馬渡健三郎, ed. *Joryū bungei kenkyū* 女流文芸研究. Tokyo: Nansōsha, 1973.

- Martin, Helmut. "China, Hong Kong, and Taiwan during the 1980s and 1990s." In Victor H. Mair, ed., *The Columbia History of Chinese Literature*, 758-81. New York: Columbia University Press, 2001.
- McClain, Yōko. "Eroticism and the Writings of Enchi Fumiko." *Journal of the Association of Teachers of Japanese* 15, no.1 (April 1980): 32-46.
- McClintock, Anne. *Imperial Leather: Race, Gender, and Sexuality in the Colonial Conquest*. New York: Routledge, 1995.
- , ed. *Dangerous Liaisons: Gender, Nation, Postcolonial Perspectives*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1997.
- Mei, Chia-ling 梅家玲. "Gender Discourse and the Development of Postwar Fiction in Taiwan." Trans. Jennifer W. Jay. *Taiwan Literature: English Translation Series* 12, (2003): 139-54.
- . *Xingbie lunshu yu Taiwan xiaoshuo* 性別論述與台灣小說. Taipei: Maitian, 2000.
- Ming, Feng-ying. "The Male Gaze and the Female Returning Gaze: The Representation of the Female Sexuality in Modern Chinese Literature," *Tamkang Review* 22, nos. 1-4 (Fall-Sum 1991-1992): 177-94.
- Mishima Yukio 三島由紀夫. "Sakuhin-hyō: Fuyu momiji" 作品表：冬紅葉 *Gunzō* 群像 (1959). In *Enchi Fumiko zenshū* 円地文子全集, vol. 3, 365-8. Tokyo: Shinchōsha, 1978.
- Miyoshi, Masao. "Canons and the Challenge of Gender: Women and Women Writers." In idem, *Off Centre: Power and Culture Relations between Japan and the United States*, 189-216. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1991.
- Mizuta Noriko 水田宗子. "Josei hyōgen to sintai no henyō" 女性表現と身体の変容. In *Hiyō kūkan* 批評空間, 196-207. Tokyo: Hukumu shoten, 1993.
- Moi, Toril. *Sexual/Textual Politics: Feminist Literary Theory*. London: Methuen, 1986.
- Moore-Gilbert, B. *Postcolonial Theory: Context, Practices, Politics*. London: Verso, 1997.
- Montrose, Louis. "Professing the Renaissance: The Poetics and Politics of Culture." In H. Aram Veesser, ed., *The New Historicism*, 15-36. New York: Routledge, 1989.
- Morris, Ivan. *The World of the Shining Prince*. New York: Penguin, 1994.

- Morris, Pam. *Literature and Feminism*. UK, Oxford: Blackwell, 1993.
- Mulhern, Chieko I. ed. *Japanese Women Writers: A Bio-critical Sourcebook*. Westport CT: Greenwood Press, 1994.
- Muramatsu Sadataka 村松定孝 and Watanabe Sumiko 渡辺澄子, eds. *Gendai josei bungaku jiten* 現代女性文学辞典. Tokyo: Tōkyōdō, 1990.
- Murō Saisei 室生犀星. "Ōgon no hari" 黄金の針. *Fujin kōron* 婦人公論 (1960) in *Enchi Fumiko zenshū* 円地文子全集, vol. 14, 307-15. Tokyo: Shinchōsha, 1978.
- Nicholson, Linda. *Feminism/Postmodernism*. London; New York: Routledge, 1990.
- , ed. *The Second Wave: A Reader in Feminist Theory*. New York and London: Routledge, 1997.
- Ng, Sheung-Yuen Daisy. "Feminism in the Chinese Context: Li Ang's *The Butcher's Wife*." *Modern Chinese Literature* 4, nos. 1&2 (Spring & Fall 1988): 177-200.
- Norris, Christopher. *Deconstruction: Theory and Practice*. New York; London: Methuen, 1982.
- Ōba Minako 大庭みな子. "Garakuta hakubutsukan" がらくた博物館. In *Ōba Minako zenshū* 大庭みな子全集. Vol. 4, 7-174. Tokyo: Kōdansha, 1990.
- Ōba Minako 大庭みな子. "Kojin to kokka" 個人と国家. In idem, *Mezamete miru yume* 目覚めてみる夢, 163-6. Tokyo: Kōdansha, 1978.
- . *Mae, Mae, Katatsumuri*、舞へ舞へ蝸牛. Tokyo: Fukutake Bunko, 1990.
- . "Yorozu shūzenya no tsuma" よろず修繕屋の妻. In *Ōba Minako zenshū* 大庭みな子全集. Vol. 3, 335-51. Tokyo: Kōdansha, 1990.
- . "The Repairman's Wife." In *The Kyoto Collection: Stories from the Japanese*. Trans. Tomoyoshi Genkawa and Bernard Susser, 87-132. Osaka: Niheisha, 1989.
- Okazaki Ikuko 岡崎郁子. *Taiwan bungaku: itan no keifu* 台湾文学: 異端の系譜. Tokyo: Tabata Shoten, 1996.
- Okuno Takeo 奥野健男. "Eien ni osorerareru onna: Enchi Fumiko no bungaku" 永遠に怖れられる女: 円地文子の文学. *Bungakukai* 文学界 (1959). In *Enchi Fumiko zenshū* 円地文子全集, vol. 3, 375-85. Tokyo: Shinchōsha, 1978.

- Orbaugh, Sharalyn. "Arguing with the Real: Kanai Mieko." In Stephen Snyder and Philip Gabriel, eds., *Ōe and beyond: Fiction in Contemporary Japan*, 245-77. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i, 1999.
- Parry, Amie Elizabeth. "Locating Modernities: Epistemologies of Space, Time and Nation in Modernist Literature from Taiwan and the U.S." Ph.D. Thesis. University of California, San Diego, 1996.
- Peng Mingmin 彭明敏, *Ziyou de ziwei—Peng Mingmin huiyilu* 自由的滋味—彭明敏回憶錄. Translated from English into Chinese by Lin Meihui. Irvine, Calif.: Taiwan Publishing Co., 1984.
- Peng Ruijin 彭瑞金. *Taiwan xinwenxue yundong sishi nian* 台灣新文學運動四十年. Taipei: Zili wanbao she, 1991.
- . "The Primary Issue for Taiwan Literature is Identifying with the land." Trans. Mabel Lee. *Taiwan Literature: English Translation Series*, no. 4 (Dec. 1998): 9-14.
- Peng Xiaoyan 彭小妍. *Lishi henduo loudong: cong Zhang W-jun dao Li Ang* 歷史很多漏洞：從張我軍到李昂. Taipei: Zhongyang yanjiuyuan Zhongguo wenzhe yanjiusuo choubiechu, 2000.
- . "Nüzuoia de qingyu shuxie yu zhengzhi lunshu: jeidu Miyuan" 女作家的情慾書寫與政治論述：解讀《迷園》. *Chungwai literary monthly* 24, no. 5 (1995): 72-92.
- , ed. *Retong, qingyu yu yuyan: Taiwan xiandai wenxue xili* 認同、情慾與語言：台灣現代文學系列. Taipei: Zhongyang yanjiuyuan Zhongguo wenzhe yanjiusuo choubiechu, 1996.
- Petersen, Kirsten Holst, and Anna Rutherford, eds. *A Double Colonization: Colonial and Post-Colonial Women's Writing*. Mundelstrup, Denmark; Oxford: Dangaroo Press, 1986.
- Phillips, Steven E. *Between Assimilation and Independence: the Taiwanese Encounter Nationalist China, 1945-1950*. Stanford, California: Stanford University Press, 2003.
- Pollack, David. *Reading against Culture: Ideology and Narrative in the Japanese Novel*. Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press, 1992.
- Pounds, Wayne. "Enchi Fumiko and the Hidden Energy of the Supernatural." *Journal of the*

- Association of Teachers of Japanese* 24, no.2 (November 1990): 167-83
- Qiu Quifen 邱貴芬. "Cong zhanhou chuqi nüzuojia de chuanguo tan Taiwan wenxueshi de xushu" 從戰後初期女作家的創作談台灣文學史的敘述, *Zhongwai wenxue* 中外文學 (Chungwai literary monthly) 29, no. 2 (July 2000): 320-6.
- . *Houzhimin ji qiwa* 後殖民及其外. Taipei: Maitian, 2003.
- . "Meiguo pinpai, Taiwan liuxing—tantao liuxing lilun zhijian de chongtu maodun" 美國品牌台灣流行—探討流行理論之間的衝突矛盾. *Zhongwai wenxue* 中外文學 (Chungwai literary monthly) 23, no.2 (1994): 88-94.
- . "Yuan Qionggong yu baling niandai Taiwan nüxing zuojia de Zhang Eileen re" 袁瓊瓊與八〇年代台灣女性作家的張愛玲熱. *Zhongwai wenxue* 中外文學 (Chungwai literary monthly) 25, no.1 (1995): 56-75.
- . *Zhongjie Taiwan nüren: houzhimin nüxing guandian de Taiwan yuedu* 仲介台灣女人：後殖民女性觀點的台灣閱讀. Taipei: Yuanliu, 1997.
- Rajeswari, Sunder Rajan. *Real and Imaged Women: Gender, Culture, and Postcolonialism*. London; New York: Routledge, 1993.
- Ramusack, Barbara N. and Sharon Siever. *Women in Asian: Restoring Women to History*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1999.
- Rich, Adrienne. "Compulsory Heterosexuality and Lesbian Existence." In Sandra Kemp and Judith Squires, eds., *Feminisms*, 320-5. Oxford, New York: Oxford University Press, 1997.
- Rieff, Philip, ed. *Sexuality and the Psychology of Love*. New York: Collier Books, 1963.
- Rubin, Gayle. "The Traffic in Women." In Rayna R. Reiter, ed. *Toward an Anthropology of Women*, 157-210. New York: Monthly Review Press, 1975.
- Rubinstein, Murray. *Taiwan: A New History*. New York: Sharpe, 1999.
- Ruch, Barbara. "Beyond Absolution: Enchi Fumiko's *The Waiting Years and Masks*." In Barbar Stoler Miller, ed., *Masterworks of Asian Literature in Comparative Perspective*, 439-56. Armonk. N.Y.: M.E. Sharpe, 1994.
- Russo, Ann, Lourdes Torres and Chandra T. Mohanty. *Third World Women & the Politics*

- of *Feminism*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1991.
- Ryu, Catherine. "A Golden Needle, A Rabbit's Tail, and the Density of Female Body Fat: An Analysis of Murō Saisei's Metaphors for Enchi Fumiko's Writing Libido." In Sekine Eiji ed., *Love and Sexuality in Japanese Literature*, 264-73. West Lafayette, IN.: Association for Japanese Literary Studies, 1999.
- Said, Edward. *Orientalism*. New York: Pantheon Books, 1978.
- Schierbeck, Sachiko. "Ooba Minako." In *Japanese Women Novelists in the Twentieth Century: 104 Biographies 1900~1993*, 218-21. University of Copenhagen: Museum Tusculanum Press, 1994.
- Schlant, Ernestine and J. Thomas Rimer, eds. *Legacies and Ambiguities: Postwar Fiction and Culture in West Germany and Japan*. Washington, D.C.: Woodrow Wilson Center Press, 1991.
- Schalow, Paul Gordon and Janet A. Walker, eds. *The Woman's Hand: Gender and Theory in Japanese Women's Writing*. Calif.: Stanford University Press, 1996.
- Scott, Joan Wallach. "History in Crisis?" *American Historical Review* 94 (1989): 680-92.
- Shao Yujuan 邵毓娟. "Li Ang de Taiwan shishi: Miyuan zhong de qingyu/guozu de yuyan" 李昂的台灣史詩：《迷園》中的情慾/國族的預言. *Zhongwai wenxue* 中外文學 (Chungwai literary monthly) 28, no.2 (1999): 92-123.
- Shimizu Ken'ichirō 清水賢一郎. "Kioku no sho" 記憶の書. In *Koto* 古都. Trans., Shimizu Ken'ichirō, 315-24. Tokyo: Kokusho kankōkai, 2000.
- Showalter, Elaine. *A Literature of Their Own: British Women Novelists from Bronte to Lessing*. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1999.
- Showalter, Elaine, ed. *The New Feminist Criticism: Essays on Women, Literature Theory*. New York: Pantheon Books, 1985.
- Snyder, Stephen and Philip Gabriel, eds. *Ōe and Beyond: Fiction in Contemporary Japan*. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 1999.
- Spivak, Gayatri C. *In Other World: Essays in Cultural Politics*. London; New York: Methuen, 1987.

- . "Imperialism and Sexual Difference." *Oxford Literary Review* 8, 1-2 (1986): 225-40.
- . *The Post-colonial Critic: Interviews, Strategies, Dialogues*, ed. S. Harasym. New York: Routledge, 1990.
- . *The Spivak Reader*, ed. Donna Landry and Gerald MacLean. New York: Routledge, 1995.
- Sung, Mei-hwa. "Feminist Consciousness in the Contemporary Fiction of Taiwan." In Stevan Harrell, and Chun-chieh Huang, eds., *Cultural Change in Postwar Taiwan*, 275-93. Boulder, Colo.: Westview Press, 1994.
- Starrs, Roy. *Soundings in Time: The Fictive Art of Kawabata Yasunari*. Surry, B.C.: Japan Library, 1998.
- Takenishi Hiroko 竹西寛子. "Enchoi Fumiko" 円地文子, In *Nihon kindai bungaku daijiten* 日本近代文学大事典 vol. 1, 235-7. Tokyo: Kōdansha, 1977.
- Tam, Kwok-kan, Terry Siu-Han Yip, and Wimal Dissanayake, eds. *A Place of One's Own: Stories of Self in China, Taiwan, Hong Kong, and Singapore*. Hong Kong; New York: Oxford University Press, 1999.
- Tanaka, Yukiko ed. *Unmapped Territories: New Women's Fiction from Japan*. Seattle: Women in Translation, 1991.
- Tang, Xiaobing and Stephen Snyder, eds. *In Pursuit of Contemporary East Asian Culture*. Boulder, Colo.: Westview Press, 1996.
- Tien, Hung-mao. *The Great Transition: Political and Social Change in the Republic of China*. Stanford, CA: Hoover Institution Press, 1989.
- Thakur, Ravni. *Rewriting Gender: Reading Contemporary Chinese Women*. London; Atlantic Highlands, N.J.: Zed Books, 1997.
- Trinh, T, Minh-Ha. *Woman, Native, Other: Writing Postcoloniality and Feminism*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1989.
- . *When the Moon Waxes Red: Representation, Gender and Cultural Politics*. New York and London: Routledge, 1991.
- Twine, Nanette. *Language and the Modern State: The Reform of Written Japanese*. London:

- Routledge, 1991.
- Ueda, Makoto. *Modern Japanese Writers and the Nature of Literature*. Stanford, Calif., Stanford University Press, 1976.
- Vernon, Victoria V. *Daughters of the Moon: Wish, Will and Social Constraint in Fiction by Modern Japanese Women*. Berkeley: University of California, Institute of East Asian Studies, 1988.
- Wang, David Der-wei 王德威. "Fin de siecle Splendor: Contemporary Women Writers' Vision of Taiwan." *Journal of Modern Chinese Literature and Culture* 6, Nos.1 & 2, (Spring/Fall 1992): 39-59.
- . *Xiaoshuo Zhongguo: wan Qing dao dangdai de Zhongwen xiaoshuo* 小說中國：晚清到當代的中文小說. Taipei: Maitian, 1993.
- . *Zhongsheng xuanhua: sanling yu baling niaidai di Zhongguo xiaoshou* 眾聲喧嘩：三〇與八〇年代的中國小說. Taipei: Yuanliu, 1980.
- . *Zhongsheng xuanhua yihou: dianping dangdai zhongwen xiaoshuo* 眾聲喧嘩以後：點評當代中文小說. Taipei: Yuanliu, 2001.
- . "Xulun: Laolinghuen qianshi ginsheng—Zhu Tianxin de shiaoshuo" 序論：老靈魂前世今生—朱天心的小說. In Zhu Tian-xin, *Gudu* 古都, 9-32. Taipei: Maitian, 1997.
- Wang, David Der-wei and Jeanne Tai, eds. *Running Wild: New Chinese Writers*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1994.
- Williams, Raymond. *Marxism and Literature*. Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press, 1977.
- Wilson, Michiko Niikuni. *Gender is Fair Game: (Re)Thinking the (Fe)male in the Works of Ōba Minako*. Armonk, New York: M.E.Sharpe, 1999.
- Wu Baozhu 伍寶珠. *Cong fansi dao fanpan: ba, jiuling niandai Taiwan nüxing zhuyi xiaoshuo tanjiu* 從反思到反叛：八、九〇年代台灣女性主義小說探究. Taipei: Daan, 2001.
- Xu Chunya 許俊雅. *Riji shidai Taiwan xiaoshou yanjiu* 日據時代台灣小說研究. Taipei: Wenshiji, 1995.
- Xu Xinliang 許信良. *Xinxing minzu* 新興民族. Taipei, Yuanliu, 1995.
- Xu Xiuzeng 許琇禎. *Taiwan dangdai xiaoshuo zonglun: jieyan qianhou, 1977-1997* 台灣當

- 代小說縱論：解嚴前後，1977-1997. Taipei: Wunan, 2001.
- Yang Zhao 楊照. "Cong 'xiangtu xieshi' dao 'chaoyue xieshi'—bashi niandai de Taiwan xiaoshuo" 從「鄉土寫實」到「超越寫實」——八十年代的台灣小說. In Feng Deping ed., *Taiwan wenxue fazhan xianxiang: wushi nianlai Taiwan wenxue yataohui lunwenji* 台灣文學發展想像：五十年來台灣文學研討會論文集 2, 137-50. Taipei: Xingzhengyuan wenjihui, 1996.
- . *Wenxue, shehui yu lishi xiangxiang: zhanhou wenxueshi sanlun* 文學、社會與歷史想像：戰後文學史散論. Taipei: Lianhe wenxue, 1995.
- Yegenoglu, Meyda. *Colonial Fantasies: Towards a Feminist Reading of Orientalism*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1998.
- Ye Shitao 葉石濤. *Taiwan wenxue shikang* 台灣文學史綱. Gaoxiong: Wenxue jie zazhi she, 1987.
- . *Taiwan wenxue de beiqing* 台灣文學的悲情. Gaoxiong: Paise wenhua, 1990.
- . "The Multi-ethnic Issue of Taiwan Literature." Trans. Wan-Shu Lu. *Taiwan Literature: English Translation Series* no. 3 (June 1998): 3-12.
- . *Zhanwang Taiwan wenxue* 展望台灣文學. Taipei: Jiuge, 1994.
- Yip, Wai-Lim. "Beyond Chinoiserie: Differentiating Sameness in the Oriental Hermeneutic Community." *Tamkang Review* 15, nos. 1-4 (1984-5): 221-32.
- Yonaha Keiko 与那覇恵子. *Gendai Joryū Sakkaron* 現代女流作家論. Tokyo: Shinbisha, 1986.
- Yoshinaga, Seiko. "Enchi Fumiko and Re-writing Postwar Japan: Translating Classics, Women, and Nation." Ph.D. Thesis. University of Pennsylvania University: 2001.
- Yu Guangzhong 余光中 and Zhang Mo 張默, eds. *Zhonghua xiandai wenxue daxi: Taiwan 1970-1989* 中華現代文學大系：臺灣一九七〇—一九八九. Taipei: Jiuge, 1989.
- Zhang Songsheng 張誦聖. "Taiwan nüzuoqia dangdai zhudao wenhua" 台灣女作家當代主導文化. *Zhongwai wenxue* 中外文學 (Chungwai literary monthly) 28, no. 4 (1999): 6-20.
- . "Juewang de fanshe—pin Zhu Tianxin de Gudu." 絕望的反射——評朱天心的「古都」. *Lienho wenhsue* 聯合文學 (UNITAS) 13, no. 10 (Aug 1997): 183-4.

- Zhang Xiaohong 張小虹 ed. *Xing/bie yanjiu duben* 性／別研究讀本. Taipei: Maitian, 1998.
- Zheng Mingli 鄭明俐, ed. *Dangdai Taiwan nüxing wenxuelun* 當代台灣女性文學論. Taipei: Shibao wenhua, 1993.
- Zhong Huiling 鍾慧玲, ed. *Nüxing, chui yu Zhongguo wenxue* 女性主義與中國文學. Taipei: Liren, 1997.
- Zhou Yingxiong 周英雄 and Liu Jihui 劉紀蕙, eds. *Shuxie Taiwan: wenxueshi, houzhimin yu houxiantai* 書寫台灣：文學史、後殖民與後現代. Taipei: Maitian, 2000.
- Zhu Tianxin 朱天心. "Gudu" 古都. In idem *Gudu*, 151-233. Taipei, Maitian. 1997.
- . "Doesn't My Memory Count?" Trans. Oiwan Lam. *Inter-Asia Cultural Studies* 3, no. 1 (2002): 101-6.