Fostering the Responsible Citizen: Citizenship and Sexuality in the Girl Guides of Canada, 1979-1999

by

Elizabeth Faingold

B.A. (Hon.) York University, 1997

A THESIS SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF

MASTER OF ARTS

in

THE FACULTY OF GRADUATE STUDIES

(Department of Anthropology and Sociology)

We accept this thesis as conforming to the required standard

THE UNIVERSITY OF BRITISH COLUMBIA

July 9, 2001

© Elizabeth Katharine Faingold, 2001
In presenting this thesis in partial fulfilment of the requirements for an advanced degree at the University of British Columbia, I agree that the Library shall make it freely available for reference and study. I further agree that permission for extensive copying of this thesis for scholarly purposes may be granted by the head of my department or by his or her representatives. It is understood that copying or publication of this thesis for financial gain shall not be allowed without my written permission.

Department of Anthropology and Sociology

The University of British Columbia
Vancouver, Canada

Date July 12, 2001
Abstract

The Girl Guides of Canada is a youth service organization, serving almost 10% of the Canadian female population aged 5-17, that aims to teach girls and young women to become responsible citizens. In this thesis, I review the curriculum of the Pathfinder branch (for girls and young women aged 12-15) of the Girl Guides of Canada. Using feminist, anti-racist, and queer perspectives, I treat "responsible citizenship" as a discursive concept and conduct a discourse analysis of the Pathfinder programme to discover how it attempts to gain the consent of girls and young women to particular definitions of responsible citizenship.

Drawing on feminist citizenship theory developed by Yuval-Davis, Anthias, Alexander, and Ross, I argue that the state implicates select female citizens in nation building practices as biological reproducers and transmitters of culture. I also draw on theories of moral regulation extended by Sangster, Strange, and Loo to illustrate ways in which the state and voluntary organizations attempt to gain the consent of citizens to particular ways of being. I argue that, because its texts authorize particular definitions of responsible citizenship, the Pathfinder curriculum implicates girls and young women in capitalist nation building in Canada.

Specifically, I argue that the Pathfinder programme normalizes heterosexuality, whiteness, and ability, and privileges middle-class values. I also demonstrate that a responsible citizen, according to the Pathfinder curriculum, performs caregiving and environmental stewardship as volunteer service, prepares to join the labour force, and is healthy, hygienic, cheerful and obedient. I raise questions about the nature of the organization's efforts to teach about sexism, racism, classism, ableism, homophobia and heterosexism, and suggest some ways in which the curriculum can attend to these social relations to develop a more inclusive image of the ideal responsible citizen. I also suggest a number of directions for future research.
# Table of Contents

Abstract .................................................................................................................. ii  

Table of Contents .................................................................................................. iii  

List of Figures ........................................................................................................ iv  

Acknowledgements ............................................................................................... v  

Chapter I  Introduction: Learning to become a “responsible” citizen .................. 1a  

Chapter II Everybody loves a girl who is sweet and tender: Twentieth century youth 
services and responsible heterofemininity ......................................................... 16  

Chapter III Producing the people: Citizenship, moral regulation, and the discursive 
construction of responsibility ............................................................................. 43  

Chapter IV Who is a responsible citizen? Considering gender, sexuality, class, ethnicity, 
and ability in the Pathfinder Programme ............................................................ 65  

Chapter V What makes a citizen responsible? Moral regulation in the Pathfinder 
Programme ............................................................................................................ 116  

Chapter VI Conclusion: Where do we go from here? ...................................... 133  

Works Cited ........................................................................................................... 147  

Appendix I  Lesson plan: Scenarios for discussion. ........................................... 157  

Appendix II Lesson plan: Myth-Busting. ............................................................. 161
## List of Figures

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Figure 1</td>
<td>Pathfinders as Canadian citizens 1997</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2a</td>
<td>The Pathfinder Programme</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 2b</td>
<td>Focus on Pathfinder curriculum</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 3</td>
<td>Girl Guides of Canada recruitment advertisement</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4</td>
<td>Pathfinder handbook cover 1981</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5</td>
<td>Pathfinder handbook cover 1986</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 6</td>
<td>Pathfinder handbook cover 1999</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 7</td>
<td>Pathfinder uniform 1981</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 8</td>
<td>Pathfinder uniform 1986</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 9</td>
<td>Pathfinder uniform 1993</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 10</td>
<td>Pathfinder uniform 1997</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 11</td>
<td>Pathfinders and the Canada Food Guide</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Acknowledgements

First, I would like to thank the Girl Guides of Canada for allowing me access to the Pathfinder handbooks, manuals, and other texts that made this research possible. Special thanks goes to Lynn Austin, Archivist and Records Administrator at the Girl Guides of Canada National Headquarters in Toronto, who was most generous with her time and library resources. Also, thanks to Jacqueline Rennick and Beth Briginshaw, Guiders of Pathfinder units in Ontario, for sharing their curriculum materials and for providing rich anecdotes for my thesis.

I would also especially like to thank the members of my thesis committee. My supervisor, Dr. Becki Ross, provided rigorous comments on many drafts of this thesis, and continually pushed me to sharpen and deepen my analyses. Dr. Gillian Creese provided the initial inspiration for this work and offered important comments that helped me improve my work. Dr. Leslie Roman also provided critical commentary and shared her own academic work with me. I am also grateful for the facilities provided by the Department of Anthropology and Sociology, and for two years of generous funding I received through the University of British Columbia Renewable Graduate Fellowship.

Thanks are also due to Katja Cronauer, who read many drafts of this thesis and whose comments and questions inspired much of my analysis. Friends Skye Crawford and Tiffini Jacobs were voices of reason despite being thousands of miles away. Thanks to my family - mom, dad, grandma, and Dave, for their love and support. Finally, a big thanks is owed to my partner Jason Shaffer, who always knew when I needed distraction and when I needed to work, and whose chocolate milkshakes and Caesar salads sustained me throughout much of my writing.

All views expressed within this thesis are mine, and I alone am responsible for all errors in fact or interpretation.
Figure 1 Pathfinders as Canadian citizens

(Pathfinder Program 1997: 35)
Chapter I

Introduction: Learning to become a “responsible” citizen

In the past few years, a number of events occurred that brought issues of youth and sexuality into popular public debate in North America. One significant event was the United States Supreme Court ruling in 2000 that upheld the Boy Scouts of America’s right to refuse membership to gay men. Other events include the Surrey, British Columbia School Board’s banning of books depicting same-sex parents, and public rallies about gay-straight alliances in schools. People who work with young women and men in schools and voluntary organizations have joined the vigorous debates over these issues – to what extent should gay, lesbian, and bisexual people be recognized as participants in organizations serving youth?

Amidst these debates, in the fall of 1999, the Canadian Scouting Association (which has both male and female members) established a new troop for gay, lesbian, and bisexual youth. The new troop falls into the Rovers category, a branch of the Canadian Scouting Association for young adults ages 18-26. Co-founded by Bonte Minnema, a young adult Scout and University of Toronto women’s studies major, the troop intends to pursue regular Scouting activities, such as camping and fundraising, in an openly gay context (Globe and Mail 1999: A2). Minnema hoped that participation in an openly gay troop would mean that gay, lesbian, and bisexual youth would not have to endure discrimination as they learned to reach their full potential through Scouting.

While there are no current plans to create other gay, lesbian and bisexual Scouting troops, Scout leaders are considering creating a gay-friendly troop in the Venturers age group (ages 14 to 17), although they maintain that adolescents of this age may not be sure about their sexuality.

Note that a main purpose of my research is to interrogate the term “responsible,” so it appears here in scare quotes. I use the term “responsible” throughout my thesis, but forego the scare quotes for legibility.
Also in 1999, on a tip from an Internet savvy friend, I discovered a U.S.-based electronic message board for lesbian and bisexual Girl Scouts and their supporters. Among discussions about favourite camp songs, activities, and recipes, members of this list trade tips about coming out to local councils, discuss volunteering with their girlfriends and partners, and share stories of discrimination in the organization. This message board also turned me on to an important book by Nancy Manahan, entitled *On My Honor: Lesbians Reflect on Their Scouting Experience*. After lurking on this board for two years, I have learned that lesbian and bisexual women are active in all facets of Girl Scouting, but many remain deeply closeted within their home councils.

Issues pertaining to youth and sexuality began to interest me in 1998, so my discovery of the Canadian gay, lesbian, and bisexual Scouting troop and US-based lesbian and bisexual Girl Scout message board only inspired me further. By that time, I had already started work on a proposal for a Master’s thesis exploring how sexuality is linked to notions of responsible citizenship in Girl Guides of Canada programmes. These two cases motivated me to more passionately pursue my research. Was this evidence that lesbian, gay, and bisexual Scouts and Guides were discriminated against in their groups? Or did it mean that Scouting and Guiding really were open to all people, regardless of their sexual identity and behaviour? I wanted to know whether lesbian and bisexual members were recognized in the Girl Guides of Canada.

Since I did not have any first-hand experience with Girl Guiding (I grew up in a Jewish neighbourhood where Girl Guiding was considered a Christian activity), I started to ask some friends about their experiences as Girl Guides. One friend, a Girl Guide leader, told me that she calls her boyfriend during meetings and “the girls ooohh and ahhh and tease me.” Another friend, also a unit leader, told me “there is no training around issues of sexuality. We don’t

---

2 Note that the Canadian Scouting Association has both male and female members. In contrast, both the Girl Guides of Canada and Girl Scouts USA are single-sex organizations for female youth only. See page 5 for elaboration.
discuss it. I had one girl tell me about a boy’s good body and I just looked at her and said ‘ooo -
kay’. There really should be training.” These statements made me suspicious about what
Canadian girls and young women were learning about sexuality in their Guiding units, in spite of
claims that no formal training exists. But I needed more than anecdotal evidence.

To figure out where to find answers to my questions, I returned to the initial inspiration
for my research, Mary Louise Adams’ 1997 book *The Trouble With Normal: Postwar Youth and
the Making of Heterosexuality*. I first read this book in a graduate sociology class during my first
term as a graduate student. Though I entered graduate school with a plan to pursue research on
women’s organizing in post-Soviet states that I had started as an undergraduate, Adams’ book
struck a chord with my life and prompted me to pursue a new angle in sociology. I was
particularly struck by Adams’ attention to the ways in which heterosexual identity and behaviour
was normalized and encouraged in postwar sex education films, texts, and advice columns. As I
read the book, I recalled my own experiences with heterosexism during my adolescence. At
thirteen I read in a teen magazine advice column that my attraction to an older girl was not
attraction, but admiration, not a crush, but a desire to be like her. For years after that, I
interpreted my same-sex desire as a normal stage of heterosexual development.

Because of the strong resonance with my own experiences, Adams’ book motivated me
to consider other sites where heterosexuality might be normalized. At the same time, though, I
wanted to be able to draw on the knowledge of nation building that I had developed as an
undergraduate dual sociology/political science major. I also wanted my work to have real-world
implications, so selecting a contemporary site was foremost on my mind. The Girl Guides of
Canada seemed a logical choice. I have two friends who are unit leaders and both of them kindly
allowed me to peruse their Guider’s manuals. The third page told me all I need to know: “The
aim of the Girl Guides of Canada – Guides du Canada is to help girls and young women become responsible citizens…” (Guider’s manual 1997: 3). What does it mean to be a responsible citizen? I wondered. Do responsible citizens have to be heterosexual?

To further explore these issues, I decided to focus my research on one branch of one organization – the Pathfinder branch (for girls aged 12-15) of the Girl Guides of Canada – Guides du Canada. The Girl Guides is a Canadian youth service organization, dedicated to fostering the growth and development of girls and young women (Annual Report 1998). Because much of its curriculum is dedicated to helping girls become responsible Canadian citizens, the Girl Guides is implicated in processes of nation building in Canada. As described in the mission statement of its 1998 Annual Report, the Girl Guides “is a movement for girls, led by women. It challenges girls to reach their potential and empowers them to give leadership and service as responsible citizens of the world” (Ibid: i). The Canadian organization is divided into 5 branches: Sparks (ages 5 and 6), Brownies (ages 7 and 8), Guides (ages 9 through 12), Pathfinders (ages 12 through 15), and Senior Branches (ages 15 and up) (Guider’s manual 1997: 5).

Though the name “Girl Guides of Canada – Guides du Canada” includes both English and French titles, the organization I refer to in my research is the primarily Anglo national association. All of the materials that I analyze are published in English. Girl Guides exist in Quebec in two forms: as the Girl Guides of Canada Quebec chapter, and as the Guides franco-canadiennes. (The latter organization has its own uniform and produces its own curriculum, handbooks, and other materials designed to meet the particular needs of French-speaking girls. It also has members in Manitoba, Ontario, New Brunswick, and Nova Scotia.) The national association publishes some of its material in French, so I suspect that this effort at a bilingual title reflects the organization’s aim to include as many Canadian girls and young women as possible. I also suspect that this effort reflects the organization’s federalist politics.

According to the 1977 Publication Guiding for You, La Federation des Guides Catholiques de la Province de Quebec first became affiliated with the Canadian Girl Guides Association in 1938 (1977: 141). In 1962 La Federation became Guides Catholiques du Canada (secteur français) to incorporate La Federation and other French-speaking Roman Catholic Guides and Guiders across the country. In agreement with Girl Guides of Canada, the Guides Catholiques du Canada (secteur français) recognizes the Chief Commissioner of the Girl Guides of Canada as head of Guiding in Canada. Guides Catholiques du Canada are eligible for all Girl Guides of Canada awards, and have equal opportunity for participation in all national, international and interprovincial events (1977: 142). In 1992, Guides Catholiques du Canada (secteur français) changed their name to Guides francophones du Canada. (POR 1997: 6). Since 1995, their name has been Guides franco-canadiennes.

Indeed, Girl Guiding has garnered some status as a particularly Canadian thing to do. Both Margaret Atwood and Alice Munro, two award-winning Canadien authors, have made reference to Girl Guiding in their novels. See Munroe’s Open Secrets (1994) and Atwood’s Lady Oracle (1976).
The Girl Guides of Canada

First established in Britain in 1909 as an affiliate of the Boy Scouts, the Girl Guides began in Canada in 1910 (Guider’s manual 1997: 122). Since its inception, hundreds of thousands of Canadian girls and women have taken part in its programmes. In 1998 alone, over 200,000 Canadian girls and women were registered as members of the Girl Guides (Annual Report 1998: 15). Despite its prevalence in the lives of almost 10% of the Canadian female population aged 5-17, little research has focused on the relevance of guiding in Canadian girls’ lives (for exceptions, see Varpalotai 1992, 1994). In contrast, substantial writing and research has been directed toward Boy Scouts organizations and their role in boys’ lives (see, for example, Hantover 1978, Hirsch 1997, Macleod 1983, and Warren 1986).

Today, the World Association of Girl Guides and Girl Scouts (WAGGGS) is active in 140 countries and serves over 10 million members (WAGGGS 2000). As voluntary single-sex organizations dedicated to serving girls and young women, the Girl Guides and Girl Scouts play a significant part in shaping girls’ attitudes, values, and understandings of citizenship. As members of WAGGGS, both “Girl Guides” and “Girl Scouts” share a mission “to enable girls and young women to develop their fullest potential as responsible citizens of the world” (Ibid.).

While intimately connected through WAGGGS, “Girl Guides” and “Girl Scouts” claim slightly different origins. The “Girl Guides” locates its origins in Britain and operates in Canada, Jamaica, and other former British colonies. The “Girl Scouts” claims a uniquely United States

5 The 140 countries span the world, and include countries at all levels of industrialization, such as Canada, the United States, Mexico, Honduras, El Salvador, Chile, Costa Rica, Grenada, Guyana, Haiti, France, Denmark, Czech Republic, Greece, Israel, Ivory Coast, Kenya, Mauritius, Nepal, Pakistan, Singapore, Sri Lanka and Thailand (WAGGGS 2000). I expect that the specificities of being a responsible citizen differ by country, and a more expanded study could consider the meanings of responsible citizenship in a comparative context. Some ideals of responsible world citizenship are, however, common for all WAGGGS members. The Prevention of Adolescent Pregnancy WAGGGS New Initiative is one example. Focused on preventing pregnancy in young women under the age of 15, the initiative aims to pressure local governments in all WAGGGS countries to address teenage pregnancy.
American origin and identity. Both organizations identify as non-formal education youth service organizations: values-based, youth-centred groups oriented to peer education and experiential learning (Ibid.).

The Pathfinder Programme

While all branches of the Girl Guides of Canada profess to empower girls and young women, the Pathfinder programme (for ages 12-15), in particular, claims to play a significant role in young women’s development of self. The Pathfinder programme was established as part of the Girl Guides of Canada in 1979, after a study of the age groupings of members showed a need for young women aged 12-15 to have their own branch. The decision to create Pathfinders was informed by popular theories of adolescent psychology and by an exploration of the age groupings used by other youth service organizations. (See my discussion in chapter IV for further details.) Dedicated to young women ages 12 to 15, the Pathfinder programme is organized around a series of Emblems that are earned through the completion of various activities. From 1979 to 1985, the Pathfinder programme consisted of five Emblems: Camping, Community, Home, Outdoor, and World. In 1986 the Be Prepared Emblem was added and in 1997 the Leadership Emblem was added, to total seven Emblems in 1999. (See figure 2a for clarification.) Pathfinders earn bronze, silver, or gold Emblems in each category, depending on the number of activities that they complete. For example, to earn a silver camping Emblem in 1985, a Pathfinder had to complete twenty activities, five of which were compulsory (Pathfinder Programme 1985). Commonly referred to as “challenges,” activities involve such tasks as presenting fire safety information to one’s unit, helping to pitch and care for one’s tent, and practicing appropriate etiquette in caring for the Canadian flag (Pathfinder Program 1999).
The Pathfinder Programme 1979-1985
Each Emblem is divided into 3 stages:
Bronze (complete 10 challenges)
Silver (complete 20 challenges)
Gold (complete 30 challenges)
1 Camping Emblem
2 Community Emblem
3 Home Emblem
4 Outdoor Emblem
5 World Emblem

The Pathfinder Program 1986-1993
Each Emblem is divided into 3 stages:
Bronze (complete 1 challenge from each section)
Silver (complete 3 challenges from each section; choose only 1 section for Camping Emblem)
Gold (complete 5 challenges from each section)
1 Be Prepared Emblem
Community
Home
Outdoors
2 Camping Emblem
Established
OR Undeveloped
OR Lightweight
OR Winter
3 Community Emblem
Arts & Recreation
Citizenship
Heritage
Knowledge & Service
4 Home Emblem
Fashion & Health
Leisure Time & Hobbies
Nutrition & Home Management
Personal Relationships and Values
5 Outdoor Emblem
Conservation
Natural Environment
Outdoor Skills
Sports & Fitness
6 World Emblem
Canadian Mosaic
Global Understanding
Travelling
World Guiding

*note: no new handbooks were published between 1993 and 1997

The Pathfinder Program 1997-1999
Each Emblem is divided into 3 stages:
Bronze (complete 1 challenge from each pathway)
Silver (complete 3 challenges from each pathway; choose only 1 section for Camping Emblem)
Gold (complete 5 challenges from each pathway)
1 Be Prepared Emblem
Community Pathway
Home Pathway
Outdoors Pathway
2 Camping Emblem
Established
OR Adventure
OR Winter
3 Community Emblem
Arts & Recreation Pathway
Citizenship Pathway
Heritage Pathway
Knowledge & Service Pathway
4 Home Emblem
Lifestyles Pathway
Personal Interests Pathway
Nutrition & Home Management Pathway
Relationships and Values Pathway
5 Leadership Emblem
Skill Building
Event
6 Outdoor Emblem
Conservation Pathway
Natural Environment Pathway
Outdoor Skills Pathway
Active Living Pathway
7 World Emblem
Canadian Mosaic Pathway
Global Understanding Pathway
Travelling Pathway
World Guiding Pathway
The 1997 *Guider's manual* for the Pathfinder programme notes that Pathfinders are “beginning the transition from child to adult” and points to physical, intellectual, emotional, and social characteristics of female adolescents. The manual notes that Pathfinders need “the safety of friends and adults she can trust as she begins to be aware of her own sexuality” (1997: 7). The Pathfinder unit, the manual also notes, “can be a place to discuss and debate as [the Pathfinder] gradually matures in ability to make independent decisions” (Ibid.). Furthermore, the Pathfinder is described as “seeking to become her own person” and, the manual states, “her unit can allow her to experiment with various behaviours, and examine the identity she will choose” (Ibid.).

The Pathfinder curriculum aims to enable members to build self-esteem and independence skills, and to provide a dependable and supportive peer group in which members can develop a sense of accomplishment, usefulness, and social responsibility (Ibid: 8, 16). Through the Pathfinder programme, young women can also earn the Canada Cord and the Citizenship Certificate. In earning these awards, young women enrolled in Pathfinders demonstrate “their commitment to active and responsible Canadian Citizenship” (*Pathfinder Program* 1997:8).

The focus on citizenship in the Pathfinder programme is important. In advanced capitalist countries in the Post World War II period, citizenship has become the chief signifier of membership in a nation state (Thobani 1998: 1). In addition to representing membership in a state, citizenship refers to the relations between people and the state, and between various persons within that state. As long as states have existed, they have been concerned with socializing their residents as responsible citizens. The socialization of responsible citizens is a process that occurs through the efforts of both state and extra-state organizations. Definitions of responsible citizenship vary across time and place, and are mediated by one’s gender, sexuality,

---

6 The manual does not elaborate on the types of identities available for a Pathfinder’s choosing but, as my analysis will show, the opportunities may be more restrictive than this phrase suggests.
race, class, and ability. In this thesis, I explore the ways in which Canadian youth service organizations aimed to develop responsible citizens in the twentieth century. I then examine the ways in which one particular extra-state organization – the Girl Guides of Canada – works to gain the consent of girls and young women to particular definitions of responsible citizenship. I am concerned with whether definitions of responsible citizenship espoused in the Pathfinder curriculum are based on heteronormative sexual behaviour and identity.

My research strategy

Historian John Springhall argues that understanding the ideals, appeals, and composition of youth groups gives clues to the workings of society and can serve as barometers of public attitudes (cited in McKee 1982: 4). The values, standards, and attitudes of an organization are frequently expressed by means of verbal communication, particularly through the texts that they produce. Their texts also act as authorizing agents that privilege particular identities and behaviours. Because the Girl Guides, and the Pathfinder programme in particular, professes to teach girls and young women to become responsible citizens, it can serve as a case study through which to explore assumptions about Canadian citizenship.

To discover the meanings of “responsible citizenship” as defined by the Girl Guides, I conducted an analysis of the content of the first ten Pathfinders handbooks and six Pathfinder Guider’s manuals published between 1979 and 1999. I aimed to uncover assumptions about the rights, meanings, entitlements, and responsibilities of Canadian citizenship, and to explore how these assumptions contribute to processes of nation building in Canada. This type of analysis is particularly important given the accessibility of Pathfinder handbooks and Guider’s manuals - all of the young women enrolled in Pathfinders, as well as their leaders, families, friends, and the public, have access to them. In the context of teaching about responsible citizenship, the
handbooks outline requirements for earning Emblems and provide space for personal records of achievement. Pathfinder Guider's manuals are designed specifically for unit leaders, and outline the requirements for Emblems and suggest ideas for leading group meetings.

A common critique of a study that only uses texts as data is that we cannot know how readers of these texts consumed the messages in them. Did readers read these texts with full voluntary attention? Did they take these texts seriously? Although data may also be derived through interviews or other direct contact with girls and young women enrolled in Pathfinders between 1979 and 1999, current restrictions on my time and resources make this task impracticable. It is also important to note that all of the texts that I analyze were published in Toronto, though the author is rarely identified. Consequently, it is difficult to identify the various interests at play in the Pathfinder curriculum. Furthermore, while definitions of "responsible citizenship" are mediated by gender, sexuality, race, class, and ability, my research will not consider these statuses equally. My focus on gender and sexuality is also attributable to current

---

7 For example, to study the role of 'race' in youth service organizations would require a much more expanded study that attends to the history and complexities involved. Prescriptions for responsible citizenship may vary for First Nations, Latina, Black, Asian, South Asian, and White young women, and may involve the sustaining or refuting of various racialized stereotypes. For example, Evelyn Hammonds (1997) notes that social reform was a strategy used by middle-class blacks at the turn of the twentieth century in an attempt to change racist perceptions about black sexuality as exotic, deviant, and animalistic. Research by Nina Mjagkij (1997) shows that youth service organizations, such as YMCAs run by African-Americans, played a significant role in attempts to change these perceptions and to secure racial advancement for Americans of African decent. Mjagkij writes,

African American YMCA leaders hoped to achieve racial advancement through the display of good citizenship, sound character, and true manhood. They accepted segregated YMCAs to provide African American men and boys with the opportunity to build their manhood while shielding them from racial humiliation (139).

It would be useful to explore whether notions of "good" citizenship in turn-of-the-century segregated Black YMCAs were similar to notions of responsible citizenship espoused in segregated White YMCAs in the same period. Mijagkij also notes, for example, that contrary to practices common in white-dominated branches of the YMCA and YWCA and other youth service organizations, black reformers "were less interested in building manhood among the lower classes than they were in preserving the manhood of members of their own rank" (Ibid: 144). For a man to be eligible for membership in a black YMCA, he was required to be an active member of a Protestant church, subscribe to the ideals promulgated by the YMCA, and be able to pay a small membership fee (Ibid: 144). It is also important to compare prescriptions for responsible citizenship in Girl Guide units and Girl Scout troops where First Nations, Latina, White, and Black young women make up most of the membership.
restrictions on my time and resources, as well as to my desire to do full justice to sexuality as a category of analysis. I want to know who, according to these texts, counts as a responsible citizen? What qualities, in terms of personal attributes as well as sexual identity and sexual practices, is the responsible female citizen encouraged to and believed to possess? How do these qualities intersect, in attempts by the Pathfinder branch of the Girl Guides, to construct a particular Canadian identity? How does the Pathfinder programme work to gain the consent of girls and young women to its definitions of responsible citizenship? I do not, in this research, aim to assess whether or to what extent the Girl Guides is successful in producing good citizens.

**Canadian nation building and moral regulation**

In this thesis, I take up two theoretical issues in order to understand the Pathfinder programme: Canadian nation building and moral regulation. Since the turn of the century, citizens in Canada have been part of various nation building strategies influenced by the social, economic, and political climate. In the early part of the century, for example, rapid urbanization and industrialization followed by a call to war caused anxiety about the future of the nation. As sociologists Mariana Valverde and Wendy Sterne demonstrate, youth service organizations before and after World War I were concerned with educating young Canadians as particular kinds of citizens – strong, virile, and ready for battle. During the Cold War, anxiety about the future of the nation was still strong, though the focus shifted from creating strong individuals to creating strong families. Along with government initiatives for welfare state funding and family allowances, youth educators and youth service organizations aimed to teach young people to become the future mothers and fathers of the nation. As Mary Louise Adams, Franca Iacovetta, and Gary Kinsman show, the family in Cold War Canada was constructed and normalized as a bourgeois, Anglo-Celtic nuclear family, against which “non-conformists” were compared,
judged, harassed, and punished (Iacovetta 2000: 13). Both of these periods were characterized by campaigns (led by state and extra-state organizations) that meant to ensure the physical and moral health of Canada’s citizens.

The contemporary climate is shaped by factors different from those listed above. Apart from peacekeeping stints and small roles in wars waged overseas, Canadians have now enjoyed more than 50 years of peace. And, as Jeffrey Weeks notes, profound changes have occurred as global economic, social and cultural changes have undermined many traditional bastions of authority, such as the churches, state, and family (1998: 41). Furthermore, the women’s movement and lesbian, gay, bisexual, and transgender rights movements have unsettled ordered erotic categories and placed strain on traditional concepts of citizenship by blurring the boundary between public and private life. Combined with rapid global migration, these circumstances have challenged states to develop more inclusive forms of citizenship. In a “multicultural” nation defined as pluralist and tolerant, state and extra-state organizations have imagined a new kind of Canada. In this thesis, I explore whether this newly imagined state includes lesbians and bisexuals as full citizens.

My research will contribute to existing literature on both citizenship and youth service organizations. While Canadian scholars have long been interested in citizenship issues, their research has focused primarily on the responsibility of the state to grant full rights to all citizens. Recent feminist literature on citizenship has considered the state’s role in managing immigration policy to prevent certain groups from achieving full citizenship status (see, for example, Alexander 1997, Ross 1998, Thobani 1998, Yuval-Davis 1989). My research will add a new dimension to contemporary citizenship studies by taking into account the role that extra-state organizations play in discursively developing responsible citizens. Similarly, by considering
citizenship in the context of youth service organizations, my research interrogates recreational and educational programs for youth, contributing to existing literature (as outlined in chapter II) in that area as well. My thesis will be one of the first to incorporate theories of citizenship and moral regulation using a Canadian youth service organization as a case study.

My research also contributes by setting the foundation for new directions of research. Though this thesis focuses specifically on the Girl Guide programme, it could serve as part of a broader comparative project that also considers the encouragement of normative hetero-masculinity(ies) in the Scouting program. Of particular relevance are the Scouts program (for boys aged 11-14) and the Venturers program (for boys and young men aged 14-17). Also, as I suggested in an earlier footnote, this research can serve as a foundation for those wanting to compare definitions of responsible citizenship in youth service organizations dedicated to Black, Latina, Asian, South Asian, White, and First Nations young women.

Overview of chapters

In chapter II, I provide a review of literature to contextualize my research and show where my work might contribute to knowledge about Canadian youth service organizations. To begin, I discuss the historical origins of youth service organizations in Canada. I follow this by considering youth services in three periods: the turn of the twentieth century, the post World War II period, and the contemporary period. In each of these sections, I draw on research that details the ways in which young women involved in youth services were encouraged to display particular forms of heterofeminine behaviour.

In chapter III, I consider some of the theory that is relevant to my work. I begin with a brief explanation of liberal citizenship theory and supplement that with a review of feminist contributions to theories of citizenship. I then consider gender and sexuality in the context of
nation building. In this chapter, I also discuss theories of social control and moral regulation.

Here I take up the debate about whether or not the state is the primary coercive force in people’s lives. This is also the place where I consider what it means to be “responsible.” Drawing on Beverly Skeggs’ (1997) work on learning respectability through a British caring course, I lay the groundwork for my own analysis. I also discuss discourse analysis, which serves as the foundation for my research strategy.

In chapters IV and V, I consider the case of the Pathfinder branch of the Girl Guides of Canada in great detail. I begin with an overview of the organization, explaining its affiliates, how it is funded, and how its programmes are revised. I then analyze the principles of the programme, drawing on existing analyses of youth service organizations and theories of moral regulation. I then consider what it means to be a responsible citizen according to Pathfinder handbooks and Pathfinder Guider’s manuals. In my analysis, I divide the contemporary period into three terms: 1979-1985, 1986-1993, and 1997-1999 (note that no new handbooks were published between 1993 and 1997 - see figure 2a for further clarification). By comparing the content of the handbooks and manuals in each of these terms, I am able to get a sense of how the demands of the organization have changed over time. The bulk of these chapters is dedicated to my analysis of assumptions about responsible Canadian citizenship, and the ways in which these assumptions contribute to processes of nation building in Canada. In chapter IV, I consider categories of identity by exploring the treatment of gender, sexuality, class, ethnicity, and ability within the handbooks and manuals. Here I attend to the social relations of sexism, heterosexism, classism, racism, and ableism. In chapter V, I consider five codes of responsibility as expressed in the Pathfinder programme: volunteer service, respect for the environment, preparation for paid work, health and hygiene, and cheerfulness and obedience.
In the final chapter, I review my goals for the project, reiterate my conclusions, and suggest ways in which the Girl Guides of Canada can address some of the issues raised in my research. I also draw on a publication by Gay and Lesbian Educators of British Columbia (GALE), entitled *Challenging Homophobia in schools*, to provide some direction for Girl Guides' administrators hoping to develop an anti-homophobia training program for leaders and young members. I conclude by suggesting directions for future research related to youth service organizations and gay, lesbian, and bisexual studies.
Chapter II

Everybody loves a girl who is sweet and tender:
Twentieth century youth services and responsible heterofemininity

The Girl Guides of Canada is one of many organizations that make up the youth service movement in Canada. As a topic of study, youth service organizations have been essentially overlooked by sociologists. Youth service organizations for young women even more so. There is, however, a growing body of literature on recreational services for young women, written primarily by feminists studying sport, history, and education (see, for example, Heath 1997, Sterne 1993, Varpalotai 1992, 1994). These studies provide a firm foundation for my research.

In this chapter, I review some of the existing literature on female youth service organizations in Canada. To ground my research historically, I consider three periods: the turn-of-the-twentieth century, the post World War II period, and the contemporary period. Much of the existing research on youth service organizations for young women focuses on the turn-of-the-century period, when youth service organizations first gained popularity. While many of these studies do not directly contend with sexuality, they provide crucial background about gender prescriptions for young women who were members. Canadian sociologists Mariana Valverde (1991) Leila McKee (1982) and Gary Kinsman (1987) set the stage, and Lee Stewart (1993), Sarah Heath (1997), Wendy Sterne (1993), Carol Auster (1985) and Karen Altman (1990) provide the evidence. Here I begin to ground my own research historically and to understand the historical construction of the link between youth sexuality and citizenship.

For reasons that I can only speculate, the small body of work on female-focused youth service organization considers them only up until the 1920s. To garner information about services for youth in the post World War II period in Canada, I relied on information provided by Mary Louise Adams (1997), Joan Sangster (1996), and Becki Ross (1997, 1998b). While not
directly concerned with youth service organizations, these authors consider youth and sexuality in the context of Canadian schools, young offender reformatories, and urban charitable organizations, respectively. Their work illuminates the ways in which postwar youth organizations attempted to gain the consent of young women to particular definitions of responsible femininity, and helps me to historicize the discursive development of responsible young female sexuality in Canada.

Building from the two bodies of literature, I move into the contemporary period, where my own research is situated. Here I consider two authors who explore the Canadian Girl Guides and the Girl Scouts USA, respectively. Aniko Varpalotai (1994) discusses the process of the politicization of the Girl Guides of Canada as it defended its right to remain an all-female organization in the early 1990s. Nancy Manahan (1997) provides important insights into the nature of the Girl Scouts USA’s non-discrimination policy in her introduction to a book that explores American lesbians’ experiences in Girl Scouts. I use Varpalotai and Manahan to set the stage for my research into the development of responsible citizens in the Pathfinder programme.

In this chapter, I use two concepts that may require clarification. First, I define heterosexism as “the institutionalized assumption that everyone is, or should be, heterosexual and that heterosexuality is inherently superior to and preferable to homosexuality or bisexuality.” Furthermore, the term “also refers to the institutional and organizational discrimination against non-heterosexuals or behaviours not stereotypically heterosexual” (GALE 2000). I also use the term “normative heterofemininity.” By this I mean the appearance and behaviours associated with female heterosexual femininity, as defined by dominant social groups. Definitions of what constitutes “normative heterofemininity” vary over time, as I will illustrate in this discussion.
The social-purity movement, youth-service organizations, and citizenship in turn-of-the-century Canada

Youth service organizations, such as the Girl Guides of Canada, have roots in the Canadian and British social purity movements that were prominent at the turn of the twentieth century. Mariana Valverde (1991) and Leila McKee (1982) note that social welfare organizations were established in Britain and Canada at the turn-of-the-century in response to anxiety about future generations and the perceived corrupting influences of the city. Valverde notes that in late nineteenth-century Britain, the death of young soldiers during the Boer War led members of British society to be concerned about the next generation of soldiers (20). At the same time, as immigration, urbanization, and industrialization increased in countries in Western Europe and North America, so did anxiety about the future of the nations (McKee 1982: 91). For example, the increased visibility of “undisciplined,” unschooled, working class children in the city streets, Canadian sociologist Gary Kinsman (1987) argues, was thought to symbolize a breakdown of the family and a threat to the moral order (82). Also, as part of the “new world,” Canada was seen by the British as a country in development, whose new urban citizens needed to learn how to become responsible Canadian citizens.

Franca Iacovetta (2000) notes that Canadian nation building involved the socialization of Canadian citizens according to middle-class Protestant values. Drawing from Valverde’s 1991 book The Age of Light, Soap and Water: Moral Reform in English Canada 1885-1925, Iacovetta writes that,

Canadian nation-building in an earlier era required more than protective tariffs, backroom political deals, and a transcontinental railway. It also involved various moral campaigns both to encourage middle-class white Canadian women to procreate (or face “race suicide”) and to ensure the moral “uplift” of working-class immigrants and racialized Canadians deemed inferior on both moral and mental grounds (13).
The social purity movement played a starring role in this process. Valverde describes the
Canadian social purity movement as

a loose network of organizations and individuals, mostly church people, educators,
doctors, and those we would now describe as community or social workers, who
engaged in a sporadic but vigorous campaign to "raise the moral tone" of Canadian
society, and in particular of urban working-class communities (1991 :17).

Furthermore, Valverde notes that the social purity campaign aimed to "raise the moral tone" of
Canadian society by involving itself with campaigns around morality and sexuality, particularly
that of young women. She writes,

The social purity movement must also be interpreted as a great deal more than simply a
campaign against prostitution, immoral amusements, and other public manifestations of
vice. Social purity was a campaign to regulate morality, in particular sexual morality, in
order to preserve and enhance a certain type of human life (Ibid: 24).

Lee Stewart (1993), a Canadian historian whose book traces the history of the Elizabeth
Fry Society of BC from 1939-1989, notes that since the 1880s middle-class women’s
organizations have been instrumental in shaping the social purity movement. These organizations
include the Women’s Christian Temperance Union (WCTU – established in Canada in 1874), the
Young Women’s Christian Association (YWCA - established in Canada in 1870), the Victorian
order of nurses (established in Canada in 1898), the Children’s Aid Society (established in
Canada in 1901), The Imperial Order of the Daughters of the Empire (IODE – established in
Canada in 1902), the University Women’s Club (established in Canada in 1907) and the “Big
Sister” movement (established at the Toronto YWCA in 1912). Women’s instrumental role in
these organizations was, Stewart argues, based on the belief that women were best suited to
understand and remedy the needs and problems of girls and women (13). The youth service
organizations that came out of these women’s organizations aimed to teach young Canadian
citizens responsible moral behaviour. As Joanne Meyerowitz (1997) notes, youth service
organizations at the turn of the century sought to protect young men and women from the temptations of urban dance halls, theaters, brothels, and saloons by providing values-based educational and recreational activities.

Anxiety about "youth" and youth sexuality at the turn of the century and during the post World War I period was also related to anxiety about the period of adolescence. McKee notes that the curricula of youth service organizations at the turn-of-the-century were based on theories about Western European and North American youth developed by Rousseau, Froebel, and George Stanley Hall. These theorists argued, in a manner informed by the highly racialized and gendered discourses of the period, that stages of childhood and adolescence corresponded with the stages of human evolution (McKee 1982: 98).\footnote{For more on the racialized and gendered discourses of this period, see McKee 1982.} Teenagers were thought to be especially vulnerable to temptation, but malleable enough to make adolescence the ideal time for social conditioning (Ibid: 90). This perspective blended the two discursive models that dominated assumptions about "youth" throughout the twentieth century: the medical model, including sexology, psychiatry, psychology, and physiology, which posits that one's character is biologically ingrained; and the social model, including family studies, criminology, sociology and social work, which posits that one's character is influenced by her social environment.

One psychologist whose work is often referenced in Girl Guides handbooks is George Stanley Hall. Writing at the turn of the twentieth century, Hall was a pioneer of child study and one of the first theorists to conceptualize adolescence as a distinct stage in life. Hall's study of white, middle-class North American youth was published in 1904 in a two-volume book entitled *Adolescence: Its Psychology and Its Relations to Physiology, Anthropology, Sociology, Sex, Crime, Religion, and Education.* Hall saw adolescence as a turbulent period of physical,
emotional, and sexual development during which youths needed to be shielded from adult duties and expectations. He argued that heterosexual urges were normal but needed to be sublimated into religion, athletics, education, and music. Female adolescents, according to Hall, needed sleep, plain diets, little mental strain, and careful supervision and guidance to develop healthfully (Odem 101-102). The following quote from the 1920 publication *Aids to Scoutmastership* by Boy Scouts founder Lord Baden-Powell illustrates the influence of turn-of-the-century child psychology on the Scouting programme.

> A nation owes its success, not so much to its strengths in armaments, as to the amount of character in its citizens. For a man to be successful in life, character is more essential than erudition…. Character cannot be drilled into a boy. The germ of it is already in him, and needs to be drawn out and expanded (Ibid: 120).

For young people at the turn of the century, good character was linked to healthy sexuality. Concerns about sexuality, and female sexuality in particular, increased at this time to such an extent that it became a target of social intervention and organization. This intervention was carried out in two ways – through punitive organizations established to rehabilitate the young offender and through voluntary social and educational organizations run by the state and extra-state institutions that aimed to teach young people to become responsible citizens.

Extra-state voluntary youth service organizations established in Canada at the turn of century included the Young Men’s Christian Association (YMCA), the Young Women’s Christian Association (YWCA), Canadian Standards Efficiency Training for boys (CSET), Girl Guides, and Boy Scouts. Also, in 1916, the Canadian Advisory Committee on Work with Teen- aged Girls was established and by 1924, the Canadian Girls in Training program (CGIT), which aimed to protect youth from the temptations of a rapidly changing world, had units in each

---

9 Note that this is a classist ideal as many working class families at the turn of the century could not support such an extended period of dependence and close supervision of youth.
province (2766 in total) and thirty thousand members nationwide (McKee 1982: 62). These organizations were based on groups of ten to twelve youths who would engage in activities such as dramatics, outdoor recreation, handicrafts, art and literature, and discussion and debate (Ibid: 61). By regulating the leisure time of youth, voluntary youth service organizations, in addition to state-sponsored youth service organizations and educational institutions like schools, became part of a large network of organizations acting as agents concerned with the discipline and socialization of youth (Ibid: 11).

Teaching normative heterofemininity in turn-of-the-century youth-service organizations

Existing literature on turn of the century youth service organizations suggests that notions of responsible citizenship were based on assumptions about appropriate gender and sexual behaviour. Beliefs about what constituted responsible behaviour were based on the middle-class Protestant values espoused by the founders of many Canadian youth service organizations. In the introduction to their edited volume Men and Women Adrift: The YMCA and YWCA in the City, Nina Mjagkij and Margaret Spratt (1997) trace the history of the Young Christian Associations. The YMCA was founded in June 1844 by Londoner George Williams. First established as a prayer group for single young men who arrived in the British city during the Industrial Revolution, the organization aimed to promote wholesome activities and respectable behaviour through “alternative living and leisure spaces” (2). The movement grew rapidly among the merchant class and was primarily led by prominent businessmen who were concerned about safeguarding young respectable men from the corruption of the city (Ibid: 1). The first YMCAs in North America were established in Montreal in 1851 and in Boston and New York City in 1852. By working through churches, the YMCA gained credibility, legitimacy, and attracted a
network of “socially responsible” men (Ibid: 3). By 1905, the YMCA had recorded 5000 associations in 24 countries (Ibid: 3).

The first YWCA opened in London, England in 1859, more than a decade after the YMCA opened. Its primary goal was to provide charity to poor urban women (Ibid: 6). According to historian Sarah Heath (1997), by the turn of the century, young white, working class women, attracted by employment in factories and the service industry, and amusements such as restaurants and dancing, were moving to the cities (86). Low wages, however, meant that women often struggled to live independently and

reformers of that time worried that women workers would be drawn into a situation of decreasing finances and declining morality. Specifically, a common fear was that women who lacked money might turn to a life of prostitution to avoid starvation” (Ibid: 87). 10

Through her study of the Cincinnati, Ohio YWCA between 1918 and 1929, Heath found that the YWCA served two important purposes: it provided income-geared residence and an employment referral service that aimed to protect women from unsafe conditions, over work, and sexual advances from employers (Ibid: 90). The Association also offered weekly night classes so young women could better themselves or their position. In 1920, the Association offered courses in gym, dramatics, beadwork, ukelele, dressmaking, millinery, current events, basketry, English literature, and embroidery, and sent women to the YWCA commercial school to learn bookkeeping, accounting, and salesmanship (Ibid: 91). Despite this broad range of assistance and courses, Heath shows that YWCA reformers had strong ideas about what it meant to be a woman, namely that they desired to be married and raise a family. Heath writes,

Women reformers in the YWCA held values that were more commonly associated with nineteenth-century Victorian values. They encouraged young women to meet

10 Note that this statement identifies prostitution as a sign of declining morality. This is a strong connection that led turn-of-the-century reformers to include sexual regulation in moral education programmes for young women.
prospective mates in a chaperoned setting and hoped that when women were married, they would be able to leave the workforce to bear and raise children (Ibid: 87).

Furthermore, Heath cites the YWCA 1922 Annual Report, which stated that

[
encouragement is given to courses which contribute to homemaking, including the care of children, so that young women may go to their homes knowing right care and management, and may raise their community standards through enacting principles for right living that are ethically and scientifically sound (Ibid: 92).

When Scouting and Guiding entered Canada in 1909, it challenged the dominance of the YMCA, YWCA and church youth groups (McKee 1982: 66). Unlike the YMCA and YWCA, Scouting and Guiding were primarily secular organizations and, though they did advocate their own version of social Christianity, their definition of responsible citizenship was not tied to the Church. As Wendy Sterne (1993), Carol Auster (1985), and Karen Altman (1990) illustrate, notions of responsibility in Girl Guides organizations were tied to the character of the individual, whose heterofemininity was both assumed and encouraged in the name of responsible citizenship in the early part of the twentieth century.

In her 1993 Dissertation entitled “The Formation of the Scouting Movement and the Gendering of Citizenship,” Wendy Sterne argues that knowledge created within United States of America civism literature, including Scouting literature, has “helped to authorize and legitimate particular images of citizenship that have shaped the expectations, experiences, perceptions and practices of many Americans” (6). Using gender as a category of analysis, Sterne examines civic education in American Girl and Boy Scout curricula at the beginning of the twentieth century. She asks, “[h]ow does gender manifest itself in the formation of ‘good citizenship’ in particular social communities and settings” (Ibid: 87)? Building from there, she also asks, “[h]ow and what notions of gender and gender relations are embedded in constructions of the ‘good citizen’ and the ‘good society’ (Ibid: 271)? Sterne argues that examining prescriptive sources of ideals can
help us understand popularly held assumptions about how people live their lives. For Sterne, Scouting handbooks (for boys and girls) are both prescriptive and descriptive, and are inherently political (Ibid: 176). She writes,

The language and arrangement of the textual discourses are inherently "political" because they act as "authorizing" agents, legitimating particular constructions of "social reality," of "masculinity" and "femininity," and of "morality" and making them seem "normal" and "natural" (Ibid. 266).

Sterne begins by noting that Scouting, by its very division of groups based on gender, assumes that gender is a principal means of organizing social life. She shows that the handbooks prescribe different roles for Boy and Girl Scouts, though they both link the character of American boys and girls to the health and quality of the nation. Sterne notes that the kind of character emphasized in Girl Scout handbooks primarily focused on particular "qualities of womanliness," which included intelligence, resourcefulness, physical and mental fitness, self-sufficiency, economic self-reliance, ingenuity, "survival" spirit, and the ability to mediate circumstances and relations successfully (Ibid: 235). For example, the 1913-1916 handbook urged Girl Scouts to "be strong," "be handy," and "be Good Mothers" (Ibid: 196). The 1916-1920 handbook added the importance of "self-improvement," "economy," and "study" (Ibid: 196). Girl Scouting also challenged girls to use their character to serve the British Empire alongside the boys. Sterne quotes from the 1919 handbook Scouting for Girls:

Girls do not want to sit down and lead an idle life, not to have everything done for them, nor to have a very easy time... They would much rather show themselves handy people, able to help others and ready, if necessary, to sacrifice themselves for others... And...to tackle different jobs themselves in their life, to face mountains and difficulties and dangers and to go at them having prepared themselves to be skillful and brave (Ibid: 176).

Sterne cites similar passages from the foreword to the 1913-1916 Girl Scouts Handbook and from a section entitled "Do a Good Turn Daily" in the 1920-1927 handbook. The first
emphasized the role of Girl Scouts as future mothers, and the second emphasized their role as American citizens.

If character training and learning citizenship are necessary for boys, how much more important is it that these principles should be instilled into the minds of girls who are destined to be the mothers and guides of the next generation . . . . The Scout movement, so popular among boys, is unfitted for the needs of girls, but on something the same lines has been devised the present system given a more womanly training for both mind and body (Ibid: 195).

This simple recipe for making a very little girl perform every day some slight act of kindness for somebody else is the seed from which grows the larger plant of helping the world along—the steady attitude of the older Scout. And this grows later into the tree of organized, practical community service for the grown Scout—the ideal of every American woman today (Ibid: 208, emphasis in original).

Similar to Sterne, Carol Auster and Karen Altman found that Girl Scout USA handbooks encouraged particular forms of feminine behaviour among young Girl Scouts. Like Sterne, American social scientist Carol Auster suggests that Girl Scouts handbooks should be considered "manuals for socialization and handbooks of values" (1985: 360). Auster argues that because Girl Scouts manuals and programmes reflect the particular social and historical context in which they are produced, an analysis of these manuals can "yield insights concerning societal expectations for family, career, gender roles, sexual behavior, social stratification, and other aspects of life of interest to sociologists" (Ibid: 359). Auster shows that gender expectations are expressed through the Girl Scouts Promise, Laws, uniforms, and badges. For example, in a review of Girl Scouts handbooks published between 1913 and 1984, Auster noted that the proportion of badges devoted to homemaking and childcare decreased substantially between 1913 and 1980: from 23% in 1913, to 13% in 1963, to 7% in 1980 (Ibid: 361). Her review of 1913 handbooks also revealed the following phrases:

BE WOMANLY. No one wants women to be soldiers. None of us like women who ape men. . . . An imitation diamond is not as good as a real diamond. An imitation fur coat is not as good as real fur. Girls do no good trying to imitate boys. You will only be a poor
imitation. It is better to be a real girl such as no boy could possibly be. Everybody loves a girl who is sweet and tender and who can gently soothe those who are weary or in pain....

BE GOOD MOTHERS. Some time when you are grown up and have children of your own to bring up you will have to know what food to give them, how to look after their health, how to make them strong, and how to teach them to be good, hardworking, honorable citizens in our growing country.

MODESTY. Don’t let any man make love to you unless he wants to marry you, and you are willing to do so. Don’t marry a man unless he is in a position to support you and a family (Ibid: 364).

Commensurate with these findings, Karen Altman’s research shows that early Girl Guide programs were dedicated to teaching middle- and upper-class girls to become good homemakers. Altman notes that in the early 1920s, Girl Guides practiced an exercise called “Little House” that presented homemaking as “a delightful game” and trained girls to create a home as a “refuge from the world’s frets” and “something more than a house filled with furniture” (1990: 296).

In addition to promoting particular forms of femininity, youth service organization leaders also appear to have had heteronormative assumptions about young women’s sexuality. Sarah Heath notes that the Cincinnati YWCA attempted to protect young women’s reputations by enforcing a homosocial atmosphere at the residence and arranging for carefully supervised contact between young women and men. Men were only permitted in the visitors’ lounge and had to register their names with the house matron (1997: 95). Furthermore, though the YWCA sponsored women-only sporting competitions, afternoon teas, dances and Valentine’s parties, Heath notes, assumptions of heterosexuality prevailed (Ibid: 95). Heath refers to records of a Christmas party attended by eighty-five young women where “[t]he party took the form of a ‘boy and girl party,’ some of the girls disguising as boys and escorting the girls” (Ibid: 95). Moreover, the report of a 1929 open forum on sexuality with residents, stated that “[m]any girls were interested in the [charm] school and are especially interested in the talks on Marriage and
Petting.” Questions included “Is a kiss or petting [permissible] before engagement? How to encourage the boys without permitting it? [and] The effect of petting upon both parties” (Ibid: 103).\footnote{Researchers are quick to note, however, that the young men and women who used YMCA and YWCA facilities were not always acquiescent to the rules and regulations of the Associations. Mjagkij and Spratt note that railroad workers who visited YMCAs “challenged the YMCA’s attempt to mold them into content, morally reformed workers, and pious Christian men by boycotting Bible study and gospel classes, stealing supplies, and spitting on floors” (1997: 8). Also, as John D. Wrathall notes in “Taking the young Stranger by the Hand: Homosexual Cruising at the YMCA, 1890-1980,” the YMCAs served as cruising grounds for gay men, reaching popularity between 1940 and 1960 (Ibid: 17). He notes that the YMCA’s single-sex environment offered a safe, accessible space for young men to explore their sexual identities (Wrathall 1997: 251). The same was likely true for the YWCA.

Women also actively challenged their Association by “lobby[ing] for increased physical recreation, less rigid residence regulations, and varied entertainment, forcing Association leaders to reexamine the YWCA’s standard of acceptable female behaviour” (Mjagkij and Spratt 1997: 9).}

The passages from the 1913 handbooks cited by Sterne and Auster (pages 26 & 27) suggest that the character of Girl Scouts, in terms of gender- and sex-specific identity and behaviour, was tied to whether they were considered responsible citizens. Sterne observes that by linking character to citizenship and advocating particular behaviours and values within both sites, Girl Scouting blurs the boundaries between public and private spheres. Here she paves the way for other researchers to link curriculum aimed at building character in individual Scouts and curriculum aimed at developing particular kinds of citizens. The analyses of the gendered structure of Scouting discourses in the early part of the twentieth century provided by Heath, Sterne, Auster, and Altman provide valuable historical data for researchers aiming to incorporate gender into an analysis of Girl and Boy Scout programming. Their quotes from early manuals also suggest that there may be evidence that Girl Guides and Girl Scouts organizations were important sites for the production of heterofemininity at the turn of the century. I further consider the development of heteronormative citizens in the next section.
Teaching normative heterofemininity in the post World War II period

Like Heath, above, a number of researchers suggest that sexuality, in addition to gender, is implicated in definitions of responsible citizenship. The research that I cite here focuses on the middle of the twentieth century, which is commonly referred to as the postwar (post World War II) or Cold war period. Like the turn of the century, the postwar period was also characterized by anxiety about the character of adolescents. Mary Louise Adams (1997) notes that during the World War II period, adolescents experienced new freedoms and well-paying jobs. As soldiers returned to their jobs after the war, adolescents faced new restrictions on their lifestyles. Adams writes,

As victory celebrations subsided, Canadians struggled with the changes that war had brought to the homefront. War work had introduced thousands of women and teenagers to relatively lucrative industrial jobs. Many children and teenagers had been free of adult supervision, with fathers in the military and mothers doing war work (19).

Adams further notes that the disruptions caused by attempts to reintegrate communities after the war led to a privileging of domesticity in Canada. Family life, many believed, would shield Canadians from the threat of ‘outside turmoil’ (Ibid: 21).

In The Regulation of Desire: Homo and Hetero Sexualities, Canadian sociologist Gary Kinsman (1996) argues that powerful state and social policies lie behind the “naturalness” of heterosexuality (25). In the immediate postwar period, the state and voluntary organizations developed sexual education programs in an aim to socialize adolescents in “normal” and “healthy” sexual behaviour, constructing heterosexual behaviour as “normal” (and indeed “normalizing” it). Heterosexuality became the dominant framework for talking and teaching about sexual behaviour. Kinsman notes that “although teenagers did rebel against adult restrictions, their cultural forms were generally heterosexual and male-defined. Sexuality was
central to teenage social interaction and culture but in a patriarchal and heterosexual context….” (Ibid: 137).

Similarly, Mary Louise Adams’ research suggests that the state and voluntary organizations in the postwar period were implicated in producing heterosexual citizens. In her book, *The Trouble with Normal: Postwar Youth and the Making of Heterosexuality*, Adams reviews postwar sex education texts, films, and advice columns in an attempt to understand “the processes through which particular forms of heterosexuality were constructed as normal, and therefore socially desirable, in the postwar period in English Canada” (1997: 4). Adams notes that in this period, the development of a heterosexual identity became important for adolescent girls and boys. She writes,

It was not until the postwar period that the process of developing a proper heterosexual identity came to be understood as something that took place before marriage. Not only was teenage sexuality acknowledged – in dozens of advice books and magazine articles on petting and necking – but it was watched and nurtured and guided in socially appropriate directions by sex educators, concerned parents, various civic bodies, and voluntary organizations (Ibid: 10).

Adams’ findings suggest that adolescent sexuality was centrally implicated in the development of (heterosexual) society in the postwar period. Like discourses about youth at the turn of the century, postwar talk emphasized that youth were the future of the nation. Adams writes,

The notion of adolescence as a time of rapid and profound change operated as a funnel for fears about change in the society at large. As the progression of one’s adolescence was seen to determine the shape of one’s adulthood, so, too, the collective progress of adolescents could indicate the shape society would take in the future; youth operated as a metaphor for the development of the society as a whole” (Ibid: 40).

During this period, youth that were delinquent or refused to conform to the prevailing norms in their society were perceived to be “reneging on their responsibility (indeed their privilege) to help build the new society” (Ibid: 55). The conflating of “normal” sexual behaviour with
responsibility and nation building illustrates that the state and members of civil society saw sexual identity, sexual practices, and responsible citizenship as linked.

Adam’s research shows that most discussion around female youth delinquency in the postwar period focused on sexual conduct (Ibid: 59). She stresses that “almost all girl delinquents had been labeled as such because of their sexual or moral behaviour” (Ibid: 63). To socialize young women in “sexually responsible” behaviour, state and extra-state youth service organizations, such as the Children’s Aid Society, tried to find solutions to the delinquency problem by providing supervised recreational activities for youth (Ibid: 55). Books, advice columns, and sex education films also provided scripts for proper behaviour. When it came to sex, these texts stressed the link between heterosexuality and normalcy (Ibid: 91). Adams cites an excerpt from a 1960 Book entitled *Sex and the Adolescent* by journalist Maxine Davis. Davis writes,

> Human beings have always been frightened by phenomena which seem to be unnatural. For example, before they learned something about astronomy they were terrified by the eclipse of the sun by the moon; they thought it was the end of the world. Today, the average healthy adult has a comparable aversion to homosexuality; he [sic] thinks it is a dreadful incurable disease or an unnatural emotional deformity (cited in Adams 1997: 91).

After reading many texts that espoused opinions similar to those of Maxine Davis, Adams concludes that “[t]o be marked as ‘sexually abnormal’ in any way was to throw into question the possibility of achieving or maintaining status as an adult, as a ‘responsible citizen,’ as a valued contributor to the social whole” (Ibid: 166).

Adams’ study is an example of the ways in which texts produced for consumption by youth, such as teen advice columns and sex education films, reflect dominant attitudes toward adolescent sexuality. In addition, her research draws important links between the regulation of

---

12 Supervised recreational activities were thought to be the remedy for delinquent behaviour, which was often attributed to the “bad home life” or “bad neighborhood” of working-class youth (Adams 1997: 57).
adolescent sexuality and the encouragement of particular kinds of citizenship. Like Adams, Canadian scholars Joan Sangster (1996) and Becki Ross (1997, 1998b) have combined the study of gender and sexuality to document the ways in which the state and voluntary organizations in the postwar period attempted to shape young women into heterofeminine citizens by regulating both their gender and sexual behaviour.\textsuperscript{13} While the following examples do not focus specifically on youth service organizations, they help to frame the historical context of state and extra-state efforts to manage young women’s behaviour in the name of responsible citizenship.

In “Incarcerating ‘Bad Girls’: The Regulation of Sexuality through the Female Refuges Act in Ontario, 1920-1945,” historian Joan Sangster (1996) examines case files of young women who were brought before the provincial court under the Ontario Provincial Female Refuges Act. Such files, she argues, “highlight the polarized constructions of good and bad femininity and sexuality created and justified by those with medical and legal authority, and the way in which women were measured against these ideals” (249). Established in 1897, the Female Refuges Act (FRA) was instituted to offer shelter, work, and reform to young women found to be leading an “idle and dissolute life” (Ibid: 240). Many young women believed to be “unmanageable” or “incorrigible” were incarcerated at the Mercer Reformatory for Women in Eastern Ontario. The magistrate, police, and Children’s Aid Society workers claimed that the reformatory would teach discipline, self-control, and improve the young women’s moral character (Ibid: 252). In addition, Sangster argues, such incarceration was a means of moral and sexual regulation used by parents, police, welfare authorities, and the Children’s Aid Society to “regulate the sexual and moral behavior of women perceived to be ‘out of sexual control’” (Ibid: 240).\textsuperscript{14}

\textsuperscript{13} For a discussion of the encouragement of feminine hetero-normativity in women’s sport, see Helen Lenskyj 1990 and 1992.

\textsuperscript{14} For more on female sexuality and delinquency, see Angela McRobbie and Mica Nava (1984).
The most distinguishing feature of the women who were convicted under the FRA, Sangster notes, was youth. Seventy percent were between 16 and 19 years old, and almost all of them were under 21 (Ibid: 248). Also significant is that fact that “almost half of the women either had an illegitimate child or were pregnant with one when they entered the reformatory” (Ibid: 248). In fact, Sangster notes, the majority of incarcerations resulted from (hetero)sexually related behaviour: sexual promiscuity, illegitimate pregnancy, and venereal disease (Ibid: 250).\textsuperscript{15} She concludes that the FRA sentencing reports reflect patriarchal definitions of female sexuality and family. She writes,

> The creation of categories of good and bad girls, and of moral and immoral women, through the raw power of the legal system, proscribed women’s sexuality within the bounds of a gender order defined by hegemonic masculinity and the sanctification of the nuclear, father-headed family (Ibid: 264).

Sangster also shows that attempts to regulate young women’s sexuality were class and race specific, and tied directly to notions of responsible Canadian citizenship. A “lack of ‘Canadian’ values” was blamed for family violence in a case where a young Ukrainian woman was sexually abused by her father and brothers. Sangster quotes from the Parole report:

> “The family are all good hard workers, and money makers. If the living conditions could be made to conform to Canadian standards, no doubt the boys, who have Canadian schooling, would...become good citizens. If [the young woman] can be given confidence in herself, she will be a good, hard working woman. Apathy and moral repression are her biggest problems” (Ibid: 268).

In her conclusion, Sangster compiles a list of the qualities most condemned by the FRA. These include being “willful, stubborn, disobedient to elders and family, overly sexual or easily led to engage in sex, lacking in sexual guilt, having no sense of appropriate sex partners, and disrespectful of marital boundaries with regards to sex” (Ibid: 273). Though Sangster notes that

\textsuperscript{15}Sangster refers very briefly to one case where a young woman was incarcerated at Mercer for “pursuing the girls” at the training school that she previously attended (Sangster 1996: 257).
she assumes that a woman’s proper role would be to act in ways opposite to the behaviours condemned by the FRA, to “assume a position of sexual passivity,” (Ibid: 273) for example, further research could pursue this angle. As Mary Louise Adams notes, “[i]n practice, it is not always easy or even possible to determine which categories are in fact in opposition to each other, to determine the two sides of any particular binary” (1997: 170). Further research is required to discover what particular behaviours were encouraged in the “good” girl during this period.

Similar to Sangster, through her research into the practices of moral regulation at a Toronto charitable organization, Becki Ross found that reform-minded organizations for young women emphasized particular kinds of normative heterofemininity. In “Destaining the (Tattooed) Delinquent Body: The Practices of Moral Regulation at Toronto’s Street Haven, 1965-1969” (1997) and “‘Down at the Whorehouse?’ Reflections on Christian Community Service and Female Sex Deviance at Toronto’s Street Haven, 1965-1969” (1998b), Ross analyzes case files, logs, newsletters and reports generated by the Staff and Board of Directors of a Toronto charitable organization called Street Haven. To “explore the discursive construction of the ‘homeless, wayward street girl’,,” Ross also consulted Canadian newspapers and magazines and interviewed the Street Haven Executive Director, Peggy Ann Walpole, two former Street Haven regulars, and nine former Street Haven volunteer service providers (1997: 562).

Founded with the intention of rehabilitating sex workers, lesbians, and drug users, Street Haven was a refuge that aimed to help the young women who dropped in by providing referrals to retraining courses, methadone treatment, medical services, counseling, and emergency lodging (Ibid.). Within its first year, the Haven had secured funding from the United Church of Canada, the Timothy E. Eaton Company, the Alcohol and Drug Research Foundation, as well as the
municipal government and private donors (1998b: 48). The goal for Street Haven staff, who were primarily white middle class and middle-aged Christian wives and mothers, was to teach the young women to “want better things and [help them] to get them” by encouraging them to sober-up and straighten out (1997: 572). Many of the volunteer staff at the Haven had extensive experience in church and community service, and chose Street Haven in order to do what they called “more meaningful” work. Ross cites former volunteers Harriet O. and Nora S.:

We found that the [United] Church was wanting in its outreach. And we had been through all the women’s groups and the children’s groups and the Sunday Schools, and the Brownies, and the Guides, and the Scouts; we both recognized that the world wasn’t just Church and home, home and church (1998b: 50).

Harriet O. and Nora S. had obviously been involved in various forms of Christian social service in post WWII Toronto, and this may be true for other white middle class and middle-aged Christian wives and mothers. Their statement suggests that their ideas about what it meant to be a responsible female citizen were communicated to a significant number of Toronto youth through a variety of venues, including Girl Guiding.

According to Street Haven Director Peggy Ann Walpole, “eighty to eighty-five percent of the Haven drop-ins were either lesbians or in lesbian relationships” (cited in Ross 1998b: 48). However, lesbian displays of affection were prohibited at the Haven as Haven volunteers believed that lesbian relationships did not last (1997: 583). Instead, Ross writes, from 1965 to 1969, “[Street] Haven staff endeavored to maximize the enterprise of respectable heterosexual femininity, domesticity, and married family life among ‘the poor, down-and-out girls’ in their charge” (Ibid: 563). Efforts to resocialize wayward girls into responsible heterosexual adults, Ross notes, were built upon state-sanctioned discourses of “normal” gender and sexual behaviour. Like the young women at the Mercer Reformatory, Haveners were invited to take a course in “Fashion for Living.” Curriculum for the course covered modeling, art appreciation,
diction, make-up, and posture (Ibid: 576). The staff’s efforts were strongly applied to butch lesbians (whose style included men’s dress pants and short, slicked back hair), who were encouraged to wear dresses and make-up and attend courses in traditionally feminine occupations (Ibid: 576). Ross cites a 1966 interview for the Canadian Register newspaper (Kingston, Ontario) in which Director Peggy Ann Walpole referred to taking twenty-five young women to a movie. The article notes that “[a]ll [were] suitably dressed, even those who usually wear men’s slacks and shirts” and quotes Walpole as saying “[s]ure they looked feminine, they wouldn’t want to disgrace us. Subconsciously, they yearn to return to the square world of acceptance and responsibility” (Ibid: 578).

The staff’s role in the process of gender discipline was not always consciously coercive. As part of a wider regime that encouraged feminine hetero-normative behaviour, Ross notes, “their practices of normalization were more subtle and commonsensical than they were self-consciously punative” (1998b: 56). The quote in the Canadian Register makes clear, however, that according to Street Haven staff the world of acceptance and responsibility was a world in which women appeared feminine and practiced heterosexual relationships. It is also clear that, by changing into feminine dress, women who wore men’s slacks only days or hours before immediately were perceived to be on track to becoming “acceptable” and “responsible.”

Like Sangster, Ross shows that assumptions of responsibility are tied to one’s sexual identity, sexual practices, and feminine appearance. She further demonstrates that the discursive construction of the “wayward street girl” was tied to constructions of normality, abnormality, respectability, and criminality in other sites, including the state. In light of more recent research that links these constructions to substantive citizenship rights (see
chapter III), Ross' research illustrates that Street Haven was one of many extra-state organizations engaged in the regulation of young women's sexuality in the name of responsible citizenship.

Although the institutions investigated in Sangster and Ross' research are part of the historical context in which state and extra-state organizations attempted to manage young women’s behaviour in the name of responsible citizenship, they cannot be considered youth service organizations. Youth service organizations, like the YWCA, CGIT, Girl Guides and Girl Scouts, contain both recreational and educational components aimed at providing wholesome leisure experiences for young women and men of any class or circumstance. Most importantly, unlike the organizations studied by Sangster and Ross, youth service organizations are voluntary – both the leaders and members are involved by (their own or their parents’ or guardians’) choice – and the assumption is that the member is attracted to the organization’s goals and curriculum. Members of youth service organizations do not seek them out as social services, nor are they referred to the youth service organization by a court of law. Next, I consider youth service organizations in the contemporary context.

Girl Guiding and Girl Scouting: Sexuality and citizenship in the contemporary context

The previous sections have shown that nation building in Canada in the twentieth century was facilitated by the efforts of youth-targeted state and extra-state organizations to gain the consent of girls and young women to normative heterofeminine practices in the name of responsible citizenship. Though little research exists that considers youth service organizations in the contemporary context, in this section I review some of the existing literature on Girl Guides and Girl Scouts in the late twentieth century. The two works that I consider are Aniko Varpaotai’s 1994 article on the politicization of the Girl Guides of Canada, and Nancy
Manahan’s 1997 collection of lesbian reflections on their Girl Scout experiences in the United States. In “Women Only and Proud of It! The Politicization of the Girl Guides in Canada,” Varpalotai traces the efforts of the Girl Guides of Canada to defend its position as an exclusively female organization. In November 1990, amid public pressure to admit men as Girl Guide leaders, the Girl Guides National Council issued a statement confirming its single-sex mandate. Drawing on arguments used by all-female institutions such as the Linden School, the Girl Guides of Canada argued that girls and young women learn best when they interact with female mentors in leadership positions.\textsuperscript{16} They publicly stated:

\begin{quote}
We believe strongly that the girls of Canada are best served by a program designed specifically by girls and led by women. Although it is recognized that society is changing, it does not treat males and females equally. There is still a sexist approach to the development of girls and to the contributions that females can make to the society...All female organizations provide women with the opportunity to take executive and leadership positions and thus provide role models for girls... (cited in Varpalotai 1995: 32).
\end{quote}

Like other single-sex institutions, Girl Guides functions under the belief that in co-ed situations girls experience pressure to conform to particular ways of being, and may be excluded or ridiculed for making mistakes. In single-sex organizations, girls and young women talk about issues of interest to them, share the company of other girls and young women, and attempt new skills without fear of failure (Ibid: 32).

\textsuperscript{16} Arguments in support of single-sex schooling cite research by Hall and Sandler (1982) that found that co-educational schools provide a “chilly classroom climate,” where female students are discouraged from participating in class, prevented from seeking help outside class, and have their career aspirations dampened and their self-confidence undermined (Riordan 1990: 10). Single-sex school supporters also argue that co-educational schools reveal a pattern of discrimination against women, where men set educational policy and determine what knowledge is important, male values permeate instruction, and women are unequally represented in text books (Tyack and Hansot 1990:251). Tyack and Hansot note that young women who attend all-girls schools reportedly study harder, display fewer sex-stereotyped attitudes and aspirations, and receive more attention from teachers than young women attending co-educational schools (Tyack and Hansot 1990: 285). For more on this topic, see Rosemary Salomone, 1999.
With this perspective in mind, Varpalotai asks where the Girl Guides of Canada might fit on the “feminist continuum” (Ibid: 14). This question is particularly salient because, citing her own earlier research, Varpalotai notes that while “more than 90 percent of the 63 girls and women interviewed (from all levels of the organization) were in favour of retaining the single-sex membership of the organization, less than half would identify themselves as feminist, or identify with the women’s movement” (Ibid: 15). Varpalotai notes that today’s Girl Guides are encouraged to view high-profile liberal feminists, such as Canadian astronaut Roberta Bondar and former Governor General of Canada Jeanne Sauvé, as role models for good citizenship (Ibid: 15). Other prominent women celebrated by the Guides as good citizens include liberal feminists Michelle Landsberg, a journalist, Barbara MacDougall, former Federal Minister Responsible for the Status of Women, and Sylvia Gold, former president of the Canadian Advisory Council on the Status of Women (Ibid: 17).  

Varpalotai notes that along with restating its commitment to remaining a single-sex organization, the Girl Guides has also reflected on whether its programmes promote equality and inclusiveness by being anti-sexist and accessible to women of colour and poor women (Ibid: 16). She notes that in recent years the organization has become more inclusive in its depictions of diversity within the membership, and has made significant progress in including lower income members, as well as members with disabilities (Ibid: 19). Varpalotai cautions that homophobia is “an issue most discussed privately, and has yet to be addressed explicitly within the organization” (Ibid: 19). She notes that there is a concern “with the homophobic image of lesbian/gay leaders as pedophiles” (Ibid: 19). Because of this perception, as Nancy Manahan

---

17 The Girl Guides’ reverence of these openly liberal feminist women may suggest that the organization is changing, though, as Varpalotai (citing Christine Overall) notes, “the role model may be portrayed an as “exceptional woman” in contrast to the alleged incompetency and weakness ascribed to women in general” (1994: 17).
shows, it is common for lesbian and bisexual members of Girl Guiding to remain closeted within their home councils.

In her introduction to *On My Honor: Lesbians Reflect on Their Scouting Experience*, editor Nancy Manahan (1997) states that her aim in the book was to document the contributions lesbians have made to the Girl Scouts, discuss the impact scouting has had on lesbians, and uncover some of the problems undermining the relationship between lesbians and Scouting. She argues that her book breaks a taboo by revealing lesbians' participation in the organization (3).

Manahan’s book is a compilation of the stories of thirty-three American lesbian women who were and/or are involved in Girl Scouts USA. In the introduction, Manahan refers to the strong homophobia present in many Girl Scout groups. She writes,

> For many years, lesbians in Girl Scouting – as in the larger society – have been warned, explicitly or implicitly, not to reveal their sexual orientation. Bad things would happen if they came out of the closet. Parents would withdraw their girls from the organization. Program directors and camp counselors could lose their jobs. Volunteer leaders could have their troops taken away. Professional Girl Scouts could lose not only their livelihood, but the entire career upon which their lives, their friendship network, and their identity were built (Ibid: 3).

She further argues that the organization not only discourages lesbian members from coming out, but that it actively promotes a heterosexual “lifestyle.” Manahan writes,

> [a]lthough Girl Scouts may not endorse a particular lifestyle, the organization does “permit the advocacy of a personal life style or sexual orientation” as long as it is heterosexual. Recent [Girl Scouts] handbooks discuss heterosexual dating, dealing with boyfriends, and (hetero)sexual questions. Husbands are not only talked about; they may be an integral part of the troop life, participating on camping trips, cookie sales, and other activities” (Ibid: 7, italics in original).

Furthermore, despite its 1980 policy that identifies personal lifestyle and sexual orientation as private matters, Manahan notes that the United States Girl Scout organization refuses to incorporate sexual orientation into its non-discrimination policy. By discouraging lesbian

---

18 Manahan has also co-edited, with Rosemary Curb, a 1985 collection entitled *Lesbian Nuns: Breaking the Silence.*
and bisexual members from being honest about their lives, and encouraging them to pass as heterosexual, Manahan argues, the Girl Scouts of the USA is practicing discrimination (Ibid: 7).

Though Manahan argues that the Girl Scouts promotes heterosexuality, she also suggests that the exclusively female environment fostered her respect for other women, and provided a space free of pressures to date in a heterosexual context. She writes,

Even though I hadn’t realized I was a lesbian during my Girl Scout years, my joy in scouting stemmed partly from being in an all-women environment for at least a week every summer, the only time I didn’t have to cope with men, boys, or the pressure to date. At camp, I met a few counselors who, in retrospect, I think were lesbians although they gave no indication of that by word or action. Those counselors acted as a powerful antidote to the poison of homophobic self-hatred already dripping into my veins.... From those few camp counselors I absorbed the unspoken but reassuring message that being a sexual minority wasn’t so shameful after all (Ibid: 2).

Manahan’s book is one of the first to compile evidence of lesbians’ experiences in Scouting. These stories chronicle the stories of women who have lost their volunteer positions with Girl Scouts USA after coming out, and also tell of women who have fought for, and achieved, acceptance within their troops. Manahan calls for readers of the book to “help the organization... take the next steps in treating its lesbian youth and adults with integrity” (Ibid: 10).

Conclusion

This review of literature has made clear that notions of responsibility and, in particular, notions of responsible citizenship, have been tied to representations of normative heterofemininity in some sites. The state, reform institutions, social services organizations, and youth service organizations appear to operate with particular ideas of what it means to be a good female citizen in Canada. As Sarah Heath (1997), Wendy Sterne (1993), Carol Auster (1985) and Karen Altman (1990) show, youth service organizations at the turn of the century encouraged heterofeminine characteristics thought to embody responsibility. Mary
Louise Adams (1997), Joan Sangster (1996), and Becki Ross (1997, 1998b) provide evidence that shows how, in the post World War II period, reformatory and social service organizations for young Canadian women perceived feminine dress and heterosexual identity and heterosexual practices as signs of acceptability and respectability. These services tied young women’s feminine appearance and heterosexual practices to responsible citizenship.\(^{19}\) Aniko Varpalotai (1994) and Nancy Manahan (1997), in their research on Girl Guides and Girl Scouts, respectively, show that while the organizations support an exclusively female atmosphere that facilitates same-sex interaction, they have remained silent about homophobia and heterosexism when teaching about responsible citizenship. These authors show that the organizations have some distance to travel before claiming to be fully inclusive organizations.

My research will build upon, extend, and, in some cases, challenge the literature provided here by considering the Girl Guides of Canada in the contemporary context. By focusing on the Pathfinder branch of the Girl Guides from 1979-1999, I will further investigate the prescriptions and practices of one very powerful youth service organization. I also extend my discussion to consider the theoretical notion of responsible citizenship. As Nancy Manahan states, “[t]he fundamental stance of the [American Girl Scouts] organization is that sexual orientation is not an issue; appropriate behaviour is” (1997: 5). In the next chapter, I consider why the state and voluntary organizations might be interested in normalizing heterosexuality as appropriate and responsible behaviour.

\(^{19}\) As I will discuss later in this thesis, prescriptions for feminine dress and other markers of respectability are class-based.
Chapter III

Producing the people: Citizenship, moral regulation, and the discursive construction of responsibility

To consider why the state and voluntary organizations might be interested in encouraging heterosexuality as a responsible behaviour, I need to integrate theories of citizenship and nation building with theories of moral regulation. I spend the first part of this chapter discussing the principles behind liberal citizenship theory, as espoused by British citizenship theorist T.H. Marshall (1992 [1949]). I then refer to Nira Yuval-Davis and Floya Anthias (1989) and Jacqui Alexander (1997) to discuss feminist responses to this theory, with a focus on the ways in which states have historically constructed select women as transmitters of culture and biological producers for the nation. To inform this discussion, I draw on Yasmeen Abu-Laban (1998) and David Held’s (1991) concept of substantive citizenship and David Evans’ (1994), Jeffrey Weeks’ (1998), and Lauren Berlant’s (1997) concept of sexual citizenship to show that liberal citizenship theory does not account for differentiated citizenship rights based in sexism, racism, and heterosexism.

In this chapter, I also consider nation building and theories of social control and moral regulation. Here I focus on the debate about whether the state is a primary agent of social control. Stanley Cohen (1989), Joan Sangster (1996), and Carolyn Strange and Tina Loo (1997) note that social control theories do not account for the patterns of accommodation and resistance expressed in people’s everyday lives. They argue that theories of moral regulation are best able to account for methods of regulation employed in sites outside the state, such as youth service organizations. To inform this debate, I introduce the Foucauldian concept of “normalization” as a process through which the state and voluntary organizations attempt to gain consent to particular ways of being.
In the last part of this chapter, I discuss discourses of respectability and responsible citizenship by drawing on Beverly Skeggs (1997). I also discuss discourse analysis as a research method by drawing on Michel Foucault (1990 [1978]) and Mary Louise Adams (1997). I conclude this section by showing how I will use discourse analysis as a strategy in my own research.

**Liberal citizenship theory**

To explore citizenship and nation building in the context of Girl Guiding, it is useful to review some of the major assumptions and critiques of citizenship theories. Contemporary Canadian citizenship policies build from theory developed by British sociologist T.H. Marshall in a 1949 essay entitled “Citizenship and Social Class.” Marshall’s liberal citizenship theory, which challenges conservative ideas of citizenship rights and responsibilities, categorizes citizenship into civil, political, and social rights. Civil rights refer to one’s right to justice, right to own property, and right to freedom of speech, thought, and faith. Political rights refer to one’s right to vote, join a political party and run for office. Social rights include a right to economic welfare, and to live “the life of a civilized being according to the standards prevailing in the society” (Marshall 1992: 8).

By introducing the concept of “social rights,” Marshall greatly contributed to theories of citizenship prevalent at the time and, many would argue, set the stage for the end of class-based exclusion. He did not, however, recognize the inequalities of citizenship arising from heterocentric, patriarchal, and racist social relations (Thobani 1998: 59). Marshall, like many conservative citizenship theorists, believed that citizenship should be universal and equal for all in return for equal duties. He considered one’s status as a citizen to be unaffected by one’s

---

20 Some critics called Marshall’s theory “socialist” because of its emphasis on social welfare. For more on Marshall, see Thobani 1998.
gender, race, and sexual identity. This perspective is based on two assumptions: that everyone has equal rights under the law so there is no need to discuss anyone as a separate group, and that citizenship is about the public, common, and general, while a person’s identity is private, personal, and particular.

**Substantive citizenship**

In recent years, social theorists have shown that there is more to citizenship than the civil, political, and social rights posited by Marshall. Yasmeen Abu-Laban (1998) and David Held (1991) use the term "substantive citizenship" in reference to qualities that fall outside civil, political, and social definitions of citizenship. Abu-Laban defines substantive citizenship as involving "pressing issues relating to the equality of rights and opportunities; treatment and life conditions; and, not least, participatory involvement that ought to come from holding formal citizenship" (1998: 70). Expanding on this, David Held points to the difference between formal and substantive citizenship. He writes,

The citizen may formally enjoy ‘equality before the law’ but, important though this unquestionably is, does he or she also have the capacities (the material and cultural resources) to choose between different courses of action in practice? Do existing relations between men and women, between employers and employees, between the different social classes, between blacks, whites and other ethnic groups, allow citizenship to become a reality in practice (1991: 22)?

The concept of substantive citizenship is a useful place to begin theorizing about citizenship and sexuality. Within the context of substantive citizenship, British social theorists David Evans (1994) and Jeffrey Weeks (1998) developed a concept called “sexual citizenship.”21 Weeks notes that traditional definitions of citizenship espoused by theorists like Marshall are not entirely relevant in the contemporary context because contemporary social and political relationships are characterized by a blurring of the public/private divide that was the foundation of social life just

---

21 Also see Iris Marion Young (1990, 2000).
decades ago (1998: 36). This blurring of boundaries is exemplified in lesbian, gay, bisexual, and transgender rights movements that have brought sexual identity to the fore in public life. The idea of sexual citizenship fills a gap in traditional theories of citizenship and contributes to theories of substantive citizenship by identifying sexual identity as a category of analysis. Weeks writes,

The notion of sexual or intimate citizenship, then, is an attempt to remedy the limitations of earlier notions of citizenship, to make the concept more comprehensive. But it simultaneously requires us to accommodate different analytical categories: not only class, not even just gender and race, but also the impact of the heterosexual/homosexual binarism (Sedgwick, 1990), the institutionalization of heterosexuality (Richardson 1996, 1998), and the question of equity and justice for emergent ‘sexual minorities’, of whom the lesbian and gay communities are most vocal, organized and challenging (Herman, 1994; Wilson, 1995; Rayside, 1998). The idea of sexual citizenship has many features in common with other claims to citizenship. It is about enfranchisement, about inclusion, about belonging, about equity and justice, about rights balanced by new responsibilities (1998: 39).

The idea of sexual citizenship directly implicates the body, long considered private and personal, in the public realm. The body not only becomes the subject of public debate over appropriate forms of citizenship, but is also used to mobilize new expressions of citizenship. American citizenship theorist Lauren Berlant writes,

Every day, in ordinary, banal ways, members of the politically distressed populations of the United States - for example, women, queer people, people of color, and the indecorous of any, especially lower, class - get humiliatingly named and reduced to their stereotypic embodiment during moments of distraction or preoccupation. (1997: 88)

Moments of distraction or preoccupation, Berlant notes, occur when one experiences catcalls on the street or when something on television reminds one that her stereotyped embodied identity is one that is despised or thought to be disgusting (1997: 88). One mobilizes her own expressions of citizenship against these stereotypes by invoking her body in struggles for recognition as a full citizen. Berlant notes that organizations such as Queer Nation, which furiously promotes the
visibility of lesbians, gays, and bisexuals in all facets of public life, reveal the link between the sexual body and citizenship. She writes,

Queer Nation’s outspoken promotion of a national sexuality not only discloses that mainstream national identity touts a subliminal sexuality more official than a state flower or national bird, but also makes explicit how thoroughly the local experience of the body is framed by laws, policies, and social customs regulating sexuality (1997: 148).

Arguments about sexuality and citizenship build from earlier feminist theorizing and activism that showed the ways in which the gendered body is implicated in particular definitions of responsible citizenship. In the following section, I show how gender, sexuality, race, and class intersect to construct some women as biological producers and cultural transmitters for the nation.

**Citizenship theory: Gender and sexuality**

Most critiques of liberal citizenship theory have focused on class (Barbalet 1988), ethnicity (Kymlicka 1995), and nationality (Spinner 1994) to point out that some citizens are more equal than others. Only recently, scholars like Abu-Laban, Held, Evans, Weeks, and Berlant have brought issues of gender and sexuality to the fore. Like them, Nira Yuval-Davis, Floya Anthias, Becki Ross, and M. Jacqui Alexander argue that one’s status as a citizen is affected by her gender and sexual identity. These scholars point out the various ways that state and civil discourses construct women as embodiments of the nation. In their 1989 edited volume *Woman-Nation-State*, Nira Yuval-Davis and Floya Anthias compiled articles that detail the ways in which women are constructed as reproducers of the nation. They note five ways that women participate in ethnic and national processes and in relation to state practices:

---

22 Also see Shane Phelan’s new book (2001) *Sexual Strangers: Gays, Lesbians, and Dilemmas of Citizenship* for a discussion of the sexual body in relation to citizenship. Though I digress from other theory in this chapter with this tangent about the body, I alert the reader to the importance of considering ways in which citizenship is (permitted to be) embodied by various members of a state.
a) as biological reproducers
b) as reproducers of boundaries of groups (gate-keepers)
c) as ideological reproducers and transmitters of culture (as main socializers of children)
d) as signifiers of ethnic/nation difference
e) as participants in national, economic, political, and military struggle (1989: 7).

For the purposes of this thesis, I am concerned only with practices a) women as biological reproducers of and for the nation, and c) women as reproducers and transmitters of culture. Two examples illustrate these practices. In “Women, Nation and the State in Australia,” Marie de Lepervanche (1989) demonstrates that Australian women in the early twentieth century were symbolized as breeders of the nation and keepers of communal boundaries (1989: 12). She cites a poem from a poetry competition held in 1938 to celebrate the 150th anniversary of Phillip’s landing:

Ye girls of British race
Famous for your beauty
Breed fast in all your grace
For this is your duty.
As Anzac gave in war
So daughters at your call
Will quick respond the more
To replace those that fall (de Lepervanche 1989: 46-47).

Similarly, Lesley Caldwell (1989), studying the transition from fascism to democracy in post World War II Italy, cites a statement made in the session of the Prima Sottocommissione during the 1946 Constituent Assembly discussions on the Constitution. This statement also constructs women as mothers of the nation.

Protection for mothers mean protection for society at its roots because around the mother, the family is established and through the mother, society’s future is guaranteed... (Caldwell 1989: 175).

Though statements like these show that women are frequently called upon to “mother” the nation both literally and figuratively, Yuval-Davis, Anthias, Ross (1998) and Jacqui Alexander (1997) also argue that women’s race and ethnicity, class, sexuality, and political affiliations
affect the extent to which the state recruits them for such tasks. For example, M. Jacqui Alexander argues that nation building practices rely on heterosexuality. She writes,

[n]o nationalism could survive without heterosexuality – criminal, perverse, temporarily imprisoned, incestuous or as abusive as it might be, nationalism needs it. It still remains more conducive to nation-building than same-sex desire, which is downright hostile to it, for women presumably cannot love themselves, love other women, and love the nation simultaneously (1997: 83).

Citizenship rights, Alexander argues, are premised on the privileging of heterosexuality and the subordination of people with alternate sexual identities. She and Chandra Talpade Mohanty note that

both postcolonial and advanced capitalist/colonial states organize and reinforce a cathectic structure based in sexual difference (i.e., heterosexuality), which they enforce through a variety of means, including legislation. In almost all instances, however, these states conflate heterosexuality with citizenship and organize a “citizenship machinery” in order to produce a class of loyal heterosexual citizens and a subordinated class of sexualized, nonprocreative, noncitizens, disloyal to the nation, and, therefore, suspect (1997: xxiii).

Historical sociologist Becki Ross agrees. She notes that “…nation and citizenship have been largely premised within parameters of hegemonic masculinity and naturalized heterosexuality” (1998: 188). Because they were historically positioned outside the parameters of what experts termed “normality,” Ross argues that lesbians, gay men, and bisexuals could not be included as full-fledged citizens of the Canadian nation (Ibid: 193). Ross refers to Benedict Anderson when she encourages researchers to investigate nation building practices. She writes,

Exploring the ways in which people construct their ‘imagined communities’ can tell us much about how they locate themselves in relation to others and where they draw the lines between [among, and within] groups (Ibid: 189).

In the next section, I reflect on the role of the state and voluntary organizations in nation building practices. I also consider theories of social control and moral regulation to
understand how state and extra state organizations attempt to gain the consent of citizens to particular definitions of responsible citizenship.

**Constructing citizens**

It is useful here to employ Benedict Anderson’s (1983) notion of the “imagined community.” To illustrate that both the state and members of the nation are involved in the production and reproduction of national communities, Anderson shows in his book, *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*, that nations and nation states are “imagined communities,” whose national unity and national interests are shaped by national elites into a “national consciousness”. Referring to Anderson’s work, Eva Mackey (2000) notes that “[nations] do not emerge spontaneously from some primordial source, but are shared fictions created and maintained through media, education, cultural products and government programs” (125). Similarly, in *Race, Nation, Class: Ambiguous Identities*, Etienne Balibar (1991) argues that members of nations are implicated in processes of “nationalization,” which ensure the ongoing existence of that nation. The fundamental problem of the nation, Balibar argues, is to produce the people. More exactly, it is to make the people produce itself continually as national community. Or again, it is to produce the effect of unity by virtue of which the people will appear, in everyone’s eye, ‘as a people’…. (94).

Although Anderson and Balibar refer to nations and nation states constructed on the basis of a shared ethnicity, their arguments can be applied to multi-ethnic states such as Canada. Mackey, for example, argues that nation building in Canada depends on a two-fold project: both managing the diverse peoples of the country, and imagining and creating a national identity (2000: 125).²³

---

²³ See Mackey (2000) for further discussion of the imagining of Canada as a “Northern Kingdom” to differentiate the country from southern peoples as well as from the United States. Such construction relied heavily on sexist and racist ideology.
To accomplish the construction of a shared national identity, the state relies on civil society and civic institutions. Yuval-Davis and Anthias define civic institutions as:

[t]hose institutions, collectivities, groupings and social agonies [sic] which lie outside the formal rubric of state parameters... but which both informs and is informed by them.... These produce their own ideological content as well as being subjected to those of the state (1997: 5).

Mariana Valverde notes that the work of civil institutions is central to the development of national citizens. She argues that a state “can only make its citizens *internalize* certain values if it has the full and active co-operation of the family and of voluntary organizations” (1991: 25).

In her book on the social purity movement in turn-of-the-century English Canada, Valverde asserts that the national project to ensure the moral character of the Canadian population depended on, and was facilitated by, voluntary organizations. She writes,

> Indeed, there are very good reasons why liberal-democratic states, far from desiring to absorb all social policy activity, have a vested interest in fostering non-state organizations that will co-operate in certain aspects of social policy, particularly in areas such as regulating morality and gender and family relations. Except in situations such as war or internal rebellion, explicitly moral campaigns are difficult for liberal democratic states to undertake with any degree of success, since such states portray themselves as neutral arbiters of opinions circulating in civil society (Ibid: 25).

Valverde continues by noting that regulating morality in the early twentieth century was thus a task “the state could not possible [sic] have carried out; voluntary organizations played the starring role in the campaign to reconstruct the inner selves, and in particular the sexual/moral identity, of Canadians” (Ibid: 32).

Learning to become citizens also involves learning about appropriate gender and sexual behaviour. Through their research on post World War II British citizenship textbooks, Patrick Brindle and Madeline Arnot (1999) found that notions of citizenship and polity were strongly gendered. Of the 22 texts that they analyzed, Brindle and Arnot found that 15 texts represented women as participants in domestic life and men as participants in public life. Typically, these
texts emphasized the role of women as mothers and guardians of young children and noted that the whole world lies open to boys (1999: 111). Similarly, Debbie Epstein and Richard Johnson (1998) note that children learn acceptable sexual behaviour through schools and sex education texts. They argue that sexual identities “are formed in schools whether they have elaborated sex education programmes or not” (1998: 194). Furthermore, they argue, schools act as socializers of sexuality because it is present in both the formal and informal curriculum. These are just two extra-state mechanisms of nation building. In the next section, I review two theories that attempt to explain the process through which nation building is accomplished. I then consider the discursive concept of responsible citizenship.

**Theories of social control**

To explain the control and regulation of citizens’ behaviour, and young women’s sexuality in particular, two general theories have emerged. The first, developed in the late nineteenth century, is known as the social control theory. According to this perspective, the state, the legal system, capitalism, and patriarchy coerce citizens into particular behaviours. These forces, acting through the state, use social control as a means through which to meet their interests. For example, a social control theorist might say that the state is interested in controlling a young woman’s choice of sexual partner to ensure her heterosexual marriage, which would, in turn, result in offspring who would serve the economic future of the nation. Social control is achieved through mechanisms of the state, such as immigration and marriage laws, policies, and military force.

For decades, the social control theory drove the direction of research for many scholars and activists. By placing the state and bourgeois power holders at the centre, academics and activists had a clear target at which to direct their appeals for more progressive policies and laws.
Also, as Joan Sangster notes, putting the state at the centre of power contributed to an understanding of social structure by identifying a key player in the organization of power relations (1996: 243). Citing Nicole Rafter, Sangster further notes that late versions of social control theory began to wrestle with the question of how powerful groups attempt to restrain the behaviour of the less powerful, and how less powerful people then come to restrain and monitor their own behaviour (Ibid: 243).

In a 1989 article critical of social control theory, social theorist Stanley Cohen argued that theories of social control are essentialist in that they reduce all expressions of power to the coercive control of the state. The state is perceived as an active and autonomous force whose interests are served through the means and ends of social control. The state is also perceived as panopticonal and omnipotent (348-351). Social control, Cohen notes, is always seen in “sinister, negative, and pejorative terms,” and is expected to be increasing daily (Ibid: 350, 351). Cohen argues that by focusing on the state, social control theories do not take into account extra-state sites of primary and informal social control, such as the family, community, public opinion, or the market (Ibid: 353). McKee further notes that by not accounting for extra-state agents of regulation, theories of social control do not see that power and control operate in various sites at the same time. For example, McKee argues that the social control thesis is not enlightening because social control is not deliberate, is not different from routine socialization processes, and, most importantly for my project, is not applicable to voluntary youth organizations because it does not recognize them as agents of control (1992: 12). Asking questions about the nature of social control illustrates the nebulous character of power. Asking about who is doing the social control, what is being controlled, and what is the supposed aim of doing this, Cohen argues, will produce neither the coherent social essence nor the unambiguous political messages that were once promised. It will reveal fragments – shifting strategies and alliances,

Many researchers lost faith in the social control hypothesis not only because it posited the state as centre, but because it did not correspond with information many gained through their research. Thanks to critical advances in research methods, academics have increasingly engaged in dialogue with respondents who disagree with the idea that they are mere pawns in a game. Sangster, for example, notes that the state and the law are not all-powerful institutions, but rather the product of struggles among citizens (1996: 242). This perspective is significantly informed by theories of power developed by the late French philosopher Michel Foucault.

In 1978, Foucault published the first volume of *The History of Sexuality*, in which he suggests that power is not wielded by only one agent for only one goal but is instead “exercised from innumerable points in the interplay of nonegalitarian and mobile relations” (1990 [1978]: 94). Foucault further states that he is not convinced that the social control of sexuality is motivated by a need to reproduce labour capacity and perpetuate the social order. Moreover, he suggests that the power used to wield social control is fully located neither in the state nor in the law, but in various social and political spheres and wielded by various agents. Foucault writes,

> It seems to me that power must be understood in the first instance as the multiplicity of force relations immanent in the sphere in which they operate and which constitute their own organization; as the process which, through ceaseless struggles and confrontations, transforms, strengthens, or reverses them; as the support which these force relations find in one another, thus forming a chain or a system, or on the contrary, the disjunctions and contradictions which isolate them from one another; and lastly, as the strategies in which they take effect, whose general design or institutional crystallization is embodied in the state apparatus, in the formulation of the law, in the various social hegemonies (Ibid: 93).

Drawing from Foucault, social and political theorists have increasingly argued that power is multidimensional and complex. As more and more researchers and theorists came to recognize the various agents active in the regulation of behaviour, social control theories
were labeled essentialist, determinist, and conspiratorial (Sangster 1996: 242). A new theory of moral regulation has taken shape, and, in my view, offers a fruitful avenue to understand the regulation of sexuality. As I will show below, theories of moral regulation take into account the role of extra-state organizations, such as the Pathfinder branch of the Girl Guides of Canada, in regulating the sexual identities and behaviours of young women. Furthermore, moral regulation theories urge me to ask about how Pathfinders negotiate with and integrate the varied messages they receive about sexuality.

**Theories of moral regulation**

Theories of moral regulation attempt to account for and understand the regulation of behaviour, not only by considering the role of the state, but also by considering the ways in which people regulate their own and others' behaviour. For example, moral regulation theorists, and feminist Foucaultian theorists in particular, have shown that “medical, social science, and legal discourses criminalize and pathologize certain women” (Sangster 1996: 243) while other women, as shown above, are heralded as keepers of the nation. In this way, moral regulation is involved in the control of women’s sexuality – procreative sex that supports Christian, White, middle-class, heterosexual values is declared moral, while other expressions of sexuality are declared immoral, and bad for the nation.²⁴ Sangster defines *moral regulation* as “the processes whereby some behaviors, ideals, and values [are] marginalized and proscribed while others [are] legitimimized and naturalized” (1996: 241). In contrast to social control theories, Sangster argues, theories of moral regulation enable us to locate the regulation and normalization of particular

²⁴ Morality can be defined as the rules, values, customs, and expectations by which we live. Definitions of “the moral” are historically constituted and socially constructed through social institutions such as government and religion. As White European Christian imperialists colonized much of the world, they brought with them ideas of what constitutes the moral, and marginalized people and behaviours (often on the basis of gender, race, class, sexuality, and ability) that they considered to be immoral. Contemporary definitions of morality reflect many of their ideas.
acts, values, and attitudes in a historical context while taking into account people’s “patterns of resistance, struggle, and accommodation as well as control” (Ibid: 245). Similarly, in their 1997 book *Making Good: Law and Moral Regulation in Canada, 1867-1939*, Carolyn Strange and Tina Loo argue the importance of considering the inconsistencies, contradictions, and resistance involved in regulating morality (10). They deny the primacy of the state in regulating behavior, arguing instead that the federal government is one of many institutions implicated in regulating the moral life of the nation (Ibid: 59). In fact, as Foucault has emphasized, any analysis of regulation must not assume a general system of domination (1990 [1978]: 92). Instead, we must recognize that medical, juridical, pedagogical, and administrative discourses all contribute to the regulation of morality. These discourses interact to construct complex social relationships.

For example, in considering legal discourses, Sangster writes,

... penal punishment becomes part of a broader system of moral regulation within the larger cultural formation by normalizing some behaviors, pathologizing others, and setting out definitions of good/bad, abnormal/normal for all of society (1996: 273).

A number of materialist feminists, such as Nancy Hartstock (1990) and Karlene Faith (1994), have been critical of moral regulation theories, arguing that discourses are not actors and that locating multiple sites of power obscures the processes of control, or regulation. Sangster suggests that to find the actors it is important to “know which social groups promoted, used, and endorsed [the] regulation, why, and how their consent was secured” (Ibid: 244). Sangster notes that expressions of power occur at both the discursive level (by normalizing and pathologizing behaviours) and at a tangible level (through legal and economic policies that privilege some groups over others). In this way, the state and civic institutions continue to be central sites of power and moral regulation (Ibid: 245).

Drawing from Foucault, Sangster and Adams argue that moral regulation occurs through a process called "normalization." Normalization is achieved through the production of "expert" knowledge and discourses about normality that cross boundaries between the state and civil society (Sangster 1999: 242). The dissemination of "expert" knowledge enables people to regulate their own behaviour, according to standards of normality developed by "experts." Adams argues that normalization operates as deviance-prevention mechanism, where

Individuals are encouraged, through a variety of discursive and institutional practices, to meet normative standards, and they come to desire the rewards that meeting those standards make possible. In this way individuals become self-regulating (1997: 13).

Through the process of normalization, Adams argues, moral regulation occurs through everyday gendered and sexualized practices rather than through coercive social sanctions. Normalization "masks difference under an illusion of social unity" and "defines and limits the choices available to us" (Ibid: 15, 13). For example, if heterosexuality is revered and validated, while same-sex sex is punishable by law, social ostracism, or by its definition as abnormal, fears of punishment or of not fitting in can inhibit one's expression of self. For Adams, "[i]t's in this most insidious way that moral regulation limits the number of acceptable or possible social identities that we can take on, all the while making this situation of reduced opportunity appear natural" (Ibid: 15).

Drawing from theories of moral regulation, my thesis will attend to one site - the Pathfinder branch of the Girl Guides of Canada - where normative discourses about responsible citizenship are used to encourage particular forms of responsible behaviour in 12-15 year-old girls and young women. In the next section, I consider the discourse of responsible citizenship by drawing on Beverly Skeggs' work on respectability. I also discuss how I will use discourse analysis as a research strategy.
The discourse of responsible citizenship

Studying notions of responsible citizenship requires that I treat “responsibility” as a discursive concept that both organizes and reflects social relations. Discourses can be defined as “the particular scientific and specialist language(s), and associated ideas and social outcomes that, according to Foucault, must be seen as a major phenomenon of social power and not simply a way of describing the world” (Jary and Jary 1991: 124). Adams defines discourses as “organized systems of knowledge that make possible what can be spoken about and how one may speak about it” (1997: 6). Citing Foucault, Adams argues that discourses “act as grids for the perception and evaluation of things” (Ibid: 6) and notes that material factors enable some discourses to become more powerful than others. An important part of discourse analysis, Adams argues, is to determine “which discourses are operating when and how and in what configurations” (Ibid: 6).

To consider responsibility as a discursive concept, I draw from Beverly Skeggs’ 1997 book *Formations of Class and Gender: Becoming Respectable*. Though “respectability” is not the same as “responsibility,” both terms refer to appropriate behaviour and acceptability. Respectability refers to one’s worthiness of respect, while the term “responsibility” adds to this a connotation of accountability. To be responsible implies that one is moral and rational (thus respectable) and can therefore answer to her actions. Skeggs’ work provides a starting place for analysis of this complex term.

Skeggs’ book is a culmination of 12 years of participant observation in Britain where she used the concept of respectability as an analytical tool to discover how subjectivities are constructed across a range of different sites. She considers the concept of respectability in the context of a British community care course, where working class women were taught
caring skills.²⁶ The construction of a caring subjectivity, Skeggs notes, involves the conflation of caring for with caring about, "in which the practices of caring become inseparable from the personal dispositions" (1997: 56). She concludes that caring means not only having the right skills but also being the right sort of person (Ibid: 68).

Students in the community care course were taught caring by taking part in projects that required them to present catalogue cut-outs of ideal families and discuss classifications of problem families (Ibid: 64). Evaluating the practices of non-caring others, Skeggs argues, allowed caring to be "displayed as a performance of moral superiority" and served to facilitate the students' development of a caring subjectivity (Ibid: 72). Hygiene, Skeggs notes, was held up to be "a strong signifier of respectability and of good caring practice" (Ibid: 65). Other qualities students associated with good caring practice included being warm, understanding, kind and loving, considerate about others, reliable, sympathetic, clean, tidy, and never cruel or nasty (Ibid: 68). For the women in the community care course, becoming a caring person also involved displaying selflessness. One proved herself as respectable and responsible through her caring performance for others (Ibid: 64). Skeggs writes, "[t]he display of selflessness is crucial to their production of their caring selves. Their self is for others" (Ibid: 65).

Race, sexuality, gender, and class Skeggs argues, combine to produce a "respectable" body (Ibid: 84). The respectable female body, she suggests, is "White, desexualized, heterofeminine and usually middle class" (Ibid: 82). As a discourse of normativity, respectability is "one way in which sexual practice is evaluated [and] distinctions drawn [and] legitimated and

²⁶ Skeggs notes that this course prepares students for familial caring, unpaid community care and, potentially, low-paid caring jobs. She writes that "[t]his framework of association between caring, respectability, regulation, and investment provides the basis through which the women move through other identifications, such as sexuality and femininity . . ." (1997: 54).
maintained between groups” (Ibid: 118). Skeggs draws on Lynda Hart (1994) to show that heterosexuality has historically been associated with middle class respectability while lesbianism and bisexuality were associated with “others,” namely women of colour and working class women. Skeggs writes that the “lesbian subject has been defined as perverse, deviant, dangerous and contaminating and most definitely not respectable” (Ibid: 122). In the community care course that she studied, heterosexuality was not only assumed (and thus institutionalized) in discussions of proper caring but also actively encouraged through “discussion and inclusion of marriage as a topic across the curriculum” (Ibid: 125). Because notions of respectability are linked to one’s social status, Skeggs argues that people strongly invest in particular expressions of respectability. As long as heterosexuality continues to be a marker of respectability (in legal, state-administrative and pedagogical discourses), she argues, “it will always induce investments from those positioned at a distance from it and pathologized as a result” (Ibid: 136).

Like Skeggs, I aim to discover how consent to particular definitions of responsible citizenship is gained by analyzing the content of one particular programme – the Pathfinder programme of the Girl Guides of Canada. In the next section, I discuss discourse analysis as a research method and show how I will use it to understand the ways in which gender, sexuality, class, race, and ability intersect and interrelate in definitions of responsibility in Pathfinder texts.

**Methods**

The values, standards, and attitudes of an organization are frequently expressed by means of verbal communication, be it through written or spoken words, or in the texts that they produce. In my thesis, I will attempt to make sense of the ways in which responsible citizenship is defined in one particular site – the Pathfinder branch of the Girl Guides of Canada - by identifying the qualities that are associated with responsible citizenship in Pathfinder handbooks.
and Pathfinder Guider's manuals. To do this, I will use discourse analysis as a method of research. Discourse analysis will enable me to identify how consent to particular definitions of responsible citizenship is produced through Pathfinder curriculum.

There are two methods commonly used to analyze text: content analysis and discourse analysis. According to a popular sociological dictionary, content analysis is usually associated with quantitative research that aims to objectively and systematically study communication content such as texts, film, and advertisements (Jary and Jary 1991: 82). Jary and Jary explain that it "involves charting or counting the incidence, or coincidence, of particular items belonging to a set of (usually) predetermined categories" (Ibid.). This method would enable me to count and categorize references to responsible citizenship as they appear in Pathfinder handbooks and Pathfinder Guider's manuals. Content analysis would not, however, direct me toward discovering what meanings are associated with responsible citizenship, nor would it require that I link the definitions to wider social and historical processes, like nation building in Canada.

Discourse analysis, on the other hand, encourages the researcher to discover associations between the content of an item and socio-historical processes that occur simultaneously in different sites. An important aspect of discourse analysis is the taking-into-account of expressions of power. It asks whose interests are served by these definitions and how are these definitions negotiated by the producers and consumers of this item? Using discourse analysis in my research enables me to go beyond categorizing data to discover how definitions of responsible citizenship are produced, reproduced, and negotiated in Pathfinder texts. Furthermore, as Foucault notes, discourse analysis enables one to uncover how discourses are used to support power relations (1990 [1978]: 97).
An important part of my discourse analysis will be to historicize the concepts that will be analyzed. In the preceding chapter, I reviewed existing literature that shows how notions of responsibility and responsible citizenship have been constructed through state and extra-state youth services throughout the twentieth century. A second part of this project will involve locating patterns relating to the concept of responsibility to discover what (personal) beliefs and behaviours, particularly around young women's sexuality, are taught, in Pathfinder texts, to constitute (public) responsible Canadian citizenship. I hope that my analysis will illuminate how the Girl Guides of Canada is implicated in the process of moral regulation in its attempts to gain the consent of its members to particular definitions of responsibility. Specifically, I will locate terms and qualities that appear in conjunction with references to responsible citizenship, with particular regard for references to gender, sexuality, class, race, and ability. I will also comment on changes in the terms and qualities associated with responsible citizenship by comparing data from the texts over time. In addition to an analysis of 10 Pathfinder handbooks and 6 Pathfinder Guider's manuals, I will also consult related primary materials, such as National Council meeting minutes, Girl Guides of Canada Annual Reports, and Girl Guides of Canada Policy, Organization, and Rules publications for supplementary information.

Limitations

Because the proposed research only deals with texts, it will be limited by its inability to address the ways in which Girl Guide members and leaders consumed the Pathfinders curriculum. Archives and manuals tell us what was intended to happen during Pathfinders meetings, but do not tell us what actually happened in those meetings nor about the meanings that Pathfinders (girls and young women aged 12-15) made of the curriculum. Readers do not all share the same background, experiences, and identities, so texts are not read the same way by
everyone. Also, by focusing only on texts, I will be unable to gauge Pathfinders’ patterns of resistance to and negotiation of the definitions of responsible citizenship that appear in Pathfinder handbooks and manuals. My research is thus limited to only one side of the discourses (the text) about responsible citizenship in the Pathfinder curriculum. The information that I learn and conclusions that I draw from this discourse analysis will, however, serve as preparation and a necessary foundation for subsequent ethnographic research on the Pathfinders.

Conclusion

In this chapter I have considered some of the assumptions of liberal citizenship theory and referred to various critiques of these assumptions. By identifying how gender and sexuality are implicated in citizenship rights, Abu-Laban, Held, Evans, Weeks, and Berlant have shown the need for a more comprehensive definition of citizenship that considers the ways in which citizenship rights are differentiated according to one’s social status. Moreover, as shown by Yuval-Davis, Anthias, Alexander, and Ross, definitions of responsible citizenship are often tied to particular gendered and sexualized ways of being. Some women are held up as transmitters of culture and biological producers for the nation, while others are vilified as non-citizens.

To understand the processes through which consent to particular definitions of responsible citizenship is won, I have considered theories of social control and moral regulation. While social control theories enable us to locate power in the hands of the state, theories of moral regulation encourage us to consider the ways in which extra-state institutions attempt to regulate citizens’ behaviour. Theories of moral regulation also urge us to consider the ways in which people resist and negotiate attempts to regulate their behaviour.

Because it is necessary for my project that I treat responsible citizenship as a discursive concept, in this chapter I explored similar work by Beverly Skeggs. I also clarified the term
discourse and discussed how I will use discourse analysis as a research strategy. In the next two chapters, I provide an analysis and discussion of the Pathfinder curriculum, with attention to the ways in which the programme attempts to gain the consent of Pathfinders to particular identities and behaviours that are correlated with responsible citizenship.
Chapter IV

Who is a responsible citizen? Considering gender, sexuality, class, ethnicity, and ability in the Pathfinder Programme

In this chapter and the next, I analyze and discuss the ways in which Pathfinder handbooks and Pathfinder Guider’s manuals conceptualize responsible citizenship and work to gain the consent of Pathfinders to these ideas. Though there are seven emblems that comprise the Pathfinder programme, I focus on four of these: the Community Emblem, The Home Emblem, the World Emblem, and the Be Prepared Emblem. The remaining three Emblems, Camping, Leadership, and Outdoor, focus on very specific skills and do not make reference to citizenship. (See figure 2b, page 66, for details.)

I begin this chapter with a discussion of the origins of the Pathfinder programme. I then briefly discuss some of the ways that the Girl Guides of Canada is funded, who the organization is affiliated with, and how the programme is revised. I refer to supplementary publications, including Annual Reports and Policy, Organization and Rules publications to provide this background information. The balance of the chapter focuses on the principles of Girl Guiding, and contains my analysis of the Pathfinder programme.

The Pathfinder Programme manuals and handbooks can be divided into three periods: 1979-1985, 1986-1993, and 1997-1999 (note that no new handbooks were published between 1993 and 1997, see figure 2b for details). These three periods are marked by significant changes to the structure of the programme. During the first period, 1979-1985, there were five Emblems (Camping, Community, Home, Outdoor, and World) that contained up to one-hundred challenges each, thirty of which Pathfinders were required to complete to earn the gold version of each Emblem. The Pathfinder handbooks in the first period also included a number of word and trivia games that focused on Canadian geography and the history of Girl Guiding. During the
**The Pathfinder Programme 1979-1985**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Emblem Type</th>
<th>Pathways</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Community Emblem</td>
<td>Community Pathway</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Home Emblem</td>
<td>Home Pathway</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outdoor Emblem</td>
<td>Outdoors Pathway</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>World Emblem</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*note: no new handbooks were published between 1993 and 1997*

**The Pathfinder Program 1997-1999**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Emblem Type</th>
<th>Pathways</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Be Prepared Emblem</td>
<td>Community Pathway</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Home Pathway</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outdoors Pathway</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Camping Emblem</td>
<td>Established OR Adventure OR Winter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Emblem</td>
<td>Arts &amp; Recreation Pathway</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Citizenship Pathway</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heritage Pathway</td>
<td>Knowledge &amp; Service Pathway</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Home Emblem</td>
<td>Lifestyles Pathway</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal Interests Pathway</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nutrition &amp; Home Management Pathway</td>
<td>Relationships and Values Pathway</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leadership Emblem</td>
<td>Skill Building Event</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outdoor Emblem</td>
<td>Conservation Pathway</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Natural Environment Pathway</td>
<td>Outdoor Skills Pathway</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Active Living Pathway</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>World Emblem</td>
<td>Canadian Mosaic Pathway</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Global Understanding Pathway</td>
<td>Travelling Pathway</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>World Guiding Pathway</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
second period, 1986-1993, the Be Prepared Emblem was added as compulsory and each Emblem was divided into four sections with twenty challenges in each. Pathfinders were required to complete twenty challenges to earn the gold version of each Emblem. In 1997, the Leadership Emblem was added, and the rest of the programme remained the same. (See figure 2b for further details of the programme.) The three periods also roughly mark changes to the Girl Guides of Canada Aim, Objectives, Promise and Law, which I will discuss below.

In this chapter, I attend to the characteristics of identity implicated in definitions of responsible citizenship espoused in the Pathfinder programme. Specifically, I focus on gender, sexuality, class, ethnicity, and ability. In the next chapter, I focus on five themes most strongly associated with responsible citizenship in Pathfinder handbooks and Guider’s manuals: volunteer service, respect for the environment, preparation for paid employment, health and hygiene, and cheerfulness and obedience. Using examples from the handbooks and manuals, I illustrate that the Pathfinder programme encourages its young members to develop particular characteristics that are associated with responsible citizenship.

The origins of Pathfinders

The Pathfinder branch of the Girl Guides of Canada was established in 1979 after research by the National Programme Committee (made up of professional members and volunteers) showed that the age groupings of the programme should be revised (Annual Report 1979: 4). Official correspondence names Mr. Thomas Coon, a Master’s student in the Department of Recreation at the University of Waterloo, Ontario, as a primary contributor to this change. With Mr. Coon, National Programme Committee members Mrs. Jean Abray, Mrs. Sheila Crosby, Mrs. Sally Steers, Mrs. Barbara Hayes (Chief Commissioner), and Mrs. W.B. Richards investigated other Canadian youth service programmes and surveyed Canadian Girl Guide
leaders to explore the age groupings that would best serve the needs of their membership (Sept. 13, 1978).

The revisions to the Guiding programme started in 1978, when Thomas Coon presented a Master’s thesis proposal that aimed to research the age groupings of a number of Canadian youth service organizations to determine whether they corresponded with theories of child and adolescent development. Supervised by Dr. K.R. Balmer of the Department of Recreation, Coon’s research was informed by social psychology and child and adolescent developmental psychology, particularly by theorists Erikson and Piaget. As part of his research, Coon consulted with the YWCA, YMCA, the 4H club, CGIT, and the Canadian Boy Scouts regarding their age groupings. The Girl Guides of Canada National Programme Committee then conducted a survey of five-hundred Guide leaders to gauge their opinions about age groupings in the Guiding programme. (The response rate to the survey was quite low, which was attributed to a mail strike during the survey period.) (Annual Report 1978). On November 17, 1978 a final decision to break into four age groups was made (Ibid: 9) and the new programme officially began on September 1, 1979 (Annual Report 1979: 4). The Chief Commissioner wrote the following statement in The Bridge, the programme handbook created for the transition period:

The decision to divide our program into the four age groups was not taken lightly. Not only was it felt to be the right arrangement by most of the Guiders who responded to the questionnaire and by the various Councils and Committees concerned, but this feeling was endorsed by extensive literature on the subject of child development and by child psychologists, teachers and other educators working with girls in this age range (1979: 6).

Once the National Council decided to rearrange the programme, they solicited suggestions for a name for the new branch. The name that was chosen, Pathfinders, is based on the writings

---

27 Both Erikson and Piaget’s theories of development include the idea that people pass through a number of stages before reaching adulthood. The idea of developmental stages has influenced the practice of age-grouping in youth service organizations like the Girl Guides of Canada.
of Lord Baden-Powell, the founder of the Boy Scouts. An excerpt from the 1985 Pathfinder handbook explains it best:

[Powell] noted that a special name was given by the Red Indian Scouts to those persons who were good at finding their way in a strange country. That special name was *Pathfinder*. He wrote that it was a great honour to be called by that name.... It is certainly an exciting name and quite fitting for those girls who, as one Guider so aptly put it, are “between the dignity of Rangers and the innocence of a Guide.” These are the girls who are now ready to venture into a wider world of discovery, challenge, and service” (*Pathfinder Programme* 1985: 14).

Note here the obvious, but unaddressed, reference to British Colonial expansion in North America. Early Girl Guide and Boy Scout handbooks are rife with such references, and are important references for a more expanded study that would pursue the link between Guiding and British and American Imperialism. Furthermore, it is ironic that while the concept of “Pathfinder” was appropriated from a First Nations concept, there are no references to First Nations Pathfinders in any of the handbooks or manuals that I consulted.  

It also appears to me that the name “Pathfinders,” used here to describe young women who are “between the dignity of Rangers and the innocence of a Guide” reflects the racialized construction of First Nations peoples as not fully “civilized” or “dignified.”

Pathfinder units ideally consist of two Guiders and fifteen Pathfinders. The Pathfinder programme is organized around the seven Emblems (see figure 2b), which Pathfinders earn by completing a number of activities, or challenges. Evaluation of the challenges is conducted by others in the unit, the Guiders, and the Pathfinder herself, with an aim to have the Pathfinder reflect upon what she has done and what she has learned. As noted in the 1981 Pathfinder handbook, “the purpose of the emblems is to show one’s ability to give service in that area rather than to show how much one can do” (*Pathfinder Programme* 1981: 59). This evaluation process

---

28 First Nations girls and young women make up less than 1% of all girls and young women in Guiding (WAGGGS 2000). See notes 35 and 36 for more detailed membership information.
serves as a method of moral regulation, through which Pathfinders’ performance of a task is judged by their peers as conforming to particular (read: “normal”) standards of presentation.

According to Anne McRuer, the Co-ordinator of Programme Delivery Service, recruiting for membership in Pathfinders is done mostly through word of mouth and by young members moving through the branches. At times, a Pathfinder unit may publish an ad in a local newspaper (see figure 3) or put up posters at local schools to recruit new members. Leaders are, for the most part, recruited through their young daughters and they move through the branches as their daughters do (Interview March 20, 2000).

Figure 3 Girl Guides of Canada Recruitment Advertisement
(\textit{Westender} April 26-May 2, 2001)
Funding

The Girl Guides of Canada, and, by extension, the Pathfinder programme, derives funding from various sources. Over the past twenty years, government grants to the organization have decreased and donations from corporations have increased. In 1987, the Girl Guides of Canada received grant monies from the Federal department of External Affairs, Fitness Canada ($79,729), the Federal department of National Defense, the Canadian International Development Association (CIDA) ($56,260), the Federal department of the Secretary of State, the Canadian Broadcasting Corporation (CBC), the Canadian Association of Broadcasters, Canadian Press, and Canadian Television Media (Annual Report 1987).

In 1989, funding was derived through membership dues (34% in 1989), product sales (19.5% in 1989), fund raising efforts (17% in 1989), investments and donations from private individuals and companies (14% in 1989) and grants from government (3.5% in 1989). That year the Girl Guides of Canada also derived income from “funds” (12% in 1989) (Annual Report 1989). Also in 1989, the organization formed a fundraising committee, established licensing agreements for product sales, and received grants from CIDA, Fitness Canada, the Secretary of State Women’s Programme, Archives Canada, and Labour Canada. A number of corporations also donated to the organization, including Air Canada, Bell Canada, Campbell Soup, Dominion Textiles, Eaton’s, Grand and Toy, and Texaco (Annual Report 1989: 12).

Since 1990, the Girl Guides have also sold Girl Guides soap (environmentally-friendly in processing, product, and packaging), in addition to the traditional Girl Guide cookies, as a fund

---

29 The sources described here are vague. Further description of these categories in Girl Guides of Canada publications would make this information more valuable for my research. A friend who is a Pathfinder unit leader in Ontario tells me that, in 2001, Pathfinders pay approximately $40 per year in membership dues, and $35 per year in miscellaneous fees. Pathfinders are also required to contribute each time the unit goes camping, which works out to about $20 for food and campground fees per trip. The costs of uniforms vary by unit, as some units require the full uniform, and others require Pathfinders to wear only part of the outfit.
government totaled only $23,500 ($20,800 from Fitness Canada and $2,700 from CIDA) and
donations rolled in from large North American corporations, including the Bank of Montreal,
Christie, General Motors, Imperial Oil, Investors Group, and Sun Life Insurance (*Annual Report
1997: 13*).

The decrease in government funding and increased reliance on corporate donations may
pose serious consequences for the Girl Guides of Canada. What kinds of criteria do corporations
such as the Bank of Montreal, General Motors, and Sun Life Insurance have for donating funds
to the Girl Guides of Canada? Do these criteria affect the types of programmes offered by the
Girl Guides? Consider work by Harold Buchbinder and Janice Newson (1994), who show that
Canadian universities’ increased reliance on private donations has severely affected the quality
of university education by directly integrating the university in the process of corporate
development and capitalist production (474). The penetration of universities by corporations,
Buchbinder and Newson argue, “provides corporations with a window on ongoing research, a
means of influencing the direction of such research, and access to marketable products based on
the research” (Ibid: 475). Penetration of (liberal) feminist youth-service organizations, like the
Girl Guides of Canada, can similarly provide benefits to corporations. Guides become an
audience to which to market corporate products, a future labour force trained to work in the
interest of capitalist development, and a population of young women acquiescent to corporate
models of social (i.e. hierarchical) organization. This is not to say that the Girl Guides of Canada

---

30 Anne McClintock’s chapter “Soft Soaping Empire: Commodity Racism and Imperial Advertising” (1995)
immediately comes to mind. Of soap, McClintock writes, “The emergent middle-class values – monogamy (‘clean’
sex, which has value), industrial capital (‘clean’ money, which has value), Christianity (‘being washed in the blood
of the lamb’), class control (‘cleansing the great unwashed’) and the imperial civilizing mission (‘washing and
clothing the savage’) – could all be marvelously embodied in a single household commodity” (1995: 208).
has actively sought corporate partnerships with these ends in mind. Rather, I suspect that the
decrease in government funding, coupled with a desire to reach out to as many Canadian girls
and young women as possible, has driven the Girl Guides of Canada to seek funding from
readily available sources, and corporations have been happy to oblige.

While the Girl Guides may support linking with corporations because of the “real world”
experience that may be provided to its members, the consequences may be a restriction on “ideal
world” education and recreation. While Pathfinders learn how to find a job in their community,
do they also have the opportunity to think critically about the industries in which they aspire to
work? Will the Pathfinder programme continue to encourage girls and young women to act for
social change? The Girl Guides of Canada will need to think carefully about the extent to which
it will permit its agenda to be dictated by corporate interests. 31

At the same time, it is important to note that funding provided by the Canadian
government to the Girl Guides of Canada may also restrict the kinds of programmes that the
organization offers. Janine Brodie (1996) notes, for example, that the Canadian welfare state is
both a site of regulation and a site through which women’s emancipation can be gained (12).
Because the state is responsible for providing social services to the Canadian public, it may also
be interested in facilitating programmes that teach girls and young women to provide volunteer
labour that can be used to support its mandates. After all, most adult members of the Girl Guides
of Canada, from the Chief Commissioner to unit leaders, are volunteers. I will further consider
how women’s un- and underpaid service work is tied to Canadian nation building in chapter V.

31 An interesting comparison is the integration of corporate funding into Ontario school boards. The York Region
School Board has recently cultivated a partnership with Heinz to develop a grade three lesson plan that integrates
botany with the current space program. While astronauts test the effects of various fertilizers on tomato plants in
space, students test their effects in the classroom. Part of the plan involves a ketchup “taste-test,” in which Heinz
brand ketchup is a competitor.
Affiliates

Through the World Association of Girl Guides and Girl Scouts (WAGGGS), the Girl Guides of Canada is affiliated with a number of non-government organizations (NGOs), such as the United Nations (UN) in Geneva, Nairobi, New York, Paris, Rome, and Vienna. WAGGGS has consultative status with the Economic and Social Council of the UN (ECOSOC), the UN Children’s Fund (UNICEF), and the UN Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization (UNESCO), as well as official status with the UN Development Fund for Women (UNIFEM) and the World Health Organization (WHO). Furthermore, WAGGGS co-operates with the International Labour Organization (ILO) and the Centre for Social Development and Humanitarian affairs (CSDHA) (Girl Guiding/ Girl Scouting: A Challenging Movement: 1990).

The Girl Guides of Canada is also affiliated with a number of other Canadian organizations that share its interests in Canadian federalism and human rights. For example, in her year-end statement in the 1991 Annual Report, Executive Director Margaret Ringland noted that during 1991 the organization devoted itself to “national unity issues, Rights of the Child, and violence against women. With other national groups we pressed for greater recognition of the voluntary sector and focused on the value of all female organizations” (Annual Report 1991).

Revisions

The Guiding programme has been revised a number of times since 1979. Because the Girl Guides of Canada tries to keep its programmes relevant, changes are made to the programmes in response to needs expressed by the girls and young women and those who work with them. Anne McRuer notes that Committees made up of long-standing Guiders and administrative assistants work to make the programmes contemporary and ensure that they conform to current trends of inclusiveness (Interview March 20, 2000). The 1984 Guider’s
manual states that programme changes are made at the regional and district levels through consultation with Guiders and girls across the country. Questionnaires are periodically published in the *Canadian Guider* (a quarterly magazine distributed to all Guide leaders), and representative committees are set up to review the programmes (*Learning to Lead* 1984: 42). For example, the programmes were changed following 1980s research that showed that the Girl Guides of Canada needed to better reflect the Canadian population (Ann McRuer, Interview, March 20, 2000).

**The centrality of responsible citizenship**

A central theme that runs through Girl Guides of Canada programmes is the idea of responsible citizenship. At the turn of the twentieth century, Girl Guide and Boy Scout founder Lord Baden-Powell connected Scouting and citizenship in an attempt to prepare young men and women to serve their country. The 1984 Guider’s manual quotes a statement made by Baden-Powell in 1916 that links Girl Guiding to good citizenship:

> Guides’ keenness is going to develop a higher standard of good citizenship among the rising generation, one which cannot fail to be of highest value to the nation (*Learning to Lead* 1984:36).

While few remnants of the early programme remain, Girl Guiding continues to actively promote the idea of responsible citizenship for young Canadians. The Aim of the organization (Girl Guides of Canada aims to help girls and young women become responsible citizens), Pathfinder Emblem challenges, and citizenship-related awards all promote the importance of responsible citizenship. A few examples from the citizenship pathway of the Community Emblem (see figure 2b) over the past twenty years illustrate my point. The purpose of this pathway is “to

---

32 Whether Baden-Powell developed Scouting to prepare young men (and, later, women) for war is a subject of debate. For discussion on this topic, see various articles in the *English Historical Review*, April 1986 and October 1997.
understand the meaning of citizenship and know how you can be an active citizen in your community" (Pathfinder Program 1999: 34). The first period, 1979-1985, included challenges requiring that Pathfinders “[m]ake a chart showing the responsibilities of a citizen; at home, at school, and in a community” (Pathfinder Programme 1985: 66), “know the rights and freedoms to which citizens are entitled” (Pathfinder Programme 1981: 63), “produce a skit depicting four examples of good citizenship and four examples of poor citizenship,” (Ibid.), and “apply the Guide Law to being a good citizen” (Ibid.). In the third period, 1997-1999, Pathfinders were asked to learn the requirements for becoming a Canadian citizen and to discuss how new immigrants benefit Canada (Pathfinder Program 1999: 34). Pathfinders were also responsible for learning the Charter of Rights and Freedoms, discussing the history and importance of the national anthem and flag, and knowing flag etiquette (Ibid.).

Moreover, the Guider’s manuals suggest that Pathfinder Guiders facilitate activities that reinforce the importance of responsible citizenship. One activity suggests that Guiders

[g]ive each girl a section of the daily newspaper. Ask her to find examples of good or poor citizenship. Discuss these together. You’ll be surprised at the insight the girls have (Learning to Lead 1984: 2).

Another activity, for Citizenship challenge number three in 1999 (“Learn the rights and freedoms guaranteed to Canadians under the Charter of Rights and Freedoms. Discuss how they affect your life” (Pathfinder Program 1999: 34)), suggests that Guiders

[m]ake a set of cards detailing the profile of someone requesting Canadian citizenship. Appoint a judge. Have each girl role play her character with the judge. After each role, discuss whether she should be granted citizenship. An example of a profile: single mother, 34 years old, works as a bookkeeper, has lived in Canada 3 years (Guider’s manual 1999: 59).

Both of these activities implicate the Pathfinder in moral regulatory processes. The first activity sets-up two categories of citizens – those who are responsible, hence deserving of
Canadian citizenship, and those who are not responsible, and thus not deserving of citizenship.

The second activity appoints the Pathfinder as a judge of responsible citizenship. In determining whether the one being judged deserves to be a Canadian citizen, the judge puts to use some definition of what it means to be a “normal” Canadian citizen, and assesses the one to be judged on the basis of that idea of normality. For Foucault

> The judges of normality are present everywhere. We are in the society of the teacher-judge, the doctor-judge, the educator-judge, the ‘social-worker’-judge; it is on them that the universal reign of the normative is based; and each individual, wherever he [sic] may find himself [sic] subjects to it his [sic] body, his [sic] gestures, his [sic] behaviour, his [sic] aptitudes, his [sic] achievements (1979: 304).

In judging others, the Pathfinder also learns to judge herself. In this way, she learns to regulate her own behaviour according to standards of responsibility and normality established through the Pathfinder curriculum, and through her own negotiations with that curriculum. Building on Skeggs’ research on a British caring course (see page 58), I also understand the process of establishing good and bad citizenship and acting as judges as part of a moral regulatory process whereby Pathfinders enact a performance of moral superiority and, at the same time, develop their own subjectivities as moral beings.

The Guider’s manuals also provide guidelines for Guiders facilitating citizenship activities. For example, for community challenge number one in 1999, Pathfinders were required to know the responsibilities of being a Canadian citizen. The Guider’s aid to this question states that

> [t]he responsibilities of being a Canadian Citizen include such things as: working hard to make sure that people’s rights are protected; belief in equal opportunity for all people; keeping the laws; respecting the rights and property of others; voting; belief in the freedom of speech; wise use of our natural resources; valuing the diverse
contributions of people of different backgrounds and abilities; respecting the
government; [and] service to the community (Guider’s manual 1999: 58).33

Furthermore, the 1999 Guider’s manual reflects on the Guide Promise (see page 80) by noting
that

[t]he concept of being true to Canada includes our responsibility as members of our
community, good citizenship, concern for our country’s heritage and future, and respect
for individual communities, traditions, beliefs and ways of life. Being true to Canada
includes being true to the Queen as the constitutional head of state (Guider’s manual
1999: 111).34

In addition to the challenges noted above, two Pathfinder awards and one affiliated
programme revolve around the development of responsible citizenship. These are the Canada-
Cord, the Citizenship Certificate, and the Duke of Edinburgh’s Award Young Canadians
Challenge.35 The Citizenship Certificate is presented to Pathfinders who “have demonstrated
their commitment to active and responsible Canadian citizenship” (Pathfinder Program 1999: 8).

To emphasize the importance of citizenship to Girl Guides programmes, the 1996 and
1997 Annual Reports highlight members’ participation in Canadian citizenship activities. For
example, in 1996, in partnership with the Federal Ministry of Citizenship and Immigration, the
Girl Guides of Canada distributed to Guiders the Canada: Take it to Heart poster and activity
sheet, to support Citizenship Week, Heritage Day and the anniversary of the Canadian flag
(Annual Report 1996: 3). In 1997, in addition to serving their communities by drain marking,

---

33 As I will show later in this chapter, “valuing the diverse contributions of people of different backgrounds and
abilities” includes adhering to liberal multiculturalism policies and advocating on behalf of people with disabilities.
Lesbians, gays, and bisexuals are not identified as contributors to the nation, nor are poor or working class people.
34 Note that many Canadians, and Francophones and First Nations peoples, in particular, have objected to
recognizing the Queen as constitutional head of state, and fiercely refuse to genuflect to the British monarchy. I have
a friend who, as a Brownie, refused to pledge allegiance to the Queen and was subsequently expelled from the
organization. It is possible that requiring members to recognize the Queen as constitutional head of state means that
some Canadian girls and young women (namely, Francophone and First Nations girls) have been exempted from the
Girl Guides organization.
35 Students in British Columbia can receive 2 high school credits for completion of the Canada Cord.
recycling, and helping at blood donor clinics and food banks, Pathfinders were ushers at Canadian Citizenship Courts (Annual Report 1997: 5).

The above examples give some important clues about what it means for a Pathfinder to be a responsible citizen. According to the Pathfinder handbooks and manuals cited above, principles of good citizenship include "voting; ... [the] wise use of our natural resources; valuing the diverse contributions of people of different backgrounds and abilities; ... service to the community" and "being true to the Queen as the constitutional head of state" (Guider's manual 1999: 58, 111). These examples also illustrate that the Girl Guide programme is dedicated, in its entirety, to helping girls and young women become responsible citizens. It is thus important to me to ask what characteristics, in addition to those noted above, a responsible citizen possesses, according to the Girl Guides of Canada. An in-depth review of Pathfinder handbooks and Pathfinder Guider's manuals reveals some of these characteristics.

Guiding principles

Since its inception at the turn of the century, the Girl Guides of Canada Aims and Objectives have served as the foundation of the organization. The curricula of Girl Guide branches (such as Brownies, Guides and Pathfinders) are based on fulfilling the Aims and Objectives. As stated in the 1985 annual report, "[t]he written programme is not an end it itself. It's a means to accomplish the Aims and Objectives of Guiding" (Annual Report 1985: 130). The Aims and Objectives have been revised a number of times over the past twenty years in an effort to meet the demands of a changing Canadian society. In 1999, the Aim (there is only one) was transformed into a mission statement. The Aims can be organized according to the three periods laid out at the beginning of this chapter (1979-1985, 1986-1993, and 1997-1999).

The Aim of the Girl Guides of Canada – Guides du Canada is to provide opportunities designed to help girls become responsible, resourceful, and happy members of society.
This is the collective aim of the girls themselves. Girl Guides are a special breed – committed to the world they live in, committed to making a contribution and to making the most of their lives. They are not the ‘consumers’ they are the ‘contributors’" (Pathfinder Programme 1981: 10).

The Aim of the Girl Guides of Canada - Guides du Canada is to help girls and young women become responsible citizens, able to give leadership and service to the community, whether local, national or global (Pathfinder Program 1986: 5).

Mission: Girl Guides of Canada – Guides du Canada is a Movement for girls, led by women. It challenges girls to reach their potential and empowers them to give leadership and service as responsible citizens of the world (Pathfinder Program 1999: 3).

Two ideological shifts are apparent when comparing the Aims from the three periods. First, there is a clear transition from calling Guides “members of society” until 1985 to calling them “citizens” in 1986. The transition from “members of society” to “citizen” is a political one. By calling Girl Guides “citizens,” the organization acknowledges Girl Guides as public beings, who make contributions to public life. Second, in contrast to the earlier Aims, the 1999 mission statement emphasizes the organization’s commitment to being a single-sex organization. This transition is also political. As shown by Varpalotai (1994), when the Canadian public pressured the Girl Guides to admit boys and men into their organization in the early 1990s, the organization responded by drawing on feminist arguments about the benefits of women-only groups.36

In the early 1990s the Girl Guides reaffirmed its commitment to being an all-female organization.37 These sentiments first appeared in print in the 1985 Guider’s manual. A section on co-ed activities with the corresponding branch of the Boy Scouts (the Venturers) reads:

Pathfinders often enjoy co-ed activities with members of Scouts Canada, particularly the Venturer branch. ... We have much in common with members of Scouting, not least

---

36 I outlined some of these arguments in footnote 15 (page 38).
37 Also in the early 1990s, the Boy Scouts of Canada became Scouts Canada, and reinvented itself as a co-ed organization. There is some speculation that the declining membership in the Girl Guides of Canada may have to do with Canadian girls and young women becoming involved in Scouts Canada.
of which is a common heritage and Founder. There are things we do better separately, and girls need to belong to an all-female organization. It helps them to gain a sense of self-worth, to develop traditionally male-oriented skills in an unbiased atmosphere, and to have access to leadership roles.

The official statement of its position on single-sex education first appeared in the 1992 Policy, Organization and Rules publication. The statement read:

Girl Guides of Canada – Guides du Canada is an Organization for girls and women. Guiding is uniquely suited to the needs and aspirations of girls and women today. Women and girls take positions of leadership, use their talents and abilities in planning and policy making, and are encouraged to take these skills into their lives. In a country in which most females are exposed to co-education, Guiding offers opportunities to acquire leadership skills, to become self-reliant, to enjoy the friendship of other women and girls and to develop a sense of well-being and self-esteem.

To support its position, the Girl Guides of Canada referred to research by Canadian sociologists Reginald Bibby and Donald Posterski that shows the importance of single-sex education for young women. In the 1980s, Bibby, a sociologist at the University of Lethbridge, Alberta, and Posterski, a consultant to teen organizations, surveyed 3000 teenagers aged 15-19, in grades 10-12 across Canada. Their research was published in a 1985 book called The Emerging Generation: An Inside Look at Canada’s Teenagers. Citing this research, a passage in the 1993 Girl Guides of Canada Policy, Organization and Rules states:

We believe that Guiding gives girls the opportunity to develop their sense of self-esteem. In The Emerging Generation, Bibby and Posterski report that “feelings of inferiority appear to be a major cause for concern for about one in three teens” and that teenage females (35%) are more likely than males (23%) to admit to having such feelings.

The Objectives of the Girl Guide programme have also changed over time and reflect the changing values of the Guiding programme. For example, the ten Objectives listed in the 1981 through 1985 Pathfinder handbook are labeled as “things you could do in order to become a responsible, resourceful, and happy member of society.” The Objectives encourage girls and young women to:
Develop personal values and respect for self and others; Develop respect for nature and the order of things; Have new experiences and outdoor adventure; Make new friends and have fun; Achieve a sense of well-being; Learn the importance of decision making; Function in small groups; Achieve a sense of pride in accomplishment; Acquire practical and leadership skills; Develop the ability and willingness to help (*Pathfinder Programme* 1981: 10).

The list of Objectives in 1986 states that the Girl Guide programme provides opportunities for girls and women to:

- develop personal values and respect for self and others;
- be challenged through new experiences;
- develop a sense of well-being;
- achieve a sense of pride in accomplishment;
- learn to work cooperatively with others;
- learn and practise decision making;
- make friends and have fun through the fellowship of Guiding;
- acquire practical and leadership skills;
- learn about the natural environment and how to preserve it;
- develop knowledge and understanding of other countries, their people and culture;
- put into practice the principle of service (1986: 5).

In 1999, the list of Objectives was changed to a list of Principles, which encompass the spirit of the Objectives in place from 1986 to 1997. The Principles are:

- Guiding is based on the ideals of the Promise and Law;
- Guiding develops personal values and well-being, self-respect, and respect for others;
- Guiding promotes fun, friendship, adventure, and challenges through new experiences;
- Guiding celebrates pride in accomplishment;
- Guiding develops leadership and decision-making skills;
- Guiding teaches practical skills and teamwork;
- Guiding gives service;
- Guiding values the natural environment;
- Guiding develops an appreciation of Canada and its diversity;
- Guiding fosters cultural understanding and knowledge of the global community;
- Guiding actively supports the worldwide sisterhood of Girl Guides and Girl Scouts (*Pathfinder Program* 1999: 3).

Like the Aims, the Objectives reflect a number of changes in the Pathfinder curriculum over the past two decades. The Objectives in 1986 introduced the principles of respecting the natural environment and developing a knowledge and understanding of other countries and their peoples. The 1999 Objectives introduced the principle of valuing Canadian diversity. Note, however, that the Objectives consistently encourage responsible citizenship through the development of a sense of well-being and giving service in one’s community. These principles provide additional clues about the ways in which the Girl Guides of Canada defines responsible citizenship. I will consider these principles in further detail later in this chapter and the next.
Prescriptions for responsible citizenship also appear in the Guide Promise and Law. All members of the Girl Guides of Canada are required to pledge the Guide Promise and follow the Guiding Law. Here are the Guide Laws from 1979 through 1985, and from 1997:

A Guide's honour is to be trusted; A Guide is loyal; A Guide is useful and helps others; A Guide is a friend to all and a sister to every Guide; A Guide is courteous; A Guide is kind to animals and enjoys the beauty in nature; A Guide is obedient; A Guide smiles and sings even under difficulty; A Guide is thrifty; A Guide is pure in thought, word and deed (Bridge 1979:31).

The Guiding Law challenges me to: be honest and trustworthy, use my resources wisely, respect myself and others, recognize and use my talents and abilities, protect our common environment, live with courage and strength, share in the sisterhood of Guiding (Pathfinder Program 1997: 4).

Note that the 1997 Guide Law maintains the concepts of trust and honour, respect for the environment, and self-respect. It discards ideas that Guides should be obedient, thrifty, pure, and smile and sing even under difficulty. The differences between the two Laws illustrate that concepts of responsible citizenship change over time and are complex. I will take-up respect for the environment, obedience, and smiling and singing even under difficulty in chapter V.

The Guide Promise also reflects changes in the organization. The 1979 Promise states:

I promise, on my honour, to do my best; To do my duty to God, the Queen and my country, To help other people at all times, To obey the Guide Law (Bridge 1979: 31).

The 1997 revised Promise states:

I promise to do my best, To be true to myself, my God/faith* and Canada; I will help others, and accept the Guiding Law (Pathfinder Program 1997: 4).38

The revised Guide Promise steers away from using “duty,” “God,” and “Queen” in an effort to more closely reflect the convictions of its membership. In the 1994 Annual Report, Chief Commissioner of the Girl Guides of Canada Marsha Ross reflected on the revision that replaced

---

38 *The 1997 Promise asks Girl Guides to “[c]hoose either the word God or the word faith according to your personal convictions” (1997: 4).
the word “God” with “Faith” in the Girl Guide Promise. She wrote that “[t]he new Promise and Law remain faithful to our traditions and values, but are expressed in language more appropriate for today’s girls and women” (i). 39 By removing the reference to the Queen as head of state, these revisions may make the programme more accessible to Francophone and First Nations young women (recall footnote 29 where I suggested that Francophone and First Nations young women may object to recognizing the Queen as head of state).

Despite these significant changes to the programme, a number of the principles of the Girl Guides organization remain static. Since 1979 the organization has pledged to be non-political, to provide service to the community, and to cooperate with educational organizations. Another central principal of the Girl Guides of Canada is its claim of openness to all girls and young women. The 1977/1979 Policy, Organization, and Rules (POR) publication states that participation in Girl Guides is “voluntary and open to all girls and women without distinction of creed, race, class, nationality or any other circumstance....” (4) In 2000, Section 10-4 of the POR restated this principal in its code of conduct for all adult members and, for the first time, included sexual identity. The current non-discrimination code reads:

A Guider will not discriminate against another individual in accordance with the Human Rights Code of her Province and Canada. This includes discrimination based on race, ancestry, place of origin, colour, ethnic origin, citizenship, creed, sexual orientation, age, marital status or disability (2000: 10-4).

In the next sections, I consider the non-discrimination policy in the context of Pathfinder handbooks and Pathfinder Guider’s manuals to discover whether the organization is as inclusive as it intends to be. In the following discussion, I investigate how gender, sexuality,

39 A more expanded study could also consider the role of religion in Canadian voluntary youth service organizations. Whose God is emphasized in this passage? More broadly, how were non-Christian young women received in Christian youth service organizations like the YMCA? Were ideals of responsible citizenship espoused in Canadian youth programs commensurate with mid-twentieth century Canadian immigration policies that effectively barred Jews from immigration to Canada? For more on the latter, see Irving Abella and Harold Tropper (1998).
class, ethnicity, and ability are implicated in definitions of responsible citizenship in Pathfinder texts. In this analysis I ask “who is a responsible citizen?” In the next chapter I ask “what does the responsible do?”

Considering gender

As Wendy Sterne, Carol Auster, and Karen Altman have demonstrated, Girl Guiding at the turn of the century encouraged girls and young women to become good mothers, learn how to spotlessly clean a home, and explore traditionally female occupations. My research shows that while some of these gender scripts continue to be included in the contemporary Pathfinder programme, a number of them have been replaced over the past twenty years with encouragement to pursue careers outside of the home. The contemporary programme takes women’s rights very seriously, and challenges young women to enter non-traditional occupations and fight for pay equity. Since the early 1990s, the Girl Guides of Canada has also strongly asserted its right to be an all-female organization, citing studies that show that girls and young women excel in all-female environments.

There are a few instances in the early Pathfinder programme where Guiders, encouraged to teach Pathfinders tasks that involve home skills, are directed to refer to mothers and fathers for help. Often these references to parents are based on gender stereotypes. Consider, for example, the following activities where mothers are portrayed as helpers, and fathers as electricians and handymen.

Have the girls sign up to work on an emblem for one month. Have an adult in charge of each group (mothers?) if you have more groups than you have Guiders (Learning to Lead 1984:11).

Have each girl bring an electrical plug to the meeting and renew the wiring in it under the supervision of a resource person (a father?) (Learning to Lead 1984: 21).
Problem Solving: Example: not enough storage space at meeting place. Possible solutions: ask the church for another cupboard, look for a handyman among Pathfinders’ fathers (Learning to Lead 1984: 29).

In addition to promoting gender stereotypes, these suggestions also promote heterosexism by encouraging the participation of Pathfinders’ biological mothers and fathers and not acknowledging other forms of family.

In the texts published in the second period (1986-1993), there is an obvious awareness of women’s issues. In 1988, the community pathway of the Be Prepared emblem encouraged Pathfinders to investigate services for women in their community. A tenth challenge added to the handbook that year required Pathfinders to

Know the names and phone numbers of agencies in your community that offer counselling on the following: teenage pregnancy, teenage suicide, sexual abuse, battered women, alcohol and drug abuse, and sexually transmitted diseases (Pathfinder Program 1988: 18).

Furthermore, the 1993 Pathfinder Handbook challenged Pathfinders to

Discuss the image of women presented in advertisements in the media. How does advertising on television and in magazines affect: your buying habits, your attitudes towards dieting and your body image, the possible development of eating disorders among young women (40)?

By 1999, references to women’s issues in the Pathfinder handbooks and Pathfinder Guider’s manuals were common. The citizenship pathway of the 1999 Pathfinder handbook challenged Pathfinders to

Discuss issues of significance to women, such as employment equity, marriage/common law relationships or property laws (34).

Similarly, the 1999 Guider’s manual suggested that Guiders and Pathfinders

Brainstorm strategies to use against violence and harassment. For example, discuss ways to tell people to stop; what to say when you hear racist or sexist remarks; and how to respond to people’s reactions to your objections” (76).
In contrast to the gender scripts promoted in early Girl Guide handbooks, the Pathfinder programme in the late twentieth century recognizes the public contribution of its members. Pathfinders are identified as agents with the will and ability to stand-up for themselves, and are urged to recognize and speak out against sexist stereotypes. Having Pathfinders discuss pay equity and property laws directly challenges earlier assumptions that women are associated with the private domestic world of full-time wifedom and motherhood. There are no references in the contemporary handbooks or manuals to women’s roles as biological reproducers of and for the nation, or as reproducers and transmitters of culture. In late twentieth century Pathfinder handbooks, responsible female citizens are women who reflect on, and aim to change, the social, political, and economic circumstances around them. This is not to say, however, that the Pathfinder programme does not aim to gain the consent of girls and young women to particular gender scripts. See chapter 5 for a detailed discussion of the ways in which Pathfinders learn that caring work is a natural extension of their (female) selves.

That Pathfinders are encouraged to promote women’s equality in the workplace and speak out against sexist stereotypes suggests that the Girl Guides of Canada’s mandates fit within the rhetoric of liberal feminism. Liberal feminist ideology, while supporting the advancement of women’s interests, does not seek to reestablish the current social order, but rather aims to create a space for women inside it. Recall Aniko Varpalotai’s study on the politicization of the Girl Guides of Canada. In her article, “‘Women Only and Proud of it!’ The Politicization of the Girl Guides of Canada,” (1994) Varpalotai discusses where the organization might fit on the feminist continuum. She notes that the Girl Guides has been reluctant to identify as a feminist organization, partly due to its mandate to be “non-political,” and partly because of a perceived negative image of feminism that alienates many of its members (15). Varpalotai notes that the
organization “already fits the widely accepted definitions of feminism [such as] a belief in equal rights and opportunities for women, the recognition that women are discriminated against by virtue of being women, and the need to organize to make change” (1994: 16). She also found that girls and young women in the Girl Guides feel that it is a “safe place” for learning new skills without fear of failure, and for talking about issues of interest and concern to them (1994: 20). My own research confirms these findings.  

**Considering sexuality**  

Through its policies and practices, the Pathfinder branch, and the Girl Guides of Canada in general, has shown that it is sensitive to gender issues and the challenges that girls and young women face by virtue of their status as female citizens. The organization also claims to be sensitive to issues of sexual diversity, as stated in its non-discrimination policy. In this section, I take an in-depth look at the Pathfinder programme for evidence of an appreciation of sexual diversity. I also consider the ways in which sexuality is talked about in Pathfinder handbooks and Pathfinder Guider’s manuals to gauge the extent to which the Pathfinder programme acknowledges the existence and contributions of lesbian and bisexual women in its organization and in Canada.

As I will demonstrate in the following discussion, the Pathfinder curriculum pays significant attention to young women’s sexuality and the physical, mental, and emotional changes that accompany adolescence. From 1979 through 1999, almost all of the references to young women’s sexuality and romantic interests were made within a heterosexual context. While

---

40 This is not to say that all members of the Girl Guides of Canada identify as feminist. In fact, as Varpalotai notes, there is a lot of tension about the extent to which the organization should include feminist values in its programmes.
some of the references are not overtly heterosexual, they never refer to lesbian or bisexual behaviour or relationships.

The 1979 Guider’s handbook, *The Bridge*, introduced the Pathfinder branch by including a section on what a Pathfinder is like. In this section, Pathfinders are described as being self-centred, inquisitive, loyal, and interested in boys.

Our twelve to fifteen year-old Pathfinder is a much less stable individual [than the Guide]. Physical changes are forcing her to examine and develop a new, and changing, self-image. She needs to be popular but is usually self-centred and very heavily influenced by peer pressure. “Everyone else has one…”, “Everyone else’s mother lets them…”, “Why can’t I …”. Are the mottoes of this age. **She is less prepared to work in a small group than her younger sister, unless that group includes her immediate buddies, yet she is eager to take part in group events, especially (giggle) co-ed events. (Usually boys of this age aren’t as interested!)** She is less prepared to work in a small group than her younger sister, unless that group includes her immediate buddies, yet she is eager to take part in group events, especially (giggle) co-ed events. (Usually boys of this age aren’t as interested!) She is easily distracted and tends to be impractical and unreliable. But her enthusiasm, once captured, is a delight to work with, and it is a joy to watch her emotional growth and her developing ability to laugh at herself. Her world tends to be small and personally oriented, but her mind is capable of reaching out and absorbing anything it thinks useful for the future. If she joins Pathfinders, chances are she will be fiercely – but secretly – loyal (8, emphasis mine).

A number of Pathfinder activities and challenges also manifest the assumption that Pathfinders are heterosexual. Consider the Promise and Law activities suggested in the 1981 Guider’s manual:

Hand out copies of the following for the girls to complete individually, then share and discuss. Add other situations.

*How do you react when:*

a) your young sister teases you about having a crush on a certain boy?…

*What would you do?*

c) Some boys you like are being cruel to a neighbour’s cat….  
d) An older boy whom you secretly admire tries to persuade you to have a drink of liquor…. *(So You Chose Pathfinders 1981: 27).*

In this example, Pathfinders are portrayed as having crushes on and secretly admiring boys. The 1984 Pathfinder Guider manual continued with this assumption. In preparing Pathfinder Guiders
to be leaders, the manual suggested that Guiders imagine what it was like to be a young adolescent. Page thirty-four contains a reference to admiring boys:

How does it feel to be 12, awkward and homely? How does it feel to have left home with an unhappy mother screaming at you? How does it feel to have been betrayed by your best friend? How does it feel to be teased for being a Pathfinder by a boy whom you admire? How does it feel to go to Pathfinders week after week and be bored by it? (Learning to Lead 1984: 34, emphasis mine).

The 1981 and 1985 Guider’s manuals contain one of the few overt references to sex and sexuality. This reference mentioned the importance of informative and suitable sex education programmes for young women. Like the passages cited above, however, references to young women’s sexuality were made in a heterosexual context.

Many girls of Pathfinder age are physically mature and are beginning to be aware of their own sexuality. They enjoy – or would like the chance to enjoy – being with boys. Their knowledge of sex varies greatly, and it is a subject in which they are increasingly interested. The “old wives’ tales course of study” still flourished when the schools or homes fail to provide good programs in sex education” (Guider’s manual 1985: 109).

Although it is tempting to chalk-up these statements to old-fashioned beliefs common in the 1980s, two examples from 1990s Pathfinder handbooks show that heterosexist assumptions prevailed throughout the twentieth century. The first example is a challenge from the relationships and values pathway of the Home Emblem that asked Pathfinders to “[p]articipate in a skit to demonstrate appropriate behaviour on a date or co-ed event” (Pathfinder Program 1999: 44). The second example is a suggested activity from the relationships and values section of the 1999 Guider’s manual. In this activity, Guiders were to lead a discussion called “Who’s the Boss? You or Your Group?” Examples of questions for Guiders to ask are:

Do I skip school and go to the store? Do I smoke a cigarette? What kind of clothes do I buy? How do I wear my hair? Do I have sex with my boyfriend? (Guider’s manual 1999: 139, emphasis mine).
Some passages relating to sexuality and co-ed activities are more ambiguous than the ones cited above, providing a chance for a Pathfinder to read the Pathfinder programme as open to sexual behaviours and identities other than heterosexuality. Consider the following excerpts from the 1981 Guider’s manual and 1999 Pathfinder handbook. The first passage discusses what Pathfinders are like. The second passage, challenge eight of the relationships and values pathway of the Home Emblem, refers to the importance of both women and men in Pathfinders’ lives. Both of the sections note that young women are interested in personal relationships with people of both sexes. These sections do not suggest that Pathfinders may be interested in romantic relationships with other young women but, at the same time, they do not suggest that young women are exclusively interested in spending time with young men.

What is a Pathfinder like? Her friendships with other girls are vitally important and she is guided by what they think, do and wear. She needs their acceptance...Friendships begun at this age can be deep; one girl can build an emotional dependence on another. When such a relationship is broken by a third person (of either sex) the girl who is left out feels depressed and often resorts to petty behaviour” (So You Chose Pathfinders 1981: 1).

Discuss where you can find help concerning problems about school work, money, girlfriends, boyfriends, family rules, or religious beliefs (Pathfinder Program 1999: 44).

Of all of the challenges and activities suggested in the Pathfinder handbooks and Pathfinder Guider’s manuals, only one opportunity for reading about a possibly non-heterosexual relationship is present. A passage on service in the 1985 Guider’s manual gave an example of two women who live together. The example reads:

Two elderly women once lived next door to a Scout who insisted on shovelling [sic] their snow without payment. The women felt so badly about this that they often got up very early to get the shovelling done themselves so that he wouldn’t do it for nothing” (117).

After reading this paragraph, a lesbian or bisexual Pathfinder looking for representations of non-heterosexual romance in her handbook may find comfort in knowing that there is no stigma
involved when two women live together. The tone of the anecdote is, however, mediated by mentioning that the women are elderly. Elderly people are commonly assumed to be non-sexual beings, and this assumption gives the anecdote an innocent charm. Identifying the women as elderly dampens the threat of homosexuality in this story.

All of the examples in this section reflect the normalization of heterosexuality in the Pathfinder curriculum. Sexual identities and behaviours other than heterosexuality are not acknowledged in Pathfinder handbooks and manuals and, therefore, are made to appear non-existent. As Mary Louise Adams notes, normalization occurs by defining and limiting the choices available (1997: 15, 13). By focusing only on heterosexual relationships, the Pathfinder programme is implicated in the process of moral regulation, where “some behaviors, ideals, and values [are] marginalized and proscribed while others [are] legitimized and naturalized” (Sangster 1996: 241). The Pathfinder curriculum is implicated in promoting heterosexuality as a requisite part of responsible citizenship because it privileges heterosexuality in a programme that aims to teach girls and young women to become responsible citizens. As Jacqui Alexander has argued, citizenship rights are premised on the privileging of heterosexuality and the subordination of people with alternate sexual identities. By excluding references to non-heterosexual citizens, the Pathfinder programme conflates responsible citizenship with heterosexuality.

A significant obstacle preventing the Pathfinder programme from including activities and challenges that consider lesbian and bisexual sexual identities, and, as mentioned above, preventing the organization from identifying as “feminist,” is its commitment to being “non-political.” Guiders are encouraged to steer away from controversial subjects, and Pathfinders are taught that their political interests will not be supported by the organization. The 1985 Guider’s
manual clarifies what it means to be a non-political organization and outlines the Guider’s role in situations where controversial topics are raised.

“The definition of a ‘non-political’ organization, such as WAGGGS, is difficult in today’s world. On the one hand, Guiding tries to remain independent of political systems, and on the other, to become involved in the realistic issues of society. Action is often impossible without political involvement. Decisions which lead to action are often political ones. Members of the movement who take the Promise and Law seriously, and translate its implications into human justice, are led to political action. Young adults, especially, become impatient and frustrated at the realization that this must be done individually and not with the weight of Guiding’s influence behind it.... The adult’s role is to give information as objectively as possible, and to allow discussion without imposing her personal opinions in any way (1985: 34).

You may well get cold feet when a girl raises a subject which you feel inadequate to handle. Topics such as abortion, pre-marital sex, divorce, family problems and local political issues will arise in any group which has freedom of discussion.... If you feel strongly committed one way or another on such issues and express your views forcefully, you may find the group quickly polarizes, splitting into opposing camps. Reverberations may follow from parents, and touchy situations can arise. What do you do if you feel uncomfortable and incompetent to deal with controversy? You can say frankly that you would rather not discuss the matter because you are uncertain about your own feelings, and most girls will respect your honesty (Guider’s manual 1985: 125).

The idea that the Girl Guides of Canada is a “non-political organization” echos assumptions espoused in liberal citizenship theory. The sentiments expressed in the above statements suggest that a person’s identity and views are private and personal matters. The organization claims that to discuss one’s views openly is to make them political, so it discourages Guiders from raising issues that may ignite protest from parents. Interestingly, issues like abortion and sexually transmitted diseases are not considered taboo for the Pathfinder curriculum. This may be because these issues are concerned with the regulation of rather than the expression of women’s sexuality. The regulation of women’s sexual behaviour, as I have shown throughout this thesis, is often appropriated as a public (and therefore not personal) concern to be managed through state reform institutions and extra-state charitable and youth service
organizations. Of course, when considering these issues, it is important to note that the Pathfinder programme varies by unit and much of the programming depends on the Guiders involved. While some Guiders will undoubtedly feel more comfortable discussing sexuality than others, in my view, it remains important that all Pathfinders have an opportunity to consider the implications of heterosexism and homophobia in our society.

**Considering class**

According to the written texts, sensitivity to differences in economic circumstance and opportunity has been important to the Girl Guides of Canada and to the Pathfinder branch, specifically, since it began. Before 1997, the preface to most Emblems in the Pathfinder programme referred to differences in economic circumstance and opportunity to ensure that Guiders took into account the needs of all Pathfinders. An example of one of these prefaces is:

> It is understood that some girls have more opportunities than do others and some units have more facilities, resources and equipment available to them than do others. It is presumed that the planning of any of the camps in this programme will take proper consideration of these socio-political and economic differences without denying girls the opportunity to grow as individuals (*Pathfinder Program* 1990: 21).

Furthermore, as illustrated by a passage from the 1985 Guider’s manual, the organization has attempted to respond to public perceptions that its programme is for middle-class girls and young women by targeting specific populations for membership.

Guiding is attempting to cope with its image as a “middle class” organization, by functioning with a greater flexibility in areas where it has previously had minimal success, that is to say, inner cities, areas of dense population of immigrant people who are concerned in maintaining their original culture (37). 41

---

41 In September and October 2000, the Girl Guides of Canada conducted a survey of 2799 girls and young women in Guiding. To determine the income distribution of members, the survey asked unit Guiders for their perceptions of members’ family incomes compared to others in their specific community. “The survey respondents identified 11.4% of the girls as coming from high income homes in their community, 70.7% from middle income homes, and 17.1% from low income homes. Of the 173 Units in the survey, 71 included girls from high income homes, 168 included girls from middle income homes, and 123 included girls from low income homes. The Guide Units and the two combined Units (one Sparks and Brownies, another Sparks, Brownies and Guides) included in the survey had the highest low income participation, at over 20%. The lowest low income participation was found in Pathfinders.
The attention to class in Pathfinder texts suggests that the Girl Guides of Canada appreciates the contributions of all Canadians regardless of their economic circumstances. Note, however, that the organization recognizes its minimal success among inner city immigrant populations. This may suggest that the Girl Guides of Canada has, in the past, concentrated its efforts on working with girls and young women who already have the cultural capital (the class, culture and language of dominant groups) available to be molded into responsible Canadian citizens. Attempts by the organization to become active among inner city youth may indicate that the Girl Guides of Canada has redefined who can become a responsible citizen.

It is important to consider whether attempts by the Girl Guides of Canada to recruit inner city immigrant youth is a sign of its desire to be more inclusive or whether it is a sign of attempts by a middle-class organization to gain the consent of working class immigrant youth to particular ideas of what it means to be a responsible Canadian citizen. To explore this idea, I looked for instances in Pathfinder texts where middle-class values and activities were normalized. I found that the Pathfinder programme places substantial value on capitalist consumption dictated by middle-class values of taste and thriftiness.

In “Building Anti-Delinquent Communities: Morality, Gender, and Generation in the City,” Mariana Valverde (1995) shows how teaching citizenship in the post World War II period in Canada involved consumer education for young women. Consumer education entailed teaching young women how to buy wisely and how to develop the right ‘taste,’ according to the principle that “young women should not merely buy economical goods because someone told...

(13.3%) and Senior Branches (10.9%). High income participation was also highest in Guide Units (17.7%).” (WAGGGS 2000).

them how to budget, but should be taught to desire the right objects” (38). These sentiments are echoed in Pathfinder challenges that encourage Pathfinders to be thrifty without sacrificing style. For example, the 1985 Guider’s manual notes that a Guide can “become an informed consumer, a competent cook, and someone who cares about making her home warm and welcoming” (6). Similarly, Home Emblem challenge six from the 1981 Pathfinder handbook asks Pathfinders to rate the quality of footwear.

Make a survey of your friends’ preferences in footwear. Different shoes or boots are worn for different occasions. Discuss which ones are popular for school, social occasions, hiking, etc. Rate footwear under: cost, durability, appearance, ease of care, comfort. How do they compare? Which brands are the best buys (69)?

Valverde argues that consumer education links free enterprise with notions of ‘correct’ femininity, thus regulating the behaviour of young women to conform to particular political interests (1995: 38). Teaching thrift to Pathfinders accomplishes this same goal. By normalizing particular consumer patterns, such as comparing price, durability, and appearance, the Pathfinder programme teaches girls and young women how to appreciate and function in a capitalist economy, not only as “contributors,” as the organization claims, but also as “consumers.” I will further consider how the Pathfinder programme encourages middle-class values and ideals in chapter V.

**Considering race and ethnicity**

Since its inception, the Pathfinder branch of the Girl Guides of Canada has become increasingly sensitive to issues of ethnicity and racism. In the early 1980s, Pathfinders were encouraged to discover the diverse ethnic groups that made up their communities. For most of the activities that encouraged Pathfinders to explore diversity, Pathfinders were asked to canvass
their friends and neighbours for information, and Pathfinders themselves were not described as “ethnic.” The following excerpts from the 1981 Pathfinder handbook illustrate this point.

Learn about some of the ethnic groups which make up your community. Ask to attend one of their special events.... Present to your group what you have learned about the customs and traditions of one of the ethnic groups which make up your community.... Invite people of ethnic groups to your unit to tell about themselves and how, and why, they settled in your community (Pathfinder Programme 1981: 65, emphasis mine). Survey your friends [sic] to find out the ethnic backgrounds of their families. Keep a list of the countries from which they, their parents, and or/great grandparents came. What language did they speak (Pathfinder Programme 1981: 92)?

Find out when your family or ancestors first came to Canada. Explore the conditions in both their home country and in Canada to explain why they came, either by asking those involved or by reading a book on emigration (Pathfinder Programme 1981: 93).

Note that all of these passages identify members of ethnic groups as “others,” and mark “others” as ethnic. Pathfinders are encouraged to attend “their” special events and learn about “their” languages. Ethnic groups, in these examples, are identified as outsiders whose customs and traditions are curiously different from those of the “Canadian” Pathfinder. Of course, Anglo-Canadians also constitute an ethnic group, though, as demonstrated here and elsewhere, they are rarely recognized as one. Furthermore, members of ethnic groups and Pathfinders themselves are identified as immigrants to Canada, and the passages ignore the presence of First Nations peoples in this country. The first passage suggests that ethnic groups settled in the community of the “Canadian” Pathfinders, rather than suggesting that Pathfinders (or their families) may have actually settled in the ethnic community. Moreover, by urging Pathfinders to find out when and why their ancestors came to Canada, the third passage blatantly assumes that there are not any First Nations Pathfinders.43

43 The 2000 Girl Guides of Canada survey of 2799 girls and young women in Guiding found that “Aboriginal and visible minority girls represented a combined 7.6% of girls included in the survey, compared to 14.2% in the general population; Aboriginal participation in Guiding is at 0.9%, compared to 3% for the total population; Visible minority participation stood at 6.7%, compared to 11.2% for the Canadian population” (WAGGGS 2000). Though
Handbooks and Guider's manuals published in 1999 similarly framed Pathfinders as non-ethnic and encouraged them to explore foods and artifacts that are new to them. For example, the 1999 Guider's manual asked Guiders to

Invite a person who is familiar with ethnic foods to come and cook food new to the girls. Ask them to tell the girls about the types of food they use. Visit a restaurant specializing in ethnic cooking. A pot luck meal representing ethnic dishes at a meeting or at camp, could be a fun Unit activity (101).

Ask this person to share things that are special to her culture or country, for example, family life, food, clothing, or celebrations. Look at such things as artwork, carvings, embroidery, music, or architecture (Ibid.).

The 1999 Pathfinder handbook also encouraged an exploration of "other" cultures by challenging Pathfinders to "[p]lan, prepare and serve a meal typical of one of Canada's ethnic groups" (60) and to "[f]ind out how culture in Canada is being shaped by immigrants from many nations" (Ibid.). Here again, Anglo-Canadians are not identified as an ethnic group. Also, ethnic groups are described as "immigrants" who shape Canada's culture, and First Nations peoples are not mentioned at all.

Though liberal multiculturalism rhetoric dominated the Pathfinder curriculum from 1979 through 1999, the 1981 and 1985 Guider's manuals also encouraged Guiders to discuss racism with their Pathfinders. The following exercise was included in both manuals.

The beginning of racism is often the stereotyping of people, rather than seeing the uniqueness of the individual. Try this true-false exercise individually and then discuss. (All the answers are false.): All redheads have quick tempers; All Negroes are musical; All Chinese are good at math; All Indians are lazy; All Italians like garlic; All blondes are beautiful; All Scots are stingy; All English people are stuck up; All Americans are pushy; All politicians are crooked; All teenagers are selfish; All women are dumb about auto repairs (1981: 28).

Similarly, the 1985 Guider's manual urged Guiders to recognize that power relations are often based in racism. Drawing on liberal multiculturalism rhetoric, the manual noted that learning this data does not specifically refer to the Pathfinder programme, it is reasonable to assume that distributions in that
about the traditional songs, dances, and food enjoyed by people in other countries could contribute to mutual understanding. The goal of this education is to overcome racism by making Pathfinders familiar with other cultures. One notable passage reads:

Many of the World Pathway challenges lead to new interests and changed attitudes towards other cultures. We live in a multicultural society where racism is often experienced, overtly and subtly, by minority groups. We benefit by exploring and understanding others’ customs. When we become friends with people whose traditions are different from our we all gain (130).

Note that 1985 was the last time the word “racism” appeared in Pathfinder handbooks and manuals. Since that year, the focus has been on exploring the customs and traditions of “other” ethnic groups.

The problem with the rhetoric of dispelling stereotypes and sharing in the culture of “others” is that it diverts attention from recognizing that power relations are based on racialized constructions of difference. By focusing on the cultural artifacts of ethnic groups, such rhetoric ignores racism and normalizes whiteness. Ruth Frankenberg, in her 1993 book White Women, Race Matters: The Social Construction of Whiteness notes that such colour-blindness is the “polite” language of racism. Frankenberg argues, however, that colour evasion “actually involves a selective engagement with difference, rather than no engagement at all” (143). My findings are commensurate with this argument. By moving from activities that incorporate an (albeit limited) analysis of racism to activities that replace the concept of race with that of ethnicity, the Pathfinder programme selectively engages with difference. It focuses on differences in customs and traditions, and mystifies social relations based on racism.

All of the above activities, such as learning about the food, customs, artwork, and celebrations of “ethnic groups,” reflect liberal multiculturalism rhetoric. Himani Bannerji (2000) and Leslie Roman (1993, 1995) have critically considered such rhetoric and argue that it is
ahistorical, power neutral, and evades relations of power that are determined by racism. Bannerji writes that Canadian multiculturalism policy is an “apparatus which rearrange[s] questions of social justice, of unemployment and racism, into issues of cultural diversity and focus[e] on symbols of religion, on so-called tradition” (2000: 45). Through multiculturalism discourse, immigrants become “ethnicized, culturalized and mapped into traditional/ethnic communities” (Ibid). Roman (1995) calls this the “spectacle of multiculturalism” – “the management of issues of racial inequality through a discourse of reified cultural differences which treats ethnicity and power differentials between, among, and within racial groups as token differences of culture” (23). Furthermore, as Roman shows, multiculturalism discourse that identifies members of ethnic groups as “people of color” implies that white culture is the norm against which all other groups’ differences are measured (1993: 71).

Liberal multiculturalism rhetoric is implicated in nation building practices in Canada. As Bannerji writes,

The importance of the discourse of multiculturalism to that of nation-making becomes clearer if we remember that “nation” needs an ideology of unification and legitimation. As Benedict Anderson points out, nations need to imagine a principle of “com-unity,” or community even when there is little there to postulate any (2000: 97).

Linda Carty and Dionne Brand (1993) note that in advanced capitalist societies, the state operates in the interest of the economically dominant class and spends time and effort legitimizing the dominant class position (210). Liberal multiculturalism rhetoric enables the state and dominant classes to legitimate power differences by obscuring them under the rubric of cultural difference. And, as Eva Mackey (1999) notes, multiculturalism is a “great national bandage” allows the state “to highlight and manage diversity without endangering the project of
nation-building” (68). By actively promoting liberal multiculturalism rhetoric, the Pathfinder programme is implicated in such acts of legitimation and management.

While the challenges in Pathfinder handbooks and Guider’s manuals did not identify Pathfinders as “ethnic,” the illustrations fared better at showing that Pathfinders are not all white. Illustrations in the handbooks and manuals became more and more representative since 1979. Consider, for example, the covers of the 1981 (figure 4), 1986 (figure 5), and 1999 (figure 6) Pathfinder handbooks. Both the 1981 and 1986 covers contain illustrations of two white girls. The 1999 cover includes illustrations of non-white Pathfinders. Note, however, that this illustration portrays the white girls as the actors (running and balancing on ropes), while the non-white girls watch and take pictures. Also, consider the illustrations used to display the Pathfinder uniform. The illustration in the 1981 handbook (figure 7) includes two white and two non-white Pathfinders. The same excerpt from the 1986 handbook (figure 8) portrays four white Pathfinders in their uniforms. The Pathfinders and Guiders represented in the 1993 (figure 9) and 1997 (figure 10) handbooks are depicted as ethnically diverse. In fact, in both of these years, more than one half of the characters are non-white.

It is thus fair to say that the Pathfinder programme has become more sensitive to the diversity of girls and young women involved in Canadian Guiding over the past two decades. It is also fair to say that, at some points in its history, the programme has contributed to anti-racist pedagogy by teaching girls and young women about stereotypes and the effects of them. Outside

---

44 See also Roman and Stanley (1997) in Leslie Roman and Linda Eyre, eds. (1997) for more on multiculturalism.
45 Note also that three of the four young women illustrated in 1981 and 1986 have their heads cocked to the side, in a deferential pose considered to be particularly feminine in western societies. They also all have long hair and pointed toes, also traditional western symbols of femininity. Furthermore, a constant feature of the illustrated Pathfinder uniform is the skirt. For 1981, 1986, and 1997, two versions of the skirt are shown and, for 1993, four versions are shown. The skirt can be read as a marker of Pathfinders’ transformation from child to feminine subject. Thanks to Becki Ross for drawing the skirt to my attention. For further discussion on femininity in Pathfinders, see chapter V.
Figure 4 Pathfinder handbook cover 1981

The Pathfinder Programme
Figure 5 Pathfinder handbook cover 1986
Pathfinder Fashion Parade

The wardrobe of a Pathfinder is both versatile and attractive. Like you, it has many sides — the practical, the playful, the formal. The weather, the planned activity, your unit's standards, your own preferences will influence your choice of outfit on any given occasion. Here is the parade of Pathfinder fashion choices for the 80's.

- White tailored, long-sleeved blouse
- White nylon square scarf with green maple leaves and blue border
- Navy blue skirt or pants (official design)
- Beige stockings or navy blue socks
- Appropriate shoes

- Blue and white checked gingham blouse
- Navy blue pants or shorts, cope blue activity skirt
- Navy blue socks

The suggested clothing for Special Activities and Informal Occasions is the blue and white gingham blouse with navy blue shorts or pants. For official groups attending International Events, uniform and kit requirement lists will be issued for each specific event.

Remember when you wear your uniform that you are a representative of the Organization, an active force in the creation of the image of Guiding in the Community and beyond. Wear it proudly and do it proud!
Figure 8 Pathfinder uniform 1986

YOUR PATHFINDER UNIFORM

- Blue camp hat (not depicted)
- Blue and white checked Pathfinder Blazer
- Navy blue pants or shorts, navy blue activity skirt
- Navy blue socks
- Appropriate shoes
- The Camp Uniform
- White t-shirt, long-sleeved blouse
- White or blue square-cut short-sleeved blouse and white pants
- The Official Pathfinder Uniform
- Navy blue shirt or pants
- Appropriate shoes
- The Official Pathfinder Uniform
- Dark stockings or Navy blue socks
- Appropriate shoes
- The Official Pathfinder Uniform

The Camp Uniform
The Camp Uniform
A selection from the official Pathfinder uniform items listed on page 1 and/or:
- Camp T-shirt (striped, crew-neck)
- Navy blue shorts
- Navy blue sweatpants
- Navy blue cap (no)
- Navy blue socks

The Official Pathfinder Uniform
A selection of the following items. The choice of uniform for all occasions is made by you and your family.
- Navy blue pants
- Striped polo T-shirt
- Striped blouse (short- or long-sleeved)
- Navy blue skirt or striped skirt
- Navy blue and white sweatshirt
- Belt
- Tie
- Badge sash
- Cardigan
- Appropriate hosiery and shoes
Your Pathfinder Uniform

Wear your uniform proudly.

as a representative of the Organization.

You may wear your uniform before you are enrolled.

* Uniform is not essential for enrolment.

* The choice of uniform for all occasions is made by you and your family. It is not a Unit or Guide decision.

* Only the badges and insignia outlined on pages 11 and 12 are worn on your Pathfinder uniform.

Pathfinder uniform consists of:

Pants

- navy blue, official design


Pants or Skirts

- navy blue, official design

- white with navy blue stripes, official design

with Polo

- white with navy blue stripes

T-shirt

- official design (not worn with striped shirt)

or Blouses

- white with navy blue stripes (long or short sleeves), official design
of illustrations, however, the programme has rarely represented Pathfinders themselves as being ethnic, and has implicitly portrayed ethnic people as "others." The contemporary programme places ethnic groups outside of the organization, inviting members inside only to share their customs and traditions. By doing so, the contemporary Pathfinder programme misses a valuable opportunity to show that responsible citizens are not only accepting of "other" cultures, but belong to "other" cultures. Furthermore, by concentrating on customs and traditions, and evading issues of power based on race and ethnicity, the contemporary Pathfinder programme sidesteps the politics of racism, normalizes whiteness, promotes liberal multiculturalism discourse, and legitimates current relations of power in Canada. In my view, it is essential for the Pathfinder curriculum to make Pathfinders aware of the race-based structural inequalities facing Canadian citizens. Moreover, to borrow from Roman (1993), Pathfinders also need to learn how to "disinvest" in racial privilege by critically considering how their own claims to the world contribute to structural racism in Canada.

**Considering ability**

More than sexuality, class, and ethnicity, discussion of ability has been central to the Pathfinder programme since it began in 1979. Pathfinder handbooks published during the first period encouraged Pathfinders to not only care for and about people with different abilities, but also to recognize systemic barriers that exclude people with disabilities from full participation in the social world. In 1985, Community Emblem challenges fifty-seven and fifty-nine challenged Pathfinders to "[s]how that you have an understanding of different kinds of disabilities, and of what you can do to help someone with a physical, mental, visual, hearing, speech, or medical disability" and to "[v]isit a hospital or treatment centre for the disabled" (Pathfinder Handbook 1985: 67). Pathfinders were further encouraged to "learn what makes a building suitable, or
unsuitable, for various disabilities” and to “[c]heck the public buildings in your community” (Ibid.). Consistent with these challenges are notes to Guiders that the Pathfinder programme is open to all girls and young women who wish to join. Guiders were asked to accommodate Pathfinders with disabilities and were told overtly that the programme,

from Brownies through Guides and Pathfinders to Rangers and Cadets, is flexible enough so that girls with almost any kind of disability can participate and gain a sense of achievement (Guider’s manual 1985: 23).

Furthermore, the 1999 Guider’s manual and Pathfinder handbook challenged Guiders and Pathfinders to consider what it means to be excluded because of one’s disability. Pathfinders were encouraged to discuss assumptions and stereotypes about people with disabilities, and were urged to serve their communities by helping to make public places more accessible. Consider the following two exercises and the guide to the exercises given in the Guider’s manual.

Visit parks and playgrounds or local public buildings and shopping areas in your community. Evaluate how accessible they are for people of different ages, abilities and interests to enjoy. What improvements would you recommend (Pathfinder Program 1999: 37)?

Discuss some of the challenges people with disabilities may face in being accepted as participating members of society. How do stereotypes affect them? (Ibid.)

Discuss some of the assumptions people make about people with disabilities. For example, talking loudly to people with a physical disability, assuming they need help instead of asking first, ostracising, impatience with people who need more time, etc. Follow up with role plays to show appropriate and inappropriate responses (Guider’s manual 1999: 64).

By recognizing the participation of Pathfinders with disabilities and encouraging Guiders to accommodate Pathfinders with disabilities, the Pathfinder programme teaches that one can be a responsible citizen regardless of her abilities. The programme also teaches that people with disabilities are important members of one’s community. Pathfinders are taught to be advocates of people with disabilities, and to take action in their communities to overcome assumptions and
stereotypes about them. Fighting for the rights of people with disabilities is not treated as a political issue to be swept under the carpet, but as an issue affecting the fair and equal treatment of Canadian citizens.

However, like ethnicity, the Pathfinder curriculum identifies disabilities as belonging to “others.” While the programme claims to be open to the participation of disabled girls and young women, people with disabilities are not represented in any of the challenges, and are physically represented in only one handbook and manual illustration (see figure 1). Furthermore, by teaching Pathfinders to be advocates for people with disabilities, the programme implies that Pathfinders themselves, and their Guiders, are not disabled, and privileges ability as the norm.

Like liberal multiculturalism discourse, rhetoric about including girls and women with disabilities in order to be more diverse deflects attention from the structural issues that women with disabilities face. Michelle Fine and Adrienne Asch (1985) identify these issues as labour discrimination (unemployment or underpaid employment), lower educational attainment than able-bodied people, the encouragement by medical professionals not to bear children, and forced sterilization (8). Women with disabilities also face structural barriers when it comes to raising children, accessing services for battered women, and even voting at the ballot box.

It is essential to consider these issues in terms of nation building in Canada. According to the Pathfinder curriculum, the ideal responsible citizen advocates for people with disabilities,

---

46 The 2000 Girl Guides of Canada survey of 2799 girls and young women in Guiding found that “24% of units have at least one member with a physical or mental disability [and] in total, 1.8% of the girls in the survey were identified as having a disability” (WAGGGS 2000). These figures were not compared with national data on disabilities. Though this data does not specifically refer to the Pathfinder programme, it is reasonable to assume that distributions in that branch would reflect the overall distribution in Guiding. A more expanded survey could explore this further.

47 For example, the majority of child sterilizations in Australia are performed on young women and girls with intellectual disabilities. Justifications have included eugenics, menstrual management, and prevention of pregnancy. This is, ultimately, an issue of class, gender and ability, as well as one of human rights and bodily integrity. For more detailed discussion on this topic, see The Sterilisation of Girls and Young Women in Australia: Issues and Progress by Susan Brady et al. (2001).
though she herself is able-bodied. The person with a disability is thus located outside of the realm of responsible citizenship, and needs people to advocate on her behalf. By constructing disability as a handicap, the state and civil institutions deflect attention from their failure to accommodate people with disabilities in full political life. Fine and Asch (1988) call this the social construction of disability - “it is the attitudes and institutions of the non-disabled, even more than the biological characteristics of the disabled, that turn characteristics into handicaps” (7). At this time, the Pathfinder curriculum is implicated in constructing disability as a handicap because it has not included people with disabilities in its ideal version of the responsible citizen. After reading through the Pathfinder handbooks and Pathfinder Guider’s manuals published between 1979 and 1999, I am left with a number of unanswered questions. The texts do not tell me whether curriculum materials are published in forms accessible to girls and young women with disabilities, such as in Braille or on audio cassette. Similarly, I wonder whether the organization provides ASL interpreters to accommodate deaf Pathfinders in their units. I also wonder whether Guiders with disabilities are recruited as role models for all Pathfinders, or whether recruiting for diversity only means recruiting Pathfinders under the assumption that they are “the Guided” and not “the Guiders.”

To best represent people with disabilities, the Pathfinder programme needs to do more than encourage the participation and assimilation of young women with disabilities in Pathfinder activities. While it remains important to represent girls and women with disabilities in Pathfinder challenges and illustrations, it is also important that the curriculum move beyond questions of representation. In my view, Pathfinders need to learn that disability is not a unitary concept, and that people with disabilities are also mothers, lovers, workers, and politically active citizens. Furthermore, the Pathfinder curriculum needs to treat disability as a status of political
oppression, separate from, but interrelated with, gender, class, race, and sexuality. Pathfinders can then learn not only to focus on the accessibility of parks and public buildings, but also to challenge the ways in which political structures like disability insurance programs and medical standards for employment restrict people with disabilities' opportunities for participation as full citizens. The Pathfinder curriculum could also include challenges that discuss the positive effects of disability on people's lives.48

Conclusion

Through an analysis meant to discover who is a responsible citizen according to the Pathfinder programme of the Girl Guides of Canada, I became aware of the ways in which gender, sexuality, class, ethnicity, and ability intersect and interrelate to create an ideal image of the responsible citizen. I began the chapter with a discussion of the origins of the Pathfinder programme, and noted that the age groupings of the Girl Guides of Canada programmes were developed to reflect stages of development popularized by child psychology theorists such as Erikson and Piaget. I then showed that the Girl Guides of Canada has increasingly relied on private and corporate donations as funding from Federal and Provincial governments has significantly decreased over the past two decades. I suggested that this trend may mean that corporations have increasing control over the content of Girl Guides of Canada curricula. I also noted that the Girl Guides of Canada is affiliated with a number of non-governmental organizations. Also in this section, I referred to the current coordinator of program delivery service, who told me that recruitment for members and Guiders of the Pathfinder branch happens

48 Mary Jo Deegan (1985) notes, for example, that women with disabilities may feel more free from sexist stereotypes than able-bodied women. Such freedom may allow them to concentrate on their work, dress comfortably, and be accepted as friend, rather than as a sexual object.
primarily by word of mouth, and that the programmes are periodically revised to keep up with current trends.

In the second section, I considered the centrality of teaching and learning about responsible citizenship in the Pathfinder programme. Between 1981 and 1999, Pathfinders were encouraged to produce skits depicting examples of good and poor citizenship, setting-up categories of deserving and non-deserving citizens, and learning to act as judges of their peers. Also in this section, I outlined the principles of Guiding by focussing on the Girl Guides of Canada Aim and Objectives, as well as its Promise and Law. I also traced the organization's arguments about the importance of single-sex education and recreation for girls and young women, and showed the ways in which the Girl Guides of Canada can be considered a liberal feminist organization.

In the third section of this chapter, I considered the characteristics of a responsible citizen and the ways in which the Pathfinder programme acts as an agent of moral regulation by normalizing particular identities and legitimating current relations of power. Here I was concerned with the kind of person that a responsible citizen is believed to be. I focused my analysis on five characteristics: gender, sexuality, class, ethnicity, and ability. I found that the Pathfinder programme teaches girls and young women that ideal responsible female citizens stand up for women’s rights and the rights of people with disabilities. They are middle-class and white, and they have romantic relationships with boys and young men. Pathfinders are not represented as “ethnic,” nor as having disabilities. I argued that, by encouraging the sharing of cultural artifacts, the liberal multiculturalism rhetoric espoused by the programme deflects attention from relations of power based on race, and contributes to processes of Canadian nation building. Similarly, I argued that the rhetoric of diversity and inclusion of people with disabilities
also deflects attention away from structural barriers to full citizenship that people with disabilities face. By not taking up issues of heterosexism, homophobia, classism, racism, or ableism in its programme, the Pathfinder branch of the Girl Guides of Canada normalizes heterosexuality, middle-classness, whiteness, and able-bodiedness, tacitly supporting current relations of power in Canadian society.
Chapter V

What makes a citizen responsible?
Moral regulation in the Pathfinder Programme

Five of the most frequently highlighted themes in the Pathfinder Programme are volunteer service, respect for the environment, preparation for paid employment, health and hygiene, and cheerfulness and obedience. As I illustrate below, references to these themes have been included in the Pathfinder Programme since its inception. The first three themes (volunteer service, respect for the environment, and preparation for paid employment) either appear in conjunction with references to responsible citizenship, or they are included in sections of the programme that relate directly to citizenship, such as the citizenship pathway of the Community Emblem (see figure 2b). Though references to health and hygiene are not often accompanied by references to responsible citizenship, their dominance in the Pathfinder Programme, which aims to teach responsible citizenship to girls and young women, suggests that health and hygiene are central to the programme’s conception of what it takes to be a responsible citizen. Notably, references that connected responsible citizenship to being cheerful and obedient were prominent in early Pathfinder handbooks and Pathfinder Guider’s manuals, but disappeared from those publications in the early 1990s. While I observed some differences in all of these themes over the three periods (1979-1985, 1985-1993, 1997-1999), their ideals and their centrality to definitions of responsible citizenship remained fairly consistent between 1979 and 1999. In this chapter, I will explore each theme and show some ways in which these themes are implicated in practices of moral regulation central to capitalist nation building in Canada.
Giving service and respecting the environment

Service to the community has always been at the heart of Girl Guiding. As explained in all of the Pathfinder handbooks, serving their community is one of the ways that Pathfinders can show their commitment to responsible citizenship. The following excerpt is from the 1999 Pathfinder handbook.

Helping others, or service, is the very heart of Guiding. From helping someone without being asked, to the more extended community service, we see Guiding in action.... You can help at home or in the community. As a unit or individually, you can help at blood donor clinics, hospitals, places of worship, nursing homes, or at Guiding activities.... Pathfinders find ways to fulfill the Promise and Law by giving time, energy and enthusiasm whenever they see an opportunity to help (5).

In fact, as the 1981 Pathfinder handbook explains, the Emblems earned in the programme do not represent rewards or medals that show “what a smart girl” a Pathfinder is, but rather are symbols that a Pathfinder has done the thing it stands for often enough, thoroughly enough, and well enough to be prepared to give service in it. [She] wear[s] the emblem to let people know that [she is] prepared and willing to be called on because [she is] a Girl Guide (56).

Through its aim to help girls and young women become responsible citizens, the Pathfinder programme contains a number of challenges that require Pathfinders to volunteer in the community. Consider challenge sixty-one from the 1984 Community Emblem and challenge two from the 1999 knowledge and service pathway of the Community Emblem:

List the opportunities that exist for you to become involved in community service. Select one and become actively involved for at least two months. Explain how the Guide Promise is upheld by performing community service (67).

Brainstorm ways in which you can give service in your community. Choose a service project and with a group, or alone, take part in it (37).

Not only is service to the community at the heart of Guiding, it is also, according to the texts, at the heart of the responsible citizen. As explained in the 1981 Pathfinder handbook, some
people are more likely to give service to the community than others. Consider challenge fifty-six of the Community Emblem, which emphasized service and suggested that particular kinds of people (the same people that are responsible citizens?) provide service to their communities:

Investigate the need for giving service in the community. What kind of person volunteers and why do they volunteer? Tell what relationship this has to our Guide Law, “A Guide is useful and helps others” (Pathfinder handbook 1981: 66).

The 1985 Guider’s manual also linked the Pathfinder personality with a capability and willingness to serve her community. A section on service noted that “Pathfinders, with their many skills, can accept increasing responsibilities” (117). Guiders were encouraged to help Pathfinders explore how they can serve their communities by inviting “people from social service agencies, hospitals, institutions, public health units, nursing homes and volunteer agencies, to discuss ways in which Pathfinders can serve” (Guider’s manual 1985: 117). The connection between being the kind of person who volunteers and being a good citizen suggests a merging of public and private spheres. It is summed up in the following statement made in the 1981 Pathfinder handbook:

Girl Guiding is not just knowing but doing – not just doing but being. A First Class Girl Guide is a first class person (56).

Note here the strong connection drawn between serving the community and being a “first-class” person. Drawing a connection between giving unpaid service and being a quality person is one way in which moral regulation works to gain the consent of citizens to the workings of the capitalist state. Under capitalism, work that involves the production and consumption of material goods is most valued. Work that is tangential to this cycle, such as education and caregiving, is considered to be less valuable. Since the mid twentieth century, the Canadian welfare state has provided publicly funded social services such as education, health care, and various forms of
economic relief. In recent years, however, these services have faced massive fiscal cutbacks that have resulted in employee lay-offs and increased work loads for remaining workers.

Canadian feminists Janine Brodie and Isabella Bakker have argued that Canada’s transition from a Keynesian welfare state (with a comprehensive social-welfare system and government intervention in the economy) to one with a neoliberal agenda (which privileges exports, a reduction in social spending, and curtailed state economic regulation) has particularly gendered effects (Brodie 1996: 8). Bakker (1996) notes, for example, that “the recasting of welfare state services and benefits signals an assumption by the state that “the community” (read: women) will increasingly ‘take-up the slack’” (35). Bakker points to the movement toward community care for the elderly, terminally ill, and people with disabilities (Ibid: 36). Because caregiving, nurturance, and self-sacrifice have historically been naturalized as innately feminine traits, Canadian women are often expected to be primary caregivers (of children, as illustrated by the lack of a national day care program; and of their elderly or disabled relatives). Because of this expectation, “community care” often means that women are the ones responsible for filling holes left by cutbacks to social services.

The Pathfinder programme becomes complicit in the neoliberal agenda by encouraging girls and young women to give unpaid volunteer service in their communities without questioning the broader social and economic implications of their actions. By constructing helping at nursing homes, blood donor clinics, and hospitals as “service,” the Pathfinder curriculum helps to maintain the construction of caregiving as “service” as opposed to “work.” In this way, the programme justifies the low pay and value associated with caring jobs that is central to the operation of the capitalist state.
Similar to caring work, caring for the environment is also constructed as part of giving service to the community. Over the past 20 years, the Pathfinder programme has become increasingly focused on having Pathfinders complete challenges that show dedication to energy conservation and environmental preservation. During the first period the focus was on energy and water conservation, as illustrated by challenges eighteen and nineteen of the 1981 Community Emblem:

Using cartoons, clippings, and articles, show ways to conserve energy (Pathfinder handbook 1981: 64).

With your Emblem Group, plan a panel discussion on conservation of water (Ibid.).

By 1985, concerns about the environment included water pollution and acid rain, and the challenges linked concern for the environment to possible service projects for Pathfinders to carry out. The 1985 Community Emblem challenged Pathfinders to:

[d]iscover how the community and province/territory are involved in the conservation of our resources. Using this knowledge, encourage your group to become more conservation minded and demonstrate how to protect your environment (Pathfinder handbook 1985: 64).

The Guider's manual for the same year suggested the following activity involving litter pick-up.

Girls meet outside place of worship, hike to river, divide into two groups and are challenged to see which group can fill the most garbage bags with litter in an hour. Winners have choice of cooking lunch or cleaning up afterwards. Cook-out, followed by prearranged pickup of girls and litter by parents (Guider's manual 1985: 128).

Challenges in the third period similarly required Pathfinders to become knowledgeable about the environment. Consider the following examples from the 1993 Be Prepared Emblem and the 1999 Community Emblem:

Learn about the dangers in your province caused by pollutants such as acid rain and industrial wastes. Find out what is being done to lessen these dangers (Pathfinder handbook 1993: 18).
Adopt a natural area near you, for example, a stream, river, pond, ocean front or beach, for a minimum of one Guiding year. Keep the area clear of litter during this time. Keep a diary of your activities. Involve your community if possible (Pathfinder handbook 1999: 38).

Being a responsible citizen clearly involves respecting nature and caring for one's environment by conserving energy and picking up litter. Note that all of this work is mentioned in the context of service, rather than paid employment. Through these challenges, Pathfinders learn that they, and their parents, rather than corporations and the state, are responsible for caring for the environment. In this way, the Pathfinder programme works to support capitalist nation building in Canada. By teaching youth that caring for the environment is part of volunteer service, the Pathfinder programme enables governments and corporations to take minimal responsibility for the environmental damage caused by capitalist over-production and over-consumption. Furthermore, by focusing on services like picking up litter, the Pathfinder programme depoliticizes environmental issues, isolating them from broader political and economic forces at work in Canada.

The programme’s emphasis on caring and environmental work as service seems to contradict the programme’s emphasis on pay equity. If caring and environmental work are considered service, what types of jobs are relevant to a discussion of pay equity? To see the contrast between jobs that are constructed as “service” and those that are constructed as “work” in the Pathfinder programme, I considered the ways in which paid work is discussed and defined in the Pathfinder curriculum.

Preparation for paid employment

Like service, the importance of working for pay is emphasized in most of the Pathfinder Emblems, including the Community Emblem, Home Emblem, and World Emblem. For example,
challenge seventy-nine of the 1985 Community Emblem, which is a required challenge for the Canada Cord, encouraged Pathfinders to:

Discuss the jobs available in your community. Select one of these as a possible career or make a choice of your own. Prepare a report stating: the education and skills needed, advancement possibilities, working conditions and environment, job description, salary, and fringe benefits (Pathfinder handbook 1985: 68).

Examples from the third period similarly encouraged Pathfinders to consider jobs that they could do. Challenges eight and nine of the 1999 knowledge and service pathway of the Community Emblem asked Pathfinders to:

Discuss what part-time jobs are available for teenagers in your community and how you would apply for one of these jobs (Pathfinder handbook 1999: 38).

Identify and explain how skills you have could lead to a self-employed, part-time job (Ibid.).

The Pathfinder programme clearly places significant value on paid work. Consistent with capitalist ideals of production and consumption, Pathfinders are encouraged to explore career options as early as age 12, and can even learn how to apply for a part-time job. From these examples, it is obvious that the Pathfinder programme associates working for pay with being a responsible citizen. This association is important for capitalist nation building in Canada, which relies on the development of a work ethic that privileges self-sufficiency, self-discipline, thrift, and time-management.

In contrast to the challenges related to service, the above passages about paid employment emphasize education and skills. Caring work and environmental stewardship are constructed as innate extensions of femaleness and as unskilled types of work, while paid employment is constructed as skilled. Though there are few examples in the programme of the types of jobs Pathfinders are expected to have, challenge sixteen from the 1999 citizenship pathway of the Community Emblem serves as one example.
Find out about a career in the service of Canada (for example, the armed forces, elected government official, the civil service, the RCMP, etc.) (*Pathfinder handbook* 1999: 36).

In this example, working in the service of Canada may very well involve policing responsible citizenship. Through the Pathfinder programme, girls and young women not only learn to police their own behaviour, but are also encouraged to become part of Canada’s surveillance complex by finding employment in law and the civil service. The armed forces, the government, the civil service, and the RCMP are all involved in the administration and discipline of the population and, by encouraging Pathfinders to engage with these organizations, the Pathfinder programme prepares girls and young women to police their peers according to state-sanctioned ideals of morality and normality. Of course, employment in the law and civil service is not the only option suggested to Pathfinders. As noted by Varpalotai (1994), Girl Guides are also encouraged to pursue non-traditional occupations and to look-up to high-profile women, such as journalist Michelle Landsberg and astronaut Roberta Bondar, as role models.

An emphasis on paid work as a component of responsible citizenship also helps to set up two categories of citizens – the deserving citizen who works and the undeserving citizen who does not work. These categories are especially strong in the contemporary context, where neoliberal policies have identified some citizens, particularly the unemployed and women on welfare, as lazy free-loaders. Brodie writes,

> The new idea of the common good rests on market-oriented values such as self-reliance, efficiency, and competition. The new good citizen is one who recognizes the limits and liabilities of state provision and embraces the obligation to work longer and harder in order to become more self-reliant (1996: 19).

---

49Foucault refers to the surveillance complex as part of the panoptics of every day (1979: 223). The purpose of the Panopticon (an architectural design for prisons intended to allow guards to see inmates at all times), Foucault writes, is “to induce in the inmate a state of conscious and permanent visibility that assures the automatic functioning of power” (Ibid: 201). The Panopticon is not restricted to prison structures. Foucault argues that it must be understood “as a generalizable model of functioning; a way of defining power relations in terms of the everyday life of men [sic]” (Ibid: 205).
By emphasizing paid employment as a sign of responsible citizenship and encouraging employment in the disciplinary mechanisms of the state, the Pathfinder programme supports capitalist nation building in Canada. At the same time, however, the programme challenges essentialist assumptions about femininity by encouraging Pathfinders to strive for economic independence and participation in non-traditional occupations.

**Health, hygiene, and responsible citizenship**

Like the commitment to teaching Pathfinders to give service, respect the environment, and explore paid employment, the commitment to teaching Pathfinders how to be healthy and hygienic has remained a central part of the programme over the past twenty years. Health and hygiene-related challenges run through all of the Emblems, though most often are categorized under the Be Prepared and Home Emblems.

According to the Pathfinder texts, it is important for a Pathfinder to take an active approach to her health by eating according to the Canada food guide (see figure 11), exercising and avoiding drugs and tobacco. Challenges for the 1999 Home Emblem included the following:

- Make a list of the foods you have eaten during the past *three* days. Include all snacks. Evaluate whether or not you ate well according to Canada’s food guide. How could you improve your eating habits (*Pathfinder handbook* 1999: 42, emphasis in original)?

- On a restricted budget, plan and record costs of a balanced and nutritious menu for a family of four for a day (*Guider’s manual* 1999: 73).

- Discuss how tobacco is harmful to your health and the health of others (*Pathfinder handbook* 1999: 39).

Similarly, the Be Prepared Emblem encouraged Pathfinders to


As I noted above in the section on service, the Pathfinder programme ties one’s actions to the quality of her character. These challenges further demonstrate that connection. In an
Figure 11 Pathfinders and the Canada Food Guide

(Pathfinder Program 1997: 42)
expanded version of "you are what you eat," the programme encourages Pathfinders to learn to become responsible citizens by eating sensibly and being honest about their food intake (Guider’s manual 1997: 72). For Pathfinders, personal health is an expression of the self.

In “Recipes for Democracy? Gender, Family and Making Female Citizens in Cold War Canada,” Franca Iacovetta argues that cooking lessons and food guides were widely disseminated in post World War II Canada in attempts to assimilate new immigrants to middle-class, pro-capitalist Canadian food customs (2000: 16). Similarly, the project of teaching healthy eating habits to Pathfinders (who, as I showed in chapter IV, more and more are from poor and immigrant families) can be viewed as a process of social intervention designed to gain young women’s consent to particular ways of preparing particular kinds of food. Learning to eat according to Canada’s food guide is just one of the ways that Pathfinders learn about domesticity. The handbooks place an equal emphasis on hygiene around the home. Consider challenge thirty-one from the 1981 Pathfinder handbook.

What weekly cleaning is needed in your home? take over the cleaning of one specific family area, e.g., kitchen, bathroom, living area, etc. When you have mastered it, take over the cleaning of another area. Do this until you have learned how to take care of all areas (Pathfinder Programme 1981: 70).

Ross argues that organizations serving young women have historically prepared them for poorly paid domestic work. She notes that at Street Haven, in the mid 1960’s, job-oriented strategies prepared women for “underpaid, undervalued, and insecure forms of commercialized domestic service expressive of respectable gender roles” (1997: 578). Similarly, in her study of a twentieth century American federal Indian boarding school, K. Tsianina Lomawaima (1995) found that girls were trained for domestic service with the underlying federal agenda being “to train Indian girls in subservience and submission to authority” (200). Lomawaima argues that domesticity training was “training in dispossession under the guise of domesticity, developing a
habitus shaped by messages about subservience and one’s proper place” (Ibid: 203). Sangster similarly ties domestic training to moral regulation, and argues that domestic training was a method used to control young women’s sexuality. The Mercer Reformatory, she notes, aimed to teach discipline, self-control, new morals, and some skills for domestic life or feminine occupations. She writes,

Correcting bad language; learning respect for others, especially elders; learning cleanliness; and working everyday at a job were all part of the program to help women improve their moral character and thus ultimately control their sexual behaviour (Sangster 1996: 252).

In addition to teaching the importance of hygiene around the home, the Pathfinder programme also emphasizes the importance of personal hygiene as a sign of responsible citizenship. For the 1981 Home Emblem, Pathfinders were encouraged to outline a weekly plan that one should follow to maintain good hygiene and health habits (Pathfinder programme 1981: 74). In 1990, the Home Emblem challenged Pathfinders to invite a knowledgeable person to the unit to “discuss hair care, the use of cosmetics and good grooming” (Pathfinder program 1990: 37). In the 1999 Guider’s manual, the aid to the latter challenge suggested that Guiders invite a representative from a cosmetic company in your area to your Unit to teach girls about skin care and makeup. A hairdresser can help with hair care and styling. Someone who has taken a modelling course is another possible resource. Some Units also like to visit a salon that teaches about hair care, cosmetics, and appearance (67).

These passages about health and hygiene give clues about what it means to be a responsible female citizen and, in doing so, help to organize particular definitions of femininity. Here I build from Dorothy Smith, who argues that texts are not only reflections of the social organization of

---

50 Note that despite their similarities, the cases presented by Ross and Lomawaima are fundamentally different. While the programs at Street Haven were oriented to cultural reproduction, the programs at the federal Indian school were oriented to cultural obliteration and transformation. It could, however, be argued that Street Haven programs were also oriented to the obliteration and transformation of queer culture. See Ross 1997 for a discussion of how tattoo removal and other practices aimed to eliminate markers of lesbian identity.

127
femininity but are also constituents of the social organization of femininity (1990: 166). In the Pathfinder programme, health, domestic hygiene, and personal hygiene all constitute feminine practice. Similar to the Pathfinder curriculum, Ross notes that staff at Street Haven “facilitated the participation of their clients in programs hinged to ordinary notions of appropriate feminine practice – maintaining mainstream standards of fashion and personal hygiene, as well as typing, waitressing, sewing, laundry, and housekeeping” (1998b: 577). For Pathfinders, like the young women at Street Haven, feminine practice is something to be administered, managed, and regulated.

Cheerfulness and obedience and responsible citizenship

Unlike commitments to teaching Pathfinders to give volunteer service, respect the environment, explore paid work, and be healthy and clean, the commitment to teaching Pathfinders to be cheerful and obedient has not (overtly) endured the Pathfinder’s twenty years of operation. In the first period, from 1979 to 1985, the Girl Guide Aim, Law, and Promise encouraged Pathfinders to be “happy members of society” (Pathfinder handbook 1981: 10), to be obedient, and to “smile and sing even under difficulty” (Bridge 1979: 31). The significance of obedience was reiterated in the Guide Promise of that period, where Pathfinders promised to “obey the Guide Law” (Bridge 1979: 31). The importance of appearing cheerful was further elaborated in the handbooks and Guider manuals published before 1985. The 1984 Guider’s manual, Learning to Lead, asked Guiders to consider “[w]hat sort of an atmosphere builder are you?” and told Guiders that “[a] smile and song go far to promote a happy atmosphere.

51 In her chapter “Femininity as Discourse,” Smith argues that discourses of femininity articulate “a moral order vested in appearance to a market and the production of commodities” (1990: 171). Discourses of femininity, Smith notes, are reproduced, revised, and updated in magazines, books, televisions shows, and popular theology, philosophy, and psychology (1990: 174). It may be useful to consider how Smith’s concept of femininity as social accomplishment can be used to understand the Pathfinder curriculum.
Complaining, nagging and dissatisfaction breed more discontent and misery” (*Learning to Lead* 1984: 12).

The practices of obedience, smiling and singing under difficulty, and appearing cheerful, all require strict discipline of one’s body and reflect middle-class prescriptions of feminine practice. Franca Iacovetta argues that social work agencies in Post World War II Canada aimed to teach middle-class ideals of cheerful femininity to new Canadian families. She writes,

> In positing a return to a ‘normal’ family life, Canada’s family and medical experts, like the American and British colleagues whose viewpoints they shared, were simultaneously expounding a familiar, middle-class ideal of womanhood that reaffirmed women’s domestic orientation. Women, it was argued, possessed the moral capacity to provide their families with an emotional haven in an uncertain world, and it was precisely through their selfless contributions to home and family that they found true happiness and fulfillment.... The ideal portrait of the married woman, then, was of a cheerful wife and good mother who accepted her social responsibility and reaped the benefits in the form of a contented husband and well-adjusted children (1998: 492).

In similar ways, the Pathfinder curriculum before 1997 taught girls and young women that cheerfulness and obedience were markers of responsible Canadian citizenship. In doing so, the Pathfinder programme normalized middle-class definitions of femininity. More importantly, however, by teaching girls and young women that nagging and complaining were markers of irresponsible citizenship, the Pathfinder programme buttressed the social, political, and economic order that relied on the second-class citizenship status of Canadian women.

For 1997, all references to obedience and smiling and singing even under difficulty were removed from the Guide Law. Similarly, the wording of the Guide Promise was changed from “obey the Guiding Law” to “accept the Guiding Law” (*Pathfinder handbook* 1997: 4). These changes correspond with other efforts to modernize the Guiding programme, like calling Pathfinders “citizens” instead of “members of society,” having girls and young women learn about and advocate for pay equity, and changing the Guiding Aim to a mission statement. These
transitions coincide with, and, to a large extent, can probably be attributed to, a greater influence of liberal feminist ideology on Guiding programmes. I suspect that this influence comes directly from volunteer leaders who have experienced more economic independence and access to non-traditional occupations than their counterparts did in earlier decades. While responsible citizenship in the 1980s may have meant that one was cheerful, responsible citizenship in the 1990s, according to the Pathfinder programme, does not depend on one’s level of cheer. As shown throughout this thesis, however, contented conformity to particular white, middle-class, “Canadian,” heterosexist values remain central to notions of responsible citizenship. The Pathfinder programme continues to act as an authorizing agent that helps to shape the identity and behaviour of girls and young women.

**Interrelations and contradictions**

It is important to note that the categories presented here interrelate with one another in complex ways. For example, at the beginning of this chapter I demonstrated that assumptions about appropriate types of service and paid employment are often connected to assumptions about appropriately gendered behaviour. Similarly, the theme of health and hygiene interrelates with class. Maintaining proper health and a hygienic home and body requires the investment of a certain amount of capital. By suggesting that Pathfinders are concerned with cosmetics and hair care, the Pathfinder programme normalizes middle-class constructions of femininity. Race and ethnicity, sexuality, and ability also interrelate together and with the themes of service, work, hygiene, and obedience. Although I have organized these themes separately for the purposes of readability, it is imperative to recognize that all of the themes are intricately connected.

It is also important to consider the contradictory messages about responsible citizenship espoused in the Pathfinder programme. For example, Pathfinders are encouraged to try foods
from different cultures and, at the same time, are urged to follow the recommendations of the Canada food guide. Pathfinders also learn that the Girl Guides of Canada does not discriminate on the basis of sexuality, but their texts only refer to examples of heterosexual identity and behaviour. Similarly, Pathfinder texts encourage the participation of poor girls and girls and young women with disabilities, but the actual participation rates of these populations is low. These contradictions attest to the challenges that the Girl Guides of Canada faces today. Drawing from Linda Briskin (1994), I understand these contradictions not as flaws, but as connoting dynamic tensions that are never fully resolved. Briskin writes,

> The concept of contradiction recognizes that what needs to be changed is not superficial and not only inside the individual: it is systemic – structurally and ideologically. Naming the contradictions is a powerful motor for change. The recognition of “opposing forces” suggests choices; challenges the obvious, the accepted, the “natural”; and forces [one] to seek understanding in order to seek a position (460).

By recognizing the contradictions in the Pathfinder programme, I also identify the ways in which the programme departs from a moral regulatory approach. Contradictions in the programme point out that there is more than one way to be a responsible citizen. Faced with contradictory messages, it is up to Pathfinders to work through what the curriculum means to them.

**Conclusion**

Recall my earlier discussion in chapter IV of the centrality of responsible citizenship in the Pathfinder programme. In that section, I quoted a passage from the 1999 Guider’s manual that outlined the responsibilities of being a Canadian citizen. Characteristics of responsibility included keeping the laws, respecting the rights and property of others, voting, using natural resources, and serving the community (*Guider’s manual* 1999: 58). In this chapter, I have illustrated that doing unpaid caring and environmental work, preparing for participation in the
disciplinary mechanisms of the state, and maintaining one's health and domestic hygiene are also signs of responsible citizenship.

By normalizing caring work as volunteer service, the Pathfinder programme gains the consent of girls and young women to contemporary wage structures that devalue the work that women do in daycares, hospitals, and other caregiving venues. And by teaching that working for pay equals responsible citizenship, the Pathfinder programme sets-up categories of morality based on capitalist values of production and consumption. The programme also defines responsible femininity as conforming to middle-class standards of health, cleanliness, cheerfulness and obedience. I have also demonstrated in this chapter that service, sacrifice, caring for the environment, preparing for paid employment, good health and hygiene, and obedience are instrumental to the workings of capitalism, and to Canadian nation building in general.

While encouraging unpaid caring work, participation in the regulatory mechanisms of the state, and particular forms of domestic femininity implicates the Pathfinder programme in the moral regulation of girls and young women, the contradictions of the programme suggest that moral regulation is not a straightforward process. As Pathfinders encounter contradictions in the programme, they learn to negotiate with the different messages they receive. Most importantly, they learn that there are various ways that one can be a responsible citizen.
Chapter VI

Conclusion: Where do we go from here?

In this thesis, I aimed to uncover assumptions about the rights, meanings, entitlements, and responsibilities of Canadian citizenship, and to explore how these assumptions contribute to processes of nation building in Canada. I have argued that youth service organizations, and the Girl Guides of Canada in particular, are implicated in the regulation of young women’s sexual behaviour. In this thesis, I also argued that the Pathfinder programme supports liberal diversity rhetoric around issues of gender, class, ethnicity and disability, and fails to address structural inequalities arising out of sexism, classism, racism, ableism, and heterosexism. The Pathfinder curriculum normalizes heterosexuality, middle-classness, whiteness, and able-bodiedness, and gains consent to particular gender scripts, tacitly supporting current relations of power in Canadian society. Similarly, by encouraging girls and young women to perform unpaid caring work and environmental stewardship, and prepare for paid employment as managers and administrators of their peers, the Pathfinder curriculum contributes to capitalist nation building in Canada. Furthermore, by promoting middle-class ideals of health and hygiene, the Pathfinder programme normalizes particular definitions of domestic femininity and reinforces the dominance of middle-class forms of cultural capital.

To arrive at the above conclusions, I conducted a discourse analysis of ten Pathfinder handbooks and six Pathfinder Guider’s manuals. Because texts act as authorizing agents that legitimate and constitute particular constructions of social reality, discourse analysis enabled me to make sense of the ways in which responsible citizens are imagined and how consent to these images is gained through the Pathfinder curriculum. Discourse analysis also enabled me to attend to power and orient my analysis to social change. I considered the dominant themes of identity
and behaviour with which references to citizenship were made. In chapter II, I reviewed existing literature on youth services at the turn of the twentieth century, during the post World War II period, and during the late twentieth century. I discussed the origins and history of youth service organizations in Canada to show that they have played a role in nation building in Canada. I drew on Wendy Sterne, Carol Auster, Karen Altman, and Sarah Heath to show that youth service organizations for girls and young women at the turn of the century privileged and encouraged normative heterofeminine behaviour among their members. I then reviewed research by Mary Louise Adams, Joan Sansgter, and Becki Ross that showed that youth service in the post World War II period similarly normalized heterofeminine behaviour for young female Canadians. Finally, I considered work by Aniko Varpalotai and Nancy Manahan, who argue that the Girl Guides of Canada and Girl Scouts USA in the late twentieth century are more inclusive organizations than in the past, though they have not yet addressed the systemic heterosexism and homophobia that continues to plague their organizations.

In chapter III, I discussed T.H. Marshall’s liberal citizenship theory and feminist contributions to theories of citizenship. Specifically, I referred to Nira Yuval-Davis and Floya Anthias and Jacqui Alexander, who argue that states have historically identified select women as transmitters of culture and biological producers for the nation. I also used Yasmeen Abu-Laban and David Held’s concept of substantive citizenship and David Evans’, Jeffrey Weeks’, and Lauren Berlant’s concept of sexual citizenship to show that liberal citizenship theory does not account for differentiated citizenship rights based on gender, race, and sexuality. Also in this chapter, I took up the debate between theories of social control and moral regulation. Drawing on Stanley Cohen, Joan Sangster, and Carolyn Strange and Tina Loo, I argued that theories of moral regulation best account for power that is exercised by youth service organizations to gain consent
to particular definitions of responsible citizenship. I also showed how I would treat “responsible citizenship” as a discursive concept by drawing on work by Beverly Skeggs, Mary Louise Adams and Michel Foucault.

In chapters IV and V, I conducted a discourse analysis of the curriculum of the Pathfinder branch of the Girl Guides of Canada. After detailing how the Girl Guides of Canada is organized, how it is funded, and with whom it is affiliated, I analyzed the principles of the programme by drawing on existing analyses of youth service organizations and theories of moral regulation. I divided the contemporary period into three terms: 1979-1985, 1986-1993, and 1997-1999, and compared the content of the handbooks and manuals in each of these terms. By considering gender, sexuality, class, ethnicity, and ability, I found that girls and young women enrolled in the Pathfinder programme in the late twentieth century were encouraged to stand up against sexual harassment and stand up for pay equity, though this occurred in a liberal feminist context where Pathfinders were not taught to consider patriarchy as an organizational schema.

To fully understand sexual harassment, violence against women, and pay equity policies, it is important that Pathfinders learn about how patriarchal social organization works to oppress women. Teaching Pathfinders to look up to successful women as role models is important, and I commend the Girl Guides of Canada for its efforts to encourage girls and young women to strive to do and be their best. At the same time, however, it is important that Pathfinders learn that power is organized according to sexist social relations. As Briskin (1994) writes,

the truth is that little girls cannot be anything they want: formal and informal, ideological and material discrimination stands in their way. So if they are taught that everything is possible, that sex and gender do not matter, then when they come up against the limits of what is possible, easy, or acceptable, they can only conclude that they must be at fault.
Teaching Pathfinders that relations of power are structural could involve group discussions about women’s participation in a variety of occupations. Pathfinders could be asked to brainstorm and discuss ideas about women’s representation in different levels of government or business. Such an approach could focus on understanding the barriers that prevent women from entering particular occupational fields and could review some of the collective strategies that have enabled some women to overcome those barriers.

I also found that heterosexuality was normalized in the Pathfinder programme, where heterosexist assumptions of dating and romantic interest prevailed. By normalizing and privileging heterosexuality, the Pathfinder curriculum marginalizes young women who may be lesbian or bisexual. As such, it gives consent to, and buttresses, unequal power relations based on sexuality. I argued that the Girl Guides of Canada has not addressed heterosexism and homophobia in its organization and I suggested that it is important that the Girl Guides of Canada does so. Addressing issues of heterosexism and homophobia in the Pathfinder curriculum is not about teaching sex but about teaching that one does not have to be heterosexual to be a full, equal, and responsible Canadian citizen. At the end of this chapter, I have included sample lesson plans developed by the Gay and Lesbian Educators of British Columbia (GALE) for teaching about heterosexism and homophobia.

Through my analysis, I also found that the Girl Guides of Canada has recently attempted to make its programmes more accessible to poor and immigrant girls and young women. Drawing on work by Franca Iacovetta, I argued that this attempt at inclusiveness also serves as an attempt to gain the consent of working class immigrant youth to particular middle-class values of taste, thrift and consumption. Furthermore, while the Pathfinder programme in the late twentieth century was continually focused on exploring diverse cultures in Canada, I noted that it
rarely identified Pathfinders as being “ethnic” themselves. While the early Pathfinder programme asked Pathfinders and Guiders to consider racism in Canadian society, later handbooks and manuals focused only on cultural diversity, missing an opportunity to show that responsible citizens not only accept other cultures, but belong to other cultures. The curriculum also fails to make Pathfinders aware of the ways in which racialization structures social, political, and economic relations in Canada, and neglects to teach Pathfinders about how they can fight against racism in their own communities.

A revised Pathfinder curriculum might include a challenge that asks Pathfinders to discuss their own experiences with racism. As Pathfinders share their stories in small groups, they may come to recognize the structural nature of racist social relations, and may be encouraged to act collectively to fight against racism in Canadian society. Another challenge may ask Pathfinders to discuss some ways in which their own claims to the world reinforce the social organization of racism. Pathfinders could also be challenged to develop strategies for holding institutions accountable for racist practices.

One area where Pathfinders were taught to exercise political advocacy was in support of the rights of people with disabilities. Since its inception, the Pathfinder programme has encouraged Guiders to accommodate Pathfinders with disabilities, and has taught that one can be a responsible citizen regardless of her abilities. By teaching Pathfinders to be advocates for people with disabilities, however, the Pathfinder curriculum constructs people with disabilities as “others,” implies that Pathfinders and their Guiders are not disabled, and privileges ability as the norm. I argued that concentrating on the participation and assimilation of girls and women with disabilities deflects attention from larger issues that women with disabilities face, and excuses the state and civil institutions from failing to accommodate people with disabilities in full
political life. The Pathfinder curriculum could be revised to include challenges that attend to fighting the systemic discrimination that people with disabilities face in Canadian society.

Because being a responsible citizen is as much about what one does as it is about who one is, in chapter V I considered the qualities that are most associated with citizenship in the Pathfinder curriculum. I discovered that responsible citizens, according to Pathfinder texts, serve their communities by performing caring work and environmental clean-ups for free, prepare to join the labour force, and are healthy and hygienic. I concluded that the values and behaviours encouraged in the Pathfinder curriculum intersect in ways to gain the consent of girls and young women to capitalist models of production and consumption, and to sexist, racist, classist, and heterosexist forms of social organization. While the Girl Guides of Canada no longer requires members to pledge to be obedient and smile and sing under difficulty, its programmes earn the obedience and complicity of members in a more covert fashion – through the normalization of heterosexuality, whiteness, and ability and by recruiting Pathfinders as workers in state surveillance machinery.

In chapter V I also suggested that the themes of gender, sexuality, ethnicity, class, ability, service, work, health and hygiene, and obedience are interrelated in complex ways. While it was necessary for me to consider these themes separately in this thesis for readability, it is integral to recognize that no theme stands alone. Furthermore, prescriptions for responsible citizenship are often contradictory, pointing out that there are various ways for a Pathfinder to perform responsible citizenship. These contradictions also illustrate that there is room for new interpretations of what it means to be a responsible citizen.
Contributions

My research contributes to literature on citizenship and nation building, moral regulation, and youth service organizations. By taking into account the role that extra-state organizations play in attempts to gain the consent of girls and young women to particular definitions of responsible citizenship, my research has added a new dimension to contemporary citizenship studies. Similarly, by considering citizenship in the context of youth service organizations, my research contributes to literature about recreational services for youth. My work also contributes to theoretical debates about the centrality of identity in social relations by showing the varied ways in which identity is used as a marker through which to include and exclude people from full Canadian citizenship. Furthermore, this research also sets the foundation for new directions of research, as outlined below. I have also contributed to Girl Guides of Canada programmes by developing recommendations for how the organization can include teaching about homophobia and heterosexism in its curricula.

Directions for future research

It is important to recognize that gaining the consent of young women to particular definitions of responsible citizenship is not a straightforward process. Definitions of responsible citizenship are not only gendered, racialized, classed, and sexualized; they are also contradictory and contingent upon social and historical contexts. One’s interpretation of what it means to be a responsible citizen is contingent upon the ways in which she connects the ideals expressed in the Pathfinder curriculum to her own social and political experiences. To find out how Pathfinder texts are taken-up in everyday settings, it would be necessary to conduct research that takes into account young women’s reading of them. Some questions that emerge from my research include: How do young women enrolled in Pathfinders make sense of the contradictions inherent in
definitions of “responsible” citizenship? For example, how do Pathfinders negotiate between being encouraged to follow Canada’s food guide while also being encouraged to test out “new” “ethnic” foods? How do Pathfinders interpret a program that officially does not discriminate against includes lesbian and bisexual women, but unofficially normalizes heterosexuality? To what extent do Pathfinders recognize the contradictions between encouraging the participation of poor girls and girls and young women with disabilities and the actual participation rates of these populations? I also want to ask about how young women enrolled in Pathfinders negotiate between definitions of responsible citizenship and their lived experiences. How do young women enrolled in Pathfinders both comply with and resist these definitions? To attempt to understand how these contradictions organize social relations, it would be useful to employ Dorothy Smith’s (1990) concept of discourse as an assemblage of statements mediated by texts. Doing so would enable me to more fully consider the ways in which Pathfinders engage in dialogue with their handbooks and manuals.

In addition to ethnographic research that further explores my conclusions, there are other avenues for future research on youth service organizations, moral regulation, and nation building. As mentioned previously in this thesis, because of their different histories, it would be useful to compare whether ideals of responsible citizenship in turn-of-the-century segregated black youth service organizations were similar to ideals of responsible citizenship espoused in segregated white youth service organizations in the same period. What historical narratives did each use to build their communities? How did these narratives serve to gain the consent of young members to particular definitions of responsibility?

Similar questions could be asked in a comparison of Canadian Girl Guide and Boy Scout programmes. My research could serve as part of a broader comparative project that also
considers development of normative hetero-masculinity(ies) in the Scouting program. It would be central to this research to discover the complementary and conflicting ways in which Guiding and Scouting programmes define responsible citizenship.

Another avenue of research would be similar to that conducted by John D. Wrathall on homosexual cruising at the YMCA. Tracing the history of gay, lesbian, and bisexual involvement in single-sex organizations, and exploring the opportunities for same-sex experiences in single-sex youth service organizations would contribute to literature on leisure and recreation, as well as to knowledge about gay, lesbian, and bisexual history in Canada. Ethnographic research would be essential here to discover the ways in which gay, lesbian, and bisexual youth resist(ed) the heterosexist messages that continue to be so strongly emphasized in youth programs.

**Recommendations for teaching about homophobia and heterosexism**

For Pathfinder Guiders who are interested in teaching about heterosexism and homophobia in their units, I recommend a lesson guide published in 2000 by the Gay and Lesbian Educators of British Columbia (GALE). See Appendices II and III for some examples from the text. Although the guide was developed for teaching about homophobia and heterosexism in BC public schools, many of the suggested classroom activities can be adapted for use in the Pathfinder programme.\(^\text{52}\) The following recommendations and exercises are an

---

\(^\text{52}\) GALE argues that teaching about homophobia and heterosexism is not about sex education. Educating youth about stereotypes and prejudice based on sexuality should be treated in the same way as teaching about other forms of inequality, such as sexism, racism, and ableism. GALE also argues that remaining silent and 'neutral' about heterosexism implies one's consent to current social, political, and economic relationships based on unequal rights. Remaining silent is not being "neutral" at all; but contributes and even encourages the continuation of these harmful myths and stereotypes.... Rather than push children's discussion underground, our goal must be the honest exploration of human differences so that students can start to appreciate diversity in a safe, supportive environment (2000: 13).

David Chudnovsky, President of the British Columbia Teachers Federation argues that teaching about homophobia is important because,

As they grow and mature, all of our students will struggle to understand their own sexualit[ies]. But they will do so in a society, and in schools, in which homophobia is a common and frightening fact. Name calling, bullying, and even physical violence occur at an alarming rate (2000: 5).
important start to teaching Pathfinders (and Guiders) about heterosexism and homophobia.

GALE suggests that teachers develop an awareness of bias in their language and use inclusive language and behaviour in the classroom. For example, use orientation-neutral language like “people get crushes at puberty.” Similarly, note that encouraging students to find only opposite-sex dates is a manifestation of heterosexism (2000: 3).

One sample lesson plan is called “Scenarios for Discussion” (see Appendix II). In this activity, students get into pairs or small groups to discuss scenarios that will help them to “gain deeper insight into a variety of issues faced by LGBTs [lesbian, gay, bisexual, and transgendered persons] and their friends, families and allies” (2000: 43). One example asks students to imagine the following:

You are just starting to wonder if you might be lesbian or bisexual. You do not always feel comfortable when the other kids talk about boys and sexual matters. What could you do to get more information? Whom could you call or see in your community (2000: 43)?

Another scenario is:

You hear the other students (male and female) making sarcastic comments about lesbians. These comments are mostly about women in the movies and the music industry rather than about anyone particular in your school. One girl does not join in with these comments or say anything about them, but just chats about other things. You have a strong sense that her mother may be lesbian. What can you do or say (2000: 43)?

A second lesson plan is called “Myth busting – how do myths affect us?” (see Appendix III). In this lesson, students explore how myths like “homosexuality is a mental illness” and “the majority of pedophiles are gay” affect both heterosexual and LGBT people. Other myths for discussion include “LGBTs can be identified by certain mannerisms, clothing, or physical characteristics.” Both of the lesson plans outlined here can be easily adapted to the Emblem – Challenge format of the Pathfinder programme. I would recommend that these lesson plans be incorporated into the Pathfinder handbooks and Guider’s manuals to ensure that Pathfinders in
both rural and urban areas have access to inclusive curricula. For queer Pathfinders living in rural areas, such lesson plans may be the only support available. Using these lesson plans in the programme is one step that the Girl Guides of Canada can take to recognize the full and equal citizenship of all Canadians.

**Challenges and obstacles**

Of course, there are a number of obstacles that the Girl Guides of Canada will face in any attempt to implement lessons on heterosexism and homophobia in its curriculum. As the successful banning of books depicting same-sex parents from the Surrey, British Columbia school board illustrates, a politically powerful movement exists that opposes the visibility of gay, lesbian, and bisexual people in educational institutions. The same people engaged in this movement, including parents, religious leaders, politicians, and students, are likely to oppose attempts by the Girl Guides of Canada to implement any curricula having to do with homophobia and heterosexism. Considering the damaging reaction from parents opposed to the organization identifying as feminist, the Girl Guides of Canada will face the possibility of losing a significant number of members should it decide to publicly declare alliances with lesbian and bisexual women.

In addition to losing members, the Girl Guides of Canada may also lose a significant amount of financial support from organizations that adhere to pro-family rhetoric. Parallels can be drawn with the Boy Scouts of America, where religious organizations with the three largest Scout memberships are the United Methodists, the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-Day Saints [the Mormons] and the Roman-Catholic Church. As Leslie Stahl reported in an April 1, 2001 segment of *60 Minutes*,

the Mormon Church said explicitly in documents filed with the Supreme Court that it would leave the Boy Scouts if the anti-gay policy were changed. That might seem like
no big deal since Mormons make up less than 2% of the U.S. population. But Mormons sponsor more Scout troops and packs than any other religious or civic group in the country ("Have the Boy Scouts...").

The people and organizations opposed to gay men's participation in Boy Scouts argue two points: that gay leaders will show young Scouts that being gay is okay, and that gay men are likely to sexually molest children. Consider the following passages. The first is a statement by a parent involved in Broward County, Florida Cub Scout pack #114. The second is an exchange between CBS correspondent Leslie Stahl and Congressman Dana Roerbacher.

...On a family campout, is he going to bring his -- his family member? Are they going to be sharing a tent together? Do I then want for the children in the pack to be saying, ya know, 'Why is he sleeping with that person?' Or 'Are they going to be sleeping in the tent together? What does that mean, "together"?" ("Have the Boy Scouts...").

Congressman Dana Roerbacher: "I've been in the Scouts, and if a Scout is sick or is afraid, that Scout Master will be in that pump [sic] tent."
Leslie Stahl: "The Boy Scouts of America say flat out that their policy has absolutely nothing whatsoever to do with the fear of pedophilia."
Congressman Dana Roerbacher: "Uh-huh. They're afraid. They're afraid to make that argument, I'm sure. Everybody's afraid to say this."
Leslie Stahl: "You think that fear of pedophilia is really behind what's behind the Boy Scout's anti-gay policy?"
Congressman Dana Roerbacher: "It is common sense" ("Have the Boy Scouts...").

Although some people (including movie mogul Steven Spielberg), companies, municipal governments, school districts, churches, synagogues, and police departments have withdrawn support for Boy Scouts of America programs since the ruling, its largest funders continue to have the upper hand. As Leslie Stahl reports,

in a revolt against the policy, the parents and sponsors of eight Oak Park, Illinois troops [sic] and packs wrote to the Boy Scouts organization in Irving, Texas to say that if a qualified gay man applied to be a Scout master in their community, they would take him. The Boy Scouts organization responded by throwing them out of scouting ("Have the Boy Scouts...").

Similar controversy over lesbian and bisexual membership has been raised in relation to the Girl Scouts USA. The Girl Scouts USA publicly stated in the mid 1990s that it does not
discriminate on the basis of sexual orientation. However, when the Girl Scout national president Connie Matsui made remarks supporting a video screened at the White House entitled “That’s a Family” about lesbian and gay groups, members of the American Family Association sent letters of protests to the national organization demanding that Matsui retract her statement of support and/or resign. The Producers of the film, Women’s Educational Media, quote Matsui as saying “It’s really a pleasure to be here, and to congratulate you personally on such a wonderful product. We really look forward to using it in our informal education in working with all girls across the country” (www.womedia.org 2001). The American Family Association notes, however, that the Girl Scouts USA has denied that Matsui made the statement (www.afa.net 2001). The Girl Scouts USA is obviously flustered by the controversy, but, for now, is standing behind its anti-discrimination policy. It is not clear whether they will use the film in any of their programs.

With these issues in mind, this may not be the right time for the Girl Guides of Canada to implement my recommendations. It may be necessary for the organization to teach about homophobia and heterosexism in the context of discrimination and human rights, and some of the lesson plans offered by GALE will be more conducive to that than others. Considering, however, that the Girl Guides of Canada has taken steps to include sexual orientation in its non-discrimination clause, and considering the precedent set by the establishment of a gay, lesbian, and bisexual Rovers troop in a Toronto Scouting branch, the time may be ripe for the Girl Guides of Canada to take a side in the vicious debates about the participation of gay, lesbian, and bisexual people in organizations serving youth. One of the greatest challenges will be to fight the stereotype that gay and lesbian teachers and youth leaders are pedophiles. In fact, I suspect that this association is the organization’s greatest fear. As Nancy Manahan’s book shows, many Girl
Guides of Canada leaders are lesbian and bisexual, and many remain deeply closeted within their councils out of fear of losing their troops and their livelihoods. In my view, these Guiders need to come out and the organization must stand behind them. This is all easier said than done. I hope that this thesis will, at the very least, spark some discussion about this very important issue.

Should the Girl Guides of Canada decide to take a stand, it will be a long fight, but it will not be alone.
Works Cited

Primary Sources:

*The Bridge.* 1979. Published by the Girl Guides of Canada – Guides du Canada for use by adult personnel during the implementation of new age groupings.


*Guider’s Manual - The PathfinderProgram: For Fun and Opportunities.* 1999. Published by the Girl Guides of Canada – Guides du Canada

*Guider’s Manual - The PathfinderProgram: For Fun and Opportunities.* 1997. Published by the Girl Guides of Canada – Guides du Canada

*Guiding for You! Programme Uniform and Badges.* 1977. Published by the Girl Guides of Canada – Guides du Canada

*Learning to Lead, Section 1: For New Pathfinder Guiders.* 1984. Based on material compiled by Dorothy Crocker. Published by the Girl Guides of Canada – Guides du Canada
The Pathfinder Program. 1993. Published by the Girl Guides of Canada – Guides du Canada

The Pathfinder Program. 1990. Published by the Girl Guides of Canada – Guides du Canada

The Pathfinder Program. 1988. Published by the Girl Guides of Canada – Guides du Canada

The Pathfinder Program. 1986. Published by the Girl Guides of Canada – Guides du Canada

The Pathfinder Programme. 1985. Published by the Girl Guides of Canada – Guides du Canada

The Pathfinder Programme. 1984. Published by the Girl Guides of Canada – Guides du Canada

The Pathfinder Programme. 1981. Published by the Girl Guides of Canada – Guides du Canada

The Pathfinder Program: For Fun and Opportunities. 1999. Published by the Girl Guides of Canada – Guides du Canada

The Pathfinder Program: For Fun and Opportunities. 1997. Published by the Girl Guides of Canada – Guides du Canada

So You Chose Pathfinders: A Supplement to the Guider Handbook Especially for Pathfinder Guiders. 1981. Written by Dorothy Crocker. Published by the Girl Guides of Canada – Guides du Canada

Sources for supplementary information:


Girl Guides of Canada – Guides du Canada Policy, Organization, and Rules. 1977/1979

Toronto: Girl Guides of Canada – Guides du Canada


Secondary Sources:

Abella, Irving and Harold Tropper. 1998. "‘The line must be drawn somewhere:’ Canada and Jewish Refugees, 1933-1939.” In Franca Iacovetta, Paula Draper, and Robert Ventresca, eds. A Nation of Immigrants: Women, Workers, and Communities in Canadian History, 1840s-1960s. Toronto: University of Toronto Press. 412-445


Buchbinder, Howard and Janice Newson. 1994.“Corporate-University Linkages in Canada: Transforming a Public Institution.” In Lorna Erwin and David McLennan, eds. Sociology of Education in Canada: Critical Perspectives on Theory, Research and Practice. Toronto: Copp Clark Longman, Ltd.


“Have the Boy Scouts lost more than they gained by banning homosexuals from scouting?” 60 Minutes. Reported by Leslie Stahl. Segment Produced by Shari Finkelstein. Transcribed by Satiricus Rex. CBS News. April 1, 2001


McClimontock, Anne. 1995. “Soft-Soaping Empire: Commodity Racism and Imperial Advertising” in Anne McClimontock Imperial Leather: Race, Gender and Sexuality in the Colonial Contest. New York: Routledge


The YWCA Movement In Canada — More Than 100 Years of Working Together
Appendix 1

SCENARIOS FOR DISCUSSION

Grade level
8-12

Learning Outcomes
-to be able to identify with hypothetical conflict situations
-to be able to identify problems and possible solutions
-to examine different sides of difficult issues
-to gain deeper insight into a variety of issues faced by LGBTs and their friends, families and allies
-to be able to differentiate between times to act immediately & times to plan carefully
	-to gain knowledge about school & community resources

Vocabulary
LGBT
Queer/lesbian/gay bisexual transgender persons
STD's
HIV/AIDS

Context
This lesson presents examples of scenarios which students could discuss in pairs, in small groups, or all together. Also included are some general discussion questions which could be used with any of these scenarios. These are intended as springboards for discussion and there are therefore no right or wrong answers.

These scenarios are intended for use with various age/grade levels. Teachers should feel free to adapt them for older or younger students.

All situations presented here are realistic, in that they are regularly faced by LGBT students, children of LGBT parents, LGBT adults in education, allies of LGBTs, and even heterosexuals perceived as queer. The words "queer" and "LGBT* are used here to include lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender persons, and are not intended as pejorative terms.

Preparation
-photocopy scenarios and discussion questions or prepare as overheads

Instructional Strategies
Co-operative group work using a Think, Pair, Share Strategy.
Small/whole group discussion
Role-play

Lesson
-introduce scenario or scenarios.
-discuss the importance of respect and safety for all present.
-divide students into small groups (5-6 students per group).
-have students choose someone to record thoughts & someone to present ideas to class at the end of discussion.
- provide students with scenarios and discussion questions.
- give students time to explore the issues in small groups. Groups can work on the same scenario or different ones.
- have students share their thoughts with the larger group.
- engage in class discussion & debrief as necessary.

**Follow-up Activities**
- further research or reading on certain scenarios or related issues.
- essay writing on specific issues or homophobia or transphobia in general.
- individual or group debate.
- plan and put into action some solutions to specific problems in the school or community.
- develop a presentation or document for addressing concerns with administrators, counsellors or student council.

**Assessment**
- ability to approach topics respectfully.
- ability to examine different sides of issues.
- willingness to discuss difficult and possibly emotionally charged issues.
- ability to problem solve.
- ability to take notes during group discussions.
- ability to present information to larger group.

**General Discussion Questions**

- What is/are the central issue(s) in this situation?
- Is safety an issue here? (physical, emotional safety)
- What myths or stereotypes about LGBT persons might be at play in this situation?
- If you are observing this event, what intervention or support could you safely make?
- If you are directly involved in this situation, who could you turn to for support?
- Whether you are directly involved or an observer, should you act immediately to deal with the situation, or would it be better to first make a plan and get some resources?
- Can you suggest some practical long-term strategies to help correct this situation, or to prevent a reoccurrence?
- What else would you like to learn about LGBT persons and issues?
Scenarios

1. You know that a certain student is being taunted and teased, when there are no
   teachers present. He is constantly being called names like "faggot," "gay-boy"
   and "girlie," in the hallways, in the locker room, and on the school grounds. He
does not usually try to defend himself. Instead he appears to be trying to make
himself invisible, and keeps his eyes down. He does wear some rather unusual
clothing on most school days. You are not part of the group harassing him, but
you know that he is going to have a lot of difficulty surviving a few more years of
school in this atmosphere. What can you realistically do to help him?

2. You are just starting to wonder if you might be lesbian, gay or maybe bisexual.
   You do not always feel comfortable when the other kids talk about boys/girls (the
   opposite gender) and sexual matters. What could you do to get more
   information? Whom could you call or see in your community?

3. You hear the other students (male and female) making sarcastic comments
   about lesbians. These comments are mostly about women in the movies and the
   music industry rather than about anyone particular in your school. One girl does
   not join in with these comments or say anything about them, but just chats about
   other things. You have a strong sense that her mother may be lesbian. What
can you do or say?

4. There is a new student in your school named Jamie. You really cannot tell
   whether this student is male or female, because Jamie is fairly quiet, and has
   clothing, hair and mannerisms that are not definitively male or female. Many
   students are asking each other whether Jamie is a boy or girl, and are starting to
   make jokes. What can you say or do?

5. In your CAPP class about STDs and HIV/AIDS, the teacher skirts around the
   issue of sexual practices between two men or two women. Some students have
   snickered about not needing this information because "only gay people do those
   things". The teacher does not bother to correct these students or to include any
   factual information for sexually active gays and lesbians. You are not certain
   about your own future sexual orientation, and you are pretty sure that there are
   some closeted lesbian and gay students present. What can you say or do?

6. Your friend Lisa comes to you and tells you that she is lesbian, but doesn't really
   want everyone to know because she doesn't think that everyone else in Grade
   11 (and the rest of the school) would be very supportive of her. Lisa is telling you
   this news because she trusts you, she says. She also wants to find out if a
certain other girl you both know feels the same way about girls (and specifically
about Lisa), and wants your help. You are feeling a bit confused and caught in
the middle of things. What can you say or do?
7. You are quite sure that you are gay, but have not said a word about it to anyone. You don't know how knowledgeable or supportive your school counsellor is, on this issue. You do not know anyone else who is gay, but many students say that one of the science teachers (whom you do not know) is gay. You really would like to know how to meet other gay guys and to learn more of what being gay is all about. What can you do?

8. On a school trip, you and a bunch of friends got pretty silly. At one point you were hugging and laughing with a friend (of the same gender as you). Now some of the other kids are telling everyone that you are gay, and that you are probably "doing it" with other queer kids. You do not really feel that you are gay or lesbian, and you would just like everyone to shut up about this. What can you say or do?

9. Because your uncle is gay and your parents are comfortable with this fact, you know a fair bit about gay and lesbian issues and people. You would like to do an in-depth assignment on same-sex legal issues for your Socials assignment and also a piece of writing on a young person's coming out experience for your drama class. You know that your drama teacher will not have any difficulty with this topic, but you are not so sure about your Socials teacher. There is also the possibility that some other students will try to give you a hard time about focussing so much on queer issues. What should you do?
Appendix II

MYTH BUSTING - HOW DO MYTHS AFFECT US?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Grade level</th>
<th>Context</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8-12</td>
<td>Often the only information that students have about LGBT people are the myths they have heard. When we work to understand how myths affect others and ourselves, we begin to understand ourselves better and have empathy for others. The students may be certain that some myths are true and will want to focus on these points. Although the students may be able to find examples of individuals that live up to the myths described, this exercise pushes us beyond the debate of true and false. It gives us an understanding that myths classify all people in a group as being the same, and restrict everyone from making personal choices.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Approx. Time</th>
<th>Learning Outcomes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>60 min.</td>
<td>-to increase awareness of the purpose of myths -to demystify information about LGBT people -to increase understanding of the affects of myths on each person -to become aware of our own internalized beliefs about others</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Preparation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Photocopy &amp; enlarge charts and cut out for each group.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Make an overhead of one myth.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lesson</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ask the students if they know what a myth is and if they can give any examples of a myth they know. Explain to the students that they will be given a myth about LGBT people and be asked to discuss in their group the following two questions:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- If a person is LGBT, how does this myth affect them? (What would they believe about themselves? How would they act? Who would they hang out with? What kind of self-esteem would they have? How would their family treat them? What kinds of jobs could they do?)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- If a person is heterosexual, how does this myth affect them?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

To demonstrate the activity choose one myth as an example, put it on the overhead and go through it with the students, filling in the two parts of the chart. A student may insist the myth is true and want to discuss this. Explain that parts of the myth may be true for some individuals, but not true for others. This is what makes it a myth. Myths are often applied to whole groups of people.
After you have given them an example, ask the students if they are clear on what they are to do.

Tell the students that they are to work in groups of 2, 3 or 4 depending on the size of the class and the time you have and then give out the myths. Explain that someone in the group will need to record their ideas on the charts and a different person in the group will need to report back to the larger group. Give them 15-20 minutes to fill in the chart. If a group is having difficulty with the task try to ask them questions that will get them back on track.

Back in the larger group have each group share their myth and their ideas. Use the Myth busting information (see Background Section) to help dispel each of the myths. This activity will prompt rich discussion and will need a substantial amount of time for the debrief. A second class may be needed to finish the presentations. If students are having difficulty with the topic and want to generalize about LGBT people, use examples of myths about teenagers for them to understand how myths about teenagers affect all teenagers and how myths about teenagers affect other people (and what they believe about teenagers.)

**Follow-up Activity**
Have students write about myths and their purpose in traditional cultures.
How are myths used today? Describe.
Can myths have a positive effect? How? When?
Create a role play/drama about a myth and its impact on others in a group.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MYTHS</th>
<th>IMPACT ON LGBs</th>
<th>IMPACT ON HETEROSEXUALS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>People choose to be homosexual.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MYTHS</th>
<th>IMPACT ON LGBs</th>
<th>IMPACT ON HETEROSEXUALS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Homosexuality is a type of mental illness and can be cured by psychotherapy or “orientation reparative therapy.”</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MYTHS</th>
<th>IMPACT ON LGBTs</th>
<th>IMPACT ON HETEROSEXUALS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>It's unnatural to be lesbian, gay bisexual or transgendered.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MYTHS</td>
<td>IMPACT ON LGBs</td>
<td>IMPACT ON HETEROSEXUALS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Most LGB people could be cured by having really good sex with a person of the other sex.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MYTHS</th>
<th>IMPACT ON LGBTs</th>
<th>IMPACT ON HETEROSEXUALS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LGBT teachers are harmful role models for children.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MYTHS</th>
<th>IMPACT ON LGBs</th>
<th>IMPACT ON HETEROSEXUALS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The majority of pedophiles are gay.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MYTHS</td>
<td>IMPACT ON LGBs</td>
<td>IMPACT ON HETEROSEXUALS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lesbian/gay/bisexual children and teenagers do not exist.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LGBT people do not value family.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There is a distinct LGB lifestyle.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MYTHS</td>
<td>IMPACT ON LGBTs</td>
<td>IMPACT ON HETEROSEXUALS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LGBTs can be identified by certain mannerisms, clothing, or physical characteristics.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MYTHS</th>
<th>IMPACT ON LGBs</th>
<th>IMPACT ON HETEROSEXUALS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The typical LGB person is young, white, and not religious.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>MYTHS</th>
<th>IMPACT ON LGBs</th>
<th>IMPACT ON HETEROSEXUALS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>LGBs are promiscuous or somehow more sexual than heterosexuals.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MYTHS</td>
<td>IMPACT ON LGBs</td>
<td>IMPACT ON HETEROSEXUALS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>We know what causes homosexuality and bisexuality.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In a same-sex relationship one partner usually plays the masculine role and the other plays the feminine role.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LGB people would change if they could.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>