In presenting this thesis in partial fulfilment of the requirements for an advanced degree at the University of British Columbia, I agree that the Library shall make it freely available for reference and study. I further agree that permission for extensive copying of this thesis for scholarly purposes may be granted by the head of my department or by his or her representatives. It is understood that copying or publication of this thesis for financial gain shall not be allowed without my written permission.

Department of **ART HISTORY**
The University of British Columbia
Vancouver, Canada

Date **APRIL 29TH, 1997**
ABSTRACT

This work deals with the notion of hybridity; an ideal moment of cultural negotiation which results, in the words of Homi Bhabha, in the creation of a 'third space.' This theoretical plateau is formed by two parties whose agendas, while ostensibly conflicting, overlap enough so that each informs the space but neither dominates it. In this case I examine a specific site of hybridity, the "Arrivals Passengers Only" area of the Vancouver International Airport. Here, the space is informed by the presence of works, created by the Coast Salish Musqueam people, in the Airport Terminal, created by the Vancouver International Airport Authority.

While this sort of negotiation can be described using positive and progressive terms, and the creation of a third space represents a compelling ideal, I argue that the moment of hybridity within the airport is ultimately undermined by other areas of the building in which no negotiation has taken place. The airport's role as a business necessitates marketing strategies aimed mainly at tourists and other business interests. Since virtually the entire building is devoted to that market, the negotiated hybrid space becomes hidden so that its potential impact is lost. Although participating in the creation of a working model of culture with the Musqueam people, the Airport ends up destabilising that model and the space, the 'third space,' which contains
This particular example points to a site specific aspect of contemporary North American culture by drawing on the local community as a source for investigating that discourse. The thesis, then, has two points of entry; the ephemeral discourse of cultural negotiation and the locally grounded freeze-frame view of one site in contemporary Vancouver.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT .................................................................................................................. ii

TABLE OF CONTENTS .............................................................................................. iv

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS ............................................................................................ v

LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS ......................................................................................... vi

INTRODUCTION ........................................................................................................ 1

CHAPTER ONE ........................................................................................................... 12
  Early Travel Writing .............................................................................................. 12
  Modern Tourism .................................................................................................. 15
  Tourism in the YVR .............................................................................................. 20
  Tourism in other Airport Sites ............................................................................. 24

CHAPTER TWO .......................................................................................................... 31
  Context of Work .................................................................................................. 31
  Rationales ........................................................................................................... 37
  Historical Context of Display Practices .............................................................. 40
  Intentions Regarding Art ...................................................................................... 45

CHAPTER THREE ...................................................................................................... 49
  Segregation and Fetishization .............................................................................. 49
  Representation ..................................................................................................... 53
  Reduction ............................................................................................................. 54
  Tokenism ............................................................................................................. 57
  Cultural Negotiation and the Third Space .......................................................... 59

CHAPTER FOUR ......................................................................................................... 62
  Creation of Tourist Moments .............................................................................. 62
  YVR on the Internet .............................................................................................. 67

CONCLUSION ............................................................................................................ 73

ILLUSTRATIONS ....................................................................................................... 79

REFERENCES ............................................................................................................ 92
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

In the course of preparing this thesis I have been aided by the support, time and knowledge of many people. For taking time out of their busy schedules to share their wisdom and knowledge with me, I wish to thank Debra Sparrow and Krista Point of the Musqueam Salish Nation; Howard Grant, Band Manager for the Musqueam Salish people; Bill McLennan, of the Museum of Anthropology, U.B.C.; Frank O'Neill, President of Visitor Services, YVR; Winnie Cheng and Carl Rey, also of the YVR; and Rosalie Wilson, former Art Ambassador at the YVR.

For their patience, academic expertise and greatly appreciated painstaking attention to detail, I would like to thank Dr. John O'Brien, my first reader, and Dr. Marvin Cohodas, both of the University of British Columbia. Their guidance, direction and support rendered a long and arduous process both intellectually stimulating and personally rewarding.

Fellow students and friends, Stephanie Dragonas and Joan Handwerg, have also been unfathomably patient in assisting me to clarify my thoughts. Their kindness in allowing me to plumb their combined intellects, in the sharing of their resources, and in their consistent friendship and emotional support above and beyond the call of duty leave me permanently indebted to them. In addition, I would like to extend my heartfelt thanks to David Knudsen whose keen intellect and rigorous debating skills helped to guide me through the murky waters of my own creative process. His time, support and tenderness have sustained me through more than one dark moment in bringing this work to completion.

Finally, I would like to thank my family. First, my grandparents, Agnes and Wilfred Chamney, whose emotional and financial support was unfailing; your encouragement and love have been deeply appreciated and I thank you. My mother, Eileen Leddy, must be credited for stimulating me from an early age, giving me the curiosity to develop interests and the tools to pursue them. Your unfailing faith in me, even when I had little myself, and your boundless love will always be the most precious of my treasures; thanks Mom. And, last but not least, my brothers, Connor, Brendan and James, who have consistently helped to keep me in my place and to remember that sometimes, humour is one's only recourse (you guys are the greatest).

To all of you listed here and to the many others who helped along the way, THANK YOU. My love and respect goes out to you all.

Shannon C. Leddy
Vancouver, 1997
LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS


FIGURE 2: The Spirit of Haida Gwaii/The Jade Canoe, Bill Reid. 4.8m x 3m, 3.3m x 1.5m, 3.6m x 2.7m. 10,800lbs. Bronze. 1993. YVRAA. Currently installed at YVR.

FIGURE 3: Great Wave Wall, Lutz Haufschild. 40m x 10m. Glass Bricks. 1996. YVRAA. Currently installed at YVR.


FIGURE 5: Pacific Market, Right Side.

FIGURE 6: Coast Salish Weavings, Debra Sparrow, Robyn Sparrow, Krista Point, Gina Grant, Helen Calbreath. 1.75m x 5m. Sheep's wool, Hand dyed and spun. YVRAA. Currently installed at YVR.

FIGURE 7: Spindle Whorl, Susan Point. 4.8m x 30cm(middle) 15cm(edges). Red Cedar. YVRAA. Currently installed at YVR.

FIGURE 8: Welcome Figures, Shane Pointe and Susan Point. 5.1m x 1.05m x 1.05m. Red Cedar and Glass plates. YVRAA. Currently installed at YVR.

FIGURE 9: Welcome Figures, anterior view

FIGURE 10: Cedar 'Longhouse', Now a 'Carving Shack' this was the temporary home of the "Jade Canoe" while on Granville Island. Photographed September, 1995.

FIGURE 11: YVR Art Foundation Donation Box located at Granville Island Site. Photographed September, 1995.


INTRODUCTION

"What one thinks of any region, while travelling through, is the result of at least three things: what one knows, what one imagines, and how one is disposed".¹

Vancouver's first airport, the City of Vancouver's Sea Island Airport, was opened just after the first World War, with passenger flight service commencing in 1932. The original facilities, including a post-World War II expansion, were run by the City of Vancouver until the entire operation was purchased by the federal government in 1962. In 1968 the original portion of the current terminal was officially opened, having been designed to capacitate 3.5 million people per year. By 1995 that terminal was handling nearly 12 million passengers annually.²

In 1992 the Federal government relinquished its control over the Vancouver International Airport (YVR) and management duties were returned to local powers, under the terms of a sixty year lease from the Department of Transport. To this end, the Vancouver International Airport Authority (YVRAA) was established to run the multi-million dollar facility. The YVRAA consists of a Board of Directors chaired by Chester A. Johnson (for whom the small rock garden in front of the new terminal building was named) as well as a number of senior managers responsible for various aspects of the airport's functioning. Airport Services, the branch in charge of the

¹Barry Lopez: 1986, 271
²SkyTalk: 1996, 40-41
placement of the art which is the major concern of this paper, is run by the president of Airport Services, Frank O'Neill.

The year 1996 marked the official opening of the new International Terminal building, an appendage of the existing terminal structure, at an estimated cost of $250 million. A third runway was also built and opened later the same year in order to deal with the increase in both international and domestic air travel. Although not mentioned in the official Souvenir booklet commemorating the airport's opening, Howard Grant, Band Manager for the Musqueam Salish people on whose traditional lands the airport is situated, confirmed in a private interview that the new runway abuts an historic Musqueam burial site. In addition, there are a number of invaluable midden sites in the region (essentially garbage dumps or 'toss zones' used historically by the Musqueam people), a factor which will be returned to in a later chapter of this work, and one which significantly complicates the placement of Musqueam work within the airport.  

This thesis focuses on the new International airport as a place-specific example of a representative moment of hybridity created through cultural negotiation. I will argue that the space of the 'Arrivals Passengers Only' area housing

---

3 Midden Sites are of particular importance to students of First Nations cultures including First Nations people themselves as they can provide a great deal of archaeological evidence regarding past lifeways. Burial sites retain the same importance and also reflect the sacredness around the disposal of the dead.
the Musqueam work is, in fact, a working model of culture forged by the meeting of the 'dominant' and the 'other' where the dominant is represented by the physical space of the airport and the other is represented by the art of the Musqueam Salish people within that space. I will use the insights of Homi Bhabha to illustrate that this meeting and negotiation has resulted in the creation of a 'third space' or a plateau of mutual agreement which is dominated by the interests of neither party but informed by both.

While this 'third space,' which I posit as being intrinsic within the International Arrivals area, represents a compelling ideal, I will later discuss the ways in which the clearly conflicting agendas of the Musqueam and the YVR do, in fact, involve a power struggle, effectively compromising the utopian claims of the hybrid moment. Because of the airport's stature as a business, its marketing strategies dominate the rest of the building, untempered by the process of the negotiation with the Musqueam which took place elsewhere in the terminal. The resulting effect is that the working model of hybrid culture set forth by the creation of the third space is destabilised, not only because it occurs within a finite and restricted space but also because it is superseded by the marketing strategies deployed within the building as a whole.

By examining this snap-shot example of a hybrid moment my thesis refers to the discourse of a larger continuum of cultural negotiation, a pervasive process in the late 20th
Century as more and more people from a variety of cultures seek to occupy the same spaces. This particular example points to a site specific aspect of contemporary North American culture by drawing on the local community as a source for investigating that discourse. The thesis, then, has two points of entry; the ephemeral discourse of cultural negotiation and the locally grounded freeze-frame view of one site in contemporary Vancouver.

To return to that site (the airport) the idea of interior design thematics is a crucial concept both in terms of the airport as a whole and in terms of its passenger attracting marketing strategies. The focus of the YVR's theme is Celebrating Nature and Culture in which both the natural environment and First Nations cultures are emphasised. All of the elements within the New International Terminal Building which contribute to the theme were decided upon prior to the selection and engagement of the architects and artists involved.

Essentially, then, the Project Definition Report, in which the theme is described, became the template for the completed project, and all designs were completed within the parameters outlined therein. Carpets and light fixtures were chosen to reflect the chevron or 'V' shape of the building. Because the use of wooden support pillars is prohibited by earthquake safety standards, metal support pillars had to be

"Project Definition Report: N.D."
used. In keeping with the theme, however, even these were designed to refer to the forestation and logging industries in British Columbia. Natural wood and wood adorned with First Nations design elements has been used in as many places as possible both by the YVR and by some of the retailers at the site (such as the Allder's Duty Free shop which features, as a partial store front, a large, low relief panel carved by British Columbia First Nations artist, Roy Vickers). In addition, glass ceilings have been used wherever possible to give the entire structure an open-air feel.

One of the unique aspects of the design and planning of the terminal, according to Frank O'Neill, is the fact that the major art pieces in the terminal were also selected and purchased prior to and concurrent with the building and design process. This meant that rather than being included as an afterthought to a more or less completed project, design plans were made with the art pieces in mind. While sixteen glass boutique style cases house rotating works by local non-Aboriginal artists such as Joe Average and Tiko Kerr, the major pieces in the new terminal are by First Nations artists.


It is important to note that the YVR has also established an Art Foundation under the direction of Frank O'Neill. Although it is important to this thesis, it is not directly related to the work within the terminal and so will be taken up later in this work.
The first works which a local visitor to the airport might see are the three large poles standing outside the entrance to the International Terminal in the Chester Johnson park (Figure 1). The poles (two of which were carved by Earl Muldoe with the third carved by Walter Harris) are not actually owned by the YVR. The poles are on loan from the Vancouver Museum, having been removed from one of their former sites on the grounds of Expo' 86. Although partially hidden by walkways and the somewhat secluded design of the park, these works are available for the viewership of any visitor to the airport.

The most celebrated and highly publicized purchase of the airport is the second cast of Haida artist Bill Reid's **Spirit of Haida Gwaii/Jade Canoe** (Figure 2). This three million dollar, nine ton bronze sculpture, with its distinctive green or Jade patina is the final cast of Reid's famed sculpture. The first cast, the **Black Canoe**, was commissioned for Arthur Erickson's Canadian Embassy building in Washington, D.C. The sculpture is one of the few major works within or about the airport to which the public at large has access. Its central location in the second floor Food Court and Public Market (Figures 4 and 5) area of the new International Terminal guarantees its continued notoriety, as both domestic and international passengers may view it along with those visitors to the airport either picking up or dropping off travellers (meeters and greeters, in airport jargon).
Set across the second floor mezzanine, on which Reid's sculpture sits, is a large glass panel mural by Lutz Haufschild (Figure 3). This work is also one with considerable public access due to its equally central location. Done in a variety of blue and white shades, the undulating ripples of colour, teased into a flat surface by laying tinted glass slats one on top of the other, are designed to reflect an aquatic or oceanic tone. The placement of Haufschild's work more or less as a backdrop to Reid's massive sculptural work was orchestrated in order to continue the allusion to the Jade Canoe's implied presence in fictitious waters; a theme also picked up by the black-green marble floor tiles on which the canoe 'floats'.

The other large scale works purchased by the YVRAA for the new terminal building are by people from the Musqueam Salish Nation of Vancouver, and it is with these works that I am chiefly concerned. In the planning stage of the project, the YVRAA approached the Musqueam band council to commission major works by the Musqueam people for installation in the new building. From that initial approach, the Musqueam band formed the Musqueam Cultural Committee which was then responsible for the selection of artists and work and for the arrangement of the subsequent commissions. Each of the works selected and completed is ensconced within the 'Arrival Passengers Only' area of the airport. The Canadian Customs desks, through which all international passengers must pass,
are located in a 'great hall' within the new terminal and it is here that the Musqueam works are situated.

Musqueam weavers Debra Sparrow, Robyn Sparrow, Krista Point, Gina Grant and Helen Calbreath created four 1.75m x 5m tapestries that hang from the ceiling adjacent to the central stairwell and escalators leading down to the main floor and the Canada customs desks (Figure 6). The weavings, each of which is done with only white, black, red and yellow wool, use historic Salish geometric design elements. The weavings also involve designs drawn from the creative repertoire of each of the weavers involved.

At the top of the stairs, against a wall of rushing water rests Susan Point's enormous red cedar Spindle Whorl (Figure 7). Incised with "traditional images reflecting the theme of flight" the work measures sixteen feet in diameter and was carved from a number of edge grained cedar planks. The figures on the surface of the whorl are two eagles circling head to tail with a human on the back of each. The rushing water is part of a larger "waterscape" which runs down under the floor to emerge again between the escalators. Its presence in the airport refers to the coastal lifeways of the Musqueam Salish people, past and present, who rely, in part, on the Fraser River as a food source.

Across from the whorl, at the bottom of the stair case, sit two 'Welcome Figures', one female and one male (Figures

'SkyTalk: 1996, 61
Although carver Shane Pointe originally received the commission to do both the male and the female figures, his completed female figure was deemed unacceptable for aesthetic reasons by the Musqueam Cultural Committee. The contract for the replacement sculpture was then awarded to Susan Point, who also completed the design for the backs of both figures. In addition to their aesthetic value, the carvings are also designed to serve the historically grounded function (from the perspective of Salish people) of both welcoming new visitors to the region and also of welcoming returning residents.

Chapter one of this thesis will set the stage by outlining the basic precepts of tourism beginning with an analysis of Mary Louise Pratt's discussion of the concept of the 'Imperial Eye' relating to 18th and 19th Century exploration. Through this examination of some of the functional roots of western travel habits, the advent of tourism in the 20th Century and contemporary theory around modern tourist practices will be discussed, drawing on a variety of sources such as John Urry and John Jakle. In addition, tourism concerns specific to British Columbia, Vancouver and the YVR will be discussed, especially as regards the YVR's target markets and the motivation behind trying to draw on those markets. Acknowledging that the airport's use of local populations to provide distinctive 'thematics' happens neither in a vacuum, nor independently of other airport sites, similar techniques employed by other major
international airports will be discussed in order to provide both an expanded context and a basis for comparison.

In the second chapter the aforementioned art within the terminal complex will be addressed in greater detail, with specific attention paid to the implications of the work's location within the site. Calling upon personal interviews with many of those involved with the production and placement of works within the airport, social and political concerns around this topic will be discussed from a variety of perspectives, including some of the attitudes of the producers towards the issues of display and representation. To this end, some of the history around the production and display of the art of First Nations people within Canada in general will be addressed in order to provide an historicized picture of the political matrix into which these issues ultimately fall. Here, the perspectives of some of the producers of the work currently situated within the YVR, as well as the opinions of other First Nation's artists from across Canada will be brought forth, in order to provide a non-homogeneous or pan-Indian reading.

While the first two chapters serve to set the stage for later arguments, in the third chapter issues of tourism and the viewership of the works within the terminal shall be brought together under the rubric of visual culture. Here, the idea of cultural representation and negotiation in which the YVR has clearly and actively engaged itself, partially
through the establishment of the Art Foundation, and more specifically through the use of thematics, will be addressed. Socio-political ideas such as appropriation, segregation and fetishization shall be discussed in conjunction with contemporary theory around these subjects as dealt with by film-maker Loretta Todd and artist Joanne Cardinal-Shubert, as well as by theorist Homi Bhabha. Cultural negotiation will be addressed with specific reference to Bhabha's idea of the 'third space' as a site of cultural negotiation. The writings of other cultural theorists such as James Clifford, Gayatri Spivak and Virginia Dominguez will also be brought forth in discussion of the social position of especially those First Nations people included in the project.

Chapter four will examine the ways in which the negotiation of the 'third space' has been compromised by some of the tourist related strategies the airport has employed. One focus will a reprisal of the effects of creating a tourist moment. In addition, the issue of language as it is used to disseminate information about the art within the airport will be addressed. Reference will be made to public relations material about the Art Foundation, as well as to information available on the Internet. In the fifth I will discuss my conclusions, interweaving arguments from the body of the thesis in an analysis of the project as a whole.
CHAPTER ONE

The advent of the phenomenon known as tourism is predominantly a development which has occurred in the last two centuries. Different from travelling for reasons of perceived necessity, as was often the case with others throughout history, tourism implies a set of practices that have much more to do with leisure and diversion rather than survival. In order to adequately contextualize the 20th Century trends of tourism one must first look backwards to some earlier tropes of travel where the threads of modern motivations began to take shape.6

EARLY TRAVEL WRITING

In her survey of historic travel writing, Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation, Mary Louise Pratt documents a variety of early sources for her subject. Most interesting of her well founded suppositions and postulations pertinent here is the idea of the 'master-of-all-I-survey' perspective adopted by the male traveller/travel writer. In Part Three of her text, "Imperial Stylistics," Pratt is concerned mainly with the written depictions of moments of 'discovery,' especially in Africa in the late 18th Century.

6Words such as 'new', 'discovery' and 'explorer' have been placed in quotation marks in order to emphasize the idea that the lands being travelled in were new, and therefore discoverable, only to travellers visiting the land. The Aboriginal inhabitants would, of course, already have known the land so that words such as discovery become part of the irony of colonial practices.
She refers to a sort of conceptual or theoretical colonisation engaged in by an untravelled public through the narratives provided by actual travellers or 'explorers.' Some of these early travel writers contributed to European knowledge of other lands and peoples by acting as "verbal painters" whose task it was to "render momentously significant what is, from a narrative point of view, practically a non-event." That is to say, moments of encounter with 'new' landscapes in an 'unknown' continent had to be rendered in such a manner as to provide the reader with his or her own sense of first hand discovery in as convincing a manner as possible.

Essentially, the motivation of these early explorers was to make way for interior colonisation; not, at that time, an uncommon theme. The processes of 'exploration' and 'discovery' were necessary in order to provide the industrialising forces which would follow the trail-blazing initial visitors with as clear a picture as possible of what they would be dealing with upon their arrival. This is the level on which early travel writing may be viewed as regards capital and commercial interests, both of which are certainly also the same factors which made such activities both important and necessary.

There was, however, a more public forum to which these writings were also addressed and with which this paper is more

Pratt: 1992, 201

Ibid. 202
concerned; that is to say, travel writing as not so much an instigator of capital development, but travel writing as an early form of tourism itself. In this case, travel writing serves as a form of introduction to the 'exotic' places encountered by the actual traveller/writer but pared down into a form that lends itself to the presumed relative stasis of the reader and one which eliminates the real physical dangers of first hand experience. Thus, the reader may have the simulated experience of travel through the engagement of the travel literature and have the pleasure of 'discovery' and the 'master-of-all-I-survey' perspective thereby making the adventure his or her own; essentially colonizing the experienced knowledge of the writer. To quote Pratt's summation of this process, "the 'discovery' itself, even within the ideology of discovery, has no existence of its own. It only gets 'made' real after the traveller (or other survivor) returns home, and brings it into being through texts."11 The writing out of the experience of travel, then - the mutation of lived experience into something commodifiable and disseminable - is really at the root of what validates both travel and the practice of travel writing.

But prior to the thought of what might ultimately act as validator to the experience is the motivator of the experience; in this case, the motivator is somewhat the same for both traveller and reader. That is, discovery; the

11Pratt: 1992, 204
desire, whether cultivated or inherent to seek out the unknown and make it known or knowable. For Pratt, "discovery...consists of a gesture of converting local knowledges (discovery) into European national and continental knowledges associated with European forms and relations of power." In other words, the place other than where one is (the subject of travel writing, in this case) can become a knowable experience commodity for the non-traveller; but only when it is effectively transcribed by the traveller into means which lend themselves to the pre-existent knowledges held by the reader or experiencer. The travel narrative must be written in a language and format to which the non-traveller can easily relate.

MODERN TOURISM

The quest for discovery experiences in the late 18th and 19th Centuries does much to set the stage for a discussion of the tropes and motivations of conventional, contemporary tourism. John A. Jakle, writing about tourism in the 20th Century asserts that "in tourism we are freer to explore the unexpected, to face experiences directly and immediately through our senses, unedited by other minds." In fact, nothing could be farther from the truth. As later sections of this chapter will prove, the tourist experience is an entirely mediated and organized one. What Jackie seems to be referring

---

12 Pratt: 1992, 202

13 Jackie: 1985, 3
to, however, is the tourist's ideal. Tourists want to feel as though their explorations are free and their experiences are unmediated.

John Urry, in his book *The Tourist Gaze: Leisure and Travel in Contemporary Society*, writes that his text is about "how and why for short periods people leave their normal place of work and residence. It is about consuming goods and services which are in some sense unnecessary. They are consumed because they supposedly generate pleasurable experiences which are different from those encountered in everyday life."\(^{14}\) Essentially, the motivations Urry posits for contemporary tourism are the same as the motivations suggested earlier for the consumption of travel writing in this and the last few centuries; that is, for variety. In some sense, we are still talking about discovery, only now the discovery is necessarily made in the first person. One becomes intimately familiar with the mundane details of one's own daily existence to the point that we very nearly become blind to those details. Tourism seeks to provide a change of scene; an opportunity to see other details so new and different from our own lives that we cannot be blind to them. Tourism is, as Urry asserts, "a leisure activity."\(^{15}\)

Tourism encompasses a whole raft of experiences of which travelling marks only the beginning, and, generally speaking,

\(^{14}\)Urry: 1990, 1

\(^{15}\)Urry: 1990, 2
the ending; travel is, often, a means of tourism. So huge is the demand for fulfilment of this one facet of 'leisure' activities that an entire industry, including schools and an accompanying body of academic theory, has been generated in order to accommodate the ever growing number of those who wish to engage in it.

Current text books designed for use in tourism schools carefully distinguish a variety of factors inherent in the industry. They classify types of tourists, differentiate between leisure and recreation, and essentially lay out the rationale behind the industry. Included in such texts as The Geography of Travel and Tourism are examinations of geography and demand; tourist resources; the relationship between climate and tourism; and issues of transportation and summaries of tourist resources from some of the most frequently visited areas on the planet. In other words, texts of this nature provide the basic "how to's" of tourism and some of the more pragmatically based aspects of "why to." In this particular volume, the section on Canada asserts that major tourist attractions here lie within the forms of natural landscape; a fact which renders B.C.'s Supernatural British Columbia campaign dead on target.

What is lacking in such instructional texts, however, is a critical evaluation of the impact that the industry has on the sites and people it attempts to sell, as well as just exactly how, sociologically speaking, the industry creates
certain kinds of needs and expectations in order to cater to them. Indeed, mentions of Indigenous populations as potential selling points in the packaging of the Canadian regions covered in *The Geography of Travel and Tourism* are excluded. This raises a compelling question; why, when the YVR and other comparable international sites (such as Phoenix Arizona's Sky Harbour International Airport, which will be discussed later) clearly rely on the 'difference' of their inhabitants as a major selling point in the creation of the sort of spectacle that might attract tourists, are these very factors left out of the discussion at this most basic level?

The idea of tourism implies a set of practices, beyond the technical jargon of industry texts, about which there is a large body of work. As asserted earlier, the tourist is drawn from the mundane world of everyday occurrences to sites which, for them as tourists, speak of difference and variety; sites which are often intentionally constructed that way. Instead of consuming the products of that everyday life, the tourist uses leisure time to consume a new experience; an experience which will produce the sort of memories which make the return to the everyday bearable.

The set of practices involved in this process is divided between those that the tourist enacts and those enacted upon the tourist by the industry. The tourist is involved in, among other things, a certain kind of 'looking', in which, as Kenneth Little puts it, "looking is reduced to the 'positioned
point of view' of that subject-observer gazing upon the wild, that is, a framed and staged object. It is a perfect picture that the tourist sees." Here, contrary to Jakle's idea that the tourist has an unmediated experience, Little asserts that the tourist experience is very much a mediated one.

The counterpart, I would argue, to the tourist's viewing is the construction of the spectacle, which falls to the tourist industries. They must make each destination saleable by means of creating the illusion that what the tourist is about to experience captures, in a wholly authentic way, the true essence of the location; that this event or locale is what makes the trip worthwhile, and it is real. However, this is rarely the actual case since, as later sections of this paper will suggest, what is offered as saleable to the tourist is often a heightened sense of the unique attributes of the destination which do not necessarily reflect the 'real' essence of the place.

Because the tourist aims to get away from the mundane, it falls to aspects of difference within the context of those other sites to provide the impetus necessary for the temporary relocation of the tourist to the proffered attraction, which, as we have established, is a great part of what tourism is. While the educational texts are right in pointing to climatic and geographic differences as major drawing points, differences in social landscapes cannot be ignored. When one

16 Little: 1991, 149
travels, one generally expects the inhabitants who live in the new locale to be 'different' from the people at home.

TOURISM IN THE YVR

With these things in mind, I will turn to a discussion of tourist concerns specific to the YVR. It has been noted that the Vancouver International Airport served nearly twelve million passengers in 1995. Many of these passengers were undoubtedly residents of Vancouver and British Columbia at large using the facility either for business purposes or for their own tourist adventures; the attracting of international business and international business travellers being a key focus for the airport as later sections will suggest. Many of them were also likely people arriving in Canada with the intention of living here; that is to say, immigrants. Still others, perhaps the largest number, were tourists; people from all over the world who come to the city and province to have just the sort of non-everyday experience discussed earlier.\(^7\)

Of particular concern to the Vancouver International airport has been the Asia Pacific region which is, according to the 1996 Souvenir Edition of the YVR's Skytalk Magazine "the world's fastest-growing economic and air travel

\(^7\)It should be acknowledged that even domestic users of the airport may, to some extent, be engaging in a kind of tourist experience, especially while within the confines of the airport. The beginning and end of a journey for any reason are likely to be marked with some of the experience of difference on which the practices of tourism are founded.
An influx in both immigration and business concerns arising out of this region, especially as regards British Columbia, has been growing steadily over recent years. In addition to scores of new residents, visits from family members still residing in the Asian Pacific region have increased as well. By expanding their facilities, the YVR has brought itself closer still to its goal of being "North America's premier gateway" for all of those with concerns in that part of the world. The idea of being a 'premier gateway' is especially important considering the fact that the YVR is essentially in competition with all other major West Coast airports such as L.A. International in California and especially Sea-Tac in Washington State, the closest major International airport to the YVR.

The Asia Pacific region, then, stands out as one of the major markets to which the airport wishes to cater. On a superficial level, this has been accommodated by an increase in the number of languages in which visitor services are available as well as in the variety of foods available at various kiosks throughout the airport. However, as will be discussed in the last chapter, there are other, more insidious temptations at play.

The much heralded "Open Skies" agreement between Canada and the United States has also had a major impact on the

---

18SkyTalk: 1996, 9

19Ibid. 9
potential markets available to the YVR. Direct flights to and from major U.S. cities previously unavailable are now scheduled with nearly the same frequency as other flights. This, of course, has meant an increase in the convenient availability of Vancouver to a general North American market. In short, the expanded airport facilities and favourable air travel agreement with the U.S. along with increased business interests in Vancouver has meant that more people potentially can and will come to Vancouver than ever before.

According to Airport Authority President David Emerson, one of the goals of the airport is to "be an exciting people place offering a variety of opportunities to shop, eat, sip a cappuccino, or simply watch the excitement on a major international airport in a setting unique to super, natural British Columbia." But how does one make something as seemingly uninteresting as an airport appear to be a tourist attraction in and of itself, as is clearly the airport's goal?

In the case of the YVR, the aforementioned tactic of using thematics to create an attractive environment with a specific sense of place has proven to be a viable option. By capitalising on the employment of things unique to British Columbia and trying to create an 'authentic' B.C. environment within the airport, the YVR has created what Jackle calls a

---

20 SkyTalk: 1996, 9-10

21 Ibid. 9
'contrived attraction'; one which has effectively drawn in an ever growing body of clientele. According to John Jakle, "contrived attractions are staged. They attract tourists, condensing for them the essence of a place so that they can consume it more readily. Contrived attractions also protect a locality from its visitors by focusing tourist activities temporally and geographically." While the airport can obviously not expect that a visitor to Vancouver could find complete fulfilment within the confines of the terminal complex the element of condensation for experiential ease exists there.

A Public Market area designed to reflect both the popular farmer's market atmospheres of Granville Island in Vancouver and Steveston in Richmond, and a taste of food from the origins of many of the provinces inhabitants within the body of the International Food Court all work together to create an environment which stimulates the visitor by culling some of the more interesting things British Columbia has to offer. One of the most striking aspects of the airport, however, and the one with which I am chiefly concerned, is the use of visual signs of the presence of an Indigenous population within the city and province through the placement of its art within the airport. Certainly, the historic, and to some extent, contemporary lifeways of First Nations people within the province are a distinguishing characteristic of the

---

"Jackle: 1985, 23-24"
province as a whole. However, the overall effect of the prominent placement of some of the works within the terminal smacks more of tokenism than an indication of a sort of nonchalant fulfilment of cross-cultural protocol; that is to say that works such as those by the Musqueam people have won a place within the airport in part due to political necessity and tourist expectations rather than out of a pervasive sense of belonging and appropriateness. In order to gain a deeper understanding of how this might be so, a context for the history and mechanisms of such a contrived nonchalance must first be established.

TOURISM IN OTHER AIRPORT SITES

The YVRAA is not the only institution which seeks to heighten its international profile by marketing itself via the visual signs of Indigenous peoples and elements of local culture. It is important here to gain perspective by examining some other international airport sites and their approaches in order to more clearly evaluate the British Columbian example within an international context. In 1983 the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia officially opened its new King Kahled International Airport (KKIA) for public use. To commemorate that event a collectible full colour picture book was assembled for perusal and printed in both English and Arabic; the two languages bound together in a single volume.

Among the most highly touted features of the KKIA is a mosque with the capacity for five thousand worshippers and
room for an additional five thousand in the courtyard outside the central dome. For a country within which Islam is the dominant faith and to which millions of International Muslims make pilgrimages annually, the central placement and import of such a structure is logical and appropriate. The mosque is a necessary addition to the airport because of its role within contemporary cultural practices. Its treatment within the picture book suggests that it is being promoted as an exotic subject for the tourist gaze, not part of a western everyday experience, but still representing the local dominant society. Here is the first point at which the approaches of YVRAA and the KKIA, two major players within international travel, diverge.

While a mosque within the KKIA clearly refers to a deeply entrenched history of ongoing religious tradition within Saudi Arabia, the use of First Nations art and objects within a Canadian context certainly does no such thing. While the Musqueam people have their own deeply entrenched history of religion or spiritualism, they were selected to participate in the new airport more because of the aura of 'difference' they signify rather than because their traditions are dominant, or even widely accepted, within Canada.

Further than this, contemporary understandings between Canada and First Nations Canadians renders at least the gesture of inclusion politically appropriate and even necessary, which somewhat destabilises such inclusions. It is
also important to note that the Musqueam Cultural Committee had to actively negotiate with the YVRAA on issues around the inclusion and placement of their work and on issues of the types of work to be displayed. While this negotiation is an important part of the creation of a hybrid moment, it is also indicative of the conflicting agendas of both parties and of the power struggles inherent in that process.

With this in mind, it is my suggestion that the scenario at the YVR is one of the tokenized presence of Indigenous peoples; tokenized because the works are present as signs of a subaltern segment of the broader culture. This is especially clear when juxtaposed to the KKIA example in which it is the dominant culture that is used to create a sense of place. The space of the KKIA, then, is homogenised into a forum which, while essentialized into the microcosm of the airport, refers largely to the dominant culture of Saudi Arabia as a whole. In the Vancouver example, the created sense of place is fragmented by conflicting signs of dominant and marginalised presences in which the dominant cultural presence (marked by the site of the airport as a whole) seeks to represent the marginal culture (Indigenous peoples) metonymically through the exhibition of their works. The subject of tokenism shall be discussed in greater detail in chapter three.

The KKIA has on display a variety of "paintings,
tapestries, sculptures, oriental carpets and mosaics." In a manner somewhat similar to the commission of works for the YVR, in Saudi Arabia:

"Kingdom-wide effort was made to marshal talent to create the art works. The thrust of the program was to commission works by Saudi artists that would have lasting value and represent traditional Islamic art forms. At the same time, a search was conducted to locate already existing Arabic art work and antique furnishings that might be available for acquisition. For more than a year, The KKIA art project was the major focus of effort for dozens of Saudi artists who were selected to produce the new works in the collection...The art committee sought out and evaluated the work of as many Saudi artists as could be located - in Kingdom and overseas."24

Here, the ways in which the methods of the two institutions differ becomes increasingly apparent. While both institutions used commission as a major method of acquisition, the manner employed by the Saudi airport seems to have been one which emphasised the inclusivity of mainly dominant culture signs to the exclusion of any subcultural or marginalized ones. The Saudi government attempted to draw on the traditions of the majority. In Vancouver, it is precisely the 'other' who is set forth. The works of non-aboriginal artists are certainly present within the airport. However, with the exception of Lutz Haufchild's large glass art piece, the works of other non-Indigenous artists are of a smaller scale and mainly contained within the glass display cases in the "Departure

23King Khaled International Airport: 1983, Page unavailable

24King Khaled International Airport: 1983, Page unavailable
Passengers Only" area.

The Vancouver International Airport's presentation of Indigenous peoples as a source of local colour, is anything but unusual. Calgary's International Airport uses Indigenous artifacts loaned to them by the Glenbow Museum to affect precisely the same regionally specific sense of place. On a recent trip to Arizona I had the opportunity to see America West Airlines' Terminal Four at the Sky Harbour International Airport in Phoenix. Exterior surfaces of the structure, including the parkade, are decorated with geometric patterns the origins of which could clearly be traced back to design elements common to the Indigenous peoples of the region. Paintings and sculptures within the site capitalized on the 'wild west frontier' theme, complete with representations of sun weathered cowboys and wild Indians. Here again, carpets and fixtures picked up the colours of the desert landscape along with the designs of the people who first lived there. It is clear, then, that Vancouver is not alone in its use of Indigenous cultures to create a sense of place.

Not every International airport turns to the productions of local Indigenous populations in order to attract business. A recent special section of the Vancouver Sun (designed to feature the new International Terminal of the YVR) referred to the Changi Airport in Singapore. The Singapore airport is, the article affirms, internationally known mainly for the amenities it has to offer its clients. A Science Discovery
centre, free city tours, an outdoor swimming pool with bathing suit rental and a karaoke room figure prominently amongst the list of appealing perks. The airport also boasts notably quick turnover times for customs and immigration; both of which are exceedingly important to international visitors.²³

While the Changi Airport may or may not also contain local art (the article included reference to neither a presence nor an absence of such), certainly it would appear that this is a location attempting to build a reputation on the basis of services available rather than on its ability to create an environment in which visitors may shop comfortably. This is not to say that customer service and quick turnover times are not important to the YVR. On the contrary, vast improvements have been made in both of these areas and it remains a key focus of airport management and staff. However, the Changi example was provided simply to indicate that some other airports have adopted approaches which seem, in some respects, far more pragmatic in their overall orientation.

Essentially, all four of the examples provided are competing in a tourist driven marketplace. Reasons for travel such as leisure, variety and curiosity fuel the approaches adopted to the varying social climates and concerns of each site. Setting forth these examples and discussing them within the context of tourist practices broadens the scope of the focus in an effort to locate the larger project within an

²³Vancouver Sun: April 26 1996, D2
international context. The aim is to provide a broad picture of both the idea of tourism as a temporally finite activity with certain expectations attached and an overall picture of the way in which the airport is used by its clientele. Discussions in the final chapter shall expand much of what has been provided here.
The topic of thematics was introduced in chapter one as being of key import to the overall structure of the new terminal building and its marketing goals in terms of passenger attracting strategies. Of prominence with regards to thematics is the use of a variety of First Nations art objects situated throughout the airport in order to create an ambience which reflects the uniqueness of the British Columbian social and physical landscape. In this chapter I will deal more pointedly with some of the issues surrounding that art and its producers, looking at broader issues of display practices around First Nations art in general.

CONTEXT OF WORK

Pertinent here are considerations around not so much the content of (specifically) the Salish Musqueam works present in the YVR but more around their context; especially with regard to their juxtaposition with other non-Musqueam works. This implies some level of curatorial intent; that is to say, the goals and objectives of the exhibitor in terms of what message is communicated to the viewer. In the case of the YVR, the curatorial intent is not one sided but, rather, is informed by both the YVR and the Musqueam people. The issue of bifurcated intent and conflicting agendas will be discussed at length in Chapter Three as a moment of cultural negotiation.

The agency exercised by the Musqueam people in terms of
curatorial intent became clear to me through interviews with weavers Debra Sparrow and Krista Point, as well as with Band Manager Howard Grant. The Musqueam people welcome the opportunity to have some of the visual works of their people included in the new terminal building. In addition, the role of the Musqueam art in the position of welcoming visitors to Canada at the site of the International arrival area is deemed entirely appropriate. The airport stands on traditional Musqueam land and so it should fall to the Musqueam people to welcome visitors. The idea is that, in the absence of the actual people themselves, their art stands in for them as a reminder to resident and visitor alike that one is not only entering Vancouver, British Columbia, Canada, but Musqueam Salish land as well. It seems an equitable solution to a problem of protocol long ignored.

However, there are latent connotations to this otherwise appropriate context as well. In the fourth chapter I will deal with the political problems that arise when objects are left to stand in for people. Suffice it to say, here, that this is really the only viable solution available to both the Musqueam people and the airport. The presence of 'real Indians' in the airport to welcome visitors and returning residents alike would smack even more of tokenism and reflect an atmosphere comparable to the 19th Century museum dioramas in which real people, such as some members of Inuit society,
were used as live props.\textsuperscript{26}

But there is another set of problems posed by the YVR's attempts to develop a contained 'reality.' By virtue of the work's location within an area in which pedestrian traffic is strictly regulated and limited to only airport staff and those arriving on international flights, the Musqueam pieces are immediately rendered less effective because of the exclusivity in terms of their potential viewership. Conversely and not coincidentally, Bill Reid's Spirit of Haida Gwaii, located within the area of the International Food Court and Public Market is more accessible to all visitors. Both domestic and international passengers have access to it as do their sundry ground parties and even visitors to the airport having no intention of using any other airport services. These sites of the location of Indigenous art within the airport, when juxtaposed to one another, make even more complex the tangled web of representational issues which this thesis aims to untangle. It is a question of agency.

The Reid sculpture is not of Musqueam origin. In the light of the socio-political matrix of Indigenous protocol and custom, its position within the airport is, in that respect, somewhat unstable. In order to install the sculpture in the airport, permission and blessing had to be asked of the

\textsuperscript{26}The subject of a physical Indigenous presence will be taken up again later in the discussion of the 'Art Ambassadors' whose role it is to educate the public about the Reid sculpture.
Musqueam people since the airport sits on their land. 
Permission was officially granted by Musqueam Elders in the 
dedication ceremony at the airport on the night of April 18th, 
1996. Haida Gwaii, the spiritualized subject of the 
sculpture, is the traditional home of the Haida people, later 
called the Queen Charlotte Islands by western explorers. The 
Islands are located hundreds of miles up the coast of British 
Columbia so, considering Indigenous protocol (which requires 
that a Nation wishing to accomplish something on land 
belonging to another Nation must first gain permission), to 
have used Reid's work in the position of the Musqueam work as 
a figure of welcome would have been inappropriate; comparable, 
perhaps, to using the American flag and anthem to welcome 
visitors to Canada. Politically, then, with regards to 
respect for protocol, all seems to be as it should. 

What must be addressed, however, is the idea of 
privileging this work within the spatial hierarchy of the 
terminal. While the prestige associated with providing a 
welcoming committee (in absentia or otherwise) is apparent, 
the potential for broader viewership allowed by placement 
within a more public area cannot be ignored. The simple fact 
is that throughout the lifespan of all of these art works 
within the airport, the Reid sculpture will be seen more 
frequently and by more people, and possibly over a longer 
period of time. In addition, the associations many travellers 
may make with the sculpture's twin piece at the Canadian
Embassy in Washington D.C. may also somehow further enhance its prioritization.

Aside from the noted celebrity of the Jade Canoe as an individual and isolated piece of work, one might also question whether or not its prominence within the airport has to do with the fact that it is a Haida work. In terms of the 20th Century history of Northwest Coast Indigenous works circulating both within museological and fine art contexts, the design elements of the Haida people had, by the 1960s and 70s, achieved an elevated status. This is a phenomenon which began early in this century with research and writing carried out by anthropologist Franz Boas. The 1965 publication, *Northwest Coast Indian Art: An Analysis of Form*, by art historian Bill Holm, was probably one of the largest factors in the continued increase of this prominence. Collaborating with artists such as Bill Reid, then just beginning his career as a visual artist, Holm suggested that among the Haida "the principles of organization and form...had their greatest development and most rigid adherence." Such assertions led to the framing of Haida design as the 'classic' Northwest Coast style.

Writing about the 1967 *Arts of the Raven* exhibition at the Vancouver Art Gallery, Marcia Crosby included much discussion around Bill Holm and the methods and means by which Haida works rose to prominence. In writing specifically about

---

Holm: 1965, 20
Reid's great uncle, Haida carver Charles Edenshaw, Crosby states: "Legitimising an Indian-master artist then was as contingent upon the 'Indian-Master' being Haida as it was on constructing him as an individual whose personal interpretation of the rigid rules and principles of Northwest Coast design signalled his artistic genius." In addition to this assertion of the way in which Holm's work inspired exhibitions (such as the *Arts of the Raven* show) to treat Haida work deferentially, Crosby also cites the idea that "a patriarchal form of lineage" was crucial in launching Reid's personal reputation, as his familial relationship to Edenshaw somehow served to ground the burgeoning reputation of his own work as being 'genius'. In this light, considering the historical prominence of specifically Haida work within a fine art context, one wonders whether or not the placement of the Reid sculpture was a strategy founded on a hierarchical system, long established, regarding the Nations of the West Coast. In addition to this, it should also be noted that there is a precedent for placing large scale Haida works in and about public buildings throughout the world, such as the Haida canoe in the American Museum of Natural History at the museum entrance nearest to the Franz Boas Northwest Coast Hall. Haida work, perhaps most especially work by Bill Reid, is what is expected of Vancouver. I suggest that the

---

28 Crosby: 1994, 15
29 Crosby: 1994, 2
fulfilment of that expectation contributes to the destabilization of the Musqueam work within the terminal, a discussion which I will elaborate on later in this paper.

RATIONALES

President of YVR Visitor Services, Frank O'Neill, asserted in a private interview (September 19th, 1996) that the placements of both the Musqueam works and the Jade Canoe were, indeed, strategic. According to O'Neill, however, the works are placed at the two main entry points to the new terminal building and so the underlying strategy is framed by O'Neill as being about 'anchoring' the two entrances, theoretically speaking. He readily acknowledged the role of the Musqueam work as serving to welcome arriving passengers, covering the notion of anchorage at the point of entry for passengers arriving at the terminal by air. As regards the main entrance for passengers walking into the terminal from the street, O'Neill stated that the second floor area, where the Jade Canoe is situated, was designed to be reminiscent of a European Square. In this light, the Canoe is meant to act as a sort of landmark and central meeting place, its origins in the tropes of a Northwest Coast design tradition assisting in the creation of the sense of 'place' specific to British Columbia that the airport is trying to cull. In other words, in terms of pragmatic concerns around the planning and execution of the new terminal building, the placement of all of the works within the airport seem to have a basis in a
particular system of logical thought, and the *Jade Canoe*'s position is grounded within that context, at least as far as the airport is concerned.

A factor falling outside of the logic with which the airport placed the work within the building is the political implication of not having the Musqueam work readily accessible to the average resident of British Columbia who may not be as likely to engage in frequent international travel. Perhaps the somewhat hidden position of the Musqueam work within the airport can be seen as a means of subverting associated issues such as land claims negotiations, educational rights and self-government. The idea of the Musqueam work as hidden becomes even more ironic in considering that information regarding the proximity of the burial and midden sites to the airport and new runway has not been released in a publicly meaningful way.

Band manager Howard Grant stated that he did not feel that the political position of the Musqueam people was being diluted by the inclusion of their work in the airport.\(^{30}\) In other words, at least as far as Grant was concerned, there seemed to be little sense that the work represented a means of masking the propriety and inevitability of conclusive negotiations around any issues of political import to the Musqueam people (such as land claims, hunting and fishing rights, and so on).

Though satisfied that the inclusion of works in the

\(^{30}\)Grant: Interview November 1996
airport marked more of a beginning to a new moment in the negotiation process rather than a shutting down or an end, Grant did assert a certain amount of discomfort in terms of the placement of the Jade Canoe relative to that of the Musqueam works. The inclusion of both Reid's work and the works of other artists, such as Roy Vickers, makes the assertion that the land on which the airport stands is Native land in general, rather than Musqueam land in particular.31 While Grant's discomfort with the inclusion of works by non-Musqueam Indigenous people is shared by Musqueam weaver Debra Sparrow, it should be noted that neither Grant nor Sparrow are entirely opposed to these inclusions, simply somewhat uncomfortable.32

What, then, motivated members of the Musqueam band to have their works included in the new terminal project, considering the obvious and apparent political problems inherent in the site? For Debra Sparrow, the recognition of the Musqueam people seems to be a key factor. Her motivation had little to do with building her own reputation as an individual artist (a title she rejects to begin with) but is more about getting "people to recognize Musqueam as part of Vancouver history."33 By her own admission, her attitude towards the airport is more positive than anything else.

31 Grant: Interview November 4th, 1996
32 Sparrow: Interview, October 17th, 1996
33 Ibid.
Those things about which she feels uncomfortable Sparrow prefers to think of as issues yet to be negotiated rather than as flat out problems.

Krista Point, another of the weavers, seems to share Sparrow's views, asserting that the main focus of her participation had to do with the overall recognition of the Musqueam people and the general appropriateness of their inclusion in the airport. Point acknowledged the inclusion of works by non-Native artists such as Tiko Kerr, but treated them as something of a non-issue. For her, there is also some discomfort with the celebrity of works by Reid and Vickers. Her motivation, too, has to do with making way for a growing interest in and rise to prominence of Musqueam Salish works.

**HISTORICAL CONTEXT OF DISPLAY PRACTICES**

The issues facing the Musqueam people with regards to their decision to participate in the YVR project are not uncommon. Artists of Aboriginal ancestry across Canada have long and often struggled with such dilemmas. The choice to participate in a venture including the displays of works, historic or contemporary, is always a loaded one, often complicated by knowledge of the history of display practices around First Nations work in Canada in general. These factors can contribute significantly to the debate. Before a discussion of the theoretical and political issues around visual culture and display practices can be addressed in the

---

(Point: Interview, November 15th, 1996)
third chapter, a brief look at how some of the present debates have been informed is necessary.

Canada's relationship to Indigenous peoples is full of many incidents of repression and attempts to obliterate entirely the cultures which pre-dated the arrival of Europeans. The introduction of the reservation system (which provided the framework for South Africa's infamous policy of Apartheid) in order to monitor and control the customs and land use of Indigenous peoples is only one example. Residential schools, designed in part to assimilate Native children - to 'white wash' their Nativeness out of them - is another example of historical errors in relational tactics. In addition, the ban on the Northwest Coast Potlatch, and Plains Sundance ceremony, among other spiritually significant practices, have had a profound impact on the continuing evolution of Indigenous Canadian cultures in the 20th Century. Though Potlatches were decriminalized by the 1950s and Sundances by the 1960s, and Native people were granted the right to vote federally in 1962, the historic methods of dealing with First Nations people in Canada have left their mark in terms of a series of unsatisfactorily resolved issues around cultural sovereignty, many of which are further marred by feelings of mistrust for all parties involved.

In terms of display practices around First Nations objects and art works, prior to the middle of this century, most of the responsibility for that task was assumed by the
field of anthropology, with their 'loot' being displayed in museums (as opposed to art galleries). According to Joane Cardinal-Shubert: "As well as the displacement of ceremonies and language, Native people suffered the loss of their cultural icons, their reliquiae. Ceremonial objects were taken from them and systematically collected by museums and collectors throughout the world as evidence of a dying culture."\(^{35}\)

The notion of the motivation for collection practices as being the result of the perceived decline of Indigenous cultures is often referred to as the "Salvage Paradigm." Salvage, in this context, implies the preservation of things presumed or perceived as abandoned.

The idea of the salvage paradigm stems from the collection practices of ethnologists in the late 19th and early 20th Centuries. According to Virginia Dominguez: "When we assert the need to salvage, rescue, save, preserve a series of objects or forms, we announce our fear of its destruction, our inability to trust others to take appropriate action and our sense of entitlement over the fate of the objects. Our best liberal intentions do little other than patronize those slated for cultural salvage."\(^{36}\)

The implication here is a shift in assumed responsibility from the producer (in this case, Indigenous people) to the 'expert' (in this case, the anthropologist).

\(^{35}\)Cardinal-Shubert: 1989, page unavailable

\(^{36}\)Dominguez: 1987, 131
Writing on the same topic James Clifford has noted that the underlying logic reads something like "'we' have history, 'they' have myth." Because the attempts to assimilate and acculturate, if not obliterate, Native peoples were seen as being so successful around the turn of the century, a set of practices evolved whereby the dominant culture was able, to some extent and not without objections, to assume responsibility for the care and preservation of certain aspects of Native culture.

These practices have resulted in many objects of Native origin being transferred to, and still kept in, museum collections. A shift in focus for some objects from 'artifact' to 'art' (those which could be construed as having notably aesthetic attributes) began to occur fairly early on in this century. Many early exhibitions, such as Canadian West Coast Art: Native and Modern, organized by anthropologist Marius Barbeau and gallery director Eric Brown for the National Gallery in Ottawa in 1927, marks one such early example. The show meshed two and three dimensional work by west coast Aboriginal peoples with the more modernist works by members of the Group of Seven, Emily Carr and others.38 The practice of relating to objects created by First Nations people as art, even those objects originally created as utilitarian items, has continued; frequently with interesting

37Ibid.: 125

38Hill: 1995, 190
results.

Factions have developed within the body of Aboriginal Canada. Some factions fully desire the recognition that exhibitions of this nature can bring, while others reject the exhibition of any objects that have not been produced specifically as art. Joane Cardinal-Shubert, Daphne Odjiig, Jane Ash-Poitras and Alex Janvier staged a protest in the form of an exhibition to object to what they felt was the latent message of *The Spirit Sings*, a show held at the Glenbow Museum concurrent with the 1988 Winter Olympic games in Calgary and one which featured First Nation's artifacts. According to Cardinal-Shubert, the Glenbow exhibition "pushed the false assumption that these objects were created for art's sake...pushed the notion that Native culture was dead, wrapped up, over and collected." As a visual artist and writer working with modernist and post-modernist means, Cardinal-Shubert seems to be expressing concerns around the lack of acknowledgement paid to contemporary First Nations artists, seemingly in favour of continued exhibitions highlighting 'traditional' works and artifacts. While the next chapter will address in more depth the socio-political implications of this dichotomy, it serves here to point to a problematic history around issues of representation and exhibition within Canada.

---

39Cardinal-Shubert: 1989, 23
INTENTIONS REGARDING ART

Considering Cardinal-Shubert's remarks, a new dimension of meaning and interrogation can be added to the discussion of the works in the new International Terminal building. The works produced by the Musqueam artists for the airport all find their creative genesis not only within the hands and minds of their late 20th Century producers, but also in the historic modes and types of production of their ancestors. With the exception of Susan Point's huge Spindle Whorl (clearly too enormous to be functional) each of the items selected by the Musqueam Cultural Committee and installed in the airport could easily, without considering their obvious newness, have been borrowed from a place such as the Museum of Anthropology. In fact, weaver Krista Point has stated that she frequently uses the facilities at the M.O.A. to look at some of the old blankets of her people and so glean inspiration from them.\[40\]

The argument here is not that the Musqueam people are reproducing objects based in antiquity and therefore they are not creating art, especially considering the objections that Debra Sparrow has to the use of that title.\[41\] Rather, the point is simply to question whether or not other kinds of work, more modern or post-modern work, might not have been as readily accepted for display.

\[40\]Point: Interview November 15th, 1996

\[41\]Sparrow: Interview October 17th, 1996
My point here is that the work which ultimately ended up at the airport is work which is acceptable and desirable not so much because it is Musqueam work but because it is Musqueam work which fits into the thematics at the airport without creating any ruptures in the perfect picture of a contained reality which the airport is trying to create. The objects, selected through the auspices of both the YVRAA and the Musqueam Cultural Committee, fit the image of British Columbia and Vancouver that the airport is trying to sell. In addition, they in no way present a problem to the image of the Musqueam people which the band has worked to build and maintain. In fact, the Musqueam works in the airport might be read as speaking of a quiet dignity that comes from knowing and claiming one's history with pride.

However, the nagging question remains as to whether or not this work was approved precisely because of these normative qualities. Contemporary works included in exhibitions such as Indigena (a 1992 exhibition focusing on contemporary works by North American Natives held at the Canadian Museum of Civilization) frequently tend to have more political and often potentially volatile connotations. According to co-curators Lee-Ann Martin and Gerald McMaster: "The objective of the project was...to engage indigenous Canadian visual, literary and performing artists to address such issues as discovery, colonization, cultural critique and
tenacity, from each of their perspectives." While it may be argued that the Musqueam work in the airport certainly may be said to speak to issues of cultural tenacity, an explicit treatment of issues around critique, colonization and discovery is absent from the exhibition.

It would be inappropriate to over problematize the apparent absence of these other positions. It may, perhaps, be said that cultural tenacity, in and of itself, indirectly addresses those other issues through its defiance of them. In addition, there is no one particular way in which all First Nations artists ought to work nor only one body of issues which they should be expected to address. While this is not a line of inquiry which seeks to accuse either the airport or the Musqueam people of boondoggling through avoidance, it does seem convenient, considering the airport's goals, that the work selected for inclusion certainly seems to down-play the kinds of social and political issues with which other Aboriginal artists have engaged themselves.

One wonders how things would sit if an artist working in the manner of Lawrence Paul Yuxweluptun, whose works are notably aggressive and politically loaded, were included. On the one hand, the direct address of political issues through visual art seems to have been a concern for neither the Musqueam people, nor the airport. Rather, an exhibition that speaks of long standing tradition and values seems to be more

---

42 Martin and McMaster: 1992, 15
what both parties had in mind. On the other hand, (and this harken back to debates cited in previous sections) the work in the airport is of a decidedly modernist, not post-modernist, ilk.

While I do not intend to argue here that some things 'art' and other things are not, the orientation of works included in other exhibitions of Indigenous art versus the tone of the works included at the airport speaks to some sort of disparity. To value one type of work over the other seems inappropriate, but to acknowledge the differences in their approaches and to question what is at stake for both the airport and the Musqueam people by adopting their particular position, remains significant.
Chapter Three

This portion of the paper seeks to draw together previous sections into a cohesive theoretical analysis of how the components of the airport function in terms of their effects on the viewer and in terms of the latent issues of representation and cultural negotiation with which the airport has actively involved itself. Up for discussion here is not only the airport proper, but also the YVR's Art Foundation, whose goals and strategies, while perhaps not always manifest within the airport, certainly inform the larger picture. My interest in these subjects is in the question of what is at stake for both the airport and the Musqueam people in terms of the art selected and the exhibition tactics chosen.

SEGREGATION AND FETISHIZATION

Contemporary mainstream First Nations artists working in Canada such as Joane Cardinal-Shubert and Gerald McMaster, address the notion that Indian art in Canada has been consistently filtered out of the mainstream and has been defined as its own discreet and separate category, that is to say, ghetto-ized. McMaster and Martin's 1992 project for the Canadian Museum of Civilization, Indigena, brought these issues clearly to centre stage. Throughout the show, which was designed to be a forum for self-representation and the interrogation of an apparently oppressive system, McMaster posited his underlying problem as being about the reasons that
"art museums have excluded aboriginal art in Canada and the United States," although, of course, the show's intention was to challenge those boundaries. While 1992 saw the realisation of many exhibitions of First Nations work across the country (formulated to mark the anniversary of five hundred years of occupation and contact), the years preceding and proceeding from that one watershed year continue to be plagued by issues of separation, segregation, and fetishization.

Cultural critic Homi Bhabha refers back to Freudian theory when he defines fetishization as a "non-repressive form of knowledge that allows for the possibility of simultaneously embracing two contradictory beliefs, one official and one secret, one archaic and one progressive, one that allows the myth of origins, the other that articulates difference and division." This reading of fetishization is pertinent to the project at hand and one which is, in some ways, embodied by the YVR.

In the first instance, there are clearly two forms of knowledge and two sets of practices employed with regards to the International Terminal building. The display and exhibition of First Nations work may be seen to act as a sort of homage to the artists, their heritage, and their creativity; a celebration of the Indigenous cultures within

---

"McMaster: 1992, Page Unavailable

"Bhabha: 1994, 80
the province. However, the very fact that the YVR went out of its way to include works by Aboriginal artists indicates that there were non-progressive motivations behind the project as well.

The Vancouver International Airport has further implicated itself in the project of defining culture through contemporary visual culture by the establishment of the YVR Art Foundation. Though the Art Foundation is not responsible for the placement of the Musqueam works within the airport its associations with its parent institution are made clear by the reference to the airport within the Foundation's title, in that it actually contains the airport's name. In addition, the Foundation used the airport's Jade Canoe during the summer of 1995 in order to raise funds to support its goals (Figure 12), a move which further links the two entities.

The Art Foundation's mandates provide some insight into the idea of fetishization being linked here to the airport. In the YVR Art Foundation Newsletter of Summer, 1995, the following description of the purpose and mandates of the Art Foundation was provided:

"The YVR Art Foundation, established in 1994, was created to foster the development of Northwest Coast Native Art. Funds from the Foundation will be used to commission work from emerging and well known artists. The Vancouver International Airport Authority (YVRAA) has taken this initiative because Northwest Coast Native art can play an important role in defining the unique character of our Province and its heritage, and can make a major contribution to the increase of international awareness and tourism to Canada. The YVR Art Foundation, through use of the airport facilities will have an opportunity to display and promote our cultural heritage to many millions of international, national and local travellers
and visitors."

Here, the attitude is one of patronization, as opposed to patronage, with the assumption being that the producers of this art needed extra or special help in marketing it. In addition, the idea that First Nations work has been specifically targeted for fostering, contributes to the very sort of segregation and separation against which many Aboriginal artists are working; but not any of those included in the airport.

Frank O'Neill made clear in an article in the Vancouver Sun that a good part of the purpose of the art was to stimulate economic profits at the airport. His statement extended beyond the Art Foundation to include the work actually in place at the terminal. "I think it [Native Art] will provide a competitive advantage over an airport that looks upon itself as a processing factory...What art can do is create an ambience and a feeling that puts people in a good mood. That, by the way, has a great commercial spinoff." Here one of the 'secret' beliefs, seemingly counted by the airport as a 'progressive' one, is made manifest. While one of the socio-political 'spinoffs' may be a heightened awareness of First Nations people within the province and the Musqueam people in particular, what lies at the heart of the enterprise is really a matter of commerce.

"Vancouver International Airport: 1994, 4 (emphasis mine)

"Vancouver Sun: April 26th, 1996, D2
Although the Musqueam people fully participated in the inclusion of their work within the new International Terminal building, there is an underlying problem around the lack of self representation, fundamentally a question of the construction of identity. Collection and display practices often tell us much more about the exhibitor rather than about the exhibitee, as asserted by Virginia Dominguez in a 1986 article, and others. Even had the selection of works for the airport been entirely at the insistence and discretion of the Musqueam Cultural Committee, and every aspect of it entirely under their control, the context of the terminal building is reflective of ideas pertaining to the philosophical west more so than of the Indigenous people of Canada; a phenomenon which art historian Svetlana Alpers refers to as the "museum effect". This describes the way in which the very presence of an object within a western display context has a transformative effect on that object, immediately decontextualizing it and thereby rendering it 'art' regardless of any and all prior meaning. This inherent shift in meaning is especially true when the objects in questions are, in fact, once culturally useful historic artifacts such as those one might find at an ethnographic museum. Function, in that case, recedes in deference to form so that the focus of the viewer is directed to an aestheticised examination of the

"Alpers: 1991, 26"
object which may take such issues as intent and function for granted. Although it remains true that the airport is a business and not a museum, the idea of transformation of objects through the 'museum effect' is still useful as, essentially, it refers not just to transformations which occur within the realm of a formal museum but to the way in which any display context changes the meaning of an object.

With this in mind the concept of the 'museum effect' can be applied to the works in the YVR as regards their display context. However, the overall issue of display practices and representation is rendered much more complex due to the fact that the objects on display were, indeed, created specifically for the purpose of exhibition. In other words, their primary function was not to be culturally useful, but, rather, to be decorative tourist attractions, allowing the airport to capitalize on Native authorship and benefit from the absence of politically loaded messages. Really, then, the objects are performing as they were intended to by the producers; or are they?

REDUCTION

To answer this intriguing question, it is useful to return to the subject of the tropes of tourism. Kenneth Little discusses the relationship of Indigenous peoples to the tourist industry: "In the tourist discourse, for example, there is a striking objectification of indigenous people that is a focal part of the production of tourist
spectacles...Tourists...never meet indigenous people within a contemporary social context. Rather, the 'tribal natives' of the sort in the tourist text remain categorized as 'native', 'tribal', 'prehistoric', and 'primitive'." What Little is asserting here is that the potential problems of inequitable relationships between tourists (as 'dominant society figures) and Natives (as marginal 'others') is diffused by the reduction of Natives to the position of unthreatening tourist commodities. Rather than representing themselves as contemporary people who occupy the same variety of roles assumed by the dominant society, Natives are represented by the tourist industry in a variety of ways, many of which render them as non-participants in contemporary life.

In the case of the YVR, the reduction of First Nation's people occurs when their art (visual evidence of their existence) is left to stand in for them; the objects replace the people. By presenting a picture of the Indigenous populations of British Columbia which only allows for the acknowledgement of certain aspects of their culture (in this case, artistic production) the airport has presented a cropped image. While outside of those things which apply to the tourist discourse relations between the Musqueam (specifically) and the airport may in fact be very open and broadly informed with much potential for growth, the image presented by the YVR at the airport does not indicate this.

"Little: 1991, 152"
Rather, the display of the work within the YVR renders this representation of the Musqueam people as a static one.

Although the display of the *Jade Canoe* is mediated by the presence of First Nations 'Art Ambassadors' which allows for the presentation of the physical presence of members of the Indigenous population, the reduction effect still occurs. Drawn from a variety of Indigenous Nations and, in some cases, academic disciplines, the art ambassadors, usually working two at a time, are at the site in order to respond to public questions about the sculpture. Though their position as marginal within the larger society is somewhat mollified by their actual presence within the airport a reduction still occurs.

By having them on site specifically to act as 'informants' (in the historical ethnographic sense) the total identities of the ambassadors are again compromised by the absence of any indication that they occupy other roles as well. Their designation as 'ambassadors' presents an image of Indigenous people in which they only relate to the dominant society in order to explain themselves and their differences. It is the curiosity of the viewer, an external factor, which is allowed to provide meaning to their roles, and not the kinds of internal impetuses which are allowed to inform the roles of everybody else.49

49As a point of interest, contrary to what was expected in terms of public questions, Rosalie Wilson, one of the Art Ambassadors, confirmed that the majority of the questions were
TOKENISM

Here, we find not only that the inclusion of the art acts as a form of tokenism, as asserted earlier in this work, but that, further, the 'art ambassadors' as human subjects themselves, also become tokenised; essentially tokenism, here, is a form of reduction. Cultural critic Gayatri Spivak has written extensively on the problems facing diasporic peoples, who also face marginalization in contemporary post colonial society. On the subject of the relationship of 'dominant' to 'marginal' people she states that "certain people are elevated very quickly to those who speak for all immigrants: in terms of funding, and in terms of the dissemination of their work, etc. As a result, you don't hear about the rest, because 'we have covered that,' and those few token figures function as a very secure alibi."\(^{50}\) What Spivak is talking about is the way in which certain people, objects, and ideas become tokenized. Although she refers specifically to immigrants, essentially, Spivak is speaking of the position of any marginalized people; a position which the First Nations of Canada are quite familiar with. She further asserts that "when you are perceived as a token, you are also silenced in a certain way because...if you have been brought there [to participate] it has been covered, they [dominant society] needn't worry about

about materials, weight, the artist, the amount of time it took to create the sculpture and the work's total cost. (Interview, October 25th, 1996)

\(^{50}\)Spivak: 1990, 60
it anymore, you salve their conscience."

The notion of a particular kind of 'silencing' is a valuable one in terms of what is happening with regards to the display practices at the airport and in terms of thinking about display practices in general. As referenced with the earlier idea of the 'museum effect' an exhibit often tells us much more about exhibitor than exhibitee; an effect which, in many ways, does silence the object and any references to the object's producer. In a case like that of the YVR, the issue of exhibiting intentions and silences becomes even more complex as the variable of cultural representation is introduced to the equation.

Michael Baxandall, in his article "Exhibiting Intentions" discusses the ways in which exhibitions are both organized and informed:

"The purpose of the exhibitor's activities are complex. They include putting on a good show and instructing the audience, but if these purposes come under the rubric of representing a culture then they also include, functionally, validating a theory - namely, a theory of culture. There seems nothing sinister in this. But clearly the exhibitor has purposes and conditions different from those of the first agent, the maker of the objects exhibited."[52]

Here, Baxandall also points to a presumed silencing of what he calls the 'first agent.' This view, while true to the idea that the exhibitor has, almost invariably, an agenda, also belies the agency and agenda of the 'first agent.' Because in

---

[51] Ibid., 61

the case of the YVR, the Musqueam people were actively involved in negotiating the terms of the inclusion of their work, the idea of 'exhibiting intentions' is much more complex.

Before discussing these complexities, it should be known that the actual process of negotiation between the airport and the Musqueam people began in 1992 when the airport's control was transferred to the YVRAA. It was at this point that the Musqueam Cultural Committee was established. Several proposals were put forth to the YVR from the committee, most of which called for more pieces than are currently installed in the terminal. After much discussion the current format was approved by both parties and commissions were formally assigned.

CULTURAL NEGOTIATION AND THE THIRD SPACE

This leads to a discussion of the idea of cultural negotiation which is a part of the very core of my thesis. In keeping with Baxandall's remarks, when an institution displays works which are clearly products of a social 'other', that institution is, indeed, participating in a discourse which ultimately seeks to validate a particularly theorized idea of culture. The involvement of the producers in this case, however, indicates their investment in that same process of negotiation. The YVR is in the business of attracting tourists. The Musqueam people wish to heighten the awareness of tourists to their existence. The YVR has an outsiders view
and understanding of the Musqueam people; the Musqueam's view of themselves is informed from within. The YVR has on display some of the works of the Musqueam people, thereby, taking on the role of representing them. The Musqueam were involved in the construction of that exhibition, thereby, taking responsibility for representing themselves. Two sets of goals, two agendas and two perspectives went into the creation of the Musqueam exhibition at the airport in order to come up with a working model of culture. What they have created together, then, is a hybrid moment in the history of cultural negotiation.

Homi Bhabha states that the hybrid moment is one of political change. "Here the transformational value of change lies in the rearticulation, or translation, of elements that are neither the One...nor the Other...but something else besides, which contests the terms and territories of both." This creation of a 'third space' through a moment of hybrid negotiation is really what we are speaking of when we speak of the exhibition practices, especially as they pertain to the Musqueam people, at the airport; the third space is the plateau of the moment of cultural hybridity created through negotiation.

The participation of both parties allowed the placement of the work to be informed by both exhibitor and first agent so that the message that we receive as viewers is truly a

---

53Bhabha: 1994, 28
matter of 'neither the one nor the other' but a complex meshing of both, as indicated in the description of the actual process of negotiation. For example, the placement of the 'welcome poles' in a position where they do actually perform their function as 'welcomers' (rather than, say, being pushed up against the walls where they would be present but out of the path of pedestrian traffic) is an example of the way in which a third space has been created at the airport.

At the most base level, the very inclusion of Musqueam work in the first place, outside of the airport' passenger strategy initiatives, also represents the creation of a third space; one in which two cultures, perhaps with little in common other than a shared interest in the land on which the airport stands, are brought together to be represented in tandem (one by the creation of the space and one by the art within the space) on a common ground.

While the idea of the third space, cultural negotiation and political change through moments of hybridity are valid and can be clearly seen at the airport if one approaches the subject with a critical mind, this is not where the discussion ends. Although it is clear that the Musqueam people did exercise some agency, there are many other factors within the airport (that is, the airport as a business) to be considered.
Chapter Four

It is at this point that discussion may expand outwards from dealing solely with the Musqueam examples. Because they involve the idealized moment of hybridity, they cannot be said to reflect the airport as a whole. In this chapter I will deal with some of the ways in which the integrity of that hybrid moment is compromised by other strategies employed by the YVR.

**CREATION OF TOURIST MOMENTS**

As asserted in previous sections, the tourist industry consists of a whole set of practices which aim to provide the tourist with a particular kind of experience; one which is tied closely to both leisure and pleasure. Tourist industries, especially localized ones such as airports, clearly recognize the selling potential that Indigenous communities lend to the larger community. The question, then, often becomes one of how to utilise Indians as a 'natural resource' while filtering out some of the potentially 'displeasurable' aspects of the reality of their relationships to the 'dominant' society.

The answer is obvious; use not the Indians themselves, who may speak in their own voices and provide a disjuncture in the perfect community picture, but use instead the visual signs of their presence - art. This is a tactic which has already been addressed, but now it can be evidenced through a
discussion of the way it has been employed by the airport at one of the earlier planning stages; in this case, specifically with regards to the YVR Art Foundation and the Spirit of Haida Gwaii/Jade Canoe.

In order for an endeavour such as the Art Foundation, or even the creation of a conceptually localized sense of place to be successful, it must be strictly controlled and thoroughly explained and rationalised both for the institution and for the viewing public. The set of practices this entails, at least on the part of the institution concerned, might generally be referred to as 'public relations.' In the case of the YVR Art Foundation, text seems, thus far, to be the mainstay of any kind of public relations activities surrounding the Foundation.

Prior to its investiture at the new International Terminal building, Bill Reid's sculpture was installed at a temporary home on Granville Island. The sculpture itself was housed in a post-modern version of the traditional Coastal style cedar Longhouse, open entirely to the public (Figure 10). Visitors to the Island were free to walk around the sculpture at their leisure, much as they are now at the airport. Initially, many visitors even felt free enough to mount the platform on which the sculpture stood in order to achieve (presumably) something like a more physical communion with the work. (Apparently, this still occurs even within the more formal setting of the airport, much to the chagrin of
Tour guides from various Native bands throughout the province were hired by the YVR to act as interpreters for the sculpture, the site, and the Art Foundation. Unlike the Art Ambassadors currently employed within the YVR, the nature of their roles seemed much more formal.

In speeches of approximately twenty minutes in length, the guides circumvented the sculpture, always followed by eager tourists, as they explained and defined each of the figures in Reid's colossal bronze work. Though they were 'live action' figures, designed to invigorate the site with a contemporary First Nation's presence, their speeches were entirely scripted, even down to the answers to random questions posed occasionally by equally random tourists. Their sharing of information seemed text based and inorganic and, in that respect, differed very little from the panels posted throughout the site. Essentially, the same process of silencing occurs here in much the same manner as does with the Art Ambassadors. Rather than allowing for an organic and free flowing dialogue (or even a monologue which reflects something of the personality of the speaker) presentations were so cropped and constructed as to leave one with the impression that what one was hearing was not even the speaker's real voice.

At its site on Granville Island, the Canoe was accompanied by two main bodies of text. One of these was an
explanation of the figures in the Canoe written in a poetic style by Bill Reid (Figure 11). In the conclusion of Reid's musings, he states:

"Is the tall figure, who may or may not be the Spirit of Haida Gwaii, leading us, for we are all in the same boat, to a sheltered beach beyond the rim of the world as he seems to be or is he lost in a dream of his own dreamings. The boat goes on, forever anchored in the same place."  

Here, the semi-satirical intent of the sculpture comes to the fore. Reid places us all within the same boat and then begs us examine our direction, or lack thereof, and specifically asks just who is doing the steering. The abridged version of this text which appears just adjacent to the sculpture in the airport includes these last couple of lines. The lines and the question they pose seem something of an ironic twist considering the questions about just who is steering the boat with regards to the project of cultural representation, with which this paper is concerned.

The other set of text panels at the Granville Island site were promotional texts intended to inform the public about the Art Foundation and its goals (Figure 12). The Foundation's mission statement, as quoted earlier in this paper also appears now at the airport. Here, once again, problems of language and power relations become readily apparent. With the expression of sentiments which relate the potential positive impact of the role that First Nations art can play within the province, the mandate, although altruistic in

---

"Reid: 1994"
essence, may have been helped by the indication of some sense of history. While the Art Foundation's newsletter stated, within the body of the Chairman's message, that the YVR acknowledges that many tourists will have had no prior exposure to Northwest Coast Aboriginal art no special sensitivity is used in consideration of this fact. Perhaps the Board of Directors forgot, momentarily, that a large part of tourism in this province has already been built on the backs of First Nation's peoples (the rest of it having been built on the landscape, the mounties, the idea of Canada as 'pure', natural and sublime in general).

These two texts play off of one another in an instructive manner within the context of the airport. Their spatial isolation from one another (in the sense that they do not appear on the same panel) allows them to be read discreetly so that the 'voice' of the YVR and the 'voice' of the sculptor may be viewed only as latently incohesive, since their presence together within the Canoe site forces them to be read, on that level, as manifestly cohesive. While the informational text about the YVR fulfilled its function more or less manifestly by acting as an explicative tool, Reid's text, the one which presumably works to authenticate the site by the employment of 'the Native voice', was cut down to the bare minimum. The logic seems to be that by using Reid's voice to explain the sculpture, the YVR alleviates (or, at

---

55 Vancouver International Airport: 1994, 1
least, attempts to) some of the problems around representation which may otherwise have been more prevalent.

YVR ON THE INTERNET

The advent of increasing access to the Internet has provided yet another forum to which institutions such as the YVR may look in the process of disseminating information. Here, as language is the predominant means of explication, issues around the use of language in constructing the user's understanding of whatever information is contained within the text becomes increasingly important.

The Internet is, in and of itself, a quagmire of spatially unanchored data, easily accessible to anyone with a modem. Sites on the 'net' provide users with both visual and textual bytes organized into discreet compartments which allow an easy flow of information, exponentially expanding as the user clicks onto key words within the body of a given text. The YVR has taken advantage of this technology by establishing its own site on the World Wide Web (WWW).

The site begins with a Home Page which essentially provides a menu of the informational items available throughout the rest of the site. Organized into categories such as 'Welcome', 'Gateway', 'Terminals', 'Route Network', 'Photo Gallery', and 'Ground Transportation', the user may click onto any one of these headings in order to probe the information available therein. This paper, being mainly concerned with the new International Terminal building,
utilised that menu item to generate a search (a different menu choice would result in a different search pattern). From the first page, entitled "New International Terminal Building: Summary of Features," flow various sub-headings; 'A Taste of British Columbia', 'Passengers on the Move with Spectacular Connections', 'Smart use of Space', 'Baggage Handling', 'Exciting Retail Development', and 'Improved Customs Facilities'. In particular, 'A Taste of British Columbia' deals with the earlier referred to idea of thematics.

Here, within the 'Taste of British Columbia' page, the text allows the reader to click onto information regarding 'Musqueam' art works and 'The Sprit of Haida Gwaii'; it is within this first page that the continuing investigation of both the kind of language and the way in which language is used by the YVR can resume. Within the body of text in the souvenir edition of "Skytalk Magazine" the Reid sculpture is the only work referred to as a 'masterpiece.' Although this obvious accolade is absent from the Internet site, a more subtle form of hierarchicalization is nonetheless employed. The text on the web site reads: "Captivating displays, including giant murals, museum artifacts and specially commissioned Musqueam and Haida Nation art, including Bill Reid's The Spirit of Haida Gwaii, the Jade Canoe, depict British Columbia's past and Present."

---

56SkyTalk: 1996, 58

57http://www.yvr.ca/itb/itbsumm.htm: January 22nd, 1997
of specific references to individual artists of the Musqueam Nation, juxtaposed to the specific mention of Reid's name and work indicates the presumed prevalence of both his reputation and work. Although on subsequent pages in the web site, such as the Photo Gallery, do mention both Susan Pointe and Shane Point and even place the Musqueam work before the Reid sculpture, this initial omission is troubling. While Reid's international reputation doubtless lends him some name recognition, the lack of overall consistency is telling.

In addition to this problematic moment of representation, several other equally problematic moments surfaced as the scope of the search broadened. On the page entitled "A Musqueam Welcome to the World" it is asserted that the viewer "will experience the impressive artistic talents and natural reflections of the Musqueam, the aboriginal people who still today live at the mouth of the Fraser River." Here, the Musqueam encounter the same kind of reduction referred to earlier in this work; in which their identities are essentially collapsed into the singular role of 'artist'. The mental image created of the Musqueam living 'still today at the mouth of the Fraser River' is equally reductive as it implies that their lifeways have remained unchanged in all of the time they have existed here. No reference is made to the fact that they all live in modern houses with central heating and so on.

http://www.yvr.ca/itb/musqueam.htm: January 22nd, 1997
Each of the pieces created by the Musqueam are identified within the body of the text, but once again, with no reference to the names of the individual artists. In order to get at that information the user must click onto each of the works individually, calling up the applicable page. What this means is that, for many, access to the names of specific Musqueam artists is gained only through the persistence of the user; a stark contrast to the ease with which the user may find information regarding Bill Reid's work.

Unlike "Skytalk Magazine", the WWW text does mention, on the Photo Gallery page, the fact that the two welcome figures were in fact carved by two different artists. What is absent from both bodies of text, however, is the fact that Susan Point also created the glass disks which adorn the backs of both figures. Here, the latent message is that not only are the Musqueam works under rated in terms of their accessibility, but the drive to get the information out accurately would appear to be absent.

The page regarding the Jade Canoe is the only one which has a section specifically devoted to the transmission of "Artistic Details" which are, in reality, simply the pragmatic details regarding the work's dimensions and materials. Information regarding the materials and dimensions of other works within the airport is included in the bodies of the texts which deal with them. However, that information is not

http://www.yvr.ca/itb/figures.htm: January 22nd, 1997
laid out in the same definitive and professional manner which is used in the treatment of Reid's work.

While these problems may be a matter of oversight the latent detriment which results from the physical difference between the pages is not ameliorated by such an excuse. Perhaps the Reid sculpture really is more highly valued than the other works and has, as a result, been treated deferentially both within the airport as a whole and within the context of the Internet site. Regardless of what the reasons may be for these discrepancies, the effect remains the same; there is a disparity in the ways that the Musqueam and Haida works are treated. It is my suggestion that this contributes to the overall reduction of the Musqueam people.

In a final irony, only two pages on the site use the artists own voice to describe their work. One is the page devoted to the "Great Wave Wall" by Lutz Haufschild while the other is by Bill Reid, and details the figures in the canoe. Although Haufschild's name is misspelled, it appears at the bottom of the text and is dated September 7, 1995; an apparent indication of his authorship. Here, once again, issues of silencing, hierarchicalization and privileging become apparent.

The idea that Haufschild, as the only non-aboriginal artist treated on the site, and Reid, as the Master Haida carver, are the only two artists who are allowed to represent

60http://www.yvr.ca/itb/wavewall.htm: January 22nd, 1997
themselves through text certainly says something about the agency of the other artists involved. Haufschild and Reid speak for themselves while the other artists are spoken for by someone else. Further, and once again, Reid is mentioned by name at the earliest possible juncture, while the Musqueam people are only named if the reader is willing to continue with a more detailed search. It is apparent that the maze of segregation, fetishization and silence exists even in one of the world's most modern and accessible means of data deployment. Barriers exist here not due to preferential access but through the privilege of self-representation (or lack thereof) and the language used to construct that representation.\footnote{It should be noted that this section was written based on the WWW pages as they appeared in January of 1997. Subsequent research revealed that the YVR had plans to change the format of their web site, effective in mid-April of 1997. However, the updated information was unavailable at the time of this writing so my analysis stands on the basis of my initial research. In addition, I was able to learn that the new web site is slated to have significantly less information on the art within the terminal so that the focus can be shifted to more pragmatic tourist concerns such as ground transportation and parking.}
Throughout this work, I have referred to the idea of the 'third space' as being a theoretical plateau of mutuality achieved by the negotiation of two parties. In this particular case that negotiation has to do with the coexistence of two cultures which, for different reasons, have sought to occupy the same space. In Bhabha's utopian theoretical ideal, that hybrid space is dominated by neither party, but equally informed by both. Though their agendas may conflict, the potential for a power struggle is ostensibly assuaged through the negotiating process and the result is a working model of hybrid culture which allows room for both. In this instance the discussion has focused on a snap-shot moment of the Vancouver scene involving the Vancouver International Airport and the Musqueam Salish Nation. The international "Arrival Passengers Only" area of the new terminal building has become, I have argued, a site of cultural negotiation, resolving itself in a moment of hybridity.

Because the airport must function as a business competing in the tourist industry many of the marketing strategies it employs in order to be competitive ultimately belie the positive advancements made during the prior negotiation of that 'third space.' One of the ways in which the agency of the Musqueam people - their right and ability to represent
themselves - has been undermined by the airport has to do with the very act of placing the work within the terminal building. Not a museum but a business, the airport, by virtue of that fact, has partly co-opted the agency of the Musqueam people, and ends up presenting them as a people metonymically reduced to an art form - despite the fact that the Musqueam participated in negotiations aimed at representing themselves. Although they did exercise their agency and were able to participate in their own representation, the success of that finite exhibition space is compromised by the larger matrix of the airport as a whole.

The works selected for exhibition, though contemporary, all find their structural genesis in forms which can be traced back to common items from earlier times; spindle whorls, blankets and welcome poles. Although this speaks positively of cultural perseverance and the carrying on of tradition, it also serves to render the Musqueam as atemporal; static. Further, none of the works deal with contemporary political issues of the sort which many Northwest Coast Natives and other aboriginal Canadians are engaged in. Therefore, the Musqueam are rendered not only atemporal, but apolitical as well.

This is not to suggest that Native artists must deal with socio-political issues in their art. On the contrary, it is my intention to point to the fact that by leaving such references out of the exhibition, the airport excuses itself
from having to engage in a more actively political way with the issues that face contemporary Native people. As Gayatri Spivak has suggested, the fact of inclusion of marginalised peoples acts to salve the conscience of the dominant society so it can relax into thinking that all is as it should be and nothing more needs be done.

In addition to the depoliticizing of the Musqueam, the location of their work within the airport also speaks to the way in which the overall benefits of the negotiated space are damaged. The physical prominence allowed to Bill Reid's work by its placement in a very central high traffic area of the airport, juxtaposed to the more limited access allowed to the Musqueam work is problematic. What is the point of undertaking an important project such as the negotiation of a third space if only a privileged set of people are allowed to see it? And those who are allowed to see it are indeed privileged as they must first be able to afford the cost of an international flight. Here again the relationship of the Musqueam to the airport is undermined and the one step forward is followed closely by the proverbial two steps back.

It is not only the Musqueam as a people who are affected by these problems of representation within the airport, but their work is affected as well. Created specifically for the purpose of exhibition, the works fit into the category of art. However, their function within the airport is much more complicated than that. The work provides a certain element of
decoration in what might otherwise be a very cold and impersonal space. However, its specific designation as 'Indian Art' expands, or perhaps reduces, its role from decoration to curio.

What the airport wanted the art it purchased to do was to assist in the creation of a sense of place specific to Vancouver. The Musqueam agreed to participate on the basis of their desire to be formally recognized as a vital part of the local community and with the understanding that they would have a say in how the work was treated within the airport. However, any contextualizing information about who the Musqueam are and why their work is in the airport, any impact that it might have made on the viewer, is significantly reduced and the work becomes fetishized as a source of local colour rather than a reference to a vibrant and on-going culture.

The difference that context makes became apparent to me on a recent visit to the Museum of Anthropology at U.B.C. where two exhibitions dealing with the historic lifeways of the Salish Musqueam people were being held. Both exhibitions, "Written in the Earth: Images of Ancient Art" and "Under the Delta: Wet Site Archaeology in the Lower Fraser Region of British Columbia" dealt with some of the material products of the Salish forebears. The Musqueam people themselves were involved with both exhibitions here as well. Though the explanatory texts associated with the exhibitions were not
voluminous, they did do an excellent job of explaining the history of the region and of highlighting the ongoing existence of contemporary Salish people.

This is, on a certain level, to be expected. Both of those exhibitions took place within a museum, one of the primary functions of which is education. Once again, it is to be remembered that the airport is not a museum. However, the point remains that because the airport adopted the responsibility of participating in contemporary visual culture and the process of cultural negotiation by choosing to exhibit works by Musqueam people (the 'other') with the involvement of the Musqueam, it should also have adopted its share of the responsibility for education which goes along with that. Instead of using the exhibition of Musqueam work as an opportunity to be proactive in informing the public at large about Musqueam and its people, the airport shirked that mantle and opted instead for a format which ultimately cheapens an otherwise positive moment.

The inclusion of the art within the new terminal building does mark some sort of advancement for cultural relations within Canada, and, theoretically speaking, the idea is a commendable one. A foundation has been laid, but the process of cultural negotiation is one which is constantly in flux and therefore vigilance is required in order to ensure its growth. The 'third space' created within the airport is not a static one, temporally and theoretically isolated. It is involved,
like all hybrid spaces, in a constant critique; its focus and meaning are permeable and shifting in chameleon like fashion. What I have been calling a hybrid moment is perhaps better defined as the beginning of a new eternity with all of the uncertainty such a proposition provides.

In the last chapter I suggested that the necessary manipulations of touristic interests employed by the airport, such as the tokenizing of objects/people and the fetishization inherent in that process, were working against what was otherwise a successfully negotiated third space. Ultimately, this matter seems to be one of relativity. As the Barry Lopez quote in the introductory chapter suggests, a traveller's (or tourist's) impression of a region is informed not only by what they see upon contact, but also by their general disposition and imagination. Though the airport's attempt to construct a particular atmosphere, reinforced by carefully selected objects, makes for an implied meta-narrative which presents an ideal image of Vancouver, the response of individuals within the site remains variable. No more static as a site than the culture within which it exists, the continued evolution of the airport as both a container of necessary services and a tourist attraction will continue to shift and change.
FIGURE 2
FIGURE 10
FIGURE 11

THE SPIRIT OF HAIDA GWAI I

Now we turn at last, a long way from
those days, nothing here when we are on
shore, in the land. Still, coming from
the land, sometimes the water conveys
us to be reading in some direction, at
least the problem and together, and the way in
the world once to have some vision of what is
1000.

As for the rest, they are specifically
more or less what they clammers were, a family of
wooden pipes, three, four, five, or even
thousand of them, here that were the
furniture of an entire lifetime.
The rest. He as he in the land of the
boat, who were actually any connection, there, an
interesting sensation, like family, and forever
paddled on the boat, they in displacing something
belonging to them, a wooden pipe, wooden pipe,
children than with her leg. After
all, that happened in fact.

Now, according to
completely
content, and
perfectly

perfection for letting down trees and
harvesting rivers.

And there may be, until the passing winds
of noble white clothing no place to the pretty
boat maiden, in both of her hair and head up
the nose, she sits on her chair like
mendacious sound, who character describes the
miserable sound. It was all there, the
contention of men in white. All these,
without, were marvellous than the people
would be as the deep waters
which support the planks, unless that
move and continue her power, she starts away
from the boat. The comparison of the
planks support a name's

Taking deals in the story of the boat, still
billed by the same consensus, to stay immediately
and in the story, desire and wish, jump cove, and
海峡. More, that move and continue her power,
the other character of her own
within, an important part of the boat mother's
story and simply succeeded in the opposite
day of the boat, becomes the tale of the
planks. In the planks, she may or may not look like this.
REFERENCES


Bramham, Daphne. April 25th, 1996. "Vancouver's role as a gateway to Pacific is key to expansion," Vancouver: Vancouver Sun.


Newman, Peter. January 8th, 1994. "Letters; Sculpture will Shape our Future". Vancouver: Vancouver Sun


