COMMODITIZATION OF INDIGENOUS CULTURES THROUGH TOURISM

by

RITVA KARAJAOJA

B.A., The University of British Columbia, 1991

A THESIS SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF MASTER OF ARTS in THE FACULTY OF GRADUATE STUDIES DEPARTMENT OF ANTHROPOLOGY AND SOCIOLOGY

We accept this thesis as conforming to the required standard

THE UNIVERSITY OF BRITISH COLUMBIA

April 1995

©Ritva Karajaoja, 1995
In presenting this thesis in partial fulfilment of the requirements for an advanced degree at the University of British Columbia, I agree that the Library shall make it freely available for reference and study. I further agree that permission for extensive copying of this thesis for scholarly purposes may be granted by the head of my department or by his or her representatives. It is understood that copying or publication of this thesis for financial gain shall not be allowed without my written permission.

Department of **Anthropology**

The University of British Columbia
Vancouver, Canada

Date **21 April, 1995**
Abstract

This essay looks at cultural commoditization by indigenous people in Third World countries in response to tourism. The common assumption is that commoditization invalidates a culture and that it somehow becomes inauthentic. I show that even though the Indians of the Peruvian highlands sell their 'Indianess' for tourists to photograph, the real commoditization takes place by mestizos who appropriate Indian culture: their dress, rituals, handicrafts. The Indians and mestizos are both trying to maximize their share of tourism revenue, little of which actually gets to the highlands. Neither culture, however, becomes inauthentic in the process. While the meanings of cultural products may be altered over time, no culture is static and fixed in time: new meanings are relevant within the context of contemporary society.

Key words: cultural commoditization, authenticity, ethnic tourism, Peru.
# Table of Contents

Abstract ........................................ ii
Table of Contents ................................ iii
List of Figures ................................... iv
Acknowledgements ................................. v

## SECTION I

Introduction .................................... 1
Definitions ...................................... 2
History of Travel, Evolution of Tourism .... 6
The Growth of Mass Tourism ..................... 7
Tourism as an Anthropological Subject ..... 9
Some Theories on Travel Motivation ......... 12

## SECTION II

The Discourse of Advertising ................. 16
International Travel Brochures ............... 17
Amish Travel Brochures ....................... 18
Third World Travel Brochures ................. 20
Ramifications of Advertising Discourse .... 22

## SECTION III

Peru as a Tourist Destination ................. 25
The Tourism Complex Around Cuzco and the Highlands ................. 30
Touristic Encounters and Commoditizations .... 33

## SECTION IV

Cultural Commoditization: A Case Study .... 46
Transformations and Conclusions ............... 49

Literature Cited ................................ 53
List of Figures

1. Photograph 1...Mestizo boy and condor.....................34
2. Photograph 2...Indian family begging at tourist site ...36
3. Photograph 3...Indian with llamas and hydrofoil..........38
4. Photograph 4...Uros Indian village on Lake Titicaca.....39
Most of all, I wish to thank my Mother, Lyydi Karajaoja, who throughout her illness encouraged me to continue when she needed me more.

I thank Dr. Robin Ridington for making my undergraduate introductory class in anthropology so stimulating and challenging that I knew I would not become a biologist. I thank Dr. Elvi Whittaker, my inspiration for pursuing tourism as a topic. I particularly want to thank my advisor, Dr. Ken Stoddart, for his wise counsel, kindness, and extraordinary patience.

My heart-felt thanks to that wonderful facilitator, that fountain of knowledge, Margaret Baskette.

Finally, I wish to thank my fiancé, Peter C. Newman, for setting a work ethic which I found nearly impossible to emulate and for his loving encouragement throughout.
SECTION I

Introduction

When tourism is the stimulus for some societies to commoditize aspects of their culture in order to get a share of tourism revenues, the common assumption is that the culture, or the products of that culture, have somehow become inauthentic. I am going to show that commoditization and inauthenticity do not necessarily go hand in hand. Another assumption is that tourism causes the native self to be changed while the tourist self remains unaffected. I will show that in certain types of tourism, specifically ethnic tourism, it is also possible for the tourist self to change.

I have divided this essay into four sections. First, I am going to define some of the terms I will be using, then I shall move onto the topic of tourism: how it evolved, why anthropology should be at the forefront of tourism studies, and then look at some theories regarding travel motivation. Next I will examine the discourse of tourism advertising and show how the advertising focus differs between countries which have been labelled developed and under-developed. I will show that developed countries are able to control the discourse of advertising while the under-developed countries with high indigenous populations lack this power. In the third section, I will discuss Peru as a tourist destination and the tourist complex around Cuzco. I will use photographs to show how some
indigenous people are trying to get a share of tourism revenue; I will also discuss other forms of commoditization which are necessary to bring in tourists and generate tourism spending for much needed revenue to the area. In the fourth and final section, I will discuss commoditization and present a time-depth case study as evidence that cultures adapt and create new meanings that are relevant within the context of their current society. Contrary to popular belief, I will also show that in ethnic tourism, it is possible for the tourist self to experience change.

Definitions
Definitions are mental constructs formulated according to the disciplinary parameters of a given field of study and, as yet, there is no shared consensus of meaning within the various disciplines in which tourism is a factor. I have looked at definitions of tourists (and tourism) put forth by anthropologists, sociologists, geographers, psychologists, economists, and others who study tourism, but as John Lea (1988:4) points out, even the word tourism "...is capable of diverse interpretation with one survey of eighty different studies finding forty-three definitions for the terms traveller, tourist, and visitor."

While all of the various definitions have been helpful in illuminating the diverse characteristics and aspects of
tourists and tourism, I have found the definitional typologies put forth by Erik Cohen (1972:167-8) and Valene Smith (1989:12) to be best suited for this anthropological enquiry. These are the two most often cited typologies within the literature, as well. Cohen identifies four types of tourists: organized tourists, individual mass tourists, explorer types of tourists, and drifters. The first two types are institutionalized tourists, whereas, the latter two make their own arrangements and travel on their own. Cohen describes his typology as being "...based on the extent of the tourist's exposure to the strangeness of the host environment as against his seclusion within the 'environmental bubble' of his home environment that is supplied by the tourist establishment" (1984:378).

Smith's typology is based on the numbers of tourists and their adaptation to local norms. Smith identifies seven tourist categories: explorer, elite, off-beat, unusual, incipient mass, mass, and charter. The first four types correspond to Cohen's noninstitutionalized explorer and drifter categories. These tourists are low in number and can adapt to the local norms of the receiving society. The remaining three, incipient mass, mass, and charter correspond with Cohen's institutionalized categories of individual mass and organized tourists. These tourists arrive in greater numbers and expect western amenities. The two typologies are
The types of tourism which the various types of tourists engage in is divided into five self-explanatory categories by Smith (1989:4-6): ethnic tourism, cultural tourism, historical tourism, environmental tourism, and recreational tourism. Pierre L. van den Berghe explains that in ethnic tourism the natives are the primary, or at least significant, attraction "...an integral part of the exotic spectacle" (1980:377). The purest form of ethnic tourism, according to van den Berghe, is ethnographic tourism in which the primary purpose is "...to observe the behaviour and artifacts of exotic peoples" (Ibid.:378). Van den Berghe asserts that cultural tourism is a sub-form of ethnic tourism: tourists are more interested in native ruins and handicrafts than in the natives themselves (Ibid.). The boundaries of these categories are over-lapping and a situational analysis of a touristic experience will often indicate that the tourist has engaged in several types of tourism simultaneously.

The question of what is tourism continues to be a lively point of debate within anthropological and sociological circles. Among the many definitions of tourism, Dennison Nash (1978:149) succinctly (and logically) states that tourism is the "...culture of leisured travelers". I find this to be an
acceptable definition for the purposes of this paper. Needless to say, there is an ongoing debate about who is a tourist within the literature as well. My favourite observation is by David Wilson in the Comments to Dennison Nash's 1981 article 'Tourism as an Anthropological Subject'. Wilson states that definitions are needed only if there is likely to be confusion about meaning. "...it is the tourist himself who should surely be the arbitrator of such disputes. He knows if he is or isn't a tourist..." (1981:477).

The words tourist and tourism suggest 'touring'. Not all people who go on a vacation 'tour'. Many go to languish on a sunny beach and never venture beyond the confines of hotel and beach even if it is situated in some foreign exotic country. For this reason, I think, van den Berghe has drawn an interesting distinction between vacationers and tourists, stating that "...the best subjective criterion of whether one is vacationing or being a tourist is whether one finds the natives quaint enough to take their picture" --the more touristic the trip, the greater the number of photographs of local people (1980:376).

Since the main theme of this paper is commoditization of indigenous cultures in Third World countries, the kind of tourism I will be examining is ethnic tourism (as per Smith and van den Berghe) and the type of tourism is individual mass
tourism or incipient mass tourism (as per Cohen and Smith). The title —commoditization of indigenous cultures in Third World countries— presupposes that a sufficient number of tourists are arriving and that indigenous people are adapting their culture in order to enhance their ability to cash in on tourist revenue.

Commoditization is essentially 'commercialization', however, for a more detailed explanation, I will use Eric Cohen's definition:

'Commoditization' is a process by which things (and activities) come to be evaluated primarily in terms of their exchange value, in a context of trade, thereby becoming goods (and services) (1988:381).

Some of the alternate terms I will be using for Third World countries are under-developed, less developed, and LDC (less developed country) due to the variation in terminology used by my sources. Also, I will use indigenous, native, Indian, host, local, and 'Other', according to the context in which the concept is used, and again, according to how my sources are using the term.

History of Travel, Evolution of Tourism
Throughout history people have travelled. Wealthy Romans, Athenians, and Alexandrians had resorts to which they could travel to escape the stifling summer heat of their cities (Wolfe 1967). Later, the Roman Empire, which stretched from
Hadrian's Wall to the Euphrates, made it possible for adventurous Romans to travel from one end to the other, and as Philip L. Pearce points out, "...needing only one currency and two languages for the whole trip" (1982:54). In the Middle Ages, the pilgrimage became an important motive for travel, and over time, ancillary services evolved which can be compared to our current hospitality industry. In the seventeenth century, the 'Grand Tour' evolved as a sort of finishing school for the sons of English aristocracy, however, after the Napoleonic Wars and the advent of railways, other, newly affluent people were able to start going abroad as well.

In the nineteenth century, with this new mobility and new affluence, people began to go abroad to spas and resorts in England and in Europe. Pearce states that "...travel and tourism became associated with health and, in turn, with rest and relaxation" (Ibid.). This concept remains with us still in the form of annual paid vacations from which employees supposedly return renewed and refreshed, ready yet again to put in another year of work.

The advent of mass tourism can be linked to an English entrepreneur named Thomas Cook who both organized and supervised tourist groups going abroad in the nineteenth century. Cook made travel accessible to large numbers of people and his legacy continues in the travel agencies which
The Growth of Mass Tourism

After the First World War, mobility was further enhanced by ocean liners and automobiles but it was not until after the Second World War that international tourism began to occur en masse. Economic prosperity for those in the developed world followed on the heels of the Second World War; moreover, the war had been the incentive for tremendous advancements in the area of air travel. It had now become possible for a massive number of people to go much further, much more quickly, than ever before.

The growth of the travel industry has been nothing short of phenomenal. "In 1990, according to the World Tourism Organization of the United Nations, 429 million people...travelled from one country to another as tourists" (cited in Barnet and Cavanagh 1994:29). This makes the mass tourist industry the world's largest employer. "The global stock of lodging, restaurant, and transportation facilities is estimated to be worth about $3 trillion, and one out of every fifteen workers across the planet spends the day transporting, feeding, housing, herding, cosseting, or amusing tourists" (Ibid.). After food and housing, travelling is the third largest household expense in the developed world and according to Barnet and Cavanagh, $232 billion were spent on tourism in
Tourism As An Anthropological Subject

It has taken a great number of years for the academic community to view tourism as a valid subject of anthropological enquiry. John J. Bodine (1981:469) states that the first organized symposium was held in Milwaukee in 1964 by the Central States Anthropological Society. The first published anthropological paper on tourism is accredited to Theron Nuñez (1963).

Why, if people have been travelling abroad and at home for many years, has there been a lack of research interest in the field of tourism? Pearce claims that it has to do with the Protestant work ethic which emphasizes the spiritual value of hard work: play and leisure are therefore not valued as activities worthy of study. Another plausible reason for the dearth of research could be due to the lack of recognized academic positions in the field (Pearce 1982:1-2); perhaps Claude Lévi-Strauss has contributed to this lacuna by starting off his famous book *Triste Tropique* with "Travel and travelers are two things I loathe - and yet here I am, all set to tell the story of my expeditions" (1968:17). Moreover, Lévi-Strauss claims the only reason he had not written the book sooner was because he had been "...held back by a sort of shame and disgust" (Ibid.). These words, from one of the foremost
anthropologists of our time, do not encourage the study of tourism within the discipline.

All of the above reasons are certainly valid, as is the following observation by Toby Alice Volkman (1990:91) who states:

Anthropologists have not quite decided what to do with tourism when it appears on 'their' turf. It seems to be a blight upon the local culture as well as an intrusion upon (and a threat to) the anthropologist's own privileged domain. As a phenomenon it is easily disdained, mocked, even condemned; as a subject of inquiry it is easily trivialized.

Pearce echoes this claim stating that field researchers of all types, including anthropologists, have tried to ignore the presence of tourists and the impacts of tourism because they are an annoying reminder that most of the world, however remote, is now accessible to the modern world —"Like weeds in the garden plot, tourists spoil the character of the researcher's carefully cultivated community" (1982:1). Malcolm Crick asks if the reason for the lack of anthropological study might be due to the fact that traditionally anthropologists have studied 'them' and not 'us' (1989:311). This would seem to indicate that tourists are not exotic enough to merit serious anthropological enquiry. Even if that were the case, the many different impacts of tourism which affect the lives of the 'Other' certainly necessitates a great deal of research.
Despite the concerns voiced by the academics, the decade of the 1980s has seen serious attention paid to tourism studies by a wide range of disciplines (Pearce 1988:17-18). Anthropology, sociology, political science, social psychology, geography, business studies, environmental, recreational and leisure studies, plus others, are addressing this global phenomenon in their curricula. Jafari and Aasen (1988:410-13) have examined the data regarding the number of doctoral degrees granted in the United States and Canada\(^1\) based upon dissertations devoted to the study of tourism. Geography and economics produced a few dissertations as early as the 1950s. Anthropology, however, did not 'discover' tourism until 1973 but it is the discipline which has shown the greatest rate of growth with a total of 25 dissertations to 1986, the last year for which complete figures were available.\(^2\)

James Lett (1989:275) states that "Modern tourism accounts for the single largest peaceful movement of people across cultural boundaries in the history of the world." Clearly, this is reason enough for serious academic enquiry into every aspect

\(^1\)Only 3 doctoral degrees were granted in Canada. All were in Geography from the University of Western Ontario.

\(^2\)Between 1951 and 1987 (not all 1987 entries were available) there were a total of 157 dissertations. Economics is the leader with 40, Anthropology next with 25, Geography 24, Recreation 23, Business Administration 11, Education 9, Sociology 7, Urban-Regional Planning 7, Political Science 5, and the remaining 6 in Fine Arts, Social Work, Theology, History, Mass Communications, and Public Relations.
of tourism.

Some Theories on Travel Motivation
There are many reasons for travelling. There is no need (at least within the context of this paper) to discuss those who go abroad to health spas or those who take charter flights to the pleasure periphery\(^3\) to spend time on the beach, get tanned, or just have some 'fun'.

The type of tourism I wish to address is that to Third World countries with high indigenous populations, specifically Peru.\(^4\) Although the indigenous population is very high, they have very little power politically; generally, they are also very poor in comparison to the rest of the population. The tourists who travel to Peru and other countries such as these are primarily interested in the culture of the indigenous people themselves, in their artifacts, and in the extant ruins of earlier civilizations. It is to this type of tourism that the theories best lend themselves.

\(^3\)Lea (1988:1) states that the pleasure periphery is a "band of host countries stretching from Mexico and the Caribbean to the Mediterranean; from East Africa via the Indian Ocean and South-east Asia to the Pacific Islands; thence back to Southern California and Mexico."

\(^4\)While there are many other countries which fit the criterion, Peru is the country in which I have spent the most amount of time and am most familiar with.
There are numerous theories as to why people travel: a return to the womb, or a form of birth or rebirth (Dichter 1967); a form of pilgrimage, a sacred journey (Graburn 1989); a rite of passage from societas to communitas (Turner and Turner 1978); a need to regain a sense of purpose (van den Berghe and Keyes 1984); an attempt to escape the alienation of modern society (MacCannell 1989), and so on.

Dean MacCannell's seminal work, The Tourist: A New Theory of the Leisure Class (1976, 1989 2d.ed.) raises the concept of authenticity which, some twenty years after it was first published, is still debated and often cited within the anthropological and sociological literature. In this landmark work, MacCannell integrates and expounds upon the earlier work of Erving Goffman (1959) which is based on the notion of a front-back dichotomy (frontstage and backstage). Frontstage is that which is presented to tourists and therefore inauthentic, and backstage --that which the tourist cannot usually access-- the authentic.

According to MacCannell, "The intellectual critique of society assumes the inauthenticity of everyday life in the modern world" (1989:147); therefore, the touristic quest is for authenticity. Inauthenticity is the result of alienation which is the product of contemporary industrialized society. Tourism then, is a post-modern phenomenon: it is an escape in which
persons from this alienated society go in search of the "Absolute Other" (Ibid.:5), thereby descending upon the 'authentic' worlds of indigenous peoples whose lives have not yet been altered (too drastically) by the processes of modernization. MacCannell states, "For moderns, reality and authenticity are thought to be elsewhere: in other historical periods, and other cultures, in purer, simpler lifestyles" (Ibid.:3).

Clearly, the quest for authenticity is not a sustainable one because contact is that which destroys it. Most tourists who engage in ethnic tourism are relatively knowledgeable about the world and this precludes a belief in the existence of an Absolute Other; rather, the quest for authenticity becomes a quest for authentic experiences.5

Being an inveterate traveller, I have often thought about the reason why I travel —why I feel a need to travel— and why I have often chosen to go to developing countries. Sometimes when I have returned home I have sworn never to go again (as in the case of Peru) only to find myself planning to go yet again. In a graduate seminar on tourism in the spring of 1992,

5Much has been written about the nature of authenticity. I shall not attempt to expound on the literature here. For the purposes of this paper, authenticity is that which the tourist perceives as authentic, or falls within the realm of being acceptably authentic.
quite unexpectedly, my reasons became clear. On a 3" x 5" index card I wrote the following:

I am operating under the assumption that while tourists are experiencing other cultures etically, they are hoping to experience them emically. To be human includes the need for meaningful interaction with ones fellow human beings, and most particularly when these human beings may be culturally, racially, ethnically very different. There is a need in all of us to be reassured that indeed, we humans are all basically the same.

Dean MacCannell (1989:10) supports my hypothesis in part:

The touristic critique of tourism is based on a desire to go beyond the other 'mere' tourists to a more profound appreciation of society and culture, and it is by no means limited to intellectual statements. All tourists desire this deeper involvement with society and culture to some degree; it is a basic component of their motivation to travel.

In summary, many theories exist as to why people travel. Since we are all individuals, we have individual motives for travelling. I do believe, though, that those people who engage in ethnic tourism may have a similar quest: a quest to access experiences which fulfil their concept of authenticity. From experience, I can attest to the fact that when this quest is occasionally realized, the touristic experience truly becomes extraordinary.

In the following section, I will show how the language and images of tourism advertising promise, but seldom fulfil, the touristic quest for authenticity.
SECTION II
The Discourse of Advertising

Travel destinations can be classified as commodities because they are being marketed like other manufactured goods and services. In order to sell these destinations, the travel industry creates certain images through which they hope to attract the maximum number of buyers. The buyers, in this case, are tourists who purchase package tours -- complete with the imagery -- marketed by the advertisers. The advertisers may be countries, provinces or states, cities, airline companies, hotels and resorts, travel agencies, attractions, and others who stand to profit from the lucrative mass tourism market. In this section, I will review three papers on tourism advertising: (1) Robert S. Dilley, a geographer, compares international travel brochures in general (2) Roy C. Buck, a sociologist, analyzes the advertising brochures of the Amish in North America (3) Robert A. Britton, a geographer with a special interest in international tourism and indigenous people, looks specifically at the image of the Third World in tourism marketing. Each author writes from the perspective of his own discipline, yet each paper has an anthropological content central to my hypothesis for this section: the advertising focus of tourist brochures differs between countries which have been labelled as developed and underdeveloped.
International Travel Brochures

"There seems little doubt that for many people tourist brochures --obtained from travel agencies or from official government tourist bureaux [sic]-- play a major role in forming their images..." (Dilley 1986:60). Dilley has examined the international tourist brochures of twenty-one countries in an attempt to gain an understanding of the images certain countries are trying to project to prospective North American tourists. Dilley has classified the photographic images and grouped them into the following categories: attraction services, coastal landscapes, entertainment, flora and fauna, history and art, local people, mountain landscapes, rural landscapes, recreational participation, reassurance services, and urban landscapes.

Dilley was not specifically searching for differences between the advertising images of developed (Old World) and underdeveloped (Third World) countries, however, certain differences clearly emerged. His findings indicate that the ten Old World countries he looked at, eight presented history and art as the principal image and the remaining two had history and art as a secondary image after mountain landscapes; clearly, these countries are primarily using cultural themes to attract tourism. On the other hand, the islands and countries of Antigua, Bahamas, Barbados, Bermuda, Cayman Islands, Trinidad and Tobago all emphasize the four s's
--sun, sea, sand, and sex. Their primary themes fall within the categories of recreational participation and coastal landscapes, replete with the prerequisite sexual intimations through the usual beach scene clichés. The point of this comparison is that the imagery promoted by the Caribbean islands (and Bermuda) is devoid of any cultural theme. It is as if these islands have no art, no history, no culture --they exist solely as pleasure playgrounds for North American tourists. Conversely, none of the ten Old-World countries emphasizes the four s's; it is, however, a known fact that the four s's are a primary attraction of both Spain and Portugal and the remaining eight countries certainly offer an abundance of various recreational opportunities, yet they choose instead to emphasize the cultural aspects of their societies.

**Amish Travel Brochures**

Roy C. Buck (1977) has looked at the tourist brochures of 'Amish Country' in Lancaster County, Pennsylvania. The Amish constitute a distinct community within the developed world: their history, religion, economic choices, and other factors have lead to their continued separation from mainstream society.\(^6\) I must point out, though, that it is the Amish who have chosen to keep their society separate from that of the developed world and it has been this penchant for separation

\(^6\)David Harrison calls the Pennsylvania Amish "islands of 'tradition' in an ocean of modernity" (1992:21).
that has led them to be the objects of touristic curiosity.

Amish tourist brochures are put out by individual attractions and can be found everywhere including in the large urban centres of New York, Philadelphia, Washington, and Baltimore which are relatively close by. Buck states that these brochures are instrumental in attracting some three million tourists a year which are accommodated by a well developed system of attractions and facilities promoting different aspects of Amish culture --history, religion, farm life. However, it is only possible to see and experience the culture through staged attractions (museums and farms set up for show), guided tours to the countryside, and for those who want to do it on their own, maps leading to these very same locations.

What is remarkable is how the Amish have adapted and come to terms with the influx of mass tourism --they have manipulated the touristic experience away from their daily lives and contained it within a network of staged activities. Buck states "Brochures are essentially fraudulent in their tautological messages of guaranteeing that what is advertised is what will be seen and experienced. The tautological event is a closed circle. Tourists are caught up in a world not of their making and their only choice is among the alternative staged tautologies" (Ibid.:206). It is, in fact, possible to
visit Amish Country for two or three days and not see any 'real' Amish at all. Buck notes that not all Amish are pleased by the commoditization of their culture and the inherent inauthenticity of the 'authentic' staged attractions; however, for the Amish community as a whole, the solution appears to be working well.

**Third World Travel Brochures**

Robert A. Britton (1979) has specifically looked at the imagery generated by the tourism industry in promoting travel to Third World countries. The advertising is intended to perform the same sort of function on an international scale as the brochures for the Amish Country at the regional level, yet the playing fields are not level. First of all, Amish Country is situated within the developed world; second, and most importantly, the Amish have had the power to implement strategies which have enabled them to control mass tourism and mitigate its effects on their society.

Britton contends that the imagery put forth by the tourism industry is distorted and therefore impacts adversely on the quality of the touristic experience. Britton states that the primary reason behind the untruthfulness in advertising is that it is an attempt to overcompensate for the visible poverty of the host country: tourists are coming for a vacation and do not want to be bothered by local problems.
Secondly, governments are well aware of the fact that tropical locations are to a large extent interchangeable and truthfulness in advertising just might send the tourists to a competing location. This would be catastrophic for those countries whose economies are precariously dependent upon tourism revenues.

Britton identifies numerous themes which run through the advertised images. "One nearly ubiquitous theme is that poor countries are not real places. Mystification masks reality. The exotic is amplified, usually in the direction of Eden" (1979:321). The language used to describe these places include words such as fantasy, paradise, unspoiled, sensuous, and untouched. The photographic images accompanying the text reinforce this sense of unreality by omitting scenes which are urban and industrial in nature. Another theme is the minimization of foreignness if the place is perceived as too exotic; for instance, advertisements mention that "almost everyone speaks English" (Ibid.:322), or that the staff of a certain hotel is European trained, and so on. The attempt to minimize foreignness precludes references to the local milieu and encourages emphasis on touristic places and activities (casinos, golf courses, night clubs). Britton notes that when it is necessary to depict local people in the illustrations, "they likely appear as stereotyped stage props" (Ibid.:323), rather than as real people with real lives.
The romanticization of the local population within the context of its poverty—denoted by such descriptions as cheerfully stoic, naturally graceful—is yet another pervading theme within the advertising, as is that of sex and the suggestion of possible sexual liaisons with local people (Ibid.). The sexual implications are evident in the suggestive language (double entendres) and the provocative photographic images, usually those of a stereotypical, generically dark-skinned, bare-breasted, glistening male or female, lying seductively on some sandy beach.

**Ramifications of Advertising Discourse**

Can promotional images be dismissed as simply 'advertising' and not to be taken seriously or are there more profound effects? Britton contends that the contrast between the promotional images and reality in the Third World affects the experiences of the tourists and the host societies negatively. For the tourist, "the experience is reduced to validation of clichés and stereotypes" (Ibid.). Kathleen Adams (1984:472) concurs, stating that the travel literature given to tourists provides a mental grid through which they filter their perceptions. The travel experience is therefore deemed to be authentic if it matches the images conveyed by the literature.

Thus, for the ethnic tourist the image becomes reality: the travel agent's stereotype is reified. These stereotypes are not created out of thin air; they are based on genuine ethnic markers that have become distorted and simplified in the translation process (Ibid.).
Tourists generally lack the time and knowledge to evaluate the validity of their pre-packaged stereotypes (Ibid.). The controlled nature of most tours is not conducive to exploration and discovery of anything other than what has been prearranged therefore, for the tourist, the brochure represents reality and authenticity.

For the host society, Britton (1979:323) states that conformity to or identification with the stereotypes promoted by the travel industry is detrimental to the formation of self-esteem by those who have experienced a colonial past. As Dilley has pointed out, it is the developed countries which promote images pertaining to history and culture: the images of Third World or under-developed countries often promote the commodities of sun, sea, sand, and sex. This creates the notion that some Third World countries have no real history or culture of their own and this can be devastating to the spirit of a people, society, nation, country.

The Amish and their tourist brochures are an anomaly. The experiences promised and delivered are pure validations of clichés and stereotypes. The Amish have decided how much and what aspects of their culture they are willing to divulge; the tourists believe they are seeing a true representation of Amish life. Edward Bruner states that "Tourists are willing to accept a reproduction, as long as it is a good one, or as one
tourist brochure put it, as long as it is an 'authentic reproduction'" (1991:240-41). This is an example of successful cultural commoditization and it can only exist when the power is in the hands of those whose lives are to be affected.
SECTION III

Peru as a Tourist Destination

Although Britton's analysis of tourism advertising is based on Third World countries situated in the pleasure periphery, many of his findings apply also to Peru, a Third World country situated on the central-western coast of South America. There is, however, a major difference. The four s's --sun, sea, sand, sex-- are not the primary advertising focus. I have an official brochure put out by Fondo De Promocion Turistica of Peru and of the eighteen photographic images it contains, only four are of women in sexually suggestive poses or attire. The majority are of archaeological sites, artifacts, colonial architecture, and topographical diversity. Unquestionably, Peru is exotic and mysterious and these aspects are amplified without any reality checks: there are no images of poverty or of urban slums, scenes of industrial development, or of working or middle-class neighbourhoods. Only one photograph depicts indigenous Indians and they are not identified: they really do appear to be like the 'stereotyped stage props' described by Britton (1979:323). In fact, there is no reference within the written text to the campesinos at all.

7Peru has a north to south orientation. Stated simplistically, the entire coastline is arid, the Andes Mountains run down the central part, and on the eastern side is the Amazon basin.

8I was advised in Peru that campesino is now the politically correct term when referring to the indigenous Indians. The earlier term indigenes is still acceptable. I shall continue to use the term Indian in this paper.
In view of Britton's findings, the Indians might be considered too poor, too exotic, or too foreign to be included in an official tourist brochure aimed at a Western audience.

Victor Alba (1977:132) states that anthropological research has shown that the make-up of the Peruvian population is 47-51 percent Indian, 40 percent mestizo\(^9\), "...and the remainder are 'pure' white, 'pure' Negroes, or 'pure' Orientals." The 1992 population figure given in the *Country Studies Area Handbook* (Hudson 1993) is 22.7 million inhabitants. Based on these figures, the Indians are a huge silent majority: silent because they have no political power and silent in the sense that many are monolingual speakers of Quechua and Aymara\(^10\) whereas the power is in the hands of the Spanish speaking people.

Peru has been a tourist destination for a very long time because of its archaeological riches. The sites are scattered throughout Peru but are mostly concentrated on the arid coastal plain which stretches the entire length of the country, and in the highlands of the Andes. These highlands

\(^9\)Mestizos are of mixed Spanish-Indian descent. They have adopted the culture of the Whites and constitute the middle class of Peruvian society.

\(^10\)Besides Quechua and Aymara, there are many different local languages spoken in the Amazonian region. Various estimates place the number between 30 and 40, and the number of speakers between 50,000 and 250,000.
stretch south all the way to Lake Titicaca and Bolivia. Recently, tourism has also begun to play a role in the development of the vast Amazonian region which is located to the east of the Andes Mountain Range. This huge mountain range effectively divides the country into very distinct topographical regions and makes land travel excessively difficult for those accustomed to a modicum of comfort. Air services, however, are well developed and under most circumstances are the preferable way to travel.

The infrastructure is not in place to handle mass tourism on a significant scale. It can, however, accommodate Cohen's individual mass tourist category and Smith's category of incipient mass tourism even in the high tourist season between June and September, although, from experience, it can feel excessively crowded in the main tourist sites of Cuzco and Machu Picchu. The majority of tourists arriving from outside South America make some kinds of arrangements through various travel agencies prior to their arrival. Travel agencies are true facilitators because they have access to such things as train and bus tickets which normally might take a day or more of waiting in line to obtain.  

In the late 1980s, I had been on a whirlwind tour of South

11An unofficial source informed me that bribery is used to make things run smoothly.
America and at that time had decided Peru would be the country I would most like to tour in the future. The opportunity presented itself in 1990 --I had 6 weeks off between semesters in my final year as an anthropology major at the University of British Columbia. My contact in Vancouver was a travel agent who was also the daughter of the owner of one of the largest travel agencies in Peru. With her help, we put together an extensive itinerary of many of the accessible major archaeological sites in the country, including two in Bolivia. I did not take a guided tour per se, but because I was travelling alone and going to some less-visited locations, I booked tours to see specific sites. Sometimes I was alone with a tour guide and at other times there would be other tourists who had booked through the same agency. This sort of arrangement gave me lots of free time to explore and do things on my own.

When I departed for Peru, I knew very little about campesinos or mestizos, land reforms, or the Sendero Luminoso.\textsuperscript{12} I was armed only with a photocopy of pages 2-33 of National Geographic, Vol.177, No.6, June 1990, titled \textit{The Moche of

\textsuperscript{12}Maoist guerillas called "Shining Path". They were very active in Peru when I was there. President Fujimori was able to effect the capture of their leader Abimael Guzmán in 1993 and according to the news reports, their activities have since subsided.
Ancient Peru: New Tomb of Royal Splendor and Masterworks Reveal a Pre-Inca World. I also had along a very old copy of some guidebook to South America which I have since misplaced. Like most tourists, I was totally unprepared for the culture shock. I was visually assaulted by poverty such as I had never seen before; I observed extreme wealth and its concomitant excesses; I saw how long and hard some people had to work, often at ridiculously menial jobs, just to make ends meet.

This dichotomy of extreme wealth and extreme poverty parallels the class structure of Peruvian society: the white upper class is wealthy, the mestizos are the working middle class, and the Indians, who are mostly concentrated in the highlands, are poor. On many occasions, because of my apparent affluence, I was embarrassed to be a tourist. My travel agent, who had been born and raised in Peru in a white upper class family with many servants including a cook, gardener, and chauffeur, could not have anticipated my reactions because, as she made it clear later, that is the natural order of things in Peru --people there expect it to be that way.

Having said all these things, I must add that it was

13 This is the famous Lord of Sipán tomb, the richest unlooted tomb in the New World. I had the pleasure of meeting Dr. Walter Alva, the archaeologist who is directing the dig.

14 Conversely, when dining with the elegant owner of the travel agency, I was embarrassed because I didn't appear affluent enough!
intellectually the most challenging and rewarding of any trip I have ever taken. But, it was also necessary for me to have the 'environmental bubble' provided by the tourist establishment (Cohen 1984:378) as a place into which I could retreat and recoup. I really was the epitome of an incipient mass tourist as I didn't always adapt very well to local norms (Smith 1989:12). I vividly recall becoming quite upset at times when there was no water, let alone hot water, to wash my hair every few days!

The Tourism Complex Around Cuzco and the Highlands

The Department of Cuzco and its capital, the City of Cuzco (or just 'Cuzco'), are located in the highlands of the southern Andes. Cuzco is also the historical capital city of the Inca empire, both of which were conquered by the Spaniards in the 1500s. Spanish colonial architecture is superimposed on Incan architecture and the combination of the two is a fascinating blending. This makes the City of Cuzco, as well as the many other archaeological sites in the surrounding areas - particularly Machu Picchu- the most visited tourist sites in the country. In fact, Pierre L. van den Berghe states that this area is one of the main attractions on all South American

---

15The Area Handbook (Hudson 1993) gives the population figure of 1,041,800 for the Dept. of Cuzco. The breakdown is 465,000 urban, 576,400 rural. The City of Cuzco had a population of 275,000 in 1990.
grand tours (1980:382).\textsuperscript{16}

Van den Berghe has done extensive research on Peru, especially in the Cuzco region (1974, 1977, 1980). He states that the area is inhabited by urban mestizos and rural Indians. The mestizos constitute more than just the working class and the petty bourgeoisie of the area: they are also the political and economic ruling class (1980:382). Victor Alba states that the mestizos of the highlands are in a privileged position in that they, unlike the mestizos on the coast, are not subject to anyone except white administrators and hacienda owners (1977:134). They have a monopoly on the intermediary positions in the tourist trade because they speak Quechua as well as Spanish.\textsuperscript{17} The better educated mestizos also speak English—some even speak a smattering of French, German, and Japanese—and this gives them the ability to move between the worlds of the Indian and the tourist and act as a facilitator to bring the two together (van den Berghe 1980:385).

The Indians outnumber the mestizos but they are at a disadvantage.

\textsuperscript{16}I have chosen Cuzco to illustrate my point due to the availability of academic literature. I observed similar types of commoditization in the Amazon and on the coast, but not to the same extent.

\textsuperscript{17}Many mestizos are still full-blooded Indian. The reason they are considered mestizo is that they have adopted the dress and life-style of the whites.
...they are handicapped not only by poverty and by the isolation of the communities many of them live in, but also by the fact that, when they do receive an education, they are taught in Spanish —a strange language— which lessens scholastic progress and discourages many (Alba 1977:134).

Land reforms have not really changed the lives of the Indians. They are still attached to the land either through a commune or through a hacienda as sharecroppers or tenants. Few own sufficient land to provide anything beyond subsistence farming. It is a dry, cold climate around Cuzco and the potato, which is indigenous to the region, is the main crop along with corn. In the more temperate and tropical valleys at the lower altitudes many varieties of fruits, vegetables, and grains are grown and then trucked to Cuzco and other urban centres. Unfortunately, the Indians in the highlands do not normally have the money to purchase these items. Large haciendas raise cattle and sheep but meat is also very expensive. In comparison to mestizos who have had access to a more varied diet, the Indians tend to be shorter and have other physical characteristics which indicate that malnutrition is pervasive throughout the population.¹⁸

According to van den Berghe, the entire tourist complex is

¹⁸Personal observations and communication with residents and fellow tourists, many of whom were academics from North America on their summer holidays. The Area Handbook (Hudson 1993) states that 12 million people suffer extreme poverty (1990-92 figures). Malnutrition and starvation are the leading causes of death.
controlled by the mestizos.\textsuperscript{19} This includes the hotels and restaurants and their employees, taxis, tour guides, shop owners and sales clerks, street peddlers, airport employees, the vendors in the market places, and so on. The entire mestizo population, directly or indirectly, benefits from tourism (1980:383).

\textbf{Touristic Encounters and Commoditizations}

Almost every tourist who comes to Cuzco is an ethnic tourist. They come to see the ruins and the architecture and they come to see the indigenous people, their culture, and their festivals. The Indians are interesting as a spectacle because many continue to wear colourful traditional clothing woven from the wool of indigenous animals such as llamas, vicunas, and alpacas. Some of the women also wear an interesting bowler type hat which begs to be photographed.

The mestizos are the culture brokers, or intermediaries, who facilitate encounters between tourists and Indians (van den Berghe 1980:385-88). Sometimes these encounters are on the official itinerary and it is not difficult to tell that the encounter is with other mestizo entrepreneurs rather than with

\textsuperscript{19}Van den Berghe is correct about mestizo control; however, in many cases, the actual ownership of the larger travel agencies and major hotels is in the hands of the white ruling class (personal communications with owners in Lima and mestizos in Cuzco).
actual Indians regardless of what the guide proclaims. See Photograph 1 (above) which is of a boy demonstrating the wing span of a young condor. The boy is dressed in a native poncho and hat but underneath he is wearing jeans and running shoes. At the entrance to this viewing area is a souvenir shop and the dozen or so people I was with on the tour stopped to do some shopping after watching the boy playing with this bird. Clearly, there was an arrangement between everyone concerned: the tourists would feel obligated to buy something because there was no fee for watching and photographing the boy and the condor; the tour guide and the bus driver would get a percentage of the sales made to the tourists; the owners of
this little tourist stop would make a few dollars; the boy would get more western-style status symbol clothing. In a way, this seemed to be a fair exchange for everyone including the tourists because this was probably their only opportunity to ever see a live condor. I recall being upset because I objected to this magnificent bird being used as a commodity. The Spanish speaking mestizo owners of the tourist spot were also wearing pieces of Indian apparel. They were, in fact, appropriating a part of Indian tradition and using it as a commodity to make themselves more 'authentic' in the eyes of the tourists ("...they manipulate ethnicity for individual gain in response to situational opportunities" [van den Berghe 1980:389]). This is a good selling tactic. It is better on the authenticity scale to buy souvenirs, even if they are the same, from distant locations and from people who look like Indians rather than from the big cities or the airports from people who dress in western-style clothes.

The poverty is such that begging by Indians near or at archaeological sites on tourist routes is commonplace. According to my guide of that day, for some, this affords a much better living than the subsistence farming that most Indians survive on. Photograph 2 (following page) is of an Indian woman and her three children with some of the family animals for 'cute' appeal. The people are shabbily dressed,
unwashed, and appear to be very poor. Interestingly, the animals appear to be very clean in comparison. I was not able to communicate with them and I cannot relate any of the life circumstances which have led this Indian mother to provide for her children in a manner which I felt to be degrading.

She was not really begging per se. She would place the animals and the children carrying them to the forefront and when the tourists photographed them, she would put her hand out hoping to get paid. Although I overheard some mestizo guides telling the tourists to ignore this little troupe, the animals were so adorable and the children so pathetic that a few people took
photographs anyway. There are several different levels of commoditization in this photograph: indigenous Indians in their traditional dress, native animals of the Andean region, sad looking, unwashed, and presumably hungry children. Also, for this Indian mother, we, the tourists, were economic commodities through which she hoped to feed her children. This was not an encounter facilitated by a travel agency or entrepreneurial mestizo middleman. The encounter, albeit sad, was 'authentic' because they were not mestizos pretending to be Indians.

Photograph 3 (following page) has an interesting juxtaposition of a modern hydrofoil and a traditionally garbed Indian with his llamas. This encounter was set up entirely by the tourist company which operates the hydrofoil across Lake Titicaca. Upon disembarking, the guide told us to take as many pictures as we wished and not to offer the fellow any money because the agency pays him. As soon as the guide was out of sight, the Indian put out his hand for payment. The other tourists walked away in disgust: I gave the fellow a dollar and took numerous photographs. Not only was the juxtaposition of the modern and the traditional interesting, it was also the only instance when I had the opportunity to closely examine clothing which had been knitted from homespun wool in traditional patterns. To me, this is an authentic touristic photograph taken in a colourful touristic setting which was not represented to be
anything other than what it was. I did not mind slipping the fellow some money: he was simply attempting to supplement his income by cashing in on his native attire and the llamas.

The three previous touristic encounters have dealt with individuals or small groups, but entire villages have been commoditized in order to get a share of the tourist revenue. **Uros Indians**\(^\text{20}\) live in small villages on the shores of Lake Titicaca; actually, they live on islands which they make

\(\text{20}\)Uros Indians are monolingual speakers of Aymara. They subsist on fish which they catch from the lake.
themselves out of totora reeds that grow on the shores of the lake. Photograph 4 (above) is of such a village. The local travel agencies take tourist groups to several of these island communities and in return give the Indians some sort of renumeration. The novelty for the tourists is to walk around on a reed surface entirely supported by water. The homes are also made out of these reeds, as are the souvenirs which a few of the Indians try to sell to the tourists. By outward appearances, village life appears to go on relatively unaffected.

Poverty is relative and I don't know whether the Uros Indians
consider themselves poor; to me, however, the poverty of these Indians was quite evident. Lake Titicaca is the highest navigable lake in the world and at that altitude it is cold. The children had nothing on their feet or legs (which could have been a cultural choice) while I, on the other hand, felt the coldness of the damp reeds right through my thick soled shoes. A local guide on the trip who spoke English told me that rheumatism and arthritis are a fact of life for these Indians and their life expectancy is much lower than that of other land based Indians.

There was a certain dignity about these Indians and I felt very much the visitor or guest in their village. All I can surmise is that the leaders of these Indians have chosen to allow some of their islands to be used as tourist sites rather than the travel agencies forcing tourism upon them. The entire setting --the lake, the reed islands, the villages, the colourful Indians, the rarified air, the incredible purity of the light-- was extremely exotic and therefore saleable. Whether the travel agencies were using the Uros Indians and their villages as commodities or, whether in fact the Uros Indians were using the travel agencies as commodities to facilitate the movement of tourists to their islands really is inconsequential.

In the four examples I have cited, the ethnic exoticism of the
indigenous Indians has been the basic saleable commodity. Van den Berghe concurs, stating that "... by and large, Indians are much more attractions than they are beneficiaries of tourism" (1980:383).

There are also other ways in which some of the rural Indians are able to get at least a small part of tourist revenues. Among other native handicrafts, tourism has particularly increased the demand for alpaca pelt rugs, alpaca wool, sweaters, and other fine textiles which this wool is woven into. Mestizo middlemen purchase these goods cheaply from the Indians and resell them in their shops or to other retailers in the towns. Unfortunately, the Indians are not able to cut out the intermediaries because most do not speak Spanish, let alone English;21 furthermore, they do not have the specialized knowledge that the mestizos have about business practices such as obtaining licences, filling out forms, or knowing who to bribe (Ibid.:385). Since the arrival of the Spanish, the Indians have been exploited; now, they are being exploited by the mestizos who are treating them and their products as commodities, but at least, some of the tourism money is trickling down into Indian hands. Van den Berghe notes that some Indian communities have started the practice

21English is the common language for communication between tourists from different countries and Peruvians working in the travel industry.
of producing inferior textiles for the tourists \(^{22}\) (Ibid.:383), a clear indication that tourists are viewed as economic commodities by both Indians and mestizos.

Many of the small towns around Cuzco and elsewhere in the highlands have Indian markets where the Indians come to buy and sell their products. These markets are popular with the tourists because, in comparison to buying in Cuzco, they rate higher on the authenticity scale. Tourists, however, must rely on mestizo knowledge in order to get to these markets as they are held on different days, at different times in different towns, and so on. Once there, however, it is difficult to know whether one is buying from an Indian or from an enterprising mestizo who has trucked in his goods all the way from Cuzco, with the price of the gasoline being added to the cost (Ibid.:387). Theron Nuñez makes the observation that when communities are economically dependent on tourism, "...(they) must maximize the exploitation of the tourist clientele (sic) to the fullest" (1989:266).

An interesting phenomenon is the transformation of traditional festivals into lavish tourist displays. The *Inti Raymi* (or

\(^{22}\)I purchased three sweaters from three different locations. Upon further examination, I found one of the sweaters to be of such inferior quality and workmanship that it was totally useless.
Inti Raimi) is the most famous festival in the highlands which is held yearly on June 24th. It is combined with the lavish processions of the Catholic Feast of Corpus Christi along with other festivities put on by the Chamber of Commerce of Cuzco. This week-long celebration is called the Semana del Cuzco, the climax of which is the actual ceremony of the Inti Raymi which is held in the Incan fortress of Sacsahuaman overlooking Cuzco (van den Berghe 1980:386-87). Van den Berghe calls this a revivalistic festival, "... a week long orgy of tourist oriented activities --some authentic, some staged..." (Ibid.:386). Authentic Indian groups in traditional regalia come from all over southern Peru to perform songs and dances for tourists and mestizos alike. For the Inti Raymi festival itself, however, mestizos dress up as Indians and local stylish secretaries become Incan vestal virgins. The military supplies 'Inca warriors' and a university student becomes the Inca king (Ibid.:386).

Other smaller towns have also started to sensationalize and embellish upon their traditional village festivals in order to cash in on the tourist trade. The further away the town is and the more difficult it is to get to, the higher the authenticity rating (Ibid.:387). In actuality, many of the

23Michael's Guide to Bolivia and Peru (1990) claims the Inti Raimi is the second largest festival in all of South America after Carnival in Rio de Janeiro. It is the traditional Inca summer solstice festival.
events are staged and modelled on western ideas of entertainment such as beauty contests in which mestizo girls dress up as Indians (Ibid.).

Clearly, tourism has had, and continues to have, an effect on the inhabitants of Cuzco and the highlands. The place is so incredibly rich in archaeological sites alone that it is inconceivable that tourism should cease;\(^{24}\) furthermore, the area is quite dependent on tourism revenue. Unfortunately, most of the actual revenue never reaches the area because the tourists who are coming to the highlands have generally made their travel arrangements elsewhere. The monies paid for transportation have gone to international and national air carriers; the monies for accommodation have been paid, in most cases, to a travel agency who buys the rooms at the 'rack' rate, takes a profit, and transfers the balance to the accounts of the individual absentee hotel owners. So when the tourist eventually reaches Cuzco, most things have already been paid for and that money does not enter into the local economy except through wages paid to employees, permits, taxes, and so on. The money which does enter into the local economy is the discretionary spending of the tourist. Nuñez states:

\(^{24}\)Tourism figures have fluctuated with the political climate, guerilla activities, and periodic outbreaks of cholera. These are all serious considerations. As of Jan. '93, the 1990 cholera outbreak had resulted in 3,482 deaths (Hudson 1993).
...the monies expended by tourists for goods and services at the local, community level, in markets and bazaars, in taxis and in taverns, for meals and gratuities, may bring greater prosperity and well-being to members of the host community than they might have found possible by any other means in their lifetimes (1989:274).

It is true that tourism has effected many changes in the lives of the inhabitants, in their rituals, and in their arts and crafts. The anthropological critique of modernization would naturally view these changes from a negative aspect; the scenario, however, is not all black and white as the following section will show.
SECTION IV

Cultural Commoditization: A Case Study

Davydd Greenwood first published an article on tourism as cultural commoditization, *Culture by the Pound*, in 1977. His fieldwork, first started in the early sixties, took place in the town of Fuenterrabia in the north-eastern corner of Spain and was specifically concentrated on a ritual festival called the Alarde which had been performed since the 17th century. It had been a private festival of sorts: a commemoration of the time when everyone from every social stratum had united and withstood a sixty-nine day siege by the French. Since then, all the townspeople had participated in the Alarde. It had been a ritual imbued with deep meaning. "Together these people...(became) a single spirit capable of withstanding the onslaughts of the outside world as they once withstood the siege of 1638" (Greenwood 1989:176). Spain, like Peru, is a country of distinct class differences, but for this one day, all of the citizens of Fuenterrabia were united in spirit and action, just as they were when they held off the French siege. This was an event by and for the citizens of the town plus a few Spanish elite with durable ties to the community. It had never been a tourist spectacle performed for the tourists.

All this changed in 1969. Through a combination of events too numerous to explain here, the municipal government changed the Alarde into a public spectacle. "In service of simple
pecuniary motives, it defined the Alarde as a public show to be performed for outsiders who, because of their economic importance in the town, had the right to see it" (Ibid.:178). Within two summers, there was a problem in finding citizens who would participate in the Alarde. What had once been a ritual of meaning for the people, an "...affirmation of their belief in their own culture" (Ibid.) had been declared a public event to attract more tourism revenue. This had violated the meaning of the Alarde for the townspeople, its power and authenticity had been destroyed (Ibid.:179).

Greenwood wrote a strong condemnation of cultural commoditization at the end of his essay when it was published in 1977:

> Treating culture as a natural resource or a commodity over which tourists have rights is not simply perverse, it is a violation of the peoples' cultural rights.

The second edition of the essay was published in 1989 with a five page epilogue. In the intervening years, Greenwood has modified his position on cultural commoditization through tourism. He states that on the surface, determining what is authentic seems simple enough: just look at traditional models and compare them to current models. The changes which have occurred can be judged to be untraditional and therefore inauthentic (Ibid.:183). Greenwood notes that this, however, is not the case. "...the evaluation of tourism cannot be accomplished by measuring the impact of tourism against a
static background" (Ibid.:182). Certainly, tourism may accelerate change, but these changes are not endemic to tourism. Poverty, industrialization, pollution, migration, urbanization, civil war and many other factors contribute to culture change (Ibid.:181).

Cultures are in a continual process of change, caught up in complex "webs of significance" (Ibid.:183) which extend beyond the village, town, province, or country. When Greenwood had the opportunity to reassess the meaning of the Alarde, he found that it was no longer a cultural affirmation of historical unity for the people of Fuenterrabia. It had become a public spectacle, imbued "...with contemporary political significance as part of the contest over regional political rights in Spain" (Ibid.:181). Its meaning had changed, but it had become meaningful for the people within the context of contemporary Basque-Spanish society.

There is ample evidence in the literature (McKean 1989, Cohen 1988, Greenwood 1989, et al.) to indicate that commoditization can be a revitalizing force in the area of folk arts and crafts, costumes, rituals, ceremonies, festivals, and so on. This goes against the grain of 'traditional' anthropological thinking (Graburn 1984, Turner and Ash 1975, MacCannell 1984, 

25Fuenterrabia is a Basque town. The Basques have been trying to gain independence for many years from Spain.
Rossel 1988, et al.) which basically subscribes to the theory that if a cultural product is changed through external forces such as tourism, it ceases to be authentic and loses its meaning and value. Authenticity is perceived differently by everyone and in that sense it is negotiable. It is cultural arrogance to think that the fabric of entire cultures bound by custom, language, and religion is so weak that it can simply be rendered meaningless when its outward manifestations are modified or altered to cash in on tourism revenue.

I shall let David Harrison (1992:31) have the final word about cultural commoditization in Third World countries:

...there is something quite patronising (sic) in the view that the culture of many LDCs is weak and in dire need of protection from outside. In fact, the cultures of many tourist-receiving societies...may possess some kind of 'deep structure' which allows them to adapt to new influences and yet retain --even reinforce-- their vitality and coherence.

Transformations and Conclusions

I had done very little research prior to going to Peru and my cultural values were firmly planted in Eurocentric ideology. Soon after my arrival, I began to doubt my previously unquestioning acceptance of Western superiority. This shift in thinking was precipitated by exceptionally well-preserved ruins of complex civilizations pre-dating the civilizations which gave rise to Greek temples and Roman antiquities. There were exquisite artifacts from even earlier civilizations
contemporaneous with the Egyptian pyramid builders. For me, this was a new reality. Although I had read about these ancient cultures and structures as an adult, that knowledge had not been validated through any high school history class. New World peoples as the skilled builders of these incredible architectural wonders, on par with Old World antiquities, had not been integrated into my knowledge base by our educational system. To actually see, touch, and walk on these ancient ruins and to see the sophisticated artifacts made by the ancient craftsmen changed my perceptions and attitudes toward the world forever and towards our Eurocentric educational system that our entire culture is founded on. Turner and Ash make the following statement about tourism which confirms my experience:

It still has the potential to educate, since, in its highest form, it seeks to view and understand the origins and development of cultures. Anecdotes of tourist crassness are numerous but there are also tourists who do experience new feelings -- who come to some new realization of their relation to history when visiting cultures other than their own, or observing the monuments of past cultures. Anew awareness of the complexities and troubles of past or foreign cultures may conceivably turn the tourists' thoughts back to the complexities of his own culture (1975:149).

I believe I have shown through anecdotal evidence that it is possible for the tourist self to experience change through ethnic tourism. I have also demonstrated through evidence from the field how indigenous people may respond to tourism by commoditizing certain aspects of their culture but I do not
believe that this response fundamentally changes the native self. In liberal circles it is fashionable to view the natives as hapless victims of exploitation by the tourist industry, however, this is not so because the native is on home ground and often makes use of that fact (van den Berghe 1980:379). Moreover, as Lothar Nettekoven points out, in actuality there are fewer encounters between tourists and natives than is generally assumed and that the interaction between the two is one of the least important influences in culture change (1976:135). While it is true that commoditization of indigenous cultures does occur in response to tourism, it does not invalidate a culture that is hundreds, if not thousands, of years old. "We must...resist the temptation to view indigenous peoples as unable to adapt and to assimilate to a changing world. We cannot keep them as pristine pets on anthropological reservations" (Nuñez 1989:274). These cultures have been in a continual process of change throughout their entire existence and this process of change will continue as long as they continue to exist.

Eventually, the power structure in Peruvian society will change. In less than 500 years, the mestizo class has come into being and now totals approximately half of the population. With the forces of globalization, it will take even less time for further changes to come about. Also, forces from within the country are trying to effect change. Between
1879 and 1965 there have been 32 Indian revolts (Hudson 1993), but during my trip, the Sendero Luminoso presented a far greater danger. Both German and Japanese tourist groups had unfortunate encounters with them and strong measures were being taken to keep everything quiet so that tourism would not suffer as a result. With these internal and external forces in motion, it is inevitable that eventually profound societal changes are going to take place. At some point in their future history, the Indians may even be in a position of power to control those aspects of tourism which influence their lives and, in effect, become like the Amish of Pennsylvania.

---

26 When was travelling the highland highways, on three occasions the road was blocked by burning tires and rock slides dynamited from the mountain sides. The mestizo driver of the van simply said, "The peasants are not happy, they do this all the time."

27 Between 1980-1990, 18,000 people were killed by the Sendero Luminoso. Their aim is to change the ills of poverty, inequity and racial discrimination (Hudson 1993).
LITERATURE CITED


Williamsburg, Virginia: Department of Anthropology, College of William and Mary.


Peru. n.d. Fondo De Promocion Turistica.


