

C. 1

AN ANALYSIS OF ADULT EDUCATION IN LIBRARIES AND MUSEUMS

by

JENNIFER CRAWFORD

B.A. Dalhousie University, 1968

A THESIS SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT OF
THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF
MASTER OF ARTS

in

THE FACULTY OF GRADUATE STUDIES
Administrative, Adult and Higher Education

We accept this thesis as conforming
to the required standard

THE UNIVERSITY OF BRITISH COLUMBIA

April, 1988

© JENNIFER CRAWFORD, 1988

In presenting this thesis in partial fulfilment of the requirements for an advanced degree at The University of British Columbia, I agree that the Library shall make it freely available for reference and study. I further agree that permission for extensive copying of this thesis for scholarly purposes may be granted by the Head of my Department or by his or her representatives. It is understood that copying or publication of this thesis for financial gain shall not be allowed without my written permission.

Administrative, Adult and Higher Education

The University of British Columbia
2075 Wesbrook Place
Vancouver, Canada
V6T 1W5

Date: April, 1988

ABSTRACT

One of the characteristics of adult education is the degree to which it is dispersed throughout society. Much adult education is practiced in organizations and institutions that have purposes other than adult education. Schroeder (1970, p. 37) has suggested a category of adult education agencies (Type III agencies) established to serve both the educational and non-educational needs of the community, agencies in which "adult education is an allied function employed to fill only some of the needs which agencies recognize as their responsibility." The purpose of this study was to examine adult education in Schroeder's Type III agencies using libraries and museums as examples. The study addressed the definition and description of adult education, the importance of adult education relative to other functions of the organization, and the purposes for which the organizations used adult education.

A comparative analysis of the adult education function of three libraries and three museums was conducted. Print materials (annual reports and publicity brochures) and interviews with the person responsible for programming were used as data sources. Analysis of the findings was done in three stages: single case analysis (within case analysis), analysis of libraries and museums (within category analysis), and comparison of libraries and museums (across category analysis).

Many definitions of adult education were found. Most described the purposes of adult education rather than the process of teaching and learning. It was also found that the importance of adult education varied among the organizations studied. Adult education was less important than other organizational functions in four of the six organizations studied. It was as important as other

functions in one organization and was not ranked in one organization. Five uses for adult education were found: stimulation (encouraging better use of the library or museum), enrichment (adding extra information), extension (enlarging community contacts), service (filling a social need), and advocacy (promoting social change). Generally, libraries used programming for extension and museums used it for enrichment.

This study has contributed to understanding adult education in Type III organizations by describing some ways non-professional adult educators view adult education. It has also suggested some contextual factors that influence the adult education function in those organizations and has suggested a variety of purposes for which adult education could be used.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT.....	ii
LIST OF TABLES.....	vi
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	vii
CHAPTER 1: THE RESEARCH PROBLEM.....	1
Definition of Terms.....	2
The Field of Operations.....	8
Purpose of the Study.....	11
Contributions of this Research.....	14
CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW.....	16
Definitions of Adult Education.....	17
Importance of Adult Education.....	27
Uses of Programming.....	30
Evaluation of the Literature.....	35
CHAPTER 3: METHODOLOGY.....	38
Data Collection.....	38
Data Collection Instruments.....	41
Analysis of Data.....	42
Pilot Testing.....	45
Agencies for Study.....	49
CHAPTER 4: FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS.....	51
Museums: Museum of Anthropology.....	51
Museums: Surrey Art Gallery.....	59
Museums: Vancouver Museum.....	67
Libraries: New Westminster Public Library.....	75
Libraries: North Vancouver District Library: Lynn Valley Branch.....	81
Libraries: Surrey Public Library, Whalley Branch.....	87
Comparison of Museums.....	93
Comparison of Libraries.....	99
Across Category Comparisons.....	103
CHAPTER 5: SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS.....	107
Levels of Use of the Term "Adult Education".....	107
Importance of Adult Education.....	110
Contributions of Adult Education.....	116
Implications from this Study.....	119
Suggestions for Further Research.....	126

APPENDIX 1: Table Shells	128
APPENDIX 2: Interview Schedule.....	129
APPENDIX 3: Sample Consent Form.....	134
APPENDIX 4: Sample Letter Requesting Permission.....	135
REFERENCES	136

LIST OF TABLES

TABLE 1: General Definitions of Adult Education.....	5
TABLE 2: Library and Museum Definitions of Adult Education.....	18-20
TABLE 3: Comparison of Definitions.....	21

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Even though one person writes a thesis, there are many who contribute. The author was fortunate to have the support of many in this effort.

I would first like to thank the members of my advisory committee: Dr. Tom Sork, Mr. Gordon Selman, and Professor Lois Bewley. I would most like to thank my thesis advisor, Dr. Tom Sork for his guidance, and patient and constructive criticism through draft after draft. Gordon Selman was always interested and helpful. Professor Bewley contributed her knowledge from the world of libraries. She was particularly helpful in finding the libraries in which to do research.

There were my friends at the Adult Education Research Centre who helped me by listening to and helping me sort out my ideas, and by helping me to learn to use the computer. I would particularly like to thank Andrea Mathieson, Shauna Butterwick and Irene Strychar.

Finally, I would like to thank my family for their support through the whole of my graduate program -- particularly during those times when I had to be away from home more than I wanted to be.

CHAPTER I

THE RESEARCH PROBLEM

One of the characteristics of adult education is the degree to which it is dispersed throughout society. Unlike formal education for children which is concentrated in schools, much adult education takes place outside formal educational settings. Much of that adult education takes place in community organizations in which adult education is one of a number of organizational functions. We in adult education do not know much about adult education in these settings. Schroeder (1970) has suggested a category of adult education agencies established to serve both the educational and non-educational needs of the community, agencies in which "adult education is an allied function employed to fulfill only some of the needs which agencies recognize as their responsibility" (Schroeder, 1970, p. 37). He called this category of adult education agencies "Type III" agencies. But beyond suggesting the Type III category and the notion of adult education as an "allied function", Schroeder has not explained either his concept of adult education or the meaning of "allied function" in much detail. The purpose of this research was to investigate adult education in Schroeder's Type III organizations using libraries and museums as examples.

The need for research into this area of the field of adult education operations has been called for in the adult education literature (MacNeil, 1980; Gelpi, 1979; Peters, 1980; Thomas, 1964). Two quotations written almost twenty years apart illustrate the need. Peters (1980, p. xi) said

that there are so few organizations devoted solely to adult education that "an attempt to study those few would result in neglect of the bulk of activities and processes we normally associate with adult education."

Thomas, too, acknowledged the need when he said that research in agencies in the community "remains vastly [sic] a large new vein to be tapped, one of great significance to adult education. . . . It would be a great step forward to facilitate exchange among these areas" (Thomas, 1964, p. 255).

In this chapter the research problem will be discussed. There are four sections. In the first section the process used to select a definition for the terms "adult education" and "allied function" is described. In the second section Schroeder's typologies are described. The third section contains a more complete description of the purpose of the research and the research questions. In the fourth section some of the ways this study can contribute to knowledge about adult education are suggested.

Definition of Terms

The most important terms used in this study are "adult education" and "allied function."

Adult Education

Before beginning research it was necessary to select a definition that would enable the researcher to identify adult education in the literature and to distinguish adult education from other activities in libraries and museums. Many definitions of adult education were found in both the adult education literature and library and museum literatures inducing what Thomas (1964, p. 242) called "the maximum in frustration

for the researcher who is interested in some precision in terms." There appeared to be two types of definitions in the literature: those that described the purposes of adult education and those that described the process. The definitions referred to in the following section are listed in Table 1.

Purpose definitions. Purpose definitions describe the aims and outcomes of adult education. Examples of purpose definitions are those proposed by Wiltshire, Taylor and Jennings (1980) and Boyd and Apps (1980) from the adult education literature, and Monroe (1963) from the library literature. These definitions described expected outcomes from adult education in broad terms such as "fit a man for life" (1919 Report, 1980, p. 4), or "well-being of society as a whole" (Monroe, 1963, p. 15).

Process definitions. Process definitions describe how adult education is conducted. Examples of process definitions are those proposed by Verner (1964) from the adult education literature, Asheim (in Warncke, 1968) from the library literature and Zetterberg (1969) from the museum literature. These definitions mention the nature of the agent/learner relationship, imply the presence of educational objectives, and describe teaching or learning activities. They contain phrases such as "agent (who) selects, arranges and continuously directs" (Verner, 1964, p. 32), or "marked by a defined goal" (Asheim, in Warncke, 1968, p. 11), or "element of purposeful planned instruction" (Zetterberg, 1969, p. 16).

A process definition, because it could be operationalized to allow adult education activities to be exactly identified and distinguished from other activities of libraries and museums was selected for this study.

Among the process definitions considered, Verner's seemed the most appropriate.

Verner's definition. Verner's definition described an instructional situation. To Verner, adult education was:

a relationship between an educational agent and learner in which the agent selects, arranges and continuously directs a sequence of progressive tasks that provide systematic experience to achieve learning for those whose participation in such activities is subsidiary and supplemental to a primary role in society. (Verner, 1964, p. 32)

Verner's definition can be broken down into four components: agent/learner relationship, objectives, systematic, and adult. The phrase "relationship between educational agent and learner" means that learning was directed by an instructor, "systematic experiences to achieve learning" implied the presence of educational objectives and the phrase "selects, arranges and continuously directs. . .tasks" described the central role of the agent. Moreover, Verner's description of the word "adult" portrayed the type of participation in adult education activities. These four components seem to describe well the type of adult education activity sought in this study.

TABLE 1

General Definitions of Adult EducationPurpose Definitions

(Wiltshire, Taylor and Jennings, 1980, p. 5)

. . . Adult education must not be regarded as a luxury for a few exceptional persons here and there, nor as a thing which concerns only a short span of early manhood, but as a permanent national necessity, an inseparable aspect of citizenship, and therefore should be both universal and lifelong.
(Source: The 1919 Report)

(Boyd and Apps, 1980, p. 10)

. . . the progressive movement towards the solution of problems and the development of abilities to encounter future problems with greater competencies.

(Monroe, 1963, p. 15)

. . . a thread of philosophy which ran through the thinking about library adult education. . . was that public librarianship had a responsibility to stimulate and guide the community to the use of the library's materials for the best growth of the individual in terms of his needs and interests and for the wellbeing of society as a whole.

Process Definitions

(Verner, 1964, p. 32)

. . . a relationship between an educational agent and learner in which the agent selects, arranges and continuously directs a sequence of progressive tasks that provide systematic experience to achieve learning for those whose participation in such activities is subsidiary and supplemental to a primary role in society.

(Asheim in Warncke, 1968, p. 11)

. . . those library activities for adult individuals and groups which form part of the total educational process and which are marked by a defined goal, derived from an analysis of needs or interests. These activities aim at a continuing, cumulative educational experience for those who participate, require special planning and organization and may be originated by the library or by a request from individuals or groups concerned.

(Zetterberg, 1969, p. 16)

Education must retain an element of purposeful, planned instruction to be worthy of the name education. . . It should involve active participation, but active participation does not make it education.

Using Verner's definition the following activities would be called "adult education": tours, classes, lectures, workshops, demonstrations, and discussion groups. In libraries and museums, these activities are commonly referred to as "programming." From here on, much of the adult education activity described in this study will also be referred to as "programming." Verner's definition excludes non-programming library and museum activities also designed to help adults learn, such as exhibits and displays, reference services, and support for the work of other adult education agencies in the community.

The discussion on definition would not be complete without mention of Schroeder's (1980) definition of adult education. Schroeder did not give a definition of adult education for his 1970 typology. Since Schroeder's Type III category of adult education providers was the focus of this study it would have seemed appropriate to use Schroeder's definition in the research. Unfortunately, Schroeder's definition was not practical. Schroeder defined adult education as "a developmental process (that) links agent and adult client systems together for the purpose of establishing directions and procedures for adult learning" (Schroeder, 1980, p. 56). His definition had two problems with respect to this research. For one, it was a circular definition by repeating the use of the word "adult". For another, the phrase "developmental process" was too ambiguous to be operationalized. A "developmental process" could refer to program development, instruction, gathering resources for self-directed learners, and more. For these reasons, Schroeder's definition was unsuitable.

Allied Function

Two types of meaning also applied to the term "allied function": an operational meaning referring to the ways adult education relates to other activities in the organization and a political definition referring to the importance of adult education relative to other functions of the organization.

Operational meaning. Several dictionaries were consulted to find an operational meaning of "allied function." "Allied" is understood to mean "closely related to", and "function" to mean an activity or set of activities designed to fulfill some purpose. Combining them, "allied function" means "closely related activities for a certain purpose."

Political meaning. Schroeder's use of the term appeared to be different from the operational meaning. He seemed to be referring to the political use of the term. The meaning of "allied" seemed clearer when contrasted with "central", "secondary" or "subordinate" in other categories of his typology. Schroeder appeared to imply that adult education in organizations where it is an allied function was equally as important as other functions of the organization. In organizations where adult education is a "central" function, adult education is more important than other functions and in organizations where it is "secondary" or "subordinate" function it is less important than other functions. In this paper "allied function" was assumed to mean "as important as" other functions of the organization.

The Field of Operations

Many different kinds of organizations and institutions provide adult education. Some authors have classified institutions of adult education into typologies, notably Schroeder (1970, 1980), Verner (1964), Knowles (1964) and Houle (1960).

Schroeder's 1970 Typology

Using the importance of adult education relative to other functions of the organization as his organizing principle, Schroeder identified four types of adult education agencies:

- Type I - established to serve the educational needs of adults -- adult education is the central function of the organization,
- Type II - agencies established to serve the educational needs of youth which have assumed the added responsibility of at least partially serving the educational needs of the public -- adult education is a secondary function.
- Type III - agencies established to serve both educational and non educational needs of the community -- adult education is an allied function employed to fulfill only some of the needs which agencies recognize as their responsibility.
- Type IV - agencies established to serve the special interests (economic, ideological) of special groups -- adult education is a subordinate function employed primarily to further special interests of the agency itself. (Schroeder, 1970, p. 37)

Previous Typologies

Schroeder's 1970 typology was based on work by Verner (1964), Knowles (1964) and Houle (1960). Verner and Knowles classified agencies of adult education while Houle classified the types of people who practice adult education. Verner and Knowles, like Schroeder, classified agencies of adult education according to the importance of adult education relative to other functions of the organization. Verner and Knowles mentioned the first two categories of Schroeder's 1970 typology but differed on their classification of community adult education agencies. Knowles made a distinction between two types of community organizations offering adult education, those designed to serve the whole community and those serving a special interest area. Verner mentioned only one category of community adult education agencies, those which he called "adult education as means" (Verner, 1964, p.14). Schroeder's 1970 typology most closely resembled Knowles' typology.

Houle's contribution to Schroeder's typology was different from Knowles and Verner. Rather than offering a classification of adult education agencies, Houle identified different types of adult education practitioners. Houle called his typology a "pyramid of leadership." He identified a large group of practitioners at the bottom of the pyramid who practice adult education but have no formal training, a smaller group in the middle who are trained in something other than adult education but who practice it as part of their jobs, and a small group at the top who are professional adult educators. Houle's pyramid shows that many who practice adult education, particularly those who practice in community

organizations, are not professionally trained adult educators.

Schroeder's 1980 Typology

In 1980 Schroeder refined his 1970 typology. In his new typology, Schroeder identified two types of providers of adult education according to the primary roles they perform: "leadership systems" and "operating systems." "Leadership systems" furnish guidance and leadership to the whole field and include government agencies, professional associations, private foundations, and graduate programs of adult education. "Operating systems" plan and conduct adult education programs for various clienteles and include institutional agencies, voluntary associations, and individual agents.

The category Schroeder called "institutional agencies" was the category of "operating systems" that most closely resembled his 1970 typology. Within the category of institutional agencies, he identified the same four types of agencies but renamed them according to type of institution. Thus Type I became "autonomous adult education agencies", Type II became known as "youth education agencies", Type III became "community service organizations", while Type IV became "special interest agencies." Nonetheless, while Schroeder expanded upon his old typology, creating new categories and renaming old ones, he did not appear to have changed the organizing principle. As in the 1970 typology, the 1980 typology was still based on the importance of adult education relative to other functions of the organization. The old typology appears to be more concise and more clearly illustrates the relative relationship of adult education to other functions of the organization and was therefore used in

this research.

Libraries and Museums

Schroeder gave libraries and museums as examples Type III agencies. He also included health and welfare agencies, corrections institutions, and family counselling agencies. While any of these might have been appropriate for this research, libraries and museums were selected for study. "Programming" in libraries and museums fits the definition of adult education used in this paper. Further, in libraries and museums the function of programs relative to other functions of the organization could be clearly identified. Libraries and museums also have enough similarities and differences to make comparisons possible. Both are concerned with collections. Gregg (1960, p. 331) called museums "a library of specimens." Both offer programs to adults whose participation is subsidiary and supplemental to other roles; both are designed to serve the whole community. However, they differ in two ways. For one, libraries and museums offer programs for different reasons. For another, museums have a mandate to undertake research on their collections while librarians do not making the purposes of the organizations somewhat different. Moreover, the study of both literatures allowed two perspectives on the same research questions.

Purpose of the Study

The fact that adult educators do not know much about the practice of adult education in community organizations, organizations in which adult education is one of a number of functions, is the primary rationale for this study. Little is known about how those who practice in those

settings define and describe adult education. Nor are the purposes for which adult education is conducted known. Further, Schroeder, through his typologies, has increased understanding of adult education in these settings but has not provided much detail about either his concept of adult education or the meaning of "allied function." The purpose of this study, then, was to examine adult education in organizations in which adult education is an allied function using libraries and museums as examples. Specifically, the study examined how adult education was described, its importance in the organization relative to other functions, and the various purposes for which it was used.

Research Questions

Three questions flowed from the purpose of the research.

1. How do those who work in adult education programming in libraries and museums define and describe adult education?
2. To those who practice adult education programming in libraries and museums, how important is it relative to other functions? What are the factors that influence its importance?
3. For what purposes is adult education programming used in libraries and museums?

Definition of adult education. Many meanings of adult education were suggested in the library and museum literatures. Few of those definitions conformed to Verner's definition. It was therefore important to understand what was meant by the term "adult education."

Understanding the concept of adult education enabled the researcher to identify adult education activities and to determine the purposes and

processes of adult education.

Importance of programming relative to other functions of the organization. Schroeder's use of the word "allied" was assumed to mean "of equal importance" of adult education relative to other functions of the organization. The question naturally arose as to whether this was so. Relative importance of programming was assessed and some of the factors that influenced its importance identified.

The uses of programming in libraries and museums. The term "use" refers to the function of an activity for a certain purpose. In this research it refers to the purposes for which libraries and museums conduct programming. The various uses were identified and categorized.

Before ending this section, something that was relevant to the research but not included in this study should be mentioned. The organizational and social context of libraries and museums very much influences the adult education function within them. For the purpose of adult education is drawn from the purpose of the organization, and the purpose of the organization is drawn from its role in society. Apart from acknowledging the fact that libraries and museums fulfill several educational and recreational roles, the contextual factors that affect the definition, position and uses of adult education in libraries and museums were acknowledged but not studied in detail.

Contributions of This Research

Five contributions that the research makes to understanding adult education in Type III agencies have been identified.

First, this study should improve our understanding of adult education in Type III agencies. Research about adult education has been conducted for libraries and museums, but little has been reported in the adult education literature. The need for research into this area of the field of operations has been acknowledged in the literature. Second, it should clarify what it means when adult education is an "allied function." Schroeder introduced the notion of "allied function" but did not explain it in much detail. Third, it should provide some insight into how adult education is conceptualized and practiced by people such as librarians and museum curators who are not primarily trained in adult education. Their work is more likely to be reported in their respective literatures and not in the adult education literature making it a relatively unknown to adult educators. Fourth, it should suggest a range of possible uses for programming in libraries and museums. It could provide ideas and alternatives for ways libraries and museums might use programming. Fifth, it should identify some factors that influence the position of adult education in organizations which have functions in addition to adult education. Apart from a few studies (Darkenwald, 1974; Knox, 1980; Clark, 1964) the organizational context of adult education has not been well researched. This study not only examined the relative importance of adult education, it also identified some factors influencing its importance that could lay the foundation for future research into the organizational

context of adult education.

The four chapters following this one contain a review of library and museum literature with respect to the three research questions, a detailed description of the methodology that was employed in the field work, a description of the findings from the field research, and a final chapter containing a summary and conclusions.

CHAPTER 2

LITERATURE REVIEW

The purpose of this chapter is to review the library and museum literature on adult education with respect to the three research questions. Because there was little in the adult education literature on the subject, material for this study was drawn from books, journals, and studies written for libraries and museums. It will be noted that much of this literature, particularly the library literature, was written before 1970. Little current literature was found that was specifically pertinent to this study. It also will be noted that most of the literature was American. Little Canadian literature on the topic was found.

This chapter is divided into three sections, each one conforming to one of the research questions. The first section is about the description and definition of adult education in libraries and museums, particularly with respect to the variations in the definitions. The second section is about the importance of adult education relative to other functions of the organization. A number of factors that affect its position are suggested. The third section is about the five uses of adult education found in libraries and museums. The last section contains a brief evaluation of the literature.

Definitions of Adult Education

In this section various definitions of adult education are analyzed and compared and some of the reasons for the variations found in the definitions given. Different terminologies for adult education were noted in the literature. Some of the definitions that described adult education were often called something else. Terms such as "popular education", "community education", or just "education" were considered also as definitions of adult education. Table 2 on page -- contains the definitions that were analyzed in this section. Table 3 contains a comparison of those definitions.

Variations in Definitions

Six components from purpose and process definitions were chosen to analyze the definitions, four from Verner's definition and two from purpose definitions. The four from Verner's definition were: agent/learner relationship, the presence of educational objectives, the notion of systematic delivery of instruction, and the notion of serving adults in a part-time, supplementary fashion. The two from purpose definitions were: orientation and client focus. Most definitions in the literature contained these six components.

Agent/learner relationship. Because Verner felt that a direct relationship between the educational agent and the learner was the crucial element that distinguished education from learning, an indication of this relationship was sought in the definitions. The relationship, while not always described clearly, was indicated by a verb such as "directed" or "planned."

TABLE 2

Library and Museum Definitions of Adult EducationLibrary Adult Education

. . . those library activities for adult individuals and groups which form part of the total educational process and which are marked by a defined goal, derived from an analysis of needs or interests. These activities aim at a continuing, cumulative educational experience for those who participate, require special planning and organization and may be originated by the library or by a request from individuals or groups concerned. (Asheim in Warncke, 1968, p.11)

Adult Education

. . . an effort put forth by a mature person to improve himself/ herself by acquiring information, understandings, attitudes or appreciations, or the effort of an agency to present the opportunity and encouragement to mature persons for improving themselves or their communities. (Houle, 1951, p. 24)

Adult Education

The library's adult education function is performed by providing appropriate means for adults to continue to learn, but only when there is a purposeful aim within the context of librarianship. (Lee in Stibitz, 1968 p. 48)

Library adult education

. . . a thread of philosophy which ran through the thinking about library adult education . . . was that public librarianship had a responsibility to stimulate and guide the community to the use of the library's materials for the best growth of the individual in terms of his needs and interests and for the well-being of society as a whole. (Monroe, 1963, p. 15)

Educational activity

. . . any library service which would directly help an adult user to build upon and realize his potentialities. (Phinney, 1956, p. 3)

Popular education

. . . a process whereby people through their own efforts, set out systematically to develop certain attitudes, or to acquire new knowledge. . . ie. adult self education taking place outside the confines of a school, a continuous, life-long process. (Raymond, 1978, p. 55)

Adult education

. . . [any service for adults] if performed with planning, direction, or participation in one or more of the services which [are] included in the six categories of service -- supplying, planning, advising, training, informing and doing. (Smith, 1954, p. 1)

Adult Education, Reader's Advisor, Continuing Education

Regardless of the term used to describe this continuing function its objective has remained the same -- to teach the individual "of every age, education, philosophy, occupation, economic level, ethnic origin and human condition . . . regardless of where he lives." (Standards Committee . . . of the Public Library Association, American Library Association Minimum Standards for Public Library Systems, 1966. Chicago, ALA, 1967, p.9, quoted in Stevenson, 1968, p.4)

Museum Definitions

Adult Education

Adult education is something more than an intellectual opiate for the governed masses. It represents a definite method for social control, an essential framework for political democracy. (Adam, 1939, p. 135)

Community Education

(1) the arousal of civic consciousness and the creation of a sense of belonging; (2) the spreading of knowledge and understanding of what the needs and problems are and how to identify them; how people themselves can be enabled to determine their needs, and what the possibilities and alternatives are for remedying those conditions on both short and long term bases; (3) the assistance needed to bring about participation in the action necessary to formulate a plan and then carry it out. (Chadwick, 1980, p. 123)

Education

. . . the involvement that the public is looking for is not what can be provided by direct-action, push-button types of participation. Museum visitors desire a higher level of involvement; they desire participation in an active, personalized learning process. (Dixon, Courtenay and Bailey in Wholer, 1976, p. 7)

Education

[The purpose of education] is to nurture the public's confidence in their own abilities to respond to art, encouraging necessary abilities to develop their potential; [to act as] a catalyst to experience, to translate information into feeling; to help actualize the experience itself, to assist the community in rediscovering and developing its own ability to respond to art. (Murphy, 1970, p. 15)

Education Museums should provide programs and activities that arouse the participants's curiosity and test his powers of observation, thus teaching him to teach himself. (Naumer, 1971, p. 15)

Education

Educational responsibility of museums is . . . to find out what we have, to document and publish, to give a wider conceptual frame than mere classification, to overcome the compartmentalization of knowledge, to adapt the new techniques to communication which our century has created; to overcome the explosion of information; to devote ourselves to the periodic training and retraining on which a vigorous and active profession must be based. (Richardson in Larabee (ed.),1968, p. 23)

Adult Education

Education must retain an element of purposeful planned instruction to be worthy of the name education. . . . It should involve active participation, but active participation does not make it education. (Zetterberg, 1969 p.16)

TABLE 3

Comparison of Definitions

<u>Adult Education</u>	<u>Agent/Learner Relationship</u>	<u>Objective</u>	<u>Systematic</u>	<u>Adult</u>	<u>Purpose</u>	<u>Orientation</u>
Verner (1964)	*	*	*	*	-	<i>I</i>
<u>Libraries</u>						
Asheim (in 1968)	*	*	*	*	-	<i>I/G</i>
Houle (1951)	-	*	-	*	*	<i>I</i>
Lee (in 1968)	-	*	-	*	-	<i>I</i>
Monroe (1963)	-	*	-	*	*	<i>I/C</i>
Phinney (1956)	-	-	-	*	*	<i>I</i>
Raymond (1978)	-	-	*	*	*	<i>I</i>
Smith (1954)	*	*	-	*	-	
Stevenson (1968)	*	-	-	-	*	<i>I</i>
<u>Museums</u>						
Adam (1939)	-	-	-	*	*	<i>C</i>
Chadwick (1980)	*	*	-	-	*	<i>C</i>
Dixon et al (in 1976)	-	-	-	-	*	<i>I</i>
Murphy (1970)	-	-	-	-	*	<i>I</i>
Naumer (1971)	-	-	-	-	*	<i>I</i>
Richardson (1968)	-	-	-	-	-	
Zetterberg (1969)	*	*	*	-	-	

* indicates presence in definition

- indicates absence in definition

I individual client focus

G group client focus

C community client focus

Objective. This refers to the presence of a specific educational purpose, and was indicated in the definitions by words such as "goal", "aim", "direction", and occasionally "objective."

Systematic. This refers to an orderly combination of learning tasks. Because an element of systematic control and direction is evident in Verner's definition and appears in varying amounts in much of the adult education activity discussed in the literature, mention of it was sought in the definitions. Systematic was indicated by words such as "continuing", "cumulative" or "purposeful, planned instruction."

Adult. A direct reference to "adult" or a general approach to education was looked for in the definitions. The words "adult" or "mature person" indicated if educational activities were designed for adults.

Orientation. This refers to an awareness of the relationship of adult education to its social environment. Since many adult education definitions are oriented toward personal and/or social growth some indication of this was sought. Words such as "growth of the individual", "well-being of society", or "improving themselves" indicated orientation.

Client focus. This refers to the audience for library or museum adult education. Boyd and Apps' (1980) client systems: individual, group, and community were used in this study to indicate the audience for adult education activities. Words such as "individual", "person", or "society" indicated client focus.

Analysis of Definitions

The definitions were analyzed as follows. Library definitions and museum definitions were first compared with each other. Then library definitions were compared with museum definitions.

Library definitions. Library definitions generally described the total educational function of the library rather than just the programming function. Most definitions were purpose definitions, concerned with aims and outcomes rather than the design of instruction. While all the definitions indicated the presence of an educational agent, only three of the eight indicated a direct relationship between the agent and learner (Asheim, in 1968; Smith, 1954, and Stevenson, 1968). A sense of purpose was present in five of the definitions (Houle, 1951; Monroe, 1963, Phinney, 1956; Raymond, 1978 and Stevenson, 1968). Two of the three in which it was absent were process definitions (Asheim, in 1968 and Houle, 1951). The notion of "systematic" was present in only two of the definitions (Asheim, in 1968 and Raymond, 1978). Seven of the eight definitions mentioned the word "adult" (Stevenson, 1968, did not). Seven mentioned a philosophical orientation (Smith, 1954, did not), and five were focused on the individual learner (Houle, 1951; Lee, in 1968; Phinney, 1956; Raymond, 1978; and Stevenson, 1968).

Museum definitions. Museum definitions generally were also concerned with aims and outcomes. Most described the reasons museums wanted to stimulate learning. The aims and outcomes usually referred to in museum definitions were those personal benefits that could result from a stimulating learning experience. However, museum definitions did not

usually describe the learning process in much detail. Only two of the seven museum definitions mentioned an agent/learner relationship (Chadwick, 1980; Zetterberg, 1969). Presence of educational objectives was mentioned in two (Chadwick, 1980 and Zetterberg, 1969). The notion of "systematic" was mentioned in Zetterberg (1969). Only one definition mentioned the word "adult" (Adam, 1939). A philosophic orientation was present in five (Adam, 1939; Chadwick, 1980; Dixon et al, in 1976; Murphy, 1970; Naumer, 1971). Of the five definitions that mentioned client focus, two were oriented to the community (Adam, 1939 and Chadwick, 1980) and three to the individual (Murphy, 1970; Naumer, 1971; and Dixon et al, in 1976).

This analysis has shown that most of the definitions described aims and outcomes for adult education rather than its design and delivery. Most had an individual focus rather than a group or community focus. Generally, library definitions reflected an interest in all the educational functions of the libraries and did not describe how those functions were to be carried out. Museum definitions were more concerned with learning than were library definitions but did not describe learning in terms of process. Zetterberg's and Chadwick's definitions were the exceptions. Interestingly, both Zetterberg and Chadwick were professional adult educators. It was also noted that none of the definitions found in the library and museum literature conformed to Verner's definition.

Factors Influencing Variations in the Definitions

The literature suggested several factors that could account for the variations in definitions.

Organizational context. The meaning of adult education varied from organization to organization. The organization in which adult education was practiced defined the meaning. For example, Smith (1954), showing 37 different types of adult education practice, said that adult education was what the library did when it was said to be providing adult education. It could be any of the 37 services she described.

Purpose of the organization. The purpose of adult education was derived from the purpose of the organization. There appeared to be general agreement in the literature that the functions of libraries were collection development and education and of museums were collection, research, and education. But opinions differed as to the most important function of each organization. For example, in museums, Chadwick (1980, p. 58) said that a number of definitions of museums existed underlining the fact that "agreement is by no means unanimous as to their functions." He said that some favoured the scholar rather than the general public, some were more concerned with aesthetics than education, and some gave preference to acquisition, conservation and research. Seeing itself as a research institution rather than an educational institution for example, would affect how education was defined.

Lack of consensus about the goals of education. While there appeared to be consensus about the goals of adult education at a philosophical level, there appeared to be little consensus at a practical

level. Most definitions in the literature were purpose definitions referring to goals such as "greater good of society" or "growth of the individual" with little description of how those goals were to be achieved. Monroe (1974) talked about lack of consensus at a practical level when she described a problem in trying to evaluate services for adults in libraries. According to Monroe, adult services lacked direction. She said that it was difficult to translate the vague but agreed upon goals of adult education into activities. Lee (in 1968) and Adam (1939) agreed when they said that much educational work in libraries and museums, based on unexamined assumptions, was missing concrete educational objectives.

Practice by professionals not trained in adult education. Adult education in libraries and museums is practiced mainly by librarians and curators rather than adult educators. The literature suggested that adult education in libraries and museums lacked a professional educational perspective. Knowles (1980), Zeller (1985) and Monroe (1963) spoke to this phenomenon when they talked about a sometimes vague approach to adult education. They suggested that while most librarians and curators agreed on the value of adult education, they did not have a clear idea of what adult education was or what it could do. Further, they often lacked the skills necessary to design and carry out adult education. Knowles (1980, p. 79) agreed when he said that adult education positions are "no longer merely administrative jobs just like other administrative jobs; they are specialized roles requiring specialized attitudes and competencies."

Lack of consensus within adult education. Peters (1980, p. xi)

talked about the lack of consensus when he said that "the plethora of definitions in the field testified to the complexity of the field itself." The problem of finding order in adult education within the collage of organizations, programs, clientele, and concepts that comprise adult education itself is challenging and becomes more so in organizations where it is an allied function.

Importance of Adult Education

The literature revealed that, for a number of reasons, adult education was more important in some organizations than in others. Collection development and education are commonly agreed on functions of libraries and museums. Museums have a third function -- research relating to their collections. The literature reflected different points of view about the relative importance of the three functions. In museums some, (Washburn, 1964; Monroe, 1963; and Rae in Adam, 1939) felt that the education function could not be addressed until the collection and/or research function had been fulfilled. Washburn (1964, p. 35) favoured what he called the "productive" (curator) function over the "distributive" (educational) function saying that if quality education was to be hoped for the educational function of a museum should consist of expressing the knowledge which scholars in the museum generate. In libraries, Monroe (1963, p. 476) said that the educational function of the library should be based on the "best materials collection that the library can afford."

Others felt that education, if not the most important function of libraries and museums, should have been more important than it was.

Chadwick (1980), Adam (1939), and Raymond (1978) saw libraries and museums as vehicles for education and favoured educational activities over every other function. In short, the choice between several functions required what Adam (1939, p. 42) called a "nice judgement" for support of collection, research or education.

Factors Which Influenced the Importance of Adult Education

The literature mentioned several factors which affected the importance of adult education in libraries and museums.

Traditional priorities of the institution. An organization that had traditionally done something a certain way would likely continue the same pattern. For example, a library that had historically favoured collection before education would not likely change its traditional approach and emphasize education before collection.

Director's priorities. Organizations reflect the priorities of the person who runs them. As Ralph Waldo Emerson once said, institutions are "lengthened shadows of one man" (Hamp, 1985, p. 35). If the director considered education to be an important function, then it would be reflected in that organization's policies and practices.

Organizational structure. Adult education is often not clearly enough defined in the organization to ensure that it has adequate personnel and budget. According to Lawrence and Lorsch (1967) an organization deals with its environment by differentiating the functions within it. Knowles (1980) acknowledged the importance of a differentiated unit for adult education in the organization when he said that adult education must be differentiated in an organization to the extent that it

has its own budget, policies and trained personnel if it is to be effective. Differentiation would be indicated in libraries and museums by designating a person or a department to be responsible for adult education.

Professionalization of staff. In libraries and museums those responsible for adult education are librarians or curators and can favour their own professional interests over the development of adult education skills. Zeller (1985), studying art museum educators found that, given the choice, art museum educators placed training in their specialty over training in education. Professional training in education appeared to make a difference in the delivery of educational services. The literature suggested that those trained in something other than adult education were not as able to apply educational principles and practices. Darkenwald (1974), studying the acceptance of educational innovations in adult basic education agencies, found that professional training in adult education made a difference in being able to use new teaching and learning methods.

Practical considerations. While most authors agreed that there were practical problems like lack of time, funds, or space in libraries and museums, most also agreed that they were more likely to be symptoms of a problem of organizational priorities rather than real problems. Bob (1982), responding to an article criticizing programming in libraries, was able to refute most practical arguments on the grounds that programming was simply not a priority.

Uses of Programming

Five uses of programming were determined from the literature: stimulation, enrichment, extension, service, and advocacy.

Stimulation

Stimulation refers to the use of programming to encourage the public to make better and more efficient use of the library or museum. The best example is the use of group tours. According to Wholer (1976), tours have two purposes: to prepare visitors to receive maximum benefit from a museum visit to establish some rapport with museum personnel. Tours in museums are used to explain exhibits to the visitor. In libraries tours are used to show patrons how to use the library. Few descriptions of tours were found in the literature, possibly because tours are a routine part of operations and do not generate much interest in the literature.

Enrichment

Enrichment refers to the addition of extra information, through programming, to complement or supplement an exhibit or collection. Wholer (1976, p. 39), talking about what he calls a "museum lesson", referred to the enrichment purpose this way: "to study an aspect in greater detail than the exhibit alone permits." Typical enrichment activities include lectures, workshops, film events, panel discussions, and popular theatre.

The literature contained numerous examples of the enrichment use. In libraries, examples included the American Heritage series, Great Books Programs, and People's Institutes in American libraries, three programs

where people could come together to exchange ideas based on a common background of reading (Phinney, 1956). In museums, an example was when Hamp (1984) described museum classes in the Henry Ford museum on the topic of modernization, one of Henry Ford's main interests.

Even though programming for enrichment appeared to be commonly practiced, it was, nonetheless, controversial. Some (Raymond, 1978; Washburn, 1964) felt it diluted the collection or research functions of the library or museum. They also felt that programming was not a proper function of libraries and museums because programming properly belonged to other community adult education agencies. Others (Adam, 1939; Bob, 1982, and Zetterberg, 1969) felt that programming was both a desirable and necessary part of library and museum activity.

Extension

Extension refers to the use of programming as an external link between the organization and the community. Content for programs was drawn from the community rather than from the collections as in the use of programming for enrichment. Programming for extension was done to strengthen community relations, and to extend the organization's contacts beyond those whose use of the library or museum was self motivated.

There were three ways programming was used for extension. First were programs that reflected a topic of local interest. Examples of topical programs included the Enoch Pratt Free Library War Activities program during the second world war in which weekly talks and film forums on timely topics were held (Monroe, 1963). Second were programs cosponsored with a community group. Examples included programs

cosponsored by the local United Nations Association and the Mount Vernon Public Library (Phinney, 1956), and the cooperative program cosponsored by the New York Public Library and the Atomic Energy Institute in 1947 on the subject of the peaceful uses of atomic energy (Monroe, 1963). A third type of extension programming was services for community organizations in which library or museum staff acted as a resource in the educational work of community organizations. In libraries, Phinney (1956) described the library's role in providing resource people or planning expertise in the educational work of the League of Women Voters and community church groups at the La Crosse Public Library in Wisconsin. In museums, Bestau (1969) suggested some ways that museums and community adult education agencies could cooperate. According to Bestau (1969, p. 315), "all adult education bodies, like museums, have high aims and totally inadequate resources." Using museum staff as resource people, initiating extra-mural courses in cooperation with adult education agencies, and providing practical classes in a museum interest area were some of the ways that Bestau suggested.

There was much discussion in the library literature about the value of developing good community relations through programming. Stevenson (1960, p. 312) wrote, "To fulfill this role [as community resource] competently, the library must take an active part in community life." Birge (1981) stressed the importance of the library having a thorough knowledge of the community it served. Yet the literature often lamented that the library did not take full advantage of its position as an educational resource for the community. Some of the reasons suggested

were: lack of coherent development of specific long and short-term educational objectives, reliance on more passive forms of service rather than accepting responsibility for a dynamic program (Birge, 1981; Monroe, 1974), or lack of required skills necessary to undertake service (Birge, 1981).

Service

A fourth purpose, service, refers to programming done to fill a social need in the community. The library or museum initiated programs to fulfill a sense of social responsibility (Monroe, 1974), to bring the resources of the library or museum to bear on a social problem, and to provide a different way for the librarian to promote the use of library materials (Coleman, 1986). "Service" is similar to "extension" in that both uses for programming respond to the community. However, "service" refers specifically to library or museum initiated programming designed to fill a social need.

Warnke (1968) described some of the ways that libraries could program to fill social needs. She suggested five kinds of programs: 1) programs that responded to general community information needs such as family finances, 2) cooperative programs that related to work carried out by other community agencies such as programs on aging, 3) programs of local geographic interest such as building a new park, 4) programs related to current pressing community needs such as programs for school dropouts and 5) programs for disadvantaged adults which address social needs such as poverty, literacy or services for the disabled. This programming continues to be valid and offered.

The need for libraries and museums to take the initiative in providing programs to serve the community was strongly expressed in the library and museum literature of the 1930's and 1960's. Notable was the literacy work initiated by the public libraries in Canada and the United States the 1960's (Lyman, 1979; Library Trends, Fall, 1986; and the Canadian Library Journal, 1980). For example, the Britannia Library in the east end of Vancouver was the first library based learning centre in British Columbia to offer instruction in adult basic education and English as a Second Language. Halifax, too, offered literacy classes in the library. In cosponsored programs with the continuing education department of the Halifax School Board, women from public housing in Halifax worked with tutors to design programs suited to their particular learning needs.

It was difficult to tell from the literature, without a specific search, how much of this type of programming actually existed. As Phinney (1963, p. 108) said "reporting is likely to center on activities that stand out because they are new undertakings and require special efforts." Literacy programs being quite innovative in the 1960's would naturally attract reporting. Warnke (1986) acknowledged that "service" as a use for programming was rare in libraries. Nonetheless, library initiation of service programs was an issue in the literature. As Stevenson (1960, p. 341) said, "It is not enough for the library to be a child of its time. It must be a maker of its time as well."

Advocacy

Advocacy refers to the political use of programming to raise social consciousness and/or to affect social change. Advocacy is included as a use for programming not so much because examples of such programs could be found, but because it represented a strong vein in the literature in the activist 1930's and 1960's. In literature produced by the American Association for Adult Education in the 1930's (Adam, 1939; Johnson, 1938), adult education was seen as "something more than an intellectual opiate for the masses. It represent(ed) a definite method of social control, an essential framework for political democracy" (Adam, 1939, p. 79). Certain books, for example, contained politically powerful ideas and could be used as a basis for programs designed to promote social change. Museum artifacts, too, were objects of culture and could be used as the basis for understanding and promoting political action. In the 1960's, the best example was Chadwick (1980) who saw museums as a resource for community education. According to Chadwick, community education, through museums, consisted of arousing civic consciousness, identifying needs, and planning for participation. Advocacy as a use for programming was highly controversial. It appeared to be more of an ideal than a reality. No examples were found in the literature searched.

Evaluation of the Literature

Even though the adult education literature acknowledged that adult education in community organizations is a large area of the field of operations, little was written about it in the adult education literature. Accordingly, material for this study was drawn from library and museum

literature. It is a weakness of this study that so little current literature, particularly in libraries, was found. Also, few Canadian sources were found on the topic.

Some authors whose work was pertinent to this research were found. Most valuable was Margaret Monroe (1963, 1974, 1979). Her (1963) case studies of the meaning of adult education in libraries contributed to the sections on the definitions of adult education. Her articles contributed to the section on the uses of adult education. Also interesting and useful in the library literature were the works of Smith (1954), Stone (1953), Lyman (1968) Stevenson (1960, 1979), and Phinney (1956, 1978). The most useful author in the museum literature was Wholer (1976) who wrote about the potential for education in history museums in Canada. An interesting vein of literature was the American Association of Adult Education's commissioned work on adult education in libraries and museums written in the 1930's (Adam, 1939; Johnson, 1938). The strong social viewpoint contributed to the section on advocacy as a use for adult education.

The adult education literature was notable for its lack of attention to this area. Possibly it has not been given much attention in adult education because adult education in these settings is practiced by people such as librarians who are trained in something other than adult education. Their work was usually reported in their own literature, not in the adult education literature. The most notable author in the adult education literature was Schroeder (1970, 1980). His typologies increased understanding of the function of adult education in community

organizations, but he did not provide much detail.

The biggest weakness in all the literature reviewed, was the lack of clarity of the meaning of adult education and its application in library and museum settings. The problem of finding the meaning of adult education will be extended from the literature review into the field research portion of this study.

CHAPTER 3

METHODOLOGY

The field research portion of this study was a comparative analysis of six Type III organizations, three libraries and three museums. Case study methodology furnished data collection procedures and the techniques for data analysis. This study, while it resembled a case study in some respects, differed from true case study in its analysis of data. Rather than analyzing each case separately (a vertical analysis) data was pooled across cases (a horizontal analysis) (Yin, 1985).

The purpose of this chapter is to describe the methodology used in this study. The first section contains a description of data collection procedures including the data sources used and the instruments for data collection. The second section contains procedures for analysis of data. The third section contains the procedure for the pilot study and the last contains a description of the three libraries and three museums chosen for study.

Data Collection

The following section includes a description of data sources and data collection instruments used in this study. Reference to a principle known as "using multiple sources of evidence" is also discussed.

Using Multiple Sources of Evidence

"Multiple sources of evidence", or "triangulation" as it is sometimes called, refers to the use of more than one data source for a single piece of evidence. Using multiple sources of evidence is a way to correct for

possible misrepresentation or bias. In this study, where possible, one data source was used to check information from another source, as in checking information from interviews with information from documents.

Data Sources

Two sources for data, document analysis and interviews, were used in this study. According to Yin (1985) six data sources were possible: document analysis, interviews, archival records, artifacts, direct observation, and participant observation. The last four were considered inappropriate for this research for the following reasons. Archival records and study of artifacts would not likely yield current data about the uses of adult education; participant observation and direct observation would have yielded irrelevant data. The two chosen were felt to provide enough relevant data and still keep the study from becoming unwieldy.

Document analysis. This term refers to the systematic examination of printed evidence from or about the organizations studied. Printed evidence that might have been examined were annual reports, publicity brochures, minutes of program planning meetings, and records such as organization charts and budgets. While all these documents could be used in this research, annual reports and publicity brochures were the most useful. Annual reports contained an overview of all the activities in the organization and publicity brochures contained descriptions of programs. Both the annual reports and the brochures contained descriptions of programming activities and clues about the uses of programming. Further, the annual reports contained some general information about the functions of the organization and furnished the researcher with some clues as to

the relative importance of programming compared with other functions.

Interviews. This term refers to conversations between relevant people in the organization and the researcher. The person responsible for programming in each organization studied was selected as the interviewee. Not only did the programmer most closely resemble a professional adult educator, their position in the organization gave them the background to be able to answer the questions.

Details of Sources

The following section contains a detailed description of where information was contained in the data sources.

Definition of adult education. There were three sources of information for this question: Section I of the interview schedule, preambles to descriptions of adult education activities in annual reports and brochures, and any written policies concerning adult education. Whenever possible, all three sources were used.

Importance of programming. The interviews, supplemented by information from annual reports, supplied the data for this question. Section II of the interview schedule contained questions which asked the person responsible for programming to both list and rank the functions of the organization and to identify those factors which most influenced the importance of adult education in their organization.

Uses of programming. Information for this question was found mainly in the annual reports and publicity brochures and was augmented with information from Section III of the interview schedule. The interviewee was asked to describe some notable programs and to explain

the organization's rationale for offering each program mentioned.

Data Collection Instruments

Two instruments for collecting data were developed, "table shells" for document analysis and an interview schedule.

Table Shells

"Table shells", a term coined by Yin (1985, p. 64), refers to outlines, in chart form, that indicate categories of information to be collected. Table shells, one per organization, were applied to the third research question, the uses of adult education. Categories of information recorded were year of program, title of program, brief description of program if one could be found, and a notation of any activities in the library or museum held in conjunction with the program. For example, programs in museums were often held in conjunction with a temporary exhibit. Appendix 1 contains an example of the table shells.

Interview Schedule

The other instrument used was an interview schedule, a form that contained a predetermined set of questions to be used in the interviews together with room to record the responses. It was used as a way to gather information the documents could not yield and as a way to corroborate data collected by document analysis.

The interview schedule contained three sections, each one pertaining to one of the three research questions. The first section contained questions about the description and definition of adult education. Three questions were asked in the first section: a description of adult education activities, a description of any written policies about adult education the

organization may have had, and the interviewee's own definition of adult education. The second section contained questions about the importance of programming relative to other functions of the organization. The word "programming" was used instead of "adult education" because it had a more exact meaning to those interviewed. The person responsible for programming was asked to identify the most important functions of the organization and to rank them in order of importance. Next they were asked to identify those factors that influenced the importance of programming and to rank them in order of importance. The third section contained questions about the uses of programming. As time permitted, respondents were asked to describe some programs and to offer the organization's rationale for each program. At the end, respondents were invited to add anything to the interview that they wanted. Appendix 2 contains a sample of the interview schedule.

Analysis of Data

Data analysis was conducted on three levels: within case analysis, within category analysis, and across category analysis.

Within case analysis

Definition of adult education. First, each organization's adult education activities were listed. Next, descriptions of any policies pertaining to adult education in the organization were listed. The third question, the one that asked respondents to define the term "adult education" was treated differently. First, the various notions respondents used to describe adult education were listed. If they were able to give a definition of adult education, it was reported. If not, one was built according to

Gagne's (1977) analysis of a definition. Then definitions were analyzed to see how many of the components mentioned in literature review were contained in the definitions: agent/learner relationship, objectives, systematic, adult, purpose and orientation.

Importance of programming. Two lists for each case were made, one showing the functions of the organization in order of priority, and one showing the factors that influence the importance of adult education in the organization, also in order of priority. Any discrepancies between data gathered in the interviews and that gathered in the document analysis were noted.

Uses of programming. Using information from the table shells, programs were grouped by categories of activities suggested by the organization in order to determine the number and types of programs. For example, those programs that are used to support an exhibit in a museum or support a theme in the library were grouped together. Following the grouping by type of activity, programs were grouped by the purpose suggested by the literature review. A brief review of the purposes follows:

- Stimulation. The use of programming to encourage the public to better and more efficient use of the library or museum.
- Enrichment. The use of programming to add information beyond that contained in an exhibit or display.
- Extension. The use of programming to enlarge community contacts through programs that reflect a local interest, cooperative programming or programming with another community organization.

- Service. The use of programming to fill a social need in the community.
- Advocacy. The political use of programming to raise social consciousness and/or to produce social change.

Where possible, the number of programs used for each purpose was mentioned.

After all six cases were analyzed in this fashion the first level of analysis was complete. At this point data were organized the same way across all six cases making it possible to move to the next level of analysis, within category comparisons.

Within Category Comparisons

The next stage was to compare data from one case with that of another in the same category. In other words, libraries were compared with other libraries and museums with other museums. Data from the first level of analysis were used as the basis for the second level of analysis.

For the definition of adult education, the activities, policies, and components of the definitions were compared with each other. Any patterns that emerged were noted. For the importance of programming the lists of functions and the list of factors influencing the importance of programming reported in the first level of analysis were used to compare one organization with another. The lists were inspected for similarities, differences, and patterns. A similar procedure was followed for the uses of adult education. Types of activities and purposes for those activities were compared. Following within category comparisons, data from libraries

and museums respectively were consolidated, making the third level of analysis possible.

Across Category Comparisons

Analysis from within category comparisons was used as the basis for across category comparison. Across category comparisons were done the same way as within category comparisons except units of analysis were the results from the previous analyses.

Pilot Testing

Ene Haabnit, Manager of the Whalley Branch of the Surrey Public Library agreed to allow the research to be pilot tested in the library she managed. Permission was sought and granted to conduct the interview and to review annual reports and publicity brochures from the last three years. Once the relevant documents had been assembled, the table shells were tested to see if they were accurate and easy to administer. When that was complete, the interview was conducted. The interview was tested to see if it elicited the type of data that addressed the research questions and if it could be adequately conducted in an hour. The instruments proved both to furnish the type of data sought and to be easy to administer. It took approximately two hours to fill in the table shells and one hour to do the interview. When data were collected, they were analyzed to test the within case analysis. Data analysis procedures developed proved workable.

Agencies for Study

Three libraries and three museums were chosen for this study.

Three of each was felt to be a sufficient number of organizations to give breadth in perspective while still allowing for some depth. The Vancouver Lower Mainland area contained a number of libraries and museums, not all of which were suitable for study. Many libraries did not offer programming and many museums were too small to have enough programming activity to make them worthy of study. Some which might have been suitable did not keep adequate records for this research. And some had had some political trouble causing their programming activity to be inconsistent. In the end, the six criteria for selecting organizations were practical ones. The criteria were:

- The library or museum had to have enough programming activity to make it worthy of study, ie. it should have offered programs on a minimum monthly basis.
- One of each type of museum -- art, history and science -had to be represented.
- It must have had three recent, consecutive years of programming.
- It must have had accessible data for the period studied.
- It must have agreed to participate, and
- It must have been in the Vancouver lower mainland.

The six organizations described below met these criteria.

Museum of Anthropology. The Museum of Anthropology was chosen as a representative of a science museum. This museum had a research focus, one the other two museums in this study did not have.

It had a public programming department, staffed by a half-time person, although it was advertising for a full-time person at the time of the interview. The museum conducted a number of different types of adult education activities in the period studied, had both brochures and annual reports available, and expressed interest in participating in the study.

Surrey Art Gallery. The Surrey Art Gallery was chosen as a representative of an art museum. The gallery had a full-time Education and Events Coordinator and much adult education activity. Comprehensive records of activities were available through their annual grant applications. It also expressed interest in the study.

Vancouver Museum. The Vancouver Museum was chosen as an example of a history museum. The museum had a long history of public programming. The adult programming was conducted by a full-time public programmer who expressed much interest in the study. Comprehensive records were available through both annual reports and brochures.

Selection of the libraries to be studied proved to be more challenging than the museums. Fewer libraries than museums conducted programs. What might have been a logical library to study in Vancouver, the Vancouver Public Library system, did not conduct enough programming activity to make any of the libraries worthy of study. Consequently, all libraries chosen were in the outlying districts of Vancouver.

For two reasons, the library chosen as the site for pilot testing was used as the third library in this study. First, the data collection instruments proved both accurate enough and practical enough in the first

instance that they did not require any changes. Second, the pilot study yielded some insights into the three research questions that would prove valuable for the study. Consequently, permission was sought and granted to use the data for the study.

The three libraries chosen were:

New Westminster Public Library. The New Westminster Public Library conducted an average of two to four programs per month. Programming was carried out by a librarian called a "community services librarian" who divided her time between programming and other library work. Annual reports and brochures were available. The period 1985-1987 was chosen for this organization since most activity had occurred since 1985, and information was available to the end of 1987. The librarian, Debra Nelson, agreed to participate in the study.

North Vancouver District Library. The North Vancouver District Library offered an average of two programs per month in the period 1984-1986. Data were available for that period, although it was not as organized as it might have been for purposes of the study. None of the posters used to advertise programs were dated. Two of the annual reports carried fairly complete descriptions of programming activities; one was too concise to carry enough information.

Whalley Branch, Surrey Public Library. The Surrey Public Library offered programs on a regular basis through all the branches in its system, the Whalley Branch being one. Information available to the researcher included publicity materials, annual reports and all correspondence pertaining to the programs during the period, 1985-1987.

The librarian interviewed at the Whalley Branch had expressed an interest in the community practice of adult education and was very interested in participating in the study.

Procedures for Gaining Access to Organizations

Once the organizations had been chosen for study, permission was sought to do the research. First, prospective organizations were contacted by letter. The study was briefly described and the organization asked if it would be interested in participating. If the organization indicated an interest, another letter was sent. The second letter contained a more detailed description of the study, what was required of the organization in terms of data sought and time required, plus a reassurance that confidential information would be reported so its source could not be recognized. A consent form plus a copy of the questions that would be asked in the interview were also sent. Appendix 3 contains an example of the consent form; Appendix 4 contains a sample of the letter sent to each organization. Following that, a telephone call was made to set up a time to do the research and to clarify any points that might not have been clear. Permission was sought at this time to tape record the interviews.

In this chapter the procedures for gathering and analyzing data have been described. The study resembled a case study, but because of its method of analysis did not conform to a true case study design. Data were collected from documents and interviews. Two instruments, "table shells" for document analysis and an interview schedule, were developed and pilot tested in the field. After all data were collected, they

were analyzed first by single case, then by category, and then across category. Research was conducted in three libraries and three museums in the Vancouver Lower Mainland.

CHAPTER 4

FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS

The purpose of this chapter is to present the findings from the three museums and three libraries studied. Reporting of the findings follows a similar format for each organization. First, the organization's description and definition of adult education is given. Some organizations gave their own definition of adult education. In cases where they did not, one was constructed from the notions of adult education they suggested. Definitions constructed by the researcher are noted in the text. Then each definition was analyzed. Second, the importance of programming relative to other functions of the organization is discussed. Included in this section is a list, in order of priority, of the factors respondents perceived that influenced the importance of adult education. Third is a description of the programs offered in each organization and an analysis of the uses of the programs. The last part of the chapter contains the within category comparisons and across category comparisons.

Museums: Museum of Anthropology

The Museum of Anthropology, a teaching, research, and exhibit centre for Northwest Coast Indian art and other collections, is located in a magnificent building on the western edge of the U.B.C. campus. The adult education officer, Ms. Margaret Holm, Coordinator of Public Programming, and a graduate student in Anthropology, held the position half-time. Ms. Holm was going to be replaced by a full-time public programmer.

There were four kinds of adult education activities in the Museum of Anthropology. The first kind was formalized courses often co-sponsored with the U.B.C. Centre for Continuing Education. A second kind was more informal "out of the classroom" kinds of courses such as raft trips down the Fraser River or Sunday afternoon programs for families. A third kind was activities for museum volunteers. A fourth kind, regular and special tours, were conducted by trained museum volunteers and graduate students. There was no formal policy statement for the programming function in the Museum of Anthropology. The absence of one was seen as either an omission on the part of the administration or as a reflection of the fact that the person who had held the job previously simply did not put things in writing.

Definition of Adult Education

The Museum of Anthropology's definition included the following: learning about museums in the broad sense and Northwest Coast Indians in particular, and sensitizing the public to heritage conservation. As well, adult education was seen as a way to broaden the appeal of the museum and to increase its contact in the community. The following definition was provided by the interviewee:

any enrichment that increases people's understanding of museums and how they work.

This definition can be analyzed as follows. The agent/learner relationship, any idea of using objectives or imparting systematic instruction were absent from the definition. Also absent was mention of the notion "adult." The purpose for adult education was mentioned by the phrase

"increases people's understanding of museums and how they work." Any specific orientation was also absent.

Importance of Adult Education

Functions of the the Museum. Four main functions of the museum were described in the annual reports. First, the museum was described as an academic unit, maintaining programs of teaching, research, and experimentation. Second, it was described as an anthropological institution with a commitment to learning the point of view of others and to respecting cultural differences. Third, the museum was dedicated to maintaining high museological standards to qualify as a first rank museum, and fourth, it was a public service institution seeking to attract the public and share scholarly knowledge. The museum saw itself as an integrated, overlapping system, as a pyramid with four sides, the pinnacle at the top dedicated to achieving excellence (Museum of Anthropology, Annual Report, 1985/86, p. 1). In the interview six functions of the museum in the following order of priority were mentioned: exhibits, care of collections, academic teaching, outreach and public programming and professional association with other museums.

In both the annual reports and the interview, public programming was given low priority. The following reasons were suggested in the interview. Collection and exhibition were the most important functions because they are the core of all museums. Second, because the museum was part of the university, academic teaching and research was the next priority. The director of the museum and most of the staff were oriented toward research and teaching; most saw a minor role for public aspects of

the museum. Third, educational activities were not part of the original plan for the museum; consequently no workshop or classroom space had been allocated in the design.

Factors which influenced the position of programming. Four factors were given in the interview that accounted for the low priority. First, public education had not been the historical role of museums, making it traditionally a low priority in museums in general. Second, the orientation of the professional staff was a research and academic teaching orientation, rather than public education. The museum director tended to reinforce his own academic orientation by choosing anthropologists or art historians as museum educators rather than professionally trained educators. Third, lack of adequate classroom or workshop space restricted programming activity. Fourth, there were no financial incentives for public programming. Any monies generated from programs went to the university rather than back to the programming budget.

Uses of Programming

Adult education activities for the years 1984/1985 to 1986/1987 were reviewed.

1984/1985. In 1984/1985, five kinds of adult education activities were offered: public programs, adult guided tours, monthly identification clinics, behind-the-scenes tours of the conservation lab, the Correction Services Outreach program. Altogether 26 public programs, day and evening, were offered, regular and special guided tours, 36 tours of the then new conservation lab, 11 monthly identification clinics, six cultural excursions and the Correction Services Outreach program which included

films and video, performances and theatre arts, and carving and engraving classes for native prison inmates.

The following uses for programs were found in 1984/85.

- Stimulation. The weekly guided tours by museum volunteers and the special tours for visiting groups conducted by senior students were done to introduce visitors to the exhibits. Two programs that year were designed to teach the public about museums and how they operate: the "Curator-Conservator" series and the "Behind-the-Scenes" tours of the Conservation Lab.
- Enrichment. Of the public programs offered, two related to current, temporary exhibits: "Cedar: Tree of Life", and "Changing Tides Exhibition Series." Six programs related to the museum's permanent collection of Northwest Coast Indian artifacts including "Northwest Coast Indian Art Appreciation", "Blood from Stone: Making and Using Stone Tools" and "Edible Wild Plants." Nine programs related to broader anthropological themes of the museum such as "Food and Culture" including the food of Japan, India and Vancouver's Chinatown and "Mayan Treasurers of Belize." The six cultural excursions, also related to museum themes were conducted away from the museum. Included were three petroglyph tours, two architectural tours of Vancouver and a visit to Seattle. Further, the Sunday afternoon special events series were designed to present the themes of the museum in an innovative fashion. Snake in the Grass Theatre was an example of this type of programming.
- Extension. Six programs, although co-sponsored by the museum, did

not appear to be related to any themes in the museum. "London Through the Ages", "The World of St. Augustine" and "Architectural Drafting and Illustration" may have been designed to reflect current interests in the community, although it was not clear from the annual report. The Sunday afternoon special events series was designed not only as a way to enrich the exhibits but also as a way to attract visitors to the museum who otherwise might not come.

- Service. The Corrections Services Outreach program was designed and implemented to teach native inmates about Northwest Coast Indian culture and to teach them carving and engraving skills. The program was funded by Corrections Canada and conducted by a person hired by the Museum.
- Advocacy. No programs were found.

1985/1986. In 1985/1986, six types of adult education activities were offered including 16 public programs, regular and special guided tours, 11 behind the scenes tours, 11 monthly identification clinics, three cultural excursions and the Correction Services Outreach program. In 1985/1986, also, the full-time public programmer left and was replaced by a part-time person.

The following uses were noted for programs in 1985/86.

- Stimulation. As in the previous year, the regular and special guided tours plus the behind-the-scenes tours were held for this purpose.
- Enrichment. Of the 16 public education programs, one was related to an exhibition. The "Button Blanket Workshop" was offered in

conjunction with the temporary exhibition, "Robes of Power: Totem Poles on Cloth." Eight of the 16 programs related to the museum's permanent collection; examples were "Northwest Coast Indian Art Appreciation", "Basketry Workshop" and "Prehistoric Origins of Salish Art." Five related to broader anthropological themes of the museum such as "1793 in B.C. by Land and Sea", "Ancient Peru: Art and Architecture", and "Traditional Textiles" using examples from the museum's textile collection. In addition to the public programs inside the museum, three cultural excursions were held.

- Extension. One program offered both day and evening was related to Expo '86: "Prologue to the World of Ramses II." The Sunday afternoon special events series was also designed to attract the public to the museum.
- Service. The Corrections Services Outreach program as above.
- Advocacy. No programs were found.

1986/1987. In 1986/1987 the same five types of activities were offered: 19 public programs, of which 11 were co-sponsored with the Centre for Continuing Education and eight by the museum, 11 monthly identification clinics as in the previous two years, regular and special tours, four cultural excursions and the Corrections Services Outreach program.

The following uses were noted for programs in 1986/87.

- Stimulation. The tours as above, plus one program cosponsored by the Centre for Continuing Education, "How to Visit a Museum."
- Enrichment. Sixteen of the 19 programs offered related to the

themes of the museum. None were found that related directly to a temporary exhibit. Of the 16 programs, four were on the Northwest Coast Indian theme and 12 dealt broadly with anthropology. Included were "Mykanos: Tourist Mecca of the Aegean", "Temple Builders of Ancient Java" and "Kushan Sculpture: Images from Early India." Further, the cultural excursions, one to the Alberta Badlands cosponsored by the Centre for Continuing, took the museum themes outside the museum. The museum also sponsored four special events to their work: a robing ceremony, lecture by Thor Heyerdahl, a storytelling event, and a lecture by Jean Auel.

- Extension. No programs were found for this purpose; the museum preferred events like concerts in the Great Hall to attract the public to the museum.
- Service. The Corrections Services Outreach program expanded in 1986/87 to include 89 sessions.
- Advocacy. One program was found that addressed political issues, "Our Home and Native Land", a program about contemporary Native issues: land claims, cultural rights and issues in native education.

Stimulation and enrichment were the most common uses for adult education in the Museum of Anthropology. Some activities such as the Sunday afternoon special events series were designed to attract visitors to the museum. One, the Corrections Services Outreach program was conducted as a social service, and one in the three year period, "Our Home and Native Land", was used for advocacy.

Museums: Surrey Art Gallery

The Surrey Art Gallery, part of the Surrey Arts Centre complex, is located in the spread-out community of Surrey. It is difficult to reach for many because there are no bus routes close by and it could take up to an hour to drive to it from some parts of Surrey. Partly because of its location, the gallery relied on programming to attract visitors and strengthen its ties to the community. The gallery had a mandate to develop the local art community. It mounted at least twelve exhibitions a year featuring local artists as well as some historical and contemporary art. The education program is administered by a full-time Education and Events Coordinator, Ms. Ingrid Kolt. She has a degree in Fine Arts, teacher training and experience in working with people with learning disabilities.

The Surrey Art Gallery had three kinds of adult education activities. The first kind was the formal training program for docents. The program consisted two sessions a year, one in the fall on art history and one in the spring on how to conduct tours. In addition, there were bi-monthly meetings that also included training sessions. The second kind represented the bulk of the education program at the Surrey Art Gallery. These were informal programs for the public designed to enrich the exhibitions and teach the public about art. For example, the gallery held a public event once a month called "Dialogue with . . ." which featured the artist(s) on display and/or the curator. Workshops, demonstrations, film series, and concerts also formed part of the second kind of activity. The third kind, tours and information provided by gallery attendents, were

directed toward the casual visitor who wanted some information about the current exhibition.

There was no formal policy statement on adult education in the Surrey Art Gallery. Rather, the mandate to provide public education was woven into the general policy statement"

The Surrey Art Gallery is a public gallery specializing in exhibiting and promoting lesser known contemporary B.C. artists and in introducing and educating the public to the visual arts.

. . . In addition to the core exhibition program, the Gallery performs a unique role in art education through its school and public events programs, and tour guide training program.

(Parks and Recreation Commission, Policy Manual, p. 1)

Further, the Surrey Art Gallery Mission Statement proposed that "the Gallery will demonstrate excellence and innovation in art gallery education" (SAG Draft Mission Statement).

Definition of Adult Education

To the Surrey Art Gallery adult education was recognizing that adults had experience to bring to a situation, that adults made choices about what and where to learn, that learning about art was not a passive experience, and that the major way to learn about art was to learn to look at it. Further, concern was expressed that learning carried over from one exhibit to another. The goal of education in the Surrey Art Gallery was to encourage an informed and critical public. The following definition was constructed from the description above:

anything applied to a certain age range (out of university) that encourages learning to look at art in an informed and critical manner in such a way that learning can be carried over from exhibition to exhibition. [author's construction]

This definition can be analyzed as follows. The notion of systematic education was suggested by the phrase "so that learning can be carried over from exhibition to exhibition." That educational activity was directed toward adults was confirmed by the phrase "a certain age range out of university level" and the purpose for adult education suggested by the phrase "to encourage an informed and critical public." While the orientation was not mentioned in the definition, description of adult education activities showed that it was oriented to individuals through programming, groups through extension work and the community through activities to develop the local art community.

Importance of Programming

Functions of the museum. Exhibiting art, introducing and educating the public in the visual arts, and collecting and preserving art were seen to be the main functions of the Surrey Art Gallery. While the Education Coordinator felt that the functions could not be ranked, she felt that exhibitions were central to all else that happened in the gallery. Education in the Surrey Art Gallery, while not central to the gallery the way exhibits were, was as important as any other function.

Factors which influenced the importance of programming. Four factors have influenced the importance of adult education in the Surrey Art Gallery. First, the structure of the organization, designating a

full-time Education and Events Coordinator, showed that the organization considered the function important. Second, the supportive attitude of the director was important. The Surrey Art Gallery had an ambitious program for the size of its organization and the number of staff; a supportive attitude toward education permeated the whole organization. Third, the Gallery had established a successful programming record. The Education and Events Coordinator had been with the Gallery for ten years. Also, certain kinds of adult education programs such as gallery tours and docent training programs were historically acceptable forms of education in art galleries. That acceptance made other kinds of programming more acceptable.

Uses of Programming

Information about the uses of programming were drawn from the annual grant applications which also served as the gallery's annual report. Unfortunately, statistics given in the grant applications often did not discriminate between activities for children and those for adults. They also did not discriminate between special events and educational events, making precise identification of number and types of events difficult. Nonetheless, certain things became clear.

Informal programming for the public is reported in this section. Programs that remained consistent over the three year period are not included. Those programs are docent training and the the tour and workshop packages. The latter was four workshops conducted by an artist and art educator in communication with the docents: "Art Encounter", "World of Clay", "Inuit Arts", "Culture and Seeing Ourselves

through Art." It was not clear from the grant applications how often and to whom these programs were offered.

1984. There were three types of informal adult education activities: Sunday afternoon panel discussions with exhibiting artists; workshops, demonstrations and film series, and extension programs. In 1984, a total of 22 informal programs were reported. Nine programs were artists' panel discussions designed to introduce the current exhibition to the public. Three workshops and demonstrations were offered including a demonstration of the art of glass and fiberglass and a workshop on the use of pictorial space in drawing. Three film events, each with an introductory talk explaining the significance of the film were offered. One was offered in conjunction with the exhibition of Canadian painters of the 1930's and one with lecture, "From Scribbles to Circles", was held in conjunction with a children's art exhibit. Two summer film series, five concerts, each with an introductory talk relating the films to the exhibits were also held.

Three types of extension programs were conducted: groups who received a lecture or other service from the gallery, cooperative programs with community groups, and programs for special age groups. Groups receiving a service from the gallery included the Canadian and United States Society for Education Through Art, the Surrey Volunteer Bureau and parent-teacher associations. Programs for special groups included seniors, sorrowities, and pre-school teachers.

As well as the informal programs described above, tours were regularly offered on Sundays by gallery trained docents, and information

about the exhibits provided by gallery attendents.

The following uses for programming were noted in 1984.

- Stimulation. Regular tours by docents who were trained to guide the viewer to look carefully and ask critical questions about the exhibits, and information for the casual visitor by gallery attendents.
- Enrichment. Most of the informal adult education activities undertaken by the gallery were undertaken for this purpose. Of the 20 programs reported in the grant application, 12 were designed to enrich the current exhibit, four were designed for adults in conjunction with works in the children's gallery, two were film events, and two were concerts.
- Extension. Activities included services provided for community groups, cooperative programs, and programs for special groups as described above. Groups served included seniors groups, sororities and women's groups, docents and volunteers from other galleries, pre-school teachers, parent teacher groups as well as talks at meetings and conferences. There appeared to be much of this kind of activity, but exact figures about how much were not available.
- Service. No programs were found.
- Advocacy. No programs were found.

1985. The same three kinds of adult education activities were conducted in 1985 as in 1984: the docent training program, informal education programs, and tours and information. Nineteen informal programs were counted for 1985.

The following uses for programs were found:

- Stimulation. The tours and information provided by gallery attendants as in the previous year.
- Enrichment. Of the nineteen informal programs reported in the grant application, seven artists' panel discussions and five workshops or demonstrations were associated with the exhibits. For example, a family oriented workshop on clay sculpture was held in conjunction with the Sally Michiner exhibit and a photography workshop was held in conjunction with the photography exhibit, "Urban Edges." Three film events were held in conjunction with the exhibits: one, the "New Spirit of Painting: Six Painters of 1980", was held in conjunction with an exhibit of local painters of the 1980's, a children's film, "The Brother's Grimm" was held in conjunction with an exhibit of German native painting and another with the opening of exhibit. Some exhibits had concerts associated with them, eg. the "David Sloan" exhibit. In addition to the programs that accompanied exhibits, a summer film series, "Films About Issues", with an accompanying talk and handout was held. A program, "Artists on Site", featured six artists involved in six projects for Surrey at the sites where they were producing their works, followed by an artists' panel discussion.
- Extension. The same three types of extension activities were held as in the previous year. A cooperative program was held with the B.C. Museum of Transportation and Industry. Most extension activities concentrated on lectures about children's art. Adult

programs included an instructional session for preschool teachers and talks to the Parent-Teacher Associations on children's arts.

Programs were also done for special groups such as women and seniors.

- Service. No programs were found.
- Advocacy. No programs were found.

1986. In 1986, the same kinds of programs were carried over from 1985. Nineteen informal programs were counted in 1986, consisting of artists' panel discussions, films, concerts and workshops. The following uses were noted for programs in 1986:

- Stimulation. The tours and information as in 1984 and 1985.
- Enrichment. Included in the nineteen programs were seven artists' panel discussions and two films held in conjunction with exhibits, one being a film series, "Art About Issues" held in conjunction with an exhibit of the same name. Three concerts were also held. One program, "Artists on Site" featured six artists involved in six projects for Surrey at the sites for the pieces, held in conjunction with the exhibit, Six Projects for Surrey.
- Extension. The Surrey Art Gallery's work with community groups continued as in previous years. Included in 1986 activities were planning, and organizing art education sessions for the Canadian and American Society for Education through Art and the Surrey Volunteer Bureau. Activities for special interest groups continued as before.
- Service. No programs were found.

- Advocacy. No programs were found.

Most informal programming was conducted to enrich the current exhibitions at the Surrey Art Gallery. In addition to this kind of programming, the Gallery also conducted numerous extension programs with or for community groups.

Museums: Vancouver Museum

The Vancouver Museum's mandate is to inform the public about Vancouver's history through its permanent exhibitions and to mount five or six temporary exhibits per year. The Vancouver Museum had a full-time public programmer, Ms. Georgina Hansen, trained in communication, but with 15 years experience in museum work. The public programmer was responsible for non-formal education programs for adults and special events for the public.

The museum conducted four kinds of non-formal programming. First were programs that related to the permanent or temporary exhibits in the museum. Their purpose was to provide a meaningful experience to museum visitors and to increase access to the museum. Second, the museum sponsored a number special events related to the historical themes of the museum used mainly for fund-raising purposes. These activities, although run by the public programs office did not fit the description of adult education used in this paper and will not be considered. Third, programs were held whose themes did not relate to the museum but responded to a community interest. These programs, however, were de-emphasized in favour of ones that featured the museum. Fourth, the museum co-sponsored programs with community groups with

an interest in Vancouver heritage or the museum exhibits. These programs were mentioned in the interview but not in the annual reports or publicity brochures.

No formal policy statement existed in the museum for programming. Any written materials that described the functions of the public programs office had been written by the public programs office itself.

Definition of Adult Education

The Vancouver Museum described adult education as an experience, through museum artifacts, of what was usually only available in history books. Public programming was seen as the most public face of the institution, having to maintain high standards while responding to community needs and interests. Programs were also seen as a way to break down the traditional upper middle class appeal of museums.

The following definition was constructed:

. . . a way of interpreting museum artifacts that makes the museum accessible to everyone. [author's construction]

This definition did not contain any of the process components suggested by Verner's definition, but rather suggested the purposes for adult education, ie. to interpret museum artifacts to make the museum accessible to everyone.

Importance of Programming

Functions of the museum. The annual reports listed the functions of the Vancouver Museum as collections, exhibitions, collections management, care and research, programs and extension activities (children

and adults), museological services, and special projects. In the interview the functions were described in order of priority as collection, documentation, preservation, and interpretation of the history of Vancouver and its people. The museum's collections were central to all other museum activities. In the document distributed to docents when they entered their training program it stated:

No matter how dedicated to social or educational purposes, a museum's first obligation [was] to preserve its collection, and to make that collection available for study or education. (1986, Draft document for recruiting museum docents)

In both the annual reports and the interview, education (called interpretation) was considered lower in priority than the curatorial functions of collection, documentation, and exhibition. The public programmer, however, thought the priorities should be different. She thought that education should have come next after collection and documentation. She saw programs as integral to the museum exhibits making them more interesting, accessible and vital to the visitor. Planning for education should have begun as soon as the idea of what the exhibit was about had been identified to allow appropriate space within the exhibit to hold programs; however, programming in the museum was often an afterthought.

Factors which influenced the importance of programming. Three negative and one positive factor were indentified. Negative factors were first, lack of support for public programming by the museum administration, evidenced by the division of the core budget. Not enough

financial support was given, making it necessary for programs to generate revenue. An inequality in pay between the curatorial staff and the interpretive staff was also noted, a factor which perpetuated the inequality of the two functions. According to the public programmer, the functions would never be considered equal in status unless the pay scales became balanced. Second, in the coming reorganization of the museum, space previously available for programming was to become less available, making it difficult to find adequate space to conduct programs. When the Vancouver Museum operated under the umbrella of the Vancouver Museums and Planetarium Association, space in the whole complex was available for programming. With the three organizations, the Vancouver Museum, The Planetarium, and the Maritime Museum each becoming autonomous, space was allocated to each. Third, competition in the community was dividing the audience making it harder to attract people to the museum. For example, the museum used to hold the only Dominion Day celebration in Vancouver, but now found itself competing for the same audience with other community groups holding a similar event.

On the positive side, the historical success of the public programs office was noted, evidenced by the response from the community and from funding agencies. Despite the historical success of the public programming function in the eyes of the community, the coordinator felt it necessary to keep reminding the museum administration about the good work of her office.

Uses of Programming

The three kinds of adult education activities mentioned in the interview -- those held in conjunction with exhibits, those which responded to a community interest, and those co-sponsored with community organizations -- were noted in the annual reports and publicity brochures.

1984. In 1984, the museum hosted five temporary exhibits. Six programs were related directly to the temporary exhibits and seven programs were related to the permanent exhibits. Programs held in conjunction with temporary exhibits included a four part series of programs plus docent led gallery tours in conjunction with the exhibition, "Celebrating Silver", a program, "The History of Fashionable Dress: 1750 - 1950", in conjunction with the exhibit, "In Gear: Cars and Clothes, 1905 - 1985", and the program, "The Compleat Collector" held in conjunction with the exhibit, "The Museum Collects". The program, "The Eleventh Hour: Saving Vancouver's Heritage" related to the museum's historical purpose as did the popular "Heritage Walking Tours" and supporting programs about Vancouver architecture. One program, "Writing Cookbooks for Profit", did not relate to the museum themes but appeared to relate to a current community interest. Any cosponsored programs there might have been were not mentioned in the documents reviewed. Although the museum regularly conducted a docent training program, it also was not mentioned in any of the documents reviewed.

The following purposes were noted for programs in 1984.

- Stimulation. The only tours mentioned were those in conjunction with the "Celebrating Silver" exhibit.

- Enrichment. Of the 12 programs noted in 1984, 11 programs plus the "Heritage Walking Tours" were held in conjunction with the temporary or permanent exhibits.
- Extension. Only one program, "Writing Cookbooks for Profit", was found that did not relate to the themes of the museum. That program was designed to reflect a current interest in the community. Co-sponsored programs were also a way that the museum could extend its community relations. However, none were reported in the documents reviewed, so the number and type held cannot be estimated. Special events sponsored by the public programs office, but not included in this paper, were often held for extension purposes.
- Service. No programs were found.
- Advocacy. One program whose purpose it was to influence public opinion was found. "The Eleventh Hour: Saving Vancouver's Heritage" addressed the perceived need to conserve older buildings of historic value in Vancouver.

1985. In 1985, the museum mounted five temporary exhibitions. Five programs related to these exhibits. Included was a six part series held in the gallery in conjunction with the Judy Chicago show, "The Birth Project", the "China Connection" lecture series was held in conjunction with the exhibit, "Gods and Men: Theatre in Asia" and wood carving demonstrations in conjunction with the exhibit, "Wood You Believe." Programs that related to the local historical themes of the museum included "The Vancouver Museum Heritage Series", "The Heritage Walking

Tours", "Historical Costume Patterns" and "Old Fashioned Games." New to the museum in 1985 was a travelling exhibit, The Vancouver Museomobile, described as a "programming dream . . . state of the art program, the latest thinking about museum education" (Vancouver Museums and Planetarium Associations, Annual Report, 1986). The Vancouver Museomobile was a customized van which travelled through the province bringing museum information to those who could not visit the museum. It contained 16 kits of materials supplemented with eight separate programs dealing with four themes: Vancouver pre-history, natural history, history and multi-cultural heritage.

The following uses were noted for programs in 1985.

- Stimulation. No programs for this purpose were reported.
- Enrichment. Of the 18 public programs reported, 13 were held in conjunction with one of the temporary exhibits, five plus the "Heritage Walking Tours" related to the museum's theme of Vancouver history.
- Extension. The Vancouver Museomobile was designed to extend the museum into the community and to attract people who otherwise might not visit the museum.
- Service. No programs were found.
- Advocacy. No programs were found.

1986. The 1986 Annual Report (p. 1) described 1986 as an "ambitious year to honor the City's 100th birthday and Expo '86." The Museum mounted eight temporary exhibits. Seven programs were held in conjunction with temporary exhibits. Included were three programs,

"Illuminated Manuscripts" series, "Brass Rubbings Tournament" and a "Medieval Tournament", held in conjunction with the exhibit, "Canada Collects in the Middle Ages." Others were "Voyage of Discovery Nature Walks" in conjunction with the exhibit, "Captain George Vancouver: A Voyage of Discovery, 1791-1795." Gallery tours were also part of the Captain Vancouver exhibit. "Works of Craft" film series plus tours of local craft studios, called "A Touch of Craft" were held in conjunction with the exhibit, "Works of Craft." "Glory of French Wines" was the title of a program held in conjunction with two exhibits about French wines. Programs that related to the themes of the museum included one on storytelling, "Northwest Coast Indian Storytelling", the "History of Fashionable Dress", and "Wives' Tales." The "Heritage Walking Tours" were continued from the previous years; three programs were held in conjunction with them: "Erickson's Touch"; "Old Stones, New Beginnings", a program about the Sinclair Centre, and a hardhat tour of the Sinclair Centre.

The following uses were noted for programs in 1986.

- Stimulation. Gallery tours of the Captain Vancouver exhibit that served to introduce visitors to the exhibit were held.
- Enrichment. Of the 16 programs reported, seven were held in conjunction with temporary exhibits and nine were held in conjunction with the permanent exhibit. The "Heritage Walking Tours" also related to the museum's permanent theme.
- Extension. The Vancouver Museomobile was continued from the previous year. One program was conducted that responded to a

current community interest, the program on Expo '86. Any co-sponsored activities there might have been were not reported.

- Service. No programs were found.
- Advocacy. No programs were found.

The Vancouver Museum, then, held several programs each year most of which were related to either the temporary or permanent exhibits.

The individual reports of museums is complete here. Comparison of museums begins on page 93 following the reports from the libraries.

Libraries: The New Westminster Public Library

The New Westminster Public Library is centrally located. The library has a general collection of books and reference materials. Included in the collection are books in other languages and a collection of books for new adult readers. The library has a large auditorium downstairs used for programs sponsored by the library and other community groups and an art gallery upstairs. Programming was administered by Ms. Debra Nelson, Community Services Librarian, whose position is divided between circulation and publicity and programming. The library sponsors an average of two public programs per month and co-sponsors two more. However, adult education activities in the New Westminster Library were described more broadly than programming. Adult education was described as all library activities except those that were directed toward children including provision of books for circulation, information services and programs. No policy statement existed for adult education in the New Westminster Public Library; indeed, no policy manual existed in the library.

Definition of Adult Education

To the New Westminster Public Library adult education was making information readily available by providing books or programs on topics adults want or need, all library activities, and the library as a resource for the whole community. The term "adult education" was not a familiar one in the New Westminster Library. The library offered the following definition:

. . . making information readily available to adults.

This definition was analyzed as follows. The notions of an agent/learner relationship, presence of educational objectives, systematic instruction, or an orientation to individuals, groups, or society were absent. The purpose of adult education was suggested by the phrase "making information readily available." The word "adult" was also used.

Importance of Programming

Functions of the library. The main functions of the New Westminster Public Library were described by the Community Services Librarian as the provision of information, reference services, providing books, shut-in services, programming, art gallery facilities and displays. In the New Westminster Public Library information brochure, the functions of the library were described as collections, services such as information and reference, meeting rooms, interlibrary loans, programs, and speakers offered for the community. The functions were not ranked as the policy of the library was to treat everything on an equal basis.

Factors which influenced the importance of programming. Ms.

Nelson described programming as equal in importance to other functions of the library. However, one positive and one negative factor were mentioned. The positive influence was a positive perception of programs by the public. Ms. Nelson said that people seemed to choose programs in the library over other locations in the community because they perceived it as a friendly place, almost an extension of their homes. For example, the public attended an all-candidate's meeting when it was held in the library but not when it was held in another community location. On the negative side, programming was mentioned as a sensitive issue because there could be an inverse relationship between the cost of providing a program and the number of people it served. Library statistics showed that numbers of people attending programs were small compared with book circulation statistics.

Uses of Programming

The New Westminster Public Library offered approximately two programs per month and co-sponsored two programs regularly with community groups, a travel slide show series sponsored by the University Women's Club and a monthly lecture by the New Westminster Historical Society. Other programs were co-sponsored on an ad-hoc basis with other groups in the community. Library sponsored programs reflected themes such as "Animal Health Week" or the "National Book Festival", some series and some individual programs.

1985. In 1985, 31 programs were either sponsored or co-sponsored by the library. Two programs related to themes the library was promoting, "Talk to a Vet", held in conjunction with "Animal Health Week", and a writer's workshop with Rona Murray in conjunction with the National Book Festival. One series, "Personal Finance" was held. The library continued to co-sponsor monthly programs with the University Women's Club and the New Westminster Historical Society. In addition, to the regularly co-sponsored programs, the library co-sponsored two programs with community groups, one on earthquakes with the Royal City Naturalists and one on salmon enhancement with the Sapperton Fish and Game Club. The library also sponsored five programs. Included were a preview to Expo '86 and a popular program designed to introduce seniors to computers called "New Machines for Old Hands." The following uses were noted for programs at the New Westminster Public Library.

- Stimulation. No programs were found.
- Enrichment. The two programs held in conjunction with themes the library was promoting, "Animal Health Week" and the "National Book Festival", were designed for this purpose.
- Extension. Most topics for programs at the New Westminster Public Library were chosen because of "interest, timeliness, and currency" in the community. For example, the preview to Expo '86 coincided with the coming of Expo '86, and the one on Halley's Comet was held in conjunction with the sighting of Halley's Comet that year. In addition the programs co-sponsored with community groups strengthened the library's connection with the community.

- Service. Sometimes the library sponsored a program because they saw a need for it and noticed that no other community agency had addressed it. This was the case with the "Personal Finance Series." In the annual report for 1985 it stated, "Recognizing that the economy is still of vital concern in our community, we held several programs on personal finance" (1985, Annual Report, p. 1). The program designed to introduce seniors to computers was also done because there was a perceived need that was not being filled elsewhere. The library also saw a need for non English language materials and new adult reader books but did not program in either English as a Second Language or Adult Basic Education because programs were already held at Douglas College.
- Advocacy. No programs were found.

1986. In 1986, 32 programs were held. One series was designed to augment the November library theme, "Fraser River Month." Included were displays, programs, and an art show in the upstairs gallery. Two series, a business series and a gardening series, were held. The library sponsored 11 programs and cosponsored 21 programs. Library sponsored ones included programs, "Expo Preview" and "How to Get Published." Included in the cosponsored ones were "Birds of South Africa" with the Royal City Field naturalists and "Saving the Stein River" with the Stein Alliance.

The following uses for programming were noted.

- Stimulation. No programs were found.
- Enrichment. The programs designed to complement the themes

promoted by the library, "Fraser River Week" and "Libraries' Week" were designed for enrichment.

- Extension. Topics of popular interest which served to attract visitors to the library included the Expo programs and the gardening series. Included also for extension reasons were the regular and ad-hoc co-sponsored programs.
- Service. The business series which included a program on family law and one on tax planning were offered because there was a perceived need which no-one in the community had addressed.
- Advocacy. "Saving the Stein" was conducted for this purpose.

1987. Thirty-six programs were offered in 1987. Two library initiated themes were promoted partly with programs, "Nostalgia Month" in October and "Heart Month" in February. Series included "Composers in the Morning" cosponsored by Douglas College and "Women's Health Month." Co-sponsored programs included the regular ones with the University Women's Club and the New Westminster Historical Society. Ad-hoc co-sponsored programs were held with the New Westminster Family Services, Capilano College and the British Columbia Automobile Association. Library sponsored programs included "Romance Writing", "Collecting Books", and an all candidate's meeting.

The following uses were noted in 1987:

- Stimulation. No programs were found.
- Enrichment. Five programs were held in conjunction with library featured themes: two for "Nostalgia Month" and three for "Heart Month."

- Extension. Eleven programs whose topics reflected current interests in the community were held including the all candidate's meeting and "Buying a House." Eighteen programs were co-sponsored with the University Women's Club and the New Westminster Historical Society; eight were cosponsored on an ad hoc basis.
- Service. No programs were found. in 1987.
- Advocacy. No programs were found.

Every year the New Westminster Public Library held programs in conjunction with a particular theme they were promoting. Most programs, however, were designed to reflect a current interest in the community or to work in cooperation with a group in the community.

Libraries: North Vancouver District Library, Lynn Valley Branch

The North Vancouver District Library, Lynn Valley Branch, is one of three libraries in the North Vancouver District Library system. Located just off a main street in North Vancouver, the library is near a shopping centre and a small shopping district. The programming is conducted by Ms. Elisabeth Scotson, a librarian by training but with 15 years experience in journalism. Ms. Scotson worked part-time, four days a week dividing her time between reserving books, staffing the information desk, and programming. In the period studied, the Lynn Valley Branch Library held an average of two programs per month.

Adult education activities in the Lynn Valley Branch were described as everything the library did for adults -- book collection, acquisition, and availability of reference and circulating materials -- with programs and displays a small, but vital part of the library's extended services.

Because the North Vancouver District Library system did not see adult education as a separate aspect of library services, no policy statement for adult education (or programming) existed. Rather, the notion of education was included in the library goals.

[Library] services will be designed to enable the users to make the best possible use of the library for their education, enrichment and enjoyment. (Library Goals, II.1.1., 1.2)

The programming function was not mentioned, except in a job description for the librarian responsible for programming.

Definition of Adult Education

The Lynn Valley Branch described adult education as the basis of the whole library's operation, except children's services, as a life-long process in which the library played a vital role, as a service to the whole community, and as any activity that promoted the acquiring of knowledge. In general terms, adult education was described as "life itself." The library gave the following definition.

. . .the whole function of the library, anything that promotes the acquiring of knowledge, be it books, pamphlets, posters, videos, records, ephemeral information, meetings and the creation of programs and displays to create knowledge.

This definition was analyzed as follows. The notions of an agent/learner relationship, using educational objectives or providing systematic instruction were absent. So was specific mention of the word "adult." The purpose for adult education was suggested by the phrase "the acquiring of knowledge." Any specific orientation, individual, group, or community was

also absent.

Importance of Programming

Functions of the library. The functions of the library in order of priority were: disseminating information, providing education, and providing recreation and entertainment. The information function was seen to be the most important function because connecting people with the knowledge they sought was the primary purpose of the library. Education, defined as the expansion of knowledge through library sources, was seen as the second function. Education in this case was not equated with teaching, but with guidance. Third was entertainment and recreation; programming was seen as part of the entertainment function of the library.

Factors which influenced the importance of programming. Four factors were mentioned. First, the library had established a successful programming record, making it more acceptable to management and the library board. Second, personal attitudes of both the programmer and management influenced the importance of programming. If both wanted programming to occur in the library, it could happen. Third, time and money constraints made it difficult to do much programming. Only three hours a week of the librarian's time were allotted for programming and a budget of \$600.00 per year allowed. Fourth, management did not have a clear concept of what programming might do; the librarian responsible for programming had had to fight for acceptance of programming. In order of priority, the "wish and the will", ie. the attitude of the programmer and of management was considered the most important factor influencing

programming. Second was the availability of good facilities, and third was the lack of time and money.

Uses of Programming

The annual reports and publicity brochures at the Lynn Valley Branch did not contain complete descriptions of programs by year. Rather, some program highlights were mentioned in the annual reports. Publicity materials were saved but were not usually dated making it difficult to determine when programs happened. Consequently, the programs at the Lynn Valley Branch will be reported by year as per information contained in the annual reports. Analysis of uses, however, will not be done by year. Rather the three years studied will be considered together instead of individually as in previous reports. Programs were always one time, two hour events. Topics were usually chosen to reflect a local interest, feature a local person or to promote a local enterprise which interested the library.

1984. In 1984, 36 programs were offered on various topics of interest to the community. Included were a "Fit for Life" series, a series of holistic health related topics such as a program on "Osteoporosis", "Macrobiotic Diets", "Food Fads", and "Aerobics for Large People." Other topics included travel programs, "Birds in B.C. Parks", talks by writers, a look ahead to Expo' 86, and a program to inform the public about a proposed new regional park.

1985. In 1985, 18 topics featuring 22 adult programs were mentioned in the annual report. Included in 1985 programs was a continuation of the "Fit for Life" series from the previous year with

evening programs on "Reflexology", "Food Fads", and an exercise program for overweight people. Local authors included playwrights and authors giving their personal experiences as writers, an historian discussing his own book on the history of Vancouver, and the writer of best selling thrillers as a guest of the "National Book Festival." Two historical works in progress were featured in library programs: "The Voyage of the St. Roch" and "The Life of Phyllis Munday", an early mountain climbing pioneer in B.C. Local interest programs included "Colour Me Beautiful", a program on personal colour theory popular at the time, was repeated from 1984, a travel program, and "Floral Decorations for Christmas."

1986. In 1986, 25 programs were offered. Series included one for consumers, on "Buying Encyclopedias" and one on "Gift Giving for Everyone." The library also held a book discussion group that year, a travel series, and a series of video showings. Local authors featured in library programs included Diane Clement, the author of a popular cookbook, and one on writing detective fiction by author, Constance Beresford. Programs highlighting local enterprises included the "Saving of '374'", the first locomotive to cross Canada, being restored in North Vancouver as a contribution to Expo. Topics of local interest included a program on Vancouver history.

The following uses for adult education programs were noted:

- Stimulation. No programs were found.
- Enrichment. Only one program in the three years reviewed was designed to promote a theme in the library. In 1985, "A World of Words" with poet, Ann Marriot, was designed to promote "National

Book Festival Week" at the library. However, most programs, where possible, were supplemented by book displays and reading lists from the library collection.

- Extension. Programs were seen primarily as a way for the library to promote its services and book stock in the local community. Ms. Scotson called programming a vehicle for "community communication", "a two-way street", or the "inner wedge of library services", and considered it an outreach service of the library. Featuring local authors, enterprises or interests, ideas for programs came from local newspapers, radio or television, or from demand by library patrons. Most programs were highlighted by a display or reading list from the library's book stock "designed to complement the book collection by providing speakers, films or workshops on topics of proven interest to the community" (1986, Annual Report, p. 6).
- Service. No programs were found.
- Advocacy. No programs were found.

The North Vancouver District Library, Lynn Valley Branch, then, sponsored between 25 and 36 programs per year over the period reviewed. All programs but one were undertaken with a view to extending the library's relations into the community. All were designed to feature a topic of local interest or a local resource person. In the 1986 annual report the chief librarian stated, ". . . more and more the library is being recognized as an important community resource. We are asked to put on special displays, hold programmes . . . the popular free

programs attract people from all walks of life" (1985, Annual Report, p. 1).

Libraries: Surrey Public Library, Whalley Branch

The Whalley Branch of the Surrey Public Library is located near a busy section of Whalley. Adult education is overseen by Ms. Ene Haabnit, Manager of the Whalley Branch, a librarian who had had some adult education training. Adult education in the Whalley Branch was described as the provision of information to adults engaged in learning, whatever the learning was. Included in adult education activities were the bulk of library activities such as providing books, making information available, acting as a helper or a guide and supporting educational work in the community. Programming was deliberately excluded from the list of adult education activities. Programming was not seen as a part of the library's educational effort because it did not reach too many people and did not encourage them to establish a lasting relationship with the library. Programming, also, was perceived by some library staff as a better activity for community organizations other than the library.

The Surrey Public Library policy governing programs stated that programs are designed to fill one or more of the following functions: to supplement the library's collections by providing an alternate format for communicating ideas or information, to highlight and encourage the use of particular parts of the collection or promote the library as a resource centre for further exploration of issues, and to provide effective publicity so that potential users are attracted to the library and so that community awareness of, and support for and use of the Library was increased

(Policy Manual, Surrey Public Library, 3.3.1).

Definition of Adult Education

To the staff of the Whalley Branch, adult education included all the ways adults learned, a humanistic type of activity that helped people fulfill their potential. Libraries were seen more as centres for learning than education. The library fulfilled two roles in adult education, providing information and providing guidance. Too much guidance, however, was seen as inappropriate; the library was part of someone's educational process, not the initiator of it. The library offered the following definition.

. . . an activity that helps people do or learn so they can bringing about a behavior change so they can fulfill their potential.

This definition can be analyzed as follows. The notions of an agent/learner relationship, objectives or systematic instruction were absent. The word "adult" was not specifically mentioned. The purpose for adult education was suggested by the phrase "helps people do or learn so they can bring about a change in their behavior so they can fulfill their potential."

Importance of Programming

Functions of the library. The functions of the Surrey Public Library, Whalley Branch, were described as information, defined as supplying books and reference materials; recreation, defined as providing books for entertainment and programming; culture, defined as collections about the arts and ethnic cultures; and education, defined as providing

information about specific learning goals related to employment. Education was ranked as the most important function; culture as the least important function. Recreation and information were ranked equally in the middle. Education was ranked first because it was seen as important in the community. Many people in Surrey were seeking to upgrade their skills related to employment and saw a need to educate themselves. The library worked to make what services it had accessible, including providing study space. Culture, while still considered important by the library, was ranked last because little demand for it was seen in the community. The library saw itself as demand oriented, responsive to the needs of the community. Therefore, the library tried to offer the services it saw as most important in the community.

Factors which influenced the importance of programming. The following influenced the importance of programming. First was the demand for service. Whether a program was offered was dependent upon the perceived demand. Second, the library was often not aware of the needs in the community. In order to learn about the community, library staff were encouraged to belong to local associations such as the Immigrant Services Society. Third, the process of developing community contacts to the level where their educational needs could be understood was a long process. Lack of time to develop relationships between the library and the community was seen as a problem. Fourth, some individuals in the organization perceived the need for the library to become involved in programming. Their influence affected the priority given to programming. Fifth, there was some difference of opinion in the organization on the

library's role in programming. Some staff thought programming was more appropriate for other organizations in the community. The library was also seen by some community organizations, for example, the Board of Parks and Recreation, to be duplicating their services. Sixth, was inadequate knowledge of adult education and its potential among library staff, and seventh was not having the required skills to develop and conduct programs. Eighth, programming in the Whalley library was no one person's job; the function was divided up among various people in the library making it difficult to focus the function.

Uses of Programming

The number of programs offered by the Whalley Branch increased from five programs in 1985 to 15 programs in 1987. Topics for programs were generally confined to ones that were suitable for a one time, two hour presentation. Where possible, programs were offered in series in order to streamline publicity and to compensate for the possibility that one program in the series might be poorly attended. Data for the Whalley Branch was taken from 1985 to 1987 as the library only started offering programs in 1985.

1985. Five programs were offered in 1985. No series were offered that year. Programs included a "Fashion Counselling Workshop", "How to Start a Small Business", "Crime Prevention", "The Entrepreneurial Woman" and a demonstration on "Gift Wrapping."

The following uses for programs were noted.

- Stimulation. No programs were found.
- Enrichment. No programs were found.

- Extension. Programs were conducted mainly in response to demand in the community.
- Service. No programs were found.
- Advocacy. No programs were found.

1986. Fourteen programs plus a multicultural series for Expo' 86 were offered in 1986. The range of programs increased and included two series, a five session program on parenting and a travel series in cooperation with other branches of the Surrey Public Library system. One time programs included one on how to "Handling a Job Interview", and a program on "Alternatives in Adult Education" for those who wanted to upgrade their education, a program felt important by the library, but poorly attended. A reading by author, W.P. Kinsella was offered as were practical programs on self-defense, auto mechanics and public speaking. That year also, a quarterly program, "Learn to Love a Library" tours was proposed. The program was designed to introduce patrons to the circulation, collections, reference materials, book talks and library technology. Library tours, not well supported in the past, were proposed again on a regular basis and with special features such as "Back to School" in September. Also in 1986, in honour of both Expo '86 and Surrey's multi-cultural community, the library offered a multi-cultural series featuring displays, demonstrations, and workshops highlighting six different cultures in Surrey.

The following uses were noted for programs in 1986.

- Stimulation. The proposed "Love a Library" tours were designed to help users make better and more efficient use of the library.

- Enrichment. The "Parenting Series" was designed to supplement the library's collection of books on the topic. The library wanted both to promote the books they had on the topic and to give additional information not found in books. Books on parenting were in short supply; the program was seen as a way to supplement what the library could provide.
- Extension. The library saw itself as demand oriented, programs responding to needs in the community. The parenting series was designed in response to the demand. Other programs were used to reflect local interests. The "Multi-Cultural Series" was designed in the spirit of Expo '86 to feature the multi-cultural population of Surrey. Other programs featured items of community interest.
- Service. No programs were found.
- Advocacy. No programs were found.

1987. In 1987, 15 programs were offered. Included were several series, a "Legal Series", a "Financial Series", "Gardening Series", and a "Do-It-Yourself Maintenance Series" on cars and bicycles. Other programs included "Job Search Programs", a health program on "Stress Management", and a film program for multi-cultural week.

The following uses were found for programs.

- Stimulation. No programs were found.
- Enrichment. No programs were found.
- Extension. Two programs in 1987 were highlighted in the interview as programs that promoted a favorable impression of the library, the "Stress Management" program, and the fashion program, "Colour Me

Beautiful." The program on stress was also undertaken in response to a number of questions on the topic. It was felt that programs like this informed the public about the library and created a favorable impression that the library was a place that cared about people. The program, "Colour Me Beautiful", after a book of the same title, was done to create good attendance figures at a library program and to create the impression that the library was a fun place. According to the manager of the library, demand in the community was the most important reason for offering programs.

- Service. No programs were found.
- Advocacy. No programs were found.

The bulk of the programs at the Surrey Public Library, Whalley Branch were designed to respond to a demand in the community. The library saw itself as demand oriented institution with programming being one way of showing that the library responded to the community.

This completes the individual reports of the three libraries studied with respect to their concept of adult education, the importance of programming relative to other functions of the organization and the uses of programming.

Comparison of Museums

In the first part of this analysis, within category comparisons, findings from each museums will be compared and findings from each library will be compared. In the second part, across category comparisons, findings from libraries will be compared with findings from museums.

Description of Adult Education

Adult education activities. Three patterns emerged. One was commonality among the descriptions of adult education. The same three types of activities appeared in the museums studied: instructional activities designed to enrich understanding and appreciation of the exhibits or themes of the museum, activities to educate volunteers to work in the museum, and informal events such as concerts, plays and celebrations. Second was ideas of what adult education might do for the museum. The Surrey Art Gallery and the Museum of Anthropology saw adult education as an active process that could shape public thinking. The Museum of Anthropology and the Vancouver Museum saw adult education as a way to break down the traditional upper middle class appeal of museums making them more accessible. The third was the variety of names given to adult education. The Museum of Anthropology called it "outreach" and "public programming", the Surrey Art Gallery called it "education", and the Vancouver Museum called it "interpretation" and "public programming."

Written policy statements. None of the museums studied had written policy statements. In the Museum of Anthropology the absence of policy was said to be either an omission on the part of management or a reflection of the style of the programmer previous to the one interviewed. In the Surrey Art Gallery, adult education was not considered a function of the gallery separate from other functions. Rather the notion of education was woven into the goal statements and the mission statements of the gallery. At the Vancouver Museum, the programming function was

simply not included in organizational policy.

Definitions of adult education. Three patterns were evident in the definitions for adult education offered by the museums. First, all were purpose definitions except the one offered by the Surrey Art Gallery which was both a purpose and process definition. The Vancouver Museum defined the purpose of adult education as a "learning experience through artifacts", the Museum of Anthropology as a way to "learn about museums and how they work" and the Surrey Art Gallery as a way to develop a critical public. Only the Surrey Art Gallery offered a definition that consisted of process components. Included in their definition of adult education were the notions of an agent/learner relationship and the notion of systematic learning.

Second, all the definitions included the idea that adult education is capable of shaping public opinion and thought. Both the Vancouver Museum and the Museum of Anthropology saw adult education as a way to sensitize the public to heritage conservation whereas the Surrey Art Gallery saw adult education as a way to teach the public to look critically at art.

Third, all saw adult education as a way to extend the appeal of the museum. Both the Vancouver Museum and the Museum of Anthropology saw it as a way to broaden the appeal of the museum past its traditional upper middle class audience whereas the Surrey Art Gallery saw programming as a way to compete with other community activities and to attract the public to the museum.

Importance of Programming

Functions of the museum. Two patterns became evident when examining the functions of museums. First, all considered collections, and care and exhibit of collections as the main functions. The Museum of Anthropology had a third function, academic teaching and research, reflective of its place at the university. Second, public education, except at the Surrey Art Gallery, was considered the least important function. At the Surrey Art Gallery, education was considered second only to the collections and exhibits, simply because the gallery relied on the material in the exhibits for its education program. At the Vancouver Museum, the low priority given education was evidenced by the division of the core budget and the difference in salary between the curatorial staff and the interpretive staff. At the Museum of Anthropology, it was evidenced partly by the fact that the permanent job of public programmer had been vacant for a year and a half, and that no space for programming had been designed into the building.

Factors which influenced the importance of programming. Six factors accounted for the position of programming in museums. First, all mentioned that the priorities of the director was the most important factor. In the Museum of Anthropology, it was evidenced partly by the fact that the permanent job of public programmer had been vacant for a year and a half. In the Vancouver Museum it was said to be evidenced by the division of the core budget and the differences in salary between curatorial staff and interpretive staff. In the Surrey Art Gallery the fact that they had been able to put together and maintain what they called an

ambitious program for the size of the organization was due to the fact that the director was supportive. Second, each museum had a full-time person as the public programmer. In the case of the Museum of Anthropology the full-time position was soon to be filled. Third, with the exception of the public programmer at the Museum of Anthropology, all had professional training in something other than the museum specialty. At the Surrey Art Gallery, the education coordinator also a teaching certificate and experience in working with people with learning disabilities. The public programmer at the Vancouver Museum had a university degree in communications as well as long experience working in museums. Fourth, all mentioned the historical place of education in museums. The Museum of Anthropology mentioned that education was not an historically acceptable role for museums, although it appeared to be gradually changing. Both the Vancouver Museum and the Surrey Art Gallery saw their historical record of successful programming as a factor that made programming acceptable in the eyes of both management in the museum and the public. Fifth, the Surrey Art Gallery and the Vancouver Museum mentioned competition in the community for the same audience a factor that affected their programming. In the Surrey Art Gallery, the location and competition from sports, television, and other cultural events made it necessary to have appealing programs. In the Vancouver Museum, competition for the same event between different organizations in the community was mentioned. For example, the Museum used to offer the only Dominion Day celebrations; now others offered the same type of program. Sixth, the Museum of Anthropology and the Vancouver Museum

mentioned a shortage of resources. Adequate space was a problem in both places. Not enough money was a problem at the Vancouver Museum while lack of financial incentive was a problem at the Museum of Anthropology. No mention was made at the Surrey Art Gallery of a shortage of resources. Shortage of time was also not mentioned in any of the museums studied.

Uses of programming. All the museums studied had activities designed to help the casual visitor make better and more efficient use of the museum. At the Museum of Anthropology, those activities included regular and special guided tours plus some programs on how to visit a museum. At the Surrey Art Gallery they included tours given by docents and provision of information by trained gallery attendents. At the Vancouver Museum, tours were only reported in connection with the "Captain Vancouver" and "Silver Collection" exhibits. However, the public programs coordinator said that she was currently re-evaluating the place of tours in the museum and was considering offering them again. Most activities at the museums were designed to enrich either an exhibit or the themes in the museum.

Using adult education activities as a link with the community was also mentioned in all museums. Aside from the public attraction of programs some specific attempts through programs were made to strengthen museum links with the community. The Vancouver Museum did it two ways. It cosponsored programs with like minded community groups and it conducted the Vancouver Museomobile program. The Surrey Art Gallery did it by cosponsoring some activities, participating in

community programs such as conferences and workshops, and by holding lectures and workshops for interested groups. The Museum of Anthropology conducted tours for special groups. Some activities were found that filled a social need in the community. The Museum of Anthropology sponsored the Correction Services Outreach program for native inmates and the Surrey Art Gallery devoted some of its programs to the goal of developing an art community in Surrey. No similar efforts were found at the Vancouver Museum.

Two programs were found with a political perspective. One sponsored by the Museum of Anthropology, "Our Home and Native Land", was designed to inform the public about current native political issues. The other, "What Was Lost", was a program designed to sensitize the public to the need to conserve historic buildings of value.

Comparison of Libraries

Description of Adult Education

Adult education activities. Three patterns emerged from the descriptions of adult education activities in libraries. First, all libraries held a broad, inclusive view of what constituted adult education. All of them held that all library activities, except those for children, could be called adult education. Included were the book collection, reference and information services, and with the exception of the Whalley Branch, displays and programming. Second, all were oriented to serving the whole community and third, the New Westminster and North Vancouver libraries mentioned the role of the library as an important institution in people's life long learning activities. Fourth, all the libraries saw their role as

one of providing information and guidance rather than teaching.

Written policy statements. Two libraries had policy statements. The Whalley Branch had a clearly defined policy statement defining the role of programs within the Surrey Public Library system. The North Vancouver library had only a job description for the person responsible for programming whereas the New Westminster Public Library had no policy statements for anything, including programming.

Definition of adult education. All the libraries had a broad, inclusive definition of adult education. The New Westminster library called it "everything the library does", the North Vancouver District Library called it "the whole function of the library" and the Whalley Branch called it "an activity that helps people do or learn."

Importance of Programming

Functions of libraries. All the libraries listed their functions as information, education, recreation/entertainment, and in the case of the Whalley Branch, culture. Although the same functions were mentioned, different perspectives were taken. North Vancouver District Library tended to view the functions as library activities whereas the Whalley Branch referred to various aspects of the collections or information services. The North Vancouver District Library gave information as its first priority whereas the Whalley Branch gave education as its first priority. However, upon closer inspection, education was said to be the provision of information about educational opportunities that would aid employment, including providing study space. Education, defined as the expansion of knowledge through library sources, was mentioned as the second priority.

As in the Whalley Branch, education was equated with guidance, not teaching. The North Vancouver District Library gave entertainment and recreation as its last priority; programming was considered part of the entertainment function. As in the Whalley Branch, programming was not considered part of the education function. The New Westminster Library, although it agreed with the other libraries on the functions of libraries, felt that all functions had equal priority and could not be ranked.

Factors which influenced the importance of programming. Four factors emerged from the data. First, influence of individuals in the organization was a factor in the North Vancouver District Library and the Whalley Branch. In the North Vancouver District Library the priorities of the director, board and programmer were mentioned, whereas no specific individuals were mentioned in the Whalley Branch. At the New Westminster library, the chief librarian was said to place equal priority on all functions. Second, North Vancouver and Whalley mentioned that there was not a clear concept of what programming might do among some in the organization. In the Whalley Branch lack of a clear concept was coupled with lack of skills such as teaching, group dynamics, or counselling. Also at the Whalley Branch, individuals in the organization held different views on whether the library had a proper role in programming. Some felt it belonged to other organizations in the community. Third, librarian's awareness and contact with the community was felt to be an important factor in all libraries studied. "Interest, timeliness, and currency" was given as the main factor affecting the importance of programming at New Westminster Library. Awareness of

community needs combined with efforts on the part of the library to develop appropriate relationships in the community were also factors at the Whalley Branch. At North Vancouver, the librarian made an effort to keep up with local authors, read local papers, listen to the radio and watch television to learn of community interests. Fourth were the practical constraints of time and money. All the librarians interviewed combined programming half-time or less with other functions. At Surrey, one person was not assigned to the job; rather the responsibility for programming was shared.

Uses of Programming

Only one program was found in the three libraries that was designed to help users make better and more efficient use of the library. The proposed "Learn to Love a Library" tours at the Whalley Branch were designed for this purpose. Usually, the information desk provided this service.

Programs designed to enrich a theme at the library were not often found in the libraries studied. The exception were programs offered in conjunction with a theme at the New Westminster Library such as "Animal Health Week" or "Fraser River Month" at the New Westminster Public Library. Sometimes a program such as "Colour Me Beautiful" at the Whalley Branch was offered to promote a particular selection from the book stock.

All three libraries saw programming as a way to strengthen their links with the community, referred to in this paper as extension. The New Westminster library saw programming as a way to provide the

community with information it wanted or needed; the North Vancouver library saw it as the "inner wedge" of library service, linking the library with the community, and the Whalley Branch saw it as part of its demand oriented service to the community. Only one library, New Westminster, co-sponsored programs with other community organizations. Sometimes, as with the business series during the recession and the computer program for seniors, the library saw a need in the community in which it could provide a service that was not provided elsewhere. No programs for this purpose were found at other libraries.

Across Category Comparisons

All the libraries studied were located at or near main intersections in their communities. Museums were more difficult to reach. The Museum of Anthropology was on the extreme western edge of the city, the Surrey Art Gallery in a hard to reach location in Surrey, and the Vancouver Museum was easier to reach, but required travel from most parts of the city to reach it.

Description of Adult Education

Museums had a more exclusive concept of adult education than did the libraries. Museum adult education was described as instruction that enriched the exhibits. Excluded from all descriptions was the learning provided by exhibits and displays.

Libraries, on the other hand, had a more inclusive view of adult education activities. Libraries tended to view adult education as a matter of all that the library did from collecting books to putting on programs. Only children's activities were excluded. Programming, though a vital part

of the libraries' activities, was considered only a small part of the library's role in adult education. Moreover, librarians tended to view their educational role as more of a guide than an instructor, whereas the museums tended to view adult education activities more as instruction. Museums also included the notion that adult education could shape public thinking whereas libraries avoided wanting to shape public thought.

Importance of Programming

In all cases, collections of books or artifacts were considered the most important functions of both libraries and museums. In libraries, providing desired information was the most important function, and in museums, displaying the collections was considered the most important function. All other activities in the organization sprang from the collection function. In every case, except the Surrey Art Gallery, public programming was considered the lowest in priority of organizational functions. Findings from the New Westminster Public Library were inconclusive.

A number of similar factors influenced the importance of adult education in both types of organizations. First, the priorities of the director was considered the most influential factor. Second, the historical record of programming was considered influential. In the case of the North Vancouver District Library, the Vancouver Museum and the Museum of Anthropology, having established a successful programming record positively influenced the importance of programming. In the Museum of Anthropology, the fact that programming was not considered an historical function of museums was a negative factor. Third, museums

had a full-time person assigned to public programming. Public programming was clearly differentiated in the organizational structure. Moreover, with the exception of the Museum of Anthropology, the programmers had training in something relating to their education function, one in teaching and the other in communications. Librarians, on the other hand, did not have that extra training. Libraries, too, were the ones that mentioned that a clear concept of adult education was missing. One mentioned also that necessary skills were lacking.

Uses of Programming

Museums more than libraries tended to use adult education activities as a way to stimulate the public to better and more efficient use of the museum. Only one attempt was found in libraries. Museums mostly used programming as a way to enrich understanding of exhibits and displays. Topics for programs came from the material contained in the exhibits. Only two programs were found in which topics were drawn from the community. Libraries, on the other hand, tended to design their programs to reflect a need or an interest in the community. Only when the library wanted to promote a particular theme, such as the National Book Festival, did they use programming to enrich their collections. Usually the reverse was true; libraries used their collections to enrich a program, as when the North Vancouver District Library supplemented their programs, with displays and reading lists from their stock. Programming to fill a social need was done more often by museums than libraries. The best example of programming for this use was the Corrections Services Outreach program at the Museum of Anthropology. However, the

New Westminster Public Library also programmed sometimes for this reason. With the business series and the computer program for seniors, the library saw itself as a service provider where no others in the community could. Generally, however, in both libraries and museums, little programming was done for this purpose. Advocacy was rarely found. Only two programs, both sponsored by museums, were designed for this purpose. Libraries, on the whole, tended to avoid any programs that might promote a particular political perspective. If any program, such as the opening of a new regional park in North Vancouver, might spark some controversy, care was to either restrict the content of program to one of providing information only, or to represent all sides of an issue.

Libraries and museums, then, differed mainly on their concept of adult education, on the organizational structures with respect to the person who was responsible for programming, and on their primary use for adult education. They were similar in that in every case but one, adult education was lowest in priority of organizational functions. Priorities of the director was given as the major factor influencing the importance of programming in almost every case. Almost the same uses for programming were found in both libraries and museums, but the emphasis in each was different.

CHAPTER V

SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

The purpose of this chapter is to summarize and discuss the findings from this study. There are three sections. In the first, the findings from the research are discussed with respect to levels of use of the term "adult education", the factors which decreased or increased the importance of programming, and the contribution adult education makes to libraries and museums. In the second part of the chapter the implications of the study with respect to the practice of adult education in libraries and museums are discussed. It is suggested that we need to become aware of the different ways adult education is defined and described, and that of the organizational and community context in which adult education is practiced. A role for adult educators in these settings is also suggested. The third section contains two suggestions for further research that arise from this study, one a study into the organizational context of adult education and another into the community context of libraries.

Levels of Use of the Term "Adult Education"

The findings of the study suggested that the term "adult education" was used three ways: an inclusive use, a particular use, and a philosophical use.

Inclusive Use

In libraries particularly, the term "adult education" was used to describe a broad range of library services for adults. Generally, the term was used to describe all library activities for adults from collecting books and advising readers to planning and conducting programs. Little library activity was excluded. As Debra Nelson remarked, "Who is to say what anyone will be educated by?" Adult education was referred to by the New Westminster library as "everything the library does", the North Vancouver District Library as "life itself", and the Whalley Public Library as "the provision of information to adults engaged in learning whatever it [was]." Similarly, the library literature often reflected a broad view of what constituted adult education. Phinney (1956, p. 3) called adult education "any library service that would help an adult user to build upon and realize his potentialities" while Smith (1954, p. 1) defined it as "any service for adults if performed with planning, direction and participation."

Particular Use

Particular use refers to a set of activities, either instructional activities or those activities which supported self-directed learners. The instructional use of the term, usually found in museums, described various kinds of programming activities while the support use, usually found in libraries, described various services to help self-directed learners.

Zetterberg (1969, p. 16) defined adult education in museums as "purposeful, planned instruction." His definition was consistent with descriptions of adult education in museums since purposeful, planned instruction was evident in all museum descriptions of adult education.

Included in all museum descriptions of adult education were training for volunteers, non-formal programming for the public, and guided learning opportunities for the casual visitor. Excluded from museum descriptions of adult education were core museum activities such as displays and exhibits.

The particular use of the term in libraries was different. In libraries adult education often meant the services libraries implemented to support self-directed learners. Included were non-instructional educational services such as counselling, reference services, support of community activities and educational brokering (Raymond, 1979; Fiels, 1982). Opinions about the library's role to guide and support, but not to direct adult education often accompanied this use of the term "adult education." Ene Haabnit, for example, called libraries "learning centres, not educational centres." Raymond (1979), Fiels (1982) and Birge (1986), too, felt that library's role was to support self directed learning rather than initiate it.

Philosophical Use

The philosophical use of the term "adult education" arose from the descriptions of the purposes of adult education included in definitions. Three philosophical uses were noted: a humanistic use, an interpretive use and a political use.

Humanistic use. Some authors (Monroe, 1963; Raymond, 1979; and Houle, 1951) and practitioners, particularly in the libraries, viewed adult education as a way to develop personal growth and social well-being. Monroe (1963, p. 15) described the purpose of adult education this way:

. . . to stimulate and guide the community. . . [for] the best growth of the individual in terms of his needs and interests

and for the well-being of society as a whole.

Monroe's thinking was echoed by Ene Haabnit who described adult education as "a humanistic thing, helping people change their behavior so they [could] fill their potential."

Interpretive use. Interpretive use refers to the potential power of adult education to stimulate learning. Usually found in museums, adult education was viewed as a way to make museum exhibits more personally meaningful. Ingrid Kolt in the Surrey Art Gallery saw adult education this way. She said that the purpose of adult education was to learn to actively view art and to develop critical judgement. Others (Murphy, 1970; Richardson, 1968; Wholer, 1976) viewed adult education as a "catalyst to experience" (Murphy, 1970, p. 15), or as a way to inject meaning into an exhibit (Wholer, 1976, p. 7).

Political use. The political use refers to the potential power of adult education to shape public thinking on social issues and in some cases (Chadwick, 1980; Adam, 1939) to be a springboard for social action. Two examples of the political use were found in the museums, the program, "Our Home and Native Land" in the Museum of Anthropology and the program, "What Was Lost" in the Vancouver Museum. None were found in the literature.

Importance of Adult Education

The factors that affect the importance of adult education in libraries and museums were roughly of two types, those that increased and those that decreased.

Factors Which Decreased the Importance of Programming

Four factors that hindered adult education appeared consistently: low priority of management, unclear concept of what programming could do, conflicting notions of the library or museum's role in adult education, and competition from the community.

Low priorities of management. Low management priority for programming was mentioned as the most influential factor four of the six organizations studied. Programming was in a marginalized position in all the organizations except the Surrey Art Gallery. The New Westminster Public Library, the other one that did not mention management priorities, did not mention any organizational factors influencing the importance of programming.

Unclear concept of what programming could do. Unclear concepts of what adult education was or what it could do was often mentioned particularly in the libraries. Monroe (1974), Warncke (1968) and Stevenson (1981) talked about lack of definiteness of the adult education function. Monroe mentioned a lack of consensus about the goals for adult education except at the vaguest level; Warncke about a tenuous relationship between accepted objectives and activities, and Stevenson about a continuing lack of real focus or coherence. Similar thoughts were noted in the field. Ene Haabnit of the Whalley Branch of the Surrey Public Library mentioned that library staff, because they didn't know what adult education was, were unaware of its potential. Elisabeth Scotson, referring to management's attitude rather than her own concept, mentioned that there was not a clear concept of what programming might do for the

organization.

Two conflicting ideas about the role of adult education also appeared. One was whether the library had an obligation to serve individuals (Birge, 1981; Fiels, 1982; Raymond, 1979) or an obligation to serve groups and the community (Warncke, 1968; Phinney, 1968). An obligation to serve individuals over groups would lead libraries to develop reference services to support the work of self-directed learners rather than developing programming services to support groups of learners.

The other issue was based around an active rather than a passive approach to service. As Monroe (1974, p. 338) said, "Libraries . . . have been characterized by a readiness to serve rather than library initiation of services." Some thought that the library should support educational work initiated by others. Others (Stevenson, 1960; Warncke, 1968) felt that the library should take a more active approach, initiating and providing leadership in adult education. In the field, Ene Haabnit saw libraries as "learning centres, not educational centres, part of someone else's learning process, not initiators of it." Favoring a passive role for adult education over an active one would mean that the library would not be aggressive seeking opportunities for programming and would therefore de-emphasize the importance of programming in the organization.

Competition in the community. The kinds of adult education provided elsewhere in the community affected the priority given to programming in libraries and museums. The library would either be duplicating services, competing with other agencies for an audience, or performing a function perceived more appropriate for another agency.

Most striking in this study was an organization considered as a case but not used. The Richmond Public Library had undertaken adult programming at one time, but had stopped because they saw that the public attended other types of community organizations for programs. In the Whalley Branch, also, programming was seen by some in the organization to be an inappropriate function for the library. In museums, both the Vancouver Museum and the Surrey Art Gallery cited competition from the community as a negative factor influencing programming in their organizations.

Factors Which Increased the Importance of Programming

Four factors were found that positively influenced the importance of programming in libraries and museums: differentiation of adult education within the organizational structure, professional training in education or a related discipline, ability to recognize and respond to community needs and interests, and an historical record of success.

Differentiation. Both the number and types of programming were greater in museums than in libraries. In museums the programming function was clearly differentiated in the organizational structure. The influence of differentiation reinforces what Knowles (1980, p.71) said about the importance of differentiating adult education. Knowles said:

It is clear . . . that as institutions recognized the unique requirements of serving the educational needs of adults by establishing differentiated administrative units for this purpose, the volume and quality of those services rose dramatically.

The findings from this study support Knowles' statement. The volume

and quality of services was greater in museums than in libraries. In libraries, the programming function was assigned part time to a librarian with other duties. Usually libraries held programs only once or twice a month. Those programs were usually confined to topics that could be handled by one lecture.

In museums, where there were more programs and greater variety the programming function was clearly differentiated. Museums offered short courses, lectures, workshops, demonstrations, and panel discussions. All the museums had full-time public programmers. Ingrid Kolt at the Surrey Art Gallery affirmed the importance of organizational structure when she said that designating the position showed that the organization placed emphasis on the function. She also said that if programming was everybody's function, then it was nobody's function. Ene Haabnit at the Whalley Branch agreed when she said that one of the negative factors affecting the importance of programming in her organization was that it was no one person's function. Having the function clearly differentiated was a positive factor enhancing the importance of programming in the organization.

Professional training. Another factor is training in education or a relevant discipline. In the two organizations with the most varied and interesting programs, the Surrey Art Gallery and the Vancouver Museum, the programmers had had training in education and communications respectively. In the North Vancouver Public Library where there was a lively and interesting program given the constraints, the programmer was able to put her experience as a journalist to good use. This affirms

what Darkenwald (1974) found when he studied the practice of adult education in adult basic education agencies. He found that those most willing to try new methods of teaching and learning had professional adult education training.

Ability to recognize and respond to the community. The programmer's skills in assessing and responding to community need, particularly in libraries, was a positive factor influencing the importance of programming. All librarians interviewed spoke of the need to listen to the community and develop programs that responded. Ene Haabnit talked about the need to be systematic in developing relationships in the community; Elisabeth Scotson about keeping in touch with local authors, events and undertakings, and Debra Nelson about choosing topics based on community needs and interests.

Historical record of success. Historical success of programming was mentioned as a positive factor in five of the six cases studied. For one, the public responded well to the organization. As Debra Nelson expressed it, "There is a perception among the public that programs are a good thing." For another, the programming function became more acceptable to management. Three programmers of the six interviewed mentioned that they had had to fight for acceptance of the programming function within their organizations. Over time, when they had proven that their programs were successful, programming became more acceptable with management.

Contributions of Adult Education

An opportunity to demonstrate innovativeness, a way to become more aware of and responsive to the community, and philosophical orientation for service were programming's contributions to libraries and museums.

Demonstrate Innovativeness

Programming provided libraries and museums with the opportunity and occasion to demonstrate innovativeness, an opportunity not usually available in routine activities. Particularly in museums, programming provided the occasion for new and interesting ways to enrich collections. According to Naumer (1971), the purpose of education in museums was to arouse curiosity and test powers of observation. Margaret Holm in the Museum of Anthropology described programs as a way to "bring museum objects to life", a way the museum could encourage the public to "integrate the collections into experience." Murphy (1970) echoed the same idea when he talked about education being a "catalyst to experience." Two examples demonstrate the potential of museum education to bring collections to life. One from the literature was Schlereth's (1979) description of the use of popular theatre in which visitors had an opportunity to reenact episodes in American history such as the Boston Tea Party. The purpose was to depict the role violence had played in shaping American history. Another was the use of theatre to enrich the permanent exhibit in the Museum of Anthropology. Snake in the Grass Theatre interpreted the museum's themes dramatically, lending an element of vitality to the collections.

Programming not only provided innovative ways to enrich collections, it also provided a way for the library or museum to demonstrate innovativeness in educational methods. The Surrey Art Gallery, for one, had as one of its mandates "to demonstrate innovativeness in education" (Surrey Art Gallery Mission Statement). The Surrey Art Gallery offered not only lectures, but also concerts, demonstrations and hand-on workshops to enrich exhibits. Other efforts at innovative methodologies were found elsewhere. The Museum of Anthropology offered out of classroom excursions to learn about Northwest Coast Indian art and the Vancouver Museum introduced the public to Vancouver's Heritage by walking tours.

Innovative initiatives through programming did not appear to be emphasized in the libraries as much as the museums. Programming, however, was mentioned in all libraries as a different way that adults could learn. By employing the spoken word instead of the written word and the opportunity to learn in groups rather than individually, programming was an alternative to the traditional way that libraries encouraged learning.

Link Between the Organization and the Community

Programming provided libraries and museums with a way to become more responsive to the community. Libraries, particularly, expressed a concern that they be aware of the needs of the community and find a way to respond to them. Programs, by reflecting a topic of interest, were a way that libraries could keep current with the community. Elisabeth Scotson in the North Vancouver District Library described programming as a communication and contact service, the "inner

wedge" of library service. Debra Nelson in the New Westminster Public Library was aware of planning programs around topics that people wanted or needed, while Ene Haabnit in the Whalley Branch called programming a "demand oriented service." Many in the library literature (Fiels, 1982; Monroe, 1963; Phinney, 1968; Stevenson, 1968; Estabrook, 1979) believed that adult education was an external link between the library and the individuals or organizations the library served. Fiels (1982) even lamented that as funding for community educational institutions had increased, the library's identity and responsiveness to the community had declined.

Not only did programming make libraries and museums more responsive to the community, it also made them more visible. As Georgina Hansen said, "Programming is the most public face of a public institution." Both libraries and museums mentioned programming's contribution to the organization's community profile. Some, like Margaret Holm and Georgina Hansen, saw programming as a way to make museums more appealing beyond their traditional upper middle class audience. Others like Elisabeth Scotson and Ene Haabnit saw programming as a way to create a favorable impression of the library and to promote library services. For example, Ene Haabnit said that through programs the library could be seen as a place that cared about people. In the museums, Ingrid Kolt said that the Surrey Art Gallery relied on programming as a way to attract the public to the gallery. Because the gallery was hard to reach and competed with others for an audience, programming was considered a vital function. She even said that in difficult times the gallery turned more to programming as a way

to keep their audience.

Philosophical Orientation

Programming was a way that the organization could express its philosophy for service. The reverse was also true. The philosophy behind programming also contributed to the organization. Adult education was seen as a way that the library could nurture personal growth and social development. Personal growth (Monroe, 1963; Phinnney, 1956; Murphy, 1970) was seen as a way, through adult education, that the library or museum user could recognize his or her potentialities, hone their skills, and realize their potential. Monroe (1963, p. 489) writing about the contributions of adult education, said that the "average man should educate himself and be able to make judgements. Adult education has provided an enriched philosophy and necessary library service and skills to realize its historic role."

Contribution to social development ranged from making better citizens through adult education (Monroe, 1963; Johnson, 1938) to promoting social change (Adams, 1939; Chadwick, 1980). This contribution, however, appeared to be more idealistic than realistic.

Implications from this Study

There are four ways that this study could influence the practice and theory of adult education.

Increasing Awareness of Various Definitions

This study has shown that the process oriented approach taken toward the definition of adult education was not the approach taken in the field. In libraries and museums, those responsible for adult education

thought more of aims and outcomes than they did about processes. Moreover, the description of adult education activities, particularly in libraries, included more than programming. Libraries also included information (through books, displays and exhibits), guidance (through reference services), and support (through provision of materials for the adult education work of other community agencies).

The literature suggested that the definition of adult education was influenced by the purpose of the organization in which it was practiced. That notion was supported by this study. As such, different definitions, based on findings from this study, could be given for adult education in libraries and in museums. In libraries, a definition that reflects the library's broad, educative role in the community would be appropriate:

. . . linking mature people to the resources they require in order to achieve learning appropriate to their needs.

In museums, a definition which reflects the museum's more specialized role of collecting and exhibiting materials on a particular theme would be appropriate:

. . . enriching content so that patrons can learn more about exhibits.

The fact that definitions of adult education used in libraries and museums varied from the one used in this study implies that if we as adult educators wish to work in organizations such as libraries and museums, we must respect the various ways different organizations define and describe adult education.

The Effect of Contextual Factors

Three sets of contextual factors affect adult education in libraries and museums.

Organizational context. The fact that libraries and museums have a number of functions has implications for the adult education function. For one, study of the uses of adult education has shown that programs are closely related to other functions of the organization, as in the use of programs to interpret exhibits. In the Vancouver Museum, the programmer worked closely with the exhibit designer for the "Birth Project" series. This type of practice is to be encouraged. It has also shown that, unfortunately, adult education can have a lower priority than other functions of the organization. The fact that other functions influence the adult education function means that adult educators must be aware of and work closely with other parts of the organization.

Purpose of the organization. The organization's purpose in society has an effect the role of adult education. Libraries act as a resource centre for the whole community whereas museums are more specialized. Libraries must be aware of and respond to the whole community; programming is one way libraries reach out to the community. In this study programming was marginal to the library's main function, collecting and distributing materials, and was adequately served by a librarian who combined the programming function with other functions of her job.

Museums exist for a different purpose. Their role is to collect and exhibit materials on a certain theme. Museums generally do not have the broad public appeal that libraries have. Programming is a way to

interpret the exhibits, a way to make museums more appealing to the public. The museums in this study seemed an appropriate place for an adult education specialist. For while the content of programs was determined by the exhibits, there was plenty of room for innovative methods of teaching and learning. The fact that different types of organizations have different uses for adult education implies professional adult educators would be more useful to some types of organizations than others.

Community context. The role of other community adult education agencies also has an effect on programs in libraries and museums. For instance, libraries and museums could find themselves competing for the same audiences. The fact that two or more agencies may be offering a similar type of service means that the person responsible for programming has to be aware of what is happening in other parts of the community so they do not duplicate services.

For another, the public does not associate programming with some types of agencies. This is what had happened to the Richmond Public Library. The public would come to the library to borrow books but would attend another kind of agency for a program. The value of programming for libraries was debated in both the literature and the libraries studied. Museums, on the other hand, did seem to question the value of programming. This also suggests that programming is more appropriate in some kinds of agencies than others. The adult educator needs to choose his or her environment with care.

Role for Adult Educators

A role for professional adult educators in libraries and museums depends upon the organization's reasons for conducting programs and the priority given to adult education. Programming in libraries seemed adequately served by a librarian with other responsibilities. If, however, the library were to take a leadership role in providing adult education for the community as the literature suggests it might, a professional adult educator would be an asset to the organization. Museums, however, were places where an adult education specialist would be an asset. Design and delivery of programs was an important part of museum operations.

This study has also shown that the adult educator can be in a precarious position in libraries and museums. In at least four of the organizations studied, programming was in a marginalized position. Those who wish to practice adult education in those organizations must ensure that they establish a position for themselves. They must first gain acceptance by establishing a competent and successful record as had been done in the Vancouver Museum, the Surrey Art Gallery, and the North Vancouver District Library. The marginal position also means adult educators must be aware of political nuances which could affect their position in the organization. For example, the Surrey Art Gallery was going to have a new director at the time of this study. A change in management could have important implications for the position of programming in the organization. Adult educators who wish to work in multi-function organizations need to be politically aware, have the ability to defend themselves when necessary, and be prepared to fight for the adult

education function when it is threatened.

Effect of adult education training. The study has shown that professional training in adult education or another discipline makes a difference in the quality of service. The three organizations with the most varied and interesting programs all had practitioners with training in addition to library or museum training. Ingrid Kolt at the Surrey Art Gallery had a teaching certificate plus experience in working with people with learning difficulties; Georgina Hansen at the Vancouver Museum had a university degree in communications, and Elisabeth Scotson at the North Vancouver District Library had experience as a journalist, one that taught her how to research the community. In the writer's opinion, those organizations where professional adult educators could make a contribution, but who hire a subject specialist instead, lose some of the benefits that knowledge of adult learning and skills in program development could bring.

Implications for Schroeder's Typology

In this study the term "allied function" was taken to mean "as important as other functions of the organization" as Schroeder's typology seemed to imply. This study revealed, however, that the adult education function was less important than other functions of the organization. What are the implications of this finding for Schroeder's typology? The answer to this question seems to lie in the definition of adult education, specifically in the identification of adult education activities. It would have been more appropriate to examine Schroeder's typology using Schroeder's definition of adult education. But his definition of adult education as a "developmental process" was too ambiguous and could not be

operationalized for use in this study. We cannot tell exactly which activities in the organization to call "adult education." If we do not know what Schroeder meant by "adult education", we cannot clearly understand what he meant by the terms that describe its relationship to the rest of the organization: "central", "secondary", "allied" or "subordinate." For example, if "developmental process" referred to programming, adult education in libraries and museums is clearly not an "allied function." If, however, "developmental process" could refer to the library's or museums educational mission in society, education for both children and adults is clearly a "central function." In short, because adult education cannot be identified operationally with Schroeder's definition, his typology cannot be closely examined and criticized.

Nonetheless, Schroeder's typology has contributed much to the study of adult education. For one, Schroeder has increased our understanding of the field of operations. He has drawn our attention to the organizational context of adult education by constructing his typology around the importance of adult education relative to other functions of the organization. Even though we cannot tell the exact relationship of adult education to the rest of the organization, we do know that adult education assumes different positions in different organizations.

Schroeder has offered us the possibility of adult education being used as an "allied function." This study, through examining the organizational context of libraries and museums and through identifying a range of uses for adult education, has offered adult educators a better understanding of how to make adult education an "allied function."

Suggestions for Further Research

Two further areas of research are suggested by this study, one pertaining to the organizational context of adult education and one pertaining to the community context of libraries.

Apart from a few studies (Knox, 1980; Darkenwald, 1974; and Clark, 1964), little research has been conducted on the organizational context of adult education. Since many adult educators practice in settings in which adult education is one of a number of functions, it would be interesting to know more about the organizational dynamics that affect the practice of adult education in these settings. It would be possible to build a study from the findings of the second research question. The factors that influence the importance of adult education could be taken as variables and the effect of each one could be assessed against the importance of adult education in an organization. Greater understanding of the forces that affect adult education could lead to greater knowledge about ways to strengthen the position of adult education in multi-function organizations.

Another area of research suggested by this study would be to assess the effect of services in a community on the programs of libraries. Competition for the same audiences was mentioned as a negative factor influencing the importance of programming. Fiels (1982) mentioned also that as educational services in the community had increased, the educational work traditionally provided by libraries had decreased. Further, the New Westminster Public Library was the only library that offered programs for service reasons, causing the researcher to wonder

what services were not provided in New Westminster that were provided in other communities. It would be interesting, therefore, to assess the ways other community services impact on the educational work of libraries.

APPENDIX 1

Table Shells

PROGRAM	Description	Use
<u>1984</u>		

(A page similar to this one was used to document programs in each organization.)

APPENDIX 2

INTERVIEW SCHEDULE

I DEFINITION OF ADULT EDUCATION

As a basis for studying adult education activities in an organization there needs to be a clear understanding of what is meant by the term "adult education." In this section you will be asked to describe what activities you consider to be adult education, your organization's policies concerning adult education and to give your own definition of adult education.

1. What kinds of library/museum activities do you describe as adult education?

2. Does your organization have a written policy statement for adult education? Y _____ N _____

If yes, define policy _____

3. How would you define the term "adult education?"

II. IMPORTANCE OF PROGRAMMING

Library and museum literature reflects different points view on the importance of programming relative to other functions of the organization. In some organizations it appears to be a more important part of the total organizational activities than in others. The literature also suggests a number of factors in an organization that could influence the importance of adult education in that organization. In the following section you will be asked to both list and rank the main functions of the organization in order to see where adult education "fits." You will also be asked to assess those factors in your organization that influence the importance of adult education.

1. What do you consider the main functions of your organization?

2. Please rank them in order of importance, from most important to least important.

3. Please give your reasons for ranking them as you did.

4. What factors do you consider influence the importance of programming in your organization?

5. Please rank them in order of importance, most important to least important.

III. USES OF PROGRAMMING

In the time remaining could you please describe some of the most notable programs your organization has conducted during the past three years. Please name them, describe them, and give a brief rationale as to why it was offered.

1. Program title _____

Description of program _____

Rationale _____

2. Program title _____

Description of program _____

Rationale for offering program _____

3. Program Title _____

Description of program _____

Rationale for offering program _____

4. Program title _____

Description of program _____

Rationale for offering program _____

5. Program title _____

Description of program _____

Rationale for offering program _____

III. OTHER

Please add any other information to this interview that you would like to add.

Thank you for your time. As mentioned in the beginning of this interview, adult education in community organizations is an area that has not been well researched in adult education. The information you have given here will help to shed some light on a large, but relatively unknown area of adult education.

REFERENCES

- Adam, T.R. (1939). The museum and popular culture. New York: American Association for Adult Education.
- Adult Education Association, Committee on Social Philosophy, (1952). Principles which should guide the adult education movement. Adult Education, 2(1), 124-132.
- Bestau, J.M. (1969). What can museums offer? Adult Education, 42(5), 315-319.
- Birge, L.E. (1981). Serving adult learners: A public library tradition. Chicago: American Library Association.
- Bob, M.L. (1982). Another look at programming: Dissenting from the dissenting view of programming in American libraries. The Bookmark, 40(III), 158-164.
- Boles, S. and Smith, B. (1979). Learners' advisory service. Library Trends, 28(2), 165-178.
- Boyd, R.D., Apps, J.W. and Assoc. (1980). Redefining the discipline of adult education. San Fransisco: Jossey Bass.
- Chadwick, A.F. (1980). The role of the museum and art gallery in community education. Nottingham: Barnes & Humby, Ltd.
- Chancellor, J.M. (1939). Helping adults to learn: The library in action. Chicago: American Library Association.

- Clark, B. (1968). Adult education in transition. Los Angeles: University of California Press.
- Darkenwald, G. (1977). Innovation in adult education: An organizational analysis. Adult Education, 27(3), 156-172.
- Estabrook, L. (1979). Trends in community library services. Library Trends, 28(2), 129-138.
- Fiels, K.M.(1982). Toward learning communities: Adult independent learning and the library. The Bookmark, 40(III), 158-163.
- Gelpi, E. (1979). A future for life-long education. Manchester Monographs, 2(13), 104-109.
- Gregg, C. (1960). Museums and art institutes and adult education. In M.S. Knowles (Ed.), Handbook of adult education in the United States (pp. 330-338). Chicago: Adult Education Association of the U.S.A.
- Hamp, S.K. (1984). Subject over object: Interpreting the museum as artifact. Museum News, 63(2), 33-37.
- Houle, C.O. (1951). Libraries in adult and fundamental education: The report of the Malmo seminar. Paris: Unesco.
- Houle, C.O. (1960). The education of adult education leaders. In M.S. Knowles (Ed.), Handbook of adult education in the U.S.A. (pp. 117-128). Chicago: Adult Education Association of the U.S.A.
- Knowles, M.S. (1960). Handbook of adult education in the United States. Chicago: Adult Education Association of the U.S.A.

- Knowles, M.S. (1964). The field of operations in adult education. In G. Jensen, A.A. Liveright, W. Hallenbeck (Eds.), Adult education: Outlines of an emerging field of university study (pp. 41-67). United States: Adult Education Association of the U.S.A.
- Knowles, M.S. (1980). The modern practice of adult education: From pedagogy to andragogy. Chicago: Follett.
- Knox, A.B. (1982). Organizational dynamics in university continuing professional education. Adult Education, 32(3), 117-129.
- Larabee, E. (1968). Museums and adult education. Washington, D.C.: Smithsonian Institute Press.
- Lawrence, P.R. and Lorsch, J.W. (1967). Differentiation and administration in complex organizations. Administrative Science Quarterly, 12, 1-47.
- Lee, R.E. (1966) Continuing education through the American public library, 1833-1964. Chicago: American Library Association.
- Leone, M.P. (1983). Method as message. Interpreting the past with the public. Museum News, 62(1), 34-41.
- Lyman, H.H. (1979). Literacy education as a library community service. Library Trends, 28(2), 193-217.
- Lyman, H.H. (1973). Reading and the new adult reader. Library Trends, 22(2), 197-217.
- McNeil, T.(1985). Adult education in voluntary organizations. Learning, 111(2), 11-17.

- Monroe, M.E. (1963). Library adult education. The biography of a new idea. New York: Scarecrow Press.
- Monroe, M.E. (1974). Evaluation of public services for adults. Library Trends, 22(3), 337-360.
- Monroe, M.E. (1979). Emerging patterns of community service. Library Trends, 28(2), 129-138.
- Munn, R.R. (1968). Library leadership through adult group services -- an assessment. Library Trends, 17(1), 86-95.
- Murphy, J.T. (1970). What you can do with your education department. Museum News, 49(2), 14-17.
- Naumer, H.J. (1971). A marketable product. Museum News, 50(2), 14-16.
- Peters, John M. & Assoc. (1980). Building an effective adult education enterprise. San Fransisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Phinney, E. (1956). Library adult education in action: Five case studies. Chicago: American Library Association.
- Phinney, E. (1968). Trends and needs: The present condition and future improvement of group services. Library Trends, 17(1), 96-108.
- Raymond, B. (1978). Libraries and popular education: Proceedings of a one-day symposium held at the School of Library Service, Dalhousie University Libraries and Dalhousie School of Library Service. Occasional Paper 20.

- Rubin, R.J. (1979). Uses of bibliotherapy in response to the 1970's. Library Trends, 28(2), 239-252.
- Schlereth, T.J. (1984). Causing conflict, doing violence. Museum News, 63(1), 45-52.
- Schroeder, W.L. (1970). Adult education defined and described. In R.M. Smith, G.F. Aker and J.R. Kidd (Eds.), Handbook of adult education (pp. 32-47). New York: McMillan.
- Schroeder, W.L. (1980). A typology of adult learning systems. In J.M. Peters (Ed.), Building an effective adult education enterprise. (pp. 42-68), San Fransisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Schull, D.D. (1985). Shhh...owtime at the library! Exhibits lend new life to old institutions. Museum News, 63 (4), 37-41.
- Sinclair, D. (1968). Materials to meet special needs. Library Trends, 17(1), 36-47.
- Smith, H.L. (1954). Adult education activities in public libraries. Chicago: American Library Association.
- Stevenson, G.T. (1960). Adult education in libraries. In M.S. Knowles (Ed.), Handbook of adult education in the U.S.A. (pp. 340-345). Chicago: Adult Education Association of the U.S.A.
- Stevenson, G.T. (1968). Group services in public libraries: Introduction. Library Trends, 17(1), 3-5. ,31(3), 142-154.
- Stone, W.C. (1953). Adult education and the public library. Library Trends, 1(4), 437-451.

- Thomas, A.M. (1964). Program in adult education. In G. Jensen, A.A. Liveright, W. Hallenbeck (Eds), Adult education: Outlines of an emerging field of university study (pp. 241-269). United States: Adult Education Association.
- Verner, C. (1964). Definition of terms. In G. Jensen, A.A. Liveright, W. Hallenbeck (Eds), Adult education: Outlines of an emerging field of university study (pp. 27-39). United States: Adult Education Association.
- Verner, C., & Booth, A. (1964). Adult education. Washington, D.C.: Center for Applied Research in Education.
- Walker, C.B. (1984). The kind of response art can have. Museum News, 63(1), 37-44.
- Warncke, R. (1968). Library objectives and community needs. Library Trends, 17(1), 6-13.
- Washburn, W.E. (1964). The museum's responsibility in adult education. Curator, VII(1), 33-38.
- Wholer, J.P. (1976). The history museum as an effective educational institution. Ottawa: National Museums of Canada.
- Wiltshire, H., Taylor, J., Jennings, B. (Eds.) (1980). The 1919 Report. The final and interim reports of the adult education committee of the ministry of reconstruction, 1918-1919. Nottingham: Barnes and Humby Ltd.
- Yin, R.K. (1985). Case study research: Design and methods. Beverly Hills: Sage Publications.

Zeller, T. (1985). Art museum educators: Who are they? Museum News, 63(5), 53-59.

Zetterberg, H.L. (1969). Museums and adult education. New York: Augustus M. Kelly (with the help of UNESCO).