In presenting this thesis in partial fulfilment of the requirements for an advanced degree at the University of British Columbia, I agree that the Library shall make it freely available for reference and study. I further agree that permission for extensive copying of this thesis for scholarly purposes may be granted by the head of my department or by his or her representatives. It is understood that copying or publication of this thesis for financial gain shall not be allowed without my written permission.
ABSTRACT

This thesis examines the social and intellectual history of an apparently disparate group of voluntary associations and their members in Vancouver, British Columbia, 1886-1916. These associations sought to educate their own members, and often the general community, in the arts, in history, in science, in public affairs, and in matters of physical, vocational, and moral welfare. Vancouver’s Art, Historical and Scientific Association, its natural history and literary societies, and its YMCA are central to the discussion.

These associations’ educational practices embodied a form of “intentional mutual enlightenment.” The term refers to the non-formal education of adults through voluntary associations. Primarily through social, economic, intellectual, and political inferences from historical evidence, the thesis explains the meaning that “mutual enlightenment” had for participants. It pays attention to the contexts of late Victorian and Edwardian intellectual thought, and of British Columbia social and economic development. The thesis describes and explains both the reasons—stated and structural—for participants’ involvement, and the social, political, and economic functions of the mutual enlightenment associations.

To get at those reasons, the study examines interrelationships between ideas and their social circumstances, and how these inter-relationships gave rise to mutual enlightenment. Further, it examines mutual enlightenment (1) through an analysis of ten exemplar voluntary associations, (2) through a study of the ambient social structure and its reflection of and support for mutual enlightenment associations, and (3) through a conceptually satisfying definition of “intentional mutual enlightenment.”

The argument is this: the context largely determined, and now explains the nature of mutual enlightenment. Vancouver’s social, political, and economic arrangements, and its residents’ ideas, manners, tastes, and values accounted for the objectives, programmes, and membership of mutual enlightenment associations. Vancouver’s intellectual climate and cultural forms had been imported primarily by middle-class residents from their original homes and homelands, mainly from Great Britain, or from Britain as modified through Central and Eastern Canadian experience.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abstract .................................................................................................................. ii

List of Tables ......................................................................................................... vi

List of Figures ........................................................................................................ vii

Acknowledgement ................................................................................................. viii

Abstract..................................................................................................................... ii

Acknowledgements ................................................................................................. ix

Chapter 1. INTRODUCTION ................................................................................. 1
  1.1. Introductory Note .......................................................................................... 1
  1.2. Intentional Mutual Enlightenment in Early Vancouver ....................... 2
  1.3. The Background: Vancouver, British Columbia, 1886-1916 ............. 4
  1.4. The Background: Related Literature ....................................................... 17
  1.5. The Methodology: A Social History of Ideas ....................................... 21
      1.5.1. “The Utilitarian Ideal” ..................................................................... 22
      1.5.2. “Clerisy,” “Class,” “Culture,” and “Civilization” ....................... 23
      1.5.3. Defining “Mutual Enlightenment” ................................................ 29
      1.5.4. Exemplar Associations of Mutual Enlightenment .................. 32
      1.5.5. Mutual Enlightenment and the Social Structure: A Prosopography 34
  1.6. Conclusion ................................................................................................... 37

Chapter 2. “LIGHT, MORE LIGHT” 1: BRINGING AESTHETIC, INTELLECTUAL, AND MORAL “TONE” TO EARLY VANCOUVER ............................... 39
  2.1. Introductory Note ....................................................................................... 39
      2.1.1. The Art, Historical and Scientific Association of Vancouver: A Case Study of Mutual Enlightenment ................................................................. 41
  2.2. The Art, Historical and Scientific Association, 1894-1916 .............. 43
  2.3. Art, Historical and Scientific Association: Aims and Intellectual Heritage .................................................................................................................. 48
      2.3.1. Reverend Tucker: To Inspire, To Enlighten, and To Build ........... 51
      2.3.2. Art, Mrs. Mellon, and Utilitarian Motives .................................. 57
  2.4. Summary .................................................................................................... 60

Chapter 3. “LIGHT, MORE LIGHT” 2: FROM “TONE” TO BRITISH CIVILIZATION THROUGH MUTUAL ENLIGHTENMENT ........................................ 63
  3.1. Introductory Note: Ideas in Practice ....................................................... 63
  3.2. Mutual Enlightenment: Historical Background ..................................... 66
  3.3. The Art, Historical and Scientific Association: A Bi-focal Pedagogy and Curriculum ............................................................................................... 72
      3.3.1. For Members Mostly: Class and Cultivation Through Lecture and Conversazione ................................................................. 73
7.2.2. “To Build a Symmetrical Christian Manhood”:
   A Four-Fold Programme ........................................ 218
7.3. “The care of the stranger”: The Vancouver YWCA .......... 226
7.4. Oratory and the Debating Tradition: The Burrard Literary Club . 232
7.5. Members’ Motives: Recreation, Vocation, and Advancement ...... 235
7.6. Protestant, Celtic, and Canadian: “The City Commonwealth” .... 243
7.7. Summary and Conclusion ........................................ 251

Chapter 8. SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION: MUTUAL ENLIGHTENMENT
   MAPPED ............................................................................. 254
8.1. Introductory Note ...................................................... 254
8.3. “Mutual Enlightenment” Modelled ................................. 260
8.4. The Social Significance of Mutual Enlightenment ................ 264
8.5. Mutual Enlightenment: Reasons for Participation ............... 268
8.6. Concluding Note ...................................................... 270

BIBLIOGRAPHY .................................................................... 272
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1. Population Growth in British Columbia, Victoria, and Vancouver, 1881-1921 ..... 7
Table 2. Occupations of Art, Historical and Scientific Association Members ................. 121
Table 3. Social Prestige of Art, Historical and Scientific Association Members
Through Published Biographies or as a “Business Leader” ................................. 123
Table 4. Residential Distribution of Art, Historical and Scientific Association
Members Compared to Vancouver Business Leaders ................................................. 125
Table 5. Educational Background of Art, Historical and Scientific Association
Members Compared to Vancouver Business Leaders and the Social Upper Class 126
Table 6. National Origins of Art, Historical and Scientific Association Members
Compared to Vancouver Business Leaders .......................................................... 131
Table 7. National Origins of Arts and Crafts Association (ACA) and Naturalists’
Field Club (NFC) Members ........................................................................... 171
Table 8. Occupations of Arts and Crafts Association (ACA) and Naturalists’ Field
Club (NFC) Members, Employed or of Immediate Relative .................................. 178
Table 9. Occupations of the YMCA and Burrard Literary Club (BLC) Members, and
YMCA Physical Department Petitioners ............................................................. 237
Table 10. Religious Affiliation of the YMCA and Burrard Literary Club (BLC)
Members Compared with Art, Historical and Scientific Association (AHSA),
Arts and Crafts Association (ACA), and Naturalists’ Field Club (NFC) Members 244
Table 11. National Origins of YMCA and Burrard Literary Club (BLC) Members .... 245
LIST OF FIGURES

Fig. 1. Pedagogies of mutual enlightenment. Programme orientation options for associations of mutual enlightenment. ................................................................. 167

Fig. 2. Pedagogies of mutual enlightenment. Programme options for associations of mutual enlightenment. ................................................................. 261
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

An undertaking such as this thesis owes much to the contributions, large and small, of many individuals. I thank them all. Some, however, deserve mention.

I am especially indebted, and sincerely grateful, for the attention, guidance, and support of my thesis chairman, Professor William ("Bill") Bruneau. It was he, at our early meetings, who suggested the term “intentional mutual enlightenment.” It was also Bill who taught me the most about doing and loving history. I leant heavily on both his ear and his mind. I thank him for his faith.

Professors Roger Boshier and Gordon Selman, committee members, also deserve thanks. Professor Boshier, as my programme advisor, both inspired me and gave me confidence to try something “different.” He gave me my first “taste” of doing history. Professor Selman further contributed to my appreciation of history, especially of Canadian adult education history. I especially thank both these men for their support and encouragement.

Special acknowledgement is also due the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada for the two years’ funding they provided me.

I also thank Anna Sumpton and Joan Stekl, Vancouver City Archives, and George Brandak, U.B.C. Special Collections, for their help. Peter van den Bosch and David Townsend, computing centre consultants, who resolved “bugs” in my textprocessing. Laine Ruus from the Data Library helped me to collate data.

Finally, I want to thank two very special ladies. Esther Birney, fellow counsellor, literateur, and friend, lent me ongoing inspiration and support. She especially taught me to appreciate history and literature—subjects that I had previously underestimated. And, finally, Wendy Hunt, my wife both supported and enabled me to return to university and to continue with this rather extensive project.

I wish to dedicate this thesis to my grandparents, Ada and Clifford Greyell, and to my great aunt and uncle, Nellie and Harold Wilson.
CHAPTER 1.

INTRODUCTION

*In companions
That do converse and waste the time together,
Whose souls do bear an equal yoke of love,
There must needs be a like proportion
Of lineaments, of manners, and of spirit.*

1.1. INTRODUCTORY NOTE

Historians, especially in Canada, have long overlooked the education of adults. They have concerned themselves with formal institutions intended for youth, including the school and university, and their attendant clienteles, staff, administrative bodies, and promoters. They have examined the origin, aims, philosophy, and objectives of schooling, its bureaucratic structures, its functions, and its impact. They have sought to locate the “school” within its socio-economic and political context, carefully reconstructing relevant variables to describe and explain the phenomenon under investigation.

Adult education history only recently has begun to tackle questions that have preoccupied mainstream historians of education for twenty years. With some exceptions, most adult education history has been recorded by dedicated amateurs, those


lovers of “things past.” No longer acceptable is the “whiggish chronicle, a quick tour of the past in search of the antecedents of contemporary educational institutions.” Adult education history must address the “new” questions of “power and legitimation, social space and autonomy, production and reproduction, [and] of social formation and cultural experience.”

1.2. INTENTIONAL MUTUAL ENLIGHTENMENT IN EARLY VANCOUVER

This study examines intentional mutual enlightenment. The setting is Vancouver, British Columbia, circa 1886-1916. This period marked Vancouver’s emergence and growth from a lumber-milling camp to become, after 1900, the province’s metropolitan centre. The year 1886 saw the city's birth, and 1916, during the First World War, witnessed the birth of the Vancouver Institute, a public adult education venture launched by several prominent, often scholarly, voluntary associations in co-operation with the new University of British Columbia (inaugurated 1915). The Institute became the city’s elite body of public enlightenment.

Briefly, “intentional mutual enlightenment” refers to non-formal adult education.


through voluntary associations.

These organizations sought to educate their own members, and often the general community, in the arts, in history, in science, in public affairs, and in matters of physical, vocational, and moral welfare. Vancouver's Art, Historical and Scientific Association, its natural history and literary societies, and its YMCA are central to the discussion which follows.

They had been formed by the city's citizens in one of the British Empire's last frontiers. To survive and to develop, to become an attractive community, and to dominate in regional economic and cultural development, Vancouver's citizens needed to make, out of a disparate and fragmented set of cultural artifacts, an appropriate cultural, intellectual, scientific, technological, recreational, and moral backdrop to the everyday business of earning a living. As in the "old country" or in Eastern and Central Canada, an important method of the day was the voluntary association, and specifically those with broadly educational aims. Governments still limited their interventions in the social, cultural, and adult educational domains. Public night school and university extension were only just beginning.

The thesis, through social, economic, intellectual, and political inferences from historical evidence, explains the meaning that "mutual enlightenment" had for participants. It pays attention to the contexts of late Victorian and Edwardian intellectual thought, and of British Columbia social and economic development. The thesis describes and explains both the reasons—stated and structural—for participants' involvement, and the social, political, and economic functions of the mutual enlightenment associations.

This phenomenon of mutual enlightenment is best understood in a multi-faceted context. This is to reject a certain number of older explanations—notably, the strictly political, sociological, and economic (e.g., Industrial Revolution and connected phenomena). I chose instead to examine the interrelationships between ideas and their social circumstances, and how these interrelationships gave rise to and can now explain mutual enlightenment.

In particular, I shall argue that Vancouver's social, political, and economic arrangements, and its residents' ideas and manners, tastes and values accounted for the objectives, programmes, and membership of mutual enlightenment associations.
Vancouver’s intellectual climate and cultural forms had been imported primarily by middle-class residents from their original homes and homelands, mainly from Great Britain, or from Britain as modified through Central and Eastern Canadian experience.

The thesis also shows how my notion of "mutual enlightenment" had to be modified to fit these facts. "Mutual enlightenment" was an heuristic concept. It required repeated modification and clarification throughout the study through examples of actual practice. Its definition was thus changed to suit the facts, not just to respond to logical requirements. Its provisional meaning thus became looser in order to accommodate variations in the approaches by which an association might educate its own members and interested publics.

The central questions of this thesis thus are: (1) what was the nature of, and the extent of, and what were the reasons for, intentional mutual enlightenment? (2) What led promoters and participants to take up mutual enlightenment? (3) What did intentional mutual enlightenment mean to them? (4) And, how did these reasons and configurations of mutual enlightenment associations reflect the social, intellectual, economic, political, and cultural arrangements—or contexts—of late nineteenth- and early twentieth-century Vancouver?

1.3. THE BACKGROUND: VANCOUVER, BRITISH COLUMBIA, 1886-1916

British Columbia may be said to have a standard comparable, at least in essential features, with the most highly developed social organization elsewhere. Its communal characteristics are not, it is needless to say, evolved from local and primitive conditions, but transplanted from the most highly civilized parts of the British Empire....With...churches, schools, lodges, social forms, old-time recreations—all re-established on former lines[—]it is often a surprise to newcomers, who have associated life in the “wild and wooly West” with bears, cowboys, Indians, bowie-knives and desperadoes [sic], to find that they are still far away from the danger of being eaten up by wild beasts, tomahawked and scalped, or shot at sight. They find a state of society almost identical with that which they left.7

With these words, R. Edward Gosnell, in the 1897 Year Book of British Columbia, sought to inspire prospective “newcomers” to immigrate to the newly opening bounty of British Columbia. Here “the law is administered fairly and firmly and is respected

7R. E. Gosnell, The Year Book of British Columbia and Manual of Provincial Information to which is Added a Chapter Containing Much Special Information Respecting the Canadian Yukon and Northern Territory Generally (Victoria: 1897), p. 412.
thoroughly," and here "the residences...aspire to be ranked with those of 'Merrie
England.'" He painted a picture of incomparable attractiveness and civility.

Gosnell was a British Columbia newspaperman, civil servant, provincial librarian and archivist, secretary to the premier, and founder of the provincial bureau of information. He was also an historian, an ardent imperialist, and a founder of the Vancouver Art, Historical and Scientific Association. Like many others, he firmly believed that British Columbia’s destiny lay "as a greater Britain on the Pacific, where British arts and institutions will expand under fresh impetus, 'where the British flag will forever fly....'"

The expansion and development of the province—economically, culturally, and socially—had been rapid, even if over-romanticized by Gosnell. With completion of the Canadian Pacific Railway in 1886, and especially after the economic depression of the 1890s, British Columbia’s economy and population experienced dramatic growth. Railway companies vied to penetrate vast areas of the province. The Interior lands were opened to settlement, agriculture, and mining. And people came. Whether from overseas, Europe (especially the British Isles), from Asia, or from other parts of North America, British Columbia’s population virtually quadrupled, from 98,173 in 1891 to 392,480 in 1911.

The city of Vancouver mirrored, and in fact far surpassed this expansion in its own spectacular growth. An insignificant coastal lumber-milling village in the early 1880s, Vancouver quickly grew by 1901 to a respectable 27,010 (38,311 in the local region including New Westminster and Richmond). By 1911, however, the city had blossomed into a bustling metropolis of 123,902, containing over thirty per cent of the province’s total population. With completion of the Canadian Pacific Railway (C.P.R.) in 1887, the city became a critical link in “The Great Red Line,” the British Empire’s transportation and

---

8Ibid., pp. 413-414.
10Ibid., p. 22.
12Canada, Fourth Census of Canada, 1901, vol. 1 (Ottawa: S. E. Dawson, Printer to the King’s Most Excellent Majesty, 1902), pp. 284-5, 418; Canada, Fifth Census of Canada, 1911, vol. 2 (Ottawa: C. H. Parmelee, Printer to the King’s Most Excellent Majesty, 1913), p. 378. The 1911 population figures for Vancouver include Vancouver city (population 100,401), and its contiguous suburbs, North and South Vancouver and Point Grey. For the region comparable to that for 1901, that is including Richmond and New Westminster, the population was 149,490.
communication route from the Orient via Canada to London. Moreover, it became the destination of tens of thousands of mainly British and Canadian immigrants.\textsuperscript{13}

The influence of the British immigrants was “indeed...so pervasive, long standing, and taken for granted,” that it has been all but ignored in scholarly research.\textsuperscript{14} By 1911, English, Scots, Irish, and Welsh immigrants comprised nearly one-third (39,883) of the city’s metropolitan population (excluding New Westminster and Richmond) of 123,902.\textsuperscript{15} Added to that were other “colonials” from Australia, New Zealand, and South Africa, giving the city a distinctly British flavour.

Dubbed “The Empire City” by the \textit{The Vancouver Daily News-Advertiser},\textsuperscript{16} Vancouver became the dominant economic and metropolitan centre in British Columbia. By 1900, the city had captured from Victoria the economic dynamism to make it completely dominant in population (see Table 1), and in the province’s financial, management, service, transportation, and industrial activities. Between 1900 and 1914, Vancouver had its


\textsuperscript{15}Canada, \textit{Fifth Census, 1911}.

\textsuperscript{16}\textit{The Vancouver Daily News-Advertiser}, 11 September 1888.
“golden age.” The city was marked by dramatic growth and prosperity. These developments have formed the basis for and set the tone of the city’s physical and economic character to this day.17

**TABLE 1.**

**POPULATION GROWTH IN BRITISH COLUMBIA, VICTORIA, AND VANCOUVER, 1881-1921**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>British Columbia</th>
<th>Victoria City</th>
<th>Vancouver City</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1881</td>
<td>49,459</td>
<td>5,925</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1891</td>
<td>98,173</td>
<td>16,841</td>
<td>13,709</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1901</td>
<td>178,657</td>
<td>20,919</td>
<td>27,010</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1911</td>
<td>392,480</td>
<td>31,660</td>
<td>100,401</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1921</td>
<td>524,582</td>
<td>38,727</td>
<td>117,217</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Economically, Vancouver changed from a British mercantile and maritime outpost to a North American corporate and industrial centre. The city assumed the economic characteristics of turn-of-the-century Eastern cities. The logging and wood products manufacturing industry, based in Vancouver, displaced salmon canning and Vancouver Island coal mining as British Columbia’s leading industries. The C.P.R. and newer railway developments, along with Kootenay mining, Okanagan fruit farming, and the rise of a prairie wheat economy, somewhat dependent on west coast ports, all tied Vancouver into the Canadian and continental economy.18

Vancouver was a city of wild, and often realizable, dreams. Rabid speculation, in real estate especially, but also in industry, in transportation, and in financial services, was the order of the day. Widely promoted through overseas publications, Vancouver could boast of a mild climate, a wide and beautiful harbour, a magnificent setting, and a seemingly unbounded hinterland filled with timber, fish, mineral, and agricultural resources (real and potential). Most significantly, the city and its resources were now tied closely to Canada, the United States, and the world through the Canadian Pacific and other companies of the new steel and steam transportation age. Vancouver businessmen were so confident by 1905 that some of them, the Hundred Thousand Club, proudly and

18 McDonald, “Economic Development.”
prophetically boasted: “In 1910, Vancouver then will have 100,000 men.”

The city, however, exhibited truly dramatic contrasts. In many ways, Vancouver was typical of most Canadian cities of the late nineteenth century. Its history of industrial and urban development virtually copied that of western Canada’s other boom cities, notably Winnipeg, Edmonton, and Calgary. Stimulated by the C.P.R.’s arrival, and by real estate and resource industry speculation, Vancouver reeled from the easy boom and fast profits, especially between 1888 and 1892, and between 1898 and 1913. However, after international financial reversals in 1892 and 1913, Vancouver quickly fell into the depths of depression.

As in Canada’s prairie cities, Vancouver’s period of speculation and “boosterism” had fuelled the driving commercial forces of the day. Land investment, by the C.P.R. and others, and real estate sales, provided the major stimulus to growth in the city. Vancouver’s population had grown from under 2,000 when the C.P.R. arrived in 1886 to 13,709 in 1891. Real estate businessmen ranked with C.P.R. executives as “the most influential business group in the city during this initial phase of growth.” Major resource-based industries—sawmills and lumber products, (885 employees), salmon canning (200 employees)—the C.P.R. ships (600 employees) and contractors (700 employees) were the major employers out of a total employment of 2,357 (industry) and 2,625 (business) in 1890.

As the city grew and prospered, commercial, financial, and some manufacturing sector employers increasingly required a trained labour force. The first high school opened in 1890 with 31 students. That same year, with some demand for higher education, a small private academic college, Wetham College, also opened. It offered preparatory education equivalent to two years university training elsewhere in North America. In nearby New

---

Westminster, a notable academic institution, the Methodists' Columbian College, was founded in 1892. Affiliated with the University of Toronto, it was the first institution to graduate students who had completed all coursework in British Columbia. Wetham College, unfortunately, closed permanently during the 1893 depression. Columbian College continued until 1927, though well after the final establishment, in 1915, of the public University of British Columbia. Promised by the Provincial Government since 1890, and after protracted debate and delays, the University superseded another earlier and notable public academic institution, McGill University College. Founded in 1906, in Vancouver, the College had itself evolved from a 1900 affiliation between McGill University and Vancouver High School. This arrangement, formally known as Vancouver College, and the later University College, provided for up to three years university education in arts and applied science.

After the 1890s depression, public elementary and high schools, private business and academic colleges, and public night school programmes expanded. Compulsory attendance in the public schools, for students between ages seven and twelve (and fourteen, after 1901) was slowly having its effect. Average daily attendance, in Vancouver public schools, grew from 58.3 per cent of 2,004 pupils in 1891-92, to 73.97 per cent of 4,391 pupils in 1901-02, and to 75.1 per cent of 10,879 pupils in 1910-11. Overall literacy, as measured by the Canadian census, was also rapidly improving; the proportion of the population, over age five, both reading and writing measured at 66.3 per cent in 1901 (for the Burrard census district), and 93.73 per cent in 1911 (for the Vancouver city census district).

---


24 Canada, *Fourth Census of Canada, 1901*, vol. 4 (Ottawa: Printed by S. E. Dawson, Printer to the King's Most Excellent Majesty, 1906), pp. 324-25; Canada, *Fifth Census of Canada, 1901*, vol. 2 (Ottawa: Printed by C. H. Parmelee, Printer to the King's Most Excellent Majesty, 1913), p. 462. Note the 1901 figure was calculated by myself from raw figures supplied in the table. Also note, as the Burrard district included a vast rural tract of the province, the figure also included the many
Still there was strong enough demand for "academic," vocational, and technical training. All sorts of private and eventually public institutions sprang up. On the "academic" front, there existed (many only briefly) such "notable" institutions as the School of Elocution (1896), the Vancouver Conservatory of Music (1896), and the Vancouver School of Elocution (1911). They all appealed to residents' "higher" tastes, or at least to those whose desire was socially to prove their "taste."

Some of the early commercial colleges played to these interests. However their mainstay was to train and improve business, office, and industrial personnel. The colleges employed, part-time, many of the city's school teachers. They offered courses to both day and evening students and, by 1904, included technical subjects in their formerly business-oriented curricula. As one school advertised, the new technical courses were aimed at "engineers, fitters, turners, pattern-makers, boiler-makers, cabinet makers, architects, carpenters, tinsmiths, plumbers, [and] sign-writers."

In any event, the Vancouver School Board began, in 1907, its experimental and, in 1909, its formal night school programme. This was perhaps the most significant effort, at the time, in the provision of adult domestic, technical, and commercial education. On January 30, 1907, evening experimental classes were held in the high school. Following the British model, this first public night school ran fourteen-week courses, with examinations. A variety of technical subjects was offered: elementary mathematics and chemistry, experimental physics, theoretical and applied mechanics, the principles of steam, building construction, drawing (including architectural, mechanical, geometrical, and freehand drawing), manual training, woodwork, and domestic science and music. The classes were a success. By 1912, 2,011 men and women were enrolled. Courses expanded to include surveying, first aid, navigation, wood carving, copper work, embroidery, millinery, book-keeping, shorthand, and "Cooking for Men," among others. The Trades and Labour Council even supported and assisted the School Board. It appointed Council delegates to act as an advisory committee on technical education.

---

24(cont'd) native Indians living in this district.
25News-Advertiser, 5 February 1905.
The reasons adults spent their valued and usually limited spare time in such courses were, of course, many and varied. The desire for employment or better employment, obviously, was significant. When Vancouver boomed, employers needed trained help, and immigrants needed work. In this new and rapidly expanding city, there were opportunities to "get ahead." Said a 1908 YMCA pamphlet: "In this present age there is everywhere a demand for increased skill and intelligence in labor, and no man can honestly expect promotion without such training." The period before the First World War saw the institution of higher qualifications in certain trades. For example, the provincial government by 1900 required licences based on examinations for boiler and machine attendants. Stricter controls and the almost never-ending changes in technology and business methods continually forced young and aspiring business people and tradesmen to up-grade their job skills.

Throughout this period from the city's 1886 birth until the Great War (1914-18), Vancouver experienced most of the economic, social, intellectual, political, labour, religious, and cultural developments and upheavals that pre-occupied Canadians. Corporate capitalism was becoming the economic engine for development, though in British Columbia there were still great opportunities for aggressive, hard-working individuals.


Vancouver City Young Men's Christian Association, Annual Prospectus: Young Men's Christian Association, 1908-9 (Vancouver: The Vancouver City Young Men's Christian Association, 1908), p. 8, in Harry Patten Archibald Collection, Young Men's Christian Association of Greater Vancouver Archives.

Selman, "Adult Education in B.C.,” p. 159.

Immigration and economic growth ensured for many, including manual workers, opportunities to advance themselves. The supply of cheap land was ample. Individual home ownership became the norm, rather than the exception, even among the city's working-class families. Even if upward mobility was restricted, the dominant sense of individualism and the perception of opportunity shared by immigrants, entrepreneurs and workmen alike, gave the city and many of its residents an almost unrealistic sense of optimism.30

On the other hand, the city's appalling physical conditions were not lost on contemporary observers. Even by the century's turn, and after prosperity's return with the 1898 Klondike Gold Rush, Vancouver was a sorry sight. As one 1898 observer noted wryly, the city sported splendid granite buildings "in the primitive Romanesque style, costing 100,000 dollars," juxtaposed with truly primitive "wretched little shant(ies),...[and] original bush," all set right in the "main or civilised portion" of the city.31 Another, prominent Art, Historical and Scientific Association and Arts and Crafts Association member and architect Robert Mackay Fripp complained, in 1899, that the city still lacked the "appearance of permanence."”32

Even these sardonic comments belied the rude conditions endured by even the most "elegant" set. Foul odours were common in lower-lying areas, a consequence of the lack of a sewer and drainage system, and again typical of contemporary industrial cities in North America and in Europe. The smallness of the city and the absence of formal town planning, meant that major industries were located on the shores of Burrard Inlet and False Creek—next door to some of the more "prestigious" residences.33 Even the West End, the newly established residence of merchants and professionals, "lacked many amenities" such as street lights, and was itself located depressingly close to the waterfront tenements southeast of pristine Stanley Park.34

33Ibid., pp. 28-30.
Socially speaking, the city was divided into the distinct “East End” and “West End.” The East End was the home of mostly British and Canadian working classes, and continental European and Asian immigrants. British and Canadian middle and upper-middle social classes, on the other hand, lived in the more exclusive West End. Around this older East and West End core, new, more respectable suburbs of home-building working people, shopkeepers, clerks, school-teachers, and salesmen rapidly filled up. Finally, and significant in Vancouver’s social landscape, the ethnic Asian communities (Chinese and Japanese), roughly ten to fifteen per cent of the local population, strategically occupied the zone between the East and West Ends.

Hostility from ethnic Europeans (including those born in North America) towards ethnic Asians was widespread and increased throughout the period to 1914. The year 1907, was particularly bad for relations between the city’s Asian and European residents. Immigration of Asians, and particularly of Japanese, had been increasing. In September of that year, the Asiatic Exclusion League’s labour leaders, Protestant ministers, and politicians incited a mob of some 8,000 to 30,000 to riot. The mob smashed and assaulted its way through Chinatown and “Little Tokyo.”

Naturally, in this rough atmosphere, public moral and physical health, and public recreation, were major concerns to various and often competing interests. Males predominated in the city’s public life until the War. Single immigrants, male and female, strained the city’s social services. Transient single men, in particular, drew the attention of social reformers upset by the proliferation of businesses associated with the liquor trade and prostitution. Unemployment, from the seasonal work characteristic of fishing and logging, and from periodic economic slumps, further stretched the attention and capacities of local charities and philanthropies.

Organized labour, club women (especially the Local Council of Women), and the evangelical Protestant Churches agitated for social and economic change. They were inspired by the post-Darwinian intellectual mood (notably the social gospel) sweeping the Western world. They pressed for legal and material changes in the care of women,

36 Roy, Vancouver, pp. 61-66.
children, the aged, the unemployed and the poor. They organized voluntary social and medical services, sponsored amateur athletics, agitated for parks and playgrounds, and worked to beautify the city and cultivate its residents. Above all they sought an ordered, more caring, and civilized society, for themselves and their fellow citizens, and their children.37

Gosnell, in his portrait of a civilized and bountiful outpost of the British Empire at the turn of the century noted the impact and importance of voluntary associations in British Columbia life. He apologized for not publishing a full chapter on the subject—“prepared...but owing to limitations of space,...omitted” from the text. Nevertheless, he stressed “that one of the most remarkable features of the development of the Province has been the way in which social, fraternal and religious organizations have kept pace with material advancement.”38

Though he never elaborated on the significance of voluntary associations, or even named any, others did. “Here Clubland is supreme,” reported visiting sociologist Bessie Pullen-Burry on her 1911 visit to Vancouver. She praised the many “charitable and educational societies of women in Vancouver” for their ambitious and co-operative scheme to construct their own Women’s Building.39 Among those organizations Pullen-Burry found significant enough to name were the Young Women’s Christian Association (YWCA), in whose residence she stayed; the Women’s Musical Club; the Women’s Canadian Club; and the suffragist Political Equality League.40

The four organizations, probably not coincidentally, were all part of the thirty-five similar cultural, recreational, service, and educational associations listed in the 1914 elite *Vancouver Social Register and Club Directory*. These associations and their members were amongst the city's most illustrious. Included were the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, the Alpine Club, the Canadian Club, the Canadian Handicraft Guild, the Canadian Women's Press Club, the Commercial Club, the Connaught Skating Club, the Daughters of the Empire, the Local Council of Women, the Royal Vancouver Yacht Club, the Shaughnessy Heights Golf Club, the Terminal City Club, the United Service Club, the University Club, the University Women's Club, the Vancouver Club, the Vancouver Rowing Club, and the Victorian Order of Nurses.

Organized voluntary activity, of course, encompassed vastly more than just these various women's and elite societies and clubs. Another writer, Dr. George C. Pidgeon, in 1911, spoke of the city's many and varied philanthropies and charities. He noted "that very few of our citizens have any idea of the volume of benevolence that is flowing continually from the hearts of our Christian people." He gave several examples. Working for children were the Alexandra Orphanage, the Children's Aid Society, the Salvation Army, and the Providence Orphanage. For social service, Pidgeon included the YWCA, the Young Men's Christian Association (YMCA), the Central Mission for unemployed single men, the similar Sailors' and Loggers' Institute, and the Salvation Army. Finally, he included two church sponsored rescue homes "for fallen women" and the city's two hospitals.41

There was a myriad of organizations to look to almost every conceivable need, conviction, and desire of Vancouver men and women. There were labour and business organizations to cater to the economic and political interests of their respective constituencies. Included here were the workingmen's Vancouver Trades and Labour Council and its constituent unions; the businessmen's Vancouver Board of Trade, Canadian Manufacturers' Association, and the more educational Progress Club; and the various professional and trade associations. Among the latter were the Architectural Institute, the Vancouver Medical Association, the British Columbia Chamber of Mines, the British Columbia Loggers' Association, and the Vancouver Information and Tourist Association.

Athletic and recreation clubs and associations embraced virtually all leisure activities, from bowling, swimming, and motoring to literary, dramatic, orchestral, choral, and amateur artistic activities. There were the English Bay Bathing and Athletic Club, the Vancouver Canoe Club, the Vancouver Chess Club, and the Vancouver Lawn Bowling Club. For the literary and aesthetic set there were Burns, Dickens, and Shakespearean Clubs, the Sugar Refinery Reading and Social Club, the Welsh Choir, the Vancouver Amateur Dramatic Society, the Vancouver Arts and Crafts Association, and the Studio Club, for instance. For the scientifically curious there were the B.C. Entomological Society, the Naturalists’ Field Club, the British Columbia Academy of Science, the Vancouver Archaeological Society, and the Human Nature Society. Finally, for those whose interest was public affairs, there were the Canadian Club (men only), the Women’s Canadian Club, the Imperial Federation, the Local Council of Women, and the Women’s Forum. There were also various political parties and women’s suffrage organizations, and many church-sponsored and independent debating, literary, and mock parliament clubs and societies, among others. This latter group included the Burrard Literary Club; the Vancouver Mock Parliament, Literary and Debating Society; and the Vancouver Debating League and its constituent member clubs.

There were also the benevolent and fraternal organizations, including the Independent Order of Odd Fellows, the Knights of Pythias, the Masons, and the Loyal True Blue Association. These were organized mostly for comradeship, informal social and business networking, and especially for providing insurance and financial security, death benefits, burials, and the like. There were building societies to assist prospective home builders. And, there were the churches and their constituent clubs, guilds, societies, leagues, and institutes to see to the spiritual, physical, recreational, and intellectual needs of their church and its congregation.

Finally, there were the many “ethnic” associations, formed for many of the same purposes as those above, but with a common regional or national background amongst the membership. Among the largest were the Scottish St. Andrew’s and Caledonian Society and the English St. George’s Society. The Chinese community counted at least 20 clubs and societies; the Japanese counted at least 12.42

42The British Columbia Gazette, vols. 32-54, (Victoria: Queen’s (King’s after 1901) Printer, 1892-1914); Selman, ”Adult Education in B.C.,” pp. 116-90.
1.4. THE BACKGROUND: RELATED LITERATURE

Gordon R. Selman recently made the following empirical generalization about adult educational activities in pre-1914 British Columbia:

By the beginning of the World War,....the young province of British Columbia was making considerable provision for the educational development of its citizens....In the individual communities, an impressive number and variety of voluntary organizations had grown up devoted to the provision of educational and cultural improvement. By these means, those taking part in these developments were seeking to promote the economic growth and social and cultural development of the area.\textsuperscript{43}

Like Gosnell, Selman recognized that the voluntary associations, and particularly their educational activities, can only be understood in their economic, social, and cultural context. Although he did not carry out this contextual analysis, his various generalizations do suggest an explanation of the “educational” activities of voluntary organizations in turn-of-the-century Vancouver. His generalization asserts that many of the early British Columbia voluntary organizations were engaged in adult education. Of the 196 Vancouver non-church voluntary associations registered with the provincial government between 1892 and 1915 (and this is minimally only one-third or one-quarter of the total number for Vancouver), 180 had objectives that very broadly could be defined as “educational.”\textsuperscript{44} Selman thus implies several possible reasons for the promotion of and participation in these organizations: economic, social, and cultural, including aesthetic-creative, improvement.

Other historians of adult education have also shown how different groups of institutions arose in response to economic, social, political, and cultural conditions. The work of such Britons as J. F. C. Harrison, Thomas Kelly, and Brian Simon; of Americans Lawrence Cremin and Malcolm Knowles; and of Canadians Ron Faris and Foster Vernon may be cited as examples.\textsuperscript{45}

\textsuperscript{43}Selman, “Adult Education in B.C.,” p. 250.
\textsuperscript{44}British Columbia, \textit{British Columbia Gazette}, vols. 32-54 (Victoria: Queen’s (Kings after 1901) Printer, 1892-1914). The \textit{Gazette} lists 196 organizations which sought legal incorporation under the Province’s Societies Act between 1892 and 1915, the vast majority registering after 1900. Selman, “Adult Education in B.C.,” pp. 116-90, provides a very useful and comprehensive description of most organizations—voluntary, public (government), and private (commercial)—providing adult education in the city before 1914.
Recently, historians have investigated more extensively voluntary associations and their role in the Victorian and Edwardian period. Still, none have specifically examined educational activities over a range of voluntary associations.

Most useful is R. A. J. McDonald’s study of Vancouver’s turn-of-the-century business leadership. McDonald used a group biography technique “to define the [business community’s] economic and social character.”46 Placed within the local and national context of economic and political development, he traced their social and business connections through athletic and social clubs, philanthropic, cultural, and charitable associations, and political and business organizations. Vancouver, before World War I, was a young, commercially oriented city without an obvious “aristocracy.” These businessmen and their elite, therefore, assumed the leadership over much of the intellectual, cultural, social, athletic, charitable, and political life of the city.

McDonald considered several possible reasons for membership in such organizations. Perhaps the most significant were the desire for social and business “integration,” and for social prestige. Common membership in certain clubs and societies led individuals to make social and business contacts. Club memberships were based upon presumed equality of interest or position in society. They helped existing members to build and to ensure a cohesive social class. Membership also provided “one of the best windows onto the social cleavages which divided [the] businessmen.”47 Club activity also acted as a ladder of prestige for less prominent business and professional families. These individuals patronized various charitable and cultural associations as “one way...to increase their ties with the upper class, and thus gain a measure of social acceptance.” McDonald, however, did not conclusively support this social acceptance hypothesis. Less prominent individuals tended to leave incomplete records.48

J. F. C. Harrison, Peter Bailey, and Ian Inkster, for England, have also found the

48Ibid., pp. 277, 280.
drive for respectability and social acceptance as significant reasons for adult education and “rational recreation” participation by some working-class and many middle-class individuals. Bailey, for instance, found that the sheer growth of the new bourgeoisie forced these new middle classes to both “confirm and consolidate...[their own] class identity.”

How was class consolidated through voluntary associations in a geographically mobile, urbanizing society?

Leadership, in fact, came from middle-class as well as upper-class citizens, often for religious reasons. Ideals such as “social citizenship” or the “progressive community” emerged in response to mid nineteenth-century liberal capitalism. They were particularly strong just after 1900. Networks of voluntary associations, comprised of “respectable” working-class and middle-class members, with upper-class patronage, thus were organized as civilizing agents.

“Social citizenship” developed, too, in Vancouver. Consider the statement, in 1902, by Lady Charles Tupper, president of the Vancouver General Hospital’s Women’s Auxiliary: “We...have realized from the first...that the women of Mount Pleasant, the East End and the Hastings manufacturing sector must be part of our organization, and we recognize the fact that a special effort will have to be made to this end.” McDonald, in quoting Lady Tupper, noted also that the less glamorous the work, the less likely would its leadership be drawn strictly from the elite class.

Ross Alfred Johnson’s and A. Ross McCormack’s researches suggest that some early socialist and labour groups in British Columbia and Vancouver also had educational and propagandistic goals. Some radicals saw education as a means of working-class

---

54. “No Compromise, No Political Trading.”
consciousness-raising and to revolutionary change.

In a related study, Bryan D. Palmer has illustrated how skilled working men used their voluntary associations to “resist the encroachments of industrial-capitalist disciplines and development” in 1860 to 1914 Hamilton, Ontario. In one particularly incisive remark, Palmer stressed that mechanics’ institutes cannot be divorced from their local context, in which the strength of the working-class movement would contribute to the vibrancy of the working-class presence in these early buildings of adult education. Nor must we mistake the hegemony of propertied elements, so common in many institutes, for an acquiescent working class constituency. Merchants, manufacturers, and clerks could often control local institutes, while workingmen utilized the services for their own purposes, often expressing distinct dissatisfaction with the policies and practices of the directors.

Contradictory aims and motives can co-exist in the same organization. This suggests the value of examining organizational programmes from the perspective of all the participants.

Finally, Gillian Weiss has argued the importance of women’s organizations to advance “maternal feminist” ideology in Vancouver, 1910-1928. These women had sought to reform society, “to extend their citizenship powers, [and]...to influence legislation.” The members, from all social classes (though predominately middle and upper-middle class) also educated themselves for “the skill and confidence to adequately play the more public role that they envisioned for themselves.”

The preceding discussion of relevant research confirms, as Selman implied, that voluntary associations, and particularly their educational activities, can only be understood in their economic, social, political, and cultural contexts.

The precise nature and appropriateness of people’s various reasons for participating in mutual enlightenment invited extensive research. A three-pronged methodology turned out to be appropriate. It called for (1) a conceptually satisfying definition of “intentional mutual enlightenment,” (2) an analysis of ten exemplar voluntary associations, and (3) an analysis of the ambient social structure—class, ethnicity, age, gender, education—and how

57 Ibid., p. 50.
58 Gillian Weiss, “As women and as citizens,” pp. ii-iii.
far it was reflected and supported by the mutual enlightenment organizations.

1.5. THE METHODOLOGY: A SOCIAL HISTORY OF IDEAS

The central issue here is this: what was mutual enlightenment and what did it mean to its constituents?

The task then is to write a social history of ideas—culture, civilization, clerisy, beauty, utility, democracy, equality, citizenship, social efficiency—and of the means by which they entered into life. I want to describe and to explain how these ideas were interpreted, activated, and transformed through mutual enlightenment in groups of educational activists.

Certain key concepts were frequently used by the associations and their promoters to justify an organization’s founding, its objects and programme, and its seeking local social legitimacy and funding. These concepts, and the frequency of their use, signalled their explanatory significance for mutual enlightenment. Therefore, it was pertinent to study the context and language of their use by association personnel, the historical pedigree of each concept (i.e., from their nineteenth-century English proponents), and their material application, that is, how they were applied locally and with whom.

How does one judge the social impact and the social significance of ideas? One answer is to argue that mutual enlightenment was a socially acceptable method of transmitting culture, and that its meaning was expressed in those ideas. Assessing impact and social significance involved two tests: first, what ordinary members said about their organizations provided an initial test of the social impact and importance of key ideas; second, connections between the social and political backgrounds of the members, and their motivating ideas, tested the social significance of the ideas.

Although the thesis as a whole answers the question “what is mutual enlightenment?” the central object of each chapter is to explain why people became involved with it.

Each chapter, therefore, is significant for its analysis of a dialectical relationship, or informative and creative tension, between critical popular ideas and their social context. The notion of “mutual enlightenment” provided “a way into” the social expression of these
ideas. To know one part of the tension is to understand better the other. No matter how “pure” their intellectual origin and intent, arise from and are used in relation to their social background.\textsuperscript{59} By discovering the ideas significant to each association’s purpose and curriculum, and by discovering that association’s supporters and clientele, the social and intellectual functions of that association are explained. And, by tracing out the central and peripheral practices of mutual enlightenment (\textit{i.e.}, resulting organizational forms and curricular expressions of the ideas), then the concept “mutual enlightenment” is defined.

1.5.1. “The Utilitarian Ideal”

It is useful here to consider the concept “utilitarian,” and its companion “useful.” Both were popular, descriptive, “philosophical” preoccupations of the nineteenth century. They were either mentioned or suggested in the documents of almost all the mutual enlightenment associations studied.

These concepts, however, were also confusing. They had very different meanings for different people, depending upon the speaker’s social background and upon the social, economic, and political intent. The terms could be “loaded with the aspersions of...enemies,” or steeped with all that is laudable by friends. Their meaning was liberal and romantic when the intent was to describe something that contributed to the “happiness of the community” (Jeremy Bentham, 1802), and to the pleasure or happiness of the individual. Its meaning, however, also encompassed practical, and especially \textit{economic} utility. It was within the liberal conception of “usefulness” that working-class individuals, alone and in “mutual improvement” groups, educated themselves both liberally and politically. “Useful knowledge,” for the dispossessed, had overtones of intellectual freedom and social power.\textsuperscript{60}

“Thereutilitarian,” also had included “\textit{romantic} or \textit{picturesque},” or aesthetic uses of art and landscape. Nevertheless, “utilitarians” came to disavow those interpretations,

\textsuperscript{59}See Raymond Williams, \textit{Keywords: A Vocabulary of Culture and Society}, 2d ed. (London: Fontana, 1976; Flamingo, 1983), for his outstanding historical analysis of key nineteenth- and twentieth-century cultural and social concepts.

\textsuperscript{60}Williams, \textit{Keywords}, pp. 327-9. See also David Vincent, \textit{Bread, Knowledge and Freedom: A Study of Nineteenth-Century Working Class Autobiography} (London and New York: Methuen, 1981), especially chapters 6, 7, and 8, for an excellent discussion of the meaning of “useful knowledge” as used by individuals of the working classes.
increasingly restricting meaning to that which was *practical* and later acquiring materialist and commodity implications. Even John Stuart Mill’s (1861) conception of utilitarian as “the greatest happiness of the greatest number” came to be mistranslated into “organized *market*” terms. “Utility” thus became “the mechanism for regulating this ultimate purpose” of people finding the means to make their own happiness. Thus it is possible for a William Burns to extol his club’s “utilitarianism,” when its meaning involves much more than mere economic development, and yet for William Morris to attack “what is called utilitarianism” and its connection to “trade finish” as opposed to “genuine artistic finish” with both apparently viewing their respective organizations as bodies in aid of the more liberal notions of happiness.

1.5.2. “Clerisy,” “Class,” “Culture,” and “Civilization”

The concepts “clerisy,” “class,” “culture,” and “civilization” also featured in our association affairs. Many club and society spokespersons phrased their mission through the powerfully evocative nineteenth-century terms of “Culture” (especially Matthew Arnold’s and Samuel Taylor Coleridge’s) and “civilization.” Similarly evocative terms—Coleridge’s “clerisy,” and Arnold’s “Barbarians,” “Philistines,” or “Populace”—though not specifically evident in association members’ statements, were clearly implied through the existence, scope, and activities of each association’s mutual enlightenment.

The references to Coleridge and Arnold were apt since, as exemplary nineteenth-century British thinkers, their concepts and ideas affected and stimulated “sophisticates” throughout the English-speaking world. Briefly, “clerisy” refers to “the intellectual community—the sum of...scholars and artists, or, as Coleridge puts it, ‘the learned of all denominations; the sages and professors [i.e., teachers] of...all the so-called liberal arts and sciences.” These individuals would be the “true educators” of a community and of the nation. They would be, as Arnold terms, the “saving ‘remnant,’” rising “above the restrictions characteristic of their respective classes,...devoted to discovering,

---

52 Williams, *Keywords*, pp. 327-9.
This "remnant" or clerisy was to represent itself as above the existing and traditional social class structure. At the same time, its members could have come from any social origin, provided they possessed or earned those skills and sensibilities characteristic of their new missionary intellectual class. Central to understanding a clerisy's position within society, and its desire to culturally reform that same society, therefore, is the concept of "class" or "social class." Even if they viewed themselves as external to the class system, the object of their educative mission were clearly the different social classes. Also, and paradoxically, the clerisy itself constituted a new social class. Their very self-consciousness as a knowledgeable, reflective group or network of intellectuals, educators, and artists can be construed as being a most critical element in the formation of a new social class. Thus it is useful to diverge briefly to consider a definition of class.

"Class" has attracted both empirically viable and subjective definitions, and has been used historically both descriptively and analytically. It has most traditionally been used to categorize and describe predefined groups of individuals, to stipulate the make-up of a particular class or category (usually economic status) of individuals. Social class thus becomes a useful tool of social analysis to describe and explain the development of industrial and corporate capitalism. Class illuminates the differences between social and economic categories (e.g., upper, middle, working, and lower classes). Moreover, it spotlights the relationship of class to power and wealth, and to social conflict or social consensus.

Social class, however, also conceptualizes a form of felt material reality, a social formation in the Marxian sense. This latter sense of class hinges upon the formation and self-definition of "class consciousness." Individuals of a specific class comprehend and articulate a collective understanding of their position within existing economic, political, and social structures. They collectively form their own social, economic, political, cultural, recreational, and educational organizations and practices to reflect this consciousness. In short, these "classes" develop their own culture.

---

Arnold's pejorative social categories of Barbarians, Philistines, and the Populace, probably incorporated both meanings of social class. They were a convenient social division (empirically verifiable, he would have claimed) that, at the same time, illuminated the growing self-consciousness of economic and social classes (subjective) in mid and late nineteenth-century England. Also, as mentioned above, the formation of a clerisy clearly could have constituted the subjective sense of a new class formation, therein, and paradoxically, undermined the class independent, egalitarian spirit of a "clerisy."

The object of the clerisy's education and cultivation was those groups Arnold termed "Barbarians," "Philistines," and the "Populace." All were uncultured, though for different reasons, and therefore needy of the benefits of such enlightenment.

For Arnold, Barbarians were the aristocracy. Vancouver had few, if any, full-blood Barbarians. There was, however, a "class" of capitalist elite that included, for instance, the city's most important C.P.R. officials, merchants, and industrialists. Most aristocrats, according to Arnold, were satisfied with maintaining only the veneer of culture. They were uncultured because, mostly, they were "indifferent to it [culture]."

More significantly, Vancouver had many more Philistines than Barbarians, that is the "new" middle classes. These "new" middle classes reflected the increasing complexity of late nineteenth- and early twentieth-century industrial society. Vancouver was moving from an individualist and relatively modest industrial capitalism towards a true corporate capitalism with its new, more specialized bureaucratic and professional occupations. These newer middle classes included professionals, including physicians, lawyers, architects, school-teachers, and men of the cloth; merchants and real estate agents, bankers and clerks; and all their wives and children. Arnold also counted, as Philistines, some of the working classes—ambitious craftsmen and other workers, and trade union leaders. Many of the former were "one in spirit with the industrial middle class" and its Liberal and Conservative

67Arnold, Culture and Anarchy, pp. 85-6.
68McDonald, "Business Leaders."
69Altick, Victorian People, p. 264.
Parliamentary representatives. The latter, independent of the middle and aristocratic classes, sought to “affirm” their “class [emphasis mine] and...class instinct,” while they maintained their pre-occupation with “industrial machinery” (as a mind set, not as objects) and with materialism.70 These new middle classes were an “uneasy class,” where economic mobility was as likely downward as upward.71 Accordingly, their cultural fault was “complacency.”72 They were too busy trying to be individually respectable and comfortable, and too concerned with making a living or pursuing money, to busy themselves with their own or humanity’s intellectual, aesthetic, and cultural welfare.

Finally, Vancouver had plenty of the “Populace,” that “vast residuum” of most of the working classes (employed artisans and labourers), peasants, and the poor.73 They also were uncultured in the Arnoldian sense because, at best, “their only ambition was to rise to be Philistines.”74 Many of these—mill-workers, salmon canners, and C.P.R. employees, for example—were undoubtedly more concerned with economic survival, with “bawling, hustling, and smashing,” or with a good beer, a game, or a laugh, than with the genius of Wordsworth or the theory of evolution.75

Transposition of these categories or classes to turn-of-the-century Vancouver conditions is full of difficulty. To begin with, we can use the Anglo-Britannic notion of social class only tentatively. Except for McDonald’s study of Vancouver’s business elites, and some overly bold researches76 into the development of working class consciousness in early British Columbia, there is only limited accurate evidence to subdivide Vancouver’s population in either the objective or the subjective sense of “class.” One can, however, fairly depict the local population on ethnic racial lines; none of which were included in Arnold’s conception of society. In British Columbia, and in Vancouver specifically, these groupings included Native Indians, Asians (Japanese, Chinese, East Indian), and European and North

70Arnold, Culture and Anarchy, pp. 86-7.
71See Katz, People of Hamilton, pp. 176-77, who has used this description to capture the middle-class experience in mid nineteenth-century Hamilton, Ontario. See also Katz, Doucet, and Stern, Early Industrial Capitalism, p. 392.
72Altick, Victorian People, p. 264.
73Arnold, Culture and Anarchy, p. 87.
74Altick, Victorian People, p. 264.
75Arnold, Culture and Anarchy, p. 87.
American Caucasians (especially Canadians and British).77

Arnold stressed, however, that members of all classes (and, undoubtedly, ethnic cultures) need to become enlightened, to strive toward human perfection. To enter into this state of perfection, they must reject the class-based love of “machinery” and materialism, and their preference for law, obedience, and shamanism, and for class itself. They must begin “to see things as they are,.....to see and learn the truth for our own satisfaction.”78 Their eventual goal is to serve and to enlighten all of mankind. This state of enlightenment, of perfection, Arnold called “culture.”

The contrast between culture and material civilization was well stated by Coleridge in 1830:

The permanent distinction and the occasional contrast between cultivation and civilization...The permanency of the nation...and its progressiveness and personal freedom...depend on a continuing and progressive civilization. But civilization is itself but a mixed good, if not far more a corrupting influence, the hectic of disease, not the bloom of health, and a nation so distinguished more fitly to be called a varnished than a polished people, where this civilization is not grounded in cultivation, in the harmonious development of those qualities and faculties that characterize our humanity.79

Coleridge’s ideal encompassed an “enriched activity of the human spirit, not...the superficial” and often illusory “improvement” of the material environment and of social and political institutions.80 This conception of “culture” developed primarily in the nineteenth century. “Culture” was a response to the naturalistic philosophy of the Romantic movement, and a reaction to the mechanical character of “the orthodox and dominant” use of the term “civilization.” Nineteenth-century civilization was then being criticized “both for its abstract rationalism and for the ‘inhumanity’ of current industrial development.”81

78Arnold, Culture and Anarchy, p. 36.
79Samuel Taylor Coleridge, On the Constitution of Church and State, V, 1830, quoted by Williams, Keywords, p. 59.
80Altick, Victorian People, p. 239.
81Williams, Keywords, pp. 89-90. Williams, in tracing the development of “culture,” categorized three usages of the term: “(i) the independent and abstract noun which describes a general process of intellectual, spiritual and aesthetic development, from the C18 [eighteenth century]; (ii) the independent noun, whether used generally or specifically, which indicates a particular way of life, whether of a people, a period, a group, or humanity in general....(iii) the independent and abstract noun which describes the works and practices of intellectual and especially artistic activity.” (Ibid.,
“Culture,” for Arnold, however, was hardly an individual or strictly personal endeavour: “It moves by the force, not merely or primarily of the scientific passion for pure knowledge, but also of the moral and social passion for doing good.” In fact, without social and moral (“national”) utility, culture risks being “selfish, petty, and unprofitable,” motivated by “mere exclusiveness and vanity.”

As he continued his argument:

Culture...is not satisfied till we all come to a perfect man; it knows that the sweetness and light of the few must be imperfect until the raw and unkindled masses of humanity are touched by sweetness and light....when there is a national glow of life and thought, when the whole of society is in the fullest measure permeated by thought, sensible to beauty, intelligent and alive....It seeks to do away with classes; to make the best that has been thought and known in the world current everywhere; to make all men live in an atmosphere of sweetness and light, where they use ideas, as it uses them itself, freely,—nourished, and not bound by them.

This is the social idea; and men of culture are free apostles of equality.

Inspired by Arnold’s and similar thinkers’ ideas, Vancouver promoters of mutual enlightenment still had strong and conflicting class and ethnic loyalties. They may have been truly inspired cultural missionaries—determined to change both subjective and objective bases for class, to remove them from their blind dependence on materialism, and to redirect their interests to the love of knowledge and beauty, science and art. Yet they were for the most part members of the middle class, “the uneasy class.” They had strong interests in enhancing and maintaining their relatively comfortable social and economic
position. And, as even Arnold was aware, many apparent lovers of culture were merely only curious at best, and vain and self-interested (in promoting class distinctions), at worst.

Thus it is conceivable that both humanitarian and selfish interests co-existed within association members, or at least were shared between members. As will become apparent, each association's members formulated and practised their their version of mutual enlightenment. In some cases, self, class, and ethnic interests superseded their humanitarian goals. This, in turn, led to variations in mutual enlightenment's pedagogical forms and curricular interests.

1.5.3. Defining “Mutual Enlightenment”

Definition of “intentional mutual enlightenment” emphasizes the actual practices of certain mutual enlightenment associations. The methodology of definition draws upon modern arguments and argument methods used to clarify the meaning of “education,” “mutual enlightenment’s” conceptual core. The definition of “mutual enlightenment” is here to be based upon analysis of the organizational aims, policies, and politics as described by each organization's participants, and of each organization's actual curricular and pedagogical practices.

“Intentional mutual enlightenment” broadly defined, is a form of education. It is here limited to the rational as regards objectives, methods, and content. It excludes cases of explicit indoctrination and propaganda. Further, it emphasizes a mutual education, as opposed to a strictly one-sided, undemocratic, and authoritarian education. Co-operation, common purpose, and shared responsibility all mark “mutual enlightenment.”

Lawrence Cremin's definition of education emphasizes intentionality and includes institutions and agencies outside traditional school systems. It also eliminates such ambiguous concepts as “socialization” and “enculturation.” It is a good place to begin:

as the deliberate, systematic, and sustained effort to transmit, evoke, or acquire knowledge, attitudes, values, skills and sensibilities, as well as any outcomes of that effort. The definition stresses intentionality, though I am well aware that learning takes place in many situations where intentionality is not present. It makes room for study as well as instruction, thereby embracing the crucial realm of self-education. And it acknowledges that behavior, preferences, and tastes are involved, as well as knowledge and understanding. It sees education as a process more limited than what the sociologists would call socialization or
the anthropologist enculturation, though obviously inclusive of many of the same phenomena. And it recognizes that there is often conflict between what educators are trying to teach and what is learned from the ordinary business of living. \(^{84}\)

Turning now to "mutual enlightenment," voluntary association and the formal voluntary organization served as the most obvious vehicle of mutual enlightenment. The term "voluntary association" is essentially synonymous with "voluntary organization" and shares the same conceptual territory as "clubs," "societies," "self-help groups," "leagues," "orders," "councils," "chambers," "parties," and "unions."\(^{85}\) Most adult education in turn-of-the-century British Columbia, and elsewhere, was still organized formally through voluntary associations.

Voluntary associations, however, did not use the term "mutual enlightenment" to cover what now might be classified as "educational." Rather, they used clauses almost identical with those contained in relevant government acts. The "Benevolent Societies Act," Revised Statute 1897, for example, states that:

Any number of persons may unite themselves into a society or corporation for any or more of the following purposes:-
(1) For any benevolent, or provident, or moral, or charitable, or religious purpose:....
(3) For purposes of social intercourse, mutual helpfulness, mental and moral improvement, and rational recreation:
(4) For improvement and development of the mental, social, and physical condition of young men and young women:
(5) For the promotion of literature, science, or the fine arts, and the promotion and diffusion of knowledge:
(6) For promoting the cause of temperance and moral reform:....
(10) For providing means of recreation, exercise, and amusement.... \(^{86}\)

Because the literature, both historical and contemporary, does not yet provide clear criteria for operationalization, and because the definitions are used to discriminate amongst

\(^{84}\)Lawrence Cremin, *Public Education*, p. 27.


organizations for their selection as research subjects, definitions of mutuality, education, and so on must be highly sensitive to historical evidence.

It should be said at once, however, that our definition of "mutual enlightenment association" excludes those organizations and institutions which explicitly and intentionally (1) violate the criteria defining "mutual enlightenment" and/or (2) prepare people for eventual recognition through formal public or private education. Churches and sects, for example, are excluded. They act primarily as proselytizers. Their educational work through public lectures and mutual improvement societies, and with immigrant and labour groups, however, is occasionally noted in passing. Likewise excluded are public and private schools, vocational training schools, and colleges and universities. Autonomous voluntary associations affiliated with colleges and churches that meet the essentially rational criteria of mutual enlightenment, however, are included.

"Mutual enlightenment," itself, then, is a modification of "education" in both tone and procedure. These modifications have been outlined by philosophers in the field of conceptual or linguistic analysis.87 Perhaps the best known authority, at least in the analysis of educational concepts, is R. S. Peters. Rather than simply formulating a definition and examples, as Cremin appears to have done, Peters' method of analysis was to distinguish and to map out a concept's central and peripheral meaning and uses.88 However, since in this case the term was not in contemporary use, definition was based strictly on "lived examples" of mutual enlightenment. The purpose here was to accommodate


the variations in the approaches by which an association might educate its own members and outsiders.

Through these definitions, I had the tools to discriminate amongst the many kinds of educational agencies and institutions, and to determine those most pertinent to the study.

1.5.4. Exemplar Associations of Mutual Enlightenment

The empirical definition of “mutual enlightenment” has been drawn from examination of certain “exemplary” organizations. These exemplars are distinguished by being clearly voluntary and by engaging in mutual enlightenment. They represent a manageable number (ten) of the most appropriate available organizations.89

The ten exemplars are: the Vancouver Art, Historical and Scientific Association (1894-present), the Vancouver Women’s Musical Club (1905-present), the Canadian Club of Vancouver (1906-present), the Vancouver Women’s Canadian Club (1909-present), the Vancouver Arts and Crafts Association (1900-01), the Naturalists’ Field Club (1906-07), the British Columbia Mountaineering Club (1907-present), the Young Men’s Christian Association (1886-1897;1898-present), the Young Women’s Christian Association (1897-present), and the Burrard Literary Club (c.1889-c.1908).

The thesis initially centred on the discrimination, selection, and analysis of certain voluntary associations that exemplified mutual enlightenment. Potentially, there were many such organizations; their names occur throughout the primary and secondary literature.90


90 Secondary sources include, for example, Roy, Vancouver, and Selman, “Adult Education in B.C.”. Primary evidence can be found in contemporary city directories, the index catalogues of the City of Vancouver Archives, the University of British Columbia’s Special Collections Division, the British
It is difficult to be sure how many of these associations explicitly undertook mutual enlightenment. Most adults likely accepted the virtues of “self-improvement” and “rational recreation” without question.\(^{91}\) Since these concepts were trotted out in the official aims of most formally organized and registered societies, they were more likely used for public and official approval than with the intent of carrying out their meaning.

The task was made manageable by choosing only those voluntary associations that most closely embodied the concept “mutual enlightenment.” These associations met the initial criteria that they were voluntary, that intentional mutual enlightenment was a significant goal, and that there was sufficient evidence to conduct an appropriate historical analysis. The latter criterion forced exclusion of the vast majority of associations. Unfortunately only the more prominent of the organizations tended to save their early (or only) records and accounts. These remaining associations were nevertheless chosen as exemplars. They had left behind significant quantities of historical evidence of administration, programme, and constituency. Their educational aims and programmes suggested that they most obviously represented mutual enlightenment associations.

From the possible exemplars of mutual enlightenment, ten were finally selected. They were selected for four reasons: first, they reflected the gender mix found throughout most voluntary associations; second, they appeared to have the socio-economic make-up of other similar associations; third, they embodied the popular curricular interests of the time; fourth, they left the best available records.

\(^{91}\) For ample discussion of the derivation and meaning of such slogans see, for example, Bailey, Leisure and Class; Harrison, Learning and Living; Patrick Keane, “Questions from the Past of Appropriate Methodology for Adult Learners,” Convergence: An International Journal of Adult Education 17, 2 (1984): 52-63; Meller, Leisure; David Vincent, Bread, Knowledge, and Freedom; and Waters, “Outlandish Recreations,” pp. 8-33.
1.5.5. **Mutual Enlightenment and the Social Structure: A Prosopography**

Contextual studies of Vancouver and prosopographies of association members served as the second major methodological component of the thesis. These studies gathered evidence from association membership lists, relevant personal documents of members, census data, theses, articles, and books on the social history of Vancouver, and impressionistic evidence from that period, including newspaper and magazine articles. The contextual studies will show the social, economic, political, and intellectual climate in British Columbia, Canada, and the international scene. The prosopographies should shed light on Vancouver’s ambient social structure and should locate association members within that structure.

A key aim was to describe and explain what ideas were and were not transmitted, and to see each mutual enlightenment association interacting with the social structure of Vancouver. The methodology for this research was inspired by Lawrence Stone’s vision of “prosopography,” and by Ian Inkster’s use of the technique to study England’s early to mid nineteenth-century mechanics’ institutes.92

Five exemplars were selected for the prosopographical analysis. They were the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, the Arts and Crafts Association, the Burrard Literary Club, the Naturalists’ Field Club, and the Young Men’s Christian Association. These organizations’ aims and objectives, their activities, and, most significantly, their clienteles were fully analyzed. The remaining five exemplars, the British Columbia Mountaineering Club, the Canadian Club (men’s), the Women’s Canadian Club, the Women’s Musical Club, and the Young Women’s Christian Association, served more restrictively for comparison and contrast with the first five and to more fully extend the description and analysis of mutual enlightenment activities. The five exemplars selected were chosen for the following reasons.

First, the volume of evidence for all ten organizations would have been excessively great. The context for each organization was slightly different. The ten exemplars, in effect, represented ten different populations from which they drew their clientele. Too much prosopographical research might have unnecessarily complicated the intensive and

---

interrelated examination and assessment of the subject organizations. The research aimed to establish the "flavour" or "tone" of mutual enlightenment through these organizations; a large number of examples was not necessary. Further, the evidence, though voluminous, was inadequate for social control research. In particular, the evidence was insufficient to test an organization's ability to control the subsequent social behaviour of its members.

Second, the prosopography was aimed at those organizations with broad ranges of constituencies and clienteles, objectives, and educational activities. Breadth of range tested the limits of both the "mutuality" and the "enlightenment" of the organizations' programmes. Thus the men's Canadian Club, the Women's Canadian Club, and the Women's Musical Club were all rejected from prosopographical analysis because they had restricted the range of their clienteles, objectives, and activities.

The members of each of these clubs, by and large, were socially prominent in Vancouver. They had been recognized for that prominence by their being named in the 1914 Vancouver Social Register and Club Directory. Less prominent individuals were effectively denied access to full membership. The range of social class representation within club membership was thus limited. Also, the two Canadian Clubs' educational programmes were the most limited of the ten exemplars. They consisted almost exclusively of lectures by visiting and local dignitaries.93

Third and finally, for some organizations, there was less evidence than was desirable. Data collection for the three all-female associations, for instance, was handicapped by the difficulty tracing women's biographical data. Biographical data for women is generally available only through a male relative, and only if he was sufficiently prominent to have received a biographical write-up in a local historical publication, obituary, or in popular biographical dictionaries.94 Most data relayed through a relative pertained

---

93The Art, Historical and Scientific Association was also listed in the Vancouver Social Register and Club Directory. That society, however, had sought to be open in its membership objectives, and had a broad, comprehensive range of programme activities and objectives. For the men's Canadian Club, Angus Everett Robertson documents linkages between Vancouver's business elite, the men's Canadian Club, and the Vancouver Board of Trade. See "Vancouver's West End Elite, 1886-1914."

mostly to the subject of the biography. Thus the Young Women’s Christian Association, the
Women’s Canadian Club, and the Women’s Musical Club have been excluded from
prosopographical analysis. This is not to deny women their proper place in the history of
associations, but, rather, simply to recognize the difficulty of obtaining adequate research
data.

This last problem of inadequate evidence also contributed to the exclusion from
prosopographical analysis of the British Columbia Mountaineering Club. The
Mountaineering Club’s programme was subdivided into distinct, and relatively exclusive,
scientific (educational) and mountain-climbing (non-educational) sections. The list of
members, however, did not differentiate the members into their respective sections. By
including biographical evidence from individuals who did not seek further education, the
undifferentiated list probably biased the prosopography. Finally, the Mountaineering Club
was rejected for its similarity to the Naturalists’ Field Club. Some description of the
Mountaineering Club’s membership was available, while that of the Field Club was a
complete mystery.

The prosopography required that association members selected be representative of
the entire association membership at a specific time period. That time period was as near a
census year as possible. The problem of obtaining adequate and sufficient data required
enough cases—approximately 50—to ensure fair representation of all classes of members.
This problem was worst for the least prominent individuals.

For three associations, all members were traced. The Art, Historical and Scientific
Association had, in 1909, some 43 members. The Burrard Literary Club, had a preset
membership limit of 25. Therefore, all members from 1895 to 1900 were traced. The total
was 54. The Naturalists’ Field Club had only 17 members during its brief existence in
1906-07.

For the other two associations, random samples (using a random numbers table) of
members were obtained. From the Arts and Crafts Association, 50 of the 60 members
sampled were traced. The total membership in 1901 was 81. For the YMCA, 55 of the 75
members sampled were traced. The total membership between 1899 and 1904, compiled

The best source for relevant obituaries and other newspaper stories was the Vancouver City
Archives, Newspaper Files, Major Matthew’s Collection.
from the 1899 to 1904 Board of Directors Minutes, numbered 252. The YMCA's sample was larger because the minutes contained only initials (and no Christian names) with the members' surnames. As a result, tracing was difficult.95 The Arts and Crafts Association list included one or two Christian names and some addresses with each surname.

The final list included 219 names across five associations. Variables from those persons included sex, residence, occupation, birth, age, origin, arrival in Vancouver, education, religious and political affiliations, and any other significant club or community affiliations (such as being a school trustee). The data was almost perfectly complete for occupation and residence, but varied considerably for the other categories.96

1.6. CONCLUSION

This study examines the impulse, widespread among turn-of-the-century adults, to enlighten one another. Since it involved peers, it was "mutual." Even when they had clear missionary overtones, the organizations intended to stimulate further learning and often to recruit new members. Thus what is described and explained as "mutual enlightenment" is fundamental to the whole adult education movement. It is the well-spring of much of the tone and philosophy of adult education of the past 200 years, both in Canada and elsewhere.

We begin the study with our first group of associations including the Vancouver Art, Historical and Scientific Association, the Vancouver Women's Musical Club, the Canadian Club of Vancouver, and the Vancouver Women's Canadian Club. Primary emphasis is on the first of these. We turn then to the Vancouver Arts and Crafts Association, the Naturalists' Field Club, and the British Columbia Mountaineering Club. The final core chapter studies the Young Men's Christian Association, the Young Women's Christian Association, and the Burrard Literary Club.

Each group is examined through the associations' uses of key ideas, through

95 "Minutes of the Board of Directors," in Young Men's Christian Association of Greater Vancouver (YMCA) MSS, Folder 1-1, Special Collections Division, University of British Columbia Library, Vancouver. Many of the YMCA sample were rejected because they were too similar in name to one or two other names in city directories or because many had only recently arrived to Vancouver and thus could not be located in city directories. Tracing names to later years in the directories also often proved fruitless because many who came to Vancouver often quickly moved on to better situations.

96 The raw data is available at the University of British Columbia's Data Library.
examples of mutual enlightenment as actually practiced, and through prosopographical studies of selected organizations' membership composition. The prosopographies, in conjunction with other researches, should tell us how far each association reflected and supported the city's ambient social structure. They should also illuminate the transmission of knowledge between classes and various social groups.
CHAPTER 2.

“LIGHT, MORE LIGHT”

1: BRINGING AESTHETIC, INTELLECTUAL, AND MORAL “TONE” TO EARLY VANCOUVER

I fear the majority of active people in this City have absorbed much of that American spirit, which keeps us all moving under high pressure. We are becoming so practicle [sic] that the esthetic side of life is more or less neglected.¹

2.1. INTRODUCTORY NOTE

The above quotation, from a letter by Art, Historical and Scientific Association Secretary, H. J. deForest, captured—with a note of sadness—the context into which his and other similar associations had tried to survive. His own organization, born of an earlier, failed Art Association, was but the first of many that came to life in pre-World War I Vancouver. Transplanted or copied from similar associations popular throughout the English-speaking world, they sought to inject a more intellectual, aesthetic, and even moral spirit into the dynamic “progress” then sweeping the world. Industrial capitalism, urbanization, and the migration of vast numbers of people would shortly transform the virginal, but increasingly physically ugly city of Vancouver. Some of the city’s first citizens thought their duty was somehow to prevent the worst materialistic effects of progress from consuming their own and their fellow citizens’ lives.

The Art, Historical and Scientific Association of Vancouver, was founded April 17, 1894. It was in many respects the city’s premier cultural organization before the First World War. As the name suggests, it represented the interests of three often overlapping constituencies whose interests coalesced around the popular concept of “culture.” These constituencies, or bodies of supporters, were citizens apparently interested in the study and teaching of artistic, literary and historical, and scientific topics. They had come together to promote their own mutual education and, like missionaries, to proselytize the value of such


39
learning amongst the general public of the city. Also, like religious missionaries, they saw themselves as “a devoted few” who have “struggled under adverse conditions” to “be an educational and refining factor in the life of Western Canada.” They aimed to transmit, into Vancouver, the higher elements of British civilization and culture.

The Art, Historical and Scientific Association was a pattern-setter for all of Vancouver’s mutual enlightenment societies. It exemplified “mutual enlightenment” and what mutual enlightenment meant to its participants. The Association also showed how “mutuality” could be compromised and, in part, abandoned when membership was restricted. In the Association’s case, the members apparently would not accept, as their equals in enlightenment, most of the non-Anglo-Celtic and petit bourgeois and working-class residents (the “great masses”) that the Association promoters aimed to refine. Contrary to the egalitarian, democratic, and reciprocal basis of “mutuality,” the basis of the Association’s “mutual enlightenment” was hierarchical, bourgeois, and English. As a “devoted few,” they were essentially elitist. They distinguished between themselves (the “sophisticated” and “refined”) and the rest of the population.

This and the next two chapters concentrate on the nature, objectives, and meaning of mutual enlightenment as exemplified by the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, and by three other similar and related clubs. These latter clubs—the Vancouver Women’s Musical Club (1905), and the men’s and Women’s Canadian Clubs (1906, 1909 respectively)—closely followed the aims, clientele, and programme pattern of the Art, Historical and Scientific Association. They are treated much more sparingly than the Association, and in a comparative rather than in a comprehensive sense.

The present chapter systematically analyzes the objectives of the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, and its forbear, the Art Association, as stated by three of their founders. These statements demonstrate why Vancouver needed and was “ready” for the Art, Historical and Scientific Association and like societies. They show how the Art, Historical and Scientific Association arose in response to theme-related social, economic, ethnic, and intellectual conditions in turn-of-the-century Vancouver.

The next chapter more completely delves into the meaning and practice of mutual

---

R. Waller, Acting Secretary, to Colonel A. Leetham, United Services Institute, Whitehall, London, 27 December 1910, in Art, Historical and Scientific Association Letterbook.
enlightenment. It examines the associational pedagogies and curricula of the Art, Historical and Scientific Association and the Women’s Musical Club and traces out the conceptual boundaries of “mutual enlightenment.”

Finally, the third chapter (Chapter Four) suggests social and ethnic reasons to explain why the Association’s members saw themselves as a “clerisy”—those “devoted few” most capable of importing, preserving, and developing aesthetic, intellectual, and moral “tone.” This chapter thereby explains the meaning behind the Association’s particular form of mutual enlightenment.

2.1.1. The Art, Historical and Scientific Association of Vancouver: A Case Study of Mutual Enlightenment

The central feature of the pre-World War I history of the Art, Historical and Scientific Association is the marriage of high, romantic ideals to more utilitarian goals. The Association, to counter Vancouver’s rough social character and appearance, transplanted the genteel idea and form of a British and European learned society. As a learned society, the Association reflected and worked to change local aesthetic and intellectual conditions. It housed and supported a spirit of cultivated activities and reflection, and it endeavoured to expand its influence over the uninitiated. It established an ambitious programme of serious scholarly lectures and discussions, and social conversazioni (all for the members mainly), and a public “cabinet of curiosities” or museum and art gallery (for the “masses”). The Association thus adopted and reflected the new city and province as its point of reference. It incorporated local interests, needs, products, and topics within its programme. Yet it contained and aimed to develop further the sophistication its promoters believed was essential for the difficult tasks of cultivation before them.

Promoters of the Art, Historical and Scientific Association espoused certain key concepts—beauty, utility, and citizenship—to justify their Association’s founding, aims, programme, and social legitimacy. The choice was revelatory of social conditions in turn-of-the-century Vancouver.

Social, economic, and other considerations both shaped and now explain the Art, Historical and Scientific Association’s pattern of mutual enlightenment, its membership, and its loss of social position. Association’s members viewed themselves as a kind of
“clerisy.” This clerisy status predetermined both the nature and direction of Association work, and its position within Vancouver society. As a clerisy, these members felt confronted by massive immigration and economic and social upheaval. They saw themselves as major factors in the cause and mission of advancing the best of British civilization and culture. They wanted to build up Vancouver’s reputation, and to carry out the disinterested cultural mission of saving and preserving the province’s own past.

As British cultural missionaries, they worked diligently in the cause of including British Columbia and Canada within “Greater Britain,” (i.e., imperial federation)s. One Association founder, a newspaperman, historian, and civil servant, R. E. Gosnell, for instance, wrote an essay in support of the cause. British Columbia’s destiny, he argued, lay “as a greater Britain on the Pacific, where [as an industrial giant] British arts and institutions will expand under fresh impetus.” Also, as cultural missionaries, they hoped to “convert” and to educate the rougher elements to the more refined and civilized habits and values of the mother country’s better classes. Thus they hoped to tame the damaging influence of the overly materialistic, money-hungry, and exploitive “American spirit.” The “rougher” elements included both entrepreneurial speculators and industrial labourers. The new industrial social structure had not yet penetrated Art, Historical and Scientific Association minds.

The Art, Historical and Scientific Association did not remain alone in this civilizing endeavour. As Vancouver grew, especially after 1900, the Association finally lost its premier position. Other mutual enlightenment groups grew up with the rising demand for programmatic specialism. Competition from functionally similar organizations helped. These included the two Canadian Clubs, the Women’s Musical Club, the Arts and Crafts Association (1900), the Studio Club (1904), the British Columbia Society of Fine Arts (1908), the B.C. Entomological Society (1902), the Vancouver Photographic Society (1903), the Naturalists’ Field Club (1906), the British Columbia Academy of Science (1909), the scientific sections of the British Columbia Mountaineering Club (1906), the Vancouver Archaeological Society (1911), and Alliance Française (“French Alliance”—1904). All rose

up to carry on programmes in fulfilment of the Art, Historical and Scientific Association’s original intent.\(^4\)

This proliferation of intellectual and cultural organizations, and the fragmentation of intellectual and cultural leadership, was finally resolved in 1916 by the foundation of the Vancouver Institute. Formed under the auspices of the new University of British Columbia, the Institute combined the Art, Historical and Scientific Association with other surviving societies and the University to collectively sponsor a public lecture programme. Each constituent body was responsible for selecting its own lectures. Along with their Institute contributions, each society, including the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, also continued to maintain its own separate existence, identity, and member programmes. The other original affiliated organizations were the Academy of Science, the Archaeological Institute, the Architectural Institute of B.C., the B.C. Mountaineering Club (Natural History Section), the Vancouver Trades and Labour Council, the Vancouver Teachers’ Association, the Woman’s University Club, and the B.C. Fine Arts Society.\(^5\)

2.2. THE ART, HISTORICAL AND SCIENTIFIC ASSOCIATION, 1894-1916

The Art, Historical and Scientific Association was formally organized at a public meeting in O’Brien’s (dance) Hall at 4 p.m., Tuesday April 17, 1894. The time and day of the week are significant since only select individuals could have been available to meet in normal working hours. This meeting and the foundation of the Art, Historical and Scientific Association culminated more than five years of hard and dedicated work. These founders had tried—but failed—to organize an art society.\(^6\) They had also set out to found at least two historical, antiquarian, and/or literary societies, all of which had petered out. Chaired by the Reverend L. Norman Tucker, Rector of Christ Church (Anglican), with Henry J. deForest, an artist, acting as secretary, this newest Association formally declared its


\(^5\)See Minutes, 29 March 1916, 23 January 1917, Vancouver Art, Historical and Scientific Association, Add. Mss. 336, VCA. This Vancouver Institute was not the city’s first. For one autumn and one spring session in 1890-91, such an Institute was organized for free public entertainments of “popular science, music, literature and debates.” See Selman, “Adult Education in B.C.,” pp. 130-131.

successors to have expired and adopted a new constitution. As descendant, the Art, Historical and Scientific Association inherited the properties, finances, and willing members of its defunct predecessors: the Art Association (1889-1892), the Historical and Literary Association (stillbirth, 1892), and the Columbia Institute (stillbirth, 1893). In effect, these organizations were re-constituted and expanded into the new Art, Historical and Scientific Association.

It is useful to recall just how the earlier efforts of the Art, Historical and Scientific Association came to grief. Consider, for example, the hopeful beginnings of the Art Association, born January 18, 1889, in the rooms of Mrs. Webster’s Art Bazaar. That Association had grown from informal meetings of local artists known to Mrs. Webster, including Captain H. A. and Mrs. S. Gertrude Mellon, and Will Ferris, a solicitor turned professional artist, and from Mrs. Webster’s art school and art discussion classes. Along with a plan for public art education, the Art Association had aimed to build an art and historical collection. The Association had hoped to “cultivate a taste for art...in the city.”

For almost two years, the Association very successfully conducted art exhibitions, held classes, and met to discuss art topics. Its membership had climbed to sixty-eight within its first year. Its success was capped by the publicly applauded First Annual Exhibition, opened by British Columbia Lieutenant-Governor Hugh Nelson, in October, 1890. However, the Association then faded from public view. Though it lasted until February 25, 1892, one of its founders, Gertrude Mellon, later suggested that part of its eventual failure was due to the overly heavy concentration on art subjects and to the exclusion by the men of women from the Association’s leadership positions. The Art Association’s eventual successor, the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, thus

---

10AHSA, *Journal*, p. 3.
11*News-Advertiser*, 20 January 1889.
assimilated the former society’s goals and organization, and many of its members, as well as those of various subsequent, but stillborn, incarnations. The latter included the Historical and Literary Association in 1892 and the Columbia Institute in 1893.

Members who had sponsored these ill-fated schemes had sought to study “the history of the province...including the aborigine tribes and the earliest records of travelers who have visited our shores” and to curtail, through the building of a museum, the export of artifacts from the Province by curio seekers. This goal had actually been clearly enunciated two years before the organization of the Art Association. Its first mention came in a letter published in *The Vancouver Daily News-Advertiser* by Dr. Hyde Clarke, distinguished English cousin of Gertrude Mellon, with a response from the newspaper’s publisher F. Carter-Cotton. Clark was a well known international journalist, linguist, author, and scientist, and was editor of *The Economist* (England). Carter-Cotton, also English, was distinguished locally as a Conservative Member of the provincial Legislature, newspaper publisher and editor, and a founder of the Vancouver Board of Trade. With “its great destiny” in hand, Clarke had called upon Vancouver’s local citizens to “remember...that they have a history.” Carter-Cotton, in turn, editorialized about the benefits of an “Historical Society” established “in connection with, or at least under the auspices of the Board of Trade.” Here was the first indication of a linkage between the Association and the city’s business and political establishment.

This goal of saving North-west Coast Indian artifacts was seen as most pressing. The popularity of such anthropologists as Franz Boas, combined with the philanthropic vigor of many American and European (especially German) capitalists anxious to establish the reputation of themselves, their museums, and their cities, served rapidly to rob the area of its most treasured anthropological artifacts and the native peoples of their cultural heritage.

The Art, Historical and Scientific Association also aimed at this high objective. They believed it their duty to save, for British Columbians, as many “antiques” as they could by attracting voluntary donations from willing local citizens. This goal was to play a

---

13 *News-Advertiser*, 24 February 1892, 26 February 1892.
continuing role in the Association's endeavours throughout the period under study. The significance of this aspect of the Art, Historical and Scientific Association's work was, and remained, twofold—first, the boosterish wish to build up the reputation of Vancouver and its region; and second, a thoroughly disinterested cultural mission whose motives were simple curiosity and a respect for the past.

At the meeting, officers were elected and a list of Honorary President and Vice-Presidents suggested. This list of local dignitaries was the closest Vancouver could claim to an aristocracy, the city itself being under eight years old. His Excellency the Lieutenant-Governor was recommended as Honorary President. Honorary Vice-Presidents included Mrs. Edgar Dewdney, wife of the Lieutenant-Governor; Mr. and Mrs. Henry Abbott, he being General Superintendendent, West Division, of the C.P.R.; Mrs. H. St. George Hamersley, wife of an important city barrister; Mayor and Mrs. R. A. Anderson; Mrs. Webster, an artist and founder of the Art Association, and wife of Captain Webster, agent for the Oceanic S. S. Company; Right Reverend Bishop Sillitoe, Lord Bishop of New Westminster (Anglican); Right Reverend Bishop Perrin, Lord Bishop of Columbia (Anglican); J. W. Horne, Esq., M.P.P.; C. E. Corbould, Esq., M.P.; F. Carter-Cotton, Esq., M.P.P., and publisher of the Daily News-Advertiser; ex-Mayor David Oppenheimer; A. G. Ferguson, Esq.; and Reverend E. D. McLaren, B.D., Presbyterian minister, St. Andrew's Church.

The Art, Historical and Scientific Association elected Christ Church's (Anglican) Reverend L. Norman Tucker as its first President. Other members of the first executive included "Professor" (a contemporory reference to any respected teacher, not just an academic) H. J. deForest, Secretary; Mrs. A. Clements, Treasurer; and Mrs. J. C. (Sara A.) McLagan, wife of the Daily World newspaper's publisher. Miss Dafoe, daughter of J. Roy Dafoe, contractor; Miss Tierney, daughter of William Tierney, contractor; and Mr. T. R. Hardiman, artist and proprietor of the Pioneer Art Gallery, constituted the first General Council.

The fledgling Association's promoters undoubtedly chose such a distinguished list of honorary officers to lend it credibility and status, and to dispose the Association to success and to longevity. The promoters' earlier failures thereby could be considered erased. By enlisting the support of the city's economic and political elite, the promoters might also have

\[^{16}\text{AHSA, Journal, pp. 4-5.}\]
meant to break down some of that Barbarian “indifference” to culture about which Matthew Arnold had complained.\textsuperscript{17}

The enlistment of support from the elite highlights the missionary-like determination of Association promoters to bring intellectual and aesthetic sophistication to a young and enterprising city. They saw themselves as carriers, and as catalysts, to import and to recreate the best and the richest of British Imperial culture. Given the temper of the times, and the strength and popularity of the Imperialist movement in Canada,\textsuperscript{18} such a goal is entirely plausible. Many Art, Historical and Scientific Association members were United Kingdom-born. Some had merchant marine or Indian Army experience, or both. Others, of Canadian origin, had United Empire Loyalist backgrounds. Similar personal backgrounds have been found in studies of other regions to correlate highly with a commitment to active pro-Imperialism.\textsuperscript{19} Perhaps they were searching for a sense of personal meaning and identity in a world fraught with accelerating and seemingly chaotic industrial, social, economic, cultural, and spiritual change. Or, perhaps, they wished to avoid or ignore the harshness of that economic materialism so prevalent then in Vancouver and British Columbia, and the opulence and wealth of some of their benefactors and the abject poverty of some of their potential clients.

In brief, these Art, Historical and Scientific Association activists probably saw themselves as an enlightened “clerisy.” They would cultivate a symbiosis within the city—enlighten both themselves and the city’s elite. Significantly, these aspirations were forming exactly during a period of rising labour and socialist political activity in the Western world, and certainly in British Columbia. It was also the height of Imperial sentiment and power. The Art, Historical and Scientific Association thus came to life in a moment of cultural transformation, but without recognizing or understanding it.


\textsuperscript{18}See Carl Berger, \textit{Sense of Power}.

2.3. ART, HISTORICAL AND SCIENTIFIC ASSOCIATION: AIMS AND INTELLECTUAL HERITAGE

Certain popular ideas—art, beauty, culture, civilization, utility—underlay the character, values, aims, and reasons for the formation of both the Art Association and the Art, Historical and Scientific Association. These ideas were espoused by association activists to support and explain their respective organization’s impact and social significance.

The first activist was an anonymous member of the Art Association. Nicknamed “Art,” he or she published his or her views in a letter to the editor of the News-Advertiser on the day of that Association’s formation in 1889. Art’s letter was an invitation to and an argument of support for such an organization in this “young and growing city, where all are alive to the business interests.”

The second was Mrs. Gertrude Mellon, a key promoter of both Associations, who, in 1909, published a short memoire on their origins. Her memoire was a more sardonic history of both Associations, written to illustrate the hard fought progress made in cultivating the city. It was likely aimed at prospective British migrants, especially “of the better classes,” to British Columbia. Mrs. Mellon, was herself the daughter of an English “gentleman” who had immigrated to Ontario. She probably accepted the belief that “superior,” private educational institutions, and “high class” cultural and recreational organizations and institutions, were of significant importance to attracting this better class of British gentle folk and the cultured middle classes to the more primitive conditions of western Canada.

Third and finally, was Reverend L. Norman Tucker, first President of the Art, Historical and Scientific Association. Tucker outlined the goals of that Association in an address to the Earl of Aberdeen, Governor General of Canada, at the opening of the Association’s first Exhibition, November 1, 1894. Reverend Tucker’s address was full of

---

20 News-Advertiser, 18 January 1889.
21 Mellon, “History Art and Science.”
patriotic idealism. He probably intended to demonstrate the rapid progress being made in
Vancouver and British Columbia, a rich land and "the natural home of and nursery of the
artist and the poet."  

Each speaker placed his and her new Association within the context of civilization
and progress in this prosperous and enterprising land. Enthused by the popular spirit of
urban "boosterism," they aimed to enchant the city's residents with "sweetness and light." They
would divert attention away from, rather than change in any substantive way, the
worst excesses and social consequences of industry. Paradoxically, it was from those same
industrial excesses that the Association, like the city, ultimately depended on for its health,
wealth, and success.

This wealth was generated by speculation, exploitation, and resource and
transportation development in Vancouver and its region. It provided the means and the
status by which some of Vancouver's elite citizens contributed—financially, politically, and
occasionally in personal membership—to the Association and its museum and art gallery
collections. Unfortunately for the Association, however, such support was always
precarious at best and virtually non-existent at worst.

The city was far too young to have produced its own class of wealthy industrial
philanthropists. Thus the Association, by 1898, was forced to begin soliciting and receiving
from City Council annual financial and museum-space grants. The City fathers, however,
were hardly generous. Their small grants (starting at $100 per year) were more part of
their campaign to attract business and prospective migrants than to promote and enhance
public adult education and innocent recreation. The Museum, Association directors argued,
would be good for attracting tourists.

Even under the impact of these membership and financial constraints, the
Association's promoters were clearly optimistic about the Association's mission. Vancouver
in 1889, according to letter-writer "Art," was destined to take "an honourable position
among all the cities of the world."  

Art and art education, however, as part of that
"greatest resource of any nation..., its brainpower," were as essential as any business or
industry to guarantee the city's its high status. Art is a key "public work," decried the

23 Art, Historical and Scientific Association Minutes, 1 November 1894 (newspaper clipping, nd.,
np.).
24 News-Advertiser, 18 January 1889.
writer. It “ought not to languish, nor be left to struggle as best it may.” Because of its aesthetic and moral attributes, it needed to be led sympathetically by those “who are interested in the artistic future of Vancouver.” The fray of the market place, the writer argued, was not the proper environment to best promote art and art education, and aesthetic appreciation, amongst Vancouver’s people.

Mrs. Mellon, on the other hand, portrayed ominously the arrival of “civilization, the iron horse...screeching into Vancouver.” With civilization came “the usual concomitant of all the nationalities and conditions of society, all bent on one goal”—the unbridled acquisition of wealth. Mrs. Mellon, however, also pointed out the city’s good fortune in its the Art, Historical and Scientific Association—

[the] few there were that had higher aims. These people saw that if no restraining hand was put forth, eventually a harvest of corruption, with foetid and unhealthy surroundings, would result.25

Progress and civilization, Mrs. Mellon and many of her contemporaries believed, if left untempered and uncultured, led only to misery. Without restraint, they produced, as Association President Reverend L. Norman Tucker had mused, only “the materialising struggle for existence.”26 This new Association, Tucker believed, had a duty to ensure that “the hard and unlovely lot of out [sic] toiling and struggling fellow citizens [be made] a little less hard and unlovely through the varied interests of literature, science and art.”27

Each spokesperson apparently believed that the laissez-faire economic system, and economic and material progress, needed to be humanized and uplifted by aesthetic, intellectual, and spiritual infusions. Only “Culture” or “cultivation,” as opposed to to mere economic and political “civilization,” might ensure the writer Art’s optimistic view of progress and Mrs. Mellon’s and Reverend Tucker’s dread of civilization’s corruption.

\[25\]Mellon, “History Art and Science.”

\[26\]Art, Historical and Scientific Association Minutes, 1 November 1894 (newspaper clipping, n.d., n.p.).

\[27\]Art, Historical and Scientific Association Minutes, 8 January 1895 (newspaper clipping, n.d., n.p.).
2.3.1. Reverend Tucker: To Inspire, To Enlighten, and To Build

Reverend Tucker was apparently captivated by the moral spirit of cultural enlightenment. He was, at the same time, a shrewd observer of local interests and problems. He understood well Vancouver's geographical and psychological isolation, at the edge of British civilization. He could speak as any booster of the province's vast and potential natural wealth. He also knew, as an agent of both Christian and British civilization, that their traditional institutions, and corresponding political stability, were only barely and minimally in place. He believed, therefore, that mutual enlightenment should hope to was best formulated to harmonize "culture's" spirituality with the more utilitarian "improvement" and "progress." His purpose for the Art, Historical and Scientific Association was to enlighten, to meld, and to build a cultivated and moral civilization.

He outlined this mission in his address to the Earl of Aberdeen, Governor-General of Canada, at the Association's 1894 Exhibition. For Reverend Tucker the objects of the Association were

to cultivate a taste for the beauties and refinements of life; to pursue studies that raise the mind above the materialising struggle for existence; to surround our community with the works of taste and beauty; to inspire our minds with the great deeds of our fellow-men and especially of our Yellow-countrymen; to explore the mysterious treasure house of nature and to admire and to utilise the marvellous forces concealed in her bosom—in one word, to appeal to our higher instincts and to develop our higher powers.  

These were powerful sentiments. Roused by this strong moral vision, Reverend Tucker subtly reminded his contemporaries of the conditions under which they were living: the chimera of economic wealth and prosperity as the economy was collapsing (due to the 1892 depression), the nastiness of the urban environment with its hardly existent sanitation, its dilapidated buildings, its eastern slums, and its pollution; and the hostility and disdain directed towards the city's Asian citizens (10.5 per cent of the total population in 1891 and 1901).

Tucker, rather than condemning, appealed by inspiring his listeners. Fully aware of Vancouver's harsh conditions, he recognized that to ensure successful material fulfillment of his vision he must appeal to the more base motives of his intended constituency. Most

---

28 Art, Historical and Scientific Association Minutes, 1 November 1894 (newspaper clipping, n.d., n.p.).
British Columbians, after all, had come to the province to fulfill their desires for material wealth, social position, and security. He had to show them how the fruits of the vision might contribute to their success—materially, socially, and spiritually. He hoped to convey that through intellectual and spiritual elevation, through the enlightenment of Association members and the greater community, the citizens of the city could be brought to work together in an harmonious, inspired, and creative construction of a beautiful, moral, and progressive city. He had, however, to temper the Romantic vision with the more utilitarian needs of his constituents.

For instance, as he so eloquently reminded his distinguished audience, the region surrounding Vancouver was a veritable treasure-house of untold riches and resources. All that was needed to reveal and to utilize these treasures was that the community pull together and develop its higher intelligence, its compassion, and its aesthetic and moral sensibilities. The ugliness of the city and the sense of depression could be overcome. The city's (and listener's personal) economy and aesthetic appearance could surely be improved, especially when people's capacities for detached intellectual curiosity and discovery were cultivated and supported. Finally, he underpinned his appeal with a consideration of morally resolute behaviour. For example, and significantly, the Association at Tucker's inaugural speech was keenly sensitive to the Pacific community and undoubtedly to trade prospectives there. Thus Tucker's audience included the Chilean and the Japanese Consuls, as well as the Governor-General and Lady Aberdeen, Vancouver Mayor R.A. Anderson, and other unidentified local dignitaries.29

It is quite plausible that Tucker, a highly educated Englishman, on his religious (Anglican) posting to one of the more remote parts of the British Empire, was keenly aware of the Empire's international politics and the role of British cultural supremacy. After all, the Empire, near the end of Victoria's reign, was a world-wide political, economic, and cultural hegemony. The Empire was based on the export of political, social, and religious institutions and traditions, and finished goods, in exchange for raw materials, certain cultural artifacts, and loyalty.30

Finally, and significantly, Tucker gave tribute to "the great deeds...of our

---

29 Art, Historical and Scientific Association Minutes, 1 November 1894 (newspaper clipping, n.d., n.p.).
30 See Morris, Pax Britannica.
Yellow-countrymen,” Vancouver’s Oriental population. Such tribute was significant considering the racial animosity felt by many in the European (i.e., British and Canadian) community. There had been a serious anti-Oriental riot in 1887 in Vancouver, and fears and resentments did and would continue to strain community relations between the groups for decades. Considering the Association’s overtures, by inviting Japanese Consul S. Shimizu to sit at the inaugural platform, and by Tucker’s unmistakable public tribute to the local Asian community, it is quite possible that the Association aimed to induce some harmony into existing strained relations. A truly beautiful, enterprising, and moral city needed some good degree of mutual co-operation and harmony, no matter how unrealistic or incompatible with individual members’ economic goals and their personal and moral prejudices. If nothing else, some Association members surely believed that the city’s economic glory still depended on an expanding Pacific trade. Their wealth ultimately required amicable and co-operative relations with Vancouver’s Asian (and South American) neighbours.

Rather more intriguing in significance, however, was the implication that European, and especially British, civilization and culture had much to learn from and to offer Asian civilization and culture. For instance, some must surely have considered that Japanese Consul Shimizu could have no better opportunity to learn the best of European civilization and culture than through the Art, Historical and Scientific Association. Also, one prominent member, Professor Edward Odium, “scientist, educator and now a prominent representative of real-estate...interests in Vancouver,” had prior to his move to Vancouver been president of a “Tokio,” (sic) Japan college. There he had studied the origin of the Japanese and had concluded “that they are either Assyrians or else one of the lost tribes of Israel.” Edward Odium’s remarkable conclusion about Japanese origins—their “Israelite” heritage—may partially explain the Art, Historical and Scientific Association. In particular, it may explain Tucker’s tribute and Shimizu’s position on the platform. Moreover, it helps to explain the Association’s willingness to accept Shimizu and several

31 E. O. S. Scholefield and F. W. Howay, British Columbia, Biographical, vol. 4, pp. 336-342, 339. Edward Odium became probably Canada’s most notable proponent of the British-Israel “theory.” He published, in 1916, God’s Covenant Man: British-Israel (Toronto: William Briggs, 1916). Written during and because of the First World War, Odium pointedly excluded Germans, Jews, and Romans as potential Israelites. Attacking orthodox Protestant Christian theology, he pointed out that he had the support of many church ministers, speaking before their congregations on many different occasions. “Roman teaching,” however was seen as beyond redemption, as “pagan and heathenish (p. 148).”
other prominent Japanese, as well as such prominent local Jews as former mayor David Oppenheimer, as members.

Professor Odum, along with others "prominent" in the local literati, such as Vancouver librarian Edward Machin, were believers in the racialistic British Israel Theory or Anglo-Israelism. Machin, for instance, had lectured in 1894 before the Association on the subject of "Anglo-Israelism." As such they believed that the early British had originated as among the "ten lost tribes" of Israelites, captured by Sargon after the northern kingdom (Israel) fell in 721 B.C. These lost Israelites, after leaving the Middle Eastern "regions formerly known as Assyria, Babylonia and Armenia," were purported to have wandered across Europe, eventually settling in Britain. The theory, in 1649, gained some popularity. It attracted such notables as archaeologist of Mexican antiquities Lord Kingsborough, English naval lieutenant Richard Brothers (1757-1824), Scottish lawyer John Finlayson, British Member of Parliament Nathaniel Brassey Halket, and Astronomer-Royal for Scotland, C. Piazzi Smythe. Significantly, the height of its popularity coincided with "the heyday of British imperialism," the significance of which supported the Biblical prophesy that Israel (not the Jews) "will be 'a nation and a company of nations'" (Genesis 35: 11). The global supremacy of Britain and the British people was proof of Anglo-Saxon, or Celto-Saxon, "Israelitish" origin and of the fulfillment of God's covenant with Abraham. The prophets also predicted a final return to Israel and a reunion between Israel and Judah. Accepting the Japanese and Jews into the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, to some believers of the theory, would be the recognition of an ancient bond of racial brotherhood.

32 Art, Historical and Scientific Association Minutes, 11 December 1894 (newspaper clipping, nd., np.).
34The boundaries of the tribe "Israel" were not clear. The various voluntary associations formed to promote the theory were active researchers and publicists, constantly trying to formulate further proofs of their position and also trying to determine who belonged and who did not. International politics, for example were an important consideration. Thus while the Scandinavians and Dutch
Thus for Tucker and the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, his tributes to Orientals were not empty platitudes. The Association had maintained contact and association with the “Oriental” community throughout the pre-war period. Mr. Kitto, the Japanese consul, was a principal actor in the 1892 attempt to form an historical and antiquarian society out of the Art Association.\textsuperscript{35} Two other Japanese consuls, the afore-mentioned S. Shimizu, and Mr. Morikawa, were elected second Vice-Presidents of the Art, Historical and Scientific Association in 1901 and 1902, and 1903, respectively. So popular was Mr. Shimizu that upon his reassignment to Chicago in 1902, and in recognition of his being “so worthy a citizen & so zealous a supporter” he was bestowed the rank of Honorary Member. He had earlier, in 1895, been elected honorary corresponding secretary. Other prominent Japanese members included Reverend Goro Kaburagi, and S. Yoshinye, Consul Morikawa’s secretary, both in 1903.\textsuperscript{36}

Curiously, and sadly, after 1903 there were no Japanese names further recorded as Association members. In that year, the Association and the City of Vancouver formally agreed to move the Association and its museum to the new publicly and philanthropically funded Carnegie Library (1905). In their Agreement, the City assumed ownership of the museum’s collection in exchange for providing the Association with facilities and funding to maintain the collection. The Association remained as the public museum’s curators and continued its own educational programmes. This removal of active Japanese membership was undoubtedly related to this Agreement, and particularly, to the upwelling of anti-Asian feeling within British Columbia. The anti-Asian sentiments eventually culminated in the large and destructive September 8, 1907 riot through “Chinatown” and “Little Tokyo.” Japanese immigration, for example, had been dramatically increasing since 1900. This increase served to exacerbate local insecurities, which thus led to the riot. Typical of these insecurities were “the challenge to morality, overwhelming numbers, the Japanese military threat [especially with their 1905 defeat of the Russians], ‘unfair’ economic competition, and, especially, inassimability.” Even the Art, Historical and Scientific Association was

\textsuperscript{34}(cont’d) peoples were generally also lost “Israelites,” the Germans (especially Teutons) were suspect. See Odium, \textit{God’s Covenant Man}, as a “scholarly” mishmash (actually anti-German propaganda) proving Britain’s pre-eminent position in the world and especially as the eventual victor of World War I. Also, the Chinese and some American Indians, by virtue of their high civilizations, were also considered “Israelites by some theorists.

\textsuperscript{35}\textit{News-Advertiser}, 26 February 1892.

\textsuperscript{36}Art, Historical and Scientific Association Minutes, 13 March 1902; 27 March 1902; 26 March 1895; 26 February 1903.
unable to remain detached from the riot and its consequences, and popular local feeling. One riot organizer, Reverend Dr. Hugh Fraser, pastor of the First Presbyterian Church, was by 1909 an Association member.\textsuperscript{37}

The Chinese community also had recognized contact with the Art, Historical and Scientific Association. This contact was not as members, unlike the more esteemed Japanese, but rather as "museum visitors." At least one even made a donation to the Museum, though no Chinese names were ever listed in the official membership lists, at least prior to World War I.\textsuperscript{38} Still, their visits to the Museum constituted a highly significant twenty-seven per cent of all registered visitors, considering that this number did not include the scores of Chinese visitors who were unable to sign the visitors book.\textsuperscript{39}

One can only speculate as to the popularity of the Museum within the Chinese community. Obviously, the location of the Museum was a factor. Situated on the top floor of the Carnegie Library, at the corner of Main and Hastings Streets, the Museum was practically next door to "Chinatown" (and only a few blocks from "Little Tokyo"). Thus the Museum was readily accessible to those Chinese who wished an opportunity to entertain or educate themselves. Perhaps it provided for them a relatively neutral ground to experience Anglo-Canadian and European culture. Here, they could even share the same space with the ethnic Canadians (foreign devils), in whose country they now lived.

The Association’s willingness to accept Japanese, but not Chinese, members (until 1903) underscores what is more likely a broader “class” difference than an ethnic difference. Japanese Association members, like other Association members, all held very high status within the community.\textsuperscript{40} Chinese residents did not. Except for the Christian missions “founded by whites for the social and spiritual welfare of the two minorities [Asians and native Indians],” neither, and especially native Indians and the Chinese, were

\begin{itemize}
\item Art, Historical and Scientific Association Minutes, 14 January 1908. The donor was listed as “Tommy (Chinaman).”
\item Calculation based on monthly statistics recorded in Art, Historical and Scientific Association Minutes: 28 May 1914, 24 September 1914, 3 November 1914, 26 November 1914, and 17 December 1914.
\item See Chapter Four for a prosopographical analysis of the 1909, then strictly ethnically European, Art, Historical and Scientific Association membership.
\end{itemize}
rarely admitted as members to ethnically European organizations.\footnote{Ward, "Class and Race," pp. 592-3.} Also, it was quite possible that the Japanese only, and not the Chinese immigrants, had sought to extend themselves into the "white" community. According to sociologist Stanford Lyman, and contrary to the fears of many "whites," Japanese immigrants actively sought to assimilate, to join with the dominant culture. Chinese immigrants, on the other hand, "present[ed] an instance of unusually persistent [and self-imposed] social isolation and preservation of Old World values and institutions."\footnote{Stanford M. Lyman, "Contrasts in the Community Organization of Chinese and Japanese in North America," in \textit{British Columbia: Historical Readings}, eds. W. Peter Ward and Robert A. J. McDonald (Vancouver: Douglas & McIntyre, 1981), pp. 640-42.} Paradoxically, British immigrants to Canada, as elsewhere, were like the Chinese in their almost rigid preservation of Old World values and institutions.\footnote{See Barman, \textit{British in British Columbia}.}

Still, the question of the Art, Historical and Scientific Association's race relations needs to be more fully considered. It is still not clear whether or not the Association was racialist or racist, though the evidence does support the former. How widespread were the racialist views of Edward Odum? Was he and were others racist, believing not only in the superiority of the British race but also that human abilities are determined by race? Note, for instance, that aside from the Japanese consular staff, and Reverend Kaburagi, there were no Japanese businessmen or professionals registered as Association members. Finally, why did so many Chinese visit the Museum, especially in light of Lyman's interpretation of Chinese resistance to cultural assimilation? These questions will have to be more substantially answered in follow up research. Except for these speculations, only the questions are raised in this study.

\section*{2.3.2. Art, Mrs. Mellon, and Utilitarian Motives}

Reverend Tucker, in his opening address to the Art, Historical and Scientific Association's 1894 Exhibition, reflected the anti-industrial tone of nineteenth-century's romanticism. All three of the Art Association's, and the Art, Historical and Scientific Association's activists, however, also supported Utilitarian goals. This was fairly obvious with Reverend Tucker's promoting the use of the province's natural resources. He wrapped his message, however, in the romantic tones of "the mysterious treasure house of nature"
and "the marvellous forces concealed in her bosom."

Art and Mrs. Mellon, on the other hand, more directly voiced Utilitarian goals. In each case, however, these speakers used these goals apparently to mask their true intent. These Utilitarian goals may have been stated in order to appeal directly and plainly to the economic self-interests of Vancouver's "Philistines." A cultural association, to remind the reader, aimed to cultivate and to refine these classes. With its ambitious plans to outfit a new museum and art gallery, and to conduct local scientific and historical investigations, the Association needed money, space, and an attractive collection of artifacts, art objects, and scientific specimens. Alas, in such a young frontier city as Vancouver, there were few potential benefactors to draw on. There were no supportive aristocrats as found in British towns and cities. There were none like the old family "Brahmins" of Boston, who served as cultural overlords and who created magnificent cultural and educational institutions to enrich the cultural fabric of that old and distinguished city. There were no great industrial philanthropists like Andrew Carnegie (libraries, including the Vancouver Carnegie Library) or like the Fields (Field Columbian Museum) and Hutchinsons (Chicago Art Institute) of late nineteenth-century Chicago. Vancouver's newly rich were probably far too insecure in their recent acquisitions to generously donate to a museum or art gallery, let alone build one.

Rather, in Vancouver, culture and enlightenment were in the hands of a group of

self-styled savants, financially stable enough, and perhaps eccentric enough, to indulge in such activities. For the most part, however, they were socially just below Vancouver’s business and professional elite. Thus they needed to look to the city’s burghers, and to members of the elite, for material (money, objets d’art) as well as intellectual and political support. Thus while they voiced Utilitarian goals, the nature of the curriculum, aside from the museum, suggests that they never carried them out.

Nevertheless, it is important to demonstrate how Art and Mrs. Mellon appealed for community support, especially considering the prevailing social and economic climate. Art appealed on three grounds. First, he pressed for support on the Utilitarian and economic grounds of “art education.” He called for instruction in “practical...art” to train the “operators and skilled designers” needed to work in Vancouver’s new factories. It would not be necessary, then, “to send our children to the Academies of Europe.” There they could be trained “to sketch our mountains and copy our skies,” and to learn the theory and intricate skills of fine and design art. Second, and in the strong Romantic vein of Reverend Tucker, Art wanted to develop “the artistic capabilities of...[the] community,...for the sake of the thing itself, for the sake of elevation of thought and feeling.”

Finally, Art proffered more selfish social and economic reasons for Vancouver’s citizens to support an Art Association. He or she argued that a city with a healthy and supportive climate for art would be very attractive to better classes of potential immigrants, including more artists and designers. Not only would such immigrants greatly enhance the city, they would strengthen its industrial base. Art recognized the importance of product design and packaging. Artists and designers attracted to Vancouver would enable the “thorough and efficient” art education “of the youth.” This, in turn, would strengthen and assure the city’s industrial and aesthetic future. Finally, his or her reasoning was “selfish.” An active and supportive art scene should attract to Vancouver people of similar values to Art, that is, friends and colleagues. Moreover, it should ensure their employment through teaching and the sale of their art.

Mrs. Mellon, while sympathetic to Art’s motives and goals regarding the fine and design arts, recognized that such art could not survive alone in the speculative and resource-based economic hot-house that was Vancouver. As she recalled:

45 *News-Advertiser*, 18 January 1889.
Art’s [the skill and product, not the spokesperson] aid was first sought,—This was too slow and insipid for the practical purposes at so early a stage. Something more direct was needed. Science was brought in to help in developing the vast natural resources and to appeal still further, history was added. The experience of the world proves that it is absolutely necessary in building up a nation to instil vitality by creating a history of those who have taken a prominent part in its discovery and growth.46

Mrs. Mellon thus suggested that the truly powerful reasons for those to join the Art, Historical and Scientific Association were economic and political. They wanted to learn about the physical properties of the Province to better enable resource exploitation. Further, they hoped to create a national history or mythology to ensure political stability and the advance of British civilization. Undoubtedly there was a third motive—personal aggrandisement. Many of the potential and actual members of this Association would be just “those...prominent...in its [the Province’s] discovery and growth.” They could thus help create that history needed by the Province for its future generations and at the same time ensure their own place and recognition within that history.

2.4. SUMMARY

In summary, the creation of the Art, Historical and Scientific Association for mutual enlightenment may indeed be explained by the “social meaning” of certain ideas, especially clerisy, culture, beauty, and utility. These ideas were critical to the Art, Historical and Scientific Association’s central purposes and to attracting public and philanthropic support in the relatively inhospitable and unconventional environment of frontier capitalism. Creating a clerisy, a core of enlightened citizens, around whom these ideas would coalesce and find practical and material expression was central to the organizers’ goal of adding a strong and modifying element of culture. It was around this clerisy that other citizens and residents would gain access to their own enlightenment.

Public explanations and arguments of Association members were critical to test for the social impact of these ideas. In summary, the three Association promoters, Gertrude Mellon, Reverend L. Norman Tucker, and newspaper letter-writer “Art,” have expressed a range and mix of motives or reasons for their respective Association’s formation. Each speaker had several reasons. All three provided economic motives for their Association’s

46Mellon, “History Art and Science.”
formation: spokesperson Art emphasized practical art training for artisans and for artists; Reverend Tucker and Mrs. Mellon stressed using science to better exploit the region's natural resources. Art and Reverend Tucker also had aesthetic motives. They wanted to bring art into the city, to stimulate and nourish its creation and exhibition, to give its citizens something of beauty to contemplate. Such aesthetic stimulations would divert people away from their personal “toil” and hardship, and from the ugliness of the city and its industrial life. Reverend Tucker and Mrs. Mellon, in turn, added a clear moral reform or moral education motive to their society's purpose. By diverting and uplifting people's minds and attention, by helping them to focus on beauty and “higher” values, by helping them to appreciate people other than themselves (the Japanese, for instance), they probably hoped to ease tensions, to find personal and community meaning beyond the mere economic, and perhaps to alter or lessen the intensity of economic competition. Finally, Gertrude Mellon clearly stated a patriotic and political reason for the Art, Historical and Scientific Association. Unbridled materialism and its resulting chaos, and the lack of understanding and appreciation of British traditions, needed to be countered by historical research and education. Only proper historical education could bring order, cohesion, and national purpose to the “comcomitant of all the nationalities and conditions of society” arriving in Vancouver mainly to get rich.

They hoped to temper or at least to smooth over that rawness of frontier capitalism and ethnic and class struggles, and to inject the ideas of beauty and refinement into the still frontier urban environment. On the surface, they appeared to accept Matthew Arnold's argument. Culture and enlightenment could be advanced, and “human perfection” achieved, only when all classes (including ethnic groups) in society participated equally in cultural enlightenment. Class and other social divisions were anathema to a truly humane and progressive civilization. Through mutual enlightenment, they wished to bring order and moral purpose out of the chaos of an “American spirit” (the height of philistinism) infesting the Canadian West. And, as Art advocated, these functions are best carried out separate from the market place. Like a church, these functions need to be conducted by those most educationally (not necessarily institutionally) qualified and by those motivated by the highest of moral values and purpose. Also like a church, all, theoretically, were invited to join.

47 Art, Historical and Scientific Association Minutes, 8 January 1895 (newspaper clipping, nd., np.).
48 Mellon, “History Art and Science.”
Underlying the formation of the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, therefore, was a marriage of European, especially British, intellectual and aesthetic ideals with West Coast Canadian economic and social necessities and desires. Idealism tempered by pragmatism contributed to the rationale that was Romantic in origin and in intention, but was Utilitarian, and especially economically, socially, and ethnically exclusive, in public expression. Overlaying this aesthetic and intellectual Romanticism, and even those aspects of economic Utilitarianism that survived into the actual programme, was the political motive and objective of creating a culturally British Vancouver and a British Columbia. It was this "national," social ideal, not just the individual enrichment ideal, to which the Art, Historical and Scientific Association aimed.

The Association's method would, however, be educational and, for its members, mutual. It would be a shared cultural enlightenment, not political or patriotic discourse or indoctrination. Arnold's ideas of an egalitarian and broadly public enlightenment were the mainstay of Association curricula—but only to a point. Ultimately, the members betrayed the full moral intent of Arnold's "national culture." They were unable to fully transcend their own English or Scot, and Philistine, interests and prejudices. Thus, as the next chapter details, they created a hierarchical and bi-focal pedagogy and curricula—a generally exclusive Association for themselves, and a public museum and art gallery for "the masses." Finally, in Chapter Four, through analyses of Association members' personal characteristics, we will show that while they indeed look like a clerisy, they failed to expand clerisy membership. They effectively excluded, from the clerisy, the "aliens" ("persons...mainly led, not by their class spirit, but by a general humane spirit")49 of other classes and ethnic groups.

49Arnold, *Culture and Anarchy*, p. 90.
CHAPTER 3.

“LIGHT, MORE LIGHT”
2: FROM “TONE” TO BRITISH CIVILIZATION THROUGH MUTUAL ENLIGHTENMENT

Use your Club as a window through which the best and the purest light of the United States, of the Old World and of the New, can shine upon the life of your town, and by the warmth and brightness of their rays contribute to the enlightenment of your city.1

...the splendid vision grows and unfolds an ideal such as no people, from the earliest dawn of time have beheld, the ideal of a great and multiplied and extended British civilization, which we here, and men abroad may unite in declaring to be one of the most beneficient instrumentalities ever given to the world.2

3.1. INTRODUCTORY NOTE: IDEAS IN PRACTICE

Earl Grey, Governor-General of Canada, and Elizabeth Rogers, Women’s Canadian Club president, captured, in the above passages, the missionary zeal behind the promotion of enlightenment through voluntary associations. Further, both quotations clearly suggest that enlightenment, mutually fostered through club and society, should also extend, as light, outwards to envelop the city. We need, then, to clarify just what mutual enlightenment was, to whom it was intended, and what it meant to its promoters and participants.

This form of enlightenment, “mutual enlightenment,” with its special pedagogy and curricula, is the subject of this chapter. The second of three chapters, this chapter explores in detail the associational pedagogy and curricula of two exemplary cases—the Art, Historical and Scientific Association and its high-toned off-shoot, the Vancouver Women’s Musical Club. These two associations were created by those men and women who were highly sensitive to the disruptions and general rudeness of Vancouver’s social, economic, and physical environment. These same men and women were also amongst those most

2Annual Report, Women’s Canadian Club, Vancouver, B.C. ([Vancouver]: Evans & Hastings, Printers, [1913]), p. 7, Pamphlet 1913-5, VCA. The speaker was Club President, Mrs. Elizabeth Rogers.
highly conscious of the high, European ideals of “culture” and “civilization.” Each organization’s major programme components. Especially significant, here, was each organization’s bi-focal (exclusive and inclusive) curriculum and pedagogy, its missionary zeal, and its focus on the acquisition of intellectual and aesthetic knowledge and values, rather than of skills.

For many associations, a major objective was to express or extend outwards, beyond their registered members, some of the knowledge, interests, and values of these associations. Missionary zeal, a key component of “mutual enlightenment,” complemented the pedagogy and curriculum organized by the members for their own personal edification. It appeared to serve as the completion of an association’s and its members’ educational goals. To educate oneself publicly and mutually entailed a sharing of such learning with those more ignorant than oneself. Further, it entailed a mission to arouse, on the part of these less educated individuals, a desire for more, and especially “useful,” knowledge. Thus, the Art, Historical and Scientific Association and the Vancouver Women’s Musical Club produced separate educational programmes aimed (a) inwards, for the registered members, and (b) outwards, towards the general population.

The bi-focal pedagogy and curricula were critical to these organizations’ purpose. Inwardly, their educational objectives were to confirm, discover, and enrich the knowledge, and above all, the values of their member constituencies. The members, as we shall see in the next chapter, consisted of and represented Vancouver’s intellectual and cultural elite. Outwardly, their objective, put bluntly, was to seduce. To the masses, they hoped to extend, and in a small way inculcate, the middle-class ideals of “self-help” and “self-improvement.” In short, they hoped to “civilize” them, or at least merely to divert their minds from “sensual gratification” (drink and irresponsible sex), and from their unsatisfactory living and working conditions. For themselves and their social equals, the members sought intellectual and aesthetic “cultivation.” Some were very serious—they were scholars and artists. Others, on the other hand, were only seriously interested in acquiring something of the cultural elegance, the patina, of their aristocratic heroes.

These themes, then, and our analyses of “mutual enlightenment,” and its variations in form, are presented through three case studies.

First, the Art, Historical and Scientific Association organized programmes of
cultivation for the city’s more sophisticated set. Their teaching methods included lectures, discussion, and conversazioni. Organized mostly for their own members, and clearly “mutual”—common interest, shared support—these programmes emphasized a social class basis and bias in “mutual enlightenment.” Their programmes also conveyed the kinds of instructive and entertaining knowledge valued by the participants.

The second case describes the Art, Historical and Scientific Association’s Cook-Vancouver Museum and Art Gallery. We want particularly to explain the rationale and purpose for the Association having provided a separate, distinct, and public programme of education and amusement. The museum and art gallery allows us to see how the Association aimed to extend enlightenment beyond its own membership constituency into the general community. “Mutual enlightenment,” for the public, was conceived by the Association, in a looser, less structured, more spontaneous, and broader sense of “self-help.”

The third case describes the Women’s Musical Club’s programmes of musical cultivation for the city’s economic and cultural elite and, separately, for aspiring, talented female musicians and singers, and for the “underprivileged.” In particular, the Musical Club learned about classical music through classes and lectures and learned music appreciation through concerts and other musical performances. Externally, the Musical Club extended its programme through its choral groups and orchestras, music examinations, and public and charity concerts. The Musical Club provides substantiation and comparison with the findings of the first two case studies. This Club, unlike the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, had no egalitarian and democratic pretensions. Nor did it have any controversies over the inclusion of “the masses” as full and equal members. Class distinction, for them, was important.

These contrasting educational practices thus provide the central and peripheral uses of the concept “mutual enlightenment,” and of “mutuality.” They provide us with the meaning, in practice, of mutual enlightenment to its participants. They detail how mutual enlightenment expressed a missionary zeal, and how this zeal was embodied in the associations’ bi-focal programmes. Finally, they help us to discover what knowledge was most desirable; and why, what, and how much knowledge could usefully, yet safely, be passed from the city’s intellectual elite (as a “clerisy”) to the mass public, and to what ends.
3.2. MUTUAL ENLIGHTENMENT: HISTORICAL BACKGROUND

Vancouver’s scientific and cultural associations, were hardly isolated occurrences. They drew well upon most relevant and popular ideas, ideologies, fashions, and social and educational movements. Like so many others throughout late nineteenth-, early twentieth-century Europe and America, they were the expression of class-based ideals. These ideals included “aesthetics,” rational and scientific enquiry, and “self-help” and “self-improvement.” The connection of these local associations to wider intellectual, cultural, and educational worlds serves as the final major chapter theme.

From as early as the late eighteenth and especially the early nineteenth centuries, a myriad of middle-class scientific and cultural clubs and societies were formed. Most notable were the innumerable English literary and philosophical societies. Often born out of informal mutual improvement groups, meeting regularly at members’ homes, they later re-organized into formal organizations, with elected leaders and formal organizational and pedagogical procedures. Their interests were catholic, and covered a wide range of subjects. These included medicine, English literature, modern languages, history, geography, economics, mathematics, and, especially, experimental science.

Similarly, more specialized organizations also formed at the same time: musical, dramatic, historical, antiquarian, natural historical, geological and assorted mutual enlightenment societies and clubs. Some remained primarily mutual enlightenment societies. Others, however, modelled themselves after such organizations as the Royal Institution in London (formed 1799). As well as providing scientific improvement for its own members, the Royal Institution also sought public influence. It attempted a residential technical education for young artisans (1801). This attempt was abandoned out of fear, however, because the industrial middle-classes were beginning to associate science for the working classes with “scepticism, radicalism, and the French Revolution.”

These organizations all drew their inspiration from and were modelled after similar seventeenth- and eighteenth-century aristocratic scientific, literary, and cultural societies and institutions. The most significant was the scientific Royal Society (founded 1660). Serious, scholarly societies, like the Royal Society, nonetheless, were still somewhat the

exception. Conviviality and joviality were as much a part of the aim, and the educational process, of most aristocratic societies, as were the book and specimen collections, the lectures, papers, and debates, and the scientific apparatus. Early versions, and especially the aristocratic societies, when not meeting in homes, had congregated at public and coffee houses. Some even took an early and invaluable start in what has been termed the “Museum Movement.”

As one historian of adult education, Thomas Kelly, has commented:

This was pre-eminently the age of the virtuosi—the cultured gentleman with a catholic interest in science, antiquities, and the arts. Sometimes this interest was of a rather dilettante kind, but there were many wealthy individuals who devoted time and money to the building up of extensive and often carefully classified collections of natural history, antiquities, curiosities, from abroad, and other objects of interest....The greatest virtuoso of them all, of course, was Sir Hans Sloane, President of the College of Physicians and of the Royal Society, whose long career as a collector extended to the middle of the eighteenth century, and whose vast accumulations of material eventually formed the starting point of the British Museum [founded 1753].

Specimen collecting for museums, such as that by Sloane, became an increasingly popular, and wide-ranging avocation. Many were small, private, and often eccentric “cabinets of curiosity” or “closets of rarities.” Others, however, were large, educational and wonder-inspiring public museums. Important examples include the British Museum at London, the Ashmolean (founded 1683) at Oxford, and the Smithsonian (founded 1846) at Washington, D.C. Between these two extremes, and exhibiting characteristics of both private and public museums, there developed a whole range of museum collections assembled by historical and scientific research societies. In Britain, the most notable was the Royal Society’s research collection. In the United States, there were early notable collections assembled by the New York Academy of Natural Sciences (founded 1815) and the Academy of Natural Sciences in Philadelphia (founded 1812). Both countries, and Canada, also had many local variations of these societies. The American museum idea, in particular, borrowed from European concerns with “scholarship and research...[However,] when transplanted...[it] took on the coloration of its new environment and became concerned


Kelly, Adult Education in Great Britain, pp. 58-59. Kelly noted that there actually existed a “Society of Virtuosi,” founded in 1689 and lasting until at least 1732.
primarily with the diffusion of knowledge."6

Almost concurrent with the development of these many scientific and cultural societies, the middle classes supported the organization of educational institutions to teach the working classes. They feared the new revolutionary ideas and the prospect of a working-class revolt. Most notable here were the mechanics’ institutes—an idea and educational form that caught the imagination of social reformers throughout the English speaking world—and the Society for the Diffusion of Useful Knowledge (S.D.U.K.). Lord Henry Brougham founded the S.D.U.K. in 1826, and was a “guiding spirit” of the burgeoning mechanics’ institute movement. A follower of Jeremy Bentham’s and John Stuart Mill’s Utilitarian and radical-liberal ideas, Brougham was a foremost advocate of good quality adult education for the working classes. He and his sympathizers recognized that the working classes were educationally handicapped by their lack of time and money. They therefore established their organizations to provide workers with both cheap and available reading materials and a public lecture system. The S.D.U.K. published and disseminated the educational books and pamphlets. The mechanics’ institutes served to organize the desired educational clientele—artisans and other workers, amateur scientists, and later the middle classes—through the lectures, museums, and reading rooms.7


Vancouver even had its own Hasting Mill Mechanics' Institute. It was founded in 1869 by the mill's manager, J. A. Raymur. The Institute provided books, and eventually lectures, to the lumber-milling community until its closure, in 1886. In neighbouring communities, there were also New Westminster's British Columbia Institute (1865-1893—later the Mechanics' Literary Institute) and the Moodyville Mechanics' Institute (1868-c.1901), on the north shore of Burrard Inlet.  

The mechanics' institutes, in particular, were formed originally to diffuse scientific and other "useful knowledge"—*laissez-faire* political economics, for example—to working-class mechanics and artisans. However, aside from the strictly "educational" content of their programme, the institutes also provided opportunities of social intercourse for the workers. The hope was that they would interact, in a "civilized" and dignified manner, with their social superiors. Through the institutes, the middle-class promoters sought to inculcate, into these workers, a new and safer middle-class ideology. They hoped to lead them into adopting and assimilating desired middle-class values, and social and moral (though not necessarily economic or political) attitudes, habits, tastes, and behaviours.  

Note, however, this "education" was not a strictly "downwards" affair. Workers used the institutes actively and consciously to acquire the literacy needed for their own interests and for the educational and political pursuits of their social class. Many also sought to acquire many of the valued characteristics of middle-class culture. They were far from being supplicants. For example, they created their own informal and formal mutual improvement societies to increase literacy skills; or to study and to exercise their scientific, artistic, or musical interests. These latter societies clearly resembled the scientific and cultural clubs and societies of the middle and aristocratic classes. More significantly, they

---

also used mutual improvement to learn and to debate politics and economics, and to learn vital communication and organizational skills. These mutual improvement societies even regularly used the resources (e.g., libraries, useful lectures, classes) and facilities of the middle-class’s mechanics’ institutes. The mutual improvement society, according to J. F. C. Harrison, “was the most truly indigenous of all the early attempts at working-class adult education.”

The middle-class passion to organize scientific and cultural institutions was part of a century-long campaign to firmly establish itself—economically, politically, and culturally. This was especially true of the middle-classes’ religious non-Conformist and political whig and radical elements. Further, the middle classes wanted to fit the working classes to their own value image. Above all, the middle classes valued (even if they did not always strictly adhere to) industry, thrift, punctuality, innocent and rational recreation, temperance, and reasonable temper, and “prudent” marriages (waiting until couples were financially solvent). They also valued the sophistication and social graces, and the supreme respectability, which marked their social superiors, and especially the aristocratic class.

The various classes, and especially the middle classes, throughout the nineteenth century, and into the twentieth, continued to form and actively participate in scientific and cultural societies. The earlier concept of the literary and philosophical society never died out, even if their titles and personnel changed. In fact, the descendents of these amateur, middle-class institutions flourished after the mid nineteenth-century. A particularly notable, and fashionable, example could be found in fin de siècle Paris—the salon.

The salon, a “peculiarly Parisian institution” of the 1890s and 1900s, lionized the literary, artistically, and scientifically accomplished and cultivated. Paris, at that time, was renowned as a bastion of philistinism, conservatism, and public indifference. The salon, therefore, protected, even coddled, and yet encouraged and gave personal applause and status to “the painter, the scientist, the philosopher, the politician, the novelist and the musician.” Salons were led by women of the new Napoleonic aristocracy—sympathetic, cultured, and with the financial means to support such an institution. These women would

---

10Harrison, Learning and Living, p. 53. See also, ibid., pp. 42-55; Harrison, Early Victorian Britain pp. 166-68; Keane, “Methodology for Adult Learners,” pp. 55-56; and Vincent, Bread, Knowledge and Freedom, pp. 141-42.

gather together cultural and intellectual celebrities, in often elegant surroundings, to converse and to entertain each other—to engage in intelligent, rational, and tasteful social intercourse.\textsuperscript{12}

Historian Theodore Zeldin (with a quote from philosopher Emile Boutroux, in 1912) described the \textit{salon} and its purpose, this way:

[T]he French believed that man needed to be perfected by culture....Art was needed to impose rules and discipline on man, but art by itself was not enough, because it could too easily take itself as its own end and so become artificial. Perfect culture came from the union of art and nature, of mind and heart. But this again was not an aim in itself. The French had an ideal of man with certain qualities which could only be developed in social intercourse, 'that habitual meeting of a certain number of chosen people, where each one tries to think and speak in a manner that will win the approbation of all...to surpass himself in order to be heard, and where distinction, delicacy, ingeniousness, fine judgement and wit are imposed'. It is in surroundings of this kind that the French had created the ideal man. They had expected from him first of all reason, which could apply all the faculties as well as intelligence; secondly, the cult of 'simple and natural sentiments', notably love of the family and of humanity, so that he naturally sided with the weak; thirdly, generosity, devotion to disinterested ends, glory, the honour of France and the good of humanity.\textsuperscript{13}

Comparative reference to the \textit{salon}, especially when considering the curricular disposition of the Art, Historical and Scientific Association and the Women’s Musical Club, is not as far-fetched as might first appear. The similarity between Coleridge’s concept of “clerisy” and Arnold’s “culture” and man’s “perfection” is striking, indeed. Obviously, these ideas and methods were shared throughout the Western cultures. Note, for example, the Bloomsbury circle of writers, artists, and intellectuals of early to almost mid twentieth-century London; the cultured womens’ clubs of late nineteenth-century America;\textsuperscript{14} and the pervasive high society “conversazione,” of which the Art, Historical and Scientific Association had many. Conversazioni were evenings of music, poetry, drama, and humour. Supposedly centering upon intelligent and dignified social intercourse, they drew together celebrities and other important local people, often to mark some local event.

As we shall see, both organizations regularly brought in the most distinguished persons available to edify and to entertain their members and invited guests. The Art, Historical and Scientific Association, in particular, was the organizational home, the "club," so to speak, of many of Vancouver's leading lights. One member and his wife, a noted poet, were themselves well-known as cultural leaders. Their home was noted as "a rendezvous for writers and literateurs from all over the Dominion."15

In passing, and paradoxically, this Parisian phenomenon of mutual enlightenment for the intellectual, artistic, and aristocratic set, the salon, began during the same period to disappear. Its spirit was returning to the cafés, its most important home during the sixteenth- and seventeenth-centuries. The salon eventually declined, according to Roger Shattuck, "for lack of ladies trained to conduct one and through disappearance of the basic attitude of hommage on which the institution rested...."16

3.3. THE ART, HISTORICAL AND SCIENTIFIC ASSOCIATION:
A BI-FOCAL PEDAGOGY AND CURRICULUM

Just how these ideas and this mission would be effected is evident in the official aims of the Art, Historical and Scientific Association. These aims imply the lengths to which such an educational and cultural society was prepared to go in order to enlighten the whole surrounding society.

Inspired by these scientific and cultural societies and by the public museum and art gallery movement of the mid and late nineteenth century, the Association thus officially aimed:

To form a collection of paintings and works of art as a nucleus of an Art Gallery;

To hold from time to time a Loan Exhibition of paintings and works of art;

To form a Museum of Antiquities, especially of the remains of Indian life in British Columbia and America;

15 This quotation refers to Association member, Willie Dalton. VCA, M2312, Dalton, Willie (newspaper clipping, 20 November 1946).
To form and preserve a Collection of Specimens of the ores and natural products of British Columbia and of Canada generally;

To establish a library of books, pamphlets and periodicals, bearing on the subjects of Art, Science, Mineralogy, etc., and on the Early History of Canada and America, and generally to cultivate, by all means in its power, the study of these subjects.\textsuperscript{17}

The Art, Historical and Scientific Association’s aims reveal intimate knowledge of and perhaps even experience in the traditions, heritage, and varied purposes of scientific, historical, antiquarian, and art societies, and of museums. They imply that the Association organizers had some consistent notion or philosophy of how to best educate their members and to reach their desired public clientele. They understood what a good museum and art gallery should have and what it could do. They understood the importance and role of a good museum and art gallery for the Association’s educational programme and for its public recognition and status within Vancouver and internationally. And, they also aimed for competent, complementary, and representative personnel to solicit, plan, and exhibit the materials in an attractive, and educationally stimulating, manner. Who these educators were, and what and how they taught, will provide significant pieces of evidence to clarify the nature of the Association’s mission and of the values and motives of its members. Complete analyses of Association members’ social standing, however, will be found in the next chapter. There we will assess how their status affected their deeper social, economic, and political reasons for practising mutual enlightenment.

3.3.1. For Members Mostly:
Class and Cultivation Through Lecture and Conversazione

Success for the new Art, Historical and Scientific Association, founded April 17, 1894, came quickly. By January 1895, the Association had taken charge of Vancouver’s intellectual and cultural life. It was singularly the brightest light on the city’s cultural scene. The President, Reverend L. Norman Tucker, was able to boast at the first annual meeting that:

The Association has been an active and educating influence in the community. It has not only begun to collect treasures of art and remains of Indian life, and

\textsuperscript{17} Constitution (Vancouver: Art, Historical and Scientific Association of Vancouver, 1894), in Vancouver Art, Historical and Scientific Association, vol. 1, file 1, Add. Mss. 336, VCA.
stamps and specimens of various kinds, but it has also begun to focus and to stimulate the artistic and intellectual life of our people. It has provided musical entertainments of a superior order, and has had the honor of introducing to the public some of the best musical talent of the City. It has discussed with surprising vigor and intelligence, some very important questions, notably the ancient life of our Province, and by its loan exhibition it has revealed to many the treasures of art that already exist in our midst, and what is better still, it has disclosed on the part of many, a taste for artistic and literary studies that only needs cultivation to produce the most gratifying results.\(^{18}\)

The intended purpose and use of the Museum and Art Gallery, as stated in the Association’s official aims, was fairly straightforward, especially for the desire to build up a respectable collection for public display. Its intended clientele were to be the “great masses of the people.”\(^{19}\)

The aims, however, were much less clear about the goals and objectives for the paid membership. A programme, directed primarily for the benefit of the members, however, was implied by the verb “to cultivate,” stated in the last of the official aims. Cultivation meant teaching and learning through the popular educational methods of the day: lectures, conversaziones (social evenings of literature, music, and social intercourse), excursions, classes, reading, and, of course, attending the museum and gallery and any exhibitions.

The first two, lectures and conversaziones, were particularly popular methods of extending the Association’s aims inwards, towards the registered membership.\(^{20}\) Unlike the Museum and Art Gallery, however, the intended clientele for lectures and conversaziones were the more formally educated and more socially prominent classes within the city. Also, unlike the case of the Museum, whereby visitors would remain just that—visitors—the lectures and conversaziones were intended to attract people to the advantages of Association membership. They would bring into mutual contact both regular members and the interested public, any of whom could join the Art, Historical and Scientific Association for a nominal one dollar and appropriate member sponsorship. Together they could partake of

---

\(^{18}\)Minutes (newspaper clipping), 8 January 1895, Vancouver Art, Historical and Scientific Association, Add. Mss. 336, VCA.


\(^{20}\)Though “inwards,” in the strict sense, refers to a registered membership, the functions described as lectures and conversaziones served as recruiting tools as well as the Association’s regular programme for members. That is, the types of people attracted to the Association’s programmes were the ones which the Association wished to have as permanent members. Thus for purposes of pedagogy and curriculum, actual and prospective members will be treated as one.
engaging and colourful lectures (often accompanied with lantern slides), delivered by distinguished local and visiting “scholars,” and followed by occasionally lively discussion. Or, they could be entertained at conversaziones and “promenade concerts.” The latter would be attended by upwards of “150 ladies and gentlemen,” who would absorb the refined and tasteful performances of some of Vancouver’s better musicians, singers, and orators. They would top off their evening with “general and genial conversation, a feature of the discussion [often] being a generous supply of cake, lemonade and ice cream.”

For these more “sophisticated” citizens, the Association provided a broad and varied programme of lectures and entertainments. The topical array covered the full range of arts, letters, and sciences, and included musical concerts, some art classes, an excursion to Pitt Lake, and some “At Homes.” Its quality was high, almost scholarly. The early lectures, mostly in the Association’s first year, were also accompanied by an entertainment programme of light classical music by local singers and musicians. Most lectures throughout the 1884-1916 period, according to newspaper accounts, ended with some general discussion from the audience. The lecturers themselves were mostly local authorities, and often Association members, especially Association presidents. Most were highly educated, being professional men for the most part. Many held university graduate degrees.

The music at conversaziones, like that at lectures, was of a popular classical variety. Moreover, the literary recitations and “humourous sketch[es]” were such that could be executed with dignity and taste. For example, as one newspaper reported the conversazione which ended the gala 1894 Art Exhibition:

The concert was an instrumental one and was a very pleasing diversion. The platform had been most tastefully arranged for the occasion with shrubs and plants, and presented a very pleasing floral effect. There was an exceedingly nice audience present and one that thoroughly enjoyed the various renditions, bestowing liberal applause and encores. The orchestra was composed of the following: Prof. Martens, piano; Victor Austin and George Dyke, violin; F. Dyke, cello and double bass; J. W. Trendell, clarionette; F. Sordet, flute; C. Rennie, cornet. Such an aggregation of musicians it would be difficult for any other city in the Dominion to equal, let alone to excel. Every number was executed with much acceptance to the audience, which was an appreciative, as

21 Art, Historical and Scientific Association Minutes, 14 August 1894 (newspaper clipping).
well as a critical one.  

The contrast is striking between the Association’s purposes for and understanding of its Museum, and its accounts of the lectures and conversazioni, as reported in the Association’s minutes and local press. In a word, the contrast can be summed up as one of tone. This tonal difference is significant, not only because it existed, but also because it was advertised. To anyone of less than “superior” class, or its aspirants, the newspaper coverage of Association conversazioni or lectures (with and without musical accompaniment) must surely have seemed daunting. However, for the devotees and aspirants, here truly was the essence and soul of the Art, Historical and Scientific Association. Here, for the Association’s promoters, was the true meaning of “cultivation.” By “improving” themselves at such an elegant affair, the participants were undoubtedly learning the “art” of urbane sophistication as much as the “Art of Florence.” Also, they were setting themselves well apart from the rabble whom they had to mix daily with on Vancouver’s streets.

The difference here, however, was more than tonal. It had to do with policy. Although the promoters had to overcome internal resistance to locating the Museum on the East End edge of downtown Vancouver, their purpose was clearly to attract working- and middle-class residents, of both British and non-British ethnic origin. The Museum was so important to this purpose that the Directors had even considered opening it in the evenings and on Sundays, to be more convenient to working people. However, when confronted with the extra cost, the Directors appear to have taken no further action.

Notwithstanding Reverend Tucker’s admonition that the Association should devote its energies to uplift the city’s working people through “literature, science and art,” the Association rejected extending the members’ lecture programme to these people. Suggestions to hold public lectures in the East End, again for working people, appear to have suffered the same fate as the proposal to extend museum hours. Even when a Mr. Gibbs offered to rent the rooms himself for this purpose, in the Seaman’s Institute or

---

23 Art, Historical and Scientific Association Minutes, 7 November 1894 (newspaper clipping).
24 Art, Historical and Scientific Association Minutes, 24 January 1907, 28 January 1913.
25 Art, Historical and Scientific Association Minutes, 8 January 1895 (newspaper clipping).
26 Art, Historical and Scientific Association Minutes, 28 May 1908; 28 January 1913.
Central Mission, the Directors agreed only to "consider" the matter. The 1914 and 1915 Annual Reports and Minutes do not mention any further action. Perhaps the Directors wished to maintain strict control over just what knowledge was to be imparted to whom. That is, the Museum was quite appropriate for working people and their families, and for Orientals, while the lectures and conversazioni were aimed at the more truly "sophisticated" citizens of the city. Knowledge and learning could be "controlled," and "mixing" of social unequals could be avoided. This inference, however, is still tentative; more evidence is needed.

Beside the superior and "classy" tone of this member-oriented programme, two other issues arise. We need to know (1) how closely the curriculum matched the ideals set out by the three previously discussed speakers, especially those of Gertrude Mellon and Reverend Tucker, and (2) what the curriculum was and how it might be explained. The programme of lectures from 1894 to 1916 provides answers.

The translation of ideals into programme practice was limited at best. The Association, however, did try. Unsatisfied members, unfortunately, had decided to go elsewhere for their education or amusement. A fickle membership and mounting expenses quickly forced the Association to retrench and to focus more directly on those two groups—the "sophisticates" and the "great masses." Its membership had plummeted from a 1895 high of over 200 to a hard core of 43 in 1897. This nucleus, though, maintained and nursed the Association and Museum through its darkest years at the turn of the century. It rebuilt the Association to a new high of 130 members in 1912, and it added a new strictly members-only programme of lectures and discussions. This new programme complemented the continuing "public lectures" and the increasing popularity of the now City-owned, but Association-managed (since 1905), public museum.

In the Association's various programmes, however, there was to be no bridge between intellectual and skills education. Scientific, technological, and artistic skills to stimulate economic activity were hardly encouraged. Likewise, there was almost no stimulation and nourishment of artistic practice and creativity. Both the economic and creative goals were briefly attempted: the former through geologist G. F. Monckton's late

\(^{27}\) Art, Historical and Scientific Association Minutes, 27 November 1913.
\(^{28}\) Art, Historical and Scientific Association Minutes, 8 January 1895 (newspaper clipping).
1895 lecture series on mining; the latter through a brief arrangement in 1898 whereby the Association rented their rooms and sponsored classes in drawing and painting. Except for the Vancouver Photographic Society which joined the Association in 1905, there were no further attempts along this line. Even the art gallery component of the Museum withered and remained stunted. In response, architect and veteran Association promoter, R. Mackay Fripp, remarked rather caustically: "this is the west, and that there has not been sufficient time to evolve a standard in matters of taste. There are no old established interests, no cultivated leisure class....Every man is fully occupied in making a way for himself...." Thus most of the "people" had to be satisfied with the Museum only, or they joined one or more of the newer, but more specialized, organizations. These new organizations, like the Arts and Crafts Association and the B.C. Mountaineering Club, sprang up to bridge the gap between the social classes and between the theoretical aspects of their curriculum and the actual practice or learning of artistic or scientific skills.

The Association's rejection of a utilitarian, and practical, skill-developing, member programme forces alternative explanations to account for the programme's content and methods. The pedagogical method was essentially didactic, detached, and even dilettantish—unlike that of some of the Association's "progeny," the Arts and Crafts Association and the Naturalist Field Club. These latter two organizations emphasized a practical, in combination with a theoretical, education. Art, Historical and Scientific Association members and interested public instead mostly attended the reading of papers (or a good oration). This they did in the Association's rooms or, when the topic was sufficiently popular, in a hall or school, and usually on a weeknight. Newspaper reports usually described the event as "instructive" and "interesting," and the audience as "appreciative." Occasionally, there appears to have been some engaging (though never

29 Selman, "Adult Education in B.C.,” pp. 138, 163; Mellon, “History Art and Science.” Monckton went on to form his own School of Mines in Vancouver shortly after the lectures though he also remained an active Association member.

30 Art, Historical and Scientific Association Minutes, 5 April 1898.

31 Art, Historical and Scientific Association Minutes, 26 March 1903; 26 January, 23 February, 26 April, 25 May, 1905. The Art, Historical and Scientific Association absorbed both the members and the collection of the Vancouver Photographic Society, providing the former society members with "space for scientific purposes" in the basement. A similar accommodation with the Entomological Society unfortunately fell through. See Art, Historical and Scientific Association Minutes, 28 April, 1904, 26 January 1905.

described as heated) discussion from the more learned members of the audience. Most notable were Professor Charles Hill-Tout, a noted anthropologist and Principal of Buckland College, and Captain H. A. Mellon, a retired sea captain and husband of Association founder, Gertrude Mellon.

The content was usually fairly erudite and concerned some local authority's interpretation of recent research or scholarship. Topically, and as the Association's name suggests, the lecture programme covered the fine and applied arts (17 lectures), history (35 lectures), and the newly emerging branches of natural and physical science (28 lectures). Equally prominent were topics in literature (22 lectures), archaeology and anthropology (27 lectures), and world and exotic travel and geography (18 lectures), among others (4 lectures). As well, the Association offered occasional lecture series and a weekly study group in poetry (1898). Included in these series were eight lectures on English literature (1895), six on mining (1895-6), four on religions of the world (1900), and a series each on geology (1906) and on British Columbia history (1908). The programme content for any one year would, in turn, direct the participants along several seemingly unconnected paths. In 1909, for example, eight lectures were given: “Early Bibliography of N.W. Coast,” by E. O. S. Scholefield (Provincial Librarian); “Story of Royal Engineers,” by Judge Howay; “Huxley’s Life Work,” by Professor Porter; “Ancient Cities of Euphrates Valley,” by Reverend A. E. Hetherington; “Moral Significance of the Fine Arts,” by R. H. Weldon; “History of Water-color Painting,” by R. Mackay Fripp; “Trip Through West Africa,” by S. F. G. White; and “Wireless Telegraphy,” by J. G. Lister.

Clearly, the topics list was wide-ranging, though at the same time, it narrowly focussed on generally abstract matters. Few of the topics had any particular relevance to members’ occupational or economic needs, excepting in some cases, of course, the speaker at

---

33 This programme, as outlined, extended from 1894 to 1916 and includes all public, Vancouver Institute (1916), and members only (1912-1915) lectures except occasional lecture series. See AHSA, Journal, pp. 9-14, for a complete list of lecture topics and lecturers. Note that this list is at best an approximation. There were other lectures given but not mentioned in the Journal as well as several lecture series, also not mentioned. Also some lecture titles in the Journal differ from those in the Association’s minutes and in annual reports.

34 Selman, “Adult Education in B.C.,” p. 138; News-Advertiser, 6 January 1895, 16 January 1895, 30 January 1895, 23 February 1895, 7 March 1895, 20 March 1898, 17 March 1906, 22 March 1908, 25 March 1908, 19 April 1908. The English Literature and B.C. history lectures were deemed to be of sufficient importance that newspaper accounts provided almost complete transcripts of most of the lectures in the series of those years.

hand. The topics were mostly one-time affairs. Little opportunity was given for the audience to fully develop any understanding of the subject. The Association, however, did try to develop classes and series. Unfortunately, interest on the part of the members was never strong enough to sustain such activity over the long term, and especially after 1900.

The topics rarely, if ever, dealt with social, political, economic, military, moral, or religious issues, especially whenever they concerned local situations or problems. For instance, there were no papers on the growth of socialism, the state of industrial capitalism, the wretched conditions of the poor (or the Chinese, in Vancouver), the growing military might of Japan, or even the impact of the geological, biological, and archaeological sciences on religious thinking. Each was a major local and international concern. This lack of interest in some of the most important subjects of the day might even have been more surprising considering most lecturers' occupations.

Almost forty per cent of the lectures, for example, were given by local clergy (and most of these appear to be Anglicans or Presbyterians). Clergymen, however, had for several decades now in Britain provided much of the leadership, and even financial support, for adult education schemes. This was especially true in village (formerly mechanics') institutes and similar church institutes. Awakened to the pitiable social and physical conditions in which many people were living, these socially conscious Broad Church (as opposed to the hierarchical and liturgical Anglican High Church) representatives increasingly included adult education as part of their pastoral work. Their motivation was religious and social, and sometimes spiritual and even political. Education, they had believed, through its rational and refining characteristics, could be a means to "reclaim" to the Church and to Christianity many of the "lost" multitude. And, of course, such work could also help them carry out Christ's social mission to the poor, a responsibility for which the Anglican Church (the "Tory Church") had long been accused of neglecting.36

The remainder of the lectures were given by local artists, scientists, teachers, lawyers, engineers, retired military officers, amateur historians, and other professionals.37 These gentlemen, like the clergymen, were well educated. They participated through reading papers, giving lectures, and leading discussions—not through conducting practical lessons—as well as through simply being available for stimulating

---

36Harrison, Living and Learning, pp. 179-81, 201.
social intercourse. Their presence testifies more to their status as educated and cultured gentlemen, as late nineteenth-, early twentieth-century virtuosi, than to their merely being teachers to Vancouver’s class of uncultured bourgeois, its philistines.

As for the rest of the Association’s membership, how do we explain this programme? One lecturer, R. B. Hill, in explaining the “pursuit of science,” has offered us a clue. He stressed that science is “elevating....[T]hose who follow a noble science are likely to become noble.” Here, surely, is substantiation that at least some participants wished to acquire “taste,” “tone,” and “sophistication.” The members were not of noble (though some could claim gentle) birth. Perhaps they were hoping to acquire or confirm themselves into the new status of the culturally noble. Certainly, through educating themselves in a relatively global smattering of the “higher” subjects, they might acquire that cultured mind—or at least the patina—so strongly sought by some fin de siecle Parisians, or that perfection as advocated by Matthew Arnold. As in the famous Parisian salons, the Art, Historical and Scientific Association could applaud and support (through publication and museum and art gallery display) its local scientific, literary, and artistic celebrities. These celebrities also had a place and position where they could be recognized for their special talent, avocation, or even non-entrepreneurial vocation.

Enlightenment, thus, likely brought widened vistas, new insights and appreciations, and a better understanding of the natural and social worlds and their development. The method was apparently rational and did not indoctrinate. Propositions were based on and supported by available evidence and the post lecture discussions involved evidenced and reasoned arguments to contest or to support the lecturers’ arguments. As with similar contemporary and antecedent associations, conviviality and social intercourse were a marked characteristic. Education, and socialization, here, were fun. They also likely reinforced members’ beliefs that they were cultivated, liberal persons, and that their position in Vancouver required a shared commonality with other like-minded individuals. Though skills, as in art, music, science, or history, were not directly taught, many members found a sympathy and an empathy within the Association from which they were in a better position to practise their skills. Enlightenment, as sought and experienced by the programme participants, therefore, effectively depended upon the mutual exchange and

38 Art, Historical and Scientific Association Minutes, 14 November 1895, p. 24 (newspaper clipping).
sharing of ideas, sympathy, life experiences, and values.

Mutuality was expressed in two ways. First, self-selected participants characteristically shared personal values and beliefs. They wanted to recreate a gentility and sophistication that they believed marked the lives of European aristocrats and gentry. Like many of the new middle classes, Art, Historical and Scientific Association members absorbed, debated, and shared in the popular ethos that self-improvement and self-cultivation could increase their respectability. Further, along with their acquisition of property, self-cultivation should provide them with the revered status of gentleman or gentlewoman. The “notion of a gentleman,” according to historian Robin Gilmour, and the debate about its status value, was a major obsession of Victorian society and literature.\(^{39}\) This first dimension, which incidently underlies the members’ probable self-perception as a clerisy, will be further explored in the next chapter.

Second, mutuality describes how educational roles and activities were distributed amongst the membership. Participants not only passively listened to the lecturers, they engaged in sometimes lively post-lecture discussion. They took tea together, engaged in social intercourse, planned and selected the topics and the meetings, discussed the nature of their museum and art collection, and invited the speakers, or volunteered themselves. Their system was essentially co-operative, democratic, and egalitarian—but with some significant restrictions.

First, as discussed, Association membership effectively limited itself through its curricular emphasis on lectures and on abstract, erudite topics, and by its West End meeting locations. Thus it served, primarily, a bourgeois West End crowd. Second, as museum and art gallery developers, in combination with their lecture and conversazione programme, the Association developed a bureaucratic structure to manage the different functions of raising money, soliciting and evaluating collection donations, loans, and potential purchases, and programme planning. It thus had a division of labour, though the Board of Directors was elected democratically by the general membership. The Board and its committees were also very democratic, egalitarian, and co-operative in their internal organization, and in their management of these functions. Finally, although the Association was quite advanced in

electing both women and Japanese members to executive positions, the women did not lecture before the Association until 1914. Women, however, did perform musically at conversaziones. They were also responsible for the more traditional duties entailed by the Entertainment Committee. For example, as with the salon, women organized, hosted, and provided for teas and desserts at conversaziones and at informal members-only lectures.

Nevertheless, women and all other members freely participated in educational activities, though both appeared to defer to the well-educated men. Newspaper reports only named the educationally prominent, such as educators, intellectuals, or ministers, among their reports of post-lecture discussions. On the surface, then, it is safe to conclude that active participation at lectures and conversaziones was generally solicited and appears to have been freely taken. If nothing else, all participants likely desired, to some extent, an enjoyable, yet stimulating, night out amongst intellectually convivial company. Some, undoubtedly also wished to show off their intellectual or creative prowess. The Association provided a showcase for their non-economic achievements, talent, or knowledge. And for the women, the Association provided a relatively safe environment to demonstrate their own intellectual assertiveness. Here they could stand as equals amongst some of Vancouver's most intellectually sophisticated gentlemen.

Finally, and aside from these personal desires, the programmes suggest a more subtle political goal. This goal reflected Gertrude Mellon's promotion of nation-building as a high moral purpose of the Association. Professor Charles Hill-Tout, in a 1917 lecture, also reflected this purpose. Under the guise of outlining the meaning and value of the "Science of Anthropology" or the "Science of Man," Hill-Tout advanced the supremacy of the British way of life. He drew upon his own research on North-West Coast Indians to define anthropology's "value" from within the perspective of "intellectual and spiritual evolution." As he put it:

The practical man of business often wonders, I know, why men devote their time and energies to the study of savage and uncivilized peoples. This is one of the reasons, because they reveal to us the steps and stages by which the advanced races of the world have reached their present intellectual position and attainments, and because they show us the origins and meaning of many of our

40 The lecturer, in April 1914, was Mrs. M. McNaughton Manson; her topic was "Hawaii." No women lectured in 1915. See AHSA, Journal, p. 14.
own customs and beliefs.\textsuperscript{42}

Hill-Tout's point is valuable. He explained, in racialistic terms, the reasons and values behind research on "savage and uncivilized" cultures. Significantly, Hill-Tout also pointed to that aspect which underlay the seemingly disparate nature of the Art, Historical and Scientific Association members' lecture topics: the natural intellectual, material, and spiritual supremacy of European and especially British culture and civilization.

All the Association's lecture topics seem to point towards this assumption of supremacy: the great figures of English literature, the tremendous "progressive" advances of art, science and technology, and the sweep of history, culminating in the creation of the British Empire and now the colonizing of perhaps one of its most significant members—British Columbia and Canada. Even the many topics on antiquity—"Egyptology" (1907), "Roman Art" (1895), "Atlanta, the Submerged Continent," "Ancient Cities of Euphrates Valley" (1909), "Ruins of Desert Cathay" (1913), or "Classical Life in Japan" (1912), for example—point to other great empires or civilizations in the distant past. And, of course, British-Israélite topics such as "Anglo-Israelism" (1894), "The Ten Lost Tribes" (1907), and possibly "Great Pyramid—Egypt" (1912) would further substantiate the innate, God-given racial superiority of the British and north-western European races.

There was thus a wholeness, a world-view, a spirit, within the curriculum of the Art, Historical and Scientific Association. It reflected the very recent (and actually contemporary) colonization of the Pacific coast of Canada. Progress and colonization, for Association promoters, involved more than mere economic and resource exploitation, and immigration. Colonization and civilization also required the infusion of ideas—British ideas—to meld the new people in a new land into a cohesive, enlightened, British Empire building force. Truly, it was the \textit{Pax Britannica} brought to life.

3.3.2. Improving the Masses:
The Cook-Vancouver Museum and Art Gallery, 1894-14

The Art, Historical and Scientific Association, as just discussed, had evolved into something resembling a \textit{salon} or a club, at least for its members. The essence of mutual

\textsuperscript{42}Ibid., pp. 18-31.
exchange was of tone; the members learned and shared in an “enobling” educational experience. They practised in, and were endeavouring to solidify further, their civic position and role as a cultural and intellectual elite—a clerisy.

A “clerisy,” however, was intended to be classless, or at least to make an enlightened, classless society. Anyone could belong, so long as they embodied the humanitarian, cultivated characteristics identified with a clerisy, and so long as they used their abilities and their experiences for the benefit of all mankind. Reverend Tucker, for example, captured something of this spirit in his early statements of purpose for the Association. The Art, Historical and Scientific Association, he advised, should work to a common or shared enlightenment for the benefit of all or most of Vancouver’s residents.

A major component of the Association’s work, from the beginning, was to be its museum and art gallery. It was supposed to complement the Association’s programme of lectures and other activities. For some members, though not the majority, the lectures were also to be accessible to and attended by anyone, from any social or ethnic position. Of course, this did not happen. The museum and lecture programmes were quite effectively kept as slightly overlapping but separate educational entities. And “mutuality,” narrow and exclusive for the members’ own programmes, was experienced in a looser, less structured, more spontaneous, and broader sense of “self-help” by museum patrons.

Association members, however, did devote much time and resources to developing a museum. Why they did so, and what kind of knowledge they wished to impart needs to be explored. These questions take on extra meaning when, as will become apparent, the members who worked for this museum did so in the face of often frustrating and debilitating “adversaries”: a fickle membership, poor and insecure finances, lack of faith on the part of other organizations, and even of their own members, and disagreements over the museum’s location, and of the focus of the Association’s mission.

The mission, at least at the Association’s inception, was against the greedy and ugly side of materialism, and against philistinism and the class struggle, in general. It was towards an “enlightened” conception of a British civilization and culture. The very forces against which the members fought, however, almost defeated them. More significantly, however, the forces may have very well contributed to their effectively splitting the Association’s mission into its two major pedagogical and curricular components—the lecture
and conversazione programme for members, and the museum and art gallery for the general public. Therefore, we ask how the museum and art gallery contributed to mutual enlightenment; and how mutual enlightenment, through a museum, was practically expressed.

The Art, Historical and Scientific Association’s museum and art gallery (they were a single institution) developed as one of many that sprang up throughout Europe and America, especially after the mid nineteenth-century. These museums reflected a vast, popular, “Museum Movement” that began in eighteenth-century Continental Europe, particularly Italy. “Renaissance humanism, eighteenth-century Enlightenment and nineteenth-century democracy” all influenced the movement. By the early nineteenth century, the movement spread—first to France, and then to Britain and the United States.43

Museums emerged when curious and interested people—the powerful and some of the meek—sought to establish better, within the grand scheme of things, the position of mankind, in general, and of themselves, in particular. Collectors eagerly scoured local and distant lands for examples of flora, fauna, geological, archaeological, and cultural artifacts; and for artistic and historical treasures. They sought: (1) to satisfy simple curiosity and awe; (2) to research and especially to re-organize and reform knowledge; (3) to teach aesthetic and useful (e.g., technical) knowledge; and (4) to create through the museum building and its contents, the “enlightening impulse [of]...the museum...[as] a spiritually enobling place.”44

By the turn of the century, museums still copied the practices and values of the earlier literary and antiquarian societies’ and mechanics’ institutes’ museums. Late nineteenth-century museums “catered to the desire for self-improvement on the part of the

artisan and middle classes." They also reflected collectors' desires to provide some means of "innocent" and "rational" amusement, and spiritual uplift, to those same said people. At the same time, museum promoters wanted to further people's interest in Science and Art, and especially in industrial productive processes. As J. F. C. Harrison has stated, quoting *Family Friend* magazine: "Leisure was not to be wasted but used; 'One of the hours each day wasted on trifles or indolence, saved and daily devoted to improvement, is enough to make an ignorant man wise in ten years.'"

The Vancouver Public Museum began life in the dreams of the Art, Historical and Scientific Association's first members. Mrs. Gertrude Mellon, especially, had wished to erect a "Cook-Vancouver Museum and Art Gallery." The museum idea had been first put forward by Mrs. Mellon's English cousin, Dr. Hyde Clarke, a noted journalist and editor of *The Economist*, in an 1887 letter to the *Vancouver Daily News-Advertiser*. Clarke had envisioned the erection of a museum in Vancouver, to give the new city a history. Such a museum, said Clarke, should be resplendent with a historical reference library, Indian and other relics, and statues of Captains Cook and Vancouver. The erection of this "Cook-Vancouver Institution...worthy of Vancouver" became Mrs. Mellon's lifelong mission.

Discussion of, and lobbying and fund-raising for, the museum and art gallery pre-occupied the Association throughout the period 1892 to 1914, and especially between 1898 and 1913. In 1903, the Association succeeded in having the City of Vancouver assume responsibility for building and maintaining a public museum. In turn, the Association agreed to donate its collection though it retained responsibility for its management. The new public museum was completed in 1905, occupying the top floor of the newly completed Carnegie Library.

The city and the Museum grew fast, however, and life was not always satisfactory in a building shared with a growing library. Both facilities quickly became overcrowded. Tempers flared in exchanges between the Art, Historical and Scientific Association's

---

48 Art, Historical and Scientific Association Minutes, 9 January 1912.
Directors, the City Council, and the Library personnel and Board. Fights over scarce space and inadequate City funding were the norm.

Life, for the Association and its museum and art gallery, seemed an almost constant struggle against the forces of philistinism. Perhaps even more galling, the museum’s philistine foes included its supposed allies, City Council and the Public Library. On one occasion, Association President Judge Howay decried Council’s preoccupation with “busy commercialism,” to the detriment of education and culture. He “regret[ed]...that an Association with a Museum visited by thousands had so little sympathy and encouragement from the City.” In particular, Howay and other Association directors were especially galled by the City Council’s propensity to give large cash donations to sometimes dubious causes, most of which stressed the city’s strictly economic interests. For example, Council “blew” away $5000 for a “beastly arch” at the 1909 Seattle-Yukon Exposition and $15,000 to the Progress Club, a short-lived civic booster club, in 1913, while at the same time cutting back on its annual museum grants. Similarly, the Association had a rather mixed, and often mutually hostile relationship with the Carnegie Library staff. For example, the Association’s Museum Curator, H. J. deForest, complained: “I have taken care to always be very civil to those people [Mr. and Mrs. Machin, the librarians] but yesterday Mrs. Machin took occasion to speak very unpleasantly to me—’wished the Museum was on Deadman’s Island or somewhere else.’”

Sometimes the disagreement was even within its own membership. The Library and Museum were located at the corner of Main and Hastings Streets. They straddled the city’s main social territories, the East and West End. This location was well situated to serve much of the museum’s intended clientele—the working and lower-middle classes who traditionally have lived east and generally south of, or immediately around, the Main and Hastings intersection. Some Association members, as early as 1900, nevertheless apparently believed that the museum should serve the city’s middle classes rather than

---

Footnotes:
49 Art, Historical and Scientific Association Minutes, 11 January 1910.
50 In 1909, with new alderman and city personnel appearing ignorant of the intent and even the existence of the 1903 Agreement, the annual grant was again slashed back, from $1200 to $1000. See Art, Historical and Scientific Association Letterbook, deForest to Bro. Newmarch, 6 October 1909; Will Ferris, Secretary, to Judge Howay, 14 May 1913; and Ferris to Mrs. McLagan, 14 May 1913.
51 deForest to Dr. and Mrs. Grant, 5 March 1907, Letterbook, Vancouver Art, Historical and Scientific Association, Volume 18, file 36, Add. Mss. 336, VCA.
52 The location was selected in a city-wide referendum.
working people. Some Association Directors, in 1901, for instance, had expressed dislike of
the "absolute inconvenience" of its location. The museum was located at the east end of
the downtown core. This was far from the more affluent parts of the West End, and next
door to the Chinese and Japanese districts. Some had preferred a Stanley Park
location, closer to the West End, and home to many Association members.

These many disagreements and bad feelings clearly hurt the museum, and probably
the Association. Though located near their major clientele source, they were far from the
most actual and potential members and benefactors. The Association and its museum were
placed poorly to attract and maintain the substantial interests of time and money needed
from their educational and business constituencies, and from the business-sensitive City
Council.

The Association, for example, lost the chance to acquire some valuable exhibits. For
example, in consequence of the City's 1913 grant cut, the Association was unable to
purchase a valued exhibit from the Georgetown Museum, British Guiana, which the
Museum had wished to secure. The Association was further snubbed by the B.C.
Mountaineering Club. That Club had overlooked the Association's Vancouver Museum
when they donated a bird and plant life collection to museums in Ottawa and Victoria.
Wrote the Association's Secretary-Curator William Ferris to John Davidson, botanical
instructor with the Mountaineering Club: "Poor Vancouver gets nothing I suppose. The
Club whose headquarters are here I think might have patronized our work."

Ferris's bitterness over these losses, reflects, perhaps, the sense of anomie and
alienation, from especially eastern and central Canada, that has dogged Western Canadians
throughout their history. Ferris and other Association members believed that they were

53 Art, Historical and Scientific Association, vol. 2, Minutes, 8 August 1901.
54 Art, Historical and Scientific Association Minutes, 25 October 1900.
55 Art, Historical and Scientific Association Letterbook, Ferris to J. Rodway, The Museum,
Georgetown, Demerara, British Guiana, 20 August 1913.
56 Art, Historical and Scientific Association Letterbook, 19 August 1913.
57 See similar themes in, for example, David Jay Bercuson and Phillip Alfred Buckner, eds., Eastern
and Western Perspectives: Papers from the Joint Atlantic Canada/Western Canadian Studies
Conference (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1978); John E. Foster, ed., The Developing West:
Essays on Canadian History in Honor of Lewis H. Thomas (Edmonton: University of Alberta Press,
1983); R. Douglas Francis and Howard Palmer, eds., The Prairie West: Historical Readings
(Edmonton: Pica Pica Press, 1985); Gerald Friesen, The Canadian Prairies: A History (Toronto:
University of Toronto Press, 1984); and Larry Pratt and Garth Stevenson, Western Separatism: The
pushing forward the frontiers of civilization, here on the west coast of Canada. They, more than museums in Ottawa, or even Victoria, needed to build a viable and educative collection if ever they were to civilize Vancouver and to educate its "great masses." And, as only a "devoted few" seemed to possess the vision to advance society beyond the grip of frontier philistinism, the task seemed especially difficult.

Still, the Museum became quite popular with the public. In 1913, with the city's population now over one hundred thousand (100,411 in 1911), the Association recorded a substantial 41,350 Museum visits. Even the City Council took note. On January 28, 1913, they agreed to consider erecting a temporary museum on the old City Hall site on Powell Street. The economy collapsed shortly afterwards, however, in 1913. World War I followed. The Association's Museum remained in the Carnegie Library building and Mrs. Mellon's dream of a new museum had to remain dormant.

The central purpose of the Museum and Art Gallery, as throughout Europe and America, was to diffuse cultural and scientific knowledge among average working citizens. As stated in the draft (unpublished) preamble to the 1912 museum guide and catalogue, it was through the museum that:

culture, education and enlightenment of the people are stimulated.

It [a museum] is a necessity of every highly civilized community...to give recreation and happiness to great masses of the people...[T]hey remain to think and study and from such casual visits carry away a desire and intention to further investigate and receive educational benefits from.

Clearly, the Association had intended that their museum and art gallery should serve as a vehicle for public enlightenment. They apparently also understood that as such the Museum and Art Gallery should appeal directly to people's curiosity and imagination. Such appeal should preclude the more intense demands and satisfactions of education and improvement. Thus in order to draw their visitors away from the many competing attractions of a growing city, the Museum's curator and the Association's Directors

58 Art, Historical and Scientific Association Minutes, 21 January 1914.
59 Art, Historical and Scientific Association Minutes, 28 January 1913. Earlier, in 1908, attempts had been made to secure the old Provincial Court House for an independent city museum. Aid was unsuccessfully solicited from major international philanthropists including Lord Strathcona and Andrew Carnegie (the latter of whom funded the Public Library with $50,000). See Art, Historical and Scientific Association Minutes, 3 January 1908, 17 December 1908.
60 In 1967, the new Centennial (now Vancouver) Museum was at long last opened.
recognized the value of an attractive, especially exotic, collection. Curiosity over exotica—the rare, the unusual, the foreign—had played a major role, throughout the museum movement’s history, as a stimulus to both museum collectors and patrons.

Will Ferris, the Association’s second paid Curator, aptly described the Associations collection as “Cosmopolitan.” Collected since the early 1890s, Ferris and his colleagues had secured modest exhibits of “native work [and] curios...from all over the world,” including from “Peru, Ecuador, Malay States, New Zealand,...”62 The Association had also wanted to avoid duplicating the Provincial Museum’s (in Victoria) emphasis on British Columbia ethnology and natural history. The Museum’s donors included such recognized “names” as several of the Association’s first Honorary Vice-Presidents (in 1894) and many of its registered members. Some of the latter included several world travellers (a popular pastime amongst the well-to-do) and merchant sea captains who had returned with artifacts from such exotic places as the “South Seas” and Asia. Also, and considering the financial restrictions, the collection included such purchases as Dr. Roland Grant’s collection of fine gemstones and John C. Crump’s small collection of Peruvian antiquities.63

The choice of a more exotic “Cosmopolitan” collection, Ferris had argued, lay in its “appeal to everyone[,] not only as curios but [also as]...educational examples.”64 He apparently recognized, as had others before him, that most working-class and lower middle-class people simply did not respond well to traditional public educational lectures. Their lack of sufficient education, the resulting educational and social gulf between the expert (lecturer) and the audience, their physical fatigue from work, and perhaps even a disdain for learning all impeded their ability to adequately learn from lectures. Thus museums, like libraries, arose to arouse interest more efficiently in and bring about new learning.65

The Association thus developed, organized, and catalogued their museum in hopes that visitors would further increase their knowledge. It was hoped that the visitors might gaze upon the exhibits, think about what they were observing, and share with each other

---

62Art, Historical and Scientific Association Letterbook, Will Ferris to John Davidson, Provincial Biologist, 2 August 1913.
63Art, Historical and Scientific Association Minutes, 10 January 1911.
64Art, Historical and Scientific Association Letterbook, Ferris to Davidson, 2 August 1913.
those thoughts and observations. In line with a most significant purpose of public museums and art galleries, the contents were to educate the viewers, by example, about beauty, nature, and functional utility. Thus the exhibits, as at Vancouver's museum and art gallery, included both fine and applied art (the latter including examples from both industrial civilizations and “primitive” cultures); geological, botanical, entomological, zoological, and conchological (seashells) samples; and local and British historical and literary exhibits.

The very presence of so fine an institution as a museum and art gallery, it was believed, especially by the middle classes, in some measure advanced the “dignity” of a society. The arts, for example, could perhaps refine a person’s perception of beauty. In turn, their minds might be “abstracted” from degrading and “sensual” pursuits. Scientific and industrial exhibits, and even examples of native craft, on the other hand, might induce interest in industrial education, and in the investigation of the principles common to industrial processes and design. Finally, and of equal importance, the very environment of a museum and art gallery should efficiently and effectively uplift the visiting patrons, spiritually and intellectually. Thus it was imperative that the Association strive so hard to obtain and to create as large and as architecturally beautiful a museum as was possible.66

The middle-class conception of educational “self-help,” especially popular after the 1840s and 1850s, was central to this type of education provided by the Museum and Art Gallery. The self-help movement promoted an almost mythical belief in “self-made man,” and in the possibilities and benefits of the new individualist society. Heroes were made, for example, of self-educated artisans or c:of ters. Both before and after each long, hard day at work, these workers religiously spent much of their scarce free time learning. First, they acquired literacy skills. Then, many mastered a variety of difficult subjects including plant biology, mechanics, philosophy, and foreign languages. With their new knowledge, many of these self-educated men went on to illustrious careers in business or universities, for example, or became prominent in working-class causes. Promoters of this success gospel argued that good moral qualities—industry, punctuality, orderliness, good temper, and a desire for self-improvement—in combination “with a few simple techniques of living,” made

66Harrison Living and Learning, p. 87; Kelly, Adult Education in Great Britain, pp. 177-80. For more on the presumed value of museums and art galleries in nineteenth-century Britain and the United States, see also Howe, “Class, Culture and Charity.”
the ingredients for success in business and in life in general. Museums and art galleries, along with libraries, mutual improvement societies, temperence societies, and other organized vehicles for adult education, individually and together, worked to inculcate these new ideas and values into the working classes. At the same time, these learning opportunities enabled some individuals to escape from that class position.

A museum, like a library, thus served as a valuable stimulus to further study. It allowed the learners to choose their preferred ways of study. It gave rise, for instance, to individual study, on both a sustained or an occasional basis, or to formal and informal mutual improvement groups. The latter, as mentioned, were educational bodies, organized and conducted by the learners for themselves. Several individuals would formally constitute themselves into a mutual instruction group. They would teach each other basic literacy skills, and often such useful topics as science and technology, history, and geography. They generally taught each other through classes, lectures, essays, debates, and discussion. They often drew upon a small library of the books they had collected. Unfortunately, due to its ephemeral nature, direct evidence of working-class and informally arranged mutual study groups in early Vancouver is difficult to provide.

Many such groups, however, did exist. Most formally constituted associations, in particular, appear to have been associated with churches. There were also many independent clubs and societies. These included literary and debating clubs, arts and crafts societies, photographic clubs, and natural history and amateur science clubs. Several of these organizations, including the Burrard Literary Club, the Arts and Crafts Association, the Naturalists' Field Club, and the British Columbia Mountaineering Club, are discussed in subsequent chapters.

The Museum and Art Gallery, in effect, sponsored satellites of individual and mutual enlightenment, or at least served as an educational resource for their development. Mutuality, in this case, was spontaneous in relation to the Association's own activities. Mutual enlightenment could have been formal, through a mutual improvement group, for example. It also could have been informal. For example, several individuals might have

---

68See, for example, Harrison, *Early Victorian Britain* pp. 166-68; Keane, “Methodology for Adult Learners,” pp. 55-56; Vincent, *Bread, Knowledge and Freedom*, pp. 141-42.
69See also Selman, “Adult Education in B.C.,” pp. 116-190.
spontaneously met in the museum and discussed an exhibit, or an individual might have met and discussed with colleagues, family, friends, or workmates some new knowledge or awareness he or she had gained from a museum visit. Certainly, for some, education was an intended outcome of a museum visit. The Association, however, did not directly develop nor control any independent episodes of group study (either formal or informal) that could have arisen in response to the Museum collection’s educative features.

On another front, the Museum and Art Gallery served the Art, Historical and Scientific Association’s desire to develop and to maintain informal, and sometimes formal, relations between itself and several independent voluntary mutual enlightenment associations. These relationships were useful to the Association. The other societies both used and could advance the value of the Museum, and correspondingly, the Art, Historical and Scientific Association. In these cases, mutual enlightenment seemed to develop as a formal, reciprocating relationship between two independent bodies.

For example, the Association’s Dr. Roland Grant, in 1903, gave a “drawing room talk on the ‘birth of art’...in aid of” the Young Women’s Christian Association. The Association, at that time, was attempting to rejuvenate itself through a number of “new departure[s].” These included co-operating with other local societies. “The hope,” Executive members “unanimously” felt, was “that this & similar occasions would inspire in the minds of all worthy citizens, a desire for a more extended knowledge of the Arts & Sciences.”

Sometimes the independent association eventually amalgamated with the more central body. This happened in 1905, when after much negotiation, the Vancouver Photographic Society joined up with the Art, Historical and Scientific Association. The Association, as part of the agreement, provided the Photographic Club with darkroom facilities and “space for scientific purposes” in the basement of the new museum at the Carnegie Library. Sometimes the amalgamation attempt, however, failed. For example, after several transactions with the local B.C. Entomological Association, including the loan by the Entomological Association to the museum of insect collections, the Art, Historical and Scientific Association attempted but was unable to amalgamate with the Entomological Association. A major part of the Art, Historical and Scientific Association’s missionary

---

70Art, Historical and Scientific Association Minutes, 26 March 1903.
71Art, Historical and Scientific Association Minutes, 26 March 1903, 26 January 1905.
72Art, Historical and Scientific Association Minutes, 26 January 1905.
zeal was to foster and develop its hegemony over Vancouver's intellectual and cultural affairs. Such hegemony, however, and as discussed in Chapter Five, was not accepted by all.

Ultimately the middle-class community (and especially the business community) believed they would benefit most from a good museum and art gallery. The accumulated “useful knowledge” acquired by the motivated working man should stimulate his interest in and technical understanding of his work. Further, it should increase his value to an employer. Finally, it might also lead him to change his habits, values, and attitudes to better approximate middle-class ideals.

These beliefs originated with Lord Henry Brougham (S.D.U.K.). Their most notable advocate, from the 1840s and beyond, was Samuel Smiles. Through his book *Self-Help* (1844), the most popular of the self-improvement manuals of the day, Smiles made most direct the connection between self-improvement and economic advancement.\(^7^3\) Such “useful knowledge,” however, was intended to be only enough to enhance production, not to stimulate creative or innovative thinking, or knowledge of overall industrial or business practices. There was no wish that the working classes learn how to challenge traditional authorities.

Of equal or even greater significance, mental and moral improvement also served as solace to a middle class threatened by the consequences of the industrial age. In British Columbia, this was compounded by a rough, frontier society. Traditional culture was collapsing and was being replaced by a new, technical civilization. Middle-class writers like Smiles believed that the best solution was to “strengthen...a common culture, based on middle class social norms, [and] into which the working classes could be integrated. Respectability was the goal...and self-improvement the way to attain it.” The middle-class values of hard work, self-reliance, and duty would be assimilated by the working classes and accepted as their own.\(^7^4\)

Finally, the community would also benefit by the contentment and morally restrained recreation (“rational recreation”) of a more enlightened working class. The men of such a class, wrote Samuel Smiles, would be “virtuous, intelligent, well-informed, and

\(^7^3\)Vincent, *Bread, Knowledge and Freedom*, p. 144.
They would hardly despoil themselves in beer halls and brothels nor involve themselves in political and especially in socialistic and labourite causes. By elevating the best of a whole class, Smiles and others believed, society would benefit, and political and economic stability could be maintained. Mutual enlightenment, through the Cook-Vancouver Museum and Art Gallery, would serve the non-educational purpose of social control.

The interest of Vancouver's elite in contributing to such an institution was ambiguous. Some may have been truly sympathetic to the needs and well-being of the "great masses." Perhaps they hoped to contribute to their recreation and improvement, or to stem the tide of the worst aspects of industrialism. Others, perhaps subconsciously, aimed to provide an "opiate" to those who would surely threaten their social, financial, and political well-being. If not becalmed and amused, in a period of highly conspicuous wealth alongside abject poverty, the "masses" might surely rise up and overturn the prevailing social order, as they had in the past. This period, before the Great War, was for British Columbia, as with much of the Western World, an economic and social crucible for socialists and the labour movement. Finally, some of the many contributors might also have simply desired public accolade for their generosity. Through donation, they could mark their financial or professional success. At the same time, their action would serve as their rejection of the "myth" that capitalist enterprise breeds philistinism.

The concept "interest," however, provides a key to unravel the motives of the museum's illustrious and often elitist contributors. Etymologically and historically, "interest" conveys an association with "property and finance....[Its meaning] is saturated with the experience of a society based on money relationships." Thus while museum and art gallery contributors appear to have been motivated through altruism and generosity, their actual interests, above all, may have been to enhance economic and political stability. An attractive museum might help to inculcate positive and useful middle-class habits and values, and maybe even stimulate some to independent self- and mutual education and improvement. At its least, the museum will have served as a harmless diversion away from such social, political, or economic threats as drunkenness or crime, or union and socialist agitation.

Nevertheless, as historian David Vincent has amply demonstrated, and contrary to any private intentions of social control by these self-interested contributors, Museum visitors had their own "interests" in their own education. As well, the Cook-Vancouver Museum and Art Gallery could not possibly have served, in any more than minimal way, as an instrument of social control. By its nature, it need to attract, voluntarily, its patrons and visitors. And, it could not tell them what or how to think about their observations.

3.4. THE VANCOUVER WOMEN'S MUSICAL CLUB: MUSICAL CULTURE AND AMATEUR IMPRESSARIOS

The Vancouver Women's Musical Club, founded October 18, 1905, became the successor to the Art, Historical and Scientific Association's conversaziones. Possibly due to waning interest and cost, the Association had ceased its regular conversaziones around 1900. In 1905, the new and vigorous Women's Musical Club thus assumed sponsorship of much of the city's musical enlightenment.

The new Musical Club offered programmes of musical cultivation for the city's economic and cultural elite and, separately, for aspiring, talented female musicians and singers, and for the "underprivileged." Women's Musical Club members learned about classical music through classes and lectures, and learned music appreciation through concerts and other musical performances. Like the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, the Musical Club also extended its programme beyond its primary membership. While the Association had its public museum and art gallery, the Musical Club extended its programme of musical enlightenment through Club-sponsored choral groups and orchestras, music examinations, and public and charity concerts. Critical to this aim, the Musical Club, unlike the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, had no egalitarian and democratic pretensions. There were no controversies over their exclusion of most people from full and equal membership. Class distinction, for them, was important.

The Musical Club's programmes substantiate and provide comparison with the findings of the previous two Art, Historical and Scientific Association case studies. These

---

77A. Winifred Lee (newspaper clipping, 6 April 1946); Naomi Long (newspaper clipping, 20 December 1952), Vancouver Women's Musical Club, MS 12,597, VCA.
78There does not appear to have been any other musical group of significance or significant social connections formed until the Women's Musical Club's foundation.
contrasting educational practices are further examples of mutual enlightenment, and especially of how mutuality was practised. They suggest to us what mutual enlightenment might have meant to its practitioners. These contrasting practices also help us to discover what knowledge was most desirable, and why. They suggest what and how much knowledge could usefully, yet safely, be passed from the city's intellectual elite (as a clerisy) to the mass public, and to what ends.

As the successor to the conversaziones, the Women's Musical Club expressed the same Imperial spirit espoused by many Art, Historical and Scientific Association members. The Club was founded as "an association for mutual improvement and pleasure and for the advancement of musical culture in Vancouver." Its instigators were Mrs. Dr. R. C. Boyle, honorary Vice President of the Vancouver Imperial Order of the Daughters of the Empire (IODE), and Mrs. Charles Peter, "a fine violinist" and member of the Art, Historical and Scientific Association. The Coronation Chapter of the IODE, "in connection with the Art Club," were especially prominent as instigating organizations. The IODE promised to provide meeting facilities. The IODE connection is mentioned because of its strongly Imperialist and British patriotic aims. A women's organization, the IODE worked to develop and engender strong patriotic sentiment towards the King and mother country, including the development of a British patriotic school curriculum. Obviously, as with the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, they viewed the development of high culture as equally important to the development of material wealth.

The Musical Club's connections to the Art, Historical and Scientific Association were also significant. Nothing in the Club's minutes, however, indicated any overt contribution by the Art, Historical and Scientific Association towards the Musical Club's foundation. Significantly, though, two of the Musical Club's most important members, Mrs. Peters and Mrs. J. J. Banfield, were also Art, Historical and Scientific Association members. Mrs.

---

81 Women's Musical Club, Lily Laverock, 1937.
82 Minutes, 10 October 1905, Coronation Chapter, Imperial Order Daughters of the Empire, vol. 10, Add. Mss. 255, VCA. The "Art Club" named in the Minutes was not specified and could have been either the Art, Historical and Scientific Association (sometimes referred to in the press as the "Art Association") or, more likely, the Studio Club, an amateur art club comprised of upper middle-class and upper-class members, organized in 1904.
Peters served the Musical Club in various official capacities including First Vice-President in 1906 and President in 1907 and 1908. Mrs. Banfield, leader of a smaller musical group, instigated her group's joining the Women's Musical Club in 1906. She became the Musical Club's secretary, also in 1906. As well, some 12 members (6.8 per cent) of the Women's Musical Club, in 1914, were also Art, Historical and Scientific Association members. While not a large number among the Musical Club's 185 members, it does indicate some overlapping interest. It is significant to note, however, that many of the Musical Club's members appear to come from among the city's most prominent families, with both Mrs. Peters and Mrs. Banfield being the wives of prominent business leaders.

There were other similarities and some differences with the Art, Historical and Scientific Association. The Women's Musical Club's initial programme was similar to that which the Art, Historical and Scientific Association finally had discarded. Initially, until 1907, when the Club began to organize concerts with important professional performers, the Club's musical programmes consisted of weekday morning and occasional evening classical recitals. These performances, by accomplished local musicians and vocalists, were offered to Club members in such places as the Labour Hall, or the Sons of England Hall. Actually, both the performers and the audience were Club members: the performers held "Active" status, acquired after an audition before an Examining Committee or Board, and the audience held "Associate" memberships. The Art, Historical and Scientific Association, it should be noted, had no class of membership structure—all who joined, lecturers or learners, held equal status. Clearly, the Musical Club members' purpose was to learn about and to listen to classical musical or, for the Active members, to perform before an appreciative audience. Active members learned to play in orchestras or to sing in choruses. After passing a music test, their job was to accommodate the Associate members' desires for "musical culture."

The morning member's programme continued beyond 1907. The programme consisted of the members-only concerts and of lectures about music and composers. Often a season would be organized around a theme, in 1908-9, it was German music; in 1910-11, it

---

84 Women's Musical Club, A. Winifred Lee (newspaper clipping, 6 April 1946).
85 Vancouver Social Registry and Club Directory (Vancouver: Welch & Gibbs, 1914).
was French. Lectures, such as three by Rubin Goldmark on Wagner's "Nibelung Tetrology," prepared the women for the season's musical programme of pianists, violinists, cellists, and voice soloists. Recitals and lectures were held twice monthly, from November through March.

The Musical Club also organized, in 1911, a semi-autonomous Women's Choral and Orchestral Society, after earlier (1909) attempts at a "Ladies Orchestra" and a "Ladies Choral Society." Mr. Dyke, who had also played at early Art, Historical and Scientific Association conversaziones, was acquired as conductor, and Mrs. Carapota was "re-engaged as First Violin at a fee of $50." All former orchestra and choral society members (57) were re-invited to join. The Choral and Orchestral Society, comprised of Active members, were to play at Club recitals and, as an extension of Club principles, to other community organizations.

Most daring and expensive was the Club's "venture into the unknowns of the impresario field." It sponsored major performances for often large amounts of money (e.g., $2000 plus 50 per cent profits for Paderewski; $1400 for soprano Mme Godski). As outlined by a more recent publicity convenor, Mrs. A. E. Andersen:

In 1908, they presented Herbert Witherspoon, "America's Greatest Basso," at Vancouver Opera House....[And], sponsoring the Paganini, Pascal and Griller quartets, it brought chamber music to Vancouver for the first time. It also arranged the only three performances ever given here by the New York Symphony Orchestra, under Walter Damrosch.

Such performers, however, eventually almost reduced the Club to bankruptcy. The Club, for instance, had to be rescued from financial collapse "by a Public-spirited gentleman who wished to remain anonymous" when the New York Symphony concert failed to generate sufficient revenues. That particular fiasco was apparently due to the death of Edward VII on May 6, 1910. Nevertheless, they carried on, only to have eventually to curtail such expensive programmes during the 1913 depression and at the outbreak of war

---

87 Minutes, 2 September 1908, 2 September 1910, Vancouver Womans (sic) Musical Club, vol. 1, Add. Mss. 397, VCA.
88 Womans Musical Club Minutes, 4 October 1911, 23 August 1909, 13 November 1909, 15 December 1910. The orchestra was disbanded on 15 December 1910.
89 Naomi Long (newspaper clipping, 20 December 1952), Women's Musical Club, VCA.
90 Womans Musical Club Minutes, 6 July 1907, 2 September 1908.
91 Naomi Long (newspaper clipping, 20 December 1952), Women's Musical Club, VCA.
in 1914.

Just as the Art, Historical and Scientific Association had its museum for the "masses," so too did the Women's Musical Club cater, albeit at a much lesser level, to the city's less cultured people. For example, the Club's Philanthropic Committee, in 1912, had arranged concerts at the General Hospital and the Alexandra Orphanage ("by child-performers"). They also received requests "from the Y.W.C.A., St. Paul's Hospital, the Seamen's Institute, & [sic] the Children's Aid." Though the Club had received "many letters of appreciation"\footnote{Womans Musical Club Minutes, 5 December 1912, 23 April 1914.} for such concerts, and no doubt they provided a pleasant diversion for the listeners, the concert programme had overtones of charity. Such overtones were not so obviously present at the Art, Historical and Scientific Association's public lectures and Museum.

Mutual enlightenment, as practised by the Women's Musical Club, almost mirrored that practised by the Art, Historical and Scientific Association. The pedagogy and curricula of both organizations were bi-focal. There was an internal, Associate members' programme of classical music classes and lectures, and music appreciation concerts and other musical performances. Correspondingly, there was an external programme of choral groups and orchestras, and music examinations, for Active members, and of public and charity concerts.

The Club, however, was much more elitist, exclusive, and traditional in its approach towards pedagogical and organizational mutuality. The Club followed a tradition that musical culture was best nurtured by women. However, only women from Vancouver's most prominent families were appropriate as Associate members. Because of their "better" class origins and socialization, only they possessed the sensibilities necessary to best appreciate and understand "good" music.

This elitism, or noblesse oblige, however, almost exceeds the logical meaning of mutual enlightenment. The education the Musical provided for its offspring clubs and charity concerts, was one-sided. It proceeded directly from teachers hired by the Club to its students, or from performers to audiences. Nevertheless, in both cases, voluntarism was a key factor, especially for the Active members and their choral and instrumental clubs. Also, the element of exchange was strong, especially between the Associate and the Active
member groups. The Associate group provided opportunities for musical expression, education, and recreation to talented local women—the Active members. These Active members, however, did have to submit to testing in order to demonstrate their talent (and thus their worthiness) to the Associate members. Still, in exchange, the Active members provided the Associate members with the musical performances necessary for their own musical enlightenment and appreciation, and for their charity work.

The Associate members, of course, more closely exhibited mutual enlightenment through through their planning and administering their own programme of lectures and recitals. Like the Art, Historical and Scientific Association's programme participants, the Musical Club women would also exchange knowledge, opinions, and feelings about whatever lecture or recital-concert they were attending. Some of this would have been formal exchanges, in the context of the lecture itself, and in terms of questions and answers and group discussion involving a lecturer and the learners. Other mutual exchange would have been informal, occurring in exchanges before and after lectures or recitals, and at other times, during business meetings.

Even more significantly, of course, the women had provided themselves with a rather elitist “mutual admiration society.” Also, they were, effectively, a business, albeit a non-profit co-operative. As such they obviously exchanged much more than simply ideas and opinions about music. They were learning organizational and business skills. They also learned and re-enforced the social codes and behaviours appropriate to their assumed social station. Not only were they clearly distinct from other “lower” social classes, they were similarly distinct, as a class, from their very materialistic husbands and most other males. In fact, in areas of taste, refinement, and sensibilities, they believed that they were clearly superior to most men. Thus, as with Art, Historical and Scientific Association members, a major currency of exchange here was tone. As science enobled, so music refined. Also, the Musical Club's women, too, were securing and practising their civic role as a cultural elite. Being so distinctly classbound, however, they hardly can be considered a clerisy.

This belief in the cultural superiority of femininity, especially upper-class femininity, was strongly held throughout the Victorian and Edwardian period. Women softened, refined, and civilized the roughness and violence of a male world.\textsuperscript{93} Progress, they

\textsuperscript{93}Harrison, \textit{Living and Learning}, p. 207.
believed, necessitated the “fostering of the gentle art,” by cultured women. They aimed to complement the materialism of their husbands’ and other men’s business activity, and of city building. Thus it took the Women’s Musical Club to introduce the best and most widely reputed of European and American musical culture to select Vancouver audiences. As writer Ethel Stoddard observed, it was the women’s organizations of Vancouver who were working with “briskness” towards improving the social, cultural, and patriotic side of life. Specifically, she named the Musical Club, along with the Women’s Canadian Club, the Studio Club, the Daughters of the Empire, the Council of Women, and several charitable and reform organizations. Notably, the Art, Historical and Scientific Association was not included. Perhaps it was dominated by men. Or perhaps, its status, while elite, was not quite at par with these other organizations.

Finally, there were other reasons for the popularity of the Club amongst Vancouver women. While not publicly espoused, they were nonetheless significant and plausible. For the Active members, the Club provided opportunities for some learning, but even more for creative or talent expression. Also, for both Associate and Active members, it gave ample opportunity for a tasteful and self-improving use of one’s leisure time. Finally, and without substantiating evidence, membership in such a “classy” organization likely gave individual members the chance to make contact with others higher up the social ladder. Here was one way they might improve their social position in a city where the class or status structure was far from static and settled.

3.5. CONCLUSION: A BI-FOCAL MUTUAL ENLIGHTENMENT

This chapter, second of three, has explored, through three case examples, the associational pedagogy and curriculum of two mutual enlightenment associations. We wanted to establish how mutual enlightenment translated nineteenth-century Victorian ideals of Utilitarianism and Romanticism into these two associations’ various programmes. The Art, Historical and Scientific Association was the object of two case studies; the third was the Vancouver Women’s Musical Club. This third case study provided substantiation and comparison with the findings of the first two case studies.

“Mutual enlightenment,” for these organizations, was conceived as bi-focal

(internal/exclusive and external/inclusive) in its curricula and pedagogy. Narrowly interpreted, "mutual enlightenment" consisted of self-planned and self-administered programmes of lectures, conversaziones, and choral and instrumental recitals. Both societies appeared to provide for the free and reasoned exchange of knowledge, opinions, and feelings, amongst the participants, about whatever event they were attending. "Mutual enlightenment" included both formal and informal exchanges. The former mainly consisted of post-lecture group discussion. The latter included those exchanges occurring before and after lectures or recitals, and at other organization related times. For example, evaluating and deciding about the appropriateness of museum or art exhibits, or musical performers, would constitute mutual enlightenment, at least when new intellectual or aesthetic knowledge was learned. Lastly, the environment for mutual enlightenment facilitated the exchange and discussion of social values, attitudes, and behaviours through refined social intercourse.

The more difficult, yet equally significant, component of mutual enlightenment involved the extension of each Association's or Club's educational goals and programmes outside that organizations' official membership bounds. However, because outsiders chose themselves whether or not to attend, and because there was a kind of exchange, if only through that attendance, "mutual enlightenment" here, can be seen in a looser, less structured, and broader sense. Extension included the Art, Historical and Scientific Association's Cook-Vancouver Museum and Art Gallery, and the Women's Musical Club's off-shoot choral and orchestral clubs, its "Active" (i.e., performing) membership, and its impresario role, and its public and charity concerts. This conception of mutual enlightenment originated in the relationship between Lord Brougham's "useful knowledge" movement and the museum as an educational resource. This relationship served to foster "self-help" among and the improvement of "the masses." In the case of the Musical Club, these masses in need of improvement included their busy and wealthy but culturally boorish business and professional husbands and high-status friends.

It is argued that Art, Historical and Scientific Association and Women's Musical Club members saw themselves as a kind of "clerisy"—a cultural and intellectual elite. They set out to build up Vancouver's reputation, to carry out the disinterested cultural mission of saving and preserving the province's own past, and to introduce to Vancouverites the finest cultural and intellectual talent available. Their status and interests affected both the
pedagogy and curricula of their associations' work. Their status and interests especially shaped their decisions about just who should learn what.

With this in mind, the next chapter analyzes the membership composition and standing of the Art, Historical and Scientific Association. We will show how their occupations, educational levels, and ethnicity, amongst other characteristics, affected their deeper social, economic, and political reasons for practising mutual enlightenment as they did. We will infer how far they were and were not a clerisy. Indeed, they did look like a clerisy. However, as suggested in this chapter, they failed to expand their clerisy membership to effectively include working-class intellectuals. Thus they violated Matthew Arnold's belief that such intellectual and cultural leadership should be of the best available, regardless of their class origin.
CHAPTER 4.

"LIGHT, MORE LIGHT"

3: A VANCOUVER "CLERISY"

His life, honorable in purpose and action, has been one of value to his fellowmen—a factor in pushing forward the wheels of progress and civilization.¹

He is a leader in cultural affairs. Their home...is a rendezvous for writers and literateurs from all over the Dominion.²

4.1. INTRODUCTORY NOTE: A COLLECTIVE BIOGRAPHY OF ART, HISTORICAL AND SCIENTIFIC ASSOCIATION MEMBERS

The Art, Historical and Scientific Association’s engaging and often embattled history exemplified the dialectical relationship between ideas and the social, economic, and political context. The Association’s members—those “devoted few”—saw themselves as key agents for cultural refinement in a city noted for its “busy commercialism.” The Association, itself, and its programme of mutual enlightenment, then, were the material outcome of this creative interaction between ideas and context. Understanding one part of the dialectic helps to explain better the other, and vice versa.

This dialectic, for the Association, saw the marriage of high, Romantic ideals—beauty, culture, and spiritual elevation—to the Utilitarian and patriotic needs of Vancouver’s early residents. These contextually-based needs characterized the city’s materialistic drive and environment, and its pro-Empire spirit. The Association’s exclusive, member-oriented conversaziones and lecture programmes, and its public, inclusive Cook-Vancouver Museum and Art Gallery, epitomized the translation of these ideas into material form. Central to this expression of the dialectic, it is argued that the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, through its members, was a kind of “clerisy.” As such, the members aimed to enlighten themselves culturally, and to civilize and inspire

²This quotation refers to Association member Willie Dalton. Vancouver City Archives (VCA), M2312, Dalton, Willie (newspaper clipping, 20 November 1946).
“self-improvement” amongst the city’s “great masses.”

The Association’s programme content and methods, its limited success, and the members’ underlying reasons for promoting and participating in such an organization, can best be explained with reference to the social characteristics of its members and their social context. The social background is significant in two ways. First, we can discover and describe a person’s social class, gender, ethnicity, occupational and economic interests, and the like. We can thereby infer and explain his values, priorities, and assumptions. In turn, we can explain his specific actions.

This chapter is the third of a trilogy examining the embodiment of mutual enlightenment through the Art, Historical and Scientific Association. It has two principal objects. The first is to explain why people became involved with mutual enlightenment. Could the members be construed as a “clerisy,” and thereby be accorded a special leadership status? Were there underlying reasons that also help explain their participation? The second is to explain the extent to which the members’ social characteristics (their age, gender, education and social status, and their national origin) limited the effectiveness of the Association’s pedagogy—especially towards that class of people much like themselves or, at least, that class to which they believed they belonged. Of these four inference patterns, only two—social origin and national origin—are fully developed and explored. Age and gender, as developed, and for want of more inferential data, only hint at their significance. Further research is recommmended.

The Art, Historical and Scientific Association’s membership, since its predecessor’s (the Art Association) formation in 1889, had an aura of distinction about it. Association members represented something of the “cream” of Vancouver society, though they were certainly not at the “top.” Rather, this distinction gave them a special position within that society. This position can be seen through who they were and through what they did.

The complete 1909 membership may be portrayed as follows. They were 31 men (including the three not traced any further) and 13 women. Their ages ranged from 33 to 77 years (that is of the 26 whose exact age could be determined), and averaged 54 years.

Minutes, nd.(1909), p. 360, Vancouver Art, Historical and Scientific Association, vol. 2, file 10, Add. Mss. 336, VCA. The list comprised 44 paid members, including officers, and enough detail to allow some biographical data traces on 41 members. The relatively high success rate of the trace is indicative of the high status of Association members within the community.
Both the mean and median year of birth was 1855.\(^4\) Ethnically, and in religious affiliation, they were hardly distinguishable from the rest of Vancouver's population in 1911. All were British subjects and all but one were of Protestant faith.\(^5\) Most (19 of 33, 57.6 per cent) were born in the British Isles; only 14 (42.4 per cent) were born in Canada. No Americans were listed as members for 1909, a fact which acquires significance in light of the growing temper of Canadian Imperialistic nationalism. Association members particularly abhorred the "American spirit" of Vancouver's economic, social, and aesthetic development. The breakdown in religious affiliation did not significantly deviate from that in the 1911 census. The Association accepted individuals of any of the major denominations, though affiliations were reflective of the Association's British ethnicity.Occupationally, however, the group was most significantly different from the general population. Of the 26 members who were employed (this excluding all but one woman and two retired men), seventeen (65 per cent) could be classified as professionals. The remainder, including those not employed (i.e., wives, widows, and an aunt) were mostly employed or related to an individual who owned or managed a substantial business concern. Finally, various sorts of evidence suggests that the members were well connected to Vancouver's "upper classes" and that most, even when not actually of the upper class, could claim some local, provincial, or even national recognition or fame.

Various characteristics, then, of age, gender, social and occupational position, patterns of residency, education, national origin, and self-perceived role in an educational clerisy, all indicate how members assumed elite social status in early Vancouver. This status, and their special social mission, is supported finally by the members' substantial involvement within local educational and reform circles, and through their strong membership connections to the patriotic Canadian Clubs. The chapter concludes on a note summarizing the changing conceptions of "culture" and on the fate of the Art, Historical and Scientific Association.

\(^4\) Even when estimated age was added to the date from a further seven individuals, the mean and median ages did not change substantially. The birth averaged 1856, and age 53, in 1909.
\(^5\) The one non-Protestant was Frank Burnett, Sr., a Roman Catholic. As mentioned earlier, there had also been Jewish members, and a Catholic priest, Father Emmanuel.
4.2. THE ASSOCIATION BEFORE 1909: THE CLERICS DEPART

Vancouver clergymen, until the new Public Museum's opening in 1905, had played a prominent role in Art, Historical and Scientific Association affairs. Anglican Reverend L. Norman Tucker, for example, had been the Association's first president, from 1894 until he relocated, in 1902, to Toronto. Tucker's retirement from the Association's presidency marked the last year of any significant membership in, and leadership of, the Association by the city's clerical community.

More significantly, there was a dramatic changeover in Association lecturers. Until 1902, there had been an almost equal split between clerical and secular lecturers. Afterwards, until 1916, secular lecturers vastly outnumbered clerical lecturers. Thus, during the Association's first ten years, 31 lectures had been delivered by church ministers. Only 29 were delivered by non-church individuals (noting that a single lecturer often lectured more than once). Only 14 lectures were presented by church ministers, however, in the following 13 years, as opposed to 86 lectures presented by non-church individuals.

As participation by clergymen declined, so too did literature decline as an important lecture topic. Clergymen lectured mostly on literary topics. Correspondingly, the topic history increased with the decline in literature. Historical lectures were delivered by secular amateur historians. During the first ten years, from 1894-1903, there were 14 literature lectures (not including Hill-Tout's eight lecture series in 1895), and only ten historical lectures. The following 13 years (there were no lectures 1904-5 due to Museum construction and relocation), however, saw 25 historical lectures, as opposed to only eight concerning literature.

These changes in programming and Association leadership invite explanation. Why did the clergy's once substantial participation in Association life fall off so rapidly and completely? Did they abandon the Association or did the Association abandon them? Did these curricular changes occur in consequence of their leaving or did they leave because the Association wanted to lessen its literary component?

6Art, Historical and Scientific Association Minutes, 16 October 1902, 22 January 1903.
7Statistics compiled from the Art, Historical and Scientific Association's, comp. and ed., Journal of The Art, Historical and Scientific Association of Vancouver, B.C., (Vancouver: Trythall & Son, 1917), pp. 9-14. Note that even with as large a number as 86 lectures, seven secular lecturers accounted for 34 lectures in the 1903-1916 period.
Both Reverend Tucker and Gertrude Mellon, it is worth recalling, had suggested spiritual and social reasons for organizing the Art, Historical and Scientific Association. They had hoped to provoke a spiritual uplift in the community through the stimulation of intellectual and aesthetic interests and practices. Moreover, Tucker had hoped that the Association would bring together the various classes, except perhaps the very poor (who were pre-occupied with simple survival), to a community-wide sharing of knowledge. If nothing more, he wished that the different classes might find uplift and diversion from the nastier and primitive conditions of the prevailing materialistic and competitive civilization. Because Tucker and most other clergymen left the Association, one might well ask what was happening to the clergy and their perception of mission and reform during this period?

Mellon, however, in 1909, added new reasons for the Association’s programme changes. She recalled:

Art’s aid was first sought,—This was too slow and insipid for the practical purposes at so early a stage. Something more direct was needed. Science was brought in to help in developing the vast natural resources and to appeal still further, history was added. The experience of the world proves that it is absolutely necessary in building up a nation to instil vitality by creating a history of those who have taken a prominent part in its discovery and growth.  

Mrs. Mellon did not specifically name literature amongst her three topical areas. Had she subsumed it under “Art,” then it may be inferred that indeed the Association had been shifting its curricular emphases between the Association’s inception, in 1894, and 1909.

Note, however, there was no suggestion that the Association rejected the services of the clergy or their topics of interest. Except for Mrs. Mellon’s opinion, Association minutes or other reports suggest no such shift in policy. Besides, literature topics and lectures by clergymen continued, albeit at a much lower frequency. Other possibilities, therefore, must be considered, or at least included with Mellon’s judgment.

Two independent but connected reasons appear most likely. First, the social gospel movement, inspired by new religious, social, and political doubts and ideas, transformed, or at least questioned, much of the Church’s mission. To whom, and how, should Christianity

---

8S. Gertrude Mellon, “History Art and Science,” typescript article from Woman’s Life and Work in the Province of B.C. (Victoria: King’s Printer, 1909), attached to the inside back cover of the Art, Historical and Scientific Association Minutes, vol. 2, file 8, Add. Mss. 336, VCA.
address itself, and to what ends? Second, the Association's clientele, particularly those attending lectures, was probably socially and economically too narrow. The Association's lecture programme catered almost completely to the middle classes. To Tucker and many other clergymen, the Association had failed to fulfill their mission to reach the city's "toiling and struggling fellow citizens."

The Canadian social gospel arose during the 1890s. It drew from comparable developments throughout much of the European (and American) world—the social gospel movement. Concentrated in the Methodist, Presbyterian, and Congregational Churches, and to a lesser extent in other Protestant and Catholic Churches, the social gospel movement was a response by these churches to the combined trauma of the "threatening climate of intellectual doubt" brought on by the scientific reasoning of the Enlightenment and later biological Darwinism, by political radicalism and democracy, and by the social and political unrest of the degraded social and economic conditions of the urban masses. Out of their concern and doubt, social gospel ministers and lay people worked with secular social and economic reformers, particularly progressives and socialists, to resolve some of society's most distressing urban and industrial moral and social problems.

The participating churches and religious activists lent both moral authority and organized manpower to the struggle "to realize the Kingdom of God in the very fabric of society." Social gospellers, instead of concentrating their energies on esoteric theological debate and on individually and spiritually saving people for the afterlife, interpreted Jesus' gospel in an earthly, temporal sense. To them, the Church's duty was as much to save people physically, as to save them spiritually. They sought reforms to combat and to ameliorate a plethora of problems that were beginning to trouble the more sensitive of the middle classes. These problems included "the drink" (alcohol use or abuse), urban slums and squalor, the "foreign born" (i.e., non Anglo-Saxon immigrants), horrendous labour

conditions and employer-employee relations, poor private and public health, an unfair tax system (one solution was Henry George's "single tax"), and "the depredations of the 'industrial pharoahs' of the time."\(^{12}\)

Their solutions, however, varied according to the ideological approach and social composition of the participants. Social gospellers, from the 1890s into the 1930s, changed and evolved in composition and in ideological focus and development according to changing social, economic, and political conditions in Canada, especially in the West. These changes saw shifts in emphasis from the earlier individualistic and evangelical conservative solutions (e.g., temperance) towards the radical solutions (e.g., political and economic reconstruction) popular by the 1930s Great Depression. Between them there grew a large and powerful middle group of social progressives advocating still substantial but moderate social solutions. The conservatives, including the evangelical Low or Broad church party within the Anglican Church, reflected that church's traditional paternalism and saw salvation in personal and ethical terms, and reform through legislation. The radicals, on the other hand, including socialists (e.g., J. S. Woodsworth) and some who would become communists (e.g., A. E. Smith), saw society in organic terms. They saw both salvation and reform as social salvation, and believed "in an immanent God working in the social process to bring his kingdom to birth...."\(^{13}\) Outside the social gospellers, there also remained very strong conservative constituencies. The conservatives retained and advanced the Church's traditional spiritual tradition. Direct societal intervention, to them, was not the Church's responsibility.

For local churchmen, these competing interpretations of Christianity and their confused social responsibilities must have triggered as much reflection on their public responsibilities as it probably did on their theological and social duties. With only limited resources, many local churchmen must have decided that their time and energy would be better spent working with the disinherited, the disenfranchised, and with other social activists to resolve many of these grave and vexing problems. The Methodist and Presbyterian churches, for instance, in 1913 commissioned a report on social conditions in Vancouver. *The Report* was particularly critical of housing and recreational conditions, and

\(^{12}\)Ibid., pp. 10-17, 15.

\(^{13}\)Ibid., p. 17.
of the lack of decent public and private health. These churches, along with their Anglican brethren, had been active educating the Chinese, Japanese, and East Indian communities since the 1890s. Along with their lay organizations (especially women’s organizations), these and the Roman Catholic Churches had provided most of the social service and philanthropic work in Vancouver.

Other, much more conservative, clerics, also responding to these ideological and theological challenges, perhaps decided to concentrate their energies closer to home, within their own diminishing congregations. Also troubled by the materialist temper of the age, they reflected the conservative belief that the solution to this materialist age was to emphasize the spiritual and mystical elements of Christianity, and to reassert the Church’s traditional authority and ritualism. This view, most pronounced in the Anglican Church, and especially through its Anglo-Catholic or High Church parties, also found sympathy in representatives of other Protestant churches. The most notable example of these other Protestant churches was the conservative wing of the Presbyterian Church. Both of these churches, the Anglican and the Presbyterian, were well established within the most economically secure and powerful classes in the country and in Vancouver.

The Art, Historical and Scientific Association’s clerical members and lecturers thus

---

14 See United Church Archives, University of British Columbia, [Mr. Stewart], *The Report of a Brief Investigation of Social Conditions in the City Which Indicate the Need of an Intensive Social Survey, the Lines of which are Herein Suggested.* ([Vancouver]: The Board of Temperance and Moral Reform of the Methodist Church and The Board of Social Service and Evangelism of the Presbyterian Church, [1913]).


17 See Stephen Yeo, *Religion and Voluntary Organisations in Crisis* (London: Croom Helm, 1976). Yeo, following a Marxist approach has traced the Church’s multivariated response to this depleted influence (or control) over the populace in turn-of-the-century Reading, England.

may have decided it would be more advantageous for themselves and their Christian mission to concentrate on more religious and spiritual matters. They decided, perhaps, that it was better to replenish their own depleting church constituents, or to devote their time to the pressing social problems being noticed in Vancouver. Reverend Tucker, for example, though he left the Association to move to Toronto, became one of the Anglican’s Church’s most prominent social gospellers. There he directed the Anglican Council for Social Service after 1918. Like Tucker, many of the Art, Historical and Scientific Association’s clergymen may have been struck by the belief that there was little reform to be gained through continued association with the Association’s programme. Perhaps they had become discouraged by the programme’s apparent social segregation and by its decreasing concern with “beauty” (i.e., through literature and art). The High Anglican Church had positively associated beauty with morality, mysticism, and spirituality. This belief of the Association’s inefficacy as a vehicle to adequately reform Vancouver’s prevailing materialism must have struck some clerical members especially upon their realization of the second reason for their withdrawal.

That second reason must have been the realization that the Association’s clientele, especially those who would attend lectures or participate in other scientific and aesthetic aspects of the programme, was not nearly as broad as they had first envisioned. As this chapter on the actual Association membership illustrates, the Association attracted neither major capitalists and industrialists, nor working people, in sufficient numbers to effect any significant influence over their work, business, and recreational lives. Rather the Association was a collection of people, resembling a “clerisy.” Except for the informal museum visits, however, the Association failed to effectively reach out to a larger, city-wide constituency. Thus with the advent of a new definition of social ministerial responsibilities (the social gospel), and the lack of desired constituents, the clergy withdrew. The hoped-for opportunity to influence business, political, and industrial affairs—to infuse a spirit of aesthetics and morality into business and industrial conduct—never materialized.

Allen, Social Passion, p. 15.
4.3. AGE AND COMMUNITY SENIORITY

The Art, Historical and Scientific Association was a senior within Vancouver’s organized community affairs. It was one of the city’s oldest mutual enlightenment societies; its immediate predecessor (the Art Association) founded in 1889, itself founded in 1894. Similarly, its members, as a group, were also among the oldest (in age) active in civic affairs. The Association’s younger members, of course, suggested continuing vitality. The mean average age for Association members was high (54 years, in 1909); ten years more than the nearest of four other clubs and societies similarly researched. The age means for the other four associations, in parentheses, were: Burrard Literary Club (37 in 1898), Arts and Crafts Association (41 in 1900), YMCA (39.5 in 1903), and Naturalists’ Field Club (44 in 1906).

This high mean average for the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, beyond reflecting its own longevity, becomes more significant when other details about the members are added. These details add some weight to the proposition that the Association was a club or salon for a relatively distinguished group of British Columbians. First, a large proportion of the members could truly be termed pioneers. Of those 31 members with identifiable dates of arrival on the west coast, 18 had arrived before the Association’s founding in 1894. Thirteen of these had arrived by 1889. Second, some members, for example, Miss Sarah Bowes (75), Walter Moberly (77), and Captain William Soule (76), were virtually historical celebrities in the Association. As celebrities, they were not only the Association’s senior members, but along with Mrs. Sarah McGillivray (c.49) and Mrs. Sara McLagan (54), were renowned as living notable figures from British Columbia’s still very young history.

Sarah Bowes, for example, arrived in Vancouver in 1888. As the city’s first “social worker,” she worked through the Methodist and other churches and organizations such as the W.C.T.U. and the Alexandra Orphanage. Walter Moberly, “the last of the great pathfinders of the Canadian West,” had surveyed the Province for the C.P.R., looking

---

20 The Art, Historical and Scientific Association, amongst the five associations researched, also had the broadest age range amongst members, and the highest low age. The lowest and highest recorded age for the years noted in the text above, and the range, for each association was as follows: Art, Historical and Scientific Association (33-77, 44); Naturalists’ Field Club (21-63, 42); Arts and Crafts Association (26-61, 35); YMCA (21-54, 33); and Burrard Literary Club (28-50, 22).


unsuccessfully for a pass through the Rocky Mountains. Captain Soule, had mined for gold in the Cariboo in 1862 and had lived and worked in Vancouver since 1869, when it was but a lumber-milling village named Granville.23 Sarah McGillivray, daughter of a trader at Fort Douglas, B.C., was the first white child born at the Fort.24 Finally, Sara McLagan, was Irish-born but raised in B.C. since 1855 with the founding of New Westminster, B.C. Her father, Sergeant John Maclure, C.E., was one of the builders of the Cariboo Road. She was famed as the province’s first lady telegrapher and, later, its first woman newspaper publisher (of the World that she inherited from her husband).25

As historical notables, their presence lent considerable prestige to the Association. It also, in effect, gave them an honourable and sympathetic club “home,” with company who might truly recognize their contributions to British Columbia’s economic and social development. Their presence also probably served to attract ambitious, younger, but equally notable, men and women to the advantages of Association membership. For example, the new President, prominent lawyer and historian, F. C. Wade (49), the next President, in 1910, and again an historian, Judge Frederick Howay (42), and the youngest member, dentist Dr. George Telford (33), were all relative newcomers to the Association. Each, of course, with the other members, contributed to the heady air of distinction that separated this society from the others.

4.4. MIXING GENDER: IMPLICATIONS FOR ORGANIZATIONAL SUCCESS

In the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, men and women held regular memberships, and ostensibly equal organizational power. This situation ran counter to the mode, still common, of regular membership for men, and of powerless and supportive auxiliary status for women. Regular and equal membership, for the Association’s women, gave them political opportunity to ensure that their needs, interests, and skills were met and used. They could anticipate participation at any level and through all functions of the Association, from audience to lecturer, and from regular member to Association President. This gender mix, and its apparent equality, nevertheless may also have contributed, in the end, to the Association’s only limited success.

24 Ibid., pp. 914-916.
Women, for instance comprised 30.2 per cent of the 1909 membership; 13 versus 30 men. Though they were fewer in number than the men, their low numbers belied their recognized importance to the life and survival of the Art, Historical and Scientific Association.

These women were so important to the Association that Gertrude Mellon, a long-time member and promoter, credited them with the very survival of cultural enlightenment in Vancouver. Sardonically, she recalled that:

in one period of its history it was decided to despense [sic] with the aid of the ladies, and the male element, as being the more aggressive, undertook to pilot the ship. Naturally, the result was almost entire shipwreck. Suffice to say that the ladies came to the rescue in 1894.26

Thus, the Association had re-incorporated the women members, who through their hard work and dedication, and who through their community-wide network in the Local Council of Women, were seen as critical to the Association’s success. So entrenched did these women become that upon invitation on November 27, 1894, the Association affiliated with and sent delegates to the new Local Council of Women. This Council, for many years, was the major co-ordinating body of Vancouver’s women’s organizations. It developed a reputation in its labours for social reform especially regarding women and children.27 The Art, Historical and Scientific Association even provided meeting space for the Council, for a small fee. Many of these women were prominent in Associational life, several assuming executive positions. Mrs. Sara McLagan, for instance, was Vice-President for several years and was the Association’s first woman President in 1903.28

As with organized women throughout the English-speaking world, Art, Historical and Scientific Association women saw themselves as imbued with the natural and supreme responsibility to be the “mothers” of the nation, as well as of the home. As “mothers,” it was their responsibility to ensure that men were civilized and refined to protect them, and

26Mellon, “History Art and Science,”
28Art, Historical and Scientific Association Minutes, 27 November 1894, 26 February 1895, 20 January 1903. The second woman President, Mrs. J. W. Weart, was not elected to that post until after the First World War. Robinson, First Cultural Association, 1946), p. 14, described Mrs. Weart’s presidency as “recent” past (before 1944).
the world as a whole, against the worst effects of material civilization, industrialization, and urbanization. Fearing "national degeneration," they sought order and good taste in an increasingly disordered and tasteless world.\textsuperscript{29}

Gertrude Mellon's argument that the Art, Historical and Scientific Association's survival depended upon men and women working together belies, apparently, the Association's only limited impact on the city, and its difficulty attracting members and funding. Social impact, longevity, and a solid and growing membership, for such turn-of-the-century mutual enlightenment organizations as the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, required separate spheres for men and women. Regardless of an organization's ideals and even its connections to "Society" and to other powerful organizations, a mixed membership imposed clear limits on the practice of those ideals. For the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, it is probably true that the "ladies", with conviction and available leisure time, were able to serve as footsoldiers in as major a campaign as putting on both the members-oriented programme and in soliciting for and setting up the city's first museum and art gallery. However, as footsoldiers, (and this is not to diminish their continuous presence on the Executive), women never lectured before the Association, except once,\textsuperscript{30} nor officially assumed curatorial duties in the Museum.

Perhaps they did not think they had the necessary education or experience to successfully work in an intellectual capacity with their more highly educated male colleagues. Such a reason, however, did not stop the Women's Canadian Club from having women as seven of its seventeen speakers in their 1912-13 season,\textsuperscript{31} for instance.

In fact, of the ten organizations under study, those most long lasting or most attractive to new members were single gender organizations. The only possible exception, among the ten under study, was the B.C. Mountaineering Club. Even it, however, never grew to the massive size of the single gender organizations. The single gender associations

\textsuperscript{29}Veronica Jane Strong-Boag, \textit{The Parliament of Women: The National Council of Women of Canada, 1893-1929}, National Museum of Man Mercury Series, History Division Paper No. 18 (Ottawa: National Museums of Canada, 1976), discusses the concerns and reform programmes of the National Council of Women of Canada. On page 228, for example, she briefly outlines the case for the Women's Art Association of Canada, whose concerns included reviving traditional handicrafts as part of "their desire to restore simpler standards of behaviour."

\textsuperscript{30}The one exception was Mrs. MacNaughton's 1914 members-only talk on "Hawaii." See AHSA, \textit{Journal}, p. 14.

\textsuperscript{31}\textit{Annual Report, Women's Canadian Club, Vancouver, B.C.}, [1913], p. 10-11, Pamphlet 1913-5, VCA.
could count their members in the hundreds rather than in the tens or the hundred-odd members of the mixed associations. The two other mixed gender organizations, the Arts and Crafts Association, and the Naturalists’ Field Club, lasted less than two years. The latter never gained more than 17 members. Even the Art, Historical and Scientific Association’s intimate connections to the powerful Local Council of Women could not seem to overcome the apparently negative effects of mixing men and women in the same organization.

Other organizations, such as the aggressive, and clearly business-oriented (and “manly”) Progress Club, could get large amounts of funding from the City. In contrast, the Art, Historical and Scientific Association had always struggled, almost begging, for support. Moreover, the Association, like women in general, could be accorded public respect and official praise, for its cultural and aesthetic expertise. Nonetheless, the Association had to suffer the indignity of having the Mayor and two aldermen appointed to its Board of Directors as part of the City’s arrangement to provide Museum facilities in the new Library.

With women as Association Directors, in combination with “less manly” artists and educators (rather than with more “manly” and “competent” businessmen), did the City Council not fully trust the Association to make the “best” decisions? Also, as desirous and as competent as were the Association’s members to influence the city’s cultural development, why did they lack the requisite power and respect to do so? Further research, here, is warranted, especially by comparing many organizations, and by analyzing prevailing attitudes towards the efficacy of mixed gender (or class or ethnic origin), as opposed to single gender (or comparable social category), organizational composition.

4.5. ASSOCIATION MEMBERS AS SOCIAL AND OCCUPATIONAL ELITES

The Association’s members’ occupational and “elite” status within Vancouver and the province further suggests their qualification as a “clerisy.” Tables 2 and 3, following, show that Association members were consistently representative of the higher reaches of Vancouver society. Sixty-five per cent of the employed members were professionals. They ranged in occupation from teachers to physicians, lawyers to a Methodist Church deaconess (the only employed female, similar to a social worker32), and included Vancouver General

32 For a complete description of the role and responsibilities of this incipient profession see: John D. Thomas, “Servants of the Church: Canadian Methodist Deaconess Work, 1890-1926,” Canadian
Hospital and Employers' Association administrators, among others. The other nine employed members came from the business community. All owned or managed their own business concerns. One of the latter was a Fraser Valley farmer.

These businessmen, however, were exceptionally interested in cultural or intellectual affairs. They were often well educated and strongly interested in historical or scientific topics, and some had had extraordinary life experiences (the Indian mutiny [Capt. Mellon], the Fenian raids [Prof. Edward Odlum], or the merchant marine [Capt. Soule]). Even the women, through their own or a relative's (e.g., husband's) occupation, and retired men, through their former occupation, roughly fit this pattern. Women and retired men, however, were distributed differently from the other members. Except for the wives of two prominent lawyers, all were related to persons who had substantial business interests.
### TABLE 2.

**OCCUPATIONS OF ART, HISTORICAL AND SCIENTIFIC ASSOCIATION MEMBERS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Occupational Type</th>
<th>AHSA Member’s Occupation n (%</th>
<th>AHSA Relative’s Occupation n (%)</th>
<th>AHSA Member Business Fame n (%)</th>
<th>Vancouver Business Elite n (%)</th>
<th>Toronto Business Elite n (%)</th>
<th>Vancouver Census 1911 n</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Professional</td>
<td>18 (66.7)</td>
<td>3 (21.4)</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>24 (8.9)</td>
<td>(36.8)</td>
<td>3971</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educator</td>
<td>3 (11.1)</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>(13.0)</td>
<td>508</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lawyer</td>
<td>2 (7.4)</td>
<td>2 (14.3)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>(11.6)</td>
<td>254</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physician</td>
<td>2 (3.7)</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>(4.7)</td>
<td>168</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dentist</td>
<td>1 (3.7)</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Artist</td>
<td>1 (3.7)</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>(5.4)</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Architect</td>
<td>2 (7.4)</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>(2.5)</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Civil Engineer</td>
<td>1 (3.7)</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td>179</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clergy</td>
<td>1 (3.7)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>(9.6)</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deaconness</td>
<td>1 (3.7)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Account’t</td>
<td>1 (3.7)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td>295</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Profes’</td>
<td>7 (7.4)</td>
<td>1 (7.1)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gov’t Official</td>
<td>1 (3.7)</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>civil eng.</td>
<td>477</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Insurance</td>
<td>2 (7.4)</td>
<td>2 (14.3)</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>35 (13.0)</td>
<td>(22.4)</td>
<td>147</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Banking</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Real Est.</td>
<td>2 (7.4)</td>
<td>1 (7.1)</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>14 (5.2)</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>1331</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commerce</td>
<td>2 (7.4)</td>
<td>3 (21.4)</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>63 (23.4)</td>
<td>(5.0)</td>
<td>2040</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transportation</td>
<td>2 (7.4)</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6 (2.2)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Builder</td>
<td></td>
<td>2 (14.3)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>19 (7.1)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>855</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufact’r</td>
<td></td>
<td>2 (14.3)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>53 (19.7)</td>
<td>(20.0)</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farm Owner</td>
<td>1 (3.7)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>216</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misc</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>5 (1.8)</td>
<td>(5.8)</td>
<td>41653</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td>25 (100)</td>
<td>14 (100)</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>269 (100)</td>
<td>277</td>
<td>50628</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**NOTES:**

1. Column one: occupations were determined from biographical data. See footnote 5. Occupational types, and Vancouver and district census data (1911), were derived from Canada, *Fifth Census of Canada, 1911*, vol. 6: *Occupations of the People* (Ottawa: J. De L. Tache, 1915), pp. 286-296. This census division includes Vancouver city, and Vancouver’s immediate and contiguous suburbs, North and South Vancouver and Point Grey.

2. Column two: for those members fully employed in their own business or profession.

3. Column three: for non-employed wives, widows, and a live-in aunt of employed relatives.

4. Column four: the established or recognized fame of Association members was determined by each member’s having been publicly recognized through a published biography or newspaper or magazine story. See footnote 5 for references and Table 3 for details. Note, the Association’s three educators, listed in the table, were educational leaders, not teachers.


* The proportion of Toronto elites within the occupational type marked with an asterisk (“*”) was included within the occupational type immediately above in Tepperman’s study. Therefore, read the percentage figure immediately above the asterisk as including those marked “*”:*
More significantly, especially as regards their “elite” status, almost one-fourth (10 of 41) were or were closely related to Vancouver’s 276 “business leaders.” These business leaders, identified by R. A. J. McDonald for the 1910-13 period, represented the top segment of Vancouver’s business community. They were also either members of, or closely connected to, the city’s “social upper class.” Four of these ten members were clearly members of that upper class: Lieutenant-Colonel J. Duff Stuart, vice-president, Clarke and Stuart, stationers; Frederick C. Wade, barrister; Miss Eliza P. Edge, aunt of W. H. Malkin, wholesale grocer, descendent of the Knight of Hastings; and Dr. William Rear, physician (retired), father of James S. Rear, president, North American Securities.

Equally significant, 34 of the 41 (82.9 per cent) of the members achieved—or were close relatives of achievers of—city, provincial, or national recognition, or any combination, thereof. Such recognition or fame was established through having one’s biography published in one of the Who’s Who, histories, or newspaper articles mentioned above, or both. “Fame,” as Lorne Tepperman has asserted for the early part of this century, came by “two pathways.” “One [pathway was] through economic power attained in business, and the other [was] through a variety of activities that might be construed as public service.”

It is this latter pathway to fame, through “public service,” which appears to be most critical in identifying the Art, Historical and Scientific Association members as a “clerisy.” Non-business vocational or avocational interests bring into full relief the implications of Tepperman’s assertion. In particular, Tepperman has noted the significance of “moral worth and family respectability.” “Moral excellence,” he asserted, “is invoked to compensate for a shortage of cash...[S]uch balancing of virtues [with wealth within a closed

---

33The concept “elite” was purposefully selected. An “old word,” originating with the notion of being “elected,” first by man, later by God, and of being a member of the “elect,” “elite” came to be used in the nineteenth century to mean the “best” and had its synonyms in Coleridge’s “clerisy,” J. S. Mill’s “the wisest,” and Arnold’s “the best” and “the remnant.” As Raymond Williams judges: “The significance...is the assumed distinction of such groupings from existing and powerful social formations.” See Raymond Williams, Keywords: A Vocabulary of Culture and Society, 2d ed. (London: Fontana, 1976; Flamingo, 1983).
34Close relations means three wives, one father, and one live-in aunt.
35McDonald, “Business Leaders.”
37Ibid., pp. 371.
38Vancouver Sun, 31 December 1943, M2738, VCA.
community] is a valuable, even necessary means of controlling envy and conflict..."41

As his listing of occupations of the elite shows, the very occupations, and especially the spread across the professions, is remarkably similar to that of the Art, Historical and Scientific Association's membership. Thus, in the case of the Association's "business leader" members, many had received their recognition for their educational and social accomplishments alongside, rather than because of their economic accomplishments. Two of those named by McDonald as leaders (not relatives), real estate agent and educator, Professor Edward Odum, and barrister and historian, F. C. Wade, could claim fame on both economic and "moral" (i.e., social) grounds.

TABLE 3.

SOCIAL PRESTIGE OF ART, HISTORICAL AND SCIENTIFIC ASSOCIATION MEMBERS THROUGH PUBLISHED BIOGRAPHIES OR AS A "BUSINESS LEADER"

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>AHSA Relationship</th>
<th>Business Leader</th>
<th>Who</th>
<th>Scholefield &amp; Gosnell</th>
<th>Gosnell 1906</th>
<th>Morgan 1913</th>
<th>Newspaper all years</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1910-13 n</td>
<td>1911, 12 n</td>
<td>n</td>
<td>n</td>
<td>n</td>
<td>n</td>
<td>n</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Member</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relative</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SOURCES: McDonald, "Business Leaders;" Parker, Who's Who in Western Canada, vol. 1 (1911); Parker, Who's Who and Why, vol. 2 (1912); Scholefield and Howay, British Columbia Biographical, vols. 3, 4; Gosnell, History of British Columbia; Morgan, Canadian Men and Women; and obituaries and other newspaper stories was from the Vancouver City Archives, Newspaper Files, Major Matthew's Collection.

Of the 41 members, five received no recognition, and of the 36 recognized, three are recognized only through relatives, not for themselves. Thus of the 41, only 33 received direct personal recognition through one or more sources. With the Newspapers category, only members who have had stories written about themselves are recorded, except for one case where the only story concerned the member's husband, not her.

41Ibid., p. 137. Note here, "moral," in the nineteenth-century, was understood as we now mean "social." Compare the nineteenth-century phrase "moral economy." Did Tepperman use "moral" as a substitute for "social," or did he use it as we now use the word, or as some at the turn of the century were wont, did he imply, ambiguously, both meanings?
4.6. CLASS THROUGH RESIDENCE: ASSOCIATION MEMBERS AND THE BUSINESS ELITES

Somewhat surprisingly, Association members virtually replicated the residential distribution of the city’s leading businessmen. After all, most were employed in salaried and professional work, rather than in more lucrative commerce. As a group they probably lacked the substantial wealth owned by the city’s leading business families. As Table 4 shows, 56.1 per cent of Association members lived in the highly desirable West End; almost as many as the 58.4 of the business leaders who lived there. The remaining members, for the most part, were scattered in the next most desirable areas of Fairview Heights, Kitsilano, and the earlier settled but still desirable parts of the downtown area (sandwiched between the undesirable Yaletown to the south-west and Strathcona to the east). The only exceptions within the city were Reverend Fraser, who lived at his Strathcona church, First Presbyterian, and Professor Odium, who was making a small fortune developing the east side’s Grandview area. Only when compared to the upper class was there a difference in residence. Most of that group, some 78.4 per cent, lived inside the West End (and to an almost insignificant extent, Point Grey).

Clearly then, Association members indicated through their choice of living arrangements that they considered themselves part of the city’s higher classes. Only the wealth and the “superior” family backgrounds of some upper class residents served to militate against Association members.

---

42McDonald, “Business Leaders,” p. 260. The West End, as designated here includes both the West End and the Seaton Street (now West Hastings) area.
### TABLE 4.

RESIDENTIAL DISTRIBUTION OF ART, HISTORICAL AND SCIENTIFIC ASSOCIATION MEMBERS COMPARED TO VANCOUVER BUSINESS LEADERS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Residential District</th>
<th>AHSA Members</th>
<th>Business Leaders 1910-13</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>n (%)</td>
<td>n (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West End</td>
<td>23 (56.1)</td>
<td>129 (58.4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Downtown</td>
<td>8 (19.5)</td>
<td>43 (19.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fairview</td>
<td>4 (9.8)</td>
<td>14 (6.3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kitsilano</td>
<td>1 (2.4)</td>
<td>5 (2.3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grandview</td>
<td>1 (2.4)</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strathcona</td>
<td>1 (2.4)</td>
<td>6 (2.7)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Westminster/Fraser Valley</td>
<td>3 (7.3)</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>17 (7.8)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>41 (100)</strong></td>
<td><strong>221 (100)</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

NOTE: The comparison is to Vancouver's business leaders, as assessed by McDonald, “Business Leaders,” p. 260.

### 4.7. ASSOCIATION MEMBERS: AN EDUCATIONAL ELITE

Art, Historical and Scientific Association members were highly educated. This pattern appears to be a key indicator of their self-perceived and probably actual status as a “clerisy.” Of those members for whom data is available (see Table 5), the evidence suggests that Association members had received much more formal education than had Vancouver’s business leaders, or even the social upper class. Most (50 per cent) had attended university or college, or had received a commensurate professional education, compared to 33 per cent of the city’s business leaders. Such a large proportion also clearly exceeded the proportion of the general population with any post-secondary education. By comparing school levels attained by urban residents of Manitoba, it is estimated that only four to eight per cent of British Columbia’s urban population had 13 years of schooling or more.43

---

43Canada, Dominion Bureau of Statistics, *Seventh Census of Canada, 1931*, vol. 12 (Ottawa: Edmond Cloutier, Printer to the King's Most excellent Majesty, 1942), p. 741. This estimate is drawn from Manitoba age group and school achievement figures of the same age cohorts as surviving Art, Historical and Scientific Association members. Association members' mean age of 54, would have roughly corresponded to the Manitoba (1936) age group of 80-85. The youngest
Such superior educational status, in comparison with the Association members' social “superiors,” lends credence to their claiming an honourable position in the city’s elite class, and to their serving as a clerisy. Further evidence supports this proposition. For example, several had or would publish books, pamphlets, or journal and newspaper articles. They were often recognized as local, or even national, experts in their chosen vocation or avocation. Finally, most Association members extended their expertise, influence, and community spirit by participating in and often providing leadership through many city educational, reform, and charity boards and associations.

TABLE 5.

EDUCATIONAL BACKGROUND OF ART, HISTORICAL AND SCIENTIFIC ASSOCIATION MEMBERS COMPARED TO VANCOUVER BUSINESS LEADERS AND THE SOCIAL UPPER CLASS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Educational Attainment</th>
<th>AHSA Members</th>
<th>Business Leaders 1910-13</th>
<th>Social Upper Class</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>University/Law Accountancy</td>
<td>11 (50.0)</td>
<td>50 (33.1)</td>
<td>34 (48.6)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High School/ Art or Business College</td>
<td>8 (36.3)</td>
<td>42 (27.8)</td>
<td>19 (27.1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grade School/ Apprenticeship</td>
<td>3 (13.6)</td>
<td>59 (39.1)</td>
<td>17 (24.3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>22 (100)</td>
<td>151 (100)</td>
<td>70 (100)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

NOTE: Column three, Social Upper Class, combines both McDonald’s social upper class categories, that is, the upper class including both economic elite and non-elite businessmen. See “Business Leaders,” pp. 211, 229. Of the 22 Art, Historical and Scientific Association members for whom educational data was available, none was available for the 13 women and for nine other men. There were 44 members in total.

To vividly convey some of the flavour of their accomplishments and related activities, we will detail the individual members and their education. Moreover, we will outline their publications as evidence of the seriousness with which members expressed

\[^{43}\text{(cont'd) Association member, age 33, would have fallen into the 60-65 age group. The Manitoba figures for these two groups, respectively, were 5.54 per cent and 8.29 per cent.}\]
their interests. Finally, and in keeping with their role as a clerisy, and their desire to share their knowledge, interests, and experience with other social and educational activists, we will outline members' connections and involvement with other community organizations.

As Table 5 shows, 50 per cent (11 members), of the 22 members leaving records of educational background, were university graduates or held the professional equivalence (law or accountancy). More striking, at least six (27.3 per cent) of the university graduates held advanced degrees: William Burns, a teacher, and "Professor" Edward Odium, formerly a headmaster and in 1909 a financial and real estate agent, had M.A.s from London and Victoria (Toronto) Universities, respectively; George Boggs and William Rear held M.D.s or equivalent; George Telford had a D.D.S. from Pennsylvania; and Reverend Hugh Fraser had a Doctorate in Divinity. Other university graduates included F. W. Howay who studied law at Dalhousie; F. C. Wade, a barrister, with a B.A. from Toronto; and J. Duff Stuart, a businessman, and R. P. S. Twizell, an architect, who studied at Aberdeen and Durham, respectively. Robert Waller, the eleventh man, was an accountant, although no specifics of his education are available.

Just below that level of attainment were another five (22.7 per cent) of the 22 who had received advanced education or professional apprenticeship training. John Kyle, school district art supervisor, had studied at the Royal College of Art in London and at Julian's Studio in Paris. Tom Wilson, a horticulturalist and superintendent at the Dominion Fumigation Station, studied at the Edinburgh College of Art. School principal Robert Sparling trained at the Goderich (Ontario) Model School. Professional apprenticeships were carried out by R. Mackey Fripp in architecture in London and by Walter Moberly in civil

---

44McDonald, "Business Leaders," p. 211, equated law and accountancy, often gained through extensive apprenticeships to working professionals. He did not include other professions, notably architecture, engineering, or teaching, to be equivalent. This may have been because there were no business leaders as primary practitioners in those professions. However, researchers in occupational stratification tend to locate these latter three professions in the second tier of occupations, beneath those including medicine, law, and usually, accountancy. For examples see Michael B. Katz, The People of Hamilton, Canada West: Family and Class in the Mid-Nineteenth-Century City (Cambridge, Mass. & London, England: Harvard University Press, 1975), pp. 343-48, for Hamilton, Ontario in the 1850s and 1860s; George S. Counts, "The Social Status of Occupations: A Problem in Vocational Guidance," The School Review: A Journal of Secondary Education 33, 1 (January 1925): 16-27, for the United States in the 1920s; and W. A. Armstrong, "The Use of Information About Occupation," in Nineteenth-century Society: Essays in the Use of Quantitative Methods for the Study of Social Data, ed. E. A. Wrigley (Cambridge, U.K.: University Press, 1972), pp. 191-254, especially 214-23, for York, England, in 1841/1851, 1921, and 1951.
engineering and survey in Toronto. Three others received education or training in post
grade school institutions: Frank Burnett, Sr., an insurance agent (Merchant Tailors’ School,
Liverpool); H. J. deForest, an artist and Museum Curator (Sackville Academy, New
Brunswick); and A. E. Goodman, a journalist and secretary-treasurer of the Employers’
Association (St. Catharines Collegiate Institute, Ontario). Captains Mellon and Soule, and
also Burnett, apprenticed as sailors, among other trades, after receiving public school
educations in England. Finally, Willie Dalton, owner and manager of Mainland Transfer
and Vancouver Warehouse, received his education at “public schools” in Huddersfield,
England.\textsuperscript{45}

Along with this pattern of high educational attainment, the educational portrait
shows a representative spread of education and training across most disciplines (Wilson
studied biology and horticulture at Edinburgh), professions, and trades. As regards both
occupation and education, the Art, Historical and Scientific Association appears as if it were
a representative council, albeit self-selected, rather than a collection of peers of similar
backgrounds. This is all the more remarkable since the available evidence suggests that
there were no overt attempts to balance the membership.

Members’ educational backgrounds naturally predisposed them to certain specialized
interests within the Association. For some, their specialized interests also accorded them a
status of local, and even national, experts. Many lectured at Association meetings, often
several times. Some, notably Professor Odium (anthropology, sociology, science,
thology),\textsuperscript{46} Professor Hill-Tout (anthropology),\textsuperscript{47} Judge Howay (history),\textsuperscript{48} Walter Moberly

\textsuperscript{45}No attempt will be made here to defend whether or not such “public school” educations were in
the traditional British sense of being privately funded.
\textsuperscript{46}Odum was famed in British Columbia particularly, as a “theologian, scientist and educationist of
international [?] reputation,” a British-Israelite and Imperialist. He published newspaper articles,
 pamphlets, and at least two books. His pamphlets included: “Who are the Japanese?,” “Who are
the Saxons?,” “Great Britain Great,” “The Cone-Shaped Holes of Bandal-Sun,” and a critique of
Campbell’s “New Theology.” His books were \textit{God’s Covenant Man}, and \textit{The Old Book Stands} which
had “been running serially in a London weekly, the National Message.” (VCA, M6919, Professor
Edward Odulm).
\textsuperscript{47}Hill-Tout’s writings included: “Later Prehistoric Man in British Columbia,” “The Cosmogony of
the Squamish,” “The Oceanic Affinities of the Salish Tribes of British Columbia,” all published in
the \textit{Proceedings of the Royal Society of Canada}, and two monographs on “Totemism,” also
published by the Royal Society. (Scholefield and Howay, B.C. Biographical, vol. 4, p. 1197).
\textsuperscript{48}Howay was a notable provincial historian, co-authoring with E. O. S. Scholefield a two-volume
history of British Columbia, and his own \textit{British Columbia: The Making of a Province}, 1929. (VCA,
M4304, Judge Howay).
(history), 49 F. C. Wade (history and politics), 50 Frank Burnett (natural history and anthropology—Pacific islands), 51 and John "Wildwood" Winson (natural history), 52 had or would publish pamphlets, articles, and books. Such scholarly activity, amateur and professional, along with the work of collecting for, organizing, and maintaining the Museum, is suggestive of the dedication and interest of some of the city's more influential persons.

Association members, through their substantial expenditure of time and energy, were committed to their cause. They must have believed it their duty to bring culture, enlightenment, and a sense of national consciousness to this economic dynamo of west coast British Columbia.

The dedication and purpose of Association members was not limited to Association work only. The 1909 members belonged to and supported other mutual enlightenment and reform organizations, an obvious indication of their desire to provide leadership or to directly influence the aesthetic, intellectual, social, and moral affairs of the city and its political, commercial, and industrial leaders. The Association had members in the Arts and Crafts Association, the Naturalist Field Club, the Women's Musical Club, the Canadian Club and Women's Canadian Club, the YMCA and YWCA, the Daughters of the Empire, and the Local Council of Women, all with wholly or in part mutual enlightenment aims. Memberships were also held in numerous other reform or aid organizations (e.g., Victorian Moberly was more famous for his exploits in exploring the province. He also had published in local newspapers his lectures to the Art, Historical and Scientific Association in 1908, and in the Canadian Club proceedings. For instance, his Art, Historical and Scientific Association publications, both in 1908, included: "The History of the Cariboo Wagon Road" and "The Early History of the Canadian Pacific Railroad." His published address before the Vancouver Canadian Club, in 1909 was: "The Discovery of the Northwest Passage by Land," Proceedings of the Canadian Club of Vancouver, 1906-1908 (Vancouver: The News-Advertiser, [1908]) pp. 40-54. He was a prolific speech-giver in Vancouver before his death in 1915. (VCA, Add. Mss. 33, Walter Moberly; Journal, pp. 9, 11-12).


51 Burnett, a traveller of the "South Seas" and an amateur ethnographer of Polynesian culture, had collected artifacts (which he donated to the University of British Columbia, receiving an LL.D. in November, 1929) and wrote four books, three of which are: Through Polynesia and Papua, Through Tropic Seas, and Summer Isles of Eden. (VCA, M1322, Burnett, Dr. Frank, LL.D., F.R.G.S.)

52 Winson was a nature writer for the Province. He also published two books: Weather and Wings, 1932, and Wildwood Trails, 1946. (VCA, M10490).
Order of Nurses, Hospital Auxiliary) and social and business organizations and clubs (e.g., Vancouver Club, Commercial Club, Masons). Three members had also been successful politically: Odlum as an Alderman and Library Board appointee; Howay and Dr. Boggs as school trustees in New Westminster (1894). In all, some 26 of 28 identifiable members had secondary organizational memberships. Eleven were members of social reform or aid societies.

With contacts spread so widely, there was ample opportunity to spread their influence throughout the community. So important was this desire and capacity for a community presence, it was usually recognized in member’s biographies. There they were praised, for example, as “modest,” “faithful,” “unselfish,” and “in the front rank...lead[ing] the way to a more humane civilization.” Such community activity and contact would have been particularly important since most of that community never directly joined the Art, Historical and Scientific Association.

4.8. PAX BRITANNICA: THE BRITISH CONNECTION

Association members were also much more British than were the business leaders. Almost 58 per cent of the Association’s members had been born in the British Isles (England, Scotland, Ireland) as opposed to only 42.4 per cent born in Canada (see Table 6). There were no Americans or other nationalities in the sample, though as discussed, there had been individuals of “other” nationalities, including a few prominent European Jews, and Japanese diplomats and a minister of religion. Remarkably, only 34 per cent of the city’s 1910-13 business leaders were of British Isles origin. Fifty-four per cent were Canadian born; 5.9 per cent American. This difference is even more remarkable in that the national origin for business leaders had shown a substantial shift from British Isles born to Canadian born (47.5 per cent British Isles born and 33.9 per cent Canadian born in 1890-93), while the Association’s membership probably remained relatively stable. Among even new Association members arriving in Vancouver after 1900, British Isles-born members outnumbered Canadian-born members six to four. The character of the Association, therefore, was markedly British, especially English, and strong enough as such to continue to attract its majority from British Isles immigrants.

53VCA, M551, Macaulay, Mrs. James.
TABLE 6.

NATIONAL ORIGINS OF ART, HISTORICAL AND SCIENTIFIC ASSOCIATION MEMBERS COMPARED TO VANCOUVER BUSINESS LEADERS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Birthplace</th>
<th>AHSA Members</th>
<th>Business Leaders 1910-13</th>
<th>Vancouver Census 1911</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>n (%)</td>
<td>n (%)</td>
<td>n (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
<td>19 (57.6)</td>
<td>75 (34.3)</td>
<td>39,883 (31.9)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>England</td>
<td>12 (36.4)</td>
<td>36 (16.4)</td>
<td>23,495 (18.9)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scotland</td>
<td>6 (18.2)</td>
<td>27 (12.3)</td>
<td>12,085 (9.8)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ireland</td>
<td>1 (3.0)</td>
<td>6 (2.7)</td>
<td>3,182 (2.6)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wales, etc.</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>6 (2.8)</td>
<td>606 (0.5)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>14 (42.4)</td>
<td>119 (54.3)</td>
<td>53,335 (43.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ontario</td>
<td>10 (30.3)</td>
<td>75 (26.8)</td>
<td>19,641 (15.9)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nova Scotia</td>
<td>2 (6.1)</td>
<td>14 (6.4)</td>
<td>2,968 (2.4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Brunswick</td>
<td>1 (3.0)</td>
<td>10 (4.6)</td>
<td>2,735 (2.2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>British Columbia</td>
<td>1 (3.0)</td>
<td>6 (2.2)</td>
<td>18,304 (14.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Canada</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>15 (5.5)</td>
<td>7,276 (5.8)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>U. S. A.</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>14 (5.9)</td>
<td>12,435 (10.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rest of World</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>12 (5.7)</td>
<td>21,675 (18.3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>33 (100)</strong></td>
<td><strong>220 (100)</strong></td>
<td><strong>123,435 (100)</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


This evidence suggests a probable curricular pre-occupation with British and Imperialist values and traditions. Not being capitalists or entrepreneurs, for the most part, these newcomers to Canada (or at least to the west coast) needed some means by which to establish and maintain those values and traditions, and to mark their presence in the community. By virtue of their professional training and advanced education, as well as their family background, they could best secure their own social position by contributing their own intellectual, aesthetic, organizational, and moral resources to cultivate and to civilize an already and extremely materialistic society.

Mrs. Gertrude Mellon, a driving force of the Association (along with her husband), could claim a distinctiveness (and perhaps superiority) of vision in Vancouver by virtue of
her family and personal background. She was well connected by birth and family to London, England, and to professional circles. These connections notably included her cousin, Dr. Hyde Clarke—engineer, government attaché to Constantinople, “celebrated linguist,” and newspaperman—and Professor Bull, an associate of “Lord Kelvin on the first Atlantic Cable Expedition.” Mrs. Mellon, herself, though London born, was raised on a farm near Meaford, Ontario. Her father was “uniformly styled ‘Gentleman Clarke’ because of his gracious and courtly manner.” Both Mrs. Mellon and her father had had mutual enlightenment experience. He was an inventor devoted to “scientific farming” and a member of the “Anti-Mephitic and Sanitary Association.” She, prior to her move to Vancouver in 1886, had been a member of a Winnipeg art society.\textsuperscript{55}

Other members repeated Gertrude Mellon’s family history and personal experiences as exemplary of their claim to a special leadership position in Vancouver society. R. Mackay Fripp, for instance, was the son of George Arthur Fripp, court painter to Queen Victoria and Prince Albert.\textsuperscript{56} William Burns’ father, William Burns, M.A., LL.D., was principal of a grammar school in Rochester, England.\textsuperscript{57} Finally, Captain Henry Augustus Mellon, as well as being a Vancouver pioneer, had spent a useful (to the Empire) and colourful life prior to his arrival in Vancouver in 1886. He had spent most of his earlier life at sea in the merchant marine and with the Royal Navy. In the latter capacity, he had fought and was wounded near Lucknow, in India, during the mutiny of Indian Sepoy troops.\textsuperscript{58}

A second explanation for the British emphasis is less obvious but, perhaps, is more significant. It may be that the Art, Historical and Scientific Association and similar organizations served a function similar to that of the distinctly “ethnic” clubs and societies. Certainly, Canada was a British and Imperialist Dominion, and all its citizens were British. To boot, there were more British Isles-born adults than Canadian in Vancouver.\textsuperscript{59} However, it was the Canadians who, as a group, were the economically superior, in a local and

\textsuperscript{55}Scholefield and Howay, B.C. Biographical, vol. 3, pp. 763-64.
\textsuperscript{56}Ibid., p. 291.
\textsuperscript{57}Scholefield and Howay, B.C. Biographical, vol. 4, p. 992.
\textsuperscript{58}Scholefield and Howay, B.C. Biographical, vol. 3, pp. 758-9.
\textsuperscript{59}As Table 6, above, shows, 14 per cent of the total Vancouver population was B.C. born. It can probably be assumed that most of that figure were children, since most adult whites born in the province likely remained on the earlier settled Vancouver Island and there were few native Indians left in Vancouver.
provincial economy increasingly tied to the North American market. As historian Carl Berger has observed:

[In the Canada of 1900-14 men of learning were pushed aside in the bustling search for profit and gain. Business was predominant and set the tone for the entire community...[shutting out people like Stephen Leacock] because they did "not know how to make money."  

Canadian nationalism was beginning to assert itself, though along often conflicting lines. As Jean Barman has shown, British immigrants (and especially those in the more refined upper and middle classes) sought to establish traditional institutions such as private clubs and private preparatory and grammar schools. Through such institutions, offering both education and socialization, these British immigrants hoped to pass on and to retain their most cherished values and traditions and to forestall complete assimilation into the "pragmatic" Canadian way of life.

Adult mutual enlightenment, of the kind provided in the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, is then a valuable means of assessing "British" ethnicity in Canada.

As for the 42.4 per cent of the Art, Historical and Scientific Association members who were Canadian by birth, many had strong and sympathetic British connections and ideals. British Imperialist sentiment in Canada had been strong for decades, expressed politically, morally, and culturally. Berger, for instance, attributes to the social gospel movement a strong imperialistic spirit:

Imperial unity and church unity were...not merely analogous—they were both the products of the identical causes and directed to the same ends. Just as the union of the churches was the precondition for the Christianization of the social order, so too the unity of the Empire was necessary to maintain a political power making righteousness on earth. Both Christianity and imperialism called upon men to self-sacrifice and service; both required the allegiance to

---


62 The category "Canadian" refers to anyone born in the British North American territories which since 1867 have gradually federated into Canada.
ideals and the denigration of the material and the flesh.\footnote{Berger, \textit{Sense of Power}, p. 32.}

Distinctly patriotic associations were formed, including, in Vancouver, the Daughters of the Empire (with Mesdames Banfield, Kemp, McLagan, and Whitehead as members), the Imperial Federation League, and the League of Empire (of which Mrs. Mellon was a member). There were also the educationally-oriented organizations—local historical societies, such as the Art, Historical and Scientific Association and later the Canadian Clubs. The Canadian Clubs were a popular, national businessmen’s lunch and lecture movement that originated in Hamilton, Ontario, in 1893. In Vancouver, a Canadian Club (men’s) and a Women’s Canadian Club were founded, respectively, in 1906 and 1909. Both Vancouver clubs cast the Canadian nation within the Imperial mould.

Significantly, some 32 of the 41 Art, Historical and Scientific Association members researched, or 78 per cent, were concurrently members of the Canadian Clubs. The total overlap between the organizations probably would have been larger were it not for several Association members who did not work or live in the immediate downtown or surrounding area. Included among the Association’s Canadian Clubs members were the founding Canadian Club President, F. C. Wade; the founding Honorary Life Member, Walter Moberly (along with Governor-General Earl Grey); the 1913-14 President, Colonel J. Duff Stuart; and Women’s Canadian Club President for 1913-14, Mrs. J. J. Banfield. As Berger has noted: “The period [1882-1896] was truly the golden age of local history and the local history society....There is much to be said for regarding these historical societies as branches of the Imperial Federation League.” Berger, like Mrs. Mellon, noted the value of such societies for promoting “a cohesive national heritage,” and for inspiring national sentiment within a conception of Canadian-British nationality.\footnote{Ibid., pp. 96-97, 99.}

Like their British-born associates, Canadian-born members possessed background characteristics suggestive of strong British sympathies. Professor Odlum, for instance, had descended from a long line of loyal British army officers, stationed in Ireland since 1690 with King William of Orange, and emigrating to Canada in 1820, only to participate in quelling the 1837 rebellion. Professor Odlum, himself, had served the Empire, first against the Fenian raiders from 1866 to 1870 (for which he was recognized with a land grant in Ontario), and second by travelling throughout Britain for Canadian authorities advertising...
the advantages of immigration to Canada. He was best known, however, for his research into the “history” of the Anglo-Saxon race, and their “probable” descent from the ancient Israelite tribes scattered throughout ancient Assyria, Babylonia, and Armenia (contributing naturally to their inherited and natural “superiority”). Mrs. J. J. Banfield, on the other hand, was of United Empire Loyalist stock, born in St. Catharines, Ontario, and pioneering in Vancouver since 1891. Also from St. Catharines was A. E. Goodman, son of a prominent medical and Conservative family (his father was mayor of St. Catharines). Finally, F. C. Wade, barrister son of an Ontario Bank manager, had served Manitoba, Yukon, and British governments in various legal and social capacities, including acting as British Counsel before the Alaska Boundary Tribunal in 1903.

4.9. A NEW PATRIOTISM: THE CANADIAN CLUBS CONNECTION

The Canadian Club connection to the Art, Historical and Scientific Association was particularly significant. The advent of the Canadian Clubs in Vancouver represented, in many ways, both the success and the failure of the Association. Association members, as mentioned, were prominent both as leaders and as members within the Clubs, though both Clubs grew quickly to several hundred members.

As with the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, the Canadian Club (the men’s at least) had a distinctly British character and tone. This was not only because so many members were probably British Isles born, nor because the Club’s aim included “the making of good imperialistic citizens,” but also because its programme was too British (at least to some members). This last observation about the Club’s excessive Britishness came from a 1914 committee report (including the Art, Historical and Scientific Association’s F. C. Wade as an author) which criticized the men’s Club. Unlike its counterparts across the country, the Vancouver Canadian Club mostly ignored Canadian topics. Vancouver’s members were accused of being too “content[ed]...with sitting at the feet of distinguished visitors from

65 Scholefield and Howay, B.C. Biographical vol. 4, pp. 336, 341-2. See Chapter Three for a more extensive discussion of Odlin’s and other Association members’ belief in the racialist, and probably racist, and generally discredited, British-Israelite theory.

66 VCA, M564 Banfield, Mr. & Mrs. J. J.; VCA, Add. Mss. 54, vol. 13, file 1335, Harriet Banfield.

67 Scholefield and Howay, B.C. Biographical, vol. 4, p. 346.

68 Ibid., pp. 1149-50.

abroad....” For instance, it was claimed that for one year, Canadian topics outnumbered Imperial topics 17 to nine in Toronto, eight to one in Saint John, and eight to six in Montreal, while in Vancouver, Imperial topics outnumbered Canadian topics six to two.\(^7\)

Most significantly, however, the Canadian Clubs were seen as the best places to meet and to share ideas with the city’s most powerful, influential, and supportive business people or their wives. The Clubs had an overtly honourable purpose:

To foster patriotism by encouraging the study of institutions, history, arts, literature and resources of Canada, and by endeavouring to unite Canadians in such work for the welfare and progress of the Dominion as may be desirable and expedient.\(^7\)

They would meet over lunch, usually once or twice a month, and with two or three hundred members in attendance. There, “for their mutual entertainment,” they would hear (and “applaud”) addresses by important “authors, publicists, statesmen, [and] empire builders,” thereby creating “an esprit de corps among Canadians by encouraging members of the club to express their views on matters of interest.”\(^7\) The topical range and content of both Clubs was much narrower than that of the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, though because of their “special” position in society and their natural sensibilities, the women showed much greater latitude in their selection of topics. While the women freely discussed such topics as “A Navy for Canada,” “The Status of Women in China,” “The Tendencies of Modern Drama,” or “The Native Trees of British Columbia,”\(^7\) the men restricted themselves to mainly current Canadian and British Empire military, economic, and political issues.

The Clubs were prestigious. They attracted all those powerful people that the Art, Historical and Scientific Association had failed to entice. As with the inauguration of the Association, the official openings of the Canadian Clubs were a pageant of the most important dignitaries. These included the Governor-General, Earl Grey, and the Mayor and other prominent local citizens for both Clubs’ inaugurations. For the men’s Club, the list

\(^7\) Minutes, 3 November 1914, Canadian Club of Vancouver, vol. 3, Add. Mss. 95, VCA.
\(^7\) The Canadian Club of Vancouver. Inaugural Addresses, Constitution, and Roll of Members (Vancouver: News-Advertiser, Printer, 1907), p. 3, Pamphlet 1907-21, VCA.
\(^7\) Annual Report, Women’s Canadian Club, (Vancouver: Evans & Hastings, [1913]), pp. 10-11, Pamphlet 1913-5, VCA.
also included the Premier, Richard McBride, the Lieutenant-Governors of B.C. and Alberta, a coterie of Ministers of the Crown and sitting Members from Houses of Parliaments in Ottawa, British Columbia, Alberta, and Westminster, the consular representatives of eight nations, and numerous other lesser and local dignitaries. Unlike the dignitaries at the Art, Historical and Scientific Association's opening, many of these continued to play a significant role. For example, they addressed the Club on many opportunities, and on topics that differed substantially from those given at the Association. The speakers were also distinguished, and usually overseas, visitors.

Both the topics of address and the speakers of the men's Club, as mentioned above, caused some consternation among some members. Those upset called for much more Canadian and local content, with more freedom for members to discuss "non-politically" the national and political issues of the day. Both the Art, Historical and Scientific Association and the two Canadian Clubs slowly, but assuredly, were advancing a goal of patriotic ("one who loves and earnestly serves his country"), knowledgeable, and self-consciously Canadian citizenship. However, both organizations were still far from that other goal of "the growth...of a spirit of hearty co-operation among all classes; the determination to consolidate and solidify the varying and complex natures of her citizens into one truly national spirit...."

4.10. MUTUAL ENLIGHTENMENT: FOR SOME OR FOR ALL?

The Art, Historical and Scientific Association, founded in 1894, was organized to enlighten the adult population of Vancouver, though differentially according to social class. They sought to stimulate intellectual inquiry and aesthetic appreciation, to foster an atmosphere conducive to local scholarship, and to provide some appealing forms of recreation. This effort was all in the hope of instilling a higher level of intellectual, aesthetic, and moral awareness among Vancouver's population, the masses and philistines

4 The Canadian Club of Vancouver. Inaugural Addresses, Constitution, and Roll of Members, 1907, p. 3.
5 It is impossible to estimate the degree of this consternation nor of the consequences of the report drawn up to give voice to the concerns. World War I had intervened and the topics focussed almost solely on war issues.
6 Canadian Club Proceedings, 1911, p. 69.
alike. In particular, they aimed to overcome something of the meaner and uglier aspects of industrial capitalism, rapid urbanization, and immigration. Such effort, it was hoped, would also assure a firm British cultural base in the metropolitan centre of the province, and provide a wholesome, inspired, harmonious, and relatively democratic leaven in the civilizing process.

These “dedicated few,” socially and culturally select, made it their duty to turn the Association and Canadian Clubs into a civic forum for mutual enlightenment. They had hoped that by providing for the free and rational expression of ideas, the city and its industry might be humanized, and the city made more beautiful. Furthermore, they hoped that democracy itself would be safeguarded. Organizations like the Canadian Clubs and the Art, Historical and Scientific Association provided “a security against those evils [self-interest creeping into ‘places of high public trust’] which fasten upon every self-governing city.”

The question, however, who could be trusted with the free expression of ideas, no matter how esoteric, was never properly resolved. As Reverend Tucker commented early in the Association’s life, the public lectures were truly public, with any and all invited; even the city’s toilers could there experience the light of art, literature, and science. However, as the Association developed, it organized itself around a bi-focal pedagogy and curriculum. The Cook-Vancouver Museum and Art Gallery was organized and made public—for the “mass” public, while the “public” lectures, by their restricted locations and rather esoteric topics, remained well within the preserve of local savants and members of the “better” classes.

Democracy and liberty, it would seem, were good and certainly worthy of maintenance, but at the same time were advanced by sophisticates able to protect them. Mutuality of enlightenment, as actually practised, was seen as fine and admirable when safely conducted within socially and economically cohesive groups and classes. The mutual sharing of ideas might be dangerous, however, when extended across social, economic, and ethnic barriers. There is no direct evidence available, however, to support this last claim. Indirectly, there is the fact that many of those people from non-Anglo Saxon backgrounds, for example, the early Japanese and Jewish members, had left the Association by 1905. Also, Association member, Reverend Doctor Hugh Fraser, pastor of First Presbyterian Church, had been an instigator of the 1907 anti-Asian riot in Vancouver.

78Earl Grey, Inaugural Address, Canadian Club Proceedings, p. 8.
The lectures, conversaziones, and musical concerts of the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, the Women's Musical Club, and the men's and Women's Canadian Clubs were clearly conducive to mutual enlightenment. They were aimed at a generally committed and motivated membership. The Museum and Art Gallery, and the charity concerts, on the other hand, were marginal and less secure as vehicles for the promotion of mutual enlightenment. Their audiences were potentially less committed to mutually shared learning, and their organization and presentation of educational resources were passive. Their social compositions helped to account for this difference. The parent associations did or tried to organize or sponsor sub-groups dedicated to promoting their mutual enlightenment, to stimulate broader interest and educational use of their resources. The Art, Historical and Scientific Association built formal and mutually supportive linkages with several artistic and scientific societies and clubs. The Women's Musical Club organized and sponsored choral and orchestral societies. Nevertheless, the parent associations, as educational custodians, could control or at least influence the knowledge exchanged. Thus they exercised a subtle control over the population. They could not easily indoctrinate, however, because they could not control the self- or mutual educational practices of their audience. Thus mutual enlightenment was possible, and likely practised, by some users of the parent associations' public programme extensions.

4.11. CHANGING CONCEPTIONS OF CULTURE: DESTINY OF THE ART, HISTORICAL AND SCIENTIFIC ASSOCIATION

Sadly for the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, the rise and relative success of new, more specialized mutual enlightenment organizations condemned the Association to rather diminished existence. This destructive competition was mirrored in the rise and educational success of the Canadian Clubs, established by and for the city's elite businessmen and their wives. It is true that the Association succeeded in many ways. It organized, for example, city's Museum and first public Art Gallery and probably one of the city's most successful programmes of lectures, discussions, and musical conversaziones. Nonetheless, it ultimately failed to reach out beyond that relatively tiny group of "devoted" local scholars. While its membership never really changed until (modestly) the latter half of the 1900-10 period, with new leadership by Judge Howay and F. C. Wade, the city changed very substantially. Most crucially, perhaps, the constituency to which the Association most
needed to appeal to, the businessmen and their wives and families, had become markedly Canadian. The Association, was perhaps just too English and Romantic in its fashion to excite material progress hungry entrepreneurs. Even Stephen Leacock, that gentleman creator of "Mariposa," was by the 1900s and 1910s very much out of step with the changing times and values.

Aware that public knowledge of their existence was slipping away, the Directors in 1910 paid a reporter $2.50 per lecture, for one year, to have their proceedings published. The Directors by this time had become conscious that their long-time and cherished supporters, the city Press, were giving them less and less attention. The publicity attempt, however, likely failed or was deemed not worth the expense, for a year later the scheme was dropped. 79

One newspaper, the liberal Vancouver World, in 1913, even answered the question "What is Culture?" in a manner which must have depressed the Art, Historical and Scientific Association's "dedicated few" who read it, especially former Association President and former World publisher, Sara McLagan. According to the World:

[T]he nation needs the culture that makes for democratic, economic and ethical efficiency...[C]ulture is something else than the mastery of one's faculties and storage of treasures of knowledge. A man may have these and yet lack culture. This perhaps may most truly be regarded as the cultivation of one's whole nature, that he prefers the higher to the lower and seeks to put his achievements, especially the best in himself, unselfishly at the service of his fellow man. 80

How ironic! Culture originally had been posited as the saviour of humanity from mere Utilitarianism. Now, however it was being defined in the very language of Utilitarianism. This was a dramatic transformation. From its association with intellectual, aesthetic, scientific, and spiritual enlightenment, culture was now conceptualized as a materialistic, pragmatic pre-occupation with "democratic, economic and ethical efficiency."

To dismiss this newspaper definition is to ignore the evidence of similar transformations within the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, especially after the

79 Art, Historical and Scientific Association Minutes, 23 March 1910, 27 April 1911. The reporter was J. Francis Bursill, alias "Felix Penne," a talented and rather eccentric Art, Historical and Scientific Association member.
80 The Vancouver World, 14 October 1913, p. 8.
blows of the 1890s depression. First, and most significant, was the decision of what was a culturally elitist body of men and women to acquire public or municipal assistance in the form of grants and lodgings. The Association thus began a process which moved them from the technically private to the technically public sphere of organization, culminating in a quasi-public museum and a quasi-public lecture series through the University of British Columbia. The Association changed in other ways too. Even as they held to their perception as a “devoted few,” the Directors became increasingly concerned with running a business-like organization. At the same time, they began to retire or to detach themselves from the Association's programmes as well as from many of their former Executive responsibilities. The Museum's curator and the Association's secretary became salaried personnel. Clearly they were adopting the significant twentieth-century concepts of efficiency, democracy, specialization, and division of labour.

In the end, the Art, Historical and Scientific Association suffered from these changing conceptions of culture, education, and organization. The age of the “Renaissance Man” was coming to an end, except, of course, for dilettantes. Newer, more specialized, and increasingly bureaucratic and professionalized, organizations came into being and flourished. It is to these organizations we shall now turn.
CHAPTER 5.

ART AND NATURE

1: MUTUAL ENLIGHTENMENT FOR A PRACTICAL CULTURE

Sir L. Alma-Tadema, R.A., has emblazoned on the walls of his studio this device: "As the sun colors flowers, so art colours life." How little color then there must be in the vast majority of lives! John Ruskin says—"All great art is praise." We live in a city full of churches, is it invidious to ask "where is the art?" Echo would indeed ask, Where?¹

British Columbia is far behind in scientific research, and no one need be afraid to put his shoulder to the wheel if he can help with the work which has to be done in every branch of natural science in the province. The backwardness is not because scientific work has been neglected, but because it has not been organized.²

5.1. INTRODUCTION

The turn of the century proved significant for mutual enlightenment in Vancouver. The Art, Historical and Scientific Association had become traditional and conservative. Its lecture and discussion programmes were limited to an intellectual elite, a local "clerisy," while its Museum primarily served as an outreach to the city's "great masses." A group of voluntary organizations with more experimental, even progressive, ideas about mutual enlightenment, however, began to challenge the Art, Historical and Scientific Association's hegemony over the city's intellectual and cultural affairs. Among them were the Vancouver Arts and Crafts Association (1900-1901), the Vancouver Naturalists' Field Club (1906-07), and the Vancouver (later British Columbia) Mountaineering Club (1907-present).

The new associations were born of the same missionary zeal that characterized the

¹[Robert Mackay Fripp.] "British Columbia Letter, Number III," The Canadian Architect and Builder 8 (March 1900): 57. Fripp was probably the author of this article. This conclusion is reached because of comparative references to New Zealand in the "Letter" which announced the formation of an "Arts and Crafts Society," and because Fripp had authored a piece on Maori art in another edition of the same periodical. Fripp had twice spent time visiting and working in New Zealand. Also, he was a regular contributor to the periodical (unlike any other known Vancouver architects).

Art, Historical and Scientific Association. They drew readily from the heady élan of the Romantic movement, and from its interpreters including John Ruskin,\(^3\) quoted above. Their promoters also sought to transform and to build a new civilization on the western frontier of the British Empire. However, the new associations also set out to be more utilitarian, and more egalitarian, than was the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, their intellectual forebear. They realized that a healthy civilization should be constructed from the people and resources of Vancouver and British Columbia. Moreover, in contrast to the British patriotic mandate of the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, the new associations viewed their mandate in very local terms. Vancouver art, crafts, and architecture, and Vancouver regional flora, fauna, and geology would form the substance of their interest. And, significantly, their associations would be open to any local citizen, male or female, patrician, burgher, worker, or homemaker. Interest in the organization's subject field, and not even pre-existing skills, were the only apparent pre-requisites to membership.

Such ideals, however, left the new organizations vulnerable to the confusion and stresses of club and association members' often contradictory interests. Canadian historian Carl Berger has well captured the essence of the contradiction. Conceiving of the dual aims of Canada's nineteenth- and early twentieth-century natural history societies, Berger has argued that in Canada natural history "was born of wonder and nurtured by greed." For Canadians, natural history "combined an intellectual fascination with the strange forms of life in northern America with an intense interest in exploiting new resources."\(^4\) These interests had their origin and their heyday in Victorian Britain where natural history had attained the status of "a national obsession...books on the subject...only marginally less popular than the novels of Dickens."\(^5\) Imported to Canada by its mainly British immigrants, along with "that masterpiece of social mechanics, the natural history field club,"\(^6\) the highly popular pastime of nature study found new meaning in the unexplored, vast, Canadian wilderness. The British tradition of "appreciation for the utility of scientific knowledge [combined] with a gentle, almost reverential attitude to the natural world" was amplified.


and extended by the challenges and possibilities of the "new world." Natural history offered the opportunity for Canadians (immigrant and native-born, professional and amateur, alike) to contribute to their own and their country's new "self-reliance," and to the overall "stock of knowledge." Not without its appeal, such study also allowed naturalists to make their mark in Canada and abroad, "to assert a certain intellectual status." 7

Art, and particularly the arts and crafts movement, likewise, had reverential and utilitarian aims. "Art," according to British arts and crafts movement pioneer J. D. Sedding, "is the embodiment and communication of man's thoughts about man, nature and God. It is man's way of decorating his existence and ministering to the glory of his Maker." 8 The arts and crafts, however, when taught to and practised by the working classes, could also serve as a rebellion against and a reversal of their debased work and family lives. The machine age and capitalist economics had rendered their work mechanical and degrading, and their lives devoid of natural beauty. The arts and crafts movement, conceived in a British middle-class "crisis of conscience," 9 thus sought to rebalance the card. It aimed "to establish a society in which creative freedom was the right of all." 10 Aesthetic sensibility and creativity would temper and elevate both the physical, aesthetic, and social conditions of all classes, and the physical conditions of the urban environment.

Such dual aims—the reverential and the utilitarian—exposed the new Vancouver organizations to confusion of goals and perhaps even to dissension within the ranks. Their meaning was conveyed through such ideas as beauty, utility, the social structure, and social, political, economic, and technological change. How did beauty and utility go together in the social context? Who were the local proponents of these ideas? What did they mean and how were they used to educate both themselves and the working classes? Did they truly seek transformation of the social and political structure, or did they merely seek to proselytize the working classes in the values of the new middle classes? Finally were they truly democratic and egalitarian, or did they retain assumptions of superiority in the

8Quoted by [Fripp], "B.C. Letter, No. III," p. 57.
9Gillian Naylor, The Arts and Crafts Movement: A Study of its Sources, Ideals and Influence on Design Theory (London: Studio Vista, 1971), p. 7. Naylor argued that the movement's "motivations were social and moral, and its aesthetic values [were] derived from the conviction that a society produces the art and architecture it deserves."
transmission of knowledge and in the practice of mutual enlightenment?

This chapter, and the next, continue as a social history of ideas. These two chapters (Five and Six), however, do not merely repeat the arguments of the previous three chapters. Rather, their evidence contributes to our understanding of the strains within mutual enlightenment when attempts were made to mix quite different types of people, and to aim towards apparently contrasting programme goals. The evidence also further enriches and exemplifies the concept “mutual enlightenment.” The curricula were augmented through skills training, along with the transmission of attitudes and intellectual knowledge. As well, apprenticeship methods complemented formal classes and lectures. Finally, the bi-focal (introverted and extroverted) character of mutual enlightenment changed to serve more inclusive than exclusive curricular and membership needs.

We will argue that people’s social backgrounds and interests will explain: (a) their choice of mutual enlightenment programme and what they sought to study; (b) the ideas used for explanation and promotion of their programme; (c) the impact of their association’s programme, that is, how the knowledge produced by an association was used; and (d) their association’s or programme’s fate, whether it succeeded or failed. Notably, the Arts and Crafts Association and the Naturalists’ Field Club members’ mainly English origin explains both their associations’ foundation and the associations’ limited appeal to non-English residents. Also, the members’ mostly, but not completely, middle-class and professional background explains each associations’ curricular emphasis on skill development. Finally, the mixed composition of both organizations’ memberships (middle class and working class, professional and amateur) underlay the organizations’ short life spans. It also underlay the members’ consequential re-grouping into several associations, each with a more limited curriculum.

5.2. BREAKING GROUND: NEW CONFIGURATIONS

The new organizations were formed in the context of and in reaction to changes and lost opportunities within the Art, Historical and Scientific Association. This Association, noted Arts and Crafts Association spokesman, Robert Mackay Fripp, had devoted “little attention to the arts, probably because it is found that things historical and scientific
embrace a sufficiently wide domain." Similarly, natural science promoters could have critiqued the Art, Historical and Scientific Association's only very modest attention to science. Even the Association's moves to develop a more discipline-based approach, through committees in art, natural science, archaeology and literature, had failed through lack of support. Sydney Williams's "proposal to form a section for the ascent of the mountains and observing the plants and animals peculiar to the higher regions" for instance, never materialized. The stage, by 1900, was thus set for new, more vigorous associations to form for a more practical and democratic mutual enlightenment.

5.2.1. To Create an "Earthly Paradise": The Vancouver Arts and Crafts Association

The Vancouver Arts and Crafts Association was formally organized at a public meeting on April 25, 1900. Modelled after the "now famous Arts and Crafts [Exhibition] Society of London [England], founded by the late William Morris," the Vancouver Arts and Crafts Association's foundation culminated six months of planning and lobbying by architects Sydney Eveleigh, Arnott Woodrofe, and Robert MacKay Fripp. These men had contacted similar societies in Scotland and England, drawn up a preliminary constitution, and had collaborated with another group, the Vancouver Art Workers Guild to form "a Society of Arts and Crafts."

This arts and crafts society was the new organization most directly connected to the Art, Historical and Scientific Association. Fripp was a former and subsequent, though not current, Art, Historica! and Scientific Association member. He was well-educated, cultivated, and worldly, and the son of distinguished British artist, George Allen Fripp, former Court Painter to Prince Albert and Queen Victoria. Woodrofe also held a membership in the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, as did H. J. deForest, one of

12Minutes, 18 April, 25 April, 1895 (newspaper clipping), Art, Historical and Scientific Association, Add. Mss. 336, Vancouver City Archives (VCA).
13Vancouver Daily News-Advertiser, 26 April 1900. The meeting was held at the Vancouver Builder's Exchange, in the Fairfield Block.
15Minutes, 10 April 1900, Vancouver Arts and Crafts Association, Add. Mss. 142, VCA.
16Vancouver Arts and Crafts Association Minutes, 6 April 1900.
the Art Workers Guild’s representatives.\textsuperscript{17} Finally, the Arts and Crafts Association’s founding meeting was chaired and addressed by the Art, Historical and Scientific Association’s president, Dr. A. R. C. Selwyn.

As reported in the \textit{News-Advertiser}, the founding meeting was fully representative of the arts and crafts of the city and included the following...Mrs. Balfour Ker, Mrs. Marcus Lucas, Mrs. W. F. Caulfeild, Messrs. H. J. deForest [sic], J. B. Fitzmaurice, painting, sketching...; Messrs. J. W. Mallory, E. A. Whitehead, A. Woodroofe, R. M. Fripp, Sydney Eveleigh, architects; W. H. Barnes[,] ornamental confectioner, J. Murray, D. Campbell, woodworker; H. M. Alpen, A. V. Harrod, lithographic artists; W. Campbell, furniture; G. Sydney Carr, bookbinding; A. Russell Wilson, photography; J. Bloomfield, designing artist; C. E. Bloomfield, stained glass; F. W. Caulfeild, painting and woodcarving.\textsuperscript{18}

According to its constitution, the new Arts and Crafts Association aimed “to encourage artistic feeling and knowledge, and to bring the workman and craftsman into closer relationship.”\textsuperscript{19} It hoped to encourage “the association of those engaged in these pursuits for their mutual benefit and education,” to form a “collection of examples of Art and Craftsmanship,” and to establish a reference library.\textsuperscript{20} Membership was open. Men and women, professional and amateur, designer and workman alike were welcome to join. The education of manual workers, in fact, was seen as critical to the function of such an association within the arts and crafts movement.

The arts and crafts movement and the Vancouver Arts and Crafts Association, specifically, were not intended as copies of such traditional bourgeois art societies as the original and ill-fated Art Association of 1889. The professional arts backgrounds of Arts and Crafts Association promoters and the call for working-class members suggest that the

\textsuperscript{17}Ibid.; \textit{News-Advertiser}, 26 April 1900. The Guild’s other representatives were Herman Alpen, F. Gardener, and James Bloomfield. Bloomfield, had been made secretary at an April 10, 1900 meeting. He invited potential members to the Association’s April 25 founding meeting.

\textsuperscript{18}Ibid. Note, Reverend H. G. F. Clinton (Anglican) and Rowland Brittain, a patent lawyer, were also present; they formally moved and seconded the formation of the Association. See Arts and Crafts Association Minutes, 25 April 1900. A general meeting was held on May 9, 1900. Officers were elected: President, R. M. Fripp; Vice-Presidents, Mrs. Balfour-Ker, and Sydney Eveleigh; Secretary, C. E. Bloomfield; and the Executive Committee, Mrs. Marcus Lucas, Herman Alpen, Rowland Brittain, James Bloomfield, William Ferris, another Art, Historical and Scientific Association member, Arnot Woodroofe, and M. W. Caulfeild. See Arts and Crafts Association Minutes, 9 May 1900.

\textsuperscript{19}Pamphlet, n.d. [1900], Vancouver Arts and Crafts Association, Add. Mss. 142, VCA.

\textsuperscript{20}Arts and Crafts Association Minutes, 9 May 1900.
Association was not intended as a recreational art club for the city's leisured classes. Rather, the Association's promoters deliberately invoked William Morris's call for a revolutionary new social order, an "Earthly Paradise."²¹

Vancouver Arts and Crafts Association spokesman Robert MacKay Fripp praised Morris's London Society. It had "performed yeoman's service in the cause of restoring English Art to a national art, as opposed to a merely one man or individual art."²² A "national art," as opposed to an individualistic art, was critical to Morris's conception of the role of art and craft work in the well-being of the nation and of all its people. Note too that such a "national art" recalls Matthew Arnold's advocacy of "culture" and cultural enlightenment, for all social classes, as the key to a whole nation's welfare.²³ Morris was struck by the bond between art, a man's labour, and the quality of his life. He stressed, in particular, the need to develop the art of common people, especially their crafts. In his reaction to industrial blight, Morris argued that salvation could be attained only when people were surrounded by and in vital contact with beauty. Through the aesthetic design, manufacture, and display of industrial and commercial products and works—from furniture to buildings and to fine art itself—beauty could restore (to a romantic dream-like and imaginary past) society's health and happiness.²⁴ Arts and crafts movement disciples, at least in England, were inspired, then, by the Romantic and aesthetic visions of Morris and John Ruskin, and by desires for a democratic, humanitarian, and communitarian society.

To achieve this earthly paradise, through socialist revolution as necessary, Morris and his colleagues argued that artists and workingmen both needed to educated. Artists, Morris argued,

...can expect no general impulse towards the fine arts till civilization has been transformed into some other condition of life....Our business as artists [is] to supply the lack of tradition by diligently cultivating in ourselves the sense of beauty,...skill of hand, and niceness of observation, without which only a

Likewise, and as stressed by the Vancouver Arts and Crafts Association, ordinary workingmen needed to become acquainted with this sense of beauty, and educated to skillfully apply it to their work and in their daily lives. As Morris's colleague Walter Crane pointed out, the movement was a revolt against the hard mechanical conventional life and its insensibility to beauty (quite another thing to ornament). It is a protest against that so-called industrial progress paid for by the lives of their producers and the degradation of their users. It is a protest against the turning of men into machines, against artificial distinctions in art, and against making the immediate market value, or the possibility of profit, the chief test of artistic merit. It also advances the claim of all and each to the common possession of beauty in things common and familiar.

Vancouver Arts and Crafts Association spokesman Fripp clearly, and sometimes caustically, sympathized with many arts and crafts movement concerns and ideals. He indicted the city—its "progress," its "city fathers," and its citizens—as devoid of art, art institutions, and artistic spirit. Not only, he complained, was there "no art gallery, museum of any sort, art or technical schools," there were not even any decent meeting places for artists and cultured citizens. "[C]uriously enough," he remarked, "the need for such a place does not appear to be recognized."

Fripp further condemned Vancouver's private and public works, and those responsible for such a degenerate state of affairs:

In spite of systems of electric trolley cars, of electric lighting, and of telephone communication (with their attendant forests of hideous poles), our "handsome," "solid," even "magnificent" blocks, as the ubiquitous reporter very modestly describes them, our "splendid" galvanized iron statuary, our tons of "beautiful" metal cornices, our sham Gothic churches, with their wealth of stained glass, in which is revealed about as much power of design and thoughtful color as is found in a 10-cent kaleidoscope, all of this notwithstanding, it is greatly to be feared our learned critics would not place us very high on the scale of past civilizations. What indeed could the future Mr. Dryasdust find to say in favor of a people apparently so devoid of excellence in the practise of the Art?

25William Morris, quoted by Davey, Architecture, p. 53.
26Davey, Architecture, pp. 53-54.
28Ibid., p. 58.
Indeed it is a wonder that with such an assault on even those who did practise art, such as Charles Bloomfield, artist and stained glass designer, that Fripp was able to attract any to the new Arts and Crafts Association. Obviously those who joined, and especially those who knew of Fripp’s views, must have been at least sympathetic to Fripp’s case, or at least were attracted to pretensions of advancing art amongst the working classes.

Fripp especially advocated the extension of art and art appreciation to all classes of the city, particularly to artisan craftsmen and architects. Craftsmen and architects, he believed, could most readily begin to produce the beauty that he and his sympathizers believed was so sorely missing from the city’s man-made environment. Following upon Arnold’s, Morris’s, and Ruskin’s ideas, Fripp believed (or at least stated) that a society, like the new Vancouver Arts and Crafts Association, could

bring together all workers..., all sorts and conditions of men and women who regard their daily vocations as something higher than mere wage-earning drudgery....[I]f the worker could have instilled into him some appreciation of the art value of the molding, contour, or what not on which he is working, as well as of the texture of the material, his interest would be quickened and he would of necessity put more of his own soul and character into his execution.  

Fripp also argued that universal worker-oriented art education would have to be a mutual effort “of the citizens...of a higher intellectual level.” Consistent with the idea of “clerisy,” he believed that a community’s enlightenment should extend, in part, from the mutual enlightenment of its artists and professional craftsmen.

Fripp’s reasons for a mutual enlightenment of Vancouver’s intellectual set were threefold. First, there was no evident class of wealthy philanthropists to provide leadership, financial support, and substantial artistic and gallery (i.e., building) donations. Vancouver had had neither the time to develop as a great city, nor the presence of industrial and “aristocratic” giants, as in such great industrial cities as Liverpool or Birmingham, or Boston or Chicago. There was none of even that “patriotic generosity of private individuals who laid the foundations of...valuable institutions” as found in New Zealand, a land as young as and even more remote than British Columbia. Second, “the city fathers,” as

---

29Ibid., p. 58.
30Ibid., p. 57.
31Fripp’s castigation of local niggardliness, to be noted, was a rather ungenerous overstatement. The Art, Historical and Scientific Association’s museum, albeit small, was being stocked primarily through the generosity of local citizens.
Fripp complained, who should be most cognizant of these needs, "appear[ed] to be too deeply immersed in acrimonious personal disputes or in the cares of ward politics to give much thought to such trifling matters as 'painting or poetry.'" Finally, as with the Art, Historical and Scientific Association's intellectuals, Vancouver's professional artists and craftsmen were, simply, among those most capable and discriminating to advance enlightenment within their communities. Fripp, like Morris and the Art, Historical and Scientific Association's promoters, seemed to understand and to promote Matthew Arnold's call for cultivation of the nation's people. He believed that as "men of culture," they were best suited to be the "free apostles of equality."

Fripp and his associates aimed to carry onwards what earlier and contemporary associations had lost. They would attempt to fulfill and to extend the 1889 Romantically-inspired dreams of "Art's" Vancouver—a city of elevated "thought and feeling," inspired by an environment "which is beautiful, pure and lovely," and the home of a professional arts community. They would educate themselves and the city's artisan craftsmen in the traditions and practice of art and craft work. They would teach each other how to recognize and to produce beauty in both the fine and the practical arts. Notably, they would develop skills of aesthetic, observation, discrimination, argument, and evaluation. They would understand and would learn to practise the manufacture of aesthetic buildings and industrial products. Further, they would educate the city's residents in the meaning of Taste and Beauty through aesthetic displays of fine art and craft, a task not adequately being performed by the successful but small Art, Historical and Scientific Association. Finally, the members would learn organizational skills—arranging, publicizing, and financing exhibitions, teaching, and running meetings, for example—all necessary for the survival of the Association, and many useful in members' non-Associational work.

It is noteworthy that unlike the revolutionary William Morris, Fripp, did not openly advocate any form of socialist society. His interpretation of Morris and the role of art education for working people was ambiguous, possibly conservative. If workers could be taught to see their labours as inspired, reflecting good taste, then they should be happy. Furthermore, Fripp's argument, though not stated, implied that such happy workers would:

---

33 Arnold, Culture and Anarchy, p. 56.
34 News-Advertiser, 18 January 1889.
(a) be more content with their present lot and cease their wage and benefits demands, and
(b) produce better products, products reflecting quality of design and of manufacture.
Naturally, the “nation” would benefit, especially the owners and sellers of this inspired production.

5.2.2. Seeking Their Own Footing: Vancouver's Natural History Clubs

Natural history clubs, as with the Arts and Crafts Association, to a large extent were also formed in reaction to the worst aspects of the machine age. Through nature study, club members might find positive and healthy alternatives to the prevailing “sterile, mechanistic” values of society. The object was not merely and only temporarily to remove club members from a harsh and pessimistic social environment. Rather, they provided the knowledge and experience, both practical and spiritual, to rejuvenate their members and hopefully to contribute to their and society’s betterment.

The summer of 1906 appears to have marked the foundation of the Vancouver Naturalists’ Field Club. Though details of the Club’s formation are not known, the Field Club apparently held its first series of bi-weekly field study trips. On the Saturdays of August 18, September 1, and September 15, 1906, small groups of Club members explored the local Kitsalano [sic] Beach, Stanley Park, and cemetery districts, respectively. The Club used these excursions to add to the record of botanical specimens found in the region and to give “the less experienced members a practical acquaintance with the art of collecting.”

The Field Club was an offshoot of the Vancouver-based B.C. Entomological Association. The latter society had been founded January 8, 1902 by its Secretary Robert V. Harvey, a teacher. Harvey reputedly founded and, in fact, served as the Field Club’s first President.

---

35 Newspaper clipping, n.d., attached to Vancouver Naturalist Field Club Minutes, Add. Mss. 484, vol. 1, VCA.
36 News-Advertiser, 10 January 1902. The “British Columbia Entomological Society” was organized on Wednesday, January 8, at the Queen’s School, at the behest of R. V. Harvey. Though primarily a Vancouver organization, it received delegates from Wellington, on Vancouver Island, and New Westminster. Its first president was Rev. Thomas Taylor of Wellington. Harvey was elected Secretary. The Society “arranged to hold a meeting of the Provincial Society every three months and, meantime to organise local bodies, which will meet more frequently.” Along with Harvey, Field Club member Tom Wilson also attended. By February 1903, the Society’s membership reached 18,
The Entomological Society, however, was not Vancouver's first natural history society. Aside from similar interests within the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, and especially its short-lived (1895) Natural History section, there was, in 1896, a Game Protection Association. Art, Historical and Scientific Association member and Arts and Crafts Association founder R. M. Fripp was its Secretary. Moreover, in 1903 there was a "forest-stream club," A. G. Thyne, President.

The Naturalists' Field Club likely owed its inception to the failed amalgamation attempt, in 1905, between the Entomological Association and the Art, Historical and Scientific Association. Harvey had served as the Entomological Association's negotiator. No reason was given for the amalgamation attempt to fall through. However, the Entomological Association may have decided that it was better to go it alone. After an earlier dispute between the two societies over the ownership of a loan or gift of insect specimens from the Entomological Association to the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, the Entomological Association may have feared losing its separate identity to the more catholic Art, Historical and Scientific Association. In the end, however, the Art, Historical and Scientific Association invited the Entomological Association to the official opening of its new Public Museum, later in April 1905. The Art, Historical and Scientific Association appeared desirous to deflate any possible acrimony over these negotiations, and to maintain its select position within Vancouver society.

Among the other Field Club founders were several prominent local naturalists including Mrs. Julia Henshaw, prominent socialite and amateur botanist, author of *Mountain Wild Flowers of Canada* (1906); Joseph K. Henry, also a teacher and botanist, and author-to-be; and Tom Wilson, federal government fruit inspector, a botanist and entomologist, and member of both the Entomological and Art, Historical and Scientific

---

(39) (cont'd) and was meeting quarterly (*News-Advertiser*, 11 February 1903). By 1911, the Society was clearly reflecting more professional scientific interests. At its December 1911 meeting, for instance, papers were read by "Thomas Cunningham, provincial inspector of fruit pests; Mr. A. E. Wallace, assistant inspector of fruit pests; P. M. Oliphant, late of School of Indian Wood and Forests; G. O. Day, and Dr. S. Haddon, Dominion veterinarian at the experimental farm at Agassiz" (*News-Advertiser*, 9 December 1911).

34 Art, Historical and Scientific Association Minutes, 18 April, 25 April, 1895 (newspaper clipping).
36 Art, Historical and Scientific Association Minutes, 26 March 1903.
Associations. Henry was elected Vice-President at the first regular business meeting in October 1906. Robert Harvey was made Honorary President, and Normal School Principal William Burns was newly elected as President.42

Like the Arts and Crafts Association, the Club membership was “open both to ladies and gentlemen.”43 Children were welcome, though the Club’s membership of eighteen only recorded one such “Junior.” The Club also called for city school-teachers to join for further training and education in observational skills. Such training, in combination with knowledge of the natural sciences, was intended to educate these teachers in the use of nature study to develop the intellectual skills—systematic observation, reasoning, and problem-solving—of their own school pupils. The Provincial Department of Education apparently had instituted a new school programme of nature study.

Significantly, the Field Club phrased its call to appeal to the teachers’ professional and egalitarian interests. The Club’s scientific “experts,” that is, those who would teach the teachers, were to be, “after all[,] only senior students in the same great class.”44 With an egalitarian spirit, it was hoped the teachers and other professional scientists might themselves benefit from the enthusiasm and devotion of the amateur naturalists. The “professional” members, in turn, could initiate and instruct the amateur members to more systematically conduct their work.45 Through its programme, the Club thus aimed

to bring together those who are interested in any of the branch of natural history, for mutual help and encouragement....[B]y a series of weekly or fortnightly afternoon field-days, by more extended excursions during the holiday season, and by evening meetings during the Winter, much benefit may result to the members, and a further knowledge may be obtained of the fauna, flora and geological formations of this neighborhood [sic].46

The Field Club’s enthusiasm, unfortunately, was shortlived. The Club apparently ceased shortly after its second annual meeting, October 19, 1907. At this meeting, the Club had decided to “defer” publication of its proceedings, hoping to complete its list of local wild-flowers. However, there were no further accounts of the Club’s existence, either in the

42 Other officers elected included Secretary R. S. Sherman, Treasurer A. H. Marrion, and Committee members Miss Laura Eaton, J. H. Tarrant, and A. E. W. Salt.
43 Naturalists’ Field Club Minutes (newspaper clipping, n.d.).
44 Ibid., newspaper clipping, [1906], n.d.
45 Ibid., newspaper clipping, [1906], n.d.; ibid., 19 October 1907.
46 Ibid., newspaper clipping, [1906], n.d.
minute-book (which was left unfinished) or in local newspapers. The proceedings, apparently, were never published.

Curiously, a new natural history club was formed—only nine days after the Naturalists’ Field Club’s last recorded meeting. On October 28, 1907, the Vancouver (in 1909, the British Columbia) Mountaineering Club was organized to “more systematically” explore the mountain region immediately surrounding Vancouver. Geographically, British Columbia is largely mountainous, and it was natural that mountaineering would eventually gain in popularity with the province’s more adventurous citizens. There had been individual and informally organized efforts to explore nearby mountains, particularly those just to the north of the city. Nevertheless, as late as 1907 very little was actually known of the area. Thus, the new Mountaineering Club sought to promote the exploration, study, and preservation of the province’s “mountains, valleys and ice fields....”

Among the Mountaineering Club’s first officers and executive committee members were Naturalists’ Field Club Secretary R. S. Sherman, and members John Porter and Miss Elizabeth Fowler. All three became especially prominent in Mountaineering Club affairs. The two men helped to organize the Club’s geological (Porter, 1911) and entomological (Sherman, 1912) sections (along with a botanical section organized in 1911 by the new provincial biologist, Scotsman John Davidson). Miss Fowler was noted for her Club support and her mountain climbing. Porter also served as Club editor.

Whereas the Arts and Crafts Association and the Naturalists’ Field Club were eventually to fail, the Mountaineering Club and its scientific sections succeeded handsomely. The scientific sections (and especially the Botanical Section), in particular, were so successful that their members outnumbered the Club’s mountain-climbers. For many of the new members, “the mere effort of hiking and climbing was incidental to the pursuit of

---

47 J. P. [John Porter], “Historical Note,” *Northern Cordilleran*, p. 5.
As Sherman explained:

Some seek mere physical exhilaration; others love the hills for their sublimity and still others, very much in the minority, who combine with their desire for physical exercise and their love for the beautiful, a craving for intellectual stimulus, a definite desire to study minutely and exhaustively some special feature of mountain life, be it bird or beast, insect or flower, and thereby attain a general uplift of all their natural faculties....[T]he master mountaineer....brings back with him from a climb, not only the luxury of physical fatigue and a full kodak, but a store of knowledge which will be of unfailing interest to himself and of perhaps of lasting benefit to mankind.\(^5\)

These new members, nonetheless, soon agitated for a separate “Botanical Society.” Appraised of the dangers of separating, they “were advised it was better to stay and strengthen a weak Club rather than split into two weak struggling Clubs.”\(^5\) Thus, on March 23, 1916, they instead settled for a more autonomous Natural History Section of the B.C. Mountaineering Club. Two years later, however, on May 10, 1918, this Natural History Section joined with the two year old Arbor Day Association to form the Vancouver Natural History Society.\(^5\) Both the original Mountaineering Club and new Natural History Society succeeded, and remain popular organizations until the present.

Like its predecessor, the Naturalists’ Field Club, the Mountaineering Club was remarkably egalitarian and democratic. Its members came from all walks of life. Unlike the Arts and Crafts Association, however, this state was not officially prescribed through the Constitution or club objects. Women were prominent. As well as offering traditional administrative support and ensuring “the comfort of the builders...of the [Grouse Mountain] club-house,” these women gained reputations as “arduous climbers” in their own right.\(^6\)

---


\(^5\)Ibid. The Arbor Day Association had originated early in 1916 as a committee of the University Women’s Club. The Women’s Club had been considering how to establish an Arbor Day in Vancouver schools. The “Arbor-day committee,” studied and contributed a series of 20 weekly “Arbor-day talks” on native trees to the World newspaper in 1916 and 1917. Reorganized in 1917 as the Arbor Day Association, they met with the Natural History Section, on May 10, 1918, to amalgamate their two societies.

\(^6\)J. P. “Historical Note,” p. 8. Susan Leslie records interviews with two such women, Phyllis Munday of the B.C. Mountaineering Club and Kate McQueen of the Alpine Club, as examples of such women climbers. See Leslie, Western Mountains, pp. 22-25, 52-53.
And although some of the early climbers were among the city's leading citizens, a Club member could boast:

Our club was democratic. I have the list of the 90 members for the year 1913 before me, and I notice among others thereon, two lawyers, two land surveyors, three bankers, one botanist, two electricians, three salesmen, two railwaymen, two exporters, two nurses, seven stenographers, one meteorologist, three printers, one postman, one civil engineer, one cigar maker, one piano tuner, two real estate men, all gentlemen and gentlewomen.

In contrast, the membership of the local branch of the Alpine Club of Canada was socially, and decidedly, haute. Its members were all listed in the Vancouver Social Register and Club Directory. Included here were former Naturalists' Field Club and concurrent Mountaineering Club member Elizabeth Fowler, and former Field Club members Mrs. Julia Henshaw and Mr. A. H. Bush.

A national mountaineering club, founded in Winnipeg in 1906, the Alpine Club was established in Vancouver by 1909. Its mountaineering venues were the more distant (and hence more expensive) Rocky and Selkirk Mountains of Alberta and eastern British Columbia. Described by Leslie:

The men and women who joined the ACC were not homesteaders or pioneers; they were not factory workers; they were not tradesmen or artisans. They were, in general, people with education and resources, who had the time to take holidays in the mountains and the cultural background to believe that climbing mountains was a spiritually rewarding endeavour....The clergymen, school teachers, doctors and professors who joined the Alpine Club of Canada had not been disabused of their Romantic notions about nature. They came to the mountains with a secure sense of their own importance; they did not stay long enough to feel diminished.

The apparent split of former Field Club members into two quite different natural history clubs suggests strongly that underlying social differences and personal interests contributed to the collapse of the Field Club. To Sherman and Porter, who joined the

---

57 Leslie, Western Mountains, p. 27. Leslie here names Basil Darling and Henry Bell-Irving as examples.
61 Leslie, Western Mountains, pp. 17-19.
Mountaineering Club, furthering science was a major objective. Not surprisingly, both were scientific professionals and teachers. In contrast, the Alpine Club drew some of the Field Club’s amateur (and financially secure) former members. As the above quotation suggests, these and other Alpine Club members sought adventure and romance, and perhaps character-building. In a similar vein, older Field Club members, like William Burns and Tom Wilson, retained memberships in the rather sedate and scholarly, though again haute, Art, Historical and Scientific Association.

Other factors, however, also likely contributed to the Field Club’s demise. There were only eighteen members, hardly enough to actively maintain a solid programme of outdoor activities. Some excursions were cancelled and, sadly, those that took place usually saw a turnout of three or four members, hardly enough for a stimulating mutual enlightenment. Age was also a factor. Burns was 63 in 1906, and Wilson was 52. The North American wilderness movement, and especially the growing vogue for mountain-climbing, probably took their toll as well. Prospective members apparently were not attracted by the genteel English activities of exploring local creeks, seashores, and cemeteries, and of collecting wild flowers and insects. All lacked the challenges of scaling the omnipresent mountains. Also, the expected flood of teachers seeking scientific enlightenment never materialized. This lack of teachers disabled the Club’s hope to assume responsibility (at least unofficially) for teacher-training in the Department of Education’s nature study programme. Finally, the more Romantic passions of the amateur members, such as Julia Henshaw and Arthur Bush, were somewhat incompatible with the scientific, socio-moral, and economic development interests of Burns, Harvey, Porter, Sherman, and Wilson.

The natural history clubs did not call for the extensive renovation of society and its political economy, as did promoters of the London Arts and Crafts Society. Nevertheless, they did lend a similar missionary zeal to the promotion and practice of their work. As with

---

the Vancouver Arts and Crafts Association, the natural history clubs likened themselves as intellectual and scientific pathfinders, “utilitarian” in purpose, yet still knowingly Romantic in their conceptions of Nature in general, and of mountains, specifically. The Clubs called attention to “the enormous amounts of work to be accomplished...in natural science,” and, especially, extolled the economic virtues of increased knowledge of local geological formations, plant species, and insect pests. At the same time, they still drew much of their sustenance from the more aesthetic and spiritual, and even moral, sides of nature study and mountaineering.

Witness Julia Henshaw’s spirit of mountaineering romance:

It matters not at what hour one goes to the mountains, whether in the amethyst dawn, when the golden gates of sunrise fall ajar and the first faint rustle of the leaves stirs the dreaming world to consciousness, dispersing mists and dew; in the brilliant noon-tide when life marches on with all her banners unfurled and every plant is budding and blowing as the sap runs freely, and the sun’s rays gild hill and vale; or in the amber evening when purple shadows steal with phantom feet from cliff to cliff and down in the dusk of the forest, dewdrops spangle leaf and bloom as God lights the star lamps of his high heaven and puts out the day.

As with Arts and Crafts Association promoters, the naturalists were repelled by the destruction of God’s natural world by industrial plunder and economic greed. Their attitudes evidenced the popular, almost cultish, “wilderness ethic [that] rejected the artificiality and materialism of modern society.” They sought escape. For example, they built a physical retreat—a cabin on Grouse Mountain, high above Vancouver. And they assumed a responsibility to protect Nature. They lobbied the provincial government “to preserve the Garibaldi area from logging and mining interests,” succeeding in 1920 when Victoria declared the area a parkland reserve, now Garibaldi Park.

Even their emphasis on nature study, with its perceived value in the training of intellectual skills, the naturalists showed their strong social and moral mission. On the one

63 William Burns uses “utilitarian” as a key purpose for field clubs in his lecture on “The Value of Local Associations,” Naturalists’ Field Club Minutes, 10 October 1906.
64 Burns, “Local Associations.”
67 Davidson, “Reminiscences,” p. 8; Leslie, Western Mountains, p. 29.
hand, they hoped to instil into other members a “spirit of enquiry.” On the other, nature study and the advanced study of botany, geology, entomology, and the competitive and co-operative interrelationships amongst plants, animals, insects, and their natural environment provided those who were trained “to see” with a model of their own world, and lessons for their own lives.\(^68\)

As one teacher of nature study explained in 1902:

The aim of nature study is to interest men and women, and especially boys and girls, in the natural objects which they look at, handle, taste, or smell from day to day, in order that they may acquire the habit of observing closely, and so get all the pleasure possible out of their surroundings in life, and find their daily duties less irksome, and gather information that will be helpful to them in overcoming difficulties and in working for a share of the necessaries, comforts, and luxuries of life.\(^69\)

### 5.3. CONCLUSION

Mutual enlightenment as practised by the natural history clubs, and also by the Arts and Crafts Association, involved the transmission of groups of attitudes, intellectual knowledge, and skills. This knowledge was variously aimed at fulfilling different, often conflicting, objectives.

There were public social and economic goals. The Arts and Crafts Association set out to beautify the city, its architecture, and its industrial products. The natural history clubs aimed to discover, record, map, and otherwise educate club members and the public about how science contributes to the welfare of natural and agricultural environments.

There were also social and moral goals for the members. Each organization used knowledge and practical experience learned in the arts and crafts and in science to instil “healthy” and “uplifting” attitudes about work and problem solving. Each taught moral lessons about competition and co-operation. Above all, each organization provided their members the opportunity for what has been variously called “rational recreation,” “innocent amusement,” and “rational amusement.” As historian Lynn Barber has explained: “To

---

\(^68\) John Davidson, “Botanical Opportunities in British Columbia,” a paper read to the B.C. Academy of Science, November (?) 1912, pp. 13-14, B.C. Mountaineering Club Pamphlets, vol. 1, file 1, VCA.

qualify as rational amusement—as distinct from vulgar or 'mere' amusement, like going to the theatre or reading novels—an activity had to contain some element of useful instruction or moral uplift; or preferably both.\textsuperscript{70} Whether it be reading "sermons in stone, books in the running brooks, and good in everything,"\textsuperscript{71} or seeing in art "the embodiment and communication of man's thoughts about man, nature and God,"\textsuperscript{72} each organization provided moral uplift. And through simply learning science or art, each organization provided provided useful instruction.

These clubs and societies thus sought to provide their members with the skills and knowledge to carry out actively these objectives. Arts and Crafts Association members, acquired, for example, new or improved knowledge and abilities in aesthetic perception, skills in and knowledge of aesthetic argument and evaluation, and skills in a variety of arts and crafts including furniture design and wood carving, mechanical drawing and metalwork, stained glass design, confectionary design, painting, lithography, pyrography, and photography. The natural history club members acquired, for example, new or improved knowledge and abilities in scientific observation, scientific knowledge of the natural world, its structure, components, and intrinsic beauty, and skills in the use of scientific equipment, including cameras (for topography), aneroids (to determine altitude), and compasses and plane tables (to determine location). They also acquired scientific research and recording skills including preparing, cataloguing, and mapping botanical, entomological, and geological specimens, and writing scientific papers. Finally, members of both types of organizations acquired skills in such organizational matters as publicity, publications or exhibitions arrangement, and organizational management.

We will now, in the next chapter, expand on the meaning of these associations' programmes. Further, we will explain the members' reasons for enlightening each other, and the public, as they did.

\textsuperscript{70}Barber, \textit{Natural History}, p. 16.
\textsuperscript{71}John Davidson, "Mountaineering: As an Educational Stimulus," a paper read to the B.C. Mountaineering Club, 2 February 1913, p. 4, B.C. Mountaineering Club Pamphlets, vol. 1, file 1, VCA.
\textsuperscript{72}[Fripp], "B.C. Letter, No. III": 57, quoting British arts and crafts movement pioneer and spokesman J. D. Sedding.
CHAPTER 6.

ART AND NATURE

2: NEW FORMS IN MUTUAL ENLIGHTENMENT

It must be borne in mind that this is the west, and that there has not been sufficient time to evolve a standard in matters of taste. There are no established interests, no cultivated leisure class. The town does not possess a museum, much less a gallery of arts, not even a fine arts society. Every man is fully occupied in making a way for himself....¹

Some of you may find the work during the winter at times stiff, dull, or uninteresting. Keep on! and show us that your mental faculties are equal to your physical powers, that you are able to force your way through the dense bush of elementary botany, ascend to the summit and obtain the wider view which results from your overcoming obstacles, and rising to a higher level than that from which you started.²

6.1. INTRODUCTION

The organization of these new arts and natural science associations, in the early part of this century, signaled new forms in mutual enlightenment. They created and promoted programmes that were more egalitarian and democratic in their structure, and more practical and active in their function. They attempted, though mostly failed, to break away from the rigid bi-focal, class-exclusive pattern of mutual enlightenment established by the Art, Historical and Scientific Association. Perhaps stimulated to meet the challenges of a vigorous and growing city, they set out to more adequately meet the varied educational needs of different population sectors. Mutual enlightenment, for them, included the imparting and sharing of useful knowledge and skills instead of the restricted and dilettantish cultural enlightenment provided by the Art, Historical and Scientific Association. Mutual enlightenment also entailed teaching techniques, it was likely hoped, that would better serve the needs of and the challenges expected with a clientele that spanned several social categories.

We want to know, then, if these new associations, in fact, exemplified their


egalitarian and practical ideals. We want to explain the members' reasons for their joining one of these organizations. And, we want to infer just why these organizations ultimately collapsed.

Notably, while the two associations failed, many of their members did regroup into newer and usually more successful associations. Field Club members joined up with others in at least five organizations: the B.C. Mountaineering Club, the Alpine Club, the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, the Entomological Association, and the professional B.C. Academy of Science (1909). Arts and Crafts Association members formed some of the nuclei of the Vancouver Photographic Society (1903), the Art, Historical and Scientific Association (with which the Photographic Society amalgamated in 1905), the amateur (and well-heeled) Studio Club (1904), the Vancouver branch of the Canadian Handicrafts Guild (c.1908), and the professional artists' B.C. Society of Fine Arts (1909). The ready transfer of so many members suggests that their original interests and ideals remained strong. They had not lost all faith in co-operative forms of learning.

To discover the members' reasons for joining their organizations, and to explain the meaning of the educational programmes that they organized, it is useful to analyze both the members' social characteristics and the nature of the programmes. The Arts and Crafts Association and the Naturalists' Field Club, primarily, shall serve as exemplars for this further study.

6.2. MUTUAL ENLIGHTENMENT: TWO EPISODES

Consider, for example, the following two episodes of mutual enlightenment. Each exemplifies that and similar associations' educational work. Neither episode, however, typifies all aspects of the association's programme. The first episode recounts the Vancouver Arts and Crafts Association's First Annual Exhibition, held at the Alhambra Hall on September 24, 25, and 27, 1900. The second episode recounts one of several field excursions organized by the Vancouver Naturalists' Field Club. This particular excursion was held on September 1, 1906, in the city's vast, and still wild, Stanley Park.

First, in late September, 1900, the Arts and Crafts Association displayed a collection of its members' work. This First Annual Exhibition was actually the Association's second exhibition; an earlier July exhibition had been held to introduce the
new organization to the local public.\textsuperscript{3} This First Annual Exhibition was also the city's first major art exhibition since the 1894 Exhibition that financially had crippled the then new Art, Historical and Scientific Association. Touted as "Probably the most important event...in the provincial world of art," the Arts and Crafts Association aimed to exhibit representative works of local art and fine craftsmanship. Concurrent with the Exhibition was a school children's art competition, an Art Union, for the sale of displayed artwork, and a Conversazione. The Mayor opened the Exhibition in the absence of the Governor-General of Canada, first patron to the Association. With "several hundred visitors" over the three days, the Exhibition was judged a tremendous success. A propitious future seemed assured.

Over three hundred works were catalogued and displayed, though according to an unidentified reviewer, "far too great a proportion belonged to pictorial art."\textsuperscript{4} Other works, some under-represented according to the reviewer, included "architecture, design, furniture, [and] carving..., some exceptionally good collections of photographs, several good examples of pyrography, of stained and painted glass and embroidery and some really excellent painted china."\textsuperscript{5} Among the presentations were the architectural drawings of Association founder R. M. Fripp, and a table designed by Fripp and made by J. Bowman, an architectural drawing and a photographic work by architect Sydney Eveleigh, a water-colour painting and examples of lithography by Province chief artist Herman Alpen, carved panels by land developer and artist Francis W. Caulfeild and by sash and door employee James R. Suter, a pedestal and statue by stationer and picture framer J. C. Bishop, a fire screen designed by design artist James Bloomfield and executed by Mrs. R. B. Ellis, and numerous oil and water-colour paintings by local professional and amateur artists, both men and women, and photograph collections mostly by local professional

\textsuperscript{3}The new Association held its inaugural public exhibition of art and craft works, at O'Brien Hall. The exhibition was judged "a most decided success" by one city newspaper. See \textit{Vancouver Daily News-Advertiser}, 12 July 1900. Among its displays, the exhibition hung paintings by Mrs. Balfour Ker, Will Ferris, Mower Martin, Mrs. Lucas, and Mrs. Bell-Irving, and exhibited samples of stained glass by Mr. Bloomfield.

\textsuperscript{4}[T. Mower Martin,] "British Columbia Letters, No. IV," \textit{The Canadian Architect and Builder} 8 (December 1900): 234. I am assuming that the writer of this "Letter" was Mower Martin, an artist and Association President. He was accused of having been critical of fellow members' work in a public magazine (i.e., the above magazine) and as a result was forced to resign on February 22, 1901. See Arts and Crafts Association Minutes, 22 February 1901. These fellow members did not take kindly to public criticism, even if for the Association's architects, included in the critique, the criticism was not of their artistic talent but, rather by implication, of their inability to attract to the Association more of their professional colleagues.

\textsuperscript{5}Ibid.
photographers.\textsuperscript{6}

The second episode of mutual enlightenment, the Naturalists’ Field Club’s natural history field day, was held within the precincts of the city’s vast Stanley Park, on a warm, sunny September 1, 1906. Guided by Club founder, school teacher, and “amateur” entomologist Robert Harvey, the six members and one visitor explored within the 968 acre natural-state park. Joining Harvey on the Stanley Park excursion were two other teachers—school teacher R. S. Sherman and Columbia College mechanical engineering instructor John Porter. Also attending were excise officer Arthur Marrion, sporting goods clerk John H. Tarrant, and stenographer Miss Elizabeth Fowler and her friend. Among other things, the seven intrepid explorers were searching for eight plant species thought by Harvey to exist in the park. Following the park’s trails, with two of the members armed with butterfly nets, the group collected insects and examined wild-plants and wave-worn sedimentary rocks. Latin names were assigned to the plants and insects. Along with finding the prescribed species, the members, to their delight, even discovered a new species. The primary purpose of the excursion, nevertheless, was to provide “the less experienced members with a practical acquaintance with the art of collecting.”\textsuperscript{7}

Four key points become readily apparent in summarizing the details of these two episodes of mutual enlightenment.

First, on the basis of the discussion so far, these organizations were born out of mainly British tradition, and re-interpreted within a Canadian context.

Second, in accordance with the organizations’ policies of openness, both episodes demonstrated a broader gender and social class range of participation than their forbear, the Art, Historical and Scientific Association. Women appeared to participate in the activities in the same fashion, and with the same capacity and responsibility, as did the men. Men were still more likely, however, but not completely, to become activity leaders. Unlike most female members, the men still had the most relevant professional or occupational background. Both organizations also had working-class or lower middle-class members participating, again in the same fashion as did the more professional members.

\textsuperscript{6}Compiled from an exhibition pamphlet attached to the Minutes, n.d., Vancouver Arts and Crafts Association, Add. Mss. 142, VCA.

\textsuperscript{7}Minutes, various entries, n.d. [1906], newspaper clipping, n.d. [October, 1906], Vancouver Naturalists’ Field Club Papers, Add. Mss. 484, vol. 1, VCA.
Third, members participated by learning or teaching artistic or scientific skills. The range of activities leading up to or involved in each particular episode (i.e., different art and craft forms and different natural history disciplines) suggests a significant exchange of knowledge and skills amongst members of different and unequal backgrounds. Architects and craftsmen, or botanists and geologists, for instance, jointly participated in the same activity. They learned and practised some of the knowledge and skills that were the preserve of each other's specialty. Also for those least knowledgeable or skilled, the pedagogy resembled apprenticeship in its educational practice. Knowledge was to be shared and learned co-operatively.

The skills and associated intellectual knowledge and attitudes were often taught or shared through informal demonstration and discussion. This was facilitated through each association or club organizing itself into interest sections. Each section represented and co-ordinated activities, including classes, lectures, and skill training and practice, for a specific art or craft, or scientific interest. Each had two or three experienced leaders. The Arts and Crafts Association, for instance, formed ten such sections (called sub-committees): "Furniture, wood-carving and the designing of furniture;" "Mechanical drawing in iron and wood, and engineering;" "Painting & Drawing;" "Amateur Photography;" "Painting on China;" "Lithography;" "Needlework & Embroidery;" "Decorator and Applied Art;" "Modelling;" and "Architecture." Similarly, the Field Club (and the B.C. Mountaineering Club) organized itself into three "sections": Botany, Entomology, and Geology.

Fourth and finally, the episodes also evidenced the bi-focal orientation of mutual enlightenment that characterized the Art, Historical and Scientific Association (see Fig. 1 below). Both associations assumed a public mission to complement the programmes organized for their members. These extension programmes included public art exhibitions, publications of botanical, entomological, and geological findings and maps, open meetings and lectures, and the loan of association speakers to other clubs and societies. John Davidson, B.C. Mountaineering Club, for example, spoke regularly about the natural sciences to garden clubs, other scientific organizations, church groups, literary clubs, and agricultural and mining societies.

---

8Arts and Crafts Association Minutes, 28 May 1900, 16 May 1900.
9Naturalists' Field Club Minutes, 11 October 1906.
10See B.C. Mountaineering Club Pamphlets, vol. 1, file 1, VCA.. Note also, Davidson has outlined how club members should conduct an open meeting and to what purpose in his "Botanical Work for
Programme orientation options for associations of mutual enlightenment.

**Introverted**
(Members Only)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I</th>
<th>II</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(e.g., drawing class)</td>
<td>(e.g., nature hike)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Formal Pedagogies**

**Informal Pedagogies**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>III</th>
<th>IV</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(e.g., public lecture)</td>
<td>(e.g., art exhibition)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Extroverted**
(Members + Non-members)

NOTE: The above programme structure demonstrates the relationship between the dimension of organizational orientation towards member and non-member participation (introverted versus extroverted) and the degree of educational formality (formal versus informal pedagogy). An introverted programme serves only the organization's members. An extroverted programme extends to the public that organization's mandate. It is open to both members and non-members.

Note also, this definitional schema is not a predictive or explanatory model of social facts. Such a model, appropriate to social scientific research, and applicable to accurate quantifiable data, is beyond the scope of this study.

Extension programmes and publications, for the Arts and Crafts Association and the natural history clubs, served three purposes. First, they acquainted local residents with the organizations and the value of their work. Secondly, they educated the public. Art exhibitions and specimen displays provided members and the public with exemplary samples for learning by “study and comparison.”

Similarly published articles and public lectures on scientific topics disseminated useful information to gardeners, farmers, lumbermen, and miners, among others. Finally, they served to stimulate interest and thereby attract new members to their organizations, and to their cause. The extension

10*(cont’d) Mountaineers,” p. 41.
11Arts and Crafts Association Pamphlet.
programmes were designed as gateways to membership for all who were interested, not as alternatives for those social groups whom the membership had hoped to exclude.

Thus, through these two episodes alone, it is possible to see that mutual enlightenment for these post-1900 organizations meant substantial changes over the Art, Historical and Scientific Association's existing programme. Mutual enlightenment, for such organizations as the Arts and Crafts Association and the Naturalists' Field Club, entailed a wider appeal and the use of more extensive and more individualized instructional methods. The bi-focal programme structure was tailored to be inclusive, rather than exclusive. Finally, mutual enlightenment here entailed a restricted, yet more complete, subject focus to these associations' curricula.

6.3. FAILED ENLIGHTENMENT?: COMPETING OBJECTIVES AND HIDDEN MOTIVES

The shifts in pedagogy and of curricula for the Arts and Crafts Association and the Naturalists' Field Club, away from that of the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, however, were not easy. The members of both the Arts and Crafts Association and the Naturalists' Field Club apparently struggled with competing interests and objectives over curricula and personnel. These interests and objectives, and other personal goals, underlay and strained the structure and function of mutual enlightenment as depicted through the two episodes, above. In fact, they probably contributed most to shorten the lives of both associations.

This competition was most apparent in the above critical review of the Arts and Crafts Association's Exhibition for having included too much fine, as opposed to design, art. Such a review, though leading to the Association's expulsion of the reviewer, was but one piece of evidence suggesting the existence of competing aesthetics within the Association.

Briefly, the first aesthetic emerged from a bourgeois belief that some people, by virtue of their birth and upbringing, are naturally more sensitive to and an embodiment of "Taste" and "Beauty" than are the brutish masses. This group included certain bourgeois and landed women and professional artists and scholars. They also believed that what was right and natural to them, particularly their access to sentiment and their feeling for beauty, ought to be charitably shared. They adopted a kind of noblesse oblige of the arts
and crafts, hoping to improve their more materialistic bourgeois brethren and working craftsmen. The arts and crafts to this group was essentially a more contemporary form of nineteenth-century “rational amusement.”

The second aesthetic was based upon the arguments of John Ruskin and, especially, of William Morris. These English writers and artists had adopted the Romantics’ notions of the goodness, beauty, and wholesomeness of an idyllic past. They sought to transfer these values and perceptions into a present and especially future social reality. This transformation, nevertheless, assumed that working people could regain their lost dignity and enrich their work and their lives through the discovery and application of their own artistic sensitivities and skills to their daily work. Art teachers of this school would teach by drawing out what was innate but lost rather than by training or imposing bourgeois values.

Similarly, for the Naturalists’ Field Club, there was competition between what we shall term the “romantic utilitarians” and the “romantic sentimentalists.” Each sub-group contributed to the effective splitting of the Club’s small membership into the two characteristically different mountaineering clubs. The difference here, though, was not so much between opposing views about the natural capacities of people. Rather, it was between those who desired to acquaint all people with the beauties and utility (both the liberal and the practical forms) and those who simply sought the experience of Nature, without charitable mission. From the shambles of the Naturalists’ Field Club there arose the more “utilitarian” B.C. Mountaineering Club, with its attendant scientific interests and occupationally broad membership, and the more elitist and sentimentalist Alpine Club.

All of these facts, including the specific curricular interests of the associations’ leaders and members, can be explained by the social and ethnic status of the members. National origin, education, occupation, personal wealth, and gender together indicate the power, values, and interests of those groups who comprised club and society memberships. They suggest in whose interests these organizations were founded. They explain why certain kinds of knowledge were valued and promoted, and to what ends and in whose interests the knowledge was used. Finally, they explain the fate of the organizations, and in particular, why they collapsed before two years of operation.
6.3.1. The English Connection

The English connection to these new Vancouver organizations, like that to the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, was particularly significant. English immigrants dominated both the leadership and the membership of both organizations. Their dominance thus explains the choice of English models and curricula for mutual enlightenment. It suggests the importance of associations of mutual enlightenment for preserving and advancing cherished cultural beliefs and knowledge. At the same time, their dominance helps explain both the accidental exclusivity of these organizations and a mortal weakness of theirs—unpopularity.

The Arts and Crafts Association and the Naturalists’ Field Club were both born out of a mainly English tradition, though re-interpreted, of course, within a new Canadian context. The Vancouver Arts and Crafts Association, as discussed, was inspired by and drew its name from the original London (England) Arts and Crafts Exhibition Society, founded in 1888, by William Morris. Vancouver’s Association, like the London Society, was an offshoot of the Art Worker’s Guild (founded in London, in 1884), an association of artists, architects, and craftsmen formed to combat professional isolation and to stimulate new ideas about the nature and social role of art and architecture. Similarly, the Naturalists’ Field Club also borrowed heavily from its British antecedents. Its very name was intended to capture the intent and social significance of the English field club, “that masterpiece of [English early Victorian] social mechanics.”

 Appropriately, most of the instigators and key personnel of the two organizations whose members’ backgrounds were analyzed were also English. English architects and artists dominated among the founding members and the first Executive of the Arts and Crafts Association. Of the Association’s founders, six (75 per cent of those with known origin), including instigator Robert MacKay Fripp, were English immigrants. The other two of known origin, H. J. deForest and Herman Alpen were born in New Brunswick and San Francisco, respectively. Similarly, key Field Club personnel, including President William Burns and Julia Henshaw, were English-born. One other, Tom Wilson, was a Scot. Finally, Ruyter S. Sherman was from Brantford, Ontario.

---

12Gillian Naylor, *The Arts and Crafts Movement: A Study of its Sources, Ideals and Influence on Design Theory* (London: Studio Vista, 1971), pp. 120-23. The Exhibition Society was organized by some Guild members to teach the public about the arts and crafts movement’s philosophy and work.
This dominance of key positions by English-born members was reflected in the
general membership compositions of both associations (see Table 7). Like that of the Art,
Historical and Scientific Association, the ethnic compositions of the two associations also ran
counter to that of turn-of-the-century Vancouver. The Arts and Crafts Association's
membership was 54 per cent English-born and 39 per cent Canadian-born. Vancouver's
population, on the other hand, was about 13 per cent English-born and 53 per cent
Canadian-born. The Naturalists' Field Club's English-born membership was even more
substantial, albeit only slightly so: 57 per cent versus 29 per cent Canadian-born. This
preponderance of English-born artists, architects, and naturalists, and their followers,
accordingly illuminated the character and direction of the new associations.

TABLE 7.
NATIONAL ORIGINS OF ARTS AND CRAFTS ASSOCIATION (ACA) AND
NATURALISTS' FIELD CLUB (NFC) MEMBERS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Birthplace</th>
<th>ACA Members</th>
<th>NFC Members</th>
<th>Vancouver Census</th>
<th>Vancouver Census</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1900 No. (%)</td>
<td>1906-07 No. (%)</td>
<td>1901 No. (%)</td>
<td>1911 No. (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
<td>14 (53.8)</td>
<td>5 (71.4)</td>
<td>5,245 (19.4)</td>
<td>39,883 (31.9)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>England</td>
<td>13 (50.0)</td>
<td>4 (57.1)</td>
<td>3,427 (12.7)</td>
<td>23,495 (18.9)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scotland</td>
<td>— —</td>
<td>1 (14.3)</td>
<td>1,107 (4.1)</td>
<td>12,085 (9.8)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ireland</td>
<td>1 (3.8)</td>
<td>— —</td>
<td>625 (2.3)</td>
<td>3,182 (2.6)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>10 (38.5)</td>
<td>2 (28.5)</td>
<td>14,299 (52.9)</td>
<td>53,335 (43.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ontario</td>
<td>6 (23.1)</td>
<td>1 (14.3)</td>
<td>4,977 (18.4)</td>
<td>19,641 (15.9)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Brunswick</td>
<td>1 (3.8)</td>
<td>— —</td>
<td>763 (3.8)</td>
<td>2,735 (2.2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>British Columbia</td>
<td>1 (3.8)</td>
<td>— —</td>
<td>6,112 (22.6)</td>
<td>18,304 (14.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manitoba</td>
<td>— —</td>
<td>1 (14.3)</td>
<td>534 (2.0)</td>
<td>3,667 (2.6)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Zealand</td>
<td>1 (3.8)</td>
<td>— —</td>
<td>43 (0.2)</td>
<td>205 (0.2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>U. S. A.</td>
<td>1 (3.8)</td>
<td>— —</td>
<td>2,258 (8.4)</td>
<td>12,435 (10.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>26 (100)</td>
<td>7 (100)</td>
<td>27,010 (100)</td>
<td>123,902 (100)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

NOTE: The Arts and Crafts Association had a total 1900 membership of 81. Of the sample of 50
members (61.7 per cent of the 81), birth origin data was found for only 26 members (32.1 per cent
of the 81, 52.0 per cent of the 50). The Naturalists' Field Club's membership for 1906-7 was only 18,
one of whom held a "junior" (under age 18) membership. Of the total universe researched, some
data was available for 17 members, and birth origin data was available for only 7 (38.9 per cent of
the 18). This lessened availability of personal data for these organization’s members, compared to Art, Historical and Scientific Association members, results from the lower social status of the members as a whole. The lower one was in the social structure, the less likely of biographical data being recorded and left for posterity.

For census data, see: Canada, Fourth Census of Canada, 1901, vol. 1 (Ottawa: S. E. Dawson, Printer to the King’s Most Excellent Majesty, 1902), pp. 284-5, 418; Canada, Fifth Census of Canada, 1911, vol. 2 (Ottawa: C. H. Parmelee, Printer to the King’s Most Excellent Majesty, 1913), p. 378. The 1901 population figures used here are estimates, derived and calculated from census data for the Burrard. They pertain to Vancouver city only, and have attempted to account for and thus exclude the large numbers (8,951) of Indians and “Half-breeds” present in the rural areas of this vast census district. The remainder of the population has been estimated using a ratio of 0.785 derived from the Vancouver city’s relative population size in the Burrard census district. This method of ethnic population determination was chosen over a similar attempt that derived its ratio without apparent recognition of the large population of native Indians, all grouped on p. 418 of the Census under the category of British Columbia born. Note, in Vancouver city there were, accurately, 892 Indians and 133 “Half-breeds”—3.8% of the city’s total population of 27,010. The Vancouver regional population, including Richmond and New Westminster, was 38,311. The 1911 population figures for Vancouver include Vancouver city, and its contiguous suburbs, North and South Vancouver and Point Grey. For the region comparable to that for 1901, that is including Richmond and New Westminster, the population was 149,490.

What might account for such a strong British, and especially English, contingent within these two associations? First, Englishmen and women, above all, were immigrants. Arriving in vast numbers from the turn of the century onwards, and like so many other immigrants, they could have come together for friendship and support. As with other immigrants, they probably threatened the majority Canadian residents’ sense of national identity. Many brought with them experiences, ideas, and attitudes that were seen as foreign, and perhaps even hostile, to the mostly economic needs of a very young part of Canada. Many immigrant members of the Arts and Crafts Association and Naturalists’ Field Club, for example, were well educated in the aesthetic and scientific skills and traditions of England and the professional middle classes. Canadians resented, in particular, “the patronizing attitude of some Englishmen” and their dependence upon money from “home.”14 They perhaps suspected that such English immigrants would not fully participate in the drive to develop the province. Thus the association members may have formed their groups in response to their sense of rejection, isolation, and alienation.

To illustrate this rejection of at least some English immigrants, note the following observation made by a London Times correspondent in 1908 Vancouver:

In the best club in Vancouver, when an Englishman has put up for permanent membership, a whip has to be sent to the English members in order to overcome the black-balls which will almost certainly be used against the candidate, only because he is an Englishman.15

15Roy, Vancouver, p. 61, quoting from the Times (London), 10 October 1908.
Thus, faced with ethnic and intellectual rejection, English people, like other immigrant groups, formed associations to serve their own interests and needs.

Nevertheless, there were many co-existing clubs, lodges, and regional-origin societies to meet many of these needs. Also, and significantly, virtually all members of both organizations had lived in Vancouver for at least two years prior to each organization's formation. Arts and Crafts Association and Naturalists' Field Club members had averaged 8.3 years and 11.6 years of residency, respectively. Thus they should have had many opportunities to establish formal and informal connections within Vancouver's relevant social and occupational circles.

The "shared goal" of many ethnocentric, including British, regional associations, however, was to "sponsor...recreational activities which maintained aesthetic cultural forms." Particularly important was the "exhibition of overt signs" like regional food, drink, music, and crafts. The importance to immigrants of maintaining such communal cultural activities should not readily be dismissed. As immigrants, and thus needing acceptance and assimilation into a new and essentially foreign society, they undoubtedly also wished to maintain their most valued beliefs and traditions. As Jean Barman has argued, British immigrants created such organizations, including private schools, to resist complete assimilation to the rougher, more practical and materialistic, western Canadian way of life.

16 The figures were computed from the year of arrival for each member for whom such data is available. For the Arts and Crafts Association, there was evidence available for 27, of 50 possible, such members. For them, the dates of arrival ranged from 1877 for James R. Suter, born in Victoria, B.C., in 1875, and moving to New Westminster in 1877, to five other members who arrived in 1898. For the Naturalists' Field Club, evidence was available for seven of 17, the arrival dates ranging from Arthur Marrion's 1886 (though born in England, also in 1886, he actually lived in Vancouver until he moved to Victoria in 1911) to R.W. Suter's 1902. Another Club member, Miss Ivy Abercrombie, probably arrived about the same time of the Club's formation. Nevertheless, since her arrival date is not known, she has not been included within the computation.

17 A. Ross McCormack, "Networks among British Immigrants and Accommodation to Canadian Society: Winnipeg, 1900-1914," Histoire Sociale—Social History 17, 34 (November 1984): 370-72. McCormack's article is useful for his study of the ways which British immigrants imported cultural mechanisms to aid in their accommodation to early twentieth-century Canadian society. Though the family, and its cross-Atlantic connections formed the basis of the networking, other British institutions—churches, benefit and regional cultural societies, and boarding houses—supported immigrant adaptation and advancement by functioning as surrogate families.

On the other hand, by establishing such organizations, these same immigrants may have believed that they might contribute much to the cultivation and development of their adopted land. Though the majority of the members were English, it was only accidental that Canadian born and others had failed to accept invitations to join. As evidenced by the curricula of the organizations studied here, association promoters had hoped somehow to introduce Vancouver’s residents to the beauty and utility of aesthetics and natural science. Through this education they wanted to change or at least moderate the prevailing ugliness and the destructiveness of unbridled and unenlightened economic speculation and development.

Of course, and as will be made plain in the following section, such altruism was not without its very personal and non-altruistic interests and anticipated benefits. If nothing else, the members must have come to Vancouver hoping to improve their own lives. Most were not capitalists, however. Thus they may have viewed their aesthetic or scientific expertise as their best means to a better social and perhaps economic position. After all, and as with Art, Historical and Scientific Association members, they found that scholarship and the arts were rejected and scorned as unprofitable in a Canada bewitched by commercial success and material gain.\(^\text{19}\)

Finally, the dominance of this single ethnic group suggests that both the Arts and Crafts Association and the Naturalists’ Field Club inadvertently became rather exclusive ethnic clubs. This exclusiveness vastly hindered their attempts to expand their memberships. Ultimately it starved and weakened the organizations. Membership in the Arts and Crafts Association peaked in its first year at 81, while that in the Naturalists’ Field Club never rose above a dismal 18. Other Canadian-born and foreign-born residents likely found that these associations were quite foreign to their own values and experiences and offered little for their own needs and interests. Subsequently, there was little desire to join the associations’ programmes.

Correspondingly, the English members of the associations likely would have resisted any attempts to recruit members from non-Anglo-Saxon ethnic groups. Many Anglo-Saxon Protestants believed that other “races” (and Roman Catholics) were culturally (and in some cases intellectually) inferior to themselves. They also believed it impossible to assimilate

them fully into the British culture. Their national heritage was one of dominance; they would hardly seek to mix with, let alone learn from, those whom they believed to be inferior. Thus, in the end, ethnic exclusivity, in combination with the members’ conflicting curricular interests and goals (this latter a product of social class interests), crushed both associations.

6.3.2. Members’ Social Origins and Practical Culture

The social origins of Arts and Crafts Association and Naturalists’ Field Club members provide even more powerful explanations of the organizations’ curricula and fates than do the members’ English ethnicity. The choice of study topics and the apparent ambiguity and confusion about these choices, for example, reflected occupational and class differences, even amongst the English members. Above all, these organizations were dominated by professional artists, teachers and scientists, and by middle- and upper middle-class amateurs. This dominance, in particular, explains the associations’ interest in boosting and improving Vancouver, and especially, in promoting the members’ own occupational, recreational, and class interests. Conversely, this same dominance explains the associations’ failure to expand beyond their initial membership, to adequately confront the political questions implied by their expressed egalitarian goals, and to orient their curricula around working-class needs, interests, and proficiencies.

Officially, the two organizations (and the B.C. Mountaineering Club) de-emphasized social differences and competition amongst the members. Instead, they promoted social collaboration and co-operation. Together, John Davidson of the B.C. Mountaineering Club urged, “teachers, surveyors, prospectors, and many other people...have opportunities of making outdoor studies in botany[,]...[with a particularly] special field open to climbers.”

Likewise, and most directly, the Arts and Crafts Association’s “chief aim” was “to bring the

---


designer and the workman or craftsman into closer relationship." They sought to ensure, for each member, a "mutual benefit and education."

While it was not entirely unusual for organizations to officially advocate an open membership (Reverend Tucker and the Arts, Historical and Scientific Association is the classic local example), it was less usual to actually practise it. And, even when "practised," it usually was organized around members' economic, social, or sexual roles and characteristics. Women in the Arts, Historical and Scientific Association, for example, while accorded administrative roles, did not give papers or lectures and, according to press releases, appeared not to become overly involved in ensuing discussions. Also in that same association, lectures and conversazioni were reserved, essentially, for the city's higher classes. The Museum was for everybody else.

Significantly, however, the Arts and Crafts Association and the Naturalists' Field Club (and the B.C. Mountaineering Club) actually tried to implement their egalitarian and democratic intentions. To demonstrate, Table 8, following, portrays three clear facts. With these facts we can both explain their curricula and infer the underlying reasons for their members' participation.

First, at the core of each organization, there was a large (and in the case of the Naturalists' Field Club, almost overwhelming) cadre of professionally or practically experienced members. That is, these members brought with them to the new Club or Association experience as a professional artist, architect, scientist, or teacher, or as a dedicated, practised amateur. These core members amounted to 40 per cent (20 of the sample of 50) of the Arts and Crafts Association's membership (totalling 81), and 68.8 per cent (11 of the sample of 16) of the Naturalists' Field Club's adult members. Significantly, fully 52.9 per cent (9 of 16) of the Naturalists' Field Club's members were teachers.

Second, something of the occupational and gender spread that had been hoped for and even proclaimed by zealous promoters did develop. The memberships of both organizations included stenographers, and a variety of other business and industrial occupations. The Arts and Crafts Association, as designed, had a number (albeit small) of tradesmen and labourers. These included two contractors, a plumber, a brewer, a job

22 Arts and Crafts Association Minutes, Pamphlet, n.d., 1p.
23 Arts and Crafts Association Minutes, 9 May 1900.
printer, a bicycle repairer, a picture framer, a metal/plumbing merchant, a building supply merchant, and a mechanical engineer. All were proprietors of their own business establishments. There were also three sash and door factory workers, and a baker, a bookbinder, and an electrician. Finally, 30 per cent (15 of 50) of the Association’s membership were women, though 22 per cent (11 of 50) had no employable occupation. Two women identified themselves as artists, one was a teacher, and one was a legal stenographer. The Naturalists’ Field Club similarly included two stenographers, a customs officer, a real estate agent, and a retail clerk. All 5 Field Club women (31.2 per cent) were employed.

Nevertheless, and finally, that spread was neither as broad, nor as inclusive, as expected. Only 14 per cent (7 of 50) of the Arts and Crafts Association’s membership were trades or labouring employees. And, while 37.5 per cent of the Naturalists’ Field Club’s adult members were truly amateurs, it took the highly successful B.C. Mountaineering Club to significantly expand nature study far beyond the interest of teachers and the commercial classes.
### TABLE 8.

**OCCUPATIONS OF ARTS AND CRAFTS ASSOCIATION (ACA) AND NATURALISTS' FIELD CLUB (NFC) MEMBERS, EMPLOYED OR OF IMMEDIATE RELATIVE**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Occupational Type</th>
<th>ACA Employed</th>
<th>ACA Relative's Employm't</th>
<th>NFC Employed</th>
<th>NFC Relative's Employm't</th>
<th>Vancouver Occupations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No. (%)</td>
<td>No. (%)</td>
<td>No. (%)</td>
<td>No. (%)</td>
<td>No. (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Professional</strong></td>
<td>21 (42.0)</td>
<td>5 (10.0)</td>
<td>14 (82.4)</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>3971</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Artist</td>
<td>9 (18.0)</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educator</td>
<td>2 (4.0)</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>9 (52.9)</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>508</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Architect</td>
<td>4 (8.0)</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Photographer</td>
<td>2 (4.0)</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lawyer</td>
<td>1 (2.0)</td>
<td>3 (6.0)</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journalist</td>
<td>1 (2.0)</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>1 (5.9)</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mech Engineer</td>
<td>1 (2.0)</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accountant</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>1 (2.0)</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>295</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gov't Official</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>1 (2.0)</td>
<td>2 (11.8)</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>477</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Legal Steno</td>
<td>1 (2.0)</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stenographer</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>2 (11.8)</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>680</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Merchant</td>
<td>3 (6.0)</td>
<td>1 (2.0)</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>1 (5.9)</td>
<td>2040</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brokers</td>
<td>1 (2.0)</td>
<td>2 (4.0)</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>512</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Real Es/Ins</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>1 (5.9)</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>1478</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retail Clerk</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>1 (5.9)</td>
<td>4266</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Owner-Manufbr</td>
<td>3 (6.0)</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labor-Sash/Door</td>
<td>3 (6.0)</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>1513</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baker</td>
<td>1 (2.0)</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>242</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bookbinder</td>
<td>1 (2.0)</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contractor</td>
<td>4 (8.0)</td>
<td>1 (2.0)</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>855</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electrician</td>
<td>1 (2.0)</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plumber</td>
<td>1 (2.0)</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>584</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carpenter</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>1 (2.0)</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>2991</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mechanic-CPR</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>1 (2.0)</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
<td>--</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**TOTAL** 39 (78.0) 11 (22.0) 16 (94.1) 1 (5.9) 50628

NOTE: Two columns for each organization here: one for those members fully employed or earning a living in a trade, business, or profession; the other for non-employed wives or daughters of employed relatives.

Note also, Naturalists' Field Club member Ivy Abercrombie, recently arrived in Vancouver (she was in England as late as July 1906), has been included as an educator though there is no record of her being employed as such in Vancouver until 1910. She had recently finished studies at The Horticultural College, Swanley, Kent, and had also taught agricultural subjects in Suffolk. See University of British Columbia, Special Collections, VF 269, Abercrombie, Miss Ivy. Also, several women have been included as employed. For those included as artists, there is no means of estimating the income they might have derived from their artistic work, such work being a precarious income earner in early (and present) Vancouver. Finally, one male contractor, Arts and Crafts Association member Francis W. Caulfield, could have been categorized as an artist, or as a capitalist, town planner, or private scholar of languages, art, and astronomy. See VCA, M 1685,
Caulfeild, Admiral.

For census data, see: Canada. *Fifth Census of Canada, 1911: Occupations of the People*, vol. 6 (Ottawa: J. De L. Tache, 1915), pp. 286-296. This census division includes Vancouver city, and Vancouver's immediate and contiguous suburbs, North and South Vancouver and Point Grey. The 1911 occupations are used as there was no comparable occupational breakdown in the 1901 census.

As noted, each association's programme of mutual enlightenment was formed around a cadre of well-skilled and experienced members. This cadre provided the leadership and the core of each organization's programme sub-committee (Arts and Crafts Association) or section (Naturalists' Field Club). They shared their expertise with the other members of their particular sub-committee or section. The specific curriculum of each sub-committee or section, of course, reflected quite clearly the occupational interests and experience of the leading members.

The Arts and Crafts Association's curriculum, for example, as reflected by the sub-committees, was clearly constructed around the members' occupational expertise. To repeat, the sub-committees included "Mechanical drawing in iron and wood, and engineering," "Amateur Photography," "Lithography," and "Decorator and Applied Art." Correspondingly, the Association had members of comparable occupational backgrounds, including John B. Houston, a mechanical engineer; Paul L. Okamura and George T. Wadds, professional photographers; Herman M. Alpen and Victor S. Thurston, chief artist and artist, respectively, for the *Province* newspaper, and Thomas W. Hastings, the proprietor of a job printing business; and Charles and James Bloomfield, design artists specializing in stained glass for large public and private buildings, including the Provincial Parliament Building. Even the more esoteric fine arts and handicrafts could count on experienced, professional mentors, including H. J. deForest, Thomas W. Fripp, and Thomas Mower Martin.

The Naturalists' Field Club had a similar congruence between its professional members and section structure. The section leaders included: T. Wilson, A. E. W. Salt, J. K. Henry, and Mrs. Julia Henshaw for Botany; T. Wilson, R. V. Harvey, A. H. Bush, and R. S. Sherman for Entomology, and J. Porter and R. W. Suter for Geology. Over half were teachers—Porter taught mechanical engineering at Columbian College, Harvey, Henry, Salt, Sherman, and Suter were elementary or high school teachers. Wilson, who participated in two sections—Botany and Entomology—was a professional scientist.

24 Naturalists' Field Club Minutes, 11 October 1906; newspaper clippings, n.d.
employed by the federal agricultural department. He, like Harvey, was also a founding member of the B.C. Entomological Association. Bush, also a member of the Entomological Association, owned a real estate and insurance business. Finally, Henshaw was locally recognized for her botanical work, especially in mountain environments, and as a journalist and author.  

Even more significantly, the influence of the teachers can readily be seen in the pedagogical structure of the programme. The teachers read scientific papers, such as by Harvey on “Mimicry” and by Miss Laura Eaton on “Lemuridae.” They “entertain[ed]” with lantern slides, including Harvey’s “description of an entomologist’s trip over the Hope Mountains, and loaned specimens for examination, such as Henry’s “typical selection of local and Canadian plants, whose specific peculiarities he pointed out in a clear and entertaining manner.” They (officially the Club) even offered prizes “for competition among the Junior members” for wild flower collections, water-colour sketches, and written field-day descriptions. Other Club members, of course, contributed in less formal ways through questions, discussion, and in the examination and comparison of the specimens.

The cadre of well-skilled and experienced members, played an equally powerful role as core members of the sub-committees and sections. As such, they participated in areas outside their expertise. They either joined sections or sub-committees other than those corresponding to their expertise, or participated in total group activities such as the Art Exhibition or natural history field day previously discussed. In doing so, they carried out a

---

25A true adventurer, Mrs. Henshaw was well known in local and international circles as an amateur botanist, explorer, and geographer, novelist and nature writer, and arts patron and socialite. Born in Durham, England, in 1869, and educated in England, France, and Germany, she came to Montreal with her parents, eventually moving with her husband Charles Gordon Henshaw to Vancouver in 1890. With her husband, she had explored the “sources of both the Columbia and Kootenay Rivers” in 1896 and later had mapped and explored central Vancouver Island. For the Vancouver Island work, she was made a Fellow of the Royal Geographical Society, in 1911. She wrote two books and several articles on mountain botany, and was a member of the Ladies Alpine Club (London) and the Trail Riders of Canada, as well as the Naturalists’ Field Club and later the Alpine Club of Canada. She was even decorated for heroism by the French (“Croix de Guerre and gold star”) in the Great War. Finally, Mrs. Henshaw, was also responsible, along with Mrs. C. J. Peter (AHSA), for the formation of the Women’s Musical Club. In 1911 she also helped found the Georgian Club for women. She was also a newspaper columnist and from 1900 to 1910 was Editor of the News-Advertiser’s “Sunday Page.” See G. A. (Audrey) Williams, “Julia Henshaw, 1869-1937,” Unpublished typescript, 3 pp.; Henshaw, Mrs. Julia, Add. Mss. 55, vol. 13, file H, M4131, VCA.

26Naturalists’ Field Club Minutes, 30 November 1906; 8 December 1906; 19 January 1907.

27Naturalists’ Field Day Minutes, 11 October 1906.
key function of both associations, that of breaking down the artificially-erected and professionally-imposed barriers between the various arts and crafts and the natural sciences. Promoters of both organizations believed it to be paramount that the knowledge should be shared; that the value of such knowledge was in its broad dissemination and use, not in its restriction to a closed “profession.”

The Arts and Crafts Association, for example, acted according to the principles first established by the London Art Workers’ Guild. By participating in other sub-committees, the Association’s artists, architects, and craftsmen probably hoped to draw themselves together, viewing their own and each other’s work as part of a greater aesthetic unity from which they each drew inspiration and knowledge. Stained glass artist Charles Bloomfield and architect Sydney Eveleigh, for example, represented the “Amateur Photography” sub-committee at general meetings. Other crossovers included interior and exterior design artist James Bloomfield and architect R. Mackay Fripp on the “Furniture, wood carving and the designing of furniture” sub-committee, and patent artist Rowland Brittain on the “Mechanical drawing in iron and wood, and engineering” sub-committee. These crossovers also revealed themselves at the Association’s public exhibitions, such as the First Annual Art Exhibition reviewed earlier. At such exhibitions, participants often produced works outside of their occupational specialty, either alone or in collaboration with other Association members.

Though the Field Club was too small to use effectively its sections, the “principal [sic] of co-operation” was very important to its task. President Burns, for example, had described the role of voluntary association in scientific work: “By working together they [spare hours] are practically saved and their [naturalists’] results, however trifling, make a grand total.” This reflected the disparate backgrounds and specific expertise of each member, including those professionally trained. The programme thus promoted the idea that each member could make a valuable contribution, and that each member had something to learn. The Club was determined to compile a record of local flora, fauna, and geology. It was paramount, then, that each member learn to systematically collect and identify specimens during and after field excursions. Such work also provided a systematic scientific education for all members, including the few teachers who were attracted by the

28 Arts and Crafts Association Minutes, 19 May 1900.
29 Naturalists’ Field Club Minutes, 11 October 1906.
Club's promise of help in teaching "nature study." R. V. Harvey, the Club's instigator, captured this spirit when he proposed as the Club's motto: "Know something of everything, and everything of something."\(^{30}\)

Each organization's curricula clearly reflected the experience, training, and limitations of the professional core members. The Arts and Crafts Association's curriculum, for example, apparently interpreted the broader Arts and Crafts movement's principles somewhat narrowly. Indeed, the impact of Arts and Crafts design appears to have been limited (though not insignificantly) to its incorporation in various local projects. Included here are architect Robert MacKay Fripp's rustic "California Bungalows" (along with other Arts and Crafts inspired "English Cottages") characteristic of much of Vancouver's housing stock;\(^{31}\) and developer Francis Caulfeild's "traditional" English village styled "Caulfeilds," in West Vancouver.\(^{32}\) Similarly, James Bloomfield designed Vancouver's Coast of Arms (1903), the "Queen Victoria memorial in native granite and bronze in Stanley Park," and stained glass windows and the ballroom murals at the Lieutenant-Governor's residence, Government House, in Victoria, and stained glass in numerous churches, banks and other public buildings throughout North America. Finally, James Bloomfield, with his father and his brother Charles (Charles had been the Arts and Crafts Association's first Treasurer), also designed the stained and leaded glass windows in the British Columbia Parliament Building.\(^{33}\)

Likewise, the interests of the Field Club also influenced the expansion and dissemination of scientific knowledge about British Columbia. The impact was perhaps most notable in the books and articles, cited throughout this and the preceding chapter. Perhaps, too, the impact can be seen in the relative ease that Provincial Biologist John Davidson had in finding observers to collect and record the data used to compile his "First Annual Report of the Botanical Office, published by the Government, 1913."\(^{34}\)

There is little evidence, however, to suggest any deep exploration and discussion of

---

\(^{30}\) Ibid.


\(^{32}\) VCA, M 1685, Caulfeild, Admiral.

\(^{33}\) VCA M 877, James Bloomfield.

the broader social, political, and economic issues that had stimulated Ruskin, Morris, and their sympathizers in London and elsewhere, or the nature conservation movement. Nevertheless, there was still a relatively strong undercurrent of reaction to philistinism, and to urban and industrial conditions in general.

The Arts and Crafts Association executive, for example, was apparently conscious of and, by 1901, quite distressed about the lack of appreciable development in arts and crafts ideas and in architectural and product design. They were concerned especially about the Association’s failure to attract sufficient numbers from two of the three constituencies essential to a “true” arts and crafts association—“blue-collar” workers and craftsmen, and architects. Only the local artistic community was there in some strength. This failure to expand much beyond their initial membership struck to the core and especially to the heart of their purpose.

On workingmen, “Discussion arose as to the best means of obtaining more craftsmen as members...and getting them to exhibit.” As noted, trades and labour employees comprised only fourteen per cent of Association membership. A further twenty per cent were proprietors of trades establishments (one was a mechanical engineer).

This failure was compounded, further, by the Association’s inability to attract architects. The Association had only four architects. Association President Mower Martin was so disturbed over the first Exhibition’s lack of architectural design that he roundly chastised the practitioners of that learned profession in their national periodical:

When it is considered that the number of architects practising in British Columbia probably is nearly half a hundred it is surprising to find but three of that number exhibiting on the walls of the association. If the practise of the first and the highest of the arts lie with men who are themselves so little appreciative of the real position of architecture in the world of art, or so little desirous of impressing upon the public the high nature of their vocation, what can be expected from that same public but a continued attitude of indifference?...[R]eally, an Arts and Crafts Association with scarcely a sign of the artistic foundation upon which associations must of necessity rest is a noteworthy curiosity.

Martin’s frustration and public criticism, however, forced his resignation from the Association, on February 22, 1901. His critique was perceived by other Association

---

35 Arts and Crafts Association Minutes, 10 April 1901.
members as both personal and professional.

Martin’s critique, however, underlined members’ worries about their Association’s apparent drift away from the movement’s potentially revolutionary and certainly idealistic goals. The Exhibition’s exhibit list, for example, shows that the “arts and crafts” idea was being interpreted more in the amateur sense of handicrafts, rather than in the more polished, professional sense of fine furniture and tastefully executed building design. Having failed to attract enough architects and artisans, the Association’s aesthetic mission was seen as failing. Contrary to the primary instructional goal of an arts and crafts exhibition, many Association members, including some architects, artists, and school teachers, and certainly its leisured ladies, seemed to view their organization as a hobby and recreational “art club,” and as an avenue for exhibiting their own work. For these members, the Association was hardly a vehicle to promote aesthetic or social change.

Similarly some Naturalists’ Field Club members also seemed to raise deeper questions, if only in passing, and to react to philistinism. William Burns, Club President and Normal School Principal, for example, called for a “New System of Education” to counteract the harsh, alien conditions of cities. This new system should be powered by students’ “[i]nterest, natural, unperverted and unrestrained.” Furthermore, it should be dissociated from the interests of “‘big business.’” Instead it should derive from an appointed commission of internationally reputed educationists, scientists, and above all, women.37 This dread of philistinism also clearly stirred many local naturalists to fight powerful forestry and mining interests and lobby the provincial government for a park preserve north of Vancouver (Garibaldi Park). However, as with the dissonance over aesthetics within the Arts and Crafts Association, the wilderness ethic and conservation concerns were strong enough only in the Field Club’s much larger successor, the B.C. Mountaineering Club, to have significant effect.38

Many in both organizations had hoped to model a more co-operative, progressive, natural, and aesthetically sensitive relationship amongst the social and economic classes, albeit without necessarily restructuring society. This relationship would be based upon a sacred and enlightened bond between humankind and nature. These members also believed

37William Burns, manuscript “Notes on Nature & the New Education” in the Naturalists’ Field Club Minutes, n.d.
that society eventually could become educated to the new values, especially through the agency of mutually promoted enlightenment.

These core members, within both organizations, and all the others who joined, nevertheless also had other, more personal interests. Primarily, they probably sought to improve their occupational status. They sought either to advance the status and public recognition of their trade or profession, or to improve and to advance, individually, their own position within a given occupation.

The professional arts community, for example, needed to sell art to prosper or even to survive. Quite likely, Arts and Crafts Association artists had hoped that their membership and connections to other artists and to potential art buyers and patrons would further their careers. Three facts support this argument. First, the Arts and Crafts Association held periodic “Art Unions” or sales of the members’ art. Second, as part of this process, the Association had invited prominent men to serve as Honorary Members and patrons. Each Honorary Member was given five free chances to win artwork at any Association-sponsored exhibition. Presumably, such patrons were to lend prestige, credibility, and dignity to the Association, tying it to the city’s elite society, and hopefully to contribute to its overall success. Included as Honorary Members were the Governor-General of Canada, the Lieutenant-Governor of British Columbia, and Harry Abbott, superintendent of the C.P.R. Third, and finally, the Association eventually failed, in part, because many artists left Vancouver during and shortly after the Association’s lifespan.

Being an artist in Vancouver must have seemed bleak indeed. True, the region presented artists with some of the most beautiful landscape in the world. Vancouverites, however, showed “so little interest” in purchasing (or even seeing) local artwork that the Association’s Second Annual Art Exhibition “was, financially, a complete failure.” With an average attendance of only 30 per day, Vancouver’s public apparently offered no “intelligent appreciation...probably because they did not have it to give.”

The Association apparently ended shortly after this exhibition, with R. M. Fripp’s

41Ibid. Though this exhibition’s collection was “the best ever,” the reviewer was so disgusted with the Vancouver public that he quipped: “A nigger minstrel show would have drawn five hundred.”
move to Toronto and later to California, and with the “scattering of other important members.” Another former member, James Bloomfield, left Vancouver around 1904, “for wider fields, because as he puts it with a twinkle in his eye and a suggestion of tartness in his voice, ‘it was a case of politely starving to death or getting the hell out of there!’” He was later reported, on a visit to Toronto and New York, to be “looking forward to the time when Vancouver shall have so grown in population and wealth that her citizens will have more leisure than at present to devote to matters artistic.” Two others, H. J. deForest and W. Ferris went on to supplement their income, working as paid secretaries and museum curators for the Art, Historical and Scientific Association.

As members, and along with other Association members, many of these professional artists and architects likely attended design artist James Bloomfield’s ten week illustrated lecture course on “Decorative Design.” Those who were true cultists in the arts and crafts tradition would have wanted to gather the latest styles and methods, and perhaps to exchange ideas and opinions about the direction of the movement and the need for its expression in Vancouver. Certainly many of the more “philistine” members could have attended for the same reasons. Nevertheless, the Association’s building contractors, property developer, real estate broker, construction industry merchants, and various tradesmen attending the course, and with sympathies for a more beautiful city, conceivably had more concrete, and lucrative, ideas about arts and crafts design applications. Similarly, the different product manufacturers present may have been shopping for new product ideas, and perhaps for ways to improve their employees’ workmanship. Vancouver’s major industrial base was primary resource production. Thus inventive and enterprising individuals might have hoped to make their mark in the promotion and development of finished instead of raw products.

---

43 *Province*, 17 September 1912, p 14.
44 VCA, M 877, James Bloomfield. He worked for a time as a journalist on the *Christian Science Monitor* before moving on to Toronto and back to his beloved art.
46 *News-Advertiser*, 9 November 1900. Tickets to the course were two dollars, with single tickets available at 25 cents per lecture.
47 Someone might consider following up this speculation, perhaps by tracing some Association members who were involved in the real estate and construction business to see if ever they worked or collaborated on projects that might have incorporated relevant design principles. Caulfeild’s West Vancouver development would of course be a good place to start.
Any skilled and unskilled workers attending Bloomfield's course might also have wanted to advance their own social and economic welfare. They may have wanted to learn new skills, or make new and better employer contacts. Conversely, they could have been quite conversant with Morris's communitarian ideas, and like Morris, were disappointed and disaffected by the more popular movements in unionization and bureaucratic socialism. Either way, none of these working-class members appeared to be connected with the province's burgeoning labour movement, and especially with its "labour aristocracy." As Crossick has noted, a labour aristocracy conceived working class achievement as improved economic well-being combined with values of respectability, but of and within the primary social stratum—not as individual economic advancement.\(^{48}\) Local labour leaders might have joined the Association, but only if they believed this could have advanced class interests. Their primary interest in Vancouver was to foster a class consciousness amongst all British Columbia workers.\(^{49}\) They did not join, however. Perhaps they sensed a lack of commitment towards and a serious understanding of workers' needs amongst many or most of the Association's members. For the workers who did join, individual or family advancement was a more likely reason.

Career advancement, for individual Association members or their offspring, is readily noted by comparing their occupation between 1901 and 1911.\(^{50}\) James Murray and Horace Foster, both labourers in sash and door factories, for example, became, respectively, a qualified sawyer, and a real estate agent. Foster, like so many others, undoubtedly was taking advantage of the prevailing boom in real estate speculation. Employee electrician Dennis Hotson, likewise, advanced his career. He was an electrical engineer by 1911. And, bicycle repairer Ernest Easthope became an inventor and manufacturer of gasoline engines, including (date unknown) "the well-known marine engine" of the Easthope name. Finally, plumber Otto Laursen, while probably retired by 1911, did have three children who showed clear social and economic advancement. The children, Kai, Lillie, and Viggo, respectively were employed as an Orpheum theatre employee, a teacher, and a solicitor.

In a related sense, something of the century-old intellectual spirit that had drawn

---


workingmen to co-operate in “mutual improvement” clubs or to join a local mechanics’ institute may also have been operating. The Arts and Crafts Association’s topics were practical, something that these workers understood and could appreciate. Thus while workers as individuals joined, perhaps to enhance their individual social and economic status, they may have also sought to do so within the class and material framework that they understood.

The Naturalists’ Field Club members probably had similar motives. The Club’s nine teachers (the Arts and Crafts Association also had two), for example, quite likely wanted to raise their own and their profession’s status, and especially the teaching of science (and art). As Carl Berger, has argued: “Educators in the public school system were in the forefront of efforts to secure a more adequate recognition of natural science in the classroom.” The introduction of nature study was viewed as essential to that effort. And the promotion of its economic benefits, in agriculture, for instance, prodded these new ideas to a more skeptical public. These goals can be seen readily in both the Club’s commitment to teach nature study to other teachers, and in William Burns’ call for educational reconstruction.

As individuals, Field Club members Miss Ivy Abercrombie and Arthur Marrion probably utilized their Club experience to advance into teaching. Abercrombie, recently arrived from England, and a graduate of The Horticulture College, Swanley, Kent, went on to teach nature study at the Provincial Normal School, and later to illustrate John Davidson’s *Conifers, Junipers and Yew of British Columbia* (1927). Marrion, an excise officer in 1906, went on to study and to teach, after 1911, in Victoria.

Other scientific professionals such as federal fruit inspector Tom Wilson and such science teachers as Harvey, Porter, or Sherman, also hoped to utilize clubs like the Field and the Mountaineering Clubs to advance their own scientific endeavours. By getting together small armies of amateur observers, they could systematically collect and record botanical, entomological, and geological data, thereby advancing the known geography of the still very frontier province. Even dedicated amateur adventurers like Julia Henshaw did much the same, though for a more popular audience.

---

52 U.B.C. Special Collections, Abercrombie.
6.3.3. Opportunity, Femininity, and the “New Woman”

For women, membership in the Arts and Crafts Association and in the natural science clubs was a qualitatively distinct experience. To a large (though perhaps not complete) extent, they experienced real power within a mixed sex organization. Like the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, all these organizations elected women to their executive councils. These new organizations, however, also offered the women educational opportunities equal to those available to the male members. Such power reflected and recognized their traditionally perceived aesthetic superiority, their occupational status, and, to a limited extent, their connections to Vancouver’s economic elite. Their power, however, also likely acknowledged their expanding economic, social, and political positions within the greater society.

Significantly, many of these women were fully employed (including those self-employed), seeking employment, or earning money selling artistic or written work. Their occupations paralleled those of the men in these organizations. Many were either artists or teachers. Others held clerical positions. Accordingly, these women, their experiences, and their reasons for participation more properly belong in the previous section. Nevertheless, the social and political circumstances of their participation warrant their separate treatment. Also, their specific situation, and their interests, more clearly illuminate the competing ideologies that contributed to the collapse of the two organizations within two years of their founding.

To begin, the Vancouver Arts and Crafts Association constitutionally recognized the importance of women to its activities, and to art in general. The Vice-Presidency was shared equally between a woman and a man. This, undoubtedly, was to reflect the large number of women in the Association, some 30 of 81 members in 1900. More significantly, this rule also recognized art and culture as within women’s general sphere of competence. As historian Karen Blair has noted:

A strong bond existed between the spirituality attributed to the lady and her comfort in the spiritual realm of the arts. If ladies were supposed to be naturally otherworldly and intuitive in their care for others, it was logical that they were well-suited to explore the abstractedness of the arts. Furthermore, the compatibility of the moral lady and the uplifting quality of the arts made their coexistence probable....The arts, potentially, could uplift everyone, much
as women were supposed to do. Women and the arts belonged together.\textsuperscript{54}

Notably, four of the fifteen women members (from the total sample of fifty) were "ladies," well connected to Vancouver's elite society. They were either wives or daughters of prominent Vancouver businessmen,\textsuperscript{55} and thus were linked to potential (if unrequited) patrons of the Vancouver Arts and Crafts Association. The backgrounds of some of these women, and especially those with important social connections, however, also meant that they would hardly be sympathetic to any of William Morris's more radical (i.e., communitarian socialist) ideas. Rather, they more likely supported the Association's extensions to the working classes as a form of charity and as expressions of their own moral and political motives.

The Naturalists' Field Club, with five women and one girl amongst its eighteen members, had elected three women—Ivy Abercrombie, Laura Eaton, and Julia Henshaw—to its executive committee. None, however, were elected as Club officers. The B.C. Mountaineering Club, with its similar proportion (23 of 91 members in 1913), nevertheless, did have female officers. One of their two initial vice-presidents was female, a Miss Loverock. A Miss Mitchell was on the first executive committee.\textsuperscript{56}

The meaning of the apparent equality of women and men in these organizations is somewhat ambiguous. Morris's Arts and Crafts Exhibition Society accorded women no such position, though women were active in the background and were a major force in the arts and crafts movement on both sides of the Atlantic.\textsuperscript{57} They were excluded from the


\textsuperscript{55}These women were Miss Margaret Eldridge, Miss Constance Hamersley, Mrs. Hamersley, and Mrs. A. D. Taylor. Edward Cook and William O'Neil were also recognized business leaders. See R. A. J. McDonald, "Business Leaders in Early Vancouver, 1886-1914" (Ph.D. thesis, History, University of British Columbia, 1977), p.174.

\textsuperscript{56}J. P. [John Porter], "Historical Note," \textit{Northern Cordilleran}, p. 5. And, while the Field Club's connections to Vancouver Society and to its business elite is much less tenuous, it did possess one such member—Julia Henshaw. As discussed, she eventually joined up with some of city's better established outdoor enthusiasts in the Vancouver chapter of the Alpine Club of Canada, a Club socially "important" enough to be included in the 1914 \textit{Vancouver Social Register and Club Directory} (pp. 79-80). In that year she was the Alpine Club's Vice-Chairman; Elizabeth Fowler, also a former Field Club member, was on the executive committee.

\textsuperscript{57}Callen, \textit{Women}, pp. 15-16. In particular, she stresses that in the Art Workers' Guild, the association of like-minded architects, designers, artists, and craftsmen that "fulfilled the crucial need for an arena for discussion and the exchange of ideas[,]...[this] most influential, elite bodies of the Arts and Crafts movement, excluded women from its ranks."
Society’s general membership, and served instead in a more traditional “auxiliary” role. Nevertheless, many did receive training and became experienced practitioners of the arts and crafts. Women associated with the British movement, like those in Canada, were assumed to possess “naturally” the sensibilities and disposition that then could be easily cultivated into useful and employable skills. Thus, they were seen as fit, even if not quite professional, to become artists and craftswomen. The British women were not admitted to the inner circles, however, unlike their counterparts in Vancouver.

Likewise for women associated with the natural sciences. Teaching, and particularly elementary school teaching, was also considered an extension of traditional femininity. It was only natural that they would further their knowledge and perhaps their careers. Teachers of both sexes, in other places, had used associations like the Field Club to enhance the reputation of the natural sciences and nature study. The women’s prominence accordingly reflected (in a somewhat subdued fashion) their numerical superiority among Vancouver teachers. In 1911, for example, they outnumbered Vancouver male teachers 357 to 131.58

Such prominence in a natural science club, however, like any position for women in society, was not easily attained. Science had formerly been seen as a primarily male activity. And in most circles, it was still being seen that way. As Berger notes, “women were treated with condescension.” Nevertheless, with women, by the 1880s, coming to dominate elementary teaching, their exclusion “became a political question, and the sex barrier to membership was broken.” Generally, though not in Vancouver, women members were in the vast majority of the nation’s natural science societies.59

How may we account for this apparent intellectual, creative, physical, economic, and political power of the Arts and Crafts Association’s and Naturalists’ Field Club’s female members? The theories (particularly about middle-class women) advanced to date, that explain women’s attitudes and behaviour in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, offer some insight. Each of these theories developed around one or another competing ideals

58 Canada, Census of Canada, 1911, p. 292.
of femininity.  

The earliest of these theories, developed by the 1870s, was the “vital energy theory” or the “theory of moral physiology.” This theory held that women were “delicate” creatures—passive, vulnerable, and dull-witted. They were dominated by their physiology, not their rational faculties. Furthermore, their life roles were restricted primarily to the “caring for home and husband and [the] producing and rearing of children.” In fact, undue sexual (i.e., non-procreative) and intellectual stimulation and activity (including education) were considered grave threats to the vital energy critical to their health and to the development of their reproductive organs. Female education, as cautioned Dr. Edward Clarke, contributed to “monstrous brains and puny bodies; abnormally weak digestion; flowing thought and constipated bowels....”

Some early Women’s Rights’ activists took these beliefs as the basis from which they began to assert women’s biological and moral superiority. They asserted that the ideal female role was still motherhood, and that her moral power lay in the home. However, these early “maternal feminists” also held that sexual continence (a not too difficult proposition, since it was believed, “women lacked any kind of sexual desire....”), and increasingly, physical education and exercise (“performed gracefully, without sweating”), would add to their vital energy reserve, and ensure healthy bodies and babies. By developing sound moral and hygienic habits, from birth, and by taking control of the home and child rearing and education, these women’s rights activists argued that women’s role and power could be vastly improved.

Maternal feminists by the 1890s, however, increasingly advocated the legitimate extension of women’s maternal powers into society. Society, until then, had been seen as a

---

60 See, for example, Deborah Gorham, *The Victorian Girls and the Feminine Ideal* (London: Croom Helm, 1982).
63 Vertinsky, “Physical Education,” p. 31.
male preserve. Concern was mounting over the damaging effects of industry, commercial competition, and urban blight upon the family and on society as a whole. The family, these new feminists argued, was the foundation stone of society, and was, they contended, their distinct preserve. They began to organize in the areas of social, political, moral, and cultural reform, and ventured forth, therefore, to demand a responsible share of political power. Like the reformers who preceded them, they did not, however, advocate women's equal sharing of men's economic world. They sought no change in the status quo of relations between men and women. Their power would continue to be their femininity.  

In concert with the maternal feminists in their agitation for the vote, radical feminists saw women as deserving full and true equality with men. A much smaller group than the maternal feminists, they questioned and criticized the status quo—the church, the family, and the capitalist system. They wanted status equal to men, not because they possessed "special virtues and qualities," but because "they were human beings like men."

The evidence of the Arts and Crafts Association and the Naturalists' Field Club women suggests that the women did not conform well to any one of the four feminist ideals. None of these women appear to have been involved any of the direct reform or political activities undertaken by those women who espoused any of the above views. These two associations, unlike the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, did not join the maternal feminist Local Council of Women. Even the drive towards physical exercise, implicit to the vital energy theory, was not met with a corresponding interest in a retiring home life. Quite to the contrary, the Field Club women showed much independence of spirit, especially

---


66 Jeanne L'Espérence, Widening Sphere, p. 29.
afterwords when they developed reputations for climbing mountains and writing or illustrating books. Similarly for the Arts and Crafts Association’s aspiring female artists, though the Society ladies may have been maternal feminists or perhaps had simply charitable or even recreational motives. Rather, it would appear that much of these women’s behaviour reflected that of a little recognized but adventurous group who sought change, not through agitation for political or social reform, but through personal achievement on an equal basis with their male counterparts.67

For many of these women, their organizational prominence and their relatively equal educational and organizational participation can be attributed to their social and political achievements as employed persons. Many of the women in both the Arts and Crafts Association and the Naturalists’ Field Club were fully employed or appeared to be self-employed. Others were earning money by the sale of artistic or written work. All five Naturalists’ Field Club’s adult women members were or can be considered employed.68 Two were teachers, two were stenographers, the fifth was Julia Henshaw, journalist and writer.

As well, several Arts and Crafts women can be identified as employed (roughly speaking). Four were artists, their artistic activities being substantially more than a hobby or pastime, their art often sold on the open market. Mrs. J. Balfour Ker, “a skilled artist in oils,” had sold her work “to ‘help out,’” the “Balfour Kers...[being] rather impecunious in those days.”69 Miss McLung had a studio in Vancouver in 1901. Mrs. Ellis, not recorded as employed during the Associations’ life, later became known locally as an instructor in the arts and crafts, having a business or studio, the “Arts and Crafts,” by 1911.70 Miss Constance Hamersley also became a recognized, “well-known artist.”71 Two other women were also employed: Miss Margaret Eldridge, a stenographer in A. St. G. Hamersley’s law office, and Miss Althea Moody, a teacher. The remaining nine Arts and Crafts Association

67Silverman, “Canadian Women’s History,” p. 530, observed that women engaged in creative work, in many cases, had to chose non-traditional lives to further their interests. She also noted that we need to know more about such women.
68Included here is Ivy Abercrombie who eventually found work teaching, and Julia Henshaw, Editor of the News-Advertiser’s “Sunday Page,” a novelist, nature writer, and journalist.
69VCA, Add. Mss. 54, vol. 13, file K43, Ker, Balfour. Caulfeild. J. Balfour Ker had previously owned the Caulfeild district of West Vancouver, then known as “Skunk Cove.” He sold to Arts and Crafts Association member F. W. Caulfeild, either directly or through a third party.
70Vancouver City Directory, 1911; VCA, M 2858, Ellis, Robert B. In 1933, she founded the Weavers’ Guild of British Columbia.
71VCA, M 3947, Hamersley, A. St. G., K. C.
women were not or did not appear to be employed in any capacity other than homemaker.

Clearly, for those women who considered themselves artists, an art education and further experience in the company of other accomplished artists must surely have been uppermost in their minds. As Callen found for English female artists and crafts workers: “In the search for suitable occupations for gentlewomen, art rapidly came to be recognised as one of the few areas in which women’s participation could safely be encouraged,” especially with teaching rapidly professionalizing. Remarkably, the Association’s female artists could concurrently be described as gentlewomen. Even Mrs. Balfour Ker’s husband was a mining and real estate broker, and her father was the purchaser of many of her paintings. And, of course, with technical art coming to the fore, such an education in the latest ideas and techniques would be a tremendous boon to any school teacher trying to advance her profession, and perhaps her own career. Nevertheless, for some of these women artists, and for many of the more leisured women, the arts and crafts really meant the amateur and professional fine arts, much to Mower Martin’s consternation. The Association’s bi-weekly “hobby night” likely was set up to attract and to accommodate them, also thereby to ensure, it was hoped, a better supply of members, students, and money.

As for the women, from both organizations, who were employed in clerical positions, or who were not employed at all, leisure and recreation must be considered a prime reason for their association membership. A local magazine article explained women’s participation in outdoor sport: “Any possible disadvantages of life in a new country are more than compensated for by the wonderful accessibility of facilities for all kinds of sport,” including the province’s “great mountain masses.” For those of a more creative bent, these same natural beauties provided ample subject matter for any aspiring or hobby artist.

Vancouver did not yet provide a surfeit of recreational activities for women with time on their hands. For personal and moral reasons, many women from the city’s middle- and upper middle-class families undertook organizational work, ranging from church and charity, to political and social agitation, and to cultural advancement. They undoubtedly did much of the work for their own satisfaction, and to overcome the distress of boredom,

---

72 Callen, Women, p. 25.
73 E. McClughan, “Where Women Share the Sports of Men,” Man to Man, October, 1910, p. 824. Much attention in the article is devoted to that “enthusiastic sportswoman...Mrs. C. G. Henshaw.”
especially now living thousands of miles from their more richly endowed former homes. Such entertainment as learning to draw or paint, or climbing mountains and discovering nature, was not only edifying and stimulating, it was also respectable. Thus the women in these two organizations not only had opportunity for challenge in new endeavours, but could do so in an area that was only just opening up to women. Also, the open and more democratic membership policies of the organizations served to attract some women, and probably men, who wished to "rub shoulders" with men and women of a higher social station in Vancouver. Such a motive, along with "rational recreative" opportunities, could account for either Miss Currie's or Mrs. Hetty Hobbs' membership. Miss Currie's father, Sam, was a carpenter, while Hetty Hobbs' husband was an assistant master mechanic with the Canadian Pacific Railway. Also, as for the other women, such activities gave them access to knowledge and experiences formerly reserved for the "stronger" sex. It provided them with opportunities to express themselves outside their homes or strictly women's organizations, such expression satisfying private, not philanthropic, needs.

Finally, that women of both the upper and the lower levels of Vancouver society could agree to participate together, equally as students of the arts and crafts, and democratically as organizational members, harkens back to the Art, Historical and Scientific Association's crusade for cultural improvement in Canada. This cultural patriotism was very much in keeping with Fripp's contention of the arts and crafts as a "national art," English in origin and especially suited for Canada. It was also only part of a larger, national women's crusade. Here, similar objectives were being espoused and promoted by such organizations as the Women's Art Association of Canada and the Canadian Handicrafts Guild, both affiliates of the National Council of Women.74

6.4. CONCLUSION

After 1900, several new associations of mutual enlightenment were formed. The Art, Historical and Scientific Association's programmes had been found wanting. They never adequately responded to members' desire to learn and practise intellectual, artistic, or

74Strong-Boag, Parliament of Women, pp. 67, 99-100, 228. Strong-Boag argues that such cultural societies, which began forming in the 1890s, "each deliberately rejected sectarianism and espoused patriotism, perhaps in its stead" (p. 87). Also, like Morris and Ruskin, these women feared a "national degeneration" caused by industrialization, urbanization, and immigration. By reviving the traditional handicrafts, they hoped "to restore simpler standards of behaviour" (p. 228).
scientific skills. Nor did they adequately organize and practise a democratic and egalitarian association, as had been promoted by their earliest advocates. Perceptions of Vancouver's problems—rapid growth, industrialization, urban rawness and blight, "philistine" pre-occupations, boredom—combined to motivate the founders of these organizations to try again.

This chapter has concentrated on the Arts and Crafts Association (1900-01) and the Naturalists' Field Club (1906-07), with secondary references to the B.C. Mountaineering Club (1907-present) and to the Vancouver local of the Alpine Club of Canada (1909-present). It has described and explained how attempts to mix quite different types of people, towards often contradictory curricular ends, strained and ultimately destroyed the first two organizations. The chapter also further enriched, through examples, the concept "mutual enlightenment." In particular, it showed how all four organizations' curricula included skills training along with the transmission of attitudes and intellectual knowledge, and how apprenticeship techniques complemented formal classes and lectures. This chapter also showed (and diagrammed) how bi-focal (introverted and extroverted) character of these associations' mutual enlightenment contrasted with that of their forbear, the Art, Historical and Scientific Association. Specifically, it was more inclusive than exclusive in serving the associations' curricular and membership needs.

Moreover, we have inferred that the strong pattern of English origin among Arts and Crafts Association and the Naturalists' Field Club members explains both the origin of the two organizations and the limited appeal to residents of other national origins. We have also shown that the members' mostly but not completely middle-class and professional background explains the two organizations' emphasis on the advancement of aesthetic and scientific knowledge and skills. They wanted to improve both the workmanship of their members, and of community members at large, and to improve the physical and environmental conditions of Vancouver and its region.

The Arts and Crafts Association and the Naturalists' Field Club, in particular, collapsed in the face of severe obstacles. They generally failed to attract new members from those constituencies most central to their purpose, notably working craftsmen for the Arts and Crafts Association, and teachers for the Field Club. Moreover, there appeared to be injurious competition between members' utilitarian, and their reverential and romantic interests. Simplified, perhaps overly so, these interests and objectives were characterized
as competing aesthetics for the Arts and Crafts Association, and as “romantic utilitarians” versus “romantic sentimentalists” for the Field Club. The competing aesthetics grew from social class assumptions and beliefs, with conflicting interpretations of the role and meaning of arts and crafts, and of the nature of man, and the responsibilities of the Association towards the practical education of the working classes. The differing philosophies for the Field Club members, similarly, were based on differing social and occupational attitudes and values. The difference here, though, was not so much between opposing views on the natural capacities of people. Rather, it was between those who desired to acquaint all people with the beauties and the liberal and the practical utility of nature, and those who simply sought to experience Nature, and its challenges, without charitable mission. In the end, several related problems—unintended English exclusivity, financial weakness, loss of members, the social and economic breadth of the existing memberships—mortaly weakened and ultimately destroyed the organizations.

The aims and spirit of the two associations, nevertheless, did not die. Their memberships split and resurfaced in other, usually new, organizations. These even more specialized receiving organizations, in turn, better represented the interests of the Arts and Crafts Association’s and Field Club’s former members. Unfortunately some of the more philanthropic of the expired organizations’ aims were not transmitted to the new and surviving organizations. They were not lost, however. They just found their expression in the older, less egalitarian and less practical Art, Historical and Scientific Association. They helped that organization to further develop its public museum’s natural history and applied arts exhibits. For those interested in the applied and the fine arts, they resurfaced in the eminently practical and pragmatic, though highly structured, programmes of the Young Men’s and the Young Women’s Christian Associations. Finally, the practical aims and egalitarian spirit surfaced in the public school board’s new adult night school programme. That was introduced experimentally in 1907 and became a permanent fixture after 1909.

The Naturalists’ Field Club, for example, apparently dissolved shortly after its Second Annual meeting, in October of 1907. Most of its members joined up with others in at least five organizations: the more occupationally diverse and more “utilitarian” and scientific B.C. Mountaineering Club, the more “high class” and sentimentalist Alpine Club, the stodgy and traditional Art, Historical and Scientific Association, and the professional Entomological Association and B.C. Academy of Science (1909). Survival for the amateur
natural sciences during this pre-war period, however, remained tenuous. It required a symbiotic, or even parasitical, relationship between those whose interests were scientific and educational (e.g., the scientific sections), and those whose interests were more recreational (e.g., the Mountaineering Club). As discussed, these scientific sections finally broke away, in 1918, to form their own Vancouver Natural History Society.

Like the Field Club, the Arts and Crafts Association, in late 1901, and not two years after its inception, quietly folded. Its Second Exhibition had been a financial disaster. Other funding schemes had similarly failed. These had included a financial assistance request to City Council, an offer to take charge of the Art Department of the Royal Agricultural Society's annual Exhibition in New Westminster, and an Art Union of members' works, with 25 per cent of the proceeds to go to the Association to cover debts. Except for the August 1901 review of the Second Annual Exhibition in The Canadian Architect and Builder, nothing more was heard of the Association.

Many of those members who remained in Vancouver eventually spawned other art organizations. Most notable were the professional artists' B.C. Society of Fine Arts, founded in 1908, and the amateur (and Society) artists' Studio Club, founded in 1904. The Studio Club counted C.P.R. Superintendent Harry Abbott as its first President, and Emily Carr as one of its most distinguished teachers. Miss Carr taught there from late 1905 to early 1906. Another arts organization, the Vancouver Photographic Society, was founded in 1903. In 1905, however, it fused with the Art, Historical and Scientific Association. The latter association provided it with darkroom facilities in the basement of their new museum in the new Carnegie Library building. R. M. Fripp in the end maintained his commitment to the arts and crafts. He became President of the Vancouver branch of the Canadian Handicrafts Guild in 1912. As well, he rejoined the Art Historical and Scientific Association, around 1908, becoming Vice-President from 1911 to 1915 and President, thereafter, until his death in January 1917.

Vancouver continued, nonetheless, as a city of commerce, and of philistines. The city and its residents offered little recognition or support to either the fine or the practical design arts. Professional and amateur artists managed, however, to care for their own

75 Arts and Crafts Association Minutes, 8 November 1900.
artistic needs. They could often live and operate successfully within the marketplace, deriving a living from teaching or selling art or, in the case of middle-class women, pursuing their art as a hobby or pastime without worry of financial need.

The working craftsmen, around whom the Arts and Crafts Association was intended to focus, however, had to wait several years before anything was again attempted in their interests. Change for them came with the arrival of John Kyle to Vancouver. He became the new Supervisor of Drawing and Art Education for the city’s schools, and was instrumental in developing their night school programme. An “artist of considerable skill,” Kyle helped organize the B.C. Society of Fine Arts. He played a major role, after 1908, in the Art, Historical and Scientific Association. He also instructed the YMCA’s applied art class in 1906. In 1914, Kyle became the Province’s Organizer of Technical Education where he promoted night schools elsewhere in the province.78

The dedication and perseverance of those artists and their cultured supporters, including some of the “burgher’ class,” was remarkable. They continued, in the face of almost total neglect and ignorance by the public, to pursue their crafts, and to attempt to enlighten that public and their elected representatives. They worked to sow “the seed of a national art of the West.”79


CHAPTER 7.

"A PHILANTHROPY—NOT A CHARITY":  
MUTUAL ENLIGHTENMENT FOR SOCIAL AND MORAL CONTROL

The Literary Society..., apart from the social function it may fulfil, has too often been regarded with a passive complacency by the majority...; and partly for this reason it has not fully realised its usefulness. Yet it deserves practical recognition. If not a brilliant electric light[,] it is at least a lamp; and its members, like [Robert Louis] Stevenson's lamplighter, are helping to "knock a luminous hole in the dusk.”

The higher purpose of the [YMCA] work is to make possible a larger life, a broader mental horizon and the development of a manly, Christian character. It is at the same time specially adapted to increase the immediate efficiency and earning capacity of the students.

7.1. INTRODUCTORY NOTE

Optimism was almost a canon of turn-of-the-century mutual enlightenment. It had to be. People feared they were on the brink of chaos. The social order, as they knew it, was collapsing and re-forming. Unprecedented immigration; urbanization; mechanization; corporate capitalism and monopoly; and political, economic, and moral corruption all threatened the very fabric of society.

Vancouver residents, in particular, were distressed by the rise of a harsh, unhealthy, and unpleasant urban environment; boredom and the lack of "rational" and "innocent" forms of amusement; the absence of traditional institutions of authority; heavy immigration of job-hungry singles; and such urban blights as vagrancy, drunkenness, prostitution, crime, and disease. Further, there was growing political discussion within the community. This especially concerned the growth of plunder capitalism, socialism, and the labour movement; increasing immigration from Asia, and from southern and eastern Europe; the demands of women; and questions of national political and economic

---

2The Vancouver City Young Men's Christian Association, *Annual Prospectus: Young Men's Christian Association, 1908-9* (Vancouver: The Vancouver City Young Men's Christian Association, 1908), p. 8, Harry Patten Archibald Collection, Young Men's Christian Association of Greater Vancouver Archives.

201
sovereignty. Civilization needed to be defended; order, discipline, and community re-established; and citizens protected, controlled, socialized, and educated to the new world.\(^3\)

These themes were important to all the organizations thus far examined. These organizations' promoters, and especially the Art, Historical and Scientific Association's, all apparently believed that the Canadian west should be civilized through British social institutions and by British values. They had hoped to avoid the stereotyped instability and violence of the American west. Thus it was paramount for the earliest settlers to the Canadian west to establish very quickly the institutional and organizational vehicles to replicate and pass on traditional British cultural ideals.\(^4\)

Just which ideals were seen as best, however, was a significant point of divergence for would-be “moral educators,” cultural missionaries, and social reformers. As we saw at the end of the fourth chapter, two quite different notions of “culture” were being promoted by the turn of the century.

One form was the culture of aesthetics, of taste, and of elevated intellectual and scientific knowledge. It was the special preserve of such societies as the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, the Women's Musical Club, the Arts and Crafts Association, the Naturalists’ Field Club, the B.C. Mountaineering Club, and even the Canadian Clubs. For the most part, theirs was an elitist culture. Their only question was whether or not culture should remain in the hands of the elite, or whether it should be diffused to the masses (and by how much). Only this “culture,” many believed, would bring true happiness to all. Only when the masses were “brought to participate in the nation's artistic and intellectual life”


could democracy be more than a vulgar and superficial equality.\textsuperscript{5}

Alternatively, there was a newer, more materialistic and pragmatic interpretation of “culture.” It, too, had the goal of revitalizing society. The \textit{Vancouver World}, for example, described this new interpretation in answer to the query “What is Culture?” According to the \textit{World}:

\begin{quote}
[T]he nation needs the culture that makes for democratic, economic and ethical efficiency...[C]ulture is something else than the mastery of one's faculties and storage of treasures of knowledge. A man may have these and yet lack culture. This perhaps may most truly be regarded as the cultivation of one's whole nature, that he prefers the higher to the lower and seeks to put his achievements, especially the best in himself, unselfishly at the service of his fellow man.\textsuperscript{6}
\end{quote}

It was this latter interpretation of “culture” that provided the mission of the three organizations examined in this chapter. Fear of chaos, and desire for economic, political, and social order, and discipline, were especially important to the Young Men's Christian Association (YMCA) (1886-1897; 1898-present), the Young Women's Christian Association (YWCA) (1897-present), and the Burrard Literary Club (c.1889-c.1908). These were among the most successful of Vancouver's mutual enlightenment societies, as measured by membership, popularity, and longevity.

Promoters of these and similar organizations saw their work, to a large extent, as a kind of social and moral prophylaxis, a “preventive treatment against [social and moral] disease.”\textsuperscript{7} This line of argument begins with the YMCA's self-description as a “social resort with helpful agencies,” effectively an urban social and educational oasis.\textsuperscript{8} The argument places their work within the perspective of social and moral control. The “gospel” as promoted by prohibitionists and other social reformers was that “of the contaminated community.”\textsuperscript{9} It reflected a “belief that the illness of the body politic and of the human body

\textsuperscript{6}The \textit{Vancouver World}, 14 October 1913, p. 8.
\textsuperscript{8}Minutes of the Board of Directors,” 30 December 1903 (attached to page), in Young Men's Christian Association of Greater Vancouver (YMCA), Folder 1-1, MSS Papers, Special Collections Division, University of British Columbia Library (UBC), Vancouver.
were profoundly linked." Proponents of this belief argued that people could be protected from society's "contagion" by their seclusion, voluntary or coercive, from that society.

Yet, these organizations also manifested the excitement of civilizing the west coast of North America; of contributing to its economic, social, and democratic development; and of melding a new society. They called for an enlightened, responsible, "efficient," and especially, a moral citizenry.

Both of these goals—the preventative and the constructive—are evidence of social and moral control. Throughout the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, social reformers and reform organizations—

the tract societies, the Sunday schools, the asylums,...the YMCA, and the charity organization movement—tried in some fashion to re-create or find substitutes for the moral atmosphere of a traditional social order revolving around family, church, and close knit community. Their aim was to produce an orderly, disciplined, deferential urban type adhering to a clear-cut code of personal morality.

Social and moral control took many approaches. Boyer has described two—"coercive and environmentalist." Though they contrasted in strategy, and carried different assumptions about how people respond and learn, the approaches often were seen as complementary. Briefly, the coercive strategy started with the "wicked city." Reformers

10 William Bruneau, "Opportunism and Altruism in Official Moral Education, 1880-1939: The Examples of France and Canada," unpublished paper, University of British Columbia, April 1985, pp. 11-12, 27. (Typewritten.) Bruneau has since substantially published this article as "Opportunism and Altruism in Official Moral Education, 1880-1939: The Examples of France and Canada," History of Education Review (Australia/New Zealand) 14, 1 (1985) : 25-39. In the unpublished version, he has noted that this "social educational theory[,] founded on a pathological characterization of society" was an early phase in the transition by the late 1930s to a "morally sensible theory" based upon new insights into "the community,' and the benefits that life in a vibrant community would confer."
12 Ibid., pp.102-03.
here used whatever repressive means—legal and social sanction, harassment, surveillance, propaganda, indoctrination—to uproot vice and to impose higher standards of conduct upon the city’s residents, high or low in class. The environmentalist strategy, on the other hand, “attempt[ed] to elevate the moral character of city dwellers by transforming the physical conditions of their lives.” Recreational facilities—parks, gymnasiums, swimming pools, libraries, art galleries, and eventually city planning—would each subtly and pervasively influence the behaviour of a city’s residents.

Significantly, however, social control may have not been as effective as wished. Recent historical interpretations of the movement have recognized the interaction—and sometimes conscious collaboration—between reformers and their clientele. For example, Chad Gaffield has argued that most families actively supported (rather than resisted) sending their children to school. They wanted social order and economic opportunities. Also, and especially with regards the environmentalist and Progressive reformers, social controllers often had little, if any, effective control over their clientele. If anything, as Wiebe and Baylor have argued, the new Protestant, professional middle class triumphed over the older aristocratic and plutocratic classes through their efficient and bureaucratic management of much of the reform and Progressive movements. They quite effectively used this movement to “achieve a greater degree of internal order and cohesion, and overcome the social isolation and emotional aridity that always seemed to plague them.”

Some, such as the organizers of the YMCA and YWCA, saw their organizations as part of this great movement. These Associations, worked to attract young men and women who were moving into cities for education and employment. The two Associations wanted to rescue them from potential moral and social calamities, and to place them in an environment conducive to their improvement. Their reasons were in part religious and ethical, and in part based upon their observations and their fear of the consequences of prevailing social conditions. Their treatment, however, intended as social and moral

16Boyer, Urban Masses and Moral Order, p. 179.
control, was “educational” in nature. Although they confused religious and even economic goals with educational ends, education appeared to be the main objective. Was it?

Others, such as D. W. Dunlop, advocate of literary and debating clubs, also promoted the clubs' social resort and moral education aims. These societies offered “rational recreation” to newcomers to Vancouver. Their programmes, as at the Burrard Literary Club, or at similar YMCA or YWCA clubs, however, promoted reasoned debate and rational oratory. Members learned communication skills and experienced direct, as opposed to representational, democracy. We need to know how such distinctly educational activities coincided with social and moral control.

The Burrard Literary Club, YMCA, and YWCA may be treated together in contrast to, say, the Art, Historical and Scientific Association. Though “moral education” was certainly carried out by all the rest, intellectual, curricular, and prosopographical evidence all strongly categorize the YMCA, YWCA, and literary and debating clubs separately from the scientific and cultural (as in the arts, literature, and music) societies. They differed in their conception of “culture.” Their members held a broader range of occupations; many were of either the merchant or working classes. Ethnically, their members were predominantly Canadian born or had immigrated from the Anglo-Celtic regions (Scotland, Wales, Ireland). They were also non-Anglican Protestants, for the most part, again in contrast to the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, the Arts and Crafts Association, and the Naturalists' Field Club.

The organizational and pedagogical features of mutual enlightenment associations—in this case, the YWCA, and especially the YMCA and the Burrard Literary Club—were sharply contrasted, whatever the similarities in their deepest objectives. The Burrard Literary Club, an independent literary society, is useful in making the contrast because of its success and longevity, and because of its relatively extensive archive. But within this group of three, there were still more contrasts. The YMCA and YWCA, while incorporating literary and debating clubs as part of their programmes, also had other clubs, reading rooms, physical and health education, religious instruction and meetings, vocational and domestic science classes (the latter for young women only), vocational and social guidance, as well as non-educational residential and job-searching facilities. The Burrard Literary Club would never have aimed at providing this range of services. There is more at stake here than straightforward differences of mission.
The literary and debating clubs, and the YMCA and YWCA, present the greatest difficulties for establishing the conceptual boundaries of "mutual enlightenment." This is especially so considering their historical antecedents and allies in social reform, church, and temperance groups. The literary and debating clubs were highly democratic (though sometimes exclusive) organizations. Some operated semi-autonomously within the Ys, and some independently of them. These democratically-run societies provide a useful points of contrast of organizational types, of educational programmes, and of how to define "mutual enlightenment." In contrast, the YMCA and YWCA were the most highly structured and increasingly professionalized of the ten organizations studied. It would be particularly valuable to discover what happens when there is more than one goal, for example, education and religious indoctrination, or education and socialization, within a bureaucratic and professional organization.

Briefly, this chapter asks whether or not these organizations aimed to inculcate values and beliefs. If so, whose? Or, were they aimed at establishing a rational and liberating culture for all? We have empirical and intellectual evidence that supports both positions, within all three organizations. What meaning does this have for "mutual enlightenment"? Finally, what curricular and membership composition factors contributed to these organizations' success, especially in light of the more limited successes of the organizations already discussed?

7.2. THE VANCOUVER YOUNG MEN'S CHRISTIAN ASSOCIATION: 1886-1897, 1898-PRESENT

The Young Men's Christian Association (YMCA) of Vancouver was one of the city's earliest voluntary associations whose explicit aims included the education and uplifting of citizens. Certainly it was the earliest of our ten roughly similar voluntary associations. From an educational standpoint it was predated only by the British Columbia Institute (later the "Mechanics' Literary Institute") in New Westminster (1865-1893), the New London Mechanics' Institute and Hastings Literary Institute (1869-1886)—serving the workers at Hastings Mill (later Vancouver)—and the Moodyville Mechanics' Institute (1868-c.1901), on the north shore of Burrard Inlet.\textsuperscript{17} The Hastings Mill Institute ceased to

exist in Vancouver when the city incorporated in 1886 (though similar institutions continued on the North Shore and at New Westminster and possibly at Port Moody as late as 1900). One of a vast international network founded in London, England, in 1844, and first established in Canada at Montreal in 1851, British Columbia YMCAs were organized as early as 1859 in Victoria and 1864 in New Westminster, 22 kilometres south-east of Vancouver. The Vancouver YMCA was formally organized on Sunday, October 24, 1886. This was barely four months after the city's devastating fire of June 13, 1886, and only seven months after the proclamation of Vancouver's city charter.

This YMCA was actually the city's first of two YMCAs. Organized on principles common to most North American YMCAs, it set out immediately "to open a reading room and gymnasium and institute a lecture course." It also sought to arrange monthly meetings of the members for programmes of "a literary character, selections of prose, poetry, songs and debates to form part of the order of exercises." So rapid was the development of the Vancouver YMCA that construction of "the first YMCA building in the Pacific Northwest," was commenced on December 22, 1886. This building, at the rear of the Methodist Hall, was to consist of two rooms, one for use as "a conversation room and the other for a free reading room, for the use of the public."

The new Association, like the city, grew rapidly. By January 1889, it counted 132 members. These increased to 150 by June 1889. Its reading-room was busy, with an

19Vancouver News, 26 October 1886.
20News, 26 October 1886.
21News, 4 November 1886.
23News, 4 November 1886.
estimated daily attendance of 250. Following the model of its British parent, the Association had organized various religious and intellectual activities for its members. These included gospel meetings, a Bible class, lectures, and entertainments.\(^{24}\)

In the spring of 1893, the YMCA opened their third (consecutive) building. This allowed the further enlargement of the programme. Included were gym and swimming activities, classes in “writing, arithmetic, bookkeeping, French and shorthand,” architectural drawing, music and “elocution,” by the following October, and a “Current Topics Club” (a debate and discussion club), chaired by Congregationalist Reverend J. W. Pedley, in October 1894.\(^{25}\) The vocational classes, in particular, while developing as standard fare at other YMCAs, also clearly reflected the dominant positions of commerce and the building industry in Vancouver’s economy, and the growing need for skilled help.

Finally, on April 12, 1893, the YMCA was formally incorporated by an Act of the British Columbia Legislature. Officially the “Young Men’s Christian Association of Vancouver, British Columbia,” the Association declared its aim as: “the improvement of the spiritual, moral, mental, social, and physical condition of young men.”\(^{26}\)

Sadly, this first YMCA rather ignominiously collapsed and faded away in 1897, a victim of an ambitious building programme and the 1890s worldwide depression. As the News-Advertiser reported: “[I]n spite of every effort the storm broke, and the association found itself not only out of a house and home, but dishonoured; a by-word and a reproach in the community.”\(^{27}\) It had lost its new building, the result of dishonoured pledges and the collapse of its London bank. Their business and evangelical Protestant constituencies,

\(^{24}\)Daily News-Advertiser (Vancouver), 18 January 1889; The Monthly Review, July 1889, Pamphlet, Vancouver City Archives (VCA).

\(^{25}\)Dampier, Courage, p. 14; News-Advertiser, 13 October 1893; 20 October 1894.

\(^{26}\)“An Act to Incorporate the Young Men’s Christian Association of Vancouver, British Columbia,” 1893, p. 371. Signatures to the act, all members of the 1893 Board of Directors, were: Jonathan Rogers, YMCA President and an electrician and later a wealthy builder; James Taylor Grant Campbell, likely a bookkeeper at Godfrey’s Hardware Store; William Shannon, retired; George Robertson Gordon, merchant of men’s fashions; William Disbrow Brydone-Jack, physician and surgeon; James Scott, a painter or plasterer (two James Scotts in the directory); John H. Kerr, High School teacher; George W. Phipps, accountant at Dunn and Co.; Thomas Brenton Hall; Henry Havelock Spicer, of Spicer’s Shingle Mill; James England, stenographer at Rand Brothers, estate agents; William Lapoint, drayman; James Ramsay, manager of Ramsay Brothers, manufacturing confectioners; Edwin Blagdon Morgan, manager, B.C. Land and Investment Co.; and William Roy Spencer, dentist. These occupations were drawn from Williams, Directory, 1894.

\(^{27}\)Quoted by Selman, “Adult Education in B.C.,” p. 125.
which the Association had studiously and successfully courted, had failed them. And, unlike many associations in eastern Canada, there was no “established wealth” to support a YMCA—or the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, for that matter. The Vancouver YMCA had to rely upon the city’s business community for its financing.\(^{28}\) Though the Association did manage to re-organize in its old headquarters and to carry on its regular programme, it began to fail with the 1896 resignation of A. W. McLeod, its first professionally-trained General Secretary. Finally, in September 1897, financial problems coupled with a lack of public support forced the Association to close permanently.\(^{29}\)

The second YMCA, officially the “Vancouver City Young Men’s Christian Association,” was organized in 1898, after two attempts.\(^{30}\) Prosperity, stimulated by the Yukon’s Klondike Gold Rush, had returned to the city. With it came young men—new clients for a new YMCA, and concern for their welfare. Instrumental in the second attempt was Reverend John MacKay, a young Presbyterian minister at St. Andrews Church and later Principal of Westminster Hall and Theological College in Vancouver.\(^{31}\) This Association has survived to this day.

The new Association, like its predecessor, quickly established a “four-fold” programme for the young men. The programme emphasized the “all-round” development of Christian manliness through relatively equal concentrations on his religious, social, physical, and educational growth. It followed the YMCA’s international programme structure, developed particularly according to the philosophical inspiration of International Committeeman Dr. Luther Gulick. The new YMCA expanded its membership to boys, and formally structured its programme into separate religious, social, physical, and educational Departments, and a comprehensive boys Department.

During the period until the First World War the Association also grew extremely rapidly. It extended its services, professionalized its staff, and joined the new Canadian

---

\(^{28}\) Dampier, *Courage*, pp. 18-19.

\(^{29}\) Newspaper clipping, 23 September 1947, Ms 11, 6786, VCA; *News-Advertiser*, 30 September 1897.


\(^{31}\) YMCA Minutes, file 1-3, 8 March 1909; Hutchinson, “Vancouver Y.M.C.A.,” p. 10. Reverend MacKay was elected Honorary Life Member for this contribution.
Association of YMCA. Even with the eventual loss of vocational night-school classes to the
Vancouver School Board in 1910 (they were supposed to have been reinstated in a new
building), membership in the new YMCA proved popular. It attracted 640 members by
May 1906, up from 140 in 1904, and rapidly grew to the recorded high of 1408 in April
1914, comprised of 1078 men and 330 boys.  

It is worth noting that between these two YMCA, there existed ever so briefly a
"Young Men's Home." It was organized by the Total Abstinence Union, on October 1, 1897,
after the first YMCA's demise. The Abstinence Union took over the YMCA's rooms. It
organized a programme of YMCA-style Sunday afternoon men's religious meetings,
temperance meetings, Saturday night socials and "Free and easy meetings" (talks, music,
singing, etc.), and re-opened the Reading Room and Gymnasium. It even attempted to start
a "Young Men's Football Club in connection with 'The Homes'." 

Notable in this organization was the strong emphasis on "total abstinence." This
theme also underlay the formation of both YMCA. However, since some of the Home's
founders later organized the new YMCA, they probably failed to reach their goals and
probably their intended clientele. Likely, they recognized that perhaps as a less restrictive,
more secular organization, the YMCA would better fulfill their ambitions. As well, the new
YMCA's promoters could draw upon the methods and knowledge available from an efficient,
effective, international YMCA structure.

7.2.1. The Vancouver YMCA: 'A Brotherhood to Promote Christian Living'

The foundation for these YMCA, as for each organization studied, was markedly
similar. In each case, interested persons would develop and share these ideas amongst
their associates through informal meetings, through the press via letters, and through
meetings with other interested organizations. Finally, after a formal organizational
meeting, the new society and its constitution would be proclaimed. Elements of this

32 YMCA Minutes, 15 January 1904; 14 May 1906; 22 May 1914.
33 News-Advertiser, 18 October 1897.
34 Among the principals of this organization were R. W. Clark, J. P. D. Malkin, James Beveridge,
and A. E. Carter, all early and highly prominent promoters of the re-generated YMCA, and at least
three women, Mrs. Russell, Miss Young, and Miss McLean, probable WCT Unionists.
35 Similar generalizations of the founding procedure can be found in Patrick Keane, "Library
Policies and Early Canadian Adult Education," Humanities Association Review 29 (1978), p. 6; and
Helen Gregory McGill, The Story of Vancouver Social Service (Vancouver: n.p., 1943), an anecdotal
foundation provide enlightening glimpses into the aims and goals, both explicit and implicit, of these organizations. The letters to the editor, and the actions and statements of certain individuals, provide contextual background and suggest explanations for the actions of such organizations' promoters.

In particular, the elements point to the significance of social and moral control, both as a key purpose of the YMCA, and as a highlight upon the configurations and motives of its founders and supporters. The YMCA and its programmes, as historian Paul Boyer has explained, emphasized association—social interaction to combat the loneliness and "evil temptations" experienced by young men new to the city. The foundation procedures shed light on the importance of a YMCA to Vancouver's municipal authorities, its church leaders, and business community, and to such social reform organizations as the Women's Christian Temperance Union and the Total Abstinence Union. For each of these groups, social control—social order, public safety, public aesthetics (cleanliness), social justice, respect for family, property, class, country, and the Church—was of paramount importance to the well-being, and social and economic development of Vancouver.

As with our other organizations, the Vancouver YMCA began through "informal discussions," in this case a small flurry of letters to the editor of the local News. Being "a largely masculine community," in which men outnumbered women almost two to one, Vancouver's social situation gave rise to "certain characteristics. The liquor trade flourished and prostitution was common...." Naturally, debate about the liquor trade and the "Social Evil" raged amongst the leading members of the community. It was in the context of hot debate—in a town recovering and rebuilding after its disastrous fire, when "The Churches themselves have scarcely yet become organized"—that one opinion-maker laid some groundwork and some background for the creation of a local YMCA. That opinion-maker was an unidentified letter-writer to the News nicknamed "Vigilant."

Vigilant's letter is re-printed in its entirety. It exposes the underlying aims and interests of, and the context behind, those who might found a YMCA. Wrote Vigilant:

The question is often asked in this our new town, "where may a man

\[\text{(cont'd)}\]

collection of early Vancouver social service organizations, including the YWCA, the Women's Musical Club, and the Women's Canadian Club.


News, 15 September 1886.
spend his evenings or leisure time, except at the saloons?” It seems a little strange that no effort has yet been made to provide a place to which citizens may resort, and where they will not be under the contaminating influences of drunkenness and liquor. It should be known that many new-comers are men of good habits and moral character, to whom the idea of going into a bar-room is repulsive and the act of drinking a sin. When religious services are held on Sundays the halls are crowded, and it is a pity that the churches cannot be kept going all the time. There is hardly a town in the west, which does not support a good free reading-room, usually under the auspices of the Y.M.C.A., W.C.T.U. [Women’s Christian Temperance Union], or the K. of L. [Knights of Labour, an early labour union]. Now that long evenings will soon be upon us, someone should give us a hall, in some central place, well supplied with papers and books and innocent games.

In this city there is a K. of L. Assembly and a W.C.T. Union, but no Y.M.C.A., and whoever gives us a hall will receive the honor. At the same time there ought to be a Y.M.C.A. organized to look to the welfare of young men coming to settle among us; to find employment and provide respectable quarters for them. This is a mark peculiarly needful in the west, where young men have come away from home and moral restraint, and when not sought out, are soon on the downward road to destruction, while parents and family, with breaking hearts, mourn for the selfishness of those who might have helped them.

I do not think that the moral tone of our town is bad, but, rather, the reverse. A person, however must have lived here several months in order to learn it, for a walk around town would rather convince him that moral sentiments were sadly wanting. Let us have a Y.M.C.A., and see whether Christians are afraid to assert themselves.38

Vigilant’s Vancouver—like the “wicked” eastern city—was a vision of social and moral pathology. “Vice” seemed “alive” in the city. It had a particularly strong affinity to the liquor trade, and spread like contagion.

The victims of “vice” included single young men, mostly newcomers. Not only could vice entice and ensnare them, the young men were psychologically inclined towards it. New to Vancouver, socially isolated, and probably lonely, they were without their usual behavioural checks of church, home, and community. With few recreational and educational facilities, the young men had little choice but to frequent the “saloons” and other assorted dens of iniquity. There they were easy prey, and were easily corrupted. Through his YMCA proposal, Vigilant sought to create a vehicle for the socialization and education of such young men. At the same time, Vigilant saw the YMCA as a viable means to control their social behaviour and that of the city’s residents.

Vigilant’s letter made three points. First, he introduced a strong negative reason

---

for establishing a YMCA and free reading-room—protection. Such facilities could keep men off the streets, away from the “contaminating influences” of the bar, booze, and evil women, and away from crime. As a B.C. interior newspaper put it: a reading-room could “prevent such an undesirable result” as was potential with young men “without homes...and [with] time to hang heavy on their hands.”

Thus the enticing attractions of vice needed to be countered by the YMCA’s more engaging attractions. These included a room with carefully selected reading materials and “innocent amusements” (games such as chess or checkers), “respectable quarters,” vocational classes, and an employment bureau. Above all, the YMCA provided opportunities for companionship. Together all these elements were to ensure “[t]he moral protection of the youth of our city.” The YMCA’s young men would be shielded from the new urban “society of the vicious and the profane....”

Second, Vigilant stressed the protective, supportive, and guiding roles of the nineteenth-century family. Traditionally, the family was the primary agent of socialization; of education, employment, and occupational advancement; of material and emotional sustenance; and of moral training. It was the “cement needed to hold the structure [of society] together.” When it failed, or was displaced through emigration, something was needed as a replacement.

For this, Vigilant saw the YMCA. It should serve as the family’s proxy for the isolate. Moreover, its organization should mimic the family. The male

---

39The Vernon News, 15 October 1909.
41William E. Dodge, quoted in Boyer, Urban Masses and Moral Order, p. 112.
43Bacchi, Liberation p. 10-11.
Directors—evangelical Protestant (by edict) and often prominent in business and professional circles—and, later, the professional staff, provided “parental” leadership, guidance, and support. They provided for the inculcation of Christian “principles of religion and morality” balanced with “aids to mental and physical development.” Their charges included often “their employees or their own sons.” The Ladies Auxiliary, in turn, added maternal influence. They provided social and psychological comfort, and a feeling of belonging. They “help[ed] in the social work,” organized “entertainments” (e.g., musical programmes, games, and dinners), and raised funds to furnish the dormitories. Finally, the concept of “association,” itself, drew the YMCA membership together. The fraternal influence of fellow members aided in the young men’s socialization to morally responsible social behaviour. Cheerful social contact and friendship, for the isolate, cemented his commitment to the Association, and it was hoped, to Association ideals.

Third and finally, Vigilant cast significance upon a “free reading-room.” They aided in social control, yet they were also positive and liberating elements of the YMCA. From early in the century, mutual improvement societies—with their mutually shared libraries—had been organized spontaneously outside church and other institutional control. Mutual education, across many subjects, was a popular response to industrial and social changes. Social control advocates, including supporters of early YMCAs, quickly recognized the value of reading-rooms and educational programmes for “attracting young men to the Association.” Reading-rooms gave “opportunity to the young men...to devote their spare hours during the day and evening to mental improvement and self-culture.”

Of course, once “inside” the Association, the young men were safe from the clutches of vice. Further, encapsulated within an ostensibly Christian environment, the members should “magically” absorb and strengthen middle-class habits and values. Sobriety, decency, thrift, industry, cleanliness, orderliness, efficiency, self-respect, Christian observance, and civic duty all led to middle-class respectability.

---

45 *Vancouver Province*, 2 November 1910.
49 *News*, 20 January 1887.
50 See, for example, Peter Bailey, *Leisure and Class in Victorian England: Rational Recreation and the Contest for Control, 1830-1885* (Toronto and Buffalo: University of Toronto Press, 1978); Stuart M. Blumin, “The Hypothesis of Middle-Class Formation in Nineteenth-Century America: A Critique
Reading-rooms, however, could also be positive and liberating. A strength of the YMCA was its palatability to young men. Though its basic ideals were Protestant, and its clientele was mostly middle-class, the YMCA did not confine itself narrowly to specific "uplift" activities—such as temperance or evangelism. It asked for no renunciation of members' values or beliefs. Rather, it aimed for a more general, and complete, uplift through its environment.

The YMCA's newspaper and magazine collection was topically broad enough to be a resource for intellectual enrichment. For example, the 1902 Board of Directors ordered for the reading-room the following morally correct, but intellectually stimulating, and recreationally, vocationally, and commercially useful "list of Papers and Magazines":


Note, the list was remarkably secular in focus. Only one of the twenty-six publications appeared to be overtly Christian in perspective.

Each of Vigilant's points crystallized broad patterns of nineteenth-century thought and concern. Each responded to dramatic transformations of society brought on by industrialization and urbanization. Only through a concerted and sophisticated programme of moral and social control—supported by evangelical, utilitarian, political, and reform interests—could solutions be found and young men "saved."

Support for Vigilant's ideas was strong indeed. Though a YMCA was to embody an ideal of Christian "brotherhood," it was also, in fact, in the firm but nurturant control of


52 YMCA Minutes, 1 December 1902.
some of the city's most respected citizens. The YMCA organized following Vigilant's letter was formed out of a powerful configuration of social reform activists, the press, municipal authorities, and major business interests. "Those mothers of Israel"—the Burrard Inlet chapter of the Women's Christian Temperance Union—supported Vigilant's view of society and "the erection of a Reading Room." Perhaps it was these same WCTU women who were the women present at the YMCA's October 24, 1886 founding meeting.\textsuperscript{53} The \textit{News} itself was a supporter. It offered assistance, including reading materials, when it announced the impending formation of a committee "to establish such a necessary means of relaxation." The \textit{News} also called upon the Mayor and city fathers to call a public meeting "to further the cause...of...so worthy a project."\textsuperscript{54}

In fact, this first YMCA was particularly well connected to the Vancouver's political and economic elite. The Canadian Pacific Railroad in 1886, for example, leased one of its "prestigious" West Hastings Street lots to the new Association for a nominal rent. The Association's 1889 Citizens' Finance Committee consisted of:

David Oppenheimer, mayor, as president; alderman Dr. Wetham, vice-president; G. A. Charnock, secretary; R. H. Alexander, president of the Board of Trade and manager of the Hastings Sawmill; Honorable John Robson, premier of B.C.; J. M. Browning, commissioner, C.P.R.; F. C. Carter, editor of the \textit{News-Advertiser}; and prominent businessmen C. D. Rand, B. Springer, W. D. Creighton and G. I. Wilson.\textsuperscript{55}

Still, the YMCA's first membership committee was notable for its resemblance to a prospective Association membership. The committee included J. H. Carlisle, Fire Brigade

\textsuperscript{53}\textit{News}, 2 September 1886; 15 September 1886; 26 October 1886. Judge Helen Gregory McGill reported in her 1943 book, \textit{The Story of Vancouver Social Service}, that WCTU had a reading-room but it was destroyed in the 1886 city fire. Two of these women YMCA promoters are named in the \textit{News-Advertiser}, 26 January 1913, p. 26. Referring to Mrs. J. C. McLagan, the newspaper stated that: "Her record of philanthropic achievement date (sic) from 1888 (sic), with the founding of the Y.M.C.A. in conjunction with 'Mrs. T. E. Atkins, Mr. Jonathan Rogers and other pioneer leaders....Later followed the founding of the Y.W.C.A. with a small nucleus of members.'"

\textsuperscript{54}\textit{News}, 17 September 1886; 30 September 1886. It is not known whether this particular committee was meeting to form the YMCA or the later Vancouver Reading Room, established late in 1887. The Vancouver Reading Room evolved into the Free and finally the Public Library and was located, until 1905, on the upper floor of the YMCA building. Nevertheless a meeting was called on October 22, 1886, "for the purpose of organizing a branch of the Y.M.C.A." See \textit{News}, 22 October 1886.

\textsuperscript{55}\textit{Dampier, Courage}, pp. 11-13. Note that several of these men also lent their names and support as Honorary Vice-Presidents of the fledging Art, Historical and Scientific Association in 1894, an obvious mark of civic responsibility in both cases. See chapter 2.
Chief; James Finley, Vancouver Shingle Mill employee; J. M. Clute, jr., of J. S. Clute and Company, dry goods; C. Z. Perry, likely of A. C. Perry, stationers and fancy goods; and L. M. Stark, possibly son of T. G. Stark, bricklayer and builder.56

How the young men who actually joined, and led, the YMCA viewed their Association’s “educational” thrust will be examined in following sections. In particular, we want to know whether or not the YMCA’s programme was that to be expected considering the background and interests of the founders. Also, was this programme concerned primarily with the transmission and inculcation of middle-class habits and values, or was it a mutual enlightenment, contributing to a rational and liberating culture for all?

7.2.2. “To Build a Symmetrical Christian Manhood”: A Four-Fold Programme

Vancouver’s YMCAs, like their counterparts throughout North America, followed Dr. Luther Gulick’s “four-fold” programme. On the faculty at the YMCA’s Springfield Training School, a normal school for Association secretaries, Gulick was an innovator in the School’s physical training department.57 His programme, developed in the 1880s, was designed to meet “urban youth’s demands for companionship, physical exercise, and educational and religious activity.”58 Gulick wanted to combat the new stresses of city life and particularly to ensure a “natural” development for the individual. He believed that the “total man” should be developed; man was perfectable. His programme, therefore, aimed to teach young men “a combination of the qualities of Hercules, Socrates, and Jesus.”59

Correspondingly, Gulick’s YMCA programme should be “so much more than the sum of a strong religious society, a good school and library, and a good gymnasium. It is the product, not the sum of these:...”60 Subsequently, YMCAs, including Vancouver’s, organized “four-fold” religious, social, physical, and educational Departments. After 1900,  

57MacLeod, “A Live Vaccine,” p. 12.
58Ross, Y.M.C.A., p. 168. See also pp. 79, 164, 168-172, and Chapter X, pp. 176-193. Ross notes that the four-fold programme was eventually changed by Gulick into the now familiar red triangle that symbolized a “three-fold development” programme. See Ross, p. 498.  
the YMCA organized similar programmes through the Boys Department. In Vancouver, this ideal was well captured in 1889 by the first YMCA’s General Secretary G. A. Charnock:

...the Association worked for the whole man. Physically, to make them erect, broad shouldered, deep chested and strong limbed; familiar with the laws of health and reverent care of their bodies. Intellectually, to develop their mental powers. Socially, to satisfy their desire for companionship, by bringing them under elevating and refining influences. Spiritually, for the lifting up of young men, or companionship and acquaintance with God.61

Idealistic as were Gulick’s philosophy and programme, some, including Montreal YMCA President Herbert Ames, realized that it needed modification in light of city problems in Canada. Ames considered Gulick’s ideas in a pragmatic perspective. It was certainly desirable that young men, attracted to the YMCA by the varied and comprehensive, yet secular, components of the programme, would join the Men’s religious meetings and Bible classes “and there be really ‘saved.’” Nevertheless, he also recognized that even if not saved, “they would at least have ‘wholesome, healthy opportunities for development’ away from ‘the gambling den, saloon, or low theatre.’”62 For Ames, the impact of industrial and urban development in Canada had justified the recognition of purely secular objectives over formerly pre-eminent spiritual objectives.63

Certainly, this case of secularization was active, if not condoned, in Vancouver. James McNair, president of Vancouver’s second YMCA, sympathized with Ames’s viewpoint in his prescription of a new YMCA building for Vancouver:

As we look at the fine business blocks and bank buildings which adorn our streets, and as we think of the sixty licenced houses, numerous gambling dens and brothels, which ensnare and trap young men every day, we earnestly pray and fondly hope that an attractive building with an up-to-date equipment may soon be provided for the young men of this Terminal City.64

Further, Canadian YMCAs, until the 1920s, still viewed the “ultimate test” of the YMCA programme’s success as “the number of ‘decisions’ taken, ‘forward steps’ signed, or

61News-Advertiser, 20 October 1889.
63Ross, Y.M.C.A., pp. 171.
64YMCA Minutes, 30 January 1902.
total attendance at religious meetings." Such was not the case in Vancouver. Indications of Christian conversions were rarely mentioned in Vancouver YMCA documents. The YMCA’s spiritual purpose, along with calls for greater spiritual commitment and participation, were continually raised in public YMCA documents and in the city’s press. The thrust of growth, however, was distinctly secular programme directions. Programme attendance figures from before 1914, for instance, show that physical education was unquestionably supreme, attracting about two-thirds of all members. Educational classes, as well, grew in popularity to match YMCA religious staples in the Sunday Afternoon Men’s Meetings and various Bible classes.

What linked these four programme elements together? In a word—manhood. The YMCA, by the turn of the century, was dedicated towards making a new culture and civilization. Their ideal of a cultured man became the independent, “symmetrical” or “well-rounded,” Christian man.

Much more than simply a protective reaction to the threat of city life, the YMCA’s programme sought to inject new life and new ideals into the beleagured urban, middle-class male. Throughout the nineteenth century, men and masculinity had been perceived as in retreat. The family had become the preserve of the new “professional” mother. Men’s occupations had become separated from the home; apprenticeship had declined. Boys were increasingly isolated from their fathers—“women were teaching boys to be men.” The new urban work-world, with its large offices and corporate structure, further undermined men’s sense of cherished independence. At the same time, it “emasculated” their formerly robust, healthy bodies and minds. Even religion, with its growing sentimentality, emotion, and introspection, now threatened male believers as being too effeminate.

In short, the YMCA had witnessed a profound transformation in masculine ideals—“from a standard of manhood rooted in the life of the community and the qualities of a man’s soul to a standard of manhood based on individual achievement and the male body.” The YMCA made this change their own. At the same time, however, the Association was still an active proponent of Protestant social reform concerns and ideals. It

Ross, Y.M.C.A., pp. 171.
67MacLeod, “A Live Vaccine,” p. 10.
aimed to balance individualist ideals with the older, community and spiritual ideals. Fair-play and "brotherhood" would remain on a par with individual achievement. The social order needed to be maintained and enhanced, not torn asunder.

A key part of the four-fold programme, especially in Vancouver, was its very successful programme of evening educational and vocational classes. The programme began in early 1906 and, by fall, included Commercial and Mechanical Arithmetic, Composition and Business Correspondence, Penmanship, Bookkeeping, Vocal Music, First Aid to the Injured, and Applied Art. These and subsequent courses were taught voluntarily (with an honorarium) by local subject specialists including school- and business-school teachers. Forty-three students enrolled for the first session. Enrollments doubled to 94 in the fall, and reached their zenith at 196 in 1907. By 1908-1909, specialized technical courses were added. These included Construction, Plan Reading and Estimating, Clay Modeling, Mechanical Drawing, Gasoline Engineering, Freehand Drawing and Illustrating, and Show-card Writing. English for Foreigners and English Literature courses were also added in that season. This highly successful programme soon was emulated by the city's Board of Education. In 1910, after the YMCA had run out of space and needed to construct new quarters, the Board of Education took over the programme permanently.

Such courses filled two needs—the city's and province's economy, and their own members' employment. Vancouver and British Columbia were in an unprecedented period of economic development and expansion. Obviously, skilled young men were needed to maintain that growth, especially in Vancouver, the province's economic capital. The YMCA undoubtedly proved a good and valued source of such labour. Its membership was based in the city's commercial sectors, and it promoted amongst that membership a strong and attractive tone of morality and "efficiency." It also had ready access to dedicated and skilled teachers. As Educational Department spokesman B. P. Wintemute noted, this "work is a very practical and important one and may mean much to our City by increasing the skill and intelligence of its employees."
Association members, of course, also benefited. Wintemute, for instance, recalled “statistics [that] show that the great majority of the youths leave school before the age of fourteen, before they are old enough to appreciate the loss.” The programme was ameliorative: “only a very small percentage of the boys and young men are fitted by educational training for the positions they hold,...the great need which exists today among young men [therefore is] for supplementary education.”

More idealistically, and in keeping with the YMCA’s overall philosophy, the official YMCA programme for 1906-07 noted:

The purpose of this work is...to help them [young men] to discover themselves or their special adaptability to various occupations and, through training, to lead them into a congenial and successful life work. In the present age there is everywhere a demand for increased skill and intelligence in labor, and no man can honestly expect promotion without such training.

The higher purpose of the work is to make possible a larger life, a broader mental horizon and the development of a manly, Christian character. It is at the same time specially adapted to increase the immediate efficiency and earning capacity of the students.

Other components of the overall YMCA programme were similarly successful. Included here, for the second YMCA, were the “gymnasium” (actually a room in their rented headquarters in the Ormidale Block), with its gymnastics classes and basketball teams, led by “honorary instructors;” the Literary Society, organized in September 1901; “course[s] of Practical Talks by men of knowledge experience and ability;” and the Reading Room, “supplied with forty-five well-selected papers and magazines....[with] the illustrated papers furnish[ing] entertainment and instruction,...[and] the magazines—literary, scientific, and religious—afford[ing] many hours of profitable reading.” Of course, the Religious Department had its Bible Class and Sunday Afternoon Men’s Meeting. The Meetings often were led by prominent visiting speakers such as Walter M. Parsons, International Secretary of the YMCA, and Professor W. C. Chen, of Pekin (sic).

Later, as the Association grew, the Physical Department programme grew massively. It drew approximately two-thirds of all members to its professionally-led gym

---

72 Ibid.
74 Ibid., p. 8.
75 Annual Report of the Board of Directors of the Young Men's Christian Association of Vancouver B.C., attached to YMCA Minutes, 30 January 1902. The “Practical Talks” topics included “The Ethics of Commerce,” “First Aid to the Injured,” and “Life Insurance.”
and health classes. Swimming, athletics, and individual and team sports, and camping each became very important. The physical education had "moral, mental and physical benefit[s]" that would add to their manly strength, physical efficiency, and competitiveness, and would prevent "brain fag." Educative exercises, in particular, would "train the motor centres of the nervous system, thereby developing the higher faculties of endurance, agility, skill, courage, self-control, etc."  

Other intellectual and recreational clubs also were added. These included a camera club, a glee club, and an "Efficiency Club." The former, purely recreational clubs, helped to advance the Association's "stand...for a rational social life." The latter club was specifically for "members who have secured employment through the agency of the Association[, and whose]...purpose is to promote friendship, and...increase the business and moral efficiency of the members." Like the earlier "Practical Talks," the Efficiency Club and other activities like the "British Columbia Talks" allowed for "instructive addresses on matters of practical interest...given by prominent business and professional men." Sample talks included "Opportunities in Modern Business," "The Choice of a Life Work," "The Early History of Canada," and "Civic Finance, Taxation and Expenditure" for the Efficiency Club; and "The Geography of British Columbia," "Mines and Minerals of British Columbia," "British Columbia Indians," and "Our Opportunities and Duty as Citizens of British Columbia" for the British Columbia Talks. Such talks were intended surely to equip recently migrated young men for the rigours, anticipated successes, and civic responsibilities that these new citizens and potential leaders would need.

Briefly, Gulick's four-fold programme ideas spurred the YMCA to shift away from a spiritual and strictly lay programme. The new programmes emphasized multiple goals. Moreover, they were increasingly organized and conducted by specialized, paid personnel.

---

77Vancouver YMCA, Plans, 1906-07, p. 5.
78The Vancouver City Young Men's Christian Association, Some Schedules: The Vancouver City Young Men's Christian Association, Season 1912-13 (Vancouver: The Vancouver City Young Men's Christian Association, 1906), pp. 6-7; Vancouver YMCA Archives; The Vancouver City Young Men's Christian Association, A Question of Values, 1913-14 (Vancouver: Vancouver City Young Men's Christian Association, [1913]), p. [12], Vancouver YMCA Archives. The "British Columbia Talks" were in 1908-09. See Vancouver YMCA, Annual Prospectus, 1908-9, p. 13.
In Canada, this programme was further modified to emphasize secular objectives; and to further the education and training of members in a broad range of skills, knowledge, and attitudes. The shift, and a respect for the “efficiencies” of modern industries, led to the employment of YMCA-trained programme managers (Secretaries), and, especially in physical departments, of trained instructors. Its mission was to re-define and to make a new masculine ideal. Correspondingly, it sought to inject this ideal into the marketplace world of men and into the culture as a whole. The new value of achievement needed to balanced by the older values of community and the spiritual.

Was the four-fold programme “mutual enlightenment,” or merely the unthinking inculcation of habits and values? The division between the two is problematic. The curriculum was mostly passed down from the International Committee’s headquarters in New York. Regular conferences of representative members, from throughout North America, however, were held to discuss, theoretically to dispute, and overall to establish Association policy. Also, the members themselves organized and conducted major parts of the programme, including the literary or debating clubs, camera clubs, the library and reading-rooms, Bible discussion classes and clubs, social activities, and sporting teams. Moreover, attendance was not compulsory. Members were free to take part in any, or even only one, activity. Of course, it was hoped that once they had become committed to the YMCA idea and mission, they would join in a variety of activities and thereby acquire a deeper knowledge, understanding, and practice of Christian manliness.

Indoctrination, or even the teaching, of evangelical Protestant, middle-class habits and values, to be sure, was the intention of the programme’s founders. Control over this process, however, was severely limited, and virtually impossible to ensure. Some of the values, especially independence, taught the members to judge objectively the programme’s

elements. The members thus could carefully and knowingly (relatively speaking) select those elements most meaningful to themselves. Also, the YMCA made free and open “discussion” a key element in its programmes, including religious ones. Discussion, “in a conversational manner,” fostered both the YMCA’s spirit of “brotherhood” and “fellowship,” and ensured an individual, manly character. Such discussion, when free and unhindered, is anathema to indoctrination.

Religious indoctrination and conversion were the most pronounced of the YMCA’s intentions. Officially, conversion was the Association’s primary objective until after World War One. Indoctrination, however, was only a part of the Association’s teaching, and for only a declining part of its membership. Individually, the subject matter of most clubs, classes, and recreational, athletic, and social events, provided only limited scope for indoctrination. As well, and significantly, religious teaching within the Vancouver YMCA included elements crucial to education. Most religious classes, clubs, or meetings were distinctly practical—designed to instruct and help the young men and boys “in their fight for character.” The goal was to make religion more objective, and therefore, less sentimental and effeminate.

The religious programme also allowed for some speculation. Even when not fully intended, however, members acquired abilities to reason about the moral basis of Christian traditions. They analyzed Biblical teachings in the light of modern social realities. “The Bible,” for these members, was liberally portrayed as “the great valuator in life, and the inspiror [sic] of persistent purpose to seek high ideals.” In Bible classes, they discussed such contemporary secular topics as “the great social problems of today...in light of the teachings of Jesus,” and “‘Life Problems,’...[which] includes the study of problems which relate to a young man’s vocation, his temptations, his family, social, civic and church relationships.” Such teaching contrasted with church ministers’ indoctrination, and fit, if obtusely, with the YMCA’s goal of complementing, and not competing, with the Church.

80MacLeod, “A Live Vaccine,” p. 17.
81Vancouver YMCA, A Question of Values, pp. [8-9].
7.3. "THE CARE OF THE STRANGER": THE VANCOUVER YWCA

The Vancouver Young Women's Association (YMCA) was, to a large extent, a female (and feminine) replicate of the YMCA. It was founded on September 30, 1897, from a merger of the Anglican Girls' Friendly Society with the "Women's Improvement League" of St. Andrew's Presbyterian Church (the same church at which Reverend MacKay, initiator of the second YMCA, ministered). As with the YMCA, the W.C.T.U. contributed to the YWCA's foundation. However, after "[c]onsiderable debate," over "the question of affiliating the Y.W.C.A. with the W.C.T.U." into a single organization, they decided to remain separate.82 This decision not to affiliate may reflect that made by some members of the Total Abstinence Union's Young Men's Home (1897) to found instead a new YMCA. It may also reflect a caution on the temperance question by the Anglican supporters of the new YWCA.83

First conceived as a "home" for single women immigrants, the YWCA's Vancouver programme developed along lines reminiscent of the YMCA's "four-fold" programme.84 Beyond some important similarities, however, there were also striking differences.

The YWCA, like the YMCA, sought to recreate the embracing safety, comfort, sociability, training, guidance, and control of a "good" Christian home. "[F]ar from relatives and home," young women were flooding into Vancouver. They had come "to find employment in office or store,...to study in Normal or High School or in the business college;

---

82 News-Advertiser, 2 October 1897.
83 See Richard Allen, The Social Passion: Religion and Social Reform in Canada, 1914-28 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1973), pp. 6, 8, 12, 13, 15, 264-283, for detail on the relationship amongst the Protestant churches and their individual responses to the liquor question. Note, while the YWCA officially supported temperance (which is not necessarily support for prohibition), they did accept a $10 donation from Hiram Walker (liquor distillers).
each one to fill her place in life, wherever it may be.”  The YWCA shared the YMCA’s fears about the social and especially moral consequences awaiting these unattended, innocent young people migrating into Vancouver.

Indeed, these fears, and the YWCA’s protective response, were so strong that long-time YWCA President (1897-1910), Mrs. R. J. (Annie L.) Skinner, reiterated to every annual meeting the “special work” of Vancouver’s YWCA—“the care of the stranger.”  The YWCA had feared that by working, a young woman’s morals would decline.  They especially feared that young women would become the easy victims of the notorious “White Slave” (prostitution) trade.  It was imperative, therefore, that the YWCA protect these newcomers and to help them fit into their new community, and outfit them to their proper domestic role in life.  Thus Mrs. Skinner prayed “that this new Home of the Y.W.C.A. will prove to them a home indeed; hallowed by loving thought and sympathy.”

Some young women, however, needed more than a home.  For those “who were utterly unfitted, partly from the lack of early training or temperament, to cope alone with the life of the city and the struggle for a livelihood,” the YWCA would provide extra care.  They would be “helped to a better knowledge of what they owe to themselves and to those around them.”

This extra care was similar to that provided by the YMCA’s four-fold programme.  It was embodied in the YWCA’s official aims:

(a.) For the improvement and development of the mental, social and physical condition of young women;
(b.) To promote social intercourse, mutual helpfulness, moral improvement and rational recreation amongst young women;
(c.) For the promotion of literature, science and the fine arts, and the promotion and diffusion of knowledge amongst young women;
(d.) For establishing and maintaining homes for young women;

85Province, 17 February 1905.
86Province, 17 February 1905.
87Mitchinson, “The YWCA and Reform,” p. 381.
89Young Women’s Christian Association (Vancouver), Annual Report, 1905 (Vancouver: Young Women’s Christian Association, 1906) p. 9, in Young Women’s Christian Association of Vancouver, Box 10-4, MSS Papers, Special Collections Division, University of British Columbia Library (UBC), Vancouver.
90Province, 17 February 1905.
(e.) For making provision by means of contributions, subscriptions, donations or otherwise against the sickness, or unavoidable misfortune or death of young women.\(^91\)

The YWCA’s first boarding home, as with the YMCA, had a reading-room and library. These and the attractions of “association” (companionship) would draw young women into the Association. With their new home, opened in 1906, the YWCA offered new attractions. Physical training, educational classes, recreational clubs, socials, and religious services and Bible classes further enhanced the Association’s appeal. In 1911, for example, there was a Shakespeare Club, for “reading and studying [and presenting] Shakespeare’s immortal plays,” and a Literary Club. As well, classes in “German, French, Expression and Voice Culture, First Aid to the Injured, Dressmaking and Millinery” were instituted. Additionally, the YWCA organized gymnasium classes—“marching, calisthenics, corrective, wand and club exercises, asthetic [sic] and folk dancing, games, apparatus work and athletic sports”—basketball teams, and a Summer Camp. Among its aims the Camp was to maintain the interest of the winter gymnasium programme’s participants. Further, it was to ensure that those “business girls...living away from home...[get] a week or two of rest and recreation under...[YWCA] conditions.”\(^92\)

These various programmes, like those at the YMCA, were linked in purpose. As with the YMCA, religion was to be “vitally interwoven” through all departments and combined with the spirit of association. “Each for all....makes the home a home and not a boarding-house, as each night we gather for praise and prayer.”\(^93\) However, unlike the YMCA, there was to be no religious speculation and discussion. YWCA classes were, expressly, an indocration: “simple, direct and practical.” The message-givers, in 1910, were Reverend Professor Pidgeon and the YWCA’s General Secretary.\(^94\)

Of greater significance, the programmes aimed to develop the young women for their feminine responsibilities in society.

[The] recreative and health-giving exercise received in the gymnasium...enabled [the girls] to keep themselves in a condition which fits them for the most

\(^91\)YWCA (Vancouver), *Annual Report: 1905* p. 17.
\(^92\)Young Women’s Christian Association (Vancouver), *Annual Report of the Young Women’s Christian Association, For the Year Ending January 31, 1912* (Vancouver: Young Women’s Christian Association, 1912), pp. 8-11, in Box 10-4, YWCA, Special Collections, UBC, Vancouver.
\(^93\)YWCA (Vancouver), *Annual Report, 1907*, p. 9.
\(^94\)YWCA (Vancouver), *Annual Report, 1912*, pp. 8-11.
effective service....[The] classes and clubs ...unite[d] the girls in different ways, and serve[d] to develop and train the latent powers of the individual girl for mutual helpfulness, [with] each giving according to her ability, and each receiving to her capacity.\textsuperscript{95}

The YWCA wanted to "domesticate," and to make thoroughly "respectable," their working-class charges. The clubs and classes, and the home-like atmosphere itself, were designed to socialize and train future mothers and homemakers. The YWCA did not intend permanent, lifelong, paid employment. Even the Bible classes complemented the Association's home-like atmosphere—offered in a "bright and attractive" setting, with tea served afterwords.

In their eagerness to save young women, the YWCA left little to chance. Their Travellers' Aid Branch volunteers met all incoming trains and boats. There they helped newly arrived women and girls, and often brought them directly to the Association. The YWCA then provided or found appropriate housing for these new arrivals, and through the Association's Employment Bureau, helped them to find work. The Employment Bureau also helped those women who had completed the YWCA Educational Department's vocational courses.\textsuperscript{96} Notably, and in contrast to the YMCA, the YWCA also solicited and received substantial funds from both Provincial and City governments, albeit for their immigration and service work.\textsuperscript{97}

The most striking contrast between the YMCA and the YWCA was the denominational and social class differences between two Associations' principal actors. The YWCA was led by Vancouver's Anglican elite. YWCA President Annie Skinner and Directors Mrs. A. U. de Pencier and Mrs. Cecil C. Owen were Anglicans.\textsuperscript{98} More significantly, the clerics on the YWCA's male Board of Trustees (later Advisory Board) were

\textsuperscript{95}News-Advertiser, 21 February 1913.
\textsuperscript{96}Young Women's Christian Association (Vancouver), Annual Report, 1907 (Vancouver: Young Women's Christian Association, 1908) pp. 4-5, in Box 10-4, YWCA, Special Collections, UBC, Vancouver.
\textsuperscript{97}In 1905-6, they received a $1000 grant from the Province and $200 from the City, the grants increasing to $1000 and $2000, respectively, by 1913.
\textsuperscript{98}Young Women's Christian Association of Vancouver Minutes, 9 April 1907, Young Women's Christian Association of Vancouver (YWCA), MSS Papers, Special Collections Division, University of British Columbia Library, Vancouver. Mrs. Skinner and Mrs. Owen were selected representatives of the YWCA for their churches, St. Paul's Anglican Church and Christ Church, respectively. Mrs. Owen and Mrs. de Pencier were the wives of the rectors (ministers) of St. Paul's and Christ Church, respectively. See Henderson Publishing Co., comp., Henderson's City of Vancouver and North Vancouver Directory, 1910 (Vancouver: Henderson, 1910), p. 215.
predominantly Anglican until the First World War. All clerics in 1904 were Anglican, including The Lord Bishop of New Westminster, the Venerable Archdeacon Pentreath, Reverend C. C. Owen, and Reverend G. A. Wilson. Only in 1905, were Reverend John Simpson of the First Congregational Church and Reverend R. J. Wilson of St. Andrew's Presbyterian Church added to the Advisory Board.99

The YMCA did have Anglicans as Board and regular members. They probably represented only a minority, however. Of the eighteen 1899-1904 YMCA members whose religion could be identified, only three were Anglicans (16.7 per cent). Only one Anglican, Colin F. Jackson, was a Board member. See Table 10 in section 6.6 for a complete religious breakdown of YMCA members. Of greater significance, a 1913 list of the YMCA's present and "Prospective Directors" listed the present Directors by their church affiliation—Baptist, Congregational, Methodist, and Presbyterian.100 The Board appeared consciously to desire a relatively balanced representation of the major Protestant denominations. Nevertheless, they rather mysteriously omitted Protestant Anglicans, even though Anglicans had been members of both the Association and the Board, and were the largest of all denominations in the city.

This Anglican prominence in the Vancouver YWCA, suggests the importance of established wealth. The YWCA's listing in the elite Vancouver Social Register and Club Directory attests to this inference. The other women prominent in the YWCA belonged to the renowned Presbyterian Church, St. Andrew's, and to the tiny but influential Congregational Church.101 The YMCA was not listed in that Directory, though its Executive contained prominent city businessmen. Likely, the social distance between the YMCA Board and the general membership was much smaller than that between the YWCA Board and its general membership. As eminent as the YWCA leaders were, the membership (that is those young women the Association set out to help) were or were to be students, shop and factory workers, and domestics. Thus while many of the YMCA's young men perhaps aspired to be like that Association's elders, most of the YWCA's young women could never aspire to join the Society crowd of their Association's elders.

Though it tried not to be a "charity," the Vancouver YWCA was undoubtedly

100 List of names, n.d. (probably 1913), in Archibald Collection.
constrained by its history. The physical training, the educational classes, and the clubs suggest some movement away from the "charity" concept and some willingness to experiment with new ideas. However, as Mitchinson has noted, the YWCA was hindered....[by a] duality of goals, religious and secular....Following the example of early benevolent societies, the YWCA had aligned itself to the church which meant that its focus on the temporal welfare of working women was lessened. This was reinforced by the fact that the YWCA's organizational structure was dominated by a select group of women, resulting in little innovation and certainly little challenge to the accepted role of woman's involvement in society. The YMCA was interested in maintaining the domestic role of women as much as possible in the face of the challenge presented by working women. To do this it responded to the needs of working women in a traditional way, that is, through concern over the private sphere (place of residence) as opposed to the public (place of work).\textsuperscript{102}

One last difference again concerns the role of religion. The YMCA placed great emphasis on its evangelical goal, even though evangelism was not actually very prominent in the day-to-day life of the programme and the members' participation. The YWCA, however, greatly underplayed this goal. The Vancouver YWCA apparently did experience the conflict noted by Mitchinson. The President, Annie Skinner, for example, commented in 1906 that "there has been some criticism about the fact that there have not been more [religious] meetings here." She pointed out that most of the girls already were church members. Further, she reminded her listeners that:

Dear friend, if you are one of those to whom spiritual gifts have been given, rejoice and be glad in them, but remember that God gave to us all bodies, minds, hearts and souls, and we want to offer all of these in the best condition in His service.\textsuperscript{103}

Perhaps Annie Skinner had a more temperate view of the place of religious indoctrination and its place in the life of a well-rounded person than did many of the more evangelical persuasion. Perhaps her rebuttal to criticism represented the more temperate Anglican constituency. It did appear, however, to convey a strong message that the YWCA's goal was social, and not religious, salvation. Beyond that message, however, the Vancouver YWCA apparently could not risk a truly mutual enlightenment amongst its "girls."

\textsuperscript{102}Mitchinson, "The YWCA and Reform," p. 369.
\textsuperscript{103}YWCA (Vancouver), \textit{Annual Report: 1905}, p. 8.
7.4. ORATORY AND THE DEBATING TRADITION:  
THE BURRARD LITERARY CLUB

Literary and debating societies contrasted quite markedly with the YMCAs and YWCA in both organization and mutual enlightenment. The YMCAs and YWCA were characterized by their large size; by their mix of purposes; and by their highly structured, almost bureaucratic, and increasingly professionalized programmes. In contrast, the literary and debating clubs were generally small (generally 20-25 members), quite democratic, and clearly focussed on their educational aim. Literary societies, it is true, also served the purposes of moral control. They were an “influence for good and a healthy antidote for ennui and idle evenings, especially in the case of strangers to the community.” There was no confusion, however, between indoctrination and education—any utterance, opinion, or statement had to be reasonably supportable or it would be usually strongly challenged by other members.

Literary and debating societies exemplified the most “mutual” form of “mutual enlightenment.” Size restrictions ensured ample and active participation from all members. Learning and practising debating and oratorical skills was central to a society’s purpose. Thus only a small group could ensure a fully mutual, and rational, exchange of ideas, opinions, and observations.

In contrast to the YMCA and the YWCA, there were no instructors or lecturers. The roles of teacher, administrator, and learner were synonymous with the role of club member. Executive positions effectively rotated (though by vote) amongst all the members. Also, those who planned and scheduled a season’s activities also participated fully in those same activities.

Generally, literary and debating societies aimed to improve public speaking and argument skills, and to discuss and debate questions of popular public interest. They wrote and presented papers for discussion and critique, and they presented unrehearsed speeches. As well, they held mock parliaments and mock trials. There, the members assumed parliamentary or legal roles, and argued and debated pertinent political and legal issues.

---

104 The Vancouver Mock Parliament, Literary and Debating Society (1890), with its one hundred or more members, appears to have been the only exception in the twenty-five member limit. Such a large number would have been quite unwieldy except perhaps for the mock parliament.
105 Dunlop, “A Plea for Literary Societies,” p. 28.
Finally, and frequently, the clubs and societies also met together, usually in a pair, to hold a joint debate, mock parliament, or oratorial contest. The public was often invited to attend the debates, especially when they concerned important social, political, and economic issues.

Though outwardly recreational and educational, literary and debating societies’ programmes also had clear moral intentions. One local commentator, for example, stressed the need for each member to “preserve...the better features of his own individuality, while at the same time watching the viewpoints of his fellows and profiting by them.” “Young businessmen,” in particular, he argued, would find “that the mental training and general culture would be very desirable additions to the[ir]...business...outfit, if in gaining them he could avoid getting enlarged ideas of his commercial value, while a beginner.”

In both YMCAs and the YWCA, such societies operated semi-autonomously within the larger association. Examples include the first YMCA’s Current Topics Club (1894-97), the interim Young Men’s Home’s Young Men’s Debating Society (1898), the new YMCA’s Literary Society (1902-07) and Debating Society or Club (1909-14), and the YWCA’s Literary Club “for business women” (1910-13) and Literary and Social Club (1914). Even many city churches (especially Protestant churches) had literary societies.

Other societies, however, were completely independent of larger organizational bodies. The most prominent, according to its regular press coverage, was the Burrard Literary Club (c.1889-c.1908). This club met usually one evening a week throughout the

---

107 Many of these and other independent clubs, through the initiative of the YMCA’s Debating Club, formed the Vancouver Debating League in 1911. The League aimed to “further...the art of public speaking by oratory and debate, and [to] foster...a keener interest in public questions of the day.” By 1913, the League included “some twenty teams, representative of practically all the political, educational, religious, and literary organizations of Vancouver and New Westminster....” See Roy W. Ginn, “Oratory and War: Vancouver Debating League’s Development,” _Westminster Hall Magazine and Farthest West Review_ 4, 4-5 (October-November 1913): 17-19. The League included the “Bohemian Club, Kitsilano Debating Club, Wesley Church, Y.M.C.A., Congregational Church, St. Andrew’s Church, Latimer Hall, First Presbyterian Church, Chalmers Church[,...]McGill College[,...]Collingwood Institute, Law Students, South Vancouver Liberals,...West End Club[,...]Knights of Columbus[,...]the Round Table Debating Club.” See Selman, “Adult Education in B.C.,” p. 133. The League appears to have lasted until 1927, there being a list of championship teams, 1911-1927, at the Vancouver City Archives (VCA), Add. Mss. 54, vol. 13, Vancouver Debating League.
108 Note, the exact dates of the Burrard Literary Club’s origin and demise are not known. Nevertheless, my own calculations, in conjunction with Selman, “Adult Education in B.C.,” pp. 131-132, suggest that the Club was organized in the fall of 1889 and expired in the winter or spring of 1908, a remarkably long period for this type of organization. Also, both Selman and
fall, winter, and spring. The members engaged each other in “a gentlemanly spirit of rivalry” for the expressed purpose of aiding in their own and in each other’s “intellectual improvement.” Specifically, and officially, their aims were “To cultivate the art of public speaking, and the study of political, social, scientific, literary and economic questions by debates, lectures, essays or readings.”

As the aims suggest, the topics varied widely. They touched virtually any subject that engaged the attention of late nineteenth-, early twentieth-century men and women. For example, the “subjects for impromptu speeches” given by members on October 15, 1895 were typical: “Love,” the “Single Tax,” the “New Woman,” the “Manitoba School Question,” “Protection or Free Trade,” “Evolution,” “Nationalism,” “Socialism,” and “Phrenology.” Debates and members’ papers followed similar themes. Typically, a two or three month session included a mix of debates, papers, and impromptu speeches.

Club members, here, were serious practitioners of the debating and oratory arts. They were both spirited and earnest in their approach. When G. G. Currie read his paper, “The newspapers [sic] place in politics,” on November 20, 1894, for instance, “its author [was] subjected to a wholesale course of criticism as caustic as it was deserved.” Or later, after J. H. Kerr had read his paper, “The modern tendency in Literature,” “the discussion upon it was postponed one week with the understanding that the paper would be amended and reread.” Also, with debates, the members occasionally could get heated enough to take or suggest further action. A case in point was the February 29, 1897 question on “England’s Eastern policy.” The speakers needed extra time “to benefit the Club by their rich funds of valuable information.” Moreover, the members became so “seriously” concerned with the “burning question” regarding the “sufferings of the Armenians,” they considered “sending a report to the Diplomats of Europe at Constantinople.” The issue, and the report idea, however, were “allowed to drop.” Finally, bad form, for example, “the use of ‘strong language’ in...debate,” or even poor attendance, could and did force apologies
to and resignations from the Club. 112

Who the Literary Club members were, and why they organized such debates will be discussed in the following section. One source, however, practically depicted the Club as a hot-bed of local socialists. 113 In fact, its membership included several men who were the up-and-coming business leaders. 114 Further, there were others of a more particular distinction: “Professor” Jesse Dibden, a “Scientific Phrenologist;” Professor Charles Hill-Tout, an anthropologist and Principal of Buckland College; Reverend George Maxwell, Member of Parliament (Nationalist Party) and labour sympathizer; James McGeer, a milkman farmer, former journalist, Irish nationalist, and strong “white man’s” advocate; 115 and Japanese Consul Shimizu. Undoubtedly, such members suggest that the Club’s membership had strong reasons for their analyses of controversial topics.

7.5. MEMBERS’ MOTIVES: RECREATION, VOCATION, AND ADVANCEMENT

The Burrard Literary Club and the YMCA had remarkably similar memberships. This is especially surprising considering the divergence between the two in organizational structure, size, and especially programme content. However, the Burrard Literary Club not only competed occasionally with the YMCA’s Current Topics Club, some of its members began their debating careers in the YMCA. In fact, the members of both organizations held occupational, religious, national origin, and even political affiliation characteristics in

112Ibid., 2 October 1894, 9 October, 1894. S. M. Eveleigh (later of the Arts and Crafts Association) was one such member forced to apologize and to resign for the “strong language.”
113In Vancouver, then and now, any group of socialists, social gospellers, or “free-thinkers,” together in one room, might be described as a “hot-bed.” In this case, Burrard Literary Club pioneer Charles Haney is reported to have pointed out “that there were a number of prominent socialists in the organization.” See Selman, “Adult Education in B.C.,” p. 131.
115McGeer was the author of “An Irishman’s Prayer,” a close friend of T. P. O’Connor, 30 year British M. P. and “the famous author, publisher and advocate of Home Rule for Ireland.” Well-known as a “staunch liberal” and “especially loyal to the welfare of his adopted city,” McGeer was a firm believer in the province as “white man’s country,” that the white race should develop and reap its benefits. In accord with this belief he paid the highest wages and did not employ Orientals.” McGeer was the father of Vancouver’s notorious Mayor G. G. McGeer and the grandfather of former B.C. Cabinet Minister Patrick McGeer. See E. O. S. Scholefield and F. W. Gosnell, British Columbia From the Earliest Times to the Present: Biographical, vol. 4 (Vancouver: S. J. Clarke, 1914), pp. 1124-25; VCA, Add. Mss. 54, vol. 13, file Mc 13, McGeer Family; and M5668 James McGeer.
common. Such similarity, like that found with the other organizations studied, helps to explain these organizations' curricula and the reasons that these particular people joined.

Some obvious, significant reasons for members' promotion of and involvement in organizations such as the YMCA and the Burrard Literary Club lay in their occupational and ultimately social class characteristics and interests. These interests were not separate and distinct, however. They were very much intertwined with the members' religious affiliations and with their national origin. In particular, they were very much a part of a drive for middle-class definition, cohesion, and respectability, and for the members' own occupational position, stability, and enhancement.

Both organizations, officially and to some actual extent, were open to members of almost all social groups. The Burrard Literary Club, as just shown, included business and labour sympathizers, and a well-known racist and a Japanese Consul, for example. The YMCA, as its Board publicized, was non-sectarian, non-partisan, and not of any particular class or section. Among Association members, the Board claimed there were "eleven religious denominations, twelve nationalities, and sixty occupations." In fact, almost half, 348 of the 717 senior members in April 1910, for instance, were not "Active" members, that is members of evangelical churches. The historical tradition of the two organizations, however, and the thrust of their programmes, was distinctly (and broadly) middle class and Protestant.

Table 9, below, summarizes the similarity between the Burrard Literary Club's and the YMCA's members' occupational backgrounds. Three samples of members' occupations are displayed. The first two were drawn from the general membership of each organization. The third was drawn from the signers of a 1911 petition of Physical Department members to the YMCA President and Directors. The petition had requested that YMCA officials continue to employ B. L. V. Wilson, the Physical Director. Wilson was planning to resign for unspecified reasons.

This second group of YMCA members, the 1911 petitioners, was brought in as comparison against the general sample. The petitioners represented a fuller range of

---

116 See “Petition to City Water Works Committee,” 13 July 1907, Archibald Collection, Vancouver YMCA Archives.
117 YMCA Minutes, 30 April 1910.
118 “Petition,” 1911, in Archibald Collection, Vancouver YMCA Archives.
YMCA members. The best available source of YMCA member data came from before the new building opened and the full programme was instituted, in 1905. The pre-1905 sample was drawn from all YMCA members listed in the Board of Directors' minutebook, as they joined the Association. The YMCA's physical programme, then, was limited and operated out of rented premises. The evening educational classes did not yet exist. Thus, this second (petitioners') sample, while biased, probably better reflected the occupational range of much of the YMCA's general membership, especially once the YMCA was fully functioning.

TABLE 9.

OCCUPATIONS OF THE YMCA AND BURRARD LITERARY CLUB (BLC) MEMBERS, AND YMCA PHYSICAL DEPARTMENT PETITIONERS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Occupational Type</th>
<th>BLC Members 1899-1904</th>
<th>YMCA Adult Members 1895-1899</th>
<th>YMCA Physical Department Petitioners 1911</th>
<th>Vancouver Census 1911</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No. (%)</td>
<td>No. (%)</td>
<td>No. (%)</td>
<td>No. (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professional</td>
<td>15 (31.9)</td>
<td>7 (12.7)</td>
<td>3 (11.1)</td>
<td>3971</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educator</td>
<td>10 (21.3)</td>
<td>1 (1.8)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>508</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lawyer</td>
<td>2 (4.2)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Law Student</td>
<td>1 (2.1)</td>
<td>2 (3.6)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clergymen</td>
<td>1 (2.1)</td>
<td>1 (1.8)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journalist</td>
<td>1 (2.1)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accountant</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>1 (1.8)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>295</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dentist</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>1 (1.8)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Druggist</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>1 (1.8)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Architect</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>1 (3.7)</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Draughtsman</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>1 (3.7)</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Secretary</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>1 (3.7)</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trade/Merchandise</td>
<td>14 (29.8)</td>
<td>17 (30.9)</td>
<td>4 (14.8)</td>
<td>5996</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capitalist</td>
<td>1 (2.1)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Owner-Manuf</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>2 (3.6)</td>
<td>49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Farm Owner</td>
<td>1 (2.1)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>218</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Merchant</td>
<td>9 (19.1)</td>
<td>9 (16.4)</td>
<td>1 (3.7)</td>
<td>2040</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Broker</td>
<td>2 (4.2)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>512</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Insurance</td>
<td>1 (2.1)</td>
<td>2 (3.6)</td>
<td>1 (3.7)</td>
<td>268</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Real Est Agent</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>2 (3.6)</td>
<td>1 (3.7)</td>
<td>1331</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loan/Trust Offl</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>1 (1.8)</td>
<td>1 (3.7)</td>
<td>307</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advertising</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>1 (1.8)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trade/Mer-Wkr</td>
<td>6 (12.8)</td>
<td>17 (30.9)</td>
<td>8 (29.6)</td>
<td>5708</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Position</td>
<td>Number 1</td>
<td>Number 2</td>
<td>Number 3</td>
<td>Code</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Traveller</td>
<td>1 (2.1)</td>
<td>4 (7.3)</td>
<td>1 (3.7)</td>
<td>4266</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retail Clerk</td>
<td>2 (4.2)</td>
<td>5 (9.1)</td>
<td>3 (11.1)</td>
<td>as above</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Broker's Clerk</td>
<td>2 (4.2)</td>
<td>——</td>
<td>——</td>
<td>58</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misc. Clerk</td>
<td>1 (2.1)</td>
<td>5 (9.1)</td>
<td>2 (7.4)</td>
<td>——</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bookkeeper</td>
<td>——</td>
<td>3 (5.4)</td>
<td>2 (7.4)</td>
<td>4266</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
TABLE 9. OCCUPATIONS (con’t)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Occupational Type</th>
<th>BLC Members 1899-1904</th>
<th>YMCA Adult Members 1895-1899</th>
<th>YMCA Physical Department Petitioners 1911</th>
<th>Vancouver Census 1911</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No. (% )</td>
<td>No. (% )</td>
<td>No. (% )</td>
<td>No. (% )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Government</strong></td>
<td>2 ( 4.2)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>3680</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gov’t Official</td>
<td>1 ( 2.1)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>477</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>P. O. Clerk</td>
<td>1 ( 2.1)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>as above</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Skilled Trades</strong></td>
<td>10 (21.3)</td>
<td>12 (21.8)</td>
<td>6 (22.2)</td>
<td>29,948</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Contractor</td>
<td>3 ( 6.4)</td>
<td>4 ( 7.3)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>855</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carpenter</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>1 ( 1.8)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>2991</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Painter/Decorator</td>
<td>1 ( 2.1)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>719</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Furniture Maker</td>
<td>1 ( 2.1)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Upholsterer</td>
<td>1 ( 2.1)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>as above</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barber</td>
<td>1 ( 2.1)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>309</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Undertaker</td>
<td>1 ( 2.1)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sugar Refiner</td>
<td>1 ( 2.1)</td>
<td>2 ( 3.6)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Printer</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>2 ( 4.2)</td>
<td>2 ( 7.4)</td>
<td>602</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bookbinder</td>
<td>1 ( 2.1)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tinsmith</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>1 ( 3.6)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Machinist</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>1 ( 1.8)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>383</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moulder</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>1 ( 3.7)</td>
<td>252</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gas Fitter</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>1 ( 3.7)</td>
<td>339</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Operator-C.P.R.</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>1 ( 1.8)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conductor</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>1 ( 3.7)</td>
<td>409</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rail Lineman</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>1 ( 3.7)</td>
<td>151</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Labourer-Misc.</strong></td>
<td>—</td>
<td>2 ( 3.6)</td>
<td>4 (14.8)</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-employed</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>2 ( 7.4)</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td>48 ( 100)</td>
<td>55 ( 100)</td>
<td>27 ( 100)</td>
<td>50628 (100)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SOURCE: Canada, *Fifth Census of Canada, 1911: Occupations of the People*, vol. 6 (Ottawa: J. De L. Tache, Printer to the King’s Most Excellent Majesty, 1915), pp. 286-96. This census division included Vancouver city, and the immediate and contiguous suburbs of North and South Vancouver, and Point Grey. The 1911 occupations were used as there was no comparable occupational breakdown in the 1901 census.

Note, the occupational census figures represented broad, undefined categories. Therefore, the figures are useful as guides only; they often represented more persons than existed under the more specific job titles used by organization members. Also, the broad, aggregate categories are estimates, based upon summing several smaller categories to estimate those employed in the broad categories.

Note also, the total occupational membership for each organization consisted as follows: 55 traceable members of 75 (73.3%) randomly sampled from the 252 YMCA members named in 1899-1904 YMCA minute books; 48 (88.89%) of 54 BLC members; and 27 (96.2%) of the 48 petitioners.
Table 9, above, shows notable similarities between the samples and the two organizations. The occupational range within all three samples was very broad. All had substantial proportions of professionals, merchants, clerks, and artisans.

There were also some differences. These may be explained by the specific curricula related to each membership sample. For example, the Burrard Literary Club had a notable concentration of school-teachers and other educators (21.3 per cent). Only one YMCA member was similarly employed. Further, the YMCA Physical Department’s petitioners had proportionately four times the number of labourers as did the general membership sample. Correspondingly, the YMCA general sample, had over twice the proportion of business owners, officials, and agents as did the petitioners.

The preponderance of working people, especially clerks of various and unskilled labourers, amongst all three samples, is particularly noteworthy. They had joined and were working and learning alongside their more “exalted” brethren from the merchant, financial, and professional classes. Their presence contrasted dramatically with those other organizations that had also attempted to attract or educate them. The Arts and Crafts Association, for example, had set out, purposefully but unsuccessfully, to attract many of these same clienteles. Like the YMCA, it too promoted vocational arts education for social and economic gains.

The YMCA’s clerks and artisans (45.2 per cent) is suggestive of those who participated in the Association’s very successful vocational trades and commercial programme, from 1906 through 1910. The YMCA petitioners’ clerking and trades occupations (at over 67 per cent) suggest an even larger proportion of potential participants in that programme. Their presence, as over one-third (34.1 per cent) of the Burrard Literary Club’s members, however, strongly points to the long tradition whereby at least some members of these classes have sought out mutually supported intellectual enlightenment. Further, other information suggests that their occupations sometimes disguised other equal or even more important interests. For example, the Literary Club’s barber, Jesse Dibden, was well-known locally as “Professor” Dibden. He was expert in that popular but receding specialty of “Scientific Phrenology”—the study of one’s mental faculties through the examination of his or her skull.

Both organizations also provided ample opportunities for those with occupational
and social ambitions. The intensive, interactive nature of debates and paper critiques, a mainstay of literary and debating clubs, would allow few members to remain unknown. Those who were ambitious could easily get to know and perhaps impress, on a very informal, yet intellectually stimulating basis, some of the city's social and economic leaders.

We cannot prove that individual YMCA and Burrard Literary Club members used their organizations for advancement purposes. Nevertheless, the very success of the organizations and their relevant activities, in conjunction with other circumstantial evidence, lends this motive some credence. We know, for example, that many newcomers to Vancouver came with dreams of fortunes to be made, or at least with dreams of a life better than that which they had left behind. Many did, in fact, substantially improve their lot. And some, including some members of both organizations, did make their fortunes.

Perhaps the most notable of these men was Jonathan Rogers. At age 26, he became President of the city's first YMCA. He was also a Burrard Literary Club member. Born in Wales in 1865, he spoke only Welsh until his sixteenth year. He came to Canada originally with romantic hopes of ranching in Calgary. His original dreams disabused, he then "rode the cowcatcher" of the first transcontinental train to Vancouver. He arrived May 23, 1887. Shortly thereafter, he obtained work as a painter. He began also to buy and sell lots. By the early 1890s, he owned his own tool and paint shop, and valuable city land. By the early 1900s, he was an established contractor. Rogers became one of Vancouver's leading businessmen. He constructed many important city buildings, including several banks and hotels, and his crowning achievement, begun in 1911, the Rogers Building, at Granville and Pender Streets. Civic minded, and representative of the urban reform tradition in North America, he also helped to develop Stanley Park. Later, in 1925, and with fellow Burrard Literary Club member W. H. Malkin and eight other local benefactors, he contributed the necessary funds to stock the city's new Art Gallery.119

On a much more modest scale, though no less significant, most of the Burrard Literary Club's strong contingent of educators and school-teachers also apparently used the Literary Club for job-related reasons. These educators, who numbered 10 of 47 (21.3 per

---

119VCA, M 8078-1, Rogers, Jonathan; M 8087-2, Rogers, Mr. and Mrs. Jonathan Rogers; C. W. Parker, ed., Who's Who in Western Canada, vol. 1 (1911) (Toronto: International Press, 1911), p. 327; and McDonald, "Business Leaders." Regarding the Art Gallery, Roy, Vancouver, p. 121, noted that thirteen families in total agreed to contribute $100,000 for paintings if the city would build the Gallery.
cent) members, were noted throughout the Club’s minutes for their strong advocacy of educational issues. Their Club membership served as a useful and valuable adjunct to their professional interests. Through the Club, they could ensure that educational and related topics would get a solid airing amongst representatives of all classes, high and low, at both private and public debates. Education, after all, was fast becoming the major institution for socializing the young into the new commercial and industrial world.

The Club’s teachers, for the most part were elementary teachers. Their branch of the teaching profession, at this time, however, was rapidly feminizing. The Club, therefore, like the YMCA, also would have given them an evening of keen intellectual stimulation and competition, in an adult male environment. It also provided these teachers with opportunities for career changes, regardless of their expressed commitment through debating issues.

For some, and perhaps all of these teachers, the Club provided the contacts and potential knowledge to leave the teaching profession. In particular, all four teachers traced to the 1911 city directory left teaching between 1901 and 1911. The other five teachers were not listed in the 1911 city directory. Of those teachers traced to 1911, three became businessmen—traveller J. J. Dougan, broker T. A. McGarrigle, and insurance agent A. C. Stewart. One, Professor Charles Hill-Tout, became a farmer.

The YMCA’s only educator (in the sample), Vancouver Schools Superintendent F. M. Cowperthwaite, remained in his profession. Significantly, Cowperthwaite was one of the first in Vancouver to strongly advocate a night school, “so that young people who could not go to school would not grow up in ignorance.” His goal, a blazing success, finally materialized under the tutelage of Superintendent W. P. Argue in January 1907, one year after the YMCA’s own classes had begun.

Besides Rogers and the educators, however, most traceable members of both organizations held the same occupations or positions in 1911 as they had in 1901. Thus there were probably other, more significant reasons for each members’ participation within

---

120 See also Dunn, “Mass Public Schooling,” pp. 41-43.
121 News-Advertiser, 1 January 1900.
their particular organization.

7.6. PROTESTANT, CELTIC, AND CANADIAN: “THE CITY COMMONWEALTH”

Specific characteristics of national origin and religious affiliation seemed to be a critical feature in the membership compositions of all the organizations studied. In particular, the YMCA and the Burrard Literary Club were marked by their members’ non-Anglican Protestant and “colonial” (i.e., Canadian and Celtic) backgrounds. These characteristics were not separate and distinct, however. They were very much a part of a drive for Protestant, middle-class definition and respectability, for social civility, and for urban and industrial moral health. In particular, this drive demonstrated how some people, ambitious but marginal to the centres of power, organized themselves into educational centres to attempt the reform of their society, or even to just congratulate themselves for that attempt.

Both the YMCA and the Burrard Literary Club readily could be identified by their evangelical Protestant Christian beliefs and traditions, and by their noticeably Canadian nationality. This was very much in line with much of the nineteenth-century movement for reform and social control in Canada, including the social gospel. Not only did this contrast with the very English and Anglican YWCA, discussed earlier, but also to varying degrees with those other organizations discussed in chapters two through five. As Tables 10 and 11, below, will show, both the YMCA and the Burrard Literary Club were significantly more non-Anglican Protestant (especially Presbyterian) and Canadian born, than were the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, the Arts and Crafts Association, and the Naturalists’ Field Club. Of the British Isles-born members, there were stronger Scottish, Welsh, and Irish, and weaker English contingents in the YMCA and Burrard Literary Club than in the other three organizations.

Specifically, Anglicans comprised 21.4 per cent of Burrard Literary Club members and only 16.4 per cent of YMCA members. Likewise, Canadians comprised 45.4 per cent of Burrard Literary Club members and an even more significant 59.1 per cent of YMCA members. In both organizations, only approximately 20 per cent were English-born members.
TABLE 10.

RELIGIOUS AFFILIATION OF THE YMCA AND BURRARD LITERARY CLUB (BLC) MEMBERS, COMPARED WITH ART, HISTORICAL AND SCIENTIFIC ASSOCIATION (AHSA), ARTS AND CRAFTS ASSOCIATION (ACA), AND NATURALISTS' FIELD CLUB (NFC) MEMBERS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Religion</th>
<th>YMCA Members 1899-1904</th>
<th>BLC Members 1895-99</th>
<th>Vancouver Census 1901</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No. ( % )</td>
<td>No. ( % )</td>
<td>No. ( % )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anglicans</td>
<td>3 (16.7)</td>
<td>3 (21.4)</td>
<td>3,064 (26.1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Presbyterians</td>
<td>8 (44.4)</td>
<td>7 (50.0)</td>
<td>6,505 (24.1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methodists</td>
<td>5 (27.8)</td>
<td>3 (21.4)</td>
<td>3,785 (14.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roman Catholics</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>3,064 (11.3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baptists</td>
<td>1 (5.6)</td>
<td>1 (7.1)</td>
<td>1,553 (5.7)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Friends</td>
<td>1 (5.6)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>3 (0.0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Congregationalists</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>413 (1.6)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Jerusalem</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>18 (100)</strong></td>
<td><strong>14 (100)</strong></td>
<td><strong>27,010 (100)</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Religion</th>
<th>AHSA Members 1909</th>
<th>ACA Members 1900</th>
<th>NFC Members 1906-07</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No. ( % )</td>
<td>No. ( % )</td>
<td>No. ( % )</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anglicans</td>
<td>7 (31.8)</td>
<td>7 (63.6)</td>
<td>1 (5.9)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Presbyterians</td>
<td>7 (31.8)</td>
<td>1 (9.1)</td>
<td>1 (9.1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Methodists</td>
<td>4 (18.2)</td>
<td>1 (9.1)</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roman Catholics</td>
<td>1 (4.5)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baptists</td>
<td>1 (4.5)</td>
<td>1 (9.1)</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Congregationalists</td>
<td>1 (4.5)</td>
<td>0 (0.0)</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Jerusalem</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>1 (9.1)</td>
<td>—</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td><strong>22 (100)</strong></td>
<td><strong>11 (100)</strong></td>
<td><strong>2 (100)</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


The total identifiable religious denominational membership for each organization consisted as follows: 18 from the sample of 55 (32.7%) traceable members of a random sample of 75 of the 252 YMCA members named in 1899-1904 YMCA Minute books, 14 (25.9%) of 54 the BLC members, 22 of 43 (51.2%) AHSA members, 11 of 50 (22.0%) of ACA members, and 2 of 17 (11.8%) of NFC members. Note, the low percentage of traceable members for this and other characteristics, following, is mostly, though not necessarily completely, attributable to the high percentage of individuals whose backgrounds have not distinguished them to the point of biographical records.
### TABLE 11.

**NATIONAL ORIGINS OF YMCA AND BURRARD LITERARY CLUB (BLC) MEMBERS**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Birthplace</th>
<th>YMCA Members</th>
<th>BLC Members</th>
<th>Vancouver Census</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No. (%)</td>
<td>No. (%)</td>
<td>No. (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>United Kingdom</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
<td>9 (40.9)</td>
<td>10 (45.4)</td>
<td>5,245 (19.4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>England</td>
<td>4 (18.2)</td>
<td>5 (22.7)</td>
<td>3,427 (12.7)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scotland</td>
<td>4 (18.2)</td>
<td>2 (9.1)</td>
<td>1,107 (4.1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wales</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>2 (9.1)</td>
<td>62 (0.2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ireland</td>
<td>1 (4.5)</td>
<td>1 (4.5)</td>
<td>625 (2.3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Canada</strong></td>
<td>13 (59.1)</td>
<td>10 (45.4)</td>
<td>14,299 (52.9)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ontario</td>
<td>7 (31.8)</td>
<td>4 (18.2)</td>
<td>4,977 (18.4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Brunswick</td>
<td>3 (13.6)</td>
<td>2 (9.1)</td>
<td>763 (3.8)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nova Scotia</td>
<td>2 (9.1)</td>
<td>1 (4.5)</td>
<td>735 (2.7)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prince Edw. I.</td>
<td>1 (4.5)</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>282 (1.1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quebec</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>3 (13.6)</td>
<td>783 (2.9)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brit. Columbia</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>6,112 (22.6)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Australia</strong></td>
<td>—</td>
<td>1 (4.5)</td>
<td>89 (0.3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>New Zealand</strong></td>
<td>—</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>43 (0.2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>U. S. A.</strong></td>
<td>—</td>
<td>1 (4.5)</td>
<td>2,258 (8.4)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>TOTAL</strong></td>
<td>22 (100)</td>
<td>22 (100)</td>
<td>27,010 (100)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**SOURCE:** Canada, *Fourth Census of Canada, 1901*, vol. 1 (Ottawa: S. E. Dawson, Printer to the King's Most Excellent Majesty, 1902), pp. 284-85, 418.

The total identifiable religious denominational membership for each organization consisted as follows: 22 from the sample of 55 (40.0%) traceable members of a random sample of 75 of the 252 YMCA members named in 1899-1904 YMCA Minute books, and 22 (44.0%) of 54 the BLC members.

There were two probable, interlinked, reasons for such a religious and "ethnic" configuration within both organizations. First, like the other organizations studied here, these two served as "clubs" for those of common background and values. This was certainly an expressed intention of these types of organizations. As Ross McCormack has demonstrated, churches, benefit and cultural societies, and boarding houses (including YMCAs and YWCAs) functioned as surrogate families for immigrants from Britain. These organization supported the newcomers' adaptation to and advancement in Vancouver.
Significantly, there were other "YMCAs" in Vancouver, for other religious and ethnic groups. In November 1890, a "Chinese YMCA" was organized in the Mission Hall, Dupont Street (Chinatown). It was to be part of a network of similar Associations from California to British Columbia.\(^{124}\) A YMCA (Japanese branch) was organized at 502 Powell Street (Japantown). And, most remarkably, there was a "Jewish Young Men's Christian Association [sic]" located in the Vancouver City YMCA's original home, the Wetham Block.\(^{125}\) Finally, the Catholic Church founded a Young Men's Institute, evidently before 1895.\(^{126}\) There is no evidence, however, to suggest any connection with Vancouver's YMCAs, though obviously, the "association" idea must have been appealing.

The second, and more significant reason concerns the strong evangelical and middle-class ties to the nineteenth-century reform movement. Notably, it was through such "reform" societies as the YMCA and the Literary Club, that Canadians and Celtic Britons, as against Englishmen, chose to participate.

Many historians now generally argue that the efforts of organizations similar to the Burrard Literary Club and the YMCA were part of the formation and "crystallization of middle-class consciousness...."\(^{127}\) Initially bound by the democratic and puritanical values of evangelical Protestantism, the new professional and entrepreneurial middle-classes were bonding themselves together both to protect and to strengthen themselves against the disintegration of the old social order, and to firmly and cohesively ensure that they would become the core and the power of the emerging twentieth-century economy and social order. As Boyer has noted: "[T]he decision to participate in an urban moral-reform society might reflect less the wish to control others than an impulse toward self-definition, a need to

\(^{124}\) *News-Advertiser*, 9 November 1890.
\(^{126}\) *The Vancouver City Directory* (Vancouver: Hodgson, 1896), pp. 24, 30.
publicly avow one's own class aspirations."

Indeed, according to Stuart Blumin, the “issue...of drink...underscored to reformers their own immediate social and economic circumstances, for resistance to...temperance...seemed to come from the fashionable and powerful rich and from the dissipated and fearful poor.”

And, along with (or maybe even in spite of) an organization’s specific curricular content, the members hoped “to learn how to behave according to rules of middle-class respectability....”

This hypothesis that the YMCA and Burrard Literary Club were agents of middle-class formation is consistent with other evidence. The YMCA’s Board of Directors, for example, were actively engaged in a plethora of community social reform activities. As mostly (and sometimes prominent) members of Vancouver’s entrepreneurial, managerial, and professional classes, the Directors sought perhaps to soothe and appease their own moral conscience.

Specifically, the Board fought anything that contributed to social and family breakdown, or which was a consequence of it. The Directors availed themselves of addresses by social reformers, carried on discussions of social and moral topics within their meetings, signed petitions, and sent resolutions and letters protesting social and moral vices to the authorities concerned. In particular, their interests included child delinquency and the need for a probation system, prostitution, the transport of liquors through the mails, sweepstake tickets and gambling at the Minoru Race Track, poor wages to working girls, and the prohibition of a boxing arena. Delegates were sent to the Vancouver Moral Reform Association and to the Moral and Social Reform Association. The Directors also worked with other associations on similar issues, for example, the Juvenile Protective Association, and the Trades and Labour Council. The Board also loaned the YMCA Physical Director to the Vancouver Playgrounds Association for work as a supervisor in

---

129 Blumin, “Middle-Class Formation,” p. 334.
131 YMCA Minutes, 14 April, 12 May 1903; 14 August 1903, 12 February 1914; 11 December 1913; 11 July 1912; and February 12, 1914.
132 Ibid., 15 November 1904; 10 August 1908.
133 Ibid., 10 June 1909; 12 July 1912.
Finally, in 1913, they organized a Leaders Corps which offered gym programmes to various community organizations including several churches, the Children's Home, the Alexandra Orphanage, and the Chinese Mission.\textsuperscript{135}

Literary and debating clubs sought comparable ends, though through quite different means. They provided an educative vehicle for men (and separately, for women) of conflicting political persuasions to debate openly issues of regional, national, and international importance, in an atmosphere relatively free of partisan rancour and party ideological and policy restrictions. Debates allowed businessmen to take Labour's side in a Capital versus Labour debate, for instance. These businessmen thus could learn about the needs and expectations of the working classes by defending them against "representatives" of their own business class. Perhaps it also tempered their indulgence in that most exemplary of British Columbia maladies: "a flamboyant paganism, the worship of the almighty dollar."\textsuperscript{136}

Through debate, the members of the Burrard Literary Club and similar organizations perhaps believed that they might induce greater political, social, and economic stability amongst the various competing classes. Certainly, they were highly conscious of the rapid growth in the province of the labour movement and interest in socialism. In particular, the Club's men, whether business and professional men, or labourers, were witness to the entry of potentially threatening (or emancipating) political and educational organizations. These included the Socialist Labour Party (formed 1898) and its successors and competitors, the Socialist Party of Canada (formed 1904) and the Industrial Workers of the World (formed 1905).\textsuperscript{137}

The implications of the triumph of such revolutionary organizations were not lost on the YMCA's and literary clubs' advocates. Their associations' programmes aimed to secure social consensus, stability, and integration. In particular, they provided some opportunities

\textsuperscript{134}Ibid., 14 May 1912.
\textsuperscript{135}Dampier, \textit{Courage}, p. 21.
to advance the cause of "the city commonwealth." As W. R. Dunlop argued in his "Plea for Literary Societies," it is their community of interest which is among the most powerful factors in cementing relationships—whether it be in the family, the club, the society, the larger plane of civic or political organization, the common love of the flag or, in the ultimate, the feeling of a common destiny of the race...[—]the encouragement of friendly rivalry in competition is a kin and worthy aim.\textsuperscript{138}

Such "friendly rivalry" within the broader "city commonwealth," whether as here on the debating platform, or in the YMCA's gyms and playing fields, exemplified middle-class businessmen's treasured values of independence and competition within the greater moral context of civic and patriotic duty. Moreover, and significantly, such education allowed for those same members of Canadian society to continue in their own class self-definition. Here the learned honed the necessary skills to defend and to propound their class interests.

The actions taken by both the YMCA's Board of Directors and the Burrard Literary Club were entirely consistent with their members' religious affiliations as Methodists, Presbyterians, Congregationalists, and Baptists. Their churches had long been associated with social reform and with adult education. These churches' stress on congregational Bible study had been a significant democratic move away from the traditional Anglican (and Catholic) practice of priests ministering to their flock.\textsuperscript{139} These same churches also organized many and varied educational and self-improvement programmes and clubs.

Membership in these evangelical churches, however, placed one on a distinctly lower ranking on the social ladder. Most of the city's business and social leaders were Anglicans.\textsuperscript{140} Further, the educational and social reform activities of the YMCA's Board of Directors and the Burrard Literary Club served to challenge the city's political and social status quo. That, along with the identification of many (if not most) Burrard Literary Club members and YMCA leaders as reformers and as political Liberals marked their deviation from a politically (and economically) Conservative province. "To be a Liberal," argued B.C. historian Margaret A. Ormsby referring specifically to Victoria social life "was to court

\textsuperscript{138}Dunlop, "A Plea for Literary Societies," p. 28.
\textsuperscript{140}McDonald, "Business Leaders," p. 297.
social as well as political ostracism.”

The Board (and other YMCA) members, which reflected these moral and political convictions (and liabilities), were mostly peripheral to the social and economic elite of Vancouver. Many were important business leaders. However, they were “not part of the city’s upper class,...[They] rarely held memberships in high status social clubs, and...with two exceptions were not part of the economic elite....” Thus desirous to establish some control and power, they threw their energy into the city’s socially redeeming but less prestigious organizations, and into reform issues in general. For example, instead of joining the prestigious Art, Historical and Scientific Association, they joined and supported the YMCA, the city’s Library Board, and the Children’s Aid Society.

Finally, there was a connection between national origin, religious affiliation, and the nature of mutual enlightenment. For instance, the English/Anglican organizations, notably the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, the Arts and Crafts Association, and the Naturalists’ Field Club, were more “cultural,” esoteric, and even elitist in their approach to mutual enlightenment. These associations were particularly noted for their attempts to extend their programme to, or to incorporate within their programme, individuals who were not part of their “class.” Each was, at best, only modestly successful in its attempts to frame education as an alternative to, or as an escape from, the harsh realities of turn-of-the-century Vancouver. Working people, generally, rejected the covert hierarchical approach—noblesse oblige—of these organizations’ programmes.

The YMCA and the Burrard Literary Club, on the other hand, reflected the more egalitarian, democratic, and practical values of their predominant “colonial,” and evangelical and Non-Conformist members. These organizations did not represent the old high culture of retreat to the arts, literature, and nature. Instead, they sought to capitalize upon, yet also to reform, the new culture of “democratic, economic and ethical

---

141 Ormsby, British Columbia, p. 304. Of those whose political leanings could be determined, five of eight Literary Club members, and three of the four sampled YMCA Directors were Liberals. The others were all identified as Conservatives. The Conservatives remained in power provincially from 1903, when formal political parties were introduced into provincial legislative politics, until 1916. Throughout that period, city residents consistently elected a full slate of five members to the Legislature. See also Edith Dobie, “Party History in British Columbia, 1903-1933,” in Historical Essays on British Columbia, eds. J. Friesen and H. K. Ralston (Toronto: Gage, 1980), p. 70; and Roy, Vancouver, p. 74.

efficiency...[and of] service of his fellow man." Through mutual enlightenment they promoted individual health and competence, and moral and responsible economic development. They probably hoped to temper the greed and destruction wrought by the drive for profits. Framed in these economic, individualist, and egalitarian-democratic terms, and practised safely with only members of the same sex, the YMCA (and similarly the YWCA) and the Burrard Literary Club found both popularity and success.

7.7. SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION

This chapter has contrasted the organization and pedagogies of three ostensibly mutual enlightenment associations. They were the YMCA, the YWCA, and the Burrard Literary Club. The Burrard Literary Club, a small, independent debating club, most clearly exemplified the liberal democratic tradition in adult education and the nineteenth century's mutual improvement societies. It also mirrored the programme and structure of similar YMCA and YWCA clubs. The YMCA and YWCA, on the other hand, were very large, and highly structured organizations. Their tradition was evangelical Protestant. Both were organized around a “four-fold” programme of social, intellectual, physical, and moral/religious education, primarily for a young working clientele.

All three associations outwardly promoted moral and social control. Many people, and most especially social reformers, feared that their society was about to disintegrate. Industrialization, immigration, and urbanization threatened the social order. Civilization thus needed to be defended, community re-established, and morality bolstered.

These organizations thus had dual aims. On the one hand, they aimed to provide “rational” and “innocent” alternatives to “ennui and idle evenings,” and to the “terrible temptations” of the city. In short, they offered protection from vice. On the other, they participated in the making of a new middle-class culture. Their programmes aimed to help their mostly young members to establish themselves as productive, moral, and socially sound members of their new society.

We wanted to find out whether or not these associations were practitioners of mutual enlightenment. Do we conclude that any or all were about the unthinking inculcation of habits and values? Or, were these associations out to provide a rational and

143*World*, 14 October 1913, p. 8.
liberating educational culture for all their members?

Clearly, the literary and debating clubs were educational. They were highly democratic (though sometimes exclusive) and generally numerically small enough to allow excellent opportunities for full participation. There was no permanent leadership, no elite. Any member's opinion, statement, or argument had to be logically or empirically supported, otherwise he would be challenged by the others.

The YMCA, and especially the YWCA, on the other hand, contrasted with the Burrard Literary Club's rationality. Their four-fold programmes confronted their members with a seeming jumble of both educational teaching and indoctrination. The Literary Club's programme was definitely educational, in the strict liberal sense, and thus "enlightenment." For the YMCA's and YWCA's programmes, the probably unanswerable (in a strict sense) question is where was the boundary between "enlightenment," with its characteristic rationality, and indoctrination? The boundary was especially difficult to discern in such areas as the YMCA's Bible classes and religious clubs. The goal, here, included reasoning about Christian morality and appropriate (moral) behaviour, though the Association also maintained traditional Christian aims of spiritual enlightenment. Such classes in the YWCA, in contrast, were quite probably indoctrination.

Even more troublesome, however, was the likely contrast between the intentions of the Associations' founders and those of their members. Because of the large size and administrative complexity of each organization, the founders could (and generally did) have indoctrinatory intentions. At the same time, however, the members could easily sift and choose from amongst the various programme elements. And because the Associations' moral and social control was of an environmental kind, the members would have needed to be somewhat, and wittingly, receptive for indoctrination to occur.

YMCA historian Murray Ross gets at this problem. He has pointed out that the International YMCA, in 1869, effectively closed off two paths to which the Canadian Associations had been heading: (1) "to become something like a Mechanics' Institute—a cultural and intellectual centre in the community," and (2) "of becoming adult Sunday Schools in denominational churches" or "a religious movement, separate from the churches, like the Salvation Army." At the same time, however, the International YMCA also

---

144Ross, Y.M.C.A., p. 59.
decided to co-operate with the Protestant churches, and to accept their doctrines. Thus they
decided to “live within” the “broad structure of Protestant life,” and yet also to pursue
the course of education that eventually became the “four-fold” programme. Of course, this
resulted in the YMCA’s pedagogical confusion between indoctrinatory and educational aims.

To that end, and facing the veritable flood of under-educated, unaccompanied youth
arriving in the new Canadian cities, the YMCA’s religious functions became increasingly
synonymous with a practical Christianity. Even the Association’s group analyses of the
Bible emphasized moral reasoning and behaviour. The “Christian” character of the YMCA
was shifting away from the strict doctrinal towards the educational (open to reason and to
conflicting viewpoints), and towards the secular. The YMCA, therefore, was becoming
roughly synonymous with the mutual enlightenment concept. There was no apparent elite.
The Directors and other members, in Vancouver, held similar occupations, and were,
therefore, of the same social class. Its programme was multi-dimensional, and sufficiently
educational, to allow for a wide variety of learning opportunities for its members.

Whereas the YMCA in Vancouver was approaching a state of mutual enlightenment
for its members, the YWCA was not. True, the YWCA offered a comparable variety of
educational activities. On the other hand, it still had a clear agenda to inculcate domestic
values and habits into its “girls.” That this might not have been desired by the young
women can be attested by the fact that most were either employed in the workworld, or
were vocational or college students. The YWCA’s leaders were prominent and comfortable
ladies of Vancouver society. It was their agenda, not the young women’s needs, that
formed the basis for the YWCA programme. The YWCA programme was probably
indoctrination, though with the following proviso. YWCA members, like YMCA members,
were free to choose those elements most useful and meaningful for themselves.

\[^{145}\text{Ibid., p. 62.}\]
8.1. INTRODUCTORY NOTE

Fundamentally, this study of intentional mutual enlightenment is a social history of ideas, and of the means by which they entered into life. It has examined the interrelationships between ideas, and their social, political, and economic contexts, and how this interaction gave rise to mutual enlightenment. In particular, it has shown how a discrete group of persons' social class and ethnic background, and their ideas about a properly cultured person, shaped their conception and practice of mutual enlightenment. Moreover, it has shown how any one set of facts—about context, ideas, or mutual enlightenment activities—has affected the other two sets.

The central argument of the thesis is this: the context largely determined and now explains the nature of intentional mutual enlightenment. The social, political, and economic arrangements of a city, and the ideas and cultural manners, tastes, beliefs, and values of the city's residents, determined the objectives, programme, and activities of mutual enlightenment associations, and the composition of their members. For Vancouver, the ideas and cultural elements had been brought by the residents from their original homes. They had come mainly from Great Britain and Ireland directly, or from Britain as modified through Central and Eastern Canada. The ideas and culture, for the most part, originated

1Address by President William Burns on “The Value of Local Associations,” Vancouver Naturalists' Field Club Minutes, 10 October 1906, Vancouver Natural History Society, vol. 1, Add. Mss. 484, Vancouver City Archives. Note, the italics in the quotation are mine.
also in either the elite or the non-elite middle-classes.

It must be said at once, however, that the conceptual meaning of "mutual enlightenment," and particularly of "mutuality," were limited by social facts. They are heuristic concepts, repeatedly modified and clarified through examples of material practice. Clarification had pre-requisites: (1) understanding of critical ideas that motivated promoters of mutual enlightenment, (2) knowledge of the social background of its practitioners, and (3) acquaintance with its concrete social expression through certain voluntary organizations and their educational curricula. Their provisional meanings, at the beginning of the study, thus have become looser. They accommodate variations in the approaches by which an association might educate its own members and interested publics.

In particular, mutual enlightenment was about people getting together for educational purposes who, for the most part, were of the same social class and ethnic background. In essence, middle-class people who wanted to do mutual enlightenment ensured that everybody involved was also middle class (or had such aspirations).

Further, most associations of mutual enlightenment provided for programmes external to those organized strictly for their own members. Sometimes these programmes were missionary in practice; directed at clienteles who could not become members. Other times they served to recruit new members. However, these external and extroverted programmes were an intricate part of the whole of an association's educational work. They also added a significant dimension to "mutual enlightenment," with the tension between the stricter "mutuality" of enlightenment within the membership, and the extension of enlightenment to non-members. Whether planned or accidental, mutual enlightenment might be fostered amongst some of the association's non-member clienteles.

Finally, "mutual enlightenment," a generally rational and non-indoctrinatory educational process and product, did include elements of indoctrination. Included here was the YMCA and YWCA's advocacy (though not enforcement) of a belief in the existence of God, and the Art, Historical and Scientific Association's and the two Canadian Clubs' patriotic advocacy of the British Empire's moral supremacy. Nevertheless, membership and learning in these organizations was hardly contingent upon their members accepting these beliefs. Therefore, even with these anti-educational elements present, the organizations, overall, were still associations of mutual enlightenment.
The thesis, in retrospect, has developed an empirically enriched, yet philosophically sensitive, definition of mutual enlightenment. Through each chapter, it has contributed to our understanding of what mutual enlightenment was like and what it meant to its actual participants. Key chapter themes—critical ideas, the social characteristics of the members, the social context of turn-of-the-century Vancouver, and the dialectical tension between the ideas and that context—individually and collectively have contributed to the production, meaning, and "lived experience" of mutual enlightenment.

To remind the reader, the ten associations selected and researched as exemplars of mutual enlightenment were the Arts and Crafts Society (1900-01), the Arts, Historical and Scientific Association (1889-present), the British Columbia Mountaineering Club (1907-present), the Naturalists' Field Club (1906-07), the Vancouver Women's Musical Club (1905-present), the Young Men's Christian Association (1886-present) and Young Women's Christian Association (1897-present), the Burrard Literary Club (c.1889-1908), the Canadian Club (men only, 1906-present), and the Women's Canadian Club (1909-present). These clubs and societies were also but a tiny fraction of the more than seven hundred voluntary organizations that existed in Vancouver between 1886 and 1916.

8.2. MUTUAL ENLIGHTENMENT: THE SOCIAL EXPRESSION OF IDEAS

The mutual enlightenment association was a socially accepted and applauded vehicle for transmitting culture. Its promoters apparently had realized, as has historian Brian Simon, that "through language [i.e., the language of ideas], culture and knowledge are, as it were, crystallised and may be handed on, or made available to each new generation." In particular, Simon borrowed from the eminent archaeologist, V. Gordon Childe, to argue that through the socialized action of education, and in interaction with nature and the external world, "man...makes himself.” For Simon, education included both formal, state-controlled educational systems, and informal networks and independent groups (mutual enlightenment). By educating himself, man transforms nature and his external world. Man thus, and in turn, makes and remakes his own culture, in both the human consciousness and spiritual sense and in the material sense.2

This thesis, therefore, has argued that mutual enlightenment was organized in response to the creative interaction between certain ideas and the local social, economic, and political context. These ideas—culture, civilization, order, clerisy, beauty, utility, democracy, equality, citizenship, manliness, femininity, efficiency—captured the cultural ideals of mutual enlightenment promoters. Mutual enlightenment thus facilitated the transfer and adaptation of such ideas, in the forms of knowledge, skills, values, and communication and learning patterns, to its practitioners in Vancouver.

The different clubs and societies, however, invoked different ideas. In turn, mutual enlightenment varied in practice both within and across the different associations. It reflected how the ideas were interpreted, especially in relation to specific clienteles. Thus, inspired by certain critical and often popular ideals, individual associations were formed to complement the character and meaning of those ideals considered most relevant. These organizations, in turn, attracted many supporters of the ideals to join.

Paramount amongst these ideas was "order." The search for social order was each association's response to the threat of aesthetic, social, economic, and political disruption, and even chaos. These calamities were being brought to Vancouver with increasing waves of unenlightened speculators and immigrants, of "philistines" and "barbarian" masses. The Art, Historical and Scientific Association's Edward Gosnell and Gertrude Mellon, the Arts and Crafts Association's Robert Mackay Fripp, and the YMCA's "Vigilant," for example, all urged that civilization be defended through the enlightenment of their associations' members and of other local residents. Social order, and other relevant ideas, thus framed desires to uplift and strengthen the material and civil condition of their city, of their homes and workplaces, and ultimately, of their new nation.

The Art, Historical and Scientific Association, for example, promoted beauty, utility, high culture, nature and science, and patriotism. Their ideals, however, became manifest through different programmes for different clienteles. Though the Association offered itself as a kind of educated "clerisy," proferring cultural enlightenment for all, it quickly became esoteric and elitist in its promotion of enlightenment. Only those who had the requisite up-bringing, education, and natural sensibilities, it became apparent, could actually become members. Thus only the city’s more prosperous and educated classes attended the Association's salon-like lectures and conversaziones.
Vancouver's other citizens, the "great masses," had to find their own enlightenment through the Association's Cook-Vancouver Museum and Art Gallery. Here, a utilitarian emphasis served primarily to attract bourgeois support. It fit the Association within the ideological structure of the nineteenth-century's "useful knowledge movement." Workers and their families should learn applicable knowledge, might acquire some aesthetic and spiritual uplift, and generally should be distracted from the harsher aspects of their lives. Utility, for both Association members and museum visitors, thus, was treated intellectually. Experimental practice and application were generally ignored.

The Canadian Club and Women's Canadian Club, and the Women's Musical Club's "Associate" (i.e., regular) members, as well, were intellectual and elitist in their approaches to mutual enlightenment. The Musical Club sought to express beauty and high culture through its recitals and concerts. To a limited degree, the Club also saw their work as an expression of patriotism. The Canadian Clubs, on the other hand, expressly promoted patriotism. Their lectures centred upon Canadian and British economic, historical, sociological, geographical, cultural, and political topics.

Like the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, the programmes of all three clubs reflected their mainly upper middle-class constituencies. The Musical Club also expressly provided musical edification for the lower classes through charity concerts and recitals. Further, for the Club's "Active" (i.e., performing) members, the Club arranged music training and practice, and organized and sponsored subsidiary choral and symphony societies. The Active members performed in recitals and concerts for Associate (i.e., beneficiary) members. The Canadian Club's outreach was mainly through the newspaper publication of the text of each lecture.

In contrast to the above organizations, and especially the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, the Arts and Crafts Association, the Naturalists' Field Club, and the B.C. Mountaineering Club all emphasized utilitarian ideals. Their members aimed to acquire useful artistic, scientific, and observational skills, not just intellectual or aesthetic knowledge. Equally, by teaching skills and imparting knowledge, these organizations sought to enlighten their members to the aesthetic and romantic concepts of Beauty and Nature.

Significantly, the Arts and Crafts Association and the two natural history clubs
idealized co-operative and mutual *sharing* of each other’s aesthetic and scientific knowledge and skills amongst *all* members. Through ongoing informal exchanges of knowledge, augmented with formal lectures and classes, the members—architects and craftsmen, or botanists and geologists—taught each other something of their own specialties.

Further, any and all outsiders were welcome to join these societies. This contrasted with the elitism of the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, the Women’s Musical Club, and the two Canadian Clubs. The Arts and Crafts Association and the two natural history clubs were imbued with ideals of social progress added to their romantic and utilitarian aims. For some members, these ideals possibly included goals of social and political transformation. These organizations drew upon the romantic, and communal, images of William Morris and John Ruskin, but re-interpreted them to fit a more “primitive” Canadian context. The organizations expanded thus their membership aims to include working-class and lower middle-class members of both sexes. All the members were invited to participate in the same fashion, and with the same capacity and responsibility, as the professionally-skilled members.

Finally, some organizations sought to embody ideals of efficiency, and manliness or femininity, to complement many of the above ideals. They also and more openly aimed to promote social and moral control. Notable exemplars of these goals and ideals were found within the educational and socialization programmes of the YMCA, the YWCA, and the Burrard Literary Club.

As with the other organizations, these associations were formed in response both to threats of disorder, and to new opportunities for individual and class advancement. They were part of the evangelical Protestant movement for social reform and control. As such, their programmes aimed to protect young adults, and to train, educate, and socialize them to better deal with a world in transformation. Further, their promoters self-consciously acted to define and crystallize a new middle-class consciousness. In particular, they wanted to bring about a more practical, efficient, and democratic culture. These associations thus provided effective and accessible opportunities for all social classes. They aimed to more completely ameliorate and fulfil missed educational chances, moral character, and personal industry and efficiency. They believed that talent could be better distributed throughout commerce, industry, the trades, and the professions. And, they sought improvements in social and political standards.
For these organizations, the inculcation of those habits and values associated with a middle-class, "manly" or "domestic feminine" Christian character was very important. Such attempts at social and moral control, whether positively or negatively intentioned, however, undermined and twisted both the mutuality and the enlightenment of some YMCA and especially YWCA programmes. True "mutual enlightenment," at times, probably ceased to exist.

Mutual enlightenment, for the YMCA, was redeemed only through the curricular range of the four-fold programme. Its methods and curricula, for the most part, were educational. Opportunities for alternative information and learning experiences were available to all members. And the YMCA's overall programme, in contrast to the YWCA's, was clearly voluntary and democratic, notwithstanding its Protestant roots and character.

The literary and debating clubs, on the other hand, did not indoctrinate. The nature of their organization and pedagogy was both liberating and democratic; their teaching process was rational. Even the YMCA's and YWCA's own literary and debating clubs maintained most elements of enlightenment and a truly co-operative mutuality.

8.3. "MUTUAL ENLIGHTENMENT" MODELLED

"Mutual enlightenment," as this study has shown, cannot be cleanly and decisively demarcated. Rather, like "education," it was comprised of certain core defining characteristics. It should be generally rational, voluntary, and, in some manner, reciprocal. Further, it excludes (1) those organizations with explicitly indoctrinatory goals, and (2) those preparing people for eventual recognition by institutions of formal public education.

"Mutual enlightenment," however, can usefully be conceived as concentric circles. The central circle would correspond with those elements and limitations most critical to its definition. The centre circle would include those organizations that have most strictly adhered to these elements, for example, the literary and debating clubs and societies, especially, and the Women's Musical Club. Intentional mutual enlightenment likely would have ceased, however, when those elements detrimental to its practice and effect (indoctrination, propaganda, research, and artistic creation) took precedence over, or grossly interfered with and impeded, the strictly educational work of an association. The YMCA and YWCA, for reasons of their indoctrinatory practices and ideals, and for their
questionable “mutuality,” therefore, would be placed most likely on or near a borderline between “mutual enlightenment” and “not mutual enlightenment.” The YWCA, however, because of its elitist leadership, and because of its overall goal of “domesticating” working women, was probably the least compatible with the ideals of mutual enlightenment.

“Mutual enlightenment” also can be diagrammed into a four quadrant figure. This figure displays the bi-focal nature of most association's programmes (see Fig. 2, below).

Fig. 2. Pedagogies of mutual enlightenment.
Programme options for associations of mutual enlightenment.

\[
\begin{array}{c|c}
\text{Introverted} & \text{Informal} \\
\text{(Members Only)} & \text{Pedagogies} \\
\hline
\text{I} & \text{II} \\
(e.g., literary club) & (e.g., club reading-room) \\
\hline
\text{Formal} & \text{Pedagogies} \\
\text{Pedagogies} & \text{Extroverted} \\
\text{(Members + Non-members)} & \\
\hline
\text{III} & \text{IV} \\
(e.g., Women’s Musical Club’s choral club) & (e.g., public museum) \\
\end{array}
\]

NOTE: This definitional schema does not predict nor explain social facts. Instead, it models relevant empirical generalizations and describes key categories of facts and organizations. Each quadrant conveniently characterizes the ideas and concepts that have guided this study. Finally, it points to further research questions about the scope and nature of mutual enlightenment, both past and present.

Fig. 2, in particular, models the relationship between an association’s programme orientation towards members and non-members (introverted versus extroverted), and its use of formally controlled, as opposed to informal and spontaneous, situations for teaching
and learning (formal versus informal pedagogies). An extroverted policy assumes that the programme (or organization) serves its own members, but with the addition of a programme extension to non-members. That extension could be for missionary or recruitment purposes, or both. An introverted policy, on the other hand, assumes that the programme (or organization) serves only its own members. Pedagogically, a formal programme could include pre-arranged lectures, discussions, debates, classes, or concerts; or a formally organized, but subsidiary, club. Informal practices of mutual enlightenment, on the other hand, could include those events when observers and listeners voluntarily and spontaneously interact with each other in response to educative art gallery or museum exhibits, concerts, or lectures; or within an organization's reading room. Clearly, however, for these informal practices to be considered intentional mutual enlightenment, the educational events or facilities must have been so arranged for the observers and listeners to interact with each other.

Fig. 2 thus shows how the degree and nature of, and how the definition of, "mutuality" is central to describing the various practices of mutual enlightenment. These various manifestations of mutuality thus effectively modified the most strict interpretation of "mutual enlightenment."

Specifically, "mutuality" may be interpreted in a range from narrow to broad. Narrowly, "mutuality" is intentional. It emphasizes co-operation, reciprocity, commonality, and equality of action, particularly among the registered members of a club or society. Broadly, "mutuality" may be interpreted as a looser and less structured exchange of knowledge and experience. In this case, there is a mutual relationship between the club or society and individuals and groups outside the regular membership, and also amongst these outsiders.

Clearly, only the literary and debating clubs and societies could be included within the narrowest category of "mutuality." Only they, as evidenced in the 25-member Burrard Literary Club, came close to a communal democracy. All their organizational and pedagogical roles were filled completely, by rotation, by every member. The only outside resources used for their education were the public and members' own libraries.

The only other organizations that might also fit this narrowest category of "mutuality" could have been the Arts and Crafts Association and the Naturalists' Field
Club. In these cases, the Arts and Crafts Association's use of apprenticeship techniques and the Field Club's expectation of full and equal participation in all educational activities involved clearly mutual exchanges of knowledge and skills. Nevertheless, both of these organizations had a mixture of subject specialists (e.g., professional artists, science teachers). Also, the actual programme of the Field Club utilized the professional and expert naturalists in their experienced capacity. This suggests that the Club might better fit within the next category of "mutuality."

"Mutuality," then, may be broadened slightly to reflect organizationally self-planned and self-administered, though not necessarily self-taught, educational programmes for registered members. The programmes of all ten organizations studied thus may be considered as "mutual enlightenment." Lectures, discussions, conversaziones, choral and instrumental recitals, hikes and excursions, speeches, debates, and classes were variously used by the organizations to instruct and entertain their members. The actual teacher or performer, however, was often someone outside the association. That person would donate his or her time, or would be hired, to teach, lecture, or perform before the membership. For each club or society, then, "mutual enlightenment" included the free and reasoned exchange of knowledge, opinions, and feelings, amongst the participants, about whatever event they were attending. Furthermore, these exchanges could be both planned and formal (e.g., post-lecture group discussion) or unplanned and informal (e.g., topical discussion before and after lectures or during business meetings).

The broad interpretation of "mutuality" has proved to be a more difficult yet equally significant component of "mutual enlightenment." "Mutuality," in this case, involved each club or society extending its educational goals and programmes outside the organizations' official membership bounds. This conception of "mutuality," was most obviously evidenced within the contexts, for example, of the Art, Historical and Scientific Association's art exhibition and its Cook-Vancouver Museum and Art Gallery; the Arts and Crafts Association's arts and crafts exhibitions; the Women's Musical Club's off-shoot choral and orchestral clubs, its "Active" membership, its impresario role, and its public and charity concerts; the Canadian Club's newspaper published lectures; and the YMCA's industrial noon-hour meetings.

This broad interpretation incorporates the educational "self-help" character of Lord Brougham's "useful knowledge" movement. Public museums, public reading rooms and
libraries, public lectures, musical concerts, and public exhibitions were organized to “improve” and to “uplift.” Their clientele included both the “masses” and the busy and wealthy (but culturally boorish) business and professional classes (Philistines). These facilities and events aimed to stimulate aesthetic and intellectual reflection amongst these clienteles. In many cases, these public services also were intended to attract individuals to more committed forms of education through associational membership.

The difficulty of my extending the concept “mutual” beyond an association’s membership was the often hierarchical and didactic nature of the association’s programme. However, in each case, non-members attending any of each organization’s public events did so of their own volition. Conceivably, many interacted educationally with other visitors or audience members, and later with their friends, families, or workmates. In some cases, mutual interaction developed through exchanges between the association and members of other educational, mutual improvement, or even research or creative arts associations. The work of both associations could be advanced by sharing knowledge and by donating or loaning exhibit specimens and artwork. Mutual educational relationships thus probably existed on both individual and group levels. They developed both amongst individuals and between the exemplar associations and other identifiable organizations or publics.

8.4. THE SOCIAL SIGNIFICANCE OF MUTUAL ENLIGHTENMENT

Mutual enlightenment, as practised, and particularly its breadth, scope, and viability, was affected by the organizations’ membership policies and practices. Each organization had apparently open membership policies, and was a democratic political structure. Nevertheless, there were variations in the application of these principles. These, in turn, affected the structure and functions of mutual enlightenment in each organization.

Some associations circumvented their outwardly egalitarian principles through restrictive selection methods to prevent “undesirables” from joining. The Art, Historical and Scientific Association, the Woman’s Musical Club, and both Canadian Clubs, for example, all met during the week-day, at locations far from industrial plants or workers’ homes. They also required that all new members be sponsored and elected by the Board of Directors (all associations did this but to different effects). Yet, these associations could still claim, though perhaps falsely, that they remained relatively true to the egalitarian spirit.
They could have based this claim on their provision of public events and facilities, where both their own members and outsiders were welcome to attend.

The other six exemplar associations, on the other hand, practised more openly egalitarian membership and pedagogical procedures. These six organizations included the Arts and Crafts Association, the Naturalists’ Field Club, the B.C. Mountaineering Club, the YMCA, the YWCA, and the Burrard Literary Club. Each of these organizations were open to and accepted participating members from many different constituencies. All six had hoped to stimulate learning and understanding amongst their members by combining two or three clienteles—experts, novices, teachers, artisans, business and professional men, and “women of leisure”—into one great “class.” Perhaps they recognized, as had a Field Club spokesperson, that even the most learned were but “senior students.” The only exceptions here were the YMCA’s, YWCA’s, and Burrard Literary Club’s membership restriction to a single sex.

These latter six associations, even with their apparently open membership policies, differed substantially over what and how to teach the different clienteles. Their methods of programme management and member selection also contrasted.

The greatest contrast, for example, was between the Burrard Literary Club and the YMCA and YWCA. Literary Club members were directly and completely responsible for the Club’s management and for its curricula and pedagogy. Ultimately, they were fully responsible for their own and for their fellow members’ full participation. They practised the most participatory form of democracy of all ten organizations. In admitting members from different, and probably intentionally contrasting backgrounds (e.g., teachers and businessmen), however, they also effectively and purposefully controlled admission to the twenty-five member “club.” It was not unusual for the membership applications of prospective members to be rejected.

These democratic, yet highly restrictive measures contrasted with the larger YMCA’s and YWCA’s divisions of labour and representational democratic leadership. The YMCA and YWCA were among the most open in terms of accepting members of almost any background. They were also the most bureaucratic and professionalized of the ten organizations studied. For these organizations, divisions occurred, for instance, between administrative functions, on the one hand, and educative, social, and religious functions.
They also occurred between teaching and pupil functions, with instructors hired to teach some vocational, physical, and health education classes. Finally, the membership was divided between the the Protestant "active" members, who could vote, and the non-evangelical "associate" members, who could not vote. These divisions, compounded by the Associations' Protestant Christian background, made defining "mutual enlightenment" especially difficult. Nevertheless, unlike the Women's Musical Club with its similarly split membership, all YMCA and YWCA members were encouraged to participate in any and all programmes.

Some of the most egalitarian and democratic of the exemplar associations quickly failed, or experienced severe organizational changes or splits. The Arts and Crafts Association, Naturalists' Field Club, and B.C. Mountaineering Club all lacked cohesive memberships. They also lacked the management and control mechanisms necessary to set firmly and clearly the organizations' curricular policies, and to provide clear and strong administrative direction. Without organizational focus, even common topical interest was not a sufficient glue. Further, the promoters' belief in noblesse oblige, which underlined much of their hope and purpose, also probably contributed to the organizations rejection by both the working-class and the wealthy business-class constituencies. The Arts and Crafts Association, for instance, failed to attract both sufficient working craftsmen and philanthropic businessmen to their exhibitions and into their Association. Prospective working-class members were likely put off by the Association's barely hidden aesthetic pretensions and occasional snobbishness.

The social characteristics of each organizations' members clearly demonstrated the different applications of egalitarian and democratic policies. Most notably, relationships (not necessarily causal) were found between the national origin, religious affiliation, and occupational position (especially the presence of professional teachers or subject specialists) of an organization's members, and the character of mutual enlightenment. For example, the Art, Historical and Scientific Association, the Arts and Crafts Association, and the Naturalists' Field Club were more "cultural," esoteric, and even elitist in their approach to mutual enlightenment. In many cases, their attempts to extend to or to incorporate individuals who were not part of their "class" were patronizing, or at least could have been seen as such. These organizations were also distinctly English/Anglican organizations. The YMCA and the Burrard Literary Club, on the other hand, reflected the egalitarian,
democratic, and practical values of their predominant “colonial” (i.e., Canadian and Celtic) and non-Anglican Protestant constituencies. They did not cultivate escape into the old ideals of “high culture” from an unsavory and materialist Vancouver. Instead, these organizations encouraged reflective understanding of, and sought moral and practical input into, the new urban and commercial ideals of twentieth-century Vancouver. Mutual enlightenment, for them, promoted individual health and competence, and conscious moral behaviour.

Finally, those organizations deficient in teachers or subject specialists as members usually belonged to larger national or international associations. From these central organizations or coalition partners, the local associations could obtain curricular and organizational support. For example, the most bureaucratic and structured organizations, the YMCA and YWCA, had the fewest teachers as registered members. There were teachers involved but they were either Association employees or they were volunteers teaching certain courses or giving lectures. Thus these organizations, needing pedagogical and curricular expertise, were units of the large, comprehensive, and federated national and international YMCA and YWCA organizations. From the central organizations and their affiliate bodies (e.g., the YMCA’s Springfield College), they obtained organizational and programme guidance, and trained administrators and instructors. To a lesser degree, the Canadian Clubs (mostly business and professional men and their wives) formed units in the international Canadian Clubs coalition. As members, they shared ideals, organizational forms, speakers, and some national projects that promoted patriotism.

Most of the remainder of the ten organizations were at the most independent extreme. Of those whose membership was analyzed, all had a significant representation of teachers or subject specialists.

Also, there was a positive relationship between the presence of teachers and subject specialists, and mutual as opposed to didactic teaching arrangements. One might have expected that professional teachers within the membership might lead to a didactic style of education. However, the most egalitarian and democratic, or narrowly mutual, cases of enlightenment occurred within those organizations with many teachers and subject specialists. Examples included the Burrard Literary Club, followed by the Arts and Crafts Association and the Naturalists’ Field Club. Even the more “erudite” Art, Historical and Scientific Association followed the trend. It was notable both for its many professionals and
for its occasionally heated discussions. Instead, the YMCA and the Canadian Club, composed largely of businessmen, were the most didactic. Both associations, however, maintained sufficient formal and informal discussion of topics to remain a "mutual" education.

8.5. MUTUAL ENLIGHTENMENT: REASONS FOR PARTICIPATION

The reasons for people to have formed and participated in mutual enlightenment often overlapped and were interconnected. Some reasons were obvious. These had been published or otherwise noted by association members themselves, or could be easily inferred from programme topics. Others were covert or hidden from obvious public knowledge and awareness, born of social class and other interests.

The most obvious reasons for participation in mutual enlightenment stemmed from the popular nineteenth-century goal of "self-improvement." Mutual enlightenment could contribute to an individual's economic, social, political, intellectual, or aesthetic knowledge and development. For example, the teachers belonging to the Naturalists' Field Club, the Arts and Crafts Association, and the Burrard Literary Club, or the tradesmen in the YMCA's educational class and even in the Arts and Crafts Association, hoped to improve their employment prospects. Vancouver was booming, employers needed trained help, and immigrants needed work. Teaching was professionalizing. Advances in technology and in business organization were forcing tradesmen and young businessmen and clerks to up-grade their technical and communication skills. In this new and rapidly expanding city, there were opportunities to "get ahead," and many new migrants who desired as much.

Friendship and recreation also drew participants. The clubs, courses, concerts, conversaziones, and excursions provided "respectable" ways for participants to spend leisure time, to socialize and meet like-minded people.

Third, many wanted to lead—to stimulate and forge—a vigorous intellectual and cultural presence in Vancouver. Mostly educated, British, and Anglican, this "clerisy" sought to transplant and to re-generate in the new frontier the best of British and European cultural "tone" and heritage. Among other reasons, they wanted to retain their personal cultural heritage; to discover and nourish their creative and artistic urges; to encourage science, technology, and art for both aesthetic and economic reasons; and to promote and
engender a moralistic Canadian and British Empire consciousness and sentiment.

Fourth, and in common with the third reason, many activists hoped to protect young and migrant adults from the horrors and temptations of city life. They wanted to provide them with a more enlightened vision of how the city and their lives might be. YMCA and YWCA promoters, in particular, sought to better control their members’ personal and social development, and indirectly to rid society of its “social ills.” They reasoned that mutual enlightenment would best serve these goals by looking to their members’ economic, social, recreational, cultural, and ultimately moral needs, all within a family-like atmosphere. The Art, Historical and Scientific Association also started with social ameliorative goals, though its methods were less comprehensive and emphasized diversion rather than conversion.

Finally, many association members were newcomers. They were socially and economically “marginal” to the dominant interests and cultural values of the established and socially “superior” merchant, industrial, and professional classes. Non-elite professionals (e.g., teachers, librarians, journalists, social workers, artists), artisans and clerks, women, British and other immigrants (especially non-English immigrants, and including recently migrated eastern Canadians), and non-elite religious groups (e.g., Methodists, Congregationalists, Roman Catholics, Jews), with their perceived lower status or social handicaps, comprised the bulk of socially ambitious, culturally sensitive, individuals attracted to the ten associations studied. Simply stated, mutual enlightenment was seen as a publicly applauded vehicle for these people to enhance their social standing. Through association with their social “superiors,” these association members could learn and copy the manners, values, and habits of those whose status they desired. Concurrently, these aspiring cultural leaders, through their improved social position, and under the aegis of their organizations, could seek to extend their new knowledge, and their own cultural interests, to help form society into their own image. They were developing and articulating new cultural values and interests for the newly evolving middle classes. As such, they were very much a part of a larger, international drive for middle-class definition and respectability.
8.6. CONCLUDING NOTE

To conclude, this thesis is a social and intellectual history of intentional mutual enlightenment. The setting was Vancouver, British Columbia, 1886-1916. The thesis argues that mutual enlightenment—its aims, objectives, curricula, and instructional and organizational arrangements—was organized in response to, and in interaction with, its context. By analyzing the relationship of mutual enlightenment to the contexts of late Victorian and Edwardian intellectual thought, and to British Columbia's social and economic development, then, the thesis explains the meaning that mutual enlightenment held for participants. In particular, the thesis infers and explains the reasons—stated and structural—for their participation, and the social, political, and economic functions of the mutual enlightenment associations.

The thesis also shows how the context (especially as reflected through the membership) limited the impact of mutual enlightenment to those people who held social class and often ethnicity in common. Mutual enlightenment, on the whole, was only of moderate significance to Vancouver society. It was generally too introverted and formal in its practice. Too often programmes were split between constituencies. It attracted too few people, though many of the members were important locally and provincially. And given its stated aim to foster "a spirit of healthy co-operation among all classes," as claimed by a Canadian Club president, mutual enlightenment must be judged only a limited success.

The thesis further shows how these limitations forced modification of "mutual enlightenment's" conceptual definition. It therefore has defined "mutual enlightenment," such definition having paid attention, so far as possible, both to significant social facts and to the rigours of conceptual analysis.

Finally, the thesis suggests that the aims and interests of those people and organizations researched were not unique to Vancouver nor to the type of organization. They exemplified that phenomenon and co-operative activity that saw the creation of the co-operative, labour, and adult education movements in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. The work suggests how collections of individuals, imbued with the ideals of an enlightened and wholesome community, could come together in the concrete expression of those ideals. Moreover, it affirms the importance of examining the meaning of frontier in the Canadian experience. The frontier—the "last great West"—was an idea that aroused
both fear (e.g., the American pattern of settlement and civilization), and a vision of how to
tame and cultivate it. We need still to know more about these fears and visions, and about
the institutions created to handle them.

More critically, the contextual analysis of these voluntary associations has shown a
life of struggle and mission within a generally hostile environment. Each organization
typically represented a specific social group or class and was ignored by other groups, even
when their goals were aimed at those other groups. Other institutions—government,
business, and labour—further impeded these organizations. Much more contextual
research, however, is needed to demonstrate further and to explain the linkages between
adult and especially mutual education and a region's political economy and social structure.
Such work, viewing the context from the perspective of a secular co-operative and
“missionary” activity, therefore, should add considerably to the developing social and
intellectual history of Western Canadian culture and adult education.
BIBLIOGRAPHY

I. PRIMARY SOURCES

A. Manuscript Sources

1. Organizational Records

University of British Columbia Library (UBC). Special Collections Division. British Columbia Academy of Science. MSS Papers.


University of British Columbia Library. Special Collections Division. Young Women’s Christian Association of Vancouver (YWCA). MSS Papers, 1903-1915. Boxes 1, 3, 10.


Vancouver City Archives. Art, Historical and Scientific Association of Vancouver, B.C. MSS Papers, 1894-1918. Vols. 1, 2, 4, 9-11, 13, 18, 22, 26.


Vancouver City Archives. Mrs. Elizabeth Rogers. MSS Papers. Includes the Women’s Canadian Club, 2 volumes, 1909-1916.


Vancouver City Archives. Vancouver Art Association. MSS Papers, 1890-1891, 1939, 1944.

Vancouver City Archives. Vancouver Arts and Crafts Association. MSS Papers, 1900-1901.


Vancouver City Archives. Women’s Canadian Club of Vancouver. MSS Papers, 1909-1978.


2. Unpublished and Miscellaneous Biographical Records (Manuscript Collections)

University of British Columbia Library. Special Collections Division. Abercrombie, Miss Ivy. VP Papers.


Vancouver City Archives. Robert MacKay Fripp. MSS Papers, 1890.


W. H. Malkin File.


Robert Marriott File.

Rev. George Ritchie Maxwell File.

G. W. Melhuish File.

Lt.-Col. Charles Milne File.

Walter Moberly File.

“Professor” E. and E. F. Odum File.

T. H. Robson File.

Jonathan Rogers File.

W. D. S. Rorison File.

“Capt.” Wm. H. Soule File.

James Stark File.

A. M. Stewart File.

James R. Suter File.

Dr. George Telford, D.D.S., File.

R. P. S. Twizell File.

George T. Wadds File.

F. C. Wade File.

Frederick Welsh File.


Vancouver City Archives. Rev. George Ritchie Maxwell. MSS Papers, 1861-1900.

Vancouver City Archives. Walter Moberly. Personal MSS Papers, 1908-1914.

Vancouver City Archives. Native Sons of B.C., Post # 2. MSS Papers. Volume 22. 
“Poplar Lodge,” newspaper article on J. J. and Harriet Banfield.

Vancouver City Archives. Native Sons of B.C., Post # 2. MSS Papers. Volume 24. Judge 

Vancouver City Archives. Professor Edward Odum. MSS Papers, 1890-1910.

Vancouver City Archives. Mrs. Gillian Roberts, Collector. MSS Essays concerning Point 
Atkinson/Caulfeild district, West Vancouver.
Vancouver City Archives. Robert Percival Sterling Twizell. MSS Papers.

Vancouver City Archives. Wade Family. MSS Papers.


3. Unpublished Manuscript Articles


B. Published Sources

1. Government Publications


2. **Annual Reports and Yearbooks**


Draper, Thomas, comp. *William's Vancouver and New Westminster Cities Directory, 1890; Containing General Provincial Information.* Vancouver: R. T. Williams, 1890.

Gosnell, R. E. *The Year Book of British Columbia and Manual of Provincial Information to which is Added a Chapter Containing Much Special Information Respecting the Canadian Yukon and Northern Territory Generally.* Victoria, 1897.


3. Biographical Sources (Books)


4. General Books


5. Pamphlets


[Stewart, Mr.]. *The Report of a Brief Investigation of Social Conditions in the City Which Indicate the Need of an Intensive Social Survey, the Lines of which are Herein Suggested*. ([Toronto]: The Board of Temperance and Moral Reform of the Methodist Church and The Board of Social Service and Evangelism of the Presbyterian Church, [1913]). United Church Archives. University of British Columbia.


Vancouver City Young Men's Christian Association. *A Question of Values*. Vancouver: The Vancouver City Young Men's Christian Association, [1913]. Harry Patten Archibald Collection. Young Men's Christian Association of Greater Vancouver Archives.


Vancouver City Young Men's Christian Association. *Plans for Fall and Winter*. Vancouver: The Vancouver City Young Men's Christian Association, [1906]. Harry Patten Archibald Collection. Young Men's Christian Association of Greater Vancouver Archives.

Vancouver City Young Men's Christian Association. *Some Schedules: The Vancouver City Young Men's Christian Association, Season 1912-13*. Vancouver: The Vancouver City Young Men's Christian Association, [1912]. Harry Patten Archibald Collection. Young Men's Christian Association of Greater Vancouver Archives.

6. Articles


Dorchester, Frank E. “Physical Culture.” *Man to Man Magazine* (Vancouver), December 1910, pp. 1106-1107;


Vigilant. [“Letter to the Editor.”] News (Vancouver). 14 September 1886, p. 4.

“What is Culture?” The Vancouver World, 14 October 1913, p. 8.


7. Newspaper Clipping Files (Vancouver City Archives, Major Matthew’s Collection): Association Personnel

Alpen, Herman Martin. Pioneer, 1897. Artist.


Bishop, J. C. 1912-1918. Mr. Bishop--Bishop & Christie.


Burnett, Dr. Frank, LL.D., F.R.G.S.

Burns, William. (1938-). Pioneer, 1891.


Cook, Alderman Edward. 1901-2-3-4-5 (1936).


Crysdale, B. F. [Bella Flint]. Life Insurance.

Dalton, Willie.


Dougan, J. J. Teacher, East School. Pioneer. 18[??].


Edge, Miss E. P. [Elizabeth].


Fowler, George L. Pioneer.

Fowler, Hector A. Pioneer.


Hammersley, A. St. G., K.C. 1897. First City Solicitor. Constance Hammersley (dau.)


Knowlton, E. S. [Ed]. 1902. Early Druggist, etc.


Logan, J. J. Capt. and Mrs. 1942. Pioneer.


Moberly, Walter. 1914. Explorer, 1858....


Rear, James S. [re. father, Dr. William Rear]. 1943.

Robson, Thomas Hood. 1959. Pioneer, 1891 or before.


Sills, Reuben S. 1940. Lewis & Sills--now 1940 Sills & Grace.


Stewart, Allan C. 1941. Pioneer.

Stewart, Angus M. 1938. Pioneer.
Stuart, Gen. J. Duff. 1914.


Vancouver Women's Musical Club. 1955. [re. obituary, Mrs. R. C. Boyle].


Wade, F. C. 1898. Agent General--B.C.

Welsh, Mr. and Mrs. Fred W. 1938.


8. Newspapers and Periodicals


British Columbia Federationist. 1911-1915.


The Independent (Vancouver). 1900-1904.

The Monthly Review 1, 4 (July 1889). Young Men's Christian Association (Vancouver). Vancouver City Archives.


The Vernon News. 15 October 1909.

Western Clarion (Vancouver). Various issues, 1903-1908.

Western Socialist (Vancouver). 1902-1903.


II. SECONDARY SOURCES

A. Unpublished Sources

1. Theses


2. Unpublished Articles and Monographs


B. Published Sources

1. Books


2. Pamphlets


3. Book and Periodical Articles


