

# Paul the Apostle

By Robyn Walsh

Entry tags: Religion, Christian Traditions, Early Christianity, Roman Religious Traditions

Paul was a well-educated (i.e. elite) Jewish Pharisee who understood the Galilean teacher Jesus of Nazareth to be the "Christ" or Messiah predicted in the Hebrew Bible. He traveled throughout the Mediterranean, primarily to urban hubs, offering his unique interpretation of the Jewish scriptures, what he called "pneumatic demonstrations," and details of his divinatory experiences to those with means to sponsor him as a religious specialist and self-styled "apostle." After leaving these urban areas, he would continue contact via formal letter writing. Some of these letters still survive and constitute our evidence for Paul's efforts. The degree to which the groups to whom he writes were bounded and cohesive is debated by scholars. These letters have also been preserved somewhat idiosyncratically and represent hundreds of years of editing and translation by various parties.



Date Range: 50 CE - 60 CE

Region: Ancient Mediterranean

Region tags: Europe, Western Europe

Ancient Mediterranean tagged with "Western Europe" out of convention, but actually overlaps with a few regions.

## Status of Participants:

✓ Elite    ✓ Religious Specialists

## Sources

Print sources for understanding this subject:

- Source 1: Stanley Kent Stowers, *A Rereading of Romans: Justice, Jews, and Gentiles*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1997.
- Source 2: Caroline Johnson Hodge, *If Sons, Then Heirs: A Study of Kinship and Ethnicity in the Letters of Paul*. Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press, 2007.
- Source 3: Other sources mentioned throughout in comments.

Notes: Primary sources include, naturally, the genuine letters of Paul in the canonical New Testament. Some scholars would also include the canonical Acts of the Apostles; however, I judge that text (along with the other Acts of Paul) to be constructed myths about Paul as a founding figure. Concerning dates/years covered: I have only included the years scholars generally agree Paul wrote his letters.

Online sources for understanding this subject:

- Source 1 URL: <http://www.greekbible.com/>

Relevant online primary textual corpora (original languages and/or translations):

– Source 1 URL: <http://www.earlychristianwritings.com/>

– Source 1 Description: A collection of the canonical and extra canonical letters of Paul (both genuine and pseudepigraphic) offered in multiple scholarly translations.

– Source 2 URL: URL TBD

– Source 2 Description: Tufts University and the Perseus Project (<http://www.perseus.tufts.edu>) are currently working on new scholarly translations of the New Testament. The project will likely be available in 2019.

Notes: Note that translations in this entry are largely adapted from the NRSV.

## General Variables

### Membership/Group Interactions

Are other religious groups in cultural contact with target religion:

– Yes

Notes: Paul considers himself a Judean/Jew and the messianic Jesus movement he represents falls under these auspices. As a Pharisee, Paul is offering a particular interpretation of Judean sacred books for which there are attendant practices; however, there is no "Christianity" as an independent entity at this time. Among the other 'religions' in cultural contact: any of the other Greco-Roman religious systems (e.g., practices/worship centered on individual/local gods, imperial cult, etc). NB: I follow the work of Steve Mason and others on the proper translation of the term Ἰουδαῖος (Ioudaios)/ Ἰουδαῖοι (Iudaea, Iudaei) as an ethnic category "Judean" rather than the religiously coded "Judaism" and its derivatives (Jewish, Jew, etc). See Steve Mason, "Jews, Judaeans, Judaizing, Judaism: Problems of Categorization in Ancient History," *Journal for the Study of Judaism* 38 (2007): 457-512. There are hesitations that in not translating the term, one risks performing an act of erasure on the place of Judaism in the ancient world. For more on this particular debate, see *Jew and Judean: A Marginalia Forum on Politics and Historiography in the Translation of Ancient Texts*, eds. Timothy Michael Law and Charles Halton (Los Angeles: The Marginalia Review of Books, 2014).



Is the cultural contact competitive:

– Yes

Notes: Paul openly states that he has competitors, "opponents," and people he terms "super-apostles" (2 Corinthians 11-12) vying for the attention of his target audiences. For example: 2 Corinthians 11:4-6 For if someone comes and proclaims another Jesus than the one we proclaimed, or if you receive a different spirit from the one you received, or a different gospel from the one you accepted, you submit to it readily enough. I think that I am not in the least inferior to these super-apostles. I may be untrained in speech, but not in knowledge certainly in every way and in all things we have made this evident to you. Also see Galatians 2:4, 1 Corinthians 1:12-15, 3:3-9. 1 Corinthians 1:12-15 What I mean is that each of you says, "I belong to Paul," or "I belong to Apollos," or "I belong to Cephas," or "I belong to Christ." Has Christ been divided? Was Paul crucified for you? Or were you baptized in the name of Paul? I thank God that I baptized none of you except Crispus and Gaius, so that no one can say that you were baptized in my name.

↳ Is the cultural contact accommodating/pluralistic:

– Yes

Notes: Based on the content of his letters, there do appear to be some recipients (e.g., Galatians) who are amenable to Paul's offerings. Other letters, like those labeled "1 and 2 Corinthians," demonstrate conflict and a lack of cohesion. In Paul's letter to the Romans it is clear he has not yet been to Rome and is seeking sponsorship (Romans 15:22-33).

↳ Is the cultural contact neutral:

– No

Notes: No cultural contact is inherently neutral. The nature of our evidence make it difficult to go into detail with this particular question. That said, if Paul's claims concerning persecution are accurate, perhaps they are relevant (e.g., 2 Corinthians 11:24ff).

↳ Is there violent conflict (within sample region):

– Yes

Notes: On a macro-level, the Roman empire frequently engaged in violent conflict in order to quash uprisings. On the micro-level, Paul describes himself as someone who formerly "pursued" other Christ-followers. Again, he also claims he was persecuted (beaten and arrested) on occasion because of his specialist activities.

↳ Is there violent conflict (with groups outside the sample region):

– Field doesn't know

Does the religious group have a general process/system for assigning religious affiliation:

– Yes

Notes: "Yes," with the caveat that it is unclear to what extent the groups to whom Paul is writing (so-called Pauline 'churches') were cohesive. In Paul's historical moment, "Christianity," as such, was not distinguishable as its own religion. Paul refers to membership/affiliation as being or participating "in Christ." The means for obtaining this membership include engaging in certain practices, such as baptism and sharing eucharist meals. These practices were a means by which one could share in the "pneuma" (often poorly translated as "spirit") of the risen Christ (Jesus). In ancient (Stoic, Middle Platonic) thought, pneuma was a physical and highly refined principle substance. The term is often featured in reference to concepts or objects to explain their contiguity or animation (wind, air, breath, fire, sperm). Paul describes a process through which those baptized "into Christ Jesus" are endowed with his (shared) pneuma. See, for example, Romans 6:3-4: Romans 6:3-4 Do you not know that all of us who have been baptized into Christ Jesus were baptized into his death? Therefore we have been buried with him by baptism into death, so that, just as Christ was raised from the dead by the glory of the Father, so we too might walk in newness of life. What Paul means in this passage is that Christ Jesus, having been endowed by Yahweh ("Father") with special pneuma as a son of God, had the faithfulness to trust in Yahweh and his plan for Jesus' death to represent a new covenant. Thanks to his death/sacrifice, this new covenant is fulfilled and the risen Christ has defeated the first mortal enemy: death. Through baptism, those "in Christ" share in Christ's pneuma. Likewise, they will share in Christ's destiny (as "adopted sons") and look forward to a special status in the afterlife. See 1 Corinthians 6:10-11: "But you were washed, you were sanctified, you were justified in the name of the Lord Jesus Christ and

in the pneuma of our God." Sharing in the ritual meal of the eucharist serves a similar function. Take, for example, 1 Corinthians 10:16-21: 1 Corinthians 10:16-21 The cup of blessing that we bless, is it not a sharing in the blood of Christ? The bread that we break, is it not a sharing in the body of Christ? Because there is one bread, we who are many are one body, for we all partake of the one bread. Also see below for a discussion concerning intercourse as potentially linking participants "in Christ." Finally, of note, Paul is focused on the membership of Gentiles (non-Jews/Judeans). However, this does not mean that Jews/Judeans are not also obtaining membership in the Jesus movement. According to Paul, this is the objective of the representatives of the movement elsewhere (cf. Galatians 2). For more on this in secondary literature, see: Stanley Kent Stowers, "What is Pauline Participation in Christ," Pages 352-371 in *New Views of Jewish and Christian Self-Definition: Essays in Honor of E. P. Sanders*. Notre Dame: Notre Dame University Press, 2008.

↳ Assigned at birth (membership is default for this society):

– Field doesn't know

Notes: It is possible that Paul believes that children born to those sharing in Christ's "pneuma" also share in that fellowship. He describes those "united" in intercourse as sharing "one body" and sharing pneuma (1 Cor 6:16). One may be safe in assuming that Paul considers a child born to at least one person "in Christ" as sharing in that same "body." Elsewhere, for instance, he describes the children of Christ followers as "holy" (1 Cor 7:12-16). This would ultimately depend on Paul's understanding of who (male/female) is primarily responsible for the formation of the fetus. Given his knowledge and use of Stoic/Middle Platonic philosophical concepts and his understanding of the role of pneuma in ability to "adopt" Gentiles into the line of Abraham, it is quite possible he ascribes this ability to the male. This is (arguably) supported by his objection to men engaging in intercourse with prostitutes, lest they inadvertently join them "in Christ" through the activity (1 Corinthians 6:15-17, below); however, in this passage it seems he is primarily concerned with the sexual act itself. It is important to note that, on the whole, Paul discourages procreation. In 1 Cor 6:12-20, he is explicit about his disdain for intercourse, deeming it a passion to be avoided (given its associative risks for immorality). He suggests that, if one is unable to control this particular passion, that the act be confined to marriage. 1 Corinthians 5:1 It is actually reported that there is sexual immorality among you, and of a kind that is not found even among "pagans"; for a man is living with his father's wife. 1 Corinthians 5:9-11 I wrote to you in my letter not to associate with sexually immoral persons—not at all meaning the immoral of this world, or the greedy and robbers, or idolaters, since you would then need to go out of the world. But now I am writing to you not to associate with anyone who bears the name of a brother or sister who is sexually immoral or greedy, or is an idolater, reviler, drunkard, or robber. 1 Corinthians 6:13-14 The body is meant not for fornication but for the Lord, and the Lord for the body. And God raised the Lord and will also raise us by his power. 1 Corinthians 6:18-20 Shun fornication!.. the fornicator sins against the body itself. Or do you not know that your body is a temple of the holy pneuma within you, which you have from God, and that you are not your own? For you were bought with a price; therefore glorify God in your body. 1 Corinthians 6:15-17: Do you not know that your bodies are members of Christ? Should I therefore take the members of Christ and make them members of a prostitute? Never! Do you not know that whoever is united to a prostitute becomes one body with her? For it is said, "The two shall be one flesh." But anyone united to the Lord becomes one spirit with him. NB: Paul is likely reflecting on Genesis 2:24 in some measure with this discussion: "Therefore a man leaves his father and his mother and clings to his wife, and they become one flesh." For more on Paul's strategies of Gentile inheritance/adoption, see: Caroline Johnson Hodge, *If Sons, Then Heirs: A Study of Kinship and Ethnicity in the Letters of Paul* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2007).

↳ Assigned by personal choice:

– Field doesn't know

Notes: It is unclear whether those under the relative authority of a male head of household (paterfamilias) would have had the liberty to reject membership "in Christ" (e.g., slaves). Paul notes that there are marriages in which one member is "in Christ" and the other is not (1 Cor 7:12-16) and he discourages divorce; however, he also implies that marriage alone might be sufficient to link the non-participating partner into membership (that is, not by personal choice). The same may also be true for sexual partners (1 Corinthians 6:15-17).

↳ Assigned by class:

– No

Notes: Paul appears to be targeting those who are able to sponsor his travel and expenses (heads of households); however, class is not a deterrent to membership. cf. Romans 16:10-11

↳ Assigned at a specific age:

– Field doesn't know

Notes: Paul is not explicit on this point.

↳ Assigned by gender:

– No

Notes: There are several women named in Paul's letters who appear to have leadership roles (e.g., Phil. 4:2-3; 1 Cor. 1:11, 7:8, 7:39-40, 16:19; Romans 16:1-7). Paul also denies gender distinctions in Galatians 3:27-28: "As many of you as were baptized into Christ have clothed yourselves with Christ. There is no longer Judean or Greek, there is no longer slave or free, there is no longer male and female; for all of you are one in Christ Jesus." Similarly, in 1 Corinthians 7:1-5, Paul argues that a husband and wife have equal "authority" over one another's bodies: "Now concerning the matters about which you wrote: 'It is well for a man not to touch a woman.' But because of cases of sexual immorality, each man should have his own wife and each woman her own husband. The husband should give his wife her conjugal rights, and likewise the wife to her husband. For the wife does not have authority over her own body, but the husband does; likewise the husband does not have authority over his own body, but the wife does. Do not deprive one another except perhaps by agreement for a set time, to devote yourselves to prayer, and then come together again, so that Satan may not tempt you because of your lack of self-control." That said, there are some passages in which Paul appears to reify traditional gender roles. This may be situational (e.g., attempting to critique the actions of certain women a particular circumstance). Scholars also debate whether these passages are later interpolations designed to reinscribe traditional gender roles associated with the institutionalization of the orthodox church. See, for example: 1 Corinthians 11:3-15: "But I want you to understand that Christ is the head of every man, and the husband is the head of his wife, and God is the head of Christ. Any man who prays or prophesies with something on his head disgraces his head, but any woman who prays or prophesies with her head unveiled disgraces her head - it is one and the same thing as having her head shaved. For if a woman will not veil herself, then she should cut off her hair; but if it is disgraceful for a woman to have her hair cut off or to be shaved, she should wear a veil. For a man ought not have his head veiled, since he is the image and reflection of God; but woman is the reflection of man. Indeed,

man was not made from woman, but woman from man. Neither was man created for the sake of woman, but woman for the sake of man. For this reason a woman ought to have a symbol of authority on her head, because of the angels. Nevertheless, in the Lord woman is not independent of man or man independent of woman. For just as woman came from man, so man comes through woman; but all things come from God. Judge for yourselves: is it proper for a woman to pray to God with her head unveiled? Does not nature itself teach you that if a man wears long hair, it is degrading to him, but if a woman has long hair, it is her glory? For her hair is given to her for a covering." 1 Corinthians 14:34-35: "Women should be silent in the churches. For they are not permitted to speak, but should be subordinate, as the law also says. If there is anything they desire to know, let them ask their husbands at home. For it is shameful for a woman to speak in church." For more, see: Antoinette Clark Wire, *The Corinthian Women Prophets: A Reconstruction through Paul's Rhetoric*. Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 1990.

↳ Assigned by participation in a particular ritual:

– Yes

Notes: Paul names baptism and eucharist meals as practices associated with sharing in Christ's "pneuma." See comments on "Does Religious Group have a general process/system for assigning religious affiliation" above. See Stowers, "What is Pauline Participation in Christ," Pages 352-371 in *New Views of Jewish and Christian Self- Definition: Essays in Honor of E. P. Sanders*. Notre Dame: Notre Dame University Press, 2008.

↳ Assigned by some other factor:

– Yes [specify]: It is possible Paul possess a concept of what we might term predestination for those who ultimately "participate in Christ." See, for example, Romans 8:28-30: "And we know that in all things God works for the good of those who love him, who have been called according to his purpose. For those God foreknew he also predestined to be conformed to the image of his Son, that he might be the firstborn among many brothers and sisters. And those he predestined, he also called; those he called, he also justified; those he justified, he also glorified." He also describes his own activity as predetermined; he tells the Romans that Christ told him he was selected to be a messenger to the Gentiles before his birth (Romans 15:15-18).

Does the religious group actively proselytize and recruit new members:

– Yes

Notes: Yes. One of the primary objectives of Paul's letters is to communicate the guidelines for continued membership and good standing within his particular interpretation of the Christ movement. It seems reasonable to conclude that this activity did not remain static outside of Paul's purview with the reputed groups to whom he is writing. Whether we'd call this activity organized and systematic "proselytizing" is a matter of debate. Per my other answers in this entry, the level of cohesion implied by a term like "proselytize" may not be applicable in this specific instance. That said, if we consider "proselytizing" simply informing others of the Christ movement and inviting participation, then it seems reasonable to assume this was taking place. In Romans 16, Paul does reference certain individuals who are either benefactors, fellow apostles/workers and/or members in Christ. It is unclear whether we would say these individuals are also "proselytizing." Romans 16:3-12 Greet Prisca and Aquila, who work with me in Christ Jesus, and who risked their necks for my life, to whom not only I give thanks, but also all the churches of the Gentiles. Greet also the church in their house. Greet my beloved Epaenetus, who was the first convert in Asia for Christ. Greet Mary, who has worked very hard

among you. Greet Andronicus and Junia, my relatives who were in prison with me; they are prominent among the apostles, and they were in Christ before I was. Greet Ampliatus, my beloved in the Lord. Greet Urbanus, our co-worker in Christ, and my beloved Stachys. Greet Apelles, who is approved in Christ. Greet those who belong to the family of Aristobulus. Greet my relative Herodion. Greet those in the Lord who belong to the family of Narcissus. Greet those workers in the Lord, Tryphaena and Tryphosa. Greet the beloved Persis, who has worked hard in the Lord. In 1 Corinthians, there is also a debate over whether there is a woman with her own group of Christ followers (Chloe). If this is the case, it again raises concerns about how to imagine group cohesion. See 1 Corinthians 1:11: "For it has been reported to me by Chloe's people that there are quarrels among you, my brothers and sisters." Also see the somewhat ambiguous 1 Thessalonians 1:8: "For the word of the Lord has sounded forth from you not only in Macedonia and Achaia, but in every place your faith in God has become known, so that we have no need to speak about it."

↳ Is proselytizing mandated for religious professionals:

– Field doesn't know

Notes: Paul certainly viewed his self-described "mission" as mandated. There is not enough evidence to confirm that those represented in his writings as other "religious professionals" (e.g., deacons) are also tasked with precisely this same mandate.

↳ Is proselytizing mandated for all adherents:

– Field doesn't know

Notes: It is not entirely clear what Paul means when he states that members "in Christ" are "work[ing] very hard among you" (Romans 16:6).

↳ Is missionary work mandated for religious professionals:

– Yes

Notes: Given the nature of our evidence, I can only speak to Paul's self-described activities as a "religious professional." As mentioned above, Paul understands himself to be a Jonah figure, selected before birth for his leadership role informing Gentiles about the Jesus movement and the coming new age (Romans 15:15-18).

↳ Is missionary work mandated for all adherents:

– Field doesn't know

↳ Is proselytization coercive:

– Field doesn't know

Notes: If by "coercive" we mean forced, it is not clear whether heads of households could have forced participation for household members like slaves. Otherwise, Paul's rhetoric is arguably coercive insofar as he claims that those who do not participate will face mortal death. See, especially, Galatians 3, 5; Romans 5, 8.

Does the religion have official political support

– Field doesn't know

Notes: We do not know enough about the individuals addressed in Paul's letters. Paul indicates that he has been arrested and beaten for his activities at times, suggesting the opposite (cf. 2 Corinthians 11:24-26; Romans 16:7). NB: Later evidence of Christ-followers (e.g., the letters of Pliny) also suggest a lack of political understanding or support.

Is there a conception of apostasy in the religious group:

– Yes

Notes: Paul does speak of "false apostles" (2 Corinthians 11:13) and "false believers" (Galatians 2:4). That said, I dispute the notion that what is traditionally termed "Pauline Christianity" is cohesive enough at this stage to label the activity of Paul's so-called opponents "apostasy." To do so would reinscribe anachronistic categories of orthodoxy and heresy.



Are apostates prosecuted or punished:

– Field doesn't know

## Size and Structure

Number of adherents of religious group within sample region (estimated population, numerical):

– Field doesn't know

Notes: One might be able to estimate the size of the households/groups to whom Paul is writing, but it would assume much to say these groups were fully cohesive. One source that hypothesized the number of early Christians in the empire is: Hopkins, Keith. "Christian Number and its Implications." *Journal of Early Christian Studies* 6, 2 (1998): 185-226. According to Hopkins, by 40CE there may have been a total of 1,000 people identifying as (what we would call) "Christian." By 300CE, perhaps around 10% of the total Roman population ( $\approx$  6 million people). However, given that this entry is about Paul as a religious specialist, these numbers stand as a reference only. I do not associate them directly with Paul as Paul can not be held responsible for all Christ-followers (despite the claims of tradition).

Number of adherents of religious group within sample region (% of sample region population, numerical):

– Field doesn't know

Notes: Any answer to this question would be purely theoretical. It also depends on whether you reason that larger social structures, such as imperial cult, dictate adherence. In the future, this entry may want to link to a general entry on Greco-Roman religion and first-century Judaism.

Nature of religious group [please select one]:

– Small religious group (seen as being part of a related larger religious group)

Specific to this answer:

Date Range: 35 CE - 65 CE



Are there recognized leaders in the religious group:

– Yes

Specific to this answer:

Date Range: 35 CE - 65 CE

↳ Is there a hierarchy among these leaders:

– Yes

Specific to this answer:

Date Range: 35 CE - 65 CE

↳ A council or group of leaders for the religious group that oversees all other leaders in the sample region:

– Field doesn't know

Notes: Paul speaks of himself as an authority, recognizes others like Peter and James as authorities, and references leaders with official titles like "deacons." However, the extent to which these were recognized authorities and the relative oversight they possessed is unclear.

Specific to this answer:

Date Range: 35 CE - 65 CE

↳ Are leaders believed to possess supernatural powers or qualities:

– Yes

Specific to this answer:

Date Range: 35 CE - 65 CE

↳ Powers are acquired by individual deeds carried out in past lives:

– No

Specific to this answer:

Date Range: 35 CE - 65 CE

↳ Powers are acquired by individual deeds carried out in the current life:

– Yes

Notes: Paul speaks frequently about "pneumatic" powers which appear to include acts such as speaking in tongues, divination, prophecy, and healing.

Specific to this answer:

Date Range: 35 CE - 65 CE

↳ Powers are inherited:

– Field doesn't know

Notes: There may be a degree to which pneumatic powers are tied to ethnicity.

Specific to this answer:

Date Range: 35 CE - 65 CE

↳ Powers are culturally transmitted from a supernatural being:

– Yes

Notes: I am not clear what "culturally transmitted" means in this context; however, Paul claims that the risen Christ (Jesus) is responsible for much of his authority and his pneumatic powers.

Specific to this answer:

Date Range: 35 CE - 65 CE

↳ Powers are culturally transmitted from another human (e.g. teacher):

– Field doesn't know

Notes: It is possible that Paul is instructing people on how to perform certainly supernatural activities.

Specific to this answer:

Date Range: 35 CE - 65 CE

↳ Powers are associated with leadership office they assume:

– Field doesn't know

Notes: This is quite possible. In 1 Cor 14, Paul addresses those seeking to obtain special recognition for their ability to speak in tongues.

Specific to this answer:

Date Range: 35 CE - 65 CE

↳ Are religious leaders chosen:

– Yes

Notes: Paul is clearly vying for authority (i.e. to be chosen).

Specific to this answer:

Date Range: 35 CE - 65 CE

↳ Are leaders considered fallible:

– Yes

Specific to this answer:

Date Range: 35 CE - 65 CE

## Scripture

Does the religious group have scriptures:

Scripture is a generic term used to designate revered texts that are considered particularly authoritative and sacred relative to other texts. Strictly speaking, it refers to written texts, but there are also "oral scriptures" (e.g. the Vedas of India).

– Yes

Notes: Paul makes reference to the Septuagint version of the Torah. He also makes reference to a "gospel" (good news); however, what he means by this term is disputed. It is unlikely he is using the term to designate written materials such as the later lives of Jesus now known as "gospels." Nor is it the case that the Christian canon of scripture is codified at any point close to Paul's life and work. See, for example, Romans 2:16: "... according to my gospel/good news, God, through Jesus Christ, will judge the secret thoughts of all."

↳ Are they written:

– Yes

Notes: Paul utilizes the Septuagint/Judean/Jewish sacred books. When he makes reference to "the law," he means to indicate the first five books of the Hebrew Bible.

↳ Are they oral:

– Yes

Notes: There are oral "versions" of the Septuagint/Hebrew Bible in circulation in this period, although it's not clear that Paul is reliant on these oral transmissions in any form. This entry may want to link to a future entry on oral Torah, should it exist.

↳ Is there a story associated with the origin of scripture:

– Yes

Notes: Yes, associated with the Hebrew Bible/Judaism. For all answers below, assume association with first-century CE Judaism and Jewish history. In the future, this entry should link to an entry on this subject. NB: Below, on occasion, I make reference to the perceived role of Jesus in Paul's theology/cosmology in order to engage the thinking of our subject (Paul); however, strict adherence to this question would focus exclusively on Judaism/Hebrew Bible.

↳ Revealed by a high god:

– Yes

Notes: Yahweh reveals himself in multiple forms throughout the Hebrew Bible.

↳ Revealed by other supernatural being:

– Yes

Notes: The distinction between "revealed" and "inspired" in this section are not terribly clear to me. By answering "yes" I am indicating an awareness of other supernatural beings (e.g., angels) in the Hebrew Bible. Paul also acknowledges a variety of supernatural beings in his letters. See the primary sources listed below. NB: To that end, because we are talking about the discrete question of scripture, I am not

including the revelation/inspiration Paul attributes to Christ Jesus. 1 Corinthians 4:9 For I think that God has exhibited us apostles as last of all, as though sentenced to death, because we have become a spectacle to the world, to angels and to mortals. 1 Corinthians 5:3-5 For though absent in body, I am present in spirit and as if present I have already pronounced judgment in the name of the Lord Jesus on the man who has done such a thing. When you are assembled, and my spirit is present with the power of our Lord Jesus, you are to hand this man over to Satan for the destruction of the flesh, so that his spirit may be saved in the day of the Lord. 1 Corinthians 6:3 Do you not know that we are to judge angels—to say nothing of ordinary matters? 1 Corinthians 7:5 Do not deprive one another except perhaps by agreement for a set time, to devote yourselves to prayer, and then come together again, so that Satan may not tempt you because of your lack of self-control. 1 Corinthians 8:4-6 Hence, as to the eating of food offered to idols, we know that “no idol in the world really exists,” and that “there is no God but one.” Indeed, even though there may be so-called gods in heaven or on earth—as in fact there are many gods and many lords—yet for us there is one God, the Father, from whom are all things and for whom we exist, and one Lord, Jesus Christ, through whom are all things and through whom we exist. 1 Corinthians 10:14-22 Therefore, my dear friends, flee from the worship of idols. I speak as to sensible people judge for yourselves what I say. The cup of blessing that we bless, is it not a sharing in the blood of Christ? The bread that we break, is it not a sharing in the body of Christ? Because there is one bread, we who are many are one body, for we all partake of the one bread. Consider the people of Israel are not those who eat the sacrifices partners in the altar? What do I imply then? That food sacrificed to idols is anything, or that an idol is anything? No, I imply that what pagans sacrifice, they sacrifice to demons and not to God. I do not want you to be partners with demons. You cannot drink the cup of the Lord and the cup of demons. You cannot partake of the table of the Lord and the table of demons. Or are we provoking the Lord to jealousy? Are we stronger than he? 1 Corinthians 11:10 For this reason a woman ought to have a symbol of authority on her head, because of the angels. 1 Corinthians 13:11 If I speak in the tongues of mortals and of angels, but do not have love, I am a noisy gong or a clanging cymbal. 2 Corinthians 2:10-11 Anyone whom you forgive, I also forgive. What I have forgiven, if I have forgiven anything, has been for your sake in the presence of Christ. And we do this so that we may not be outwitted by Satan for we are not ignorant of his designs. 2 Corinthians 2:13-15 For such boasters are false apostles, deceitful workers, disguising themselves as apostles of Christ. And no wonder! Even Satan disguises himself as an angel of light. So it is not strange if his ministers also disguise themselves as ministers of righteousness. Their end will match their deeds. 2 Corinthians 12:7-9 Therefore, to keep me from being too elated, a thorn was given me in the flesh, a messenger of Satan to torment me, to keep me from being too elated. Three times I appealed to the Lord about this, that it would leave me, but he said to me, “My grace is sufficient for you, for power is made perfect in weakness.” So, I will boast all the more gladly of my weaknesses, so that the power of Christ may dwell in me. Galatians 1:8 But even if we or an angel from heaven should proclaim to you a gospel contrary to what we proclaimed to you, let that one be accursed! Galatians 3:19 Why then the law? It was added because of transgressions, until the offspring would come to whom the promise had been made and it was ordained through angels by a mediator. For such boasters are false apostles, deceitful workers, disguising themselves as apostles of Christ. And no wonder! Even Satan disguises himself as an angel of light. So it is not strange if his ministers also disguise themselves as ministers of righteousness. Their end will match their deeds. Galatians 4:3-5 So with us while we were minors, we were enslaved to the elemental spirits of the world. But when the fullness of time had come, God sent his Son, born of a woman,

born under the law, in order to redeem those who were under the law, so that we might receive adoption as children. Galatians 4:8-10 Formerly, when you did not know God, you were enslaved to beings that by nature are not gods. Now, however, that you have come to know God, or rather to be known by God, how can you turn back again to the weak and beggarly elemental spirits? How can you want to be enslaved to them again? You are observing special days, and months, and seasons, and years. Romans 8:38 For I am convinced that neither death, nor life, nor angels, nor rulers, nor things... Romans 16:20 The God of peace will shortly crush Satan under your feet. The grace of our Lord Jesus Christ be with you. 1 Thessalonians 2:18 For we wanted to come to you—certainly I, Paul, wanted to again and again—but Satan blocked our way.

↳ Inspired by high god:

— Yes

Notes: It is likely those composing these scriptures would attribute "inspiration" to the Judean god (Yahweh).

↳ Inspired by other supernatural being:

— Yes

Notes: I am answering "yes" here in reference to the other supernatural beings acknowledged in the Hebrew Bible. Again, because we are talking about the discrete question of scripture, I am not including the revelation/inspiration Paul attributes to Christ Jesus.

↳ Originated from divine or semi-divine human beings:

— Yes

Notes: See comment fields in the questions above concerning the Hebrew Bible. Paul combines references to the Hebrew Bible and the "good news" of Christ Jesus in his letters. Although this question calls for data on the specific category of scripture, I will include examples from the primary text (Paul's letter) for context. See Romans 1:1-4: "Paul, a servant of Jesus Christ, called to be an apostle, set apart for the good news of God, which he promised beforehand through his prophets in the holy scriptures, the good news concerning his son, who was descended from David according to the flesh and was declared to be the Son of God with power according to the pneuma of holiness by resurrection from the dead, Jesus Christ our Lord..." Also see 1 Corinthians 9:1-3: "Am I not free? Am I not an apostle? Have I not seen Jesus our Lord? Are you not my work in the Lord? If I am not an apostle to others, at least I am to you for you are the seal of my apostleship in the Lord. This is my defense to those who would examine me."

↳ Originated from non-divine human being:

— Yes

Notes: The Hebrew Bible/Law to which Paul refers is attributed to Moses. Also, on a purely descriptive level, yes. All of our written sources were composed by/originated from human beings.

↳ Are the scriptures alterable:

– Field doesn't know

Notes: The Torah/Hebrew Bible (LXX) is a source for Paul's interpretation; however, as a Pharisee, he is free to "read" or interpret these scriptures at will. In this respect, and as it concerns the act of translation with Paul's use of the Septuagint, these scriptures are alterable.

Specific to this answer:

Date Range: 35 CE - 65 CE

↳ Are there formal institutions (i.e. institutions that are authorized by the religious community or political leaders) for interpreting the scriptures:

– Yes

Notes: With the caveat that more research is necessary into the practices and "formal" institutionalization of Pharisees.

Specific to this answer:

Date Range: 35 CE - 65 CE

↳ Can interpretation also take place outside these institutions:

– Yes

Specific to this answer:

Date Range: 35 CE - 65 CE

↳ Interpretation is only allowed by officially sanctioned figures:

– Field doesn't know

Notes: Unfortunately our knowledge of Pharisees is relatively limited. It is therefore difficult to determine a process of internal authorization and/or exclusion for sanctioned figures.

Specific to this answer:

Date Range: 35 CE - 65 CE

↳ Is there a select group of people trained in transmitting the scriptures:

– Yes

Specific to this answer:

Date Range: 35 CE - 65 CE

↳ Is there a codified canon of scriptures:

– Yes

Specific to this answer:

Date Range: 35 CE - 65 CE

## Architecture, Geography

Is monumental religious architecture present:

– No

Are there different types of religious monumental architecture:

– No

Is iconography present:

– Field doesn't know

Notes: If there is extant art from this period that corresponds to Paul's activities, we are not aware of it. One could argue that Paul's emphasis on the cross as a symbol is iconographic; however, there is no material evidence to defend this position.

## Beliefs

### Burial and Afterlife

Is a spirit-body distinction present:

Answer "no" only if personhood (or consciousness) is extinguished with death of the physical body.

Answering yes does not necessarily imply the existence of Cartesian mind/body dualism, merely that some element of personhood (or consciousness) survives the death of the body.

– Yes

Notes: Paul speaks of the "body" (*sarx*, *soma*) and "spirit" (*pneuma*)/pneumatic bodies in terms that imply distinction. The material body is weak physiologically and in terms of its moral psychologically, a state inherited from Adam. Those who share in Christ's *pneuma* are empowered to better control emotions/passions and communicate with God. In the next age, they will have pneumatic bodies resistant to disease, passions, etc. For more, see Stanley Stowers, "The Apostle Paul," *The History of Western Philosophy of Religion*, Vol. 1 *Ancient Philosophy of Religion*, eds. Graham Oppy and Nick Trakakis (New York: Oxford University Press, 2009), 145-157, esp. 147-148. Some representative passages: Romans 8:11 If the *pneuma* of him who raised Jesus from the dead dwells in you, he who raised Christ from the dead will give life to your mortal bodies also through his *pneuma* that dwells in you. Romans 8:22-23 We know that the whole creation has been groaning in labor pains until now and not only the creation, but we ourselves, who have the first fruits of the *pneuma*, groan inwardly while we wait for adoption, the redemption of our bodies. Romans 12:1 I appeal to you therefore, brothers, by the mercies of God, to present your bodies as a living sacrifice, holy and acceptable to God, which is your pneumatic worship. Romans 12:4-5 For as in one body we have many members, and not all the members have the same function, so we, who are many, are one body in Christ, and individually we are members one of another. 1 Corinthians 6:13 "Food is meant for the stomach and the stomach for food"... The body is meant not for fornication but for the Lord, and the Lord for the body. 1 Corinthians 6:15-16 Do you not know that your bodies are members of Christ? Should I therefore take the members of Christ and make them members of a prostitute? Never! Do you not know that whoever is united to a prostitute becomes one body with her? For it is said, "The two shall be one flesh." 1 Corinthians 10:16-17 The cup of blessing that we bless, is it not a sharing in the blood of Christ? The bread that we break, is it not a sharing in the body of Christ? Because there is one bread, we who are many are one body, for we all

partake of the one bread. 1 Corinthians 12:12-27 For just as the body is one and has many members, and all the members of the body, though many, are one body, so it is with Christ. For in the one Spirit we were all baptized into one body—Jews or Greeks, slaves or free—and we were all made to drink of one pneuma. Indeed, the body does not consist of one member but of many. If the foot would say, “Because I am not a hand, I do not belong to the body,” that would not make it any less a part of the body... But God has so arranged the body, giving the greater honor to the inferior member, that there may be no dissension within the body, but the members may have the same care for one another... 2 Corinthians 4:8-12 We are afflicted in every way, but not crushed; perplexed, but not driven to despair; persecuted, but not forsaken; struck down, but not destroyed; always carrying in the body the death of Jesus, so that the life of Jesus may also be made visible in our bodies. For while we live, we are always being given up to death for Jesus’ sake, so that the life of Jesus may be made visible in our mortal flesh. So death is at work in us, but life in you. 2 Corinthians 5:6-10 So we are always confident; even though we know that while we are at home in the body we are away from the Lord— for we walk by faith, not by sight. Yes, we do have confidence, and we would rather be away from the body and at home with the Lord. So whether we are at home or away, we make it our aim to please him. For all of us must appear before the judgment seat of Christ, so that each may receive recompense for what has been done in the body, whether good or evil. Philippians 1:20 It is my eager expectation and hope that I will not be put to shame in any way, but that by my speaking with all boldness, Christ will be exalted now as always in my body, whether by life or by death. Philippians 3:21 He will transform the body of our humiliation that it may be conformed to the body of his glory, by the power that also enables him to make all things subject to himself. 1 Thessalonians 5:23 May the God of peace himself sanctify you entirely; and may your spirit and soul and body be kept sound and blameless at the coming of our Lord Jesus Christ.

↳ Spirit-mind is conceived of as having qualitatively different powers or properties than other body parts:

— Yes

Notes: Yes, to the extent that Paul sees pneuma or nous as communicating/connected with Christ/God and future pneumatic bodies as distinct from fleshly, mortal bodies. Each of these "divine" substances are considered more refined than material stuff (like bodies). For more on Paul's cosmology and moral psychology, see: Troels Engberg-Pedersen, *Cosmology of the Self in the Apostle Paul: The Material Spirit* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010); Troels Engberg-Pedersen, ed. *Paul in His Hellenistic Context* (London: T&T Clark, 2004); Troels Engberg-Pedersen, *Paul and the Stoics* (Louisville: Westminster John Knox Press, 2000).

Belief in afterlife:

— Yes

Notes: Paul believes that in the afterlife, those who have participated "in Christ" will be granted pneumatic bodies, free from mortal concerns, including pain and susceptibility to the passions. 1 Corinthians 15:35-57 But someone will ask, “How are the dead raised? With what kind of body do they come?” Fool! What you sow does not come to life unless it dies. And as for what you sow, you do not sow the body that is to be, but a bare seed, perhaps of wheat or of some other grain. But God gives it a body as he has chosen, and to each kind of seed its own body. Not all flesh is alike, but there is one flesh for human beings, another for animals, another for birds, and another for fish. There are both heavenly bodies and earthly bodies, but the glory of the heavenly is one thing, and that of the earthly is another.... For more on this, see Stanley K. Stowers, “Paul and the Terrain of Philosophy,” *Early Christianity* 6 (2015), 141-156, esp. 150-152. Emma Wasserman, *The Death of the Soul in Romans 7: Sin, Death, and the Law in Light of Hellenistic Moral Psychology* (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2008); Troels



Engberg-Pedersen, *Cosmology of the Self in the Apostle Paul: The Material Spirit* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010); Troels Engberg-Pedersen, ed. *Paul in His Hellenistic Context* (London: T&T Clark, 2004); Troels Engberg-Pedersen, *Paul and the Stoics* (Louisville: Westminster John Knox Press, 2000); Pierre Hadot, "Théologie, exégèse, revelation, écriture dans la philosophie grecque," in *Les règles de l'interprétation*, ed. M. Tardieu (Paris: Le Cerf, 1987), 13-34.

Reincarnation in this world:

– No

Are there special treatments for adherents' corpses:

– Field doesn't know

Notes: Paul does speak of "baptism on behalf of the dead" (1 Corinthians 15:29). It is not clear what this practice entailed or whether it was something unique to this group.

Are co-sacrifices present in tomb/burial:

– Field doesn't know

Are grave goods present:

– Field doesn't know

Are formal burials present:

– Yes

Notes: It is clear from Paul's letters (e.g., Thessalonians 4:13-5:11; 1 Corinthians 15:6) that some of the people he considered members of the group have died. One would assume these members have had a formal burial. It is impossible to say whether these burials entailed any characteristics we would associate with Paul's teachings. As such, this question reveals one of the difficulties with assuming that Paul's letters represent on-the-ground activities. This entry should later link to evidence for burial practices in the particular regions to which Paul is writing. The "yes" answers given below are provisional and indicate the existence of these formations in Greco-Roman burial practices writ large. Future evidence may require revision.

↳ As cenotaphs:

– Yes

↳ In cemetery:

– Yes

↳ Family tomb-crypt:

– Yes

↳ Domestic (individuals interred beneath house, or in areas used for normal domestic activities):

– Field doesn't know

↳ Other formal burial type:

– Field doesn't know

## Supernatural Beings

Are supernatural beings present:

– Yes

Notes: In addition to Yahweh (the supreme, high god), Paul makes repeated references to other beings, such as angels, demons (daimons), Satan and "elemental spirits" (τὰ στοιχεῖα τοῦ κόσμου): 1 Corinthians 4:9 For I think that God has exhibited us apostles as last of all, as though sentenced to death, because we have become a spectacle to the world, to angels and to mortals. 1 Corinthians 5:3-5 For though absent in body, I am present in spirit and as if present I have already pronounced judgment in the name of the Lord Jesus on the man who has done such a thing. When you are assembled, and my spirit is present with the power of our Lord Jesus, you are to hand this man over to Satan for the destruction of the flesh, so that his spirit may be saved in the day of the Lord. 1 Corinthians 6:3 Do you not know that we are to judge angels—to say nothing of ordinary matters? 1 Corinthians 7:5 Do not deprive one another except perhaps by agreement for a set time, to devote yourselves to prayer, and then come together again, so that Satan (Σατανᾶς) may not tempt you because of your lack of self-control. 1 Corinthians 8:4-6 Hence, as to the eating of food offered to idols, we know that "no idol in the world really exists," and that "there is no God but one." Indeed, even though there may be so-called gods in heaven or on earth—as in fact there are many gods and many lords—yet for us there is one God, the Father, from whom are all things and for whom we exist, and one Lord, Jesus Christ, through whom are all things and through whom we exist. 1 Corinthians 10:14-22 For I think that God has exhibited us apostles as last of all, as though sentenced to death, because we have become a spectacle to the world, to angels and to mortals. Therefore, my dear friends, flee from the worship of idols. I speak as to sensible people judge for yourselves what I say. The cup of blessing that we bless, is it not a sharing in the blood of Christ? The bread that we break, is it not a sharing in the body of Christ? Because there is one bread, we who are many are one body, for we all partake of the one bread. Consider the people of Israel are not those who eat the sacrifices partners in the altar? What do I imply then? That food sacrificed to idols is anything, or that an idol is anything? No, I imply that what Gentiles (τὰ ἔθνη) sacrifice, they sacrifice to demons and not to God. I do not want you to be partners with demons (τῶν δαιμονίων). You cannot drink the cup of the Lord and the cup of demons. You cannot partake of the table of the Lord and the table of demons. Or are we provoking the Lord to jealousy? 1 Corinthians 11:10 For this reason a woman ought to have a symbol of authority on her head, because of the angels. 1 Corinthians 13:11 If I speak in the tongues of mortals and of angels, but do not have love, I am a noisy gong or a clanging cymbal. 2 Corinthians 2:10-11 Anyone whom you forgive, I also forgive. What I have forgiven, if I have forgiven anything, has been for your sake in the presence of Christ. And we do this so that we may not be outwitted by Satan for we are not ignorant of his designs. 2 Corinthians 2:13-15 For such boasters are false apostles, deceitful workers, disguising themselves as apostles of Christ. And no wonder! Even Satan disguises himself as an angel of light. So it is not strange if his ministers also disguise themselves as ministers of righteousness. Their end will match their deeds. 2 Corinthians 12:7-9 Therefore, to keep me from being too elated, a thorn was given me in the flesh, a messenger of Satan to torment me, to keep me from being too elated. Three times I appealed

to the Lord about this, that it would leave me, but he said to me, "My grace is sufficient for you, for power is made perfect in weakness." So, I will boast all the more gladly of my weaknesses, so that the power of Christ may dwell in me. Galatians 1:8 But even if we or an angel from heaven should proclaim to you a gospel contrary to what we proclaimed to you, let that one be accursed! Galatians 3:19 Why then the law? It was added because of transgressions, until the offspring would come to whom the promise had been made; and it was ordained through angels by a mediator. Galatians 4:3-5 So with us while we were minors, we were enslaved to the elemental spirits (τὰ στοιχεῖα τοῦ κόσμου) of the world. But when the fullness of time had come, God sent his Son, born of a woman, born under the law, in order to redeem those who were under the law, so that we might receive adoption as children. Galatians 4:8-10 Formerly, when you did not know God (Θεὸν), you were enslaved to beings that by nature are not gods. Now, however, that you have come to know God, or rather to be known by God, how can you turn back again to the weak and beggarly elemental spirits? How can you want to be enslaved to them again? You are observing special days, and months, and seasons, and years. Romans 8:38 For I am convinced that neither death, nor life, nor angels, nor rulers, nor things present, nor things to come, nor powers... Romans 16:20 The God of peace will shortly crush Satan under your feet. The grace of our Lord Jesus Christ be with you. 1 Thessalonians 2:18 For we wanted to come to you—certainly I, Paul, wanted to again and again—but Satan blocked our way.

↳ A supreme high god is present:

— Yes

Notes: Yes, in reference to the Jewish/Judean supreme god (Yahweh). Some of my comments/notes below, however, recognize that the gods associated with Roman imperial cult may be relevant.

↳ The supreme high god is anthropomorphic:

— Yes

Notes: In some respects this is a difficult question to answer. Paul makes references to Yahweh in anthropomorphic terms on multiple occasions. He also uses language of paternity and so on which implies some sense of anthropomorphism. It is unclear whether it follows that he has an anthropomorphic conception of this supreme high god or whether this is literary device. I answer "yes" because I am reliant on the text; however, a future entry on Second Temple Judaism may yield a different interpretation. See, for example: Romans 8:33-34 Who will bring any charge against God's elect? It is God who justifies. Who is to condemn? It is Christ Jesus, who died, yes, who was raised, who is at the right hand of God, who indeed intercedes for us. Romans 9:20 But who indeed are you, a human being, to argue with God? Will what is molded say to the one who molds it, "Why have you made me like this?" 2 Corinthians 4:4-6 In their case the god of this world has blinded the minds of the unbelievers, to keep them from seeing the light of the gospel of the glory of Christ, who is the image of God. For we do not proclaim ourselves; we proclaim Jesus Christ as Lord and ourselves as your slaves for Jesus' sake. For it is the God who said, "Let light shine out of darkness," who has shone in our hearts to give the light of the knowledge of the glory of God in the face of Jesus Christ. Philippians 2:5-8 Let the same mind be in you that was in Christ Jesus, who, though he was in the form of God, did not regard equality with God as something to be exploited, but emptied himself, taking the form of a slave, being born in human likeness. And being found in human form, he humbled himself and became obedient to the point of death—even death on a cross.

↳ The supreme high god is a sky deity:

– Yes

Notes: In his earliest manifestations, Yahweh is associated with mountains/thunder/sky. In later interpretation, he would be associated with the concept of "heaven" which is often described as "above." See, for example, 1 Kings 8:23; Deuteronomy 4:39; John 8:23; Acts 2:19. This answer should link with a future or existing entry on Yahweh/Second Temple Judaism.

↳ The supreme high god is chthonic (of the underworld):

– No

↳ The supreme high god is fused with the monarch (king=high god):

– Field doesn't know

Notes: I do not know how to interpret "fused" in this question. One can argue that figures like David are in conversation with Yahweh and/or are able to engage in acts of prophecy. Outside of Judaism specifically, one would have to turn to the broader Greco-Roman religious system and address whether the Roman Emperor falls within this purview. This would also require debate over the concept of a "supreme high god" for imperial religion.

↳ The monarch is seen as a manifestation or emanation of the high god:

– Field doesn't know

Notes: See comments on question above: The supreme high god is fused with the monarch (king = high god).

↳ The supreme high god is a kin relation to elites:

– Yes

Notes: Yahweh is referred to as "Father" in Judaism, indicating a familial relationship (if only as protector). This answer should link to a Second-Temple Judaism entry in the future.

↳ The supreme high god has another type of loyalty-connection to elites:

– Yes [specify]: covenant(s)

Notes: Yahweh frequently enters into covenant agreements with selected elites (and others).

↳ The supreme high god is unquestionably good:

– Yes

Notes: While the Jewish god is capable of destruction, these actions are usually interpreted as justified.

↳ Other feature(s) of supreme high god:

– Yes [specify]: In the Second-Temple period, moral psychology and theories of matter, etc linked to Yahweh and the composition of cosmos, etc.

Notes: Link this an entry on Second-Temple Judaism in the future.

↳ The supreme high god has knowledge of this world:

– Yes

Notes: There are multiple examples of Yahweh interceding in human events in the Hebrew Bible (e.g., Moses/exodus). Particularly relevant for Paul is the prediction that the Gentiles will be reintroduced into the fold of God's people (e.g., Romans 1).

↳ The supreme god's knowledge is restricted to particular domain of human affairs:

– No

↳ The supreme high god's knowledge is restricted to (a) specific area(s) within the sample region:

– Field doesn't know

Notes: One could argue that Yahweh's knowledge/power is confined to Judea/Judean territory; however, the implication is that his knowledge extends throughout the diaspora/Mediterranean.

↳ The supreme high god's knowledge is unrestricted within the sample region:

– Yes

↳ The supreme high god's knowledge is unrestricted outside of sample region:

– Field doesn't know

Notes: Presumably this is the case.

↳ The supreme high god can see you everywhere normally visible (in public):

– Field doesn't know

Notes: Presumably this is the case.

↳ The supreme high god can see you everywhere (in the dark, at home):

– Yes

– Field doesn't know

Notes: Presumably this is the case.



The supreme high god can see inside heart/mind (hidden motives):

— Yes

Notes: According to the Hebrew Bible and Paul's interpretation, Yahweh/God is aware of the emotions and internal motivations of various actors. See, for example, Romans 1:18-32: 18 For the wrath of God is revealed from heaven against all ungodliness and wickedness of those who by their wickedness suppress the truth. 19 For what can be known about God is plain to them, because God has shown it to them. 20 Ever since the creation of the world his eternal power and divine nature, invisible though they are, have been understood and seen through the things he has made. So they are without excuse; 21 for though they knew God, they did not honor him as God or give thanks to him, but they became futile in their thinking, and their senseless minds were darkened. 22 Claiming to be wise, they became fools; 23 and they exchanged the glory of the immortal God for images resembling a mortal human being or birds or four-footed animals or reptiles. 24 Therefore God gave them up in the lusts of their hearts to impurity, to the degrading of their bodies among themselves, 25 because they exchanged the truth about God for a lie and worshiped and served the creature rather than the Creator, who is blessed forever! Amen. 26 For this reason God gave them up to degrading passions. Their women exchanged natural intercourse for unnatural, 27 and in the same way also the men, giving up natural intercourse with women, were consumed with passion for one another. Men committed shameless acts with men and received in their own persons the due penalty for their error. 28 And since they did not see fit to acknowledge God, God gave them up to a debased mind and to things that should not be done. 29 They were filled with every kind of wickedness, evil, covetousness, malice. Full of envy, murder, strife, deceit, craftiness, they are gossips, 30 slanderers, God-haters,[f] insolent, haughty, boastful, inventors of evil, rebellious toward parents, 31 foolish, faithless, heartless, ruthless. 32 They know God's decree, that those who practice such things deserve to die—yet they not only do them but even applaud others who practice them. Also see Romans 2:1-16: Therefore you have no excuse, whoever you are, when you judge others; for in passing judgment on another you condemn yourself, because you, the judge, are doing the very same things. 2 You say, "We know that God's judgment on those who do such things is in accordance with truth." 3 Do you imagine, whoever you are, that when you judge those who do such things and yet do them yourself, you will escape the judgment of God? 4 Or do you despise the riches of his kindness and forbearance and patience? Do you not realize that God's kindness is meant to lead you to repentance? 5 But by your hard and impenitent heart you are storing up wrath for yourself on the day of wrath, when God's righteous judgment will be revealed. 6 For he will repay according to each one's deeds: 7 to those who by patiently doing good seek for glory and honor and immortality, he will give eternal life; 8 while for those who are self-seeking and who obey not the truth but wickedness, there will be wrath and fury. 9 There will be anguish and distress for everyone who does evil, the Jew first and also the Greek, 10 but glory and honor and peace for everyone who does good, the Jew first and also the Greek. 11 For God shows no partiality. 12 All who have

sinned apart from the law will also perish apart from the law, and all who have sinned under the law will be judged by the law. 13 For it is not the hearers of the law who are righteous in God's sight, but the doers of the law who will be justified. 14 When Gentiles, who do not possess the law, do instinctively what the law requires, these, though not having the law, are a law to themselves. 15 They show that what the law requires is written on their hearts, to which their own conscience also bears witness; and their conflicting thoughts will accuse or perhaps excuse them 16 on the day when, according to my gospel, God, through Jesus Christ, will judge the secret thoughts of all.

↳ The supreme high god knows your basic character (personal essence):

— Yes

Notes: See answer/comment above (re: "inside heart and mind"). Concerning Paul, his Middle Platonic/Stoic leanings also supports this interpretation. See Stanley K. Stowers, "Paul and the Terrain of Philosophy," *Early Christianity* 6 (2015), 141-156; Emma Wasserman, *The Death of the Soul in Romans 7: Sin, Death, and the Law in Light of Hellenistic Moral Psychology* (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2008); Troels Engberg-Pedersen, *Cosmology of the Self in the Apostle Paul: The Material Spirit* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010); *Stoicism in Early Christianity*, eds. Tuomas Rasimus, Troels Engberg-Pedersen, and Ismo Dunderberg (Grand Rapids: Baker Academic, 2010); Troels Engberg-Pedersen, ed. *Paul in His Hellenistic Context* (London: T&T Clark, 2004); Troels Engberg-Pedersen, *Paul and the Stoics* (Louisville: Westminster John Knox Press, 2000); Abraham J. Malherbe, "Hellenistic Moralists and the New Testament," *ANRW* (1992) 26.1: 267-333; Pierre Hadot, "Théologie, exégèse, revelation, écriture dans la philosophie grecque," in *Les règles de l'interprétation*, ed. M. Tardieu (Paris: Le Cerf, 1987), 13-34.

↳ The supreme high god knows what will happen to you, what you will do (future sight):

— Yes

Notes: For example, in Paul's understanding, Yahweh/God has sent his son (Jesus) to fulfill a new covenant and usher in a new cosmic age (cf. Romans 1). As discussed above, according to Paul, God also allows certain individuals to fall into the passions or allows them to relent their "hearts to impurity" (e.g., Romans 1:24-32).

↳ The supreme high god has other knowledge of this world:

— Field doesn't know

Notes: According to the wide canon of sacred writings, Yahweh/God appears to have knowledge of other supernatural beings; however, I am not certain from this question whether this constitutes "this world."

↳ The supreme high god has deliberate causal efficacy in the world:

— Yes

↳ The supreme high god can reward:

– Yes

↳ The supreme high god can punish:

– Yes

↳ The supreme high god has indirect causal efficacy in the world:

– Field doesn't know

Notes: I am uncertain what to make of the prompt "indirect causal efficacy" in this case.

↳ The supreme high god exhibits positive emotion:

– Yes

Notes: "Positive emotion" in this case might be expressed via affirmation and support. Paul also speaks of being beloved by God (cf. Romans).

↳ The supreme high god exhibits negative emotion:

– Yes

↳ The supreme high god possesses hunger:

– Field doesn't know

↳ Is it permissible to worship supernatural beings other than the high god:

– No

Notes: cf. Exodus 20:3

↳ The supreme high god possesses/exhibits some other feature:

– Field doesn't know

Notes: TBD

↳ The supreme high god communicates with the living:

– Yes

Notes: My primary point of reference in this section is the Hebrew Bible.

↳ In waking, everyday life:

– Yes

Notes: e.g., Exodus 3



↳ In dreams:

– Yes

Notes: e.g., 1 Kings 3:5.

↳ In trance possession:

– Field doesn't know

Notes: This may depend on whether "pneumatic demonstrations" and/or speaking in tongues (e.g., 1 Corinthians 14) involves trance-like states (in addition to circumscribed communication with Yahweh/God).

↳ Through divination practices:

– Yes

Notes: In Paul's case, he describes divination experiences involving communicating with Christ as a representative of/participant with God. See 1 Corinthians 15:3-11: 3 For I handed on to you as of first importance what I in turn had received: that Christ died for our sins in accordance with the scriptures, 4 and that he was buried, and that he was raised on the third day in accordance with the scriptures, 5 and that he appeared to Cephas, then to the twelve. 6 Then he appeared to more than five hundred brothers and sisters[c] at one time, most of whom are still alive, though some have died.[d] 7 Then he appeared to James, then to all the apostles. 8 Last of all, as to one untimely born, he appeared also to me. 9 For I am the least of the apostles, unfit to be called an apostle, because I persecuted the church of God. 10 But by the grace of God I am what I am, and his grace toward me has not been in vain. On the contrary, I worked harder than any of them—though it was not I, but the grace of God that is with me. 11 Whether then it was I or they, so we proclaim and so you have come to believe. Also see 1 Corinthians 12, 14. Stanley K. Stowers, "Paul and the Terrain of Philosophy," *Early Christianity* 6 (2015), 141-156

↳ Only through religious specialists:

– Field doesn't know

Notes: This would depend on the definition of a religious specialist. Certainly Paul appears to only want to authorize certain individuals for performing divinatory exercises (cf. 1 Corinthians 11).

↳ Only through monarch

– No

↳ Other form of communication with living:

– Field doesn't know

Notes: Again, this depends highly on definition. At this stage, I would like to leave this question open ("TBD").

↳ Previously human spirits are present:

– Yes

Notes: For Paul, I am including the risen Jesus in this dynamic. See quotations and discussion above on 1 Corinthians 15, Romans.

↳ Human spirits can be seen:

– Yes

Notes: If we consider the risen Christ to be a former human being now in a pneumatic body, yes (e.g., 1 Corinthians 15).

↳ Human spirits can be physically felt:

– Field doesn't know

Notes: Perhaps through pneumatic rituals (e.g., baptism)?

↳ Previously human spirits have knowledge of this world:

– Yes

↳ Human spirits' knowledge restricted to particular domain of human affairs:

– No

↳ Human spirits' knowledge restricted to (a) specific area(s) within the sample region:

– Field doesn't know

Notes: All of the same hesitations and caveats discussed above re: supreme high god apply to this section as well. Given that Paul believes Christ will usher in a new cosmic age, his knowledge and powers presumably extend beyond a particular region (e.g., Romans 2:12).

↳ Human spirits' knowledge unrestricted within the sample region:

– Yes

Notes: Presumably this is the case.

↳ Human spirits' knowledge unrestricted outside of sample region:

– Yes

Notes: Presumably this is the case.

↳ Human spirits can see you everywhere normally visible (in public):

– Field doesn't know

Notes: Presumably this is the case.

↳ Human spirits can see you everywhere (in the dark, at home):

– Field doesn't know

Notes: Presumably this is the case.

↳ Human spirit's can see inside heart/mind (hidden motives):

– Yes

Notes: If we understand Christ as an extension of Yahweh/God.

↳ Human spirits know your basic character (personal essence):

– Yes

↳ Human spirits know what will happen to you, what you will do (future sight):

– Yes

↳ Human spirits have other form(s) of knowledge regarding this world:

– Field doesn't know

Notes: TBD. He certainly appears to have knowledge of future cosmic activity.

↳ Human spirits have deliberate causal efficacy in the world:

– Yes

Notes: One example may be the risen Christ's repeated appearances to the apostles and others (e.g., 1 Corinthians 15).

↳ Human spirits can reward:

– Yes

↳ Human spirits can punish:

– Field doesn't know

↳ Human spirits have indirect causal efficacy in the world:

– Field doesn't know

Notes: I am not sure what to make of "indirect causal efficacy" in this case.

- ↳ Human spirits have memory of life:
  - Yes
  - Notes: The risen Jesus knows former mortal acquaintances.
  
- ↳ Human spirits exhibit positive emotion:
  - Yes
  
- ↳ Human spirits exhibit negative emotion:
  - Field doesn't know
  
- ↳ Human spirits communicate with the living:
  - Yes
    - ↳ In waking, everyday life:
      - Yes
    - ↳ In dreams:
      - Field doesn't know
      - Notes: This claim is made in Acts (e.g., Acts 16:9); however, I am restricting this entry to the undisputed letters and do not consider Acts a historical account.
    - ↳ In trance possession:
      - Field doesn't know
      - Notes: Again, it is possible something akin to trance possession takes place during pneumatic demonstrations.
    - ↳ Through divination processes:
      - Yes
    - ↳ Only through specialists:
      - Field doesn't know
    - ↳ Only through monarch:
      - No
    - ↳ Communicate with living through other means:

– Field doesn't know

Notes: Perhaps appearances via other figures/symbolism, TBD.

↳ Non-human supernatural beings are present:

– Yes

Notes: Paul appears to accept the existence of other supernatural beings and Greco-Roman deities (e.g., 1 Corinthians 10:20).

↳ These supernatural beings can be seen:

– Yes

↳ These supernatural beings can be physically felt:

– Field doesn't know

Notes: Presumably this is the case. While Paul may not discuss this explicitly, there are many discourses in this period concerning material contact with supernatural forces (e.g., possession by unclean pneuma, daimons, etc).

↳ Non-human supernatural beings have knowledge of this world:

– Yes

Notes: This series of questions should link to a future entry on broad Greco-Roman ideas concerning supernatural beings, household gods, etc (e.g., daimons). My answer "field doesn't know" simply indicates that this is not entirely clear from Paul's letters; however, a researcher using this entry may find other information on broader practices from which one can draw an educated, alternative conclusion.

↳ Non-human supernatural beings have knowledge restricted to particular domain of human affairs:

– Field doesn't know

↳ Non-human supernatural beings have knowledge restricted to (a) specific area(s) within the sample region:

– Field doesn't know

↳ Non-human supernatural beings have knowledge unrestricted within the sample region:

– Field doesn't know

↳ Non-human supernatural beings have knowledge unrestricted outside of sample region:

– Field doesn't know

↳ Non-human supernatural beings have can see you everywhere normally visible (in public):

– Field doesn't know

↳ Non-human supernatural beings can see you everywhere (in the dark, at home):

– Field doesn't know

↳ Non-human supernatural beings can see inside heart/mind (hidden motives):

– Field doesn't know

↳ Non-human supernatural beings knows your basic character (personal essence):

– Field doesn't know

Notes: "Personal essence" is a fuzzy category.

↳ Non-human supernatural beings know what will happen to you, what you will do (future sight):

– Field doesn't know

Notes: Arguably, supernatural, non-human supernatural and former supernatural beings seem to have input in human events through acts of prophecy. See 1 Corinthians 12, 14, 15.

↳ Non-human supernatural beings have other knowledge of this world:

– Field doesn't know

↳ Non-human supernatural beings have deliberate causal efficacy in the world:

– Yes

↳ These supernatural beings can reward:

– Yes

↳ These supernatural beings can punish:

– Yes

↳ These supernatural beings have indirect causal efficacy in the world:  
– Field doesn't know

Notes: I do not know how to address the concept of "indirect causal efficacy."

↳ These supernatural beings exhibit positive emotion:  
– Field doesn't know

↳ These supernatural beings exhibit negative emotion:  
– Field doesn't know

↳ These supernatural beings possess hunger:  
– Yes

Notes: In the case of sacrifices made to other Greco-Roman deities (e.g., 1 Corinthians 10:20).

↳ These supernatural beings possess/exhibit some other feature:  
– Field doesn't know

↳ Mixed human-divine beings are present:  
– Yes

Notes: Those included as participating in Christ possess his divine pneuma.

↳ Does the religious group possess a pantheon of supernatural beings:  
– Yes

↳ Organized by kinship based on a family model:  
– Yes

Notes: God the Father, Jesus his son and so forth (e.g., Romans 1:7).

↳ Organized hierarchically:  
– Yes

↳ Power of beings is domain specific:  
– Field doesn't know

↳ Other organization for pantheon:

– No

## Supernatural Monitoring

Is supernatural monitoring present:

This refers to surveillance by supernatural beings of humans' behaviour and/or thought particularly as it relates to social norms or potential norm violations.

– Yes

Notes: For this section, I am to some degree extrapolating what I believe Paul would claim on these matters, given his emphases on controlling the emotions and desires. For Paul, the Mosaic Law provided a guideline on proper behavior and control of the human propensity for disobedience, so one can assume that actions explicitly prohibited by Mosaic Law would be included among those things not viewed favorably by "supernatural monitoring." Please see the following secondary pieces of literature on moral psychology in Paul's letters. Romans (particularly Romans 1-11, 13) deal with these matters explicitly. Also see Galatians, esp. 5:16-21: 16 Live by the Spirit, I say, and do not gratify the desires of the flesh. 17 For what the flesh desires is opposed to the Spirit, and what the Spirit desires is opposed to the flesh; for these are opposed to each other, to prevent you from doing what you want. 18 But if you are led by the Spirit, you are not subject to the law. 19 Now the works of the flesh are obvious: fornication, impurity, licentiousness, 20 idolatry, sorcery, enmities, strife, jealousy, anger, quarrels, dissensions, factions, 21 envy, drunkenness, carousing, and things like these. I am warning you, as I warned you before: those who do such things will not inherit the kingdom of God. Stanley K. Stowers, "Paul and the Terrain of Philosophy," *Early Christianity* 6 (2015), 141-156; Stanley K. Stowers, "Kinds of Myths, Meals, and Power: Paul and Corinthians," in *Redescribing Paul and the Corinthians*, eds. Ron Cameron and Merrill P. Miller (Atlanta: Society of Biblical Literature, 2011), 105-14; Troels Engberg-Pedersen, *Cosmology of the Self in the Apostle Paul: The Material Spirit* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010); Stanley Stowers, "The Apostle Paul," *The History of Western Philosophy of Religion, Vol. 1 Ancient Philosophy of Religion*, eds. Graham Oppy and Nick Trakakis (New York: Oxford University Press, 2009), 145-157; Emma Wasserman, *The Death of the Soul in Romans 7: Sin, Death, and the Law in Light of Hellenistic Moral Psychology* (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2008); Troels Engberg-Pedersen, ed. *Paul in His Hellenistic Context* (London: T&T Clark, 2004); Troels Engberg-Pedersen, *Paul and the Stoics* (Louisville: Westminster John Knox Press, 2000); Abraham J. Malherbe, "Hellenistic Moralists and the New Testament," *ANRW* (1992) 26.1: 267-333; Pierre Hadot, "Théologie, exégèse, révélation, écriture dans la philosophie grecque," in *Les règles de l'interprétation*, ed. M. Tardieu (Paris: Le Cerf, 1987), 13-34.



There is supernatural monitoring of prosocial norm adherence in particular:

Prosocial norms are norms that enhance cooperation among members of the group, including obviously "moral" or "ethical" norms, but also extending to norms concerning honouring contracts and oaths, providing hospitality, coming to mutual aid in emergencies, etc.

– Yes



Supernatural beings care about taboos:

– Yes



↳ Food:  
– Yes  
Notes: e.g., food sacrificed to the broader Greco-Roman pantheon of gods

↳ Sacred space(s):  
– Field doesn't know

↳ Sacred object(s):  
– Field doesn't know

↳ Supernatural beings care about other:  
– Field doesn't know

↳ Supernatural beings care about murder of coreligionists:  
– Yes  
Notes: Any activity that is motivated by the passions (as opposed to reason) and represents indulgence is discouraged among those participating in Christ.

↳ Supernatural beings care about murder of members of other religions:  
– Yes

↳ Supernatural beings care about murder of members of other polities:  
– Yes

↳ Supernatural beings care about sex:  
– Yes

↳ Adultery:  
– Yes

↳ Incest:  
– Yes  
Notes: cf. 1 Corinthians 5:1-13

↳ Other sexual practices:  
– Yes [specify]: Same-sex sexual activity, prostitution

- ↳ Supernatural beings care about lying:
  - Yes
- ↳ Supernatural beings care about honouring oaths:
  - Yes
- ↳ Supernatural beings care about laziness:
  - Yes
- ↳ Supernatural beings care about sorcery:
  - Yes
- ↳ Supernatural beings care about non-lethal fighting:
  - Yes
  - Notes: 1 Corinthians 11 discusses divisions within the group.
- ↳ Supernatural beings care about shirking risk:
  - Field doesn't know
- ↳ Supernatural beings care about disrespecting elders:
  - Yes
- ↳ Supernatural beings care about gossiping:
  - Yes
  - Notes: cf. Romans 1:29
- ↳ Supernatural beings care about property crimes:
  - Yes
  - Notes: Paul insinuates there are lawsuits between members of the 'group' to whom he is writing (cf. 1 Corinthians 6:1-11).
- ↳ Supernatural beings care about proper ritual observance:
  - Yes
  - Notes: For example, not offering food to other gods/idols (cf. 1 Corinthians 8).

- ↳ Supernatural beings care about performance of rituals:
  - Yes
- ↳ Supernatural beings care about conversion of non-religionists:
  - Yes
- ↳ Supernatural beings care about economic fairness:
  - Yes
- ↳ Supernatural beings care about personal hygiene:
  - Field doesn't know
- ↳ Supernatural beings care about other:
  - Yes [specify]: Paul frequently and explicitly encourages love/loving on another.
  - Notes: cf. Romans 13:8-10

Do supernatural beings mete out punishment:

– Yes

Notes: In this case I consider not being included in the next cosmic age/afterlife a "punishment"/consequence.

- ↳ Is the cause or agent of supernatural punishment known:
  - Yes
    - ↳ Done only by high god:
      - Yes
    - ↳ Done by many supernatural beings:
      - Field doesn't know
    - ↳ Done through impersonal cause-effect principle:
      - Field doesn't know
      - Notes: If one reads Paul as indicating a measure of predestination, then perhaps this would be "impersonal cause-effect."
    - ↳ Done by other entities or through other means [specify]

– Field doesn't know

Notes: Paul does speak of Christ Jesus having beaten one of the first sins or evils: death. Perhaps one might include "death" among supernatural agents, although this may be a liberal interpretation of the source material.

↳ Is the reason for supernatural punishment known:

– Yes

↳ Done to enforce religious ritual-devotional adherence:

– Field doesn't know

Notes: I am uncertain how to answer this. Paul discusses the pending end-time scenario as a predicted result of various covenants between God and his people (including Jesus/cf. *pistis Christou* in Galatians and Romans). Given the nature of this "punishment," it does not necessarily function to "enforce" adherence long-term.

↳ Done to enforce group norms:

– Field doesn't know

↳ Done to inhibit selfishness:

– Yes

Notes: See Philippians 2:3; 2 Corinthians 12:20; Romans 13 and so forth (see above).

↳ Done randomly:

– No

↳ Other [specify]

– Field doesn't know

↳ Supernatural punishments are meted out in the afterlife:

– Field doesn't know

↳ Supernatural punishments are meted out in this lifetime:

– Yes

↳ Supernatural punishments in this life are highly emphasized by the religious group:

– Yes

- ↳ Punishment in this life consists of bad luck:
  - No
- ↳ Punishment in this life consists of political failure:
  - No
- ↳ Punishment in this life consists of defeat in battle:
  - No
- ↳ Punishment in this life consists of crop failure or bad weather:
  - No
- ↳ Punishment in this life consists of disaster on journeys.
  - No
- ↳ Punishment in this life consists of mild sensory displeasure:
  - No
- ↳ Punishment in this life consists of extreme sensory displeasure:
  - No
- ↳ Punishment in this life consists of sickness or illness:
  - No
- ↳ Punishment in this life consists of impaired reproduction:
  - No
- ↳ Punishment in this life consists of bad luck visited on descendants:
  - No
- ↳ Other [specify]
  - Yes

Notes: Soul-death is one of the consequences of immoral behavior. Emma Wasserman, *The Death of the Soul in Romans 7: Sin, Death, and the Law in Light of Hellenistic Moral Psychology* (Tübingen: Mohr Siebeck, 2008)

Do supernatural beings bestow rewards:

– Yes

↳ Is the cause/purpose of supernatural rewards known:

– Yes

Notes: I'm thinking here about bestowing those in the afterlife with pneumatic bodies that are impervious to the passions/desires, disease, death, etc. For a discussion of Paul's understanding of the nature of the resurrected body, see 1 Corinthians 15.

↳ Done only by high god:

– Yes

↳ Done by many supernatural beings:

– Field doesn't know

Notes: The word "many" in this question asks me to extend the available evidence too far.

↳ Done through impersonal cause-effect principle:

– No

↳ Done to enforce religious ritual-devotional adherence:

– Yes

Notes: Yes, in the sense that afterlife/pneumatic body are a carrot and stick reward for adherence.

↳ Done to enforce group norms:

– Yes

↳ Done to inhibit selfishness[]:

– Yes

Notes: See cited passages above.

↳ Done randomly:

– No

↳ Supernatural rewards are bestowed out in the afterlife:

– Yes

↳ Supernatural rewards in the afterlife are highly emphasized by the religious group:

– Yes

↳ Reward in the afterlife consists of mild sensory pleasure:

– Field doesn't know

↳ Reward in the afterlife consists of extreme sensory pleasure:

– Field doesn't know

↳ Reward in the afterlife consists of eternal happiness:

– Yes

↳ Reward in the afterlife consists of reincarnation as a superior life form:

– Yes

Notes: Paul does speak of a rebirth in pneumatic form, which one can interpret as a reincarnation or resurrection into a pneumatic body. On resurrection of the righteous, see 1 Corinthians 15:24-28.

↳ Reward in the afterlife consists of reincarnation in a superior realm:

– Yes

↳ Other [specify]

– No

↳ Supernatural rewards are bestowed out in this lifetime:

– Yes

Notes: Paul appears to have little doubt that the end time scenario he describes will take place during his lifetime (e.g., in 1 Corinthians 7:28-31 he judges that marriage is not necessary given the impending end of mortal social arrangements). Some scholars have observed that by the end of Paul's letter-writing career, he seems to think Christ's return is further in the future. To the degree that this question is driving at supernatural rewards over the course of an individual's lifetime, I am not sure Paul envisions that God/Yahweh and/or Jesus are interceding in human events on a regular basis. For that reason, I often answer "field doesn't know" to many of the prompts below.

↳ Supernatural rewards in this life are highly emphasized by the religious group:

– Yes

↳ Reward in this life consists of good luck:

– No

↳ Reward in this life consists of political success or power:

– Field doesn't know

↳ Reward in this life consists of success in battle:

– No

↳ Reward in this life consists of peace or social stability:

– Field doesn't know

↳ Reward in this life consists of healthy crops or good weather:

– Field doesn't know

↳ Reward in this life consists of success on journeys:

– Field doesn't know

↳ Reward in this life consists of mild sensory pleasure:

– Field doesn't know

Notes: Note that in 1 Corinthians, some of the Corinthians appear to think they already possess pneumatic bodies and are subsequently engaging in pleasure-seeking activities (e.g., sex) without immediate concerns for controlling the passions. 1 Corinthians 7 discusses the control of sexual desire. 1 Corinthians 6:12-20 also discusses activities with prostitutes.

↳ Reward in this life consists of extreme sensory pleasure:

– Field doesn't know

↳ Reward in this life consists of enhanced health:

– Field doesn't know

↳ Reward in this life consists of enhanced reproductive success:

– Field doesn't know

Notes: On the contrary, Paul discourages procreation (e.g., 1 Corinthians 7).

↳ Reward in this life consists of fortune visited on descendants:



– No

↳ Other [specify]

– Field doesn't know

## Messianism/Eschatology

Are messianic beliefs present:

– Yes

↳ Is the messiah's whereabouts or time of coming known?

– Yes

↳ Alive, identified:

– No

↳ Coming in this lifetime:

– Yes

↳ Coming on specified date:

– No

↳ Coming in unspecified time in near future:

– Yes

↳ Coming in unspecified time in distant future:

– Field doesn't know

Notes: As noted above, in his more mature letters (e.g., Romans), Paul seems to think the return of Christ will be in the more distant future, in contrast to the immediacy communicated in an early letter like Thessalonians (e.g., 4:13-5:11).

↳ Coming has already passed:

– No

↳ One in a line of many past and future messiahs:

– No

↳ Is the messiah's purpose known:

– Yes

Notes: cf. Romans 8:1-11

↳ Messiah is a political figure who restores political rule:

– Yes

↳ Messiah is a priestly figure who restores religious traditions:

– Yes

↳ Other purpose:

– Yes [specify]: defeat evils of the world (e.g., death)

## Norms and Moral Realism

Are general social norms prescribed by the religious group:

– Yes

Is there a conventional vs. moral distinction in the religious group:

– Field doesn't know

## Practices

### Membership Costs and Practices

Does membership in this religious group require celibacy (full sexual abstinence):

– No

Notes: See 1 Corinthians 7; abstinence is preferred, but sex within marriage is acceptable

Does membership in this religious group require constraints on sexual activity (partial sexual abstinence):

– Yes

↳ Monogamy (males):

– Yes

↳ Monogamy (females):

– Yes

↳ Other sexual constraints (males):

– Yes

Notes: Romans 1 suggests same sex relationships indulge the passions.

↳ Other sexual constraints (females):

– Yes

Notes: Romans 1 suggests same sex relationships indulge the passions.

Does membership in this religious group require castration:

– No

Does membership in this religious group require fasting:

– No

Does membership in this religious group require forgone food opportunities (taboos on desired foods):

– Yes

Notes: I am including meat sacrificed to other Greco-Roman gods in this instance (cf. 1 Corinthians 8).

Does membership in this religious group require permanent scarring or painful bodily alterations:

– Field doesn't know

Does membership in this religious group require painful physical positions or transitory painful wounds:

– Field doesn't know

Does membership in this religious group require sacrifice of adults:

"Adults" here referring to an emic or indigenous category; if that category is different from the popular Western definition of a human who is 18-years-old or older and who is legally responsible for his/her actions, then please specify that difference in the Comments/Sources: box below.

– No

Does membership in this religious group require sacrifice of children:

"Children" here referring to an emic or indigenous category; if that category is different from the popular Western definition, please specify that different in the Comments/Sources: box below.

– No

Does membership in this religious group require self-sacrifice (suicide):

– No

Does membership in this religious group require sacrifice of property/valuable items:

– Field doesn't know

Notes: Paul makes personal requests for money (e.g., for travel) as well as funds for those in poverty, but the extent to which this is mandatory (or observed) is debatable.

Does membership in this religious group require sacrifice of time (e.g., attendance at meetings or services, regular prayer, etc.):

– Yes

Does membership in this religious group require physical risk taking:

– Field doesn't know

Does membership in this religious group require accepting ethical precepts:

– Yes

Does membership in this religious group require marginalization by out-group members:

– Field doesn't know

Does membership in this religious group require participation in small-scale rituals (private, household):

– Yes



What is the average interval of time between performances (in hours):

Performances here refers to large-scale rituals.

– Field doesn't know

Does membership in this religious group require participation in large-scale rituals:

i.e. involving two or more households; includes large-scale “ceremonies” and “festivals.”

– Field doesn't know

Are extra-ritual in-group markers present:

E.g. special changes to appearance such as circumcision, tattoos, scarification, etc.

– Yes

Notes: Veil/head coverings for women (e.g., 1 Corinthians 11:1-16).

↳ Tattoos/scarification:  
– Field doesn't know

↳ Circumcision:  
– No

Notes: Paul explicitly rejects circumcision for Gentiles (cf. Galatians 2-5; 1 Corinthians 7; Romans 2)

↳ Food taboos:  
– Yes

↳ Hair:  
– Yes

Notes: See notes above on veiling.

↳ Dress:  
– Field doesn't know

↳ Ornaments:  
– Field doesn't know

↳ Archaic ritual language:  
– Field doesn't know

↳ Other:  
– Field doesn't know

Does the group employ fictive kinship terminology:

– Yes

Notes: Particularly terms like "brother."

↳ Fictive kinship terminology universal:  
– Field doesn't know

Notes: Within Paul's letters, yes.

↳ Fictive kinship terminology widespread:

– Yes

Notes: In the sense that his letters are addressed to a number of groups throughout the Mediterranean.

↳ Fictive kinship terminology employed but uncommon:

– No

## Society and Institutions

---

### Levels of Social Complexity

The society to which the religious group belongs is best characterized as (please choose one):

– Field doesn't know

### Welfare

Does the religious group in question provide institutionalized famine relief:

– Field doesn't know

Is famine relief available to the group's adherents through an institution(s) other than the religious group in question:

– Field doesn't know

Does the religious group in question provide institutionalized poverty relief:

– Yes

Notes: Paul requests funds "for the poor among the saints in Jerusalem" (Romans 15:26).

Is poverty relief available to the group's adherents through an institution(s) other than the religious group in question:

– Field doesn't know

Does the religious group in question provide institutionalized care for the elderly and infirm:

– Field doesn't know

Notes: There may be group support for widows, but this is unclear from the genuine letters.

Is institutionalized care for the elderly and infirm available to the group's adherents through an institution(s) other than the religious group in question:

– Field doesn't know

## Education

Does the religious group provide formal education to its adherents:

– Field doesn't know

Is formal education available to the group's adherents through an institution(s) other than the religious group:

– Yes



Is extra-religious education open to both males and females:

– Yes

## Bureaucracy

Do the group's adherents interact with a formal bureaucracy within their group:

– Yes

Do the group's adherents interact with other institutional bureaucracies:

– Yes

## Public Works

Does the religious group in question provide public food storage:

– Field doesn't know

Is public food storage provided to the group's adherents by an institution(s) other than the religious group in question:

– Yes

Does the religious group in question provide water management (irrigation, flood control):

– Field doesn't know

Is water management provided to the group's adherents by an institution(s) other than the

religious group in question:

– Yes

Does the religious group in question provide transportation infrastructure:

– Field doesn't know

Is transportation infrastructure provided for the group's adherents by an institution(s) other than the religious group in question:

– Yes

## Taxation

Does the religious group in question levy taxes or tithes:

– Field doesn't know

Notes: Again, it is not clear whether donations for the poor, etc are mandatory.

Are taxes levied on the group's adherents by an institution(s) other than the religious group in question:

– Yes

Notes: For recognized landholders/citizens only.

## Enforcement

Does the religious group in question provide an institutionalized police force:

– Field doesn't know

Do the group's adherents interact with an institutionalized police force provided by an institution(s) other than the religious group in question:

– Yes

Does the religious group in question provide institutionalized judges:

– Field doesn't know

Do the group's adherents interact with an institutionalized judicial system provided by an institution(s) other than the religious group in question:

– Yes



Does the religious group in question enforce institutionalized punishment:

– Field doesn't know

Are the group's adherents subject to institutionalized punishment enforced by an institution(s) other than the religious group in question:

– Yes

↳ Do the institutionalized punishments include execution:

– Yes

↳ Do the institutionalized punishments include exile:

– Yes

↳ Do the institutionalized punishments include corporal punishments:

– Yes

↳ Do the institutionalized punishments include ostracism:

– Yes

↳ Do the institutionalized punishments include seizure of property:

– Yes

Does the religious group in question have a formal legal code:

– Field doesn't know

Are the group's adherents subject to a formal legal code provided by institution(s) other than the religious group in question:

– Yes

## Warfare

Does religious group in question possess an institutionalized military:

– No

Do the group's adherents participate in an institutionalized military provided by institution(s) other than the religious group in question:

– Field doesn't know

Are the group's adherents protected by or subject to an institutionalized military provided by an institution(s) other than the religious group in question:

– Yes

### Written Language

Does the religious group in question possess its own distinct written language:

– Field doesn't know

Is a non-religion-specific written language available to the group's adherents through an institution(s) other than the religious group in question:

– Yes

Is a non-religion-specific written language used by the group's adherents through an institution(s) other than the religious group in question:

– Yes

### Calendar

Does the religious group in question possess a formal calendar:

– Field doesn't know

Is a formal calendar provided for the group's adherents by an institution(s) other than the religious group in question:

– Yes

### Food Production

Does the religious group in question provide food for themselves:

– Field doesn't know

Notes: In the broad sense (given the social organization of Mediterranean society), yes. Given that Paul is advocating for the rejection of meat/food prepared for sacrifice to the broader pantheon of Greco-Roman gods, one assumes those who are adhering to Paul's regulations are providing their own food. Whether this is formalized in some sense is difficult to answer. Certainly Eucharist meals are taking place; however, this is a narrow instance.

Is food provided to the group's adherents by an institution(s) other than the religious group in question:

– Yes

↳ Please characterize the forms/levels of food production [choose all that apply]:

– Gathering

– Hunting (including marine animals)

– Fishing

– Small-scale agriculture / horticultural gardens or orchards

– Large-scale agriculture (e.g., monocropping, organized irrigation systems)