Endangered Government Information: Strategies to Protect Government Collections

James Church, University of California, Berkeley
Susan Paterson, University of British Columbia
Amanda Wakaruk, University of Alberta
James R. Jacobs, Stanford University

June 23, 2018

Co-Sponsors:
GODORT
To the Honourable the Treasury Board:

The undersigned, in conformity with the terms of a Minute Board recommending their appointment as a departmental committee into the whole question of the state of the public records, as approved by His Excellency the Governor General in Council, 1897, have the honour to report:

That in the execution of this duty they have visited the several branches of the public records in each of the departments, and made as thorough an inspection of the records in each as circumstances would permit. This examination discloses a state of affairs which, in the absence of the undersigned, calls for prompt and vigorous measures of reform.

The objects of the inquiry falling under several heads, it may be convenient to observe a similar division in this report. It is proposed to examine the subject under the following sub-heads, which method is most likely to exhibit the whole question in the clearest manner:

1. The actual state of the records and public documents in the several departments.
2. The danger to which they are exposed from fire.
3. What papers or records might be destroyed and after their destruction would be a serious loss.
4. General recommendations of the Commissioners.

1. THE ACTUAL CONDITION OF AFFAIRS.

Throughout their inspection the Commissioners were impressed with the importance of any community of plan among the several departments for the preservation of their records. As a rule departmental papers, when years old, are convenient of access. Those of older date are not always in the most convenient places. Those that have been stored carefully are often unmanageable and undescribed, suffering more or less from damp. The presence of a uniform system is to be desired for the disposal of records, and is advocated by the Commissioners.

2. THE DANGER TO WHICH THE GOVERNMENT RECORDS ARE EXPOSED FROM FIRE.

Recent experience has shown that the undersigned with the conviction, that the danger from fire to which the public records are exposed is a serious and ever present one.

The above remarks apply to public documents generally. As regards the older papers of historic interest which form the archives of the country, the message of valuable papers bearing on the early history of Canada in the Department of Agriculture, under the control of an official known as the Dominion Archivist, but this officer, though amply qualified for the post, has never been provided with the facilities for its adequate administration, nor enjoyed anything beyond a casual and perfunctory recognition. The Department of the Secretary of State possesses a similar collection of papers under the immediate charge of the officer known as "The Keeper of Records." Two branches of the public service, although necessarily devoted to the promotion of a common object, are not in any sense of the word auxiliary to each other. On the contrary, they are distinct, and even antagonistic. The Commissioners, for instance, understand that for the purpose of bridging over breaks in the archives, copies have been made of documents in the libraries of European capitals when the originals of these very documents were at the time in the custody of one or other of the public departments. It is not too much to say that the rivalry existing between these offices has long been an obstacle to the attainment of that unity of responsibility and control essential to the introduction of a perfect system. Another collection of State papers relating to the century immediately preceding Confederation exists in the Privy Council Office, and there are many minor deposits to one of which reference may be made. In the Department of Indian Affairs the Commissioners have been shown a number of bound volumes of manuscript containing the reports of the Indian Commissioners in Albany, from 1722-23, and amongst other matters of historic interest the story, in part, of the Mohawk war, the conspiracy of Pontiac, and the migration of the Six Nation Indians. These books are quite unprotected from fire and their destruction would be a serious loss. Thus, records which united would form a collection of rare interest, are dispersed throughout the departments, where they lie in every stage of insecurity, often unarranged and undescribed, suffering more or less from damp, their value sometimes unrecognized and their very existence, it may be, unknown. Nor is this surprising when it is borne in mind that the fire of February last was not considered a matter of immediate concern.
Canada’s access to government information timeline

1897 - 1916: reports, loss due to fire, more reports, more threats due to fire

- **1897** Western Block fire (150,000 public works documents were destroyed)
- **1914** Canada. *Departmental Commission Appointed to Inquire into the State of the Records of the Public Departments* (Pope Commission). Ottawa. (recommended building a library for government records and publications)
- **1916** Fire on Parliament Hill (Library of Parliament spared due to iron doors installed at librarians’ insistence)

https://www.pinterest.ca/pin/403212972869515723/
Canada’s access to government information timeline

1927 Depository Services Program (DSP) established
- Program of an executive branch agency, subject to Treasury Board of Canada (~OMB) Policies and Procedures
- Not a publisher, compliance from publishing agencies always a problem
- Distributed government publications to libraries (including LAC post-1953)
- Stopped distributing paper in 2013 (end of depository contracts allowed libraries to dispose of their print collections)
- Collects, catalogues, and provides access to electronic government publications
- Works with CGI DPN to preserve government publications

1953 National Library of Canada established (with legal deposit authority)
- Received print government publications via the DSP (collection incomplete)
- Merged with National Archives of Canada in 2004 to create the Library and Archives of Canada (LAC), reports to Parliament through the Minister of Heritage
- Stopped accepting provincial government materials and ended most reciprocal partnership arrangements in the mid 2010s, during cutbacks in budget, staff, and services
- Web archiving activity (federal only) sporadic and selective, more collections added in last few years
Canada’s access to government information timeline

2011 Canada joined the Open Government Partnership
- Virtual Library was a goal... downgraded to a portal without preservation... upgraded to portal/repository... finally launched in 2014... holds ~278 publications in June 2018
- Open government licence: lawful uses (only a court of law can determine fair dealing); attribution required; does not apply to third party content, names, crests, logos, or other official symbols
- Publication equivalent (PDF) of web-based content still includes statement, “Crown copyright. All rights reserved. All requests for permission to reproduce this document or any part thereof shall be addressed to the Department of...”
- 2017 Canada added to OGP Steering Committee, named lead
Removed due to incompatibility with OGL (e.g., Crown copyright).
Government of Canada web content timeline

- pre 2000: range of styles, content on agency websites
- 2010: federal court case, Jodhan v. Canada (Attorney General), 2010 FC 1197 (CanLII)
- 2012-2013: “Web Renewal Action Plan” based on removing ROT (redundant, outdated, and trivial content)
- Wayback Machine (Archive.org): some gc.ca sites prior to 2012; “full” crawl in early 2013 due to advocacy efforts of GODORT IDTF (lots of dead links); first choice for journalists and other users
- How do you know what’s been lost?
  - Anecdotes
  - ATIP (FOI) documents
  - Selective comparisons using archive.org and LAC web harvests
Libraries and copyright chill

Asked permission to web archive site (2012):

Unfortunately we are not in a position to help advise you on how to resolve your technical difficulties* in archiving GoC website content.

My more immediate concern is ensuring you are provided proper guidance and information regarding Crown Copyright and Licensing and what this means when reproducing (via an archive) GoC website information on your institutions website. To this end, I've sent an email to the Crown Copyright and Licensing and Library of Canada seeking their advice and input on this matter.

*not wanting to circumvent a robot.txt file

Asked permission to web archive site (2013):

I apologize for the delay in getting back to you. Unfortunately, we decline your request to allow your user agent archive.org_bot to crawl the website. To respect the recommendation of the Office of the Privacy Commissioner of Canada that xxxx protect personal information on their websites, the xxxx implements the robots.txt protocol to prevent search engines such as Google from crawling certain areas of our website that include personal information about individuals who participate in xxxx processes and displaying these search results.

Why is restricted personal information openly available on a government web site in the first place?
Libraries and copyright chill

Asked permission to make a copy for a library collection (2015):

Usually, when a publication is not on the website anymore, it means it is no longer available to the public and the government of Canada is not allowed to give you permission even for a non-commercial purpose. Looking at the publication title, that content looks to be owned by xxxx. Here is a link that may help you in your research:

http://www.DEPARTMENT.gc.ca/home-accueil/important-eng.php

New restrictions for new formats? Were print publications ever withdrawn from depository libraries?

http://hdl.handle.net/10402/era.38740 (OA via ALA GODORT: https://wikis.ala.org/godort/images/9/9c/DttP_42n1.pdf)

www.fixcrowncopyright.ca
What is Crown copyright?

Copyright Act, s.12 (emphasis added)

Without prejudice to any rights or privileges of the Crown, where any work is, or has been, prepared or published by or under the direction or control of Her Majesty or any government department, the copyright in the work shall, subject to any agreement with the author, belong to Her Majesty and in that case shall continue for the remainder of the calendar year of the first publication of the work and for a period of fifty years following the end of that calendar year.

“Crown copyright comes from and is justified by a particular non-democratic conception of government.” -- David Vaver
Overview

- Canada & U.S. Contexts
- Government Information Access
- CGI-DPN
- Initiatives & Activities
Government Information Landscape: Similarities

- Collaborative initiatives
- Digital preservation concerns
- Focus on “Open” Government
- Commercialization of government information
- Shrinking quantity of print materials issued
- Exponential growth of e-only information
- Fugitive government information
Government Information Landscape: Differences

- Two official languages
- Federal print depository program terminated in 2014
- No legislation analogous to USC Title 44
- *Ad hoc* Government Information Network
- Declining number of government information librarians
- Copyright significantly different
Open Government

● OGL conflicts with Crown Copyright
● Open Government Portal
  ○ Open Information
  ○ Federal Science Library
  ○ Open data
  ○ https://open.canada.ca

Photo by Abele Gigante on Unsplash
## Depository Services Program

### Pre-2014
- 1927: DSP established by an OIC
- 1952: First Daily Checklist
- 1981: DSP LAC established
- 1995: DSP website created,
- 2012: Economic Action Plan (Budget)
- 2014: Print distribution ceases
- 2014: Copyright clearance devolved back to issuing agency

### Post-2014
- Reliance on e-publications
- Community of practice
- New ILS
- Statistics Canada Historical Digitization Project
- Reimagined DSP Library Advisory Committee
Library professionals deem government publications “unique,” of particular resonance, part of an important historical record, and essential to government accountability, an engaged citizenry and the nation’s capacity to learn from the past.

Publishing & Depository Services Directorate
Client Satisfaction Survey Report (2017)
Canadian Government Information Access Today

- Diminished access
  - Need for connectivity
  - Concerns over stability
  - Concerns over findability
- Increased reliance on ATI / FOI requests
- DSP Advisory Council
- Naylor Report
- How will all this government information will be preserved?
Canadian Government Information - Digital Preservation Network (CGI-DPN)

- To preserve and provide perpetual access to digital content originally published by government agencies in Canada
- Decentralized and distributed preservation (Lots of Copies Keeps Stuff Safe)
- Local custody and control of assets
- Affordable and sustainable
Possession is 9/10 of the law solution

Memory institutions have played a vital role in preserving government publications and making them accessible for long-term use. A distributed, tamper-evident preservation infrastructure is required to maintain this stewardship role in a digital environment.

Canadian Government Information - Digital Preservation Network mission
CGI-DPN Collections

- DSP E-collection
- At-risk content
- Provincial and territorial government sites
- Thematic collections (e.g. opioid crisis)
- Statistics Canada site
- Available on the CGI-DPN Archive-It site

https://archive-it.org/organizations/700

Photo by Samuel Zeller on Unsplash
Please Note: Updates to the Ministry of Finance website are currently in progress. You may experience broken links and/or missing graphics when viewing archived documents.
Initiatives & Activities

- Provincial web archiving
- Canadian Web Archiving Coalition (CWAC)
- Registry of Canadian Government Information Digitization Projects
- Advocacy (GovInfo Day)
- COPPUL Shared Print Archive Network
- Digitization grants
- National government information network discussions
- GALLOP Portal
Final thoughts...

We need to work together to pursue collaborative partnerships to safeguard past, present, and future government information for the public’s long-term access and consumption, and to promote services that encourage our users to critically evaluate and interrogate all information [...] the solutions we create today need to be adaptable for the government information landscape of the future.

Kian A. Flynn & Cassandra J. Hartnett
University of Washington Libraries
Acknowledgements

Many thanks to Carla Graebner, Government Information and Research Data Services Librarian at Simon Fraser University and the ongoing support of my CGI DPN colleagues.
Venn diagram of government information
"Issued for Gratuitous Distribution':
The History of Fugitive Documents and the FDLP"
https://freegovinfo.info/node/12735
Controversial tobacco document pulled from congressional Web site

After mounting thousands of secret tobacco industry papers on their public Web site, the House Commerce Committee removed a controversial 104-page memo after R.J. Reynolds Tobacco Company officials objected it being made public.

The memo described how RJ R's lawyers suppressed research on the health hazards of smoking over a 30-year period. The Committee held back 400 documents from the public in response to tobacco industry pleas that the papers contained trade secrets or were entitled to confidentiality because they had been prepared by outside lawyers now working for...
**Fugitives scope**

“The number of fugitive print documents has been estimated as about 50% of the universe of Federal printing, but this estimate may be conservative.”


“The Superintendent of Documents recently stated that 85% of these non-GPO publications fail to appear in the Monthly Catalog due to the fact that the issuing agencies do not provide copies of them to GPO for cataloging.”

End of Term Web Archive
US Federal Web Domain at Presidential Transitions

http://eotarchive.cdlib.org
https://govinfo.gov
https://www.hathitrust.org/usdocs_registry
https://lockss-usdocs.stanford.edu

http://climatemirror.org
https://www.datarefuge.org
https://envirodatagov.org
GOVT INFORMATION ECOSYSTEM
THE ELECTRONIC SUGGESTION BOX PROJECT IS HALF-WAY DONE.

THE ORIGINAL DESIGN CALLED FOR A BOX THAT SCANS AND DIGITIZES SUGGESTIONS WRITTEN ON PAPER AND EMAILS THEM TO THE APPROPRIATE MANAGER.

THEN THE DEVICE SHREDS THE ORIGINAL PAPER SUGGESTION TO MAKE ROOM FOR MORE.

I ALREADY BUILT THE BOX AND THE SHREDDER.

I'LL NEED ADDITIONAL FUNDING TO FINISH THE SCANNING PART.

WE DON'T HAVE ANY FLEXIBILITY IN OUR BUDGET. LET'S JUST DEPLOY WHAT YOU HAVE.

ALL I HAVE IS A BOX THAT SHREDS SUGGESTIONS BEFORE ANYONE READS THEM.

DON'T LET PERFECT BE THE ENEMY OF GOOD.
Guiding principles of government information

Information must be:

Not just *preserved*, but *discoverable*.
Not just *discoverable*, but *deliverable*.
Not just *deliverable* as bits, but *readable*.
Not just *readable*, but *understandable*.
Not just *understandable*, but *usable*.

*Open Archival Information System (OAIS) principles

HT to Ranganathan's 5 laws of library science!
Already happening:

LOCKSS (C, P)
Hathitrust (A, M)
GOVINFO (O, A)
EOT (C, P)
Memento (A)
Cobweb (C)
Perma.cc (A)
DPLA (A, M)
Science.gov (O, A)

Needs:

Public Policy Funding!
DOI/Purl Versioning
(Git/wiki)
Open standards
Open APIs
Interoperability
Provenance
Redundancy
Short-term and long-term strategies

- Librarians can use existing tools to preserve government information today.

- But we must also **lead** a movement for a long-term, comprehensive plan for the **life-cycle** of government information.

“The only kinds of fights worth fighting are those you are going to lose because somebody has to fight them and lose and lose and lose and lose until someday, somebody who believes as you do wins. In order for somebody to win an important, major fight 100 years hence, a lot of other people have got to be willing -- for the sheer fun and joy of it -- to go right ahead and fight, knowing you're going to lose. You mustn't feel like a martyr. You've got to enjoy it.”

--I.F. Stone
Thank you for attending this ALCTS program

Your feedback is important to us!

Please take a moment to complete a short online evaluation form at the URL below:

https://www.surveymonkey.com/r/JRY5BGJ