

DIFFERENTIATION AND HARMONIZATION:
THE COMPILATION OF THE FIRST ILLUSTRATED GAZETTEER OF
THE “NEW TERRITORY” OF THE QING EMPIRE (1644–1912)

by

TIANPEI CHEN

B.A (hons.), Hong Kong Baptist University, 2017

A THESIS SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF
THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF

MASTER OF ARTS

in

THE FACULTY OF GRADUATE AND POSTDOCTORAL STUDIES

(History)

THE UNIVERSITY OF BRITISH COLUMBIA

(Vancouver)

June 2019

© Tianpei Chen, 2019

The following individuals certify that they have read, and recommend to the Faculty of Graduate and Postdoctoral Studies for acceptance, a thesis/dissertation entitled:

Differentiation and Harmonization: The Compilation of the First Illustrated Gazetteer of the
“New Territory” of the Qing Empire (1644–1912)

submitted _____ in partial fulfillment of the requirements
by Tianpei Chen for

the degree
of Master of Arts

in History

Examining Committee:

Prof. Leo Shin
Supervisor

Prof. Timothy Brook
Supervisory Committee Member

Supervisory Committee Member

Prof. Bruce Rusk
Additional Examiner

Additional Supervisory Committee Members:

Supervisory Committee Member

Supervisory Committee Member

Abstract

A group of Qing court officials was ordered to compile a local gazetteer of the Western Regions, a vast stretch of land in present-day northwest China that was incorporated into the Qing empire (1644–1912) in 1759, and which in time became known as Xinjiang, or “New Territory.” The result of their efforts was the *Qinding Huangyu Xiyu tuzhi* (Imperially Commissioned Illustrated Gazetteer of the Western Regions of the Imperial Domain), or *Xiyu tuzhi* for short. This thesis examines the compilation of this first Qing government-sponsored gazetteer of Xinjiang and the cultural ideology that influenced the Qing-dynasty rule of the Western Regions in general. By studying the way in which the *Xiyu tuzhi* was compiled by the Qing empire, I argue that the compilers employed the Confucian rhetoric of music untraditionally to assert their agenda: incorporating the borderland through both differentiation and harmonization to legitimize Qing’s rule of the region. They differentiated local peoples and cultures to maintain diversities and harmonized the diversities of local characteristics in the Western Regions and made it universally accessible as part of the empire’s imperial knowledge. A better understanding of the functions that the knowledge of music in the *Xiyu tuzhi* served would be the starting point to lead us to a broader picture of the Qing’s expansion and how the Qing maintained the diverse local characteristics of the Western Regions instead of creating uniformity across the empire.

Lay Summary

In the mid-eighteenth century, the Qing empire (1644–1912), the last imperial dynasty of China, conquered and incorporated the Western Regions (which in time became known as Xinjiang) into the empire. In order to understand how the Qing empire incorporated this borderland through knowledge production, this thesis examines the compilation of the first Qing government-sponsored gazetteer of Xinjiang: the Qinding Huangyu Xiyu tuzhi (Imperially Commissioned Illustrated Gazetteer of the Western Regions of the Imperial Domain), or Xiyu tuzhi for short. The Xiyu tuzhi includes the history and geography of the Western Regions. By studying the way that the Xiyu tuzhi was compiled, I argue that the Qing compilers employed the Confucian rhetoric of music untraditionally comparing to the preceding Chinese regimes to assert their agenda: incorporating this borderland through both differentiation and harmonization to legitimize Qing's rule of this newly conquered region.

Preface

This dissertation is original, unpublished, independent work by the author, Tianpei Chen.

Table of Contents

<i>Abstract</i>	<i>iii</i>
<i>Lay Summary</i>	<i>iv</i>
<i>Preface</i>	<i>v</i>
<i>Table of Contents</i>	<i>vi</i>
<i>List of Tables</i>	<i>vii</i>
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	<i>viii</i>
<i>Introduction</i>	<i>1</i>
<i>The Editorial History of the Xiyu tuzhi</i>	<i>11</i>
<i>The Perfect Time or Not? The Qianlong Emperor and the Compilers</i>	<i>17</i>
<i>Legitimacy and Unification: Music in the Western Regions</i>	<i>30</i>
<i>Conclusion</i>	<i>46</i>
<i>Bibliography</i>	<i>49</i>
<i>Appendix 1</i> :.....	<i>57</i>
<i>Appendix 2</i> :.....	<i>60</i>

List of Tables

<i>Table 1: Versions of the Xiyu tuzhi.....</i>	<i>13</i>
<i>Table 2: Comparison of the Siku and the Bianyi shuju metal plate versions of the Xiyu tuzhi</i>	<i>14</i>
<i>Table 3: Comparison of the Section of Sixteen Rules of the Compilation from the Siku Version and the Bianyi shuju Metal Plate Version.....</i>	<i>15</i>
<i>Table 4: Subject Matter Categories Shared by the Xiyu Tuzhi with Other Qing Gazetteers.....</i>	<i>26</i>
<i>Table 5: Descriptions of Instruments of the Western Regions in Three Texts</i>	<i>43</i>

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank my supervisor, Prof. Leo Shin, for his guidance and patience through each stage of the process. My research would have been impossible without his suggestions and support in the past two years. I would also like to thank my second reader, Prof. Timothy Brook, whose wisdom and encouragement have motivated me and helped me in narrowing down what I am actually pursuing. My sincere thanks go to Prof. Bruce Rusk for reading my thesis as the external examiner and in helping with translations of primary sources.

I will be forever thankful to Dr. Loretta Kim. From the very beginning of my undergraduate career in Hong Kong to the final revision of my thesis, she has always been assisting me along every step. A special thanks goes to Prof. Michel Durchame for his witty and invaluable constructive criticism, and in helping me with the last round of revisions. I would like to thank Prof. Matthew Mosca and Prof. David Brophy for their generous support and advice for the related research and primary sources. I would also like to thank faculty members of UBC History Department and administration staff. I won't be able to make it without your generous help and support.

I want to offer my sincere thanks to my cohort for their invaluable suggestions and comments on my preliminary draft in the research writing seminar and support in the past two years. I would like to thank Ryan Cheuk Him Sun, as *Tongmen* and good friend, for being supportive and for helping me with proofreading my thesis and everything throughout two-year graduate school life. I am also grateful to the numerous friends I have gained during my Master's journey, all of whom I have laughed with and was supported by in the toughest of times: Jihyun Shin, Michael Buse, Archa Neelakandan Giriya, Guldana Salimjan, Niping Yan, Yuqing Liu,

Justin Chun-Yin Cheng, Zoeyn Cho, Sarah Basham, Daniel Carkner, and Nathan Lucky. Thank you all!

I am profoundly grateful to Kelvin Chan, my academic partner and my best friend, who always supported me and reminded me of my passion for history, since our second year in Hong Kong Baptist University to the last week of editing my thesis. Thank you for accompanying me all the way through.

At last, I would like to thank my parents, who supported me and made it possible for me to be here in Vancouver from all the way back to Urumqi. Thank you.

If you were to compile a gazetteer of the entire world, not considering how institutions and boundaries have changed throughout the ages, one would have no way to trace back multiple traditions. As for compiling a gazetteer of the Western Regions, the main reasons you will be unable to thoroughly check changes over the ages will be because of the territorial limits of previous empires and the barrier of language.

志廣輿者，不稽之歷代建置沿革，將無從數典，而志西域則有不能盡稽之歷代者，實以幅員所限，言語不通。

The Qianlong emperor (r.1736–1795), the preface to the *Qinding Huangyu Xiyu tuzhi* 欽定皇輿西域圖志 (Imperially Commissioned Illustrated Gazetteer of the Western Regions of the Imperial Domain)

Introduction

Imagine being an editor designated to compile a book on the history and geography of a particular foreign land. Where would you start? You might, of course, start by locating books that have been written about this foreign region. But what if such sources are rare and that, even if they are available, the information therein is mostly based on hearsay? Local residents might have used various languages over time, too. If so, that area might have several different names transcribed from various languages, making it more difficult to know how to locate relevant sources. If it already seems like a daunting task to compile such a book today, imagine what it might be like for those who were given such an assignment in the early modern period.

Yet this was precisely the task handed to a group of officials in eighteenth-century China. During the reign of the Qianlong emperor (r.1736–1795), a group of court officials was ordered to compile a local gazetteer of the Western Regions, a vast stretch of land in present-day northwest China that was incorporated into the Qing empire (1644–1912) in 1759, and which in

time became known as Xinjiang, or “New Territory.”¹ The result of their efforts was the *Qinding Huangyu Xiyu tuzhi* 欽定皇輿西域圖志 (Imperially Commissioned Illustrated Gazetteer of the Western Regions of the Imperial Domain), or *Xiyu tuzhi* for short.² The *Xiyu tuzhi*, completed in 1782, was the first Qing government-sponsored gazetteer of the Western Regions. Of the fifty-two *juan* (fascicle) that comprise the *Xiyu tuzhi*, four are devoted to the prose and poems of the Qianlong emperor. The other forty-eight *juan* are concerned with the geography and history of Xinjiang. These *juan* include information about Muslims living in the Western Regions and about Zunghars, who were a confederation of the Mongol groups living in the region before the Qing conquest.³

However, unlike administrative units in the interior of China, where there had been a centuries-long tradition of compiling gazetteers, there were no cumulative historical records on the Western Regions for the compilers to follow.⁴ Local residents in the Western Regions also used languages other than Chinese, which made locating related historical sources difficult. The challenge faced by the compilers was how to compile a gazetteer for this newly conquered area without having adequate and accessible sources about the region. More broadly, the challenge of compiling the *Xiyu tuzhi* also reflected fundamental problems faced by the Qing empire: how to

¹ For the three terms “Western Regions,” “New Territory,” and “Xinjiang,” I use them interchangeably in this thesis but with purposeful consideration of the context of each citation. Of course, these terms are all Qing ones because native people had their own concepts of reference: They did not think of the territory as “new” nor that they were “western,” which was a clear “Beijing-oriented” or “China-interior-oriented” perspective.

² Fu Heng et al., comps., *Qinding Huangyu Xiyu tuzhi* 欽定皇輿西域圖志 [Imperially Commissioned Illustrated Gazetteer of the Western Regions of the Imperial Domain], *Siku quanshu* version, 1782.

³ In the original text, the compilers used *Zhunbu* 準部 (Zunghar tribes) and *Huibu* 回部 (Muslim tribes or Hui tribes). Here, I deliberately refer to “Muslims” in general but that I acknowledge the significant differences among Muslim populations in the region at that time. Enoki Kazuo 榎一雄, “Researches in Chinese Turkestan during the Ch’ien-lung Period, with Special Reference to the Hsi-yü-t’ung-wên-chih,” in *Studia Asiatica: The Collected Papers in Western Languages of the Late Dr. Kazuo Enoki* (Tokyo: Kyuko-shoin, 1998), 444; James A. Millward, *Beyond the Pass: Economy, Ethnicity, and Empire in Qing Central Asia, 1759–1864* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1998), 27.

⁴ Matthew W. Mosca, “Cišii’s Description of Xinjiang: Its Context and Circulation,” in *Xinjiang in the Context of Central Eurasian Transformations*, ed. Shinmen Yasushi, Onuma Takahiro, and David Brophy (Tokyo: Tōyō Bunko, 2018), 196.

incorporate a newly conquered region into the empire and how to legitimize imperial authority over borderlands, which had been a challenge that the Qing empire faced since the mid seventeenth-century.

In 1644, the Qing regime led by a Manchu ruling elite conquered north China and supplanted the Ming dynasty (1368–1644) as the central power of China. During the period from 1644 to 1683, the Manchu rulers were busy with suppressing the Ming loyalists and revolts, including the Three Feudatories Revolt in the southern and southeastern area of interior China. Rebellious peasants and the Ming loyalists in Taiwan were crushed by the Kangxi emperor (r.1654–1722), and Taiwan was incorporated into the Qing empire. Finally, the Qing empire turned to its biggest threat to its power, the Western Regions in the northwest reaches of the empire. This area, incorporating present-day Xinjiang, parts of Inner and Outer Mongolia, plus Qinghai, Tibet, and Kazakhstan, was under the rule of the Western Mongolian chieftain of the Zunghar state, Galdan (r.1671–1697).⁵ The Zunghars had been the enemy of the Qing since the late seventeenth century. Though the Qing and the Zunghar signed a peace treaty in 1739, the Zunghar invasions had always threatened the security of the Qing frontiers.⁶ After several expeditions led by the Kangxi emperor and the Yongzheng emperor (r.1723–1735), the Qing empire finally conquered the Zunghar state through a series of military campaigns from 1755 to 1759, during the reign of the Qianlong emperor. The Qing empire thereafter controlled the Western Regions until it was supplanted by the Republican government in 1912.⁷

⁵ Peter C. Perdue, “Military Mobilization in Seventeenth and Eighteenth-Century China, Russia, and Mongolia,” *Modern Asian Studies* 30, no. 4 (1996): 758–59.

⁶ Benjamin Levey, “Jungar Refugees and the Making of Empire on Qing China’s Kazakh Frontier, 1759–1773,” (PhD diss., Harvard University, 2014), 1.

⁷ Perdue, “Military Mobilization,” 758–59.

After conquering the Western Regions, the Qing empire needed to consider how to incorporate the region into the empire. In the words of Peter Perdue, “the boundaries had to be constructed in the process of conquest and constantly justified.”⁸ From a practical perspective, the Qing imperial incorporation involved controlling the local succession of power, lands and taxation, establishing local administration, mobilizing labor for land settlements, and developing the communication and transportation infrastructure to allow local administrators to work efficiently and effectively. Collectively, these efforts were designed to make it difficult for the region to break away from the empire.⁹

Nevertheless, because Qing control could not be sustained on the basis of wealth and power alone, some historians have discussed how the Qing empire employed cultural ideologies to accomplish imperial control on borderlands. For example, Qing imperial rule and authority in the borderlands was justified by what Peter Perdue defines as the Qing “imperial project”: “the structure of symbols, texts, inscriptions, and pronouncements [that] defined behavior and thought for the imperial elite, its officials, and at least some of its subjects... [to] establish control over multiple peoples, incorporating the non-Han peoples as subordinate Others.”¹⁰

Although the notion of “imperial project” has been mostly employed to analyze the rhetoric and ideology of European imperialism, the concept also provides a feasible way to analyze how the *Xiyu tuzhi* contributes to the Qing incorporation of the Western Regions, situating the Qing expansion in a global context. These historians, such as James Millward, have points out resemblances shared between the Qing empire and other European colonial empires in

⁸ Peter C. Perdue, *China Marches West: The Qing Conquest of Central Eurasia* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2005), 336.

⁹ Ibid., 137 and 335.

¹⁰ Ibid., 517.

the deployment of imperial rhetoric and ideology.¹¹ Kwangmin Kim's work on the alliance between the Qing empire and local Uighur *begs* in Xinjiang situates the Qing empire within the context of the rise of capitalism and global trade in the eighteenth century, demonstrating "the simultaneous (even coeval) paths to imperialism and capitalism in the colonies and borderlands taken by the European and Chinese empires."¹²

However, unlike the "civilizing mission" implemented in colonies by European colonial empires, Qing officials were not trying to assimilate the borderland peoples by Confucian imperatives, nor were they trying to establish a uniform hierarchy across the empire. Instead, Joanna Waley-Cohen's research on the banishment system in Xinjiang has shown the Qing empire's ambiguous attitude to Xinjiang: proclaiming Xinjiang as the empire's territory while making a clear distinction between Xinjiang and the interior of China.¹³ Similarly, Perdue argues that "difference was inherent in the imperial project"¹⁴ because the Manchus ruled a Han-dominated empire, and the Qing rulers were cautious about eliminating differences between peoples in order to maintain their Manchu identity. Therefore, the Qing constantly constructed the differences and uniformity among its subjects, especially on the frontiers.¹⁵ I propose to further develop Perdue's arguments by focusing on the Qing imperial project in the Western Regions. But I choose to use "differentiation and harmonization" to describe this incorporation of the borderland into the empire, because I would like to emphasize the process of constructing

¹¹ James A. Millward, *Eurasian Crossroads: A History of Xinjiang* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2007), 105–06. Also see Laura Hostetler, *Qing Colonial Enterprise: Ethnography and Cartography in Early Modern China* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2001); Joanna Waley-Cohen, *Exile in Mid-Qing China: Banishment to Xinjiang, 1758–1820* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1991).

¹² Kwangmin Kim, *Borderland Capitalism: Turkestan Produce, Qing Silver, and the Birth of an Eastern Market* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2016), 1–3.

¹³ Joanna Waley-Cohen, *Exile in Mid-Qing China: Banishment to Xinjiang, 1758–1820* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1991), 218.

¹⁴ Perdue, *China Marches West*, 338.

¹⁵ *Ibid.*

differences and uniformity, and shed light on the more dynamic and fluid aspect of the Qing imperial project.

Situating the compilation of the *Xiyu tuzhi* in history of the Qing expansion helps to better understand this gazetteer's significance and the Qing cultural ideology of ruling Xinjiang. The *Xiyu tuzhi* was the only local gazetteer commissioned and compiled by *the central government* (as opposed to local officials) during the Qing dynasty. This reveals that the establishment and propagation of Qing imperial authority in Xinjiang was not merely an administrative and economic stratagem but rather that the Qing empire was aiming to remold the cultural and social dimensions of Xinjiang through knowledge production so that it could become a legitimate part of the empire. The Qing government compiled a great number of documents to collect information and knowledge about the region after the conquest and the *Xiyu tuzhi* was one of them.¹⁶ The *Xiyu tuzhi* was a cultural product designed to influence subsequent images of Xinjiang as a social space.¹⁷ Peter Perdue points out that these documents served to legitimize the empire's rule of the borderland in both temporal and spatial terms.¹⁸

Despite the significance of music concerning governance in Chinese society, existing scholarship does not examine why and how the Qing compilers of the first gazetteer of Xinjiang compiled the *juan* dealing with music – an uncommon subject category in local gazetteers. The editors of the critical abstract of the *Xiyu tuzhi* in the *Siku quanshu* 四庫全書 (Complete Library

¹⁶ Millward, *Eurasian Crossroads*, 106.

¹⁷ James A. Millward, “‘Coming onto the Map’: ‘Western Regions’ Geography and Cartographic Nomenclature in the Making of Chinese Empire in Xinjiang,” *Late Imperial China* 20, no. 2 (Dec 1999): 61–98.

¹⁸ For example, the *Xiyu tuzhi* includes not only the maps of the Western Regions produced in the previous dynasties, such as the Han and the Tang periods, but also new maps of both the Qing empire and of the Western Regions. Several scholars have examined how the state-commissioned surveyors produced maps of the empire to fulfill the Qing's own political interests. Mapmakers presented more exact measurements of the empire as well as more erasures and silences across the empire. Perdue, *China Marches West*, 410, and 446–47

of the Four Treasuries) describes the *juan* dealing with music as “a formal innovation 創體.”¹⁹

The *juan* on music describes local Muslim and Zunghar peoples’ instruments, musical scores, and rituals of musical performances. In Chinese civilizational world, music was utilized as a medium through Confucian rituals to make and maintain authority over their own subjects while alienating others.²⁰ Erica Brindley has explored how music worked as “a pattern expression of and means to state order, which includes viewing music as a civilizing force in state and society” in early China.²¹ Other scholars, such as Bell Yung, Evelyn S. Rawski, and Rubie S. Watson, have also discussed how music, as one of the primary elements of rituals, “empower an officiant, legitimate an officeholder, create a heightened state of awareness, convey a message, or produce a magical outcome, a transformation, a transition” in sinological context.²²

Thus, taking a close examination of the *juan* on music would see as crucial the ways in which the *Xiyu tuzhi* was compiled, and what functions it served. My departure point is the observation that geography plays a prominent role in the body of scholarship known as New Qing History,²³ but I do not think the current scholarship put enough emphasis on diversity of

¹⁹ The original texts: “次風俗、音樂各一卷，服物二卷，土產一卷，皆如地志之例，惟音樂一門為創體，以其隸在協律，備禁佚兜離之數故也。” The corresponding translation is as follows: “Next are customs and music in one *juan* each, clothing in two *juan*, and local products in one *juan*. This all follows the conventions of local gazetteers, except that the category of music is a formal innovation; this was done because the performers are within the offices of music and in order to fully enumerate the many instruments used by the various groups.” Here, “禁佚兜離” comes originally from Ban Gu’s 班固 *Dongdu fu* 東都賦: “爾乃食舉雍徹，太師奏樂。陳金石，布絲竹。鐘鼓鏗鉤，管絃燁煜。抗五聲，極六律。歌九功，舞八佾。韶武備，泰古畢。四夷間奏，德廣所及。禁佚兜離，罔不具集。萬樂備，百禮暨。” Because “四夷間奏” parallels with “禁佚兜離,” in this context, “禁佚兜離” therefore refers to *Yi* 夷 music or something different from *Hua* 華 music. In the Qing context, however, the meaning of “四夷” or “禁佚兜離” was unclear. Therefore, I translate it as “the various groups.” Fu Heng et al., *Qinding Huangyu Xiyu tuzhi*, *Siku quanshu* version, *juan shou*, 9a–9b.

²⁰ Erica Brindley, *Music, Cosmology, and the Politics of Harmony in Early China* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 2012), ix and xi; Bell Yung et al., ed., *Harmony and Counterpoint: Ritual Music in Chinese Context* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1996), 5.

²¹ Brindley, *Music, Cosmology, and the Politics of Harmony in Early China*, ix and xi.

²² Bell Yung et al ed., *Harmony and Counterpoint*, 1.

²³ Especially in the last thirty years, historians have become increasingly aware that paying attention to the study of the Qing borderlands is, as Mark Elliot argues, “essential to any account of China during the last three and a half centuries.” This is because the Qing imperial expansion had two principal, long-lasting effects. First, it set the geographical boundaries of both the Qing empire and much of present-day China. Second, it brought diverse socio-

material culture, or even intangible forms of culture like music. Although I concentrate on a Chinese-language source in this thesis, I use a critical rather than expository lens to read this Chinese source differently than existing scholarship. I examine the *juan* on music to break down the ways in which the Qing compilers applied the Confucian rhetoric of music, differently from preceding Chinese regimes, to legitimize Qing's rule. This allows us to see how the Qing rulers redefined the traditional meanings of *Hua* (Chinese) and *Yi* (foreigners) to rule the Qing empire.

In this thesis, I have chosen to focus on the cultural ideology that influenced the Qing-dynasty rule of the Western Regions in general and the compilation of the *Xiyu tuzhi* in particular. By examining the problems the compilers faced, this thesis aims to reveal the broader contradictions and tensions within the Qing empire's incorporation of the Western Regions to answer the questions: Why was the *Xiyu tuzhi* compiled? In particular, what could be the section on the local music of the Western Regions tell us about the broader objectives of this text?

I posit that the *Xiyu tuzhi* was compiled to comply with two main imperial imperatives. First, by showing strong imperial presence and control of the region based on the detailed records of maps, the administration of military agricultural colonies affairs, and tributes and tax in Xinjiang, the *Xiyu tuzhi* demonstrates the Qing imperial incorporation of the Western Regions. Second, the *Xiyu tuzhi* aimed to build and reinforce Qing legitimacy in the Western Regions.

Based on the analysis of the gazetteer's *juan* of music in particular, I argue that the compilers employed the Confucian rhetoric of music to help legitimize the Qing imperial incorporation of the Western Regions in the *Xiyu tuzhi*. One of the key strategies in the Qing

cultural groups of people into the empire, creating a multi-ethnic diversity that persists in China today. The body of scholarship known as New Qing History has tried to reconstruct Qing history based on non-Han centered sources and methodologies. This presents us with a new and insightful from which to scrutinize the Qing: The center of the Qing empire was no longer China's central plain or the interior of China where Han people inhabited; in its place, the center extended to the Qing empire's borderlands of Inner Asia. Joanna Waley-Cohen, "The New Qing History," *Radical History Review* 88 (winter 2004): 195.

expansion is incorporating the borderland through both differentiation and harmonization. The compilers differentiated local peoples and cultures to maintain diversities, and harmonized the diversities of local characteristics in the Western Regions and made it universally accessible as part of the empire's imperial knowledge. Here, I use "harmonize" to describe how the Qing maintained a diversity of people in the empire and ensured that one group did not dominate the others, rather than impose uniformity.²⁴ At the same time, harmony is a central concept to music.²⁵

To investigate the compilation of the *Xiyu tuzhi* and the implications of this process for Qing empire building, I closely read and analyze both the text and the context of compilation of the *Xiyu tuzhi*. Examining both the text and the context will provide us with a broader picture to understand two aspects of the *Xiyu tuzhi*: how the Qing compilers managed to carry out their task without precedents or adequate sources and how the Qing empire incorporated the new borderland into the empire. Regarding the text, I do a close reading and analysis of the *Xiyu tuzhi*, especially the preface written by the Qianlong emperor and the *juan* on music, to show the way that the information was collected and organized.

To construct the context of the compilation of the *Xiyu tuzhi*, I examine several primary sources including *Da Qing Gaozong Chunhuangdi shilu* 大清高宗純皇帝實錄 (Completed

²⁴ Regarding the conception of "harmony," I was inspired by Erica Brindley's work, *Music, Cosmology, and the Politics of Harmony in Early China*. Here is her definition of "harmony:" "If harmony refers not merely to the conformity of similar items but to an appealing admixture of many diverse ones – as it defined in the *Zuo zhuan*, the *locus classicus* for defining the term "harmony" in ancient China." See Brindley, *Music, Cosmology, and the Politics of Harmony in Early China*, ix; I was also inspired by the definition of "harmony" in the *Zuo Zhuan* 左傳 as follows: "和如羹焉。水火醯醢鹽梅，以烹魚肉，燂之以薪；宰夫和之，齊之以味，濟其不及，以洩其過。" The corresponding translation is as follows: "To create harmony is just like making a stew. [You need] fire and water, fermented sauces, salt and plums, with which you boil your meat and fish. When you heat up [your ingredients] with firewood, the cook harmonizes them, equalizing each of the flavours, so that one does not dominate the others." Olivia Milburn, *The Spring and Autumn Annals of Master Yan* (Boston: Brill, 2016), 432–33.

²⁵ Brindley, *Music, Cosmology, and the Politics of Harmony in Early China*, ix and xi; Bell Yung et al ed., *Harmony and Counterpoint*, 5.

Records of Emperor Qianlong), *Da Qing Shizong Xianhuangdi shilu* 大清世宗憲皇帝實錄 (Completed Records of Emperor Yongzheng), *Gongzhong gechu dang'an* 宮中各處檔案 (Archives from the Various Palace Depositories), *Qianlong chao hanwen zhupi zouzhe* 乾隆朝漢文硃批奏折 (Palace Memorials in Chinese from the Qianlong Reign), and *Qianlongchao shangyudang* 乾隆朝上諭檔 (Edicts of the Qianlong Period) to construct the context of the compilation of the *Xiyu tuzhi*. These primary sources, including memorials and edicts between the Qianlong emperor and the compilers, allow reconstruction of the *Xiyu tuzhi* compilation process from the very beginning. The memorials and edicts about the compilation provide supplementary evidence for the background and details on the compilation of the text that are not contained in the text of the *Xiyu tuzhi*. The above sources providing the most direct evidence are inherently limited because relatively few memorials between the Qianlong emperor and the compilers are extant, but I incorporated as much substantial content with indirect references as possible into my study. My objective is ultimately not to identify a consistent logic or a single imperial ideology within the *Xiyu tuzhi*, but to reveal the possible reasons for the compilation, with all of their conflicts and claims.

Before diving into the fascicle dealing with music, I will describe the editorial history of the *Xiyu tuzhi* and then discuss the elements of this text that reflect the Qing center's visions of legitimacy and harmonization of the Western Regions.

The Editorial History of the *Xiyu tuzhi*

In 1756, the Qianlong emperor commissioned the compilation of the *Xiyu tuzhi*. The first draft was submitted to the Qianlong emperor for review and comment in 1762. Only in 1782, however, was the final draft sent to *Wuying dian* 武英殿 (Hall of Martial Valour) to be printed from woodblocks and was also hand-copied into the *Siku quanshu* 四庫全書 (Complete Library of the Four Treasuries) that year.

It took twenty years to complete the revision of the *Xiyu tuzhi* because of the start of compiling the *Xiyu tongwenzhi* 西域同文志 (Unified Language Gazetteer of the Western Regions) in 1762 according to Enoki Kazuo 榎一雄.²⁶ The *Xiyu tongwenzhi* is a six-language glossary of transliterations of place names in the Western Regions, which aimed to standardize Manchu and Chinese transcriptions of Zunghar, Uighur, Mongolian, and Tibetan names.²⁷ The *Xiyu tongwenzhi* also served as the dictionary used to inform a series of commissioned works, including the *Pingding zhunga'er fanglüe* 平定準噶爾方略 (Imperially Commissioned Military History of the Pacification of the Zunghars) and a series of atlases of Xinjiang.²⁸ Accordingly, the *Xiyu tuzhi* was also amended to reflect the content of the *Xiyu tongwenzhi* being developed, starting in 1764.

At last, both the *Xiyu tuzhi* and the *Xiyu tongwenzhi* were finalized for printing at *Wuying dian* and were incorporated into the *Siku quanshu* in 1782.²⁹ At this point, three versions of the *Xiyu tuzhi* were in existence: the first draft of 1762, the final draft of 1782 (the *Wuying dian* woodblock version), and the *Siku quanshu* manuscript version (referred to below as the *Siku*

²⁶ Enoki, “Researches in Chinese Turkestan,” 455.

²⁷ Millward, ““Coming onto the Map’,” 74–75.

²⁸ Ibid.

²⁹ Enoki, “Researches in Chinese Turkestan,” 466–67.

version). All of three versions were stored in the Forbidden City. The first draft of the *Xiyu tuzhi* is mentioned only in the preface of the *Xiyu tuzhi*,³⁰ and it seems that there is no extant copy of the final draft today. The *Wuying dian* version is listed in the catalog of the Palace Museum in Beijing and is not easily accessible.

About a century after the compilation of the *Siku quanshu*, *Hangzhou Bianyi shuju* 杭州便宜書局 (*Bianyi* Publishing House of Hangzhou) published two more versions of the *Xiyu tuzhi* during the Guangxu emperor's reign (1875–1908). One was printed with metal plates, the other with lithographic plates. Metal plates allowed for the creation of a large number of copies, which were urgently needed to serve as an administrative guide for local officials once the Qing dynasty changed Xinjiang from being a military administrative region to a province in 1884.³¹ As mentioned before, the *Wuying dian* version and the *Siku* version were almost impossible out of the Forbidden City to circulate. Thus, the *Hangzhou Bianyi shuju* metal plate version (hereafter known as the *Bianyi shuju* metal plate version) therefore became the most widely circulated version. But as yet there is no information about what the original the *Bianyi shuju* metal plate version was based on.

Unsurprisingly, the *Bianyi shuju* metal plate version is the most widely circulated version reproduced from the twentieth century onward. *Xiyu tuzhi jiaozhu* 西域圖志校注 (A Critical Version of *Xiyu tuzhi*),³² a work of modern scholarship, bases its critiques and annotations on the lithographic plate version printed by *Hangzhou Bianyi shuju* in 1893 and the *Wenhai* 1970

³⁰ Fu Heng et al., *Qinding Huangyu Xiyu tuzhi*, *Siku quanshu* version, *juan shou*, 7b.

³¹ Fu Heng et al., comps., *Qinding Huangyu Xiyu tuzhi* 欽定皇輿西域圖志 [Imperially Commissioned Illustrated Gazetteer of the Western Regions of the Imperial Domain], *Hangzhou Bianyi shuju* 杭州便宜書局 version, metal plate, the 1890s, reprinted with preface and notes by Wu Fengpei (Tianjin: Tianjin guji chubanshe, 1986), 3b.

³² Zhong Xinglin, Wang Hao, and Han Hui ed. *Xiyu tuzhi jiaozhu* 西域圖志校注 [A Critical Version of *Xiyu tuzhi*]. Wulumuqi: Xinjiang renmin chubanshe, 2002.

version.³³ After comparing several extant modern versions, it can be deduced that the *Wenhai* 1970 version, the *Wenyou* 1965 version³⁴ (which is copied from a rare book collected in the National Central Library in Taipei), the *Tianjin guji* version,³⁵ and the version owned by the Harvard-Yenching Library, are all copies of the *Bianyi shuju* metal plate version.³⁶ Table 1 shows different versions chronologically, with publication information.

Table 1: Versions of the *Xiyu tuzhi*

Date	Version	Format	Provenance
1762 乾隆二十七年	The first draft	Manuscript	Indicated by the compilers in the <i>Xiyu tuzhi</i>
1782 乾隆四十七年	The <i>Wuying dian</i> version	Woodblock	Indicated by the compilers the <i>Xiyu tuzhi</i>
1782 乾隆四十七年	The <i>Siku</i> version	Manuscript	The <i>Siku quanshu</i>
The 1890s 清光緒	<i>Hangzhou Bianyi shuju</i> version	Metal plate	<i>Wenhai</i> 1970 version <i>Wenyou</i> 1965 version copied from a rare book collected in the National Central Library in Taipei <i>Tianjin guji</i> version 1986 Harvard-Yenching version One of the basic versions used by <i>A Critical Version of Xiyu tuzhi</i>
1893 光緒十九年	<i>Hangzhou Bianyi shuju</i> version	Lithographic plate	One of the basic versions used by <i>A Critical Version of Xiyu tuzhi</i>

³³ Fu Heng et al., *Qinding Huangyu Xiyu tuzhi, Hangzhou Bianyi shuju* 杭州便宜書局 version, metal plate, the 1890s. Reprint, Taibei: Wenhai chubanshe, 1970.

³⁴ Fu Heng et al., *Qinding Huangyu Xiyu tuzhi, Hangzhou Bianyi shuju* 杭州便宜書局 version, metal plate, the 1890s. Reprint, Taibei: Wenyou chubanshe, 1965.

³⁵ Fu Heng et al., *Qinding Huangyu Xiyu tuzhi, Hangzhou Bianyi shuju* 杭州便宜書局 version, metal plate, the 1890s. Reprinted with preface and notes by Wu Fengpei, Tianjing: Tianjin guji chubanshe, 1986.

³⁶ Fu Heng et al., *Qinding Huangyu Xiyu tuzhi, Hangzhou Bianyi shuju* 杭州便宜書局 version, metal plate, the 1890s, reprinted with preface and notes by Wu Fengpei (Tianjing: Tianjin guji chubanshe, 1986), 3b–4a.

Comparing various extant and accessible versions allows us to identify two major versions: the *Siku* version of 1782 and the *Bianyi shuju* metal plate version of the 1890s. These two major versions have some differences in the *juan shou* 卷首 (prefatory fascicle). Table 2 shows the basic sections that two versions include in the *juan shou* of the *Xiyu tuzhi* in sequence:

Table 2: Comparison of the *Siku* and the *Bianyi shuju* metal plate versions of the *Xiyu tuzhi*

The <i>Siku</i> version (1782)	The <i>Bianyi shuju</i> metal plate version (1890s)
The Preface by the Qianlong emperor for the <i>Xiyu tuzhi</i> 御製皇輿西域圖志序	The Preface by the Qianlong emperor for the <i>Xiyu tuzhi</i> 御製皇輿西域圖志序
Imperial Decree 諭旨	Imperial Decree 諭旨
Imperially Authored Description of Kazakh Horses 《御製大宛馬識語》	
Sixteen Rules of the Compilation 凡例十六則	Sixteen Rules of the Compilation 凡例十六則
	List of the Titles for Compilers 開列諸臣名銜
General Table of Contents 總目	General Table of Contents 總目
Critical Abstract from the Complete Library of the Four Treasuries 欽定四庫全書提要	
The Catalogue of the Qianlong emperor's Poems and Prose 天章總目	

If we consider the *Siku* version as the original version, Table 2 indicates that the *Bianyi shuju* metal plate version lacks three sections: Imperially Authored Description of Kazakh Horses,³⁷

³⁷ Imperially Authored Description of Kazakh Horses is a prose written by the Qianlong emperor. It records the story of Kazakh tribes that sent Kazakh horses to the Qing as the tributes after the Qing's pacification of the Zunghar. The Qianlong emperor discusses the historical names and changes of Kazakh and the Kazakh horses. Here is the original text: “《御製大宛馬識語》：歲乙亥，準噶爾平。越明年，左右部哈薩克，以次內附。又明年，使臣入覲隨獵，有詩紀事，並加按定哈薩克為漢之康居。又越二年，哈薩克來貢馬，因成是歌，仍謂之大宛者，以自古相傳大宛產善馬也。夫西域諸國，何地不產馬，而大宛獨擅其名。漢時人足未履其地，僅聞其名，阻閼習昧，遂以為大宛所獨耳。不寧惟是，即我朝西極未定之前，準噶爾所貢馬率謂之大宛，向按大宛部落疆盛，附庸者多，哈薩克當是其部中之一國，非臆說也。史記載康居南羈事月氏，東羈事匈奴，則康居固他人之屬國耳。張騫使月氏為匈奴所閉，及亡抵大宛。而大宛遂能為發導驛抵康居，是康居本聽大宛役屬也。唐書載石國故康居小王窳匿城地，漢書所謂康居小五王之一。而唐顯慶中，以為大宛都

Critical Abstract from the Complete Library of the Four Treasuries, and the Catalogue of the Qianlong emperor's Poems and Prose. In contrast, the *Siku* version lacks one section that the *Bianyi shuju* metal plate version contains: List of the Titles for Compilers. Further, there are differences between the two texts at the end of the section of Sixteen Rules of the Compilation as shown in the underlined portions of Table 3.

Table 3: Comparison of the Section of Sixteen Rules of the Compilation from the *Siku* Version and the *Bianyi shuju* Metal Plate Version

	Sixteen Rules of the Compilation 凡例十六則
The <i>Siku</i> version (1782)	于壬午冬 <u>初稿告成</u> ， <u>邇日新疆規度日詳</u> ，隨事增輯， 進御，仰荷睿裁欽定，蔚為完書。
The <i>Bianyi shuju</i> metal plate version (1890s)	於壬午冬 <u>初稿成</u> ， <u>獲呈乙覽</u> 。邇年來規度日詳，隨事增輯， 進御，仰荷睿裁欽定，蔚為完書。

The *Bianyi shuju* metal plate version lacks Xinjiang 新疆 from the second sentence of the *Siku* version. In addition, the *juan shou* of the two versions are arranged differently. Though these differences do not substantially change the meaning of the text, they demonstrate that the *Bianyi shuju* metal plate version was not reprinted from the *Siku* version. That makes the *Wuying dian* version collected in the Forbidden City the most likely original source for the *Bianyi shuju* metal plate version. However, this is conjectural because there is not enough verified evidence proving which version was used for the reproduction of the *Bianyi shuju* metal plate version yet.

督府亦其一証。故哈薩克以漢語言之則為康居，自其服屬言之，則原大宛近三十年來，軍吏塗經，貢使踵接，
 汗血之馬，服早獨樹之蹟。寄題非如前代鑿空者比，此歌與丁丑按語，固相印合，不得以異同致疑矣，幾暇
 重書是卷，因識之。” Fu Heng et al., *Qinding Huangyu Xiyu tuzhi*, *Siku quanshu* version, *juan shou*.

It is understandable that two major versions have different arrangements of their *juan shou*. However, it is useful to discuss the inclusion of Imperially Authored Description of Kazakh Horses in the *Xiyu tuzhi*. Eleven years after the 1782 decree incorporating the *Xiyu tuzhi* into the *Siku quanshu*, the Qianlong emperor in 1793 specifically ordered that this additional essay of his be added to the *Siku* version of the *Xiyu tuzhi*, as follows:

It is decreed that the Imperially Authored Description of Kazakh Horses should be hand-copied into the *Xiyu tuzhi*. Other than the exemplar in the Hall for Savoring Culture at Rehe, the text following the “Imperially Authored Ode on Kazakh Horses” is to be added to all copies of the Complete Library of the Four Treasuries as soon as possible. In addition, it is ordered that Ji Yun examine all of the exemplars of the Complete Library of Four Treasures in the Hall of Literary Profundity, the Hall of the Sources of Culture, and the Hall for Recalling Culture, and then copy the text into them...

旨將御製大宛馬識語一篇繕入皇輿西域圖志內，御製大宛馬詩一首之後。除熱河文津閣所貯四庫全書，即就近添寫補入。外著傳諭紀昀，即將文淵文源文溯三閣，所貯四庫全書查明一體，照繕增入.....³⁸

The addition of Imperially Authored Description of Kazakh Horses to the *Siku quanshu* reminds us how committed the Qianlong emperor was to this official gazetteer of the Western Regions. The fact that the Qianlong emperor went to all that trouble to add his newly composed prose on the Western Regions to the *Siku quanshu*, suggests that we consider this local gazetteer not just simply a part of the Qing imperial project, but also a personal project of the Qianlong emperor. It was designated for special palace use and made a part of the imperial collection.³⁹ Therefore, in this thesis, considering that the *Siku* version has the most “cultural elements” and the *Siku quanshu* itself was an imperial project of the Qing empire, I have decided to use the *Siku* version of the *Xiyu tuzhi* as the basis for analysis.

³⁸ The First Historical Archives of China, *Qianlongchao shangyudang* 乾隆朝上諭檔 [Edicts of the Qianlong Period], 乾隆五十六年八月初九日奉。

³⁹ Endymion Wilkinson, *Chinese History: A New Manual*, 5th ed. (digital) (Pleco, 2018), 72.1.

The Perfect Time or Not? The Qianlong Emperor and the Compilers

Since the beginning of the Ming dynasty, compiling gazetteers was instrumental to the central government's incorporation of border regions. This was because local gazetteers were an important source of local information, especially for the borderlands. As Joseph R. Dennis argues, "local gazetteers both signified incorporation into the state and acted as agents of cultural transformation in areas populated by non-Chinese peoples."⁴⁰ However, to identify the reasons the Qing compiled the *Xiyu tuzhi*, we need to evaluate what the Qianlong emperor claimed about the purpose of compiling this gazetteer critically and what its compilation actually entailed. This section reconstructs the compilation process of the *Xiyu tuzhi* and explores the challenges its compilers faced. I pay special attention to the background of each Qing compiler and to the conventions of local gazetteers. Close attention to the rhetoric of the Qianlong emperor and of those involved in the compilation is crucial to understanding both why the *Xiyu tuzhi* was compiled and the content of the text itself.

In the preface to the *Xiyu tuzhi*, written by the Qianlong emperor in 1762 after receiving the first draft of the work, the emperor revealed the purposes of the compilation,

It is ideal that this gazetteer of the Western Regions must be completed at this time, in order to allay the previous dynasties' multiple doubts [about the Western Regions], leave credible information for thousands of years of use, and by occasionally also mentioning the dynastic histories, preserve them for handing down the past.

是西域志之書，必應及是時成之，用開歷代之群疑，垂千秋之信錄，間亦涉及諸史，以存述古。⁴¹

⁴⁰ Dennis also notes that the Ming dynasty compiled a sixty-one *juan* gazetteer immediately after the conquest of Yunnan in 1382. The *Veritable Records* also connects the compilation of the gazetteer with establishing administrative governance to pacify local people. Joseph R. Dennis, *Writing, Publishing, and Reading Local Gazetteers in Imperial China, 1100–1700* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Asia Center, 2015), 51–52.

⁴¹ Fu Heng et al., *Qinding Huangyu Xiyu tuzhi*, *Siku quanshu* version, *juan shou*, 1b.

Based on this quote, the Qianlong emperor believed that it was the perfect time to compile this gazetteer of the Western Regions. This is because, as the Qianlong emperor noted in his preface, the Han and the Tang empires in their heyday only controlled the southern part of the Western Regions. Due to linguistic barriers (not the least from the incomprehension between the Chinese language and the various different local languages), these previous dynasties were limited in their ability to collect accurate information from local sources and peoples of the Western Regions.⁴²

Indeed, the Qianlong emperor implies that the Qing was the only dynasty in imperial China's history able to compile this gazetteer for the Western Regions. In the preface, the emperor goes on to explain that what the Qing accomplished was unprecedented for two main reasons. First, the Qing empire was the only empire in Chinese history to have conquered the region completely, which allowed Qing officials to travel around the region and collect local information. Second, the Qing had Zunghar and Muslim peoples to serve at the court, and the Manchu phonetic script allowed the Qing compilers to reproduce non-Chinese languages better and gather more accurate knowledge of the Western Regions. These advantages made it the ideal moment to compile such a book for the region, in order to circulate the accurate knowledge.⁴³ If what the Qianlong emperor claimed was true, it suggests that the compilers of the *Xiyu tuzhi* should be proficient in Manchu and the local languages of the Western Regions, in addition to their familiarity with the various localities. A close examination of List of the Titles for Compilers of the *Xiyu tuzhi* (See Appendix 1) would further our understanding of the

⁴² Ibid., 1a–1b.

⁴³ The original text: “雖漢唐盛時，亦頗能威行天山迤南，建官設都，而天山迤北，本不能至也…且漢唐之程督異域者，仍漢唐人而已。其與準噶爾、回部人語，奚啻粵問而燕答，則其所記魯魚亥豕之紛，又不待言而可知…準噶爾、回部之人皆在廷執事，而國語切音譯外藩語又甚便且易。我諸臣馳驅往來其間，目覩身歷非若耳聞口傳者比，俾司校勘而正其訛，傳其真。” Fu Heng et al., *Qinding Huangyu Xiyu tuzhi*, *Siku quanshu* version, *juan shou*, 1a–1b.

backgrounds of the compilers and examine to what extent the emperor's preface reflected what was actually done in the *Xiyu tuzhi*.

Commissioned compilations were commonly assembled not by an individual but by a group of people. Those named in List of the Titles for Compilers were generally appeared by seniority. The most senior officials took overall political responsibility for the compilation and rarely did editing work,⁴⁴ and directors-general of compilation, *Zongcai* 總裁, almost never did actual editorial work; rather, they conveyed the political meanings of the compilations.

Compilers, *Zuanxiuguan* 纂修官, who usually served in the Hanlin Academy, managed the actual editorial work.⁴⁵ Compilers played the key roles of taking responsibility for providing suggestions about what initial material to include in the compilation, as well as for deciding what to keep and what to delete in the work.⁴⁶ To understand the political meaning conveyed by the *Xiyu tuzhi* and how the compilers' abilities and backgrounds may have shaped its content, it is therefore critical to examine those who served as its directors-general of compilation and Compilers.

Yet, it is hard to say how much concrete influence the directors-general of compilation had on the project. Nonetheless the presence of their names on the list may reveal what political meaning the Qianlong emperor sought to convey with the work. In total, there were thirteen directors-general of compilation: eight who were Manchu bannermen, or *qiren* 旗人, and five

⁴⁴ Wilkinson, *Chinese History*, 70.4.3.

⁴⁵ Ibid.

⁴⁶ Zhang Sheng 張升, "Siku quanshu guan de jigou yu yunzuo – yi Siku quanshu zhiming biao wei zhongxin de kaocha" 《四庫全書》館的機構與運作——以《四庫全書》職名表為中心的考察, *Beijing shifan daxue xuebao* (Shehui kexue ban) 北京師範大學學報 (社會科學版) 201, no.3 (2007): 90.

who were Han officials.⁴⁷ Three of them were *bitieshi* 筆帖式—the clerks or scribes who wrote memorials and translated documents between Chinese, Manchu, and Mongolian, and who usually came from the Mongol and Manchu banners.⁴⁸

Seven of the directors-general of compilation had participated in the conquest of the Western Regions or had sojourned in Xinjiang for several years.⁴⁹ For example, Shuhede 舒赫德 (1710–1777), from the Manchu plain white banner, was appointed to work as the Amban of Akesu 阿克蘇 from 1759 to 1761, as the Amban of Kashgar 喀什 in 1761, and as the Amban of Wushi 烏什 from 1768 to 1771. Afterwards, he served as the General of Ili 伊犁將軍 from 1771 to 1773, which made him the military governor of Xinjiang in fact.⁵⁰ Another example is Liu Tongxun 劉統勛 (1700–1773), who was also commanded to supervise the garrisons in Balikun 巴里坤 and Hami 哈密 in 1755. Liu and the other two directors-general of compilation for the *Xiyu tuzhi* were the directors-general of compilation of the *Pingding zhunga'er fanglue* as well,⁵¹ which collected official reports and memorials about the Kangxi, Yongzheng, and Qianlong campaigns to pacify the Zunghars.

Based on the above biographical information found in *Qingshi gao jiaozhu* 清史稿校注 (Critical Version of the Draft history of the Qing dynasty) and *Qingshi liezhuan* 清史列傳

⁴⁷ Wang Zhonghan 王鐘翰, ed., *Qingshi liezhuan* 清史列傳 [Biographies of the Qing Period] (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1987), 1128, 1131, 1384, 1391, 1447, 1485, 1498, 1499, 1490–91, 1508, 1511, 1516, 1523, 1526, 1538, 1539, 1545, 1546, 1949, 1952, 1965, 1986–87.

⁴⁸ Many of those who started their career as rose to a high rank. More than twenty percent of Manchus started as *bitieshi*, were mentioned in the standard Qing histories, and ended careers with a top rank at last. Mark C. Elliott, *The Manchu Way: The Eight Banners and Ethnic Identity in Late Imperial China* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2001), 151–52.

⁴⁹ Wang, *Qingshi liezhuan*, 1128, 1131, 1384, 1391, 1447, 1485, 1498, 1499, 1490–91, 1508, 1511, 1516, 1523, 1526, 1538, 1539, 1545, 1546, 1949, 1952, 1965, 1986–87.

⁵⁰ Guo Shi Guan, *Qingshi gao jiaozhu* 清史稿校注 [Critical Version of the Draft History of the Qing Dynasty] (Taipei Xian Xindian Shi: Guo Shi Guan, 1986), 7000–7004; Harvard University, Academia Sinica, and Peking University, *China Biographical Database* (January 12, 2019), <https://projects.iq.harvard.edu/cbdb>.

⁵¹ Wang, *Qingshi liezhuan*, 1391.

(Biographies of the Qing Period), I find that more than half of the directors-general of compilation had been to Xinjiang and were therefore familiar with the situation on the ground there. Therefore, it seems to be the case that they knew Xinjiang better than their contemporaries and predecessors at court. Moreover, the fact that at least three were expert in the Manchu language, through their experiences as *bitieshi*, probably gave them an advantage in collecting information and knowing the locality better. However, thirteen directors-general's lack of experience or knowledge about compiling Chinese gazetteers made it almost impossible that they participated in the actual editorial work. Some of them even held other responsibilities while the *Xiyu tuzhi* was being compiled. Shuhede, for example, was in Xinjiang to work as Amban and General of Ili for the most years between 1755 and 1782, during the time when the *Xiyu tuzhi* was being compiled.

While directors-general of compilation contributed to the overall political meaning of the work, Compiler, *Zuanxiuguan* 纂修官, did the actual editorial work. Thus, it is vital to examine the backgrounds of the three Compilers of the *Xiyu tuzhi* and discuss to what extent their backgrounds shaped the work. Chu Tingzhang 褚廷璋 (1728–1797), from Jiangsu 江蘇, served in the Hanlin Academy and was appointed as a compiler to work in the Campaign History Office, *Fanglüe Guan* 方畧館.⁵² Chu was also the chief compiler of the *Xiyu tongwenzhi* published in 1762,⁵³ which probably familiarized him with the topography, languages, and local customs in the Western Regions.⁵⁴ Although there is no available record showing that Chu had

⁵² The Campaign History Office compiled comprehensive and lengthy accounts of Qing campaigns that conquered new regions and pacified domestic rebellions since the Kangxi period. Wilkinson, *Chinese History*, 66.6.1.

⁵³ Enoki, "Researches in Chinese Turkestan," 455; Millward, "'Coming onto the Map'," 74–75.

⁵⁴ Wang, *Qingshi liezhuan*, 5915.

yet visited Xinjiang, Chu could still be considered qualified to compile the *Xiyu tuzhi* because of his experience compiling the *Xiyu tongwenzhi*.

Another Compiler, He Guozong 何國宗 (d. 1766), from Shuntian 順天, was an official and mathematician who served in the Hanlin Academy. Passing his *jinshi* examination in 1712, He then served as a bachelor of the Hanlin Academy to study mathematics. In 1741, He was commissioned as one of the chief editors of the imperial work dealing with music, the *Yuzhi lülü zhengyi houbian* 御製律呂正義後編 (Imperially Composed Sequel to the Correct Meaning of the Pitch Pipes), which was printed in 1746. This might explain why the *Xiyu tuzhi* has one *juan* dealing with local music, which will be discussed in detail in the next section. Three years before the final conquest of the Zunghar state, the Qianlong emperor in 1756 ordered He to survey and map the Western Regions. His group of surveyors included two Manchu officials, two Catholic missionaries, Felix da Rocha 傅作霖 and Joseph d’Espinha 高慎思, and He.⁵⁵ Based on the two memorials sent by He about his work to the Qianlong emperor, they travelled over the Jiayu Pass,⁵⁶ and through Anxi Hami, Turfan, Balikun, and Ili.⁵⁷ This trip to the Western Regions might be when He familiarized himself with the Western Regions and prepared himself for the later editorial work of the *Xiyu tuzhi*. There are few sources on Qiu Tinglong 邱庭瀟, the third Compiler. The only information about him shows that Qiu served in Hanlin Academy from 1772,

⁵⁵ Arthur W. Hummel, *Eminent Chinese of the Ch’ing Period (1644–1912)* (Taipei: Ch’eng Wen Pub., 1970), 286.

⁵⁶ The *Jiayu Guan* or the Jiayu Pass was both a fort and a gate serving as a military checkpoint of a defensive wall, which was both symbolic and physical boundary between China proper and “the territory beyond the pass” of the Qing Great State in the eighteenth and the nineteenth century. Millward, *Beyond the Pass*, 27.

⁵⁷ The First Historical Archives of China. *Qianlong chao hanwen zhupi zouzhe* 乾隆朝漢文硃批奏折 [Palace Memorials in Chinese from the Qianlong Reign]. “奏報由巴里坤起程測量日期事,” the number of archive: 03-0389-037; “奏明測量繪圖進呈事,” the number of archive: 03-0462-047.

and by 1780 was one of the proofreaders of the *Siku quanshu huiyao* 四庫全書薈要 (Essentials of the Complete Library of the Four Branches).⁵⁸

Examining the background of each compiler informs us that the claim made by the Qianlong emperor in the preface to *Xiyu tuzhi* does not entirely align with the actual expertise of its compilers. None of the three compilers who did actual editorial work on the *Xiyu tuzhi* were expert in the Manchu language or in local languages of the region; two had only basic knowledge of the Western Regions, one due to travel to the region and the other due to experience compiling related work. Although the Qianlong emperor emphasized that the Qing had more advantages than the previous dynasties in compiling its gazetteer, such as the full control of the region and the presence of local people from the Western Regions serving at the imperial court, the emperor did not include anyone originally from the Western Regions in the compilers' group. Reasons behind his choice remain unclear. One hypothesis is that the Qianlong emperor organized the group of compilers in a way that he felt served the imperial agenda: Excluding any local people from the compilation group meant that the Qing compilers alone spoke for the Western Regions and defined the Western Regions from the perspective of the Qing state. This is analogous to what Edward Said argues: "Orientalism as a Western style for dominating, reconstructing, and having authority over the Orient."⁵⁹ Another hypothesis is that the emperor had to make compromises between compilers' lack of knowledge about compiling Chinese gazetteers and his ideal gazetteer compiled by local people. Despite what the preface states, the Qianlong emperor was still trying to consolidate the credibility of the work by doing so while boasting about his accomplishment and the Qing victory. We cannot say with full certainty which hypothesis is

⁵⁸ Harvard University, Academia Sinica, and Peking University, *China Biographical Database* (January 12, 2019), <https://projects.iq.harvard.edu/cbdb>.

⁵⁹ Edward W. Said, *Orientalism* (London: Penguin, 2003), 2.

correct without more information available, but the facts that we have present us with hidden limitations that the Qing empire and the compilers faced behind the compilation.

Information about their backgrounds raises further questions about how these three relatively uninformed compilers succeeded in their work. They certainly had challenges to face: how did these compilers start when they did not have enough sources on this foreign region or any precedent for it? One option is that the compilers tried to develop the compilation from an existing template. The first and highly possible choice for such a template is the sixteen provincial gazetteers revised and reprinted between 1729 to 1741⁶⁰ following an edict issued by the Yongzheng emperor in 1728 to: “inform the governors of each province to revise the provincial gazetteers... After checking and examining [the revisions] carefully, send them all to the *Yitong zhi* office for the compilation of the gazetteer.”⁶¹ For the purpose of comparing local gazetteers’ conventions, I choose to use the reprinted provincial gazetteers of Yunnan and Guizhou. These two provinces, on China’s southwestern frontier, were gradually transformed from the semi-periphery into part of the Chinese empire between 1400 and 1800.⁶² Comparing the conventions of these two provincial gazetteers with the *Xiyu tuzhi* may provide us with a glimpse of how the empire consolidated its authority and increased the state control on the borderlands in its years of expansion.

⁶⁰ I examined all of the provincial gazetteers and found that there were sixteen provincial gazetteers reprinted between 1729 to 1741, though Ba Zhaoxiang claims that eighteen provincial gazetteers were revised and reprinted. Determining the correct number requires more research, but it is safe to say that it is highly possible that the compilers of the *Xiyu tuzhi* took these reprinted gazetteers as their departure point. Ba Zhaoxiang 巴兆祥, “Lun *Da Qing Yitong zhi* de bianxiu dui qingdai difangzhi de yingxiang” 論《大清一統志》的編修對清代地方志的影響, *Ningxia shehui kexue* 寧夏社會科學 124, no.3 (May 2004): 68.

⁶¹ *Da Qing Shizong Xianhuangdi shilu* 大清世宗憲皇帝實錄 [Completed Records of Emperor Yongzheng], 雍正六年十一月甲戌. The original text: “著各省督撫，將本省通志重加修輯……即詳查確核，先行送《一統志》館，以便增輯成書。”

⁶² John E. Herman, “The Cant of Conquest: Tusi Offices and China’s Political Incorporation of the Southwest Frontier,” in *Empire at the Margins: Culture, Ethnicity, and Frontier in Early Modern China*, ed. Pamela Kyle Crossley et al. (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2006), 135.

The *Yitong zhi*, mentioned in the above edict by the Yongzheng edict, refers to the *Da Qing Yitong zhi* 大清一統志 (Unification Gazetteer of the Qing Great State). The compilation of the *Da Qing Yitong zhi* took about two centuries to be completed, from 1672 to 1842, and involved three major revisions. The *Da Qing Yitong zhi* is the first and the only comprehensive, empire-wide gazetteers of the Qing empire. In 1744, the first version of the *Da Qing Yitong zhi* was completed, which was initially started in 1672.⁶³

Twenty years later, after the completion of the first version, revisions of the second version of the *Da Qing Yitong zhi* started, on the basis of a 1764 proposal by Cao Xuemin. One of the major reasons for the revision was to incorporate information from the *Xiyu tuzhi* in the *Da Qing Yitong zhi*.⁶⁴ This suggests that by 1764 the *Xiyu tuzhi* was developed enough to be incorporated into the *Da Qing Yitong zhi* and that the likelihood of including the *Xiyu tuzhi* in the *Da Qing Yitong zhi* created pressure to further improve the *Xiyu tuzhi* draft. From the Yuan to the Qing, initiatives taken by the state to compile comprehensive gazetteers shaped the contents of the local gazetteers several times. As Dennis points out, “gazetteers...served to bring lands at the margins of the Chinese cultural world into the imagined geography of the empire.”⁶⁵ Hence, the conventions between the two *Da Qing Yitong zhi* and the provincial gazetteers should share certain conventions.

Therefore, using the subject categories of the *Xiyu tuzhi* as a baseline, I compare it to those of four other gazetteers: the first version of the *Da Qing Yitong zhi*, the second version of the *Da Qing Yitong zhi*, and reprinted provincial gazetteers of Yunnan and Guizhou following the edict by the Yongzheng emperor. See Table 4.

⁶³ Jiang Tingxi et al. comps., *Da Qing Yitongzhi* 大清一統志 [Unification Gazetteer of the Qing Great State], 1744, preface.

⁶⁴ Ibid.

⁶⁵ Dennis, *Writing, Publishing, and Reading*, 62–63.

Table 4: Subject Matter Categories Shared by the *Xiyu Tuzhi* with Other Qing Gazetteers

西域圖志 <i>Xiyu tuzhi</i> 1782	雲南通志 ⁶⁶ <i>Provincial Gazetteer of Yunnan</i> 1736	貴州通志 ⁶⁷ <i>Provincial Gazetteer of Guizhou</i> 1741	御製大清一統志 The First Version of the <i>Da Qing Yitong zhi</i> 1744	欽定大清一統志 The Second Version of the <i>Da Qing Yitong zhi</i> 1784
Tianzhang 天章 (The Qianlong emperor's poems and prose)				
Tukao 圖考 (Maps)	✓	✓	✓	✓
Liebiao 列表 (Changes in administrative units)	✓	✓	✓	✓
Guidu 晷度 (Coordinates)				
Jiangyu 疆域 (Territory)	✓	✓	✓	✓
Shan 山 (Mountains)	✓Shanchuan 山川 (Mountains and rivers)	✓ Shanchuan 山川 (Mountains and rivers)	✓ Shanchuan 山川 (Mountains and rivers)	✓ Shanchuan 山川 (Mountains and rivers)
Shui 水 (Rivers)	✓ Shanchuan 山川 (Mountains and rivers)	✓ Shanchuan 山川 (Mountains and rivers)	✓ Shanchuan 山川 (Mountains and rivers)	✓ Shanchuan 山川 (Mountains and rivers)
Guanzhi 官制 (Official titles)		✓	✓Zhiguan 職官 (Official titles)	✓
Bingfang 兵防 (Military Defense)	✓	✓		
Tunzheng 屯政 (Administration of military)	✓Hukou 戶口 (Household and head counts)	✓Hukou 戶口 (Household and head counts)	✓Hukou 戶口 (Household and head counts)	✓Hukou 戶口 (Household and head counts)

⁶⁶Jing Daomo et al., comps., *Yunnan tongzhi* 雲南通志 [Provincial Gazetteer of Yunnan], Harvard-Yenching Library Chinese Local Gazetteers Digitization Project, 1736.

⁶⁷Jing Daomo et al., comps., *Guizhou tongzhi* 貴州通志 [Provincial Gazetteer of Guizhou], Harvard-Yenching Library Chinese Local Gazetteers Digitization Project, 1741.

agricultural colonies affairs)				
Gongfu 貢賦 (Tributes and tax)	✓Tianfu 田賦 (Land tax)	✓Tianfu 田賦 (Land tax)	✓Tianfu 田賦 (Land tax)	✓Tianfu 田賦 (Land tax)
Qianfa 錢法 (Monetary System)				
Xuexiao 學校 (Schools)	✓	✓	✓	✓
Fengjue 封爵 (Ennoblement)				
Fengsu 風俗 (Customs)	✓	✓	✓	✓
Yinyue 音樂 (Music)				
Fuwu 服物 (Clothing)				
Tuchan 土產 (Local products)	✓	✓	✓	✓
Fanshu 藩屬 (Vassal states)				
Zalu 雜錄 (Miscellaneous records)	✓			

One important function of the local gazetteer was to inform and guide local officials. Therefore, the four gazetteers above include nine categories of information about local geography, fiscal information, educational information, officeholders in the local governments, and customs and festivals. In this sense, similarities of conventions can be seen between the *Xiyu tuzhi* and the other four gazetteers. At the same time, the information covered by all these categories in the *Xiyu tuzhi* displays evidence of a strong imperial presence in the Western Regions, which contributed to its textual incorporation into the Qing empire. For example, fiscal information such as head counts and land tax were critical for local officials to have in the record, in part to know how much tax the state could collect from every administrative unit. Table 4 shows that in

both the *Da Qing Yitong zhi* and in two provincial gazetteers, *hukou* 戶口 (household and head counts) and *tianfu* 田賦 (land tax) were compiled as two separate categories.

However, the compilers of the *Xiyu tuzhi* adapted to Xinjiang's local characteristics by compiling two categories that differed slightly from other provincial gazetteers from China proper. These two categories were *tunzheng* 屯政 (administration of military agricultural colonies affairs) and *gongfu* 貢賦 (tributes and tax). *Tunzheng* included records of the self-supporting Qing soldiers who were garrisoned in the borderlands. For the *tunzheng* category,⁶⁸ the compilers collected the numbers of soldiers, the number of the exiles, and the agricultural products of each military agricultural colony in the Western Regions, thereby generating data that would customarily belong to the category of *hukou* in traditional gazetteers. For the category of *gongfu*,⁶⁹ the compilers combined the tax records of each local administration and the local tributes paid to the Qing empire “as traditions of the Western Regions”⁷⁰ in an effort to reflect the same information as the *tianfu* category in traditional gazetteers.

Based on this comparison, I argue that, despite the lack of a uniform guideline that compilers could follow in constructing the gazetteers, the gazetteer themselves still shared strong similarities and covered similar information. Thus, comparing the *Xiyu tuzhi* with other gazetteers is helpful because the organization of the *Xiyu tuzhi* was a departure from or variation on the general conventions of local gazetteers. Based on the similarities of the conventions between the *Xiyu tuzhi* and other gazetteers, we can see that the compilers included detailed records of the localities—such as geographical information and fiscal information— in order to

⁶⁸ Fu Heng et al., *Qinding Huangyu Xiyu tuzhi*, *Siku quanshu* version, *juan* 32 and *juan* 33.

⁶⁹ *Ibid.*, *juan* 34.

⁷⁰ Fu Heng et al., *Qinding Huangyu Xiyu tuzhi*, *Siku quanshu* version, *juan* 34, 2b.

fulfill the basic function of the gazetteer. This information also demonstrated the strong imperial control over the Western Regions.

Not only did the compilers made adaptations of some categories, such as *tunzheng* and *gongfu*, but there were also multiple new subject categories invented for the *Xiyu tuzhi*. As discussed earlier, one hypothesis reveals that the Qianlong emperor had intended to compile an ideal, more accurate gazetteer for the Western Regions compared to the preceding regimes', just as he had claimed in the preface. In practical terms, however, the emperor had to make compromises because its compilation was limited by the insufficient knowledge on the part of the compilers. Similarly, the *Xiyu tuzhi* was a compromise between the normal conventions of gazetteers and the reality of inadequate sources on the region. As a result, the *Xiyu tuzhi* compilers went beyond the established conventions of other provincial gazetteers and empire-wide gazetteers. Another hypothesis is that the *Xiyu tuzhi* compilers invented new subject categories for this local gazetteer to serve the imperial agenda –the consolidation and legitimization of Qing rule in the Western Regions and to speak for this newly conquered borderland. One example showing an adaptation by the compilers is that music, an uncommon subject category in local gazetteers, was given a category of its own in the *Xiyu tuzhi*.

Legitimacy and Unification: Music in the Western Regions

Music compiled as an independent category of its own is uncommon in Chinese local gazetteers. Hence, exploring why the compilers decided to organize a separate *juan* for music in the *Xiyu tuzhi* may help us understand what functions the first local gazetteer of Xinjiang served. In this section, I explain what the *juan* on music included and how the Qing compilers employed the Confucian rhetoric of music differently from preceding Chinese regimes to legitimize Manchu rule in the Western Regions. This comprises two parts: differentiation through the categorization of local people and the distinction between the empire and the borderland; and harmonization through using music as a mean to maintain the diverse elements in the state. Finally, I place the *juan* on music in the broader context of other Qing texts on Xinjiang as well.

The *juan* about music, which is the fortieth fascicle in the text, was organized into two sections: *Zhunbu* 準部 (Zunghar tribes) and *Huibu* 回部 (Muslim tribes or Hui tribes). Each section includes detailed descriptions of musical instruments (twelve instruments from *Zhunbu* and eight from *Huibu*), musical scores, and related Chinese texts from the previous dynasties about the music of the Western Regions and about the descriptions of Muslim rituals for musical performances. The *juan* ends with Imperially Authored Linked Verses of Watching Muslim Rope-walking 御製觀回部繩伎聯句, a poem composed by the Qianlong emperor.

It is noteworthy that the compilers structured the *juan* on music to include only two categories of local inhabitants, the *Zhunbu* and *Huibu*, despite the fact that multiple socio-cultural groups of people inhabited in the Western Regions. Since the sixteenth century, interactions between various peoples and cultures—including Turkic and Iranian speakers, Mongols, Muslims, Tibetan Buddhists, Kazaks, Kirghiz and Chinese—increasingly changed the

demographics in Central Eurasia.⁷¹ After examining multiple *juan* of the *Xiyu tuzhi* carefully, I suggest that both *Zhunbu* and *Huibu* have two meanings, depending on context in which they are used. *Zhunbu* could refer to a geographical demarcation, *Zhunbu* or Zungharia, representing the northern part of Xinjiang, or the northern march of the Tianshan Mountain. *Zhunbu* also refers to the group of people who were called Zunghars, a confederation of Oirat Mongol nomads controlling parts of the present-day Russia, Kazakhstan, Mongolia, and northern Xinjiang. Likewise, *Huibu* also carries two meanings, one as a geographical term meaning the “Muslim region” of southern Xinjiang. For example, the Qing government called the southern march of the Tianshan Mountain the Tarim Basin *Huibu* or *huijiang* 回疆. Similarly, *Huibu* also designated a group of people: Muslims who inhabited the Tarim basin and oasis cities in southern Xinjiang.⁷² In this *juan* on music, it is quite obvious that the compilers collected music knowledge of two different groups of people, Zunghars and Muslims.

The compilers did not explain the reasons for their particular categorization of local inhabitants in the *Xiyu tuzhi*. In some ways, it was unreasonable to expect one section dedicated to the Zunghars because few Zunghars were left in the region after the Qing army slaughtered thousands of Zunghars, including women and children, in a Zunghar rebellion in 1755 when the Zunghar state collapsed.⁷³ Recently, however, work by Benjamin Levey reveals that the Qing actually protected and settled Zunghar refugees who chose to submit to the Qing after they made their way out of the Kazakh captivity between 1759 and 1761.⁷⁴ This might explain why the Qing compilers retained *Zhunbu* as one of the main categories in the gazetteer, and probably also reflected the Manchus’ vision of rule in the Western Regions.

⁷¹ Millward, *Eurasian Crossroads*, 78.

⁷² Millward, *Beyond the Pass*, 23; Millward, “‘Coming onto the Map’,” 65.

⁷³ Levey, “Jungar Refugees,” 2.

⁷⁴ *Ibid.*, 21–22.

It is interesting that the compilers chose to describe local instruments in this *juan* by presenting the instruments' exact sizes in this *juan*. For example, the section on *Huibu* instruments describes one important instrument, the *dap*, as follows:

Dabu [dap], that is a drum. The drum's cavity is created by the wood and is covered by the leather. The diameter of the cover is one *chi* three *cun* six *fen* five *li* and two *hao* [about 45.036 cm] and the height is two *cun* two *fen* seven *li* and five *hao* [about 7.476 cm]. For a smaller *dabu* [dap], the diameter of the cover is one *chi* two *cun* two *fen* and four *li* [about 40.272 cm], and the height is one *cun* six *fen* and two *li* [about 5.34 cm]. Beat the drum by the fingers to play.

達卜,即鼓也。以木為腔,冒以革。面徑一尺三寸六分五釐二毫,高二寸二分七釐五毫。其小者,面徑一尺二寸二分四釐,高一寸六分二釐。以手指擊之。⁷⁵

The compilers described the sizes of the instrument in an encyclopedic way, which makes people wonder what functions this *juan* were designed and compiled to serve. Moreover, the compilers include little to explain how those instruments were played and what performers were expected to do.

In order to understand what functions this *juan* was compiled to serve, I first examine closely what the compilers stated about their intent in its preface. The compilers open the preface by referring to previous Chinese dynasties' traditions of mastering *Yi* 夷, or foreign, music to show the state's prosperity. Implying that mastering *Yi* or foreign music was a tradition in the previous Chinese dynasties, I argue, the compilers aimed to establish a link between the Qing and the previous dynasties in order to legitimize the Qing's rule and make the Qing become part of the legitimate sequence of the Chinese dynasties. For example, at the beginning of the preface, the compilers invoked the allusions from the *Zhouli* 周禮 (Rites of Zhou), one of the classics of Confucianism, as follows:

⁷⁵ Fu Heng et al., *Qinding Huangyu Xiyu tuzhi*, *Siku quanshu* version, *juan* 40, 17b.

The *Spring Offices* section of the *Rites of Zhou* includes the *Dilou* Master, who is in charge of the music of the foreigners and sings their songs with them, and the *Maoren*, who supervises instruction in the foreigners' music. When the king's accomplishments and virtues are great, then *yin* and *yang* are in harmony, and when the proclaimed teachings are firm, they reach out and saturate the eight frontiers. Even the most distant places respect benevolence, admire righteousness, sing songs and dance to it. Therefore, collect their music and sounds, follow their rhythms, cover all of their flutes and zithers, apply to the dance of *ganqi* for the imperial gathering and banquets and perform at the right of the door. This is what is meant by the person who has flourishing virtue, and his music is completely collected.

《周禮春官》有鞀鞀氏，掌四夷之樂，與其聲歌。又有旄人，掌教夷樂。王者功德隆盛，陰陽和調，聲教所暨，外浹八埏。殊方絕域，相與懷仁慕義，詠歌而舞蹈之。於是採其音聲，按其節奏，被諸管絃，施於干戚，朝會燕饗，用陳門右。所謂其德盛者，其樂備也。⁷⁶

In this quote, the compilers highlighted the collections of *Yi* or foreign music as a symbol of the righteousness in order to demonstrate the Central State's (*Zhongguo*, 中國) prosperity and the legitimacy of its rulers. Then the compilers continued their narrative by listing the examples of *Yi* or foreign music collected during the Han dynasty (202 BCE–220), the Northern dynasties (420–579) and the Southern dynasties (386–581), the Sui dynasty (581–618), and to the Tang dynasty (618–907). This demonstrates that the previous rulers of the Central State viewed the complete collection of the Western Regions' music as a symbol of state prosperity.⁷⁷ One example the compilers cite is as follows:

In the Han dynasty, Zhang Qian was sent abroad as ambassador to the Western Regions and acquired the song of *Mohe doule*. This song spread over the Central State, and Li Yannian reproduced it as *Ershiba jie*. Thus, the Han started for the first time to have Western music.

漢張騫使西域，得摩訶兜勒一曲。傳之中國，李延年翻為二十八解。於是始有西音。⁷⁸

⁷⁶ Fu Heng et al., *Qinding Huangyu Xiyu tuzhi*, *Siku quanshu* version, *juan* 40, the preface.

⁷⁷ Ibid.

⁷⁸ Ibid.

Including this statement in the *Xiyu tuzhi* validates Qing legitimacy by establishing a connection to previous Chinese dynasties that deployed the Confucian rhetoric of music.

At the same time, when the Qing compilers came to discuss the present, they justified the incorporation of the borderland with the Confucian rhetoric of music as well:

The Western Regions' main [musical] skills have been generally laid out. However, the territory has not returned [to the empire], and the reputation [of the Qing] has not been burnished [in the Western Regions]. Though it [music from the Western Regions] also assists the peacefulness and happiness [of the feasts], it does not match the prosperity of harmony that prevails. The Emperor is gifted and intelligent and personally sets the tones and pitches. Recently, now that the Western Regions have been fundamentally pacified, it is possible to collect their *Rongyue* [foreign or barbarian music]. The instruments of Zunghar tribes are similar to Mongol instruments, so we are able to examine their music in order to correct their understanding of it. As for *Huibu*, we look at their scores that their performers use when they entertain at banquets, in order to examine the feelings that musical sound expresses in different regions, and to let music be played within the protection of our limitless frontiers. As it has been recorded in ancient times, when the Son of Heaven establishes the supreme order of harmony and maintains the rules and procedures, the sounds of bronze and jades are there to acclaim this. For this reason, we have examined their musical scores, instruments, and costumes and made a full record. 西域之技，大畧粗陳。然而疆索未歸，聲容弗脩。亦第以佐清暇歡娛，無當於光被同和之盛也。我皇上天縱聰明，身度聲律。邇者西域底定，致其戎樂。準部器物，畧同蒙古，既得審音以資考訂。回部則譜在伶工，參之嘉宴。以察殊方聲氣之感，以垂鐘虞無疆之庥。惟古所紀，天子建中和之極，兼綜條貫，金聲而玉振之。爰是按其曲譜，詳其樂器工衣而備載焉。⁷⁹

This quote indicates that the Qing compilers emphasized the value of collecting local music of the Western Regions “in order to examine the feelings that musical sound expresses in different regions and to let music be played within the protection of our limitless frontiers.” The compilers suggested the commonalities of music among the Western Regions and implied that the Qing

⁷⁹ Ibid.

achieved the unification of empire through harmonizing the diverse elements of Zunghar tribes' music and Muslim tribes' music. Here, the compilers did not just claim that the importance of collecting foreign music demonstrates the legitimacy of the Qing. They also suggested that assembling and keeping the diverse elements of local music within the "protection" of the Qing state's "limitless frontiers" incorporates the borderland within the Qing empire.

Actually, ruling elites used music as a vehicle to educate people and unify the state.⁸⁰ As *Liji* 禮記 (Book of Rites) indicates, music was considered to be one of the "instruments by which the minds of the people are assimilated, and good order in government is made to appear."⁸¹ Since the Han dynasty, the discourse of musical philosophy – one of the primary elements of Confucian rituals – was codified and incorporated into the Chinese political systems to legitimize a unified bureaucratic state.⁸² This occurred in two major ways, as Erica Brindley suggests: "Unity might be achieved either at the expense of diversity through measures of standardization and equalization, or by keeping diversity in mind through the harmonization of diverse elements."⁸³ In the *Xiyu tuzhi*'s *juan* on music, the compilers adopted the second approach—including both *Zhunbu* music and *Huibu* music to justify the unification of the Western Regions into the Qing empire.

The compilers conclude the preface to the *juan* on music as follows:

We are aware of where the sacred dynasty's virtue and transformation reach, which indeed gradually spread to the region of the west where the sun sets. Though the region is remote, it is proper to know how to harmonize their music to express the prosperity of the state. Thus, we have compiled the sixteenth category on music.

⁸⁰ Evelyn S. Rawski, "The Creation of an Emperor in Eighteenth-Century China," in *Harmony and Counterpoint: Ritual Music in Chinese Context*, edited by Bell Yung, Evelyn S. Rawski, and Rubie S. Watson (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1996), 161.

⁸¹ The original text: "禮樂刑政，其極一也；所以同民心而出治道也。" *Liji* 禮記 [Book of Rites], trans. James Legge, C-text, accessed April 22, 2019, <https://ctext.org/liji/zh>.

⁸² Rawski, "The Creation of an Emperor in Eighteenth-Century China," 162.

⁸³ Brindley, *Music, Cosmology, and the Politics of Harmony in Early China*, 60.

知聖朝德化所及，實漸被於金方濛汜之區。雖僻處遐陬，亦得和其聲以鳴國家之盛焉。志音樂第十六。⁸⁴

In this statement, the compilers used the term “transformations” (*hua*, 化) and claimed that the Qing’s virtue gradually spread to the Western Regions. The logic behind such claims, I maintain, is built upon the rhetoric of music in the Confucian Classics, which consider music as a symbol of the Central State or *Hua*. For example, the *Zuo zhuan* 左傳⁸⁵ considers music as having properties that are the opposite of those espoused by *di*.⁸⁶

When the ear does not hear the harmony of the five sounds, it is deafness. When the eye does not distinguish the resplendence of the five colors, it is blindness. When the heart does not take as model the principles of virtue and duty, it is waywardness. When the mouth does not speak words of loyalty and good faith, it is perfidy. In all cases the *di* take these as models. These four iniquities are all present in them!

耳不聽五聲之和為聾，目不別五色之章為昧，心不則德義之經為頑，口不道忠信之言為嚚。狄皆則之，四姦具矣。⁸⁷

According to this statement, it could be seen that the harmony of the five sounds, and of music as one of the demonstrations of the opposite of the *Di* 狄, who do not “hear the harmony of the five sounds.” In other words, the ability to appreciate music was one of the symbolic attributes of the opposite of the *Di*, which could be taken as the Central State or *Hua* here.

⁸⁴ Fu Heng et al., *Qinding Huangyu Xiyu tuzhi*, *Siku quanshu* version, *juan* 40, the preface.

⁸⁵ *Zuo zhuan* 左傳 is a commentary on *Chun qiu* 春秋, which is “a chronicle of the reigns of twelve dukes of the state of Lu covering the period from 722 to 481 B.C.” Traditionally, its authorship was attributed to Zuo Qiuming 左丘明, a contemporary of Confucius. The work is also considered to be one of the 13 Classics. Michael Loewe ed., *Early Chinese Texts: A Bibliographical Guide* (Berkeley: The Society for the Study of Early China, 1993), 67 and 69.

⁸⁶ Brindley, *Music, Cosmology, and the Politics of Harmony in Early China*, 44.

⁸⁷ Stephen Durrant, Wai-yee Li, and David Schaberg, trans., *Zuo Tradition/Zuozhuan: Commentary on the “Spring and Autumn Annals”* (Seattle: University of Washington Press, 2016), 382–83.

However, the compiler of the *Xiyu tuzhi* did not intend to stress that the Qing or the Central State was using *Hua* music to transform the borderlands peoples and to create uniformity across the empire. Instead, they emphasized that *Zhunbu* and *Huibu* music are valid contributions as part of the empire. In other words, the Qing compilers did not distinguish *Hua* and *Yi* music hierarchically, but rather stressed the incorporation of music from *Zhunbu* and *Huibu* equally into the empire as representations of the diversity of cultures of the Western Regions.

Moreover, the compilers used the specific term *Rongyue* 戎樂 — foreign music — in the preface to refer to *Zhunbu* and *Huibu* music. This requires further examination and interpretation, because *Rong* 戎 as a term to refer non-Chinese has a pejorative nature in Chinese texts, especially in the Qing. From very early on, the Chinese referred to those they perceived as non-Chinese variously as *rong* 戎, *yi* 夷, *man* 蠻 and *di* 狄. Since the Zhou period (ca. 1045–221 B.C.), these terms were used to distinguish the Chinese – inhabitants of the Central Plain’s polities – from surrounding tribes and peoples.⁸⁸ For example, *Shiji zhengyi* 史記正義⁸⁹ contrasts the “central *xia*” with the “periphery *yi di*” as follows, “[P]eople within the borders are the *xia*, those outside are the *yi* and *di*.”⁹⁰ During the Eastern Zhou (771–221 B.C.) period, these four terms started to be related to the four cardinal directions. For instance, the *Liji*⁹¹ states, “The

⁸⁸ Mu-chou Poo, *Enemies of Civilization: Attitudes toward Foreigners in Ancient Mesopotamia, Egypt, and China* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 2005), 45.

⁸⁹ The *Shiji* 史記 is a history of China from the time of the Yellow Emperor to the end of the second century B.C. The earliest extant print version of the *Shiji* to include the Zheng yi 正義 is a Song version of 1196 that is credited to Tang historians by Zhang Shoujie 張守節. Loewe ed., *Early Chinese Texts*, 405 and 407.

⁹⁰ The original text: “內諸夏，外夷狄也。” Sima Qian 司馬遷, *Shiji* 史記. Vol.1 卷一 Ji 紀 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1982), 36.

⁹¹ *Liji* 禮記 includes a ritualist’s anthology about ancient usages, definitions, prescriptions, and anecdotes. Loewe ed., *Early Chinese Texts*, 293.

[chiefs] among [the wild tribes of] the *yi* on the east, the *di* on the north, the *rong* on the west, and the *man* on the south.”⁹²

Some scholars argue that the terms *rong*, *yi*, *man* and *di* had the derogatory meaning of “barbarians” and were used to disparage non-Chinese peoples whose cultures the Chinese believed was inferior. For example, in the *Analects* (*Lunyu*, 論語), Confucius claims that Chinese (*hua*, 華) are superior to non-Chinese *yi* and *di* peoples, though the *Analects* does not offer a definitive description of the categorical distinction between *Hua* and *Yi* and the boundary between two became more flexible over time.⁹³

Other scholars disagree. According to Christopher I. Beckwith, translating the word “barbarian” into Chinese is impossible since there is no concept of “barbarian” in Chinese culture.⁹⁴ The terms used to represent foreigners or non-Chinese contain multiple meanings, including: “inability to speak Chinese, militarily skilled, fierce/cruel to enemies, and Non-Chinese in Culture.”⁹⁵ Even today, no native Chinese word concisely expresses the meaning of “barbarian.”⁹⁶ Moreover, Di Cosmo points out the imprecision of giving varying native Chinese terms for foreigners the uniform translation of “barbarians.”⁹⁷

What remains clear, however, is that although the connotations of *rong*, *yi*, *man* and *di* are debatable, the use of these terms in the Confucian Classics distinguishes between *Hua* and *Yi*, between Chinese and non-Chinese, and sometimes between the civilized and the uncivilized.

⁹² The original text: “其在東夷，北狄，西戎，南蠻。” *Liji*, trans. James Legge, C-text, accessed April 22, 2019, <https://ctext.org/liji/zh>.

⁹³ Timothy Brook et al ed., *Sacred Mandates: Asian International Relations since Chinggis Khan* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2018), 59.

⁹⁴ Christopher I. Beckwith, *Empires of the Silk Road: A History of Central Eurasia from the Bronze Age to the Present* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2009), 358.

⁹⁵ *Ibid.*

⁹⁶ *Ibid.*

⁹⁷ Nicola Di Cosmo, *Ancient China and Its Enemies: The Rise of Nomadic Power in East Asian History* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), 100.

Despite their pejorative nature, such terms were still used in Qing writings to refer to certain groups of people. The reasons behind this need to be further explored in the broader context of the Qing, a period during which Han/Chinese subjects constantly questioned the legitimacy of Manchu rule.⁹⁸

As a regime of conquest, the Manchu and Inner Asian qualities of the Qing empire constantly undermined its legitimacy in the eyes of the Chinese civilizational world. Although most Chinese never fully accepted the Manchu rulers as legitimate rulers, their proficiency with the Chinese language and the Classics remained an important part of the Manchu emperors' personae.⁹⁹ The Manchu rulers also employed Chinese cosmology to rule the empire. For example, the Yongzheng emperor defended the Qing's legitimacy by citing *Mengzi* 孟子,¹⁰⁰ a core Confucian work, to refute the doubts expressed by Chinese subjects:

Seditious rebels suggest that we were the sovereign of Manchuria and later entered the Middle Kingdom to become its ruler. Their prejudices about the territorial division between this land and that land have led to hateful lies and fabrications. What they have failed to understand is that Manchuria is to the Manchus what *jiguan* [birthplace or ancestral place] is to the people of the Central State. Shun was a man of the eastern *yi* and King Wen was a man of the western *yi*. Did that diminish their sagely virtue?¹⁰¹
在逆賊等之意，徒謂本朝以滿洲之君，入為中國之主，妄生此疆彼界之私，遂故為訕謗詆譏之說耳。不知本朝之為滿洲，猶中國之有籍貫。舜為東夷之人，文王為西夷之人，曾何損於聖德乎。¹⁰²

⁹⁸ Brook, *Sacred Mandates*, 146.

⁹⁹ Brook, *Sacred Mandates*, 146 – 47.

¹⁰⁰ *Mengzi* 孟子 is a collection of Meng ke's 孟軻 (Mencius) sayings. It also includes his conversations with the kings of the states, his disciples and other contemporaries. Historical record confirms that he travelled to several states around 320 B.C. Loewe ed., *Early Chinese Texts*, 331.

¹⁰¹ Lydia H. Liu, *The Clash of Empires: The Invention of China in Modern World Making*. Cambridge (MA: Harvard University Press, 2004), 84.

¹⁰² The Yongzheng emperor, *Dayi juemi lu* 大義覺迷錄 [Narration of the Great Righteousness and Enlightenment] (Harvard-Yenching Library Chinese Rare Book Digitization Project, 1723), *juan* 1, 2b–3a.

The Yongzheng Emperor stressed that it was virtue instead of birthplace that confers ruling legitimacy and differentiates *Hua* from *Yi*. The Yongzheng emperor cited the philosophy of Mencius a second time in the same work to demonstrate that the Qing should not be regarded as *Yi* because of the Manchu rulers' "heart of benevolence and righteousness":

The treacherous book argues, "*Yi* and *Di* are different species, as we and beasts are [different]." Human beings are different from beasts, even if only slightly, because human beings preserve hearts. A gentleman has heart because of benevolence and righteousness...As for our dynasty, since we have established our state beyond the pass, we hold the heart of benevolence and righteousness, and rule the empire with benevolence and righteousness. Even previous distinguished rulers can rarely compare favorably to our dynasty. Besides, we have been in the Central State more than eighty years. The influences of orthodox teaching of Confucianism are increasing; rites and music are in peak period; and political affairs and literary and artistic pursuits are prosperous. Everything becomes grand. How could [they] still consider us as beasts and different species?

逆書云：「夷狄異類，譬如禽獸。」夫人之所以異於禽獸者，幾希。以其存心也。君子以仁存心，以義存心。若夫本朝，自關外創業以來，存仁義之心，行仁義之政，即古昔之賢君令主，亦罕能與我朝倫比。且自入中國，已八十餘年。數猷布教，禮樂昌明，政事文學之盛，燦然備舉，而猶得調為異類禽獸乎？¹⁰³

The Yongzheng emperor pointed out that Manchus should not be regarded as *Yi* or beasts anymore because "the rites and music are in peak period," demonstrating the legitimacy of Qing rule. And indeed rites and music were employed as a vital instrument to legitimize Manchu rule to the Chinese civilizational world. The Yongzheng emperor's writing indicates that terms like *Yi* and *Di* indeed had negative connotations in the Qing period.

The Qing compilers of the *Xiyu tuzhi* mirrored the Yongzheng emperor's use of Mencius to justify Qing's rule through using the Confucian rhetoric of music to classify the music of the Western Regions as part of the Qing empire. For example, in the *Xiyu tuzhi*, the compilers also occasionally referred to Zunghars as *Zhunyi* 準夷 (Zunghar barbarians) but never referred to

¹⁰³ Ibid., *juan* 1, 40b and 41a–41b.

people from *Huibu* as *Yi*. Manchu was not Chinese either, but the Manchus borrowed the term *Zhunyi* to indicate their hostility to the Zunghars when they were fighting to conquer them, and to justify the Qing conquest of the Western Regions.¹⁰⁴ These interpretations of how Qing rulers used the rhetoric of *Yi* shed light on the reason why they kept using these derogative terms. On the one hand, some Chinese subjects always regarded the Qing rulers as *Yi* instead of as *Hua*. Instead of refuting all the accusations of Manchu illegitimacy, however, the Manchu chose to adopt Confucian rhetoric and use it to defend the legitimacy of the Qing empire.

Another question is how the compilers collected the sources to organize this *juan* as none of them were from the region, and were probably not fluent in the local languages to consult the sources. Current scholarship has not questioned whether the text of this *juan* on music is original or not. If the records of the instruments in the *Xiyu tuzhi* are not original, what sources did the compilers consult? This is important to examine because it will help us to situate the *Xiyu tuzhi* within the broader context of the Qing imperial project.

After searching through related sources on music, I have found two possible works from which the compilers may have derived the *juan* on music in the *Xiyu tuzhi*. One is also an imperial work commissioned by the Qianlong emperor and printed in 1746, the *Yuzhi lülü zhengyi houbian* 御製律呂正義後編 (Imperially Composed Sequel to the Correct Meaning of the Pitch Pipes). The other is the *Xiyu zhi* 西域誌 (Gazetteer of the Western Regions) printed in 1761 and compiled by local officials of the Qing in the Western Region.¹⁰⁵ The *Yuzhi lülü zhengyi houbian* is based on the revision and extension of *Lülü zhengyi* 律呂正義 (Correct

¹⁰⁴ Millward, *Beyond the Pass*, 21–22, and 27; Poo, *Enemies of Civilization*, 45

¹⁰⁵ David Brophy, “An Early Manchu Account of the Western Regions,” *Saksaha: A Journal of Manchu Studies* 14 (2016): 26–27.

Meaning of the Pitch Pipes) compiled during the Kangxi emperor's reign.¹⁰⁶ He Guozong, who was a compiler of the *Xiyu tuzhi*, was also one of the chief compilers of the *Yuzhi lülü zhengyi houbian* was.¹⁰⁷ The *Yuzhi lülü zhengyi houbian* contains a chapter dealing with the instruments of the Xinjiang Muslims, including detailed descriptions and illustrations.¹⁰⁸

The *Xiyu zhi* is a little-known Chinese text with Manchu annotations to help with the transcriptions of the foreign names of things and places in the Western Regions. It is considered to be the first gazetteer-like work compiled by the Qing officials in Xinjiang in the 1760s, but its author is unknown.¹⁰⁹ The work includes a chapter showing illustrations and giving Chinese descriptions of Muslim instruments in the Western Regions. Therefore, in Table 5 I show the results of my comparison of how closely the three texts correspond to each other on the sources of the instruments of the Western Regions.

¹⁰⁶ Nicholas Standaert, "Ritual Dances and Their Visual Representation in the Ming and the Qing," *The East Asian Library Journal* 12, no. 1 (2006): 134.

¹⁰⁷ Rawski, "The Creation of an Emperor in Eighteenth-Century China," 162–63.

¹⁰⁸ The *Yuzhi lülü zhengyi houbian* established the music institution for the Qing until it collapsed in 1912. As Rawski points out that the Qing employed "the ancient lineage of the musical instruments" to legitimize the Manchu rule in the dynastic cycles as part of the orthodox in China. Yinlu et al., eds., *Yuzhi lülü zhengyi houbian* 御製律呂正義後編 [Imperially Composed Sequel to the Correct Meaning of the Pitch Pipes], 1746, *juan* 77; Rawski, "The Creation of an Emperor in Eighteenth-Century China," 162–63.

¹⁰⁹ Brophy, "An Early Manchu Account of the Western Regions," 26.

Table 5: Descriptions of Instruments of the Western Regions in Three Texts

《律呂正義後編》1746 <i>Imperially Composed Sequel to the Correct Meaning of the Pitch Pipes</i> 卷七十七 樂器考十六	《西域圖誌》1782 <i>Imperially Commissioned Illustrated Gazetteer of the Western Regions</i> 卷四十 音樂		《西域志》1761 <i>Gazetteer of the Western Regions</i> 音樂
瓦爾喀舞樂器 回部樂器	回部	準噶爾部	
箏	哈爾扎克 C	雅托噶	達布式 A
奚琴	喀爾奈 D	伊奇里呼爾	墊馬式
達卜 A	巴拉滿 G	圖布舒爾	開甲克式
那噶喇 B	喇巴卜 F	披帕呼爾	塞塔爾式 E
哈爾扎克 C	色塔爾 E	特木爾呼爾	拉瓦布式
喀爾奈 D	達卜 A	鏗格爾格	喀嫩式 D
塞他爾 E	蘇爾奈 H	倉	納噶拉式 B
喇巴卜 F	納噶喇 B	登舍	素呢式 H
巴拉滿 G		轟和	都木巴克式
蘇爾奈 H		畢什庫爾	雄昌式
		伊克布勒	布奇打納式
		冬布勒	薩碧特嗎拉式
			呢??式
			襍布拉式
			巴拉滿式 G

Comparing the sections dealing with music in the three works above, it is clear that the descriptions of *Huibu* instruments in the *Xiyu tuzhi* are copied directly from the *Yuzhi lülü zhengyi houbian*, though they are sequenced differently in the *Xiyu tuzhi*. Further sources are required if we hope to understand why the original sequence was modified. This result is not surprising if we recall that He Guozong participated in the compilation of both texts. This finding also partially explains the way that the compilers organized the *juan* on music: they followed the existing template about the Muslim music in the *Yuzhi lülü zhengyi houbian* and then compiled the section on *Zhunbu* instruments.

Furthermore, I found that the names of six instruments that appear in both the *Xiyu zhi* and the *Yuzhi lülü zhengyi houbian* are transcribed in Chinese differently in the two texts. It is hard to say whether the *Xiyu zhi*'s section on music was inspired by the content of the *Yuzhi lülü zhengyi houbian*, but an examination of how this private work organized its discussion of music would help us to better understand the particularities of the *Xiyu tuzhi*.

In fact, the *Xiyu zhi* is the lengthiest recension of a text compiled in the 1760s, and the *Xiyu Dili tushuo* 西域地理圖說 (Illustrated geography of the Western Regions),¹¹⁰ the *Huijiang zhi* 回疆志 (Gazetteer of the Hui Frontier),¹¹¹ and the *Xinjiang Huibu zhi* 新疆回部志 (Gazetteer of the Xinjiang Hui Tribes)¹¹² are all shorter recensions of this text.¹¹³ The music section of the *Xiyu zhi* includes extremely detailed illustrations of Muslim instruments and their descriptions in Chinese, but the content of the text does not overlap that of the *Xiyu tuzhi*. As for three shorter recensions, no section about music appears in the *Xiyu dili tushuo*. The section might be lost over its years of circulation. The authors of the *Huijiang zhi* and the *Xinjiang huibu zhi* seem to have summarized the *Xiyu zhi*'s section on music instead of keeping it as intact. I have compared the section called Musical Instruments (*Yueqi*, 樂器) in the *Huijiang zhi* and the *Xinjiang huibu zhi* and found that their discussion of instruments closely correspond to each other, though the author of the *Xinjiang huibu zhi* made some adjustments (see Appendix 2). Indeed, based on the *Xiyu zhi* and its family of short recensions, it seems that Manchu officials had paid attention to

¹¹⁰ Ruan Mingdao, ed., *Xiyu dili tushuo zhu* 西域地理圖說注 [Illustrated geography of the Western Regions] (Yanji: Yanbian daxue chubanshe, 1992), 2.

¹¹¹ *Huijiangzhi* 回疆志 [Gazetteer of the Hui Frontier]. Taipei: Chengwen chubanshe, 1968.

¹¹² Wu Fengpei, ed., *Xinjiang Hui bu zhi* 新疆回部志 [Gazetteer of the Xinjiang Hui Tribes]. Beijing: Quanguo tushuguan wenxiansuo wei fuzhi zhongxin, 2003.

¹¹³ Brophy, "An Early Manchu Account of the Western Regions," 26–27.

information about the music and culture in the Western Regions quite early on. However, the agendas behind the two texts, the *Xiyu zhi* and the *Xiyu tuzhi* are different.

It is true that both texts remain the accounts of Muslim instruments and describe the details of the instruments in an encyclopedic way. The *Xiyu zhi* focuses more on the details of instruments and relevant cultural customs of Muslim peoples. However, unlike the *Xiyu tuzhi*, the author of the *Xiyu zhi* did not discuss the connections between and connotations of rituals, music, and the state. The different organization of content and rhetoric in the two works show that the *Xiyu tuzhi* was compiled with an imperial agenda in mind: The *Xiyu tuzhi* organizes the local music of the Western Regions into a specific Confucian rhetoric of music to make clear aspects of its “differentiation and harmonization” in the Qing imperial project.

It might seem odd that both differentiation and harmonization exist in the same text, but they are as closely connected as two sides of a coin. On the one hand, the compilers categorized local inhabitants as *Zhunbu* and *Huibu*, and set the Qing and the Western Regions within the framework of *Hua* and *Yi* to allow the Confucian rhetoric of music to work. Only within this discourse could the state harmonize the diverse elements of *Zhunbu* and *Huibu* music in a way that linked the borderland and the state. The *Xiyu tuzhi*’s *juan* on music was not compiled to instruct musicians how to play the local instruments and perform the music of the Western Regions. Instead, it was compiled mainly to legitimize Qing rule of the Western Regions and to justify the unification of the empire by using the Confucian rhetoric of music to the collection of *Zhunbu* and *Huibu* music.

Conclusion

Why was the *Xiyu tuzhi* compiled? The answer might be simple: the Qianlong emperor merely wanted to know what was in this recently newly conquered territory. However, the process in which the *Xiyu tuzhi* was compiled raises a series of questions that the simple answer does not suffice. The *Xiyu tuzhi* took about twenty-three years to compile. The Qianlong emperor believed that it was the perfect time to compile this gazetteer for the Western Regions because the Qing had unprecedented advantages relative to preceding Chinese regimes: the Qing had conquered and now controlled the Western Regions completely, and their own Manchu language allowed them to more easily collect information on the region.

Yet a close examination of the *Xiyu tuzhi* shows that what the Qianlong emperor claimed or believed was not entirely true. It was almost impossible for the compilers who really did the editorial work to be capable in Manchu or the local languages of the Western Regions. Even though the Qianlong emperor mentioned that people from the Western Regions served in the Qing court, none were involved with the compilation group. Maybe the local people were not capable to compile a Chinese gazetteer because they were not familiar with this genre of writing; perhaps the Qianlong emperor organized the *Xiyu tuzhi* compilers intentionally to exclude local people from the compilation to serve the imperial agenda.

Despite all the challenges that the compilers faced, what remains clear is that they managed to use knowledge of music as a medium to legitimize Qing imperial rule of the Western Regions. As can be seen from the analysis of the unusual *juan* on music, the organization of the *Xiyu tuzhi* varied somewhat from that of Chinese gazetteers, but the functions that it served went beyond those of the traditional gazetteer. The compilers' purpose was not merely for the collection of information about local instruments and musical scores of the Western Regions.

They also employed the Confucian rhetoric of music untraditionally to assert their agenda: incorporating the borderland through both differentiation and harmonization. The Qing maintained the diverse local characteristics of the Western Regions instead of creating uniformity across the empire.

This finding of “differentiation and harmonization” shows one of the Manchu’s main concerns of ruling the Qing empire. It seems that incongruous for the compilers to legitimize Qing rule in the Western Regions through both differentiation and harmonization at the same time. However, such incongruity was also seen in the way that Manchus ruled a Han-dominated empire: the Qing rulers needed to appeal to Han subjects and were also concerned about maintaining Manchu identity.¹¹⁴ Therefore, it explains why the Qing was cautious in assimilating the borderlands and creating uniformity across the empire. Under this circumstance, the Qing had to employ the Chinese derogatory terms of “non-Chinese,” such as *Yi* and *Di*, to defend their legitimacy of ruling when they faced to Han subjects. The *Xiyu tuzhi* was the product of this complex regime: the Manchu chose to compile the first gazetteer of the Western Regions in Chinese instead of in Manchu or in a local language.

We can say that this is a unique aspect of the Qing’s incorporation of the Western Regions, but it was not the only such case that occurred in the process of the dynastic incorporation of borderlands. For example, Leo Shin’s work shows that the Ming state incorporating the borderlands is a story of colonization and acculturation, “but just as significant, it is also a story of demarcation and differentiation.”¹¹⁵ Another example during the Qing involves the Miao people in western Hunan, for whom Qing officials’ interventions were

¹¹⁴ Perdue, *China Marches West*, 338.

¹¹⁵ Leo K. Shin, *The Making of the Chinese State: Ethnicity and Expansion on the Ming Borderlands* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2006), 5.

instrumental in creating “interethnic balance in the region and in the strengthening of ethnic self-consciousness in its various groups.”¹¹⁶

A better understanding of the functions that the *juan* on music in the *Xiyu tuzhi* served would be the starting point to lead us to a broader picture of the Qing’s expansion and how the Qing rulers creatively located and legitimized themselves in the Central State through music. Vertically, the Manchus employed music to justify the Qing empire as a legitimate regime in the Chinese dynastic cycles. Horizontally, they utilized the rhetoric of music differently from preceding Chinese regimes to legitimize Qing’s rule in newly conquered borderlands and harmonized diversities of peoples on frontiers. Thus, musical harmonization is a metaphor for the Qing harmonization (*he*, 和) of the Western Regions: harmony occurs when diversity is maintained, not when uniformity is imposed, though consonance will not result unless diverse elements follow certain rules. The ultimate result is a beautiful song composed of different pitches and sounds.

¹¹⁶ Donald S. Sutton, “Ethnic Revolt in the Qing Empire: The ‘Miao Uprising’ of 1795–1797 Reexamined,” *Asia Major* 16, no. 2 (2003): 144.

Bibliography

Primary Sources:

Da Qing Gaozong Chunhuangdi shilu 大清高宗純皇帝實錄[Completed Records of Emperor Qianlong].

Da Qing Shizong Xianhuangdi shilu 大清世宗憲皇帝實錄 [Completed Records of Emperor Yongzheng].

Fu Heng et al., comps. *Qinding Huangyu Xiyu tuzhi* 欽定皇輿西域圖志 [Imperially Commissioned Illustrated Gazetteer of the Western Regions of the Imperial Domain]. *Siku quanshu* version, 1782.

Fu Heng et al., comps. *Qinding Huangyu Xiyu tuzhi* 欽定皇輿西域圖志 [Imperially Commissioned Illustrated Gazetteer of the Western Regions of the Imperial Domain]. *Hangzhou Bianyi shuju* 杭州便宜書局 version, metal plate, the 1890s. Reprint, Taipei: Wenyou chubanshe, 1965.

Fu Heng et al., comps. *Qinding Huangyu Xiyu tuzhi* 欽定皇輿西域圖志 [Imperially Commissioned Illustrated Gazetteer of the Western Regions of the Imperial Domain]. *Hangzhou Bianyi shuju* 杭州便宜書局 version, metal plate, the 1890s. Reprint, Taipei: Wenhai chubanshe, 1970.

Fu Heng et al., comps. *Qinding Huangyu Xiyu tuzhi* 欽定皇輿西域圖志 [Imperially Commissioned Illustrated Gazetteer of the Western Regions of the Imperial Domain]. *Hangzhou Bianyi shuju* 杭州便宜書局 version, metal plate, the 1890s. Reprinted with preface and notes by Wu Fengpei, Tianjing: Tianjin guji chubanshe, 1986.

- Fu Heng et al., comps. *Qinding Huangyu Xiyu tuzhi* 欽定皇輿西域圖志 [Imperially Commissioned Illustrated Gazetteer of the Western Regions of the Imperial Domain]. Harvard-Yenching Library version. Chinese Local Gazetteers Digitization Project.
- Guo Shi Guan. *Qingshigao jiaozhu* 清史稿校注 [Critical version of the Draft history of the Qing dynasty]. Taipei Xian Xindian Shi: Guo Shi Guan, 1986.
- Harvard University, Academia Sinica, and Peking University, *China Biographical Database* (January 12, 2019), <https://projects.iq.harvard.edu/cbdb>.
- Huijiangzhi* 回疆志 [Gazetteer of the Hui Frontier]. Taipei: Chengwen chubanshe, 1968.
- Jiang Tingxi et al. comps. *Da Qing Yitong zhi* 大清一統志 [Unification Gazetteer of the Qing Great State], 1744.
- Jing Daomo et al., comps. *Guizhou tongzhi* 貴州通志 [Provincial Gazetteer of Guizhou]. Harvard-Yenching Library Chinese Local Gazetteers Digitization Project, 1741.
- Jing Daomo et al., comps. *Yunnan tongzhi* 雲南通志 [Provincial Gazetteer of Yunnan]. Harvard-Yenching Library Chinese Local Gazetteers Digitization Project, 1736.
- Liji* 禮記 [*Book of Rites*], trans. James Legge, C-text, accessed April 22, 2019, <https://ctext.org/liji/zh>.
- Ruan Mingdao, ed. *Xiyu dili tushuo zhu* 西域地理圖說註 [Illustrated geography of the Western Regions]. Yanji: Yanbian daxue chubanshe, 1992.
- Sima Qian. *Shiji* 史記. Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1982.
- The First Historical Archives of China. *Gongzhong gechu dang'an* 宮中各處檔案 [Archives from the Various Palace Depositories].

The First Historical Archives of China. *Qianlong chao hanwen zhupi zouzhe* 乾隆朝漢文硃批奏折 [Palace Memorials in Chinese from the Qianlong Reign].

The First Historical Archives of China. *Qianlongchao shangyudang* 乾隆朝上諭檔 [Edicts of the Qianlong Period].

The Yongzheng emperor. *Dayi juemi lu* 大義覺迷錄 [Narration of the Great Righteousness and Enlightenment]. Harvard-Yenching Library Chinese Rare Book Digitization Project, 1723.

Wang, Zhonghan 王鐘翰 ed. *Qingshi liezhuan* 清史列傳 [Biographies of the Qing Period]. Beijing: Zhonghua Shuju, 1987.

Wu Fengpei, ed. *Xinjiang Hui bu zhi* 新疆回部志 [Gazetteer of the Xinjiang Hui Tribes]. Beijing: Quanguo tushuguan wenxiansuo wei fuzhi zhongxin, 2003.

Xiyu zhi 西域志 [Gazetteer of the Western Regions], 1761.

Yinlu et al., eds. *Yuzhi lülü zhengyi houbian* [Imperially Composed Sequel to the Correct Meaning of the Pitch Pipes], 1746.

Zhong Xinglin, Wang Hao, and Han Hui ed. *Xiyu tuzhi jiaozhu* 西域圖志校注 [A Critical Version of Xiyu tuzhi]. Wulumuqi: Xinjiang renmin chubanshe, 2002.

Secondary Sources:

Ba Zhaoxiang 巴兆祥. “Lun Da Qing Yitongzhi de bianxiu dui qingdai difangzhi de yingxiang” 論《大清一統志》的編修對清代地方志的影響. *Ningxia shehui kexue* 寧夏社會科學 124, no.3 (May 2004): 67–73.

- Baddeley, John F. *Russia, Mongolia, China, Being Some Record of the Relations between them from the Beginning of the XVIIth Century to the Death of the Tsar Alexei Mikhailovich A.D. 1602–1676*. New York: Burt Franklin, 1919.
- Beckwith, Christopher I. *Empires of the Silk Road: A History of Central Eurasia from the Bronze Age to the Present*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2009.
- Brindley, Erica. *Music, Cosmology, and the Politics of Harmony in Early China*. Albany: State University of New York Press, 2012.
- Brook, Timothy, Michael Van Walt Van Praag, and Miek Boltjes ed. *Sacred Mandates: Asian International Relations since Chinggis Khan*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2018.
- Brophy, David. “An Early Manchu Account of the Western Regions.” *Saksaha: A Journal of Manchu Studies* 14 (2016): 25–44.
- Brunnert, Īppolīt Semenovīch, V. V. Hagelstrom, Nikolă Ėedorovīch Kolesov, Andrei Terent'evich Biel'chenko, and Edward Eugene Moran. *Present Day Political Organization of China*. New York: Paragon, 1911.
- Dennis, Joseph R. *Writing, Publishing, and Reading Local Gazetteers in Imperial China, 1100–1700*. Cambridge: Harvard University Asia Center, 2015.
- Di Cosmo, Nicola. *Ancient China and Its Enemies: The Rise of Nomadic Power in East Asian History*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002.
- Durrant, Stephen, Wai-yee Li, and David Schaberg, trans. *Zuo Tradition/Zuozhuan: Commentary on the “Spring and Autumn Annals.”* Seattle: University of Washington Press, 2016.
- Elliott, Mark C. “Frontier Stories: Periphery as Center in Qing History.” *Frontiers of History in China* 9, no. 3 (2014): 336–360.

_____. *The Manchu Way: The Eight Banners and Ethnic Identity in Late Imperial China.*

Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2001.

Elman, Benjamin A. *From Philosophy to Philology: Intellectual and Social Aspects of Change in Late Imperial China.* Los Angeles: UCLA Asian Pacific Monograph Series, 2001.

Enoki Kazuo 榎一雄. “Researches in Chinese Turkestan during the Ch’ien-lung Period, with Special Reference to the Hsi-yü-t’ung-wên-chih.” In *Studia Asiatica: The Collected Papers in Western Languages of the Late Dr. Kazuo Enoki*, 458–71. Tokyo: Kyuko-shoin, 1998.

Herman, John E. “The Cant of Conquest: Tusi Offices and China’s Political Incorporation of the Southwest Frontier.” In *Empire at the Margins: Culture, Ethnicity, and Frontier in Early Modern China*, edited by Pamela Kyle Crossley, Helen F. Siu, and Donald S. Sutton, 135–168. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2006.

Hostetler, Laura. *Qing Colonial Enterprise: Ethnography and Cartography in Early Modern China.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2001.

Hou Deren. *Qingdai xibei bianjiang shidi xue.* Beijing: Qunyan chuban she, 2006.

Hucker, Charles O. *A Dictionary of Official Titles in Imperial China.* Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1985.

Hummel, Arthur W. *Eminent Chinese of the Ch’ing Period (1644–1912).* Reprint. Taipei: Ch’eng Wen Pub., 1970.

Kim, Kwangmin. *Borderland Capitalism: Turkestan Produce, Qing Silver, and the Birth of an Eastern Market.* Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2016.

Levey, Benjamin. “Jungar Refugees and the Making of Empire on Qing China’s Kazakh Frontier, 1759–1773.” PhD diss., Harvard University, 2014.

- Lin Tianwei 林天蔚. *Fangzhi xue yu difangshi yanjiu* 方志學與地方史研究. Taipei: Nantian Shuju, 1995.
- Liu, Lydia He. *The Clash of Empires: The Invention of China in Modern World Making*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2004.
- Loewe, Michael, ed. *Early Chinese Texts: A Bibliographical Guide*. Berkeley: The Society for the Study of Early China, 1993.
- Lv, Changying 呂長穎. “*Xiyu tuzhi bianzuan yu chengshu yanjiu*” 西域圖志編纂與成書研究. Master’s thesis, Xinjiang University, 2012.
- Mayers, William Frederick, and G. M. H. Playfair. *The Chinese Government: A Manual of Chinese Titles, Categorically Arranged and Explained, with an Appendix*. Shanghai: Kelly and Walsh, 1897.
- Milburn, Olivia. *The Spring and Autumn Annals of Master Yan*. Boston: Brill, 2016.
- Millward, James A. “‘Coming onto the Map’: ‘Western Regions’ Geography and Cartographic Nomenclature in the Making of Chinese Empire in Xinjiang.” *Late Imperial China* 20, no. 2 (Dec 1999): 61–98.
- _____. *Beyond the Pass: Economy, Ethnicity, and Empire in Qing Central Asia, 1759–1864*. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1998.
- _____. *Eurasian Crossroads: A History of Xinjiang*. New York: Columbia University Press, 2007.
- Millward, James A. and Laura J. Newby. “The Qing and Islam on the Western Frontier.” In *Empire at the Margins: Culture, Ethnicity, and Frontier in Early Modern China*, edited by Pamela Kyle Crossley, Helen F. Siu, and Donald S. Sutton, 113–134. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2006.

- Mosca, Matthew W. "Cišii's Description of Xinjiang: Its Context and Circulation." In *Xinjiang in the Context of Central Eurasian Transformations*, edited by Shinmen Yasushi, Onuma Takahiro, and David Brophy, 169–200. Tokyo: Tōyō Bunko, 2018.
- _____. "Empire and the Circulation of Frontier Intelligence: Qing Conceptions of the Ottomans." *Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies* 70, 1 (2010): 147–207.
- _____. "The Literati Rewriting of China in the Qianlong-Jiaqing Transition." *Late Imperial China* 32, 2 (2011): 89–132.
- _____. "The Qing State and its Awareness of Eurasian Interconnections, 1789–1806." *Eighteenth - Century Studies* 47, 2 (2014): 103–116.
- _____. *From Frontier Policy to Foreign Policy: The Question of India and the Transformation of Geopolitics in Qing China*. Stanford, California: Stanford University Press, 2013.
- Nappi, Carla Suzan. *The Monkey and the Inkpot: Natural History and Its Transformations in Early Modern China*. Cambridge, Mass: Harvard University Press, 2009.
- Perdue, Peter C. *China Marches West: The Qing Conquest of Central Eurasia*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2005.
- _____. "Military Mobilization in Seventeenth and Eighteenth-Century China, Russia, and Mongolia." *Modern Asian Studies* 30, no. 4 (1996): 757–93.
- Poo, Mu-chou. *Enemies of Civilization: Attitudes toward Foreigners in Ancient Mesopotamia, Egypt, and China*. Albany: State University of New York Press, 2005.
- Qiao Zhizhong, and Hou Deren. "Qianlong Chao guanxiu *Xiyu tuzhi* kaoxi." (Analysis of the State-sponsored *Imperially Commissioned Illustrated Record of the Western Regions* in the Qianlong period) *Studies in Qing History* 1 (2005): 104–113.

- Rawski, Evelyn S. "The Creation of an emperor in Eighteenth-Century China." In *Harmony and Counterpoint: Ritual Music in Chinese Context*, edited by Bell Yung, Evelyn S. Rawski, and Rubie S. Watson, 150–74. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1996.
- Said, Edward W. *Orientalism*. London: Penguin, 2003.
- Shin, Leo K. *The Making of the Chinese State: Ethnicity and Expansion on the Ming Borderlands*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2006.
- Standaert, Nicholas. "Ritual Dances and Their Visual Representation in the Ming and the Qing." *The East Asian Library Journal* 12, no. 1 (2006): 68–181.
- Sutton, Donald S. "Ethnic Revolt in the Qing Empire: The 'Miao Uprising' of 1795–1797 Reexamined." *Asia Major* 16, no. 2 (2003): 105–52.
- Waley-Cohen, Joanna. *Exile in Mid-Qing China: Banishment to Xinjiang, 1758–1820*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1991.
- _____. "The New Qing History." *Radical History Review* 88 (winter 2004): 193–206.
- Wilkinson, Endymion. *Chinese History: A New Manual*. 5th ed (digital). Pleco, 2018.
- Yung, Bell., Evelyn S. Rawski, and Rubie S. Watson ed. *Harmony and Counterpoint: Ritual Music in Chinese Context*. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1996.
- Zhang Sheng 張升. "Siku quanshu guan de jigou yu yunzuo – yi Siku quanshu zhiming biao wei zhongxin de kaocha" 《四庫全書》館的機構與運作——以《四庫全書》職名表為中心的考察. *Beijing shifan daxue xuebao* (Shehui kexue ban) 北京師範大學學報（社會科學版） 201, no.3 (2007): 87–92.

Appendix 1:

List of the Titles for Compilers¹¹⁷

職務 Functions	人物 Names	官職 Titles
總裁 Directors- general of compilation	傅恆 Fu Heng	經筵講官太保保和殿大學士一等忠勇公 Lecturer at the Classics Colloquium, Grand Guardian, Grand Secretary of <i>Baohe dian</i>
	來保 Lai Bao	經筵講官太子太傅武英殿大學士一等忠勇公 Lecturer at the Classics Colloquium, Grand Tutor of the Heir Apparent, Grand Secretary of <i>Wuying dian</i>
	舒赫德 Shuhede	經筵講官太子太保武英殿大學士世襲雲騎尉一等忠勇 公 Lecturer at the Classics Colloquium, Grand Guardian of the Heir Apparent, Grand Secretary of <i>Wuying dian</i>
	阿桂 Agui	經筵日講起居注官太子太保武英殿大學士誠謀英勇公 Lecturer at the Classics Colloquium, Diarist, Grand Guardian of the Heir Apparent, Grand Secretary of <i>Wuying dian</i>
	劉統勛 Liu Tongxun	經筵講官太子太保東閣大學士 Lecturer at the Classics Colloquium, Grand Guardian of the Heir Apparent, Grand Secretary of <i>Dong ge</i>
	兆惠 Zhaohui	經筵講官協辦大學士一等武毅謀勇公 Lecturer at the Classics Colloquium, Assistant Grand Secretary
	阿里袞 Aligun	經筵講官兵部尚書一等果毅公 Lecturer at the Classics Colloquium, President of Board of War
	劉綸 Liu Lun	經筵講官太子太傅文華殿大學士 Lecturer at the Classics Colloquium, Grand Tutor of the Heir Apparent, Grand Secretary of <i>Wenhua dian</i>
	英廉 Yinglian	經筵日講起居注官太子太保東閣大學士 Grand Guardian of the Heir Apparent, Grand Secretary of <i>Dong ge</i>

¹¹⁷ For the translations of titles, I choose to leave out all the honorary titles, such as 一等忠勇公, 誠謀英勇公 and 一等果毅公. Translations of titles are based on Charles O. Hucker, *A Dictionary of Official Titles in Imperial China* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1985), William Frederick Mayers, and G. M. H. Playfair, *The Chinese Government: A Manual of Chinese Titles, Categorically Arranged and Explained, with an Appendix*. (Shanghai: Kelly and Walsh, 1897), and Īppolīt Semenovič Brunnert, V. V. Hagelstrom, Nikolā Fedorovič Kolesov, Andrei Terent'evich Biel'chenko, and Edward Eugene Moran. *Present Day Political Organization of China* (New York: Paragon, 1911). Fu Heng et al., comps. *Qinding Huangyu Xiyu tuzhi* 欽定皇輿西域圖志 [Imperially Commissioned Illustrated Gazetteer of the Western Regions of the Imperial Domain]. Harvard-Yenching Library version. Chinese Local Gazetteers Digitization Project.

	于敏中 Yu Mingzhong	經筵日講起居注官太子太保文華殿大學士世襲輕車都尉 Lecturer at the Classics Colloquium, Diarist, Grand Guardian of the Heir Apparent, Grand Secretary of <i>Wenhua dian</i>
	福康安 Fukang'an	戶部尚書現任四川總督 President of Board of Revenue, Governor-General of Sichuan
	劉墉 Liu Yong	尚書房行走工部尚書 Fellow of the Royal Study, President of Board of Works
	錢汝誠 Qian Rucheng	刑部左侍郎 Senior of Vice-President of Board of Punishments
提調官 Supervising officer ¹¹⁸	珠魯納 Zhuluna	戶部員外郎 Second-class Secretary of Board of Revenue
	保成 Baocheng	光祿寺卿 Director of Court of Imperial Entertainments
	慶桂 Qinggui	內閣學士兼禮部侍郎銜署吏部侍郎事軍功加三級 Sub-Chancellor of the Grand Secretariat Vice-President of Board of Ceremonies Vice-President of Board of Punishments
	伊江阿 Yijiang	戶部銀庫員外 Supernumerary of Board of Revenue
	顧雲 Gu Yun	吏部員外郎 Second-class Secretary of Board of Civil Office
	王昶 Wang Chang	刑部員外郎 Second-class Secretary of Board of Punishments
	劉謹之 Liu Jinzhi	戶部郎中 Senior Secretary of Board of Revenue
	汪日章 Wang Rizhang	兵部主事 Second-class Assistant Secretary of Board of War
纂修官 Compilers	褚廷璋 Chu Tingzhang	日講起居注官翰林院侍讀學士 Diarist, Reader of the Hanlin Academy
	何國宗 He Guozong	翰林院編修 The Hanlin Academy Compiler (second class)
	邱庭瀛 Qiu Tinglong	翰林院編修 The Hanlin Academy Compiler (second class)
收掌官 Keepers ¹¹⁹	德成 Decheng	內務府筆帖式 Official Writer of the Imperial Household

¹¹⁸ Supervising officers were a general term referring to people who supervised the compilation of the work. In some situation, they handled allocating and distributing the books during the process of compilation. Because at the time, all of the drafts needed to be kept in the Hanlin Academy and be checked every day to prevent people from bringing any of them out secretly. Zhang Sheng, "Siku quanshu guan de jigou yu yunzuo," 90; Wilkinson, *Chinese History*, 70.4.3.

¹¹⁹ Keepers were in charge of keeping the drafts of the work. Ibid.

	敷倫太 Fulongtai	戶部員外郎 Second-class Secretary of Board of Revenue
	舒濂 Shulian	刑部主事 Second-class Assistant Secretary of Board of Punishments
	張霽 Zhang Ji	刑部主事 Second-class Assistant Secretary of Board of Punishments
	吳熊光 Wu Xiongguang	內閣侍讀 Assistant Readers of the Grand Secretariat
	蔣謝庭 Jiang Xieting	工部主事 Second-class Assistant Secretary of Board of Works
膳錄官 Final-draft copyists ¹²⁰	江炯 Jiang Jiong	舉人 Provincial Graduate
	陳基德 Chen Jide	舉人 Provincial Graduate
	徐觀海 Xu Guanhai	舉人 Provincial Graduate
	佟克昌 Tong Kechang	舉人 Provincial Graduate
	蔣業謙 Jiang Yeqian	舉人 Provincial Graduate
	李維寅 Li Wei Yin	舉人 Provincial Graduate

¹²⁰ Final-draft copyists were responsible for copying all the contents of the work for final publication. Wilkinson, *Chinese History*, 70.4.3.

Appendix 2:

Title	<i>Huijiang zhi</i> 回疆志	<i>Xinjiang huibu zhi</i> 新疆回部志
Comparisons of the section dealing with instruments	<p>樂器</p> <p>大鼓徑二尺餘，高尺餘。小鼓徑尺餘，高三吋餘。鼓圈以生鐵鑄就，羊皮挽之。</p> <p>噴吶喇叭，均與內地者無異。</p> <p>每日未申間，登高臺作樂，以送日行陣間，亦用為號令。其宴會之樂器，有鼓徑尺六七吋，高一吋，以羊皮挽之，或染綠或染紅鼓圈。鼓？面密釘小鐵環，不用槌，以手拍之。</p> <p>胡琴用鋼絃十根，馬尾絃二股，用弓磨拉絃子。用桑木為之，三尺餘，有二皮絃五綱絃。又有名為胡撥類琵琶者，用皮絃四根，綱絃三根。洋琴長三尺，寬二尺，用十二雙綱絃，兩邊各一單綱絃，名曰喀淪。¹²¹</p>	<p>樂器<u>土</u></p> <p>大鼓徑二尺餘，高尺餘。小鼓徑尺餘許，高三吋許。鼓圈以生鐵鑄<u>成</u>，羊皮挽之。</p> <p>噴吶喇叭，均與內地者<u>同</u>。</p> <p>每日未申間，登高臺作樂，<u>送日行陣</u>，亦用為號令。其宴會之樂<u>送日行陣</u>，有鼓徑尺六七吋，高三吋 <u>挽以羊皮</u>，<u>或染紅綠</u>。鼓圈<u>內面密釘小鐵環</u>，不用<u>杖擊</u>，以手拍之。</p> <p>胡琴用銅絃十<u>馬尾絃二</u>，用弓磨拉<u>作聲</u>。絃子用桑木<u>作</u>，長三尺餘，<u>皮絃二銅絃五</u>。<u>又</u>名為胡撥類琵琶者，用皮絃四銅絃<u>三</u>。<u>羊琴長三尺，寬二尺，用十二雙銅絃，兩邊各一單銅絃，名曰喀淪。</u></p> <p><u>凡伯克等宴會，則有跣銅繩掄刀耍盤變戲法闢羊幼童翻筋斗之戲。又有四五回人，坐地鳴鼓作樂。二回婦對舞者，亦有韋回歌唱者，亦有一回在地舞蹈歌唱者。</u>¹²²</p>

(I underline the different parts in the *Xinjiang huibu zhi* comparing to the *Huijiang zhi*.)

¹²¹ *Huijiangzhi*, 59–61.

¹²² Wu Fengpei, ed., *Xinjiang Hui bu zhi*, 26–27.