Improvised Great Ages: The Creating of *Qingming shengshi*

by

Su-Chen Chang

A THESIS SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF
THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

in

THE FACULTY OF GRADUATE STUDIES

(Art History and Theory)

THE UNIVERSITY OF BRITISH COLUMBIA

(Vancouver)

April 2013

© Su-Chen Chang, 2013
Abstract

From the Ming to the Qing dynasty, *Qingming shanghe tu* was among the paintings most frequently copied by professional painters and most often collected and viewed by urban residents, merchants, scholar officials and nobles. Over one hundred copies are extant. Modern scholars have disregarded these paintings, considering them not as "original works" but as mere copies and/or forgeries after Zhang Zeduan or Qiu Ying. This thesis proves their value by showing that though based on earlier works, *Qingming* painters created distinctive paintings that visualized pre-modern viewers’ various conceptions of a “great age,” an ideal society from the traditional Chinese perspective—*Qingming Shengshi*.

Through comparisons of the earliest *Qingming* scroll by Zhang Zeduan of the Song dynasty and six selected *Qingming* paintings from the sixteenth to the eighteenth century, my thesis shows that later painters reinterpreted the subject matter, copied and modified original motifs, and added new motifs drawn from contemporary life experiences and concerns. That is, these painters created new paintings using the title and structure of the well-known Zhang Zeduan scroll.

Many Ming-Qing viewers stated that the *Qingming* scrolls were portrayals of a prosperous age. My analysis shows that themes in these paintings relate closely to the economic success and social changes in this period. In other words, painters and patrons extracted elements of the prosperity and cultural transformations of their age to design paintings based on the notion of *Qingming shengshi*.

The variety of these scrolls and responses via inscriptions demonstrate that people from various backgrounds and different times and places held diverse views of an ideal world. Analysis of the six paintings reveals that over time this ideal world grew from a smaller prosperous economy to a much larger one, and changed from one where humble
customs were followed to a much more luxurious, unrestrained and fashion-conscious way of living. Despite these changes, certain conservative ideas were preserved. Such traits demonstrate that people’s view of a great age was a dynamic conjunction of various conventions and new fashions, and lead us to believe that this was a new mode of visual cultural production: a model of improvisation.
# Table of Contents

Abstract...................................................................................................................................................... ii

Table of Contents....................................................................................................................................... iv

List of Tables .............................................................................................................................................. vii

List of Figures........................................................................................................................................... viii

Acknowledgements ................................................................................................................................... xxv

Introduction............................................................................................................................................... 1

Chapter 1. Copying *Qingming shanghe tu* .............................................................................................. 23

1.1. Copy and Forgery ................................................................................................................................. 24

1.2. Literature Concerning Copies and Forgeries of the *Qingming* Paintings ........................................ 30

1.2.1. *Siben, Linben, Moben, and Fangben* ........................................................................................... 31

1.2.2. *Gaoben, Zhenben, and Yanben* .................................................................................................. 35

1.2.3. *Fenben* ....................................................................................................................................... 44

1.3. Evidence of Copying and Forgery in the *Qingming* Scrolls ............................................................. 48

1.3.1. Copied Motifs ............................................................................................................................... 49

1.3.2. Fake Signatures ............................................................................................................................ 56

1.4. Copyists and Forgers ........................................................................................................................ 63

1.5. Collectors and Viewers ...................................................................................................................... 68

Chapter 2. Creating *Qingming shanghe tu* .............................................................................................. 79

2.1. *Qingming* Painting as a Portrayal of a Peaceful and Prosperous Age .............................................. 79

2.2. Constructing an Ideal World .............................................................................................................. 88

2.2.1. Jiangnan in Springtime ............................................................................................................... 92

2.2.2. Thriving Urban Economy .......................................................................................................... 100

2.2.2.1. Urban Economic Scales ....................................................................................................... 101
2.2.2.2. Textiles Used throughout the World .......................................................... 102
Expanding Silk Business and Consumption ......................................................... 103
Prevalence of Cotton Fabrics and Active Cotton Trade ........................................ 110
Popular Ready-made Textile Products .................................................................. 117
2.2.2.3. Coming to Town: Farm Products and Laborers ........................................ 118
2.2.2.4. Luxury Commodities: Antiques and Work of Art .................................... 120
2.2.2.5. Exotica and Vigorous Long Distance Trade ............................................ 122
2.2.2.6. Currency Service as an Industry .............................................................. 127
2.2.3. Conspicuous Consumption and Fashion ..................................................... 131
2.2.3.1. Lavish Equipment for Outings ................................................................. 132
2.2.3.2. Fashionable Outfits .................................................................................. 135
2.2.4. Existing Government Structure and Social Order ......................................... 141
2.2.5. Transforming Human Relationships ........................................................... 148
2.2.5.1. Intimate Family Relationships ................................................................. 148
2.2.5.2. Changing Gender Relationships and Images of Women ......................... 151
2.2.6. Secularizing Religious Life ........................................................................... 166
2.2.6.1. Buddhism: From Offering Spiritual Support to Practical Rewards .......... 167
2.2.6.2. Folk Religions: Their Benefits through Ritual Practices ............................ 174
2.2.7. Celebrating a Great Age: Entertainment and Leisure Activities ................. 178
2.2.7.1. Entertainment .......................................................................................... 179
2.2.7.2. Leisure activities ...................................................................................... 187

Chapter 3. Responding to *Qingming shanghe tu* .................................................. 193

3.1. Wan Shide: Glamorizing the Gold Terrace and a *Shengshi* ............................ 194
3.2. Wang Shizhen: Reflecting on the Rise and Fall of a *Shengshi* ....................... 212
3.3. Prince Bao: Warning Against Extravagance in a *Shengshi* ............................ 220

Conclusion ............................................................................................................. 227
Bibliography .......................................................................................................................... 232

Appendices ........................................................................................................................................... 254

Appendix A: Grouping and Dating the Popular Qingming Scrolls .................................................. 254

Appendix B: Tables ............................................................................................................................... 259

Appendix C: Figures ............................................................................................................................. 276
List of Tables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table 1</td>
<td>THE SIX VERSIONS OF QINGMING PAINTINGS CURRENTLY UNDER STUDY</td>
<td>259</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 2</td>
<td>VIEWERS/COLLECTORS OF THE POPULAR VERSIONS OF QINGMING SHANGHE TU</td>
<td>260</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 3</td>
<td>GROUPING AND DATING THE SELECTED SIX QINGMING SCROLLS</td>
<td>269</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 4</td>
<td>URBAN ECONOMY</td>
<td>270</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 5</td>
<td>GENDER RELATIONSHIP AND IMAGES OF WOMEN</td>
<td>272</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 6</td>
<td>RELIGIONS</td>
<td>273</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table 7</td>
<td>ENTERTAINMENT</td>
<td>274</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of Figures

FIG. 1.  **Zhang Zeduan, Qingming Shanghe tu**, Northern Song, Ink and color on silk, 24.8 x

528.7 cm, ............................................................................................................................276

FIG. 2.  **Zhao Zhe, Qingming Shanghe tu**, 1577, Ink and color on silk, 28.7 x 576 cm,

Hayashibara Museum of Art .................................................................................................277

FIG. 3.  **Anonymous (fake Qiu Ying), Qingming Shanghe tu**, early seventeenth century, Ink

and color on silk, 30.5 x 987.5 cm, Liaoning Provincial Museum (Liaoning A) ...............278

FIG. 4.  **Anonymous (fake Zhang Zeduan), Qingming Shanghe tu**, early seventeenth century,

Ink and color on silk, 30.6 x 725.6 cm, Liaoning Provincial Museum (Liaoning B) .........279

FIG. 5.  **Anonymous (fake Qiu Ying), Qingming Shanghe tu**, mid-seventeenth century, Ink and

color on silk, 34.8 x 804.2 cm, National Palace Museum, Taipei (Taipei A) .................280

FIG. 6.  **Anonymous (fake Zhang Zeduan), Qingming yujian tu (Qingming in Brief)**,

mid-seventeenth century, Ink and color on silk, 38 x 673.4 cm, National Palace Museum,

Taipei (Taipei B) ..................................................................................................................281

FIG. 7.  **Anonymous (fake Qiu Ying), Qingming Shanghe tu**, eighteenth century, Ink and color

on silk, 24.8 x 1005.84 cm, Metropolitan Museum of Art (Metropolitan version) ........282

FIG. 8.  **Qiu Ying, Mountain Birds by a Pine Stream**, leaf of the album Paintings in the Styles of

Song Masters, Ink and color on silk, 27.2 x 25.2 cm, Shanghai Museum .......................283

FIG. 9.  **Anonymous, Mountain Birds by a Pine Stream**, Southern Song Dynasty, album leaf,

Ink and color on silk, 25.3 x 25.3 cm, Palace Museum, Beijing ......................................283

FIG. 10. **Qiu Ying, section of Spring Morning in the Han Palace**, handscroll, Ink and color on silk,

30.6 x 574.1 cm, National Palace Museum, Taipei ...............................................................284

FIG. 11. **Attributed to Song Huizong (Zhao Ji), section of Palace Ladies Preparing Silk**,

Handscroll, Ink and color on silk, 37 x 147 cm, Museum of Fine Art, Boston ...............284

FIG. 12. **Attributed to Zhou Fang, section of Palace Ladies Playing Chess**, handscroll, Ink and

color on silk, 28.8 x 115 cm, National Palace Museum, Taipei .........................................284
FIG. 13. QIU YING, SECTION OF SPRING MORNING IN THE HAN PALACE ................................................................. 285

FIG. 14. GU HONGZHONG, SECTION OF A NIGHT ENTERTAINMENT OF HAN XIZAI, TENTH CENTURY,
HANDSCROLL, INK AND COLOR ON SILK, 28.7 X 335.5 CM, PALACE MUSEUM, BEIJING ....................... 285

FIG. 15. GU HONGZHONG, SECTION OF A NIGHT ENTERTAINMENT OF HAN XIZAI ................................. 285

FIG. 16. HUANG GONGWANG, DWELLING IN THE FUCUN MOUNTAINS: THE REMAINING MOUNTAIN 31.8 X 51.4
CM, AND MASTER WUYONG SCROLL 33 X 636.9 CM, 1350, INK ON PAPER, ZHEJIANG PROVINCIAL
MUSEUM AND NATIONAL PALACE MUSEUM, TAIPEI ................................................................. 286

FIG. 17. SHEN ZHOU, IN IMITATION OF HUANG GONGWANG’S DWELLING IN THE FUCUN MOUNTAINS, 1487, INK
AND COLOR ON PAPER, 36.8 X 855 CM, PALACE MUSEUM, BEIJING ........................................ 286

FIG. 18. HUANG GONGWANG, SECTION OF DWELLING IN THE FUCUN MOUNTAINS .................................. 287

FIG. 19. SHEN ZHOU, SECTION OF IN IMITATION OF HUANG GONGWANG’S DWELLING IN THE FUCUN
MOUNTAINS ................................................................................................................................. 287

FIG. 20. P4517.4. POUNCE, QIANFO (1000 BUDDHA) COMPOSITION, PELLIOT COLLECTION, BIBLIOTEQUE
NATIONALE ........................................................................................................................................ 288

FIG. 21. ATTRIBUTED TO WU ZONGYUAN (D. 1050), SECTION OF CELESTIAL RULES OF DAOISM IN
PROCESSION, INK ON SILK, 57.8 X 790 CM, COLLECTION OF C.C. WANG, NEW YORK ............... 288

FIG. 22. GU JIANLONG, LEAF FROM ALBUM OF SKETCHES (FENBEN) AFTER OLD MASTERS, INK AND COLOR ON
PAPER, 30.2 X 18.8 CM, NELSON-ATKINS MUSEUM OF ART, KANSAS CITY ........................................ 288

FIG. 23. RETURNING FROM A HUNTING EXCURSION, DETAIL OF ZHANG ZEDUAN VERSION ....................... 289

FIG. 24. WEDDING PROCESSION, DETAIL OF ZHAO ZHE VERSION ............................................................... 289

FIG. 25. WEDDING PROCESSION, DETAIL OF LIAONING A ......................................................................... 290

FIG. 26. WEDDING PROCESSION, DETAIL OF TAIPEI A ............................................................................. 290

FIG. 27. WEDDING PROCESSION, DETAIL OF METROPOLITAN VERSION ............................................... 291

FIG. 28. WEDDING PROCESSION, DETAIL OF LIAONING B ......................................................................... 291

FIG. 29. WEDDING PROCESSION, DETAIL OF TAIPEI B ............................................................................. 292

FIG. 30. ARCHED BRIDGE AND POTENTIAL BOAT COLLISION, DETAIL OF ZHANG ZEDUAN VERSION .......... 292
FIG. 31. ARCHED BRIDGE, DETAIL OF ZHAO ZHE VERSION .................................................................293
FIG. 32. ARCHED BRIDGE, DETAIL OF LIAONING A .................................................................293
FIG. 33. ARCHED BRIDGE, DETAIL OF TAIPEI A .................................................................294
FIG. 34. ARCHED BRIDGE, DETAIL OF METROPOLITAN VERSION ..............................................294
FIG. 35. ARCHED BRIDGE, DETAIL OF LIAONING B .................................................................295
FIG. 36. ARCHED BRIDGE, DETAIL OF TAIPEI B .................................................................295
FIG. 37. PEOPLE THROWING ROPE FROM THE BRIDGE, DETAIL OF ZHANG ZEDUAN VERSION ....296
FIG. 38. EFFORTS TO SAVE THE BOAT, DETAIL OF ZHANG ZEDUAN VERSION ................................296
FIG. 39. PEOPLE ON THE BOAT YELLING AND POINTING, DETAIL OF ZHAO ZHE VERSION ..........296
FIG. 40. PEOPLE THROWING ROPE FROM THE BRIDGE, DETAIL OF LIAONING B .........................296
FIG. 41. A MAN READY TO CATCH A ROPE, DETAIL OF LIAONING B ........................................296
FIG. 42. PEOPLE ON THE BRIDGE, DETAIL OF TAIPEI B ............................................................296
FIG. 43. A MAN STANDING IN THE FRONT OF A BOAT, DETAIL OF TAIPEI B ..................................297
FIG. 44. A PLEASURE BOAT PASSING UNDER THE BRIDGE, DETAIL OF TAIPEI B .................297
FIG. 45. CITY GATE, DETAIL OF ZHANG ZEDUAN VERSION .......................................................297
FIG. 46. LAND GATE AND WATER GATE, DETAIL OF ZHAO ZHE VERSION ................................297
FIG. 47. LAND GATE AND WATER GATE, DETAIL OF LIAONING A ............................................297
FIG. 48. LAND GATE AND WATER GATE, DETAIL OF TAIPEI A ...............................................297
FIG. 49. LAND GATE AND WATER GATE, DETAIL OF METROPOLITAN VERSION .......................298
FIG. 50. LAND GATE AND WATER GATE, DETAIL OF LIAONING B ............................................298
FIG. 51. LAND GATE AND WATER GATE, DETAIL OF TAIPEI B ...............................................298
FIG. 52. CAMELS PASSING THROUGH THE CITY GATE, DETAIL OF ZHANG ZEDUAN VERSION ..........298
FIG. 53. CAMELS AND AN OX PASSING THROUGH THE CITY GATE, DETAIL OF ZHAO ZHE VERSION ..................................................299
FIG. 54. CAMELS AND AN OX PASSING THROUGH THE CITY GATE, DETAIL OF LIAONING A ....299
FIG. 55. CAMELS AND AN OX PASSING THROUGH THE CITY GATE, DETAIL OF TAIPEI A ..............300
FIG. 56. CAMELS AND AN OX PASSING THROUGH THE CITY GATE, TAIPEI B ..........................300
FIG. 57. CAMELS AND AN OX PASSING THROUGH THE CITY GATE, DETAIL OF METROPOLITAN VERSION. .....301

FIG. 58. AN OFFICIAL AND HIS ESCORTS, DETAIL OF ZHANG ZEDUAN VERSION...........................................301

FIG. 59. OFFICIALS AND ESCORTS, ZHAO ZHE VERSION.................................................................302

FIG. 60. OFFICIALS AND ESCORTS, LIAONING A .................................................................................302

FIG. 61. OFFICIALS AND ESCORTS, TAIPEI A ...................................................................................302

FIG. 62. OFFICIALS AND ESCORTS, METROPOLITAN VERSION.........................................................302

FIG. 63. OFFICIALS AND ESCORTS, LIAONING B .................................................................................302

FIG. 64. OFFICIALS AND ESCORTS, TAIPEI B ...................................................................................302

FIG. 65. WORKERS CONSTRUCTING A HOUSE, ZHAO ZHE VERSION..................................................303

FIG. 66. WORKERS CONSTRUCTING A HOUSE (RIGHT); THE IMPERIAL GARDEN (LEFT), LIAONING B ....304

FIG. 67. WORKERS CONSTRUCTING A HOUSE (RIGHT); THE IMPERIAL GARDEN (LEFT), TAIPEI A ........304

FIG. 68. WORKERS CONSTRUCTING A HOUSE (RIGHT); THE IMPERIAL GARDEN (LEFT), LIAONING A ....305

FIG. 69. WORKERS CONSTRUCTING A HOUSE (RIGHT); PALACE LADIES ON AN OUTING (LEFT), TAIPEI B .....305

FIG. 70. WORKERS CONSTRUCTING A HOUSE, METROPOLITAN VERSION.............................................306

FIG. 71. HUNTING (RIGHT), DISPLAYS OF MILITARY SKILLS (CENTER), AND VILLAGE (LEFT), METROPOLITAN
VERSION...................................................................................................................................................306

FIG. 72. SIGNATURE, LIAONING B .........................................................................................................307

FIG. 73. SIGNATURE, TAIPEI B .............................................................................................................307

FIG. 74. SIGNATURE, LIAONING A .....................................................................................................307

FIG. 75. SIGNATURE, TAIPEI A .............................................................................................................307

FIG. 76. SIGNATURE, METROPOLITAN VERSION ..............................................................................307

FIG. 77. SIGNATURE, ZHAO ZHE VERSION ..........................................................................................307

FIG. 78. HUANG BIAO, SECTION OF THE NINE ELDERS, 1594, HANDSCROLL, INK AND COLOR ON SILK, 27.2 X
193 CM, NATIONAL PALACE MUSEUM, TAIPEI .....................................................................................308

FIG. 79. HUANG BIAO, INSCRIPTION FOLLOWING THE NINE ELDERS, 1594. ........................................308

FIG. 80. HUANG BIAO, DETAIL OF THE NINE ELDERS, 1594, NATIONAL PALACE MUSEUM, TAIPEI ........308
FIG. 81. WANG BIAO, SECTIONS OF *THE PEACH SPRING IN IMMORTAL REALMS*, C. 1558, HANDSCROLL, INK AND COLOR ON SILK. .................................................................................................................. 309

FIG. 82. DETAIL OF *SEEING-OFF AT XUNYANG RIVER.* .................................................................................................................. 310

FIG. 83. MOUNTAINS, LIAONING A. ................................................................................................................................. 310

FIG. 84. PINE TREE, TAIPEI B. ................................................................................................................................. 310

FIG. 85. PINE TREE, LIAONING B. ................................................................................................................................. 310

FIG. 86. WAN SHIDE, INSCRIPTION ON ZHAO ZHE VERSION. ...................................................................................... 310

FIG. 87. LI DONGYANG, DETAIL OF COLOPHON OF ZHANG ZEDUAN VERSION. .................................................................................. 311

FIG. 88. ANONYMOUS, DETAIL OF *QINGMING SHANGHE TU*, HANDSCROLL, INK AND COLOR ON SILK.

MARTOPOLITAN MUSEUM OF ART. ................................................................................................................................. 311

FIG. 89. GUI FU, COLOPHON ON ZHAO ZHE VERSION........................................................................................................ 311

FIG. 90. DRAMA PERFORMANCE, LIAONING A VERSION. ........................................................................................... 312

FIG. 91. DRAMA PERFORMANCE, TAIPEI A. ..................................................................................................................... 313

FIG. 92. IMPERIAL GARDEN, LIAONING A. ..................................................................................................................... 313

FIG. 93. IMPERIAL GARDEN, TAIPEI A. ..................................................................................................................... 314

FIG. 94. ACROBATIC PERFORMANCE, ZHAO ZHE VERSION. ........................................................................................ 314

FIG. 95. ACROBATIC PERFORMANCE, LIAONING A. ................................................................................................. 314

FIG. 96. ACROBATIC PERFORMANCE, TAIPEI A. ........................................................................................................ 314

FIG. 97. ACROBATIC PERFORMANCE, METROPOLITAN VERSION. ..................................................................... 314

FIG. 98. ACROBATIC PERFORMANCE, LIAONING B. ........................................................................................................ 314

FIG. 99. ACROBATIC PERFORMANCE, TAIPEI B. ........................................................................................................ 314

FIG. 100. MOUNTAINS, LIAONING A. ..................................................................................................................... 315

FIG. 101. HUQIU MOUNTAINS, WOODBLOCK PRINT, *XINJUAN HAINEI QIGUAN*. .................................................. 315

FIG. 102. ILLUSTRATION, WOODBLOCK PRINT, *SANCAI TUHUI*. ........................................................................... 315

FIG. 103. ILLUSTRATION, WOODBLOCK PRINT, *YUCHU JI*. ......................................................................................... 316

FIG. 104. DETAIL OF TAIPEI A. ................................................................................................................................. 316
Fig. 105. Illustration, woodblock print, *Yuanyang meng* ..........................................................316

Fig. 106. Mountains, Taipei A ..........................................................317

Fig. 107. Ding Yunping, *Landscape*, hanging scroll, 1585 ..........................................................317

Fig. 108. Landscape, woodblock print, *Fangshi mopu*, 1594: 222 ..................................................318

Fig. 109. Wang Jinku 汪晉穀, *Tamed Dragon Pine*, 1679, woodblock print published in Huangshan zhi ..........................................................318

Fig. 110. Jianjiang, *Tamed Dragon Pine*, leaf from an album of scenes of Huangshan, ink on paper, Beijing Palace Museum ..........................................................318

Fig. 111. Lan Ying, detail of *White Clouds and Red Trees*, 1658, 48 x 189.4 cm ........................................318

Fig. 112. Inscription on Liaoning B ..........................................................319

Fig. 113. Men wearing piaopiao jin, Taipei B ..........................................................319

Fig. 114. Men wearing piaopiao jin, illustration in *Boan Furong ying* 沛庵芙蓉影, 1634, Suzhou woodblock print ..........................................................319

Fig. 115. City gate, Metropolitan version ..........................................................320

Fig. 116. Details of the Chang Gate in *Three Hundred Sixty Occupations*, 1734, woodblock prints, ink and hand-painted color on paper, 108.6 x 55.9 cm, and 108.6 x 55.6 cm, Oshaio Museum, Hiroshima ..........................................................320

Fig. 117. Chen Mei et al., detail of *Qingming shanghe tu*, Qing court version, 1737, handscroll, ink and color on silk, 35.6 x 1152.8 cm, National Palace Museum, Taipei ..........................................................320

Fig. 118. Xu Yang, detail of *Bourgeoing Life in a Resplendent Age*, handscroll, ink and color on paper, 36.5 x 1241 cm, 1759, Liaoning Provinical Museum ..........................................................320

Fig. 119. Peach blossoms and willows, Zhao Zhe version ..........................................................321

Fig. 120. Peach blossoms and willows, Liaoning A ..........................................................321

Fig. 121. Peach blossoms and willows, Taipei A ..........................................................321

Fig. 122. Peach blossoms and willows, Metropolitan version ..........................................................321

Fig. 123. Peach blossoms and willows, Liaoning B ..........................................................321
FIG. 124. PEACH BLOSSOMS AND WILLOWS, TAPEI B. .................................................................321
FIG. 125. COUNTRYSIDE, ZHAO ZHE VERSION .................................................................321
FIG. 126. COUNTRYSIDE, LIAONING A. .............................................................................322
FIG. 127. COUNTRYSIDE, TAPEI A ..................................................................................323
FIG. 128. COUNTRYSIDE, LIAONING B. .............................................................................323
FIG. 129. COUNTRYSIDE, TAPEI B ..................................................................................324
FIG. 130. COUNTRYSIDE, METROPOLITAN VERSION ......................................................324
FIG. 131. ATTRIBUTED TO QIU YING (C.1509-1551), THREE DETAILS OF VILLAGE LIFE, PEACH BLOSSOM SPRING, INK AND COLOR ON SILK, 33 X 472 CM, MUSEUM OF FINE ARTS, BOSTON .................................................................325
FIG. 132. QIU YING (ATT.), PEACH BLOSSOM SPRING, OPENING SECTION AND DETAIL OF ENTRANCE TO A GROTTO. .................................................................................................................326
FIG. 133. SILK FABRIC STORE, ZHANG ZEDUAN VERSION ..................................................327
FIG. 134. SILK FABRIC STORE AND SINGING GIRLS, ZHAO ZHE VERSION .........................327
FIG. 135. SILK FABRIC STORE AND SINGING GIRL, LIAONING A .......................................327
FIG. 136. SILK FABRIC STORE AND SINGING GIRLS, TAPEI A ............................................328
FIG. 137. SILK FABRIC STORE AND SINGING GIRLS, METROPOLITAN VERSION ..............328
FIG. 138. SILK FABRIC STORE, LIAONING B. .....................................................................328
FIG. 139. STORE FOR INSPECTING AND BUYING FABRICS INCLUDING SILK XIUBO, LIAONING B .................................................................329
FIG. 140. SILK FABRIC STORE, TAPEI B ............................................................................329
FIG. 141. SILK THREAD STORE, ZHAO ZHE VERSION .......................................................329
FIG. 142. SILK THREAD STORE, LIAONING A ...................................................................329
FIG. 143. SILK THREAD STORE, TAPEI A ..........................................................................329
FIG. 144. BANNERS ADVERTISING SILK THREADS, TAPEI B .................................................330
FIG. 145. COTTON FABRIC SHOP, ZHAO ZHE VERSION ....................................................330
FIG. 146. COTTON FABRIC SHOP, LIAONING A ................................................................330
FIG. 147. COTTON FABRIC SHOP, TAPEI A ......................................................................330
FIG. 148. COTTON FABRIC SHOP, METROPOLITAN VERSION. .....................................................330
FIG. 149. COTTON FABRIC ITINERANT PEDDLER, ZHAO ZHE VERSION. ................................331
FIG. 150. COTTON FABRIC SHOP, TAIPEI A. .........................................................................331
FIG. 151. COTTON FABRIC BOOTH, LIAONING B. .................................................................331
FIG. 152. COTTON FABRIC BOOTH, TAIPEI B .......................................................................331
FIG. 153. COTTON FABRICS FROM WUSONG, TAIPEI B .........................................................331
FIG. 154. COTTON RAW FIBER STORE, LIAONING B ..........................................................332
FIG. 155. COTTON YARN SHOP, LIAONING A ........................................................................332
FIG. 156. COTTON YARN SHOP, METROPOLITAN VERSION ...............................................332
FIG. 157. COTTON YARN, TAIPEI B .......................................................................................332
FIG. 158. DYE HOUSE, ZHAO ZHE VERSION ........................................................................332
FIG. 159. DYE HOUSE, LIAONING A .....................................................................................332
FIG. 160. DYE HOUSE, TAIPEI A .........................................................................................332
FIG. 161. DYE HOUSE, METROPOLITAN VERSION ..............................................................332
FIG. 162. DYE HOUSE, TAIPEI B ...........................................................................................333
FIG. 163. DYE HOUSE, LIAONING B ......................................................................................333
FIG. 164. A STORE SELLING DYESTUFF, TAIPEI B ..............................................................333
FIG. 165. COTTON FABRIC AGENT, LIAONING A ..................................................................333
FIG. 166. COTTON FABRIC AGENT, TAIPEI A ......................................................................333
FIG. 167. COTTON FABRIC VENDERS, METROPOLITAN VERSION .......................................333
FIG. 168. COTTON FABRIC STORE, METROPOLITAN VERSION ..........................................334
FIG. 169. READY-MADE GARMENTS, ZHAO ZHE VERSION ...............................................334
FIG. 170. READY-MADE GARMENTS AND TAILOR’S SHOP, LIAONING A .........................334
FIG. 171. READY-MADE GARMENTS AND TAILOR’S SHOP, TAIPEI A ...............................334
FIG. 172. READY-MADE GARMENTS, METROPOLITAN VERSION ......................................334
FIG. 173. SOCK SELLER, ZHAO ZHE VERSION ....................................................................334
FIG. 174. SOCK SELLER, LIAONING A .................................................................334
FIG. 175. SOCK SELLER, TAIPEI A ..................................................................335
FIG. 176. SOCK SELLER, METROPOLITAN VERSION ......................................335
FIG. 177. HANDKERCHIEF PEDDLER, ZHAO ZHE VERSION ...........................335
FIG. 178. HANDKERCHIEF SHOP, LIAONING A ...........................................335
FIG. 179. HANDKERCHIEF STALL, TAIPEI A ...............................................335
FIG. 180. HANDKERCHIEF STALL, METROPOLITAN VERSION ....................335
FIG. 181. READY-MADE GARMENTS, TAIPEI B ............................................335
FIG. 182. BRINGING GOATS TO TOWN, ZHAO ZHE VERSION ......................336
FIG. 183. BRINGING GOATS TO TOWN, METROPOLITAN VERSION ..............336
FIG. 184. HERDING PIGS TO TOWN, METROPOLITAN VERSION ....................336
FIG. 185. HURRYING WATERTO TOWN, LIAONING A ....................................336
FIG. 186. HURRYING WATERTO TOWN, LIAONING B ....................................336
FIG. 187. HURRYING WATERTO TOWN, TAIPEI B ........................................336
FIG. 188. TRANSPORTING PLANTS TO TOWN, TAIPEI B .............................336
FIG. 189. LABORERS, ZHAO ZHE .................................................................337
FIG. 190. LABORERS, LIAONING A ...............................................................337
FIG. 191. LABORERS, TAIPEI A .................................................................337
FIG. 192. LABORERS, METROPOLITAN VERSION ..........................................337
FIG. 193. LABORERS, LIAONING B ...............................................................338
FIG. 194. LABORERS, TAIPEI B .................................................................338
FIG. 195. ANTIQUE SHOP, ZHAO ZHE VERSION ..........................................338
FIG. 196. ANTIQUE PEDDLER, ZHAO ZHE VERSION ....................................338
FIG. 197. ANTIQUE SHOP, LIAONING A ......................................................338
FIG. 198. ANTIQUE PEDDLER, LIAONING A ................................................338
FIG. 199. ANTIQUE SHOP, TAIPEI A ............................................................339
Fig. 200. Antique peddler, Taipei A. ................................................................. 339

Fig. 201. Antique shop, Metropolitan version. .................................................. 339

Fig. 202. Antique booth, Liaoning B. ............................................................... 339

Fig. 203. Antique booth and shop, Taipei B. ...................................................... 339

Fig. 204. Fans from Japan, Taipei A. ............................................................... 339

Fig. 205. Products from Shangdong (northeast), Taipei B. ............................ 339

Fig. 206. Products from Shanxi and Lanzhou (northwest), Taipei B. ............ 340

Fig. 207. Products from Guangnan, the Western Oceans, and the Southern Oceans, Taipei B. 340

Fig. 208. Silver molding shop, Zhao Zhe version. ........................................ 340

Fig. 209. Silver molding shop, Liaoning A. .................................................... 340

Fig. 210. Silver molding shop, Taipei A. ......................................................... 340

Fig. 211. Silver molding shop, Metropolitan version. .................................... 340

Fig. 212. Money exchange broker, Liaoning A. ............................................ 341

Fig. 213. Money exchange broker, Taipei A. .................................................. 341

Fig. 214. Money exchange broker, Metropolitan version. ............................. 341

Fig. 215. Money exchange broker, Taipei B. .................................................. 341

Fig. 216. Sedan chair, Liaoning A. ................................................................. 341

Fig. 217. Sedan chair, Liaoning A. ................................................................. 341

Fig. 218. Sedan chair, Taipei A. ..................................................................... 342

Fig. 219. Sedan chair, Taipei A. ..................................................................... 342

Fig. 220. Sedan chair, Metropolitan version. .................................................. 342

Fig. 221. Sedan chair, Metropolitan version. .................................................. 342

Fig. 222. Sedan chair, Taipei B. ..................................................................... 342

Fig. 223. Scholars wearing FANGJIN square caps and blue or plain colored robes, Zhao Zhe version ................................................................. 342

Fig. 224. Physician wearing DONGPO JIN, Zhao Zhe version. .......................... 342
FIG. 225. ELITES WEARING TANGJIN, ZHAO ZHE VERSION. .................................................. 343

FIG. 226. ELITE WEARING A RUANJIN SOFT HEADSCARF, LIAONING A. ................................. 343

FIG. 227. ELITE WEARING ERYI JIN, LIAONING A. .................................................................. 343

FIG. 228. ELITES’ OUTFITS, LIAONING A AND TAIPEI A. ...................................................... 344

FIG. 229. ELITES WEARING DONGPO JIN OR TANGJIN, LIAONING B. ................................. 344

FIG. 230. ELITES WEARING SIMPLE HEADSCARVES AND ROBES, LIAONING B. ...................... 344

FIG. 231. ELITES WEARING DONGPO JIN OR TANGJIN, TAIPEI B. ......................................... 345

FIG. 232. PHYSICIAN WEARING WANJI JIN, TAIPEI B. .......................................................... 345

FIG. 233. MAN WEARING ERYI JIN, TAIPEI B. ....................................................................... 345

FIG. 234. ELITE WEARING RED SHOES, TAIPEI B. ................................................................... 345

FIG. 235. OUTFITS, METROPOLITAN VERSION. ...................................................................... 345

FIG. 236. SHOES FROM NANJING, METROPOLITAN VERSION ............................................. 346

FIG. 237. GUARDS AT THE CITY GATES, LIAONING A. ............................................................ 346

FIG. 238. GUARDS AT THE CITY GATE, TAIPEI A. .................................................................... 346

FIG. 239. GUARDS AT THE CITY GATE, METROPOLITAN VERSION ........................................ 346

FIG. 240. GUARDS AT THE CITY GATE AND THE INLAND CUSTOMS STATION, LIAONING B .......... 347

FIG. 241. GUARDS AT THE CITY GATE AND THE INLAND CUSTOMS STATION, TAIPEI B. ............. 347

FIG. 242. GOVERNMENT OFFICE, TAIPEI B. .......................................................................... 347

FIG. 243. RENHE STORE, TAIPEI B. ....................................................................................... 348

FIG. 244. MILITARY INSPECTION AND ENTERTAINMENT, TAIPEI A. ................................. 349

FIG. 245. DISPLAY OF MILITARY SKILLS, METROPOLITAN VERSION ................................... 350

FIG. 246. IMPERIAL GARDEN AND POND, LIAONING A. ..................................................... 351

FIG. 247. IMPERIAL GARDEN AND POND, TAIPEI A. ............................................................ 351

FIG. 248. IMPERIAL GARDEN AND POND, LIAONING B. ..................................................... 352

FIG. 249. MOTHERHOOD, ZHAO ZHE VERSION. ...................................................................... 352

FIG. 250. MOTHERHOOD, LIAONING A. ................................................................................. 352
FIG. 251. MOTHERHOOD, TAIPEI A.................................................................352
FIG. 252. MOTHERHOOD, METROPOLITAN VERSION..................................352
FIG. 253. MOTHERHOOD, LIAONING B..........................................................352
FIG. 254. MOTHERHOOD, TAIPEI B...............................................................352
FIG. 255. BROTHERHOOD, ZHAO ZHE VERSION........................................353
FIG. 256. BROTHERHOOD, LIAONING A........................................................353
FIG. 257. BROTHERHOOD, TAIPEI A.............................................................353
FIG. 258. BROTHERHOOD, METROPOLITAN VERSION.................................353
FIG. 259. BROTHERHOOD, LIAONING B........................................................353
FIG. 260. BROTHERHOOD, TAIPEI B.............................................................353
FIG. 261. FATHER AND SON, ZHAO ZHE VERSION........................................353
FIG. 262. FATHER AND SON, LIAONING A.....................................................353
FIG. 263. FATHER AND SON, TAIPEI A..........................................................353
FIG. 264. FATHER AND SON, METROPOLITAN VERSION...............................353
FIG. 265. FATHER AND SON, LIAONING B.....................................................353
FIG. 266. FATHER AND SON, TAIPEI B..........................................................353
FIG. 267. HUSBAND AND WIFE, TAIPEI A.....................................................354
FIG. 268. HUSBAND AND WIFE, TAIPEI B.....................................................354
FIG. 269. HUSBAND AND WIFE, METROPOLITAN VERSION..........................354
FIG. 270. HUSBAND AND WIFE, TAIPEI B.....................................................354
FIG. 271. WRESTLING, LIAONING B..............................................................354
FIG. 272. BOYS WANDERING ON THE STREET, TAIPEI B..............................354
FIG. 273. WATCHING A PUPPET SHOW, ZHAO ZHE VERSION........................354
FIG. 274. BOYS WANDERING ON THE STREET, LIAONING A.........................354
FIG. 275. FLYING A KITE, TAIPEI A...............................................................355
FIG. 276. RIDING HOBBYHORSES AND PLAYING PINWHEELS, METROPOLITAN VERSION..........................355
FIG. 277. PLAYING MUSIC AND DANCING FOR MALE ELITES, ZHAO ZHE VERSION. ........................................ 355
FIG. 278. WOMAN WITH A FEMALE RELATIVE, ZHAO ZHE VERSION. .................................................. 355
FIG. 279. WOMAN WITH HER SON, ZHAO ZHE VERSION. ........................................................................ 355
FIG. 280. WOMEN EMBROIDERING, ZHAO ZHE VERSION. ........................................................................ 356
FIG. 281. PLAYING IN A PRIVATE GARDEN, ZHAO ZHE VERSION. ....................................................... 356
FIG. 282. GENTRY WOMAN TRAVELING IN A SEDAN CHAIR ACCOMPANIED BY HER MAIDSERVANT, ZHAO ZHE
VERSION ................................................................................................................................................... 356
FIG. 283. PEEPING WOMAN WATCHING A WEDDING PROCESSION, ZHAO ZHE VERSION. ................. 356
FIG. 284. MERCHANT’S WIFE, ZHAO ZHE VERSION .................................................................................. 356
FIG. 285. OLD LADY SELLING FANS, ZHAO ZHE VERSION. ....................................................................... 356
FIG. 286. MATCHMAKER’S SEDAN CHAIR AND ENTOURAGE, ZHAO ZHE VERSION. ....................... 357
FIG. 287. SINGING GIRLS, ZHAO ZHE VERSION ...................................................................................... 357
FIG. 288. VISITING A TEMPLE, ZHAO ZHE VERSION. ............................................................................... 357
FIG. 289. WATCHING A DRAMA PERFORMANCE, LIAONING A. ............................................................ 357
FIG. 290. VISITING A TEMPLE, LIAONING A ............................................................................................ 357
FIG. 291. COURTESANS, LIAONING A ....................................................................................................... 357
FIG. 292. WOMAN BREAST FEEDING A BABY, LIAONING A .................................................................... 358
FIG. 293. WOMAN BRINGING HER CHILD TO WATCH AN ACROBATIC SHOW, LIAONING A ................ 358
FIG. 294. WOMEN TRAVELING BY BOAT, TAIPEI A .................................................................................. 358
FIG. 295. WOMEN WATCHING A DRAMA PERFORMANCE AND CHATTING, TAIPEI A ..................... 358
FIG. 296. GENTRY WOMAN IN A ROOM WITH BOOKS, TAIPEI A .......................................................... 358
FIG. 297. GENTRY WOMAN PLAYING A ZITHER, TAIPEI A .................................................................... 359
FIG. 298. PALACE LADIES IN A ROOM WITH BOOKS, TAIPEI A ............................................................... 359
FIG. 299. PALACE LADIES WITH A ZITHER, TAIPEI A .............................................................................. 359
FIG. 300. PALACE LADIES PLAYING CHESS, TAIPEI A ........................................................................... 359
FIG. 301. WOMAN LEADING HER HUSBAND AND SON TO VISIT A TEMPLE, TAIPEI A ....................... 359
FIG. 302. WATCHING A BRIDAL PROCESSION, TAIPEI A. ................................. 360
FIG. 303. COURTESANS ENTERTAINING MEN, TAIPEI A. .............................. 360
FIG. 304. TIGHTROPE WALKING, TAIPEI A. ........................................... 360
FIG. 305. WOMAN INDOORS, SEPARATED FROM MEN, LIAONING B. .......... 360
FIG. 306. MERCHANT’S WIFE, LIAONING B. .......................................... 360
FIG. 307. OLD LADY, LIAONING B. ....................................................... 360
FIG. 308. A MOTHER ESCORTED BY A SERVANT GIRL, LIAONING B. .......... 360
FIG. 309. WOMAN IN THE SAME ROOM WITH TWO MEN, TAIPEI B. .......... 361
FIG. 310. PLAYING A BOARD GAME, TAIPEI B. ........................................ 361
FIG. 311. WOMAN BRINGING HER HUSBAND AND SONS TO VISIT A TEMPLE, TAIPEI B. .................................................. 361
FIG. 312. WOMAN TALKING TO A MAN AND MINGLING WITH A GROUP OF MEN, TAIPEI B. .................................................. 361
FIG. 313. NOBLEWOMEN ON AN OUTING, TAIPEI B. ................................. 362
FIG. 314. WOMAN RIDING A DONKEY, TAIPEI B. .................................... 363
FIG. 315. WOMAN RIDING A DONKEY, TAIPEI B. .................................... 363
FIG. 316. VISITING A FORTUNE TELLER, TAIPEI B. .................................. 363
FIG. 317. COURTESAN LI SHISHI’S WINE HOUSE, TAIPEI B. ...................... 363
FIG. 318. A WOMAN AND TWO MEN TAKING A PLEASURE BOAT, TAIPEI B. 364
FIG. 319. SINGING GIRLS, TAIPEI B. ...................................................... 364
FIG. 320. PLAYING A BOARD GAME, METROPOLITAN VERSION. .............. 364
FIG. 321. HOLDING A DINNER PARTY, METROPOLITAN VERSION. ........... 364
FIG. 322. NOBLEWOMEN ON AN OUTING, METROPOLITAN VERSION. ...... 364
FIG. 323. A YOUNG LADY VISITING A TEMPLE, METROPOLITAN VERSION. 364
FIG. 324. WOMEN ON AN OUTING, METROPOLITAN VERSION. ................ 365
FIG. 325. FEMALE PEDESTRIANS, METROPOLITAN VERSION. .................. 365
FIG. 326. FEMALE ACROBATS, METROPOLITAN VERSION. ....................... 365
FIG. 327. FEMALE RELIGIOUS PRACTITIONER, METROPOLITAN VERSION. .. 366
FIG. 354. DRAMA PERFORMANCE, METROPOLITAN VERSION. ..................................................373

FIG. 355. BLIND STORYTELLER OR MUSICIAN, ZHAO ZHE VERSION ...........................................374

FIG. 356. BLIND STORYTELLER OR MUSICIAN, TAIPEI A .............................................................374

FIG. 357. BLIND STORYTELLER OR MUSICIAN, METROPOLITAN VERSION. .................................374

FIG. 358. DAOIST SENTIMENTS DAOIQING, ZHAO ZHE VERSION. .................................................374

FIG. 359. DAOIST SENTIMENTS DAOIQING, TAIPEI A ...............................................................374

FIG. 360. DAOIST SENTIMENTS DAOIQING, METROPOLITAN VERSION ........................................374

FIG. 361. PINHUA STORYTELLING, LIAONING A ........................................................................374

FIG. 362. STORYTELLING, ZHANG ZEDUAN VERSION .....................................................................375

FIG. 363. TIGHTROPE WALKING, METROPOLITAN VERSION .........................................................375

FIG. 364. JUGGLING CYMBALS, ZHAO ZHE VERSION ..................................................................375

FIG. 365. JUGGLING CYMBALS, LIAONING A ................................................................................375

FIG. 366. JUGGLING CYMBALS, TAIPEI A ....................................................................................375

FIG. 367. JUGGLING CYMBALS, METROPOLITAN VERSION ...........................................................375

FIG. 368. FOOT-JUGGLING A JAR, TAIPEI A ...................................................................................376

FIG. 369. MAGIC SHOW, METROPOLITAN VERSION ......................................................................376

FIG. 370. ACRABAT ON A POLE, METROPOLITAN VERSION ...........................................................376

FIG. 371. TRICK RIDERS ON HORSEBACK, METROPOLITAN VERSION .........................................377

FIG. 372. PRIVATE GARDEN, ZHAO ZHE VERSION .......................................................................377

FIG. 373. PRIVATE GARDEN, LIAONING A ..................................................................................378

FIG. 374. PRIVATE GARDEN, TAIPEI A .......................................................................................378

FIG. 375. PRIVATE GARDEN, METROPOLITAN VERSION ..............................................................379

FIG. 376. PRIVATE GARDEN, LIAONING B ..................................................................................379

FIG. 377. PRIVATE GARDEN, TAIPEI B .......................................................................................380

FIG. 378. MUSIC AND DANCING, LIAONING A .............................................................................380

FIG. 379. MUSIC AND DANCING, TAIPEI A .................................................................................380
FIG. 380. MUSIC AND DANCING, METROPOLITAN VERSION. ........................................380
FIG. 381. MUSIC AND DANCING, TAIPEI B. .................................................................380
FIG. 382. RIDING AND ARCHERY, ZHAO ZHE VERSION. ...........................................381
FIG. 383. KICKING A FOOTBALL, ZHAO ZHE VERSION. ..............................................381
FIG. 384. RIDING AND ARCHERY, LIAONING A. .......................................................381
FIG. 385. KICKING A FOOTBALL, LIAONING A. ............................................................381
FIG. 386. PLAYING A BOARD GAME, LIAONING A. .......................................................381
FIG. 387. RIDING AND ARCHERY, TAIPEI A .................................................................381
FIG. 388. KICKING A FOOTBALL, TAIPEI A. .................................................................381
FIG. 389. PLAYING A BOARD GAME, TAIPEI A. ............................................................381
FIG. 390. THROWING DICE, TAIPEI B. ...........................................................382
FIG. 391. RIDING AND ARCHERY, METROPOLITAN VERSION. ................................382
FIG. 392. KICKING A FOOTBALL, METROPOLITAN VERSION. ....................................382
FIG. 393. THROWING ARROWS INTO A JAR, METROPOLITAN VERSION. ..................382
FIG. 394. COCKFIGHT, METROPOLITAN VERSION. ...................................................382
FIG. 395. RICE SHOP, ZHAO ZHE VERSION. ...............................................................382
FIG. 396. BOOKSTORE, ZHAO ZHE VERSION. ............................................................383
FIG. 397. PEOPLE COMING TO TOWN, ZHAO ZHE VERSION. ....................................383
FIG. 398. PRINCE BAO’S PROSE POEM THE IMPERIAL CAPITAL, INSCRIBED BY LIANG SHIZHENG, TAIPEI A ..384
FIG. 399. THE SEAL OF LEHANGTANG HAPPY-IN-ADOPTING-RIGHTEOUSNESS STUDIO, TAIPEI A ..........384
Acknowledgements

I would like to express my profound gratitude to my advisor Dr. Tsao Hsingyuan for her inspiring remarks and invaluable guidance during the entire course of this study. I feel very honored and privileged to have worked with her.

I am deeply grateful to my committee, Dr. Timothy Brook and Dr. Rhodri Windsor-Liscombe, for their careful readings, insightful comments, and encouragement. I also thank university examiners Dr. Marvin Cohodas and Dr. Leo Shin, and external examiner Dr. Wang Cheng-hua for their valuable remarks and precious suggestions. I further wish to express my appreciation to Dr. Ina Asim and Dr. Charles Lachman for inspiring and encouraging me to engage in the study of cityscape paintings.

I greatly appreciate assistance from many institutions and individuals during my research. In particular, I would like to express my gratitude to Dai Liqiang of Liaoning Provincial Museum, China; Katsuko Sugimura and Satoko Endo of the Hayashibara Museum of Art, Japan; Chen Yunru, Zhang Biliang, and Yan Xinyi of the National Palace Museum, Taipei; Chang Ya-ling of National Tsinghua University Library, Taiwan; Jiang Xinrong of Yuanpei University Library, Taiwan; and Jean Liu of the Asian Library as well as Michael Mao of the Art History, Visual Art, and Theory Visual Resources Collection, University of British Columbia, Vancouver.

I am also indebted to my colleagues and friends whose superb help and warm encouragement made this dissertation feasible. I owe a special debt of gratitude to Jean Kares for her ongoing support during my study and her inspiring suggestions to this project. Great thanks are also extended to April Liu, Zoe Li, Kazuko Kameda-Madar, Hong Li-ju, Tim Allen, Weiqi Sylvia Zheng, Geoffrey Carr, Liu Diyu, and Han Gang for much needed moral support and for, in one way or another, contributing to the successful completion of my study and research.
Moreover, I want to express my sincerest appreciation to my family: Chang Hsueh-shun, Chang Suh-hua, Shieh Min-long, Lin Hsin-chao, Lin Meng-yen, Chen Qiong-yao, Lin Hsin-ying, Lin Hsing-hung, Li Quan-xiang, and my parents as well as my parents-in-law for their continuous support, concern and understanding. I want to thank wholeheartedly my beloved husband Meng-chieh Ivan Lin, son Yi-chen Jimmy Lin and daughter Yi-hsuan Demi Lin for their persistent love, tremendous encouragement and immense help, which kept me going through difficult times and gave me the confidence and bravery to explore new horizons.

Last but not least, I would like to acknowledge the financial support of the University of British Columbia. The Ph.D. Tuition Fee Award and Art History Travel Research Scholarship I received made my dream of academic pursuit come true and my research fruitful.
Introduction

A number of paintings titled *Qingming shanghe tu* 清明上河圖 that were produced over a period of seven centuries mark a distinct phenomenon in the history of art. My dissertation examines a group of these works that were executed in China from the sixteenth to the eighteenth century, a period approximately equal to the late Ming (1368-1644) to the middle Qing (1644-1911) dynasties.¹ The title of the paintings has been variously translated as *Spring Festival on the River, Going Upriver for the Qingming Festival, Peace Reigns on the River, Up to the Capital at Qingming*, and so on. Roughly following the composition and some motifs of an older painting from the Northern Song dynasty (960-1127), these paintings depict activities in cities and their outskirts. I will argue that although the creation of these paintings was largely based on earlier version(s) and started with copying, each was a distinct improvisation of its prototype, and the improvised elements were directly related to its own particular social and political environment. Through the existing comments on these works in the Ming-Qing period, I will show that they were considered to be paintings of a prosperous age and that they were enthusiastically pursued. By carefully scrutinizing these paintings,

¹ Unless otherwise noted, the pre-modern texts cited in this thesis are from the digital database Liu Junwen 劉俊文, ed., *Zhongguo jiben gujiku* 中國基本古籍庫 (Beijing: Erudition Digital Technology Research Center).

¹ I adopt Timothy Brook’s division of historical stages of the Ming dynasty, which dates the early Ming, 1368-1450, mid-Ming, 1450-1550, and late Ming, 1550-1644. See Timothy Brook, *The Confusions of Pleasure: Commerce and Culture in Ming China* (California: University of California Press, 1998), xix-xxi. The early Qing is roughly equal to Manchu rule in the seventeenth century, though some scholars such as Dorothy Ko include Kangxi’s rule until 1722 in the early Qing period. See Dorothy Ko, *Teachers of the Inner Chambers: Women and Culture in Seventeenth-Century China* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1994), 22-23. The middle Qing period accords with the eighteenth century, which was considered by scholars as the most prosperous age of the Qing regime known in English as the High Qing era, a term that derives from Ho Ping-ti’s studies. Scholars generally agree that the High Qing began in 1683 when the Manchu eliminated the last remnants of Ming loyalist resistance. Some scholars considered that the High Qing era ended in 1790s about the time that the Qianlong Emperor died, but Susan Mann following Frederic Wakeman’s proposal posited that the era ended in 1839 on the eve of the Opium War (1839-1842). Ho Ping-ti, *Studies on the Population of China* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1959), Ho Ping-ti, “The Significance of the Ch‘ing Period in Chinese History,” *Journal of Asian Studies* 16, no. 2 (1967): 189-95, and Frederic Wakeman, Jr., “High Ch‘ing, 1683-1839,” in James B. Crowley, ed., *Modern East Asia: Essays in Interpretation* (New York: Harcourt, Brace & World, 1970), 1-28, cited by Susan Mann, *Precious Records: Women in China’s Long Eighteenth Century* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1997), 20, 236-237 (footnote 1).
I will also show the world depicted in the *Qingming* scrolls was the discourse of a prosperous golden age. It consisted of orthodox scholars’ values such as patriarchy and rural idyll, as well as various desirable elements extracted from real life at a time when commercial activities and lavish and unrestrained lifestyles gradually had become recognized and accepted. According to the backgrounds of the collectors and the prices of *Qingming* paintings, I will demonstrate that these works were appreciated by the middlebrow as well as the upper class—people who benefited the most from the economic prosperity—of the Ming-Qing period. From the shared and diverse motifs among these paintings, I will prove that they demonstrate the people’s collective concerns (focusing on the middle and upper classes) and their changing views of an ideal society.

**The Idea of Qingming shanghe tu**

The many versions of *Qingming shanghe tu* were believed to have been based on the *Qingming* scroll painted in the eleventh century, during the Northern Song dynasty, which is now in the collection of the Palace Museum, Beijing (hereafter referred to as the Beijing scroll) (Fig. 1). In spite of the sudden rise of popularity of the subject in the sixteenth century, the Beijing scroll itself was only known to a few individuals prior to the Ming Dynasty. From the sixteenth century, *Qingming shanghe tu* paintings were continually prevalent throughout the following centuries. The main reason for the huge admiration of these paintings is probably that their subject matter and contents appealed to the people of the time. However, the many accounts that commented on the theme and

---

2 Because the idea of a prosperous age was a constructed truth asserted by people who were economically better off, it is considered to be a discourse. Foucault treated discourses as “practices that systematically form the objects of which they speak.” Therefore, discourse can be defined as the meaningful communication, such as in the forms of speeches, writings, images, or cultural practices, which express and shape cultural ideas and practices. Foucault mentioned that discourses are not only about what can be said and thought, but also about who can speak, when, and with what authority. Thus, he emphasized that discourse is interwoven with power relations and it represents what is asserted as truth by people or institutions that control language. Michel Foucault, *The Archaeology of Knowledge and the Discourse on Language* (New York: Pantheon, 1972), especially 48-50; also see D’Alleva’s interpretation, Anne D’Alleva, *Look Again, Art History and Critical Theory* (London: Laurence King Publishing Ltd, 2005), 9, 139.
the popularity of the paintings and repeated the story of the earnest search for the Song version of the *Qingming* scroll by the powerful early sixteenth-century Grand Secretary, Yan Song 嚴嵩 (1480-1567), together with the remarkably high price he paid for the painting, certainly added to its fame and encouraged the proliferation of forgeries and copies.

These later *Qingming* scrolls usually carried the signature of either Zhang Zeduan (ca. eleventh century) or the famous mid-Ming professional painter Qiu Ying (ca. 1494-1552), in order to be taken for an original or as a copy by prestigious artist. Actually, most were painted by little-known professional painters in Suzhou, the most prosperous city and the core of pre-modern China. At a time when only upper class cultural elites had access to the original masterpiece, not many people were able to detect whether these paintings were either the original, or precise or rough copies; or even complete fabrications. However, records also show that people who recognized that these paintings were not from famous painters’ hands still appreciated them. Many

---

3 Such as in the Ming dynasty: Wang Shizhen 王世貞, *Yanzhou shanren sibu xugao* 弈州山人四部續稿 (Qing Wenyuan ge siku quanshu ben 清文淵閣四庫全書本), juan 168, 1814; Li Rihua 李日華, *Weishui xuan riji* 味水軒日記 (Mingguo jiaye tang congshu ben 民國嘉業堂叢書本), juan 1, 12-13; Gu Qiyuan 顧起元, *Kezuo zhaiyu* 客座贅語 (Ming Wanli shihiliu nian zi keben 明萬曆四十六年自刻本), juan 8, 133; Shen Defu 沈德符, *Wanli yehuo bian* 萬曆野獲編 (Qing Daoguang qinian yaoshi ke tongzhi banian buxiu ben 清道光七年姚氏刻同治八年補修本), juan 2, 616-17. In the Qing dynasty: Xu Shupi 徐樹丕, *Shi xiaolu* 識小錄 (Hanfen lou miji jingkao ben 涵芬樓秘笈景稿本), juan 2, 49; Lu Shihua 陸時化, *Wuyue suojian shuhua lu* 吳越所見書畫錄 (1776), juan 1, 33. Sometimes in the story Yan Song was changed to Yan Song’s son Yan Shifan 嚴世蕃.

4 Several accounts mentioned that the Zhang Zeduan painting was sold for 1200 taels of silver (a Ming/Qing tael equals 37.5 grams), such as Wen Jia 文嘉, *Yanshi shuhua ji* 嚴氏書畫紀, quoted by Zhang Chou 張丑, *Qinghe shuhua fang* 清河書畫舫 (Qing Wenyuan ge siku quanshu ben 清文淵閣四庫全書本), juan 7, shang 上, 223. Zhang Chou’s account was included in Sun Yueban 孫岳頤 et al., eds, *Peiwen zhai shuhua pu* 偏文齋書畫譜 (Qing Wenyuan ge siku quanshu ben 清文淵閣四庫全書本), juan 99, Lidai jiancang 9 历代鑒藏九, 2602. More about the value of the *Qingming* paintings including copies and forgeries will be discussed in chapter one.

5 Though rare and somewhat doubtful, there were records in pre-modern Chinese texts mentioning *Qingming* paintings by Gui Xi 郭熙, Zhao Boju 趙伯駒, Sheng Mou 盛懋, and Shi Tao 石濤, etc. This will be discussed in chapter one.

6 Actually, even an elite connoisseur such as Dong Qichang 董其昌 made mistakes, let alone ordinary people.

7 For example, Wan Shide 萬世德 of the late Ming, who acquired the Zhao Zhe version and will be
accounts revealed that the prices of the Ming-Qing versions Qingming paintings varied significantly. This suggests that not only the wealthy social elite but also the middle class could afford these works of art.

More than one hundred Qingming paintings have survived from the Ming-Qing era. They have not received much scholarly attention because they were unfairly labeled introd...
and treated as mere copies and/or forgeries of the paintings by Zhang Zeduan or Qiu Ying. Since modern scholars are influenced by the post-Renaissance European notions of individual authorship and “originality,” copies are often seen as flawed reproductions that merely capture the surface of their prototypes. We must now look at these works in a different light and, I propose, begin to treat them as “authentic” copies.  

To address the gap in the scholarship and the inherent value and meaning of copying in painting, my study builds on Mikhail Bakhtin’s idea of the dialogical relationship between writer and reader, Julia Kristeva’s perception of the dialogical relationship in terms of intertextuality, Gerard Genette’s theory of transtextuality in which he sketched out a detailed taxonomy of intertextuality, and Michael Baxandall’s notion of the later painter as an active agent rather than a passive receiver.

Bakhtin’s idea of dialogic relationship between writer and reader is valuable to our understanding of the communication between the Qingming painter (writer) and viewer (reader). According to Bakhtin, in a novel, the characters’ speeches are designed in a way that they anticipate possible responses of interlocutors. Thus, even the monologue of a character can be considered as a dialogue between him and the voices of others who are invisible, yet present within his speech. Likewise, many Qingming

---

the Liaoning Provincial Museum, accession no. 4865-167, which has not been published elsewhere, but fits the description of one recorded in Zhang Zhao 張照, et al., eds., Shiqu baoji chubian 石渠寶笈初編 (1745; Qing Wenyuan ge siku quanshu ben 清文淵閣四庫全書本), juan 34, zhu yushufang 贯御書房七, 649. It will be discussed in this dissertation and referred to as Liaoning B.

10 This dissertation developed from a paper that I presented in the symposium “The Authenticity of the Copy: Rethinking Mo and Fang (copying) in Chinese Painting and Its Theory,” organized by Tsao Hsingyuan and Timothy Brook, March 29-30, 2007 at the University of British Columbia, Vancouver, Canada. I was inspired to rethink the value, meaning and power of copies/copying by the various phenomena, purposes, practices and theories regarding copies/copying in Chinese paintings/maps that were contributed to this symposium by scholars including Tsao Hsingyuan, Timothy Brook, John Hay, Richard Vinograd, Craig Clunas, and Yin Jinan among others.

paintings, which generally lack comments from viewers (just like the monologues in literature), can still be considered as a result of a dialogue between their painters and viewers. Bakhtin also proposed that the co-creation of self and other constructs dialogic relationship, because through dialogue, self and other both undergo processes of change. They influence and are being influenced by each other simultaneously. This cyclic process brings to existence what Bakhtin calls “the polyphony of voices.” Polyphony is the result of understanding, experience, and knowledge of self and other by the self in the continuum of time and space. Therefore, I will show that the Qingming paintings in all their variations were executed in a way similar to that of musical improvisations; were co-created by painters and viewers engaged in a type of dialogue; and that the genre continued from generation to generation while undergoing continuous change.

This improvisational model of production, in many respects, is similar to the notion of intertextuality theory by which texts are read in interdependent ways. This interdependent relationship situates texts in relation to one another (as well as to the culture at large) to produce meaning. Julia Kristeva developed the Bakhtinian dialogic relationship and polyphony into the concept of intertextuality. She emphasizes that a text is the result of the intersection of numerous voices, and is the result of many textual interventions. Kristeva articulates that any text is constructed as a mosaic of quotations and absorbs and transforms other texts. She situates texts in terms of two axes: the horizontal axis connects the author and the reader of a text, while the vertical axis connects the text to other texts—either anterior or other contemporary cultural expressions. Therefore, for Kristeva, the text is embedded in a web of cultural practices.

---


blending the texts of the author and reader with earlier or contemporary cultural contexts.\(^\text{14}\) I will apply Kristeva’s theory to my discussions to emphasize the intertextual relationship among the *Qingming* paintings and between the paintings and their social and historical contexts. This intertextual relation allows us to see how the various *Qingming shanghe tu* were constructed through visual “quotations.”

Whereas Kristeva refuses to allow the concepts of “author” or “source” to overlap with that of anonymous intertextuality,\(^\text{15}\) many theorists, including art historian Michael Baxandall, question the firm boundary between influence and intertextuality and support a redefinition of intertextuality that allows for the concept of agency. Baxandall argues for the agency of the later painter. He reasons that the successor or later painter is not a passive recipient of predecessors’ or earlier painters’ ideas, but rather an active agent who reshapes precursors’ material by various and ample means, including misunderstanding, copying, appropriating, paraphrasing, absorbing, adapting, making variations, and so on.\(^\text{16}\) His argument for the agency of the later painter actually pronounces the agency of both the reader and the author, since the later painter (reader to the earlier painter’s work) is also an author for the later painting and the source for the even later painter. Nevertheless, his theory manifests the agency of later painter to produce artworks in his or her own right on the basis of earlier works, and helps to clarify how later *Qingming* painters created various new paintings in the Ming-Qing period.

Genette proposed “transtextuality” as a more inclusive term than “intertextuality.”

---


\(^{15}\) Roland Barthes, “The Death of the Author,” in *Image, Music, Text*, trans. Stephen Heath, (London: Fontana Press, 1977), 142-148. Following Kristeva’s idea, Roland Barthes further abolished the notion of an author, claiming that the words of a text do not release only a single meaning or message of an "Author-God." Rather, a text is a series of quotations drawn from various cultures. Thus, both Kristeva and Barthes replace the concept of an author that dominates a text with that of intertextuality, a mosaic of various voices. For them, the meaning of the text is open to activation by the reader.

of other texts, he maps out ways in which relationships between texts can be systematically interpreted and subdivided into five types. I will refer to two types of transtextuality in Genette’s classification—metatextuality and hypertextuality—to address the intertextual relationship between the Qingming paintings and other texts. While metatextuality addresses the relationship of a text and related comments, hypertextuality deals with the interconnection of a text and a preceding text on which it is based but which it transforms or extends, such as someone else’s discourse or speech. I will examine how texts, including commentary on the paintings, the discourse of a great age, and the literary tradition of using a prosperous city to represent a great empire, exist in a matrix of connections with the Qingming paintings.

With the above theories as a framework, I will show that the later painters misunderstood the original Song dynasty Qingming painting, copied, and/or appropriated certain earlier motifs. Further, as they interacted with viewers and reshaped the idea of Qingming shanghe tu, they visualized their and the viewers’ readings of the paintings according to cultural practices and life experiences. Thus, by modifying and improvising on earlier paintings, they created various new paintings. In addition, this study will demonstrate that the Qingming painters of the Ming-Qing period created new paintings using the same title and a generic framework derived from the original composition. Each


1. intertextuality: quotation, plagiarism, allusion. (differs from Kristeva’s intertextuality).
2. paratextuality: the relation between a text and its “paratext,” which surrounds the so-called main body of the text such as title, headings, prefaces, dedications, etc.
3. architextuality: description of a text as belonging to a genre or genres.
4. metatextuality: intertextual discourse in which one text makes critical commentary on another text.
5. hypertextuality, the relationship between a text and a preceding text on which it is based, but which it transforms, modifies, elaborates or extends, for instance, another’s discourse or someone else’s speech.

of the *Qingming* paintings presented an imagined ideal way of life by assimilating or “quoting” from conventions of various texts that they wanted to retain, as well as including a selection of the finer aspects of life in the Yangzi delta region of their time, which they glorified.

I have selected six versions of *Qingming* paintings produced from the sixteenth to the eighteenth century as the focus of my analysis. Of the six paintings, the painting by the artisan painter Zhao Zhe (Fig. 2), who is relatively unknown except for his name, was painted in 1577. Two *Qingming* paintings in the Liaoning Provincial Museum were painted around the early seventeenth century. The two *Qingming* paintings in the National Palace Museum in Taipei were produced around the mid-seventeenth century. The *Qingming* painting housed in the Metropolitan Museum of Art in New York was painted in the eighteenth century.\(^\text{19}\) Hereafter I will refer to these paintings as the Zhao Zhe version (Fig. 2), the Liaoning A (Fig. 3), the Liaoning B (Fig. 4), the Taipei A (Fig. 5), the Taipei B (Fig. 6) and the Metropolitan version (Fig. 7) respectively. In this thesis each of them represents a type of *Qingming* painting.\(^\text{20}\) (See table 1 for their physical conditions and locations, and appendix A for their dating and groupings).

**Previous Studies on *Qingming shanghe tu***

Scholars now agree that there are two major versions of *Qingming* paintings: the original Song rendering referred to as the Beijing scroll, and those from the Ming-Qing period. Scholars have also generally agreed that the Beijing scroll was painted by Zhang Zeduan of the Northern Song era. The painting was circulated in the southern part of

\(^{19}\) More about their dating will be discussed in appendix A.

\(^{20}\) At the present time, I am unaware of any two *Qingming* paintings that are exactly the same. I consider paintings that share more similarity as being the same type. There are more *Qingming* scrolls extant similar to the Zhao Zhe and the Taipei A versions. In between is the Liaoning B. The Liaoning A, the Taipei B and the Metropolitan versions feature many motifs that other *Qingming* scrolls did not include. Therefore, they are a more special type of *Qingming shanghe tu*. For the similarity and difference of these paintings, see my discussions in chapters one and two.
Henan Province during the Jin Dynasty (1115-1234), following the fall of the Northern Song in 1127. Studies of the Zhang Zeduan *Qingming* painting have focused on two major debates: first, the question of whether the painting represents the Song capital Kaifeng, another city or town, or an ideal city; and secondly, whether the meaning of the title *Qingming* refers to a festival, a district, the “pure and bright” solar term (*jieqi*) or a prosperous period under an ideal regime. However, in his article to show the transformation of the *Qingming* scrolls from the Song to the Qing dynasty, Yu Hui proposed that the Beijing scroll presents certain respects of life in Kaifeng during the *Qingming* festival and reveals social crisis during Emperor Huizong’s time (r. 1101-1125). Furthermore, in her recent studies, Tsao Hsinyuan has persuasively argued that the subject of the Beijing scroll was the capital city Kaifeng.

---


23. For example, Zheng Zhenduo proposed that this version was a painting of Kaifeng during the *Qingming* festival. Kong Xianyi proposed that *Qingming* means the *Qingming* district (清明坊) outside of Kaifeng. According to Tsao Hsinyuan, the *qingming* (pure and bright) term is the fifth term of the Chinese twenty-four solar terms (*jieqi*) around the first half of the third month of the lunar calendar, and *Qingming shengshi* 清明盛世 is the term for a prosperous period under an ideal regime. Xiao Qiongri 蕭瓊瑞 proposed that *Qingming* refers to an ideal regime and summarizes the debate. Zhenduo Zheng 鄭振鐸, “Qingming shanghe tu de yanjiu 清明上河圖的研究,” in Liaoning sheng bowuguan 劉益安, *Qingming shanghe tu yanjiu wen xian huibian* 清明上河圖研究文獻匯編, 157-69; Kong Xianyi 孔憲易, “Qingming shanghe tu de qingming zhiyi 清明上河圖的清明質疑,” in Liaoning sheng bowuguan 劉益安, *Qingming shanghe tu yanjiu wen xian huibian* 清明上河圖研究文獻匯編, 557-61; Tsao Hsinyuan 曹星原, “Unraveling the Mystery of the Handscroll *Qingming Shanghe tu*,” *Journal of Sung-Yuan Studies*, no. 33 (2003): 168; Xiao Qiongri 蕭瓊瑞, “Qingming shanghe tu huaming yiyi de zai renshi 清明上河圖畫名意義的再認識,” in Liaoning sheng bowuguan 劉益安, *Qingming shanghe tu yanjiu wen xian huibian* 清明上河圖研究文獻匯編, 569-82. I will further discuss the idea of *Qingming shengshi* as a discourse in chapter two.

during the *Qingming* solar term, and its purpose was to seek unity in a time of difficulties (*tongzhou gongji* 同舟共濟) during Emperor Shenzong’s reign (1067-1085) as he was implementing new policies to save the declining empire. Therefore, previous interpretations of the Beijing scroll as portrayals of the *Qingming* festival or an ideal city misunderstand the painting.

The *Qingming* paintings that this study focuses on were produced after the above-discussed Song version. They circulated widely in the market during the Ming-Qing period and were referred to by Kohara as the “popular versions.” Records suggest that a forgery of the painting was known to have existed as early as the Yuan Dynasty (1271-1368). In the Ming-Qing period, several scholars stated that the *Qingming* paintings they saw were painted in the Southern Song dynasty (1127-1279),

---

27 The popular versions do not include the *Qingming* paintings executed by the Qing court painters, but include those purchased in the market and presented to the imperial family, see Kohara, “Seimei jōgazu 清明上河図,” 213-34. Whitfield puts the popular versions and the Qing court versions under the category “later versions,” see Whitfield, “Chang Tse-tuan’s Ch’ing-ming Shang-ho T’u,” 76-111.
28 In 1352, one of the collectors Yang Zhun 楊準 stated in his colophon after the *Qingming* painting, recorded in Ying He 英和 et al., eds., *Shigu baoji sanbian* 石渠寶笈三編, vol. 1077 of Xuxiu siku quanshu 續修四庫全書, comp. Xuxiu siku quanshu bianzuan weiyuan hui 續修四庫全書編纂委員會 (1815; repr., Shanghai: Shanghai guji, 1995), 187-88; also see Whitfield, “Chang Tse-tuan’s Ch’ing-ming shang-ho t’u,” 154.
29 Such as Dong Qichang 董其昌, *Rongtai ji* 容臺集 (Ming Chongzhen sannian dongting keben 明崇禎三年董庭刻本), *bieji* 別集, *juan* 4, 338; Sun Chengze 孫承澤, *Gengzi xiaoxia ji* 庚子銷夏記 (Qing Wenyuan ge siku quanshu ben 清文淵閣四庫全書本), *juan* 8, 74. The Southern Song versions have never been found. Those who claimed to have witnessed Southern Song versions were probably misled by Li Dongyang, whose first inscription (a poem) on the painting was published in his book *Huilu tanggao* 懷麓堂稿. In one of the lines he mentioned: “When the painting was completed, it entered the Qixi 緝熙 palace.” The Qixi palace was a palace in the Southern Song. It contradicts another line by Li: “The artist’s name is not recorded in the *Xuanhe huapu* 宣和畫譜. That the painted work has be preserved is due to my ancestor,” indicating that Li thought Zhang Zeduan was from the Northern Song, and should be included in the Northern Song catalogue of imperial collection *Xuanhe huapu*. In Li Dongyang’s second inscription on the painting, he mentioned the title of the painting written by Northern Song emperor Huizong and his seal. Li Dongyang still thought Zhang Zeduan was a Northern Song painter, but he misattributed the Qixi palace as a Northern Song palace for storing collections. Later scholars, including Dong Qichang and Sun Chengze, thus all considered Zhang Zeduan as a Southern Song court painter and painted Bianjing scenery as a nostalgic act. Sun Chengze mentioned that Zhang Zeduan was a Southern Song painter, but also mentioned that on the *Qingming* painting, there were seals of Huizong’s reign without realizing the contradiction.
however, any such Southern Song and Yuan dynasty copies have never been found.\textsuperscript{30} Most scholars have recognized that the current surviving \textit{Qingming} paintings were mass-produced from the late Ming to the Qing dynasties, with a structure similar to Zhang Zeduan’s painting but with very different motifs.\textsuperscript{31}

Previous studies of the popular versions of \textit{Qingming} paintings have taken four approaches: first, they have compared paintings in order to identify the authentic, original by Zhang Zeduan; second, the paintings have been discussed as illustrations of Ming urban life in Suzhou or any of the cities south of the Yangzi River; third, they have been compared to identify the elements that contributed to the making of cityscapes by the court painters of the Qing dynasty; and finally, the paintings have been interpreted as perceptions of a city. In the first study of its kind and a major contribution, Roderick Whitfield generalized from the structure and content of about twenty Ming-to-Qing versions of \textit{Qingming} paintings to propose their genealogy. He suggested that the earlier versions were shorter in length and had compositions similar to the Beijing scroll, while the longer, later versions were built on the basic composition of earlier works but added scenes of an open-air theater at the beginning and a palace garden at the end.\textsuperscript{32} Liu Yuanlin \textsuperscript{ Liu Yu} compared images from about seventeen popular \textit{Qingming} scrolls in

\textsuperscript{30} Two extant \textit{Qingming} paintings were claimed to be painted in the Yuan Dynasty: one was once in Chicago, proposed by Dong Zuobin, and the other was once collected by Xuanhe Tang 宣和堂, claimed by Lin Fan. See Dong Zuobin 董作賓, \textit{Qingming shanghe tu} 清明上河圖 (Taipei: Yiwen yingshu guan, 1960); Lin, “Qingming shanghe tu yuanben xinzheng 清明上河圖元本新證,”134-57. The Dong Zuobin version was asserted to have been produced in Ming-Qing period by Whitfield, “Chang Tse-tuan’s Ch’ing-ming Shang-ho T’u,” 86-87. The Lin Fan version was a combination of the mid-seventeenth century Taipei A of Lineage I and Taipei B of Lineage II that I will categorize and discuss in detail in chapter two. It thus must have been painted around the mid-seventeenth century. Liu Diyu 劉迪宇 mentioned that Yang Renkai 楊仁愷 also considered this painting as a Ming version and discussed many features of the Lin Fan version that resemble other popular versions of \textit{Qingming} paintings, see Liu Diyu 劉迪宇, “Zhongguo gudai shijing tuxiang de shikong tezhen: lilai Qingming shanghe tu bijiao yanjiu 中國古代市井圖像的時空特徵: 历代清明上河圖比較研究,” (PhD diss., Tongji University, 2012), 22, 31, 180, 184-85.

\textsuperscript{31} Such as Whitfield, “Chang Tse-tuan’s Ch’ing-ming Shang-ho T’u,” 79; Kohara, “Seimei jōgazu 清明上河図,” 221-22.

\textsuperscript{32} Whitfield, “Chang Tse-tuan’s Ch’ing-ming Shang-ho T’u,” 77-90.
order to determine the authentic Zhang Zeduan painting. Kohara also addressed the structure and content of approximately thirty Qingming paintings, which he divided into three groups, and concluded that later versions were developed from the first group of paintings. Like Whitfield, he noted that the later versions included additional scenes such as a drama performance in the opening section and a palace scene at the end. Both Whitfield and Kohara agreed that the 1577 painting by Zhao Zhe is one of the earliest Ming versions of Qingming shanghe tu.

Some scholars have examined the details of these various Qingming paintings in an attempt to correlate them to what is known about Ming city life. Yang Chenbin claimed to have studied about thirty Qingming scrolls (he does not specify which versions). In his 1990 paper about the Suzhou forgery industry, he posited that most of these paintings were produced in Suzhou, and therefore illustrate features of life in that city. In 1994, Kato Shigeru compared the shops and the city gate in a Qingming painting in the collection of the Okura Shukokan Museum with the special products and features of Suzhou. Ma Baojie and Lee Chi Kwong, Yang Renkai and Dong Yanming all discussed a Qingming painting in the Liaoning Museum (Liaoning A). These authors agreed that this Liaoning version

---

33 Liu Yuanlin 劉潤臨. Qingming shanghe tu zhi zonghe yanjiu 清明上河圖之綜合研究 (Taipei: Yiwen yinshu guan, 1969). Liu misattributed the Taipei B that I will discuss later as the original Zhang Zeduan painting.
38 Ma Baojie 馬寶傑. “Qiu Ying Qingming shanghe tu shangxi 仇英清明上河圖賞析” [Qingming Shanghe Tu by Qiu Ying], in Qiu Ying fang Zhang Zeduan Qingming shanghe tu 仇英仿張捲端清明上河圖 [Qingming Shanghe Tu: A Fine Copy by Qiu Ying], ed. Lok On Hui (Beijing: Wenwu chuben she, 2007), 152-58. This painting was listed under the name of Qiu Ying in another publication edited by Yang
was painted by Qiu Ying and that it illustrates life in Suzhou, but none offered a detailed analysis. However, in “A Flourishing Scene of Prosperity: A Study of the Scroll Qingming shanghe tu Attributed to Qiu Ying,” Chang Su-chen demonstrated through stylistic analysis that Qiu Ying did not paint this Liaoning Qingming. In addition, Chang identified details of the content of the painting not only as representing Suzhou’s special products but also the urban lifestyle of its elite in the mid-to-late Ming period, as well as geographic features near Suzhou.³⁹ In Yu Hui’s article comparing the Beijing scroll, the Liaoning version, and a Qing court-sponsored version in terms of their themes, content, and artistic styles, he also further demonstrated that the Liaoning Qingming illustrates features of Suzhou city and city life in Ming Suzhou.⁴⁰ In his research to investigate the transformations of urban spatial structures and character from the Song to the Ming dynasties, Liu Diyu 劉滌宇 explored the patterns of infrastructure and architecture presented in approximately nineteen Qingming scrolls (together with the Song version and four Qing court sponsored versions) and concluded that, despite some differences among these patterns, the popular versions generally featured characteristics of Suzhou or cities in the Yangzi River delta during the Ming-Qing period (whereas the Song dynasty version shows contemporary Kaifeng and the Qing court sponsored Qingming depicts a mixture of contemporary Beijing and Suzhou).⁴¹ The above scholarship contributed

⁴¹ Liu, “Zhongguo gudai shijing tuxiang de shikong tezheng: lidai Qingming shanghe tu bijiao yanjiu 中國古代市井圖像的時空特徵: 历代清明上河圖比較研究,” Liu also discovered that some of the images of urban structures and architecture in many popular Qingming paintings did not correspond with those in contemporary written or visual records in Suzhou/Jiangnan of the Ming-Qing period. He proposed
tremendously to detailing the objects, events and urban structures depicted in the paintings, their schemas, and their relationship with Ming dynasty Suzhou and cities in the Yangzi delta.

Scholars have recognized that the compositions and some motifs in the Ming-Qing artisan painters’ *Qingming* paintings were appropriated in many Qing dynasty cityscape paintings sponsored by the emperor. They include Maxwell Hearn’s study on *Paintings of Kangxi’s Southern Inspection Tour* (*Kangxi nanxun tu*)\(^{42}\), Yang Duo’s 楊多 examination of the *Paintings of Qianlong’s Southern Inspection Tour* (*Qianlong nanxun tu* 乾隆南巡圖),\(^{43}\) Wang Cheng-hua’s 王正華 and Ma Ya-chen’s 馬雅貞 studies of court painter Xu Yang’s *The Painting of Ever Growing in a Prosperous Age* (*Shengshi zisheng tu* 盛世滋生圖) which was presented to the Qianlong Emperor in 1759 following his second southern inspection tour,\(^{44}\) and Chen Yunru’s 陳韻如 work on the court version of the *Qingming shanghe tu* which started with the Yongzheng (1722-1735) era and was completed in the Qianlong Emperor’s reign (1735-1795).\(^{45}\) However, their investigations rarely included a detailed analysis of the content or explored the meaning of these popular versions of *Qingming* paintings.\(^{46}\)

---

46 When Chen Yunru discussed the meaning or theme of the Qing court version of the *Qingming* painting, which she considered to be about a prosperous age under a sage king’s rule, she also mentioned the theme of the popular versions of *Qingming* paintings. She tended to agree with Wang Cheng-hua that
Finally, Wang Cheng-hua approached several Ming versions of *Qingming shanghe tu* as visual texts instead of illustrations of facts. She dated the production of four *Qingming* paintings currently in the collections of the Hayashibara Museum (Zhao Zhe version), Baiyun Hall (*Baiyun tang* 白雲堂), the National Palace Museum (Taiwan), and the Liaoning Museum (China; Liaoning A) to the late Ming. She interpreted these *Qingming* paintings along with other cityscape images of the time as representations of contemporary perceptions of a city as a place for consumption and entertainment.\(^{47}\) Wang’s approach is stimulating, but her reading of the paintings, which focuses on the motifs of commodities and amusements, misses the bigger picture that the painters of *Qingming* scrolls wanted to convey. These paintings not only demonstrate Wang’s findings, but also depict the period view of a prosperous world with a stable social order. This is evident as the content of *Qingming* paintings became more festival-oriented. Moreover, many Ming-Qing writings state that the *Qingming shanghe tu* paintings depict life in peaceful and prosperous times.\(^{48}\) Wang did not include the *Qingming* paintings produced in the Qing dynasty, nor explore the meanings of the commodities and entertainment at the time, nor does she discuss why these goods and activities were selected for representation. Furthermore, the numerous scenes and events that are not related to the themes of consumption and entertainment require additional investigation. The particularities and similarities of these paintings, which signal the different and/or shared visions and attitudes of their painters and viewers, merit more examination. The economic positions of Suzhou and the Yangzi delta in the Ming-Qing period and how the

---


\(^{48}\) This will be discussed in detail in chapter two.
notions of an ideal world were based on the images and the life of Suzhou and the Yangzi delta also call for further discussion.

In addition, except for Yang Duo’s and Wang Cheng-hua’s attentions to Prince Bao’s (Bao qingwang 寶親王, later the Qianlong Emperor) inscription on the Taipei A in Yang’s thesis on the Paintings of Qianlong’s Southern Inspection Tour and Wang’s paper on The Painting of Ever Growing in a Prosperous Age, none of the above studies address the comments and inscriptions on the popular Qingming paintings which should help to understand how people perceived and responded to these paintings. Besides, Prince Bao’s inscription still lacks a more contextualized reading; that is, the meanings of the paintings to their viewers deserve more exploration.

**China of the Time**

What was the world like that encouraged such a large quantity of paintings of this particular subject matter? When the Qingming paintings became popular in the sixteenth to the eighteenth centuries, it was a time of great change in Chinese history. Although Sinologists recognize that the political rupture that resulted from the dynastic change in 1644 when the Manchu conquered China, which brought about changes in the areas of moral and ideological control, they still considered sixteenth- to eighteenth-century China as a coherent period. During the latter half of the Ming dynasty, the pace of economic development in various regions of China accelerated. Although the economy suffered in the last few years of the Ming dynasty and during the period of Ming-Qing transition, it revived in the late seventeenth century, evolved and expanded dramatically in the

---

49 Yang, “Qianlong nanxun tu yanjiu 乾隆南巡圖研究,” 44; Wang, “Qianlong chao Suzhou chengshi tuxiang: Zhengzhi quanli wenhua xiaofei yu dijing suzao 乾隆朝蘇州城市圖像: 政治權力、文化消費與地景塑造,” 125. Both refer to the Qianlong Emperor’s interest in the Qingming paintings before he ascended the throne.
eighteenth century on an even larger scale, and was not disrupted until the widespread rebellions of the mid-nineteenth century.\textsuperscript{50}

Many scholars recognize the unprecedented socio-economic transformation of society in various regions of China during this period, which in some ways is also characteristic of the history of early modern Europe.\textsuperscript{51} As early as the Song dynasty (960-1279), the replacement of the aristocracy by an autocracy and the improvement in agricultural production and handicrafts encouraged the spread of commercialization and urbanization in China.\textsuperscript{52} The silver standard initiated in the sixteenth century greatly enhanced the economic life of the empire. Commerce introduced cash crops to increasing areas of cultivation, fostered webs of long distance trade routes and marketing networks, provoked division of labor and job specializations, urged a general relaxation of government control over the economy, and cast China as a growing market economy with a developing labor market and handicraft industry. These economic developments were accompanied by sweeping social changes. These included extensive consumption of luxuries, expanded educational opportunities, flourishing commercial publishing, fluid class and status structures, rising social positions of craftsmen and merchants, growing


\textsuperscript{51} Scholars such as Dorothy Ko criticized earlier scholars’ use of the term “early modern” to this period of Chinese history since China featured different historical and cultural dynamics of its own. However Sinologists generally agree that there were many similarities in socio-economic trends in China and Europe from the sixteenth to the eighteenth century, despite that there also being many differences. For Ko’s criticism, see Ko, *Teachers of the Inner Chambers: Women and Culture in Seventeenth-Century China*, 23-25.

The impact of these developments was particularly noticeable in the economically advanced Jiangnan region—literally “south of the [Yangzi] River” and the current lower Yangzi River area. As mentioned above, Qingming shanghe tu were mainly produced in Suzhou—the most prosperous city of the lower Yangzi region during the Ming-Qing period. From the late Tang dynasty (618-907), the warm and well-drained lower Yangzi River region had been the rice bowl of the empire. Two cities of the area—Suzhou and Hangzhou—were proclaimed a paradise on earth from the time of the Northern Song

53 There is much research that compares the socio-economic development of China (specifically the Yangzi delta region) from the sixteenth to the eighteenth century with Western Europe, as well as research that focused on China’s development in the same period. These studies include: Ko, Teachers of the Inner Chambers: Women and Culture in Seventeenth-Century China, 19-23; R. Bin Wong, China Transformed: Historical Change and the Limits of European Experience (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1998), 13-52; Kenneth Pomeranz, The Great Divergence: China, Europe, and the Making of the Modern World Economy (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2000); Li Bozhong 李伯重, Fazhan yu zhiyue: Mingqing jiangnan shengchan li yanjiu 發展與制約—明清江南生產力研究 (Taipei: Lianjing chuban gongsi, 2002), 401-17; Craig Clunas, Superfluous Things: Material Culture and Social Status in Early Modern China (Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press, 2004), 171-73. For scholars’ regarding the economic development of the time as a market economy—with the existence of a relatively free market in which buyers and sellers exchange goods based on prices determined by demand and supply, see Wong, “The Political Economy of Agrarian Empire,” 219-220, 224-225, Pomeranz, The Great Divergence: China, Europe, and the Making of the Modern World Economy, 70, and Myers and Wang, “Economic Developments, 1644-1800,” 563-564, 591-592. Chinese historians, influenced by Karl Marx’s writings, have considered the economic development of this period as budding capitalism, see Myers and Wang, “Economic Developments, 1644-1800,” 643-44.

54 Most scholars agree that in geographical terms, the heart of Jiangnan in the Ming-Qing period coincided with the drainage area of Lake Tai in the provinces of Zhejiang and Jiangsu. In the administrative hierarchy, the prefectures of Suzhou, Songjiang, Bengtian (Jiangning), Changzhou, Zhenjiang, Hangzhou, Jiaxing, and Huzhou encompassed the core of Jiangnan. For reviews and discussions about the history and boundary of the core and/or greater Jiangnan area in Chinese, see Chen Xuewen 陳學文, “Bilu lanlu sanshi nian: Mingqing jiangnan shi yanjiu de huigu yu zhanwang 筆路藍縷三十年: 明清江南史研究的回顧與展望,” in Mingqing jiangnan shi yanjiu sanshi nian 1978-2008 明清江南史研究三十年: 1978-2008, ed. Jiafan Wang (Shanghai: Shanghai guji, 2010), 4; Li, Fazhan yu zhiyue: Mingqing jiangnan shengchan li yanjiu 發展與制約—明清江南生產力研究, 419-32. For literature regarding the scope of Jiangnan in English, see Linda Cooke Johnson, ed., Cities of Jiangnan in Late Imperial China (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1993), ix; Ko, Teachers of the Inner Chambers: Women and Culture in Seventeenth-Century China, 20-21. This region is an important component of the Lower Yangzi macregoin that G. William Skinner proposed. He divided pre-modern China into eight autonomous macroregions of which the Lower Yangzi macregion was the most commercialized and urbanized, see G. William Skinner, “Regional Urbanization in Nineteenth-Century China,” in The City In Late Imperial China, ed. G. William Skinner (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1977), 212-15, 234-35, 238.

55 Li, Jiangnan de zaoqi gongye hua 江南的早期工業化, 345 (footnote 1).
Since the mid-Ming, the ensuing development of trade routes, market towns, employment opportunities for the migrant population, and the silk and cotton industries that attracted not only domestic but also foreign traders including Japanese and Europeans, transformed this area into China’s wealthiest, most urbanized, and densely populated region. In terms of culture, this region featured a large number of scholars who had passed the metropolitan examinations, famous artists, renowned courtesans, book merchants, and female writers. Dorothy Ko puts it very well: the very name of Jiangnan always conjured up the images of abundance, hedonism and sensual beauty.

Therefore, this most culturally and materially affluent place of this unprecedented prosperous age in pre-modern China inspired the professional painters and their patrons to create the Qingming paintings.

---

56 Michael Marme, “Heaven on Earth: The Rise of Suzhou, 1127-1550,” in Cities of Jiangnan in Late Imperial China, ed. Linda Cooke Johnson (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1993), 17. Marme further explains in footnote 1 that during the Northern Song the saying went, “Su Hang baishi fandu, dishang Tian gong 蘇杭百事繁，地上天宮” [At Suzhou and Hangzhou the hundred things multiply many times; it is heaven’s place on earth]. During the Southern Song, Fan Chengda 范成大 cited the saying in his Wujun zhi 吳郡志 as “Tianshang tiangong, dishang Su Hang 天上天宮，地上蘇杭” [In heaven above, there is the heavenly palace; on earth, there are Suzhou and Hangzhou]. Since the thirteenth-century, the phrase has been: “Shang you tiantang, xia you Su Hang 上有天堂，下有蘇杭” [Above there is Heaven; on earth, Suzhou and Hangzhou].

57 Fan Shuzhi 樊樹志, Jiangnan shizhen: chuantong de bianjie 江南市鎮: 傳統的變革 (Shanghai: Fudan daxue chuban she, 2005), 2-27.


59 Flipping through the following records, I found it easy to locate names of artists from the Yangzi River delta, though I did not calculate the total numbers of artists from this area: Xu Qin 徐沁, Ming hualu 明畫錄, in vol. 10 of Zhongguo shuhua quanshu 中國書畫全書, ed. Lu Fusheng 盧輔聖 (Shanghai: Shanghai shuhua chuban she, 1992), 1-36; Zhang Geng 張庚, Guochao huazheng lu 國朝畫徵錄, in vol. 10 of Zhongguo shuhua quanshu 中國書畫全書, ed. Lu Fusheng 盧輔聖 (Shanghai: Shanghai shuhua chuban she, 1992), 423-59; also see Richard M. Barnhart, et al., Three Thousand Years of Chinese Painting (New Haven: Yale University press, 1997), 197-282.

Organization of the Chapters

Based on the existing scholarship that contributes greatly to the exploration of the common themes among the popular versions of *Qingming shanghe tu* and their relationship with Suzhou or cities of Jiangnan, I will further explore the meanings of these common themes in their social and historical contexts—an extraordinary, prosperous age in pre-modern China. In addition, I will examine the diverse themes in each painting represented by the selected six scrolls; that is, instead of considering all these paintings as a block, I will explore how motifs were gradually modified in the process of copying earlier works, which indicates ongoing changes in the painters’ and patrons’ mentalities. I will also investigate how new themes were added and how these themes correspond with the new developments in the Ming-Qing period and reveal people’s appreciation of the new era.

In chapter one, I will deal with the issues of copying and forgery in the Ming-Qing period, and their relationship with the popular *Qingming* scrolls. I will examine literature that provides direction on methods of copying and forging paintings. Then, taking the six selected *Qingming* as examples, I will trace the evidence of copying from Zhang Zeduan’s painting to the popular *Qingming* scrolls, and demonstrate how later popular versions were copied from earlier ones. Furthermore, this analysis also will show how later copies differ from Zhang Zeduan’s scroll and in turn reveal later painters’ and patrons’ changing attitudes and the traces of social change. In addition, I will explore the background of the copyists and forgers as well as the collectors and viewers to discover whose ideal world these paintings construct.

In chapter two, through written records in the Ming and Qing dynasties, I will demonstrate that the popular versions of *Qingming* scrolls were considered to be paintings of “A World of Peace and Prosperity”—an ideal society. Then through analyzing the Beijing scroll and the six paintings of the Ming-to-Qing period, I will
demonstrate that though Qingming scroll painters and patrons began by copying previous paintings, they re-interpreted the subject matter and deleted, modified and added motifs according to their own life experiences and their imaginative renderings of the Northern Song capital through literary works about Bianjing and Zhang Zeduan’s painting; as a result they create distinctive new paintings. Additionally, through iconographic analysis (connection to literary sources) and iconological interpretation (connection to social and historical context), I will explore the meanings of the common and unique themes in these paintings. From the perspectives of time and space, urban economy, material life, political system, social relationship, religion and entertainment, I will show that the images of these paintings relate closely to the economic prosperity and subsequent changing culture of the Ming-to-Qing period. Further, though certain images and values remained throughout the earlier to the later versions, the variety of the Qingming paintings embody divergent visions of an ideal society that were a mixture of differing degrees of conventional ethics with new ways of life in pre-modern China.

In chapter three, I will examine three inscriptions on popular Qingming paintings, and analyze how and why the viewers responded. I will further prove that although Qingming paintings were commonly considered as paintings that depicted a great age, viewers of distinct times, places, and situations responded to these paintings differently. Moreover, these viewers’ responses were examples of patrons’ opinions, and provided sources for Qingming painters to further produce diverse newer versions of the Qingming scrolls.
Chapter 1. Copying *Qingming shanghe tu*

In the history of the transmission of *Qingming shanghe tu*, many terms such as 似本 似本, linben 临本, moben 摹本, fangben 仿本, gaoben 稿本, zhenben 真本, yanben 贛本, and fenben 粉本 have been used to describe how copies and forgeries of the scroll occur.⁶¹ In this chapter, I will review the historical background and the reasons for its widespread copying and counterfeiting, and probe the practices that these terms denote from the Ming to the Qing dynasties. Taking the six selected scrolls as examples for analysis, I will first explore the question of whether they are or are not copies or forgeries of the Beijing scroll, and then, clarify the relationships among these popular versions of the *Qingming* scrolls. I will demonstrate that these terms reveal that the popular versions are not exact replicas of the Beijing scroll. My comparisons of these paintings will provide convincing evidence that marks of copying from the Beijing scroll are evident, but they are not “copies” of the Beijing scroll in the common use of the term. Traces of coping among these popular versions are also present, but they differ from each other in many ways. They represent various constructions of a new social image derived from the title and composition of a popular subject, which I will further explore in chapter two. In addition, a variety of signatures of famous artists on these popular versions were also fakes demonstrating that most of them were counterfeits as well, which testify to the thriving business of copying and forgeries of the *Qingming* scrolls.

Furthermore, I will examine the background of the copyists and forgers as well as the viewers and collectors of the *Qingming* scrolls—the key persons who constructed the world of *Qingming*. I will illustrate that the copyists included well-educated professional

---

⁶¹ English does not offer nuanced translations of these Chinese art historical terms; as such, “improvisation” more closely suggests the subtleties of these methods of creating new artworks than the too-general term “copying.”
painters and uneducated artisans. The patrons ranged from petty merchants to high-level social elites, which shows the common appreciation of a prosperous age from people of a middle-class economic background as well as those who possessed high social status in the Ming-Qing period—the better-off people in Ming-Qing China.

1.1. Copy and Forgery

Generally speaking, in the history of art, a copy is a rendering of a work done in imitation of an original, although there may be differing levels of similarity. A forgery is any work of art made with the intention to deceive, that is, to be passed off as the product of another’s hand or a different period, by diverse means including but not limited to copying a preexisting work. Paintings have always been copied in China for several reasons: preservation of paintings, greater circulation of important works, learning certain brushwork techniques for specific effects, and to make forgeries in order to deceive for personal gain. A forgery, thus, has a close and complicated relationship to a copy; it could be, but is not necessarily, equal to a copy. A forgery may be the duplicate of a preexisting work with a high degree of similarity, or a pure fabrication with little or no similarity to the claimed original.

---

62 In the symposium “The Authenticity of the Copy: Rethinking Mo and Fang (copying) in Chinese Painting and Its Theory,” scholars generally agreed that copies feature more or less degree of similarity with the original. Many of them also asserted the creative or signifying power of the copy, which results in the creation of totally new paintings, such as Tsao Hsingyuan. Her paper “Dip the Brush in Ancient Ink: Dong Qichang's Fang (copying) Theory as a Discourse” argues that scholar painter Dong Qichang’s “copy” could be totally different from the original or overwrite the original in his fang theory and practice. Robert E. Harrist Jr. also found that later successive “copies” of Wang Xizhi’s calligraphy feature infinite variations with distinctive personal touch of the later writers; see Robert E. Harrist, Jr., “Copies, All the Way Down: Notes on the Early Transmission of Calligraphy by Wang Xizhi,” *The East Asian Library Journal* 10, no. 1 (Spring, 2001): 179.


Copying in ancient China was vitally important as the only way to reproduce treasured masterpieces of calligraphy and painting—the two major forms of fine art—in order to perpetuate and circulate them. As early as the fourth century, in his essay on painting, the artist Gu Kaizhi 顧愷之 (ca. 344-406) wrote about the process and technique of copying. In the late fifth-early sixth century, Xie He 謝赫 (479-556) of the Jin dynasty proposed Six Principles (liufa 六法) of making a fine painting, one of which was “to transmit by copying [chuanyi moxie 傳移模寫]” from a model. In the Tang dynasty, Zhang Yanyuan 張彥遠 in his Famous Paintings through History (Lidai minghua ji 歷代名畫記) recorded the tradition and methods of copying precious paintings among collectors, and the official reproduction of artworks for preservation in the Tang imperial court. In addition, he also noted how these copies were prized, such as when Emperor Tang Taizong (599-649) asked contemporary calligraphers to copy Wang Xizhi’s Preface to the Orchid Pavilion Collection and then awarded the copies to nobles and officials. Similar practices existed throughout the dynasties of pre-modern China. Examples include Emperor Song Huizong 宋徽宗 (1082-1135) ordering court painters to make copies of the imperial collections, Su Shi’s friend Cao Guangzhou 曹

65 Ku Kaizhi, Lan Hua 論畫, included in Zhang Yanyuan 張彥遠, Lidai minghua ji 歷代名畫記, in vol. 1 of Zhongguo shuhua quanshu 中國書畫全書, ed. Lu Fusheng 盧輔聖 (Shanghai: Shanghai shuhua chuban she, 1992), juan 5, 141; also see Wen Fong, Beyond Representation: Chinese Painting and Calligraphy 8th-14th Century (New York: Metropolitan Museum of Art; New Haven: Yale University Press, 1992), 95; Rogers, “Second Thoughts on Multiple Recensions,” 49.

66 Xie He 謝赫, Gu huapin lu 古畫品錄, in vol. 1 of Zhongguo shuhua quanshu 中國書畫全書, ed. Lu Fusheng 盧輔聖 (Shanghai: Shanghai shuhua chuban she, 1992), 1. The meaning and translation of the term is according to Wen Fong, “The Problem of Forgeries in Chinese Painting,” Artibus Asiae 25, no. 2/3 (1962), 95, and Wang Yao-ting 王耀庭, Chuanyi moxie 傳移模寫 (Taipei: Guoli gugong bowuyuan, 2007), 14, 114. Scholars generally agree with Wen Fong and Wang Yao-ting’s interpretations; however Han Gang 韓剛 argues that chuanyi moxie does not mean transmitting by copying from a draft or a pre-existing work, but rather transmitting and copying mental images to painting, see his Xie He liufa yizheng 謝赫六法義證 (Beijing: Hebei jiaoyu chuban she, 2009), 200-09.

67 Zhang, Lidai minghua ji 歷代名畫記, 1: juan 2, 127; also see Wang, Chuanyi moxie 傳移模寫, 17, 118.

68 He Yanzhi 何延之, Lanting ji 蘭亭記, included in Zhang Yanyuan 張彥遠, Fashu yaolu 法書要錄, in vol. 1 of Zhongguo shuhua quanshu 中國書畫全書, ed. Lu Fusheng 盧輔聖 (Shanghai: Shanghai shuhua chuban she, 1992), 58; also see Harrist, “Copies, All the Way Down: Notes on the Early Transmission of Calligraphy by Wang Xizhi,” 183.
borrowing a painting of a dragon by Huang Jucai 黃居寯 from him in order to make a traced copy, and the renowned Ming dynasty collector Xiang Yuanbian 項元汴 (1525-1590) who had Qiu Ying make copies of the paintings in his collections.

There are also many examples of how artists copied ancient paintings in order to learn a certain technique, and even retained the copies for later use. One such is the famous mid-Ming dynasty artist Qiu Ying, who was said to have “copied all of the masterpieces by famous painters of the Tang and Song dynasties and kept the copies.”

In Qiu Ying’s album of *Paintings in the Styles of Song Masters* (林 Çalış huace 臨宋人畫冊) (Fig. 8), we find near-identical versions of the Song paintings he copied (Fig. 9). His practice of saving copies of old masters’ paintings is further evident in his reuse of the motifs of old paintings in his new compositions, such as the palace ladies in *Spring Morning in the Han Palace* (漢宮春曉). Here, the motif of palace ladies preparing silk (Fig. 10) comes from a painting attributed to Song Huizong who copied an original by Tang painter Zhang Xuan 張萱 (Fig. 11). The motif of palace ladies playing chess (Fig. 10) derives from a painting of palace ladies attributed to Zhou Fang 周昉 (Fig. 12). The lady playing the pipa, the dancer turning and waving her arms, and the lady clapping her hands for percussion (Fig. 13) are identical in position and movement of the courtesans in Gu Hongzhong’s 顧閎中 (ca. tenth century) *A Night Entertainment of Han Xizai* (韓熙載夜宴圖) (Fig. 14, Fig. 15).

---


71 Wang Shizhen 王世貞, *Yanzhou sibugao 弇州四部稿* (Ming Wanli keben 明萬曆刻本), juan 155, 1680. Wang Shizhen used the term *gaoben 稿本* for copies. The meaning of *gaoben* will be further discussed later.

The history of forgery can be traced back to 470, when Yu He 虞龢 complained about counterfeits of the great calligrapher Wang Xizhi’s works. He described how forgers, after copying Wang’s writings, “used drippings from thatched roofs to soak the papers, and make them look old,” and then sold the fake to a noble for a profit.\(^73\) Another notorious story, dating from the reign of Empress Wu (624-705) of the Tang dynasty, is that of the powerful official Zhang Yizhi 張易之 who urged the empress to direct artisans to make copies of the paintings in the imperial collection, ostensibly for the purpose of preservation. Since the replicas and the mountings were exactly like the originals, Zhang Yizhi was able to steal most of the authentic works and deposit them in his own collection.\(^74\) In this case, the copies were turned into forgeries. Though the forgery of artwork began to appear as early as the fifth century, it was not until the Song dynasty that an industry of forgery emerged. In addition to nobles and the imperial family, many scholar officials became collectors of artworks, which encouraged the rise of art markets and an extensive forgery business. Yet, it was not until the mid-Ming to the mid-Qing dynasties that the art forgery industry reached its peak.\(^75\)

The rise of the art forgery industry in the Ming-Qing period closely followed the above mentioned economic prosperity, which expanded the trend of collecting art not only among nobles and scholarly officials but also to the rising merchant class, who were the key targets of forgers.\(^76\) The late Ming writer Shen Defu (1578-1642) gave a detailed

---


history of the rise of art collecting and forgery during the mid-Ming in the Jiangnan area. After naming nobles and scholars including the powerful Grand Secretary Yan Song and those in the Jiangnan area who collected a tremendous amount of antiques and paintings, he also described the rise of merchant collectors especially Huizhou merchants and the bogus masterpieces in their collections. Shen wrote:

Lately people from Huizhou became government officials [by “donation”]. They are as rich as the Cheng and Zhuo families of Linqiong 臨邛 city [in the Han dynasty] and talk in a lofty strain about the *Illustrated Catalogue of Xuanhe Antiquities* [*Xuanhe bogu tu* 宣和博古圖] as well as the *Catalogues of Calligraphy and Painting* [*Shuhua pu* 書畫譜]. They often prized the fake Zhong brothers’ calligraphies, the fake Mi Haiyue’s [Mi Fu 米芾] letter, and the fake copies of the Tang zither mentioned in the *Chitchat Records at Shengshui* [*Shengshui yantan lu* 滬水燕談錄] as extraordinary treasures.\(^{77}\)

Another record also testified to the rise of merchant collectors. The late Ming-early Qing art dealer Wu Qizhen 吳其貞 (ca. 1609-1681) mentioned in his art records *Notes on Painting and Calligraphy* (*Shuhua ji* 書畫記):

I recall in the past, in terms of collections, there was no place as prosperous as Xiu and She counties in Huizhou. The division between elegance and vulgarity depended on whether they owned antiques or not, therefore [people of Xiu and She] spared no large sums of money and strove for collection. Then, antique sellers from four directions immediately responded to the need and arrived. Itinerant merchants searched for curios out of town and brought them back. Therefore, they gained plenty of treasures.\(^{78}\)

Owning antiques and knowing how to appreciate antiques became the standard for judging a merchant as a person of taste. Thus, the Huizhou merchants were willing to spend large sums of money on their collections. The antique sellers immediately

---


\(^{78}\) Wu Qizhen 吳其貞, *Shuhua ji* 書畫記, in vol. 8 of *Zhongguo shuhua quanshu* 中國書畫全書, ed. Lu Fusheng 盧輔聖 (Shanghai: Shanghai shuhua chuban she, 1992), 46.
responded to their need and arrived with their merchandise; of course, the forgers came
also, as Shen Defu recounted above.

According to Shen Defu, Suzhou was one of the major forgery centers and even
cultural elites were involved in making bogus works in the late Ming. In Suzhou, in
addition to Shantang Street (Shantang jie 山塘街) outside the Chang Gate, Zhuanzhu
Lane (Zhuanzhu xiang 專諸巷) and Peach Blossom Cove (Taohua wu 桃花塢) inside
the Chang Gate were locations where art and antique forgery workshops were located.79
Zhang Fengyi 張鳳翼 (1527-1613) and Wang Zhideng 王穉登 (1535-1612) were two
Suzhou literati elites singled out by Shen Defu as having been involved in the forgery
industry. Shen stated, “In recent generations, no one was as refined and pure as Zhang
Fengyi, yet he could not avoid being involved in it [the forgery business] for his
livelihood. Wang Zhideng was totally dependent on these stratagems for his income.”80
Likewise, in the Qing dynasty, when describing the rows of antique stores at the Chang
gate, where mostly fake paintings were sold, Shao Changheng 邵長蘅 (1637-1704)
observed, “the good artists do not create their own works [anymore, but] copy and take
pride in their close-likeness” to the styles of the old masters in their forgeries.81 His
comment indicates that there were huge numbers of cultural elites and professional artists
making a great amount of spurious art in the Ming-Qing period. No wonder the famed art
colloisseur of Xiang Yuanbian’s time, Zhan Jingfeng 詹景鳳 (1532-1602), once

79 Shen, Wanli yehuo bian 萬曆野獲編: juan 26, 487; Yang, “Tan Mingdai shuhua zuowei 談明代
書畫作偽,” 73; Ellen Johnston Laing, “‘Suzhou Pian’ and Other Dubious Paintings in the Received
80 Shen, Wanli yehuo bian 萬曆野獲編: juan 26, 487; also see Yang, “Tan Mingdai shuhua zuowei
談明代書畫作偽,” 73, and Clunas, Superfluous Things: Material Culture and Social Status in Early
Modern China, 112.
81 Translated by Wai-kam Ho in his essay “Late Ming Literati: Their Cultural and Social Ambience,”
in The Chinese Scholar's Studio: Artistic Life in the Late Ming Period, eds. Chu-tsing Li and James C. Y.
Lived and Worked in Traditional China (New York: Columbia University Press, 1994), 46, and Clunas,
Superfluous Things: Material Culture and Social Status in Early Modern China, 111.
claimed that half of Xiang Yuanbian’s collection was fake. Though it might not be true, it indicates the prevalence and profitability of faking artwork.

In addition to antiques, contemporary works from well-known Suzhou painters were among the favorites in the counterfeit art market. Among these, Qiu Ying’s works and styles were forged most frequently. The most specious or copied subject matter of all was *Qingming shanghe tu* in the name of Zhang Zeduan or Qiu Ying. In other words, *Qingming shanghe tu* was one of the most eagerly accepted subjects and most often collected and viewed paintings in the Ming-Qing era.

1.2. Literature Concerning Copies and Forgeries of the *Qingming* Paintings

Building on the historical background as delineated above, I will examine the writings regarding copying and forgery of the *Qingming* scroll through the colophons of the Zhang Zeduan painting and in the Ming-Qing publications in order to understand how the *Qingming* scroll was duplicated and faked. Literature referred to these paintings as *siben*, *linben*, and *fangben*, implying that they were not exact replicas of the Beijing scroll or any other earlier versions, and that these paintings differ from one other, though sharing some similarities in a general compositional framework and certain motifs. Techniques of copying the original, such as *lin* and *fang*, and of forgery, such as *gai* and *fang*, together with the forms of *gaoben* and *fenben* gave the painters a lot of freedom and room to interpret the themes and contrive new paintings under a particular composition.

---

82 Chung Eun-suk 鄭銀淑, *Xiang Yuanbian zhi shuhua shoucang yu yishu* 項元汴之書畫收藏與藝術 (Taipei: Wenshizhe chuban she, 1984), 209.
84 Ibid., 73; Johnston Laing, “‘Suzhou Pian’ and Other Dubious Paintings in the Received ‘Oeuvre’ of Qiu Ying,” 267.
1.2.1. *Siben, Linben, Mohen, and Fangben*

The earliest record of the making of a copy of Zhang Zeduan’s scroll is a colophon written in the Yuan dynasty after the Zhang Zeduan painting. In 1352, one of the collectors, Yang Zhun 楊準, stated in his colophon that: “The painting had at first been kept in the Yuan imperial collection and then was taken by an official mounter, who substituted it with a copy and sold the original to a high official named so-and-so.”\(^85\) The term Yang Zhun used for the copy is *siben* 似本, meaning “a similar version.” In a situation where the mounter had access to the original, and the copy was “similar” to the original, the copyist would have probably used the technique of *lin* 臨 to reproduce the Zhang Zeduan scroll. In *lin*, or freehand coping, a copyist first studied an original work, placed it next to the paper or silk on which the copy was to be made, then reproduced the particulars of the original in a freehand manner.\(^86\) Although an expert copyist can reproduce a striking likeness of an original, freehand copying is far less exact than the tracing process known by the term *mo* 摹. A tracing copy aims to produce an exact replica of the original. In this method, the copyist places a sheet of paper over the original painting and traces it line-by-line and stroke-by-stroke. The paper used for copying sometimes was coated with a thin layer of wax to make it semi-transparent, allowing the minutest details of the original work to be followed.\(^87\) Another popular way of copying

---

85 Ying, *Shiqu baoji sanbian* 石渠寶笈三編, 187-88; also see Whitfield, “Ch'ang T'Se-t'uan’s Ch'ing-ming Shang-ho T'u,” 165.
in the Ming dynasty was *fang*, in which the copyist imitated the style or spirit of the original with his own interpretation, producing *fangben*, which are the least similar to the original.\(^{88}\) Since a *linben* featured the likeness of the original but was not an exact replica, the *siben* copy that was substituted for the Zhang Zeduan original and was returned to the Yuan imperial collection must have been a *linben* instead of a *moben* or *fangben*.

In the early seventeenth century, several scholars’ random notes recorded the appearance of various *linben* in the markets, indicating the proliferation of the *Qingming* scroll. In 1609 after he retired to his hometown Jiaxing 嘉興, Li Rihua (1565-1635) wrote in his diary about his experiences with several *Qingming* paintings. He began with one scroll brought by a collector to him for appraisal, which he mistook as Zhang Zeduan’s original.\(^ {89}\) Then, he continued, he saw three *linben* of the *Qingming* scroll in the capital but with different content and structures, although all rendered the subject matter well (*juyou yitai* 俱有意態). Li Rihua reasoned that the variations among the *Qingming* scrolls existed because the Song dynasty Huizong Emperor ordered all the court artists to paint the *Qingming* scroll, among which Zhang Zeduan’s version was the best. Then, Li gave details of how the Ming dynasty forger Wang Biao 王彪 copied the original *Qingming shanghe tu* from memory. Every time Wang Biao returned home after viewing the painting, he drew what he remembered, that is, *beilin* 背臨. After viewing the painting over ten times within a two-to-three month period, Wang had completed the entire scroll. It was later sold and presented to the Grand Secretary Yan Song. Li Rihua called the painting a *linben*,\(^ {90}\) and from his note we learn that a copy from memory could


\(^{89}\) According to his description of the content and the inscriptions, this painting is similar to the Liaoning B and Taipei B that I will discuss in details in chapter two. Li, *Weishui xuan riji* 味水軒日記, juan 1, 12-13.

\(^{90}\) Ibid., juan 1, 12. For the *Qingming* paintings he saw, Li also made some comments in *Zitao xuan*.
also referred to as a freehand copy. The reason all these copies were called *linben* by Li Rihua was probably because although they looked different from one another, they shared some similarities, and most likely also shared certain similarities with the *Qingming* painting that Li Rihua judged as the original (no records indicate that Li Rihua ever saw the Beijing scroll in person).

Sun Kuang 孫鑛 (1543-1613) in his *Remarks on the Colophons of Painting and Calligraphy* 書畫跋跋 also recorded how the fake *Qingming* was made and circulated in the capital, and how people perceived it:

I was in one of my old friends’ home in the capital [Beijing] and saw a painted ten-plus-leaf screen on which, according to the owner, is the painting *Qingming shanghe tu*. The owner said: “The Emperor Muzong ordered an artist to add colors to the *Qingming* scroll. I asked the court artist to get one copy of the scroll for me. Though the brushwork in the copy does not look like the original at all, its composition roughly is similar.” When Huang Biao first made the fake *Qingming* [yanben], his story is remarkable. It was said that he got a chance to take a look at the original. Within three days, he completed a copy from his memory. His copy could really confuse elites’ eyes at that time...⁹¹

From this narration, we find that in addition to Suzhou artists/artisans, the court artists also made copies when Zhang Zeduan’s scroll was in the imperial collection. The copy by the court painter probably was *linben*, since the original was at hand and the composition of the copy in general was similar, although the brushwork style was different. In this version of the story, Huang Biao 黃彪 rather than Wang Biao initiated the forgery of the *Qingming* scroll by making the copy from memory.

---

In *Random Gatherings of the Wanli Era* (*Wanli yehuo bian*), Shen Defu likewise narrated artist Huang Biao’s forgery of the original Zhang Zeduan *Qingming shanghe tu*. He recounted that he had viewed several freehand copies (*linben*) of the *Qingming* scroll, and considered it the most copied painting of his time.\(^2\) Shen’s record once again shows the great attention given to the *Qingming* scroll, the large numbers of them in the market, and the diversity of the content in *Qingming* paintings in the late Ming.

There is no way to discover the exact appearance of Huang Biao’s copy, though it was praised for its fine quality. However, a comparison between Huang Gongwang’s 黃公望 (1269-1354) masterpiece *Dwelling in the Fucun Mountains* (*Funcun shanju tu* 富春山居圖) and Shen Zhou’s 沈周 (1427-1509) copy of this painting may give us an idea of how a *beilin* version is similar to or different from its original. From the colophon following the long pictorial scene we learn that he duplicated *Dwelling in the Fucun Mountains* from memory.\(^3\) A comparison indicates considerable discrepancy between the details of the motifs in this work and the original (Fig. 16, Fig. 17, Fig. 18, Fig. 19). The brushwork and ink in the copy fully display Shen Zhou’s soft, moist and steady style, and in addition, light colors have been added. Except for the last section, the copy generally preserves the structure of the original.\(^4\) As artists differ in their level of talent and the excellence of their recollection, we expect that they would produce different qualities when painting from memory. Shen’s case nevertheless provides evidence that a copy from memory will mostly keep to the original composition but may lose detailed motifs, and will feature the personal brushwork as well as new themes or sections by the copier. It suggests that copies from memory will be further removed from the original.

---


\(^3\) Shen Zhou wrote that he originally owned Huang Gongwang’s *Dwelling in the Fucun Mountains*. After asking someone to write an inscription, it was appropriated by his son and sold at a high price. Shen Zhou had no means to buy it back, so on a mid-autumn day of 1487 he painted a copy from memory to record his longing for it. He Chuanxin 何傳馨, *Shanshui hebi: Huang Gongwang yu fuchun shanju tu tezhan* 山水合璧—黃公望與富春山居圖特展 (Taipei: Guoli gugong bowuyuan, 2011), 25, 122, 316.

\(^4\) Ibid., 316.
than freehand copies that were copied alongside the original. Regardless whether a similar copy, a freehand copy, or a copy from memory, the above literature not only shows that in the Yuan and Ming dynasties many versions of *Qingming shanghe tu* were not exact replicas of the Beijing scroll and that there are differences among them, but also reveals that copyists had a great deal of autonomy and opportunities to improvise something new.

### 1.2.2. *Gaoben, Zhenben, and Yanben*

After the first evidence of a copy of the *Qingming* scroll appeared in the Yuan dynasty, the next record of the existence of another version emerged in the mid-Ming in a colophon attached to the Zhang Zeduan painting, referred to as a *gaoben* 稿本. In the late fifteenth century, the Suzhou scholar-official Wu Kuan 吳寬 (1435-1504) viewed the Zhang Zeduan scroll when it was in the collection of the Chief Grand Judge of the Supreme Court (*Dalisi qing* 大理寺卿), Zhu Wenzheng 朱文徵. He wrote a colophon and remarked that “Mr. Zhu says that there is a *gaoben* for this painting in the house of Zhang Yinggong 張英公…” Both Wu Kuan and Zhu Wenzheng were high-ranking officials. Zhang Yinggong was the Duke of Yingguo (*Yingguo gong* 英國公)–Zhang Mao 張懋 (1440-1515)–a high ranking noble. Therefore, these social and cultural elites’ claims of the existence of a *gaoben* were most likely true, and the quality and the similarity of the *gaoben* compared to the original must have been impressive.

---


96 Ying, *Shiqu baoji sanbian* 石渠寶笈三編, 189-90; Whitfield, “*Chang Tse-tuan’s Ch’ing-ming Shang-ho T’u*,” 168.

What did the term *gaoben* mean to Wu Kuan and Zhu Wenzheng? Was it a preparatory drawing for the Zhang Zeduan scroll that was produced prior to the completed work, or a copy after Zhang Zeduan’s scroll that was made for the purpose of further reproduction? The term *gaoben* used in the history of painting can be traced back to the Yuan dynasty connoisseur Tang Hou’s 湯垕 book *Examining Painting* (*Huajian* 畫鑒). He recorded:

I have seen Li Sheng’s 李昇 landscape. When I visited the capital, I saw his Picture of Deities of the Western Mountain [Xiyue jiangling tu 西嶽降靈圖] with hundreds of figures, whose physical features and movements were vividly rendered. Some of the figures do not have details on their face. This [actually] is his gaoben, on which there are inscriptions and seals from the court of Shaoxing [紹興] period [1131-1162]. Those without [the seals and inscriptions] were other Tang dynasty painters’ gaoben.\(^98\)

From the context, it seems that the term *gaoben* refers to preparatory drawings made before the finished work. Late Ming to early Qing scholars Wen Zhenheng 文震亨 (1585-1645) and Tang Zhiqi 唐志契 (1579-1651) mentioned in their publications in the 1620s that Song dynasty Academy of Art court painters had to present a *gaoben* (to the emperors for approval) before they could officially proceed to produce a painting.\(^99\) In these cases, the *gaoben* was also the preliminary work or draft.

However, in other cases, the *gaoben* was a study copy of an earlier work and so was used as a source for reproduction and learning. Ming dynasty scholar Wang Shizhen 王世貞 (1526-1590) once commented that Qiu Ying “copied all of the masterpieces by famous painters of the Tang and Song dynasties and kept the *gaoben*, which [were so


In the Qing dynasty, Zhang Geng 張庚 mentioned that he had seen Dai Siwang’s 戴思望 gaoben of masterpieces, including Wang Mojie’s 王摩詰 Mount Emei after the Snow (Emei xueji tu 峨嵋雪霽圖), Wang Shuming’s 王叔明 Slender Bamboos and Distant Mountains (Xiuju yuanshan tu 修竹遠山圖) or Jiang Guangdao’s 江貫道 Autumn Forests and Solitary Mountain (Qiulin guzhang tu 秋林孤幛圖). It is likely that Dai Siwang’s gaoben were study copies of Wang Mojie’s, Wang Shuming’s and Jiang Guangdao’s paintings. Regardless whether gaoben means a draft or a study copy, these seem to have featured a relatively complete compositions and designs instead of only detailed motifs.

Judging from the above, since Wu Kuan did not give any background information about the appearance of gaoben and how it was used, it seems that the term could refer to either the design for Zhang Zeduan’s painting prior to the final painting or a study copy after the original. Yet, the important point is that the gaoben, if not exactly identical to Zhang Zeduan’s scroll, shared a high level of similarity with the original in terms of content and composition. In addition, the gaoben was available for further reproduction, including multiple-reproduction.

Wang Shizhen’s (1526-1590) writing was actually the earliest published writing—with the exception of the inscriptions on the Zhang Zeduan painting, which only could be seen by a few viewers—in the Ming dynasty to bring up the popularity of the subject matter and the use of gaoben for reproducing and forging the Qingming scroll. In his A Sequel to the Scripts by Yanzhou shanren (Yanzhou shanren xugao 弇州山人續稿) written from 1576 to 1590, Wang mentioned that he had seen the authentic original (zhenben 真本), a forgery (yanben 贗本) and a fake gaoben of Zhang Zeduan’s

---

100 Wang, Yanzhou sibugao 弇州四部稿, juan 155, 1680.
101 Zhang Geng 張庚, Guochao huazheng lu 國朝畫徵錄, 430.
102 According to Wei Hongyuan 魏宏遠, it was not published until 1597-1599. “Shanghai tushuguan ming chaoben yanzhou shanren xugao kao 上海圖書館明抄本弇州山人續稿考,” Tushuguan zazhi 128, no. 11 (2009): 74.
scroll. His narration revealed many important ideas about how the *Qingming* scroll could be copied and forged, and is the model story that was repeated, appropriated, modified and elaborated by later writers, such as the above mentioned Li Rihua, Sun Kuang and Shen Defu. Therefore, it is worth citing at length:

There are authentic [zhēnben] and fake [yānben] versions of Zhang Zeduan’s *Qingming shanghe tu*. I have seen both. In the authentic painting, the figures, vessels and vehicles, bridge and road, buildings and halls are depicted with brushwork as thin as hair, yet still full of strength. It was first collected by the Grand Secretary. Later it entered the palace collection, loved by the Emperor Muzong and was colored with pigments. The fake was made by Huang Biao from the Wu [Suzhou] district. It was said that he obtained a *gaoben* of Zhang Zeduan’s scroll and copied it with variation by deleting and adding some motifs. Yet, the fake [yānben] looks quite different from the authentic [zhēnben], while it is still detailed, delicate and lovely. What the fake lacks is executing with the strength of wrist. Currently it is kept in my younger brother’s home. It seems that the painter of the so-called *gaoben* of Zeduan’s scroll has never seen Zeduan’s version. Zeduan’s painting does not look like featuring the so-called fire-forbidden scene [of the *Qingming* festival]. In addition, though rendered with details and roughness, the brushwork [in Zeduan’s painting] are surprisingly full of strength and ease, which cannot be accomplished by people of recent times. In the Art Academy of Zeduan’s time, there were other court artists also painted the great scene of the Bian River. That is why there are various versions [of the *Qingming shanghe tu*] with differing levels of quality. Yet, the forger in my hometown decided that one of them is authentic, and the other of them, a *gaoben*. On it [the so-called *gaoben*], he asked Peng Kongjia [Peng Nian 彭年, 1505-1566] to write Mr. Li Wenzheng’s [Li Dongyang 李東陽, 1441-1516] note in small-character standard script, Wen Zhengzhong [Wen Zhengming, 1470-1559] to write Mr. Wu Wending’s [Wu Kuan] inscription in Su’s [Dongpong] style, while Zhang Zhu’s [張著] and Yang Zhun’s [楊準] colophons were written by Shoucheng [Wen Peng 文彭, 1498-1573] and Xiucheng [Wen Jia 文嘉, 1501-1583] in small-character running script. In the end, Wang Luzhi’s [Wang Guxiang 王穀祥, 1501-1568] and Lu Zichuan’s [Lu Shidao 陸師道, 1517-c.158] inscriptions are especially refined. Lu’s writing reveals his criticism of the details, yet no one can tell this
painting is not from Zeduan. If among painters, there are good eyes like Huang Changrui [黃長容], how could they counterfeit like this? 103

In addition, Zeduan was not known during the Xuanhe and Zhenghe periods [1111-1125]…While *Qingming shanghe tu* became so prominent after 400 years of its production that it even motivates the powerful Grand Sectary to use deadly means and spend one thousand taels of silver to obtain it, well, it is really incredible… 104

Since the content, brushwork, and inscriptions of the *zhuben* that Wang Shizhen described are very similar to those of the Zhang Zeduan painting, it is very likely that he saw the original painting. 105 The people he mentioned involved in the forgery were his contemporaries and acquaintances. Wang Shizhen exchanged poems with Wen

---

103 Wang, *Yanzhou shanren sibu xugao* 弇州山人四部續稿, juan 168, 1814 “張擇端清明上河圖有真軸本，餘俱僞作，真本人物舟車橋道宮室皆細於髮，而絕老勁有力，初落筆相家，尋籍入天府，為穆廟所愛，飾以丹青。軸本乃吳人黃彪造，或云得擇端稿本加潤活，然與真本殊不相類，而自工緻可念，所乏腕指間力耳，今在家弟所。此卷以為擇端稿本，似未見擇端本者。其所云於禁煙光景亦不似。第筆勢逸驚人，雖小相率，要非近代人所能辦。蓋與擇端同時畫院廝戰，各圖汴河之勝，而有甲乙者也，吾鄉好事人遂定為真稿本，而謁彭孔嘉小楷李文正公記，文徵仲蘇書呂文定頗跋，其張張導楊準跋則壽承，陳承以小行之，豈惟出藍！而最後王業之、陸子傳題字尤精楚。陸於遙慮處，毫髮 princípio殆盡，然不能斷其非擇端筆，使畫家有黃長容那得爾?”

104 Ibid., “又按擇端在宣政間不甚著…而清明上河一圖歷四百年而大顯至勞權相出死構再損千金之直而後得，嘻！亦已甚矣。”

105 Tsao, *Tongzhou gongji* 同舟共濟, 41-42. Kohara, “Seimei jōgazu 清明上河圖,” 232. Kohara believes that Wang Shizhen did not see the original, while Tsao is positive that he did. Kohara argues that Wang Shizhen mentioned that the *zhuben* included a *gongshi* 宮室, which Kohara translates as “palace,” and is colored with *dangqing* 丹青, which he considers to mean heavy colors. Kohara reasons that as Zhang Zeduan’s *Qingming shanghe tu* did not include the palace and is colored with light red and green, what Wang saw was not the original. However, in the late Northern Song imperial catalogue of paintings *Xuanhe huapu* 宣和畫譜 (1120), paintings that prominently displayed architecture were listed under the *gongshi* category. Therefore, Wang Shizhen probably referred to *gongshi* as architecture. See *Xuanhe huapu* 宣和畫譜, in vol. 2 of *Zhongguo shuhua quanshu* 中國書畫全書, ed. Lu Fusheng 陸補生 (Shanghai: Shanghai shuhua chuban she, 1992), 83. In addition, *dang* is a red color, *qing* is a blue or blue-green color, and *dangqing* generally refers to paintings or colors for paintings as well, but not necessarily “heavy colors.” For example, in the remark “Recorded in bamboo and silk, painted by color pigments *[zhubo suozai, dangqing suohua* 竹帛所載，丹青所畫],” in *Sawu zhan* 蘇武傳 of *Hanshu* 漢書, *dangqing* means colors in general. See Ban Gu 班固, *Hanshu* 漢書, ed. Yang Jialuo 楊嘉駿, juan 54, *Hanshu* 漢書, ed. Yang Jialuo 楊嘉駿, juan 54, *Hanshu* 漢書, ed. Yang Jialuo 楊家駿, juan 54, *Hanshu* 漢書, ed. Yang Jialuo 楊家駿, juan 54, *Hanshu* 漢書, ed. Yang Jialuo 楊家駿, juan 54, *Hanshu* 漢書. Accessed March 13, 2012, http://hanchi.ihp.sinica.edu.tw/ihp/hanji.htm. Thus, Wang Shizhen probably meant that the authentic painting included architecture but not a palace and was in color but not necessarily in heavy colors. Another possibility is that what he saw was a close copy of Zhang Zeduan’s painting, since he mentioned that the style of the brushwork was “full of strength”—typical Song style, which he claimed could not be accomplished by people of his time. For the painting of architecture and how the term *gongshi* was used, also see Lin Lina 林莉娜, *Gongshi louge zhi mei: jiehua tezhan* 宮室樓閣之美: 界畫特展 (Taipei: Guoli gugong bowuyuan, 2000), 8, 12.
Zhengming and wrote his biography. He also befriended Wen Zhengming’s sons Wen Peng and Wen Jia, and Wen Zhengming’s disciples Lu Shidao and Wang Guxiang. They all belonged to the upper-level elite circle in Suzhou. Wang Shizhen’s brother kept the Huang Biao version of the fake Qingming. In addition, according to Wang Shizhen’s publication, Huang Biao gave Wang Shizhen his fake copy of Zhao Mengfu’s calligraphy, and painted a portrait for Wang Shizhen’s good friend Yu Yunwen. Thus, his account of how the fake was made is credible. When Wang Shizhen wrote down his experience with Qingming paintings, he reported that there were already many versions of Qingming shanghe tu in the market. As to the variety of Qingming paintings, Wang Shizhen’s interpretation is that they were duplicated from a work of Zhang Zeduan’s peers in the Song court, one of which was arbitrarily named as the gaoben of Zhang Zeduan’s painting by a forger in his hometown, though it was very different from Zhang Zeduan’s scroll. According to Wang Shizhen, Huang Biao forged the Qingming by emulating this so-called gaoben, and added his own


107 Wang Shizhen 王世貞 stated in his preface to Ba’ai pian 八哀篇 that he had eight elder good friends: Lu Zhi 陆治, Peng Nian 彭年, Wen Jia 文嘉, Chen Liu 陈]bool, Lu Shidao 陆师道, Huang Jishui 黄姬水, Gu Shengzi 顾圣之, and Qian Gu 钱毂. Wang, Yanzhou shanren sibu xugao 於州山人四部續稿, juan 3, 33-34; also see Zhuo, “Wang Shizhen shiwen lun yanjiu 王世貞詩文論研究,” 450-52. More about Wang Shizhen’s friends including Wen Peng 文彭 and Wang Guxiang 王穀祥 in the elite circle of Suzhou, see ibid., 462-65. For Wen Zhengming’s friends, relatives and students, see Zhang, Mingshi 明史, juan 287, liechuan 175, wen yuan 3, 7362-64.


109 Wang, Yanzhou shanren sibu xugao 於州山人四部續稿, juan 150, 1601; also see Ye, “Mingdai houqi de shuhua zuowei gaoshou Huang Biao 明代後期的書畫作僞高手黃彪,” 72. For Wang Shizhen and Yu Yuwen’s close relationship, see Zhang, Mingshi 明史, juan 288, liechuan 176, wen yuan 4, 7390, and Zhuo, “Wang Shizhen shiwen lun yanjiu 王世貞詩文論研究,” 441.

110 Wang Shizhen used the term haoshi zhe 好事者 to refer to the person who chose a painting as the gaoben of the Qingming painting and invited artists to add some fake inscriptions. Liu Ginku 劉金庫 interpreted the term haoshi zhe to refer to both a dilettante and forger, see Liu, Nanhua beidu: Qingdai shuhua jiancang zhongxin yanjiu 南畫北渡—清代書畫鑒藏中心研究, 60-61, 93; Clunas translated the term into dilettante, see Clunas, Superfluous Things: Material Culture and Social Status in Early Modern China, 86-87. In Wang Shizhen’s writings however, haoshi zhe means forger.
interpretations. Notably, Wang Shizhen praised this fake, mentioning its delicate style and fine quality.

Since the *gaoben* and the fake mentioned by Wang Shizhen were quite different from the original and the *gaoben* was inscribed with imitations of pre-existing colophons, technically it involved a type of forgery known as change, *gai* 改, and imitation, *fang* 仿. In the *gai* method, the forger makes a fake by attributing an anonymous painting to a known artist;\(^\text{111}\) however in the *fang* method the forger imitates the writings with the style of known inscribers without the original at hand.\(^\text{112}\) The question is: How did the owner of the so-called *gaoben* know who inscribed the original painting and the details of its content?

According to Wang Shizhen, the fake paintings bear colophons by four of the original inscribers: Zhang Zhu 張著, Yang Zhun 楊準, Wu Kuan 吳寬, and Li Dongyang 李東陽. Recent studies of the Zhang Zeduan original show that before the painting entered the Ming imperial collection there were eleven inscribers with twelve colophons mounted after the original painting, as Li Dongyang inscribed it twice. The eleven inscribers are Zhang Zhu (1186), Zhang Gongyao 張公藥 (no date), Li Quan 酈權 (no date), Wang Jian 王礨 (no date), Zhang Shiji 張世積 (no date), Yang Zhun (1352), Liu Han 劉漢 (1354), Li Qi 李祁 (1365), Wu Kuan (no date), Li Dongyang (one poem in 1491 and one note in 1515) and Lu Wang 陸完 (1524). According to Du Mu’s 都穆 (1459-1525) statement when he viewed the painting in Li Dongyang’s collection, among the twelve colophons, the inscriptions by four Jin dynasty writers (Zhang Gongyao, Li Quan, Wang Jian, and Zhang Shiji) were lost around the early sixteenth century.\(^\text{113}\) These lost inscriptions were not found and remounted on the

\(^{111}\) Yang, “Tan Mingdai shuhua zuowei 談明代書畫作僞,” 83-87.

\(^{112}\) Ibid., 83.

\(^{113}\) Probably before 1515, when Li Dongyang inscribed his note, since Du Mu only mentioned Li Dongyang’s poem which had been inscribed in 1491. Du Mu in his records on art Nanhai wenba 南濠文跋 or Yuyi bian 寓意編, published around the late fifteenth-early sixteenth century, stated that he viewed
painting until the eighteenth century by the Qing dynasty collector, Bi Yuan (1730-1797). Therefore, not including the four inscriptions that were lost from the early sixteenth to the late eighteen century, there should have been eight that still existed on the original painting during Wang Shizhen’s time. That is, since only four of the eight colophons were copied, there were four—three remarks (by Liu Han, Li Qi, and Lu Wan) and one poem (by Li Dongyang)—that were not duplicated by the forgers. It indicated that the forgers did not see the original, consequently did not know of the other inscriptions on the painting. Thus, they faked the inscriptions according to other sources. What then, were their sources? Possible sources were publications in the market that included the four colophons they copied. In fact, by the late sixteenth century, among the eight existing colophons on the painting, the four colophons that were copied or forged had all been published, while among the other four colophons that were not copied or forged, two of them—Li Dongyang’s poem and Li Qi’s colophon—were published but were not noticed by the forgers, and the other two—Liu Han’s and Lu Wan’s inscriptions—were not published. Zhang Zhu’s and Yang Zhun’s colophons were recorded in Zhu Cunli’s art collection records Coral Caught with Iron Nets (Tiewang shanhu), published around the late fifteenth to early sixteenth century. Wu Kuan’s colophon was included in his collection, Paoweng’s

---

114 Dai, “Qingming shanghe tu yiben kaoshu.” 121.
115 Lu Wan’s inscription was included in his written collection but it was circulated only in the limited format of a manuscript. Wang Yuming, “Lu Wan yanjiu,” in Liaoning sheng bowuguan, Qingming shanghe tu yanjiu wenxian huibian, 90-91.
116 Zhu Cunli, Tiewang shanhu, in vol. 3 of Zhongguo shuhua quanshu, ed. Lu Fusheng, Lu shuhua quanshu (Shanghai: Shanghai shuhua chuban she, 1992), huapin 1, 658. Tiewang shanhu was compiled by Zhu Cunli in the early sixteenth century and recompiled with extra materials by Zhao Qimei in the seventeenth century. I agree with Dai Liqiang that Zhu Cunli should have
Home Collection (Paoweng jiacang ji 鮆翁家藏集) published in 1508. Li Dongyang’s first inscription, a poem, was included in his The Scripts of Huailu Hall (Hailutang gao 懷麓堂稿) published in 1516, which also included a preface to Li Qi’s Yunyang ji mentioning what Li Qi had inscribed on Zhang Zeduan’s painting. His second inscription, a note, was published in his A Sequel to the Scripts of Huailu Hall (Huailutang xugao 懷麓堂續稿) published in 1517. Li Qi’s colophon was included in his anthology Yunyang ji 雲陽集, published in the late fourteenth century, which was recollected by Li Dongyang (Li Qi’s descendant) and published again around Hongzhi’s reign (1488-1505). Li Qi’s name probably was not as popular and well known as Wu Kuan’s and Li Dongyang’s, so that the forgers did not notice and copy his inscription. In addition, the forger probably only read Li Dongyang’s A Sequel to the Scripts of Huailu Hall with the note, but not The Scripts of Huailu Hall with the poem, since in the latter Li Dongyang included the poem and the preface to Li Qi’s Yunyang ji. If the copyist had read it, he would have copied the poem and tried to find Li Qi’s Yunyang ji for his recorded Zhang Zhu and Yang Zhun’s inscriptions. Dai Liqiang 戴立強, “Sanzhong Qingming shanghe tu zhulu bikan ji 三種清明上河圖著錄比勘記,” Zhongguo lishi wenwu, no. 4 (2006): 78. Regarding different opinions about the authors of Tiewang shanhui, see Xie Wei 謝巍, Zhongguo huaxue zhuzuo kaolu 中國畫學著作考錄 (Shanghai: Shanghai shuhua chuban she, 1998), 303, 378-81; Han Jin 韓進 and Zhu Chunfeng 朱春峰, “Mingdai tiba jilu ti meishu wenxian de chansheng yi tiewang shanhu wei zhongxin de kaocha 明代題跋集錄體美術文獻的產生以鐵網珊瑚為中心的考査,” Tushu qingbao gongzuo 54, no. 19 (2010): 143; Guo Jianping 郭建平, “Shanhu muanan yu tiewang shanhu bu fenjuan tiba kaoshi: Jianlun er shu zoze guishu wenti 珊瑚木難與鐵網珊瑚不分卷題跋考釋—兼論二書作者歸屬問題,” Nanjing yishu xueyuan xuebao, no. 2 (Feb., 2011): 22-26. As mentioned above, around the late fifteenth-early sixteenth century, Du Mu also noticed the inscriptions by Zhang Zhu and Yang Zhun.

117 Wu Kuan 吳寛, Paoweng jiacang ji 鮆翁家藏集 (Sibu congkan jingming zhengde ben 四部叢刊景明正德本), juan 53, 400.

118 Li Dongyang 李東陽, Huailu tang ji 懷麓堂集 (Wenyuan ge siku qianshu ben 文淵閣四庫全書本), juan 9, shigao 9, 75-76, & juan 41, wengao 21, 376; Li Dongyang 李東陽, Li Dongyang xujie 李東陽續集, ed. Qian Zhenmin 錢振民 (Changsha: Yuelu shushe, 1997), 1-6, 294-95. Li Xu 李詡 copied Li Dongyang’s entire second inscription in 1515, except for the last few sentences, see Li Xu 李詡, Jiean laoren manbi 戒篤老人漫筆 (Ming Wanli keben 明萬曆刻本), 13-14. In addition to Li Dongyang’s own publications, this is the only source for his second inscription. The earliest version of Jiean laoren manbi was published in 1597 by Li Xu’s grandson, according to Yang Hongsheng 楊洪升, “Li Xu biaozi yanwu kao 李詡表字沿誤考,” Zhongguo dianji yu wenhua 67, no. 4 (2008): 31. The publication date (1597) of Jiean laoren manbi was later than Wang Shizhen’s reference to the forgery by 1590.
colophon; and yet, it also makes sense that both Li Dongyang’s poem and Li Qi’s colophon were missed altogether by the forger. This explains why only the four colophons that had been published became the targets of the forger in Wang Shizhen’s accounts.

Though today there is no *gaoben* of the *Qingming* painting that has survived, one entry in the catalogue of the *Qing* imperial collection, the *Catalogue of Treasures at the Stone Canal* (Shiqu baoji 石渠寶笈) testifies to the existence of a *gaoben* (most likely of one of the popular versions) for reproducing *Qingming* paintings in the Ming-Qing period, and the explanation under the entry expounds on the nature of a *gaoben*. The record states, “*Qingming shanghe tu gaoben* of Ming dynasty, one scroll, first grade, *diyi* [地一, catalogue number],” then continues, “Monochrome linear drawing on white paper, seven *cun* nine *fen* in width, one *zhang* six *cun* and five *fen* in length.” All the popular *Qingming* paintings extant today were executed in brilliant colors and share varying levels of similarity in composition and motifs. The painters of these *Qingming* scrolls probably reproduced them, like Huang Biao, by copying after a *gaoben*—a monochrome drawing—and added or deleted some motifs before coloring.

### 1.2.3. Fenben

Another term similar to *gaoben* is *fenben*. Ming scholar Jiao Zhou 焦周 mentioned in his random note *Jiaoshi shouku* 焦氏説楛 (published in 1613) that he saw a *fenben* 粉本 of the *Qingming* scroll (probably one of the popular versions):

One big scroll of *fenben* of *Qingming shanghe tu*; the authentic painting was painted by Song dynasty Zhang Zeduan. I did not see it. But this scroll [*fenben*] features the distinction of distance among the city walls, the markets, and the bridges, the height of the houses, cottages, and trees, as well as the various size of horses, oxen, donkeys and camels. There

---

119 Zhang, *Shiqu baoji chubian* 石渠寶笈初編, juan 6, zhu qianqing gong 6 貯乾清宮六, 126.
are also numerous residents and the coming and going of boats and carts; all these are shown in their complete character and in details. It resembles the vast view of Bianjing in the time of its prosperity.\textsuperscript{120}

He praised the quality of this \textit{fenben}, and his description of its contents showed that, like a \textit{gaoben}, it featured a complete composition of a \textit{Qingming} scroll ready for duplication. Xia Wenyan from the Yuan dynasty did mention that “ancient people called \textit{huagao} [畫稿, drafts of paintings] as \textit{fenben}.”\textsuperscript{121} However, I will examine why the particular term \textit{fenben} was used in order to understand the nature of this painting. As I will explain below, \textit{fenben} could refer to a draft of a part or the whole of a composition, or a copy of some detailed motifs from earlier works.

The term \textit{fenben} appeared in the Tang dynasty and referred to the preliminary drawing that was designed by the artist himself before completing his own final work. In the \textit{Records of Tang Dynasty Masterpieces} (\textit{Tangchao minghua lu 唐朝名畫錄}) there is an account of how artist Wu Daozi 吳道子 painted a landscape of the Jialing River in Sichuan on a palace wall after returning from a trip there. When the emperor asked what the painting looked like (before its completion), Wu replied, “I do not need the \textit{fenben}, the scenery is all in my mind.”\textsuperscript{122} Thus, Wu Daozi’s use of \textit{fenben} meant a preliminary drawing. These preliminary drawings could be kept for the artist’s later use. For example, a Song dynasty scholar wrote in his \textit{Records of Masterpieces in Yizhou} (\textit{Yizhou minghua lu 益州名畫錄}) that “Dexuan [德玄] brought hundreds of paintings to the Shu from Liang, Su and Tang dynasties. Those are copies, \textit{fenben}, or calligraphies. They were those lost from the imperial collections. They had circulated in the Shu area. It was the

\begin{flushright}
\textsuperscript{120} Jiao Zhou 焦周, \textit{Jiaoshi shouku 焦氏說估} (Ming Wanli keben 明萬曆刻本), \textit{juan} 7, 130. His description copied some wording in Yang Zhun’s colophon showing that he researched the available literature to compare the \textit{fenben} with the description of the original.
\textsuperscript{121} Xia Wenyan 夏文彥, \textit{Tuhui baojian 圖繪寶鑒}, in vol. 2 of \textit{Zhongguo shuhua quanshu 中國書畫全書}, ed. Lu Fusheng 盧輔聖 (Shanghai: Shanghai shuhua chuban she, 1992), \textit{juan} 1, 848.
\textsuperscript{122} Zhu Jingxuan 朱景玄, \textit{Tangchao minghua lu 唐朝名畫錄}, in vol. 1 of \textit{Zhongguo shuhua quanshu 中國書畫全書}, ed. Lu Fusheng 盧輔聖 (Shanghai: Shanghai shuhua chuban she, 1992), 164.
\end{flushright}
later learners’ luck.” This statement shows that fenben were designed and transmitted from earlier artists and were used as sources by later artists to learn, reproduce, and compose new paintings.

The term fenben literally means “powder” or “pounce” version. There was no written record in the Tang dynasty as to why drafts were called fenben or how they were used. Currently, scholars have proposed two possible practices. Some scholars, based on study of the production practices of the Dunhuang 敦煌 murals and inferring from the materials left in its caves, relate fenben to the pouncing method of copying patterns. First, pricks are made in the drawing at many points along the lines that make up the design. Next, a cloth bag filled with red powder is gently patted onto the perforated surface, and the powder goes through the holes onto the paper or silk (or wall of a mural) to make a dotted outline that serves as guide to the copyist. Some scholars followed Qing scholar Fang Xun’s 方薰 (1736-1799) reasoning and felt that the draft of painting was called fenben because powder was applied on the back of the draft with a brush before a bamboo or wooden awl-like instrument was used to scribe the design of the draft, leaving powder traces on the blank silk or paper indicate where to paint. A pounced version found in Dunhuang (Fig. 20) and the Celestial Rulers of Daoism in Procession 朝元仙杖圖 (Fig. 21) attributed to Wu Zongyuan 武宗元 (d. 1050) show what cartoons and drafts for paintings might have looked like.

---

123 Huang Xiufu 黃休復, Yizhou minghua lu 益州名畫錄, in vol. 1, Zhongguo shuhua quanshu 中國書畫全書, ed. Lu Fusheng 盧輔聖 (Shanghai: Shanghai shuhua chuban she, 1992), 192.
125 Fang Xun 方薰, Shanjing ju lunhua 山靜居論畫 (Qing Zhizhuzhi chuang shu juzhu) 傳知不足齋叢書本, juan shang, 4; Wang, Chuanyi moxie 傳移模寫, 15, 116.
126 Cahill, The Painter’s Practice: How Artists Lived and Worked in Traditional China, 94-95; Fraser, “Formulas of Creativity: Artist's Sketches and Techniques of Copying at Dunhuang,” 189, note 2. Judging by its size, Fraser believed that Wu Zongyuan’s draft was more likely a copy of a wall painting, to be used for restoration.
In addition to indicating a preliminary drawing of a complete composition for a work, the word *fenben* was used more broadly in Ming-Qing texts to designate the sources for composing a painting, such as motifs sketched from nature and study copies of motifs from earlier paintings.¹²⁷ Neither appears as a coherent composition, and both serve as models for further copying and as elements in compositions. Regarding the reference to sketches from nature as *fenben*, the painter Fang Xun mentioned in his *Discussing Painting at the Shanjing Residence (Shanjing ju lunhua)* that people of former times made their own *fenben*, and cited as examples the artists Yi Yuanji 易元吉, Zhao Chang 趙昌, and Tao Yunhu 陶雲湖, who sketched from animals and flowers.¹²⁸ In addition, the celebrated Qing dynasty collector An Qi 安歧 (1683-?) stated in his *Collection of Viewed Ink Works (Moyuan huiguan 墨緣彙觀)* that Mi Youren’s 米友仁 cloudy landscape was so unique because he used fog and cloud as his *fenben*.¹²⁹ Since Chinese artists were studio painters and their works were always finished indoors with their sketches from nature close at hand, what An Qi meant was that Mi Youren sketched from the motifs in nature—fog and cloud—and then used the sketches as *fenben* to compose his landscape.

*Fenben* also referred to copied of motifs (instead of the entire design) from earlier paintings. A good example is the early Qing artist Gu Jianlong’s 顧見龍 (1606-1687) copies of specific details from earlier works (Fig. 22), which included notes to emphasize the stylistic ideas. These were called “*fenben* imitating various styles of ancient paintings [zamo guhui fenben 雜摹古繪粉本],” according to Wang Shimin’s preface.¹³⁰

---

¹²⁷ Cahill, *The Painter’s Practice: How Artists Lived and Worked in Traditional China*, 88-102. Cahill discussed the function of *fenben* as *huagao*, and considered them as drafts before the finished work, study copies from earlier works, and sketches from life. He does not detail how the term was used in the original texts, instead he mentioned ancient texts that refer to drafts not related to the term *fenben* in his discussions. In addition, he did not discuss the term *gaoben*, and did not differentiate *fenben* from *gaoben*.

¹²⁸ Fang, *Shanjing ju lunhua* 山靜居論畫, juan xia, 12.

¹²⁹ An Qi 安歧, *Moyuan huiguan* 墨緣彙觀 (Qing Yueya tang congshu ben 清粤雅堂叢書本), juan 3, minghua shang, 89.

¹³⁰ *Xu Gu Yunchen zamo guhui fenben jian huilu mingong tiba* 序顧雲臣雜摹古繪粉本兼彙錄名
The above literature indicates that the term fenben was generally used more broadly than gaoben. Gaoben refers to the general representation of a whole composition, sometimes with abbreviated details in the interest of clarity. It can be a draft made prior to a finished work or as a study copy after a completed work to be used as a model for a new painting. Though fenben could mean gaoben, it also refers to the detailed motifs sketched from life or copied from earlier paintings instead of the entire design.\textsuperscript{131} However, according to the Ming-Qing texts, both the gaoben and the fenben of the Qingming scrolls featured monochrome ink drawings of nearly complete compositions, which were ready for duplication. The existence of the gaoben and fenben of Qingming shanghe tu are evidence of the reproduction and even multiple-reproductions of the Qingming scroll. With the aid of gaoben and fenben, professional painters, either using their own interpretation or by communicating with their patrons, produced more and various versions of the copies and fakes within certain guidelines to meet their customers’ diverse needs.

1.3. Evidence of Copying and Forgery in the Qingming Scrolls

By carefully comparing the Zhang Zeduan painting with the six selected scrolls, I will show that the Ming-Qing versions of the Qingming paintings are “copies” of Zhang Zeduan’s original painting. Through successive copying and further re-interpretation of the theme, painters of the later Qingming scrolls deviated significantly from the original and created distinctive paintings, yet vestiges of the original remain.\textsuperscript{132} I will discuss the

\textsuperscript{131} Rogers, “Second Thoughts on Multiple Recensions,” 52. Rogers also found that fenben could mean sketches of a complete composition and iconographic details for future use, but his conclusions were based on sketches on the back of sutra fragments dating from the ninth-tenth century and he does not include any examples from the Ming-Qing period.

\textsuperscript{132} I will show in chapter two how the later painters started out by copying and forging, then modified and added motifs in accord with some literary records of Zhang’s painting, and used their life
fake signatures on the popular versions in depth, to provide convincing evidence that these paintings are indeed forgeries.

1.3.1. Copied Motifs

Some motifs in the popular versions, such as the procession of people, the orientation of the arched bridge and city gate tower, the tense situation under the bridge, and the locations of animals and officials with escorts, show that they were copied from Zhang Zeduan’s painting, since descriptions of these cannot be found in any written records that refer to the content of the Beijing scroll. However, these copied motifs also went through some modifications as a result of the painters’ misreadings and new interpretations of the Beijing scroll. This is a good example of what Baxandall’s theory articulates: the later painter is not a passive recipient but an active agent who creates new paintings via various ways, including misunderstanding, copying and adapting previous paintings.

In its opening section, Zhang Zeduan depicted a countryside in which a line of travelers is seen moving towards a city (Fig. 23). The six Ming-Qing versions, like the Beijing scroll, also depict the countryside with a procession of people. Details of this group of figures show evidence that the later versions were based on the Beijing scroll. In it, the people are portrayed as returning from a hunting excursion, indicated by the individuals carrying game birds and a bow. In the procession, a horse rider follows a sedan chair. Later painters converted this procession into a wedding parade. In the Zhao Zhe version (Fig. 24), the Liaoning A (Fig. 25), the Taipei A (Fig. 26) and the Metropolitan versions (Fig. 27), the sedan chair, now occupied by a bride, is still followed by riders on horseback. These riders, a remnant of Zhang’s painting, do not necessarily have to be there, as they look like travelers and so do not belong to the experiences as well as their imagination to create new paintings.
wedding parties. The copiers who developed a new draft for the Liaoning B and Taipei B probably sensed that the travelers were irrelevant, and removed them from the scene (Fig. 28, Fig. 29). However, the procession of people shown against a backdrop of the countryside in the beginning section uncovers the first traces of copying.

In the middle scenes of the scrolls the painters depicted a bridge that arches across the canal. The bridge in Zhang Zeduan’s painting is constructed of wood (Fig. 30) but in the later popular versions it was turned into a stone structure more typical of Suzhou. Due to their foreshortened portrayal all of these were approached from the left rather than from the right, and each features an arch of a similar angle, indicating another mark of copying (Fig. 31, Fig. 32, Fig. 33, Fig. 34, Fig. 35, Fig. 36). In this portion, Zhang Zeduan painted a tense scene under the bridge: two boats passing under the bridge are in danger of colliding, and people work together to overcome this difficulty. Five people at the front of the boat bound upstream yell and point with great exertion, trying to warn the boat bound downstream—half of which is hidden under the bridge—to avoid collision. While one man has both of his arms raised probably in an effort to catch a rope thrown down by the coolies on the bridge, the rest of the sailors handle the mast and oars and strain to hold the boat against the current (Fig. 37, Fig. 38). In the Zhao Zhe version, this scene was copied though it became less dramatic: two men are yelling and pointing to people on another boat, warning of the possible collision, and some sailors are handling the oars, but the effort to catch the rope was deleted (Fig. 39); In Liaoning B, one man is shown trying to catch a rope thrown from the bridge, supposedly for holding the boat, although there is no sign of an impending collision since there is no longer a boat headed downstream (Fig. 40, Fig. 41). In Taipei B, the copyist sensed the awkwardness of the scene in Liaoning B, so he still copied the man standing in the front of the boat but changed his action into calling to or receiving something from someone

133 A theme that Tsao addresses in depth; see Tsao, Tongzhou gongji 同舟共濟.
up on the bridge, but without the former tension (Fig. 42, Fig. 43, Fig. 44). The Liaoning A, Taipei A and Metropolitan version painters also sensed the awkwardness of this scene and deleted it entirely.\(^{134}\) So, we can see that traces of the interaction between the people on the bridge and on the boat that come from the Beijing scroll are present in some of the popular versions.

Beyond the arched bridge, we can see city gates in all of the paintings. Where Zhang Zeduan depicted only one city gate (Fig. 45), the popular versions all feature land and water gates. Most of the land gate towers in the popular versions face in a similar direction, to the right (Fig. 46, Fig. 47, Fig. 48, Fig. 49), except for those in Liaoning B and Taipei B (Fig. 50, Fig. 51). In Zhang Zeduan’s painting, a group of camels pass through the gate and leave the city heading east, while three are still in the city–one is nearly past the gate with half of its body depicted on the right side of the city (Fig. 52). In the popular versions except for Liaoning B, we still find camels, though now their direction has changed so that they enter the city heading west. The strange look of the camels suggests that the later artists had never seen a camel and so pictured them only through copying. In addition, the camel that has exited the city in the original painting was transformed into an ox, an animal the southern artisans were more familiar with, in most of the popular versions (Fig. 53, Fig. 54, Fig. 55, Fig. 56, Fig. 57). Despite this transformation, the identical orientation of the city gate towers and the similar location of the animals still provide evidence that these were copies derived from the Beijing scroll.

The composition of the concluding scenes in the later versions shows the greatest difference from Zhang Zeduan’s painting, but they also reveal a pattern of copying with modifications among the popular versions. The Beijing scroll finishes with an official on

\(^{134}\) In the Liaoning A, Taipei A, and the Metropolitan versions, the boats under the rainbow bridge sail peacefully through the canal (or moor), without any interaction between their passengers and people on other boats or the bridge. This totally removed the tension from the original situation. More about the modifications and changes in the original motifs will be discussed later.
horseback heading eastward escorted by runners as guides (Fig. 58). All of the later versions include the same motif of an official and his escorts, though not in the concluding scene, and with the addition of one more official. (Fig. 59, Fig. 60, Fig. 61, Fig. 62, Fig. 63, Fig. 64).

Regarding the concluding scene in the later versions, the Zhao Zhe version ends with some workers constructing a house (Fig. 65). All of the later scrolls include the motif of house construction. However, following this, Liaoning B ends with an imperial garden (Fig. 66). Taipei A continues with a display of martial skills, and then also ends with an imperial garden (Fig. 67). Liaoning A continues with a street scene, and then also concludes with an imperial garden (Fig. 68), while Taipei B closes with palace ladies on an outing escorted by guards (Fig. 69). In the Metropolitan version, after the image of a house being constructed, the street extends to the other side of the city; then, outside of the city additional exciting activities are included before the painting ends with a village scene (Fig. 70, Fig. 71). The above comparison reveals the relationship between the composition and motifs of the original Zhang Zeduan painting and the popular versions, as well as the relationship among the popular versions. Though changes were made, the evidence of the copying remains.

Kohara has proposed that many later copyists forged the popular versions of the Qingming painting by referring to literary records, since the original Qingming scroll had passed into private hands.\(^{135}\) Though later painters did add themes in accordance with the literature, it was not the whole story. As mentioned earlier, the earliest publication of any inscriptions on Zhang Zeduan’s Qingming shanghe tu was Li Qi’s Yunyang ji in the Yuan dynasty. In the Ming, Li Dongyang’s colophons and Wu Kuan’s inscriptions were included in their own publications respectively. Zhang Zhu’s and Yang Zhun’s inscriptions were published in Zhu Cunli’s art collection records. These colophons were

\(^{135}\) Kohara, “Seimei jōgazu 清明上河圖,” 230.
repeatedly copied in many later publications including the *Catalogue of Calligraphies and Paintings from the Peiwen Study* (*Peiwen zhai shuhua pu* 佩文齋書畫譜) compiled under the order of the Kangxi Emperor (1662-1722). The inscriptions on the original painting were known only to the collectors of the painting until they were recorded in *Catalogue of Treasures at the Stone Canal*, published in 1816. Since the *Catalogue of Treasures at the Stone Canal* was compiled by elite connoisseurs for the imperial family, the literary sources for copyists who did not have access to Zhang Zeduan’s painting were limited to inscriptions by Li Qi, Zhang Zhu, Yang Zhun, Wu Kuan and Li Dongyang. Among them, only Yang Zhun’s and Li Dongyang’s inscriptions included some description about the content of the original painting. Yang Zhun comments:

The compositional arrangement, the distinction of distance and height in the city walls, the markets, the bridges, houses and cottages as well as the distinction in size and importance of grass, trees, horses, oxen, donkeys and camels, some standing still and some walking, the coming and going of boats and carts, all these are shown in their complete characters, yet no one could enumerate them all. This is a vast view of Bianjing in the time of its prosperity.136

Li Dongyang’s poem reads:

A Song master [paints] Bian capital in the period of its full prosperity;  
From all directions jade and silk come by land and water.  
Going up the river on the Qingming was a custom;  
The gentlemen and ladies of the whole city lead children by the hand.  
Within the walls ten thousand houses rise in bright swarms;  
Goods and traders by the hundreds and thousands collect like ants.  
A spring wind blows around the flower pavilions and the willow markets;  
The red towers and the white windows reflect the colors of the morning rays.  
A light dust blows over the fragrant fields of slender grasses;  
Riders are like a whirlwind, moving like clouds.

136 Ying, *Shiqu baoji sanbian* 石渠寶笈三編: 188. Translation by Whitfield, “Chang Tse-tuan’s Ch’ing-ming Shang-ho T’u.” 163-64, but the romanization was changed from Wade-Giles spelling to Hanyu Pinyin with slight modification by this author.
The shadow of the rainbow bridge falls on the waves;  
The helmsmen and the crewmen all have spirit.  
The [sound of the] sheng and singing in the buildings, amusement in the countryside;  
There are those too who drive oxen, cultivating the fields.  
In their eyes each has emotions of grief or pleasure;  
Even though painting is unable to depict them…

Li Dongyang’s note gives more details:

The height of the painting is not a full foot, and it is a little over two zhang [twenty feet] long. The height of a person cannot be as much as an inch, and that of the small ones only a fraction of that, with other things in proportion. From far to near, from general to particular, from the suburbs to the city, the hills are steep and high, crumbing and low, hollow and empty; the water is pale and level, broad and deep, slow and extending a long way, suddenly whirling and in motion; the trees are withered and pollarded, elegant and refined, erect and tall, so abundant that no one knows their end. Of people there are courtiers, gentlemen, farmers, merchants, soothsayers, Buddhists, Daoists, clerks, boatmen, trackers, women, slaves, who walk, sit, give, receive, ask, answer, shout, obey, ride and gallop, carry [loads] on their heads and lift, embrace and lead, guide and shout ahead, hold axes and saws, grasp hoes and spades or cups and jars, open their clothes to fan themselves, are sleepy or asleep, are tired or stretch themselves. Some ride in sedan chairs and pull the curtains aside to look, others make a cart out of planks, or drag along a box without wheels. There are heavy towed barges traveling against the fast current, only progressing with the utmost effort, while around the bridge and on the banks, people stop and stand to watch, all shouting in friendly help, a hundred voices making a single sound. Donkeys, mules, horses, oxen, camels and the like are either laden with packs, or lying down, or resting, or drinking, or feeding, or eating hay from a sack with their heads half-way inside. Buildings include government offices, places where bazaars are held, hamlets in the country, temple retreats, and constructions like doors, windows, screens, fences and walls, many seen one behind the other. The shops sell wine, or food or incense or medicine, or a hundred kinds of miscellaneous things, and all have a sign with their name and surname, the characters

---

137 Ying, Shiqu baoji sanbian 石渠寶笈三編: 190. Poem translated by Whitfield, “Chang Tse-tuan’s Ch’ing-ming Shang-ho T’u.” 169-70, but the romanization was changed from Wade-Giles spelling to Hanyu Pinyin with slight modification by this author.
written fine and small, some so much so that they cannot be read. As to men and objects, their numbers cannot be counted…

Reading through the descriptions of the painting in Yang Zhun’s colophon and Li Dongyang’s poem and note, the above-mentioned traces of Zhang Zeduan’s painting in the popular versions—the procession of people in the beginning section, the interaction between people on the bridge and on the boat, the possible boat collision, the orientation of the bridge and city-gate tower, the animals passing through the gate, the official with escorts—are nowhere to be found. My comparison shows that the popular versions more or less follow Zhang Zeduan’s composition and motifs. This provides compelling evidence that there must have been a copyist who had viewed Zhang Zeduan’s painting in person and made a copy—probably a freehand copy as recorded in Ming dynasty texts—either from memory or side by side with the original. Then, later copyists, forgers or workshop owners developed their own drafts from this closely corresponding copy. Through further copying, new variations and themes developed, though some features of the original still remained.

However, on the other hand, these selective forms of copying reveal a process of adaptation and innovation, which in turn, prove that the later painters are active agents—as Baxandall has argued—and these Qingming paintings are improvised copies, rather than mere imitations. More importantly, the variations indicate changes in painters’ and/or patrons’ interpretations of the subject matter and their attitudes toward their society. For example, the differences in the scene under the bridge between the Beijing scroll and popular Qingming testify that the painters and patrons of the latter did not comprehend the original meaning of the former: working together to overcome difficulty,

138 Ying, Shiqu baoji sanbian: 190-91. Translated by Whitfield, “Chang Tse-tuan’s Ch’ing-ming Shang-ho T’u,” 171-72, but the romanization was changed from Wade-Giles spelling to Hanyu Pinyin with only slight modification by this author.

139 Some motifs in the later versions were forged or added in accordance with the poem and will be addressed later.
signified by the tension of the possible boat collision, as Tsao has argued. They regarded the subject of the Beijing scroll as that of a prosperous age. Thus, the alarming near-collision was incongruent and had no place amongst scenes of abundance and merriment that the painters designed primarily to represent ideal life, drawing on the best parts of their era (which I explore further in chapter two). This misunderstanding and fresh interpretation, as Baxandall would put it, allowed the Ming-Qing Qingming painters to invent a new social image in the name and composition of the famous old painting.

1.3.2. Fake Signatures

Regarding evidence of forgery, of the six selected scrolls, the Liaoning B and Taipei B were signed with the name Zhang Zeduan (Fig. 72, Fig. 73), while the Liaoning A, Taipei A, and the Metropolitan version carried the signature Qiu Ying (Fig. 74, Fig. 75, Fig. 76). Style analysis demonstrates, however, that Zhang Zeduan or Qiu Ying certainly did not sign these paintings. Scholars generally acknowledge that the Zhao Zhe version carries his authentic signature (Fig. 77), and is a copy after other popular Qingming that derived from Zhang Zeduan’s painting.\(^{140}\) Thus, the six scrolls are later copies and/or forgeries of earlier copies and/or forgeries of Zhang Zeduan’s work.

There are no records to prove that Qiu Ying copied Zhang Zeduan’s painting, but the first mention of it came from mid-Ming scholar Shao Guijie 邵圭潔 (1549 provincial graduate juren) in his inscription published in his collection of writings Writings Left Behind by Beiyu (Beiyu yiwen 北虞遺文). He recounted that his teacher, a scholar with the courtesy name Dongzhou 東洲, had collected a tracing copy or moben of a Qingming painted by Qiu Ying.\(^{141}\) Shao’s teacher was most likely the scholar Miao Xuan 繆宣 (1498-1564; 1544 metropolitan graduate jinshi), also from Shao’s hometown.

\(^{140}\) Whitfield, “Chang Tse-tuan’s Ch’ing-ming Shang-ho T’u,” 82-85.

\(^{141}\) Shao Guijie 邵圭潔, Beiyu yiwen 北虞遺文 (Ming Wanli keben 明萬曆刻本), juan 6, 86.
of Changshou 常熟. Miao Xuan had been the Taihe 泰和 county magistrate in Jiangyou 江右 (currently Jiangxi 江西) for three years, but was discharged from the position after a local upheaval and was never able to assume any official position again. 而

Though Shao Guijie praised the quality of the moben, it is very doubtful that it was really a tracing copy actually painted by Qiu Ying. It is also uncertain that Shao Guijie or Miao Xuan had ever viewed the Beijing scroll, and were able to judge whether what they had seen was a moben or even a similar copy. Though both of them belonged to the gentry in their hometown, there is no evidence that they were ever close to any collectors of the original. The Qingming painting in Miao Xuan’s collection did not survive; thus it is not easy to ascertain whether or not it was an authentic work by Qiu Ying. In addition, it is doubtful that Qiu Ying ever made a copy of the Qingming painting. The extant painting, Liaoning A, at one time considered to be a copy by Qiu Ying has since been proven not to come from his hand. 而

To the best of my knowledge, except for Shao’s publication, there is no other reference in Ming dynasty records to copies of a Qingming painting by Qiu Ying until the late seventeenth-early eighteenth century—claimed as moben or fangben by Qiu Ying. 而

Since then, more records of copies by Qiu Ying have appeared. 而

In the late nineteenth century, Lu Xinyuan 陸心源 (1834-1894; 1859 juren) 而

---


143 Chang, “A Flourishing Scene of Prosperity: A Study of the Scroll Qingming shanghe tu Attributed to Qiu Ying,” 31-36.

144 Two Qiu Ying copies appeared in the catalogue of the Qing imperial collection compiled during Qianlong’s reign. A Qiu Ying Qingming moben with a poem by the Qianlong Emperor, written when he was a prince, with the title Bao Qingwang (1733-1735)—that is, the Taipei A version—was recorded in Zhang, Shiqu baoji chubian 石渠寶笈初編, juan 25, zhu chonghua gong 重華宮六, 449-50. A Qiu Ying fangben—probably Liaoning A—was recorded in Wang Jie 王杰 et al., eds. Shiqu baoji xubian 石渠寶笈續編, vol. 1070 of Xuxiu siku quanshu 續修四庫全書, comp. Xuxiu siku quanshu bianzuan weiyuan hui 續修四庫全書編纂委員會 (1793; repri., Shanghai: Shanghai guji, 1995), juan 7, qianqing gong cang 乾清宮藏七, 31. One Qiu Ying fangben was recorded in Liang Zhangju 梁章鉅, Tuian shicun 退菴詩存 (Qing Daoguang keben 清道光刻本), juan 5, 176-78, and one Qiu Ying moben was recorded in Wu Rongguang 吳榮光, Xinchou xiaoxia ji 辛丑銷夏記 (Qing Daoguang keben 清道光刻本), juan 5, 176-78.

145 See table 2.
claimed in his record of viewed and collected paintings that he acquired a *Qingming* painting previously owned by Miao Xuan. According to Lu Xinyuan, this *Qingming* (supposedly by Qiu Ying) included a copy of Li Dongyang’s inscription and a short note by Wen Zhengming, which mentioned that Miao Dongzhou had asked him to add Li Dongyang’s note.\(^{146}\) The authenticity of Lu Xinyuan’s *Qingming* painting is dubious. If this was the painting once collected by Miao Dongzhou, why had Lu not found and recorded Shao Guijie’s inscription? It is also doubtful that Wen Zhengming ever copied Li Dongyang’s inscription on a *Qingming* painting by or attributed to Qiu Ying, though he was mentioned in Wang Shizhen’s writing as being involved in faking Wu Kuan’s inscription on a fake Zhang Zeduan draft or study copy. There are several extant *Qingming* paintings attributed to Qiu Ying that include what is supposed to be a copy of Li Dongyang’s inscription by Wen Zhengming, or a note by Wen Zhengming that adopted a large part of Li Dongyang’s inscription.\(^{147}\) Thus, Lu Xinyuan’s *Qingming* painting probably was a forgery with a fake inscription, which was made by referring to several sources including Shao Guijie’s description of Miao Xuan’s collection, Wang Shizhen’s story that Wen Zhengming copied an inscription on a forgery, and texts that record Wen Zhengming’s relationship to Qiu Ying. However, Shao Guijie’s mention of Qiu Ying’s *Qingming* painting in his writings indicates that versions carrying the falsified signature of Qiu Ying first appeared in the market in the mid-sixteenth century, though these were not as numerous in the Ming as they would become in the Qing dynasty.

In addition to Qiu Ying, other famous artists’ signatures also appeared on *Qingming* paintings, such as Shen Mao 盛懋 (1300-1360), Zhao Boju 趙伯駒 (ca.

---

146 Lu Xinyuan 陸心源. *Rangli guan guoyan lu xulu* 穎梨館過眼錄續錄 (Qing Guangxu wuxing lushi jiashu keben 清光緒吳興陸氏家塾刻本), juan 19, 188-89.

twelfth century), Shi Tao 石濤 (1642-1707), Guo Xi 郭熙 (1023-1085), Min Zhen 閔貞 (1730-?), Xia Zhi 夏芷 (ca. fifteenth century), Qian Gu 錢穀 (1508-1572) and Zhao Yong 趙雍 (1290-ca.1360). Most of these are almost certainly fakes.

Two publications in the late Ming and early Qing list a linben by Yuan dynasty professional painter Shen Mao. In his published inscription the late Ming Suzhou cultural elite Zhang Fengyi (1527-1613) deemed Shen Mao’s freehand copy to be refined and very much like the original. He further claimed that he had seen the original Qingming when it was brought to Wen Zhengming to judge its authenticity by a collector who wanted to purchase the painting from Mr. Gu in Kuanshan, the then owner of the painting. Zhang Fengyi noted that the original had ended up in the hands of a powerful person and then entered the imperial collection;¹⁴⁸ this statement about its whereabouts was correct. Did Wen Zhengming and Zhang Fengyi see the original? This is doubtful. First, among the Suzhou elites, Wu Kuan and Du Mu had seen the original and, as mentioned, both published remarks in their publications. If Wen Zhengming had seen the painting, it is likely that he would have recorded this experience, since the work was legendary and carried inscriptions by both his teacher Wu Kuan and prominent scholar Li Dongyang. His son Wen Jia (1501-1583) recorded Yan Song’s collection including the Qingming painting when he was assigned to examine Yan’s confiscated collections. Later, Wen Jia’s publication remarked that this painting lacked the gaoguqi 高古氣 “high-mindedness of antiquity,” but said not a word about his father’s appraisal.¹⁴⁹ Second, given the fame and probable high value of the painting, it was highly unlikely that Mr. Gu would allow a potential buyer to take the painting away before purchasing it.¹⁵⁰

¹⁴⁸ Zhang Fengyi 張鳳翼, Chushi tang ji 處實堂集 (Ming Wanli keben 明萬曆刻本), houji, juan 5, 523.
¹⁴⁹ Wen Jia 文嘉, Qianshan tang shuhua ji 鉛山堂書畫記, Baibu congshu jicheng 29 百部叢書集成 29, Zhibuzu zhai congshu 知不足齋叢書 (repr. Banqiao: Yiwen chuban she, 1966), 9b.
¹⁵⁰ In the publication, Zhang Fengyi incorrectly recorded Zhang Zeduan. 張“擇”端, as 張“澤”端. Probably this was what the forged signature looked like on the painting that he and Wen Zhengming saw, but it is also possible that it was an error made by the publisher.
Regarding Shen Mao’s copy, prior to Zhang Fengyi’s comments there was no record of the well-known artist Shen Mao having copied a Qingming painting in the Yuan dynasty. This Shen Mao copy was probably a fine copy by a Suzhou vocational artist, who had read Yang Zhun’s inscription and learned about the existence of a Yuan dynasty copy, and so faked Shen Mao’s signature and asked for Zhang Fengyi’s endorsement; as discussed earlier, Zhang Fengyi had been involved in the Suzhou forgery industry. Thus, the paintings that Zhang Fengyi saw and claimed were the Zhang Zeduan original and the Shen Mao copy, which according to him were very similar, were both the products of Suzhou professional artists.

Another of Shen Mao’s freehand copies of the Qingming painting appeared in the late Ming-early Qing scholar Fang Yizhi’s 方以智 (1611-1671) publication, which included his inscription on the painting. He mentioned that he saw two Shen Mao Qingming that had almost identical structures and motifs except for the last part—the imperial garden. In addition, he reported a prose poem by Zhao Lin 趙麟 inscribed on one of the Shen Mao Qingming copies during the years of Emperor Taiding (r. 1324-1328), which suggested that it was probably a fake.\(^\text{151}\) Zhao Lin (birth date unknown) is the grandson of celebrated Yuan dynasty scholar/artist Zhao Mengfu (1254-1322) and the second son of Zhao Yong (1290-ca.1360). He was assigned low level position as Proofreader at Jiangzhe (Jiangzhe xingsheng jianjiao 江浙行省檢校) in 1359. His father Zhao Yong was 34 to 38 years old during Taiding’s reign;\(^\text{152}\) as his second son, at that time Zhao Lin would have been a teenager at most, and was not active as an artist until the second half of the fourteenth century.\(^\text{153}\) In 1359, he and his father

\(^{151}\) Fang Yizhi 方以智, *Fushan ji 浮山集* (Qing Kangxi cicang xuan keben 清康熙此藏軒刻本), juan 1, 251.


\(^{153}\) Fong, *Beyond Representation: Chinese Painting and Calligraphy 8th-14th Century*, 432.
added a horse and a groom respectively to his grandfather’s painting of the same theme, which was dated 1296. Zhao Lin was too young to inscribe a prose poem on a painting in the period 1324-1328, since there was also no record that he had been a young talent. Thus, this Shen Mao copy of *Qingming shanghe tu* with Zhao Lin’s inscription was in all probability a fake.

In the eighteenth-century the scholar Shen Chiran 沈赤然 (1768–1783) published his inscription on a *linben* by Southern Song court painter Zhao Boju. To the best of my knowledge, no earlier records exist of this subject painted by him. Zhao Boju was famous for his blue and green landscapes, which are similar to features seen in the *Qingming shanghe tu*, and many accounts incorrectly relate that the original *Qingming* painting was painted in the Southern Song dynasty; these factors may have inspired professional artists to fake Zhao Boju’s name on the *Qingming* scroll to increase its marketability.

In late Qing dynasty writings, there are records of *Qingming* paintings painted by Shi Tao, Guo Xi, and Min Zhen. Qian Du 錢杜 (1763–1844) maintained that he had seen a *Qingming* painting copied by Shi Tao. However, considering Shi Tao’s untrammeled style of painting, it seems unlikely that he would engage with this subject matter. One extant painting that Whitfield found does bear Shi Tao’s signature, but Whitfield has judged it a forgery. When Wei Yuan 魏源 (1794–1857) saw the scenery in Yangzhou, he compared it with the *Qingming* painting that he believed was by Guo Xi. It is possible that he mistook Zhang Zeduan’s *Qingming* for one by the

---

154 Ibid., 432-36.
156 Qian Du 錢杜, *Songhu huayi* 松壺畫憶, (Qing Guangxu yuyuan cong keben 清光緖榆園叢刻本), juan 10, 20.
158 Wei Yuan 魏源, *Guwei tang shiji* 古微堂詩集, (Qing Tongzhi keben 清同治刻本), juan 10, 112.
prominent court painter Guo Xi, since both were Northern Song painters. It is also possible that he once saw a *Qingming* with the signature of Guo Xi, but if that was the case, it must certainly have been a fake. Xie Kuan 謝堃 (1787-1844) mentioned that he saw several versions of *Qingming* paintings, among them was one by Min Zhen, an eighteenth-century professional artist. Since this painting has not survived, it is uncertain whether Ming Zhen made a copy of the painting. However, his extant paintings show that he was capable of painting many different kinds of subject matter including landscapes, flowers and birds, as well as figures and portraits. Written records show that his ink drawing of Luohan 羅漢 could be confused with Li Gonglin’s work. Yet, he did not write inscriptions on his paintings like other famous Yangzhou professional painters of his time, which is evidence that he was less well educated. Regardless of his lack of education, like other professional painters he was able to render figures in details and could provide for the diverse of needs of his patrons. The popular subject of *Qingming shanghe tu*, which as we know includes numerous figures and objects, might well have been one of his own or his patrons’ choices.

Among extant *Qingming*, Kohara refers to some scrolls that had been attributed to the early Ming professional painter Xia Zhi, the mid-Ming scholar painter Qian Gu, and the Yuan dynasty scholar painter Zhao Yong; to the best of my knowledge there were no *Qingming* paintings attributed to these painters in pre-modern records. Kohara categorized them all as forgeries and determined that the Xia Zhi version, which did not bear Xia Zhi’s signature and did not feature Xia’s style, was a Japanese art critic’s

161 Zhongguo meishu jia renming cidian 中國美術家人名辭典 (Shanghai: Renmin meishu chuban she, 2002), 1120.
162 Bian, “Ming Zhen buzai yangzhou baguai lun 閔貞不在‘揚州八怪’論,” 8.
misattribution, while the Qian Gu and Zhao Yong versions, which bore their signatures, had been forged by artisans.\footnote{Kohara, “Seimei jōgazu 清明上河圖,” 223-228. Among the popular versions, Kohara considers only Zhao Zhe’s signature to be authentic.}

During the Ming-Qing period, many writings reported the wide variety of types of copies and forgeries of Qingming paintings—siben, linben, moben, and fangben—as well as a wide variety of faked signatures of famous artists including Qiu Ying, Zhao Boju, Shen Mao and Shi Tao. The extant Qingming paintings carry additional spurious signatures of renowned artists such as Qian Gu and Zhao Yong. Though it was rare, some professional painters signed their copies with their own names, such as Zhao Zhe and perhaps Ming Zhen. Altogether, this professes to the great variety in the paintings and to the thriving business of copying and forging the Qingming scrolls.

1.4. Copyists and Forgers

In this section, through examination of the written records and surviving paintings, I will argue that the popular versions of Qingming paintings were produced by low-level scholars who lacked a degree but turned to painting as a vocation, or by artisans who apprenticed to a master in order to learn studio painting.

As stated above, many accounts in the Ming-Qing period referred either to Huang Biao or Wang Biao as initiators of the Qingming copies and forgeries. Yang Chenbin and Ye Kangning proposed that Wang Biao and Huang Biao were, in reality, the same person and that it was the identical pronunciation of Huang and Wang in southern China that had confused people when they recorded his last name.\footnote{Yang Chenbin thinks that Wang Biao was mistaken as Huang Biao; Ye Kangning proposes that Huang Biao was the correct name but was miswritten as Wang Biao by Huang’s teacher Zhang Huan. See Yang, “Tan Mingdai shuhua zuowei 談明代書畫作偽,” 76-77; Ye, “Mingdai houqi de shuhua zuowei 明代後期的書畫作偽,” 70-73.} Howard Rogers also considered Wang Biao and Huang Biao to be the same person, but speculated that Wang Biao
changed his last name to Huang in order to escape Yan Song’s anger for his deception. Following the reasoning of Yang and Ye or Rogers, one possibility is that Huang Biao and Wang Biao were indeed the same person, and of the two paintings, one was an early effort, and the other his later work. Another possibility is that they were two artists with similar last names, so that people confused them as well as their work. There are no other paintings available to trace the development of either artist’s painting style or to prove that the two paintings were early and later works. I will treat Huang Biao and Wang Biao as two individuals, since the two paintings appear to have come from different hands, though I will show that the painters had quite similar backgrounds. The painting *Nine Elders* 九老圖  carries an inscription with Huang Biao’s signature, his seals Zhenquan 震泉 and Biao 彪, and a date in accordance with the year 1594 (Wanli Jiawu 萬曆甲午) when he was seventy-four years old by Chinese reckoning (seventy-three by Western calculation) (Fig. 78, Fig. 79, Fig. 80). The painting portrays the story of Tang dynasty poet Bai Juyi’s elegant gathering of eight friends—all celebrated figures over the age of seventy—for drinking and poetry, one of the most painted subjects in the late Ming. The signature and seal are identical to late Ming–early Qing writer Jiang Shaoshu’s description of Huang Biao in his *History of Silent Poem* (Wusheng shishi 無聲詩史): “Huang Biao, sobriquet Zhenquan, was a native of Suzhou…”

---

165 Rogers, “Second Thoughts on Multiple Recensions,” 57.  
166 Ibid. These are the only two paintings I can find by Huang Biao and Wang Biao. According to Rogers, there is another painting, *In Search of Elegance*, with Huang Biao’s signature; however, the reproduction is not clear enough for analysis and since Rogers does not give an explicit source and location of the painting, I have thus far been unable to locate it.  
statement in the style of Wang Xizhi, in which he included several cultural allusions to
the past, such as Emperor Tang Taizong’s commissions of portraits of twenty-four
ministers who had made great contributions, as murals of the Lingyan Hall (Lingyan ge
凌煙閣) and of a painting of eighteen scholars whom the emperor highly respected.

Huang Biao’s inscription demonstrated his knowledge of art, literature and history. After
Huang’s comment, the artist Lu Shiren 陆士仁, son of the famous Suzhou scholar
painter Lu Shidao, inscribed a poem on the Nine Elders in 1595—that is, the year after
Huang Biao’s inscription—indicating that his painting was appreciated by the Suzhou
elite. As mentioned earlier, Wang Shizhen and his brother were acquaintances of Huang
Biao. Judging by Huang Biao’s signature, inscriptions, brushwork and social circle, he
seems to have been a minor artist in Suzhou with a certain level of literary and art
education. Huang probably was a scholar who did not pass the higher civil examination
and so could not qualify to become an official, and thus turned to painting and forgery for
livelihood. However, as far as I know there is no extant Qingming painting featuring the
Huang Biao style of brushwork and rendering in terms of figures, rocks or plants as in the
Nine Elders.

As for Wang Biao, one extant painting is attributed to him. Zhang Huan 張寰
(1485-1561) in his colophon of 1558 (Jiajing wuwu 嘉靖戊午) after the painting The
Peach Spring in Immortal Realms (Taoyuan xianjing tu 桃源仙境圖) (Fig. 81) claimed
that this painting was painted by his disciple Wang Biao. Zhang Huan said Wang Biao
spent three years copying Zhao Boju’s painting The Peach Spring to great acclaim; even
Wen Zhengming praised the work. Zhang Huan was a jinshi in 1541 and friends with

---

169 Ibid., juan 2, 846.
Suzhou elites including Wen Zhengming and Wang Shizhen.\textsuperscript{171} The colophon shows that Wang Biao was likewise familiar with Wen Zhengming and not only reveals Wang Biao’s possible social circle but also his background as an educated man. There are other close copies to this painting, such as the ones in the possession of the Museum of Fine Arts, Boston, the Art Institute of Chicago and the St. Louis Art Museum.\textsuperscript{172} The patterned mountains with contours and stylized trees, such as the pines with spreading, fan-like branches, as well as the delicate brushwork and bright colors are similar to those in the painting *Seeing-off at Xunyang River (Xunyang songbie 濯陽送別)*, attributed to Qiu Ying (Fig. 82). There are several *Qingming* paintings that exhibit the same Wang Biao style of mountains and trees: Liaoning A features the patternized mountains (Fig. 83), while Taipei B and Liaoning B include fan-like pine trees (Fig. 84, Fig. 85). These probably were popular motifs among professional painters in Suzhou ateliers. This assessment of Zhang Huan’s inscription and Wang Biao’s brushwork and possible social circle leads to the conclusion that Wang Biao, like Huang Biao, was a minor artist in Suzhou with a certain level of literary and art education, but probably did not pass the civil examination for officialdom—the most common pursuit for educated men in the Ming dynasty—and so became a professional painter for a living.

Perhaps professional painters, who lacked literary education but received their training from and worked in ateliers, created most *Qingming* paintings. As mentioned by Wan Shide, the collector of the Zhao Zhe version, “Among artisan painters, they spread the word that the painting of *Qingming shanghe tu* mostly depicted the flourishing of great urban peace.” indicating that it was mostly artisans who painted and transmitted

\textsuperscript{171} Zuo Fuan mentioned that Zhang Huan once went on an outing to Stone Lake with Peng Nian, Zhang Fengyi, and Yuan Zunni 袁尊尼, who were also Wang Shizhen’s friends. Zhang Huan had friends in common with Wang Shizhen, showing that they were friends to each other and belonged to the Suzhou elite circle. Zhuo, “Wang Shizhen shiwen lun yanjiu 王世貞詩文論研究,” 374, 466.
\textsuperscript{172} Fu Xiling 傅希齡, “Taoyuan tu yanjiu 桃源圖研究” (Master’s thesis, Guoli Taipei yishu daxue, 2005), 26-29, 35.
Qingming paintings (Fig. 86). Zhao Zhe, though not mentioned in any art historical records, was one of them. Zhao Zhe’s signature was firm but his brushwork was not fluent, and he only signed his name without adding any inscriptions (Fig. 77). Therefore, he, like many other artisans, probably was literate but did not receive as many years of education as those who decided to enter officialdom through civil examination. Instead, Zhao probably obtained vocational training in a Suzhou painting studio. Although he signed his name along with his birthplace or family’s place of origin, Siming 四明 (present day Ningbo 寧波), this does not necessarily mean that he painted the Qingming scroll in Siming. In the Ming dynasty it was a common practice to indicate one’s hometown or ancestral home with one’s signature. For example, on the Zhang Zeduan painting, Li Dongyang signed using both his name and place of family origin, Yunyang 雲陽 (in Hunan 湖南) (Fig. 87), but he was born, grew up and worked in the capital, Beijing, and inscribed the painting there rather than Yunyang. It is possible that Zhao Zhe went to apprentice with a professional painter in a Suzhou atelier, and it was there that he worked on and painted this Qingming scroll in Suzhou.

Many Qingming paintings were probably painted by even less well-educated artisans. Another Qingming painting currently in the Metropolitan Museum (Fig. 88) seems to have been executed by someone semi-illiterate or illiterate. The artisan used clumsy brushstrokes to daub the figures in a scratchy way, indicating that he was not able to handle a brush like an educated man. Some of the characters on the store signs were full of mistakes, such as the last character pin 品 (item) in the sign sishi guopin 四時菓品, “fruit items of four seasons.” The proper character is composed of three squares, yet

---

173 When he inscribed on the painting in 1491, Li Dongyang was working in the capital; when he inscribed on the painting in 1515, he had retired but still lived in the capital. He also died in the capital. Qian Zhenmin 錢振民, Li Dongyang nianpu 李東陽年譜 (Shanghai: Fudan daxue, 1995), especially 1, 12, 122-23, 255, 273-74, 283, 286.

174 For reproductions of the painting, see Albert Carman, “Spring Festival on the River (A Portfolio of Ten Details),” (New York: Metropolitan Museum of Art, 1923).
rather than recognizing the character as he copied from another painting or schema, the artisan instead simply “drew” it with four squares. The word pin 品 is a rather simple character, thus the painter of this scroll revealed his low education by making this kind of mistake.

The above analysis shows that professional painters of diverse backgrounds were involved in making Qingming paintings in the Ming-Qing era. They included those with high educations and friends in elite social circles, such as Huang Biao or Wang Biao, to less well-educated men (of lower social status) like Zhao Zhe, and even less educated artisans like the painter of the clumsily executed Qingming scroll in the Metropolitan Museum.

With regard to how the Qingming painters produced paintings, there are possibilities that a painter single-handedly completed one painting, such as in Huang Biao’s or Wang Biao’s case. It is also likely that many of the popular Qingming scrolls were made collaboratively by a group of painters or assistants specializing in different motifs (such as figures or architecture) or techniques (such as drawing or coloring) under the direction of and monitoring by the workshop owner or a leading painter, since these were popular studio practices during the Ming-Qing period. Therefore, in the following sections and chapters, where I mention the painter of a popular version, this may be taken as meaning a single artist or a group of painters working under and represented by one leading artist.

1.5. Collectors and Viewers

During the Ming-Qing period, the most popular paintings among mainstream literati-connoisseurs were landscapes. Written records tell us that there were still scholars among the collectors and admirers of Qingming scrolls, but others despised the Qingming scroll as vulgar and were surprised by its popularity. From scholars’ writings, it is evident

---

that when they noticed Qingming, they had already achieved popularity in the marketplace. For example, Wang Shizhen stated that a forger of his hometown arbitrarily choose one of the Qingming scrolls in the market and claimed that it was the gaoben of the original; Li Rihua mentioned that he saw several scrolls with variations in Beijing. Those who did not write or did not put effort into writing were probably the main collectors of Qingming paintings, for example, the merchants. Who were these unnamed potential purchasers? In this section, I will explore this question in relation to the prices paid for paintings, and examine the background of known viewers according to available written sources.

Ming-Qing period prices of Qingming paintings offer clues to the general identity of their possible collectors and viewers. Several accounts mentioned that the Zhang Zeduan painting sold for 1200 taels of silver in the mid-Ming,\(^{176}\) and Li Rihua recorded in his diary that he heard that the Huang Biao copy was worth 800 taels of silver.\(^{177}\) Wang Xiangjin 王象晉 (1561-1653) noted that a certain high official was willing to pay more than one hundred taels to obtain a Qingming copy that was in the hands of Zhang Zhuiyin’s 張隹胤 (1527-1588) offspring.\(^{178}\) Regardless of the accuracy of the commentaries, by virtue of being published and publicly circulated these prices represented the value of Qingming paintings in the minds of collectors and forgers. By comparison, a calligraphy by the great Su Shi was also purchased for 800 taels of silver in 1572 and the renowned mid-Ming professional artist Qiu Ying 仇英 was paid 200 taels of silver for his long scroll Spring Morning in the Han Palace 漢宮春曉.\(^{179}\) As for the price of real estate, a mid-level gentry-class large house in the mid to late Ming was

---

\(^{176}\) See footnote 4.
\(^{177}\) Li, *Weishui xuan riji* 味水軒日記: juan 1, 13.
\(^{178}\) Wang Xiangjin 王象晉, *Jiantong zaibi* 剪桐載筆 (Ming Wang yuyang yishu ben 明王漁洋遺書本), 4. Wang Xiangjin’s grandson, Wang Shizhen 王士禛, recorded that it was 3,000 taels. Wang Shizhen 王士禛, *Gufuyu ting zalu* 古夫于亭雜錄 (Qing Wenjuan ge siku quanshu ben 清文淵閣四庫全書本), juan 3, 26-27.
\(^{179}\) Clunas, *Superfluous Things: Material Culture and Social Status in Early Modern China*, 179-180.
worth 200 taels of silver, given that Xu Wei (1521-1593) recorded that he spent 220 taels to build his house of twenty-two bays (jian) on an area of ten mu (approximately 1.7 acres), and Chen Que (1604-1677) recorded that his father spent 200 taels to build a house of twenty bays on six to seven mu (approximately one acre). An investigative report about a dispute between Dong Qichang and some local men reveals that a pawnshop was worth from 300 to 400 taels of silver around 1592. This information tells us that the Zhang Zeduan painting was worth approximately six large houses in a suburb or three to four pawn shops in a city in the late sixteenth century. Thus, the price of the acclaimed Huang Biao copy could buy four large houses in a suburb or two pawnshops in a city, and also equaled the value of Su Shi’s artwork, while the cost of the copy collected by Zhang Zhuiyin was at least half that of a large house.

According to these prices, only upper-class merchants, large landowners, high-ranking officials, and nobles could afford many of the fakes that were offered in the market as the original or fine-quality copies. The wealth of many Huizhou merchants could approach several million taels of silver, according to Xie Zhaozhi (1567-1624), while those with assets of two to three thousand taels were considered only middle level merchants. Records show that high-ranking officials, members of the gentry, and landowners gathered frequently for feasts, the cost of which could range from
three to ten taels of silver.\textsuperscript{184} For them, \textit{Qingming} paintings that cost more than a hundred taels of silver were affordable art.

Differing significantly from the high prices described above, in the early seventeenth century Li Rihua mentioned in a random note that in general stores in the capital, \textit{Qingming} scrolls varying in size and complexity were sold for one tael of silver apiece.\textsuperscript{185} At this point, copies of \textit{Qingming} scrolls must have proliferated and deluged the market. Who, then, could afford a panting that cost one tael? In the late Ming, a county magistrate’s (\textit{zhixian} 知縣) basic salary was 27.49 taels a year,\textsuperscript{186} but he also received extra income from sources such as gifts (or bribes) from local merchants or gentry, which increased his salary by dozens of times.\textsuperscript{187} A soldiers’ salary was eighteen taels a year;\textsuperscript{188} an engraver of printing blocks earned approximately 1.155 taels a month, that is, about 13.86 taels a year;\textsuperscript{189} workers were paid about 0.03 taels a day,\textsuperscript{190} and thus in a year of 300 working days, a laborer earned around nine taels. Many farmers, according to several late Ming and early Qing scholars’ records, could barely support the whole family despite their extremely hard work, and for the most part had no extra money to spend on non-essential items. Landowners, on the other hand, had surplus farm production to sell, especially if they compounded their income with products such as

\textsuperscript{184} Wang, “Mingqing jiangnan xiaofei fengqi yu xiaofei jiegou miaoshu: Mingqing jiangnan xiaofei jingji tance zhi yi” 明清江南消費風氣與消費結構描述: 明清江南消費經濟探測之一,” 34-35.

\textsuperscript{185} Li Rihua, \textit{Zitaoxuan you zhui}, juan 2, 11a-b, in Li, \textit{Zitao xuan zazhi} 3 juan, you zhui 3 juan 紫桃軒雜録 3 卷, 又録 3 卷, 400. In the Qing dynasty, Sun Chengze mentioned that in the capital of the Song dynasty, the \textit{Qingming} scroll sold for one tael per scroll, Sun Chenzhe probably misunderstood Li Rihua. See Sun, \textit{Gengzi xiaoxia ji} 庚子銷夏記: juan 8, 74.


\textsuperscript{188} Huang, \textit{Taxation and Governmental Finance in Sixteenth-Century Ming China}, 184.

\textsuperscript{189} Zhang Xiumin 张秀民, \textit{Zhongguo yinshua shi} 中國印刷史 (Shanghai: Shanghai renmi chuban she, 1989), 747; Bai Lirong 白莉蓉, “Yifen zhengui de Mingdai keshu jiayin ziliao 一份珍貴的明代刻書價銀資料,” \textit{Tushu guan gongzuo yu yanjiu} 2008.72.

\textsuperscript{190} Huang, \textit{Taxation and Governmental Finance in Sixteen-Century Ming China}, 184.
woven cloth, or by planting beans, mulberries, and fruit or by raising animals and fish, and consequently had surplus income as well.\textsuperscript{191} Feng Menglong wrote a fictional—fictional, but no doubt reflecting practices of the late Ming—story of a peddler and oil merchant, Qin Zhong 秦重, who was able to save sixteen taels a year through frugal living (Feng did not mentioned how much he earned).\textsuperscript{192} In late Ming to middle Qing years of normal harvest, one tael purchased approximately one \textit{dan} (nowadays about 70.8 kg) of rice.\textsuperscript{193} According to several scholars’ calculations, in this period a family with five people needed approximately fifteen to eighteen \textit{dan} of rice a year (three to four \textit{dan} per person),\textsuperscript{194} costing about fifteen to eighteen taels of silver. Consequently, a laborer’s family required two breadwinners just to meet the household’s basic expenses for a year. Thus, scholar officials, the rising merchant class, and small landowners—but not laborers or tenet-farmers—could purchase a \textit{Qingming} copy that cost one tael of silver in a general store, equivalent to one-third of a person’s expenditure of rice for a

\textsuperscript{191} Wang Jiafan 王家範, “Mingqing jiangnan xiaofei xingzi yu xiaofei xiaoguo jixi: Mingqing jiangnan xiaofei jingzi yu xiaofei jieguo miaoshu,” \textit{Shanghai shehui kexue yuan xueshu jikan}, no. 2 (1988), 157-159. Wang Jiafan offered the case of Wu Xingsu 鄔行素 as an example of a successful small landowner; after his death, his friend Zhang Lüxiang 張履詳 helped his family to run his ten \textit{mu} of farmland with surplus production.

\textsuperscript{192} “Maiyou lang duzhan huakui 賣油郎獨占花魁,” in Feng Menglong 馮夢龍, \textit{Xingshi hengyan 醒世恆言} (Ming Tianqi ye jingchi kenben 明天啓葉敬池刊本), \textit{juan} 3, 32.

\textsuperscript{193} The price of rice differed from place to place over China’s vast land. The price fluctuated in different times, too, but several scholars concluded that in years of normal harvest the price of one \textit{dan} of rice was generally kept at about one tael of silver in the Southern Yangzi River area. Wang, “Mingqing jiangnan xiaofei fengqi yu xiaofei jieguo miaoshu: Mingqing jiangnan xiaofei jingzi yu xiaofei jieguo miaoshu,” \textit{Shanghai shehui kexue yuan xueshu jikan}, no. 2 (1988), 157-159. Wang Jiafan offered the case of Wu Xingsu 鄔行素 as an example of a successful small landowner; after his death, his friend Zhang Lüxiang 張履詳 helped his family to run his ten \textit{mu} of farmland with surplus production.

\textsuperscript{194} The exchange of \textit{dan} to kilograms, see Wilkinson, \textit{Chinese History: A Manual}, 237.
year. At that time, household almanacs and novels also cost about one tael; therefore readers of these books— aspiring students, holders of lower degrees, petty rural landlords, owners of small businesses, and women from gentry families—were probably also part of this group of viewers and buyers of the *Qingming* paintings.

Since Li Rihua did not complain about the quality of the *Qingming* scrolls that were worth one tael, the crudely executed *Qingming* painting in the Metropolitan Museum mentioned earlier probably cost even less. This work may have been collected by a semi-illiterate or illiterate person, who was not able to identify its faults. Yet, its buyer was most probably a petty merchant or a small landowner without much education rather than a labor or tenant farmer who would not have any extra money to save. The above examples reveal that the range of quality and prices for copies and forgeries of *Qingming* paintings was extremely great, and also indicates that the audience for this subject matter crossed social hierarchical boundaries and varied widely.

During the Qing dynasty, the prices of *Qingming* paintings were rarely recorded. However, the prices in the Ming records quoted above were repeated in many publications. The fame and value of *Qingming* was widely known; even the Qianlong Emperor was a fan of the painting—several copies and forgeries of the *Qingming* were listed in his catalogue of collections. His enthusiasm for it certainly also boosted the market price. One record of the price of the Zhang Zeduan *Qingming* in the Qing dynasty,
which was not publicly known since no Qing dynasty publication recorded it, is worth our attention and can be used as a point of reference for the value of a copy. In his 1792 colophon after the Zhao Zhe *Qingming*, Gui Fu 桂馥 (1736-1805) stated that Lu Danshu 陸丹叔 (Lu Feixi 陸費墀, 1731-1790)—the first owner of the original in the Qing dynasty—obtained the Zhang Zeduan painting for ten taels of silver and showed it to several people, including Weng Fanggang 翁方綱 (1733-1818) (Fig. 89). This is corroborated by Weng Fanggang’s inscription on the Zhao Zhe painting that testified he had seen the original. Since these people were all social elites during Qianlong’s reign (1735-1795) the price quoted for the original *Qingming* painting is likely accurate. Since the owner of the Zhao Zhe version, Song Ruhe 宋汝和, knew that the original was worth ten taels, he probably refused to pay a higher price for the copy.

Regarding incomes and expenditures in the Qianlong Emperor’s reign, a county magistrate’s annual income could reach at least 1000 taels. In the late eighteenth century an actor earned around four to nine taels a year, while carpenters and temporary laborers earned forty-two to sixty taels a year (140-200 wen a day, if he worked 300 days a year). Eating simple meals without meat cost a person of low

---

198 Feng Bao 馮保 inscribed on the Zhang Zeduan scroll and as far as is known, was its latest owner during the Ming dynasty. A seal from Lu Feixi 陸費墀 that appears on the painting suggests he owned the Beijing scroll sometime after Feng Bao.

199 Cahill, *The Painter's Practice: How Artists Lived and Worked in Traditional China*, 58; Zhang Yan 張研, *Qingdai jingji jianshi* (Taipei: Yunlong, 2002), 465, 468-70, 482-83. A county magistrate’s official basic salary per year was forty-five taels of silver and 22.5 dan of rice, with at least 400 taels of silver from special pensions and other income from bribes and other sources. The special pension for “nourishing incorruptibility” ranged from 400 to 2257 taels depending on the location. It was an open and common practice for Qing dynasty officials to receive “gifts.”


202 In the sixtieth year of Qianlong’s reign (1795), one tael of silver equalled 1000 wen of copper coins in the Shangxi area. In the area of the capital, the exchange rate would be similar, according to past records; for example in the sixteenth year of Qianlong’s reign (1751), one tael of silver was worth 781 wen in Shangxi, and was worth 800 wen in the capital. Peng Xinwei 彭信威, *Zhongguo huobi shi 中國貨幣史* (Shanghai: Shanghai renmin chuban she, 1958), 579.
social status thirty-to-forty wen a day, or eleven to 14.6 taels a year; a family of five needed about fifty-five to seventy-three taels for very basic living expenses. Thus, an entertainer’s or carpenter’s family with two breadwinners could not afford a painting for even one tael, since their earnings could barely support a family, never mind one that cost ten taels. It was well known in the eighteenth century that Yangzhou artist Zheng Xie (1693-1765) posted a formal price list for his works: a large-size scroll, six taels of silver; a medium-size scroll, four taels; a small-size scroll, two taels; couplets and streamers, one tael a pair; a fan and an album leaf, a half tael of silver each. Ginger Cheng-chi Hsu used this price list as evidence to argue that much of Zheng’s work was aimed at a middle-income audience including smaller-scale merchants, lower-level gentry and local officials. This same audience probably was also able to afford the popular *Qingming* paintings and likely made up the majority of the *Qingming* viewers.

Next, I will turn to the background of the collectors and viewers who were mentioned in Ming-Qing publications and colophons, summarized in table 2. Of the eighty-four people documented as having viewed the popular versions of *Qingming* paintings, forty-four were *jinshi* degree holders, who usually were assigned to at least (mostly above) the seventh grade of official position, such as a county magistrate.
Fourteen were juren degree holders, who were also qualified to be a county magistrate or lower-level official. Fifteen were the lowest degree holders (government students); among them, nine were students of the national academy. Five were nobles including Emperor Guangzong’s son-in-law Gong Yonggu, the Kangxi Emperor, the Qianlong Emperor, Qianlong’s brother Hong Zhou and one Manchu named Zhen Jun (also a juren degree holder). Two were professional painters. The other five, though it is not clear if they passed any level of civil examination, were officials or writers. Since these individuals were recorded in written texts, it is not surprising to find that most of them came from literary circles, but these statistics confirm that a large number of people in the gentry class, including jinshi and juren degree holders, appreciated Qingming paintings. In addition, many of those viewers without high degrees, such as Wen Zhengming, Zhang Chou, Zhang Dai and Zhou Liqin, came from upper-level gentry families.

Among the viewers, many made positive comments about the popular Qingming paintings, with only a few offering negative criticism. Favorable remarks included “content and structure are different, the renderings of people’s emotions and movements are all outstanding”; “[paintings include objects] in great detail even the hairs are depicted, [the artists] exhaust the mind to paint, figures are vividly rendered with sense of life”; “the painting presents such a spectacular view [with many details] that it is

---

208 Among the fourteen juren degree holders, five were from the Ming dynasty, two from 1644 to 1799, and seven from the nineteenth century.

209 The numbers from the statistics show that more jinshi and juren degree holders viewed the Qingming paintings than low-level scholar xiucai, but since cultural celebrities were more privileged and so able to publish their writings, I am hesitant to claim that they were the majority of the viewers within educated circles. However, the statistics do tell us who were among the viewers. During the Ming-Qing dynasties, private publication was very popular among upper-level scholars; Wang Shenzhong and Tang Shunzhi once mentioned in their conversation that, “When the intellectuals with several decades of study got a degree, they certainly will publish a writing.” In Ye Dehui "Shulin qinghua" juan 7, 120.

210 See table 2, no. 1, 12, 22 and 53.

211 Li, Weishui xuan riji: juan 1, 12. See table 2, no. 11.

212 Shao, Beiyu yiwen: juan 6, 86. See table 2, no. 5.
impossible for viewer to see them all, it is better than reading the *The Imperial Capital* (*Dijing pian* 帝京篇);213 and “extraordinarily lifelike and refined.”214 The comments from two prominent connoisseurs, Dong Qichang and Wang Shizhen, are noticeable; they contributed almost the same remarks but with different tones.215 While Wang noted that although different from the original, the fake *Qingming* was detailed, delicate, and lovely but lacked execution with the full strength of the wrist,216 Dong observed that the *Qingming* copies expressed the thoughts of a great age, but it was a pity that they lacked bone strength, by which he meant weak brushwork.217 Wang praised the painting’s merits, Dong pointed out its themes, and both called attention to the shortcomings of the artist’s technique. Yet, Dong’s words still implied that, even though the painter did not excel in brushwork, he was skilled in conveying a flourishing age.

Shen Defu questioned why the price and fame of the original painting was so high. Hence, though he did not comment on the popular versions directly, he probably did not favor the *Qingming* painting that he saw. Seventeenth-century scholar Peng Sunyi complained that the forgery of the *Qingming* he saw was rough, sketchy and laughable.218 Another seventeenth-century scholar, Li Suiqiu, said that they all looked like the same, but vulgar men all praised them to be wonderful.219 Wan Shide also said that the Zhao Zhe copy was clumsy and crude, though he still liked the scenes of peace and prosperity depicted (Fig. 86). Regardless of the above criticisms, more viewers held positive

213 Hu Weilin 胡維霖, *Hu weilin ji* 胡維霖集 (Ming Chongzhen keben 明崇禎刻本), mochi langyu 墨池浪語, juan 2, 12. See table 2, no. 16.
215 According to the style of the *Qingming* scroll that Dong Qichang saw, it was a popular version, though he might have thought that what he saw was the original.
216 Wang, *Yanzhou shanren sibu xugao* 華州山人四部續稿, juan 168, 1814. See table 2, no. 3.
219 Li Suiqiu 黎遂球, *Lianxu ge ji* 蓮廬閣集 (Qing Kangxi Li Yanzu keben 清康熙黎延祖刻本), juan 16, 149. See table 2, no. 17.
attitudes towards the Qingming copies and forgeries. From this detailed analysis, it is clear that during the Ming-Qing period, the popular versions of Qingming shanghe tu were favored not only among middle-level audiences but also among upper-level elites and nobles.

In this era, there was abundant literature that described the large number of Qingming shanghe tu in the market. They disclosed that no matter how these Qingming scrolls were executed, whether skillfully or clumsily, and no matter how similar or different their content, all contributed to the distinction of this subject matter. Professional painters, including those with a literary education or low-level artisans with little education, produced the Qingming scrolls. Affluent urban residents, landowners, literati and nobles appreciated the Qingming scrolls. Together, they constructed a world different from Zhang Zeduan’s of the original painting. This newly constructed Qingming world represented their concerns and their celebration of the time. These works were not merely “copies” in any commonly used sense, but a new way of looking at the world based on well-known discourse.

---

See table 2 for more details. In addition, though many viewers and collectors did not make comments, their acts of collecting and inscribing reveal their positive attitudes toward the paintings.
Chapter 2. Creating *Qingming shanghe tu*

Later painters had a very different intention than Zhang Zeduan in rendering the *Qingming* scrolls. As a result, they actually painted new paintings even as they appropriated the title, some motifs, and basic composition of his original. In this chapter, drawing on the written records, I will explore the subject matter of popular *Qingming* scrolls and its perception by Ming-Qing viewers. I will show that many writers considered these works to be paintings of a peaceful and prosperous age under the influence of the discourse of a flourishing golden age. I will examine the motifs that were repeated, modified and embellished, and investigate the relationship between these motifs and the conventional values of the era, as well as with the time and space the paintings were produced. That is, through the images that were copied, varied, or newly invented, I will demonstrate how an ideal society was constructed from various traditional customs and special temporal concerns, and how this indicates the enduring needs of the population and their shifting views.

2.1. *Qingming* Painting as a Portrayal of a Peaceful and Prosperous Age

In the Ming-Qing period there is much evidence that clearly indicates that the *Qingming* scroll was perceived as a painting depicting “a world of peace and prosperity.”\(^{221}\) This interpretation was probably influenced by the colophons on the

---

\(^{221}\) See table 2 for viewers’ comments regarding this perception. Some viewers considered that these paintings depicted a peaceful and prosperous age specifically during the Northern Song dynasty. Others such as Wang Shide and, according to him, many *Qingming* painters, considered them as simply representing a world of peace and prosperity (more about him and his comment will be discussed in this section and in chapter three). Even though some viewers believed that Northern Song prosperity was the theme, these are still paintings of a prosperous age. In addition, viewers in the Ming-Qing period such as Fang Yizhi had already discovered that the *Qingming* painters used scenes of the Lower Yangzi to render Northern Song prosperity (for Fang Yizhi’s comment, see item 23 in table 2 or footnote 253). Therefore, it can be generalized that the paintings are perceived as paintings of a world of peace and prosperity.
Beijing scroll, the discourse of *Qingming shengshi* 清明盛世 (a great age under a benign regime), and the literary tradition of using prosperous city as a synecdoche to represent a great empire.

A particular type of intertextuality—Genette’s metatextuality, which reflects the relationship between one text and another that comments on it, whether explicitly cited or implicitly evoked—illustrates how the colophons on the Beijing scroll functioned with regard to its creation and the way people perceived the popular version *Qingming* paintings. Since Zhang Zeduan’s painting was circulated among private collectors, its colophons were not known to the public and, thus, did not influence people’s views until the publications of some the inscriptions by individuals who had seen the painting, for example Li Dongyang, Zhang Zhu and Yang Zhun. As mentioned earlier, Li Dongyang’s first colophons were collected in his *The Scripts of Huailu Hall* and the second ones, in *A Sequel to the Scripts of Huailu Hall*, both published in the early sixteenth century. Zhang Zhu’s and Yang Zhun’s inscriptions were collected in Zhu Cunli’s *Coral Caught with Iron Nets*, also published in the early sixteenth century. Both Li Dongyang and Yang Zhun believed the Beijing scroll depicted the burgeoning Northern Song dynasty, and while Zhang Zhu did not mention anything about its content, he referred to the painting as *Qingming shanghe tu*. Li Dongyang began his first inscription (a poem) with the line “The Song dynasty Bianjing [Song capital] in the period of its full prosperity”; his second inscription (a note) asserted, “This painting must have been made before the Xuanhe and Zhenghe periods, in prosperous and abundant times.” In his colophon, Yang Zhun made the observation, “This is a vast view of Bianjing at the time of its

---

prosperity.” The above inscriptions on the Beijing scroll were quoted in many later publications and influenced the view of Ming-Qing painters and connoisseurs regarding the subject matter of the *Qingming* painting, including those who had never seen the original.

The Ming-Qing professional painters of the popular *Qingming* scrolls held the same view (but with a different emphasis, which I will explain in detail later), for example, on the Zhao Zhe version, painted in the Ming dynasty, its owner Wan Shide wrote, “Among artisan painters, they spread the word that the painting of *Qingming shanghe tu* mostly depicted the flourishing of great urban peace.” The renowned connoisseur Dong Qichang of the late Ming commented that “The *Qingming shanghe tu* of Zhang Zeduan are all Southern Song recollections of the scenery of Bianjing; they have the thinking of the fine men from the West.” The term Dong used, *xifang meiren zhi si* 西方美人之思 (thought of the fine men from the west), was from the *Book of Odes* (*Shijing* 詩經). It means “thinking of the great kings of the Western Zhou,” and implies that the person who wrote the poem longed for the great age during the Western Zhou dynasty (1046-771 BCE). That is, Dong Qichang considered the *Qingming* paintings as the memories of a flourishing age, despite the fact that he mistook these paintings to be painted by Southern Song artists recollecting the prosperity of the Northern Song dynasty. In fact, what he actually viewed were popular versions painted by Ming dynasty professional artists. In addition to Dong Qichang, many Ming-Qing

---


228 The term Dong used, *Xifang meiren zhi si* 西方美人之思, comes from the line “Longing for whom? Handsome men from the west” in *Jianxi 简兮*, Beifeng, *Guofeng of Shijing*; for the interpretation of this line see Mao Heng 毛亨, ed., *Maoshi 毛詩*, annot. Zheng Xun jian 鄭玄 and Lu Demin yinyi 陸德明, (Sibu congkan jingsong ben 四部叢刊景宋本), juan 2, 29.
period viewers of the popular versions believed that the *Qingming shanghe tu* depicted the harmonious and affluent city of Bianjing in the Northern Song, such as Sun Chengze 孫承澤 (1592-1676) (see item 20 and more comments in table 2, “comments on the theme”).

Genette’s hypertextuality, which refers to any relationship uniting one text to an earlier one and suggests the concepts of influence and source, may be used to understand the effect of the discourse of *Qingming shengshi* and the literary tradition of using the flourishing city as a symbol of a great empire on the perception of *Qingming* paintings. The viewers of the *Qingming* scrolls who considered them to be paintings of a great age probably were inspired by the term *qingming* 清明, which appeared twice in the first colophon by Zhang Zhu. Though he did not mentioned the content of the painting, in his colophon Zhang Zhu called the painting *Qingming shanghe tu* and wrote that he inscribed the painting on “the day after the *Qingming*.” The term *qingming* can refer to the *qingming* solar term or the *Qingming* festival, but it also implies *Qingming shengshi*—a great age under a benign regime. It is quite understandable that among scholars, the term *qingming* (clear and bright) can also be used to signify *shengshi*. The last two lines of the poem *Daming* 大明 of the *Major Festival Odes* (Daya 大雅) in the *Book of Odes* read, “*Sifa dashang, huizhao qingming* [肆伐大商, 會朝清明].” According to the Western Han dynasty scholar Mao Heng’s 毛亨 and the Eastern Han dynasty scholar Zheng Xuan’s 鄭玄 (127-200) interpretations, we can translate this as “King Wu quickly attacked the Shang King, and within a short time the world became clear and bright.” Ever since, the term *qingming* was commonly used to refer to a regime of peace and order. For example, in the biography of the historian Ban Gu, we find, “Ban Gu was

---


230 Ibid., *juan* 16, 185; also see Xiao, “Qingming shanghe tu huaming yiyi de zai renshi 清明上河圖畫名意義的再認識,” 577.
lucky to be born in an age of clarity and brightness \( [qingming \ zhishi] \).  

Therefore, the term \( qingming \) was usually used together with another term, \( shengshi \), to form the term \( qingming \ shengshi \), used to describe an ideal world or a great age under a benign regime.

In addition to \( qingming \), scholars commonly linked the term \( taiping \) 太平 (great peace) with \( shengshi \). In the \textit{Mao Edition of the Book of Odes}, in his comments on the poem \textit{Fuyi} 鳥鷄, Mao Heng mentioned that “the ruler of great peace [\( taiping \)] who could keep the prosperity and preserve the achievements would please the gods of heaven and earth and his ancestors.” \(^{232}\) Thereafter, the term \( taiping \ shengshi \) was used frequently.

For example, Ming dynasty scholar Shen Defu wrote that, “I think in the time of \( taiping \ \ shengshi \) it is not extravagant to decorate with lanterns in celebrating the night of the first full moon of the year [the so-called Lantern Festival].” \(^{233}\) This explains why Wan Shide inscribed the Zhao Zhe version with the words, “…the painting of \textit{Qingming \ shanghe \ tu} mostly depicted the flourishing of urban ‘great peace’ [\( duhui \ \ taiping \]).”

The literary tradition of city authors usually rendered a thriving city as the embodiment of times of prosperity and used it as a synecdoche to represent a great empire, which probably also influenced scholars’ interpretation of the \textit{Qingming} scroll(s).

There are two major traditions concerning an ideal society in Chinese literature. One features an idyllic peaceful life, such as chapter 80 of Laozi’s 老子 \textit{Daode jing} 道德經 and Tao Yuanming’s 陶淵明 \textit{Peach Blossom Spring} (\textit{Taohua yuan} 桃花源) and the other, an urban life of both peace and prosperity, such as Ban Gu’s 班固 \textit{prose poem Two Capitals} (\textit{Erdu fu} 二都賦), Luo Binwang’s 駱賓王 (640-684) poem \textit{The Imperial Capital}, and Meng Yuanlao’s 孟元老 \textit{prose A Record of the Eastern Capital: Like

\[^{231}\] “幸得生於清明之世,” in \textit{Bangu zhuan} 班固傳 \textit{of Houhanshu} 後漢書, cited and interpreted by Xiao, “\textit{Qingming \ shanghe \ tu} \ huaming yiyi de zai renshi 慶明上河圖畫名意義的再認識,” 577; Tsao, “Unraveling the Mystery of the Handscroll ‘Qingming \ Shanghe \ tu’,” 168.

\[^{232}\] “太平之君子，能持盈守成，神祇祖考安樂之也,” in Mao, Zheng, and Lu, \textit{Maoshi} 毛詩, \textit{juan} 17, 204.

Dreaming of Hua [Xu] (Dongjing menghua lu  东京夢華錄). In reality, because of the limited positions available in the government and crucial political struggles in the courts, a huge number of literati did not have successful careers in officialdom throughout China’s long history. When disappointed with the courts and/or in times of social turmoil, many literati turned to nature and an idyllic rustic life for consolation or as a subtle means of criticism.\textsuperscript{234} The Daode jing in the sixth century BCE and the Peach Blossom Spring in the fifth century set the foundation for the discourse of an ideal society based on a rural, small-scale society featuring farming villages and peaceful, timeless, self-sufficient and self-governing communities of simple, earthy, kind-hearted people. Thereafter, many frustrated scholars followed this reclusive ideal and so shaped a long tradition in both the paintings and literature of China.\textsuperscript{235} Though the idyllic tradition dominated Chinese literature, most Chinese intellectuals could never forget the imperial court and the city (chaoshi 朝市).\textsuperscript{236} For Confucian scholars, the purpose of education has always been to serve in office. Given the opportunity, they would certainly become an official and work, most usually, in the seat of a local or central government in an urban area.

Deep down in many scholars’ hearts, the prosperity of the capital city represented the glory of the empire. This became more obvious when the empire declined and cities were destroyed; then, the memory of flourishing and bustling urban scenes emerged as an


\textsuperscript{236} Chaoshi literally means the markets in the capital, but was used to refer to the imperial court or any cities where marketplaces were a usual feature. Ciyuan 辞源 (Beijing: Shangwu yinshu guan, 1988), 0805.
important memory of the former golden age. For example, in terms of poetry, after the wars of the late Tang, Li Shanfu 李山甫, in his poem On the Way after the Wars (Luanhou tuzhong 亂後途中), equated the city and market as his homeland. In Ascending a Height to Look Over Louyang (Denggao wang louycheng zuo 登高望洛城作), Wei Yingwu 韋應物 depicted the noisy market, which many scholars usually despised and avoided, as the only positive sight.237 It can be further noted that Meng Yuanlao’s A Record of the Eastern Capital: Like Dreaming of Hua 夢梁録 recreation of the flourishing of the past capital (the Northern Song city of Bianjing) after the author fled to the south to escape the Jurchen invasion. Afterwards, many similar writings appeared and portrayed the hustle and bustle around the capital city as examples of the prosperity of an empire. For example, in the Southern Song and Yuan dynasties, Record of the Splendors of the Capital (Ducheng jisheng 都城紀勝), The Old Man of West Lake’s Record of Multitudinous Splendors (Xihu laoren fansheng lu 西湖老人繁勝錄), All Affairs of the Wulin (Wulin jiushi 武林舊事), and A Record of the Millet Dream (Mengliang lu 夢梁録), all commemorated the Southern Song capital Hangzhou.238 Similarly, in the Ming-Qing period, Accounts of the Subsidiary Capital (Liudu jianwen lu 留都見聞錄), Miscellaneous Records of the Banqiao (Banqiao zaji 板橋雜記), and Records of Dreams of the Capital (Chunming mengyu lu 春明夢餘録) commemorated city life in the former Ming capitals after the Manchu conquest.239 In addition to recollecting the past capitals,
many Ming-Qing writers began to compare the prosperity of their contemporary capitals and other cities to the heyday of the empire. This, in Chinese literary tradition and in the mind of intellectuals, a thriving, wealthy city in a peaceful time has always been the symbol of a great, affluent, and powerful empire. This also explains why, to many scholars, the *Qingming shanghe tu* with its metropolitan scenery portrayed a world of peace and prosperity, and clarifies Wan Shide’s emphasis on this being specifically a representation of an “urban” great peace in his comments on the Zhao Zhe *Qingming* scroll.

Furthermore, authors of literature about cities since the Song dynasty included more accounts of the daily lives of ordinary people, presenting their practices and pleasures as signifiers of good governance, which also influenced viewers’ perceptions of the *Qingming shanghe tu*, since it highlights these kinds of activities. Though a flourishing city was commonly considered as the symbol of a golden age of the empire in literature, there were changing opinions about what represented an affluent city. For example, in most of the prose poems on the capital cities of the Han to the Tang dynasties, imperial court rites and events as well as entertainments enjoyed by the nobility and market scenes were the focus. However, while rites such as the ceremony of the gathering of the imperial court, and restrained imperial entertainments, such as hunting and displays of military maneuvers, were favored as displays of the imperial family’s awesome dignity and manner, the exciting entertainments and conspicuous consumption of nobles and urbanites were denounced. During the Tang dynasty and even more so in the Song.

---

240 Literature about the prosperity of the present capitals includes Gu Qiyuan 顧起元, *Kezuo zhuiyu* 客座贅語, Liu Tong 劉侗 and Yu Yizheng 于奕正, *Dijing jingwu lüe* 帝京景物略. Literature about the prosperity of cities other than the capital includes Yuan Jinglan 臧景藩, *Wujun suihua jili* 吳郡歲華紀麗 and Li Dou, *Yangzhou huafang lu*. See ibid.


242 Li Binghai 李炳海, “Chaozheng yu minsu shixiang de xiaozhang: gudai jingdu fu wenhua 朝政與市民思想的蛻變: 古代京城賦文學”
scenes of the everyday life, thriving markets, and seasonal customs and amusements became the focal points of these works, and were put forward as the results of the good governance of a legitimate regime or virtuous emperor.\textsuperscript{243} In the Ming and Qing dynasties, many authors of prose poems and writings on cities also considered that prosperous markets and commonplace enjoyments represented the glory of an empire,\textsuperscript{244} which apparently was also the attitude of viewers toward the popular \textit{Qingming} scrolls.\textsuperscript{245}


\textsuperscript{244}Ibid., 99-105; Tu Minhua 涂敏華, “Lidai duyi fu yanjiu 歷代都邑賦研究” (PhD diss., Fujian shifan daxue, 2007), 82.

\textsuperscript{245}For prose poems, see Tu, “Lidai duyi fu yanjiu 歷代都邑賦研究,” 66-69, 79-81. For writings on cities in the Ming-Qing period see Yi, “Yi Dongjing menghua lu wei zhongxin de menghua ti wenxue 以東京夢華錄為中心的夢華體文學,” 118. The ideal lives portrayed in tomb murals or reliefs were meant to provide good environments or pleasures for the tomb occupant to (or continue to) enjoy life in the afterlife, but not to eulogize a great age or the glory of an empire. However, the scenes of ordinary people’s everyday lives in funerary art increased from the Han to the Qing dynasty, too. The tombs unearthed since the Han dynasty reveal that tomb murals and reliefs generally feature three major themes: fairyland (or paradise, more explanation later), illustrations of Confucian morality tales, and idealized secular lives. The scenes of ideal secular life were selected from the better parts of life from the tomb occupant’s time, which he may or may not have experienced, with themes such as hunting, fishing, and farming, as well as market scenes, dinner parties and entertainment, etc. From the Tang dynasty the themes changed from those with more mythical images to those with more scenes of daily secular life, and from the Song dynasty depictions of ordinary daily life, mostly with feasts and entertainment, largely exceeded other themes. For the three major themes in Han funerary art, see Wu Hung, “Myths and Legends in Han Funerary Art,” in \textit{Stories from China’s Past: Han Dynasty Pictorial Tomb Reliefs and Archaeological Objects from Sichuan Province, People’s Republic of China}, ed. Lucy Lim (San Francisco: Chinese Culture Center of San Francisco, 1987), 75-80. For the evolution of themes in funerary art throughout the Chinese dynasties, see He Xiling 賀西林 and Li Qiquan 李清泉, \textit{Yongsheng zhiwei: Zhongguo mushi bihua shi 永生之維：中國墓室壁畫史} (Beijing: Gaodeng jiaoyu chuban she, 2009), 453; Wang Xiaoyang 汪小洋, \textit{Zhongguo mushi huihua yanjiu 中國墓室繪畫研究} (Shanghai daxue chuban she, 2010), 199, 295.

\textsuperscript{245}Though some cityscapes in tomb murals appeared from the Han dynasty, such as \textit{Ningcheng tu} 寧城圖, they were rare. Some paintings of city and market scenes on silk before the Beijing \textit{Qingming} scroll were mentioned in painting records, such as \textit{Luozhong chema tu} 洛中車馬圖 and \textit{Yuezhong fengsu tu} 越中風俗圖 of the fifth century, but they are no longer extant. It is, therefore, quite difficult to trace the development of the content of cityscapes before the Beijing scroll. The \textit{Ningcheng tu} depicts the tomb occupant’s—a high-level official—achievements in life. It also shows office buildings, a residence, and services and entertainment for the afterlife. The \textit{Qingming} scrolls since the Song dynasty, by contrast, contain more scenes of ordinary people’s lives and pleasures. If we compare the \textit{Ningcheng tu} and the \textit{Qingming} scrolls, the difference seems to indicate that paintings of cities share a similar trend of development with literature on cities, though the purpose of painting cityscapes by and in the Song dynasty might not be the same as that of literature on cities and of the Ming-Qing period \textit{Qingming} scrolls. For \textit{Ningchen tu}, see Nei menggu zizhi qu wenwu kaogu yanjiu suo 內蒙古自治區文物考古研究所, \textit{Helin geer hannya bihua 和林格爾漢墓壁畫} (Beijing: Wenwu chuban she, 2007), 16-17, 87-91; For \textit{Luozhong chema tu} and \textit{Yuezhong fengsu tu}, see Pei Xiaoyuan 裴孝源, \textit{Zhenguan gongsi huashi 貞觀公私畫史}, in vol. 1 of \textit{Zhongguo shuhua quanshu 中國書畫全書}, ed. Lu Fusheng 盧輔聖 (Shanghai: Shanghai shuhua
As I will demonstrate later, the painters of popular *Qingming* incorporated these two ideals—the rural idyll and urban utopia—into their scrolls, though the urban environment was most prominent.\(^{246}\) I will show that *Qingming* painters of different times and places tended to perpetuate the image of rural life in its traditional pattern, but adjusted their versions of an urban ideal by extracting and selecting the ever changing and better parts of city life of the Ming-Qing period.

### 2.2. Constructing an Ideal World

Even though no writings have survived from the Ming-Qing period that recorded dialogues between *Qingming* painters and viewers, or patrons’ commissions of the popular versions, the painters, their patrons, and viewers must have interacted with each other within the community they shared, no matter how indirectly. Only through a type of community-oriented interaction could they jointly construct the world in the *Qingming* scrolls. We can make this assumption based on the illustrations in certain paintings of sales of finished paintings in the market, and writings that reveal the practices of the painting profession of the Ming-Qing era, as well as Mikhail Bakhtin’s idea of dialogic relationship between writer and reader.

The *Qingming* painters are viewers of anterior *Qingming* paintings and the makers of the later scrolls. They may have had their own readings of earlier examples, and yet it must have been part of their responsibility to incorporate their patrons’ responses and

---

\(^{246}\) I use the term “utopia” to refer to an ideal society consisting of idealized reality extracted from the better part of life in reality, rather than the Western notion of utopia proposed by Thomas More. I am aware that according to Zhang Longxi, the secularism of More’s utopia—the worldliness of the commonwealth on earth instead of the spirituality of paradise in heaven—is similar to Confucian thoughts of an ideal society on earth, see Zhang, “The Utopian Vision, East and West,” 5-8. Zhang Longxi mentioned that the Confucian notion of utopia ruled by sage kings and sustained by moral beings actually was never depicted in a physical picture; ibid., 12. Actually, as mentioned above, in the tomb murals and reliefs since the Han dynasty many Confucian notions of an ideal world with legendary moral beings such as wise kings, sages, filial sons, and virtuous women were portrayed. Some Confucian notions of social relationships will be later discussed and compared with human relations depicted in the popular *Qingming* scrolls.
ideas into the paintings they executed. Many of the popular versions probably were ready-made, since according to the above-mentioned Li Rihua, he saw several Qingming scrolls varying in size and complexity displayed for sale in general stores. Several prints and paintings of the Ming-Qing period, including the popular Qingming paintings (Fig. 195; Fig. 197; Fig. 199; Fig. 200; Fig. 201), illustrated sellers (who may be but are not necessarily the painters) of ready-made paintings attending to or interacting with the viewers or potential buyers of the paintings. These scenes probably show typical occurrences of transactions involving finished paintings, including sales of ready-made Qingming paintings. Even if the sellers were not the painters, since these paintings were produced for the market, the viewers' opinions were likely to be communicated to the painters.

Furthermore, we cannot rule out the possibility of custom-made Qingming paintings created on commission, since in the Ming-Qing period popular ways for painters to do business included both producing artwork on commission and displaying finished paintings in the market. In the case of commissions, the opinions and preferences of the patrons would certainly have been incorporated into the paintings.

In addition, Bakhtin's idea of dialogic relationship between writer and reader is valuable as a way to situate the communication between the painters and viewers of Qingming shanghe tu. Without any records of direct communication between viewers and painters, these popular Qingming paintings can be considered as painters’ monologues, and yet, they actually are dialogues between the painters and voices of viewers. Bakhtin

---

247 For images of this in prints, see an illustration to the drama Yichong yuan 意中緣 by Li Yu, published during the Shunzhi period (1644-1661), collected in Fu Xihua 傅惜華, Zhongguo gudian wensue banhua xuanji 中國古典文學版畫選集 (Shanghai: Shanghai renmin meishu chuban she, 1981), 852. For an image of this in a painting, see Shangyuan dengcai tu 上元燈彩圖 [Colorful Lanterns at Shangyuan], clearly published in a CD-ROM with explanations by Ina Asim, Colorful Lanterns at Shangyuan (Shangyuan dengcai tu 上元燈彩圖) (in English and Chinese), trans. to Chinese by Chang Su-chen (Eugene: University of Oregon, 2004), CD-ROM.

reasoned that in a novel, the characters’ statements are designed in a way that anticipates the possible responses of others. Thus, even the monologue of a character can be considered as a dialogue between him and the voices of others who are invisible, yet present within his remark. Bakhtin also proposed that through dialogue, self and other both undergo processes of change. They influence and are being influenced by each other simultaneously. This recursive process brings to existence what Bakhtin calls the polyphony of voices—the result of understanding and knowledge of self and other by the self in the continuum of time and space. As a result of this dialogic interaction, the *Qingming* painters and viewers experienced changes and mutual influences, co-created new themes (polyphony of voices), encoded new meanings, and enriched the original subject matter with a distinctive form, thereby demonstrating the changing views among both painters and viewers of what made up an ideal world.

In order to understand how and what kinds of worlds the painters constructed, in the following sections I will make comparisons among the six selected paintings, and between these paintings and writings about life and ideology from the sixteenth to the eighteenth centuries from seven perspectives: spatial-temporal features, urban economy, material life, social structure, human relationships, religion, and amusements. Through shared and different motifs, my comparison will show that the artisans copied and decoded earlier paintings using their own and their viewers’ experiences, interpretations, and choices, and then modified and altered what they copied as well as adding new motifs by mimicking their or their viewers’ life experiences to create new *Qingming* paintings. As previously mentioned, Baxandall’s idea of the later painters’ agency, in which successors actively copy and rework predecessors’ ideas to produce paintings that

---

are new in their own right, will further testify to my analysis of how the *Qingming* painters created these paintings.

My comparison will also show that the later *Qingming* scrolls consist of the painters’ incorporation of conventional values and contemporary social codes, which will be supported by Kristeva’s theory that any text is an interconnection among the texts of the author and reader and earlier or contemporary cultural contexts. I will demonstrate that from the earlier popular *Qingming* to the later versions, depictions of a burgeoning urban economy, conspicuous consumption, intimate family relationships, unconventional examples of womanhood, secularized religious life, and a festive atmosphere increased in frequency. Nevertheless, these portrayals all maintained the timeless qualities of a village in the springtime, and featured the geographic characteristics of the Lower Yangzi, a male-dominated social structure, and the political system of the Ming-Qing period. Furthermore, I will explain the ways that many of these changes relate closely to social changes and temporal concerns in the Ming-Qing period. During the extraordinary socio-economic transformation that took place during this time, peoples’ new desires and new attitudes to “the good life” encouraged the painters together with their patrons to create new images of a great age.

I have separated the selected six scrolls into two groups for analysis—Lineage I and II—according to the similarity of their compositions and major motifs. (For the details of the grouping and dating, please see appendix A and table 3.)²⁵⁰ Lineage I includes the Zhao Zhe version (sixteenth century), Liaoning A (early seventeenth century), Taipei A (mid-seventeenth century), and the Metropolitan version (eighteenth century). Lineage II comprises Liaoning B (early seventeenth century) and Taipei B (mid-seventeenth century).

2.2.1. Jiangnan in Springtime

As mentioned earlier, Jiangnan, or the Yangzi delta, was economically and culturally the most advanced place in the Ming-Qing period. Moreover, the Yangzi delta was renowned for its mild weather and beautiful scenery, especially in its best season, spring; for example, the Tang dynasty poet Bo Juyi 白居易 composed *Recalling Jiangnan* (Yi Jiangnan 惆江南) in admiration for springtime in Jiangnan. Since the Song dynasty, there were sayings that claimed two cities in the Yangzi delta were the location of heaven on earth; with its natural beauty and rich cultural and material life, Jiangnan was one of these. As I will show below, painters of popular *Qingming* also choose the Yangzi delta in springtime as the background for their heaven on earth. They tended to render the agrarian community as a timeless rural ideal, though still with some of the natural characteristics of Jiangnan, and made reference to the newly developed cities and towns in the Yangzi delta in depicting the urban area.

The panoramas of the six paintings show that each of the *Qingming* scrolls features a waterside village and city with continuous gently rolling mountain ranges nearby. This environment is typical of the rural and urban areas of Suzhou or the Yangzi delta.251 As Kato’s article on the *Qingming* painting at Okura Shukokan and Chang’s thesis and Yu Hu’s article on the Liaoning Version have proved, some *Qingming* painters referred to the scenery and featured products that they found in the Suzhou area to design the paintings, and yet, they intentionally generalized these objects and scenes.252 Since there are no specific names for the architecture, stores, and locations of

---

251 The whole of Jiangnan features a mild climate of similar warmth and humidity, watery ecology and gentle mountain ranges; Paolo Santangelo, “Urban Society in Late Imperial Suzhou,” in Johnson, *Cities of Jiangnan in Late Imperial China*, 81; Li, *Fazhan yu zhiyue: Mingqing jiangnan shengchan li yanjiu* 發展與制約—明清江南生產力研究, 420-21.

252 Wang cheng-hua also considers that these paintings reflect urban life in a generalized way. Wang, “Guoyan fanhua: wanming chengshi tu, chengshi guan yu wenhua xiaofei de yanjiu” 過眼繁華：晩明城市圖、城市觀與文化消費的研究,” 7.
Suzhou in the *Qingming* paintings, some scholars consider that they illustrated life, not specifically in Suzhou but of cities in the Yangzi River delta. In addition, though these *Qingming* paintings all include similar geographic environments—waterways and mountain ranges—of the area, according to the density of population and amount of commerce depicted in the paintings, they vary from revealing the atmosphere of a small city (for example, Liaoning B) to a metropolitan area (for example, the Metropolitan version). This means that the setting of some of the paintings is closer to the Jiangnan waterside market towns, while some are set closer to a metropolis like Suzhou. It is possible that various *Qingming* painters refer to Suzhou scenery to differing degrees, but it is also possible that they alluded to various urban areas in the Yangzi delta, given the fact that it was easy for artisan painters to travel around the entire area by means of its dense and convenient waterways. Additionally, although Jiangnan in Ming-Qing China was divided by local practices and dialects, it was also united by its consistent image as the land of plenty with its economic prosperity, pretty, gentle landscape full of waterways, and mild climate. Furthermore, during the Ming-Qing period, the refined literati culture of Suzhou—the heartland of the lower Yangzi River region—was a model emulated by other Jiangnan residents; thus the Jiangnan lifestyle more or less coincided with Suzhou’s lifestyle.

I will compare the paintings under discussion with descriptions of the

253 For example, late Ming-early Qing scholar Fang Yizhi, who after viewing two *Qingming* paintings, commented that their painters used Jiangnan’s scenery to construct Northern Song Bianjing, see Fang, *Fushan ji* 浮山集, 251. Some modern scholars also hold the same view, such as Liu Diyu 劉滌宇, see Liu, “Zhongguo gudai shijing tuxiang de shikong tezheng: Lidai qingming shanghe tu bijiao yanjiu 中國古代市井圖像的時空特徵: 历代清明上河圖比較研究,” 33, 42, 64, 98, 106-107, 120, 203, 256, 280, 328.

254 William Skinner’s study shows that in pre-modern China, Jiangnan enjoyed a full hierarchy of urban development ranging from lower-level market towns with a few hundred residents to major cities with over a million inhabitants. Skinner, “Regional Urbanization in Nineteenth Century China,” 238; also see Johnson, *Cities of Jiangnan in Late Imperial China*, x.

255 Ko, *Teachers of the Inner Chambers: Women and Culture in Seventeenth-Century China*, 20-21. Ko argues that Jiangnan was less a physical area with unequivocal boundaries than an economic way of life and a cultural identity. It was noticed by Ming-Qing writers that contemporary individuals imitated and favored outfits, equipments, fashions and customs from Suzhou, for example, Yu Shenxing 于慎行, *Gushan bichen* 谷山筆塵 (Ming Wanli yuwei keben 明萬曆于緯刻本), juan 3, 18, and He Liangjun 何
Suzhou lifestyle found not only in texts about Suzhou but also of other cities and towns in Jiangnan and its outskirts.

The countryside shown in the six paintings demonstrates a very different atmosphere than that of the Beijing scroll. Instead of the chilly early spring of the northern city, where willows have just sprouted and the odd flower blooms, all of the selected paintings feature a warm spring with exuberant trees—mostly willows—and blossoms—mainly peach blooms—in a southern city and its outskirts (Fig. 119, Fig. 120, Fig. 121, Fig. 122, Fig. 123, Fig. 124). The scene is just as sixteenth-century scholar Tian Rucheng 田汝成 (1503-1557) described during the Qingming solar term near the Western Lake of Jiangnan: “The Su Dike is surrounded by shady and dense peach blossoms and willow trees. Red and green intermingled…”

In addition to this image of beauty, the painters probably chose to represent spring because the season also symbolizes prosperity, as the season of mating and births—the increase of all things in profusion. The idea of birth and prosperity is further reinforced by the wedding precession seen near the beginning of all of the six scrolls (Fig. 24, Fig. 25, Fig. 26, Fig. 27, Fig. 28, Fig. 29). As mentioned in chapter one, this procession had its origins in Zhang Zeduan’s group of hunters returning from an outing. According to popular encyclopedias in the Ming-Qing period, marriage represents the origin of all things that flourish in the world: *wanhua zhi yuan* 萬化之原 (= 源) —parallel to springtime in the south, when new life grows rapidly in nature. The Qingming painters
revealed this flourishing world to the viewer later in the scroll. The sense of flourishing in nature is shown by the bright green willows and colorful peach blooms in profusion; in the city, it is demonstrated by the abundant goods and opulent life that I will explore in detail later. The difference in the time of year and the opening motif of the popular Qingming scrolls already suggests that the Ming-Qing painters’ intention—a celebration of creative growth—differed tremendously from Zhang Zeduan’s illustration of cooperation in a time of difficulties to achieve societal change.

Regarding the life of the countryside seen in the Qingming scrolls, the painters of the later versions tended to develop it into an idyll. Among the Lineage I paintings, the Zhao Zhe version includes two farmers who are tilling a paddy field and several cowherds and shepherd boys, who happily play near their livestock (Fig. 125). In Liaoning A and Taipei A, more farmers are depicted working in the fields, while a farmer’s wife brings food to the farmers (Fig. 126, Fig. 127). There are more cowherds and shepherds having fun, including one who casually plays a flute while riding on an ox’s back—a traditional way to render happy village life, and a symbol of an abundant and peaceful age, according to the illustrated encyclopedia Pictorial Compendium of the Three Powers (Sancai tuhui 三才圖會) of the Ming dynasty. Though Lineage II paintings included fewer farmers and cowherds, the farmers were depicted as cheerfully going to or working in the fields, and the theme of a cowherd playing a flute on an ox’s back is also present in both paintings (Fig. 128, Fig. 129). That is, all the Qingming painters during the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries portrayed village life as a rural idyll complete with the features of the natural environment of Jiangnan.

In the eighteenth-century Metropolitan version, the theme of village life was not only copied but also augmented, and appears at both the beginning and the end of the

---

painting. Motifs from previous paintings are developed further: even more boys play various games near the fields and herd (or ride) cattle, villagers chat pleasantly with each other, and near expansive rice paddies a farmer’s family enjoys a party in the yard (Fig. 130). Although these motifs include features of the Lower Yangzi, they are very similar to those in another popular painting of the Ming-Qing period, *Peach Blossom Spring*, which presents pastoral scenes of rice fields, farmhouses, domesticated animals and fowl, as well as pleasant villagers (Fig. 131).

However, these scenes in the *Qingming* scrolls do not match the reality of village life in the Yangzi delta in the Ming-Qing period. Many investigations have revealed that after the mid-Ming, the rural Jiangnan landscape was transformed from one of pure rice cultivation to more diversified production and even included cash crops such as mulberry or cotton trees to take advantage the rising domestic and global textile markets. Traditionally, rice farming was the main source of support for Chinese families in rural Jiangnan; in the Ming-Qing era, peasants’ income was primarily derived from cultivating mulberry and cotton and/or weaving silk and cotton cloth in the Lower Yangzi region.

The silk production areas of the Yangzi delta in the Ming-Qing period were located around Lake Tai of the Southern Jiangsu and northern Zhejiang provinces. In this area during the first month of the lunar calendar, men were first occupied by tilling and fertilizing the land and planting new mulberry seedlings, then busy with trimming the

---


260 The Jiangnan silk industry began to prosper during the Southern Song and Yuan dynasties and was well known in the entire empire from the Ming to the Qing dynasties. Then, Suzhou, Hangzhou and Nanjing were the three silk weaving industrial centers, and the surrounding countryside provided the raw silk. From the mid to late fifteenth century, silk weaving ceased to be an urban monopoly. In addition to the cities of Suzhou, Hangzhou and Nanjing, many waterside market towns appeared as new silk weaving and raw silk trading centers around the Lake Tai area of southern Jiangsu and northern Zhejiang provinces. Fan Jinnin 范金民 and Jin Wen 金文, *Jiangnan sichou shi yanjiu 江南絲綢史研究* (Beijing: Nongye chuban she, 1993), 1, 30-32, 62, 78-80, 199-204; Fan, *Jiangnan shizhen: chuantong de biange 江南市鎮:傳統的變革*, 215-17, 224, 237-46; Marme, “Heaven on Earth: The Rise of Suzhou, 1127-1550,” 33-34.
mulberry trees and exterminating insect pests, not only for the newly planted trees but also for the existing trees. In the second and third month, they continued to trim trees and exterminate insects during the time that new leaves emerged. Around the Qingming solar term, the farmers again fertilized the mulberry trees.\textsuperscript{261} In Jiangnan of the Ming-to-Qing period, although farmers still worked in rice paddies, the fields were generally reduced in size. Many of the farmers even hired migrant labor to take care of their rice fields so that they could concentrate on the more profitable mulberry leaf and silk cloth production.\textsuperscript{262}

Women were kept busy taking care of silkworms, which most often started before the Grain Rain (\textit{guyu} 穀雨) of the solar term, the latter half of the third month of the lunar calendar.\textsuperscript{263} Many records show that “the third and fourth months of the lunar calendar were called silkworm months; every family shut its doors and stayed at home.” This was the period of the silkworms’ second and third molting, and it was important that they were not disturbed.\textsuperscript{264}

The area of cotton cultivation in the region stretched out along the Yangzi River and the sea.\textsuperscript{265} Like the silk production area, many farmers allocated less land to rice in

\textsuperscript{261} \textit{Shenshì nongshù} 沈氏農書, quoted by Zhang Lüxiang 張履祥, in vol. 3 of \textit{Yangyuan xiansheng quanji} 楊園先生全集, ed. Chen Zuwu 陳祖武 (repr., Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 2002), \textit{juan} 49, \textit{bu} nongshu shang 補農書上, 1389-90, 1399; Jie Wei 魏杰, \textit{Cansang cuibian} 蠶桑萃編 (Qing Guangxu zhejiang shuju keben 清光緒浙江書局刻本), \textit{juan} 3, 45; also see Fan, \textit{Jiangnan shizhen: chuautong de biange} 江南市鎮: 傳統的變革, 217, 218.

\textsuperscript{262} Fan, \textit{Jiangnan shizhen: chuautong de biange} 江南市鎮: 傳統的變革, 18-19, 216-17.

\textsuperscript{263} Wei, \textit{Cansang cuibian} 蠶桑萃編, \textit{juan} 3, 52.

\textsuperscript{264} Gu Lu 顧祿, \textit{Qingjia lu} 清嘉録 (Qing Daoguang keben 清道光刻本), \textit{juan} 4, 39; also see Marme, “Heaven on Earth: The Rise of Suzhou, 1127-1550,” 33; Santangelo, “Urban Society in Late Imperial Suzhou,” 219, note 41.

\textsuperscript{265} Cotton was imported from overseas and was first planted in what are currently the areas of Guangdong and Fujian. First grown in Wuniing 烏泥涇 of the Songjiang prefecture in the Yuan dynasty, cotton spread to other places of Jiangnan, especially those areas along the Yangzi River and the coast. Yet, cotton was so profitable that even farmers from the Wu and Changzhou counties, where the water-saturated soil did not favor its cultivation, imported raw fiber for cloth production from areas with sandy soil that were more favorable to cotton. By the beginning of the sixteenth century, every county in Suzhou prefecture was producing cotton cloth. During the Ming-Qing period, Suzhou and Songjiang prefectures were very famous for their cotton cloth; in addition to Suzhou and Songjiang cities, many market towns nearby were also famous for their cotton and/or cotton cloth trade. Zhao Gang 趙崗 and Chen Zhongyi 陳鍾毅, \textit{Zhongguo mianye shi} 中國棉業史 (Taipei: Lianjing chuban gongsi 1977), 24-25; Duan Benluo 段本洛 and Zhang Qifu 張圻福, \textit{Suzhou shougong ye shi} 蘇州手工業史 (Nanjing: Jiangsu guji chuban she,
order to concentrate on more lucrative cotton cloth production, so that these products became the main source of income. During the springtime, cotton farmers in the Jiangnan area were busy planting cotton seeds in the second or third months, and followed that with weeding the young plants three times a month.

However, none of the six Qingming painters referred to the contemporary scenery of Jiangnan villages that had been transformed by the rising economy, such as mulberry forests, cotton fields, and farmers engaged in raising silkworms, or weeding trees or cotton. Though in Liaoning A and Liaoning B there are a few vegetable fields among the rice paddies, most painters incorporated conventional ideal images of farm life, with its rice fields, cowherds with cattle, and farmers working in harmony with nature—a village life very similar to those in the Peach Blossom Spring paintings.

Why was the countryside depicted as rural idyll instead of the newly transformed landscape? This imagined tranquil and picturesque life was a stock symbolic image of a peaceful age in the Ming-Qing period. As mentioned, during this time, different types of Peach Blossom Spring paintings appeared on the market. An earlier tradition of representing Daoist paradise, the land of immortality or a fairyland, with a celestial

---


266 Duan and Zhang, Suzhou shougong ye shi 蘇州手工業史, 44; Fan, Jiangnan shizhen: chuantong de biange 江南市鎮: 傳統的變革, 20-21, 312-13, 345-46.


269 Though paintings of Peach Blossom Spring from the Tang and Song dynasties are not extant, records show that they featured Daoist themes such as mythical birds and animals, multicolored clouds, magnificently dressed and divine-looking people, and exquisite palaces and pavilions. From the Han dynasty, in many tomb murals the most popular version of Daoist paradise was depicted as the islands of immortality floating in the Eastern sea, or as the realm of the Queen Mother of the West surrounded by auspicious clouds, mythical animals and immortals located on top of the Kunlun Mountains in the remote west. In addition, the ways of ascending to paradise depicted in funerary art include flying on auspicious animals such as dragons or cranes (or in a chariot drawn by auspicious animals) or passing through a grotto of the immortal mountain or a gate to the architectural compound of paradise. Since Buddhist ideas of
palace and clouds developed into one that emphasized the landscape and other narratives of secular village life, with the intention of illustrating Tao Yuanming’s description of life in the secluded valley of *Peach Blossom Spring*. Many professional artists painted this type of *Peach Blossom Spring* under the name Zhao Boju or Qiu Ying. Wang Biao, noted already for his forgery of *Qingming shanghe tu*, also painted this version of *Peach Blossom Spring*. Therefore, it seems that painters of *Qingming shanghe tu* and *Peach Blossom Spring* commonly adopted the theme of the idyllic rural village. However, whereas the *Peach Blossom Spring* paintings indicated a cloistered peaceful life without a ruler, or a Daoist land of immortals, the idealized village of the *Qingming* painting was physically accessible, devoid of the typical grotto entrance motif (through which a reclusive village was discovered), or a celestial atmosphere (Fig. 132). According to the *Pictorial Compendium of the Three Powers*, the cowherd playing a flute on an ox’s back was a symbol of rural contentment and abundant harvests, as I have mentioned earlier.


For those that emphasized landscape, see Fu, “Taoyuan tu yanjiu 桃源圖研究,” 77-86. For those that included more descriptions of secular village life, see Nelson, “On Through to the Beyond: The Peach Blossom Spring as Paradise,” 33-34, 36-37, 39, 41; Fu, “Taoyuan tu yanjiu 桃源圖研究,” 26-29, 35-37, 66-76; Shih, *Yidong de taohua yuan: Dongya shijie zhong de shanshui hua* 移動的桃花源: 東亞世界中的山水畫, 57-65.

For those that emphasized landscape, see Fu, “Taoyuan tu yanjiu 桃源圖研究,” 77-86. For those that included more descriptions of secular village life, see Nelson, “On Through to the Beyond: The Peach Blossom Spring as Paradise,” 33-34, 36-37, 39, 41; Fu, “Taoyuan tu yanjiu 桃源圖研究,” 26-29, 35-37, 66-76; Shih, *Yidong de taohua yuan: Dongya shijie zhong de shanshui hua* 移動的桃花源: 東亞世界中的山水畫, 57-65.
Since the plentiful harvest was used by generations of officials to eulogize a great age under a capable and virtuous emperor’s rule, this idyllic village signifies a perpetually happy life under a benign regime.

In the popular *Qingming*, prosperous urban scenes follow the timeless pastoral tableaux that indicate a peaceful age. As I will elucidate in detail in the following sections, these were closely related to the city residents’ (the artists’ patrons) daily life and the urban economy that developed in the pre-modern Yangzi delta.

### 2.2.2. Thriving Urban Economy

The popular *Qingming* painters recognized the characteristics of a prosperous city built on lively commerce, and started to create new motifs that differed greatly from those in the Beijing scroll and were much more related to the contemporary city life of the Yangzi delta. All of the six *Qingming* include urban commercial activities delivered by a large number of vendors, along with their abundant merchandise. In this section, it is not my intention to provide an exhaustive view of the numerous trade activities depicted in these paintings, but rather to attempt to understand the world in these paintings from an economic perspective. Through analysis of the illustrations of major industries of the Ming and Qing dynasties, such as textile products, luxuries, imported merchandise, and services, as well as the number of businesses shown (see table 4), I will demonstrate that these paintings illustrate differing scales of urban economy. I will also establish that the vitality of the economy was indicated by the goods produced by specialized workers, farmers who were motivated to bring their agricultural goods to the urban market or to seek employment in the city, luxuries that signified conspicuous consumption, services

---

272 For example in the Tang dynasty, Guo Yingan’s 郭英幹 poem *Lingshi ming* 靈石銘 and in the Ming dynasty, Li Dongyang’s poem *Ruimai song* 瑞麥頌. For Guo’s poem, see Dong Gao 董誥, *Quan tangwen* 全唐文 (Qing Jiaqing neifu keben 清嘉慶內府刻本), juan 457, 4659. For Li’s poem, see Li, *Huailu tang ji* 懷麓堂集, juan 38, 352.
that revealed elaborate market mechanisms, and in two of paintings, exotic commodities that disclosed long distance international trade. All of these are traits of an affluent world with highly developed production processes and business operations, and are drawn from the painters’ experiences of life during the Ming-Qing era.

2.2.2.1. Urban Economic Scales

Perhaps the Qingming painters were inspired to show a wide range of economic activities by the expansion and accelerated development of the various towns and commercial activities in the Lower Yangzi. All six Qingming include many vendors and commodities; the number of shops, booths (with roofs) and stands (without roofs) may be used as an index to compare the scale of the economy depicted in each of these paintings. In Zhao Zhe version there are fifty-eight shops and booths or stands, in Liaoning A, 117, in Taipei A, sixty-three, in the Metropolitan version, ninety-six, in Liaoning B, thirty-five, and in Taipei B, seventy-two. Therefore, relatively speaking, the urban areas of the Liaoning A, Taipei B and Metropolitan versions imply a large city (with over seventy businesses); the Zhao Zhe and the Taipei A scrolls indicate a middle sized city (with around sixty businesses); and Liaoning B shows a small city or market town (with fewer than forty businesses). We can infer the scale of the ideal society that each painter envisioned by the size of the city he represented.

In the Ming-Qing period, the lower Yangzi River was the most developed region. Scholars have estimated that its degree of urbanization was comparable to that of eighteenth-century Britain. The lower Yangzi featured not only the expansion of the

---

273 Though there are quite a few itinerant peddlers depicted in the paintings, some figures on the street are easy to identify as such, while the identity of many of the others carrying things on the street are not so easy to establish. Considering that shops and booths were the major and most stable ways of doing business in a city they provide us with an indication of the relative scale of the economy in the city of these Qingming paintings.

scale of cities but also an increase in the number of market towns of various sizes.\textsuperscript{275} The Qingming painters used this unprecedented conurbation as well as the changed atmosphere and dimension of cities to produce their variously scaled urban scenes.

2.2.2.2. Textiles Used throughout the World

No matter whether they were meant to portray a busy metropolis or a quieter small city, all the urban areas of the six Qingming include silk and cotton products and their related businesses, such as dye houses. This indicates the importance of the textile industry, testified to especially by the Liaoning B scroll: out of thirty-five enterprises, the Liaoning B painter depicted seven textile related businesses (details below). The textile trades are even more prominent than food businesses, which occupy six stores (four eateries, one butcher shop and one fruit store).

In this section, I will compare textile stores depicted in the Beijing scroll with those of the popular Qingming in order to understand the social changes that the painters observed. I will also analyze the various images of silk and cotton-related stores among the six popular Qingming paintings to comprehend the role the textile industry played in the urban economy as depicted in the scrolls, as well as its relationship to the Ming-Qing era.

The textile industry was the most profitable economic sector in China from the sixteenth to the eighteenth centuries; the silk and the cotton textiles from the Yangzi delta were two of its most famous products “under heaven.” Therefore, it is not surprising that the Qingming painters were inspired to give these goods a prominent status in their world of prosperity. Scholars have claimed that revolutionary production processes in eighteenth-century Britain, including division of labor and specialization in the textile

industry, enhanced productivity and was one of the most important factors that stimulated trade and huge economic growth.\textsuperscript{276} The images that I will analyze are related to a similarly revolutionary production process in the textile industry in China from the seventeenth to the eighteenth centuries and the ensuing productivity, expanding businesses, and economic improvements.\textsuperscript{277} Moreover, silk and cotton textiles played an essential role in enriching the lives of peasants, craftsmen, merchants, and many others involved in the industry. Chinese textiles attracted not only merchants from across the empire but also traders from overseas, including Southeast Asia, Japan, and Europe, which in turn involved China in the international economy.\textsuperscript{278} This phenomenon has even stimulated many scholars to challenge the notion of a European-centered world system in the pre-modern period that has been proposed by Western scholarship, and to argue that China was one of the most important economic centers in the world.\textsuperscript{279}

**Expanding Silk Business and Consumption**

The *Qingming* painters portrayed several kinds of stores selling silk products, including fabric and thread. I will show that these stores were depicted as having an open and welcoming atmosphere, which differs greatly from the Song dynasty *Qingming* and indicates the greater popularity and affordability of silk in Ming-Qing times. In addition, I will demonstrate that the quantity and types of quality silk textiles produced increased in the Ming-Qing Yangzi delta with a consequent expansion of silk consumption,

\textsuperscript{276} Wong, *China Transformed: Historical Change and the Limits of European Experience*, 16-17; Li, *Jiangnan de zaoqi gongye hua* 江南的早期工業化, 58.
\textsuperscript{277} Wong, *China Transformed: Historical Change and the Limits of European Experience*, 17-21. Li, *Jiangnan de zaoqi gongye hua* 江南的早期工業化, 57-77.
inspiring painters to depict many varieties of this commodity. Finally, I will show that the images of silk thread stores not only signify the luxurious consumption of embroidery, but also imply the division of labor and specialized production, as well as the highly developed commodity economy of the lower Yangzi region.

In the Beijing scroll, there is a shop with signs reading, “Wang’s Colorful Silk Store [Wangjia xianming pibo pu 王家鮮明疋帛舖]” and “Gauze and Brocade Silk Store [Lojin pibo pu 羅錦疋帛舖].” Only the backs of the two customers who sit inside are shown, which suggests that the store discouraged ordinary customers from entering (Fig. 133). In the Ming dynasty Qingming, Zhao Zhe presented a much clearer image of a popular retail location, with colorful silk fabrics on display and storekeepers interacting with customers. In this scene he also depicted two itinerant singing girls, who try to attract the customers in and around the silk store (Fig. 134). The shop appears friendly and accessible even to commoners. The differences between the two stores correspond to the fact that, although in the Song dynasty silk fabrics increased in popularity, it was not until the mid-Ming to mid-Qing that more of these textiles became available to commoners at prices they could afford, due to the larger quantities produced through improvements to the production process and the resultant drop in price. As I will

---

280 Li, Jìaŋnán de zàoqì gōngyè huà 江南的早期工業化, 40-41, 54-57.
281 According to scholars such as Brook and Fan Jinmin, with regard to economic development in the Ming-Qing period, a commodity economy is an economy in which the goods are produced for the market instead of farm surplus, see Timothy Brook, “Communications and Commerce,” in Twitchett and Mote, The Ming Dynasty, 1368-1644, Part 2, vol. 8 of The Cambridge History of China, 687; Fan Jinmin 范金民 and Jin Wen 金文, Jìaŋnán sīcōu shì yánjūi 江南絲綢史研究, 89.
explore further in this section, these social changes were also indicated by other silk-related images in the popular *Qingming* scrolls.

Among the popular versions, I will demonstrate that the Lineage I *Qingming* painters used the same image of a silk shop to illustrate the increasing amount and various kinds of textiles available in their times. Through the images of silk vendors and products in Lineage II paintings, I will show that while the earlier painters and patrons favored the relatively modest but affordable world of a market town, the later painters and patrons preferred the more luxurious world found in a big city, but both also illustrate the expansion of the silk business and the consumption of its products. The silk store in the Zhao Zhe version was repeated in the various *Qingming* scrolls, underscoring its continuing popularity as a theme; however, there are traces that show later painters attempted to develop variations on this model. For example, the sign on the silk store in Liaoning A indicates that it sells plain gauze, gauze, satin and silk tabby (*sha*, *luo*, *duan*, *juan*) (Fig. 135). This same shop, when replicated in Taipei A, was given a different sign that announced, “spun silk tabby, twill damask, plain gauze, gauze [chou 绢, *ling*, *sha*, *luo* 羅]”; in the Metropolitan version, the sign reads, “satin and

---

283 I adopt scholar Zhao Feng’s 赵豐 translation of *mianchou* 綿紬—spun silk tabby—for *chou* 織 (=紗). see Zhao Feng, *Zhixiu zhenpin: tushuo zhongguo sichou yishu shi* 織緞珍品: 圖說中國絲綢藝術史 [Treasure In Silk: An Illustrated History of Chinese Textiles], trans. June Lee (H.K.: Yisha tang, 1999), 331. *Mianchou* is defined as tabby made of coarse, short-fiber silk and silk waste, according to Zhao Feng’s book *Zhongguo sichou yishu shi* 中國絲綢藝術史 [A History of Chinese Silk Art] (Beijing: Wenwu chuban she, 2005), 39-40, as well as *Zhongguo gongyi meishu cidian* 中國工藝美術辭典 (Taipei: Xiongshi tushu gongsi, 1991), 182, and *Ciyuan* 辭源, 1328. Zhao Feng also states that tabby made of spun silk was called *mianchou* 綿紬 or *chou* 織, but, in the Ming-Qing period, the term *chou* 織 was commonly used to refer to tabby and twill damask (*pingwen he xiewen anhua zhiwu* 平紋和斜紋暗花織物), while in the Qing, *chou* 織 was changed to be written as *chou* 織 and it became a term for silk textile in general, *Zhongguo sichou yishu shi* 中國絲綢藝術史, 39-40. Moreover, Zhao Feng mentioned that *chou* 織 was not changed to be written as *chou* 織 or become interchangeable with *chou* 織 until the later part of the Qing dynasty in his publication *Zhongguo sichou tongshi* 中國絲綢通史 [The General History of Chinese Silk] (Suzhou: Soochow University Press, 2005), 528. According to several records in the Ming dynasty, *chou* 織 silk was considered inexpensive. In 1370, the Hongwu Emperor ordered that commoners could only wear *chou* 織, *juan* 絹 (silk tabby) and *sucha* 素紗 (plain uncolored gauze), and were prohibited from using fancy silks, which means that *chou* was one of the low-priced silk fabrics. The late-Ming scholar Fan Lian 范濂 observed that in Songjiang the poor (*pinzhe* 貧者) would wore colorful
silk tabby [duan 段, juan 絹]” (Fig. 136, Fig. 137). These painters, though copying the
earlier image, used various ways to show that the store sold both inexpensive (sha, juan, chou) and exclusive (luo, duan, ling) silk fabrics. In the Ming-Qing period, many writers
reported that in addition to rich families, the economic middle class also started to wear
luxurious silks. Furthermore, it became commonplace for even ordinary or poor people to
wear spun silk tabby, silk tabby, and plain gauze—less expensive fabrics—again
signaling the high production and extraordinary consumption of silk by the generally
affluent society of the Ming and Qing dynasties. The painters, via the signs on stores that
advertise common and high quality silks, incorporated this phenomenon into the
Qingming scrolls.

In Lineage II Qingming, the discrepancy between the images of silk stores in
earlier and later versions suggests that their corresponding painters and patrons held
differing visions of an ideal society, though both indicate the expansion of silk
consumption. In Liaoning B, two shopkeepers who wear short, rustic styled garments sell
lower-priced silk fabrics (chou 紬, juan 絹) (Fig. 138). In the same painting, a store that
peddles all kinds of textiles, such as cloth made from cotton or other plant fibers, also
offers expensive embroidered silk fabrics (xiubo 繡帛) (Fig. 139), suggesting that the
quantity of such luxurious fabrics was rather limited. On the other hand, in Taipei B,
storekeepers dressed in long robes of a sophisticated style deal in brocade, embroidered

chou 紬 or juan 絹 clothes, which also indicates that chou was inexpensive. Since it was common to
consider chou inexpensive, which probably includes a large portion of mianchou, I adopt “spun silk tabby”
as its translation. Zhang, Mingshi 明史, juan 67, yufu san, 1649-1650; Fan Lian 范濂, Yunjian jumu chao
雲間據目抄, Biji xiaoshuo daguan 22 bian 5 筆記小說大觀二十二編 5 (Taipei: Xinxing shuju, 1978),
juan 2, 2626.

In addition to poor people wearing chou and juan clothes, as quoted above, Fan Lian also
mentioned that in Songjiang, old and young ordinary people would wrap their head with plain gauze sha in
summer and with fine gauze lou in spring and autumn. In the gazetteer of the market town Nanxu (Nanxun
zhenzhi 南潯鎮志) it was recorded that even in the early Ming it was not strange to see commoners
wearing chou and juan, since they were local products. Fan, Yunjian jumu chao 雲間據目抄: juan 2, 2627;
Xianfeng Nanxun zhenzhi 咸豐南潯鎮志, juan 23, cited by Li, Jiangnan de zaoqi gongye hua 江南的早期工業化, 28-29.
silk, twill and tabby damask, plain and fancy gauze, spun silk tabby, and silk tabby (jin 錦, xiu 繡, ling 綾, luo 羅, qi 綺, sha 紗, chou 糟, juan 絹) (Fig. 140); that is, this store carries a large variety of silk cloth, including more extravagant patterned and embroidered fabrics.\textsuperscript{285} Therefore, the Taipei B painter presents a much more sophisticated and luxurious world than shown in Liaoning B, revealed through the storekeeper’s clothing and merchandise. The Liaoning B painter had a utopian view of a quiet market town, with shops that offered silk commodities that most ordinary residents could afford and also supplied a limited amount of deluxe silks for the few rich families. On the other hand, the Taipei B painter favored a metropolis with stores that traded in a large variety of opulent silk fabrics. However, both portrayed the expanding silk business through the various kinds of commodities offered in the small cities (or market towns) and large metropolises of the Yangzi delta.

In addition to the silk fabric stores, the Qingming painters designed other images of silk-related businesses inspired by the newly developed silk businesses of their times, for example, stores for silk thread. In the Zhao Zhe version, a man spins thread inside a shop, nearly identical to the popular phenomena of men’s more important role in silk processing and textile making since the late Ming (Fig. 141).\textsuperscript{286} Images of silk thread

\textsuperscript{285} For the different types of silk and their English translations, see Zhao Feng 趙豐, Zhixiu zhenpin: tushuo zhongguo sichou yishu shi 織繡珍品: 圖說中國絲綢藝術史 [Treasures In Silk: An Illustrated History of Chinese Textiles], 328-41.

\textsuperscript{286} Despite some differences in describing business models in the silk industry, both Francesca Bray and Li Bozhong illuminate the unprecedented role that male laborers played in the silk industry from the late Ming. According to Bray, peasant men were involved in producing silk thread or cloth from the Song dynasty. In the late Ming, rural landlord households hired women to weave, while urban loom-owners hired male weavers. However, the main rural contribution to fancy silks between the Song and the late Ming from predominantly female workers was breeding silkworms and reeling raw silk. With the development of the new putting-out system in the late Ming, silk weaving overflowed from Suzhou into surrounding villages, and rural women were once again involved in the production of fancy cloth, but not as managers or skilled weavers, rather as auxiliary workers, reeilers, and spinners, even within the context of family production. Men took over from their wives at the loom and performed the major role in weaving. According to Li Bozhong, in the late Ming several records show that in rural households men wove, while woman reeled silk, though there are still records mentioning that women took charge of the whole process. In the Qing dynasty, raw silk and thread were still produced in rural households, while silk weaving was mainly carried out in urban workshops, in which male professional weavers dominated. In terms of producing cotton textiles, Bray and Li Bozhong have differing opinions about men’s roles, especially in the
stores also appear in Liaoning A, Taipei A and Taipei B. In Liaoning A, a shop promotes itself as a “store of red and green fine silk thread [honglü xijuan xianpu 紅綠細絹線舖],” denoting the colorful thread for embroidery that it sells; in Taipei A, a shop (sidan 絲店) sells silk for weaving. In Taipei B, the banners in front of a shop advertise “assorted brightly colored silk [xianming gese si 鮮明各色絲],” “colorful coiled silk and golden silk [wucai pansi jinsi 五綵盤絲金絲],” and “colorful threads for embroidery [huase xiuxian 花色繡線],” showing that it offers silk thread for both embroidery and weaving (Fig. 142, Fig. 143, Fig. 144). The rich variety of silk thread merchandise illustrated in these paintings probably was prompted by the fact that embroidery was a common job for ordinary people, a popular pastime for elite women, and a craft for which Suzhou was renowned during the Ming-Qing period—Su xiu 苏繡 (Suzhou Embroidery) was one of four types of needlework that was famous empire-wide.  

The embroidery of the Gu family (Gu xiu 顧繡) of Suzhou was especially praised by many Ming scholars, including Dong Qichang, and was imitated in workshops throughout the Lower Yangzi region in the Qing dynasty. These images of stores marketing a large

---

Qing dynasty. Bray mentions that in the rural Lower Yangzi of the late Ming, men might have started to join their wives and daughters at the loom. In the early Qing, it was mainly men who wove, while their wives and daughters spun and reeled the thread. Li Bozhong states that in the villages and market towns of Jiangnan of the Ming dynasty, both men and women were involved in farming and weaving, while many men were dedicated to weaving. However, Li argues that in the early to middle Qing dynasty, cotton weaving was mainly the job of women because though there were records mentioning that men were still involved in cotton textile production, these records were becoming fewer than those in the Ming and did not specify men’s roles. Bray, “Towards a Critical History on Non-Western Technology,” 177, 179, 182, 185, 189 (note 85), 190-191; Li, Jiangnan de zaoqi gongye hua 江南的早期工業化, 59-60, 72-77. In addition, the fact that men played a more important role in textile making in the Ming than in previous dynasties can be inferred from a litany of complaints that emerged from literati and officials of the late Ming about their worries of men performing women’s work, and women not engaging in textile production activities, see Bray, “Towards a Critical History on Non-Western Technology,” 190-191, 196-197.  

287 Wang Ao 王鏊, Gusu zhi 姑蘇志 (Qing Wenyuan ge siku quanshu ben 清文淵閣四庫全書本), juan 15, 144; Niu Ruolin 牛若麟, Chongzhen Wuxian zhi 崇禎吳縣志 (1642; Washington: Library of Congress Photoduplication Service, 196-), microfilm, juan 29: 38a-38b; also see Duan and Zhang, Suzhou shougong ye shi 蘇州手工業史, 81.  

variety of silk threads suggest that more people could afford embroidery—a high-end product—and thus also alludes to the wealth of society in general.

The sale of silk thread for weaving is another indication of the specialization and division of labor in the textile industry during the Ming and Qing dynasties. Peasant family units were originally responsible for the production of silk textiles, from cultivating the mulberry trees and raising the silkworms to preparing the silk and finally weaving the cloth. The raw materials or finished products found in the markets were mainly surplus production.\(^{289}\) Beginning in the mid-Ming, many farmers started to specialize in certain aspects of production—such as harvesting mulberry leaves, producing silk cocoons, or weaving fabric—with a view to generating commodities for the market. Consequently, certain shops or markets specializing in raw materials also emerged. With the availability of such resources and skilled workers, workshops were established and employed weavers who had mastered certain aspects of the weaving process.\(^{290}\) Though this distributed production process does not appear in the paintings, the appearance of silk thread stores indicates its existence and the rise of the commodity economy (the transition of trading in surplus to commodities), and marked an exciting development in the Ming-Qing era. Scholars have proposed that the productivity gained through division of labor and specialization in the craft industries of Britain, especially textiles, was an important factor that contributed to the industrial revolution, economic growth, and modernization of Britain during the mid-eighteenth to mid-nineteenth century. Though a similar phenomenon occurred in Ming-Qing China did not lead to machine-based industrialization in the nineteenth century, yet still contributed to China’s

\(^{289}\) Fan and Jin, *Jiangnan sichou shi yanjiu* 江南絲綢史研究, 32-33, 89.

\(^{290}\) Duan and Zhang, *Suzhou shougong ye shi* 蘇州手工業史, 11-13; Fan and Jin, *Jiangnan sichou shi yanjiu* 江南絲綢史研究, 89-95; Li, *Jiangnan de zaoqi gongye hua* 江南的早期工業化, 59-60.
tremendous productivity, enormous economic growth, affluent society, and improvement in the standard of living.\textsuperscript{291}

The above analysis shows that the difference between silk stores in the Beijing scroll and the popular \textit{Qingming} is indicative of the expanding consumption of silk in the Ming-Qing period: in the former, the shops have a rarefied, exclusive atmosphere, while in the latter, stores are open and welcoming. The repeated images of fabric stores selling many kinds of silk in Lineage I \textit{Qingming}, the diverse illustrations of silk shops in the small towns and big cities of Lineage II paintings, and the presence of silk thread shops in most \textit{Qingming} scrolls are motifs that originated in the Yangzi delta. Their inclusion suggests the expanding quantity of various types of silk, produced in the Ming-Qing through division of labor and job specialization. These motifs suggest that abundant silk products were made specifically as commodities, and in addition, confirm the existence of a thriving silk business in a prosperous society during a period of economic growth.

\textbf{Prevalence of Cotton Fabrics and Active Cotton Trade}

While cotton goods were a common theme in the popular \textit{Qingming} paintings, there is no trace of related images in the Beijing scroll. This indicates another social change: cotton was still rare in the Song dynasty,\textsuperscript{292} while in the Ming and Qing dynasties it became the most popular textile among the general public and largely transformed people’s lives in the Yangzi delta. For example, people started to wear

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{itemize}
\item[\textsuperscript{291}] Li, \textit{Jiangnan de zaoqi gongye hua} 江南的早期工業化, 13-16, 58-60, 456-90; Li, \textit{Fazhan yu zhiyue: Mingqing jiangnan shengchan li yanjiu} 發展與制約—明清江南生產力研究, 401-17. Wong, \textit{China Transformed: Historical Change and the Limits of European Experience}, 16-22. Scholars generally agree that industrialization was marked by machine-based manufacturing. The manual labor and draft-animal–based economies that still brought about tremendous economic growth through the division of labor and production management were termed proto-industrialization or early industrialization.
\item[\textsuperscript{292}] Zhao and Chen, \textit{Zhongguo mianye shi} 中國棉業史, 22.
\end{itemize}
\end{footnotesize}
cotton instead of hemp clothing, and a large segment of the population was involved in the production and trade of cotton.

In the popular *Qingming*, there are many cotton-related images, including stores, booths, and itinerant peddlers vending cotton fabrics and shops selling yarn; middlemen in the business and dealers of raw cotton; a dye house and a business dealing in dyestuffs; not to mention, weavers as well. Many of these images are repeated in all the *Qingming* paintings, some were modified in later versions, and some were new designs. I will show that these copied, modified and invented images are closely related to the prevalence of the cotton products, and the specialization and division of labor throughout the production process, as well as changes in the business model, which contributed to tremendous economic growth during the Ming-Qing era.

In Lineage I *Qingming*, the repeated image of a booth for selling cotton fabrics as well as the variety of other sales channels, such as itinerant peddlers and cotton stores, all indicate the abundance and popularity of cotton cloth. Lineage I paintings contain the illustration of a shopkeeper (or a customer) in front of a booth spreading out a piece of cloth (Fig. 145, Fig. 146, Fig. 147, Fig. 148). Among them, only the Liaoning A painter added a shop sign, reading “high-end white fine clothing…wholesale [shangdeng baixibu…fake 上等白細布…發客],” which identifies the seller as a fabric wholesaler, given that *xi* 細, “fine,” was a common word to describe quality cotton fabric in the late Ming and Qing dynasties (Fig. 146). Although silk became more popular in the late Ming, the price of cotton fabric was still much lower than that of silk, and among ordinary people was a more popular material for clothing. This may be the reason why

---

293 Ibid., 48.
295 Ibid., 38-40, 61-77, 80-83.
296 Such as “ximi yunjing 細密勻靜” in *Chongzhen Songjian fuzhi* 崇禎松江府志, juan 16, fengsu 風俗, and “jinxixuchou 緊細如綢” in *Qianlong Shanghai xianzhi* 乾隆上海縣志, juan 5, wuchan 物產, cited by ibid., 53-54.
a cotton seller’s booth, rather than a store building, was used to show the accessibility of cotton fabrics, throughout the Lineage I Qingming scrolls.

In addition to the above repeated images of a cotton seller’s booth, various images related to cotton textiles were added to the Lineage I Qingming paintings. In the Zhao Zhe version, an itinerant peddler spreads out cotton fabric along the floor of a bridge, a further indication of its popularity (Fig. 149), while in Taipei A, a cloth store (with the sign budian 布店) was added, showing the expanding distribution channels for the product (Fig. 150).

The representation of a booth for selling cotton cloth was likewise copied in Lineage II Qingming, but new images of the cotton business were also added to further emphasize the popularity of cotton fabrics produced in the Lower Yangzi region. In both Liaoning B and Taipei B of Lineage II Qingming, more cotton dealers’ stores and booths were depicted, with their proprietors shown displaying fabrics to potential buyers (Fig. 151, Fig. 152). Furthermore, the Taipei B painter innovatively marked a booth with a banner announcing that it sells fine cotton fabrics specifically from Wusong (吳淞) in the Yangzi delta—the major and most celebrated area for the production of cotton fabrics in the Ming and Qing dynasties (Fig. 153).298

Some new images in the Qingming paintings, including stores that sell cotton yarn and raw cotton, are indicative of specialization and the division of labor in the cotton industry. A shop that collects and sells raw cotton material appears in Liaoning B but not in any other Qingming scrolls (Fig. 154); a cotton yarn store was added to the Liaoning A and Metropolitan versions (Fig. 155, Fig. 156); and in Taipei B, a store handling various fabric-related goods also includes cotton yarn (shaxian 紗線) (Fig. 157). The above

---

298 Zhou Jianding 周建鼎 et al., Kangxi Songjian fuzhi 康熙松江府志, juan 5, fengsu 風俗, cited by Duan and Zhang, Suzhou shougong ye shi 蘇州手工業史, 43; Zhao and Chen, Zhongguo mianye shi 中國棉業史, 71-72.
images are in keeping with what is known about the trend toward the separation of various aspects of production in the cotton industry in the Lower Yangzi region during the Ming-Qing period. Beginning in the mid-Ming, workers who were better spinners or less proficient at weaving specialized in spinning cotton into yarn;\(^{299}\) later in the dynasty, certain laborers began to professionally process the cotton bolls during the harvest season.\(^{300}\) Though there were still peasants who undertook the complete process from growing the cotton, to spinning the fiber, to weaving the cloth, many people began to purchase cotton fiber in the market to spin, and to buy yarn to weave.\(^{301}\) These operations contributed to the increasing quantity and the better quality of cotton cloth, which, in turn, attracted dealers from around the world to the Chinese cotton trade. The economic growth brought about by the cotton industry was one of the major factors that made the Yangzi delta the most affluent part of the country during the Ming-Qing times. The appearance of specialized stores for raw cotton and cotton yarn marked a new era for the industry, which involved more than half of the residents in the Yangzi delta,\(^{302}\) and offers us insight into why the painters of the Liaoning A, Metropolitan, Liaoning B and Taipei B versions added these fresh depictions of businesses devoted to selling raw cotton and cotton yarn.

All of the *Qingming* scrolls feature a nearly identical image of a dye house, but only one of the scrolls includes the unique illustration of a store dealing the materials for making dye. The dye house corresponds with yet another development in the specialized cotton production and business models of the Yangzi delta of the period. At that time, the production of cotton fabrics—particularly the spinning and weaving—was usually

\(^{299}\) Ibid., 62-65.
\(^{300}\) Li, *Jiangnan de zaoqi gongye hua* 江南的早期工業化, 61-62.
\(^{301}\) Ibid., 62-63.
\(^{302}\) Ibid., 41-43, 459-60. Li’s study shows that from the late Ming to the mid-Qing dynasties the number of people involved in the cotton industry increased tremendously. He also estimates that in the early nineteenth century, sixty-five to ninety percent of households in the Yangzi delta engaged in work related to the cotton industry.
performed by families in villages and on the outskirts of towns and cities in the Suzhou and Songjiang prefectures, while dying and calendering was completed in urban workshops.  

This explains why a dye house, but not a weaving operation, appears in the urban area of the Qingming scrolls. However, there is a slight difference between Lineage I and Lineage II paintings: Lineage I Qingming include a calendering service with the dye house, while Lineage II scrolls do not (Fig. 158, Fig. 159, Fig. 160, Fig. 161, Fig. 162, Fig. 163). According to written records, in the Ming and early Qing dynasties, most dye houses included a calendering operation. Starting in the middle of Kangxi’s reign (1654-1722), calender services were gradually separated from dye houses and became independent businesses. Therefore, the images of the dye house in the sixteenth to seventeenth century Lineage I paintings correspond with the records of operations of the time. However, in the eighteenth-century Metropolitan version, the painter still depicted the dye house with a calender. The painter may have appropriated a stock image to render his understanding or memory of a dye house, or possibly painted this painting around the early to the mid-eighteenth century, before the older operation methods had totally disappeared.

Although the Lineage II Qingming painters did not all portray a calendering facility as part of the dyeing operation, this was probably more a matter of deciding to eliminate details rather than feeling the need to separate the two services. The images of the dye house in Lineage II paintings are almost identical, which shows that the painters realized the importance of the service to a prosperous world, and appropriated the existing motif in order to render it. However, in Lineage II Qingming, one innovation can

---

303 For the location of dye houses and weaving units see ibid., 42, 61, 80-81. Duan and Zhang, Suzhou shougong ye shi 蘇州手工業史, 43-45, 57-65. In the Ming-Qing period, most dye houses were opened at major silk and cotton fabric centers such as Suzhou and Songjiang, though there are still some dye houses in smaller textile market towns.

304 Li, Jiangnan de zaoqi gongye hua 江南的早期工業化: 61. Duan and Zhang, Suzhou shougong ye shi 蘇州手工業史, 60.
be found regarding the theme of dyeing. The Taipei B painter added a store that sells and/or collects the red dye madder (hongqian cao 紅茜草), which does not appear in any other Qingming scroll, but is consistent with the activities of dye businesses of the time and the popularity of madder as a dyestuff (Fig. 164). Through these portrayals of dye houses and stores selling raw materials, we find evidence of specialization in the cotton production process in the Ming-Qing, which contributed to the economic growth of the time.

Several new images in Lineage I Qingming paintings relate to changing patterns in cotton commerce in the Ming-Qing period, which indicate the large scale of the long distance trade, as well as the control of the production process by wealthy merchants. Middlemen in the fabric business appear in the Liaoning A, evidenced by the shop with the sign “collecting cloth from customers” [yuke shou miaobu 與客收棉布] (Fig. 165), and in Taipei A we find a shop with a sign indicating a middleman, yahang 牙行 (Fig. 166). In the late Ming, trading cotton fabrics depended mainly on the middlemen (yanren) who collected cotton fiber and fabric from farmers and then sold these products to wholesalers or retailers. The large scale of the industry and the challenges of long

305 Madder (hong qiancao 紅茜草) was a popular dye for red color since the Spring and Autumn period (722-481 BCE). It was called nulu 茹藘 and mentioned in Zhengfeng 鄭風, Dongmen zhi shan 東門之塲 and Chuqi dongmen 出其東門 in Shijing, cited by Zhu Xinyu 朱新予, Zhongguo sihou shi (tonglun) 中國絲綢史 (通論), 30; Jiang Shibao 蔣世寶, “Zhongguo chuantong tianran ranse cai zhi xianse guanxi yanjiu: yi zhiwu ranse zhi hongse xi weili” (Guoli yunli keji daxue, 2001), 30-31. According to Jiang Shibao, madder was still a popular source for dye in the late Ming since Xu Guangqi 徐光啓 in his Tiangong kaiwu 天工開物, in which many dyes and methods of dyeing in the late Ming were recorded, see ibid., 31-32. Dye plants, especially indigo, were also important cash crops in Jiangnan during the Ming-Qing period, according to Chen Zhongping 陳忠平, “Mingqing ning zhen chang diqu shizhen yanjiu” in Jiangsu shilun kao 江蘇史論考, ed. Jiangsu sheng shelian lishi xuehui 江蘇省社聯歷史學會 (Nanjing: Jiangsu guji chuban she, 1989), 215.

306 The sign does not specify which goods the middleman handles, but it is possible that cotton was among them, since it was a very common practice for middlemen to be involved in the cotton business during the Ming-Qing period. However, it is also possible that he handled silk and other products. Though not deliberately indicated by the painters, many of the shops and stands selling cotton and silk in the Qingming were possibly owned by brokers.
distance trade required middlemen who could mediate between local producers and buyers from other provinces or countries. However, in the Qing dynasty many larger-scale cotton stores began to collect fabric directly from the peasant weavers, then commissioned dye house to custom color the cloth before finally adding their “brand name” to the fabrics. For merchants with the necessary capital, this was a great step forward: directly controlling the production and quality of the final products, though this was different from the factory production that developed in Britain. This likely explains why stores with signs indicating a middleman, yuke shou mianbu and yahang, appear in the seventeenth-century Liaoning A and Taipei A Qingming, but not the eighteenth-century Metropolitan version. Instead, the painter of the Metropolitan version inserted several figures, seen on the street carrying white cotton fabrics for sale, which they or their families probably wove (Fig. 167); one weaver is seen in a cotton store showing a piece of cloth to the shopkeepers behind the counter (Fig. 168). These images depict peasants who weave the cloth and bring their finished work to the cotton fabric merchants for examination. The images of middlemen and wealthy cotton merchants who stockpile cotton fabric are indicative of the large scale of the industry, its long distance trade, the huge amount of capital involved, and the advanced methods of quality control, all related to what was going on in Ming-Qing times. According to scholars’ statistics, the production scale of cotton textiles in the Yangzi delta by the early nineteenth century was more than three times that of Britain where cotton textiles were a

---

307 Li, Jiangnan de zaoqi gongye hua 江南的早期工業化, 81-83; Zhao and Chen, Zhongguo mianye shi 中国棉業史, 75-76.
308 According to Duan and Zhang, Suzhou shougong ye shi 蘇州手工業史, 59, cotton yarns were generally not dyed. Therefore, finished cotton fabric was white, and was not dyed until collected and processed by middlemen or cotton fabric stores. According to Li Bozhong, from the mid-Ming, most silk thread was dyed before it was woven into fabric, see Li, Jiangnan de zaoqi gongye hua 江南的早期工業化, 55-56.
309 As the people on the street and in the stores carry or show white fabric, this suggests the cloth is made from cotton.
major segment of its textile industry. In other words, the cotton industry in China was the most productive textile industry of pre-modern times.\footnote{Li, Jiangnan de zaoqi gongye hua 江南的早期工業化, 461.}

The above analysis shows that all the later Qingming paintings feature repetitions of various motifs of cotton-related stores and products, which relates to the popularity of these textiles and the development of the industry in the Ming-Qing Lower Yangzi. This development featured a division of labor and production management that enhanced efficiency, resulted in abundant output of quality products, and contributed to tremendous economic growth; most likely this was the impetus that inspired the Qingming painters to include these images in their concept of a prosperous world.

**Popular Ready-made Textile Products**

Other textile-related businesses of the Lower Yangzi in all Lineage I Qingming include representations of ready-made garments for sale or tailors’ workshops producing garments and some ready-to-wear small goods such as socks and handkerchiefs (Fig. 169, Fig. 170, Fig. 171, Fig. 172, Fig. 173, Fig. 174; Fig. 175, Fig. 176, Fig. 177, Fig. 178, Fig. 179, Fig. 180). Taipei B of Lineage II also includes shops for ready-made clothing, which indicates that the artist not only referred to paintings of the same lineage, but also appropriated images from Lineage I Qingming (Fig. 181). These popular retail lines of apparel, socks, and handkerchiefs all developed vigorously in Ming-Qing period Jiangnan.\footnote{For the ready-made garment industry in Jiangnan during the Ming and Qing dynasties, see ibid., 145-48. For the sock industry, ibid., 150-51. Handkerchiefs were also a prosperous industry and were used widely by both men and women in the Ming and Qing dynasties. According to He, Siyou zhai congshuo 四友齋叢說, juan 35, 202, one of the fashions among young men was to carry a handkerchief; in the novel Golden Lotus (Jinping mei 金瓶梅), 51\textsuperscript{st} hui, Chen Jingji mentioned that there was a place called Handkerchief Lane (shoupa xiang 手帕巷), where a famous store run by a Wang family selling all kinds of handkerchiefs was located; and in the Dream of the Red Chamber (Honglou meng 紅樓夢), 28\textsuperscript{th} hui, Jia Baoyu 賈寶玉 exchanged a handkerchief with the actor Qi Guan 琪官 as a way to demonstrate their friendship. Xiaoxiao Sheng 笑笑生, Jinping mei 金瓶梅 (Ming Wanli keben 明萬曆刻本), juan 11, 394.} In traditional agrarian societies, these items were made by and for
households. The appearance of these textile products is further evidence of the growth of a commodity economy as well as of job division and specialization. These images were copied enthusiastically in popular Qingming paintings in order to represent an affluent society.

The above images of silk and cotton-related businesses—regardless whether they were repeatedly copied or newly invented—show that the Qingming painters cherished the many varieties of textiles that were available in the market and the associated industries that engendered the wealth and prosperity of the time. Accordingly, these motifs were assimilated to construct an image of a golden age in the Qingming scrolls.

2.2.2.3. Coming to Town: Farm Products and Laborers

Common motifs among the six paintings include farmers who bring their farm products to sell in the city and laborers who wait for jobs near the arched “rainbow” bridge. They were motifs that were similarly inspired by developments in the Ming-Qing period. From the mid-Ming, the expansion of urbanization and commercialization influenced peasants’ life in the hinterland of cities and market towns in the Lower Yangzi region. Many products were created specifically for the markets, and farm surplus could also be sold in nearby urban markets. At the same time, many laborers from nearby villages or other, more distant regions of China were attracted to the prosperous cities and towns of this area.\(^{312}\) In addition to those who were employed on a long-term basis, it was reported that every day, near bridges and temples in the cities or at the entrances to main streets, many workers waited for part-time jobs to become available. Such jobs included the opportunity for work as a weaver, dyer, or calenderer, either paid by the day

\(^{312}\) William T. Rowe, “City and Region in the Lower Yangzi,” in Johnson, Cities of Jiangnan in Late Imperial China, 11-12; Li, Jiangnan de zaoqi gongye hua 江南的早期工業化, 423-26.
or by the number of pieces of finished work.\textsuperscript{313} According to estimates made by scholars, the number of workers involved in the textile industry continued to grow throughout the late Ming and increased tremendously in the Qing dynasty.\textsuperscript{314}

The spectacle of farmers and workers coming to town was visualized to an unprecedented extent in earlier Ming dynasty \textit{Qingming} paintings, and was copied repeatedly with related images added in the later \textit{Qingming}. For example, the Zhao Zhe version motif of farmers bringing goats to town was repeated in the Metropolitan version, while a farmer herding two pigs into town was a new addition (Fig. 182, Fig. 183, Fig. 184). The image of a farmer hurrying his waterfowl into town in the Liaoning A and B versions was copied in Taipei B, but the market gardener who carries produce to town was a new scheme in Taipei B (Fig. 185, Fig. 186, Fig. 187, Fig. 188). The theme of laborers waiting for jobs near the bridge was repeated in all the \textit{Qingming}, indicating the importance and the continuous existence of abundant labor in the prosperous cities (Fig. 189, Fig. 190, Fig. 191, Fig. 192, Fig. 193, Fig. 194).

The earlier popular \textit{Qingming} painters include the phenomenon of farmers and laborers coming to town, attracted by the thriving urban market. The later painters, through copying earlier motifs and adding new themes such as different farm products to the paintings, enhanced the subject matter of an economically prosperous world.

\textsuperscript{313} For the origin of the weavers and how weavers found jobs and got paid, see Fan and Jin, \textit{Jiangnan sichou shi yanjiu} 江南紡織史研究, 212, 217, 219; Li, \textit{Jiangnan de zaoqi gongye hua} 江南的早期工業化, 59-60; Santangelo, “Urban Society in Late Imperial Suzhou,” 99. For dyers’ and calenderers’ origins, employment status, and payment, see Duan and Zhang, \textit{Suzhou shougong ye shi} 蘇州手工業史: 65-68, 174-80; Santangelo, “Urban Society in Late Imperial Suzhou,” 108-10. Calenderers’ employment status was different from weavers and dyers; they mostly worked for (but were not hired by) workshops owned by contractors who maintained contact and drew up contracts with cloth traders in exchange for money and cloth. Calenderers working for these contractors could expect to be paid for each \textit{pi} 匹 of cloth they processed, although out of this they had to pay the contractor for rent and upkeep of dormitories, equipment (grindstones and wooden rollers), and their living expenses every month. For the labor markets of weavers, dyers and calenderers, also see Fan, \textit{Jiangnan shizhen: chuantong de bianjue} 江南市鎮: 傳統的變革, 23-25.

\textsuperscript{314} Li, \textit{Jiangnan de zaoqi gongye hua} 江南的早期工業化, 41-45.
2.2.2.4. Luxury Commodities: Antiques and Work of Art

There are two major arguments about the rise of “luxury” and a “consumer society” in pre-modern Europe as a result of economic growth and, in turn, how these contributed to further economic improvement. The first emphasizes the expansion of the consumption of luxuries among the wealthy; since these goods originally were only owned by people of a certain social status, as they became more available in the market they were pursued by new elites in order to translate their new wealth into social status.\textsuperscript{315} The second argument emphasizes the transformation of what had once been luxuries into everyday goods for the middle class and eventually even the poor.\textsuperscript{316} Many Sinologists have proposed and testified that the above phenomena of a rich and consumer-based society also emerged in China during the late Ming.\textsuperscript{317} I will use these features to examine the worlds presented in the \textit{Qingming} scrolls.

In the \textit{Qingming} paintings, there are many deluxe commodities displayed in the urban stores, for example, the expensive, fashionable silk fabrics that only the wealthy were able to access easily. Moreover, in these paintings many of the silk textiles are relatively inexpensive and commonplace indulgences that even commoners were able to afford.\textsuperscript{318} As previously discussed, the display of such silks indicates that the world of the \textit{Qingming} scrolls were consumer societies with both high-end goods and ordinary luxuries.

\textsuperscript{315} Pomeranz, \textit{The Great Divergence: China, Europe, and the Making of the Modern World Economy}, 114. More about conspicuous consumption will be discussed later in the section Conspicuous Consumption and Fashion.
\textsuperscript{316} Ibid., 114-15.
\textsuperscript{317} Ibid., 116-65; Clunas, \textit{Superfluous Things: Material Culture and Social Status in Early Modern China}, 171-172; Brook, \textit{The Confusions of Pleasure: Commerce and Culture in Ming China}, 218-29; also see Wu Renshu’s review of studies by Sinologists, Wu, \textit{Pinwei shehua: wan ming de xiaofei shehui yu shidafu} 品味奢華：晚明的消費社會與士大夫, 2-9.
\textsuperscript{318} For commoners’ use of silk in the Ming-Qing era, see my discussion above under the section Expanding Silk Business and Consumption, or Li, \textit{Jiangnan de zaoqi gongye hua} 江南的早期工業化, 28-29.
To further investigate the wealth and characteristics of the society in the *Qingming* paintings, I will examine them in terms of the most prestigious luxury goods—antiques and works of art. I will demonstrate that these also serve to illustrate the growth and expansion of the consumption of extravagances among the new elites of the world in the *Qingming* scrolls.

All the six *Qingming* include antique and art stores or booths (Fig. 195, Fig. 196, Fig. 197, Fig. 198; Fig. 199, Fig. 200, Fig. 201, Fig. 202, Fig. 203). These motifs were copied throughout Lineage I paintings, and even the market-town atmosphere of Liaoning B included a booth selling antiques (Fig. 202). However, the painter of the later Taipei B probably sensed that genuine high-end works of art should be displayed in a store instead of a booth; therefore, he copied the shop selling art and antiques from the Lineage I scrolls as well as inserting an antique booth copied from Liaoning B (Fig. 203). In addition to the antique or art stores, the artist of the even later Liaoning A appended one more antique peddler than other Lineage I scrolls in order to create a more prosperous aura in the world of his *Qingming* scroll (Fig. 198).

The above images are representative of developments in the Ming-Qing era. As I have mentioned earlier, many of the Ming-Qing writers recorded the popularity of collecting antiques and art among elites and the newly rising merchant class. As a result, this fashion also contributed to the rise of the antique and art forgery industry.

In the art markets, there were many ways of performing transactions. Clunas’ study shows that in the Ming-Qing period, art dealers existed at all levels of society, from peddlers by the roadside, to monks for whom the temple was the place of business, to elite dealers whose commercial activities were disguised by the established forms of sociability.\(^{319}\) According to the late Ming-early Qing art dealer Wu Qizhen, antique sellers responded to the needs of nouveau riche Huizhou merchants by bringing curios to

---

Therefore, for upper-level elites and very wealthy merchants, art transactions were mostly held in refined settings, though this did not guarantee the authenticity of the art objects. Based on this, many of the art shops and roadside peddlers in these Qingming paintings very possibly were not only selling authentic, expensive antiques and works of art, but also were sold less expensive artifacts and even fake antiques that the merchants of the economic middle-level could afford. The presence of these various venders selling art and antiques provides evidence of the expansion of conspicuous consumption among the nouveau riche, and reinforces the premise that the worlds in the Qingming scrolls were affluent consumer-based societies.

2.2.2.5. Exotica and Vigorous Long Distance Trade

In addition to picturing local goods, two of the Qingming paintings—Taipei A and Taipei B—include products imported from other regions of China and even from overseas. Taipei A includes shops that sell fans imported from Japan (Fig. 204), and Taipei B contains shop signs that promote commodities from all over: the provinces of Shandong to the northeast and Lanzhou and Shanxi to the northwest, as well as from abroad—Guangnan (currently Southern Vietnam), the Southern Oceans 南洋 (currently Southeast Asia) and the Western Oceans 西洋 (currently the Indian Ocean and Europe) (Fig. 205, Fig. 206, Fig. 207). Both paintings demonstrate that the people’s worldview had expanded and also suggest that rare, precious goods from far away were considered essential in an ideal world. Yet, motifs of exotica also indicate that the urban economies in these Qingming paintings included active long distance and international trade.

The goods converged at Jiangnan, especially Suzhou, due to the dynamic domestic (inter-regional) and international trade during the late Ming, and so must have

---

320 Wu, Shuhua ji 書畫記, 8: 46.
321 More about the locations of these places later.
inspired the Taipei A and Taipei B painters to invent images of dealings with far-away places. The routes and infrastructure that the Ming state had previously financed and built for the purpose of supplying its armies and moving its personnel in its early years also contributed to the circulation of commodities and the movement of merchants. These included the multiple routes that government couriers used to travel around the empire, the Grand Canal that runs through the region from north to south, and the Yangzi River that flows from west to east; all provided a push toward economic development.

Located on the Grand Canal in the heart of the Yangzi River delta, Suzhou became the inter-regional trade center from the mid-Ming onward, and was known as the place where goods from all the provinces converged. Actually, merchandise from other areas of the empire could also be found in many cities and market towns of the Lower Yangzi in the Ming-Qing period. The Taipei B painter accurately captured this development by showing the flying banners that promote goods from the northeast and northwest of China in the flourishing marketplace of the Rainbow Bridge.

The expanding international maritime trade during the late Ming must have inspired both the Taipei A and Taipei B painters to portray stores with overseas commodities in their Qingming paintings. During the Ming dynasty, the long-standing tributary system was maintained as official foreign policy, which featured an emphasis on

---

322 Timothy Brook, “Communications and Commerce,” 579-615; Li, Fazhan yu zhiyue: Mingqing jiangnan shengchan li yanjiu 發展與制約—明清江南生產力研究, 368-70.
323 For the merchandise converged at Suzhou, see Santangelo, “Urban Society in Late Imperial Suzhou,” 91-92. Also see Michael Marme, Suzhou: Where The Goods of All The Provinces Converge (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2005), 146-47. As mentioned earlier, Skinner divided pre-modern China into eight macroregions according to their physiographic phenomena; one is the urbanized Lower Yangzi region. He also argued that Suzhou was not only the core of the Lower Yangzi region but also the greatest economic center of the whole empire—with its empire-wide trading connections—in the Ming-Qing period. Skinner, “Marketing Systems and Regional Economies: Their Structure and Development,” paper presented for the Symposium on Social and Economic History in China from the Song Dynasty to 1900, Beijing, Oct. 26-Nov. 1, 1980, cited by Li, Jiangnan de zaoqi gongye hua 江南的早期工業化, 21. However, Li Bozhong argued that several cities, such as Nanjing and Hangzhou, and market towns, such as Zhenze 震澤 and Zhujing 朱涇, of the Lower Yangzi were also involved in interregional trade in the Ming-Qing era, see ibid., 21-22. For the goods imported to or exported from Jiangnan, see ibid., 343-90.
the ceremonial supremacy of the emperor, unilateral bureaucratic regulations, and a limited tributary trade. Reacting to the menace of “Japanese pirates,” many of who were actually Chinese, the Ming court’s maritime policy limited foreign trade in connection with embassies in certain ports, while the size and frequency of the tributary trade also was regulated. In the fifteenth century, Zheng He undertook seven state-sponsored voyages to Southeast Asia and even Eastern Africa in order to justify the Yongle Emperor’s regime (1402-1424) and to display Ming power. The maritime states of Southeast Asia were certainly impressed with China’s wealth and power, thus Zhang He’s travels worked both to uphold the tribute system and expand China’s trade with these distant lands. After Zheng He, when the Ming Empire prohibited official expeditions and private voyages to Southeast Asia, the trade between the states in this area and China’s eastern coast continued to increase, as did illegal Chinese settlements abroad.\footnote{John E. Wills Jr., “Relations with Maritime Europeans, 1514-1662,” in Twitchett and Mote, The Ming Dynasty, 1368-1644, Part 2, vol. 8 of The Cambridge History of China, 333-34; Wang Gungwu, “Ming Foreign Relations: Southeast Asia,” in Twitchett and Mote, The Ming Dynasty, 1368-1644, Part 2, vol. 8 of The Cambridge History of China, 320-24.}

In the sixteenth century, even though the Ming court prohibited tributary trade with Japan, Chinese merchants continued to trade actively with Japan.\footnote{Li Longsheng 李隆生, Wanming haiwai maoyi shuliang yanjiu - jianlun jiangnan sichou chanye yu baiyin liuru di yingxiang 晚明海外貿易數量研究–兼論江南絲綢產業與白銀流入的影響 (Taipei: Xiwei zixun keji gongsi, 2005), 75-77.} Following that period, the recovering economy in China, especially the lower Yangzi delta area, was further stimulated by private trade between Chinese merchants and Japanese and Western powers including Portugal, Spain, and Holland through their colonies in Southeast Asia. In exchange for silk from the Lower Yangzi, its major commodity, the European powers and the Japanese brought in massive amounts of silver, copper, and other exotic goods into the area.\footnote{Several scholars, such as Atwell, Li Bozhong, Li Longsheng and Jing Xiaoyan, mentioned that in the Ming-Qing period, China’s trade with Japan, Southeast Asia or the west was channeled through merchants from Huizhou, Guangdong, Fujian or Zhejiang; China’s major export commodity was silk from Jiangnan, and the major imported item to China was silver. William Atwell, “Ming China and the Emerging
that Chinese connoisseurs in the late Ming included various foreign products among their prized possessions, and in the mid-Qing, the elites of the coastal provinces also accumulated exotic curiosities. Records also show that from the late Ming to the mid-Qing increasing amounts of exotic products were imported from Southeast Asia in particular, including pearls, incense, and rare types of wood.

One of the most cherished foreign crafts in Ming-Qing times was the folding fan that originated in Japan. During Northern Song, delicate Japanese folding fans were imported to China through Korea, of such beauty that their quality was remarked upon by Song elites. Yet, the folding fan was not very popular with the public until the mid-Ming dynasty, and then continued to grow in acceptance into the Qing dynasty due to the rising production of fine fans in the Yangzi delta and the increase in private trade between China and Japan from the late Ming and to the early Qing. In Ming dynasty Wen Zhenheng’s book of taste, Superfluous Things, he mentions that folding fans from Japan were an item of fashion. In the Zhao Zhe Qingming version there is no reference to folding fans, only depictions of stores selling round fans. Inspired by the fashion of

---

Clunas, Superfluous Things: Material Culture and Social Status in Early Modern China, 58-60; also see Pomeranz, The Great Divergence: China, Europe, and the Making of the Modern World Economy, 158-59.


Ibid., 158.

Guo Ruoxu 郭若虛, Tuhua bianwen zhi 圖畫見聞誌, in vol. 1 of Zhongguo shuhua quanshu 中國書畫全書, ed. Lu Fusheng 盧輔聖 (Shanghai: Shanghai shuhua chuban she, 1992), juan 6, 495; Deng Chun 鄧椿, Huaji 畫記 (Ming Jindai mishu ben 明津逮秘書本), juan 10, 40.

Bao Mingxin 包銘新, Shanzi jianshang yu shoucang 扇子鑒賞與收藏 (Shanghai: Shanghai shudian chuban she, 1996), 4-5; Jing, “Mingqing zhi ji zhongri maoyi yanjiu 明清之際中日貿易研究” [A Study of the Sino-Japanese Trade in the Late Ming and Early Qing Dynasties] (Shangdong daxue, 2008), 27-28, 30-31, 175-82, 90-91, 208-09.
fans, the Liaoning A artist first included folding fans in his painting, followed by the painters of the Taipei A and Metropolitan versions, who both also included stores or booths selling this popular item. However, the Taipei A artist further identified the origin of the folding fan and specified that it was from Miyagawa 宮川 of Japan, which refers to Miyagawa-cho (宮川町)—one of the famous geisha districts in Kyoto since the seventeenth century (Fig. 204).

The Taipei B painter was even more sensitive to the new development of imported goods in the seventeenth century. He inscribed banners of some stores to show that they sold “sundries from towns of Guangnan” [Guangnan gezhen zahuo 廣南各鎮雑貨] and “various rare and precious goods from the Western Oceans and the Southern Oceans” [Xiyang nanyang gese zhenqi huo 西洋南洋各色珍奇貨] (Fig. 207). Guangnan was one of the southern provinces during the Le Dynasty in what is now Vietnam. From 1558 to 1777, the lords of Guangnan operated independently from the Le Kingdom, and Guangnan thus was considered to be an autonomous kingdom by foreign merchants. Its major city Faifo was an important trading port in the Ming-Qing period. The term “Western Oceans” was used throughout Chinese history to indicate various overseas areas, while during the late Ming the term “Southern Oceans” referred to what is currently Southeast Asia. The Western Oceans shifted gradually from denoting what is currently the western part of Southeast Asia to Europe, as China’s view of the world expanded due to its contacts with Europeans who arrived in China’s southern seas beginning in the sixteenth century. Zheng Ruozeng 鄭若曾 of the time of Jiajing

333 Nishio Kumiko 西尾久美子, Jingdu qiyuan 350 nian jingying xue 京都祇園 350 年經營學 (Taipei: Tianxia zazhi, 2010), 31-33, 37-38.
334 Chen Zhongjin 陳重金, Yuenan tongshi 越南通史 (Beijing: Shangwu yinshu guan, 1992), 247. The Dutch East India Company’s archives show that Guangnan 廣南 was one of the important stops for its trading in seventeenth-century Asia. Bada weiya cheng riji 巴達維亞城日記 [Diary of Batavia] (Taizhong: Taiwan wenxian weiyuan hui, 1990), cited by Li, Wamning haiwai maoyi shuliang yanjiu - jianlun jiangnan sichou chanye ya baiyin liuru de yinxiang, 56-61.
(1507-1567) was the first to use Southern Oceans to describe the area of what is now Southeast Asia, and used Western Oceans to refer to the current location of the Indian Ocean in his Illustrated Sea Transportation (Haiyun tushuo 海運圖說).\textsuperscript{335} Around the late Ming to the early Qing, Western Oceans signified the areas including not only the Indian Ocean but also what is now Europe, and Southern Oceans began to be used to describe what is currently Southeast Asia.\textsuperscript{336} Therefore, the unusual products from Southeast Asia, the Indian Ocean and even Europe that were available in stores probably inspired the Taipei B painter to represent this aspect of the consumer culture.

Imported goods from other provinces and overseas always held the implied meaning of expensive and luxurious things. Both the Taipei A and Taipei B painters included the exotic commodities of their time in innovative ways to signify a prosperous age enhanced by the existence of an expanding long-distance trade.

\textbf{2.2.2.6. Currency Service as an Industry}

Most Qingming paintings feature service industries including currency molding and exchange, carts for hire, and cargo storage in addition to the above-mentioned cotton and silk brokers. These were all current and important elements in the economically thriving Lower Yangzi. The rise of these services indicate the expanding scale of business, longer distance trading, more elaborate division of labor, and more sophisticated market operations that are essential in a market economy.


Among these services, silver molding and money exchange were probably the most eye-catching images to *Qingming* viewers during the Ming and Qing dynasties. From the mid-Ming through the Qing, silver was the main currency while copper cash was fractional coinage.\(^{337}\) Despite the issuance of paper money in the early part of the Ming dynasty, silver was nevertheless used in China as a means of exchange in the economy during the Jiajing period. This was due to the inflation of paper money, the lack of copper coins, the continuous growth of trade, and the massive inflow of silver into the Ming economy from Japan and South America, as well as the government’s policy of collecting taxes in silver. Most importantly, the widespread introduction of silver into China helped monetize the economy and further facilitated trade and stimulated the economy.\(^{338}\) Therefore, silver played an essential role in the economic prosperity of the Ming-Qing period.

Silver was used in the form of ingots mostly for large transactions, and in the form of shards for smaller business transactions, while copper was used most often in daily practice for smaller purchases and sales.\(^{339}\) Silver shops also appeared in the fiction and writings of the Ming-Qing period, so that when people needed to mold silver shards into ingots, they went to a “silver molding shop *[qingyin dan 傾銀店]*” to “mold silver *[qingxiao 傾銷]*.”\(^{340}\) Zhao Zhe included a workshop for molding silver currency, and this image was copied throughout the later Lineage I *Qingming* paintings, signifying its importance in the mind of the painters. (Fig. 208, Fig. 209, Fig. 210, Fig. 211). The terms

\(^{337}\) Song Jie 宋杰, *Zhongguo huobi fazhan shi* 中國貨幣發展史 (Beijing: Shoudu shifan daxue chuban she, 1999), 239, 252.


\(^{339}\) Song, *Zhongguo huobi fazhan shi* 中國貨幣發展史, 239, 252, 258.

\(^{340}\) For example, “Mai youlang duzhan huakui 賣油郎獨占花魁,” and “Lu wuhan yingliu hese xie 陸五漢硬留合花鞋,” in Feng, *Xingshi hengyan 醒世恆言*, juan 3, 32, & juan 16, 200, and Huang Liu Hong 黃六鴻, *Fuhui quanshu* 福惠全書 (Qing Kangxi sanshiba nian jinling lianxi shuwu kanben 清康熙三十八年金陵濬溪書屋刊本), juan 6, 71.
qingyin dan or qingxiao that appeared in Ming-Qing fiction and other literature were also what was inscribed on the signs of the silver molding shops in the later Qingming paintings.

Another cash service in the Ming-Qing period was currency exchange. When the Ming government allowed the use of silver and copper coins, in addition to government minted copper cash, many privately minted copper coins of various qualities appeared in the market. The exchange rates between silver and copper widely varied due to the fluctuating value of the metals. Many merchants, aware of the need for currency exchange and the profits that could be made from the differences in prices in these transactions, set up exchange services in their stores and stands during the Chenghua period (1465-1487). This service became even more popular beginning in the Wanli era (1573-1619) and lasted until the late Qing.\textsuperscript{341} The above development apparently inspired the Liaoning A painter to increase the number of currency businesses in his Qingming world by adding a stand offering money exchange services for silver and copper coins (Fig. 212). This image remained present in all of the later Lineage I Qingming, and was even copied into Taipei B of the Lineage II scrolls (Fig. 213, Fig. 214, Fig. 215).

Silver molding shops and currency exchange stands were two of the rarer images depicting the financial services in the Ming-Qing period. Probably recognizing the important role that silver played in economic prosperity, investments, and maintaining a better life, and more likely simply recognizing the convenience that the silver molding and currency exchange services offered in daily-life buying and selling, the Qingming painters keenly depicted and copied them as one of the key elements of the ideal and prosperous worlds they constructed. More importantly, this shows that these Qingming

\textsuperscript{341} Peng, Zhongguo huobi shi 中國貨幣史, 515-16, 647; Song, Zhongguo huobi fazhan shi 中國貨幣發展史, 245-46, 252, 267.
painters and patrons had a very different attitude than the orthodox scholar officials of the late Ming who condemned silver and copper coins, which they claimed destroyed people’s minds because they forgot all moral principles when tempted by profits.\(^{342}\)

From the analysis of the six paintings, it is clear that the popular *Qingming* paintings commonly included images of the silk and cotton businesses that point to job division and specialization as well as expanded production and consumption; farm products and laborers that are attracted to the thriving urban economy, and luxuries that signify the conspicuous consumption of a consumer society. Further showing the expanding economy are services that suggest a large market scale as well as sophisticated market mechanics and exotic commodities that result from long distance trade. This analysis also has demonstrated that the *Qingming* painters were inspired by the economic growth from the small cities and towns to the metropolises of the Ming-Qing period, and consequently included the various commodities and services of their time to construct the images of the prosperous urban economy of the *Qingming* scrolls.

\(^{342}\) For example, Zhang Tao 張濤, *Shexian zhi 歙縣志* (1609), *juan* 9, 10b-12a, cited by Brook, *The Confusions of Pleasure: Commerce and Culture in Ming China*: 4-5.
2.2.3. **Conspicuous Consumption and Fashion**

The merchandise displayed in the stores, booths, and stands and carried by street vendors in the urban areas illustrate a highly developed economy and an opulent world, and so imply people’s extensive consumption and even conspicuous consumption. To directly understand material life in the worlds constructed in the *Qingming* scrolls and the utopian views of the painters and patrons, we must examine how people consumed the commodities they purchased, that is, what they used and wore. Therefore, I will explore the patterns of consumption of urban residents in terms of the equipment for and means of travel that they used and their attire.

During the Ming and Qing dynasties, state codes regulated the equipment used for transportation as well as how people dressed, in order to distinguish between different classes of people and to maintain the privileges of the upper classes. Certain equipment used when traveling and certain kinds of clothing became symbols of social status. From the differences in the modes of travel used by male elites (or women, in a few cases) and their outfits between earlier *Qingming* paintings and the later versions, I will show that people in the world of the *Qingming* scrolls gradually abandoned the national dress codes of the time as fashion and conspicuous consumption became more available,\(^{343}\) which was also a trend in Ming-Qing society.

---

\(^{343}\) When scholars theorized the rise of fashion, they argued that since the luxuries that signify social status became increasingly available to anyone who had enough money to buy them, rather than being restricted to those who also met certain criteria, the *nouveau riche* would start to translate their wealth into status by purchasing these prestigious goods. In order to defend their social status and prevent the new elite simply translating their new wealth into status through consumption, the old elite would increasingly buy new goods, which contributed to the growth of luxury consumption. Furthermore, high-status consumption patterns were continuously imitated by “lesser” folk, which resulted in the rise of fashion. For a summary of the theory of fashion, see Pomeranz, *The Great Divergence: China, Europe, and the Making of the Modern World Economy*, 114.
2.2.3.1. Lavish Equipment for Outings

In terms of the equipment used for outings and land transportation, I will examine images of the means of conveyance and the canopies used by the upper classes. There is a tendency for mounts and canopies of the elites in the later *Qingming* scrolls to become more elaborate compared to those in the earlier paintings. In both the Zhao Zhe and the Liaoning B versions, only the bride in the wedding procession rides in a sedan chair, while individuals including officials travel by donkey or on horseback. In 1453, the Ming Emperor issued an edict to pronounce that, in addition to the imperial family, brides, common women, seniors and ill people, only scholar officials of the first three ranks could ride in sedan chairs, while the remaining officials were limited to riding horses or donkeys. This edict encoded the sedan as a symbol of position and luxury during the Ming. Before the Chenghua period, many records show that officials followed the rules and rode horses or donkeys for transportation. However, beginning in the early Wanli time, random notes revealed that officials of all ranks, low-level scholars such as *xiucai*, and even commoners such as merchants and lower people such as actors started to ride in sedans. In the opinion of the late Ming scholar official He Liangjun, and probably representing the attitude of many contemporary scholars, it was acceptable for low level officials and high level gentry to ride in sedan chairs, despite the fact that this violated the

---


346 For officials of all ranks riding in sedan chairs, see Shen, *Wanli yehuo bian* 萬曆野獲編: *juan* 13, 264; Zhu Guozhen 朱國禎, *Yongtong xiaopin* 涌幢小品 (Ming Tianqi er nian keben 明天啓二年刻本), *juan* 15, 228; He, *Siyou zhai congshuo* 四友齋叢說, *juan* 35, 199. For *Juren* and *xiucai* riding in sedans see ibid., 199-200. For commoners and lowly people riding in sedans see Shen, *Wanli yehuo bian* 萬曆野獲編, *juan* 13, 265; also see Wu, *Pinwei shehua: wan ming de xiaofei shehui yu shidafu* 品味奢華: 晚明的消費社會與士大夫, 82-87.
official regulation, but that it was unbearable to see low level scholars and commoners doing so. Therefore, in terms of transportation, these two earlier *Qingming* paintings where no one rides in sedans present a more modest and orderly world than what was the reality.

Of the *Qingming* painted later—the Liaoning A, Taipei A, Taipei B, and Metropolitan versions—we find that more people ride in sedan chairs, but all are brides, women, officials or senior gentry (Fig. 216, Fig. 217, Fig. 218, Fig. 219, Fig. 220, Fig. 221, Fig. 222). For most of the officials and upper class individuals in these paintings, the most common land transportation is still donkeys and horses. At first glance it appears that these paintings present a world that conforms to the official ideology, but by examining the colors of the sedan curtains and canopies we discover that only people in the world of the Liaoning A actually conform to social status boundaries, not those in the other three even later *Qingming*.

Regarding the curtains of the sedans, Ming and Qing dynasty state codes stipulated that scholar officials should use *qing* 靑 (blue or blue-green) colored draperies, commoners were to use black, and only the imperial family could have red or yellow hangings. The sedan chair with green curtains in Liaoning A, Taipei A and Taipei B (to be exact, with green fabric draperies and a uncolored bamboo screen in Taipei A and Taipei B), though not quite conforming to the rules, stays within the same color family of

---

347 He, *Siyou zhai congshuo* 四友齋叢說, juan 35, 199-200.

348 Regarding equipment for outings, among the Ming imperial family only the emperor’s sedan was mentioned in the *Mingshi*, but there is no detailed description about the fabric curtains of the emperor’s sedan. However, the bamboo curtains *lian* 簾 of the emperor, empress, and prince’s carriages were regulated to be red. Zhang, *Mingshi* 明史, juan 65, zhi 41, *yufu yi* 儀服一, 1600-04, 06-07, 09, 11. Among the Qing dynasty imperial family, the sedan curtains of the emperor and empress were stipulated to be yellow, while the sedan curtains of the prince and princess were red. Before the Qianlong Emperor, the curtains of an official’s sedan were ordered to be *qing* color; during his reign, in black. Zhao Erxun 趙爾巽, *Qingshi gao* 清史稿, ed. Yang Jialuo 楊家駿, Hanji quanwen ziliao ku 漢籍全文資料庫 (Taipei: Academia Sinica), juan 102, zhi 77, *yufu yi* 儀服一, 3022, 3024, 3027, 3030, in Hanji Dianzi wenxian 漢籍電子文獻 [database on line] (Taipei: Academia Sinica), accessed July 9, 2012. http://hanchi.ihp.sinica.edu.tw/lhp/hanji.htm.
the *qing* hue and does not usurp the upper level officials’ or imperial family’s symbol, and therefore follows social status boundaries. However, the red drapes of a woman’s yellow sedan in the Metropolitan version violates both Ming and Qing official codes (Fig. 221).

With regard to canopies, the elite in the earlier *Qingming* scrolls (Zhao Zhe, Liaoning A, Liaoning B) comply with the state code for their social position, but not those in later *Qingming* scrolls (Taipei A, Taipei B and Metropolitan). The Ming official code ordered that scholar officials’ canopies should be dark-brown for those above the fourth rank or *qing* color for the fifth to ninth ranks. During Wanli’s time it was popular for low level officials to use a sky blue (*tianlan* 天藍) instead of a *qing* color canopy, which while not quite following the state code, was acceptable to many elites probably because this did not usurp the upper level officials’ or imperial family’s emblems.\(^349\) In the Qing dynasty, the regulations ordered that officials’ canopies should be apricot yellow (high ranking) or blue (low ranking).\(^350\) Both Ming and Qing regulations reserved yellow and red canopies for the imperial family.\(^351\) The officials’ canopies are blue in the Zhao Zhe version, dark-brown and green in the Liaoning A, and dark brown in the Liaoning B, which obey social status boundaries or the state code (Fig. 59, Fig. 60, Fig. 63). In the Taipei A, Taipei B, and Metropolitan versions, some officials’ canopies are depicted in yellow, which infringed on the code (Fig. 61, Fig. 62, Fig. 64). However, there are records showing that, in reality, from the mid-Ming it was common for all levels...
of officials and officers to use yellow canopies, which was supposed to be the imperial family’s privilege.352

Therefore, in terms of the color of the curtains and/or the canopies, people in the Zhao Zhe, Liaoning B and the Liaoning A scrolls do not transgress status boundaries. In the world of the even later Qingming paintings (Taipei A, Taipei B and Metropolitan scrolls), many elites live in an excessive manner, indicated by their pursuit of fashionable, lavish sedan chairs and/or canopies, but most commoners still follow the official regulations.

From this analysis, we can see that with regard to the equipment used when going out, these paintings portray a daily life that basically matched many Ming-Qing scholars’ perceptions and experiences, though they did not quite conform to government regulations. From the changing images of the means of going on outings, we discover that the painters and patrons of the Qingming scrolls, who probably could afford these trendy sedans and canopies, endorsed a world of conspicuous consumption and fashion more and more.

2.2.3.2. Fashionable Outfits

In this section, I will show that, like the increasingly impressive equipment employed for excursions, depictions in later Qingming scrolls show a greater tendency towards lavish outfits, including robes, headgear and shoes, corresponding with the trend of the Ming-Qing period. I also will demonstrate that since fashionable and luxurious dress was criticized as a sign of a decadent society by scholars who upheld the notion that

352 Shen, Wanli yehuo bian 萬曆野獲編juan 14, 265; He, Siyou zhai congshuo 四友齋叢說juan 35, 198. He Liangjun mentioned that his friend Yuan Taichong 袁太沖 saw several yellow canopies used by local official clerks in front of a county magistrate’s mansion when the magistrate’s son had the pox. He Liangjun condemned those clerks taking the opportunity to build connections with the magistrate, but did not complain about their use of yellow canopies. Liang Zhangju of the Qing dynasty mentioned that during his time officials and officers violated the code by using red canopies, see Liang, Langji congtan 浪跡叢談juan 4, 37.
people should wear clothing according to their social status or the principle of frugality and simplicity, this illustrates the even later *Qingming* painters’ and patrons’ notions of an ideal life was contrary to those of the orthodox scholars. In the Zhao Zhe version, many individuals are shown dressed in accordance with official regulations; for example, most scholars wear long blue robes and simple headscarves or black square caps (sifang *pingding jin* 四方平定巾 or fangjin 方巾) prescribed in the official dress codes.\(^{353}\) Those who do not wear blue robes are presented as wearing plain and light colors (Fig. 223). Only two physicians are wearing the headgear *dongpo jin* 東坡巾 and seven scholar officials are wearing *tangjin* 唐巾 (a Tang-style head covering), which started to become popular in the Wanli period (Fig. 224, Fig. 225). In the Liaoning A painting, most figures are dressed similarly to those in the Zhao Zhe version, although one man wears a soft headscarf (ruanjin 軟巾) and another wears *eryi jin* 二儀巾 (a head covering with an angled front piece and two loose back pieces) (Fig. 226, Fig. 227). Otherwise, the plain colored long robes, simple headscarves and black square caps are the main attire for elites in Liaoning A. In reality, many Ming writings recorded that people of the Wanli era dressed in various kinds of trendy and luxurious apparel, which is rarely found in the Zhao Zhe and Liaoning A *Qingming*. However, the even later mid-seventeenth century Taipei A shows a much greater degree of extravagance, as many people wear colorful robes and fashionable head coverings. Many more people wear popular headgear such as the *tangjin*, *dongpo jin*, and *eryi jin* (or *wanzi jin* 万字巾)

noted above. In addition, many young men wear the most stylish type of cap of the late Ming, a *piaopiao jin* (or *chunyang jin*) (Fig. 228), whereas the officially prescribed square caps can hardly be found. Additionally in Taipei A, a large number of people wear sumptuous clothing of bright colors with woven patterns of gold, which were contemporary with the fashions of the late Ming, but seriously violated the official dress code.

The same tendency of people to dress in modest to fashionable styles is seen in the two, seventeenth-century Lineage II *Qingming*. In the earlier Liaoning B, though the popular varieties of headgear (*tangjin, wanzi jin* and *dongpon jin*) appear, most people wear unpretentious headscarves and robes in white, brown or blue (Fig. 229, Fig. 230). In the Taipei B version, in addition to *tangjin, dongpon jin, wanzi jin* and *eryi jin* many figures wear the more popular *piaopiao jin* cap, fashionable light colors, understated but elegant Suzhou-style long robes and, most especially, the trendy red shoes of the late Ming, which do not appear in Liaoning B or any Lineage I *Qingming* paintings (Fig. 231, Fig. 232, Fig. 233, Fig. 113, Fig. 234).

---

354 *Eryi jin* and *wanzi jin* look similar. In the painting, since the caps were not rendered in detail, they are not easy to identify. The major difference between these two caps is that *eryi jin* features an angle in the middle of the front, whereas the front of *wanzi jin* is flat. *Eryi jin* has two loose back pieces that flutter, while *wanzi jin* likely has only one, according to Huang Nengfu 黃能馥 and Chen Juanjuan 陳娟娟, *Zhongguo fuzhuang shi* 中國服裝史 (Beijing: Zhongguo luyou chuban she, 1995), 292, 296.

355 According to the late Ming scholars Wang Qi, Wang Siyi and Gu Qiyuan, late Ming-early Qing writer Li Yu 李漁, and recent scholars Huang Nengfu and Chen Juanjuan, both *piaopiao jin* and *chunyang jin* were popular in the late Ming and both featured two pieces of board in the back and front of the cap, while *chunyang jin* was ornamented with folds. In the *Qingming* paintings, it is not easy to identify the patterns on the board of the cap; I consider them to be *piaopiao jin*. Wang and Wang, *Sancai tuhui* 三才圖會 2: 1504; Gu, *Kezuo zhuiyu* 客座贅語, juan 1, 14; Yu 李漁 *Li, Xianqing ouji* 閒情偶寄 (Qing Kangxi keben 清康熙刻本), juan 5, 58; Huang and Chen, *Zhongguo fuzhuang shi* 中國服裝史, 291.


357 For elegant, light-colored Suzhou-style long robes, see Yu, *Gushan bichen* 殿山筆塵, juan 3, 18; also see Wu, *Pinwei shehua: wan ming de xiaofei shehui yu shidafu* 品味奢華: 晚明的消費社會與士大夫, 140-41. For red shoes, see Yu Wenlong 余文龍 and Xie Zhao 謝詔, *Tianqi ganzhou fuzhi* 天啓贛州府志, Siku quanshu cunmu congshu 四庫全書存目叢書 (Shunzhi shiqi nian tangbin keben 順治十七年湯斌刻本; repr., Tainan: Zhuangyan wenhua shiye, 1996), juan 3, 38b-39a, cited by ibid., 145, 150. Several late Ming literati portraits by Zeng Jing 曾鯨 of Nanjing, including those of Ge Yilong 葛一龍 of
Due to the commercialization and economic growth of the late Ming, many of the newly wealthy started to seek status through the way they dressed. At that time there were more high-priced and luxurious textiles and clothing for sale (as I explored earlier), more people who could afford to buy them, and more anxiety about the reliability of established status markers. All these contributed to the rise of fashion in the late Ming. From the mid-sixteenth century, many scholars observed that in contrast to the dress restrictions and humble tastes of earlier times, more people wore expensive, lavish, and colorful clothes such as embroideries and brocade, and pursued changing styles of clothing—fashion. Furthermore, not only more commoners but also vulgar commoners such as actors and clerks in government offices started to dress in order to appear the social equals of the gentry. In the seventeenth century, scholars found that social elites’ attire, which in the sixteenth century could be described as timeless, began to be imitated by their social inferiors. Many of the elites, who intended to distinguish their elevated social status with fresh designs, were further lured by clothing trends. This contributed to the fashion craze by spreading new and lavish styles throughout the rest of society.  

Suzhou, Zhang Qingzi 張卿子 of Hangzhou, Li Zuiou 李醉鷗 of Jiaxing (painted in 1627), Hou Tongzeng 侯峒增 (1591-1645) of Jiading, and Gu Mengyou 顧夢遊 (1599-1669), show that they wore red shoes, which also suggests the popularity of this fashion. See Nie Chongzheng 聶崇正, Zen Jing 曾鯨, vol. 86 of Jujiang meishu zhoukan 巨匠美術週刊 (Taipei: Jinxiu publishing, 1996), 4-5, 8-9, 12-13, 16-17, 28-29. Several portraits of literati in the early Qing dynasty still show scholars wearing Ming-style clothing and red shoes, for example, the portrait of Zhou Maolan 周茂蘭 by Shu Shizhen 舒時貞 painted in 1659, and portraits of Tang Shisheng 唐時升, Cheng Jiasui 程嘉燧, and Li Liufang 李流芳 painted by Shen Shao 沈韶 in 1662. See Yang Xin 楊新, Mingqing xiaoxiang hua 明清肖像畫 (Hong Kong: Shangwu yinshu guan, 2008), 77-78, 110.  

In Liaoning A, there is one pair of red shoes in a shoe store and three pairs in another shoe store, but no one in the paintings is depicted wearing red shoes.  

Brook, The Confusions of Pleasure: Commerce and Culture in Ming China, 221-22; Wu, Pinwei shehua: wan ming de xiaofei shehui yu shidafu 品味奢華: 晚明的消費社會與士大夫, 155-58.
The trend to desire up-to-the-minute outfits in the late Ming was fiercely criticized by conservative scholars as spendthrift and even morally lax. Some moralizers even proclaimed that sumptuous dress and the violations of the state dress code would bring chaos to society and cause the decline of the empire. One example is a comment by Li Yu (1610-1680), who claimed that the “patched robe” shuitian yi 水田衣 of the late Ming, a chic and colorful style of women’s clothing derived from monks’ vestments, was contributing to the decline of the Ming empire because it violated customs, and was a bad omen as it was pieced together from “fragments.”

We can see, then, that in terms of the attire of the Qingming inhabitants, the painters and patrons of the even later popular Qingming scrolls represented the opposite view to that of the conservative scholars.

In the Qing dynasty Metropolitan version, people are shown wearing Ming dynasty clothing. However, the painter was obviously not familiar with the details of Ming dynasty clothing and thus renders people’s dress in a generalized way, making it hard to identify the style of their headgear and the patterns in their robes. It can be seen that most men’s clothing is colored blue, brown, or green, which generally conforms to the Ming national code (Fig. 235), indicating that in terms of clothing they are not as sumptuous as people in the seventeenth-century Qingming paintings. Several studies show that during the Ming-Qing transition, China’s economy, especially in the Lower Yangzi area, recovered quickly. However, it was not until the eighteenth century, when the Metropolitan Qingming scroll was painted, that the Qing dynasty reached its highest economic prosperity.

361 Both Lin Li-yueh and Wu Renshu give many examples of scholars who condemn the taste for sumptuous and colorful clothes, complaining that this defies the regulations of etiquette and that they are bad omens. One of the examples quoted is Li Yu’s comment, in Xiangqing ouji (Taipei: Changan chuban she, 1979). juan 7, 143-45. Lin Li-yueh 林麗月, “Yishang yu fengjiao: Wanming de fushi fengshang yu fuyao yilun 衣裳與風教: 晚明的服飾風尚與服妖議論” [Costumes and Customs: The Vogue and Opinion on Luxury Clothes of Ordinary People in Late Ming China], Xing shixue 10, no. 3 (1999): 130-40; Wu, Pinwei shehua: wan ming de xiaofei shehui yu shidafu 品味奢華: 晚明的消費社會與士大夫, 160-65.

362 Li Bozhong proposes that Jiangnan’s economy started to recover around the 1680s. Li, Jiangnan de zaoqi gongye hua 江南的早期工業化, 399. Wakeman proposes that Qing tax revenues steadily grew in
wear splendid colorful clothing with complicated woven patterns, which violated the Qing government’s dress code and were also criticized by Confucian scholars. But the Metropolitan Qingming painter did not reflect this phenomenon and presented a world where most people followed conventional practices and wore modest Ming-style clothing, showing his nostalgia for an earlier world in which people dressed according to the earlier regulations. This painting probably was addressed to those who tended to enjoy viewing the prosperity of ancient times or the former dynasty under the rule of the Han Chinese, and thus used clothing that generally conformed to the Ming national dress code to express it. After all, the Metropolitan painter used another image to express his nostalgia for the prosperity of the late Ming—the sign of a shoe shop reads, “shoes from Nanjing (Nanjing lüxie 南京履鞋)” (Fig. 236). Nanjing was the Southern capital of the Ming dynasty, and several records mention that Jiaofu ying 轎夫營 (near the Qinhui river) of Nanjing was famous for its shoes, which were popular and sold in other places of the Lower Yangzi in the late Ming.

In terms of attire, the earlier Qingming paintings of Zhao Zhe and the Liaoning A and Liaoning B versions present a modest world in which people’s clothing, though it did not completely conform to official codes, varied less and was less fashionable than those in real life. Yet, the later seventeenth-century Qingming of Taipei A and Taipei B both reveal a world of luxury in which many people’s clothing, headgear and shoes were identical to the various fashionable late Ming trends. However, the eighteenth-century

the late seventeenth century, but it did not reach Wanli’s level until the eighteenth century. Frederic E. Wakeman Jr., The Great Enterprise: the Manchu Reconstruction of Imperial Order in Seventeenth-Century China, vol. 2 (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1985), 1070-71. For the recovery and the significant development of the Qing dynasty economy, also see Mann, Precious Records: Women in China’s Long Eighteenth Century, 20; Myers and Wang, “Economic Developments, 1644-1800,” 564.

For example, Qianlong shili xianzhi 乾隆石埭縣治, juan 2, fengsu 風俗, Chaolin bitan 巢林筆談, juan 5, Wusu shemi risheng 吳俗奢靡日盛, and Xia Zhicheng 夏之盛, “fuyao 服妖” in Zhang Yichang 張應昌, Qing shiduo 清詩鐸, 834, cited by Feng Erkang 楊爾康 and Chang Jianhua 常建華, Qingren shehui shenghuo 清人社會生活 (Tianjin: Tianjin renmin chuban she, 1990), 183, 185.

Fan, Yunjian jumu chao 雲間據目抄, juan 2, 2628; Gu, Kezuo zhuiyu 客座贅語: juan 1, 13; also see Li, Jiangnan de zaoqi gongye hua 江南的早期工業化, 150.
Metropolitan version demonstrates a world with more modest Ming style dress again, which is far removed from the reality of eighteenth-century China. Consequently, these images of newly added outfits demonstrate that the later Qingming painters and patrons were gradually influenced by the social trends of fashion and favored a more lavish world with fashionable outfits, with the exception of the Metropolitan painter who did not show this tendency due to his nostalgia for the prosperity of ancient times or the former Ming dynasty.

The above analysis of both the equipment used for outings and the wearing apparel shows that the Qingming painters and patrons gradually favored an ideal world in which people pursued fashion and lavish consumption. This echoed trends of the late Ming to the mid-Qing, but went against many conservative scholars’ notions of conformity and simplicity.

2.2.4. Existing Government Structure and Social Order

In all of the six Qingming paintings, the individuals depicted are much like those of the Ming-Qing period, and shows that the painters and patrons copied their contemporary social system in the scrolls. Some of the most noticeable images that were inspired by the Ming-Qing society are the officials, city guards, governmental offices, displays of martial skills, and imperial palaces since these all occupy conspicuous places in or large portions of the paintings. I will demonstrate that this suggests that the painters and patrons valued the rule and management of a good government that made the society orderly and able to flourish, which is very different from the unfettered ideal world without a ruler or government portrayed in the Peach Blossom Spring. Moreover, I will show that the number of symbols of skillful government increases in later versions of the Qingming paintings, which parallels the development of and need for greater social control as society became more urbanized and populated.
In the Zhao Zhe version, the presence of the government was presented by depicting escorted officials who ride horses on the streets in the city. This image was copied throughout the later *Qingming* (Fig. 59, Fig. 60, Fig. 61, Fig. 62, Fig. 63, Fig. 64). The later painters added more and varied images of the government related to security, tariffs, military power and benign rule, which in all probability were inspired by the issues of the time. Regarding security, guards around the land gate and/or the water gate were added to the Liaoning A and B, Taipei A and B, and the Metropolitan versions, while an official and several soldiers and runners in front of a government office (*yamen* 衙門) were further added to Taipei B (Fig. 237, Fig. 238, Fig. 239, Fig. 240, Fig. 241, Fig. 242).

During the Ming-Qing period, thriving market towns experienced increasing need for official management, which may have prompted the *Qingming* painters to increase the number of officials and offices that relate to security issues. At that time, in the Lower Yangzi area the large cities—usually the capitals of prefectures (*fu* 府), sub-prefectures (*zhou* 州), and counties (*xian* 縣)—were commonly walled with several gates that were guarded by military officers and soldiers. In the Ming dynasty, the city gates were locked from dusk to dawn, but the curfews were lifted in the Qing. The offices of different levels of government *yamen* were mostly located in the capitals of prefectures, sub-prefectures and/or counties. The prefect *zhifu* 知府, the sub-prefecture magistrate *zhizhou* 知州, and the county magistrate *zhixian* 知縣 were responsible for all the administrative affairs including collecting taxes and keeping public order.\(^{365}\) Most of the market towns in the Lower Yangzi during the Ming-Qing period did not have walls but featured fences built

\(^{365}\) Charles O. Hucker, “Ming government,” in Twitchett and Mote, *The Ming Dynasty, 1368-1644*, Part 2 vol. 8 of *The Cambridge History of China*, 89. To be more specific, the vice prefect *tongzhi* was the head of the security office of the capital of a prefecture, while the vice magistrate *xiancheng* headed the security office in the capital of a county, according to Wang Weiping 王衛平, *Mingqing shiqi jiangnan chengshi shi yanjiu: Yi suzhou wei zhongxin* 明清時期江南城市史研究: 以蘇州為中心 (Beijing: Renmin chuban she 1999), 147.
with gates on the main roads and waterways, which were guarded by local corvée laborers under the supervision of the Police Office (xunjian si 巡檢司), which was in charge of the security of many market towns and villages. Then, a county was the lowest unit in the formal administrative hierarchy. Usually there were no formal government offices in a market town, but with the subsequent need for public security due to increasing population and trade, various levels of civil officials and military officers were requested to be stationed in the more prosperous and populous market towns. Otherwise, according to the official reports, theft and robbery became rampant. Though, there were many cases of corrupt officials and guards taking advantage of passers-by and residents, there were also cases of capable bureaucrats who helped to keep the cities and towns peaceful and prosperous. Therefore, the collective attitude seemed to be that though there were flaws, governmental control and management was still better than anarchy. One example also testifies to this attitude: the late Ming-early Qing writer, Wu Chichang 吳熾昌, of the Lower Yangzi mentioned that,

During the Tianqi and Chongzhen era, eunuchs controlled the government, the official system collapsed and robbers and thieves emerged and occupied most of the waterside market towns. Around my hometown in the Jiaxing and Huzhou prefectures, there was a huge mount in the waterways occupied by a powerful bandit…. When he and his followers

---


367 For example, the market town Wuqing zhen 烏青鎮, under the jurisdiction of Guian 歸安 county of Huzhou 湖州 prefecture and Tongxiang 桐鄉 county of Jiaxing 嘉興 prefecture, in the Ming dynasty, in addition to a police office, a vice prefect tongzhi was assigned to the station there, while in the Qing dynasty, a vice prefect tongzhi was also assigned to a station in that town. Dong Shining 董世寧, Wuqing zhenzhi 烏青鎮志, juan 3, jianzhi 建置, & Mingguo Wuqing zhenzhi 民國烏青鎮志, juan 25, zhiguan 職官, cited by Zhang, “Mingqing jiangnan shizhen de xingzheng guanli 明清江南市鎮的行政管理,” 133-34; also see Wang, Mingqing shiqi jiangnan chengshi shi yanjiu: Yi suzhou wei zhongxin 明清時期江南城市史研究: 以蘇州爲中心, 147-48.

368 Zhang, “Mingqing jiangnan shizhen de xingzheng guanli 明清江南市鎮的行政管理,” 133.

369 Ibid., 136-37.
attempted to plunder in a larger scale…the army of our dynasty [the Qing] came and quelled them.\textsuperscript{370}

Wu Chichang sounded confident that order had been restored. According to him, Li Bozhong argued that better social order contributed to greater prosperity in the mid-Qing dynasty compared to the late Ming, especially when the last few years of corrupt Ming government resulted in near anarchy.\textsuperscript{371} The addition of guards around the land and water gates and the depiction of government offices in even later \textit{Qingming} indicate a similar attitude among the painters and patrons.

Lineage II painters were apparently more impressed by the tariff operations of their time, as both Liaoning B and Taipei B include the image of an Inland Customs station (\textit{chaoguan} 鈔關) near the water gate (Fig. 240, Fig. 241). In 1429, the Ming government set up Inland Customs systems to tax ships at important posts along rivers and canals, which was followed in suit by the Qing government. In Jiangnan, there are two important customs stations along the Grand Canal, one located at the thriving market town of Hushu 滸墅, twenty-five \textit{li} northwest of Suzhou city, and the other at Beixin qiao 北新橋, ten \textit{li} north of Hangzhou city.\textsuperscript{372} The sign of a store near the tax office in Taipei A reads, “Renhe store [\textit{renhe dian} 仁和店]” (Fig. 243), probably meaning that the store was located in Renhe county of the Hangzhou prefecture, and further suggesting that the painter was aware of the tax post near Hangzhou. Though the income from tariffs and business taxes were not as important as land taxes and service levies in the Ming-Qing period, the tax bureau was an impressive operation, which existed only for long-distance-trade in thriving districts along major waterways and those linked to other

\textsuperscript{370} Wu Chichang, \textit{Xu Kechuang xianhua} 縱客窗閒話, \textit{juan} 8, cited by Li, \textit{Jiangnan de zaoqi gongye hua} 江南的早期工業化, 25 (footnote 2).
\textsuperscript{371} Ibid., 25.
major commercial regions of the empire. Because of this, the Lineage II *Qingming* painters were moved to include the image of the tax office at the water gate in the world of the *Qingming* scroll.

Both the Taipei B painter and Metropolitan painters depicted displays of martial skills. However, the atmospheres of these two military demonstrations differ: playful and amusing in Taipei A, serious, magnificent and masterful in the Metropolitan version. In Taipei A, the soldiers are lined up before their commanders along two sides of a square with colorful flags and many kinds of weapons, but their lines meander and lack military precision. On the side opposite to the commanders, some of the mounted soldiers are off by themselves, apparently casually rehearsing actions that they will perform later. Near these rehearsing soldiers are five clown-like figures holding implements such as folding fans and curved long knives, suggesting that they will play the role of the Japanese pirates who will be defeated by the Ming soldiers in the later performance (Fig. 244). This rendering of a spectacle staged by soldiers likely comes from a unique phenomenon in the late Ming: military reviews as entertainment rather than demonstrations of force. According to Zhang Dai, a military inspection in Yanzhou 蘭州 was mixed with interludes of acrobatic, musical and singing performances; in the Lower Yangzi, these productions were probably similar. The amusing type of military display is fully expressed in the Taipei A *Qingming*.

In the Metropolitan version, the exhibition of military proficiency was carried out on a much grander scale than that in Taipei A. Soldiers are arrayed in an orderly manner before their commanders, and perform archery, horseback riding, and swordsmanship

---

with energy (Fig. 245). The formidable forces of the Qing Empire would have provided a rousing basis for this scene. The Qing reached the apex of its military power in the eighteenth century, especially after the Kangxi and Qianlong Emperors expanded China’s territory and solidified its military and political control over the territories that are now Taiwan, Mongolia, Tibet, Vietnam, and Burma; this era of greater military emphasis is reflected in the Metropolitan version. Yet, the officials and soldiers wear the military uniforms of the Ming dynasty, which indicates the painter’s nostalgia for that lost regime in addition to his admiration for the greater military force of the Qing. Perhaps for the Metropolitan Qingming painter and his patron(s), the best opportunity for a great regime, just as created in the painting, was rule by Han Chinese combined with the powerful military force of the Qing.

The Liaoning A, Taipei A and Liaoning B painters included palace complexes with ladies engaged in leisure activities and watching dragon boats in the imperial ponds (Fig. 246, Fig. 247, Fig. 248). The image of a dragon boat regatta in the imperial precinct was developed into a popular icon of “an age of prosperity under benign rulers” in the Yuan dynasty, seen in Wang Zhenpeng’s 王振鵬 painting, Dragon Boat Regatta, which was painted according to the event held during the springtime in the Jinming Pond 金明池 of the Song Imperial Garden. Though the earlier Zhao Zhe version did not include this image, it was widely adopted in the later versions of the Qingming paintings. In addition to the dragon boats, the Liaoning A, Taipei A and Liaoning B painters incorporated a phoenix boat, while the Taipei A artist further created a tiger boat. This accords with the remark in A Record of the Eastern Capital: Like Dreaming of Hua that dragon, phoenix, and tiger boats all appeared in the imperial ponds. Perhaps all the


Both dragon and tiger boats appeared in the Jinming pond, while the phoenix boat was seen in the pond of another imperial garden, Qionglin yuan 瓊林苑. See Meng Yuanlao 孟元老, Dongjing menghua
leisure activities and entertainment in the palace complex would not be available if it were not for a prosperous and peaceful age under a benevolent and wise ruler. The palace complexes imply the imperial government system of the time. Yet, the adoption and development of the motifs of dragon, phoenix and/or tiger boats in the imperial ponds further enhances the subject matter of the scrolls as a great age. This approach also echoes Genette’s theory of hypertextuality, in which a text was developed from a previous text on which it is based, but which it modifies, elaborates or extends.

Given that these images—except for the boating in the imperial lakes—were derived from contemporary life, did the Qingming painters endorse the existing governmental structure? Most traditional histories, biographies and other official or unofficial materials reflect the interests of the ruling classes and their bias. The fiction that was popular in the Ming-Qing period might better reflect the actual administrative system of the time: many corrupt bureaucrats were portrayed, but some capable officials were also represented. For example, in Ling Mengchu’s novel, [As Chen Qi was] Late to Obtain a Pawn Receipt, Mao Le Refused to Return Money; Ghost of Middleman Monk Haunted the Survivors, one prefecture magistrate and one county magistrate both accepted bribes and gave unfair sentences to defendants, while in Feng Menglong’s fictional work Governor Teng Craftily Resolves a Family Dispute, the governor settled a family dispute using wisdom. This means, for all the faults of the Ming and Qing governments, there was the possibility of efficient management under the existing system. Furthermore, it can hardly be supposed that people of the time could have envisioned a more satisfactory institutional system. Therefore, the Qingming painters endorsed the

---

378 “Teng dayin guiduan jiasi 滕大尹鬼斷家私” in Feng Menglong Gujin xiaoshuo 古今小說（明天許齋刻本），juan 1, 1-24.
existing governmental structures, and included images of the current officials, institutions, and powerful military force as symbols of the presence of a benign ruler in the ideal world. We can assume they hoped for good officials and rulers who would behave responsibly and govern fairly under the existing system, rather than have anarchy, which would have been worse, as the people of the newly developed market towns during the Ming-Qing transition had experienced.

2.2.5. Transforming Human Relationships

In this section, I will analyze images in the six paintings that represent the interactions between family members as well as between men and women, and renderings of the lives of women. My analysis will show that the later painters and patrons gradually accepted and favored more intimate family relationships and more unconventional images of women.

2.2.5.1. Intimate Family Relationships

In all the Qingming paintings, Confucian ethics regarding family values are emphasized, such as the tenderness of motherhood and harmonious brotherhood. However, intimate relationships among parents and sons and between husbands and wives also appear, which differ from orthodox Confucian models, but I will demonstrate that they met the people’s need for comfort in a competitive society and accord with the neo-Confucian scholars’ ideal of the Ming-Qing period.

In the Qingming paintings, we see the tenderness of motherhood expressed through illustrations of mothers taking care of their children (Fig. 249, Fig. 250, Fig. 251, Fig. 252, Fig. 253, Fig. 254). Motifs of brothers playing together, or an elder taking care of a younger, show the ethic of harmony between male siblings (Fig. 255, Fig. 256, Fig. 257, Fig. 258, Fig. 259, Fig. 260). However, all the Qingming painters depict affable
fathers holding or hugging their sons, defying the traditional view of father figures who were supposed to be stern toward their sons and impose discipline (Fig. 261, Fig. 262, Fig. 263, Fig. 264, Fig. 265, Fig. 266). In addition, conventional thought favored a respectful and non-attached relationship between husband and wife, and closeness between spouses was discouraged in the conservative familial system.\textsuperscript{379} Yet, both the Taipei A and Taipei B painters depicted a scene of a husband going to a temple with his wife and son (Fig. 267, Fig. 268), and the Metropolitan painter portrayed a man receiving his younger son from his wife’s hands while his elder son plays nearby (Fig. 269). The Taipei B painter even depicted a scene of intimacy between a married couple: a husband teases his wife during dinner, since he is shown standing up and reaching toward her while she holds a wine pitcher (Fig. 270).

The Qingming painters probably created these images of ideal family life because of two concerns in Ming-Qing society. Firstly, in a competitive commercialized society people were anxious about the conflicts caused by competition for profits. Secondly, in the late Ming-early Qing, serving a corrupt court or alien rulers presented a serious conflict of interest for many scholars. In contrast to the happy family of the Qingming images, anxiety about family relationships being changed by the pursuit of profits and commercialized society is found in Ming-Qing fiction and other writings. For example, two novels by Feng Menglong reflect the various possibilities and anxieties of people who are in the midst of dramatic social and economic changes. \textit{Governor Teng Craftily Resolves a Family Dispute} tells the story of how an elder brother bullied his younger brother for control of the family property, and \textit{Jiang Xingge Re-encounters His Pearl Shirt} is an account of a wife who committed adultery while her absent husband was engaged in long distance trade.\textsuperscript{380} Scholar-official Zhang Tao 張濤 (1609) also reported


\textsuperscript{380} “Teng dayi guiduan jiasi 滕大尹鬼斷家私” in Feng, \textit{Gujin xiaoshuo 古今小說}, juan 10,
his observations and fears for relationships in a commercialized society, stating: “As men match wits using their assets, fortunes rose and fell unpredictably…, each exploiting the other and everyone agitating each other,” and, “the lord of silver rules heaven and the god of copper cash reigns over the earth. Avarice is without limit, flesh injures bone [blood-related kin injure each other]; everything is for personal pleasure…”

In addition to dramatic social-economic changes, the late Ming and early Qing went through an extremely chaotic period of political conflict, which further aroused the anxieties of many scholar-officials. Many well-to-do scholars were disenchanted with the thought of serving a degenerate court or foreign head of state, and therefore shunned political appointments in favor of domestic pleasure.

The family ideal pictured in the Qingming scrolls actually not only met people’s desire for close relationships to ease their anxiety in a competitive society but also corresponded with certain Neo-Confucian scholars’ propositions. During the dramatic social and political changes of the sixteenth to the seventeenth centuries, followers of Wang Yangming’s Neo-Confucian School championed qing (feeling, emotion, and love) and challenged the dry rationality and scholastic orientation of the Confucian mainstream. To them, the meaning of qing was much broader than romantic love, encompassing friendship between people of the same sex and other human relations such as the bonds between members of households.

Since the sixteenth century, the Qingming painters echoed Neo-Confucian scholars’ ideals and visualized images not only of harmony but also of closeness among families in a way that met people’s needs in a social and economically competitive and politically changing society full of uncertainty. The later Qingming painters of the

---

381 Zhang Tao, Shexian zhi (1609), juan 9, 10b-12a, cited by Brook, The Confusions of Pleasure: Commerce and Culture in Ming China, 4-5.
382 Ko, Teachers of the Inner Chambers: Women and Culture in Seventeenth-Century China, 152.
383 Ibid., 18, 111.
seventeenth and eighteenth centuries augmented this ideal by adding more intimate interactions between family members.

2.2.5.2. Changing Gender Relationships and Images of Women

Through examination of the images of men and women in the six selected paintings, I will explore gender relationships and roles in the *Qingming* scrolls to determine whether these accorded with or challenged Confucian ideology. Further, I will consider whether these illustrations resemble or differ from contemporary gender relations and images recorded in written texts (also see table 5). My study will demonstrate that the repetition of some motifs of men and women reveal that the sixteenth- to eighteenth-century *Qingming* painters and viewers shared a number of conventional concepts about gender relationships, such as preferring a male heir and a patriarchal system. However, the transformation of some previous themes and the addition of new motifs related to images of women in the later *Qingming* paintings are indicative of changing concepts concerning womanhood among *Qingming* painters and viewers over time. For example, in later *Qingming*, women enjoy more entertainment and show more evidence of a literary education, rather than being dedicated solely to domestic work. In addition, I will show that gender relations and ideas about women took place in Ming-Qing society in correspondence with some unorthodox scholars’ ideals.

Due to patrilineal beliefs and practices, Chinese parents preferred male heirs to females.\(^\text{384}\) This concept is strongly presented in all the *Qingming* paintings, in which only boys appear in public places and enjoy all kinds of games and activities, such as wrestling, wandering around, watching puppet shows, flying kites and riding a hobbyhorse (Fig. 271, Fig. 272, Fig. 273, Fig. 274, Fig. 275, Fig. 276). All six *Qingming* paintings

\(^{384}\) Ibid., 11, 107; Mann, *Precious Records: Women in China's Long Eighteenth Century*, 10. Ming statutes stipulated that a common man could take a concubine if he was over the age of forty and had no son.
paintings testify to the notion of a patriarchal system in the Ming-Qing period by showing men not only in the majority but also, especially the gentry, as the ones who enjoy leisure activities, women’s services, and valuable things (Fig. 277, Fig. 195).

In addition to the above orthodox notions, the Ming government and Confucian scholars assented to the concept of men’s superiority over women, emphasized the Three Followings (sancong 三從) and the Four Virtues (side 四德) for women, and promoted separate spheres for men and women (men, outer/public; women, inner/domestic). This discourse on gender spread widely due to the prosperous economy and thriving publishing industry during the mid-Ming, which encouraged the public and private sectors to publish didactic books for women. These emphasized that

---

385 The Three Followings teach obedience to the father before marriage, to the husband after marriage, and to the son after the death of the husband (wejia congfu 未嫁從父, chujia congfu 出嫁從夫, fusi congzi 夫死從子), while the Four Virtues refer to Womanly Virtue (fude 婦德), Womanly Speech (fuyan 婦言), Womanly Deportment (furong 婦容), and Womanly Work (fugong 婦工). The Three Followings are found in Li ji 禮記, 1: 441, and the Four Virtues come from Ban Zhao, Nüjie 女誡, according to Ko, Teachers of the Inner Chambers: Women and Culture in Seventeenth-Century China, 6, 145; also see Mann, Precious Records: Women in China’s Long Eighteenth Century, 106.


387 According to the statistics of Wang Guangyi 王光宜 and Yamazaki Junichi 山崎純一, although didactic books for women had been published since the Han dynasty, the highest number appear in the Ming and the second highest in the Qing, see Wang Guangyi, Mingdai nü jiaoshu yanjiu 明代女教書研究 (Guoli Taiwan shifan daxue, 1999), 197-202, and Yamazaki Junichi, Kyoku kara mita Chûgoku joseishi shiryo no kenkyu: “Onna shisho” to “Shinpufu” sanbu shu 教育からみた中國女性史資料の研究: 「女四書」と「新婦譜」三部書 (Tokyo: Meiji Shoin, 1986), 23-46, quoted by Yi Jilan 衣若蘭, Sangu liupo: Mingdai funü yu shehui de tansuo 三姑六婆: 明代婦女與社會的探索 (Taipei: Daoxiang chuban she, 2002), 92, footnote 10. According to Chen Baoliang, among the imperial publications, in the Hongwu period (1369-1398), Empress Ma issued Nüjie 女誡, in the Yongle period (1402-1424), Empress Xu published Neixun 內訓, and during Wangli’s time, the Empress dowager Cisheng compiled Nüjian 女鑑 and the imperial concubine Zheng Guifei was sponsored to publish Lü Kun’s 呂坤 Guifan tushuo 婦範圖説. Among private publications, Wang Xiang’s 王相 mother compiled Nüfan jielu 婦範捷錄, Lü Kun published Guifan 婦範, and in his didactic book for his family, He Qin 賀欽 (1437-1510) compiled twelve norms for woman. Chen, Mingdai shehui shenghuo shi 明代社會生活史, 157-58, 63-65, 157-58, 163-165. According to Dorothy Ko, many of these books for women were adorned with illustrations, for example, a Nanjing printer issued a fully illustrated version of Lienü zhuàn 列女傳 in 1587; another printer in Shexian followed suit in 1606. A Suzhou leading printer also produced a reprint of a supposed Song edition of the book; a two-color illustrated version of Lü Kun’s Guifan was issued in 1600, which was so popular that it was reissued several times between 1612 and 1615; in the eighteenth century, a handbook with illustrations entitled Kunde baojian 坤德寶鑑 was published. Ko, Teachers of the Inner Chambers: Women and Culture in Seventeenth-Century China, 55-57.
the ideal demeanor of a woman is quiet and gentle;\(^{388}\) she should be a submissive daughter, wife and mother, and should master domestic work such as weaving, tailoring, embroidery and cooking.\(^{389}\)

In the selected six paintings, as mentioned above, most of the people in public places are male, reminding us of men’s dominance of the outer sphere, and in the earlier versions of the popular *Qingming*, more women were depicted in indoor settings, conforming to the orthodox Confucian scholars’ ideal. However, we still find some women on the street in the earlier *Qingming*, and in the even later versions there is a tendency for more women to appear in public domain, disregarding Confucian norms.

Among the three *Qingming* paintings of Lineage I painted by the seventeenth century, the Zhao Zhe version presents the women of gentry families mostly as staying indoors; they quietly stay with female family members, a maid or a son; do embroidery, amuse themselves in the private gardens, or travel under the cover of curtains without any interaction with men (Fig. 278, Fig. 279, Fig. 280, Fig. 281, Fig. 282). Although one little girl (with white color on her face, a typical way to render females in Chinese paintings) was depicted outdoors, she is almost invisible. Apparently attracted by the wedding parade, she shyly hides behind a boy and an old lady (probably her grandmother) in front of the gate of her home, stealing a glance at the bridal procession. Behind her, a housewife (probably her mother) hides behind the gate also peeping at the bridal procession (Fig. 283). Thus, the images of female gentry in the Zhao Zhe version rather

---

\(^{388}\) For example, according to Empress Xu’s *Neixun*, a virtuous woman should be “chaste, quiet, gentle and serene as well as dignified, modest, sincere and loyal” [*zhenjing youxian* 貞靜幽閒], *duanzhuang chengyi* 端莊誠一], and according to the norms of virtuous woman in He Qin’s didactic book for his family, a woman should be “serene, composed, respectful, and cautious” [*anxiang gongjin* 安祥恭謹], see *Daming renxiao huanghou neixu* 大明仁孝皇后內訓, *Dexing pian* 德性篇, and He Qin, *Yilu ji* 醫閭集, *juan* 1, *Yanxing lu* 言行錄, cited by Chen, *Mingdai shehui shenghuo shi* 明代社會生活史, 163-64.

\(^{389}\) Diligent productive manual labor was considered a mark of virtue for all women, regardless of class. Mann, *Precious Records: Women in China’s Long Eighteenth Century*, 14, 77; Chen, *Mingdai shehui shenghuo shi* 明代社會生活史, 165.
accord with the ideal women of Confucian ideology. However, Zhao Zhe presented several women from ordinary or lower class families as working in public spaces, which contrasts with the Confucian model of separate gender domains. Examples include merchants’ wives helping in stores, an old lady selling fans on the street, a maidservant walking alongside a curtained sedan (which probably carries her mistress), a female matchmaker in the bridal procession, singing girls performing on the street, and private musicians or entertainers performing for their male master and guests (Fig. 284, Fig. 285, Fig. 282, Fig. 286, Fig. 287, Fig. 277).\textsuperscript{390} In addition, commoner-class woman is portrayed visiting and praying in a temple (Fig. 288).

In 1577, when Zhao Zhe painted the \textit{Qingming} scroll, some women had actually crossed the boundaries of the inner chamber. For instance, in the early sixteenth century Zou Saizhen 鄒賽貞 (commonly referred to Pu Shiqi 濮士齊), a scholar-official’s wife, enjoyed traveling with her husband to his official post.\textsuperscript{391} Records show that since the mid-sixteenth century a large number of women, including gentry women, went on outings, especially to visit temples and sight-see during festivals, and thus exposed themselves to the public. This was in addition to the courtesans and singing girls who worked in the public sphere and were used to being invited on and joining the outings of the gentry.\textsuperscript{392} Furthermore, Ming writers and novels often portrayed female commoners as this was a social occasion, it should be considered as a public space.\textsuperscript{393} Ko, \textit{Teachers of the Inner Chambers: Women and Culture in Seventeenth-Century China}, 138-39.

Concerning women’s exposure to the public, Huang Xingzeng 黃省曾 (1490-1540) mentioned that in February and March many gentrywomen visited Guanyi temple in Zhixing Mountain near Lake Tai, and Gu Qiyuan (1565-1628) mentioned that, after the Zhende (1491-1521) and Jiajing (1522-1566) periods, many women in Nanjing showed their faces in public. Huang Xingzeng 黃省曾, \textit{Wufeng lu} 吳風錄 (Ming Longqing keben 明隆慶刻本), 1; Gu, \textit{Kezuo zhuju} 客座贅語, \textit{juan} 1, 15; also see Chen, \textit{Mingdai shehui shenghuo shi} 明代社會生活史, 15. Regarding the company of courtesans or prostitutes on outings in the sixteenth century, Huang Xingzeng mentioned that in the Wu area, scholars often went sailing in pleasure boats and went hiking in the company of courtesans; and on Tiger Hill of Suzhou, a famous temple built by the magistrate Hu Zuanzong 杭繡宗 was always as busy as a market place and courtesans who accompanied gentry visitors “numbered as many as clouds,” Huang, \textit{Wufeng lu} 吳風錄. 1. He Liangjun mentioned how Qian Tongai 錢同愛 asked Wen Zhengming to sail on Stone Lake, and summoned a courtesan to accompany them, which scared away Wen Zhengming. He, \textit{Siyou zhai congshuo} 四友齋叢說, \textit{juan} 18, 99; also see Wu, \textit{Pinwei shehua: wan ming de xiaofei shehui yu shidafu} 品味奢侈: 晚明的消費
who worked in the public sphere as nuns, fortunetellers, physicians and healers, midwives, peddlers, brokers, matchmakers, brothel runners and procuresses; collectively referred to as *sangu liupo* 三姑六婆, an idiom denoting women with disreputable professions. Wives may also be portrayed as an assistant in a merchant or craftsman’s small business. Contemporary scholar-officials usually despised these women. Moreover, records dating from approximately the Zhengde period (1505-1521) indicate that some women even started to work in the rice paddies, and as mentioned earlier, research shows that in the late Ming, more men in the Lower Yangzi became professional weavers to earn their living, both of which contradicted the traditional concept that men farm in the fields while women weave at home. In the Zhao Zhe painting, although men still work in the fields, another man winds silk thread on a spinning wheel in a thread store, and in a tailor’s shop, two men make cloth, which was usually considered to be women’s work (Fig. 141). Thus, Zhao Zhe depicted a world where gentry-class women are separated from men, mostly following the traditional norms—quietly staying indoors or embroidering cloth—while lower class females are active in the public arena and men work at a few jobs more typically performed by women, reflecting some aspects of sixteenth-century life that challenged the official ideology of gender relationships and ideas about women.

Women lead less restricted lives in Liaoning A compared to females in the Zhao Zhe version. In Liaoning A, many women remain indoors but none do domestic work.

---

393 For example, in Feng Menglong's novel *Yiwen qian xiaoxi zao qiyuan* 一文錢小隙造奇冤, pottery-maker Qiu Yida 丘乙大 in Jingdezhen ran a workshop of his own; his wife, a woman named Yang 楊氏, assisted him in the business by painting decorations on the pottery. She is portrayed as an unwise and unchaste woman, Feng, *Xingshi hengyan* 醒世恆言, juan 34, 495-516. For scholar-officials' attitudes toward *sangu liupo*, see Yi, *Sangu liupo: Mingdai funü yu shehui de tansuo* 三姑六婆: 明代婦女與社會的探索, 18-32.

394 For women working in the rice fields, see Wang, *Gusu zhi* 姑蘇志, juan 13, 117. For trends regarding men involved in fabric production, and officials and literati’s worries about women farming and men weaving, see footnote 286.
more enjoy leisure activities such as watching a drama being performed in an open-air theater from their backyard, more appear in public, and palace ladies partake in a leisurely boating trip (Fig. 289, Fig. 246). The single female commoner who worshipped in a temple in the Zhao Zhe version was transformed to three elite women in Liaoning A (Fig. 290). The scene of two gentry women sitting and chatting in a room with a painted screen in the Zhao Zhe version has changed into a musical performance by three courtesans, with the sign Qinglou (green chamber, a euphemism for a brothel)—openly identifying a pleasure quarter—in the Liaoning A version (Fig. 278, Fig. 291). Some lower class women even reveal their bodies in public or mingle with men—a merchant’s wife breastfeeds her baby in a store, and a mother brings her child to join a crowd watching an acrobatic show (Fig. 292, Fig. 293). From around the early seventeenth century, when Liaoning A was painted, to the end of the Ming dynasty, it was common to find publications that referred to women visiting temples and the commingling of men and women, a sign of a decadent society to official and gentry-class moral crusaders. In addition, many seventeenth-century writers referred to the booming

---

395 According to Dorothy Ko, the pleasure quarter or brothel should be considered a public space, since though it is indoors, it is a place to form a public network and social community. Ko, Teachers of the Inner Chambers: Women and Culture in Seventeenth-Century China, 16.

396 Around the seventeenth century, there are more records about woman’s outings and travel, such as a crowd of women visiting West lake of Hangzhou during the Qingming and the Shuangjiang 霜降 solar terms recorded in Zhang Han 張瀚, Songchuang mengyu 松窗夢語 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1982), juan 7, shixu ji 時序記, 136-137, cited by Wu, Pinwei shehua: wan ming de xiaofei shehui yu shidafu 品味奢華: 輕明的消費社會與士大夫, 188. In addition, Wang Shixing 王士性 recorded that in summertime, women crowded the pleasure boats in the Qinghui River area of Nanjing, Kuangzhi yì 廣志 迹 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1981), juan 2, liangdu 兩都, 24, cited by ibid., 188-89. Zhang Dai recorded several occasions where women went on outings and mingled with men, such as during summertime at Lotus Lake of Suzhou, during the Moon Festival at Tiger Hill of Suzhou, in the Qingming festival of Yangzhou, and during the Lantern Festival in Shaoxing, Zhang, Taoan mengyi 陶庵夢憶, juan 1, fengmen hedang 風門荷宕, 8-9, juan 5, huqiu zhongqiu yie 虎丘中秋夜, & yangzhou qingimgn 揚州清明, 69-72, and juan 6, shaoxing deng 紹興燈, 79-81. Regarding women visiting temples, for example, Yuan Hongdao 袁宏道 was impressed by the crowd of men and women visiting the temple at Tianchu 天竺 Mountain near West Lake, see Yuan Hongdai ji jianjiao 袁宏道集箋校 (Shanghai: Shanghai guji, 1981), juan 10, hushang zaxu 湖上雜敘, 438, cited by Wu, Pinwei shehua: wan ming de xiaofei shehui yu shidafu 品味奢華: 輕明的消費社會與士大夫, 191.

courtesan culture of the time. Thus, the painter of Liaoning A portrayed a world in which many gentry women still followed the conventional norms of separated spheres, but none performed household tasks and more took pleasure in recreational activities. Some even violated Confucian norms and visited temples. The Liaoning A painter portrayed more women (particularly mothers) of lower class who appeared freely on the streets, and displayed courtesan culture more openly, which indicates that with regard to womanhood, the artist, though still favoring some Confucian ideals, gradually accepted the contemporary values of the late Ming.

In spite of these developments in Liaoning A, women generally are still not active and do not interact with men. In the mid-seventeenth-century Taipei A, not only do more women appear in the community, more engage in cultural practices normally assigned to men, are active in the public realm, or interact positively with men. For example, with regard to women’s outings, in addition to using a curtained sedan to go from place to place, two gentry women (probably a wife and a concubine) travel openly with their scholar-official husband in a boat on the canal (Fig. 294). In the scene of the drama performance in an outdoor theater in Taipei A, some upper-class women watch the show and talk to each other; they are in a separate area from the men, but this section is not curtained off and thus the women can been seen by men (Fig. 295). As compared to the

398 There are more documents recording the company of courtesans, prostitutes, or singing girls on the outings and gatherings of the gentry, and noting the boom of courtesan culture around the seventeenth century than of earlier times, such as Xie Zhaozhi’s 謝肇淛 comments that during the Wanli period, prostitutes and courtesans were everywhere; thousands existed in metropolitan areas and they appeared even in small towns of backward places, Wu Zazu 五雜組 (Taipei: Weiwen tushu chuban gongsi, 1977), juan 8, 199, cited by ibid., 83. Tan Yuanchuan 譚元春 mentioned his outing with his friends with the company of courtesans in “Zai you wulongtan ji 再遊烏龍潭記” in Tan Yuanchun ji 譚元春集 (Shanghai: Shanghai guji chuban she, 1998), juan 20, 558, quoted by Wu, Pinwei shehua: wan ming de xiaofei shehui yu shidafu 品味奢華：晚明的消費社會與士大夫, 186. Dorothy Ko mentions that courtesan culture blossomed in the late Ming period and both its visibility and respectability peaked at this time; she notes that literati not only visited entertainers' houses but also invited courtesans to their domestic halls and private gardens, citing James C.Y. Watt, “The Literati Environment,” in Li Chu-tsing and James Watt, eds., The Chinese Scholar's Studio: Artistic Life in the Late Ming Period, (N.Y.: Asia Society Galleries, 1987), 7, in Ko, Teachers of the Inner Chambers: Women and Culture in Seventeenth-Century China, 256.
same scene in Liaoning A (Fig. 289), in which many women quietly watch an outdoor performance from their backyards—still a domestic site—these women in Taipei A pleasantly enjoy entertainment beyond the confines of the domestic sphere. According to late-Ming scholar Zhang Dai’s memory of many glorious scenes of the prosperous time before the demise of the dynasty, crowds of women enjoyed outings and sightseeing and mingling with men, and also became the target of people’s gaze—another attractive sight. Much like Zhang Dai’s depiction but on a smaller scale, the Taipei A painter expressed similar excitement at such a sight.

In terms of women’s indoor activities in Taipei A, none of the gentry women do domestic work, but two are shown in a room with books, indicating they read or have literary ability; one plays the zither (Fig. 296, Fig. 297). In the imperial palace and garden, some palace ladies are also portrayed as being able to read (depicted in a room with books) or play the zither (maids carry their zithers), and some play chess (Fig. 298, Fig. 299, Fig. 300). Originally, books, zithers and chess were considered to belong to the domain of men. However, they became popular among upper-class women and concubines in the late sixteenth to the seventeenth century. Furthermore, during the sixteenth century, some scholars started to recognize women’s literary talents and championed sincerity, spontaneity, and emotions as essential to composing good poems,

399 Zhang, Tāoān mengyì 陶庵夢憶, juan 6, shāoxīng dēng 绍興燈, 79-80.
400 The arts of zither (qín 琴), chess (qì 棋), calligraphy (shū 書), painting (huá 畫) have been considered as four important practices among intellectuals since the Tang dynasty, according to He Yangzhi 何延之, when he praised Bian Cai’s 辨才 talents in Lanting jì 蘭亭記, included in Zhang, Fashu yaolu 法書要錄, 1: 57. Regarding elite women’s and concubines’ educations, including reading, zither, chess, calligraphy and painting, among others, in the Ming-Qing period, see Wu Hao 吳暘, comp., Guochao hangjun shiji 國朝杭郡詩集 (Qiantang: Dingshi, 1874), juan 30, 10a. Hu Baoyi 胡抱一, comp., Benchao mingyuan shichao 本朝名媛詩鈔 (n.p., preface 1766), juan 1, 2a, and Li Yu 李漁, Xianqing ouji 閒情偶寄, ed. Helmut Martin, vol. 5 of Li Yu quanji 李漁全集 (Taipei: Chenwen chuban she), juan 3, 46a, 47b-50a, 51a, 52a, 57a-58a, 60b-61a, cited by Ko, Teachers of the Inner Chambers: Women and Culture in Seventeenth-Century China, 244, 265; also see Wang Shixing, Kuangzhi yi, juan 2, liangdu, 29, cited by Chen, Mingdai shehui shenghuo shi 明代社會生活史, 171; Shen, Wanli yehuo bian 萬曆野獲編, juan 23, guanlin ji 廣陵姬, 444.
and equated them with the attributes of women;\textsuperscript{401} this also indicates the popularity of woman’s education. The Taipei A painter certainly sensed this trend and echoed these unorthodox scholars’ ideas.

Moreover, some modified images in Taipei A show that women were more active in the public arena than those in earlier paintings. In the temple scene, in addition to the women worshipping in front of a Buddhist image like those in Liaoning A, the Taipei A painter added the motif of a wife physically leading her son and husband—a young man in a long robe, supposedly a scholar—to visit a Buddhist temple (Fig. 301). The Taipei A artist also changed the image of the shy girl behind her grandmother, whose mother is shown peeping from behind the door at the wedding parade in the Zhao Zhe version to a woman with her son in front of her main door, joyfully pointing at and watching the bridal procession (Fig. 302). Furthermore, he modified the scene of three courtesans playing music in Liaoning A to two courtesans performing music for male guests. Here, while one courtesan plays the \textit{pipa} and uses her eyes to flirt with one man, another guest responds to the second courtesan’s \textit{ban} percussion by beating a rhythm with his fan (Fig. 303). The Taipei A painter also added a skilled female tightrope walker engaged in a public performance, which was a common sight from the mid-fifteenth century when the economy started to boom (Fig. 304). These active women did not appear in any of the previous \textit{Qingming} paintings.

In the world of Taipei A, the emergence of books, zithers and chess in the lives of women, women’s activities in public places, and interactions between men and women are indicative of changing concepts about women and gender relationships among the later \textit{Qingming} painters and viewers, who sensed and even more, accepted, the changing roles of women that eroded the strict gender boundaries of the seventeenth century.

The changes to the images of women in the Lineage I *Qingming* also occurred in the Lineage II scrolls. In the *Qingming* paintings of Lineage II, most of the people on the streets are men, too. Yet, painters of the later versions depicted more women active in public spaces or interacting with men. In Liaoning B, most women were portrayed as modestly staying at home and apart from men (Fig. 305). In addition to some merchants’ wives who help in the stores and an old lady who walks out in the open, there is only one other woman, probably a wealthy merchant’s wife and a mother, escorted by a servant girl,\footnote{As this figure wears rather simple clothing compared to the mother, we can assume she is a maid instead of the woman’s daughter. Even if she is the daughter of the woman, she is practicing a guardian’s duty, trying to discipline the boys instead of playing like them in a public place.} who tries to stop two boys (probably her sons) from wrestling on the street (Fig. 306, Fig. 307, Fig. 308).

In Taipei B, the painters added many new images of women that help to generate an atmosphere that was very different from the earlier Liaoning B. Regarding women of upper classes, many were depicted staying in the same room with men (Fig. 309), and one even joins men who play a board game (Fig. 310). In a temple, a gentry woman brings her husband and sons to worship (Fig. 311). In the later part of the Liaoning B, many noble ladies—with their guards in attendance—appear in a park area; one talks to a young man and mingles with a group of males watching a puppet show (Fig. 312). Several ladies with some boys are playing or viewing scenery from a bridge, while in the meantime, three young men gaze at them (Fig. 313).

In terms of lower-class females in Taipei B, in addition to the women depicted in Liaoning B, more of these types of women also appear in the public realm. For example, a girl rides a donkey alongside a loaded grain cart; a woman rides a donkey across a bridge as her servant boy follows behind; another woman visits a fortuneteller (Fig. 314, Fig. 315, Fig. 316). Furthermore, a courtesan’s house is openly displayed (Fig. 317); a woman (probably also a courtesan) takes a pleasure boat trip with two men, crossing
under the Rainbow Bridge (Fig. 318); and a singing girl plays a *pipa* on the street (Fig. 319).

Hence, although belonging to a different lineage of *Qingming* paintings, the Zhao Zhe version of the late sixteenth century and Liaoning A (Lineage I) and Liaoning B (Lineage II) of the early seventeenth century present similar images of women—with many leading more conventional, passive lifestyles. Both the Taipei A (Lineage I) and Taipei B (Lineage II) paintings of the mid-seventeenth century illustrate unconventional attributes of womanhood—with many demonstrations of vitality in both domestic and public life.

As for the eighteenth-century Metropolitan *Qingming*, with further modifications of earlier images and the addition of many new designs, the painter presented more images of women and gender relationships that are further divorced from Confucian ideals, but closely resemble what was happening in the society, especially among the common people. Like the previous *Qingming* paintings, men also dominate the outside spaces. Many women were still confined indoors, being good mothers or housewives. Yet, more of them lead active lives in their domestic spheres and there are even more women depicted outside of domestic sites. They freely enjoy outings or are actively involved in all kinds of events, and some not only talk to, but also engage playfully with men. For example, in a mansion, some upper class women play board games, while a group holds a dinner party (Fig. 320, Fig. 321). In the latter part of the Metropolitan painting, two noble ladies are shown in a magnificent chariot, notably without curtains, following behind a nobleman’s chariot, going on an outing. They are escorted by young maids on horseback and musicians, and are watched by groups of men and women on the streets (Fig. 322). A young lady worships in a Buddhist temple, accompanied by her maidservant; in the meantime, a young man peeps at her from behind a pillar. A male servant (possibly of the young man) turns and looks at her; three monks also stop working to gaze at her (Fig.
Together, all these elements create a scene that suggests a possible romance between the young lady and young man. In addition, within the city, more women appear on the streets. Two walk casually, escorted by their maidservants; they probably are gentry women or courtesans (Fig. 324). Three are peddlers (only one appears in the Zhao Zhe version) who operate small businesses (Fig. 325), and several female acrobats put on an energetic performance (Fig. 326). One woman is an active practitioner of vernacular religion: seen in a religious procession, she carries the statue of a god (Fig. 327). In the courtesan’s quarter, some female musicians perform for a man, several women dine with a man, and others play football with some young men (Fig. 328, Fig. 329, Fig. 330).

The Metropolitan version painter pictured a world with more images of women that were in conflict with the orthodox Confucian ideology that the Qing government strongly promoted. Eighteenth-century China has been known for the rise of Confucian ritualism and conservative ethics as a reaction against the late Ming Neo-Confucian movement. Many Qing scholars, like the previous moral crusaders of the Ming dynasty, issued didactic books for women, such as Chen Hongmou’s 陳宏謀, Bequeathed Guidelines for Instructing Women (Jiaonü yigui 教女遺規), Lan Dingyuan’s 藍鼎元 Women’s Learning (Nüxue 女學) and Huang Liuhong’s 黃六鴻 A Complete Book Concerning Happiness and Benevolence (Fuhui quanshu 福惠全書). The Qing government and Confucian scholars advocated familistic moralism, and encouraged women’s domestic productivity in areas such as weaving and embroidery, even as they discouraged women from traveling outside the home especially to visit temples.

---

405 Ibid., 22.
406 Ibid., 21, 29, 143-77.
407 Ibid., 21, 29, 194-96.
Under the circumstances, many eighteenth-century erudite elite women embraced the imperial discourse on women. Many of their writings reveal that they positioned themselves as the guardians of Confucian morals, and they engaged in literary learning or composed poetry only after completing their domestic work, which was considered a woman's virtue.

However, several phenomena relating to women’s outings indicate the gap between the ideals upheld by the elite and what was really happening in the society that inspired the Metropolitan Qingming painter. After stating that, “a woman’s proper ritual place is to be sequestered in the inner apartment. When at rest, she should let the screen fall [in front of her]; when abroad, she must cover her face to distance herself from any suspicion or doubt and prevent herself from coming under observation,” the eighteenth-century moral advocate Chen Hongmou complained of what he found in the Yangzi delta area:

[Y]oung women accustomed to wandering about, all made up, heads bare and faces exposed, and not a care in the world! Some climb into their palanquins and go traveling in the mountains. Some ascend to pavilions and gaze at the evening moon. In the most extreme cases, we find them traveling around visiting temples, monasteries…. The monks and the priest entertain them cordially; evil youth encircle the place. And their husbands and relatives think nothing of it!

Then he sighed, “This is a real blight on the reputation of the local community!”

These scholar officials considered women’s outings and pilgrimages as perverse opportunities for dalliance and the practice of orgies, and thus, troubling signs of disorder

---

408 Ibid., 44, 218.
409 For examples of women giving higher priority to domestic work than to literary engagement, see ibid., 65, 112, 114. For women’s work as a measure of moral worth, see ibid., 77, 143-45, 158-59.
410 Chen Hongmou, “Some Comments on Local Customs,” in Huangchao jingshi wenbian 皇朝經世文編, ed. He Changling 賀長齡 (1826; reprint, Taipei: Guofeng chuban she, 1963), juan 68, 5b, cited by ibid., 195-96. Mann also mentioned other officials’ similar concerns, such as Huang Liuhong and Lan Dingyuan.
411 Ibid., 196.
and declining moral standards. Yet, women’s outings and pilgrimages that offered them opportunities to interact with men and monks was happening at the time and is exactly what was depicted in the Metropolitan version.

Many Qing scholars’ notes also reported that women of lower classes worked or were active in the public arena. The sangu liupo were still popular occupations among female commoners and they were still active in the eighteenth century. Confucian scholars continued to hold a negative view of women’s public activities. For example, Zhu Bolu 朱柏廬 (1627-1698) in his publication, much read throughout the Qing dynasty, *Maxims on How to Manage a Household* (*Zhijia geyan* 治家格言) warned that sangu liupo are paths to crime.\(^{412}\) Records also show that during the Ming and Qing dynasties many women were not only followers but also were energetic leaders in popular beliefs,\(^{413}\) but this image did not appear in the *Qingming* paintings until the Metropolitan version. Though not all of the sangu liupo were depicted, the appearance of more female peddlers and the committed religious petitioner in the Metropolitan *Qingming* was indicative of the acceptance of popular occupations for common-class women among the *Qingming* painters and viewers.

In the eighteenth century many lower-class women also worked as acrobatic performers. Though the Qing government tried to ban public acrobatic performances, these were still presented throughout the country.\(^{414}\) According to late Ming-early Qing scholar Peng Shiwang’s 彭士望 (1610-1683) description of an acrobatic performance in Hunan in 1678, the show was staged by an itinerant acrobatic troupe consisting of a large extended family—including old and middle-aged women and young girls. The leader of the troupe claimed that their family had been acrobats for three generations.\(^{415}\)

---


\(^{413}\) Ibid., 38-41; Feng and Chang, *Qingren shehui shenghuo* 清人社會生活, 82-83.

\(^{414}\) Feng and Chang, *Qingren shehui shenghuo* 清人社會生活, 311-12.

\(^{415}\) Peng Shiwang 彭士望, “Jiuniu ba guan jiaodi 九牛壘觀角抵,” in *Yuchu xinzhi* 虞初新志, ed.
young girls of the troupe almost certainly would have continued the family business for years to come. Eighteenth-century scholar Zhu Lian 諸聯 also reported that a skillful female acrobat was good not only at performing with ropes but also could foot-juggle two huge earthen jars, to the surprise of the audience.\textsuperscript{416} The Metropolitan \textit{Qingming} painter included more of these awesome contemporary performances by female acrobats than any earlier painter, as emblems of a prosperous age.\textsuperscript{417}

Though the Qing government’s policy of suppressing the pleasure business discouraged the development of a more refined courtesan culture in the Qing dynasty, this resulted in the relegation of courtesans’ status in the Qing as compared with their counterparts in the Ming. The courtesan or prostitute industry prospered again following the economic affluence of the eighteenth century, and in the lower Yangzi river area it even developed to a greater scale than in the late Ming.\textsuperscript{418} There were still courtesans who attracted literati customers with their talents and aesthetic cultivation,\textsuperscript{419} but many eighteenth-century documents show that brothels resorted to sensual stimuli to attract customers, such as audio and visual entertainment and sexual services. Their banquets, frolics, and outings with customers created many scenes of noise and excitement that were recorded in notes about courtesan culture.\textsuperscript{420} The pleasure quarter in the Metropolitan version presented literally such a scene.
In the Metropolitan Qingming, men are still more evident in public places and many women still play traditional roles. However, by depicting more women enjoying excursions and working on the streets, and by picturing the interaction and open frolicking between men and women, the painters of the Metropolitan version demonstrated a world with more images that were contrary to the upper-class gentry’s ideology but in accord with what was really happening in the eighteenth century.

The repeated images, modified motifs, and new depictions of women show that although the earlier Qingming painters pictured an ideal society consisting of women following the norms of Confucian ideology, the later Qingming painters and viewers gradually accepted more contemporary phenomena of women’s behavior. Women’s new images were even favored, in violation of conventional concepts of separate spheres that moral crusaders—mainly officials and upper level gentry—advocated: women walk out of domestic spaces, interact with men, offer various services and/or even enjoy themselves in public.

2.2.6. Secularizing Religious Life

In this section, I will explore the themes of religion in the Qingming paintings, especially Buddhism and folk religions. The theme of Buddhism appears in all the six Qingming: some similar images of temples and monks continued throughout the paintings, while new Buddhist-related images were developed in later Qingming. Folk religions were included only in the even later Taipei B and Metropolitan versions. The images of Buddhism and folk religions disclose that people gradually appreciated more secularized religions, which offered practical rewards instead of spiritual enlightenment in a Qingming world. This becomes even more obvious in the later versions (see table 6).
2.2.6.1. Buddhism: From Offering Spiritual Support to Practical Rewards

The most popular religion in the world of the Qingming is Buddhism, as its related images appear repeatedly in the paintings, evidence of the pervasiveness of Buddhism among people of all social classes in the Ming-Qing period. I will show that sometimes these images of Buddhism were endowed with a quiet, otherworldly aura, but more commonly with a secularized atmosphere. I will further demonstrate that these reveal Qingming viewers’ increasing preference for the Buddhism that offered more practical rewards instead of (or in addition to) spiritual support.

Both the Ming and Qing governments recognized Buddhism as one of the orthodox religions and set up bureaucratic systems to manage Buddhist issues. In the Ming dynasty, even though the Hongwu Emperor prohibited the founding and registering of new Buddhist temples, Buddhism enjoyed court patronage to varying degrees throughout most of the Ming period. The religion also benefited from the tremendous patronage of literati lay believers, especially the late Ming to early Qing, from about 1550 to 1700, which was also the most active temple building period in Chinese history.

The gentry’s patronage started to decline in the eighteenth century due to the rise of orthodox Confucianism; they allocated more resources to sponsor infrastructure favorable

422 For the Hongwu Emperor’s prohibition of founding or registering new Buddhist temples, see Minglu jijie fuli 明律集解附例 [The Ming Code annotated with appended precedents] (reprint, 1908), juan 4, 7a-b, cited by Brook, Praying for Power: Buddhism and the Formation of Gentry Society in Late-Ming China (Cambridge: Council on East Asian Studies, Harvard University and Harvard-Yenching Institute, 1993), 161. Small and private chapels were exempt from the regulations with the exception of temples founded with the emperor’s authorization. For court patronage of the Ming dynasty, see Marsha Weidner, Latter Days of the Law: Images of Chinese Buddhism, 850-1850 (Lawrence: Spencer Museum of Art, University of Kansas, and Hawaii: University of Hawaii Press, 1994), 51-62; also see Yu Chun-fang “Ming Buddhism,” in Twitchett and Mote, The Ming Dynasty, 1368-1644, Part 2, vol. 8 of The Cambridge History of China, 897.
423 For a survey of the gentry’s active patronage period see Brook, Praying for Power: Buddhism and the Formation of Gentry Society in Late-Ming China, 181-83. For a survey of the active temple building period in Fujian, Zhejiang, Anhui, Hunan and Guangdong provinces without attention to the gentry’s involvement, see Wolfram Eberhard, “Temple-building Activities in Medieval and Modern China—An Experimental Study,” Monumenta Serica 23 (1964): 264-318, cited by ibid., 182-83. Brook and Eberhard’s findings are similar.
to state concerns, such as schools and orphanages. Yet, Buddhism was still the most popular religion among the elite families. In the eighteenth century, the Qing imperial family’s patronage of temples was strong, which can be attested to by the funds for renovations to many Jiangnan temples that were granted by the Kangxi and Qianlong Emperors while on their southern tours. Buddhism remained popular among the commoners throughout the Ming and Qing dynasties, since many Ming-Qing scholars, such as seventeenth-century Zhang Dai and eighteenth-century Chen Hongmo, mentioned or complained of the commingling of men and women when they visited temples. Under the circumstances, in their time the Qingming painters must have been stimulated by the popularity of Buddhism and the strong sponsorship of its temples to create and repeat the many images related to the Buddhism.

The otherworldly aspects of Buddhism appear in three of the six Qingming: the earlier Zhao Zhe (Lineage I) and Liaoning B (Lineage II) paintings, and the later Metropolitan scroll. In both the Zhao Zhe and Metropolitan Qingming, there is one Buddhist institution located in a mountain range without any trace of visitors, making it reminiscent of a monastery for self-cultivation (Fig. 331, Fig. 332). In the temple of Liaoning B, only two monks stand in front of a Buddhist statue with their palms together in prayer, likewise with no sign of lay members, giving it the look of a cloistered monastery (Fig. 333).

---

According to Brook’s study, the late Ming and early Qing upper elite favored and sponsored Buddhist temples outside of the cities or in the mountain areas. These were places for withdrawal from the challenges and responsibilities of daily life and to engage in cultural practices that elevated the spirit. Moreover, a temple was also a site where the gentry could quietly contest public authority and manifest their distinctive social status.\(^{427}\) The tranquil temples with no indication of activity that were depicted in the Zhao Zhe, Liaoning B, and Metropolitan versions represented the Buddhist temples sponsored by the Ming-Qing upper elite. As the *Qingming* artisan painters probably were not able to gain access to these temples, they could only represent the outer appearance and had to use their imaginations with regard to what the monks did there.

However, there are more themes that refer to secular aspects of Buddhism in the six *Qingming*. For example, lay believers pray for blessings in the temple, monks and literati socialize, monks solicit donations on the streets, and stores sell Buddhist merchandise. All the *Qingming* except for Liaoning B include pilgrims in the Buddhist temple, and there is a tendency for the number of visitors to increase in later versions. In one of the temples in the Zhao Zhe version of Lineage I, a female follower prays in front of a Buddhist statue (Fig. 288), while in Liaoning A three women appear as a monk greets a scholar outside the temple (Fig. 290, Fig. 334). In the much later Taipei A, in addition to two women, an elite family—a scholar official, his wife and son—arrive at a temple (Fig. 301). One man visits a Chan Buddhist temple (Fig. 335) in the Taipei B version of Lineage II, compared with the temple in Liaoning B where no trace of a visitor can be found. The temple in Taipei B is not a place for a monks’ self-cultivation, but a space for public worship. In the eighteenth-century Metropolitan version, as previously discussed, one of the temples even has become a site for watching women or possible

\(^{427}\) Brook, *Praying for Power: Buddhism and the Formation of Gentry Society in Late-Ming China*, 105-08, 125-26.
romance: a young man spies on a young lady at her worship, and the monks no longer pray but are as tempted as the young man, as they all stare at her as well (Fig. 323). In another temple in the Metropolitan version, a ceremony is underway: a large number of pilgrims appear there, including a few Confucian literati (in typical scholastic-style long robes) who follow monks performing a ritual, signaling its popularity (Fig. 336). From the earlier to the later Qingming, the number of pilgrims to Buddhist temples increases and activity in temples changes from quiet prayer to socializing, looking at women, or noisy ceremonies, demonstrating that the Qingming painters increasingly accepted a type of secularized Buddhism that was more relevant to people’s practical needs.

Qingming painters were inspired by the phenomena and practices of Buddhists in their times to design the above images. In the Ming-Qing dynasties, among temple visitors, women made up the majority of pilgrims, according to many records that reported crowds of women in temples during festivals as well as the concern felt by conservative scholars about women’s passion for visiting temples. In addition to female commoners, many elite families (men and women alike) were also devoted Buddhists and even influenced their families to patronize temples or associate with monks. For example, the late Ming-early Qing writer Zhang Dai recalled that his mother was a pious devotee. He and his family sponsored and visited Buddhist temples frequently, one of which was his visit to the Gaoli temple in Hangzhou with his wife. The difference between the temple scenes in the Zhao Zhe, the Liaoning A, and the Taipei A Qingming corresponded to developments in the late Ming and early Qing society and give us an artistic representation of the increasing number of women who visited temples. In addition, the Liaoning A painter depicted a monk greeting a scholar.

---

428 For example, in the above mentioned Zhang Dai’s and Chen Hongmou’s records, and Songjiang fuzhi 松江府志 (Zhengde qian nian keben, 1512), juan 4, 3a, and Yinxian zhi 鄞縣志 (Qianlong wushisan nian keben, 1788), juan 1, 18b, and juan 11, 23b, 24b, cited by ibid., 190.

429 Ibid., 42-43.
outside the temple, suggesting that the sight of literati associating with monks was commonplace (Fig. 334). The later Taipei A painter was impressed by the appearance of an entire gentry family at a Buddhist temple. Accordingly, along with copying earlier images of the female Buddhists, he included an elite and his family among the pilgrims (Fig. 301).

Furthermore, in Ming-Qing China, Buddhist religious activities and rituals dominated not only commoners’ but also elites’ lives. Early Qing Suzhou scholar You Tong 夤侗 remarked, “supplicating the Buddha to gain good fortune is a matter for ignorant men and women, whereas studying Buddhism in order to understand birth and death is the approach of the gentry,” observing that it was a very common practice among ordinary people to pray for good fortune when they visited temples or attended Buddhist observances. However, You Tong’s claim concerning the gentry was hardly in keeping with actual custom. Like the commoners, it was popular among many Ming-Qing elites to participate in Buddhist activities. According to Brook’s research, they also went to Buddhist temples for divination, to supplicate the Buddha for good fortune, and to take part in ceremonies conducted by monks. The Buddhist ceremony in the Metropolitan version accords with the practices for the purpose of gaining blessings in a temple where commoners as well as elites are in attendance.

The scene discussed earlier of the young man and monks watching the female pilgrim at the temple (Metropolitan version) was considered a troubling sign of social disorder by many orthodox scholar officials. Yet, this was a common phenomenon in

---

430 Yu Tong’s comments were included in his memorial to the Shunzhi Emperor in 1661, see Huayi shanzhi 華陰山志 (Tongzhi si nian keben, 1865), juan 17, 2b, cited by ibid., 97-98.
431 Brook gives some examples of the activities of the gentry in a temple and the Buddhist rites they attended, such as Xu Hongzu 徐宏祖 asking for divination, Jiao Hong’s grandfather taking him and his cousins to a temple on New Years day to make offerings, and the common practice of the gentry arranging Buddhist funerals for deceased family members. Xu Hongzu, Xu Xiake youji 徐霞客遊記 (1642; reprint, Shanghai: Shanghai guji chuban she, 1980), 167, 531, and Jinling fancha zhi 金陵梵剎志 (Wanli wushisan nian keben, 1607), juan 27, 6b, cited by ibid., 97-99.
reality and a familiar episode that led to romances and affairs in popular dramas and fiction of the late Ming and early Qing.432

The inclusion of pilgrims’ practices and behaviors in temples demonstrates that the Qingming painters created these images from various aspects of their life experiences. It also shows that the Qingming painters and patrons, especially of the even later versions, had very different views of an ideal world from that of conservative Confucian scholars.

All the Qingming include another obvious secularized aspect of Buddhism—the images of monks begging alms on the streets. Each of the six paintings features a monk who wears a hat in the shape of a pagoda and asks for donations, evidently to build or to renovate a pagoda (Fig. 337, Fig. 338, Fig. 339, Fig. 340, Fig. 341, Fig. 342). In addition, all the Lineage I Qingming include another fundraising scene, a monk with a group of laymen begging alms for constructing or refurbishing a temple complex, indicated by the poster of a temple compound that one of them holds behind a kneeling monk (Fig. 343, Fig. 344, Fig. 345, Fig. 346). The images of monks who use interesting props relating to the reason they are raising funds, which even attracts the attention of children as if they were watching a street show, gives these portrayals of Buddhism a very secular face. In the late Ming, upper class patrons of Buddhism like Yuan Hongdao considered the sight of monks soliciting funds on the street to be distasteful, probably because the public display of want is similar to what a beggar does—a lower class form of asking for charity. The great Buddhist figures of the late Ming such as Zhuhong 袾宏 also considered begging in public spaces to be undignified, and preferred to see monks’ needs met in an

432 Some examples of this theme in drama and fiction: in the Romance of the Western Chamber (Xixiang ji), Zhang Gong 張珙 met and pursued Cui Yingying 崔鶯鶯 in a temple; in Su Xiaomei sannan xinlang 蘇小妹三難新郎, Qin Guan 秦觀 waited for Su Xiaomei 蘇小妹 and flirted with her in a temple, though it is a Daoist temple; and in the Dream of the Red Chamber, a young man from the rich Li family took a fancy to Jin Ge 金哥 when he found her worshipping in a temple. Wang Jide 王驥德, Guben xixiang ji 古本西廂記 (Ming Wanli sishiyi nian xiangxue ju keben 明萬曆四十一年香雪居刻本), 2-3; “Su Xiaomei sannan xinlang 蘇小妹三難新郎,” in Feng, Xingshi hengyan 醒世恆言, juan 11, 145-146; Cao, Honglou meng 紅樓夢, 15th hui, 97.
institutional context rather than by door-to-door begging.\textsuperscript{433} However, the concerns and distress felt by these eminent figures suggest that it was common for monks to beg for food or donations in public, which should have been acceptable to non-elites, especially urban merchants. In Ming-Qing China, the writings of social elites and gazetteers concerning renowned Buddhist temples rarely mentioned other classes of people such as merchants in the lists of donors. However, documents depicting the activities of Huizhou merchants and several records of the Ming-Qing period reveal a few cases of merchants who sponsored Buddhist temples. These records also disclose that merchants tended to patronize temples located near major markets or along commercial routes, rather than those at far-away sites that represented the ideal of withdrawal. Their patronage to urban temples should have been beneficial to their trade, since Ming-Qing markets and fairs commonly developed in or near temple compounds on main transportation routes.\textsuperscript{434} The monks in the \textit{Qingming} paintings are probably raising funds from urban merchants and residents for the temple or pagoda near the city. Thus, the painters who included monks soliciting donations on the streets in a \textit{Qingming} world reflected a view that differs greatly from the values of the upper elite, but accords with perceptions of merchants and urban residents. The motif of monks fundraising remained throughout the sixteenth- to eighteenth-century \textit{Qingming}, which indicates that viewers welcomed these images, as for them it was, in all probability, a symbol of thriving business in a prosperous city.

Another secular theme related to the image of Buddhism is stores that sell Buddhist merchandise. The Liaoning A painter added a store dealing in Buddhist statues; the small size of the statues reveals that they are meant for the home worship practices of lay Buddhist believers (Fig. 347). A store selling incense and candles is found in the


\textsuperscript{434} Ibid., 217-22.
Metropolitan version; the store’s location near the entrance of the popular temple, where a ceremony is being conducted, assures its success and prosperity (Fig. 348). In the Ming-Qing period, Buddhism remained popular with the public and experienced resurgence among the literati. This phenomenon presumably boosted the profits of businesses related to Buddhism, and in turn inspired the Liaoning A and the Metropolitan version painters to create innovative stores selling Buddhist-related commodities to lay believers.

The above shows that some *Qingming* painters, such as the creators of the Zhao Zhe, Liaoning B and Metropolitan versions, presented both the otherworldly and secular sides of Buddhist temples. However, most of the later *Qingming* painters and patrons appreciated the increasing popularity and the social side of Buddhism and its temples, such as pilgrimages, fundraising, gatherings, attractive women, ceremonies, and stores selling Buddhist merchandise. These scenes show that *Qingming* viewers more and more favored secularized Buddhism, which offered practical solutions and offered good fortune and happiness, and allowed them to receive these benefits easily and quickly.

### 2.2.6.2. Folk Religions: Their Benefits through Ritual Practices

In addition to the Buddhist subjects, the Taipei B and Metropolitan version painters also depicted folk religions. I will show that these were new motifs derived from Ming-Qing popular religions, which emphasized the benefits that people could acquire through ritual practices.

In addition to the Chan Buddhist temple, three temples of folk religions were added to Taipei B. One was the Temple of the Dragon King of the Bian River in the Eastern Capital (*Dongjing bianhe longwang miao* 東京汴河龍王廟), another was the Temple of the Earth God of the Rainbow Bridge (*Hongqiao tudi ci* 虹橋土地祠), and the

---

435 For the organization of lay associations among the gentry class, see ibid., 103-07.
third, in the same compound as the Earth God of the Rainbow Bridge, was the Temple of the Earth and Grain Gods (Tugu shen 土穀神) (Fig. 349, Fig. 350, Fig. 351). 436 The tablet of the Temple of the Earth God of the Rainbow Bridge includes the term chifeng 敕封, “appointed under the imperial order,” and the term chijian 敕建, “built under the imperial order,” is part of the sign of the Earth and Grain Gods temple. This terminology shows that these were temples of officially approved folk beliefs. 437

The Earth God, the Grain God and the Dragon King of the temples depicted in Taipei B were very popular deities in imperial China. Ancient China was predominantly an agricultural country, and for this reason as far back as the Three Dynasties period (Xia, Shang and Zhou, c. 2100-221 BCE), from the imperial court to every small village, the Chinese were already worshipping gods of the earth and grains in order to ensure plentiful harvests. 438 During the Ming and Qing periods, the government mandated that earth and grain temples should be set up in the capital as well as in every prefecture, sub-prefecture and county. The Ming government even commanded that every village should dedicate a shrine to these deities. 439 Though the banner of the Dragon King temple in the painting does not include the words chifeng or chijian, this should also be

436 The last character on the sign of the temple to the Dragon King of Bian River in the Eastern Capital is not clear. It is either shen 神, god or miao 廟, temple. However, it is clear that this is a temple to the Dragon King.

437 “[Earth] God of the Rainbow Bridge Appointed under the Imperial Order” [chifeng hongqiao zhi shen 敕封虹橋之神] and “Temple of Earth and Grain Gods Built under the Imperial Order” [chijian tugu shenci 敕建土穀神祠]. The second character on the tablet to the Earth God of the Rainbow Bridge temple is not distinct, but the first character is clearly chi 敕, which means “under the imperial order.” According to the practices of the Ming and Qing dynasties, the court showed official recognition by conferring a title on temples of local deities. Normally the term for the official appointment is chifeng 敕封 or chiming 敕命, which would be added to the tablet of the deity.

438 Wang, Zhongguo zongjiao shi 中國宗教史, 99-100.

an officially recognized temple, since the Dragon King was the river god who controlled
the rainfall essential to agriculture, and sacrifices to him were included in state worship
ceremonies. In Ming-Qing period, there were Dragon King temples in almost every city
and county of the Suzhou area and it was common practice for local officials to pray to
the Dragon King for rainfall whenever there was a drought.\textsuperscript{440} The temples to the Earth
and Grain Gods and the Dragon King were prevalent landmarks in the cities, towns and
villages of Ming-Qing China, thus were included in the world of the \textit{Qingming} scroll. For
the viewers, these were temples that offered practical aid through the rituals performed
for an abundant harvest. In order to create the images of folk religion temples, the Taipei
B painter probably referred to texts about the life and scenery in the eastern capital of the
Northern Song dynasty, Kaifeng, and the inscriptions on the Beijing scroll, in addition to
having familiarity with the practices of popular religions in the Lower Yangzi. The
emphasis on the Dragon King temple of the “Bian River of the eastern capital”—the river
near Kaifeng—and the Earth God temple of the “Rainbow Bridge”—the famous bridge
that arched across the Bian River—show that the painter wanted the viewer to consider
this \textit{Qingming} scroll to be the legendary Song version. His knowledge about the Northern
Song capital and the Beijing scroll may have also come from the book about life in
Kaifeng, \textit{A Record of the Eastern Capital: Like Dreaming of Hua}, and the inscriptions on
the Beijing scroll published in the late Ming. However, without seeing the temples in
Kaifeng, the Taipei B painter used the folk religion temples in the Lower Yangzi to
construct the imaginary landmarks of the long-gone glorious city of Kaifeng.\textsuperscript{441}

\textsuperscript{440} Some examples of Dragon King temples in the Suzhou area include the Lingji temple (靈濟廟) for the Yangshan White Dragon God (\textit{yangshan bailong shen} 陽山白龍神) in Changzhou county, the Huanling temple (煥靈廟) for the Dingshan White Dragon God (\textit{dingshan bailong shen} 頂山白龍神) in Changshou, the Shunji Dragon King temple (\textit{shunji longwang miao} 順濟龍王廟) in Wujian, and the Ludu Dragon King temples (\textit{ludu longwang miao} 瀘瀆龍王廟) in Kunshan and Jiading. Wang, “Sidian sisi yu yinsi: Mingqing yilai suzhou diqu minjian xinyang kaocha 祀典、私祀與淫祀: 明清以來蘇州地區民間信仰考察,” 52.

\textsuperscript{441} There are no records of temples of the Earth God, the Grain God or the Dragon King in the
Inspired by other popular cults in the Lower Yangzi, the Metropolitan Qingming painter also created two images of folk religion in his painting. In the outskirts of town, one shaman sits in front of an improvised altar and is worshipped by several believers (Fig. 352). On the banks of a canal outside the city gate, a procession bears a statue of a folk deity in a sedan chair. Among the followers in the procession, some put their palms together and some hold small statues of deities, signifying their piety (Fig. 353). Folk religions were unsophisticated and disorganized, and thus lacked literary or cultural richness and emphasized practical rewards to followers. Although these religions attracted many believers, orthodox Confucian scholars of the Ming and Qing dynasties despised their practice. While the Ming and Qing governments incorporated certain folk religions that helped to solidify the regime and stabilize society into the system of state worship, most of the popular cults were considered to be unorthodox or have evil beliefs. Their practices were prohibited, and Ming-Qing officials frequently ordered that their temples be destroyed. Yet, studies show that such folk beliefs prevailed and prospered as ever, which was also the case of these faiths in the Ming-Qing Yangzi delta area.

Dongjing menghua lu or in the inscriptions on the Beijing scroll. The Taipei B painter pictured several images illustrating objects mentioned in the Dongjing menghua lu and scenes described in the inscriptions. In addition to the Bian River and the Rainbow Bridge in Dongjing menghua lu, juan 1, the Taipei B painter also referred to juan 6, xue liu雪柳 (paper flowers), and juan 7, Zitui swallow (zituiyan 子推燕, a steamed cake in the shape of a swallow to commemorate Zitui 子推), with regard to the Qingming festival, as well as the Peony Pavilion (mudan ting 牡丹亭) of the imperial garden, in order to design the stores selling merchandise (indicated by their banners only) and a pavilion with the sign mudan ting. In addition to Yang Zhun’s words “bianjing shengshi weiguan” [汴京盛時偉觀] to design a bridge with the sign “The Bridge of Tianjin” (Tianjin zhi qiao 天津之橋). He also referred to Li Dongyang’s expressions “yiban weiyu, wu lunxiang er luye” [以板為輿, 無輪箱而陸曳] in Li’s second inscription to denote the image of a woman with her son on a board tugged by a man. However, the painters used figures, architecture, and objects of the Ming dynasty to design these images. Meng, Dongjing menghua lu 東京夢華録, juan 1: 1-2, juan 6: 19, 21, & juan 7: 23, 25. For Yang Zhun’s colophon, see Ying, Shiqu baoji sanbian 石渠寶笈三編, 187-89; Whitfield, “Chang Tse-tuan’s Ch’ing-ming Shang-ho T’u,” 164-165. For Li Dongyang’s inscription, see Ying, Shiqu baoji sanbian 石渠寶笈三編, 190-92; Whitfield, “Chang Tse-tuan’s Ch’ing-ming Shang-ho T’u,” 171.

For the increasing number of folk religions in the Suzhou area that were included in the state worship system in the Ming-Qing period, see Wang, “Sidian sisi yu yinsi: Mingqing yilai suzhou diqu minjian xinyang kaocha” 祀典、私祀與淫祀: 明清以來蘇州地區民間信仰考, 1-2. For destruction of temples of folk religions by Ming-Qing officials in Jiangnan, and the survival and prosperity of these...
the Metropolitan Qingming painter again presented a totally different view of a great age than that of orthodox Confucian scholars by including such unorthodox religious practices in the Qingming scroll.

In terms of the representation of beliefs, the Qingming painters copied and modified earlier images and also designed new patterns. They repeated or made variations on earlier images such as the mountain temple and women visiting the temple as well as monks begging for donations. They also captured various aspects of contemporary religious culture such as temple visits by the elite, practitioners of a folk religion praying to a shaman, and the procession of pilgrims with a deity statue. They referred to the accounts in ancient historical records, but used the temples of their day to portray the images of folk religion temples near the Bian River and Rainbow Bridge. These depictions show that all of the six Qingming depict more scenes of earthly, mundane life than of lofty spiritual issues. Even so, the earlier paintings still conform to government mandate and include only those religions that had governmental approval, whereas the eighteenth-century Metropolitan version includes those that were officially condemned as evil beliefs, but were welcomed by the public. Nevertheless, these religion-related images in the Qingming show that the patrons of the paintings gradually began to favor the more secularized religious practices that promised worldly benefits, such as a plentiful harvest or good fortune.

2.2.7. Celebrating a Great Age: Entertainment and Leisure Activities

I will now explore how the Qingming painters used contemporary entertainment such as drama, storytelling, and acrobatic performances; and recreational activities such as horse riding, cockfights, and kicking footballs as well as other motifs drawn from their

---

life experiences, to create the celebratory and joyful atmosphere of the *Qingming* scrolls. In contrast, these qualities are only rarely found in the eleventh-century Zhang Zeduan original *Qingming* painting. In this way, *Qingming* painters and patrons portrayed the ways they celebrated the thriving economy of their age through the activities they enjoyed in their lives.

Furthermore, I will demonstrate that among the popular *Qingming* scrolls, the later painters added even more exciting motifs of entertainment and leisure activities (for more details of these amusements, see table 7). From these additions we can determine that people more and more considered entertainment and leisure activities as essential to a prosperous age.

### 2.2.7.1. Entertainment

Drama became a very popular form of entertainment during the Ming-Qing period. Though dramatic performances were popular from the early Ming, they were not included in the *Qingming* scrolls until the early seventeenth-century versions, and then were copied in later versions. In the Liaoning A, Taipei A, and Metropolitan versions, a theatrical troupe performs in an open theater. Though *Qingming* painters copied the schema of a dramatic performance in an open-air theater, they added new content and varied the old patterns. In Liaoning A, the boy and adult on the stage of the open-air theater have white-painted faces, and play the roles of a clown, *chou* 丑, and a forceful character, *jing* 淨. Their relationship is probably that of a boy servant and his master—a member of the gentry, indicated by his long robe, high square cap, and fan. This elite is likely the rich but evil and slippery Sun Ruquan 孫汝權 from *The Tale of the Wooden Hairpin* (Jinchai ji 荊釵記). In order to force Qian Yulian 錢玉蓮—the wife of scholar-official Wang Shipeng 王十朋—to marry him, he conspired to change the content of a letter from Wang Shipeng to his family, altering it from news about receiving
a zhuangyuan 状元 degree to a letter divorcing his wife (Fig. 90).\textsuperscript{443} Behind the backdrop curtains, an official wearing black gauze hat stands at the left exit, and a female character at the right exit. These probably represent Wang Shipeng, who went to the capital to take the civil examination and later received his zhuangyuan degree, and his wife Qian Yulian, who had to remain behind in his hometown.

In the Taipei B version, the plan of the open air theater remains but the theme of the drama changes: a man playing a military role meets the female lead, suggesting a performance of the secret meeting between Lü Bu 呂布 and Diaochan 貂蟬, a well-known scene of the \textit{Tale of Connecting Plots} (\textit{Lianhuan ji} 連環記), inspired by the famous novel \textit{Romance of the Three Kingdoms}. The actor playing Diaochan’s husband, the powerful warlord Dong Zuo 董卓, stands behind the backdrop curtain waiting to perform the next scene in which he discovers the affair, and outraged, tries to kill Lu Bu by throwing a halberd at him (Fig. 295).\textsuperscript{444}

The Metropolitan painter also changed the theme of the dramatic scene and presented another popular Ming-Qing program, \textit{Going to an Appointment with a Saber} (\textit{Dandao hui} 單刀會): the dark red-faced military character with a long weapon is Guangong 關公—one of the heroes of the \textit{Romance of the Three Kingdoms}—holding his green-dragon, crescent moon-shaped saber. He holds the hand of the official Lu Su 魯肅.\textsuperscript{445} This is the moment when Guangong pretends to be half-drunk and takes Lu Su as

\textsuperscript{443} Ke Danqiu 柯丹邱, \textit{Wang Shipeng jingchai ji 王十朋荆釵記}, in vol. 9 of \textit{Quan yuan xiqu 全元戏曲}, ed. Wang Jisi 王季思 (Beijing: Renmin wenxue chuban she, 1999), 263-265; also see Ke Danqiu 柯丹邱, \textit{Jingchai ji pingzhu 荊釵記評注}, in vol. 2 of \textit{Liushi zhoung qu pingzhu 六十種曲評注}, annot. Yao Yuguang 姚玉光 and Bai Xiuqin 白秀芹 (Changchun: Jilin renmin, 2001), 190-95. The strong character of Sun Ruquan was portrayed as a jing. From the Song and Jin dynasties to the Yuan and Ming dynasties, jing and chou characters commonly wore white make-up with black lines that emphasized the eyebrows and eyes. Liao Ben 廖弁, “Mingdai xiqu shi 明代戲曲史,” in \textit{Zhongguo yishu shi, xiqu juan 中國藝術史, 戲曲卷}, ed. Shi Zhongwen 史仲文 (Shijia zhuang: Hebei renmin chuban she, 2006), 203, 347, 623.

\textsuperscript{444} \textit{Lianhuan ji} 連環計 (Chaoben 鈔本, n.d.), 34-35; \textit{Jinyun tang anding lianhuan ji 錦雲堂暗定連環計}, in vol. 6 of \textit{Quan yuan xiqu 全元戏曲}, ed. Wang Jisi 王季思 (Beijing: Renmin wenxue chuban she, 1999), 587.

\textsuperscript{445} For Guangong’s red facial make-up see the partial collection of make-up of Ming and Qing
a hostage to the riverside where his boat is docked, in order to escape an ambush at the banquet arranged by Lu Su—another famous plot inspired by the popular Romance of the Three Kingdoms (Fig. 354).446

The three dramas The Tale of the Wooden Hairpin, Tale of Connecting Plots and Going to an Appointment with a Saber were all well liked from the Ming to the Qing dynasties.447 Judging by their modifications to the theme, the Qingming painters probably selected the play that they liked most and included it in the ideal worlds that they constructed.

The Qingming painters included several storytelling performance techniques such as tanci 弹词, daoqing 道情, and pinghua 評話 in the scrolls based on their life experiences. Most of these types of presentation were repeated in the Qingming paintings, indicative of their great popularity.

Tanci was a way of telling stories through narration and singing. According to the writings of Ming-Qing scholars, tanci performers played the pipa for accompaniment and many of the performers were women or blind people.448 In five of the six selected Qingming—the Zhao Zhe, Liaoning A, Taipei A, Taipei B and Metropolitan versions—there are performances by courtesans in their houses and/or by singing girls on the streets accompanied by pipa (Fig. 291, Fig. 303, Fig. 330, Fig. 134, Fig. 135, Fig. 136,
Fig. 137, Fig. 319). They may be simply singing songs or just playing music, but it is more likely that they are performing the famed tanci that became popular in the Yangzi delta from the Ming to the Qing dynasties.\(^{449}\) In addition, in three of the above five Qingming with female tanci performers—the Zhao Zhe, Taipei A, and Metropolitan versions—a blind musician carries a pipa on his back, and is probably also a tanci performer (Fig. 355, Fig. 356, Fig. 357). Qingming painters copied the motif of tanci performances repeatedly, indicating the popularity of this entertainment.

In the Tang and Song dynasties, in daoqing (Daoist sentiments) performance, the performer narrated Daoist stories. However, by the Ming-Qing era in the Lower Yangzi region this became a popular means for telling and singing secular stories accompanied by yugu 漁鼓—a drum made out of a bamboo tube and the membrane of a pig’s intestines—and jianban 簡板—a percussion instrument made from two bamboo strips. These are exactly the same instruments used by the performers portrayed in the Qingming scrolls.\(^{450}\) The daoqing performance appeared in the Zhao Zhe, and was copied in the Taipei A and Metropolitan versions (Fig. 358, Fig. 359, Fig. 360), also indicating its popularity.

Another widespread type of performance in the Lower Yangzi of the period was pinghua—storytelling. Several late Ming and early Qing scholars such as Zhang Dai and Yu Huai recorded the great fame and brilliant performances of Jiangnan storyteller Liu Jingting 柳敬亭, showing the prevalence of this entertainment.\(^{451}\) The Liaoning A

\(^{449}\) Yang, Zhongguo su wenxue 中國俗文學, Ju zhongguo youyi yanjiu 附中國遊藝研究, 107; Feng and Chang, Qingren shehui shenghuo 清人社會生活, 267.

\(^{450}\) For the popularity of this type of performance, see Xu Ke 徐珂, Qingbi leichao 清裨類鈔, vol. 10, 4939, cited by Feng and Chang, Qingren shehui shenghuo 清人社會生活, 266. For yugu and jianban musical instruments, see Xue Zongming 薛宗明, Zhongguo yinyue shi: yueqi pian 中國音樂史: 樂器篇, vol. 1 (Taipei: Taiwan shangwu yinshu guan, 1983), 66-67, 270.

\(^{451}\) Zhang, Taoan mengyi 陶庵夢憶, Juan 5, 67; Yu Huai 余懷, Banzhao zaji (Shanghai: Shanghai guji chuban she, 2000), xiajuan, yi shi 軟事, 62, cited by Chen, Mingdai shehui shenghuo shi 明代社會生活史, 585-86; Feng and Chang, Qingren shehui shenghuo 清人社會生活, 267. In addition to Liu Jingting, Zhang Dai also mentioned another famous Nanjing storyteller, Wang Yuesheng 王月生.
painter replaced the *daoqing* performer depicted in the Zhao Zhe version with a *pinghua* storyteller (Fig. 361, Fig. 358). He or his patrons probably preferred *pinghua* to *daoqing* performance, and therefore modified the older illustration to meet the new demand. A *pinghua* storyteller also appears in the Beijing scroll—one of the rare entertainments depicted in the painting (Fig. 362). The storyteller of Ming-Qing times usually held a ruler or fan while performing;\(^{452}\) the Beijing scroll storyteller holds a ruler, while in Liaoning A he holds a folding fan. Since folding fans did not become popular among ordinary people until the Ming dynasty, the folding fan held by the storyteller in Liaoning A indicates that the painter was inspired by contemporary storytellers and current fashions, and modified the existing image of the *daoqing* performer to create the performance he or his patron favored in the world of the *Qingming*.

Acrobatics were also popular with the public, especially during festivals and at temple fairs. For example, Tian Ruchen mentioned that during the *Qingming* festival around West Lake, people could find all kinds of acrobatic performances.\(^{453}\) The late Ming scholar Wang Zhideng noted the acrobatics in the processions of temple fairs in the Suzhou area.\(^{454}\)

Acrobatic performances are recorded as early as in the Han dynasty, and many ancient styles were still popular or developed new formats in the Ming-Qing period. I will show that the *Qingming* painters included many of old favorites as well as novel developments of the time in *Qingming* scrolls, and there is a tendency for the number of acrobatic performances to increase in the later versions.

For example, tightrope walking was popular from the Han throughout the following dynasties and was one of the most documented and predominant acrobatic

\(^{452}\) Chen, *Mingdai shehui shenghuo shi* 明代社會生活史, 585-86; Feng and Chang, *Qingren shehui shenghuo* 清人社會生活, 267.

\(^{453}\) Tian, *Xihu youlan zhiyu* 西湖遊覽志餘, juan 20, 215.

\(^{454}\) Wang, *Wushe bian* 吳社編, 8a.
performances in the Ming-Qing period. The Taipei A and Metropolitan version painters were aware its prevalence and put it in the Qingming scrolls (Fig. 304, Fig. 363).

Another acrobat performs hand juggling with cymbals, a newly developed trick in the Ming dynasty that was recorded in many writings from the sixteenth to the eighteenth century. Cymbals were originally musical instruments used in Daoist services, and many Ming-Qing Daoist priests were good at juggling them. The cymbal juggler with a shaven head in the Zhao Zhe, Liaoning A, Taipei A and Metropolitan Qingming seems to be a monk rather than a priest (Fig. 364, Fig. 365, Fig. 366, Fig. 367). Though it was not recorded in written texts, some itinerant monks probably juggled with cymbals for a living in Ming-Qing times, consequently Qingming painters created and retained the motif of the juggling monk in the late sixteenth- to eighteenth-century Lineage I paintings. In addition, in Taipei A the painter added a popular variation—foot juggling a jar. Some writings in the Southern Song dynasty reported public performances of foot juggling a jar, but in the Ming dynasty a great variety of footwork developed, involving all kinds of props such as wheels, humans, poles, and even acrobatics on poles, as portrayed in Xianzong Emperor Enjoying His Leisure (Xianzong xingle tu). Thus, foot

This performance was recorded in the Han dynasty, Cai Zhi 蔡質, Hanguan dianzhi 漢官典職; Tang dynasty, Zhang Chujin 張楚金, Louxia guan shengji fu 楼下觀繩技賦; and Song dynasty, Dongjing Menghualu, cited by Fu Tianzheng 傅天正. Xu Zhuang 徐莊, and Fu Tenglong 傅騰龍, “Handai zajishi 漢代雜技史,” in Zhongguo yishu shi, zaji juan 中國藝術史，雜技卷, ed. Shi Zhongwen 史仲文, 102; Fu Tianzheng 傅天正, Xu Zhuang 徐莊, and Fu Qifeng 傅起風, “Suitang wudai zajishi 隋唐五代雜技史,” in Zhongguo yishu shi, zaji juan 中國藝術史, 雜技卷, ed. Shi Zhongwen 史仲文, 230; Fu and Xu, “Songliaojin zajishi 宋遼金雜技史,” in Zhongguo yishu shi, zaji juan 中國藝術史, 雜技卷, ed. Shi Zhongwen 史仲文, 333. It was documented in many Ming-Qing writings, too, such as Tian, Xihu youlan zhiyu 西湖遊覽志餘, juan 20, 215; Wang, Washe bian 吳社編, 8a; Li, Yangzhou huafang lu 揚州畫舫錄, juan 11, 153; also see Fu, Deng, and Xu, “Yuanming zajishi 元明雜技史,” 418, 420; Fu, Xu, and Xu, “Qingdei zajishi 清代雜技史,” in Zhongguo yishu shi, zaji juan 中國藝術史, 雜技卷, ed. Shi Zhongwen 史仲文, 486-87.

For example, Tian Rucheng’s Xihu youlan zhiyu 西湖遊覽志餘, juan 20, 215, and Li Shengzhen’s Baisi zhu ci 百戲枝詞, cited in Fu Qifeng 傅起風 and Fu Tenglong 傅騰龍, Zhongguo zajishi 中國雜技史 (Shanghai: Shanghai renmin, 1989), 258, 303-04; Fu, Deng, and Xu, “Yuanming zajishi 元明雜技史,” 426. Such as Wu Zimu 吳自牧, Mengliang lu 夢粱錄, juan 20, 126.
juggling a jar also developed into a public performance requiring a great deal of skill. For example, one illustration in the Ming novel *The Romanic Story of Emperor Suiyang* (*Suiyang yanshi* 隋煬豔史) shows a foot juggler controlling a huge jar with a person crouching inside, on top of which another person stands on one foot and plays a flute.\(^{458}\) According to written records, in the Qing dynasty even more types of objects and jars were used in foot juggling.\(^{459}\) Among the six *Qingming*, only the Taipei A painter recorded this innovative foot juggling and included it in the painting. The performer not only foot juggles a jar but also beats a gong and is probably also sings or speaks at the same time; this was not documented in any written texts (Fig. 368).\(^{460}\)

The painter of the Metropolitan version included even more new features of acrobatics of the Ming-Qing period, such as acrobats on poles, female equestrians, and another entertainment, the magic show. Magic shows had previously appeared in the Han dynasty, yet, the type of magic show called *tongzi* 筒子 was a new amusement developed in the Ming dynasty and still popular in the Qing (Fig. 369). At the beginning of the show, the magician showed his audience hollow, empty tubes; Ming magicians used three tubes while Qing magicians used two tubes (shown in the Metropolitan version). After slipping one tube into the other several times, the magician then pulled many kinds of objects such as food, animals, or jars out of the tubes to the surprise of the audience.\(^{461}\)

---

\(^{458}\) Fu, Deng, and Xu, “Yuanming zaji shi 元明雜技史,” 427; Fu, Xu, and Xu, “Qingdai zaji shi 清代雜技史,” 500-01; Fu and Fu, *Zhongguo zaji shi 中國雜技史*, 276, 281.


\(^{460}\) The jar that the acrobat uses is a *beng* 鬃, a jar with small mouth, which was not recorded as being used in juggling until the eighteenth century by scholar Zhu Lian in *Mingzhai xiaoshi*, in which he described how a female acrobat foot juggled two *beng* jars, cited by Yang, *Zhongguo su wenxue 中國俗文學, fu zhongguo youyi yanjiu 附中國遊藝研究*, 156; Fu, Xu, and Xu, “Qingdai zaji shi 清代雜技史,” 501.

\(^{461}\) For the magic show in the Han dynasty, see Yang, *Zhongguo su wenxue 中國俗文學, fu zhongguo youyi yanjiu 附中國遊藝研究*, 158-60. The *tongzi* magic show in the Ming-Qing was recorded in Liu Tong and Yu Yizheng’s *Dijing jingwu lue, Pu Songling’s 蒲松齡, Liaozhai zhiyi 聊齋志異, and Xu
Acrobatic entertainment with a pole was popular in earlier dynasties, but in the Ming the focus of the performance became acrobatics “on” instead of “with” a pole. In the Han dynasty, performers jumped or hung onto poles that were attached to a moving cart. From the Six Dynasties (220-589) to the Tang, a performer often balanced a pole (or poles) on his hands or head to support several people. From the Ming dynasty to the early Qing, pole acrobatics emphasized the drama of an acrobats’ performance. The Metropolitan painter presented one example of such an act: the acrobat hooks one foot around the pole to support his whole body high in the air, one of the postures documented in many Ming-Qing texts (Fig. 370).

According to Liu Tingji 劉廷璣 of the early Qing, equestrians had been popular since the Jin dynasty. Originally, it was a way to train cavalry soldiers and later this became a public acrobatic performance. Liu also noted that in his time, the seventeenth to eighteenth century, most of the equestrian performers were women. The Metropolitan version painter portrayed three female acrobatic performances: one woman stands on a running horse, another transfers to the side of her running horse by holding its mane, and yet another does headstands on the third running horse. These tricks were the standard...
format of many performances documented in many late Ming- to early-Qing writings (Fig. 371).^465

2.2.7.2. Leisure activities

In addition to various shows, leisure activities presented in the Qingming paintings were also inspired by other diverse and fashionable recreational activities of the Ming-Qing period. According to Shen Defu, since the late Jiajing the world had been at peace; the gentry started to construct private gardens and instructed girls in singing and dancing for pleasure, at the same time began collecting antiques; then rich merchants began to follow suit. All these activities mentioned by Shen Defu were pictured in most of the popular Qingming paintings. The painters all depicted the private gardens of the gentry and show them engaged in various activities (Fig. 372, Fig. 373, Fig. 374, Fig. 375, Fig. 376, Fig. 377). All the Qingming except for Liaoning B include motifs of the gentry enjoying singing and dancing performances (Fig. 277, Fig. 378, Fig. 379, Fig. 380, Fig. 381). As for antiques, all the six Qingming include the motif of an antique shop or peddler, as has been discussed earlier. Most of the painters shared similar observations as Shen Defu regarding what the gentry and rich people liked to do in their free time and included these in the prosperous age they constructed.

Based upon Zhang Chou’s complaints regarding the decline of public morality in his time, we learn that in addition to the above leisure activities most people were fond of riding, cockfights, throwing arrows into a jar, kicking footballs, throwing dice—wumu (for gambling), playing board games—liubo (also sometimes played for gambling), playing flutes and composing songs (enjoying music); indeed he gave seven examples of

^465 Liu and Yu, Dijing jingwu lüe 帝京景物略, juan 2, 36; Zhang, Taoan mengyi 陶庵夢憶, 47; also see Fu, Deng, and Xu, “Yuanming zaji shi 元明雜技史,” 411, 427.
these typical recreational pursuits.\textsuperscript{466} What Zhang Chou considered to be the most popular leisure activities of his time, were more or less covered by these six \emph{Qingming}. In the Lineage I scrolls, the sixteenth-century Zhao Zhe included three of the seven examples mentioned by Zhang Chou: riding, kicking a football, and enjoying music (Fig. 382, Fig. 383, Fig. 277). The seventeenth-century Liaoning A and Taipei A included four activities: riding, kicking a football, enjoying music, and playing a board game (Fig. 384, Fig. 385, Fig. 378, Fig. 386, Fig. 387, Fig. 388, Fig. 379, Fig. 389). The earlier Liaoning B of the Lineage II did not include any, while the later Taipei B included three pastimes: a board game, enjoying music, and throwing dice (Fig. 310, Fig. 381, Fig. 390). The eighteenth-century Metropolitan \emph{Qingming} painter included six amusements, that is, all those mentioned by Zhang Chou except for throwing dice (Fig. 391, Fig. 392, Fig. 380, Fig. 320, Fig. 393, Fig. 394).

The above analysis illustrates that \emph{Qingming} painters designed these entertaining motifs based upon their life experiences during the Ming-Qing period. Many of them were repeated among the \emph{Qingming} indicating their popularity. However, inspired by the development of new amusements in their times, novel designs were continuously added. In addition, these examples show that the later \emph{Qingming} painters considered trivial and mundane pleasures to be more and more important to leading a good life in a great age. In other words, to celebrate a great age, the \emph{Qingming} viewers gradually accepted and even supported the idea that it was proper to enjoy entertainment, leisure activities and all types of pleasure without hesitation or confusion.

My comparisons of the compositions and the motifs found in the \emph{Qingming} paintings has revealed what the painters of the popular versions accomplished: they

\textsuperscript{466} Zhang Chou wanted to distinguish himself as a person with a lofty mind and elegant taste, and so he inscribed complaints about the activities of vulgar people on the painting \emph{Xianshan louge} 仙山樓閣. In his inscription of 1606, he stated, “人間世所尚走馬鬭雞投壺蹋踘五木六博吹簫度曲等伎……” Zhang, \emph{Qinghe shuhua fang} 清河書畫舫, \textit{juan} 12, \textit{shang}, 391.
followed a certain structure and then added motifs; using their creative, artistic abilities, they reconstructed and modified elements from the original; added new motifs inspired by their and their patrons’ life experiences; and created distinctive Qingming paintings that depicted their own visions of an ideal society. The improvisational mode of executing Qingming paintings directly reminds us of Baxandall’s notion that painters who have been traditionally considered copiers were active agents through their choice-making process; they reworked earlier painters’ material to produce unique “new” paintings in their own right.

The above examination also testifies that only by looking at these paintings through the theory of intertextuality can we then map the production mode of Qingming shengshi. Similarly created through a mosaic of quotations, this discourse of a great age absorbed and transformed other texts and the texts of the author and reader, as well as blended with earlier or contemporary cultural contexts. That is, the painters not only adopted but also edited and transformed previous themes and added new schemas to the paintings in order to suit their contemporary value system. The shared and different motifs in the Qingming paintings show that to Qingming painters and viewers an ideal society was a combination of various levels of traditions as well as contemporary practices. According to the motifs in terms of geographic and temporal features, social relationships, urban economy, material life, social structure, religions and entertainment, all the painters of the popular versions of Qingming set the background of a great age in the springtime of the Lower Yangzi, where the climate is mild and plants grow exuberantly, and where the landscape is gentle and full of waterways. With a social structure similar to that of the Ming-Qing, male heirs are favored, males are the major figures in the public areas, and harmonious relationships including the closeness of family life are emphasized. The ideal life in the city is depicted on a varying economic scales; the city is mostly shown as well managed by the government and includes the
abundant local goods and services of the Lower Yangzi, whereas the countryside is portrayed as a conventional idyllic atmosphere.

The six *Qingming* painters present very different views about an ideal world as shown by the various motifs depicted. Among them, the world in Liaoning B is the most modest, while the worlds in the Taipei A and Metropolitan versions are the most prosperous and festive. In between are the Zhao Zhe, Liaoning A and Taipei B versions, in order of their increasing prosperity.

Liaoning B of the early seventeenth-century displays a quiet small town atmosphere. People ride and dress modestly according to the Ming state dress codes and have less entertainment available than those in other *Qingming* scrolls. Most of the women stay indoors and are separated from men. This painting also features the more spiritual side of the Buddhism and a limited amount of luxury goods available for consumption.

The Zhao Zhe version of the late sixteenth-century presents a world with an atmosphere of a middle-sized city. People in the city mostly live and behave in ways that comply with official ideology, for example, the transportation and clothing of the elite are mostly in accord with the state code, and gentry women stay indoors and do domestic work. With some luxuries and entertainment, but low-key religious practices, people live a pleasant and orderly life, though it may be less colorful and diverse than the real urban life of the late sixteenth century.

The Liaoning A version of the early seventeenth-century portrays a world with the atmosphere of an orderly metropolitan city. People of this world still use transportation according to the official codes and dress modestly. However, they live a bit more lavishly than those in the Zhao Zhe version. For example, the entertainment that rich people enjoy includes the services of courtesans and more antiques are available on the street. In addition, people enjoy more entertaining activities than those in the Zhao Zhe version.
such as drama; and more women leave their inner chambers, for example to visit the Buddhist temple, which features a social instead of a spiritual atmosphere.

The Taipei B version suggests the atmosphere of a metropolitan city. This is a world of extravagance and delight. A scholar official is shown using a yellow canopy, supposedly restricted to the use of the imperial family, for outings. People enjoy fashionable clothes and exotic goods from far-away provinces and further abroad. They also enjoy much more entertainment and leisure activities than those in Liaoning B of the same lineage. More women enjoy the freedom of going out, visiting the temple, and mingling with men as well as joining in leisure activities with them such as board games. Additionally, people lead a more secularized religious life that emphasizes practical rewards.

Taipei A of the mid-seventeenth century shows a world with a brisk yet relaxed atmosphere of a middle-sized city. People live and dress extravagantly; some officials have luxurious canopies for outings and many people’s flamboyant outfits violate the seventeenth-century state code. They enjoy more luxuries including imported goods, enjoy more amusements in public areas, and even military inspections have become a form of entertainment. More women in this world are seen out in public areas, visiting the temple, and enjoying activities that used to belong in the domain of men, such as reading books and playing the zither, and actively interact with men. Moreover, the Buddhist temple in this world is depicted as a place to pray for worldly rewards. This world is very similar to the urban life of the seventeenth-century Lower Yangzi.

The Metropolitan version presents a more festive metropolitan atmosphere. It features a busy city full of mundane pleasures including more acrobatic performances and leisure activities than those in the earlier *Qingming* paintings. People live in a lavish way, for example, using a splendid sedan and canopy for outings that violate the state code of the Ming-Qing period. In addition, this world features a more secularized side of religion:
there are more people visiting Buddhist temples, making these temples a bustling site of social activities and even romance, and there are more people engaged in the practice of folk religion. Women lead active social lives in their domestic domain, such as holding a dinner party, and they are also active in public areas, such as being religious practitioners, skillfully performing acrobatics, visiting temples, and frolicking with men. This world also features a powerful military force under effective management, which is demonstrated by a well-organized and energetic military display, probably inspired by the united and mighty Qing Empire of the eighteenth century. However, there is an obvious nostalgia for the Ming Empire in this world that is testified to by the images of people wearing Ming-style outfits and the appearance of the term “Nanjing,” a reference to the “southern capital” of the Ming dynasty.

In short, views of an ideal world changed from the time of the earlier to the later *Qingming* painters, from a lesser to a greater degree of a prosperous urban economy, conspicuous consumption, images of unconventional women, intimate family relationships, secularized religious life, and celebratory atmosphere, though they all are based on the same representation of idyllic village life in the spring of the Lower Yangzi, a patriarchal social structure, and the Ming-Qing political system. In addition, many of the changes relate closely to the social changes and the temporal concerns of the Ming-Qing period. They show that in the extraordinary socio-economic transformations of Ming-Qing China, people’s utopian views featured a dynamic conjunction of conventions and new fashions. Supported by Kristeva’s notion that intertextual citations are always absorbed and transformed according to different cultural contexts, these various visual texts of the *Qingming* paintings are improvisational artworks that reveal the transformation of an ideal world and people’s changing values over time.
Chapter 3. Responding to *Qingming shanghe tu*

The above analysis of visual texts that were both interrelated and quoted shows how, at the same time, they were shifting, exchanging and transforming constantly. In addition, in this chapter, based on the inscriptions on or comments (written texts) about the *Qingming* paintings by viewers, I will further demonstrate that people of different backgrounds, times, and places had diverse responses and readings towards the *Qingming* paintings.

Many Ming-Qing viewers inscribed or commented on the popular *Qingming* paintings as a painting of a great age, but the *Qingming* scrolls that they viewed have mostly either been lost or can no longer be identified. The only *Qingming* paintings that have survived with commentaries by known viewers that relate them to a great age are the Zhao Zhe version, with Wan Shide’s inscription and Wang Shizhen’s poems, and the Taipei A, with a colophon by Prince Bao.\(^\text{467}\) I will explore these viewer’s backgrounds, their responses, and the circumstances under which they inscribed the paintings in order to understand what the *Qingming shanghe tu* meant to them. I will show that because of their varying circumstances, these social elites responded to the *Qingming* paintings differently. Both Wan Shide and Wang Shizhen agreed that the subject of Zhao Zhe’s painting was a prosperous age, and both were motivated to imagine a more luxurious, ...
affluent image of an ideal world. In addition, Wan Shide used the Zhao Zhe painting to
 glorify a victory and to compare his time to a great age. Wang Shizhen responded to the
 same painting with a sentiment on the rise and fall of a great age. Prince Bao recognized
 the Taipei A as a painting that depicted the prosperity of the Northern Song, but he
 disagreed with the extravagant lifestyle shown in the painting. He used this scroll as a
 reminder to caution against the decadence in a great age and to demonstrate his capability
 and wisdom as an emperor-to-be.

 These viewers’ different reactions are examples of patrons’ opinions that possibly
 in turn provided sources for the Qingming painters to further create various new versions
 of a great age. That is, non-elite viewers such as the rising merchant-class of different
 backgrounds, who most likely made up the majority of the Qingming patrons, did not put
 their responses in writing. Nonetheless, their diverse views, responses, or reactions must
 have made a great impact on the creation of new Qingming paintings.

 3.1. Wan Shide: Glamorizing the Gold Terrace and a Shengshi

 Wan Shide (1547-1602) inscribed the Zhao Zhe version in 1599 when he was the
 supreme commander of the Sino-Korean troops. He had a rather successful career in
 officialdom, was extremely social, and had several hobbies, which shows that he was a
 person who enjoyed a varied and successful life. He came from a family with a long
 military tradition and grew up in the Pian Pass (Pianguan 偏關), along the Great Wall in
 Shanxi province, at the front line of the Ming Empire’s defense system against the
 Mongols to the north. Growing up on the frontier, he mastered riding and archery at a
 very young age.468 While still in his teens, Wan Shide served in the military police at a
 military post on the frontier with the job of capturing lawbreakers, but left after being

 468 Tu Long 屠隆, “Dasima wangong zhuan 大司馬萬公傳,” in Pianguan zhi 偏關志, ed. Lu
 Chengye 盧承業 and Ma Zhenwen 馬振文 (repr., Taipei: Chengwen chuban she, 1967), 224-25.
insulted and reprimanded by his superior. Afterwards, he was determined to devote himself to furthering his education.\(^{469}\) He passed the highest level of civil service examination as *jinshi* in his mid-twenties.\(^{470}\) In terms of literature, he favored the Qin-Han dynasty essays and prose poems as well as Tang poetry, and he also composed poems.\(^{471}\) In addition, he studied geomancy\(^{472}\) and played the board game *tanqi* 弹棋 as well as musical instruments such as the drum, *pipa* and *zhu* 筑 zither.\(^{473}\) Further, he collected paintings,\(^{474}\) loved singing, composed songs,\(^{475}\) and appreciated drama;\(^{476}\) and was not only adept with traditional weaponry such as the spear and archery, but also a newly invented armament—firearms.\(^{477}\) He loved good food, wine, and parties,\(^{478}\) and kept a large circle of friends including cultural elites such as Wang Shizhen 王世贞.

---

\(^{469}\) Wang Kechang 王克昌 and Yin Menggao 殷夢高, in vol. 2 of *Baode zhouzhi* 保德州志 (repr., Taipei: Chengwen chuban she, 1976), 435.

\(^{470}\) Tu, “Dasima wangong zhuan 大司马萬公傳,” 226; Chen Yidian 陳懿典, *Chen xueshi xiansheng chuji 陳學士先生初集, juan 13*, 238.

\(^{471}\) Tu Long mentioned Wan Shide favored Qin-Han dynasty essays; Tu, “Dasima wangong zhuan 大司馬萬公傳,” 226. Chen Yidian and Tu Long wrote that Wan Shide’s poem collections include *Shuzhong gao 稗中稿*, *Huangzhong gao 黃中稿*, *Saixia qu 塞下曲*, *Yanshang gao 燕上稿*, *Xijin gao 楚津稿*, and *Haishang gao 海上稿*. Chen, *Chen xueshi xiansheng chuji 陳學士先生初集, juan 13*, 242; Tu, “Dasima wangong zhuan 大司马萬公傳,” 236. Chen Yidian also recorded the friendship between Wan Shide and other Ming poets, in Chen, *Chen xueshi xiansheng chuji 陳學士先生初集, juan 12*, 225. The only extant collection of Wan Shide’s poems that I found is *Ni saixia qu 威塞下曲*. Wan Shide 萬世德, *Ni saixia qu 威塞下曲* (1591; Taipei: Guoli zhongyang tushu guan suoying shi), microfilm. He supported the publication of Tang dynasty poems, *Pidian tangshi zhengsheng 批點唐詩正聲* compiled by Gao Bing 高棟 with Gui Tianxiang 桂天祥 comments, and with his own proofreading and correcting. Gao Bing 高棟 and Gui Tianxiang 桂天祥, *Pidian tangshi zhengsheng 批點唐詩正聲* (Jiajing keben 嘉靖刻本; Taipei: Guoli zhongyang tushu guan suoying shi), microfilm.

\(^{473}\) Chen, *Chen xueshi xiansheng chuji 陳學士先生初集, juan 13*, 241.

\(^{474}\) Ibid., 241; Tu, “Dasima wangong zhuan 大司马萬公傳,” 235.

\(^{475}\) Li Zuoxian 李佐賢, *Shuhua jianying 書畫鑒影*, *juan 5*, 67. Though Wan Shide is not a very well-known collector, in addition to the Zhao Zhe *Qingming* painting, a bamboo scroll attributed to Wu Zhen 吳鎮 was once collected by Wan Shide, as shown by his two seals on the painting.


Wang Daokun, Wang Daokun, 479  Xin Tong, Xin Tong, 480  Hu Yinglin, Hu Yinglin, 481  Tu Long, Tu Long, 482  Wang Zhideng, Wang Zhideng, 483  and Tang Xianju, Tang Xianju. 484 He was considered a generous man and helped to support dismissed officials and unemployed scholars—such as Tu Long and Ding Cü —and recruited many of them for his staff. 485 People with diverse political positions and personalities favored him, such as Shen Yiguan of the later Zhe faction, and Zuo Yuanbiao of the later Donglin faction. 486 He first served as a county magistrate after he obtained his jinshi degree, but eventually again became involved in military affairs. 487 He experienced several battles against the Mongols before he was appointed as the commander of troops assisting the Chosun dynasty’s (Korea) defense against the Japanese invasion. He was promoted to the

479 Chen, Chen xueshi xiansheng chuji 陳學士先生初集, juan 12, 225.
480 Ibid.; Chen Tian 陳田, Mingshi jishi 明詩紀事, gengqian 庚籤, juan 7, shang, 1380, and juan 29, 1614.
481 Chen, Chen xueshi xiansheng chuji 陳學士先生初集, juan 12, 225; Hu Yinglin 胡應麟, Shaoshi shanfang ji 少室山房集, juan 62, 378, juan 63, 383, juan 67, 417, juan 87, 480-482, and juan 117, 708-09.
482 Chen, Chen xueshi xiansheng chuji 陳學士先生初集, juan 12, 225; Tu Long 屠隆, Qizhen guan 棲真館集, juan 18, 213-14; Tu, Dasima wangong zhuan 大司馬萬公傳,” 223, 235-36.
483 Chen, Chen xueshi xiansheng chuji 陳學士先生初集, juan 12, 225; Wang Baigu 王百穀, Ming Wang Baigu shanyu yiqu ce 明王百穀山歡一曲冊, in Lu, Wayue suojian shuhua lu 吳越所見書畫錄, juan 4, 225.
484 Tang Xianzu 湯顯祖, Yuming tang quanji 玉茗堂全集, shiji, juan 4, 155, juan 17, 313, and juan 18, 319.
485 Chen, Chen xueshi xiansheng chuji 陳學士先生初集, juan 13, 241-42; Tu, “Dasima wangong zhuan 大司馬萬公傳,” 223, 235-36. These unemployed scholars were the so called shanren 山人.
486 Shen Yiguan 沈一貫, Jingshi cao 敬事草, juan 9, 174-75; Zou, Zou Zhongjie gong zoushu 鄭忠介公奏疏, juan 3, 48. During Wan Shide’s lifetime, the names of Zhe and Donglin factions were not yet in use (the Donglin Academy started in 1604). Shen Yiguan and Zou Yuanbiao had very different personalities and aligned with different groups in the power struggle in the court from the 1580s; the former was calculating in dealing with the Wanli Emperor and eunuchs, and the latter, straightforward in criticizing Wanli and the eunuchs and insistent on moral issues. For Shen Yiguan, see Ray Huang, “The Lung-ch’ing and Wan-li reigns, 1567-1620,” in The Ming Dynasty, 1368-1644, Part 1, vol. 7 of The Cambridge History of China, eds. Frederick W. Mote and Denis Twitchett (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988), 531-32, 541, 547. For Zou Yuanbiao, see Willard Peterson, “Confucian Learning in Late Ming Thought,” in Twitchett and Mote, The Ming Dynasty, 1368-1644, Part 2, vol. 8 of The Cambridge History of China, 758-59; Ray Huang, 1587, A Year of No Significance: The Ming Dynasty in Decline (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1981), 59, 63. For the Donglin Academy and partisan controversies, see Huang, “The Lung-ch’ing and Wan-li reigns, 1567-1620,” 532-550.
487 Tu, “Dasima wangong zhuan 大司馬萬公傳,” 226-28; Chen, Chen xueshi xiansheng chuji 陳學士先生初集, juan 13, 238.
Vice Minister of War before he passed away. Though not without attracting some criticism, his contemporaries largely recognized him as a capable man, competent in both civil and military matters (wenwu shuangquan 文武雙全).\textsuperscript{488} which was rather difficult to accomplish in the environment of sophisticated cultural practices and complicated court politics of the late Ming.

In 1599, Wan Shide added an inscription of Luo Binwang’s long poem \textit{The Imperial Capital} to the Zhao Zhe scroll. After the poem he wrote a note declaring that the theme of the \textit{Qingming} painting was an “urban great age,” and remarked on the similarity among the popular \textit{Qingming} paintings. Then, he continued,

I manage Chosun, after Japan has been defeated. And now, after the rain with its coolness, I inscribe the poem \textit{The Imperial Capital} on the painting, which can further glamorize the scale of the gold terrace.\textsuperscript{489} [With the peace and prosperity in the painting], why should I care about the clumsy and crude quality of the painting! Wanli yihai year [1599], summer, wang [fifteenth] day of June, Yunzhong [now Shanxi], Wan Shide, Boxiu [Wan Shide’s courtesy name], writes at Gongchen Hall of Wangjing [capital of Chosun] [Fig. 86].

\textsuperscript{488} There were many positive comments about Wan Shide from his contemporaries, for example, Shen Shixing 中時行, \textit{Lunfei jiandu} 綸扉簡牘, juan 3, 86, Shen, \textit{Wanli yehuo bian} 萬曆野獲編, juan 17, 324, and juan 22, 418, Zou, \textit{Zou Zhongjie gong zoushu} 都忠介公奏疏, juan 3, 48, and Cheng Kaidu 程開祜, \textit{Chouliao shuhua} 筹遼碩畫 (Minguo guoli beiping tushu guan shanben congshu jingming wanli ben 民國國立北平圖書館善本叢書景明萬曆本), juan 18, 418. Tang Zhaojing 湯兆京 recognized Wan Shide as a capable man but charged that he used his talents to engage in wrongdoing, such as taking credit that did not belong to him, seizing every opportunity to make money, and appointing subordinates who were not qualified; see Tang Zhaojing 湯兆京, \textit{“Lichen jiuyu qingyi bianchen xumao tiangong qici ba chi yi shen quanheng yi ning jiangyu shu”} 禮臣久于清議邊臣虛冒天功乞賜罷斥以慎銓衡以寧疆域疏, in \textit{Wanli shuchao} 萬曆疏鈔, ed. Wu Liang 吳亮, juan 19, 654-655. Korean records about Wan Shide were rather negative. He was described as a greedy person: he accepted and asked for gifts and allowed his son and subordinates to ask for gifts, see Li Guangtao 李光濤, ed., \textit{Chaoxian renchen wohuo shiliao} 朝鮮壬辰倭禍史料, vol. 4 (Taipei: The Institute of History and Philology of Academia Sinica, 1970), 1396, 1448, 1511-12, and 1580. He impressed Koreans as a gentle and quiet person, but was not able to strictly discipline his army, see ibid., 1402, 1448, 1497, and 1516. In addition, he was criticized as a man who looked kind and mild but was insincere and made no attempt to accomplish anything; e.g. he promised the Chosun court to file a memorial on false allegations about Chosun made to the Ming Emperor, but did not do it and he delayed responding to many Chosun court reports, see ibid., 1448, 1497.

\textsuperscript{489} The allusion to the “gold terrace” will be explored later.
Thus, the inscription was written when Wan Shide was stationed at Seoul after the Sino-Japanese war that lasted for seven years (1592-1598). In this conflict, the Japanese Taiko Toyotomi Hideyoshi (1537-1598) launched an invasion of Chosun in 1592, and under the request of the King of Chosun, the Wanli Emperor (1572-1620) sent troops to rescue the Chosun Kingdom. From 1593 to 1596, there was a truce to allow for negotiations, but in the end nothing was accomplished. Early in 1597, Hideyoshi ordered a second invasion. After several violent battles between the Sino-Korean and Japanese forces without a decisive victory, Wan Shide was appointed the supreme commander of the Sino-Korean troops in 1598. However, Wan Shide did not fight in any of the major battles of the war until the hostilities were nearly over. He was appointed as the supreme commander in June of the twenty-sixth year of Wanli’s reign (1598) when he was stationed in Tianjin, but he did not reach the battlefields until November when the Japanese troops started to retreat due to the death of Hideyoshi. He claimed that on his way to Seoul he encountered resistance from local tribes in Liaoyang, but his claim was criticized for his delayed arrival and considered to be an excuse by some officials. The war probably ended earlier than he expected, since he arrived in Korea quite late but still before the end of the war, and records showed that he sent a representative to negotiate with the Japanese leaders during the last battle. Though several accounts in
Ming texts stated that he was involved in planning or supervising the last attack, it is uncertain how much he was involved. Nevertheless, he was present in Chosun when the last major battle—the Battle of Noryang Strait 露梁海戦 (November 19 of twenty-sixth year of Wanli; 1598)—broke out, in which some of the major Japanese military leaders were killed or captured as they retreated. After the war, he was awarded and promoted for the “victory.” About two months before Wan Shide’s inscription, on April 25 of the twenty-seventh year of Wanli’s reign (1599), the emperor ascended the tower of the Meridian Gate to receive the surrender from the prisoners of war, which was a rather special act for Wanli, because he had rarely held court or appeared in public since 1586, showing that he was extremely pleased. The month before Wan Shide wrote his inscription, most of the Ming troops had retreated back to China, except for Wan Shide and twenty thousand Ming soldiers who were ordered to stay in Chosun for another two years to assist the defense of the kingdom. However, when most of the Ming troops were withdrawing, Wan Shide left Korea temporarily from April 4 (an intercalary month) to May 29, 1599 and returned to the Ming capital, Beijing.

Juan 239, 1711-12; Mao Ruizheng 茅瑞徵, Wanli sanda zheng kao 萬曆三大征考, 17.


Chen, Chen xueshi xiansheng chuji 陳學士先生初集, juan 13, 240; Tu, “Dasima wangong zhuan 大司馬萬公傳.” 233; Li, Chaoxian renchen wohuo shiliao 朝鮮壬辰倭禍史料, 4: 1394.

Chen, Chen xueshi xiansheng chuji 陳學士先生初集, juan 13, 240; Tu, “Dasima wangong zhuan 大司馬萬公傳.” 233; Li, Chaoxian renchen wohuo shiliao 朝鮮壬辰倭禍史料, 4: 1513.

Li, Chaoxian renchen wohuo shiliao 朝鮮壬辰倭禍史料, 4: 1510; Huang, “The Lung-ch’ing and Wan-li reigns, 1567-1620,” 517. Huang, 1587, A Year of No Significance: The Ming Dynasty in Decline, 47, 123. In 1586, the Wanli Emperor declared that he had suffered a blackout when rising early in the morning and therefore had to have his audience with the court and the study sessions suspended for an unspecified period of time. In 1588, Wanli made one more trip to inspect his own mausoleum. After 1588, he appeared only at victory celebrations held after successful military campaigns, and he remained in the Forbidden City for more than three decades until he died and was carried to his mausoleum for his permanent rest.

Chen, Chen xueshi xiansheng chuji 陳學士先生初集, juan 13, 240; Tu, “Dasima wangong zhuan 大司馬萬公傳.” 233; Shen, Xiangcun gao II 象村稿 II, juan 39, 27b.
to receive his awards. After he returned to Seoul and two weeks before he inscribed the painting, the King of Chosun very unusually went to Wan Shide’s residence and hosted a welcoming reception, to congratulate him on receiving rewards from the Wanli Emperor. Wan Shide’s feelings toward the great Ming Empire must have been intensified by these events, since he had just returned from Beijing where he experienced its magnificence and prosperity, was at that moment living in the capital of the tributary state Chosun and was honored by its king, and moreover, felt satisfaction in the peacefulness and security of the region under the protection of the Ming army.

His direct experience with the flourishing capital of Beijing and his understanding of the literature about the city apparently inspired him to draw on both the Zhao Zhe Qingming painting and Luo Binwang’s The Imperial Capital, which compliment each other well, to express his cheerfulness and sentiments. To Wan Shide, the “urban great peace” of the Zhao Zhe version of Qingming shanghe tu must have reminded him of the Beijing’s prosperity. His inscription of The Imperial Capital also reveals his fresh memory of the magnificent structures and enticements of the capital of the Ming Empire. As the Korean campaigns were fought on foreign soil, the marketplaces in Beijing that Wan Shide had just visited were, in contrast, that much more the model of a peaceful society and growing economy. Many Ming scholar officials wrote their memories about the impressive, thriving markets in Beijing, especially the chaqian shi 朝前市 (“court-front market”), located in front of the Imperial City (Huangcheng 皇城), that was open daily and the other three fairs that were held frequently—the lantern festival fair, the city-god temple fair and the imperial city fair. These marketplaces were

498 Li, Chaoxian renchen wohuo shiliao 朝鮮壬辰倭禍史料, 4: 1499, 1513. He probably attended the victory ceremony and celebrations.
499 Ibid., 1513.
500 Jiang Yikui 蔣一葵, Changan kehua 長安客話 (Beijing: Beijing guji chuban she, 1944) juan 1, 11, Liu Tong & Yu Yizheng, Dijing jingwu lue (Beijing: Beijing guji chuban she, 1980), juan 4, 161, Ye Quan 葉權, Xianbo bian 賢博編 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1987), 189, and Jiang Dejing 蔣德璟, You gongshi xiaoji 遊宮市小記, in Ming wenhai 明文海 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1987), juan 359, 6a,
stocked with all kinds of the necessities of daily life as well as luxury items, and thrived during the entire Wanli era. The chaoqian shi was the busiest commercial district in Beijing during the period.\(^{501}\) Even the lantern festival fair in mid-January, which was supposed to be open only during that particular festival, opened twice per month in the late Wanli age.\(^{502}\) The city-god temple fair, which extended for miles, often expanded, and was famous for its paintings and antique markets,\(^{503}\) opened three times a month during Wanli’s reign.\(^{504}\) Records show that when the city-god temple fair was opened, many officials visited after their office hours.\(^{505}\) The imperial city fair was not actually supposed to exist, as it was situated in the Imperial City where only the workshops and other services for the imperial family in the Forbidden City were to be located. However, merchants started businesses in the area, and Beijing residents shopped there anyway. Though some officials proposed closing it for safety reasons, the government did not prohibit residents from going there.\(^{506}\) During the reign of Wanli, this fair also opened three times a month,\(^{507}\) and especially featured high-end handcrafts and antiques as well as objects acquired from the imperial families and officials.\(^{508}\)

When Wan Shide temporarily returned to Beijing from Korea after the war, he had the chance to visit at least one of these markets and purchased, perhaps accidentally,
a painting like the *Qingming* scroll that was displayed in one of the variety shops or booths before he departed for Seoul again.\(^{509}\) This incident is not recorded in any document, but it was highly possible, since in his inscription he mentioned that he learned about the theme of *Qingming* from the professional painters who usually sold their paintings in the market. Nevertheless, when he visited Beijing, he passed the prosperous market *chaqian shi* on the way to his office, and the imperial city fair on his way to the court, both of which must have impressed him tremendously. Wan Shide must have been aware of the expansion of the markets from the time when he passed the metropolitan examination in 1571 to when he became a local official visiting the capital, reporting to the court at three-year intervals from 1571 to 1582, to when he was an official in the Ministry of War stationed at the capital from 1582 to 1586.\(^ {510}\) With the victory over the Japanese, and the thousands of miles he had traveled during military maneuvers, these even more prosperous market scenes must have meant something very different to him.

Since Wan Shide mentioned that the Zhao Zhe painting portrayed a city of harmony and wealth, he knew it was not necessarily a picture of the capital. As a northerner, the canals of the Lower Yangzi region depicted in the painting were strange to him, but the painting includes many scenes that were likely similar to his Beijing experiences and the life he enjoyed during peaceful times. For example, in the painting he

---

\(^{509}\) In his forty-four days of absence from Seoul, most of the time Wan Shide was on the road; he probably had a few days sojourn in Beijing. According to Ni Qian, it took him one month to arrive in Seoul from Beijing. Since Ni Qian stopped for receptions in many places on his way, Wan Shide’s journey must have been faster. Qian Ni 倪謙, *Chaoxian jishi* 朝鮮紀事 (Ming chaoben 明鈔本, c. 1449?), 1-3.

\(^{510}\) On Wan Shide receiving the *jinshi* degree, see Chen, *Chen xueshi xiansheng chuji* 陳學士先生初集, juan 13, 238; Tu, “Dasima wangong zhuan 大司馬萬公傳,” 226. For his appointment as a county magistrate, see Chen, *Chen xueshi xiansheng chuji* 陳學士先生初集, juan 13, 238; Tu, “Dasima wangong zhuan 大司馬萬公傳,” 226-28. He was promoted to secretary of a bureau in the Ministry of War (*Bingbu zhushi* 兵部主事) in the tenth year of the Wanli reign (1582), and then vice director of a bureau in the Ministry of War (*Bingbu yuanwailang* 兵部員外郎), and was promoted to assistant surveillance commissioner stationed at Xining of Shanxi (*Shanxi xining beibing qianshi* 陝西西寧備兵僉事) in the fourteenth year of the Wanli reign (1586) leaving the capital for Xining (now Xining in Qinghai), according to Chen, *Chen xueshi xiansheng chuji* 陳學士先生初集, juan 13, 238; Tu, “Dasima wangong zhuan 大司馬萬公傳,” 228.
could find the urban market with its bustling shoppers and various stores. These shops included those that sold necessities such as grains, an essential foodstuff for the army (Fig. 395), luxuries such as paintings that he personally appreciated (Fig. 195), and books that he, as a scholar official, published and purchased (Fig. 396).\textsuperscript{511} In addition, he could find a gathering of scholar officials in a grand mansion, enjoying dancing and musical performances including his favorite \textit{pipa} instrument (Fig. 277). There were also people riding horseback and practicing archery, both of which he had mastered (Fig. 382). Furthermore, in the painting, people from near and far all converge on the city, which was also his experience whenever he traveled to Beijing (Fig. 397).

In the poem \textit{The Imperial Capital}, Luo Binwang used the Han capital to represent that of the Tang, which probably inspired Wan Shide’s thoughts about the Ming first city. In the first two sections of the poem, the author elaborates on the superior geographical location of the capital, its magnificent palaces, splendid court events, activities held at the imperial lake, densely crisscrossing city streets, nobles and important officials’ grandiose residences, and the parties with good food, courtesans and performers. The third section describes the severe power struggles within the Han court and the rise and fall of its many famous figures, demonstrating the uncertainty of fortune. Luo Binwang closed the poem by observing that even talented men including Jia Yi 賈誼 had been affected by politics, and bemoaned that in the Tang dynasty he suffered just as Jia Yi had in the Han.\textsuperscript{512}

\textsuperscript{511} As mentioned above, according to Chen, \textit{Chen xueshi xiansheng chuji} 陳學士先生初集, \textit{juan} 13, 242, Wan Shide’s poetry collections include \textit{Shuzhong gao, Huangzhong gao, Saitia qu, Yanshang gao, Xijin gao} and \textit{Haishang gao}. In addition, he supported the publication of Tang dynasty poems, \textit{Pidian Tangshi zhengsheng}. 512 帝京篇

\begin{table}[h]
\centering
\begin{tabular}{|l|}
\hline

\textit{山河千里國，城闕九重門。不睹皇居壯，安知天子尊。}  
皇居帝裏鎖函穀， 鴻野龍山侯甸服。五緯連影集星躔，八水分流橫地軸。秦塞重闕一百二，漢家離宮三十六。  
桂殿陰岑對玉樓，椒房窈窕連金屋。三條九陌麗城隈，萬戶千門平旦開。複道斜通鳧鷖觀，交衢直指鳳凰台。  

\hline
\end{tabular}
\end{table}

\textit{(section 1)  
(section 2)  
剑履南宮入，簪纓北闕來。聲名冠寰宇，文物象昭回。鈎陳肅蘭囿，璧沼浮槐市。銅羽應風回，金
The magnificence of the palace, excitement of the capital, and pleasant life of the upper class described in first two sections of *The Imperial Capital* would have been familiar to Wan Shide in his position as a high-ranking official since these sights were also common in the Ming capital. As mentioned earlier, he visited Beijing from time to time, had a rather good relationship with other elites, and enjoyed parties. Many of these scenes also appeared in the Zhao Zhe scroll, such as the manors and parties of the elite as well as the exciting street life. However, there are scenes depicted in *The Imperial Capital* that Zhao Zhe did not include, such as the palace architecture, court events, and activities on the imperial lake. One of Wan Shide’s intentions for inscribing the poem was probably to supplement the scenes in the painting, since he added a comment in his colophon to explain why he included *The Imperial Capital*. He wanted to further glamorize the scale of the “gold terrace,” so that he could overlook the clumsiness and crudity of the painting.\textsuperscript{513} We can assume that Wan Shide thought Zhao Zhe’s painting...
did not fully illustrate the prosperous age of Wan’s experience and that he had in mind. Therefore, his view of a prosperous world featured a grander scene than Zhao Zhe’s painting, and he added the poem in order to improve and complement it.

Wan Shide also understood very well the third section of the poem that outlines political conflicts in the court and the rise and fall of a Han official. In the Ming court, the power struggles were just as severe as those depicted in the poem. For example, Wan Shide witnessed Grand Secretary Zhang Juzheng 張居正 acting very arrogantly during his lifetime and defeating many of his political opponents, but within five years of his sudden death in 1582, under the impeachment of his political opponents, Zhang Juzheng’s family was destroyed and their property confiscated.  Zhang Juzheng had once been a strong supporter of the powerful general Qi Jiguang 戚繼光, but after Zhang lost favor with the Wanli emperor, Qi Jiguang was deprived of his position in 1584 and died in miserable conditions in 1588. In addition, Wan Shide himself was impeached for his aggressively militant actions early in his career and was also criticized for supporting peaceful settlements later; he wrote about the dilemma of behaving properly.

Perhaps his joy over the results of the war brought back many feelings of his previous experiences and ideas. To Wan Shide, the victory and subsequent accord meant a lot to him, especially in terms of his belief in the purpose and necessity of war and the ideal of making peace. In the prologue to his poetry collection, The Imitation of Border Songs (Ni saixiqu 擬塞下曲), written in 1591 when the battles he had been heavily involved in against the Mongols finally came to an end, he made it very clear that he

---


514 Huang, 1587, A Year of No Significance: The Ming Dynasty in Decline, 14-47.

515 Ibid., 241, 246-47.

believed that waging war was not to exterminate the enemy but rather to procure peace. This was especially true when the empire’s military force was not absolutely sure to gain the upper hand and further military actions might bring down the empire. His belief developed out of his personal experiences and the lessons learned from history. Wan Shide was one of the few civil officials who experienced first-hand bloody killings in the battlefields. He was brought up in a family of long-standing military history; ever since the founding of the Ming dynasty, his family had been an army household. It was not until his father was admitted to the National Academy and later became a low-level official that his family gained access to academic circles. Nevertheless, he grew up on the frontier close to Mongols, served at a frontier post when he was in his teens, and married the daughter of another military family. Though he served as a county magistrate in different places for several years after he obtained his jinshi degree in 1572, he was transferred to the Ministry of War in 1582 when he was thirty-one years old, and was always thereafter involved in military affairs.

The first serious battle that Wan Shide fought was against the Mongols in Qinghai in 1588 when he was forty-two-years old. At that time he held the position of Assistant Surveillance Commissioner and was stationed at Xining in Shanxi (Shanxi xining beibing qianshi). Wan Shide must have clearly remembered that during his childhood and teenage years the Mongols pillaged the northern border from time to time. Mongolians led by Altan Khan (1507-1582) plundered the borders areas repeatedly during 1540s, and even more so in the 1560s after he organized an all-Mongolian confederation. After a settlement was finally reached in 1571—the year Wan Shide obtained his jinshi degree—the northern border was peaceful for about twenty years. However, after the

---

517 “Ni saixia qu yin 擬塞下曲引” in ibid.
death of Altan Khan in 1582, and later that of his son, his grandson Curuke 搏力克 could no longer hold together the now defunct confederation. The border raids began again, chiefly perpetrated by the Mongolian tribes active on the Gansu-Qinghai border. Wan Shide was sent to assist in managing the issue. Taking advantage of the conflicts between the two tribal leaders Qulaci and Wala, he determined to seize the opportunity to destroy them decisively. His attacks inflicted heavy losses on Wala’s tribe, and were also intended to intimidate Qulaci. Wan Shide’s actions in this were unacceptable to his superior who preferred negotiating with Wala, so he was blamed for worsening the relationship, and as a consequence was sent to another post.

Later, Curuke visited Qinghai and allied with Qulaci to raid the border areas, which shocked the court. This time, Zheng Luo 鄭洛 was appointed the new supreme commander and Wan Shide was transferred back to the frontier to assist him. They won several battles, and then negotiated with Curuke to force him to move with his followers back to the bend of the Yellow River to the north, as well as expel Qulaci. The tributary relationship was maintained, and the border along inner Asia was at peace again. However, Zheng Luo and Wan Shide were criticized for not being able to exterminate Qulaci and the victory was considered flawed. Grand Councilor Shen Shixing came to their defense and settled the argument, and Wan Shide was given a small promotion. Wan Shide had been in favor of settling conflicts through war, but changed this hardline position under the influence of Zheng Luo, who advocated peaceful resolution in addition to using military force to reinforce peace. This change in attitude may have been due to


\[521\] Chen, Chen xueshi xiansheng chuji 陳學士先生初集, juan 13, 239.

\[522\] Zhang, Mingshi 明史, juan 222, liezhuan 110; Zheng Luo 鄭洛, 5852-53; Zhang Xuan 張萱, Xiyuan wenjian lu 西園聞見錄, juan 28, 1179; Chen, Chen xueshi xiansheng chuji 陳學士先生初集, juan 13, 239-40; Tu, “Dasima wangong zhuan 大司馬萬公傳,” 229-31; Huang, 1587, A Year of No Significance: The Ming Dynasty in Decline, 111.
the frustration Wan Shide encountered in his last experience of fighting the Mongols in 1588. In the prologue to his poetry collection concerning his border experiences, he commented that throughout Han Wudi’s lifetime (156–87 BCE), the borders had never been at peace. This observation was contrary to widely held opinions about Han Wudi’s military achievements and his grandiose plans for territorial expansion. In reality, the Xiongnu had never yielded obedience to the Han Empire as a tributary nor made peace through marriage—the former was the goal of Wudi’s aggressive campaigns, while the latter, the intention of the Xiongnu. Further, the country under Wudi’s reign had become depopulated and exhausted due to years of military expeditions. Wan Shide compared the results of Ming policy—the Mongols became a tributary state when faced with Ming superior military force and negotiation skills—with the outcome of Han Wudi’s campaigns, and argued that the more flexible policy of pacifying and fighting was the better strategy.  

During the Sino-Japanese war, Wan Shide probably sent messengers to negotiate with the Japanese in the last battle, though whether this was a means of spying on them and sowing division in the enemy camp, or a real attempt to attain a peaceful settlement, is difficult to affirm. After the war, some officials accused him of being a traitor in his attempt to make peace with the Japanese. However, the Wanli Emperor ignored the charge, as according to some, he was so happy the prolonged war was over he did not care how it had been achieved. The awards from the emperor proved to Wan Shide that he was safe from such accusations, and provided evidence not only of the emperor’s favor but also implied approval of flexible ways to make peace. An earlier example also showed this shift in policy. Not long after the second round of the Korean defense

---

523 “Ni saixia qu yin 擬塞下曲引” in Wan, Ni saixia qu 擬塞下曲. 
524 Fan, Zhaodai wugong bian 昭代武功編, juan 10, 149; Mao, Wanli sanda zheng kao 萬曆三大征考, 17. 
525 Fan, Zhaodai wugong bian 昭代武功編, juan 10, 149; Mao, Wanli sanda zheng kao 萬曆三大征考, 17; Zhou Yongchun 周永春, ed., Silun lu 絲論錄, juan 4, 100.
campaign began following the failure of formal diplomatic efforts in 1597, the defense coordinator of the Ming troops, Governor-general Xing Jie 邢玠, was accused of negotiating for peace with Japanese military leaders. Xing Jie, who had also supported Zheng Luo’s peaceful settlement in 1591 with the Mongols, confirmed the truth of this but argued that there were many methods to win a war. If the military force was strong enough to defeat the enemy, then one could use force; but if the strategy of sowing dissent amongst the enemy could work, then there was no reason not to employ it in addition to military action. In other words, the strategy of spreading discord should not be rejected just because it was considered passive—a sign of weakness—by some officials, and that to settle a war, every possible means should be considered. Fortunately, Wanli did not accept the accusations against Xing Jie, and on many occasions ordered other officials not to interfere with his strategies and ways of commanding the troops in the war. Wanli’s reaction shows that the tactics of pacifying and fighting were openly adopted in the second campaign.526

The last section of Luo Binwang’s poem illustrates his frustration with court politics through the image of Jia Yi. Wan Shide probably could partially identify with this reference, as he experienced similar frustrations in his earlier life, but his official career had commenced smoothly ever since. His allusion to the gold terrace in his commentary following Luo Binwang’s poem testified to his confidence in the Wanli emperor’s high opinion of him, and his pride and delight at being so understood.

526 For Xing Jie’s support of Zheng Luo’s strategy, see Zhang, Mingshi 明史, juan 222, liezhuan 110, 5852-53. For Xing Jie’s strategy in the Sino-Japanese war see Shenzong shilu 神宗實錄 (repr., Kyoko: Chinese Book Co., 1984), juan 324, Wanli ershilu nian qiuyue jihai 萬曆二十六年七月己亥, 4b-5a, and Zhang, Mingshi 明史, juan 320, liezhuan 208, 8296-297. Although the Wanli Emperor’s response to Xing Jie’s argument was not recorded in the Shenzong shilu or Mingshi, he commented in response to other memorials from Xing Jie and other officials that he authorized Xing Jie to make the decisions during the war and asked other officials not to interfere, see Xing Jie 邢玠, Jinglüe yuwo zouyi 經略御倭奏議, in vol. 4 of Yuwo shilao huibian 御倭史料匯編, ed. Jiang Yasha 姜亞沙, Jing Li 經莉, and Chen Zhanqi 陳湛綺 (Beijing: Quanguo tushu guan wenxian suowei fuzhi zhongxin, 2004), 25-41, especially 38-39, and Yao Wenwei’s 姚文蔚 memorials in Wang Zaijin 王在晉, Haifang zuanyao 海防纂要, 60-64, especially 62, 64.
The allusion to the gold terrace comes from the story of Guo Wei 郭隗, from the Warring States period. Guo Wei’s fate was very different from Jia Yi’s, since Guo was greatly respected by his master. Guo Wei told King Zhao (Zhaowang 昭王; 311-279 BCE) of the Yan Kingdom a story about how an ancient wise king had spent a thousand taels of gold to purchase the bones of a swift horse that could run a thousand li a day, which inspired people to bring him other winged steeds. The King Zhao took the hint and built a mansion for Guo Wei to show his respect for his great intellect and as a way to attract even more capable men to serve in his court. Guo Wei’s fortunate encounter with the king has been envied by generations of scholars. His story was further elaborated by the addition of a terrace that was covered with thousands of taels of gold to show the king’s sincerity and determination to recruit men of real talent—hence the origin of the allusion of the gold terrace. King Zhao attracted more capable men to serve in his court, and the Yan Kingdom was transformed into a powerful state. The gold terrace became a symbol of the encounter between a wise king and a brilliant intellectual, which foretold of a promising future for the country. Poets throughout the following dynasties, such as Li Bai 李白, composed poems containing allusions to the gold terrace. In the Ming dynasty, the remains of the gold terrace reflecting the sunlight of the sunset—the “gold terrace in the sunset”—was considered one of the great scenes in Beijing. By referring to the allusion of the gold terrace, Wan Shide implied that he was proud of the honors he received and appreciated the emperor’s indulgence, and this further implied a prosperous age under a wise ruler, illustrated in the first two sections of The Imperial

527 Gao You 高誘, *Zhanguo ce zhu 戰國策注* (Shilí ju congshu jingsong ben 士禮居叢書景宋本), juan 29, 169.
528 Liu and Yu, *Dijing jingwu lüe 帝京景物略*, juan 2, 58-61.
529 Li Bai, “Xinglu nan 行路難,” *Li Bai 李白, Li taibai ji 李太白集* (Song keben 宋刻本), 17. Several poems on the gold terrace by poets from the Yuan to the Ming dynasty were recorded in Liu and Yu, *Dijing jingwu lüe 帝京景物略*, juan 2, 58-61.
530 Huang Yu 黃瑜, *Shuanghuai suichao 雙槐歲鈔* (Qing Lingnan yishu ben 清嶺南遺書本), juan 6, 60.
Capital as well as Zhao Zhe’s painting. Therefore, he used the poem and the painting to glamorize the gold terrace—a symbol of a wise king’s understanding and the ensuing prosperous age. The emperor’s recognition, the peace that closely followed the beginning of second Korean campaign, and the retained tributary system—these results confirmed Wan Shide’s concept of peace-making and signified a powerful Ming regime, what could have been more inspiring?531

Wan Shide probably understood that even though a large amount of the Ming state treasury had been spent,532 the Wanli emperor was relieved by the end of war and considered it a victory and a mark of his achievements; although he rarely appeared in public, he personally accepted the surrender of prisoners. According to common knowledge in the Ming, an empire attained its golden age after major military triumphs and/or securing more tributary states, for instance in the time of Han Wudi and Tang Taizong. With the victory, the Wanli emperor along with many officials must have felt that they could claim that the military achievements of the Ming Empire were as great as those of the ancient dynasties.

To Wan Shide, the Japanese retreat meant he could resume the colorful lifestyle that he had not able to enjoy during wartime. Given his recognition by the Wanli emperor, rank as the highest commander in Korea, and representation of the Heavenly Dynasty in its subject state, a man that even the King of Chosun had to respect and receive carefully,

531 The Wanli Emperor’s favor towards him was also demonstrated when Wan Shide was promoted to the position of Supreme Commander in 1600. When Xing Jie was discharged from the position, Wan Shide was not on the list of candidates recommended by the officials to succeed Xing Jie, but the Wanli Emperor still remembered him and singled him out for the position. Chen, Chen xueshi xiansheng chuji
532 The cost of the war was seven million taels of silver, which together with the battles in Ningxia that cost two million taels of silver, and the war in Bozhou that cost two to three million taels of silver, exhausted the national treasury of the Ming dynasty, according to Zhang, Mingshi 明史, juan 305, leichuan 193, huanguan 2, 7805. For the cost of the Sino-Japanese war, also see Mao, Wanli sanda zheng kao 福曆三大征考, 18; Mao recorded that it cost one million in materials (such as grain) and more than four million taels of silver. Modern scholars Reischauer and Fairbank estimated that it cost twenty million taels of silver, see Edwin O. Reischauer and John K. Fairbank, East Asia: The Great Tradition (Boston: Houghton Mifflin Co., 1960), 332-33, cited by Donald N. Clark, “Sino-Korean Tributary Relations Under the Ming,” in Twitchett and Mote, The Ming Dynasty, 1368-1644, Part 2, vol. 8 of The Cambridge History of China, 298.
he surely felt that he was at a rare and honorable moment in his life. With his vivid, fresh memories of Beijing’s prosperity and magnificence, to Wan Shide the end of the war probably signaled the prosperity that would come to Chosun’s capital, and the strengthening of the tributary relationship between the Ming and Chosun. It was time to declare again the Chinese concept of world order with its own dominant influence radiating from the celestial capital to the peripheral areas. Wan Shide’s inscription of Luo Binwang’s *The Imperial Capital* after the Zhao Zhe *Qingming* painting celebrated the victory and his honor, and eulogized the Wanli emperor’s rule as a great golden age.533

3.2. Wang Shizhen: Reflecting on the Rise and Fall of a Shengshi

Wang Shizhen 王士禎 (1634-1711) was another person who viewed the Zhao Zhe version of *Qingming Shanghe tu* and wrote poems about it. He came from a prominent family in Xincheng 新城, Shandong province, received his jinshi degree in 1658, and became a leading poet and high-ranking official in the early Qing dynasty. Many of his forefathers were high-ranking scholar-officials in the Ming dynasty; for example, his great-great-grandfather Wang Chongguan 王重光 (1502-1558; 1541 jinshi) was Assistant Administrative Commissioner at Guizhou (Guizhou canyi 貴州參議). His great-grandfather Wang Zhiyuan 王之垣 (1527-1604; 1562 jinshi) was the Vice Minister of Revenue (Hubu zuo shilang 戶部左侍郎), and his grandfather Wang

---

533 Though there were no records about Wan Shide’s physical condition, during the time he was stationed at Chosun from November 1599 to September 1600, he probably had been ill. He died in September 1602, two years after he returned from Korea, at the age of fifty-five. When he had just arrived at Chosun, Korean officials were surprised that he looked gentle and quiet since they had heard that Wan Shide was reputed for his bravery and bold vision. The former supreme-commander Yang Hao also told Chosun officials that Wan Shide was a man of great strategy with ambitions for great achievements. According to Korean records and Tang Zhaojing’s memorial to the emperor, Wan Shide was blind in at least in one eye when he commanded the Ming troops in Korea. His illness probably made him far less active than his reputation suggested. In all probability his illness may have been an unofficial reason why he felt happy with the peace, so that he could have a long break. Li, *Chaoxian renchen wohuo shiliao* 朝鮮壬辰倭禍史料, 4: 1402, 1497; Tang, “Lichen jiuyu qingyi bianchen xumao tiangong qici ba chi yi shen quanheng yi ning jiangyu shu 禮臣久于清議邊臣虛冒天功乞罷職以慎銓衡以寧疆域疏,” 654.
Xiangjin 王象晉 (1604 jinshi) was the Administrative Commissioner at Zhejiang (Zhejiang you buzhengshi 浙江右布政史). His brothers Wang Shilu 王士祿 and Wang Shihu 王士祜 obtained jinshi degrees in 1652 and 1670 respectively, and were officials in the Qing dynasty as well. Wang Shizhen eventually advanced to the position of Minister of Justice (Xingbu shangshu 刑部尚書). His two poems on the Zhao Zhe Qingming painting were written in 1682 when he was forty-eight years old, and when his career started to prosper. The poems read:

Over Jinming Lake willow fluffs drift in the wind.
Ladies’ new make-up reflects on the water.
They apply light yellow cosmetics on their foreheads and wear tight dresses in the palace style;
With newly painted decoration of a pair of Empress Meng’s design of cicadas.

The Dreaming of Hua is like the old Eastern Capital.
My eyes shine for a while when I see the painting.
Yet, frustratingly I stop my wine cup; for what?
Because the west wind and the setting sun approach Qingcheng.

These poems show that Wang Shizhen was inspired by the painting to imagine the heyday of the capital of the Northern Song, Bianjing, which featured a more luxurious

---

534 Guoli zhongyang tushu guan 國立中央圖書館, ed. Mingren zhuanji ziliao suoyin 明人傳記資料索引 (Taipei: Guoli zhongyang tushu guan 1964), 45, 22, 60.
536 First poem: 金明池上柳吹綿, 仕女紅妝照水鮮, 學取鵲黃宮樣窄, 一雙新畫孟家蟬. Second poem: 夢華髣髴舊東京, 聲見丹青眼暫明, 忽忽停杯緣底事, 西風殘照近南城. Wang, Daijing tang ji 帶經堂集, juan 37, 263. Weng Fanggang inscribed on the Zhao Zhe painting that he once had read Wang Yuyang’s (Shizhen) two poems in Wang’s poem collection written in 1683 on Zhu Zhe’s Qingming painting which, as Wang Shizhen noted, once was collected by Wan Bouxiu (Shide); Weng Fanggang corrected that the painter should be identified as Zhao Zhe instead of Zhu Zhe. Wang Shizhen’s poems were not inscribed on the painting, but were collected in Wang Shizhen’s writings. Weng Fanggang inscribed Wang Shizhen’s poems on the painting after Wan Shide’s inscriptions.
scene than what was depicted by Zhao Zhe. In addition, stimulated by the painting, he expressed his sentiment on the rise and fall of a flourishing empire. In the first poem, he used several allusions to life in Bianjing to indicate the prosperity of the Song Empire, including Jingming Lake and ladies’ fashionable make-up and dresses. Jingming Lake was originally developed to the west of the capital for marine maneuvers in 978, during Taizong’s time. Emperor Huizong of the Northern Song (r. 1101-1125) had more architecture constructed around and on the lake, and transformed it into a place for imperial entertainment, yet from March 1st to April 8th the district was open to the public.537 In the poem, Wang Shizhen used the image of willow fluffs blowing in the wind to imply the season of spring and the time of the opening of Jingming Lake—a festive event that attracted hundreds and thousands of Bianjing residents, which Meng Yuanlao described in a large portion of his Records of the Eastern Capital: Like Dreaming of Hua.538 Wang Shizhen depicted the stylish make-up and dresses of the gentry women in the city who imitated the palace ladies and even the designs of Empress Meng.539 These scenes revealed the affluence and prosperity of the Song Empire, but they were not portrayed in the Zhao Zhe version. According to my analysis in the last chapter, the Zhao Zhe painting displays an abundant, pleasant and orderly world (Fig. 2). Zhao Zhe depicted the bustling street scenes and various goods as well as some luxuries and entertainment, but most of the people in the painting, men and women alike, dress or behave according to the Ming dynasty state code and/or Confucian ideology. The abundant commodities, extravagances and amusements probably fit into Wang Shizhen’s idea of a prosperous world, but his emphasis in the poem on Jingming Lake and on ladies in fashionable outfits out in public, shows that he imagined an even more lavish scene of prosperity in the Northern Song.

537 Meng, Dongjing menghua lu 東京夢華録, juan 7, 23, 28.
539 Empress Meng was the wife of Emperor Zhezong (1085-1100).
In the beginning of the second poem, Wang Shizhen referred to the *Records of the Eastern Capital: Like Dreaming of Hua*, in which the capital Bianjing was compared to the ideal kingdom Huaxu, showing that he was familiar with Meng Yuanlao’s portrayal of life in Bianjing and Meng Yuanlao’s sorrow over the sudden fall of the Northern Song. Then, Wang Shizhen returned to the moment when he viewed the *Qingming* painting, and wrote that on seeing the painting, his eyes shone brightly. The joy of examining the painting soon was replaced by other sentiments, because he knew that the affluence of the Northern Song described in the *Records of the Eastern Capital* and the *Qingming* scroll would soon be destroyed, as the Jurchen were approaching. By using the images of the west wind blowing through Qingcheng in the setting sun, he implied the “fall” of the Northern Song Empire because Qingcheng was the place where Song Huizong and his son Qinzong surrendered to the Jurchen general Nianhan 粘罕. Furthermore, the tragic collapse of the dynasty was intensified by and akin to the west wind and setting sun—the natural signs of desolation and decline.

Coming from a family with an honorable record of scholar-officials who served in the Ming court, and experiencing the fall of that dynasty, did the Zhao Zhe *Qingming* remind Wang Shizhen of the former empire and did he use the allusion of the Song Empire to imply his sorrow and nostalgia for the Ming? Wang Shizhen was ten years old when the alien Manchu forces overthrew the Ming dynasty in 1644. When the last Ming emperor died, Wang Shizhen’s grandfather Wang Xiangjin, the retired Administrative Commissioner of Zhejiang, stopped engaging in any kind of social life and gave himself the pseudonym “Peasant Hermit of the Ming” [*Mingnong yinshi* 明農隱士], and one of his uncles committed suicide to show his loyalty to the Ming dynasty.  

---

540 Liu Qi 劉祁, *Guiqian zhi* 歸潛志 (Qing Wuying dian juzhen ban congshu ben 清武英殿聚珍版叢書本), juan 7, 38.
befriended Ming loyalists such as Mao Pijiang and Lin Gudu, who refused to serve the Qing court, and Wu Weiye and Chen Weisong, who though serving in the Qing court, still lamented the demise of the Ming regime.\(^{542}\) The deep sorrow that many Han Chinese felt and the memory of life in the late Ming were expressed, recorded, and published in plays and random notes such as Wu Weiye’s The Spring of Moling (Moling chun 林陵春) in 1653, Yu Huai’s Miscellaneous Records of the Banqiao in 1663, and Kong Shangren’s Peach Blossom Fan (Taohua shan 桃花扇) in 1669. In addition, Wang Shizhen had first-hand experience with the refined material and cultural life of the late Ming through his gatherings with Ming loyalists, especially one in 1665 at the Shuihui Garden owned by Mao Pijiang. The Shuihui Garden was the villa that Mao Pijiang renovated and retreated to after the fall of the Ming. In the gathering of 1665, Wang Shizhen and the loyalists composed poems, appreciated paintings, tasted good food and wine, and enjoyed music and dramatic performances, which included singing and dancing by Mao Pijiang’s private troupe. These activities represented a late Ming lifestyle that Mao Pijiang intended to recreate in his garden.\(^{543}\) Hence, Wang Shizhen understood the prosperity and cultural richness in the late Ming and the grief that loyalists experienced over the fall of the Ming Empire.

When Wang Shizhen wrote the poems for the painting in 1682, he was the president of the National Academy in Beijing, the capital of the Qing Empire, and enjoyed the emperor’s favor and the reputation of being a leading poet. His rise began four years previously in 1678, when he was forty-four years old and serving as a director of a bureau (Langzhong 郎中) of the Ministry of Revenue. At that time, the young Kangxi Emperor appointed Wang Shizhen to be a member of the Hanlin Academy, the

\(^{542}\) Li, Zuori dao chengshi: jinshi zhongguo de yile yu zongjiao 昨日到城市: 近世中國的逸樂與宗教, 181-92.

\(^{543}\) Ibid., 96, 112-13, 170-74.
first Han Chinese to be so promoted. High-ranking officials were groomed for advancement in this institution, especially the grand secretariats and the heads of the six ministries. As such, his appointment was a great honor and showed how the emperor held him in esteem. In 1665, before he moved to Beijing for a new position, he served as a judge (Tuiguan 推官) in Yangzhou for five years and earned a very good reputation for handling cases. During his time in Yangzhou, he became friends with cultural elites in the Lower Yangzi such as Mao Pijiang, Chen Weisong and Qian Qianyi. His two literary gatherings in Yangzhou with creative elites for composing poems, in imitation of Wang Xizhi’s historic gathering with friends at the Orchid Pavilion in 353, became famous cultural events of the time and in this way, Wang Shizhen established his reputation as a poet.

When he was transferred to positions in the Ministry of Rites and the Ministry of Households from 1665 to 1678, in addition to excelling at his work he continued to compose poems and associate with literati such as Gong Dingzi 龔鼎孳, Zhu Yizun 朱彝尊, Wang Wan 汪琬 and Song Wan 宋琬, and organized poetry clubs and went sightseeing with them. With his genial personality and fame as a prominent poet, he attracted many scholars who befriended him and consulted him for advice on their poetry. With the favor of the Kangxi Emperor, his status as a leading poet, and his many successful social relationships, he had every reason to expect a promising future when he wrote the poems on the Zhao Zhe painting in 1682.

That year, Kangxi was a young emperor of twenty-eight years old. Even so, Wang Shizhen was probably aware that Kangxi, though young, was a daring emperor with superior judgement, wisdom, and political strategies. Kangxi was enthroned in 1661 at the age of seven as the second emperor of the Qing dynasty, when the regime was not yet

---

545 Huang, Wang Yuyang shilun zhi yanjiu 王漁洋詩論之研究, 14-18.
546 Ibid., 19-21, 33-34.
very stable. In 1669, at the age of fifteen, he shrewdly got rid of the dominant and arrogant regent, Ao Bai 鷙拜, and subsequently personally took control of the country. The year before Wang Shizhen’s inscription on the Zhao Zhe painting (1681), at the age of twenty-seven, Kangxi quelled the rebellion of the powerful Three Feudatories (sanfan 三藩) in southern China, the last serious threat to Qing imperial rule. 547 To win over the Han Chinese scholars, who were essential to running the bureaucracy, Emperor Kangxi showed his respect to Confucius, and thus to the scholars, by ordering a worship ceremony to be held for Confucius in the Imperial Academy in 1669. He paid utmost reverence by kneeling three times, each time performing two koutou (i.e. kowtows, sangui liukuo li 三跪六叩禮) to the spirit tablet of Confucius. 548 In 1679, Kangxi recruited renowned Han Chinese scholars including Wang Shizhen’s close friends Wang Wan and Chen Weisong to compile an official Ming history. When some Chinese scholars refused to be recruited, Kangxi was rather tolerant of their rejections. 549 To secure the empire’s main source of state revenue, which was based on agriculture and sericulture, 550 Emperor Kangxi adopted several pragmatic measures. Starting from 1671, he encouraged people to reclaim wasteland and he offered those settlers three to ten years of exemption from paying taxes. 551 Through several tax reforms in the 1680s, Qing revenue grew twenty-three percent compared to the 1650s, which though not at the level of the late Ming, showed that the Qing Empire was already stable and affluent. 552 These


548 Meng, Kangxi Pingzhuang 康熙評傳, 54.

549 Ibid., 182-83. Spence, “The Kang-hsi Reign,” 148; Ma Zuzxi 馬祖熙, Chen Weisong nianpu 陳維崧年譜 (Shanghai: Shanghai guji chuban she, 2007), 139-140.

550 Meng, Kangxi Pingzhuang 康熙評傳, 358. According to statistics, around the fiftieth year of Emperor Kangxi’s reign (1704), 82.3 percent of annual revenue was from land tax and labor levy, which means it came mostly from farmers, while the remaining 17.7 percent was from the salt business, trade and customs.

551 Ibid., 193.

actions provide compelling evidence that the Kangxi Emperor was a capable ruler and that the power of the Qing Empire was increasing.

Therefore, Wang Shizhen experienced the demise of the Ming dynasty as well as the rise of the powerful new Manchu Empire. Though he could remember the chaotic conditions during the Ming-Qing transition, he was only ten years old at the time. He understood the pain of losing one’s country probably more through his family and friends than from his own experience. He attended literary gatherings but did not attend any political gatherings held by adherents of the Ming dynasty, and in his literary works he never openly revealed his feelings toward the Ming dynasty. By the time he wrote the poems on the Zhao Zhe Qingming, he had served the Qing court for more than twenty years, won the emperor’s favor, and led a good life under the new regime. By this time, the last major threat to the Qing Empire from Han Chinese—the rebellion of the Three Feudatories—had been quelled. The Kangxi Emperor Wang Shizhen served appreciated Chinese scholars and carried out many beneficial policies for the people. The peace and the Emperor’s policies ensured the rise of a powerful Manchu Empire.

Wang Shizhen probably understood that the affluence of the Northern Song recorded in the *Records of the Eastern Capital* and represented in the Zhao Zhe Qingming painting especially because Jurchen groups overthrew both of these thriving empires: the Northern Song and the Ming. Wan Shide’s 1599 inscription, which compared the Zhao Zhe scroll with the great times of Wanli’s rule, perhaps also reminded Wang Shizhen that the Ming shared the same fate as the Song dynasty. However, he must have recognized that the Mandate of Heaven had been transferred to the Qing dynasty, and emperors like Kangxi who had proven that they could rule well, since with his

family’s support and encouragement he earnestly pursued his career and did his duty, as well as appreciated his lifestyle under the new dynasty. As a Han Chinese with generations of ancestors who served the Ming court, he probably could not avoid complicated feelings toward the Qing regime. Therefore, the sentiments that Zhao Zhe’s scroll stimulated probably led him to the conclusion that every life, including that of a dynasty, like the wind and the sun in nature that he mentioned in his poem, declined after reaching its zenith (shengji bishuai 盛極必衰), rather than that he specifically despised over the demise of the Ming dynasty.  

3.3. Prince Bao: Warning Against Extravagance in a Shengshi

Hongli 弘曆 (1711-1799) was the fourth son of the Yongzheng Emperor (r. 1722-1735), and from 1733 to 1735 was granted the title Prince Bao. When the Yongzheng Emperor died in 1735, Hongli ascended the throne at age twenty-five and took the calendar name Qianlong 乾隆, becoming the Qianlong Emperor. When he was in his early twenties, Hongli composed a poem of four sections using the rhyme of Luo Binwang’s The Imperial Capital (Fig. 398). Prince Bao ordered the scholar official Liang Shizheng 梁詩正 to inscribe this poem as an addition to the Taipei A version of Qingming shanghe tu.  

554 Shengji bishuai is a philosophy illuminated in The Commentary on the Book of Changes (Yizhuan 易傳), see Fu Yijian 傅以漸, Yijing tongchu 易經通注 (Qing Wenyuan ge siku quanshu ben 清文淵閣四庫全書本), juan 6, 99. 
555 (section 1)

大禹敷土, 導河過龍門, 死水沃萬里間, 卓為羣瀆尊, 流經積石走凾穀, 東過洛汭繞甸服, 土中自古稱洛都, 撫帶山河雄地軸, (section 2)

維昔宣和全盛時, 寒食初過一百六, 潦fire=兩清明, 踏青歲岁侈華屋, 華屋朱樓金飾homepage, 千門萬戶天邊開, 飛花香滿宜春苑, 稱觴獻壽柏梁台, 佩響千官入, 山呼萬乘來.
The first section of the poem depicts the strategic features of the Song capital, \(^{556}\) while the second gives a description of scenes during the *Qingming* festival in Song

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>畫裙豔交藻，雲漢巋昭回，</th>
<th>開封 or Bianjing 汴京. The others were the western capital Henan 河南府 (currently Louyang in Henan), the northern capital Daming 大名府 (now Daming in Hebei), and the southern capital Yingtian</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>梯航萬里至，幅軸日中市，</td>
<td>北大位今 Daming in Hebei, and the southern capital Yingtian</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 綺縠揚袞袖，連袂如雲起， | 楊柳岸.

---

\(^{556}\) The Song dynasty had four capitals; the major and most prosperous was the eastern capital Kaifeng 開封.
Huizong’s Xuanhe period, the most prosperous time of the Song dynasty. These scenes included court events held in magnificent palaces, entertainment for emperors, nobles and officials, people on outings, and urban prosperity with bustling businesses, all of which largely correspond to the middle portion of Taipei A (Fig. 5). The peaceful scenery of the countryside, conforming to the first part of Taipei A, is also depicted. In the third stanza, Hongli described scenes of boating on the lake of the imperial garden, which he likened to the land of the immortals. He referred to the magic of the Daoist priest Lin Lingsu 林靈素, whom Huizong relied on, to imply that Huizong had been unwise to trust the priest’s words, not recognizing that his situation was already as wonderful as the land of immortal paradise. This account resembles the last part of the Taipei A. In the final section of the poem, Hongli praised Qiu Ying’s talent and the painting as a masterpiece, and recalled the miserable scene of 1127 when Jin forces captured Emperor Qinzong, former emperor Huizong, and many members of the imperial court. In the concluding verse, Hongli questioned the purpose of the painting, and offered the answer that the scroll was a reminder that the Song made the mistake of enticing the Jin to invade, and that the real reason for its fall was the extravagance of the dynasty.

When Prince Bao wrote the poem, he was outstanding among his brothers, but he was not the heir apparent. During his reign, the Yongzheng Emperor never announced his successor. Hoping to avoid repetition of the succession crisis that had tainted his own accession to the throne, Emperor Yongzheng had the name of his successor placed in a sealed box secured behind the tablet over the throne in the Palace of Heavenly Purity (Qianqing Palace 乾清宮). The name in the box was to be revealed to other members of the imperial family in the presence of all senior ministers only upon the death of the 应天府 (current Shangqiu in Henan). In the poem, Prince Bao called the capital Loudu (capital Luoyang) instead of Bianjing; he must have known that the capital of the Northern Song was Bianjing, but used Luoyang—an ancient capital for several dynasties and the eastern capital of the Sui and Tang dynasties—as general term meaning capital city or eastern capital.
emperor, but it was widely known that Prince Bao would be the likely successor since he had been a favorite of his grandfather, Kangxi, and his father alike.

When he was first introduced to his grandfather at the age of twelve, Hongli so impressed the Kangxi Emperor with his confidence and impressive responses that he was brought to and raised in the Forbidden City.\(^{557}\) When his father became the emperor and he a prince, a number of important ritual tasks were entrusted to him, and he was also included in important discussions of military strategy. He probably was confident about his future as well, as he tried hard to establish a positive image of himself as a wise emperor in waiting. For example, at age twenty (1732), he selected and published his early poems and writings under the title *Collection of Happy-in-Adopting-Righteousness Studio* (*Leshan tang wenchao* 樂善堂文鈔), in which he displayed his knowledge of Chinese classics, talent in literature, and ideas about leading a country.\(^{558}\)

Happy-in-Adopting-Righteousness Studio was Hongli’s personal study in the Forbidden City when he was a prince. According to one of his articles in the *Collection*, the name of his studio came from a sentence in the classic work *Mengzi*: “The great Shun was happy to adopt others’ good deeds to implement them himself.”\(^{559}\) The name of his studio thus effectively not only announced that he was knowledgeable about and agreed with the thoughts of the Confucian scholar Mengzi, but also that he was modeling himself on Shun, a legendary sage king of ancient China.

The seal of Happy-in-Adopting-Righteousness Studio on Taipei A further testifies that this painting was collected and viewed by Qianlong when he was Prince Bao (Fig. 399). In his poem, Hongli acknowledged that the *Qingming* painting illustrated the

\(^{557}\) Aixin jueluo Hongli 愛新覺羅弘曆, *Leshan tang quanji* 樂善堂全集, ed. Qingdai shiwen ji huibian bianzhu hui 清代詩文集彙編編纂委員會, vol. 331 of *Qingdai shiwen ji huibian* 清代詩文集彙編 (Shanghai: Shanghai guji 上海古籍, 2010), 51.

\(^{558}\) Ibid., 48-49.

\(^{559}\) “大舜樂取於人以爲善,” see ibid., 161. Meng Ke 孟軻, *Mengzi 孟子* (Sibu congkan jingsong dazi ben 四部叢刊景宋大字本), *juan* 3, 27.
prosperous age of the Northern Song dynasty. As a possible emperor-to-be he demonstrated his knowledge of Chinese history and high literary ability by not only composing a poem in the rhyme of Luo Binwang’s *The Imperial Capital* but also in his use of many historical and literary allusions. In addition, regarding his Jurchen Jin ancestors’ conquest of the Northern Song dynasty, he demonstrated his ethnic pride by reasoning that since the Song had repudiated its agreements with the Jin, the Chinese themselves precipitated the invasion. Most importantly, he concluded, he learned a lesson from the Song: their fall was essentially caused by their extravagance. Since Taipei A was one of the *Qingming* scrolls illustrating the most flamboyant and sumptuous lifestyles among the popular *Qingming*, his conclusion that a life of excess in the Song dynasty had caused the decline of a prosperous age was justified. By making these comments, he established his image as an emperor-to-be endowed with knowledge and confidence as well as wisdom. The Taipei A painting with his long poem serves as a reminder of his astute analysis of and warnings about what caused empires to fail.

Wan Shide, Wang Shizhen and Prince Bao all agreed that the popular *Qingming* scrolls were about a great age. However, given the different times and places they wrote their inscriptions, their responses to the picture of a great age diverged. Both Wan Shide and Wang Shizhen viewed the Zhao Zhe scroll as displaying an abundant, pleasant and orderly world that they recognized. Yet, according to their comments and their experiences of a lavish lifestyle, both imagined a grander and more luxurious ideal of society that even went beyond the scope of Zhao Zhe’s utopia. Furthermore, living under different circumstances, one at the moment of his own victory as well as that of his state, and the other being recognized by a capable but alien emperor, they responded to the painting with distinct thoughts. Wan Shide used the painting to glamorize the victory and to declare his own time as that of a great age, while Wang Shizhen responded with sentiments about the rise and fall of a great age.
Prince Bao, the most promising candidate to become emperor after Yongzheng, viewed the Taipei A painting as illustrating a prosperous, brisk, and extravagant world. He disagreed with its painter’s utopian view: being more “politically correct” he warned of the extravagance of a great age, which he considered to be the cause of the collapse of the great age itself. In this manner he demonstrated his qualifications as ruler designate.

Though the responses of these viewers were different, they were all possible sources for the Qingming painters to design new motifs for the Qingming paintings. It is uncertain how Wan Shide, Wang Shizhen and Prince Bao obtained these Qingming scrolls. Wan Shide and Prince Bao probably did not commission the paintings, otherwise they would have instructed the artists to paint the scenes of prosperity in the way they preferred. In Wan Shide’s case, he probably purchased the Zhao Zhe scroll in a marketplace, after it had been produced and displayed in a shop. By the time Wang Shizhen saw the Zhao Zhe version, it was already an antique painting. Prince Bao likely received the Taipei A as a gift from his officials. Nevertheless, their various comments about the paintings and the various great ages they envisioned, like other patrons, might have been transmitted to the Qingming painters one way or another, and encouraged the painters to further design new paintings that met their viewers’ diverse needs.\footnote{One good example is the imperial-commissioned Qingming shanghe tu in the Qing dynasty—the Qing court version. Though this painting was begun during the Yongzheng emperor’s reign, it was not completed until the first year of the Qianlong emperor’s reign. Qianlong even inscribed it (via Liang Shizheng again) to show his endorsement, indicating that this painting fit his view of an ideal world. This painting presents much more ordered and less extravagant lifestyles than those in the Taipei A painting, for which Prince Bao wrote a poem. Since the Qing court version is out of the scope of this study, which focuses on the content, meaning and value of the popular versions that have been ignored by art historians, and many scholars have already addressed the content and the orderly society depicted in the Qing court version, I have not included a discussion of this painting in my study. A few examples of studies of the Qing court version include Na Zhiliang 那志良, Qingming shanghe tu 清明上河圖 (Taipei: National Palace Museum, 1993); Chen Yunru, “Zhizuo zhenjing: Chonggu qing yuanben qingming shanghe tu zai zai yongzheng chao huayuan zhi huashi yi” 製造真境: 重估〈清院本清明上河圖〉在雍正朝畫院之畫史意義” [Producing a Realm of Truth: Reexamining the Art-Historical Significance of the Qing Court Version of Up the River During Qingming at the Yongzheng Painting Academy], 1-64, especially pages 20-21 about the idealized lifestyles, and page 33 about Qianlong’s inscription; Yu Hui, “Cong Qingming jie dao xiqing ri—sanfu Qingming shanghe tu zhi bijiao 從清明節到喜慶日—三幅清明上河圖之比較,” 263-264, 269, 274, 279.}
Kristeva’s intertextuality theory, which reveals how a reader’s text changes in different social and cultural contexts, supports my analysis of the three diverse responses from *Qingming* viewers of different backgrounds, times, and places. Genette’s metatextuality which denotes the influence of a comment on a text, Bahktin’s theory of dialogue between the author and reader in the formation of a text, and the many possible ways of communication between the painters and viewers in the Ming-Qing period that I demonstrated earlier, endorse my reasoning that these three responses would eventually contribute to the creation of other *Qingming shanghe tu* visual texts.
Conclusion

From the Ming to the Qing dynasty, *Qingming shanghe tu* was one of the most popular subjects and one of the most often copied, forged, collected, and viewed paintings. I have proved that the painters of these works ranged from those with advanced educations and friends in elite circles, to less erudite men, to artisans with little schooling. The collectors included affluent urban residents, merchants, landowners, literati and nobles. These were the people who constructed the worlds in the *Qingming* scrolls.

In this dissertation, I examined the meaning of the later *Qingming* scrolls, the shared and distinct motifs amongst the Beijing scroll and the popular *Qingming*, as well as motifs in popular *Qingming* scrolls that represent six types of these paintings dating from the sixteenth to the eighteenth century. Based on Bakhtin’s concept of dialogical relationship between the author and reader, Kristeva’s theory that emphasizes the intertextuality between the texts of the writer and reader and their social contexts, and Genette’s model of transtextuality that stresses and classifies references from various sources in a text, my study demonstrated that the visual texts of the *Qingming* scrolls are a mosaic of quotations. This collection of components includes the discourse of *Qingming shengshi*, observations by commentators, the literary tradition of the thriving city as a symbol of a great age, and the literary allusion and pictorial convention of imperial boating as an icon of a thriving era. The scrolls are also the outcome of painters’ and viewers’ absorption and transformation of previous ideas and paintings, as well as the incorporation of their society’s stance towards life.

As Baxandall’s idea of later painters as active agents illuminates, my analysis proved that the anonymous later *Qingming* painters’ practices are innovative and improvisational. They interacted with viewers, reinterpreted, and reconstructed the meaning of the subject matter by copying and reworking some original motifs, and adding new elements from their and their viewers’ life experiences and concerns. These practices contributed to the creation of distinctive new paintings in their own right.

Many viewers in the Ming and Qing dynasties stated that the *Qingming* scrolls were portrayals of a prosperous age. According to my analysis, many of the paintings’ themes relate closely to the economic success and social changes in the Ming-Qing
period. That is, the *Qingming* painters and patrons extracted the elements of the wealth and cultural transformation of their age to design various new *Qingming* paintings, adopting the title and structure of the Beijing scroll, based on a well-known notion of *Qingming shengshi*—that of a prosperous age.

I proved that the variety of these new paintings demonstrates the changing opinions of painters and patrons in the Ming-Qing era with regard to the proper appearance and character of an ideal world. The model society first depicted as a smaller prosperous economy grew to one of a much grander scale, and changed from a place where humble customs were followed to a much more luxurious, unrestrained, and fashion-conscious way of living.

Throughout the dynasties of China, in times of affluence and consequent social changes, there were always diverse opinions about how to perform in an economically prosperous age among scholars: some defended conventional values, while some proposed new thoughts or supported the new trends. For example, in the Southern Song dynasty, Zhu Xi offered the criticism that “during the Xuanhe and Zhenghe periods, when people boasted of their extravagant life, there were villains who made excuses for them, stating that in prosperous and abundant times one should consume extravagantly. Therefore, people exceeded the limits of propriety; how could the world not go chaotic?”

This statement indicates that in the Northern Song, there were people who considered it reasonable to live lavishly in a prosperous age. In the Ming-Qing period, there were even more scholars who promoted conspicuous consumption during times when the economy flourished, or advocated extravagant spending as a way to encourage prosperity.

As I discussed, Shen Defu of the late Ming argued that, “in the time of *taiping shengshi*, it is not extravagant to decorate with lanterns in celebrating the night of the first full moon of the year.” He made several statements on other occasions in support of the entertainment and expenditure required to commemorate the lantern festival in a way appropriate to a prosperous era. Shen Defu was not alone. His contemporary Zhang Li Jingde

---

561 Li Jingde 黎靖德, *Zhuzi yulei* 朱子語類 (Ming chenghua jiunian chenwei keben 明成化九年陳煒刻本), *juan* 73, 1229.
562 For example, in addition to his statement in Shen, *Wanli yehuo bian* 萬曆野獲編, *juan* 20, 377.
Dafu 張大復 (1554-1630) argued with those who criticized extravagant consumption during the lantern festival, even reasoning that a quiet and simple celebration was a sign of a declining age.\footnote{563} Shen Defu also recorded that during Wanli’s time many scholars complained that the court’s prohibition of performances by singing girls was a defect in a time of peace and prosperity (*taiping*).\footnote{564} These thoughts concerning entertainment and excessive consumption as symbols of a prosperous age were concurrent with the discourse of esteeming extravagance promoted by some liberal scholars in the sixteenth to the eighteenth centuries, such as Lu Ji 陸楫 (1515-1552), Fa Shishan 法式善 (1753-1813), Li Yuheng 李豫亨, and Gu Gongxie 顧公燮, which justified the need to spend in order to have a wealthy society.\footnote{565}

In addition, when orthodox scholars such as Li Kun 呂坤 of the Ming and Chen Hongmou of the Qing promoted the moral and ascetic life that accorded with the state ideology,\footnote{566} some scholars championed following one’s spontaneous feelings and led less restricted lifestyles. The discourse of the love cult and enjoying life was promoted by Neo-Confucian scholars such as Li Zhi 李贄 and Yuan Zhongdao 袁中道 in the late Ming.\footnote{567} In the Qing dynasty, when official moral and ideological control became

---


\footnote{567} Peterson, “Confucian learning in late Ming thought,” 749-50; Chen, *Mingdai shehui shenghuo shi*
stronger than that of the late Ming, there were still cases of scholars who advocated the idea of following one’s passions and personal feelings. One was Yuan Mei, who led a life in accord with his dispositions and desires. He received female disciples, had more than ten concubines, and enjoyed several romances with men, in addition to the pleasures of his luxurious garden and delicate foods. Moreover, several eighteenth-century scholars such as Wang Tingshao 王廷紹, Sheng An 盛安, Hua Guongsheng 華廣生, and Qian Sipei 錢思沛 supported, compiled and/or published contemporary popular love songs that were full of strong expressions of love, intimacy and sexuality. This indicates that there was a trend in Ming-Qing society that ran contrary to governmental and official ideology.

From my study of the Qingming scrolls, which were appreciated by many individuals from the middle to upper classes of society, I demonstrated that favoring a sumptuous and unrestrained lifestyle was a “mainstream” attitude in that economically thriving era. These attitudes were closer to the ideals of unorthodox scholars. Perhaps the late Ming scholar Fan Lian’s words better describes the inexorable nature of trends: “I have been poor and upheld thrift as the highest ideal. Yet, in recent years, I cannot help but to wear colorful clothes. Now, I understand the meaning of the saying: ‘Custom can change a man, even a man of virtue.’” However, my analysis also shows that despite great changes in customs and society, a certain degree of tradition nevertheless remained in the world of the Qingming scrolls. Therefore, people’s view of a great age is never static or uniform, but a dynamic combination of various conventional values and new fashions.

In terms of my contributions to the field, my study rediscovers, reassesses and re-presents a type of painting that was appreciated by a large number of the social elite and middle-class commoners of the Ming-Qing era, but which have largely been ignored by contemporary art historians. My study establishes not only the art historical value of these Qingming paintings but also the value of copying as a form of creation—these

明代社會生活史, 40-43.
569 Ibid., 232-83.
570 Fan, Yunjian jumu chao 雲間據目抄, juan 2, 2626.
Qingming paintings are new creations, not merely imitations. Furthermore, my study confirms that the changing and diverse dreams of an ideal society of the upper class and the rising middle class of the Ming-Qing – encapsulated in Qingming shengshi – were visually manifested through these improvisations of a great age.
Bibliography

*Unless otherwise noted, the pre-modern texts are from the digital database:

Primary sources:

Aixin jueluo Hongli 愛新覺羅弘暉. Leshan tang quanji 樂善堂全集. Edited by
Qingdai shiwen ji huibian bianzhuan weiyuan hui 清代詩文集彙編編纂委員會.
Vol. 331, Qingdai shiwen ji huibian 清代詩文集彙編. Reprint, Shanghai:
Shanghai guji 上海古籍, 2010.

An Qi 安岐. Moyuan huiguan 墨緣匯觀. Qing yueya tang congshu ben 清粤雅堂叢書
本.*

Ban Gu 班固. Hanshu 漢書. Edited by Yang Jialuo 楊家駱. Hanji Dianzi wenxian

Baqi tongzhi 八旗通志. Qing wen yu yan ke siku quanshu ben 清文淵閣四庫全書本.*

Cao Xueqin 曹雪芹. Honglou meng 紅樓夢. Qing Qianlong wushiliu nian cuwen shuwu
huozi yinben, chengjia 順乾隆五十六年萃文書屋活字印本, 程甲.*

Chen Yidian 陳懿典. Chen xueshi xiansheng chuji 陳學士先生成集.*

Cheng Kaihu 程開祜. Chouliao shuohua 筹遼碩畫. Minguo guoli beiping tushu guan
shanben congshu jingming wanli ben 民國國立北平圖書館善本叢書景明萬曆
本.*

Dong Gao 董誥. Quan Tangwen 全唐文. Qing Jiaqing neifu keben 清嘉慶內府刻本.*

Deng Chun 鄧椿. Huaji 畫記. Ming Jindai mishu ben 明津逮秘書本.*

Fan Lian 范濂. Yunjian jumu chao 雲間據目抄. Biji xiaoshuo daguan 22 bian 筆記

Fang Menglong 馮夢龍. Gujin xiaoshuo 古今小說. Ming Tianxu zhai keben 明天啓敬池
刻本.*

Fang Yizhi 方以智. Fushan ji 浮山集. Qing Kangxi cicang xuan keben 清康熙此藏軒
刻本.*

Feng Menglong 馮夢龍. Gujin xiaoshuo 古今小說. Ming Tianxu zhai keben 明天許齋
刻本.*

———. Xingshi hengyan 醒世恆言. Ming Tianqi ye jingchi keben 明天啓敬池刊
本.*
Fu Yijian 傅以漸. *Yijing tongchu* 易經通注. Qing Wenyuan ge siku quanshu ben 清文淵閣四庫全書本.*


Gu Lu 顧祿. *Qingjia lu* 清嘉録. Qing Daoguang keben 清道光刻本.*

Gu Qiyuan 顧起元. *Kezuo zhuiyu* 客座贅語. Ming Wanli sishiliu nian zi keben 明萬曆四十六年自刻本.*

Huang Xiufu 黃休復. *Ruizhou fuzhi* 瑞州府志. Qing Tongzhi shier nian kanben 清同治十二年刊本.*


Li Bai 李白. *Li taibai ji* 李太白集. Song keben 宋刻本.*
Li Dongyang 李東陽. *Huailu tang ji* 懷麓堂集. Wenyuan ge siku qianshu ben 文淵閣四庫全書本.*
Li Dou 李斗. *Yangzhou huafang lu* 揚州畫舫錄. Qing Qianlong liushi nian ziran keben 清乾隆六十年自然爛刻本.*
Li Jingde 黎靖德. *Zhuzi yulei* 朱子語類. Ming chenghua jiunian chenwei keben 明成化九年陳瑩刻本.*
Li Rihua 李日華. *Weishui xuan riji* 味水軒日記. Mingguo jiaye tang congshu ben 民國嘉業堂叢書本.*
Li Suiqiu 黎遂球. *Lianxu ge ji* 蓮鬚閣集. Ming Kangxi Li Yanzu keben 明康熙黎延祖刻本.*
Li Xu 李詡. *Jiean laoren manbi* 戒菴老人漫筆. Ming Wanli keben 明萬曆刻本.*
Li Yu 李漁. *Xianqing ouji* 閒情偶寄. Qing Kangxi keben 清康熙刻本.*
Li Zuoxian 李佐賢. *Shuhua jianying* 書畫鑒影.*
Liang Zhangju 梁章鉅. *Langji congtan* 浪跡叢談. Qing Daoguang ershiqi nian keben 清道光二十七年刻本.*
Liu Qi 劉祁. *Guiqian zhi* 歸潛志. Qing Wuying dian juzhen ban congshu ben 清武英殿聚珍版叢書本.*
Liu Tong 劉侗, and Yu Yizheng 于奕正. *Dijing jingwu lue* 帝京景物略. Ming Chongzhen shangyou tang keben 明崇禎尚友堂刻本.*
Lü Yanzhao 呂燕昭. *Chongkan jiangning fuzhi* 重刊江寧府志. Qing Jiaqing shiliu nian xiu qing guangxu liunian kanben 清嘉慶十六年修清光絡六十年刊本.
Mao Ruizheng 莫瑞徵. *Wanli sanya zheng kao* 萬曆三萃考.*
Mao Yuanyi 茅元儀. *Wubei zhi* 武備志.*
Meng Yuanlao 孟元老. *Dongjing menghua lu* 東京夢華録. Qing Wenyuan ge siku quanshu ben 清文淵閣四庫全書本.*
Ni Qian 倪謙. *Chaoxian jishi* 朝鮮紀事. Ming chaoben 明钞本. [c.1449?]*

234


Qian Du 錢杜. Songhu huayi 松壺畫憶. Qing Guangxu yuyuan cong keben 清光緒榆園叢刻本.


Shen Chiran 沈赤然. Wuyan zhai shiwen chao 五研齋詩文鈔. Qing Jiaqing ke zengxiu ben 清嘉慶刻增修本.

Shen Defu 沈德符. Wanli yehuo bian 萬曆野獲編. Qing Daoquanguan qинian yaoshi ke tongzhi banian buxiu ben 清道光五年姚氏刻同治八年補修本.


Shen Shixing 申時行. Lunfei jiandu 綸扉簡牘.*

Shen Yiguan 沈一貫. Jingshi cao 敬事草.*


Sun Chengze 孫承澤. Gengzi xiaoxia ji 庚子銷夏記. Qing Wenyuan ge siku quanshu 清文淵閣四庫全書本.*

Sun Kuang 孫鑛. Shuhua baba 書畫跋跋. 1614. Qing Qianlong wunian keben 清乾隆五年刻本.*


Tang Xianzu 湯顯祖. Yuming tang quanjji 玉茗堂全集.*


Tian Rucheng 田汝成. *Xihu youlan zhiyu 西湖遊覽志餘*. Qing Wenyuan ge siku quanshu ben 清文淵閣四庫全書本.*


————. *Qizhen guan ji 棲真館集*. 王昶. *Guochao cizong 國朝詞綜*. Qing Jiaqing qinian wangshi sanmao yuzhuang ke zeng xiuben 清嘉慶七十年王氏三泖漁莊刻增修本.*

Wang Ao 王鏊. *Gusu zhi 姑蘇志*. Qing Wenyuan ge siku quanshu ben 清文淵閣四庫全書本.*


Wang, Shihan 汪師韓. *Tan shulu 談書錄*. Qing Qianlong ke shanghu yiji ben 清乾隆刻上湖遺集本.*


Wang Shizhen 王士珍. *Daijing tang ji 帶經堂集*. Qing Kangxi wushi nian chengzhe qilue shutang keben 清康熙五十一年程哲七略書堂刻本.*

————. *Chibei outian 池北偶談*. Qing Wenyuan ge siku quanshu ben 清文淵閣四庫全書本.*

————. *Gufuyu ting zalu 古夫于亭雜錄*. Qing Wenjuan ge siku quanshu ben 清文淵閣四庫全書本.*

Wang Shizhen 王世貞. *Yanzhou shanren sibu xugao 濟州山人四部續稿*. Qing Wenyuan ge siku quanshu ben 清文淵閣四庫全書本.*

————. *Yanzhou sibugao 濟州四部稿*. Ming Wanli keben 明萬曆刻本.*

Wang Xiangjin 王象晉. *Jiantong zaibi 剪桐載筆*. Ming Wang yuyang yishu ben 明王漁洋遺書本.*
Wei Jie 魏杰. *Cansang cuibian 蠶桑萃編. Qing Guangxu zhejiang shuju keben 清光緒浙江書局刻本.*
Wei Yuan 魏源. *Guwei tang shiji 古微堂詩集. Qing Tongzhi keben 清同治刻本.*
Wen Zhenheng 文震亨. *Zhangwu zhi 長物志. 1621. Qing Yueya tang congshu ben 清雅堂叢書本.*
Wu Rongguang 吳榮光. *Xinchou xiaoxia ji 辛丑銷夏記. Qing Daoguang keben 清道光刻本.*


Yang Zhongyi 楊鍾羲. Xueqiao shihua 雪橋詩話. Minguo Qiushu zhai congshu ben 民國求恕齋叢書本.*


Yu Shenxing 于慎行. Gushan bichen 谷山筆塵. Ming Wanli yuwei keben 明萬曆于緯刻本.*

Yu Yue 俞樾. Chaxiang shi sanchao 茶香室三鈔. Qing Guangxu ershiwu nian keben 清光緒二十五年刻本. 西南師範大學文獻館藏本.*


Zhang Chou 張丑. Qinghe shuhua fang 清河書舫. Qing Wenyuan ge siku quanshu ben 清文淵閣四庫全書本.*


Zhang Fengyi 張鳳翼. Chushi tang ji 處實堂集. Ming Wanli keben 明萬曆刻本.*

Zhang Fuzhi 張輔之. Taipu zouyi 太樸奏議.*


Zhang Shijin 張世進. Zhulao shutang ji 著老書堂集. Qing Qianlong keben 清乾隆刻本.*


Zhang Xuan 張萱. Xiyuan wenjian lu 西園聞見錄.*


Zhang Zhao 張照, Liang Shizheng 梁詩正, Li Zongwen 勳宗萬, Zhang Ruowai 張若靄, Zhuang Yougong 莊有恭, Qiu Yuexiu 裘曰修, Chen Bangyan 陳邦彥, Guan Bao 觀保, Dong Bangda 董邦達, eds. *Shiqu baoji chubian 石渠寶笈初編*. 1745. Qing Wenyuan ge siku quanshu ben 清文淵閣四庫全書本.*


Zhou Yongchun 周永春, ed. *Silun lu 絲綸錄*. *


Zhu Guozhen 朱國禎. *Yongtong xiaopin 湃幢小品*. Ming Tianqi ernian keben 明天啓二年刻本.*


Zou Yuanbiao 鄒元標. *Zou zhongjie gong zoushu 鄒忠介公奏疏*. *
Secondary sources:


Dai Liqiang 戴立強. “Qingming shanghe tu yiben kaoshu 清明上河圖異本考述.” In Liaoning sheng bowuguan 遼寧省博物館, Qingming shanghe tu yanjiu wenxian huibian 清明上河圖研究文獻匯編, 117-34.


Fu Tianzheng 傅天正, and Xu Zhuang 徐莊. “Songliaojin zaji shi 宋遼金雜技史.” In Shi Zhongwen 史仲文, Zhongguo yishu shi, zaji juan 中國藝術史，雜技卷, 283-381.

Fu Tianzheng 傅天正, Xu Zhuang 徐莊, and Fu Qifeng 傅起風. “Suitang Wudai zaji shi 隋唐五代雜技史.” In Shi Zhongwen 史仲文, Zhongguo yishu shi, zaji juan 中國藝術史，雜技卷, 189-279.


Fu Tianzheng 傅天正, Xu Zhuang 徐莊, and Xu Qiuzi 徐秋子. “Qingdei zaji shi 清代雜技史.” In Shi Zhongwen 史仲文, Zhongguo yishu shi, zaji juan 中國藝術史，雜技卷, 469-538.


Jin Weidong 金衛東. *Mingqing fengsu hua* 明清風俗畫 [Genre Paintings of the Ming and Qing Dynasties]. Hong Kong: Shangwu yinshu guan, 2008.


———. “‘Suzhou Pian’ and Other Dubious Paintings in the Received ‘Oeuvre’ of Qiu Ying.” *Artibus Asiae* 59, no. 3/4 (2000): 265-95.


Kong Xianyi 孔憲易. “Qingming shanghe tu de qingming zhiyi 清明上河圖的清明質疑.” In *Liaoqin sheng bowuguan 遼寧省博物館, Qingming shanghe tu yanjiu wenxian huibian 清明上河圖研究文獻匯編*, 557-61.


Ma Baojie 馬寶傑. “Qiu Ying Qingming shanghe tu shangxi 仇英清明上河圖賞析” [Qingming Shanghe Tu by Qiu Ying]. In Qiu Ying fang zhang zeduan qingming shanghe tu 仇英仿張擇端清明上河圖 [Qingming shanghe tu: A Fine Copy by Qiu Ying], edited by Lok On Hui, 152-59. Beijing: Wenwu chuban she, 2007.


Rowe, William T. “City and Region in the Lower Yangzi.” In Johnson, *Cities of Jiangnan in Late Imperial China*, 1-16.

Santangelo, Paolo. “Urban Society in Late Imperial Suzhou.” In Johnson, *Cities of Jiangnan in Late Imperial China*, 81-116.


Zhongyang yanjiu yuan jindai shi yanjiu suo jikan, no. 50 (2005): 115-84.


Xiao Qiongrui 蕭瓊瑞. “Qingming shanghe tu huaming yiyi de zai renshi 清明上河圖畫名意義的再認識.” In Liaoning sheng bowuguan 遼寧省博物館, Qingming shanghe tu yanjiu wenxian hui bian 清明上河圖研究文獻匯編, 569-82..


Zhang Haiying 張海英. “Mingqing jiangnan shizhen de xingzheng guanli 明清江南市鎮的行政管理.” Xueshu yuekan 40, no. 7 (July, 2008).


Appendices

Appendix A: Grouping and Dating the Popular Qingming Scrolls

The grouping of the six paintings is based on the similarity of their compositions and major motifs. Lineage I includes the Zhao Zhe version, Liaoning A, the Taipei A, and the Metropolitan version. In addition to following the composition and many motifs of the Zhao Zhe painting, both the Liaoning A and Taipei A added a drama performance in the beginning and an imperial garden at the end of the painting (Fig. 90, Fig. 91, Fig. 92, Fig. 93). Lineage II comprises the Liaoning B and the Taipei B versions. They share more similarity in composition and schemas, and differ from Lineage I paintings in many motifs such as the angle of city gate tower and the location of the acrobatic performance (Fig. 46, Fig. 47, Fig. 48, Fig. 49, Fig. 50, Fig. 51, Fig. 94, Fig. 95, Fig. 96, Fig. 97, Fig. 98, Fig. 99). Though its middle section follows the structure of Liaoning B, Taipei B includes more activities and people than Liaoning B. In addition, Taipei B concludes with a scene of palace ladies on an outing instead of the imperial garden at the end of the Liaoning B (Fig. 69, Fig. 66).

According to their inscriptions, styles, and motifs, the six paintings can be dated from the sixteenth to the eighteenth century. The Zhao Zhe version was produced in the sixteenth century, Liaoning A and B were painted in approximately the early seventeenth century. Taipei A and Taipei B were probably painted in the mid-seventeenth century, and the Metropolitan version, in the mid-eighteenth century.

At the end of the Zhao Zhe Qingming, Zhao Zhe wrote that he painted it on the first day of the first month of winter (October) in the year of Wanli dingchou (the fifth year of the Wanli reign, 1577) (Fig. 77). It is clear that this painting was executed in 1577.

\[571\] Kohora’s groups A and B, Whitfield’s groups A, B and C, and the Metropolitan version, which as Whitfield puts it, is a creative variation out of his group B and C.

\[572\] Kohora’s group C; Whitfield did not see these paintings.

\[573\] On the painting he also signed his origin as Siming, currently Ningbo, in the area of Zhejiang. Other than that, there is no other record indicating the identity of Zhao Zhe. His origin can also be identified through his use of the side of his brush to render some rocks in his Qingming scroll, which is typical of the Zhe School of painting, whereas Suzhou School painters used the tip of the brush to depict
The Liaoning A version was not dated but has been attributed to Qiu Ying. In my MA thesis I presented a convincing case that the painting was not made by Qiu Ying but by an artisan painter imitating his style. From the close imitation of Qiu Ying’s style, I showed that it was probably painted in the late sixteenth to early seventeenth century. Here, I will make a close comparison between Liaoning A with other dated prints to further confirm that it was painted in approximately the early seventeenth century. For example, the mountains with their patterning of contour lines and dots for vegetation in Liaoning A are presented in very much the same way as the print Picture of Huqiu Mountains 虎丘圖 in Newly Engraved Wonders of the Nations (Xinjuan hainei qiguan 新鐫海內奇觀) published in 1609, the mountains illustrated in Assembled Pictures of Three Realms (Sancai tuhui) published in 1610, and the mountains illustrated in the fictional Story of the Jade Pestle (Yuchu ji 玉杵記) published in 1606 (Fig. 100, Fig. 101, Fig. 102, Fig. 103). Therefore, Liaoning A was very possibly painted around the early seventeenth century.

Taipei A was also not dated; however, several marks indicate that it was painted in the mid-seventeenth century. First, the official boat with Water-quelling Beast (Zhenshui shou 鎮水獸) painted on its prow and large, whirling cloud patterns all over the side is almost identical to the official boat in the illustration of Xue Dai’s 薛旦 play Dream of Mandarin Ducks (Yuanyang meng 鴛鴦夢) published in the early Qing (Fig. 104, Fig. 105). Secondly, the slanted form and geometric patterns of the mountains at the beginning (Fig. 106) are very similar to the way the mountains were depicted in Anhui School painting and woodblock prints, which was one of the most popular styles in the

---


575 Caizhi ke 采芝客, Yuanyang meng 鴛鴦夢, Shunzhi keben 順治刻本, 656 qifeng 奇逢, in Fu, Zhongguo gudian wenxue banhua xuanji 中國古典文學版畫選集, 875.
seventeenth century after it was created by late sixteenth-century Anhui artists. Ding Yunpeng’s 丁雲鵬 (1547-c. 1621) landscape of 1585 and his design of landscape prints in the ink-cake book Fang’s Ink Cake Designs (Fangshi mopu 方氏墨譜) of 1594 are earlier examples (Fig. 107, Fig. 108). The woodblock prints of the Huang mountains in the Huang Mountain Gazetteer of the mid-seventeenth century, which copied the mountainscapes of another famous Anhui artist, Jianjiang 漸江 (1610-1663), attest to the popularity of the Anhui School’s landscape paintings (Fig. 109, Fig. 110). It is clear that the artisan of Taipei A probably adopted the popular Anhui style of landscape to render the mountain format. In addition, the brown, green and blue colors of the mountains in Taipei A share similarities with those of the mid-seventeenth century professional artist Lan Ying 藍瑛 (1585-1666). The painter used a broad, moistened brush to create a three-dimensional effect within a pale, relaxed outline. This method is called “boneless rendering” 沒骨法. It was popular in the late Ming and early Qing dynasties and was also adopted in Lan Ying’s 藍瑛 (1585-1666) Painting of White Clouds and Red Trees (Baiyun hongshu tu 白雲紅樹圖) painted in 1658 (Fig. 111). All of the above strongly suggest that the Taipei A was painted in the mid-seventeenth century.

The Liaoning B painting appears to have been circulated in the market in the early seventeenth century. One entry in Li Rihua’s diary, which was written when he retired to his home town, Jiaxing 嘉興, recorded that he saw a Qingming painting in 1609. His description of the Qingming painting he viewed was very similar to the Liaoning B version in terms of its composition and inscriptions. Yet, the only inscriber that appears on the Liaoning B but not on the Li Rihua version is the famous late-Ming scholar Chen Jiru 陳繼儒 (1558-1639). His signature and seals as they appear on Liaoning B are not identical to the signatures and seals appended to his other works (Fig. 112). However, this indicates that the Liaoning B was circulated during or after

---

577 Ibid. 154, 157.
578 Li, Weishui xuan riji 味水軒日記, juan 1, 12-13.
579 For example, Chen Jiru’s signatures and seals collected in Shanghai bowuguan 上海博物館, ed.
Chen’s active days, which were around the turn of the seventeenth century. It provides further evidence that the Liaoning B painting was most probably circulated in the market in the early seventeenth century.

As for Taipei B, some figures are shown wearing the headgear piaopiao jin 凱凱巾, which does not appear in Liaoning B. This headgear was very popular in the mid-seventeenth century and appeared in many illustrations of late Ming to early Qing fiction and plays (Fig. 113, Fig. 114). This strongly suggests that the Taipei B was not produced until the mid-seventeenth century and thus can be assigned a date later than Liaoning B.  

The Metropolitan version was probably painted around the mid-eighteenth century. This painting, distinct from the above-mentioned Qingming paintings, features a bird’s-eye view from a greater distance, a more convincing rendering of three-dimensional structures and interior spaces, and more reasonable proportions between the architecture and figures. Art historians have noticed that since the mid-seventeenth century, some artists in southern China began paying attention to rendering space in a more accurate way. This trend became more obvious when paintings and prints from Europe started to influence the prints in Suzhou and the court paintings by Jiangnan painters in the eighteenth century. Though these artists did not use a fixed light source for shading or a firm standpoint for linear perspective as in Western paintings, they created a hybrid Sino-Western pictorial style, which depicts space and three-dimensionality of objects in a more convincing way. The similarity in rendering architecture and space, as well as the height of the bird’s-eye view between the

---

Zhongguo shuhua jia yinjian kuanshi 中國書畫家印鑑款識 (Beijing: Wenwu chuban she, 2005), 1096-1100.

Some scholars noticed the similarity between the Liaoning B type of Qingming scrolls and the Taipei B, but were not certain about which one was produced earlier, see Weng Tongwen 翁同文, “Lun qingming yijian tu shi mingdai moben 论清明易简图是明代摹本,” in Liaoning sheng bowuguan 遼寧省博物館, Qingming shanghe tu yanjiu wenxian huibian 清明上河圖研究文獻匯編, 38-41.

Cahill, The Compelling Image: Nature and Style in Seventeenth-Century Chinese Painting: 17-22. Cahill argues that this was inspired by the engravings from Europe that appeared in Jiangnan of the time.

Metropolitan version and eighteenth-century prints and paintings, such as the Suzhou print series *Three Hundred Sixty Occupations* (*Sanbai liushi hang* 三百六十行) produced in 1734, the Qing court-sponsored *Qingming shanghe tu* executed by court painters from Suzhou from 1728 to 1737, and *Burgeoning Life in a Resplendent Age* (*Shengshi zesheng tu* 盛世滋生圖) painted by the Suzhou artist Xu Yang 徐楊 in 1759, convincingly demonstrates that the Metropolitan version was painted around the mid-eighteenth century (Fig. 115; Fig. 116; Fig. 117; Fig. 118). (See table 3)
## Appendix B: Tables

### Table 1  The Six Versions of Qingming Paintings Currently under Study

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Painting</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Short form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Zhao Zhe, <em>Qingming shanghe tu</em>, 1577, ink and color on silk, 28.7 x 576 cm</td>
<td>Hayashibara Museum of Art (Japan)</td>
<td>Zhao Zhe version</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anonymous (fake Qiu Ying), <em>Qingming shanghe tu</em>, Early seventeenth century, ink and color on silk, 30.5 x 987.5 cm</td>
<td>The Liaoning Provincial Museum (China) (no. 4931-233)</td>
<td>Liaoning A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anonymous (fake Zhang Zeduan), <em>Qingming shanghe tu</em>, Early seventeenth century, ink and color on silk, 30.6 x 725.6 cm</td>
<td>The Liaoning Provincial Museum (China) (no. 4865-167)</td>
<td>Liaoning B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anonymous (fake Qiu Ying), <em>Qingming shanghe tu</em>, Mid-seventeenth century, ink and color on silk, 34.8 x 804.2 cm</td>
<td>The National Palace Museum (Taipei, Taiwan) (no. guhuabing 故畫丙 01.10.01605)</td>
<td>Taipei A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anonymous (fake Zhang Zeduan), <em>Qingming yijian tu</em> (Qingming in Brief) Mid-seventeenth century, ink and color on silk, 38 x 673.4 cm</td>
<td>The National Palace Museum (Taipei, Taiwan) (no. guhuayi 故畫乙 01.08.00990)</td>
<td>Taipei B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anonymous (fake Qiu Ying), <em>Qingming shanghe tu</em>, Mid-eighteenth century, ink and color on silk, 24.8 x 1005.84 cm</td>
<td>Metropolitan Museum of Art (New York, USA) (no. 47.18.1)</td>
<td>Metropolitan version</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table 2  Viewers/Collectors of the Popular Versions of *Qingming Shanghe Tu*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Viewers/collectors</th>
<th>Social status$^{583}$</th>
<th>Attributed painter/version</th>
<th>Comments on the painting</th>
<th>Comments on the Theme</th>
<th>Sources$^{584}$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>文徵明 1470-1559</td>
<td>Tribute student of national academy gongsheng 貢生; 翰林院待詔</td>
<td>Zhang Zeduan</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>張鳳翼 處實堂集 後集, 卷五, 523.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>繆東洲 1498-1564</td>
<td>Metropolitan graduate jinshi 進士 (1544); 奉和縣令$^{583}$</td>
<td>Qiu Ying moben</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>邵圭潔 北虞遺文 卷六, 86.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>王世貞 1526-1590</td>
<td>jinshi (1547); 刑部尚書</td>
<td>- Zhang Zeduan - yanben - Huang Biao</td>
<td>工緻可念乏腕力</td>
<td>Bianjing prosperity</td>
<td>王世貞 登州山人四部續稿 卷一百六十八, 文部, 1814.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>張隹胤 1527-1588</td>
<td>jinshi (1550); 龜遼總督</td>
<td>anonymous linben</td>
<td>臨本甚佳</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>王象晋 剪桐載筆 3, 4.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>邵圭潔 1549 alive in 1549</td>
<td>Provincial graduate juren 舉人 (1549); 德清教諭</td>
<td>Qiu Ying moben</td>
<td>極入毛髪 巧窮心腑 氣韻生動</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>邵圭潔 北虞遺文 卷六, 86.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>張俊翼 1527-1613</td>
<td>juren (1564)</td>
<td>Sheng Mao 盛懋 linben</td>
<td>本來面目 繼悉具備; 擎寫惟肖</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>張俊翼 處實堂集 後集, 卷五, 523.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>張應文 1535-1595</td>
<td>Student of national academy jiansheng 監生</td>
<td>Zhang Zeduan</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>張應文 清秘藏 卷下, 25.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>孫鑛 1542-1613</td>
<td>jinshi (1574); 南京兵部尚書</td>
<td>anonymous; Huang Biao</td>
<td>anonymous; 筆法絲</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>孫鑛 書畫跋跋 續卷三, 畫, 146-147.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

$^{583}$ Unless otherwise specified, sources of the dates of birth and death and social status of the viewers and collectors are: Arthur W. Hummel, *Eminent Chinese of the Ch’ing Period* (1644-1912); Guoli zhongyang tushu guan 國立中央圖書館, *Mingren zhuanji ziliao suoyin* 明人傳記資料索引; *Lidai mingren shiming biehao cidian* 歷代名人室名別號辭典 (Taiyuan: Shangxi guji chuban she, 1998); Xie, *Zhongguo huaxue zhi zhidao* 中國畫學著作考錄; *Zhongguo lidai renming da cidian* 中國歷代人名大辭典 (Shanghai: Shanghai guji chuban she, 1999); and/or *Zhongguo meishu jia renming cidian* 中國美術家人名辭典; *Qingdai jinshi cidian* 清代進士辭典 (Beijing: Zhongguo wenshi, 2004).

$^{584}$ Sources of the pre-modern texts in this table are taken from the *Zhongguo jiben guji ku* unless otherwise specified.

$^{585}$ Chang, “Changshu Yushan Mingdai Miu Xuan mu fajui jianbao 常熟虞山明代繆宣墓發掘簡報.”

260
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Viewers/collectors</th>
<th>Social status</th>
<th>Attributed painter/version</th>
<th>Comments on the painting</th>
<th>Comments on the Theme</th>
<th>Sources</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>萬世德 1548-1602</td>
<td>Jinshi (1571); 華遜總督右都御史</td>
<td>Zhao Zhe</td>
<td>拙陋</td>
<td>Urban peace and prosperity</td>
<td>Image provided by Hayashibara Museum of Art</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>董其昌 1555-1636</td>
<td>Jinshi (1589); 南京禮部尚書</td>
<td>Zhang Zeduan</td>
<td>筆法纖細，惜骨力乏耳</td>
<td>Bianjing prosperity</td>
<td>董其昌</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>李日華 1565-1635</td>
<td>Jinshi (1592); 太僕少卿</td>
<td>Zhang Zeduan</td>
<td>繽巧</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>李日華</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>linben</td>
<td>大小繁簡不一</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>張丑 1577-1643</td>
<td>Government student zhusheng 諸生</td>
<td>anonymous</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>張丑</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>沈德符 1578-1642</td>
<td>Juren (1618)</td>
<td>anonymous</td>
<td>Bianjing prosperity</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>沈德符</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Several linben</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Bianjing prosperity</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14.</td>
<td>鞏永固 ？-1644</td>
<td>駙馬都尉（光宗婿）</td>
<td>Sheng Mao</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>方以智</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15.</td>
<td>焦周 1600</td>
<td>Juren (1600); 修撰; 焦竑之子</td>
<td>fenben</td>
<td>曲盡其意態，汴京</td>
<td>Bianjing prosperity</td>
<td>焦周</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

586 Chen, Chen xueshi xiansheng chuji 陳學士先生初集, juan 13, 237, 238, 241.
587 Li, Zitao xuan zazhui 3 juan, you zhu 3 juan 紫桃軒雜綴 3 卷，又綴 3 卷: 400.
588 Lü Yanzhao 吳燕昭, Chongkan jiangning fuzhi 重刊江寧府志 (Qing Jiaqing shiliu nian xiu qing guangxu liunian kanben 清嘉慶十六年修清光緒六年刊本), juan 31, 1244 & juan 54, 2104.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Viewers/collectors</th>
<th>Social status</th>
<th>Attributed painter/ version</th>
<th>Comments on the painting</th>
<th>Comments on the Theme</th>
<th>Sources</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Zhang Zeduan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16.</td>
<td>胡維霖</td>
<td>Jinshi (1613); 福建左布政使</td>
<td>Jiang Zeduan</td>
<td>霞氣可見，動靜可見聞</td>
<td>Bianjing prosperity</td>
<td>胡維霖 胡維霖集</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17.</td>
<td>黎遂球</td>
<td>Juren (1627); 兵部主事</td>
<td>copies</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>黎遂球 廟藏閣集</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18.</td>
<td>魏謙益</td>
<td>Jinshi (1610); 禮部侍郎</td>
<td>Zhang Zeduan</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>孫承澤</td>
<td>1582-1664</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19.</td>
<td>譚貞默</td>
<td>Jinshi (1628); 國子監祭酒</td>
<td>Zhang Zeduan</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>李日華</td>
<td>1590-1665</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20.</td>
<td>孫承澤</td>
<td>Jinshi (1631); 吏部左侍郎</td>
<td>Zhang Zeduan</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>孫承澤</td>
<td>1592-1676</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21.</td>
<td>熊文舉</td>
<td>Jinshi (1631); 兵部左侍郎</td>
<td>anonymous</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>熊文舉</td>
<td>1669</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22.</td>
<td>張岱</td>
<td>1597-after 1667</td>
<td>Writer</td>
<td>copy</td>
<td>張岱</td>
<td>1611-1671</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23.</td>
<td>方以智</td>
<td>Jinshi (1640); 翰林院檢討</td>
<td>Two Sheng Mao fangben</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>以江南寫汴京</td>
<td>1667</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24.</td>
<td>彭孫貽</td>
<td>Late Ming-early Qing</td>
<td>Gongsheg</td>
<td>Zhang Zeduan</td>
<td>Bianjing prosperity</td>
<td>1704</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25.</td>
<td>潘江</td>
<td>Late Ming-early</td>
<td>Writer; 桐城寓文人</td>
<td>Zhang Zeduan</td>
<td>Bianjing/ Northern Song</td>
<td>1704</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

589 Huang Tingjin 黃廷金, Ruizhou fuzhi 瑞州府志 (Qing Tongzhi shier nian kanben 清同治十二年刊本), juan 13, 1060; Zeng Guofan 曾國藩, Jiangxi tongzhi 江西通志 (Qing Guanxu qinian keben 清光緒七年刻本), juan 106, 8891.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Viewers/collectors</th>
<th>Social status</th>
<th>Attributed painter/ version</th>
<th>Comments on the painting</th>
<th>Comments on the Theme</th>
<th>Sources</th>
<th>author</th>
<th>title</th>
<th>Juan, page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>26.</td>
<td>陳維崧</td>
<td>1625-1682 Writer; 博學鴻詞科 (1679); 翰林院檢討</td>
<td>copy</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Bianjing prosperity</td>
<td>陳維崧</td>
<td>陳迦陵文集</td>
<td>卷二, 18-19.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27.</td>
<td>王士禎</td>
<td>1634-1711 Jinshi (1658); 刑部尚書</td>
<td>Zhao Zhe</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Bianjing prosperity</td>
<td>王士禎</td>
<td>漁洋山人精華錄</td>
<td>卷九, 145.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>anonymous</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Bianjing prosperity</td>
<td>王士禎</td>
<td>帶經堂集</td>
<td>卷三十二, 漁洋續詩十五, 263.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28.</td>
<td>張篤慶</td>
<td></td>
<td>Qiu Ying</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>張維屏</td>
<td>郭朝詩人徵略</td>
<td>卷十四, 125.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29.</td>
<td>禹之鼎</td>
<td>1647-? court painter; 鴻臚寺序班</td>
<td>anonymous</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>孫原湘</td>
<td>天真閣集</td>
<td>卷二十九詩二十九, 548-549.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30.</td>
<td>查慎行</td>
<td>1650-1727 Jinshi (1703); 翰林院編修</td>
<td>Zhang Zeduan</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>查慎行</td>
<td>人海記</td>
<td>卷下, 66.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31.</td>
<td>玄燁</td>
<td>1654-1722 Kangxi Emperor (1662-1722)</td>
<td>anonymous</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Bianjing prosperity</td>
<td>孫岳頒, 宋駿業, 王原祁, 吳啓, 王銓</td>
<td>錦文齋書畫譜</td>
<td>卷六十七, 御製書畫跋, 1699.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32.</td>
<td>沈德潛</td>
<td>1673-1769 Jinshi (1739); 禮部侍郎</td>
<td>Zhang Zeduan; Yijian tu 易簡圖</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Northern Song prosperity</td>
<td>沈德潛</td>
<td>歸懋詩鈔餘集</td>
<td>卷十, 92.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33.</td>
<td>高鳳翰</td>
<td>1683-1748 Zhusheng; artist; 知縣</td>
<td>Zhao Zhe</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Image provided by Hayashibara Museum of Art</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34.</td>
<td>張照</td>
<td>1691-1745 Jinshi (1709); 刑部尚書</td>
<td>gaoben</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Qiu Ying (Taipei A)</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Northern Song prosperity</td>
<td>張照, et al.</td>
<td>石渠寶笈初編</td>
<td>卷六, 貯乾清宮, 126.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Zhang Zeduan</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Zhang Zeduan (Taipei B)</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35.</td>
<td>梁詩正</td>
<td>1697-1763 Jinshi (1730); 東閣大學士</td>
<td>Qiu Ying</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Northern Song prosperity</td>
<td>張照, et al.</td>
<td>石渠寶笈初編</td>
<td>卷二十五, 貯重華宮, 449-450.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36.</td>
<td>周長發</td>
<td>1696-1777 Jinshi (1724); 侍講學士</td>
<td>Qiu Ying moben</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Northern Song prosperity</td>
<td>周長發</td>
<td>賜書堂詩鈔</td>
<td>卷四, 47.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37.</td>
<td>弘曆</td>
<td>1711-1799 寶親王 (1733-1735)</td>
<td>Qiu Ying (Taipei A)</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Northern Song prosperity</td>
<td>張廷玉, et al.</td>
<td>皇清文頴</td>
<td>卷首二十一, 171-172.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Viewers/collectors</td>
<td>Social status</td>
<td>Attributed painter/version</td>
<td>Comments on the painting</td>
<td>Comments on the Theme</td>
<td>Sources</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>---------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Qianlong Emperor (1735-1795)</td>
<td>Zhang Zeduan; Yi Jian tu 易簡圖</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Northern Song prosperity</td>
<td>張照, et al. 石渠寶笈初編 卷二十五, 貯重華宮, 449-450.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Zhang Zeduan</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td></td>
<td>張照, et al. 石渠寶笈初編 卷三十四, 貯御書房七, 649.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>583</td>
<td>Qiu Ying (Taipei A)</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td></td>
<td>王杰, et al. 石渠寶笈續編 卷七, 乾清宮藏七.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>584</td>
<td>Zhang Zeduan; Yi Jian tu 易簡圖</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Bianjing prosperity</td>
<td>鎮志通志 白旗通志 (Qing Wenyuan ke si ku quanshu ben 清文淵閣四庫全書本), juan 120, 1374.</td>
<td>591</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38. 弘晝 1720-1792</td>
<td>Prince 和親王; 雍正第五子</td>
<td>Zhang Zeduan</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Northern Song prosperity</td>
<td>張九鉞 紫峴山人全集 卷七, 122.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39. 張九鉞 1721-1803</td>
<td>Jurén (1762); 知縣</td>
<td>copy</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Bustling and prosperity</td>
<td>張九鉞 紫峴山人全集 詩集, 卷二十五, 407.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40. 王杰 1725-1805</td>
<td>Jinshi (1761); 東閣大學士</td>
<td>Qiu Ying</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>王杰, et al. 石渠寶笈續編 乾清宮藏七.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41. 蔣士銓 1725-1785</td>
<td>Jinshi (1757); 翰林院編修</td>
<td>copy</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Bustling and prosperity</td>
<td>蔣士銓 忠雅堂文集 卷十七, 195-196.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42. 宋思仁 1730-1807</td>
<td>Zhusheng; 泰安知府山東糧道</td>
<td>Zhao Zhe</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Peaceful scenes</td>
<td>Image provided by Hayashibara Museum of Art</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43. 吳蘭 1733-1813</td>
<td>Gongsheng</td>
<td>copy</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Peace and prosperity</td>
<td>吳蘭 愚谷文存 卷十四, 134.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44. 翁方綱 1733-1818</td>
<td>Jinshi (1752); 內閣學士</td>
<td>Zhao Zhe</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Northern Song prosperity</td>
<td>翁方綱 復初齋詩集 卷四十三, 小石帆亭稿上, 487.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45. 沈初 1735-1799</td>
<td>Jinshi (1763); 戶部尚書</td>
<td>Zhang Zeduan; Yi Jian tu 易簡圖</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>沈初 西清筆記 卷二, 10.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

592 Ibid., 1073, juan 54, ningshou gong cang 宁壽宮藏十一: 66.
593 Baqi tongzhi 八旗通志 (Qing Wenyuan ke si ku quanshu ben 清文淵閣四庫全書本), juan 120, 1374.
595 Zhongguo wenxue jia da cidian, Qingdai juan 中國文學家大辭典, 清代卷 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 1996), 320.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Viewers/collectors</th>
<th>Social status</th>
<th>Attributed painter/ version</th>
<th>Comments on the painting</th>
<th>Comments on the Theme</th>
<th>Sources</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td>桂馥</td>
<td>1736-1805</td>
<td>Jinshi (1790):知縣</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Image provided by Hayashibara Museum of Art</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td>沈東然</td>
<td>1745-1816</td>
<td>Juren (1765): 知縣</td>
<td>Zhao Boju linben</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Bianjing prosperity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48</td>
<td>吳錫麒</td>
<td>1746-1818</td>
<td>Jinshi (1775):國子監祭酒</td>
<td>copy</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Peace and prosperity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>49</td>
<td>張世進</td>
<td>Around Qianlong period (1736-1795)</td>
<td>Gongsheng: 阜陽訓導 linben</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Bianjing prosperity</td>
<td>張世進 著老書堂集 卷五. 48.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50</td>
<td>顧鏡</td>
<td>1720-1792</td>
<td>Jinshi (1754): 寧府主事</td>
<td>copy</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>About excess, temple fair, and singing and dancing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>51</td>
<td>金瑗</td>
<td>Around Qianlong period (1736-1795)</td>
<td>Government student Xiucai (1757)</td>
<td>Qiu Ying</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>52</td>
<td>吳人冀</td>
<td>1766: 山東萊州知府</td>
<td>Jinshi</td>
<td>Zhao Zhe</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>53</td>
<td>周利親</td>
<td>Zhusheng: 周春之子</td>
<td>Zhang Zeduan moben</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Northern Song prosperity</td>
<td>Image provided by Hayashibara Museum of Art</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

596 Li, Yangzhou huafang lu 揚州畫舫録, juan 4, 51; Wang Chang 王昶, Guochoo cizong 國朝詞綜 (Qing Jiaqing qinian wangshi sanmao yuzhuang ke zeng xiuben 清嘉慶七年王氏三泖漁莊刻增修本), juan 30, 256; Wu Kunxiu 吳坤修, Chongxiu anhui tongzhi 重修安徽通志 (Qing Guangxu sinian keben 清光緒四年刻本), juan 127, 5163.


598 Zhou Chun 周春, Maoyu shihua 老餘詩話 (Qing Chaoben 清鈔本, n.d.), juan 4, 21.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Viewers/collectors</th>
<th>Social status</th>
<th>Attributed painter/ version</th>
<th>Comments on the painting</th>
<th>Comments on the Theme</th>
<th>Sources</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>54</td>
<td>孫星衍</td>
<td>Jinshi (1787)</td>
<td>Qiu Ying</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>孫星衍平津館藏書畫記</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55</td>
<td>阮元</td>
<td>Jinshi (1789); 體仁閣大學士</td>
<td>copy</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>卷四, 30.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>56</td>
<td>錢泳</td>
<td>Gongseng; 慕客</td>
<td>Zhang Zeduan</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>錢泳履園飄話卷十, 146-147.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>57</td>
<td>孫原湘</td>
<td>Jinshi (1805); 武英殿協修</td>
<td>anonymous</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Northern Song prosperity</td>
<td>孫原湘天真閣集卷二十九, 詩二十九, 548-549.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>58</td>
<td>石承藻</td>
<td>Jinshi (1808); 御史, 工科給事中</td>
<td>copy</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Northern Song prosperity</td>
<td>沅湘耆舊集卷一百四十一, 1771.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>59</td>
<td>錢杜</td>
<td>Student of national academy by protection yinsheng 藩生: 主事</td>
<td>Shi Tao 石濤</td>
<td>用筆細秀古拙</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>錢杜松壑畫憶卷下, 20.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60</td>
<td>吳榮光</td>
<td>Jinshi (1799);湖廣總督</td>
<td>Qiu Ying moben</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Northern Song prosperity</td>
<td>吳榮光石雲山人集文集, 卷五, 311.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>61</td>
<td>馮雲鵬</td>
<td>Around Qianlong-Daoguang era (1736-1850) Poet</td>
<td>Qiu Ying</td>
<td>畫極工細</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>馮雲鵬掃紅亭吟稿卷九, 古近體詩, 151.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>62</td>
<td>童槐</td>
<td>Jinshi (1805); 通政使司副使</td>
<td>copy</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Peaceful scenes</td>
<td>童槐今白華堂詩錄卷八, 近體詩, 81.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>63</td>
<td>梁章鉅</td>
<td>Jinshi (1802); 兩江總督</td>
<td>Qiu Ying</td>
<td>特生動精詣…尤見筆意</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>梁章鉅退菴詩存卷二十二, 218.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>64</td>
<td>謝堃</td>
<td>Zhusheng; 曲阜屯田郎</td>
<td>Zhang Zeduan</td>
<td>工細中有</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>書畫所見錄卷20.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


600 Zhongguo wenxue jia da cidian, Qingdai juan 中國文學家大辭典, 清代卷, 125.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Viewers/collectors</th>
<th>Social status</th>
<th>Attributed painter/version</th>
<th>Comments on the painting</th>
<th>Comments on the Theme</th>
<th>Sources</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>author</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>583</td>
<td>Qiu Ying</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Ying Baoshi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>584</td>
<td>Ming Zhen 閔貞</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Ying Baoshi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65.</td>
<td>徐寶善 1790-1838</td>
<td>Jinshi (1820): 當監御史</td>
<td>Qiu Ying</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Bianjing prosperity</td>
<td>徐寶善 壟圖詩鈔選 卷十, 還壹集, 44.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>66.</td>
<td>魏源 1794-1857</td>
<td>Jinshi (1845): 高郵州知州</td>
<td>Guo Xi</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Peaceful scenes</td>
<td>魏源 古微堂詩集 卷十, 112.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>67.</td>
<td>戴熙 1801-1860</td>
<td>Jinshi (1832): 兵部右侍郎</td>
<td>copy</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>戴熙 習苦齋畫絮 卷六, 95.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>68.</td>
<td>程鴻紹 ?-1874</td>
<td>Juren (1849): 桐城派文人</td>
<td>Zhang Zeduan</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>程鴻紹 有恒心齋集 迎厲筆記, 7-9.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>69.</td>
<td>劉德六 1805-1875</td>
<td>Professional painter</td>
<td>anonymous</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>孫原湘 天真閣集 卷二十九. 詩二十九, 548-549.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>70.</td>
<td>鄭珍 1806-1864</td>
<td>Juren (1837): 荔波縣訓導</td>
<td>Qiu Ying</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>鄭珍 巢經巢詩文集 詩後集, 卷三, 236.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>71.</td>
<td>李佐賢 1807-1876</td>
<td>Jinshi (1835)</td>
<td>Zhang Zeduan</td>
<td>細入毫芒, N/A</td>
<td>李佐賢 石泉書屋類稿 卷六, 書畫題跋, 57.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>72.</td>
<td>王慶勳 Around Xianfeng period (1851-1861)</td>
<td>Gongsheng: 廣州知府</td>
<td>Qiu Ying</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>王慶勳 貞安堂詩稿 二集, 卷一, 和箋集上, 88-89.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>73.</td>
<td>方濬頤 1815-1889</td>
<td>Jinshi (1844): 西川按察使</td>
<td>copy</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>方濬頤 夢園書畫錄 卷四, 46.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>74.</td>
<td>黃崇惺 1829/1831-1896/1898</td>
<td>Jinshi (1869)</td>
<td>Zhang Zeduan</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>黃崇惺 草心樓讀畫集502</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>75.</td>
<td>杜瑞聯 1852</td>
<td>Jinshi (1852)</td>
<td>Qiu Ying</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>杜瑞聯 古芬閣書畫記 卷十五, 53-54.603</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>76.</td>
<td>楊恩壽 1835-1891</td>
<td>Juren (1870)</td>
<td>Qiu Ying</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>楊恩壽 眼福編 初集, 卷十一, 3.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

601 Ying Baoshi 應寶時, Shanghai xianzhi 上海縣志 (Qing Tongzhi shiyi nian kenben 清同治十一年刊本), juan 21, 1679-1680.  
603 Du Ruilian, Gufen ge shuhua j (Qing Guangxu qinan keben 清光緒七年刻本), juan 15, 53-54, cited by ibid., 779.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Viewers/collectors</th>
<th>Social status</th>
<th>Attributed painter/ version</th>
<th>Comments on the painting</th>
<th>Comments on the Theme</th>
<th>Sources</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>77.</td>
<td>張薰桓</td>
<td>1837-1900</td>
<td>戶部左侍郎</td>
<td>Linsuo ben 縮臨本</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>78.</td>
<td>陳作霖</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Linsuo ben 縮臨本</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>79.</td>
<td>陸心源</td>
<td>1834-1894</td>
<td>Juren (1859); 福建鹽運使</td>
<td>Zhang Zeduan</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Bianjing prosperity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>80.</td>
<td>繆荃孫</td>
<td>1844-1919</td>
<td>Jinshi (1876)</td>
<td>copy</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Northern Song prosperity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>81.</td>
<td>震鈞</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Juren (1889); Manchu noble</td>
<td>copy</td>
<td>Bustling and prosperity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>82.</td>
<td>史澄</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Jinshi (1840); 翰林院編修</td>
<td>copy</td>
<td>Peace and prosperity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>83.</td>
<td>楊恩壽</td>
<td>1835-1891</td>
<td>Juren (1870)</td>
<td>Qiu Ying</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Northern Song prosperity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>84.</td>
<td>裴景福</td>
<td>1865-1937</td>
<td>Jinshi (1894)</td>
<td>Qiu Ying</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

604 Xu Shichang 徐世昌, *Wangqing yi shihui* 晚晴簃詩匯 (Minguo tuigeng tang keben 民國退耕堂刻本, juan 170, 3897).
605 Zhao, *Qingshi gao* 清史稿, *juan 486, liezhuan 273, wenyan 3, 13436*; Yang Zhongyi 楊鍾羲, *Xueqiao shihua* 雪橋詩話 (Minguo Qiushu zhai congshu ben 民國求恕齋叢書本, *juan 8, 1678*).
607 Pei Jingfu, *Zhuangtao ge shuhua lu* *juan 10, 43a-45b* (repr., Shanghai: Zhonghua shuju, 1937), cited by ibid., 779.
Table 3  Grouping and Dating the Selected Six *Qingming* Scrolls

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Lineage</th>
<th>Late sixteenth century</th>
<th>Early seventeenth century</th>
<th>Mid-seventeenth century</th>
<th>Mid-eighteenth century</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I Zhao Zhe version</td>
<td>Liaoning A</td>
<td>Taipei A</td>
<td>Metropolitan version</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II</td>
<td>Liaoning B</td>
<td>Taipei B</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business</td>
<td>Paintings</td>
<td>Zhao Zhe</td>
<td>Liaoning A</td>
<td>Taipei A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Textile-related business</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Silk</td>
<td>Silk fabric</td>
<td>store</td>
<td>v</td>
<td>v (sha 紗, luo 羅 duan 段, juan 綹)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>booth</td>
<td>v (ling jian ling luo 零剪菱羅)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Silk sock store</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Silk thread/yarn store</td>
<td></td>
<td>v</td>
<td>v (honglü xijuan xianpu 紅緞細紗線舖)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cotton</td>
<td>Cotton fabric</td>
<td>booth</td>
<td>v</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>peddler</td>
<td>v</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>store</td>
<td>v (budian 布店)</td>
<td>v (mumian 木綿)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>middleman</td>
<td>v (yake shou mianhua 與客收棉花)</td>
<td>v (yahang 牙行)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>maker</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cotton yarn store</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cotton raw fiber store</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dye house</td>
<td>with calender</td>
<td>v</td>
<td>v</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>no calender</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dye stuff</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ready-made garment</td>
<td></td>
<td>v</td>
<td>v</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tailor’s shop</td>
<td></td>
<td>v</td>
<td>v</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Socks</td>
<td></td>
<td>v</td>
<td>v</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4 Urban Economy
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Business</th>
<th>Paintings</th>
<th>Zhao Zhe</th>
<th>Liaoning A</th>
<th>Taipei A</th>
<th>Liaoning B</th>
<th>Taipei B</th>
<th>Metropolitan version</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Handkerchief</td>
<td>v v</td>
<td>v v</td>
<td>v</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Antique/painting</td>
<td>Shop</td>
<td>v v</td>
<td>v</td>
<td>v</td>
<td>v</td>
<td>v</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Booth</td>
<td></td>
<td>v</td>
<td></td>
<td>v</td>
<td>v</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Peddler</td>
<td>v v</td>
<td>v</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Imported goods</td>
<td>From other regions of China, other than Jiangnan</td>
<td>Shanxi</td>
<td>v</td>
<td>v (zhan 毡)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Lanzhou</td>
<td></td>
<td>v (rong 绒)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Shangdong</td>
<td></td>
<td>v</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Sichuan, Guangdong and Guangxi (ChuanGuang 川</td>
<td></td>
<td>v</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>From Overseas</td>
<td>Japan</td>
<td>v fan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Guangnan</td>
<td></td>
<td>v</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>South Oceans</td>
<td>v v</td>
<td>v</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Western Oceans</td>
<td>v v</td>
<td>v</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service industry</td>
<td>Agent</td>
<td>v v</td>
<td>v v</td>
<td>v v</td>
<td>v v</td>
<td>v v</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Carts for hire</td>
<td>v v</td>
<td>v v</td>
<td>v v</td>
<td>v</td>
<td>v v</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cargo storage</td>
<td>v v</td>
<td>v</td>
<td></td>
<td>v</td>
<td>v</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Accommodation</td>
<td></td>
<td>v v</td>
<td>v v</td>
<td>v v</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Currency molding</td>
<td>v v</td>
<td>v</td>
<td></td>
<td>v</td>
<td>v</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Currency exchange</td>
<td>v v</td>
<td>v</td>
<td></td>
<td>v</td>
<td>v</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 5  Gender Relationship and Images of Women

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Lineage I</th>
<th>Lineage II</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Zhao Zhe version</td>
<td>Liaoning A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Males</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Upper class</td>
<td>enjoy leisure</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>enjoy valuables</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>enjoy women’s services</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ordinary men/commoners</td>
<td>work/public space</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boys</td>
<td>play/public space</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Females</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Domestic space</td>
<td>Upper class</td>
<td>stay with female family or son</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>embroidering</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>play in private garden</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>peeping out at a bridal procession</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>watch outdoor drama performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public space</td>
<td>Upper class</td>
<td>visit temple</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>travel by curtained sedan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>travel by boat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>watch a bridal procession</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>watch outdoor drama performance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>appear on the street</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ordinary women/vulgar commoner</td>
<td>visit temple</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>merchants’ wives helping in stores</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>vender</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>matchmaker</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>maidservant</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>singing girls</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>dancing girls/musicians</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>brothel workers</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>appear on the street</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Religion</td>
<td>Painting</td>
<td>Lineage I</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Zhao Zhe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buddhism</td>
<td>Quiet monastery</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Temple with pilgrims</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Monks fundraising</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Store selling Buddhist commodities</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Daoism</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Folk Cults</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Watching performance</td>
<td>Entertainment</td>
<td>Zhao Zhe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Storytelling</td>
<td>v (shoushu)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dancing</td>
<td>v</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Drama</td>
<td>v</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Puppet show</td>
<td>v</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Juggling</td>
<td>hand-juggling with cymbals v</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>foot-juggling with jar v</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Watching performance</td>
<td>Wrestling or boxing v</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acrobatic</td>
<td>v</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Horse show/Equestrian</td>
<td>v</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monkey show</td>
<td>v</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dog show</td>
<td>v</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tightrope walking</td>
<td>v</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acrobat on a pole</td>
<td>v</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acrobat on stacked tables</td>
<td>v</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Walking on stilts</td>
<td>v</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lion dance</td>
<td>v</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Little girl acrobat</td>
<td>v</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Magic show</td>
<td>v</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cock fight</td>
<td>v</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engaging on leisure activities</td>
<td>Riding and mounted archery v</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Swinging</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Football-kicking</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Appreciating artworks/antiques</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Tea tasting</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Board games</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Boating (or boat racing)</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Playing zither</td>
<td>v (palace lady, elite woman and scholars)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Grass game</td>
<td>v (boys)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Throwing arrows into a jar</td>
<td>v</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Entertainment</td>
<td>Lineage I</td>
<td>Lineage II</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Zhao Zhe</td>
<td>Liaoning A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fishing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hunting</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dicing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix C: Figures

Fig. 1. Zhang Zeduan, *Qingming shanghe tu*, Northern Song, ink and color on silk, 24.8 x 528.7 cm, Palace Museum, Beijing.
Fig. 2. Zhao Zhe, *Qingming shanghe tu*, 1577, ink and color on silk, 28.7 x 576 cm, Hayashibara Museum of Art (Zhao Zhe version).
Fig. 3. Anonymous (fake Qiu Ying), *Qingming shanghe tu*, early seventeenth century, ink and color on silk, 30.5 x 987.5 cm, Liaoning Provincial Museum (Liaoning A).
Fig. 4. Anonymous (fake Zhang Zeduan), *Qingming shanghe tu*, early seventeenth century, ink and color on silk, 30.6 × 725.6 cm, Liaoning Provincial Museum (Liaoning B).
Fig. 5. Anonymous (fake Qiu Ying). *Qingming shanghe tu*, mid-seventeenth century, ink and color on silk, 34.8 x 804.2 cm, National Palace Museum, Taipei (Taipei A).
Fig. 6. Anonymous (fake Zhang Zeduan). *Qingming yijian tu (Qingming in Brief)*, mid-seventeenth century, ink and color on silk, 38 x 673.4 cm, National Palace Museum, Taipei (Taipei B).
Fig. 7. Anonymous (fake Qiu Ying), *Qingming shanghe tu*, eighteenth century, ink and color on silk, 24.8 x 1005.84 cm, Metropolitan Museum of Art (Metropolitan version).
Fig. 8. Qiu Ying, *Mountain Birds by a Pine Stream*, leaf of the album *Paintings in the Styles of Song Masters*, ink and color on silk, 27.2 x 25.2 cm, Shanghai Museum.

Fig. 9. Anonymous, *Mountain Birds by a Pine Stream*, Southern Song Dynasty, album leaf, ink and color on silk, 25.3 x 25.3 cm. Palace Museum, Beijing.
Fig. 10. Qiu Ying, section of *Spring Morning in the Han Palace*, handscroll, ink and color on silk, 30.6 x 574.1 cm, National Palace Museum, Taipei.

Fig. 11. Attributed to Song Huizong (Zhao Ji), section of *Palace Ladies Preparing Silk*, handscroll, ink and color on silk, 37 x 147 cm, Museum of Fine Art, Boston.

Fig. 12. Attributed to Zhou Fang, section of *Palace Ladies Playing Chess*, handscroll, ink and color on silk, 28.8 x 115 cm, National Palace Museum, Taipei.
Fig. 13. Qiu Ying, section of *Spring Morning in the Han Palace*.

Fig. 14. Gu Hongzhong, section of *A Night Entertainment of Han Xizai*, tenth century, handscroll, ink and color on silk, 28.7 x 335.5 cm, Palace Museum, Beijing.

Fig. 15. Gu Hongzhong, section of *A Night Entertainment of Han Xizai*. 
Fig. 16. Huang Gongwang, *Dwelling in the Fucun Mountains: The Remaining Mountain* 31.8 x 51.4 cm, and Master Wuyong scroll 33 x 636.9 cm, 1350, ink on paper, Zhejiang Provincial Museum and National Palace Museum, Taipei.

Fig. 17. Shen Zhou, *In Imitation of Huang Gongwang’s Dwelling in the Fucun Mountains*, 1487, ink and color on paper, 36.8 x 855 cm, Palace Museum, Beijing.
Fig. 18. Huang Gongwang, section of *Dwelling in the Fucun Mountains*.

Fig. 19. Shen Zhou, section of *In Imitation of Huang Gongwang’s Dwelling in the Fucun Mountains*. 
Fig. 20. P4517.4, Pounce, qianfo (1000 Buddha) composition, Pelliot Collection, Bibliotheque Nationale.

Fig. 21. Attributed to Wu Zongyuan (d. 1050), section of *Celestial Rulers of Daoism in Procession*, ink on silk, 57.8 x 790 cm, Collection of C.C. Wang, New York.

Fig. 22. Gu Jianlong, leaf from album of sketches (*fenben*) after old masters, ink and color on paper, 30.2 x 18.8 cm, Nelson-Atkins Museum of Art, Kansas City.
Fig. 23. Returning from a hunting excursion, detail of Zhang Zeduan version.

Fig. 24. Wedding procession, detail of Zhao Zhe version.
Fig. 25. Wedding procession, detail of Liaoning A.

Fig. 26. Wedding procession, detail of Taipei A.
Fig. 27. Wedding procession, detail of Metropolitan version.

Fig. 28. Wedding procession, detail of Liaoning B.
Fig. 29. Wedding procession, detail of Taipei B.

Fig. 30. Arched bridge and potential boat collision, detail of Zhang Zeduan version.
Fig. 31. Arched bridge, detail of Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 32. Arched bridge, detail of Liaoning A.
Fig. 33. Arched bridge, detail of Taipei A.

Fig. 34. Arched bridge, detail of Metropolitan version.
Fig. 35. Arched bridge, detail of Liaoning B.

Fig. 36. Arched bridge, detail of Taipei B.
Fig. 37. People throwing rope from the bridge, detail of Zhang Zeduan version.

Fig. 38. Efforts to save the boat, detail of Zhang Zeduan version.

Fig. 39. People on the boat yelling and pointing, detail of Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 40. People throwing rope from the bridge, detail of Liaoning B

Fig. 41. A man ready to catch a rope, detail of Liaoning B

Fig. 42. People on the bridge, detail of Taipei B.
Fig. 43. A man standing in the front of a boat, detail of Taipei B.

Fig. 44. A pleasure boat passing under the bridge, detail of Taipei B.

Fig. 45. City gate, detail of Zhang Zeduan version.

Fig. 46. Land gate and water gate, detail of Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 47. Land gate and water gate, detail of Liaoning A.

Fig. 48. Land gate and water gate, detail of Taipei A.
Fig. 49. Land gate and water gate, detail of Metropolitan version.

Fig. 50. Land gate and water gate, detail of Liaoning B.

Fig. 51. Land gate and water gate, detail of Taipei B.

Fig. 52. Camels passing through the city gate, detail of Zhang Zeduan version.
Fig. 53. Camels and an ox passing through the city gate, detail of Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 54. Camels and an ox passing through the city gate, detail of Liaoning A.
Fig. 55. Camels and an ox passing through the city gate, detail of Taipei A.

Fig. 56. Camels and an ox passing through the city gate, Taipei B.
Fig. 57. Camels and an ox passing through the city gate, detail of Metropolitan version.

Fig. 58. An official and his escorts, detail of Zhang Zeduan version.
Fig. 59. Officials and escorts, Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 60. Officials and escorts, Liaoning A.

Fig. 61. Officials and escorts, Taipei A.

Fig. 62. Officials and escorts, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 63. Officials and escorts, Liaoning B.

Fig. 64. Officials and escorts, Taipei B.
Fig. 65. Workers constructing a house, Zhao Zhe version.
Fig. 66. Workers constructing a house (right); the imperial garden (left), Liaoning B.

Fig. 67. Workers constructing a house (right); the imperial garden (left), Taipei A.
Fig. 68. Workers constructing a house (right); the imperial garden (left), Liaoning A.

Fig. 69. Workers constructing a house (right); palace ladies on an outing (left), Taipei B.
Fig. 70. Workers constructing a house, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 71. Hunting (right), displays of military skills (center), and village (left), Metropolitan version.
Fig. 72. Signature, Liaoning B.

Fig. 73. Signature, Taipei B.

Fig. 74. Signature, Liaoning A.

Fig. 75. Signature, Taipei A.

Fig. 76. Signature, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 77. Signature, Zhao Zhe version.
Fig. 78. Huang Biao, section of the *Nine Elders*, 1594, handscroll, ink and color on silk, 27.2 x 193 cm, National Palace Museum, Taipei.

Fig. 79. Huang Biao, inscription following the *Nine Elders*, 1594.

Fig. 80. Huang Biao, detail of the *Nine Elders*, 1594, National Palace Museum, Taipei.
Fig. 81. Wang Biao, sections of *The Peach Spring in Immortal Realms*, c. 1558, handscroll, ink and color on silk.
Fig. 82. Detail of *Seeing-off at Xanyang River*.

Fig. 83. Mountains, Liaoning A.

Fig. 84. Pine tree, Taipei B.

Fig. 85. Pine tree, Liaoning B.

Fig. 86. Wan Shide, inscription on Zhao Zhe version.
Fig. 87. Li Dongyang, detail of colophon of Zhang Zeduan version.

Fig. 88. Anonymous, detail of *Qingming shanghe tu*, handscrew, ink and color on silk. Metropolitan Museum of Art.

Fig. 89. Gui Fu, colophon on Zhao Zhe version.
Fig. 90. Drama performance, Liaoning A version.
Fig. 91. Drama performance, Taipei A.

Fig. 92. Imperial garden, Liaoning A.
Fig. 93. Imperial garden, Taipei A.

Fig. 94. Acrobatic performance, Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 95. Acrobatic performance, Liaoning A.

Fig. 96. Acrobatic performance, Taipei A.

Fig. 97. Acrobatic performance, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 98. Acrobatic performance, Liaoning B.

Fig. 99. Acrobatic performance, Taipei B.
Fig. 100. Mountains, Liaoning A.

Fig. 101. Huqiu Mountains, woodblock print, Xinjuan hainei qiguan.

Fig. 102. Illustration, woodblock print, Sancai tuhai.
Fig. 103. Illustration, woodblock print, *Yuchu ji*.

Fig. 104. Detail of Taipei A.

Fig. 105. Illustration, woodblock print, *Yuanyang meng*.
Fig. 106. Mountains, Taipei A.

Fig. 107. Ding Yunping, *Landscape*, hanging scroll, 1585.
Fig. 108. Landscape, woodblock print, *Fangshi mopu*, 1594: 222.

Fig. 109. Wang Jinku 汪晉穀, *Tamed Dragon Pine*, 1679, woodblock print published in Huangshan zhi.

Fig. 110. Jianjiang, *Tamed Dragon Pine*, leaf from an album of scenes of Huangshan, ink on paper, Beijing Palace Museum.

Fig. 111. Lan Ying, detail of *White Clouds and Red Trees*, 1658, 48 x 189.4 cm.
Fig. 112. Inscription on Liaoning B.

Fig. 113. Men wearing piaopiao jin, Taipei B.

Fig. 114. Men wearing piaopiao jin, illustration in Boan furong ying 泊庵芙蓉影. 1634, Suzhou woodblock print.
Fig. 115. City gate, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 116. Details of the Chang Gate in *Three Hundred Sixty Occupations*, 1734, woodblock prints, ink and hand-painted color on paper, 108.6 x 55.9 cm, and 108.6 x 55.6 cm, Oshajo Museum, Hiroshima.

Fig. 117. Chen Mei et al., Detail of *Qingming shanghe tu*, Qing court version, 1737, handscroll, ink and color on silk, 35.6 x 1152.8 cm, National Palace Museum, Taipei.

Fig. 118. Xu Yang, detail of *Bourgeoning Life in a Resplendent Age*, handscroll, ink and color on paper, 36.5 x 1241 cm, 1759, Liaoning Provincial Museum.
Fig. 119. Peach blossoms and willows, Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 120. Peach blossoms and willows, Liaoning A.

Fig. 121. Peach blossoms and willows, Taipei A.

Fig. 122. Peach blossoms and willows, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 123. Peach blossoms and willows, Liaoning B.

Fig. 124. Peach blossoms and willows, Taipei B.

Fig. 125. Countryside, Zhao Zhe version.
Fig. 126. Countryside, Liaoning A.
Fig. 127. Countryside, Taipei A.

Fig. 128. Countryside, Liaoning B.
Fig. 129. Countryside, Taipei B.

Fig. 130. Countryside, Metropolitan version.
Fig. 131. Attributed to Qiu Ying (c.1509-1551), three details of village life, *Peach Blossom Spring*, ink and color on silk, 33 x 472 cm, Museum of Fine Arts, Boston.
Fig. 132. Qiu Ying (att.), *Peach Blossom Spring*, opening section and detail of entrance to a grotto.
Fig. 133. Silk fabric store, Zhang Zeduan version.

Fig. 134. Silk fabric store and singing girls, Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 135. Silk fabric store and singing girl, Liaoning A.
Fig. 136. Silk fabric store and singing girls, Taipei A.

Fig. 137. Silk fabric store and singing girls, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 138. Silk fabric store, Liaoning B.
Fig. 139. Store for inspecting and buying fabrics including silk xiubo, Liaoning B.

Fig. 140. Silk fabric store, Taipei B.

Fig. 141. Silk thread store, Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 142. Silk thread store, Liaoning A.

Fig. 143. Silk thread store, Taipei A.
Fig. 144. Banners advertising silk threads, Taipei B.

Fig. 145. Cotton fabric shop, Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 146. Cotton fabric shop, Liaoning A.

Fig. 147. Cotton fabric shop, Taipei A

Fig. 148. Cotton fabric shop, Metropolitan version.
Fig. 149. Cotton fabric itinerant peddler, Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 150. Cotton fabric shop, Taipei A.

Fig. 151. Cotton fabric booth, Liaoning B.

Fig. 152. Cotton fabric booth, Taipei B.

Fig. 153. Cotton fabrics from Wusong, Taipei B.
Fig. 154. Cotton raw fiber store, Liaoning B.

Fig. 155. Cotton yarn shop, Liaoning A.

Fig. 156. Cotton yarn shop, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 157. Cotton yarn, Taipei B.

Fig. 158. Dye house, Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 159. Dye house, Liaoning A.

Fig. 160. Dye house, Taipei A.

Fig. 161. Dye house, Metropolitan version.
Fig. 162. Dye house, Taipei B.

Fig. 163. Dye house, Liaoning B.

Fig. 164. A store selling dyestuff, Taipei B.

Fig. 165. Cotton fabric agent, Liaoning A.

Fig. 166. Cotton fabric agent, Taipei A.

Fig. 167. Cotton fabric vendors, Metropolitan version.
Fig. 168. Cotton fabric store, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 169. Ready-made garments, Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 170. Ready-made garments and tailor’s shop, Liaoning A.

Fig. 171. Ready-made garments and tailor’s shop, Taipei A.

Fig. 172. Ready-made garments, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 173. Sock seller, Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 174. Sock seller, Liaoning A.
Fig. 175. Sock seller, Taipei A

Fig. 176. Sock seller, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 177. Handkerchief peddler, Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 178. Handkerchief shop, Liaoning A.

Fig. 179. Handkerchief stall, Taipei A.

Fig. 180. Handkerchief stall, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 181. Ready-made garments, Taipei B.
Fig. 182. Bringing goats to town, Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 183. Bringing goats to town, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 184. Herding pigs to town, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 185. Hurrying waterfowl to town, Liaoning A.

Fig. 186. Hurrying waterfowl to town, Liaoning B.

Fig. 187. Hurrying waterfowl to town, Taipei B.

Fig. 188. Transporting plants to town, Taipei B.
Fig. 189. Laborers, Zhao Zhe.

Fig. 190. Laborers, Liaoning A.

Fig. 191. Laborers, Taipei A.

Fig. 192. Laborers, Metropolitan version.
Fig. 199. Antique shop, Taipei A.

Fig. 200. Antique peddler, Taipei A.

Fig. 201. Antique shop, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 202. Antique booth, Liaoning B.

Fig. 203. Antique booth and shop, Taipei B.

Fig. 204. Fans from Japan, Taipei A.

Fig. 205. Products from Shandong (northeast), Taipei B.
Fig. 206. Products from Shanxi and Lanzhou (northwest), Taipei B.

Fig. 207. Products from Guangnan, the Western Oceans, and the Southern Oceans, Taipei B.

Fig. 208. Silver molding shop, Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 209. Silver molding shop, Liaoning A.

Fig. 210. Silver molding shop, Taipei A.

Fig. 211. Silver molding shop, Metropolitan version.
Fig. 212. Money exchange broker, Liaoning A.

Fig. 213. Money exchange broker, Taipei A.

Fig. 214. Money exchange broker, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 215. Money exchange broker, Taipei B.

Fig. 216. Sedan chair, Liaoning A.

Fig. 217. Sedan chair, Liaoning A.
Fig. 218. Sedan chair, Taipei A.

Fig. 219. Sedan chair, Taipei A.

Fig. 220. Sedan chair, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 221. Sedan chair, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 222. Sedan chair, Taipei B.

Fig. 223. Scholars wearing fangjin square caps and blue or plain colored robes, Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 224. Physician wearing dongpo jin, Zhao Zhe version.
Fig. 225. Elites wearing *tangjin*, Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 226. Elite wearing a *ruanjin* soft headscarf, Liaoning A.

Fig. 227. Elite wearing *eryi jin*, Liaoning A.
Fig. 228. Elites’ outfits, Liaoning A and Taipei A.

Fig. 229. Elites wearing *dongpo jin* or *tangjin*, Liaoning B.

Fig. 230. Elites wearing simple headscarves and robes, Liaoning B.
Fig. 231. Elites wearing *dongpo jin* or *tangjin*, Taipei B.

Fig. 232. Physician wearing *wanzi jin*, Taipei B.

Fig. 233. Man wearing *eryi jin*, Taipei B.

Fig. 234. Elite wearing red shoes, Taipei B.

Fig. 235. Outfits, Metropolitan version.
Fig. 236. Shoes from Nanjing, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 237. Guards at the city gates, Liaoning A.

Fig. 238. Guards at the city gate, Taipei A.

Fig. 239. Guards at the city gate, Metropolitan version.
Fig. 240. Guards at the city gate and the Inland Customs station, Liaoning B.

Fig. 241. Guards at the city gate and the Inland Customs station, Taipei B.

Fig. 242. Government office, Taipei B.
Fig. 243. *Renhe* store, Taipei B.
Fig. 244. Military inspection and entertainment, Taipei A.
Fig. 245. Display of military skills, Metropolitan version.
Fig. 246. Imperial garden and pond, Liaoning A.

Fig. 247. Imperial garden and pond, Taipei A.
Fig. 248. Imperial garden and pond, Liaoning B.

Fig. 249. Motherhood, Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 250. Motherhood, Liaoning A.

Fig. 251. Motherhood, Taipei A.

Fig. 252. Motherhood, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 253. Motherhood, Liaoning B.

Fig. 254. Motherhood, Taipei B.
Fig. 255. Brotherhood, Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 256. Brotherhood, Liaoning A.

Fig. 257. Brotherhood, Taipei A.

Fig. 258. Brotherhood, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 259. Brotherhood, Liaoning B.

Fig. 260. Brotherhood, Taipei B.

Fig. 261. Father and son, Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 262. Father and son, Liaoning A.

Fig. 263. Father and son, Taipei A.

Fig. 264. Father and son, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 265. Father and son, Liaoning B.

Fig. 266. Father and son, Taipei B.
Fig. 267. Husband and wife, Taipei A.

Fig. 268. Husband and wife, Taipei B.

Fig. 269. Husband and wife, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 270. Husband and wife, Taipei B.

Fig. 271. Wrestling, Liaoning B.

Fig. 272. Boys wandering on the street, Taipei B.

Fig. 273. Watching a puppet show, Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 274. Boys wandering on the street, Liaoning A.
Fig. 275. Flying a kite, Taipei A.

Fig. 276. Riding hobbyhorses and playing pinwheels, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 277. Playing music and dancing for male elites, Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 278. Woman with a female relative, Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 279. Woman with her son, Zhao Zhe version.
Fig. 280. Women embroidering, Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 281. Playing in a private garden, Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 282. Gentry woman traveling in a sedan chair accompanied by her maidservant, Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 283. Peeping woman watching a wedding procession, Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 284. Merchant’s wife, Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 285. Old lady selling fans, Zhao Zhe version.
Fig. 286. Matchmaker’s sedan chair and entourage, Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 287. Singing girls, Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 288. Visiting a temple, Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 289. Watching a drama performance, Liaoning A.

Fig. 290. Visiting a temple, Liaoning A.

Fig. 291. Courtesans, Liaoning A.
Fig. 292. Woman breast feeding a baby, Liaoning A.

Fig. 293. Woman bringing her child to watch an acrobatic show, Liaoning A.

Fig. 294. Women traveling by boat, Taipei A.

Fig. 295. Women watching a drama performance and chatting, Taipei A.
Fig. 296. Gentry woman in a room with books, Taipei A.

Fig. 297. Gentry woman playing a zither, Taipei A.

Fig. 298. Palace ladies in a room with books, Taipei A.

Fig. 299. Palace ladies with a zither, Taipei A.

Fig. 300. Palace ladies playing chess, Taipei A.

Fig. 301. Woman leading her husband and son to visit a temple, Taipei A.
Fig. 302. Watching a bridal procession, Taipei A.

Fig. 303. Courtesans entertaining men, Taipei A.

Fig. 304. Tightrope walking, Taipei A.

Fig. 305. Woman indoors, separated from men, Liaoning B.

Fig. 306. Merchant's wife, Liaoning B.

Fig. 307. Old lady, Liaoning B.

Fig. 308. A mother escorted by a servant girl, Liaoning B.
Fig. 309. Woman in the same room with two men, Taipei B.

Fig. 310. Playing a board game, Taipei B.

Fig. 311. Woman bringing her husband and sons to visit a temple, Taipei B.

Fig. 312. Woman talking to a man and mingling with a group of men, Taipei B.
Fig. 313. Noblewomen on an outing, Taipei B.
Fig. 314. Woman riding a donkey, Taipei B.

Fig. 315. Woman riding a donkey, Taipei B.

Fig. 316. Visiting a fortune teller, Taipei B.

Fig. 317. Courtesan Li Shishi’s wine house, Taipei B.
Fig. 318. A woman and two men taking a pleasure boat, Taipei B.

Fig. 319. Singing girls, Taipei B.

Fig. 320. Playing a board game, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 321. Holding a dinner party, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 322. Noblewomen on an outing, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 323. A young lady visiting a temple, Metropolitan version.
Fig. 324. Women on an outing, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 325. Female peddlers, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 326. Female acrobats, Metropolitan version.
Fig. 327. Female religious practitioner, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 328. Kicking a football, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 329. Dining, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 330. Courtesans playing music or performing tanci, Metropolitan version.
Fig. 331. Buddhist temple, Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 332. Buddhist temple, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 333. Buddhist temple, Liaoning B.

Fig. 334. A monk greeting a scholar, Liaoning A.

Fig. 335. Chan Buddhist temple, Taipei B.
Fig. 336. Ritual in a Buddhist temple, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 337. Monks fundraising, Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 338. Monks fundraising, Liaoning A.

Fig. 339. Monks fundraising, Taipei A.

Fig. 340. Monks fundraising, Metropolitan version.
Fig. 341. Monks fundraising, Liaoning B.

Fig. 342. Monks fundraising, Taipei B.

Fig. 343. Monks fundraising, Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 344. Monks fundraising, Liaoning A.

Fig. 345. Monks fundraising, Taipei A.

Fig. 346. Monks fundraising, Metropolitan version.
Fig. 347. A store selling Buddhist statues, Liaoning A.

Fig. 348. A store selling incense and candles, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 349. Temple of the Dragon King of Bian River in the Eastern Capital, Taipei B.
Fig. 350. Temple of the Earth God of Rainbow Bridge, Taipei B.

Fig. 351. Temple of the Earth and Grain Gods Built by Imperial Order, Taipei B.
Fig. 352. A shaman, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 353. Religious procession, Metropolitan version.
Fig. 354. Drama performance, Metropolitan version.
Fig. 355. Blind storyteller or musician, Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 356. Blind storyteller or musician, Taipei A.

Fig. 357. Blind storyteller or musician, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 358. Daoist sentiments Daoqing, Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 359. Daoist sentiments Daoqing, Taipei A.

Fig. 360. Daoist sentiments Daoqing, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 361. Pinhua storytelling, Liaoning A.
Fig. 362. Storytelling, Zhang Zeduan version

Fig. 363. Tightrope walking, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 364. Juggling cymbals, Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 365. Juggling cymbals, Liaoning A.

Fig. 366. Juggling cymbals, Taipei A.

Fig. 367. Juggling cymbals, Metropolitan version.
Fig. 368. Foot-juggling a jar, Taipei A.

Fig. 369. Magic show, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 370. Acrobat on a pole, Metropolitan version.
Fig. 371. Trick riders on horseback, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 372. Private garden, Zhao Zhe version.
Fig. 373. Private garden, Liaoning A.

Fig. 374. Private garden, Taipei A.
Fig. 375. Private garden, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 376. Private garden, Liaoning B.
Fig. 377. Private garden, Taipei B.

Fig. 378. Music and dancing, Liaoning A.

Fig. 379. Music and dancing, Taipei A.

Fig. 380. Music and dancing, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 381. Music and dancing, Taipei B.
Fig. 382. Riding and archery, Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 383. Kicking a football, Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 384. Riding and archery, Liaoning A.

Fig. 385. Kicking a football, Liaoning A.

Fig. 386. Playing a board game, Liaoning A.

Fig. 387. Riding and archery, Taipei A.

Fig. 388. Kicking a football, Taipei A.

Fig. 389. Playing a board game, Taipei A.
Fig. 390. Throwing dice, Taipei B.

Fig. 391. Riding and archery, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 392. Kicking a football, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 393. Throwing arrows into a jar, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 394. Cockfight, Metropolitan version.

Fig. 395. Rice shop, Zhao Zhe version.
Fig. 396. Bookstore, Zhao Zhe version.

Fig. 397. People coming to town, Zhao Zhe version.
Fig. 398. Prince Bao’s prose poem *The Imperial Capital*, inscribed by Liang Shizheng, Taipei A.

Fig. 399. The seal of *Leshantang* Happy-in-Adopting-Righteousness Studio, Taipei A.