

Out of Sight, Out of Mind?
Discourse Analysis of Street Sex Trade Governance in a Small City

by

Lorry-Ann Marie Austin

BSW, Thompson Rivers University, 2007

A THESIS SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULLFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF

MASTER OF SOCIAL WORK

in

The College of Graduate Studies

(Social Work)

THE UNIVERSITY OF BRITISH COLUMBIA

(Okanagan)

August, 2012

©Lorry-Ann Marie Austin, 2012

Abstract

This study utilized socio-cultural discourse analysis grounded in anti-oppressive social work perspectives to explore and develop a narrative account of one small city's response to the street sex trade. Discourse analysis was used to explore discursive representations of the street sex trade as they related to the governance actions of key players within the small city of Kamloops, British Columbia (BC) between 2002 and 2009. Media texts and civic government meeting minutes were collected and analyzed, revealing that two main responses developed over the time period under analysis (exclusion and rescue). Discursive analysis of these texts revealed that the visibility of the street sex trade motivated policy responses resulting in the complete rejection of the street sex trade in this small city. Further analysis revealed that themes of war and pollution encouraged the development of exclusionary policy responses while rescue policy responses were inspired by representations of the sex worker as a child-like victim. There was a noticeable absence of sex worker generated discourse within this policy debate. While based on different depictions of sex workers and the street sex trade, both policy responses were situated within the overriding visibility discourse and as a result, they both aimed to remove all evidence of a visible street sex trade. In the small city of Kamloops, BC a visible street sex trade was not tolerated as it often is in larger metropolises and policy responses forced it from public view. The complete rejection of the street sex trade in the small city may not be unique to Kamloops and the implications of exclusionary policy responses may increase the violence and marginalization experienced by sex workers in the small city context. Further research exploration is needed to understand the perspectives of sex trade workers and to include their views in the development of civic policy.

Table of Contents

Abstract.....	ii
Table of Contents.....	iii
List of Tables.....	vi
Acknowledgements.....	vii
Chapter 1 – Introduction.....	1
Conceptualizing the Street Sex Trade.....	4
The Canadian Policy Context.....	5
International Research.....	7
Limitations of the Current Research.....	9
One Small City: Kamloops, British Columbia, Canada.....	11
The Research Questions.....	16
Summary.....	16
Chapter 2 - Conceptual Framework.....	18
Anti-Oppressive Social Work Theory.....	18
Governance and Anti-oppressive Perspectives.....	24
Sex Trade Discourses: The International Literature.....	29
Summary.....	37
Chapter 3 – Methodology.....	40

Discourse Analysis.....	41
The Small City Case Study.....	46
Data Analysis.....	50
Summary.....	54
Chapter 4 – Findings.....	56
Civil Society and Anti-sex Trade Activism 2003-2007.....	60
State Responses: Legitimizing Exclusion through Laws, Bylaws and Zoning 2003-2009..	66
Civil Society and the Backlash from Social Activists 2005-2008.....	73
Summary.....	84
Chapter 5 – Discussion.....	86
(In)visibility in a Small City.....	86
Revanchism in a Small City.....	89
Salvation in a Small City.....	94
Small City Themes: Relationships with Broader Sex Trade Discourses.....	98
Contagion in a Small City.....	99
Containment and Regulation in a Small City.....	99
Culpability in a Small City.....	101
Abolition in a Small City.....	101
Silence in a Small City.....	102

Small City Considerations.....	103
Summary.....	104
Chapter 6 – Conclusion.....	106
 Researching the Governance of Street Sex Work.....	106
 Implications of this Research.....	109
 Limitations of this Research.....	111
 Summary and Future Research Considerations.....	113
References.....	114

List of Tables

Table 1 - Final Data Set.....	57
Table 2 - Players Influencing Kamloops Sex Trade Governance Responses.....	59
Table 3 – Discursive Relationships.....	89

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank Dr. Christopher Walmsley and Dr. Terry Kadding for their inspiration and support throughout this long journey. Thank-you also to Dr. Shirley Chau for her encouragement and insight; without this I would not have had the courage to pursue a thesis. I would also like to thank Dr. Judy Gillespie who provided exceptional leadership and guidance, allowing me to develop new perspectives from which to analyze not only my work, but our entire social world. Finally, I would like to thank my family for their endless support and encouragement, without them this dream would have remained impossible.

Chapter 1 - Introduction

There is acute discrimination against people involved in the sex trade and they are among the most marginalized populations in the world (UNFPA, n.d.). In British Columbia (BC), Canada the majority of the more than 60 women who disappeared from the City of Vancouver between 1980 and 2002 are believed to have been involved in the street sex trade (Lowman, 2000). The Vancouver Missing Women's case is an extreme example of the dangers inherent in street sex work yet other less sensational incidents of violence occur in every city and country in which the trade takes place.

A diverse body of academic research and public policy debates centre on the potential for policy responses to lead to a concealed sex trade thereby increasing the harms faced by those working the streets (Francis, 2006; Hubbard, 1998; O'Neill, Campbell, Hubbard, Pitcher & Scoular, 2008). The research demonstrates that when sex work is hidden from public view, the harms associated with it increase. An ambiguous legal context exists globally with laws criminalizing sex work by targeting public communication, while the actual act of selling sex remains legal (O'Neil et al.). The ambiguous legal context provokes debates focusing on the challenges posed by a legal system that technically tolerates the sale of sex, but does not set out how the trade can be conducted within the confines of the law. This ambiguity results in a wide range of policy responses to street sex work at the local level, including the enforcement of laws, relaxed regulation of indoor prostitution venues, the creation of formal or informal toleration zones, the utilization of community members to provide surveillance in areas of high activity, and the enhancement of support services to assist sex workers in exiting the trade.

The vast majority of research concerning representations of and responses to the street

sex trade focuses on large metropolises and although there has been a considerable amount of research, we lack an understanding of how the perceptions of various players within the community influence the development of local policy responses to the street sex trade, specifically within the context of the small city. Between 2002 and 2009, the small city of Kamloops, BC created exclusion zones referred to locally as 'Red Zones' to target the street sex trade. The 'Red Zones' were supplemented with social programming aimed at rehabilitating street sex workers. Informed by anti-oppressive social work perspectives, my research explores what discourse analysis tells us about these actions and what this in turn suggests about the governance of the street sex trade in the context of the small city.

Discourses are representations that claim to depict all that is known about a social issue, such as the sex trade. They are dispersed in multiple ways and are influential in the adoption of local policy responses. Discourses are collections of language and action containing all that can be written, thought, said or done in regard to a particular thing (Layder, 2006, p. 119). The discourses used to describe people and activities are not neutral, but rather contain the power to shape our perception of our social world and influence our reactions to social phenomena (Tonkiss, 2006, p. 373)(Seale, 2006, p. 373). **Governance** entails a policy creation process in an arena where competing and conflicting interests exist. The term encompasses, but transcends local government, including people from within the business and residential communities in the policy making process (Minnery, 2007). Local governance includes all forms of collective action targeting the development of social policy, from the decisions of government to the activity of business lobby groups and community social activists (Healey, 2006). I further clarify the concepts of governance and discourse in chapter three where I

describe the conceptual framework underlying this research.

In order to gain insight into my research question, I examined discourses pertaining specifically to the governance of the street sex trade in the small city of Kamloops, BC. I drew this data from archival texts; specifically minutes of city council meetings and articles, editorials, and letters from Kamloops two community newspapers. My analysis resulted in a description of discourses dispersed by various players in response to the street sex trade in one small Canadian city, providing one narrative account of the development of local responses to street sex work in one small Canadian city.

In this chapter I introduce my research by conceptualizing the street sex trade. I discuss the Canadian policy context and provide an overview of the international body of research. Prior to concluding this chapter I discuss the concept of the small city and provide some contextual information about this small city. In Chapter 2, I discuss the broad theoretical foundations underlying my thesis including anti-oppressive social work perspectives and the role of discourses in the construction of identity and social practices. I also discuss the concept of governance and the actors that are the focus of analysis within an institutionalist perspective of governance. Finally, I detail the discourses identified within the international literature on the street sex trade. In Chapter 3, I present the methodology and methods of my work by discussing discourse analysis and elucidating the processes used to collect and analyze my data. In Chapter 4, I detail the findings of my work, presenting the governance actions that were initiated in response to local discourses championed by various players in Kamloops between 2002 and 2009. In Chapter 5, I explore what discourse analysis tells us about the two regulatory responses adopted in Kamloops by identifying the discursive themes active within the city and

considering their relationship to the discourses identified in the broader body of literature concerning the sex trade. I finish with a discussion of what discursive representations evident in Kamloops between 2002 and 2009 suggest regarding responses to the street sex trade in the small city context. I conclude in Chapter 6 by reviewing the initial problem, research question and findings, before discussing the implications and limitations of this project and areas for further research.

Conceptualizing the Street Sex Trade

People involved in the sex trade represent all sexual orientations and genders, but the profession is commonly perceived to be dominated by women and they are the customary focus of research and policy debates (Francis, 2006; Jones, Hillier, Shears & Comfort, 2005). While researchers have recently begun to include male and transgendered voices within academic discourse, this work is limited and the majority of research continues to focus on the female street sex trade (Whowell, 2010). There is also an absence of attention to race and ability in the literature and most analyses fail to consider these perspectives. The sex trade exists in a diversity of forms, ranging from stripping and nude photography to internet web cams, pornographic films, phone sex, and street prostitution. The term '**sex trade**' encompasses the sellers and purchasers of sexual services, as well as the actual act itself.

Prostitution and **sex work** are commonly defined as the exchange of sexual services for resources such as money, drugs or housing (Jones at al., 2005, p. 61; Pivot Legal Society, 2006). The terms are often used interchangeably, but have different influences over the conceptualization of the sex trade in both academic literature and public policy debates (Betteridge, 2005, p. 2). The word 'prostitution' carries enormous social stigma and people

involved in the sex workers' rights movement often avoid this term (Betteridge, p. 2). The terms 'sex trade' and 'sex work' are more commonly used by pro-rights activists, though they are also contested. The terms are taken up by some advocates in an attempt to inform public discourse and frame legislative debates by focusing attention on the rights of sex workers to engage in lawful work. The term 'prostitution' carries legal significance and is used in the Canadian *Criminal Code* to describe the in-person exchange of sexual services by one person for payment by another, including intercourse, oral sex, masturbation, and other services usually (although not necessarily) involving bodily contact (Criminal Code, RSC, 1985). I use the terms 'sex trade' and 'sex work' interchangeably in this thesis to refer to the street sex trade.

Finally, in conceptualizing the sex trade, it is important to recognize the distinction between sexual slavery, coerced survival sex, and consensual sex work, as the factors compelling people to work in the sex trade are far too diverse and complex to discuss here (Lowman, n.d.). Sexual slavery is the assertion of the right of ownership over a person who is forced to provide sexual services for the 'owner's' profit (Human Rights Watch, 2003, p. 2). Coerced survival sex occurs when the person has no feasible choice but to trade sex for resources fundamental to survival such as shelter, food or protection. 'Consensual' sex work occurs when a person is not coerced or forced to sell sex, but chooses autonomously to do so. The degree of independence exercised in the decision to engage in 'consensual' sex work is contested and is itself the subject of academic debate (Brison, 2006; Lakeman, 2009a; Lakeman, 2009b).

The Canadian Policy Context

Cities in Canada are bound by provincial and federal laws and as such, their abilities to

govern are constrained (Wharf & McKenzie, 2004). The Canadian policy response to street sex work is highly complex and involves policy decisions at all levels of government, including the governments of each city within the country. Sex work is technically legal in Canada, but the federal Criminal Code makes it illegal to negotiate or talk about the purchase of sexual services in a public place (Criminal Code, RSC, 1985). In 2010, an Ontario Court of Appeal judge challenged Canada's prostitution laws, observing that "provisions meant to protect women and residential neighbourhoods had endangered the lives of sex trade workers" (Hall, 2011). In March 2011, the Supreme Court of Canada agreed to hear an appeal involving a legal challenge to prostitution laws brought about in 2007 by a group of former Vancouver sex trade workers. The workers argued that current federal laws violate the Charter of Rights and Freedoms by impeding sex workers "right to work safely and live in safety, to be free from arrest and to be free from the inequalities they currently experience" (News 1130 Staff, 2011). While laws remain in flux, the ongoing theme is the potential for policy responses to push street sex work into the shadows, thereby endangering the lives of sex workers and possibly impeding their civil rights.

Provincial governments have no direct jurisdiction over the legal status of prostitution as the Criminal Code is the domain of the federal government, but provincial governments do control the enforcement of federal laws. They may respond to sex work in a variety of ways using their jurisdiction over highways and traffic, community safety, and child protection. City governments operate within the provincial framework, but do retain some independent powers to respond to the sex trade via municipal bylaws regulating the use of streets, business licensing, and the zoning of off-street sex services (Barnett, 2008).

Approaches to street sex trade regulation in Canada are influenced by the socio-political context in which the work takes place and thus, regulation will look different in different localities. Community dialogue about the street sex trade influences local culture, producing unique city level responses. The *Criminal Code* details the instances in which the acts relating to sex work become a criminal offense, but it fails to address the legality of the sex trade or to provide recommendations for workers to conduct business in compliance with Canadian law. The provinces and cities have no express jurisdiction to regulate the sex trade, but cities are responding through creative interpretations of their jurisdictional powers (Francis, 2006; Kohm & Selwood, 2004; Larsen, 1992). These responses include unofficial policies tolerating the street sex trade in specific areas of a city, gentrification of other areas to push out sex workers, local campaigns aimed at shaming the purchasers of sexual services, and increased funding for enforcement approaches. The Canadian legal context fails to provide sanctions, guidance or jurisdiction to cities on how they may respond, placing both the sex worker and the neighbourhood in which the trade takes place in a byzantine situation. Sex work is technically legal, but negotiating the sale of sex is not. As noted below, this legal ambiguity is not unique to Canadian cities, spanning both historical and international contexts.

International Research

Overall, the international body of street sex trade response literature strongly affirms the repressive potential of local policy responses and the need to further examine each local context (Benoit & Shaver, 2006; Betteridge, 2005; Bindel & Kelly, 2003; Francis, 2006; Hallgrimsdottir, Phillips & Benoit, 2008a; Howell, Beckingham & Moore, 2008; Hubbard, 1997; Hubbard, 1998; Hubbard, Matthews & Scoular, 2008; Jones, Hillier, Shears & Comfort, 2005;

Kerkin, 2004; Lakeman, 2009; Lowman, 2000; O'Neill et al., 2008; Scoular & O'Neill, 2007; Tani, 2002). Lowman's analysis of the relationship between media portrayals, the criminal law, and violence against street sex workers demonstrates that current Canadian responses endanger sex workers by creating illicit markets, hidden from public view, where brutal forms of exploitation often occur. International research indicates that the forced location of the street sex trade in concealed areas where other illicit activities often occur further results in the alienation of sex workers from protective services. The key point offered in much of the international literature is the threat posed to individuals by the contradictory legal status of the sex trade and the multiplicity of responses to it.

The vast majority of international literature concerning sex work is qualitative in nature and grounded in structural or post-modern theoretical frameworks. It utilizes a variety of methodologies including in-depth interviews and the analysis of crime statistics, policy papers, and archival materials. Within this body of work, research data is often deconstructed to gain insight into the connections between space and sexuality and the processes of excluding sex workers from our communities. The data is also often examined for evidence of city governance responses and how these may be influenced by local activists. In my review of the literature, I focused on the work specifically relating to federal, provincial, and municipal policy responses to the street sex trade in Canada and abroad. While contributions in this area come from a variety of disciplines and theoretical backgrounds (business, law, policy, and social work), geographical research exploring the large city context comprised the bulk of research analyzing community responses to the street sex trade (Howell, Beckingham, & Moore, 2008; Hubbard, 1997; Hubbard et al., 2008; Plaster Carter, Carter, & Dannenberg, 2003; Tani, 2002).

Limitations of the Current Research

The current body of work has several limitations including a myopic focus on the large city context, the exclusion of gender inclusive analyses, a lack of significant contribution from other disciplines such as social work, and a preoccupation with moral arguments rooted in debates pitting the abolition of the sex trade against its continued existence and regulation. Research from the discipline of social work offers the potential to contest conclusions that may sustain derisive discourses. Social work contributions also offer the potential to argue for the inclusion of voices that may otherwise be silenced in policy debates. A review of social work's historical response to sex work reveals past interventions motivated by moralistic and paternalistic concerns, however shifting social contexts have driven the discipline to adopt deconstructing methodologies to dissect agents of social control and oppression (Wahab, 2002). With its commitment to social justice and understanding of the influences of discourse in the conceptualization of individuals and groups, anti-oppressive social work perspectives provide a unique and important framework from which to analyze governance responses to the street sex trade.

Research concerning the sex trade is often tainted by moralistic perspectives that relegate issues of marginalization and social exclusion to discussions about deviance and crime (Benoit & Shaver, 2006, p. 243). For example, Plaster Carter et al. (2003) utilize crime statistics in their discussion of Crime Prevention Through Environmental Design (CPTED) in the reduction of a visible street sex trade in Sarasota, Florida. The work dehumanizes sex workers by conceptualizing the sex trade as a 'thing', rather than an activity people engage in. The study further fails to consider the effects CPTED may have on sex workers' safety and ability to access

support services. Urban geographers Jones et al. assert that there are “major linkages between drug markets and street sex markets” and sex workers are “themselves significant customers for drug dealers” (2005, p. 63). This overarching theoretical statement may perpetuate derisive discourses and this should be acknowledged and qualified.

A further limitation of the overall body of academic research is an unfortunate preoccupation with moral and legal arguments (Benoit & Shaver, 2006). Research focused on the moral aspects of sex work is compromised by overarching suppositions and claims of truth regarding our human nature, while legal research often appears caught in a theoretical quagmire. Bindel and Kelly (2003) observe legal questions pitting the abolition of the street sex trade against its regulation are unanswerable as they concern philosophical debates about personal agency versus structural constraint, the conceptualization of gender equality, and varying perceptions about the kind of society one wishes to see. They call on researchers to cease concentration on these polarized positions and instead examine the rationales behind the differing governance approaches to the street trade. They compel researchers to explore the links between society’s opinions of the street sex trade and their subsequent actions in response to it. Hallgrimsdottir, Phillips, Benoit, & Walby (2008b) concur that polarizing debates reduce many research pursuits to moralizing narratives disregarding the genuine experiences of the people and communities impacted by the street sex trade (p. 266).

Researchers are beginning to overcome moral and legal preoccupations and encouraging work is emerging from the European context exploring conceptualizations of stigma and social exclusion as they relate to sex work (Howell et al., 2008; Hubbard, 1997; Hubbard 1998; Hubbard, 2002; Hubbard, 2004; Hubbard et al., 2008; Kerkin, 2004; O'Neill et

al., 2008; Scoular & O'Neill, 2007; Tani, 2002). It will be useful for researchers across the globe to engage in similar studies in diverse locales, including in small cities and rural landscapes. Current research does detail the existence of the street sex trade, particularly in larger urban centres, but it says little about the processes of governance of the street sex trade in specific spaces within the city (Hubbard & Sanders, 2003).

A final limitation identified within the current body of literature is the lack of work situated within Canada and outside of the large city context (Benoit & Shaver, 2006). The omission of small city and rural experiences sustains discourses that link the street sex trade primarily to large metropolises. For example, Jones et al. (2005) claim that the street sex trade occurs “almost exclusively” in large cities where it is “usually, but not exclusively, confined to specific districts” (p. 62). In opposition to this claim, I argue that the street sex trade does in fact occur in diverse locations throughout the world and does actually exist in small city locales such as the site of this thesis. It is thus relevant to investigate how social issues such as the street sex trade play out within the small city context.

One Small City: Kamloops, British Columbia, Canada

The definition of what constitutes a **small city** is contested, yet this term is increasingly used to discuss the unique experiences of residents living outside of large metropolises, but inside urban areas. Cities are commonly understood to have a municipal governing structure and to provide the hub of services for a region that may be comprised of towns, villages, and agricultural parcels of land (The Canadian Encyclopedia Online, n.d.). ‘Small city’ is often used to describe municipal incorporation with a specified population, with researchers placing the population cut-offs anywhere from less than 50,000 to a maximum of 280,000 people (Bell &

Jayne, 2006; Brennan, Hackler, & Hoene, 2005; Waitt & Gibson, 2009). Definitions based solely on population are problematic as they ignore the heterogeneity of everyday activities and the influence of diverse social, economic, and political contexts (Bell & Jayne). Clarifying the distinctness of the small city without relying on population markers is difficult, but not impossible. In keeping with emerging definitions from within the literature, I conceptualize a small city as an urban centre that provides all the services necessary to meet the basic needs of citizens within the surrounding regional district, including universities, regional hospitals, and the area's major industries and employers. Further, the small city has a population of more than 10,000, but less than 280,000 residents.

I chose Kamloops, BC as the site of my exploration of governance responses to the street sex trade, in part because this is the small city in which I live and where I witnessed considerable discursive debate regarding street sex trade regulation in 2007. Similar to many other small cities in North America, Kamloops provides a service hub for the municipalities and rural populations within its regional district. This small city differs from the network of suburbs found within major metropolitan areas such as Metro Vancouver in that it is required to be relatively self-reliant and cannot lean on a neighbouring larger city for basic services or supports. This small city makes for an interesting case study for several reasons. Local media proclaims Kamloops as the only city in Canada to have been the sole provider of tax payer funds for a local social program aimed at getting sex trade workers off the street (Young, SHOP Around, 2005). It is also a small city that faced increasing social challenges, especially with regards to the street sex trade and homelessness, in the wake of the shift to right wing provincial politics in 2001.

With a population of 80,376 residents, Kamloops is situated in the interior region of British Columbia, Canada (Province of British Columbia, 2006). This small city is the anchoring service hub for the municipalities and rural populations within the Thompson Nicola Regional District. It is also the gateway to points north, east, south, and west, with all of the area's major highways meeting in Kamloops. The region's main hospital is located within the city, as is the area's university and trades school. Billed as the 'Tournament Capital of Canada,' the city is the frequent host of sporting events and is home to the Western Hockey League's Kamloops Blazers. There is a large arts and culture scene that includes the Western Canada Theatre Company and Kamloops Symphony. The landscape around Kamloops is characterized by rivers, lakes, grasslands, and mountains, and outdoor activities, including golf, skiing, and fishing abound. Dining establishments, modern shops, and a range of businesses and corporate headquarters give the impression that this small city has all the amenities found within larger metropolises. Yet Kamloops is much more than a miniature Vancouver and unlike the province's largest city, it is required to be relatively self-reliant and cannot lean on a large metropolitan region for services and supports.

A spatial divide related to perceptions of income and education is evident within Kamloops with its boundaries clearly demarcated by the Thompson River. On the north side of this river is an area identified locally as 'the North Shore.' It is also identified as the oldest neighbourhood in the city, but it did not officially become part of the City of Kamloops until 1967 when North and South Kamloops amalgamated to form Kamloops (Fulton & Company LLP, n.d.). The North Shore is perceived locally as the poorest area in the city. Property is more affordable there than it is in other areas and there are several low cost apartment buildings and

social housing developments. Many of the city's social services are located on the North Shore, including the Food Bank and the ASK Wellness Centre. Across the bridge on the south side of the river, heritage homes have been bought up and gentrified by home and business owners resulting in a revitalized downtown core. On the hillsides overlooking downtown are newer subdivisions and affluent neighbourhoods such as Sahali, Aberdeen, and Rose Hill. Though amalgamation occurred decades earlier, North Kamloops is still perceived as disconnected from the remainder of the city, both geographically due to the river, and conceptually due to perceptions that its residents are low income and perhaps less educated. Media discourses often appear to delight in identifying social issues that appear to only occur in this corner of the city (North Shore: Crime capital of city?, 2005).

I focus my exploration of local governance responses to the street sex trade on the years between 2002 and 2009 because a shift in political power at the provincial level of politics occurred just prior to this time period and resulted in immense social change in the province in the years that followed. The 2001 BC provincial election moved governing philosophy sharply to the right, with the landslide defeat of the New Democratic government and the overwhelming majority election of the BC Liberal Party. The New Democratic Party of BC is pro-union and grounded in social democratic philosophy, while the BC Liberal Party has conservative-liberal roots and favours deregulation, balanced budgets, and reduced social expenditures. The 2002 provincial budget included major tax cuts, reduced expenditures, and the elimination of thousands of civil service jobs (Laneela, 2009). The government cut funding for women's centres and legal aid, and froze healthcare and education budgets, medical services plan premiums were increased, and the freeze on post secondary tuition was lifted (Laneela). In BC

cities, the actions of the provincial government translated into increasing social need and decreasing social resources (Deutschmann, 2005). In the small city of Kamloops, marginalized populations became increasingly visible as city administrators struggled to find ways to manage the problems perceived to be associated with their presence. The street sex trade became a significant issue, especially for residents and business owners in one of Kamloops' oldest neighbourhoods. Vocal citizens compelled the Kamloops' state to respond, with business groups, residential associations, and individuals speaking out and influencing the policy approaches adopted within the city in its response to the growing presence of a visible street sex trade.

Similar to other small cities, Kamloops' social infrastructure is not as well developed as larger urban centres and the city has less experience confronting the range of social issues thrust on it by the shift in political climate. A former sociology professor at the city's university observed that social service cuts, decreased access to legal aid, and a freeze in social assistance rates, resulted in a sharp increase in social problems evident on the streets of Kamloops (Deutschmann, 2005). The challenge to resolve entrenched social difficulties is daunting for all cities, but is especially difficult for the small city with its smaller set of skills and resources. Faced with the increased challenge of growing revenue with population, Kamloops has been compelled to develop strategies to assuage social concerns about the street sex trade while mediating the interests of business and citizens. With economic growth and stability its overriding concern, sex trade workers and other marginalized individuals have been viewed as threats to Kamloops' prosperity. They have also been viewed as victims within the community. Kamloops is the ideal site for my exploration of responses to the street sex trade in the small

city context as a battle between discursive representations of sex work was waged within this small city between 2002 and 2009. As the street sex trade became more visible, Kamloops' citizens appeared to become more vocal and a variety of governance strategies emerged.

The Research Questions

This research thus seeks to answer the following question and related subquestions:

What does discourse analysis tell us about the actions that developed in response to the street sex trade in Kamloops, BC between 2002 and 2009?

- What actions occurred on the part of individuals and groups categorized within the state, the market, and civil society in Kamloops, BC in response to the local street sex trade between 2002 and 2009?
- What discourses encompassing these actions were present over this same period of time in local media and city council meetings?
- What do these discourses suggest about the governance of the street sex trade in the small city?
- What are the implications of these findings for anti-oppressive social work practice?

Summary

International research exploring street sex trade regulation within cities demonstrates the repressive potential of local policy responses and the need to further examine each local context. Local governance approaches may at one time seek to eradicate sex work from a city, relying on strict enforcement, or it may appear more accepting, seeking to assist sex workers. The existing research acknowledges that policy responses are extremely context specific and

yet no research has explored street sex trade governance in the context of the small city (Benoit & Shaver, 2006). The lack of exploration in this unique context fails to acknowledge that the street sex trade does occur outside large metropolises and may in fact be experienced differently as a result of the small city locality. Society has a long history of stigmatizing people involved in the sex trade, and as our social and political practices increasingly align with right of centre, neoliberal approaches, sex workers and other marginalized people seem to face intensified scrutiny within the small city. The conditions of modern society appear to produce growing numbers of people perceived as a threat to a shrinking sense of neighbourhood and community (Deutschmann, 2005; Hubbard, 2004; Hubbard et al., 2008). Within the small city, vocal citizens assert opinions on what they perceive to be missing from their community and what values or spaces they believe are in need of protection. On the surface, small cities may appear as increasingly fortified zones with the ability to harness considerable political power to define membership and influence social policy (Deutschmann). Within the boundaries of the small city, citizens may adopt a revanchist stance, exerting their collective will in an attempt to reclaim their neighbourhoods from people they perceive as a threat (MacLeod, 2002). The discourses of small city residents compete in an ongoing restructuring of their community as they influence the development of local governance responses to social issues.

Chapter 2 - Conceptual Framework

In this thesis I explore what discourse analysis tells us about the actions taken within Kamloops, BC in response to the street sex trade. As I explained in the introductory chapter, the purpose of this exploration is to develop one narrative account of the evolution of discourses influencing the development of local responses to the street sex trade in the small city context. In this chapter I discuss the theoretical foundations underlying this thesis including anti-oppressive social work perspectives, the role of discourses in oppression, and the examination of the concept of governance. I conclude by exploring international discourses concerning street sex work.

Anti-Oppressive Social Work Theory

Social workers engage with society's most oppressed people and are challenged to develop empowering research and practice approaches to meet the complex needs of diverse populations (Okitikpi & Aymer, 2008). The profession's theoretical foundations often utilize eclectic approaches, combining more than one theory to gain insight into the complex processes that shape our social world (Dustin & Montgomery, 2010). Social work is essentially a political activity and it is constantly evolving to respond to the challenges that result from the shifting priorities of government (Gilbert & Powell, 2010). Gregory and Holloway (2005) have described social work as a socially constructed discipline in the sense that it "has been constructed and reconstructed from both inside and outside the profession as it responds to the exigencies of the prevailing social context" (Gregory & Holloway, p. 49). As a result, social work and its theoretical foundations have undergone multiple transitions throughout the history of the profession. In recent years, the profession has acknowledged its eclectic nature

by developing an anti-oppressive theoretical approach that seeks to meet the challenging research and practice needs of social workers.

Anti-oppressive social work perspectives (AOP) have their roots in the radical social work of the 1970s and early critical theories that often organized around issues of oppression, marginalization, and social exclusion based on a singular social identity such as class, race, gender, sexual orientation, etc. In the late 1990s, reformulated critical theories emerged within the field of social work that modified and merged structural perspectives with post-modern and feminist perspectives (Payne, 2005, p. 236). Leading social work theorist Payne classifies AOP as an inclusive theoretical perspective as it is based on an evidenced body of knowledge, but also explicitly permits the inclusion of other theories and models provided that they are consistent with AOP's overall aims (p.12). To this end, he describes AOP as providing a sound explanatory perspective of discriminatory social relations. He is critical of its ability to provide concrete practice prescriptions for social workers, indentifying AOP as more of a value based approach. Payne further recognizes that AOP derives from sociological and psychological explorations of the influence of difference on social exclusion (p. 270).

Dominelli is a key figure in the development of **anti-oppressive perspectives** and she broadly defines these as social work research and practice that addresses social divisions and structural inequalities (Dominelli, 2002). AOP seeks to unite perspectives concerned with the marginalizing effects of a singular social identify under one overarching perspective that addresses oppression based on a multiplicity of social identities (Payne, 2005, p. 272). AOP targets multiple oppressions based on gender, social class, race, sexuality, disability, age, religion, mental health, physical health, and nationality (Clifford & Burke, 2009, p. 41). AOP

makes use of the term **multiple oppressions** to emphasize both the multiple identities that may be oppressed as well as the multiple levels of oppression, which are the personal, cultural, and structural levels (Hick & Murray, 2009, p. 97).

AOP recognizes the complex nature of social identity and the multiple, intersecting, and diverging forms of social exclusion and oppression. At the core of AOP is the recognition of identity as “a major arena in which oppressive relationships have been elaborated” (Dominelli, 2002, p. 37). Identity carried by discourse is used by dominant groups of people in society to maintain oppression in order to preserve their power. Payne clarifies by observing that oppression is constructed through personal beliefs and behaviours that are encouraged by discourses that develop from the power exerted by privileged groups in order to sustain and strengthen their dominant position in society (2005, p. 284). Discourse is the means by which privileged and oppressed identities are constructed and sustained by dominant groups (Lin, 2008, p. 2).

The concept of **identity** forms the foundation of anti-oppressive perspectives as AOP considers all oppressions to develop from socially constructed identities that place individuals either in an accepted or a rejected social position. As Dominelli explains “oppressors attack identity – its formation and reformation ...depicting a socially constructed status as natural and immutable” (2002, p. 9). As with other taken for granted terminology, social work scholars have argued that the concept of identity needs to be problematized as identity is not equally available to all members of society and thus operates as an instrument of oppression (Skeggs, 2008, p. 11). As stated above, dominant groups in society have the capital and resources necessary to construct for themselves positive identities while dictating the identities of groups

they perceive to have lesser value.

Identity involves not only people's sense of themselves, but also their sense of who others are in relation to themselves. Identity is constructed based on physical, psychological, and sociological differences that are used to categorize individuals or groups (Hines, 2012). As identity differentiation becomes evaluative, discourses come to define certain identities as superior in opposition to others that become defined as inferior; these socially constructed symbolic representations result in "them-us" divisions based on identified traits perceived to be associated with membership in each group (Dominelli, 2002, p. 38). This identity formation process is often referred to as "othering" and it involves the exercise of power in the competitive comparison of people based on identified criteria for inclusion/exclusion (p. 45). The excluded are labelled with "outside" identities, while the "insiders" construct for themselves privileged identities. As there are multiple identities, individuals can simultaneously be oppressed by some aspects of their identity while they oppress others on different aspects of identity.

An aspect of the 'othering' process involves treating 'difference' as deviant or pathological and, therefore, undesirable. If the dominant group's definition of normality is accepted, it becomes the yardstick whereby everyone is measured. That is, their norms become universalized and taken as the natural way of ordering daily practices or conceptualizing events. Those who have alternate views ... are likely to be considered deviant and dangerous. (Dominelli, 2002, p. 17) As both oppression and identity are socially constructed, some clarification of the social constructionist perspective is needed. **Social constructionism** is a theoretical approach that contends that our shared perception of reality is actually a creation

that results from the social interaction of individuals and groups (Payne, 2005, p. 7). As Payne explains, we share our ideas about what constitutes our social reality and these ideas are then legitimised by processes that attach meanings to these understandings; our collective ideas are then integrated into our culturally dependent conceptions of specific social phenomena. The discourse used to talk about social issues is thus both representative of our understanding of the issue as well as restrictive in terms of the possibility of responses to the issue. Simply stated, “language is the means by which humans socially construct their world” (Filmer, Jenks, Seale, Thoburn & Walsh, 2006, p. 34). Social constructivism is criticized for its failure to recognize the influence of broader social forces (ie. capitalism) on observable social outcomes (Giddens & Duneier, 2000, p. 109). The potential for this perspective to conceal forces such as capitalism is of significant concern, particularly in anti-oppressive social work. With this in mind, social constructionism has been reworked by some theorists to acknowledge the real existence of broader social forces, while contending the impossibility of humans to accurately perceive of these forces given their imperfect and biased perceptual abilities (Shaw, 2009, p. 192). The power of these broader social forces are thus understood to act both inside and outside of the discourses used to understand them.

As previously mentioned, **discourses** are collections of language and action containing all that can be written, thought, said or done in regards to a particular thing, context or field of knowledge (Layder, 2006, p. 119). Discourses are multiple and contain competing representations of our social world that clash against each other in an ongoing struggle for acceptance. They are not neutral, but carry the power to “shape the social and physical world, and construct the individual” (Sharp & Richardson, 2001, p. 196). Within any given setting

multiple discourses transmitting competing representations contest each other in an ongoing, shifting process that results in continuous evolution in the meanings and practices embedded within our social world (Scmidt, 2008, p. 236). As certain discourses become dominant, they normalize certain identities and social practices while defining others as deviant, inferior, or problematic (Layder, 2006, p. 123). Dominant discourses become “ingrained in our common sense views about the world, and become regarded as normative” (Speer, 2005, p. 7). For example, discourses are often gendered, offering the primary means by which patriarchal norms and social practices are sustained and reproduced across society (Speer, p. 7). Discourses also contain the power to elevate people who are knowledgeable about the discourse over those who are perceived as outside of it. In this way, discourses result in the formation of power relations between ‘knowing’ and ‘unknowing’ groups of people, with the earlier group coming to dominate the latter.

AOP connects discourse, identity, and oppression through a social constructionist perspective that challenges social workers to identify discursive representations in order to understand the role of power and language in everyday practices (Ward, 2009). Power is a contested term and there are a number of perspectives on its definition (Abercrombie, Hill, & Turner, 1988, pp. 192-193). Within AOP, **power** enacted through dominant discourses is understood as a process or instrument that operates according to the logic of inside/outside or inclusion/exclusion (Scmidt, 2008). Power legitimizes certain people, ideas, and social practices, while marginalizing, excluding, or oppressing others (Danaher, Schirato, & Webb, 2000). Anti-oppressive social work perspectives require researchers to explore the ways in which identities are socially constructed in discourse within particular social and historical contexts in order to

challenge and subvert oppression (Sundar, 2009, p. 101). The AOP research strategy has been identified as anti-reductionist and historically specific, materialist, political, focused on difference, internationalist, and reflexive (McLaughlin, 2007, p. 131). In other words, AOP research involves the exploration of power and the analysis of difference in both historical and political contexts while remaining aware of wider contexts that may influence the local level. AOP contributes to the entire development of my thesis as it necessitates the investigation of the role of discourses in the creation of sex trade identities and the concurrent exploration of the influence of these constructed identities on policy responses to street sex work in a specific local context. In the course of my research, AOP has caused me to think analytically about power and social relations through the identification and deconstruction of sex trade discourses that potentially have oppressed people during the complex process of local governance (Baines, 2007).

Governance and Anti-oppressive Perspectives

As previously mentioned, **governance** is a political process focused on policy creation in an arena where competing interests exist (Minnery, 2007, p. 328). The term 'governance' refers to the modes or approaches to governing, while 'governing' is the actual outcome of this policy creation process (Jessop, 1998, p. 30). Governance provides the arena and means by which discourses compete, necessitating my analysis of this complex process. Informed by the AOP framework detailed above, this thesis explores the social construction of sex work identities and the concurrent development of governance response policies to the street sex trade documented in texts in order to uncover possible oppressions in one local context.

Governance is the process by which various players exert their collective and individual

powers in championing certain discursive positions and social identities (Sharp & Richardson, 2001). The discourses that attain dominance become policy until other positions succeed them in the on-going governance process. The victors of “discursive struggles condition what happens in specific policy-making processes” (Sharp & Richardson, 2001, p. 196). Minnery explains that the players involved in championing various discursive positions in the governance process include individuals and groups from the three key societal sectors of state, market, and civil society. This process includes elected members of government, but also includes players such as city employees, business owners, and residential associations.

In keeping with Minnery I understand the **state** to encompass the formal institutions tasked with distributing public resources and making decisions within specific administrative and legal frameworks (Minnery, 2007, p. 329). In democratic nations, the state’s authority to make decisions is supported by the electoral delegation of legitimized power. I understand the **market** to refer to the commercial institutions utilized by business in the exchange of their goods, services, and labour for monetary resources. In capitalist societies, interactions within these institutions are inherently antagonistic in that they rely on competition and generally produce winners and losers, though transactions at times appear to satisfy all parties (Davies, 2005, p. 312). Finally, I understand **civil society** to encompass the voluntary civic and social institutions that form around shared values and are distinct from the legitimized power of the state and the competitive commercialism of the market.

At the local level of governance, major players from within these three sectors include individuals and groups located within the area under analysis, such as neighbourhood organizations, business associations, and municipal government, some of these individuals and

groups may also have formal external connections, i.e. to higher levels of government, national or global corporations, and non-profit organizations (Minnery, 2007, p. 332).

I feel that some clarification of the term civil society is in order as the term is often criticised for its obfuscation of the divisive and oppressive potential of civil groups (Hewitt de Alcántara, 1998, p. 108). Civil society is the sphere of voluntary action based on shared values and mutual concern, but mutual interests can occur around marginalizing and oppressive ideas just as they can around progressive and liberating ones. For example, white supremacy groups are civil societies organized around shared values, but they attempt to exert their power to oppress others. Civil society can therefore be the site of considerable discursive debate. The concept is additionally criticised for creating a dichotomy between private citizens and the state (Hewitt de Alcántara, p. 108). The concept can lead to perceptions that a strong civil society requires a weak government and vice versa. Despite the criticism of the term, civil society is conceptualized as an integral player in the governance process, necessitating its inclusion in this research.

As mentioned, within the process of governance, various players champion diverse discourses with the discursive victor determining the policy outcome. While it is useful for analytical purposes to categorize these players into the key sectors of state, market, and civil society, their actual categorization is problematic. For example, does a neighbourhood business association belong in the market or civil society sector? The players within this organization conduct business in the area, but they may also reside there and their interests may go far beyond profit making. Minnery (2007) acknowledges that each of the three sectors is comprised of numerous agencies and individuals that could claim membership in one or more

of the sectors at any given time (p. 328). For example, the mayor of a city could be categorized within the state, but the mayor also resides in the city and could be categorized as a member of civil society. The categorization of local government itself is problematic as it could be categorized as state or as civil society, given its attention to civic issues. Following Minnery, I understand municipal government as a group to be part of the local state. Within this analytic framework, municipal government is perceived as co-existing with a wide network of agencies and interest groups and an organized and active business community. Municipal government represents the local state and is subject to processes of accountability and legitimacy (elections, freedom of information legislation, and due process); the other two actors (market and civil society), carry no such burden.

While categorization is definitely problematic, it is necessary to place the players within these three categories in order to deconstruct the complex governance process. I do this in my analysis while remaining cognizant that the three sectors are not entirely separate and a blurring of boundaries and responsibilities exists among them.

The conceptualization of governance as comprised of institutions (state, market, and civil society) instrumental in the creation of public policy has been identified as an **institutionalist approach** to the analysis of social action (Healey, 2006, p. 301). Governance itself is understood as **social action** in that it is the participation of the public in the process of social change with policy development as the intended outcome (Beall, 2001, p. 359). The institutionalist approach originated with Giddens' Theory of Structuration and it is useful in anti-oppressive analyses as it allows the concept of governance to be broken down or deconstructed into its smaller parts, allowing for a detailed analysis of the players and

discourses involved (or not involved) in the governance process (Beall).

Giddens' Theory of Structuration conceptualizes society as comprised of institutions, which themselves consist of resources and pre-existing societal rules (Keil, 2006, p. 338). Giddens developed structuration theory in an attempt to resolve the dichotomies produced by previous social theorists including the dichotomy between agency and structure (Healey, 2006, p. 303). Giddens argues that the existence of both agency and structure are dependent on each other and that they exist in a dialectical rather than dichotomous relationship (Giddens, 1979, p. 53). He further posits that to understand this relationship, social theorists need to acknowledge the importance of temporality. Giddens suggests that the examination of social issues necessitates the examination of what he terms the "threefold intersection of difference", that is the aspects of time, space, and structure (p. 55). For Giddens, any examination of the surface of a social issue also requires the examination of the meaning or paradigms hidden beneath this surface. According to Giddens "the concept of structuration involves that of the duality of structure, which relates to the fundamentally recursive character of social life, and expresses the mutual dependence of structure and agency" (p. 69). He clarifies what he means by 'duality of structure' by underscoring its reflexive nature in that it is both the medium and the outcome of social action.

Giddens' ideas resonate with anti-oppressive perspectives as they focus attention on the analyses of social practices across time and space. His Theory of Structuration has recently been re-conceptualized into what is now identified as **new institutionalism**. Within new institutionalism the unassailable structures of the past are replaced by conceptualizations of ever changing institutions that involve collective groups of people in "patterned interactions

that are predictable based upon specific relationships among the actors” (Beall, 2001, p. 339).

A key shift in ideas is between predictable rather than pre-determined social actions as predictable actions may or may not occur. This approach to the analysis of governance underscores the role of individual and collective groups of actors and the importance of their perceptions, interpretations, and actions in the development of social policy across time.

Taken together, the anti-oppressive and governance frameworks form the basis of my analysis of the influence of local discourse on the development of governance responses to street sex work in Kamloops, BC. The institutionalist understanding of governance described above assisted in my deconstruction of the complex governance process and my analysis of the players and discourses involved (or not involved) in this process. It caused me to specifically explore the discourses championed by various players within the sectors of state, market, and civil society in order to uncover the discursive representations around sex trade identities contained within these discourses. These frameworks further allowed me to make connections between the specific governance responses promoted by each institutional sector and the discursive representations used in their promotion. Finally, these two frameworks assisted my analysis of the oppressive potential contained within the discourses actively influencing the development of sex trade governance response policy in the context of one small city.

Sex Trade Discourses: The International Literature

A considerable body of international research has explored discourses concerning social representations of the street sex trade and the influence these have on the development of policy responses (Benoit & Shaver, 2006; Brown, Higgitt, Miller, Wingert, Williams, & Morrisette, 2006; Hallgrimsdottir et al., 2008a; Hubbard, et al., 2008; Larsen, 1992; Lowman,

2001; O'Neill, Campbell, Hubbard, Pitcher & Scoular, 2008; Tani, 2002). Overall, this work demonstrates that ongoing discursive struggles to define street sex work result in shifting policy responses (Hubbard & Sanders, 2003). One Canadian study examining policy responses to street sex work linked changes in policy direction to society's social construction of the identities of women (Lowman, n.d.). Other research has examined modern day conceptualizations in European cities, contending that local talk about the street sex trade classifies it as adverse to neighbourhood values and hence, out of place in healthy communities (O'Neill et al.). In one British city, research demonstrated how the moralizing talk of vocal residents resulted in community responses to street sex work requiring the banishment of workers from neighbourhoods (Hubbard, 1998). In Finland, research explored the influence of vocal residents and their perceived right to claim ownership of their neighbourhood to 'protect' it from street sex work (Tani, 2002). In Victoria, British Columbia, Canadian newspaper coverage of the street sex trade was analyzed with researchers concluding that over time, three discourses (containment, culpability, and contagion) were used to stigmatize sex work, producing context specific responses to the trade in that city (Hallgrimsdottir et al., 2008a).

Taken collectively, this international body of research suggests that discourses produced and/or repeated by local government, businesses owners, and community members compete in an on-going evolution of policy responses to the street sex trade (Hubbard & Sanders, p. 75). This makes this international body of literature and the sex trade discourses contained within it vital to my overall research aims as I seek to explore what discourse analysis can tell us about the governance actions taken within Kamloops, BC in response to the street sex trade. After reviewing this international body of work I sought to build on it by adding an exploration into

the small city context. As I mentioned in Chapter 1, the vast majority of international research concerning identity representations of and responses to the street sex trade focuses on large metropolises and as a result, we lack an understanding of how these may or may not differ in the context of the small city. In Chapter 3, I discuss how the international sex trade discourses discussed below merge with my AOP and governance frameworks to direct the development of my methods and the analysis of my data. Five discourses pertaining to the street sex trade are found within the international body of sex trade response literature and it is these five discourses that influence the overall development of my work. These are the discourses of contagion, culpability, and containment, conceptualized most clearly by Hallgrimsdottir and his Canadian team of researchers (2008a), and the discourses of regulation and abolition which I conceptualized based on the overarching themes found in multiple works within the body of literature (Francis, 2006; Howell et al., 2008; Hubbard, 1997; Hubbard, 1998; Hubbard, 2004; Hubbard & Sanders, 2003; Hubbard et al, 2008; Kerkin, 2004; Lowman, 2000; O'Neill et al., 2008; Tani, 2002). I detail the conceptualizations of these five discourses in the remainder of this section.

Contagion discourses focus on the conceptualization of the sellers of sex and describe fabled qualities of health, personality, and upbringing that people engaged in the trade are purported to possess. These discourses are used to validate community responses that seek to eradicate the street sex trade by detailing the perceived risks posed by the seller of sex to the general public (Hubbard & Sanders, 2003, p. 79). Within overriding contagion discourses are themes of pollution, defilement, disgust, and desire. Themes of pollution and defilement detail the perceived risk of moral or medical infection posed by sex workers. Themes of disgust and

desire detail society's disapproval of the perceived yearning of men for women who exhibit unbounded sexuality.

Hallgrimsdottir, Phillips, Benoit, & Walby (2008b) assert that society absorbs contagion discourses and then uses them to justify the containment of the sex trade to specific spaces within the city. This includes the use of spatial confinement to control contagion and to produce morally aesthetic urban space; fictitious discussions around culpability leading to the need to rescue 'diseased' sex workers; and fabricated medical dialogues positioning sex workers as carriers of moral and medical sickness (p. 125-126). Modern and historical narratives unearthed by these researchers demonstrate discourses detailing a visible street sex trade that contaminates public space via immorality or disease, leading to a singular response based on visibility and spatial confinement. These researchers establish a correlation between contagion discourses and increasing citizen concern for regulating order by means of urban gentrification and the use of policing strategies such as toleration and/or exclusion zones.

Culpability discourses focus on the conceptualization of the sex worker by purporting to detail the extent to which society can hold those who sell their sex accountable for their own actions. These discourses encompass themes of salvation and repression, prompting responses to the street sex trade that seek to save the sex worker or alternatively, eradicate her due to her own immorality and criminalized identity (Hallgrimsdottir et al., 2008a). The sex worker is conceptualized as either a "fallen woman" who cannot be rescued due to her own depravity or as a "victim," cognitively and psychologically incapable of exercising agency (p. 269-270). Hallgrimsdottir et al. (2008a) note a shift in culpability discourses evident in newspaper media reports in Victoria, British Columbia in the early 1990s, with discourses of 'victimhood' and 'risk'

dominating discourses of the ‘fallen woman.’ They attribute this discursive shift to wider changes in state and policy discourses, which identified abuse as a unifying feature of sex worker experiences, both prior to and during their involvement in the sex trade (Hallgrimsdottir et al., p. 271).

Culpability and contagion discourses are used to rationalize two competing theoretical standpoints regarding society’s ‘optimal’ response to the street sex trade. The abolitionist standpoint is comprised of an increasingly volatile and moralizing rhetoric linking the street sex trade with urban decay, disorder, and gender inequality. This is countered by the regulation standpoint which includes arguments for sex worker rights led by some sex workers, feminists, and civil libertarians (Hallgrimsdottir et al., 2008a, p. 123). These discourses inform policy decisions and responses to the street sex trade, with abolitionists calling for responses that ultimately lead to the elimination of all sex work and regulationists demanding responses that contain and regulate the trade.

Abolitionist discourses depict the sex trade as intolerable, with foundational rationales in a diversity of theoretical traditions from religion to conservative family ideals to radical feminist philosophy. The unifying theme is a total rejection of the idea that sex is a commodity that should be available for purchase. Regardless of the foundational basis, these narratives all assert that the sex trade always involves exploitation (Bindel & Kelly, 2003, p. 24). Feminist abolitionists perceive all forms of sex work as manifestations of sexual inequality, the exploitation of women and an increase in men’s power over them (Lakeman 2009b, p. 5). The underlying theory is that sex work is a form of violence against women that threatens to control all women, regardless of their proximity to the sex trade.

The aim of advocates utilizing abolitionist discourses is the total eradication of the sex trade via the increased criminalization of activities viewed as exploitive (Lakeman, 2009a, p. 143). Feminist advocates do not support the criminalization of sex workers; instead they support the increased criminalization of those attempting to buy sexual services along with the provision of resources to assist people in exiting the sex trade. Abolitionist discourses are situated within discourses of culpability and can be read as reproducing dominant values of women with impaired personal agency in need of 'salvation' and 'rescue.' They can also be read as reproducing dominant discourses of female sexuality that invalidates the idea that women can exercise 'free agency' in choosing to commodify their sexuality.

Containment discourses are utilized by advocates of regulation to validate responses to the street sex trade that seek to confine it rather than abolish it. These narratives originate in discourses of contagion and represent collective attempts of a community to purify certain spaces of all the physical, mental, and political dangers believed inherent in the co-location of the street sex trade (Hubbard & Sanders, 2003, p. 82). Intrinsic to these discourses are the themes of disgust, desire, pollution, and defilement. These themes affirm that within a "rational and heterosexually-ordered city" the sex trade is needed to assuage male desire, but it must be confined to specific spaces of the city to reduce the risk of corrupting 'healthy' or normalized expressions of female sexuality, which must also be confined to the private home (Hubbard & Sanders, p. 82). The preservation of an active street sex trade to serve the needs of male desire connects containment discourses with regulation discourses, discussed later.

Containment discourses are extremely powerful in their ability to appeal to economic and moral interests. Research bears out that these discourses provide the basis for many

modern day responses to the street sex trade both within Canadian cities and abroad (Hubbard, et al., 2008; Jones et al., 2005; Kerkin, 2004; Lowman, 2000; O'Neill et al., 2008; Tani, 2002).

In a comparison of prostitution control policy in four large Canadian cities, Larsen (1992) exposes the vital role of economic objectives and the gentrification of inner-city neighbourhoods in increasing local suspicions of the street sex trade as “polluting,” leading to policy responses that contained and excluded it (Larsen, p. 187). Research in Sarasota, Florida explored the effectiveness of city government plans to assemble a team of planners, police officers, and architects to zone out the street sex trade via increased police patrols and tax breaks to stimulate redevelopment and gentrification of neglected neighbourhoods (Plaster Carter et al., 2003). In the Netherlands, the *Law of Municipalities* resulted in nine Dutch cities adopting zoning by-laws allowing for *tippelzones* where the street sex trade was legally tolerated, while in England and Wales, ‘vice squads’ concentrated the sex trade in informal toleration areas, displacing it to new areas only in response to community complaints (Hubbard et al., 2008).

Howell et al. (2008) examined the decision by Liverpool’s municipal government to consider the creation of a managed zone for the street sex trade, contrasting this with alternative municipal strategies. The researchers effectively identified major municipal models of response to the street sex trade in diverse European locales. In Glasgow, aggressive attempts at suppression combined with a powerful alliance of class ideologies, feminism, and philanthropic calls for education, reform, and protection to produce a mixed response of repression and rescue work grounded in discourses of culpability and abolition. In Manchester, zero-tolerance policing exemplified regulation discourses, as did Liverpool’s toleration zones.

Overriding discourses of abolition and regulation appeared to motivate the municipal responses evident in Howell et al. and in other work (Bindel & Kelly, 2003; Hallgrimsdottir et al., 2008a; Hallgrimsdottir et al, 2008b; Hubbard, 1998; Hubbard, et al., 2008; Kerkin, 2004; O'Neill et al., 2008; Scoular & O'Neill, 2007; Tani, 2002).

Regulation discourses concede that the sex trade has and always will exist and society should therefore focus on the mediation of the harms perceived to be associated with it (Howell et al., 2008, p. 238). Regulation discourses support standpoints perceiving the sex trade as necessary in the pacification of male desire. There are two layers of rationale within these discourses, one based on the rights of adults to commodify their own sexuality, the other on the nuisance aspects associated with the street sex trade and the need to lessen community impacts without 'wasting time' on ineffective attempts at abolition (Bindel & Kelly, 2003, p. 12). Some prostitution rights advocates assert that the decriminalization potential contained within regulation discourses respects personal agency and legitimizes sex work, while reducing the associated harms posed to sex workers by policies that seek to suppress the trade. Other narratives within regulation discourses uphold the rights and privileges of men to own and possess women as objects via their commodified sexuality (Lakeman, 2009, p. 151).

Regulation discourses do not necessarily advocate for legalization, but rather champion increased enforcement to regulate and contain the trade, so that it continues to be available for those who want to seek it out. These discourses can be read as aspiring to protect 'good society' and preserve patriarchal rights by concealing the sex trade from the "respectable public gaze (i.e. that of innocent women and children)" (Hubbard & Sanders, 2003, p. 82). Regulation discourses are situated within discourses of contagion and can be interpreted as reproducing

dominant values that the sex trade endangers the sanctity of family or the perceived purity of normalized female sexuality.

Contagion, culpability, abolition, containment, and regulation discourses produce diverse responses to the street sex trade, ranging from advocacy calling for the legalization of prostitution to reactive clampdowns on visible nuisances to informal tolerance or 'blind eye' approaches. Taken as a whole, this research demonstrates that current discursive debates have resulted in a myriad of legal and policy responses that often jeopardize the safety of street sex workers. This body of literature formed the foundation of my research exploration of small city governance responses to the street sex trade in Kamloops, BC. My review of this work led me to question the influence of discourse on the development of governance responses to the street sex trade the context of the small city.

Summary

International research demonstrates the influence of local actors and discursive struggles on the development of governance responses to the street sex trade. This work provided me with a road map for my analysis of governance responses to the street sex trade in the context of the small city. It focused my attention on the influence of discourse on the development of local social policy and encouraged my use of anti-oppressive social work perspectives in the construction of my conceptual framework. As stated above, AOP underscores the central role of discourse in the construction and valuation/devaluation of identities and the use of these (de)valued identities in oppressive practices. The international research further necessitated my conceptualization of governance as it demonstrates that governance is the means by which discourses compete, identities are constructed and valued,

and oppressive practices are normalized and/or challenged.

Within the international literature five discursive constructions of sex work have been identified by researchers, these are contagion, culpability, containment, regulation, and abolition. Within large urban landscapes, local discourses generate highly variable policy responses; in some cases formal or informal toleration zones are produced, while in other cases the sex trade is forced off the street where “sexuality can be commodified with apparent impunity; the repression of the sex worker in discourse mirrored in her placement in the unknown, invisible city” (Hubbard, 2002, p. 372). However, there is little Canadian research concerning local governance of the sex trade and none that examines policy responses within the context of the small city.

My research explores local governance responses to street sex work in the small city context; in doing this I draw on anti-oppressive social work perspectives as they focus research on the construction and valuing/devaluing of identity through dominant discourses that in turn legitimize certain forms of practice. I also draw on conceptions of governance as a process involving players from state, market, and civil society in the setting of local agendas and the development and implementation of local social policy and practice as this institutionalist understanding allows the complex process of governance to be broken down and analyzed. The governance process is “multi-level” and complex in that it involves “interactions between public and private actors ...both vertically and horizontally, some happening spontaneously others created deliberately” (Davies, 2005, p. 313). The process may be both cooperative and conflictual.

Informed by the conceptual framework described above (international literature, AOP,

governance), I analyzed individual and collective actors and explored their representations, interpretations and actions, as well as the parallel development of local social policy. In the following chapter I introduce discourse analysis as the methodology used in my research, and I identify the specific methods of data collection and analysis that enabled understanding of discursive representations of street sex work in Kamloops and of local responses to the street sex trade in the context of this small city.

Chapter 3 – Methodology

In this thesis, I explore the social construction of sex work identities and the concurrent development of governance response policies to the street sex trade documented in texts in order to uncover possible oppressions in one local context. In this chapter, I present the methodology and methods of my research. I begin with a review of the three components of my conceptual framework and their contribution to the selection of discourse analysis as my methodology. I then provide a general overview of socio-cultural discourse analysis and elucidate the processes used to collect and analyze my data. I conclude with a discussion of both the benefits and the limitations of my research.

Methodology is a key component of the qualitative research endeavour as it links the underlying philosophy of the thesis with the methods used to carry it out (Nicholls, 2009). As detailed in Chapter 2, this thesis is grounded in anti-oppressive social work perspectives (AOP), an institutional conceptualization of governance, and international sex trade discourses. International research demonstrates the influence of discourse on the development of governance responses to the street sex trade, directing my analysis of the discourses influencing governance responses to street sex work in Kamloops, BC. The focus on discourse fit with my subscription to anti-oppressive social work perspectives as AOP is concerned with the central role of discourse in the construction and valuation of identities and the use of these (de)valued identities in oppressive practices (Dominelli, 2002). As previously discussed, governance is the means by which discourses compete and the process by which identities are constructed and social policy is produced (Sharp & Richardson, 2001). I developed an institutionalist understanding of governance to assist in my exploration of the players involved

in the local governance process. Informed by the international literature, AOP, and an institutionalist understanding of governance I analyzed the discourses championed by individual and collective actors, exploring their representations, interpretations, and actions, and their influence on the development of local social policy.

As I discussed in detail in Chapter 2, multiple discourses operate simultaneously, vying for dominance in the representation of our social identities during the process of governance. AOP notes that social identities are constructed through dominant discourses that value certain individuals and groups and devalue others. Representations of identity classify certain people as ‘good/right/normal’ and others as ‘bad/wrong/deviant.’ These representations are then used to promote and justify particular governance practices. In maintaining social practices, dominant discourses appear natural and deny their own biases by appealing to common sense. They support existing power relations and tend to be accepted by most of the people most of the time in a given place and space. With this in mind, I developed my methods and analysis to explore what discourse analysis tells us about the governance actions that developed in response to the street sex trade in Kamloops, BC between 2002 and 2009.

Discourse Analysis

The deconstruction of “dominant categories of identity to diminish their hegemonic potential” forms the core of anti-oppressive social work practice and research (Dominelli, 2002, p. 49). This is accomplished through discourse analysis (DA). DA encompasses a set of methods used to identify the social discourses available in a given culture and society at a given time (Gavey, 1997, p. 56). The focus is on the social context of language and its relationship to current power structures and policy responses. DA methods aim to provide historical and

current analyses exploring the workings of power in relation to a specific interest (in this case the street sex trade) and to analyze social action (governance). DA corresponds to anti-oppressive perspectives as it can be used to identify “taken-for-granted ideas about particular phenomena...and how these reflect particular historical, political and/or moral positions” (White, 2009, p. 162). DA used in anti-oppressive research aims to expose social constructions where none are thought to exist (Shaw, 2009, P. 193). As previously detailed, AOP contends that oppression is maintained through discourse during the governance process; necessitating the adoption of DA as my methodological approach (Payne, 2005, p. 284).

Discourse analysis methodological approaches are informed by anti-oppressive ideas, including those emerging from post-modernism (Speer, 2005, p. 14). As a qualitative form of textual analysis, DA involves the examination of the ‘language’ (face-to-face talk, nonverbal interactions, images, symbols, documents) used to ‘talk’ about social phenomena and construct social identities (Shaw & Bailey, 2009). DA offers a means by which researchers can deconstruct social practices that give meaning to our social world (Clarke, 2005). DA methods are rooted in either of two distinct traditions. The linguistic tradition is concerned with language and how words are used to give meaning to our experience (Nicholls, 2009, p. 589). This tradition treats text as the actual object of analysis, whereas the socio-cultural tradition treats texts as windows into human experience and is more concerned with what words do as opposed to what words mean (Ryan & Bernard, 2000, p. 769). Socio-cultural approaches can be used to link actions to discursive representations of phenomenon such as the street sex trade. Socio-cultural approaches to DA are concerned with knowledge as a product of society’s power relations and with uncovering the institutions that value certain forms of knowledge over others (Nicholls, p.

589). These approaches are political and aim to better understand and challenge society's valuation of some ways of thinking and acting over others. They explore the competing explanations of events and phenomena offered by those seeking to define or redefine problems in various ways (Patterson, 2006, p. 294). Socio-cultural approaches focus either on the actions of participants in particular events or on the general characteristics of discourse communities that develop in relation to specific issues such as the street sex trade. Researchers utilize a variety of socio-cultural DA methods to explore the ways in which social phenomena are created, institutionalized, and absorbed into local culture. This approach is highly compatible with the AOP foundation of my thesis as anti-oppressive research seeks to deconstruct practices that marginalize or oppress vulnerable groups (Potts & Brown, 2008).

There are a range of approaches within the socio-cultural DA tradition and these are not easily defined (Shaw & Bailey, 2009, p. 413). As Shaw and Baily explain, there are overlaps in terms of underlying theory, but approaches vary depending on the level of the social world under study. Micro-level approaches focus on understanding participant perspectives and how cultural and communication patterns inform individual behaviour; one such approach is sociolinguistic discourse analysis. Meso-level approaches place less emphasis on individual experience and more on connections with broader cultural contexts; an example of this approach is discursive psychological analysis which focuses on understanding the meaning and function of statements in the context of the emotions and lives in which they occur. Macro-level approaches involve the study of both language and societal principles or beliefs; the Foucauldian approach is one example.

The initial concern of socio-cultural DA approaches is the role of power and knowledge

in society. These approaches aim to identify the patterns of discourses as they relate to specific phenomena, demonstrate how these patterns constitute aspects of society, and then establish how “the language available to us sets limits on what is (and is not) possible to think, say and do” (Shaw & Bailey, 2009, p. 415). Socio-cultural DA approaches lead to the deconstruction of taken-for-granted assumptions and increased insight into the meaning or consequences of these assumptions on individual actions and society.

The socio-cultural DA approach calls for detailed analyses of discourses to deconstruct social practices and community conventions in order to explore the ideas and messages that shape and constrain individual and social actions (Speer, 2005, p. 15). These approaches are inherently political and aim to examine texts in order to uncover the discourses that operate to naturalize unequal power arrangements in society. This methodology is the best fit for my thesis as it connects my conceptual framework to my research goal by demanding analysis of the discourses operating to produce oppressive governance responses to the specific issue of the street sex trade.

A criticism of DA methodologies is that they produce subjective research results, while the ‘objective’ knowledge of positivist worldviews is often more highly valued (Lazar, 2009). I acknowledge that my thesis represents one possible narrative description of street sex trade governance in Kamloops, BC and that other narrative accounts could differ from the one that I have produced. DA aims to stimulate new ways of thinking about our response to social issues. The findings and results of DA are rigorously produced interpretations rather than objective discoveries and they are well supported with details about study setting, research sample, and methodology, allowing readers to judge for themselves the credibility and plausibility of the

interpretation (Shaw & Bailey, 2009, p. 418).

While guarding against dismissive criticisms regarding subjectivity versus objectivity, it is important for me to acknowledge my own subjective position within this work. Subjectivity is understood to encompass “the conscious and unconscious thoughts and emotions of the individual, her sense of herself and her ways of understanding her relation to the world” (Weedon, cited in Gavey, 1997, p. 54). As researchers, our subjective identities influence our interpretations of the social world and our knowledge production capabilities. It is therefore important to be upfront about who we are as researchers; we play a role in the construction of knowledge and this can be influenced by what we know and where we are currently situated within societal discourse (Speer, 2005, p. 26). My subjective positions currently are anti-oppressive in theoretical alignment, female, heterosexual, nonreligious, able-bodied, and educated in terms of social location. I am a social worker, currently a resident of Kamloops, and was a television and radio news journalist in this city until 2007. I acknowledge that my research results can be viewed as simply another discourse, but its intention is to spur conversation about the street sex trade and our taken-for-granted views of and responses to it and those involved in it, and it is my hope that such conversation will occur within my own community.

Another criticism of discourse analysis is the limited capacity of this form of research to generate policy recommendations. This is due to its deliberate focus on historically and culturally crafted meaning, precluding the suggestion of policy solutions. DA generally explores “how it is that individual [or social] experience comes to be understood in particular terms” (Gubrium & Holstein, 2000, p. 495). DA approaches generally aim to stimulate analytical

conversations about social issues by initially exploring one context in which the issue is taking place (Sharp & Richardson, 2001, p. 207). Proponents of DA question whether the generation of policy recommendations is an appropriate expectation of all forms of research. Still, DA does provide researchers with the capacity to make policy observations and to make future practice suggestions, particularly when it is viewed through the anti-oppressive lens. AOP promotes both reflection and action; in deconstructing existing oppressive practice it seeks to create possibilities for transformative change (Baines, 2007, p. 21).

Despite the limitations of DA approaches, this method provides the best tool for my exploration of the small city case study. This approach induces an investigation linking local talk and action to local governance responses to a specific social issue (the street sex trade). The case study method allows for the in-depth examination of the discursive processes of social exclusion operating within the small city of Kamloops in its development of governance responses to the street sex trade between 2002 and 2009.

The Small City Case Study

As mentioned above, governance discourses concerning the regulation of the street sex trade in Kamloops, BC are archived in textual materials, mainly the community's two newspapers and to a lesser extent the meeting minutes of Kamloops' City Council. I became aware of the online archives of Kamloops' City Council meeting minutes during an undergraduate research project exploring the City of Kamloops' response to women's needs and knew this would be useful to explore again as I sought to identify textual materials concerning governance responses to the street sex trade in this small city. Textual materials are defined as existing documents that archive the discourses active at a particular time in history

(Stuart, 2005). Historical discourses are contained in texts, but texts are not discourses, they represent one interpretation of the discourses active at the time that they were transcribed (Gubrium & Holstein, 2000). Textual materials contain past interpretations of actions and they are not understood to represent true or impartial depictions of historical events (Silverman, 2000, p. 826). Texts depict diverse versions of the world and are produced through the use of interpretive narratives and claims to the truth. Dissemination to large audiences enhances the power of discourse to shape the construction of reality thus rendering print media a key source of data (Mautner, 2008).

Mautner (2008) identifies two approaches to data collection, one cyclical and the other top-down. The top-down approach begins with the “universe of possible texts and progressively narrows down one’s choice” with the final result a “specialized, topic oriented and diachronic corpus” (Mautner, p. 37). It is this ‘top-down’ approach that characterized my data collection methods. As I discussed in my introductory chapter, I focused my exploration on the years between 2002 and 2009 because a shift in political power at the provincial level of politics just prior to this time period resulted in immense social change and the increased visibility of marginalized populations in Kamloops as well as elsewhere in the province.

Utilizing the City of Kamloops webpage to explore council meeting minutes and the Canadian Newsstand database to identify newspaper articles, I searched for discussions of the Kamloops street sex trade or those involved in it, as well as various responses to the Kamloops street sex trade discussed or adopted by individuals and groups in this small city. I manually reviewed all council meeting minutes between 2002 and 2009 to identify instances where the Kamloops street sex trade was mentioned within City Council chambers and retained these

texts to add to my data set. I utilized the Canadian Newsstand database as it facilitated access to full text articles for the only two locally produced newspapers (Kamloops This Week and Kamloops Daily News). After limiting my search to these two newspapers, I inputted the following search terms: prostitution, prostitute(s) sex trade, sex work, sex worker(s), hooker(s), whore(s), john(s), Social and Health Options for Persons in the Sex Trade (SHOP), sex worker rights, Red Zone(s), North Shore, undercover sting(s), and crime. AOP caused me to input terms used to construct sex worker identities, while governance caused me to input labels used locally to identify responses to sex work. As noted earlier, I have been a resident of Kamloops for many years and previously worked in broadcast media in Kamloops; this resulted in my awareness of the association of many of these search terms to the local sex trade. I acknowledge that some of these terms are derogatory, but needed to use them in my search as I was aware that these terms were used by local media and city residents to talk about the street sex trade and their responses to it.

The use of these terms resulted in multiple searches and I continued searching until the results returned to me were comprised of the same articles netted using previous search terms, often referred to as “saturation” (Mautner, 2008, p. 35). I stopped searching once I was confident that my searches were not resulting in any additional texts. I initially identified 789 texts referencing the street sex trade in Kamloops. These texts all contained one or more of my search terms and did not include any duplicate articles.

Discourse analysis depends upon very detailed data investigation and thus it is imperative to ensure that the final data set adheres strictly to the selection criteria set out by the researcher (Silverman, 2000, p. 828). As Mautner (2008, p. 37) notes, choosing data always

involves an element of subjective judgement and the key correctives are transparency and accountability. After my initial review of this large body of data I refined my selection criteria in order to adhere more closely to the aims of my research, specifically to explore local representations of the street sex trade and those involved in it, as well as actions that were discussed or taken in response to the street sex trade in Kamloops between 2002 and 2009 in order to gain insight into the governance of the street sex trade in the context of the small city.

After reading through all 789 texts I was able to eliminate texts that did not explicitly meet the above criteria for inclusion. For example, I eliminated texts documenting the outcome of court proceedings, human interest stories about volunteers, and editorial articles about sex work on an international and provincial scale. I was left with 443 texts pertaining specifically to the governance of the street sex trade in this small city.

While 443 texts sounds like an overwhelming number, and I must admit that I did find this data set cumbersome, the majority were short newspaper articles. Thus I did not draw a sample from these texts, but chose to analyze them all in order to gain insight into the governance of the street sex trade in Kamloops between 2002 and 2009. I should note that many of the newspaper texts were produced by the same authors. Kamloops is a small city and there are a limited amount of journalists working at the city's two newspaper publications. As I previously stated, texts are interpretations of events and are influenced by the authors that produce them. The journalists producing the texts I analyzed convey their own assumptions through their work and the biases they may impart on these texts could be another entire area of study.

Data Analysis

Jäger and Maier (2009) suggest specific terminology to aid in making the structure of discourses more transparent and amenable to analysis. Four terms that are particularly relevant to my analysis are discourse strands, discursive events, discourse fragments, and discursive positions. Discourse strands are flows of discourse centred on a specific topic, i.e. the sex trade. They can be examined at specific points in time as well as over long periods of time. Discursive events occur at a particular point in time and influence the development of discourse in particular contexts. Discourse fragments consist of elements traditionally referred to as texts or parts of text that deal with a particular topic. Discursive positions consist of ideological positions that social actors take up and espouse.

I utilized QSR International NVivo 8 qualitative data analysis software to aid in the analysis of my final data set of 443 texts. I imported all of my texts into NVivo 8 and read and re-read them, initially organizing them according to the year in which they appeared. I soon realized that the discursive strands contained within each text spanned multiple years and hence, organization by year was not an effective analytical strategy. This initial analysis resulted in the identification of 17 discursive strands that explicitly concerned the governance of the street sex trade in Kamloops between 2002 and 2009 (see Table 1). I labelled each of the 17 discursive strands to reflect the specific topic that they addressed. For example, texts or text segments pertaining to the development of bylaw responses to the street sex trade in Kamloops were placed into the Bylaw Response discursive strand, while text or text segments that discussed the perceived consequences of the street sex trade on the North Shore neighbourhood were placed in the North Shore Sex Stroll discursive strand. The discursive

strands all represent the specific topics relating to the governance of the street sex trade that were archived in the texts in Kamloops; research in different locales would likely produce different discursive strands with which the researcher could organize their texts.

With the assistance NVivo 8, I looked for segments of the texts that represented each of the 17 categories. I identified 1, 225 text segments (or discourse fragments) pertaining to the governance of the street sex trade and placed each within its appropriate category. I then analyzed the discourse fragments in each category in isolation. My analysis was informed by the conceptual frameworks detailed in Chapter 2. AOP caused me to focus on the construction of sex worker identities contained within each discourse fragment and to question how this construction might sanction or challenge oppressive social practices. My institutionalist understanding of governance resulted in my identification and classification of the players involved in championing various discursive strands. Finally, international sex trade discourses provided me with a point of comparison, causing me to look within my data for evidence of the five discourses found within other research. After analyzing the discursive fragments independently, I then re-read them with the discourses of contagion, culpability, containment, regulation, and abolition in mind. The results of this analysis are detailed Chapters 4 and 5 where I present my findings and discuss the results of my analysis.

During my analysis, I adapted analytical sub-categories from Reisigl and Wodak (2009) which included the naming of social actors (nomination); traits, qualities, and features attributed to social actors (predication); arguments and argumentation schemes used by specific persons or social groups to justify or challenge specific nominations and predications; expressed perspectives or points of view; overttness, intensification or mitigation of utterances.

Once I had analyzed discourse fragments within each of the 17 categories, I then examined themes across the categories looking for similarities and differences in nomination, predication, arguments and argumentation schemes, perspectives or points of view, and overttness, intensification or mitigation. This facilitated the identification of various discursive positions that appeared to impact the governance of the sex trade in this small city. For example, my analysis resulted in grouping discourse fragments such as ‘battleground,’ ‘under siege,’ ‘minefield,’ and ‘war zone,’ into the broader theme of ‘war.’ Alternatively, discourse fragments such as ‘no woman wants to be a junkie hooker when she grows up’ and ‘to buy sex from a prostitute is paramount to serial rape’ were identified as argumentation schemes that were grouped into the broader theme of ‘victim.’ My analytical process was recursive, resulting in the emergence of new insights as I read and re-read the data. Throughout this process I referred back to conceptualizations of governance as well as international sex trade discourses, both described in Chapter 2.

In positivist research, reliability and validity are core issues. However, Wood and Kroger (2000) note that within discourses analysis, reliability or the expectation of producing the same findings across samples and raters is unrealistic. Conventional researchers assert that research variables have the same qualities regardless of context and hence, reliability and validity can be assessed independent from context. Discourse analysts argue that this does not apply to the social world where meaning is always interpretive and interpretations are always contextual and provisional. Wood and Kroger thus suggest that interpretive work must be judged on other criteria including orderliness, demonstration, coherence, plausibility, and fruitfulness (p. 169-176).

The fundamental tasks associated with discourse analysis are identifying the data set, reading, identifying themes, and constructing models summarizing these themes (Ryan & Bernard, 2000, p. 780). This is the orderly 'doing' of discourse analysis. To this end, as noted above, I identified and interpreted the context of the discourse to determine if similar meanings were emerging. During this iterative process of data analysis, it was important for me to remind myself of my aim of developing one narrative account detailing the development of governance responses to the street sex trade in the small city of Kamloops between 2002 and 2009. I found the data analysis process to be an evolving work that seemed to spiral in from a broad generalized overview of the data to a more narrowed focus as my understanding of the data became clearer. With my principal aim in mind, I was able to keep to Hodder's recommendations for the interpretation of textual materials (Hodder, 2000). These three key principles focused my analysis on similarities and difference, context, and theory. I examined and re-examined the discursive fragments looking for similarities and differences, patterns and competing messages, as well as the specifics of time and place. And I considered and re-considered the relevance of previous research, assessing its relevance to my data and vice-versa. Finally, utilizing Hodder's principle of coherence I assessed the strengths of my findings and their internal coherence. I assert that internal coherence was reached as the pieces of my narrative argument do not contradict each other and the conclusion flows plausibly from the premise (Hodder, 2000, p. 712). I also assert that external coherence was achieved as my findings fit within and complement existing theories concerning the governance of the street sex trade. As I previously stated, I acknowledge that my work represents one narrative account of the governance of the street sex trade in Kamloops, BC and that other narrative accounts

could differ from the one that I have produced. There is no single correct interpretation of social phenomenon and different interpretations reflect shifting contexts, different perspectives, and perhaps different analytical concepts (Wood & Kroger, 2000, p. 165). Finally, I assert that this narrative also proves fruitful in terms of inspiring possibilities for change in everyday practices as well as further research concerning the governance of the sex trade in the small city; this is discussed further in Chapter 6.

Summary

As I discussed above, I employed socio-cultural discourse analysis to explore discursive representations of the street sex trade in relation to its governance within the small city. As Danaher et al. (2000) detail, socio-cultural approaches are an appropriate methodological fit for researchers who aim to look back to identify discursive representations and their role in responses to social issues. Utilizing discourse analysis, I explored the development of street sex trade governance approaches in Kamloops, BC between 2002 and 2009. Assisted by anti-oppressive perspectives, my conceptualization of governance, and international sex trade discourses detailed in Chapter 2, I explored local governance discourses archived in the City's two community newspapers and in the meeting minutes of Kamloops' City Council.

My data set was rich and I initially reviewed 789 texts, before eliminating those that did not specifically meet my selection criteria. My final data set was comprised of 443 texts and I identified 1,225 relevant discourse fragments discussing street sex trade governance in Kamloops, BC. The reading and re-reading of these texts resulted in the identification of 17 discursive strands in which representations of street sex work and governance responses within the city coalesced. I organized these discursive strands into thematic categories. Analysis of

discourse fragments within each of these 17 categories resulted in identification of various representations of sex work and sex workers and their relationship to governance strategies in response to the street sex trade in Kamloops. This analysis facilitated identification of two primary and related governance approaches and the development of my narrative summary detailing the governance responses to the street sex trade in the small city of Kamloops, BC between 2002 and 2009.

Chapter 4 – Findings

In this chapter, I present the two main governance approaches that developed in Kamloops, BC between 2002 and 2009 by exploring the actions and responses of the players involved in dispersing discourses influencing these responses to the street sex trade. By analyzing the texts, the players that produced them, the discourses documented within them, and the governance actions they promoted, I was able to develop one narrative account of the evolution of governance responses to the street sex trade in Kamloops between 2002 and 2009. In Chapter 5, I consider what local discursive representations of the sex trade and sex trade workers tell us about these actions and their relevance within the small city context.

- *Firstly, it is important to note, we are to be commended for even acknowledging that the sex trade exists. Too many communities keep their heads in the sand and deny the presence of something so untoward, so raw, and so sad, that no one will talk about it.* (Hughes, 2007, statement made by the executive director of ASK)

The text above was produced by the executive director of the AIDS Society of Kamloops (ASK), a social agency contracted by the City to provide programming to assist sex workers in exiting the street trade. I chose to include this text segment as it acknowledges the complexity of street sex trade governance while asserting that many communities choose instead to ignore the issue. When taken as a whole, my findings reflect an experience of the street sex trade in Kamloops, BC that appears to be unique to the small city context. Documented in the texts I analyzed were several interesting governance responses to the street sex trade, including the development of a citizen watch group and the removal of pay phones in areas perceived to

have high street sex trade activity. I also identified educational approaches such as public forums and debate surrounding the creation of a community 'John School.' As discussed in the methodology chapter, I initially categorized these individual responses into the 17 discursive strands identified in Table 1. After further analysis it became clear that these strands were connected to two primary governance responses evident within the small city of Kamloops between 2002 and 2009. These were the rescue response and the exclusion response; all of the discursive strands in Table 1 either influenced the development of one of these two main responses or fit within one of the two overriding response categories.

Table 1 - Final Data Set

DOCUMENT CATEGORY	ERA	NUMBER OF TEXTS
Business Activism	2002-2008	18
Bylaw Response	2002-2007	11
Citizens Patrol Response	2005-2007	7
City Council Actions	2002-2009	57
City Council Elections	2002-2008	14
Community Activism	2002-2009	34
Community Forum Response	2004-2009	21
John School Response	2004-2006	5
North Shore Sex Stroll	2002-2009	54
Pay Phone Response	2006-2009	12
Police Presence Response	2002-2008	16
RCMP Advocacy	2003-2009	9
Red Zone Response	2007-2009	41
SHOP Response	2002-2009	58
Singh Solution	2006-2007	22
Social Housing Response	2002-2008	13
Undercover Sting Response	2005-2009	51

TOTAL NUMBER OF TEXTS = 443

Exclusion was the main governance response used to suppress and eliminate the street sex trade and this was typified by the creation of 'Red Zone' areas banishing criminalized sex workers from public space within the city. The other governance approach was a rescue response endorsing social programming that appeared to embrace sex workers by offering them assistance. Partly born out of public criticism of the severity of the exclusion approach, this response was realized with the expansion of the Social and Health Options for Persons in the Sex Trade Program (SHOP) and the creation of the Sex Trade Worker Diversion Program (STWDP). As I demonstrate in this chapter, these responses all shared an underlying preoccupation with the visibility of the street sex trade and ultimately, a total rejection of its presence in the small city of Kamloops.

As I discussed in chapter 2, governance responses develop from discursive debates between players from within the sectors of state, market, and civil society. While the categorization of groups of people is problematic, it is necessary for analysis. Following Minnery's lead (2007), I categorized the elected members of Kamloops City Council in the state sector as they are accountable to the local electorate and are tasked with making administrative decisions within the city. I also categorized the Royal Canadian Mounted Police (RCMP) and employees of the City of Kamloops in this sector as they also make administrative and legal decisions (see Table 2). The North Shore Business Improvement Association (NSBIA) was a major player influencing the development of sex trade response policies and while this group could be classified in either the market or civil society sectors, I chose to place it in the market sector as the overriding concern of this group is economic growth and development (see Table 2). ASK Wellness (ASK) is a non-profit organization formed around the shared values

of helping marginalized individuals in the Kamloops' community. ASK is contracted by the City to provide the SHOP program and it holds provincial and federal government contracts to provide other programming addressing homelessness and other marginalizing issues (ASK Wellness, n.d.). As a non-profit organization, ASK advocates for its clients in matters affecting them and is thus conceptualized in this thesis as belonging to the civil society sector (see Table 2). As previously mentioned, groups in this sector are understood to form around shared values. I also conceptualize other social agencies, the Citizens Safety Patrol, individual residents, and sex workers in the civil society sector.

Table 2 – Players Influencing Kamloops Sex Trade Governance Responses

State	Elected members of Kamloops City Council, Employees of the City of Kamloops, Members of the Royal Canadian Mounted Police (RCMP), Vancouver and Edmonton Vice Squads, Cities of Surrey, Vancouver, Victoria, Vernon and Kelowna
Market	North Shore Business Improvement Association (NSBIA), Individual Business Owners
Civil Society	Sex Workers, ASK Wellness Centre (ASK), Citizens' Safety Patrol, Individual Residents, Kamloops Women's Resource Society, Prostitution Awareness & Action Foundation of Edmonton, Kamloops Sexual Assault Counselling Centre, Kiwanis House

The two responses that developed between 2002 and 2009 demonstrate that discourses espoused by people from within Kamloops' state, market, and civil society sectors competed with one another in processes of governance that saw exclusion win out in the development of this small city's response to the street sex trade. As I demonstrate in this chapter, discourses from market and civil society increased in their resolve that 'their' North Shore neighbourhood

be salvaged from the perceived scourge of the street sex trade. Faced with increasingly vocal and active residents and business owners, the state felt obligated to take a heavy handed approach in their governance response to the street sex trade that did eventually prioritize the community over the sex worker. The visibility of the street sex trade was the major determinant in the volume of discourses emanating from the three players and as discourse volumes increased, so did the severity of state responses.

Civil Society and Anti-sex Trade Activism 2003-2007

- *"It's when it's visible on the streets and interferes with daily life that people get concerned."* (Koopmans, North shore sex trade raises alarm, 2003, statement made by the Mayor of Kamloops)

The visibility discourse above was dispersed by the Mayor of Kamloops in response to a small delegation of residents and business owners who turned up at City Hall in 2003 to express their alarm over a burgeoning street sex trade on the North Shore of the city. I chose to use this text segment as it demonstrates the main discursive theme influencing the development of governance responses to the street sex trade in Kamloops between 2002 and 2009. This quote represents the visibility discourse which is conceptualized as an overriding discourse in which the resulting exclusion and rescue responses are situated. In this section I detail the evolution of the visibility discourse that eventually asserted the right of one group of people to exclude another group of people from accessing public space within the City of Kamloops. Beginning in 2003 and escalating to 2007, visibility discourses generated war zone discourses that were dispersed by residents and business owners on the North Shore as they asserted ownership of

the neighbourhood and demanded state action to combat the street trade.

- *"The world's oldest profession isn't welcome in the North Shore's business district."*

(Koopmans, North shore sex trade raises alarm, 2003, text references a conversation with the North Shore resident who led the delegation to City Hall)

The text above references a conversation with the leader of the North Shore delegation of residents and business owners who took their concerns to City Hall in 2003. I chose to include it here as it demonstrates that early on, residents and business owners in the city's oldest neighbourhood asserted ownership of this public space in their expression of fear and alarm over the visible presence of the street sex trade. As their perceptions about the visibility of the street sex trade grew they became more vocal, demanding the state do something to rid the neighbourhood of the street trade. The sex trade was also somewhat visible in the downtown south side of the city, but North Shore activists believed that the majority of sex work activity took place in 'their' neighbourhood and it was their complaints that were documented by the media and ultimately heard by the state.

- *"It's good to see people taking charge of their own turf, identifying the problems and working to resolve them."* (Taking steps for safety, 2004, statement made by a journalist with Kamloops This Week)

With their fears about the visible street sex trade unresolved, residents and business owners began to organize in 2004, hosting community forums to brainstorm strategies that might be used to push the street sex trade from 'their' neighbourhood. The above text segment was produced by the editor of one of the local newspapers who reported on one such forum in

September 2004. I include the quote here to demonstrate that within the city, war zone discourses were being dispersed to assert ownership of public space. In the quote, the editor praises the actions of residents and business owners who sought to protect 'their' neighbourhood from the perceived threat of sex workers. The quote sustains dominant assumptions that public space can be owned by one group of people.

- *"(W)hen a woman can't walk to the corner store, or wonders who might be lurking in an unlit doorway or alley - when personal safety is challenged - a neighbourhood becomes a minefield."* (Taking steps for safety, 2004, statement made by a social advocate with the Kamloops Women's Resource Society)

As demonstrated in the quote above generated by a social advocate with the Kamloops Women's Resource Society, war zone discourses emerged on the North Shore in 2004 as residents and business owners pleaded for the salvation of 'their' neighbourhood. Indicating an underlying fear of the street sex trade, these war zone discourses claimed ownership of public space on the North Shore and placed increased demands on the state for help in eradicating the 'dangerous' sex trade from city streets. In response, the state did make some early attempts at quelling the street sex trade, but they were largely viewed by activists as having little impact and the visibility of the trade continued to grow.

- *"The North Shore seems to be under siege."* (North Shore: Crime capital of city?, 2005, statement made by a North Shore business owner)

War zone discourses continued to spread through 2005 as indicated by the text segment above produced by the owner of a North Shore business. The owners and employees of

businesses along the North Shore's main traffic corridor, where the trade was most prominent, began to demand the state increase the number of police foot and bicycle patrols in the area. The NSBIA organized meetings for business owners, police, and city staff to work out solutions to the street sex trade with gentrification of the area viewed as one approach to forcing the trade from the neighbourhood.

- *"A john pulls up to the curb to buy the services of a prostitute. A group of six people - wearing safety vests and equipped with cellphones, flashlights and cameras - approaches, and snaps photos of the john as he's negotiating with the prostitute."*
(Crime gets unwelcome shadow, 2005, text references conversation with the city's crime prevention officer)

A block watch program originally suggested in 2004 was pulled together in 2005, with the City of Kamloops' crime prevention officer guiding volunteer residents and business owners in the creation of neighbourhood 'safety' patrols. The text above resulted from the media's conversation with the officer and it details how the volunteers would be trained to pursue and harass sex workers and their clients. Discursively termed the North Shore Citizens Safety Patrol, the volunteer group sought to reclaim 'their' neighbourhood by patrolling the streets in large groups and pushing sex workers out of the area.

- *Farther down the street, the woman is stopped by the North Shore Citizens' Safety Patrol...They shadow her, keeping a block's distance from themselves and the woman, and finally she leaves. "We're like a neon light around her. No one is going to stop."* (North Shore patrol, 2006, statement made by Safety Patrol co-ordinator)

The text segment above was dispersed by the landlord of a large apartment building on the North Shore who also happened to be the co-ordinator of the Citizens Safety Patrol. In the quote, he draws attention to RCMP support of the group and denies that they are vigilantes taking the law into their own hands in defence of public space. The Citizens Safety Patrol was a direct action that developed in response to escalating war zone discourses being dispersed by business owners, residents, social activists, and the state. The patrol was like an army developing in response to discourses demanding the reclamation of neighbourhood from the perceived scourge of the street sex trade. It was the active response to state, market, and civil society discourses claiming that the street sex trade had somehow stolen public space that now needed to be revanched in defence of community.

- *"It's pure hell over here," (he) told city councillors this week. "I'm fed up. I want you guys to deal with it."* (A Royal pain that's a crime, 2006, statement made by a North Shore resident)

The Citizen's Safety Patrol appeared to have little effect on the visible presence of the street sex trade and North Shore residents continued to disperse war zone discourses into 2006 as represented by the above quote generated by a North Shore home owner. Barricaded behind a six foot high fence likened to a "compound" in the main text, the resident told City Council that "low lifes" including sex workers had so taunted his elderly neighbour that she was afraid to leave her home. Residents began to accuse the state of indifference to the location of the street sex trade in 'their' neighbourhood due to perceptions of the North Shore as less educated, lower income and somehow, less deserving.

- *We on the North Shore are getting fed up with the way City council keeps dumping crap on our doorsteps ... "they" chased all the hookers and drug dealers over to the North Shore.* (Morgan, 2006, statement made by a North Shore resident)

The quote above is from a text that was produced by a North Shore resident. In it, the resident reveals perceptions that the state had intentionally compelled sex workers to locate on the North Shore by shutting down low income housing on the south side of the river and concentrating low-income, high density housing projects on the north side. I chose to include the quote as it is highly representative of the 'us against them' atmosphere that was indicative of war zone discourses. Civil society continued into 2007 to demand stronger state action in defence of public space perceived to have been overrun with sex workers.

- *The 200-block of Tranquille Road on the North Shore is a "war zone," says a Robo Car Wash supervisor. (He) says he sprays trouble-making street people who wander onto his property with a high-powered car-wash hose.* (MacDonald, 2007, statement made by a North Shore business employee)

Tired of apparent state apathy, North Shore residents and business owners began fighting back in 2007, joining the Citizens Safety Patrol or taking matters into their own hands as evidenced by the text segment above produced by a North Shore business employee. The main text describes the employee as a man sporting an RCMP pin on the lapel of his coveralls and boasting to media of an enforced understanding between himself and "street people." I included the quote here as it again underscores the expressions of ownership of public space active at the time. This quote is representative of the discourses in 2007 that identified the

North Shore as locked into a losing battle against a plague linked with the street sex trade. In 2007, these discourses strengthened amid perceptions that the street sex trade was taking over the North Shore and destroying all sense of community.

State Responses: Legitimizing Exclusion through Laws, Bylaws and Zoning 2003-2009

In this section I describe the state's response to the escalating anti-sex trade discourses emerging from civil society. Associating the public's concerns entirely with the visibility of the street sex trade, the state sought to completely eradicate the trade through the use of enforcement and exclusionary measures beginning in 2003.

- *Kamloops RCMP began using the DISC program a couple of years ago, when prostitution was recognized by the community as an increasing problem, namely in the downtown. (Local RCMP to get visit from vice squad, 2002, referencing a conversation with an RCMP staff sergeant)*

The above text segment produced from a conversation with an RCMP staff sergeant indicates that the state had some concerns about the street sex trade prior to the time period of my analysis. I included the quote here as it further suggests that prior to 2002 the street sex trade was concentrated on the south side of the river in the downtown core, but it appears that sometime in 2002 or early 2003 the location of the street sex trade shifted and it became largely concentrated on the North Shore of the city. With this shift, civil society began to become more alarmed about the trade and the state became more concerned. Media texts do not specifically identify this relocation, but in 2003 anti-sex trade discourses began emerging from North Shore residents and business owners indicating their apprehensions about a

growing visible presence of the street sex trade.

- *"We need to get the message out that they (the prostitutes) don't belong around the schools," she said.* (Hewlett, Mayor has plan to deal with hooker problem, 2003, statement made by a representative of North Shore residents and business owners)

As I previously mentioned, a delegation of North Shore residents and business owners showed up at City Hall in 2003 demanding the Mayor address their concerns. As indicated by the quote above produced by a purported representative of North Shore residents and business owners, the group was looking for the City of Kamloops' assistance in banning sex workers from certain public spaces. The actions of this group resulted in the Mayor's interest in drafting a Kamloops specific bylaw prohibiting street sex workers from plying their trade near schools, parks, and homes (Hewlett, Mayor has plan to deal with hooker problem, 2003). City Council reviewed a similar bylaw drafted in the City of Surrey that set out municipal fines for sex workers caught in these areas. The bylaw was sent to the City's Police Service Committee for review and was abandoned when it was found to be unenforceable due to constitutional issues.

With their first attempt at people zoning struck down, City Council continued in 2004 to endorse a Mayor's task force established to create local solutions to resolve the street sex trade and they hosted a series of community meetings aimed at providing the community with its own tools to combat the trade (Hewlett, North Shore meet seeks solutions, 2004). These early attempts at street sex trade governance included suggestions for residents and business owners to gentrify their community and develop citizen run block watch groups to push the sex trade out of 'their' neighbourhood.

With residents and business owners spreading war zone discourses on the North Shore in 2005, the RCMP were compelled into action and they initiated a series of undercover sting operations targeting both the sellers and the consumers of street sex services. In an attempt to quell citizen concerns, City Council invited Edmonton police officers and representatives from the Prostitution Awareness and Action Foundation of Edmonton to address service providers, business owners, and residents at a state sponsored community forum. These non-Kamloops players suggested RCMP stop using undercover stings that functioned to push the street sex trade around the city without actually addressing the issues. They recommended City Council look to social programming for solutions and suggested the creation of a local 'John School' to educate the purchasers of sex about the exploitation and abuse involved in street sex work.

- *The only way to retire from life as a sex trade worker is "by suicide, disease and homicide," so the only way to deal with the problem is to go after the men who purchase the service and create the demand.* (Local solution needed, 2005, statement made by an Edmonton vice squad officer)

I included the above text segment to demonstrate the emergence of a counter discourse in the city in 2005. The Edmonton Vice Squad introduced a rescue discourse that competed with discourses seeking to exclude sex workers from the city. The local 'John School' idea was eventually scrapped, due to perceptions that there were not enough 'Johns' arrested locally to justify its existence (KCAT tackles john school, 2005). The local John Howard Society suggested resources would be better utilized if Kamloops' 'Johns' were sent to the Vancouver 'John School'. As indicated in the text segment below produced by an RCMP staff sergeant, the

RCMP offered to arrest more 'Johns' if that was what the community wanted, but they warned that this action would come at the expense of other police work.

- *"Is [prostitution] the community's biggest problem right now?"...Greenwood said local resources are tied into several high- profile investigations, including the beating death of known sex- trade worker Sheri Lee Hiltz. (KCAT tackles john school, 2005, statement made by an RCMP staff sergeant)*

Disregarding the suggestions of the Edmonton Vice Squad, the state continued in 2005 to focus on eliminating sex work from the city through enforcement and exclusion. Residents and business owners on the North Shore escalated their complaints and in another early attempt to generate local solutions, a subcommittee of City Council was tasked with reviewing sex trade governance approaches in two larger cities. The resulting Street Sex Trade Strategy report was presented to City Council's Social Planning Committee. It detailed a seven pillars approach to the trade developed after the review of sex trade governance models in Victoria and Vancouver (Rothenburger, City sex-trade group works hard on a daunting social issue, 2005). The approach focused on prevention, harm reduction, enforcement strategies, criminal justice interventions, treatment and healing programs, housing and political initiatives, with a goal for both immediate and long-term plans of action. The plan was criticized by City Council for lacking specific recommendations and for failing to prioritize community protection over interventions targeting sex workers. Visibility discourses continued to dominate and the plan did not appear to offer much to assuage this overriding concern and so the report was largely ignored. Some of the specific recommendations contained in the report included expanding the

SHOP program and establishing a prostitution diversion program to divert sex workers from the legal system and into support services.

- *"These pay phones, they've got to go."* (Phones gone on Tranquille, 2006, statement made by a City Councillor)

In direct response to the escalating concerns of residents and business owners, City Council voted in 2006 to remove two public pay telephones on the North Shore's main traffic corridor after the Citizens Safety Patrol identified the phones as conduits for sex and drug trade activity (Phones gone on Tranquille, 2006). I included the above quote as it forms part of the text produced by a Kamloops' City Councillor who strongly supported the removal of the phones while cautioning that other actions would also be needed in order to more permanently solve the prostitution 'problem'.

- *Police estimate there are as many as 70 sex-trade workers selling themselves on two main "strolls"... Business owners and families have complained about witnessing sex acts near stores or in front of children.* (Koopmans, 13 banned from North Shore areas, 2007, statement made by a provincial court crown prosecutor)

Seemingly contradicting earlier claims that there were not enough 'Johns' in the city to justify a Kamloops based 'John School', a provincial court crown prosecutor referenced police claims that there were as many as 70 active sex workers on the streets of Kamloops in 2007. I included the above quote as it suggests that at least 70 'Johns' must have been actively seeking to purchase sex in the city in order to support the supply of people apparently willing to sell it. The crown prosecutor's quote again portrayed an out of control street trade with sex workers

victimizing the community and potentially corrupting its children.

- *Wilson said the police effort comes on the heels of many complaints from city residents about highly visible sex-trade workers plying their trade at all times of the day. (Koopmans, 13 banned from North Shore areas, 2007, statement made by an RCMP corporal)*

I included the quote above as it demonstrates the direct influence of residents and business owners on the governance actions of the state. Players within the sectors of civil society and the market had become so boisterous on the North Shore that they compelled a state response actively seeking to eradicate the street sex trade. The RCMP took the unprecedented step of establishing exclusion zones in May of 2007 and then carrying out a series of undercover sting operations to ban criminalized sex workers from key public areas within the city (Ajay A-OK in cup run, 2007). The exclusion zones, discursively termed 'Red Zones' by the state, were public spaces identified by representatives from the City of Kamloops and the RCMP as having high incidences of street sex trade activity. After the arrest of a sex worker, an RCMP officer could tick off the exclusion request on the charges submitted to crown council; the courts could then prohibit the worker from entering the identified area as a condition of their release from custody (Red zones to target criminals, 2007). Kamloops' RCMP adopted the program after seeing it implemented with perceived success in the neighbouring small cities of Vernon and Kelowna, though no outcome or evaluation studies were reported to have taken place prior to the co-opting of the 'Red Zone' strategy.

- *Kamloops RCMP Supt. Jim Begley said the red tag could prove a valuable tool in*

keeping repeat and nuisance offenders away from key business and tourist centres, such as the downtown core and area beaches. (Red Zones to target criminals, 2007, statement made by the superintendent of the RCMP)

As indicated in the text segment above dispersed by the superintendent of the RCMP, the 'Red Zones' reintroduced the concept of people zoning by providing a legal means to exclude certain groups of people from key public spaces. The courts did eventually accommodate exceptions to the exclusion orders, allowing those who requested entrance to access services at social agencies within the 'Red Zones' (Koopmans, The red zone effect, 2008). Meanwhile, on the south side of the city, residents and business owners began to complain that the street sex trade had been displaced to their neighbourhood by intense state enforcement on the North Shore (Minutes of a regular meeting of the municipal council of the City of Kamloops, 2007). South side business owners requested state assistance with the RCMP offering a tour to business owners through their own back alleys, suggesting ways that they could make the area less conducive to sex trade activity (Hewlett, Core values: Businesses seeks solutions to downtown crime, 2008). The complaints spread to the south-east of the city in 2009, demonstrating further evidence that displacement had resulted from the previous years' enforcement efforts. The state persevered by suggesting an expansion of existing 'Red Zones' to cover the new public spaces perceived to have been infested by the street sex trade. Wherever it moved, exclusion by enforcement followed until the street sex trade was largely zoned out of the Kamloops' landscape.

Civil Society and the Backlash from Social Activists 2005-2008

- *With the recent killings of three prostitutes on Kamloops streets and court cases involving assaults against street workers, council has recognized that something more needs to be done.* (Young, SHOP Around, 2005, text produced by a reporter with Kamloops Daily News)

As I discuss in this section, discourses advocating the legitimization of exclusionary sex trade governance responses did not go unchallenged. I chose to include the above text segment as it demonstrates that as early as 2005, a counter discourse conceptualizing the sex worker as the victim began to promote social programming. The quote exemplifies the emerging discourse's reliance on representations of sex work that underscored the harms faced by sex workers. This representation was used to assign responsibility for the rescue of sex workers to the community. Victim and danger discourses were dispersed by local social agencies such as ASK and by some local citizens who wrote letters to newspaper editors. Beginning in 2005 and persisting until the sex trade vanished from city streets, these discourses also aimed to eliminate all street sex work, but the responses they promoted involved the rescue of sex workers rather than their persecution and exclusion. Some players within civil society were critical of City Council's inadequate funding of the SHOP program while others condemned state responses that focused exclusively on exclusion. The pursuit of sex worker exclusion angered the promoters of rescue responses who accused the state of failing to protect victimized sex workers, though from what threat was not entirely clear. A controversial debate about the merits of legalizing the street trade developed and carried into the November 2005

civic election with Mayoral candidates weighing in on the idea of community run brothels (Pondering prostitution, 2005). Local social advocates largely disagreed with the idea, as evidenced in the text segment below produced by a local social advocate from the agency that formerly operated SHOP. Danger discourses are clearly evident in the quote which assigns responsibility for sex worker safety to the community.

- *"The violence that does occur does not go away...When I think about a safe and caring community, it is not one that puts that kind of behaviour behind closed doors."* (Take sex trade out of the dark, 2005, statement made by a social advocate with the Kiwanis House)

Up until 2005, City Council had thought they were adequately addressing the social aspect of the sex trade issue with the SHOP program, and as social advocates became critical of Council's use of exclusionary responses, Council began to question the effectiveness of SHOP. As I briefly mentioned in the introductory chapter, Kamloops was reportedly the only city in Canada to fund a local social program such as SHOP which aimed to get sex trade workers off the street (Kamloops Daily News, Funding continues for program to get women, 2007; Hughes, 2007; Young, SHOP hosts sex trade discussion, 2007). SHOP was developed in 1997 to provide support to street sex workers with the aim of connecting them to resources that would assist them in exiting the trade. The program also provided community education about the street sex trade and the exploitation of its workers. The creation of the program in 1997 indicates that the street sex trade was a significant concern prior to the commencement of the time period under analysis here. In 2005, the program was forced to close its doors due to safety and

liability issues resulting from the lack of operational dollars. The host agency for the program had recently switched to ASK and they stressed their inability to safely operate on a budget that had recently been increased by City Council from the previous \$5000 per annum to \$13,500 per annum.

- *Rothenburger is skeptical that inroads into prostitution can be made by providing comprehensive programs to help sex-trade workers leave the business. "I support the program ...But if we think the whole answer is harm reduction for sex-trade workers - which SHOP is part of -- it's not...We have to continue to look at enforcement, drug addiction and other areas."* (Young, SHOP Around, 2005, statement made by the Mayor of Kamloops)

I included the above text segment produced by the Mayor of Kamloops as it demonstrates that City Council supported SHOP, but did not believe that social programming would solve Kamloops' street sex trade problem. City Council's query about the effectiveness of SHOP and the need to maintain it occurred in the wake of the separate murders of three women identified as sex workers in media reports. The violent crimes were incorporated into media reports documenting the impassioned plea of the executive director of ASK for increased funding for SHOP. With the understanding that a revived program would provide a drop-in component along with counselling services for sex workers to motivate them to leave the street, City Council approved an increased annual budget of \$68,000 per annum for three years, allowing ASK to run SHOP out of its new building on the North Shore (Duncan, Society must talk SHOP with group, 2005). What Council did not anticipate was the strong opposition of area

business owners who had grown weary from having experienced the high visibility of the street trade over the previous years. Represented by the NSBIA, these business owners reacted vehemently to the proposed location of the social program in the heart of 'their' neighbourhood. As seen in the text segment below produced by the editor of one of the local newspapers, media discourses reproduced the fear business owners had that SHOP would further infect 'their' community.

- *A furor has erupted among the North Shore business community with city council's approval Tuesday to fund a drop-in and counselling program for sex-trade workers.*

(Duncan, Society must talk SHOP with group, 2005, text produced by the editor of the Kamloops Daily News)

City Council had mistakenly assumed that the business community had consented to the location of SHOP and learning that it had not, they delayed approval of the three year service agreement and ordered ASK to conduct a public awareness campaign. They stressed that while they did not need the approval of the North Shore business community, they certainly hoped to attain it (No answer yet on SHOP, 2005). City Council did eventually sign off on the agreement after watering down the social program to appease business owners in the area (City to hire crime prevention officer, 2006). Ironically, the new service agreement eliminated the drop-in focus of the program, which Council had cited as one of their main reasons for increasing SHOP's annual funding. It also required increased education targeting local business and the residential community. City Council additionally added an escape clause, allowing them to terminate the program should they feel that it was failing to produce the desired results,

hinting at their continued commitment to exclusion rather than social programming. A steering committee was created in 2006 to evaluate and advise City Council on the program with committee membership including North Shore business owners, who admitted that their original fears about the program had never come to fruition. The text segment below, produced by the manager of the NSBIA indicates that education about SHOP had resulted in the market's realization that the social program aimed to accomplish what they all desired, the complete removal of sex workers from city streets.

- *The association's manager... called the SHOP program "one of our strongest tools" to be used to manage the North Shore. (Prostitution program in committee's sights, 2006, statement made by the manager of the NSBIA)*

Even with the market apparently embracing SHOP, City Council remained critical of the social program. They were presented with an annual review of the program in January 2007 and after considering SHOP's claim that they had had 747 service contacts with sex workers in a one year time period, they accused program operators of escalating public panic by inflating the numbers of sex workers on the streets (ASK accused of inflating numbers, 2007). While City Council bristled about the social program, the state seemed unprepared for the backlash from social advocates that followed in the wake of the implementation of 'Red Zone' exclusion areas and undercover sting operations in May 2007.

- *Hughes said he was shocked to learn of the busts, as well as the fact the operation was directed only at street-level sex-trade workers. "The sting was ill-conceived and ill-implemented. There was no indication they were going to do this," he said.*

(Koopmans, Prostitutes simply trade zones, SHOP head says, 2007, statement made by the executive director of ASK)

As indicated in the text segment above dispersed by the executive director of ASK, the operators of social programs within the city were appalled by the lack of community consultation prior to the implementation of the 'Red Zones.' Seventeen women were arrested and banned from the 'Zones' in the first undercover sweep of city streets, drawing the ire of social advocates and as represented in the text segment below, the criticism of at least one elected official.

- *"These are the most vulnerable and most desperate people in our community," he said to council Tuesday. "We've lost the ability to help some of these young ladies because they've gone into hiding." (Red Zone forcing prostitutes into hiding, councillor claims, 2007, statement made by a City Councillor)*

Discourses countering those promoting exclusion strengthened with the introduction of a civil rights discourse that followed the implementation of the 'Red Zones.' The text segment below demonstrates the concern of some social advocates that 'Red Zones' actually violated women's civil rights to movement and to be free from government suppression and discrimination.

- *"Their civil rights are really being violated because of the red- zone tactics. I really believe it's inappropriate and their civil rights aren't being honoured." (March to veer through red zone, 2007, statement made by a representative of the Kamloops Sexual Assault Counselling Centre)*

The 'Red Zone' exclusion areas seemed to reawaken and strengthen victim and danger discourses that had previously been mere mentions. Social advocates accused the state of failing to consider the severe repercussions of taking such drastic measures to combat the street sex trade. The exclusion zones covered an area that included the main traffic corridor and business district on the North Shore and the shopping and tourism district on the south side, banning sex workers from areas where many social service agencies were located. As indicated by the text segment below produced by the editor of one of the local newspapers, immense confusion resulted with sex workers reportedly baffled at the implications of the exclusion orders and unwilling to risk re-arrest to access emergency shelters and other treatment services.

- *It's a no-go zone. No, it's a maybe-you-can-go zone. Then it's a no-go zone and women are being rearrested for going there. Then it's a you-can-go-there-for-treatment zone. What is it? Go or no-go? And what's the point? Does this not just move the women elsewhere?* (Bass, 2007, statement made by the editor of Kamloops This Week)

While dominant discourses focused on the visibility of the sex trade and promoted the outright exclusion of sex workers, social advocates began to disperse discourses expressing fear over their decreasing visibility, stressing the potential harms they faced if the trade continued to be driven into the shadows. As represented by the text segment below dispersed by a Kamloops' street nurse, the counter-discourses advocated for the rescue of sex workers by highlighting ambiguous threats to their safety.

- *(T)he streets are “like a ghost town” ...She said most mornings, she would encounter up to a dozen women on the known strolls ...That has changed since the arrests. “I could not see a soul and that’s what’s scary.”* (Will gang control prostitutes, 2007, statement made by a Kamloops street nurse)

Discourses promoting rescue responses ran counter to those demanding the exclusion of sex workers from the city. Mounting concern over the workers’ safety and questions about individual rights to access public space resulted in a heated demonstration with social advocates taking to the streets within the North Shore ‘Red Zone’ to protest its existence. The group was comprised mostly of women affiliated with the Kamloops Sexual Assault Counselling Centre. The women identified themselves strongly as feminists and they were accompanied by a few male supporters including a federal New Democratic Party candidate who commented on the divisive potential of the ‘Red Zone’ debate. As evidenced in the text segment below, the media’s coverage of the march promoted rescue responses by reproducing victim discourses espoused by the protesters.

- *Equipped with homemade signs and walking to the beat of a banjo, marchers told reporters their presence spoke of the need for action against, what they said, is a flawed and discriminatory system that puts the victims at greater risk of danger and victimization.* (Olivier & Bass, 2007, statement made by a ‘Red Zone’ protester)

A few residents and business owners in the area asserted their ownership of public space by countering the protesters with their insistence that the ‘Red Zones’ had improved ‘their’ neighbourhood. According to media discourse, they yelled at the protesters and upheld

exclusionary narratives, clearly demonstrating the discursive battle being waged within the city over the representation of sex workers and the street trade. The march was marred by violence when the former president of the NSBIA allegedly grabbed one woman by the arm possibly forcing her to her knees, though this detail was discursively debated. The alleged assault was used in the text segment below produced by a representative of the Kamloops Sexual Assault Counselling Centre to underscore the threat posed to sex workers by apparently violent men.

- *"When you consider this was a man who did not hesitate to do this to a woman on Tranquille Road in the afternoon in front of at least 30 witnesses, it makes you wonder what are the men doing at night in isolated places to the women who work on the street."* (Olivier & Bass, 2007, statement made by a representative of the Kamloops Sexual Assault Counselling Centre)

The march itself was a discourse as was the media's coverage of it and long after it had ended, the discursive battle over the representation of sex workers continued as did the debate about the 'Red Zones.' Multiple texts were produced opposing the messages of the marchers and as demonstrated by the text segment below dispersed by a Kamloops resident, these texts promoted exclusionary responses by reasserting discourses constructing sex workers as threats to the community.

- *Why should Kamloops residents be concerned about the safety of prostitutes? What about the safety of the children who walk through their "zones"? How safe an environment is that? How safe is it to have who knows how many sexually transmitted diseases travelling through our community?* (Saunders, 2007, text

produced by a Kamloops resident)

Public debate about the appropriateness of the 'Red Zones' resulted in one City Counsellor suggesting they be turned into tolerated sex strolls after midnight (Young, Legalize prostitution says Singh, 2007). The councillor joined with local social advocates in denouncing the 'Red Zones' as indicated in the text segment below.

- *"We're trying to get the ban reversed. The issue is, is the thing really helping in terms of a long-term, stable solution? A bunch of us don't think it is. This has actually been a harmful, not a helpful move."* (Young, Legalize prostitution says Singh, 2007, statement made by a City Councillor)

The Councillor further proposed City Council lobby the federal government to legalize, regulate and tax prostitution. Reaction was strong, with some residents writing in to newspaper editors to support the Councillor's proposition and others writing in to call for his resignation. Amidst this public debate pitting regulation responses against those of exclusion, the executive director of ASK Wellness reintroduced rescue themes by reminding the community about the role of social programming and the need to find long-term solutions to end the street sex trade.

- *(W)e have not only acknowledged our sex trade, we as a community have taken the unprecedented step of funding programming to assist those caught in its tight grasp.* (Hughes, 2007, statement made by the executive director of ASK)

In the midst of the social advocates' back lash, North Shore business owners expanded their perceptions of SHOP as a tool to end the street sex trade to include the sex workers

themselves as instruments to combat a visible trade. They actively partnered with SHOP to directly assist sex workers, albeit in a program aimed at gentrifying the business district. The partnership resulted in the Social Enterprise Program, which provided paid employment to 10 sex workers who were hired to improve the overall look of the North Shore (Prostitutes, homeless to beautify Tranquille, 2007). The discursive debate about exclusion versus rescue responses continued into 2008 when the state was again publically criticized for jeopardizing sex worker safety while failing to offer salvation. This is indicated in the text segment below, which was produced by a Kamloops resident,

- *Producing a red zone doesn't solve any problems; all it does is move them to a new location. I still say we should treat the sex trade workers like in the olden days when they had a house that gave them a roof over their heads, not to mention safety for both the clients and the sex-trade workers.* (Phillips, 2008, statement made by a resident)

In an apparent attempt to mediate the concerns of those promoting rescue responses from those endorsing exclusion, City Council acted on a 2005 recommendation contained in a report prepared by the City's Social Planning Committee. The Street Sex Trade Strategy report was based on a review of sex trade governance models in the larger metropolises of Vancouver and Victoria and it called on the state to develop a diversion program for sex workers facing criminal charges (Rothenburger, City sex-trade group works hard on a daunting social issue, 2005). In 2008, City Council unveiled the Sex Trade Worker Diversion Program (STWDP) which offered qualifying sex workers the opportunity to choose addictions treatment and social

programming aimed at getting them out of the sex trade over criminal charges that could result in conviction, incarceration, and permanent criminal records.

- *The City spent a year developing the diversion program. The hope is it will cover all the bases -- from enforcement to social causes. (Hewlett, Prostitutes to get help staying off the streets, 2008, produced by the city's community safety supervisor)*

I included the above text segment, produced by the City's community safety supervisor, as it demonstrates the state's aim of addressing all concerns by utilizing the SHOP and STWDP programs to pacify social advocates while upholding 'Red Zone' exclusion areas and staunch police enforcement to appease citizens demanding the eradication of street sex work. With this combined governance approach firmly in place, the sex trade was largely forced from Kamloops city streets by 2009 as evidenced by the quieting of community debate.

Summary

- *"Why are you guys pushing us into the dark?" asks a woman who says her name is Connie. (Litt, 2007, statement made by a Kamloops sex worker)*

The two governance approaches adopted in Kamloops appeared on the surface to have differing goals with dissimilar representations of sex work promoting the different responses. However, as represented in the text segment above dispersed by a Kamloops sex worker, the exclusion and rescue responses resulted in the same outcome, the suppression of street sex work within this small city. Whatever the outcome, the development of the two governance approaches to the street sex trade did indicate that a discursive battle over the representation of sex workers and the street trade took place within Kamloops between 2002 and 2009. This

debate was situated within an overriding visibility discourse that ultimately rejected any visible evidence of an active street sex trade within this small city context. Whether opposing discourses were dispersed by state, market, or civil society, they seemed unanimous in their assertion that a visible street sex trade would not be tolerated. The two policy responses adopted within this small city developed out of this outright rejection and though discourses promoting either of the two responses were based on differing representations of sex work, they both upheld the total rejection of a visible street trade.

Discourses emanating from City Council, RCMP, business owners, and residents promoted exclusion as the most effective way to eliminate the sex trade's visibility. As I discuss further in the next chapter, these discourses used themes of war and pollution to promote exclusionary responses that included the early consideration of a bylaw banning sex workers from areas around schools to the eventual development of the 'Red Zones' which blatantly excluded criminalized sex workers from key public spaces within the city. Social advocates were joined by some residents in opposing exclusion and instead asserting rescue responses by dispersing discursive themes of ambiguous dangers that threatened already victimized women. The promoters of these rescue responses upheld the need to eradicate sex work from city streets, but sought to accomplish this through social programming rather than exclusion. While in apparent agreement on the complete rejection of street sex work in the small city, conflicting representations of sex workers and the street sex trade lie beneath the exclusion and rescue responses championed by various players in this small city.

Chapter 5 – Discussion

In this chapter, I explore what discourse analysis tells us about the two governance responses that developed in Kamloops in its efforts to respond to the street sex trade linking this to anti-oppressive concerns with the role of dominant discourses in the exclusion and marginalization of particular individuals and groups. I begin by identifying the discursive themes active within the city, linking them to the players involved in their dispersal and the responses they eventually promoted. I also consider these themes as they relate to the historical discourses found in the body of sex trade response literature. I conclude with a discussion of what the discursive representations evident in Kamloops between 2002 and 2009 can tell us about responses to the street sex trade and those involved in it in the small city context.

Two governance responses inspired by two differing representations of sex work developed in Kamloops, BC between 2002 and 2009; these were the rescue response and the exclusionary response to the street sex trade. As I discussed in the preceding chapter, the discourses nestled within these responses are ultimately situated in the superseding visibility discourse that motivated this city's total rejection of a visible street sex trade. A discursive battle over the rightness of each approach and ultimately the representation of sex work played out in this small city. The differing approaches to street sex trade regulation both sought to decrease the visibility of sex work, but they were motivated by radically different depictions of sex workers and the implications of their visible presence in the small city landscape.

(In)visibility in a Small City

- *"It isn't as visible as it was," he said. But that doesn't mean it doesn't exist. (Seeking*

sex trade workers, Society looks for help delivering outreach, 2009)

Towards the end of 2009, talk about the street sex trade quieted and media texts observed an apparent conclusion to street sex trade activity. As represented in the text segment above, discourses announcing the end of the street trade were countered somewhat by advocates assisting sex workers who attempted to remind the public that even though they couldn't see the trade, it continued to operate within the city. The lack of a visible street sex trade translated into a lack of public controversy and eventually the media stopped talking to advocates who had a vested interest in keeping the conversation about sex workers alive. Discourse about the sex trade vanished from media texts in 2009, just as sex workers vanished from city streets. Texts documenting the lack of a visible street sex trade could be read as confirmation of the elimination of street sex trade activity, alternatively they could be interpreted as substantiation of policy responses actively seeking to exclude sex workers from this small city, leading to the concealment of the trade within the landscape of Kamloops.

- *The open trade in society's dysfunction isn't easily seen anymore. The reason? A thick red line, drawn on a map around a several-block area of the neighbourhood. (Koopmans, The red zone effect, 2008)*

The visibility of the street sex trade was always the prime concern of residents, business owners, and City Council and it was this discourse that motivated the development of the two differing responses to the street sex trade. The text segment above, generated by a local social advocate and interpreted by local media indicates that exclusionary measures targeting visibility effectively removed the sex trade from public view. The visible sex trade was not

tolerated at all within this small city. Early in the time frame of my analysis, the Mayor of Kamloops publically stated that city residents were only concerned about street sex work because they could see it (Koopmans, North shore sex trade raises alarm, 2003). His comments indicated that the only solution would be the removal of sex work from city streets. The Mayor's visibility text promoted early exclusionary responses, evident in City Council's consideration of a bylaw to prohibit sex workers from areas near schools, parks, and residences (Hewlett, Mayor has plan to deal with hooker problem, 2003). Another response linked to the visibility text was the creation of a Mayoral task force that met with players from market and civil society to provide them with tools to combat the visibility of the street sex trade at the community level.

Exclusion was the primary response that developed out of the visibility discourse and the targets of this exclusion were the sex trade workers. Nestled within this overriding discourse were themes of war and the depiction of sex workers as polluters threatening to infest the Kamloops' community (see Table 3). Rescue responses developed in opposition to these exclusionary responses. Also situated within the overriding visibility discourse, rescue responses emerged from the contradictory portrayal of sex workers as victims rather than polluters. This response was based on themes of unspecified dangers that would menace and prey on sex workers if the community of Kamloops failed to protect them and get them off of city streets (see Table 3). All of these discourses were situated within the overriding visibility discourse and they all sought to remove the sex trade from city streets, they just differed in their approach and their representation of sex workers.

Table 3 – Discursive Relationships

War	Pollution		Victim	Danger
Exclusion Response			Rescue Response	
Visibility Discourse				

Revanchism in a Small City

- *We on the North Shore are getting fed up with the way City council keeps dumping crap on our doorsteps ... "they" chased all the hookers ... over to the North Shore.*

(Morgan, 2006)

The visibility of the street sex trade was the overriding concern within the city, but underneath this were resident fears that sex workers were malevolent polluters who jeopardized the community that ‘good’ citizens had sought to create. The text segment above was produced by a resident of Kamloops in a letter to the local newspaper and it likens sex workers to “crap” that had been dumped on the community. This offensive term was used to portray sex workers as excrement or waste, products useless and potentially contaminating to the public if not correctly disposed of. Other early texts likened the sex trade to a “mine field,” suggesting that sex workers were land mines that threatened to detonate and harm the community’s women and children (Taking steps for safety, 2004). The derogatory depictions of sex workers increased along with the visibility of the street trade and were particularly powerful on the North Shore of the city.

- *Intravenous needles are often tossed into their yard and, sometimes, prostitutes ply their trade within sight of the house, leaving behind empty condom wrappers. (A Royal pain that's a crime, 2006)*

Pollution discourses were strongest in the city's oldest neighbourhood on the North Shore. The text segment above represents a conversation with a local North Shore home owner who described his neighbourhood as "pure hell." This terminology evokes images of sex workers tormenting local residents with their very presence, causing anguish and distress. Pollution discourses indicated a pervasive fear on the North Shore and identified sex workers and the street trade as the cause of that fear. The representation was clear, sex workers were the predators and the community was their victim. These discourses further represented sex workers as wicked, immoral, and diseased.

- *"It was a mini (Vancouver) Eastside...It was a war zone, the neighbourhood was being neglected, it needed enforcement." (Koopmans, The red zone effect, 2008)*

The street sex trade was associated most strongly in media texts with the North Shore of the city and texts describing this neighbourhood began to also depict it as contaminated and unsafe for habitation. In the text segment above, ASK's executive director identifies the North Shore of Kamloops as a war zone in need of rescue. He likens Kamloops' oldest neighbourhood to the Downtown Eastside of Vancouver, an area notorious for drug use, street sex work, violence, poverty, and urban decay. Picking up on discourses depicting their neighbourhood as the city's ghetto, residents complained that the state tolerated sex workers' presence on North Shore streets because they considered the inhabitants of the area to somehow be lower class

and less deserving than residents living in more affluent areas. This further enraged North Shore residents who became more resolute in their complete rejection of the location of sex workers in 'their' neighbourhood. Revanchist sentiments began to emerge in media texts like the one below. These detailed the residents' desire to protect 'their' neighbourhood from the perceived polluting threat posed by sex workers, suggesting that public space could be 'owned.'

- *It's good to see people taking charge of their own turf, identifying the problems and working to resolve them. (Taking steps for safety, 2004)*

With origins in visibility narratives, the polluting discourses spawned war discourses that were dispersed by residents, home owners, and social advocates. One media text quoted a worker at a North Shore gas station who identified the area as a war zone and admitted to using a high-powered car wash hose to spray "trouble-making street people" (MacDonald, 2007). Other media texts cited other North Shore business owners who declared the area "under siege" (North Shore: Crime capital of city?, 2005). When City Council granted the operating contract for the SHOP program to a social agency (ASK) on the North Shore, the business community in the area was described as erupting into a "furor", a term used to describe an angry, maniacal fit (Duncan, Society must talk SHOP with group, 2005). Media texts depicted a community in fear and ready to wage war against sex workers who they perceived as 'infecting' their community.

- *Sure, these patrol members with their orange vests may simply succeed in pushing hookers, thieves and drug dealers to another part of Kamloops. So be it. Joe Sixpack in North Kamloops has lived long enough with ... avoiding certain areas at night*

because they have been commandeered by society's lowlifes. (It Shouldn't Surprise Anybody, 2005)

The pollution and war discourses championed by media, residents, business owners, and social advocates resulted in several response actions. In 2005, North Shore citizens banded together to form a neighbourhood watch group discursively termed the “Citizens Safety Patrol”. The group denied that they were vigilantes seeking to punish sex workers. They maintained that they sought to “take back their streets” and would walk together around the North Shore after dark in large groups (It Shouldn't Surprise Anybody, 2005). While they denied vigilantism, they clearly took regulation of the street sex trade into their own hands by seeking to force sex workers from the area. The group was well supported by the state, with RCMP providing training and City Council listening to and then acting on their concerns. At the group’s request, Council pulled all but one public payphone from the North Shore’s business district as they were identified by the citizens’ group as conduits for sex and drug trade activity (Phones gone on Tranquille, 2006). Pollution and war discourses had even transformed representations of pay phones on the North Shore. They were no longer viewed as a way for a child to call a parent for a ride or for a senior to call for help, but were instead perceived as conduits for street sex and thus, like sex workers they had to be removed from city streets.

- *Thirteen women ... were ordered Thursday to stay away from a big chunk of the North Shore. Wilson said the police effort comes on the heels of many complaints from city residents about highly visible sex-trade workers plying their trade at all times of the day. (Koopmans, 13 banned from North Shore areas, 2007)*

While market and civil society responded to pollution and war discourses with Citizen Patrols and individual actions, the state began by stepping up the exclusionary responses that they had first undertaken when visibility discourses began to convey the complete rejection of the street sex trade. They began with undercover sting operations in 2005, but realizing that the workers simply returned to the North Shore after their release from jail, they blatantly declared their aims by taking the unprecedented step of establishing exclusion zones, discursively termed 'Red Zones.' They again utilized undercover sting operations to entice sex workers into criminal charges, but once criminalized, the workers were prohibited by court order from being on the North Shore. Although the 'Red Zones' only covered certain public spaces, the intent of these actions seemed to be the complete banishment of visible sex work from city streets and sex workers from life in the small city. The 'Red Zones' again asserted that public space could be owned by a privileged group who could then decide who had rights to access it.

Public debate about the ethics and severity of the 'Red Zone' response followed its implementation, with residents and business owners either condemning or praising the state for its swift action. To pacify their critics, the state created a social program to divert sex workers from the justice system and bolstered annual funding for another locally created social program that aimed to assist sex workers in exiting the trade. These social programs aimed to rescue sex workers from the street and while the approach differed, the goal remained the same as it did with exclusionary responses; the complete removal of the sex trade from small city streets.

Salvation in a Small City

- *"The thing is, they're never going to be able to stop it. All they're doing is making it more dangerous for us."* (Prostitutes migrating to other areas of the city, 2007)

A counter-discourse began to emerge in 2005, disputing previous conceptualizations of sex workers as wicked predators destroying the Kamloops' community. Pollution discourses had depicted sex workers as disposable people, out of place in the Kamloops' landscape, but the emerging victim discourses countered this with representations of sex workers as exploited children in need of salvation.

- *Anyone who purchases the services of a prostitute is contributing to the exploitation of children, even if the prostitute is 30 years old, he said. "Young girls, children, fill the ranks of all the girls out there."* (Local solution needed, 2005)

The text segment above was produced by an Edmonton area vice cop who was in Kamloops to speak at a community forum aimed at creating local solutions to the street trade. His 'exploited child' discourse joined with other victim discourses emerging at the time in offering a representation of sex workers as incapable and innocent victims who had been apprehended by the street sex trade and corrupted by predatory men. Social advocates spoke about the "tight grasp" of the street sex trade and of women being able to escape only through death or disease (Hughes, 2007). The emergence of these victim discourses occurred after the murders of three Kamloops sex workers and assaults on several others. It also coincided with province wide media coverage of the gruesome details emerging from the trial of a Vancouver area man accused of killing 26 sex trade workers. The image of sex workers as exploited

children offered an alternative to that of sex workers as predatory polluters, resulting in conceptualizations of the sex worker as incapable of making appropriate life choices and hence, in need of rescue. In this alternative conceptualization, men and the sex trade were the predators, the sex workers were the victims and the community was the expected saviour.

- *Most sex-trade workers are recruited by 13 or 14 years of age, she says, and they're targeted by "master manipulators." By the time they've been in the business a couple of years, "they're not like anyone else." (Take sex trade out of the dark, 2005)*

The identification of sex workers as exploited children promoted responses that sought to rescue them rather than exclude them. Whereas pollution and war discourses depicted sex workers as irredeemable, victim discourses saw them as capable of rehabilitation if provided with the right supports. These discourses led to talk of civic responsibility with social advocates identifying what a "safe and caring community" ought to do, which was to rescue these poor children (Take sex trade out of the dark, 2005). Within the context of victim discourses, advocating for the legalization of the trade was not acceptable as it allowed for the continued exploitation of children. Criminalizing sex workers and excluding them from areas of the city was also viewed as unacceptable as it pushed the trade from public view where it was assumed that the worker would face increased victimization. This fear led to the development of danger discourses that depicted the men who bought sex as dangerous predators threatening to consume sex workers if society failed to protect them.

- *It is the perverts and pedophiles strolling the streets to exploit and rape these women. No woman wants to be a junkie hooker when she grows up. No woman*

wants to sell her body for drugs. To buy sex from a prostitute perpetuates chronic sexual abuse and violence against women on an entire cultural scale, and is paramount to serial rape. (Reichennek, 2007)

The text segment above is part of a letter to the editor composed by a Kamloops' resident who detailed that when she walked the streets of Kamloops, it was not the sex workers who frightened her but the men who purchased their services. Her text joined with other danger discourses mostly emanating from social advocates within the city who questioned what "the men" would do "at night in isolated places to the women who work the streets" (Olivier & Bass, 2007). Social advocates complained that known sex strolls had become like a "ghost town" as workers attempted to sell sex without getting caught in the intensified police actions that accompanied the implementation of the 'Red Zones' (Will gang control prostitutes, 2007). The advocates talked about increased dangers and their fear that sex workers would end up beaten, raped, or worse.

Danger and victim discourses joined together in the promotion of responses that sought to rescue the sex worker from the threat of men in order to rehabilitate her for life off the street. These discourses prompted City Council's decision to significantly increase funding for the SHOP program and its eventual creation of the STWDP program. Both of these programs aimed to rehabilitate sex workers, SHOP by providing street outreach and drop in services and STWDP by diverting sex workers from jail if they agreed to participate in addiction services and counselling. RCMP and City Council also considered the creation of a 'John School' to educate and potentially rehabilitate the purchasers of sex services, but scrapped this idea, suggesting that while the men's activity was viewed as dangerous it was not perceived to be amenable to

change. This further suggests that while this small city completely rejected the presence of a visible street sex trade, it acknowledged that the sex trade would always exist in some form as men's desires were perceived to be too strong to extinguish. It was as if this small city condoned the right of men to purchase and own women's sexuality, a sentiment that was bolstered by the Mayor's discourse represented in the text segment below.

- *(P)oliticians would have to be naive to believe that prostitution can be reduced. It never will be as long as there is a demand for sex from people willing to pay. That demand is eternal; hence the reality of prostitution as perpetual.* (Shopping for some answers, 2007)

While the street sex trade was completely rejected, off street sex services were licensed in the city via Kamloops' By-Law No 9-38 which set out higher licensing fees for businesses classed as body-rub parlours or escort services (By-Law No, 9-38, 1991). The funds collected from these licensing fees were used to partially fund the SHOP program (Young, SHOP Around, 2005). The City attacked the visible street trade while ensuring that sex was still available for consumption by the men who were portrayed as requiring it. This desire discourse clearly indicated that a visible street sex trade threatened to corrupt the community, but concealed sex services should still be available to help quench the strong desires of men so that they would not prey on innocent women. While victim/danger discourses represented sex workers as victims, they were still perceived as tainted and inferior to other women in the community.

The cumulative effect of victim/danger discourses was the portrayal of sex workers as victims being preyed upon by 'out of control men' who after ravaging the workers potentially

threatened to come after the rest of society's women and children. In this context, the street sex trade was viewed as the exploitation of all women and children and its continued existence was not tolerated, but men's desires would continue and so off street sex services were required. This differed somewhat from the representations evoked by pollution/war discourses that depicted sex workers as the contaminatory threat, but the response promoted by both discourses was ultimately the same, the outright rejection of a visible street sex trade and as a result, the exclusion of identifiable sex workers from participation in small city life.

Small City Themes: Relationships with Broader Sex Trade Discourses

As I detailed in chapter 2, my exploration of the international body of literature revealed five overriding discursive themes operating in relation to approaches to street sex trade regulation. These are the discourses of abolition, regulation, containment, culpability, and contagion (Francis, 2006; Howell et al., 2008; Hubbard, 1997; Hubbard, 1998; Hubbard, 2004; Hubbard & Sanders, 2003; Hubbard et al, 2008; Kerkin, 2004; Lowman, 2000; O'Neill et al., 2008; Tani, 2002). Contagion discourses conceptualize the sellers of sex as diseased or otherwise amoral and a threat to community; resulting in discourses of containment demanding responses that confine the street sex trade to certain spaces in order to protect other spaces within a city. Alternatively, culpability discourses focus on the extent to which society should hold the sex worker responsible for their own marginalization; resulting in responses that seek to rescue or eradicate the sex worker. Culpability discourses can result in abolitionist discourses that seek to eliminate all forms of sex work. Alternatively, they can join with contagion and containment in supporting regulation discourses that seek to control and maintain an active street sex trade.

Contagion in a Small City

Contagion narratives encapsulate individual and group perceptions about the infectious nature of sex workers and the street sex trade and the threat these pose to a healthy and viable community (Hubbard & Sanders, 2003). These discourses can be further deconstructed to reveal narratives of pollution, defilement, disgust, and desire. Contagion discourses were active in Kamloops as evidenced by the ongoing complaint of residents and business owners who identified 'their' North Shore neighbourhood as polluted by and at war against a visible street sex trade. Media discourses conferred that the area was infected by the street trade by consistently portraying the older neighbourhood as dicey, dangerous, and derelict; in other words in ruins due to the infestation of the street sex trade. Disgust and desire discourses were also clearly evident within Kamloops as North Shore residents and business owners expressed their condemnation of street sex workers, while failing to call for the complete abolition of sex work. Their narratives indicated that while they did not want the sex trade to be located on 'their' streets, they would perhaps tolerate its presence elsewhere, where it would pose a reduced threat of contaminating the community, but could still service the needs of male desires.

Containment and Regulation in a Small City

Contagion discourses justify the containment of the street sex trade to specific sites within an urban landscape or alternatively its expulsion from a city to areas outside of its borders. Research bears out that containment and regulation narratives provide the basis for the vast majority of modern day responses to the street sex trade and Kamloops was no exception (Hubbard, et al., 2008; Jones et al., 2005; Kerkin, 2004; Lowman, 2000; O'Neill et al.,

2008; Tani, 2002).

Contagion discourses led to regulatory responses within the city that aimed to completely clear the highly visible street sex trade from city streets while allowing the off street or contained sex service providers to continue to operate within the city. 'Red Zones' were established to exclude and banish 'polluting' street sex workers from the 'healthy' community where business and residential life could then be conducted without threat of corruption. Social programs were created or buffered to rehabilitate workers for life off of the street. The loud complaints of business owners and residents prompted the state to respond with regulatory approaches attacking the visibility of the street sex trade, pushing it off of city streets, into darkened alleys, licensed massage parlours, and perhaps to other communities. Following the end of the time period under analysis here, anecdotal conversation within the city identified a burgeoning street sex trade in the neighbouring community of Merritt. This could indicate a displacement of sex workers from Kamloops to this smaller city forty-five minutes south on one of the area's major highways.

The street sex trade was not so much confined in Kamloops as it was expelled from the city. State, market, and civil society joined in the promotion of regulatory responses that ultimately forced the street sex trade out of every neighbourhood and business district in which it attempted to establish. The state did not go after known establishments that provided off street sexual services, indicating that sex work was tolerated in the city only if it were closeted away out of public sight. A substantial body of international research demonstrates that this policy approach further marginalizes sex workers by forcing the trade into the shadows, thereby increasing the harms faced by those working the streets (Francis, 2006; Hubbard, 1998;

O'Neill, 2008).

Culpability in a Small City

Culpability narratives focus on the extent to which society feels it can hold those engaged in sex work accountable for their actions. These discourses take one of two opposing viewpoints, either portraying sex workers as in need of salvation due to their incapability or as disposable people due to their depraved morality. It is with respect to culpability that a discursive battle was waged in Kamloops, beginning in 2005. Discourses circulating within the city offered competing representations of sex workers. Pollution/war discourses portrayed the workers as predators responsible for their own marginalization and abuse, while victim/danger discourses portrayed the workers as childlike victims incapable of helping themselves and in need of rescue. Neither discourse triumphed during the time of my analysis as the debate about which representation was more accurate ceased when the workers disappeared from city streets.

Abolition in a Small City

Abolitionist discourses reject the existence of sex work in any form denying that sex is a commodity that should be available for purchase. These discourses assert that the sale of sex always involves exploitation (Bindel & Kelly, 2003, p. 24). Feminist abolitionists take the discourse one step further and use it to argue that sex work is tantamount to sexual inequality, violence against women, and the exploitation of women by men (Lakeman 2009b, p. 5). This exploitation discourse was evident in the victim discourses that developed in the city, but there was no evidence of any public debate that sought the eventual abolition of sex work, rather as

discussed above, citizens acknowledged from the beginning that it would always exist.

Messages similar to those contained in abolitionist discourses were evident in media texts, but they were used to promote rescue responses without ever stating that the abolition of sex work was the end goal. The victim/danger discourses suggested the exploitation of women and the superiority of male desire, but they did not explicitly talk about ending all sex work. They remained focus on the street trade and the rescue of its workers. Perhaps if the discursive debate between these representations and the pollution/war representations had played out, further talk of abolition may have developed, but this did not occur and all debate silenced as the street sex workers vanished.

Silence in a Small City

The debate about the sex trade and the contradictory portrayal of sex workers ended when the trade moved from public view. During the debate there was a noticeable absence of discourses produced by sex workers. These voices were not included in any of the policy debates with their exclusion mirroring the exclusion of the sex worker in the landscape of this small city. There was also an absence of considerations of other sex trade related issues. Media texts indicated that this small city was preoccupied with a visible street sex trade that involved only women. With the exception of one letter to the editor that stated that not all sex trade workers were women, there was an absence of texts identifying men as potential sex workers (Barlow, 2007). The letter was produced by a former North Shore business owner and a volunteer with the Citizens Safety Patrol and it expressed his support for the 'Red Zone' exclusion areas. The lack of contemplation about the gender of sex workers in media texts suggested the idea of men selling their sex was completely at odds with heterosexual and

masculine identities accepted as 'true' within this small city. Also absent was the consideration of women as purchasers of sex services, again an idea that likely was rejected due to its contradiction of feminine identities. The texts did not identify sex work as a viable career choice for women, assuming instead that it was a service provided by corrupt, immoral women or exploited and enslaved ones. There was a further absence in the available texts of any considerations of race, class, and ability and ways these intersect with sex work, which is also a silencing of a host of other issues related to women's presence in the street sex trade.

Small City Considerations

Discourse analysis demonstrates that within this small city, a visible street sex trade was not tolerated as it often is in larger metropolises. The responses endorsed within Kamloops indicate that in no way would a visible street sex trade be allowed to exist. In large cities, the street sex trade is often confined to invisible areas of the city where other 'deviant' individuals also reside and where 'normal' citizens tread only when seeking the services that are known to be tolerated in the area. For example, the tolerated sex strolls in the Downtown Eastside of Vancouver, the *tippelzones* in Dutch cities, and the informal toleration zones in England and Wales (Hubbard et al., 2008). Research in large metropolises supports the assertion that street sex work is "usually, but not exclusively, confined to specific districts" within these cities (Jones et al., 2005 p. 62). This was not the case in this small city where a visible street sex trade was completely rejected.

The street sex trade was not tolerated in the small city of Kamloops and it is likely rejected in other small Canadian cities. Citizens in small cities share a spatial closeness to all within the city. They have a strong sense of ownership over the neighbourhoods in which they

reside, a sense of this space as “their” space. When an active sex trade exists, they drive by the visible street sex trade on their way home from work and encounter it again when going out for evening socialization. In the morning while walking their children to school they may encounter evidence of the previous night’s activities, or see people who appear to have been used and discarded by the night’s trade. This challenges their perceptions of normalcy and their sense of safety. Such spatial closeness does not exist in large metropolises where it is entirely possible to live one’s life in one area of a big city without ever encountering the activities that may be segregated to another area.

Summary

In its refusal to tolerate a visible street sex trade, two principal responses promoted by four discursive themes developed within the City of Kamloops between 2002 and 2009. These were the exclusionary response and the rescue response, and while supported by different discursive representations of sex workers, they shared among them the objective of eradicating a visible street sex trade. Within these two regulatory responses were discursive themes of pollution/war and victim/danger, revealing how the street sex trade was conceptualized within this small city. The visible trade was viewed as a threat to the community and as offering the potential contamination and corruption of citizens. Sex workers were viewed as either devious polluting women who should be shunned or child-like victims in need of rescue. While based on different discursive representations, these themes promoted only one course of action; the complete eradication of the street sex trade or at least the concealment of its presence in order to eliminate any contaminatory or victimizing potential.

The Mayor of the City observed early on that people only had a problem with the street

sex trade because they could see it. This perspective was supported by the quieting of discourses that followed the implementation of the 'Red Zone' exclusion areas. This response and the accompanying enforcement of it in 2007, 2008, and 2009 resulted in the virtual clearing of city streets as criminalized sex workers moved to avoid arrest during on-going undercover police operations. The 'Red Zones' appeased residents and business owners on the city's North Shore, but also angered residents who viewed the exclusion zones as jeopardizing sex worker safety and infringing on their rights to access public space. Rescue responses were offered in appeasement.

The cumulative outcome of both responses was the exclusion of identifiable sex workers from public participation in this small city. Sex workers were either criminalized and banished from city streets or coerced into leaving the streets and seeking rehabilitation by means of diversion and outreach programming. Unfortunately, discursive debate quieted once the sex workers were no longer visible and residents and business owners began to comfortably access the public spaces they once perceived as so polluted by the street sex trade. Talk about the women who were identified as murdered sex trade workers ceased, with two of the murders remaining unsolved. It was as if the old adage of 'out of sight, out of mind' settled in Kamloops; where once this small city debated the conceptualization of sex work and examined the effects of its responses, now the discussion fell silent and the issue of assisting marginalized individuals vanished into thin air as the workers themselves seemed to disappear into the night. The street sex trade did not fit in this small city's landscape and so its visibility was attacked until it receded into the shadows and off of the streets.

Chapter 6 - Conclusion

The sex trade continues to exist in the shadows of the small city of Kamloops, BC, but it has vanished from the urban landscape. Between 2002 and 2009, an aggressive enforcement campaign that sought to erase all visible evidence of the street sex trade was pursued in this small city. The identification of sex workers as diseased polluters or child-like victims legitimized responses that completely rejected the visible presence of the street sex trade, oppressing the women identified as street sex workers. There was no neighbourhood, street, or district where city residents' would permit the street trade to exist. Instead, sex workers had to either get off the streets into tolerated massage parlours and escort agencies, leave town to ply their trade elsewhere, or attempt to practice in darkened back alleys where they likely faced increased exploitation and danger.

In this concluding chapter, I review the initial query that sparked this research and briefly restate my findings and situate them within the international body of literature on the street sex trade. I discuss the implications of my work for social advocates and policy development and conclude with areas for further research.

Researching the Governance of Street Sex Work

Street sex trade workers are among the most marginalized and oppressed populations in the world (UNFPA, n.d.). They are derided by the public and face the real dangers of violence and even death daily as they practice their trade. Between 1983 and 2002 more than 60 women believed to have been involved in the street sex trade disappeared from the Downtown Eastside of Vancouver, BC. Many of these women were never found, while it was discovered that others had been the victims of homicide in a horrific serial murder case involving a Lower

Mainland pig farmer. The Vancouver Missing Women's case brought to the forefront the extensive vulnerability of street sex trade workers in Canada and the potential harms caused by our policy responses to the street trade.

A Canadian research analysis of the relationship between media portrayals, the criminal law, and violence against street sex workers demonstrates that current Canadian responses endanger sex workers by concealing the sex trade from public view and creating illicit markets where brutal forms of exploitation often occur (Lowman, 2000). This research joins with the international body of work in demonstrating that responses to the street sex trade that lead to its suppression result in the alienation of sex workers from protective services and their increased exposure to exploitation and harm. This research further demonstrates that local discourses influence the development of policy responses to the street trade often forcing it off of city streets where "sexuality can be commodified with apparent impunity; the repression of the sex worker in discourse mirrored in her placement in the unknown, invisible city" (Hubbard, 2002, p. 372).

International research provides ample evidence of the influence of discursive representations on the evolution of unique local level responses to the street sex trade (Lowman, n.d.; O'Neill et al., 2008; Hubbard, 1998; Tani, 2002). This work acknowledges that policy responses are extremely context specific and yet until now no one has explored street sex trade regulation in Canada in the small city context (Benoit & Shaver, 2006). The lack of exploration in this unique context fails to acknowledge that the street trade does occur outside large metropolises and fails to illuminate discourses and governance in the context of the small city. My research explored what discourse analysis tells us about the actions that developed in

response to the street sex trade in the small city of Kamloops, BC between 2002 and 2009.

This research was informed by anti-oppressive social work perspectives which challenge social workers to deepen their awareness of locally situated forms of oppression and social exclusion. At the core of AOP is the recognition of identity as a key feature of oppression through discourses that set individuals apart, and judge their worth in relation to dominant norms (Hines, 2012). These discourses also justify practices of exclusion, marginalization, and oppression for those judged 'bad,' 'deviant,' or 'inferior.' AOP thus requires the analysis of practices of social exclusion, connecting discourse, identity, and marginalization in specific contexts. Analysis of discourses was supplemented by analysis of governance, drawing on an institutionalist approach to governance characterized by attention to individual and collective groups of state, market, and civil society and their perceptions, interpretations, and actions in response to the local sex trade in Kamloops during the period under study.

In order to understand governance responses to the street sex trade and the various discourses that championed them, I examined archived texts from the time period above; specifically minutes of City Council meetings and articles from Kamloops two local newspapers. My initial analysis identified 17 discursive strands; further analysis connected these discursive strands to two primary governance responses evident within the small city of Kamloops between 2002 and 2009. My research suggests that the street sex trade is present within the small city, and notes a number of dynamics that operated in this small city context.

First, unlike large cities where street sex work may be confined to a tolerated district, in the small city, any visible presence of the street sex trade may be completely rejected, its workers excluded from community participation unless they conform to demands that they

enter rehabilitatory programming.

This research highlights an aggressive exclusionary response strategy aimed at sex trade workers that evolved between 2002 and 2009 in the small city of Kamloops. It links this strategy to a dominant discourse of visibility and themes of pollution and war evident within this discourse. 'Red Zones' were implemented to eradicate the highly visible street sex trade by excluding criminalized sex trade workers from specific areas of the city.

Following the exclusionary response strategies, victim and danger counter-discourses emerged, promoting rescue responses that aimed to rehabilitate sex workers to save them from the streets. By 2009 the visible street sex trade was eliminated and the above discourses quieted. My analysis of the discursive representations motivating these actions reveal that the street sex trade was viewed by many as so polluting and dangerous to the community that it chose to completely reject any visible presence of the trade within city limits.

Implications of this Research

- *He said he hopes to live in a city not that wants to be free of prostitutes -- an impossible task -- but a city that shows sex- trade workers respect, in which prostitutes are safe, have adequate housing and get decent medical care.*

(Koopmans, No easy solution found for sex trade: Forum seeks solutions to problems created by street-level prostitution, 2007)

As noted in Chapter 2, AOP encourages social workers to think analytically about power and power relations through identification and deconstruction of dominant discourses in specific contexts (Baines, 2007). An aggressive exclusion approach was used to push the sex

trade off of Kamloops' city streets between 2002 and 2009. While this was being accomplished, discursive debate developed in the city over the representation of sex workers and legitimate responses to their presence. While inclusive approaches were suggested, as indicated in the text segment above, exclusion ultimately won out and the debate ended without resolution as the sex workers vanished from the city.

AOP also encourages the deconstruction of existing social relations and practices in order to inspire possibilities for change (Dominelli, 2002). Within the texts analyzed in this research, the voices of sex workers were largely excluded and this exclusion limited the policy making capacities of this city. Social advocates attempted to speak on behalf of the sex workers, but their talk did not come directly from the workers and it resulted in discourses that sustained representations of sex workers as incapable, child like victims. From an AOP perspective this is concerning as the governance responses that developed to address the challenges associated with a visible street sex trade may have looked very different if the voices of sex workers had been added to the debate. The state could have formed a social policy committee that included representatives from the street sex trade, the community, and the state to undertake research and policy analyses.

Alternatively, social advocates could have gathered the stories of street sex workers and dispersed them to those involved in the policy debate in order to educate the decision-makers about the actual concerns of the street sex workers. Instead, there was a total failure to consider the inclusion of sex workers' voices in this governance debate; in the future, social advocates and service organizations working with sex workers should lobby for the inclusion of these voices in future policy making processes.

As noted earlier, another finding of this research was the absence of any analysis of issues of race, class, ability, or other structural issues in representations of sex trade workers in the context of this small city. This in turn silenced a host of issues related to women's involvement in the sex trade. Here too, more effort could be made to highlight these issues, drawing attention to the intersections of race, poverty, and other factors that limit women's capacity to live in dignity, rather than simply focusing on the need for narrow rescue approaches.

Limitations of this Research

My work represents one narrative account of discursive representations of the street sex trade and their influence on the governance responses adopted in the small city of Kamloops, BC between 2002 and 2009. While my results do offer insight into what discourse analysis can tell us about governance responses to the street sex trade in the small city context, the results can not be generalized to other small cities where the experience of the street sex trade may be very different. Between 2002 and 2009, the small city of Kamloops asserted that it would not tolerate a visible street sex trade anywhere within city limits. I would hypothesize that other small cities in British Columbia have responded in a similar manner. The Kamloops' state chose to create 'Red Zone' exclusion areas to banish criminalized sex workers from public spaces after seeing the same type of spatial exclusions implemented in the neighbouring small cities of Vernon and Kelowna, BC. While further study is needed to determine if these two small cities also chose an outright rejection of a visible street sex trade, it is possible that their exclusion zones were implemented to accomplish the same objective as was sought in Kamloops. Still, my results pertain only to Kamloops, BC and only to the actions that occurred

between 2002 and 2009.

This project was undertaken as an initial exploration and I uncovered a large amount of data. Even after narrowing down the original 789 texts to the remaining 443 texts, I found my data set cumbersome. Discourse analysis depends upon very detailed data investigation and this can potentially be compromised by too large a data set (Silverman, 2000, p. 828). I attempted to safe guard myself from this limitation by adhering strictly to my data selection criteria and focusing my analysis on the main governance responses that evolved between 2002 and 2009. Still, the large amount of data limited my analysis of periphery actions to mere mentions, but I would argue that these responses were secondary to the responses that I chose to focus on. Also, a single 3 year time span is worthy of its own study of local enforcement approaches to the street sex trade. From 2006 to 2008, local talk about the street sex trade in Kamloops escalated to such a point that it was perhaps the most talked about media issue within the city. My analysis of media discourses during this time period revealed over 290 discourse fragments relating to the state's undercover sting operations and the creation and enforcement of the 'Red Zones.' The extent of discursive debate regarding these two issues alone could justify a research project focused exclusively on the community's response to the actions of police.

Finally, it is important to reiterate that archived texts are only representations of what was said and what was done. These representations were dominated by two newspapers and a handful of journalists; their genders and social positions will have impacted their representations along with the market driven goal of selling their newspapers. These archived texts therefore carry their own biases and distortions and this too, represents an important

limitation in this research and, as noted earlier, could be another entire area of study.

Moreover, while acknowledging my own subjective positions and my allegiance to an anti-oppressive framework, I may be unaware of other biases that influenced my analysis.

Summary and Future Research Considerations

This small city's response to the visible trade differs from responses identified within some larger metropolises, where a visible street sex trade may be tolerated in a specified area within the city. In Kamloops, there was no such area and this small city chose instead to pursue exclusionary or rescue responses that drove sex workers into the shadows, out of the city, or into rehabilitative programming. The sex trade was thus pushed from public view in Kamloops, however it is not clear whether sex workers faced increased harms as a result of this governance response. The state certainly did not evaluate this and thus far, no researcher has come forward to explore the outcome of the implementation of the exclusion zones within Kamloops. Interest about the trade and the people engaged in it disappeared as the sex workers vanished from sight.

It would be valuable however, to examine outcomes that follow in the wake of the implementation of exclusion zones in the small city context. Examination of the wider body of literature allows for the speculation that these responses may have further jeopardized sex worker safety. Further research explorations offer the potential to increase our insight and potentially lead us to develop responses to the street sex trade that aim to include the workers in our community, in our research, and in future policy making processes.

References

A reason not to buy local. (2007, September 7). A reason not to buy local.

Kamloops This Week, p. 8.

A Royal pain that's a crime. (2006, September 1). A Royal pain that's a crime.

Kamloops This Week, p. 5.

Abercrombie, N., Hill, S. & Turner, B. (1988). *The penguin dictionary of sociology* (2nd ed).

London: Penguin Books.

Ajay A-OK in cup run. (2007, June 10). Ajay A-OK in cup run. *Kamloops This Week*, p. 8.

Filmer, P., Jenks, C., Seale, C., Thoburn, N. & Walsh, D. (2006). Politics, identifies and reasearch.

In C. Seale (Ed.), *Researching society and culture* (2nd ed.), (33-46). London: Sage Publications.

ASK accused of inflating numbers. (2007, January 19). ASK accused of inflating numbers.

Kamloops This Week, p. 4.

ASK Wellness. (n.d.). Retrieved October 17, 2011, from ASK Wellness:

<http://www.askwellness.ca/>

Baines, D. (2007). Anti-oppressive social work practice: Fighting for space, fighting for change.

In D. Baines (Ed.), *Doing anti-oppressive practice: Building transformative politicized social work* (1-30). Halifax: Fernwood Publishing.

Barlow, J. (2007, July 6). Let red zone brighten the day for north shore.

Kamloops This Week, p. 9.

Barnett, L. (2008, February 14). *Prostitution in Canada: International obligations, federal law and provincial and municipal jurisdiction*. Retrieved August 2, 2009, from Parliament of Canada: <http://www.parl.gc.ca/Default.aspx?Language=E>

Bass, D. (2007, July 8). Perhaps the quiet approach will best tackle crime.

Kamloops This Week, p. A6.

Beall, J. (2001). Valuing social resources or capitalizing on them? Limits to pro-poor urban governance in nine cities of the South. *International Planning Studies*, 6 (4), 357-375.

Bell, D. & Jayne, M. (. (2006). *Small cities: Urban experiences beyond the metropolis*. New York: Routledge.

Benoit, C. & Shaver, F. (2006). Critical issues and new directions in sex work research. *Canadian Review of Sociology & Anthropology*, 43 (3), 243-264.

Betteridge, G. (2005). *Sex, work, rights: Reforming Canadian criminal laws on prostitution*. Toronto: Canadian HIV/AIDS Legal Network.

Bindel, J. & Kelly, L. (2003). *A critical examination of responses to prostitution in four countries: Victoria, Australia; Ireland; the Netherlands; and Sweden*. Retrieved July 15, 2008, from Global Network of Sex Work Projects: <http://www.nswp.org/>

Brennan, C., Hackler, D. & Hoene, C. (2005). Demographic change in small cities, 1990 to 2000. *Urban Affairs Review*, 40 (3), 342-361.

- Brison, S. J. (2006). Contentious freedom: Sex work and social construction. *Hypatia*, 21 (4), 192-200.
- Brown, J., Higgit, N., Miller, C., Wingert, S., Williams, M. & Morrisette, L. (2006). Challenges faced by women working in the inner city sex trade. *Canadian Journal of Urban Research*, 15 (1), 36-53.
- By-Law No, 9-38. (1991). *By-Law Governing Licences and Regulations*. Retrieved September 11, 2011, from City of Kamloops:
<https://kamloops.civicweb.net/Documents/DocumentList.aspx?ID=8290>
- City cleans up house. (2004, August 15). *Kamloops This Week*, p. 13.
- City to hire crime prevention officer. (2006, January 13). City to hire crime prevention officer. *Kamloops This Week*, p. 12.
- Clarke, A. E. (2005). *Situational analysis: Grounded theory after the post-modern turn*. Thousand Oaks, California: Sage.
- Clifford, D. & Burke, B. (2009). *Anti-oppressive ethics and values in social work*. London: Palgrave MacMillan.
- Crime gets unwelcome shadow. (2005, July 17). Crime gets unwelcome shadow. *Kamloops This Week*, p. 3.
- Criminal Code, RSC. (1985). *Justice Laws Website*. Retrieved March 15, 2008, from Department of Justice: <http://laws-lois.justice.gc.ca/eng/>

Danaher, G., Schirato, T. & Webb, J. (2000). *Understanding Foucault*. London, England: Sage Publications.

Davies, J. S. (2005). Local governance and the dialectics of hierarchy, market and network. *Policy Studies*, 26 (3/4), 311-335.

Deutschmann, L. B. (2005). Kamloops: The risk society is in my back yard. In W. F. Garrett-Petts, *The small cities book: On the cultural future of small cities* (333-348). Vancouver: New Star Books.

Dominelli, L. (2002). *Anti-oppressive social work theory and practice*. London: Palgrave MacMillan.

Duncan, S. (2004, January 31). Emptying Rafter G of problem tenants forces them elsewhere. *Kamloops Daily News*, p. A6.

Duncan, S. (2005, November 18). Society must talk SHOP with group. *Kamloops Daily News*, p. A6.

Dustin, D. & Montgomery M. R. (2010). The use of social theory in reflecting on anti-oppressive practice with final year BSW social work students. *Social Work Education*, 29 (4), 386-401.

Fortems, C. (2004, November 10). Home of last resort torn down to make way for seniors' housing. *Kamloops Daily News*, p. A1.

Francis, D. (2006). *Red light neon: A history of Vancouver's sex trade*. Vancouver: Subway Books.

Fulton & Company LLP. (n.d.). *Amalgamation: 1967 when north & south Kamloops became*

'Kamloops'. Retrieved October 17, 2011, from Fulton & Company LLP:

<http://www.fultonco.com/>

Gavey, N. (1997). Feminist poststructuralism and discourse analysis. In M. M. Gergen & S. N. S.

N. Davis, *Toward a new psychology of gender: A reader* (49-64). New York: Routledge.

Giddens, A. (1979). *Central problems in social theory: Action, structure and contradiction in*

social analysis. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press.

Giddens, A. & Duneier, M. (2000). *Introduction to sociology* (3rd ed.). New York: W.W. Norton &

Company, Inc.

Gilbert, T. & Powell, J. L. (2010). Power and social work in the United Kingdom: A Foucauldian

excursion. *Journal of Social Work*, 10 (3), 3-22.

Gregory, M. & Holloway, M. (2005). Language and the shaping of social work. *British Journal of*

Social Work, 35 (1), 37-53.

Gubrium, J. F., & Holstein, J. A. (2000). Analyzing interpretive practice. In N. K. Denzin, & Y. S.

Lincoln (Eds.), *Handbook of qualitative research* (2nd ed.) (481-508). Thousand Oaks:

California: Sage Publications.

Hall, N. (2011, March 31). *Supreme Court of Canada Grants Prostitution Law Appeal*. Retrieved

April 23, 2011, from Vancouver Sun: <http://www.vancouversun.com/index.html>

Hallgrimsdottir, H., Phillips, R. & Benoit, C. (2008a). Fallen women and rescued girls: Social

stigma and media narratives of the sex industry in Victoria, B.C., from 1980 to 2005.

Canadian Review of Sociology & Anthropology, 43 (3), 265-280.

Hallgrimsdottir, H., Phillips, R., Benoit, C. & Walby, K. (2008b). Sporting girls, streetwalkers and inmates of houses of ill repute: Media narratives and the historical mutability of prostitution stigmas. *Sociological Perspectives*, 51 (1), 119-138.

Healey, P. (2006). Transforming governance: Challenges of institutional adaptation and a new politics of space. *European Planning Studies*, 14 (3), 299-320.

Hewitt de Alcántara, C. (1998). Uses and abuses of the concept of governance. *International Social Science Journal*, 50 (155), 105-113.

Hewlett, J. (2003, September 24). Mayor has plan to deal with hooker problem.

Kamloops Daily News, p. A4.

Hewlett, J. (2004, August 24). North Shore meet seeks solutions. *Kamloops Daily News*, p. A3.

Hewlett, J. (2004, May 21). Notorious corner gets facelift. *Kamloops Daily News*, p. A4.

Hewlett, J. (2005, July 11). Crime wave: Businesses batten down the hatches and persevere.

Kamloops Daily News, p. B1.

Hewlett, J. (2008, January 30). Core values: Businesses seeks solutions to downtown crime.

Kamloops Daily News, p. A1.

Hewlett, J. (2008, June 18). Crime can happen anywhere in town and it did.

Kamloops Daily News, p. B1.

Hewlett, J. (2008, May 23). Prostitutes to get help staying off the streets.

Kamloops Daily News, p. A3.

Hick, S. & Murray, K. (2009). Structural social work. In M. Gray & S. A. Webb (Eds.), *Social work theories and methods* (86-97). London: Sage Publications.

Hodder, J. (2000). The interpretation of documents and material culture. In N. K. Denzin, & Y. L. Lincoln (Eds.), *Handbook of qualitative research* (2nd ed.) (703-716). Thousand Oaks: California: Sage Publications.

Howell, P., Beckingham, D. & Moore, F. (2008). Managed zones for sex workers in Liverpool: Contemporary proposals, Victorian parallels. *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers*, 33 (2), 233-250.

Hubbard, P. (1997). Red-light districts and toleration zones: Geographies of female street prostitution in England and Wales. *Area*, 29 (2), 129-140.

Hubbard, P. (1998). Sexuality, immorality and the city: Red-light districts and the marginalization of female street prostitutes. *Gender, Place & Culture: A Journal of Feminist Geography*, 5 (1), 55-69.

Hubbard, P. (2002). Sexing the self: Geographies of engagement and encounter. *Social & Cultural Geography*, 3 (4), 365-381.

Hubbard, P. (2004). Revenge and injustice in the neoliberal city: Uncovering masculinist agendas. *Antipode*, 36 (4), 665-685.

- Hubbard, P., Matthews, R. & Scoular, J. (2008). Regulating sex work in the EU: Prostitute women and the new spaces of exclusion. *Gender, Place & Culture*, 15 (2), 137-152.
- Hubbard, P. & Sanders, T. (2003). Making space for sex work: Female street prostitution and the production of urban space. *International Journal of Urban Space*, 27 (1), 75-89.
- Hughes, B. (2007, July 10). Community must solve thorny prostitution issue.
Kamloops Daily News, p. A6.
- Human Rights Watch. (2003, January 15). "We'll kill you if you cry": Sexual violence in the Sierra Leone conflict. Retrieved March 7, 2010, from Human Rights Watch:
<http://www.hrw.org/>
- It Shouldn't Surprise Anybody. (2005, July 27). It Shouldn't Surprise Anybody.
Kamloops This Week, p. 8.
- Jäger, S. & Maier, F. (2009). Theoretical and methodological aspects of Foucauldian critical discourse analysis and dispositive analysis. In R. Wodak & M. Meyer (Eds.) *Methods of critical discourse analysis* (2nd ed.), (34-61). Los Angeles: Sage.
- Jessop, B. (1998). The rise of governance and the risks of failure: The case of economic development. *International Social Science Journal*, 50 (155), 29-45.
- Jones, P., Hillier, D., Shears, P., & Comfort, D. (2005). Managing and regulating red light districts in British cities. *Management Research News*, 28 (8), 61-67.
- Kamloops Daily News. (2007, October 31). Funding continues for program to get women off the

streets. *Kamloops Daily News*, p. A5.

KCAT tackles john school. (2005, May 4). KCAT tackles john school. *Kamloops This Week*, p. 5.

Keil, A. (2006). New urban governance processes on the level of neighbourhoods. *European Planning Studies*, 14 (3), 335-364.

Kerkin, K. (2004). Discourse, representation and urban planning: How a critical approach to discourse helps reveal the spatial re-ordering of street sex work. *Australian Geographer* 35 (2), 185-192.

Kohm, S., & Selwood, J. (2004). *Sex work and city planning: Winnipeg's red light district committee and the regulation of prostitution (Research and Working Paper #42)*.

Retrieved July 8, 2008, from The University of Winnipeg: Institute of Urban Studies:
<http://www.uwinnipeg.ca/>.

Koopmans, R. (2002, July 24). Police round up five people after search of crack house.

Kamloops Daily News, p. A1.

Koopmans, R. (2003, October 17). Council urged to curtail prostitution.

Kamloops Daily News, p. 1.

Koopmans, R. (2003, November 22). Mayor eyes plan for North Shore improvement.

Kamloops Daily News, p. A7.

Koopmans, R. (2003, September 23). North shore sex trade raises alarm.

Kamloops Daily News, p. A1.

Koopmans, R. (2007, June 8). 13 banned from North Shore areas; Police round up prostitutes in undercover operation after complaints from residents about sex trade.

Kamloops Daily News, p. A1.

Koopmans, R. (2007, June 9). Men, women fare differently in crackdown on prostitutes.

Kamloops Daily News, p. A7.

Koopmans, R. (2007, March 15). No easy solution found for sex trade: Forum seeks solutions to problems created by street-level prostitution. *Kamloops Daily News*, p. A1.

Koopmans, R. (2007, July 17). Police say no assault reported. *Kamloops Daily News*, p. A3.

Koopmans, R. (2007, June 16). Prostitutes simply trade zones, SHOP head says.

Kamloops Daily News, p. A4.

Koopmans, R. (2008, February 21). The red zone effect. *Kamloops Daily News*, p. A1.

Koopmans, R. (2008, February 21). The red zone effect. *Kamloops Daily News*, p. A1.

Lake, T. (2007, June 11). North shore deserves break from impact of sex trade.

Kamloops Daily News, p. A7.

Lakeman, L. (2009a). Abolishing prostitution through economic, physical and political security for women. In M. Griffin Cohen, & J. Pulkingham, *Public policy for women: The state, income security and labour market issues* (pp. 139-161). Toronto: University of Toronto

Press.

Lakeman, L. (2009b). One is too many: Global trafficking for sexual exploitation. *Perspectives*, 31 (2), 4-7.

Laneela, M. (2009). *Gordon Campbell: leader of the BC Liberal Party, British Columbia votes 2009*. Retrieved May 22, 2011, from CBC News: <http://www.cbc.ca>

Larsen, E. N. (1992). The politics of prostitution control: Interest group politics in four Canadian cities . *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, 16 (2), 169-189.

Layder, D. (2006). *Understanding social theory* (2nd ed.). London: Sage Publications.

Lazaar, D. (2006). Selected issues in the philosophy of social science. In C. Seale (Ed.), *Researching society and culture* (2nd ed.) (7-19). London: Sage Publications.

Litt, C. (2007, June 23). Beat patrol, volunteers keep crime at bay on busy North Shore street. *Kamloops Daily News*, p. B1.

Lin, A. M. Y. (2008). The identity game and discursive struggles of everyday life: An introduction. In A. M. Y. Lin (Ed.), *Problematizing identity: Everyday struggles, in lanaguge, culture, and education* (1-10). New York: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Local RCMP to get visit from vice squad. (2002, February 5). Local RCMP to get visit from vice squad. *Kamloops Daily News*, p. 4.

Local solution needed. (2005, April 8). Local solution needed. *Kamloops This Week*, p. 5.

Lowman, J. (2000). Violence and the outlaw status of (street) prostitution in Canada. *Violence*

Against Women, 6 (9), 987-1011.

Lowman, J. (2001). *Identifying research gaps in the prostitution literature*. Retrieved April 12, 2008, from Research and Statistics Division of the Department of Justice Canada:
<http://www.justice.gc.ca/eng/pi/rs/index.html>

Lowman, J. (n.d.). *Submission to the subcommittee on solicitation laws of the Standing Committee on Justice, Human Rights, Public Safety and Emergency Preparedness*. Retrieved June 21, 2008, from John Lowman's Prostitution Research Page:
http://24.85.225.7/lowman_prostitution/

MacDonald, M. (2007, August 22). "We don't usually come out in the evenings, once it gets dark". *Kamloops This Week*, p. 1.

MacLeod, G. (2002). From urban entrepreneurialism to a "Revanchist City"? On the spatial injustices of Glasgow's renaissance. *Antipode*, 34 (3), 602-624.

March to veer through red zone. (2007, September 18). March to veer through red zone. *Kamloops Daily News*, p. A3.

Mautner, G. (2008). Analyzing newspapers, magazines and other print media. In R. Wodak & M. Krzyzanowski (Eds.), *Qualitative discourse analysis in the social sciences* (pp. 30-53). Basingstoke, Hampshire: Palgrave McMillan.

Minnery, J. (2007). Stars and their supporting cast: State, market and community as actors in urban governance. *Urban Policy and Research*, 25 (3), 325-345.

Minutes of a regular meeting of the municipal council of the City of Kamloops. (2007). Minutes of a regular meeting of the municipal council of the City of Kamloops. October 30.

Morgan, R. (2006, December 2). City council must stop dumping on North Shore.

Kamloops Daily News, p. A6.

News 1130 Staff. (2011, March 31). *Supreme court of Canada to weigh in on prostitution laws:*

Case brought in by local group. Retrieved April 23, 2011, from NEWS 1130:

<http://www.news1130.com/>

Nicholls, D. (2009). Qualitative research: Part two – methodologies. *International Journal of Therapy and Rehabilitation*, 16 (11), 586-592.

No answer yet on SHOP. (2005, December 16). No answer yet on SHOP.

Kamloops This Week, p. 7.

North Shore patrol. (2006, February 5). North Shore patrol. *Kamloops This Week*, p. 2006.

North Shore: Crime capital of city? (2005, July 1). North Shore: Crime capital of city?

Kamloops This Week, p. 7.

Okitikpi, T. & Aymer, C. (2008). *The art of social work practice*. Dorset, England: Russell House Publishing.

Olivier, C. & Bass, D. (2007, July 15). Peaceful protest turns ugly. *Kamloops This Week*, p. 1.

O'Neill, M., Campbell, R., Hubbard, P., Pitcher, J. & Scoular, J. (2008). Living with the other:

Street sex work, contingent communities and degrees of tolerance. *Crime, Media, Culture*, 4 (1), 73-93.

Patterson, B. (2006). Newspaper representations of mental illness and the impact of the reporting of 'events' on social policy: The 'framing' of Isabel Schwarz and Jonathan Zito. *Journal of Psychiatric and Mental Health Nursing*, 13, 294-300.

Payne, M. (2005). *Modern social work theory* (3rd ed.). Chicago: Lyceum Books.

Peacock, D. (2003, November 1). Good luck dealing with ladies of the night.

Kamloops Daily News, p. A1.

Phillips, L. (2008, March 1). Drug dealers simply changed locations. *Kamloops Daily News*, p. A6.

Phones gone on Tranquille. (2006, September 15). Phones gone on Tranquille.

Kamloops This Week, p. 13.

Pivot Legal Society. (2006). *Beyond discrimination: Sex work, human rights and a new framework for law reform [full report]*. Retrieved June 25, 2008, from <http://www.pivotlegal.org>

Plaster Carter, S., Carter, S. & Dannenberg, A. (2003). Zoning out crime and improving community health in Sarasota, Florida: "Crime prevention through environmental design". *American Journal of Public Health*, 93 (9), 1442-1445.

Pondering prostitution. (2005, November 16). Pondering prostitution.

Kamloops This Week, p. 5.

Potts, K. & Brown, L. (2008). Becoming an anti-oppressive researcher. In M. Webber and K. Benzanson (Eds.), *Rethinking society in the 21st century: Critical readings in sociology* (50-57), (2nd ed.). Toronto: Canadian Scholars Press.

Prostitutes migrating to other areas of the city. (2007, June 15). Prostitutes migrating to other areas of the city. *Kamloops This Week*, p. 1.

Prostitutes, homeless to beautify Tranquille. (2007, July 4). Prostitutes, homeless to beautify Tranquill. *Kamloops Daily News*, p. A4.

Prostitution program in committee's sights. (2006, July 21). Prostitution program in committee's sights. *Kamloops This Week*, p. 7.

Province of British Columbia. (2006). *British Columbia Municipal and Regional District 2006 Census Total Population Results*. Retrieved July 20, 2009, from BC Stats :
www.bcstats.gov.bc.ca/index.asp

Red zone forcing prostitutes into hiding, councillor claims. (2007, June 13). Red zone forcing prostitutes into hiding, councillor claims. *Kamloops Daily News*, p. A3.

Red zones to target criminals. (2007, May 16). Red zones to target criminals.
Kamloops This Week, p. 2.

Reichennek, K. (2007, July 20). Sex trade workers the real victims, not business.
Kamloops This Week, p. 9.

Reisigl, M. & Wodak, R. (2009). The discourse-historical approach (DHA). In R. Wodak & M. Meyer (Eds.), *Methods of critical discourse analysis* (2nd ed.), (87-121). Los Angeles: Sage.

Robertson, J. (2005, June 16). Drugs, hopelessness defining our lives.
Kamloops Daily News, p. 6.

Rothenburger, M. (2003, May 5). Meeting city's policing needs requires multifaceted approach.
Kamloops Daily News, p. 4.

Rothenburger, M. (2005, June 6). City sex-trade group works hard on a daunting social issue.
Kamloops Daily News, p. A6.

Rothenburger, M. (2008, May 24). Prostitution sting raises important issues.
Kamloops Daily News, p. A7.

Ryan, G. W. & Bernard, H. R. (2000). Data management and analysis methods. In N. K. Denzen, & Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.), *Handbook of qualitative research* (769-795). Thousand Oaks: California: Sage Publications.

Saunders, L. (2007, June 22). Get a respectable job! *Kamloops This Week*, p. 9.

Scmidt, D. (2008). Who counts? On democracy, power and the incalculable. *Research in Phenomenology*, 38, 228-273.

Scoular, J. & O'Neill, M. (2007). Regulating prostituion: Social inclusion, responsiblization and he politics of prostitution reform. *British Journal of Criminology*, 47, 764-775.

Seeking sex trade workers, Society looks for help delivering outreach. (2009, January 6). Seeking sex trade workers, Society looks for help delivering outreach.

Kamloops Daily News, p. A3.

Sharp, L. & Richardson, T. (2001). Reflections on Foucauldian discourse analysis in planning and environmental policy research. *Journal of Environmental Policy & Planning*, 3, 193-209.

Shaw, I. (2009). Ways of knowing. In M. Gray & S. A. Webb (Eds.), *Social work theories and methods* (184-194). London: Sage Publications.

Shaw, S. E. & Bailey, J. (2009). Discourse analysis: What is it and why is it relevant to family practice? . *Family Practice*, 26, 413-419.

Shopping for some answers. (2007, February 14). Shopping for some answers.

Kamloops This Week, p. 8.

Silverman, D. (2000). Analyzing talk and text. In N. K. Denzen, & Y. S. (Eds.), *Hanbook of qualitative research* (2nd ed.) (821-834). Thousand Oaks: California: Sage Publications.

Skeggs, B. (2008). The problem with identity. In A. M. Y. Lin (Ed.), *Problematizing identity:*

Everyday struggles in language, culture, and education (11-34). New York: Lawrence

Erlbaum Associates.

Speer, S. A. (2005). *Gender talk: Feminism, discourse and conversation analysis*. East Sussex, England: Routledge.

Stuart, P. H. (2005). Historical research. In R. M. Grinnell, Jr. & Y. A. Unrau (Eds.), *Social work research and evaluation: Quantitative and qualitative approaches* (7th ed), (329-338).

New York: Oxford University Press.

Sundar, P. (2009). Multiculturalism. In M. Gray & S. A. Webb (Eds.), *Social work theories and methods* (98-108). London: Sage Publications.

Take sex trade out of the dark. (2005, April 15). Take sex trade out of the dark.

Kamloops This Week, p. 1.

Taking back the streets. (2005, July 22). Taking back the streets. *Kamloops This Week*, p. 3.

Taking steps for safety. (2004, September 17). *Kamloops This Week*, p. 8.

Tani, S. (2002). Whose place is this space? Life in the street prostitution area of Helsinki, Finland. *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, 26 (2), 343-359.

Team tackles crime head-on. (2004, August 24). *Kamloops This Week*, p. 3.

The addiction of violence. (2007, August 29). The addiction of violence.

Kamloops This Week, p. 8.

The Canadian Encyclopedia Online. (n.d.). *City*. Retrieved July 1, 2008, from

<http://thecanadianencyclopedia.com>

Tonkiss, F. (2006). Analysing text and speech: Content and discourse analysis. In C. Seale (Ed.), *Researching society and culture* (2nd ed.), (367-382). London: Sage Publications.

UNFPA. (n.d.). *HIV/AIDS, gender and sex work*. Retrieved February 5, 2010, from United Nations Population Fund: <http://www.unfpa.org/hiv/docs/rp/factsheets.pdf>

Wahab, S. (2002). "For their own good?" Sex work, social control and social workers, a historical perspective. *Journal of Sociology and Social Welfare*, 14 (4), 39-57.

Waitt, G., & Gibson, C. (2009). Creative small cities: Rethinking the creative economy in place. *Urban Studies*, 46 (5 & 6), 1223-1246.

White, S. (2009). Discourse analysis and reflexivity. In M. Gray & S. Webb (Eds.), *Social work theories and methods* (161-171). London: Sage Publications.

Ward, N. (2009). Social exclusion, social identity and social work: Analysing social exclusion from a material discursive perspective. *Social Work Education*, 28 (3), 237-252.

Wharf, B. & McKenzie, B. (2004) *Connecting Policy to Practice in the Human Services* (2nd ed.). Don Mills, Ontario: Oxford University Press.

Whowell, M. (2010). Male sex work: Exploring regulation in England and Wales. *Journal of Law and Society*, 37 (1), 125-144.

Will gang control prostitutes. (2007, June 13). Will gang control prostitutes.

Kamloops This Week, p. 1.

Wood, L. & Kroger, R. (2000). *Doing discourse analysis: Methods for studying action in talk and text*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Youds, M. (2002, March 2). New downtown group seeks improvement unity.

Kamloops Daily News, p. A3.

Young, M. (2002, December 5). City councillors handed committee jobs for year.

Kamloops Daily News, p. A9.

Young, M. (2005, August 13). SHOP Around. *Kamloops Daily News*, p. A1.

Young, M. (2007, October 12). SHOP hosts sex-trade discussions. *Kamloops Daily News*, p. A9.

Young, M. (2007, June 14). Legalize prostitution says Singh. *Kamloops Daily News*, p. A1.