A “COMMERCE OF TASTE” IN PATTERN BOOKS OF ANGLICAN CHURCH
ARCHITECTURE IN CANADA 1867 -1914

by

BARRY STEPHEN MAGRILL
B.A., York University, 2001
M.A., York University, 2003

A THESIS SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS
FOR THE DEGREE OF

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

in
THE FACULTY OF GRADUATE STUDIES
(Fine Arts)

THE UNIVERSITY OF BRITISH COLUMBIA
(Vancouver)
May 2008
© Barry Stephen Magrill, 2008
Abstract

This thesis examines the construction of Anglican churches in Canada in the period between 1867 and 1914. During this period settlement and economic expansion occurred alongside new political arrangements and consciousness that involved religious observance and debate. The building of churches became an important site of architectural and cultural formation in part due to the circulation of pattern books and the development of print media. At its broadest level, this thesis assesses the influence of church building across the Confederation in the constitution of social economy and attitude, particularly around ideas of collective identity. Consequently the focus is the analysis of the effects of transatlantic and transcontinental exchanges of ideas of design taste on a representative selection of churches built over the protracted period of Confederation. To this end, the thesis examines the importation of pattern books of architecture, particularly those illustrating popular Neo-Gothic church designs from Britain and the United States. It demonstrates how print media not only influenced architects, builders and committees charged with ecclesiastical construction but also consolidated architectural practice and constrained the fashioning of an autonomous national architectural idiom. The thesis maintains a perspective of the very diversity of ethnic, cultural and political allegiance experienced across Canada that contested the apparent dominance of British imperial authority and colonial regulation. The case studies of Anglican churches re-present larger economic and socio-cultural trends subsequently contested by comparative cases of Roman Catholic, Non-Conformist and even Jewish structures that underscore the complex interchange of ideas and interests. They reveal the use of supposedly hegemonic taste in church design to register the
presence of other denominations and religious groups in the formation of Canadian society.

The thesis shows how debates about the design of churches in the evolving nation of Canada was integral to the ongoing definition of wider taste in architecture, to the development of local and regional economy, and to communal identity. These processes reflected the new spatial geographies and imagined maps of culture enabled by the commercial production, circulation and consumption of print media such as church pattern books.
# Table of Contents

Abstract ................................................................................................................................................... ii

Table of Contents ....................................................................................................................................... iv

List of Illustrations ...................................................................................................................................... viii

Acknowledgements ....................................................................................................................................... xiv

Dedication ................................................................................................................................................... xvi

I. Introduction ................................................................................................................................................. 1

1.1 About Social Formations in Canada ........................................................................................................ 1
1.1.1 The Rise of Commercial Society ...................................................................................................... 5

1.2 Terrain of the Thesis ................................................................................................................................... 6
1.2.1 The Value of Case Study ................................................................................................................ 9

1.3 Theoretical Approaches .......................................................................................................................... 11

1.4 A Few Words to the Readers of Church Pattern Books ............................................................................ 13

1.5 Prior Analyses of Pattern Book Consumption ......................................................................................... 17

1.6 The Construction of the Thesis Chapters .................................................................................................. 18

II. Church-Building and Pattern Books in the Dominion, 1840s and 1850s .................................................... 23

2.1 The Influence of Ecclesiology and Pattern Books on Maritime Churches .................................................. 26
2.1.1 Variations in Church Pattern book Formats .................................................................................. 30

2.2 Economy and Religion in Church-Building in the Maritimes and Lower Canada Before 1867 ................................................................. 41
2.2.1 Religious Politics of Church Pattern Books .................................................................................. 48

2.3 The Establishment of New Anglican Dioceses in St. John, New Brunswick, St. John’s Newfoundland, and Montreal, Quebec before 1867 Confederation ........................................................................ 54
2.3.1 Case Study: Fredericton Cathedral and St. Anne’s Chapel ......................................................... 58

2.4 Selling Early Ecclesiology as Identity in the Maritimes .............................................................................. 67
2.4.1 Case Study: Anglican Cathedral of St. John’s, Newfoundland ..................................................... 71
### II. Race, Rebellion, and Politics in Lower and Upper Canada

2.5 Race, Rebellion, and Politics in Lower and Upper Canada .................74  
2.5.1 Case Study: Montreal’s Christ Church (later cathedral) 1857 .......76  
2.5.2 Comparative Case Study: St. Simon and St. Jude, Tignish PEI ...79  
2.5.3 Comparative Case Study: St. Mary’s Roman Catholic Church  
(1899-1902), Indian River, PEI .......................................81

2.6 Summary .............................................................................83

### III. Property Ownership, Church-Building, and Pattern Book Economies  
in Ontario and Manitoba in the 1860s and 1870s...............................86

3.1 Anglican Church-Building Alongside Settlement Expansion  
in Ontario and Manitoba ..........................................................89  
3.1.1 Material Representations of Spirituality .................................90  
3.1.2 Britain’s Parish Church Model in Rural Ontario ......................96  
3.1.3 The Financial Structure of Churches in Ontario and Manitoba  
after Confederation ...............................................................98  
3.1.4 Tariffs on Imported Books and Pattern Book Consumption.....101  
3.1.5 Church-Building and Commercial Expansion in Toronto,  
Ontario .............................................................................103  
3.1.6 Material Growth in Toronto after 1867 .................................105  
3.1.7 Case Study: The Burial Chapels of St. James-the-Less  
and the Toronto Necropolis ....................................................106

3.2 Financial Challenges for Anglican-Church Building in Ontario ......110  
3.2.1 The Context of Re-Constructing Toronto’s St. James  
Cathedral ...........................................................................113  
3.2.2 Case Study: St. James’ Cathedral, Toronto .............................116  
3.2.3 Strategies, Tactics, and Surveillance: Completing the Tower  
at St. James’ Anglican Cathedral .............................................123  
3.2.4 Religious Dissent in Ontario’s Social Structure after  
Confederation ..................................................................125  
3.2.5 Comparative Case Study: The Parsonage for Toronto’s  
‘Temple to Methodism’ .........................................................126  
3.2.6 Church-Building and the Architectural Profession in Manitoba..128  
3.2.7 Case Study: Holy Trinity Anglican Church, Winnipeg,  
Manitoba ........................................................................131

3.3 About Church Pattern Books and Pattern Book Economy,  
After Confederation ................................................................132  
3.3.1 “Designs for Village, Town, and City Churches”:  
One Pattern Book Produced in Ontario ...................................138  
3.3.2 Comparative Case Study: Two St. Andrew’s Presbyterian  
Churches in Toronto .........................................................142

3.4 Summary .............................................................................145
IV. The Mobility of Church Pattern Books in the Context of Colonialism in Canada

4.1 Pattern Book Distribution Between St. John’s and Victoria

4.2 Regional Booksellers, Local Church-Building, and National Imaginings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.2.1 The Local Spread of Empire: Railway, Religion, and Church-building</td>
<td>157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.2 Comparative Case Study: St. Antoine de Padoue, Batoche, Saskatchewan</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.3 Reappraising a ‘National Style of Architecture’ Alongside the Spread of Booksellers</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2.4 Case Study: Holy Trinity, Stanley Mission and St. James, Star City, Saskatchewan</td>
<td>167</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.3 Pattern Books after 1867

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.3.1 Comparative Case Study: Neo-Gothic at Rosh Pina Synagogue (1892), Winnipeg</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.2 Book Distribution and Imperial Procedure</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3.3 Case Study: St. Paul’s Anglican Church (1894), Regina, Saskatchewan</td>
<td>177</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.4 Settlement, Tourism, and Book Distribution

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>4.4.1 Case Study: St. George’s-in-the-Pines and the Banff Springs Hotel, Banff, Alberta</td>
<td>182</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.5 Summary

V. Unfinished Business: Church-Building and Pattern Book Consumption in Post-Confederation British Columbia

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.1 Promoting British Columbia as Terminus of Confederation and the Gothic Revival</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1.1 Case Study: St James’ Anglican Church, Vancouver, BC</td>
<td>192</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2 An “Empty” Land: The Possession and Erasure of First Nations</td>
<td>193</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.1 Case study: St. Paul’s, Metlakathla, BC (1874)</td>
<td>195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2.2 Comparative Case Study: Holy Cross Church, Skookumchuck, BC</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3 British Capital and U.S. Participation in Developing Infrastructure in British Columbia</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.1 Case Study: St. Anne’s (1901-2) and St., Jerome’s (1903), Steveston, BC</td>
<td>204</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3.2 Case Study: St. Saviour’s, Barkerville, BC (1869)</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Title</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>The Alternate Influence of U.S. Artistic, Cultural, and Economic Capital on British Columbia’s Churches</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4.1</td>
<td>Comparative Case Study: The Episcopal Church of Our Lady, Victoria BC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>Sourcing Acceptable Architecture for Evangelical Congregations in British Columbia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5.1</td>
<td>Methodism: Social Reform and Church Reform</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5.2</td>
<td>Comparative Case Study: Metropolitan Methodist Church, Victoria, BC (1890)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5.3</td>
<td>The Presbyterian Church in British Columbia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5.4</td>
<td>Comparative Case Study: St. Andrew’s Presbyterian Church, Victoria, BC (1890)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>Neo-Gothic’s ‘Final Gasp’ in Ecclesiastical Building in Victoria, BC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6.1</td>
<td>Case Study: St. John the Divine, Victoria, BC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.7</td>
<td>Summary</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

VI Conclusion

Illustrations

Bibliography

Appendix ‘A’ - Preface to George Truefitt’s Designs for Country Churches

Appendix ‘B’ – Brief Biographies of Pattern Book Authors
List of Illustrations

Fig. 1.1 Elevation of Howden Cathedral from Edmund Sharpe’s Architectural Parallels; or the Progress in Ecclesiastical Architecture in England through the Twelfth and the Thirteenth Centuries Examined in a Series of Parallel Examples, 1848..........................................................229

Fig. 1.2 A section of Whitby Cathedral from Edmund Sharpe’s Architectural Parallels; or the Progress in Ecclesiastical Architecture in England through the Twelfth and the Thirteenth Centuries Examined in a Series of Parallel Examples, 1848..........................................................230

Fig. 1.3 Plan of Barnwell Church, Northamptonshire from Raphael and J. Arthur Brandon’s Parish Churches; being Perspective Views of English Ecclesiastical Structures: Accompanied by Plans Drawn to a Uniform Scale with Descriptive Letterpress, 1848..........................................................231

Fig. 1.4 Perspective view of Barnwell Church, Northamptonshire from Raphael and J. Arthur Brandon’s Parish Churches; being Perspective Views of English Ecclesiastical Structures: Accompanied by Plans Drawn to a Uniform Scale with Descriptive Letterpress, 1848..........................................................232

Fig. 1.5 Foliage decoration from James Kellaway Colling’s Examples of English Medieval Foliage and Coloured Decoration Taken from Buildings of the Twelfth to the Fifteenth Century with Descriptive Letterpress, 1874.................................233

Fig. 2.1 Design No. 8, a generic design for an Anglican church with crossing tower and transept arms using the Early English Style from Frederick Withers’s Church Architecture Plans Elevations and Views of Twenty-One Churches and Two School Houses Photo Lithographed from Original Drawings with Numerous Illustrations Shewing Details of Construction, Church Fittings, etc., 1873..............234

Fig. 2.2 Centrally planned design from George Bidlake’s Sketches of Churches: Designed for the Use of Nonconformists, 1865..........................................................235

Fig. 2.3 Roof and scissor truss above the nave of Lympenhoe Church, Norfolk from Raphael and J. Arthur Brandon’s Open Timber Roofs, 1849.........................236

Fig. 2.4 View of Mont St. Michel, France from William Eden Nesfield’s Specimens of Medieval Architecture Chiefly Selected from Examples of the Twelfth and Thirteenth Centuries in France and Italy, 1862 .......................................................237

Fig. 2.5 Design No. 20 in the style of an Anglican church showing the architect’s diversity from Frederick Withers’s Church Architecture 1873.........................238
Fig. 2.6 Elevation drawing of the nave from Edmund Sharpe, *Illustrations of the Conventual Church of the Benedictine Abbey of St. Germaine at Selby*, 1870..239

Fig. 2.7 Perspective drawing of Werstham Church, Surrey from the liturgical south east from Raphael and J. Arthur Brandon’s *Parish Churches: being Perspective Views of English Ecclesiastical Structures: Accompanied by Plans Drawn to a Uniform Scale with Descriptive Letterpress*, 1848..................240

Fig. 2.8 Illustration of Grace Church, Albany New York from Frank Wills’s *Ancient English Ecclesiastical Architecture and its Principles Applied to the Wants at the Present Day*, 1850.................................................................241

Fig. 2.9 Design No. XIX from George Truefitt’s *Designs for Country Churches* 1850.................................................................242

Fig. 2.10 Charles Dwyer’s *The Economy of Church, Parsonage, and School Architecture*, 1856.................................................................243

Fig. 2.11 Example of the Picturesque in Henry Hudson Holly’s *Church Architecture*, 1871.................................................................244

Fig. 2.12 Christ Church, Fredericton, New Brunswick (1845), architect Frank Wills and completed by William Butterfield published in *The Ecclesiologist* vol. 9 April 1848: 360.................................................................245

Fig. 2.13 Christ Church, Montreal, (1847), architect Frank Wills. View from the liturgical south-west.................................................................246

Fig. 2.14 Perspective drawing from William Butterfield’s *Elevations, Sections and Details of Saint John Baptist Church, Shottesbrooke, Berkshire*, 1844.............247

Fig. 2.15 St. Michael’s, Long Stanton Cambridgeshire England. C. 13th century illustrated in Raphael and J. Arthur Brandon’s *Parish Churches* 1848.............248

Fig. 2.16 St. Michael’s, Sillery Quebec. Attributed to architect Frank Wills c. 1856.....249

Fig. 2.17 Christ Church, Montreal, (1847), architect Frank Wills. From the *Illustrated London News*, March 3 1860: 205.................................................................250

Fig. 2.18 Proposed British Protestant church in Nice France from the *Illustrated London News* May 14, 1859: 480.................................................................251

Fig. 2.19 St. Simon and St. Jude, Tignish PEI. Architect Patrick Keely c. 1860..............252

Fig. 2.20 St. Mary’s, Indian River PEI. Architect William Critchlow Harris 1900-02...253
Fig. 2.21 St. Mary’s, Indian River PEI. Interior looking east. Architect William Critchlow Harris 1900-02

Fig. 2.22 Illustration of the roof over the nave of St. Mary’s Church, Wimbotsham, Norfolk from Raphael and J Arthur Brandon’s Open Timber Roofs of the Middle Ages, 1849

Fig. 3.1 Design No. 3, a timber church from Henry Hudson Holly’s Church Architecture, 1871

Fig. 3.2 Elevation and plan of Design No. 11 from Frederick Withers’s Church Architecture Plans Elevations and Views of Twenty-One Churches and Two School Houses Photo Lithographed from Original Drawings with Numerous Illustrations Shewing Details of Construction, Church Fittings, etc., 1873

Fig. 3.3 St. Anne’s Chapel, Fredericton New Brunswick. Architect Frank Wills c. 1845 published in Wills’ Ancient English Ecclesiastical Architecture and its Principles Applied to the Wants of the Church at the Present Day 1850

Fig. 3.4 Anglican Church of the Messiah, rang du Bord de ‘leau, Sabrevois, Quebec . c.1855

Fig. 3.5 St. John the Evangelist, Oxford Mills, Ontario, 1869

Fig. 3.6 Design for iron church published in Instrumenta Ecclesiastica, 1856

Fig. 3.7 Design for village chapel from F.J. Jobson’s Chapel and School Architecture as Appropriate to the Buildings of Nonconformists, Particularly to Those of the Wesleyan Methodists, 1850

Fig. 3.8 St. James-the-Less, Toronto, Ontario. Architects Fred Cumberland and George Storm, 1857-61

Fig. 3.9 Toronto Necropolis Chapel. Architect Henry Langley, 1872

Fig. 3.10 Design No. 9 from George Truefitt’s Designs for Country Churches, 1850

Fig. 3.11 St. Paul’s Church, Brookline, Mass. and St. Thomas’ Church, Hanover, N.H

Fig. 3.12 St. James Anglican Cathedral, Toronto, Ontario. Architect Fred Cumberland, 1852
Fig. 3.13 St. Michael’s Roman Catholic Cathedral, Toronto, Ontario.
Architect Henry Langley 1867.................................................................268

Fig. 3.14 St. James Anglican Cathedral photographed in 1852 before the
completion of the tower in 1874. Photo: Toronto Public Library..............269

Fig. 3.15 Photograph of Holy Trinity Anglican Church, Winnipeg, Manitoba
published in the Canadian Architect and Builder, Architect Charles Wheeler....270

Fig 3.16 Illustration of north aisle windows of the nave of Strasbourg Cathedral
from George Trueflit’s Architectural Sketches on the Continent, 1847...........271

Fig. 3.17 Advertisement for Woodward’s Rural Church Architecture noting that
architects, builders, and building committees were a target audience, published
in the rear of Woodward’s National Architect 1869.....................................272

Fig. 3.18 Advertisement for ‘Dixon’s Low Down Philadelphia Grate’ placed
in the rear of Woodward’s National Architect 1869.....................................273

Fig. 3.19 Design for a church in Assiniboia by W.A. Langton published in
Designs for Village, Town and City Churches, 1893...............................274

Fig. 3.20 Design for a large town church by Daniel J. Crighton of Montreal
published in Designs for Village, Town and City Churches, 1893..............275

Fig. 3.21 Design for a country church by G. F. Stalker published in Designs for
Village, Town and City Churches, 1893......................................................276

Fig. 3.22 Winning entry for competition supplying publishable material to Designs
for Village, Town and City Churches, 1893. This winning design was not
published in the actual book........................................................................277

Fig. 4.1 Design No.8 from Henry Hudson Holly’s Church Architecture, 1871........278

Fig. 4.2 Polemical illustration of two church interiors entitled ‘The House of God’ from
Henry Hudson Holly’s Church Architecture, 1871.....................................279

Fig. 4.3 Holy Trinity Anglican Church, Stanley Mission, Saskatchewan. View from
the west tower..............................................................................................280

Fig. 4.4 New Independent Chapel, Abergele, North Wales. Architect, J. Roger Smith
published in Examples of Modern Architecture Ecclesiastical and Domestic
1873...........................................................................................................281

Fig. 4.5 ‘Interior of Library’ published in Henry Hudson Holly’s Church
Architecture 1871......................................................................................282
Fig. 4.6 West end of St. George’s-in-the-Pines, Banff, Alberta. Architect
F.P. Oakley........................................................................................................283

Fig. 5.1 St. James’ Anglican Church, Vancouver, BC...........................................284

Fig. 5.2 St. Paul’s Anglican Church, Metlakatla, BC. Photo: Archives of
British Columbia..................................................................................................285

Fig. 5.3 Chapel at Metlakatla. View of interior to the west showing the
carved totems........................................................................................................286

Fig. 5.4 Holy Cross, Skookumchuck, BC. View of the west entrance..................287

Fig. 5.5 Design No. 5, Plate 10 published in Henry Hudson Holly’s Church
Architecture 1871................................................................................................288

Fig. 5.6 St. Anne’s Anglican Church, Steveston, BC. Photo originally published in
Work for the Far West ..........................................................................................289

Fig. 5.7 St. Saviour’s Anglican Church, Barkerville, BC, 1869..........................290

Fig. 5.8 Illustration of ‘Board-and-Batten’ church design published in the
Ecclesiogical Society’s Instrumenta Ecclesiastica 1856.................................291

Fig. 5.9 The Episcopal Church of Our Lady, Victoria, BC. Architect John Teague....292

Fig. 5.10 Presbyterian church design published in A Hand Book of Designs, containing Plans in Perspective (1868) by the Chicago architect Gurdon P. Randall..............................................................................................................293

Fig. 5.11 Metropolitan Methodist Church, Victoria, BC. Architect Thomas Hooper....294

Fig. 5.12 Illustration of the New Baptist Church on Palmerston Ave., Toronto, Ontario published in the Canadian Architect and Builder in 1888.................295

Fig. 5.13 St. Andrew’s Presbyterian Church, Victoria, BC.
Architect Leonard Buttress Trimen......................................................................296

Fig. 5.14 St. John the Divine, Victoria, BC.
Architect Col. William Ridgway Wilson.............................................................297

Fig. 5.15 Design of a Presbyterian Church by architect Arnold Woodrofe published in Canadian Architect and Builder, in 1903........................................298
Acknowledgements

My production of this thesis was possible because of the dedication and support of my research advisers who have given generously of their time, knowledge, and perspective. I have also benefited from comments by other scholars within the Department of Art History, Visual Art and Theory at the University of British Columbia as well as colleagues, friends, and family. The subject of this project broadly encompassed church-building across Canada and therefore necessitated the help of archivists in various locales, many of which I had the pleasure to visit.

My thanks to Maureen Ryan for her insightful comments and suggestions throughout the entire process of my dissertation and graduate education. Carol Knicely provided valuable perspectives and common sense that was used to guide the completion of this project. Malcolm Thurlby’s knowledge of the nineteenth century and its architecture as well as his encouragement of my project – even before he became an official member of my thesis committee – deserves special recognition. I owe an abundant debt to Rhodri Windsor-Liscombe for his critical insight, sagely advice, and thorough analysis that carried through all of my graduate studies and my dissertation in particular.

I am thankful to the University of British Columbia for the award of a Travelling Scholarship that enabled me to research the church pattern books in London, England.

I wish to convey my gratitude to several people, particularly Melanie Wallace and Doreen Stephens of the Anglican Archives the Diocese of New Westminster and the Ecclesiastical Province of British Columbia and the Yukon, Twila Buttimer at the Provincial Archives of New Brunswick, and Nancy Hurn at the Anglican Diocesan
Archives in Toronto as well as the librarians at the British Museum and at the National Arts Library housed in the Victoria and Albert Museum.

Finally, I wish to acknowledge my family for their emotional support and understanding during the time I spent researching and writing this thesis.
Dedication

To my wife, Judy, who believed in me enough for the both of us. Her persistent support and love through several trials in our life together has been more than anyone could imagine. To my children Jamie, Haley, and Geoffrey for their understanding and patience which they more than paid for in time while I researched and wrote this thesis.
I. Introduction

1.1 About Social Formations in Canada

This thesis concerns the connections between religion, politics, taste, social practice, architectural expression, and the development of Canadian social economy in the era of Confederation. More specifically, the thesis uses these factors to examine the business and politics of church-building and the transmission of Neo-Gothic architecture to the Canadas between 1867 and 1914. Three key issues in the formation of society in the Canadas will be examined: the development of national ideologies alongside religion, the role of the church pattern books in circulating particular designs, and the growing influence of economy in the development of print culture. The influence of religion in society’s consolidation was amplified by the mechanical reproduction of the imagery contained in the church pattern books. On the one hand, the pattern books operated as a locus of identification through the publication of elevations, sections, plans, perspectives of churches and architectural details (figs. 1.1,1.2,1.3,1.4 and 1.5). On the other hand, the variety of church designs established in the pattern books only served to increase the exchange between economy, religion, and patterns of public taste.

Anglican churches form a significant part of the thesis because that denomination believed itself in control of the forming national enterprise. After the late 1830s, Anglicans operated as though their hegemonic status in Britain cemented privilege and prestige in the Canadas. This advantage was generally expressed in Neo-Gothic architecture. For this reason, I look at a collection of Anglican churches whose construction paralleled the western trajectory of settlement expansion across the Dominion of Canada. However, Anglicans were not as dominant as they believed
themselves to be. In reality, Methodists, Baptists, Presbyterians, and even Roman Catholics offered opposing ideologies but comparable Neo-Gothic church designs. Thus, I interpose examples of churches built by other denominations as comparative cases. I will show that a diverse set of Christian denominations adapted Neo-Gothic architecture to accord with their functional needs and aesthetic sense, and that these adaptations were related to the growth of consumer culture. As a factor of these new commercial practices, the variety in Neo-Gothic churches – which also paralleled the diversity of the Dominion’s immigrant population – was marketed and controlled by the pattern books. Each denomination followed a method of building churches prescribed in the pattern books primarily written for Anglicans, even though specific books were also developed to cater to the aesthetic needs of other denominations.

A number of case studies show how pattern books worked for a diverse group of readers and church-builders. All of the case studies will demonstrate how church buildings were connected with commercial society. In particular, the debates around the aesthetics of a single church building commission will clarify larger social issues linked to what I define the commodification of taste. The connection between early consumer culture and church-building in the Canadas is direct since churches were privately funded. By looking at church architecture as a consumer item frequently related to the pattern books, this thesis demonstrates the multifarious interconnections of religion, taste, economy, politics, and identity.

Above the several systems of societal regulation, religion marked out hierarchies of economic and social privilege. Anglicans had the financial backing of the Church of England. Even though money alone did not guarantee social dominance, Anglicans
enjoyed a privileged place in the governance of the Confederation of Canada. For this reason, inter-colonial political resistances periodically challenged what might be termed imperial-religious authority in the Dominion. For instance, the Mackenzie Rebellion of 1837 in Upper Canada, the Fenian Raids of 1866, and the ‘Manitoba Resistances’ of 1869-70 and 1885 became exacerbated by the Dominion authorities’ limitation of religious freedoms and restrictions enforced upon First Nations’ access to customary lands. Being correlated with the Dominion’s institutional establishment, Anglicans, for example, became targets for Mackenzie’s primarily Methodist forces. These resistances were constrained by enforced pacification that neglected to address the socio-economic imbalances contributing to the tensions. Nevertheless, the historical approach of this thesis will not lose sight of the fact that imperial and colonial forces believed in, and solicited support for, the rightness of their actions.

My thesis is arranged in a chronological and geographical sequence, but applies case studies to avoid a linear framework and thereby illustrates the complex social, economic, and political processes of Confederation. It also seeks to recover the formation of the imagined ‘nationhood’ that embraced political and commercial culture no less than religious practice. An integral part of understanding Canada’s ‘nationhood’ was the creation of infrastructures of religion as well as of governance and communication. The railway, which touched upon all of these factors, was also notionally connected to church-building because the rail generated wealth and transported materials, including pattern books, used to build churches. The railway had much in common with church pattern books because both were instruments for social pacification that also instigated disputes in the places they traversed – and each imbricated politics, economics, and
aesthetics. The proximity of the intercontinental rail boosted some small towns in Canada West and ruined others that were by-passed. By contrast, church pattern books showed a unified method of building churches, but offered variety that was facilitated by the commercial character of the book trade. As a result, the Dominion’s church-building congregations were able to pick from the parts of pattern books that they believed most applied to their needs.

Several of the churches examined in this thesis will be familiar ones to students of nineteenth-century architectural history but they are subject to novel evaluation. The churches are deliberately juxtaposed against the more obscure examples in order to show the diverse social and economic background of Canada’s church-building endeavours. The churches used in the case studies will be examined in connection with a clutch of pattern books produced in Britain by architects George Truefitt (Architectural Sketches on the Continent, 1848 and Design for Country Churches, London 1850), Raphael and J. Arthur Brandon (Parish Churches, 1st edition, London 1849), as well as, pattern books produced in America by architect Frederick Withers (Church Architecture, New York: 1873) and Davey James Brooks, ed.² (Examples of Modern Architecture, Boston: 1873). Another significant pattern book was compiled by British-trained architect Frank Wills entitled, Ancient English Ecclesiastical Architecture and its Principles Applied to the Wants of the Church at the Present Day (New York: 1850). It illustrates medieval European churches and contemporary designs by the author. Looking at the transmission ideas in architecture imported from Britain and the U.S. via the pattern books also enables a discussion of the different social economies of production as well as how these productions interfaced with the Dominion’s readerships. The full-page engraved
illustrations in pattern books reflected the socio-cultural geography of the authors and reflected the architectural history of the books’ places of publication in London, New York, and Boston. Thus, authors illustrated churches known to them; British books illustrated British and European medieval churches, and American books generally illustrated and advertised recent nineteenth-century Neo-Gothic designs. Many of the businessmen who sat on church-building committees, the contractors and builders, and even some architects relied on the pattern books and architectural newspapers as their chief sources of fashion in Britain.

1.1.1 The Rise of Commercial Society

A ‘commerce of taste’ – more properly defined as commercially driven ‘fashion’ – paralleled the production and consumption cycle evident in the construction of new churches in the Dominion and in the production of the pattern books. The growth of an early consumer society in the nineteenth century was achieved through marketing goods as generically necessary items. Churches were already considered a necessary component in building society but the pattern books’ popularity depended on new assurances on consumer culture.

The particular concern of this thesis is the means by which the circulation of print, and related local architectural practice, constituted a commercial society. My investigation seeks to contribute to an understanding of the economic systems that created political, social and cultural effects in marketing visual imagery. An important point reflected in this study shows that pattern books, which contained a range of designs categorized by the cost of construction, illustrated the interface of economy and social practice in the identification and classification of readerships. Thus, this study reinforces
and disrupts historian J.I. Little’s assertion that “few studies have integrated religion into the dynamic of community.” The objective of the thesis is to study the business of church-building, as it was associated with the pattern book, as an agent of social change. The significant role of pattern books to religious architecture will be addressed by examining the only known book of church designs produced in Canada: *Designs for Village, Town, and City Churches* (1893). Modelled on the U.S. publication format, the book will be discussed in Chapter III in order to demonstrate the accommodation of attitudes and processes from the United States in religious practices still founded on British models.

The marketing of the pattern books promoted church-building and associated religious institution with the new commercial practices in the constitution of a nation-state. But, as the history of Confederation shows, the process of forming society in British North America was complex, conflicted, and even counter to the stabilizing logic of a dominant colonial narrative. For this reason, my thesis is framed by the notion that there was no uniform imperial policy and related colonial process. Confederation was a ‘deal-making’ process reflecting diverse social and cultural interests within a loose association of regions, rather than a monolithic version of the superficially unifying ‘manifest destiny’ of the United States. As with most negotiations, the parties accepted that Confederation meant different things to each participating region. In this sense, provincial politicians likely talked the Confederation into political reality.

1.2 Terrain of the Thesis

The period under investigation in the thesis, 1867-1914, coincides with a formative episode in the social and economic development of the Canadas. The analysis
of church designs published in Britain and the U.S., and executed in Canada, corresponds to the theories of nation, modernity, modernization, and social identity that developed in the decades previous and subsequent to official Confederation in 1867. A major element is the way nineteenth-century observers perceived social and economic ‘improvements’ in terms of the spread of new commercial practices. The thesis also explores how social progress in a largely technocratic society was associated with the continued importance of religious institution. In this period, settlement expansion was entrenched in British values and financial investment, yet simultaneously exposed to American economic and cultural influence. The threat of an American annexation of the west was a particular concern to British and eastern Canadian investors who were financing the infrastructure pushing settlement and development westward.

The purpose of focusing on Anglican church-building is to probe imperial power relations that, positively and negatively, constituted the colonial situation. The established Church was a significant agent of the British imperial regime because the monarch was styled ‘Defender of the Faith’ as constituted in the Church of England. The imported church pattern books promoted Britain’s architectural fashion and contributed to the reinforcement of British mores, cultural values, and economic structures in the Dominion of Canada, eventually over-written by U.S. hegemony. Taste legitimized British, and to a considerable extent, Anglican cultural privilege. At the same time, the variety of imagery read into the pattern books contributed to intense architectural debates about the way churches should look. Those aesthetic debates reflected the interdenominational rivalries, as well as the internal tension within the Anglican communion about the level of ritual observance in worship. For this reason, the
iconography of Neo-Gothic churches that reflected and reinforced British, and particularly Anglican, socio-economic and cultural advantage, in essence, became unanticipated points of contention. Historian William Westfall has pointed out that, on the one hand, the established Church assumed a set of social and economic privileges not supported by canon law. For instance, colonial governments in the early nineteenth century exercised a good deal of authority over the Church by appointing colonial bishops. Church courts had not been reproduced in the Dominion, though the practice continued in England, and colonial governments removed the Church’s ability to collect tithes. On the other hand, the same documents that failed to establish the Anglican Church at law showed a clear intention to create a religious structure in the Dominion. For instance, the government of Quebec created policies on the use of the Book of Common Prayer, the school system, marriage, the authority of bishops, and land policy that established the primacy of the Church of England in principle and practice. Westfall argued that the ‘partial’ establishment of the Anglican Church made it a more effective organization by effectively removing the antiquated aspects of its practice. At the same time, the Anglican Church in Canada relied upon the continuation of a traditional social structure controlled largely by it, despite the level of religious competition that grew over the decades since Confederation.

It is worth bearing in mind that the notion of a ‘modern colonial society’ grew from the term ‘Empire’ coming into popular use to describe British expansion in all of its political, economic, and cultural – even religious – associations. In that regard, the term ‘Dominion’ became associated with British North America after the London Conference of Dec 4, 1866, which presaged the Charlottetown and Quebec Conferences that
established official Confederation on July 1, 1867. The designation ‘Dominion’ had biblical origin as suggested by the New Brunswick politician Samuel Leonard Tilley (1818-1896) (knighted in 1879) to describe the newly minted territory of Canada by citing Psalm 72:8, “His dominion shall be also from sea to sea.” Church pattern books similarly wrapped themselves in the mantle of religion and thereby promoted religious institution as the essential, if also commercial and political, practice devoted to community-building. As well, the link between the established Church and the forming nation-state was exemplified by the St. George, Union Jack, and Red Ensign flags that flew from the towers of Anglican churches throughout the Dominion as everyday regalia of both Canadian and imperial authority.

The Empire continued to associate itself with social improvement and modern technology, especially in the era following the London 1851 Great Exhibition – a projection of commerce and technology on a grander scale than was typically found in church pattern books. Social improvements were considered to be achievable through the deployment of new knowledge and the pattern books marketed themselves in that manner.

1.2.1 The Value of Case Study

A longitudinal series of case studies of church-building is deployed throughout this thesis and deliberately organized geographically across the Dominion in order to contextualize the broader analysis of social formation and the minutiae of building churches and reading church pattern books. The thesis adopts case study to examine systems of action bounded socially, spatially, and temporally.
The inclusion of case studies also enables the analysis of a network of social factors including economy, religion, and individual and collective identity to be visualized as organic, living systems. The thesis applies case study as part methodology, and part critical device to interrogate the constitutive force of these factors. The thesis comprises fourteen case studies, not including ten comparative cases, of church-building in the Dominion, linking the everyday contextual data and theoretical framing with conventional architectural analyses. The case studies of Anglican church-building in the Dominion present the data of ‘real-life’ situations, while the comparative cases of Non-conformist and other dissenting religions redistribute the discursive elements to form a concrete study of power relationships. The fourteen cases of Anglican churches built across the Dominion will be spread throughout the chapters of the thesis to show how local building practice adapted to the spread of British and American design initiatives. The cases will show how the spread of pattern book imagery across the Dominion paralleled the actual expansion of settlement and hence church-building, a fundamental part of the country’s social development.

The case studies will illustrate how pattern book imagery combined a network of commercial, technological, and religious factors in a particular kind of marketing scheme linked to settlement expansion. These factors included: migration, new building enterprise/techniques, social aspiration, the religious institution in the national formation, and a commerce of taste that legitimated social and economic privilege as well as justified the pursuit of group respectability. This thesis takes into account the resistances and dissentions among other Christian institutions, particularly Catholic, Presbyterian, and Methodist congregations, operating in the Dominion. Consequently, this thesis calls
for a varied and even flexible analytical approach to broad contexts and specific research data.

1.3 **Theoretical Approaches**

Though the thesis chiefly engages with the everyday processes of building churches it also applies aspects of spatial theory, discourse analysis, reception theory, and conventional architectural analysis. Ideas gleaned from these analytic frames are used to interrogate the western spread of church pattern books, settlement expansion, and new commercial practices associated with religion’s influence on social formation. Selling mechanically reproduced visual imagery, in the parlance of Walter Benjamin, liquidated the authenticity and mystifying elements of the original work of art but also commodified the value of representation. The mystical authority employed by religious institution was likewise disrupted by modern science and technology. The mechanical spread of print-based visual and verbal imagery, thus, brought about a varied, and opportunistic, use of church illustrations. That the debates coalesced around the way churches should look – fuelled by the variety of church engravings in illustrated pattern books – meant that the agency of the pattern books was both embraced and contested in the context of imperial and colonial authority.

Consequently, the thesis draws upon Pierre Bourdieu’s social studies collected in *Distinctions* (1984), *The Field of Cultural Production* (1993), and *The Social Structures of Economy* (2005) are important sources for developing a framework to probe the social, cultural, economic, and symbolic dimensions of taste. Presenting the dynamic, and variable, factors of social formation in action requires spatial and discursive analytic frameworks that visualize human interactions as relationships in oscillation. So much the
better to critically analyse the effects of capitalism in socially constituted space. As such, Henri Lefebvre’s critical reading of the social functioning of capital markets, in *The Production of Space* (1974), is applied in the thesis as complex relations of production.

To approach social relations in spatial terms, the activities of groups and individuals building churches in the Dominion will be assessed through Bourdieu’s concept of ‘habitus’. 'Habitus' is the learned understanding that people have about their social and economic position. Thus, the case studies will demonstrate the ‘habitus’ of colonial actors, who are also periodically agents for the exchange of cultural, symbolic, and economic capital. Their actions were constituted by “systems of dispositions” found in the pattern books’ rhetorics that became socially determined – and self-defining – positions. What produced the everyday practices that constituted church-builders’ positions in the Dominion, is the critical focus of the thesis. In *The Practices of Everyday Life* (1984), Michel De Certeau added two essential factors relative to the thesis: first, that stakeholders including those of so-called inferior status are not passive but active strategists and tacticians in the exchange of cultural, economic, and symbolic capital; and second, that ‘habitus’ needs – or invents – an *other* in order to function as a theory ‘to explain everything’. The latter factor speaks to the nature of postcolonial studies. The thesis takes the position that the efficacy of postcolonial critique should account for the internal confidence of the British imperial project. The savvy entrepreneurship of the Dominion’s Anglican church-builders shows a parallel with colonial-cum-imperial policy and procedure. Comparative cases will show how dominated, and marginalized, religious groups made tactical responses to a dominant western culture, still complicit in constructing ‘otherness’. Consequently, the thesis then moves beyond Benjamin’s critical
reading of proto-mass reproduction by situating the synthesis of pattern book receptions alongside the case studies of Anglican church-building at the boundary between production and consumption.21

1.4 ‘A Few Words’ to the Readers of Church Pattern Books

The pattern books were produced, as noted, primarily in Britain and the U.S. Their importation to the Dominion acted as conduits of building ideas that transplanted taste – or architectural fashion – from a different social space. By influencing the construction, renovation, and re-building of churches in the Dominion the mechanisms of social formation can be read into and out of the visual and verbal imagery in pattern books.22 Of especial interest to the forming social order was the (re)organization and exploitation of growing markets, the opportunistic uses of iconography in the construction of built form, and the complex cultural dynamics of identity-making.23 Each of these factors was increasingly associated with the social impact of new commercial practices that affected post-1850s modern ‘lifestyle’. An important commodity related to class distinctions through economy was taste, which Anglican church-builders often claimed despite its closer associations with the transience of fashion.

The reasons that architects produced pattern books varied but generally reflected a desire to legitimate their practices, separate themselves from builders and contractors, illustrate their historical study abroad on the Continent, and demonstrate their superior draughtsmanship. As a group, these authors constituted a multifarious voice that spoke the grammar of medieval architectural authority only available in the pattern books to many church-builders in the Dominion of Canada. However, the pattern books also represented the circulation of visual imagery that democratized the architect’s, and even
history’s, ‘authority’. This democratization of visuality was exemplified by the variety in aesthetics and planning of the Dominion’s churches built between 1867 and 1914. As such, the endurance of architectural ‘authority’ increasingly became associated with the commercially driven transience of fashion. Thereby taste and architectural fashion was brought into a discourse around ‘popular’ imagery. The complexity of the situation was compounded particularly after the 1870s by British medievalism adopting a sequential series of new ‘authoritative’ images and rhetorics to satisfy the consumption practices of growing readerships. The result was the continuous insinuation of authority through the operation of diminishing rank. With a flair for business, each author recognised the new importance of providing customers with a variety of ‘correct’ antiquarian designs in ever-increasing high-quality reproductions.

Church pattern books formed part of the expansion of print publication and of the growth of professional architectural organization, which depended largely on illustrated newspapers, books, and magazines. In addition, illustrated encyclopaedic volumes of world architectural history promoted transoceanic imperial political and economic resources, which profited the British architectural profession. Promoting architectural professionalism in the Dominion involved reaching a broad cross-section of the English-speaking population. The effect of marketing the visual imagery of churches increased the variety of audience reception and interpretation. Though the church pattern books contained replicable plans and aesthetics of mainly gothic churches, audiences opportunistically selected from parts of the specimen designs that best suited them. Reading ecclesiastical pattern books was analogous to shopping by mail-order catalogue – a new commercial practice – for ‘ancient-inspired’ church designs. The loyalist village
of Maugerville, New Brunswick built an Anglican church, possibly designed by architect and pattern book author Frank Wills,\textsuperscript{25} which exhibits a Neo-Gothic aesthetic paralleling churches in England’s more prosperous communities. The broach spire on the church in Maugerville is modelled on English examples such as Shiere Church, Surrey, an illustration of which was published in Raphael and J. Arthur Brandon’s pattern book, \textit{Parish Churches} (1849).\textsuperscript{26}

The circulation of print media gave taste-cum-fashion a complex spatial dimension. The spatial property of a ‘commerce of taste’ was a major component channelling two-dimensional visual imagery into the built form. Transposing designs on paper into the built form was the privileged domain of the architect and builder. The architects (many of whom were also pattern book authors) extended similar privileges to their readers. However, readers’ receptions of pattern books challenged the author’s privileged position because interpretations varied. The profound effect of pattern books’ reception was in the way that mechanical reproduction proliferated cultural images and signs, disrupting the mystical aura around the medieval buildings the books were meant to promote.\textsuperscript{27}

The growing impact of print media was exemplified by the emergence of public opinion. An increase in the availability of illustrated newspapers, magazines, and books attests to the social significance of print media’s spread of ideas. The diverse nature of public opinion meant that readers opportunistically consumed the parts of Gothic Revival imagery that backed their socio-economic and cultural claims. The dissemination of pattern books involved the (re)organization and exploitation of markets that developed from settlement expansion. Marketing visual and verbal imagery through taste’s
distinctions associated the rise of a new middle-class consumer society with religious institution, in a close and conflictual relationship. Visual imagery spread to, and circulated within, British North America because readerships had been readied for the purchase of imported pattern books. Canadian publications, such as, the Canadian Illustrated News (1869-1883) and the Canadian Architect and Builder (1888-1908) followed, more or less, the antiquarian practices promoted by similar British publications, like the Illustrated London News (1842 - 1898) and The Builder (1843-1966). The railway enabled the extensive distribution of such journals across the Dominion.

Architects practicing in the Dominion - mostly British-trained - appropriated antique or medieval planning and aesthetics to legitimize the modern cultural claims of their clientele. The deployment of British and European medieval-revival motifs lent churches built in the Dominion an appearance of permanence. The medieval aesthetic adopted by colonial church-builders legitimated the claims to superior taste.

As part of the emergent ‘popular’ literature, akin to journal and magazine consumption, illustrated church pattern books marketed social mores to professional and general audiences. As well, the books carried aesthetic ideas about the way churches should look. The church pattern books demonstrated how religious architecture was imaged alongside local, and Confederated, identity and culture in the expanding Dominion. The books also pointed to changes in architectural fashion, though the actual transience of fashion was marketed in the books as the permanence of taste.

Church pattern books illustrated an affinity with British social organization that paralleled social formation in the Dominion. The distribution of the pattern books forecast other infrastructures engaged in nation-building such as the railway that carried
imperial authority into the Dominion’s expanding settlements. Since the Dominion’s expansion was associated with the nineteenth century’s attraction to movement and mobility, the pattern books can be understood as having moved architectural fashion across vast distances.

1.5 Prior Analyses of Pattern Book Consumption

Pattern books have received little attention from scholars excepting some research predominantly into U.S. production. This has meant that almost no attention has been paid to pattern books in terms of issues of knowledge brokering. Neither have pattern books been discussed as a way of measuring dynamic social situations. The notable exceptions are James O’Gorman’s volume, *American Architects and their Books to 1848*, which shows how books were watersheds for the shift from colonial building practices to architectural professionalism. Similarly, Dell Upton’s article entitled, ‘Pattern Books and Professionalism: Aspects of the Transformation of Domestic Architecture in America, 1800-1860’ addresses the interface of architects’ professional claims and pattern books of domestic architecture, with respect to the emergence of popular and national building styles. Linda Smiens’ book, *Building an American Identity: Pattern Book Homes and Communities 1870-1900* deals with the notion that an American national identity was constructed through a relationship between house architecture and domestic taste. A recent article by Pierre du Prey entitled “John Soane, John Plaw, and Prince Edward Island” demonstrated how pattern books were at the centre of the transatlantic transmission of architectural knowledge between England and PEI, which crossed cultural and economic, and therefore, social boundaries. Without exception scholars in the U.S. examine U.S. pattern books leaving a void in the scholarship around
the impact of British and U.S. books on the Dominion of Canada. More work needs to be done on the interface of visual imagery with social formation, the connection between spreading print media and collective identity, as well as, the relationship between political economy and religious institution.

An altogether different, but no less significant source of data, has been Henry Russell Hitchcock’s *American Architectural Books: A List of Books, Portfolios, and Pamphlets on Architecture and Related Subjects Published in America Before 1895* (1946, re-printed 1976 on microfiche), which lists the known American and re-printed British pattern books of domestic, civic, and religious architecture. Another major source that contextualizes book production and reading audiences in the Dominion has been *History of the Book in Canada, volume two: 1840-1918* (2005) eds. Lamonde, Fleming, and Black.

1.6 The Organization of the Thesis

In order to unravel some of the issues accompanying the spread of church-building and its intersection with print-based visual imagery (the pattern books) and to allow broad questions about the social life of church designs, this thesis will focus on particular local points of tension. To this end, Chapter Two probes the brokering of knowledge, religion, and group identity through the pattern books with respect to a new ‘commerce of taste’. Chapter Three investigates how print-based visual imagery coming out of Britain and America legitimized Anglican social and economic privilege in the Dominion’s economy. Chapter Four is arranged to draw attention to the social life of pattern books and book economy, including the politics of book ownership, social
classification, and selling aesthetics. Chapter Five is organized around the movement of books, people, and the economy as a metaphor for the spread of visuality and identity.

My second chapter is a deliberately concise analysis of early nineteenth-century church building. The chapter will contextualize the constitution of consumer culture and analyse the appropriation of visual imagery in the process of social classification. Chapter Two investigates how knowledge was marketed to the Dominion alongside socio-economic and professional privilege. A transatlantic reading of a ‘commerce of taste’ will use Charles Eastlake’s discourse in *Hints on Household Taste in Furniture, Upholstery, and other Details* (1878) and *A History of the Gothic Revival* (1872) in conjunction with local journalistic references from the *Canadian Architect and Builder*. Case studies include the Anglican cathedral (1853) and St. Anne’s Chapel (1846) in Fredericton, New Brunswick, Christ Church in Montreal (1857), Quebec, and the Anglican cathedral (1850) in St. John’s, Newfoundland. Newfoundland is included in the thesis though it remained a separate colony until 1949 because it was also part of the picture of the Dominion in terms of trade, commerce, and religious interchange. Comparative cases include, the Roman Catholic church of St. Simon and St. Jude (1860) in Tignish, PEI, and St. Mary’s Roman Catholic Church (1900), Indian River, PEI. Colonial self-governance and economic growth were steadily becoming autonomous, a little scorched by the demise of the British mercantile system, and then boosted by new Reciprocity Treaty with the seaboard States of America to the stage that businessmen spread positive sentiment toward a union of federated provinces. The colonial government responded to new feelings of autonomy by raising tariffs as a mildly protective device, which increased the ire of some manufactures in England and created some transatlantic tensions.\(^{34}\)
Meanwhile, Maritimers debated the value of political union and some, like Samuel Tilley’s government in New Brunswick, initially openly opposed the union of Maritime provinces. Visual images associated with church-building generated the anticipation of growth, irrespective of strained imperial-colonial, and even inter-colonial relations. Churches – particularly those of Anglican denomination – appeared as necessary to social and cultural growth as did the anticipated railway that was seen to benefit the St. Lawrence region’s overburdened canal system.

My third chapter will examine the workings of the Dominion’s economy and political system with special reference to the connection between religious institution and land. Land and related economy were significant factors in the enormous amount of cajolery and deal-making that pulled the union together. Social privilege and property were closely related during the period when the Dominion was in the early stages of defining itself. In addition, questions of the importance of religion and ritual underpinned contemporary debates about the ‘correct’ mode of modern lifestyle. The case studies include St. James’ Cathedral (1853), St. James the Less (1861) and the Necropolis Chapel (1872) in Toronto, Ontario and Holy Trinity Church (1883) in Winnipeg, Manitoba. Comparative cases include, Metropolitan Methodist Church (1870-73), Toronto and the Roman Catholic Church of Our Lady (begun, 1876 with towers completed in 1888) in Guelph, Ontario.

My fourth chapter will analyze the commercial structure centred around the importation and distribution of pattern books. The books became elements of entrepreneurial pragmatics and social cohesion in the context of imperial-cum-colonial power relations. In post-Confederated society, the ‘threat’ of U.S. annexation became a
cultural as well as a geographic issue, leading to new political and financial concerns about railway construction guarantees. Pattern book readerships varied from builders needing technical assistance, to church-building committees wanting design advice, to architects’ apprentices needing teaching tools, and finally, to architecture enthusiasts collecting high-quality visual representations of architectural achievements. The chapter will further examine the relation between book imports, new commercial practices, and the building trades in the Dominion from the perspective of a non-professional reader. The readerships were tapping into a matrix of increased commercial consumption, ‘arm-chair’ tourism, and possession as a sign of social status. Case studies include Holy Trinity at Stanley Mission (1854) and St. James at Star City (c.1909), Saskatchewan as well as St. George’s-in-the-Pines (1889-97), Banff, Alberta. Comparative cases include, Rosh Pina Synagogue (1892), Winnipeg, St. Antoine de Padoue (1883), Batoche, Saskatchewan, and the Roman Catholic Church of Our Lady (c. 1907), Fort Providence, N.W.T.

My fifth chapter examines the circulation of books, people, and commercial practice alongside the apparent completion of the Confederation project. Churches continued to be built even after the completion of the railway, facilitated by increasing settlement moving westward and expanding personal wealth. The pattern books became magazines, demonstrating the resonance between reproduction and fashion. The appeal of Neo-Gothic to First Nations church-builders and the expectations that they should build churches in that style of architecture were experienced alongside problems of their possession and cultural erasure. Case studies include St. John the Divine (1912) in Victoria and Christ Church (now cathedral) (1895) in Vancouver, British Columbia, as
well as, St. Saviour’s (1869), Barkerville, British Columbia and the First Nations church of St. Paul’s (1874) at Metlakatla in British Columbia. Comparative cases include, Metropolitan Methodist Church (1890), St. Andrew’s Presbyterian (1890), the Reformed Episcopal Church of Our Lord (1874) and St. Andrew’s Roman Catholic (1892), Victoria, as well as, Holy Cross (1905) built by the InShuch First Nation at the Skookumchuck Reserve.

The variety of church designs employed in the Dominion was associated with the debates about church aesthetics derived in no small measure from the pattern books. Though rooted in tradition, church-building exemplified that new form of commerce that applied religion, taste, and knowledge to matters of politics and social formation. The modern expression of these factors utilized new forms of mechanical reproduction, which contributed to the complex formulations of public taste. The pattern books claimed authority of design, religion, art practices, and medieval history even though the books were also associated with new forms of commerce.
II. Church-Building and Pattern Books in the Dominion, 1840s and 1850s

“…the social world is present in its entirety in every ‘economic’ action.”

Pierre Bourdieu

In the 1840s and 50s, the processes of building churches in the Maritimes and Lower Canada were paralleled in the pattern books’ constitution of economy and politics no less than religion. The formation of political, religious, and economic structures in these eastern regions sustained a profound cultural affinity with Britain. For that reason, the production of a species of Neo-Gothic in New Brunswick, Newfoundland, and Quebec was comparable to that of the Neo-Gothic churches then being constructed in Britain. There were, of course, differences in the Canadas expressed in terms of taste due to the differences in site conditions, building materials, skilled labour, and available financing, but the variety of church designs was related to the importation of the pattern books.

This chapter probes the cultural politics of religion by examining the visual and verbal guidance that church pattern books provided to church-builders. This was not simply a matter of transmitting new kinds of data from one place to another, but rather a complex set of social patterns combined with historical references to constitute the processes apparent in church-building. To these ends, history was brought into the service of contemporary architecture. This chapter will analyze the marketing of Neo-Gothic architecture to church-builders in the Maritimes and Lower Canada by looking into the discourse around early ‘Ecclesiology’, a particular manifestation of the Gothic Revival. Ecclesiology referred placidly to the study of medieval church architecture, but its most potent characteristic was its moral biases and aesthetic judgements. The promoters of
Ecclesiology wanted their species of the Gothic Revival to appear permanent and therefore deserving of wide emulation. These ideas were summed up in the pattern book by British architect George Truefitt (1825-1902), *Designs for Country Churches* (1850), which ostensibly provided a “calculated” influence over “public taste”, derived from the commercial demand for “illustrated information”.\(^4^0\) Truefitt asserted that he had correctly estimated the Gothic “spirit” (the preface is quoted in full in Appendix A). He deftly disassociated himself from “heathenism” and “copyism” by adopting empirical and archaeological methods.\(^4^1\)

This chapter deliberately focuses on the constitution of society in the Dominion in the decades preceding 1867 in order to establish, for the subsequent chapters, the position and strategies of church-builders active in post-1867 Confederated society. In the Maritimes and Lower Canada, collective identities were forming as a result of group and individual socio-economic and cultural interactions. Colonial officials trying to increase the amount of foreign investment in the Canadas were obliged to veil the cultural and economic tensions between Upper and Lower Canada. A façade of stability was projected internationally even though the limits of group cohesion were being tested in Canada. However, the deal-making process behind Confederation, intensified exponentially during the decades leading up to 1867, was a macrocosm of these geo-political, religious, and economic factors.

For the sake of clarity, this thesis will consider ‘source books’ and ‘pattern books’ without conceding to literary categorizations, except to note the important social distinctions related to the places of publication. Thus, the thesis will adopt the term ‘pattern book’ as a general concept for books involved in the appropriation of a medieval
aesthetic for nineteenth-century church-builders. I will not judge their actual success in changing the world of building, rather my project is about the way the pattern book authors activated fashion in the endeavour to bridge gaps in knowledge. I do not lose sight of the close association between the way knowledge and fashion was constituted, especially taking twenty-first century perspectives into account.

The case studies in this chapter are comprised of churches built in the concentrated settlements in Fredericton, New Brunswick; St. John’s, Newfoundland; and, Montreal, Quebec. Case selections were based on the high degree in which religion and commerce acted as determinants of social convention in the test communities. Though Newfoundland was a separate colony in the 1840s and 50s it is included in the data because it was part of the forming Dominion’s architectural, social, economic, and colonial terrain. Comparative case studies of the construction of Prince Edward Island’s Roman Catholic churches of St. Simon and St. Jude’s, Tignish and St. Mary’s, Indian River are offset against a case study of the construction of the Anglican cathedral in Montreal in order to illustrate the diversity, yet shared situation, among settler identities.

Setting up the context of church-building and pattern book consumption requires a brief historical sketch of the Ecclesiological movement in the 1840s and 50s. Then follows an examination of the pattern book formats will be used to contextualize the subsequent analyses of their distribution and consumption. This sketch shows the relation between the print-based church pattern books and the dispositions of church builders in the Maritimes. An examination of the interface between economy and religion then follows. Consequently, this chapter looks at the way that pattern books appeared to offer valuable architectural knowledge when, in reality, the books used taste to legitimize and
reify Ecclesiological judgements. When reading through a clutch of church pattern books, the marketing of Ecclesiology is apparent. In this sense I approach Ecclesiology as a commodity and political instrument of taste; thus, the term ‘spectacle’ applies to Ecclesiology, and to the pattern books themselves, as “capital accumulated until it becomes an image”. 42

2.1 The Influence of Ecclesiology and Pattern Books on Maritime Churches

During the mid-nineteenth century, Ecclesiological rhetoric intensified. As I will show, liturgy, knowledge, science, taste, and fashion came to the fore in debates in Britain and the Canadas. Yet, Ecclesiology was more ephemeral than its advocates cared to admit, leading a core clutch of supporters to create a continuous stream of claims about its ‘superiority’. The archaeological precedent that underlay Ecclesiology controlled the way the empirical data was used in Gothic Revival churches. A.W.N. Pugin created a series of architectural principles around the idea of emulating the truthfulness of medieval construction. 43 Churches built in the nineteenth century were deemed Ecclesiologically ‘correct’ if they obeyed a certain architectural grammar, which included asymmetrically planned and separately articulated building components, low exterior walls, steep roofs, towers with spires, pointed windows, materials used truthfully, and ornament that served a structural purpose. 44 This grammar was learned through the empirical study of medieval churches that A.W. N. Pugin had gleaned by assisting his father, Augustus Charles Pugin, in the completion of pattern books including Pugin’s Gothic Ornaments, Selected from Various Buildings in England and France (1831). The pattern book authors that followed A.W.N. Pugin tended to reduce his architectural principles to a simplified equation of taste.
Pursuant to the architectural principles advocated by A.W.N. Pugin, the designers of Anglican churches wrote books that promoted the longitudinal axis, thus advocating rectangular buildings with aisled naves. Ritual forms of Christian worship were enforced through this type of church design. A series of pattern books including Raphael and J. Arthur Brandon’s *Parish Churches* (1849), Edmund Sharpe’s *Architectural Parallels* (1848), Frederick Withers’ *Church Architecture* (1873), and George Woodward’s *Rural Church Architecture* (1868) described how the Anglican Communion preferred this type of church design (fig. 2.1). By contrast, other pattern books written for the consumption of non-conformist congregations, including Methodist, Baptist, and even Presbyterian groups resisted the rectangular plan that facilitated ritual worship. These books illustrated interior spaces organized to create unobstructed sightlines to the pulpit, widened naves, and amphi-theatrical seating plans. The British architect George Bidlake who wrote *Sketches of Churches: Designed for the Use of Nonconformists* (1865) and Joseph Crouch and Edmund Butler who wrote *Churches, Mission Halls, and Schools for Nonconformists* (1901) advertised amphi-theatrical and centrally planned churches in order to develop effective designs for ‘experiential’ worship and to position Anglicans as conventional, unexciting, and anti-modern (fig. 2.2).

The Ecclesiological principles of architecture preferred by Anglicans were transmitted to the Canadas via the immigration of British-trained architects, clergymen, and the importation of Neo-Gothic church pattern books, which carried associated rhetorics and imagery. In the pattern books, journals, magazines, and historical texts, Neo-Gothic was marketed as ‘Pointed’ or ‘Christian’ architecture in reference to its association with a worshipful approach to antiquarian practice.
Ecclesiology resonated particularly strongly in the Maritimes among a clutch of bishops newly installed from Britain during the mid-nineteenth century, Bishop John Medley of New Brunswick (1845-1892), Bishop Edward Feild of Newfoundland (1846-76), and Bishop Francis Fulford of Montreal (1850-1868). However, the production of Ecclesiologically ‘correct’ or ‘tasteful’ churches was expensive. For instance, the open timber roofs and complex truss systems called for in the pattern books were more costly and complex than Maritime builders were accustomed to. Carpenters were loyal to methods they knew to be ‘tried and true’, such as the use of triangular roof trusses that produced flat ceilings in homes. For this reason, many of the early Maritime churches retained the aesthetic of Methodist single-room meeting houses. Christian overtones were used to market the open-timber roofs of Ecclesiologically ‘correct’ churches to builders and the pattern book readers. Bishops marketed Ecclesiological principles as the only reasonable and tasteful solution for building churches. Advocates of Ecclesiology even appealed, in the Dominion, to people’s practical logic by arguing that the steeply pointed roofs produced by open-timber systems countered the effects of heavy snowfalls. These roofing systems which often used scissor-trusses were described in Raphael and J. Arthur Brandon’s *Open Timber Roofs* (1849) and later on in Frank E. Kidder’s *Building Construction and Superintendence: Part III. Trussed Roofs and Roof Trusses* (1895) (fig. 2.3). These roofing systems eventually became tradition in the Maritimes, which was known for its high-grade supply of timber. The lumber and shipbuilding industries in New Brunswick and Newfoundland actually primed the use of open timber roofs in churches.
Finding the money to build Ecclesiologically ‘correct’ churches in the Maritimes was a challenge for bishops Feild and Medley. The uneven commercial development meant that individual and corporate wealth was spread thinly across the Maritimes. A few concentrated pools of owners of lumber, shipbuilding, and shipping interests became more diversified when merchants ceased to operate as ship-owners, but the spread of this wealth took several generations to develop.\textsuperscript{49} The risk-reward markets in the Maritimes translated into fewer but sometimes larger donations to church-building. The difficult economies inflamed the tensions between Feild, who was a ‘High-churchman’ that respected ritual liturgical practices, and his ‘Low Church’ congregation. Frustrated by the lack of local cooperation from his Anglican congregation, Feild privately referred to them as ignorant “fishmongers”.\textsuperscript{50}

Maritime bishops compensated for the uncertain sources of local funding by travelling back to England in search of a variety of funding opportunities. Bishop Feild relied upon several forms of funding from Britain that included a Royal letter of credit and monies donated from the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel in Foreign Parts. Architectural associations and individual Anglican congregations in Britain also donated monies.\textsuperscript{51} The Maritime business interests became disadvantaged by the wealth accruing in nearby regions. As a result, donations to church-building enterprises in Montreal were more frequent after that city assumed the benefits of fishing, farming, and sometimes logging and shipbuilding once enjoyed by the Maritimes. Consequently, Bishop Fulford in Montreal did not have to resort to the drastic measures that Bishop Feild in St. John’s had had to adopt to complete his cathedral.
Money was an important factor in building churches but the advocates of Ecclesiology publicly expressed its architectural principles in doctrinal terms. They saw Ecclesiology as an architectural science with religious overtones. This perspective on Ecclesiology mirrored a description of an imagined confederated Canada in a remark made, in 1866, by the New Brunswick politician Francis Hibbard. He noted that as a unified whole Canada:

would advance more rapidly in science, and literature, in railroads and telegraphs, in civilization and religion, than we do at present.”

As instruments of knowledge, taste, architectural principles, and communal enterprise church pattern books were significant markers of the intersection of science, governance, efficiency, and technique. The combination of these factors was involved in the process of identity-making and even in the act of Confederation. In the Dominion, as in Britain, the Ecclesiological movement became an instrument of religious and social politics such that taste and archaeological ‘correctness’ became synonymous with liturgy and worship. The term ‘correct’ legitimated class division and conservative politics.

2.1.1 Variations in Church Pattern Book Formats

The business of marketing Ecclesiology in church-building demonstrated that economy was a matrix around which all other social structures were organized. The pattern books used visual and verbal modes combined with new commercial practices and conventional religious institution to market Ecclesiology. Their production can be divided into two fundamental formats: source books and pattern books. Source books contained elevations, sections, perspective views, plans, and the architectural details of ‘genuine’ medieval buildings, which authors recorded directly from their travels, such as, British architect William Eden Nesfield’s book Specimens of Medieval Architecture
Nesfield’s book illustrated towers, interiors, doorways, and foliage, as well as, sweeping picturesque exteriors (fig. 2.4). Nesfield produced Specimens of Medieval Architecture in order to distinguish his draughtsmanship skills above those of his direct competitors in Britain, especially other architects that wrote pattern books. Customarily, Nesfield used the pattern book’s introductory section to legitimize his understanding of history, architecture, and the Neo-Gothic, all of which were constituted as co-dependent by the pundits of the Medieval Revival. Nesfield used Continental architecture strategically to cut against the prevailing belief among British architects that English medieval building, and by association Neo-Gothic, was superior to that of other European countries.55

Pattern books, by contrast, contained perspective views and plans sometimes accompanied by elevations and details about construction of the ‘latest’ nineteenth-century churches. These books sometimes included schematics as though the author was showing the reader (amateur builders in most cases) how to re-construct the illustrated design. This particular format was popularized in the U.S. by authors who promoted their own designs. A prime example was U.S. architect Frederick Withers’s book Church Architecture: Plans, Elevations, and Views of Twenty-One Churches and Two School Houses (1873) (fig.2.5).

Since I reject the arbitrariness of precise literary categories, it appears as though the typography of visual material in pattern books had a broad range.56 It is nevertheless important to provide a brief description of the books and to illustrate a few things about their production. Firstly, there were books depicting a full suite of views, elevations, and plans of a single church building (Edmund Sharpe, Illustrations of the Conventual Church

Chiefsely Selected from Examples of the 12th and 13th Centuries in France and Italy (1862).
of the Benedictine Abbey of St. Germaine at Selby, 1870) (fig. 2.6). Secondly, there were books depicting a series of medieval cathedrals and churches, some categorized by country (Raphael and J. Arthur Brandon, Parish Churches; Being Perspective Views of English Ecclesiastical Structures Accompanied by Plans Drawn to a Uniform Scale, 1849) (fig. 2.7). Thirdly, there were books comprised of a haphazard collection of renderings by well-known architects (contributors to Examples of Modern Architecture, Ecclesiastical and Domestic, 1873: Sir George Gilbert Scott, George Edmund Street, and J.P. Seddon). 57

U.S. pattern books tended to blur the distinction between medieval and medieval revival architecture by including both types of design (eg. Frank Wills’s Ancient Ecclesiastical Architecture, 1850) (fig. 2.8). Wills remarked that his friends had encouraged the architect to include some of his own modest designs among the depictions of medieval originals. Wills may have been exhibiting false humility and feigning disinterestedness in making money from using history to market his architectural practice. By the 1870s, U.S. architects including Frederick Withers and Henry Hudson Holly advertised their own designs in their pattern books that coincidently included smaller historical introductory sections. As the U.S. pattern books gained popularity in North America the legitimacy of history was superseded by architectural fashion.

Taken together, the British and U.S. pattern book production exemplified patterns of public taste through paraphrasing European history. Although Canada was not a major market for British and U.S. pattern books their impact on building in the Dominion was profound. Architects in Canada believed what British and U.S. architects/pattern book authors wrote: that European architectural history – especially in its printed format –
could be propelled into the service of modern architectural fashion. When the serial production and consumption of U.S. pattern books shifted the centre of the Gothic Revival from Europe to New York, architectural fashion in Canada followed suit. From Fredericton, New Brunswick, the British-trained architect Frank Wills moved in 1848 to New York and inaugurated the New York Ecclesiological Society modelled on its namesakes in Britain. Wills founded, in 1848, a quarterly journal called The New York Ecclesiologist that echoed the format of Britain’s Ecclesiologist (1841-68), a publication discussed in detail later in this chapter.

Examining the content of the various pattern books is another way of visualizing their consumption. Consequently, it appears that two varieties of literature converged to produce church architecture pattern books: encyclopaedic volumes of architecture that used small-format diagrammatic pictures, and books referencing taste that contained large-format illustrations. I address these encyclopaedic volumes of the history of the world’s architecture at this early point in the thesis because their presentation of knowledge, or ‘science’, was used to legitimate taste presented in the books containing large-format Picturesque illustrations.

Encyclopaedic books of architecture produced by Joseph Gwilt, John Henry Parker, Rev. George Wolfe Shinn, and James Fergusson exemplify how print-based illustrations were used in imperial appropriations of ancient architecture, updated to contemporary construction methods. Like these books of general architectural knowledge, the pattern books marketed knowledge that was associated with a ‘self-improvement’ movement active in the period. Demonstrating the interconnection between religion and political economy, pattern books amplified the oft-repeated maxim
from self-improvement manuals that “heaven helps those who help themselves”.\(^{58}\) Joseph Gwilt’s *Encyclopaedia of Architecture Historical, Theoretical, and Practical* (1842, several re-prints) used roughly 1700 thumbnail-sized wood-cut illustrations, inset within the text pages, to demonstrate a variety of constructions from past civilizations. Gwilt depicted Babylonian, Persian, Egyptian, Grecian, and Chinese cultures, though not without exoticizing them for a western audience. The book’s temporal and geographic sections, which also included a section on ‘Pointed’, or Gothic architecture, corresponded to the book’s later sectional divisions that taught the practical methods of construction using geometry and proportion. John Henry Parker’s *Introduction to the Study of Gothic Architecture* (1849, re-printed 1861, 1873, 1877, 1909) also used small-sized, wood-cut engravings, inset in the text, to trace the trajectory of the Gothic Revival from its roots in England’s Saxon heritage to its spread onto the Continent.\(^{59}\) Reference books such as Parker’s *A Glossary of Terms Used in Grecian, Roman, Italian, and Gothic* (1846, several re-prints) as well as Thomas Rickman’s *An Attempt to Discriminate the Styles of English Architecture, from the Conquest to the Reformation* (1817, several re-prints) wrote the history of gothic architecture in Britain’s favour. In America, Rev. George Wolfe Shinn’s *King’s Handbook of Notable Episcopal Churches in the United States* (1889, re-printed 1893) experimented in a few of its one-hundred images with photogravure, demonstrating technique over substance. Chiefly, however, engraving was the pattern book’s staple means of conveying images of Neo-Gothic churches built across America because the books always tried to appear like the bound volumes of expensive etchings.
James Fergusson’s illustrations in *History of the Modern Styles of Architecture* (1862, re-printed 1873, 1891) progressed from wood-cut engravings, to steel-plate engravings, to photo-lithographic techniques as the book’s sections proceeded, thereby exemplifying an even closer relationship with new commercial practices. One can see the progression in print technologies, brought to market by new economies, of which the ‘commerces of taste’ was an important feature. Technical and economic progress appeared metaphorical of the architectural improvements discussed in Fergusson’s volume of books.

Ironically, Fergusson was critical of progress, as exemplified by the way he constructed the purity and simplicity of religion against the complicated socio-economic and technical aspects of modern engineering. Indeed, Fergusson’s introductory section began by stating that the Gothic Revival was “mainly an ecclesiastical movement…the real hold it has upon the people arises from their religious… feelings.” His volume proceeded through architectural styles used in England, Europe, and America, concluding with a section on civil and military engineering in which he suggested the enforced separation of engineering from architecture. For Fergusson, architecture was grounded in nostalgia for the noble edifices of the past while engineering was concerned chiefly with the management of the future. For example, Fergusson lamented, rather than extolled, the trail blazed by architectural improvements:

…the history of Architecture during the three or four centuries to which the contents of this treatise extend… is sufficiently melancholy and discouraging. For the first time in history the most civilized nations of the world have agreed to forsake the only path that could lead to progress or perfection in the “Master Art”, and have been wandering after shadows that constantly elude their grasp. When we consider the extent to which building operations have been carried during that period, the amount of wealth lavished on architectural decoration, and the amount of skill and knowledge available for its direction, it is very sad to think that all should have been comparatively wasted…
His sadness was moderated by a positive belief that numerous, well-instructed architects ready in the earnest exercise of their vocations were prepared to raise architectural practice toward ‘perfection’. Linking commerce, knowledge, and taste, Fergusson wrote:

We have more wealth, more mechanical skill, more refinement than any nation, except perhaps the Greeks, and taste (even if not innate) may result from the immense extent of our knowledge.

These illustrated encyclopaedic books of architecture contributed to the increased demand for architectural knowledge. Akin to the ‘do-it-yourself’ manual, church pattern books presented themselves as though giving needed advice for the builder or church building committee. Indeed, pattern book rhetorics went so far as to construct within society the ‘need’ for building advice, thereby assuring continued readerships. In other words, a client’s ‘need’ for pattern books was reinforced by discourses around building standards and taste-cum-fashion located within the pattern books themselves. As well, the authors of church pattern books tended to withhold just enough information in the illustrations in order to remain indispensable to future clients. Because experienced builders were able to copy pattern book designs, architects were quick to mention that builders did not possess the social access to taste inherent in the architectural profession.

Thus, church pattern books fed into the commerce of knowledge and taste that both attempted to alleviate and yet often reinforced social disadvantage.

The encyclopaedic volumes were used in state-sanctioned architectural education. Architects recognised the need for professionalization and the necessity of education in that regard, and a national school of architecture was mandated. In 1891, the Ontario Architectural Association considered building a curriculum that involved a series of well-
respected British architectural books including John Henry Parker’s *Introduction of Gothic Architecture*, Matthew Bloxam’s *Gothic Architecture*, Thomas Rickman’s *Gothic Architecture*, and James Fergusson’s *History of Architecture*. The same magazine article listed books recommended by the Quebec Architectural Association that included Gwilt’s *Encyclopaedia of Architecture* (1888 ed.), Fergusson’s *History of Architecture* and *Handbook of Architecture*, and Raphael Brandon’s *Analysis of Gothic Architecture*. In argument for professionalized training of new architects in Ontario and Quebec, the article noted:

> if the public insist on employing men calling themselves architects, but who put up buildings bad in plan, construction, and appearance, then the trained architects, as citizens, should insist upon it that such work is detrimental to the public taste...[italics mine].

Missing from the ranks of the selected volumes were the large-format illustrated books, omitted on account of their marketing of visual imagery. Nevertheless, these books had broader appeal and influenced church design more deeply as a result.

An article dated 1889 in the *Canadian Architect and Builder* entitled “The Influence of the Modern Christian Church Upon the Ecclesiastical Architecture of the Dominion” by Robert M. Fripp noted the dangerous connection between taste and church architecture in relation to the instrumentality of knowledge. To that end, the article included the following caution:

> …all denominations in the Dominion share guilt in making poor church architecture which is ‘history in stone of a nation’… Perishable as most of our modern buildings are, they will endure long enough to exercise a baneful influence on the habits of taste that do duty with most people for education or cultivated taste. Future students of architecture in Canada will be influenced by the junk we build today[italics mine].

Contemporaries recognised the relationship between knowledge, production, fashion, and commerce. Books that marketed taste held a common trait in that their authors tried to
diminish stylistic differences by implementing a uniform way of building Neo-Gothic churches. At the same time they attempted to discredit the mobility of builders and contractors. They included brief historical narratives in the opening section of the pattern books to discredit builders, to suppress clients’ wishes to the taste of the architect, and to appear to offer the knowledge presented in the encyclopaedic books. Proof that the pattern books actually fuelled the public’s sense of legitimate architectural taste was the increase in adjudicating commissions populated by businessmen instead of architects. Businessmen sitting on church-building committees likely did not understand the architectural merits of a particular design and they could be swayed by the Picturesque presentation drawings that resembled the pages familiar in pattern books.

The attractiveness of the illustrations in the pattern books had a great impact on both professional and non-professional readers. So long as the images were well illustrated, readerships did not seem to mind that lithography had replaced original drawings. Thus, a growing segment of the Anglican Communion was persuaded to support the construction of more complex and expensive churches based on the attractiveness of pattern book illustrations. The structural and architectural analyses in the pattern books eventually diminished. An interesting comparative appears between the plain economic drawing style in Charles Dwyer’s *The Economy of Church, Parsonage, and School Architecture* (1856) and Henry Hudson Holly’s picturesque drawings in *Church Architecture* (1871) noting the structural similarities in the tower designs (figs. 2.9, 2.10, 2.11). Dwyer’s simplified line drawings that represented two-dimensional elevations of churches did not seem to confirm the reality experienced in the depth of space illustrated in Truefitt’s or Holly’s perspective renderings. Where Dwyer’s drawings
appear insipidly instructional, Truefitt’s and Holly’s appear experiential. Nevertheless, neither book dealt in any meaningful way with architecture’s influence on social patterns, even though the public’s interest in social evolution was well underway in 1859 with Charles Darwin’s publication of *Origin of the Species* (priced at 15 shillings).

Church pattern books produced after the 1840s were not expensive, bound editions of etchings. Consumers did not confuse pattern books with ‘fine art’. The production of pattern books after the 1840s became dominated by cheaper lithographed books that only appeared to contain hand-pulled etchings (sometimes blatantly advertised as such). Most of the pattern books used the nostalgia for etched prints as a means for marketing the latest architectural fashions. The production process of the pattern books, which relied upon greater print-runs to be economical, verified Walter Benjamin’s perception that exhibition value of reproductions replaced the mystifying experience of an original work of art. The danger to society according to Benjamin in the 1930s – and the pattern books were one example – was that the image’s ability to communicate social truths was encumbered by economy. As such, the visual imagery in the pattern books tended to market architectural fashion and counter-balance the verbal imagery in the books that predicted and promoted the longevity of the Gothic Revival. For this reason, George Truefitt’s book *Sketches on the Continent* (1847) advertised its lithographed pages as etched illustrations, going so far as to imprint a bevelled edge upon individual pages in order to create the appearance of copper plate etching. Consumers of Truefitt’s book were not misled into believing they owned a symbol of conspicuous consumption because the book was priced at £3. By contrast, Frederick Withers’ book *Church Architecture* (1873), which sold for a $12 US dollars new and $1 used. Withers’ book
used photo-lithography to keep the book relatively inexpensive and to associate himself with ‘improved’ technologies of production.\textsuperscript{70} Photo-lithographs drew attention to the books’ scientific character but also staged the books’ dependency on the transience of fashion. Though cheaply produced, the pattern books rarely appeared to offer poor quality designs, and readers tended to believe they were buying valuable knowledge.

Printing from steel plates became a cheaper and more rapid form of production than copper plates, which wore out after three-hundred copies. Subsequently, the advancements in lithography technique retained the appearance of the artist’s hand, making the images appear as authentic as though they were produced from a copper plate.\textsuperscript{71} Despite the pattern books’ general entry into a new and growing consumer culture, the readers fell into categories that corresponded to the books’ productions. Architects kept pattern books in their libraries as reference material and used the books to train apprentices. Builders read pattern books when they were commissioned to build churches, particularly in rural places where the services of an architect were unavailable. Clergymen read pattern books to stay informed about developments in church architecture, especially when they were considering building or renovating a church. Architecture enthusiasts and other members of the general public read pattern books to gain knowledge of architectural styles, architectural history, and to own images of British and European buildings in lieu of, or in anticipation of, Occidental travel.

Although the pattern books were consumed at a level that matched their production, and the construction of new churches, readers in the Dominion did not demand domestically produced pattern books. Even when the first pattern book was produced in Canada, no one appeared to notice its poor aesthetic quality. This book,
actually a pamphlet, entitled *Designs for Village, Town and City Churches* (1893), was produced by the General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church in Canada. It is a useful diagnostic device measuring the British cultural values and the effects of the U.S. hegemony on the Canadian situation (discussed in detail in Chapter 3).

2.2 **Economy and Religion in Church-Building in the Maritimes and Lower Canada Before 1867**

The close relation between religion, new commercial practices, and politics was articulated by the politician, newspaper editor, and advocate of Methodism George Brown when he proclaimed a:

```
scheme to establish a government that will seek to turn the tide of European emigration into this northern half of the American continent – that will strive to develop its great natural resources – and that will endeavour to maintain liberty, and justice, and Christianity throughout the land.72
```

As Brown remarked, church-building was envisioned as an important part of the forming society on par with economy, freedom, and progress. Church pattern books drew these factors together in the constitution of modern lifestyle and collective identity because the books marketed church-building, and particularly the Gothic Revival, as a legitimate and viable solution to social problems. Church-building was a social, economic, cultural, and political act that involved the patterns of public taste. In the Maritimes and in English-speaking parts of Quebec, British cultural privilege underlay the churches built by Anglicans. Indeed, contemporary Anglican identities in the Maritimes were wrapped determinedly in a British aesthetic and ideological ‘packaging’, a metaphor likened to the oil-cloths protecting book shipments that routinely crossed the Atlantic. In the Maritimes and in English-speaking parts of Quebec, British cultural privilege underlay the churches built by Anglicans. Indeed, contemporary Anglican identities in the Maritimes were wrapped determinedly in a British aesthetic and ideological ‘packaging’, a metaphor
likened to the oil-cloths protecting book shipments that routinely crossed the Atlantic. The particular power of the pattern books was that they resonated with church-builders of all denominations even though individual books were written with particular sects in mind.\textsuperscript{73}

During the middle decades of the nineteenth century, church-building enterprise and the forming society reflected the interchange between the sacred and the secular.\textsuperscript{74} Indeed, the term that described British North America as a ‘Dominion’ had a religious connotation. It was the suggestion of Samuel Tilley of Saint John, New Brunswick, a businessman turned politician, who brought to bear his passion for religion and economy by noting that Psalm 72:8 stated, “His dominion shall be also from sea to sea”. In essence, the Dominion of Canada was envisioned as a land of resources to be developed for profit with the sanction of Christian religion even if a vast majority of its population comprised Christians who rejected greed.\textsuperscript{75} But, religion sanctioned the judicious development of God-given resources. Thus, it was no coincidence that the working classes employed in lumber, shipbuilding, and shipping industries in the Maritimes were churchgoing folk. A particular example of religion’s permeation of economy and politics was that businessmen and political dignitaries christened new ships with Divine and Royal blessings at ceremonies where workers were given the day off.

The interchange between spiritual and secular mindsets occurred in line with a corresponding belief that ‘progress’ was expressed in economic and moral-cum-religious discourses.\textsuperscript{76} Settlers validated their endeavours and sacrifices through language and imagery borrowed from the Bible. For instance, the novella \textit{A Home in the Northwest} (1903) – discussed in chapter IV of this thesis – demonstrates the point that settlers to
Canada needed churches to complete domestic living, or at least that certain writers wanted the public to believe it was the case. Thus, the political moments that included the Union of Upper and Lower Canada (1840) and official Confederation (1867) appeared also to be constituted as triumphs of Christian character and values.

With the focus upon regionalism in the Canadian situation, local debates about architectural aesthetics took on new meaning. New debates occurred over the way churches should look and these were constituted in commercial practice; that is, the variety of visual imagery available to church-builders happened in the Dominion largely through importing pattern books, prints, and magazines. British and U.S. print media distributed social attitudes and cultural values that were shot through with debates concerning church aesthetics. The debates also reflected the multifarious communal identities forming across the Dominion between 1867 and 1914, especially exemplified by interdenominational rivalries that took on an architectural mode.

The debates about the way churches should look were amplified by the pattern books written for Anglican audiences coming into the hands of other denominations including Methodists and Roman Catholics. Methodists and Roman Catholics were looking at church pattern books because their numbers were growing. The Anglican Church in Canada responded with a xenophobic belief that the growth of other denominations amounted to a crisis. Thus, the syndication of Anglican power around synods in the 1860s, as expressions of self-governance, was a sharp check against the rise of Methodism. For this reason, the consolidation of Anglican power at the diocesan level re-emphasized the colonial bishops’ power to determine the way their churches should look. Church-building committees were obligated to defer to the tastes of their bishop.
These bishops, as will be demonstrated, developed a large portion of their architectural knowledge from books, magazines, and periodical journals.

The economy was inevitably part of the operations that constituted society A complex economic field characterized church-building in the Maritimes and Lower Canada. This field included procedures of state power, missionary activity, self-improvement, and collective versus individual identity. The term for a church as the ‘House of God’ implied the religious and social mechanisms of production and reproduction because houses are both economic and social investments. A church building was anticipated to accrue to future generations of worshippers until such time that the edifice ceased to function appropriately.78

The ideology, and identity, in printed legislation and in journals of architectural criticism that influenced church-building were sustained by the larger economic, religious, and cultural apparatus. Economy and print reproduction combined in pattern books of churches to create a textural surface of concentrated settlement, consecrated under the auspices of religious and secular governments. Taken together the pattern books presented a deliberate attempt to order patterns of public taste through economy and this affected not only architecture but also the deployment of religion.

In the emergent commercial society, patterns of public taste in church-building found new meaning in the old ideology that stated religion improved society. But, these social improvements, like church-building, needed money to finance them. The idea of national progress as the sum of individual industry and uprightness was expressed in an advertisement for the self-help book entitled Dollars and Sense (1895) written by a “leading expert on business and advertising”. It focused on the progress of economy
through the success of the individual. Consequently, religious institution re-focused initiatives on the spiritual growth of each living soul and this profoundly affected the Anglican Church. The situation put pressure on liturgical practice that had traditionally isolated the High Anglican clergy behind choir screens; individual congregants were able to see salvation but not partake of it in this life. Under the new social conditions personal development became associated with the overall social, and even religious, fabric.

The money used to build churches was a visible manifestation of collective and individual values but it also contributed to the tensions between individual and collective interests. Collective groups often formed in opposition to the architectural aspirations of individual patrons when groups objected to the church being used to satisfy the wants of a wealthy congregant. On a broader scale in Montreal, for instance, wealthier merchant classes who benefited from the Maritime shipbuilding and shipping industries generated local economies capable of supporting larger religious architectural projects. Indeed, Montreal’s Anglican community took pride in the scale of its cathedral, Christ Church (203 ft. length), which was large by colonial standards and thirty percent longer than Christ Church, Fredericton, New Brunswick. More data and analysis will appear on the cathedrals in New Brunswick, Newfoundland, and Montreal in the case studies ahead.

The significant amount of individual and group wealth expended on church-building in the Maritimes, despite its relatively rural economies in the mid-nineteenth century, was directly proportional to economy’s legitimization of religious practices. The construction of cathedrals in New Brunswick and Newfoundland, where wood churches were the norm, illustrates small pockets of wealth in ‘resource’ economies that were also a significant part of the developing negotiations around Confederation. Because
the shipbuilding, shipping, and fishing industries produced isolated pockets of individual wealth unevenly disbursed among relatively poor populations, the industries themselves were significant components of the overall picture of the developing Dominion. This was particularly the case with Newfoundland, which was not an official partner in Confederation until 1949 though its trade continued to impact the overall Canadian picture.

Building a new church can be regarded as a microcosm of organizing a new society in much the same way that a church’s congregation constituted a ‘mini’ social economy. Within the church-building and related social formation processes, taste was an instrument that legitimized wealth, power, prestige, and privilege. Accordingly, the operations of the emergent Confederated nation and the management of modern business appeared associated with religion, not the least because of decisions to abolish commerce on the Sabbath. More precisely, church-building committees for the more affluent construction projects were generally composed of wealthy merchants, politicians, and high-ranking civil servants as well as building practitioners who were also respected members of the congregation. The connection between religious and secular interests was given architectural expression by a leading British architect, George Edmund Street (1824-81) who remarked, “it is unhappy that [the revival of gothic architecture] should ever wish to divorce religious and secular art; as if religion were a thing for Sundays only, and not for every moment of every life…” Street had articulated the tensions between religious and secular lifestyles that were constituted in new commercial society. To that end, a reciprocal marketing relationship connected church pattern books and church-building with everyday social and commercial structure.
The social respectability of religion in the Maritime context was chiefly assisted by Anglican missionaries and colonial bishops who were under orders to win souls by building churches in remote communities. The dioceses in Britain and the Dominion rarely balked at the considerable expense of such initiatives, believing in their moral and spiritual responsibility. These bishops and missionaries came prepared to do the business of expanding the Church particularly by converting the aboriginal population and ministering to immigrant settlers. Church-building was a necessary step in the achievement of this goal so several bishops, including John Medley of Fredericton New Brunswick, had looked at church patterns before they left England and others sent for books and church plans by mail. By forging ahead with church-building, a suite of Maritime bishops of the Anglican Church changed the pattern of ecclesiastical architecture in those colonial provinces. For instance, Bishop Medley spread the knowledge of church-building that was marketed by the plans, sections, elevations, perspective drawings, and related discourses found in the pattern books that included the Ecclesiological principles advocated by the Cambridge Camden (later Ecclesiological) Society. Bishop Medley was the first to sanction a model/copy relationship for a Neo-Gothic cathedral in Canada, as will be seen in the case study on Christ Church Cathedral in Fredericton, New Brunswick presented later in this chapter.

The bishops travelled by boat to remote areas of the Maritimes to encourage the construction of a network of churches. However, there were disappointing initial results. The small number of Anglican clergy in the Maritimes was ill equipped to service the vast and remote geographical area. Nevertheless, the bishops and missionaries pressed on because religious faith tended to resist economic realities. For this reason, remote
communities built churches without having been appointed a clergyman. In short, the belief in social progress rallied church-builders in the Maritime colonies despite economic realities to the contrary. Despite the complicated nature of the situation, some of these communities forged ahead with the construction of churches on the assumption that a ‘proper’ Neo-Gothic building would help attract a larger congregation and a permanent minister.

2.2.1 Religious Politics of Church Pattern Books

On both an individual and group level, consumer society constantly renewed production and consumption in order to drive the economy – and modern lifestyle – forward. Church pattern books showed how taste was an instrument that not only legitimized group and individual wealth, power, and privilege but also appeared to move society forward toward so-called ‘perfection’. The cultivated values associated with taste marked the stakes of social advantage, belonging, and group respectability as well as exclusion. Dominant groups and individuals benefited from ‘enforcing’ a connection between taste and the enduring, permanent aspects of antiquity. In this sense, illustrated print-based books of church architecture strengthened history’s deployment as a stabilizing force on modernity even though history was treated, like taste, as a commodity. The pattern books both purveyed an enduring sense of taste as well as acted as ciphers of the new transience of the economy linking architecture with the latest building fashions.

Taste was both an expression of individualized character and a reflection of group identity. Taste had complicated modes of operation particular to it, which were evident in the production and consumption of the pattern books. The architectural aspirations of
bishops were moderated by the prevailing public taste in church design, in no small part due to the distribution of a variety of church illustrations. At the same time pattern book authors, who were also architects themselves, tried to use taste to control the aesthetic aspirations of bishops and church-building committees. Using taste to legitimize an architect’s disposition towards a client was “a trade in things that have no price…can only work by pretending not to be doing what they are doing.”

A ‘commerce of taste’ enabled the appropriation and exploitation of medieval aesthetics and planning conceptualized in the pattern books as enduring and permanent. A new social order was particularly apparent in the development of a ‘modern’ Dominion, despite its deep roots in British tradition, history, and values. New commercial and consumption practices occurred in the Maritimes and in Montreal, constituting new social identities. Britain had already experienced a so-called transformation into ‘modern’ society brought to the fore as much by economy as by technology. Goods, social veneers, and lifestyles that characterized modernity re-made the substance of everyday life in these expanding settlements.

Public taste reflected the social norms into which people were socialized because taste was part of the social structures in which people developed a sense of their social positions. Bourdieu’s conceptualization of ‘habitus’, as indicated was a system of classificatory rules, habits, and customs that dispose people to certain preferences. ‘Habitus’ was a learned and embodied expression of the role that consumption played in reproducing the social order.

The result of marketing taste in the public domain, especially in print media, conflated the transience of fashion with the enduring and permanent aspects of taste.
Taste-cum-fashion became a ‘great leveller’ in colonial society because of increased access to money and goods, formerly associated with Old-World landed gentry. Pattern book author Rev. George Bowler expressed concern over the transience of public taste:

We do not claim a greater knowledge, - more perfect taste, - better judgement or superior professional skill, to our comppeers… . Having made the science of Building a study of some years before entering the ministry, we had gained some knowledge of the principles of correct taste in constructing the different styles of private and public buildings, and in common with others we could not fail to notice the great want of taste and skill which is so fully manifest in every village and hamlet throughout the land [italics mine].

Bowler also expressed the desire of most architects and pattern book authors who wanted to pacify their clients’ opinions and distance themselves from builders, as such:

It will never do to trust the matter to the taste and skill of your builder, for there are very few of those who call themselves practical men and practical carpenters who are competent to design with taste and skill, and to combine all the details of an edifice in the best manner, and in right proportions…

The discourses around professionalization and claims of taste were more plainly stated in a book of compiled designs by some of the leading U.S. architects of the day, entitled A Book of Plans for Churches and Parsonages (1853):

There are…those of the plane and the saw who also have an eye for architecture as an art, and such men often build very unexceptional structures. But the majority of carpenters have hardly more sense of what is really involved in Architecture, than is needful to the building of a barn.

Trade and the marketing of goods increased as a result of increased populations, much of which occurred within the developing urban areas. In the Dominion, pattern books that were intended to promote an ‘elite’ social advantage actually provided everyone with the same access to taste, or at least with its claims. The claims were related to the old ideas of value and history as an instrumental force. Thus, the ecclesiastical
The Church engaged in commercialized taste by printing the following account of a new Anglican church in Ontario:

It was only the other day that a kind friend drove us out in his carriage from Hamilton to see, for the first time, the little Barton church, which is a perfect gem in its way – the model, indeed, for country churches. The architectural correctness of this pretty edifice is due to the good taste of the late incumbent, the Rev. R.N. Merritt… He was happy in the choice of his architect, Mr. Frank Wills, a gentleman who, we have every reason to believe, is imbued with the religious spirit of his noble profession, as every church architect ought to be. In carrying out the plans furnished by Mr. Wills, Mr. Merritt’s own appreciation of genuine Church architecture and good taste were of service to him. The result has been the erection of a building which affects you with a pleasing interest the moment the eye rests on it; and simple village-church as it is, fills the mind, immediately on entering it, with a quiet and solemn sense of God’s presence. We have never entered a church in Canada where the effect of softened light and internal arrangements was so instantaneous and so complete in exciting devotional impressions.

This account was typical of the exclusivity that Anglicans, and others, attached to taste, which was a socio-economic ‘invention’ that people believed.

More widely available and cheaply produced pattern books meant greater public access to visual material and to a new ‘commerce of taste’. However, the increased public access to visual material associated with commercially-based taste did not deliver on the books’ promises to elevate the status of the masses. Instead, broad public participation in a ‘commerce of taste’ lowered the status of taste by its associations with fashion, which challenged and eroded the ‘traditional’ sacrosanct social distinctions. As a result, the Dominion’s church-builders used pattern books in ways unanticipated by the books’ authors.

One effect of the publication of church pattern books was the commodification of taste. The publication of church pattern books, that included churches reproduced in two-dimensional format, contributed to the dispersal of the aura associated with the ‘real’
gothic church. But, of course, Victorian churches were a substitution, and repetition, of a false image for a previous ‘real’ one: the medieval church. Despite efforts to create authenticity around the Gothic Revival the pattern books actually reinforced the shadowy semblance of the simulacra. It was a temporal impossibility to build medieval churches in the nineteenth century and so the pattern books actually marketed the taste for authenticity.

Even taste, itself, was susceptible to shifts in the public perception. The historian Dell Upton has argued that taste experienced a shift from being a fixed entity in the eighteenth century to becoming associated with social claims in the nineteenth century. His examination of house pattern books produced in the U.S. showed that after the 1830s taste, in and of itself, was not enough for architects to mollify their clients whose judgement was subordinated to the architect’s guidance. Architects needed to ‘invent’ design principles to be attached to taste in order to retain some control over their emerging professions. At the same time, pattern books advertised that taste could be learned from books, though authors who were also architects added the stipulation that taste was an inherent quality in architects. Despite Upton’s argument that U.S. architects used taste as a commodity in the professionalization of American architectural practice, the visual and textual data found in church pattern books before and after 1830 suggest that taste was never a fixed commodity but one always associated with changeable power structures. Upton also claimed that pattern book writers were unwilling to claim openly that taste was linked to status, but research into church pattern books suggests that the link was common knowledge; and, to state taste’s link with social status was redundant. What is important is that publication of architectural principles in church pattern books
meant publishing the discourse around taste. The promotion of taste in association with Neo-Gothic church imagery commodified both taste and the church imagery.

Commercialized taste was a component in the identity-making process associated with church-building in the decades after official Confederation. The complex conditions of consumption, as identified in Consumer Culture and Modernity (1997), were egocentric, un-related to needs, and deeply involved in individual receptions. Consumers were, thus, boundless, fluid matrices of ‘libidinal economies’ that modified, transgressed and re-interpreted the social order.98

Church pattern books were commercial objects that involved modern print techniques and distribution channels in the construction and proliferation of religious values in society. Anglicans claiming social privilege justified their belief systems by arguing their superior taste. They normalized the unequal power relations emanating from taste that contemporaries accepted as legitimate and were, thus, embedded in classifications that described everyday life.99

Concurrent with Fergusson’s commercialization of knowledge, Charles Eastlake’s book Hints on Household Taste (1868, re-printed 1869, 1872, 1878) showed how taste was consolidated around modern lifestyle such that he unselfconsciously coupled a ‘commerce of taste’ with the growth of arts manufacture, including architecture:

The faculty of distinguishing good from bad design in the familiar objects of domestic life is a faculty which most educated people – and women especially – conceive that they possess… that, while a young lady is devoting at school, or under a governess so many hours a day to music, so many to languages and so many to general science, she is all this time unconsciously forming that sense of the beautiful, which we call taste… to form a correct estimate of the merits of art-manufacture… .We may condemn a lady’s opinion on politics – criticise her handwriting – correct her pronunciation of Latin, and disparage her favourite author with a chance of escaping displeasure. But if we venture to question her taste – in the most ordinary sense of the word, we are sure to offend.100
Eastlake complained that the transience of fashion, which he associated with ‘feminine’ domestic space, had infringed upon the enduring taste associated with ‘masculine’ church architecture. But, his complaints were actually indications of what was common practice in the public arena; that is, taste and fashion converged at the point of economy.

2.3 The Establishment of New Anglican Dioceses in St. John, New Brunswick; St. John’s, Newfoundland; and, Montreal, Quebec before 1867 Confederation

Anglican church-building enterprise in the Maritimes before Confederation presented itself as a viable and visible option for propagating the established Church’s social and religious dominance. However, the Anglican identity in the Maritimes, and in Montreal, formed around a self-described ‘crisis’ that resulted from the continued rise in the numbers of Methodists and Roman Catholics. When Bishop Feild arrived in Newfoundland in 1846 he found the population in St. John’s predominantly Roman Catholic: 4226 Anglicans versus 18986 Roman Catholics. The Roman Catholics had already built a substantial Basilica that dominated the city skyline. That ‘crisis’ persisted until 1857 when the next census recorded the growth of the Anglican Communion in Newfoundland in numbers amounting to 44,285, which nearly equally the Roman Catholic population of 56,895. Determined to compete, Bishop Feild resolved to build an Anglican cathedral in St. John’s to counter the ‘Hiberno Romanist’ crisis in the Maritimes, whether or not his diocese could immediately afford it.

Ecclesiological principles in architecture appeared to be transmitted to the colonies to deal with the so-called crisis. The appointment of Edward Feild to Newfoundland was actually the third of three new bishopric positions filled in the 1840s
by architecturally and Ecclesiologically minded men. Their appointments marked the interface of the force of religious institution, a ‘commerce of taste’, and politics, especially evident in the manner of new cathedrals erected by the individual bishops. The transatlantic transmission of architectural taste-cum-fashion was exposed particularly by the way in which each of the bishops requested drawings and pattern book illustrations from British architectural and ecclesiastical associations, such as the Oxford Architectural Society and the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel in Foreign Parts. The appointment of these bishops marked the established Church’s expansion of operations in the Maritime colonies and Lower Canada. Newfoundland was an important part of the overall architectural and commercial picture of the Dominion though it had not become a political player in the negotiations around Confederation until well into the twentieth century. The expansion of the established Church in the Dominion responded to waves of Catholic and dissenter immigration as well as the concern toward a growing atheism in secular society.

Building Anglican cathedrals and churches in the colonies was anticipated to provide a visible expression of an attenuated social dominance enjoyed by groups of Anglicans. Anglicans used architecture to express and re-assert their influence over the formation of society, even if the membership of the established Church did not command a majority of the Dominion’s population. Bishops Medley, Fulford, and Feild ascended to diocesan power amid the colonies’ systematic economic affairs that were also punctuated by moments of political and cultural tension. The Church of England recognised that its political and social privilege in the Dominion was at stake.
Newfoundland (1847), and Christ Church, Montreal, (1856) (fig. 2.13) were the visible result of the established Church’s economic and social strategies. These bishops brought significant social reform and architectural fashion to bear on their respective colonial posts and church-building schemes. At the same time, the bishops contended with other denominations’ church-building initiatives, which represented serious religious and social contestations. Anglican groups in particular, though by no means exclusively, used architectural taste to reinforce their claim to superiority in the community. Despite their use of the latest architectural fashions, they continued to link taste with social privilege.

The relative ease by which British-inspired social structures were visibly repeated in the Dominion’s architecture was reflected in immigration patterns of architects, clergy, and architecture enthusiasts. In the Dominion, and especially in the Maritimes and English-speaking parts of Montreal, the repetition of British social structures and cultural attitudes helped the Cambridge Camden (later, Ecclesiological) Society become a major influence on the colonial development of Ecclesiology. The Society disseminated its objectives and especially its architectural beliefs in print by offering advice to architects and church-building committees. The Society accomplished the distribution of its ideas through a series of pamphlets, an architectural church pattern book, and a quarterly journal called the *Ecclesiologist* (1841-68). Anglican readers of the *Ecclesiologist* in the Dominion connected the ‘correct’ antiquarian source with the Society’s Christian morals. 108

The apparent permanence of medieval buildings legitimized Anglican claims of superior architectural taste that, in turn, reinforced Anglican self-identification as dominant in colonial society’s formation. Church-building was a communal activity
heavily involved in the process of identity-making, which chiefly involved classifying one’s own group through its dispositions toward other denominations’ churches. Thus, church-building bred intra-denominational unity while also stirring social tensions within an economically and geo-politically expanding nation-state. At stake was the crafting of a ‘national’ identity for the emerging Dominion. What ought the Dominion look like and whose social rules would prevail in it? Discourse analysis shows that the equation of privilege and social dominance was complicated because socially and economically dominant Anglican groups in the Dominion did not always welcome the use of Gothic by other religious denominations. Winning the souls of new immigrants to the Dominion, as well as their economic support, was a serious business and colonial Anglican bishops complained vehemently when non-Anglicans appeared to gain ground. The 1851 census of Lower Canada reported the Roman Catholics only slightly ahead of Protestant church-builders, the former having built 385 churches versus 275 for the latter.

Though the Anglican Communion perceived itself pre-eminent, the Dominion’s democratic society encouraged other denominations to express architectural choice and variety within the general confines of a Neo-Gothic grammar. The local debates about the way churches should look and the variations of Neo-Gothic in pattern books were shot through with the question about whether aesthetic variety was equated with taste or fashion. The politics of pattern books presented a unified look for Anglican churches, but a variety of church designs ensued across the Maritimes and Lower Canada (not to mention British North America) partly in response to the variety of church designs exemplified in the variations of ‘styles’ in pattern books. In essence, local debates about the way churches should look were a microcosm for the larger negotiations over the way
the formation of the nation should unfold. The debates about the variety of Neo-Gothic were not only local but also reflected transatlantic political tensions. Britain negotiated land settlements with the U.S. by directing the Dominion in ways that were not always beneficial to the colony.\textsuperscript{109} The dispute over logging the Columbia basin, in an area between New Brunswick and Maine, was indirectly related to church-building and pattern books because timber was the chief material component of each product.

2.3.1 **Case Study: Fredericton Cathedral and St. Anne’s Chapel**

Bishop Medley’s cathedral in Fredericton was both an imperial and an Anglican architectural statement in its adoption of British Ecclesiology. The association between the Bishop of New Brunswick and his architect, Frank Wills (1822-57) (later replaced by William Butterfield) was a decidedly British affair in the Canadas that reflected the Maritime’s moderate and Loyalist politics.\textsuperscript{110} Cultural affinity with Britain was expressed architecturally when the fourteenth-century fabric of St. Mary’s, Snettisham, Norfolk, England was chosen as the model for the Fredericton Cathedral.\textsuperscript{111} Bishop Medley and Frank Wills had left England together with the plans for the new cathedral packed away in their baggage.

The flowing window tracery in the west window of Fredericton cathedral is a recreation of the stone tracery in the west window at Snettisham. The decision to use Snettisham as the model was initiated by the Right Rev. Bishop Coleridge of Exeter, who presided over Bishop Medley’s consecration and handed over a cheque in the amount of £1,500.\textsuperscript{112}

Snettisham’s church was not the only model for Fredericton’s cathedral. In December 1844, Bishop Medley had written to the OAS asking if St. Mary’s church in
Shottesbrooke, Berkshire (fig. 2.14) would “be a good model for a small cathedral?” He had heard that “Shottesbrooke church is published by the Society [and] if so I should be greatly obliged if that could be among the number” of books to be shipped to New Brunswick. Medley received the shipment of books on or before February 26, 1845. He had heard of Shottesbrooke through ‘word of mouth’ from the architect Thomas Rickman. Shottesbrooke was a cruciform fourteenth-century church that had undergone extensive restoration in 1844 by British architect William Butterfield. Butterfield had produced a set of drawings based on his restoration that were published by the OAS. The layout of Shottesbrooke included north and south double-bay transept arms and a three-bay chancel in the east end. Wills’ perspective drawing for Fredericton shows a similar cruciform plan, though cruciform churches ran counter to architectural tradition in New Brunswick. Clearly Bishop Medley and his architect, Frank Wills, envisioned a cruciform plan for the cathedral, although congregants following the slow progress of construction would not likely have imagined the same.

In the spirit of interchange, Bishop Medley also asked for models from the Ecclesiological Society, claiming that “[t]hey might also aid me much by small plain wooden models for wooden churches in the country.” Asking after models of wooden churches was a concession to the unwanted expense of an architect in rural economies. But more importantly, the ‘conversations’ between different architecture pattern books sent by rival British architectural societies would have solicited much debate about the way churches should look in the Maritimes. The books’ initiation of aesthetic debates was a metaphor for the debates around geo-political unification in the Dominion.
Notwithstanding a British/colonial transatlantic push toward federation for the Canadas beginning around the mid-1850s, some sectors of New Brunswick, for instance, remained stringently opposed to Confederation during the Tilley government’s term.¹¹⁹ Local economic interests, like those in New Brunswick, weighed heavily on political federation negotiations just as the opportunistic way pattern books were used in the colonies subtly adjusted the Anglican politics in church pattern books.

In November 1848, the journal of the Cambridge Camden (later Ecclesiological) Society reported “favourable accounts of the progress of Fredericton cathedral”, the new seat of the Anglican bishop, John Medley.¹²⁰ Fredericton’s positive attention from the Ecclesiologist was somewhat unusual. Canadian church-building factored rarely into the journal’s approximate ten-year long coverage of colonial church architecture, but Fredericton’s cathedral was mentioned on at least four occasions. Churches in the Empire’s more prominent colonial holdings were more notably covered in the Ecclesiologist.¹²¹ Fredericton’s cathedral likely appeared in the Ecclesiologist because it was the first architecturally ‘correct’ Anglican cathedral established in the Canadas, reflected in the scale of the proposed cathedral. Bishop Medley’s architectural experience was not slight, having founded the Exeter diocesan Architectural Society in 1841. It was a kindred spirit to the Cambridge Camden (later Ecclesiological) Society, a group for which he was a member. On 14 December 1844, John Medley communicated with the Oxford Architectural Society (OAS, formerly the Oxford Society for Promoting the Study of Gothic Architecture) asking, “to take out a stock of architectural books and drawings” that the Society deems useful.¹²² The OAS “agreed to give a set of the Society’s publications to the Bishop Elect of New Brunswick.”¹²³ Bishop Medley
responded by letter with his thanks for the architectural books and made a further request for some decorated tiles “for a new chapel I am building.”

In 1857, he gave a lecture on ‘Good Taste’ to the Church of England Young Men’s Society in St. John, in which he remarked:

In our household arrangements, in our dress, in the social festivities, we shall eschew the extremes of extravagance and meanness, and look upon all things, great and small, as given us that we may discharge the duties belonging to them in the best possible manner…Thus, while we carefully guard the sacred deposit of truth from all adulteration, and found our religion strictly and soberly on God’s most holy word, good taste will preserve that religion from sourness and self-complacency, and will make it gracious and acceptable to all who have sufficient candour to appreciate our intentions, and generally useful to the world.

Strategically equating ‘truth’ with ‘good taste’, Bishop Medley also adopted a medieval model for Christ Church Fredericton in order to avoid the ‘extremes of extravagance and meanness’.

Indeed, ecclesiology equated beauty with economy, truth, and taste. For instance, the New York Ecclesiologist (1848-53) expressed the matter succinctly: “beauty and economy will be the result of our working upon true principles.” Architect Frank Wills was a founding member of the New York Ecclesiological Society, which introduced the ‘new’ mode of Neo-Gothic to the U.S. Fifteen hundred copies of its inaugural edition were printed and given gratis in the prospect of developing a readership. Wills understood a “commerce of taste” implicitly. In an article for the second instalment of the New York Ecclesiologist he wrote:

Finery, everywhere, takes the place of dignity; and if, by accident, anything is good at first, it is afterward spoiled by a Committee of Taste, who stick a little lump of unmeaning putty here, and a dab of the same convenient material there; and, in the end, to quote the language of a friend, “more is expended to make the Church look fine, than would have been sufficient to make it beautiful.”
References to taste considered, the decision to model Fredericton Cathedral on St. Mary’s, Snettisham, still proved unexpectedly controversial for Bishop Medley. The Ecclesiological Society objected to modelling a cathedral on Snettisham’s parochial church design. To the sensibilities of the Society, the architect Frank Wills’ plan to have a lower chancel roofline than that of the nave was particularly unsuited to the grandeur warranted by a cathedral. Could Bishop Medley have left neglected a fundamental ‘building principle’ of ecclesiology that stated cathedral rooflines were uniform across the nave and chancel? Quite the contrary since Medley exhibited historical and architectural knowledge of ecclesiology in his published pamphlet *Elementary Remarks on Church Architecture* (1841). In essence, economy resolved the differences between the Bishop’s and his architect’s vision for the cathedral; that is, the Bishop knew he need not have worried over a complete structure that he could as yet afford to build.\(^\text{128}\) Bishop Medley had the time to change components of the cathedral before each was begun.

Besides, Bishop Medley had other things to worry about. In New Brunswick, Anglicans were few in number and among them there was distaste for the Bishop’s High Church or Tractarian ideals.\(^\text{129}\) Resistance to the High Church position was marked among the general populace of New Brunswick. Perhaps Bishop Medley viewed the slow construction process advantageously, giving him time to sway more the local population toward his High Church ideals before the architectural reflection of those ideals became visible in his cathedral. At some point it did become obvious, even to a leading non-conformist, who was heard to observe, “so we went towards Rome.”\(^\text{130}\)

Construction of Bishop Medley’s cathedral began in May 1845 with £3,000 raised from congregants in the Bishop’s new diocese.\(^\text{131}\) By the following October, the
Lieutenant Governor, Sir William Colebrooke laid the cornerstone, attracting local prestige and illustrating the established Church’s imperial connections. The nave and aisles were built by November 1847, which depleted building funds. Frank Wills moved to New York in order to continue his architectural practice there, and Medley returned to England in search of more financing. Upon his return from England the diocese’s coffers had grown to £20,000. In his possession was also a new set of drawings by the well-known British architect William Butterfield, which altered the cathedral’s roofline to reflect a form prescribed by the Ecclesiological Society.

Though Bishop Medley agreed in principle that the design needed changes, the act of realizing those changes was a complicated affair. Bishop Medley’s address to the Ecclesiological Society at its annual meeting, held on May 9 1848, shows that there was some discrepancy between the new drawings by Butterfield and the private thoughts of the bishop. The bishop described the current dimensions of the nave, noting that construction of the tower and choir were not yet begun. Bishop Medley was careful to specify the size of the choir he anticipated building:

A choir, 40 feet in length, with aisles, would be sufficient for our purpose. It remains to be seen how this might be connected with a tower.

However, the bishop’s private thoughts about the way the cathedral should look deviated from Butterfield’s drawings of the proposed cathedral, which were printed alongside the address to the Ecclesiological Society. Butterfield’s illustration of the chancel was clearly not the forty feet length that Bishop Medley anticipated. Furthermore, Butterfield’s drawing explicitly showed how the choir was to be connected to the tower, leaving no question of its arrangement except in the mind of Bishop Medley. The bishop’s verbal address indicated that he did not anticipate using Butterfield’s drawing as
presented, knowing that much negotiation about the way the cathedral would look still lay ahead in New Brunswick. What was on the bishop’s mind was the expense and pragmatics of church-building in the colonies, to which he noted:

I had thought of two towers, as at Ottery and Exeter, but shall be content with one, if a cathedral-like appearance can be produced at less expense; for I am desirous to do whatever is most thoroughly practical, provided it be correct and church-like.\textsuperscript{135}

The interesting idea about Bishop Medley’s vision of his cathedral was the inclusion of a tower and spire, whose height must be considered against that of the surrounding secular structures as representative of the local social economy.

In his address, Bishop Medley criticized the traditional architectural practices of British North America by stating:

Both in the United States and in British North America there is a strong feeling in favour of Pointed architecture, though there is little knowledge of the subject, and great difficulties arise from having no positive standard before men’s eyes. It must be expected that many eagerly cling to old forms, however unsightly they may appear to others, and one must honour their feeling, though one cannot admire their taste.\textsuperscript{136}

Interestingly, the Bishop had to somewhat adjust his own taste to comply with the Ecclesiological Society’s judgement. The next issue of the \textit{Ecclesiologist} noted that Bishop Medley had modified the design for the tower drawn by Butterfield to give the tower windows “greater simplicity while preserving the general effect.”\textsuperscript{137} Indeed, by the time the cathedral was completed in 1853 much had changed from Butterfield’s published drawing. The bishop got his choir, which was placed under the crossing tower, and he got a two-bay chancel area much more generously laid out than in Butterfield’s plan – though the chancel was built with a roofline at the height of the nave. Twin north and south vestries adjacent to the chancel replaced Butterfield’s cosy little vestry that
would have been complete with its own fireplace. Butterfield’s drawing of the vestry indicated it was essentially a stand-alone structure linked through the south aisle to the main body of the church. The bishop’s image of himself reading by the fire in that vestry must have appeared excessive in light of the freezing winter nights that the poor in Fredericton had to endure.

The construction process of Christ Church Cathedral, once again, illustrates the interface of religion, economy, taste, and politics at the theoretical, and actual, point of social formation. Part of the cathedral’s construction involved building a ‘temporary’ chapel to house the congregation. The architecture of the chapel, dedicated St. Anne’s (Frank Wills, 1847\textsuperscript{138}), was inspired by the thirteenth-century fabric of St. Michael’s, Long Stanton, Cambridgeshire (fig. 2.15). St. Michael’s was advocated for emulation in the Empire’s colonies because its simple design, steep roof, low walls, and plain western bell-côte were an inexpensive and manageable way to achieve Ecclesiological principles. Illustrations of Long Stanton were published in Raphael and J. Arthur Brandon’s Parish Churches, or Perspective Views of English Ecclesiastical Structures Accompanied by Plans Drawn to a Uniform Scale (1848) and the same author’s Open Timber Roofs of the Middle Ages (1849).\textsuperscript{139} Wills designed several such churches in the U.S., which he published in his pattern book Ancient English Ecclesiastical Architecture; and its Principles Applied to the Wants of the Present Day (1850).\textsuperscript{140} Wills also built a version of St. Michael’s, Long Stanton, for the Anglicans at St. Michael’s in Sillery (1856), outside of Quebec City, which is particularly interesting for its double buttressed western wall echoing the English model (fig. 2.16).\textsuperscript{141} St. Michael’s, Sillery makes an excellent contrast to the Roman Catholic church of Saint-Michel, Sillery (1852) built to the plans
of architect Goodlatte Richardson Browne. The Roman Catholic church has a central western tower partially integrated into the main body of the nave, tall walls, shallow roof, polygonal east end, and vaulted interior using plaster in imitation of the richer stone material. The English-speaking Irish Roman Catholics at Saint-Michel did not follow the same ecclesiological principles of architecture as the English-speaking Anglicans at St. Michael’s. The Roman Catholics intentionally recalled what they considered to be the beauty of Roman gothic architecture; in this case, the source was likely Santa Maria Sopra Minerva in Rome (1280-1370). By contrast, the Anglicans believed in superiority of the constructed ‘truthfulness’ of ecclesiological architecture. The cultural differences reflected in these distinct positions on architecture exemplified the interdenominational divisiveness that continued for the next fifty years.

Bishop Medley referred to the decoration of St. Anne’s chapel in the most fashionable terms, noting imported stained glass produced by the companies of Beer and Warrington, with floor tiles were a gift of Minton’s, a porcelain manufacturer and distributor of international reputation. Bishop Medley had published a pamphlet on church architecture entitled, “Elementary Remarks on Church Architecture” (1841). That the Bishop believed himself possessed of architectural knowledge gave credence to his blunt remark to a leading parishioner, “Mr. R., when you build a church, build a church, and when you build a barn build a barn.”

Despite the added expense of building the chapel with hammer-dressed grey sandstone, Bishop Medley especially noted that the chapel was intended for the poor with all seats free from the expense of pew rental. Leaving all of the seats free was a controversial decision, since pew rental was a significant source of church income;
therefore, construction costs had to be offset entirely by donation. Bishop Medley was an ardent supporter of free seats, having published a paper on the subject in the inaugural edition of the *Exeter Diocesan Architectural Society Transactions*, repeating 3 Phillim 16: “there shall be no property in pews”\(^\text{144}\).

Nevertheless, he used the opportunity to advertise the chapel’s free seats to a British audience in order to solicit donations to complete Fredericton’s cathedral. The case was one of the politics of religion in which the sale of church seats to the ‘highest bidder’ was a sign of progressive economy. Medley argued conservatively against the closed pew-system, noting it was:

not only contrary to all sound principles of Architecture, and fatal to all excellence in the interior arrangement of a Church, but that it is alike inconvenient, illegal, and unchristian, and that the arguments in its favour, and the objections against the system of open seats, properly understood, are fallacious and untenable.\(^\text{145}\)

2.4 Selling Early Ecclesiology as Identity in the Maritimes

Architectural knowledge, expertise, and ‘styles’ were transmitted from Britain and Europe to the Canadas initially through the immigration of architects and builders. Once British-trained architects had set up practice in the Dominion, they became equally dependant upon British books, journals, and magazines as the Canadian-born practitioners. The dispositions around the professionalization of architectural practice meant that distinctions arose between the use of pattern books and magazines. The formally-trained architects read pattern books for data and the builders that wanted to raise their professional status read the books like magazines, for the latest architectural ‘fashions’.
The link between pattern book publication and architectural practice was mainly commercial, but it was also driven by social dynamics, such as the force of religion and the search for group identity. While architects produced church pattern books to establish a marketable reputation and increase their professional stature, religion and identity were the chief reasons that a particular book might resonate with its reading audiences. In the Maritimes in the 1840s pattern books became the architectural substance that referred back to British society, something that increasingly needed to be verified by the printed page.

An example of the type of pattern book that would have appealed to all categories of user was British architect George Truefitt’s *Designs for Country Churches* (1850). It contained twenty-two full-page perspective illustrations of churches varying in design from chapels, to parishes, to conventual churches. The churches illustrated in the hard-bound volume adhered to Ecclesiological principles, meant to facilitate the “rise and progress of the revival of the taste for Pointed Architecture”, where ‘Pointed’ was synonymous with ‘Christian’ architecture to describe the Gothic Revival style. The book lacked a long historical introduction and therefore was chiefly a picture book with rich illustrations. Truefitt’s earlier and little known text *Architectural Sketches on the Continent* (1847) was produced after a period of travel on the Continent, evoking the status of a Grand Tour. The prime difference between the two books was indicated in their preface sections; *Architectural Sketches* (1847) focused on “knowledge” while *Designs for Country Churches* (1850), a more mature volume, examined “public taste”.

Truefitt’s books marketed the constant renewal of production and consumption of visual and verbal imagery to Maritime church-builders. His endorsement was part of a
much larger promotion of Britain’s Gothic Revival, led by architects and publishers more influential than he. Truefitt’s books show admiration for the architectural principles laid out for Catholic congregations by A. W.N. Pugin (1812-1852), later brought into Anglican worship chiefly through the Ecclesiological Society. Truefitt directly credits Pugin’s book *True Principles* and the “excellent practical rules and correct advice of the [Ecclesiological Society]” with giving a “clue to the *real spirit* of the style.” For the Society and its followers, the ‘real’ spirit was emphatically religious. Truefitt’s link with the Ecclesiological Society was further revealed by *Architectural Sketches*’ dedication to Alexander James Beresford Hope, a founding member of that society. The link with the Society, and particularly with respect to Beresford Hope, announced Truefitt’s architectural – and religious – leaning toward High Anglican ideals associated with ritual in worship.

Truefitt promoted the Anglican Communion, and its social economic and professional privilege. Embedded in that structure was the notion that poorer Anglican congregations could not afford the expensive designs more suited to the wealthy. Consequently, Truefitt sustained hierarchical social structures traditionally associated with dominant cultures.

Truefitt’s modest contribution to British architecture and church pattern books illustrates how religion and taste were used to market Neo-Gothic architecture, which spread through to the moderates of British architectural practice, as well as practitioners in Canadian outposts of the British Empire. The ideas did not cease their social life once the three-dimensional church building was realized because the books of church imagery continued to circulate with a life of their own. The social life of pattern books impacted
the formation of identity in the Dominion. Like Truefitt, British-trained architect William Hay (1818-1888) also showed an affinity with Pugin’s religious ideals, marketing of taste, as well as, construction principles. The interface of Pugin’s ideals with Hay’s practice in the Dominion was exemplified by the eulogy Hay wrote for Pugin. Bearing in mind that eulogizing is a particularly religious enterprise, Hay’s use of the term ‘Christian’ in the eulogy to describe Neo-Gothic reinforced Pugin’s affiliation of the Church and architectural ‘righteousness’. Hay also tied religion with taste as neatly together as Pugin himself with the statement:

> to the various and learned writings of Pugin we are chiefly indebted for the late revival of pure taste, and the getting rid of much spurious architecture of the Brummagem Gothic school, worse in many respects than pure Pagan.\(^{155}\)

Hay’s verbal imagery, like Truefitt’s visual data, endorsed the efficacy of new buildings that followed the ‘spirit’ of medieval design principles rather than the precise copying of ancient models. But, Hay’s architectural output was not based on models, as Bishop Medley was shown to use at Christ Church Fredericton. Instead, Hay adapted Ecclesiological principles to suit his clients’ needs, indicating he understood the latest Neo-Gothic trends in Britain and how to market their enduring aspects to his clientele.

In following Pugin, Hay and Truefitt parted company over the application of architectural philosophy. Hay believed that the traditional values of the Gothic Revival needed to jibe with indigenous building. Truefitt was more progressive by adapting the principles of the Gothic Revival to suit his original designs thereby retaining the ‘art’ in architecture.\(^{156}\) Both men agreed that a Gothic Revival architect was expected to learn to “think in Gothic, exclusive of actual authority”.\(^{157}\)
2.4.1 Case Study: Anglican Cathedral of St. John’s, Newfoundland

Bishop Feild’s (1801-1876) new cathedral in St. John’s, Newfoundland capitalized on the reputation and taste of its architect, George Gilbert Scott (later knighted for his service to architecture). Scott shipped the drawings from his offices in London in the hands of his assistant, William Hay.\(^{158}\) Scott’s drawings show the architect adapted Ecclesiological principles to suit his own sense of ‘beauty’, in consultation with Bishop Feild. In addition, the transmittal of the suite of drawings for the cathedral illustrated how Bishop Feild and his architect Gilbert Scott traded economic and artistic capital around the symbolic capital of the established Church.\(^{159}\)

The events surrounding the cathedral project were as rocky and crestfallen as the Newfoundland landscape. The poverty surrounding Newfoundland’s main industries of fishing and shipbuilding and the “dearth of taste” among local residents were troublesome hurdles. An associate of Feild’s, William Grey the Principal of Queen’s College at St. John’s, echoed these sentiments in a letter that remarked:

Fashions are palmed off on the credulous fashion-hunters here as new which really are stale enough in England. Church-building is in the same predicament; the revival, which began with you in 1839, can scarcely be said to have begun here, although there have certainly been more enquiries what Gothic architecture is within the last two years than ever there were before in Newfoundland. You wonder perhaps that, under these circumstances, Newfoundland can boast of our noblest colonial cathedral. But this is the doing of our noble-hearted Bishop alone. The building is quite unappreciated by the majority of persons here… they see no beauty in it, because it is not finished.\(^{160}\)

Feild intended to build a new cathedral in St. John’s in 1844 but found the local residents resistant to the High Church principles of Ecclesiology. They were initially unwilling to put money into architecture that did not reflect their Low Church ideals.\(^{161}\) In 1844, he wrote to his colleague and fellow clergyman William Scott in England bemoaning that:
The fact is there are no more means to complete or proceed with [the cathedral] and I can see no disposition on the part of the people to come forward with additional subscriptions at all adequate to the object.\textsuperscript{162}

To the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel he wrote:

Our projected Cathedral seems to have died a natural or unnatural death through want of funds, and of love. The subject now is never raised even in talk.\textsuperscript{163}

It is not certain whether the letters were actually meant to solicit financial support in Britain by showing the state of ‘crisis’ of the established Church in Newfoundland. Providentially, a fire that destroyed large parts of St. John’s and left hundreds of people homeless became the rallying point for the established Church in Newfoundland. A civic committee for the relief of the sufferers of the fire at St. John’s succeeded in obtaining a Royal letter from Queen Victoria authorizing the Archbishops of Canterbury and York to adopt measures for providing relief.\textsuperscript{164} Anglican Church officials in St. John’s opportunistically positioned themselves to intercede upon the delivery of the funds in order to obtain financial control for their cathedral project. Showing the level of animosity between the Anglican and Catholic Churches, the Anglican Archdeacon of St. John’s Thomas Bridge wrote to the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel, an Anglican institution, asking:

I hope it may be possible to make some arrangements for the disposal of the Collections under [the Queen’s letter], by which a portion of them may be applied to the restoration of the church. That, I would think, would be right and just, seeing that the great bulk of those who will share in the Relief supplied for those who have suffered temporal loss by the late fire, will not belong to our Communion, whilst all the contributions under a Queen’s letter will, of course, come from members of it.\textsuperscript{165}

The established Church in England raised the money and the Church of England in Canada wanted to keep a significant portion of the money away from the Roman Catholics who outnumbered Anglicans in the colony. Archdeacon Bridge’s letter also
shows that sentiments had not changed toward the Roman Catholics on the island in a
decade since Bridge’s predecessor Archdeacon Edward Wix (1802-1866) had written in
his journal in 1836:

you were living in a town, which, for the lawlessness of a large portion of its
inhabitants, who are excited to breaches of the peace by a most seditious Romish
priesthood, is as little desirable a place of residence as many of the disturbed
townships of Ireland.166

In terms of the financial capital investment on souls saved in Newfoundland, the
Anglican Church was faring least well of all.167 After arriving in St. John’s harbour for
the first time, Bishop Feild remarked upon the growth amassed by the Catholic Church.
The Bishop felt the pressure of harvesting souls for the established Church in a ‘wooden
shed’ of a church he inherited from his predecessor, Bishop Spencer. According to
Bishop Feild, an impressive Gothic cathedral was needed to win the battle for the island’s
souls. However, the process of building a large stone cathedral, even on an island
composed chiefly of rock, turned out to be a formidable procedure. To begin with,
suitable masonry had to be shipped to St. John’s, which exasperated British authorities
who criticized Bishop Feild’s seemingly spendthrift ways. For instance, a hand-written
memo from Arthur Blackwood, Senior Clerk, to H. Merivale, under-secretary of State for
the Colonies was attached to the back of William Hay’s status report on the cathedral’s
construction. The note read:

Mr. Merivale
It would seem that the £16,000 which has been spent on the Cathedral is
insufficient to complete the Building, & that the Bishop does not know where the
rest of the money is to be found to finish the interior & make is serviceable. Two
good stone churches might have been built for that money.168

In following up on the Queen’s letter which raised money after the St. John’s fire, the St.
John’s cathedral project came under the microscope of British authorities. The under-
secretary of State for the Colonies clearly believed that economy gave him the right to pass judgement on colonial church-building without having set foot on the rocky Newfoundland ground.

Feild had made at least one public reference to book publications in his quest to build a new cathedral in St. John’s. He mentioned A.W.N. Pugin’s book *The Present State of Ecclesiastical Architecture in England* in a letter to his colleague William Scott, making particular reference to “the Church of St. Wilfrid”.\(^{169}\) He especially noted the church’s cost of construction, estimated at £5,000. Other design sources made themselves available, such as, a set of drawings sent by the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel in the summer of 1846.\(^{170}\)

### 2.5 Race, Rebellion, and Politics in Lower and Upper Canada

Religion appeared to bind together the Dominion’s populace, though in reality it both formed social structures and catalyzed resistances. The 1837 rebellion in Lower Canada led by Louis-Joseph Papineau raised the issue of religion, race, French identity and nationality. The rebellion, coupled with another prominent rebellion in Upper Canada led William Lyon Mackenzie,\(^{171}\) prompted the British Colonial Office to suspend the Constitution in the Dominion and appoint Lord Durham (John Lambton) to the post of Governor-General. The circumstances effectively made the Governor-General’s post into a constitutional monarch in the Dominion.\(^{172}\)

Controversially, Lord Durham’s 1839 Report accepted the minority view of the English-speaking business community in Montreal that stated French-Canadian society – resolutely Roman Catholic – was “priest-ridden and unprogressive.”\(^{173}\) Lord Durham urged the British Crown to “settle the matter” of Anglican minority in Lower Canada by
adopting a policy favouring the union of Upper and Lower Canada in order to make the French a minority and undermine the quest for French nationalism.\textsuperscript{174}

Since religion was a contributing factor in both Empire-building and in settlement expansion across the Dominion of Canada, it was not unusual to find the British flag flying from the towers of Anglican churches in the Dominion. Flying the Union Jack from Anglican churches was also a significant means of representing social continuity wrapped around “those [sic] who claimed to be descendants of natives of Scotland, Ireland, England, or France [who were] the same class of people [having] the same customs, institutions, and laws.”\textsuperscript{175} For this reason, the flag – like church pattern books – were a visible means of expressing settlement expansion under the influence of the established Church, thereby recalling ‘old world’ privilege and social prestige.\textsuperscript{176} Pattern books expressed the emergent visuality of economy because prestige was visibly linked to wealth.

Taste in the Maritimes in the 1840s and 50s, was essentially consolidated around British examples. At the same time, these same factors did not constitute a singular Dominion identity, but rather a network or tapestry of multiple identities consolidated around geographic and temporal power structures (provincial, urban, religious, social) as concentrated settlement expanded west, north, and even inward from the coasts. Denominational differences were reflected in the aesthetics and plan of churches, meaning that Roman Catholic, Anglican, Presbyterian, Baptist, and Methodist groups each manipulated the Neo-Gothic style in subtly different ways. As well, cultural differences were also reflected in ecclesiastical architecture. Predictably, Acadian churches in PEI had a French Neo-Gothic flavour. Temporal differences were also rather
striking, so within the span of a few or more decades massive changes occurred in the way Neo-Gothic churches looked.

2.5.1 Case Study: Montreal’s Christ Church (later cathedral) 1857

The industrial manufacture that developed in the province of Quebec, and especially at Montreal, after 1850 had an impact upon the political and social debates of the time. Montreal’s geographic location on the St. Lawrence assisted mercantile, and thus urban, growth as compared to Toronto. In 1860, Montreal (population 90,323) had fourteen foundries employing 427 workers as compared to Toronto (population 44,821) had only four foundries employing only 58 workers. These figures related proportionally to the number of churches built in each city. The city of Montreal had 11 Roman Catholic and 24 Protestant churches versus the city of Toronto, which had only 3 Roman Catholic and 9 Protestant churches in 1860. The measurement of these figures by census indicated the importance given to scientific and business efficiency. Accordingly, protective tariffs became both the economic focal points and the measure of the Dominion’s wealth. 177

By 1870, Quebec’s manufacturing businesses were steadily weakened through attrition and the relocation of enterprise in Ontario and the west. Quebec lagged behind Ontario as an agricultural producer because of a failure to “develop the wealth and local capital necessary to encourage the capital intensive, high value added industry.” 178 On the other hand, provincial debt in Quebec was relatively small because of the conservative stance taken by its governing apparatus. 179 Not overburdened by debt, but lacking for manufacture, local merchants supported modest church-building initiatives.

Bishop Fulford’s Christ Church Cathedral in Montreal, though completed more than a decade after Lord Durham’s 1839 Report that recommended something be ‘settled’
in regards the ‘French issue’, was an architectural rallying point for an Anglican minority in Lower Canada. The monumental scale of Christ Church Cathedral visibly countered the demographic scale of Anglicanism in the Montreal population, which was fourteen percent. Christ Church’s monumentality was a visible denial that Anglicans contributed to only about fourteen percent of the province’s population. Bishop Fulford’s architect, Frank Wills articulated these tensions in his pattern book *Ancient English Ecclesiastical Architecture; and its Principles Applied to the Wants of the Present Day* (1850). Wills wrote:

> There is a catholicity in architecture as well as in the Church, and may be separated from Popery as well in one as the other, the dross removed, the rest is all our own, and let us use it as our inheritance. The wretched Gothic abortions every day witnessed and everyday lauded, have no more right to the appellation of Christian architecture than the late New England heresy is to be considered as an article in the creed of the Catholic Church; they both have their origin in the vagaries of ignorant men, and ere long, will share an equally ignominious fate.

Frank Wills presented his pattern book in 1856 to the building committee of the Anglican cathedral in Montreal as a matter of self-promotion. The book was produced with promotion in mind because its pages were organized in the fashion of U.S. domestic and ecclesiastical pattern books that illustrated an author’s own designs. This type of pattern book was more pragmatic than its British counterparts that were associated with the replication of British social values in the colonies. U.S. pattern book formats were engaged more in self-aggrandizement and the marketing of church-building in a commercial and unapologetic manner. I argue that the exchange of economic and symbolic capital between Wills and Bishop Fulford mutually increased the legitimacy of both parties. U.S. pattern books routinely included eclectic mixes of domestic and religious architecture, such as, A.J. Bicknell’s *Victorian Buildings* (1878). The mixture of
domestic and religious spaces within the covers of U.S. pattern books illustrated how sacred space was fused with secular space. The connectivity between sacred and secular spaces, coupled with the re-production of a variety of church imagery, contributed to the commercialization of churches. Pattern books that crossed the U.S. border into the Dominion contributed to a similar commercialization of church imageries.

The Ecclesiologist generally liked Wills’ design claiming that the church marked “an epoch in transatlantic ecclesiology”. The design was promoted beyond the borders of ecclesiastical interests. Coincident with the cathedral’s consecration in 1860, a perspective view was published in the Illustrated London News that gave the design international exposure and pronounced the building “the most beautiful specimen of ecclesiastical architecture in Canada, if not on the American Continent.” (fig. 2.17) 

Besides noting the free seats opened for the consecration ceremony, the newspaper article noted that construction costs were approximately £35,000. Once again, the church was modelled on St. Mary’s, Snettisham. The church’s inclusion of the rose window motif was typically thought of as French but its extensive use in major English twelfth and thirteenth century cathedrals, such as, Lincoln and York Minster is unmistakable. Indeed, the motif’s appropriation by English medieval architects was echoed in the nineteenth century by the re-appropriation of Gothic as an English invention. For that reason, a contemporaneous published account in the Illustrated London News showed how British architects Smith and Hertford had built a Neo-Gothic church for Protestant congregation in Nice, France (fig. 2.18). Its cruciform plan with crossing tower and elaborate finials on the tower, transepts and entrance gables was not a mainstay in pattern book visual imagery because it was expensive to construct. The added expense and expertise needed
to building the piers that supported a crossing tower was too costly a venture for the pattern books to promote widely. One of the only known crossing towers depicted in pattern books was included in Frederick Withers’ book *Church Architecture; Plans, Elevations, and Views of Twenty-One Churches* (1873).\(^{185}\)

### 2.5.2 Comparative Case Study: St. Simon and St. Jude, Tignish PEI

On August 19, 1860, Father Peter MacIntyre (1818-1891), later Bishop of Charlottetown, led an impressively long procession of religious and civic dignitaries to consecrate the small Roman Catholic parish church of St. Simon and St. Jude in Tignish, PEI (fig. 2.19).\(^{186}\) The last of eight children to parents of Scottish birth, Father MacIntyre was ordained the first resident priest in Tignish, an Irish-Catholic community living in a place that had been founded in 1799 by eight Acadian families moved from Malpeque, PEI. Locally in Tignish, the church was a visible disruption to the power of the Anglican Church in PEI because the building was the town’s first brick structure. The *Charlottetown Herald* summed up the situation of the Roman Catholics in PEI:

> [Father MacIntyre] saw before him a Catholic population – scattered over a country where to be a Catholic was to be intellectually, socially, and commercially at a disadvantage. There were no Catholic schools outside of Charlottetown, there was no Catholic filling a public office of any importance – indeed to be a Catholic was to be regarded with suspicion and distrust be one half of the population of the colony.\(^{187}\)

The construction of St. Simon and St. Jude’s church was thus, the effort of a closed community of Irish-Catholics, excepting the fact that their leader was a Scotsman whose parents hailed from Uist and Inverness. Local materials, including the foundation’s sandstone from Lot 7, a half-million locally produced bricks, as well as volunteer labour to haul those materials went into the crafting of the church.
In 1857, Father MacIntyre formed the building committee and charged them with completing the new church to replace the wooden structure deemed obsolete. He personally hired the architect Patrick Keely (1816-1896), an Irish immigrant practicing out of Brooklyn, New York. Keely was introduced to Father MacIntyre by the Reverend Sylvain-Ephrem Poirier, but the meeting was unlikely the sole cause for gaining the commission. The Irish-Catholic congregation at St. Simon and St. Jude must have gladly accepted Keely, whose family came from the “right” part of Ireland, Kilkenny in the south.

Keely ardently supported the Irish-born architect A.W.N. Pugin and advocated his architectural principles. Keely’s design for St. Simon and St. Jude reflected Pugin’s tenet that ornament need serve a constructional-cum-truthful function rather than obey a purely aesthetic wont. Keely took the principle to heart and produced a stark Neo-Gothic church with a central western tower, partially integrated into the nave that could in no way be accused of aesthetic excess. An economy of line gave the church a certain ‘minimalist’ elegance.

But, Keely was not only looking at Pugin’s architecture and principles as a model. Practicing in New York, he would have been acutely aware of the architect Richard Upjohn and his book *Upjohn’s Rural Architecture* (1852) that was published in New York. For that reason, St. Simon and St. Jude is not dissimilar to Upjohn’s Christ Church, Brooklyn (1841-2) and more similar to Upjohn’s original drawing of Dr. Pott’s Presbyterian Church, New York (1844). In addition, Keely economized on materials by using wood in imitation of stone in the arcades at Tignish to accompany the lath-and-plaster vaults. These were decidedly not Ecclesiological though that sort of architectural
precedent mattered less to the Roman Catholic Church than robust architectonic
references to the ancient world and Rome.

2.5.3 Comparative Case Study: St. Mary’s Roman Catholic Church (1899-1902), Indian
River, PEI

On August 4, 1896, St. Mary’s Roman Catholic Church in Indian River was
struck by lightning as the Reverend Monsignor D.J. Gillis stood on a nearby verandah
saying his rosary. Consequently, Monsignor Gillis instructed his architect William
Critchlow Harris (1854-1913) to re-build St. Mary’s church (fig. 2.20 and 2.21) like St.
Malachy’s at Kinkora, which featured an impressive groined ceiling of lightly stained
birch-wood. Harris adopted French Neo-Gothic based on the fashions occurring at the
time in Quebec, Britain, and the United States. Harris visited Montreal on several
occasions to inspect churches similar to his final design for St. Mary’s. St. Mary’s
presents itself as a case study in spite of its late construction date because of the enduring
affiliations with French culture and its opposition to the earlier construction in Tignish.

As exemplified by St. Mary’s church, Acadian culture endured in late nineteenth-
century PEI despite the appropriation of French possessions after the Treaty of Paris was
signed in 1763. Though the Anglican Church had thereafter gained a strong foothold on
the island thereafter, Roman Catholic immigration continued to arrive principally from
southern Ireland and Catholic areas of the Scottish Highlands. In addition, immigration
of Methodist, New Light Baptist, and Presbyterian organizations diluted Anglican
domiance. Furthermore, some local dissenter religious groups splintered into small but
strong factions which developed resilient identities on the island, such as, the 5,000
‘McDonaldites’ who became semi-independent from the Church of Scotland. A similar
resilience of Acadian culture appears in the French Neo-Gothic architecture of St. Mary’s Church.

Harris believed that the rounded forms used on the ceiling’s wood vault, and echoed in the rounded corner tower, improved acoustics. Thus, he was able to justify French style on technical grounds. The science of acoustics also justified Harris’s wooden vault system, which the architect argued would not have been achievable with an open-timber roof, such as, those illustrated in Raphael and J. Arthur Brandon’s *Open Timber Roofs of the Middle Ages* (fig. 2.22). Anglican church-builders who continued to refer to ecclesiological rules well into the late nineteenth century justified open roofs on symbolic grounds. The architectural firm of Cram, Goodhue, and Fergusson, who competed with and bested Harris for large-scale projects in the Maritimes argued that the taste associated with symbolism trumped the science of acoustics. The identities in rural PEI continued to be presented in symbolic and not necessarily scientific terms.

Harris’s attachment to acoustics certainly came from his personal skills as a musician. However, the verbal rhetoric concerning acoustics had a niche market within the broader pattern book discourse. For instance, the opening paragraph of the U.S. architect Charles P. Dwyer prescribed:

> In taking up the subject of church construction, there are some points worthy of particular attention; namely, the absolute necessity for hearing distinctly in every part of the building … and perfect accommodation of the auditory.¹⁹²

He proceeded to discuss the merits of designing a flow for people and arrangement of the set pieces in the church space, including the arrangement of the pulpit and galleries. But, Dwyer brought the narrative back to the flow of divine light and the audible aspects of worship as factors of salvation and improved society. In Dwyer’s estimation economy, as
well as technology, clearly constituted improved society. He crafted a small pattern book industry from the publication of a suite of books committed to showing a readership the method of building cheap, efficient buildings. Simplicity was the substitute for extravagance, and even his drawings demonstrate an economy of line. His books had no Picturesque illustrations and no historical overview of architectural periods. Instead, he offered an architect’s practical advice filtered through the social concerns of the day, including the “healthful” method of heating a church from below the floor boards and not by way of a stove set in the nave.

Summary

The construction of Neo-Gothic churches in the Maritimes and Lower Canada in the 1840s and 50s expressed the economy, politics, and patterns of public taste that were indicated in the pattern books. A significant component of this network was related to the dissemination of knowledge and taste constituted in the church pattern books imported from Britain. The growth of consumer society influenced the demand for variety in church aesthetics and the pattern books were symptoms of the new commercial practices.

The potency of Ecclesiology developed because print media, and the pattern books in particular, developed a raft of architectural principles that were marketed in terms of taste. Pugin’s principles of Neo-Gothic that favoured the association of religion and architecture legitimized and reified those architectural rules as though they were positive implements of the social order. Social control in the Dominion had been emulated British models. As a result, the robustness of the elevations, sections, and plans of medieval and medieval revival churches illustrated in the pattern books was due to their reassertion of British identity. The modelling of St. Anne’s Chapel and the Anglican
cathedral in Fredericton, New Brunswick on medieval churches in Britain were compelling examples.

The business of church-building and the consumption of the pattern books in Lower Canada and the Maritimes was constituted by an already established British identity that drew its power from the Anglican Church, which styled the Monarch as supreme ‘Defender of the Faith’. The Canadas’ description as a ‘Dominion’ was a compelling image because of the combination of religious and secular elements of society. Neo-Gothic doctrines conscripted history into commercialized modern lifestyle and pushed forward the renewal of production and consumption. In this sense, people identified themselves through taste, or more properly, fashion. The pattern books advertised taste as an instrument of improving one’s social standing except for the difficulty of realizing these promises in the Dominion where the ordinary public objected to people rising above their station in life. Thus, the main factor in pattern books’ consumption became focused upon science, efficiency, and discipline expressed in architectural terms as ecclesiology.

Church pattern books used high quality print and photolithographic techniques to meet market expectations. In essence, the production, distribution, and consumption of church pattern books was a serious business; authors had to divulge a good reason for writing a pattern book and making money was neither a professionally nor socially acceptable reason. As such, authors claimed to assist the greater good. Writing a preface to his [pattern] book Ancient English Ecclesiastical Architecture (1850), Frank Wills summed up the common motivations of pattern book authors:

…to give a few practical hints suited to this time and country, which may be of service to those who contemplate the erection of a House of God. The want of
some volume treating popularly on the above subject has long been felt. A taste for the study of Ecclesiology has been of late rapidly increasing. Volume after volume superbly illustrated has been issued from the English press, but most of these have been adapted for the use of professional architects, or of those who have devoted their leisure to the study of numerous examples around them. A mere glossary … is not sufficient to show the American student what an Ancient English Parish Church is… The present book is intended to meet this want.¹⁹⁴

Wills’ book purported to solve the problems experienced by American architectural students while also operating as a marketing device for its author. Though there is no reason to doubt Wills’ altruistic intent, it is also clear that book sales and thus commercial practice were firmly in the picture.

An important consideration in the next chapter is the way that groups of Anglicans constituted their privilege in the social structure of economy, particularly relevant to a pattern book economy and a church-building economy. The interconnection of a suite of social, economic, and political factors will be examined with respect to church-building in Ontario and Manitoba, as well as, the resultant uneven living conditions that emerged from capital development.
III. Property Ownership, Church-Building, and Pattern Book Economies in Ontario and Manitoba in the 1860s and 1870s

“A Christian nation without a religious establishment is a contradiction”
Bishop John Strachan, *A Sermon Preached at York, Upper Canada, Third of July 1825, on the Death of the Late Lord Bishop of Quebec*

“Canada has shown a remarkable amount of progress. We have the best canal system in the world and the best railway system. Notwithstanding that some parties said the C.P. railway would never earn sufficient to pay for the axel grease, the company was able to pay a dividend on the enormous capital it required to build the road. We must try to develop a national spirit. We must develop our resources.”
S.G. Curry, President, remarks at Annual Dinner for Toronto Architectural Sketch Club
*Canadian Architect and Builder* vol. 3 (1890), 12: 136

The Anglican Church in the Dominion attempted to use the mechanics of property ownership to leverage its privilege and prestige. Consequently, the Church used the same rhetoric that the Dominion’s governments and industries applied to procuring massive allotments of land. To unpack the political and economic apparatus behind these practices, which also appeared in the pattern books’ visual and verbal imagery, this chapter will examine the strong Anglican current in societal formation. A central theme is the commercial components of church-building in Ontario and Manitoba in the 1860s, and 70s, expressed through the methods of financing Anglican churches and the problematics around land ownership. A particular focus in this chapter will be the interaction of social privilege and economy as they influenced the deal-making processes of church-building in Toronto and Winnipeg. The deal-making processes that were involved in building a church were emblematic of the larger negotiations involved in Confederation.
Church officials adopted the language used by government and industry representatives that presumed the land to be ‘empty’ prior to European settlement. It is important to note that the process of procuring land was played out differently across the Dominion because settlement in Ontario and Manitoba occurred under treaty with Aboriginal people while settlement in British Columbia chiefly did not. Consequently, the social impact of church-building on First Nations in British Columbia is discussed in Chapter IV, while this chapter focuses on the acquisition of land in Ontario and Manitoba based on its value to European settlers. Nevertheless, that value was dependent upon concealing the history of Aboriginal peoples on the land while making space for white settlers. Thus, British settlers to Ontario and Manitoba were able to manufacture a ‘new’ visual history for the land beneath their churches. A chief purpose of that new visual history was to legitimize the appropriation of land using the authority invested in medieval architectural precedent presented in the pattern books.

The methodology of this chapter draws upon the recent publication by Pierre Bourdieu, *The Social Structures of the Economy* (2005), which studied the interactions of home buyers and selling agents. In the case of church pattern books, the commercial market and public taste had a greater influence over the spread of Anglican church-building than the state did, though I value Bourdieu’s methodological approach to the interface between producers and consumers.

The connection between property ownership and religious institution provides a method for studying the assertion of religion in the spectrum of Canadian economy, politics, and social systems. In particular, church-building, and the consumption of the pattern books, marked the social practices associated with the way religion was financed.
and imagined as a force of social cohesiveness. Beneath that imagined cohesiveness were rifts tearing at the seemingly smooth surface of some religious institutions and their congregations. Congregants argued about the way money was spent on their churches. The variety of Neo-Gothic church designs made available by the pattern books amplified the debates over the way churches should look. The situation contributed to tension at a crucial time when religious institution wanted to present a unified image to the public in order to appear deserving of the economic benefits of settling the land.

The close association between taste, finance, commerce, and property underlay the social formation in Ontario and Manitoba. Readers of the pattern books in the Dominion drew together the spread of taste and the mobility afforded by rail travel to help make claims on the land. For instance, the following passage from the book *Brick and Marble in the Middle Ages* (1855) written by the British architect George Edmund Street resonated with Ontario and Manitoba audiences:

> In these days of railways and rapid travelling there is scarcely any excuse for ignorance of Continental art. The most busy man finds some short holiday in the course of the year, and, if wise as well as busy, spends it not in quiet sojourn at home, but in active search of the picturesque, the beautiful, or the old, in nature or in art…

Street was encouraging Britain’s citizens to seek out and even rescue medieval churches, but readers of his book in Ontario and Manitoba were excited by the possibility of creating Picturesque settings for their Neo-Gothic churches that compared to the ones they saw in the books.

The readers of the pattern books were exposed to a second kind of citation of the past, which was found in authors’ references to each other. Thus, Street’s concluding remarks of his preface, which stated, “I cannot speak too highly of the assistance afforded
to the architectural student of Murray’s *Handbook of Northern Italy*: it is almost invariably correct…” was actually a literary device for legitimizing his own claims to architectural taste. Street’s claims typified those made by other pattern book authors who needed to legitimize their methodology.

A range of case studies will probe the network of factors surrounding church-building and the consumption of pattern books in Ontario and Manitoba. The cases include: the Anglican cemetery chapels of St. James the Less Cemetery and the Necropolis in Toronto; the seat of the Anglican diocese in Toronto, St. James’ Cathedral; and, Holy Trinity Church in Winnipeg. Comparative cases include Toronto’s Metropolitan Methodist Church and the ‘old’ and ‘new’ St. Andrew’s Presbyterian Churches. These churches were visible examples of the resistances to the so-called architectural ‘correctness’ that Anglican’s promoted in their pattern books. In addition, the case studies in this chapter will show how U.S. pattern books influenced a new species of Neo-Gothic church in Toronto and Winnipeg.

3.1 Anglican Church-Building Alongside Property Acquisition and Settlement Expansion in Ontario and Manitoba

The significance of property was expressed in Section 91 of the British North America Act of 1867, which established the legislative authority over “the Public Debt and Property” as its primary concern. Property was second only to “the Regulation of Trade and Commerce”, and “the raising of Money by any Mode or System of Taxation”, listed in sub-sections 91 (1), 91(2), 91(3) of the Act. Church-building and the advice given in the pattern books encouraged the appropriations of land that occurred on behalf of religion and governmental authorities. Even oblique references to Picturesque landscapes in the pattern books demonstrated quite clearly how churches in the Dominion
were expected to blend with the vista. Still more important in the pattern books was the reference to the commerce associated with the commercialization of aesthetics; that is, constructing the Picturesque in the material world was an expensive proposition.

These patterns of social and economic development contained in the British and the U.S. pattern books influenced the construction of churches in the Dominion. Thus, the pattern books that canonized visual components of the medieval past were inextricably connected to modern economies of the nineteenth-century. One of these new commercial practices was the railway, which offered the promise of modernization and acted as an instrument to legitimate removing Indigenous Peoples from their customary lands. Similarly, religion offered the promise of social improvement to veil assimilation. The rhetorics of travel, land, and spirituality were combined in CPR guidebooks that prompted travellers west to ‘See this world before the next’.

3.1.1 Material Representations of Spirituality

The churches that marked out British and European settlement in Ontario and Manitoba were the material representation of spiritual authority, even though the religious institutions struggled against government for their perceived ‘fair’ share of land. In practical terms, land was an essential component in church-building because property guaranteed the mortgage needed to build a church, in addition to providing an actual space for the building. Mortgages were the only large-scale forms of capital available to church-builders, followed by individual donations and periodic revenue from bazaars. Thus, church-builders, no less than railway companies who issued bonds to raise working capital, relied upon the services of land agents, bankers, insurers, and mortgage brokers, all of whom – like the pattern books themselves – were involved in the new
commercial practices of the nineteenth century. Thus, the economies of religion was dependant upon the economy of property.

In the 1860s and 70s, the economies in Ontario and Manitoba were caught in a boom and bust cycle, complicated by the shifting value of commodities, food, labour, and land. As a result, business was on the minds of religious leaders who considered the economy when timing new church buildings. For instance, the Bishop of Toronto claimed that, “the commercial depression …in 1857 [had] prostrated the whole country and paralysed the Church’s resources”. In poorer economies, the construction of new churches typically scaled back the amount of ornament or delayed the completion of non-essential architectural elements, including towers. More importantly, economic downturns generally coincided with an increase in the use of building plans available in pattern books; the expense of an architect’s original design probably appeared extravagant. Restricting the amount of ornament, and more importantly choosing which components of a church to postpone completion on, came into direct conflict with the pattern books advising builders to finishing the church in one campaign.

As a result of economic uncertainty, the Anglican Church in Ontario, no less than the rest of the Dominion, believed its survival depended upon expansion. Church officials legitimated the institution’s expansion as forming a positive effect on society. In reality, the expansion of religious institution and the acquisition of property for churches was, in many cases, a personal endeavour. Wealthy settlers donated land to their church, thereby exchanging economic capital for cultural, social, and spiritual capital.

For instance, a gift of land from D’Arcy Boulton (1759-1834) not only established the location for St. George’s Anglican Church, Toronto (John St. above
Queen St.; architect Henry Bower Lane, 1845) close to the family’s Grange estate, but it effectively made the church into a private family chapel. A brief description of the Boulton family will illustrate how the politics of church-building operated in Ontario. The Boulton family were members of the conservative and elite Tory-dominated government and they used clout to extend important positions to allies. As leaders of the so-called ‘Family Compact’, the family monopolized the Executive Council in Ontario, leaving the Legislative Assembly with little real power until Upper and Lower Canada were consolidated in 1841. D’Arcy Boulton’s son, William Henry Boulton (1812-1874), sat on the building committee of St. George’s Church and was elected its first churchwarden, serving between 1844 and 1848, indicating the reciprocal relationship between Church service freely given and social privilege. The awarding of the design contract to the architect Henry Bower Lane, a Boulton family relation, cemented the connection between Church, property, and privilege. The enlarged costs of constructing the small church, estimated at $24,000, demonstrated how privilege guided the expenditure of money; the Boulton’s would have no church that they attended, on land donated by them, appear less endowed than their social standing demanded.

As this early example illustrates, property and privilege were closely associated in the expansion of religion and church-building. The representations of church-building in the pattern books coincided with the imaging of choice allotments of property. Some British publications including Raphael and J. Arthur Brandon’s Parish Churches (1849) and George Truefitt’s Designs for Country Churches (1850) showed how valuable sectors of countryside were ‘open’ to the Anglican Church for possession and manipulation. The pattern book by the British architect William Eden Nesfield entitled, Specimens of
Medieval Architecture Chiefly Selected from Examples of the 12th and 13th Centuries in France and Italy (1862) made extensive use of bucolic landscape settings for church architecture, and the book by the U.S. architect Henry Hudson Holly entitled Church Architecture (1871) followed suit (fig. 3.1). In reality, the land available to the Anglican Church in the Dominion did not turn out to be as bucolic as the pattern books made it seem. The U.S. architect Frederick Withers’ pattern book entitled, Church Architecture: Plans Views and Perspectives of Twenty-One Churches (1873) alternated between providing Picturesque views his church designs and elevation drawings that enhanced the book’s professional character (fig. 3.2). Alternately, the U.S. architect Amos Bicknell, Victorian Buildings (1878) omitted Picturesque drawings from his book entirely, creating generic designs that presumably could be successful in any location. The omission is significant since most architects were conscious of the public’s desire to have new architecture respond to the natural and already-built environments. Bicknell compounded the incongruity between his designs and the environment by offering a great deal of technical data meant to assist builders including sample business contracts meant to assist clients.205

Land was integral to the church-building process and the pattern books echoed the sentiment. Government officials in the Dominion, however, actually diminished the amount of land that was initially supposed to accrue to religious institutions. As a result, churches either purchased property on the open market or received gifts of land from parishioners. This put Anglicans in an increasingly difficult situation. On the one hand, Anglican parishioners were expected to give generously to aid the expansion of the Church. On the other hand, large gifts of money and land were construed as secular
interference with the theological operations of the Church, derogatorily known as ‘voluntarism’. Conservative clergymen referred to ‘Voluntarism’ as “free trade that worked on the heretical principle that individuals could make religious decisions based on their own self-interest”.  

The Anglican Church was particularly upset about losing control of what amounted to millions of acres of land. These lands were generally referred to as the Clergy Reserves that Anglican officials believed had been set aside from settlement in order to satisfy religious development; the Clergy Reserves will be discussed in detail later in this chapter. The loss of the Clergy Reserves resulted in the strengthening of local fund-raising initiatives. For instance, the construction of the St. Paul’s Anglican church on Bloor St. in Toronto in 1873, whose parish was an offshoot of St. James’s Cathedral, resulted because “Mrs. Proudfoot organized a bazaar that netted $4,000… and the late W.A. Baldwin mortgaged his farm for $8,000 to complete the church”. Interestingly, the church-bazaars run by women’s auxiliaries raised significant funds on par with commercial enterprise, though the bazaars retained the public appearance of ‘ice-cream socials’.

Given the larger financial role of individuals in the financing of church-building, local businessmen became more vocal about the way churches should look. For instance, the newspaper editor and publisher John Ross Robertson printed extensive newspaper reports on new church constructions in Ontario. They were eventually published in six volumes as Robertson’s Landmarks of Toronto covering vast portions of the nineteenth and early decades of the twentieth centuries. His entry for St. Paul’s Anglican on Bloor St. juxtaposed the social practice of the elite churchgoer with the newly constructed church
building. His article painted a picture of the milieu among in Toronto’s privileged classes by noting that:

A walk through Rosedale glen, through the cemeteries, over the Don [river] and along its banks [that] will reveal … many persons that had discharged their religious duty by going to church in the morning and leaving their pews vacant for the common people in the evening. But it was a pleasant and refreshing sight to see little children merrily skipping over the beautiful lawns in innocent play, while the contented mother luxuriously enjoyed the picture from the open window of a richly furnished drawing-room.\textsuperscript{211}

Channelling the Divine through the Picturesque, he continued:

With all this loveliness of nature attuning the spirit to worship the Power that created it, nothing is lost by entering a beautiful church where the classic surroundings complement the outside natural beauty. And St. Paul’s is an attractive one.\textsuperscript{212}

An architectural assessment of St. Paul’s followed, which began:

The building is a Gothic stone structure and conveys an impression of massiveness and solidity, although it is not a large building; its outline is well proportioned and it is an ideal structure, such a one as is frequently met with in the land across the sea – the real home of the Church of England.\textsuperscript{213}

This final comment cut right through the anxiety in the Canadas around issues of authenticity, as though something essential had been lost in the translation of the gothic ‘style’ across the Atlantic that also diminished the authority of the established Church in the Dominion.

Robertson had an extensive book collection indicating the likelihood that Ontario businessmen gleaned their knowledge of architecture from imported books. These businessmen sat on church-building committees alongside local builders and architects who supplied the practitioner’s perspective. The variety of economic perspectives produced a degree of disharmony at committee meetings. The situation is roughly comparable to regional political pressure disrupting the process of Confederation to
“found a great nation, with strong central governments having dominion from sea to sea”.

Grudgingly, the federal initiative recognized the local political voices even though nationalists believed in the “subordinate stature” of provincial governments “exercising merely municipal powers.”

The same thing was happening on a smaller scale in church-building where local building committees complied with Gothic Revival standards but resisted ‘standardization’ by adopting pursuing aesthetic variety.

3.1.2 Britain’s Parish Church Model in Rural Ontario

During the 1860s and 70s British rural parish churches acted as models for a variety of ecclesiastical buildings in the Dominion. Among the several reasons for advocating parish churches as models for the colonies were economic and practical considerations, which included lowering the cost of materials and the amount of skilled labour needed to complete the job.

A popular parish church model was the thirteenth-century fabric of St. Michael’s in Long Stanton, Cambridgeshire. The idyllic depiction of Long Stanton in a natural setting in Raphael and J. Arthur Brandon’s pattern book entitled Parish Churches (1848) set a standard for the Picturesque among advocates for the Gothic Revival. For instance, Frank Wills’ Ancient Ecclesiastical Architecture (1850) clearly borrowed the wooded landscape setting employed by Brandon. Typically, these designs included a west end gable surmounted by a bell-cote that was flush with the western façade. Usually, a round window flanked by a group of simple lancets was housed in the western gable. The repetition of subtle variations in different pattern books and its adoption across Canada was a powerful combination.
As already noted in Chapter Two, St. Anne’s Chapel, Fredericton, New Brunswick by Franks Wills (fig. 3.3) was aesthetically related to a collection of other parish churches in Canada that had been marketed in the pattern books. Included in the grouping of parish churches that have low walls, steep-pitched roofs, and a single, double or triple bell-cote integrated into the west wall are the Anglican Church of the Messiah, rang du Bord de l’eau, Sabrevois, Quebec (c.1855) (fig. 3.4) and St. John the Evangelist, Oxford Mills, Ontario (1869) (fig. 3.5). The arrangement was repeated in timber at St. Mary’s Church (1865) New Westminster, BC built by architect J.C. White. St. Stephen’s-in-the-Fields at the corner of College and Bellevue, Toronto (1856) by Thomas Fuller which combined the silhouette with rich constructional polychrome by using brick and stone.

The parish model-type used at St. Anne’s appeared in a variety of pattern books which included a design for an iron church published in the second series of Instrumenta Ecclesiastica (1856) (fig. 3.6), this one authorized by the Ecclesiological Society. It also appeared in Design no. 10 in Frederick Withers’s Church Architecture (1873) (fig. 3.2). The bell-cote silhouette was still popular in 1880 when Amos Bicknell’s company published a compilation book of other architects’ designs entitled Specimen Book of One Hundred Architectural Designs, Showing Plans, Elevations, and Views of Suburban Houses, Villas, Sea-Side and Campground Cottages, Homesteads, Churches and Public Buildings (1880) that included another of Frederick Withers’s renditions of the distinctive gable. The Rev. F.J. Jobson published a scaled-down version minus the bell-cote in a design for a village chapel to be used by Wesleyan Methodists in Chapel and School Architecture as Appropriate to the Buildings of Nonconformists (1850) (fig. 3.7).
3.1.3 The Financial Structure of Churches in Ontario and Manitoba after Confederation

Land transactions occurring subsequent to Confederation continued the connection between religious and secular society. Lawyers, businessmen, and builders often sat on the boards of church-building committees and provided their professional service free of charge to the church. These professionals could afford to donate their time since they had profited by the provinces’ new economies. In addition, donors that provided large lump sum payments to assist church-building had made their money in land speculation, business mergers, and trade. Mixed in with their philanthropy were the realities of giving in a material world because large donations increased one’s social status. Religion received a lion’s share of these donations because people invested in it the hope of ordering society and winning salvation.

The creation of order in society involved obtaining property by legal means, even though the legal system privileged capitalism while advertising democracy. European and British settlers argued the illegitimacy of Aboriginal property claims by refusing to recognise the validity of the Aboriginal social and economic structure. The situation was no less complicated in the dealings negotiated between settlers and banking institutions. Because the members of a church-building committee knew that banks tended to foreclose on property in times of poor economies, it became essential for land to be legally acquired before a church’s construction began. The farm foreclosures in Ontario subsequent to the 1873 Depression were a poignant example of the misfortune visited upon mortgagees unable to meet their interest payments.²¹⁷

The rising price of land was generally favourable to religious institutions on account of their long-term financial outlook even though the prices were subject to the
general uncertainty of price fluctuations. For instance, the value of the property at the corner of Bloor and Avenue Rd. in Toronto that had been acquired for the Anglican Church of the Redeemer (architects Smith and Gemmell, 1878) nearly doubled from its $10,000 purchase price only a decade prior. The increase was attributed to the “rapid enlargement and improvement of the city.”

Land speculation and rising property values had become problematic for the Church of England in the Dominion even before Confederation. This impact was most apparent in the Anglican Church’s loss of the Clergy Reserves. The Clergy Reserves represented approximately 1.3 million acres of land, interspersed throughout the Dominion but consolidated in the Prairies, which had been set aside for the Protestant Church in the Constitution Act of 1791. Despite the recognized importance of religion in society, public opinion was generally unwilling to support the Church of England’s claim to millions of dollars worth of land. Despite decades of legislative and public battles over the Clergy Reserves, the situation had been settled by 1854 largely in the government’s favour. The lands were sold through the government’s agent, the Canada Company, but only a small portion of its revenue, £245,000, accrued to the combined coffers of the leading religious institutions in the Dominion. An editorial in The Church objected and lamented that:

the Church of England in Canada [was] … deprived of her unquestionable rights, [thus] what ecclesiastical property in the empire is anywhere safe? Should her revenues be sacrificed in Canada, because a real or presumed majority demand it, can they, with some weight of argument and high moral influence be preserved in Ireland?

The enforced sharing of the proceeds from the sale of the Clergy Reserves paralleled the negotiated unification of Confederation. The government’s political power enforced a
settlement on the Anglican Church’s potential ability to serve its members by arguing in favour of the ‘common interest’ of the general population in the Dominion.\textsuperscript{224}

When the Clergy Reserves were rescinded the material expansion of the Anglican Church began to depend more fully upon funds received from specialized Anglican organizations in Britain including the Society for the Promotion of Christian Knowledge and the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel in Foreign Parts. However, these institutions eventually withdrew financial support causing the Anglican Bishop of Toronto John Strachan (1778-1867), for instance, to ask for money from local businessmen in Toronto to finish the construction of St. James’ Cathedral. This put the bishop in a difficult position because he had earlier accused the laity of propagating a “monstrous robbery” by secularizing the Clergy Reserves.\textsuperscript{225}

Despite the profound change to the revenue stream available to religious institutions, numerous new churches were built in Ontario and Manitoba. The rescission of the Clergy Reserves placed the Anglican Communion, no less than other denominations, in a precarious financial situation as a purchaser of the properties it believed were freely due. The amount of money expended on new church construction in the decades after official Confederation must have created the appearance of an ‘industry’ for church-building. It appeared this way to John Ross Roberston, editor of the Toronto Telegram, who commented that commercial endeavour was helping to build the Dominion into a Christian, and Picturesque, nation. His newspaper recorded the connection between taste, lifestyle, and churches in its description of St. Peter’s Anglican Church on Carlton:

… a modern English Gothic church with such proportions and offsets that is rather picturesque in appearance. It partakes of the cleanliness and neatness of
that section of the city in which it is located. There is an assimilation of property and people… that determines the architectural condition of living. Neat cleanly and cultured people will have homes and surroundings correspondingly superior. The same rule applies to churches, to that even the outside appearance of a church edifice is… indicative of the kind of people who attend it or support it.\textsuperscript{226}

### 3.1.4 Tariffs on Imported Books and Pattern Book Consumption

The Government of Canada collected revenue from the wholesaling of land as well as from trade imbalances and tariffs. Protective tariffs on imported goods increased the government’s treasury even though there existed virtually no social programming to enhance the lives of its citizens.\textsuperscript{227} Instead, the tariffs were meant to encourage local manufacture, though results were mixed and rising imports continued apace.\textsuperscript{228}

The protective tariffs placed on some categories of imported books did not appreciably affect the consumption of pattern books in Ontario, Manitoba, or other regions of Canada.\textsuperscript{229} The price of books in Ontario, for instance, marginally increased but it did not discourage consumption of imported pattern books nor did it encourage local production of them. Indeed, Ontario’s printing presses continued to print all manner of other printed mater including textbooks, newspapers, and travel journals; reading audiences in the Dominion expected that more ‘serious’ forms of knowledge came from reliable publishers in Britain and Europe.

The libraries of Ontario’s architects and builders were lined with imported architectural reference material and treatises no less than pattern books. In the 1840s, the Kingston, Ontario builder-turned-architect William Coverdale (1828-84) had owned sixty-three pattern book publications on subjects covering civic, religious, and domestic building.\textsuperscript{230} Thirty years later, architects working in Ontario were still collecting pattern books. For instance, the library at the architectural partnership of William Storm and Fred
Cumberland contained an extensive suite of pattern books purchased between the 1840s and 70s. These books included the Ecclesiological Society’s *Instrumenta Ecclesiastica* (1847), Frank Wills’s *Ancient English ecclesiastical architecture and its principles, applied to the wants of the church at the present day* (1850), Raphael and J. Arthur Brandon’s *Open Timber Roofs* (1849) and *An Analysis of Gothick Architecture: Illustrated by a Series of Upwards of Seven Hundred Examples of Doorways, Etc.* (1873), as well as, William Butterfield’s *Elevations, Sections, and Details, of Saint John Baptist Church, at Shottesbrooke, Berkshire* (1844) and James Fergusson’s *Illustrated handbook of architecture* (1855). This suite of books was produced in Britain. The British pattern books largely dispensed inspiration, education, and a system of British taste. The British system of taste upheld the social and economic privilege that Anglican church-builders associated with their ‘invention’ of Ecclesiological Gothic architecture.

During and after the 1870s, the offices of William Storm (formerly Cumberland and Storm) began to invest in U.S. pattern books, including Bicknell’s *Victorian Village* (1873) and Edward Jenkins’ *The Architect’s Legal Handbook* (1880). The U.S. pattern books provided concrete design ideas, technical knowledge, and a connection to a large market for ecclesiastical architecture developing south of the Dominion’s border.

A particularly interesting volume in the Cumberland/Storm library was Edward Ryde’s *A General Text Book, for the Constant Use and Reference of Architects, Engineers, Surveyors, Solicitors, Auctioneers, Land Agents, and Stewards, in all their Several and Varied Professional Occupations: and for the Assistance and Guidance of Country Gentlemen and Others Engaged in the Transfer, Management, or Improvement of Landed Property: Containing Theorems, Formulae, Rules, and Tables in Geometry, Mensuration*,
and Trigonometry (1854). Their ownership of this book clearly indicated that the firm’s services extended beyond architectural design to include property valuation. As late as the 1870s, even well known architects in Ontario and Manitoba needed to augment their income by acting as engineers and property valuators.

3.1.5 Church-Building and Commercial Expansion in Toronto, Ontario

A significant factor in church-building processes in the Toronto area was the city’s commercial expansion that began between 1820 and 1840, and continued more or less unabated throughout the century.\(^{232}\) Toronto’s mercantile emphasis shifted from grain distribution to entrepreneurial activity, meaning that banking became a more important part of the economic and social terrain. For instance, the Bank of Upper Canada in Toronto (est. 1821) assisted the urban financial growth that created a pool of potential philanthropists willing to support local church-building enterprise. With a deeper investment support structure, many affluent Toronto neighbourhoods developed further from the urban industrial lands and closer to the centre of commerce.

Church-building in Toronto paralleled the rise and fall of the Ontario economy because church leaders astutely followed local economies. During an economic peak in 1854, a correspondent of the Montreal Herald (1811-57) noted the “beauty of the principal streets [of Toronto] has been very greatly increased [because] St. James Church had been completed.”\(^{233}\) By the economic apex that started in 1870, Toronto believed itself graced with an important variety of architectural works from every major religious denomination. Leading up to that point, Anglicans built St. James’ Cathedral (King and Church St.; architect Fred Cumberland, 1850-54; tower architect: Henry Langley, 1870-74), Holy Trinity (Trinity Square; architect Henry Bower Lane, 1847), St. Stephen’s-in-
the-Fields (College St.; architect Thomas Fuller, 1858; re-built after fire by architect Henry Langley, 1865), St. Peter’s (Carlton St.; architects Gundry and Langley, 1865), and the Church of the Redeemer (Bloor and Avenue Rd.; architects Smith and Gemmell, 1878) in a few square miles either side of Yonge St in Toronto. Presbyterians built Knox Church (Queen St. near Yonge; architect William Thomas, 1847), St. Andrew’s Church (King and Simcoe; architect William George Storm, 1874-75), and the second Cooke’s Church (Queen and Mutual St.; architect William Thomas, 1857), Leslieville Church (Queen and Carlaw St.; architect unknown, 1878), and Central Presbyterian Church (Grosvenor and Vincent St.; architects Gordon and Hellwell, 1877). Roman Catholics built St. Michael’s Cathedral (Bond and Shuter St.; architect William Thomas, 1848; tower architect Henry Langley, 1867-70), and St. Basil’s at St. Michael’s College (St. Joseph St.; architect William Hay, 1855-6). Not to be outdone, the Methodists built Metropolitan Methodist Church (Richmond St.; architect Henry Langley, 1870), Elm St. Methodist Church (Elm St.; architect unknown, 1862), Carlton St. Methodist Church (Carlton St.; architect William G. Storm, 1876), and Sherbourne St. Methodist Church (Sherbourne St.; architects Langley and Burke). The Baptist body built Jarvis Street Baptist Church (Jarvis and Gerrard St.; architect Edmund Burke, 1875). This list of mostly Neo-Gothic churches includes those Christian denominations representing the largest share of the population and, to remain chronologically consistent to the layout of the chapters of this thesis, excludes the numerous churches constructed after 1880.234

Each of the commencement dates of these construction projects in Toronto coincided with Ontario’s rising economic performance.235 Still, church-builders approached the construction of new churches pragmatically and not without a degree of
apprehension. These tensions generally evaporated after the churches were consecrated, a moment which signalled the congregation’s debt-free status.

3.1.6 Material Growth in Toronto after 1867

The material growth of the Anglican Church in Toronto no less than in other parts of Ontario and Manitoba had a financial component that was objectionable in principle to some of its worshippers. Nevertheless, the practice was chiefly condoned because churches needed money to survive. Anglican worshippers complained about the economic costs but accepted the rough balance of benefits and concessions. Congregations had to reconcile the idea that organized religion had a ‘price-tag’ while salvation was freely given.

The cost of religion was most visible in the controversy over pew rental, which equated economic capital with preferential seating, social status, and superior sightlines to the altar. This was especially true in large churches with longitudinal-axes that seated six or eight hundred worshippers. In other words, wealthy individuals visibly expressed their social status by paying for visibly better seating arrangements than the poor could afford. The practice was normalized in society to the extent that the poorer classes sitting in the rear of St. James’ Anglican Cathedral in Toronto dare not whisper their discontent for fear of being heard.236

At the same time there was a growing movement to offer ‘free’ religion, reflected in the practice of offering seats in churches at no cost. Numerous small churches across Canada were built without pew rents. Even in Toronto, the church of Holy Trinity was built with the express purpose of opening the seats “free and unappropriated forever” because a donation of $5,000 from an anonymous lady in England stipulated it as such.237
Alongside the controversy over pew rents was the related but usually less recognised confluence of expense and social ritual that pertained to burial.

3.1.7 Case Study: The Burial Chapels of St. James-the-Less and the Toronto Necropolis

The burial chapels of St. James-the-Less (1857-61) and the Toronto Necropolis (1872) served identical purposes and exhibited strikingly similar Neo-Gothic characteristics (figs. 3.8 and 3.9). Both chapels were characterized as High Victorian Gothic, an architectural fashion that marketed a subtly new kind of architectural massiveness and simplicity.

High Victorian Gothic departed from the Neo-Gothic aesthetic offered by Pugin’s and the Ecclesiologists’ archaeological Neo-Gothic thereby enabling its promoters, including the well-known British architect George Street, to appear to have re-engineered Neo-Gothic for a progressive church-building public. In a long lecture published in 1852 in the Ecclesiologist, Street referred to the progressiveness of High Victorian Gothic as ‘development’ in which he described a complicated suite of new ideas in proportion, simple ornament, European source material, and massing that challenged the archaeological precedent advocated by Pugin.

Aspects of High Victorian Gothic were transmitted to Toronto particularly in the Anglican chapel of St. James-the-Less awarded to the architects Fred Cumberland and George Storm. This burial chapel was organized around the architectural principles Street had propounded regarding an aesthetic emphasis on horizontality. Cumberland and Storm emphasized the low walling at St. James-the-Less by creating a reciprocal relationship with the low rolling hills of the surrounding cemetery. In addition, the church’s streamlined exterior followed Street’s concept that the Neo-Gothic was malleable. The
design was innovative because of a mechanism that allowed the coffin to be raised and lowered through the floor of the chancel at the east end to an awaiting horse-drawn hearse. Aesthetically and structurally, a good comparison to St. James-the-Less is Street’s small church at Frisby, Lincolnshire (1858), which used freestone instead of the architect’s trademark polychromy. John Ross Robertson noted the characteristics of High Victorian Gothic at St. James-the-Less by describing, “the walls [sic] of smooth, though unornamental brick, [sic] pierced on each side with three or four spade-shaped orifices tapering funnel wise to the little trefoil windows.”

Another influence on Cumberland and Storm was the writings of John Ruskin. This warned about the surface, structural, and machine-made modes of deception in architecture; respectively, these included the painted wood masquerading as marble, slim masonry details deceptively appearing to support weight, and metals supporting masonry where stone would suffice. Ruskin summed up the connections between beauty and taste by noting that in forgetting the principle of truth in architecture “lies half the dignity or decline of every art and act of man”. In addition, there was some interest in following medieval precedent by having variety in the design of the corbels, particularly those that support the interior wall posts. These corbels match across the nave and chancel but change as they progress toward from west to east.

Strong comparisons exist between the St. James chapel and the parish church models contained in Raphael and J. Arthur Brandon’s Parish Churches (1848) and George Truefitt’s Designs for Country Churches (1850)(fig. 3.10). The strong corner tower arrangement prominently displayed in the pattern books was echoed in the corner tower of St. James-the-Less, which was “strongly broad at the base and taper[ed]
gracefully to a thin spire.\textsuperscript{241} Its design was not dissimilar to U.S. models including St. Paul’s Church, Brookline, Mass. and St. Thomas’ Church, Hanover, N.H (fig. 3.11).

Similar architectural methods were applied to the Toronto Necropolis, built by Henry Langley. He used brick construction in a different a manner, but remained consistent to George Street’s published opinions about building town churches.\textsuperscript{242} Following Street’s advice, Langley used brick in order to achieve a symbiosis with neighbouring domestic and commercial buildings. Langley did not conform to Street’s constructional polychromy, multicoloured brick patterning, but a similar effect was achieved in the horizontal design used in the slate roof.

The connection between the Toronto chapels and the British pattern books was intensified because of their common deployment and marketing of the Picturesque. Burial at St. James Anglican cemetery was expensive but the surroundings were beautifully landscaped. Burial customs meant that the “handsome little sanctuary, enshrined in a grove of low-growing oaks and maples and flowering shrubs…”\textsuperscript{243} came at a price that few people considered objectionable. People may have objected to renting one’s pew in church, but few people resisted the state-supported privatization of burial. By contrast, the burial grounds of the non-sectarian Necropolis were crowded, less bucolic – but ‘free’.\textsuperscript{244}

Underlying the two chapels’ aesthetic similarities were profound social differences.\textsuperscript{245} Langley’s design for the Necropolis Chapel indicated the architect was aware of the newest designs in crematory chapels, which became the subject of a book by Albert C. Freeman’s entitled, \textit{Crematoria in Great Britain and Abroad} (1906). A review of Freeman’s book appeared in \textit{The Canadian Architect and Builder} (1888-1908)
periodical, noting that “the illustrated examples are English, European, and American”;

the style was Neo-Gothic.

The reviewer expressed the contemporary fears associated with disease, remarking that “the modern revival of cremation has a sanitary motive”. Worms, which propagated beyond the confines of the cemetery, were believed to carry disease so cremation was hailed as the sanitary alternative. However, the sanitization/sanctification of the dead came with a price tag. The reviewer of Crematoria expressed frustration and dissatisfaction with the added expense of so-called ‘modern’, ‘improved’, and ‘socially responsible’ burial. He resisted the traditional notion of the Picturesque Gothic Revival by arguing instead that Neo-Gothic was suited to crematory chapels because they each exhibited “gloom unenlightened by sentiment.” He intended to legitimize the claim that added burial expense associated with cremation was little more than ‘fashion’ designed to encourage people to part with their money. The reviewer claimed to read beyond the Picturesque to expose the commodification of modern burial by concluding, “one would like to revert to the old order of things and bury the urn”.

The Toronto Necropolis may have been aesthetically British but its operation was economically and socially derivative of U.S. models. Crematoria’s reviewer even observed that U.S. pricing schemes were being used to sell crematory interment spaces in columbaria, such as those on the inside walls at the Toronto Necropolis. Fresh Ponds Crematory in New York, which charged “in the upper row all around the building $10 each, in the next row $15, and then $20 and $25” appeared to be the model adopted in Toronto.
3.2 Financial Challenges for Anglican-Church Building in Ontario

The Church Society of the Diocese of Toronto shaped the financial operations of the Anglican churches in Ontario. The Church Society was an ecclesiastical corporation resembling the structure of secular bodies’ central boards and local committees. Its chief model in Britain was the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel in Foreign Parts. Businessmen sitting on the Church Society’s board formulated a plan to counteract the loss of revenue by commuting colonial missionaries’ salaries through the corporation in order to build up its ‘vested rights’. These ‘vested rights’ ensured a minimum amount of compensation when the Clergy Reserves were finally rescinded. The Anglican Church’s employment of a corporate strategy indicated how finance was the “door through which the laity entered the inner courts of the church”.

The corporate model adopted by religious institutions also involved procuring short and long-term credit. Short-term credit helped congregations pay builders and suppliers during the years that pew rents or donations accumulated to pay down principal and interest. Part of the reason that Anglican building programs became more complicated after 1840 was the availability of debt financing that used land as loan collateral.

The availability of short-term finance, from either private or banking sources, meant that building committees had time to consider aesthetics more fully. Property played a significant role in these developments. Before the union of the Upper and Lower Canadas in 1840, the Colonial Office had restricted the use of land to secure loans in the Dominion fearing that agencies might finance industrial growth that would damage British enterprise. The coincidence of several factors culminated in the issuance of
credit secured against land in the Dominion. Religious organizations began to take advantage of the new policies. The economic value of usable acreage in Ontario and Manitoba, for instance, changed when property owners began borrowing against their land. In addition, landowners – including religious institutions – deepened their identity with the land once property began to serve as collateral for loan capital.

This capital routinely exceeded the value of the property acting as collateral for several reasons. First, churches were considered excellent credit risks because lenders imagined Anglican churches to be backed by the considerable resources of the Church of England. Second, and perhaps more importantly, there was a general belief in the future value of property in urban Ontario and Manitoba even though the Canada Company and other agents were encountering some difficulties in selling rural plots. The situation is described by the example of the small Anglican congregation building St. Peter’s church on Carlton Ave. in Toronto that procured a mortgage of $3,700 in 1864 on property that cost them $700. On the other hand, the myth of financially secure churches was periodically tested. For instance, in 1878 the Central Presbyterian Church in Toronto accumulated such large debt, amounting to $30,000 from building its church and school-house, that the congregation was faced with ruin. The church’s pastor left for New Jersey and a congregation that built him a manse (resident home) costing $15,000. Nearly a decade later, Central Presbyterian still had a “debt on the church in the shape of a mortgage held by the Star Life Assurance Company, London, England, amounting to £5,000 sterling” which drew interest of six percent and necessitated the congregation to raise $110 per week in order to meet its expenses.
To avoid these sorts of problems, Anglican church-building committees used their personal influence with bankers. These privileged connections are illustrated by the following biographies of some of St. James’ Cathedral building-committee members, notably John Beverley Robinson, Frederick Widder, Thomas Helliwell, Peter Paterson, and Charles Albert Berczy. John Beverley Robinson (1791-1863) was a respected lawyer, judge and conservative politician. He sat as the cathedral’s building committee chair. As the ‘unofficial figure-head’ of the ‘Family Compact’ Robinson used his privilege to develop close personal ties with the Anglican bishop of Toronto, John Strachan, as well as, the Lieutenant Governor Sir Peregrine Maitland (1777-1854). Frederick Widder (1801-1865) became an official of the British land and colonizing venture, the Canada Company, upon his immigration from England. Active in the St. George’s Society and lay vice-president of the Anglican Diocesan Church Society, he also became involved in railway promotion and brought the Canada Company’s province-wide operations under his control in Toronto. Thomas Helliwell (1795-1862) was a successful merchant of Yorkshire descent who developed brewery and milling businesses, founding Todmorden Mills in Toronto. With his son, Thomas Jr., he contributed to the commercial development of the Don Valley and the Toronto wharf through their ownership of waterfront lots. Peter Paterson (1807-1883) was a merchant and capitalist of Scots origin who owned a successful hardware and dry goods business in Toronto. He incorporated the British American Fire and Life Assurance Co. (1834), founded the Consumer’s Gas Co. (1847), developed the Canada Permanent Building and Savings Society (1855, later the Canada Permanent Mortgage Co.), held directorship of the Bank of Upper Canada (1861), and was active in the St. Andrew’s Society. Charles Albert Berczy (1794-1858),
born in Newark, Niagara-on-the-Lake, Upper Canada, was involved in business, law, and politics. During and after the 1837 Rebellion, Berczy had been employed by Lieutenant Governor Sir Francis Bond Head to provide correspondence about the designs of foreign and domestic enemies. He was director of the Bank of Canada, president of the Toronto Building Society, and founder of the Toronto, Simcoe, and Lake Huron Rail-Road Co.\textsuperscript{260} The list of these accomplishments indicates the Anglican Church’s close relationship with the new commercial practices forming society.

3.2.1 The Context of Re-Constructing Toronto’s St. James Cathedral

Church-building enterprise in Toronto expanded and consolidated in tandem with the local commercial initiatives. Historically, the growth of Toronto’s commercial sector up to the 1870s resulted from a combination of speculative and mercantile endeavours, both of them intimately related to the railway connecting Ontario to the western regions and northern U.S.\textsuperscript{261} Successful speculative investment brought faster returns and astute businessmen were quick to recognise which sorts of gambles to take.\textsuperscript{262} For instance, owning railway company shares was not as lucrative an investment as owning businesses that supplied railway construction. The railway’s suppliers routinely overcharged, causing every mile of Canadian track to exceed U.S. costs by nearly 85%.\textsuperscript{263}

Railway managers often overpaid for services and supplies because of the pressure to complete contracts on, or ahead, of schedule. Public scrutiny of rail projects, not always favourable in nature, contributed to the pressure to speed construction at any cost and resulted in some questionable dealings. For instance, the railway contractor Samuel Zimmerman, whom John Ross Robertson celebrated as the hero that built 120 miles of the Great Western track before his accidental death in the Desjardins Canal
disaster in 1857, purposefully slowed work on the Great Western main line in order to negotiate a $470,000 bonus to be paid to him for its timely completion. An additional scandal at the Great Western that was peripherally connected to church-building included a $10,000 bribe accepted by the railway’s chief engineer and former architect of St. James’ Anglican Cathedral, Frederick Cumberland. The taint of scandal ruined Cumberland’s engineering career and prevented his return to the architectural profession.

Governments promised economic development by promoting ‘progress’ through the railway expansion. The image of the railway’s social benefits was publicly accepted even though most railroads went bankrupt before initial investors were even re-paid their principal. CPR guidebooks made locomotives appear eternal even though design styles changed every few years. The pattern books did the same with church imagery. For instance, church-towers were non-liturgical architectural forms that the books advertised as an eternal symbol of religion even though their designs fluctuated with current fashions. For instance, the report on a new Anglican church in Brampton Ontario, published in 1854 in the Anglo-American Magazine, focused almost exclusively on the building’s 80- foot tower by noting its “bold and fearless outline, expressive… of dignity and humility [and]… strength”. This image of strength was contradicted periodically by the Anglican Church’s assertions of being in economic ‘crisis’.

Church towers were important social icons, though they tended to be left incomplete because of the lack of funds. The belief in the integrity of the Anglican faith and the visual impact of church towers remained unspoiled by the lack of towers brought to completion. Thus, there remains the question of the measurable influence on society of completed church-towers. In other words, to what degree could one measure the social
theories revolving around Jeremy Bentham’s panoptic prison, no less than the threat of
damnation everlasting, for their true social effect? In some sense the question is moot
because faith – like taste – sustained its potency among those already converted, but a
deeper analysis is nevertheless worth pursuing.269 For this reason, the presence of St.
James’ Cathedral at the corner of King and Church Streets, opened in 1853 twenty years
before the completion of its massive tower, represented an imaginary ‘clean’ Toronto that
existed in principle if not in fact.

St. James’ was situated a few blocks north of a sector of the city that religious
authorities thought needed supervision: Toronto’s first wharf. In the 1850s, the Grand
Trunk Railway expansion brought immigration and commercial goods traffic to Toronto
but it also brought what proper society termed ‘undesirable’ people and smuggled
goods.270 Low-cost dwellings and drab merchant shops (whose landlord was none other
than the Anglican Church) extended north of the wharf and surrounded the broad,
manicured church grounds. The affluent residences stretched further north of the
cathedral along tree-lined Jarvis and Sherbourne Streets. The cathedral’s space appeared
to be encroached upon by this ‘undesirable’ element, which the church benefited from
financially. The cathedral was, thus, situated between affluent, established Torontonians
and many poor immigrants, especially those from Ireland, travelling in steerage on ships
arriving in the wharf. The poor became the cheap labour manufacturing, in some cases,
the expensive goods that collectively helped to maintain the affluence of many Anglican
families for several generations.

The cathedral of St. James’ represented affluent society, despite the official
rhetoric that religion was the preserve of the masses. The cathedral was the seat of Bishop
John Strachan’s (1839-1867) Diocese of Toronto, where Synod affairs that signalled religious union and self-governance began in 1853. By 1874, the completion of the tower and spire marked a significant point in Torontonians’ identification with the economies in major European and American cities. The metaphoric ‘view’ from St. James’s tower allowed Torontonians to see their city, and themselves, in the cosmopolitan manner they had imagined was true. The considerable forces of religion and economy, in modernity, intersected metaphorically at the church tower, especially in terms of identity-making. The following case study probes the visual connections between short-term credit finance and the civic symbolism of the church-tower.

3.2.2 Case Study: St. James’ Cathedral, Toronto

During Toronto’s Great Fire of 1849, an ember had ignited the wooden spire of St. James’ Church causing it to fall into the body of the cathedral. Within two weeks, the congregation organized a new building committee, which outlined and debated several issues about the cathedral’s re-construction. At issue in building committee meetings was the proposed sale of the churchyard located along King Street for commercial development. With $5,000 insurance money matched by congregants’ donations, the building committee still needed significantly more funds.

The cathedral’s re-construction was relatively rapid; the nave was completed in 1852, well in advance of the 1857 recession. However, the internal debates over architect, cost, and design showed that the construction process was not straightforward. The re-building efforts at St. James’ became a locus of identification even for non-Anglican Torontonians. In February 1850, Bishop John Strachan tried to auction eight city lots on King Street owned by the church, measuring 26 feet by 120 feet, without the
permission of the church’s board. The auction was blocked by a collection of incensed citizens, many of which had no religious affiliation aside from the belief in the sanctity of burial in churchyards. The building committee backed by considerable support in the secular community opted instead for saving money by re-using the burned cathedral’s foundation. Architecturally, the re-use of a burned foundation was risky. So the well-respected Toronto architect William Thomas was contracted to pronounce the soundness of the foundation, thereby leaving the graves undisturbed. The scenario explains how the Neo-Gothic cathedral of St. James’ has the proportions of a Georgian church.

Significant cost overruns threatened to bankrupt the church because the building committee persisted in constructing a church that the congregation could not afford.

The interpretation of the term ‘consecration’ was preventing, in the mind of Bishop Strachan, the ‘legitimate’ sale of the churchyard. The opposition to the bishop’s plan to move the graveyard was, in his own words, a source of ‘irritation’. To rally public support for the sale of St. James’s churchyards, Bishop Strachan published and widely distributed a pamphlet in 1850 that illustrated his pragmatic approach to addressing the financial shortfall associated with building the new cathedral.

In the pamphlet, the Bishop argued that the preservation of consecrated land was less important than the funding of a new, prominent cathedral worthy of the prestige of the Anglican Church in Canada. He further argued against public burial within the city limits by noting “public opinion, as well as, the law were against burying in churches or cities; and, being injurious to health”. To legitimize his position the bishop argued that burial in the city was invented by modern custom and not theology or hygiene and consequently he wanted the graves moved beyond the confines of the city. The pamphlet
prompted building committee member ‘Bramhill’ to state that consecrated ground could not be unconsecrated for commercial purposes. In reality, redistributing the graves beyond the city limits was not possible because economic growth made the city limits unstable, shifting, and constantly expanding.

Bishop Strachan also noted the link between the invention of new customs and the transience of fashion. Essentially, he claimed that the public taste already concurred with the removal of the graves, which gave his printed public address the quality of a decree rather than a public plea. Clearly, the letter showed how Bishop Strachan expected that religious rank and privilege could influence social and economic capital. He intimated that his authority permitted the de-consecration of the churchyard, as long as the dead were carefully removed. Furthermore, he stated that the churchyard ought to be sold because all available space was already allotted. The bishop was undeterred by the prospect that he might be undermining religious principles for the immediate interests of his cathedral. His logic serves to underline what might be termed religious real-estate.

The bishop defended his position in print by claiming that his congregants cared less for civic justice than the appointment of their own pews. When one congregant complained that his new pew was smaller and poorly located in the nave, the architect, Fred Cumberland was called upon to produce a letter illustrating the favourable appointment of the new pews. However, Bishop Strachan failed to fully consider that religious no less than secular politics held the public interest but newspapers benefited from amplifying scandal. Bishop Strachan had to compromise on the design and location of his new cathedral due to the scandal that surrounded his desire to sell off the churchyards.
Several architects competed for the commission. Fred Cumberland had been selected ahead of other well-respected architects including Frank Wills, William Thomas, Kivas and John Tully, John Ostell, and U.S. resident Gervase Wheeler, all of whom were British-trained immigrants. However, Cumberland struggled to retain the commission because Bishop Strachan attempted to have him replaced by Montreal architect George H. Smith, who had not even participated in the initial competition.

The Bishop’s belief that Divine providence could overcome economic problems put him in league with Smith, who had suggested building a larger cruciform cathedral. Pragmatically, the Bishop preferred Smith’s layout. The larger cruciform plan would have added considerably to the old church’s 2000 seat capacity. Smith’s plan was achievable only by offsetting building expense with the sale of the churchyard. It was ultimately too ambitious so that Cumberland’s plan, with modifications, was adopted.

Cumberland’s plan involved a more than moderate use of British and European models in addition to U.S. patterns where the silhouette was dependent upon a strong western tower. The angle tower arrangement would have been unacceptable in a cathedral because of its associations with parish church models.

Bishop Strachan’s troubles extended beyond the immediate concerns of building his cathedral and included the loss of the lands known as the Clergy Reserves. He wrote disparagingly to the Right Hon. Lord John Russell, member of British Parliament and Reform advocate, that, “we [Anglicans] have fallen into a state so extraordinary and humbling in a British colony.” The bishop’s position that “the Romish Church has increased in efficiency, wealth, and importance, with the growth of the Colony” was prescient considering the architectural advancements at St. Michael’s Roman Catholic
Cathedral. By the mid 1850s, the colonial government of Canada and the British Foreign Office rescinded the offer of monies accruing from the sale of the Clergy Reserves to the Anglican Church. These were massive tracts of land in Upper Canada and other provinces in British North America set aside to fund religious institutions – which for Strachan was the Anglican Church alone. Feeling defeated in 1854, the bishop wrote complaining about unfair treatment but resigned himself to working in tandem with other denominations.²⁹²

Losing the Clergy Reserves came at an inopportune moment, just as the bishop was completing St. James’, because he was counting upon some of the revenue to pay for construction. Tenders from builders that had been advertised in The British Colonist, The Church, and The Patriot returned bids that were 50% higher than expected. The contracting firm of Metcalfe, Wilson, and Forbes supplied the lowest bid at £16,500. In actuality, costs overran to £18,803.17.7, leaving the bishop with a £9,353.17.7 deficit, for an unimpressive building – very unlike a cathedral and not at all what either the bishop or the building committee wanted. Increasing the level of insult, the English religious press pronounced St. James’ inferior to the design for Montreal’s Christ Church by the late architect Frank Wills. For instance, the Ecclesiologist journal wrote:

> Altogether Montreal Cathedral will, when completed, mark an epoch in transatlantic ecclesiology. It will be the largest completed cathedral in America of our communion; for though the new one at Toronto would, if completed, be larger, it is as yet unfinished, and on (we believe) a much inferior and less correct plan.²⁹³

The reference to a “much inferior and less correct plan” was clearly pointed at St. James’ layout which took on the proportions of its Georgian – not Neo-Gothic – predecessor.
Although Bishop Strachan eventually adopted a conciliatory position regarding the loss of the Clergy Reserves, at least in public, there were others in his circle of influence who were combative. That did not relax their ire. For instance, in addressing the congregation at St. Peter’s Church, Springfield, Elgin County the Anglican clergyman Henry C. Cooper tried to shame the members into action by creating comparisons with Roman Catholics who he claimed were united in resistance against the losses of the Reserves. Without religion he predicted the colonial society’s demise, as follows:

… the Romanists will not passively yield up their church’s rights and properties. They are a united body; they acknowledge no bond of union so abiding and binding as their church. For it and its endowments they will sacrifice everything; colonial union – British connexion – civil peace: and … we may see the fearful forms of political convulsion, intestine anarchy and strife, - the dislocation of the whole frame of our social fabric – the probable dismemberment of our colonial empire.\footnote{294}

The threat of civil uprising involving Roman Catholics was not far off the mark, as religious and cultural tolerance was ebbing in Toronto, and perhaps especially within St. James’ mixed congregation.

Yet, and as a microcosm of the larger social organization, the building committee’s British, Irish, Scots and Canadian-born members managed to complete their task despite such cultural and political disagreement. They behaved as a collective out of the interests of religion but economy often provided the potential for internal disagreement. Moreover, the cobbling together of a collective approach involved the suppression of violence stemming from coercion, rather than the building of consensus. Periodic violent clashes had proven un-containable. In 1852, more than a decade before the Fenian raids of 1866, the Anglo-American Magazine reported:

\begin{quote}
that in Hamilton a party of Orangemen who had assisted at the demonstration in Toronto, were attacked by a hostile body``.\footnote{295} \end{quote}
During the attack, an Orangemen called Thomas Campbell stabbed and killed a Roman Catholic named McPhillips. On account of the disturbance, the dead McPhillips was denied the rites of burial by the Roman Catholic Bishop of Toronto, Armand-Francois-Marie Comte de Charbonnel (1802-91).

While Toronto newspapers used factional disputes to increase readership, the press was also cultivating the town’s identity around architectural accomplishments. The reporting of civic violence and civic architectural development fashioned Toronto’s complex identity. On 7 August, 1874, a letter to editor of the Globe newspaper expressed admiration for the tower and spire of St. James’s Cathedral, by making positive comparisons with British and European church architecture. The writer produced a table illustrating the various heights of European cathedral spires, among which St. James ranked sixteenth behind the leading example - Strasbourg cathedral’s 466 ft. spire. At 309 feet, Toronto’s Anglican cathedral was given the pride of exceeding, by one foot, Britain’s Norwich cathedral. In a further expression of civic pride, the report stated that:

…although the spire of St. James Cathedral in this city is not so high as quite a number in Europe, it is sixteen feet higher than any structure in North America, ninety-six feet higher than the highest in Montreal, and seventy feet higher than any in Toronto. Let us hope that an edifice so lofty, and so much admired already, will in due time, with its expected illuminated clock, be brought to a thorough completion, and that no loss of life or serious harm will be sustained therewith.

The report demonstrated Toronto’s rivalry with Montreal, the latter having edged ahead in economic growth due to the importance of the St. Lawrence transportation system. Situations reversed after the joint U.S. and Canadian initiative in 1895 deep dredged the
St. Lawrence, opening up the Great Lakes to transatlantic shipping. This proved to be an initial stage in Toronto’s economic advancement.

Such shifts in economic power were manifested in the rising skyline of Toronto. A major episode in this combination of religious, cultural, and economic ambition was the construction of the tower and spire of St. James’. In dramatic fashion, Toronto could even claim affiliation with medieval European tragedy because a fall from the scaffolding at St. James’ tower claimed the life of a worker in 1839. Few Torontonians likely knew that the master mason William of Sens fell from the scaffolding at Canterbury Cathedral while inspecting construction progress in 1179. However, many Torontonians read the Illustrated London News and thus knew about the loss of life connected to the construction of major architectural monuments in modern Britain and Europe.

3.2.3 Strategies, Tactics, and Surveillance: Completing the Tower at St. James’ Anglican Cathedral

Anglicans only slightly outnumbered the Roman Catholics in the 1860s in Toronto. Census records show there were 14,125 Anglicans, 12,135 Roman Catholics, 1,288 Baptists, 525 Methodists, and 1,231 Presbyterians. Despite the reality of the population figures, Anglicans believed in a ‘chain of being’ that placed themselves at the top, and therefore worthy of accruing social and economic benefits. In the summer of 1867 the Anglican brethren leaving a quiet mass at St. James’ Cathedral (fig. 3.12) must have bristled at the celebratory cheers a few blocks north where the Roman Catholic cathedral of St. Michael’s had just consecrated its tower (Bond and Shuter St.)(fig. 3.13). By comparison, St. James’ tower sprouted no more than the height of its nave (fig. 3.14). This moment in their interdenominational rivalry signalled the rise of the tallest church spire ever built in Canada and, for a short time in the 1870s, North America. A new
building committee was struck in order to outstrip the dominance of St. Michael’s tower. Amplifying the rivalry, the committee at St. James hired St. Michael’s architect Henry Langley whose talent helped the Anglican cathedral surpass its Roman Catholic rival by 56 feet.301

Perched atop St. James’ Neo-Gothic spire in 1874, an observer with a sharp eye – and a little faith – might believe Britain’s cathedrals were visible across the Atlantic.302 Indeed, a sense of ‘imagined community’ continued to link Canada with Britain well beyond official Confederation in 1867.303 The phenomenon was particularly strong in church architecture, in which Torontonians continued to believe paralleled similar stylistic movements in Britain. Prominent social and political figures connected to the established Church believed they could rely upon religion to reinforce social prestige and power. These people included the Governor-General of Upper Canada, Lord Durham (John Lambton 1792-1840) and his successor, and son-in-Law, Lord Elgin (James Bruce 1811-1863). Lord Durham’s Report to the British Crown on the political state of the Dominion (1838), among other things, suggested that the French cultural issue be settled by creating a union of Upper and Lower Canada in order to place the French in minority.304 At the same time, one could neither miss the nearness of the U.S., nor avoid the complaints that American architects were snapping up Canadian architectural competitions.305 At issue was the way in which the Dominion was going to assert its identity in architectural terms that differed from the United States, while also being more differentiated from Britain. The nascent issue of the Dominion’s identity was being worked out in architectural terms in tandem with the same debates in the socio-cultural and political arenas.
3.2.4 Religious Dissention in Ontario’s Social Structure after Confederation

In the Dominion, the Anglican Church objected to sharing its advantage with other denominations, especially the evangelical Methodist congregations which were gaining followers. The rise of Methodism contributed to additional interdenominational rivalries that indicated the multiplicity of identities forming the Dominion. In Canada, there was no truly dominant ideology, even though the Anglicans believed that Canada was a ‘Dominion’ under their preserve and specific form of worship. Of course, the reasons for interdenominational rivalries were doctrinal but there was also a strong economic element involved because churches in the Dominion knew their financial growth depended upon attracting more followers. Interdenominational rivalry was serious business in the decades immediately after official Confederation while Anglican, Methodist, and some Catholic groups tried to gain an upper hand in the formation of Canadian society. For instance, the Anglican Church restricted the growth of Methodist churches by objecting to that Church’s consecration of marriages. The Anglicans’ reasoning was that Methodism was too communal. Thus, the Anglican Church treated its recognised status as a private resource, an un-official ‘compact’ with the leading members of the Dominion’s society. Anglican groups believed they were instrumental in forming the important parts of the Dominion’s social structure even though Anglican privilege was resisted on many fronts.

When Methodist churches adopted Neo-Gothic architecture they divested themselves of the traditional Meeting-House style of church architecture. The change in architecture reflected the acceptance of Methodism as a reputable religious sect. This coincided roughly with the re-organization of Methodist faith from its previous focus on
the conversion of sinners to its new focus on the salvation of the saved. The Toronto chapter of the Methodist Church, for instance, built a massive cathedral-like church in 1870, which coincided with doctrinal transformation focused on individual spiritual experience.

3.2.5 Comparative Case Study: The Parsonage for Toronto’s ‘Temple to Methodism’

Metropolitan Methodist Church (1867-70) was built on the corner of Bond and Shuter Streets by architect Henry Langley as a visible challenge to Anglican social dominance in Toronto. As of the 1850s, Methodists began to believe that Upper Canada was no longer an Anglican preserve. Methodists took the government’s distancing itself from the established Church (exemplified by the rescission of the Clergy Reserves in 1854) as an optimistic sign, on the surface at least.

The major changes in Methodism happened in connection with the reorganization of Methodist principles in the 1860s and 70s, which changed its spiritual objective from the conversion of sinners to the salvation of the faithful. The re-structure brought Methodists chiefly under one consolidated Wesleyan banner, having previously held “the same doctrines theologically but differing on points of church government.”

The changes initiated optimism among Methodist officials. The Rev. William Morley Punshon, a trustee of the Metropolitan Methodist Church in 1870, projected this optimism with the claim that their organization had replaced the Church of England as the ‘real’ Canadian establishment. All that remained to do was construct an appropriately optimistic building to reflect the robust apparatus of the Methodist Church. Metropolitan Methodist Church was not only a monumental building capable of accommodating 1,900 worshippers, but it was also constructed using the plain exterior
walling typical of Britain’s latest architectural fashion, High Victorian Gothic. Moreover, its prominent tower rivalled the Anglican Church’s architectural accoutrements. As the markers of public taste, the pattern book by Joseph Crouch and Edmund Butler *Churches, Mission Halls and Schools for Non-Conformists* (1901) illustrated the same sort of Neo-Gothic that the Methodists had adopted for their parsonage.

Since the cost of a building was a benchmark of status, it is worth looking at how the expense of building Metropolitan Methodist was worked into consecration announcements printed in local newspapers. The church had cost an unprecedented $100,000. It claimed to have one of the best church organs in the country worth $6,500 as well as advanced gas-heating and lighting technology that cost $5,000. Using print media to advertise a building’s architectural accomplishments justified by their cost was an old Anglican strategy used in Britain. In Toronto, Methodist officials used expenditure to create prestige, resulting in the public’s nicknaming of the building as the ‘Cathedral of Methodism’. The nickname was a derogatory reference meant to discredit the rise of Methodist power above what the ordinary public believed was that Church’s station in society. To counter such public criticism, the *Toronto Telegram* made architectural and cultural comparisons with British churches, remarks usually reserved for the Church of England in Canada.\(^{310}\)

A significant portion of the project’s costs included a $50,000 parsonage to accommodate the minister and his family. The expense rivalled those built by Anglican and Roman Catholic congregations, illustrating how Methodists also believed that social privilege ought to be accruing to them in Toronto. The design of the parsonage and its construction received significant attention in print media. The *Canadian Architect and
Builder newspaper published illustrations of the parsonage, designed by the noted architectural firm of Sproatt and Rolph. Newspaper reports noted that the architects had been given carte blanche to build, decorate, and supply absolutely everything needed for the equipment of the building as a home. The public’s attention on the project was stimulated because its patron was Daniel Massey a seventh generation member of the wealthy family of farm equipment manufactures (later Massey-Fergusson), a family whose wealth and privilege rivalled the name Eaton. Mirroring the colonial apparatus, Massey not only paid for the entire building but he also established a fund to subsidize the minister’s salary.\textsuperscript{311}

3.2.6 Church-Building and the Architectural Profession in Manitoba

In June 1897 the Canadian Architect and Builder published a photograph of the recently consecrated Anglican church of Holy Trinity, Winnipeg built by one of the town’s local architects Charles H. Wheeler (1838-1917).\textsuperscript{312} The decision to present Holy Trinity in a photograph rather than a lithograph put religion and technical reproduction together in a new and disruptive way. The reproducibility of photographs and their dissemination in the public domain stripped away the remaining formal vestiges of spirituality associated with Picturesque lithographs. Mesmerized by the spectacle of photographic representation, viewers of pictures of churches seemed oblivious to the way reproduction liquidated the authority of the Church through a break with traditional representation. It is ironic that the Gothic Revivalists who wrote so extensively on the archaeological authority of their architecture failed to notice that the reproducibility of church imagery in the pattern books actually disrupted the mystical value of religion. They did not appear to notice that the commercial practices around the pattern books,
which normalized the marketing of taste, was also unravelling the threads of religion woven into the fabric of society.\textsuperscript{313}

In part, this occurred because pattern books and architectural magazines, including the \textit{Canadian Architect and Builder}, represented the plurality in architectural education and professionalization.\textsuperscript{314} It was not an easy matter for architects to build a ‘profession’ since this necessitated putting aside their personal differences in favour of creating a self-regulating organization. The architectural historian Kelly Crossman has shown how uneasy collectives formed among Ontario’s architects in the last decades of the nineteenth century.\textsuperscript{315}

In Winnipeg in 1906 Charles Wheeler assumed the vice-presidency of the newly formed Manitoba Association of Architects (MAA).\textsuperscript{316} The creation and maintenance of fee schedules was the association’s chief function.\textsuperscript{317} These organizations were expected to control the way professionals and workers competed, though individual action in the workplace resisted institutional strategies. \textit{The Canadian Architect and Builder} championed the professionalization of architectural practice. It published favourable reports on the activities of architectural associations. The magazine’s editors believed that the professional organization of architects, the construction of a robust society, and the search for a national style of architecture were interrelated. The situation was expressed by a correspondent to that newspaper who wrote:

Increasing knowledge will add to the number of those who appreciate and desire good work, and their sensitiveness in matters of good taste will incite the producers to higher efforts… It will not be long, I venture to prophecy, before public opinion will declare itself definitely and decidedly, insisting upon grace and refinement both in our public buildings and in our important thoroughfares. Given such an opportunity, we may feel confident that our national architecture will not fail under the test, but will reflect the highest and noblest qualities of our race.\textsuperscript{318}
This process was complicated by the democratization of architectural education. In this process the ‘heroic’ architect of a past generation, such as Sir Christopher Wren, Matthew Bloxam, and John Henry Parker, became a literary personality. Readers invested in themselves the ‘innate’ quality of discerning taste, once they became fully acquainted with the rhetoric in the pattern books.

Charles Wheeler was also an astute observer of the growth of the architectural profession in Canada, noting its relation to growth in other sectors not the least of which was the railway. In his published accounts of development in Winnipeg, he noted the advance of ‘balloon frame’ house construction as part of a “steady architectural progress” coinciding with the “approach of the Canadian Pacific Railway”. The connections between civic development and economy were duly noted:

Architecture in Northwest Canada, and particularly in Manitoba…has undoubtedly passed its ‘happy stage’, has gone through its teens, and is now only waiting to develop into vigorous manhood with the advent of settlers and capitalists.

The planning of new streets, sanitary plumbing, as well as scientific heating and ventilation for many new developments in:

public buildings, churches, schools, stores, and residences [that sprang up because] scores of architects from all over the world hung their ‘shingles’ up to the light of day.

Alongside the ‘advent of capitalist progress’ Wheeler situated his own architectural achievements by noting the completion of Winnipeg’s Holy Trinity Church.

Wheeler’s discourse also touched on settlement expansion as a factor in the possession and erasure of Indigenous Peoples, though he clearly saw its effect as progressive rather than being in any way problematical:
Thirty or thirty-five years ago Winnipeg was an aggregation of log houses surrounding Fort Garry, an Hudson’s Bay Company post on the plains of Manitoba and the territories stretching away for nearly a thousand miles westward to the foot hills of the Rocky Mountains, uninhabited, except by Indians and half-breeds.\(^{322}\)

He supported the idea that the west was a vast ‘emptiness’ with minerals and land available for exploitation, a subject that will be addressed more fully in Chapter 3. He also indirectly reacted to the Riel Rebellion of 1870, which we will see was chiefly about property ownership in and around Manitoba.

3.2.7 Case Study: Holy Trinity Anglican Church, Winnipeg, Manitoba

The Winnipeg architect Charles H. Wheeler did not initially win the competition for the city’s Anglican Holy Trinity Church. However, in 1883 he was successful following a second round of tenders based on a reduced budget of $60,000 (fig. 3.15). The church was built under the supervision of Archdeacon John McLean (later, Bishop of Saskatchewan). Wheeler’s design bears some comparison with the church built in Addiscombe (Surrey) by Edward Buckton Lamb, though the exact connection has yet to be established. Lamb was an architect whose “frank scorn for the ritualistic planning of churches” caused the Ecclesiological Society to label him ‘rogue’.\(^{323}\) However, in western Canada Wheeler did not attract the negative criticism associated with Lamb in Britain. It is worth briefly examining Wheeler’s situation.

Wheeler was a typical character in the history of Canadian architecture, because he began his architectural career as a carpenter, bricklayer, and stonemason. Like William Coverdale in Kingston he learned his trade from pattern books.\(^{324}\) At Holy Trinity, Wheeler experimented at Holy Trinity with a hammer-beam roof system in order to span a width of more than thirty-five feet, possibly based on reading Frank E. Kidder’s
Building Construction and Superintendence: Trussed Roofs and Roof Trusses (1895). Triangular roof trusses were standard load-bearing features of roof construction but the hammer-beam roof system allowed for the creation of open timber ceilings that revealed the beauty of the timber roof. Raphael and J. Arthur Brandon’s Open Timber Roofs popularized the aesthetics of the open timber roofs in the 1850s. In Kidder’s Trussed Roofs and Roof Trusses U.S. models showed the hammer-beam at work, including its depiction in a photograph of the interior of a church by American architect C.C. Haight.

Despite some traditional design choices made at Holy Trinity, the church represented ‘progress’ in several other ways. The church’s cruciform design built of Stoney Mountain limestone replaced a succession of two plain wood frame churches built in 1868 and 1875. The building’s new situation at the junction of Donald and Graham Streets was presumed an improvement over the previous location at the corner of Portage and Main Streets, which was considered undesirable for a church because new commercial development had changed the social composition of the area.

3.3 About Church Pattern Books and Pattern Book Economy, After Confederation

Several factors of economy influenced the production of pattern books. Mail order purchasing was factored into the production of the pattern books and this was evident in the books’ exceptionally long titles. The title was often the only means by which a purchaser could imagine a book’s contents. Thus, the title A Manual of Gothic Mouldings: A Practical Treatise on their Formations, Gradual Development, Combinations, and Varieties; with full Directions for Copying them, and for Determining
their Dates (1845) by Frederick Apthorp Paley divulged book’s specific subject and announced that its pages provided the reader with a practical skill.

The exchanges of economic, symbolic, and cultural capital that occurred through the sale of the pattern books did not necessarily guarantee an author’s architectural success. For instance, the contemporary British architects George Truefitt (1825-1902) and George Edmund Street (1824-81) each produced illustrated architecture books of churches that demonstrated fine draughtsmanship, the privilege of Continental travel, and an ability to ‘think’ in gothic. Truefitt’s images in particular demonstrate his belief that the grammar of gothic architecture lay in one’s ability to work decorative details into holistic design of churches. However, Truefitt’s architectural details and European churches in Sketches on the Continent (1847) (fig. 3.16) and Designs for Country Churches (1850) loses some of its ‘naïve’ appeal in comparison to Street’s seemingly ‘mature’ visual and verbal rhetoric in Brick and Marble in the Middle Ages: Notes of a Tour in the North of Italy (1855), both architects published not later than their early thirties. Truefitt had a more moderate career, dealing mainly with domestic construction. Street became a cornerstone of Neo-Gothic ecclesiastical, commercial, and civic production. Some of Street’s several books included monographs of his architectural practice, Some Account of the Church of St. Mary, Stone near Dartford (1860) and The Cathedral of Holy Trinity, Commonly Called Christ Church Cathedral, Dublin, an Account of the Restoration of the Fabric (1882) as well as his architectural travel book, Some Account of Gothic Architecture in Spain (1869). Street’s books demonstrate established reputation, understood as taste, which allowed him to publish on virtually any subject, no matter how specific.
Once a pattern book was produced it took on a social life of its own that was intimately involved in taste. Taste was regarded as a commodity because readers picked out the bits of designs that suited their individual and collective construction/aesthetic needs. In addition, the books’ producers tapped into the market’s needs, or at least believed that they could do so. A chief factor in the commodification of taste was advertising. Advertising conflated the visual and verbal data proffered as ‘knowledge’ with ‘fashion’. The general practice among U.S. pattern book authors to include advertising in their books highlighted the authors’ business savvy and self-promotion. The British-trained architect Frank Wills, who worked briefly in the Maritimes and Quebec before transferring his practice to New York, advertised that he was “prepared to furnish designs and working drawings of churches, schools, and other buildings” the year before the publication of his pattern book made the process more democratic. More commercial applications of advertisement included U.S. architect George Woodward’s publication of Woodward’s Architecture and Rural Art which contained ads for Woodward’s National Architect (fig. 3.17). Re-printed copies of Woodward’s books sold for between $1.50 and $2.00 but the latest edition of National Architect was priced at $12.00. Commercial practice closely associated expense with the latest in architectural fashion.

The use of lithography meant that the images in pattern books ceased to refer directly to the original medieval buildings, which the books claimed were the source of taste. Instead, the pattern books were actually referring to one another in a continuous cycle of marketing new fashion as though it had the endurance of the antique.
Indeed, the technical and mass-reproductive process of lithography was deliberately made to appear indistinct from etching, a labour intensive process associated with fine art European portfolios. Pattern book readers knew that their books were not fine art but they appreciated the appearance of it in their purchase of the books. Moreover, readers of the pattern books in Canada who had never been to Britain to see an original medieval church had to trust that the image in their hands referred to the latest fashion for the Neo-Gothic in Britain.

The illustrated advertisements that formed part of the U.S. pattern books were an aspect of simulacra that raised the level of the books’ commodification. For example, the chromolithographic plate in Frederick Withers’ *Church Architecture* (1873) that was used to illustrate an advertisement for Minton’s Tiles was not an actual copy of a tile but a copy of a rendering of the idea of a tile. In other words, the tile depicted in the advertisement did not have to be part of Minton’s inventory in order for the tile illustration to represent Minton’s company. Similarly, the designs in Withers’ book needed only to refer to the Gothic Revival and not to original medieval buildings in order to participate in the selling of taste.

The pattern book author George Woodward expanded his marketing schemes by retailing the books written by his colleagues and competitors. To that end, he printed a catalogue entitled *Architectural and Mechanical Books* (c.1868). Pattern book sales increased with the expansion of the mail order business, which grew as a result of the spread of railway and shipping, as well as, the lowering of postal rates. The popularity of mail-order pattern books is illustrated by Woodward’s catalogue, which explained in painstakingly clear language “How to Remit Money”. Woodward’s commercial
aspirations did not stop with book retailing. An advertisement in *Woodward’s National Architect* signalled how he also acted as sales agent for ‘Dixon’s Low Down Philadelphia Grate’, a modern home-heating device that claimed there was not a “single educated Physician in Philadelphia who owns the home he lives in, who is not supplied with one or more of these delightful luxuries.” (fig. 3.18)\(^{329}\) The advertisement’s text is significant because it drew together education, medicine, the social respectability of doctors, and the necessity of luxury. Dixon’s heating device was not cheap at $35 to $60 each. The inclusion of the advertisement for Dixon’s heating device in Woodward’s pattern books that ‘objectively’ discussed the merits of modern heating and ventilation illustrates the blurred borders between commerce and ‘knowledge’.

Pattern books generally had a long shelf-life that contributed to the ongoing debates about the way churches should look. For instance, the introduction of George Wightwick’s pattern book *Hints to Young Architects, Calculated to Facilitate Their Practical Operations…* (1846, re-printed 1847, 1860, 1875, 1880) into the library of the Barrie, Ontario Mechanics’ Institute initiated a ‘conversation’ between the ideas in Wightwick’s book and the ideas in the library’s copy of Joseph Gwilt’s *Encyclopaedia of Architecture Historical, Theoretical, and Practical* (1842, several re-prints).\(^{330}\) That is, architects did not read books in isolation; but rather, they produced new ideas from a combination of sources. The ‘conversations’ between these books is metaphoric of the conversations that the Toronto architects Fred Cumberland and William Storm may have had while perusing their copy of Wightwick’s *Hints to Young Architects…*(1847) in conjunction with their editions of Frank Wills’ *Ancient English Ecclesiastical Architecture and Its Principles…* (1850) and Frederick Mackenzie’s *Observations on the*
Construction of the Roof of King’s College Chapel, Cambridge: with Illustrative Plans, Sections, and Details, from Actual Measurement (1840), for instance. The interaction of books introduced into Cumberland and Storm’s library is metaphoric of the wider public debate about the way churches should look, based upon the visual and verbal imagery available in pattern books anyone could purchase.

The discourses around taste and knowledge illustrate how pattern books represented a new psychology of selling intangibles that was more related to the U.S. book-trade. Pattern book authors still used words to make taste appear tangible, but advertisements within the body of the pattern book told another story of the transitory and commercial character of fashion. For this reason, pattern book author John Thomas Mickelthwaite wrote:

the opinion still generally held, even by men of real taste, is, that in each building it is necessary to adopt some particular ‘period’, as they call it, and conform to it in every detail, even the minutest, particular [italics mine].

The term ‘real taste’ was applied not only to sway public opinion but intended to prove the actual existence of taste. The point was to make taste tangible through verbal and visual means.

The transience of fashion was a problem for pattern book authors selling the idea of enduring taste. In this way, taste and fashion began to be conflated by contemporary pattern book readers. Taste’s existence, and the privilege that went with it, was contingent upon people’s willingness to suspend their disbelief in the transience of fashion. To offset taste’s apparent variability, U.S. pattern books appeared to offer practical and useful advice, especially since their authors had to contend with the added ethereality of their own profession. In the early parts of the nineteenth century, architects marketed their services as essential to a general public who considered the profession an
economic extravagance. By the close of the century, most of the general public came to believe in the necessity of architects. Professionalization had much to do with these changed attitudes, and pattern books were a complex part of the dialogue that alternately educated the public and created a distance between architects and their clients. Thus, church-building committees must have heeded the words of the U.S. architect and pattern book author, Frederick Withers, who advised “spending no more than $75 to $100 per seating”, “lining the foundations with slate to check the rising damp”, and sourcing the “best stone materials in New Brunswick and Ohio.” Withers’s architectural drawings and plans typified the format of most U.S. pattern books by offering comprehensive and straightforward building instructions. The elevations, sections, and plans depicted in Withers’s Church Architecture were plain renderings that recalled the economical output of a draftsman’s table rather than the picturesque illustrations typified by most British pattern books.

3.3.1 “Designs for Village, Town, and City Churches”: One Pattern Book Produced in Ontario

In the 1893, a slim pamphlet of church patterns, entitled Designs for Village, Town, and City Churches and published by the General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church in Canada, was produced for practical and ideological purposes. The pamphlet’s stated hope to “be of some service to those congregations about to build churches, more especially in rural districts” was coupled with a complex marketing scheme that promoted a “wealthy and prosperous” modern Presbyterian Church. It is clear that the Presbyterian Church was using the pamphlet to increase its public image in Ontario and Manitoba because the publication was produced through a nation-wide competition conducted in conjunction with the Ontario Association of Architects (OAA). The timing
was right because the reputation of the Presbyterian Church in the 1890s had largely recovered from the division that stemmed from the disruptions to its parent organization in Scotland in the 1840s. The growth of the Presbyterian Church was reflected in the census of 1881, which recorded 676,165 Presbyterians as compared to 587,818 Anglicans and 742,918 Methodists, due in part to the increase of Scots immigration.\textsuperscript{334}

The factors involved in the open competition that produced Designs for Village, Town, and City Churches included the socio-economic constitution of privilege, the interdenominational competitions to define the nation, and the associations between economy and church-building. The pamphlet also participated in the apparatus of pattern book economy discussed in this chapter, which included the visual and verbal marketing of taste, ‘progress’, and knowledge. Advertisements were included in the pamphlet in a manner that followed the U.S. pattern book format.

To fill the pages of the proposed pamphlet, junior and seasoned architects and draughtsmen were induced with small cash prizes. But the real inducement for submissions was that the adjudicators were prepared to “publish all [designs] of merit”.\textsuperscript{335} The architectural profession in Ontario was expected to participate eagerly. Instead, the contest was met with ambivalent response because few submissions had been received even a year after its announcement in 1891. Further chiding of the profession was called upon. An additional call for entries appeared in the Canadian Architect and Builder soliciting those “many architects who are not too busy at present” and reminding “draughtsmen in offices, [to] enter this competition with advantage to themselves”.\textsuperscript{336} The competition organizers presumed that many architects had resisted the competition because they would not work gratis; though, one advertisement noted that many
“architects persisted in preparing designs and forcing them upon prospective clients when they were not asked to do so.” Matters had not improved six months later, in May 1892, when the OAA registrar W.A. Langton received a letter from the “Committee of Experts” that noted:

we have examined the competitive designs... and with much regret we beg to say that in our opinion there is not a sufficiently large number of suitable designs among them to warrant the committee in publishing a pamphlet."

They complained that few of the entries could actually be utilized as Presbyterian churches. But, the Presbyterian Committee of Church Architecture pressed ahead with the pamphlet by publishing the submitted entries, claiming that all were “in harmony and good taste”. The use of taste to justify publishing the pamphlet exemplified the fact that the last word to appear in print carried to most weight in a system of commercialized taste.

The “Prefatory Notes” of Designs for Village, Town and City Churches equated the richness of building materials with the “means and liberality of the people”. As the pamphlet’s title suggested, there was a range of church designs suitable for an array of Canadian urban settlements. Cost of construction was the main factor of suitability. The pamphlet contained church designs that could be built for less than $2,000 in small rural towns, as well as, larger churches more suited to cities. Clearly, the pamphlet was playing to the idea that its readers identified themselves through the style of church they could afford to build.

The designs in the pamphlet were supplied by a variety of mature and emerging architects. W.A. Langton provided a perspective drawing and plan from a commission to build a small stone parish church in Assiniboia (fig. 3.19), modelled on the 13th century
fabric of St. Michael’s, Longstanton. Other entries came from Daniel J. Crighton of Montreal, James Russell of Toronto, and E. Lowery and Son, all of whom presented amphitheatrical seating plans (fig. 3.20). This type of interior planning was not particularly definitive of the Presbyterian experience, since Non-Conformists had used it for decades to improve the communication between congregants and the pulpit.

Conversely, W. L. Munroe, G. F. Stalker, and the partnership of Greg and Greg gave illustrations showing plans with longitudinal axes typified by Anglican churches (fig. 3.21). The pattern book did not precisely define the architectural aesthetic of a Presbyterian church, presenting instead a series of variations on Anglican and nonconformist architecture.

The pamphlet advertised goods related to architecture and religion. R.J. McDowall’s piano and organ retailer of Kingston paid for a full-page advert placed ahead of the main body of printed drawings. Adverts of other sponsors included the ‘Owen Sound Stone Company’, the ‘Rathbun Co. Door and Moulding Manufacturers’, and ‘Castle and Son’ providers of stained glass. The rear of the volume contained another series of adverts for the makers of pews, pulpits and chairs, such as, the ‘Globe Furniture Co.’ of Walkerville, Ontario and their competitors ‘B.H. Carnovsky’ of Kingston, Ontario. A U.S. church bell manufacturer was listed, the ‘Clinton H. Meneely Bell Co.’ of Troy, New York, which showed the close relationship between U.S. manufacture and Canadian consumption. The final advert in the volume was supplied by W. Drysdale & Co., Booksellers and Stationers of Montreal, suppliers to the Presbyterian College. These advertisements were naturally related to church-building but they also demonstrated the close relationship between religion, manufacture, new commercial practices, and the
book trade. Placing advertisements in a church pattern book showed that building a sanctified structure was also a commercial practice.

3.3.2 Comparative Case Study: Two St. Andrew’s Presbyterian Churches in Toronto

During the mid-1870s, disagreements about the amount of ritual in church services split the congregation of St. Andrew’s Presbyterian Church in Toronto. The seceding group built a church on Jarvis Street that became known as “Old St. Andrew’s”, though in reality that congregation dated from 1876. The bulk of the original St. Andrew’s congregation in Toronto, established in 1821, also built a new church on King Street West on a site located near the growing commercial sector of the city. The church known as “New St. Andrew’s” was built by William George Storm, who modelled his design on the “famous Kirkwall cathedral in the Orkney Islands, and the style of architecture […] described as Norman Scottish.”³⁴¹ Architectural historian Janine Butler noted the connections between “New St. Andrew’s” and pattern books written by George Bidlake (Sketches for Churches Designed for the use of Non-Conformists, 1865).³⁴²

When the congregation moved to the corner of King and Simcoe Streets the parish’s mission building, dedicated St. Mark’s, was moved to Adelaide Street west of Techumseh. The “New St. Andrew’s” church continued to finance St. Mark’s, which nearly bankrupted the congregation. The situation required some financial reorganization that involved selling a small portion of the land at King and Simcoe St. for $12,000. The remaining portion of land grew in value to $16,000 nearly twenty years later. However, the decision to replace St. Mark’s small Carpenter’s Gothic board-and-batten building with a larger, but simplified, Scottish Norman brick structure proved costly to the “New St. Andrew’s” congregation.
Tempers boiled over on 2 October when St. Andrew’s newly arrived minister, the Reverend, W.J. McCaughan of Belfast, Ireland announced to the congregation that the church was $2,100 in debt. He was upset that the St. Andrew’s coffers had been carrying St. Mark’s Church. To illustrate the problem, the Reverend publicly stated that he “refused to cash his cheque for salary …because he objected on principle to an overdraft of the church’s banking account.” He continued:

I don’t think the people need be told that the present difficulty exists on account of our branch, St. Mark’s church. We are behind financially solely on account of our own congregation. …Personally, I think this congregation should pay its own debts.

Rev. McCaughan concluded his sermon by officially giving notice of his intention to leave Toronto for Chicago and a congregation that had built him a new parsonage. The congregation responded by publishing a full account of its finances in the *Toronto Telegram* tabulating the costs of financing St. Mark’s, pew rental incomes, and envelope donations in order to refute “these injurious reflections on the church finances, whether emanating from the press or the pulpit.” Of particular note were land acquisition costs since 1876 that amounted to $167,752.17 and additional expenditures for missionary, educational and benevolent purposes that amounted to $163,000, a combined figure of nearly $330,000. Furthermore, the Board of Managers of the church released its finances to the public in a bid to discredit the Reverend, proving its debt had actually been “reduced from $53,000 to $41,000.”

By contrast, the “Old St. Andrew’s” church built its new church, in connection with hiring a new pastor Rev. G.M. Milligan from Detroit who was lured to the congregation on account of their “fervent” and “forceful” approach to worship. Finding a vacant lot at Carlton and Jarvis Streets, Rev. Milligan convinced the congregation to
build a new church. The architect firm of Langley, Langley, and Burke was hired and they produced a “second-pointed” Neo-Gothic design that the Toronto Telegram claimed was “a building being devoid of especial ornamentation and elaboration … amply atoned for in the symmetry and harmony of its construction.” It was completed in 1877 for a cost of $57,000. The congregation remained out of serious debt by opting for a more modest building, one nevertheless employing an amphitheatrical interior plan that suited a more egalitarian approach to worship.

Both St. Andrew’s churches employed conventional aesthetics but claimed to utilize the progressive designs that were actually shown in Designs for Village, Town and City Churches. Clearly, there were readers of pattern books who preferred their innovative architectural design to remain on the printed page. To illustrate the contradiction, it is worth noting that the competition’s winning design by architect Arthur E. Wells of Toronto, which was a very progressive blend of domestic and religious architecture, was actually omitted from the pamphlet’s publication (fig. 3.22). Only the thin ‘fleche’ or spire emerging from the steeply pitched roof, and amid the verticals of two chimneys, announced the building as a church at all. The editors of the pamphlet appeared unwilling to conform to the principles of ‘newness’ that was announced two years earlier in its call for entries. Surprisingly, the Anglican congregation of St. Clement’s at Yonge and Eglinton in Toronto had already adopted the type of ‘progressive’ design that Wells had had rejected from the Presbyterian Church’s pamphlet.
Summary

The Anglican Church no less than other denominations relied heavily on land transactions to expand its operations. For that reason the fluctuations and machinations around modern values of property impacted church business, and particularly church construction. The force of economy was thus a point of reference for church leaders and church-builders in the process of crafting identity around rural and urban spaces in Canada’s developing society. The imagery in the pattern books clearly influenced not only the way churches were constructed but also the way churches were planned to attain a Picturesque effect.

Churches benefited from the expansion of social networks in Canada, each depending upon the accumulation of property at cheap prices. The Government of Canada had vested interests in selling land cheaply in order to spread the population west and north toward the fulfilment of Britain’s desire to have an inexpensive economic link with the Asian archipelago. On the other hand, land still retained its associations with prestige and privilege, especially in the expanding urban situation. For this reason, Canada’s population growth and economic expansion occurred in an uneven manner despite official representations to the contrary.

The economy of church pattern books touched on all of these factors because bookselling purported to offer fashion disguised as knowledge. The pattern books professed to establish continuity with the past even though they marketed history to sell something new. British and U.S. church pattern books were on the shelves of the library of the architects Fred Cumberland and George Storm demonstrating the consumption of imported architectural knowledge. Furthermore, the close relationship between economy,
settlement, architecture, and books was revealed by their ownership of *A General Text Book, for the Constant Use and Reference of Architects, Engineers, Surveyors, Solicitors, Auctioneers, Land Agents, and Stewards* indicating that architects participated in property valuation as a component of land speculation. The deployment of this book in the practice of property assessment illustrated the ease with which imported knowledge was accepted by the colonial populace, whether it originated in Britain or the U.S. For this reason, the rate of church pattern book consumption was not affected by the fluctuations in tariffs on books; there were very few Canadian produced alternatives to imported pattern books dealing with architecture.

The creation of an equivalence of fashion and taste with regard to building churches in Ontario and Manitoba was demonstrated most clearly in the Presbyterian publication of *Designs for Village, Town and City Churches*. The churches illustrated in it expressed variety in design but limited innovation. Its strategy to offer alternative church designs for Presbyterian worship became restricted by the drawings of churches that appealed to more traditional values. The omission of the winning entry explains that progressive church designs were not appreciated; instead, the editor attempted to misrepresent traditional church designs as innovative. The situation indicates the conservative nature of the church-building communities in the middle regions of Canada even though Britain, which appeared to be the social model, had undergone pronounced stylistic progressions.
IV. The Mobility of Church Pattern Books in the Context of Church-Building in Canada

The Dutch may have their Holland, the Spaniard have his Spain
The Yankee to the south of us must south of us remain;
For not a man dare lift a hand against the men who brag
That they were born in Canada beneath the British flag.
Tekahionwake (Pauline Johnson), Canadian Born (1903)

In the post-Confederated Dominion, business, religion, and settlement generally operated as though expansion ensured survival. Expansion required mobility afforded by the flow of people and capital. Church-building expanded across the Dominion by marketing newness even though the cycle of production and consumption represented by the sale of pattern books contradicted their emphasis on historical tradition. This chapter is primarily concerned with the spread of churches alongside the sale of pattern books.

These ideas need to be examined in light of the constitution of group and individual identities relative to national imaginings, particularly expressed in the rhetoric around the construction of the railway. The railways spread the pattern books, and thus knowledge, and all three impacted the lives of First Nations by attempting to replace their traditional beliefs with European knowledge systems. Understanding the mobility of the pattern books in light of the marketing of knowledge and science, as well as that of fashion and taste, involves examining colonial strategies, policies, and procedures of trade. The central feature of colonial expansion positioned some groups, especially indigenous peoples and the Métis, as social ‘others’. Accordingly, this chapter will examine the dual structure of church pattern book importation and distribution that resonated with the colonial authority.

The chapter begins with a comparison of the type of social and economic structures that spread the pattern book trade and organized religion. The spread of books
across the Dominion that occurred through the regionally structured book trade, heavily influenced by U.S. hegemony, mirrored the spread of church buildings. Furthermore, the strength of regional markets no less than regional politics influenced the internal spatial division of new commercial ventures, the department stores.

The Anglican Church’s development of a General Synod in Canada replicated aspects of those patterns of consolidation that occurred in the expansion of the book trade and even development of the trans-continental railway. The especial role of church-building in connection with resource extraction, settlement, the pacification of social uprisings, and even tourism, will be contemplated through case studies of Holy Trinity at Stanley Mission (1854) and St. James at Star City (c.1909), Saskatchewan as well as St. George’s-in-the-Pines (1889-1897), Banff, Alberta. These cases will be considered in connection with comparative cases at Rosh Pina Synagogue (1892), Winnipeg, and the Roman Catholic church of St. Antoine de Padoue (1883), Batoche, Saskatchewan.

4.1 Pattern Book Distribution between St. John’s and Victoria

The loose collection of booksellers operating independently across the country, many of them largely unaware of each other, imported and distributed many of the same books from Britain and the U.S. This occurred largely because a small clutch of regional book agents travelled around Canada selling their wares. For this reason, the appearance of a national community of readers, whether real or imagined, was constituted economically on a regional scale. The owners of various booksellers including Robert Dicks (Sign of the Book) in St. John’s, New Brunswick, James C. Linton (Sign of the Big Book) in Calgary, and T.H. Hibben (Hibbens Books) in Victoria sold imported goods to a regional customer base. Even though the booksellers were supplied by shipments that
travelled across country by rail – a new commercial venture in itself – the regional
flavour of their customers was significant.

During the 1870s book shipments from the U.S. increased in tandem with the
expansion of branch rail lines extending from the U.S. into Canada. Thus, New York and
Philadelphia publishers were able to ship directly to markets in Toronto, Winnipeg, and
even Vancouver, highlighting the regional aspect of the book trade. The growth in cheap
books imported from the U.S. also influenced the growth of regional book markets in
Canada. These regional business patterns were consistent with the regional patterns of
identification and settlement growth reflected in church-building.

Canada’s railway enterprise became influenced by the U.S. business model of
expansion rather than the British one because of geographic and economic resemblances.
For that reason, the CPR project was described in positivist terms of technology even
though the close cultural affinity with Britain continued to be reflected in the marketing
of Picturesque views beheld by travellers crossing the Rockies. Daily newspaper reports
of ‘progress’ in the Canadian Pacific Railway construction accompanied periodic reports
about the latest church consecrations. Though industry and economy drove the railway
forward people identified with the railway through ideologically charged imagery. The
CPR guidebooks, for example, generally omitted industry from their landscape
illustrations in order to foster their associations with a pristine and wild but ultimately
manageable natural environment. Using textual rather than pictorial representation, the
Manitoba Free Press (1872-1931) serialized CPR construction reports using ‘human-
interest’ stories in order to contextualize the monumental costs that average readers could
not fathom. At the same time, church-building conjured up medieval architecture and moral directives imposed on the middle ages by the Victorian sensibility.

The mobility offered by the railway also initiated a continual loop of production and consumption similar to the one occurring in the U.S.\textsuperscript{349} In that way, the railway became a myth-making engine that contributed to the complex structure of identity formation. In reality, the main CPR line disadvantaged the west with a 13% freight rate differential that made shipping goods to the east prohibitively expensive.\textsuperscript{350}

The structure of the book trade in Canada demonstrated that there was neither a unifying culture of the ‘nation’ nor a straightforward expansion of settlement in an undisrupted state. In reality, the spread of the book trade occurred by a series of energetic expansions accompanied by equally sharp consolidations. The formation of the book trade comprised an opportunistic collection of parts while projecting official images of a unified whole. Thus, the rhetoric of ‘national unification’, which was more imagined than material, was not entirely consistent with booksellers’ actual commercial practices. Booksellers operated through a network of regional agents.

Putting the force of religion and the spread of settlement into play, J.S. Woodworth wrote in 1911 in \textit{My Neighbor: A Study of City Conditions, a Plea for Service} that:

\textit{We can hardly be accused of under-estimating the value of social settlements, institutional churches, and city missions, but more and more we are convinced that such agencies will never meet the great social needs of the city. They serve a present need; they bring us face to face with our problem; they point out the line of advance. Then by all means let us multiply them and extend the scope of their work. But the needs will remain until the community at large is dominated by the social ideal. This is surely the mission of the Church, and yet the Church itself is hardly awake to the situation, much less fitted to meet it. Will the Church retain – perhaps we should rather say, regain – her social leadership?}\textsuperscript{351} 


Woodworth’s idea that a cohesive society was needed to improve modern living was not new. It reached as far back as Plato’s *Republic* and found expression more contemporaneously in A.W.N. Pugin’s *Contrasts* where he predicted that Catholic values would shelter humanity. Churches no less than the pattern books made similar promises to improve society but the books quickly reverted into marketing aesthetics, thus, diminishing their overall social impact.

The movements of the pattern books among the buying public sold the idea that history was something familiar. Another layer of complexity was added when the books were imported to Canada because the past being marketed was verified by the printed page. In reality, pattern books marketed church designs while covering the tracks of their commercial purposes, notable the control of public taste. For instance, the U.S. architect Henry Hudson Holly veiled the commercial aspect of his book *Church Architecture: Illustrated with Thirty-Five Lithographic Plates, from Original Designs* (1871) behind a “mixture of the science of the freemason and the love of the workman of the old days”.

The church pattern books marketed history and the Picturesque as reactions to institutional controls on daily life. The pattern books combined bucolic images of an open landscape with references to the medieval past, even though reality was reflected in the invention of Standard Time and the rigidity of railway schedules, both of which organized the workday schedule. People looked forward to Sunday as a respite from modern life by retreating to the pastoral setting of their church. Illustrations in Holly’s *Church Architecture* (1871) even made it appear as though the town church had Picturesque qualities. Design number 13, Plate 28 illustrated a church surrounded by mature but manicured tree symbolizing God’s communion with nature and religion’s
self-described custodial care for society (fig. 4.1). In reality, church pattern books deliberately marketed the latest scientific construction methods in tandem with the conventional and Picturesque landscape because the combination held large public appeal. The dormer windows that were partially integrated into the roof of Holly’s drawing of a timber church reflected the latest architectural fashion in the 1870s. The appeal of the medieval past was so strong that people disregarded the fact of the pattern books’ technical reproduction – lithography.

Amongst the perspective views and full-page plans of churches in Henry Hudson Holly’s Church Architecture were some pairs of images that built upon the polemical argument in Pugin’s Contrasts. These images intensified the marketing of a robust past associated with Pugin’s notoriety. In Holly’s pattern book, plate 10, ‘The House of God’ (fig. 4.2), depicts the interior of two separate unnamed churches identified by the headings ‘The Deformation’ and ‘The Reformation’. In the former image two lonely and parishioners, a man and his wife, sit on a cold and uncomfortable bench listening to the sermon from one of three different preachers each situated in a pulpit. The parishioners have their backs to the church officials and the husband appears to sleep. The building is in disarray. The dilapidated condition of the large coat of arms above the chancel arch must have symbolized the fragile relationship between Church and State. The gothic arch, which appears to frame a gallery and not the chancel, has been pushed dangerously out of vertical by the slanted roof of the aisle. A depressed archway related to Neo-Classical domestic interiors frames the triple pulpit. In the foreground, the octagonal font, though constructed in form reminiscent of medieval fonts, is used to hold the gentlemen’s hats instead of Holy Water. The general shabbiness of the ‘Deformation’ church stands in
direct opposition to the ‘Reformation’ church whose consistent vertical lines and pristine condition evokes piety, humility, and social stability. In the ‘Reformation’ church the attentive congregation faces the high altar encompassed by the verticality of the stone rib-vault above the chancel. The vaulted interior allows the chancel to be pierced by a full suite of triple lancet windows encompassed by a framing arch with plate tracery at its apex. The congregation is depicted listening dutifully to the sermon delivered from the pulpit located not at the extreme east but in the crossing arch beneath the tower, an arrangement indicative of a cathedral. Holly based the polemics of his imagery on Pugin’s *Contrasts* (1836), showing Ecclesiology still resonated thirty years after its inception. The connections between truth, taste, beauty, and religion no less than architectural function were described by Holly as the antithesis of:

bad architecture and shams of all kinds...[that] exemplify the fraud and neglect of ecclesiology which so militate against true art...\(^{353}\)

4.2 Regional Booksellers, Local Church-Building, and National Imaginings

As businessmen, booksellers across Canada developed increasingly sophisticated sales tactics that grew from casual networks of wholesale and retail agents. The formation of temporary collectives occurred in reaction to the perception of economic crises. Throughout the long process of Confederation, booksellers consolidated their trade by forming regional associations, such as the Ontario Booksellers’ Association (founded, 1885).

Local markets for books illustrated the importance of regional identities even though some Canadian publishers tried to create the appearance of a nationalized industry. The local character of the book trade is exemplified by J. and A. McMillan of Saint John, who in 1867, filled orders only for other retailers in New Brunswick. The
A.C. Perry Company in Winnipeg sold books, stationary, and music to a limited market in 1881. During the 1870s specialization increased to the point that W.F. Shaw Company of Toronto advertised in 1889 their supply to the trade only. In that same year, Zed S. Hall of New Westminster, British Columbia also supplied local stores only. By contrast, smaller markets in rural towns caused combined services including ‘Stationer, Bookbinder, and Printer’ to be offered by R.D. Richardson in Regina in 1884. These booksellers, and many others like them, distributed Bibles, prayer books, hymn books unencumbered by tariffs.

The professional organizations developed by booksellers claimed national status even if they were regionally based. For instance, the trade journal Books and Notions, launched by John Joseph Dyas of Toronto in 1884, claimed to have a national circulation; in fact, it represented the regional interests of the Booksellers’ and Stationers’ Association of Ontario. Several changes to the journal’s name, including Canadian Bookseller and Stationer (1896-7), Bookseller and Stationer (1897-1907), Bookseller and Stationer and Canadian Newsdealer (1908-10) as well as, Canadian Bookman (1909-10) indicated an intent to market nationalism, in theory, if not in fact.

The regional apparatus of the book trade in Canada was highlighted by a series of business mergers that claimed to unite the industry while augmenting individual and corporate wealth. For instance, the Canadian Booksellers’ Association (formed in 1857 by Henry Rowsell, A.H. Armour, and Rev. John Cunningham Geikie, re-formed 1876) was national in name only since it represented eighty-seven Ontario booksellers. Their first item of business was to demand an end to the monopoly on selling textbooks enjoyed by the Ontario Department of Education. Because of the closeness between the
department of education and the provincial government in Ontario, the booksellers’ pleas were largely ignored. The booksellers in Ontario had few alternative agencies to whom they could register a complaint, since there was no national governing body.

The regional model of book distribution resonated with the way religion and settlement spread across the Dominion. For instance, the same sort of divisional management that represented local markets in the book trade was also instituted in the establishment of the separate dioceses in Saskatchewan (1874), Athabasca (1873), Moosonee (1872), Qu’Appelle (1884), Mackenzie River (1884), Calgary (1888), Yukon (1891), and Kewatin (1901). The fragmentation of Rupert’s Land into regional dioceses was an apparatus that geographically divided First Nations and made it more difficult for aboriginals to make unified, and ‘legitimately enhanced’, land claims.\(^357\) The regional distribution of pattern books, like the local importance of church-building, was reflected in organizational terms in the advent of department stores.\(^358\)

As early as the mid-1850s, the distribution of books in Canada increasingly shifted away from advance subscription sales. Instead, a loose syndicate of booksellers marketed their product by concentrating on volume sales. They increased their claims about the love of reading while actually dealing in mass sales using the department store model. The prime motivator of books sales became price and advertising, each of which was influenced by the exponential increase in book production. Russell’s Bookstore at Winnipeg advertised “$25,000 – most of choice stock to select from with new goods arriving every day by mail, express, and freight from London, New York, and Boston.”\(^359\) This situation is not surprising given the way that the British Empire was exporting to their colonies “a kind of packaged civilization, offered in competition with the local
product, and backed by powerful service arrangements.”\(^{360}\) The collectives such as the Ontario Booksellers Association (est. 1885) (OBA) were structures imported from Britain demonstrating that booksellers in the Dominion felt that they needed to organize in order to cope with the complexities of the modern marketplace. At the same time, the OBA provided business opportunities for already established booksellers and impeded newcomers to the trade, which was a mirror of architecture professionalization and a metaphor for the attitudes towards new immigrants.\(^{361}\)

At the same time as the OBA exerted a new level of control over the book trade, even while individual booksellers tried to establish monopolies through business mergers. The ebb and flow of these mergers was exemplified in 1872 in Victoria by T.N. Hibben and Co.’s outright purchase the stock of David Spencer which also added the services of the “bookbinder R.T. Williams to provide ‘the only complete book bindery north of San Francisco’”.\(^{362}\) The bookselling industry was generally characterized as moving from diversification to consolidation. This structure mirrored the collectives forming in other sectors, such as railway, logging, manufacture, and mining. In this manner, the book trade in the Dominion evolved from local merchandising to professionally run commercial concern.\(^{363}\) The consolidation of booksellers put pressure on the agents for British publishers such as the itinerant bookseller Mr. Lawrie, who travelled by rail between Toronto and Winnipeg as an agent for the William Collins and Sons of London. Pressures of the consolidating industry caused him to abandon his trade.\(^{364}\) Figures from the Canadian Booksellers’ Association demonstrate the situation; in 1876, approximately 500 booksellers in Ontario alone tallied sales sold books worth $750,000.\(^{365}\)
The consolidation of the booksellers’ businesses gave power to a few privileged corporations, causing concern about rising prices. The monopoly enjoyed by the railway brought about accusations of price fixing (unidentified as such at the time) for goods travelling east, disadvantaging producers in the west. For that reason, James C. Linton at the ‘Sign of the Big Book’ in Calgary shipped books by rail not farther than the foothills of the Rockies, thereby strengthening regional ties.\(^{366}\)

The regional formation of the book trade within an imagined nationalism in Canada echoed the developing structure of religious institutions in the Dominion. By contrast, the production of pattern books in the U.S. was controlled by a small clutch of architects and authors including William Comstock and Amos Bicknell. Roughly a third of the architectural books published between the 1850s and 1890s came from them. Their books entered Canada from New York via branch-line rail service.

4.2.1 The Local Spread of Empire: Railway, Religion, and Church-building

Even before the contract to build the Dominion’s railway, the project received attention in Britain. Eventually, the railway linking the east and west coasts became the apparatus for Canadian nationalism though it was initially envisioned in Britain as a means for lowering the costs of British trade with Asia and India by circumventing treacherous sea travel around Cape Horn.

At the same time, the railway was a private enterprise that henceforth changed the economics of travel. In addition, the railway promised to urbanize, and therefore enrich, isolated rural towns.\(^{367}\) In reality, most small communities were left in an impoverished state, particularly in the Prairies, because of population shifts into already established cities.\(^{368}\) By 1901, twenty percent of the Prairies’ 400,000 inhabitants lived in urban
settlements of a thousand people or more.\textsuperscript{369} Monopoly was chiefly responsible for bringing the railway into existence and similar impulses drove consolidations in the book trade.

Since the CPR management recognised the profit potential in building townsites, they incorporated several similar towns in the Prairies. To legitimate profits and to be responsible ‘corporate citizens’ the CPR and the Hudson’s Bay Company operated in concert to project an image of corporate benevolence. They “‘granted sites [for churches] for half of the prices charged by others, and the CPR Company have carried all material for the construction of churches at half the usual rates.’”\textsuperscript{370}

The pattern books illustrated churches as societal commodities, virtually in a department-store fashion. This indicated the depth to which the corporate strategy had permeated other areas of cultural and religious production. The focus of architecture in the public domain, aided by the pattern books’ presentation of plastics, largely drove issues of aesthetics rather than liveability. The same thing occurred in towns supported by the CPR where profit potential chiefly influenced location. For example, the CPR abandoned a northern route through the Prairies in favour of a southern one that was more lucrative for the CPR, but prone to severe flooding in the spring. This is how Winnipeg superseded Selkirk as a ‘better’ place to ford the Red River, even though Selkirk was located on superior higher ground. The deciding factor was a $200,000 cash reward paid to the CPR by Winnipeg businessmen in addition to an offering of land and tax-exemption in perpetuity.

Despite these endorsements and incentives, the CPR, under the presidency of William Cornelius Van Horne and vice-presidency of Thomas Shaughnessy, periodically
faced bankruptcy. For that reason, the CPR relied on business relationships with regional consortia to dispose of millions of acres of land it had been granted gratis by the Government of Canada. These relationships include the Canada North-West Land Company which was given the responsibility to sell building lots in forty-seven townsites on the main line between Brandon and British Columbia. Quarter-page advertisements in local newspapers promised that for $2 per acre settlers would benefit from additional services such as “schools, churches and municipal organizations”. Though little of it was actually fulfilled, the CPR offered land to church groups at discounted prices as an enticement.

Besides a direct influence upon the sale of land, religion in the Prairies was enhanced by the expansion of the railway because missionary travel increased. This meant an exponential growth in meetings between Anglican clergymen and bishops that congregated in General Synod conferences to consolidate Church business under one self-governing body. This view of the formation of Anglican religious institution reveals elements comparable with the formation of the Confederated provinces, especially in the negotiation and friendly coercion needed to achieve consensus. With this in mind, it becomes clear that the advent of rail travel did not increase religious leaders’ ability to reach consensus so much as it gave them the ability to meet to air grievances and make objections. For instance, the diocese of Huron protested against the terms of the Letters of Patent appointing Bishop Francis Fulford of the diocese of Montreal as figurehead of the Metropolitan See.

Like friendly coercion that slowly cobbled together Confederation, there was haphazard enforcement of social controls in Canada West. The Riel Rebellion of 1885
was a symptom of this lack of care and control because it reflected how the federal government both excluded the Métis from the new social order and ignored the looming problem about land claims.

Some background to the Métis situation is useful. In the early 1880s, the Métis who had moved west into Saskatchewan were agitated by what appeared to them as the government’s unwillingness to secure title to land occupied by them around the Saskatchewan River. The combination of several other factors including the perception of weak support for farming initiatives resulted in Louis Riel and the Métis declaring open rebellion in 1885. The CPR was used to transport over one-thousand of the 90th Battalion of Winnipeg Rifles in under two weeks to engage with Riel. His limited force of Métis, First Nations, and disgruntled European settlers was eventually overwhelmed. Nationalist sentiment was raised by Lawrence Clarke, Chief Factor for the HBC in Fort Carton, who claimed:

Mr. Riel and his band of discontents should not be allowed to keep up senseless agitation, destroying all faith in the country and ruining its peaceable inhabitants [italics mine].

Newspapers rationalized and legitimized opinions similar to Clarke’s in the public domain. Newspapers and the railway were the vehicles of public opinion, though each could be more or less controlled by oppressive forces, demonstrated in the manner of their use to combat the Métis uprisings in the Prairies.

4.2.2 Comparative Case Study: The Métis and St. Antoine de Padoue, Batoche, Saskatchewan

The timber-framed, clapboard church of St. Antoine de Padoue, Batoche, Saskatchewan (1883) was completed less than two years before it became a strategic component in the defence of Batoche – a three-days long defeat of the 350 Métis led by
Riel and Dumont. The Gothicized single-cell church with segmented western tower was typical of the simple churches built by First Nations from Manitoba to Vancouver Island. The simple clapboard church evokes chapels-of-ease, which were small single-cell structures. It was significant that the battle, and Riel’s subsequent arrest, was played out in front of the church building because religion had been an instrument of social control that encouraged the Métis to become ‘industrious farmers’.

Having settled in the Red River area around the 1820s the Métis had, more or less, become politically separated over the issue of farming. The construction of churches like St. Antoine de Padoue was associated with an imperial strategy designed to keep First Nations and the Métis from moving about the land, much of which was being sold to settlers by the Canada Company and agents of the CPR.

The Northwest Rebellion of 1885 re-visited the earlier and unresolved problems of the Manitoba Rebellion of 1869 in which Louis Riel led a combined force of Métis, First Nations, and groups of disenfranchised European settlers and extracted federal government concessions regarding the establishment of Manitoba. The 1869 Riel conflict had previously arisen because of the disruption of the fur trade, which disrupted Métis economic and social structures. The 1885 Rebellion resulted when Riel discovered that the lands his people customarily held along the Saskatchewan River were about to be surveyed, a prelude to appropriation. The situation had only been exacerbated by the Hudson’s Bay Company who advertised “Farming, Grazing, Coal and Mineral Lands for Sale” to a predominantly white settler readership. Similar strategies were employed by government intent upon controlling the First Nation and Métis movements by encouraging them to farm instead of hunt. Church pattern books fed into this strategy by
emphasizing the importance of building European-style communities. Some members of
the print media recognised the problematics of the situation. For instance, the
Saskatchewan Herald (1878-1887), which usually assumed a conservative position,
recognised farming as a scheme to “pauperize the half-breeds”.\textsuperscript{382} Though, still showing
its cultural bias, the Herald discredited “Indian farmers” as a warrior race, thereby
endorsing the privileges of white settlers and farmers.\textsuperscript{383}

Church pattern books, as exemplars of taste, science, and knowledge, were co-opted into the process of appropriating First Nations and Métis lands by showing the
idyllic relationship between religion and the land. The pattern books even expressed the
so-called superiority of western building techniques that were taught to First Nations
carpenters as a way of acculturating them and making them feel inferior at the same time.
The Anglican missionaries used these building techniques to create schools adjacent to
churches within close proximity of the Métis in the Red River and Saskatchewan River
areas. One example was the Anglican archdeacon J.A. Mackay who took over the
responsibility of First Nations mission schools on the Cree Reserves at Eagle Hills,
Moosomin, and Thunderchild in anticipation of building churches there.\textsuperscript{384}

When Riel declared a provisional government in the spring of 1885, prompting
the federal authorities to use force in his removal, the ensuing battle involved the railway,
the church of St. Antoine de Padoue, and the claims of social superiority made by the
pattern books. The military had been deployed quickly by rail to Saskatchewan from
Winnipeg, catching Riel off his guard where the battle occurred in front of the church.
4.2.3 Reappraising a ‘National Style of Architecture’ alongside the Spread of Booksellers

The CPR promoted – but could not live up to – the objective of establishing national unity simply by transporting goods and promoting tourism. CPR officials attempted to create a national architecture by consistently using the Baronial Style in their stations and line of hotels built before 1900. However, the variety and sheer number of Neo-Gothic churches built across the Dominion vied for – and complicated – the national identity. A satisfactory compromise was never achieved because the heterogeneous viewing public did not champion a single style for Canada. In addition, architects did not help the situation because they had difficulty organizing even regional self-regulatory bodies based upon a standard set of principles. Many regional professional organizations formed, but they quickly disbanded due to internal squabbling. The architect William George Storm described the lack of cooperation as the, “modern system of competition and the rivalries of private practice [which] bring into undue prominence individual interest, until the members of the profession may be described as a number of fortuitous atoms.”

By the 1880s, several regional and municipal architectural organizations had formed, not long after earlier failures to “restore the profession in the eyes of the public”. They were spurred into action because of the increasing amount of competition from U.S. architects who were winning prominent commissions in Canadian towns. Thus, magazine trade in Canada became an instrumental vehicle to influence the public taste away from U.S. building styles. Thus, it was no accident that the seemingly casual formation of the Architectural Guild of Toronto in 1887 preceded the
establishment of the professional journal *The Canadian Architect and Builder* (1888-1909). The journal exemplified the problems of establishing a national voice in Canada because its editors and narratives were chiefly focused on Ontario and Quebec. Nevertheless, the journal aspired to galvanize architects around the formation of legislation that eventually brought into existence the Ontario Architects’ Act (1890). These events coincided with the formation of the Ontario Association of Architects (1890) and the standardization of architectural education in that province, all modelled, more or less, on similar developments in the architectural professions in the Britain, Australia, and the U.S.

The ongoing importation of British and U.S. pattern books undercut the nationalist and regional professionalizations of architecture in the Dominion. For this reason, the loose syndication of booksellers that profited from importing their wares were unwittingly playing into the hands of American taste when they tried to establish self-regulatory bodies.

When the question of a national style of architecture arose periodically in Canada, there was division between using a British or U.S. model. The *Canadian Architect and Builder* tried to settle the question, not by advocating a unique style for Canada, but by pointing out that England had “a knowledge of architecture and cultivated taste – the natural consequence of a leisure class of educated men and a country stocked with examples of good architecture.” Toward the pursuit of sustaining an imagined ‘little Britain’ in parts of Canada, the journal re-printed a speech made in London by John Belcher, the newly elected president of the Royal Institute of British Architects (RIBA), which concluded, as follows:
Increasing knowledge will add to the number of those who appreciate and desire good work, and their sensitiveness in matters of good taste will incite the producers to higher efforts… It will not be long, I venture to prophecy, before public opinion will declare itself definitely and decidedly, insisting upon grace and refinement both in our public buildings and in our important thoroughfares. Given such an opportunity, we may feel confident that our national architecture will not fail under the test, but will reflect the highest and noblest qualities of our race.  

Belcher was referring to Neo-Gothic as Britain’s national style even though the battle with Neo-Classicists continued.

Illustrating the public’s ambivalence toward developing a national architectural style, the Canadian Architect and Builder had re-printed the Boston architect J.R. Putnam’s nationalist rhetoric as though it had robust meaning for Canada. He claimed that American society “will develop a national style of architecture which will surpass in splendour anything hitherto known in the history of art…” Putnam’s idea of national architecture was decidedly Neo-classicist, following the broad fabrication of a U.S. civil society effected through its public architecture. His position was meant to influence the formation of an Ontario-centric image of Canadian identity.

The complex economic negotiations behind Confederation and the unstable political unity it represented were not extended to Aboriginals. Instead, Canada projected an image of unity during the expansion of the religious and commercial components of colonialism. A significant concern to settlers was the pacification of the indigenous peoples. It was generally believed that pacification could be achieved through engaging Aboriginal people in farming, an activity that would also limit their geographical mobility. This was the method by which First Nations were acculturated and imagined as settlers in their own land. For this reason, Archbishop Robert Machray of Rupert’s Land remarked upon the massive region as a whole, noting that all of its First Nations had been
converted to Christianity, when he circumnavigated the Red River, Lake Superior, and James Bay area in 1868.

Archbishop Machray’s preferred form of travel was the rail, which showed that modernity had already visited Canada west before the last spike of the CPR was hammered in at Craigallachie in 1885. During his visits, the Archbishop toured sawmills, fisheries, and farming operations employing First Nations. His mobility via the railway, something the pattern books were already doing, showed how Christianity and commerce had effectively paved the way for European ways of life. Modern European lifestyle involved the appropriation of whatever lands and people were deemed expendable, exploitable, and otherwise outside of the new social order.

Church of England missionary activity in Saskatchewan which also involved building new churches connected architectural fashion, commerce, and religion in the formation of society. The case of the construction of an ambitious new church in Stanley Mission, Saskatchewan that followed, for the most part, the latest fashion in British Neo-Gothic architecture opens questions about the working relationship between missionaries and First Nations. It is an open question of how well the Anglican missionary Robert Hunt worked together with the Woodland Cree and the Chipewyan bands to determine the Stanley Mission’s High Victorian aesthetic. The important factor was that Aboriginal catechists, working with the Anglican Church, had already converted the Cree and Chipewyan bands in the immediate area of Stanley Mission to Christianity before the arrival of the Church of England missionaries.
4.2.4 **Case Study: Holy Trinity, Stanley Mission and St. James, Star City, Saskatchewan**

In 1850, Rev. Robert Hunt accompanied by his wife Georgianna arrived from England at Lac la Ronge, Saskatchewan, a Hudson’s Bay trading post, with the intention of converting the Woodland Cree to Christianity. The Rev. Hunt found that Native catechists (religious teachers) had already converted the Cree and Chipewyan by conducting religious services in their languages. Religious services were held for the first two years in a utilitarian timber building. He routinely operated as peace keeper by arbitrating legal and social disputes, offered limited medical services, and performed marriage, baptism, and confessional services to the Cree and Chipewyan. He renamed the area Church Mission Point in honour of Mrs. Hunt’s home in England. The following year, the HBC arrived and established its trading post near the Rev. Hunt’s mission, reflecting the growth of the settlement. Tensions escalated only a few years later when the HBC closed the post due to its unprofitability.

The Rev. Hunt’s diary illustrates how pattern books and the influence of local churches transferred British architectural fashion to this remote area of the Prairies (the church at Stanley Mission is still accessible only by riverboat) (fig. 4.3). The architectural sources for Rev. Hunt’s plans and elevations of Stanley Mission (now lost) were the British pattern books from which he had “studied views & descriptions of more than 50 Churches & Chapels”. A major influence on its size and appearance of Hunt’s church was Christ Church, Cumberland House (The Pas) (1847), a Neo-Gothic timber frame structure that measured 63’ by 27’ surmounted by a 70’ tower built by the Rev. James Hunter.
During a period of seven years after drawing up the plans and elevations in 1853, the construction of the church was slow but steady. The chief factor in prolonging the church’s completion was the shortage of timber. By March 1856, the “frame of the Church Spire [was] set up on the ground, which complete[d] the skeleton of the building”.\(^{393}\) Thereafter, consecration was delayed until 1860 because of the sporadic delivery of boarding for the exterior finish. The Rev. Hunt’s frustration over irregular shipments of goods to Saskatchewan’s more remote areas was illustrated by the five-year delivery period for felt needed to insulate the church’s roof. The large rolls of felt had sat idle in several way-stations along the route between Britain and Saskatchewan because the shipping handlers were inept.\(^{394}\) Despite the railway’s problems, the Rev. Hunt recognized its “no small conveniences for speed & punctuality, only to be equalled perhaps, by a penny Royal mail which …could not exist without them.”\(^{395}\)

The Rev. Hunt appeared to be using a progressive aesthetic approach by employing plain, tall exterior walling akin to the High Victorian Style being pioneered at the same time in London at All Saints Margaret Street (1849-59) (William Butterfield, 1814-1900). For this reason, the church at Stanley Mission disrupted the idea that the Gothic Revival travelled west in a uniform manner. However, it remains unclear how this could be the case since Hunt had left London just as All Saints was in the planning stages. The situation is interesting because Hunt’s diary shows he was interested in emulating the church at Cumberland House.

The Rev. Hunt’s ideas for Stanley Mission were comparable with the influential writing and High Victorian architecture produced by the British architect George Edmund Street (1824-1881).\(^{396}\) For this reason, the “considerable space of wall
unpierced” by windows was adopted at Holy Trinity because it was believed to admit a greater amount of play in the coloured light on the interior.\textsuperscript{397} G.E. Street’s notion of the “right management of light” was related directly to the system of window fenestration at Stanley Mission. Without claiming a direct link, Holy Trinity was related to other High Victorian churches published during the mid nineteenth century. For instance, the silhouette of Holy Trinity bears a remarkable resemblance to the published image of J. Roger Smith’s the New Independent Chapel, Abergele, North Wales (fig. 4.4) included in Davey James Brooks’s \textit{Examples of Modern Architecture Ecclesiastical and Domestic} (1873). Holy Trinity has side aisles with simple lancet windows that are doubled in the clerestory level as in Smith’s church design. These designs illustrate how similar things developed in different parts of the world, but which were actually connected via an almost imperceptible web thanks to post, rail, books, and magazines. These things existed because people generally believed that progress occurred as a result of the spread of ‘knowledge’.

Due to the monumental size of the church at Stanley Mission, the close involvement of the Cree and Chipewyan workers posed a direct challenge to the belief that First Nations craftsmanship was second rate. At the time, it was believed that First Nations would be able to complete only modest architectural projects, excepting that a paternalistic crowd held that belief. It must also be borne in mind that the term ‘volunteering’ carried different connotations for First Nations than White settlers. Free service to religious institutions was expected of White settlers as a sign of social belonging. By contrast, First Nations were cast as being conscripted into the service of the church as a strategy to make them acculturated but permanent outsiders.
Contrasting the monumentality of the church at Stanley Mission was the proliferation of numerous single-room clapboard churches spread across Canada west. The development of small, plain churches whose cheap production and simple manufacture was necessitated by the general shortage of skilled workers and funding. A particular example is the Anglican church of St. James, Star City, Saskatchewan (1909). Its crenellated tower juxtaposed to the simple, rectangular nave was no parody of a medieval church but one that was seriously represented by stone church models in Raphael and J. Arthur Brandon’s *Parish Churches* (1849), Frank Wills’ *Ancient Ecclesiological Architecture* (1850), and James Davey Brooks’s *Examples of Modern Architecture Ecclesiastical and Domestic* (1873).

The plain modules at St. James, Star City were repeated in nearly exact proportions at St. Mary’s, North Battleford, Saskatchewan (date unknown), about 200 kilometres to the west, and again at the Roman Catholic Mission Chapel in Brigus South, Newfoundland (date unknown) and St. Joseph’s Roman Catholic Church in Yale, BC (c.1910) minus the crenelations in the tower. The same design had already been tried in masonry to anchor a civic permanence at St. Clement’s Anglican Church, Selkirk, Manitoba (1860-61), the town that lost the CPR railway to Winnipeg businessmen. The church’s tower was possibly a later addition

4.3 **Pattern Books after 1867**

It is likely that the mergers and buy-outs that existed among Canadian booksellers in the 1880s was a result of the perceived threats from U.S. book distribution. John Sebastian Helmcken (1824-1920), Speaker of the British Columbia Legislature and an Anglican (later a reformed Episcopalian after schism with Bishop Hills in Victoria)
expressed the threat, remarking upon the probability that “not only this colony, but the whole Dominion of Canada, will be absorbed by the United States.” With the majority of Canadian book sales originating in the U.S., Canada’s importers worsened the situation by advertising that they could get books from Boston and New York within a week of their publication at a quarter the price of British first editions.

The pattern of conferring important Canadian architectural commissions on American architects illustrated the problematics underlying the book trade. Teaching institutions were established to counterbalance a virtual ‘flood’ of U.S. architects, or at least the public perception of one. However, their effectiveness was disrupted because few organizers could agree upon standardized curriculum; indeed, Quebec and Ontario each advocated, and published, different sets of books for their courses. Though each organization listed different books, they each believed that Canadian architectural knowledge could only be gleaned from imported material. But, the Canadian readers of U.S. pattern books were exposed to U.S. manufactured goods advertised in the back of the pattern books. The pattern books are examples of how Canada’s culture was altered by its exposure to U.S. commerce.

Advertisements are useful indicators of the diverse cultural and economic exchanges going on around the social life of pattern books. The advertisements that manufacturers placed in the pages of the U.S. pattern books provided revenue and illustrated the closely relationship between the spread of knowledge and the expansion of consumer society. The inclusion of advertisements positioned the church pattern books as nascent magazines, marketing architectural fashion as taste. Other promotional practices, including book reviews in printed newspapers, reflected the robustness of the social
structure around disseminating knowledge.\textsuperscript{401} That is, a growing host of ‘professionals’ wanted to gain control of the way that architectural knowledge was both created and marketed. The advertising agent, Ernest Heinrichs, noted in an editorial printed in the \textit{Canadian Architect and Builder} that “in this age of keen competition, it is not likely that any man will have a purchaser for his goods simply because they have the characteristics of excellence.”\textsuperscript{402} Playing largely into the scheme to market the superiority of U.S. architectural ideas, the \textit{Canadian Architect and Builder} promoted the U.S. architect Frank Kidder’s three-part series \textit{Building Construction and Superintendence}, including Part II, \textit{Churches and Chapels: Their Arrangement, Construction, and Equipment} (2\textsuperscript{nd} ed.1900) and Part III, \textit{Trussed Roofs and Roof Trusses}, each of which sold at $3.00, each.\textsuperscript{403} A reviewer of Kidder’s books ironically noted that the author was so well-known as to need “no commendation and little description”.\textsuperscript{404} Nevertheless, Kidder’s publishers continued to advertise his books to a sceptical society where advertisers increasingly began to disavow their impact in order to legitimate their practices.

Naturally, the advertisements in pattern books were for building products. The architect Frederick Withers’s book \textit{Church Architecture} (1873) included full and half-page advertisements for a variety of architectural services and manufactures imported from Britain, including Minton Tiles. Of course, the pattern books were not that different from the manufactured building products that they advertised in the sense that the profits were generally reaped by the sales agents and publishers. The sales agents and publishers of \textit{Church Architecture} likely made more money selling the book than Withers did by writing it. In lieu of economic capital, Withers book gained its author artistic and cultural
capital which he could trade upon for monetary gain through the enhancement of his professional reputation.  

Reflecting the movement towards large-scale production, Withers adopted the new lithographic techniques designed to replace older method of etching. Lithography allowed thousands of print copies at a fraction of the cost of etching. Advertisement and mass production underlined the liquidation of universal architectural truths in favour of knowledge materializing chiefly from inside a consumer society. Nonetheless, Withers claimed that his images bore the stamp of exclusive taste, contradicting his pictorial method. By contrast, the British architect and pattern book author James Kellaway Colling banked upon the pretence of exclusivity associated with owning ‘fine art’. His book *Examples of Medieval Foliage and Coloured Decoration, Taken from Buildings of the Twelfth to the Fifteenth Century; with Descriptive Letterpress* (1874), published in London by B.T. Batsford, displayed lavish architectural details. The B.C. architect R. Mackay Fripp owned a copy of another of Colling’s books, *Art Foliage* (1874), signed in 1894 and held in the library of the University of British Columbia. U.S. pattern books dispensed with the pretence of ‘fine art’ by engaging directly with the consumer society developing in the U.S. and to a degree in Canada as well. The commercialization of churches in the pattern books meant the accessibility of ‘Christian Architecture’ to any religious affiliation willing to purchase a pattern book.

4.3.1 Comparative Case Study: Neo-Gothic at Rosh Pina Synagogue (1892), Winnipeg

Pogroms in Eastern Europe contributed to Jewish immigration to Canada. Many of the poorer Jewish immigrants were drawn to the Prairies to pursue farming and farming related businesses, and where they hoped to find inexpensive land. By 1901, the
1,164 Jews in Winnipeg represented a large expansion because the same number was counted in the entire country during the 1871 census. When the first Jewish congregation chose a variation of Neo-Gothic architecture for their new synagogue in north Winnipeg, built in 1892, they were expressing the architectural fashion found within the pattern books.

The Neo-Gothic aesthetic at Rosh Pina helped the congregation blend with their cultural environment. Jews had not been accepted into mainstream Canadian society. They still experienced the anti-Semitism they had expected to leave behind on the Eurasian continent. For that reason, Jews tended to build synagogues that could be mistaken for a single-room church. In Saskatchewan and Manitoba, for instance, Rosh Pina appeared related to a clutch of Christian churches, except for the distinctive Russian-style turrets. Still, these architectural elements could have been confused for Russian Orthodox architecture.

4.3.2 Book Distribution and Imperial Procedure

The spread of the pattern books was consistent with the spread of ‘scientific’ knowledge advocated by Mechanics’ Institutes located in urban centres across the Dominion. The spread of builders’ books used in developing new skills was central to urban development. Mechanics’ Institutes supported the workmen by offering public lectures on a variety of subjects, loosely categorized as scientific. As early as 1840, the moral and scientific benefits of new forms of ‘knowledge’ was advocated by the Montreal Mechanics’ Institute. The membership and revenue of Mechanics’ Institutes in urban centres grew exponentially between the 1840s and 1880s, demonstrated by the
increase from 3000 volumes in 1859 to over 9,000 in 1870 in the library holdings of the Montreal Mechanics’ Institute.\(^{409}\)

Church pattern books were listed among the holdings of some of those libraries. Mechanics’ Institutes represented a fraction of the book distribution, though their records are important historical documents that trace the spread of books in Canada. The Mechanics’ Institute of Toronto owned *The Principles of Design in Church, Parsonage, and School*.\(^{410}\) The Mechanics’ Institute of Barrie, Ontario owned books with sections devoted to churches including George Wightwick’s *Hints to Young Architects* (1846, reprinted 1847, 1860, 1875, 1880) and Gwilt’s *Architectural Encyclopaedia* (1842, several re-prints).\(^{411}\) In addition, to the Mechanics’ Institutes, retailers’ catalogues reveal the trajectory of book distribution in the Dominion. For instance, *The Canada Bookseller* (1867) listed the U.S. architect Henry Hudson Holly’s *Designs for Country Seats: containing Lithographic Designs for Cottages, Villas, Mansions, Etc. with the Accompanying Outbuildings; also, Country Churches, City Buildings, Railway Stations* (1866) at $2.50.

The books imported from Britain and the U.S. must also be seen in light of the cheap re-prints available from U.S. distributors’ pirated copies of British books. Church pattern books available in the Dominion were generally exempt from pirating, but Davey James Brooks’ *Examples of Modern Architecture Ecclesiastical and Domestic* was re-printed in Boston in 1873 after its initial 1868 print run in London.\(^{412}\)

The Mechanics’ Institutes presented science as a commercial enterprise. They presented a series of lectures that harnessed new technologies to the growth of the economy. In a similar manner, the provinces were harnessed to the national enterprise of
Confederation – the incipient Canadian State. Census records, maps, immigration
guidebooks, geological surveys, and even almanacs were part of a scientific approach to
the ‘improvement’ of the businesses and lifestyles of Canadians. Church pattern books
were another, albeit even more marketable, example of harnessing religion to the
economic needs of the incipient state. Henry Hudson Holly illustrated this situation in
Church Architecture by discussing the interconnection of science, economy, and
knowledge:

To drudge through his stint, - doing just as little as will pass muster with his
superintendent, fixing his mind the while, not on the matter in hand, but on the
beer and beef to follow, and the dollars and cents to be pocketed, - seems the main
idea of the mechanic as he is….What is needed is a mixture of the science of the
freemason and the love of the workman of the old days. The benefits of this
system are reached through education.\(^413\)

Beyond the nostalgia for the workmanship of a past generation of workers (if it ever
existed), Holly untied the ideas of education and commerce. He pointed to the
educational benefits of the Victoria and Albert Museum in South Kensington and the
American Institute of Architects (AIA). The AIA included a library, courses, lectures,
and classes to benefit draughtsmen and mechanics.\(^414\) Holly especially noted that, “a
library alone would go a long way to proper taste in design, to show the Old World that
America has moved away from the log-hut and the Corinthian column as its beautiful
ideal of art and architecture.”\(^415\) To this end he illustrated what a library ought to look
like and it was no surprise that it resembled a church altar (fig. 4.5).

The commercial distribution of church pattern books depended on two distinct but
interconnected streams of technical and religious education; one stream was architectonic
and the other was moral. The pictures in church pattern books generally portrayed social
reform led by the middle-classes who professed the ability to ‘perfect’ Canadian
The church pattern books played into this scheme by quantifying the number of people each church could accommodate coupled with a cost analysis of the labour and materials needed to achieve those seatings. A sign of a successful church plan was the increase in the number of people who could be accommodated at reasonable cost. Architects were judged upon their ability to navigate an economy of space in addition to taste.

Book distribution was consistent with the scientific method applied to church building. Shipping books by rail disseminated the product more quickly, providing a quicker return on invested capital. In addition, the ‘time value’ of money was seen as a scientific method of measuring financial success of everything from the book trade to railway expansion. For instance, Calgary granted generous tax concessions in return for the large Palliser Hotel built next to the CPR station (c. 1912). Once again, the civic concerns – chiefly economic – were a major driving force that superseded the national cause.

4.3.3 Case Study: St. Paul’s Anglican Church (1894), Regina, Saskatchewan

In May 1883, the Anglican congregation at St. Paul’s, Regina celebrated the opening of their new church described as a “neat ecclesiastical edifice” whose “very handsome and tastefully built” parsonage were both built by the architect Mr. Sproat and builder Mr. Lyne. Within a year the congregation encountered financial difficulty that emanated from internal disputes about the level of High Anglican ritual observances in the weekly service. To alleviate the financial burden, once the debate over ritual observances was temporarily resolved, a ladies bazaar was held to raise money. It was suggested that family members from the east be enticed to buy items through the post in
order to lessen the immediate financial burden on the congregation. An ecclesiologically ‘correct’ church design was sought in 1890 when the economy in Regina revived. The congregation of St. Paul’s was encouraged to reassess the value of their ‘old’ timber-framed church. Clearly, the new social status of the congregation warranted a new, more ‘improved’ church building.

For this reason, a decision was made to replace the old church with a new stone and red brick building whose richer materials would reflect the wealth of the congregants putting up the money. The building was expected to cost between $12,000 and $15,000 for which only $3,300 had been subscribed. That money had been raised by six members of the congregation each donating $500 with a seventh providing $300. Adding to the prestige, an architect was sought from out of town even though one of the vestrymen was J.R. Reilly the only locally listed architect in Regina.

The commission was awarded to the architect Frank H. Peters, possibly the same person elected vice-president of the Institute of Architects of Canada in 1907. For St. Paul’s, the architect designed a Neo-Gothic parish church with a wide nave, low-slung sloping roof, and a bold quasi-detached corner tower. The design omitted buttresses but comprised walls that splayed out at the foundation. A round window pierced the west gable. Otherwise, exterior ornament was minimized, excepting some decorative brickwork below the eaves of the roof evoking a medieval corbel table. The church’s modest appearance was combined with ecclesiological ‘correctness’ that evoked the Cambridge Camden (later Ecclesiological) Society’s half-century old principles.

The church’s simplicity and broad proportions echoes the parish churches illustrated in George Truefitt’s Designs for Country Churches (1850) and Raphael and J.
Arthur Brandon’s *Parish Churches* (1849). Frank Peter’s design has something of George Edmund Street’s St. John the Evangelist, Howsham, Yorkshire on account of the circular window in the gable and the pronounced corner tower. Street’s drawing had been illustrated in Davey James Brooks’s *Examples of Modern Architecture Ecclesiastical and Domestic* (1873). But it is also clear that the impetus to renew churches within a few years of their initial construction was founded on the idea of positivist improvement. The frequency of improving lifestyle was reflected in the pace of settlement expansion and tourism of western Canada. Once the railway project was completed people were urged to see the west, thereby causing a clash between the west that was imagined and the un-glamorous reality.

4.4 Settlement, Tourism, and Book Distribution

The (re)settlement of the west was a business in which institutions acquired resources in order to supply consumers. It was also a business with strong religious undertones. A compelling example of the interface between religion, church-building, and publication can be found in the pages of the *Colonist’s Handbook No. 1* (1882) published in London by the Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge (SPCK). The handbook was distributed gratis by shipping agents and sold in the Depositories of the SPCK for “three half pence a copy”.

The pamphlet provided ‘useful’ data about Canada; though, it was shot through with marketing about social and economic ‘improvement’, such as:

> Every emigrant, of course, proposes to “better” himself. He wishes to find better – that is, more regular and constant - work; or better wages, or a better position… in which he may be his own master, and have his own land or his own business…”
The guidebook advised emigrants to look forward to the advantages of better health and education in addition to an improved access to religion. Emigrants were told that they would “find the Church everywhere”.\textsuperscript{421} In essence, the guidebook exploited personal faith in social development through the combined factors of economy and progress.

Such intense marketing of faith in connection with settlement expansion was met with equally intense disappointment when problems developed. For instance a scathing report from Henry Youle Hind written to the Archbishop of Canterbury accused opportunist Canadian bureaucrats of providing false information to the compilers of the society’s publication, the \textit{Colonists’ Handbook, No.1} (1882), thereby defrauding the Church of England’s missionary arm, the SPCK. Hind alleged the fraudulent misrepresentation of the fertility of the land west of Manitoba, and the dissemination of inaccurate ‘Trade Returns’. He also alleged that maps of Canada printed in the handbook falsely showed a completed CPR railroad. He accused the handbook’s editors of overstating the amount of cultivable land by approximately 218 million acres. He complained that:

\begin{quote}
all this Land and Railway speculation is carried on in showing the CPR railway in, or relates to a country falsely alleged to be marvellously fertile over an area larger than the combined surface of the Empire of Germany and the Kingdom of Italy, and not yet possessing a civilized population exceeding that of a third rate town in England, and with resources so undeveloped or charity so deformed, that its authorities or citizens feed the poor, defenceless refugee Jews on – PORK.\textsuperscript{422}
\end{quote}

The maps, for instance, had been in use for six years since 1874 and surfaced in several different Canadian Yearbooks and government publications disseminated across the country. Repeated use between 1874 and 1882 had authenticated the inaccurate maps in Canada. The exaggerated trade returns and fertile land misled and abused the poor, uninstructed immigrants and the “English investing public”.\textsuperscript{423} The “Valleys of the Red
River, the Assiniboine, the Saskatchewan” were enthusiastically but inaccurately
promoted as a fertile area seven times the surface of England:

… the power and influence of government, and of Government officials in exalted
positions of Trust, to intrude their fraudulent representations into Sacred and
Scientific Societies for wider distribution of the poison – under the cloak of
RELIGION and KNOWLEDGE. In a word they have used their position and their
opportunities to do these dishonourable things which constitute palpable fraud of
the most treacherous stamp, and legally vitiate many or all of their bargains and
sales.\textsuperscript{424}

Economy had propelled the CPR’s profiteering but it also influenced society’s
view that social improvement was commercially constituted. The open question is not
whether the economy did in fact grow – it did –, but the amount of growth that resulted
from the CPR remains in dispute. It is not sufficient to suggest that the CPR management
championed the national cause by re-investing 90% of Company revenues totalling $95
million by 1913.\textsuperscript{425} The alternative action would have been the declaration of a dividend
that would have benefited a clutch of already wealthy shareholders. Thus, it is
worthwhile remembering that the CPR was a business –and not purposefully a public –
entity. Thus, the CPR project was often cast in the guise of a national project when in
reality it was a commercial endeavour. Indeed, many other reasons promoted provinces to
join Confederation, not the least of which was the forgiveness of millions of dollars on
debt.

The railway was marketed as a mechanism for connecting people when its biggest
business was the shipment of freight. Its managers intuitively knew that public support
rallied around the human element in the railway story rather than the pure economy of the
rapid delivery of goods. Thus, the CPR promoted tourism for positive publicity, even
though it grew into a genuine business. But, tourism needed the infrastructure afforded by
settlement. The marketing of tourism was achieved as much through a nationalistic vocabulary as through a religious one. In addition to the promise of fine dining, adventure, luxury, and breathtaking views of the west, prospective travellers were tempted by the slogan: “See This World Before the Next”.

4.4.1 Case Study: St. George’s-in-the-Pines and the Banff Springs Hotel, Banff, Alberta

Luxury tourism vaulted the CPR into the business of building and managing high-end hotels. The CPR’s Banff Springs Hotel (1888) was marketed as one of company’s crowning achievements. CPR president William Cornelius van Horne worked closely with the architect Bruce Price (whose daughter was Emily (Price) Post the famous authority on American etiquette\textsuperscript{426} to create the monumental hotel cradled within the peaks of the Canadian Rockies. The style of the hotel combined Scottish Baronial, Chateau Style, and Arts and Crafts elements. Privacy and privilege were the hotel’s focus, highlighted by the building’s location just outside of the small town of Banff. The main features of the building were its spacious lobby and octagonal rotunda, overhanging balconies, parlours, dining rooms, smoking rooms, reading rooms, bars were the epitome of luxury. Visitors’ main access point to nature, and by extension the Divine, was the vista viewpoints built into the hotel’s design that offered stunning panoramic views.

Between 1902 and 1911, the CPR’s hotel guests at Banff increased steadily from 3,890 to 22,000.\textsuperscript{427} The increased international tourist traffic necessitated the building of a new Banff Springs hotel in 1910, a commission awarded to Bruce Price’s disciple the U.S. architect Walter Painter. Twelve years after tourism started in Banff, the CPR’s old frame hotel was a crown jewel that needed ‘improvement’ and was replaced with an eleven storey concrete structure faced with Mount Rundle Limestone.
After the Hotel’s inaugural year, a steadily decreasing number of Canadian guests were replaced by a growing number of U.S. and international guests. In 1888, Canadian tourists represented 53 percent of the 1,503 guests compared with 26% to American tourists. By 1891, the situation was reversed with Canadians representing 25 percent of the 3389 guests compared with 56% Americans. Thus, U.S. tourists assisted the creation of a western social economy and a locus of identification framed around religion and representations of nature.

The idea of communing with nature was a spiritual and religious experience that the Anglican church sought to capitalize upon by building a church in Banff. It was no coincidence that St. George’s-in-the-Pines (fig. 4.6) was opened shortly after the inauguration of the first Banff Springs Hotel building. A short walk into the town of Banff brought visitors to the Gothic Revival church of St. George’s-in-the-Pines (1889-1897). The church was built to the specifications of British architect F.P. Oakley early in a career that later included the design of facilities for the Children’s Hospital and Dispensary, Manchester (1905). His status as a British architect was a saleable characteristic. Built of local limestone, the small parish church’s appearance contrasted with the forests surrounding the town of Banff. Limestone was chosen to evoke permanency, richness, and an aesthetic corresponding to rural English churches. Similarly proportioned churches were marketed in George Truefitt’s Designs for Country Churches (1850) and Raphael Brandon’s Parish Churches (1849). A scissor truss used to support the church’s open roof recalls illustrations in Raphael and J. Arthur Brandon’s Open Timber Roofs (1849) (fig. 2.3).
St. George’s-in-the-Pines was built during the expansion of the tourist trade in Banff. The Banff Springs Hotel turned away roughly 5,000 guests each summer, coinciding with rumours that the nearby Mount Stephen House booked three or four guests to a room by sending three on excursions while the fourth occupied the room pro tem.429 Whether Anglicans attended services at St. George’s-in-the-Pines with the same enthusiasm is immaterial in light of the idea that Anglicans expected that their religion should be materially represented alongside important cultural enterprises.

Summary

The spread of church architecture no less than civil and consumer society masked fashion as science and knowledge. Wealthy and powerful people who benefited from the uneven situation of capitalism veiled Canada’s social inequities behind egalitarian terms that included ‘prosperity’, ‘progress’, and ‘science’. On the one hand, the exchanges of cultural, economic, and artistic capital appeared to offer social mobility to any participant. The distribution of church pattern books certainly appeared to make taste (or more properly fashion) available to all. On the other hand, the social elite and the architects they employed continued to claim that the ‘truly’ enduring qualities of taste related to one’s pedigree, education, and wealth. As a result, a large part of the social apparatus, contemporaneously advertised as egalitarian, was used to deny social mobility to a large portion of the working class and poorer populace.

Many religious institutions forged new territory, creating a regulatory infrastructure ahead of the political apparatus. This explains why Alberta and Saskatchewan established Anglican ‘provinces’ within the larger Church structure before the two regions made political union with the Dominion of Canada.430 As an important
component in identity formation, settlement expansion in the Prairies and Alberta was felt in regional rather than national terms. The railway project to connect the coasts across an unimaginable distance was emblematic of the ambitions of church-builders to unify specific but distant communities through religion. In reality, religion was offered to everyone even though churches benefited from the wealthy and thus provided residual benefits accordingly. Thus, churches were not places of social equality that the pattern books advertised.

The potency of church-building and of the pattern books’ imagery emanated from configurations of public taste. Similar patterns of public taste in the late-nineteenth century were constituted in the new commercial practices existing in department stores. The cycle of production and consumption was awakened by objectives to create and market new knowledge systems, including new construction techniques in church-building. The spread of these new knowledge systems connected settlement expansion with the enactment of civil society. The book trade in Canada spread the imagery of civil society, particularly in relation to the importance of religion whether or not piety was actually at the heart of the new commercial society. Thus, the church pattern books demonstrated how new marketing schemes were adopted to sell the old ideas of religion in societies still making transition from agrarian to commercial structures, an activity representative of map-making, planning, and communication systems.

In the view of European settlers, the spread of knowledge in books contrasted sharply with the oral traditions of indigenous peoples. The juxtaposition served to enhance western ideology, and Anglican doctrine. Thus, national imaginings more ephemeral than actual were equated with the westerly spread of booksellers, and thus
European knowledge. Despite the social freedoms marketed alongside the development of Canada, the constrained rules of Imperialism and monopoly resonated with the public. The transfer of knowledge from Europe and the U.S. to Canada indicated the power of British culture and the hegemony of the U.S. commercial market. The pattern books followed the grand historical narratives of dominant cultures constituted as such by advanced capital. The pattern books also represented the categorization of architectural styles, nuanced by the variety of imagery on display. The next – and final – chapter of the thesis will explore the problematics of national imaginings inherent in the unfinished business of Confederation marketed as the final stage of building the country. A particular focus will be the religious implications associated with driving the last spike into the thin ribbon of CPR rail lines that connected the provinces from two coasts and how that act endorsed a cleansing of past transgressions against First Nations, Métis and other ‘others’ deemed marginal in the pursuit of progress.
V. Unfinished Business: Church-Building and Pattern Book Consumption in Post-Confederation British Columbia

*I hope that its new colony in the Pacific (British Columbia) may be but one step in the career of steady progress by which my dominions in North America may be ultimately peopled in an unbroken chain from the Atlantic to the Pacific by a loyal and industrious population.*

Her Majesty Queen Victoria, 1858

*A Province which Canada should be proud to possess, and whose association with the Dominion she ought to regard as the crowning triumph of Federation.*

Frederick Temple Blackwood, Lord Dufferin

The expansion of settlement populations in British Columbia after the 1880s was chiefly driven by the mutual efforts of miners, loggers, railway workers, clergymen as well as merchants and financiers whose capital aided rapid development. The exploitation of resources was paramount as was the feeling that ordinary men could make fortunes by opening up the Pacific terminus to trade with Asia. Trade with California and amongst various points along the Pacific Rim during the 1880s and 90s subsided in favour of a more robust regional economy in British Columbia by 1910, having been nurtured by a sharp increase in its population, the developing wheat economy, the extension of American railroads, and finance capital introduced by entrepreneurs.

Canada’s monumental project, the CPR, echoed in scale the vast potential of the trade that the railway would initiate with Asia. The railway’s ability to compress travel time between and within the coasts became synonymous with forming a Canadian identity, though British Columbia’s signature on the BNA Act of 1871 did not complete
the nation. At best it added another economic component to Confederation negotiations that eventually incorporated other Prairie regions including Saskatchewan and Alberta.

The religious rhetoric around settlement expansion in the west may have focused on nationalist and loyalty issues but missionaries and clergymen concentrated on building more churches merely to keep ahead of each other. Church-building in British Columbia reflected the religious and social values of the settlers expanding into the region although it also represented a chief factor in the disruption of the lives of First Nation people. The immense impact that European settlers had on First Nations cultural, language, and social customs was to a large extent filtered through the appropriation of land without treaty. In this situation, the imported pattern books displayed the primacy of British cultural and economic capital no less than U.S. architectural expertise.

This chapter begins by examining the controversies around marketing British Columbia’s openness to development in light of its reluctance to complete treaties with First Nations and particularly with respect to misrepresentations about the west made in Canada’s formal document to immigrants, the Colonists’ Handbook No.1 (1882). The case studies used in this chapter will demonstrate Canada’s unfinished business as far as the constitution of identity is concerned. The specific cases include Anglican churches of St. James’, Vancouver (1881), St. Anne’s (1902) and St. Jerome’s (1903) in Steveston, St. John the Divine (1912) in Victoria on Vancouver Island, Christ Church (now cathedral) (1895) in Vancouver, St. Saviour’s (1869), Barkerville in the Cariboo region, and the church of St. Paul’s (1874) at Metlakathla built by Tsimshian First Nations. Comparative cases include, the Reformed Episcopal Church of Our Lord (1874), Metropolitan Methodist Church (1890), St. Andrew’s Presbyterian (1890), Victoria, as
well as, the Holy Cross (1905), Skookumchuck built by the Skatin, Samaquham, and Douglas First Nations on the northwest coast mainland.

5.1  Promoting British Columbia as Terminus of Confederation and the Gothic Revival

The gold discoveries along the Fraser River in 1858 and subsequent finds in Cariboo including the well-known Barkerville gold rush propelled other industries in British Columbia. For instance, the development of a shipping port at Ladysmith on Vancouver Island in 1900, that was built to receive coal mined at the Nanaimo deposits, drew upon the body of wealth created by the earlier gold finds. Plans to build rail termini in Port Moody and subsequently Vancouver relied upon the labour once searching the goldfields.

The optimistic assertion that the entry of BC into Confederation completed the national infrastructure was evident in Canada’s Colonists’ Handbook No.1 (1882). Projecting Canada’s infrastructure as ‘mature’ was crucial for attracting immigration and foreign investment capital, which contradicted the actual embryonic state of its economy. The handbook advertised Canada’s advanced government, militia, and education. In trade, Canada was described as a net exporter to the United Kingdom, demonstrating already established trade routes for exports and the opportunity for increased imports. Residents of Canada were described as enjoying superior communications in railway, postal, and telegraph services. ‘Improved farms’ that had three or four feet of rich black loam top soil could be purchased, according to the handbook, in Manitoba and the Northwest Territories for £1 per acre. In Ontario 200 acres of free farm land was advertised to anyone over the age of eighteen provided they clear fifteen acres and construct a permanent dwelling. Most significantly, the handbook
noted that a plentiful amount of Anglican churches were waiting for new immigrants, whose faithful were ready to assist with the adjustments to life in the colonies.\textsuperscript{434}

These points demonstrated a commonly used ploy to persuade immigration. The idea was to hasten immigration on the basis that opportunity and resources in the New World were fast disappearing. Potential immigrants were made to feel that Canada’s infrastructure was sufficiently developed to encourage their comfortable existence. Potential entrepreneurs were made to believe that the imminent completion of Canada’s rail infrastructure was the pivotal time for investment.

In British Columbia, a similar strategy was performed by the emigrants’ handbook, entitled \textit{The Province of British Columbia, Canada: its Resources, Commercial Position, and Climate} (1890). The publisher of this document was not the government of Canada but the Canadian Pacific Railway. Its opening phrase described how the CPR had given birth to western economy; in its own words, the company had “suddenly transformed [BC] into an easily accessible and profitable field for commercial enterprise [from earlier] mere dabbling on the shores of the ocean of commerce”.\textsuperscript{435} The handbook was associated with Britain’s plan to connect Europe with Asia through an uninterrupted flow of trade across British North America. Canada’s contribution to the effort was nothing more than the fuel and food resources needed to drive the train from coast to coast. In furtherance of the grand vision, the Canadian Pacific Company had created steamship routes between Vancouver and Asia, demonstrating that the city’s future lay in speculative endeavour. The handbooks demonstrated the combined importance of space and commerce in the era of new settlement.
The provincial handbook marketed British Columbia’s ‘sudden expansion’, despite the relatively low population figures published in the 1881 census. Similarly, churches in British Columbia – with the exception of those built in the capital city of Victoria – did not follow the patterns of public taste created by the variety of designs illustrated in the church pattern books. The situation was caused by the short supply of money and skilled labour. There was also the expectation of further growth in small towns that translated into the anticipation of renewed and more splendid churches.

A colonists handbook promoting settlement in British Columbia published in 1886 attempted to persuade readers that Vancouver had outstripped Victoria as the economic centre of the west coast, when in reality the towns were matched in populations at 15,000. The handbook privileged the description of Vancouver’s economic development by including the value of new building constructions, the mileage of paved roadways, and increased property values. A proliferation of “grand edifices of stone, brick, and iron” that replaced the wooden buildings burned in the “conflagration of 1886” advertised Vancouver’s prominence. In reality, the brick and iron churches built in Victoria demonstrated the city’s advanced construction technology compared to Vancouver’s resilient timber church industry.

The ‘real’ state of affairs in Vancouver appeared in a letter written by the Anglican Priest Henry Glynne Fiennes-Clinton, the Rector of St. James’ Church (1885-1912). Clinton’s High Anglican inclinations stressed pastoral leadership and social consciousness. These were apparent in a letter about Vancouver, in which he wrote:

…all the swagger in the world will not build houses, and if they don’t mend soon they will have this place a city of shanties, without water, roads or drains. …The roads are quite impassable from the mud holes… Some new roads they have been making are worse as they cross boggy land and therefore there is no bottom to the
roads at all, and if you once get stuck you might reckon on taking forthwith a journey to the centre of the earth. \textsuperscript{440}

Pattern books professed to be able to solve these types of civic problems by promoting ‘improved’ and more tastefully designed churches. This was an extension of the idea that that which could be imagined could also be materially realized. In this way, the pattern books operated as pre-visualization tools.

5.5.1 Case Study: St. James’ Anglican Church, Vancouver, BC

In 1881 George ‘Father’ Ditcham, an Anglican Vicar, built a “small neat church”, dedicated to St. James fifty yards from Westminster Street (later Main) in Granville (eventually Vancouver) (fig. 5.1). The clapboard-clad church building was generally admired for its “taste and orderliness”.\textsuperscript{441} The building was nominally Neo-Gothic because of its quasi-pointed windows, steep roof, separate chancel, and trefoil cut-outs in the window heads. Ironically, St. James’ open belfry rang the initial alarm on June 13, 1886 to warn of the fire that eventually consumed the church along with most of the buildings in Vancouver.\textsuperscript{442}

The site of the original St. James church was chosen because the land was provided for free by the San Francisco-based milling firm of Heatly and Company. After the fire the congregation acted upon an earlier intention to relocate and negotiated two town lots from the CPR. The architect Thomas Sorby (1836-1924), who worshipped at St. James’, was engaged to draw up the plans.\textsuperscript{443} The depletion of the congregation’s coffers threatened to forestall the project but a one-year pew leasing campaign, in 1887, realized most of the needed funds. Re-opening ceremonies in 1887 were followed a year later by the church’s consecration, which was only allowed to occur once debts accumulated during construction had been paid off.
A *Victoria Times* correspondent noted the following particulars of the church: the nave measured 51 feet by 30 feet and the chancel measures 25 feet by 22 feet, dimensions that were later advocated in Frank E. Kidder’s *Trussed Roofs and Roof Trusses* (1910). Kidder believed that open timber roofs, such as the one inside St. James, should not exceed 35 feet in width.

5.2 An “Empty” Land: The Possession and Erasure of First Nations

The Treaty of Oregon in 1846 between British and the U.S. authorities stabilized an international border. This enabled the British Columbia government to begin treaty negotiations with its diverse First Nations population living on Vancouver’s Island, even though most of the mainland was appropriated without signed treaties. As Chief Factor of the Hudson’s Bay Company, which had assumed the responsibility for the colonization of Vancouver Island, James Douglas (later Governor of British Columbia) negotiated fourteen treaties with the Coast Salish people including the Songhee, Sooke, Saanich, Fort Rupert and Nanaimo bands. The potency of these treaties was in their repetition of wording, allowing Douglas to efficiently dispossess First Nations of large amounts of land in as expedient and cheap a manner as possible. In exchange for one-time payments and perpetual hunting and fishing rights, the Coast Salish bands accepted the proposal that “the land” excepting the ground already built upon by band members “becomes the property of the white people for ever”.

These treaties were used as binding legal and social contracts aimed at the rapid accumulation of land for European settlers. With First Nations isolated onto relatively small Reserves, European settlement and industry moved into what appeared to be ‘empty’ space. Compliance with treaties was achieved because European settlers
talked First Nations into believing that the two cultures’ continued friendship depended upon adhering to printed contracts, which represented the Divine right of English law. The situation illustrates government officials’ paternalistic and absolutist attitudes towards First Nations compared to the democratic and capitalist attitudes advertised in the pattern books.

Printed documents were instrumental not only in generating compliance from First Nations but also in making Aboriginal people seem invisible. For instance, the omission of First Nations from the Colonists’ Handbook and The Province of British Columbia: its Resources, Commercial Position and Climate handbook reflected the perceived irrelevance of Aboriginal people to the development of privileged society. First Nations that built Neo-Gothic churches using features found among the pattern books inadvertently reinforced their own invisibility because the buildings appeared as though they accommodated European settlers.

Even the rhetoric and illustrations in the pattern books represented a kind of social contract with the First Nations, positioning aboriginal craftsmen to build churches in the Gothic Revival fashion. The architecture of these First Nations churches advertised that aboriginal conversion to Christianity was more than nominal. Indeed, religion was the socially pacifying arm of colonization and the pattern books were its architectural and moral connection.

Renewed attempts at treaties with First Nations between 1864 and 1871 occurred under the authority of James Douglas’ replacement, Joseph Trutch (1826-1904) an engineer and politician. Trutch disdained the First Nations and undid Douglas’ practices by refusing First Nations ancestral rights to land. Trutch acted out the paternalistic
attitudes, and in accordance with the view of many settlers, that positioned First Nations as social inferiors who needed to be “nurtured in the ways of civilization”, chiefly represented by the Roman Catholic, Anglican, and Methodist Churches. The plan of action involved the provision of religious-based re-education for First Nations in segregated Reserves, which had the effect of making aboriginal people appear to be immigrants in their own land. The Neo-Gothic churches built by First Nations appeared to materially veil First Nations from the land by sheltering them inside buildings that looked like they accommodated European settlers.

5.2.1 Case study: St. Paul’s, Metlakatla (1874)

In 1867, the Anglican missionary William Duncan (1832-1918) partnered with 800 Tsimshian from Fort Simpson to found the town of Metlakatla, BC. Metlakatla was situated on the west coast of British Columbia near the border of Alaska. The town was planned around a massive timber church, dedicated St. Paul, reported to be the largest north of San Francisco and west of Chicago (fig. 5.2). For this reason, virtually all of the photographic images of the town depict the church, which was completed in 1874. A series of single-family dwellings with white picket fences lined the streets surrounding the church, creating the appearance of an English Victorian village. The mock Englishness of the town was a paternalistic strategy intended to acculturate the Tsimshian as though they were immigrants to Canada.

The Tsimshian were led to believe that their adoption of British architecture would raise their social status. Unfortunately, white settlers looked upon the village as a social experiment, thereby objectifying and degrading the Tsimshian, even while publicly applauding the efforts to ‘civilize’ themselves.
The structure of life in Metlakatla around religion and industry helped to sustain an image of the Tsimshian as socially and economically responsible people. For that reason, official representations showed the civilizing practices of religious services, religious education, and work in the village’s saw mill, soap factory, fish cannery, and general store; Duncan’s disciplinary measures taken for non-compliance with these activities were less often broadcast.  

Duncan’s complex ‘paternal’ bond with the Tsimshian was strained at times, particularly because of his unwillingness to provide education above the first two years of primary school. His attitude was demonstrated by a list he kept of “things to be remembered when discoursing with the Indians” that read like a series of grievances including their “superstitious trust in signs”, “easily being excited to rebellion”, and “unwillingness to engage in any public duty”. Duncan believed that these social failures could be overcome by the combined civilizing capacity of religion and commerce. Even though the village’s various businesses were unprofitable, in his view, the important part of commerce was its potential to instil a Christian work ethic. An apparent contradiction in Duncan was the size of his personal estate, valued at nearly $140,000 in cash in a Victoria bank, discovered after his death in 1918. Duncan’s view of Christian religion and morals as the antidote to the problems of technocratic society has not been satisfactorily reconciled against his large personal treasury, which he amassed by collecting and selling cultural artefacts made by the villagers.

The architecture of St. Paul’s was associated with the social structure of Metlakatla. The church was a monumental Carpenter’s Gothic building, erected entirely by Tsimshian labourers. The churches monumental proportions accommodated 1,100
seats. The building was planned like a massive longhouse that eclectically combined several Neo-Gothic features with Renaissance Revival motifs. The west end had asymmetrical twin-towers that framed a cathedral-like triple-gabled west entrance. Other features included the triangular pointed windows in the second level of the crenellated tower, otherwise all other window dressings were round-headed and appeared related to the transoms of houses. The overlarge architectural features, including the massive spur wall-like buttresses appeared related to the exaggerated features on totem carving.

The open timber roofing system at St. Paul’s follows Frank Kidder’s advice in his pattern book *Trussed Roofs and Roof Trusses* that demonstrated how to use horizontal tie beams in spans wider than thirty-five feet. This roofing technology was slightly different from ‘Howe’, or Bridge, trusses used in homes that had angled supports to resist compression. Instead, the rafters of St. Paul’s Church rested directly on top of the timbers of the top chord of the truss. In Kidder’s view, rafters needed to be “greatly enhanced” in their dimensions and “special calculations” were needed for cutting the timbers.\(^{458}\) The roofing system at St. Paul’s used a hybrid of the domestic truss and the hammer-beam variety typical of Neo-Gothic churches built after the 1870s in Canada.

Despite the outward appearance of a compliant Aboriginal community, the Tsimshian regularly engaged in forms of resistance that ranged from subtle to overt. Church services were routinely held in Tsimshian language. A chapel in Metlakatla had two interior support beams carved to represent the four phratries of the Coast Tsimshian (fig. 5.3).\(^{459}\) In addition, Tsimshian people kept ceremonial masks hidden inside the walls of their homes, thus resisting the ban on the Potlatch.\(^{460}\)
The renown of the church at Metlakatla attracted the attention of the bishop of Caledonia, William Ridley, who attempted to appropriate two acres of land on Mission Point in Metlakatla where the church stood. The bishop’s attempts to assume control of the church were met with strong opposition because the Tsimshian did not favour the bishop’s High Church ritual form of worship. Coincidently, the Crown sided with the bishop in a combined attempt to appropriate the land under the Tsimshian. Angry residents of Metlakatla expelled the Crown’s surveyor, causing a Commissioners’ inquiry. The inquiry held in 1884 determined that Duncan’s leadership had been the problem, perhaps as a way for the authorities to avoid direct conflict with the Tsimshian. It was a simple matter to blame Duncan in the inquiry because he had already been removed from service by the CMS.461

During the prolonged land dispute, the people of Metlakatla demonstrated that they clearly understood the connection between property and their church. They had written to the magistrate “asking him to carry out the law relating to churches in Indian settlements…”462 Upon discovering that the magistrate intended to do nothing in their favour:

[They] notified the agents of the church missionary society that they had taken and intended to hold possession of the school house (sic) which [Bishop Ridley] had been using as a rival church. They had done this, they said, because by the recent ‘attempt to surreptitiously survey their property’ they were convinced that their protest, now in the hands of the government… was ignored, and they felt it incumbent on them to assert and defend their rights.463

The situation was not entirely veiled from the view of BC’s urban citizens. A letter printed in the Victoria Daily Colonist demonstrated support for the Tsimshian’s property rights by noting:
[w]hat right have we to make away with [their land]? But even if we have a title it is only in trust for the benefit of the Indians that we have it. But is it for their benefit to give away their land to religious teachers whom they do not want [Ridley]? There would, I apprehend, be no question here but for the entering into it of the Church of England, a name which is often potent to cover a multitude of sins.  

The land dispute at Metlakatla in the mid 1880s, which focused on the church-building, demonstrated that the governments had already defined their adversarial position towards First Nations ahead of the second wave of treaty negotiations in 1899.

The land disputes galvanized the Tsimshian and the 600 to 700 members of the community left with William Duncan to found New Metlakatla on Annette Island in Alaska. Their search for a higher level of autonomy and recognised property rights were granted from the U.S. Government. Because the Tsimshian began to recognise their legitimate claim to the land rather early in the history of such disputes in British Columbia it is possible to view the naissance of Metlakatla as a place where architectonics staged claims to recognized property title.

5.2.2 Comparative Case Study: Holy Cross Church, Skookumchuck, BC

Elaborate western towers are major elements in First Nations churches in BC. The entrance portion of the church building reflected the symbolic importance of longhouse entrances, which had ceremonial doorways cut into family totems. The Roman Catholic Church of the Holy Cross in Skookumchuck, built in 1895 by labourers from the Skatin, Samahquam, and Douglas bands of the In-Shuck-ch Nation (fig. 5.4).

In addition to the triple octagonal tower arrangement small bulls-eye windows on the twin-towers echo a larger rose window that fills the area of the west gable. The building is clad with horizontal timbers joined with a three-quarter tongue and groove technique to provide a richer aesthetic than the plain clapboard finish. Since the church
tower has the least liturgical significance of religious architecture, it could be argued that 
First Nations emphasis of towers underlined their nominal conversion to Christianity.

A ceiling-height altar dominates the interior of the rectangular body of Holy Cross 
Church. The altar is comprised of a combination of hand-carved and manufactured 
elements. A centrally placed figure of Christ is among the latter group shipped to the site 
by wagon. The wagon road, a commercial route since 1850, followed the precipitous 
banks of the Lillooet River, sometimes four meters above the rushing water that gave 
Skookumchuck (rapid flowing waters) its name.

The Roman Catholic Oblates of the Order of Mary Immaculate arrived in the area 
a few months before dramatic economic developments in 1896 brought large numbers of 
settlers and workers to Canada West.\textsuperscript{466} The Cariboo gold rush also drew great numbers 
of miners through the territory by the wagon road that linked First Nations workers with 
labour markets to the south in Steveston (near Vancouver), a major fish processing plants 
in the Dominion.

Though there was no railway in the immediate area, architectural ideas still 
managed to be transferred within about a 100-mile radius. Half-price rail tickets were 
made available to First Nations in order to encourage their attendance at the consecration 
of Our Lady of the Rosary, Sechelt (1890), built by the Belgian-born architect Joseph 
Bouillon.\textsuperscript{467} Bringing First Nations to this event by rail was intended to show how 
industry, commerce, and religion had civilized the First Nations.

Other churches that followed the arrangement of the western façade were St. 
Michael the Archangel, Musqueam (1902). Its octagonal twin-towers had become a main 
motif among the more elaborate of First Nations churches in BC. Similar octagonal
towers were used by the Sta’atl’imx at Skawaylax or Pavilion, BC in their church built in 1898. The Roman Catholic churches of St. Louis, Bonaparte (1890, survives), St. Mary’s, Scowlitz (c.1900, condition unknown) and the church at Fountain, BC (c.1890-1900, demolished in 1950s) also used the elaborate octagonal tower and all of them were related to the church at Sechelt.468 Henry Hudson Holly illustrated comparable octagonal towers in Church Architecture (1871) (fig. 5.5) and Frederick Withers did likewise in his book entitled Church Architecture: Twenty-One Plans (1873). The visual imagery in the books would have been ‘readable’ to First Nations challenged by literacy, though there is as yet no evidence that any of these volumes were in the possession of Native leaders.

5.3 British Capital and U.S. Participation in Developing Infrastructure in British Columbia

Aspects of British Columbia’s infrastructure relied on British capital finance and generally reflected that cultural affinity. John Dart (1895-1910), the bishop of New Westminster, demonstrated the situation in the publication titled Work for the Far West (1898-1914). He inaugurated the journal for the purpose of soliciting donations to BC’s missionary enterprise.469 Work for the Far West was a joint colonial/imperial scheme involving written accounts of the taxing efforts made by BC’s clergymen to progress the Church of England in Canada. With specific reference to the pattern books and the transmission of architectural knowledge, the journal’s editors offered to “give patterns for churches and other work to be done for the diocese, and will recommend or lend books to be read in working parties”.470

One of the books the journal recommended was a novella entitled A Home in the North-West (1903). The book was not a picture book of churches but its narrative bears directly upon the social structures occurring during the period. The story detailed the
fictional adventures of a family of British settlers to Canada, whose “everlasting”
contribution to the Dominion’s social formation was the construction of an Anglican
church in the rural Northwest. The fictionalized social space of the novella included free
and equal association between domestic servants and their employers, an encounter with
the ‘noble savage’, and a community rallying around crises. According to the story’s
protagonist Ada, the family needed to build a church for:

… the lonely ones, the young men who have no sisters, no women to make a home of
their log shacks, and no church to go to near enough without an amount of exertion
and arrangement for which real zeal is necessary? If there were but a church at the
Creek, only three miles away, what a blessing it would be. And to have a clergyman
…who could help Rupert now of an age for confirmation, but by no means growing
more inclined towards it, the rough outdoor life seeming to raise his boyish animal
spirits to a dangerous extent.471

The bishop who pays the family a visit after surviving a brush-fire is the hero of the story
whose brief appearance is there to certify that:

The greatest deprivation is the distance from the church. [It] is not only a centre of
spiritual life, it is a centre of civilization too.472

From the perspective of the early twentieth century, Ada’s story (the novella is told from
her perspective) is a myth. Her plea to build a church for the general welfare of the
sparsely distributed population is a myth. In the end, the church is only being built to
allow her marriage, reinforcing her subjectivity and subservient position in paternalistic
society.

The church that the family builds was an object of commerce no less than a locus
of identification. Because the family agreed to raise £50 toward the completion of a £250
church the bishop “drew out a pencil and notebook, and at once began to sketch both
groundplan and elevation of a simple and neat wooden structure, with a bell-turret and a
The church therein described was the Ecclesiologist’s model, St. Michael’s, Longstanton, with its western bell-cote and separately articulated east end. Ironically in the story, the solace and salvation that British settlers to Canada were searching for, as opposed to impious profit, was mediated through the work of Britain’s history. The family’s situation was a metaphor for Canada’s reliance on British capital and U.S. engineering technology.

But, where the railway was exclusive churches were ubiquitous. The estimated £25 million of invested capital in the CPR, which was backed up by British loan guarantees, connected many but not all towns in the west. The CPR was a monumental factor in the development of Canada’s infrastructure – still small in terms of the money spent on comparative projects in Britain – but far less money achieved the construction of churches in virtually every town in the Dominion. Britain’s officials did not need to be convinced of the merits of building churches in the Dominion, though their continued financial support for church-building in British Columbia was problematic. By contrast, large-scale negotiations were required to convince Britain’s bureaucrats of the merits of funding a massive endeavour such as the railway. As early as 1861, commercial enterprise pushed for the Canada’s transcontinental railway as demonstrated by the Illustrated London News that reported:

[s]uch a great highway would give shorter distances by both sea and land, with an immense saving of time. As regards the great bugbear of the general traveller, sea distance, it would, to an from Liverpool, save, as compared with the Panama route, a tossing, wearying navigation of 6000 miles to Japan, of 5000 miles to Canton, and of 3000 miles to Sydney… such as route must become the great highway to and from Europe; and whatever nation possess that highway must wield of necessity the commercial sceptre of the world.
The correspondent urged the British Parliament to take the initiative in guaranteeing the necessary capital. In 1861, Canada was portrayed as being in its formative stages of development and therefore, in the colonial mandate, deserving of financial assistance. By the turn of the century, the Church Mission Society and the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel in Foreign Parts (SPG) had made it clear they did not think it necessary to fund church missions in British Columbia.

5.3.1  Case Study: St. Anne’s (1901-2) and St., Jerome’s (1903), Steveston

The bishop of New Westminster, John Dart, had worked as Organizing Secretary of the SPG, a major funding agent of missionary activity in Canada. He knew in advance that the society was planning to withdraw its funding of BC’s church in 1900. In the SPG’s view, British Columbia was expected to be economically mature at the turn of the century, and thus able of to “pay its own way” as far as missionary service and church-building were concerned. As already mentioned, Bishop Dart instigated Work for the Far West as a nascent lobby for the continuance of Britain’s funding for BC’s church-building. Work for the Far West facilitated the exchange of economic and symbolic capital between Britain’s working classes and the ‘pioneer’ settlers on the northwest coast.

Canadian missionaries and clergymen needed money to build churches and religious authorities in Britain urged the working classes to enrich their spiritual selves by giving monetary aid to the religious development of the Empire’s outposts. With the exception of a single large private donation from Baroness Angela Burdett-Coutts, whose gift of £15,000 established the diocese of British Columbia, money for church-building in British Columbia was extracted from many poor people who were least able to afford it,
Britain’s working classes. The scheme worked because Britain’s working classes were already pre-disposed to worry about the disappearance of the village lifestyle that they believed was lost to them; the British working classes imagined the village lifestyle was salvageable in Canada. In this regard, an Anglican missionary in Steveston, British Columbia, connected with potential donors in Tewkesbury, England – the headquarters of the St. Anne’s Society, a parish guild of the working classes. The Society was organized and operated by the Rev. Jerome J. Mercier and his wife, Anne, who likely knew John Dart prior to his appointment in BC. Church-builders in British Columbia became adept at raising money from Britain to augment religious revenue and local donations, which demonstrated the tactical strength of the colonial position. Though BC needed the Mother Country the reverse was also true in the sense that Britain imagined Canada as a place of new possibilities and pastoral settings.

The editor of the illustrated journal Work for the Far West, Anne Mercier who also penned the novella A Home in the Northwest (1903), facilitated fund-raising for the construction of two churches in Steveston, BC by publishing solicitations for money from the town’s Anglican vicar, the Rev. Joseph McAfee Donaldson (1835-1918). Anne was married to the Rev. Jerome Mercier the Treasurer of the St. Anne’s Society in Tewkesbury, Gloucestershire, a textile manufacturing town in the vicinity of England’s south-west midlands.

Money from the St. Anne’s Society completed the interior of Donaldson’s first Steveston church, which was begun the previous year on an unfinished site purchased from a group of Baptists. The Society also partially funded the construction of a second church in 1903, dedicated St. Jerome’s in honour of its patron the Rev. Jerome J. Mercier.
Donaldson’s initial requests in 1902 for £80 (about $400) to help St. Anne’s Church ballooned to a request in 1903 for £200 to help build the new church. Donaldson naturally understood the importance of emphasizing the deficiency in local resources in order to inspire donations from Britain. In reality, the sixteen-hour workday in any of Steveston’s fifteen canneries, and not its economically constructed ‘pioneer village’ image, was similar to the workday in Britain’s industrialized towns.

St. Anne’s Church (1895), which was illustrated in the Work for the Far West journal, was a two-cell structure with separately articulated chancel and porch entrance (fig. 5.6). No image or description of St. Jerome’s Church (1903) survives, though it was likely modelled on St. Anne’s plain timber aesthetic. St. Anne’s had separately articulated building components that reflected the interior liturgical arrangements; thus, a separate roof-line reads on the interior as the division of nave and chancel. However, the pitch of the roof was too shallow for Ecclesiological correctness either on account of economy or because local builders could not be convinced to construct something unfamiliar. The similarity between the silhouette at St. Anne’s silhouette and the housing stock at Steveston indicates the waning of Ecclesiological Gothic and its replacement by more economical forms.

Ironically, Ecclesiological principles in Neo-Gothic construction clearly mattered to Rev. Donaldson, who had engaged the architect Leonard Perry to erect, in Mortlake, Australia in 1864, a replica of the Ecclesiological Society’s chief colonial model, the 13th century church of St. Michael’s Long Stanton, Cambridgeshire. St. Michael’s was illustrated in several pattern books including Raphael and J. Arthur Brandon’s Parish Churches (1848) (see Chapter II). Donaldson was unable to repeat the erection of his
Mortlake church in Steveston on account of limited funds, skilled labour shortages, and a general disinterest in Ecclesiology.

Except for the arrangement of lancet windows, St. Anne’s lacks all of the features of St. Michael’s Long Stanton – the steep roof, low walls, and distinctive bell-côte crowning the west end – and retains all of the plainness typical of a group of west coast Anglican churches built at the turn of the century. The Long Stanton model may have been rejected because of its High Anglican associations though it is more likely that by the turn of the century few people in BC cared or knew that much about Ecclesiological principles in architecture. Besides, timber churches were generally considered temporary buildings, which anticipated the permanent church buildings done in whatever variety of Neo-Gothic would be fashionable.

The moral and civilizing effect of Neo-Gothic architecture marketed in the pattern books neither soothed, sustained, nor expanded Donaldson’s congregation in Steveston. In 1902, a riot broke out between striking First Nations cannery workers and Asian workers willing to accept a fraction of the pay-scale. Donaldson was not able to encourage a large congregation to develop in either of his churches, due in part to his having had a bigamist marriage in Kapunda, Australia that he refused to annul. In addition, Donaldson was accused of improprieties by the local folk, including keeping stray chickens that wandered into his yard and the theft of an organ from the Opera House. 1902 was a particularly violent time for the small community and Donaldson was not immune to its effects, having chased his timber supplier, Mr. French, down the main street of Steveston on horseback in full view of the town and the visiting Anglican
bishop. The incident occurred because Donaldson found his church padlocked by French on account of overdue payments for the wood used in construction.

A poor judge of his own leadership capability, Donaldson hastily and incorrectly speculated on the expansion of his church. Erecting St. Jerome’s only a few years after completing St. Anne’s was a poor gamble to increase church attendance among his preferred target audience, the farming community. The gamble was doubly speculative because Donaldson accumulated a £200 debt because of the church’s construction. Though not large by some standards the amount represented more money than Donaldson could ever hope to raise locally. Thus, he called upon Anne Mercier by explaining that:

in order to make the Church more worthy of the honoured name which it is to commemorate, I have made it much better, and therefore more expensive than would otherwise have been necessary or expedient. To do this I have taken upon myself personally the entire responsibility in the matter of finding the necessary funds, which is a venture of faith as well as hope. 480

The letter was more a plea for funds from the St. Anne’s Society in Tewkesbury and less an assertion that Donaldson would undertake to find the money locally.

Donaldson was keen to project the impression that his ministry was expanding despite the actual poor attendance of worshippers. He was also careful to present his solicitations for money as one-time gifts rather than on-going occurrences, thus minimizing resistance from donors worried about perpetual petitions. His success in raising moderate amounts of money from those working classes who could least afford it in Britain was that, in the view of donors, the association of nation-building with the completion of churches. In reality, the construction of an increasing number of churches was a factor of advancing economies rather than the culmination of the Canadian nation-state. That is, missionaries moved more or less in tandem with groups of workers and
settlers, the largest and most rapidly expanding of which were associated with gold mining. For that reason, reports made by missionaries often contained some discussion about the development of mining and other forms of commercial activity near their parishes.

5.3.2 Case Study: St. Saviour’s Church, Barkerville, BC (1869)

The discovery of placer gold in the Cariboo in 1859 combined with interest in establishing Anglican churches in the interior of British Columbia led the Rev. James Reynard to build St. Saviour’s church in the centre of the gold mining camp at Barkerville, BC in 1869.\(^\text{481}\) Rev. Reynard together with the builders Bruce and Mann built a remarkable timber-frame Neo-Gothic church that exhibited an eclectic array of Neo-Gothic features marketed in the pattern books (fig. 5.7). The church was clad using a vertical board-and-batten technique illustrated in the Ecclesiological Society’s pattern book \textit{Instrumenta Ecclesiastica} (fig. 5.8). Board-and-batten had broader popularity in the Maritimes and on the Eastern Seaboard of the U.S. This explains why Frank Wills, who practiced in New Brunswick and then moved to New York City included an example in his pattern book \textit{Ancient English Architecture}. The vertical character of the board-and-batten technique was emphasized because the church was built up on six-foot stilts hidden behind the exterior cladding. The stilts were necessary to raise the church above the level of the river that formed down Barkerville’s main thoroughfare during the spring run-off.

Gold speculation proved unsustainable, particularly in the Barkerville area, curbing religious activity. The mining camp, the town, and the Anglican parish at Barkerville failed in 1870, one year after its inauguration.\(^\text{482}\) Rev. Reynard blamed the
isolation of the remote community and the impossibility of achieving economic stability
in a town built upon gold speculation.\textsuperscript{483} Contributing to Rev. Reynard’s failure was the
prior establishment of the Methodist Church under the Rev. Thomas Derrick. Reynard’s
ability to raise money for church-building was diminished because Derrick had already
accumulated $1,850 from the townspeople and the populace were unwilling to contribute
to two churches. Records do not indicate the source of the funds used to construct St.
Saviour’s Church in Barkerville.

In 1898, new placer finds in the area of Barkerville also renewed interest in the
town’s Anglican mission. The Rev. Field Yolland was sent to revive St. Saviour’s Church
though he relied heavily on donations solicited through \textit{Work for the Far West} to
augment his missionary income in order to make his parish run. Rev. Yolland resorted to
farming in nearby Quesnel where he built a new church, at a cost of $250, which became
a successful parish.

5.4 \textbf{The Alternate Influence of U.S. Artistic, Cultural, and Economic Capital on
British Columbia’s Churches}

Americans were influential in the development and consumption of British
Columbia’s infrastructure, even though there were periodic complaints about the loss of
Canadian jobs. California miners and workers were drawn to BC in 1858 for the Fraser
River Gold Rush. In addition, Americans were appointed to high-profile positions in the
CPR including Cornelius William Van Horne (1843-1915, born Frankfort, Illinois) and
his successor Thomas Shaughnessy (1853-1923, born Milwaukee, Wisconsin) serving as
president of the railway company. On the railway tracks, the CPR’s cars carried
American goods and passengers, and its complement of 400 Pullman sleepers were
produced in George Pullman’s company town near Chicago, Illinois.\textsuperscript{484}
The awarding of large projects to American architects drew attention from the Ontario Association of Architects and the Canadian Architect and Builder. The journal published the OAA’s letter of complaint to the Manufacturer’s Life Association, which had hired the U.S. firm of Donaldson & Meyer to design their new headquarters on Bay Street in Toronto.485

A clutch of architects, engineers, and surveyors, whose careers had matured in the U.S., built churches in British Columbia. The architect and builder Thomas McKay (1842-87; St. Peter’s Catholic Church, New Westminster 1886) moved from California; the architect Bruce Price (1845-1903; Van Horne Block, Vancouver 1888) worked in Baltimore and New York City, Charles Clow (1860-1899; Reformed Episcopal Church, New Westminster, 1899) moved from Detroit in 1883; Arlen H. Towle (n.d) arrived from San Diego in 1885 (First Presbyterian Church, Vancouver, 1893); and J.C.M. Keith (1858-1940; St. John the Baptist, Duncan 1905) practiced in San Francisco and San Diego. 486 The architect, J. Eugene Freeman (1856-1926) exemplified the cross-border architectural relationship between BC and California with regards to church-building and economy. Freeman trained two years in San Francisco under the prominent architect William F. Smith, advanced himself to partner, and then attached himself to the wealthy Dunsmuir family of California and BC. He was commissioned by them to build Grace Methodist Church in Cumberland, BC (1894) where the prestigious family maintained a second residence.487

Another no less robust example was the career of the architect John Teague (1835-1902) whose work in BC was influenced by a sojourn in the western United States. Teague’s Carpenter Gothic (identified by the bargeboard ‘cut-out’ designs under the
eaves of the roof) and his use of board and batten finishes came from pattern books by the U.S. architects A.J. Davis and A.J. Downing.\textsuperscript{488} Teague began to practice architecture in earnest in Victoria in 1873, just prior to the city’s expansion in the 1880s. Civic optimism was high because it was believed that the CPR terminus would ensure its positive economic future. The terminus eventually went only as far as Vancouver but optimism in Victoria ran high until roughly 1885. Large-scale civic, commercial, and religious buildings reflected that optimism. Teague appears to have imported a personal ‘manifest destiny’ to his Victoria practice that helped him compete with, and in many cases supersede, a previous generation of well-respected architects including H.O. Tiedemann and Edward Mallandaine, Sr.\textsuperscript{489} Teague received over 350 commissions during his long career, completing many buildings on Vancouver’s Island and in the capital city of Victoria.

After the CPR decided to build its western terminus in Vancouver, the city of Victoria re-constituted itself as a tourist destination combined with important shipping interests during the 1890s. The Province of British Columbia: its Resources Commercial Position, and Climate (1890) described Victoria as “wealthy, well-built, and very English”.

5.4.1 \textbf{Comparative Case Study: The Episcopal Church of Our Lady, Victoria BC}

The architect John Teague and the American Episcopal Church each gained a significant foothold in British Columbia in connection with the construction of the Reformed Church of Our Lord (1874), Victoria (fig. 5.9). Teague won the commission to build the new church for a group of 250 Anglicans who followed their Dean, Edward Cridge, in his dissent from the High Anglican values of the Bishop of British Columbia,
George Hills. Cridge invited the American Episcopal Church into British Columbia with the promise of building a church that would adopt Episcopal teachings and worship.

The Church of Our Lord was constructed on a double lot donated by a prominent parishioner, Sir James Douglas. Douglas was the second Governor of Vancouver Island and former Factor of the Hudson’s Bay Company. He also supplied 10% of the total $9,700 building cost. Teague’s design evoked the U.S. Carpenter’s Gothic popularized in pattern books by well-known American architects A.J. Davis and A.J. Downing. In particular, the Church of Our Lady shared architectural features with a Presbyterian church published in *A Hand Book of Designs, containing Plans in Perspective* (1868) by the Chicago architect Gurdon P. Randall (fig. 5.10). The architectural features included a western gable enclosing a round window, surmounted by a bell-cote and symmetrical finials. The extra width of the church designed by Gurdon was moderated by the vertical articulation of the board-and-batten cladding that was also used in Teague’s design for Our Lady. The skills required to frame and clad a timber church were discussed at length in the U.S. architect Samuel Sloan’s popular pattern book *The Model Architect* (1852). He went so far as to include a table that listed the various resistances of wood to cross strains, among which Red Pine was rated in the top 5%. This explains why Teague chose California Redwood for the construction of Our Lord in Victoria.

Sloan noted several problems in timber construction especially including the fact that carpenters knew how to measure but lacked the “geometrical science [and] thorough practical understanding of the composition and resolution of forces.” This was, in Sloan’s view, the domain of the architect. He advised carpenter’s to study this aspect of timber construction though Sloan’s underlying intent privileged the architect’s
knowledge and taste. Thus, Teague’s practice brought subtle but significant U.S. architectural influences to Victoria, ironically a city advertised for its ‘Englishness’.

5.5 **Sourcing Acceptable Architecture for Evangelical Congregations in British Columbia**

The Protestant Churches combined social reform and liturgical reform as a focal point of human salvation. The equation had a strong moral imperative, expressed in sermon. A reduction of ritual in worship set them apart from Roman Catholic and Anglican worshipers. For that reason, Methodists’ religious knowledge was constituted in and guided by printed material and the spoken word. The reciprocal relationship between congregants and their minister, during the church service, was characterized by readings and sermonizing. Architecture responded with enhanced acoustics and open interior spaces offering improved sightlines. Amphitheatrical seating plans became the standard furniture arrangement in Evangelical churches. A chancel was not needed because it had a ritual function that was diminished in Evangelical practice. For this reason, the chancel arch became an aesthetic motif used to frame the organ and the pulpit.

5.5.1 **Methodism: Social Reform and Church Reform**

The expansion of the merchant classes assisted the growth of the Methodist Churches in rural British Columbia, especially after the 1870s. Their growth was achieved chiefly by converting settlers and First Nations. Methodism attracted new worshippers, especially among the merchant and working classes who wanted personal access to spiritual enlightenment. Poorer congregants who felt marginalized by their inability to contribute to the financial needs of the Anglican found acceptance in the Methodist body.
The architectural complexity of Methodist churches increased in tandem with increasing wealth of their predominantly middle class congregants. Shop assistants, mechanics, and day-labourers joined in public demonstrations advocating temperance. Around this time, Non-Conformists began to represent themselves in church pattern books. These books included George Bidlake’s *Sketches of Churches: Designed for the Use of Nonconformists* (1865), F.J. Jobson’s *Chapel and School Architecture, as Appropriate to the Buildings of Nonconformists, Particularly to those of the Wesleyan Methodists: with Practical Directions for the Erection of Chapels and School-Houses* (1850), James Cubitt’s *Church Designs for Congregations* (1870), and Joseph Crouch’s *Church, Mission Halls, and Schools for Non-Conformists* (1901).494

These books appeared at a time when the Protestant sects were searching for a way to define how their churches should look. The three books were written exclusively for Methodist congregations and emphasized the importance of flexible interior spaces that could be converted into classrooms to teach the Gospel. Jobson’s book emphasized text over images in order to explain how to use architecture to satisfy the needs of Methodist worship. By contrast, Crouch’s and Bidlake’s books were almost entirely picture books depicting modified Neo-Gothic versions of churches acceptable to Anglicans. All three books were printed in Britain.

In the U.S., the architect Gurdon P. Randall of Chicago, Illinois published a suite of books between the 1860s and 1880s intended for Methodist church-building audiences. These books contained the author’s own designs, exclusively. He avoided Neo-Gothic in favour of an eclectic assortment of Neo-Renaissance and Free Classicism in order to architectonically underscore the doctrinal differences between the sects. In every other
way, Randall’s books corresponded to the rhetoric in the pattern books produced and consumed with Episcopal, or Anglican, audiences in mind. He promoted the supremacy of an architect’s knowledge and taste over that of a builder. He confirmed the importance of using new technologies in heating, ventilation, and new fire-proof building materials. He sold advertising space to manufacturers of goods directly related to the architecture depicted in his books. Randall’s economy, par excellence, was demonstrated in his republication of an earlier book under a new title with slightly different illustrations.495

5.5.2 Comparative Case Study: Metropolitan Methodist Church, Victoria, BC (1890)

In 1889, the Canadian Architect and Builder announced that the Victoria architect Thomas Hooper (1857-1935) was on a “visit to the east for the purposes of examining the best models of church architecture” in order to prepare “plans for a new Methodist church in Victoria.”(fig. 5.11)496 The Metropolitan Methodist congregation in Victoria had outgrown their church. In response, a building committee was organized with the intent of constructing a larger church facility that included office and Sunday school spaces under a single roof. These functional considerations coincided with debates about the aesthetics of Methodist churches. The committee was determined to avoid using Neo-Gothic, which had strong theological and ritualistic associations with the Anglican and Roman Catholic Churches.

The building committee chose Hooper because they admired his design for the Homer Street Methodist Church in Victoria (1888). Hooper may also have been helped by a personal contact with Ebenezer Robson, a Methodist missionary and brother of the British Columbia premier John Robson.497
While on the study tour in eastern North America, Hooper was attracted to the new style of Romanesque Revival popularized by the American architect Henry Hobson Richardson. This style used massive, sculpturally modelled round arches and compositional massing of load bearing walls. The richness of materials was articulated by rough exterior stonework. It is very likely that Hooper’s first exposure to the Romanesque Revival came through an illustration of the Palmerston Baptist Church, by the firm of Henry Langley and Edmund Burke in Ontario. A drawing of the church was printed in 1888 in the *Canadian Architect and Builder* (fig. 5.12). It was only a few months after the publication of the church in Palmerston that Hooper embarked on his journey to see, firsthand, what Romanesque Revival looked like.

Upon his return, Hooper designed the new church for the Metropolitan Methodist congregation combining Scottish Baronial motifs, including the towers and hanging turrets, with a Romanesque Revival structure. The church’s round corner tower, the massing of gabled ends joined at right angles, and the rusticated stonework are Romanesque Revival features. Though Hooper designed the building as a timber structure, the building committee opted for stone and the change put grave financial pressure on the contractor, Mr. W.H. Burkholder, whose bid of $50,224 did not include the richer material. He had to cover the difference himself. The *Victoria Daily Colonist* remarked on the “handsome” rose window of “elaborate and ornamented design”, provided by the Albion Iron Works, and also noted that the “walls were finished in ‘distemper’ of a pleasing neutral tint, while the ceiling was to be praised for the delicacy of its design.”
Hooper’s study tour was in part prompted by the lack of designs illustrated in pattern books that were appropriate for Methodists’ use. George Bidlake’s *Sketches of Churches: Designs for the Use of Nonconformists* (1865) was outdated by the standards of the 1880s because it used the longitudinal plan and Neo-Gothic format typical of Anglican churches. Clearly, Hooper was searching for the centrally planned church illustrated in Joseph Crouch’s *Church, Mission Halls, and Schools for Nonconformists* (1901) except this book had not been conceived in 1889 at the time of Hooper’s commission to build Metropolitan Methodist. Gurdon Randall’s suite of books would have been equally unhelpful to Hooper since Randall did not provide floor plans “without [monetary] compensation”.500

5.5.3 The Presbyterian Church in British Columbia

The Scottish ancestry of the majority of those allied with the Presbyterian Church accounted for a large, but not exclusive, part of that ministry. Because the aesthetics of church buildings reflected the cultural heritage of its congregants, the Scottish Baronial style became a viable architectural fashion for many Presbyterian groups. The relatively quick increase in the Presbyterian population strained the finances of individual congregations. Internal divisions developed such as the one between the Rev. Thomas Somerville and a group of congregants, which resulted in the establishment St. Andrew’s Presbyterian Church in Victoria.501 Wanting to erect a new church quickly, the building committee advertised a premium payment of $100 to the architect who supplied the most appropriate design. In 1868, the architect Hermann Otto Tiedemann was selected. By the late 1880s, and roughly coincident with the fire of 1889 that destroyed large parts of
urban Victoria, the congregation decided to erect a larger church that was more consistent with the Scottish heritage of the core part of the congregation.

5.5.4 **Comparative Case Study: St. Andrew’s Presbyterian Church, Victoria, BC (1890)**

Before construction began on the Presbyterian church of St. Andrew’s on Douglas and Broughton (fig. 5.13), the building was already pronounced “comfortable and complete in all its appointments” as well as “the most beautiful and imposing [church] in Victoria.” The Rev. Mr. Macleod described it as “commodious” prior to being able to set foot inside the church structure. The reason for the optimism was to sell new subscriptions in order to raise 2/3 of the building costs, estimated to be a total of $40,000.

The round headed windows of Trimen’s Romanesque Revival design were as far from gothic as a medieval revival church could come without attaching itself to Neo-Renaissance and Roman Catholicism. However, the ‘real’ innovation was the building’s auditorium plan and amphitheatrical seating in which “everyone commands a views of the pulpit platform and a back seat is as good as one in the front.” The architect’s attention to acoustics and improved lighting were evident in the arched ceiling and the use of the new technology of electric light. The eclectic use of polychromatic brickwork and a diaper-patterned roof demonstrated the design was fairly up to date.

Other Romanesque Revival churches of the day were illustrated in the *Canadian Architect and Builder*; these included, the Palmerston Baptist Church and St. Andrew’s Presbyterian by architects Power and Son. These illustrations demonstrate the centrally planned auditorium-style arrangement of space as opposed to the longitudinal axis. From the exterior, the centrally planned church appears to have two main facades, though one is usually primary as is the case with the Douglas St. Entrance of St. Andrew’s. The
adoption of two facades on the centrally planned church emphasized the structural
massing of spatial components, resulting in a heavier aesthetic.

The Presbyterian Church’s interest in using the Romanesque Revival as a way to
determine what a church of their order should look like was demonstrated in their ‘pattern
book’ Designs for Village, Town and City Churches. The book illustrates a design for a
church in Assiniboia by W.A. Langton of Toronto (fig. 3.19) who noted the stepped
gables, which was amplified in Trimen’s earlier design for St. Andrew’s. Within three
years of the completion of St. Andrew’s Church the congregation was undergoing
another serious internal dispute that threatened to cause a split. In a public display of
temper the Rev. Macleod notified the congregation about his displeasure over having his
stipend reduced. The congregation had been facing financial difficulties for several years
and had accumulated $12,340 in interest charges on a mortgage of $50,283. The annual
revenues were only $2,262, which was barely enough to pay their Reverend’s $2,000
stipend.

The financial troubles contributed to some internal tensions that had been brewing
for some time. Rev. Macleod and some prominent members of the congregation blamed
each other for the church’s financial problems. The situation became so heated that a
church tribunal was called with testimony heard from the Reverend and Mrs. Ballantyne,
who challenged the Rev. Mr. Macleod on moral grounds, highlighting the connection
between morality, economy, and religion.

5.6 Neo-Gothic’s ‘Final Gasp’ in Ecclesiastical Building in Victoria

The social fabric in Victoria appeared more or less unaffected by the shifts in
immigration occurring on the mainland. The only cultural difference exhibited in church-
building was Scottish Baronial and Renaissance Revival used by Protestant and Jewish congregations in the city. These choices reflected deeper cultural and architectural divergences. Thus, when the Anglicans at St. John the Divine decided to build a new church in Victoria, in 1912, they chose a design that consciously asserted ‘Englishness’.

The new church built on Quadra St. re-cycled the Early English gothic style popularized by Pugin and the Ecclesiologists in the 1840s.

5.6.1 Case Study: St. John the Divine, Victoria, BC

In 1912, when the Anglican Rev. Jenns, vicar of St. John the Divine in Victoria (fig. 5.14), called for the replacement of the church, locally known as the ‘Iron Church’. The new commission was given to his son-in-law the architect William Ridgway Wilson (1862-1957). The commission was Wilson’s first ecclesiastical building although he had been in practice for several years mainly building houses.

Wilson’s design for the church returned to the earliest moments of the 1840s Gothic Revival by his economical use of lancet windows, paired and triplets, and his judicious use of buttresses with double and triple weatherings. The unexciting composition at St. John the Divine demonstrated its architect’s ineffective struggle with the new fashions in Victoria’s religious architecture on display at the Metropolitan Methodist and St. Andrew’s Presbyterian churches.

The heavily buttressed corner tower and the gabled west end enclosing a triple lancet window arrangement was standard fare in Anglican churches since the 1840s. There is an overall lack of harmony arising from the apparent individual use of gothic motifs, including buttresses, windows, and doorways, as if each element had been cribbed from different church designs. This might certainly seem to be the case except that the
overall design is remarkably close to Arnold Woodroffe’s (F.R.I.B.A) and Charles
Osborn Wickenden’s published drawing in the *Canadian Architect and Builder*, in 1903,
for a Presbyterian church in Vancouver (5.15). Except for the gabled west entrance on the
sketch of the Presbyterian church, Wilson’s design for St, John’s is a quote of the sketch
for the Presbyterian church except for the west entrance in the Woodroffe and
Wickenden drawing. The relationship demonstrates the influence of print media. This
explains how a competent architect augmented his repertoire by looking at pictures of
buildings when involved in an unfamiliar project.

The apparent endurance of taste is demonstrated because the design adopted was
over fifty years old. As well, Wilson’s prospective use of a published image nearly ten
years old demonstrates how architectural models, including styles and related motifs were
continually recycled. Moreover, it is important to note the regional connection between
architects working in British Columbia. It is doubtful that the congregation or Rev. Jenns
suspected the influence of Wilson’s design might have come from a design for a
Presbyterian church because it used standard Anglican architectural grammar. That
grammar sat well with the St. John’s congregation whose politics were, more or less,
consistent with those of the Rev. Jenns. For instance, Jenns was stubbornly against the
idea of empowering a synod of the Anglican Church in Canada. He showed his
displeasure that certain congregation members had become involved in the synods. Jenns’
comments, which demonstrated his displeasure and revealed an authoritarian attitude,
comparable with Imperialism, were:

As long as I remain in the Church of England I know what her laws are and I
value them far too highly to cast them to the winds and be governed by those of
so small a church as that of British Columbia. 506
The conservative politics of the congregation itself was consistent with its early association with the imperial commercial enterprise of the Hudson’s Bay Company. The HBC funded the formation of the congregation in 1853 and sold land to them at a discount for the erection of a church. When that original church, the ‘Iron Church’ outlived its ‘temporary’ status after holding services for fifty-two years, the HBC re-purchased the town lot at the cost of $140,000. The amount covered nearly the total $170,000 expense of building the new brick church on Quadra Ave.

5.7 Summary

Church-building was a chief method used by settlers to craft a civil society, or to manufacture the appearance of one. In this regard, the close relation between knowledge and myth, as exemplified by The Colonists’ Handbook No. 1 and The Province of British Columbia, Canada: its Resources, Commercial Position, and Climate inaccurate advertisements of the finished state of the nation, was demonstrated by the way the pattern books portrayed fashion as knowledge. The pattern books used church architecture to advertise a method for finishing the nation since churches were perceived as the social spaces that glued communities of settlers together. This situation was robustly described in the novella A Home in the Northwest where the settler family built themselves a church in order to attain personal and community goals.

However, the economic arm of the settlement processes, the railway, increased the wealth unevenly by encouraging the over-distribution of property in the hands of already elite individuals, many of whom were Anglican. At the same time, other denominations found ways to resist and disrupt Anglican social dominance, a case in point being the situation in Barkerville, BC where the Methodists raised money more
easily for church-building than the Anglicans. Notwithstanding the resistance of the Methodists in Barkerville, the Anglicans built St. Saviour’s church at the head of the town’s main street in a bid to advertise a self-perceived position of social dominance.

Social and economic unevenness was demonstrated visibly in the Neo-Gothic churches built by First Nations because of the retention of European architectural principles. The business of church-building and the marketing of the pattern books, both viewed as stabilizing forces by the European settlers, became focused instruments of social control when applied to the First Nation situation in BC. The fears of many European settlers were assuaged by the belief that religion would pacify the First Nations and that the architecture of churches would help modernise the Aboriginal population. Thus, the Neo-Gothic churches that First Nations constructed around the turn of the century tended to veil their customary practices behind European architecture or a new hybrid of European/Aboriginal building. Throughout the early part of the twentieth century church-building changed in accordance with the adoption of new forms, new building materials, and as expressed by the hybridization of First Nations churches, altered perspectives.
Conclusion

The process of church-building and the consumption of the church pattern books both keenly expressed the connections between religion and economy in the forming society. Church construction was an important element in local economy whether in established centres or new settlements. My thesis found that religion was understood to be an integral part of the social fabric in the 19th c and communities believed that the church architecture reflected ‘wealth’ – a combination of status, identity, and morality. The money spent on building a church and the particular design choice reflected a community’s identity and social status.

The adoption of Neo-Gothic architecture for churches 1867 to 1914 not only coincided with the British Imperial phase of Canada and the resurgence of religious observance but also with the broad transatlantic acceptance of medieval architecture coinciding with a period of intense cultural resonance with Britain. Consequently, this cultural resonance was ensured and even extended through the importation of church pattern books, illustrated by the growing book trade and lowered tariffs. Thus, the pattern books became a locus of identification at the important moments when church-builders were deciding upon the way their congregations were going to be perceived in the public domain. The growth and proximity of the U.S. architectural practice and associated fashion eventually added another dimension.

The changing architectural fashions illustrated in the pattern books can be generally traced in the construction of churches in Canada. This demonstrates that the colony remained roughly current with architectural fashion in Britain and the U.S, even though the term taste was substituted to augment culture and class distinctions. The
diversity of the churches produced in the Dominion in addition to a trans-denominational
effort to acknowledge the architectural wealth of the medieval past was a metaphor for
Canada’s regional apparatus with national intent. On the one hand, the official
Confederation of Canada in 1867 was an event of political merit that did not completely
or even accurately describe the situation on the ground level in local communities that
still relied heavily on regional economic and social apparatus. On the other hand, the
ratification of official Confederation and the subsequent addition of other provinces
represented the negotiated formation of Canadian polity. Confederation was a deal-
making process which resembled a loose association of regions built upon diverse social
and cultural interests. Notwithstanding this diversity, Anglicans did not often feel limited
from expressing a responsibility for society’s development – of projecting an image of
being ‘in-charge’ even in places where they numbered comparatively few.

A particularly interesting facet of the relationship between church-building and
the pattern books explored in this thesis was the effects that reproduction had on the
configuration of public taste or fashion. The variety of churches built across the
Dominion was related not only to the religious and cultural diversity but also to the wide
assortment of designs marketed in the pattern books. Pattern books marketed taste in
architecture in order to compel church-builders to choose a specific architectural
grammar, deemed enduring by the books no matter how new the individual design. The
pattern books not only provided an education but also fed, and fed into, the appetite for
architectural fashion. In this way, ordinary readers felt justified in their architectural
opinion believing that the pattern books had provided an education when in reality the
books fed their appetite for fashion. Practitioners were motivated to use pattern books to
train students and to seek inspiration. Builders used pattern books to elevate their professional status and general reading audiences used the books to imagine their lives connected to the churches in Picturesque settings. A great number of these readers had probably not seen an original medieval building. However, once viewing audiences learned the architectural grammar from the pattern books they became interested in voicing their own criticisms about an architect’s Gothic.

This thesis demonstrated that the economic, social, and even political alliances with Britain, clearly reflected in the business of church-building, translated into the persistence of Anglicans’ elevated social standing. Anglicans believed that they could project a dominant social image through church-building, a public forum for ideological expression. Anglicans did not dominate in numbers, although they operated as if the reverse was true, and they nevertheless used interdenominational rivalries as the fodder for fund-raising to build churches. The visibility of Anglican churches on the landscape, whose subtleties were generally discernable to the nineteenth-century viewer, counted in the perception of social dominance. In reality, reproduction and variety of imagery ended any Anglican monopoly of the pattern book business. Anglicans could not control the new ways in which users of pattern books, particularly Baptist, Methodist, and Presbyterian groups and other faiths, picked parts of the imagery that applied to them. This further contributed to the debates in Canada about the way churches ought to look. This was an example of the way that readers of the pattern books used the data stores to confirm things they already believed were true rather than to explore new discoveries.
The case studies of churches built by Anglicans as well as other denominations in Canada between 1867 and 1914 owed their richness to empirical rather than theoretical analysis. These case studies demonstrated that church-building was both economically and ideologically driven. The commodification of taste clearly related to the financial structures in place in the Dominion and they determined the amount and location of property upon which churches were built. These complex social and economic structures were continually changing in the growing democracy, reflected not only in the negotiated settlements that contributed to Confederation but also in the growing rivalries between denominations. Church-building resonated with the forming society as intensely as the pattern books developed their audiences in the Dominion. The churches built in Canada between 1867 and 1914, no less than the consumption of the pattern books, expressed the impact of consumer culture in forming society. In this sense, this thesis has demonstrated that the interactions and operations of taste, economy, religion, and politics constituted a formative structural model. Visuality was a constituent factor in marketing new designs that were allied with historical authenticity because church-builders needed to see what it was they were buying into before committing to the expenditure of construction.
Fig. 1.1 Elevation of Howden Cathedral from Edmund Sharpe’s *Architectural Parallels; or the Progress in Ecclesiastical Architecture in England through the Twelfth and the Thirteenth Centuries Examined in a Series of Parallel Examples*, 1848
Fig. 1.2 A section of Whitby Cathedral from Edmund Sharpe’s *Architectural Parallels; or the Progress in Ecclesiastical Architecture in England through the Twelfth and the Thirteenth Centuries Examined in a Series of Parallel Examples*, 1848
Fig. 1.3 Plan of Barnwell Church, Northamptonshire from Raphael and J. Arthur Brandon’s *Parish Churches; being Perspective Views of English Ecclesiastical Structures: Accompanied by Plans Drawn to a Uniform Scale with Descriptive Letterpress*, 1848
Fig. 1.4 Perspective view of Barnwell Church, Northamptonshire from Raphael and J. Arthur Brandon’s Parish Churches; being Perspective Views of English Ecclesiastical Structures: Accompanied by Plans Drawn to a Uniform Scale with Descriptive Letterpress, 1848
Fig. 1.5 Foliage decoration from James Kellaway Colling’s *Examples of English Medieval Foliage and Coloured Decoration Taken from Buildings of the Twelfth to the Fifteenth Century with Descriptive Letterpress*, 1874
Fig. 2.1 Design No. 6, a generic design for an Anglican church with crossing tower and transept arms using the Early English Style from Frederick Withers’s Church Architecture Plans Elevations and Views of Twenty-One Churches and Two SchoolHouses Photo Lithographed from Original Drawings with Numerous Illustrations Shewing Details of Construction, Church Fittings, etc., 1873
Fig. 2.2 Centrally planned design from George Bidlake’s *Sketches of Churches: Designed for the Use of Nonconformists*, 1865
Fig. 2.3 Roof and scissor truss above the nave of Lympenhoe Church, Norfolk from Raphael and J. Arthur Brandon’s *Open Timber Roofs*, 1849
Fig. 2.4 View of Mont St. Michel, France from William Eden Nesfield’s Specimens of Medieval Architecture Chiefly Selected from Examples of the Twelfth and Thirteenth Centuries in France and Italy, 1862
Fig. 2.5 Design No. 7 in the style of an Anglican church showing the architect’s diversity from Frederick Withers’s Church Architecture 1873
Fig. 2.6 Elevation drawing of the nave from Edmund Sharpe, *Illustrations of the Conventual Church of the Benedictine Abbey of St. Germaine at Selby*, 1870
Fig. 2.7. Perspective drawing of Werstham Church, Surrey from the liturgical south east from Raphael and J. Arthur Brandon’s Parish Churches; being Perspective Views of English Ecclesiastical Structures: Accompanied by Plans Drawn to a Uniform Scale with Descriptive Letterpress, 1848.
Fig. 2.8. Illustration of Grace Church, Albany New York from Frank Wills’s *Ancient English Ecclesiastical Architecture and its Principles Applied to the Wants at the Present Day*, 1850
Fig. 2.9. Design No. XIX from George Truefitt’s Designs for Country Churches 1850
Fig. 2.10 Charles Dwyer’s *The Economy of Church, Parsonage, and School Architecture*, 1856
Fig. 2.11 Example of the Picturesque in Henry Hudson Holly’s *Church Architecture*, 1871
Fig. 2.12 Christ Church, Fredericton, New Brunswick (1845), architect Frank Wills and completed by William Butterfield published in *The Ecclesiologist* vol. 9 April 1848: 360
Fig. 2.13 Christ Church, Montreal, (1847), architect Frank Wills. View from the liturgical south-west. Photo: Barry Magrill.
Fig. 2.14 Perspective drawing from William Butterfield’s *Elevations, Sections and Details of Saint John Baptist Church, Shottesbrooke, Berkshire, 1844*
Fig. 2.15 St. Michael’s, Long Stanton Cambridgeshire England. C. 13th century illustrated in Raphael and J. Arthur Brandon’s Parish Churches 1848.
Fig. 2.16 St. Michael’s, Sillery Quebec. Attributed to architect Frank Wills c. 1856. Photo: Barry Magrill
Fig. 2.17 Christ Church, Montreal, (1847), architect Frank Wills. From the Illustrated London News, March 3 1860: 205
Fig. 2.18 Proposed British Protestant church in Nice France from the *Illustrated London News* May 14, 1859: 480
Fig. 2.19 St. Simon and St. Jude, Tignish PEI. Architect Patrick Keely c. 1860
Fig. 2.20 St. Mary’s, Indian River PEI. Architect William Critchlow Harris 1900-02. Photo: Barry Magrill
Fig. 2.21 St. Mary’s, Indian River PEI. Interior looking east. Architect William Critchlow Harris 1900-02. Photo: Barry Magrill.
Fig. 2.22 Illustration of the roof over the nave of St. Mary’s Church, Wimbotsham, Norfolk from Raphael and J Arthur Brandon’s *Open Timber Roofs of the Middle Ages*, 1849
Fig. 3.1 Design No. 3, a timber church from Henry Hudson Holly’s *Church Architecture*, 1871
Fig. 3.2 Elevation and plan of Design No. 11 from Frederick Withers’s Church Architecture Plans Elevations and Views of Twenty-One Churches and Two School Houses Photo Lithographed from Original Drawings with Numerous Illustrations Shewing Details of Construction, Church Fittings, etc., 1873
Fig. 3.3 St. Anne’s Chapel, Fredericton New Brunswick. Architect Frank Wills c. 1845 published in Wills’ *Ancient English Ecclesiastical Architecture and its Principles Applied to the Wants of the Church at the Present Day* 1850
Fig. 3.4 Anglican Church of the Messiah, rang du Bord de ‘leau, Sabrevois, Quebec. c.1855
Fig. 3.5 St. John the Evangelist, Oxford Mills, Ontario, 1869
Fig. 3.6 Design for iron church published in *Instrumenta Ecclesiastica*, 1856
Fig. 3.7 Design for village chapel from F.J. Jobson’s Chapel and School Architecture as Appropriate to the Buildings of Nonconformists, Particularly to Those of the Wesleyan Methodists, 1850
Fig. 3.8 St. James-the-Less, Toronto, Ontario. Architects Fred Cumberland and George Storm, 1857-61. Photo: Barry Magrill.
Fig. 3.9 Toronto Necropolis Chapel. Architect Henry Langley, 1872. Photo: Barry Magrill.
Fig. 3.10 Design No. 9 from George Truefitt’s *Designs for Country Churches*, 1850
Fig. 3.11 St. Paul’s Church, Brookline, Mass. and St. Thomas’ Church, Hanover, N.H
Fig. 3.12 St. James Anglican Cathedral, Toronto, Ontario. Architect Fred Cumberland, 1852.
Fig. 3.13 St. Michael’s Roman Catholic Cathedral, Toronto, Ontario. Architect Henry Langley 1867.
Fig. 3.14 St. James Anglican Cathedral photographed in 1852 before the completion of the tower in 1874. Photo: Toronto Public Library.
Fig. 3.15 Photograph of Holy Trinity Anglican Church, Winnipeg, Manitoba published in the Canadian Architect and Builder. Architect Charles Wheeler.
Fig 3.16 Illustration of north aisle windows of the nave of Strassbourg Cathedral from George Truefitt’s *Architectural Sketches on the Continent*, 1847
Fig. 3.17 Advertisement for Woodward’s Rural Church Architecture noting that architects, builders, and building committees were a target audience, published in the rear of Woodward’s National Architect 1869
Fig. 3.18 Advertisement for ‘Dixon’s Low Down Philadelphia Grate’ placed in the rear of Woodward’s National Architect 1869.
Fig. 3.19 Design for a church in Assiniboia by W.A. Langton published in Designs for Village, Town and City Churches, 1893
Fig. 3.20 Design for a large town church by Daniel J. Crighton of Montreal published in Designs for Village, Town and City Churches, 1893
Fig. 3.21 Design for a country church by G. F. Stalker published in Designs for Village, Town and City Churches, 1893
Fig. 3.22 Winning entry for competition supplying publishable material to *Designs for Village, Town and City Churches*, 1893. This winning design was not published in the actual book.
Fig. 4.1 Design No.8 from Henry Hudson Holly’s *Church Architecture*, 1871
Fig. 4.2 Polemical illustration of two church interiors entitled ‘The House of God’ from Henry Hudson Holly’s *Church Architecture*, 1871
Fig. 4.3 Holy Trinity Anglican Church, Stanley Mission, Saskatchewan. View from the west tower.
Fig. 4.4 New Independent Chapel, Abergele, North Wales. Architect, J. Roger Smith published in Examples of Modern Architecture Ecclesiastical and Domestic 1873
Fig. 4.5 ‘Interior of Library’ published in Henry Hudson Holly’s *Church Architecture* 1871
Fig. 4.6 West end of St. George’s-in-the-Pines, Banff, Alberta. Architect F.P. Oakley.
Fig. 5.1 St. James’ Anglican Church, Vancouver, BC
Fig. 5.2 St. Paul’s Anglican Church, Metlakatla, BC. Photo: Archives of British Columbia
Fig. 5.3 Chapel at Metlakatla. View of interior to the west showing the carved totems.
Fig. 5.4 Holy Cross, Skookumchuck, BC. View of the west entrance.
Fig. 5.5 Design No. 5, Plate 10 published in Henry Hudson Holly’s *Church Architecture* 1871
Fig. 5.6 St. Anne’s Anglican Church, Steveston, BC. Photo originally published in *Work for the Far West*. 
Fig. 5.7 St. Saviour’s Anglican Church, Barkerville, BC, 1869.
Fig. 5.8 Illustration of ‘Board-and-Batten’ church design published in the Ecclesiogical Society’s Instrumenta Ecclesiastica 1856.
Fig. 5.9 Church of Our Lady, Victoria, BC. Architect: John Teague.
Fig. 5.10 Presbyterian church design published in *A Hand Book of Designs, containing Plans in Perspective* (1868) by the Chicago architect Gurdon P. Randall.
Fig. 5.11 Metropolitan Methodist Church, Victoria, BC: Architect: Thomas Hooper.
Fig. 5.12 Illustration of the New Baptist Church on Palmerston Ave., Toronto, Ontario published in the Canadian Architect and Builder in 1888.
Fig. 5.13 St. Andrew’s Presbyterian Church, Victoria, BC. Architect: Leonard Buttress Trimen
Fig. 5.14 St. John the Divine, Victoria, BC. Architect: Col. William Ridgway Wilson.
Fig. 5.15 Design of a Presbyterian Church by architect Arnold Woodroffe published in Canadian Architect and Builder, in 1903.
ENDNOTES


2 The publication of this book is complex because Brooks' editorial credit noted in the initial 1868 publication was removed in the 1873 re-print, as was his five page introduction and a few of his perspective drawings.

3 The recognition that commercializing the past has a substantial effect on the present, as exemplified in the transmission of architectural ideas is discussed in Rhodri Windsor Liscombe, "The Commodification of Civic Culture in Early Nineteenth-Century London," *London Journal* 29.2 (2004): 18-32.


8 The contexts of trade, tariff, and reciprocity are factors of Confederation that intensified border relations between Canada and America in the antebellum period. See, Creighton, "Economic Nationalism and Confederation."


11 Ibid.

12 New Brunswick, Nova Scotia, Ontario, and Quebec initially formed Confederation on July 1, 1867. Manitoba and the Northwest Territories signed on in 1870 followed by British Columbia in 1871, Prince Edward Island in 1871, Yukon in 1898, Alberta and Saskatchewan in 1905, as well as Newfoundland and Labrador in 1949. In more recent history, Nunavut joined in 1999.


14 The Exhibition's technocratic picture of the expanding British Empire nevertheless showed that the Canadas formed only a small part of its image.


16 Ibid., 123.

Prompted by A.W.N. Pugin's publications _Contrasts_ (1836) and _True Principles_ (1841) that outlined the basic conventions of the archaeologically inspired Gothic Revival, the founding members of the Cambridge Camden (later Ecclesiological) Society voiced their opinions on the “proper” treatment of medieval revival church architecture in a series of pamphlets including *A Few Words to Church-Builders* (1841) and the Ecclesiologist journal (1841-68). The Society was founded by an intimate group of Cambridge undergraduates: Benjamin Webb, John Mason Neale, and Alexander James Bereford Hope. The Society steadfastly believed in the infallibility of its own opinions that ironically shifted ad infinitum. For instance, the famed British architect Sir George Gilbert Scott, whose gothic designs were highly criticized publicly by the Society, said of the group that “there was no class of men whom the Cambridge Camden Society held in such scorn as those who adhered to their own last opinion but one.” See, George Gilbert Scott, *Personal and Professional Recollections* (Stamford, Lincolnshire: P. Watkins, 1995), 206.
The Society’s architectural and liturgical ideology shared Pugin’s condemnation of Neo-Classical architecture, derogatorily termed Pagan. In his 1836 publication of Contrasts: or, a Parallel between the Noble Edifices of the Middle Ages, and Similar Buildings of the Present Day; Shewing the Present Decay of Taste, Pugin noted “almost all the researches of modern antiquaries, schools of painting, national museums and collections, have only tended to corrupt taste [italics mine] and poison intellect, by setting forth classic art as the summit of excellence, and substituting mere natural and sensual productions in the place of the mystical and divine.” Pugin’s work connected the Ecclesiological Society with the early publication history in Britain that included John Britton’s Architectural Antiquities of Great Britain in five volumes printed between 1807 and 1826, Thomas Rickman’s Attempt to Discriminate the Styles of English Architecture, from Conquest to the Reformation; Preceded by a Sketch of the Grecian and Roman Orders, with Notices of Nearly Five Hundred Buildings (1817). Early support for the theories of Gothic’s origin included Rev. G.D. Whittington’s An Historical Survey of the Ecclesiastical Antiquities of France with a view to Illustrate the Rise and Progress of Gothic Architecture in Europe (1809), William Whewell’s Architectural Notes on German Churches, with Remarks on the Origin of Gothic Architecture (1830), Robert Willis’ Remarks on the Architecture of the Middle Ages, especially of Italy (1835) and his On the Construction of the Vaults of the Middle Ages (1842). These authors adopted an academic approach to the study of antiquities which was contrasted by Walter Scott’s Romantic turn in The Border Antiquities of England and Scotland Comprising Specimens of Architecture and Sculpture and other Vestiges of Former Ages Accompanied by Descriptions, Together with Illustrations of Remarkable Incidents in Border History and Traditions, and Original Poetry (1814). A watershed publication was Thomas Rickman’s (1776-1841) An Attempt to Discriminate the Styles of Architecture in England, From Conquest to Reformation, which was the first to categorize medieval gothic into architectural styles that included Norman (1066-c.1190), Early English (c.1190-c.1300), Decorated English (c.1300-c.1390), and Perpendicular English (c.1390-c.1540). These same periods were also contemporaneously referred to as First, Second or Middle, and Third Pointed. Rickman’s method was reinforced by John Henry Parker’s massive publication output of catalogue-like encyclopaedias, including Introduction to the Study of Gothic Architecture (1849), the A Concise Glossary of Terms Used in Grecian, Roman, Italian, and Gothic Architecture (1846), and The ABC of Gothic Architecture (1885). E.A. Freeman, by contrast, disputed the periods in The Ecclesiologist vol. 13, (Oct, 1852.): 118.

The standard text on the developments of the Gothic Revival, and in particular the influence of the Ecclesiological Society remains Kenneth Clark, The Gothic Revival: An Essay in the History of Taste (London: Constable & Co. Ltd., 1928) 200-08. Also see, The publication dealing with the problematic of the Ecclesiological Society from the approach of politics, economy, and social history is Christopher Webster and John Elliott, ed., ‘a Church as It Should Be’ (Stamford: Shaun Tyas, 2000).


Language describing Neo-Gothic, such as, ‘correct’, ‘proper’, and ‘solemn’ was used to challenge the Classical idioms three-hundred year dominance of British ecclesiastical architecture. More telling of the Neo-Gothic proponents’ position was an adjacent use of the terms, ‘debased’, ‘decayed’, and most damning of all, ‘pagan’, to describe post-Reformation Classicizing, and Georgian style, churches. As a derogatory term, ‘pagan’ was associated architecturally with the ‘impious’ polytheism of the pre-Christian world. Initially, ecclesiological “correctness” was transmitted by Augustus Welby Northmore Pugin (1812-52) who advocated the precise archaeological study, and thus truthful, modelling of original medieval designs. Pugin promoted his principles through the distribution of two books, Contrasts: or, A Parallel between the Noble of Edifices of the Middle Ages, and Corresponding Buildings of the Present Day; Shewing the Present Decay of Taste (1836, re-printed 1841), and The True Principles of Pointed or Christian Architecture (1841). The publications were polemical vehicles fusing together moral rhetoric with a series of architectural principles. His principles were directed both to architects as well as to a general audience of architectural consumers. Though Pugin’s architectural practice was curtailed by his conversion to Catholicism, which somewhat limited his clientele to less financially affluent, mainly Irish-Catholic congregations, book production made him into a contemporary heroic figure. Then, architecture and painting critic, John Ruskin promoted the ethics of ‘truth’, ‘beauty’, ‘sacrifice’, and ‘obedience’ interfaced with the belief in nature as a source of revelation, see Ruskin, The Seven Lamps of Architecture (1849) and the three-volume series of The Stones of Venice (1851-3). Ruskin built upon the ‘dry and practical’ nature
of Pugin’s polemics with an impassioned prose that captured the emotional complexity of architecture, showing the warmth, richness, and colour of Continental examples, see Michael Brooks, John Ruskin and Victorian Architecture (New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press, 1987), 9.

44 See also, Augustus Welby Northmore Pugin, The True Principles of Pointed or Christian Architecture: Set Forth in Two Lectures Delivered at St. Marie’s, Oscott (London: John Weale, 1841).

45 Even though A.W.N Pugin had converted to Catholicism, Anglican church-builders used the basis of his principles in the formation of Ecclesiological taste.


47 Also, see the Canadian Architect and Builder vol. 11 (1898) issue 7: 127 which contains correspondence about the structural benefits of steeply pitched roofs.


49 Initial expansions in shipbuilding consolidated after the 1850s when it came under more control of colonial procedures. Tariffs and duties caused considerable push and pull among local merchants, depending upon whether they were engaged more or less in export or local manufacture. Taylor and Baskerville, eds., A Concise History of Business in Canada, 119.


51 Ibid.

52 House of Assembly, June 8, 1866 see Ajzenstat, Canada’s Founding Debates, 133.


54 Bourdieu, The Social Structures of the Economy, 16.

55 A robust source for the book collector continued to be John Britton’s A Catalogue Raisonne of an Unique Collection of Books on Cathedral and Architectural Antiquities; with proofs and etchings (London: Longman and Co., 1837). Another of Britton’s numerous publications was used by the Canadian architects Cumberland and Storm to connect the medieval design of gatehouse at Bury St. Edmunds abbey with their design for the main entrance to University College. Britton’s text was The Architectural Antiquities of Great Britain (London: Longman, Hurst, Rees, and Orme, 1809, several re-prints).

56 I am thinking here of the multifarious projects embarked upon by A.W.N. Pugin, John Ruskin, and J.M. Neale, each of whom innovated different architectural doctrines around the Neo-Gothic but each of whom also strategically used black and white media for its appearance of truthfulness.

57 The book was originally compiled in 1868 by its editor, Davey James Brooks, who was later eliminated from his position along with the two designs that he submitted for the book’s publication. The delay in bringing the book to press is presumed to have related to its conflict with a rival publication by B.T. Batsford and it was not until 1873 that the publisher, Birbeck, plucked up the courage to print the volume.

58 Similar maxims were contained in the quintessential self-improvement books, see Samuel Smiles, Self-help: with Illustrations of Character, Conduct and Perseverance (Chicago: Belford, Clarke and Co., 1881). For trends in book importations see also, George L. Parker, The Beginnings of the Book Trade in Canada (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1985), 93. Social progress became a locus of identification and the terrain of the emergence of the modern individual. At the same time, books dealing in taste variously lubricated the mobility of certain groups and individuals; books also hindered the mobility others. Science and taste-cum-fashion converged in pattern book illustrations in new techniques, such as, photogravure. Photogravure was technique of transferring photographs to a copper plate treated with a light-sensitive layer of gelatine that was acid-etched. The early photographic techniques used in church architecture pattern books reflected a new commercialization of the ancient past coupled with an exchange between new and old methods of reproduction.

59 The British origination of medieval gothic was not subscribed universally throughout the Empire, for instance, both John Ruskin and George Edmund Street recognized the importance of European sources in their respective books, The Stones of Venice (1851-3) and Some Account of Gothic Architecture in Spain (1865, re-printed 1869, 1914).
62 Ibid., 430.
63 Ibid.
64 Upton, "Pattern Books and Professionalism: Aspects of the Transformation of Domestic Architecture in America, 1800-1860.", 120. Upton argued that architects of the Antebellum period “agreed that builders did not possess taste”.
65 Canadian Architect and Builder 2 Feb 1889: 15.
68 Canadian Architect and Builder 12 April 1899: 79-80.
70 Withers’ book likely sold for between $2.00 and $12.00, comparable to the price of British books. The prices appear to be close to the general range of church pattern books as advertised in a list of publications in George Woodward’s book Woodward’s Architecture and Rural Art (New York, George Woodward, 1868).
71 My gratitude to Thomas Coomans for pointing out the subtle distinctions of print reproduction.
72 Legislative Assembly, Feb. 8, 1865 see, Ajzenstat, Canada’s Founding Debates, 133.
73 Non-conformists’ pattern books had to identify themselves accordingly in their titles to be differentiated from the dominant format used by Anglican groups.
74 William Westfall, "The Sacred and the Secular: Studies in the Cultural History of Protestant Ontario in the Victorian Period," University of Toronto, 1976, , 3-7. See also, S.D. Clark, The Developing Canadian Community, 2nd ed. (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1971), 3. For the way that Clark’s study was framed around the notion that studying economy is akin to studying social organization see, Bourdieu, The Field of Cultural Production.
75 William Westfall points out the intersecting natures of the religious and secular colonization of the Dominion. The established Church believed that properly ordered political and social institutions could protect mankind from his fallible nature and advance the cause of Christ’s Kingdom on earth. By contrast, Lord Durham’s report on the state of the Dominion revealed how the chief purpose of colonization was materialistic profit achieved by increasing population and accumulation of property. Westfall’s thesis illustrates how these two diverse mindsets each assisted the other in the formation of the Dominion’s society. See, Westfall, "The Sacred and the Secular: Studies in the Cultural History of Protestant Ontario in the Victorian Period,," 48.
76 Loyalty, for instance, had a religious and economic aspect. Courage and self-sacrifice were associated with religion and financial affluence was strongly related to the loyalty. William Westfall illustrates how Lord Durham was keen to note that the threat of American annexation would have been severely curtailed if colonists could generate wealth comparable to U.S. standards, see Westfall, "The Sacred and the Secular: Studies in the Cultural History of Protestant Ontario in the Victorian Period," 50.
77 Bishop Fulford of Montreal was appointed the first Metropolitan in the formation of a ‘Provincial Synod’ to include all of the dioceses in the Canada East. Religious self-governance in Canada East had been discussed as early as the Quebec Conference of 1851. See, Carrington, The Anglican Church in Canada, 126. S.D. Clark emphasizes the shifting nature of religious institution at the edges of social organization by looking at the complex histories of Methodism in the opening decades of the nineteenth century in the Dominion. Different groups loosely associated with Methodist practice consolidated and split apart in a network of connections that eventually formed as the Methodist Church. Significantly, Clark used the Methodist institution as a metaphor for the nuanced formations and re-formations of the Dominion’s society in the nineteenth-century. He described social organization as a complex system of checks and balances. See, Clark, The Developing Canadian Community, Chapter VII "Religious Organization and the Rise of the Canadian Nation, 1850-85, 115-130.
The economic and social situations were different in the Maritimes and in Montreal, such that Maritime bishops had frequently to send away to England for cash donations in order to complete their ambitious building projects, while similar cases occurred infrequently in Montreal’s deeper economy. The establishment of the Bank of Montreal in 1817 marked the commercial growth of the city and Lower Canada due primarily to transatlantic trade and investment.

A prevailing opinion in the nineteenth-century was that religious practice had deteriorated since the later medieval period. The revival of Gothic architectural forms became a leading means of re-sanctifying traditional religious institution, particularly the established Church.

The shifts in social practice affecting the people of Anthony Trollope’s fictional county of Barsetshire, described in the novels The Warden (1855), Barchester Towers (1857), Dr. Thorne (1858), Framley Parsonage (1860), and The Small House at Allington (1864), was a metaphor for the actual changes occurring in contemporary British society.

Church-building enterprise illustrates how it was near impossible to recognise a religious institution on purely spiritual grounds. S.D. Clark points out how religious sects prospered on the edges of reform society and on the geographical and economic margins of the Dominion. For instance, early Methodist and Baptist churches did not gain wider social acceptance until such time as they began operating in a more traditional light. A cycle of new reform movements spun off from those once considered radical, such as, the emergence of Newlights as a separate group from the Baptists, the Freewill Baptists, the Scotch Baptists, Bible Christians, Primitive Methodists, or Campbellites. See, Clark, The Developing Canadian Community, 118-19.

Bishop Edward Feild of Newfoundland visited remote communities on the island via the Church ship, the ‘Hawk’, upon which he also sailed to the other part of his diocese in Bermuda. The imperial and Anglican techniques of colonization and regulation were comparable between Bermuda and Canada, see Barry Magrill, “Ecclesiology in the Outposts of the British Empire: Gothic Theory and Social Context in William Hay’s Churches for Bermuda and Canada” MA thesis, York University, 2002.

Don Slater, Consumer Culture and Modernity (Cambridge: Polity Press, 1997), 159. The passage explains how taste, in Bourdieu’s reckoning, is a resource deployed within a stratified system to establish and enhance one’s location in the social order. See also, Bourdieu, The Field of Cultural Production, 40 and 102.

Bourdieu, Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgement of Taste, 7. Bourdieu added that taste involved classifications in which the classifiers actually classified themselves.


Bourdieu, The Field of Cultural Production, 74.

The values placed on artistic works were not found in “some vague concept of antiquity, but in certain specific works of antiquity”, see Francis Haskell, Taste and the Antique: The Lure of Classical Sculpture 1500-1900 (London: Yale University Press, 1981), 6.

Slater, Consumer Culture and Modernity, 157.

Bourdieu, The Field of Cultural Production, 64-72.


Ibid.


The Church vol. 17 no. 21 (December 22, 1853), p. 2.


Slater, Consumer Culture and Modernity, 144 and 51.

Bourdieu, The Field of Cultural Production, 40.

Charles Eastlake, Hints on Household Taste in Furniture, Upholstery, and Other Details (London: Longmans, Green, 1878) 8-9.
The Report of the Incorporated Society for the Propagation of the Gospel in Foreign Parts for the Year 1838 (SPG, 1838), noted that the colony of Newfoundland had “forgotten that she was a Christian nation”.

Abstract Census and Return of the Population of Newfoundland, 1845.

Census of Newfoundland, 1857, Table II, Religions and Churches. In addition, across Newfoundland in 1857 there were 72 Anglican churches and chapels as compared to 63 for Roman Catholic and 37 for Methodist denominations.

Correspondence in the archives of the Oxford Architectural Society references letters from colonial churchmen and bishops asking for sets of drawings for new churches, including: “The president undertake to make a communication to Mr. Herchman to the effect that the Society would undertake to furnish tracings of any church, if he could hold out any hope of a sufficient sum being raised for the erection of a church-like building”, May 10, 1845; “The president read a letter from the Rev. E Hawkins, mentioning that the Bishop of Toronto was in want of designs for churches. It was agreed to forward to the Bishop a set of the Society’s Publications, with the exception of the working drawings of Littlemore”, Nov 15, 1845; and, “Agreed to send set of publications to Bishop of New Brunswick”, Feb 8 1845. My gratitude to William Westfall for providing notes on the Oxford Society’s holdings.


1861 Census returns indicate Church of England in Upper and Lower Canada combined were 374,887 of a total 2.5 million population, which amounted to about 14 percent, see Canada, Census of Canada, 1861, 1: 3-4. A decade later returns showed a decrease to 11 percent of the population, Canada, Census of Canada, 1871, 1: table II. Returns recorded Church of England presence at 15 percent of the total population in 1881, see Canada, Census of Canada, 1: table II. Census did not record religious affiliations in New Brunswick during this period. The relative numbers of Anglicans versus Roman Catholics in Newfoundland were nearly equal.

Though the Corn Laws were repealed in 1846, thus spelling the demise of the British Mercantile system, trade in the colonies continued to increase even under the institution of protective British, American, and colonial tariffs. Trade was buoyed by new commercial practices, a factor of increased migration to the Canadas.

Despite reaching a wide readership, the Society’s proclamations were not universally observed, opening debate about which was the ‘correct’ antiquarian source. Such debate occurred in front of wider public audiences due to print circulation’s questioning of the authority of the image, see Benjamin, "The Work of Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction." and Arnold and Bending, eds., Tracing Architecture: The Aesthetics of Antiquarianism , 1. The Society’s detractors found opportunities to tear at the argument favouring gothic styles. For instance, architect George Wightwick’s West Country churches, designed in the 1840s, were especially out of compliance with Camdenian proclamations. George Wightwick, The Palace of Architecture (London: James Fraser, 1840), 183-90. Wightwick’s book The Palace of Architecture (1840) illustrated a ‘Protestant Cathedral’ with a drum and dome, based upon St. Paul’s Cathedral in London, and a Peristyle Roman Corinthian portico on a plan with almost no chancel or nave but huge transepts. In an 1845 article in Weale’s Quarterly Papers on Architecture, Wightwick predicted the demise of the Camden Society due, in his opinion, to their inability to consider architecture beyond its historical language, see ‘Modern English Gothic Architecture (continued)’ in Weale’s Quarterly Papers on Architecture 4 (1845): 6. Even the publication’s founder, John Weale, was no less critical of the Society’s mixture of High Church rhetoric and archaeology, see ‘On the Present Condition of and Prospects of Architecture in England’ in Weale’s Quarterly Papers on Architecture 2 (1844): 2.

The Governor-General Lord Elgin (son-in-law to Lord Durham and appointed Governor General in 1848) attempted to have Britain direct the colonies’ trade and foreign policy. Lord Durham resigned as a result of sharp attack by political enemies in Britain, led by Lord Brougham, over Durham’s withdrawal of charges against the 1837 rebellion participants, except Mackenzie and Papineau. See, McNaught, The Penguin History of Canada, 104.

Rather than public rebellion, the Maritime colonies tended towards institutional change like that provided by Lord Durham, which sometimes had the effect of hiding conflicts and contestations.


113 The pattern book by Hart, J. Coleman entitled *Designs for Parish Churches, in the Three Styles of English Church Architecture with an Analysis of Each Style: A Review of the Nomenclature of the Periods of English Gothic Architecture, and Some Remarks Introductory to Church Building. Exemplified in a Series of Over One Hundred Illustrations* (New York: Dana and Company, 1857) contains this reference to Shottesbrooke as a model, on page 19: Though the unique little church of Shottesbrooke, (England) should be made the model for a new church in its vicinity or elsewhere, its cruciform plan and trianal arrangement, adopted by the pious founders, as typical of Christ crucified and the Holy Trinity, would still remain symbolical, though a building committee may have adopted the model without a spirit of reverence, or in utter disregard of all its typical signification.

114 Medley, Letter 209, Dec, 14, 1844, Ashmolean Museum. The dating of Medley’s letter is likely correct since the OAS Reports of Committee Meetings Dec. 61844 to April 22, 1847 contains notes dated Jan. 25, 1845 that mention a letter was read from the Bishop elect of New Brunswick requesting copies of the Society’s publications.


118 *Ecclesiologist*, vol.9 April 1848: 362.

119 Bailey, “The Basis and Persistence of Opposition to Confederation in New Brunswick,” 70-93. Bailey convincingly argues that the reasons for New Brunswick’s resistance to Confederation was not out of Loyalist duty to England but because of local economics and politics.

120 *Ecclesiologist*, vol. 9 1848: 192. See also vol. 9 1848: 361-63.

121 From about 1841 to 1851 the journal included a section dealing with churches in the colonies, though Ceylon, Guyana, and India figured prominently, which paralleled the Empire’s greater economic and social investments in the east.

122 John Medley, Letter 209, Dec 14, 1844, Ashmolean Museum, Oxford, Publications of the Oxford Architectural Society. There had been a recent history of importing architectural books into the diocese in New Brunswick from Britain since Frederick Coster had written to J.L. Richards, Rector of Exeter College in April 29, 1843 thanking the Society for sending *View and Details of Four Churches* (Publication date and place unknown). He noted that he would be glad to receive the whole series, implying that the publication was a pamphlet. See, Letter 155, Ashmolean Museum, Publications of the Oxford Architectural Society.

123 OAS Meeting Minutes, Feb 8, 1844, Ashmolean Museum.


126 “Cheap Churches”, *The New York Ecclesiologist* vol. 1 October, 1848.

127 “Reality in Church Architecture”, *The New York Ecclesiologist* vol. 2 April, 1848.

128 Ibid., 74.


130 Heeney, *Leaders of the Canadian Church*, 121.

131 Ibid., 118, Heeney notes that another £1,000 came in a few days later.

132 Kalman, *A History of Canadian Architecture*, 282. Bishop Medley was in Cambridge to deliver an address to the Ecclesiological Society on Tuesday, May 9, 1848 see *Ecclesiologist*, vol. 9 April 1848.

133 *Ecclesiologist*, vol.9 1848: 362.

134 Ibid., 360.

135 Ibid., 362.

136 Ibid., 361.

137 Ibid., 192.

138 St. Anne’s was dedicated on March 18, 1847 and reported in *The Church* 1847, p.166.
Contrasts: or, A Parallel between the Noble of Edifices of the Middle Ages, and Corresponding Buildings of the Present Day; Shewing the Present Decay of Taste (1836, re-printed 1841), and The True Principles of Pointed or Christian Architecture (1841). The publications were polemical vehicles fusing together moral rhetoric with a series of architectural principles meant to re-create the “spirit” of medieval churches. As a result, Gothic Revival architecture in Britain changed antiquarian practice in a way that brought about the invention of a ‘correct’ architectural source for modern churches, rather than a Classicising idiom or the application of a Romantic notion of imagined medieval buildings. Pugin wrote his detestation of corrupt taste into the opening page of Contrasts:

It is now, indeed, time to break the chains of Paganism which have enslaved the Christians of the last three centuries, and diverted the noblest powers of their minds, from the pursuit of truth to the reproduction of error. Almost all the researches of modern antiquaries, schools of painting, national museums and collections, have only tended to corrupt taste [italics mine] and poison intellect, by setting forth classic art as the summit of excellence, and substituting mere natural and
sensual productions in the place of the mystical and divine. Before true taste and Christian feelings can be revived, all the present and popular ideas on the subject must be utterly changed.

153 The workings of the Ecclesiological Society will be discussed in full in the section following.
155 William Hay, "The Late Mr. Pugin and the Revival of Christian Architecture," Anglo-American Magazine 2.June (1853): 73. The “Brummagem” reference was directed at industrial Birmingham, which in Hay’s estimation, at least, was guilty of producing architecture and religious institution that lacked pastoral care.
159 Bourdieu, The Field of Cultural Production, 45-61.
160 Ecclesiologist vol. 14 1853: 156.
161 The Bishop, who worried that his Low Church congregation would find an affiliation with the Ecclesiological Society too High Church, found himself in the awkward position of being placed upon the role of the Society’s membership supposedly without his prior authorization. Wishing to avoid scandal, the Bishop wrote the Society asking to have his name stricken from the roles. In a letter to his colleague in England, William Scott, Bishop Feild levelled blame squarely on his congregation:

You can easily understand what suspicious and jealousies would be excited in this country if I were reported as vicepatron or Member (newly elected) of the Cambridge Camden Society. You know how shamefully and perseveringly that Society is attacked in the Newspapers which are ye authorities here, and so all ye mischief. And we ought, I think, to use prudence and reserve in such matters. This was my reason for being alarmed at the report, which had actually got into some newspapers that I had joined the Society. I hear that I have been attacked in the Record Newspaper for having a Tractarian curate … and that charge alone would alienate I know how many of these ignorant and excited fishmongers from me and the Church.

See, Letters of Bishop Edward Feild to the Reverend William Scott, Diocesan Archives of Eastern Newfoundland and Labrador, 100.43 Box 2 File 4.
162 Diocesan Archives of Eastern Newfoundland (Anglican), Feild to William Scott, August, 1844.
163 Diocesan Archives of Eastern Newfoundland (Anglican), Feild to Ernest Hawkins, June, 19, 1845.
164 House of Commons Papers, Reports &c, vol.XXXVI, no.30: 43. The Queen’s letter produced approximately £16,000 not including other funds from the SPG and SPCK, with which only the nave of the cathedral was completed.
165 Provincial Archives of Newfoundland and Labrador, Bridge to Ernest Hawkins, August 24, 1846.
166 Edward Wix, Six Months of a Newfoundland Missionary’s Journal from February to August, 1835 (London: Smith Elder, 1836), 6.
167 1836 Census Reports St. John’s was populated by 772 Protestant Dissenters, 2623 Anglicans, and 11,551 Roman Catholics.
168 Public Records Office, no. 548, January 3, 1850 “Erection of New Cathedral”.
169 Diocesan Archives of Eastern Newfoundland (Anglican), Feild to William Scott, June 23, 1846.
170 The drawings do not survive but Archdeacon Thomas Bridge commented on them as being too rural for the metropolis of St. John’s. See, Provincial Archives of Newfoundland and Labrador, Bridge to Ernest Hawkins, August 24, 1846.
171 Issues contributing to the 1837 Rebellion included resistance to an oligarchic government that saw appointed officials in the executive council in the Canadas disregard the will of a weak elected legislative Assembly. The focal point of the resistance was the “Family Compact” who controlled power in the
Canadas by exerting financial influence over corporate and banking interests, as well as, by participating in corruption in patronage. The “Family Compact” spread an Anglican bias, which raised the ire of the majority Methodist, Presbyterian, and other Non-Conformist settlers. Lord Durham’s appointment to investigate the Canadas’ cultural politics effected a Reform-oriented transformation of the colonial executive council into a ministry, a la Britain’s newly formed cabinet, that dispersed the favouritism of the Family Compact. See, McNaught, The Penguin History of Canada, 92-95.  


173 Ibid., 93.  

174 John Lambton (Lord Durham), Lord Durham’s Report on the Affairs of British North America (Oxford Oxford Press, 1839 (reprinted 1912)). In effect, the 1840 Act of Union did create a single province in the St. Lawrence – Great Lakes areas, which included equal legislative Assembly representation from what was then called Canada East and Canada West, although immigration unbalanced such short-lived legislative equalities and responsible self-government was withheld, some argued, as long as the Governor-General was caught between the legislature and the Crown, see McNaught, The Penguin History of Canada, 96-97.  

175 Joseph Arsenault of PEI addressing the House of Assembly, March 10, 1868. See, Ajzenstat, Canada’s Founding Debates, 258.  

176 However, flying the British flag from the established Church was also a focal point for dissention and resistance, wherein individuals and groups dissatisfied with Anglican social privilege tied to the state apparatus found a double target: governmental apparatus and religion.  


180 Gerald M. Craig, Lord Durham’s Report (Ottawa: Carleton University Press, 1982).  


185 Frederick Withers, Church Architecture; Plans, Elevations, and Views of Twenty-One Churches and Two School-Houses, Photo-Lithographed from Original Drawings with Numerous Illustrations Showing Details of Construction, Church Fittings, Etc. (New York: A.J. Bicknell, 1873).  


191 Ibid., 14.  

192 Charles P. Dwyer, The Economy of Church, School, and Parsonage Architecture Adapted to Small Societies and Rural Districts (Buffalo: Phinney and Co., 1856), 9.  

193 Dwyer’s publications included The Immigrant Builder; or, Practical Hints to Handy-Men. Showing Clearly How to Construct Dwellings in the Bush, on the Prairie, or Elsewhere Cheaply and Well with Wood, Earth or Gravel. Copiously Illustrated (Philadelphia: Claxton, Remsen, and Haffelfinger, 1872) and
The Economic Cottage Builder; Cottages for Men of Small Means Adapted to Every Locality, with 
Instructions for Choosing the Most Economical Materials Afforded by the Neighborhood to Which are 
Added Many Valuable Hints and Useful Observations (Buffalo: Wanzer, McKim and Co., 1855). 

Wills, Ancient English Ecclesiastical Architecture and Its Principles, Applied to the Wants of the 
Church at the Present Day. 5-6.

George Edmund Street, Brick and Marble in the Middle Ages: Notes of Tours in the North of Italy. 2nd 
1874 ed. (London: John Murray, 1855), xi.

Ibid., xix.

Parker, The Beginnings of the Book Trade in Canada. 94. Parker remarked that the U.S. book market 
dominated the Canadian bookselling industry, especially with regard to inexpensive re-printed editions, but 
‘dominance’ may have been too strong a word to describe the arrangements of convenience that existed 
between American firms and British North American booksellers.

See the section on the Clergy Reserves and Bishop John Strachan appearing later in this chapter.

Only a portion of the construction budget for churches was accounted for in the money raised from 
leasing pews so other means of finance were needed. Mortgages were the most common form of finance 
available to church-builders.

For instance, the period between 1874 and 1876 must have been recessionary since the prices of food 
production (eg. Vegetables, potatoes) rose appreciably as did interest rates on property, see M.C. Urquhart, 
Gross National Product, Canada, 1870-1926: The Derivation of the Estimates (Kingston and Montreal: 
McGill-Queen's University Press, 1993), esp. table 2.6, 2.7, 2.13,2.17. More significantly, the number of 
ewn residential constructions fell in 1877 to 1879 to new lows resulting from the 1875 recession, see op cit 
table 8.20.

It is interesting that church-building was not included in economic statistics, likely because they were 
considered an expense from which no material profit could be returned. I make the argument that religion 
should have been recognized as profitable for social formation on the basis that Church officials and 
politicians agreed that religion sustained a ‘well-ordered’ that in turn was more productive.


J. Ross Robertson, Robertson's Landmarks of Toronto, a Collection of Historical Sketches of the Old 
Town of York from 1792 until 1837 and of Toronto from 1834 to 1904. Also Nearly Three Hundred 
Engravings of the Churches of Toronto Embracing the Picture of Every Church Obtainable from 1800- 
1904 (Toronto: J. Ross Robertson, 1904), 7.

Stephen Otto, “Henry Bower Lane”, Canadian Dictionary of Biography Online 
http://www.biographi.ca/EN/index.html

The inclusion of a checklist of construction specifications and sample contracts for builders showed that 
pattern book architects were engaged in constructing a public distrust of builders and contractors in order to 
improve the professional status of architects, see Upton, "Pattern Books and Professionalism: Aspects of 
the Transformation of Domestic Architecture in America, 1800-1860.".110.

Westfall, Two Worlds: The Protestant Culture of Nineteenth-Century Ontario. 100. Westfall points out 
that the Anglican church-building program was a costly enterprise consisting of church, parsonage, and 
school, as well as, the administrative structure of bishoprics, deaneries, and theological colleges. Salaries, 
pensions, and support for widows and orphans funds contributed to the growing demand on the established 
Church’s finances.

The comment was made by the Rev. Thomas Chalmers of the Church of Scotland. An Anglican 
commentary on Chalmers’ critique of voluntarism is found in The Church 28 July 1838, 22.

An essential discussion of the cultural and economic changes experienced in Canadian society due to the 
separation of Church and State remains Westfall, Two Worlds: The Protestant Culture of Nineteenth-
Century Ontario. He has noted that disestablishmentarianism instituted a restructuring of the Anglican and 
Presbyterian organizations to face “a new way of interpreting God and the world.” Westfall noted that the 
politics of disestablishment removed much of the privileged status of the established Church and this move 
“cut down one of the last barriers to Protestant co-operation.” See pages 91 and 86, respectively.

Robertson, Landmarks of Toronto. 14.

Robertson wrote copy briefly for George Brown at the Globe and then went on to become co-proprietor 
of Toronto’s first evening newspaper the Telegraph in 1866 and later founded the Telegram in 1877. His 
newspapers generally had a sensationalist style and offered cut-rate advertising and copy prices. In the 
1880s, Robertson went into publishing becoming known as a pirate of U.S. books which he sold at a
fraction of their value in the U.S. Finally, he went on to a political career, ironically leading a delegation to Britain to seek the negotiation of a Canadian copyright act that eventually came to fruition in 1921. See, Minko Sotiron “John Ross Robertson” in Dictionary of Canadian Biography, http://www.biographi.ca/EN/ShowBio.asp?BioId=41796&query=robertson

211 Ibid., 11.
212 Ibid.
213 Ibid.
215 Ibid.
216 In reality the ‘Compact Theory’ of Confederation, which described how provincial powers were renegotiated with the central government, was a fairly accurate estimation of the way Confederation played out. ‘Compact Theory’ illustrates how Canada periodically seemed to be coming apart in a scenario that was re-enacted in the religious domain. For instance, Anglicans concretely gathered as congregations of approximately one-thousand people before the group naturally split apart; meanwhile, the congregants envisioned an abstract sense of belonging to a larger Church of England body.
217 Clark, The Developing Canadian Community, 4. Clark argued that the occurrences of foreclosures were endemic of the lack of social services delivered to ‘frontier’ economies. Clark pointed to economic monopolies in geographical extremes that tended to take political control when institutions failed to meet peoples’ needs. There was a business etiquette like a ‘club’ mentality of land transactions in Ontario and Manitoba that continued to benefit the wealthy, as traditionally as it had done in Britain, especially when it came to manipulating the rules of foreclosure.
218 Robertson, Landmarks of Toronto, 40. The property purchased from Mr. Alcorn was valued at $18,000 in 1888.
219 Taylor and Baskerville, eds., A Concise History of Business in Canada, 147.
220 The Anglican Church in Canada had believed itself the sole beneficiary of the Clergy Reserves by claiming it was the only true ‘Protestant’ Church.
221 Carrington, The Anglican Church in Canada, 76-77.
223 The Church, Mar. 24 1853: 300.
224 Unfortunately, governments had not provided satisfactory definitions of what it considered the ‘public’ or the ‘public interest’.
226 Ibid., 36.
227 The institution of tariffs occurred initially in the wake of Britain’s repeal of the Corn Laws in 1846 that abruptly halted duty-free trade between the colony and England. Despite a short-lived Reciprocity agreement with the U.S. between 1854 and 1866 the Dominion began to rely on protective tariffs in order to pay down an accumulating trade debt with Britain and the U.S. Eventually, the tariffs proved ineffective to offset these trade imbalances and the Dominion resorted to borrowing more foreign money to pay down its escalating interest charges. See, Taylor and Baskerville, eds., A Concise History of Business in Canada, 239.
228 In the nineteenth century, the Dominion’s governments did not draw revenue from personal or corporate taxes to finance their operations. The governments managed to keep the economy going by importing loan capital from Britain, though the governments also had to balance large trade deficits of approximately $10,000,000 between 1850 and 1866. Between 1867 and 1879, Canada raised 60 percent of its income from customs duties but they were far from benign instruments. Export and import businesses, such as booksellers, generally favoured low tariffs. See, Taylor and Baskerville, eds., A Concise History of Business in Canada, 239-44. The tariffs were also a reactionary measure taken to offset British and U.S. duties on the Dominion’s exports. Historian D. G. Creighton notes that the provinces wanted low tariffs combined with some reciprocity treaties with the U.S. to increase commerce but the Dominion government
wanted high tariffs to pay for railway construction. Periodically, governments offered to lower tariffs in order to induce the provinces to advocate for the railway. See, Creighton, "Economic Nationalism and Confederation." 7. An essential source on Reciprocity remains, Tansil, The Canadian Reciprocity Treaty of 1854. To place Reciprocity in cultural and political contexts see, Norrie, Owram and Emery, A History of Canadian Economy, 151-56.

229 Henry Holbrook (1820–1902, merchant and politician) of British Columbia favoured protective tariffs in an address to Legislative Council March 10, 1870.


231 The collection remains intact at Thomas Fisher Rare Books in Toronto.

232 Growth was interrupted by sharp but short-lived depressions about 1857 and 1874.


234 For a complete listing of Toronto churches built before 1904 see, Robertson, Landmarks of Toronto.

235 Though I am not aware of any study that compares the timing of church constructions with the local economy one can judge the overall economic picture by looking at the boom years immediately before the Depressions of the late 1850s and late 1870s. A discussion related to the boom and bust economies connected to railway development is found in Taylor and Baskerville, eds., A Concise History of Business in Canada, 179.

236 The cathedral of St. James was outfitted with ‘box-pews’, which were personal spaces of worship for by wealthy members of the congregation. The box pews were housed at the front of the main body of the church, cordoned off from adjacent boxes, and accessed from a small gate. The idea that there was ‘church-business’ to conduct normalized new commercial practices as a component of everyday religious life. Indeed, the organization of churches began to mirror the boardrooms of corporations, especially when one considers the election of Treasures and Secretaries to the office of Church trustees.

237 Robertson, Landmarks of Toronto, 17.


239 Robertson, Landmarks of Toronto, 33


241 Robertson, Landmarks of Toronto, 33.


243 Ibid.

244 One was still expected to pay the costs of an undertaker.

245 A significant different of usage occurred when the chaplain of the cemetery, Rev. Samuel J. Boddy, conducted public service for a period of seventeen years, until such time as the congregation formed St. Peter’s Church and constructed a building. See, Robertson, Landmarks of Toronto, 35.

246 Canadian Architect and Builder vol 19 (1906), issue 3: 52.

247 Ibid.

248 Ibid. “Earth does not purify… There is no certainty as to when the germ will die, if buried; cremation, on the other hand, surely destroys it.”

249 Ibid.

250 Ibid.

251 Ibid.

252 John Beverley Robinson, a businessmen and politician, together with Bishop Strachan were instrumental in crafting the plan. See SPG Archives, C/Canada/Toronto, folio 518, John Beverley Robinson to SPG, 5 Spet. 1850.

253 Westfall, Two Worlds, 111-12.

254 There were significant differences between urban and rural sources of finance capital in the Ontario because banks serviced the former and private individuals dealt with the latter, see Taylor and Baskerville, eds., A Concise History of Business in Canada, 145.

255 Ibid.

256 Britain allowed the unrestricted issuance of loans in the Dominion by protecting national manufactured goods with tariffs. The Canadas benefited by receiving the responsible self-governance it sought, the union
of the Upper and Lower Canadas that privileged English-speaking citizenry, and the ability to raise local business capital through local financial institutions. Britain benefited by ridding itself of responsibility for the Canadas, and in particular, recalling its 12,000 regular troops still stationed across the Dominion in 1869 to counter the threat of American annexation. See, Parliamentry Papers, House of Commons, United Kingdom, 1870 no. 254, vol. XLII, and The Times, March 29, 1867 that reports British regulars were "hostages for British good behaviour."

257 Taylor and Baskerville, eds., A Concise History of Business in Canada, 145.  
258 Robertson, Landmarks of Toronto, 37.  
259 Ibid, 260.  
260 Other no less important building committee members were: Sir J.H. Hogarty (1816-1900), born in Dublin, was a professor of Law at Trinity College and a judge for forty-one years, as well as, president of the St. Partick’s Society; John George Howard (1803-1890), architect, surveyor and civil engineer; James Edward Small (1798-1869), Lawyer, Reform politician and judge; Henry Sherwood (1807-1855), lawyer, businessman, politician, and judge; Philip M. Vonkoughnet (1822-1869), politician and judge; John James Browne (1837-1893), architect, businessman, and justice of the peace; George P. Ridout (1807-1873), merchant and Conservative politician, see Dictionary of Canadian Biography online (http://www.biographi.ca/index2.html).

261 The expansion of the railway in Lower and Upper Canada began when a line connecting Montreal to Portland, Maine was completed in 1853. By 1860, a thousand miles of track connected Quebec City to Sarnia, the Maritimes were linked to Quebec in 1876, and the Canadian Pacific Railway from Montreal to Vancouver was completed in 1885. See Parker, The Beginnings of the Book Trade in Canada, 140.

262 By the 1870s a second railway boom occurred in Upper Canada characterized the construction of the main feeder lines that expanded twenty-one new lines outward from Toronto and Hamilton (eventually taken over by the Grand Truck or Great Western railroad companies). Wealthy and influential merchants preferred to sit on and control railway boards in order to guard their adjacent mercantile interests, see Taylor and Baskerville, eds., A Concise History of Business in Canada, 167.

263 Ibid., 168.  
265 Ibid., 168. Cumberland had accepted the under-the-table payments from contractors in exchange for sanctioning their “speedy and careless efforts”.


267 "A Word on Church Towers” noted that the tower’s only function was to held the church bells which identified the faith within the community, see Ecclesiologist vol. 3 1844: 173.

268 Anglo-American Magazine vol. 4 no. 1 1854: 20-22. Hay’s truthful use of brick on the exterior was applauded by the comment, “nothing is more offensive to good taste than a want of truthfulness in ecclesiastical design.”


270 The Anglo-American Magazine vol. 4 (1852): 363 reported that the line from Kingston to Buffalo, New York via Toronto will positively affect business in Toronto.

271 Carrington, The Anglican Church in Canada, 131. A discussion of Synod politics suggested that “the dioceses have handed over large powers to the Provincial Synods and to the General Synod… but they have a high degree of autonomy within their own territory; more so than in the United States…[however] The diocese is the real working unit in our Canadian Church”.

272 The re-construction of the present-day cathedral occurred in connection with Toronto’s fashioning itself both an Imperial and Continental city. In addition, the city’s growth was regarded as evidence of the recovery from an almost catastrophic civic disaster. The current, and fourth, church of St. James is the product of a renewal project that began after Toronto’s Great Fire of 1849 brought destruction to the previous Georgian church of St. James, see, Frederick Armstrong, ‘The First Great Fire of Toronto,’ Ontario History 53, no.3 (Sept. 1961), 201-21.

273 The bishop did not stomach selling pews to the congregants at full price because it would meant that they had had to finance two churches in as many decades. As a result, the building committee initially approved of the idea of selling the churchyards but left the matter in the hands of the Vestry, see “Report of the Committee Appointed by the Vestry of St. James’ Church to Report on the Rebuilding of the Church”,
Toronto, 1849. Archives of St. James’ Anglican Cathedral. Later, the committee withdrew their approval of the sale and openly opposed it. My grateful thanks to Nancy Hurn, archivist at the Anglican Diocese in Toronto, for providing much needed material and support.

274 The actual financial books record that insurance paid £8,500 but monies owing on the former building was £3,500, leaving an insurance payoff of £5,357.2.10. The building committee envisioned selling new pews to the same pewholders of the former church, but at 1/3 the original price, in order to raise £2,276.13.4. New pew sales were expected to bring in £1,490, for a grand total of £9,123.16.12 at the end of a twelve month period, see “Report of the Committee Appointed by the Vestry of St. James’ Church to Report on the Rebuilding of the Church”, Toronto, 1849, Archives of St. James’ Anglican Cathedral. This left a £1,000 shortfall, which Bishop Strachan later offered to obtain from the Society for the Promotion of Christian Knowledge (SPCK) in England if the building committee agreed to hire the bishop’s preferred architect, George Smith.

275 “The commercial depression which began in 1857 has prostrated the whole country and paralysed all of our resources” Letter from Strachan to Hawkins, Society for the Propagation of the Gospel in Foreign Parts Archives, D series, 30 Mar. 1860.

276 The lands were offered through a 42 year lease extendable at a price of $3 per foot, see The Church Feb. 21 1850: 119 advertisement signed by the churchwardens Thomas Harris and Lewis Moffatt.

277 A petition among residents was also organized to block the lease of the established Church’s lands, a rare instance of public intervention in Church affairs.

278 In a second report of the building committee dated December 4, 1849, motions were made to sack Cumberland in favour of Smith, and agreement made to sell the churchyards. The decision to rent out the church land was rescinded on 9 March 1850 by a close vote of thirty-one to twenty-nine. Recognising that pew sales may not be entirely forthcoming, only the insurance money and the funds from the S.P.C.K. were to be counted upon to a total of £6,000. A subsequent meeting held in July 1850 approved different motions agreeing to locate the church facing King St. in a north-south orientation and approving costs of not more than £12,000. A letter in the Archives of St. James’ Cathedral from ‘F.R.S’ to the Globe in 1849 explains why the Cumberland design was not approved immediately and how Smith managed to insinuate himself on the building committee, see Geoffrey Simmins, Fred Cumberland: Building the Victorian Dream (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1997), ch.12. note 22.


280 Strachan, Thoughts on the Rebuilding of the Cathedral Church of St. James.

281 Ibid., 2.

282 Ibid., 4.

283 Bramhill’s pamphlet is found in the Archives of St. James’ Cathedral. He wrote: “If (consecration) is not a fiction… then will no good churchman wish or dare to alienate one inch of ground consecrated not alone by this service of the Church, but consecrated and endeared by the dust of those who died in the faith” 284 Ibid., 2.


287 In a second report of the building committee dated December 4th, 1849, motions were made to sack Cumberland in favour of Smith, and agreement made to sell the churchyards. The decision to rent out the church land was rescinded on 9 March 1850 by a close vote of thirty-one to twenty-nine. Recognising that pew sales may not be entirely forthcoming, only the insurance money and the funds from the S.P.C.K. were to be counted upon to a total of £6,000. A subsequent meeting held in July 1850 approved different motions agreeing to locate the church facing King St. in a north-south orientation and approving costs of not more
than £12,000. A letter in the Archives of St. James’ Cathedral from ‘F.R.S’ to the Globe in 1849 explains why the Cumberland design was not approved immediately and how Smith managed to insinuate himself on the building committee, see Simmins, Fred Cumberland: Building the Victorian Dream, ch.12, note 22. The Bishop’s belief that Divine providence could overcome economic problems had put him in league with Smith, who had suggested building a larger cruciform cathedral. Pragmatically, the Bishop preferred Smith’s layout. The larger cruciform plan would have added considerably to the old church’s 2000 seat capacity. Smith’s plan was achievable only by offsetting building expense with the sale of the churchyard. It was ultimately too ambitious so that Cumberland’s plan, with modifications, was adopted. See, Simmins, Fred Cumberland: Building the Victorian Dream, 128-30.

283 For a detailed description of the machinations taken by Bishop Strachan and the vestry building committee see, Simmins, Fred Cumberland: Building the Victorian Dream, 128-30.

284 The cathedral was not the only project of Bishop Strachan’s that encountered adverse public reaction. His initiative to ally higher education and Anglican tradition, as exemplified by his founding of Trinity College, were being thwarted in the press and in the Ontario Legislature chiefly by Egerton Ryerson.

285 Bishop John Strachan, Letter to the Right Hon. Lord John Russell on the Present State of the Church in Canada (London: George Bell, 1851), 1. The sale of the Clergy Reserves - 2 million acres of land once set aside by governments for the benefit of religious institutions in Canada - appeared both imminent and likely to accrue little to the established Church.

286 Ibid., 10.

287 “Strachan Letter to the Hon. A.N. Morin on the Clergy Reserves” 20 Oct. 1854, 4. The printed letter carries a postscript that bears a very different tone since news had reached the bishop of the government’s refusal to pay the established Church on its claim of the monies. It is worth quoting a passage: “I was favoured with a copy of your bill, providing for the confiscation of the Clergy Reserves, and I declare, without hesitation, that it is the most atrocious specimen of oppressive legislation, that has appeared since the days of the French Convention. Can members of the United Church of England and Ireland be expected to summit calmly to this monstrous robbery?… Are you not rejoicing in the hope that the voice of prayer, and praise, and the preaching of the Gospel, will soon cease to be heard in Upper Canada?”

288 Ecclesiologist vol.18 (1854): 359


290 Anglo-American Magazine vol. 1 no.2 August 1852: 178.

291 the spire was finished, by a subsequent architect Henry Langley, just as the effects of the 1873 recession hit Ontario.


293 Norrie, Owrnam and Emery, A History of Canadian Economy, 289.


295 Census of Upper Canada, 1860-61 Table II.

296 Langley’s practice was especially respected and sought out for completing the towers of exiting churches.

297 The influence of an ecclesiological Gothic Revival in the Canadas was assisted by imported architectural pattern books and particularly by polemic texts such as Augustus Welby Northmore Pugin, Contrasts: Or, a Parallel between the Noble Edifices of the Middle Ages, and Similar Buildings of the Present Day, Shewing the Present Decay of Taste Accompanied by Appropriate Text, 2nd ed. (London: Charles Dolman, 1836), Pugin, The True Principles of Pointed or Christian Architecture“ Set Forth in Two Lectures Delivered at St. Marie’s, Oscott. The architectural principles that Pugin derived essentially for Catholic consumption in the nineteenth century were adopted and adapted by the Cambridge Camden (later Ecclesiological) Society for Anglican usage. The Society successfully used print media to get their message out about the “correct” way to build churches. Their print publications included the quarterly Ecclesiologist journal (1841–68) and a series of inexpensive pamphlets such as “A Few Words to Churchbuilders” that spoke directly to the people involved in designing, restoring, and maintaining Britain’s churches. British-trained architects immigrating to the Canadas were well versed in the rules of Neo-Gothic architecture and print publication was intended to keep architects and their clients up to date on the latest fashions in Britain. However, local practitioners in the Canadas also had some independent ideas of how the Dominion’s churches should look, which were often discussed in terms of climate. Essential sources for the history of
the latter group. He continued to work in Quebec after the move, which explains his possible involvement at St. Michael’s, Sillery.

328 Other book catalogues included Weale’s Series on Architecture and Building.


332 Withers, Church Architecture; Plans, Elevations, and Views of Twenty-One Churches and Two School-Houses, Photo-Lithographed from Original Drawings with Numerous Illustrations Showing Details of Construction, Church Fittings, Etc.,.

333 Committee on Church Architecture, Designs for Village, Town, and City Churches (Toronto: General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church in Canada, 1893), 4.

334 William Gregg, History of the Presbyterian Church in the Dominion of Canada (Toronto; Presbyterian Printing and Publishing Co., 1885), 18.

335 Canadian Architect and Builder vol. 3 (1890) issue 2: 24.

336 Canadian Architect and Builder vol. 5 (1892) issue 1: 3.

337 Ibid.

338 Canadian Architect and Builder vol. 5 (1892) issue 7: 71.

339 Architecture, Designs for Village, Town, and City Churches. 5.


341 Robertson, Landmarks of Toronto, 124.


343 Robertson, Landmarks of Toronto, 126.

344 Ibid.

345 Ibid, 30.

346 Ibid.

347 Ibid, 229.

348 Robertson, Landmarks of Toronto, 116.

349 It is also important to situate the changes to the mobility of European settlers with the resultant restrictions placed upon First Nations. A good discussion of the changes to First Nations patterns of living remains Cole Harris, Making Native Space: Colonialism, Resistance, and Reserves in British Columbia (Vancouver: University of British Columbia, 2002). See also, Jean Barman, The West Beyond the West (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1991), particularly 129-33 which discusses the rapid decrease in First Nations populations alongside the exponential increase of European and Asian settlers between 1890 and the First World War.


351 James Shaver Woodsworth, My Neighbor, (Toronto: University of Toronto Press (1911) 1972 reprint), 212.


353 Holly, Church Architecture (1871), 60.

354 Yvan Lamonde; Patricia Fleming, ed., History of the Book in Canada (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2004), 198.


356 Ibid., 225.


358 Department stores liquidated the close relationship between consumers and merchants but, more importantly, regionalism served as a model for department stores because the structure of organization depended upon categorizing and dividing goods into diverse sectors based on clear characteristics. Prior to the advent of department stores in the mid-nineteenth century pattern books including Raphael and J. Arthur Brandon’s An Analysis of Gothick Architecture: Illustrated by a Series of Upwards of Seven
Hundred Examples of Doorways, Windows, etc (1847) were purchased by advance subscription. Brandon’s book, which contained a large variety of medieval details including doorways, windows, foliage, and open timber roofs, was sold primarily to architects and persons associated with church-building. Among the subscribers were famous British architects Charles Barry, William Burges, and Benjamin Ferry, as well as, G.W. Billings, James Kellaway Colling (a pattern book author, himself), and C.R. Cockerell (architect of the Bank of England). The Lord Bishop of Fredericton and Mr. Joseph Biscoe resident of Yonge St. in Toronto also subscribed, showing the interest among the Canadian clergy and ordinary architecture enthusiasts. The architect Thomas Fuller subscribed to the book, eleven years before he designed St. Stephen’s-in-the-Fields in Toronto in 1858. Indeed, the combination of double-lancet windows at St. Stephen’s-in-the-Fields recalls an illustration in Brandon’s book. See, Angela Carr, "New Building Technology in Canada's Late Nineteenth-Century Department Stores: Handmaiden of Monopoly Capitalism," Journal for the Society of Architectural Historians 23.4 (1998): 124-42. For data on the reception of new social forms related to urban commerce see Walter Benjamin, The Arcades Project trans. Howard Eiland and Kevin McLaughlin (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1999), 32-61.

360 James Morris, Heaven's Command: An Imperial Progress (London: Faber and Faber, 1973), 337.
361 An analysis of the architecture associated with monopoly appeared in Carr, "New Building Technology in Canada's Late Nineteenth-Century Department Stores: Handmaiden of Monopoly Capitalism."
367 For that reason, the CPR received the power to organize urban western development for their corporate advantage. The particular social, economic, and psychological controls afforded the railways is discussed in detail in Schivelbusch, The Railway Journey: The Industrialization of the 19th Century.
368 Major branch lines include the Manitoba South-Western Colonization Railway, the Manitoba and North-Western Railway of Canada, the Great North-West Central Railway, the Calgary and Edmonton Railway and the Alberta Railway and Irrigation Company, see Hugh Dempsey, The CPR West: The Iron Road and the Making of a Nation (Vancouver: Douglas & McIntyre, 1984), 302 note 4.
370 Winnipeg Free Press Jan. 1, 1884: 155. The report described how the Presbyterian Church had made “satisfactory progress” by building churches in the Northwest at Broadview, Cadurois, Calgary, Turtle Mountain, Gladstone, Greenwood, Indian Head, Moosejaw, Prince Albert, Rat Portage, Regina, Stonewall, Virden, Dominion City, Humesville. In Prince Albert alone, Presbyterians built three timber frame churches. At Union Point the Presbyterian ministry had purchased a timber church from a Methodist body. The cost of each church varied dramatically, for instance, the new timber-frame church and manse built in Broadview cost $1,500 while a “fine brick manse built in Prince Albert cost $5,000”. The land that the CPR sold had come from a 25 million acre grant as partial payment for construction services.
371 Hugh Dempsey, The CPR West, 91.
372 “The Land Corporation of Canada” which offered “80 acres of land absolutely free to each settler and his family... besides many rare privileges not afforded by any other company”. See, Regina-Leader Post Mar. 27, 1888.
373 The Quebec Conference of 1851 had recommended such an organization for the whole of British North America but it was confined to the dioceses of Canada proper, meaning Quebec, Toronto, Montreal, Huron, and Ontario without representing the Maritimes, Rupert’sland, or British Columbia. See, Carrington, The Anglican Church in Canada, 126-36.
374 Parker, The Beginnings of the Book Trade in Canada, 140. See also, D.N. Sprague, “Confronting Riel and Completing the CPR”, in Gilbert, Wallace and Bray, eds., Reappraisals in Canadian History: Post-Confederation. The procedure Riel used at the previous rebellion in Manitoba in 1869 had been to take
hostages and coerce the federal government into concessions but Macdonald had no intention of negotiating this time.

375 Hudson’s Bay Company Archives, D.20/33, fo. 67-74, Lawrence Clarke to Joseph Wrigley, 14 March 1885.

376 For instance, the Regina-Leader Post published unsympathetic coverage of the 1885 Rebellion most heavily between March 31 1885 and April 21 1885 that positioned Riel as a megalomaniac and the Métis as unreasonable squatters.

377 The Métis were of mixed Euro-Canadian and First Nations “ancestry who had developed their own shared culture, customs, traditions, way of life, and collective identity separate from those of their Indian foremothers (many of them Cree, Ojibway, Chipewayan, and Saulteaux) and their European forefathers, primarily French and Scottish.” See, George Goulet and Terry Goulet, The Metis: Memorable Events and Memorable Personalities (Calgary: Fabjob Inc., 2006), 15.

378 By the 1870s, the Métis of Scottish ancestry tended toward farming and other capitalist pursuits while the Métis of French descent tended toward a nomadic and hunter lifestyle following the Buffalo. See, Marcel Giraud, The Metis in the Canadian West (Edmonton: The University of Alberta Press, 1986), 113. See also, Taylor and Baskerville, eds., A Concise History of Business in Canada, 96-8.


380 Giraud, The Metis in the Canadian West, 442.

381 Saskatchewan Herald May, 2, 1884. Riel and the Métis in 1885 found public opinion set against them, particularly in the press. Few people outside of the Métis or the Prairies cared about the decimation of the Buffalo and henceforth the Métis’ economic base of trade in the Assiniboia with the Hudson’s Bay Company. An editorial ran in the Regina-Leader Post that declared the central government was doing its best to settle ‘half-breed’ land claims along the Saskatchewan despite the ‘unreasonableness’ of the Métis. Not only did the press describe Riel as a megalomaniac lunatic but also helped to make him a martyr in the weeks after his execution in November 1885. See, Regina-Leader Post April 21, 1885: 4; Nov. 9, 1885: 4; and, Dec. 14, 1885:4.

382 Saskatchewan Herald Nov. 9, 1885: 3.

383 The Métis have been improperly characterized as a backward culture but recent evidence suggests that they were both resourceful and economically sophisticated. For instance, after years of dealing exclusively with the HBC the Métis began to compete against the Company, after 1850, on account of the American Fur Company whose steamboats on the Red River and railway links between St. Paul, Minnesota and New York beat out the HBC’s slower transport. The Métis position is not difficult to understand since their strong sense of identity began to challenge “not simply the Company’s economic prerogatives, but also its political and judicial powers in the fur-trade interior.” See, Taylor and Baskerville, eds., A Concise History of Business in Canada, 103.


387 Canadian Architect and Builder vol. 18 (1905) issue 12: 183.

388 Ibid., 185.

389 Ibid., vol. 3 (1890) issue 9: 99-100.

390 Carrington, The Anglican Church in Canada, 139.


392 Boon, 61 citing CMSA James Hunter to Church Missionary Society, July 30, 1850

393 Ibid. March 29, 1856 and July 24, 1858.

394 Ibid. August 23, 1858. Rev. Hunt wrote: “this felt passed its first winter in this country at York factory; the next at Norway House; the next at red River, having been sent thither by mistake; the next at Norway House again on its way hither and the next in the storeroom here being the fifth year since it left England: it is still in a state to be unrolled and useful to the Church instead of to my house.”

395 Ibid.

396 George Edmund Street commented on the truthful articulation of the Gothic Revival style. Street read a paper before the Oxford Architectural Society that was later published under the title “The True Principles
of Architecture and the Possibility for Development” in the Ecclesiologist vol. 13 (1853): 247-262 that outlined his position on massiveness, contour, colour, tracery, and the undisturbed space of the wall. In his views he was similar to the opinions John Ruskin held in The Stones of Venice (1853) with regards to structural truth and beauty in nature and architecture.


398 A survey of international sources of book supply, including the “Canadian Book Imports and Exports Database” housed in the History of the Book in Canada project, confirmed that the U.S. was the Dominion’s principal source for books. See, Fleming, ed., History of the Book in Canada, 207.

399 J.S. Helmcken addressing the Legislative Council, March 9, 1970. See, Ajzenstat, Canada’s Founding Debates, 194.

400 Crossman, Architecture in Transition: From Art to Practice 1885-1906.

401 “It may be safely asserted that newspapers, magazines, and trade papers, are now recognised as the standard advertising mediums,” wrote Ernest H. Heinrichs in the “The Art of Successful Advertising”, Canadian Architect and Builder vol. 6 (1893) issue 12: 129.

402 Ibid.

403 Canadian Architect and Builder vol. 13 (1900) issue 11, page x and vol. 19 (1906) issue 4, page 52, respectively.

404 Canadian Architect and Builder vol. 19 (1906) issue 4, page 52.

405 The operations of the disavowal of economy at the heart of the economic fields of production is found in Bourdieu, The Field of Cultural Production, particularly 74-80.

406 For a description of Fripp’s career see, Donald Luxton, Building the West (Vancouver: Talon, 2003), 158-62.

407 The development of social libraries began in the Dominion as early as the 1820s when Robert Gourlay reported in his Statistical Account of Upper Canada, Compiled with a View to a Grand System of Emigration (London: Simpkin Marshall, 1822) I, 246 that the continued lack of books created a desire for them. Several kinds of organizations made books available, including public subscription libraries, literary and scientific societies, reading clubs, and mechanics’ institutes, see Parker, The Beginnings of the Book Trade in Canada, 95.

408 Montreal Transcript Feb. 8, 1840. See also, Nora Robins, “The Montreal Mechanics’ Institute” 1828-1870”, Canadian Library Journal 38 (1981): 376. Though the implications of public libraries were recognized as early as 1827, intermittent unpopular responses had caused the Scottish radical journalist William Lyon Mackenzie (later turned politician after having fled Ontario after his involvement in the Upper Canada rebellion of 1836) to remark:

what a pity it is that a mechanics’ and agricultural society is not established in this colony on liberal and extended principles! In the promotion of designs like these, more than in governing an ignorant and bigoted mob at the point of a bayonet, consists true patriotism.

See, The Colonial Advocate July 12, 1827. Mackenzie then announced that he was the agent for the New York firm of Carvill, which imported cheap books from the London publisher Charles Knight on behalf of the Society for the Diffusion of Useful Knowledge, see Parker, The Beginnings of the Book Trade in Canada, 97.


410 The Toronto Mechanics’ Institute. Catalogue of Books in the Library and List of Newspapers and Periodicals in the Reading Room (Toronto, 1862)

411 Barrie Mechanics’ Institute. Catalogue of Books in the Library and List of Newspapers and Periodicals in the Reading Room (Barrie, Ontario, 1887)

412 See, Chapter I, note 18.

413 Holly, Church Architecture (1871), 26.

414 Architects were expected to pay for the creation of this educational system as a way of improving their profession, as one insured themselves against the natural elements.

415 Ibid.

416 Keshen and Morton, Material Memory: Documents in Post-Confederation History, 131.

321

Regina—Leader Post June 5, 1884: 4.


Colonists’ Handbook No. 1 Canada, Containing Statistical and Other Useful Information (1882), A2.

Ibid., 9.

Ibid., 11 and 52.

Ibid., 5.

Ibid.


Luxton, Building the West, 112.

Hart, The Selling of Canada, 88. In 1903 there were 5303 guests and in 1904 there were 9684.

Ibid.

Ibid.

Ibid.

Textbooks and printed legislation during the period of official Confederation constituted into existence those noteworthy events in Canada’s past. The Constitutional Act of 1791 that divided Quebec into Upper and Lower Canada roughly coincided with the expansion of the fur trade and the foundation of Anglican dioceses in Quebec (1793) and Nova Scotia (1787). The union of Upper and Lower Canada in 1840 similarly intersected the consolidation of Maritime fishing, shipbuilding, and shipping industries with the foundation of the Dioceses of Newfoundland (1839), Toronto (1839), and Fredericton (1845). After official Confederation in 1867, the growth of finance capital management in Ontario, and to a lesser extent in Quebec, improved the wealth of a growing mercantile sector that drove western expansion. The establishment of Anglican dioceses in Moosonee (Rupert’s Land, now Manitoba) (1872), Algoma (Ontario) (1873), and Athabasca (1873) marked the growth of economy and national regime. The Oregon Treaty (1846) determined a western border and secured the Dominion’s access to the west coast. The acquisition of Rupert’s Land from the Hudson’s Bay Company (1870) provided an avenue of western expansion that increased farming and mercantile exchange. The establishment of Anglican dioceses in Saskatchewan (1874), Caledonia (1879), New Westminster (British Colombia) (1879), and Calgary (1884) responded to the increased settlement that followed the relaxation of border disputes with the U.S. The Monarch was quoted in The Illustrated London News Feb 16, 1861: 1.

The formation of Canada continues to be a complex question, particularly around the issue of its status as a modern nation-state. A centralist approach was taken in Keshen and Morton, Material Memory: Documents in Post-Confederation History. A discussion on the problematics of nationalist perspectives relative to the CPR is found in Taylor and Baskerville, eds., A Concise History of Business in Canada.

The handbook noted the population increase from 3,602,596 to 4,352,080 between the census of 1871 and 1881 with the greatest increase, 289 percent, belonging to Manitoba. Manitoba’s small population naturally lent itself to large percentage increases but, of course, the point was to fill up the Prairies with people in order to create an ‘unbroken chain’ of settlement.


The census of 1881 recorded approximately 50,000 people, half of them First Nations, living primarily along the Fraser River, the Straight of Georgia, and on the west coast of Vancouver Island. Cole Harris, The Resettlement of British Columbia: Essays on Colonialism and Geographical Change (Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press, 1997), 138. The population density was exceedingly low across the province: a ratio of one person for every eighteen square miles, but the ratio of churches to urban density was high in the three main cities, Victoria, New Westminster, and Naniamo. During the rivalry between Victoria and Vancouver for the pre-eminent position on Canada’s west coast, each city recorded roughly similar population statistics, though Victoria appeared to expend more money on church architecture. This may have been because of its civic rivalry with Vancouver and over-compensation after the fire of 1899.
In 1889, approximately $1,400,000 was expended on new building constructions. Property valuations had nearly doubled from 1888 to 1890, representing assessments of $6,600,000 and $9,000,000 respectively. The city boasted 40 miles of paved roadway and a similar mileage of paved sidewalks, demonstrating its mature stage of planning.

Father Clinton’s letter, dated Vancouver April 3, 1886 is found in Phyllis Reeve, Every Good Gift (Vancouver, British Columbia: St. James' Church, 1981), 15. On Clinton see also, pages 65, 78, and 82.


Only Hastings Mill and a few other out-buildings were spared.

Ibid., 19-23.

Dennis Madill, British Columbia Indian Treaties in Historical Perspective (Ottawa: Research Branch, Corporate Policy Indian and Northern Affairs Canada, 1981), 7-13. The Vancouver Island Treaties and Treaty 8 are contextualized in chapters I and II. The welfare of First Nations became a federal responsibility after British Columbia entered Confederation in 1871.

It is important to note that the majority of First Nations in BC did not sign treaties in the past although Canadian governments continued to regulate their lives under the federal Indian Act in any event.

Harris, Making Native Space: Colonialism, Resistance, and Reserves in British Columbia, 14. See also, Thomas R. Berger in “Native Land Claims and a Mackenzie Valley Pipeline” in Bruce Hodgings, ed., Canadian History since Confederation (Georgetown, Ontario: Irwin-Dorsey, 1979). Berger cites F.H. Kitto, the Dominion Land Surveyor in 1920, stating that the development of oil rich areas of Fort Norman on the Mackenzie River were “open to debate” without the formalization of Treaty, see p.639.

Madill, British Columbia Indian Treaties in Historical Perspective, 67-73. That perspective failed to take into account that First Nations understood treaty as ‘friendship’ payments that were exclusive of property issues. Thus, the historical and continuing negotiations around Native land claims were disadvantaged in the legal system.


The Colonists’ Handbook and the Province of British Columbia handbook described in detail Canada’s climate, commerce, industry, geology, farming, resources, population, urban and rural geography, sport, leisure, and religious structures. The handbooks also explained how to purchase land from the Crown. In addition, two pages were devoted to descriptions of trees, of which one type was likely used in the production of pulp that created the handbook.


Harris, Making Native Space: Colonialism, Resistance, and Reserves in British Columbia, 14. At the same time, many individuals took less conciliatory approaches to First Nations and demonstrated the difficulty that European settlers had in understanding the aboriginal relationship with the land. For instance, in 1861 Amor de Cosmos, then editor of the Victoria Daily Colonist, wrote “locate reservations for [First Nations] on which to earn their own living, and if they trespass on white settlers punish them severely. A few lessons would enable them to form a correct estimation of their own inferiority.” See March 1861: 8.


Ibid., 138.

See, Maclvor, "Science and Technology Education in a Civilizing Mission.", 100-102.


Usher, William Duncan of Metlakatla, 138.

A portion of those funds was used to relocate the town to Alaska, which is consistent with Duncan’s view of the town as his own personal property.


Joanne McDonald, From Ceremonial Object to Curio: Object Transformation at Port Simpson and Metlakatla, British Columbia in the Nineteenth Century, 203.


3 Ibid.

4 Ibid.


6 Ibid.

7 Ibid., 34.

8 This collection of churches is illustrated in Veillette and White, *Early Indian Village Churches*.

9 Dart’s address in the June 1903 edition of the quarterly publication of *Work for the Far West* remarked that the Anglican Church in British Columbia, and by extension its representatives in the whole of Canada, did not want to be “independent of aid from England”. “The Canadian Church is manifestly right in seeking to do her part in spiritual extension, but for many years she will need the continuance of generous help from the Mother Country”.

10 *Work for the Far West* Jan. 1898: 23. One of the books recommended, *A Home in the North-West* penned by the journal’s editor, Anne Mercier, was an advertisement for colonial settlement combined with strong elements of religiously.


12 Ibid., 66.

13 Ibid., 68.

14 Colin Coates argues that Confederation made possible and credible British capital investment in Canada, see *Imperial Canada*, 1867-1917, 7-10. Merchant banks like Barings facilitated British investment in the transatlantic shipping lines from Liverpool and Glasgow to Montreal, as well as the Grand Trunk, the Canadian Pacific and the Canadian National Railways. Over 70% of the £500 million in foreign capital that Canada absorbed between 1900 and 1914 came from Britain. On the other hand, Kelly Crossman has also demonstrated how U.S. architects commanded a series of key commissions in the country, which advanced the need to professional self-regulation of Canadian architects, see Crossman, *Architecture in Transition: From Art to Practice 1885-1906*.

15 *The Illustrated London News* Feb 16, 1861: 1. The investment in the Canadian railway represented only 2 1/2% of Britain’s National Debt and 6% of the outlay used to construct England’s rail system.

16 Ibid.

17 *Work for the Far West* Jan. 1898: 5.

18 He wrote, “to finish [St. Anne’s Church] will cost about £100, but half that amount would make it sufficiently comfortable to be used during the winter season.”

19 While stationed in Kapunda, Australia Donaldson’s bigamist marriage to Jean Elizabeth Margaret Arroline Morton had brought about the Reverend’s suspension of duties, his financial ruin, and eventual immigration to Steveston.

20 *Work for the Far West* April 1902: 18


22 Joan Weir, *Canada’s Gold Rush Church* (Quesnel: Anglican Diocese of the Cariboo, 1986). The work of missionaries in the area was diminished, as Weir has suggested, because of steadily declining donations, see page 30.


24 By increasing the number of its Pullman luxury sleeping cars by a factor of four between 1901 and 1912, the CPR increased its passengers from 4,337,799 in 1901 to 15,480,934 in 1913. See E. J. Hart, *The Selling of Canada: The Canadian Pacific Railway and the Beginnings of Canadian Tourism* (Banff: Altitude Publishing, 1983), 88.

25 “Rights of Canadian Architects”, *Canadian Architect and Builder* vol. 20 (1907) issue 4: 60.

26 Luxton, *Building the West*.


308 For the notion of a collective communion in nationalistic terms see, Benedict Anderson, Imagined Communities, revised ed. (New York: Verso, 2000), 6-7. However, I do not share Anderson’s larger view that nationalism replaced religion on the political world stage of the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries.

309 For the notion of a collective communion in nationalistic terms see, Benedict Anderson, Imagined Communities, revised ed. (New York: Verso, 2000), 6-7. However, I do not share Anderson’s larger view that nationalism replaced religion on the political world stage of the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries.

310 Durham), Lord Durham's Report on the Affairs of British North America. Subsequently, Lord Elgin impacted the financial fate of the Anglican Church in Canada by recommending that the future of the Clergy Reserves be decided in the Canadian and not British parliament. Whereas Lord Durham’s action was beneficial to the established Church, whose minority population little impacted their social status, Lord Elgin’s act on the other hand imposed serious financial strain on the Anglican Church. The appointment of Lord Durham and Lord Elgin to superior posts in the Dominion extended British policy across the Atlantic, even though both men championed the Dominion’s responsible self-governance.

311 Crossman, Architecture in Transition: From Art to Practice 1885-1906 17-24, 36, and 127. Crossman points out that the Ontario Association of Architects was formed around the idea that there needed to be architectural standards in Canada to counter the popularity of American architects and architectural fashions.

312 The Anglican power structure was focused on the diocesan level. The Methodist Church focused power at the congregational level, though they organized under the umbrella of synods around the 1860s.

313 Westfall, Two Worlds: The Protestant Culture of Nineteenth-Century Ontario, 51.

314 Robertson, Landmarks of Toronto, 342.


316 Robertson, Landmarks of Toronto, 349. The parish churches of Doncaster and St. George’s, Sheffield were offered as comparative examples.

317 Canadian Architect and Builder vol. 22 issue 4: 13

318 See, Canadian Architect and Builder vol. 10 (1897) issue 1: plate 5 and page 5 for text.

319 Benjamin, "The Work of Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction." I am benefiting from much of Benjamin’s critique of capitalist structures.

320 Ibid., vol. 4 (1891) issue 4: 91-2 on the certification of architects in Ontario and Quebec, in which lists of books were provided as adequate knowledge. Among the books listed were John Henry Parker’s Introduction to Gothic Architecture, Matthew Bloxam’s Gothic Architecture, Thomas Rickman’s Gothic Architecture, and James Fergusson’s History of Architecture.


322 Canadian Architect and Builder vol. 19 (1906) issue 6: 82. Incorporation occurred on May 25th 1906.

323 The MAA formed nearly twenty years after the Builder’s Association, which served, much like a union, to assure the fair wages paid to builders, contractors, and sub-contractors.

324 Ibid., vol. 18 (1891) issue 12: 185.


326 Ibid.

327 Ibid.

328 Ibid.

329 Ibid.


334 The Church May 3, 1849: 160. Wills identified himself as the designer of St. Anne’s, Fredericton as well as a member of the London and New York Ecclesiological Societies. He was a founding member of
Martin Segger, *Victoria: A Primer for Regional History in Architecture* (Victoria: Heritage Architectural Guides, 1979), 207. The monumental output of books from Davis and Downing is discussed in Smeins, *Building an American Identity: Pattern Book Homes and Communities*, 1979, 75. Teague built an impressive 350 buildings in and around the greater Victoria area including projects in the north of the Island.


Marks, *Revivals and Roller Rinks: Religion, Leisure and Identity in Late Nineteenth Century Small Town Ontario*, 63. For instance, the published lists of contributors to small communities that built churches actually highlighted contributors’ absences.


Except for the page format and inserted illustrations, the opening sequences of *A Hand Book of Designs, containing Plans in Perspective of Court Houses, Universities, Academies, School Houses, Churches, Dwellings, etc, and Suggestions Relative to their Construction, Heating and Ventilation* (1868) replicated the argument and textual data from *Descriptive and Illustrated Catalogue, containing Plans in Perspective, of Colleges, School Houses, Churches, and Other Buildings, and Suggestions Relative to their Construction, Heating and Ventilation* (1866).

*Canadian Architect and Builder* vol. 2 (1889) issue 10: 116.

Hooper’s practice was, for a time, one of the largest on the west coast. A series of financial reversals in the 1890s caused the architect to retire penniless but not after having tried to restore his practice in New York City between 1915 and 1927.


Ibid., May 17, 1891: 2.


The ‘Iron Church’ was a pre-fabricated sheet and cast-iron building that likely came from the pages of the British manufacturing company of W. Slater. It was shipped in pieces from England around Cape Horn and assembled on-site. Iron churches were meant to be temporary measures to be used until more permanent buildings could be constructed. Bishop Hills initially refused to consecrate the church on the grounds that it was a temporary building but he eventually acquiesced and consecration occurred on Sept. 30, 1860.

Wilson’s training was acquired in the London offices of architects Searles and Hayes, during which time he also lectured on building construction. His long career in Victoria, at first in serial partnership with Elmer Fisher and Thomas Sorby, and then in solo practice mainly produced office blocks, residences, and the odd school building, see Luxton, *Building the West* 132-34.

Ibid., Jan 12, 1890: 4.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Publisher and Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ajzenstat, Janet</td>
<td><em>Canada's Founding Debates</em></td>
<td>U of T Press, 2003</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anderson, Benedict</td>
<td><em>Imagined Communities</em>, revised ed.</td>
<td>Verso, 2000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Arthur, Eric and Stephen Otto</td>
<td><em>Toronto: No Mean City</em></td>
<td>U of T Press, 1986</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bagshaw, Roberta L.</td>
<td><em>No Better Land: The 1860 Diaries of the Anglican Colonial Bishop George Hills</em></td>
<td>Sono Nis Press, 1996</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barman, Jean</td>
<td><em>The West Beyond the West</em></td>
<td>University of Toronto Press, 1991</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baudrillard, Jean</td>
<td><em>Simulacra and Simulation</em></td>
<td>University of Michigan, 1995</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bennett, Vicki</td>
<td><em>Sacred Space and Structural Style: The Embodiment of Socio-Religious Ideology</em></td>
<td>University of Ottawa Press, 1997</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Berger, Carl</td>
<td><em>The Writing of Canadian History</em></td>
<td>University of Toronto Press, 1986</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bhabha, Homi K.</td>
<td><em>The Location of Culture</em></td>
<td>Routledge, 1994</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Boorman, Sylvia</td>
<td><em>John Toronto: A Biography of Bishop John Strachan</em></td>
<td>Clark, Irwin, 1969</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td><em>The Field of Cultural Production</em></td>
<td>Columbia University Press, 1993</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td><em>The Social Structures of the Economy</em></td>
<td>Polity Press, 2005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Britain, Great</td>
<td><em>Colonists' Handbook No.1: Canada, Containing Statistical and Other Information from Government Sources and Useful Councils to Emigrants</em></td>
<td>The Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge, 1882</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>British Columbia, Metlakatla Inquiry</td>
<td><em>Report of the Commissioners, Together with the</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Elliott, Christopher Webster and John, ed. 'A Church as It Should Be'. Stamford: Shaun Tyas, 2000.


McDonald, Joanne. From Ceremonial Object to Curio: Object Transformation at Port Simpson and Metlakatla, British Columbia in the Nineteenth Century.
McNeil, John Thomas. The Presbyterian Church in Canada. Toronto: General Board, Presbyterian Church in Canada, 1925.


---. A Few Words to Churchwardens on Churches and Church Ornaments, No.Ii Suited to Town and Manufacturing Parishes. 2nd ed. Cambridge: University Press, 1841.

Urquhart, M.C. Gross National Product, Canada, 1870-1926: The Derivation of the


Bibliography of Church Pattern Books

Architecture, Committee on Church. Designs for Village, Town, and City Churches. Toronto: General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church in Canada, 1893.


---. Parish Churches; Being Perspective Views of English Ecclesiastical Structures: Accompanied by Plans Drawn to a Uniform Scale, and Letter-Press Descriptions., 1851.

Butterfield, William. Elevations, Sections Etc., of St John the Baptist at Shottesbrooke. 1844.

Colling, James Kellaway. Examples of English Medieval Foliage and Coloured Decoration, Taken from Buildings of the Twelfth to the Fifteenth Century: With Descriptive Letterpress., 1874.


Eastlake, Charles. Hints on Household Taste in Furniture, Upholstery, and Other Details. London: Longmans, Green, 1878.


King, Thomas H. The Study-Book of Mediaeval Architecture and Art: Being a Series of Working Drawings of the Principal Monuments of the Middle Ages; Whereof the Plans, Sections and Details Are Drawn to Uniform Scale. London: John Grant, 1893.

---. The Study-Book of Medieval Architecture and Art: Being a Series of Working Drawings of the Principal Monuments of the Middle Ages, Whereof the Plans, Sections, and Details Are Drawn to Uniform Scale. London: Bell and Daldy, 1868.


---. The True Principles of Pointed or Christian Architecture" Set Forth in Two Lectures Delivered at St. Marie's, Oscott. London: John Weale, 1841.

Robertson, J. Ross. Robertson's Landmarks of Toronto, a Collection of Historical Sketches of the Old Town of York from 1792 until 1837 and of Toronto from 1834 to 1904, Also Nearly Three Hundred Engravings of the Churches of Toronto Embracing the Picture of Every Church Obtainable from 1800-1904. Toronto: J. Ross Robertson, 1904.


Sharpe, Edmund. Architectural Parallels; or, the Progress of Ecclesiastical Architecture in England through the Twelfth and Thirteenth Centuries, Exhibited in a Series of Parallel Examples Selected from the Abbey Churches [of] Fountains, Kirkstall, Furness, Roche, Byland, Hexham,
Jervaulx, Whitby, Rievaulx, Netley, Bridlington, Tintern, St Mary's, York, Guisborough, Selby and Howden. London: Van Voorst, 1848.


---. Supplement To "Architectural Parallels"; Containing the Full-Sized Mouldings Of ... Abbey Churches. London: Van Voorst, 1848.


Smith, George T. Art in House Building. Twenty Designs of Modern Dwellings... Costing from $600 Upwards, Including Designs of a Church & Schoolhouse. Pittsburgh: J. Eichbaum and co., 1890.


Street, George Edmund. Brick and Marble in the Middle Ages: Notes of Tours in the North of Italy. 2nd 1874 ed. London: John Murray, 1855.


Appendix A

Designs for Country Churches by George Truefitt, 1850

London, Joseph Masters, Aldergate Street and 78 New Bond Street
Manchester, Simms & Dinham

Preface

As the present work appeals principally to the eye, being composed of sketches, it may at first sight hardly seem to require a preface; but being intended to illustrate attempts at design, some explanation may be permitted with reference to its pretensions and the motives for submitting it to the Public; and for this purpose, a cursory retrospective glance at the rise and progress of the revival of the taste for Pointed Architecture in this country appears necessary.

The reaction in favour of the style that is now almost invariably adopted in our Ecclesiastical buildings may be traced, to a considerable extent in the first instance, to the spirited publication of a few such serials as ‘Britton’s Cathedrals”, “Pugin’s Examples”, &c. These important works, being richly edited and containing accurate delineations of some of the most beautiful of English mediaeval art, were consequently well calculated to have an influence over the public taste at a period when apathetic ignorance seems to have been the leading characteristic of all connected with the development of Church Architecture. They were followed by others of a similar antiquarian character; and the demand for illustrated information on the subject gradually increasing, many first-rate examples were engraved and laid before the Public. The consequence was, that after some time a strong desire for practical imitation sprung up, and the favour with which the Heathen Temple had been hitherto received as a model for the Christian Church sensibly diminished. The reaction still steadily progressing, an attempt to respond to it was found necessary by the Architects of the day; and numerous designs, in which pointed arches and pinnacles appeared as leading features, were accordingly prepared and carried into execution. Public taste, however, in due time improving, the worthlessness of these first productions, became evident, and the members of the profession then began to perceive, that while utter ignorance prevailed as to the principles of the style in which they were called upon to design, and their only chance of avoiding failure lay in a servile repetition of examples already in existence: this plan was accordingly introduced and by degrees adopted as a general rule. Books of examples appeared in rapid succession and ‘Authority’ having taken the place of ‘Originality’, Church Architecture and ‘Copyism’ became synonymous terms.

The period for a more correct knowledge of the groundwork of the art was nevertheless gradually arriving, and the publication of the “Glossary,” with the works of Messrs. Rickman, Bloxam, and a few others, considerably hastened its approach: a comparatively correct classification of the various gradations of style was obtained, and the chief chronological difficulties were overcome; but one great obstacle still existed, and it is
to the publication of the excellent practical rules and correct advice of the Cambridge Camden (now the Ecclesiological) Society, and of the ‘True Principles of Christian Architecture’, by Mr. A.W. Pugin, that we are chiefly indebted for its removal. These works at once gave the clue to the real spirit of the style, and in a great measure cleared up by the mystery that had so long attended it.

Much additional critical information and many admirable illustrations have since been laid before the public, for the most part by members of the profession, and the opportunity of obtaining a correct knowledge of the principles and practice of Pointed Architecture having increased in every direction, the result has been, that within the last few years many original conceptions have been most successfully carried out.

Such appears to be the present position of the art in England. A reasonable anticipation may therefore be indulged in, that the period is now drawing near when nothing but design in its strictest sense will be admitted in any of our modern Ecclesiastical buildings. In the mean time however, the degrading epithet ‘Copyist’, is suffered to remain in full force, and such being the case, it cannot but be desirable that every architect should do his best toward relieving the profession as soon as possible from the stigma conveyed by such a term.

It is with these feelings, and an earnest desire that such attention may be speedily drawn to this point as will lead to its satisfactory and permanent settlement, that the present sketches for ‘Country Churches’ have been made. They cannot pretend to be elaborate studies, being in the most part designed in perspective on the stones from which they are printed; neither are they put forward as models for indiscriminate imitation, being generally conceived with reference to specific though imaginary varieties of site: they merely progress to be attempts to think in Gothic, exclusive of actual authority, and as such their Author trusts that they may be favourably received.

6, Bloomsbury Square

May, 1850
Appendix B: Brief Biographies of Pattern Book Authors

George Truefitt (1824-1902)
George Truefitt was articled at age 15 to the British architect Lewis Nockalls Cottingham (the elder). Truefitt later worked for Sancton Wood (1815-86), and afterward with Eginton of Worcester. With Calvert Vaux (1824-95) he travelled throughout the English countryside for documenting medieval architecture with sketchbooks. Vaux went on to practice professionally with Andrew Jackson Downing and Frederick Law Olmsted in New York.

Truefitt had an extensive architectural practice but built few buildings considered historically important. He erected buildings in 25 different counties of England and worked internationally in 15 countries. He produced 16 churches and chapels including St. George’s Tufnell Park, St. George’s Worthing, St. John’s Bromley, Kent, and Davyhulme Church, Cheshire. He is credited with the restoration of 10 medieval churches. He erected 8 rectory houses, 7 schools, 13 banks in major cities, 7 large halls and church rooms, 170 houses and mansions, and 44 cottages. He was the architect of Tufnell estate for over 25 years. He was involved in extensive renovations at Aboyne Castle, Aberdeenshire, the residence of the Marquis of Huntly. Truefitt retired from architecture in 1899 and died at Worthing in 1902 at the age of 89.

He was elected a Fellow of RIBA in 1860.

He was the author of two pattern books and contributed several publications to the journal The Builder and to its editor, Mr. Godwin, he claimed early success on account of publishing designs in the journal that solicited several important commissions.


Raphael Brandon (1817-77)
Raphael Brandon completed numerous restorations of medieval buildings, primarily churches and chapels. In 1846-8 he worked on restoration of St. Martin, Leicester with his brother J.A. Brandon, again in 1851-2 with Robert Richie, in 1857 while in partnership with Freshwater and finally in 1861-2 with Broadbent.

He built several railway stations and engine houses on the London-Croydon line in the 1840s in which chimneys were disguised as the bell-towers of early Gothic churches. He designed the Apostolic Church in Gordon Square (1851-5), the actors’ church (near Picadilly Circus demolished April 1854), and St. Peter’s, Great Windmill St. (1860-1). He was pre-deceased by his wife and child, went into depression and committed suicide in 1877 by self-inflicted gunshot wound to the head.
Brandon was best known for architectural books of the Gothic Revival, including An Analysis of Gothic Architecture (1849), Open Timber Roofs of the Middle Ages (1849), and Parish Churches (1848).


**James Kellaway Colling (1816-1905)**

James Kellaway Colling described himself as a draughtsman more than as an architect. He completed the lithographic plates for other architect’s pattern books, including Parish Churches (1848).

Between 1849 and 1855 Colling drew architectural subjects on wood for the Illustrated London News, including the 1851 Exhibition building, houses of Parliament, and Northumberland House.

His pattern books included Gothic Ornaments, being a Series of Samples of Enriched Details (1846), Details of Gothic Architecture, Measured and Drawn from Existing Examples (1852), Art Foliage, for Sculpture and Decoration, with an Analysis of Geometric Form, and Studies from Nature of Buds, Leaves, Flowers, and Fruit (1865), and English Medieval Ornament (1874).

His buildings included Hooton Hall, Cheshire; the Albany, Liverpool (a large block of offices); St. Paul, Cheshire, Hooton; Ashewicke Hall, Gloucestershire; Coxwold Hall, Lincolnshire; Popham Church, Hants. 1875 (dem). In 1891-3 he designed the National Portrait Gallery with Ewan Christian who was a fellow pupil of Habershon nearly 50 years earlier.

His restoration commissions included Eye Church, Suffolk; Hingham Church, Norfolk; Arthingworth Church and Kelmarsh Church, Northamptonshire; Scole Church, Norfolk; Melbury Church, Dorset; Oakley Church, Suffolk; and the Chapel of the Mercers Company, London; new Grammar school at Eye.

Colling was an important drawing teacher to William Eden Nesfield.

Colling died at the age of 90 on September 1, 1905. He had been an associate of RIBA 1856 and Fellow 1860, resigned 1885.

He helped found the Architectural Association and he founded the Architectural Draughtsmen in 1842. In 1851, he established an architectural museum, an outgrowth of Cottingham’s Museum.

Hughes, Quentin 1964 Seaport: Architecture and Townscape in Liverpool. London: Lund Humphries
Jones, Owen. The Grammar of Ornament. 100-103
Summerson, John 1947 The Architectural Association 1847-1947
Turak, Theodore 1974 ‘French and English Sources of Sullivan’s Ornament and Doctrine’ Prairie School Review 11 n 4:5 28

His books were not without their controversy. The American Architect, in 1905, wrote that his books had a most unhappy influence on American architecture because students of medieval design thought that his books were treasuries of Gothic ornamentation. According to that journal’s editors, students believed that the integration of some of Colling’s designs into their would accomplish a perfected Gothic design

**William Eden Nesfield (1835-1888)**
William Eden Nesfield was born in Bath, England and graduated Eton College in 1851. He was a man of independent means who disliked architectural competitions and openly chided architects for their use of professional advertising.

In the London offices of the architect William Burn, Nesfield met Richard Norman Shaw who had worked for the prominent British architect George Edmund Street in 1858, and together they shared offices between 1862 and 1876 and an official partnership between 1866 and 69. Afterwards Nesfield worked for James Kellaway Colling and his uncle Anthony Salvin.

He claimed to have won a travelling Studentship from the Royal Academy in the Architectural School which took him to Italy, France, Athens, Constantinople, and Salonica with James Donaldson, the son of an English professor of architecture. The story was refuted in a letter to the editor of The Builder journal dated April 14 1888 from R. Phene Spiers who remarked that Nesfield could never have travelled on a Royal Academy Studentship because he never attended the Academy.

Upon his return in the early 1860s he prepared drawings for a pattern book Specimens of Medieval Architecture that used selected examples of the 12th and 13th century buildings he documented on his travels. The book was dedicated to Lord Craven, for whom Nesfield enlarged the country house Coombe Abbey, Warwickshire. Nesfield claimed that the book lifted him to the front ranks of the profession though it was more likely a result of its patron. Because Nesfield’s architectural practice had become busy almost immediately he was prompted to hire Day and Son, Lithographers to the Queen to finish the plates. Nesfield was acutely aware of his reputation and social station.

Among Nesfield’s his early commissions were the lodges at Kew Gardens and Regent’s Park awarded by the Hon. Mr. Cowper-Temple.
In 1887, Nesfield married Mary Annetta Gwilt, eldest daughter of John Sebastian Gwilt the draughtsman and brother of Joseph Gwilt a prominent author of books on architecture especially Gwilt’s Encyclopaedia of Architecture.

Journal of the Royal Institute of British Architects 23 May 1903: 396
The Builder vol. 54 April 7 1888: 244
Architectural Review vol. 1 1897: 241, 289-92
Country Life
The Victorian Country House 1979: 318-28
Architectural Review vol. 2 1897: 29

Frederick Withers (1828-1901)
Frederick Withers trained in England and immigrated to New York with his friend Calvert Vaux. He moved to Newark N.J. to work for the landscape architect Andrew Jackson Downing. After Downing’s unexpected death, Withers returned to New York and entered into a six-year partnership with Vaux beginning in 1866. Important commissions included the old Jefferson Market, Court House and Prison group of buildings, designed in Victorian Gothic. Withers and Vaux were the architects of the Hudson River State Hospital for the Insane, one of the most costly and pretentious early public buildings in New York state.

Withers was best known as a church architect completing commissions in New York state and New England. Important ecclesiastical commissions included the First Presbyterian in Newburgh, N.Y. (1867), and in 1874 St. Luke’s Episcopal, Beacon, N.Y., Zabriski Memorial Church, Newport, R.I. and St. Thomas, Hanover, N.H.

Withers was an early member and Fellow of the American Institute of Architects and served a term as Secretary of the national organization.

Obituary in A.I.A. Quarterly Bulletin, April, 1901.

Henry Hudson Holly (1834-1892)
Henry Hudson Holly, born in New York, N.Y., was an architect and pattern book author. His first book Country Seats was published in 1863 and it was followed in 1871 by Church Architecture. He practiced in partnership with Horatio F. Jelliff after 1887. Rev. George Bowler. His architectural credits include the Virginia Military Institute at Lexington, St. Luke’s Memorial Hall at the University of the South and a palatial residence in Colorado reported to have cost $400,000.

Obituary in American Architect and Building News 9/7/1892, see also 3/11/1878.

Frank E. Kidder (1859-1905)
Franklin E. Kidder, born in Bangor Maine, was in practice as an architect and engineer for only a short period and thereafter devoted his time to writing books. He was well-known as the author of Kidder’s Architects’ and Builders’ Handbook first published in 1884 and later undergoing eighteen editions up to the year 1944. His architectural
training occurred at Cornell University’s School of Architecture and in 1880 he graduated in Engineering from the Massachusetts Institute of Technology. Poor health forced him to abandon an attempt to start an office in Boston. He moved to Denver about 1888 and continued to work in that city until 1891, associated for a time with John J. Humphreys. d Obituary in A.I.A. Bulletin, Dec. 1905.

George Wightwick (1802-1872)
George Wightwick was born in Wales and trained in London. He was an architect and architectural journalist. In the late 1820s he practiced with John Foulston in Plymouth. With Foulston he completed several civic projects including the Bodmin County Lunatic Asylum, the Plymouth Mechanics’ Institute, Athenaeum Terrace, the Esplanade, the Devon and Cornwall Female Orphan Asylum, and the Devonport Post Office.

His views on church architecture differed from the leading churchmen and ecclesiological architects of the day and he published these ideas in Weale’s Quarterly Papers on Architecture in 1844-5. His pattern books include Hints to young architects: comprising advice to those who are destined to follow the profession (1846 with new editions in 1847, 1860, 1875 and 1880) and The Palace of Architecture: a romance of art and history (1840